

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jan 25, 2009 7:47 PM
Title: Re: Greetings from Ballarat
Content:
Hello Carl,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 12:30 AM
Title: Re: Hindrance
Content:

No, you should just swallow it, unless you want to drown or have the saliva dribbling down your chin.

Dogen's advice to keep the tongue against the palate, with the tip of the tongue resting against the back of the top teeth, will both reduce the quantity of saliva and make the swallowing of it fairly effortless.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 10:07 AM
Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?
Content:

The Expositor passage is on page 421 and you have misquoted it. It says: "The masculine state is superior, the feminine is inferior."

Taken in context, this passage is not about 'men' and 'women'. Rather, as one would expect from an Abhidhamma treatise, it's about the derivative rūpa dhammas called masculinity faculty and femininity faculty. These are kammically produced rūpas that are present in certain material octads spread throughout the body, and which lead to the conventionally observable marks of sexual distinction, such as breasts, rounded hips, beards, moustaches etc. Here 'inferiority' and 'superiority' are attributes of the kinds of kamma that generate these rūpa dhammas, not of the conventional realities called 'men' and 'women'.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 12:04 PM

Title: Re: What is the "life-principle"? (Jivitindriya)

Content:

No, the Sutta isn't talking about the normal condition of a living arahant. It's talking about a rare samadhi state that certain arahants and non-returners can enter for a limited period of time. While in this state breathing stops, as do all mental processes.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 1:00 PM

Title: Re: Entering the stream

Content:

Well, I really don't know whether it's likely or unlikely. It's just that I've never come across any accounts of it happening in the Pali texts, and nor have any of the more learned monks whom I've asked about it. But we shouldn't read too much into that, for even in the case of the sotapannas reborn as devas, the accounts are rather few in number and in most cases they only get their names in the books because they came back to visit the Buddha after death, or because they had been unusually close to him in their human life, or because their progress happens to make an unusually edifying (or unusually entertaining) story.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 1:16 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen - a comparative analysis

Content:

Since allegations about this teacher aren't really relevant to the topic, discussion of them would be better continued by pm. Incidentally, the subject has been discussed at considerable length in a thread at E-sangha.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 1:27 PM

Title: Re: Beginners questions

Content:

It's a decision and all decisions belong to the aggregate of formations. In fact everything that's mental but isn't a feeling, perception or cognition, belongs to this aggregate.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 1:37 PM

Title: Re: Greetings!

Content:

Hi Justin,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 1:45 PM

Title: Re: What is the "life-principle"? (Jivitindriya)

Content:

I'm pretty sceptical about it. There is no mention in the Suttas of the Buddha's remains looking any different to those of anyone else, nor of the relics of his arahant disciples. Also, this sort of thing would be dead easy to fake, and among the less scrupulous followers of a teacher there are strong worldly incentives to do so. For example, someone on the lay committee which manages a wat might have hopes that the wat will become a future pilgrimage site; so he hides some crystals in the coffin before the cremation, knowing that gullible folk will take their later "discovery" as a sign that the monk was an arahant.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 4:56 PM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

I don't know if this is ever spelt out in the texts, but I doubt it, for the abhidhammikas' priority is to describe the dhammas themselves, rather than their conventional consequences. I would suggest, however, that the sexual differences produced by the gender-controlling faculties are indeed of a sort that tend to make a male body something more to be wished for than a female one, all other things being equal. If one considers those features of men's and women's bodies that are differentiated by the gender-controlling faculties, it seems that in every case the male features are stronger, less susceptible to injury, and more versatile for nearly every end save that of attracting mates and child-rearing.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 5:45 PM
Title: Re: Howdy
Content:
Hi Davcuts,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 6:06 PM
Title: Re: Entering the stream
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 26, 2009 8:08 PM
Title: Re: unravelling the mysteries of mind & body through abhidhamma
Content:
If it's not too much trouble. Thank you.

Kalāpas are cool.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 12:04 AM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

This may be the case, but it goes beyond the issue that my reply to Jason was addressing, which was male and female physical features considered in themselves.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 12:20 AM

Title: Re: Entering the stream

Content:

1. As with all the ariyan paths and fruits, the supramundane jhāna at the moment of attaining the path and fruit of non-returning may be at the level of any of the five jhānas.
2. The fact that non-returners are reborn in the Suddhāvāsas is due to their eradication of all the causes for rebirth in the Kāmaloka, but their non-eradication of attachment to the refined material and immaterial spheres.
3. The level of Suddhāvāsa in which a non-returner is reborn is conditioned by his/her development of mundane jhāna in the case of those who have done this.
4. In the case of those who haven't (the bare insight workers), the level will be the lowest, i.e., the Avihā Suddhāvāsa.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Beginners questions

Content:

No, I didn't mean to say that.

However, looking at the discussion of this matter in the Milindapañha I'm not now sure that the locution "choosing his rebirth" is really correct. The text speaks of the Bodhisatta performing "eight great investigations" (mahāvilokana), i.e., regarding the time of conception, the continent, the region, the family, the mother, the life-span his mother would have after giving birth, the month he would be born, and the time of his renunciation, but it doesn't say anything about him exercising choice regarding the first five items. It might be that rather than "the Bodhisatta chooses to be reborn in the highest caste, either brahmin or kshatriya" it would be more accurate to say "his merit

causes him to be reborn in the highest caste, and while in Tusita he foresees what that caste will be." But I would need to look into this further.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 12:56 AM
Title: Re: hello folks
Content:
Hello Dumb Bonbu,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel!

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 2:00 AM
Title: Re: Entering the stream
Content:
I don't recall seeing any discussion of why path and fruition consciousnesses are always at the level of rūpa and not arūpa jhāna. My guess would be that it's because the arūpa cittas are not capable of taking any object but the conceptual ones of infinite space, infinite consciousness etc.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 3:44 AM
Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?
Content:
In the Mahāsīhanāda Sutta (MN. 12) the first of the ten Tathāgata powers is called "knowledge of the possible and the impossible" (ṭhānaṭṭhāna-ñāṇa):
“Here, the Tathāgata understands as it actually is the possible as possible and the impossible as impossible. And that is a Tathāgata’s power that the Tathāgata has, by virtue of which he claims the herd-leader’s place, roars his lion’s roar in the assemblies, and sets rolling the Wheel of Brahma.
And in the Vibhanga the Buddha’s knowledge of the impossibility of a woman being a Sammāsambuddha, a universal monarch, Māra, Brahmā etc. is classed as part of this

Tathāgata power.

So perhaps his statements are simply a demonstration of this power, aimed at reinforcing his disciples' faith.

ye bhikkhave buddhe pasannā, agge te pasannā
agge kho pana pasannānaṃ aggo vipāko hoti.

“Those, bhikkhus, who have faith in the Buddha, have faith in the best;
And those who have faith in the best, theirs is the best result.”

(AN.ii.35)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 4:23 AM

Title: Re: AN 11.13: Mahanama Sutta (six recollections)

Content:

Even better than that...

"Here, if a certain person, while giving a gift, or undertaking the precepts, or observing the uposatha, or setting out drinks and refreshments for the use of passing travellers, or beautifying the area around his home, or worshipping a cetiya, or adorning a cetiya with perfumes and garlands, or circumambulating a cetiya, or engaging in any wholesome kamma belonging to the three planes, does not do so for the sake of a fortunate destiny, or birth, or relinking, or becoming, or wandering in saṃsāra, or continuing in the cycle, then all of these actions tend to the sundering of bonds, and are inclining, tending and sloping towards Nibbāna."

(Nidd.ii.424)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 4:32 AM

Title: Re: Hello

Content:

Hi Jesse,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 4:53 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma Stories recounted by Mahasi Sayadaw

Content:

Another source of stories from Mahasi Sayadaw is his wonderful book on the Sallekha Sutta:

<http://aimwell.org/Books/Mahasi/Sallekha/sallekha.html>

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 9:18 AM

Title: Re: Cula Sotapanna

Content:

No, you're correct. The cullasotāpanna knows what's magga and what's not, but hasn't yet attained magga.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 9:35 AM

Title: Re: A Manual of the Excellent Man

Content:

Aññā is synonymous with arahantship (arahatta), the liberation of arahantship (arahatta-vimokkha), and the noble fruition consciousness of arahantship (arahatta-ariyaphala-citta).

The first of these can be used in place of 'Nibbāna' when speaking conventionally (i.e. when talking about the ongoing state of cooledness or extinguishedness in those persons called arahants).

The last two refer to the citta that cognizes Nibbāna, but not to Nibbāna itself.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 10:44 AM
Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?
Content:
I was making an analogy.

Other things being equal, a human is better advantaged by being a biped than a uniped; nonetheless, some human unipeds can turn their less-than-optimal state to good use.

Other things being equal, a human is better advantaged by being a man than a woman; nonetheless, some women can turn their less-than-optimal state to good use. As you put it yourself:

"Women can and do well pretend to be weaker than they are in order to attract mates, for this is what usually pleases the male ego."

In practice, of course, other things are rarely equal. Better, for example, to have the feminine rūpadhammas of a Mahāpajāpati or a Khemā than the male ones of a Devadatta or an Ariṭṭha the vulture-trainer.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 11:13 AM
Title: Re: Great site guys.
Content:
Hi Adeh,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 11:25 AM
Title: Re: A Manual of the Excellent Man
Content:

If the citta that cognizes Nibbāna were Nibbāna itself, then Nibbāna would be just another dependently arisen phenomenon. As it is, Nibbāna is conceived in classical Theravāda as the unconditioned object (ārammaṇa) of a conditioned citta. The effect of this cognition, at the moment of path consciousness, is the cutting off of the defilements particular to that level (e.g., the first three fetters in the case of stream

entry).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 4:26 PM
Title: Re: Entering the stream
Content:

I was actually going from memory, but it's lucky you asked because after checking with Gethin's Summary of the Topics of Abhidhamma I now think I've made some mistakes. I'll post a corrected version this evening.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 4:59 PM
Title: Re: Samaya
Content:

"Harsh speech" is usually used to translate pharusā vācā, which is one of the four kinds of wrong speech. It means speech prompted by an unwholesome mind state and spoken merely with the aim of hurting someone:

"He speaks harshly; he utters such words as are rough, hard, hurtful to others, offensive to others, bordering on anger, uncondusive to concentration."

(MN. 114)

Probably you mean speech that is disagreeable to others, but is also true and beneficial. To a listener this may at times appear indistinguishable from pharusā vācā but it is inwardly distinguished by the different motivation that prompts it.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 5:51 PM
Title: Re: Kamma and its Ripening in the Abhidhamma
Content:

As Robert mentioned, in the commentary it is said that the various projectiles were not deliberately aimed at Angulimala. As for the ripening, this consisted in the unwholesome resultant bodily consciousnesses accompanied by painful feeling.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 6:03 PM
Title: Re: Chat room
Content:
Hi Mawkish,

Thanks for this. It does sound like something worth considering.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 27, 2009 8:43 PM
Title: Re: your top three Buddhist assumptions
Content:

As Element has reminded us many times, dukkha is the supporting condition for the arising of faith in the Dhamma. Now in some cases it happens that the dukkha that motivates a person to the quest that leads her to the Dhamma will be dukkha resulting from her own folly, wrong view or suchlike. But that doesn't make folly, wrong view etc. in any way commendable. Much oftener, one with wrong view will simply continue to wallow in it.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jan 28, 2009 4:13 AM
Title: Re: AN 11.13: Mahanama Sutta (six recollections)
Content:
A cetiya (Sanskrit caitya) is about the same as a stupa.

Relinking (paṭisandhi) is the abhidhammic term for the moment of rebirth.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2009 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

But as I mentioned earlier in the thread, the commentators do not draw any connection between the Abhidhamma teaching on kamma-originated materiality and the Sutta teaching on the impossibility of a Sammāsambuddha being female.

In fact the latter teaching is accounted for with reference to another Sutta doctrine: that of the Great Man (mahāpurisa) and his thirty-two marks.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2009 8:47 PM

Title: Re: perfections

Content:

In the Sutta Pitaka they are all listed in the Buddhavamsa and (I think) about eight of them in the Cariyapitaka.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 6:09 AM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

Maybe. One of the eight conditions for a vow made before a Buddha to be effective is that one must be a male human at the time of making it. Having made it and received a prediction, from then on there are eighteen states he can never fall into. One of these eighteen is to change one's sex, but does this mean the Bodhisatta can never be born female or that he will never undergo a change of sex in the course of a life? I'm not sure about this.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 6:56 AM

Title: Re: The enlightenment of Vakkali

Content:

When you say "The Theragatha suggests he attained Arahantship before killing himself" I take it you mean some time before putting the knife to his throat (as opposed to after putting the knife to his throat but before expiring). But what is there in the dictionary entry you've cited that leads you to think that this is what the Theragatha commentary is suggesting?

You quoted:

According to the Theragāthā, Commentary (ThagA.i.420), when Vakkali was dismissed by the Buddha he lived on Gijjhakūta, practising meditation, but could not attain insight because of his emotional nature (saddhā). The Buddha then gave him a special exercise, but neither could he achieve this, and, from lack of food, he suffered from cramp. The Buddha visited him and uttered a verse to encourage him. Vakkali spoke four verses (Thag.350 4) in reply, and, conjuring up insight, won arahantship. Later, in the assembly of the monks, the Buddha declared him foremost among those of implicit faith (saddhādhimuttānam) (cp. A.i.25; also Dvy.49 and VibhA.276; Vsm.i.129). In the Pārāyanavagga (SN. vs. 1146) the Buddha is represented as holding Vakkali up to Pingiya as an example of one who won emancipation through faith.

Are you taking the words "Vakkali spoke four verses (Thag.350 4) in reply, and, conjuring up insight, won arahantship" to mean that all of this happened there and then in the Buddha's presence? Malalasekera's words might suggest this, but the commentary itself gives only the sequence of events, not the duration in which they elapsed. (In general when reading the Theragatha and Therigatha verses one needs to keep in mind that in many cases the verses of a particular arahant or arahanti were not spoken all at once, but rather at intervals over a long duration, with each verse encapsulating some pivotal experience in the disciple's career).

Or are you perhaps assuming that Vakkali must have been alive at the time when the Buddha praised his special quality in the assembly of monks? If so, this would be a mistake, for Bahiya is also praised in this same chapter of the Anguttara Nikaya, though he would almost certainly have been deceased at the time.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 8:54 AM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

Almost everybody is declared inadequate. In Theravāda teaching the vow can be made effectively only when there is a concurrence of eight conditions:

1. Manussatta: the human state. The resolve to become a Sammāsambuddha can be made only during a life in which one is a human being.
2. Liṅgasampatti: possession of the right sex. One must be a man, not a woman, a

congenital eunuch, or a hermaphrodite.

3. Hetu: cause. Possessing the supporting conditions for attaining arahantship in that same life, if he were to exert himself towards this end.

4. Satthāradassana: the sight of the Teacher. This means an encounter with a Sammāsambuddha, as when Sumedha met the Buddha Dīpaṅkara and declared his resolve in his presence.

5. Pabbajjā: going forth into the homeless life. One must have left the household life and be an ascetic who holds to the doctrine of the efficacy of kamma, like the ascetic Sumedha when he made his resolve.

6. Guṇasampatti: attainment of special qualities. One must have attained special or distinctive qualities, beginning with the jhānas, like Sumedha, who had attained the five mundane higher knowledges (abhiññā) and the eight attainments (samāpatti) when he made his resolve before the Buddha Dīpaṅkara.

7. Adhikāra: extreme dedication. At the time of making one's resolve to become a Sammāsambuddha one must be prepared to sacrifice everything, even one's life.

5. Chandatā: strong desire. Having a strong desire to become a Sammāsambuddha, no matter how great the difficulties and obstacles one may encounter. For example, if he were told that to attain sammāsambodhi it would be necessary to tread his way across an entire world-system filled with flameless hot coals, or tread his way across an entire world-system whose ground was bespread with spears and sharp-pointed bamboo sticks, or wade across an entire world-system filled with water, or cut his way through an entire world-system choked with thorny bamboo plants, — he would reply: "I can do that."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 10:42 AM
Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?
Content:

I downplay it because I think a preoccupation with it indicates a seriously misplaced sense of priorities and a lack of awareness of just how perilous our present lot is.

For example, did you know that according to the Suttas the great majority of humans will be reborn after death in the lower realms? Hardly any of us will even manage to be human beings in the next life, let alone Sammāsambuddhas billions of lives from now.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 10:56 AM

Title: Re: No record of Women Buddhas

Content:

Yes, it's possible that the Buddha delivered a plethora of teachings on female Sammasambuddhas and sexist monks engaged in a conspiracy to suppress them all.

And perhaps there were speciesist monks too, guilty of suppressing the Buddha's many discourses on kangaroo Sammāsambuddhas, chimpanzee Paccekabuddhas etc.

Once we start down the hermeneutics-of-suspicion road, the possibilities are limitless.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 12:48 PM

Title: Re: Women can't be enlightened?

Content:

In the Mahāsamaya Sutta an ariyan deva from the Pure Abodes says:

yekeci buddhaṃ saraṇaṃ gatāse,
na te gamissanti apāyabhūmiṃ
pahāya mānusaṃ dehaṃ,
devakāyaṃ paripūressanti

"Whoever have gone to the Buddha for refuge

Will not go to the lower realms,

Having abandoned the human body

They will swell the company of devas."

(DN.ii.255; SN.i.27)

But this principle cannot be universally applicable, for the likes of Devadatta and Sunakkhatta went for refuge and yet ended up in hell. The commentaries take the verse as referring to the supramundane going for refuge, which consists in the attainment of stream-entry. An ordinary person's going for refuge is a wholesome kamma, but it will save him from the lower realms only if it happens to be the kamma that ripens at the time of death. There is no guarantee that this will be the case, for it could be counteracted by some unwholesome kamma.

In some Buddhist circles one will find people voicing rather exaggerated opinions on the benefits of refuge-going that were never taught by the Buddha. In the Suttas (e.g., DN. 5) the benefits of refuge-going rank higher than those of giving gifts to the Sangha, but lower than those of an unbroken observance of the five precepts.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 1:04 PM

Title: Re: No record of Women Buddhas

Content:

Then I can only repeat that the possibilities of what a few monks could have been influenced by, and what they could have done as a result of being influenced are limitless.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 6:22 PM

Title: Re: Greetings kalyanamittas

Content:

Hi Gregory,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 6:37 PM

Title: Re: hi ya

Content:

Hello Ippaefans,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 29, 2009 6:50 PM

Title: Re: Theravadins' thoughts on the origin of the sutras?

Content:

In the pre-modern age slaves were employed in the larger monasteries of every Theravada country too. That being so, an argument like yours would rather tend to recoil

upon him who advances it.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 10:11 AM
Title: Re: The Wisdom of Ariyan Women
Content:

Inasmuch as the wisdom happens to have arisen in the cittasantati whose accompanying rūpasantati is distinguished by the femininity controlling faculty, speaking conventionally, in accordance with the world's usage, one might correctly refer to it as "women's wisdom".

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 10:50 AM
Title: Re: Why there is no re-linking consciousness
Content:
I have in fact quoted the Sutta to you twice already. Once again:

Bhava Sutta

"It is said, lord, 'becoming, becoming.' In what way, lord, is there becoming?"
"If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the sense realm, would sense-sphere becoming be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus, Ānanda, kamma is the field, consciousness is the seed (viññāṇaṃ bījaṃ), craving the moisture; for beings obstructed by ignorance and fettered to craving, consciousness becomes grounded in a low realm. Thus, Ānanda, there is the production of re-becoming in the future. It is thus, Ānanda, that there is becoming.

"If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the fine-material realm, would fine-material becoming be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus, Ānanda, kamma is the field, consciousness is the seed, craving the moisture; for beings obstructed by ignorance and fettered to craving, consciousness becomes grounded in a middling realm. Thus, Ānanda, there is the production of re-becoming in the future. It is thus, Ānanda, that there is becoming.

"If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the immaterial realm, would immaterial becoming be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus, Ānanda, kamma is the field, consciousness is the seed, craving the moisture; for beings obstructed by ignorance and fettered to craving, consciousness becomes grounded in a superior realm. Thus, Ānanda, there is the production of re-becoming in the future. It is thus, Ānanda, that there is becoming."

(AN.i. 223-24)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 11:01 AM
Title: Re: Hi Dhamma Friends
Content:
Hi Siaophengyou,

Nice to see you around.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 11:08 AM
Title: Re: Greetings
Content:
Welcome Jin

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 11:11 AM
Title: Re: Watching movies if you are a monk
Content:

Years ago I met an Italian Theravadin monk called Mahinda or Milinda or something like that, who told me about his stay at a certain Tibetan monastery in Italy. While he was there one of the resident monks informed him one day that they would be holding the Vajra Cup later that week and asked him if he'd be interested in taking part.

"Sure," replied Mahinda, thinking that the Vajra Cup must be the name of some Tibetan ritual.

"Great, our team's one player short. Which position would you prefer?"

The Vajra Cup, it turned out, was an annual soccer match between the Tibetan-ordained

monks in Italy and those in Germany. Mahinda then explained that it was out of the question — in the Pali Vinaya, balls and other playthings aren't even to be touched by a bhikkhu, let alone played with. His hosts were okay about this, but later one of them approached Mahinda and said: "We understand that your vows prohibit playing football, but would you mind being the referee?"

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 11:39 AM

Title: Re: Theravadins' thoughts on the origin of the Mahayana sutras?

Content:

I think you've misunderstood what modern scholars are saying. As there's nothing in the supposedly oldest stratum of the Mahāsaṃghika Vinaya that isn't matched in other Vinaya recensions it's nonsensical to say that scholars regard this Vinaya (rather than the others) as representing the earliest stratum.

In fact the question that modern scholars are chiefly concerned with is which recension of the Vinaya was closed (i.e. stopped adding new material) the earliest. And in this matter the only point on which there is any consensus is that the Mūlasarvastivāda Vinaya was closed the latest. But as to which was closed the earliest, the Theravāda, Dharmagupta and Mahāsaṃghika Vinayas are each treated as the likeliest candidate by one scholar or another.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 12:13 PM

Title: Re: Zen Forum International: Coming soon!

Content:

Congratulations! I hope it will be of benefit to many.

(that's apple juice, btw, not beer)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 3:57 PM

Title: Re: The Wisdom of Ariyan Women

Content:

That's true, but the use of "women's wisdom" in the opening sentence of Piotr's initial post (I would like to start new thread with examples of women's wisdom & discrimination portrayed in the Pāli Canon) needn't be taken as implying the wisdom of women in general. On the other hand, there's no doubt that it does carry this undesired meaning when isolated from its context, as in Element's reply. To avoid this ambiguity perhaps it would be better to speak of the wisdom of ariyan women. I'll change the thread title to make the topic clearer.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 4:26 PM

Title: Re: Greetings!

Content:

Hi hrtbeat7,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 4:30 PM

Title: Re: Zen Forum International: Coming soon!

Content:

Pfft, you can't propose a toast with baggies.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2009 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Option to see created threads?

Content:

Hi Bodom,

At present there isn't any simple one-click way of doing this, but it can be done using the advanced search function.

1. Go to the <http://dhammawheel.com/search.php> page.
2. Type the author's name in Search for author.
3. Select the forums in which you wish to search.
4. Click the button First post of topics only.
5. Click Search.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 12:03 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 2 - MN 60. Apannaka Sutta
Content:
Here is Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation:
(IV. THERE ARE NO IMMATERIAL REALMS)

“Householders, there are some recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘There are definitely no immaterial realms.’ [1]

“Now there are some recluses and brahmins whose doctrine is directly opposed to that of those recluses and brahmins, and they say thus: ‘There definitely are immaterial realms.’ What do you think, householders? Don’t these recluses and brahmins hold doctrines directly opposed to each other?” - “Yes, venerable sir.”

“About this a wise man considers thus: ‘These good recluses and brahmins hold the doctrine and view “there are definitely no immaterial realms,” but that has not been seen by me. And these other good recluses and brahmins hold the doctrine and view “there definitely are immaterial realms,” but that has not been known by me. If, without knowing and seeing, I were to take one side and declare: “Only this is true, anything else is wrong,” that would not be fitting for me. Now as to the recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine and view “there definitely are no immaterial realms,” if their word is true then it is certainly still possible that I might reappear [after death] among the gods of the fine-material realms who consist of mind. [2]

“But as to the recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine and view “there definitely are immaterial realms,” if their word is true then it is certainly possible that I might reappear [after death] among the gods of the immaterial realms who consist of perception. The taking up of rods and weapons, quarrels, brawls, disputes, recrimination, malice, and false speech are seen to occur based on material form, but this does not exist at all in the immaterial realms.’ After reflecting thus, he practises the

way to dispassion towards material forms, to the fading away and cessation of material forms.” [3]

Notes:

[1] This is a denial of the four immaterial planes of existence, the objective counterparts of the four immaterial meditative attainments.

[2] These are the gods of the planes corresponding to the four jhanas. They possess bodies of subtle matter, unlike the gods of the immaterial planes who consist entirely of mind without any admixture of matter.

[3] Majjhima Commentary: Even though the wise man discussed here has doubts about the existence of the immaterial planes, he attains the fourth jhana, and on the basis of that he attempts to attain the immaterial absorptions. If he fails he is certain of rebirth in the fine-material planes, but if he succeeds he will be reborn in the immaterial planes. Thus for him this wager is an “incontrovertible teaching.”

Does this make things clearer?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 10:57 AM

Title: Re: What is puthujjano?

Content:

No, the saddhānusārī and dhammānusārī have both arrived at the path of stream-entry (sotāpatti-magga).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 11:52 AM

Title: Re: Anybody know the "Insightforum" Yahoo Group?

Content:

1. Midpeninsula Insight Discussion Forum:

<http://groups.yahoo.com/group/insightforum>

— I don't know anything about this one.

2. Insight Forum: http://groups.yahoo.com/group/insight_forum

— Inactive since 2007

3. Insight Practice Forum: <http://groups.yahoo.com/group/InsightPractice>

— Very active group moderated by Jinavamsa/Mitchell Ginsburg, an American student of the Thai teacher Dhiravamsa. Its threads are pretty wide-ranging, but the focus is chiefly North American vipassanā, and especially the more eclectic and psychotherapy-oriented wing of this movement. I've been a member almost since it started, but haven't read it for ages as it's not really my cup of tea.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 1:10 PM
Title: Re: Why there is no re-linking consciousness
Content:

You are indulging in your usual penchant for moving the goalposts. What you asked Piotr to supply was not a sutta explaining relinking consciousness, but rather, one supporting his claim that "viññāṇa is a cognition but I don't think that it is correct to say that it's 'merely cognition', since it's also described as a seed with other kammic factors that nourish it."

This is what we have both done.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 3:42 PM
Title: Re: Why there is no re-linking consciousness
Content:

Citta is never defined as the aggregate of formations. It is in fact a synonym of viññāṇa. "But, bhikkhus, as to that which is called 'mind' (citta), that which is called 'mentality' (mano), that which is called 'consciousness' (viññāṇa), — the uninstructed worldling is unable to experience revulsion towards it, unable to become dispassionate towards it and be liberated from it.

"It would be better, bhikkhus, for the uninstructed worldling to take as self this body composed of the four great elements rather than the mind (citta). For what reason? Because this body composed of the four great elements is seen standing for one year, for two years, for three, four, five, or ten years, for twenty, thirty, forty, or fifty years, for a

hundred years, or even longer. But that which is called 'mind' (citta), that which is called 'mentality' (mano), that which is called 'consciousness' (viññāṇa) arises as one thing and ceases as another by day and by night."

(Assutavā Sutta, SN.ii.94. Bodhi trans.)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 4:12 PM

Title: Re: Why there is no re-linking consciousness

Content:

Mental objects (dhammā) arises from a variety of causes, but are not "concocted" by the consciousness that cognizes them any more than visual objects are concocted by eye-consciousness, sounds by ear consciousness etc.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Different football codes - who are the toughest?

Content:

Rugby union "not so good"?! Pfft. You wouldn't say that if you were old enough to remember Gareth Edwards. Watch him score the greatest try in the history of the universe:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AwCbG4l0QyA&feature=related>

See also Jonah Lomu bulldozing through the Lion's defence at the 1995 world cup:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yvR8CsGcwyQ>

And go wash your mouth out with soap.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 5:50 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

Why "speculative"? Surely it's just straightforward logical entailment.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2009 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

I think their position —that the puggala is indescribable and its relationship to the aggregates is indescribable— would be included in eel-wriggling.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 9:38 AM

Title: Re: Safe Journey and Happy Landings Ben!

Content:

Hi Ben,

I hope you're all settling in nicely.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 12:11 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

It's not consistent with the classical viewpoint. The classical viewpoint was accurately stated in the passage from Nyanatiloka's Dictionary quoted by Chris in her opening post. Those interpretations which conceive of anattā as a strategic way of regarding things, or which assert that it's a speculative view to hold that there is no self, are misreadings of the Suttas from the classical Theravada point of view. A good rule of thumb when

reading modern attempts to explain anattā is that if the writer makes no reference (implicit or explicit) to the doctrine of the two truths then the chances are he's got it all wrong.

The commentator Mahānāma, concluding his commentary on the Paṭisambhidāmagga's Treatise on Emptiness, offers a neat series of epigrams summarizing the Mahāvihāra understanding of anattā:

sabbe dhammā samāsenā
tidhā dvedhā tathekadhā
suññāti suññatthavidū
vaṇṇayantīdha sāsane

In short, whether classed in triplets, couplets or units, all dhammas are empty. Thus is it explained by those in this religion who know the meaning of emptiness.

kathaṃ? sabbe tāva lokiyā dhammā dhuva-subha-sukha-atta-virahitattā dhuva-subha-sukha-atta-suññā

How so? Firstly, all mundane dhammas, through being bereft with respect to permanence, beauty, pleasure and self, are empty of permanence, beauty, pleasure and self.

magga-phala-dhammā dhuva-sukha-atta-virahitattā dhuva-sukha-atta-suññā

The [noble] path and fruition dhammas, through being bereft with respect to permanence, pleasure and self, are empty of permanence, pleasure and self.

aniccattāyeva sukhena suññā

But only on account of their impermanence are they empty with respect to pleasure;

anāsavattā na subhena suññā

and being free of the taints they are not empty with respect to beauty.

nibbānadhammo attasseva abhāvato attasuñño

The dhamma called 'Nibbāna' is empty of self only on account of the non-existence of self.

[i.e., not on account of impermanence etc. — Dhammanando]

lokiyalokuttarā pana sabbepi saṅkhatā dhammā sattassa kassaci abhāvato sattasuññā

Secondly, conditioned dhammas, both mundane and supramundane, are all empty of a living being on account of the non-existence of a living being of any sort whatever.

asaṅkhato nibbānadhammo tesam saṅkhārānampi abhāvato saṅkhārasuñño

The unconditioned, the dhamma called 'Nibbāna', is empty of formations on account of the absence [there] of formations.

saṅkhatāsaṅkhatā pana sabbepi dhammā attasaṅkhātassa puggalassa abhāvato attasuññāti

Lastly, all dhammas, conditioned and unconditioned, are empty of self on account of the non-existence of any person who could be classed as 'a self'.

(PaṭiA. iii. 638-9)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 2:22 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

From the Manorathapūraṇī:

duve saccāni akkhāsi

sambuddho vadataṃ varo

sammutiṃ paramatthañca

tatiyaṃ nupalabbhati

The Awakened One, best of speakers,

Spoke two kinds of truths:

The conventional and the ultimate.

A third truth does not obtain.

tattha:

saṅketavacanaṃ saccaṃ

lokasammutikāraṇaṃ

paramatthavacanaṃ saccaṃ

dhammānaṃ tathalakkhaṇaṃ ti

Therein:

The speech wherewith the world converses is true

On account of its being agreed upon by the world.

The speech which describes what is ultimate is also true,

Through characterizing dhammas as they really are.

tasmā vohārakusalassa

lokanāthassa satthuno

sammutiṃ voharantassa

musāvādo na jāyati ti

Therefore, being skilled in common usage,
False speech does not arise in the Teacher,
Who is Lord of the World,
When he speaks according to conventions.
(Mn. i. 95)

Conventional truth (sammuti-sacca):

1. Treats of concepts (paññatti), i.e., things which are mere speech, such as 'self', 'person', 'life', 'butter-jar' etc.
2. Is used to expound teachings whose meaning warrants interpretation (neyyattha).
3. Is chiefly, though not exclusively, the province of the Sutta and Vinaya Piṭakas.

Ultimate truth (paramattha-sacca):

1. Treats of real existents (dhammā), such as the earth element, eye-consciousness, greed, Nibbāna, etc.
2. Is used to expound teachings whose meaning is definitive (nītattha).
3. Is chiefly, though not exclusively, the province of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

From Nyanatiloka's Dictionary of Buddhist Terms"

Paramattha (-sacca, -vacana, -desanā): 'truth (or term, exposition) that is true in the highest (or ultimate) sense', as contrasted with the 'conventional truth' (vohāra-sacca), which is also called 'commonly accepted truth' (sammuti-sacca; in Skr: saṃvṛti-satya). The Buddha, in explaining his doctrine, sometimes used conventional language and sometimes the philosophical mode of expression which is in accordance with undeluded insight into reality. In that ultimate sense, existence is a mere process of physical and mental phenomena within which, or beyond which, no real ego-entity nor any abiding substance can ever be found. Thus, whenever the suttas speak of man, woman or person, or of the rebirth of a being, this must not be taken as being valid in the ultimate sense, but as a mere conventional mode of speech (vohāra-vacana).

It is one of the main characteristics of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, in distinction from most of the Sutta Piṭaka, that it does not employ conventional language, but deals only with ultimates, or realities in the highest sense (paramattha-dhammā). But also in the Sutta Piṭaka there are many expositions in terms of ultimate language (paramattha-desanā), namely, wherever these texts deal with the groups (khandhā), elements (dhātu) or sense-bases (āyatana), and their components; and wherever the 3 characteristics (ti-lakkhaṇa, q.v.) are applied. The majority of Sutta texts, however, use the conventional language, as appropriate in a practical or ethical context, because it "would not be right to say that 'the groups' (khandhā) feel shame, etc."

It should be noted, however, that also statements of the Buddha couched in conventional language, are called 'truth' (vohāra-sacca), being correct on their own

level, which does not contradict the fact that such statements ultimately refer to impermanent and impersonal processes.

The two truths - ultimate and conventional - appear in that form only in the commentaries, but are implied in a sutta-distinction of 'explicit (or direct) meaning' (nītattha, q.v.) and 'implicit meaning (to be inferred)' (neyyattha). Further, the Buddha repeatedly mentioned his reservations when using conventional speech, e.g. in D. 9: "These are merely names, expressions, turns of speech, designations in common use in the world, which the Perfect One (Tathāgata) uses without misapprehending them." See also S. I. 25.

The term paramattha, in the sense here used, occurs in the first para. of the Kathāvatthu, a work of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka (s. Guide, p. 62). (App: vohāra). The commentarial discussions on these truths (Com. to D. 9 and M. 5) have not yet been translated in full. On these see K N. Jayatilleke, Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge (London, 1963).

Sammuti-sacca: 'conventional truth', is identical with vohāra-sacca (s. paramattha-sacca).

Vohāra-desanā: 'conventional exposition', as distinguished from an explanation true in the highest sense (paramattha-desanā, q.v.). It is also called sammuti-sacca (in Sanskrit saṃvṛti). (App.).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 2:44 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

When expounding the Dhamma by way of paramattha-desanā it is perfectly correct to say that there is no self. This is not a speculative view.

When we speak of 'self' we are speaking either about a reality (dhamma) or a concept (paññatti). Examples of the former would be talk about the "I am conceit" (which would have to do with the mental factor of māna) or about personality view (which would have to do with the mental factor of diṭṭhi).

Examples of the latter would be (1) innocuous usages, such as when an arahant says "I will go to Rājagaha" or "I've hurt myself", but does not misapprehend his words, since he knows that there are really only dhammas; or (2) non-innocuous usages such as: "The self and the world are eternal, barren like a mountain-peak, set firmly as a post. These beings rush round, circulate, pass away and re-arise, but this remains eternally," and all the other erroneous views given in the Brahmajāla Sutta and elsewhere.

The arahant and the person of wrong view both resort to the term 'self', but whereas the

one is misled by his concept, the other knows that dhammas are real but paññattis are not, and so is not misled.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 3:17 PM
Title: Re: Awakening and Cessation
Content:
One couldn't have final cessation of suffering without attainment of the path of arahantship, which is the fourth of the four bodhis.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 3:56 PM
Title: Re: Anattā
Content:
It's quite a disputed point, and one that seems to have a number of heavyweight scholars lined up on both sides. My own view is that the ontological reading is rather better supported in Theravādin Abhidhamma texts.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 1, 2009 4:11 PM
Title: Re: Anattā
Content:
Could you expand on this?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 9:51 AM
Title: Re: Super Bowl!!!

Content:

Quite so. NFL is the USA's most unexportable commodity. The only way anyone can find it entertaining is if they've been brainwashed into believing so at a very young age (reminiscent of that supposed Jesuit saying: "If we get them by the age of six, they're ours for life"). Anyone not thus brainwashed (i.e. anyone born outside of the US) will find the game either laughable (with its refrigerator-fetish costumes etc.) or else boring to tears (chiefly due to the lack of fluid play and continual breaks).

By contrast, with rugby —and especially rugby union— no childhood exposure is needed. The sport is so intrinsically thrilling that even middle-aged or elderly people, upon seeing a game for the first time become immediate addicts (with the one sad exception of those whose sense of discrimination has been perverted by childhood exposure to NFL).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 11:10 AM

Title: Re: Retreats and Money

Content:

My impression is that the real divide here is between Buddhist groups that are content with whatever size they happen to be vs. groups with strong expansionist ambitions. Since the former's priority in holding a retreat will be to teach the Dhamma, they will typically offer the retreat free of charge or at least at minimal charge. The latter, on the hand, will tend to view retreats as partly, or even primarily, an opportunity to make a profit, which will then be used to expand the scope of their activities.

This divide is not really the same as the Theravada/Mahayana one, for one will find some Theravada groups offering very pricey retreats (especially in the North American vipassana scene) and some Mahayana groups (e.g. that of the late Master Hsuan Hua) offering almost everything free of charge.

Another factor is whether the teacher leading the retreat is a high- or low-maintenance one. For example, if he happens to be one of these playboy Tibetan tulkus who travels everywhere with a large entourage and expects to be provided with first-class air tickets and a whopping great "donation" at the end of the retreat, then any group hosting him will have to charge an arm and a leg just to cover its expenses. But if it's a teacher who lives frugally and travels alone, then one should be able to safely finance the retreat just by relying on donations.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 11:31 AM

Title: Re: Store consciousness in Theravada

Content:

It is bhavanga. The identification of Yogacarīn alayavijñāna with Theravādin bhavanga actually originates not with W. Rahula, but in some Yogacarīn text (I've forgotten which one, but I think it's either one of Asaṅga's or else the Saṃdhirnamocana Sūtra).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 11:50 AM

Title: Re: Store consciousness in Theravada

Content:

It's one kind of mind-consciousness.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 12:18 PM

Title: Re: Super Bowl!!!

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2009 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

Would you care to expand on this? With no accompanying clarification it just looks like a rather unhelpful insult.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 12:55 AM
Title: Re: Nibbana
Content:
I don't think we can.
Saṅkhata-lakkhaṇa Sutta

tīṇimāni, bhikkhave, saṅkhatassa saṅkhatalakkhaṇāni. katamāni tīṇi? uppādo paññāyati, vayo paññāyati, ṭhitassa aññathattaṃ paññāyati. imāni kho, bhikkhave, tīṇi saṅkhatassa saṅkhatalakkhaṇāni ti.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three conditioned characteristics of the conditioned. Which three? Arising is manifest. Disappearance is manifest. The changing of what persists is manifest. These, bhikkhus, are the three conditioned characteristics of the conditioned."
(AN. i. 152)

Asaṅkhata-lakkhaṇa Sutta

tīṇimāni, bhikkhave, asaṅkhatassa asaṅkhatalakkhaṇāni. katamāni tīṇi? na uppādo paññāyati, na vayo paññāyati, na ṭhitassa aññathattaṃ paññāyati. imāni kho, bhikkhave, tīṇi asaṅkhatassa asaṅkhatalakkhaṇāni ti.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three unconditioned characteristics of the unconditioned. Which three? No arising is manifest. No disappearance is manifest. No changing of what persists is manifest. These, bhikkhus, are the three unconditioned characteristics of the unconditioned."
(ibid)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 1:08 AM
Title: Re: Past lives
Content:

He doesn't, but the Pali commentators blame it on the prolonged dullness of mind during gestation. Beings of immediate arising (opapatika) such as devas and pretas all have a native ability to recall their former life, whereas most humans and animals do not.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 2:25 AM
Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:
Well, that's a little ironic. This sutta is most often cited by those who seek to refute the ābhidhammikas' conception of momentariness!

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 9:44 AM
Title: Re: Newbie inviting you to Spain
Content:
Hi Viriya Karuna,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

That's a nice website you have; I'm impressed to see how much has been translated into Spanish. Is there any Spanish equivalent of the Pali Text Society, or are the translations all independent projects?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 10:04 AM
Title: Re: Taking Refuge and Precepts
Content:
Hi Craig,

An efficacious going for refuge entails approaching the Three Jewels both by way of objective field (visaya) and by way of appropriate duty or task (kicca). An action by way of the mind-door alone will fulfil these two conditions only in one case, namely, when a Noble Person goes for refuge by cutting off his defilements (saraṇagamanupakkilesasamucchedanaṃ). For a worldling, a merely mental act would fulfil visaya, but a supplementary act by way of the speech-door or body-door is necessary to fulfil kicca. It's not necessary to go to any special place or to visit a bhikkhu to do this, though traditionally visiting a bhikkhu to request the refuges is the most common way of fulfilling kicca.

From Buddhaghosa's account of refuge-going (saraṇa-gamaṇaṃ) in the Paramatthajotikā:

Now regarding the ‘going’ etc.: “It counters”, therefore it is a refuge; the meaning is that when people have gone for refuge, then by that very act of going, the refuge counters, dispels, carries off, and causes to cease, their fear, anguish, suffering, defilement, and risk of rebirth in the lower realms.

Or alternatively:

He combats the fears of living beings by promoting their welfare and preventing their harm, thus he is called the Buddha.

It provides a way of crossing over the desert of existence and gives comfort, thus it is called the Dhamma.

It causes the obtaining of abundant fruitfulness from small actions, thus it is called the Sangha.

So in this way the refuge is also that threefold Jewel.

The going for refuge consists in the arising of a citta:

- * from which defilements have been removed and eliminated;
- * which is possessed of confidence in the threefold Jewel and veneration for it;
- * which inclines to acceptance of the threefold Jewel as its highest value;

Whether in the immediate presence of one of the Jewels, or without any external prompting, a being in whom the above factors arise is said to go for refuge when, prompted by that citta, he avows: “This is my refuge; this is my highest value [or “my going to the further shore”],” (esa me saraṇaṃ, esa me parāyaṇaṃ).

Buddhaghosa then continues by describing sundry acts that are each reckoned as tantamount to going for refuge, provided that they are prompted by the kind of citta described above:

* An undertaking (samādānaṃ), as in cases like that of the two merchants, Tapussa and Bhallika, thus: “Venerable sir, we go for refuge to the Blessed One and to the Dhamma; let the Blessed One remember us as upāsakas,” (ete mayaṃ, bhante, bhagavantaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāma, dhammañca, upāsake no bhagavā dhāretu).

* An assuming of the status of a pupil (sissabhāvūpagamaṇaṃ), as in the case of Mahākassapa etc., thus: “Venerable sir, the Blessed One is my teacher, I am his disciple,” (satthā me, bhante, bhagavā, sāvako’ham’asmi).

* An inclination towards it (tapponattaṃ), as in the case of the brāhmaṇa Brahmāyu, thus: ‘When this was said, the brāhmaṇa Brahmāyu rose from his seat, and arranging his upper robe on one shoulder, he raised his hands palms together towards where the Blessed One was staying, and uttered this udāna three times: “Homage to that Blessed One, the Arahant and Perfectly Awakened One!” (namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa).

* A self-dedication (attasanniyyātanaṃ), as in the case of meditators devoting themselves to a meditation subject.

* Going for refuge by cutting off one’s defilements

(saraṇagamanupakkilesasamucchedanaṃ), as in the case of Noble Persons.
(KhpA. 16-17. This is my own rather free, explanatory translation, since the more literal rendering by Ñāṇamoli in Minor Readings & Illustrations is rather difficult to understand)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 10:21 AM
Title: Re: Past lives

Content:
I have encountered one person who claims to have done so. On the very first Buddhist e-mail list that I joined (the now defunct Buddhist-L), one of our more colourful characters was an American rabbi who belonged to some Jewish group which subscribed to reincarnation. The rabbi was also the founder of an organization whose mission was to track down Jewish holocaust victims who had reincarnated as American Christians, and then convert them back to Judaism.

In his posts the rabbi would speak quite unabashedly about his time as an animal of one sort or another, being particularly fond of recounting his former lives as a polar bear and a rabbit.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 11:51 AM
Title: Re: Past lives

Content:
Yes, they use kabbalistic means to track you down. You can run but you can't hide.

Though the project's scope wasn't limited to occult detective work; in fact much of it consisted in counselling Christians who for some reason felt themselves to be Jews.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 3:29 PM
Title: Re: Mahayana

Content:

I recommend Karunadasa's article, Dhamma Theory

<http://www.zeh-verlag.de/download/dhammatheory.pdf>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 3, 2009 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Newbie inviting you to Spain

Content:

You can put the website into your signature if you like:

<http://dhammawheel.com/ucp.php?i=profile&mode=signature>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 4:52 AM

Title: Re: Introduction

Content:

Hi Khalil,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Help finding a specific sutta!

Content:

Hi Individual,

If you mean this passage:

Suppose a monk were to say: "Friends, I heard and received this from the Lord's own lips: this is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Master's teaching", then, monks, you should neither approve nor disapprove his words. Then, without approving or disapproving, his words and expressions should be carefully noted and compared with the Suttas and reviewed in the light of the Vinaya. If they, on such comparison and

review, are found not to conform to the Suttas or the Vinaya, the conclusion must be: "Assuredly this is not the word of the Buddha, it has been wrongly understood by this monk", and the matter is to be rejected. But where on such comparison and review they are found to conform to the Suttas or the Vinaya, the conclusion must be: "Assuredly this is the word of the Buddha, it has been rightly understood by this monk." This is the first criterion.

it's from the Mahaparinibbana Sutta (DN. 16).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Kamma and its Ripening in the Abhidhamma

Content:

You're welcome to your opinion, but this sub-forum is concerned with classical Theravada teaching. In the present matter, a sense-door ārammaṇa is desirable or undesirable before it is processed by any javana cittas.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 5:22 AM

Title: Re: What's your favorite Buddha's quote?

Content:

When you've finished your porridge, don't forget the Dantakaṭṭha Sutta's teaching on the five dangers of not using a toothbrush (AN. iii. 250).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 7:21 AM

Title: Re: taking refuge????

Content:

The teaching of anicca is that all conditioned phenomena are impermanent. But "conditioned phenomena" doesn't include Nibbana, nor does it include dhammatās ("laws", "regularities of nature") such as dependent arising.

That being so, the OP's statement "everything changes" is at best a crude approximation

of what the Buddha taught on anicca, and at worst seriously misleading.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 8:51 AM
Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:
Yes, I'm very sorry. It's the second time this week I've done this.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 10:00 AM
Title: Re: taking refuge????

Content:
So long as there's ignorance there'll be kammic formations; so long as there are kammic formations there'll be consciousness etc. etc. Ignorance can cease, but the dhammatā of kammic formations arising wherever there is ignorance does not cease.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 10:08 AM
Title: Re: Hello Friends

Content:
Hello Mountain,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 7:06 PM
Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

And that's all there is to it, eh?

The four noble truths are one application of the principle of dependent arising — a teaching that is "profound, hard to see and hard to understand, peaceful and sublime, unattainable by mere reasoning, subtle, to be experienced by the wise." Do you really think your take on the noble truths could be characterized in such terms?

I do agree, btw, that there is "no problem" for one who has abandoned the three akusala roots. But "no problem" doesn't mean no dukkha of any sort. More to the point, there will be no abandoning of the three akusala roots without the development of insight into the danger in conditioned dhammas; there will be no development of insight into the danger in conditioned dhammas so long as one adheres to the wrong view that there might be some such dhammas that don't have dukkha-lakkhaṇa as an inherent and inalienable feature.

Now a question in return: what do you understand the Buddha to mean by "the dukkha of formations" (saṅkhāra-dukkha)? For example, when he says regarding vedanā: "Whatsoever is felt, that is included in dukkha" (yaṃ kiñci vedayitaṃ taṃ dukkhasmiṃ — Rahogatasutta, SN. iv. 216; Kaḷāra Sutta, SN. ii. 53)?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2009 7:20 PM
Title: Re: Nibbana
Content:
Certainly it applies to arahants.

From the Nettipakarana:
"Dukkha is [the world's] greatest fear."
(Ajita Sutta, Sn. 1033)

"Dukkha is [the world's] greatest fear" is the Blessed One's reply to [Ajita's question]
"and what will be its greatest fear?"

Dukkha is of two kinds: bodily and mental. The bodily kind is pain, while the mental kind is grief. All beings are sensitive to dukkha. Since there is no fear that is even equal to dukkha, how could there be one that is greater?

There are three kinds of unsatisfactoriness (dukkhatā): unsatisfactoriness consisting in [bodily] pain (dukkha-dukkhatā), unsatisfactoriness consisting in change (vipariṇāma-dukkhatā), and the unsatisfactoriness of formations (saṅkhāra-dukkhatā).

Herein, the world enjoys limited freedom from unsatisfactoriness consisting in [bodily] pain, and likewise from unsatisfactoriness consisting in change. Why is that? Because there are those in the world who have little sickness and are long-lived.

However, in the case of the unsatisfactoriness of formations, the world is freed only by the Nibbāna element without remainder (anupādisesa nibbānadhātu).

That is why "Dukkha is [the world's] greatest fear", taking it that the unsatisfactoriness of formations is the world's inherent liability to dukkha.

(Nettipakaraṇa 12)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 1:09 AM

Title: Re: Mahavamsa (The Great Chronicle of Sri Lanka)

Content:

Rickmers' translation of the Cullavamsa, which supercedes that of Geiger, is also available online:

<http://lakdiva.org/culavamsa/>

This takes the history up to 1815.

Unfortunately it's been OCR'd but not proofread yet, and so is in too messy a state to be used for serious research.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 8:57 AM

Title: Re: Dharma names

Content:

What I was told by the Aussie monk Ñāṇadhammo was that at one time the monk responsible for choosing the names for Ajahn Chah's western disciples was a bit of a joker and several of the names he chose were non-standard ones. For example, there was an Aussie whose lay name was Bruce, which Thais pronounce as Baroot. Baroot is also how Thais pronounce the Sanskrit word puruṣa ("man"). So when Bruce was ordained the joker gave him the name Puriso (the Pali cognate of puruṣa). This is not a proper Pali name, but he kept it till he disrobed. Then there was a New Zealand monk who was given the name Upanno ("the arisen one"), also a non-standard name. He was still Upanno when I met him in 1982, but now he goes by the name of Munindo.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 9:06 AM
Title: Re: Theravada and Zen - a comparative analysis
Content:

That is in fact the outcome of a very similar story from the Christian desert fathers. As Thomas Merton tells it, when the miscreant monk is discovered the abbot wants the community to forgive him, but the brothers won't have any of it: "He's a sinner, he must go!"

To which the abbot replies: "I'm a sinner, I must go."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 9:15 AM
Title: Re: Hi!
Content:
Hello Termite,

Good to see you around.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 10:03 AM
Title: Re: MN 135 - help me clear some things up!
Content:

When posting to the Classical Theravada forum citations from Pali textual sources are required. Readers of this sub-forum are not interested in half-misremembered quotes.

In fact there is nothing in the Pali suttas about giving money to temples or monks. I suspect the text that you are referring to (but which you have both misunderstood and misremembered) will be either the Dakkhinavibhanga Sutta (MN. 142) or the Velāma Sutta (AN. iv. 392-5). The main message of the former concerns the threefold purity of giving (i.e. of the giver, the recipient and the gift) and that an offering made to the sangha

as a whole is more meritorious than one made to an individual monk or nun. In other words, it's a teaching aimed at encouraging laypeople not to discriminate between monks they like or dislike when making offerings to the sangha.

As for the Velāma Sutta, here we are presented with a graduated list of increasingly meritorious deeds. As summarized by Lily de Silva:

The Anguttara Nikāya (A.iv,392-95) records a fabulous alms-giving conducted by the Bodhisatta when he was born as a brahmin named Velāma. Lavish gifts of silver, gold, elephants, cows, carriages, etc., not to mention food, drink and clothing, were distributed among everybody who came forward to receive them. But this open-handed munificence was not very valuable as far as merit was concerned because there were no worthy recipients. It is said to be more meritorious to feed one person with right view, a stream-enterer (sotāpanna), than to give great alms such as that given by Velāma. It is more meritorious to feed one once-returner than a hundred stream-enterers. Next in order come non-returners, Arahants, Paccekabuddhas and Sammasambuddhas. Feeding the Buddha and the Sangha is more meritorious than feeding the Buddha alone. It is even more meritorious to construct a monastery for the general use of the Sangha of the four quarters of all times. Taking refuge in the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha is better still. Abiding by the Five Precepts is even more valuable. But better still is the cultivation of mettā, loving-kindness, and best of all, the insight into impermanence, which leads to Nibbāna.

So the highest kind of merit taught in this sutta is developing insight into impermanence: "Though a person might develop a thought of loving-kindness, greater still would be the fruit if he would develop the perception of impermanence for the duration of just one snap of the fingers."

Thus the chief point of this sutta is not to promote gifts to the sangha —meritorious though they be— but rather to highlight how superior to everything else is the development of understanding (paññā).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 10:17 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 3 - MN 47. Vimamsaka Sutta
Content:

Since some kinds of abstention from indulgence come under the heading of Dhamma rather than Vinaya, it's quite possible for a bhikkhu to be keeping all the Vinaya rules very strictly and yet still be living devoted to sensual indulgence. For example, a bhikkhu who eats like a hog, slumbers most of the day, likes to stand about ogling at the female visitors to his monastery, and is miserly about sharing the monk's requisites, will not in fact be breaking any Vinaya rules. Hence Buddhaghosa's warning that a bhikkhu shouldn't suppose that his sila is perfect just because his Vinaya is perfect.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 6:54 PM

Title: Re: Dharma names

Content:

Lance Cousins' Thai meditation teacher uses his old monk's name, Puññadhiro, as his surname, and he's a pretty conservative guy. In Thailand it's not common to do this, but when ex-monks do I doubt anyone takes it amiss.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 7:11 PM

Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

It is the fruit of the abandoning of craving. The abandoning of craving partly yields its effect at the time of the attainment of arahatta-phala, for example, by cutting off a variety of afflictive mental factors for the remainder of the arahant's life. It wholly yields its effect at the time of nibbāna without remainder. To assert otherwise is to ignore the fact that the first truth includes aging, sickness and death, to which an arahant is still subject. The first noble truth doesn't say "Aging, sickness and death are only dukkha if you're a puthujjana."

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2009 8:22 PM

Title: Re: Anattā

Content:

I would recommend that you read chapter viii of Narada's Manual of Abhidhamma:

<http://buddhanet.net/budsas/ebud/abhisgho/abhis08.htm>

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 17, 2009 3:21 AM
Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth
Content:
Nothing leads to Nibbāna if held to.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 17, 2009 3:43 AM
Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)
Content:
Greetings,

Thank you all for your kind wishes. As my friend Martin reported via Retro, the malaria was quickly cured but the cellulitis proved a little more refractory and I'm still not free of it. I can now walk again, but the antibiotics haven't stopped the infection and so the right foot and calf are still in constant pain. I've been discharged from the Sangha Hospital and tomorrow will take up a kind offer from Khun Salil, one of my Abhidhamma teachers, to be tested and treated at a much better equipped private hospital. I regret that it may be a few more days yet before I return to full participation in this forum.

Still, things could be a lot worse: in the bed opposite mine at the Sangha Hospital there was a Belgian monk who was likewise admitted for cellulitis; unfortunately his case was complicated by diabetes, which resulted in his having his right leg amputated.

"Householder, who would claim even a moment's health, while yet carrying this body about, what else is he but a fool?"

(Nakulapitasutta)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 17, 2009 4:35 AM
Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth
Content:
Most certainly wrong. See the dozen or so suttas in the Anamataggasamyutta of the SN's Nidānavagga (SN. ii. 177-193; = Connected Discourses I. 651-661). Note the key phrase:

"This is enough to experience revulsion towards all formations (sabbasaṅkhāresu nibbidā), enough to become dispassionate (virāga) towards them, enough to be liberated (vimutti) from them."

The "this" here, depending on the sutta, stands for the recollection of such things as

how long one has wandered in the past saṃsāra, how many oceans of tears one has shed, how many oceans of past mothers' milk one has drunk, how many mountains of bones one has left behind, etc. etc.

This is what the "danger of rebirth" is all about in the Buddha's teaching.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 17, 2009 6:36 AM
Title: Re: An Uposatha Question
Content:
Hi Justin,

A day is reckoned as being from dawn to dawn, rather than midnight to midnight, so one would begin the avoidance of high or large seats and beds at dawn on the Uposatha day and continue it until the dawn of the day after.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 17, 2009 2:09 PM
Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)
Content:
It's not difficult to avoid it and merely requires that one stay away from malarial regions (i.e. most of the Cambodian border districts and certain of the less inhabited Burmese and Laotian border districts). This is what I did for the first 13 years, but then a couple of years ago I went to spend the rains retreat on a private island that was close enough to Cambodia to be visited by malarial mosquitoes from there. It hits you very hard when you get it for the first time, but if properly treated subsequent occurrences will get milder and milder and less and less frequent.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 18, 2009 10:54 AM
Title: Re: Retrofuturist in hospital
Content:

Wishing you a swift recovery.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 18, 2009 10:56 AM
Title: Re: Greetings
Content:
Hi Karma Gedun,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel!

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 18, 2009 10:57 AM
Title: Re: well wishes
Content:
Hi Charlie,

Welcome. Good to see you around again.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 18, 2009 11:11 AM
Title: Re: Hello friends!
Content:
Hi Lotus,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

I think I remember you from E-sangha. Is your thesis the one on C.A.F. Rhys Davids, or am I confusing you with someone else?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2009 11:32 AM

Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)

Content:

Hi all,

Thanks again for your good wishes. Today I shall be going to another hospital for minor surgery and hope to be back here early next week.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Hello

Content:

Hi Danny,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 10:16 AM

Title: Re: Hi!

Content:

Hi Green,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Military destiny (to Retrofuturist, Appicchato, and others)

Content:

Yes, that's true. Ex-soldiers usually make very fine monks, as military training tends to imbue a man with the self-knowledge that enables him to avoid many of the more elementary errors that new monks are wont to make. If I were you I'd go for it (though don't kid yourself that's it's anything to do with destiny, caste etc. It's nothing of the kind; it's a choice you're making).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 11:01 AM

Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth

Content:

I haven't time to listen to the talk, but if you are stating T's view accurately then it is utter nonsense. None of the schools which taught the 3-life interpretation held that the result of eliminating ignorance is only experienced after another couple of lives.

If you eliminate ignorance there won't be any more lives. The result in the present life will be the pulling out of the first arrow (mental distress etc.) by Nibbana with remainder. The result in the future will be the pulling out of the second arrow (the dukkha inherent in the aggregates) by Nibbana without remainder.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 11:33 AM

Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth

Content:

No, Nibbana during this life is the complete extinguishing of the kilesas, not the khandhas.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 1:26 PM

Title: Re: Greetings

Content:

Hi Sevaka,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2009 1:57 PM

Title: Re: "Dogs do it better"

Content:

Hi Individual,

The only thing that comes to mind is the Soṇa Sutta (AN. iii. 221-2), where the Buddha describes the five ways in which dogs are better than brahmins, owing to the latter's discarding of their ancient customs. It's one of a series of suttas where the Buddha decries how the brahmins of his day had degenerated. To paraphrase:

1. Dogs only have sex with other dogs, whereas brahmins, though formerly having sex only with other brahmins, nowadays will do it with women from any caste.
2. Dogs only have sex when the bitch is in season, whereas brahmins will do it at any time.
3. Dogs don't buy and sell bitches, but rather, will mate according to mutual affection. Brahmins do buy and sell lady brahmins.
4. Dogs don't hoard silver, gold, grain etc., but brahmins do.
5. Dogs go looking for their evening meal in the evening and their morning meal in the morning. Brahmins stuff themselves silly and then keep the leftovers for the next meal.

"Verily, bhikkhus, these are the five ancient brahmin dhammas that are nowadays practised by dogs but not by brahmins."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 1:24 AM
Title: Re: Online Pali Canon?
Content:
Two complete Thai translations of the Tipitaka (those of Mahachula and Mahamakut) and one of the Atthakatha are already available on many websites.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 9:44 AM
Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth
Content:
It would seem so. Buddhadāsa's critique of the three-life interpretation seems to have been formulated in disregard of (or ignorance of) discourses like the Paṭiccasamuppāda-vibhaṅga Sutta, the Paccaya Sutta, the Ñāṇavatthu Sutta, etc., in which the Buddha clearly defines the factors of dependent arising. And so disregarding the Buddha's definitions he then substitutes his own.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 10:21 AM

Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)

Content:

Sure, if I'm invited.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 10:23 AM

Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)

Content:

Thanks for the offer, but I don't think I'm in need of anything at the moment. (At least not unless you want to carry me about on your shoulders).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)

Content:

Yes, I'm limping but living. I hope your recovery is proceeding well too.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 10:33 AM

Title: Re: English Translation of Upekkhā

Content:

This is seldom the case. Sometimes an analysis of a Pali word's etymology and construction will give one a general sense of what the word denotes, but without conveying much about its connotations or its context-related meanings. Sometimes such an analysis will convey nothing useful at all or may even seriously mislead.

I think you would be better off starting with the treatment of upekkhā in the Saḷāyatanaṭṭhapaṇṇāsutta (MN. 137), the Nirāmisasutta (SN. iv. 235-7) and the Book of Analysis (U Thitila's translation of the Vibhanga). Then check the indexes of MLD and CD.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 23, 2009 10:52 AM
Title: Re: The Danger of Rebirth
Content:
So where does he discuss greying and wrinkling?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 24, 2009 7:01 AM
Title: Re: Monks and Family
Content:
Yes, though since this is a matter that is not covered in the Vinaya, in practice the frequency and length of visits will vary according to the in-house rules of a particular community or the views of a particular abbot.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 24, 2009 8:42 AM
Title: Pali Website Recommendation
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 24, 2009 9:29 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma and Happiness
Content:
In the Buddha's teaching (e.g., AN. ii. 149) correct practice may be any of the following four:

1. dukkha and leading rapidly to awakening.
2. dukkha and leading only slowly to awakening.
3. sukha and leading rapidly to awakening.
4. sukha and leading only slowly awakening.

So it would seem that your quoted statement is a non-Vibhajjavādin over-generalization. If the statement were true then it would mean that only #2 would count as correct practice, but the Buddha didn't teach that.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 24, 2009 9:37 AM
Title: Re: Online Pali Canon?
Content:
I don't know of any online interlinear translation of the Satipatthana Sutta.

The Thai translation of the Tipitaka and its commentaries is available here:
<http://www.84000.org>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 24, 2009 1:33 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism has been in Thailand far longer than thought?
Content:
The writer means that Buddhism was present in what is now Thailand before the arrival of Sri Lankan monks here, not before Buddhism arrived in Sri Lanka.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 25, 2009 6:29 AM
Title: Re: Greetings to friends in the Dhamma
Content:
Hello Sally,

Welcome, and thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 25, 2009 6:43 AM

Title: Re: "Bhikkhu", before or after Dhamma name?

Content:

Just regional conventions. 'Bhikkhu' before the name is the norm in Sri Lanka and Burma; 'bhikkhu' after the name is the norm in Thailand, Laos and Cambodia. That's assuming the word bhikkhu is used at all, which isn't always the case; in Asia one more often finds 'thera' or some regional title such as 'chao khun' or 'sayadaw' used instead.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 25, 2009 7:11 AM

Title: Re: Online Pali Canon?

Content:

Yes, it depicts him lying in the lion's posture at the time of his parinibbāna.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 25, 2009 10:50 AM

Title: Re: Why can there be only one Buddha at at time?

Content:

Bahudhātukasutta (MN. 115), Mahāgovindasutta (DN. 19), Sampasādanīyasutta (DN. 28), and a few others:

"He [i.e., the bhikkhu who understands the possible and the impossible] understands: 'It is impossible, it cannot happen that two Arahants who are Sammāsambuddhas could arise contemporaneously in one world-system — there is no such possibility.'"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 25, 2009 1:32 PM

Title: Re: Why can there be only one Buddha at at time?

Content:

I should think so, for if I remember right, 'lokadhātu' refers to just one ten thousandfold world-system, not to the whole universe.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2009 12:38 PM

Title: Re: Why can there be only one Buddha at a time?

Content:

It's not the whole universe, but rather the portion or extent of the universe that gets shaken when a Buddha first sets the Dhamma Wheel turning.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2009 12:52 PM

Title: Re: Hi =)

Content:

Hi Mauricio,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2009 9:37 PM

Title: Re: Feeling

Content:

Vedanā has no connection at all with the words *ve* and *dāna*.

Most Pali words are formed by taking verbal roots (*dhātu*), adding various prefixes and/or suffixes to them, and then making phonetic modifications according to rules specified in the classical grammars. Consequently, the final forms of several words derived from the same verbal root may be very dissimilar. For example, *akkhara* ('letter') and *nakkhatta* ('star'), despite their dissimilar appearance, are both derived from the verbal root *khar*, "to end, spoil, or become empty."

Conversely, several words that look very similar may be derived from entirely different verbal roots. For example, quite a few of the words in the list you posted have no connection with vedanā at all.

So, trying to identify words related to vedanā by searching Pali dictionaries for similar-looking words is not the proper procedure. (It's actually the sort of pseudo-scholarship that one gets from people like Jhanananda and Shakya Aryanatta). Rather, one must begin by finding what the word's root is (this will often be given in the PTS Pali-English Dictionary) and then looking up the root in a dictionary of verbal roots such as the Saddaniti Dhātumālā or the Dhātuppadīpikā.

In the case of vedanā the root is vid. Some related words from the Dhātuppadīpikā's entry for vid:

vidati, vedo, vidū, vedī, vijjā, vedeti, vedayati, vindati, govindo, vitti, vedikā, nibbindati, nibbindaṃ, nibbiṇṇo, vittaṃ, vijjati, saṃvijjati, vedayitaṃ, vedayamāno, paṭivedeti, paṭivedayati.

On a final note, it should be remarked that the fact that two Pali words are derived from the same root doesn't necessarily mean that either of them will shed any semantic light on the other, for their meanings will in many cases have nothing to do with each other (as we saw with the words akkhara and nakkhatta).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 4:30 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 6 - MN 57. Kukkuravatika Sutta
Content:

The distinction is between merely being dedicated to an akusala habit and being dedicated to an akusala habit with the wrong view that it is kusala. One might, for example, be a bank robber who accepts that stealing is wrong but does it anyway out of greed for money, or one might rob banks thinking that this is ethically justified (like Lenin and his associates or the Baader-Meinhof gang, who robbed banks to finance their revolutionary activities). In the latter case the akusala kamma is weightier.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 5:33 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 6 - MN 57. Kukkuravatika Sutta

Content:

Yes, the wrong view that what is not a path leading to the deva world is in fact a path leading to the deva world (adevalokagāṃimaggā-devalokagāṃimaggā micchādiṭṭhi) is a species of niyati-micchādiṭṭhi — wrong views that lead to hell.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 7:26 AM
Title: Re: Happy birthday, bodom_bad_boy!!!
Content:
Hi Bodom,

Many happy returns.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 8:18 AM
Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?
Content:

I'm currently reading the articles I downloaded from the latest edition of the Journal of Buddhist Ethics, nearly all of which contain material that will be of interest to Theravadins:

<http://www.buddhistethics.org/current.html>

Ven. Anālayo — The Sixfold Purity of an Arahant according to the Chabbisodhana Sutta.

Jayarava Michael Attwood — Did King Ajātasattu Confess to the Buddha, and did the Buddha Forgive Him?

Christopher Ives — Deploying the Dharma: Reflections on the Methodology of Constructive Buddhist Ethics

Michael Parnwell & Martin Seeger — The Relocalization of Buddhism in Thailand

Charles S. Prebish — Cooking the Buddhist Books: The Implications of the New Dating of the Buddha for the History of Early Indian Buddhism

Nirmala S. Salgado — Eight Revered Conditions: Ideological Complicity, Contemporary Reflections and Practical Realities

Colette Sciberras — Buddhism and Speciesism: on the Misapplication of Western Concepts to Buddhist Beliefs

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 6:23 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?

Content:

That's not correct. I would guess you are thinking of the Udāna passage where Sāriputta admits that he was unable to see mud sprites. However, he did possess the three vijjās and these are one of the things Mahāmoggallāna praises in his Theragāthā eulogy to Sāriputta. He would therefore have been able to recall his former lives.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?

Content:

I would say that rebirth is either implicit or presupposed in all three of these sermons.

The Buddha sometimes taught the Dhamma in brief and sometimes in detail. In the earliest phase of his teaching career he deliberately sought out those whose faculties were ripe for speedy awakening and for whom Dhamma teachings in brief were all that was needed for the arising of the Dhamma eye.

In the first sermon, the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta, part of the definition of the first noble truth is:

yampicchaṃ na labhati tampi dukkhāṃ

“Not to obtain what one wants is dukkha.”

This is an example of a statement of Dhamma in brief and was sufficient for the arising of the Dhamma eye in Koṇḍañña. In later teachings, however, the Buddha states the same in detail:

“And what, bhikkhus, is ‘not to obtain what one wants is dukkha? To beings subject to birth there comes the wish: ‘Oh, that we were not subject to birth! That birth would not

come to us!’ But this is not to be obtained by wishing, and not to obtain what one wants is dukkha.”

[repeat for aging, sickness, death, sorrow etc.]

(DN. 22; MN. 141)

And don’t try telling me that ‘subject to birth’, ‘subject to aging’ etc. really means subject to the momentary birth and death of the ego, for the same sutta defines these things in graphic physical terms (‘greying’, ‘wrinkling’ etc.).

In the second and third sermons rebirth is presupposed by the statement:

khīṇā jāti, vusitaṃ brahmacariyaṃ, kataṃ karaṇiyaṃ, nāparaṃ itthattāyā ti pajānāti ti.

“He knows: ‘destroyed is birth, the holy life has been lived, what needed to be done has been done, there is no more coming to any state of existence’”.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 7:04 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?

Content:

In the post to which you were earlier replying Dark Dream had used the term 'divine eye' (incorrectly, I think) to refer to knowledge of one's former lives.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2009 7:09 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?

Content:

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2009 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Yoga? The deep kind, not the trendy new stuff.

Content:

There are some overlaps. For example, the four brahmaviharas are mentioned in Patañjali's Yoga Sutras, with detailed instructions for practising them given in commentaries to this work. Nonetheless, I think it would be better for Buddhists to

learn such things from Pali Buddhist sources. In Hindu sources they will always be mixed up with wrong views of one sort or another, so one will have to waste time separating the wheat from the chaff.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2009 11:36 AM

Title: Re: Question About Awareness-release

Content:

Akappa-cetovimutti — usually translated "unshakable deliverance of mind" — is synonymous with arahatta-phala-cetovimutti, "the deliverance of mind that is the arahatta fruition." It is arrived at directly by vimuttis 3 and 4, but only indirectly (and not inevitably) by vimuttis 1 and 2, as these are only temporary samatha-style deliverances.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2009 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Feeling

Content:

'Sensation' is a reasonable translation of vedanā.

I think that everything that we term an 'emotion' in English would be encompassed by the saṅkhārakkhandha or the 50 cetasikas (i.e. the 52 cetasikas minus vedanā and saññā). Though I should add that not all of these cetasikas would be called emotions.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2009 8:28 PM

Title: Re: "I am" in Pali?

Content:

In Pali the English simple present ("I cook"), the continuous present ("I am cooking"), and the emphatic present ("I do cook") would all be conveyed by the single form ahaṃ pacāmi.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 28, 2009 10:46 PM
Title: Re: Question About Awareness-release
Content:
I can't recall encountering any other uses of cetovimutti but these.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:40 AM
Title: Re: Hi 8=]
Content:
Hi Branko,

Dobrodošli u Dhamma Wheel. Hvala Vam što ste nam se pridružili.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:52 AM
Title: Re: Why can there be only one Buddha at at time?
Content:
This is the most important sense of 'world' as far as the development of paññā is concerned, but it isn't the only way the Buddha uses the word, nor is it the sense that applies in the context of this thread.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:58 AM
Title: Re: Tathāgata
Content:
In the Classical Forum please limit discussion to Theravadin terms and sources.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 9:35 AM
Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?
Content:

I don't think that's correct. There is no repeatable experiment that will yield public knowledge of devas. Devas can be seen by humans in two circumstances: (1) a human masters the jhanas and develops the requisite supernormal knowledge; (2) a deva chooses to make himself visible to a human.

The former wouldn't count as scientific for the knowledge of devas gained thereby would be essentially private:

Just then the Venerable Upavana was standing in front of the Lord, fanning him. And the Lord told him to move 'Move aside, monk, do not stand in front of me.' And the Venerable Ananda thought: 'This Venerable Upavana has for long been the Lord's attendant, keeping close at hand, at his beck and call. And now in his last hour the Lord tells him to stand aside and not stand in front of him. Why ever does he do that?' And he asked the Lord about this.

'Ananda, the devas from ten world-spheres have gathered to see the Tathagata. For a distance of twelve yojanas around the Mallas' sal-grove near Kusinara there is not a space you could touch with the point of a hair that is not filled with mighty devas, and they are grumbling: "We have come a long way to see the Tathagata. It is rare for a Tathagata, a fully-enlightened Buddha, to arise in the world, and tonight in the last watch the Tathagata will attain final Nibbana, and this mighty monk is standing in front of the Lord, preventing us from getting a last glimpse of the Tathagata!"'

'But, Lord, what kind of devas can the Lord perceive?'

'Ananda, there are sky-devas whose minds are earth-bound, they are weeping and tearing their hair, raising their arms, throwing themselves down and twisting and turning, crying: "All too soon the Blessed Lord is passing away, all too soon the Well-Farer is passing away, all too soon the Eye of the World is disappearing!" And there are earth-devas whose minds are earth-bound, who do likewise. But those devas who are free from craving endure patiently, saying: "All compounded things are impermanent - what is the use of this?"'

(Mahaparibbana Sutta, Walshe trans.)

And the latter case, where a deva makes himself visible, would be an impossible thing to engineer for it's entirely in the hands of the devas. As devas can't stand the smell of humans they normally have no wish to appear to us at all and will do so only in rather unusual circumstances. And so the apprehension of devas may be by jhana-based

powers or by saddha, but not by the scientific method.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 9:59 AM
Title: Re: Feeling
Content:

Quite a number of the cetasikas will be present at the moment of animitta-cetovimutti. Which ones in particular will depend on which of the five rūpajjhānas is present at the time of the arising of the supramundane consciousness.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 10:37 AM
Title: Re: Buddhist Rebirth Refuted?
Content:
Sorry. I've now unmangled them.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 1:27 PM
Title: Re: Ola
Content:
Hi Yanick,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 1:50 PM
Title: Re: Bhikku Forum
Content:

Though not opposed to the idea, I can't imagine very much happening in such a forum. There aren't many bhikkhus here and if I wanted to discuss something with one of them

I'd rather do it privately. There is already a Yahoo e-mail group for Buddhist monks and nuns; it has 49 members, but there've only been five posts in the last six months. Online monastics just don't seem to have much inclination to talk with each other.

Even on Facebook, where I have a couple of dozen bhikkhus in my network, I hardly ever talk with any of them. When I log in I seem to spend most of the time answering questions on Dhamma from Malaysian and Indonesian laypeople. Also, I notice that the other bhikkhus on Facebook appear to be interacting far more with laypeople than with each other.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 3:51 PM

Title: Re: who is phra sanghajai?

Content:

It's the Thai depiction of the Buddha's disciple Mahākaccāyana in the form of a very fat monk rather similar to Hotei.

You will find plenty about him online if you use the Rajapundit transliteration "sangkachai".

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 4:08 PM

Title: Re: who is phra sanghajai?

Content:

From Wikipedia:

Phra Sangkadchai/ Phra Sangkachai

In Thailand Budai is sometimes confused with another similar monk widely respected in Thailand, Phra Sangkadchai or Sangkachai (Thai: พระสังกัจจายน์). Phra Sangkadchai, a Thai spelling of Mahakaccayanathera (Thai: มหากัจจายนเถระ), was a Buddhist Arhat (in Sanskrit) or Arahant (in Pali) during the time of the Lord Buddha. Lord Buddha praised Phra Sangkadchai for his excellence in explaining sophisticated dharma (or dhamma) in an easily and correctly understandable manner. Phra Sangkadchai also composed the Madhupinadika Sutra.

One tale relates that he was so handsome that once even a man wanted him for a wife. To avoid a similar situation, Phra Sangkadchai decided to transform himself into a fat

monk. Another tale says he was so attractive that angels and men often compared him with the Buddha. He considered this inappropriate, so disguised himself in an unpleasantly fat body.

Although both Budai and Phra Sangkadchai may be found in both Thai and Chinese temples, Phra Sangkadchai is found more often in Thai temples, and Budai in Chinese temples. Two points to distinguish them from one another are:

1. Phra Sangkadchai has a trace of hair on his head (looking similar to the Buddha's) while Budai is clearly bald.
2. Phra Sangkadchai wears the robes in Theravadin Buddhist fashion with the robes folded across one shoulder, leaving the other uncovered. Budai wears the robes in Chinese style, covering both arms but leaving the front part of the upper body uncovered.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Budai>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:15 PM

Title: Re: who is phra sanghajai?

Content:

I don't know anything about its origin.

I suppose it might be a real fellow; there is a Hindu-like ascetic practice that some of the most austere Thai monks used to undertake (though not any more as far as I know), which consisted in blindfolding oneself or making an adhiṭṭhāna to keep one's eyes closed for a certain period. My teacher's teacher, Khrubar Brahmajak, did this for four years in his early days as a dhutanga monk. For the first two years his fellow monks would lead him by the hand on almsround each day. Then he abandoned all companionship and just relied on his sense of touch and hearing to navigate his way out of the forest and into the village.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:18 PM

Title: Re: Why can there be only one Buddha at a time?

Content:

Buddhaghosa:

Buddha-fields (buddhakkhetta) are of three kinds: the field of birth (jātikhetta), the field

of authority (āṇākhetta), and the field of scope (visayakhetta).

Herein, the field of birth is limited by the ten-thousandfold world-spheres that quaked on the Tathāgata's taking rebirth-linking, and so on.

The field of authority is limited by the hundred thousand million world-spheres within which the following protections (paritta) are efficacious: the Ratana Sutta, the Khandha Paritta, the Dhajagga Paritta, the Āṭānāṭiya Paritta and the Mora Paritta.

The field of scope is boundless, immeasurable: 'As far as he wishes' it is said (AN. i. 228). (Path of Purification xiii. 31)

The commentaries to the suttas which say that it is impossible for two Sammāsambuddhas to appear in a single world-sphere (lokadhātu) identify world-sphere with the field of birth, hence a ten-thousandfold world-sphere.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2009 6:32 PM
Title: Re: Classical Theravada Theology
Content:

I haven't time to write anything now, but the Buddha's teaching on the three adhipateyyas (self, world and the Dhamma) is a good place to start:

<http://www.accesstosight.org/tipitaka/an/an03/an03.040.than.html>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 2, 2009 11:37 AM
Title: Re: Feeling
Content:

No. Vipassanā knowledge, even at the lowest level, has dhammas as its object.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 2, 2009 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Asaññasatta

Content:

They have no mentality of any kind. They are just gigantic lumps of rūpa lounging about in the Brahma world. They differ from statues in that they are kammically generated material continua (rūpa-santati). When the kamma that generated this rebirth is exhausted then they break up and a new citta-santati gets kickstarted by a past citta from the life before they became impercipient beings.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 2, 2009 7:08 PM

Title: Re: Tantra

Content:

I've never heard of a Theravada teacher advising anyone to do this. If any were to do so it would be blatantly at odds with the Buddha's teaching that stealing is an unwholesome act. There is simply no Pali text to which the teacher might appeal to give his advice any legitimacy. At the conclusion of a bhikkhu's ordination ceremony he will be exhorted not to steal even a blade of grass, let alone a prostitute's underwear.

By contrast, in the Mahayana (and a fortiori the Vajrayana) there is an elaborately developed ideology for the legitimizing of unwholesome conduct of almost every sort, to which any unscrupulous or perverted teacher might appeal. Its chief form is the doctrine of expedient means.

To get some idea of how radically the Mahayanists departed from the sīla of the Buddha's Buddhism you might be interested in the chapter on Mahayana ethics in Peter Harvey's *An Introduction to Buddhist Ethics*.

A couple of pages from Harvey's book:

1.jpg (301.94 KiB) Viewed 6488 times

2.jpg (275.54 KiB) Viewed 6490 times

Also of interest is Dza Patrul Rinpoche's *Nine Considerations and Criteria for Benefiting Beings*, wherein it is maintained that a (Mahayana) Bodhisattva may, and in some

circumstances must, commit any of the ten akusala dhammas.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 2, 2009 8:49 PM
Title: Re: Asaññasatta
Content:

No, not that big. If they are born in the standing posture they are said to be 12 yojanas (192 km) in height. But that only applies to Brahmas reborn as Asaññasattas. Humans reborn there will be in the sitting posture and so will look rather shorter.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 2, 2009 10:16 PM
Title: Re: Tantra
Content:
Why not wonder?

Any newcomer to Buddhism who frequents Buddhist forums is sure to meet with claims (1) that the Pali Canon contains the earliest record of the Buddha's teaching and (2) that the Buddha taught the Mahayana sutras and tantras. So when s/he discovers that the latter are not to be found in the former, and indeed are frequently at odds with the former, it's natural that doubt will arise regarding the veracity of the second claim.

And as the Kalama Sutta states, it's proper to doubt in doubtful matters.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 7:06 AM
Title: Re: Hello Hola Ciao Salut
Content:
Hi Paul,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 10:09 AM
Title: Re: Hi
Content:
Hi Gotamist,

Good to see you around. I was wondering what had become of you.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 5:05 PM
Title: Re: Hi from Phil
Content:
Hi Phil,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 10:04 PM
Title: Re: Tantra
Content:

You are welcome to start a thread on that topic. But in this thread I believe the OP's question is concerned with whether there is any tantra in Theravada Buddhist teachings, which is a separate issue from whether there is (or ever has ever been) a tantric presence in the Asian Theravadin cultural milieu.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 10:53 PM

Title: Re: across the lines - wrong understanding

Content:

I don't think this necessarily follows. An arahant could hardly be charged with lacking in understanding of his tradition, yet the Buddha's arahant disciples included people who were not polite and whom not even all of the Buddha's disciples found inspiring. The arahant Pilindavaccha, for example, was in the habit of addressing junior monks as 'menials', much to their chagrin. If the man couldn't make himself universally appealing even to the Theravada community then there is no reason to think he would have been inspiring to Mahayanists (had any been around in the Buddha's time) who despise arahants.

To take another example, the members of those Nichirenist sects that stress aggressive proselytizing are not people whom I would describe as "polite and even somewhat inspiring." Rather, I would describe them as boorish and even somewhat appalling. But I wouldn't conclude from this that they haven't properly understood their tradition, for in fact they are behaving pretty much like Nichiren himself.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2009 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Hi from Mudra

Content:

Hi Mudra,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2009 1:26 AM

Title: Re: across the lines - wrong understanding

Content:

In the case of Pilindavaccha, his offensiveness wasn't like that of Marpa (i.e., some kind of deliberate teaching device targeted at a particular audience). It was just the way he was. When monks complained to the Buddha about it they were told that Pilindavaccha's behaviour wasn't due to any inner fault; he just couldn't help appearing haughty because he'd been a brahmin for the previous five hundred lives.

And so what I was getting at in my post is that nothing can be reliably inferred about someone's understanding of the Dhamma on the basis of his good manners or lack of

them, nor on the basis of how inspiring he is.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2009 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravadins?

Content:

The Burma specialist Dr. Patrick Pranke of the University of Michigan's Center for Southeast Asian Studies would be the one to ask about this. For his doctoral thesis Pranke did extensive fieldwork in Burma on the *weikza-lam* — a cult of semi-Theravadin Buddhist wizards whose practice (a blend of Abhidhamma study, alchemy, mantra chanting and consuming poisonous substances) is aimed at prolonging their present life until the coming of Metteyya Buddha and then awakening as his disciples. If there is any living tradition of tantric Buddhism in Burma I'm sure Patrick will know about it. I don't have his e-mail address but you should be able to find it through google. He's a very approachable guy and if you contact him you can mention my name (he'll probably remember me as "Phra Robert").

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2009 9:15 PM

Title: Re: what is meant by nothing felt?

Content:

“Felt happiness” (*vedayita sukha*) means the *vedanā* that arises dependent on either the five cords of sense pleasure (*kāmaguṇa*) or the eight attainments (*samāpatti*). But this happiness is not unqualifiedly happy for it is still subject to *saṅkhāra-dukkha*. (“Whatsoever is felt, all that is included in *dukkha*” — MN. iii. 207).

“Non-felt happiness” (*avedayita sukha*) is not any kind of *vedanā*, but rather is a term for *nirodha*. Being free even of *saṅkhāra-dukkha* this is an unqualifiedly happy state.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2009 6:16 AM

Title: Re: Hello

Content:
Hi Ravana,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 5, 2009 1:28 PM
Title: Re: MN 135. Cūḷakammavibhanga Sutta
Content:

Had the Buddha wished to give a discourse describing the present life benefits of wholesome action and the present-life perils of unwholesome action, I think he would have made it clear that it was the present life he had in mind. As he does, for example, in the Sihasenapati Sutta:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an05/an05.034.than.html> when asked, "Is it possible, lord, to point out a fruit of generosity visible in the here & now?"

But in the Cūḷakammavibhanga Sutta paragraphs 5-18 each pointedly state that the consequences referred to occur "on the dissolution of the body, after death." So how can your proposed interpretation possibly be faithful to the Buddha's intent?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 5, 2009 2:41 PM
Title: Re: MN 135. Cūḷakammavibhanga Sutta
Content:

Well, it can be both, and I didn't mean to suggest otherwise. Nonetheless, given the repeated phrase "...on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears..." it would seem that this sutta's focus is on the outcomes that present actions will have on the next life, and (given Subha's original question to the Buddha) the way that humans are differentiated in the present life on account of actions performed in their past life.

And so a reading of the sutta that sees the Buddha as referring only to present life outcomes of present life actions seems to me to be missing the point.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 8:03 AM
Title: Re: Poll: Are you vegetarian/vegan?
Content:
Except in Scotland.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_Burke

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 8:19 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?
Content:
In which Ingram states:
In short, the Limited Emotional Range Model, the Limited Possible Action Model, and the Limited Possible Thought Model of enlightenment are all completely off the mark and have nothing to do with actual perception of the Truth of Things.
Since the three "models" dismissed by Ingram constitute most of what the suttas have to say about the character of arahants, the "arahantship" of which he speaks cannot be that taught by the Buddha.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 8:48 AM
Title: Re: Controversial Theravada traditions?
Content:
I wouldn't call it new (except for the vegetarianism). In the Mahavacchagotta Sutta (MN. 73) the Buddha's householder followers are divided into (1) "male and female lay followers, clothed in white, enjoying sensual pleasures" and (2) "male and female lay followers, clothed in white, leading lives of celibacy."

I think the most one could say is that it's unusual for monks to promote the brahmachariya among householders to the extent that the Santi Asoke monks do.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 9:14 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

This may have more to do with Ingram's tendentious choice of terms to characterize the models than with the models themselves.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 9:24 AM

Title: Re: Feeling

Content:

The brahmaviharas are termed immeasurables when they are developed with an object of unlimited range, as opposed to when one specifies particular individuals or groups.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

Could you point to an example or two of these contradictions in the suttas?

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Feeling

Content:

Yes, in samatha-bhavana the development of any brahmavihara as an immeasurable is preceded by its development with a limited range, with the range being gradually increased.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 3:59 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist cosmology

Content:

For another PTS scholar's view (and a more careful and sensitive reader of texts than Gombrich) see Rupert Gethin's *Cosmology and Meditation*:

<http://ccbs.ntu.edu.tw/FULLTEXT/JR-EPT/rupert.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 4:18 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

From Ingram's book, *Mastering the Core Teachings*, an account of the Limited Possible Action Model:

The Action Models tend to involve certain actions that enlightened beings cannot commit or certain actions they must commit. Both types of models are completely ridiculous, and so we come now to the first of the models that simply has no basis in reality. The traditional Theravada models contain numerous statements about what enlightened being cannot do or will do that are simply wrong. My favorite examples of this insanity include statements that arahats cannot break the precepts (including killing, lying, stealing, having sex, doing drugs or drinking), cannot have erections, cannot have jobs, cannot be married, and cannot say they are arahats.

[...]

There is also another more subtle and seductive view, and this is that enlightened being somehow will act in a way that is better or higher, though they won't define what those actions might be or what actions they might avoid. I consider this view very dangerous. While I wish to promote the shift in perception that I call awakening and other names, I don't want to make out that somehow this will save anyone from stupid actions or make them somehow always know how to do the right thing or avoid screwing up. Such views are a setup for massive badness and huge shadow sides, as anyone who has spent enough time in a spiritual community knows all too well. As Zen says, "The bigger the front, the bigger the back."

The list of highly enlightened individuals who have bitten the proverbial dust by putting themselves up on high, screwing up and then being exposed as actually being human is remarkably long, and the list of spiritual aspirants who have failed to draw the proper conclusions about reality from the failures of the enlightened is even longer. There are many schools of thought on this issue, and I will give them formal names here, though in reality they don't think of themselves this way.

The Halfway Up the Mountain School essentially believes, “Those who screwed up and caused a scandal were only part way up the mountain, only partially enlightened, as anyone who was really enlightened couldn’t possibly have done those terrible things.” While clearly some were only partially enlightened, or perhaps not enlightened at all in the technical sense, a number of those who screwed up clearly knew ultimate reality inside and out, and so this model misses many important points.

There is the Crazy Wisdom School that believes, “Enlightened beings transcend ordinary reality and with it ordinary morality, so that they are the natural manifestation of a Wisdom that seems crazy to us foolish mortals but is really a higher teaching in disguise!” While not entirely absurd, as there are many cultural aspects and societal rules that can seem a bit childish, artificial, unnecessary, unhelpful or naive in the face of realization, the Crazy Wisdom School provides too easy an excuse for plenty of behavior that has been and is just plain bad, irresponsible, stupid and needlessly destructive.

Then there is my school, for which I don’t have a catchy name, and it promotes the view that, “Enlightened beings are human, and unfortunately humans, enlightened or otherwise, all screw up sometimes. There is nothing special or profound about this.” In short, my school categorically rejects the specific lists and dogmas of the traditional Action Models in all forms, from the preposterous lists of the Theravada to the subtle sense that enlightened beings somehow are guaranteed to perpetually act in “enlightened” ways, whatever those are.

And on the Limited Emotional Range Model:

The Emotional Models are so fundamental to the standard ideals of awakening as to be nearly universal in their tyranny. You can’t swing a dead cat in the Great Spiritual Marketplace without hitting them. Almost every tradition seems to have gone out of its way to promote them in the most absurd and life-denying terms available, though there have been attempts at reform also. I must give thanks for the attempts, however ineffective, bizarre, mythologized, cryptic, and vague, that the Tibetan and Zen traditions have occasionally made in this regard, and mourn their nearly perpetual failure to make these issues clear. At least they tried, whereas the Theravada basically has really not tried in any significant way in 2,500 years so far as I can tell. If I am wrong, please let me know.

These emotional models basically claim that enlightenment involves some sort of emotional perfection, either gradually or suddenly, and usually make these dreams the primary criteria for their models of awakening and often ignoring or sidelining issues relating to clear perception of the true nature of phenomena. Usually these fantasies involves elimination of the “negative” emotions, particularly greed, hatred, anger, frustration, lust, jealousy, and sadness. At a more fundamental level, they promise the elimination of all forms of attraction and aversion.

As I am sure you can already tell, I am no fan of these models of enlightenment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2009 4:21 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

And an Ingramist assessment of the Arahant Chapter of the Dhammapada:

Arahantavagga

1. The fever of passion exists not for him who has completed the journey, who is sorrowless and wholly set free, and has broken all ties.

No passions!? No sorrows!? Limited Emotional Range Model.

2. The mindful ones exert themselves. They are not attached to any home; like swans that abandon the lake, they leave home after home behind.

Don't stay in one place!? Limited Possible Action Model.

3. Those who do not accumulate and are wise regarding food, whose object is the Void, the Unconditioned Freedom — their track cannot be traced, like that of birds in the air.

Don't accumulate!? Limited Possible Action Model

4. He whose cankers are destroyed and who is not attached to food, whose object is the Void, the Unconditioned Freedom — his path cannot be traced, like that of birds in the air.

Cankers destroyed!? Limited Emotional Range Model.

5. Even the gods hold dear the wise one, whose senses are subdued like horses well trained by a charioteer, whose pride is destroyed and who is free from the cankers.

Senses subdued!? Pride destroyed!? Limited Possible Thought Model.

Free from the cankers!? Limited Emotional Range Model.

6. There is no more worldly existence for the wise one who, like the earth, resents nothing, who is firm as a high pillar and as pure as a deep pool free from mud.

Resents nothing!? Limited Emotional Range Model.

7. Calm is his thought, calm his speech, and calm his deed, who, truly knowing, is wholly freed, perfectly tranquil and wise.

Calm thought, speech and deeds!? Perfectly tranquil!? Aagh, this one's a real bummer.

Limited Possible Action Model and Limited Emotional Range Model and Limited Possible Thought Model.

8. The man who is without blind faith, who knows the Uncreated, who has severed all links, destroyed all causes (for karma, good and evil), and thrown out all desires — he, truly, is the most excellent of men.

Thrown out all desires!? Limited Emotional Range Model.

9. Inspiring, indeed, is that place where Arahants dwell, be it a village, a forest, a vale, or a hill.

Ah, now that's a cool verse!

10. Inspiring are the forests in which worldlings find no pleasure. There the passionless will rejoice, for they seek no sensual pleasures.

Passionless!? Seeking no sensual pleasures!? Bah, we're back again with the Limited Emotional Range Model.

All in all not a very reliable text: nine obviously apocryphal verses and just one that might have come from the Buddha.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 12:53 AM
Title: Re: hej hej hola
Content:
Hi David,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 2:09 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?
Content:
The imponderable is "the Buddha-range of Buddhas" (buddhānaṃ buddhavisaya), which is understood to refer to that of Sammāsambuddhas, not their arahant disciples.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 5:07 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?
Content:
To be fair, what Ingram repudiates is the Sutta teaching that arahants are incapable of transgressing certain precepts. As far as I know, he doesn't repudiate the precepts themselves. The exposition of sīla in his book is pretty much like that which one would get from Kornfield or any of the fluffier sort of North American vipassanā teachers. Which is to say, it's a bit woolly and lacking in clearcut descriptions of what each precept entails, but nonetheless not actually misleading.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 6:12 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

In the case of arahants one speaks of a *sāvakavisaya* ("disciple's range"), not a *buddhavisaya*. The *sāvakavisaya*, even in the case of the most accomplished arahants, will not include all of the ten Tathāgata powers (though some of these are attainable), nor knowledge of omniscience, nor unimpeded knowledge.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 9:38 AM

Title: Re: Controversial Theravada traditions?

Content:

No. "Clothed in white" (*odātavasana*) is an idiom that means being dressed in householders' clothes.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 9:59 AM

Title: Re: Looking for sariputta sutta

Content:

You're probably thinking of the *Pubbakoṭṭhaka Sutta* (SN. v. 220-2), though your paraphrase is not an accurate one.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn48/sn48.044.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

I think it's attributed to arahant disciples not having developed the perfections for as long a time or to the same degree as a *Sammāsambuddha*.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 11:31 AM
Title: Re: metta as my main practice
Content:
Fair enough, but you over-generalize when you claim that your experience will be true for everyone.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 11:36 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?
Content:
I guess they weren't qualified for the task. That is to say, on the occasion when they encountered a Buddha they had the necessary qualities to undertake the path of discipleship, but lacked the requisite qualities that would have made them fit for undertake the Bodhisatta career.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 11:45 AM
Title: Re: Looking for sariputta sutta
Content:
I can't think of one. In fact the only one that comes to mind says almost exactly the opposite of this.
Bhikkhus, for a faithful disciple who is intent on fathoming the Teacher's dispensation, it is fitting that he conduct himself thus: "The Blessed One is the Teacher; I am his disciple. The Blessed One knows; I do not know."
(Kīṭāgiri Sutta, MN. 70)
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2009 12:05 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma book written by arahat?

Content:

In the developed form of the ideas regarding Bodhisattas, a Bodhisatta's career started with his making a resolution before a Buddha (abhinīhāra-karana or mūlapanidhāna) to become a Buddha for the welfare and liberation of all creatures. In later literature, the abhinīhāra is preceded by a period during which the Bodhisatta practises manopaniḍḍhi, when he resolves in his mind to desire to become a Buddha without declaring this intention to others.

For the abhinīhāra to be effective, eight conditions should be fulfilled (Bu.ii.59; explained at BuA.75f. and SNA.i.48f): the aspirant should be

- * (1) a human being,
- * (2) a male,
- * (3) sufficiently developed to become an arahant in that very birth,
- * (4) a recluse at the time of the declaration,
- * (5) he should declare his resolve before a Buddha,
- * (6) should be possessed of attainments such as the jhānas,
- * (7) be prepared to sacrifice all, even life, and
- * (8) his resolution should be absolutely firm and unwavering.

(from the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names, entry for Bodhisatta
http://www.palikanon.com/english/pali_names/b/bodhisatta.htm)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2009 7:38 PM

Title: Re: Looking for sariputta sutta

Content:

Now that you've quoted it, I recall there was a discussion of this Ajahn Chah quote at E-sangha. The ajahn has simply given an inaccurate paraphrase of Sariputta's reply.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2009 7:57 PM

Title: Re: Complete Buddhist Pilgrimage Sites - Video Documentry

Content:

Hi Ishara,

Thanks for this, and welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2009 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)

Content:

Some months ago I reverted to using my old Icelandic e-mail account as it has better spam control than the Thai one:

robedd
at
islandia
dot
is

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2009 8:48 PM

Title: Re: metta as my main practice

Content:

If by "systematic practice" you mean the use of the brahmavihāra attainments as a basis for insight and liberation, then of course I would agree with you. This isn't to be found outside the Buddha's teaching, for the reason I mentioned in my last post: outside teachers cannot teach full comprehension of attachment to self doctrines (attavādupādāna).

But in your earlier post your claims that "[non-Buddhists] won't be able to succeed in practicing real metta" and that they "only pretend to practice metta -- only say the words, but do not know metta" seem rather more sweeping claim than your present one. There is nothing "unreal" about the mettā that a non-Buddhist might cultivate in meditation and practice in his dealings with others. It's just that it won't be adequate for the highest goal if it is unaccompanied by the development of right view. (But nor will the mettā cultivated by a Buddhist if s/he neglects right view development).

Regarding the two sutta passages that you quote, one should note that the vital distinction is between the practice of a noble disciple (i.e. stream-enterers, once-returners etc.) and that of a wordling. This is not the same as the distinction between

the practice of one who has gone for refuge and one who has not. The class of those who have gone for refuge will include both noble disciples and worldlings.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 8, 2009 8:49 PM
Title: Re: Venerable Dhammanando away for a few days, unwell (update 3)
Content:
Hi Thundreams,

Thank you, and welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 3:17 AM
Title: Re: some very specific vegetarian questions
Content:
Changing the question to: "Does purchasing meat at a meat store constitute having another kill?" the answer is no.

The unwholesome kamma of having someone kill a living being entails exactly the same five factors as the unwholesome kamma of killing a living being oneself (i.e., a living being, a perception of a living being, a volition bent on killing, an effort towards that end, and the death of a being as a result). The only difference lies in the form that the effort takes.

Since people don't ordinarily purchase meat with the wish that by so doing more animals will be killed, their purchase does not amount to "having another kill something". The factors of killing volition, effort and the death of a being as a result of that effort will all be absent.

One should not give the verb "to have another kill something" a causal scope that stretches way beyond that which it is given in the Pali texts.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Pali Canon - can it be attributed back to the Buddha?

Content:

Carbon-dating doesn't really have any application here. The life-span of ola leaves in a tropical climate is very short indeed and so manuscripts had to be regularly recopied.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 9:31 AM

Title: Re: some very specific vegetarian questions

Content:

1. A person's purchase of chicken flesh does not amount to the akusala kamma of having someone kill chickens.

2. A person's knowledge that purchasing chicken flesh will be a contributory factor to more chickens being killed, or his ignorance of this, will not alter the fact that his purchase of chicken flesh does not amount to the akusala kamma of having someone kill chickens.

(The Vinaya principle that applies here is that the mere knowing about the probable outcome of an action does not in itself constitute the willing of that outcome. For example, in a forest monastery one of the bhikkhus' daily duties is to sweep the leaves on the forest paths. This sweeping will most probably, indeed almost inevitably, lead to the accidental injury or deaths of some ants and other small insects. But even though a bhikkhu knows that this is likely to happen, he does not incur any offence for the deaths that his sweeping causes, except in the unlikely event that his decision to sweep leaves is prompted by a desire that insects will be killed).

3. Whether the chickens were raised in battery farms, or in free range farms, or in sumptuous palaces waited upon by liveried footmen, has no bearing on the question of whether a person's purchasing their dead flesh would amount to the akusala kamma of having someone kill chickens.

4. A person who resolves not to purchase the flesh of chickens, doing so out of compassion for chickens and in the hope that this will reduce the demand for chicken flesh and lead to fewer chickens being killed, performs wholesome mind-door kamma on account of his compassionate volition.

5. But if this same person is the sort of militant vegetarian who alleges that those who don't do as he does are committing the unwholesome body-door kamma of having someone kill chickens, then he goes too far. He is disregarding the most elementary teaching on kamma, namely, that kamma is volition. In permitting such a view to persist

within himself he commits the unwholesome mind-door kamma of nurturing a wrong view regarding the wholesome and the unwholesome. In propounding this view to others he commits the unwholesome speech-door kamma of misrepresenting the Tathāgata.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 10:32 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 7 - MN 135. Cūḷakammavibhanga Sutta
Content:

Sādhu! That's exactly what this teaching is for. Reflecting backwards would be grasping the wrong end of the snake. It seems to me that Dark Dream's objections to this sutta are premised on the unwarranted assumption that grasping the wrong end of the snake is what everyone will in fact do.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 10:33 AM
Title: Re: some very specific vegetarian questions
Content:

The first two verbs are hanati and ghāṭeti, meaning to kill and to have another kill. These are the same verbs as in the Dhammapada verses I referred to earlier in this thread. And yes, the latter does mean the same as param paṇātipāte samādapeti.

The third verb, hanataṃ paresaṃ anujānāti, would be literally translated as "permit killing on the part of others". It corresponds to approving/condoning (samanuñño) in the sutta quoted by Ven. Pesala. In practice, however, the meaning is rather narrower than this. It generally has to do with conspiracy scenarios in which two or more persons jointly agree to kill someone. When the killing takes place, although perhaps only one person does the actual deed, all those who plotted towards this end incur the akusala body-door kamma of intentional killing. So the verb hanati applies to the fellow who stabs or shoots, while samanunñño or anujānāti apply to the rest of the plotters.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 2:41 PM

Title: Re: Complete Buddhist Pilgrimage Sites - Video Documentry

Content:

You can if you want. Go to <http://keepvid.com/>, paste in the youtube url and the video will be downloaded to your computer.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 2:47 PM

Title: Re: some very specific vegetarian questions

Content:

Yes.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 2:48 PM

Title: Re: Greetings

Content:

Hi Ed,

Welcome. I'm glad you found us.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 9, 2009 3:48 PM

Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)

Content:

As the vri fonts don't work well for Macintosh users I thought it would be best to download the study files, convert them to rtf files with unicode formatting and then e-mail them to anyone interested. I'll do the work this evening, so pm me with your e-mail address for a copy of the files.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2009 10:55 AM

Title: Re: Memory Loss

Content:

If by "insights" you mean vipassana knowledges attained, then no. These accumulate in the mental continuum and are never lost, even if one has to wait for some future life for them to be "reactivated".

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2009 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Titles of the Buddha (in Pali & English)

Content:

If you download the Buddhagunagāthāvalī you will find hundreds of them, arranged thematically as in a thesaurus. For example, if you look up "tathāgata" you will get:
yathāvādī tathākārī, tathavādī tathāgato.
yathākārī tathāvādī, buddhaṃ taṃ paṇamāmyahaṃ.

and:

maggagavesī maggagū, maggakkhāto tathāgato.
amatamaggaṃ dassāvī, buddhaṃ taṃ paṇamāmyahaṃ.
<http://nt.med.ncku.edu.tw/biochem/lsn/newrain/canon/pali-tipitaka-f1/Anna/Buddhavandana/Buddhagunagatha.doc>

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2009 11:13 AM

Title: Re: Hello

Content:

Hi Glenn,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 10, 2009 1:11 PM
Title: Re: Word search
Content:
Hi Phil,

The PED entry reads:
Apadāna (nt.)

1. [= Sk. apadāna] removing, breaking off, D iii.88.
2. [= Sk. avadāna cp. ovāda] advice, admonition, instruction, morals Vin ii.4 (an° not taking advice), 7 (id.) M i.96; A v.337 sq. (saddhā°) Th 1, 47.
3. legend, life history. In the title Mahāpadāna suttanta it refers to the 7 Buddhas. In the title Apadānaṃ, that is "the stories", it refers almost exclusively to Arahants. The other, (older), connotation seems to have afterwards died out. See Dialogues ii.3. -- Cp. also pariyāpadāna.
Apadāna in the sense of "deed" or "behaviour" is missing from the PED but is given in the older (and often better) dictionary of R.C. Childers and in my Pali-Thai dictionary. The translation of the phrase in the Thai Tipiṭaka expresses the same meaning as Bhikkhu Bodhi's.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 10, 2009 1:16 PM
Title: Re: Metta request
Content:
Wishing you a speedy recovery.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 9:15 AM
Title: Re: Howdy from ZFI
Content:
Hi Keith,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 1:58 PM
Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)
Content:
Greetings,

As Dhamma Wheel's settings have just been tweaked to permit the uploading of zip and rtf files I am uploading a file containing the html pages of de Silva's Primer, converted to Unicode. Should you find the diacritics not displaying correctly on your browser, go to VIEW in your browser menu, select CHARACTER ENCODING, and then select Unicode-8.

./download/file.php?id=35
(103.57 KiB) Downloaded 326 times

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 8:27 PM
Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand Info & Advice
Content:

In the five years since I returned to Thailand I haven't felt any interest in travelling around to check out new monasteries or teachers, but have been content to stay in one place, with just occasional trips to the north for meditation retreats. Consequently, as far as monasteries go I don't have any new recommendations to add to those I posted to E-sangha.

Likewise with Thai language studies, I'm completely out of the loop now and have no idea what's available. The forums at <http://www.thaivisa.com> would be the place to ask about this.

For Pali study I don't know of any better place than Wat Tha Ma O, Sayadaw Dhammananda's monastery in Lampang, though Buddhaghosa College in Nakhorn Pathom will probably be just as good (the ajahns there are all former students of the sayadaw).

For Abhidhamma study, all of the schools that I've visited had pretty impressive and

capable teachers, with a high level of faith, energy and enthusiasm prevailing. So there's no particular Abhidhamma school that I would recommend more than the others. My reason for choosing Wat Rakhang is chiefly that the classrooms are air-conditioned.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 8:32 PM
Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand Info & Advice
Content:
Really? Do you happen to know the reason for this policy?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 8:42 PM
Title: Re: G'day!
Content:
Hi Dan,

Welcome, and thanks for the introduction.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 11, 2009 11:38 PM
Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand Info & Advice
Content:
I see. Thanks for clarifying.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 1:09 AM
Title: Re: Zen Moments

Content:

Hi Alan,

Thanks for joining us.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 9:09 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand Info & Advice

Content:

Probably just putting on a brave face. Kevin disrobed in February.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 9:22 AM

Title: Re: Buddhanussati in Visuddhimagga: Nava Guna or Dasa?

Content:

Into nine. Anuttaro shouldn't be separated from purisadammasarathi.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Titles of Mara (in Pali & English)

Content:

The Abhidhānappadīpikā gives eight. Translated according to the tika's explanation:

Antaka – “The Endmaker”

Vasavattī – “The Wielder of Power”

Pāpimā – “The Malign”

Pajāpati – “Lord of the Generation”

Pamattabandhu – “The Kinsman of the Heedless”

Kaṇha – “The Black One”

Māra – “The Killer”

Namuci – “The Unfreed”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Lotus position

Content:

How to Grow a Lotus: <http://zenmontpellier.site.voila.fr/eng/lotus/lotuseng.html>

The Zennists are very good if you need advice on sitting posture.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 9:41 AM

Title: Re: Prayer request forum.

Content:

In the Suttas (AN. ii. 164) "right praying" (*sammā āyācamānā*) for a monk means praying: "May I be like the venerables Sāriputta and Moggallāna!" For a nun it means: "May I be like the therīs Khemā and Uppalavaṇṇā!" For a layman it means: "May I be like the householders Citta and Hatthaka Āḷavaka!" For a laywoman it means, "May I be like Khujjuttarā and Veḷukaṇḍakī!"

The commentary to this sutta says that praying for anything other than the above is merely "wrong wishing" (*micchā patthanā*).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 12:38 PM

Title: Re: Buddhanussati in Visuddhimagga: Nava Guna or Dasa?

Content:

Hi Green,

I don't know anything about the origin of the *gāthā* that you quote. But in any case, that *anuttaro purisadammasārathi* is a single quality (as stated in the *Visuddhimagga*), with the first word qualifying the second, can be plainly seen in the Suttas. For example: "Among the teachers of training it is he that is called 'the incomparable leader of persons to be tamed.' So it was said. And with reference to what was this said?

"Guided by the elephant tamer, bhikkhus, the elephant to be tamed goes in one direction - east, west, north, or south. Guided by the horse tamer, bhikkhus, the horse to be tamed goes in one direction - east, west, north, or south. Guided by the ox tamer, bhikkhus, the ox to be tamed goes in one direction - east, west, north, or south.

“Bhikkhus, guided by the Tathāgata, accomplished and fully enlightened, the person to be tamed goes in eight directions.

“Possessed of material form, he sees forms: this is the first direction.

“Not perceiving forms internally, he sees forms externally: this is the second direction.

“He is resolved only upon the beautiful: this is the third direction.

“With the complete surmounting of perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of sensory impact, with non-attention to perceptions of diversity, aware that ‘space is infinite,’ he enters upon and abides in the base of infinite space: this is the fourth direction.

“By completely surmounting the base of infinite space, aware that ‘consciousness is infinite,’ he enters upon and abides in the base of infinite consciousness: this is the fifth direction.

“By completely surmounting the base of infinite consciousness, aware that ‘there is nothing,’ he enters upon and abides in the base of nothingness: this is the sixth direction.

“By completely surmounting the base of nothingness, he enters upon and abides in the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception: this is the seventh direction.

“By completely surmounting the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, he enters upon and abides in the cessation of perception and feeling: this is the eighth direction.

“Bhikkhus, guided by the Tathāgata, accomplished and fully enlightened, the person to be tamed goes in these eight directions.

“So it was with reference to this that it was said: ‘Among the teachers of training it is he that is called the incomparable leader of persons to be tamed.’”

(Sālāyatanavibhanga Sutta, MN. 137)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 12:52 PM

Title: Re: MN Session 8 - MN 41. Sāleyyaka Sutta: The Brahmins of Sālā

Content:

But the Theravadin maxim is not that a householder can't attain arahatta, but that he can't attain it and thereafter remain a householder.

The Subha Sutta is relevant in this connection, though here the Buddha is responding to the brahminical view that the household life is the true way:

The brahmin student Subha, Todeyya's son, went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side and asked the Blessed One:

“Master Gotama, the brahmins say this: ‘The householder is accomplishing the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome. The one gone forth [into homelessness] is not accomplishing the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.’ What does Master Gotama say about this?”

“Here, student, I am one who speaks after making an analysis (*vibhajjavāda*); I do not speak one-sidedly (*ekamsavāda*). I do not praise the wrong way of practice on the part either of a householder or one gone forth; for whether it be a householder or one gone forth, one who has entered on the wrong way of practice, by reason of his wrong way of practice, is not accomplishing the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome. I praise the right way of practice on the part either of a householder or one gone forth; for whether it be a householder or one gone forth, one who has entered on the right way of practice, by reason of his right way of practice, is accomplishing the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.”

(MN. 99)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Greetings and Namasakarn

Content:

Hi SeerObserver,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2009 8:16 PM

Title: Re: Prayer request forum.

Content:

I wouldn't read it as meaning that it would necessarily be pointless for a layperson to aspire to be more like Sāriputta, but rather as naming the most fitting exemplars for each of the four classes of follower.

This is how it is phrased in the sutta:

"Bhikkhus, a bhikkhu of faith, praying rightly, should pray thus: 'May I be like Sāriputta and Moggallāna!' These, bhikkhus, are the measure, these are the standard for my bhikkhu disciples, namely, Sāriputta and Moggallāna."

The same phrasing is repeated for the other three aspirations, replacing "bhikkhu" with "bhikkhuni" etc.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 7:33 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and Abortion.

Content:

I think it depends what you mean by 'inaction'. If you mean no action of body, speech or mind, then no, there's no kamma of any sort.

If you mean without doing anything with one's body or speech, then yes, one can accumulate akusala mind-door kamma by thoughts of covetousness, ill will, wrong view etc..

Furthermore, there are circumstances in which one can perform akusala body-door kamma without the body moving (e.g., by commanding someone to kill) or akusala speech-door kamma without saying anything (e.g., when a bhikkhu who knows himself to be guilty of a Vinaya offence remains silent when asked if he is pure during a Patimokkha recital. The bhikkhu's silence in this context will be taken as a statement of his being free of any offence, and so he commits the akusala kamma of false speech).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 8:25 AM

Title: Re: Buddhanussati in Visuddhimagga: Nava Guna or Dasa?

Content:

It consists of verses taken from the Nidānakathā, the introductory section to the Jātaka Atthakathā.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 8:37 AM

Title: Re: Stem-cells

Content:

This sounds more like a Hua Yen take on dependent arising (such as that popularized by Thich Nhat Hanh) than a Theravadin one.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Controversial Theravada traditions?

Content:

Thanks for the notice about this site, which I wasn't previously aware of.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

P.S.,

I'm delighted to see the site offers Alan Cole's book *Text as Father: Paternal Seductions in Early Mahayana Buddhist Literature* for free download:

<https://buddhistorrents.blogspot.com/2009/03/text-as-father-paternal-seductions-in.html>

This beautifully written work sheds new light on the origins and nature of Mahayana Buddhism with close readings of four well-known texts--the Lotus Sutra, Diamond Sutra, Tathagatagarbha Sutra, and Vimalakirtinirdesa. Treating these sutras as literary works rather than as straightforward philosophic or doctrinal treatises, Alan Cole argues that these writings were carefully sculpted to undermine traditional monastic Buddhism and to gain legitimacy and authority for Mahayana Buddhism as it was veering away from Buddhism's older oral and institutional forms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 11:37 AM

Title: Re: Buddhanussati in Visuddhimagga: Nava Guna or Dasa?

Content:

The word "canonical" is used by most people to refer to the "root texts" (mūla-pāḷi), meaning the Tipiṭaka. The Narasīhagāthā are from an atthakathā and so would be

termed "commentarial". In the classical Theravāda classification atthakathā is the third of the four sources of the Dhamma:

1. Sutta: the three baskets of the Tipiṭaka.
2. Suttānuloma: a direct inference from the Tipiṭaka.
3. Atthakathā: a commentary.
4. Attanomati: the personal opinions of later generations of teachers.

In this scheme sutta is viewed as the most reliable source of authority and attanomati the least so.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 12:58 PM
Title: Re: metta as my main practice
Content:
Sorry, but I think I'll have to bow out of this thread now. I don't see any way to make my point any clearer than I already have.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 1:41 PM
Title: Re: Stem-cells
Content:
No, I'm saying that you are extending the scope of kamma beyond that which was taught by the Buddha. To get a proper idea of its scope I would suggest you read the suttas on kamma at Access to Insight and chapter 5 of the Comprehensive Manual of Abhidhamma.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 13, 2009 4:44 PM
Title: Re: Prayer request forum.
Content:
It's part of the anumodanā chant from the Mahājayamaṅgalagāthā:

bhavatu sabbamaṅgalam
rakkhantu sabbadevatā
sabba-buddhānubhāvena
sadā sotthī bhavantu te.

bhavatu sabbamaṅgalam
rakkhantu sabbadevatā
sabba-dhammānubhāvena
sadā sotthī bhavantu te.

bhavatu sabbamaṅgalam
rakkhantu sabbadevatā
sabba-saṅghānubhāvena
sadā sotthī bhavantu te.

May all good fortune come your way,
May all the devas protect you,
By all the power of the Buddha
May you always enjoy well-being.

May all good fortune come your way,
May all the devas protect you,
By all the power of the Dhamma
May you always enjoy well-being.

May all good fortune come your way,
May all the devas protect you,
By all the power of the Saṅgha
May you always enjoy well-being
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Titles of Mara (in Pali & English)

Content:

In some places Maccuraja can be an epithet of Mara too, as in the Suttanipata's Mogharaja Sutta.

Best wisehs,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 6:45 AM
Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)
Content:
It sounds fine to me.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 9:45 AM
Title: Re: Apostasy: A Buddhist View and Response
Content:
Bhikkhu Bodhi's rendering is correct. The passage reads:

yo kho maṃ ... evaṃ jānantaṃ evaṃ passantaṃ evaṃ vadeyya

The participles "jānantaṃ" and "passantaṃ" are both in the accusative case and so the actions they denote —knowing and seeing— cannot belong to the nominative 'yo', but must belong to the only other word in the accusative case, which is the pronoun 'maṃ' (i.e. the Buddha).

For a rendering like Horner's we should expect a "yo ... jānaṃ ... passaṃ" construction, like in the fourth pārājika rule (Vin. iii. 90-1) or the Abyākata Sutta (AN. iv. 67-70).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 10:49 AM
Title: Re: Stem-cells
Content:
No. Kamma accumulates in the mental continua of living beings, not in external matter.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 11:18 AM

Title: Re: Apostasy: A Buddhist View and Response

Content:

One might compare the above with the teaching on the five anantariya-kamma. The kamma of killing an arahant, for example, is accrued regardless of whether the murderer knows his victim to be an arahant. The mere wish to kill a human who happens to be an arahant (even though one doesn't know it) is sufficient to fulfil the factor of volition for this anantariya-kamma.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 4:18 PM

Title: Re: Apostasy: A Buddhist View and Response

Content:

I think there's a bit more to it than that. First of all, for the kamma in question to have full force four factors are needed:

"Sāriputta, when I know and see thus, (1) should anyone say of me: 'The recluse Gotama does not have any superhuman states, any distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones. The recluse Gotama teaches a Dhamma [merely] hammered out by reasoning, following his own line of inquiry as it occurs to him' - (2) unless he abandons that assertion and (3) that state of mind and (4) relinquishes that view, then as [surely as if he had been] carried off and put there he will wind up in hell."

So, we have:

1. Akusalā vācā — a speech denying the the Buddha's attainment.
2. Taṃ vācaṃ na pajahati — the non-retracting of that speech.
3. Taṃ cittaṃ na pajahati — the non-abandoning of the unwholesome citta that prompted the speech.
4. Taṃ diṭṭhiṃ na paṭinissajjeti — the non-relinquishing of the wrong view expressed in the speech.

What sort of akusala speech would it be? The commentary sees it as an instance of reviling noble ones (ariyānaṃ upavāda), and the sub-commentary compares it to the case of Kokālika, who was reborn in hell for denying the attainments of Sāriputta and Moggallāna, despite the Buddha remonstrating with him.

Now in all the commentarial definitions of "reviling ariyans" one of the necessary factors is anattakāma, meaning a desire for the harm (lit. "non-welfare") of the person reviled.

In the Visuddhimagga Buddhaghosa defines "revilers of ariyans" thus:

Revilers of noble ones: being desirous of harm (anattakāmā) for noble ones consisting of Buddhas, Paccekabuddhas, and disciples, and also of householders who are stream-

enterers, they revile them with the worst accusations or with denial of their special qualities; they abuse and upbraid them, is what is meant.

Herein, it should be understood that when they say, 'They have no asceticism, they are not ascetics', they revile them with the worst accusation; and when they say, 'They have no jhāna or liberation or path or fruition etc.', they revile them with denial of their special qualities. And whether done knowingly or unknowingly it is in either case reviling of noble ones. It is weighty kamma resembling that of immediate result [meaning parricide, matricide etc.], and it is an obstacle both to heaven and to the path.

[...]

Reviling noble ones is greatly reprehensible because of its resemblance to kamma with immediate result. For this is said, 'Sāriputta, just as a bhikkhu possessing virtuous conduct, concentration and understanding could here and now attain final knowledge, so it is in this case, I say; if he does not abandon such talk and such thoughts and renounce such views, he will find himself in hell as surely as if he had been carried off and put there' [Mahāsīhanāda Sutta MN 12]. And there is nothing more reprehensible than wrong view, according as it is said, 'Bhikkhus, I do not see any one thing so reprehensible as wrong view' [AN. i. 33].

(Path of Purification XIII 82-88; 90)

So, I think reading the Mahāsīhanāda Sutta in the light of the Pali commentaries will save us from the Lotus Sutra brand of bigotry and fanaticism.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 5:32 PM

Title: Re: Materialism and Physicalism

Content:

Materialism is the wrong wrong view taught by Ajita of the Hairy Blanket. It's absolutely incompatible with the Buddha's Dhamma, being the first of the four wrong views that negate the very possibility of the brahmcariya.

“But, Master Ananda, what are those four ways that negate the living of the holy life that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome?”

“Here, Sandaka, some teacher holds such a doctrine and view as this: ‘There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed; no fruit or result of good and bad actions; no this world, no other world; no mother, no father; no beings who are reborn spontaneously; no good and virtuous recluses and brahmins in the world who have themselves realised by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world. A person consists of the four great elements. When he dies, earth returns and goes back

to the body of earth, water returns and goes back to the body of water, fire returns and goes back to the body of fire, air returns and goes back to the body of air; the faculties are transferred to space. [Four] men with the bier as fifth carry away the corpse. The funeral orations last as far as the charnel ground; the bones whiten; burnt offerings end with ashes. Giving is a doctrine of fools. When anyone asserts the doctrine that there is [giving and the like], it is empty, false prattle. Fools and the wise are alike cut off and annihilated with the dissolution of the body; after death they do not exist.'

"About this a wise man considers thus: 'This good teacher holds this doctrine and view: "There is nothing given ... after death they do not exist." If this good teacher's words are true, then here [in this teaching] I have done [my duty] by not doing [it], here I have lived [the holy life] by not living [it]. Both of us are exactly equal here [in this teaching], both have arrived at equality, yet I do not say that both of us are cut off and annihilated with the dissolution of the body, that after death we shall not exist. But it is superfluous for this good teacher to go about naked, to be shaven, to exert himself in the squatting posture, and to pull out his hair and beard, since I, who live in a house crowded with children, who use Benares sandalwood, who wear garlands, scents, and unguents, and accept gold and silver, shall reap exactly the same destination, the same future course, as this good teacher. What do I know and see that I should lead the holy life under this teacher?' So when he finds that this way negates the living of the holy life, he turns away from it and leaves it.

"This is the first way that negates the living of the holy life that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.

(Sandaka Sutta, MN. 76)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Materialism and Physicalism

Content:

I think the OP is referring to ontological materialism and cognitive physicalism, not to materialism in the sense of treating physical possessions as the most desirable kind of good.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Stem-cells

Content:

I suggest you look up "inanimate" in a dictionary.

And I repeat my advice that you make a careful study of what is taught about kamma and its ripening in the Suttas and Abhidhamma, for you appear at the moment to be rather clueless about these things.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2009 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Hello

Content:

Hi Sergey,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2009 9:27 AM

Title: Re: Materialism and Physicalism

Content:

Every single clause in Ajita's view contradicts the Dhamma and moral nihilism (natthikavāda) is only one of the three wrongnesses it embodies. The others are acausalism (ahetukavāda), and the inefficacy of action (akiriyavāda). These are the niyati-micchādiṭṭhi (views that lead to rebirth in hell) in his teaching.

In addition to this, Ajita's view is incompatible with the Dhamma in that it asserts beings comprise just one aggregate. According to the Dhamma this would be true only of the imperipient beings. All other beings comprise four or five aggregates. And so Ajita not only undermines morality, but also the possibility of developing paññā.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2009 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Titles of Mara (in Pali & English)

Content:

Here's a searchable edition of the Abhidhānappadīpikā and its ṭīkā (from the CSCD). It doesn't, however, have an English translation of the words. For that you'll need the one Sherubtse linked to.

[./download/file.php?id=36](#)

(343.91 KiB) Downloaded 121 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2009 10:40 AM

Title: Re: Materialism and Physicalism

Content:

Ajita's view is that beings consists of the four elements and nothing else. It's a view that denies mind.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2009 10:50 AM

Title: Re: Is Rebirth Speculation?

Content:

Ven. Sumedho makes too sweeping a statement. If one who accepts rebirth has arrived at his view through speculation, then for him it's speculative. If he's arrived at his view out of confidence in the Buddha's teaching, then for him it's an object of faith. If he's arrived at his view through recall of former lives (whether spontaneously or by jhānic cultivation) then it's an object of knowledge and there's nothing speculative about it.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2009 11:08 AM

Title: Re: are six sense-bases kamma-vipaka or not?

Content:

I have to go out now, but I'll post the Kathāvatthu passage when I get back. The wrong view in question is attributed to the Mahasanghikas; essentially it consisted in taking 'kammavipāka' to refer to every sort of kammic production, rather than limiting it (correctly) to events in the mental continuum.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 16, 2009 11:34 AM
Title: Re: MN Session 8 - MN 41. Sāleyyaka Sutta: The Brahmins of Sālā
Content:

The latter. There are many suttas about this in the Anguttara Nikaya. The gist of them is that exceedingly few humans and devas get reborn as humans or devas; most are headed for the lower realms.

I hope that doesn't spoil your day.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 16, 2009 9:43 PM
Title: Re: are six sense-bases kamma-vipaka or not?
Content:

As I read it, the point of dispute reported in the Kathāvatthu is one of several in that text that are disagreements over the phrasing rather than the meaning. That is to say, some non-Theravādins had apparently adopted the convention of using the term 'vipāka' to cover everything that results from a morally significant action, rather than limiting it to certain mental phenomena. By contrast, the Theravādin convention was to use other terms (e.g. kammanibbatti, kammassamuṭṭhāna — kammic production, kammic origination) when speaking of kamma-generated rūpadhammas. As such, I would view this particular dispute on kamma as belonging to a different class than those which are genuinely on points of doctrine (e.g. the controversy over whether merit increases with utility).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 16, 2009 11:05 PM
Title: Re: MN Session 8 - MN 41. Sāleyyaka Sutta: The Brahmins of Sālā
Content:

In the Suttas there are no reports of any householder attaining arahatta and then remaining a householder. All householder arahants either go forth at once or die.

However, the earliest explicit statement that an arahant cannot remain a householder comes from the Kathāvatthu, the Abhidhamma Piṭaka's record of the controversies debated at the Third Council. It's notable that even the opponents of the Theravādin debater don't really hold a contrary view on this question. Rather, their disagreement arises from the semantic issue of whether the phrase "fetters of a householder" means a householder's mental fetters or his material possessions.

Later still, in the Milindapañha, we get the claim that a householder attaining arahatta must go forth the very same day or else pass away (I've no idea why so many people say that it's "seven days"). The statement is made in two dialogues. Firstly in Book IV chapter 3 (Mil. 161-4):

'And moreover, O king, you may know by this fact the greatness and the peerless glory of the bhikkhu state—that if a layman, a disciple of the faith, who has entered upon the Excellent Way, should attain to the realisation of arahatship, one of two results must happen to him, and there is no other—he must either die away on that very day, or take upon himself the condition of a bhikkhu. For immovable, O king, is that state of renunciation, glorious, and most exalted—I mean the condition of being a member of the Order!'

Then in Book IV chapter 7 (Mil. 264-6):

'Venerable Nāgasena, your people say:

"Whosoever has attained, as a layman, to arahatship, one of two conditions are possible to him, and no other—either that very day he enters the Order, or he dies away, for beyond that day he cannot last."

'Now if, Nāgasena, he could not, on that day, procure a teacher or preceptor, or a bowl and set of robes, would he then, being an arahat, ordain himself, or would he live over the day, or would some other arahat suddenly appear by supernormal power and ordain him, or would he die away?'

'He could not, O king, because he is an arahat, ordain himself. For any one ordaining himself into the Order is guilty of communion by theft. And he could not last beyond that day. Whether another arahat should happen, or not, to arrive, on that very day would he die away.'

'Then, Nāgasena, by whatever means attained, the holy condition of arahatship is thereby also lost, for destruction of life is involved in it.'

'It is the condition of laymanship which is at fault, O king. In that faulty condition, and by reason of the weakness of the condition itself, the layman who, as such, has attained to arahatship must either, that very day, enter the Order or die away. That is not the fault of arahatship, O king. It is laymanship that is at fault, through not being strong enough.'

'Just, O king, as food, that guards the growth and protects the life of all beings, will, through indigestion, take away the life of one whose stomach is unequal to it, whose internal fire is low and weak—just so if a layman attains arahatship when in that condition unequal to it, then by reason of the weakness of the condition he must, that very day, either enter the Order or die away.

'Or just, O king, as a tiny blade of grass when a heavy rock is placed upon it will, through its weakness, break off and give way—just so when a layman attains arahatship, then, unable to support arahatship in that condition, he must, that very day, either enter the Order or die away.

'Or just, O king, as a poor weak fellow of low birth and little ability, if he came into possession of a great and mighty kingdom, would be unable to support the dignity of it—just so if a layman attains to arahatship, then is he unable, in that condition, to support it. And that is the reason why he must, on that very day, either enter the Order or die away.'

'Very good, Nāgasena! That is so, and I accept it as you say.'
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2009 11:23 PM

Title: Re: Alm Bowls

Content:

No, a turner would be working with wood, which is a prohibited material for almsbowls. Also, I should think the turners of the Buddha's day are more likely to have been engaged in bodging than bowl-making.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Favourites from Sutta Nipata

Content:

It's a fairly free rendering, and not a very good one, imo. I remember at E-sangha expressing surprise upon hearing that Bhikkhu Bodhi had chosen to use this translation rather than Norman's. But it turned out that the focus of his talks was chiefly suttas of a moralistic or devotional sort, whose contents can survive even in a poorish translation. Also, I was told by one of the posters that Bodhi often gives up on Saddhatissa's translation and supplies his own during the talks.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 7:23 AM
Title: Re: Alm Bowls
Content:

When laying down the prohibition against wooden almsbowls the Buddha didn't give any reason, but issues of hygiene do seem a likely explanation.

Later, prohibitions were laid down against almsbowls made of gold, silver, mother-of-pearl, beryl, crystal, bronze, glass, tin, lead, and copper (as well as a requirement that bowls be made of either clay or iron). These were in response to householders complaining that the monks, in using such bowls, were acting like householders (a stock phrase in Vinaya origin stories).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 7:45 AM
Title: Re: Alm Bowls
Content:
Me neither. It betrays our age.

When I was a boy we still had itinerant bodgers in Yorkshire, but I believe they've all gone, with only hobbyists now preserving the craft.

<http://www.ukcraftfairs.com/guide-to-bodging.asp>

<http://www.stuartking.co.uk/index.php/chair-bodgers-of-buckinghamshire/>

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bodging>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 9:45 AM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

The list below was compiled by our member Chris.

Edit (June 13th 2021) - Some of the links were found dead on this day. I've marked them with red asterisks. If you know of an updated version of them, please post it. Thanks.

Dhammānando

Pali Pronunciation Sound Files

<http://www.aimwell.org/pali.html> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali Canon Online Database: Advanced Search

<http://www.chaf.lib.latrobe.edu.au/dcd/pali-search.htm>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali Resources available on the web, thanks to John Bullit of ATI.org

<https://web.archive.org/web/20131107010717/http://www.accesstoinsight.org/outsources/pali.html>

The PTS Pali-English Dictionary

<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/pali/index.html>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

A very useful tool by Venerable Yuttadhammo

<http://www.library.websangha.org/earlybuddhism/convertpad.htm>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Sourceforge

A cross-platform Pali-English reader. Allows intermediate Pali students to read the Pali Canon. Automatically recognizes pali words and gives definitions from the CPED and PED, as well as DPPN if available. Includes text search and dictionary lookup.

<http://sourceforge.net/projects/digitalpali/> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali fonts

<http://www.aimwell.org/Fonts/fonts.html> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

<http://www.softerviews.org/Fonts.html>

Introduction to Pali - Materials for A. K. Warder's book

<http://groups.yahoo.com/group/Pali/files/Introduction%20to%20Pali/>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Narada's Elementary Pali Course

<http://groups.yahoo.com/group/Pali/files/Narada%27s%20Elementary%20Pali%20Course/> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali Learning Files

<http://groups.yahoo.com/group/Pali/files/Pali%20Learning%20Files/> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali keyboard

Windows Keyboards for Typing with Unicode Latin-script Pali Fonts

<http://fsnow.com/pali/keyboard/> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

A Pali Word a Day - a selection of Pali words for Daily Reflection

http://www.buddhanet.net/pdf_file/paliwordday.pdf

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Tipitaka Network :: Pāḷi Synthesis

<http://www.tipitaka.net/pali/synthesis/> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Bhavana Vandana - Book of Devotion — Compiled by Ven. Gunaratana.

The purpose of this book is manifold. One is to teach the users of this Vandana book how to pronounce Pali words correctly. .

http://www.buddhanet.net/pdf_file/vandana.pdf

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Pali Canon Online Database - Peter Friedlander

<http://www.bodhgayanews.net/pali.htm> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Files from the Defunct Yahoo Pali Group

<http://wrdingham.co.uk/pali/>

Sādhu Pali Resources

<https://www.dhamma.ru/sadhu/65-pali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 9:45 AM

Title: Pali Resources

Content:

A pinned thread for posting links and files related to the Pali language.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 6:52 PM

Title: Re: "Ceased aggregates of dead or alive are alike"

Content:

It's from the Niddesa of the Khuddaka Nikaya, but you will probably have read it in the Visuddhimagga's chapter on the recollection of death.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 8:02 PM

Title: Re: MN Session 8 - MN 41. Sāleyyaka Sutta: The Brahmins of Sālā

Content:

The term "fetters of householdership" (gihisaṃyojana) is used only once in the Suttas: The wanderer Vacchagotta asked the Blessed One: "Master Gotama, is there any householder who, without abandoning the fetter of householdership, on the dissolution of the body has made an end of suffering?"

"Vaccha, there is no householder who, without abandoning the fetter of householdership, on the dissolution of the body has made an end of suffering."

— Tevijjavacchagotta Sutta (MN. 71)

The Theravadin commentators understand "gihisaṃyojana" to refer to mental attachment to the goods of the household life, not to the goods themselves. If it applied to the goods themselves, then there would be no possibility of a householder attaining arahatta, but some householders (e.g. Yasa and his companions) have in fact done so.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Namaskaram n Hello

Content:

Hi Suriya,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2009 9:18 PM

Title: Re: "Ceased aggregates of dead or alive are alike"

Content:

Hi Phil,

Here's the Pali of the three verses quoted by Buddhaghosa, with Olendzki's translation.
jīvitam attabhāvo ca, sukhadukkhā ca kevalā.
ekacittasamāyuttā, lahu so vattate khaṇo.

Life, personhood, pleasure and pain
— This is all that's bound together
In a single mental event
— A moment that quickly takes place.

ye niruddhā marantassa, tiṭṭhamānassa vā idha.
sabbepi sadisā khandhā, gatā appaṭisandhikā.

What ceases for one who is dead,
Or for one who's still standing here,
Are all just the same aggregates
— Gone, never to connect again.

anibbattena na jāto, paccuppannena jīvati.
cittabhaṅgā mato loko, paññatti paramatthiyā ti.

With no production there's no birth;
With becoming present, one lives.
When grasped with the highest meaning,
The world is dead when the mind stops.
(Mahāniddeśa 42, Olendzki trans.)
Translations of some more verses from the same text here:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/nm/nm.2.04 olen.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2009 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Luminous mind

Content:

Generally we prefer to respect the choice of the original poster as to where his or her thread should be located. You are of course welcome to start a thread on this question

in a forum of your own choosing.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2009 11:06 AM

Title: Re: Further explanation of 'thitibhutam', the primal mind

Content:

"... the mental space in which all the conditioning starting with avijja happens."

To what (if anything) would this mental space correspond in the Buddha's teaching?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2009 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Font troubles

Content:

Not necessarily. You will either need to adjust your browser settings to display all pages in Unicode-8, or, when you happen to be on a page that contains Pali in Unicode you can try selecting VIEW in your browser menu, then scroll down to TEXT (or CHARACTER) ENCODING, and select UNICODE-8 from the available options.

The text I posted the other day should look like this:

Niddesa.jpg (49.55 KiB) Viewed 2666 times

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2009 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Further explanation of 'thitibhutam', the primal mind

Content:

It's a Pali compound, but it's not found in the Tipitaka or Atthakatha. It is found in a Vinaya sub-commentary, where it refers to the stability of the marking stones (nimitta)

used to indicate a consecrated sima, and in the Majjhima sub-commentary, where it refers to the firmness of someone's wrong view. Neither usage seems to have any connection with that of the Thai ajahns.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 19, 2009 11:06 PM
Title: Re: hello
Content:
Hi Nadi,

Welcome, and thanks for introducing yourself.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 20, 2009 1:23 AM
Title: Re: What does this Sutta mean?
Content:
Suppose we change the wording to, "Any item (or mode of conduct) that I haven't vetoed with the words, 'This is not allowable,' if it resembles something that is not allowable, and conflicts with the things that are allowable, then it is not allowable for you."

Is this intelligible to you?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 20, 2009 9:14 AM
Title: Re: What does this Sutta mean?
Content:

Not really. I think you're missing the main point, which is that when a bhikkhu finds himself in vinayaic uncharted territory he is supposed to determine the appropriate course of action by looking for resemblances between that and the territory that is charted.

If he's offered an expensive, custom-made Persian carpet, for instance, then there's no

rule prohibited him from accepting it, but he might decide to reject the offering on the grounds that the Buddha prohibited bhikkhus from having rugs made out of of pure black goat's wool (apparently a luxury item back then).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 20, 2009 5:25 PM
Title: Re: Commentary Quotation Search
Content:
Hi Ed,
vadhake devadattamhi
core aṅgulimālake.
dhanapāle rāhule ca
sabbattha samako munī ti.

To the murderer Devadatta,
To the robber Aṅgulimāla,
To Dhanapāla [the elephant], and to Rāhula too —
The Sage is neutral to them all.
(Ap.i.47; Mil.410; DhA.i.146)

The Apadāna and the Theragāthā Atthakathā attribute the verse to Ven. Upāli. The Milindapañha attributes it to Ven. Sāriputta. In the Dhammapada Atthakathā it is spoken by the Buddha, but with samako ("neutral") replaced with samamānaso ("neutral in mind").

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 20, 2009 7:12 PM
Title: Re: What does this Sutta mean?
Content:

Not bad but I would leave out the phrase by discernment, for in the four mahapadesas themselves nothing at all is stipulated as to the means by which one is to judge whether something fits or doesn't fit.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2009 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Alm Bowls

Content:

They may if the monk lets them, but many monks prefer not to since few laypeople will know all the rules about the proper treatment of an almsbowl.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2009 12:53 PM

Title: Re: Moin

Content:

Hi Christian,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2009 1:04 PM

Title: Re: "in the commentaries"... where?

Content:

I posted it here too:

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=19&t=914>

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2009 4:59 PM

Title: Re: requesting help from devas

Content:

In the Atanatiya Sutta (DN. 32) the Buddha gives the names of those devas who have vowed to render assistance to those who have gone for refuge. So, learn their names and when you're in dire straits just give them a yell.

"Learn by heart, monks, the Atanata protection, constantly make use of it, bear it in

mind. This Atanata protection, monks, pertains to your welfare, and by virtue of it, monks and nuns, laymen and laywomen may live at ease, guarded, protected, and unharmed."

— Atanatiya Sutta: <http://www.accesstosight.org/tipitaka/dn/dn.32.0.piya.html>

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2009 6:52 PM

Title: Re: requesting help from devas

Content:

The word 'yakkha' can be used as an honorific for devas, gandhabbas, nagas etc. The ones named in the sutta belong to several different classes of amanussa.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2009 11:47 PM

Title: Re: More Commentaries

Content:

The earliest commentary-like works would be the commentarial content in the Tipiṭaka itself. For example:

- The definitions of terms in the Vinaya Piṭaka.
- The various suttas in which disciples like Sāriputta and Mahākaccāyana expound at length what the Buddha had expounded in brief.
- The Niddesa of the Khuddaka Nikāya (a commentary to two sections of the Suttanipāṭa). And perhaps also the Paṭisambhidāmagga.

On the other hand, taking "commentary" in the narrow sense of atthakathā, the oldest extant ones are those of Buddhaghosa, closely followed by those of Dhammapāla. The oldest we know of, but which are no longer extant are the Sinhalese texts from which Buddhaghosa was working — the Mahā-atthakathā, the Mahāpaccarī, and the Kuruṇḍī.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2009 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Ahu Sutta - It Was

Content:

Greetings,

ahū pubbe tadā nāhu

nāhu pubbe tadā ahu

na cāhu na ca bhavissati

na cetaṛahi vijjati

Formerly it was; then it was not.

Formerly it was not; then it was.

It was not, it will not be,

And now it is not to be found.

Here's a translation of Dhammapāla's commentary (except the last paragraph, which is only a paraphrase):

Therein, the phrase formerly it was (ahū pubbe) means “before the arising of knowledge of the path of arahantship the whole set of defilements, starting with lust, was present in my continuum. Within this set of defilements there was no defilement whatsoever that was not present in me.”

Then it was not (tadā nāhu) means “then, at the time of the noble path-moment, this set of defilements was not; it did not exist at all. Within this set of defilements there was not even the least significant of defilements that had not been abandoned by me the moment of the highest path [i.e. the arahantship path-moment].”

But certain bhāṇakas recite this line as subsequently it was not (tato nāhu). The meaning in this case is that from the arahantship path-moment onwards the set of defilements did not exist at all.

Formerly it was not (nāhu pubbe) means “prior to the noble path-moment, whatever immeasurable, faultless dhamma is now mine, attained through my perfection of cultivation, was not; it did not exist at all.”

Then it was means “when the highest path-knowledge arose in me, then the whole of the faultless dhamma was mine.” For in the case of Buddhas, attainment of the highest path means that all the qualities associated with omniscience come into their hands.

It was not, it will not be, and now is not to be found means “just as the faultless dhamma, the noble path, which arose in me at the place of enlightenment and by which the entire set of defilements was abandoned without remainder, was not and did not exist in me before the path-moment, even so, it will not exist, it will not arise again in the future. Since there are no more defilements to be abandoned by me, there is no further duty to be done and so no arising of the path [for the abandoning of the defilements] in the present or future.”

As it is said [in the Nālaka Sutta]: “They go not twice to the Farther Shore.”

So, an expansive translation according to the commentarial understanding would be something like this:

Formerly there were defilements; later there were none.
Formerly there was no faultless dhamma; later there was.
Just as the noble path moment formerly did not arise in me,
Even so, it will not arise again in the future and does not arise now.
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 3:03 PM
Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)
Content:
"To..." is normally indicated with the dative case. An exception is when the sentence contains a verb of motion; here the object of the verb will be in the accusative case (as in Latin and Greek).

"Run on the mountain" would require the locative case.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 3:24 PM
Title: Re: Dhammawheel RSS?
Content:
I don't know, but it sounds like rather a good idea.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 3:53 PM
Title: Re: Dhammasangani
Content:
There are two English translations. The more recent is U Kyaw Khine's 1996 rendering, which is published by Sri Satguru Publications in India, so will probably be fairly cheap. I haven't seen a copy myself, but I've heard it commended by Abhidhamma enthusiasts.

A 27 MB scanned copy of C.A.F. Rhys Davids' PTS translation (A Buddhist Manual of Psychological Ethics) is available online:
<http://openlibrary.org/b/OL13997429M/Buddhist-manual-of-psychological-ethics-of-the-fourth-century-B.C.>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 4:01 PM
Title: Re: Dhammasangani
Content:
Alternatively you can go here:
<http://www.archive.org/details/ABuddhistManualOfPhychologicalEthicsOfTheFourthCenturyBC> and download it as an 11 MB DjVu file or a 5 MB text file.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 4:17 PM
Title: Re: Practitioners view of psychotherapy
Content:
Haven't you also been trained in REBT? If so, didn't you consider that a good fit?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 6:21 PM
Title: Re: Practitioners view of psychotherapy
Content:
Rational emotive behaviour therapy.

<https://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/REBT>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2009 6:38 PM
Title: Re: Everyone seeking Enlightenment
Content:
I wouldn't agree with this. Many of the philosophers of ancient Greece were arguably engaged in an analogous pursuit, notably the Cynics, Stoics, Epicureans and (earlier) the Pythagoreans.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 30, 2009 10:27 AM
Title: Re: "Ananda, the gathering isn't pure."
Content:

No, but it seems very likely that he had committed a defeating offence. Either that or he had been subjected to an act of banishment by the sangha for general misconduct. Either of these would make it impermissible for him to sit with the bhikkhus listening to the Patimokkha recital. But a defeating offence is more likely, for throughout the sutta the man is referred to as an "individual" (puggala), not as a bhikkhu. Also, if he had been banished one would expect the monks to know about it, so Moggallana wouldn't have needed to detect him with his supernormal powers.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 30, 2009 1:24 PM
Title: Re: Differences in the Different Recensions of the Tripitaka?
Content:

It is always tathāgata and never satta in Pali sources. And if you read the Khemā Sutta (SN. iv. 373-80; = Connected Discourses II 1380-3) you will see that this is not arbitrary — there is a logic as to why it is always tathāgata and never satta.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 30, 2009 2:15 PM
Title: Re: Non-Buddhist writing that reminds you of the dhamma
Content:
Examination at the Womb-Door

Who owns those scrawny little feet? Death.
Who owns this bristly scorched-looking face? Death.
Who owns these still-working lungs? Death.
Who owns this utility coat of muscles? Death.
Who owns these unspeakable guts? Death.

Who owns these questionable brains? Death.
All this messy blood? Death.
These minimum-efficiency eyes? Death.
This wicked little tongue? Death.
This occasional wakefulness? Death.

Given, stolen, or held pending trial?
Held.

Who owns the whole rainy, stony earth? Death.
Who owns all of space? Death.

Who is stronger than hope? Death.
Who is stronger than the will? Death.
Stronger than love? Death.
Stronger than life? Death.

But who is stronger than Death?
Me, evidently.
Pass, Crow.

— Ted Hughes

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 30, 2009 6:19 PM
Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)
Content:
Nominative: Who?
Accusative: Whom?
Instrumental: By/with/through whom?
Dative: To/for the sake of whom?
Ablative: From/because of whom?
Genitive: Whose?
Locative: In/on/near whom?
Vocative: O who?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 30, 2009 9:33 PM
Title: Re: sutta reference
Content:
Hi Bazzaman,

The teaching is from the Milindapañha.

'Venerable Nāgasena, these givers when they bestow their offerings, devote them specifically to former (relatives) now departed, saying: "May this gift benefit such and such." Now do they (the dead) derive any benefit therefrom?'

'Some do, O king, and some do not.'

'Which then are they that do, and which do not?'

'Those who have been reborn in purgatory, O king, do not; nor those reborn in heaven; nor those reborn as animals. And of those reborn as Pretas three kinds do not: the Vantāsikā (who feed on vomit), the Khuppiṭṭāsino (who hunger and thirst.), the Nijjhāmatañhikā (who are consumed by thirst). But the Paradattūpajīvino (who live on the gifts of others) they do derive profit, and those who bear them in remembrance do so too.'

'Then, Nāgasena, offerings given by the givers have run to waste, and are fruitless, since those for whose benefit they are given derive no profit therefrom.'

'No, O king. They run not to waste, neither are fruitless. The givers themselves derive profit from them.'

(Mil. 294-7, Th. Rhys Davids trans.)

For the full dialogue:

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/sbe36/sbe3606.htm>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2009 6:40 AM

Title: Re: Everyone seeking Enlightenment

Content:

Hi Rob, David,

The Upali Sutta (MN. 56) reports that hot blood gushed from the mouth of Nigantha Nataputta after he had heard his former leading disciple Upali (now a disciple of the Buddha) praising the Buddha's virtues.

The commentary to the same says that "a heavy sorrow arose in him because of the loss of his lay supporter, and this produced a bodily disorder that resulted in his vomiting hot blood. After vomiting hot blood, few beings can continue to live. Thus they brought him to Pava on a litter, and shortly thereafter he passed away."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2009 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Buddhaghosa Arahant hood

Content:

I didn't say that. I said that the aspiration to meet Metteyya is expressed by some Sinhalese scribe or editor, not by Buddhaghosa himself. That's why the Metteyya aspiration isn't found in the Burmese edition and why in the concluding verses the text switches from the first person to the third person.

Buddhaghosa's aspiration is:

What store of merit has been gained by me
Desiring establishment in this Good Dhamma
In doing this, accepting the suggestion
Of the venerable Sanghapāla,
One born into the line of famous elders
Dwelling within the Mahāvihāra,
A true Vibhajjavādin, who is wise,
And lives in pure simplicity, devoted
To discipline's observance and to practice,
Whose mind the virtuous qualities of patience,
Mildness, lovingkindness, and so on, grace —
By the power of that store of merit
May every being prosper happily.
And now just as the Path of Purification,
With eight and fifty recitation sections
In the text, has herewith been completed
Without impediment, so may all those
Who in the world depend on what is good
Glad-hearted soon succeed without delay!
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2009 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Again and Again

Content:

Hi Chris,
punappunañceva vapanti bījaṃ,
punappunaṃ vassati devarājā.
punappunaṃ khettaṃ kasanti kassakā,
punappunaṃ dhaññamupeti raṭṭhaṃ.

punappunaṃ yācakā yācayanti,
punappunaṃ dānapatī dadanti.
punappunaṃ dānapatī daditvā,
punappunaṃ saggamupenti t̥hānaṃ.

punappunaṃ khīranikā duhanti,
punappunaṃ vaccho upeti mātaraṃ.
punappunaṃ kilamati phandati ca,
punappunaṃ gabbhamupeti mando.

punappunaṃ jāyati mīyati ca,
punappunaṃ sīvathikaṃ haranti.
maggañca laddhā apunabbhavāya,
na punappunaṃ jāyati bhūripaṇño ti.

The four verses are spoken by the Buddha in the Udaya Sutta (SN. i. 173-4; Connected Discourses I. 268-9) and by the arahant Kāḷudāyī in the Theragatha.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 1, 2009 11:06 AM
Title: Re: Greetings & Salutations
Content:
Hi Joshua,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel. I hope someone here will be able to find a suitable interviewee for you. If not, then you might also try writing to the Oz-based BSWA forum: bswa.org

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 1, 2009 10:20 PM
Title: Re: transfer of merit
Content:

In popular Buddhist practice in Asia it can be on any occasion when one has just done something that is likely to be meritorious (that is, assuming that it was done with the right state of mind). The most common occasions will be after giving a gift, undertaking the five or eight precepts, listening to a sermon or completing a session of meditation.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 2, 2009 6:45 AM

Title: Re: transfer of merit

Content:

Okay, then these are the two main Pali sources:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/khp/khp.1-9.than.html#khp-7>

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/sbe36/sbe3606.htm>

(Scroll down to "Offerings to the Dead")

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2009 12:53 PM

Title: Re: Ariyan aspirations and the lay follower

Content:

There is a commentarial telling of the story in which Sāriputta does investigate as best he can, but unfortunately his best isn't good enough. I can't locate it at the moment, but it goes something like this: Sāriputta surveys the previous hundred thousand lives of the brahmin and in none of them can he detect any past action that could be a cause for awakening in the present life. And so he teaches him the way to Brahmā instead. But the Buddha—whose psychic powers can go further back than Sāriputta's—sees that in the brahmin's hundred thousand and first previous life he had heard the Dhamma taught by some past Buddha and in that hearing there was a sufficient cause for stream-entry in the present life. Except that it was too late.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2009 1:35 PM

Title: Re: Cittas and Cetasikas: relational significance

Content:

In the Abhidhamma cetasikas are conceived as being just as short-lived as cittas. The opening verse of the Abhidhammatthasangaha's chapter on cetasikas states:

ekuppādanīrodhā ca

ekālambaṇavattukā

cetoyuttā dvipaññāsa
dhammā cetasikā matā

Translations:

“Arising and ceasing together with it, having the same object and base, are fifty-two dhammas associated with mind known as mentalities.”

(Rupert Gethin, Summary of the Topics of Abhidhamma, p. 54)

“The fifty-two states associated with consciousness that arise and cease together (with consciousness), that have the same object and base (as consciousness), are known as mental factors.”

(Bhikkhu Bodhi, A Comprehensive Manual of Abhidhamma, p. 76)

So, each cetasika arises simultaneously with the citta that it accompanies, passes away simultaneously with the passing of that citta, takes the same object as that citta, and depends upon the same material base.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2009 5:16 PM

Title: Re: Cittas and Cetasikas: relational significance

Content:

No, it's not on the wrong track. In fact I believe it's one of several classical similes for the citta/cetasika relationship.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2009 12:03 PM

Title: Re: Happy Birthday Fede!

Content:

Même si il y en a pour plus cher en bougies qu'en gâteau....

BON ANNIVERSAIRE, FÉDÉ!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2009 10:15 PM

Title: Re: Ariyan aspirations and the lay follower

Content:

Well, all beings have the potential for eventually awakening. Even padaparamas are not like the so-called 'icchantika' described in some Mahayana Yogacarīn texts, who is eternally cut off from the possibility of awakening. So the question is whether a person has the potential for awakening in the present life. This will depend upon whether he or she is a neyya or a padaparama (ugghaṭitaññūs and vipaṇcitaññūs are generally held not to exist any more), but this isn't easily known. One can know that certain individuals are padaparamas (e.g. those who've committed certain kinds of very weighty akusala kamma), but there isn't any outward sign by which one can discern if a person is a neyya.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2009 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Question for monks -blessing chant - Yathā vārivahā pūrā

Content:

It was a practice that was certainly well-established by the time of Buddhaghosa and was held by the commentators to go back to the Buddha's time. I think there's also mention of it in the Milindapañha. The gathas you cited, that are used in this connection, are a combination of some passages from the Tirokudda Sutta and some others preserved in the Pali commentaries.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2009 10:55 PM

Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)

Content:

Like yaacati, the verb pucchati usually takes a double accusative:

upaasako sama.na.m dhamma.m pucchati

upaasakaa pa.n.dita.m pa~nhe pucchanti

Alternatively, the thing asked about may be expressed in the locative case.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 6:00 AM
Title: Re: Ariyan aspirations and the lay follower
Content:
The only certainty is that he was born triple-rooted.

It's possible that he is a neyya, but this is not certain, for some triple-rooted persons have the capacity for jhanic cultivation but not for ariyan attainment.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 6:18 AM
Title: Re: Question for monks -blessing chant - Yathā vārivahā pūrā
Content:
Probably. The verses that are chanted regularly are largely the same in both nikayas. The difference is that the Dhammayuttika Nikaya has one style of chanting that is used in all their monasteries, whereas the Mahanikaya has a variety of styles depending on the region and/or the preferences of the particular abbot. Also the Mahanikaya has a lot of additional chants that are not used in the Dhammayuttika Nikaya. The latter tends not to innovate and rarely uses any suttas or parittas except the ones selected by King Mongkut and Prince Vajirañāṇavarorasa.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 6:34 AM
Title: Re: other Buddhist traditions on DW?
Content:
No, Dharma Wheel is a new forum, launched by David, Dhamma Wheel's owner, a few hours ago. It is modelled on Dhamma Wheel but is intended for discussion of the Mahayana and Vajrayana schools.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 9:58 AM

Title: Re: Is the result of Parinibbana Annihilation?

Content:

I think you have it the wrong way round.

The sankharakkhandha makes up 50 of the Abhidhamma's 52 cetasikas.

Vedanakkhandha and saññakkhandha make up the remaining two.

Vedana and saññā are included in sankhara in any context where sankhara means conditioned thing, but not in contexts where it means sankharakkhandha.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 5:35 PM

Title: Re: Question for monks -blessing chant - Yathā vārivahā pūrā

Content:

You will be able to memorize things very fast using the attached memorizing tool.

[./download/file.php?id=46](#)

(125.16 KiB) Downloaded 147 times

Instructions

1. Download the zip file and extract its contents.
2. Open the file named "Memorizing Tool" in your web browser.
3. When the page opens you will see two boxes. Type or paste the text you wish to memorize into the upper box.
4. Click on the button labelled "Convert".
5. The text will now appear in the lower box, but with each word truncated to just its first letter. For example, the contents of this post will look like this:
Y w b a t m t v f u t a m t.

I

1. D t z f a e i c.
2. O t f n "M T" i y w b.
3. W t p o y w s t b. T o p t t y w t m i t u b.
4. C o t b l "C".

5. T t w n a i t l b, b w e w t t j i f l. F e, t c o t p w l l t:
6. Read aloud the text you wish to memorize three or four times, then delete it.
7. Then try to recite the text just relying on the first letters in the lower box.
8. When you can do so successfully, then try to recite the text without looking at either box.

That's all there is to it.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 6, 2009 5:54 PM
Title: Re: New search engine website
Content:
Hi Chris,

It's the same website that I told you about last week in the Dhammasangani thread:

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=18&t=1046>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 21, 2009 4:53 AM
Title: Re: V or W?
Content:

The classical Pali grammars classify the consonant as dento-labial (i.e. requiring the upper front teeth to be in contact with the lower lip). So, v is more likely the correct pronunciation, since w is a bilabial consonant. But in practice SE Asian Buddhists will pronounce it as a w because their native tongues (Thai, Lao, Khmer etc.) don't have a v sound.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2009 11:22 AM
Title: Re: Monasticism and parental permission
Content:

It's the first I've heard of this. Whenever I've helped westerners to get ordained in Thailand, all the abbots required evidence of parental consent even though the parents were Christians or Jews. The religion of one's parents isn't a relevant factor in any of the scenarios described and adjudicated in the Vinaya Piṭaka and the Samantapāsādikā.

Below I append my translation of the relevant passages.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

The Vinaya Piṭaka's Mahāvagga states:

na, bhikkhave, ananuññāto mātāpitūhi putto pabbājetabbo. Yo pabbājeyya, āpatti dukkaṭassa.

"Monks, a son must not be given the going forth without permission from his mother and father. Should one do so, it is an offence of wrong-doing." — Vin. i. 83

The Atthakathā comments:

sace dve atthi, dvepi āpucchitabbā.

"If both exist [i.e. are alive], then leave must be obtained from both." — VinA. v. 1011

But there are also quite a number of exceptions given in the Vinaya Atthakathā (Samantapāsādikā. v. 1011-12)

(1) Here, the phrase "from his mother and father" was said in regard to the man and woman who conceived him. If both are living, then leave must be obtained from both of them.

If the father or mother is deceased, then leave must be obtained from [the parent] who is still living.

Even if they have themselves gone forth, leave must still be obtained from them.

* * * *

(2) When obtaining leave, he may either go and obtain it himself, or may send another person, saying to him, "Go to my mother and father and having obtained their leave come back."

* * * *

(3) If he says, "I am one who has obtained permission," he may be given the going forth if it is believable.

* * * *

(4) A father has himself gone forth and wishes his son to go forth; having obtained leave

of the mother, let him go forth; or, a mother wishes her daughter to go forth; having obtained leave of the father, let her go forth.

* * * *

(5) A father, not concerned for the welfare of his wife and son, runs away. The mother gives her son to some monks, saying, "Let him go forth." When asked, "Where has his father gone?" she replies, "He has run away to disport himself." — It is suitable for him [the son] to be given the going forth.

A mother has run away with some man or other. The father gives [his son to some monks, saying], "Let him go forth." The principle in this case is just the same as above.

The Kurundī* states: 'A father is absent. The mother gives her son permission, saying, "Let him go forth." When asked, "Where has his father gone?" she replies, "I shall be responsible for whatever is due to you from the father." — It is suitable for him [the son] to be given the going forth.'

[* Kurundī: one of the Sinhalese commentaries most frequently cited by Buddhaghosa as the source of his Vinaya exegesis.]

* * * *

(6) The mother and father are deceased. Their boy has grown up in the company of [relatives] such as his maternal aunt. When he is being given the going forth, his relatives start a quarrel or criticize it. Therefore, in order to stop the quarrel, he should obtain their leave before being given the going forth. But if given the going forth without having obtained their leave there is no offence.

They who undertook to feed him in his childhood are called "mother" and "father", and with respect to these the principle is just the same as above. The son [is reckoned as] one living dependent on himself, not on a mother and father.

* * * *

(7) Even if he be a king, he must still obtain leave before being given the going forth.

* * * *

(8) Being permitted by his mother and father, he goes forth, but [later] reverts [to being a householder]. Even if he goes forth and reverts seven times, on each occasion that he comes [to go forth] again he must obtain leave [from his mother and father] before he may be given the going forth.

* * * *

(9) If [his mother and father] say: "This [son of ours], having reverted and come home,

does not do any work for us; having gone forth he will not fulfil his duty to you; there is no point in him obtaining leave; whenever he comes to you, just give him the going forth." When [a son] has been disowned in this way, it is suitable for him to be given the going forth again without even obtaining leave.

* * * *

(10) He who when only in his childhood had been given away [by his mother and father, saying], "This is a gift for you; give him the going forth whenever you want," may be given the going forth whenever he comes [to ask for it], without even obtaining leave.

But [a mother and father], having given permission [to their son] when he was only in his childhood, afterwards, when he has reached maturity, withdraw their permission; he must not be given the going forth without obtaining leave.

* * * *

(11) An only son, after quarrelling with his mother and father, comes [to the sangha, saying], "Let me go forth." Upon being told, "Come back after you have obtained leave," he says, "I'm not going! If you don't let me go forth, I shall burn down your monastery, or stab you with a sword, or cause loss to your relatives and supporters by cutting down the plants in their gardens, or kill myself by jumping from a tree, or join a gang of robbers, or go to another country!"

It is suitable to let him go forth in order to safeguard life. If his mother and father then come and say, "Why did you let our son go forth?" they should be informed of the reason for it, saying, "We let him go forth in order to safeguard life. You may confirm this with your son."

* * * *

(12) Then, [one saying] "I shall jump from a tree," has climbed up and is about to let go with his hands and feet. It is suitable to let him go forth.

* * * *

(13) An only son, having gone to another country, requests the going forth. If he had obtained leave before departing, he may be given the going forth.

If he had not obtained leave, having sent a young monk to get [the parents] to give their leave, he may be given the going forth. If it is a very distant country, it is suitable to just give him the going forth and then send him with other bhikkhus to inform [the parents].

But the Kurundī states: 'if [the country] is far away and the way to it is [across] a great wilderness (or desert), it is suitable to give him the going forth, [thinking], "having gone there [later] we shall obtain leave [of the parents]."'

* * * *

(14) If a mother and father have many sons and speak thus: "Venerable sir, may you give the going forth to whichever [one] of these boys you choose," then having examined the boys, he may give the going forth to the one he chooses.

If an entire [extended] family or an entire village is given permission [by someone, saying], "Venerable sir, may you give the going forth to whichever [one] of the boys in this family or this village you choose," he may give the going forth to the one he chooses.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2009 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Quibble on Buddhadasa's teachings

Content:

It isn't all about if, for the passage continues:

"Since there actually is another world, one who holds the view 'there is another world' has right view. Since there actually is another world, one who intends 'there is another world' has right intention. Since there actually is another world, one who makes the statement 'there is another world' has right speech. Since there actually is another world, one who says 'there is another world' is not opposed to those arahants who know the other world. Since there actually is another world, one who convinces another 'there is another world' convinces him to accept true Dhamma; and because he convinces another to accept true Dhamma, he does not praise himself and disparage others. Thus any corrupt conduct that he formerly had is abandoned and pure virtue is substituted. And this right view, right intention, right speech, non-opposition to noble ones, convincing another to accept true Dhamma, and avoidance of self-praise and disparagement of others - these several wholesome states thus come into being with right view as their condition."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2009 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)

Content:

Except when it doesn't.

In fact in the Kaccāyana grammar *pasīdati* is cited as an example of a verb whose object may take either the *tatiyā* ("instrumental") or the *sattamī* ("locative"):
maṇḍitu' ssukkesu tatiyā.

maṇḍitaussukka iccetesvatthesu tatiyāvibhatti hoti, sattamī ca.

*ñāṇena pasīdito, ñāṇasmim vā pasīdito,
ñāṇena ussukko, ñāṇasmim vā ussukko,*

tathāgato vā tathāgatagotto vā.
(Kacc. aphorism #315)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 28, 2009 11:33 PM
Title: Re: Monasticism and parental permission
Content:
Hi Oleksandr,

Thanks for investigating the matter, but I don't agree that the passage supports the sayadaw's view. Since Sāriputta's brother, Revata, is only seven years old, the Dhp-a narrative concerns his going forth as a sāmaṇera, not his full acceptance as a bhikkhu. As such it has no bearing on the Vinaya issue of obtaining parental permission if one wishes to obtain upasampadā.

When Sāriputta says, mama mātāpitāro micchādiṭṭhikā, kiṃ tehi āpucchitehi ("my mother and father are holders of wrong view, so why bother taking leave of them?"), as I see it he is not abrogating the Vinaya obligation to obtain parental permission (for it doesn't apply here), nor introducing any amendment to the Vinaya (something that he as a disciple would have no authority to do), but merely announcing his intention to dispense with conventional courtesies.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 28, 2009 11:59 PM
Title: Re: Monasticism and parental permission
Content:

A further point that occurs to me is that the sayadaw's implied equation of "holders of wrong view" (micchādiṭṭhiko) with "non-Buddhists" is to say the least problematic. In the Pali commentaries followers of non-Buddhist doctrines who hold to kammavāda are not classed as micchādiṭṭhiko.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 29, 2009 10:05 AM
Title: Re: Help finding sutta Ajahn Chah quotes/paraphrases here?
Content:

Probably the Mahaparinibbana Sutta. On uposatha days in Thai wats, after the Patimokkha has been recited monks will chant various sutta passages, of which the following is very common:

“As long as the monks hold regular and frequent assemblies, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they meet in harmony, break up in harmony, and carry on their business in harmony, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they do not authorise what has not been authorised already, and do not abolish what has been authorised, but proceed according to what has been authorised by the rules of training, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they honour, respect, revere and salute the elders of long standing who are long-ordained, fathers and leaders of the order, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they do not fall prey to desires which arise in them and lead to rebirth, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they are devoted to forest-lodgings, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as they preserve their personal mindfulness, so that in future the good among their companions will come to them, and those who have already come will feel at ease with them, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.

“As long as the monks hold to these seven things and are seen to do so, they may be expected to prosper and not to decline.”

(from Mahaparinibbana Sutta, DN. 16. Walshe trans.)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 29, 2009 5:08 PM

Title: Re: Stupid curiosity...

Content:

na bhikkhave massu vaḍḍhāpetabbam

“Bhikkhus, the beard is not to be allowed to flourish.”

(Vin. ii. 134)

In the Vinayalankāra vaḍḍhāpetabbam is glossed as dīgham kārenti – “to cause to be long.”

But as no particular length is specified the application of the rule varies according to local custom. The Burmese are the strictest, permitting no facial hair at all. The Thais are slightly less strict. Having dry skin I prefer not to shave too often and can usually get away with about a week's growth before the other monks start murmuring about it. The Sinhalese seem to be the most liberal. I've seen photos of some of them sporting fairly substantial beards.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2009 9:41 AM

Title: Re: What does Phra mean?

Content:

It's the Thai pronunciation of the Sanskrit or Pali *bara*, which is an alternative spelling of the more common *vara*. *Vara* can be either an adjective meaning excellent or a noun meaning a boon or blessing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2009 8:36 PM

Title: Re: How do monks in non-Buddhist countries obtain food, etc?

Content:

It's one of several special food allowances that apply in times of famine. They are all from the *Mahavagga* of the *Vinaya Pitaka*. Translations of the relevant passages can be found in Book II ch. 4 of Ven. Thanissaro's *Monastic Code*.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2009 10:36 PM

Title: Re: 32 Marks of a Great Man

Content:

The *Lakkhana Sutta*, the locus classicus for this doctrine, describes each of the marks as being the outcome of a particular kind of wholesome conduct or quality of character developed by the Bodhisatta in former lives. The commentary to the *sutta* takes all of this quite literally.

It's noteworthy, however, that the commentator shows rather little interest in the marks themselves. The emphasis is chiefly upon the *kusala karmas* that generate them. A detailed exposition of these makes up about four fifths of the commentary. The

remaining fifth is mainly about how the ripening of these kusala kammās aids the the Sammasambuddha as a teacher (or the Universal Monarch as a ruler). As for the marks themselves, most of these get no more than a laconic gloss of two or three words.

My impression is that most modern Theravada groups that take the classical Theravada pov seriously pay little attention to the thirty-two marks doctrine. An interesting exception is the UK-based Samatha Trust. The Trust's founder, Lance Cousins, is a big fan of the Digha Nikaya, including those Digha suttas that Buddhist modernists usually turn their noses up at: the Mahasamaya, Atanatiya, Lakkhana, Ambattha etc. and so much use is made of these in the Trust's exposition of the Dhamma.

As Robert Bluck describes:
The figure of the Buddha

Perhaps more than other traditions, the narrative element of Samatha Trust practice focuses almost exclusively on the historical Buddha. Even in a beginners meditation group, which has little emphasis on Buddhist narrative, the life story of the Buddha will be briefly described, perhaps in the middle of the course. Advanced groups will give considerable emphasis to the person of the Buddha, with stories from the Pali texts being used to illustrate the teachings. Interviewees confirmed that most long-term members would get to know the Buddha's life story well, and that this was the most important narrative (Stanier, 2003; Voies, 2003). While such information would initially come from talks at group meetings, committed members will also read the texts for themselves, drawing on suttas and commentaries for stories about the Buddha which 'help to inform attitudes and practice' (Harvey, 2003).

One example of how such narratives are used is the The Suttanta on the Marks, where a translation from the Digha Nikaya is presented as an opportunity to reflect on the Buddha's qualities as 'an important part of Buddhist meditative practice', and one which can guard against 'dogmatism or rigid views' (McNab et al., 1996: 5). Similarly, in Thirty-Two Marks (1995: v), readers are invited to use the 'thirty-two marks of a Great Man' to observe and investigate the characteristics of their own body and mind. In a story told as if for a child, a sleepy prince leaves home on a spiritual quest for wakefulness and is gently introduced to teachings on morality, meditation and wisdom. The thirty-two marks are then linked more directly to this threefold path, to the four jhanas and finally to the Eightfold Path. Each of the Buddha's marks is seen imaginatively as relating to spiritual progress, from the 'well-planted feet' which resemble 'the first steps one takes towards the Dhamma' to the 'turban crown' which symbolizes 'insight into the real nature of things: anicca, dukkha, anatta' (Thirty-Two Marks, 1995: 106–7).

(Robert Bluck, British Buddhism: teachings, practice and development, p. 57)
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2009 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Tattoos in Buddhism, Acceptable or not???

Content:

Tattoos are only an impediment to receiving ordination if one was marked with them as a punishment for a crime.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2009 9:33 AM

Title: Re: 32 Marks of a Great Man

Content:

Taking into account the Suttas' teaching on the eight great assemblies, I would suppose that the Buddha exhibited a top-knot when visiting assemblies of people with top-knots, but not when visiting other kinds of assembly.

'Ananda, there are these eight kinds of assembly. What are they? They are an assembly of khattiyas, an assembly of brahmins, an assembly of householders, an assembly of ascetics, an assembly of devas of the Realm of the Four Great Kings, an assembly of the Thirty-Three Gods, an assembly of maras, an assembly of Brahmas.

'I remember well, Ananda, many hundreds of assemblies of Khattiyas that I have attended; and before I sat down with them, spoke to them or joined in their conversation, I adopted their appearance and speech, whatever it might be. And I instructed, inspired, fired and delighted them with a discourse on Dhamma. And as I spoke with them they did not know me and wondered: "Who is it that speaks like this? Is he a deva or is he a man?" And having thus instructed them, I vanished from there, and still they did not know: "He who has just vanished - was he a deva or was he a man?"

'I remember well, Ananda, many hundreds of assemblies of brahmins ... many hundreds of assemblies of householders ... many hundreds of assemblies of ascetics ... many hundreds of assemblies of devas of the Realm of the Four Great Kings ... many hundreds of assemblies of the Thirty-Three Gods, many hundreds of assemblies of maras ...

'I remember well, Ananda, many hundreds of assemblies of Brahmas that I have attended; and before I sat down with them, spoke to them or joined in their conversation, I adopted their appearance and speech, whatever it might be. And I instructed, inspired, fired and delighted them with a discourse on Dhamma. And as I spoke with them they did not know me and wondered: "Who is it that speaks like this? Is he a deva or is he a man?" And having thus instructed them, I vanished from there, and still they did not know: "He who has just vanished from here - was he a deva or was he a man?"
(Parisa Sutta, AN. iv. 307-8; Mahaparinibbana Sutta, DN. ii. 109-110)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2009 9:39 AM

Title: Re: Tattoos in Buddhism, Acceptable or not???

Content:

These aren't given in the Vinaya as impediments to ordaining, nor are they nowadays treated as such.

I remember when I lived with Ajahn Maha Boowa there was a Thai monk in the community, Phra Sutchai, who had once done some serious prison time for armed robbery. While in prison he had got one of the other prisoners to tattoo a naked woman on his back. This didn't stop him ordaining, though of course he came in for quite a bit of ribbing about it from the other monks.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2009 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Articles on the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Not all of it. Parts of it have been translated by Nina van Gorkom and posted to <http://www.groups.yahoo.com/group/dhammastudygroup>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2009 10:06 AM

Title: New World Record

Content:

Yesterday, in the lobby of the Ramada Hotel, New Phetchburi Road, Bangkok, there took place what I believe is the largest ever gathering of Dhamma Wheel members. Assembled in the lobby were Dmytro, RobK, Nathan and myself — four persons in all, thus doubling the former world record, set when Ben met Retro and Chris met Ben.

Photographic proof to follow shortly. As soon as Nathan can figure out the workings of his new camera....

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2009 11:26 PM

Title: Re: Fixed Views

Content:

In the commentarial understanding the first nine stanzas of the Mettā Sutta are concerned with the development of sīla and samādhi, and the tenth —the subject of this thread— with insight. The views referred to are those concerned with self.

This is Buddhaghosa's commentary on the tenth stanza of the sutta:

In this way [i.e., as described in verses 1-9] the Blessed One taught those bhikkhus mettābhāvanā in its various aspects. But now, since mettā is close to wrong view of self (attadiṭṭhi) due to its having living beings as its object, he therefore completed the teaching with the following stanza:

diṭṭhiñca anupaggamma, sīlavā dassanena sampanno.
kāmesu vineyya gedhaṃ, na hi jātuggabbhaseyya punaretīti.

"Not getting involved in wrong view, possessed of virtue, with perfected seeing, having become purged of greed for sensual pleasures, he assuredly does not come to lie again in a womb."

He did this as a preventative against the monks' straying into the thicket of views (see the Sabbāsava Sutta, MN. 2) by showing them how the plane of the nobles (ariyabhūmi) can be attained by making that same mettā-jhāna the basis for insight.

Its meaning is this: After emerging from the abiding in mettā-jhāna, which was specified with the words, "This is Divine Abiding here, they say," he discerns the immaterial dhammas that were there [while in that jhāna], starting with applied thought (vitakka) and examining (vicāra), which he defines as 'nāma'.

Then, following on the defining etc., of these jhāna factors as 'nāma', he discerns the material phenomena (rūpa-dhamma) that were there [while in that jhāna], which he defines as 'rūpa'.

By means of this delimitation of mentality-&-materiality (nāmarūpa-pariccheda), he does not get involved in wrong view (diṭṭhiñca anupaggamma), for he avoids this by his discerning that there exists "a heap of mere formations (saṅkhāra); no living being can be found herein" (Vajirā Sutta, SN. i. 135), till he eventually becomes "possessed of virtue" with the kind of virtue that is supramundane (lokuttara-sīla) since he is now "perfected" (sampanno) in the right view belonging to the path of stream-entry, which is called "seeing" (dassana), and which is associated with that supramundane virtue.

After that, whatever "greed" (gedhaṃ) there is in him still remaining unabandoned in the guise of sensual desire as subjective defilement "for sensual pleasures" (kāmesu) as objects, of that he becomes "purged" (vineyya). That is, he becomes cured by the attenuation of certain defilements and by the abandoning of certain others without

remainder (see the Ākaṅkheyya Sutta, MN. 6) by means of his attaining the paths of the once-returner and the non-returner.

"He assuredly does not come to lie again in a womb" (na hi jātuggabbhaseyya punareti): absolutely never again coming to any womb, he is reborn only in the Pure Abodes, where he reaches arahantship and is extinguished.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2009 12:29 PM

Title: Re: How do monks in non-Buddhist countries obtain food, etc?

Content:

How would there not be another option? If you're referring to a place in which nobody ever offers almsfood, then that would simply be an unsuitable place for a Vinaya-observant bhikkhu to live. And so there is in fact an option: move somewhere else.

On the other hand, if it's a place where almsfood is hard to come by but at least some is obtainable, then the teaching given in the Vanapatthasutta (MN. 17) and the Sevanasutta (AN. iv. 365) is applicable.
from the Vanapatthasutta

"Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu lives in some jungle thicket. While he is living there his unestablished mindfulness does not become established, his unconcentrated mind does not become concentrated, his undestroyed taints do not come to destruction, he does not attain the unattained supreme security from bondage; and also the requisites of life that should be obtained by one gone forth —robes, almsfood, resting place, and medicinal requisites— are hard to come by. The bhikkhu should consider thus: 'I am living in this jungle thicket. While I am living here my unestablished mindfulness does not become established, my unconcentrated mind does not become concentrated, my undestroyed taints do not come to destruction, I do not attain the unattained supreme security from bondage; and also the requisites of life that should be obtained by one gone forth —robes, almsfood, resting place, and medicinal requisites— are hard to come by.' That bhikkhu should depart from that jungle thicket that very night or that very day; he should not continue living there."

In short, if the place is both bad for obtaining requisites and bad for practice, then move on. The sutta then continues with the following permutations:

2. Good for requisites, bad for practice: leave at once.
3. Bad for requisites, good for practice: stay put for now.
4. Good for requisites, good for practice: stay put for as long as life lasts.

The same is then repeated for bhikkhus living in locations other than jungle thickets.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2009 1:12 PM

Title: Re: Kamma and child prostitution -- blaming the victim?

Content:

To me the examples you give and the conundra you raise regarding them merely highlight the limitations of expounding kamma and its ripening in conventional terms (i.e. in terms of conceptual realities such as "persons"). The conundra evaporate when the subject is expounded in terms of dhammas.

In Anurādhapura we had discussions about kamma and vipāka. Someone remarked that he found it unjust that a deed committed in a former life can cause suffering in this life. The person who suffers today is not the same person anymore as the being in the past who committed the bad deed which produces an unpleasant result. Why then do we have to suffer today because of deeds we have not done?

Kamma produces vipāka. Each cause produces its appropriate result. This is the law of cause and effect which operates, no matter we like it or not. When we suffer from pain it is the result of kamma. We may be inclined to think: "Why does this have to happen to me?" But why do we think of "me"? There was no being in a former life who committed deeds, neither is there a being in this life who experiences results. There are only realities, nāmas and rūpas, arising and falling away.

In the absolute sense there is not "my present lifespan", because life exists only in one moment. There are different types of cittas which experience objects and each moment of citta falls away completely. Some cittas are cause: they can motivate good deeds and bad deeds which can produce their appropriate results. Some cittas are the results of good deeds and bad deeds, vipākacittas. Cittas which experience pleasant or unpleasant objects through the senses, such as seeing or hearing, are vipākacittas which arise throughout our life. Vipākacitta arises because of conditions and falls away immediately; there is no self who experiences a pleasant or unpleasant object. When there is pain, it is only a short moment of experiencing an unpleasant object through the body-sense. It is unavoidable, because it arises because of conditions. It falls away immediately. When we think of the pain with aversion, there is not only one citta with aversion, but seven cittas with aversion arising in succession. That is the order of the cittas arising in a process. Thus, when we have aversion about pain we make it seven times worse. Pain is unavoidable. Life is birth, old age, sickness and death.

Nina van Gorkom, Pilgrimage in Sri Lanka

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2009 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Translation please

Content:

yattha katthaci tvaṃ maṃ khippeyyāsi, tatth'āhaṃ tiṭṭheyyuṃ.

Or more poetically:

yena maṃ khippeyyāsi, tena ṭhassāmaṃ'ahaṃ.

But I wonder, is it the Latin motto quocunque jeceris stabit that you have in mind? If so, then that would be simply:

yattha naṃ khippeyyāsi, tattha ṭhassati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2009 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Can Killing a Living Being Ever Be an Act of Compassion?

Content:

Well, I've re-formatted the post, so you've no excuse now.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2009 9:13 AM

Title: Re: How do monks in non-Buddhist countries obtain food, etc?

Content:

That's okay provided that (i) the monks don't instruct anyone to do this for them, (ii) the refrigerator isn't in their living quarters, and (iii) the food is freshly offered on the day it is eaten.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2009 3:06 PM

Title: Re: Human eusocial colony, or targeted "individual"?

Content:

They weren't.

“Then Lord Yama says: ‘Good man, through negligence you have failed to do good by

body, speech, and mind ... But this evil action of yours was not done by your mother or your father, or by your brother or your sister, or by your friends and companions, or by your kinsmen and relatives, or by recluses and brahmins, or by gods: this evil action was done by you yourself, and you yourself will experience its result.”
(MN. 130)

By oneself is evil done, by oneself is one defiled;
By oneself is evil shunned, by oneself is one refined.

To polish or stain, on ourselves it depends,
For a person cannot by another be cleansed.
(Dhammapada 165)
Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2009 11:05 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

It is alluded to with the words “taṇhā ponobbhavikā”, rendered in your translation as “the craving that makes for further becoming.”

‘Ponobbhavika’ is the adjectival form of punabbhava, which is one of the commonest sutta terms for ‘rebirth’. As in the the Alagaddūpamasutta, for instance:

“Here the bhikkhu has abandoned the round of births (jāti-saṃsāra) that brings renewed being (ponobbhavika), has cut it off at the root...”

(MN. 22)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2009 11:15 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

I have told you before, citing the Pabbajita-abhiṇhasutta (AN. v. 87-8), the Abhiṇhapaccavekkhitabbaṭṭhānasutta (AN. iii. 71-5), the first of the two Āghātaṭṭhāpavāsanāyāsuttas (AN. iii. 185-6), and the dozen or so suttas in the Anamataggasamyutta of the SN's Nidānavagga (SN. ii. 177-193).

But a man hears what he wants to hear...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2009 11:30 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

The full form, "generation of renewal of being in the future" (āyatim punabbhavābhiniḍḍatti), certainly does.

As for punabbhava by itself, I can't say whether each and every occurrence of it means birth in a new existence as I haven't checked them all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 2:44 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

The Sutta is discussing embodiment (as I prefer to translate 'sakkāya'), which is a term for the five aggregates of grasping. The craving referred to is "the past craving that produced these [aggregates]" (tesam nibbattikā purimataṇhā). That is to say, the aggregates of the present life were generated by the taṇhā ponobbhavikā of the past life. The taṇhā ponobbhavikā of the present life, if not extinguished, will generate the aggregates of a future life.

As evidence for the reasonableness of this reading I would draw your attention to the Sīhasutta (AN. ii. 32-4). This is likewise about the origination and cessation of embodiment, but with especial reference to the effect that this teaching has upon those long-lived devas who deludedly imagine themselves to be eternal. The said devas are shocked and stricken with terror upon hearing it, for hitherto they had believed that their existence was without beginning and without end. But after hearing it they came to understand that their present sakkāya was in fact impermanent — it was generated by past craving and so had a beginning in past time and would have an end in future time.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 1:13 PM

Title: Re: Human eusocial colony, or targeted "individual"?

Content:

Each continuum consists entirely of dhammas that are dependently arisen and marked by the three characteristics. Given that there is no constituent part that is self-existing, how could the continuum as a whole be?

As for "self-present", can you say what you mean by this?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 1:24 PM

Title: Re: Is Mahayana perspective useful for Theravada practitioners?

Content:

The Chinese and Japanese had the Āgama sūtras, which roughly correspond to the first four Nikāyas of the Pali Sutta Piṭaka, and they had a Vinaya which resembles the Pali Vinaya quite closely (much more so than, say, the Mūlasarvastivāda Vinaya followed in Tibet). Dōgen seems to have been exceptionally well-read in these texts, for he is constantly quoting from them or making allusions to teachings contained in them.

The actual causes of the decline of celibate monasticism in Japanese Buddhism are a matter of public record. They are largely (though not entirely) of a political sort and have nothing to do with any supposed ignorance of early Buddhist teachings.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 2:07 PM

Title: Re: A question about right view

Content:

What do you mean by "supernatural" ?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 5:07 PM

Title: Re: A question about right view

Content:

Firstly, we shouldn't in fact expect rebirth to be an especially prominent theme in discourses by Sariputta. The Buddha says of him in the Saccavibhanga Sutta: "Cultivate the friendship of Sariputta and Moggallana, bhikkhus; associate with Sariputta and Moggallana. They are wise and helpful to their companions in the holy life. Sariputta is like a mother and Moggallana is like a wet-nurse. Sariputta trains others for the fruit of stream-entry, Moggallana for the supreme goal (arahantship). Sariputta, bhikkhus, is able to announce, teach, describe, establish, reveal, expound, and exhibit the Four Noble Truths."

(MN. 141)

Sariputta's speciality lay in his taking newly converted disciples of the Buddha (kalyāṇa puthujjanas already possessed of mundane right view) and giving them discourses of an abhidhammic sort (i.e. relating to aggregates, elements, sense-bases, dependent arising and the truths) to turn them into sotapannas. In discourses of an abhidhammic sort naturally the focus is upon impersonal phenomena. Such discourses are not concerned with persons and their stories – not even with their present life stories, let alone with their past saṃsāric narrative.

Nonetheless, rebirth is not absent in Sariputta's discourses, but the topic is usually covered allusively and implicatively rather than directly, and seldom in detail.

In the case of the Sammaditthi Sutta, the opening section concerns the ten wholesome and ten unwholesome courses of action (kusala/akusala kammaṭṭhā) and their respective roots:

"And what, friends, is the unwholesome, what is the root of the unwholesome, what is the wholesome, what is the root of the wholesome? Killing living beings is unwholesome; taking what is not given is unwholesome; misconduct in sensual pleasures is unwholesome; false speech is unwholesome; malicious speech is unwholesome; harsh speech is unwholesome; gossip is unwholesome; covetousness is unwholesome; ill will is unwholesome; wrong view is unwholesome."

[....]

And what is the wholesome? Abstention from killing living beings is wholesome; abstention from taking what is not given is wholesome; abstention from misconduct in sensual pleasures is wholesome; abstention from false speech is wholesome; abstention from malicious speech is wholesome; abstention from harsh speech is wholesome; abstention from gossip is wholesome; uncovetousness is wholesome; non-ill will is wholesome; right view is wholesome."

So, the tenth item in this pair of kammaṭṭhā is right view and wrong view respectively. And in all suttas where right view in the context of the kammaṭṭhā is defined, there is always an assertion of kammic efficacy, rebirth, and the existence of worlds beyond those normally visible to humans. In short, they all include affirmations of what you would term "the supernatural", while the definitions of wrong view in this context always entail a denial of the same. As the stock definition goes:

"He has wrong view, distorted vision, thus: 'There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed; no fruit or result of good and bad actions; no this world, no other world; no mother, no father; no beings who are reborn spontaneously; no good and virtuous recluses and brahmins in the world who have themselves realised by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world.'"

"He has right view, undistorted vision, thus: 'There is what is given and what is offered and what is sacrificed; there is fruit and result of good and bad actions; there is this world and the other world; there is mother and father; there are beings who are reborn spontaneously; there are good and virtuous recluses and brahmins in the world who have themselves realised by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other

world."

(MN. 41)

So that's one connection between the Sammaditthi Sutta and rebirth.

Moving on to the next section, where Sariputta expounds the four kinds of nutriment using the framework of the four noble truths. Here rebirth is alluded to in the statement that volition is the third type of nutriment and consciousness is the fourth. As the commentary explains:

The nutriment volitional thought when occurring as kamma leading to rebirth on the sensuous plane, feeds and conditions sensuous existence. When occurring as kamma leading to rebirth on the fine-material or immaterial plane, it feeds and conditions the corresponding existence. So does the nutriment volitional thought in all cases feed and condition the three states of existence.

The nutriment consciousness, at the moment of rebirth, feeds and conditions the three other mental groups (khandhā), conjoined with it; and by way of conascence-condition, etc., it feeds and conditions the thirty corporeal processes that arise in a triple continuity (ti-santati). So does the nutriment consciousness feed and condition mind-and-body at rebirth.

(translation from Nyanaponika's The Four Nutriments of Life)

So, that's two occurrences already, and we haven't even started yet on the twelvefold paṭiccasamuppāda.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 5:28 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Shrews

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 8:10 PM

Title: Re: A question about right view

Content:

All paññā (of which right view is one mode) arises in the here and now.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2009 10:49 PM

Title: Re: A question about right view

Content:

This is too simplistic. The Buddha rejected certain views about the value of sacrifice, notably, that it can bring about purification:

"There are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: 'Purification comes about through sacrifice.' But it is impossible to find a kind of sacrifice that has not already been offered up by me in this long journey, when I was either a head-anointed noble king or a well-to-do brahmin.

"There are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: 'Purification comes through fire-worship.' But it is impossible to find a kind of fire that has not already been worshipped by me in this long journey, when I was either a head-anointed noble king or a well-to-do brahmin."

(Mahāsīhanāda Sutta, MN. 12)

But to reject this is not to deny that sacrifice may conduce to benefits of a lower order. The Buddha wasn't "a one-sided speaker" (ekamsavādin), but rather "one who speaks after analysing the matter" (vibhajjavādin). The terms 'yañña' and 'hutta' (Vedic: 'yajña' and 'hotra') covered a great variety of oblatinal practices, some meeting with the Buddha's approval and others not.

As related in the appropriately named "Discourse on Sacrifices" (Yañña Sutta):

The horse sacrifice, human sacrifice,
Sammāpāsa, vājapeyya, niraggala:
These great sacrifices, fraught with violence,
Do not bring great fruit.

The great seers of right conduct
Do not attend that sacrifice
Where goats, sheep, and cattle
Of various kinds are slain.

But when sacrifices free from violence
Are always offered by family custom,
Where no goats, sheep, or cattle
Of various kinds are slain:
The great seers of right conduct
Attend a sacrifice like this.

The wise person should offer this,
A sacrifice bringing great fruit.
For one who makes such a sacrifice
It is indeed better, never worse.
Such a sacrifice is truly vast
And the devatās too are pleased.
(SN. i. 75-6; CD. I. 171-2)

Note also that by the time of the Buddha's passing 'yañña' among his disciples had become modified to the point that its meaning was essentially the same as 'dāna'. From one of the post-parinibbāna suttas:

Kumārakassapa: "Prince, when a sacrifice is made at which oxen are slain, or goats, fowl or pigs, or various creatures are slaughtered, and the participants have wrong view, wrong thought, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness and wrong concentration, then that sacrifice is of no great fruit or profit, it is not very brilliant and has no great radiance ... But when none of these creatures are put to death, and the participants have right view, right thought, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration, then that sacrifice is of great fruit and profit, it is brilliant and of great radiance."

Then Prince Payasi established a charity for ascetics and Brahmins, wayfarers, beggars and the needy. And there such food was given out as broken rice with sour gruel, and also rough clothing with ball-fringes. And a young Brahmin called Uttara was put in charge of the distribution.

(DN. 23)

See also the Kutadanta Sutta (DN. 5), with its account of inferior and superior sacrifices.

And for some cutting-edge modern scholarship on the subject: Maria Heim, *Theories of the Gift in South Asia: Hindu, Buddhist and Jain Reflections on Dāna*, (Routledge NY 2004.)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 6, 2009 11:04 PM
Title: Re: A question about right view
Content:
No, the Mahacattarisaka Sutta is unique.

I should note that the designations 'mundane' and 'supramundane' for these two right view are actually from the Petakopadesa and Nettipakarana, two early treatises on hermeneutics. At MN. 117 the distinction is expressed with the words 'sāsava' and 'anāsava', "accompanied by cankers" and "free of cankers" respectively.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 7, 2009 4:53 PM
Title: Re: A question about right view

Content:

As far as I know, all facets of right view would be subsumed under mundane and supramundane right view.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2009 4:55 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Kornfield

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2009 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Wops

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2009 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

A slang term for Italians, derived from guappo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2009 12:47 PM

Title: Re: saying hello

Content:

Hi Sattva,

Nice to see you again.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 8, 2009 1:19 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Jerboa

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 8, 2009 9:25 PM
Title: Re: Some clarification if possible?
Content:

In the Pali commentaries and chronicles the name 'Theravada' is used in two senses: narrowly as a name for the tradition preserved at the Mahavihara (as opposed to those at the rival viharas in Anuradhapura), and broadly, as a collective name for all the schools descended from the conservative monks at the second council (as opposed to the schools descended from the Mahasanghika faction). The latter sense of the term would include, for example, the Sarvastivada and its various offshoots.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 10, 2009 3:19 AM
Title: Re: Can a Faith or Dhamma follower be a Padaparama??
Content:

Right. The DF and the FF have both arrived at sotāpatti-magga. They are of identical attainment and differ from each other only with regard to whether it is the faculty of understanding (paññindriya) or the faculty of faith (saddhindriya) that is dominant in them.

A padaparama may have faith in the Dhamma, but this does not make him a "faith-follower". He lacks the requisite accumulations of paññā for ariyan attainment in the present life.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 10, 2009 9:41 AM
Title: Re: Happy birthday Ben!
Content:
Happy birthday Ben!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2009 5:29 AM

Title: Re: Happy Mother's Day

Content:

The claim that (it is certain) all beings have once been our mothers is just Tibetan hyperbole. The Buddha's teaching is: *satto sulabharūpo yo namūtābhūtapubbo iminā dīghena addhunā* — "It is not easy to find a being who in this long course has not formerly been one's mother." (Mātusutta, SN. ii. 189; Connected Discourses I. 659). In subsequent suttas the same is said also of fathers, brothers, sisters, sons and daughters.

But let's not forget the application of this teaching. In contrast with some Tibetan presentations, the Buddha is not encouraging us to go all maudlin at the thought that so-&-so was once our mum (or become vegetarians to avoid the risk of devouring our former daughters etc.), but rather:

"For what reason? Because, bhikkhus, this *saṃsāra* is without discoverable beginning. A first point is not discerned of beings roaming and wandering on, hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving. For such a long time, bhikkhus, you have experienced suffering, anguish, and disaster, and swelled the cemeteries. It is enough to experience revulsion towards all formations, enough to become dispassionate towards them, enough to be liberated from them."

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2009 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Funny ads

Content:

My favourites as a boy were the Smash instant mashed potato ads...

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3SAbljtk7E&feature=related>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Vrer4vEY-1w&feature=related>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3gLCj9qXfp4>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Some parodies from my teens....

Mel Smith & Griff Rhys Jones parodying the s3 ad

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LTEEKyTESiU>

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

British parodies of tacky 1970's American Express ads

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZF-U9nL9los>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Deluxe home organ.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XbWukKe-drc&feature=related>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Batchelors' soup

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rUfDGaTs8sE>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

"There's a Man in Iran." Positive spin on Ayatollah Khomeini a year after the Iranian Revolution.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aGBfYoldZQ4&feature=related>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Another genuine ad – a most bizarre one for Mr. Kipling's Cakes. Withdrawn after complaints from Christians.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Tus8s2mKGME>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

The Apostles' Creed (updated Anglican version). Not an ad. Just something else that Christians complained about.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IUQcCvX2MKk&feature=related>
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2009 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Ravens

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2009 4:52 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Since at least the 15th century the collective noun for ravens has been an “unkindness.” But that seems an unjustified slur on ravens, so I’m redressing the balance.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_collective_nouns_for_birds
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 12, 2009 8:03 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
talismanic

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 12, 2009 9:49 AM
Title: Re: The garden metaphor
Content:
"Therefore, bhikkhus, abandon what is unwholesome and devote yourselves to wholesome states, for that is how you will come to growth, increase, and fulfilment in this Dhamma and Discipline. Suppose there were a big sala-tree grove near a village or town, and it was choked with castor-oil weeds, and some man would appear desiring its good, welfare, and protection. He would cut down and throw out the crooked saplings that robbed the sap, and he would clean up the interior of the grove and tend the straight well-formed saplings, so that the sala-tree grove later on would come to growth, increase, and fulfilment. So too, bhikkhus, abandon what is unwholesome and devote yourselves to wholesome states, for that is how you will come to growth, increase, and fulfilment in this Dhamma and Discipline."
(MN. 21)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 12, 2009 2:10 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Clive.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 12, 2009 2:19 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Burnham

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 12, 2009 3:14 PM
Title: Re: Unfair Criticism?
Content:
Upanisa Sutta:
<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn12/sn12.023.bodh.html>

Bhikkhu Bodhi, Transcendental Dependent Arising:
<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel277.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 13, 2009 5:52 AM
Title: Re: Unfair Criticism?
Content:
He doesn't mention Buddhadasa at all. I think you may be confusing Buddhadasa (a 20th century Thai monk) with Buddhaghosa (the Pali commentator).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 13, 2009 6:43 AM
Title: Re: the great rebirth debate
Content:
The orthodox understanding is that they have to be taught mundane right view in order to make them ready for ariyan right view. That is to say, there is no possibility of leaping from a state in which wrong view ("there is nothing given, nothing offered...etc.") is ever liable to arise to ariyan right view. Rather, wrong view must be dislodged and the only cause that can effect this is the arising of mundane right view ("there is what is given, there is what is offered...etc."). In effect this means that high attainment in Dhamma is out of the question for those who remain skeptical, agnostic or non-committal regarding the affirmations that constitute mundane right view.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 13, 2009 7:03 AM
Title: Re: what does "Phra" really mean in Pali language?
Content:
Also the names of a great many inanimate objects will be prefaced with 'phra' if they

have any kind of connection with religion or royalty. Mary Haas' Thai dictionary has three pages of examples, and that's only a small selection.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 13, 2009 11:06 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Ciñcā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 6:02 AM
Title: Re: Monk Police in Thailand
Content:
Frankly, I don't this "code of silence" has any existence outside of your imagination.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 6:37 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Bouguereau

Difficult Lesson.jpg (100.27 KiB) Viewed 2330 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 6:49 AM
Title: Re: Nibbāna
Content:
The different terms are understood by abhidhammikas to be all related to Nibbāna, but focussing upon different aspects of it. And so Nibbāna is the unconditioned dhamma itself, while nirodha is (usually) the cognizing of Nibbāna at the moment of path consciousness. I guess there's no need to capitalize an experience that lasts only a moment.
Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 2:07 PM

Title: Re: Nibbāna

Content:

Ven. Mahākaccāna on the two Nibbāna-dhātus:

Herein, living beings have two diseases: ignorance and craving-for-existence. Two medicines have been prescribed by the Blessed One for the curing of these two diseases: samatha and vipassanā. Using these two medicines one realizes two cures: deliverance-of-the-heart due to the fading of attachment and deliverance-by-wisdom due to the fading of ignorance.

Herein, samatha is the medicine for the disease of craving, whose cure is deliverance-of-the-heart due to the fading of attachment. Vipassanā is the medicine for the disease of ignorance, whose cure is the deliverance-by-wisdom due to the fading of ignorance.

For the Blessed One has said:

“Two dhammas must be fully known: nāma and rūpa.”

“Two dhammas must be abandoned: ignorance and craving-for-existence.”

“Two dhammas must be cultivated: samatha and vipassanā.”

“Two dhammas must be realized: knowledge and deliverance.”

(Dasuttara Sutta, DN. 34)

Herein, one cultivating samatha understands rūpa; understanding rūpa he abandons craving; abandoning craving he realizes deliverance-of-the-heart due to the fading of attachment. One cultivating vipassanā understands nāma; understanding nāma he abandons ignorance; abandoning ignorance he realizes deliverance-by-wisdom due to the fading of ignorance.

When a bhikkhu has fully known two dhammas: nāma and rūpa, then likewise has he abandoned two dhammas: ignorance and craving-for-existence. Two dhammas have been cultivated by him: samatha and vipassanā, and two dhammas have been realized: knowledge and deliverance.

At this point a bhikkhu becomes one who has completed his task. This is the extinction-element with stuff remaining (sa-upādisesā nibbānadhātu).

Upon the termination of his life-span and surcease of his life-faculty, this dukkha ceases and no further dukkha arises. Herein, the cessation, the subsiding, of these aggregates, elements and sense-bases, and the absence of rebirth-linking and absence of manifestation of any further aggregates, elements and sense-bases – this is the extinction-element with no stuff remaining (anupādisesā nibbānadhātu).

(Peṭakopadesa 123-4)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 2:12 PM

Title: Re: Nibbāna

Content:

Yes, that's why I inserted the qualifier "usually". Nirodha actually gets glossed in various ways by the commentators and there are some contexts where it is taken as identical to nibbana.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 2:16 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Horsemen

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Theravada's teaching on Bioethics

Content:

It's in the Vinaya Pitaka's account of the third parajika rule – the prohibition against killing humans. It says that the term "human being" applies from the moment the first citta arises in a mother's womb.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 7:48 PM

Title: Re: Another Buddha Misquote

Content:

No, quite the contrary.

“Therefore, Ananda, you should live as islands unto yourselves, being your own refuge, with no one else as your refuge, with the Dhamma as an island, with the Dhamma as your refuge, with no other refuge.”

Having yourself (and the Dhamma) as an island and refuge means developing the four satipatthanas. Since two of the conditions for the arising of satipatthana are hearing the Good Dhamma and discussing it with kalyanamittas, the Sutta implicitly affirms the necessity of “spiritual friends on the path.”

As for having “no one else as your refuge,” this is explained in the Digha Nikaya commentary in terms of not expecting others to do the work for you.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 7:53 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
laurel tree

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 8:25 PM
Title: Re: Vinaya & sutta
Content:
No, they just happen to share the same names. The names mean, respectively, Greater Section and Lesser Section, so it's no surprise that they crop up in different collections.

As well as the Vinaya and Suttanipata, there are also Cullavaggas in the Anguttara Nikaya, the Udana and the Petavatthu. There are Mahavaggas in all the first four Nikayas, and about half a dozen books from the Khuddaka Nikaya.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2009 9:23 PM
Title: Re: Theravada's teaching on Bioethics
Content:
No. Theravada teaching is that intentional killing is always an unwholesome act. No exceptions. There are, however, differences in the gravity of different acts of killing. These will depend chiefly upon what sort of being is killed (e.g. in the case of humans killing a virtuous person is worse than killing a vicious one; in the case of animals killing a big one is worse than killing a small one) and on the mental state of the killer.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2009 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Theravada's teaching on Bioethics

Content:

A good overview of the subject from Peter Harvey's Introduction to Buddhist Ethics.

[./download/file.php?id=130](#)

(574.68 KiB) Downloaded 258 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 15, 2009 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Silly question alert-kamma

Content:

Hi Drolma,

In the Abhidhamma the body is said to consist of mind-produced and temperature-produced rūpas as well as kamma-produced ones.

It is the six sense-bases that the Buddha taught as being "old kamma". The fifth of these bases is of course "body", but here the word doesn't mean the body as a whole, but only the bodily sensoria.

Kamma Sutta

"Monks, I will teach you new & old kamma, the cessation of kamma, and the path of practice leading to the cessation of kamma. Listen and pay close attention. I will speak.

"Now what, monks, is old kamma? The eye is to be seen as old kamma, fabricated & willed, capable of being felt. The ear... The nose... The tongue... The body... The mind is to be seen as old kamma, fabricated & willed, capable of being felt. This is called old kamma.

"And what is new kamma? Whatever kamma one does now with the body, with speech, or with the mind: This is called new kamma.

"And what is the cessation of kamma? Whoever touches the release that comes from the cessation of bodily kamma, verbal kamma, & mental kamma: This is called the cessation of kamma.

"And what is the path of practice leading to the cessation of kamma? Just this noble eightfold path: right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. This is called the path of practice leading to the cessation of kamma.

"So, monks, I have taught you new & old kamma, the cessation of kamma, and the path of practice leading to the cessation of kamma. Whatever a teacher should do — seeking the welfare of his disciples, out of sympathy for them — that have I done for you. Over there are the roots of trees; over there, empty dwellings. Meditate, monks. Don't be heedless. Don't later fall into regret. This is our message to you."

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2009 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Vinaya & sutta

Content:

Apart from the bhikkhuni-patimokkha I don't think there is very much that's not covered in the two volumes of Ven. Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code. The first volume covers all of the bhikkhu-patimokkha, while the second covers the extra-patimokkha rules and descriptions of procedural matters preserved in the Khandhakas (i.e. the Mahavagga and Cullavagga). I'm not sure if it covers all of the Khandhaka material, but I get the impression the author has at least covered everything that the average bhikkhu is ever likely to encounter in practice.

There is a homepage somewhere dedicated to collecting online materials on Vinaya. It's owned by the Malaysian monk Ven. Kumara, so you might be able to find it with Google. Also there's an online edition of Hermann Oldenburg's translation of the Vinaya Pitaka.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2009 9:25 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Brine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2009 10:06 AM

Title: Re: Nibbāna

Content:

The short answer is that some suttas do seem to suggest that, while others suggest that nibbana is something more than that. Since different suttas might be read as supporting different conceptions of nibbana, a major part of the interpretive task is to determine which utterances should be taken as requiring further elaboration or qualification and

which should be treated as definitive. Disagreement on this question appears to have been a major cause of the controversies regarding nibbana among the Indian Buddhist schools.

I have to go out now, but I have more to write later in reply to your question. In the meantime you might find the attached article of interest. It's an excerpt from Noa Ronkin's recent book, Early Buddhist Metaphysics.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

./download/file.php?id=135
(261.34 KiB) Downloaded 143 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 16, 2009 10:08 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Chutney

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 16, 2009 3:27 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Vole.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 16, 2009 5:35 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Unamuno

"A lot of good arguments are spoiled by some fool who knows what he is talking about."

http://www.brainyquote.com/quotes/authors/m/miguel_de_unamuno.html

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 16, 2009 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)

Content:

Except in grammatical exercises like this, I would probably translate it:

After collecting flowers and giving them to their uncle, the children laugh.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2009 7:35 AM

Title: Re: Vinaya & sutta

Content:

I'm not sure what you mean by this. The Khuddakapatha is a tiny collection of suttas in the Khuddaka Nikāya. It has nothing to do with Vinaya. Are you perhaps thinking of the "lesser and minor rules of training" (khuddānukhuddaka-sikkhāpada)?

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2009 8:14 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Ovid

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2009 10:46 AM

Title: Re: Yikes! People are noticing the change in me.

Content:

In the Dhammapada commentary, to whom does the arahant Mahākappina exclaim, 'aho sukhaṃ'?

In the Udāna and Vinaya, to whom does the arahant Bhaddiya exclaim, 'aho sukhaṃ'?

In both cases it would appear that the elders are talking to themselves, unaware that there are other monks in the vicinity, and thus not intending to make any impression on anyone. This can be more clearly seen in the Bhaddiya narrative, which is explicit that the elder would make this exclamation while dwelling at tree roots or in empty places. That being so, their 'aho sukhaṃ' utterances are not 'proclamations'.

Now if Mahākappina and Bhaddiya had gone into the midst of assemblies of bhikkhus, or into crowded marketplaces, and yelled out, 'Woo hoo, look at me!' then the

comparison of yourself with them might be apt. But since they did nothing of the kind, there is simply no comparing their 'aho sukham' with yours.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 11:03 AM
Title: Re: Sunim's Ranch
Content:
Hi David,

Thanks for posting these. I think I recognize the Sinhalese Korean-ordained Zen bhikshu. He (or someone who looked very like him) once spent a night here at Wat Benjama back in the late 80's. I think he's the most argumentative monk I've ever met. If you said almost any sentence containing the word "is" you'd be sure to get the Pythonesque reply, "No, it isn't!"

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 11:22 AM
Title: Re: Yikes! People are noticing the change in me.
Content:

Well, in fact there is a place for it. The Buddha commended the "divine abiding" of *muditā* —empathetic joy at the success or happiness of others— as a quality worth developing. And when *muditā* arises, the wholesome consciousness that it accompanies may well generate those mind-produced derivative materialities known as bodily intimation and verbal intimation, conventionally taking such forms as 'clapping', 'cheering' and suchlike.

However, not every sort of success or happiness is worthy of *muditā*. For example, a successful bank robber wouldn't be a suitable object for *muditā*, nor would a happy person whose happiness is delusional. For these persons the appropriate divine abiding is not *muditā* but compassion.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 9:43 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
divine ear

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 10:17 PM
Title: Re: Bhikkhuni ordination...
Content:
Right. All the suttas in which the earlier conversation is reported take place during the narrative leading up to the parinibbāna.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 10:26 PM
Title: Re: Bhikkhuni ordination...
Content:
Yes, though I would add that it wouldn't necessarily make the Vinaya account false, as is sometimes asserted by modernists. For the Buddha might have had the intention to eventually do it, but in the meantime feigned reluctance (as in the Brahmā Sahampati episode). He even lays down a Vinaya allowance for bhikkhus to behave like this in some circumstances.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 17, 2009 10:33 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Oyster

(A noisy noise annoys an oyster).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 18, 2009 1:50 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
mummy

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 18, 2009 10:35 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Burton

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 18, 2009 2:55 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Actually it was Rev. Robert Burton, author of *The Anatomy of Melancholy*, but never mind.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Robert_Burton_%28scholar%29

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 18, 2009 4:56 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
That Eeyore's just too darn cheerful.

“The bright side of it,” said Puddleglum, “is that if we break our necks getting down the cliff, then we're safe from being drowned in the river.”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 18, 2009 4:57 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Bacchus

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 19, 2009 12:10 AM
Title: Re: Chakras and Buddhism

Content:
No.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 19, 2009 2:32 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
joiner

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 19, 2009 3:51 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Sir Henry...

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 19, 2009 7:33 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Poppies.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 20, 2009 6:11 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Full day behind the tamarisks –the sky is blue and staring–
As the cattle crawl afield beneath the yoke,
And they bear one o'er the field-path, who is past all hope or caring,
To the ghat below the curling wreaths of smoke.

<http://poetry.poetryx.com/poems/8426/>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 20, 2009 7:21 PM
Title: Re: Music for Buddhists?
Content:
Horrible! They haven't a clue. It's even worse than the Ambedkarite chanting that's been

getting so popular in Thailand lately.

“Beat is not rhythm, but the last sad skeleton of rhythm, stripped bare of human life.”

– Roger Scruton, *The Aesthetics of Music*, p. 502.

<https://tinyurl.com/qnntns> onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 20, 2009 11:09 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Arimathea

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2009 2:14 PM

Title: Re: 10fold path?

Content:

I would say so. The professor, it seems, wishes to rely on the suttas alone, but sammā-ñāṇa and sammā-vimutti are never defined in the Sutta Piṭaka (nor even in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka), and there are umpteen things that get denoted ‘ñāṇa’ or ‘vimutti’. So if one takes a suttas-only approach one will have no option here than to resort to guesswork.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2009 2:49 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

telegraph

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2009 2:59 PM

Title: Re: Do bodhisattas have partners?

Content:

In the more usual "apadana" narrative in Thai monk hagiographies, when the monk changes his mind and starts striving for arahantship (rather than paccekabodhi or sammāsambodhi), the wife who's been tagging along with him through countless lives does not remain on good terms with him. In the life in which the male changes his mind,

the female will usually be born as a yakkhini or a female naga. Incensed at what she perceives as a betrayal of their joint vows she will do her utmost to spoil his meditation, until the heroic arahant-to-be finally vanquishes her with the power of his samadhi.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 21, 2009 3:56 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Ernie Wise

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 21, 2009 7:46 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
courteysie

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 22, 2009 8:30 AM
Title: Re: Do bodhisattas have partners?
Content:
Like when the Buddha sent Mara packing.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 22, 2009 8:57 AM
Title: Re: Do bodhisattas have partners?
Content:
No, it isn't.

The north-east region of Thailand —where most of these monks come from— is a rather macho culture that prefers rugged tough guy heroes to romantic ones. For the latter one would need to read hagiographies of Bangkok monks like Somdet Toh.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 22, 2009 9:28 AM
Title: Re: Merit
Content:
Merit is a spiritual currency.

For example, for progress in Dhamma to be possible one needs to encounter a faithworthy object — the Buddha, Dhamma or Sangha, or something representing these. Each such encounter will consist in the arising of a sense-door process comprising wholesome resultant consciousnesses (kusala vipaka-cittas — eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness etc.) that have one of the three jewels as their object. These cittas don't arise from nothing, but rather, are paid for by past merit. ("There's no such thing as a free vipāka-citta," as Milton Friedman might say).

Where the currency of merit differs from ordinary currency is that one can't get it by being greedy for it. An act of giving, for example, is puñña only to the extent that it is motivated by a non-greed-rooted consciousness.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 22, 2009 6:31 PM
Title: Re: Do bodhisattas have partners?
Content:

In the Jātakas' depiction of the future Gotama Buddha, he and the future Rāhulamātā didn't get to meet in every single life, but in those lives when they did meet they were always partners. But their partnership wasn't always sexual — in some lives they were both ascetics.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 22, 2009 8:52 PM
Title: Re: Do bodhisattas have partners?
Content:

I don't know. I haven't heard much about Luang Phor Waen except that old story about how he would fly through the air and overtake aeroplanes.

The one whom I've heard most about is Ajahn Weun, a disciple of Ajahn Laa and one of

the teachers of the veteran American forest monk Tan Dhammachando (Tan Chad). This was supposedly a case of husband and wife formerly vowing to attain Buddhahood and Buddha-wifehood, but Tan Weun changed his mind and then found himself being pestered by his wife-turned-nāga. He first tried to get rid of her using the saiyasaat that he'd studied before ordaining, but she was too powerful to be overcome in this way. In the end he developed fire kasina and then expanded the nimitta into a wall of fire surrounding himself. The she-nāga couldn't get through the fire and Weun attained arahantship after she'd given up and gone away. So they say.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2009 9:39 AM
Title: Re: Merit
Content:

1. In addition to the mental factors that generate puñña, there are those that generate its opposite, pāpa, which ripens in pain.
2. Puñña can't be generated just because one wants it to be, or wants the fruits that it brings, for the conditions responsible for it are anattā, hence out of one's control.
3. Even if there were only puñña, and no pāpa, there would still be dukkha, for puñña ripens as pleasurable feeling, but even pleasurable feeling is included in the dukkha of formations.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2009 3:35 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Woolworths

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2009 9:23 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
I don't know why I associate Woolworths with purity. Probably just brainwashed by adverts at an impressionable age.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 23, 2009 10:02 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and Self Defence

Content:

The clause you're referring to comes under the pācittiya rule prohibiting a bhikkhu from striking a fellow bhikkhu. The section of the Vinaya where this rule is laid down contains supplementary rulings covering other kinds of assault by a bhikkhu. One of the rulings is that it's no offence if a bhikkhu is attacked and strikes the attacker only in order to effect his escape.

anāpatti kenaci viheṭṭhiyamāno mokkhādhippāyo pahāraṃ deti

“There is no offence if, being in some difficulty, he gives a blow desiring freedom.”
(Vin. iv. 146. I.B. Horner trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 23, 2009 11:17 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Douglas Bader

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2009 10:21 AM

Title: Re: robe question

Content:

Hi JC,

It's called a saṅghāṭi and was originally prescribed for use in cold weather. It still serves this purpose for thudong monks and monks living in cooler climes, but for everyone else it is now merely decorative.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2009 10:49 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Freyja

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2009 11:36 AM

Title: Re: Smilies...

Content:

They are just thumping each other with electric toasters. It's not a very sensible thing to do, but nor is it a breach of the fifth precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2009 11:40 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Ratatoskr

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2009 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Rāmprāsad Sen

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2009 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Bo Duddley

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2009 12:03 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

albatross

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2009 1:17 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

beret

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2009 1:28 PM

Title: Re: Offering almsfood to monks and nuns

Content:

Hi Guy,

This guide by Ven. Ariyesako covers most of the questions that laypeople might have concerning their dealings with bhikkhus:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/ariyesako/layguide.html>"
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2009 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Ephesians

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2009 5:54 AM

Title: Re: Satipatthana: Internal and external contemplation

Content:

In the commentarial understanding it would depend on who "you" refers to. If it is someone who has mastered the jhanas and developed knowledge of the penetration of others minds (cetopariya-ñāna), then he will contemplate external dhammas at those moments when he is penetrating others' minds, or just after having done so. If he hasn't developed this power then he will contemplate internal dhammas only, because these are the only dhammas that will be available to contemplate.

This commentarial view is supported by the Janavasabhasutta (DN. 18), in which the capacity for external satipatthana arises as a result of concentration developed by means of internal satipatthana:

This was the burden of Brahma Sanankumara's speech. He went on: 'What do my lords of the Thirty-Three think? How well has the Lord Buddha who knows and sees pointed out the four foundations of mindfulness for the attainment of that which is good! What are they? Here a monk abides contemplating the body as body, earnestly, clearly aware,

mindful and having put away all hankering and fretting for the world. As he thus dwells contemplating his own body as body, he becomes perfectly concentrated and perfectly serene. Being thus calm and serene, he gains knowledge and vision externally of the bodies of others.

‘He abides contemplating his own feelings as feelings, ... he abides contemplating his own mind as mind,... he abides contemplating his own mind-objects as mind-objects, earnestly, clearly aware, mindful and having put away all hankering and fretting for the world. As he thus dwells contemplating his own mind-objects as mind-objects, he becomes perfectly concentrated and perfectly serene. Being thus calm and serene, he gains knowledge and vision externally of the mind-objects of others. These are the four foundations of mindfulness well pointed out by the Lord Buddha who knows and sees, for the attainment of that which is good.’

(DN. ii. 216, Walshe trans.)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2009 6:08 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Lawn

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2009 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

mercury poisoning

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2009 2:43 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Amakusa Shirō

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2009 3:21 PM

Title: Re: Disrobing

Content:

The Vinaya Piṭaka's Cullavagga (Vin. ii. 279)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2009 10:11 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
"Je m'en vais..."

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Louis_XIV_of_France

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2009 5:52 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Doctor Mac

<http://www.bartleby.com/6/280.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2009 7:52 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
fifty ways

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2009 9:59 PM
Title: New Sutta anthology
Content:
Greetings,

Just a note to announce the publication of a fine new anthology of Pali Suttas, collected and translated by the Pali Text Society president, Rupert Gethin.

Sayings of the Buddha: new translations from the Pali Nikāyas

<http://www.wisdom-books.com/ProductDetail.asp?PID=18311>

<https://www.amazon.com/Sayings-Buddha-Translations-Nikayas-Classics/dp/019283925X>

Contents....

Dīgha Nikāya

The Fruits of the Ascetic Life – Sāmaññaphala-sutta (D. i 47–86)

The Buddha's Final Nibbāna – Mahāparinibbāna-sutta (D. ii 72–168)

King Mahāsudassana – Mahāsudassana-sutta (D. ii 169–199)

The Origin of Things – Aggañña-sutta (D. iii 80–98)

Advice to Sigāla – Sigālovāda-sutta (D. iii 180–193)

Majjhima Nikāya

Establishing Mindfulness – Satipaṭṭhāna-sutta (M. i 55–63)

The Stilling of Thoughts – Vitakkasaṇṭhāna-sutta (M. i 118–122)

The Simile of the Snake – Alagaddūpama-sutta (M. i 130 – 142)

The Short Dialogue with Māluṅkya – Cūḷa-māluṅkya-sutta (M. i 426–432)

The Dialogue with Prince Bodhi – Bodhirājakumāra-sutta (M. ii 91–97)

The Analysis of acts – Mahā-kammavibhaṅga-sutta (M. iii 207–215)

Samyutta Nikāya

(From the Chapter with Verses – Sagātha-vagga)

Rohitassa (S. i 61–62)

(From the Chapter on Causes – Nidāna-vagga)

Analysis (S. ii 2–4)

Specific Basis (S. ii 29–32)

(From the Chapter on the Aggregates – Khandha-vagga)

Nakulapitar (S. iii 1–5)

Foam (S. iii 140–143)

(From the Chapter on the Six Sense Spheres – Saḷāyatana-vagga)

Burning (S. iv 19–20)

Illness (S. iv 46–47)

(From the Great Chapter – Mahā-vagga)

[Grouped sayings on the path]

Ignorance (S. v 1–2)

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 38–41, etc.)

[Grouped sayings on the seven constituents of awakening]

Fire (S. v 112–115)

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 134, 137)

[Grouped sayings on the four ways of establishing mindfulness]

The Monkey (S. v 148–150)

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 189)

[Grouped sayings on the five faculties]

Sāketa (S. v 219–220)

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 239, 241)

[Grouped sayings on the four ways of right application]

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 244–245)

[Grouped sayings on the five powers]

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 249, 251)

[Grouped sayings on the four bases of accomplishment]

moggallāna (S. v 269–271)

The Ganges Repetition (S. v 290–1)

[Grouped sayings on the four absorptions]
The Ganges Repetition (S. v 307–308)

[Grouped sayings on the truths]
Turning the Wheel of Truth (S. v 420–424)

Aṅguttara Nikāya

From the Section of Ones
A Finger-snap (A. i 11)

From the Section of Twos
Mother and Father (A. i 61–62)

From the Section of Threes
Kesaputta (A. i 188–193)

From the Section of Fours
Jānussoṇi (A. ii 173–176)

From the Section of Fives
Excited by the Senses (A. iii 5–6)

From the Section of Sixes
Mahācunda (A. iii 355–356)

From the Section of Sevens
Araka (A. iv 136–139)

From the Section of Eights
Worldly Qualities (A. iv 157–160)

From the Section of Nines
Sutavat (A. iv 369–371)

From the Section of Tens
A Lion's Roar (A. v 32–36)

From the Section of Elevens
Friendliness (A. v 342)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 1:16 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
craven

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 1:44 AM
Title: Re: Pronunciation nightmares: uposatha and upasaka make me cry
Content:
And what we know as a "subway", I expect David would know as a "pedestrian underpass".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 2:07 AM
Title: Re: New Sutta anthology
Content:
From Gethin's translation of the Sigala Sutta:
'A son of a good family should look after the direction above as ascetics and brahmans in five respects: with friendliness in acts of body, with friendliness in acts of speech, with friendliness in acts of thought, by keeping his doors open to them, by providing them with their material needs. When a son of a good family looks after the direction above as ascetics and brahmans in these five respects, then they show him sympathy in six respects: they keep him from what is bad; they encourage him in what is good; they show their sympathy with kind thoughts; they tell him what he hasn't heard before; they clarify what he has heard before; they explain the path to heaven. When a son of a good family looks after the direction above as ascetics and brahmans in these five respects, then they show him sympathy in these six respects, and in this way the direction above is covered by him and kept safe from danger.'

So, when you read it for the first time you will be hearing what you haven't heard before, and when you read it for the second time your understanding will be clarified.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 6:28 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:
Mopsa

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 9:00 AM
Title: Re: Commentary on...
Content:
Don't forget the pronoun!

"Bhagava.mmuulakaa no, bhante, dhammaa"

"For us, bhante, doctrines have their source in the Blessed One," or, "Our doctrines, bhante, have their source in the Blessed One."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 9:54 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Don Quixote

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 11:51 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
farcical aquatic ceremony

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 11:55 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
from Dennis the Constitutional Peasant:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dOOTKA0aGI0>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 5:35 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:
Teskjejjerringa

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 1, 2009 6:10 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
It means "Teaspoon Lady", though to English children she is better known as Mrs. Pepperpot.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Alf_Fr%C3%B8ysen"
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mrs._Pepperpot" onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 9:50 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
veal

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 12:25 PM
Title: Re: Do we create karma every second
Content:
Not every moment. During sleep there is just an uninterrupted succession of existence-continuum consciousnesses (bhavanga-citta). These are resultant consciousnesses (vipāka-citta) that are identical to the resultant consciousness with which our present life began. A resultant consciousness does not create any new kamma.

While awake no kamma is created during sense-door processes such as seeing, hearing etc., for these too consist of resultant consciousnesses. It is during the mind-door processes that follow a sense-door process that kamma is created, either through the arising of one or another of the ten unwholesome courses of action (akusala kammapaṭṭha), or one or another of the eight great sense-sphere wholesome consciousnesses, or (in the case of samatha cultivators), one of the refined material sphere or immaterial sphere wholesome consciousnesses.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Disrobing

Content:

Possibly. Though there's no limit in theory, in practice if a man were to make a habit of ordaining and disrobing then it's likely that many abbots would end up rejecting his request once they came to know of his past history. In colloquial Thai there's an expression, "ordained five times," which is applied to men with a reputation for fickleness and unreliability.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Esrom

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Do we create karma every second

Content:

Right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2009 8:42 PM

Title: Re: Do we create karma every second

Content:

Well, actually there are, because not every ethically significant (i.e. wholesome or unwholesome) mental process will be adequate to generate a kamma. For example, in the case of unwholesome mental processes, if they are of too brief a duration or too weak an intensity to bring about any of the akusala kammapaṭha (killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, false speech, divisive speech, harsh speech, frivolous speech, covetousness, ill will, or wrong view), then they won't create any unwholesome kamma.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 3, 2009 9:15 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
David Niven

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 1:16 AM
Title: Re: Commentary on...
Content:

Cześć, here's my translation...

The Blessed One is the source of them, thus they are "sourced in the Blessed One" (or: "with the Blessed One as their source"). This is said: "Bhante, these dhammas of ours were made manifest in the past by Kassapa, the Perfectly Awakened One. When he attained final Nibbana, for one Buddha-interval there was no other ascetic or brahmin who was capable of making these dhammas manifest. But [now] these dhammas have been made manifest for us by the Blessed One. Having indeed relied upon the Blessed One, we directly understand and penetrate these dhammas, thus [we say] "For us, bhante, dhammas have their source in the Blessed One."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 1:28 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Éamon de Valera (founder of Fianna Fáil)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 3:37 AM
Title: Re: How to handle doubts (vicikicchā)?
Content:

It's true that there is an implicit distinction in the Suttas between (1) unwholesome doubt (e.g., scepticism regarding the qualities of the Triple Gem), (2) commendable doubt (e.g., when one doubts doubtful claims, as in the opening to the Kālāma Sutta), and (3) ethically indifferent doubt (e.g., wondering whether one should go left or right to get to Rājagaha).

However, these distinctions need to be determined contextually. They have nothing to do with which word for doubt the Buddha happens to use. In the Suttas the various

words for doubt (kaṅkhā, vicikicchā, vimati, saṃsaya etc.), along with the verbs from which they derive, are all used synonymously and interchangeably.

Here, a monk is doubtful (kaṅkhati) and vacillates (vicikicchati) regarding the Teacher; he is dissatisfied and cannot settle in his mind. Thus his mind is not inclined towards ardour, devotion, persistence and effort.

(DN. iii. 278)

It is fitting for you, Kālāmas, to be sceptical (kaṅkhitum); it is fitting for you to doubt (vicikicchitum). Doubt (vicikicchā) has arisen in you in a doubtful (kaṅkhanīya) matter.

(AN. i. 189)

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 3:50 AM

Title: Re: How to handle doubts (vicikicchā)?

Content:

One further remark:

What I wrote in my last post concerns Sutta usage. In the Abhidhamma, however, vicikicchā is never wholesome or neutral, but is always an unwholesome mental factor. The question sometimes arises as to how to reconcile the abhidhammic claim that vicikicchā is always bad with those sutta passages in which this seems not to be the case. One does so as follows:

1. When vicikicchā is being commended in the Suttas, it is to be understood as referring to the mental factor of understanding (paññā), with the Buddha using the word 'vicikicchā' merely to conform to common worldly usage.

2. Ethically indifferent doubt, such as wondering how to get to Rājagaha when one arrives at a crossroad, is referred to as a "counterfeit of a hindrance". Abhidhammically this is described not in terms of the presence of the mental factor of vicikicchā, but rather, in terms of the absence of the mental factor of decision (adhimokkha).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 4:00 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Sgian dubh

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 6:31 AM

Title: Re: Physical pain - nama or rupa?

Content:

Painful bodily feeling is the vedanā that accompanies the fifth of the seven types of unwholesome-resultant consciousness (akusala-vipāka citta), namely, unwholesome-resultant bodily consciousness accompanied by pain (dukkhasahagataṃ kāyaviññāṇaṃ). The basis (vatthu) of this citta is rūpa, but the citta itself and the vedanā are nāma.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 11:01 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

body odour

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 5:56 PM

Title: Re: Happy to say hello!

Content:

Hi Saschwartz,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2009 5:58 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Monkees

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 2:38 AM
Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!
Content:
Thanks everyone!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 2:38 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
pliskie

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 2:41 AM
Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!
Content:
The Thais have been calling me luang phor for years. Ever since the first grey hairs began appearing.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 2:49 AM
Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!
Content:
In the case of very senior or very famous monks the laity might arrange a birthday party. The rest mostly just follow the general Thai birthday practice of doing some kind of merit-making act such as freeing a captive fish or a turtle, or offering gifts to their fellow monks.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 10:26 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Mictlantecuhtl

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 10:49 AM
Title: Re: Happy Birthday Bubbabuddhist!

Content:
Happy birthday, John!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 6, 2009 10:52 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
ha

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 8, 2009 10:12 PM
Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?
Content:
Ditto.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 8, 2009 10:24 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
ebony

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 1:20 AM
Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?
Content:
It isn't normally the rupa that serves as the basis for sakkaya-ditthi with respect to matter. At least not in the case of humans. (Tree devatas who deludedly believe themselves to be trees are another story).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 8:57 AM
Title: Re: Boxing and karma
Content:
As Ledi Sayadaw ordained very young and was reputedly strict in his Vinaya observance,

I suspect he may not have had a very accurate idea about rugby etc.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 9:01 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!

Content:

Cake-making is not really a strong point of Thai cuisine. Cakes are usually made out of rice flour and nearly always taste like sawdust. They are, however, nicely decorated.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 9:09 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!

Content:

Thai sawdust cakes of the more arabesque sort...

cakes.jpg (144.23 KiB) Viewed 2662 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Question about etymology.

Content:

There are a great many words in the two languages that derive from common roots, but not as many as in the Slavic languages.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 1:23 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

arses

Our faces to the ground
And arses to the sky...
Forever.
(from a Thai harvesting song)

harvest.jpg (170.33 KiB) Viewed 1510 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 1:51 PM
Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?
Content:
Yes, for satipatthana with respect to external dhammas means the dhammas belonging to another being.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 2:26 PM
Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?
Content:
They are an abhidhammic concern, but only as external ayatanas of our own eyes, ears etc.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 9, 2009 8:17 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
rottweiler

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 10, 2009 9:45 AM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
mangalitsa

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 10, 2009 2:45 PM
Title: Re: MN 19. Dvedhāvitakka Sutta
Content:
No problem. In fact it's better to consult several translations.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 10, 2009 4:17 PM
Title: Re: Accepting Rebirth
Content:
The candle simile is used in the Milinda, but to make a quite different point to that of Carus.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 11, 2009 12:03 AM
Title: Re: Question for monks -blessing chant - Yathā vārivahā pūrā
Content:
There may be some regional differences in this matter.

I recall that in the village wats of Lamphun on uposatha days, at the end of the day the laypeople would give an envelope of cash to the senior villager who had led them in chanting, requesting the precepts, and other ceremonial stuff. He would then bless them by chanting the "yathā..." and the "sabbītiyo..." just like the monks.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 11, 2009 10:07 PM
Title: Re: MN 19. Dvedhāvitakka Sutta

Content:

No. It is an honorific plural, like that used by Queen Elizabeth when delivering formal speeches. In Pali texts kings say 'we', 'us', 'our' etc. when issuing commands and the Buddha does so when speaking in an exhortatory or homiletic mode. When speaking in other modes they will both use the first person singular.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2009 11:23 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth in classical theravada

Content:

It is held to be an indispensable doctrine. As I wrote in the Great Rebirth Debate thread: The orthodox understanding is that they have to be taught mundane right view in order to make them ready for ariyan right view. That is to say, there is no possibility of leaping from a state in which wrong view ("there is nothing given, nothing offered...etc.") is ever liable to arise to ariyan right view. Rather, wrong view must be dislodged and the only cause that can effect this is the arising of mundane right view ("there is what is given, there is what is offered...etc."). In effect this means that high attainment in Dhamma is out of the question for those who remain skeptical, agnostic or non-committal regarding the affirmations that constitute mundane right view.

Kammic efficacy and rebirth are part of mundane right view. To reject or doubt rebirth is to suppose that there are some causes that don't yield effects – specifically, that there can be ignorance and craving that will not issue in further becoming. Those of such a view have not understood the conditionality of dhammas even at the intellectual/pariyatti level. To not understand this is to not understand the four noble truths, the three characteristics, or anything else that is of decisive importance in the development of paññā.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2009 11:42 PM

Title: Re: The Ethics of Dhamma Distribution

Content:

A text sometimes cited in support of this opinion is the Jatila Sutta, though to me it seems a bit of a stretched reading to take it as implying an injunction against commercial publishing of Dhamma books etc.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/ud/ud.6.02.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2009 1:24 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

I think it's really those who assert that the two things are one who have some explaining to do.

In the Abhidhamma the terms 'path' and 'fruition' refer to two separate moments of consciousness. The path-consciousness is a kamma and the fruition-consciousness is its vipaka. Since the fruition-consciousness arises after the path-consciousness has passed away (i.e., it's not a case of one consciousness changing into another) they are properly counted as two, not one. The only sense I can see in which they might be regarded as one is that they both take Nibbana as their object.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2009 2:30 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

It is inconceivable that the sort of person in whom the path and fruition consciousnesses arise would be unable to distinguish them. With path and fruition consciousnesses we are not talking about any ordinary person, but about one in whom the faculties of sati and paññā have been developed to the level of strong insight and who is on the threshold of the ariyan plane.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2009 9:19 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Egbere

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 10:01 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth in clasical theravada

Content:

If a person's faith in rebirth rests upon evidence of this sort, then I suppose reading Ian Stevenson books and the like will be important to him. In practice, however, my impression is that there are very few Buddhists whose faith in rebirth is of this sort.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and politics

Content:

I find them to be perfectly compatible. To the extent that the Buddha has anything at all to say on social and political matters, the positions he takes are for the most part traditionalist conservative ones. The most political Buddhist text of all —the Mahasupina Jataka— reads almost like a manifesto of classical western conservatism (though not of what goes by the name of 'conservatism' in contemporary Britain or America).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

walrus

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 1:46 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Pear tree

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rfEJkF9jqVI>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 4:08 PM

Title: Re: Facebook URL user names are now available

Content:
Thanks for this.

<https://www.facebook.com/dhammanando>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 4:25 PM
Title: Re: Quick question about Buddhist Manners
Content:

Unless you're a Bangkok Buddhist schoolgirl whose parents have enrolled you in Assumption RC College. While at school the girls will be expected to behave like Catholics, which means no waiing to monks or Buddha statues. Whenever I walk past by Assumption on the way to my Abhidhamma classes the Buddhist pupils will look around to check if there are any Catholic nuns watching; if there are none then they will wai in the usual manner. If a nun is watching, they'll wai all the same, but to avoid a scolding they'll cunningly disguise it as a sneeze.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 5:23 PM
Title: Re: Will G.W. Bush go to hell
Content:

I think all those elected to the American presidency (except perhaps Calvin Coolidge) would thereby have greatly boosted their chances of an unfortunate rebirth. But this has nothing to do with how many people loved them or hated them. Rather, it's the result of all the evil compromises that practical politics will impose upon even the wisest and most well-meaning president.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 5:34 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
Carrott

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Will G.W. Bush go to hell

Content:

Because Coolidge displayed a degree of inactivity and a dexterity for snoring that seems to be unmatched by any other US president. At night he slept even longer hours than Reagan, and in the daytime he took lengthy siestas, and preferred lounging in his rocking-chair to any other activity. Obviously the more time a president spends sleeping and lounging in his rocking-chair, the less time he will have to devote to belligerence, criminality and the like.

[./download/file.php?id=175](#)

(669.48 KiB) Downloaded 110 times

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Pali Primer Study Group (Lily de Silva)

Content:

The verb 'pasīdati' can mean either 'to be pleased' or 'to have faith'. But in the former case the subject of the verb will normally be the mind (citta, mano, hadaya etc.), not a person. Since the subject in the exercise is 'upāsaka', your proposed translation is a better one.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Christmas Humphreys

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2009 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and politics

Content:

These aren't actually the sort of things that I had in mind, since I wouldn't view them as intrinsically conservative causes.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 9:43 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

killer qu'est-ce que c'est?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 1:39 PM

Title: Re: Accepting Rebirth

Content:

In the Theravada their claims to enlightenment (or the claims that their tradition makes on their behalf) would be dismissed without appeal. In the Theravadin conception of enlightenment one may be enlightened without recalling former existences, but not without understanding the conditionality of dhammas. To doubt or reject rebirth is to suppose that those dhammas denoted "causes and conditions for further becoming" might not in fact give rise to further becoming. To suppose this is possible only for one by whom the conditionality of dhammas has neither been understood intellectually nor penetrated by insight.

When dhammas become manifest

To the ardent meditating brahman,

All his doubts then vanish since he understands

Each dhamma along with its cause.

(from the Udana, sutta 1)

One needs to bear in mind that when those of non-Theravadin persuasion speak of 'enlightenment', they're often referring to something altogether different from the enlightenment of the Buddha's Buddhism.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 1:50 PM

Title: Re: Accepting Rebirth

Content:

The list is actually of 62 views.

Have you read the Brahmajala Sutta and seen what these views are, what the Buddha says about how each view arises and in what its error consists? If you have, then would you care to say which ones in particular struck you as being a dogmatic judgment on the part of the Buddha?

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 4:51 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

dunces

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Quick question about Buddhist Manners

Content:

It's the Thai word for a folded hand salute, called 'añjali' in Pali.

<https://forestwisdom.blogspot.com/2008/02/why-wai.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2009 11:54 PM

Title: Re: Accepting Rebirth

Content:

I don't know about Zen masters. The spiritual virtuosos of Tibetan Buddhism are believed by their devotees to be enlightened in a vastly superior sense to that of the Theravada.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 5:42 AM

Title: Re: The obligatory Dhamma themed movie thread

Content:

Some Thais have also produced an animated life of the Buddha movie (I think it came out at the start of last year). I haven't seen it myself, but my friend Eisel Mazard gave it one of his characteristically caustic reviews

Several days ago, I saw the "major motion picture" titled _The Life of Buddha_ --a Thai-made cartoon, that will doubtless define many of the assumptions about the historical Buddha for some time to come (at least within Thailand, if not beyond, as English-translation DVDs are available).

Precisely because the film is regarded as an attempt to portray the historical Buddha, its wildly unhistorical character is difficult to behold without a wince.

Textual scholars will immediately recognize the events as hastily cobbled together from Ashvaghosa and the Lalitavastra --viz., non-Pali, non-Theravada, Sanskrit sources (now considered "Mahayana").

Thus, while the source material selected is fundamentally alien to the tradition of Buddhism in Thailand, the film-makers have attempted to impose "Thai" elements in a manner both artless and anachronistic.

Perhaps the most striking example: they depict Devadatta reading Pali from a manuscript written in Khom (classical Cambodian) orthography! Here is ancient Cambodia written into ancient India (with the ocean and the passage of over a thousand years that separates the two simply smeared). Perhaps more disturbing: the Buddha's followers are depicted as exclusively male, with no female monastics of any kind --apparently just to avoid Thai discomfort on this issue (currently it is illegal for female renunciates to beg with bowl in Thailand, and charges are pressed on this from time to time, to keep the women "in their place" in the modern Thai notion of Buddhism --notwithstanding what the historical Buddha taught, or that he had female renunciates as disciples, etc.).

A long catalogue of such historical errors could be provided --and, presumably, somebody in a department of cultural studies will do so eventually.

As with many modern attempts to re-tell the life of the Buddha (even in contemporary Sri Lanka), the main defects of the narrative are:

(1) the focus is almost exclusively on "magical" events surrounding the birth, childhood, and death of the Buddha --viz., omitting the actual philosophy and adult life that made

the historical figure worth remembering in the first place,
(2) instead of philosophic debate, the Buddha is simply depicted traversing the countryside of India to perform banal miracles (e.g., fighting a magic snake, making it rain indoors, etc.) to "win" the "faith" of converts --and this is both fundamentally boring to behold, and wildly extraneous to any reason (secular or religious) for respecting the historical Buddha or his teaching,
(3) there is neither any interest in the social/historical reality that the Buddha spoke to (in India of his time), nor is there any interest in the social/historical reality that the audience now inhabits, and that the content of the film might address.

Under heading #3, we could note that a Sri Lankan (or mainland Indian) film along the same lines would at least mention the existence of the caste system, and the Buddha's critique thereof; but not so for the Thais. It would also be easy to imagine some other film-maker having an interest in issues that vitiate modern Thailand, such as alcoholism, drug-addiction, prostitution, etc. --but this is purely "cloud-cuckoo-land" filmmaking.

The film is garbage; however, the monks and laypeople that now step forward in praise of it (as an accurate depiction of the historical Buddha) do us a great favor in discrediting themselves.

The same may well be said of the craze for "Jatukam" amulets in Thailand; it is as if the most corrupt had devised these as a means of having the worst elements of Thai monasticism identify themselves, at the same time convincing all the dunces to wear a sign around their necks in public to declare their own gullibility.

The saddening question is this: will there ever be an interest in the historical material that the Pali suttas hold, such as might challenge the widespread assumptions built up from half-remembered legends of Ashavghosa, the Lalitavastu, and Jataka fables ("Wet-san-don", etc.)?

In Thailand, the answer is "no". The Buddha they believe in shaved his head, and yet maintained a full head of hair. He evidently never said, wrote, or recited anything of philosophic significance, and is instead an object of worship simply on account of his (supposed) royal blood and conjurer's tricks.

So far as the dramatist's art is concerned, I here recall Schopenhauer's comment on Dante's epic poems: the first (inferno) had a great deal of dramatic interest, the second (purgatory) less so, and then the last (paradise) was an utter bore, as it simply floated from one cloud to the next, with no suffering or conflict to provide dramatic interest. So too, here, the film-makers never considered that it might be an aesthetic mistake to delete suffering --not only because the Buddha's philosophy is (in some sense) "about" suffering, but also because drama (_per se_) requires suffering to satisfy the requirements of the stage. If we turn ancient India into paradise, and put a halo around all of the characters' heads, all that remains is for a bunch of figures to float around, making resounding declarations in echoing voices --viz., there is, strictly speaking, no plot.

But ancient India was no such paradise, and the other parties the Buddha debated with (and preached) to provided much more than just mute astonishment before a haloed spectacle --they provided real opposition based on their own religious and philosophical views, and, moreover, they confronted him with real problems based on their own experience.

There was (and is) "a point" and "a plot" to the Pali canon; and it's a shame that both the film-makers, and so much of the Thai audience, simply miss the point.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 5:59 AM

Title: Re: Stream-Winners Subsequent Lives

Content:

The deceased sotapannas whose narratives are related in Pali texts were all reborn as devas, and as such had perfect recall of their preceding human life. Since we don't have any accounts of sotapannas who are reborn in the human realm one can only speculate as to what they would be like. My guess is that strong natural-decisive-support condition would probably lead to their being reborn in a Buddhist family. If it didn't and they were reborn among holders of wrong view, they would be impervious to any parental attempts to indoctrinate them, since akusala cittas accompanied by wrong view cannot arise in the mental continuum of a sotapanna. But this doesn't mean that the cittas that do arise will all be accompanied by knowledge (*ñānasampayutta*); so it's quite conceivable that in their early years they would have no sense of being sotapannas until they came to re-encounter the Dhamma.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 6:00 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Bowie

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Tsuchigumo

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 9:42 AM

Title: Re: "th" in Pali

Content:

Indeed. Modern attempts to show the pronunciation of Indic aspirates by comparing them with English words (th = hothouse, ph = flophouse, bh = clubhouse, dh = madhouse etc.) are always misleading, for 'th' in Pali, Sanskrit etc. doesn't represent two distinct syllables as it does in these suggested English words.

For example, 'hothouse' would be realized by most English speakers as ['hɒt-haʊs] or ['hɒt-tʰaʊs], with variants of this consisting only in modifications to the vowels (as in, say, Yorkshire or Mississippi) or the replacement of the obstruent with a glottal stop (as in Cockney). There is no variant at all in which the 'th' is unsegmented. Not even in Southern Asian forms of English is 'hothouse' pronounced ['hɒtʰ-ʔaʊs] or ['hɒ-tʰaʊs].

The Pali aspirates may be phonetically represented as follows:

kh - [kʰ]

gh - [gʰ]

ch - [cʰ]

jh - [ʃʰ]

ṭh - [ʈʰ]

ḍh - [ɖʰ]

th - [tʰ]

dh - [dʰ]

ph - [pʰ]

bh - [bʰ]

lh - [lʰ]

The little subscript h, [ʰ], in each of these words indicates that the consonant is aspirated. In the case of 'th', aspiration means that when the tongue-tip leaves the teeth to release the sound [t] the vocal cords don't start to vibrate immediately. Instead, there is a short delay in which breath flows out of the mouth more or less unimpeded, thus giving us [tʰ].

Best wishes,

'dʰʌm-mʌ:-'nʌn-dʰəʊ 'bʰik-kʰʊ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 11:27 AM

Title: Re: "th" in Pali

Content:

I think there are plenty of other non-arcane methods that are better than 'hothouse', 'madhouse' etc. For example:

th: like 'tea' but with the tip of the tongue striking the back of the top teeth rather than the palate.

ch: like Bob Marley's pronunciation of the c in 'Caribbean' when he sings Buffalo Soldier.

jh: like Linton Kwesi Johnson's pronunciation of the g in 'gather' when he's reciting his poem Di Great Insohreckshan

bh: as the waiter in your local Indian restaurant pronounces the bh in bhindi masala.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 2:37 PM

Title: Re: "th" in Pali

Content:

I'm afraid I don't recall how his pronunciation went.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 3:07 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Ken Dodd

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 5:00 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Crito

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 5:09 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
permanently inebriated

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 5:17 PM
Title: Re: The Retro house in quarantine!
Content:
Sorry to hear this news.

Wishing your son a very speedy recovery.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 11:06 PM
Title: Re: Good study materials
Content:
It's a good book, but there's no need to pay 23 Euros for it. It's available free from lots of German websites (they are respectable ones, so I assume they are not breaching copyright).

<http://archiv.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/savifadok/volltexte/2008/154/>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2009 11:10 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
five-spice powder

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 17, 2009 3:07 PM

Title: Re: Omniscience

Content:

"Knowable things" (ñeyya dhamma) is an important qualification and one that usually gets overlooked by those modern scholars who assert that latterday Buddhists came to exaggerate the Buddha's cognitive range. The Buddha, according to the Pali commentators is able to know all knowable things, but the commentators don't claim that all things are knowable.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2009 3:10 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

coypu

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CNXX2QJ85lo>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2009 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and politics

Content:

Splendid. I don't feel so lonely now.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 18, 2009 9:55 AM

Title: Re: Omniscience

Content:

By latterday Buddhists I meant Theravada Buddhists of the after-generations following the Buddha's parinibbana. For example, Nagasena of the Milindapanha, and the Pali commentators.

What I particularly had in mind was an article (I've forgotten what it was called, but I think it may have been by Dan Lusthaus) which purported to relate the history of the idea of omniscience in Buddhism, depicting it as becoming ever more exaggerated over the years. Insofar as the article concerned the Mahayana the author's point seemed to be justified. But insofar as it concerned Pali Buddhism, the author had clearly not done his homework and could argue his point only by a very selective reading of the texts.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 18, 2009 11:49 AM

Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?

Content:

I think it should be: "What are the characteristics of the rūpa dhammas which constitute the conceptual reality known as "gelatin" and which are known by the faculty of understanding (paññindriya) when it has been developed to the level of insight knowledge (vipassanā-ñāṇa)?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 19, 2009 12:07 PM

Title: Re: What's a gelatin, liquid crystal, or plasma?

Content:

The eight rupa dhammas that are inseparable and which constitute one material cluster.

See chapter VI of the Abhidhammatthasangaha:

<http://www.buddhanet.net/budsas/ebud/abhisgho/abhis06.htm>

These four elements coexist and are inseparable, but one may preponderate over another as, for instance, pathavi in earth, apo in water, tejo in fire, and vayo in air.

They are also called Mahabhutas, or Great Essentials because they are invariably found in all material substances ranging from the infinitesimally small cell to the most massive object.

Dependent on them are the four subsidiary material qualities of colour (vanna), smell (gandha), taste (rasa), and nutritive essence (oja). These eight coexisting forces and qualities constitute one material group called 'suddhatthaka rupa kalapa - pure-octad material group'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 19, 2009 12:12 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Pistol

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 19, 2009 12:57 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:
Prince Kropotkin

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 19, 2009 9:46 PM
Title: Re: Word Association Game
Content:
chess

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 19, 2009 9:58 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism and politics
Content:
I would say that it's ultimately unworkable, but that hasn't been an impediment to its being adopted by non-conservatives, either across the board (as, for example by Marxists and Nazis) or in an issue-specific fashion (as, for example, with the feminist support for abortion).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando Bhikkhu

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 12, 2009 2:51 PM
Title: Re: What is this design?
Content:
A celestial nymph. Search google images for "apsara".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 12, 2009 4:17 PM
Title: Re: What is this design?
Content:
Well, you oughtn't to read too much significance into it, though coincidentally before logging in I was writing an e-mail to another monk on the subject of the Anguttara Nikaya's 7 methuna-sa.myogas ("sexual bonds" -- defects of the brahmacariya that are not as grave as sexual intercourse, though impediments all the same). The seventh bond is living the brahmacariya in the hope of obtaining rebirth as a deva in one of the sensual heavens.

Apsaras are dangerous.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 12, 2009 4:46 PM
Title: Re: Pali word association game
Content:
matthalunga - brain

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 27, 2009 6:27 PM
Title: Re: Having put aside covetousness and grief....
Content:

I agree with the sayadaw's translation and don't think that he is ignoring the grammatical form. In a sentence that comprises an absolutive like vineyya or vinayitvaa followed by a finite verb, there are several possibilities as to how the actions denoted by the two verbs might be temporally related. Pali primers naturally focus on the commonest one: "Having done this, he then did that." But the next most common construction is one in which the absolutive refers to some ongoing action that is simultaneous with the action of the finite verb. For example, "she walks holding a parasol" would be expressed in Pali as "saa chatta.m gahetvaa gacchati", literally, "she, having held a parasol, walks."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 27, 2009 6:32 PM
Title: Re: Hi, this is Paññāsikhara.
Content:
Welcome, bhante!

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 29, 2009 5:59 PM
Title: Re: nina van gorkom vs burmese abhidhamma styles?

Content:

Nina is of that generation, but her critique (and that of her teacher, Khun Sujin, and their circle) is unrelated to that of Humphreys. What the Sujinists reject is the very idea that there is such a thing as a formal method by which satipatthana and vipassana can be developed. And so their critique is not directed merely against this or that proposed satipatthana method but against all proposed methods and any conceivable method that anyone might ever care to propose.

Here's a dialogue between a Sujinist and an advocate of formal meditation that might help to clarify the Sujinists' position.

<http://www.dhammastudy.com/behere.html>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 8, 2009 1:17 PM

Title: Re: The Casual Drink Or About That One Precept...

Content:

Among some Tibetan Buddhists the logic goes something like this:

1. All kammically akusala actions are included in the list of ten unwholesome courses of action (akusala kammapa.tha): taking life, taking what is not given, misconduct in sense-pleasures, false speech, divisive speech, harsh speech, frivolous speech, covetousness, malice, and wrong view.
2. The consumption of alcohol is not included in the list of ten akusala kammapa.thas.
3. Therefore consuming alcohol is not in itself kammically akusala. (from 1 & 2)

But...

4. Since consuming alcohol was discommended by the Buddha, it must in some sense be blameworthy.
5. An act may be blameworthy either because it leads to akusala kammapa.thas or because it is itself an akusala kammapa.tha, or both.
6. Since consuming alcohol is not itself an akusala kammapa.tha, it must be blameworthy because (and only because) it leads to akusala kammapa.thas. (from 3 & 5).

But...

7. Not all consumption of alcohol is sufficient to give rise to the akusala kammapa.thas.
8. Therefore the fifth precept enjoins only abstention from consuming excessive alcohol, i.e., alcohol in such a quantity that the akusala kammapa.thas may reasonably be expected to result.

The Tibetan argument wouldn't have been accepted by the Theravadin commentators, although they would have differed over the precise grounds for rejecting it. Buddhaghosa and Dhammapaala would have accepted points 1-6, but rejected 7-8, since it was their view that even the minutest quantity of alcohol leads at least to mental akusala. Buddhadatta and Sumangalasaami would have rejected premise 2, since it was their view that consuming alcohol is included in the akusala kammappa. That's under misconduct in sense-pleasures.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 8, 2009 2:13 PM

Title: Re: The Casual Drink Or About That One Precept...

Content:

I would say that it is less ambiguous than those suttas where one has to wrestle with the term pamaada.t.thaana, but not entirely unambiguous. If a reader wanted to insist on the moderation interpretation of the fifth precept he might argue that this sutta has no bearing on the question for it is merely stating what noble disciples do do, not what ordinary persons ought to do. In other words, he might treat the sutta as strictly descriptive, not prescriptive.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 21, 2009 12:08 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhuni Ordination performed - by Ajahn Brahmavamso

Content:

Thanks for posting this. It's an excellent vinicchaya on the part of Ven. Thanissaro.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 21, 2009 12:17 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Cyanide

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 21, 2009 12:39 PM

Title: Re: Attainment as Qualification to Teach?

Content:

It is Buddhaghosa's editor who expresses a wish to be reborn in heaven and later meet the Buddha Metteyya. Dhammika, like Nyanavira before him, confuses the scribe's colophon with that of Buddhaghosa himself.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 21, 2009 3:00 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhuni Ordination performed - by Ajahn Brahmavamso

Content:

I will consider it, and perhaps prepare something for posting when I'm next online (probably Wednesday next week).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 23, 2009 4:49 PM

Title: Two new articles on bhikkhunīs

Content:

Greetings all,

Attached are two articles recently made available by their author, U Pandita (not the Mahasi meditation teacher of this name, but another Burmese scholar monk). The articles are a critique of two contentions in Dr. Juo-Hsüeh Shih's article, Controversies over Buddhist Nuns, namely, her claim that Buddhaghosa misinterprets the term 'anupasampanno' in his commentary to the the Vinaya's duṭṭhullārocana training rule, and the claim (made also by Gombrich) that there once existed bhikkhunīs ordained by the "ehi bhikkhunī" method.

[./download/file.php?id=455](#)

(84.15 KiB) Downloaded 235 times

./download/file.php?id=456
(101.9 KiB) Downloaded 213 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 26, 2009 6:32 PM
Title: Re: If there was no Theravada, which tradition would you pick?
Content:
Stoicism.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 26, 2009 7:02 PM
Title: Re: From little things big things grow...
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 27, 2009 4:36 PM
Title: Re: Nibbana
Content:
As far as I know they're all subject to death and the Buddha had no qualms about speaking of them as such.
"If, Aggivessana, a king's elephant dies in old age, well tamed, well trained, the king's old elephant that has died is reckoned as one that has died tamed. And so, Aggivessana of a king's elephant that is middle-aged. And too, Aggivessana, if a king's elephant dies young, well tamed, well trained, the king's young elephant that has died is reckoned as one that has died tamed. Even so, Aggivessana, if a monk who is an elder dies with the cankers destroyed, the monk who is an elder that has died is reckoned as one that has died tamed. And so, Aggivessana, of a monk of middle standing. And too, Aggivessana, if a newly ordained monk dies with cankers destroyed, the newly ordained monk that has died is reckoned as one that has died tamed."
Dantabhumi Sutta, Horner trans.
Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Dec 10, 2009 3:05 PM
Title: Re: Sūdani
Content:

The -ī suffix in sūdani indicates an actor rather than an action-noun, hence "cleanser."

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 2:35 PM
Title: Re: Emblem of Consciousness?
Content:

Unlike the other kasiṇas, viññāṇa-kasiṇa is never treated in any detail in Pali sources. In the Visuddhimagga Buddhaghosa doesn't deal with it at all, instead substituting the light-kasiṇa, which isn't mentioned in the Suttas. Given the extreme paucity of data about viññāṇa-kasiṇa, I don't see how it could be compared with Mahamudra or Dzogchen (or anything else) with much sense of certitude.

Again, Udayin, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the ten kasiṇa bases. [...] One contemplates the consciousness kasiṇa above, below, and across, undivided and immeasurable. And thereby many disciples of mine abide having reached the perfection and consummation of direct knowledge.
(MN. 77)

That's about all the Suttas have to say. Then there's an intriguing statement in the Nettipakaraṇa:

There are ten kasiṇa bases: the earth kasiṇa, water kasiṇa, fire kasiṇa, air kasiṇa, blue-black kasiṇa, yellow kasiṇa, red kasiṇa, white kasiṇa, space kasiṇa, and consciousness kasiṇa. Herein, the eight kasiṇas from the earth and water kasiṇas down to the white kasiṇa are calm (samatha). The space kasiṇa and consciousness kasiṇa are insight (vipassanā).

(Netti. 89)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 4:00 PM
Title: Re: Sūdani
Content:

A correction: since there's no 'h' in sūdani "cleanser" isn't correct. The word comes from the root *sūd not *sodh. Hence, "Eradicator/Destroyer of Papañca". Also, I suspect papañca here is intended in its broad sense of impediment or stumbling block, rather than its narrow sense of diffuseness or proliferation.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 4:28 PM
Title: Re: psychiatric drugs and the fifth precept
Content:
In which suttas are such episodes reported?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 5:00 PM
Title: Re: Two new articles on bhikkhunīs
Content:
Attached is another article by U Pandita: Was the Buddha Obligated to Observe Vinaya Rules?

[./download/file.php?id=478](#)
(111.96 KiB) Downloaded 169 times

From the introduction:
Juo-Hsüeh Shih makes an interesting assumption in her work *Controversies over Buddhist Nuns* when she discusses the historicity of ñatticatutthakamma ordination form in Vinaya:

Moreover, evidence in the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta of the DN suggests that the Buddha himself may have used this formula [i. e., the ehibhikkhu formula]¹ all his life. (352) So why did the Buddha not follow the procedure [i. e., the ñatticatutthakamma procedure]² he had himself prescribed? (355) It is more plausible to suggest that the last stage in the evolution of the ordination process, the ñatticatutthakammaupasampadā, began after the Buddha's death . . . (356)

Her argument can be schematized as follows:

1. If the Buddha really prescribed the ñatticatutthakamma ordination during his lifetime, he must have adopted it in giving ordination to his followers.
2. But he used the older ehibhikkhu formula all his life.
3. Therefore:
 - a) Either he failed to observe his own rule,
 - b) Or the ñatticatutthakamma ordination is a later development that has materialized only after his passing away.
4. But the Buddha could not have failed to observe his own rules.

5. Therefore, only the conclusion (3b) is plausible.

As seen above, her argument is based on the assumption that the Buddha was obliged to observe Vinaya rules like his followers. “No one is above the law”, she seems to say, not even the Buddha himself.

However, I find it difficult to take her assumption at face value because it contradicts the orthodox Theravādin view...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 5:26 PM

Title: Re: psychiatric drugs and the fifth precept

Content:

See Ven Thanissaro's account of the 51st paacittiya rule, which gives all the sources:

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch08-6.html>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 14, 2009 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Two new articles on bhikkhunīs

Content:

I've uploaded it again. It downloads okay onto my computer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 20, 2009 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Different Nikaya and Sanghakamma

Content:

Hi Bankei,

Funeral ceremonies aren't really a relevant example; they are not sanghakammas and have no Vinaya significance at all.

Regarding the situation between the two nikayas in Thailand, I don't think it is readily describable in Vinaya terms. As far as I know neither nikaya has anything like an official position statement as to how it regards the monks of the other nikaya (i.e., that they are schismatics, or not really monks, or whatever). Prince Mongkut's personal doubt about the intactness of the Mahanikaya ordination lineage doesn't have any status as a Vinaya adjudication, even if some in the Dhammayuttika Nikaya take it seriously.

In practice the monks in a Mahanikaya monastery will normally allow a visiting Dhammayutt monk full participation in sangha activities, while Dhammayutt wats are highly inconsistent in how they treat visiting Mahanikaya monks. For example, the extreme chauvinists among the Dhammayutts (e.g., Ajahn Maha Boowa and his associates) will treat a visiting Mahanikaya monk like a samanera. On the other hand, in the north of Thailand (where the Dhammayuttika Nikaya is sparsely represented) many Dhammayutt forest ajahns don't care a damn about nikaya affiliation.

When I was a Dhammayutt monk myself I remember sometimes hearing whisperings about "the regulations of the Dhammayuttika Nikaya". For example, Mahanikai monks can stay at Dhammayutt wats, but must leave during the rains retreat; Dhammayutt monks can confess to Mahanikai monks, but can't hold the Patimokkha recital with them, etc. But these regulations seem to be very elusive. Nobody could ever show me a copy of them, or give me a citation; nor have I ever met a monk who admits to having seen a copy of them.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 20, 2009 12:25 PM

Title: Re: The universe is without a refuge, without a Supreme God.

Content:

The "without a refuge/protector" translation supposes anabhissaro to be an adjective formed from "na abhissarati", the passive form of the verb abhissarati, from the root *sar (the same root as sarana, refuge).

The "without a Supreme God" translation, since it posits a connection between anabhissaro and issaro (God) would need to be formed from an entirely different root: *is or *iis. But since there is no such verb as abhissati or abhiissati, one would first need to form the noun issaro, then prefix it with abhi-, then add the negative an-.

Both ways are possible, but the second is extremely improbable, for had the word been formed in this way we should expect to meet with instances of the unnegated form 'abhissaro' in the sense of "Supreme God". But there is no such instantiation even in the commentaries, let alone the Suttas.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 22, 2009 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Inspiring Quotes

Content:

It does now. You need to click the URL button to make the link clickable.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 22, 2009 10:36 PM

Title: Re: Five Tonics & Conjey

Content:

I think you've been misled by a translation of ekabhaddika that is faithful to the wording (eka = one, bhadda = meal) but not to the meaning, for it conflates ekabhaddika with ekaasannika.

Ekabhaddika: "one-mealer" means eating only during one part of the day (from dawn to midday), but despite the wording it doesn't actually set any limit on how many meals are consumed during this period.

Ekaasannika: "one-session-eater" means eating just one meal a day.

And so all ekaasannikas are ekabhaddikas, but not every ekabhaddika is an ekaasannika. Ekaasannika is an optional dhutanga observance undertaken (chiefly) by the gluttonous, while ekabhaddika is what the sixth precept entails and what arahants practise.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 23, 2009 1:21 AM

Title: Re: Five Tonics & Conjey

Content:

Ven. Gavesako and I once discussed the chocolate question on an old E-sangha thread, but I don't know if it is cached anywhere. Here is what used to be the link for it:
<http://www.lioncity.net/buddhism/index.php?showtopic=68796>

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 23, 2009 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Abhidharma-kosa

Content:

As well as those mentioned by early posters, there are significant differences in the descriptions of the various paramattha dhammas. Mindfulness, for example, is held by the Theravada to be a beautiful mental factor that arises only with kusala cittas in non-arahants and kriya cittas in arahants. But Vasubandhu treats it as an ethically indifferent factor that may be present with both kusala and akusala cittas.

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 23, 2009 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Different Nikaya and Sanghakamma

Content:

I don't know. I'd need to look it up as my memory of this topic is pretty hazy. I believe that for it to count as sanghabheda the separate recitations have to be the outcome of dissension between the two parties over one of the various grounds for schism (e.g., teaching adhamma as Dhamma).

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 24, 2009 3:41 PM

Title: Re: Different Nikaya and Sanghakamma

Content:

I haven't heard that the Ajahn Chah monasteries have anything like a blanket ban on performing sanghakammas with Mahanikayans who aren't members of their club. I believe it depends on whether the visiting monk is observing a comparable standard of Vinaya. For example, if the monk uses money and isn't prepared to confess his transgressions of the training rules that deal with this, and forfeit any money in his possession, along with any items he has purchased with money, then he won't be allowed in the Paatimokkha recital.

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 29, 2009 5:18 PM

Title: Re: Abhidharma-kosa

Content:

For me that disagreement, though it may historically have generated the more noise, nonetheless seems not as momentous as the one regarding mindfulness.

One practising rightly will sooner or later know for herself whether nibbana is the mere absence of kilesas and dukkha (as the Sautrantikas held) or a real dhamma cognized by a supramundane consciousness (as the Theravada holds). An accurate grasp of nibbana isn't needed for realizing it, but only for avoiding mistaking experiences that are not nibbana for nibbana.

But with a wrong conception of sati one won't practise rightly at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 18, 2010 5:00 PM

Title: Re: The Validity of Non-Theravada Ordinations Lineages

Content:

It's more fundamental than that: if the Diipavamsa's judgment of the Sabbathivaadins and Dhammaguttiyas is correct, then there never was a "chain" to be broken. In the Pali Vinaya a schism in the sangha is a sort of one-generation-only virus, for the Buddha's rulings are such that no schism is capable of outliving the bhikkhus responsible for it. To be specific, there is a ruling that sanghakammas will be invalid in any case where schismatical bhikkhus complete the quorum. In other words, for a sanghakamma to be valid there must be enough non-schismatical bhikkhus present to constitute a quorum by themselves. So, if a sanghakamma, e.g., bhikkhu ordination, is invalid when schismatics complete the quorum, how much more so when schismatics constitute the entire quorum.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2010 3:03 PM

Title: Re: The Validity of Non-Theravada Ordinations Lineages

Content:

Hi Bhante and Bankei,

Just to let you know that I've read your posts and will post a reply after a few days (I'm not much online these days).

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2010 3:25 PM

Title: Re: english translations

Content:

There's a non-PTS translation of the Dhammasangani by a Burmese. I forget the translator's name now, but probably Dmytro or Robert will know it

Best wishes,

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 24, 2010 3:24 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sucitto: Fragmentation & Distancing from Experience

Content:

Or perhaps "ground of being" is just Ajahn Sucitto's Cockney pronunciation of "ground up beans". In that case obviously he would be alluding to the Satipatthana Sutta's simile for the thirty-two parts of the body.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 15, 2010 3:57 PM

Title: Re: One "citta" at a time

Content:

I think you are falling into the same error as Nyanavira Thera: that of supposing that a temporal locative construction like "imasmi.m sati, ida.m hoti" necessarily indicates the simultaneity of the two things or events. But this simply isn't so.

Such a construction in Pali is every bit as ambiguous as a "when... then..." sentence in English. In both languages the relationship between the referents of the two clauses may be one of simultaneity OR subsequence OR consequence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 25, 2011 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

The abbot of Wat Tha Ma O, Sayādaw Dhammānanda, is now nearly blind and too frail to teach. The de facto abbot now is a very talented Burmese-trained Thai monk, Sayādaw Gandhasāra. U Gandhasāra has undertaken a fair bit of international teaching (mostly leading retreats in Europe) and speaks English well. He is also an incredibly prolific translator, especially of Burmese treatises into Thai, and impresses me as a competent meditation technician.

Earlier this year I transcribed and translated Wat Tha Ma O's Pali evening chanting and confession formulas for another Englishman who was preparing to ordain there. As these are rather different from those in general use in Thailand I am uploading the file here for anyone who might be considering ordaining at Tha Ma O.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 28, 2011 9:35 AM

Title: Re: Some thoughts about rebirth

Content:

I don't see why not, especially as we seem already to have an instantiation of this in the person of the current U.S. Secretary of State.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 28, 2011 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Some thoughts about rebirth

Content:

Thanks for the welcome. I'm afraid I won't be back for regular posting just yet, as I'm going back up the mountain in a few days. I came down down because a whole bunch of friends from different places all decided to visit me at the same time, and I couldn't have accomodated them in my usual abode.

All the best for the coming year!

Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 31, 2011 7:41 AM

Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi

Content:

passambhayaṃ kāyaśaṅkhāraṃ assasissāmi' ti sikkhati; 'passambhayaṃ
kāyaśaṅkhāraṃ passasissāmi' ti sikkhati.

[...]

passambhayaṃ cittasaṅkhāraṃ assasissāmi' ti sikkhati; 'passambhayaṃ
cittasaṅkhāraṃ passasissāmi' ti sikkhati.

He trains thus: 'I shall breathe in tranquillising the bodily formation'; he trains thus: 'I shall breathe out tranquillising the bodily formation.'

[...]

He trains thus: 'I shall breathe in tranquillising the mental formation'; he trains thus: 'I shall breathe out tranquillising the mental formation.'

These two lines —the final parts of the first and second tetrads of the Ānāpānassati Sutta (MN. 118)— are what Ven. Vimalaramsī cites as "proof texts" in support of his notion that the sine qua non of Buddhist bhāvanā is the willed relaxing of a supposed "tight mental fist" in one's head. As far as I know, it is on these passages alone that his theory is based. (If he has at any time cited others, then I welcome correction).

My first "issue" with Ven. Vimalaramsī is his claim that the above two modes of ānāpānassati are in some manner, or for some reason, of much greater moment than all the others. This is merely the venerable's personal opinion, for in the Suttas the Buddha doesn't single out any of the sixteen modes as meriting greater attention than the others.

Moving on to a more serious problem, it seems to me that the above passages simply cannot sustain the interpretation that the venerable imposes upon them. When citing these passages he is wont to present his case rather tersely, but when the reasoning is unpacked, it seems to go something like this:

1. The Buddha instructs the yogāvacara to tranquillize the bodily formation while breathing in and out.
2. To tranquillize means to relax.
3. That which is in need of relaxing must be something tense, tight or strained.
4. This tense, tight or strained thing may be tropologized as a "tight mental fist".
5. This mental fist is composed of attachment, aversion and self-view.
6. Willed relaxation of this "fist" brings about the letting go of attachment, etc.
7. Repeatedly doing so leads to the purification of the mind and attainment of the noble paths and fruits.

I'm not sure if I've got the latter stages of his thinking exactly right (it's ages since I last read him), but for present purposes it doesn't really matter, because the mischief lies in points 2 and 3.

In English usage the primary sense of the verb "to tranquillize" is to calm someone/something that is agitated or disturbed. The word has also a secondary sense —largely occurring in medical contexts— where it means to relax that which is tight or strained. A person suffering from stress and tension, for example, may take a tranquillizer.

Now Vimalaramsī's argument requires one to assume that the secondary sense of the English verb "to tranquillize" is the primary sense of the Pali verb "passambhati", (or if not that, then it is at least the sense that the Buddha had in mind when he taught the Ānāpānassati Sutta).

And what's wrong with that? What's wrong is that the venerable ought not to have assumed anything of the kind. Rather than making the linguistically naïve assumption of there being a perfect symmetry between the semantic range of "passambhati" and that of "tranquillize", he ought to have investigated how "passambhati" and related words (passaddha, passaddhi, passambhayaṃ, etc.) are used in the Suttas. Had he done so, he would have discovered that all the Pali words that occur in binary opposition to passambhati have to do with agitation or disturbance or turbulence. Passambhati and its derivatives NEVER occur in opposition to any of the Pali words denoting tightness or tenseness.

This is not of course to say that the method devised by Ven. Vimalaramsī may not be an effective practice, but merely that it is not nearly so well-grounded in the Suttas as he imagines it to be.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 2, 2012 7:16 PM
Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi
Content:
"Calming", "tranquillising", "pacifying" — I think they're all about equally fine. My grumble was about Ven. Vimalaramsī's "relaxing". It's his habit to insert this in brackets after "tranquillising".

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 2, 2012 7:19 PM
Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi
Content:
When the concerns are justified no amount of dialogue will clear them up. Reading the venerable's books on the Ānāpānassati Sutta and Mettabhāvanā, as well as his series of posts to DSG some years ago, I am satisfied that the two criticisms I made in my post are justified.

And lest my use of mischief in the earlier post be misunderstood . . .

According to the Oxford Dictionary in phrases like "the mischief lies in..." and "the mischief of it is that..." the word "mischief" means the most vexatious feature of something. Naturally it wasn't my intention to suggest that Ven. Vimalaramsī was being

mischievous.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 2, 2012 7:28 PM
Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi
Content:
I hope this post will clarify matters.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 2, 2012 8:14 PM
Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi
Content:
Hi all,

I'll be heading back up to my hermitage tomorrow or the day after. I'll try to post a reply to Sean's post tomorrow, but after that I won't be participating further in the thread (no dial-up connection on the mountain where I live).

All the best to you all for this new year.

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 29, 2012 10:01 PM
Title: Re: Mangala sutta - highest blessing
Content:
Conventions governing the comparative and superlative degrees of adjectives seem to be more fluid in Pali than in English. It is quite common for the superlative to be used in Pali where English idiom would demand the comparative.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 31, 2012 3:09 PM

Title: Re: The great Abhidhamma Pitaka authenticity debate

Content:

I think we could if it was in fact specifically abhidhammic teachings that the Thai monks were using to support their ideas, and if they were reading and applying these teachings correctly. Having just read the book, I would say that this is not the case at all. The author (Bernard Faure) mistakenly treats the teaching that "kamma is cetanaa" (on which the Thai monks base their case) as if it were a uniquely abhidhammic doctrine, when in fact it's a core principle of both Sutta and Abhidhamma. As for the monks themselves, from the views that Faure attributes to them it's not at all evident that they have any acquaintance with the Abhidhamma. Faure writes:

"A related type of argument that is used by modern Thai and Sri Lankan monks (see Kent and Jerryson) is more psychological and seems to rely on the Abhidhamma. This argument emphasizes intention and claims that, if the killing is committed with the right state of mind (detachment or compassion), it entails no karmic consequence and therefore can be considered to be a wholesome act." (pp. 214)

But this is in plain contradiction to abhidhammic doctrines.

"...if the killing is committed with the right state of mind (detachment or compassion)..."

According to the Abhidhamma acts of intentional killing always proceed from aversion-rooted cittas. An aversion-rooted citta hardly qualifies as a "right state of mind". Moreover, since the mental factors of compassion (*karuṇā*) and detachment (*alobha*) never arise with aversion-rooted cittas, the authors are describing an impossibility.

"...it entails no karmic consequence..."

According to the Abhidhamma only an action that proceeds from the functional cittas of an arahant entails no kammic consequence. Any action proceeding from the kusala and akusala cittas of non-arahants is liable to generate a vipaaka.

"...and therefore can be considered to be a wholesome act..."

According to the Abhidhamma intentional killing can never be considered a wholesome act for it proceeds from an aversion-rooted citta and such cittas are always unwholesome.

Now the Abhidhamma does allow that a series of kusala cittas in which compassion is predominant may trigger a series of akusala cittas that impel a bad action of some kind. This would give us the kind of scenarios conventionally referred to as "doing evil with a good motive". For example stealing bread to feed the starving or having a sick pet euthanized. The point to note with such scenarios is that it is not the prior motive (or in abhidhammic terms, the preceding series of kusala cittas) that determines the moral tone of the action, kusala or akusala, but the akusala cittas that directly produce the action. The kusala prior motive will mitigate the degree of the akusala involved in the theft of the bread or the killing of the pet, but they don't have the power to transform the

nature of these kammās from akusala into kusala.

For a detailed discussion of Abhidhamma and killing see Rupert Gethin's article Can Killing a Living Being Ever Be an Act of Compassion? The analysis of the act of killing in the Abhidhamma and Pali Commentaries

<http://www.urbandharma.org/pdf/geth0401.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2012 9:56 AM

Title: Re: how would you describe the taste of a maguromki in words?

Content:

Sweet if it's on the tip of your tongue; salty if on the edges near the tip; sour if on the edges further back; bitter if in the middle of the backmost part of the tongue.

At least that's what I was taught in school biology class, with credit going to a man by the name of Edwin Boring.

Had I been born a few years later, I'd have learned that biologists had grown bored with the Boring theory and replaced it with a new one in which the taste buds on all parts of the tongue are able to detect all tastes (rather as with the Abhidhamma's account of the jivhaa-pasaada), although varying in their sensitivity to each kind of taste.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 3, 2012 11:14 PM

Title: Re: Adequate paritta chant?

Content:

Mahasamaya Sutta, DN. 20

Chanted by the monks of Wat Saket (Temple of the Golden Mount). The Saket monks are the best chanters in Bangkok, imo. If any of you ever go to Bangkok do take a trip over there when they're holding their evening chanting. The sutta starts at 1 minute 35 seconds.

<https://youtu.be/HvwwFLi8UXg>

Chanted solo by Luang Poo Sim Acaro, late abbot of Wat Tham Pa Phlong, Chiang Mai.
<https://youtu.be/ahSRwbfb9iQ>

Chanted by English laypersons of the Samatha Trust at Wat Rama IX, Bangkok, with Pali words (minus diacritics). I think the bearded man leading the chanting is either Lance Cousins or Charles Shaw.

<https://youtu.be/S0ueBovjdnM>

Ditto, but a better recording from some other location, but the words are only in Thai Pali.

https://youtu.be/7PaAEM9x_6Q

Chanted by Thai laywomen at Wat Analayo in Germany

<https://youtu.be/ss3x5ya53yk>

There probably lots of others elsewhere, but on youtube I couldn't find any Sinhalese or Burmese examples.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 4, 2012 11:57 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

I would say that this part is the translation's only redeeming feature. The rendering 'non-substantial' suggest that Wallis is among those few Pali translators who are alert to the semantic distinction between the adjective 'anatta' (as used here) and agglutinated predicative phrase 'anatta'. Most other translators get the two homonyms muddled and when encountering the adjective will translate it as they would the phrase (i.e., as "is/are not self").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2012 7:27 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Sorry, what I wrote above was nonsense. I don't know what I was thinking but I got it completely the wrong way round. Dhp. 279 is in fact the phrasal anatta, not the adjectival one. So the Wallis translation doesn't in fact have the redeeming feature I imagined it to.

Fancy making such a mistake on the Buddha's birthday!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2012 10:20 AM

Title: Re: John Peacock: Will the Real Buddha Please Stand Up?

Content:

The Vinaya prohibition you mention was laid down in the aftermath of a suicidal bhikkhu jumping off a cliff and surviving the fall but snuffing the unfortunate fellow he landed on. However, the rule itself speaks only of "throwing oneself off" and says nothing of cliffs. The prevailing interpretation in Thailand takes the rule as prohibiting bhikkhus from jumping from any high place for any reason whatever. According to this view the rule has

no essential connection with suicide. For example, many years ago in a Thai monastery library I happened to jump down from a stool after retrieving a book from a high shelf. The librarian monk, a Vinaya scholar, came over and gave me a dressing down for (in his view) breaking this rule and told me that in future I should climb down, rather than jump, whenever there was a need to get from a high place to a low one.[*]

On the other hand, among the Sinhalese it seems that "throwing oneself off" is widely understood to be an idiomatic expression that covers all conceivable methods of killing oneself. This is the interpretation given by Ven. Thanissaro in his Monastic Code and was also my own understanding when I (with no suicidal intent) jumped off the library stool. In the years since then I've heard some clever arguments for both readings, but without finding either entirely compelling. My current policy is to play it safe by neither killing myself nor jumping off stools.

But to come to the point, no matter which reading of the rule we go with, it doesn't contradict the fact that certain bhikkhu disciples attained arahatta in the act of killing themselves. If the rule does indeed prohibit suicide, then it simply means that they attained arahatta after committing a dukkata offence (which is very minor and not the sort of offence that impedes dhammaabhisamaya). If the rule doesn't prohibit suicide, then they wouldn't even have committed a dukkata, for none are reported to have opted for leaping from high places as their chosen method.

Notes:

[*] And applying the Great References, presumably the rule would also include leaping from low places to high ones, thus barring bhikkhus from emulating the rather salubrious-looking practice of the Sisters of St. Beryl:

<https://youtu.be/YK9kg-Ngz0Q>" onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;
https://youtu.be/GV_A7YeOhfs" onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2012 6:43 AM

Title: Re: Happy Birthday Bhante Dhammanando!!!

Content:

Thank you all for your kind wishes. Anumodana.

Hadn't noticed these fish smilies before.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 7, 2012 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

One factor in transgression of this precept is that the thing taken is adinna, a thing-not-given.

A thing counts as a given-thing if it comes into one's possession (possession being defined in the KhpA as "capability to use or dispose of it as one pleases") in such a manner as would neither incur the punishment of rulers (raajada.n.da) nor be "criticised by the wise" (vi~n~nuugarahita). If either of these stipulations is not fulfilled, then it's a thing-not-given.

The "punishment of rulers" clause means that the second precept is not separable from the geographical factor of local property laws. On the other hand, the "criticised by the wise" clause means that the precept is not wholly subservient to geography. It's a safeguard against the kind of geographical relativism that avers such and such to be okay if done in Switzerland but not if done in Swaziland.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 8, 2012 3:34 AM

Title: Re: Vessantara And Maddi

Content:

I take it from Nagasena's exposition that it's essentially a story in the "pearl of great price" genre. It indirectly extols buddhahood and those who attain it by stressing what such an attainment will demand of a man.

Though there's also a more pedestrian moral that might be drawn from it (suggested by my friend Ralph Flores), namely, that responsible Buddhist parents ought to think twice before hiring a Bodhisatta as a babysitter. (Extreme Giving: The Vessantara Jātaka and Shantideva's A Guide to the Bodhisattva Way of Life <http://www.sunypress.edu/p-4559-buddhist-scriptures-as-literatu.aspx>)

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 19, 2012 3:38 PM

Title: Re: Post an image of your previous incarnation, if you like

Content:

.

Always felt quite an affinity with this chap.

[attachment=0]3093_egil_LG.jpg[/attachment]

<http://www.badassoftheweek.com/skallagrimsson.html>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Egill_Skallagr%C3%ADmsson

And I'd like my old skull back....

http://www.viking.ucla.edu/Scientific_American/Egils_Bones.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 10, 2012 1:45 PM

Title: Re: Can a Theravada Buddhist monk KILL in self defense ?

Content:

If a bhikkhu is cornered by an attacker, it is not a Vinaya offence if he gives the attacker a blow, provided that it's only with the aim of escaping from him. If the bhikkhu attempts to kill the attacker and succeeds, then he is defeated (as other posters have mentioned). If he inadvertently kills the attacker while giving him a blow with the aim of escaping, then that too would be no offence, for only intentional killing of a human is a defeating offence.

The source is the Vinaya Pitaka's account of the 4th pacittiya rule in the Patimokkha's Sahadhammikavagga. For a modern exposition of this, click here and scroll down to 74:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch08-8.html>"
onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 11, 2012 3:34 PM

Title: Re: Question regarding "jathaka katha"

Content:

The Jataka Katha (or Nidanakatha or Jataka Nidana) is not in the Tipitaka but is the opening section of Buddhaghosa's commentary (atthakatha) to the Jataka verses, which are in the Tipitaka. It's one of the earliest attempts to present the Buddha's life in the form of a connected biography: in effect a Theravadin version of works like the Buddhacarita, Divyavadana, Lalitavistara, etc. Some of its contents are present in the Sutta Pitaka, some are not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 11, 2012 5:24 PM

Title: Re: Congratulations to Americans

Content:

Ireland seems until recently to have been a particularly extreme case:

"On 22 May 1971 a group of Irish feminists including Mary Kenny travelled to Belfast by rail and made their return to Dublin laden with contraceptive devices into a statement on the illogicality of the law. This provoked criticism from the Roman Catholic Church in Ireland; Thomas Ryan, Bishop of Clonfert, said that "... never before, and certainly not since penal times was the Catholic heritage of Ireland subjected to so many insidious onslaughts on the pretext of conscience, civil rights and women's liberation.""

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Contraception_in_the_Republic_of_Ireland

As the old joke went: "The clever Irish have found a way around their country's condom ban. They smuggle them across the border hidden inside bags of heroin."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 14, 2012 6:44 PM

Title: Re: Conjuncts in Pali

Content:

Hi Vinodh,

Given your stated purpose, it would seem that the real question is not what combinations of consonants are possible in Pali, but rather, which of these combinations need to be represented by special characters in Sinhalese script. The answer is that this is required for pre-nasalized consonants (nt, nd, mb, etc.) and then a few others.

The following links should tell you all you need:

<http://www.omniglot.com/writing/sinhala.htm>" onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sinhala_alphabet" onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

Though if the modified font is intended only for Sinhalese and Pali and not for Sanskrit, then disregard sanskritic consonant clusters like kś and śrī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 14, 2012 6:54 PM

Title: Re: Melodic chanting prohibited for monks!

Content:

I think your rendering of the sutta needs re-working. You seem to have translated the word bhaṅga twice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 17, 2012 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Should Religion Get Involved in Politics?

Content:

At 0:40 in the video, Rev. Dhammananda says:

“The Buddha has given this advice: ‘*anujaanaami bhikkhave raajaana.m anuvattitu.m*’. First advice as the followers of the Buddha: to cooperate with the existing government or law enforced by the government.”

The passage quoted is from one of the Khandhakas of the Vinaya Pitaka. It was spoken after some king (I forget if it was Bimbisara or Pasenadi) had introduced a new calendar. Some bhikkhus approached the Buddha in doubt as to whether they should follow it or stick with the old calendar (e.g., when deciding on the date for entering the rains retreat). The Buddha replied by ruling that bhikkhus should conform to the wishes of kings and made it an offence of wrong-doing not to do so.

Buddhaghosa’s Vinaya Atthakatha qualified the rule by limiting its scope to those wishes of a king that are ‘*dhammika*’: ‘righteous’, ‘just’, ‘in line with Dhamma’.

So, pace Dhammananda this is not a general piece of advice for “followers of the Buddha”. It’s a Vinaya rule and concerns bhikkhus only.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 20, 2012 8:27 AM

Title: Re: Obama in Burma

Content:

I doubt he would have had much choice in the matter.

Some years ago Crown Prince Vajiralongkorn of Thailand went on a state visit to Burma. Before the visit, the Thai royal protocol people had talks with their Burmese counterparts about the details of the visit. They requested that the prince be exempted from the requirement that visitors to the Shwedagon should remove their footwear, for in Thailand the custom is that this is not required of royalty when visiting temples. The Thai royal family even walk into uposatha halls and viharas with their shoes on and sometimes a sword hanging from their waists (the ordinary military can't bring weapons into temple buildings because of the Vinaya prohibition against teaching Dhamma to people with weapons).

But the Burmese weren't having any of it: if the prince wouldn't take his shoes off he'd have to stay outside. For a few days the two sides played hardball with each other, with the Thais threatening to cancel the visit and the Burmese refusing to budge. The latter also pointed out that King Bhumibol didn't have any problem removing his shoes when he visited the Shwedagon many years earlier. Anyhow, in the end the Thais backed down

and the prince went barefoot.

So, if the Burmese wouldn't compromise even with head-anointed royalty, it's hardly likely they'd do so with some tuppenny ha'penny president.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 14, 2012 1:58 AM

Title: Re: Creating disgust of the body

Content:

.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 15, 2012 5:50 PM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination & Jesus the Liberator

Content:

I should love to arrange for a meeting between this John Lambert fellow and the Baptist pastor Rev. Tip.

Rev. Tip was originally an animist and hereditary shaman of Mae Soon, the Pgaz K'Nyau village where I live. His conversion to Christianity appears to have been rather skin-deep and the man remains an animist at heart, subsuming the Gospel under animism much as John Lambert subsumes the Dhamma under Christianity.

In the Tipist christology, for example, Jesus enjoys the exalted status of guardian spirit of the Mae Soon village too-hoo tree. This is the tree on whose branches Pgaz K'Nyau hill-tribe women will nail their dried umbilical cords after giving birth to a son. This may perhaps strike Christians as a bit of a demotion from being the Divine Logos, co-eternal with the Father, etc., but Rev. Tip's having none of it. As far as he's concerned he's done the bearded farang hippy a great favour by appointing him to this exalted post.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 16, 2012 10:57 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Two remarks regarding "no spontaneously reborn beings [beings born without the need for parents in heaven or hell]"

1. Although 'spontaneously born' is the usual meaning of opapaatika, in the context of mundane right view the commentaries understand it to denote rebirth in general, no matter which of the four modes of generation is involved.

2. When opapaatika is used in the sense of 'spontaneously-born', the range of beings thus born is not confined to those in heaven and hell:

"What is spontaneous generation? There are devas and denizens of hell and certain human beings and some beings in the lower worlds; this is called spontaneous generation. These are the four kinds of generation." (MN.i.73)

Spontaneously-born humans are those that arise at the start of a world-cycle through the decadence and increasingly coarse appetites of the Abhassara Brahmas.

The "beings in the lower worlds" are petas and suchlike.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 16, 2012 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Why does metta come before Upekkha?

Content:

It isn't that you're not meant to develop upekkhā *at all* before reaching the third jhāna in the other three. Rather, it's that you're not meant to develop it with with the fourth jhāna as your aim. This is not to say that you can't develop it with other aims. For example, in the mettabhāvanā section of the Brahmavihāra chapter you will find quite a number of upekkhā-arousing practices, such as recollection of ownership of kamma. The mettā-developing yogi doesn't practice these aiming at the fourth jhāna, but rather to get over any antipathy towards particular beings that is impeding his arrival at non-discriminating mettā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 17, 2012 7:31 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

kiviak

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 18, 2012 6:53 AM

Title: Re: how do you enter jhana?

Content:

<http://www.buddhanet.net/mettaf3.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 18, 2012 2:21 PM

Title: Re: how do you enter jhana?

Content:

I expect Ven. Sujīva's source would be the Visuddhimagga.

But in the Suttanta Piṭaka the five masteries (pañca vasiyo) are found in the Āṇakathā of the Paṭisambhidāmagga (Paṭi. i.99-100. English translation: Path of Discrimination 97-8).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 20, 2012 2:15 AM

Title: Re: On the nature of Beauty

Content:

Oh? Doesn't the phrase something not repulsive in the first passage in bold indicate exactly the opposite?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 24, 2012 12:20 PM

Title: Re: Word Association Game

Content:

Laodicean

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 6, 2013 4:15 PM

Title: Re: On Hell Wardens

Content:

Were you perhaps thinking of the two hell-hounds, Sabala ("Mottled") and Sāma ("Black")? Their names are given in the Nārada Jātaka, and earlier in the Ṛg Veda, as Lord Yama's two watchdogs Śyāma and Śabala.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 6, 2013 4:41 PM

Title: Re: What is the Pali word for humility?

Content:
Not really.

Humility in the bad sense (having little self-esteem and a low opinion of oneself) is *hīno'ham'asmi māna* ("the 'I am inferior' conceit"), or *omāna* for short.

Humility in the good sense, meaning that one is docile and tractable enough to be teachable, is denoted by various words that would translate literally as "the state of being easily spoken to". The most common of these are *soracca*, *sovacassatā*, and *suvacatā* or *subbacatā*.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jan 6, 2013 10:12 PM
Title: Re: On Hell Wardens

Content:
It's the 545th Jataka, whose full name is the *Mahānāradakassapa Jātaka*, though it's commonly shortened to *Nārada Jātaka*.

Tampissa lokantaranirayaṃ vitthārena vaṇṇetvā 'mahārāja, micchādiṭṭhiṃ avissajjento na kevalaṃ etadeva, aññampi dukkhaṃ anubhavissasi' ti dassento gāthamāha:

*Sabalo ca Sāmo ca duve suvānā,
pavaddhakāyā balino mahantā;
Khādanti dantehi ayomayehi,
ito paṇunnaṃ paralokapattan ti.*

Having described that lokantara hell in detail, he said, "Great king, if you do not wholly give up your wrong view, you will come in for still further suffering. Seeing which, he spoke a verse:

"Two dogs Sabala and Sāma,
Large in body, great and mighty,
Devour with their iron teeth
Him who departs from here to that world yonder."
(J-a.vi.247)

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 7, 2013 6:52 AM
Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:
In MN 1 it is for the *sekha* alone, i.e. the stream-entrant, once-returner and non-returner, that non-conceiving assumes the form of a prescription. Conceiving (*maññati*, e.g., "he

conceives earth...") is what the worldling does do, what the sekha ought not to do, and what the asekha (arahant) does not do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 7, 2013 10:56 AM

Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:

A worldling who believes that the abandoning of māna consists in the deliberate avoidance of thinking and conceiving will be going about things the wrong way. He will probably just end up frustrated, unless he's a jhāna-wallah and very strongly committed to deliberate abstention from thinking, in which case he may arrive at the impercipient attainment and end up spending a few kalpas in the Brahmā realms as an anthropomorphic block of stone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 7, 2013 1:19 PM

Title: Re: Greetings from Pennsylvania

Content:

What is it that everyone (except me, it seems) now knows about modern finance post-2008?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 7, 2013 2:46 PM

Title: Visiting Vulture's Peak

Content:

Hello all,

A Thai monk has asked me to find out in which months the Vulture's Peak (Gijjhakūṭa, Skt. Gṛdrakūṭa) at Rajgir is "open". I told him that as far as I know it's always open, but the monk (who has visited it four times) insists that it's closed during certain months of the year. He wishes to know because his aunt is travelling there this year and is particularly anxious to see the Vulture's Peak. I've checked a few tourist sites and pilgrims' accounts via Google and haven't found anything that would contradict my own view. Does anyone here know anything about this matter?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 7, 2013 5:30 PM

Title: Re: Visiting Vulture's Peak

Content:

Thanks, Christine. I've forwarded my query to Shantum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 8, 2013 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Visiting Vulture's Peak

Content:

I got a reply. It would appear that the cable cars up to Vulture Peak are closed every Thursday, but the mountain itself stays open for visitors all the year round.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 8, 2013 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:

By arriving at a level of insight knowledge that is adequate to cut off the first three fetters. This is done by developing and making much of the Eightfold Path.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 8, 2013 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:

Nothing, but that's rather different from the non-thinking tout court that you were advocating earlier.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 8, 2013 10:14 AM

Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:

I understand that sutta to be about the overcoming of the five hindrances in samatha-bhāvanā. Both a Buddhist jhāna-wallah and a non-Buddhist yogi striving to become a block of stone via the impercipient attainment (asaññā-samāpatti) would of course need to do this, for the latter attainment, though not at all approved in Buddhist tradition, does require jhānic proficiency as its foundation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 8, 2013 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Not-Thinking as a practice

Content:

In about the mid-80's the term "vipassanā-wallah" came into use as either a jocular term for persons committed to one or another of the modern systems of dry insight meditation or a pejorative term for persons fanatical about the same. I don't know who came up with the term, but I first heard it myself from the Aussie Patrick Kearney when he was a monk in Thailand.

In more recent years, with the growth of interest in absorption practice, "jhāna-wallah" has come into use to denote those with a similar dedication to samatha-bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 9, 2013 5:40 PM

Title: Re: Atheist Church 'Sunday Assembly'

Content:

Dominique Mosbergen obviously doesn't know her English history. It would be "Britain's first atheist church" if only Richard Congreve, an English admirer of Auguste Comte, hadn't beaten them to it by 135 years.

<https://tinyurl.com/Nineteenth-Century-Churches>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Richard_Congreve

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Church_of_Humanity

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 9, 2013 6:07 PM

Title: Re: Greetings from Pennsylvania

Content:

Well, thanks for the links. I scarcely followed world news at all in 2008.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 16, 2013 7:14 AM

Title: Re: which dhamma texts would you pick?

Content:

There is an old commentary to it, traditionally attributed to Buddhaghosa. The commentary comprises an explanation of the words in each verse, along with some story that ostensibly accounts for the verse's origin. The stories were translated many decades ago by Burlingame as Buddhist Legends, but he left out the arguably much more useful word-commentary. The latter has now been translated by John Ross Carter, but you need to get the right edition. The Ross Carter translation that Ñāṇa linked to is the 112-page edition, with the verses only. For the word-commentary you need to get the 552-page edition by Ross Carter, Mahinda Palihawadana and Jaroslav Pelikan:

<http://www.oup.com/us/catalog/general/subject/ReligionTheology/Buddhism/?ci=9780195108606>

But if you don't want to spend \$65 there is also a Kindle version for \$7.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 16, 2013 8:09 AM

Title: Re: The meaning of Muditā defined in the suttas

Content:

None of the occurrences of the term in the Sutta Pitaka is accompanied by any definition as such. However, the abhidhammic identification of muditā as a state opposed to arati is supported in the Dasuttara Sutta:

Or he might say, "I have developed the emancipation of the heart through sympathetic joy, and yet resentment still grips my heart..." He should be told, "No! Do not say that! Do not misrepresent the Blessed Lord, it is not right to slander him thus, for he would not have said such a thing! Your words are unfounded and impossible. If you develop the emancipation of the heart through sympathetic joy, resentment has no chance to envelop your heart. This emancipation through sympathetic joy is the cure for resentment."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 16, 2013 3:28 PM

Title: Re: Jhana during Inquisition

Content:

Given the tendency of jhāna to powerfully reinforce whatever diṭṭhi (right or wrong) prompts the person to strive for it, one would expect them to be even more Christian (or at least more Papist) afterwards, if they were indeed jhāna-attainers. In St. Teresa's case it's noteworthy that her rabid fulminations against Jews and Lutherans were all written subsequent to her mystical experiences; they are not juvenilia, but the works of her 'mature' years.

Here's an article that may interest you:

Lance S. Cousins, The Stages of Christian Mysticism and Buddhist Purification: Interior Castle of St. Teresa of Ávila and the Path of Purification of Buddhaghosa

[./download/file.php?id=1914](#)

(114.96 KiB) Downloaded 392 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 18, 2013 7:20 AM

Title: Re: Pali for the teaching of the Buddhas

Content:

John Ross Carter's translation of the verse and Buddhaghosa's word-commentary:

<https://tinyurl.com/badn6fd>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 18, 2013 6:03 PM

Title: Re: The translation of Muditā

Content:

As you may have seen from the Vibhaṅga quote posted by Dmytro, muditā even in the Canon is conceived as other-directed. The commentaries make it clearer why this is so. The range of potential ārammaṇas for any beautiful mental factor is co-extensive with the range of potential ārammaṇas for the unwholesome state that it opposes and displaces. So, whomsoever may be the object of one's envy may also be the object of one's sympathetic joy. But as we have seen, one cannot be the object of one's own envy. From this it follows that one cannot be the object of one's own muditā.

This is not to say that joy doesn't arise on account of one's own sampattis, but merely that 'joy' in this case would be a term for something other than muditā. Whereas muditā is always reckoned as wholesome (except when occurring in the kiriyācittas of an arahant, when it is merely functional), the joy that arise in connection with one's own sampattis may be wholesome or unwholesome. If, for example, you win the lottery and joy arises as you dream of all the ways you'll now be able to indulge yourself, then this would be unwholesome pīti and sukha. But if joy arises as you contemplate all the gifts that you now plan to give people, then it would be wholesome pīti and sukha. In neither case would the joy be termed muditā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 18, 2013 7:46 PM

Title: Re: when/why did renaming people start?

Content:

But these weren't new names. Moggallāna was Kolita's brahminical gotra name (he was from the Maudgala gotra) and Sāriputta was Upatissa's matronym (his mum was called Sārī). Most of the Buddha's disciples of brahminical birth are called in the Suttas by their gotra names, for example all the various Kassapas, Kaccāyanas, Koṇḍaññas, Vacchas, Bharadvajas, Piṅgalas, etc.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Brahmin_gotra_system"

onclick="window.open(this.href);return false;

The Vinaya has a story which offers a clue as to why this is so. It tells of how Mahākassapa wished to ordain a man and summoned Ānanda to act as the announcing ācariya. Ānanda repeatedly tried to dodge taking part in the ceremony. Eventually he was summoned by the Buddha and asked to justify his conduct. Ānanda explained that if he were to take part the Vinaya would require him to announce Mahākassapa as the preceptor using the man's personal name, Pippali. But he held Kassapa in such high esteem that he had never called him Pippali even when speaking about him in the third person. The Buddha then amended the rule, permitting gotra names to be used when making this announcement. And so from this it would appear to be a matter of courtesy that gotra names predominate over personal names in the Suttas. Perhaps this also accounts for why the Buddha's personal name (given in the commentaries as Siddhattha) isn't mentioned at all in the Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 19, 2013 1:51 PM

Title: Re: What is meant by "Sabbe Dhamma Anatta"

Content:

The writer you quote seems to be treating the Dhammapada Commentary's interpretation (which he approves of) as if it were the sole and normative definition of dhammā in this context. But in fact it's unique and exceptional. Everywhere else the commentaries support the view that the writer rejects, the usual gloss being:
'Sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā' ti sabbe tebhūmakasaṅkhārā aniccā.
'Sabbe dhammā anattā' ti sabbe catubhūmakadhammā anattā.

'All saṅkhāras are impermanent' means that all saṅkhāras belonging to the three planes are impermanent.

'All dhammas are not self' means that all dhammas belonging to the four planes are not self.

(SA.ii.318;)

The three planes are those of sense-desires, refined-form and formlessness. The four planes are the same with the addition of the supramundane.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 19, 2013 3:56 PM

Title: Re: being envious of oneself Re: The translation of Muditā

Content:

Is the aging model (musician, yogi) afflicted with some dissociative disorder, such that she supposes her remembered younger self to be a wholly different person, lacking any causal continuity with her present self? If she is, then I suppose that there may arise in her envy towards her past self whom she perceives to be someone else. I'll leave it to any shrinks who might be reading this to pronounce on whether such a thing is actually

possible. But even supposing that it is, clearly we would be talking about a psychologically very exceptional situation and not a sane puthujjana's typical mental functioning.

On the other hand, if we are talking about an aging model experiencing the normal sort of misery that comes with losing one's good looks, then I can only say ditto to Beeblebrox's contribution. I don't think the semantic range of 'envy' (even by your own quoted dictionary definition of it, let alone the very precise commentarial delimiting of *issā*) would extend to the scenarios you're describing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2013 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Being defeated and loss of attainments

Content:

According to Theravada teaching all ariyan attainments are irreversible. They cannot be lost.

Skill in *jhāna* is easily lost, and supernormal powers even more easily. Devadatta, for example, is reported to have lost all his powers just by conceiving a thought of malice towards the Buddha. Proficiency in *jhāna* can decline if one is indolent about maintaining it, or living in circumstances that are not optimal for it, or if one's *sīla* is not sufficiently pure.

As for *pārājika* offences, I don't know of any text states that one will necessarily lose *jhānas* or powers in this way, but as it amounts to a very grave decline in *sīla* it does seem rather likely to be the case. What the texts do say is that if people are "in communion by theft" (i.e., pretending to be *bhikkhus* or *bhikkhunīs* when they are not) then this will impede realization (*abhisamaya*), here meaning stream-entry. So if a *bhikkhu* committed a *pārājika* offence but concealed it and remained in the robes, then he would be cut off from any possibility of progress.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2013 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Did Arthur C. Clarke say this?

Content:

The passage the op alludes to is from *The Deep Range* (1957), although it's an archaeologist's hammer, not a scientist's. A prominent figure in the story is a Scottish *bhikkhu*, who seems to be a composite of the Englishman *Ñāṇamoli* (or perhaps *Ñāṇavīra*) and the Scotsman *Sīlacāra* (Jack F. McKechnie).

"Well, this is something that has been building up for several years. We've warned Headquarters, but they've never taken us seriously. Now your interview in *Earth* has

brought matters to a head; the Mahanayake Thero of Anuradhapura— he's the most influential man in the East, and you're going to hear a lot more about him—read it and promptly asked us to grant him facilities for a tour of the bureau. We can't refuse, of course, but we know perfectly well what he intends to do. He'll take a team of cameramen with him and will collect enough material to launch an all-out propaganda campaign against the bureau. Then, when it's had time to sink in, he'll demand a referendum. And if that goes against us, we will be in trouble."

The pieces of the jigsaw fell into place; the pattern was at last clear. For a moment Franklin felt annoyed that he had been diverted across the world to deal with so absurd a challenge. Then he realized that the men who had sent him here did not consider it absurd; they must know, better than he did, the strength of the forces that were being marshaled. It was never wise to underestimate the power of religion, even a religion as pacific and tolerant as Buddhism.

The position was one which, even a hundred years ago, would have seemed unthinkable, but the catastrophic political and social changes of the last century had all combined to give it a certain inevitability. With the failure or weakening of its three great rivals, Buddhism was now the only religion that still possessed any real power over the minds of men.

Christianity, which had never fully recovered from the shattering blow given it by Darwin and Freud, had finally had unexpectedly succumbed before the archaeological discoveries of the late twentieth century. The Hindu religion, with its fantastic pantheon of gods and goddesses, had failed to survive in an age of scientific rationalism. And the Mohammedan faith, weakened by the same forces, had suffered additional loss of prestige when the rising Star of David had outshone the pale crescent of the Prophet.

These beliefs still survived, and would linger on for generations yet, but all their power was gone. Only the teachings of the Buddha had maintained and even increased their influence, as they filled the vacuum left by the other faiths. Being a philosophy and not a religion, and relying on no revelations vulnerable to the archaeologist's hammer, Buddhism had been largely unaffected by the shocks that had destroyed the other giants. It had been purged and purified by internal reformations, but its basic structure was unchanged.

One of the fundamentals of Buddhism, as Franklin knew well enough, was respect for all other living creatures. It was a law that few Buddhists had ever obeyed to the letter, excusing themselves with the sophistry that it was quite in order to eat the flesh of an animal that someone else had killed. In recent years, however, attempts had been made to enforce this rule more rigorously, and there had been endless debates between vegetarians and meat eaters covering the whole spectrum of crankiness. That these arguments could have any practical effect on the work of the World Food Organization was something that Franklin had never seriously considered.

"Tell me," he asked, as the fertile hills rolled swiftly past beneath him, "what sort of man is this Thero you're taking me to see?"

“Thero is his title; you can translate it by archbishop if you like. His real name is Alexander Boyce, and he was born in Scotland sixty years ago.”

“Scotland?”

“Yes—he was the first westerner ever to reach the top of the Buddhist hierarchy, and he had to overcome a lot of opposition to do it. A bhikku—er, monk—friend of mine once complained that the Maha Thero was a typical elder of the kirk, born a few hundred years too late—so he’d reformed Buddhism instead of the church of Scotland.”

“How did he get to Ceylon in the first place?”

“Believe it or not, he came out as a junior technician in a film company. He was about twenty then. The story is that he went to film the statue of the Dying Buddha at the cave temple of Dambulla, and became converted. After that it took him twenty years to rise to the top, and he’s been responsible for most of the reforms that have taken place since then. Religions get corrupt after a couple of thousand years and need a spring-cleaning. The Maha Thero did that job for Buddhism in Ceylon by getting rid of the Hindu gods that had crept into the temples.”

“And now he’s looking around for fresh worlds to conquer?”

“It rather seems like it. He pretends to have nothing to do with politics, but he’s thrown out a couple of governments just by raising his finger, and he’s got a huge following in the East. His ‘Voice of Buddha’ programs are listened to by several hundred million people, and it’s estimated that at least a billion are sympathetic toward him even if they won’t go all the way with his views. So you’ll understand why we are taking this seriously.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2013 3:40 AM

Title: Re: The translation of Muditā

Content:

"But here some woman or man is not envious, he does not envy, begrudge or harbor envy about others' gain, honor, veneration, respect, salutations and offerings. Due to having performed and completed such kammās, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in a happy destination... If instead he comes to the human state, he is influential wherever he is reborn. This is the way that leads to influence, that is to say, not to be envious, not to envy, begrudge or harbor envy about others' gain, honor, veneration, respect, salutations and offerings.

<http://www.vipassana.com/canon/majjhima/mn135.php>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 24, 2013 10:43 AM

Title: Re: Sakvala

Content:

Sakavala is the Sinhalese and Indonesian form of the word. If you want English language materials you'd be better off searching for the Pali cakkavāḷa or cakkavāla, or the Sanskrit cakravāḷa or cakravāḍa or cakravāla.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 24, 2013 11:58 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

I think Wat Pa Nanachat may well be unique in this respect. I have a septuagenarian American friend who has sometimes stayed at WPN for lengthy periods and was hoping to ordain there. His application was rejected on account of the rule you mention. The explanation given to him was that the community had found it too difficult to train westerners who ordain in old age. Western quinquagenarians, sexagenarians, etc., find it irksome to be bossed about by vicenarians and tricenarians (which is what most of the WPN community are) who are their monastic seniors. It might not be so bad if there wasn't actually a lot of bossing about but at WPN there's a great deal of it.

With Thais ordaining in late life doesn't seem to be so much of a problem. The difficulties WPN encountered are avoided largely through senior Thai monks having the skill to train their charges in a non-coercive fashion, without needing to issue peremptory orders, pull rank on one's juniors, and that sort of thing. In fact there's many a Thai abbot who will never order anyone to do anything but will get things done by just quietly dropping hints.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 24, 2013 3:35 PM

Title: Re: Sakvala

Content:

It's not that Sinhalese is the language of Indonesia, but that both languages have a great number of Sanskrit loanwords, one of which is cakravāḷa. Otherwise they are not at all alike, belonging as they do to entirely different language families: Sinhalese to the Indo-European, and Indonesian (or Bahasa Indonesia) to the Austronesian.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 24, 2013 7:15 PM

Title: Re: Sakvala

Content:

I've just checked with the dictionary and it turns out my memory was deceiving me about the form of the Indonesian word. It's actually 'cakrawala'. Attached are the dictionary entries for both forms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 25, 2013 11:31 AM

Title: Re: The Extraordinary Science of Addictive Junk Food

Content:

Robot refrigerators to the rescue....

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/education/2013/feb/18/british-diet-improbable-research>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 25, 2013 11:53 AM

Title: Re: Ways to learn Thai

Content:

When I began learning Thai in 1985 almost all of the available teaching materials were rubbish, written by bumbling linguistic amateurs. Perhaps the sole exception were the textbooks for the AUA course, but taking that course necessitated living in Bangkok. Moreover, monks weren't permitted to attend the AUA public classes and so could only take the course if they had a lay supporter who was willing to pay a fortune for private tuition.

Nowadays that's all changed and there are some great Thai courses for autodidacts. In fact one is almost spoilt for choice. The most impressive that I've seen, in terms of balance, clarity and pedagogical acuity, are those prepared by a Thai woman called Benjawan Poomsan Becker:

https://www.amazon.com/Benjawan-Poomsan-Becker/e/B001JP7YSG/ref=ntt_athr_dp_pel_1

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 27, 2013 12:01 AM

Title: Re: Western Teachers of the Thai Forest Tradition

Content:

I don't think there's very much to investigate here. Outside of those in the Ajahn Chah circuit very few western monks in the TFT have set themselves up as teachers.

The Ajahn Thet disciples of the 70's and 80's have all disrobed except Ajahn Munindo, who switched to Ajahn Chah, and Ajahn Dhammachando (Tan Chad), who lives as a hermit in Tak Province and doesn't teach.

The Buddhādāsa disciples have all disrobed, with the exception of the veteran German monk Tan Khemadassī (who was only rather loosely associated with Ajahn Buddhādāsa). He lives as a hermit on an island in Trat Province and doesn't teach. Of those who've disrobed I think only the ex-Santikaro Bhikkhu now teaches.

As for Ajahn Mahā Boowa's disciples, I'm not up-to-date with the recent generation, but of the four I used to know back in the 80's, Ajahn Pañṇavaḍḍho is deceased, Tan John Vuḍḍhiko disrobed, and I haven't heard anything about Sīlaratano or Abhijāto taking up teaching. Pañṇavaḍḍho gave a few interviews and Q & A sessions in the last years of his life, but their contents were scarcely more than a reiteration of Mahā Boowa's teaching.

Then there are some western Dhammayutt monks who trained in the TFT but with less well-known ajahns. Here too I'm not up to date, but I think most whom I used to know have disrobed except the New Zealander Tan Guttasīla and the Aussie Bill Platypus (I forget his Pali name). I've no idea what's become of those two.

If you're interested in TFT-like stuff that's independent of Ajahn Chah, it might be more fruitful to look at those teachers who were formerly in the Ajahn Chah camp but then moved onto other pastures, or who are technically still in the camp but whose dhammic centre of gravity appears to lie elsewhere than in Ajahn Chah's teachings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 28, 2013 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Western Teachers of the Thai Forest Tradition

Content:

Thanks for the news.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 28, 2013 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Devanagari or Burmese Pali characters needed - help please?

Content:

This seems to be missing an i.

သမ္မာသတိ

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 1, 2013 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Western Teachers of the Thai Forest Tradition

Content:

My background is rather variegated, comprising six years in Thai and Burmese urban pariyatti monasteries, six years in monasteries affiliated with the late Khrubar Phrommajak, two years in an Ajahn Chah wat, one year in a Dhammayut forest wat, two years in vipassana meditation centres, and nine years living alone. Though I don't identify with any particular sub-tradition, the monks whom I have most to do with nowadays are Thais belonging to Khrubar Phrommajak's Lamphun branch of the Chiang Mai tradition of Khrubar Sriwichai.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 1, 2013 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Devanagari or Burmese Pali characters needed - help please?

Content:

This does seem rather odd, bhante, and I don't know why it should be. I have two Myanmar Unicode fonts in my computer (Myanmar MN and Myanmar Sangam MN) and with both of them the word appears exactly as in your image.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 2, 2013 3:00 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

More to the point, the phrase “*ṭhānaṃ etaṃ vijjati ... sacchikareyya*” (“it is possible ... he would realize.” More literally: “...this situation is to be found ... he may realize...”) would seem to contradict Pulga by indicating that stream-entry attainment is possible for such a person but not inevitable.

If it is merely a possibility that one attending appropriately may realize the fruit of stream-entry, then there is also a possibility that he may not. And all those who do not would count as instances of puthujjanas possessed of *yoniso manasikāra*. Hence *yoniso manasikāra* may be present in a puthujjana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 2, 2013 3:18 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

The commentary to this sutta defines the term twice, once giving the stock commentarial definition (the paragraph beginning: "tattha _yoniso manasikāro_ nāma upāyamanasikāro...") and once a context-specific one (notice the limiting adverb "ettha", "here"). It is only in the latter that sotāpattimagga is alluded to. In the general definition there's no limiting of yoniso mansikāra to ariyans.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 30, 2013 7:26 PM
Title: Re: The Digha Nikaya in Norwegian
Content:
Anumodanā!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 30, 2013 7:27 PM
Title: Re: The Digha Nikaya in Norwegian
Content:
In Kåre's translation I believe "woohoo!" would be "Det er vidunderlig og fantastisk". As in:

"Acchariyaṃ vata bho, abbhutaṃ vata bho, evarūpopi nāma ulāro satthā bhavissati, evarūpaṃ ulāraṃ dhammakkhānaṃ, evarūpā ulārā visesādhigamā paññāyissanti" ti.
(Janavasabha Sutta, DN. 18)

"Det er vidunderlig og fantastisk at det finnes en så ypperlig læremester og en så ypperlig lære, og det er blitt bekjentgjort en så ypperlig vei til det herligste!"
(ibid. Kåre Lie trans.)

"It is wonderful, it is marvellous, that such a glorious Teacher should arise, that there should be such a glorious proclamation of Dhamma, and that such glorious paths to the sublime should be made known!"
(Maurice Walshe trans.)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 31, 2013 4:30 PM
Title: Re: "Dogs do it better"
Content:
Typically brahmin-bashing Suttas are addressed to a brahmin enquirer (or challenger) whom the Buddha sees as having the potential for awakening, or at least for conversion, but who in the meantime is so bloated with caste conceit as to be unteachable. So the

Buddha will begin by taking the man down a peg or two and teach him the Dhamma only when he's suitably softened.

In the present case, however, the Sutta is addressed to bhikkhus and no context is given. Perhaps the purpose is to provide the listeners with material to be used for the above teaching tactic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 31, 2013 5:14 PM

Title: Re: "Dogs do it better"

Content:

and to your (or is it Ven. Thanissaro's?) footnote to it:

"This verse, concerned with disputing the dominant position of brahmins in the cast system, is obviously not, as claimed in the following paragraph, "connected with the goal." It rather sounds like polemical nonsense."

Actually what we have here is a literary device that occurs numerous times in the Dhammapada and the SN's Sagāthavagga. First there will be a line or verse expressing some mundane commonplace (that may or may not be in accordance with Dhamma). This will then be trumped by a subsequent line or verse expressing the Dhamma. The "connected with the goal" attribute applies of course to the latter, not to the more pedestrian utterance that served as its springboard.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 1, 2013 2:18 AM

Title: Re: "Dogs do it better"

Content:

But Sanaṅkumāra doesn't just do that. He repeatedly descends to earth to let folk know that...

"... a person consummate
in clear-knowing & conduct,
is the best of beings
human & divine."

and the preceding part of his speech is just spice.

Notes.

[1] Where too we find a pretty glowing endorsement of kṣatriyas:

The king commanded him: “Stay with me for a long time.” Then he said to him: “As to what you have told me, O Gautama, this knowledge did not reach any brahmin before you. Thus it was to the kshatriya alone, among all the people, that the teaching of this knowledge belonged.” Then he began to teach him...

[2] Suggested by Th. Rhys Davids in Dialogues of the Buddha.

[3] Some helpful general remarks on ‘caste’ from Paul Williams:

Scholars tend to think of Brahmanism at the time of the Buddha not in terms of the Indian actuality of caste (jāti) as it has developed over many, many centuries, but rather in terms of the Brahmanic ideology of class (varṇa). Note this distinction carefully, because confusion between caste and class seems to be almost normal in works on Indian religions. Classical Brahmanic texts dating from Vedic times and beyond refer to society divided into the four classes (varṇas) of brahmins (brāhmaṇas), warriors/rulers (kṣatriyas), generators of wealth (vaiśyas), and the rest (‘servants’, śūdras). This division is by birth, it is a division of purity, and it is strictly hierarchical. Each preceding class is purer and therefore superior to the following. Thus the preceding class has a higher social status than the following, quite regardless of any wealth one might have.

Within this system there is no correlation between wealth or power and social status. Status is determined by relative purity. It is not given by wealth, power or, as such, behaviour or insight. Members of the first three classes are referred to as ‘twice-born’ (dvija), and they are entitled and expected to enter into the world of Vedic religious duties, for most of their lives as married householders. This involves keeping alight the domestic sacrificial fire and engaging particularly in the duty to sacrifice, each in the appropriate and distinctive way determined by relative position (relative purity) in the social hierarchy. Nearly everyone can be fitted somewhere into one or other of these classes. Which class one is a member of determines (according to the Brahmanic lawbooks) a whole range of social behaviour from who one can eat with to which sort of wood is used in making one’s staff, or which sacrifices have to be carried out, by whom, and at what age.

Over the years Indian social actuality going back many centuries has seen not just four but hundreds of castes (jātis) and subcastes. If we try and relate class to caste, varṇa to jāti, class is classical Brahmanic ideology while caste is historical and modern actuality. They are different. The varṇa system is what the Brahmanic authors wanted to see, and to the extent that brahmins were the dominant group in society the varṇa ideology provided a template for what they sought to realise. The jātis represent the actual system of Indian social division within relatively recent historical time. It is important to preserve the terminological separation of the two, and not to confuse them. At the time of the Buddha there was the ideology of varṇa, that formed part of the ideology of brahmins, the dominant group in much of North Indian society. No doubt there was within that area also some form of social division influenced to a greater or lesser degree by the ideology of varṇa. But the extent to which the varṇa ideology

influenced the actual social divisions in the region from which the Buddha came, a fringe area in the Himalayan foothills, is still very unclear.

The Buddha was critical of the intrinsic supremacy of the brahmins, and with it the ideology of varṇa. But it would be misleading from this to infer, as some modern writers do, that the Buddha was 'anti-caste'. First, a criticism of the varṇa system is not in itself a comment on jāti, caste, although it could be transposed to the ideology that nevertheless underlies caste. For his part the Buddha spoke of the true brahmin as one who had spiritual insight and behaves accordingly (see the famous Dhammapada Ch. 26). In this sense the Buddha affirmed a hierarchy not of birth but of spiritual maturity. It is not obvious that the Buddha would have any comment to make about a brahmin who is also spiritually mature (understood in the Buddha's sense). The Buddha was not offering social reform. And this is what one would expect. The Buddha was himself a renouncer of society.

(Buddhist Thought, pp. 13-15)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 6, 2013 8:55 PM

Title: Re: Itivuttaka 1.24 A Heap of Bones

Content:

I shouldn't have thought so, for comparable teachings are given elsewhere to disciples in all walks of life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 6, 2013 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Christianity, from a Buddhist perspective

Content:

For my part I think that it requires a "Holy Willie" mindset, consisting in a strong conviction that one is not oneself one of the hell-bound, a thankfulness that this is so, and a strong stomach. I doubt any beast could be so vicious.

Holy Willie's Prayer

by Robert Burns

O Thou, who in the heavens does dwell,
Who, as it pleases best Thyself,
Sends one to heaven and ten to hell,
All for Thy glory,
And not for any good or ill
They've done afore Thee!

I bless and praise Thy matchless might,
When thousands Thou hast left in night,
That I am here afore Thy sight,
For gifts and grace
A burning and a shining light
To all this place.

What was I, or my generation,
That I should get such exaltation,
I who deserve most just damnation
For broken laws,
Five thousand years ere my creation,
Through Adam's cause?

When from my mother's womb I fell,
Thou might have plunged me deep in hell,
To gnash my gums, to weep and wail,
In burning lakes,
Where damned devils roar and yell,
Chained to their stakes.

Yet I am here a chosen sample,
To show thy grace is great and ample;
I'm here a pillar of Thy temple,
Strong as a rock,
A guide, a buckler, and example,
To all Thy flock.

(etc. etc. for another twelve verses)

http://www.bbc.co.uk/arts/robertburns/works/holy_willies_prayer/

In practice, however, my impression is that Holy Willie types (Fred Phelps and his horror-show of a family will serve as a good example) are not very common among Christians today. Rather, most hell-believing Christians are simply not at peace with their belief in a literal everlasting hell; they are tormented by it and resigned to being so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 6, 2013 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Christianity, from a Buddhist perspective

Content:

P.S.

To Peter B. and any other Scotsmen here... my apologies for the englishing of the Burns extract. I just didn't think there'd be too many who'd know what 'ane', 'guid', 'wha', 'sic',

'frae', etc. mean.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 7, 2013 7:19 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Violence Doesn't Exist

Content:

There are in the Suttas about thirty occurrences of the adverb *sattadhā*, meaning 'sevenfold'. In the Jātaka verses these mostly occur in connection with some miscreant (usually Devadatta) getting zapped by the utterance of a *saccakiriyā* (e.g., "Etena *saccavajjena*, *muddhā te phalatu sattadhā!*" — "By this utterance of truth may your skull explode into seven pieces!") spoken by one of the Buddha's future leading disciples. In the first four Nikāyas they mostly occur in connection with the axe-wielding *yakkha* *Vajirapāṇī* threatening to use his axe to the same effect. The persons thus threatened are those of the Buddha's interlocutors who resort to dishonorable debating tactics and the like. Now in none of these cases does the Buddha ever say to *Vajirapāṇī*: "Hey, *yakkha*, just buzz off, will you! Shoo! Go away!" On the contrary, he takes advantage of the *yakkha*'s strong-arm tactics by warning his interlocutor that he's going to get it if he doesn't mind his manners.

Then the Blessed One said to *Ambaṭṭha* the Brahman: 'Then this further question arises, *Ambaṭṭha*, a very reasonable one which, even though unwillingly, you should answer. If you do not give a clear reply, or go off upon another issue, or remain silent, or go away, then your head will split into seven pieces on the spot. What have you heard, when Brahmins old and well stricken in years, teachers of yours or their teachers, were talking together, as to whence the *Kaṇhāyanas* draw their origin, and who the ancestor was to whom they trace themselves back?'

And when he had thus spoken *Ambaṭṭha* remained silent. And the Blessed One asked the same question again. And still *Ambaṭṭha* remained silent. Then the Blessed One said to him: 'You had better answer, now, *Ambaṭṭha*. This is no time for you to hold your peace. For whosoever, *Ambaṭṭha*, does not, even up to the third time of asking, answer a reasonable question put by a *Tathāgata*, his head splits into seven pieces on the spot.'

Now at that time the *yakkha* *Vajirapāṇī* stood over above *Ambaṭṭha* in the sky with a mighty iron axe, all fiery, dazzling, and aglow, with the intention, if he did not answer, there and then to split his head into seven pieces. And the Blessed One perceived the *yakkha* *Vajirapāṇī*, and so did *Ambaṭṭha* the Brahman. And *Ambaṭṭha* on becoming aware of it, terrified, startled, and agitated, seeking safety and protection and help from the Blessed One, crouched down beside him in awe, and said: 'What was it the Blessed One said? Say it once again!'

And so for the purpose of opening *Ambaṭṭha*'s eyes to the Dhamma, the Buddha accepts with alacrity the aid of a thuggish axe-wielding *yakkha*. Unlike some of his modern western admirers, the Lion of the Sakyans (as one would expect of a *kṣatriya*) is no advocate of simple-minded hippie pacifism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 7, 2013 8:20 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Violence Doesn't Exist

Content:

Non-delusion (amoha, paññā) in the Jātakas is for the most part represented as a sort of Solomonic shrewdness and acuity in analysing and understanding situations and people, coupled with a practical prudence that enables a Bodhisatta to deal optimally with life's vicissitudes. Sometimes an optimal outcome cannot be achieved while keeping one's hands clean, in which case the Bodhisatta takes a proportionalist approach (much as dhammika rājās are expected to do). As the Bodhisatta is as yet unawakened, we shouldn't expect his paññā to be of the level that permanently eradicates kilesa and the harmful actions that issue from kilesa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2013 10:13 AM

Title: Re: L. Cousins' "de-quantification" of dhammas

Content:

Could you specify where in his writings Cousins presents these views? In the only article by him in my possession (The Paṭṭhāna and the Development of the Theravādin Abhidhamma JPTS, [1981] 22-46) Cousins speaks much like any other ābhidhammika, using 'process' when talking about the various vīthis, and the stock (modern) simile of frames-in-a-movie when speaking of individual cittas. I vaguely recall that in other writings he tends to depart from the widespread tendency of modern Abhidhamma writers who place a near-exclusive emphasis on the analytic side of the subject, while treating the synthetic side (i.e., conditional relations) as scarcely more than an afterthought. Cousins, as I recall, reverses this emphasis, but in doing so I can't recall his ever departing from the post-Anuruddha Theravādin consensus in any matter of substance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2013 2:21 PM

Title: Re: prefix ā vs. a

Content:

The prefix ā- exhibits quite a range of semantic functions, both basic and idiomatic. However, since de Silva's book is a primer, not a comprehensive reference grammar, it's no surprise that she doesn't wish to overburden new students by describing all of them.

In the Section on Prefixative Words (Opasaggikapada) in the Padarūpasiddhi, the grammarian Buddhapiya summarised the uses of the prefix -ā as follows:

Ā iti abhimukhabhāvu'ddhakamma mariyādā'bhidhi

patti'cchāparissajana ādikammaggahaṇa nivāsa-
samīpa'vhanādīsu; abhimukhabhāve āgacchati, uddhakamme
ārohati, mariyādāyaṃ āpabbatā khettaṃ, abhividhimhi ākumāraṃ
yaso kaccāyanassa, pattiyaṃ āpattimāpanno, icchāyaṃ ākaṅkhā,
parissajane āliṅganaṃ, ādikamme ārambho, gahaṇe ādīyati
ālambati, nivāse āvasatho, samīpe āsannaṃ, avhāne
āmantesi.

Translation:

“The prefix ‘ā’ has such meanings as a state of approaching towards, an upwardly directed or overhead action, bordering, complimenting, reaching, wishing, embracing, commencing, taking, residence, propinquity and addressing.”

For example:

1. Abhimukhabhāve: āgacchati.

In the sense of ‘a state of approaching towards’, as in the verb ‘to come’.

2. Uddhakamme: ārohati.

In the sense of ‘an upwardly directed or overhead action’, as in the verb ‘to ascend or rise into the air’.

3. Mariyādāyaṃ: āpabbatā khettaṃ.

In the sense of ‘bordering’, as in ‘a mountain-bordered territory / territory-bordering mountains’.

4. Abhividhimhi: ākumāraṃ yaso kaccāyanassa.

For the sake of complimenting by highlighting something surprising or unexpected, as in, ‘Kaccāyana’s fame, even though he was yet a child’.

5. Pattiyaṃ: āpattimāpanno

In the sense of ‘reaching or arriving at’, as in ‘arriving at [= falling into] a Vinaya offence’.

6. Icchāyaṃ: ākaṅkhā,

In the sense of ‘wishing’, as in ‘desire’.

7. Parissajane: āliṅganaṃ

In the sense of ‘[literally or figuratively] embracing’, as in ‘enclasping’.

8. Ādikamme ārambho.

In the sense of ‘commencing action’, as in ‘initiating’.

9. Gahaṇe: ādīyati ālambati.

In the sense of ‘taking’, as in the verbs ‘to take’ and ‘to hold’.

10. Nivāse: āvasatho.

In the sense of 'residence', as in 'refuge place'.

11. Samīpe: āsannaṃ.

In the sense of 'propinquity', as in 'near'.

12. Avhāne: āmantesi.

In the sense of 'addressing', as in 'he addressed'.

.

As for a-, Pali grammarians don't regard this as a prefix in the strict sense (i.e. as an upasagga). Rather, it is simply one of the forms that the indeclinable particle 'na' can take when it occurs as the first item in a compound. Its semantic range is rather broad, coinciding fully with those of the prefixes 'ni' and 'paṭi' and partially with that of 'vi-'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2013 3:03 PM

Title: Re: Anurudha manapa kayika sutta

Content:

It's probably a regional name for the second of the two Anuruddha Suttas in the Aṅguttara Nikāya's Aṭṭhakavagga. There is no translation of it at ATI.

AN. iv. 262-6

Gradual Sayings IV. 175-8

Numerical Discourses pp. 1182-5

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2013 3:27 PM

Title: Re: The 6 "higher powers"

Content:

That a non-arahanṭ may develop any of the five mundane abhiññās is, as far as I know, an uncontested question. Or have you met someone who claims otherwise?

Such a possibility can be seen from the life of Anuruddha, from the Brahmajāla Sutta (where non-Buddhist ascetics develop recollection of their former lives and are thereby led into wrong view) and from the MN's two Sāropama Suttas (where bhikkhus are urged not to be satisfied with concentration-based knowledge and vision that falls short of arahatta (with the former glossed in the commentary as the dibbacakkhu).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 31, 2013 8:19 AM

Title: Re: Spanish Language | Recursos en español

Content:

Abhidhamma Theravada — un grupo de Facebook en español.

<https://www.facebook.com/groups/350633041686742/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 31, 2013 11:43 AM

Title: Re: Good Pdf Book Suggestion Please

Content:

I suggest you buy the Kindle version of Rupert Gethin's The Foundations of Buddhism and convert it to a pdf.

https://www.amazon.com/Foundations-Buddhism-OPUS-ebook/dp/B005OQGBLC/ref=sr_1_1_bnp_1_kin

CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures

List of Maps

A Note on Buddhist Languages

INTRODUCTION I

I. THE BUDDHA: THE STORY OF THE AWAKENED ONE

The historical Buddha

The legend of the Buddha

The nature of a buddha

2. THE WORD OF THE BUDDHA: BUDDHIST SCRIPTURES AND SCHOOLS

Dharma: texts, practice, and realization

The first recitation of scriptures

Sutra and Abhidharma

The origin of the ancient Buddhist schools

The Mahayana sutras

3. FOUR TRUTHS: THE DISEASE, THE CAUSE, THE CURE, THE MEDICINE

The orientation of the Buddha's teaching

The disease of suffering

The origin of suffering: attachment, aversion, and delusion

The cessation of suffering: nirvana

The way leading to the cessation of suffering

4. THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY: MONKS, NUN, AND LAY FOLLOWERS

The Buddha's followers and the origin of the Buddhist order

Ordination and the Buddhist monastic ideal

The underlying concerns of the Vinaya

From wandering to settled life
The spiritual life
The lay community
Spiro's schema: apotropaic, kammatic, and nibbanic Buddhism

5· THE BUDDHIST COSMOS: THE THRICE-THOUSANDFOLD WORLD

Of space and time: world-systems
Cosmology and psychology: macrocosm and microcosm
Cosmology, folk religion, and modern science

6. NO SELF: PERSONAL CONTINUITY AND DEPENDENT ARISING

The Buddhist critique of self as unchanging
The problem of personal continuity
Ignorance, attachment, and views of the self
The elaboration of the teaching of dependent arising
Did the Buddha deny the existence of the self?

7· THE BUDDHIST PATH: THE WAY OF CALM AND INSIGHT

Introductory remarks
The role of faith
Good conduct
The practice of calm meditation
The stages of insight meditation
The relationship of calm and insight

8. THE ABHIDHARMA: THE HIGHER TEACHING

Stories, legends, texts, and authors
The Abhidharma as a system of Buddhist thought
The consciousness process, karma, and rebirth
Some Abhidharma problems

9· THE MAHAYANA: THE GREAT VEHICLE

The beginnings of the Mahayana
The vehicle of the bodhisattva
Transcendent buddhas
Emptiness and the 'perfection of wisdom'
Nagarjuna and the 'middle' (Madhyamaka) school
'Ideas only' (vijñapti-matra) and the Yogacara
The Tathagatagarbha

10. EVOLVING TRADITIONS OF BUDDHISM: SOUTH, EAST, NORTH, AND WEST

Theravada Buddhism in Sri Lanka and South-East Asia: Southern Buddhism
China, Korea, and Japan: East Asian Buddhism
Tibet and Mongolia: Northern Buddhism
A final note: Buddhism in the West
Select Bibliography
Glossary

Index

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 1, 2013 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Audio of recitation of the Vinaya-pitakas's Mahavagga

Content:

Like Ven. Pesala, I've never heard of any tradition of memorizing and reciting this text. The only monks I can imagine doing so are those (exceedingly few) who aspire to be vinayadharas. Still, if this is what you want to do, perhaps you could make a start by memorizing those portions of the Mahākhanda which are in more or less regular liturgical use and which most senior monks are likely to have memorized. It shouldn't be hard to find recordings of them at Youtube. They are:

1. Paṭiccasamuppāda anuloma: "avijjāpaccayā saṅkhārā, saṅkhārapaccayā viññāṇaṃ..."
2. Paṭiccasamuppāda paṭiloma: "avijjāyatveva asesavirāgaṇirodhā saṅkhāraṇirodho..."
3. Three Udānas: "yadā have pātubhavanti dhammā..."
4. Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta.
5. Anattalakkhaṇa Sutta.
6. Ādittapariyāya Sutta.
7. Brahmajāla Sutta.
8. Tisaṇaṇāpamaṇa: "buddhaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi..."
9. Assaji's gāthā to Sāriputta: "ye dhammā hetuppabhavā..."
10. Upasampadā formulas: "suṇātu me, bhante, saṅgho, ayaṃ itthannāmo itthannāmassa āyasmato upasampadāpekkho..."
11. Cattāro nissayā: "piṇḍiyālopabhojanaṃ nissāya pabbajjā..."
12. Cattāri akaraṇiyāni: "upasaṃpannena bhikkhuna methuno dhammo na paṭisevitabbo..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 1, 2013 3:43 PM

Title: Re: Right speech in a one on one situation

Content:

Gently confronting one's interlocutor with the stock Sutta query "Kim'atthiyaṃ āvuso..." may yield some interesting outcomes.

"Discerning what benefit, friend, and what advantage, do you thus disparage Katie's taste in clothes?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2013 5:05 AM

Title: Re: Emerging from the first jhana to develop a mental body

Content:

If you've based the statement in this thread title upon Harvey's article, then I think you are probably confusing (1) the production of "subtle mind-generated materialities" (cittaja sukhuma rūpa) by each jhānic citta with (2) the generation of a "mind-made body" (manomaya kāya) after emergence from the fourth jhāna. The two things have nothing to do with each other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2013 4:43 PM

Title: Re: Does an arahant not feel angry at all?

Content:

Though a little dated in some regards, The Psychology of Nirvana by the psychologist and Pali scholar Rune Johansson remains probably the best Sutta-based study on the personality of an arahant — both what it feels like to be one and how such a person will appear to others.

<http://watflorida.org/pages/Library.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 13, 2013 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Can consciousness experience woeful states?

Content:

According to the Abhidhamma all of the consciousnesses and mental factors that can arise among beings in the lower realms can arise also in the human realm, with just one partial exception. The exception is the dukkha-vedanā experienced in the hell realms. In no realm outside of hell does any living being undergo painful bodily feeling of comparable intensity for even a single moment. Hence the Buddha's statement in the Bālapaṇḍita Sutta:

“Were it rightly speaking to be said of anything: ‘That is utterly unwished for, utterly undesired, utterly disagreeable,’ it is of hell that, rightly speaking, this should be said, so much so that it is hard to find a simile for the suffering in hell.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 14, 2013 7:15 PM

Title: Re: Women cannot become Buddhas?

Content:

It's part and parcel of the general doctrine that in their final life bodhisattas will be reborn in circumstances that permit them to have the optimal impact upon devas and men.[1] For example, it is said that they will be reborn in whatever happens to be reckoned as the highest social class at that time; the place of their birth will be a

cultured and not a barbarous one; they will be physically attractive, possessed of a good voice, etc. etc.

The texts don't spell out precisely why it would be better for them to be men rather than women, but it's not hard to guess. As far as we know, all human societies are patriarchal, always have been, and most probably always will be.[2] So, if you're intent on making a really big splash in the world, other things being equal, possession of a male body will stand you in better stead than possession of a female one.

Notes

[1] This point is very commonly misstated, with claims being made to the effect that a bodhisatta, in his penultimate life in the Tusita heaven, gets to choose the circumstances of his final birth. But this isn't what the Suttas say. They say only that before passing away he foresees what the circumstances of his final life will be, not that he chooses them. As with any other saṃsāric being, the bodhisatta, after passing away from Tusita, fares according to his kamma. It just happens that by the time he is ripe for awakening, the power of his accumulations of paramī and his resolve for sammāsambodhi will be such as will lead to rebirth in optimal circumstances. Pace the Tibetans, it doesn't mean that he is in possession of the power to say: "Let my rebirth be such and such!"

[2] For any readers who've been taken in by the matriarchal myth-making peddled by loony feminists (i.e., supposedly matriarchal prehistoric societies, or presently existing ones among the Iroquois, or in the South Seas, etc.), I offer the following reading suggestions (especially Goldberg's book, which in its most recent edition carries the new title, *Why Men Rule*):

- Cynthia Eller, *The Myth of Matriarchal Prehistory: Why an Invented Past Won't Give Women a Future* (Boston, Beacon Press, 2001).
- Donald E. Brown, *Human Universals* (Philadelphia, Temple University Press, 1991)
- Joan Bamberger, *The Myth of Matriarchy: Why Men Rule in Primitive Society*, in M. Rosaldo and L. Lamphere, *Women, Culture, and Society*, (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1974).
- Steven Goldberg, *The Inevitability of Patriarchy*, (William Morrow & Company, 1973).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 15, 2013 7:07 AM

Title: Re: I'd feed a starving child before a plump arahant

Content:

To keep one's precepts merely out of a prudential wish to avoid unpleasant vipākas no doubt bespeaks of an inferior level of motivation, but don't you think it's better than not

being motivated towards sila at all? And I doubt the unkilld bugs would find it in the least sad.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 15, 2013 11:32 AM

Title: Re: I'd feed a starving child before a plump arahant

Content:

In what circumstances is it better to act immorally than to act morally out of mere prudence?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 15, 2013 9:09 PM

Title: Re: Korean Dhammapada

Content:

John Choi has uploaded the 법구경 (Beopgugyeong / Dhammapada) to Youtube in segments, with about 3-5 verses in each video. If you want the printed text just click on the "Show More" button.

183

To avoid all evil,
to cultivate good,
and to cleanse one's mind — this is
the teaching
of the Buddhas.

악을 피하고
선을 가꾸며
마음을 깨끗이 씻는 것,
바로 이것이
모든 붓다들의
가르침이다.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 15, 2013 9:26 PM

Title: Re: If not sure about authenticity, compare with the suttas?

Content:

The passage to which you refer is included in the Dīgha Nikāya's Mahāparinibbāna Sutta, but in the Anguttara Nikāya occurs as a complete discourse: the Mahāpadesa Sutta. Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation in Numerical Discourses:

The Great References891

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Bhoganagara near the Ānanda Shrine. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: “Bhikkhus!”

“Venerable sir!” those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

“Bhikkhus, I will teach you these four great references.⁸⁹² [168] Listen and attend closely; I will speak.”

“Yes, Bhante,” those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

“What, bhikkhus, are the four great references?”

(1) “Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu might say: ‘In the presence of the Blessed One I heard this; in his presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching!”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline.⁸⁹³ If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are not included among the discourses and are not to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is not the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been badly learned by this bhikkhu.’ Thus you should discard it.

“But a bhikkhu might say: ‘In the presence of the Blessed One I heard this; in his presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching!”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline. If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are included among the discourses and are to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been learned well by this bhikkhu.’ You should remember this first great reference.

(2) “Then a bhikkhu might say: ‘In such and such a residence a Saṅgha is dwelling with elders and prominent monks. In the presence of that Saṅgha I heard this; in its presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching.”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline. If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are not included among the discourses and are not to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is not the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. [169] It has been badly learned by that Saṅgha.’ Thus you should discard it.

“But ... if, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are included among the discourses and are to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been learned well by that Saṅgha.’ You should remember this second great reference.

(3) “Then a bhikkhu might say: ‘In such and such a residence several elder bhikkhus are dwelling who are learned, heirs to the heritage, experts on the Dhamma, experts on the discipline, experts on the outlines. In the presence of those elders I heard this; in their presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching!”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline. If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are not included among the discourses and are not to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is not the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been badly learned by those elders.’ Thus you should discard it.

“But ... if, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are included among the discourses and are to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been learned well by those elders.’ You should remember this third great reference.

(4) “Then a bhikkhu might say: ‘In such and such a residence one elder bhikkhu is dwelling [170] who is learned, an heir to the heritage, an expert on the Dhamma, an expert on the discipline, an expert on the outlines. In the presence of that elder I heard this; in his presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching!”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline. If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are not included among the discourses and are not to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Surely, this is not the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been badly learned by that elder.’ Thus you should discard it.

“But a bhikkhu might say: ‘In such and such a residence one elder bhikkhu is dwelling who is learned, an heir to the heritage, an expert on the Dhamma, an expert on the discipline, an expert on the outlines. In the presence of that elder I heard this; in his presence I learned this: “This is the Dhamma; this is the discipline; this is the Teacher’s teaching!”’ That bhikkhu’s statement should neither be approved nor rejected. Without approving or rejecting it, you should thoroughly learn those words and phrases and then check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline. If, when you check for them in the discourses and seek them in the discipline, [you find that] they are included among the discourses and are to be seen in the discipline, you should draw the

conclusion: ‘Surely, this is the word of the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One. It has been learned well by that elder.’ You should remember this fourth great reference.

“These, bhikkhus, are the four great references.”⁸⁹⁴

NOTES

891 This passage is also included in the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta, DN 16.4.7, at II 124–26.

892 Mahāpadese. Mp glosses as mahā-okāse (apparently as if the compound could be resolved mahā + padese) and as mahā-apadese, the latter explained as “great reasons stated with reference to such great ones as the Buddha and others” (buddhādayo mahante mahante apadisitvā vuttāni mahākāraṇāni). This second resolution is certainly to be preferred. DOP gives, among the meanings of apadesa, “designation, pointing out, reference, witness, authority.” Cattāro mahāpadesā is sometimes rendered “four great authorities” but the sutta actually specifies only two authorities, the suttas and the Vinaya. Walshe, in LDB, renders it as “four criteria.” I understand the term to mean “four great references,” the four provenances of a teaching.

893 Tāni padabyañjanāni...sutte otāretabbāni vinaye sandassetabbāni. Mp gives various meanings of sutte and vinaye here, some improbable. Clearly, this instruction presupposes that there already existed a body of discourses and a systematic Vinaya that could be used to evaluate other texts proposed for inclusion as authentic utterances of the Buddha. Otāretabbāni is gerundive plural of otārenti, “make descend, put down or put into,” and otaranti, just below, means “descend, come down, go into.” My renderings, respectively, as “check for them” and “are included among” are adapted to the context. Sandassetabbāni is gerundive plural of sandassenti, “show, make seen,” and sandissanti means “are seen.”

894 The clearer of the two Chinese parallels is in DĀ 2, at T I 17b29–18a22. Here cattāro mahāpadesā is rendered “four great teaching dhammas.” I translate the first declaration (T I 17c2–13) as follows: “If there is a bhikkhu who claims: ‘Venerable ones, in that village, city, country, I personally heard [this] from the Buddha, I personally received this teaching,’ you should not disbelieve what you hear from him, nor should you reject it, but through the suttas determine whether it is true or false; based on the Vinaya, based on the Dhamma, probe it thoroughly. If what he says is not the sutta, not the Vinaya, not the Dhamma, then you should say to him: ‘The Buddha did not say this. What you have received is mistaken! [Or: You have received it erroneously!] For what reason? Because based on the suttas, based on the Vinaya, based on the Dhamma, we [find] that what you said deviates from the Dhamma. Venerable one, you should not uphold this, you should not report it to people, but should discard it.’ But if what he says is based on the suttas, based on the Vinaya, based on the Dhamma, then you should say to him: ‘What you said was truly spoken by the Buddha. For what reason? Because based on the suttas, based on the Vinaya, based on the Dhamma, we [find] that what you said

accords with the Dhamma. Venerable one, you should uphold this, you should widely report it to people; you should not discard it.' This is the first great teaching dhamma."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 16, 2013 10:38 AM

Title: Re: An Apple a Day?

Content:

But only if you aim it right.

.

an-apple-or-four-a-day-keeps-the-doctor-away1.jpg (97.07 KiB) Viewed 1741 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 22, 2013 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Women cannot become Buddhas?

Content:

In your hypothetical future it would presumably depend on which of the two regularities (dhammatā) were the dominant one: that Buddhas are always born in the optimal state for carrying out their task or that they are never female. If the former is dominant then we'll get Buddhas who are female but nonetheless optimal; if the latter then the Buddhas will be male but sub-optimal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 24, 2013 11:47 PM

Title: Re: How do you take "materialism"?

Content:

1. "Great king, there is no giving, no offering, no liberality."

This is the doctrine of kammic inefficacy (akiriyavāda). These actions yield no fruit.

2. "There is no fruit or ripening of kammās well-done and ill-done."

Also akiriyavāda.

3. "There is no present world."

The doctrine of annihilation (ucchedavāda): for beings existing now there is no future world to be attained by kamma.

4. “No world beyond.”

Haphazardism / acausalism (ahetukavāda): the coming into existence of beings in the future will be causeless and not the result of kammās performed by beings existing now.

5. “No mother and no father.”

Akiriyaavāda: the performance of right and wrong conduct towards one’s parents yields no fruit. This is according to the Dīgha commentary. Other texts identify it with moral nihilism (natthikavāda): there is no obligation for anyone to practise filial piety.

6. “No beings who have taken rebirth.”

Ahetukavāda. Reiterates #4 but applying the claim to beings in general, not just future ones.

N.B. Although many have translated “natthi sattā opapātikā” as “there are no beings of spontaneous arising”, in the present context the commentators take it to refer to the denial of rebirth in general and not just the denial of devas, petas, hell-beings, etc.

7. “In the world there are no samaṇas or brāhmaṇas of right attainment and right practice who explain this world and the world beyond on the basis of their own direct knowledge and realization.”

Ariyūpavāda (slandering of nobles). The Dīgha commentary doesn’t remark on this passage. The Vinaya commentary treats it as an expression of verbal misconduct rather than wrong view.

8. A person is made of the four great primaries. When he dies the earth [in his body] returns to and merges with the [external] body of earth; the water [in his body] returns to and merges with the [external] body of water; the fire [in his body] returns to and merges with the [external] body of fire; the air [in his body] returns to and merges with the [external] body of air. His sense faculties pass over into space. Four men carry the corpse along on a bier. His eulogies are sounded until they reach the charnel ground. His bones turn pigeon-coloured.”

Ucchedavāda.

9. “His meritorious offerings end in ashes.”

Akiriyaavāda.

10. “The practice of giving is a foolish convention. Those who proclaim a doctrine of

moral obligation speak only vain, empty prattle.”

Natthikavāda.

Commentary: “This practice of giving has been prescribed by fools and ignoramuses, not by the wise. Fools give, the wise take.”

11. “With the breaking up of the body, fools and sages alike are annihilated and utterly perish. Beyond death they exist no more.

Ucchedavāda.

The commentary, discussing Ajita’s views in relation to those of Pūraṇa Kassapa and Makkhali Gosāla, remarks:

Among these, Pūraṇa, with his statement “By doing so there is no evil,” denies kamma [because of his doctrine of the inefficacy of action]. Ajita, with the statement “One is annihilated with the breakup of the body,” denies vipāka [because he completely rejects a future re-arising]. Makkhali, with his statement, “There is no cause [for the purification of beings],” etc., denies both.

By denying kamma one denies its vipāka [because there is no vipāka when there is no kamma]. By denying vipāka one denies kamma [because when there is no result, kamma becomes inefficacious]. Thus all these thinkers, by denying both kamma and vipāka, in effect espouse acausalism (ahetukavāda), the inefficacy of kamma (akiriyavāda), and moral nihilism (natthikavāda).
(adapted from Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Sāmaññaphalasutta and commentary)

So although it’s the fashion to call Ajita a “materialist”, I think that from the commentarial point of view this designation —though not wrong— rather misses the point. Where a teacher espouses a plurality of wrong views, he will be most aptly denoted by whichever of these serves as the prōton pseudos. In the case of Ajita this clearly consists in his denial of vipāka, making “akiriyavādin” the fittest name for him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 25, 2013 10:37 AM

Title: Re: Pali Term: Ussūraseyyā

Content:

It's not altogether certain whether it means (1) oversleeping in the morning, (2) taking siestas at noon, or (3) sleeping at any time during the day. But if it means #1, then much like the English expression "to have a lie-in" the word doesn't entail any stipulation as to whether one sleeps until after sunrise or until after dawn.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2013 6:36 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and the UK Conservative Party

Content:

Not really. In all the mainstream parties these sort of things would be treated as issues of conscience. As such, any changes in legislation concerning them would be via private members' bills (as opposed to being official policy, with voting to be enforced by party whips). Having said that, one would expect to find more individuals opposed to abortion in the Conservative Party than in the other parties, simply because the party has a higher proportion of practising Christians and Jews than the other parties, and the commonest grounds for opposing abortion are religious ones.

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-17535/Torys-anti-abortion-stance-slammed.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2013 8:17 AM

Title: Re: How do you view sanjaya belatthiputta agnosticism?

Content:

The commentary to the Sāmaññaphalasutta doesn't expound Sañjaya's doctrine in detail but simply classifies it as a amarāvikkhepavāda ('perennial equivocation', 'eel-wriggling') and directs the reader to the exposition of the four types of amarāvikkhepavāda in the Brahmajāla Sutta and its commentary.

The attached files contains the section on amarāvikkhepavāda in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the commentary. The Brahmajālasutta itself should be available online.

[./download/file.php?id=2032](#)

(207.72 KiB) Downloaded 125 times

[./download/file.php?id=2033](#)

(400.33 KiB) Downloaded 45 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2013 10:28 PM

Title: Re: How do you view sanjaya belatthiputta agnosticism?

Content:

The distinction is between the abandoning of diṭṭhi and the holding to diṭṭhi while evasively concealing what it is and not even realizing that one is doing this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2013 11:45 PM

Title: Re: Jacobs ladder

Content:

I've seen it, but it's really only earth, hell and the supposed Bardo.

As Rubin's movies go, it's no doubt an improvement on Ghost but all the same, it clearly belongs among the works of his juvenilia. You won't, for example, encounter any of the razor-sharp wit, the lyrical sublimity, or the cognitive and moral challenges that one associates with the works of his mature years, like Stuart Little 2.

.

Stuart_Little2_poster.jpg (70.61 KiB) Viewed 1794 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 27, 2013 8:26 AM

Title: Re: Sammasambuddha, Paccekabuddha, Arhat

Content:

Résumé

A Buddha's path's a lengthy lag,
Paccekabodhi's a lonely drag;
Rōshis are stuck in ritualistic ruts,
And myōkōnin are gullible nuts.
The mahāsiddha is a noisome corybant,
So you might as well settle for being an arahant.

(with apologies to Dorothy Parker)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 27, 2013 10:51 AM

Title: Re: Suicide and Rebirth

Content:

In Buddhism karma and rebirth are treated as sheer brute facts and nothing more. As such, the Buddhist conception of karma is not like that found in some theistic religious systems. Karma doesn't serve any purpose within some supposed divine plan. It wasn't ordained by any God to serve as a guarantor of cosmic justice or a means by which humans might evolve towards union with God or some such ultimate end.

Likewise, the Buddhist conception of rebirth is not the same as Nietzsche's "eternal recurrence" or analogous ideas among New Agers.

The idea that a suicide would have to come back as such and such, in order to experience such and such, in order that such and such lesson be learned.... etc. etc. — this presupposes a conception of karma and rebirth that is alien to the Buddhist world view. It assumes that rebirth has some sort of evolutionary teleology to it (as in Theosophy, for example), but in an atheistic system like Buddhism this is out of the question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 30, 2013 6:18 PM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

I'm not sure what you mean by simple observance of celibacy. In the suttas it's stated that practising the brahmacariyā is a condition for rebirth in the sensual heavens, even where the person who practises it does so very miserably. This seems to imply that there is something intrinsically good in deliberately undertaken abstention from sex.

Presumably the principle would not apply to someone who abstained solely out of physical incapacity (which would be the proper analogy for your blind man).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2013 6:36 AM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

Sexual coupling is an act inseparable from defilement; that's why it's an impossible act for an arahant. If one is a non-brahmacari householder but whose sex life is kept within the parameters of the third precept, then one may avoid kilesa at the morally transgressive level; nonetheless one's couplings will unavoidably supply fuel to the anusaya kilesa of lust.

Having said that, the statement "Sex is intrinsically evil" is perhaps best avoided. Not because it's actually wrong, but because 'evil' in everyday English usage is a rather strong word, making the statement a less than felicitous way of phrasing the position —

one that may lead newcomers to mistake the Buddhist view of sex for that of the Manichaeans, Priscillianists, and suchlike.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2013 10:24 AM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

But I have already done so. In the Cūḷadhammasamādāna Sutta the manner of practice is explicitly stated to involve dukkha in the present, but with sukha as its vipāka. The detailed account then describes a man practising the brahmacariyā miserably (= dukkha in the present) but arriving at heavenly rebirth (= sukha vipāka).

Then there is also the Nanda Sutta in the Udāna, where the venerable Nanda is persuaded by the Buddha to continue with the brahmacariyā in the present life (despite his wish to disrobe and take up with his former fiancée), for by doing so he will gain heavenly rebirth and five hundred pink-footed apsaras.

Then there is a sutta in the Aṅguttara Nikāya that describes various secondary defects of the brahmacariyā. One of these consists in living a celibate life motivated only by the desire for heavenly rebirth to which such a life conduces.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2013 12:42 PM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

Samyoga Sutta

Sexual Intercourse

Then the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him ... and said to him:

“Does Master Gotama also claim to be one who lives the celibate life?”

“If, brahmin, one could rightly say of anyone: ‘He lives the complete and pure celibate life—unbroken, flawless, unblemished, unblotched,’ it is precisely of me that one might say this. For I live the complete and pure celibate life—unbroken, flawless, unblemished, unblotched.”

“But what, Master Gotama, is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life?”

(1) “Here, brahmin, some ascetic or brahmin, claiming to be perfectly celibate, does not actually engage in intercourse with women. But he consents to being rubbed,

massaged, bathed, and kneaded by them. He relishes this, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. This is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life. He is called one who lives an impure celibate life, one who is fettered by the bond of sexuality. He is not freed from birth, from old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish; he is not freed from suffering, I say.

(2) “Again, some ascetic or brahmin, claiming to be perfectly celibate, does not actually engage in intercourse with women; nor does he consent to being rubbed, massaged, bathed, and kneaded by them. But he jokes with women, plays with them, and amuses himself with them....

(3) “... he does not joke with women, play with them, and amuse himself with them ... but he gazes and stares straight into their eyes....

(4) “... he does not gaze and stare straight into women’s eyes ... but he listens to their voices behind a wall or through a rampart as they laugh, talk, sing, or weep....

(5) “... he does not listen to the voices of women behind a wall or through a rampart as they laugh, talk, sing, or weep ... but he recollects laughing, talking, and playing with them in the past....

(6) “... he does not recollect laughing, talking, and playing with women in the past ... but he looks at a householder or a householder’s son enjoying himself furnished and endowed with the five objects of sensual pleasure....

(7) “... he does not look at a householder or a householder’s son enjoying himself furnished and endowed with the five objects of sensual pleasure, but he lives the spiritual life aspiring for [rebirth in] a certain order of devas, [thinking]: ‘By this virtuous behavior, observance, austerity, or spiritual life I will be a deva or one [in the retinue] of the devas.’ He relishes this, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. This, too, is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life. He is called one who lives an impure celibate life, one who is fettered by the bond of sexuality. He is not freed from birth, from old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish; he is not freed from suffering, I say.

“So long, brahmin, as I saw that I had not abandoned one or another of these seven bonds of sexuality, I did not claim to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in the world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, in this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. But when I did not see even one of these seven bonds of sexuality that I had not abandoned, then I claimed to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with ... its devas and humans.

“The knowledge and vision arose in me: ‘Unshakable is my liberation of mind; this is my last birth; now there is no more renewed existence.’”

When this was said, the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī said to the Blessed One: “Excellent, Master Gotama! ... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for

refuge for life.”

(A.iv.54-7 Bhikkhu Bodhi trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2013 12:43 PM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/ud/ud.3.02.irel.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2013 10:03 PM

Title: Re: The experience of celibacy for 12 years

Content:

Yes, in particular for the second attha.

Note that the words in the Saṃyoga Sutta: “By this rule or vow or austerity or holy life, I shall become a deva...” are the stock phrase used in the Suttas for expressing the fetter of adhesion to habitual and vowed observances (sīlabbataparāmāsa). So, in effect the passage is describing something to be expected among brahmacārī outsiders who practise celibacy while lacking the Buddha’s right view guidance. Such persons’ enfetteredness by sīlabbataparāmāsa and lack of right view will be obstructive to their attainment of the third attha, but may still yield the second, in the form of rebirth as a deva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 2, 2013 6:37 AM

Title: Re: Kamma is anatta?

Content:

I don't think this phrase ever occurs in the Suttas, but it may be inferred that kamma is anattā from the fact that:

- The saṅkhāras of saṅkhārakkhandha are defined in the Suttas as the six bodies of cetanā.
- Saṅkhārakkhandha is anattā.
- Kamma is cetanā.

I have to go out now, but I'll try to post the relevant citations later, if someone else doesn't do so in the meantime.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 2, 2013 6:43 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

Bhante, are you sure your info is up to date? Though I've no idea what the current regulations are, I recall that whereas a non-immigrant visa sufficed when I came out to ordain in 1985, when I came back to re-ordain in 2003 I did have to apply for a special 'monk-to-be' visa and wouldn't have been permitted to ordain without one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 2, 2013 5:10 PM

Title: Re: the best yardstick of our development

Content:

The king's advice is given in the Kosambiya Jātaka (#428) and carried out by the son in the Dīghītikosala Jātaka (# 371).

Whoops, I didn't see that Ven. Pesala had already replied.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 2, 2013 6:03 PM

Title: Re: Kamma is anatta?

Content:

Cetanā'ham, bhikkhave, kammaṃ vadāmi. Cetayitvā kammaṃ karoti: kāyena vācāya manasā.

(Nibbedhika Sutta, AN.iii.415)

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an06/an06.063.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 20, 2013 4:11 AM

Title: Re: Daw San Yee (Mrs Saw) Passed Away on Tuesday

Content:

Thanks for this notification, bhante. The centre at Oakenholt was slightly before my time, but I recall meeting Mrs. Saw many times at Dr. Rewata's vihara in Edgbaston and then later when I was an anagarika at Ajahn Khemadhammo's monastery on the Isle of Wight.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 22, 2013 7:50 AM

Title: Re: Is being a cook wrong livelihood?

Content:

The term ‘maṃsavaṇijjā’ means ‘butchery’, but in the traditional sense, not the modern one. Traditionally a butcher’s trade consisted in killing animals and then selling their meat; it is this that is wrong livelihood. Its modern equivalent would be the abattoir business. What we nowadays called a ‘butcher’ is usually just a meat-seller, not an animal-killer. This is not included in wrong livelihood. The same consideration applies to other occupations involved with the subsequent processing of the meat, including your own.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 23, 2013 4:13 AM

Title: Re: How Is Good Kamma Related To Nibbana

Content:

Not according to any of the suttas dealing with the cessation of kamma. The Kammanidāna Sutta, for example:

“Thus, bhikkhus, greed is a source and origin of kamma; hatred is a source and origin of kamma; delusion is a source and origin of kamma. With the destruction of greed, a source of kamma is extinguished. With the destruction of hatred, a source of kamma is extinguished. With the destruction of delusion, a source of kamma is extinguished.”
(AN.v.262, Bh. Bodhi tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 23, 2013 5:36 AM

Title: Re: Can you identify this person on amulet?

Content:

On the left the monk’s name is “Phra Khru Obhāsa- -ānukicca”. The hyphens are the letters that aren’t clear to me. On the right it says that the amulet was made for his 50th birthday.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 24, 2013 4:16 PM

Title: Re: Do people who get murdered deserve it?

Content:

Oh? Do you mean that the statements “Jones’ death by murder was the ripening of a past unwholesome kamma” and “Jones deserved to be murdered” would differ only in their wording, not in their meaning?

Editorial addition:

Consider the following statements, spoken in the aftermath of Mrs. Jones, an old lady, getting beaten to death by muggers:

1. Mrs. Jones' death by murder was the vipāka of a weighty unwholesome kamma performed in a former life.
2. Were it not for that past unwholesome kamma her murder would not have happened, therefore Mrs. Jones only got what she deserved. Her fate was well-merited. She got a taste of her own medicine. It serves the old woman right.
3. Since Mrs. Jones deserved her fate, her muggers were only doing what was right and just and should be commended for it.

If we grant that #1 is true (which we ought), then it seems to me that the only way to avoid the reductio ad absurdum that culminates in #3 is by rejecting #2.

How then do we go about rejecting #2?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 24, 2013 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Do people who get murdered deserve it?

Content:

For those who insist that "Jones' past kamma generated its vipāka" can be equated with "Jones got what she deserved" (a view that's ubiquitous among theosophically-influenced Buddhists and not uncommon among Vajrayanists), the consideration you bring up would no doubt result in a bit of a quandary. They might find themselves at a loss as to whether they should praise the muggers for giving Jones what she deserves or condemn them for breaking the first precept. But though this makes the equating of the two statements problematic, I don't think that in itself it will suffice to show the equation to be just plain wrong.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 24, 2013 7:27 PM

Title: Re: Do people who get murdered deserve it?

Content:

How remarkable. Why do suppose it is that you can't help thinking about what is said in connection with kamma in sutta AN 4.77?

This thread, after all, is not concerned with conjecturing about the detailed working out of kamma-vipāka. It deals with altogether different questions: is it proper that what is called 'vipāka' should be equated with what are called 'just deserts', and if not, why not?

Now why would discussion of this lead you to think of the Acinteyya Sutta? Have you perhaps detected some sign of the thread's contributors being led into vexation and madness?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 24, 2013 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Do people who get murdered deserve it?

Content:

Now at that time a certain monk was a ruminator; he ate ruminating continually. Monks . . . spread it about, saying: "This monk is partaking of a meal at the wrong time."

Then these monks told this matter to the Lord. He said: "Monks, this monk has recently passed on from the womb of a cow. I allow, monks, rumination for a ruminator. But, monks, one should not eat (anything), having brought it back from the mouth to outside of it. Whoever should (so) eat should be dealt with according to the rule. (Vinaya, Cūḷavagga. I.B. Horner trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 24, 2013 11:19 PM

Title: Re: Do people who get murdered deserve it?

Content:

Thank you for clarifying your position. I suspected that this was what you meant, but wanted to know for sure before replying. I'm busy right now, but will post later on why I think this use of 'deserve' is out of place ('undeserved', if you will) in this connection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2013 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Are Theravadins Simpler ?

Content:

You don't seem to understand how things work out here. Let me explain...

1. If you buy a plane ticket for a Buddhist monk from an official Thai International Airways broker, you will be given a 40% discount, but the ticket has to be for business class. If the TIA sales-staff know the ticket is for a monk they won't sell you anything else.
2. If you buy the same from a bucket shop or some other unofficial broker, you'll get no discount but you can have any kind of ticket you want.
3. Thai laypeople buying tickets for monks will commonly calculate whether it's cheaper for them to buy a discounted ticket in business class or an undiscounted one in

economy class. But which of the two they end up buying makes no difference to the monk because...

4. When a monk enters the plane, even if he has an economy-class ticket the TIA cabin crew will still direct him to a seat in the business class. Whenever this has happened to me I didn't get the impression I was being given any choice. I mean they never asked me if I actually wanted to be upgraded; I just found myself upgraded willy-nilly.

5. In recent years some of the airlines from non-Buddhist countries that fly to Thailand have begun to emulate TIA's practice of upgrading monks with economy-class tickets to business class (presumably to boost their image with Thai Buddhist passengers).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2013 6:13 PM

Title: Re: Are Theravadins Simpler ?

Content:

Puggalika-dāna or saṅgha-dāna? If it were the former —an offering that you intended for my personal use— then I would decline it because I don't use suitcases and there's no other monk to whom I could easily give it away. If it were the latter, then I would accept it and hand it over to my monastery's lay stewards. It would then be their responsibility to either barter it for whatever the monastery needs or auction it to pay the bills. Refusing a saṅgha-dāna would be out of the question, unless the gift were something unallowable or the lay donor were under the saṅgha's interdiction. Luxury French suitcases are not unallowable, however much one might wish them to be. (Although in the case of a Louis Vuitton you'd first need to remove the suitcase's pretentious monogram, since it's made out of gold).

Now to continue in this hypothetical vein, suppose I did happen to be a suitcase-using bhikkhu who lacked a suitcase? If you came to me and offered to get me one, and invited me to express some preference, then I would certainly go for something inexpensive. Perhaps a nice sensible product like the Trunki Gruffalo. It's only £39.99 and no reasonable person could deny that it makes a decorous, yet suitably understated, accoutrement for a bhikkhu.

.

Gruffalo_Front_RGB720.jpg (272.16 KiB) Viewed 3233 times

.

But if you made no such invitation and simply brought me a suitcase that you'd selected yourself, I would accept it no matter what sort it was. Whether it was a poncey over-

priced doodah from Paris or a battered old relic that you'd picked up at a jumble sale, or (heaven grant us!) a Trunki Gruffalo, I should accept it with gratitude.

Note that in both of these scenarios my aim would be that of being an easy burden to my lay supporters (subhara) and of light livelihood (sallahukavutti). These are two of the sixteen qualities mentioned by the Buddha in the opening of the Karaṇīyamettā Sutta, upon which the successful practice of mettabhāvanā (and no doubt of bhāvanā in general) depends. In the first scenario I select something cheap so that I don't burden your bank account. In the second I take what you've selected for me so that I don't waste your time (i.e. by requesting you to go back and change the Louis Vuitton for a Gruffalo or whatever).

As for your other hypothetical scenarios, you can just apply the following rubric:

1. Puggalika-dāna and I need it; I accept it.
 - 1.1. If invited I go for inexpensive.
 - 1.2. If not invited I accept what's offered.
2. Puggalika-dāna and I don't need it – I decline it.
3. Saṅgha-dāna – I accept it whether or not I have any personal use for it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2013 6:31 PM

Title: Re: Buddha statues are not idols?..

Content:

I don't think it's terribly weighty. It seems there's a rule against making images of the Buddha in one of the non-Theravādin recensions of the Vinaya (I forget which one). But since it's not found in any other recension it's doubtful whether it was present in the ur-Vinaya.

Then there's the fact that the earliest artistic depictions of the Buddha's life didn't represent the man himself. But this can be (and has been) plausibly accounted for in a number of different theories, of which iconophobic interdiction is only one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2013 6:50 PM

Title: Re: What exactly was the Buddha's teaching on suffering?

Content:

The absence of the lower realms and the human realm would impose a rather drastic limit on how much dukkha-dukkhatā could be experienced, though vipariṇāma-dukkhatā and saṅkhāra-dukkhatā would remain wholly intact. In such a universe I believe the Buddha would still teach, that is, he would still declare the preferability of

bhavanirodha over bhava. On the other hand, I suspect the paucity of dukkha-dukkhatā would mean his following being a great deal smaller than it is in our own universe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2013 7:41 PM

Title: Re: Buddha statues are not idols?..

Content:

Nothing comes to mind. Though that's not really saying much, since I'm rather indifferent to Buddha statues, so if I ever did come across anything about them I'd probably forget it pretty quickly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 27, 2013 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Timezones and the Vinaya

Content:

If the monk understands calculus then he can figure it out from the data on websites like this one:

http://www.howmanyhours.com/flight_time/keflav%C3%ADk/bangkok.php

If he doesn't then he's in shtook. He'll just have to fast.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 27, 2013 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Pali chants to show respect to teachers

Content:

These are the gāthās in popular use in Thailand:

Mother and father

Anantaguṇasampannā, janetti-janakā ubho,
Mayhaṃ mātāpitūnaṃ va, pāde vandāmi sādaraṃ.

http://www.learningthai.com/sound/chanting_04.mp3

Teachers

Pācerācariyā honti, guṇuttarānusāsakā.
Paññāvuḍḍhikaretete, dinnovāde namāmihaṃ.

http://www.learningthai.com/sound/chanting_05.mp3

On the audio files the Pali is followed by a chant in Thai.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 10:11 AM

Title: Re: Pali chants to show respect to teachers

Content:

Mother and father

Anantaḡaṇasampannā, janetti-janakā ubho,
Mayhaṃ mātāpitūnaṃ va, pāde vandāmi sādaraṃ.

anantaḡaṇasampannā – possessed of virtue(s) without limit
janetti-janakā – fathers and mothers (lit. "generators and genetrices")
ubho – both
mayhaṃ – my
mātāpitūnaṃ – mother and father
va – indeclinable particle; no need to translate here
pāde – feet
vandāmi – I salute
sādaraṃ – reverentially

"Both fathers and mothers are possessed of virtues without limit;
I reverentially salute the feet of my mother and father."

I'll do the other one later, if someone else doesn't do it first.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Pali chants to show respect to teachers

Content:

Teachers

Rendering the words in line with the Thai translation, which is expansive rather than literal...

pācerācariyā – primary and secondary school teachers, trainers of apprentices, and college professors
honti – are
ḡuṇuttarāṇusāsakā – instructors in secular disciplines who are of superior virtue
paññāvuḡḡhikareti – causing growth in understanding
ete – these
dinnovāde – who have given advice

namāmi – pay homage to / prostrate to
ahaṃ – I

“Teachers are the exalted transmitters of worldly knowledge and skills.
I pay homage to these advisors who cause understanding to flourish.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 12:56 PM

Title: Re: Access to Insight going static in January

Content:

John Bullitt:

"You can always download the entire website for use on your own personal computer or to repost elsewhere on the web."

Presumably this would permit any interested party to start a new website containing all of ATI's material, but which would still be open to new content.

<http://www.resuscitated-accessstoinsight.org> or whatever.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 2:55 PM

Title: Re: Vietnamese Language

Content:

Một số bài tiểu luận Thích Minh Châu.

<https://www.facebook.com/thichminhchau>

1. Giới thiệu Kinh Tập - Sutta Nipata

<https://tinyurl.com/l4e3dqj>

2. Vai trò của người có trí tuệ trong đạo Phật

<https://tinyurl.com/k4josen>

3. Lần đầu tiên tôi gặp một nhà sư - Tỳ-kheo Bodhi

<https://tinyurl.com/objyyft>

4. Đức Phật của chúng ta

<https://tinyurl.com/pnh8e67>

5. Một bức thư của Thầy Thích Minh Châu

<https://tinyurl.com/p99or24>

Five articles by Thích Minh Châu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 3:10 PM

Title: Re: Access to Insight going static in January

Content:

Already claimed by a company in Chicago, along with the com and the net.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2013 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Access to Insight going static in January

Content:

No, I don't think I'm the man for the job, Chownah. My memory's been deteriorating in recent years, and in any case, only a rather small proportion of the translations there are agreeable to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2013 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Are there any suttas dealing with death of loved one?

Content:

What a lot of twaddle. Thai peasants grieve just like anyone else. They just do their weeping in private and keep a stiff upper lip at the funeral or when monks are visiting their home.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2013 3:47 AM

Title: Re: Are there any suttas dealing with death of loved one?

Content:

As far as I know, Ajahn Brahmavamso didn't spend much time as a layman in Thailand, and as a forest monk it's unlikely he would have had much intimate acquaintance with the domestic lives of Thai laity. But even so, I find his radical "othering" of Thai people thoroughly bizarre.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2013 9:59 AM

Title: Re: Activism, violence and inner peace...

Content:

From within Buddhism, this:

<http://www.accesstosight.org/tipitaka/an/an05/an05.057.than.html>

(especially the reflection on ownership of kamma).

And from without, this:

<http://classics.mit.edu/Epictetus/epicench.html>

(especially the first four paragraphs).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2013 12:19 PM

Title: Re: His Holiness the Supreme Patriarch dies

Content:

The Thai Saṅgharāja's official title is six lines long, but nothing in it would literally translate as 'Supreme Patriarch' or 'His Holiness'.

somdet.jpg (69.72 KiB) Viewed 2036 times

“Somdet Phra Nāṇasaṃvara Paramanariśradharmanītibhipāla
Ariyavaṃśāgatañāṇavimala Sakalamahāsaṅghapariṇāyaka Tripiṭakapariyattidhātā
Visuddhacariyādhisampati Suvaḍḍhanabhīdhānaśaṅghavisuta Pāvacanuttambisāra
Sukhumadharmavidhāna Damrong Vajirañāṇavaṃśavivaḍha
Buddhapariśadagāraṇasathāna Vicitrapaṭibhāṇavaḍḍhanagaṇa
Vipulasilācāravatrasundara Pavaradharmapavitra Sarvagaṇiśramahāpadhānādhipatī
Gāmvāsī Araṇyavāsī Somdet Phra Saṅgharāja.”

'Supreme Patriarch' is just a very free translation of 'Phra Saṅgharāja'. As for 'His Holiness', I once learned from an unreliable source that it was first coined by the United Nations, who applied it to the Pope. Later it was extended to the Dalai Lama, and later still to clerical bigwigs of all sorts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2013 3:23 PM

Title: Re: Eradicating sex drive

Content:

No. The texts state that it isn't a Vinaya offence when a bhikkhu has a nocturnal

emission, but whether or not an arahant can have one was a disputed point in early Buddhism. The Theravadins sided with the anti-snoregasm camp.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 31, 2013 2:08 PM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

When there's a gathering of saṅgha bigwigs, he can sit on the poshest seat in the house, while making use of all the following paraphernalia of office (เครื่องยศประกอบพระอิสริยยศ):

- พัดยศสมเด็จพระสังฆราช
- พระแท่นภายใต้เศวตฉัตร 3 ชั้น
- บาตร พร้อมฝาบาตร เชิงบาตรถมปิด
- พานพระศรี ถมปิด
- ชันน้ำและพานรอง ถมปิด
- คอนโหล ถมปิด
- พระสุพรรณศรี ถมปิด
- พระสุพรรณราช ถมปิด
- หีบตราพระจักรี ถมปิด
- ปิ่นทรงกลม 4 ชั้น ถมปิด
- กาหรงกระบอก ถมปิด
- หม้อลักจั่น ถมปิด
- กระโถน ถมปิด

I don't know what most of these items would be called in English, but you can look them up in Google images if you want to see what they are.

But as for the man's actual power, like most substantive power in Thailand it lies principally in access, rather than in the official documents listing what his office entitles him to do. As Patriarch he has a hotline to royalty, politicians, senior civil servants, police chiefs, and numerous other influential figures in Thai society. When he contacts these people asking for favours, he can be fairly confident that they're not going to turn him down unless they're subject to some more pressing imperative (e.g. when the late Sangharaja ordered the abbot of Wat Dhammakaya to disrobe, nothing came of it because the latter had more powerful politicians etc. in his pocket than the Sangharaja did. But it's unlikely any other monk in Thailand would have been able to ignore such a directive from the Sangharaja).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 31, 2013 6:51 PM

Title: Re: We need new rules

Content:

It can be declared, but hardly "without fear of contradiction". It's been contradicted, for example, by Alexis Sanderson, Britain's foremost academic authority on Buddhist and Shaivite tantric systems.

<http://www.alexissanderson.com>

And what does Rudy Harderwijk think he's doing when he cites Benoytosh Bhattacharyya as an authority? I'd never even heard of the man until now. It turns out all his work is pre-WW II.

The Indian Buddhist Iconography. Oxford 1924
Sadhanamala. Band 1 Barode 1925, Band 2 Baroda 1928
Two Vajrayana Works. Baroda 1929
Guhyasamaja Tantra. Baroda 1928
An Introduction to Buddhist Esoterism. Baroda 1931

There's scarcely any buddhological scholarship from this period that can be wholly trusted.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 31, 2013 7:28 PM
Title: Re: We need new rules
Content:

I think that to prove your point you will need to show evidence that Tantrists have either attachment to, or misapprehension of, sīla and/or vata. I don't know whether they do or not, but the mere fact that they perform rituals won't suffice to show that they do.

The meal-time anumodanā of Theravādin monks, for example, is a ritual, yet the Buddha himself is reported to have performed it.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 1, 2013 7:59 AM
Title: Re: Thai words in Thanissaro dhamma talk
Content:

rajabatsat - ราชบัณฑิตยสถาน - Ratchabanditayasathan, the Royal Academy [Dictionary of Thai].

ju / jum- จำ - jam

gunho - กำหนด - kamnod

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 1, 2013 5:18 PM

Title: Re: We need new rules

Content:

“Your [Jacobin] literary men, and your politicians ... essentially differ in these points. They have no respect for the wisdom of others; but they pay it off by a very full measure of confidence in their own. With them it is a sufficient motive to destroy an old scheme of things, because it is an old one. As to the new, they are in no sort of fear with regard to the duration of a building run up in haste; because duration is no object to those who think little or nothing has been done before their time, and who place all their hopes in discovery. They conceive, very systematically, that all things which give perpetuity are mischievous, and therefore they are at inexorable war with all establishments.”

— Edmund Burke, Reflections on the Revolution in France

Non-Decline

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Rājagaha on Mount Vulture Peak. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus:

“Bhikkhus, I will teach you seven principles of non-decline. Listen and attend closely. I will speak.”

“Yes, Bhante,” those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

“And what, bhikkhus, are the seven principles of non-decline?”

(1) “As long as the bhikkhus assemble often and hold frequent assemblies, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(2) “As long as the bhikkhus assemble in harmony, adjourn in harmony, and conduct the affairs of the Saṅgha in harmony, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(3) “As long as the bhikkhus do not decree anything that has not been decreed or abolish anything that has already been decreed, but undertake and follow the training rules as they have been decreed, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(4) “As long as the bhikkhus honor, respect, esteem, and venerate those bhikkhus who are elders, of long standing, long gone forth, fathers and guides of the Saṅgha, and think they should be heeded, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(5) “As long as the bhikkhus do not come under the control of arisen craving that leads to renewed existence, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(6) “As long as the bhikkhus are intent on forest lodgings, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

(7) “As long as the bhikkhus each individually establish mindfulness [with the intention]: ‘How can well-behaved fellow monks who have not yet come here come, and how can

well-behaved fellow monks who are already here dwell at ease?’ only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.

“Bhikkhus, as long as these seven principles of non-decline continue among the bhikkhus, and the bhikkhus are seen [established] in them, only growth is to be expected for them, not decline.”

(A. iv. 21-2, Bhikkhu Bodhi tr.)

In point #3 “what has been decreed” (paññattaṃ) refers to Vinaya ordinances of every sort, whether prohibitions, allowances or procedural regulations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 1, 2013 9:36 PM

Title: Re: We need new rules

Content:

In a sense this is already permitted and practised.

In the injunction against creating new ordinances or abolishing existing ones, the term (paññatti) indicates that the disapproved conduct is that of attempting to add to or subtract from the canonical Vinaya corpus binding upon the whole of the monastic sangha. It does not, however, preclude the establishment of in-house rules binding only upon the monks residing in the monastery that establishes them. These are called 'decisions' (katikā) and the sangha has been making them from very early days. We know this because one of the rules about appropriate conduct for a visiting monk is that when he first arrives in a monastery he should enquire of the resident monks concerning the katikā that are in force in that community.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 2, 2013 7:53 AM

Title: Re: We need new rules

Content:

It's a false problem you're raising. In practice if a woman goes to coenobitical monastery to be taught, there'll always be other monks or novices who can sit with the monk who is teaching her. If she goes to an eremitical residence or to a thudong monk camping in the forest, then she will make a point of taking a chaperone with her. If she neglects to do so, or if no suitable chaperone is available, she may still be taught, albeit in brief.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 2, 2013 1:34 PM

Title: Re: We need new rules

Content:

There's no universal standard regarding homosexual monks; it's up to each monastery to set its own policy. In Thailand most at present don't have any particular policy at all. Of those that do, the policies are rather varied. Some wats, for example, will simply refuse residence to homosexual monks (e.g. Wat Suan Mokkh and other Buddhādāsa-influenced wats). Some wats will place homosexual monks in different sections of the wat to segregate them from each other and prevent the formation of a gay clique and a <http://www.nationalreview.com/articles/207326/one-and-many/john-derbyshire/> kind of scenario, wherein the clique effectively hijacks the monastery. In recent years such segregation has become a common practice in some of the larger Bangkok monasteries. Some wats will limit the number of homosexuals of the very flamboyant type; the presence of one or two such monks in a wat is no problem, but when you get a whole bunch of 'screaming queens' it becomes disruptive as they're always competing with each other to be the centre of attention.

But as for the 7th pācittiya rule, I've never heard of it being applied in the manner you describe. The closest I've come across was a Bangkok wat where homosexual monks were instructed not to enter the rooms of temple boys or teenage sāmaṇeras or be seen fraternising with them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 3, 2013 5:03 AM

Title: Re: Ajaan Fuang's date of ordination? + other teachers' date

Content:

Ajahns Lee and Sujāto need re-checking. The former died rather young, some time in the 50's or 60's. I don't know exactly when Sujāto was born but it can't have been 1964 as he's several years younger than me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 3, 2013 12:40 PM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

Where is it stated that this can be done? Are you referring to some deviant folk practice or to something authorised in the Pali Vinaya texts?

The only thing remotely like this that I've come across is not related to accepting money, but to the procedure for getting rid of money that a bhikkhu has accepted and then forfeited.

If [the trustworthy layman] does not get rid of it, they are to choose one of the bhikkhus present as the "money-disposer," by means of the transaction statement — one motion and one announcement (ñatti-dutiya-kamma) — given in Appendix VI. The money-disposer must be free of the four forms of bias — based on desire, aversion, delusion, or fear — and must know when money is properly disposed of and when it is not. His duty is to throw the money away without taking note of where it falls. If he does take note, he

incurs a dukkaṭa. The Commentary recommends that, "Closing his eyes, he should throw it into a river, over a cliff, or into a jungle thicket without paying attention to where it falls, disinterested as if it were a bodily secretion (gūthaka)."

Ven. Thanissaro, Buddhist Monastic Code ch. 7.2

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2013 4:06 AM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

In the Vinaya Piṭaka the better sort bhikkhus are consistently presented as treating them as sacrosanct. For example, when a situation arises where the original formulation of a training rule proves unwieldy in some way and brings about some inconvenience or discomfort, the monks who possess a sense of shame will continue to observe the rule in its original form, enduring the resulting inconveniences, until the Buddha issues an amendment. We don't find them indulging in any presumptuous second-guessing of the Buddha's wishes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2013 4:22 AM

Title: Re: The only farang (mae chi) in the temple

Content:

What a depressing article. The toe-rag of a journalist should be reprimanded for taking unfair advantage of the mentally subnormal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2013 4:54 PM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

And do your Chinese sources (whether Vinaya or the DA version of the Parinibbāna Sutta) say "may rescind the lesser and minor rules" or "should rescind..."?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2013 5:39 PM

Title: Re: After Warder

Content:

I would suggest you start by studying Charles Duroiselle's <http://www.pratyeka.org/duroiselle///> and (if you can get hold of them) the second and third parts of A.P. Buddhadatta's Pali Course. If you want to read Jātakas or the Dhammapada Atthakathā, then besides Tilt's recommendation you should also

download De Silva's textbook from the same website as Duroiselle's — it's a good aid to building the vocabulary that you'll need for these works.

Then read well-translated texts alongside the original Pali. Minor Readings and Illustrator —Ñāṇamoli's translation of the Khuddakapāṭha and its commentary— is a great one to start with. Another good one is Dispeller of Delusion, Ñāṇamoli's translation of the Sammohavinodanī (Vibhaṅga Atthakathā). And when you can't figure out what's going on and how on earth the translator renders some passage the way he does, post your queries here or go pay a visit to the monks at your nearest Sri Lankan or Burmese vihāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 7:19 AM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

Presumably you are referring here to the corpus of Vinaya texts as a whole (canon, commentary, subcommentary) and not to the Vinaya Piṭaka. In the latter the Ceylonese input (as far as we know) is confined to sixteen verses in the Parivāra (the last book of the Piṭaka to be closed) listing prominent figures in the ordination paramparā from the Buddha's disciple Upāli to the Ceylonese Vinaya master Siva Thera. The Vinaya Piṭaka's rules don't show any sign of 'massaging' at such a late period.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 9:37 AM

Title: Re: The only farang (mae chi) in the temple

Content:

It sometimes happens that no action is taken, but I don't know if this is common or not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 9:39 AM

Title: Re: The only farang (mae chi) in the temple

Content:

I meant 'mentally subnormal' in the strictly clinical sense. In my opinion it's not possible for a woman raised in the west to adopt a set of beliefs like Margo Somboon's unless her critical faculty has atrophied to the point where she has no more capacity for evaluating truth-claims than a wide-eyed six-year-old child.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 10:38 AM

Title: Re: The only farang (mae chi) in the temple

Content:

Words aimed at hurting another's feelings would be harsh speech (pharusā vācā), while those aimed at provoking disaffection in one person or group towards another person or group would be divisive speech (pisuṇā vācā). Both of these would be wrong speech. My own words, however, were intended as a diagnosis, and were not communicated with the aim of hurting anyone or provoking disaffection in anyone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 10:41 AM

Title: Re: The only farang (mae chi) in the temple

Content:

They are common in Thailand, but not mainstream. It's chiefly among the urban Chinese commercial class that one meets with the belief that an adulterer or adultress will be reborn a fixed number of times in hell, then so many times as a 'ladyboy', then so many times as a woman, etc. A popular form of merit-making among these people is to publish free-distribution cartoon books illustrating this rather naïve conception of kammavipāka and appealing to readers who've acted immorally to repent, pray to Kuan Yin and perform deeds of merit (such as sponsoring more copies of the book!). Among elderly Thai ladies of little education these books seem to be roughly the equivalent of Mills & Boon and other chicklit romance stories in their popularity and addictiveness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 11:11 AM

Title: Re: World Chess Championship 2013

Content:

<http://cs.boisestate.edu/~amit/teaching/430/articles/deepblue296.html//>

"Getting a chess machine to learn from its own mistakes is an appealing idea. It has been tried in the past, but with limited success. "The problem," Campbell explains, "is that when you lose a game, the machine doesn't know what move was the wrong one. It could have been the fourth move or the next-to-last, so it doesn't know what move it has to correct, and determining the reason for the loss and generalizing it to other positions is even more difficult."

In contrast, Deep Blue has no learning ability once its values are chosen by its programmers; it carries out exactly the evaluations hardwired into it. So, in any dictionary definition, as well as in the eyes of its creators, Deep Blue has no intelligence at all."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2013 1:27 PM

Title: Re: After Warder

Content:

Commentarial. The passages for translation in Buddhadatta's works are drawn primarily (though not exclusively) from the Jātaka Atthakathā. Duroiselle's work is likewise based on the Sanskrit-influenced grammar of the commentaries. Having said that, even those not interested in the commentaries would do well to at least read chapter xiv, which is by far the best overview of Pali syntax in English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2013 12:48 AM

Title: Re: After Warder

Content:

It's a fine translation and would be worth using for the stated purpose. However, if one wanted to begin with some commentary to suttas in the first four Nikāyas, those of Bhikkhu Bodhi to the Brahmajāla, Mahānidāna, Sāmaññaphala and Mūlapariyāya Suttas are available at a fraction of the price.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2013 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

I clicked on the link...

W. Pachow, A Comparative Study of the Prātimokṣa: On the Basis of Its Chinese, Tibetan, Sanskrit, and Pāli Versions

And then I scrolled down a little...

Related Books

Lewis Carroll, Alice in Wonderland

William Shakespeare, As You Like It

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2013 4:49 PM

Title: New Book on Buddhaghosa

Content:

Looks interesting.

Maria Heim, The Forerunner of All Things: Buddhaghosa on Mind, Intention, and Agency

<https://www.amazon.com/The-Forerunner-All-Things-Buddhaghosa/dp/0199331049>

Publisher's blurb...

Scholars have long been intrigued by the Buddha's defining action (karma) as intention. This book explores systematically how intention and agency were interpreted in all genres of early Theravada thought. It offers a philosophical exploration of intention and motivation as they are investigated in Buddhist moral psychology. At stake is how we understand karma, the nature of moral experience, and the possibilities for freedom.

In contrast to many studies that assimilate Buddhist moral thinking to Western theories of ethics, the book attends to distinctively Buddhist ways of systematizing and theorizing their own categories. Arguing that meaning is a product of the explanatory systems used to explore it, the book pays particular attention to genre and to the 5th-century commentator Buddhaghosa's guidance on how to read Buddhist texts. The book treats all branches of the Pali canon (the Tipitaka, that is, the Suttas, the Abhidhamma, and the Vinaya), as well as narrative sources (the Dhammapada and the Jataka commentaries). In this sense it offers a comprehensive treatment of intention in the canonical Theravada sources. But the book goes further than this by focusing explicitly on the body of commentarial thought represented by Buddhaghosa. His work is at the center of the book's investigations, both insofar as he offers interpretative strategies for reading canonical texts, but also as he advances particular understandings of agency and moral psychology. The book offers the first book-length study devoted to Buddhaghosa's thought on ethics.

From the reviews...

"This book will be a major contribution to scholarship in Buddhist Studies, as well as to the discipline of moral psychology more generally. The scholarship is impeccable, the attention to canonical material and secondary literature in Buddhist Studies as well as to relevant work in Western philosophy and social theory is meticulous. The book is rich in hermeneutical and philosophical insight, carefully argued, and written with uncommon perspicuity, grace and even humor I would not be surprised if it were to be recognized as one of the most significant recent contributions to Buddhist philosophy."

— Jay L. Garfield, Kwan Im Thong Hood Cho Temple Professor of Humanities, Yale-NUS College

"Throughout this original, humane, and often beautiful exploration of Buddhist moral thinking, Maria Heim allows herself to be taught and guided by the great Buddhist thinker Buddhaghosa about how to read Buddhist texts well and how to think reflectively about the nature of a moral person. The result is that we are introduced to a Buddhaghosa that we have not met before: an astute humanist always alert to the complexities of the moral life, and a contemporary with us, as it were, offering us fresh resources for our own efforts to make sense of ourselves as moral persons."

— Charles Hallisey, Harvard Divinity School

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2013 5:31 PM

Title: Re: prostrations in theravada

Content:

It depends on the monastery; some places are very formal, some are not. "When you enter a land of squinters, squint with them." (That's the Thai version of "when in Rome...").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2013 1:27 PM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

But not very convincingly. You cite the Mahīśāsakas' account of the origin of the alcohol prohibition. This version agrees with the Theravādin one in that both of them depict Bhikṣu Svāgata as requesting alcohol from the grateful laity. If these versions are to be trusted then you might have a case. However, earlier in the article you've shot yourself in the foot by expressing a preference for the Mahāsaṅghikas' account:

We can thus assume that the Mahāsaṅghika Vinaya ... is the earlier version and likely better reflects the original narrative concerning the incident which led to the Buddha prohibiting alcohol consumption.

Yet prima facie the Mahāsaṅghika version seems to contradict your claim. It reports that Bhikṣu Svāgata drank the alcohol thinking that it was water. The clear implication here is that he would not have drunk it had he known what it really was (else why bother drawing attention to the bhikṣu's mistake?).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2013 4:40 PM

Title: Re: New Book on Buddhaghosa

Content:

His works are the central and primary commentarial source, and especially so in the case of the Visuddhimagga. Many times in his commentaries to the Suttas Buddhaghosa will present a topic in summary form and then direct the reader to the Visuddhimagga for a more complete exposition.

As to whether Buddhaghosa's works are considered reliable, obviously this depends on who is doing the considering. The mediaeval view within the Theravāda (so far as this can be ascertained from ṭīkāś and other tertiary texts) might be summarised thus:

- The contents of his two Vinaya commentaries (Sāmantāpāsādikā and Kaṅkhāvitaraṇī) were a perennial subject of dissent and squabbling among Vinaya scholars.
- Some of the ideas in his Abhidhamma commentaries met with dissent from one quarter or another, though far less so than with the Vinaya commentaries.
- His Visuddhimagga and Nikāya commentaries appear to have been wholly uncontroversial.

As for the profusion of modern opinions on the commentaries' value, I think there are

already a number of threads where this has been discussed to death.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2013 11:13 PM

Title: Re: New Book on Buddhaghosa

Content:

These haven't been translated into English. Ven. Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code, available from ATI, will give you some idea of the vinayaic points of controversy in the mediaeval period.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 8, 2013 4:19 AM

Title: Re: Seek for Self?

Content:

Yes.

Ven. Thanissaro is following the commentators who take the 'sam-' part of words like 'sambodha', 'sambodhi', 'sambuddha', 'sambujjhati', etc. to be a shortened form of 'sāmaṃ' or 'sayam', meaning 'by oneself'.

Bhikkhu Bodhi is following modern scholars who take it to be 'saṃ-', a usually untranslatable intensifying prefix, here indicating completion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 8, 2013 5:08 AM

Title: Re: Schopen: Buddha as Businessman?

Content:

"The Teacher, Bhaddāli, does not make known a training rule for disciples until certain things that are the basis for āsavas become manifest here in the saṅgha; but when certain things that are the basis for āsavas become manifest here in the saṅgha, then the Teacher makes known a training rule for disciples in order to ward off those things that are the basis for āsavas."

(Bhaddāli Sutta)

The Vinaya parallel, addressed to Sāriputta, adds the phrase "does not appoint a Pātimokkha."

The first phrase means that the Buddha doesn't begin laying down any rules at all until some event necessitates it. The actual event that led to this was the monk Sudinna having sexual intercourse, leading to the laying down of the first pārājika training rule.

The second phrase means that he doesn't establish the full code all at once.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 8, 2013 12:01 PM

Title: Re: Monks can create art, but not Music?

Content:

Unless one counts the Buddha's allowance for bhikkhus to paint the walls of their huts with floral or geometrical patterns, there is no actually no positive allowance to engage in any of the creative arts. There is merely the absence of a prohibition.

Except of course for music and dancing, for whereas painting watercolours and writing poems can be done in silence and without bothering one's co-residents, music is noise-making and noise is a thorn.

“Good, good, bhikkhus! Those great disciples spoke rightly when they said that I have called noise a thorn to the jhānas. There are, bhikkhus, these ten thorns. What ten? Delight in company is a thorn to one who delights in solitude. Pursuit of an attractive object is a thorn to one intent on meditation on the mark of the unattractive. An unsuitable show is a thorn to one guarding the doors of the sense faculties. Keeping company with women is a thorn to the celibate life. Noise is a thorn to the first jhāna. Thought and examination are a thorn to the second jhāna. Rapture is a thorn to the third jhāna. In-and-out breathing is a thorn to the fourth jhāna. Perception and feeling are a thorn to the attainment of the cessation of perception and feeling. Lust is a thorn, hatred is a thorn, and delusion is a thorn. Dwell thornless, bhikkhus! Dwell without thorns! The arahants are thornless. The arahants are without thorns. The arahants are thornless and without thorns.”

(Kaṇṭaka Sutta)

“Bhikkhus, in the Vinaya of the noble ones, singing is wailing, dancing is madness, and laughing excessively, displaying one's teeth, is infantile. Therefore, bhikkhus, demolish the bridge that leads to singing, demolish the bridge that leads to dancing, and when rejoicing in the Dhamma you may simply show a smile.”

(Ruṇṇa Sutta)

“Bhikkhus, there is a country in the south named Dhovana [‘Washing’], where there is food, drink, victuals, comestibles, refreshments, tonics, dancing, singing, and music. There is this ‘Washing,’ bhikkhus; that I do not deny. Yet this ‘Washing’ is low, common, for worldlings, ignoble, unbeneficial; it does not lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to peace, to direct knowledge, to enlightenment, to nibbāna.”

(Dhovana Sutta)

Then the wanderer Sandaka saw the venerable Ānanda coming in the distance. Seeing him, he quieted his own assembly thus: “Sirs, be quiet; sirs, make no noise. Here comes

the samaṇa Ānanda, a disciple of the samaṇa Gotama, one of the samaṇa Gotama's disciples staying in Kosambī. These venerable ones like quiet; they are disciplined in quiet; they commend quiet. Perhaps if he finds our assembly a quiet one, he will think to join us." Then the wanderers became silent.

(Sandaka Sutta)

Then one of those deities sang, one danced, and one snapped her fingers. Just as, when a musical quintet is well trained and its rhythm well coordinated, and it is composed of skilled musicians, its music is exquisite, tantalizing, lovely, captivating, and intoxicating, just so those deities' performance was exquisite, tantalizing, lovely, captivating, and intoxicating. Thereupon the Venerable Anuruddha drew in his sense faculties. Then those deities, [thinking:] "Master Anuruddha is not enjoying [this]," disappeared right on the spot.

(Anuruddha Sutta)

"As long as they live the arahants abstain from dancing, singing, instrumental music, and unsuitable shows, and from adorning and beautifying themselves by wearing garlands and applying scents and unguents."

(Uposatha Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 8, 2013 3:24 PM

Title: Re: Voluntary Euthanasia

Content:

John Keown (brother of Damien Keown, the writer on Buddhist ethics) devotes six chapters of his book <https://www.amazon.com/Euthanasia-Ethics-Public-Policy-Legalisation/dp/0521009332/> to the Dutch experience, showing in meticulous detail that a slippery slide from VAE to NVAE is exactly what has happened in the Netherlands. The Dutch authorities have exhibited masterful ingenuity in the statistical concealment of the slide ("...the Dutch situation is a regulatory Potemkin village, a great facade hiding non-enforcement"), but there's no doubt at all that it's happened. Moreover, an additional side-effect has been the decline in palliative care for the terminally ill in the Netherlands: why bother when you can just snuff 'em?

[The Dutch Ambassador to Britain] continued that patients in Dutch hospitals were provided with 'excellent palliative or terminal care' and that 'In medical student training, much attention is focussed on sedatives and palliative care'. The Ambassador cited no evidence to support either of these assertions. They sit uneasily with Dutch research indicating that the pain of a high proportion of cancer patients is inadequately treated, with the recognition by the Remmelink Commission that Dutch doctors lacked expertise in palliative care, and with the views of the leading Dutch hospice doctor, Dr Zyllic.

Dr Zylic recently wrote that 'Palliative care is virtually unknown in Holland'. He added: 'Almost seventy percent of physicians in the Netherlands have been involved in euthanasia of some sort. Yet there is virtually no training in treating dying patients and coping with the impending death. None of the medical schools offer any thorough training for their young students. It is unbelievable how we deny the importance of such training.' He continued: 'we see poor symptom control among physicians', and 'we see cases frequently enough of ignorance about palliative care that are causes of profound concern'. 'Euthanasia', he argued, 'should never be seen as an alternative to good care. It was never meant to be this in Holland. It originated at the end of such care, when all else failed. But today it is growing to be seen as an alternative to the more difficult task of caring for the dying.'

Attached is the last of the six chapters:

Chapter 13: The Dutch in Denial?

[./download/file.php?id=2076](#)
(95.31 KiB) Downloaded 102 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2013 7:42 AM

Title: Re: Refuge

Content:

This kind of vow-talk is a Tibetan way of conceiving the precepts, based, I believe, on the Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma. The Theravāda doesn't conceive of the precepts (sikkhāpada; śikṣāpada) as mysterious meme-like entities that are somehow preserved in lineages and which a person can be said to "have taken" or "to be keeping" only if they've been magically transmitted to him by a suitably qualified "lineage-holder".

In the Theravādin conception you can resolve to undertake the precepts all by yourself. And if you break one then you can re-take it all by yourself, by recognising the fault and resolving to exercise greater restraint in future.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2013 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Refuge

Content:

I agree, bhante.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2013 1:03 PM

Title: Re: Identify this chant for me?

Content:

'Om' is composed of the sounds a, u and m, which in certain late-Pali verse compositions serve as mnemonics for Saṅgha, Buddha and Dhamma respectively.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 10, 2013 3:15 AM

Title: Re: Reading Pali Sentences

Content:

The same as that used by old-fashioned Latin teachers:

<https://www.dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=23&t=14281//>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 10, 2013 3:28 AM

Title: Re: After Warder

Content:

The second volume —the glossary— is available online:

<https://ia600407.us.archive.org/32/items/cu31924071132082/cu31924071132082.pdf>

It seems that the work is now out of copyright.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 29, 2013 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Fifteen talks given by Bhikkhu Bodhi during his 2013 Abhidhamma Retreat have been uploaded to youtube:

<https://www.youtube.com/user/bauscym/videos>

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 29, 2013 8:17 PM

Title: Re: After Warder

Content:

But whose opacity may be readily dispelled by consulting Wikipedia's fine entries for linguistic topics:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_phonetics_topics

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Linguistic_morphology

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_cases

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_tenses

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_voices

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_moods

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_gender

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Grammatical_number

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Category:Syntax>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 3:26 AM

Title: Re: What's the point of jhana?

Content:

I don't think their respective statements are in conflict. Bhikkhu Bodhi is using 'jhāna' in the sense of the states of meditative absorption (the four rūpajjhānas), while Ven. Thanissaro is using it in its broader Sutta sense, where it is virtually synonymous with bhāvanā and encompasses the full range of activities involved in mental development.

In the Suttas the sense in which Bhikkhu Bodhi is using the noun 'jhāna' is its primary sense, while Thanissaro's use is a secondary one. But with the verb 'jhāyati' it's the other way around. Now it's the sense of mental development in general (i.e. of both calm and insight) that becomes primary, while the narrower sense of 'to enter one of the absorptions' becomes secondary (and of rather uncommon occurrence in the Suttas).

For this reason I think the rendering of "Jhāyatha, bhikkhave!" as "Bhikkhus, go do jhāna!" is apt to be tendentious and misleading, inasmuch as the noun jhāna will be likely to be construed in the narrower of the two senses when in fact it's the broader one that is more often intended.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 6:46 AM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism (and not Jainism etc) die out in India?

Content:

In the case of Jainism, its survival is largely attributable to its very strict teachings on *nyāyopattadhana*, the Jain version of right livelihood. Since the Jains held that even unintentional activities generate karma, they sought to avoid not only those modes of livelihood that ineluctably and always cause harm, but also any which might do so only incidentally or occasionally.

From Christopher Capple's Jainism and Ecology:

livelihood.jpg (175.92 KiB) Viewed 4181 times

Eventually Jains came to largely eschew agriculture in all its forms and to specialise chiefly in mercantile occupations, with the most favoured ones being jewellery-making and money-lending (I believe this is still the case today; the Indian banking system, for example, was at its inception largely a Jain creation). The Jains became very accomplished in these two fields and ended up doing rather well for themselves.

Now in Muslim conquests everywhere, one recurrent feature is that the wealthiest people in the population are not encouraged to convert to Islam, for it's more profitable to let them keep their own religion and then compel them to pay the infidels' tax. And so since the richest people in India happened to be the Jains, their conquerors turned a blind eye to their 'idolatry' and didn't go out of their way to make Muslims of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 4:50 PM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism (and not Jainism etc) die out in India?

Content:

I think the typical lay Jain doesn't entertain any serious expectations of becoming a kevalin/arhat in the present life and so is little concerned with developing *aparigraha* or the other characteristic qualities valued in Jain asceticism (with the exception of *ahiṃsā*, which is a major concern for layman and renunciate alike). Like many a lay Buddhist, the Jain layman's chief activity is providing material support to his religion's ascetic virtuosos, thereby acquiring merit and participating vicariously in the ascetics' successes, with his own success being postponed to some future life. For someone with such an outlook getting rich wouldn't be perceived as a problem and might even be regarded as a benefit in that a rich man can offer more bountiful support than a poor man.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 5:59 PM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism (and not Jainism etc) die out in India?

Content:

In my first post I limited myself to the issue of how Jainism survived Islam. How it survived absorption into Hinduism and why Indian Buddhism failed to do so is another question. The attached article by the prakritist and Jain scholar P.S. Jaini proposes four reasons:

1. The Buddhist sangha, unlike Jain monastics, were neglectful of the laity.
2. Buddhist polemicists, unlike those of Jainism, responded ineffectually to the rise of the Hindu devotional movements and so failed to prevent desertion of the laity into the bhakti fold.
3. On account of its anattā doctrine Buddhism elicited greater hostility from proponents of Hindu orthodoxy than did Jainism (which had a soul theory of its own).
4. The eclipsing of the Buddha's importance subsequent to the rise of the Mahāyāna's cult of mythical Bodhisattvas, and the absence of any analogous degeneration in Jainism.

P.S. Jaini, The disappearance of Buddhism and the survival of Jainism: a study in contrast

[./download/file.php?id=2120](#)

(303.62 KiB) Downloaded 111 times

I have had to split the file into three because of its size. This is the first part.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 6:00 PM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism (and not Jainism etc) die out in India?

Content:

Second part.

[./download/file.php?id=2121](#)

(345.98 KiB) Downloaded 104 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2013 6:01 PM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism (and not Jainism etc) die out in India?

Content:

Third part.

[./download/file.php?id=2122](#)

(354 KiB) Downloaded 93 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 2, 2013 4:16 AM

Title: Re: What's the point of jhana?

Content:

“And what, friends, is right concentration? Here, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first absorption (jhāna), which is accompanied by applied and sustained thought, with rapture and pleasure born of seclusion. With the stilling of applied and sustained thought, he enters upon and abides in the second absorption (jhāna) ... etc.”

Here ‘jhāna’ in its narrow sense is identified with sammāsamādhi.

“Jhāyatha, bhikkhave, mā pamādattha!”

“Bhikkhus, meditate, don’t be negligent!”

In this context ‘jhāyatha’ (the verb concerned usually with jhāna in its broader sense) is glossed in the commentaries as “samathañca vipassanañca vaḍḍhetha!” — “Make calm and insight grow!” Here sammāsamādhi is included within ‘jhāna’.

In Dhammapada 372 we have an example of the noun ‘jhāna’ in its broad sense:

“There is no meditation (jhāna) for one who is without wisdom, no wisdom for one who is not meditating (ajhāyato). He in whom there are meditation (jhāna) and wisdom, is indeed close to nibbāna.”

(translation: K.R. Norman)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 2, 2013 4:32 AM

Title: Re: What's the point of jhana?

Content:

I think modern teachers' choice of words is influenced by the fact that in the texts the

Suttas' 'bhāvanā' and the Atthakathās' 'kammaṭṭhāna' are used far more often than the noun 'jhāna' in its broad sense. An additional reason, specific to Thailand, is that the noun 'chaan' (Thai pronunciation of 'jhāna') is popularly associated with the sort of trance states that mediums and shamans go into. And so some teachers will avoid the word jhāna because they want to distance themselves from such déclassé associations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 2, 2013 4:51 AM

Title: Re: Monasticism and parental permission

Content:

I don't know what the policy is at Wat Bananas, but at most Thai wats they will just take your word for it (that is, if they even bother to ask you about it). At the few which require evidence a letter from your parents will suffice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 2, 2013 6:39 PM

Title: Re: Non-Mahavihara Theravada?

Content:

There are plenty of Theravādins holding to notions that happen to parallel those which the Kathāvatthu Commentary attributes to this or that long-extinct school. For example, Mahāsaṅghika-like ideas about the nature of the Buddha can be found in the Thai forest tradition. But I haven't yet heard of anyone knowingly embracing Mahāsaṅghika doctrines after studying them. This has happened, however, with the Sammitiyas, Vatsīputriyas and other pudgalavādin schools. Their pudgala doctrine was famously revived in Germany by Georg Grimm and his following and in Ceylon by the Pali scholar Rev. A.P. Buddhadatta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2013 6:17 AM

Title: Re: Non-Mahavihara Theravada?

Content:

I don't know. There are certainly Theravadin teachers who are given to expressing themselves in a manner that suggests they may subscribe to such ideas. Some of the monks (and nearly all of the nuns) who've had a long-term association with Ajahn Sumedho come to mind. But the general want of clarity in the Dhamma talks of these people makes it hard to say for sure if this is really what they mean.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2013 7:03 AM

Title: Re: anyone know about Sri Lanka?

Content:

When a junior bhikkhu seeks to make contact with other bhikkhus (as opposed to, say, drinking pals, Boston Red Sox fans or whatever) would it not be more charitable to assume that his aim is kalyānamittatā, not delighting in crowds?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2013 11:40 PM

Title: Re: anyone know about Sri Lanka?

Content:

This seems an odd assertion from someone who professes to prefer facts over assumptions. I mean how do you know that it's kammārāmatā and not, say, a compassion-motivated wish to share the Dhamma or something else of a kusala character?

The ārāmatā in kammārāmatā (“delight in work”) is a state of mind, specifically, “a state of delighting in new work” (navakamme ramanakabhāva) and “being addicted (anuyutta) to much work”. It isn’t defined as “doing a lot of work”. Ānanda, for example, as the Buddha’s attendant did a lot of work, but since this was motivated by his solicitude for the Buddha’s material welfare and not by addiction, the texts never refer to it as kammārāmatā.

As it's a state of mind, whether or not somebody has fallen into kammārāmatā cannot be reliably known from the fact that he works much, any more than a person's freedom from kammārāmatā can be known from the fact that he works little. It can only be reliably known by cetopariyayañāṇa or else by the more familiar means of knowing another’s character: living with him, conversing with him, observing how he handles hardship (e.g. when he’s deprived of the opportunity to work), and doing all this for a long time. Not merely by reading a couple of posts to an online forum from a complete stranger.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2013 8:55 AM

Title: Re: Brian Ruhe and Representation

Content:

Divisive speech is that which aims at provoking disaffection in one person or group towards some other person or group, but only where this proceeds from an unwholesome volition. Therefore not all speech aimed at provoking disaffection is classed as divisive speech, for sometimes it may be prompted by a wholesome volition. An example would be when, out of concern for the listener’s welfare, one warns him about an evil person with whom it would be harmful for him to consort.

Hence the commentarial statement that the near-enemy of non-divisive speech (i.e. the

quality easily confused with it) is “lack of concern for another’s welfare” (anattakāmatā).

And so if Mr. Ruhe and Ven. Soṇa believe the Mahāyāna to have been inspired by Māra, it would be misguided of them to refrain from saying so out of a wish to be non-divisive.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2013 10:43 PM

Title: Re: Access to Insight Bulk Download

Content:

Just change the .exe file ending to .7z and then unzip it with <http://www.kekaosx.com>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 5, 2013 7:38 AM

Title: Re: Access to Insight Bulk Download

Content:

There is support, but it isn't so good with executable files with an .exe suffix.

If I download the zip-suffixed file from ATI I can unzip it with no trouble at all, but if I download an exe-suffixed file from anywhere, before I can do anything with it I need to know exactly what the encoding is and then change the .exe to something more precise: .zip, .rar, .gz, .7z or whatever.

Perhaps there is now a program that will detect an exe's encoding, but as I'm usually a year or two behind the times technologically, I haven't come across it yet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 5, 2013 7:13 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

Perhaps while the latter was undergoing an hallucination or pleasant snooze.

“Bhikkhus, just as when the stalk of a bunch of mangoes has been cut, all the mangoes on it go with it, just so the Tathāgata’s link with becoming has been cut. As long as the body subsists, devas and humans will see him. But at the breaking-up of the body and the exhaustion of the life-span, devas and humans will see him no more.”

— Brahmajāla Sutta

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2013 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

In the present case what was principally imparted in the Buddha's alleged revelations to Ajahn Mun was divine confirmation that the manner of monastic practice in Thailand, and especially in the Dhammayuttika Nikāya, and most especially at Wat Pa Baan Taad (Ajahn Maha Bua's monastery) was exactly like that of arahant bhikkhus in the Buddha's day — a confirmation so suspiciously convenient that at times I would find myself reminded of Strachey's charming account of Cardinal Wiseman:

He devoted much time and attention to the ceremonial details of his princely office. His knowledge of rubric and ritual, and of the symbolical significations of vestments, has rarely been equalled, and he took a profound delight in the ordering and the performance of elaborate processions. During one of these functions, an unexpected difficulty arose: the Master of Ceremonies suddenly gave the word for a halt, and, on being asked the reason, replied that he had been instructed that moment by special revelation to stop the procession. The Cardinal, however, was not at a loss. 'You may let the procession go on,' he smilingly replied. 'I have just obtained permission, by special revelation, to proceed with it.'

— Lytton Strachey, *Eminent Victorians*

Like the cardinal with his 'special revelations', Ajahn Maha Bua could justify virtually anything simply by claiming that it had been directly revealed to Ajahn Mun by the Buddha himself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2013 5:06 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

I don't think we need attribute the ajahn's experience to anything so exotic. If one were to live as Ajahn Mun did — dwelling in a lonely place, fasting for days on end, and devoting all of one's waking hours to the recitation of a mantra, and all of this unguided by any teacher and informed by only the meagrest acquaintance with the Buddha's teaching, I think it would be rather remarkable if one did not end up having some bizarre mental experiences.

Now I don't know whether or not a real arahant could have visions of the kind attributed to Ajahn Mun, though it doesn't seem entirely unlikely, for example, as a consequence of the kind of neural damage that gives rise to

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Peduncular_hallucinosis:

Unlike some other kinds of hallucinations, those that patients with PH experience are very realistic, and often involve people and environments that are familiar to the affected individuals. Because the content of the hallucinations is never exceptionally bizarre, patients can rarely distinguish between the hallucinations and reality.

But what I think we can be confident of is that an arahant, through his destruction of the akusala root of delusion, would be beyond the possibility of being deceived by any apparitional or visionary experience that he may undergo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2013 5:15 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

Whatever the ajahn taught that was unsupported in the texts would be attributed either to what he claimed to have personally discovered through his practice or what had been made known to Ajahn Mun during the visits paid to him by past Buddhas and their arahant disciples. The things that he justified by the latter means, when considered individually, will no doubt appear to most people as trifling and innocuous, perhaps even amusing. The general thrust, however, was not so, for it served to justify and promote: (1) an ugly nationalism (wherever there's a difference between Thai Buddhist practice and that of other Buddhist countries, it's the Thais who are doing it the Buddha's way); (2) support of far-right authoritarian government (as a consequence of that nationalism); (3) nikāya chauvinism (wherever Dhammayutt and Mahanikaya practice differ, it's the Dhammayutts who are doing it the Buddha's way); and (4) exaltation of self (wherever practice in Maha Bua's wat differs from that of other wats in the Thai forest tradition, it's he who is doing it the Buddha's way).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2013 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Why life does not really exist

Content:

That plants and the earth have kāya-indriya is mentioned in the Vinaya, but as a view of the Nigaṇṭhas and Acelakas, not the Buddha.

Now at that time the monks of Alavi, making repairs, dug the ground and had it dug. People looked down upon, criticised, spread it about, saying: "How can these samanas, sons of the Sakyans, dig the ground and have it dug? These samanas, sons of the Sakyans, are harming life that is one-facultied (ekindriyaṃ jīvaṃ)."

Now at that time the monks of Alavi, making repairs, were cutting down trees and having them cut down [...] People looked down upon, criticised, spread it about, saying: "How can these samanas, sons of the Sakyans, cut down trees and have them cut down? These samanas, sons of the Sakyans, are harming life that is one-facultied (ekindriyaṃ jīvaṃ)."

Commentary:

“Ekindriyan” ti kāyindriyeneva ekindriyaṃ, nigaṇṭhānaṃ acelakānaṃ mataṃ.

“One-facultied” means having just the body-faculty as their one faculty, as supposed by Jains and naked ascetics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Monks and Veganism/Vegeterianism

Content:

It depends how strict you are about it. If you're very strict then it's out of the question because most Thai dishes have at least a dash of fish sauce added to them while being cooked, so in rural Thailand you'd be reduced to living on rice and bananas. But the kind of vegetarianism where you just refrain from eating what is manifestly meat or fish is perfectly doable. For example, there is a vegetarian nun residing in my monastery and although we're supported by very poor mountain folk, on a typical day she'll get rice, forest leaf curry, mushroom curry, boiled bamboo shoots, an egg, noodles, bananas (and sometimes some other fruit according to the season), and sometimes a carton of soy milk.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 7:15 AM

Title: Re: good books for those wishing to become a monk

Content:

.

<http://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/banner-of-the-arahants/>

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 9:50 AM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

No, not Thaksin. I was referring to the Thai military strongmen of the Cold War era. Back in the 1980's the political idol of right-wing Northeastern monks in the Ajahn Mun

tradition was General Sarit. He'd been dead twenty years, but the older monks at Baan Taad would wax nostalgically about the days of the Sarit dictatorship as if it had been some kind of golden age.

Sarit felt that democracy had failed in Thailand and intended to rule according to "Thai ideologies", not imported Western political theories, choosing as his model the supposedly benevolent despots of his country's past.

[...]

Nevertheless, though generally popular for its achievements, Sarit's regime was the most repressive and authoritarian in modern Thai history, abrogating the constitution, dissolving parliament, and vesting all power in his newly formed Revolutionary Party. Although he pledged to appoint a constituent assembly to act as a legislature and draft a constitution, no one doubted the body would merely rubber-stamp his orders. Eventually Sarit's constitution was promulgated but not until after his death.

Sarit banned all other political parties, imposing very strict censorship of the press after the coup, his Revolutionary Party banning eighteen leftist and neutralist publications, and forbidding starting up of new opposition newspapers. Sarit's "revolution" brought an intense crackdown on "leftists"; however, as genuine communists were rare in Thailand, it was the mildly socialist or neutralist professors, politicians and newspapers which bore the brunt of the suppression.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sarit_Thanarat

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 10:33 AM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

Once, after the morning meal, a layman from Bangkok asked Ajahn Maha Bua his opinion of Phra Phothirak and his new splinter group, the Santi Asoke Sangha. The ajahn replied with strong criticisms of them for their deviations from orthodox Theravadin practice, singling out their vegetarianism and their refusal to shave their eyebrows. The layman then remarked that it is only in Thailand that monks shave their eyebrows. The ajahn replied that the Buddha's arahant disciples who visited Ajahn Mun all had shaven eyebrows and therefore it's the Thai sangha alone that is doing things right.

Meanwhile, over in Lampang Province, my namesake and Pali teacher-to-be, Sayadaw Dhammananda, was also coming in for some criticism for the fact that in his wat the monks kept to the Burmese practice of leaving their eyebrows intact. The sayadaw responded to the criticisms by publishing a learned and well-argued treatise entitled Bhamukhāvinicchaya — An Adjudication on the Subject of Eyebrows. He composed it in Pali and then translated it into Burmese and Thai. After its publication his monks would carry copies of it in their bags to be given away to any Thais who enquired as to why their

eyebrows were unshaven. In this treatise the sayadaw demonstrates beyond any reasonable doubt that although eyebrows grow on one's head, nonetheless they are not included in the term kesamassu ("head-hairs and beard" — i.e. the term for what the Vinaya requires to be shaved) but rather in lomā ("body hairs" — of which the Vinaya prohibits the shaving except for medical purposes).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 1:57 PM

Title: Re: House blessing ceremony

Content:

This would be normal for an exorcism, since the commonest reason for requesting one is recurrent bad dreams and the assumption that these are caused by spirits who've taken up residence there. But as for house-blessings, in all the dozens that I've attended I can't recall ever being deployed in anyone's bedroom.

Whereabouts in Thailand do you live?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 4:13 PM

Title: Re: House blessing ceremony

Content:

Normally the largest room available: the living room of an urban home or the entrance room of a rural shack.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 7, 2013 6:36 PM

Title: Re: House blessing ceremony

Content:

I wouldn't have thought so. I mean house-blessings aren't normally carried out with the aim of turning any part of one's home into an exclusion zone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 7:24 AM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

There weren't any teachings on Dhamma that I found valuable.

Nonetheless there were a number of things about Ajahn Maha Bua himself that made a lasting positive impression on me, mostly relating to the ajahn's uncompromising

commitment to Buddhist asceticism and the general way that he ordered his monastery, which is among the best I've ever seen. For example, MB refused to give in to pressure from rich, well-meaning Bangkok lay supporters who wanted to make merit by "developing" the wat (i.e. by making it a more luxurious place). He wouldn't allow them to install electricity or running water or to hire contractors to build luxury concrete kutis or other buildings — everything had to be built of wood and by the monks themselves.

He also imposed this standard on those of his disciples who went off to start wats of their own. I remember there was one senior monk who had founded a new forest wat and was "developing" it in ways that went against MB's ideas of what is appropriate (e.g. building a concrete sala with a marble floor). Moreover the errant disciple was raising funds for these developments by constantly boasting to the laity about the fact that MB was his teacher. When MB heard of all this he not only disowned the disciple but for several weeks would end all his sermons to laypeople with the words: "...and one more thing. I want you to know that Ajahn X is no disciple of mine." (It reminded me of how Cato the Elder would irrelevantly conclude all his speeches to the Roman Senate with the words: "...and furthermore, it is my opinion that Carthage must be destroyed," and wouldn't let up until Carthage was destroyed).

I also liked the fact that MB didn't treat his monks like cattle as they do in the Ajahn Chah tradition — sending them here and there willy-nilly. For example, in the early days of the forest sangha in England, Ajahn Sumedho came to visit Baan Taad and asked MB if he had any western bhikkhus whom he'd be willing to send to teach in England. "What are you talking about?" replied MB, "I don't send bhikkhus anywhere. If you want to know if they want to go to England why don't you try asking them?"

Another difference from Ajahn Chah's wats was that at Baan Taad there wasn't the obsession with pecking order that you get in the former. There was no silly pulling of rank like: "I ordained a week before you, so you have to empty my spittoon!" Hierarchy at Baan Taad was a lot simpler: Maha Bua was the boss and the rest of us were peers, addressing each other as "brother".

I expect there were lots of other things that I liked about Ajahn Maha Bua and his wat, but I don't remember them at the moment, so they'll have to wait until I get my diary back.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 8:52 AM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

I don't personally know of any Thai monastery of which I could say: "All (or most) of the monks living there both observe the Vinaya well and avoid the extremes of eternalism and annihilationism." One can say this of individual bhikkhus, but one can't say that such a thing prevails in any community that I know of. Generally, in a wat where all the monks observe the Vinaya well the prevailing view will be semi-eternalist, or sometimes

even full-blown eternalist, while in a wat where right view prevails the observance of Vinaya will be lax.

(It would appear this tendency is not a new one. I recall that one Chinese pilgrim to India, after visiting numerous monasteries all over the sub-continent, reported that the strictest Vinaya observance was to be found in those of the Pudgalavādin schools).

For this reason, I think it's desirable that a monk in his formative years should gain experience in both urban pariyatti and forest kammaṭṭhāna wats, taking what's best from both of them and then, when's he's got ten rains under his belt, getting the hell away from them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 10:57 AM

Title: Re: Violent sports

Content:

To say nothing of the cheerleading that accompanies this Neanderthal recreation.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cheerleading#Dangers_of_cheerleading

<http://www.thetoptens.com/most-dangerous-sports/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 2:13 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sujato and Marriage Equality

Content:

When one enlarges the scope of an existing decree by exploring and pursuing what may reasonably be taken to be intimated in it with respect to conditions not present at the time of its enactment is one necessarily decreeing something new?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 3:00 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

So is this chap:

“Supposing the Pope looked up and saw a cloud and said ‘It's going to rain’, would that be bound to happen?”

“Oh, yes, Father.”

“But supposing it didn't?”

He thought a moment and said: “I suppose it could be sort of raining spiritually, only we were too sinful to see it.”

— Evelyn Waugh, *Brideshead Revisited*

But I'm afraid that the notion of a "supramundane transcendental conversation involving no perception" is as meaningless to me as the spiritual rainfall that I'm too sinful to see.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 8, 2013 3:27 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

It will vary from one monk to another, but as advised in the Vanapatha Sutta, he should go to a place where "...his unestablished mindfulness becomes established, his unconcentrated mind becomes concentrated, his undestroyed taints come to destruction, and where he attains the unattained supreme security from bondage."

<http://www.yellowrobe.com/home/120-majjhima-nikaya/349-mn-17-vanapattha-sutta-jungle-thickets.html>

If a monk's put his first ten years to good use, then he should have a good idea what sort of place will be optimal for this.

[btw. This is likely to be my last post until the New Year as I'll be leaving shortly and going to an internet-free location]

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2013 7:26 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha really live in the forest?

Content:

Living in a 'park' (ārāma) to all intents and purposes meant living in a forest. We shouldn't picture these so-called 'parks' as, say, areas of trimmed lawns, privet fences, gazebos, bird-houses etc., surrounded by a high wall. 'Ārāma' just meant a piece of forest that somebody happened to own and used for recreational purposes (chiefly hunting) rather than agriculture.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2013 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Western Poetry for Buddhists

Content:

Links to four poems expressive of a Dhammic conservatism akin to that of the

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j1/j1080.htm> and

<http://www.metta.lk/tipitaka/2Sutta-Pitaka/4Anguttara-Nikaya/Anguttara4/7-sattakanipata/003-vajjisattakavaggo-e.html>.

<https://tspace.library.utoronto.ca/html/1807/4350/poem2162.html>

“Envy wears the mask of Love, and, laughing sober fact to scorn,
Cries to Weakest as to Strongest, ‘Ye are equals, equal-born.’

...

“You that woo the Voices — tell them ‘old experience is a fool,’
Teach your flatter’d kings that only those who cannot read can rule.
Pluck the mighty from their seat, but set no meek ones in their place;
Pillory Wisdom in your markets, pelt your offal at her face.”

http://www.kipling.org.uk/poems_copybook.htm

“In the Carboniferous Epoch we were promised abundance for all,
By robbing selected Peter to pay for collective Paul;
But, though we had plenty of money, there was nothing our money could buy,
And the Gods of the Copybook Headings said: If you don't work you die.”

http://shakespeare.mit.edu/troilus_cressida/troilus_cressida.1.3.html

“The heavens themselves, the planets and this centre
Observe degree, priority and place,
Insisture, course, proportion, season, form,
Office and custom, in all line of order;

...

“How could communities,
Degrees in schools and brotherhoods in cities,
Peaceful commerce from dividable shores,
The primogenitive and due of birth,
Prerogative of age, crowns, sceptres, laurels,
But by degree, stand in authentic place?
Take but degree away, untune that string,
And, hark, what discord follows!”

<http://www.bartleby.com/145/ww293.html>

“Genius of Burke! forgive the pen seduced
By specious wonders, and too slow to tell
Of what the ingenuous, what bewildered men,
Beginning to mistrust their boastful guides,
And wise men, willing to grow wiser, caught,
Rapt auditors! from thy most eloquent tongue—
Now mute, for ever mute in the cold grave.
I see him, —old, but vigorous in age,—
Stand like an oak whose stag-horn branches start
Out of its leafy brow, the more to awe
The younger brethren of the grove.

...

"While he forewarns, denounces, launches forth,
Against all systems built on abstract rights,
Keen ridicule; the majesty proclaims
Of Institutes and Laws, hallowed by time;
Declares the vital power of social ties
Endeared by Custom; and with high disdain,
Exploding upstart Theory, insists
Upon the allegiance to which men are born."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2013 4:29 PM

Title: Re: Christmas greetings

Content:

Christmas Greetings everyone.

I thought some of you might appreciate this little-known piece of footage. It's the Apostle Matthew, working as a reporter for the Bethlehem Star, interviewing one of the shepherds to whom the angel of the Lord appeared on the night of Jesus's birth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2013 7:50 AM

Title: Re: Delineation of head hair and body hair

Content:

From the Visuddhimagga:

"Firstly head hairs are black in their normal colour, the colour of fresh ariṭṭhaka seeds. As to shape, they are the shape of long round measuring rods. As to direction, they lie in the upper direction. As to location, their location is the wet inner skin that envelops the skull; it is bounded on both sides by the roots of the ears, in front by the forehead, and behind by the nape of the neck. As to delimitation, they are bounded below by the surface of their own roots, which are fixed by entering to the amount of the tip of a rice grain into the inner skin that envelops the head. They are bounded above by space, and all round by each other. There are no two hairs together. This is their delimitation by the similar. Head hairs are not body hairs, and body hairs are not head hairs; being likewise not intermixed with the remaining thirty-one parts, the head hairs are a separate part. This is their delimitation by the dissimilar. Such is the definition of head hairs as to colour and so on."

"Herein, firstly, as to natural colour, body hairs are not pure black like head hairs but blackish brown. As to shape, they are the shape of palm roots with the tips bent down.

As to direction, they lie in the two directions. As to location, except for the locations where the head hairs are established, and for the palms of the hands and soles of the feet, they grow in most of the rest of the inner skin that envelops the body. As to delimitation, they are bounded below by the surface of their own roots, which are fixed by entering to the extent of a likhā into the inner skin that envelops the body, above by space, and all round by each other. There are no two body hairs together. This is the delimitation by the similar. But their delimitation by the dissimilar is like that for the head hairs."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2013 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Self view, ego and conceit

Content:

Presumably he means attānudiṭṭhi, as found, for example, in the Attānudiṭṭhi, Attānudiṭṭhipahāna, and Assāda Suttas (SN. iii. 185-6; SN. iv. 147-8; AN. iii. 447).

Or else attavāda, as found in dozens of suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2013 8:22 AM

Title: Re: Can monks attend to his sick parents or former wife?

Content:

"The tradition that has come down to all Theravada Buddhist monks is that described in the Samantapasadika, the great commentary on the Vinayapitaka compiled by Buddhaghosa in Sri Lanka in the 5th century C.E. This authoritative work states that a monk may prescribe and supply medicines to his fellow monastics (monks and nuns), to his parents or to those looking after his parents, and to any laypeople staying in the monastery of Vihara either preparing to go forth as monks or just staying to help the monks. Also, a monk may prescribe but not buy medicines to his brothers and sisters, aunts and uncles, grandparents and to whatever travellers, bandits, people wounded in battle and those without relatives who come to the monastery of Vihara for emergency help. Should a monk prescribe or supply medicines beyond his allowance, he commits an offence against his precepts (a dukkata offence). Further, if he prescribes or supplies a medicine to a layperson for a material gift in return, then he incurs another offence against his precepts for "corrupting families" (kuladusaka). That is what is stated in the Samantapasadika Vinaya Commentary, respected in all Theravada Buddhist countries." From <http://www.budsas.org/ebud/eb sut033.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2013 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Sayādaw U Sīlānanda, Handbook of Abhidhamma Studies, volumes 1-3

<http://buddhispano.net/sites/default/files/uploads/Handbook-of-Abhidhamma-Studies-I.pdf>

<http://buddhispano.net/sites/default/files/uploads/Handbook-of-Abhidhamma-Studies-II.pdf>

<http://buddhispano.net/sites/default/files/uploads/Handbook-of-Abhidhamma-Studies-III.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 29, 2013 9:19 AM

Title: Re: Meet the Amish

Content:

In Thailand I suppose the Santi Asoke group might be compared to the Amish in some respects.

http://www.bunniyom.com/insight-santi_mobi3.html

http://www.bunniyom.com/openeyes.marja_leena.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 29, 2013 1:18 PM

Title: Passing of First African American Bhikkhu

Content:

Posted on Facebook today by Mushim Patricia Ikeda:

"My Great Spiritual Friend, the most Venerable Bhante Suhita Dharma passed away around 5 am this morning at Chua Dieu Phap Temple in San Gabriel, California. I have just received the news. It sounds as though it was very sudden and that he didn't go through a lot of pain."

suhit2.jpg (201.45 KiB) Viewed 6578 times

<https://www.facebook.com/suhita.dharma>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2013 3:00 AM
Title: Re: Monk travelling back to is country
Content:
See appendix V:

http://www.paaukforestmonastery.org/books/teaching_training.pdf

It seems that if a non-Burmese wishes to ordain at Pa-Auk Monastery he will be required to deposit funds with the monastery's kappiya that will be sufficient to cover both visa extensions and repatriation. But I suggest that you contact the monastery to ascertain what their current policy is:

<http://www.paaukforestmonastery.org/contact.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2013 7:45 AM
Title: Re: Monk travelling back to is country
Content:
Hi Gabriel,

There is a variety of policies among monasteries in Asia, with some leaving the foreign monk to completely fend for himself and others providing full support with regard to travel costs, visas etc. Pa-Awk Monastery seems to be somewhere in the middle: since they are strict about the prohibition against handling money they arrange for a lay kappiya to deal with all that stuff, but unlike, say, at Wat Pa Nanachat, the ordinand is required to pay the kappiya in advance of his ordination.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2013 9:07 AM
Title: Re: Divine Abidings
Content:
There is a mistake in the chart.

The near-enemy of compassion is not 'pity'. In fact the very idea of there being some difference between compassion and pity is quite a recent development in the English language; it's a distinction invented by purveyors of pop psychology and inherited by some North American vipassanā teachers. Before the twentieth century the two words were virtually synonymous, notwithstanding their very different provenance and early semantic history. In the texts the near-enemy of compassion is given in some sources as sorrow (soka) and in others as unpleasant mental feeling (domanassa-vedanā).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 1, 2014 8:22 AM

Title: Re: Monastery's in Burma(Myanmar)

Content:

If you are open to considering Burmese monasteries in Thailand, then there is <http://www.wattamaoh.org> in Lampang Province. The new abbot there, Sayadaw Gandhasāra, is a disciple of Mahasi Sayadaw who is fluent in English and teaches the samatha-vipassanā system outlined in Mahasi's <http://www.aimwell.org/brahmaviharadhamma.html>, i.e., insight development based upon mettā jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 1, 2014 11:56 AM

Title: Re: Passing of First African American Bhikkhu

Content:

Obituary by Mushim Ikeda

December 28, 2013

Dear Dharma Friends,

It is with the utmost sadness that I wish to share with you that one of my oldest friends, the most Venerable Bhante Suhita Dharma, whose Vietnamese Dharma name and title was Hoa Thuong Thich An Duc, passed away around 5 am this morning in his room at Chua Dieu Phap Temple in San Gabriel, California, at the age of 73 or so. I know that he approved of the photo I've attached, because he used it as his Facebook profile pic. His death was sudden and unexpected, and evidently without pain or struggle, possibly due to cardiac arrest.

Ven. Suhita Dharma was the first African American to be ordained as a Buddhist monk. He was my co-teacher for a number of years for the People of Color annual meditation retreat at Vallecitos Mountain Refuge outside of Taos, New Mexico. Born in Texas, he was a monk for 58 years of his life, entering the Trappist monastery when he was 14 and a half, and later becoming a fully ordained Buddhist monk. He never saw any contradiction between his Catholic family roots and his early life as Brother Anthony of the Trappists on one hand, and his life as a Buddhist monk, on the other hand, seeing all of monastic life as being essentially very similar. He often told me that he considered the Rule of St. Benedict to be the best and most comprehensive set of monastic rules. He also once said that when he was with the Trappists, who are a silent Order, that all of the brothers were joyful and that he "never once saw a long face among them." He was among the last generation of so-called child monks in the Trappist Order, as they soon thereafter raised the minimum age for ordination. Before becoming a Trappist monk,

Bhante Suhita had been a star altar boy in Texas, where his family lived for a number of years, and he always said that he was asked to be there if a visiting dignitary came, because even though he was so young, he had memorized all of the services and could do them perfectly. He said he loved high ritual, and was not pleased when the services in the Catholic Church switched from Latin to English.

As a Buddhist monk, he loved to travel, and he spent extensive periods of time in Sri Lanka, where he rose to the status of “Mahathera”; Thailand; Nepal; and I believe in Malaysia as well, plus some other countries. Some years ago, he was given the title “Hoa Thuong” in the Vietnamese Buddhist Church, which he told me was the equivalent of a bishop in the Catholic Church. His circle of connections within the monastic Buddhist world was huge, and included monks and nuns from every Buddhist country. Within the last several years, he divided his time between residing at Chua Dieu Phap temple in San Gabriel, California and his hermitage and Sangha in Juarez, Mexico. He told me several weeks ago that he hoped to do one last pilgrimage in Europe and to visit a number of monasteries and sacred sites there. He also told me that one of the few regrets he had about his life was that he had once had an opportunity to enter the Carthusian monastic order (the Order of Saint Bruno) and to live as a cloistered monk, in silence, but that he’d become very ill, had to go into hospital in England for an extended period of time, and after he recovered his life took him in a different direction.

Bhante Suhita Dharma and I have been the best of Dharma friends for around 28 years, since we first met at the International Buddhist Meditation Center (IBMC) in Los Angeles in 1985. He would say publicly that he had five spiritual friends, and that I was one of them. I never asked him who the other four were, since I always figured that if he’d wanted to tell me, he would have done so. In reality, he was a teacher and good spiritual friend to many, but held this role lightly and without attachment or possessiveness. I think it’s fair to say that he wanted people to be curious and free in their spiritual development, and to be street smart and self-reliant and to trust their own common sense (which he called “mother wit”), to stay grounded and real. As one of the most senior monks in North America, he was experienced in many different forms of meditation and spiritual practice, but always taught people to remain simple, sincere, and disciplined in spiritual life, and to keep the goal of helping others front and center at all times. He had little patience for laypeople who romanticize their idea of monastic life, or for anyone who, as one U.S. practitioner of color put it many years ago, is “hiding out in the emptiness zone.” He was an eminently practical person, a trained social worker, and had spent many years working with formerly incarcerated men, homeless persons, people with HIV-AIDS, as a prison chaplain, and as founder of the Metta Vihara hospice in Richmond, California.

Bhante Suhita had lived through Jim Crow, and he recalled that, as a little boy, he once went into a public restroom in Texas, where a white man told him to get out. He was with his grandmother, Big Mama, at the time and when he came out of the restroom and told her what had happened he said that she opened her purse and took out a switch blade and was going to storm into the men’s restroom, but evidently restrained herself from doing so, and the family put both her and her grandson on a train to San Francisco to stay with other family members for awhile.

Bhante Suhita Dharma's view of life was global and inclusive. His Dharma was subtle, profoundly deep and broad, and fairly invisible. He never wanted to become known as a Buddhist teacher and liked to remain independent and unattached to form and image. As one person who tried to interview him for a Buddhist journal once said thoughtfully, "There isn't a lot of self there." He enjoyed ice cream, fried chicken, and old school horror movies. He greatly disliked tofu and personal drama. Wherever he lived he had a television that was always turned on to a news network, and if I wanted to find out more about any current event I would usually ask him for the scoop. He also loved books on Buddhism and Catholic monasticism and collected them avidly. He was very close to my son, who knew Bhante from the time he (my child) was born. They had a deep connection to one another through their similar approaches to off-the-radar everyday Buddhism in action and their penchant for mordant commentary and feisty conversational ripostes.

The brief bio, below, was written by Bhante himself for the faculty section of Vallecitos Mountain Ranch, some years ago. He chose the attached formal photo of himself in traditional saffron robes to accompany it. He liked being alone and always said he was a card-carrying hermit and member of the Raven's Bread Hermit Ministries organization. Although he knew many people, as far as I could tell, he always preserved a deep inner silence and eremitical vocation. The etymology of the Japanese Zen term *unsui* works pretty well to describe Bhante Suhita's spirit as I knew him over 28 years — according to Wikipedia, the term *unsui*, which literally translates as "cloud, water" comes from a Chinese poem which reads, "To drift like clouds and flow like water." [2] Helen J. Baroni writes, "The term can be applied more broadly for any practitioner of Zen, since followers of Zen attempt to move freely through life, without the constraints and limitations of attachment, like free-floating clouds or flowing water."

Bhante Suhita Dharma was an adventurer, and now that he is flowing and floating onward, I know (or think I do!) that what he'd want from us would be for each of us, in our own way, to help others as much as we can, and to become the practitioner described in the Metta Sutta:

"This is to be done by one skilled in aims
who wants to break through to the state of peace:
Be capable, upright, & straightforward,
easy to instruct, gentle, & not conceited,
content & easy to support,
with few duties, living lightly,
with peaceful faculties, masterful,
modest, & no greed for supporters.

"Do not do the slightest thing
that the wise would later censure.

"Think: Happy, at rest,
may all beings be happy at heart.

Whatever beings there may be,
weak or strong, without exception,
long, large,
middling, short,
subtle, blatant,
seen & unseen,
near & far,
born & seeking birth:
May all beings be happy at heart.”

(trans. Thanissaro Bhikkhu)

Bhante was always cheerfully getting ready to die, and when I taught with him, he would sometimes say to the practitioners in the meditation hall: “I will always be with you. And when you least expect it!”

<http://www.buddhistpeacefellowship.org/floating-onward-honoring-venerable-bhante-suhita-dharma/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 1, 2014 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Passing of First African American Bhikkhu

Content:

Dharma talk by Ven. Suhita Dharma, “The Way,” June 4, 2012, Vallecitos Mountain Ranch People of Color silent seven-day meditation retreat:

<http://www.vallecitos.org/teacher-talks/ven-suhita-dharma-6-4-12-the-way>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 4, 2014 1:24 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma and polygamy

Content:

It’s not a rule as such, but rather a disputed modern application of the fifth saṅghādisesa rule — the prohibition against acting as a go-between between a man and woman for the sake of effecting a marriage, betrothal or temporary liaison. Some hold that officiating at a marriage would amount to breach of this rule. However, this is a minority view (I’ve only ever heard it from some of the monks at Wat Pa Nanachat, based apparently on an old article by Ajahn Brahmavamso) and it doesn’t seem correct to me, nor to any of the Thai or Burmese Vinaya scholars with whom I’ve raised the subject. I think the most that can be claimed is that officiating at weddings is not among the traditional rôles of a bhikkhu. Instead, the usual practice is to leave it to the secular authorities to perform the wedding and then bless the couple with paritta-chanting

afterwards.

But to come back to the fifth saṅghādisesa, as far as the spirit of this rule is concerned, it's clear that what is prohibited are such acts as matchmaking and procuring, but this is not really what a wedding officiant is doing. At a wedding the 'match' is already a fait accompli and the officiant does no more than ratify it. On the other hand, to conform to the letter of Vinaya a bhikkhu officiating at a wedding would need to ensure that the liturgy was worded in a way that didn't entail any of the three component acts involved in matchmaking: accepting the request of one party to convey a proposal (paṭiggaṇhanam), enquiring into the response of the other party (vīmaṃsanam), or reporting the response back to the first party (paccāharaṇam).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2014 2:58 PM

Title: Re: Questions about De Silva's Pali Primer

Content:

I recommend that you be patient and stick with it. Even if there are things in it you don't yet understand, just completing it will leave you endowed with a considerably larger Pali vocabulary than the average primer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 5:15 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism/Brahmanism/Hinduism discussion

Content:

Let me help him out...

The theodicy-based objection to God in the Bhūridatta Jātaka assumes an omniscient God and could therefore be evaded by positing a non-omniscient God who simply wasn't sure what would happen if he created the universe. Among philosophical theologians holding to a non-omniscient God conception there are broadly four views, summarized by <http://www.alanrhoda.net/blog/2006/02/four-versions-of-open-theism.html>:

1. Voluntary Nescience: The future is alethically settled but nevertheless epistemically open for God because he has voluntarily chosen not to know truths about future contingents. Dallas Willard was thought to hold this position.

2. Involuntary Nescience: The future is alethically settled but nevertheless epistemically open for God because truths about future contingents are in principle unknowable. William Hasker and Peter Van Inwagen espouse this position.

3. Non-Bivalentist Omniscience: The future is alethically open and therefore epistemically open for God because propositions about future contingents are neither true nor false. J. R. Lucas espouses this position.

4. Bivalentist Omniscience: The future is alethically open and therefore epistemically open for God because propositions asserting of future contingents that they 'will' obtain or that they 'will not' obtain are both false. Instead, what is true is that they 'might and might not' obtain. Greg Boyd espouses this position.

Then the imperfect, evolving and non-omnipotent God of

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Process_theology like Whitehead, Hartshorne et al would appear to evade the critique of the Bhūridatta Jātaka by cheerfully conceding that God is indeed a bit limited, but nonetheless remains a fit object for human reverence since He isn't as limited as ourselves.

Finally, one might bite the bullet and meet Bhūridatta's objection to God head-on with the retort: "Yep, God's bad." An historical example would be the malevolent <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demiurge> conception of Gnostic dualists.

None of the above, however, seem to have many takers among theists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 6:08 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma and polygamy

Content:

Actually since writing I've learned that I misidentified the ajahn. The view was actually set forth in The Heritage of the Sangha, an unpublished Vinaya treatise by the Canadian Wat Pa Nanachat monk Ven. Thiradhammo. Thiradhammo's opinion was later cited with approval by the English monk Ven. Ariyesako in his <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/ariyesako/layguide.html>.

As for Ajahn Brahmavamso, I don't know what his views are on bhikkhus' officiating at heterosexual marriages, but he is on record as saying that he would be happy to do so at homosexual ones.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 6:30 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

The problem, as I see it, is that it would be priggish and uncivil behaviour for a guest. Moreover, being a sort of gastronomic equivalent of 'overriding normal usage' such behaviour is conducive to needless strife (i.e. needless because vegetarianism is not a requirement of Buddhist sīla) and therefore at odds with the spirit of

<http://www.yellowrobe.com/component/content/article/120-majjhima-nikaya/281-araavibhanga-sutta-the-exposition-of-non-conflict.html> (araṇa).

An old post from Dhamma Study Group:

Sarah Abbot: “Actually, it was on the very first day I first met [Acharn Sujin] that I had another of those Great Non-Pampering experiences. This one was on an earlier trip in Sri Lanka with Nina too ... I’d been a super-strict vegetarian for a few years, right through university and beyond. We sat down at a table of delicious curries and I started enquiring about the ingredients of the soup and explaining what I could and couldn’t eat. I was shocked when K. Sujin just seemed to ignore these concerns - which of course came well wrapped up in a long list of humane justifications - and put some soup in my bowl and then a very little of every kind of food on my plate. Ever so sweetly she told me to eat it out of consideration for our hostess.”

<http://groups.yahoo.com/neo/groups/dhammastudygroup/conversations/topics/30929>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Greed and lust

Content:

Rāga and lobha are synonyms.

From the Dhammasaṅgani:

"Tattha katamo lobho? Yo rāgo sārāgo anunayo anurodho nandī nandirāgo cittassa sārāgo icchā mucchā ajjhosānaṃ gedho paligedho saṅgo paṅko ejā māyā janikā sañjananī sibbinī jālinī saritā visattikā suttaṃ visaṭā āyūhinī dutiyā paṇidhi bhavanetti vanaṃ vanatho santhavo sineho apekkhā paṭibandhu āsā āsisanā āsisittattaṃ rūpāsā saddāsā gandhāsā rasāsā phoṭṭhabbāsā lābhāsā dhanāsā puttāsā jīvītāsā jappā pajappā abhijappā jappā jappanā jappittattaṃ loluppaṃ loluppāyaṇā loluppāyittattaṃ pucchañjikatā sādhukamyatā adhammarāgo visamalobho nikanti nikāmaṇā patthanā pihanā sampatthanā kāmataṇhā bhavataṇhā vibhavataṇhā rūpataṇhā arūpataṇhā nirodhatāṇhā rūpataṇhā saddataṇhā gandhatāṇhā rasataṇhā phoṭṭhabbatāṇhā dhammataṇhā oggho yogo gantho upādānaṃ āvaraṇaṃ nīvaraṇaṃ chādanaṃ bandhanaṃ upakkilesa anusayo pariyutṭhānaṃ latā vevicchaṃ dukkhamūlaṃ dukkhanidānaṃ dukkhappabhavo mārappāso mārabaḷisaṃ māravisayo taṇhānadī taṇhājālaṃ taṇhāgaddulaṃ taṇhāsamuddo abhijjhā lobho akusalamūlaṃ - ayaṃ vuccati lobho."

C.A.F. Rhys Davids' translation from A Buddhist Manual of Psychological Ethics:

./download/file.php?id=2165

(170.14 KiB) Downloaded 33 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma and polygamy

Content:

Because "householders, bhikkhus, are believers in good omens" (gihī bhikkhave, maṅgalikā - Vin.ii.140).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 10:26 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

I believe the implied situation here is not one in which the host offers meat to a vegetarian out of sheer bloody-mindedness, but rather one in which she has no prior knowledge of her guest's dietary preferences and simply offers the kind of food she would offer to any guest. And so the question of whether a vegetarian's motivations are intelligible to her isn't really relevant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 11:17 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

You make my point for me: "priggish" and "uncivil".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 12:04 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

The diminution in the killing of animals that some vegetarians hope their dietary practice will conduce to could only come about if the said practice were to be undertaken by sufficient numbers. One single person's undertaking to purchase no meat will not have any discernible (that is to say, measurable) effect on the market or on the animal-slaughter that market demand generates. A vegetarian may nonetheless comfort herself with the thought that although her refusal to purchase meat has no discernible effect on the market, at least she is not personally contributing to it. We can surely agree on this much, right?

But when it comes to a guest's refusal to eat her host's meat (which is what the present sub-section of the thread is concerned with), not only will this not have any measurable effect on the market, it will not have even an unmeasurable effect on it; there is no

possibility of its having an effect of any kind on the market, for the guest's refusal will not cause the purchased meat to become unpurchased. That being so, the sole effects of her refusal will be an insulted host and some wasted food.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2014 12:10 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

Then I suggest you direct your question to the proper quarters, which is to say, to some Buddhist who actually holds such a view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 6, 2014 11:53 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach the practice of all night vigils?

Content:

The Buddha didn't teach it in the sense of making it an obligatory observance, but we can see from the Udāna's Uposatha Sutta that it was something the early sangha used to do.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/ud/ud.5.05.irel.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 7, 2014 6:35 AM

Title: Re: The interpretation of the 8 precepts

Content:

The "[sevenfold] moral habit with livelihood as the eighth" (ājīvaṭṭhamakasiḷaṃ) is a commentarial term. The formulation is based upon a sutta (whose name I can't remember right now) where the Buddha lays down abstention from wrong livelihood and from the first seven of the akusala kammapaṭha as being the very minimum standard of virtue needed for progress in bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 7, 2014 7:06 AM

Title: Re: Is death always caused by kamma?

Content:

But is death —the cutting off of the life-faculty— the same thing as a vedanā?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 8, 2014 7:39 AM

Title: Re: The interpretation of the 8 precepts

Content:

But in the commentary to the Ratana Sutta the said misconduct on the part of a sekha disciple is limited to such transgressions of the monastic rule as would not proceed from unwholesome volitions, or at least not necessarily proceed from such volitions. It wouldn't include actions such as intentional killing, stealing, etc., which orthodoxy holds to be not possible for sekhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 11, 2014 10:45 AM

Title: Re: Having children vs. not

Content:

Possibly, for going by the Majjhima Nikāya's Mahāsīhanāda Sutta, parents aren't absolutely needed for human birth, some humans being opapātika:

“Sāriputta, there are these four kinds of generation. What are the four? Egg-born generation, womb-born generation, moisture-born generation, and spontaneous generation.

“What is egg-born generation? There are these beings born by breaking out of the shell of an egg; this is called egg-born generation. What is womb-born generation? There are these beings born by breaking out from the caul; this is called womb-born generation. What is moisture-born generation? There are these beings born in a rotten fish, in a rotten corpse, in rotten porridge, in a cesspit, or in a sewer; this is called moisture-born generation. What is spontaneous generation? There are gods and denizens of hell and certain human beings and some beings in the lower worlds; this is called spontaneous generation.

So in the unlikely event of sexual intercourse coming to be viewed with the same disapprobation that it was at the start of the mahākalpa, spontaneous generation might thereonafter supply the means for those gandhabbas that have a human birth as their vipāka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 24, 2014 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

None at all?

I doubt the the Catholic nun's parents dressed her up in a wimple and habit starting at the age of eighteen months, or just as soon as she got too big for her swaddling clothes. She wears the uniform of a religious order that she has entered of her own free choice.

Now this might just be true of the Muslimah also, but we know darn well that it isn't so for the majority of them.

Furthermore, suppose the two women decided to exchange their present garb for something a little more risqué. I don't know exactly how the Vatican would handle such a disciplinary infraction, but I'm sure that the measures taken would not involve hiring a gang of bearded apes to beat the errant nun black and blue. Can this be said also of the Muslimah? Not if she comes from, say, the tribal regions of Pakistan, or most parts of the Middle East, or any place on earth where Wahhabism happens to prevail.

So that's two importance differences between these two women: freedom of choice, or lack of it, and the consequences that are likely to ensue should they make a dissenting and religiously unsanctioned choice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 24, 2014 12:06 PM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

And here's a further, albeit minor, difference between the Catholic nun and the Muslimah. The former, being celibate, will not be burdening our state health services with any rickets-ridden children.

Burka-wearing prompts the return of rickets in Birmingham

“A new health awareness campaign has been launched among Muslim women by health officials in the Midlands after a rise in the number of cases of rickets. It is thought that pregnant women who regularly wear a burka are depriving themselves of exposure to sunlight, which results in Vitamin D deficiency. Sixty-five children in Birmingham have needed hospital treatment in the past three years for rickets, a disease which was thought to have died out in Victorian times. And health bosses fear this may be the tip of the iceberg with more cases of the illness, which affects bone development, not being formally diagnosed.”

<http://www.secularism.org.uk/burka-wearingpromptsthereturnofi.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 24, 2014 12:36 PM

Title: Re: The value in learning about other traditions

Content:

It isn't true. For example, in Shantideva's Bodhicaryavatara and its commentaries, the "gross-out dead body stuff" is so strong that even Phra Khantipālo (who had a pronounced enthusiasm for this sort of thing) felt compelled to dismiss it as "certainly sick" in his Bag of Bones booklet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 25, 2014 8:00 AM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Going by the depiction of him in the Mahāsupina Jātaka and the Vajji Sutta, I expect the Buddha would have spoken like Monsieur Jacques Myard of the French National Assembly (2:28), or like Farzana Hassan of the Muslim Canadian Congress (11:53).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 25, 2014 11:56 AM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

There's a full transcript here:

<http://www.thedohadebates.com/debates/item/index0afd.html?d=81&s=7&mode=transcript>

Though there's one part that I'm not sure is correct: the French minister several times says something that's been transcribed as "common will", but it's possible that this is his pronunciation of "common weal".

And the participants' biodata:

<http://www.thedohadebates.com/debates/item/indexdcdf.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 25, 2014 1:53 PM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

I'm far from being an expert on the epidemiology of rickets, but I'll hazard a guess that its absence in nuns is attributable to four factors:

Firstly, because adults are less susceptible to it than infants.

Secondly, because nuns don't get pregnant and therefore have a lower vitamin D requirement than gestating Muslimahs.

Thirdly, because so many Catholic nuns nowadays belong to orders where they spend much of their time in normal clothes or in nun costumes of a modern and clerically minimalist design. As a result, fairly considerable areas of their skin are left exposed and therefore receptive to the beneficial early morning sunlight.

And fourthly, because even the most obnubilated nun in the most sartorially conservative order will normally have at least her cheeks, chin and nose on exhibition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 25, 2014 2:36 PM

Title: Re: Why the fuss about hijabs?

Content:

Thanks, but I'd already seen it and the only part relevant to the resolution of the nun conundrum is point #1, which is something we already knew.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 26, 2014 4:46 AM

Title: Re: WW3 is not inevitable: what we can do to prevent it

Content:

Then on the lighter side there's the Welsh writer David Langford's *Earthdoom* (1987), a spoof disaster novel in which our planet is simultaneously afflicted with everything from polar slippage to an invasion of rabid alien lemmings to the reappearance in South Devon of a time-travelling Hitler. All a bit daft, though scarcely more so than the OP's link.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 26, 2014 5:19 AM

Title: Re: Person with samatha vs Arhat's natural state

Content:

It's like the difference between the wintertime absence of blooms on a rhododendron and the absence at all times of blooms on a lepidodendron. The former is an absence of something that might be present and will again become so, but happens not to be present now, while the latter is an absence of something that can never be present again, since lepidodendrons are extinct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 26, 2014 2:35 PM

Title: Re: Person with samatha vs Arhat's natural state

Content:

If we are taking at the moment in its most strictly literal abhidhammic sense, then there may or may not be a difference between a kilesa-free moment in a worldling and the same in an arahant. For example, an arising of eye-consciousness, or any of the other fivefold sensory consciousnesses, would be exactly the same in a worldling and an arahant. On the other hand, a moment of compassion would be different in the two persons. In the worldling the compassion would arise in a kamma-generating kusala citta, while in an arahant it would be in an inoperative (i.e., non-kamma-generating) kiriya citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 27, 2014 6:08 AM

Title: Re: For you Australians

Content:

Blimey, the victors in the Great Patriotic War, now reduced to singing about Vegemite sandwiches? How are the mighty fallen!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 4, 2014 4:17 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma & defending human/civil rights

Content:

Do you mean to say that you cannot conceive that the "desire to amend an inflicted wrongdoing" could ever be aroused by any cause but resentment?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 4, 2014 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma & defending human/civil rights

Content:

But must it always come from discontent and never from any other cause?

Do you, in other words, reject the possibility of moral conduct that is rationally (rather than emotionally) prompted — conduct of the kind advocated by the Stoics or Kant or the Buddha of the Vinaya Piṭaka?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 4, 2014 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Issue with other schools of Buddhism

Content:

The Zen tradition's claim that it is the heir of a lineage of Indian and Chinese patriarchs, together with parallel claims advanced by all the other schools that sprang up in China

(the Tientai, the Huayan, the Pure Land, the Vinaya school, etc.), hasn't the tiniest shred of credibility. That this stuff was simply invented by the Chinese is evident from the fact that the Indian Buddhists knew nothing at all about these purported lineages. Despite these schools' claims about many centuries of lineages of Indian patriarchs, not one of them left even the tiniest trace on the Indian palaeographic record.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 4, 2014 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Issue with other schools of Buddhism

Content:

Well, in that case the claims of the Chinese schools would have been more credible if they had made a point of selecting low-key Indian figures for their patriarchs. As it is, the persons identified by the eminences of the Chinese schools as being "Indian patriarchs" were not just any old Tom, Dick or Harry, whom Buddhist historians might easily have overlooked. They were heavyweights in the Indian Buddhist scene, starting with the Buddha's major disciples and continuing with various big names among later generations of acaryas in mainland India.

Nagarjuna, for example, is claimed by the Chinese to have been the 14th Indian patriarch of the Zen school, while Vasubandhu is claimed to have been both the second patriarch of the Pure Land school and the 21st patriarch of the Zen school — a very busy bloke! Yet the Chinese, in effect, would have us believe that the acaryas' occupation of these leadership positions was not only completely overlooked by Indian Buddhist historians, but also failed to find any expression in the writings of the acaryas themselves. There's nothing in the works that can reliably be attributed to Vasubandhu to indicate that the man was an enthusiast for the ritualistic adoration of Amitabha. There's nothing in the works that can reliably be attributed to Nagarjuna to indicate that he was into some "special transmission outside the sūtras" or that he was a koan enthusiast.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 4, 2014 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma & defending human/civil rights

Content:

No quarrel on that score, since I regard human rights advocacy and the like as coming under dāna rather than sīla. But it seems you've moved the goalposts here, for your earlier point to which my question was a response ("the urge to defend one's own rights comes from the sense of discontent with the extant state of affairs where his/her rights are being violated,") was concerned merely with the moral compatibility of human rights advocacy with the Dhamma, not with its obligatoriness or otherwise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 12, 2014 7:39 AM

Title: Re: Does anyone know if Luang Por Prasit is still alive?

Content:

Luang Phor is still living and currently establishing a branch wat in Phrao just down the road from me. You'll find plenty of material online if you google his name (หลวงพ่อประสิทธิ์ ปุญญมากโร) and the name of his wat (วัดป่าหมื่นใหม่) in Thai.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 13, 2014 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Lokavidu

Content:

Offhand I don't recall lokavidū being defined in the Suttas.

In the commentaries it's the 'loka' of the Rohitassa Sutta that is given most weight. Although the Visuddhimagga adds many other senses of 'loka' as being applicable here (e.g. the Buddha's ability to see all the realms of existence with his supernormal powers, and suchlike), in most other places, when giving a succinct and non-exhaustive definition, the commentaries just stick to the Rohitassa 'loka'. So, to that extent they concur with the sense that Ajahn Munindo wishes to emphasise.

As for the 'seeing through', this is exactly what the teaching of loka to Rohitassa was all about: the world's nature to arise and cease is to be seen with right understanding, and it's because this seeing is a seeing-through that it issues in nibbidā and virāga with respect to the world.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 14, 2014 1:16 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

It would be an imprudent thing to attempt in Northern Ireland, for the Taigs might mistake him for an Orangeman. But elsewhere in the British Isles I suppose it's as uncertain as it is with the Indian's headdress.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 14, 2014 4:17 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

And not nearly as funny as a certain Dutch monk who went to teach in South Africa a couple of decades ago. His hosts took him on an excursion to a Zulu village whose chief gave orders that he be treated as a guest of honour. At the chief's behest the villagers proceeded to adorn the monk in leopard skins and bright orange ostrich feathers, wrapped cow tails around his arms, and finally armed him with a spear and an umbumbuluzo battle shield. The monk gamely played along with the whole thing, ending up looking something like these chaps:

1.jpg (67.71 KiB) Viewed 2271 times

However, he found himself in hot water when some pictures of the event got back to Sri Lanka and were shown to his preceptor.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 14, 2014 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

1.jpg (145.77 KiB) Viewed 2843 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 14, 2014 11:55 PM

Title: Re: Why is Buddhist Faith not blind?

Content:

It seems to me that Ñāṇavīra's claim can be derived from the sutta passage he cites in support of it only by committing the most elementary of formal fallacies. The passage — from the Paṭiṣaṇṇaka Sutta— states that anyone who wholly lacks the five faculties is a puthujjana; from this Ñāṇavīra concludes that anyone who is a puthujjana must wholly lack the five faculties. This is like arguing that since all wingless birds are flightless, therefore all flightless birds must be wingless. But as any ostrich, emu or penguin might have told Ñāṇavīra, to reason so is to commit the sentential fallacy of affirming the consequent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Why is Buddhist Faith not blind?

Content:

As I read it, the Buddha is saying that if one is wholly lacking in the five faculties then one is a puthujjana. But it doesn't follow from this that the faculties cannot be partially present in a puthujjana. Indeed it implies that they can be partially present, else all the sabba words in sabbena sabbam sabbathā sabbam natthi would be redundant.

Yassa kho, bhikkhave, imāni pañcindriyāni sabbena sabbam sabbathā sabbam natthi, tamahaṃ 'bāhiro puthujjanapakke ʻhito' ti vadāmi.

“And bhikkhus, I say that he in whom these five faculties are wholly, completely and in every way absent is an outsider, one standing on the side of the worldlings.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 10:49 AM

Title: Re: Why is Buddhist Faith not blind?

Content:

Just a brief supplementary note: it seems to me that the subject of the indriyas is much more ably handled by the commentators than by Ñāṇavīra Thera. In particular, the commentarial positing of a twofold indriya-pentad, one mundane and the other supramundane, is a hermeneutic device that permits the ready harmonisation of those sutta passages that appear to imply exclusive possession of the indriyas by ariyans, and those which imply that the indriyas may be available to all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 11:17 AM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

Yes. That's what I meant by the word gamely.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 12:28 PM

Title: Re: Revealing a cheating spouse: Wrong Speech?

Content:

OVER THE COFFIN

They stand confronting, the coffin between,
His wife of old, and his wife of late,
And the dead man whose both they had been
Seems listening aloof, as to things past date.

—‘I have called,’ says the first. ‘Do you marvel or not?’

‘In truth,’ says the second, ‘I do—somewhat.’

'Well, there was a word to be said by me!...
I divorced that man because of you—
It seemed I must do it, boundenly;
But now I am older, and tell you true,
For life is little, and dead lies he;
I would I had let alone you two!
And both of us, scorning parochial ways,
Had lived like the wives in the patriarch's days.'
— Thomas Hardy

If I were a woman, and in the advantageous position of knowing all that I know as a man,
I should take the view of the divorcée in Hardy's poem and wish that my friend would
mind her own business and keep her knowledge of my husband's infidelities to herself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 4:00 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headress

Content:

Fair enough, but doesn't that mean that with respect to the present issue your concern
is misdirected? I mean if it's the future fate of the Theravada in the west that worries you,
surely the real problem in the OP's video is not that some Mahayanist is making a
feathered wazzock of himself, but that Theravadin bhikkhus should be fraternizing with
these sort of people in the first place?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 4:39 PM

Title: Theravada/Mahayana monastic interaction

Content:

My own preference, in short, would be for oecumenism in Europe and isolationism in
the USA. Presently I've no opinion about Australia, NZ, South Africa, etc.

Oecumenism in the USA will be fatal to the Theravada; with America's ever-invasive,
"melting pot" inclusivist nonsense there is no way the Theravada monastic sangha will
be able to retain its integrity in the long term unless it adopts the sort of strategic
withdrawal one associates with the likes of the Amish or ultra-Orthodox Jews. In Europe,
on the other hand, the evidence of the last three decades is that Theravadin bhikkhus
are able to interact and coöperate to a quite considerable extent with Mahayana
persons and institutions, to their mutual benefit and without the sangha suffering any
fundamental alteration in character.

And what do you think, Tilt?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 4:40 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

But perhaps it merits a new thread, being only rather tenuously related to monks in feathers?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 5:11 PM

Title: Re: Monk with Native American headdress

Content:

I'm not sure about that. If the recital was just for the sake of a pūjā or a paritta, then of course it wouldn't be a sangha-kamma. But where a saṅgāyana is held for the purpose of generating a consensus, or reaffirming an existing consensus, that the recited material is dhamma and not a-dhamma, vinaya and not a-vinaya, then I believe it would in fact be reckoned a sanghakamma. The presence of laity in the sīmā would constitute a defect in the assembly (parisā-vipatti), but that wouldn't stop it from being a sanghakamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 15, 2014 5:24 PM

Title: Re: Why is Buddhist Faith not blind?

Content:

Yes, that sounds about right to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 19, 2014 7:57 AM

Title: Re: You have been warned

Content:

Alt "comix"

Crikey. While I can believe that <http://viz.co.uk/category/roger-irrelevant> and <http://viz.co.uk/category/postman-plod> might be minions of Satan, surely not <http://viz.co.uk/category/johnny-fartpants?!?>

a.jpg (222.74 KiB) Viewed 1806 times

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 19, 2014 6:12 PM
Title: Re: You have been warned
Content:

I wouldn't be so sure. If we can trust Clement of Alexandria's criteria, the fact that Johnny's methane emissions, though noisome and evil in themselves, nevertheless invariably issue in some good end, infallibly indicates that Master Fartpants is on the side of the angels.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 20, 2014 9:29 PM
Title: Ms Sheffield's Mettā Project
Content:

Kimberley Sheffield, a psychology doctoral student at the University of Northampton, is presently researching mettā-bhāvanā for her thesis. If you use mettā-bhāvanā, whether as your sole practice or merely as part of your practice, Kimberley would be grateful for your help:

“Looking for a few more people who do Metta/Loving Kindness to take part in a short online task. Please get in touch if you're interested – kimberley.sheffield (at) northampton.ac.uk Thank you!”

<https://www.facebook.com/kimberley.sheffield>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 21, 2014 6:55 AM
Title: Re: Sending metta to the dying?
Content:

This "othering" of the Thais is among the stupidest things I've ever read. The correct conclusion is that Thais grieve just like anyone else, only they do their weeping in private (and certainly not in front of monks), deeming it in poor taste to make a public exposure of their negative emotions.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 22, 2014 7:09 AM

Title: Re: Christianity as a subset of Buddhism

Content:

Maybe they do, maybe they don't, but either way a non-eternal heaven isn't what the majority of believing Christians believe in or hope for, nor is it what any mainstream Christian church teaches.

Opponents of Psychopannychism and Thnetopsychism include the Roman Catholic Church, most mainline Protestant denominations, and most conservative Protestants, Evangelicals, and Fundamentalists.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_mortalism

It seems to me that you're basically falling into the same kind of triviality and irrelevance that one finds in the interfaith writings of the late Ajahn Buddhadasa. Like Buddhadasa you concoct a Christianity that would scarcely be acceptable to a single Christian on earth and then proceed to demonstrate how well your idiosyncratic version of Christianity harmonizes with Buddhism. Perhaps the most fitting response to this is: "So?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 22, 2014 8:38 PM

Title: Re: Christianity as a subset of Buddhism

Content:

If we are speaking of Christian Universalism or Unitarianism as historical phenomena, then neither would be included in "mainstream Christianity", for since the suppression of Arianism most Christians have been trinitarians, and since the anathematizing of Origen's theses most Christians have supposed that not all will be saved.

But if we are speaking of what nowadays goes by the name of Unitarian Universalism, then nothing much at all can be assumed about what its adherents believe. The whole thing is so credally vacuous that if we hear somebody say: "Jones is a Unitarian Universalist" we know no more about the man than if we had been told: "Jones is spiritual but not religious," or even: "Jones is a rather nice chap."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 23, 2014 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Christianity as a subset of Buddhism

Content:

It isn't the want of specificity in the Seven Principles, but simply the fact that they are neither a creed nor even remotely credal in character.

Of more relevance than your link is the page headed "Are My Beliefs Welcome?", to which the answer appears to be "Yes!" no matter what the enquirer's beliefs may happen to be.

<http://www.uua.org/beliefs/welcome/index.shtml>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 23, 2014 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Christianity as a subset of Buddhism

Content:

Practically speaking, this is the only thing that we've got to identify it with. Normative Christianity cannot be defined with reference to God's Elect, for these (like the Buddhist ariyasangha) constitute an invisible church. Since they're invisible we've no way of knowing who they are. And so we can only go by the visible church, comprising both elect and reprobate Christians.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 23, 2014 6:16 AM

Title: Re: Christianity as a subset of Buddhism

Content:

It is a polysemous word which you chose to take in a derisory sense, even though your own preferred dictionary offered a non-derisory one: emptied of or lacking content, which is precisely the intended sense.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 23, 2014 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Restraint, abandonment, development, protection (AN 4:69)

Content:

1. Saṃvara
2. Pahāna
3. Bhāvanā
4. Anurakkhaṇā

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 24, 2014 1:05 AM

Title: Re: Going For Refuge - Resources

Content:

The author's source—the Commentary to the Khuddakapatha—isn't correctly represented here. It doesn't state that a breach of refuge occurs merely because one has "come to regard" some exterior Teacher, Dhamma or Sangha as superior to the Triple Gem. The breach occurs only when this inner attitude is given outward expression. Specifically, it is when one performs one of the four kinds of action that would constitute refuge-going, but with the action taking something other than the Triple Gem as its object, that one's Buddhist refuge is lost.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 27, 2014 3:33 PM

Title: Re: How come all the Theravada Countries so under-develop?

Content:

Interesting theory, but as we know from the case of the Danish tennis star Caroline Wozniacki, neon-pink hair isn't necessarily incompatible with self-discipline and high achievement.

z.jpg (70.29 KiB) Viewed 2939 times

Perhaps a more serious risk to the Japanese economy will be those yellow-haired men wearing shirts decorated with multi-coloured phalluses.

2.jpg (385.25 KiB) Viewed 2939 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 27, 2014 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Atanatiya Sutta?

Content:

What goes by the name of "Āṭānāṭiya Paritta" doesn't correspond exactly to what in the Dīgha Nikāya is called the "Āṭānāṭiya Sutta".

The Āṭānāṭiya Paritta can be divided into three parts: (1) from "appasannehi" up to "parittantaṃ bhaṇāmahe"; (2) from "vipassissa ca namatthu" to "mahantaṃ vītasāraḍaṃ"; and (3) from "ete caññe ca sambuddhā" to the end.

Of these three it is only the second that is derived from the Āṭānāṭiya Sutta. The first and last parts are post-canonical compositions preserved in an ancient Sinhalese paritta anthology.

And so the first part is an introductory passage in which the chanter announces his intention to recite the paritta. The second comprises a number of stanzas taken from the Āṭānāṭiya Sutta itself. Just how many stanzas is subject to regional variation — it might be as few as three or as many as all the stanzas in the entire Sutta. The third part gives a somewhat devotional fillip to the whole thing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 28, 2014 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Sourcing quote attributed to Buddha

Content:

I don't know of a saying like this in the Suttas, but it might be intended as a very terse paraphrase of Buddhaghosa's account of "breaking down the barriers" in chapter IX of the Visuddhimagga:

When his resentment towards that hostile person has been thus allayed, then he can turn his mind with loving-kindness towards that person too, just as towards the one who is dear, the very dear friend, and the neutral person. Then he should break down the barriers by practicing loving-kindness over and over again, accomplishing mental impartiality towards the four persons, that is to say, himself, the dear person, the neutral person and the hostile person.

The characteristic of it is this. Suppose this person is sitting in a place with a dear, a neutral, and a hostile person, himself being the fourth; then bandits come to him and say, "Venerable sir, give us a bhikkhu," and on being asked why, they answer, "So that we may kill him and use the blood of his throat as an offering;" then if that bhikkhu thinks, "Let them take this one, or this one," he has not broken down the barriers. And also if he thinks, "Let them take me but not these three," he has not broken down the barriers either. Why? Because he seeks the harm of him whom he wishes to be taken and seeks the welfare of the other only. But it is when he does not see a single one among the four people to be given to the bandits and he directs his mind impartially towards himself and towards those three people that he has broken down the barriers. Hence the Ancients said:

When he discriminates between
The four, that is himself, the dear,
The neutral, and the hostile one,
Then "skilled" is not the name he gets,
Nor "having amity at will,"
But only "kindly towards beings."

Now, when a bhikkhu's barriers
Have all the four been broken down,
He treats with equal amity
The whole world with its deities;
Far more distinguished than the first
Is he who knows no barriers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 31, 2014 3:27 PM

Title: Re: Is jhana possible?

Content:

You probably won't get a reply as Nathan's Dhamma Wheel account has been deleted. He was on Dharma Overground for quite a long period, but hasn't posted there for about a year now.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 1, 2014 12:30 PM

Title: Re: Self-view and Anatta - Interpretation

Content:

For so exquisitely mystical a fellow as you, surely nothing could be more important than heeding the time-honoured advice of W.S. Gilbert:

If you're anxious for to shine in the high aesthetic line,
as a man of culture rare,

You must get up all the germs of the transcendental terms,
and plant them everywhere.

You must lie upon the daisies and discourse in novel phrases of your
complicated state of mind,

The meaning doesn't matter if it's only idle chatter
of a transcendental kind.

And everyone will say,

As you walk your mystic way,

"If this young man expresses himself in terms too deep for me,

Why, what a very singularly deep young man

this deep young man must be!"

(from <http://www.readbookonline.net/readOnLine/43478/>)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 2, 2014 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Día de Muertos

Content:

I always associate el Día de Muertos with my half a dozen or so unsuccessful attempts to read Malcolm Lowry's https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Under_the_Volcano. To date I don't think I've ever got beyond the first chapter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 3, 2014 11:30 AM

Title: Re: Día de Muertos

Content:

These are eaten in the Vatican too, in the form of dead Pope lollipops.

a.jpg (136.61 KiB) Viewed 1648 times

Some commentary on the subject from Brummie expert on Catholic affairs, Stewart Lee:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 3, 2014 12:30 PM

Title: Re: Día de Muertos

Content:

I think you mean 2nd November, which is All Souls' Day.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/All_Souls%27_Day

1st November is all Saints' Day, which commemorates the faithful departed who've ascended to heaven, whereas All Souls' Day is mainly about the souls in Purgatory.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/All_Saints%27_Day

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 5, 2014 10:26 AM

Title: Re: Chocolate Muffin Kamma

Content:

Is what the result of previous bad kamma?

1. That you were offered the muffins?
2. That one of the muffins was bad?
3. That you chose the bad one?
4. That you experienced the muffins through various sense-bases?
5. That you died after eating one of them?

I believe the answers according to the Abhidhamma would be no, no, no, a qualified yes, and maybe.

1. No. One's past kamma is not a cause for the arising of any kind of cetanā in another being.
2. No. The e-coli bacterium is not included among those rūpadhammas whose arising is conditioned by one's past kamma.
3. No. One's past kamma is only a cause for the arising of certain kinds of cetanā in oneself, namely, those cetanās that accompany resultant consciousnesses. But it is

not a resultant consciousness that is responsible for the choosing of one muffin rather than the other.

4. One's experiences of the different facets of the poisoned muffin, i.e., as visual, olfactory, gustatory and tactile objects, are all vipāka. But they are not necessarily all the vipākas of bad kamma. If the muffin has a desirable smell, for example, then one's experience of this is the ripening of past kusala kamma.

5. The ensuing death might be due to the ripening of past kamma, but is not necessarily so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 9, 2014 7:15 AM

Title: Re: Can someone record Paritta chanting in english?

Content:

To clarify, do you really mean a chanting of these suttas in English? Or do you just wish to hear them read aloud in a normal, unornamented manner? If it's the former, I believe the monks and nuns of Amaravati have taken to doing their morning and evening chanting in English, though I don't know whether they do the same with parittas. Perhaps Ven. Gavesako could chip in here.

On the other hand, if you just want to hear the parittas read out in English, then you might try contacting the English sāmaṇera Rakkhita, whom I understand has recorded hundreds of hours of himself reciting translations of Pali material. His Facebook chanting page is here: <https://www.facebook.com/groups/1436701486548451>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 10, 2014 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma talk on Bhikkhuni Ordination by Ajahn Amaro

Content:

It can be downloaded from archive.org

<https://tinyurl.com/q2fsc34>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 11, 2014 11:29 AM

Title: Re: Is cow urine a medicine?

Content:

I've no recollection of any leper's finger ever falling into my almsbowl, nor of any other comparably disagreeable experience. But I don't imagine this was a terribly common experience even in pre-modern times:

Q: Do fingers and toes fall off when someone gets leprosy?

A: No. The bacteria attack nerve endings and destroy the body's ability to feel pain and injury. Without feeling pain, people injure themselves and the injuries can become infected, resulting in tissue loss. Fingers and toes become shortened and deformed as the cartilage is absorbed into the body. Repeated injury and infection of numb areas in the fingers or toes can cause the bones to shorten. The tissues around them shrink, making them short.

<http://www.leprosy.org/leprosy-faqs/>

I've also heard of lepers' fingers and toes being chewed off by rats while they're sleeping.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 11, 2014 12:02 PM

Title: Re: Mark Venerables as Venerables

Content:

What do you mean by 'strange'?

If you mean unusual or surprising, then no, it's so exceedingly common and normal that it ought not to surprise anyone.

If you mean difficult to understand or explain (as in: "children have some strange ideas" or "he's a very strange man"), then again no, it's pretty easy to understand or explain. Monasteries, being by and large generously supported, have the wherewithal to avail themselves of all the best of modern technology.

If you mean slightly or undefinably unwell or ill at ease (as in: "her head felt a little strange"), then I suppose it may prompt such feelings in some, though not in all.

If you mean not previously visited or seen, (as in: "she was lost in a strange country") then yes, it is strange in comparison to former eras when neither householders nor those gone forth had internet access.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 12, 2014 5:53 AM

Title: Re: Anand-Carlsen aṃsa dvi

Content:

Susan Polgar's live commentary on game 3.

<https://susanpolgar.blogspot.com/2014/11/anand-carlsen-game-3-live-commentary.html>

Welcome to Carlsen - Anand Sochi World Championship game 3 (LIVE commentary by me).

Thanks for joining me. What can we expect from Anand today? After just two games, Anand is already behind with a tough loss with black in game two. He also had a shaky first game with white. If he does not turn things around now, it may be too much of an uphill climb to try to regain his title.

I expect a more aggressive Anand today. He realized that he cannot keep up with Carlsen in dry positions. Changes in strategy and changes in attitude are needed. As I said after game two, he must play the position and not Carlsen. Just loosen the collar, take a deep breath, have fun, give his all and qué será será!

Anand - Carlsen (game 3)

1 d4 Nf6 2 c4 e6 3 Nf3 d5 Magnus opted for something safer

4 Nc3 Be7 5 Bf4 0-0 Typical position for Queen's Gambit Declined

6 e3 Nbd7 7 c5 c6 Nf6 2 c4 e6 3 Nf3 d5 4 Nc3 Be7 5 Bf4 O-O 6 e3 Nbd7 7 c5 c6 8 Bd3 b6 9 b4 a5 10 a3 Ba6 11 Bxa6 Rxa6 12 b5 The players are cranking out these book moves in lightning speed. Anand is going for a sharp line instead of something more positional.

12...cxb5 13 c6 Qc8 14 c7 b4 15 Nb5 We are still in theory.

15...a4 It is interesting that both teams feel that this position is good for them. We will see which team did a better job preparing for this game. 16 Rc1 is the move here. But Anand is taking time for this move and he is biting his nails. Did he forget his analysis?

16 Rc1 Ne4 Anand has 2 choices, 17 Ng5 (more aggressive and less well known) and 17 Nd2 (more popular).

17 Ng5 It seems that Magnus is surprised by 17 Ng5. Perhaps he was expecting Nd2. Magnus has a few decent responses. 17...Nxg5 17...Ndf6 or 17...Bxg5. He's taking time to decide how to proceed. Magnus has both hands over his face. He is in deep thought. Difficult decision to make on how to continue this game.

If 17...Nxg5 18 Bd6 Ra5 19 Bxe7 Rxb5 20 Qxa4 Ra5 21 Qxb4 Ra7 22 Bxg5 Rxc7 23 Rxc7 Qxc7 is a possibility.

17...Ndf6 After about 30 minutes, Magnus chose the safer Ndf6. Wise choice if he can't remember all the analysis. Anand can take the knight of e4 then Bd6 or even Qc2. White is slightly better but Anand also needs to decide how to continue.

18 Nxe4 Nxe4 Interesting choice for Anand here is 19 f3. Anand could not have asked for a better chance. This is super sharp. One mistake by either side and it's over.

19. f3 has been played! Let's see who remembers more home analysis This is the 14th game between Carlsen-Anand in the past 2 WC matches. This is the best Anand got out of the opening so far in my opinion. The reason I said this is the best Anand got is because Magnus usually stays away from sharp theoretical battles which clearly favor Anand.

19...Ra5 This is a possibility 20 fxe4 Rxb5 21 Qxa4 Ra5 22 Qc6 bxa3 23 exd5 exd5 24 O-O f5 25 Qxb6 Ra6 26 Qb3 Qe6 and White is better.

20 fxe4 Rxb5 21 Qxa4 Ra5 22 Qc6 Anand is up by more than 30 minutes on the clock. It's not that Magnus doesn't know this. But it's clear that he has to recall what he knows, which is costing him a lot of time.

22...bxa3 Let's be clear. Both sides know this line. But it seems that Anand remembers it better & Magnus has to recall what he knows.

23 exd5 We are still in theory. Magnus is thinking between 23...Rxd5 (a better choice) and 23...Bb4+.

23...Rxe5 And the best option for white here is 24 Qxb6. White has a lot to play for. Black's position is cramped.

24 Qxb6 Anand took time for this move, which is the only move to maintain initiatives. Now the plan for Magnus is to put his f8 R on c8. Therefore Qd7 makes sense.

24...Qd7 Now 25 Qa6 to put pressure on the c8 square.

25 0-0 Anand got cold feet and went with a safer option. Magnus only option is to put his Rook on the c file to block the passed pawn.

25...Rc8 Anand has to try to work the c pawn. So the idea is to play Rc6 to stop the mobility of the black queen, then either double up the rooks and Qa6 or move the other Rook to the b file.

26 Rc6 Time will be a serious factor soon. Magnus has about 25 minutes for 15 moves or so without increments. Not an easy task in this position. The problem for Magnus is there is really no "good" plan. And he cannot just sit because Anand can improve his position.

26...g5 27 Bg3 Another option is Be5 to provoke f6 then back to g3.

27...Bb4 A very interesting idea from Magnus. White cannot take the bishop because his rook of c6 is hanging. The idea is Ba5 to attack c7 pawn. Magnus is very clever. He is making Anand calculate this out. He is making it complicated for his opponent White is clearly better but has many options to continue: Ra1, Rc2, Qa6 or even Qb8. What to do, what to do? Not a good sign. Anand shook his head a few times. I think he's shocked by

Bb4 from Magnus.

28. Ra1 This is the best option at this moment and Anand found it. 7 minutes for 12 moves for Magnus without increments. This is getting serious!

28...Ba5 This is a bad move as 29 Qa6 and white is close to winning.

29 Qa6 Bxc7 Another bad move. Now 30 Qc4 and white wins easily.

30 Qc4 I expect resignation to come soon. Impossible to hold this position.

30...e5 31 Bxe5 No chance to save this.

31...Rxe5 32 dxe5 Qe7 Now Rc5 or Rc1 and white will soon be up a rook.

33 e6 This also wins easily.

33...Kf8 34 Rc1 1-0 Magnus resigned. The scored is tied up at 1.5 - 1.5.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 12, 2014 6:05 AM

Title: Re: Anand-Carlsen aṃsa dvi

Content:

Carlsen after Anand plays 17 Ng5.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 12, 2014 6:27 AM

Title: Re: Mark Venerables as Venerables

Content:

Okay, I see what you're getting at. Homelessness (anagāriya) for a bhikkhu means (1) the abandonment of home- and property-ownership and (2) the fourfold sīla (i.e. pāṭimokkha-observance, right livelihood, sense-restraint, and proper use of the four requisites). It doesn't mean being peripatetic and of no fixed abode, even if some bhikkhus do at times undertake such a manner of living.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 8:13 AM

Title: Re: The last thought moment

Content:

This commentarial teaching finds implicit support in the
<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/an/an06/an06.016.than.html>:

"Now it may be that you are thinking, 'Nakula's mother will not be able to support the children or maintain the household after I'm gone,' but you shouldn't see things in that way. I am skilled at spinning cotton, at carding matted wool. I can support the children and maintain the household after you are gone. So don't be worried as you die, householder. Death is painful for one who is worried. The Blessed One has criticized being worried at the time of death."

Given that the Buddha's policy was to criticize only those things which issue in unwished-for consequences or which hinder wished-for consequences, why would he criticize "being worried at the time of death"? The only unwished-for consequence for a person at death's door is a bad rebirth, and the only wished-for consequences that might be impeded are (1) a deathbed breakthrough to Dhamma (i.e. sotāpatti or arahatta — the time of death is one of the four occasions when this is most likely to happen) or, failing that, (2) a bright rebirth. Worrying at the time of one's death therefore merits criticism because one's state of mind at this time affects one's rebirth.

There is further support in the

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.136.nymo.html>, wherein good or bad rebirths are described as occurring as a result of right or wrong views being adopted at the time of death:

"Now, Ananda, there is the person who has killed living beings here [and the rest of ten akusala kammāpatha up to] ... has had wrong view. And on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in the states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell. But (perhaps) the evil kamma producing his suffering was done by him earlier, or the evil kamma producing his suffering was done by him later, or wrong view was undertaken and completed by him at the time of his death. And that was why, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappeared in the states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell.

"Now there is the person who has killed living beings here... has had wrong view. And on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in a happy destination, in the heavenly world. But (perhaps) the good kamma producing his happiness was done by him earlier, or the good kamma producing his happiness was done by him later, or right view was undertaken and completed by him at the time of his death. And that was why, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappeared in a happy destination, in the heavenly world. But since he has killed living beings here... has had wrong view, he will feel the result of that here and now, or in his next rebirth, or in some subsequent existence."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 8:53 AM

Title: Re: Long-term lay practitioner life in Thai meditation centr

Content:

If you are over fifty and have a Thai bank account with 800,000 baht in it, you could apply for a retirement visa. Then, provided you didn't undertake any paid employment, you could live permanently in a Thai wat or meditation centre without the need to leave

the country every 3 months.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 10:10 AM

Title: Re: Wat Saket - Maha Nikaya or Dhammayuttika Nikaya?

Content:

Unlikely. It's an urban study monastery, so the required training for a new monk would entail no more than cajoling him to memorize the basic parittas and imparting the minimal level of Vinaya observance that's needed for a monk to evade public criticism. Training in meditation is something the monk would have to seek out for himself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Wat Saket - Maha Nikaya or Dhammayuttika Nikaya?

Content:

Well, I wouldn't absolutely exclude the possibility that your local monk is competent to teach meditation. It's just that this wouldn't be typical of monks from Wat Saket. It's a monastery that's geared towards turning out sangha educators and administrators rather than yogic virtuosos.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 6:07 PM

Title: Re: Long-term lay practitioner life in Thai meditation centr

Content:

Maybe, though it would be prudent to have some sort of back-up plan. I mean it's not an arrangement that has the same stability as if one were being granted citizenship of Thailand (a near-impossibility). There would be nothing to stop the Thai government from suddenly introducing a huge increase in the amount one must have in the bank to be eligible, or even suddenly revoking all visas of this type. Moreover, given the political and social instability that's widely anticipated will succeed the ailing King's death, there's no telling how liveable Thailand is going to be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 14, 2014 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Knowingly consuming trace amounts of alcohol

Content:

If it's my own favourite brand, Cadbury-Bournville's Old Jamaica, then no, for as one might expect of Quaker-manufactured chocolate, the rum flavour comes from a non-alcoholic additive.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Martial Law in Thailand

Content:

<http://www.khaosodenglish.com/dictionary.php?group=&id=23>

"Thai police later clarified that eating a sandwich with 'anti-coup intent' constituted a criminal act."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 7:12 AM

Title: Re: The world:Loka vs. Conventional

Content:

The particle *alam* doesn't mean "useless", but something like "Enough of that!" when the speaker is announcing his intention to change the subject.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 6:46 PM

Title: Re: No birth, death, or enlightenment

Content:

It's inferrable from the fact that Māra the Malign is "Master of this Generation" and "Lord of the Sensual Realm", and so the Paranimmitavasavattidevaloka, being the highest location in that realm, is the sort of place in which one would expect him to be domiciled.

However, for an explicit statement locating Māra among the Paranimmitavasavattī devas, one must turn to the commentary to the Mūlapariyaya Sutta:

Te tividhā sammutidevā upapattidevā visuddhidevāti. Sammutidevā nāma rājāno deviyo rājakumārā. Upapattidevā nāma cātumahārājike deve upādāya tatuttaridevā. Visuddhidevā nāma arahanto khīṇāsavā. Idha pana upapattidevā daṭṭhabbā, no ca kho avisesena. Paranimmitavasavattidevaloke māraṃ sapariṣaṃ ṭhapetvā sesā cha kāmāvacarā idha devāti adhippetā. Tattha sabbā atthavaṇṇanā bhūtavāre vuttanayeneva veditabbā.

Pajāpatin ti ettha pana māro pajāpatitī veditabbo. Keci pana "tesaṃ tesaṃ devānaṃ adhipatīnaṃ mahārājādīnametaṃ adhivacanan" ti vadanti. Taṃ devaggahaṇeneva tesaṃ gahitattā ayuttanti mahāaṭṭhakathāyaṃ paṭikkhittaṃ, māroeva pana sattasaṅkhātāya pajāya adhipatibhāvena idha pajāpatitī adhippeto. So kuhiṃ vasati? Paranimmitavasavattidevaloke tatra hi vasavattirājā rajjaṃ kāreti. Māro ekasmiṃ

padese attano parisāya issariyaṃ pavattento rajjapaccante dāmarikarājaputto viya vasatīti vadanti. Māraggaṇeṇeva cettha māraparisāyapi gahaṇaṃ veditabbaṃ.
(MA. i. 33-4)

Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation (from Discourse on the Root of Existence):

MA.jpg (407.88 KiB) Viewed 859 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 6:54 PM

Title: Re: samanera ordination chanting in Pali-Thai

Content:

The upasampadā formula is the same in both Nikāyas and can be downloaded from Buddhanet:

http://www.buddhanet.net/pdf_file/ordination.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Looking for Information About Publication Dhamma Spread

Content:

In 1980's Bangkok, copies of Dhamma Spread used to be floating about all over the place, but I haven't seen any for at least two decades now. The monk responsible, Phra Appichato, was a student of Phra Khru Palad Thitavaṇṇo (aka Ajahn Khao), the late abbot of Wat Boonsrimunikorn, a Mahasi-style meditation centre in Bangkok. In the end Appichato moved to Japan and went off the radar. I've no idea whether he's still in robes. Sorry I can't tell you any more than that; despite the fact that we are both Yorkshiremen and lived in Bangkok at the same time, for some reason his path and mine never crossed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 15, 2014 9:58 PM

Title: Re: Questions about hell

Content:

The nerayikas are in extreme pain and terror. The nirayapālas are not in pain, but being petas they are of course unable to derive any pleasure from their infliction of torture. Why then do they do it? My guess is that they're probably so pissed off at being dragged away from frolicking with their nubile nymphs in their mobile mansions, that they can't help but take it out on the poor nerayikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Questions about hell

Content:

Oh yes. I mean one can't intentionally hurt someone and not perform an akusala kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 6:03 AM

Title: Re: Questions about hell

Content:

Yes. We have here a pre-volition (pubbacetanā) to save innocent lives, which then gives rise to a volition to kill someone who is about to take innocent lives. The effect of the pre-volition (or in modern parlance, the motive) is twofold: firstly it mitigates the degree of unwholesomeness involved in the killing; secondly it is itself wholesome mind-door kamma. It does not, however, have the power to transform the akusala act of intentional killing into a kusala one, as some Mahayanists misguidedly aver.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 9:36 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Yes, one can easily do that. I, for example, can easily read it as a Joycean stream-of-consciousness account of a trip to Burger King.

The question, though, is how natural and reasonable any of these easily-arrived-at non-literal interpretations might be, and how likely it is that they faithfully reproduce the thoughts that prompted the Buddha's speech. In the present case I submit that the phrase "breaking up of the body" strongly militates against a figurative reading. In your proposed reading we have a murderer whose killing leads to a certain "state of mind". But in between the killing and the ensuing state of mind, we have the killer's own death and the killer's own rotting cadaver to account for. In your non-literal reading what do they stand for?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 5:27 PM

Title: Re: The world:Loka vs. Conventional

Content:

I'll have to paste it in as I don't know if it's available online.

The Brahmins

Then two brahmin cosmologists[1932] approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, they sat down to one side and said to him:

“Master Gotama, Pūraṇa Kassapa claims to be all-knowing and all-seeing and to have all-embracing knowledge and vision: ‘Whether I am walking, standing, sleeping, or awake, knowledge and vision are constantly and continuously present to me.’ He says thus: ‘With infinite knowledge, I dwell knowing and seeing the world to be infinite.’ But Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta also claims to be all-knowing and all-seeing and to have all-embracing knowledge and vision: ‘Whether I am walking, standing, sleeping, and awake, knowledge and vision are constantly and continuously present to me.’ He says thus: ‘With infinite knowledge, I dwell knowing and seeing the world to be finite.’[1933] When these two claimants to knowledge make claims that are mutually contradictory, who speaks truthfully and who falsely?”

“Enough, brahmins, let this be: ‘When these two claimants to knowledge make claims that are mutually contradictory, who speaks truthfully and who falsely?’ I will teach you the Dhamma. Listen and attend closely. I will speak.”

“Yes, sir,” those brahmins replied. The Blessed One said this:

“Suppose, brahmins, there were four men standing in the four quarters possessing supreme movement [1934] and speed and a supreme stride. Their speed was like that of a light arrow easily shot by a firm-bowed archer—one trained, skillful, and experienced [1935]—across the shadow of a palmyra tree. Their stride was such that it could reach from the eastern ocean to the western ocean. Then the person standing in the eastern quarter would say thus: ‘I will reach the end of the world by traveling.’ Having a life span of a hundred years, living for a hundred years, he might travel for a hundred years without pausing except to eat, drink, chew, and taste, to defecate and urinate, and to dispel fatigue with sleep; yet he would die along the way without having reached the end of the world. [1936] Then the person standing in the western quarter would say thus ... the person standing in the northern quarter would say thus ... the person standing in the southern quarter would say thus: ‘I will reach the end of the world by traveling.’ Having a life span of a hundred years, living for a hundred years, he might travel for a hundred years without pausing except to eat, drink, chew, and taste, to defecate and urinate, and to dispel fatigue with sleep; yet he would die along the way without having reached the end of the world. For what reason? I say, brahmins, that by this kind of running [1937] one cannot know, see, or reach the end of the world. And yet I say that without having reached the end of the world there is no making an end of suffering.

“These five objects of sensual pleasure, brahmins, are called ‘the world’ in the Noble One’s discipline. What five? Forms cognizable by the eye that are wished for, desired,

agreeable, pleasing, connected with sensual pleasure, tantalizing; sounds cognizable by the ear ... odors cognizable by the nose ... tastes cognizable by the tongue ... tactile objects cognizable by the body that are wished for, desired, agreeable, pleasing, connected with sensual pleasure, tantalizing. These five objects of sensual pleasure are called 'the world' in the Noble One's discipline.

(1) "Here, brahmins, secluded from sensual pleasures ... a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the first jhāna This is called a bhikkhu who, having come to the end of the world, dwells at the end of the world. Others say thus of him: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.' I also say thus: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.'

(2)–(4) "Again, with the subsiding of thought and examination, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the second jhāna ... the third jhāna ... the fourth jhāna This is called a bhikkhu who, having come to the end of the world, dwells at the end of the world. Others say thus of him: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.' I also say thus: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.'

(5) "Again, with the complete surmounting of perceptions of forms, with the passing away of perceptions of sensory impingement, with non-attention to perceptions of diversity, [perceiving] 'space is infinite,' a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of space. This is called a bhikkhu who, having come to the end of the world, dwells at the end of the world. Others say thus of him: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.' I also say thus: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.'

(6)–(8) "Again, by completely surmounting the base of the infinity of space, [perceiving] 'consciousness is infinite,' a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of consciousness By completely surmounting the base of the infinity of consciousness, [perceiving] 'there is nothing,' a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the base of nothingness By completely surmounting the base of nothingness, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. This is called a bhikkhu who, having come to the end of the world, dwells at the end of the world. Others say thus of him: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.' I also say thus: 'He, too, is included in the world; he, too, is not yet released from the world.'

(9) "Again, by completely surmounting the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the cessation of perception and feeling, and having seen with wisdom, his taints are utterly destroyed. This is called a bhikkhu who, having come to the end of the world, dwells at the end of the world, one who has crossed over attachment to the world."

NOTES

1932 Lokāyatikā brāhmaṇā. See SN 12:48, II 77. Normally, the lokāyatikā are depicted as materialists; here, however, they seem to be simply speculators about the world.

1933 My translation does not follow any of the three editions available to me, which are all problematic. In Be both teachers claim to know an infinite world with infinite knowledge. Pūraṇa Kassapa says: ahaṃ anantena ñāṇena anantaṃ lokaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ viharāmi, and Nātaputta [the Jain teacher Mahāvīra] uses exactly the same words. Since this directly contradicts the statement (in all editions) that the two make mutually opposed claims (ubhinnaṃ aññaṃaññaṃ vipaccanīkavādānaṃ), Be must be faulty here. The error is likely to be old, for several Burmese manuscripts and a Siamese manuscript (referred to in Ee's notes) also have this reading.

In Ce and Ee Pūraṇa Kassapa says: ahaṃ anantena ñāṇena antavantaṃ lokaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ viharāmi, and Nātaputta says: ahaṃ antavantaṃ lokaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ viharāmi. This reading, too, seems faulty. First, it has Nātaputta claim finite knowledge, when it is known that he claimed omniscience or infinite knowledge. Second, though it makes the two teachers claim different ranges of knowledge, their conclusions about the world are the same. A true contradiction would emerge only if one teacher asserts that the world is infinite and the other that it is finite. I take it that they both claim infinite knowledge (anantena ñāṇena) but differ regarding the extent of the world. Since the Jains actually posit the world to be both finite and infinite (see just below), I assume the brahmin understands Nātaputta to hold the world to be finite, and thus takes his opponent Pūraṇa Kassapa to posit the world to be infinite. We have no other sources on Pūraṇa's thought with which to understand his cosmology. Elsewhere the crux of Pūraṇa's philosophy is said to be the doctrine of non-doing (DN 2.17, I 52,21–53,4) or the thesis that beings are defiled and purified without cause, or that there is no cause for knowledge and vision (SN 46:56, V 126,26–30). At 6:57 a system of six classes of people is ascribed to him.

Mahāvīra's view of the world is explained in "Various topics prepared on Jain History by Dr. K. C. Jain and his team" (<http://www.jainworld.com/literature/jainhistory/chapter4.asp>): "It is with regard to these questions [about the world] that Mahāvīra declared: 'From these alternatives, you cannot arrive at truth; from these alternatives, you are certainly led [astray]. The world is eternal as far as that part is concerned which is the substratum (dravya) of the "world"; it is not eternal as far as its ever-changing state is concerned.' In regard to such questions, Mahāvīra's advice to his disciples was neither to support those who maintained that the world is eternal nor those who advocated that it is not eternal. He would have said the same thing regarding such propositions as the world exists and it does not exist; the world is unchangeable; the world is in constant flux; the world has a beginning; the world has no beginning; the world has an end; the world has no end; etc." (my italics).

1934 Be lacks paramāya gatiyā, found in Ce and Ee.

1935 Daḷhadhammā dhanuggaho sikkhito katahattho katūpāsano. Mp's comments on these terms differs slightly from its comments at 4:45 (see p. 1690, notes 724 and 725). Here Mp says: "Firm-bowed archer (daḷhadhammā dhanuggaho): an archer who has taken up a firm bow. A 'firm bow' (daḷhadhanu) is called the 'strength of two thousand' (dvisahassathāmaṃ): a bow to which one can attach an arrow with a head made of

some metal such as bronze or lead, etc., fit the arrow notch to the string, grasp the bow handle and draw back the string the full length of the arrow shaft, and shoot the arrow up from the ground. Trained (sikkhito): they have studied the craft in their teacher's clan for ten or twelve years. Skillful (katahattho): one who has simply studied a craft is not yet skillful; they are skillful when they have achieved mastery over it. Experienced (katūpāsano): one who has exhibited his craft in the king's court, etc."

1936 As at 4:45 (and SN 2:26, l 61–62).

1937 Text has evarūpāya sandhāvanikāya here, whereas 4:45 has gamanena. Mp glosses padasā dhāvanena, "running on foot."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 5:39 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

I think we're talking about different things: you about whether a truth-claim seems a natural and reasonable account of how things are (as opposed to a farfetched one), and I about whether a proposed interpretation seems to be a natural and reasonable construal of an utterance's meaning (as opposed to a patently contrived and stretched one).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 16, 2014 11:08 PM

Title: Re: The world:Loka vs. Conventional

Content:

I think that in most occurrences of the term what are referred to are adherents of what later came to be called the Carvaka school, essentially an Indian version of Protagoreanism: materialist in ontology, amoralist in ethics and Machiavellian in political and social thought. I base this on the fact that in the Vinaya bhikkhus are unqualifiedly prohibited from studying or teaching Lokāyata thought (Vin. ii. 139), so I would expect it to be something rather more insalubrious than mere cosmological speculation.

However, as Bhikkhu Bodhi remarks in footnote 1932, something along the lines of "cosmological speculator" does seem to fit the present context better than "materialist".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 17, 2014 1:46 AM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

In the Theravadin usage of terms you wouldn't belong to any sangha but to the upāsaka-parisā or upāsikā-parisā, depending on your sex.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 17, 2014 2:30 PM

Title: Re: Have you heard any good dhamma talks on Depression?

Content:

How did you get only four? With a Google site search you should get over 3,000. Just go to Google and paste in:

site:<http://www.dharmaseed.org> depression

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 17, 2014 6:26 PM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

There is no such term as "cattassa parisā". The Suttas refer to "catasso parisā", and define it in exactly the way I have already explained.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 18, 2014 3:02 AM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

That the term 'ariyasangha' denotes a sub-class of the monastic sangha, consisting of those monks and nuns who are sotāpanna, sakadāgāmin, etc., is an error propagated by Ajahn Brahmavaṃso. [*] In fact all ariyan disciples, whether monastic or householders, are included in the ariyasangha.

[*] <http://www.dhammaloka.org.au/articles/item/1200-the-meaning-of-sangha.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 18, 2014 8:18 PM

Title: Re: Have you heard any good dhamma talks on Depression?

Content:

Oh, I see.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 18, 2014 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Nikaya to read after MN?

Content:

The Dīgha Nikāya, preferably in Thomas Rhys Davids' translation rather than Maurice Walshe's, except for the Brahmajāla, Sāmaññaphala, and Mahānidāna Suttas. For these three the BPS's single volume translation (with commentary) by Bhikkhu Bodhi are the best.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 18, 2014 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Anand-Carlsen aṃsa dvi

Content:

I don't think they could have. On move 122 Carlsen has no choice but to take Anand's rook with his knight, and once that's done neither side has sufficient material to force mate. Under the FIDE Laws of Chess (Article 5.2.b) when a position arises that can only result in a draw, the game comes to an immediate end, provided that the move that led to this position was a legal one. And so I doubt the umpires would have permitted the players to go on making meaningless moves just so that they could establish some new world record.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 18, 2014 11:10 PM

Title: Re: Nikaya to read after MN?

Content:

For me two differences stand out. Firstly the footnotes in Rhys Davids' rendering are more interesting and informative than those in Walshe's. Secondly Rhys Davids maintained a high standard throughout, while Walshe tended to be slapdash when translating suttas that he didn't like (chiefly those like the Lakkhaṇa, Mahāsamaya, Āṭanāṭiya and Sampasādanīya Suttas that are unlikely to appeal to a "protestant" Buddhist sensibility).

Here is Th. Rhys Davids translation:

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh01davi>

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh02davi>

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh03davi>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 19, 2014 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Is jhana possible?

Content:

Indeed. I don't know what this fellow is talking about — the presence of cittekaggatā is stipulated in dozens of Suttas.

“Friend, how many factors does the first jhāna have?”

“Friend, the first jhāna has five factors. Here, when a bhikkhu has entered upon the first jhāna, there occur applied thought, sustained thought, rapture, pleasure, and unification of mind. That is how the first jhāna has five factors.”

“Friend, how many factors are abandoned in the first jhāna and how many factors are possessed?”

“Friend, in the first jhāna five factors are abandoned and five factors are possessed. Here, when a bhikkhu has entered upon the first jhāna, sensual desire is abandoned, ill will is abandoned, sloth and torpor are abandoned, restlessness and remorse are abandoned, and doubt is abandoned; and there occur applied thought, sustained thought, rapture, pleasure, and unification of mind. That is how in the first jhāna five factors are abandoned and five factors are possessed.”

(Mahāvedalla Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 19, 2014 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Monk misconduct

Content:

How it would be considered would vary from region to region. Generally it would be more acceptable in places where temporary one-vassa ordination is practised, for the men temporarily ordained will normally attend daily Vinaya classes during their time in robes. Consequently a knowledge of Vinaya is quite widely diffused among the laity, and so people can criticize bhikkhus from a position of knowledge rather than ignorance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 22, 2014 9:21 PM

Title: Sujātā Sabrina

Content:

My friend Sujātā Sabrina, a young Colombian Buddhist whom some of you may recall for her occasional contributions to E-Sangha, has just been taken seriously ill. Less than a week ago she was found to be with deep vein thrombosis. Now today her doctors discover the thrombosis to have already generated one its worst complications, a pulmonary embolism.

May I call upon those of you in the habit of practising merit-transference and/or the divine abidings to include Sujātā in your thoughts. Thank you.

10473348_10153012746958943_7275378151174715122_n.jpg (19.73 KiB) Viewed 4346 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 23, 2014 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Sujātā Sabrina

Content:

The third link is dead. It's now <http://www.aimwell.org/bojjhanga.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 23, 2014 7:34 AM

Title: Re: disrobing procedure

Content:

Hi Yogipark,

I don't think there's any need for you to feel uncomfortable. The manner in which you left the training may not have been traditional but it sounds to have been lawful. But if you don't feel properly disrobed yet, you can always go to a temple and ask to recite one of the traditional disrobing formulas in a monk's presence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 25, 2014 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Arahant for the welfare and happiness of devas and human

Content:

By virtue of the fact that he's an incomparable field of merit for the world, and in the practice of dāna the degree of merit is determined in part by the nature of the recipient. And so a withdrawn and eremitical arahant may benefit the manyfolk simply by accepting their offerings, thereby enabling them to accumulate more merit than would be possible with any —or almost any— other kind of recipient.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 25, 2014 1:12 PM

Title: Re: The Most Generous Country In The World

Content:

1. Myanmar, USA
2. Canada, Ireland
3. New Zealand

5. Australia
6. Malaysia, UK
7. Sri Lanka, Trinidad and Tobago

Curious that they should all be British colonies or former ones. Seven out of the ten remain Commonwealth nations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 25, 2014 3:47 PM

Title: Re: The Most Generous Country In The World

Content:

I think you are right to exclude what passes for 'charity' (zakat) in Islam, as this is indeed obligatory, with the collection of it organized by the state (at least in Pakistan and Saudi Arabia) and with non-payment being a serious criminal offence.

Buddhist dāna, however, is wholly voluntary. A Buddhist might never give a gift in his life without ceasing to be a Buddhist or incurring any penalty beyond the obvious ones of getting a reputation as a niggard and missing many opportunities for meritorious action.

I believe the same applies also to the charity of Hindus and Sikhs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 25, 2014 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Brand New Monk... my first year in robes

Content:

Anumodanā.

Dhanaṃ caṇe yo pana aṅgahetu, aṅgaṃ caṇe jīvitam rakkhamāno.
Aṅgaṃ dhanam jīvitañcāpi sabbaṃ, caṇe naro dhammamanussaranto.

“He who would give up wealth for limbs,
Would give up his limbs for his life;
But a man who guards the Dhamma,
Will give up limbs, wealth, life and all.”
(Mahāsutasoma Jātaka. Ānandajoti tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 25, 2014 7:59 PM

Title: Re: The Most Generous Country In The World

Content:

Indeed.

It also entails a more elementary practical difficulty, namely, that social science researchers would need to possess mind-reading powers to be able to properly identify which of their interviewees had really performed a charitable act.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 26, 2014 1:27 PM

Title: Re: Chocolate is an exception to the No-eating-after-noon ru

Content:

But was that their precise wording?

I know it's very common for Asian Theravadin monks to say, "It's okay for a monk to eat food in the evening if he's seriously ill," but in saying this they don't mean to imply that there is any Vinaya exemption to this effect, for there simply isn't one. What they mean by "okay" is that breaking the rule in these circumstances is deemed socially acceptable by most of the laity, and so the monks who do it won't be scandalizing anyone by their conduct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 27, 2014 9:14 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Namgyal: "The text talks about there being 12 bases but the phrase 'āyatana-vibhanga' gives no mention to a number, which leaves it wide open. It could be that there are vast numbers of āyatana-vibhanga; that to realize the full nature of the decorative refinements or adornments we call the senses you must go beyond 12."

<http://www.aucklandsphere.org/abhidhamma-sixteenth-lecture/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 29, 2014 3:12 PM

Title: Re: What's this chant?

Content:

It's a widely used formula for requesting a Dhamma talk, with words derived from Brahmā's request to the Buddha.

Brahmā ca lokādhīpatiḥ sahaṃpati, katañjalī anadhivaraṃ ayācatha
Santīdha sattappaṛajakkhajātikā, desetu dhammaṃ anukampimaṃ paṇaṃ.

Then Brahma Sahampati, Lord of the world,

With palms joined in reverence, requested a favour:
“Beings are here with but little dust in their eyes,
Pray, teach the Dhamma out of compassion for them.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 30, 2014 8:47 AM

Title: Re: The Social Expectations that Stifle Ordination

Content:

Do you mean that you are struggling in your conscience because you think your family may have a point? Or do you mean that it's a struggle to put up with your family badgering you about it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 30, 2014 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Bhante Vimalaramsi

Content:

The links of dependent origination appear as blinks of light? Do you mean literally blinks of light, or do you mean that they resemble blinks of light in certain respects?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 30, 2014 5:42 PM

Title: Re: The Social Expectations that Stifle Ordination

Content:

Yes, it makes sense. I didn't have any such problems with my own parents, but in those cases where western monastics are afflicted with parental badgering it's usually a short-term problem, with the parents fairly soon becoming reconciled to their child's choice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 30, 2014 6:30 PM

Title: Re: Ingram, et al - "Hard Core Dharma" & claims of attainmen

Content:

Most animals do it instinctively, but there are several species for whom the procedures of foreplay and intercourse appear to be at least as much learned behaviours as instinctive ones. There's the incredibly sexually versatile <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bonobo>, for example.

And then there's the celebrated Dudley Moore:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 30, 2014 6:37 PM

Title: Re: Ingram, et al - "Hard Core Dharma" & claims of attainmen

Content:

Why do you suppose that he might not drink it? It's not deemed a violation of the fifth precept, or the corresponding pācittiya rule for bhikkhus, to take alcohol-based medicine when sick. And in the eyes of most Vinaya scholars, application of the Great References would lead to the conclusion that the same applies to Xanax. And so a bhikkhu, whether arahant or non-arahant, if afflicted with, say, muscle spasms, might take Xanax as a muscle relaxant without later needing to confess any offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 1, 2014 10:55 AM

Title: Re: Similes for hindrances

Content:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.039.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 7:40 AM

Title: Re: What's does the "anta" in Suttanta mean?

Content:

Like bhavaṃ and bhavanta, or arahāṃ and arahanta, suttam and suttanta are alternative forms of a single participle meaning "well-said". The meaning "thread" doesn't apply here at all and the Buddhist sanskritizers' rendering of sutta as sūtra was simply a mistake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 8:04 AM

Title: Re: Differences between Theravada and Early Buddhism

Content:

I think you may be confusing Ven. Kumāra with another poster, Kusala. It's the latter who likes to post Ian Stevenson-type stuff.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 9:03 AM

Title: Re: The sect/school of thinkers that believed in person/bein

Content:

That the person (puggala) exists in the ultimate sense, as opposed to being merely a paññatti generated by thought-construction. They didn't claim, however, that it was permanent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Using Thai-Style Altar Table Sets

Content:

Many years ago I was commissioned to translate a Thai instruction booklet about how to "ตั้งโต๊ะหมู่บูชา" or "set up a nest of pūjā tables". Unfortunately it's long since out of print (it was only published in a limited edition to be given away to guests at somebody's funeral) and I've forgotten most of the rules (there were about twelve pages of them).

They included stipulations about the permissible number of tables, where the emblems of the king and queen should go, whether or not to have fluffy artificial bushes, special rules to be followed according to the year of the home-owner's birth in the Chinese 12-year cycle, etc. etc.

As I don't know of any other work on this in English, I suggest you google "ตั้งโต๊ะหมู่บูชา" and then use an online translation service to translate the page into English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Origins of the Jayamangala Gāthā

Content:

Bhante,

I asked Ven. Ānandajoti, who's exceptionally erudite in matters relating to Pali verse. He replied:

Hi Ven., as far as I know its provenance is around the 18th century in Lanna. How I know this for the moment escapes me, but it is firmly there in my mind.

By the way, as you will have seen, it is full of grammatical errors, like:
taṃ tejasā bhavatu te jayamaṅgalāni!

which should be:

taṃ tejasā bhavantu te jayamaṅgalāṇi!

The reason is because of a poor writer trying to fit the metre. It was rewritten in proper Pali by one learned Sri Lankan monk in the mid 20th century. Maybe that is where I know it's provenance from.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 9:51 AM

Title: Re: Origins of the Jayamangala Gāthā

Content:

In later replies Ven. Ānandajoti remarked:

I now think I was mistaken about this, and was maybe thinking of the aggabhikkhunīgāthā, which was composed in Lanna in the late 18th century. and drew my attention to the opinion of Mahinda Deegalle:

10325640_10205216051186073_5096272462646761345_n.jpg (136.96 KiB) Viewed 3041 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 11:09 AM

Title: Re: Origins of the Jayamangala Gāthā

Content:

This is Rev. Sorata's revised version:

Sorata.jpg (653.21 KiB) Viewed 3029 times

I have also met with a less radically revised one in some Thai chanting books. In this one the ungrammatical refrain 'jayamaṅgalāṇi' is replaced with 'jayamaṅgalaggaṃ'. However, I don't recall ever hearing it chanted this way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Using Thai-Style Altar Table Sets

Content:

It was a government publication from Krom Silpakorn (Department of Fine Arts), though

it doesn't seem to be among the e-texts currently available at the Krom's website. The sources would probably be Bangkok aristocrats, arts laureates and senior military.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 11:51 AM

Title: Re: Going Forth and Visas

Content:

For the most up-to-date info it would probably be best to enquire at the Thai Visa forum. Regulations are constantly changing.

<http://www.thaivisa.com/forum>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 12:36 PM

Title: Re: The Social Expectations that Stifle Ordination

Content:

Yes, I was 18 when I ordained for the first time and 38 the second time. On neither occasion was there very much thought behind the decision. There was just nothing else that I wanted to do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 12:53 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Possibly, depending on what sense of 'worry' you have in mind. The sotāpanna is free of fearful apprehensions about rebirth in the lower realms, for this possibility is now cut off.

He is, however, still subject to worry in a weaker sense of the word, namely, that rebirth is still a subject of concern for him, just as anything that we are fettered to is a subject of concern. Indeed we might even say that rebirth is now more of a concern than it was when he was a puthujjana, for now he entertains no doubts about it. As such, the sotāpanna no longer has access to the sort of fool's equanimity that comes from willing oneself to disbelieve in an afterlife and then thinking such thoughts as:

“Death does not concern us, because as long as we exist, death is not here. And when it does come, we no longer exist.”

— Epicurus

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 4, 2014 7:38 PM

Title: Re: The Buddhist Path to Awakening by Rupert Gethin

Content:

The first is a general introduction to Buddhism, thoughtful, well-written, and pitched at about the level of university undergrads in comparative religious studies.

The second is a much more specialised and technical work: a scholarly study of the thirty-seven bodhipakkhiya-dhammas as they are expounded in Pali sources, canonical and commentarial. Of the three principal English-language works on this topic (i.e. those of Gethin, Ajahn Thanissaro, and Ledi Sayadaw), I would rate Gethin's as the most demanding, but also the most rewarding.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 5:25 AM

Title: Re: A female has taken a liking to me

Content:

It's the Dhammika Sutta, not the Ratana. And it's one of the four verses in the sutta which describe the sīla proper for a householder on lunar observance days, not that which is expected of them at all times.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 9:21 AM

Title: Re: Hawking: Artificial Intelligence Could End Human Race

Content:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 9:33 AM

Title: Re: The Buddhist Path to Awakening by Rupert Gethin

Content:

An interesting anthology and well-translated. And with Gethin's inclusion of the Dīgha's Aggañña and Mahāśudassana Suttas in the very opening section, it's an anthology that certainly cocks a snook at western protestant Buddhism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 5:04 PM

Title: Re: Who is the Buddha in Three refuges?

Content:

The Paramatthajotikā's account of the Three Refuges (Khp-a. 14-22), translated by Ñāṇamoli in Minor Readings and Illustrator.

[./download/file.php?id=2433](#)

(334.08 KiB) Downloaded 264 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 9:40 PM

Title: Re: The sect/school of thinkers that believed in person/bein

Content:

While it may be that such a view is attributed to them by their doctrinal opponents (though not in any Theravādin text, as far as I know), what is asserted in the pudgalavādins' own extant texts is something like this: "If the pudgala were identical with the aggregates, then it would be perishable, and to hold that would be the extreme of ucchedavāda. If it were distinct from the aggregates, then it would be eternal, and to hold that would be the extreme of sassatavāda. Avoiding these extremes, we pudgalavādins assert the pudgala to be indescribable (avācya) and its relationship to the aggregates to be likewise indescribable."

To that extent the pudgalavādins are saying about the pudgala pretty much what ābhīdharmikas say about paññattis/prajñaptis of any sort. Where the pudgalavādins differ from ābhīdharmikas is in their insistence that the pudgala actually and ultimately (though very mysteriously) exists. An ābhīdharmika would say of the pudgala that it is a product of thought-construction (cittaparikkappa) and has no existence outside of linguistic convention.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 10:05 PM

Title: Re: The sect/school of thinkers that believed in person/bein

Content:

I suppose it would make it a more digestible doctrine to those with a predisposition to believe in souls and an inability to conceive of the afterlife in any other terms. In practice that probably means most people, which may go some way to account for the extraordinary popularity of the Pudgalavādin schools in India.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 5, 2014 11:17 PM

Title: Re: Sujātā Sabrina

Content:
Anagarika,

Thanks for your query. Happily it appears Sujātā is on the mend and has now been released from hospital.

Five days ago:

The pain is getting lower, but when I have to wake up the pain in the left leg is almost unbeatable. Yesterday I started pills but I still need subcutaneous medicines.

When i leave the hospital I will be in recovery during 2 or 3 months. I will need therapy to recover movement and force in my legs, and I will have to take anticoagulants during at least 6 months.

Today I started to walk. It will be a long process but the pain is minimum now.

It's a kindly gesture from you to start that thread. Thanks everyone for their prayings. The doctors did think that i could not walk before next monday, but i did my first steps today Yesterday:

De regreso a casa ... ¡Y a mi cama!

Back to home... ¡my bed!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 6, 2014 3:10 PM

Title: Re: What's does the "anta" in Suttanta mean?

Content:

Right, though I wasn't aware that it was Walleser's suggestion. I think I first learned of it in my correspondence with either A.K. Warder or K.R. Norman, though I don't remember what the arguments were that convinced me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 7, 2014 5:52 AM

Title: Re: Teach What You Know: Sutta reference?

Content:

The story's underlying assumption —that stinginess in teaching the Dhamma (dhamma-macchariya) leads to rebirth as a deaf mute— is a little too optimistic from a Theravādin point of view. According to the Suttas this kind of stinginess leads to hell (specifically, the Hell of Hot Ashes, Kukkuḷa-niraya, according to the Commentaries) .

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 7, 2014 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Teach What You Know: Sutta reference?

Content:

The Maccharinīsutta (AN.iii.139) and the two Macchariyasuttas (AN.iii.266-7).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 7, 2014 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Teach What You Know: Sutta reference?

Content:

As a layman when I found myself in this situation I wouldn't say anything. What I would do was to decline to engage in any act that might be construed as approving the killing. For example, if the fly-killing co-worker grinned, I wouldn't grin back. I wouldn't scowl at him either, but would just keep my face impassive. The co-worker would then be slightly ill at ease because he couldn't figure me out. His unease would then compel him to review what he'd just done.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 7, 2014 12:52 PM

Title: Re: Teach What You Know: Sutta reference?

Content:

I believe its scope is broader than just that. Macchariya in general is just the mental reluctance to give or to share one's goods or skills. Even outside of a teaching relationship macchariya may arise. Moreover, it may arise just subjectively, leading to inner rigidity of mind but without prompting any particular outward behaviour.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 8, 2014 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Why has annihilationism proliferated Theravada so profus

Content:

The word 'anamata' ('not to be discovered') is glossed in the commentaries as 'avidita' ('not to be found'), which most commonly is a way of asserting the non-existence of something.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 10, 2014 5:03 AM

Title: Re: Anagarika Ordination Questions

Content:

Ditto.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 10, 2014 7:11 AM

Title: Re: mahasi vipassana vs goenka vipassana

Content:

I got 58,000 hits for "Goenka funeral", but I'm not sure what conclusion you would have us draw from them. If you mean to imply that if Goenka didn't have a Buddhist funeral — i.e. one conducted by the bhikkhusangha— then he couldn't have been a Buddhist, then I believe the premise is faulty. This can be seen from the fact that the Buddha himself wasn't interested in having a "Buddhist funeral". When Ānanda asked him what "we" (i.e. the bhikkhusangha) should do with the Tathāgata's remains, the reply was that the bhikkhus should stay out of it and leave funeral arrangements to brahmin and kshatriya householders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 10, 2014 7:28 AM

Title: Re: mahasi vipassana vs goenka vipassana

Content:

I know from several stays at the Ambedkarite temple in Wolverhampton, England, that there are some Dalit Buddhists who are enamoured with Goenka and some who are not. If you name just about any prominent figure in the Indian Buddhist world, you'll find Dalits similarly divided over him or her. I don't think the majority view of these people can be reliably determined from Google. Presumably your knowledge of the majority view is derived from some carefully-conducted opinion poll, right? If so, it would help if you'd post a link to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Anagarika Ordination Questions

Content:

Would your medical condition prevent you from ordaining as a 10-precept sāmaṇera?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 8:42 AM

Title: Re: Anagarika Ordination Questions

Content:

A sāmaṇera is classed as "not fully accepted" (anupasampanna), which in practice means that he does not participate in any of the formal transactions of the sangha (ordinations, pāṭimokkha recitals, confession, kaṭhina, etc.) and is not someone to whom bhikkhus or bhikkhunīs can declare any jhānic or ariyan attainments that they may have. As far as training rules go, a sāmaṇera is required to observe the ten precepts that he takes at his ordination, together with the Pāṭimokkha's seventy-five sekhiya rules.

A bhikkhu is required to observe the full 227-rule Pāṭimokkha, together with all the supporting rules from the Khandhakas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 4:45 PM

Title: Re: Torturers go to Hell

Content:

If it's intended as a statement of the Buddha's teaching, then I think it's an over-generalization.

“Here, Ānanda, by means of ardor, endeavor, devotion, diligence, and right attention, some recluse or brahmin attains such concentration of mind that, when his mind is concentrated, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees that person here who kills living beings [or commits any of the other ten akusala kammapatha], and he sees that on the dissolution of the body, after death, he has reappeared in a state of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, even in hell. He says thus: ‘Indeed, there are evil actions, there is result of misconduct; for I saw a person here who killed living beings [and the rest of the ten akusala kammapatha], and I see that on the dissolution of the body, after death, he has reappeared in a state of deprivation...even in hell.’ He says thus: ‘On the dissolution of the body, after death, everyone who kills living beings [and the rest of the ten akusala kammapatha] reappears in a state of deprivation...even in hell. Those who know thus know rightly; those who think otherwise are mistaken.’ Thus he obstinately adheres to what he himself has known, seen, and discovered, insisting: ‘Only this is true, anything else is wrong.’

<http://www.yellowrobe.com/component/content/article/120-majjhima-nikaya/278-mahkammavibhanga-sutta-the-greater-exposition-of-action.html>

There is no telling if the kamma of torturing somebody will be the particular kamma that determines one's next birth. It might be, but then again its vipāka might appear before one's death in this life or it might appear during the course of some subsequent life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 5:01 PM

Title: Re: What's does the "anta" in Suttanta mean?

Content:

It doesn't display on my computer. Is it his article "How the Mahayana Began" ?

If so, there's a pdf of it here:

<http://www.shin-ibs.edu/documents/bForum/v1/02Gombrich.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 10:24 PM
Title: Re: Anagarika Ordination Questions
Content:

If you have a friend in Bangkok who'll introduce you to the abbot and vouch for your character, then you could be ordained as a sāmaṇera within a week or two, or however long it takes you to memorize the Pali formulas. If you don't know anyone in Bangkok, then the best course would be to get to know the monks in your local Thai wat, let them know your intentions, and after a few visits ask the friendliest one if he'll furnish you with a letter of introduction.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Dec 11, 2014 10:58 PM
Title: Re: Hello from a new Buddhist
Content:
Hello Ahura,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel and thanks for the touching introduction. I hope your apostasy from Islam won't put you in any danger.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 12, 2014 12:37 AM
Title: Re: Hello from a new Buddhist
Content:
If your German is as good as, or better than, your English, then there is a better introduction to meditation by Nyanaponika: "Geistestraining durch Achtsamkeit: Die buddhistische Satipatthana-Methode".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 12, 2014 7:46 AM
Title: Re: Anagarika Ordination Questions
Content:
http://www.buddhanet.net/pdf_file/ordination.pdf

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 12, 2014 10:04 AM
Title: Re: Why has annihilationism proliferated Theravada so profus
Content:
I think the application of 'oblivion' in this thread is incorrect. None of the dictionary

Minds change from that they wont to bee,
Obliuions doe reuiue againe.
(from his translation of Jorge de Montemayor's *Diana*. 1598)

oblivion, n. (ə'blɪvɪən)

1. a.1.a The state or fact of forgetting or having forgotten; forgetfulness.

c.1.c Intentional overlooking, esp. of political offences. Act or Bill of Oblivion, an act or bill granting a general pardon for political offences.

 In Eng. Hist. the term is specifically applied to the Acts of 1660 and 1690, exempting those who had taken arms or acted against Charles II and William III respectively from the penal consequences of their former deeds.

†b.2.b transf. A thing forgotten. Obs.

Hence ʔə'blɪvɪən v. Obs., to put into oblivion; ə'blɪvɪənɪst, one who holds a theory of, or favours, oblivion.

http://www.pitakataw.net/download/Tipitaka/BuddhistTexts/mn/mn_e_23.htm.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 13, 2014 7:03 AM

Title: Re: Is this a fair critique of goenka?

Content:

It's actually a longstanding habit among those Dalit Buddhists who have a limited command of English. In their native tongues they refer to our teacher as Śrī Buddha (Hindi: श्री बुद्ध), which is respectful enough, as śrī in a religious context is about the equivalent of 'lord'. But in everyday usage śrī and śrīmatī mean Mr. and Mrs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 13, 2014 7:02 PM

Title: Re: the story of thera Tissa

Content:

What has the story to do with affection?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 14, 2014 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Sautrāntika momentariness

Content:

The Sautrāntikas posited just two sub-moments (arising and disappearance) to every mind-moment, as opposed to the Theravāda's three: arising, stasis and disappearance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 14, 2014 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Where can I get a hard copy chanting book (UK)?

Content:

Two free-distribution books compiled by Ven. Ānandajoti.

<http://records.photodharma.net/texts/two-chanting-books-now-in-hard-copy-for-free-distribution>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 14, 2014 8:29 AM

Title: Re: Sautrāntika momentariness

Content:

I don't know. The sources with which I'm familiar merely state their view without

describing how they arrived at it. If no one here knows the answer there might be someone on Dharmawheel who will.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 14, 2014 3:57 PM

Title: Re: Sautrāntika momentariness

Content:

Paul Williams:

Followers of Sautrāntika rejected the existence of dharmas in the three times, which they saw as necessarily implying the permanence of dharmas. Actually only the present dharma exists. The past dharma did exist, and the future dharma (assuming the appropriate conditions come together) will exist. But only the present dharma actually exists (see Abhidharmakosa 5:25 ff.). The Sautrāntika took from the Sarvastivāda, however, the idea that the present stage of a dharma lies in the dharma's exerting its characteristic activity. Thus exerting activity now becomes the mark not of the present stage of the dharma as such, but its very existence. To be in fact is to exert activity. But it follows from this that a dharma cannot be something that remains for some time and then exerts its activity. If hypothetically it existed for some time before acting then in the moments during which the dharma is not acting it actually could not exist, since to be is to act. Likewise if the dharma hypothetically existed for some time after exerting its activity then during those moments too it could not actually exist. Thus the dharma must exist only in the moment (kṣana) in which it exerts its activity. And that moment cannot itself have any time span, since if the moment had a time span then there would be the first moment of a moment, the second moment of a moment, and so on. If that were the case, then there would be the question of whether the dharma exerted its activity in the first moment of the moment, or in a subsequent moment of the moment. Whatever the answer, it would follow that the dharma actually existed in only one moment of the moment. And this process could be traced to infinity, unless one adopted the position that the temporal moment is not itself divisible into further moments. Thus the moment in which a dharma acts, in which existence occurs, has no time span beyond itself. It is absolutely instantaneous, so short that it can only be said to mark the infinitely short time-difference between the non-existence before its existence, and the non-existence after its existence. To be is to cease. Cessation is the very nature of being, and is said to occur to a dharma through its very nature as existing. We are here stretching the bounds of language. The existence of a dharma is so short in time that we can no longer speak of it in terms of 'being' at all. Life can best be viewed as an ever-flowing process, and all talk of things, of beings, is merely practical convenience that can easily mislead and engender attachment and consequential suffering.

(Buddhist Thought - A Complete Introduction to the India Tradition 119-120)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 14, 2014 6:58 PM

Title: Re: Where do you guys fall along the MBTI scale?

Content:

According to the test on your link:

PERSONALITY: INFP

VARIANT: TURBULENT

ROLE: DIPLOMAT

You are one of the Diplomats - an empathic and idealistic individual who enjoys exploring interesting ideas and prizes morality. You are known for your poetic nature, intuitive skills and pure, childlike enthusiasm.

Famous INFPs: William Shakespeare, J.R.R. Tolkien, Björk, Johnny Depp, Julia Roberts, Lisa Kudrow, Tom Hiddleston, Homer, Virgil.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 15, 2014 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Sautrāntika momentariness

Content:

I don't really know what the best book is. That of Williams just happens to be the only relevant one in my rather small collection. I should think that the more scholarly types on Dharma Wheel —especially those who've studied Tibetan Buddhism's "four tenet systems" in a traditional setting— would be in a better position to answer you, at least as regards the Sarvastivāda and Sautrāntika.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 15, 2014 8:45 AM

Title: Re: What I should take with me to stay at a monastery?

Content:

Burmese food can be exceedingly oily — so much so that after a meal one often spends an hour or two expectorating just to get rid of all the grease that's coating the inside of one's throat. Burmese monks solve this problem by swallowing some kind of medicinal powder after every meal. The powder soaks up the grease and carries it safely down the oesophagus in no time at all. I can't remember what the powder is called, but you should find out and get some, else your after-meal meditation sessions are liable to be ruined by endless coughing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 16, 2014 12:05 PM

Title: Re: the story of therā Tissa

Content:

Akkocchi maṃ avadhi maṃ, ajini maṃ ahāsi me,
ye ca taṃ upanayhanti, veraṃ tesaṃ na sammati.

Akkocchi maṃ avadhi maṃ, ajini maṃ ahāsi me,
ye ca taṃ nupanayhanti, veraṃ tesūpasammati ti.

"He abused me, he struck me, he overpowered me, he robbed me." Those who harbor such thoughts do not still their hatred.

"He abused me, he struck me, he overpowered me, he robbed me." Those who do not harbor such thoughts still their hatred.

(Dhp. 3-4)

As far as I can see neither the verses nor their background story have anything at all to do with affection being poison.

And by the way, Kao, unless you yourself happen to be Daw Mya Tin of the Burma Tipitaka Association, please cite your source in future posts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 16, 2014 2:57 PM

Title: Re: Is breath meditation bad for me?

Content:

Buddhaghosa does state that some hold this view (later writers attribute it to the author of the Vimuttimagga), but he himself does not. In fact he rejects it on the grounds that it's empirically false. That is, there's no necessary or invariable correlation between a person's temperament and his medically diagnosed humour.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 18, 2014 7:38 AM

Title: Re: Trying to ordain at Wat Boonyawad -- Looking for some ad

Content:

Never having been medically insured I don't know which of these would be better. But once you are ordained you won't need to worry about insurance. Treatment is free of charge for monks in Thai state hospitals and at the sangha hospital in Bangkok.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 20, 2014 3:32 PM

Title: Re: Forum back up and running again
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 22, 2014 10:59 PM
Title: Re: Vivartasthāyikalpa
Content:
In Pali the word is vivaṭṭaṭṭhāyikappa.

See the account of recollection of former lives in the Path of Purification, where Ñāṇamoli translates it as “what supersedes the expansion.”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 23, 2014 3:05 PM
Title: Re: Phra Malai
Content:
This is the "Meeting with Maitreya" chapter in Bonnie Brereton's translation, taken from Donald Lopez's Penguin anthology Buddhist Scriptures:

./download/file.php?id=2447
(8.36 KiB) Downloaded 63 times

But if you want the whole thing, I'm afraid it's sixty dollars:

<https://www.amazon.com/Thai-Tellings-Phra-Malai-Concerning/dp/1881044076>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 24, 2014 11:15 AM
Title: Re: Pursuing an American Buddhism.
Content:
The term “saṅgha of the four quarters” (or more literally “four directions” — cātuddisa-saṅgha) never meant “monks, nuns, laymen, and laywomen”. Originally it was a term for the bhikkhusaṅgha in the the North, East, South and West. Later it came to include the bhikkhunīsaṅgha in the four cardinal directions. Laymen and laywomen were never included in the term. Even when the Mahāyānists began to include lay bodhisattvas in the term “saṅgha” it was the ariya-saṅgha that they had in mind, not the cātuddisa-saṅgha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 25, 2014 8:18 AM

Title: Re: Long Breath/Short Breath: Control Breath or Natural Breath?

Content:

I think it's more likely the latter. The ancient Mahavihara Theravadin texts contain no explicit statement supporting either opinion, no matter how they're translated. The one text that does take sides is the Vimuttimagga, thought to be a composition of the Abhayagiri Vihara, wherein there is an explicit prescription for natural breathing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 25, 2014 8:37 AM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

The Stoic writers had quite a panoply of exercises for cultivating apatheia, and not all were past-the-post. For example, one of the most elementary ones is that the prokopton (Stoic sage-in-training) should begin each day by recollecting the most terrible things that could happen to him in the course of the day. This would enable him to be mentally prepared if any of these terrible things should actually happen, indifferent to any milder annoyances that might arise, and in for a pleasant surprise if the day should pass with no adverse events of any sort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 25, 2014 10:51 PM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

Yes, that for me is what makes them so intriguing. They start out from the most appallingly rotten premises (theism AND materialism AND fatalism — one can scarcely imagine a worse combination of wrong views!), yet in spite of this they get it exactly right about eudaemonia (i.e. there is nothing in the <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/an/an08/an08.053.than.html> that a Stoic would deem an unworthy aim) and almost exactly right about the nature of the sage (the Stoic sage differs from the Buddhist arahant only in that the former is expected to busy himself with public affairs, while the latter is expected to be a bhikkhu, and thus more like the uninvolved sage pictured by the Stoics' great rival, Epicurus).

But the fact that the Stoics sought apatheia on the basis of radically wrong views may also go some way to explaining why (on the Stoic writers' own admission) none of their number actually achieved it — that is, nobody is regarded as having graduated from a prokopton to a proficiens, not even such worthies as Heraclitus and Socrates whom the Stoics held as their patriarchs. In effect, therefore, Stoic sagehood appears to be a merely theoretical ideal.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Dec 25, 2014 11:44 PM
Title: Re: Merry Christmas!
Content:
Two Queens' Christmas Messages

Queen Elizabeth II of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zMEOrszol4U>

Queen Doreen of Walsall

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D2LCSiDvlfS>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 26, 2014 6:17 AM
Title: Re: Happy Birthday David N. Snyder
Content:
Happy birthday!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 26, 2014 6:28 AM
Title: Re: Long Breath/Short Breath: Control Breath or Natural Breath?
Content:
Why do you say that?

The objects of mindfulness in the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta's account of kāyānupassanā include such volitional objects as: walking, standing, sitting, lying down, going out, coming back, looking at something, looking away from something, bending and extending one's limbs, carrying one's outer robe, upper robe and bowl, eating, drinking, chewing, tasting, urinating, defecating, talking, and remaining silent.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 26, 2014 7:00 AM
Title: Re: Thinking, pali word, meditation
Content:
Kāma-vitakka, vyāpāda-vitakka, vihiṃsā-vitakka

Thoughts of sensuality, ill will, or cruelty.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 26, 2014 2:21 PM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

Womanizing (itthidhutta) is advised against in the <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/kn/snp/snp.1.06.piya.html> on the grounds of its conducing to a man's worldly downfall, meaning loss of his wealth.

"The man who is addicted to women (given to a life of debauchery), is a drunkard, a gambler, and a squanderer of his earnings — this is the cause of his downfall."

However, not all instances of womanizing would break the third precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 7:24 AM

Title: Re: Ven Dhammanando's cats

Content:

It's not really a case of persuasion. It's just that most animals are given to the monastery as kittens or puppies and I'm the one who usually feeds, medicates and grooms them. Then as soon as they acquire a little agility they like to climb up my sanghati (the folded robe that monks wear over their left shoulder).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 12:20 PM

Title: Re: Ven Dhammanando's cats

Content:

No, feline fur. Vicarious hair is what you get on crinigerous vicars.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 4:48 PM

Title: Re: Resistance by parents to ordination

Content:

Some examples from later times are found in Buddhaghosa's commentary on the phrase, without permission from his mother and father in his Vinaya Atthakathā. Here's the passage in full:

Here, the phrase “from his mother and father” was said in regard to the man and woman who conceived him. If both are living, then leave must be obtained from both of them.

If the father or mother is deceased, then leave must be obtained from [the parent] who is still living.

Even if they have themselves gone forth, leave must still be obtained from them.

* * * *

When obtaining leave, he may either go and obtain it himself, or may send another person, saying to him, “Go to my mother and father and having obtained their leave come back.”

* * * *

If he says, “I am one who has obtained permission,” he may be given the going forth if it is believable.

* * * *

A father has himself gone forth and wishes his son to go forth; having obtained leave of the mother, let him go forth; or, a mother wishes her daughter to go forth; having obtained leave of the father, let her go forth.

* * * *

A father, not concerned for the welfare of his wife and son, runs away. The mother gives her son to some monks, saying, “Let him go forth.” When asked, “Where has his father gone?” she replies, “He has run away to disport himself.” — It is suitable for him [the son] to be given the going forth.

A mother has run away with some man or other. The father gives [his son to some monks, saying], “Let him go forth.” The principle in this case is just the same as above.

The Kurundī* states: ‘A father is absent. The mother gives her son permission, saying, “Let him go forth.” When asked, “Where has his father gone?” she replies, “I shall be responsible for whatever is due to you from the father.” — It is suitable for him [the son] to be given the going forth.’

[* Kurundī: a Sinhalese commentary frequently cited by Buddhaghosa as the source of his Vinaya exegesis.]

* * * *

The mother and father are deceased. Their boy has grown up in the company of [relatives] such as his maternal aunt. When he is being given the going forth, his relatives start a quarrel or criticize it. Therefore, in order to stop the quarrel, he should obtain their leave before being given the going forth. But if given the going forth without having obtained their leave there is no offence.

They who undertook to feed him in his childhood are called “mother” and “father”, and with respect to these the principle is just the same as above. The son [is reckoned as] one living dependent on himself, not on a mother and father.

* * * *

Even if he be a king, he must still obtain leave before being given the going forth.

* * * *

Being permitted by his mother and father, he goes forth, but [later] reverts [to being a householder]. Even if he goes forth and reverts seven times, on each occasion that he comes [to go forth] again he must obtain leave [from his mother and father] before he may be given the going forth.

* * * *

If [his mother and father] say: “This [son of ours], having reverted and come home, does not do any work for us; having gone forth he will not fulfil his duty to you; there is no point in him obtaining leave; whenever he comes to you, just give him the going forth.” When [a son] has been disowned in this way, it is suitable for him to be given the going forth again without even obtaining leave.

* * * *

He who when only in his childhood had been given away [by his mother and father, saying], “This is a gift for you; give him the going forth whenever you want,” may be given the going forth whenever he comes [to ask for it], without even obtaining leave.

But [a mother and father], having given permission [to their son] when he was only in his childhood, afterwards, when he has reached maturity, withdraw their permission; he must not be given the going forth without obtaining leave.

* * * *

An only son, after quarrelling with his mother and father, comes [to the sangha, saying], “Let me go forth.” Upon being told, “Come back after you have obtained leave,” he says, “I’m not going! If you don’t let me go forth, I shall burn down your monastery, or stab you with a sword, or cause loss to your relatives and supporters by cutting down the plants in their gardens, or kill myself by jumping from a tree, or join a gang of robbers, or go to another country.”

It is suitable to let him go forth in order to safeguard life. If his mother and father then come and say, “Why did you let our son go forth?” they should be informed of the reason for it, saying, “We let him go forth in order to safeguard life. You may confirm this with your son.”

* * * *

Then, [one saying] “I shall jump from a tree [if you don’t let me go forth],” has climbed up and is about to let go with his hands and feet. It is suitable to let him go forth.

* * * *

An only son, having gone to another country, requests the going forth. If he had obtained leave before departing, he may be given the going forth.

If he had not obtained leave, having sent a young monk to get [the parents] to give their leave, he may be given the going forth. If it is a very distant country, it is suitable to just give him the going forth and then send him with other bhikkhus to inform [the parents].

But the Kurundī states: ‘if [the country] is far away and the way to it is [across] a great wilderness (or desert), it is suitable to give him the going forth, [thinking], “having gone there [later] we shall obtain leave [of the parents].”’

* * * *

If a mother and father have many sons and speak thus: “Venerable sir, may you give the going forth to whichever [one] of these boys you choose,” then having examined the boys, he may give the going forth to the one he chooses.

If an entire [extended] family or an entire village is given permission [by someone, saying], “Venerable sir, may you give the going forth to whichever [one] of the boys in this family or this village you choose,” he may give the going forth to the one he chooses.
(Vin-a. v.1011-12, my translation)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Friends share? Mudita? Wrong speech? Karuna, etc ?

Content:

Hi Sattva,

In my case I omitted to read or reply to your post because I normally skip threads in the Lounge unless there’s something in their title to indicate that they are, or might be, Dhamma-related. (That’s why I’m reading this one)

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Is "God" to be found in any of the Buddhist scriptures?

Content:

It's not in the Pali Canon, but even if we had no canon we'd still be entitled to dismiss the story as an anachronistic fiction. Since the Buddha was teaching long before the rise of the Hindu bhakti cults there wouldn't in his time have been any such thing as "a devotee of the god Rāma".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 7:40 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

0:10:15 - 0:10:55

I'm glad to learn that I'm not the only bhikkhu who applauds the French government for its ban on the public wearing of the burqa' and niqāb and its refusal to compromise with the spokesmen for 7th century barbarism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Can a Bodhisatta go to hell?

Content:

The Suttanipāṭa Commentary (Sn-a I 50) rules out a Bodhisatta's rebirth in the Avīci hell and the Lokantarikā hells. That it doesn't mention the rest of the hells might be read as implying that a Bodhisatta may be born in them.

See here for the full list of eighteen inauspicious births that are impossible for a predicted Bodhisatta:

<http://www.bps.lk/olib/bl/bl157-u.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 27, 2014 10:16 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

Dear Ben and James,

On the subject of Muslim women's dress I refer you to my posts in the <https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=12&t=21864> thread and to Pat Condell's short video <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TLkxlzTZc48> which addresses the case of those Muslim women who voluntarily wear the burqa' or niqāb (2:30 onwards).

The only thing I would wish to add to Condell's remarks are that these much-trumpeted cases of Muslim women in the West who, though perfectly free to dress as they wish, and though fully-exposed to Western Enlightenment values in general, and to feminism in particular, nevertheless choose to wear the burqa' or niqāb, — these cases are really just a smokescreen aimed at silencing critics of Islamic oppression of women by diverting attention from what is much more typically going on in Muslim communities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

In the case of my own country, Britain, I would say no, on the grounds that there's no public demand for such a ban, and no obvious public good to be served, or public evil to be averted, by one.

Moreover, although it's declined a lot since Vatican II, there is a longstanding tradition of walking for alms by monks and nuns in Catholic mendicant orders like the Carmelites and Poor Clares, so it's not a culturally alien innovation like hiding oneself inside a burqa' or niqāb.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 1:39 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

As the opening post purports to be about pindapata in the West, I think your introduction of the sartorial wrongheadedness of the Muslimah might be going a little off topic. Still...

If you mean merely that to wear a burqa' or niqāb is not an intrinsically unwholesome act, I wouldn't dispute it for a moment. In practice, however, it seems to me to be inseparable from unwholesomeness when done by Muslim women living in Western countries. And that for one of three reasons. Either because: (1) they have been forced to do it by men; or (2) they do it as an expression of their hatred, defiance, contempt or unacknowledged envy for a surrounding culture that's incomparably superior to any that the Muslims have ever established; or (3) even where the woman is not herself

motivated by an evil will, the mere wearing of such garments serves to perpetuate an evil institution — one that has its origin in pathological male jealousy and which involves a cruel, repressive and irrational sexualization of females from about the age of two.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 2:04 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

You already brought up this whopping great Aunt Sally in the hijab thread a few month back. I say now as I said then, that when overall context and motive are reckoned with (and as Buddhists we surely ought to reckon with them, since kamma is cetanā) there is simply no comparison between the veiled Catholic nun and the veiled Muslimah.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 3:16 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

They don't contradict it. They allow that different women do it for different reasons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 3:28 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

Where behaviour is a danger to national security or is liable to negatively impact the whole society, it surely becomes a matter of law.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 5:23 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

It doesn't have to be! Religious intolerance of the sun, for example, has seldom been expressed in language more elegant than James Rainford's:

A nun in the sun
was heard to declare
"I'm as hot as a bun
with a cross to bear."

Her companion replied

“And I’m fairly cooking.
I’d cast my habit aside,
but our Lord may be looking.”

So they sat on the beach
and prayed for a breeze
to refreshingly reach
past their tightly clenched knees.

<https://thesanctumofsanity.blogspot.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 28, 2014 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

Well, I don’t think you really disagree with me, even if you think that you do. It’s just that we are speaking with respect to different senses of the word ‘right’. You, if I understand you aright, are using it in the sense of, “That which is consonant with equity or the light of nature; that which is morally just or due.” I am using it in the sense of, “Justifiable claim, on legal grounds, to have or obtain something, or to act in a certain way.”

Now whether a Muslim woman in France possesses the former is a moot point, but it is undeniable that under the laws of France she does not possess the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 29, 2014 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

If would be undeniable if natural (as opposed to legal) rights in fact existed and if they were in fact inalienable. But notwithstanding your fervent belief in them, both contentions are disputed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 29, 2014 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

For example, a budding Casanova goes to a singles bar every Friday or Saturday night in quest of a woman for a one-night-stand, but takes care not to go home with anyone who’s married or engaged or still living in dependence on her parents or brothers, etc. etc. By confining his amatory attentions to women who are not in any of the prohibited

classes, the Buddhist philanderer's observance of the third precept remains intact.

Edit: If you are living in Sri Lanka or some other Theravada country, it's possible that my answer will differ from what you are used to being told about the third precept. I am aware of the widespread popular view in Buddhist Asia which, as in the Abrahamic religions, holds all acts of "fornication" (sex between unmarried persons) to be breaches of the third precept. This opinion is not, however, supported in the texts, which allow that lawful sexual acts may be between married persons, engaged persons, "or even a temporary arrangement" (khaṇikāyapi).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 29, 2014 11:13 AM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

In the absence of any financial constraints upon his appetite, I expect he'll end up making rather a swine of himself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 29, 2014 11:53 AM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

Sorry, but you don't know your own history. The contemporary Sri Lankans' anti-fornication belief, like their anti-homosexuality belief, is not "old Sri Lankan tradition" at all. It's a modern development arising from Buddhist revivalists like Anagarika Dharmapala trying to outdo the missionaries by being more Christian than the Christians.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 29, 2014 1:59 PM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

Well, there is plenty of informative material online. When you've finished with the Walshe booklet, if you want to learn how matters stood in Sri Lanka before sexual morals got reinvented by Dharmapala and company, just try googling 'Ceylon' in combination with words like 'polygyny', 'polyandry', 'cicisbeism', 'polykoity', etc.

Polyandry, it seems, was especially common in pre-modern Ceylon, most often in the form of one woman sharing two brothers.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 30, 2014 1:35 AM
Title: Re: Womanizing?
Content:
Yes.

And Buddhist women with gigolos, if they're so inclined.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 30, 2014 2:33 AM
Title: Re: "One-life-only" negates Dhamma
Content:

The term padaparamo is given in the Ugghaṭitaññūsutta (AN.ii.135), together with the ugghaṭitaññū, vipaṇcitaññū, and neyya, but they are only defined in the Abhidhamma's Puggalapaññatti:

Katamo ca puggalo ugghaṭitaññū? Yassa puggalassa saha udāhaṭavelāya dhammābhisamayo hoti: ayaṃ vuccati puggalo ‘ugghaṭitaññū’.

Katamo ca puggalo vipaṇcitaññū? Yassa puggalassa saṃkhittena bhāsitassa vitthārena atthe vibhajiyamāne dhammābhisamayo hoti: ayaṃ vuccati puggalo ‘vipaṇcitaññū’.

Katamo ca puggalo neyyo? Yassa puggalassa uddesato paripucchato yoniso manasikaroto kalyāṇamitte sevato bhajato payirupāsato evaṃ anupubbena dhammābhisamayo hoti: ayaṃ vuccati puggalo ‘neyyo’.

Katamo ca puggalo padaparamo? Yassa puggalassa bahumpi suṇato bahumpi bhaṇato bahumpi dhārayato bahumpi vācayato na tāya jātiyā dhammābhisamayo hoti: ayaṃ vuccati puggalo ‘padaparamo’.

(Pugg.41)

B.C. Law:

pugg.jpg (164.02 KiB) Viewed 2292 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 31, 2014 7:49 AM
Title: Re: Womanizing?
Content:

That's a non sequitur. The words "kept" and "broken" apply just as well to vowed observances as they do to rules or laws.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 31, 2014 5:52 PM

Title: Re: Resistance by parents to ordination

Content:

Yes, indeed. We're a rather small family, so it's no trouble keeping in touch with everyone by phone, Skype and Facebook.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 1, 2015 6:35 PM

Title: Re: The Matanga girl who falls for Ven Ananda

Content:

I don't recall meeting with the story in Pali sources. Carus is making a liberal use of Eugène Burnouf's *Introduction à l'histoire du Bouddhisme Indien* (Paris 1844), p. 206, including changing the Mataṅga girl's Sanskrit name, Prakṛti, to its Pali form.

Burnouf gives the Śārdūlakarṇa-avadāna story in the <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divyavadana> as his source. See attached file from the English translation of Burnouf by Buffetrille and Lopez.

[./download/file.php?id=2459](#)

(72.18 KiB) Downloaded 99 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 9:05 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

According to the Abhidhamma, the vedanās that accompany seeing, hearing, tasting and scenting are always neither-painful-nor-pleasant. Painful (dukkha) and pleasant (sukha) apply only to the vedanās that arise with body-consciousness; sad (domanassa), happy (somanassa) and equanimous (upekkhā) apply to the vedanās that arise with mind-consciousnesses.

That this is indeed the case will become evident from a comparison of the vedanās that accompany eye-consciousness and those that accompany body-consciousness, when one stares too long at a man engaged in arc welding.

So in the case of your jack-fruit, all who eat it will experience neither-painful-nor-pleasant vedanā accompanying the tongue-consciousness in the sense-door-process, but will be distinguished from each other according to whether it's domanassa, somanassa or upekkhā that they experience in the ensuing mind-door-process.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 3:00 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Sorry, it should read "neither-painful-nor-pleasant" (adukkhamasukham). I'll change it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 4:00 PM

Title: Re: Meat problem, conflict between Theravada and Mahayana

Content:

Only if you subscribe to the Jain conception of karma.

In the Buddhist conception kamma, is identified with volition (cetanā) and does not occur in the absence of volition.

A housewife, for example, doesn't go to the supermarket to buy a tin of sardines in the hope that her purchase will persuade the owners of fishing trawlers to go out and catch some more sardines. She might be vaguely aware that her purchase will contribute towards such an outcome, but her knowledge of this fact is not constitutive of the volition with which she purchases the sardines.

To give an analogy: in Vinaya monks are required to sweep certain parts of their monastery on certain days of the month. In a forest monastery they know that in doing so their sweeping will almost certainly bring about the deaths of a few ants and other small bugs that are hiding. Yet even though the monks know this to be inevitable, provided they don't do their sweeping with the aim of killing these bugs and take care not to kill any bug that's visible to them, the Vinaya is explicit that their killing is without cetanā and therefore non-culpable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 6:19 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

I would say that in a Buddhist universe he might have a legal right to do so, but the idea of a natural right to do this (or anything else for that matter) would be unintelligible. If I can find it, I'll post an article later on why there are no (natural) rights in Buddhism.

In the meantime: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Natural_and_legal_rights

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 6:33 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

Craig Ihara: Why There are No Rights in Buddhism: a reply to Damien Keown. From Buddhism and Human Rights, edited by Damien V. Keown, Charles S. Prebish, and Wayne R. Husted. (Curzon Press 1998), pp. 43-51

I maintain that the notion of Dharma may be part of a vision of society in which human life is ideally a kind of dance with well defined role-responsibilities ... Although there are beneficiaries in such a society, it does not follow that it embodies a point of view in which there are "others to whom something is owed or due, and who would be wronged if denied that something."

./download/file.php?id=2461

(465.52 KiB) Downloaded 25 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 6:38 PM

Title: Re: Should Alms round be banned in Western Countries?

Content:

And here's the paper to which Ihara is responding:

Damien Keown, <http://www.urbandharma.org/udharma/humanrights.html>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 2, 2015 11:48 PM

Title: Re: Meat problem, conflict between Theravada and Mahayana

Content:

If you want the consciences of other Buddhists to reject it and to embrace vegetarianism, there are plenty of good arguments at your disposal. Invoking kamma is not one of them, for it will be persuasive only to those Buddhists who misunderstand the doctrine of kamma, and will be rejected as nonsense by those Buddhists who understand it correctly.

For more on this, see the Sujāto article that Cooran linked to above:

"There is a wider problem, and I think the discussions of the issue among Buddhists generally avoid this. And the wider issue is this: meat eating is clearly harmful. That harm is a direct but unintended consequence of eating meat. Since there is no intention to cause harm, eating meat is not bad kamma.

There are therefore two logical possibilities: eating meat is ethical; or kamma is not a complete account of ethics." (my emphasis)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 3, 2015 8:39 AM

Title: Re: sex and romantic relationships

Content:

Although in the Suttas the life of a samaṇa is generally depicted as a quick way up, we are also warned (e.g. in the <http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/dhp/dhp.22.budd.html> of the Dhammapada) that for some it may be a quick way down. For some, therefore, the decision not to embrace the brahmacariyā, or to abandon it after embracing it, may be a quite rational and prudent one, e.g. if they know that they don't have the necessary restraint to live such a life honourably.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 5, 2015 12:37 AM

Title: Re: Remembering past lives

Content:

Not in the Pali; it's only phrased like this to make it sound natural in English translation.

Vincent: "I recollected MY manifold past lives."

Pali: "anekavihiṭṭaṃ pubbenivāsaṃ anussarāmi."

Form-equivalent translation: "manifold former-dwelling recall."

Vincent: "there I was so named."

Pali: amutrāsiṃ evaṃ nāmo."

Form-equivalent translation: "there was thus name."

Though even if 'I' and 'my' had been emphatically stated in the passage, rather than merely suggested by the verb inflections, it would not indicate eternalism. It would be just an instance of the Buddha's use of "worldly conventions, expressions, idioms and designations (lokasamaññā lokaniruttiyo lokavohārā lokapaññattiyo) without being deceived by them." (see the Poṭṭhapādasutta).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 5, 2015 7:59 AM

Title: Re: Is Brahman a term for God?????

Content:

I'd never heard the word before, but according to the Oxford Dictionary its earliest recorded use was by Laurence of Arabia in his autobiography The Seven Pillars of Wisdom:

"That hot pissy aura of thronged men in woollen clothes."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 5, 2015 2:53 PM
Title: Re: Very new to this
Content:
Welcome.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 6, 2015 1:55 PM
Title: Re: Womanizing?
Content:
Indeed.

What I said wouldn't apply, for example, in the case mentioned by Robert where the woman is already contracted. Nor would it apply in countries where prostitution is illegal, for in this case a sex-worker would be an improper partner of the saparidaṇḍā type: a woman with whom sex would entail punishment.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 6, 2015 5:37 PM
Title: Re: "While he *still* does not attain to..."
Content:
"While he still does not attain to the rapture and pleasure that are secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome states, or to something more peaceful than that, covetousness invades his mind and remains, ill will invades his mind and remains, sloth and torpor invade his mind and remain, restlessness and remorse invade his mind and remain, doubt invades his mind and remains, discontent invades his mind and remains, weariness invades his mind and remains."
I don't think it's the case that 'still' translates any particular Pali word, but rather that it is required in English for disambiguation. Its function is to show that the word 'while' is being used in a temporal rather than an adversative sense. In other words, it shows that 'while' here means 'during the time that ...' and not 'although'.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 6, 2015 6:58 PM
Title: Re: Womanizing?
Content:
Homosexual acts are not mentioned at all in the Pali texts in connection with the third precept.

Among Buddhist moral writers I have encountered two opinions on what observance of the third precept would entail for a gay Buddhist who takes his sīla seriously.[*] The more common one is that he should simply take the same strictures as would apply to a heterosexual lay Buddhist and apply them to his own orientation. For example, he would refrain from relations with men already attached, men living dependent on their parents, etc. If a gay Buddhist takes this approach then when residing in, or travelling through, countries where homosexuality is illegal, he would regard other men as saparidaṇḍa and refrain from having sex with them.

[*] Or three if you count the Tibetan view that all homosexual acts transgress the third precept.

The other, less common, view is that homosexual acts are not mentioned in connection with the third precept on account of their not being regarded by the ancient Indians as sexual acts at all. It is claimed by some scholars that having oral or anal sex with other men was viewed as simply a recreation, on a par with having a massage or climbing a tree or going for a swim, in which any young bachelor (except a brahmin) might indulge prior to settling down in marriage. If a gay Buddhist adopts this view, then he may not regard any homosexual acts at all as contravening his sīla. Should he happen to live in a country where homosexuality is illegal, whether he would refrain from homosexual sex would depend on whether he acknowledged any religious obligation to obey the law of the land. In the case of a bhikkhu there is an explicit Vinaya obligation to obey the law. According to Namdrol on Dharmawheel there is such an obligation for Buddhist laypeople too, but I've never seen this stated in any Pali text.

So those are the two views. My own preference is for the first, for even if it's true that the Indians in general didn't regard homosexual acts as sexual, there seems little doubt that the Buddha did. E.g., in the Vinaya it's decreed that breaches of chastity between a bhikkhu and another man entail exactly the same class of offence as breaches involving a female.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 6, 2015 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Womanizing?

Content:

Whatever it might be, the micchādhamma mentioned in the Cakkavattī-Sihanāda Sutta is one that appears during a "dark period" (i.e. one in between Buddha-sāsanās) in which the world has already arrived at a very advanced stage of anthropo-degeneration. Since nothing taught by the Buddha would still be present in the world, there would be no point in his going into any detail about it or laying down any guidance for the beings who live at this time. The message of the Cakkavattī-Sihanāda Sutta is a message left for us, not for them:

"Keep to your own pastures, bhikkhus, walk in the haunts where your fathers roamed. If

ye thus walk in them, then shall Māra no lodgement find.” (DN. 26)

("Own pastures" = four satipaṭṭhānas)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 8, 2015 2:07 AM

Title: Re: Can karma be purified?

Content:

I think you're misreading it. Ajahn Thanissaro is not endorsing this view. When he says "according to this understanding..." he means according to the Jain understanding [which is wrong]. So he's merely remarking that a lot of modern Buddhists subscribe to the very same error as the Jains.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 12:37 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

But why break one sīla's by slandering him? Just telling the truth about Muhammad will more than suffice.

Here's a good example: an American evangelical Christian gives an amusing presentation of a Hadith which relates the Prophet's fondness for cross-dressing, and especially in the clothes of his child-bride Aisha:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 12:41 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

What is needed, in my view, is a frank recognition that Muslims are unassimilable cultural and moral aliens who are absolutely out of place in a secularised post-Enlightenment Europe. Since their Shariah commitment does not permit them to embrace the shared values of such a Europe, they simply do not belong amongst us.

So what is best? I would say less kipping and more Kipling:

[...]

“The Stranger within my gates,
He may be evil or good,
But I cannot tell what powers control –
What reasons sway his mood;
Nor when the Gods of his far-off land
Shall repossess his blood.

[...]

“This was my father’s belief
And this is also mine:
Let the corn be all one sheaf—
And the grapes be all one vine,
Ere our children’s teeth are set on edge
By bitter bread and wine.”

<http://www.bartleby.com/364/308.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 12:47 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

But getting us to hate them isn't the Jihadists' goal at all.

Their goal is a caliphate, with Muslims ruling the roost and the rest of us subjected to dhimmitude - if we're allowed to live at all. Their more immediate goal —at which the current atrocity in France is aimed— is the silencing of all criticism or mockery of Islam and its prophet. And this insufferable patsy of a priest is just lending them a helping hand with his sequacious liberal platitudes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Terrorism

Content:

Sowing the seeds of vibhajjavādic vigilance and circumspection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 5:30 PM

Title: Re: Recreational Reading and the 8-Precept Observance

Content:

Vinaya texts, though intended for monks, are in fact helpful for ironing out some of the details of the precepts for laypeople, especially the last three of the eight precepts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 5:44 PM

Title: Re: is masturbation a lower hindrance than sex?

Content:

You wouldn't really need much of a "transportation infrastructure" for a plant that's indigenous to South Asia, is a staple of Ayurveda, and grows virtually everywhere.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 7:49 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

I fully agree with you that those whom obsequious politicians and multiculturalist know-nothings like to laud as "moderate Muslims" or "peaceful Muslims" are not really Muslims at all. But can you explain why you think it's desirable that these people have their eyes opened to the contradiction inherent in their position? Would it not be better to simply leave them to infect "real Muslims" (= Muslims who rigorously emulate Muhammad's conduct in the Hadiths = violent Muslims) with their whims and wishes and humanistic values? Or do you think this to be impossible - i.e. that the real/violent Muslims are simply immune to being infected?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 10:03 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

<http://www.thereligionofpeace.com/Pages/Games-Muslims-Play.htm#2-256>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 10:07 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Thanks. I'll watch it tomorrow when I have a faster connection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 9, 2015 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Certainly one would like to think that this might be the case, hence my question to Ahura Mazda in

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=14&t=22657&start=20#p324742>.

But his reply, as you may have noticed, is pessimistic, as are those of Ayaan Hirsi Ali, Wafa Sultan, Nonie Darwish, Ibn Waraq, Anwar Shaikh, Taysir Abu Saada, Walid Shiebat, and so many other intelligent apostates who've applied themselves to the problem.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 10, 2015 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Book of the Discipline download

Content:

The incomplete translation of the Vinaya by Oldenberg and Th. Rhys Davids is about 130 years old, but the Book of the Discipline (the complete translation by I.B. Horner) was published only in 1938.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 10, 2015 3:54 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Not really. All mainstream European Christian churches are now fully humanised.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 10, 2015 1:27 PM

Title: Re: "While he *still* does not attain to..."

Content:

If a translator opts for 'while', then he needs to add 'still' to disambiguate. If he uses 'when', then the sentence is already unambiguous and so 'still' is not needed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 11, 2015 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk ask for shelter?

Content:

Hi Opanayiko,

A bhikkhu can ask for shelter from his relatives or from laypeople who have formally

invited him to ask for the four requisites. From any other householder he is permitted to ask for building materials to build a lodging for himself. For further remarks on the last point, see Ajahn Thanissaro's explanation of the http://zugangzureinsicht.org/html/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch05_en.html rule.

Unmentioned in Thanissaro's account is that some bhikkhus think the permission to ask for building materials can be extended to include asking a householder for a room for the night. Other bhikkhus think it can't. In the Theravada countries of Asia it's pretty much a non-issue because no matter which direction a bhikkhu goes walking in, or how far he walks, when it gets to nightfall there's sure to be a monastery nearby where he can put up for the night.

When travelling around in the West my own policy would differ from one country to another. In continental Europe and central Asia I never asked for a room from householders, but just slept in ditches, barns, derelict buildings, etc. In Britain there's a good network of lay Buddhists who are willing to put up monks for the night, so travelling there is easy provided you plan your trip well and notify everyone in advance. Easiest of all is Iceland, where there's an old tradition that one should never refuse a traveller a bed for the night (dating from the old days when this would be a matter of life or death in wintertime), so there I didn't hesitate to ask. Travelling around the island I slept in churches, priests' homes, sheep farms, eider duck farms, a whaling station, a herring fishing station, shepherds' huts, and once at Stykkishólmur harbour I shared a plastic fish skip with a pair of drunken tramps. Everyone I ran into seemed very happy to help me.

In fact during ten years as a monk in Europe only one place ever turned me away at the door: a Tibetan Buddhist monastery just outside Liège. I was hitch-hiking from London to Vienna to visit my old teacher, and had been picked up in Brussels and driven to the Tibetan monastery by a Transcendental Meditation teacher. But the monks said that they were holding a Tantric retreat and that the presence of a Hinayana monk would bring bad vibrations, or something like that. Apparently Hinayana vibrations are so bad that I couldn't even be suffered to sleep under a tree in the monastery garden.

So, I left the Belgian bodhisattvas to enjoy their unadulterated vibrations, walked into Liège and sat down on a park bench. There I was approached by a friendly homosexual Thai waiter. He said that he and his Belgian boyfriend would be working all night in the Thai restaurant that his boyfriend owned, so I was welcome to sleep in their apartment. He then wrote down his address and gave me the key. While at work that night he had a whip-round among the Thai restaurant staff and the next morning he and his boyfriend presented me with a lovely breakfast and a train ticket to Vienna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 12, 2015 9:00 AM

Title: Re: comparison?

Content:

The change from the “good friendship” (kalyānamittatā) that was so highly praised by the Buddha to the “lama/disciple contract” (samaya) of Tibetan Buddhism, is the spiritual equivalent of a transformation of fellowship into serfdom. But this is probably reflective not so much of the doctrines of the schools but rather of the political forms of society in which each had its provenance: the republicanism of the Shakyans, Licchavīs, Mallas etc. versus the oriental despotisms of central Asia.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 12, 2015 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

If you mean the four assemblies, then sāmaṇeras, sikkhamānās and sāmaṇerīs are anomalies who don't really fit in anywhere. We can't call them upāsakas/upāsikās because they're pabbajita ('gone forth'). We can't call them bhikkhus/bhikkhunīs because they're anupasampanna ('not fully-accepted'). We might perhaps describe them as the religious equivalent of transitional fossils, with the sāmaṇera standing in relation to the upāsaka and the bhikkhu much as homo rhodesiensis stands in relation to homo neanderthalensis and homo sapiens sapiens.

Such a description wouldn't apply in Sri Lanka though, where for many men sāmaṇeraship isn't a transitional status but one that they stay in all their life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 12, 2015 11:58 PM

Title: Thelonious Monk

Content:

I expect Thelonious Monk must have played quite a few rolls in his career, but I'm not sure if it's true of monks in general.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 13, 2015 12:25 AM

Title: Re: a convoluted path

Content:

Welcome.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 13, 2015 7:38 AM

Title: Re: Pacifism, Ethics and Dhamma

Content:

I believe you mean role-play (or rôle-play, for the more pedantic).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 13, 2015 8:05 AM

Title: Re: What is the freedom of speech?

Content:

Or on the more elementary grounds that your analysis doesn't reckon with rhetorical conventions that are well-understood by speaker and audience alike and which the Buddha had no hesitation in using. For example, making a point by way of hyperbole or the witty coining of ersatz etymologies, to name but two pedagogical skills that seem to have been much prized in his time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 14, 2015 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Thelonious Monk

Content:

Yes, a 'roll' in piano-playing is an arpeggio.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 14, 2015 8:33 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Also interesting is that so far 94% of this left-wing tabloid's readers agree with the mayor. It's good to know that the lefties are getting sick of these choleric nuisances too, rather than constantly pandering to all their phoney grievances and demands for special treatment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 14, 2015 8:41 AM

Title: Re: Can karma be purified?

Content:

Welcome to Dhammawheel.

In the Pali language karma is in fact spelled kamma. Only one poster has misspelled it 'kama', which is probably just a typo since he's spelled it right in the rest of his post..

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 14, 2015 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Yes. Actually I'm not too sold on his economics either, nor his uncritical support for Israel. But on religious lunacy in general, and <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jlaGWURONRU>, the man's an absolute delight.

"Pat Condell is unique. Nobody can match his extraordinary blend of suavity and savagery. With his articulate intelligence he runs rings around the religious wingnuts that are the targets of his merciless humour. Thank goodness he is on our side." — Richard Dawkins

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 14, 2015 8:42 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

I wasn't aware that the term was pejorative. It seems that the editors of the Oxford English Dictionary are not aware of this either.

Had I wanted to be pejorative (which I didn't, for I was writing in a genial vein), I would have borrowed one of Winston Churchill's many colourful expressions, my favourite being "Bolshevik baboons".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 15, 2015 5:45 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

I suspect that this silly man just got the city names mixed up and was probably thinking of either Burnley, Blackburn or (most likely) the Yorkshire city of Bradford, with its Jihadist/Loony Left Member of Parliament George Galloway.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

If Emerson did in fact mean the Islamic Republic of Bradford, then what he had to say wouldn't actually be all that far off the mark. He says, for example, that "Birmingham" is a city where the police don't dare to take any action against Muslims. Well, I can remember twenty years ago when there were hundreds of Muslims marching through Bradford bearing "Kill Salman Rushdie!" placards and our supine police didn't dare arrest a single one of them for incitement to murder.

He also speaks of “Birmingham” as being run by Shariah courts, with the British legal system no longer having any de facto jurisdiction. In Bradford this wouldn’t be true of criminal courts, but in civil matters the city’s Muslims are in fact subject to strong pressure, including threats of social ostracism and the boycotting of their businesses, to settle all inter-Muslim civil disputes in Shariah courts (courts in which women are not treated as equals) rather than in normal English courts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 15, 2015 2:03 PM

Title: Re: sex and romantic relationships

Content:

The Buddha.

"That's the way it is, householder. That's the way it is — for sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair are born from one who is dear, come springing from one who is dear."

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.087.than.html>

So unless you limit your sex life to prostitutes who mean nothing to you, then there will be people who are dear to you, with all that that imports.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 15, 2015 7:52 PM

Title: Re: sex and romantic relationships

Content:

If I had appealed to my personal experience, then your question would be appropriate. But since I limited myself to citing an authority (because that's what you had asked for!) and then drawing what seemed like a reasonable inference from it, your question is impertinent and intrusive.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 1:41 AM

Title: Re: sex and romantic relationships

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 2:02 AM

Title: Re: Is selling fattening food a Right Livelihood?

Content:

It would be provided one didn't cheat when weighing the produce, or shortchange the customers, or commit any of the three bodily or four verbal akusala kammaṣaṭṭha while engaged in the selling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Boran kammaṣaṭṭha

Content:

Not really. I think you've overlooked Bhikkhu Bodhi's words "in the mundane portion of the path". In other words, in the commentarial exposition of the sukkhavipassaka, he does not attain mundane jhāna and then emerge from it and use the jhāna factors as a basis for insight (= "the mundane portion of the path"). Nonetheless the sukkhavipassaka is in jhāna during the supramundane portion of the path when there arise the path and fruition consciousnesses with Nibbāna as their object.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 11:45 AM

Title: Re: Kammaṣaṭṭha errata

Content:

In the 16-ñāṇa formulation of the progress of insight, the supramundane portion comprises the change-of-lineage, path, and fruition knowledges. The rest are mundane.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 12:34 PM

Title: Re: devas and nagas are real entities?

Content:

For a solitary Buddhist ascetic it's advantageous to believe that devas exist, for without such faith only two of the three 'authorities' (adhipateyya) are available to him. (See the paragraph in bold in the sutta below)

For everyone else I suppose it doesn't greatly matter one way or the other. Unless of course they get attacked by yakkhas. Now if that should happen, then the non-believers will be in deep shtook because it won't occur to them to call for help from the forty-one devas named in the Atanatiya Sutta as being oath-bound to protect the Buddha's followers.

from the Adhipateyya Sutta

Authorities

“Bhikkhus, there are these three authorities. What three? Oneself as one’s authority, the world as one’s authority, and the Dhamma as one’s authority.

(1) “And what, bhikkhus, is oneself as one’s authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: ‘I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe, almsfood, or lodging, or for the sake of becoming this or that, but rather [with the thought]: “I am immersed in birth, old age, and death; in sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish. I am immersed in suffering, afflicted by suffering. Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned.” As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, it would not be proper for me to seek out sensual pleasures similar to or worse than those that I have discarded.’ He then reflects thus: ‘Energy will be aroused in me without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.’ Having taken himself as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called oneself as one’s authority.

(2) “And what, bhikkhus, is the world as one’s authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: ‘I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe ... but rather [with the thought]: “I am immersed in birth, old age, and death ... Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned.” As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, I might think sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, or thoughts of harming. But the abode of the world is vast. In the vast abode of the world there are ascetics and brahmins with psychic potency and the divine eye who know the minds of others. They see things from a distance but they are not themselves seen even when they’re close; they know the minds [of others] with their own mind. They would know me thus: “Look at this clansman: though he has gone forth from the household life into homelessness out of faith, he is tarnished by bad unwholesome states.”

There are deities, too, with psychic potency and the divine eye who know the minds of others. They see even from a distance but are not seen themselves even when close; they too know the minds [of others] with their own mind. They too would know me thus: “Look at this clansman: though he has gone forth from the household life into homelessness out of faith, he is tarnished by bad unwholesome states.”

He then reflects thus: ‘Energy will be aroused in me without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.’ Having taken the world as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called the world as one’s authority.

(3) “And what, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma as one’s authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: ‘I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe ... but rather [with the

thought]: “I am immersed in birth, old age, and death ... Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned.” The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One, directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise. There are fellow monks of mine who know and see. As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness in this well-expounded Dhamma and discipline, it would be improper for me to be lazy and heedless.’ He then reflects thus: ‘Energy will be aroused in me without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.’ Having taken the Dhamma as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called the Dhamma as one’s authority.

“These, bhikkhus, are the three authorities.”

(Bhikkhu Bodhi trans. Numerical Discourses)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 12:57 PM

Title: Phonetic description of annoying teenage noises

Content:

Phonetics doesn't often make for comedy, but when Prof. James Harbeck gets his hands on it...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 2:28 PM

Title: Re: devas and nagas are real entities?

Content:

I don't think so. In calling the earth to witness the Buddha wasn't arousing himself to practise diligently, but was simply preventing Māra from stealing his seat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 3:00 PM

Title: Re: Why we can be certain that God does not exist

Content:

Apatheism may well be an easy fit for those raised in secular or religiously lukewarm households. However, I think that for most of us who’ve come into Buddhism from a strong theistic background (which I suspect may be the case with Ven. Sujāto, an ex-Catholic), an ideology of principled apathy is simply not an option. The God concept haunts us and is something we absolutely need to get out of our system.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 3:44 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Everyone except critics of Islam and irreverent cartoonists?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Oh, but I do accept them, Dan! I accept, for example, that freedom of speech should not include incitement to murder. As I've said already, I think that those placard-carrying Muslims who marched through British streets demanding the death of Salman Rushdie should have been arrested and charged with incitement, as should all these incendiary imams who preach "Death to Jews!" every Friday.

What I oppose is an expansion of these constraints that's aimed at the enforcement by the state of simple good manners. I don't consider opposing boorishness to be a legitimate function of the state. I don't consider arresting people for calling other people rude names to be a legitimate role for the police. I believe in the adage, "Sticks and stones may break my bones..." for heaven's sake. I value good manners as much as anyone, but I think they should be taught by parents and enforced not by the state but by all the traditional informal mechanisms of enforcement, that span the gamut from the sharp glance at someone who's made a thoughtlessly offensive remark to ostracism from polite society for those who make a habit of it. Why must the state be poking its nose in all the time?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 16, 2015 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Phonetic description of annoying teenage noises

Content:

Yes, though compared with other technical jargons, that of phonetics is fairly easy to pick up. Especially when you've got a talented populariser like Harbeck explaining it.

In this video he explains 9 rather unusual sounds; the first 8 are found in actual languages, while the 9th is a mere theoretical possibility but not as yet found anywhere.

1. Bilabial trill
2. Pharyngeal fricative
3. Implosive velar stop
4. Uvular trill

5. Alveolar click
6. Palatal click
7. Lateral click
8. Pulmonic ingressive voiceless lateral fricative
9. Pulmonic ingressive voiceless palatal trill
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }<https://phpbbex.com/> .

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

And the blatantly unequal enforcement of them is a matter of public record in every single country that's opted for multiculturalism rather than laïcisme or something similar.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Zen, Zazen and Dogen

Content:

<http://www.wwzc.org/dharma-text/four-noble-truths>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 2:17 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

I don't think one can say for certain. I mean Titmuss (as usual) just sort of riffs and at no point states why he would like his readers to identify with the two murderers. Doing so could be one of the approaches to overcoming resentment in mettabhāvanā, in which case the blogger may be acquitted of the charge of fluffy-bunnying. On the other hand, if he means something like: "All of us are always just doing the best that we can, so let's all try to be nice and not too judgmental about each other..." then yep, that would be getting into fluffy bunny territory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 2:22 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist wanting to be a better Buddhist...

Content:
Welcome.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 3:03 AM
Title: Re: Buddhist wanting to be a better Buddhist...
Content:
Have you consulted Buddhanet's world directory? There seem to be about half a dozen Theravadin establishments currently listed in Houston:

<https://tinyurl.com/pewo2v6>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 3:28 AM
Title: Re: Zen, Zazen and Dogen
Content:
No, sorry.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 10:30 AM
Title: Re: Phonetic description of annoying teenage noises
Content:
That could well be. I nearly choked on my coffee yesterday when I saw what Ven. Anandajoti had written on my Facebook timeline: "You forgot to mention regressive alcoholic palatal flops."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 11:15 AM
Title: Re: Robe colour
Content:
One reason is that the Buddha permitted a variety of materials to be used for robe-dying and these will inevitably generate different colours. Red clay gives a dark pink hue, while the boiled chips from the wood of a jack-fruit tree give a dull ochre. Another possible reason is differing ideas of what the Pali names for colours mean. There are a number of difficulties in translating the Pali names for colours into the languages of SE Asia (or even into English for that matter). There isn't always a perfect match between the chromatic range of a particular colour in Pali and that of a colour in some other language. Pali, for example, has a word for 'blue', while Thai does not. What Thai has is "sky-coloured" (sii faa) and "silver-nitrate-coloured" (sii nam-ngoen), the former for light

shades of blue and the latter for dark shades. But unlike in English and Pali, Thai lacks any conception of 'blueness' or any idea of sii faa and sii nam-ngoen being two shades of a single colour. They are not perceived to be so, any more than an English-speaker would perceive yellow and orange as two shades of a single colour.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 5:53 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

No comparison really, for this wasn't religiously motivated anger. The man's attackers were the people employed to look after the shrine, together with incense and candle sellers, dancing girls, and others whose livelihood depended on it. Naturally they were angered at the man for the loss of livelihood his vandalism had caused them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 5:58 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Not just Hindus. Thai Buddhists don't perceive any contradiction in venerating Hindu shrines for good luck. Almost any time you take a taxi in that part of Bangkok the driver will salute the Erawan shrine as he goes by.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 6:04 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

Yawn all you like, but you're still wrong. It simply wasn't a case of a "Buddhist responding to a perceived act of blasphemy."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 6:26 PM

Title: Re: What music are you listening to right now?

Content:

Godfrey St. John-Burns, with an exciting new rendition of Steppenwolf's "Born to Be Wild"

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 17, 2015 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

I think the Sutta passages most relevant are those that castigate and refute fatalism (niyativāda), Islam being, in most of its forms, probably the most fatalistic theism imaginable — a fatalism that puts even Jansenism and double-predestinarian Calvinism in the pale.

And then there's the Mārayācana section of the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta, in which the Buddha tells Māra that he will not pass away until he has disciples capable of rightly refuting the wrong views of outsiders. This, in my view is what the Buddhist response to Muslims should be, Islam being probably the most evil congeries of micchādiṭṭhi the world has ever known.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 18, 2015 7:55 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist response to Muslims

Content:

My disdainful phrase was directed not at peace-loving Australians, but statist Australians. These people are not really peace-loving. They might profess to love peace, but what they really love is power. They might profess to be freedom-loving, yet this is belied by all that they do, in particular by their constant assault on the right of free speech. The multiculturalist bureaucrats of Australia, like multiculturalist bureaucrats everywhere else, are just arrogant and authoritarian busybodies whose highest joy appears to consist in the never-ending expansion of state power via frivolous litigation.

Edit: Whoops, the thread was closed as I was writing my reply, so I didn't notice it. Mr Man, I'll reply to your question by pm.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 19, 2015 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Anatta

Content:

There's no evidence that Ken has ever studied Pali. His tossing about of Pali grammatical terms is just a P.T Barnum performance aimed at pulling the wool over people's eyes by creating a false appearance of expertise. To anyone familiar with the meaning of the terms it will be immediately obvious that it's all just a meaningless word salad.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 19, 2015 8:40 PM

Title: Re: Anatta

Content:

The silly buffoon doesn't even know what "proper noun" means. Unless it is the name of a man called Citta, the Pali word 'citta' is a common noun, not a proper noun.

Proper noun: a name used for an individual person, place, or organization, spelled with an initial capital letter, e.g. Jane, London, and Oxfam . Often contrasted with common noun.

Common noun: a noun denoting a class of objects or a concept as opposed to a particular individual. Often contrasted with proper noun.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 19, 2015 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

You will find this to be something of a bone of contention among English-speaking Buddhists. On the one hand there are those (mainly Theravadins) who maintain that there's an important difference in meaning between the two terms and insist that 'rebirth' alone is the correct one. On the other hand there are those (mainly adherents of the Tibetan schools) who maintain that there isn't any difference in meaning and so it doesn't matter which word one uses. Some will even go so far as to claim that 'reincarnation' is the better term, on the grounds of it being the more familiar of the two.

Those who insist on the use of 'rebirth' most commonly object to 'reincarnation' on the grounds that it suggests the idea of a soul that is reborn, which is not how past and future lives are conceived in the Buddha's teaching. Their opponents reply that this argument is weak, for the word 'rebirth' also suggests some sort of egoic entity that persists from one life to the next. The only difference is that if we use 'rebirth' then we are more likely to refer to the egoic entity as a 'person' or with some proper noun, rather than with the word 'soul'. From the point of view of ultimate truth, the sentences, "The person died and was reborn," "Fred died and was reborn," and "The person died and her soul reincarnated" are all equally expressive of falsehoods if they are taken literally. From the point of view of conventional truth, however, what they express differs in phrasing and not in meaning. In my view, this is a sound rebuttal of the argument commonly advanced by those who insist on 'rebirth'.

Having said that, although the common argument for insisting on 'rebirth' is a weak one, there is another (and much better) reason for preferring 'rebirth' to 'reincarnation', namely, that the 'carn' part of reincarnation means 'flesh'. But the Buddha's teaching includes the possibility of rebirth in the Brahma realms, where the matter is unfleshly,

and the Arūpa realms, where there is no matter at all. That being so, the word 'reincarnation' is semantically inadequate to encompass the full range of Buddhist afterlife doctrine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 6:57 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

In the Suttas some indications are given in the Dīgha Nikāya's Mahānidāna Sutta and Majjhima Nikāya's Mahātaṇhāsāṅkhaya Sutta. For the detailed treatment of the commentaries, the most accessible source is the "Process-Freed" chapter of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha (translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi and Dr. Rewata Dhamma as Comprehensive Manual of Abhidhamma).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 7:17 AM

Title: Re: A.K. Warder's Pali Metre finally free and for all!

Content:

Anyone interested in the subject of Pali prosody will also find the "Indian Prosody" section of Ven. Anandajoti's website a veritable goldmine:

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 7:25 AM

Title: Re: Dependant origination

Content:

"The Book of Analysis", U Thittila's PTS translation of the Vibhaṅga, is now available online (with the permission of the PTS, so I'm told).

<https://wattveluvona.blogspot.com/2012/03/tripitaka-or-three-baskets.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 11:49 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

This is Rev. Nārada's translation, whose accompanying commentary is much inferior to that in the revised Bodhi/Rewata one. I believe there are some online copies of the latter available, but you need to avoid the one put out by Allan Bomhard of the Charleston

Buddhist Fellowship as it's full of mistakes.

Edit: This is a free pdf version of a reliable copy, from the link posted earlier by Mike:
http://store.pariyatti.org/Comprehensive-Manual-of-Abhidhamma-A--PDF-eBook_p_4362.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 12:12 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

So long as we're doing conventional truth/sammuti-sacca the term 'rebirth' (or even 'reincarnation', up to a point) is fine, because in sammuti-sacca we are speaking as if there existed a being who persists through saṃsāric time, who acts and experiences the ripening of his actions, who has past lives and is liable to have future lives, etc. etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 20, 2015 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

The moderator who moved it from Early Buddhism to Pali Resources isn't presently online, but I myself would consider it to be of more relevance here. After all, fewer than three pages of the book are devoted to the use of metrical studies in chronological stratification—the only topic that would be of relevance to early Buddhism studies—while all the rest is devoted simply to Pali metre in its own right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 21, 2015 6:38 PM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

I doubt it for there isn't any need for it. For English words one needs such a thing because their pronunciation is so vagarious, but this is not at all the case with Pali words. Once one has learned the rules of Pali pronunciation—which can be done with just a few hours study and practice—there will be no Pali words that one cannot pronounce correctly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 21, 2015 8:08 PM

Title: Re: bodhisatta aspiration

Content:

In order to be certain of being fulfilled it must be made in the presence of a Buddha, and by a suitably qualified person (with some pretty stringent qualification criteria), and must be followed by a prediction from that Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 21, 2015 9:18 PM

Title: Re: bodhisatta aspiration

Content:

No. The detailed account of the Bodhisatta's career is from the commentaries, chiefly those to the Jātaka, Buddhavaṃsa and Cariyāpiṭaka. Below is probably the most accessible treatment in English at present — Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the section on the ten perfections in Dhammapāla's commentary to the Cariyāpiṭaka:

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel409.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 22, 2015 10:33 AM

Title: Re: TEACHERS' PLEDGE

Content:

I wonder what this means? Do American Zen Buddhists not have any teacher's code of ethics? If so, why not just borrow the perfectly serviceable one formulated by America's lay vipassanā-wallahs back in 1990? <http://www.insightmeditationcenter.org/fliers-forms/Ethics%20and%20Reconciliation%20Policy.pdf>

Or does it mean that they do have a code, but it's an invisible or a semi-visible one or a code that's kept in hiding? And so the 92 teachers have got together and pledged to make the code more visible — to bring it out into the light of day, so to speak? But why merely 'pledge' to do it? Given how easily it might be done, why not just do it?

“[F.R.] Leavis demands moral earnestness; I prefer morality... I mean I'd sooner live among people who don't cheat at cards than among people who are earnest about not cheating.”

(C.S. Lewis, dialogue with Kingsley Amis)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 9:24 AM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

For lazy people the rules of Pali pronunciation can be cut down to 6.

Rule 1:

There are 8 vowels in Pali, which are pronounced with their continental values.

Rule 2:

There are 33 consonants in Pali:

ka kha ga gha ña
ca cha ja jha ña
ṭa ṭha ḍa ḍha ṇa
ta tha da dha na
pa pha ba bha ma
ya ra la va sa ha ḷa ṃ

Rule 3:

Since almost no English-speaking Buddhists bother to distinguish retroflex consonants from dentals, we can eliminate ṭa, ṭha, ḍa, ḍha, ṇa and ḷa.

Rule 4:

Since almost no English-speaking Buddhists bother to distinguish non-aspirates from aspirates, we can eliminate the latter. So now we have only 19 consonants:

ka ga ña
ca ja ña
ta da na
pa ba ma
ya ra la va sa ha ṃ

Rule 5:

Of these 19, the consonants ka, ga, ja, ta, da, na, pa, ba, ma, ya, ra, la, va, sa, and ha have more or less the same sound that they do in English.

Rule 6:

We are now left with just 4 consonants whose pronunciation needs to be learned: ca (pronounce as as a voiceless palatal non-aspirate) and the three nasals: ña (alveolar), ña (palatal), and ṃ (nasalis simplex).

Pretty painless, eh?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Did samanera was a forest monk?

Content:

It seems to me that the word's etymology lends support to the received understanding, for 'samaṇa' means about the same as 'bhikkhu' and 'sāmaṇera' means a 'little samaṇa'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 11:19 AM

Title: Re: No F Words in Pali

Content:

In the Thai dialects spoken in some of Thailand's Eastern Seaboard provinces the consonant clusters corresponding to the Pali kv and khv are generally realized as voiceless labial fricatives. So whenever I've found myself chanting with monks from Trat, Prachinburi, etc. I notice that they'll usually say 'faci' instead of 'kvaci' and 'fāhaṃ' instead of 'khvāhaṃ'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 6:14 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk ask for shelter?

Content:

I don't think it's a misunderstanding. It's about eschewing simple-minded literalism and being sensitive to how such a request will be perceived in different countries so that you avoid giving the sangha a bad name. In most of Europe, excluding such places as rural Iceland, to ask for accommodation for the night is to ask for something that's regarded as having monetary value. For example, as a teenager when I would go hiking in the Derbyshire Peak District most farmers would demand a fee just to let me pitch my tent in their field for the night. I was costing them nothing, but they still wanted paying. Now imagine if a bhikkhu approaches such a farmer and not only wants accommodation for the night but hopes to get it for free. He'll most likely get short shrift and later down at the pub the farmer will tell all his mates about the cheeky Buddhist beggar that paid him a visit that day and how he sent the ragamuffin away with a flea in his ear.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 6:55 PM

Title: Re: Monk misconduct

Content:

Well, maybe, but even if Hara Tanzan didn't actually do any such thing, from all that's reliably known about the man it's very much the kind of thing he would do.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hara_Tanzan

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk ask for shelter?

Content:

The question isn't intelligible. Would you care to rephrase it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk ask for shelter?

Content:

Yes, but the venerable is in a Chinese temple, not a Tibetan one, and the Chinese, though predominantly Mahayanists, tend to be as good at *dāna* and *paṭisanthāra* as Theravadins are.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 7:20 PM

Title: Re: No F Words in Pali

Content:

I've no idea, though the consonant F is actually dento-labial (i.e. made with upper front teeth in contact with lower lips), not bilabial.

A bilabial fricative would sound like an imperfect attempt to blow a raspberry.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 7:23 PM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

Correction: that should be velar, not alveolar.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 23, 2015 8:45 PM

Title: Re: No F Words in Pali

Content:

The absence of a "v" sound in Thai would suffice to explain why the Pali "v" is generally realized by Thais as a "w", but it wouldn't by itself explain why the Eastern Seaboard Thais have also managed to lose the velar consonants "k" and "kh" whenever these are followed by a "w".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 12:00 AM

Title: Re: No F Words in Pali

Content:

I doubt it. The German presence in the region is no more marked than that of any other western expats and Khmer doesn't have an 'f' sound and has just the same complement of velar consonants as Thai. If the pronunciation of kw as f is due to another language's influence it would be more likely Mon.

On Thai language websites there are lots of discussions of this matter, which can be found just by googling for the two ways of pronouncing the Thai for 'broom': ไผ่ฟาด and ไผ่กวาด. But I haven't come across any intelligent theories so far. Just nonsense like "It's a genetically caused speech defect that affects everybody in Chantaburi" and "It's just the Easterners' way of trying to sound posh."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Lying and telling jokes.

Content:

tasmātiha te, rāhula, ‘hassāpi na musā bhaṇissāmī’ti: evañhi te, rāhula, sikkhitabbaṃ.

Ñāṇamoli:

“Therefore, Rāhula, you should train thus: ‘I will not utter a falsehood even as a joke.’”

I.B. Horner:

“Wherefore, for you, Rāhula, ‘I will not speak a lie, even for fun’ – this is how you must train yourself, Rāhula.”

The scope of hassā musā is somewhat narrower than its usual English translations might seem to suggest. It would include such acts as falsely telling someone that she has a bug crawling in her hair or knowingly sending someone on a fruitless errand. It wouldn't include telling jokes in the sense of funny fictional anecdotes with a punchline, whose fictional character is implicitly understood by speaker and audience.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 12:02 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk ask for shelter?

Content:

Ven. Gavesako would know better how things are now, but back in the 80's when the Forest Sangha monks would walk thudong in Britain the route would be planned in advance, with lay supporters along the route being notified in advance and awaiting the

monks' arrival.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 5:38 PM

Title: Re: Lying and telling jokes.

Content:

That's a great one. But when your children get a bit older you can start telling it like this...

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 6:02 PM

Title: Re: No F Words in Pali

Content:

Well, they ought to say the two syllables with a high tone followed by a low one, but I can't remember if they actually do so since we don't get many of those people up in Phrao and it's ten years since I last went down to Trat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 6:32 PM

Title: Re: The "Dharma" (Tibetan/Zen and Pure Land Buddhism) A question

Content:

Who says?

It's common enough for Mahayana modernists to say things like this, but I don't think those who say them can truthfully claim that they are being faithful to the historical Mahayana tradition. For such fidelity one would need to look to Mahayana fundamentalists like the late Master Hsuan Hua or the current Dalai Lama — persons who think that Mahayana texts really did have their provenance with the Buddha and really were preserved by nāgas.

Donald Lopez's *The Heart Sutra Explained* offers some interesting specimens of how Haribhadra and other Indian Mahayana apologists were wont to defend Mahayana sutras against the charge of spuriousness advanced by mainstream Indian Buddhists. It seem that none of them took the "just a legend" approach that's so common among Mahayana apologists today. On the contrary, they were very insistent on the nāga story being a literal historical truth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 24, 2015 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Couldn't Dhamma protect Tibet?

Content:

It would appear that the op's question was effectively answered 11 months ago in Ven. Pesala's post. The Dhamma didn't protect Tibet from the scourge of Mao's communism because the statement that "the Dhamma protects the one who practises it" doesn't refer the protection of nations. It doesn't even refer to the protection of individuals from physical harm during their present life. Rather, it means that one who practises Dhamma is safeguarded against 'evil destinies' (duggati), meaning rebirth in the lower realms.

Dhammo have rakkhati dhammacāriṃ, dhammo suciṇṇo sukhamāvahati,
Esānisaṃso dhamme suciṇṇe, na duggatiṃ gacchati dhammacāri.

"Truly the Dhamma protects the practiser of Dhamma; the Dhamma well-practised brings happiness.

This is the reward of the Dhamma when well-practised: the practiser of the Dhamma does not go to a bad bourn."

(Theragāthā, verse of Dhammika Thera)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2015 6:11 AM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

There are several styles of chanting in Thailand. In one of the more ornate ones, called saraphanya or sawraphanya (सरभाण्या, Skt. sarabhañña) the syllabification of double consonants is not only done clearly, but is actually accentuated. There are certain chants which are always performed in this style, such as the Buddhamāṅgalagāthā (aka Phra orahan paed thid — The Arahants of the Eight Directions).

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

But any chant can be done in this style if one wants. In practice it's a style that's performed most often by (1) nuns, (2) schoolchildren, (3) on uposatha days in wats where the Pali is chanted with interlinear Thai translation, and (4) by monks at the "High Church" end of the Thai Buddhist spectrum, e.g. when chanting at ceremonies sponsored by the Bangkok royalty and aristocracy.

Schoolgirls paying homage to the Triple Gem, with interlinear Thai translation

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2015 7:37 AM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

I don't know of one. It would probably make a good subject for a doctoral thesis in musicology, for the variety is enormous. Although the chanting in the cities is much the same from place to place, with most wats just aping the Bangkok style, once you're in the countryside virtually every amphoe has its own style. I used to know four when I lived in Lamphun, and here in Chiang Mai I'm told there are sixteen altogether.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2015 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

I didn't find it any problem when I was in my twenties, but now that I'm almost fifty I expect I would have some difficulty in taking up a new style. Luckily I don't need to. When I'm up on my mountain it happens that I'm the most senior monk within about a 12-mile radius, so at funerals, house-blessings, etc. I get to lead and all the other monks have to adapt to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2015 6:21 PM

Title: Re: Omar Khayyam

Content:

From the feline version of the same...

Wake! for the Golden Cat has put to flight
The Mouse of Darkness with his Paw of Light:
Which means, in Plain and simple every-day
Unoriental Speech—The Dawn is bright.

They say the Early Bird the Worm shall taste.
Then rise, O Kitten! Wherefore, sleeping, waste

The Fruits of Virtue? Quick! the Early Bird
Will soon be on the Flutter—O make haste!

The Early Bird has gone, and with him ta'en
The Early Worm—Alas! the Moral's plain,
O Senseless Worm! Thus, thus we are repaid
For Early Rising—I shall doze again.

<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/24258/24258-h/24258-h.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 26, 2015 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Benefits of studying the Vinaya

Content:

The five benefits Mahinda lists are certainly not in the Tipiṭaka. Nor have I met with them in any commentary (though there are a few commentaries I haven't yet read). However, as Ledi Sayadaw didn't mention the five benefits in the article posted by Ven. Pesala, I strongly doubt they are in any Pali text at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2015 5:31 PM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

Indeed. The “rains hard” rendering is in I.B. Horner's translation of the Vinaya Piṭaka:
“It rains hard on a covered thing, it rains not hard on an open thing,
So open up the covered thing: thus it will not rain hard on that.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2015 7:44 PM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

The rain descends with equal velocity in both cases, but when it reaches the earth it makes much more of a racket if it lands on a roof than if it lands on a stretch of open earth or grassland.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 27, 2015 9:43 PM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

From the Vinaya Atthakathā:

channamativassatī ti āpattiṃ āpajjitvā paṭicchādentō aññaṃ navaṃ āpattiṃ āpajjati idameṭaṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ.

“It rains hard on the covered” — this was stated in connection with one who, having committed an offence, concealing it commits another new offence

vivaṭaṃ nātivassatī ti āpattiṃ āpajjitvā vivaranto aññaṃ nāpajjati idameṭaṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ.

“It rains not hard on the open” — this was stated in connection with one who, having committed an offence, disclosing it does not commit any further offence.

Relating this to Horner’s translation: when a raindrop falls on, say, a roof or a lid, it makes a noise. It then bounces off, lands on the ground and makes a further noise. But if the raindrop falls on uncovered soil, grass, etc. then it is absorbed and so only gets to make one noise.

Relating it to Ajahn Thanissaro’s translation: the raindrops accumulate when they land on a covering but don’t accumulate if they fall on the ground.

Of the two I find Horner’s the likelier. With “It rains hard...” she plausibly treats ativassati as an impersonal verb (as the verb “to rain” usually is in Indo-European languages). But with “Rain soddens...” Thanissaro invents a subject where the Pali has none and then has this subject perform an action (“to sodden”), despite there being no grounds for supposing that “soddening” lies within ativassati’s semantic range.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 7:18 AM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

Opilāpeti, parisandati, pariṭṭavati, sedeti, seceti, pāyati, omadati, sammaddati, or vokitati.

Not all of the above actually occur as finite verbs, but I've constructed them on the basis of their past participles which are to be found. E.g. I've never seen vokitati, but one will meet with its past participle vokiṇṇa, "soaked".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 7:46 AM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

I was just looking at K.R. Norman's prose translation of the parallel passage in Elders' Verses. Norman is usually very careful, but on this occasion he gives the preposterous:

"It rains only on the covered, it does not rain on the opened. Therefore you should open the covered, then it will not rain on it."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 9:14 AM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

If we go with Horner's translation, then there's no doubt that the trope has undergone a loss of vividness in our own times. However, I think this should be attributed to the lack of plate-glass windows and doors in the Buddha's day rather than the lack of plastic sheeting.

To put ourselves in the shoes of an ancient Magadhan, let's start by asking: from which sense-objects would they infer that it was raining hard or raining soft? Chiefly it would be visible forms, sounds and (if they were outdoors) tangible objects. But since the normal thing to do when it's raining is to go indoors, we can forget about tangible objects. Now what does our ancient Magadhan do when he's gone indoors? Obviously he closes the doors and windows to stop the rain from coming in. And since the doors and windows are not made of glass, he can't see outside and therefore his knowledge that it's raining hard comes only from sounds cognizable to the ear. And so for him the sentence "it is raining hard" would be virtually equivalent to "there's a lot of noise out there".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 11:08 AM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

No. I had already stated in an earlier post what I understand the trope to mean: that there is less noise when rain falls onto open ground than when it falls onto a roof.

The post to which you replied was only concerned with remarking on the vividness that such a trope would have to an audience for whom rain was primarily apprehended as a sound rather than as a visual object.

Those posters whose minds are obsessed with "soddenness" would do well to offer some evidence that *ativassati* ever carries such a meaning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 9:33 PM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

Nobody has suggested "harden". Those who favour Miss Horner's translation understand *ativassati* to mean "it rains hard", using the adverb 'hard' in the primary sense given in the Oxford English Dictionary:

With effort, energy, or violence; strenuously, earnestly, vigorously; violently, fiercely. In early use, sometimes = intensely, exceedingly, extremely.

Sir Beues 4580 (MS. A.) The wind blew hardde with gret rage.

1628 Digby Voy. Medit. 51 It blew hard all night.

1697 W. Dampier Voy. I. 13 It rained very hard.

1798 Nelson 28 Dec. in Nicolas Disp. III. 212 The next day it blew harder than I ever experienced since I have been at sea.

1864 Mrs. Carlyle Lett. III. 237 If it snows as hard there as here.

The last three senses, "intensely, exceedingly, extremely", are particularly fitting here, and contrary to what one poster has suggested, they do fall within the semantic range of the prefix *ati-*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 28, 2015 10:19 PM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

It finds support in the fourth of the four definitions of *ati-* given by the grammarian Buddhapiya in his commentary to Kaccāyana's Grammar:

1. Atikkamane: *atirocati amhehi, atīto*.
2. Atikkante: *accantaṃ*.
3. Atisaye: *atikusalo*.
4. Bhusatthe: *atikkodho ativuddhi*.

1. In the sense of 'exceeding': "He [the *yakkha* Indaka] outshines us!"; "the past".

2. In the sense of 'exceeded': "Absolutely".

3. In the sense of 'excellence/abundance': "Extraordinarily skilful".

4. In the sense of 'strong': "vehemently angry"; "great growth".

(*Padarūpasiddhi* 281, *Opasaggikapada*. my trans.)

In the Pali-English Dictionary, the adjective '*bhusa*' and adverb '*bhusaṃ*' are defined: *bhusa* (adj.) [cp. Vedic *bhr̥śa*] strong, mighty, great Dh 339 (*taṇhā=balavā* DhA iv.48); J v.361 (*daṇḍa=daḥha, balavā* C.).

nt. *bhusaṃ* (adv.) much, exceedingly, greatly, vehemently. In cpds. *bhusaṃ°* & *bhusa°*. —S i.69; J iii.441; iv.11; v.203 (*bhusa-dassaneyya*); vi.192; Vv 69; Pv 338; iv.77; Miln 346; SnA 107 ('verbum intensivum'); Sdhp 289.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2015 10:37 AM

Title: Re: Slave question

Content:

Some time ago I learned from Sarasawadee Ongsakul's <http://silkwormbooks.com/products/history-of-lanna> that Wat Phra Dhatu Sri Chom Thong, at whose Abhidhamma school I'm presently studying, had over five hundred slaves until well into the reign of Rama V.

It seems most of the wat's 19th century slaves were donated by a Lanna king whose nickname was King Ow Pai on account of the characteristic phrase with which he would sentence anyone who incurred his disfavour to be summarily executed. Apparently he would just point at the person and say: "Ow pai!" ("Take it away!"), the "it" being the person's head. When someone like that offers you a gift it's probably not a good idea to refuse.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2015 10:58 AM

Title: Re: Slave question

Content:

Here's the fellow. His real name was King Kawirolot Suriyawong and he ruled Chiang Mai from 1856 to 1870. The other pic is his wife, Princess Usa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 30, 2015 11:02 AM

Title: Re: "Rain soddens what's covered..."

Content:

Good find.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2015 5:44 PM

Title: Re: ...full of stars

Content:

I don't think he was the first. Sagan started broadcasting in 1980, but the monocled eccentric https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick_Moore began his Sky at Night broadcasts way back in 1957.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2015 5:51 PM

Title: Re: ...full of stars

Content:

And here are Sagan and Moore together in 1974. I remember this particular programme

as it was broadcast when I was nine and just a few months after I'd become a regular viewer of the series.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 31, 2015 6:12 PM

Title: Re: What is the source of this quote?

Content:

This, posted twenty-two years ago to another forum, is as good a reply as any:
“The Buddhists’ arguments against [a supposed immutable soul] were various, but the principal point that they kept coming back to is that it is impossible to find a relationship between the world of experience (which is always changing) and this supposedly changeless Self. A changeless Self cannot act, since acting requires change. It cannot learn, since learning is a change of state. It cannot be aware of the change going on around it, since this would imply a plurality of inner characteristics within a substance that is supposed to be simple in nature. In other words, this Self would have no connection to anything about which we are concerned in everyday life. It is an entirely counterintuitive notion, and it is riddled with paradoxes. And, since nothing of theoretical or pragmatic value is gained by positing that there is a Self, it is an idea that one might as well give up. There is no point in countenancing paradox unless one is compelled to do so.”

— Richard Hayes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2015 7:46 AM

Title: Re: My relationship with my family and ethics.

Content:

Would you care to expand on the logistics of these forcible injections? I mean how is it that your parents and elder brother are in a position to do this?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2015 12:27 PM

Title: Re: Criteria for evaluating monasteries?

Content:

I find the behaviour of a monastery’s sāmaṇeras to be a pretty reliable criterion. In Thailand these are nearly all teenage lads, most of whom would rather not be in the monastery at all, and so they’re not at all easy to train. If you go into a wat and observe that the sāmaṇeras are all occupying their time productively, then it’s a fair bet that the abbot’s got his act together and has a hands-on approach to training his charges. On the other hand, if the sāmaṇeras are all goofing about —running around, playing cards, throwing frisbees, torturing dogs and cats, watching TV, etc.— then the abbot is probably, incompetent, neglectful or just too old to do his job properly, so don’t waste

your time there.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 2, 2015 6:03 PM

Title: Re: Criteria for evaluating monasteries?

Content:

I think in one's formative years it would probably be better to be in a monastery that does not have these things, or whose in-house rules make them off-limits for junior monks (I believe that's the case in England at Chithurst monastery).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 3, 2015 1:06 PM

Title: Re: Criteria for evaluating monasteries?

Content:

When I first went to Thailand I would practise aural comprehension by listening to Thai radio broadcasts for an hour a day. There are all kinds of religious broadcasts on Thai radio, but I soon discovered that the easiest things to understand were the Muslim sermons. Unlike the Buddhist radio preachers (mostly scholar monks from city monasteries), the Muslims tended to limit themselves to very simple language with a near-infantile vocabulary; unlike the forest monks they didn't use any unfamiliar regionalisms; and unlike the Thai newsreaders they didn't talk too fast. After about nine months I could get about 95% of what the Muslims were saying.

To get from that stepping stone to the point where I could understand Buddhist talks took about 2-4 years, i.e. two years before I could understand forest monks and four years before I could understand the more ornate language of scholar monks. I should add, however, that this is quite unusually slow; most western monks who ordain in their twenties seem to progress a lot more rapidly than I did.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 3, 2015 2:34 PM

Title: Re: Modern Ascetic Movements

Content:

I once knew a Welsh Buddhist lay hermit who spent a year secretly living in the catacombs at Highgate Cemetery in London. He spent his time using the surrounding skeletons to practise the cemetery contemplations. In the mornings he would support himself by walking from house to house for alms. Unfortunately it seems that due to vandalism you can't even get in to Highgate these days unless you have either a tour guide escorting you or a pass stating that you have a deceased relative buried there. Otherwise I guess it would still be a great place to live — especially for socialist types, who'd no doubt feel inspired to be in the presence of the cemetery's most famous

resident: Karl Marx.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Highgate_Cemetery

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 3, 2015 5:21 PM

Title: Re: Modern Ascetic Movements

Content:

Only with those householders at whose doors he went begging for food, but the conversations tended to be pretty short. When the posh folks on Highgate Hill found a dishevelled bearded Welsh gnome turning up on their doorstep begging for food, and explaining that he was living in a graveyard and meditating on corpses, predictably enough they weren't interested in developing a close acquaintance with him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 3, 2015 6:09 PM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

No, it wouldn't. Such a long-drawn-out introduction is a feature of Mahayana sutras. It is never found in the Pali Canon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 4, 2015 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha

Content:

You're welcome, though I think I'll bow out at this point. There really isn't much point in our continuing this discussion.

Suffice to say that in canon and commentary alike, catasso parisā means monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen, and is never used to mean anything other than these four groups. There is no "dispute" about this except the one that your imagination invents and stubbornly persists in.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2015 1:54 AM
Title: Re: Modern Ascetic Movements
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 4, 2015 11:32 PM
Title: Re: Starting from the bottom up...
Content:
Rupert Gethin, The Buddhist Path to Awakening.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 12:44 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma
Content:
<http://www.urbandharma.org/pdf/geth0401.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 7:19 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma
Content:

I should think that anyone with the medical competence to do this would surely know that his action will bring about the child's death. How then could his intention be anything other than to kill?

The only case I can imagine where this might be so is where the child has developed to the point where he has at least some chance of surviving if delivered prematurely.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 7:31 AM
Title: Re: skillful renunciation
Content:

The jhānas depend upon nekkhamma, not nekkhamma upon the jhānas. Nekkhamma depends upon saṃvega.

Renunciation is mentioned immediately after virtue: (a) because renunciation perfects the achievement of virtue; (b) in order to list good conduct of mind immediately after good conduct of body and speech; (c) because jhāna succeeds easily for one who has purified his virtue; (d) in order to show that the purification of one's end (āśaya) through

the abandoning of the offensive mental defilements follows the purification of one's means (payoga) by the abandoning of offensive actions; and (e) to state the abandoning of mental obsessions immediately after the abandoning of bodily and verbal transgressions.

[...]

(3) Renunciation has the characteristic of departing from sense pleasures and existence; its function is to verify their unsatisfactoriness; its manifestation is the withdrawal from them; a sense of spiritual urgency (saṃvega) is its proximate cause. — Dhammapāla, Cariyāpiṭaka Atthakathā, trans. Bhikkhu Bodhi: Treatise on the Paramis

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 1:03 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

When we see the Pali word *satta* (Skt. *sattva*) translated as "sentient being", we shouldn't overstress the word "sentient". It doesn't carry the full sense of the English adjective and its insertion is no more than a translator's device to make it clear that plants, fungi, bacteria, etc., are not included here. Other translations such as "living beings" or simply "beings" don't make this clear.

In short, what we are talking about here are all beings in the 31 planes that are participants in saṃsāric becoming. An unborn child, at every stage of its development, is an example of such a being.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 1:29 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

Three articles have been linked to — those of Rupert Gethin, and the venerables Pesala and Thanissaro. All three are supportive of your friend's understanding of the Dhamma, and if you read widely you will discover the views expressed by them to be faithful statements of the Theravada Buddhist position, indeed we might say of the pan-Buddhist position, for the Mahayana pandits don't dissent from this view.

It's true, as you remark in another post, that Ajahn Brahmavamso does dissent. According to him the developing foetus only becomes a sentient being some weeks after conception. But he is virtually alone in his dissent and his argument appears to be based upon an idiosyncratic, unorthodox and overly narrow understanding of the phrase "consciousness becomes manifest."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 2:04 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma
Content:

No, you've got it the wrong way round. The first precept encompasses both intentional killing by one's own hand and intentional killing by instigating or hiring another. Of the two, the kamma is more weighty when you hire somebody else to do the killing. For you have still committed the act of intentional killing, but with the aggravating factor that you've been the instigator of another's person's committing an unwholesome kamma too.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 5, 2015 6:28 PM
Title: Re: 200-year-old remains of Buddhist monk who is still in the LOTUS POSITION are discovered in Mongolia
Content:
Nonsense.

The scientists stunned him just as he was waking up. Meditating Mongolian monks stun easily.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 6, 2015 11:04 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?
Content:
But is this an instance of mere seeming or is there some principle of Dhamma upon which you make this judgment?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 10:14 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma
Content:

But why did you think that? I mean the pilots had no authority to drop atom bombs on their own initiative and would scarcely have done so had Truman not issued orders to this effect.

If you perform some akusala kamma alone, then you alone will experience the painful vipāka of that kamma. If you instigate another to assist you with it or to do it for you, then you cause another to perform an action that will lead to his experiencing a painful

vipāka too. Is it not therefore self-evident that involving another person in your performance of an akusala kamma, or delegating the performance of it to another person, is worse than doing it alone?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

I don't think that a dhammic framing of the issue would entail any talk of "rights" at all, for there is no notion of any such thing in the Suttas.

What is clear from the Suttas is that intentional killing is always an akusala action and that it is especially akusala when the living being killed is a human. And what is clear from the Vinaya is that the deliberate aborting of a human foetus is an instance of intentional killing of a human.

So, the proper framing of the issue, it seems to me, is not which person's rights should be prioritised, but rather, whether one should prioritise survival even though it will entail committing a weighty akusala kamma, or should prioritise virtue, even though it will entail putting one's life on the line.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

When orders to commit an akusala kamma are passed down a chain of command, every person in the chain who approvingly passes on the order incurs the akusala kamma, but it's the fellow at the top who commits the weightiest kamma and the one at the bottom —the one who actually does the deed— whose action is the least weighty.

Applying it to the case of a bhikkhu who urges a pregnant woman to go to an abortionist and who then does so and has her unborn child killed: all three persons, the bhikkhu, the woman and abortionist, commit the same akusala kamma of intentional killing, but the weightiest is that of the bhikkhu, the lightest that of the abortionist. The bhikkhu kills the unborn child and turns the woman and the abortionist into killers; the woman kills the unborn child and turns the abortionist into a killer; the abortionist just kills the unborn child — he doesn't make anyone else do anything akusala.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 11:21 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

In my use of the verb, I was limiting "instigate" to those cases where one deliberately seeks to cause such-and-such action to be performed by another.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 5:01 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

No, though it might be intended as a rough and incomplete paraphrase of the words of Puṇṇa in the Puṇṇovāda Sutta.

http://www.pitakataw.net/download/Tipitaka/BuddhistTexts/mn/mn_e_145.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 5:08 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

That is normally the case, for people don't ordinarily buy meat out of an intention to cause animals to be killed. An exception would be in those restaurants where diners select a living lobster or fish from an aquarium, which will then be killed and cooked for them, together with any scenarios analogous to this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 5:28 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

Bhante,

First let me note that when I used the word "approvingly" I meant to indicate that each recipient and passer-on of the order shares the volition of the original giver of it.

In the case of the donor and his servant, as they share the same volition—to offer alms to the sangha—they both perform a meritorious act of the same kind. But whereas the donor both gives and causes another to give, his servant only gives. The donor's merit is therefore augmented by the fact that he is the instigator of his servant's meritorious act. It is also augmented by the fact that the items offered are his property and not the servant's (though this may well be balanced out by the fact that it's the servant who does the preparations).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 5:34 PM
Title: Re: Fourfold Sangha
Content:
And you too.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 8:42 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?
Content:
No doubt it does seem like that to you. However, if I could only give you a pair of magical spectacles to put on that would permit you —perhaps for the first time in your life— to see the moral distinction between a willed instigation and an unwilled one, then I'm quite sure that after putting on those spectacles, you'd exclaim: "Eureka, there's not even the tiniest smidgen of a double standard here!"

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 9:01 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?
Content:
Yes.

In terms of the ten unwholesome http://dictionary.sutta.org/fr_FR/browse/k/kamma-patha, one has still fallen into the unwholesome mind-door kamma of byāpāda — willing harm to a living being, but not the unwholesome body-door kamma of paṇātipāta — killing a living being.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 7, 2015 11:19 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?
Content:
For example, there arises a wholesome mind-door process whose cittas are accompanied by the abstinence-from-bodily-misconduct mental factor (kāyaduccarita-virati cetasika) which results in a person's holding back from an act of killing, stealing or sexual misconduct on an occasion when he had an opportunity to commit one of these and was about to do so. This abstention is wholesome body-door kamma.

Or, in another wholesome mind-door process, the freedom-from-greed mental-factor (alobha-cetasika) causes him to give somebody a gift by his own hand.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 8, 2015 10:09 PM
Title: Re: Hi
Content:
Hello Leanne, and welcome.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 8, 2015 10:51 PM
Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...
Content:
Ivan,

If rebirth is the continuation of a process and not the passing on of a substance, then it is a mistake to ask what it is that transmigrates. One should be asking about the nature of the process. If you are interested in understanding this, then may I suggest that you read chapter 5 of the Abhidhammatthasangaha.

http://store.pariyatti.org/Comprehensive-Manual-of-Abhidhamma-A--PDF-eBook_p_4362.html

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 8, 2015 10:53 PM
Title: Re: Newby
Content:
Welcome to Dhammawheel!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 10, 2015 3:20 AM
Title: Re: Beginning readings
Content:

I would say the following ten are the "most essential to Theravada thought", in the sense of being the texts which have had the greatest influence and/or which historically have been most frequently quoted in Theravadin doctrinal discussion:

1. Bhikkhu-pāṭimokkha
(Thanissaro's translation at ATI)

2. Dīgha Nikāya
(Th. Rhys Davids' pioneering translation at <http://archive.org> is better than the more

recent one by Maurice Walshe)

3. Majjhima Nikāya
(Ñāṇamoli/Bodhi translation)

4. Dhammapada
(Many translations. I recommend those by K.R. Norman, Sangharakshita, and Buddharakkhita)

5. Suttanipāṭa
(K.R. Norman's translation)

6. Jātaka
(Birth Stories, ed. Cowell)

7. Milindapañha
(Th. Rhys Davids pioneering translation is better than the later one by Horner)

8. Visuddhimagga
(Ñāṇamoli's translation)

9. Dhammapada Atthakathā
(Burlingame's translation, "Buddhist Legends")

10. Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha
(Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation, "Comprehensive Manual of Abhidhamma", available as free download from http://store.pariyatti.org/Comprehensive-Manual-of-Abhidhamma-A--PDF-eBook_p_4362.html)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 10, 2015 12:43 PM

Title: Re: In the caves of withdrawal from the world

Content:

Really? I don't see any indication of the writer's being lost in a diṭṭhigahana; his musings read to me like a lucid and dry-eyed account of what eating and non-eating entail, granted Buddhist premises about the nature of things.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 10, 2015 7:30 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

I think Ven. Pesala has adequately replied to this.

I would only add that what you attribute to me is not in fact what I wrote and would probably serve better as a paraphrase of the Roman Catholic position rather than the Theravada Buddhist one. While there is considerable overlap in the two religions' perspectives on abortion, Buddhism lacks Catholicism's authoritarian element. When a Catholic priest finds himself in the position of counselling a woman who has been told that her life will be in jeopardy if she carries her child to term, the priest is required to instruct the woman to sacrifice her life for that of her child. A bhikkhu, on the other hand, will not normally instruct her to do anything. He will confine himself to informing her about the consequences of the choices available to her and then leave the matter to her conscience.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma

Content:

Well, you are mistaken. I did not use the word "narrow-minded" at all. I merely wrote of Ajahn Brahm's "overly narrow understanding of the phrase "consciousness becomes manifest".

It seems that as English is not your first language, the distinction between being narrow-minded and having an overly narrow understanding of something went over your head, and so you falsely charged me with calling Ajahn Brahmavamsa narrow-minded. This initial error is excusable, but not your present persistence in the charge in spite of my informing you that you are in error and directing you back to the original post.

In polite circles when a man tells you that you have misconstrued his meaning and taken offence where none was intended, the proper course for a gentleman is to take his word for it. As you decline to do so and have throughout the thread evinced little else but puerility and churlishness, let this post suffice as my final reply to you in this or any other thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Free from sexual arousal forever (natural)

Content:

I think the poster is probably using 'conscious' in the eighth of the twelve senses described in the Oxford English Dictionary.

8. Aware of what one is doing or intending to do; having a purpose and intention in one's actions. Said of agents and their actions, etc.

Examples:

1860 Westcott Introd. Study Gosp. vi. (ed. 5) 323 A..sequence..which few will attribute to an apt coincidence or to a conscious design.

1880 L. Stephen Pope ii. 25 Pope was from the first a conscious and deliberate artist.

1882 Farrar Early Chr. I. 130 That St. Peter has here been the conscious or unconscious borrower may be regarded as certain.

When used in this sense, yes, celibacy may be either conscious or unconscious.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 11:40 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

What do you mean by memories? If you mean occurrences of *saññā cetasika* performing its role of marking objects and recognizing objects that have been marked by past *saññās*, then no *saññā* survives even into the next moment, let alone the next life.

But if you are using 'memories' in the conventional sense, where what is denoted is something that was cognized, thought, spoken, done etc., in the past and which is conceived as being stored away in the brain or in some special mental faculty, such that it can be retrieved, more or less accurately, by acts of will or simply by one's mind wandering into the past, then I think the question is a solecism. Since this isn't how remembering—whether of the everyday sort or that of *pubbenivāsānussati*—is conceived in the Dhamma, it doesn't make any sense to ask whether the reified data conventionally termed 'memories' will survive into the next life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 5:09 PM

Title: Re: "Cravings as our companions"

Content:

*Taṇhādutiyo puriso, dīghamaddhāna saṃsaram,
Itthabhāvaññathābhāvaṃ, saṃsāraṃ nātivattati.*

“A man accompanied by craving, wandering on for a long time in existence in this form or existence in that form, does not pass beyond wandering on.”
(Suttanipāta, Dvayatānupassanā Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 5:44 PM

Title: Re: Past killing of animals

Content:

I think David's point is that in the Vinaya offences are graded according to the kind of penalty that they entail for those who break them. The offence of deliberately killing a

human warrants lifetime expulsion from the sangha, while that of killing an animal is a pācittiya-āpatti, "offence entailing expiation", which requires only that a bhikkhu confess it to another bhikkhu. The other actions mentioned by David are also offences in the pācittiya class, except "idle chatter", which I assume was included by mistake as this isn't actually a Vinaya offence at all.

So, the point is that killing an animal entails no more serious a penalty than transgression of any of the other 92 pācittiya rules. That's not of course the same as saying that the kammic gravity of breaking pācittiya rules will be the same no matter which one a bhikkhu breaks. This would not be true, for many of the 92 pācittiyas can be broken without any evil intent and therefore transgression would not necessarily be productive of any akusala kamma at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 8:17 PM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

The Kunala Jātaka is here:

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j5/j5029.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 9:27 PM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

I take it you haven't yet read the link? If you had, you would have seen the context for your quotation:

Amongst these men, who were ordained not so much for their own pleasure as out of respect to the Teacher, spiritual discontent sprang up. And their former wives to stir up their discontent sent such and such messages to them, and they grew yet more dissatisfied. The Blessed One on reflection discovered how discontented they were and thought, "These bhikkhus, though living with a Buddha like me, are discontented. I wonder what kind of preaching would be profitable to them"; and he bethought him of the religious discourse of Kuṇāla. Then this notion struck him, "I will conduct these bhikkhus to the Himalayas and after illustrating the disadvantages connected with womankind by the Kuṇāla story and removing their discontent, I will guide them to stream-entry."

(corrections mine)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 9:39 PM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

The Buddha and his disciples are depicted as occasionally giving teachings aimed at curing monks (and less often nuns) who are "living the holy life discontentedly", which is a euphemism for suffering from sexual frustration. Various approaches are taken. They include leading Nanda on a trip to heaven to ogle at celestial nymphs so that he would lose interest in earthly women; instruction in the repulsiveness (asubha) meditations; and —least often— tirades about the other sex's supposed character flaws. When reading such suttas I would suggest that it is their purpose that one should focus on: they are not set-in-stone truths, but rather teachings of a highly provisional and audience-specific character — strong medicines aimed at getting the listeners over a crisis.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 11, 2015 10:00 PM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

Not very much. It would seem the nuns on the whole weren't in need of such strong medicine. Indeed the only passages that come to mind aren't concerned with men in general but with the specific man that a nun had been having problems with, e.g. the verse of Muttā in the Therīgāthā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 1:29 AM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

I recall that in at least two of the women-critical suttas, the negative pronouncements are qualified by the adverb yebhuyyena, meaning "generally". That is to say, what is being asserted is that women in general have the specified negative qualities. Now in the commentaries to any sutta where the Buddha makes a negative generalisation about persons in class X accompanied by yebhuyyena, the gloss will be either "All members of X except ariyans" or "All members of X who are worldlings" (which means the same thing).

So, assuming such a gloss to be applicable in the present case, what is being asserted is that the specified negative qualities and behaviours are of a kind into which any non-ariyan woman is capable of falling. Such a statement wouldn't actually be false, though as a truth it would of course be only a partial one, for non-ariyan women are capable of all manner of good things too. But when the Buddha is instructing discontented male brahmacārīs, this partial truth is a useful one for him to direct their attention to, with the aim of opposing their current idealised fantasies about women.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 1:47 AM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

Here are Bhikkhu Bodhi's translations of the Kamboja Sutta and the two Kaṇhasappa Suttas. He has rendered yebhuyyena as "for the most part".

Kamboja Sutta

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Kosambī in Ghosita's Park. Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said:

"Bhante, why is it that women do not sit in council, or engage in business, or go to Kamboja?"*

"Ānanda, women are prone to anger; women are envious; women are miserly; women are unwise. This is why women do not sit in council, engage in business, or go to Kamboja."

* Mp: "They do not sit in council (n'eva sabhāyaṃ nisīdati) in the judgment hall for the purpose of passing judgment. They do not engage in business (na kammantaṃ payojeti), in major work such as agriculture, trade, and so forth. They do not go to Kamboja (na kambojaṃ gacchati): they do not go to the Kamboja country for the purpose of carrying goods. This is the mere heading. The sense is that they do not go to any remote country." (AN.ii.82-3)

Paṭhamakaṇhasappa Sutta (First Snake Sutta)

"Bhikkhus, there are these five dangers in a black snake. What five? It is impure, foul-smelling, frightening, dangerous, and it betrays friends. These are the five dangers in a black snake. So too, there are these five dangers in women. What five? They are impure, foul-smelling, frightening, dangerous, and they betray friends. These are the five dangers in women."

Dutiyakaṇhasappa Sutta (Second Snake Sutta)

"Bhikkhus, there are these five dangers in a black snake. What five? It is wrathful, hostile, of virulent venom, double-tongued, and it betrays friends. These are the five dangers in a black snake. So too, there are these five dangers in women. What five? They are wrathful, hostile, of virulent venom, double-tongued, and they betray friends."

"Bhikkhus, this is how women are of virulent venom: for the most part they have strong lust. This is how women are double-tongued: for the most part they utter divisive

speech. This is how women betray friends: for the most part they are adulterous. These are the five dangers in women.”
(AN.iii.260-1)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 9:52 AM

Title: Re: A Question

Content:

There are various approaches to this, ancient and modern. My own preference is for that of the Peṭakopadesa, wherein one explains a sutta correctly when one plausibly demonstrates its relevance to the four noble truths. Sometimes this requires a literal reading, sometimes a figurative one, and sometimes either might be plausible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 10:11 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

The mental factor of saññā performs the dual function of marking ārammaṇas (in the manner of a carpenter marking pieces of wood for later identification) and of recognizing marks made by earlier saññā. It is saññā’s marking that makes remembrance possible.

The question of how an earlier saññā’s marking persists through time, such that it may be recognised by a later saññā, despite the earlier saññā having ceased to be, is not addressed in the texts, as far as I know, and is not a dhammic concern (except insofar as it’s necessary to reject wrong ideas about it — those which entail eternalist or annihilationist views). If, however, one were to make it one’s own concern and attempt an explanation, then I suppose the lion’s share of the credit ought to go to pakatūpanissaya-paccaya — “natural-decisive-support condition”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Why do you think that? If there were an atman that reincarnated, how would that negate your earlier statement that we have a moral duty not to neglect the effect of our actions on those who survive us?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 11:01 AM
Title: Re: Hello, thanks for the acceptance.
Content:
Welcome.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 1:07 PM
Title: Re: We're going through changes...
Content:
Hi Mawkish,

Good to hear from you and my congratulations on your becoming a father. I offer them a little belatedly as I was away on a mountain when it happened.

Would you care to post a more recent photo of your daughter?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 12, 2015 10:33 PM
Title: Re: Parajika / Upasampada Question
Content:
It's true that we can't say for sure whether any man wearing the robes is really a monk, whether any given ordination is really valid, or even whether the ordination lineage has really been preserved intact anywhere on earth. But though we cannot know these things, we can at least take care to ensure that our own sangha transactions are carried out in good faith and to the best of our ability. For example, it is rare in practice for an ordination to be carried out with just the minimum quorum. Here in Thailand I have never attended one that had fewer than 12 monks in the assembly and most had from 20 to 40.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 16, 2015 5:47 PM
Title: Re: Parajika / Upasampada Question
Content:
The label "in communion by theft" applies only to men of deceitful intent and not to those who are living as bhikkhus in good faith whilst unaware that their ordinations are invalid. The practical difference between the two is that if the defectiveness of a sincere monk's ordination came to light he could always re-ordain, whereas being theyyasaṃvāsa has the same consequence as being pārājika: a lifetime ban on ordaining.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 16, 2015 5:56 PM

Title: Re: Parajika / Upasampada Question

Content:

In the stricter nikāyas he has to re-ordain and loses the seniority he formerly had. In the less strict ones there are work-arounds that don't involve any loss of seniority, but I'm not familiar with the details.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 16, 2015 7:02 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the phrase "Life is Suffering"

Content:

The statement is so common in the autobiographies, memoirs and travelogues of 19th century missionaries and colonial servants in Ceylon, Burma, French Indo-China, etc., that I suspect they were doing no more than repeating explanations given to them by the Buddhists themselves. In that case there would be no particular interest in ascertaining who repeated it first.

But as for the scholars who voiced such an understanding, one fairly early instance (though certainly not the earliest) would be the sanskritist Monier-Williams:

What, then, was the light that broke upon the Buddha? What was this enlightenment which has been so much written about and extolled? All that he claimed to have discovered was the origin of suffering and the remedy of suffering. All the light of knowledge to which he attained came to this:—that suffering arises from indulging desires, especially the desire for continuity of life; that suffering is inseparable from life; that all life is suffering; and that suffering is to be got rid of by the suppression of desires, and by the extinction of personal existence.

Here, then, is the first great contrast. When the Buddha said to his converts, 'Come (ehi), be my disciple,' he bade them expect to get rid of suffering, he told them to stamp out suffering by stamping out desires (see pp. 43, 44). When the Christ said to His disciples, 'Come, follow Me,' He bade them expect suffering. He told them to glory in their sufferings—nay, to expect the perfection of their characters through suffering.

It is certainly noteworthy that both Christianity and Buddhism agree in asserting that all creation groaneth and travaileth in pain, in suffering, in tribulation. But mark the vast, the vital distinction in the teaching of each. The one taught men to be patient under affliction, and to aim at the glorification of the suffering body, the other taught men to be intolerant of affliction, and to aim at the utter annihilation of the suffering body.

Sir Monier Monier-Williams, Buddhism, In its Connexion with Brahmanism and Hinduism, and in Its Contrast with Christianity

<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/47214/47214-8.txt>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 16, 2015 7:21 PM

Title: Re: What Was Buddhism's First Written Language?

Content:

Not hotly, but you will find this and ancillary issues coolly discussed in <https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=29&t=4630>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Should I re-take refuge or not?

Content:

Not in the Theravada. In Buddhaghosa's gloss, "I go to the Buddha/Dhamma/Sangha for refuge" means "I take these three things as my highest values." For this you don't need a realised teacher or the blessing of a lineage, and there's nothing mystical about it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Monks can't listen to music?

Content:

A bhikkhu doesn't formally undertake the ten precepts like a novice does, but all of the actions prohibited in those precepts are prohibited also in the Vinaya for bhikkhus.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 7:45 AM

Title: Re: What Was Buddhism's First Written Language?

Content:

This is discussed in the thread that I linked to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 9:28 AM

Title: Re: Parajika / Upasampada Question

Content:

Right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 11:55 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

My internet connection is too slow for me to use youtube. If it's not too much trouble, would you care to quote Ven. Sujato's words? Your paraphrase of them isn't very clear to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 1:37 PM

Title: Re: Why one meal a day?

Content:

The Vinaya rules prohibit monastics eating from midday until dawn. Between dawn and midday a bhikkhu may eat as many meals as he likes, though the commonest practice in Asia is to take breakfast at around 8 am and then a more substantial meal at 11 am. The next most common is to take three meals: a bowl of rice soup before one sets off on almsround, a heavier breakfast when one gets back, and then lunch at 11 am.

As for eating just one meal a day, this is one of the 13 ascetic practices and originally was a voluntary observance for those bhikkhus who needed to overcome a tendency to gluttony. Nowadays, however, there are certain monasteries —mainly those in forest-dwelling traditions— where the one-meal-a-day practice is incumbent upon all residents.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 2:26 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Thanks for the clarification.

It's uncontroversial that consciousness is involved with rebirth, just not in the way that Sāti thought it was. Bhante Sujato, as far as I know, doesn't subscribe to Sāti's view that one and same consciousness persists through time and undergoes rebirth. Quite the contrary in fact — in his blog he's at pains to repudiate the atman-like consciousness view that's so prevalent among monks in his tradition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 17, 2015 5:23 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Ideally by either having a spontaneous recall of one's former lives or attaining such recall by jhānic development. For those Buddhists who don't possess the former and can't do the latter, faith in rebirth comes about in quite a variety of ways...

Some just find themselves with it; for example it may arise spontaneously as part and parcel of a conversion experience.

Some embrace it via a fideistic leap of faith.

Some, having verified part of the Buddha's teaching, find themselves willing to trust all of it.

Some were raised with it and never exposed to any contrary view.

Some are persuaded by arguments advanced by Buddhist pandits and others by the alleged empirical evidence for it.

Some see no reason to think it true or false but choose to treat it as true and live accordingly, as per the Aṇṇaka Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2015 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Sappadāsa's awakening - no jhanas required?

Content:

Ven. Sappadāsa's statement, "The three knowledges have been attained," suffices to show that he had both attained and mastered the four jhānas. Even dry-insight traditions acknowledge that the first two vijjās are unattainable without such mastery.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2015 1:37 AM

Title: Re: section for discussion of sexual issues

Content:

Though I'm not myself in favour of the proposed new sub-forum, the reason it would be only for male sexual issues is that women seeking a solution to problems concerning the female genito-urinary tract appear to have more sense than to go looking for it on Buddhist forums.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2015 3:50 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

You will find his blog is here: <https://sujato.wordpress.com> but I don't recall the title of the relevant posts.

Edit: I see that Mike has already found a couple of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2015 6:19 PM

Title: Re: Seeking ordination 2: the revival of the aspiration

Content:

That story is actually from the Cūḷavaṃsa, composed many years later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 18, 2015 6:37 PM

Title: Re: Seeking ordination 2: the revival of the aspiration

Content:

No, there is no monastery on earth that meets your stipulations.

In saying that, I don't mean merely that there happens not to be one, but that as a point of principle there cannot be one because at least one of your demands is impossible (you're averse to hierarchy, but in any monastery with more than one bhikkhu a hierarchy is what you'll get), while others are mutually contradictory.

I suggest you draw up a shorter and less pernickety shopping list. Or better still, leave your shopping list in Bogotá and come out to tour the monasteries of Asia with an open mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 19, 2015 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Atthakatha& Tika AN 5.229-230

Content:

The Aṅguttara-atthakathā just gives very obvious and predictable definitions of the snake features.

The Aṅguttara-ṭīkā passage you cite is for the fifth sutta in the Dīghacārika Vagga. The ṭīkā-author has nothing to say about the two Kaṇhasappa Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 19, 2015 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Questions about becoming a monk

Content:

They would rule out your staying in certain monasteries, but by no means all of them, nor even most of them. Given your back pains, you will need to avoid places like Wat Dhammakaya, Ajahn Chah's monasteries, or anywhere else where there's a strong

emphasis on group conformity, such that attendance at group sitting meditation sessions is mandatory and with an insistence that all meditators look the same. What you need is somewhere where there is either no group meditation or where attendance is not required or where you'll be permitted to use a chair or whatever aids you might need.

Did you have any particular country in mind?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 19, 2015 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Seeking ordination 2: the revival of the aspiration

Content:

Well, not really, for the monasteries that I myself hold in high regard would be antithetical to your current set of enthusiasms. What I would suggest is that since it's probably going to take you some time to save up for your trip, you should seek out and initiate correspondence with monks who share your interest in a Suttas-only approach to the Dhamma. Most of these will be found in Sri Lanka, but wherever they're found, since most of them keep in touch with each other they'll be in a better position than I to fill you in on what opportunities are available for a would-be monk of like mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 1:55 AM

Title: Re: Seeking ordination 2: the revival of the aspiration

Content:

They conform to my prejudices about how monks should be occupying their time in the formative years of their training. That is to say, I think that anyone ordaining into the Theravada tradition should be aiming to master the tradition in its totality. This is not done by confining one's studies to just the four Nikāyas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 2:12 AM

Title: Re: Questions about becoming a monk

Content:

<http://www.wattamaoh.org/home/eng>

e-mail of abbot (Sayadaw Gandhasārābhivamsa): tamaoh24 (at) gmail (dot) com

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Hello!
Content:
Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 7:48 AM
Title: Re: Seeking ordination 2: the revival of the aspiration
Content:
No problem. I never suspected that you were being disrespectful.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 9:29 AM
Title: Re: Right Action and Right Livelihood
Content:
There's really no call for such wild guesswork. The texts are perfectly clear about what right livelihood means for samaṇas. You will find it outlined in the http://zugangzureinsicht.org/html/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc2/bmc2.ch10_en.html and the sīla section of the http://tipitaka.wikia.com/wiki/Brahmajala_Sutta. It's principally about depending on alms and not resorting to fraud, hinting or other roguish tactics to induce people to give you alms.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 20, 2015 11:05 AM
Title: Re: Not meditating facing the south, and some other stuff
Content:
I expect Lord Yama has weightier matters on his mind than the question of where people's feet are pointing when they sleep.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 22, 2015 3:16 PM
Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...
Content:
Here is a http://store.pariyatti.org/Comprehensive-Manual-of-Abhidhamma-A--PDF-eBook_p_4362.html to Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. I recommend you read chapter 1 for an understanding of how consciousnesses are classified in the Abhidhamma, chapters 3 and 4 for an introduction to the basics of abhidhammic momentarism in the cognitive process, chapter 8 for an account of conditional relations, and then, hopefully, you'll be ready for chapter 5: an application of the foregoing to the rebirth process.

Now you may not approve or agree with what you read in this text, but armed with your new-found knowledge you will at least know better than to pose questions premised upon Marxian claptrap or ill-conceived attempts to harmonize Buddhist khaṇikavāda with modern embryology and epiphenomenalist assumptions about consciousness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 22, 2015 3:57 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

I didn't ignore anything. I logged on only an hour ago, read through the posts, answered one of yours and then wrote replies to private messages that were of greater urgency than your questions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 23, 2015 7:31 PM

Title: Re: Questions about becoming a monk

Content:

What the person wrote has nothing to do with Theravada monasticism. He is describing how matters stand for westerners ordaining in the Tibetan tradition, where the practice of almsgiving to monastics is effectively defunct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 24, 2015 12:39 PM

Title: Re: The Very Idea of Buddhist History (DWM thread)

Content:

Is this what you meant to say, or did you leave out a "don't" ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 24, 2015 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Though Sāti is clearly told this, one has to keep in mind that extremely few Thai monks in the Ajahn Mun or Ajahn Chah forest traditions will have read the Mahātaṇhāsāṅkhaya Sutta, or indeed any sutta beyond the handful that all monks are expected to memorize.

As for the western monks in these traditions, I expect most of them have read the sutta, or at least will get around to doing so sooner or later. But this reading seldom does them any good for sutta-reading is typically something they do merely for inspiration rather

than seeking right-view guidance. In matters of view they are for the most part satisfied with the semi-eternalism and primitive animism that they've imbibed from their Thai ajahns. And so whatever these monks read in the suttas will be interpreted by them in a way that will square it with their ajahns' teachings. Upon encountering the Buddha's reproof of Sāti, a typical response is to insist that the the Buddha is talking about viññāṇa and this isn't the same as the supposed primordial citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 24, 2015 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Among the Thai ajahns I don't know of any who don't teach this.

As for the non-Thai (i.e. mostly western) ajahns, with these you can predict it with a fairly high degree of accuracy from the monk's biography. The non-eternalists for the most part comprise those who had some background in relatively orthodox strains of Theravada Buddhism before they got mixed up with the forest tradition. Examples would include Ajahns Khemadhammo, Tiradhammo and Sujāto, who all began as Mahasi practitioners; Ajahn Viradhammo, who began as a Ñāṇavīra enthusiast after Sāmaṇera Bodhesako introduced him to the man's teachings; and Ajahn Brahmavamso, who began with the Samatha Trust, a British group that combines samatha meditation with Abhidhamma study. All of these appear to have avoided the semi-eternalist error that's endemic to the Thai forest tradition. But those monks who had no previous background in Buddhism before they stumbled across the Thai forest tradition have for the most part not avoided it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 25, 2015 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Burmese monastery in Thailand concentrated on Vinaya

Content:

If it's Wat Tha Ma O, then it's in Lampang and not particularly near any border. The Vinaya study there—if it's the same as it used to be— entails memorization of the Pāṭimokkha and study of the commentary to it (Kaṅkhāvitaraṇī).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: Thanissaro/radical acceptance

Content:

Here's an interview with Tara Brach on this subject. I haven't yet listened to it myself as it's only at around 3:00 am that my internet connection is fast enough to view youtube.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 11:38 AM

Title: Re: Arguments/Discussions affecting my peace/meditation

Content:

<http://www.wisdompubs.org/book/middle-length-discourses-buddha/selections/middle-length-discourses-2-sabbasava-sutta>

If treating the man as an āsava to be abandoned by enduring is proving ineffective (as seems to be the case), then I suggest you treat him as an āsava to be abandoned by avoiding.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

If that's how it seems to you, then I submit that you are allowing your Women's Lib imagination to prevail over your reading comprehension skills. Although what you describe is very often the case when "Buddhism and Abortion" comes up for discussion, in the present thread it's the very opposite of what has happened. As "Buddhism and Abortion" threads go, the present one has been far more calm and measured than is usually the case. In large part this is because all but one of the contributors have confined themselves to the relatively unemotive question of whether, according to the Dhamma, the aborting of an unborn child amounts to the killing of a human being, and if so, at what stage in the pregnancy it becomes an act of this type. With the exception of the abortion advocate Blue Lotus, contributors have avoided making it a discussion about what a woman should or shouldn't do.

In short, it's a thread that's been largely concerned with positive description rather than normative prescription. And as for the contributors being largely or entirely male, as far as I know, people's capacity for studying the relevant texts, reflecting on them and arriving at a sound conclusion, is neither diminished by ownership of a penis nor augmented by ownership of a vagina. It's a genitalia-neutral issue.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana and Tathagatha the same?

Content:

I haven't time to listen to the talk, but if you mean that Goldstein replaces 'tathāgata' with 'self' in the context of the four questions, this would be in accordance with the commentarial treatment of the passage, wherein 'tathāgata' here is not treated as being limited to Buddhas, but rather is taken to be a conventional term for living beings of any sort. And so to ask if a tathāgata or a person (puggala) or a being (bhūta) or a creature (satta) or a self (attā) or a soul (jīva) exist after death is one and the same question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 9:00 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 26, 2015 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

You don't appear to understand what I'm saying. To put it as simply as I can:

- (1) Most of the posts in this thread are about what sort of action abortion is.
- (2) Hardly any of the posts are about what women should or shouldn't do.
- (3) Therefore your statement that this thread is "just [...] opinions about what women should or shouldn't do," is false.
- (4) As I was sure that you had no intention of deliberately lying, I charitably attributed your false statement to inattentive reading.

I hope this clarifies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2015 1:22 AM

Title: Ruth Denison, RIP

Content:

"Ruth Denison was one of the first female dharma teachers in the West, renowned for pioneering an unconventional, body-centered approach to Buddhist practice and for launching hundreds of students on the Buddhist path. Earlier this month, she suffered a massive stroke and, according to her wishes, received no life-prolonging intervention. Denison spent her last days, surrounded by students and friends, at home at Dhamma Dena, the rambling, desert retreat center she founded in the late 1970s near Joshua Tree, California. She died on the morning of February 26, at the age of 92."

<http://www.tricycle.com/blog/ruth-denison-western-dharma-pioneer-and-vipassana->

innovator-dies-92

<http://www.lionsroar.com/pioneering-buddhist-teacher-ruth-denison-dies-age-92/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2015 9:49 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

There's an American antinatalist poet, Jim Crawford (aka "metamorphhh") much influenced by Benatar.

<https://antinatalism.blogspot.com/search/label/Poetry/>

<https://www.youtube.com/user/metamorphhh/videos>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2015 6:02 PM

Title: Re: What exactly is meant by rapture

Content:

How are “delight in the attaining of the desired object” and “enjoyment of the taste of what is acquired” incompatible with “being born of detachment” and “being born of samādhi”?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 27, 2015 6:46 PM

Title: Re: What exactly is meant by rapture

Content:

But what if being free from things that disturb the mind was in fact the thing that you wanted? In that case, wouldn't being free of those things be accurately describable as both a freedom from things that disturb and a delight in attaining the desired object?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 12:17 AM

Title: Re: 'Thai' incense

Content:

Nowadays about 98% of it comprises cored sticks with a mild sandalwood scent. I would guess this has been the case for some time, though I haven't actually studied the

history of incense-making here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 7:18 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

Though it is often asserted (e.g. by Ajahnas Brahmavamso and Sujāto) that the stage of a pregnancy is relevant either to the fact of whether any given abortion amounts to *pāṇātipāta* or, in cases where it is *pāṇātipāta*, to the weightiness of the killing, I don't think there is any support for this claim in the texts. That is, there is no suggestion that killing an unborn child is less bad if one does it at the *kalala* stage rather than at the *abbuda* stage, or at the *abbuda* stage rather than at the *pesī* stage... etc. With the killing of animals weightiness is said (in the commentaries) to hinge on the creature's size, but with humans it hinges on the victim's ariyan attainment (if any), remoteness from indulgence in sensual pleasures, and standard of *sīla*. To abort, say, an unborn *sotāpanna*, would be equally weighty no matter whether one did it at the *kalala*, *abbuda*, *pesī*, *ghana* or *pasākha* stage of the pregnancy.

"The doctrine of rebirth, moreover, sees the new conceptus as not just a 'potential person' evolving for the first time from nothing, but as a continuing entity bearing the complete karmic encoding of a recently deceased individual. If we rewind the karmic tape a short way, perhaps just a few hours, to the point when death occurred in the previous life, we would typically find an adult man or woman fulfilling all the requirements of 'personhood'. The bodily form at rebirth has changed, but the bodily form of human beings changes constantly, and according to Buddhist teachings we have before us at conception the same individual only now at an immature state of physical development. Given the continuity of the human subject through thousands of lifetimes, it seems arbitrary to apply labels such as 'actual' or 'potential' to any given stage and to claim that the individual repeatedly gains and then loses the moral protection of the first precept.

"It is sometimes suggested that Buddhism regards late abortions as morally worse than earlier ones. This view is based on a remark of Buddhaghosa in his commentary on the *Vinaya* (MA.i.198) to the effect that the size of the victim is one of two important criteria (the other being sanctity) in assessing the gravity of breaches of the first precept. Since a fetus is considerably larger at the end of its term, it has been argued that late abortions are worse than earlier ones. This line of argument, however, fails to appreciate that Buddhaghosa's comments with respect to size were made purely with reference to animals. Thus, as we saw in Chapter 3, it is worse to kill a large animal, such as an elephant, than a mouse, because it involves a greater degree of effort and determination, and the will to cause harm on the part of the assailant is greater. Clearly, the criterion of size is not meant to be applied in the case of human beings, otherwise it would lead to the ludicrous conclusion that killing large people was worse than killing small people. The argument that early abortions are morally less serious because the fetus is smaller, therefore, is based upon a misunderstanding of Buddhaghosa's

criterion.”

(Damien Keown, Buddhist Ethics, pp. 90-1)

Indaka Sutta

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Rājagaha on Mount Inda's Peak, the haunt of the yakkha Indaka. Then the yakkha Indaka approached the Blessed One and addressed him in verse:

“As the Buddhas say that form is not the soul,
How then does one obtain this body?
From where do one's bones and liver come?
How is one begotten in the womb?”

[The Blessed One:]

“First there is the kalala;
From the kalala comes the abbuda;
From the abbuda the pesī is produced;
From the pesī the ghana arises;
From the ghana emerge the limbs,
The head-hair, body-hair, and nails.

And whatever food the mother eats—
The meals and drink that she consumes—
By this the being there is maintained,
The person inside the mother's womb.”
(tr. Bhikkhu Bodhi)

Translator's notes:

The Pāli terms refer to the different stages in the formation of the embryo. Spk: The kalala is the size of a drop of oil placed on the tip of a thread made from three strands of wool. After a week from the kalala comes the abbuda, which is the colour of meat-washing water. After another week, from the abbuda the pesī is produced, which is similar to molten tin [Spk-pt: in shape, but in colour it is pink]. After still another week, from the pesī the ghana arises, which has the shape of a chicken egg. In the fifth week, from the ghana emerge the limbs: five pimples appear, the rudiments of the arms, legs, and head. But the head-hairs, body-hairs, and nails are not produced until the forty-second week.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 7:32 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

A Buddhist who holds abortion to be pāṇātipāta may be in favour of making the practice illegal, but won't necessarily be so. In civic matters he may be a secularist who holds that religious people have no business imposing upon the general population moral values based upon undemonstrable faith claims. This happens to be my own view; though I'd rather women chose not to have abortions, I don't think the law should forbid their doing so. And so whenever Roman Catholics (who do think their Church's moral teachings should be enforced by the state) come to me with their petitions demanding a ban on abortion, I always refuse to sign.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 9:24 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

Commentarial tradition holds that a yogi is incombustible in nirodha-samāpatti. Perhaps he is immune to other kinds of harm too. But if not, then killing him would obviously be an anantariyaka kamma, for it's more than just heat that distinguishes him from a corpse:

“When a bhikkhu is dead, friend, has completed his term, his bodily formations have ceased and are quite still, his verbal formations have ceased and are quite still, his mental formations have ceased and are quite still, his life is exhausted, his heat has subsided, and his faculties are broken up. When a bhikkhu has entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling, his bodily formations have ceased and are quite still, his verbal formations have ceased and are quite still, his mental formations have ceased and are quite still, his life is unexhausted, his heat has not subsided, his faculties are quite whole.” (M.i.296).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 9:46 AM

Title: Re: What does Mara want?

Content:

Actually Māra doesn't especially want to do evil nor for his subjects to do evil. In this respect he's not like the Christian devil who can only tempt one to evil. Māra is perfectly content for people to do kusala kammās, provide that it is sub-jhānic and sub-ariyan kusala — kusala that will ripen as Kāmāvacara-bound pleasure. Not only is he content with this, he will even try to tempt people towards it, for example by telling a young would-be monk that it will be better for him to devote his younger years to indulgence in sense-pleasures and the accumulation of merit and postpone going forth until old age (when he will be much less likely to make progress in the brahmacariyā).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 28, 2015 10:52 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?
Content:
But what is it that persuades you of this?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2015 6:41 AM
Title: Re: What exactly is meant by rapture
Content:
See also the <http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.007.nypo.html>.

That gladness and rapture ensue upon the abandoning of the hindrances (or of "evil unwholesome states") is not specifically a Dīgha thing at all; it's a teaching to be found in all five Nikāyas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2015 6:52 AM
Title: Re: Why most published neuroscience findings are false
Content:
Interesting.

Do you happen to know if there are any "statistically high-powered" reports on the effects of meditation, or are they all in the 20% region?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 1, 2015 10:37 PM
Title: Re: Second
Content:
Interesting. Though I'm bemused as to what particular appeal the Bahá'í Faith might have for South Carolinians and why such a quantity of Hindus decided to settle in Delaware.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 2, 2015 9:44 AM
Title: Re: Second
Content:
From reading Dave's link it seems the map doesn't tell one much at all about the numbers of each religion, for it's based only upon the numbers attending religious

services. So the fact that the Bahá'í Faith, for example, comes second in South Carolina may (for all we know) indicate little more than that Bahá'í meetings are more fun in that part of the country.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 2, 2015 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Can you be mindful of your last breath?

Content:

Why not? Respiratory failure doesn't instantaneously result in brain death. Nor does cardiac failure. So even on materialist assumptions (where cessation of consciousness is identified with brain death) it would still be possible for a dying person to know the beginning, middle and end of her last breath.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2015 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Asking for guidance

Content:

They're Buddhadāsa-isms, though also cited a lot by Ajahn Chah's western disciples.

<http://www.buddhanet.net/budasa6.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2015 12:46 AM

Title: Re: Are these quotes reconcilable?

Content:

I don't understand what this means. Do you have a reference for it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2015 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Translation of Kusala Sutta - English to Devanagari Script

Content:

No cedam, bhikkhave, sakkā abhaviṣṣa kusalam bhāvetum, nāham evaṃ vadeyyam:
'kusalam, bhikkhave, bhāvēthā' ti.

No / cedam / bhikkhave / sakkā / abhaviṣṣa / kusalam / bhāvetum,
Not / if this / O monks / possible / would be / wholesome / to develop

nāham / evam / vadeyyam / kusalam / bhikkhave / bhāvēthā / ti.

not I / thus / would say / wholesome / O monks / develop! / [speech-indicating particle]

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2015 9:47 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth vs Reincarnation...

Content:

Beyond the two clarifications I've already provided (to Spiny and Mkoll) I would prefer not to take the thread's digression into heresiology any farther.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2015 10:09 PM

Title: Re: Hello, my name is Guy

Content:

Chào mừng bạn đến Pháp Luân.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2015 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Jivaka

Content:

There isn't any Vinaya rule requiring monks to make regular visits to a physician.

Here in Thailand when Thaksin Shinawatra was still the Prime Minister, a programme was instituted that would provide every monk in the country with a free annual health check. However, I only got to have one such check myself, whereupon Thaksin was overthrown in a coup. Then, when Abhisit Vejjajiva became PM one of the first things he did was to rescind both the 30-baht universal healthcare programme and the annual check-up programme for Buddhist monks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2015 8:25 AM

Title: Re: Applying for a volunteer job - advice needed

Content:

I haven't myself observed anything in your posts that ought to be avoided. If you conduct yourself in the real world as you do here, I don't doubt that things will go swimmingly.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 4, 2015 9:52 AM
Title: Re: Hi there!
Content:
Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 4, 2015 9:07 PM
Title: Re: Ordination first steps
Content:

There isn't any central authority for all Theravada bhikkhus. There are administrative structures for the national sanghas of different countries and then for the individual nikāyas within those countries. But this stuff needn't concern a would-be monk, for decisions about ordaining people are made at the grassroots level by the abbots of particular monasteries, so one doesn't need to approach anybody higher up.

It is possible to ordain in Asia or America.

As for the first step, I would suggest that you find out what monasteries there are in your locality and go along and introduce yourself.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 7:22 AM
Title: Re: Ordination first steps
Content:

No, that isn't possible. Ordination is given by the sangha, not by any single bhikkhu. And after ordination the new monk will be required to live with his preceptor or some other monk for some years; he can't live alone.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 10:35 AM
Title: Re: What defines a good teacher?
Content:

It means that from the Buddha's point of view it was a mistake for him to start a sāsanā. For the qualifications that would render a Buddhist competent to teach one must consult other sources.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Brahma, Sakka, deva-gods, prayer, and Buddhism

Content:

I think the more usual way that Sinhalese preachers put it (e.g. when delivering exhortations to observe the Uposatha-sīla) is that a householder who undertakes and keeps the eight precepts for a day is spending that day living like an arahant. This notion finds support in various suttas in the Aṅguttara Nikāya.

As for the deva part, this is derived from the Cūḷaniddesa and Vibhaṅga's description of the three kinds of devas: devas by arising (= catumahārājika devas, tāvatiṃsā devas, tusitā devas... etc.), devas by convention (= kings, queens, princes and princesses), and devas by purification (= Buddhas, paccekabuddhas, and arahant disciples). And so by keeping the eight precepts one spends the day being a deva of the third type: a visuddhi-deva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 12:07 PM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Some people arrive in Asia and are accepted for ordination within days. Others are required to spend a few months as a novice first. Some monasteries have fixed ordination programs for all would-be monks, while others treat each applicant individually.

But rather than worrying about the speed of the thing, it would help if you would care to relate a little more about yourself: how old are you? What has your involvement with Buddhism consisted in up to now? What do you envisage doing as a monk? etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 5:30 PM

Title: Re: Who gets Mindfulness 'Right'? An Engaged Buddhist Perspective

Content:

In the context of the five faculties and five powers, all five mental factors are always beautiful (sobhaṇa). Outside of that context, in their more everyday occurrences, mindfulness, faith and wisdom remain always beautiful. It is concentration and energy that are classed as ethically variable.

Applying this to the case of Brevik, it may well be that some kind of meditation enabled him to be very concentrated when he was killing (since one-pointedness of mind is ethically variable), but had mindfulness arisen in him for any significant duration he would have put down his gun.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 6:09 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Resorting to dynamic-equivalence or nearest-natural-equivalence translation, Christians have little difficulty translating the concept of divinity into languages belonging to non-theistic or polytheistic cultures. What they typically do is to draw upon the target language's existing numinous terms (if there be any) or else expand the semantic range of terms pertaining to the secular hierarchy. The former approach is taken in Sinhala, where use is made of a word rooted in the country's polytheistic Buddhist cosmology; the latter approach is taken in Thai, which draws upon secular conceptions of lordship and in Lao which builds upon the notion of the heavenly origin of royalty.

Thus:

- Sinhala: දිවියමය — "deva-ordained".
- Thai: ของพระเจ้า / เกี่ยวกับพระเจ้า — "of the Lord" / "connected with the Lord".
- Lao: ຈາກສະຫວັນ — "from heaven".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 6:47 PM

Title: Re: Who gets Mindfulness 'Right'? An Engaged Buddhist Perspective

Content:

Yes, but according to the Theravada what is called 'mindfulness' in the expression 'wrong mindfulness' is not actually mindfulness at all but rather a term for unprofitable recollecting of the kind described in the Anuttariya Sutta (AN.iii.328). This kind of recollecting is not carried out by sati cetasika:

"Here, someone recollects the gain of a son, a wife, or wealth; or else they recollect various kinds of gain; or else they recollect an ascetic or brahmin of wrong views, of wrong practice. There is this kind of recollection; this I do not deny. But this kind of recollection is low, common, worldly, ignoble, and unbeneficial; it does not lead to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, peace, direct knowledge, enlightenment, and nibbāna."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 6:49 PM

Title: Re: Who gets Mindfulness 'Right'? An Engaged Buddhist Perspective

Content:

No, in the Suttas micchā-sati is merely included in the list of eight (or ten) wrongnesses, but is never defined.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Yes, they use that too. For example in the Thai translation of the King James Bible we see “divine power” rendered as เดชอันศักดิ์สิทธิ์ [det an saksit] and (in the same verse) “godliness” is rendered ทางที่เป็นอย่างพระเจ้า [thaang thii pen yaang phra jao].

“According as his divine power hath given unto us all things that pertain unto life and godliness, through the knowledge of him that hath called us to glory and virtue.”

ด้วยเห็นแล้วว่าฤทธิ์เดชอันศักดิ์สิทธิ์ของพระองค์
ได้ให้สิ่งสารพัดแก่เราที่จะให้มีชีวิตและทางที่เป็นอย่างพระเจ้า
โดยรู้จักพระองค์ผู้ได้ทรงเรียกเราให้ถึงสง่าราศีและคุณธรรม
(II Peter 1:3)

But more often Thai Christians reserve “saksit” for translating ideas connected with sanctification, consecration and holiness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2015 11:00 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Sure, but they're pretty easy to explain, don't you think?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 6:36 AM

Title: Re: Student Of The Path

Content:

Anumodanā!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 9:14 AM

Title: Re: mangala sutta question

Content:

Alternatively:

“... a certain devatā of stunning beauty, illuminating the entire Jeta’s Grove, approached the Blessed One.”

(Bodhi, Connected Discourses & Numerical Discourses)

“... a certain deity of beautiful appearance who illuminated the whole of the Blind Men’s Grove approached the venerable Kumāra Kassapa.”

(Ñāṇamoli, Middle Length Discourses, Vammika Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 8:21 PM

Title: Re: mangala sutta question

Content:

Could you say more about the distinction between a nexus and a junction? I'm afraid I'm not familiar with it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 8:35 PM

Title: Re: mangala sutta question

Content:

Literally it would be "whose mind", but the more modern idiom is "He whose mind..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Thanks for these details. One more question: would I be right in thinking that the occasion when you visited a temple and were rebuffed is to date the only encounter that you've had with Buddhist monasticism?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2015 10:57 PM

Title: Re: mangala sutta question

Content:

I don't know of any conventions that can be applied where the sense alone will not suffice to make one reading necessary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Yes. There's no monastery in Thailand that's going to make anyone wait for years. Even at places like Wat Pa Nanachat, which insist on a much more thorough preparatory period before granting bhikkhu ordination, you'd at least be a *sāmaṇera* by the end of your first year there. Nonetheless it would be better to let go of the idea of getting it done quickly, if only because your eagerness is liable to be construed as impatience, which is certain to make an unfavourable impression on the Thais.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 9:14 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

There are broadly four kinds of monastery in Thailand: forest wats for ascetic contemplatives, Burmese-style meditation centres for scholarly contemplatives, city wats for scholars, and rural village wats for ritualists.

The great majority of western monks in Thailand live in forest wats or meditation centres; a minority live in city wats; few if any live in village wats.

To ordain in a forest wat you will typically be expected to go through the wat's standard ordination program. The details of this will vary from one place to another, but you can normally count on it being at least six months before you're accepted.

To ordain in a meditation centre you'll be expected to be committed to whatever method they practise there. This usually means you'll need to complete at least one or two retreats at the centre before they'll consider you for ordination.

Ordination in a city wat used to be very easy for westerners but nowadays it's unpredictable and usually depends on how good your connections are. If you have a Thai friend who will introduce you to the abbot and vouch for your good character, then you might be ordained within a week or two. If you don't have such a person then it will depend on what the abbot thinks of westerners in general or what sort of impression you in particular make upon him. The likeliest response you'll get will be a polite suggestion that you go and apply at Wat Pa Nanachat: "there are lots of westerners there, so you're sure to be happy."

As for village wats, these places hand out ordinations like candy, but the drawbacks in ordaining in one are too great to make it a worthwhile option for a westerner.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 11:35 AM

Title: Re: Are the number of beings in existence decreasing over time?

Content:

The spontaneity of a spontaneously-generated (opapātika) being does not consist in its arising without any external cause, but in its arising without the agency of pre-existing living matter. All beings that are not egg-born, womb-born or moisture-born are opapātika. Since every opapātika being is produced by some other being's decease, the fact that some beings are opapātika has no bearing on the question of the number of beings.

“Sāriputta, there are these four kinds of generation. What are the four? Egg-born generation, womb-born generation, moisture-born generation, and spontaneous generation.

“... What is spontaneous generation? There are gods and denizens of hell and certain human beings and some beings in the lower worlds; this is called spontaneous generation..”

(MN. Mahāsīhanāda Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 5:27 PM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

Ugghh. These are the most nazified pictures I've ever seen from this ghastly outfit. When one takes the nighttime photos and changes them to greyscale, only the presence of monks makes Wat Dhammakaya's rally at all distinguishable from Albert Speer's "Cathedral of Light" at Nürnberg.

cathedral.jpg (399.93 KiB) Viewed 4228 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 6:00 PM

Title: Re: Are the number of beings in existence decreasing over time?

Content:

Not to the sort of animals with which we ourselves are acquainted, but certainly to the animal-like creatures that we don't get to see, like kinnaras, kinnarīs, and Sakka's celestial elephant Erāvaṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2015 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Are the number of beings in existence decreasing over time?

Content:

In the sutta Uttiya wants to know what proportion of beings will be released from suffering. The OP wants to know if fewer beings will exist whenever a released being passes away. Though it's conceivable the Buddha might have given the same answer to both questions, they are nonetheless different questions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 1:44 AM

Title: Re: Are the number of beings in existence decreasing over time?

Content:

If the world of living beings (sattaloka) comprised an infinite number of beings, then the world they inhabit (okāsaloka) would need to be of unlimited extent to contain them all. But whether the world is bounded or boundless or both or neither are among the things undeclared by the Buddha. And so the supposed finitude and supposed infinitude of the number of living beings are both just-so stories: either might be true, but there's no particular reason to think one more likely than the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 7:57 AM

Title: Re: jhanas and nirodha?...

Content:

Bad translation. If it meant the mental faculty (manindriya) then it would be singular. As indriyāni paribhinnāni is plural, it is the five sense-faculties that are clear.

Bhikkhu Bodhi's endnote:

MA says that the faculties during the ordinary course of life, being impinged upon by sense objects, are afflicted and soiled like a mirror set up at a crossroads; but the faculties of one in cessation become exceptionally clear like a mirror placed in a case and deposited in a box.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 10:15 AM

Title: Re: jhanas and nirodha?...

Content:

Whoops! Thanks for the correction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 12:08 PM

Title: Re: Having trouble accepting Buddhism as truth... and rejecting it as truth.

Content:

It's an old argument. Essentially the video's narrator states at length what was stated in brief by George Bernard Shaw in the preface to one of his plays. The Shavian argument was that in order to be affected by the fires of hell one must have a body; the body must be either combustible or incombustible; if it's combustible then it will be burnt to a frazzle within seconds; if it's incombustible, then getting burnt might (for all we know) be as delectable as eating strawberries and cream.

In both arguments the obvious weakness is the assumption that the bodies with which we are acquainted in the human and animal realms are the only possible forms that bodies can take, and that the manner in which they can be hurt is the only manner in which a body can be hurt.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 7:21 PM

Title: Re: Kasina meditations taught by the Buddha or no?

Content:

The kasiṇas are listed in the Suttas, though the list is slightly different from that expounded in the Visuddhimagga:

Pathavī-kasiṇa – earth totality.

Āpo-kasiṇa – water totality.

Tejo-kasiṇa – fire totality.

Vāyo-kasiṇa – air totality.

Nīla-kasiṇa – blue totality.

Pīta-kasiṇa – yellow totality.

Lohita-kasiṇa – red totality.

Odāta-kasiṇa – white totality.

Ākāsa-kasiṇa – space totality.

Viññāṇa-kasiṇa – consciousness totality.

In the Visuddhimagga viññāṇa-kasiṇa is replaced with āloka-kasiṇa, the light totality.

As to scepticism about whether the kasiṇas were intended by the Buddha as devices for developing the jhānas, it's true that this is not explicitly stated in the Suttas but is from the Visuddhimagga. But then the Suttas say very little at all about the kasiṇas beyond

listing them. So, if people are sceptical about whether the Visuddhimagga gets things right, then it seems to me they have three choices:

1. Make their own wild guess as to what kasiṇas are all about.
2. Treat the kasiṇas as a mystery that they don't understand.
3. Embrace one of the non-Theravādin expositions of this doctrine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2015 8:55 PM

Title: Re: Parents kamma

Content:

To suggest that this is the case for everyone would be to over-generalize. If people feel drawn to the homeless brahmacariyā in their youth, are possessed of the requisite restraint to live such a life properly, and accomplished enough as yogis to be content living such a life, then opting for family life would be an inferior choice: they would be settling for a lower good when they're capable of a higher one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 12:39 AM

Title: Re: Fake Buddha Quote?

Content:

They are certainly there. MN 37 (Cūḷataṇhāsāṅkhaya Sutta):

Then Sakka, ruler of gods, went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side and asked: "Venerable sir, how in brief is a bhikkhu liberated in the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans?"

"Here, ruler of gods, a bhikkhu has heard that nothing is worth adhering to. When a bhikkhu has heard that nothing is worth adhering to, he directly knows everything; having directly known everything, he fully understands everything; having fully understood everything, whatever feeling he feels, whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant, he abides contemplating impermanence in those feelings, contemplating fading away, contemplating cessation, contemplating relinquishment. Contemplating thus, he does not cling to anything in the world. When he does not cling, he is not agitated. When he is not agitated, he personally attains Nibbāna. He understands: 'Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming to any state of being.' Briefly, it is in this way, ruler of gods, that a bhikkhu is liberated in the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans."

Then Sakka, ruler of gods, delighting and rejoicing in the Blessed One's words, paid

homage to the Blessed One, and keeping him on his right, he vanished at once.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 2:31 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

It is, or at least used to be, the case that at Wat Dhammakaya you needed a master's degree to become one of the permanent monks there, though not to be merely a participant in one of their mass temporary ordinations.

Other than that, acceptance for residence in a wat is simply based on the abbot's fiat. Over the years I've translated for many westerners who wanted to ordain at this or that wat in Thailand and were applying to the abbot for residence. I've never known an abbot to question a candidate about his meditation experience, his knowledge of the texts, or even to ask him what his beliefs were. Mostly they were just concerned about practical matters such as whether the candidate was in good health, would be able to get up early in the morning, do without food after midday, and digest sticky rice with nam prik (or whatever the staple food happened to be in that region).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 4:16 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

I'm not personally familiar with it, but it bears every appearance of being bona fide. No turbocharged supersonic ordinations though. It seems the policy of the incumbent, Ven. Sathī, is to first ordain and train men as sāmaṇeras and later send them to Sri Lanka for higher ordination and further training.

<http://www.triplegem.org/BecomeAMonk.php>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 4:20 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

I think your link is out of date: the ATI site seems to have removed the html version of Buddhist Monastic Code, leaving only a pdf file of it.

The link below is to an html version of the Nissaya chapter:

<http://elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinight/html/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch02.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 10:24 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

The only reason I can see for choosing a monastery or sub-tradition or nikāya of the kind that would lead to your future opportunities being greatly circumscribed, is if you happen to have great faith in a particular teacher who belongs to that monastery or sub-tradition or nikāya. Otherwise it's best to choose something that will leave you with a broad range of options.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 10:40 AM

Title: Re: Quit your job if you work with Buddhists

Content:

It is possible if they are members of Soka Gakkai.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 11:41 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Not really. For example, regarding Vinaya in most village wats you wouldn't learn enough to be able to behave in a manner that was acceptable even in a city wat, let alone a forest wat. All you'd learn would be the minimal standard of good behaviour that needed to be observed to avoid scandalizing the local villagers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a Religion

Content:

I count twelve definitions on the Wikipedia "Religion" page, with the entry-writers admitting that even these are not comprehensive. To which one is Ven. Aggacitta referring?

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Religion#Definitions>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 10, 2015 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a Religion

Content:

From the Dīgha Nikāya — eighteen Suttas that cock a snook at protestant Buddhist philistinism and at the notion that the Buddha didn't found a religion.

Ambaṭṭha Sutta

Kūṭadanta Sutta

Mahāli Sutta

Mahāsīhanāda Sutta

Kevaḍḍha Sutta

Tevijja Sutta

Mahāpadāna Sutta

Mahāparinibbāna Sutta

Mahāsudassana Sutta

Janavasabha Sutta

Mahāgovinda Sutta

Mahāsamaya Sutta

Sakkapañha Sutta

Cakkavatti-Sīhanāda Sutta

Aggañña Sutta

Sampasādaniya Sutta

Lakkhaṇa Sutta

Āṭānāṭiya Sutta

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 6:27 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a Religion

Content:

I don't see how Ven. Aggacitta's contentions can be usefully discussed until this has been clarified. The venerable alludes to the "Wikipedia definition" and you yourself demanded to know whether Mr Man had bothered to read it, yet there is no one single definition on that page. Rather, there are two typical dictionary definitions followed by definitions from ten persons:

Peter Mandaville and Paul James

Edward Burnett Tylor

Clifford Geertz

Antoine Vergote

Emile Durkheim

William James

Frederick Ferré

Paul Tillich

Friedrich Schleiermacher

Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel

As these thinkers have some very different notions as to what constitutes a 'religion', it would be helpful to know whose definition Ven. Aggacitta is basing his argument upon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 6:37 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a Religion

Content:

A rather bold claim.

Its corollary, presumably, would be that any Buddhist scholar venturing any other opinion on the dating of the Dīgha is not a serious scholar. Is that in fact your view, or were you perhaps expressing yourself a little hastily?

Would you, for example, consider Buddhaghosa, Dhammapāla and Ledi and Mahasi Sayadaws to be not "serious Buddhist scholars"?

Or, confining ourselves to academic scholarship, are modern scholars like Cousins and Gethin who regard the Dīgha as comprising multiple strata being silly and frivolous? Are those scholars who voice scepticism about the whole higher critical project merely into scholarship for fun and laughter?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Hello, hope to help each other with Buddhism questions

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 7:06 PM

Title: Re: Problems in Gaṇakamoggallāna Sutta (MN107)

Content:

At Wat Doi Suthep in Chiang Mai, only the fittest visitors are able to make it straight up to the top of the dragon staircase without pausing for breath. For all the others, learning to do this would be a gradual training. As to what the training might entail, I think David Snyder—a stair-climbing enthusiast—would be the best person to field this question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 7:32 PM

Title: Re: Where pigs were molested ... ???

Content:

Sister Upalavaṇṇā's translations seem to have been done in great haste and are extremely poor.

From the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names:

Sūkarakhatalena

A cave on the side of Gijjhakūṭa, where the Buddha stayed. There he preached the Dīghanakha (or Vedanāpariggaha) Sutta to Dīghanakha. Sāriputta was also present, and the sutta led to his attainment of arahantship (M.i.497, 501; DhA.i.79; UdA.189).

A conversation which the Buddha had there with Sāriputta is recorded in the Samyutta Nikāya (S.v.233f). The Commentary says (SA.iii.197) that, in the time of Kassapa Buddha, this cave was found as a hollow in the ground when the earth was yet growing, during the interval between the two Buddhas. One day a boar dug up the soil in the neighbourhood of the ground which concealed the cave. The sky god sent rain which washed away the soil, and the cave was disclosed.

A forest dweller saw it and looked after it, thinking it to be the dwelling of holy men. He removed the earth round it, fenced it in, cleaned it out, and, making it as beautiful as a golden bowl, furnished it with couch and stool and presented it to the Buddha. The cave was deep and could only be reached by climbing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Where pigs were molested ... ???

Content:

No. If the female boar is young and naïve, then she's a gilt, not a sow. Hey, I thought you were a farmer!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 11, 2015 10:42 PM

Title: Re: Where pigs were molested ... ???

Content:

It seems to have cognates in all the germanic languages. In fact I remember way back when I was a philology student I learned the Icelandic form gylt (an ablauted form of the Old Norse gǫltr) before I had ever encountered the English one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 12, 2015 4:14 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a Religion

Content:

Your link is to a different Mahālī Sutta: that of the Saṃyutta Nikāya.

Here is the one from the Dīgha Nikāya:

http://www.buddhasutra.com/files/mahali_sutta.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2015 9:39 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

It would likely be either that he's living alone and is unable to arrange a quorum of monks or (if he's a Thai) because he hasn't been issued with a preceptor's license. However, neither of these would be an impediment to his ordaining you as a sāmaṇera. If the monk in question is senior enough to give you nissaya, then he is senior enough to ordain you as a sāmaṇera. He wouldn't need to arrange a gathering of the sangha for this, for (unlike among the Tibetans) a Theravada sāmaṇera ordination doesn't need any witnesses. And if he's Thai he doesn't need a preceptor's license to ordain a sāmaṇera.

In your present state of doubt and confusion this might be an option worth considering if the monk will agree to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2015 10:12 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

11063206_1429142907383203_752934098_n.jpg (57.54 KiB) Viewed 3984 times

"Wat Dhammakaya, Please help the children of the Baan Nokkamin Foundation. We deposited our money with the Khlongchan Credit Union Cooperative but now we can't withdraw it."

Baan Nokkamin foundation is a Christian organization that offers assistance to orphan, street children, underprivileged children, the elderly and addicts by developing and changing their lives, and strengthening them emotionally so that they are ready to face the world in the future.

<http://baannokkamineng.weebly.com/about-me.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2015 6:19 PM

Title: The Škoda Fabia Attention Test

Content:

How is your sati?

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 4:27 AM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Really? I think the fellow might have been pulling your leg. If he had told you that you would make a good candidate for President of the USA because you have two opposable thumbs, it would scarcely have been any more of a non sequitur.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 12:54 PM

Title: Re: Ordination first steps

Content:

Good luck.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 1:12 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

I'm a floating voter, most often voting Tory but sometimes not if I think there's some pressing issue that the Tories aren't adequately addressing. The issue that I'm most exercised about at the moment is the need for Britain to recover her purloined national sovereignty, the independence of her lawmaking powers, and control of her borders from the EU. For this reason — and in spite of my mixed feelings about libertarianism — I'll be voting for UKIP.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 5:42 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

There is not much I can say as it's such a long time since I last looked at BNP's policies. Just a few random thoughts...

I wouldn't myself vote for a party that was committed to restoring the death penalty.

I recall that on the economy the BNP is advocating virtually the same measures as Old Labour back in the 1960's and 1970's — socialist nationalization policies that failed miserably even when they were being implemented by a government of relatively intelligent people. There's no reason to think they would work any better if it were the boorish yahoos of BNP who were implementing them.

I think the party is right about the need to deal with the menace of Islam, but their program for dealing with it is not a sufficiently realistic one.

They are also right about the need to take Britain out of Europe. But then as Craig has informed us, even the Bolshevik baboons of the Communist Party have raised their hairy paws in support of that. So as far Euroscepticism goes the voters are spoilt for choice.

Whenever BNP candidates have been elected to local councils or to the European Parliament, they've consistently shown themselves to be lazy, stupid and incompetent.

And that's about all I can think of to say.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 5:59 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Because Disciple asked my opinion. It wouldn't otherwise have even occurred to me to write about them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 6:35 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Indeed you haven't. But unfortunately I shall probably do so if I go ahead and answer your question.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 7:35 PM
Title: Re: hello <3
Content:
Hello Silas,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 7:55 PM
Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?
Content:
There is a kind of speech called niggayha or '[justified] rebuke of wrong-doing', which is reckoned to be right speech. Harsh speech (pharusā vācā) is the near-enemy of niggayha, i.e. an unskilful thing that may be easily confused with it.

However, from an audience's point of view, niggayha and pharusā vācā may seem exactly alike. The difference between them lies entirely in the volition that prompts them: to reform or to wound. That being so, neither the speaker's choice of words nor the manner in which he delivers them will allow us to infallibly infer whether his speech counts as niggayha or as pharusā vācā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 14, 2015 9:30 PM
Title: Re: hello <3
Content:
Would you care to clarify this? Do you mean that you prefer others to use the plural number when referring to you in the third person?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 12:49 AM
Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?
Content:
I don't think so. When a speech is generated by a wholesome volition it does of course increase the likelihood that it will benefit the listener. Nevertheless outcomes are never pivotal to making speech sammā or micchā. If they were, then the Buddha would have committed wrong speech when he called Devadatta a kheḷāsaka, for the outcome then was the latter's lasting resentment. The criteria of sammā and micchā, however, are intentionalist (and very radically so — perhaps as radically so as in Abelardian ethics),

not consequentialist.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?

Content:

There are useful instructions in the Suttas about the questions one should ask oneself in order to decide whether or not one is competent to admonish someone. But it's nearly midnight here, so I'm off to bed. I'll post the sutta tomorrow if someone doesn't beat me to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 6:07 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

The chart is already prepared but not yet the questionnaire.

<http://www.politicalcompass.org/uk2015>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:15 AM

Title: Re: The Škoda Fabia Attention Test

Content:

I've no idea whether there is any link between one's sex and one's capacity for being mindful.

As for concentration, among meditation teachers in the Thai forest tradition it seems to be widely held —indeed virtually a commonplace— that women are generally able to enter deep states of concentration with far greater ease than men. Credit for this is invariably given to the fact that women don't think very much.

Lest any women here take offence at this notion, I hasten to add that in Thai the expression "doesn't think much" is actually a compliment, or at least a description of what is deemed a desirable state of affairs. By contrast, "thinks a lot" carries implications of the person being afflicted with worry, neurosis or even insanity.

Marjorie A. Muecke has an interesting paper on this, though her findings indicate a more complicated state of affairs than the glib generalization of the forest ajahns:
How the health and well-being of families in northern Thailand might be gendered and

class linked was assessed. First, ethnographic data were gathered to contextualize and elaborate the local meanings of the indigenous concepts *kaan khit maak*, “thinking-a-lot,” and *kaan khit maak kern pai*, “thinking-too-much.” What informants were thinking a lot about was assessed. The health implications of the concept of “thinking-too-much” were then evaluated in 318 middle-aged women and their 24-year-old children (147 daughters and 154 sons) using the Symptoms of Stress Inventory (SOSI). Findings from the SOSI complemented those from fieldwork, demonstrating that both worrying and symptoms of stress were sex linked as well as associated with poverty and with life cycle stage.

<http://gen.lib.rus.ec/scimag/get.php?doi=10.1080%2F07399339409516143>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:42 AM

Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?

Content:

Kusinārā

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Kusinārā, in the forest thicket of oblations. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: “Bhikkhus!”

“Venerable sir!” those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

“Bhikkhus, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another person should examine himself with respect to five things and establish five things in himself before he reproves the other person. With respect to what five things should he examine himself?

(1) “Bhikkhus, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another should examine himself thus: ‘Is my bodily behavior pure? Do I possess bodily behavior that is pure, flawless, and irreproachable? Does this quality exist in me or not?’ If the bhikkhu’s bodily behavior is not pure, and he does not possess bodily behavior that is pure, flawless, and irreproachable, there will be those who say to him: ‘Please first train yourself bodily.’ There will be those who say this to him.

(2) “Again, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another should examine himself thus: ‘Is my verbal behavior pure? Do I possess verbal behavior that is pure, flawless, and irreproachable? Does this quality exist in me or not?’ If the bhikkhu’s verbal behavior is not pure, and he does not possess verbal behavior that is pure, flawless, and irreproachable, there will be those who say to him: ‘Please first train yourself verbally.’ There will be those who say this to him.

(3) “Again, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another should examine himself thus: ‘Have I established a mind of loving-kindness without resentment toward my fellow monks? Does this quality exist in me or not?’ If the bhikkhu has not established a mind of loving-kindness without resentment toward his fellow monks, there will be those who say to

him: 'Please first establish a mind of loving-kindness toward your fellow monks.' There will be those who say this to him.

(4) "Again, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another should examine himself thus: 'Am I learned, and do I retain and preserve what I have learned? Have I learned much of those teachings that are good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with the right meaning and phrasing, which proclaim the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life? Have I retained them in mind, recited them verbally, mentally investigated them, and penetrated them well by view? Does this quality exist in me or not?' If the bhikkhu is not learned ... and has not penetrated them well by view, there will be those who say to him: 'Please first learn the heritage.' There will be those who say this to him.

(5) "Again, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another should examine himself thus: 'Have both Pātimokkhas been well transmitted to me in detail, well analyzed, well mastered, well determined in terms of the rules and their detailed explication? Does there exist in me this quality or not?' If both Pātimokkhas have not been well transmitted to him in detail ... in terms of the rules and their detailed explication, and if, when asked: 'Where did the Blessed One state this?' he is unable to reply, there will be those who say to him: 'Please first learn the discipline.' There will be those who say this to him.

"It is with respect to these five things that he should examine himself.

"And what are the five things that he should establish in himself? [He should consider:] '(6) I will speak at a proper time, not at an improper time; (7) I will speak truthfully, not falsely; (8) I will speak gently, not harshly; (9) I will speak in a beneficial way, not in a harmful way; (10) I will speak with a mind of loving-kindness, not while harboring hatred.' These are the five things that he should establish in himself.

"Bhikkhus, a bhikkhu who wishes to reprove another person should examine himself with respect to these five things and establish these five things in himself before he reproves the other person."

(tr. Bhikkhu Bodhi, Numerical Discourses)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:46 AM

Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?

Content:

Yes, I think so, though with the qualifier that the speech of a Buddha (or any other arahant) is not kamma-generating.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 10:19 AM

Title: Re: The Škoda Fabia Attention Test

Content:

Do you mean in Dr. Muecke's paper? It would be a mental factor that would sometimes be present when the women she studied were not lost in kaan khit maak, "thinking-a-lot," or kaan khit maak kern pai, "thinking-too-much."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 11:01 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Yes, we have one of those too, of minarchist orientation, but it's even less significant than the U.S. Libertarian Party. In fact it's much less significant, for at least the American version has a rich literary output and a strong tradition of debate, while the British one seems a totally moribund outfit.

<http://libertarianpartyuk.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Can harsh speech be better than abstaining from harsh speech?

Content:

Yes, I see their only English translation is Sister Upalavaṇṇā's, which seems to be of unparalleled awfulness:

"The accusing bhikkhu should reflect thus: Am I with pure bodily behaviour, endowed with matchlessly unfishered bodily behaviour. Are these things evident in me or not? If the bhikkhu be without pure bodily behaviour, without matchlessly unfishered bodily behaviour, there may be someone who tells- Come on bhikkhu! You first train in bodily good conduct."

I'm reminded of a biting comment made by Oscar Wilde in his review of Sir Edwin Arnold's English translation of the Bhagavad Gita. It went something like: "Sir Edwin is to be applauded for his sterling effort in translating this great Indian classic from Sanskrit into his mother tongue. Let us pray that some enterprising soul will now undertake the more arduous task of translating it from Sir Edwin's mother tongue into English."

I think that was probably harsh speech.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Oral Tradition [Re: The Pali Canon is Not Original, So What Shall We Do?]

Content:

I believe it was actually at the Fifth Council of King Mindon that the MN's Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta was first recited with the four ariyasacca given in detail rather than in brief. It seems that by the time of the Sixth Council the Burmese had got into the habit of always reciting the sutta this way, and so it came as something of a surprise to them when the conciliar delegates from Thailand, Ceylon, etc. showed up bearing their short versions of the sutta. A dispute then arose as to whether it was the Burmese who had expanded the sutta or the other nations who had abridged it.

Anyhow, the conciliar decision to recite the sutta's account of the four ariyasacca in detail rather than in brief may perhaps be criticized as presumptuous, but terming it "drastic" seems to be overstating the matter a bit.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:29 PM

Title: Re: devamanussaṃ - royalty and common people?

Content:

In saṭṭhā devamanussānaṃ the devas are deities and the manussas are humans.

In the phrase imaṃ lokaṃ sadevakaṃ samāraṃ sabrahmaṃ sassamaṇabrāhmaṇiṃ paṇāsaṃ sadevamanussaṃ the devas in sadevakaṃ are the deities residing in the first five of the six sense-sphere heavens, while samāraṃ refers to the devas in the sixth heaven who have Māra as their overlord.

As for the compound word sadevamanussaṃ, this is synonymous with 'manyfolk' (bahujana). The devas in this term are royalty and the manussas are commoners.

Some translators like to take the meaning of 'deva' in sadevamanussaṃ as applicable also in saṭṭhā devamanussānaṃ. One can understand why someone of secular Buddhist bent (who disbelieves in devas) would prefer this rendering, but oddly enough I've occasionally encountered it even from orthodox Buddhists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2015 8:35 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

You haven't really shown this. I mean a page like the one above that documents the verbal gaffes and embarrassing antics of the party's nuttier members could be produced for ANY political party. Now if you really want to take the mickey out of UKIP, Stewart Lee shows the way to do it:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
```

s); }<https://phpbbex.com/> .

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 1:25 AM

Title: Re: devamanussam - royalty and common people?

Content:

Yes. Firstly, because the Buddha did in fact spend an enormous amount of time instructing devas: one of the three watches of every night was devoted to just this. He only very occasionally taught royalty. Secondly because these are qualities that the yogāvacara brings to mind when he is practising buddhānussati; in such a context taking devas as 'royalty' would be rather lacking in numinosity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 9:54 AM

Title: Re: The Škoda Fabia Attention Test

Content:

The author is a nursing specialist writing a paper within her field. Within that field it's no concern to the researcher whether occurrences of mindfulness in her subjects are the sammā-sati of the path or the ordinary sati that is present in every kusala citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 10:17 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Britain on the Brink

Introduced by Sir Patrick Moore

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 10:57 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

I think your best chance of getting elected would be if you headed to the opposite

hemisphere. In Iceland one of my lay supporters was a Sri Lankan lad who in his student days started a joke party called Funklist Íslands ("Icelandic Funk Party"). Due to a combination of the country's PR system and his personal popularity with fellow students he ended up winning a quarter of the seats in the Ísafjörður Rural Council elections, much to the fury of the more mainstream Farmers' Party and Independence Party.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 11:34 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

I'm personally little concerned over who gets to call the tune once we're out of Europe. All that matters is getting out, so that whoever calls the tune will be a person I can vote for (or against), and not a faceless unelected Brussels bureaucrat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 12:15 PM

Title: Re: Classification of Ariya disciples

Content:

I'm not sure if this is what you mean, but in the commentaries it's taught that in order to be capable of any ariyan attainment one needs to have been born into this life with a triple-rooted relinking consciousness, i.e., one whose mental factors include alobha, adosa and amoha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 2:49 PM

Title: Re: What's the point of living?

Content:

Empathy for those who would be made miserable by your absence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 9:43 PM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

I think that after the terminal arse-kicking given to historicism in general in Karl Popper's <http://libgen.in/get.php?md5=074d6a311eec4fabf1ead2ef23363c53> and that given to Marxian historicism in particular in volume II of <https://archive.org/details/opensocietyandit033064mbp>, that people continue to quote Marx with approval and to take his turgid pronouncements seriously should be

accepted as proof of the existence of miracles, and thus a disproof of Marx's view of religion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Classification of Ariya disciples

Content:

No, the description of beings in terms of the number of wholesome roots in their relinking consciousness is found only in the commentaries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2015 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Classification of Ariya disciples

Content:

The Pali terms are tihetuka (triple-rooted — alobha, adosa, amoha), dvihetuka (double-rooted — alobha and adosa only) and ahetuka (rootless — no wholesome roots at all). Of these three terms, dvihetuka would be the best one to search for as the other two have other meanings.

There are scattered references to this teaching in many commentaries, but the best translated source that I can think of would be the PTS translation of Sumaṅgalasāmi's *Abhidhammatthavibhāvinī: Summary of the Topics of Abhidhamma* by R.P. Wijeratne, and Rupert Gethin (2002).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 1:48 AM

Title: Re: devamanussaṃ - royalty and common people?

Content:

Hi Frank,

I thought that the description of the Buddha's daily duties was from the Dīgha Nikāya, but it turns out to be the Dīgha Atthakathā to the Brahmajāla Sutta (DA.i. 45ff.), though repeated also in the Saṃyutta and Aṅguttara Atthakathās.

Bhikkhu Bodhi's prose translation:

[./download/file.php?id=2520](#)

(179.85 KiB) Downloaded 43 times

F.L. Woodward's verse translation:

Ah! When the Lord of the World went forth to beg,
The gentle winds made smooth the ways before Him,
The clouds poured down their waters on the dust
And from the sun's hot rays protected Him.

The breezes wafted flowers to His path,
Raised were the ruts and hollows of the road,
Smoothed the rough places, and where'er the Lord
Trode, even was the ground and soft; thereon
Sprang lotus-flowers to receive His feet.

No sooner had He reached the city-gates
Than all the six-rayed brilliance of His form
Raced here and there o'er palaces and shrines
And decked them as with yellow sheen of gold
Or with a painter's colours. Then the beasts,
Birds, elephants and horses, one and all,
Gave forth melodious sounds, and all the folk
Crashed loud the drums; lutes twanged and instruments
Of divers sounds; tinkled the women's jewels
And by these tokens did the people know
'The Blessed One has entered now for alms.'

So donning their best robes and finery
And taking perfumes, flowers and offerings
They issued from their houses to the street,
And worshipping the Blessed One therewith
Some said 'Lord! Give us ten monks for to feed.'
And some, 'Give twenty,' some, 'Lord Give a hundred!'
And then they took His bowl, prepared a seat,
And eagerly their reverence displayed
By placing choicest food within the bowl.

Now when the meal was done, the Blessed Lord
With nice discrimination of their minds
And dispositions, taught each one the Doctrine.
Thus, some were 'stablished in the Refuges,
Some in the Precepts Five, some reached the Stream,
While others would attain the Second Path,
And some the Path of No-Return, and some
Became established in the Highest Fruit,
Were Arahants and left the world. Thus showing
Such kindness to the folk the Lord would rise
And, to His dwelling-place would wend His way.

And there when He arrived He sat Him down
On a fair Buddha-mat they spread for Him,
And waited till the monks their meal had eaten.
This done, the body-servant told the Lord,
And to the scented chamber He retired.
Such were the duties of the morning meal.

These duties done, in the scented chamber sitting,
On a seat made ready, He would wash His feet.
Then, standing on the jewelled stairs that led
Unto the scented chamber, He would teach
The gathering of monks and thus would say
‘O monks. Apply yourselves with diligence!’
For rarely comes a Buddha in the world,
And rarely beings come to birth as men
Rare the propitious moment and the chance
To leave the world and hear the Doctrine true!’

Thereat some one would ask the Blessed One
For meditation-lessons, which He gave
Fit for each man’s peculiar bent of mind.
Then all would do obeisance and depart
To places where they spent the night or day
Some to the forest, some to the foot of trees,
Some to the hills, some to the heavens where rule
The Four Great Kings, or Vasivatti’s heaven.

Then going to His room, the Blessed One
Would lay Him down and rest there for a while,
Mindful and conscious, on His right side lying,
Like a lion; till, His body now refreshed,
He rose and gazed forth over all the world.
Then came the folk of village or of town
Near which He might be staying, they who gave
The morning meal, garbed in their best, and brought
Their offerings of flowers and scents. The Lord,
His audience thus assembled, would approach
In such miraculous fashion as was fit;
And, sitting in the lecture-hall prepared
On the fair Buddha-mat they spread for Him,
He taught the Doctrine fit for time and season,
And seasonably bade the people go.
Then all would do obeisance and depart
Such were the duties of the afternoon.

These things all done, He left the Buddha-seat,
Entering the bath-house, if He wished to bathe

And cool His limbs with water there prepared
By His body-servant, who fetched the Buddha-seat
And spread it in the scented room. The Lord,
Donning His double tunic orange-hued
And binding on His girdle, threw His robe
Over the right shoulder and thither went and sat
And stayed retired, in meditation plunged.

Then came the monks from this side and from that
And waited on the Blessed One. Some asked
The solving of their doubts, and some would beg,
For meditation-lessons, others a sermon.
Thus answering, teaching, preaching, would the Lord
Spend the first night-watch, granting their desires.
Such were the duties of the first night-watch.

When the duties of the first night-watch were done,
The monks would do obeisance and depart.
Then came the Gods of the ten thousand worlds,
Seizing the chance of questioning the Lord,
Were it but single words of letters four.
He, answering those questions, passed the night.
Such were the duties of the middle watch.

Into three parts the last watch He divided
And forasmuch as, since the morning sitting,
His body would be tired, He spent one part
In pacing up and down to ease His limbs.

Then going to the scented room the Lord
Would lay Him down and rest there for a while,
Mindful and conscious, on His right side lying,
Like a lion. But in the third He rose and sat,
Gazing with Buddha-eye o'er all the world,
To see if any man, by giving alms,
Keeping the Precepts, or by deeds of worth,
Under some former Buddha took the vow
Himself to be a Saviour of the world.
Such were His habits of the last night-watch.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 2:28 AM
Title: Re: newbie to Dhamma Wheel
Content:
Hello Bodhana,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 2:44 AM

Title: Re: The best society

Content:

As any Dīgha Nikāya fan knows, the ideal society is one ruled by a Wheel-turning Monarch possessed of the thirty-two marks of a great man.

In the absence of a Wheel-turning Monarch there is no ideal society and so the question might be better phrased: "What sort of human society would be the least abominable?"

In answer to that, my own suggestion would be a society that combined the best features of Periclean Athens, Lycurgan Sparta, Edwardian England and the antebellum South of the USA.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 3:21 AM

Title: Re: Sutras that don't contradict Theravada teachings/Pali suttas?

Content:

If you cut out the Mahayana hyperbole and tinsel and change "four Māras" to "five Māras" it would probably pass as a Theravada sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 9:45 AM

Title: Re: The best society

Content:

Now to answer your question, these are the features I have in mind, in no particular order...

- A healthy and fruitful obsession with regionalism ("States' rights" and all that) and strong resistance to the imposition of bureaucratic centralism; and the fact that this attitude appears to have permeated every level of society.
- The parish church serving as the cardinal social locus of each community (as opposed to say, the tavern, sports club, political association, shopping mall or whatever).
- Widespread political literacy among the southern intelligentsia, together with an enthusiasm for classical learning and especially for the philosophy of the Stoics.
- Southern hospitality, gentility and etiquette
- Social conservatism (though admittedly this is somewhat of a mixed blessing in a culture where Calvinist notions of virtue prevail).

- Agrarian economy.

There are probably other things that I've omitted, but the above are just what come immediately to mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 10:09 AM

Title: Re: The best society

Content:

"Well he would, wouldn't he?" to quote Mandy Rice-Davies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 10:21 AM

Title: Re: The Pali Canon is Not Original, So What Shall We Do?

Content:

But the question was about Agamas. Your link is not to the Brahmajala Sutra of the Dirgha Agama but to the Mahayana sutra of this name. The former is very similar to the Pali, while the latter is entirely different and unrelated.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

The sa-upādisesa/anupādisesa distinction occurs twice in the Vinaya Piṭaka, 7 times in the Dīgha Nikāya, 8 times in the Majjhima Nikāya, 35 times in the Aṅguttara Nikāya, 11 times in what modern scholars hold to be the older texts of the Khuddaka Nikāya, and 45 times in the rest of the Khuddaka Nikāya.

A doctrine that insists on popping her head up so often is hardly a shrinking violet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 11:53 AM

Title: Re: The best society

Content:

Rural Thailand would score pretty high, except with regard to political literacy etc. Urban Thailand would score only one: hospitality.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 5:22 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Mental pain (domanassa), sorrow (soka), lamentation (parideva), etc. are the second dart.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 5:52 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Hurrah for strange women lying in ponds distributing swords!

And near him stood the Lady of the Lake,
Who knows a subtler magic than his own—
Clothed in white samite, mystic, wonderful.
She gave the King his huge cross-hilted sword,
Whereby to drive the heathen out: a mist
Of incense curled about her, and her face
Well-nigh was hidden in the minster gloom;
But there was heard among the holy hymns
A voice as of the waters, for she dwells
Down in a deep; calm, whatsoever storms
May shake the world, and when the surface rolls,
Hath power to walk the waters like our Lord.

There likewise I beheld Excalibur
Before him at his crowning borne, the sword
That rose from out the bosom of the lake,
And Arthur rowed across and took it—rich
With jewels, elfin Urim, on the hilt,
Bewildering heart and eye—the blade so bright
That men are blinded by it—on one side,
Graven in the oldest tongue of all this world,
“Take me,” but turn the blade and ye shall see,
And written in the speech ye speak yourself,
“Cast me away!” And sad was Arthur’s face
Taking it, but old Merlin counselled him,
“Take thou and strike! the time to cast away
Is yet far-off.” So this great brand the king

Took, and by this will beat his foemen down.
(Tennyson, Idylls of the King)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 6:03 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

I wouldn't apply the term "first dart" to anything that the Buddha didn't apply it to. What he applied it to is that mode of dukkha that can't be evaded so long as one is alive: bodily painful feelings. If a person is getting infatuated and upset (as in the passage above) then it's already the second dart.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 8:03 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

But when the Blessed One had entered upon the rainy season, there arose in him a severe illness, and sharp and deadly pains came upon him. And the Blessed One endured them mindfully, clearly comprehending and unperturbed.

DN. 16

Then the Blessed One, having spent most of the night instructing, urging, rousing, and encouraging the Kapilavatthu Sakyans with a Dhamma talk, said to Ven. Ananda: "Ananda, speak to the Kapilavatthu Sakyans about the person who follows the practice for one in training. My back is aching. I will rest it."
MN. 53

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 8:06 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Yes, they just reflect different translators' preferences.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 9:49 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

One of the commentarial glosses on "unperturbed" is in fact adukkhiyamāna, "free from dukkha". And yet the Buddha has said that he is experiencing dukkha-vedanā. So how are the two statements to be harmonized? The obvious way is with reference to the two darts teaching. He undergoes dukkha in the sense of dukkha-vedanā (bodily painful feeling), but this does not give rise to dukkha in the sense of domanassa-vedanā (mental painful feeling).

But to say that bodily painful feeling is not experienced by the Buddha as dukkha in any sense at all would be going too far and contradicting his own words.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2015 11:47 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

No, not just to that. In almost every sutta where the phrase "just this is the end of suffering" occurs, the commentators gloss it as referring to the ending of kilesa-dukkha and vaṭṭa-dukkha. The former means the suffering that's produced by one's defilements and chiefly denotes domanassa-vedanā. The latter means the "suffering of the round" and refers to the suffering that one would have undergone in future lives if one had remained fettered to the round of saṃsāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 7:08 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Sure.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 7:30 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It would not seem misplaced if we took the twelvefold summary of dukkha as intended to cover not just kilesa-dukkha but also vaṭṭa-dukkha, the "suffering of the round". And it is reasonable to take it so, for vaṭṭa-dukkha is the more comprehensive of the two lists: all kilesa-dukkha is vaṭṭa-dukkha, but not all vaṭṭa-dukkha is kilesa-dukkha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 7:50 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

Firstly if Philip Blackwood and his colleagues had done something like this to something that is iconic to Muslims, then they would be more likely dead than in prison.

Secondly, by killing Philip Blackwood and his colleagues the Muslims would have done exactly as their religion requires, which cannot be said of the actions of the Burmese authorities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Problems in Gaṇakamoggallāna Sutta (MN107)

Content:

I don't think it's a question of hard or easy, but rather of introducing each new training at the point where it will be of optimal benefit.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 8:21 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

Do you know where he advises this?

I'm aware that in the Vinaya the Buddha established a rule requiring bhikkhus to conform to the wishes of secular rulers, though Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Atthakathā adds the qualifier "...provided their wishes are dhammika" (righteous? lawful? constitutional? — the term in this context is never defined). And on our sister site I've seen Namdrol claim that this is an obligation for all Buddhists, though I haven't seen him cite a text in support of this and I don't myself know of one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 9:10 AM

Title: Re: Samadhi origin

Content:

This is the opinion of the American monk Ven. Vimalaramsi. The source he cites in support of it is Th. Rhys Davids' introduction to his translation of the DN's Subha Sutta. However the source (see the attached file) merely states that up to the time Rhys Davids was writing (1899) the word samādhī hadn't been found in any pre-Buddhist

texts. I don't know whether this is still true a century later, but even supposing it is, it still doesn't offer any positive support to the venerable's opinion. To say that a Buddhist term is not instantiated in any pre-Buddhist text is not the same as saying that the Buddha coined it. The term samādhī, for all we know, might have been used in yogic traditions like those of Alara Kalama and Uddaka Ramaputta but without ever making it into a written text. In short, though it's not impossible Vimalaramsi is right, he hasn't given us any compelling reason to think so.

./download/file.php?id=2521
(75.51 KiB) Downloaded 31 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 9:44 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

It is certainly very different from the kind of conservatism that I believe in, which is the old-fashioned High Tory strain. There are, however, several permitted ideological variants in modern British conservatism and that of UKIP isn't much different from Thatcherism.

Margaret Thatcher is a personal hero of the UKIP leader

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fV-TbeGoQcs> and UKIP's platform is basically a purer form of her brand of conservatism. Essentially it comprises the sort of policies that Thatcher's government would have implemented if

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Keith_Joseph (the architect of Thatcherism) had been given a completely free rein, rather than having his hands tied by the need to compromise with the so-called "Tory wets" (Thatcher's derogatory term for https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/High_Tory, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/One-nation_conservatism, and suchlike).

All of which is simply to say that UKIPism, for all its faults, is very far removed from the kind of extreme right parties that are now sprouting up all over continental Europe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 9:56 AM

Title: Re: Samadhi origin

Content:

The term "suspension of disbelief" was coined by Samuel Taylor Coleridge.

That means that before the publication of his *Biographia Literaria* in 1817 nobody ever believed in anything.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 6:18 PM
Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth
Content:
Indeed.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 18, 2015 7:21 PM
Title: Re: Problems in Gaṇakamoggallāna Sutta (MN107)
Content:
Absolutely. As I remarked in my last post: it's a question of introducing each new training at the point where it will be of optimal benefit. Now you can practise sīla and indriyesu guttadvāra even though you're stuffing yourself silly, but you can't practise jāgariyaṃ anuyoga — devotion to wakefulness — without first establishing yourself in moderate eating because over-eating will make you sleepy and lethargic — states that are directly opposed to staying awake.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 1:00 AM
Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion
Content:
In the Vinaya's Mahāvagga (Vin. i. 138) and its Atthakathā (Vin-a. v. 1068).

I'll post a translation tomorrow if no one else does so before.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 6:45 AM
Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion
Content:
Mahāvagga:
Tena kho pana samayena rājā māgadho seniyo bimbisāro vassaṃ ukkaḍḍhitukāmo bhikkhūnaṃ santike dūtaṃ pāhesi: yadi panāyyā āgame jūṇhe vassaṃ upagaccheyyunti. Bhagavato etamatthaṃ ārocesuṃ. Anujānāmi, bhikkhave, rājūnaṃ anuvattitunti.

Now at that time King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha, desiring to postpone the rains, sent a messenger to the monks saying: "What if the masters could enter upon the rains at the next full-moon day?" They told this matter to the Lord. He said: "I allow you, monks, to obey kings."

(I.B. Horner, Book of the Discipline)

Vinaya-atthakathā:

Anujānāmi bhikkhave rājūnaṃ anuvattitun ti ettha vassukkaḍḍhane bhikkhūnaṃ kāci parihaṇi nāma natthīti anuvattitun anuññātaṃ, tasmā aññasmimpi dhammike kamme anuvattitabbaṃ, adhammike pana na kassaci anuvattitabbaṃ.

I allow you, monks, to obey kings – here, since it is permitted for a bhikkhu to obey [the king] because delayed entry into the rains retreat causes no decline for bhikkhus, therefore in regard to any other kind of dhammika kamma a bhikkhu should obey, but never in regard to an adhammika one.

(Dhammānando)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

Click here <https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd3> and scroll down to "Allowance for seven days business".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:13 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

Alex Salmond is the former leader of the Scottish National Party. Together with salmont, salmonde, and sawmont it is also an archaic Scottish spellings of “salmon”.

“Now safe the stately sawmont sail,
And trouts bedropp’d wi’ crimson hail,
And eels, weel-kend for souple tail,
And geds for greed,
Since, dark in Death’s fish-creel, we wail,
‘Tam Samson’s dead!’ ”

Translation:

“Now safe the stately salmon sail,
And trout bedropped with crimson hail,
And eels, well known for supple tail,
And pikes for greed,
Since, dark in Death’s fish-creel, we wail,
‘Tam Samson is dead!’ ”

<http://www.cobbler.plus.com/wbc/poems/translations/448.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:17 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

Not that I know of. One's apartness as a person gone forth lies in one's remoteness from a householderish indulgence in sense-pleasures.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:35 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

You are just quibbling. If it was reported by Ananda then the Buddha must have told him what he was experiencing. But if you wish to insist that only a first-person report of pain by an arahant could have evidentiary value, then see the three Gilāna Suttas in the SN's Bojjhaṅga Saṃyutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:39 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

By pointing out that it's an improper question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:43 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Ven. Mahākassapa in pain:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn46.14>

Ven. Mahāmoggallāna in pain:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn46.15>

The Blessed One in pain:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn46.16>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 7:57 AM

Title: Re: Myanmar: the state mocks its own religion

Content:

I have little doubt that the commentary is right to take the rule as having a more general application, else the Buddha would have likely decreed something like: "I allow you to delay entrance into the rains retreat when the local king desires it." But circumstances when bhikkhus may enter the rains retreat later than normal are already covered extensively in another section of the Khandhakas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 9:29 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It is necessary to read the whole sentence. Ven. Mahākassapa says:

“Venerable sir, I am not bearing up, I am not getting better. Strong painful feelings are increasing in me, not subsiding, and their increase, not their subsiding, is to be discerned.”

This is simply how things are expressed in Pali. There is no verb "to have" in this language, so if I want to say "I have a dog" in Pali, it would be "sunakho me atthi" — "a dog is for me." Similarly, if I want to say that I have painful feelings, I would have to use a phrase that translates as "painful feelings are/arise in me."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 9:43 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Are you familiar with dhamma theory and the two truths? If not, then this short work by Karunadasa may help you to surmount your confusion.

http://www.abhidhamma.org/dhamma_theory_philosophical_corn.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 12:28 PM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

Not really. Popper's critique is multi-pronged, but the main thrust of it is that Marxianism is a species of historicism and that historicism in all its guises is an untenable approach to social explanation.

Contrary to a widespread popular misunderstanding, Popper does not dismiss all of Marx's output as pseudoscience (as he does with Hegel); in fact he readily acknowledges that a substantial part of the Marxian system is of a thoroughly scientific

character. Just to take the most obvious example, Marx's predictions about the future course of European history are unimpeachably scientific, and can be accepted as such no matter which of the competing verification theories we happen to prefer. His predictions do of course suffer the unfortunate drawback that they have all been falsified by 20th century history, that is, nothing happened in the way that Marx said it would [*], but that doesn't detract in the least from their being scientific in their inception.

But I think it might be a good idea for you to read *Poverty of Historicism* for yourself, or at least skim through it, so that you'll understand why Popper deemed historicism untenable, and then at least skim through *Open Society* to see an application of the argument to Marxianism.

[*] One exception to this, where Marx's crystal ball did not always fail him, was when he was giving his capitalist sugar-daddy Engels tips on which stocks and shares to buy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 5:53 PM

Title: Re: The Quotable Thanissaro

Content:

Had to re-read Eliot's poem to find what part he was referring to. I guess it's probably this, from the second part of the last quartet: *Dry Salvages*.

It seems, as one becomes older,
That the past has another pattern, and ceases to be a mere sequence—
Or even development: the latter a partial fallacy
Encouraged by superficial notions of evolution,
Which becomes, in the popular mind, a means of disowning the past.
The moments of happiness—not the sense of well-being,
Fruition, fulfilment, security or affection,
Or even a very good dinner, but the sudden illumination—
We had the experience but missed the meaning,
And approach to the meaning restores the experience
In a different form, beyond any meaning
We can assign to happiness. I have said before
That the past experience revived in the meaning
Is not the experience of one life only
But of many generations—not forgetting
Something that is probably quite ineffable:
The backward look behind the assurance
Of recorded history, the backward half-look
Over the shoulder, towards the primitive terror.

Now, we come to discover that the moments of agony
(Whether, or not, due to misunderstanding,
Having hoped for the wrong things or dreaded the wrong things,
Is not in question) are likewise permanent
With such permanence as time has. We appreciate this better
In the agony of others, nearly experienced,
Involving ourselves, than in our own.
For our own past is covered by the currents of action,
But the torment of others remains an experience
Unqualified, unworn by subsequent attrition.
People change, and smile: but the agony abides.
Time the destroyer is time the preserver,
Like the river with its cargo of dead negroes, cows and chicken coops,
The bitter apple, and the bite in the apple.
And the ragged rock in the restless waters,
Waves wash over it, fogs conceal it;
On a halcyon day it is merely a monument,
In navigable weather it is always a seamount
To lay a course by: but in the sombre season
Or the sudden fury, is what it always was.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 6:19 PM

Title: Re: inscription suggestions

Content:

From the DN's Saṅgīti and Dasuttara Suttas:

Ajjava & Lajjava.

Avihimsā & Soceyya.

Hirī & Ottappa

Khanti & Soracca.

Paggaha & Avikkhepa.

Sākhalya & Paṭisanthāra.

Sati & Sampajañña

Vijjā & Vimutti.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 19, 2015 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Fake facts in biography Buddha?

Content:

In the Suttas it is a past Buddha Vipassī, who sees the devadūtas, and there is no description of Gotama doing so. In the commentaries we meet with the idea that there are thirty regularities (dhammatā) that occur in the final life of every person who is

destined to be a Sammāsambuddha. The sixth of these is seeing the four signs and being moved by these to go forth into the homeless life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 12:01 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

As I have already shown you, persons who are free of self-view —arahants and Buddhas— express themselves using the same terms and phrases as those who are not. Therefore the presence or absence of self-view in people is not reliably inferable from the fact that they use pronouns like "I" and "me".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 12:41 AM

Title: Re: devamanussaṃ - royalty and common people?

Content:

Maṅgala in its non-Buddhist use primarily meant a "good omen" and was translated accordingly by Ñāṇamoli. I don't know of any English word that is 100% adequate to cover both this meaning and the application that the Buddha makes of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 6:44 AM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

Popper's detailed discussion of Marx's economics is in chapter 20 of Open Society, but his concern is not exactly with refuting it. He has other fish to fry. From section II of the chapter:

Marx's theory of value, usually considered by Marxists as well as by anti-Marxists as a corner-stone of the Marxist creed, is in my opinion one of its rather unimportant parts; indeed, the sole reason why I am going to treat it, instead of proceeding at once to the next section, is that it is generally held to be important, and that I cannot defend my reasons for differing from this opinion without discussing the theory. But I wish to make it clear at once that in holding that the theory of value is a redundant part of Marxism, I am defending Marx rather than attacking him. For there is little doubt that the many critics who have shown that the theory of value is very weak in itself are in the main perfectly right. But even if they were wrong, it would only strengthen the position of Marxism if it could be established that its decisive historico-political doctrines can be developed entirely independently of such a controversial theory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 7:44 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It seems to me that your confusion arises from two mistakes.

Firstly you are allowing yourself to be bewitched by the mere conventions of English grammar. Secondly, you are uncritically assuming that the thoughts that would prompt you to say, "I feel terrible pain" are the same as those which would prompt an arahant to do so.

To get over the first mistake I suggest you begin by reading up on the subject of personal pronouns (I, you, he, she, etc.). You need to understand that the way we happen to use them in English is merely the way we happen to use them in English. It's just a linguistic convention and not necessarily reflective of reality. If we were speaking a pro-drop language like Japanese or a null-subject language like Hebrew, then we would follow different conventions — ones in which we could omit the pronouns in any context where they were in some sense pragmatically inferable.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Personal_pronoun

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pro-drop_language

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Null-subject_language

And as for your second mistake, here I suggest that you read the Buddha's discourse to Potṭhapāda:

“Citta, these are the world’s designations, the world’s expressions, the world’s ways of speaking, the world’s descriptions, with which the Tathagata expresses himself but without grasping to them.”

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn9>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 7:51 AM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

[./download/file.php?id=2523](#)

(90.48 KiB) Downloaded 58 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 8:01 AM

Title: Re: Fake facts in biography Buddha?

Content:

Seconded, though there's no need to buy it:

http://store.pariyatti.org/Life-of-the-Buddha-The--PDF-eBook_p_1412.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 9:46 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It is not intrinsically invalid. It is a question whose invalidity is owing to the presuppositions of the questioner, Moliyaphagguna. One could, however, conceive of other situations in which the question would not be invalid.

From the translator's endnotes:

Phagguna's question, "Who consumes...?" is "pregnant" with an implicit view of self. He sees someone—a self—standing behind consciousness in the role of a substantial subject. The Buddha must therefore reject as invalid the question itself, which is based on an illegitimate assumption. Spk: "I do not say, 'One consumes'" = "I do not say someone—a being or a person (koci satto vā puggalo vā)—consumes."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 10:57 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It is now evident to me that there is nothing to be gained by our continuing this exchange.

Wishing you a pleasant weekend.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 11:56 AM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

Falsifiability was for Popper a 'methodological rule' or a 'tenet' for evaluating and demarcating theories, rather than a theory itself. On the other hand, there is one context in which it might be rightly called a 'theory', namely, in a discussion between philosophers about competing epistemologies of science. In such a discussion it could rightly be said that "the inductive theory holds this to be good science, the instrumentalist theory holds that, the Popperian falsifiability theory holds something else."

From Popper's Replies to My Critics:

The difficulties connected with my criterion of demarcation (D) are important, but must not be exaggerated. It is vague, since it is a methodological rule, and since the demarcation between science and nonscience is vague. But it is more than sharp enough to make a distinction between many physical theories on the one hand, and metaphysical theories, such as psychoanalysis, or Marxism (in its present form), on the other. This is, of course, one of my main theses; and nobody who has not understood it can be said to have understood my theory.

The situation with Marxism is, incidentally, very different from that with psychoanalysis. Marxism was once a scientific theory: it predicted that capitalism would lead to increasing misery and, through a more or less mild revolution, to socialism; it predicted that this would happen first in the technically highest developed countries; and it predicted that the technical evolution of the 'means of production' would lead to social, political, and ideological developments, rather than the other way round.

But the (so-called) socialist revolution came first in one of the technically backward countries. And instead of the means of production producing a new ideology, it was Lenin's and Stalin's ideology that Russia must push forward with its industrialization ('Socialism is dictatorship of the proletariat plus electrification') which promoted the new development of the means of production. Thus one might say that Marxism was once a science, but one which was refuted by some of the facts which happened to clash with its predictions (I have here mentioned just a few of these facts).

However, Marxism is no longer a science; for it broke the methodological rule that we must accept falsification, and it immunized itself against the most blatant refutations of its predictions. Ever since then, it can be described only as nonscience—as a metaphysical dream, if you like, married to a cruel reality.

Psychoanalysis is a very different case. It is an interesting psychological metaphysics (and no doubt there is some truth in it, as there is so often in metaphysical ideas), but it never was a science. There may be lots of people who are Freudian or Adlerian cases: Freud himself was clearly a Freudian case, and Adler an Adlerian case. But what prevents their theories from being scientific in the sense here described is, very simply, that they do not exclude any physically possible human behaviour. Whatever anybody may do is, in principle, explicable in Freudian or Adlerian terms. (Adler's break with Freud was more Adlerian than Freudian, but Freud never looked on it as a refutation of his theory.)

The point is very clear. Neither Freud nor Adler excludes any particular person's acting in any particular way, whatever the outward circumstances. Whether a man sacrificed his life to rescue a drowning child (a case of sublimation) or whether he murdered the child by drowning him (a case of repression) could not possibly be predicted or excluded by Freud's theory; the theory was compatible with everything that could happen—even without any special immunization treatment.

Thus while Marxism became non-scientific by its adoption of an immunizing strategy, psychoanalysis was immune to start with, and remained so. In contrast, most physical theories are pretty free of immunizing tactics and highly falsifiable to start with. As a rule, they exclude an infinity of conceivable possibilities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 12:20 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

It doesn't bother me, though it is apparent that I'm not getting through to you. If you were to review what I have written so far in this thread and read the texts that I linked to, I trust that the matter will become clearer to you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 4:24 PM

Title: Lance Cousins, RIP

Content:

From another forum:

Dear Colleagues,

It is with sadness that I write to the list to inform members of the death of Lance Cousins at the age of 72. I understand that Lance died suddenly last Friday in Oxford. Lance will be known to many members of this list both from his publications and his contributions to the list; many will also have benefited from the generous way in which he shared his learning by way of comment and advice. Lance studied history and then oriental studies at Cambridge before being appointed Lecturer and then Senior Lecturer in Comparative Religion at the University of Manchester where he taught Buddhism, Hinduism, comparative mysticism, Pali and Sanskrit. He took early retirement in the 1990s, moving to Oxford where he taught Buddhism in the Faculty of Theology and Pali and Middle Indian in the Faculty of Oriental Studies. Lance served as President of the UK Association for Buddhist Studies and of the Pali Text Society. His published articles concern the history of Buddhist schools, Abhidhamma literature and thought, as well as Pali, Middle Indian and Buddhist Sanskrit textual studies. Lance was also a founding member of the Samatha Trust and a much respected teacher of samatha meditation. He will be remembered by many as a true paṇḍita.

Funeral arrangements have yet to be announced.

With best wishes,

Rupert Gethin

Professor of Buddhist Studies

University of Bristol

Department of Religion and Theology

Cousins.jpg (340.16 KiB) Viewed 10410 times

Prof. Cousins with Ven. Wei Wu and Prof. Y. Karunadasa, on the occasion of their being awarded honorary doctorates by Mahamakut Buddhist University, Bangkok in 2013

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2015 9:51 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Sati comes first in the list and upekkhā last, so the abbreviating convention is for only these two to be expounded in full. It is not the aim to single out any particular bojjhaṅga for emphasis.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 12:31 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

The Saṃyutta commentary attributes the efficacy of the recital to the memories that it evoked in the arahant theras:

"As the elder listened closely to this teaching on the development of the enlightenment factors, it is said, the thought occurred to him: "When I penetrated the truths on the seventh day of my going forth, these enlightenment factors became manifest". Thinking, "The Master's teaching is indeed emancipating!" his blood became clear, his bodily humours were purified, and the disease departed from his body like a drop of water fallen on a lotus leaf."

(tr. Bodhi, Connected Discourses)

Though the much-attested efficacy of the Suttas when used —as they are nowadays— as paritta chants to cure sicknesses even in non-arahants would obviously need to be accounted for in some other way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Seven year anniversary

Content:

Thanks a lot for the inspiring progress report.

Malas, by the way, are very common in the Asian Theravada cultural milieu, whether as an aid to the anussati meditations or simply as something that Buddhists like to wear, usually with a Buddha amulet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 11:21 AM

Title: Re: Marx on Religion

Content:

Not quite. Popper divides Marx's work into those parts which can be falsified (and are therefore scientific) and those parts which can't. The scientific parts have already been falsified by history. The unfalsifiable parts are dismissed as metaphysics and pseudoscience.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 11:32 AM

Title: Re: 12 characteristics of material phenomena

Content:

I should like to ask posters to kindly respect the guidelines for this sub-forum:

The Abhidhamma and Classical Theravada sub-forums are specialized venues for the discussion of the Abhidhamma and the classical Mahavihara understanding of the Dhamma. Within these forums the Pali Tipitaka and its commentaries are for discussion purposes treated as authoritative. These forums are for the benefit of those members who wish to develop a deeper understanding of these texts and are not for the challenging of the Abhidhamma and/or Theravada commentarial literature.

Posts should also include support from a reference or a citation (Tipitaka, commentarial, or from a later work from an author representative of the Classical point-of-view).

Posts that contain personal opinions and conjecture, points of view arrived at from meditative experiences, conversations with devas, blind faith in the supreme veracity of one's own teacher's point of view etc. are all regarded as off-topic, and as such, will be subject to moderator review and/or removal.

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=19&t=373>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 11:36 AM

Title: Re: 12 characteristics of material phenomena

Content:

I believe a strictly momentarist account of motion —say the lifting of my arm— would actually treat it as an appearance produced by the arising of fresh rūpa-dhammas in a location adjacent to rūpa-dhammas that have just passed away.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 2:08 PM

Title: Re: Seven year anniversary

Content:

The term is usually translated 'recollection'. The anussati make up ten of the forty meditation subjects given in the Visuddhimagga:

Buddhānussati — recollection of the Buddha.*

Dhammānussati — recollection of the Dhamma.*

Saṅghānussati — recollection of the Saṅgha.*

Sīlānussati — recollection of virtue.

Cāgānussati — recollection of generosity.

Devatānussati — recollection of devas.

Upasamānussati — recollection of peace [Nibbāna].

Maraṇānussati — recollection of death.

Kāyagatāsati — recollection of parts of the body.*

Ānāpānassati — mindfulness of breathing.

The four marked with an asterisk are the ones which many like to practise with the aid of a mālā, which is used in much the same way that Catholics use a rosary. For example, a popular practice among the Burmese is to recite (orally or mentally) the Pali formula for the nine special qualities of the Buddha 108, 216 or 324 times a day, using a 108-bead mālā as a counting device. Some will then do the same with the special qualities of the Dhamma and Saṅgha. In Thailand those who meditate by repeating a preparatory-word like buddho or sammā arahaṃ may also count their repetitions using a mālā, often resolving to do a certain number of rounds each day.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 21, 2015 2:33 PM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Not necessarily. It's enough to be open to the possibility that maladies may sometimes be cured by other means than those presently understood by medical science.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 22, 2015 2:44 PM

Title: Re: Oldest translations of suttas into English?

Content:

There was a lot of variety, but in general Continental European monks tended to be diligent about learning Pali and doing their own pioneering research, while British and Americans tended to be lazy and to rely upon the work of others. Anglophone Paliist monks like Ñāṇamoli and Bodhi are rather in a minority.

Ajahn Paṇṇavaḍḍho was familiar only with the early PTS translations. You'll often hear him quoting from Kindred Sayings and Gradual Sayings, etc. in recordings of the talks he gave at the London Buddhist Society back in the 1950's. In his days as a Wat Paknam monk he did teach himself the rudiments of Pali but never put this knowledge to any use. (Though it turned out to be useful to me, as Paṇṇavaḍḍho presented me with his old copy of Warder's Introduction to Pali). Also during his Paknam period he would study thick tomes by Thai scholar monks and ended up translating one of them. I remember the MS was still in the Baan Taad library when I was there. However, once Paṇṇavaḍḍho had decided that Ajahn Maha Boowa was the business, for the remaining fifty years of his life he took no further interest in western Buddhist scholarship.

Phra Khantipālo knew the early PTS works and also kept up to date with the later ones. He learned the rudiments of Pali, but like Paṇṇavaḍḍho was never more than a hack and apart from an horrendous translation of the Dhammapada never seems to have used it for much. When delivering talks he was content to use translations.

The two German monks both knew English well and were highly proficient in Pali. They may have started off with PTS translations and pioneering German ones like Neumann's, but the greater part of their opus is the fruit of original research.

I don't know what Ajahn Sumedho's studies consisted in, but I doubt he's studied Pali much (if at all), for his use of technical terms consistently replicates the errors of the Thai forest ajahns.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 22, 2015 6:58 PM

Title: Re: Dictionary of Pali Proper Names

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 22, 2015 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Martial Law in Thailand

Content:

Bangkok's Big Brother is Watching You

General Prayuth Chan-ocha is determined to make Thailand a happy place. He's doing

this by throttling civil liberties. Abigail Haworth charts the surreal rise of his despotic regime

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/mar/22/bangkok-big-brother-politics-ruling-party-democracy>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 22, 2015 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Nowhere. In fact eternalism is closer to the truth because it's a view that's compatible with the doctrine of ownership of kamma (kammāsakatā), while annihilationism is not.

Perhaps Craig is thinking of the teaching that annihilationism is closer to dispassion. The source for this is the Dīghanakha Sutta, as it's interpreted in the Majjhima-commentary.

“Aggivessana, there are some recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Everything is acceptable to me.’ There are some recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Nothing is acceptable to me.’ And there are some recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Something is acceptable to me, something is not acceptable to me.’ Among these, the view of those recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine and view ‘Everything is acceptable to me’ is close to lust, close to bondage, close to delighting, close to holding, close to clinging. The view of those recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine and view ‘Nothing is acceptable to me’ is close to non-lust, close to non-bondage, close to non-delighting, close to non-holding, close to non-clinging.”

Bhikkhu Bodhi's endnote: MA identifies the three views here as eternalism, annihilationism, and partial eternalism. The eternalist view is close to lust (sārāgāya santike), etc., because it affirms and delights in existence in however sublimated a form; annihilationism is close to non-lust, etc., because, though involving a wrong conception of self, it leads to disenchantment with existence. If the second view is understood as radical scepticism, it could also be seen as close to non-lust in that it expresses disillusionment with the attempt to buttress the attachment to existence with a theoretical foundation and thus represents a tentative, though mistaken, step in the direction of dispassion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Help finding a Sutta

Content:

“Bhikkhus, of the speculative views held by outsiders, this is the foremost, namely: ‘I

might not be and it might not be mine; I shall not be, [and] it will not be mine.’[1] For it can be expected that one who holds such a view will not be unrepelled by existence and will not be repelled by the cessation of existence.[2] There are beings who hold such a view. But even for beings who hold such a view there is alteration; there is change. Seeing this thus, the instructed noble disciple becomes disenchanted with it; being disenchanted, he becomes dispassionate toward the foremost, not to speak of what is inferior.

(tr. Bhikkhu Bodhi)

Translator’s Notes:

[1] No c’assa no ca me siyā, na bhavissati na me bhavissati. This cryptic formula occurs in the Nikāyas in two versions. One is ascribed to the annihilationists; the other is the Buddha’s adaptation of it. The annihilationist version reads: no c’ assaṃ no ca me siyā, na bhavissāmi na me bhavissati, “I may not be, and it might not be mine. I will not be, and it will not be mine.” Since the two differ only with respect to two verbs—no c’assam vs. no c’assa, and na bhavissāmi vs. na bhavissati—the various recensions sometimes confuse them. From the commentarial glosses, it appears that the confusion had already set in before the age of the commentaries. Readings also differ among different editions of the same text. Generally I prefer the readings in Ce.

This formula is explicitly identified as an annihilationist view (ucchedadiṭṭhi) at SN 22:81, III 99,4–6. In AN, at 10:29 §8, V 63,28–64,2, it is said to be the foremost of outside speculative views (etadaggaṃ bāhirakāṇaṃ diṭṭhigatānaṃ). The Buddha transformed this formula into a theme for contemplation conformable to his own teaching by replacing the first-person verbs with their third-person counterparts. This change shifts the stress from the view of self implicit in the annihilationist version (“I will be annihilated”) to an impersonal perspective that harmonizes with the anattā doctrine. In some texts, for example at SN 22:55, III 55–58, practicing on the basis of the formula is said to culminate in the destruction of the five lower fetters, that is, in the stage of a non-returner. Sometimes, as in the present sutta, the formula includes a trailer (see below), contemplation of which is said to lead to equanimity. Practice guided by the full formula leads to one of the five levels of non-returner or to arahantship.

In the Nikāyas the precise meaning of the formula is never made explicit, which suggests that it may have served as an open guide to contemplation to be filled in by the meditator through personal intuition. The commentaries, including Mp, take the truncated particle c’ to represent ce, “if,” and interpret the two parts of the formula as conditionals. I translate here from Mp (in conformity with its own interpretation): “If it had not been: If, in the past, there had been no kamma producing individual existence; it would not be mine: now I would have no individual existence. There will not be: Now there will be no kamma producing a future individual existence for me; there will not be mine: in the future there will be no individual existence for me.”

I dissent from the commentaries on the meaning of c’, which I take to represent ca = “and.” The syntax of the phrase as a whole requires this. Skt parallels actually contain

ca (for instance, Udānavarga 15:4, parallel to Ud 78,1–3, has: no ca syān no ca me syā[n]; and MĀ 6 contains the character image (= “and”) in the appropriate places of the formula. As I interpret the meaning, the first “it” refers to the personal five aggregates, the second to the world apprehended through the aggregates. For the worldling this dyad is misconstrued as a duality of self and world; for the noble disciple it is simply the duality of internal and external phenomena. On this basis I would interpret the formula thus: “The five aggregates can be terminated, and the world presented by them can be terminated. I will so strive that the five aggregates will be terminated, (and thus) the world presented by them will be terminated.”

The trailer reads in Pāli: yadatthi yaṃ bhūtaṃ taṃ pajahāmi ti upekkhaṃ paṭilabhati. Following Mp, I understand “what exists, what has come to be” (yadatthi yaṃ bhūtaṃ) as the presently existing five aggregates. These have come to be through the craving of previous lives and are being abandoned by the abandonment of the cause for their re-arising in a future life, namely, craving or desire-and-lust.

[2] Yā cāyaṃ bhava appaṭikulyatā, sā c’assa na bhavissati, yā cāyaṃ bhavanirodhe paṭikulyatā, sā c’assa na bhavissati. The point, it seems, is that because annihilationism arises from aversion toward continued personal existence, the annihilationist welcomes the cessation of existence, though from the Buddha’s perspective annihilationism goes too far by misinterpreting such cessation as the annihilation of a real self or existent person. See It 849, 43–44.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Help finding a Sutta

Content:

The simplest method, and the one that I always use, is by listing the volume and page number of the PTS romanised edition. This is usually recognisable by the volume number being in lower case roman numerals, for example: AN. iii. 45.

Other methods:

DN. and MN. references may be given by Sutta number: DN. 1 = Brahmajāla Sutta; MN. 10 = Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta.

SN references may be given by saṃyutta number (usually in upper-case roman numerals) and then sutta number: SN. III. 34.

AN. references may be given by nipāta number and then sutta number: AN. V. 3 = third sutta in the pañca-nipāta / book of the fives.

References for verse texts (Suttanipāta, Dhammapada, Theragāthā and Therīgāthā) are given by verse number.

I don't have a hard copy of Numerical Sayings with me but to find the reference AN. v. 63 you would flick through to the Book of the Fives and then look for the number 63 in square brackets in the body of the text: [63].

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 8:33 AM

Title: Re: Oldest translations of suttas into English?

Content:

Some have been wholly autodidacts. Some have been predominantly autodidactic but regularly consulting an Asian Pali teacher when faced with difficulties. Some have gone through some traditional Asian monastic curriculum.

I don't know what the precise figures would be for these three approaches, but I believe the frequency would be in the order that I've listed above, with autodidacts being the most common and traditionally educated monks rather rare.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 9:08 AM

Title: Re: Help finding a Sutta

Content:

Sorry, I was writing very late last night and this instruction isn't correct, but conflates the two citation systems. Just do as Zom suggests.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Throughout the Suttas “good mental conduct” is defined as, “anabhijjhā, abyāpāda, sammādiṭṭhi,” — “non-covetousness, non-ill will and right view.” Therefore even the most virtuous of annihilationists — an annihilationist who is able to persuade herself to live skilfully with respect to good bodily conduct and good verbal conduct — will still, by definition, be shunning a third part of good mental conduct and adopting and practising a third part of bad mental conduct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2015 11:58 PM

Title: Re: hi all! are there some ladies in the house?

Content:

Hi Cara,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

In answer to your query, yes there are some ladies in the house, though at present it seems only four of them post with any regularity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 1:05 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

The view that there is a next world would be one item in the tenfold right view that I quoted above.

However, though it's correct to say that right view is a third part of good mental conduct, it would be a solecism to say that belief in a next world is a tenth part of right view. The former statement is acceptable inasmuch as the three components of good mental conduct —non-covetousness, non ill-will and right view— comprise three distinct mental factors: alobha, adosa and paññā.

By contrast, all ten right views amount to the occurrence of just one mental factor: paññā. And so an occurrence of the right view that there is a mother is not a different kind of mental event from an occurrence of the right view regarding the efficacy of giving. Both events consist in the arising of paññā-cetasika in the mode of right view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 5:50 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness VS Mindfulness ?

Content:

It isn't.

In Sister Upalavaṇṇā's translation only the word paṭicca is missing. Manasikaroti ekattaṃ is translated as "attends to the single".

In Ajahn Thanissaro's translation nothing is missing. Paṭicca is translated as "based on". Manasikaroti ekattaṃ is translated as "attends to the singleness".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 7:03 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

Sorry, it's time for almsround now.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 7:35 AM

Title: Re: Dhammakaya Cartoons: My Guilty Pleasure

Content:

"I wish for someone within me to love

To think of every day.

I love the person within me

I desperately need this person."

The farcical aquatic teddy boy is serenading his inner homunculus, and you think it turns out all right?!?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 8:59 AM

Title: Re: A curious comment on good and bad rebirths in AN III 371

Content:

It is in part affected by culture, inasmuch as right and wrong view are unequally present in the lore of different nations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 10:45 AM

Title: Re: A curious comment on good and bad rebirths in AN III 371

Content:

The Pali says that when Sunetta taught his Dhamma, the minds of some were pleased/faithful (*cittāni pasādesum*) and the minds of others were not. The implication of this is that the former accepted his teachings and the latter did not. And so in effect the Sutta does say that "those with virtue went to heaven" because arriving at right view—even when it's only the limited right view of a non-ariyan teaching—is a virtuous act.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2015 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

I can't conceive how right view per se could ever be detrimental. I can imagine it being detrimental only in conjunction with certain other factors. For example, the claims of

spiritual charlatans are likely to be given short shrift by hardheaded materialists but may meet with a readier reception from those who accept kamma, the afterlife, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

I see. If a person supposes that merely by her possession of mundane right view she would be led all the way to Nibbāna, then we can say that she greatly over-estimates the view's potential. She would presumably be unaware that this level of right view is *sāsavā puññabhāgiyā upadhivepakkā* ("affected by taints, partaking of merit, ripening in the acquisitions [of becoming]") and therefore by definition not a view that leads out of the round of becoming.

Whether such a misunderstanding would be correctly termed "misapprehension of virtue and vowed observances" (my preferred translation of *sīlabbata-parāmāsa*) is another question. I wasn't aware that the scope of this term included views. The commonest Sutta definition describes it as thinking: "By this virtue or vowed observance or austerity or holy life I ... [shall achieve such and such]." (*Imināhaṃ sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahmacariyena...*). So although the scope of misapprehended activities is rather broader than just "rites and rituals" it doesn't appear to include views.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Lance Cousins, RIP

Content:

A tribute page on the website of the Samatha Trust:

<http://www.samatha.org/lance-cousins>

A collection of Lance Cousins' articles:

<https://oxford.academia.edu/LSCousins>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Lance Cousins, RIP

Content:

Lance with his teacher Nai Boonman (formerly Phra Puññadhīro)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Vanilla extract

Content:

You will find here a lengthy thread on the subject of cooking with alcohol:

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=42&t=20428>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

I suggest you re-read my post, only this time give a little thought to the implications of the phrase "per se" and the following sentence in bold that you omitted to quote:

I can't conceive how right view per se could ever be detrimental. I can imagine it being detrimental only in conjunction with certain other factors.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 4:26 AM

Title: Re: Siddartha and Old Path White Clouds

Content:

Old Path White Clouds is Thich Nhat Hanh's biography of the Buddha. I think you may be confusing it with The Way of the White Clouds, Lama Govinda's Tibetan travelogue.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2015 1:59 PM

Title: Re: Is Buddhism closer to Christianity than atheism?

Content:

That conformity with fact is what makes a right view right seems to be indicated in the Apanṇaka Sutta:

"Since there actually is another world, one who holds the view 'there is another world' has right view."

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn60>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist abbots expelled from monkhood after drinking binge

Content:

The "corrupted machine" would presumably be everyone who connived at helping the

monks obtain their booze and then turned a blind eye to their drinking and its effects upon them. Out in the sticks this might well mean virtually everybody in the surrounding tambon. Shocking as it may be to some, a long-term alcoholic monk who's "a bit of a character" will in rural Thailand often find himself regarded in a rather affectionate way, somewhat reminiscent of the Catholic monks' attitude toward Sebastian in *Brideshead Revisited*:

"Poor Sebastian!" I said. "It's too pitiful. How will it end?"

"I think I can tell you exactly, Charles. I've seen others like him, and I believe they are very near and dear to God. He'll live on, half in, half out of, the community, a familiar figure pottering round with his broom and his bunch of keys. He'll be a great favourite with the old fathers, something of a joke to the novices. Everyone will know about his drinking; he'll disappear for two or three days every month or so, and they'll all nod and smile and say in their various accents, "Old Sebastian's on the spree again," and then he'll come back dishevelled and shamefaced and be more devout for a day or two in the chapel. He'll probably have little hiding places about the garden where he keeps a bottle and takes a swig now and then on the sly. They'll bring him forward to act as guide, whenever they have an English speaking visitor, and he will be completely charming so that before they go, they'll ask about him and perhaps be given a hint that he has high connections at home. If he lives long enough, generations of missionaries in all kinds of remote places will think of him as a queer old character who was somehow part of the Home of their student days, and remember him in their masses. He'll develop little eccentricities of devotion, intense personal cults of his own; he'll be found in the chapel at odd times and missed when he's expected. Then one morning, after one of his drinking bouts, he'll be picked up at the gate dying, and show by a mere flicker of the eyelid that he is conscious when they give him the last sacraments. It's not such a bad way of getting through one's life."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 1:58 AM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

My first thought is that there seem to be at least two other possible views beside those you mention:

3. That bringing new life into existence is in some cases morally defensible and in other cases not.
4. That bringing new life into existence is something of a moral mixed bag; in Buddhist terms, "dark and bright kamma with a dark and bright ripening."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist abbots expelled from monkhood after drinking binge

Content:

I shan't myself be doing anything in that regard. My approach to the corrupt and nonsensical aspects of Buddhism in Thailand is a strictly quietistic one. That is, I just stay well away from it all and tend my own garden.

But even if I wished to do something, I think the most that could be accomplished would be to found a monastery where no monk has any office or title other than those which the Vinaya permits. But as for changing the whole system, this is out of the question for western monks in Thailand. We live here more or less on sufferance and are not taken in the least seriously. Recall, for example, the meeting between Ajahn Brahmavamsa and the elders of the Ajahn Chah monasteries on the bhikkhuni ordination controversy; when Brahm attempted to make the meeting about Vinaya he was curtly told to stop trying to teach his granny to suck eggs.

But though western monks in Thailand could hardly propose the abolition of the office of abbot and expect to even receive a sympathetic hearing, let alone have the proposal accepted and acted upon, might a Thai monk do so? I don't know the answer to that, but I observe that even the most radical of the native sangha reformers don't in fact go that far. They don't even go so far as to propose the less radical step of abolishing the royally granted ecclesiastical titles and hierarchical administrative offices, presumably because to do so would be to venture into lese majesté territory. Even Phra Paisal Visalo, for example, has only called for the replacement of the Sangha Council with some more efficient mechanism. The idea of doing away with all centralised bureaucratic mechanisms and returning to a wholly localised grassroots Buddhism seems too much even for him.

Yet such a return to village-level governance probably would be the most effective solution to problems like those in the OP. Not so long ago I was talking to a Chiang Mai peasant woman in her late nineties who told me of how they used to deal with bad monks when she was a girl. Apparently it was very much a skimmington ride approach, in which the villagers would first tear the robes off the errant monk's back and then drive him out of the village, while blowing hornpipes and beating him with sticks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 10:58 AM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

On the basis of what criteria? I mean is it upon Buddhist ethical presuppositions that you make this judgment or upon something else?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 11:37 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

T., a rascally teenage American samanera in a kuti near to mine, was whittling a piece of wood the wrong way, drawing the knife towards his body rather than away from it. I showed him how to do it properly, but he was a know-all and didn't like taking orders, so as soon I was out of sight he went back to his former way of doing it. At one point the knife stuck fast in the wood and the samanera continued to press the blade forward instead of pulling it back. I then heard a loud scream coming from his hut. When I went to investigate I saw that his inept craftsmanship had resulted in a deep, 5-inch long wound in the forearm, with probably one or two tubes severed to judge from the fountain of blood that was spurting out. I staunched the bleeding with a tourniquet and then requested permission to take the samanera to hospital to get him stitched up. Permission was denied. The abbot said that no stitches were necessary and he would deal with it himself. He then took hold of T's arm and spent the next quarter of an hour chanting the Bojjhaṅgaparitta, the Rājato, and an abridged version of the northern Thai Seub Jātā paritta cycle, occasionally pausing to blow on the samanera's arm. When he'd finished and the tourniquet was removed the bleeding had stopped. When the blood was washed away there was no longer a wound on the arm at all. Where the wound had been there was now just collagenous scar tissue that bore a faded look as if the injury had happened years before.

This is probably the most persuasive example I can think of, inasmuch as it involves something that cannot very plausibly be explained away as a placebo effect, especially considering that the impetuous young American was anxious to get to the hospital and throughout the chanting kept glancing at the clock, rolling his eyes and clenching his fists in exasperation. And so it was palpably clear that he had no confidence whatever in the paritta's or the abbot's power to heal him.

Incidentally, some might think that this occurrence calls into question the Milindapañha's statement that the efficacy of parittas is impeded by obstructive past kamma, by mental defilement and by disbelief, for in this case the paritta seems to have worked even though it was quite obvious that the samanera was both unbelieving and afflicted with defilement. However Nāgasena's discussion of parittas seems to be concerned only with their use in averting imminent death, so perhaps there is no contradiction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 11:38 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

Hi Kalama,

It isn't that there's any Vinaya issue, but that I have occasionally in the past voiced scorn for certain forest monks who like to rabbit on about their teachers' supernormal powers. It's my cynical belief that they do this largely for self-aggrandisement, i.e. to drop hints

to their audience that they too might have such powers. So, having scorned the practice I felt hesitant to do the same myself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 12:00 PM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

Since it is one's own craving for existence that is the cause for one's coming into existence, coming into existence is a harm only in the sense that kicking oneself is a harm. Those who beget you, merely by having begotten you, cannot be said to have harmed you. On the contrary, they've done you a service by providing you with that form of existence—a human one—that is optimal for putting an end to existence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 1:07 PM

Title: Re: Beginning yoga?

Content:

Same here. I learned Iyengar's standing postures over twenty years ago and they, together with long walks and the 11-minute-a-day <http://www.workoutoftheweek.net/2011/02/royal-canadian-air-force-exercise-plan.html>, taught to me by a Canadian bhikkhu, have been my sole form of exercise ever since.

Thanks to the Iyengar routine I've been entirely free of back troubles throughout this time, while the RCAF workout leaves me fit and agile enough to pilot a CF-18 Hornet fighter jet or almost anything else in the Canadian aerial armoury (not that I'd actually want to do this, but if I did the Canadians would judge me fit enough for it).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 26, 2015 10:36 PM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

Which anyone possessed of right view will assume to be the case.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2015 2:00 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

I don't think so. There wouldn't be much point since guilt in connection with the fourth

defeating offence can only be established by confession. No matter how audacious and extravagant a monk's claims may be, if he's confronted over them and shown that they can't possibly be true, he can always claim that he mistakenly over-estimated himself and then he's immediately off the hook.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2015 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Siddartha and Old Path White Clouds

Content:

You might enjoy The Recorded Sayings of Layman P'ang: compiled by Imperial Commissioner Yu Ti translated by Stephen Green.

One day Shih-t'ou said, "I've come to visit you. What have you been doing?"

The Layman said, "If you're asking what I do every day, there's nothing to say about it."

Shih-t'ou said, "What did you think you were doing before I asked you about it?"

The Layman made up a verse:

What I do every day

Is nothing special:

I simply stumble around.

What I do is not thought out,

Where I go is unplanned.

No matter who tries to leave their mark,

The hills and dales are not impressed.

Collecting firewood and carrying water

Are prayers that reach the gods.

Shih-t'ou approved, saying, "So, are you going to wear black or white?"

The Layman said, "I will do whatever is best."

It came to pass that he never shaved his head to join the sangha.

<https://www.amazon.com/The-Sayings-Layman-Pang-Classic/dp/1590306309>

An account of P'ang from Thomas Hoover's The Zen Experience:

[./download/file.php?id=2526](#)

(118.82 KiB) Downloaded 38 times

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Layman_Pang

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2015 12:12 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

Since 'prick' is slang for a stupid or contemptible man, "being a self-righteous prick" has an obvious gender limitation that wouldn't apply to "being judgmental", which is possible for women too. Moreover, "being self-righteous" means enjoying certainty (especially an unfounded certainty) as to one's moral correctness or moral superiority, while "being judgmental" means being overly, and perhaps captiously, critical of others' perceived moral failings. Clearly it's possible to be one without being the other, for though the former nearly always generates the latter, the latter doesn't have the former as its only possible cause.

That being so, a meat-eater who encounters judgmental vegetarians and perceives them to be self-righteous pricks (or c***s, as the case may be), may be right to do so, but not infallibly so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 28, 2015 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Early Buddhism resources

Content:

<http://gen.lib.rus.ec/scimag/get.php?doi=10.1016%2F0048-721x%2892%2990022-v> and comprehensively trashed by Steven Collins.

Wiltshire's attempted

<http://gen.lib.rus.ec/scimag/get.php?doi=10.1006%2Freli.1993.1022> to Collins.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 28, 2015 8:52 AM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

It might be better to precipitate your thoughts, taking what's solid in anti-natalism and letting the watery remainder trickle away.

In my view you err in valuing these guys for their conclusions, which are ucchedavādin and in the light of mundane right view simply untenable. I like the writings of David Benatar, and love the anti-natalist poetry of James Crawford, but in both cases it seems to me that what's valuable are not the conclusions, but the graphic, haunting and saṃvega-arousing delineation of the premises.

Terra Infirmit

A craft, a calling, a work of art;
achieving, at best, a qualified immortality.
For, as we all know,

the world will one day fly apart.

What, then? Might there be more?
Launching electronically reproduced masterpieces
off toward the universe's dark horizon,
ere the temporal waves engulf this receding shore?

But, what of heat death?
That imagined, far-flung day
when the cold corpse of the cosmos
sighs its last breath?

Nowhere to drop anchor after nullity's deluge — or, is there?
From out of the heart of the silent aftermath,
there shines forth a beacon; an eye of spectral fire
beckoning us to hope's final refuge:

to a testament wrought in the hardest stone,
in the infinite halls of the maximal museum —
God's memory, where all is reclaimed,
and not alone.
— James Crawford

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 28, 2015 9:33 AM
Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya
Content:
Bhante,

Would you happen to know what's the commoner outcome in these situations: the destruction of the marriage or the wife coming to her senses and leaving the Dhammakaya outfit? (I'm optimistically assuming that a third scenario —the husband's conversion— never happens).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 28, 2015 2:47 PM
Title: Re: Early Buddhism resources
Content:
Given the portentous title, one would have thought that the author must surely be Robert Ludlum. But no, apparently it's a certain Susan Carol Stone:
About the Author

"Susan Stone, Ph.D., is author of "At the Eleventh Hour; Caring for My Dying Mother"

(Present Perfect Books, 2001), a memoir on mindfulness and caregiving, which was nominated for "ForeWord Magazine's" Book of the Year award in 2001. Authors Stephen and Ondrea Levine called the book "an exquisite exploration of the heart." She is also co-author of "The American Mosaic" (McGraw Hill, 1995), a research study on workforce diversity, and is author of articles on mindfulness. "The Kosambi Intrigue" is her first novel. Susan has meditated for almost 30 years, has lived in monasteries for 3 years and has received mindfulness training from nationally recognized teachers. She teaches Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction at the University of Virginia, and she co-leads the Insight Meditation Community of Charlottesville, a weekly mindfulness meditation group. She has taught mindfulness to middle-school students; founded and taught weekly mindfulness groups in men's and women's maximum-security prisons; and is a co-founder of the Blue Ridge Prison Project. She was on the staff of the Being with Dying program at Upaya in Santa Fe NM for two years. Susan leads mindfulness workshops, classes and retreats around the country. She was a hospice volunteer and is a Reiki master who has worked with AIDS patients."

"When a trivial incident sparks conflict in a Buddhist monastery, a young monk named Sati is embroiled in a plot that reaches all the way to the palace and inflames the city of Kosambi."

The story was published in 2012, but with no sequels or further efforts in the same genre. Isn't it odd that Dr. Stone has stopped at just one? One would have thought there'd be a great market for Sutta-inspired novels with Ludlumesque titles...

Nanda Sutta: The Dove-footed Nymph Ultimatum
Kūṭadanta Sutta: The Snaggle-tooth Inheritance
Lakkhaṇa Sutta: The Thirty-two Mark Identity
Kevaḍḍha Sutta: The Miracle Contenders
Tevijja Sutta: The Brahma Affair
Aggañña Sutta: The Abhassara Regression
Sigalovāda Sutta: The Six-Directioned Directive
Kālāma Sutta: The Misquoted Protocol
Sedaka Sutta: The Pole-Climbers' Compact
Aṅgulimāla Sutta: The Finger-Collecting Imperative

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 29, 2015 3:34 AM
Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya
Content:
Thanks, bhante.

I see that the fellow with the Union Jack is carrying it upside down, with the white of St. Andrew below the red of St. Patrick in the upper hoist canton. Perhaps a distress signal

to the UFO mothership?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 29, 2015 4:38 AM

Title: Re: How to stop wet dreams?

Content:

There is no need to do anything special, for nocturnal emissions are morally inconsequential and amount to a stain on the brahmacariyā only in cases where a man, before going to sleep, has deliberately taken measures calculated to increase the likelihood of his having one.

As this is the ethics subforum, I suggest you familiarize yourself with what the Buddha himself taught about the ethics of a Buddhist brahmacarī/brahmacarinī and disregard notions derived from outside systems (e.g. most of the stuff in ihrjordan's post). Having abandoned sexual intercourse and masturbation, the further refinement of the Buddhist brahmacariyā consists chiefly in restraint of the sense-doors and in the seven abstentions outlined in the Methuna Sutta (AN. iv. 53-6):
Methuna Sutta

Then the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him ... and said to him:

“Does Master Gotama also claim to be one who lives the celibate life?”

“If, brahmin, one could rightly say of anyone: ‘He lives the complete and pure celibate life—unbroken, flawless, unblemished, unblotched,’ it is precisely of me that one might say this. For I live the complete and pure celibate life—unbroken, flawless, unblemished, unblotched.”

“But what, Master Gotama, is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life?”

(1) “Here, brahmin, some ascetic or brahmin, claiming to be perfectly celibate, does not actually engage in intercourse with women. But he consents to being rubbed, massaged, bathed, and kneaded by them. He relishes this, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. This is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life. He is called one who lives an impure celibate life, one who is fettered by the bond of sexuality. He is not freed from birth, from old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish; he is not freed from suffering, I say.

(2) “Again, some ascetic or brahmin, claiming to be perfectly celibate, does not actually engage in intercourse with women; nor does he consent to being rubbed, massaged, bathed, and kneaded by them. But he jokes with women, plays with them, and amuses himself with them....

(3) "... he does not joke with women, play with them, and amuse himself with them ... but he gazes and stares straight into their eyes....

(4) "... he does not gaze and stare straight into women's eyes ... but he listens to their voices behind a wall or through a rampart as they laugh, talk, sing, or weep....

(5) "... he does not listen to the voices of women behind a wall or through a rampart as they laugh, talk, sing, or weep ... but he recollects laughing, talking, and playing with them in the past....

(6) "... he does not recollect laughing, talking, and playing with women in the past ... but he looks at a householder or a householder's son enjoying himself furnished and endowed with the five objects of sensual pleasure....

(7) "... he does not look at a householder or a householder's son enjoying himself furnished and endowed with the five objects of sensual pleasure, but he lives the spiritual life aspiring for [rebirth in] a certain order of devas, [thinking]: 'By this virtuous behavior, observance, austerity, or spiritual life I will be a deva or one [in the retinue] of the devas.' He relishes this, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. This, too, is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life. He is called one who lives an impure celibate life, one who is fettered by the bond of sexuality. He is not freed from birth, from old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish; he is not freed from suffering, I say.

"So long, brahmin, as I saw that I had not abandoned one or another of these seven bonds of sexuality, I did not claim to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in the world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, in this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. But when I did not see even one of these seven bonds of sexuality that I had not abandoned, then I claimed to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with ... its devas and humans.

"The knowledge and vision arose in me: 'Unshakable is my liberation of mind; this is my last birth; now there is no more renewed existence.'"

When this was said, the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī said to the Blessed One: "Excellent, Master Gotama! ... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 29, 2015 6:22 AM

Title: Re: First and Third Noble Truth

Content:

I don't think so. My experience has been that those who follow a teacher out of faith in his supposed supernormal powers tend to be invincibly stupid people who are swayed far more by their own projections than by any evidence one might present them with.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 29, 2015 11:41 AM

Title: Re: How to stop wet dreams?

Content:

The Vinaya prohibition in the first saṅghādisesa rule is against the deliberate emission of semen, with the Buddha explicitly ruling that nocturnal emissions are no offence under this training rule (Vin. iii. 112). The problem with the prohibited action is, firstly, that it's an intensely pleasurable indulgence that conduces to the increase of the hindrance of kāmaccanda, thereby impeding success in both calm and insight development; secondly, it reinforces the latent tendency to kāmarāga; thirdly, in the case of one gone forth, it's dishonourable to be indulging in such a thing when you're living on the offerings of the faithful. As the Buddha said to Seyyasaka, the first wanking monk: "But do you, reverend Seyyasaka, eat the gifts of the faithful with the very same hand as that which you use to emit semen?" (Vin. iii. 110; = Book of the Discipline. I. 193)

So, at least in the Theravada, the first saṅghādisesa rule is not explained as having anything to do with supposed harms resulting from loss of semen, displaced energies, unbalanced humours, wind outflows from the groin, or any other tantric or yogic notions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 29, 2015 11:55 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

I think it might be said that Lazarus is functionally the same as a zombie. As I understand it, a Haitian sorcerer's purpose in creating a zombie is to arouse in people a conviction as to his necromantic powers. In the Gospel of John, that's more or less Jesus's stated reason for wanting to raise Lazarus from the dead:

"When Jesus heard [of Lazarus's sickness], he said, This sickness is not unto death, but for the glory of God, that the Son of God might be glorified thereby." (John 11:4)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2015 2:53 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

In the only sutta where the term is found, 'old kamma' means the six bases.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2015 8:43 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Yes, I wasn't denying that all consciousness is dependently-originated, but the idea that it's all originated by kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2015 9:19 AM

Title: Re: The hell guards?

Content:

The idea that the nirayapālas are phantoms generated by the evil kamma of hell's inmates was entertained by some early Buddhists but rejected by the Theravadins at the Third Council (Kvu. 956-8).

From Points of Controversy:

Nirayapalakatha.png (486.94 KiB) Viewed 3277 times

B.C. Law has mistranslated paragraph 3. His translation presents it as the Theravadin's argument, though it's actually the heretic's counter-argument. Replace 'Moreover...' with 'But...', and "Hence there are guards..." with 'Hence there are no guards...'

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2015 9:58 AM

Title: Re: Buddha seems to bring tranquility to Oakland neighborhood

Content:

Perhaps there is something in the Oakland air that imbues its inhabitants with a heightened iconophilic sensitivity, causing them to look upon the buddharupa as an hypostasis rather than anabolically constituted. Though a statue probably can't do much at all, there's no telling what people's view of a statue may do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2015 9:47 AM

Title: Re: Buddha seems to bring tranquility to Oakland neighborhood

Content:

I'm sorry to hear that it was full of garbage, but I don't think the Kew Gardens pagoda was ever conceived as a place of worship. It was built in the mid-18th century by Sir William Chambers, a designer who happened to be an admirer of Chinese architecture and garden design, and whose good fortune it was to have a sponsor — the Dowager

Princess of Wales — who was willing to indulge his enthusiasms. Other than an object of beauty and a viewing platform, the only practical purpose the pagoda has ever served was as a place for the drop-testing of model bombs in the Second World War.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_Chambers_%28architect%29

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Princess_Augusta_of_Saxe-Gotha

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kew_Gardens

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2015 9:53 AM

Title: Re: Access to insight - Advertising?

Content:

I don't get any adverts at all, not even when I use an old browser with no ad-blocker.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2015 2:26 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and physical pain

Content:

Setting aside Ajahn Maha Boowa and replying generally...

A Buddhist monk's attainment of an exalted state is not something he is permitted to announce to the general public, let alone try to convince them of it by performing some kind of demonstration. The monastic rules permit him to declare his attainment only to fellow monastics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2015 4:15 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and physical pain

Content:

There are two relevant rules. Firstly, the fourth pārājika, which prohibits false declarations of superhuman states):

<http://pratyeka.org/a2i/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch04.html>

And secondly, the 8th pācittiya, which prohibits a monk telling unordained people about any superhuman states he may have attained:

<http://pratyeka.org/a2i/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch08-1.html>

In a nutshell: to his fellow monastics (both monks and nuns) a monk is free to disclose what he believes he has attained. To a non-monastic he can say nothing; if he does so (as in Maha Boowa's case) then he commits a pācittiya offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2015 6:35 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Mahā Chatchai - Metta Meditation

Content:

It's Wat Pleng in Thonburi. Inconveniently there happen to be two wats of this name in Thonburi. One has the full name Wat Pleng Vipassana and is quite famous as its late abbot, Ajahn Praderm, was a highly regarded Abhidhamma teacher. The other is a small obscure wat that nobody has ever heard of. The latter, I'm afraid, is the one that you want.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 1, 2015 10:31 AM

Title: Re: What about sotapanna/Sakadagami in meditation?

Content:

It's possible that the monk wasn't making a general pronouncement about Buddhist doctrine but merely describing the way things are done in Mahasi-style centres. Usually in these centres the intensive practice of samatha bhāvanā with jhāna as its aim is taught only to those who are believed to have already made decisive progress in vipassanā bhāvanā. In some centres this will mean sotāpatti, in others the lower attainment of maggāmaggañāṇadassanavisuddhi.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 1, 2015 3:44 PM

Title: Re: The question of gender and preference in mixed-gender retreats

Content:

Your question assumes that Koulla Roussos is actually making a good point. But it seems to me that her point is based on the mistaken assumption that Buddhist enlightenment (which is what the Goenka people are concerned with) is the same as the European intellectual and social developments in the 17th and 18th centuries, which also go by the name 'enlightenment'.

The 'answer', therefore, is that the Goenka people should help Koulla Roussos to understand that she's barking up the wrong tree. If, after the matter has been clarified, the woman should insist on pressing her narcissistic identarian demands, then I suggest the Goenka people take a leaf out of the late Andrew Breitbart's playbook:

Andrew was straight and pro-gay—but more than anything he hated identity politics ... If

someone went up to Andrew and declared that he/she was proud to be a transgendered sex worker activist with dyslexia, he would say, “So?”

As Gavin McInnes has pointed out, “So?” was Andrew’s simplest and most cogent retort to the angry tolerance merchant. And one that usually left the ranters in sputtering silence.

(from Greg Gutfeld’s The Joy of Hate: How to Triumph over Whiners in an Age of Phony Outrage)

<https://www.amazon.com/The-Joy-Hate-Triumph-Whiners/dp/0307986985>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 1, 2015 6:58 PM

Title: Re: The question of gender and preference in mixed-gender retreats

Content:

Ben, or one of the other Goenka practitioners here, would be in a better position to answer this question. The rationale for sexual segregation actually varies from one tradition to another. It's true that avoiding distraction is a fairly common one, but not myself being a practitioner in the U Ba Khin tradition I don't know whether this is their reason, and if it is, whether it's their sole reason.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 1, 2015 8:54 PM

Title: Re: The question of gender and preference in mixed-gender retreats

Content:

Since what the Goenka people are offering is dhammadāna (i.e. their courses are entirely free), I wouldn't presume to offer them unsolicited advice on what form their gift should take.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 2, 2015 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Is it right to get ordained and let your cats behind.

Content:

Not at all. At most he might show a loss of appetite for a few days if your ex were to feed him with a different brand of cat food and he might be ill at ease if he discovered that his fetching ways didn't have the same effect upon her as they do upon you. But within a week or two he will have completely adapted to his new territory and his new human slave.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 2, 2015 9:21 AM

Title: Re: There is nothing either good or bad ...

Content:

I think that it's hyperbole. If Rosenkrantz and Guildenstern had called upon Hamlet to define his terms and then subjected them to critical analysis, I'm sure the Prince would have eventually found it necessary to formulate his contention in a more moderate form, perhaps as:

"There are a fairly significant number of things that are arguably neither good or bad, notwithstanding the fact that thinking may lead to their being perceived as one or the other."

But this more laboured sentence probably wouldn't have ended up in any anthology of quotations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 2, 2015 5:47 PM

Title: Re: What is the Kamma relate to gender differentiation?

Content:

According to the Abhidhamma the sex-determining faculties of both sexes are produced by wholesome kamma. But where the wholesomeness is strong a male faculty will be produced, and where it is weak, a female one.

Imesu pana dvīsu purisaliṅgaṃ uttamaṃ, itthiliṅgaṃ hīnaṃ. Tasmā purisaliṅgaṃ balavaakusalena antaradhāyati, itthiliṅgaṃ dubbalakusalena patiṭṭhāti. Itthiliṅgaṃ pana antaradhāyantaṃ dubbalaakusalena antaradhāyati, purisaliṅgaṃ balavakusalena patiṭṭhāti. Evaṃ ubhayampi akusalena antaradhāyati, kusaleṇa patiṭṭhātīti veditabbaṃ.

"Of these two [sex-determining faculties] the male is superior, the female is inferior. Therefore the male faculty is made to disappear by strong unwholesomeness, while the female faculty is brought about by weak wholesomeness. However, in disappearing the female faculty does so by weak unwholesomeness. The male faculty is brought about by strong wholesomeness. Thus it should be known that both disappear through unwholesomeness and are brought about by wholesomeness."

(DhsA. 322; Expositor II. 420)

To summarise:

Strong kusala kamma generates the male controlling faculty (purisindriya).

Weak kusala kamma generates the female controlling faculty (itthindriya).

Strong akusala kamma causes the male controlling faculty to disappear.

Weak akusala kamma causes the female controlling faculty to disappear.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Is it right to get ordained and let your cats behind.

Content:

It's an Occam's razor thing and as such is a matter of probability rather than certain knowledge. The most parsimonious ethological explanation for all the characteristic actions of domestic cats is in terms of habituation, sensitization, classical and operant conditioning, etc. And so when some sentimental anthropomorphising cat-owner insists on attributing such and such behaviour of his pet to "love", he is guilty of multiplying entities beyond necessity

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism as "religion"

Content:

Would I be right in thinking that you have never actually tried this yourself? Have you, for example, ever tried asking Bangkok Thais why it is that on certain days of the year they like to offer pigs' heads to the Emerald Buddha at Wat Phra Kaew? Or why they transfer merit to living humans (King Bhumibol, for example) when the Pali texts say that only hungry ghosts can benefit from this? Or why at a Chiang Mai funeral the village headman will knock three times on the coffin before the monks start to chant? Or why at the same occasion the monks will always chant the Abhidhamma mātikā to help the deceased to a good rebirth, even though according to the Abhidhamma this would be pointless because the deceased was already instantaneously reborn immediately after his death?

If you were to try asking such questions as these, you would very seldom get anything like "a reasoned response". The commonest answers would be along the lines of: "Here in Thailand this is just what we do," or "It's our culture to do it like this," or "I do it like this because it's what my granny used to do."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 9:58 AM

Title: Re: What is the Kamma relate to gender differentiation?

Content:

What is being asserted is the superiority of the indriya, not the person.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 1:31 PM

Title: Re: What is the Kamma relate to gender differentiation?

Content:

Buddhaghosa's account of the gender faculties is on pages 419-21 of volume II of The Expositor, Pe Maung Tin's translation of the Atthasālinī. This text is available here:

<http://libgen.org/get.php?md5=0b1aa7d215e2d27560056112c21223b6>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 8:21 PM

Title: Re: What is the Kamma relate to gender differentiation?

Content:

As far as I know it is only in these texts that the OP's question is addressed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 3, 2015 11:39 PM

Title: Re: What is the Kamma relate to gender differentiation?

Content:

That isn't what I said. The propitious circumstances of your birth would no doubt be attributed to the ripening of kusala kamma. My post, however, wasn't concerned with persons at all, but only with the abhidhammic account of two kinds of kamma-originated rūpa: the male-faculty and female-faculty.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2015 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Brahma Viharas=Door to liberation?

Content:

I haven't yet read What the Buddha Thought, where I gather Gombrich expounds his thesis in greater detail. The talk linked to in the OP adds little to what Gombrich said in How Buddhism Began and to me seems every bit as unsatisfactory. Perhaps in his more recent book there'll be a more convincing attempt to address the suttas mentioned by Bhikkhu Bodhi in his review of How Buddhism Began:

Gombrich locates the Buddha's most radical departure from brahminism in his decision to make action or kamma rather than being the key to understanding existential reality. He stresses the revolutionary nature of the Buddha's teaching on kamma, which he says "turned the brahmin ideology upside down and ethicized the universe," thus marking "a turning point in the history of civilisation" (p. 51). Nevertheless, Gombrich carries his comparison between the two systems to an untenable conclusion. In an extended discussion of the Tevijja Sutta (DN No. 13) he contrasts the Buddha's description of the four divine abodes (brahma-vihāra) as the "path to union with Brahmā" with the Upanishadic dictum that the way to attain brahman is through knowledge of the true self. This, he says, once again illustrates the distinction between the ethical standpoint of Buddhism and the ontological orientation of brahminism.

So far, so good. But Gombrich then goes on to argue that for the Buddha "union with

Brahmā” is simply a metaphor for Nibbāna, and thus he concludes “the Buddha taught that kindness ... was a way to salvation” (p. 62). Such an inference, however, cannot stand, for in many texts the Buddha declares the divine abodes to be inadequate for attaining Nibbāna (e.g. DN 17, MN 83, MN 97, etc.); it would also mean that paññā, insight or wisdom, is not needed for final liberation. Gombrich is not unaware of the texts that contradict his position, but he casually dismisses them as the work of “the compilers of other suttas” (p. 61). The contrary evidence, however, is just too weighty to allow such an easy way out.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2015 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Brahma Viharas=Door to liberation?

Content:

The venerable's comments are not about the article but rather Gombrich's "Kamma as a Reaction to Brahminism", one of the chapters in How Buddhism Began. They are perfectly fair and accurate as a statement of Gombrich's main contention about the brahmavihāras in that chapter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2015 7:56 AM

Title: Re: What is a dhamma, according to the Sutta & Vinaya Pitakas?

Content:

The passage is translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi:

"mere poetry composed by poets, beautiful in words and phrases, created by outsiders, spoken by [their] disciples."

His rendering of the part in bold accords with both the commentary and the Chinese Āgama parallel. The passage should not be understood (as some followers of Thanissaro's translation do) to be a warning against relying on the words of the Buddha's disciples, but rather the words of the disciples of outsiders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2015 11:33 AM

Title: Re: What is a dhamma, according to the Sutta & Vinaya Pitakas?

Content:

An old post to Buddha-LISTSERV from Lance Cousins on dhamma and dhammas:

Date: Thu, 24 Feb 1994 14:59:54 EST

From: L S Cousins

Subject: Dhamma/dharma

Well, it has been quite interesting reading the considerable diversity of views on how to

translate dharma. It is by the way in the latest Concise Oxford. The entry gives three meanings:

1. social custom; the right behaviour
 2. the Buddhist truth
 3. the Hindu social or moral law
- [Skr., = decree, custom]

I won't defend this!

I would however like to question the assumption of many that dhamma necessarily has distinct meanings in its major Buddhist (and Hindu?) usages. In two ways:

1. The more trivial is that it is, like many things in Indian literature, often used with quite intentional multiple meanings. This shows up in some of the passages that Richard [Hayes] has recently cited. Should we not suspect it much more often? (This is in addition to the fact that even narrowly defined it often crosses over the boundaries of the English terms we might choose to translate by. So for example the Buddhadharmas which have to be developed certainly include the body of 32 marks as well as mental qualities.)

2. Much more importantly, I want to argue that there are not in fact distinct and wholly separate meanings in such usages as the second refuge, the fourth establishing of mindfulness, dhamma prince, 'dhammaness' (dhammatā), dhamma eye and so on. I question whether, when in the Pali tradition we distinguish dhamma that you study (pariyatti) from dhamma that you practise (paṭipatti) and dhamma that is penetrated (in enlightenment) (paṭivedha), this refers to wholly different dhammas. Surely the difference is in the mode of approach not in Dhamma. Yes, the exegetes of North and South do make distinctions, but I suspect that this is for practical reasons. I suspect that they do not intend to wholly separate Dhamma from dhammas.

For Edward Conze (Buddhist Thought in India p.92 f.) in the Mahāyāna: "the very distinction between dharma and dharmas had to be abandoned." The question for me is whether it was there to be abandoned. (See the discussion of this in Rupert Gethin's The Buddhist Path to Awakening pp. 147-154).

It is difficult to establish this with certainty, but I would postulate that the plural usage actually originates with the Buddha or in early Buddhism. (It doesn't seem to come from Jainism and the later occurrences in brahmanical sources are probably the result of Buddhist influence at some stage.) If so, why has the same word been used in such apparently different ways. Surely the simplest way of accounting for this is that in the Buddha's understanding they are not so different. To keep Richard Hayes happy (or at least to reduce his dukkha), I shall refer to this as the Buddha's ontology. In other words, in the early Buddhist ontology the Dhamma at large and multiple dhammas are one and the same kind of thing.

I suspect that this is an insight that most of the major schools of Buddhism preserved in

one way or another.

What follows for translating? I would argue that if you translate dhamma/dharma separately, you are dividing what Buddhism has often sought to unite. And perhaps thereby falsifying the meaning? Moreover, in actual usage, at least for Ancient India and Southern Buddhism, there is the loss of an important quality which the word necessarily has if one frequently chants it in a devotional context. The best word I can find for that quality would be to speak of its numinosity. This perhaps slightly overstates the case, but in practice the key terms of Buddhism always have a quality which inspires an emotional response and often in practice one which is very moving. The actual value of Buddhist activities for, say the Buddhists of Ceylon or Thailand, often lies in the touch of awe which they associate with things Buddhist.

Lance Cousins

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2015 11:39 AM

Title: Re: What is a dhamma, according to the Sutta & Vinaya Pitakas?

Content:

From the passage in Rupert Gethin's "Path to Awakening" alluded to in the previous post (shorn of specifically abhidhammic content):

In Buddhist thought to take dhamma apart is, I think, to be left with dhammas. Dhamma-vicaya means, then, either the 'discrimination of dhammas' or the 'discernment of dhamma'; to discriminate dhammas is precisely to discern dhamma.

The Pāriḷeyya-sutta is of some interest at this point. A bhikkhu raises the question of what kind of knowing and seeing gives rise to the immediate destruction of the āsavas. The Buddha responds:

Dhamma is taught by me, bhikkhus, by way of discrimination; the four establishings of mindfulness are taught by way of discrimination; the four right endeavours are taught by way of discrimination; the four bases of success are taught by way of discrimination; the five faculties are taught by way of discrimination; the five powers are taught by way of discrimination; the seven awakening-factors are taught by way of discrimination; the noble eight-factored path is taught by way of discrimination. Thus dhamma is taught by me by way of discrimination.

The Buddha then goes on to detail the twenty modes of what is elsewhere called the 'view of individuality' (sakkāya-diṭṭhi). In each case it is pointed out that the formation (saṃkhāra), the craving (taṇhā), the feeling (vedanā), the contact (phassa) and the ignorance (avijjā) which add up to the view of individuality are impermanent, put together, and arisen by way of conditions (aniccā saṃkhatā paṭicca-samuppannā). It is knowing and seeing this that gives rise to immediate destruction of the (āsavas).

The Sanskrit fragments of the Dharmaskandha preserve a parallel to this sutta presented as a quotation from the Pāṭaleya-vyākaraṇa. It presents a number of

variations:

For the sake of discrimination of the five aggregates, bhikṣus, dharmas are taught by me to you, that is to say, the four establishing of mindfulness, the four right endeavours, the four bases of success, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven awakening-factors, the noble eight-factored path.

With regard to dharmas taught by me to you, bhikṣus, for the sake of discrimination of the aggregates, some foolish persons dwell without strong purpose, without strong devotion, without strong affection, without strong delight. Slowly indeed do they contact excellence for the sake of destruction of the āśravas.

With regard to dharmas taught by me to you, bhikṣus, for the sake of discrimination of the aggregates, some sons of families dwell with very strong purpose, with very strong devotion, with very strong affection, with very strong delight. Quickly indeed do they contact excellence for the sake of destruction of the āśravas

The Sanskrit version goes on to discuss the various views of individuality in terms that closely parallel those of the Pāli version (though the phrase concerning the immediate destruction of the āśravas is not found). Both the Pāli and Sanskrit versions focus on the dharma taught by the Buddha as concerned with the discernment of the subtle operation of the view of individuality with regard to the five aggregates; both understand that this is achieved by way of the practice of the dharmas that constitute the seven sets. In other words, the Buddha's teaching is concerned with the interaction of various groupings of dharmas that make up the dharma. Put simply, he teaches the discrimination of dharmas and the discernment of dharma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2015 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Want a little explanation

Content:

.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel282.html>

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2015 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhammattha Sangaha

Content:

Nibbāna in the Abhidhamma is the asaṅkhata-dhamma that is the ārammaṇa cognized by ariyan path-consciousnesses and fruition-consciousnesses. As such it is neither limited to, nor even identifiable with, either sa-upādisesa or anupādisesa Nibbāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2015 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Arahants and physical pain

Content:

Neither is okay by the rules. That's precisely why Ajahn Maha Boowa caused such a stir with his announcement.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2015 5:02 PM

Title: Re: New work on Patīccasamuppāda by Ven. Ñāṇananda

Content:

"I think we have to carefully consider the significance of conceives, and the absence of it in the noble adherent, with reference to the seen, heard, sensed, and cognized. It isn't the information that is culprit to the pathway to suffering, rather it is the imaginings of conceives and ruminations of moves around/evolves etc. that the average person takes up with these."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2015 5:51 AM

Title: Re: We're (almost) all going to hell? (Question on Pansu Suttas: Dust)

Content:

I think what is related in this sutta is no less true of our own time. If it doesn't seem so, then it's probably because of the translator's rendering of vadha as "murder" (i.e. the unlawful killing of humans), though in fact the term means all intentional killing of living beings, including animals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2015 7:42 AM

Title: Re: What is a dhamma, according to the Sutta & Vinaya Pitakas?

Content:

Ettha ca te, mālukyaputta, diṭṭhasutamutaviññātabbesu dhammesu diṭṭhe diṭṭhamattaṃ bhavissati, sute sutamattaṃ bhavissati, mute mutamattaṃ bhavissati, viññāte viññātamattaṃ bhavissati.

“Here, Mālunkyaputta, regarding dhammas seen, heard, sensed, and cognized by you: in the seen there will be merely the seen; in the heard there will be merely the heard; in the sensed there will be merely the sensed; in the cognized there will be merely the cognized.” (SN.iv.73)

Iti kho, bhikkhave, tathāgato diṭṭhasutamutaviññātabbesu dhammesu tādiyeva tādī.

Tamhā ca pana tādīmhā añño tādī uttaritaro vā paṇītataro vā natthīti vadāmi”ti.

“Thus, bhikkhus, being ever stable among dhammas seen, heard, sensed, and cognized, the Tathāgata is a stable one. And, I say, there is no stable one more excellent or sublime than that stable one.” (AN.ii.25)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2015 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Theravada New Year

Content:

Although the first day of the month of Citta (Sanskrit: Caitra) does happen to be the start of a new year in the Theravada monastic calendar, it isn't celebrated in any way at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2015 12:36 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhammattha Sangaha

Content:

Either the term 'nibbāna' denotes an existing dhamma (as the Theravādins hold) or it is just a linguistic convention for a certain absence, i.e., the absence of attachment, aversion and delusion (as the Sautrāntikas held). Given the Theravāda's commitment to the notion of nibbāna as something that really exists, as opposed to being just a manner of speaking, it is quite proper that it be included among the paramattha dhammas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2015 10:53 PM

Title: Re: How India is squandering its top export: The Buddha

Content:

It's true that the Hindus have made the Buddha into the ninth of the ten avatars of Viṣṇu, but he is not in fact held in particularly high regard. In fact he seems to be less revered by them than, say Matsya (Viṣṇu's incarnation as a fish), Kurma (his incarnation as a tortoise), or Varaha (his incarnation as a boar), as evidenced by the fact that whenever the Hindus decide to substitute a local deity like Jagannātha or Viṭhobā for one of the ten avatars, it is always the Buddha who gets dropped from the pantheon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 12:19 AM

Title: Re: Martial Law in Thailand

Content:

Our children deserve education, not indoctrination

Every Thai government has failed to educate our children; they have always tried to indoctrinate them. The indoctrination of children and denying them the freedom to think critically is wholly irresponsible, and in my view, tantamount to child abuse and it must be stopped. This is why I think the argument by the People's Democratic Reform Committee (PDRC) and members of the Bangkok elite against real democracy and universal suffrage is totally disingenuous. Their stance basically rests on the notion that real democracy can't be applied to rural communities, because a democracy requires an informed citizenry to function properly, and communities outside of Bangkok have simply not been educated yet.

<http://www.bangkokpost.com/opinion/opinion/520035/our-children-deserve-education-not-indoctrination>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 12:39 AM

Title: Re: Is fruition attainment found in the early suttas?

Content:

I don't think there is any teaching in detail. It is just mentioned in passing, usually under the names ariyavihāra and paṭisallīna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Is fruition attainment found in the early suttas?

Content:

The practical description of entering the samāpatti is found only in the Visuddhimagga and commentaries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 9:37 AM

Title: Re: Fyodor Shcherbatskoy on Patikkasamuppada

Content:

is a statement about how dharmas were conceived in the Sarvastivada. Or at least it would be if you replaced 'qualities' with 'manifestations'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 9:51 AM

Title: Re: The Pali Canon is Not Original, So What Shall We Do?

Content:

Kindly start a new thread if it's your wish to discuss the Theravada's view of Mahayanist

buddha-manufacturing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 4:51 PM

Title: Re: Are we hypocrites?

Content:

I think there is a confusion here between the original sense of "hypocrite", which means people who pretend to have virtues or principles that they in fact lack (from the Greek ὑποκριτής an actor or pretender), and a more recent colloquial sense where it means people who don't practise what they preach (even if they are perfectly sincere about what they preach).

SarathW appears to be using the word in its older sense and Schaublin in the more recent one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 7:05 PM

Title: Re: Did Ananda attained Nirvana

Content:

The Cūḷavagga (Vin.ii.287) states that the mind of Ven. Ānanda was freed from the cankers when he was in a halfway posture. He cannot be said to have been standing because his feet had left the ground (bhūmito pādā muttā), but nor can he be said to have been lying down, for his head had not yet reached the pillow (appattaṃ sīsaṃ bibbohanaṃ).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 7:10 PM

Title: Re: Why did Theravadins leave the Sangha?

Content:

There are some accounts of the Second Council which report that it ended harmoniously There are others which report that it ended in a schism. There are none which report that it ended with any particular group leaving the sangha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 8, 2015 7:25 PM

Title: Re: Monasteries in Florida.

Content:

Do they? The listed activities aren't suggestive of this.

The wat's parent monastery in Thailand is Wat Somanat, a monastery in the Dusit district of Bangkok, just down the road from where I used to live. Wat Somanat has nothing to do with the forest tradition. It's a city wat where Dhammayutt monks from the south of Thailand will usually go to stay at if they want to study in Bangkok.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 9, 2015 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Monasteries in Florida.

Content:

Sure, but that doesn't mean that Wat Florida has any affiliation with the Thai forest tradition. In the Dhammayuttika Nikaya, as in the Mahanikaya, the huge majority of monks never go anywhere near a forest.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 9, 2015 9:12 AM

Title: Re: Monasteries in Florida.

Content:

You must be thinking of a different Dhammanando. As a layman in the early 1980's I would spend the occasional weekend at Chithurst Forest Monastery when Ajahn Sumedho was still the abbot there, but as a monk I've only been on one day trip to Amaravati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 9, 2015 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Joke!!!

Content:

Reminds me of this Freudian exchange in the hell scene in G.B. Shaw's *Man and Superman*:

DON JUAN. You would rather not meet [your father], probably.

ANA. How dare you say that!

DON JUAN. Oh, that is the usual feeling here. You may remember that on earth—though of course we never confessed it—the death of anyone we knew, even those we liked best, was always mingled with a certain satisfaction at being finally done with them.

ANA. Monster! Never, never!

DON JUAN. [placidly] I see you recognize the feeling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2015 7:55 PM

Title: Re: The root of the question

Content:

But they do. Both those experiencing temporary freedom from defilements and those who have permanently eradicated them are quite capable of remembering their past.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2015 8:06 PM

Title: Re: New Buddhist centre opening in Southend, UK

Content:

No personal acquaintance with it, but there's a thread about the group's supposed lineage on our sister forum:

<http://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?f=53&t=4183>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2015 8:39 PM

Title: Re: The root of the question

Content:

What absolute nonsense you spout. Nobody's memory of the past is limited to recalling past actions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2015 10:04 PM

Title: Re: The root of the question

Content:

Since you did not in your earlier post stipulate a recollection of all past events, it is irrelevant what particular past feelings I can recall. The fact that I can recall some of them is enough to persuade me that when you assert that a presently pure person is unable to recall past defiled states or that a presently defiled person is unable to recall past pure states, you are spouting nonsense.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2015 7:10 AM

Title: Re: The root of the question

Content:

That may, for all I know, be the the case with you, but that doesn't entitle you to assume that everyone's memory is as chronically deficient as your own.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2015 10:51 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Toshiichi Endo, Buddha in Theravada Buddhism - a study of the concept of Buddha in the Pali commentaries

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2015 8:39 PM

Title: Re: 16 Predictions of the Buddha

Content:

Yes, the Mahāsupina Jātaka.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=10807>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2015 7:44 AM

Title: Re: New work on Patīccasamuppāda by Ven. Ñāṇananda

Content:

Nonsense.

The verbs jānāti (to know) and janati, jāneti etc. (to produce) are from completely different roots (ñā and jan) and have nothing to do with each other.

Abhijānāti is by no means limited to iddhis, for although the first five abhiññās are mundane, the sixth is āsavakkhayañāṇa, i.e. an arahant's "knowledge of the extinction of the āsavas".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2015 10:16 AM

Title: Re: New work on Patīccasamuppāda by Ven. Ñāṇananda

Content:

No matter how you see things, in both canonical usage and commentarial definition, the terms āsavakkhaya and arahatta are straightforward synonyms.

Āsavakkhayan ti arahattaṃ.

"Extinction of the cankers" means arahantship.
(AA.iii.259)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 5:20 AM

Title: Re: Why Ordain?

Content:

Though it's true that some monks choose to spend (or in some monasteries are required to spend) much of their time in construction work, this is not obligatory — you're free to ordain in a monastery where the abbot isn't obsessed with building things.

One reason for choosing monasticism is the sort of companionship available to you. As a householder, unless you have an independent source of income, you have to go out to work each day, which means that many hours of each day have to be spent in the company of people who are not kalyāṇamittas. As a monk, by being choosy with whom one associates, one can engineer it so that one enjoys either kalyāṇamittatā or solitude 24/7.

A second reason is that the practice of "carrying the meditation subject" (i.e. keeping it in mind throughout one's waking hours — essential for jhānic deveopment) is only realistically possible for a monk or a householder who doesn't need to work. But most householders do need to work.

A third reason (though one concerned more with the benefit of others than one's own) is to participate in the stewardship of the Sāsana in order to ensure its continuance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 6:40 AM

Title: Re: A list of Theravada teachers that teach a true self?

Content:

I don't think any of these would have described themselves as "Theravada teachers", but they are all prominent in arguing for an interpretation of anattā in the Pali suttas like that which you describe.

Theosophically influenced:

C.A.F. Rhys Davids

Christmas Humphreys

I.B. Horner

Guénonist:

Ananda Coomaraswamy

Vedantists:

K. Bhattacharya
S. Radhakrishnan
R.P. Chowdhury
J.G. Jennings

Idiosyncratic:
R. Zaehner
Joaquín Pérez-Remón

Mahayanist (votary of the Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra):
Tony Page

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 4:28 PM
Title: Re: Why Ordain?
Content:

What is called "carrying the meditation subject" depends upon the maintenance of mindfulness throughout the day, but it's a little more specific than that. It is the manner of jhāna-oriented practice described in detail the <https://www.amazon.com/Discourse-Fruits-Reclusheship-Samannaphala-Commentaries/dp/9552400457>, in which the yogāvacara intent on jhāna "carries" his meditation subject all day long, from the moment of waking up until the moment of going to sleep. "Carrying the meditation subject" means the uninterrupted application of his attention to it. In the event that the yogāvacara has to do some other duty that will require his full attention (and thus prevent the carrying of the meditation subject), he makes a formal resolve to lay the meditation subject down and then pick it up again when the task is completed. Ideally, however, he should try to live in the sort of place where there won't be anything that will require him to put the meditation subject down.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 4:54 PM
Title: Re: Āgamas divergence from Pali Canon, still practiced?
Content:

Yes to the former and no to the latter. There is the odd individual or two —like the Mahayana monk Thích Minh Châu and the Theravadin one Anālayo— who make it their business to study the Āgamas and whose outlook and practice are no doubt informed by them, but there isn't any living tradition based upon them.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 6:11 PM
Title: Re: Why Ordain?

Content:

The commentary to the Sāmaññaphala Sutta has the most detailed account of carrying the meditation subject. Then there are greatly abridged parallel passages in the Sammohavinodanī / Dispeller of Delusion and in the Papañcasūdanī's commentary to the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta. But in the Visuddhimagga it seems to be alluded to in only one paragraph:

“... in order to avoid the delay of foot washing, a pair of single-soled sandals and a walking stick are desirable. Then if the new concentration vanishes through some unsuitable encounter, he can put his sandals on, take his walking stick, and go back to the place to re-apprehend the sign there. When he returns he should seat himself comfortably and develop it by reiterated reaction to it and by striking at it with thought and applied thought.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 8:04 PM

Title: Re: Why Ordain?

Content:

It turns out that the latter is more detailed than I remembered it as being. Here's the translation of Soma Thera:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/soma/wayof.html>

The relevant section begins with the words:

Who is spoken of with the words "This one carries forth and carries back" must be known just through the means of the observance of carrying forth and carrying back (the subject of meditation from the beginning to the end of the journey to and from the village).

and ends with:

Amongst these four that form the set, he who carries forth and carries back the subject of meditation reaches the crest of the clear comprehension of resort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Which Sutta?

Content:

These are the volume and page numbers of the PTS romanized editions.

D i.19 - Brahmajāla Sutta.

iii.31 - Pāṭika Sutta

49 - Udumbarika Sutta

213, 230, 270 sq. - Saṅgīti Sutta

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2015 11:18 PM

Title: Re: Which Sutta?

Content:

In both English translations of the Dīgha (Maurice Walshe's and Rhys Davids) the PTS romanised references are given in square brackets in the body of the text:

Rhys.png (287.27 KiB) Viewed 3569 times

In fact this is the practice with most PTS translations.

So that's one way to find a reference.

A second way is by using the Chaṭṭhasaṅgīti Tipiṭaka CD.

A third way is by going to Access to Insight's Dīgha Nikāya page:

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/dn/index.html>

On this page the reference for the volume and starting page of each Sutta in the PTS romanised edition is given in curly brackets.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 5:20 AM

Title: Re: Which Sutta?

Content:

It's the same Tipiṭaka, but the online version doesn't give any page numbers. The downloadable version gives the page numbers for about half a dozen different versions of the Tipiṭaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 5:41 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

Your question was already answered in the first thread you started. You just didn't like the answer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Why Ordain?

Content:

I'll have to let the North American members field this one as I've never visited any of the countries in the New World and am not in contact with any of the monks living there.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 6:35 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

Whether or not this would count as a stunt (i.e., an exhibition of supernormal power), it would (if it were done to convince people of his arahantship) amount to a declaration of his attainment to unordained people.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 6:46 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

The silly, fruitless and Eeyorish line of questioning that has been your stock-in-trade since joining this forum all seems to be premised on the notion that an arahant has something to prove — that he would feel it imperative to persuade people of his attainment and would stop at nothing to arouse faith in them. But why assume any such thing?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 6:57 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

Nonsense. It would not be persuasive to those for whom the Dhamma is intended ("beings with but little dust in their eyes"; "the wise"), but only to the sort of credulous dimwits who'll go running after any tuppenny ha'penny Hindu sadhu who knows a few conjuring tricks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

And by the way, once again you haven't answered the question. Let me put it another way: from where have you obtained your conception of what an arahant is and how he would behave? It certainly doesn't seem that the Buddha's teaching is your source.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

And so in this (which will be my last reply to you) I should like to commend for your attention Rune Johansson's book

http://www.ahandfulofleaves.org/documents/The%20Psychology%20of%20Nirvana_Johansson_1969_OPT.pdf, a somewhat dated, but still valuable, survey of how the Pali Suttas describe arahants.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach the paramis?

Content:

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel409.html>

<http://holybooks.lichtenbergpress.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/A-Manual-of-the-Excellent-Man.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 12:20 PM

Title: Re: the great Nibbana = annihilation, eternal, or something else thread

Content:

Yes.

Anusayasutta (SN.ii.252)

Apagatasutta (SN.ii.253)

Upatissasutta (SN.ii.275)

Rādhassutta (SN.iii.79-80)

Surādhassutta (SN.iii.80-1)

Puṇṇamasutta (SN.iii.100-104)

Rāhulasutta (SN.iii.135-6)

Dutiyarāhulasutta (SN.iii.136-7)

Kappasutta (SN.iii.169)

Dutiyakappasutta (SN.iii.169-70)

Vivekajasutta (SN.iii.235-6)
Avitakkasutta (SN.iii.236)
Pītisutta (SN.iii.236-7)
Upekkhāsutta (SN.iii.237)
Nirodhasamāpattisutta (SN.iii.238)
Upasena-āsivisasutta (SN.iv.40-1)

Ānandasutta (AN.i.132-3)
Sāriputtasutta (AN.i.133-4)
Atammayasutta (AN.iii.444)
Dutiyasaññāsutta (AN.iv.46-53)

Tatiyanānātitthiyasutta (Ud. 70)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 2:45 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach the paramis?

Content:

Thanks for the notice, bhante; I'll bear it in mind on future occasions. On this occasion I had just posted the first link that Google came up with.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2015 7:32 PM

Title: Re: A Manual of the Excellent Man

Content:

Yes bhante, that would seem to be in line with the Anguttara Commentary's gloss on soceyya:

“Soceyyan” ti sīlavasena sucibhāvo.

“Purity” means a pure state with respect to moral habit.

(AA.ii.161)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2015 6:18 AM

Title: Re: The surprising downsides of being clever

Content:

A couple of recent articles from the Guardian and Washington Post...

<https://www.theguardian.com/education/2015/mar/31/finnish-teachers-special-train-teach>

<http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/answer-sheet/wp/2015/02/12/teach-for-finland-why-it-wont-happen/>

It seems that in Finland only 1 in 10 of those who want to be school teachers are accepted for training, and those selected are not the most academically able[*] but rather the ones who are most passionate about wanting to teach.

[*] Though they can't be academically weak, for even to teach in a Finnish primary school you need a master's degree.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2015 3:36 PM

Title: Pseudo-Pilgrims by Ven. Ananda Maitreya

Content:

I was recently searching for a copy of Pseudo-Pilgrims, a parable that was often told by the late Sri Lankan monk Ven. Ananda Maitreya (Bhikkhu Bodhi's preceptor). It was published in the Middle Way back in the late 1980's or early 1990's. Though I wasn't able to find the original, I did come across a revised and expanded version of it under a different title. Here is a link to it...

<http://buddhismnow.com/2011/10/28/forest-and-the-way-out-by-ananda-maitreya/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2015 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Is Mandrian useful in Southeast Asia / Theravada Countries?

Content:

Thai, Burmese or Sinhala, depending on which country's Buddhism most appeals to you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2015 3:15 AM

Title: Re: When to use Saddhiṃ/saha?

Content:

Probably not. In the Vinaya Piṭaka both are defined as ekato, "together".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2015 3:49 AM

Title: Re: When to use Saddhiṃ/saha?

Content:

It means that each of the two particles means "together".

As with any two synonymous words, there will no doubt be idiomatic conventions governing when to use one and when the other, and when it's a matter of indifference which one is used. As far as I know, however, the usage of the two terms has never been thoroughly surveyed with a view to describing these conventions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2015 6:32 AM

Title: Re: Question for those who have traveled internationally on a personal retreat

Content:

It's fine if you're willing to pay whatever it takes to make your trip as hassle-free as possible. On the other hand, if minimal costs are more important to you, then...

You'll save a lot on airfare if you buy a return ticket to Bangkok and then a return ticket from Bangkok to Yangon from one of the Sikh-owned bucket shops in <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Phahurat>.

And you'll save a lot if you skip the health insurance. The odds are that you won't need hospital treatment, but even if you do, the odds are that your hospital bill will be less than what you've paid in insurance premiums, provided that you go to a state hospital.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2015 3:51 PM

Title: Re: What does "sa" in "saññā" mean?

Content:

I think Gombrich's "apperception" is the most accurate rendering, with de la Vallée Poussin's "la notion" coming a close second.

APPERCEPTION

3. a.3.a Psychol. The action or fact of becoming conscious by subsequent reflection of a perception already experienced; any act or process by which the mind unites and assimilates a particular idea (esp. one newly presented) to a larger set or mass of ideas (already possessed), so as to comprehend it as part of the whole: see quotes.

1876 J. Sully in *Mind* Jan. 36 The entrance of a presentation into the internal field of view is termed a Perception; its entrance into the point of view an Apperception.

1887 J. Dewey *Psychol.* 89 Apperception is the relating activity which combines the various sensuous elements presented to the mind at one time into a whole, and which unites these wholes, recurring at successive times, into a continuous mental life, thereby making psychical life intelligent.

1893 C. De Garmo et al. tr. Lange's Apperception (1896) 28 Apperception is the subsumption of a notion, usually newly given and more or less individual, under a predicate which is more complete..and..usually older and more familiar. Apperception does not always follow perception immediately, for years sometimes intervene between the learning of a fact and its comprehension.

1923 H. G. Baynes tr. Jung's Psychol. Types xi. 524 Apperception is a psychic process by which a new content is articulated to similar already-existing contents in such a way as to be understood, apprehended, or clear.
(Oxford English Dictionary)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 6:34 AM

Title: Re: One Buddha < a few Buddhas?

Content:

I enquired of a friend who used to be a Tibetan-ordained monk but is now a secular Buddhist. Apparently if you do the practices that BuddhaFollower believes in, when you look in a mirror you won't see your body as it is, but will instead see an hallucination of a body that is gradually acquiring the 32 marks, starting with the uṣṇiṣa on the crown of the head.

mirror1.jpg (204.87 KiB) Viewed 1603 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 4:28 PM

Title: Re: Problem with AN 5:57

Content:

It's earliest recorded name, still used in the Sinhalese Tipiṭaka, is just Ṭhānasutta. In the Burmese Fifth Council Tipiṭaka this is expanded to Abhiṇḥapaccavekkhitabbaṭhānasutta. Upajjhaṭhānasutta is a mistake by Ven. Thanissaro. This is actually one form of the name of the preceding sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 4:50 PM

Title: Re: NYC schools will start observing Muslim holidays next year

Content:

I beg to differ — it has everything to do with Islam.

"After years of advocating by New York City's Muslim community, Muslim public school students will finally and thankfully no longer be penalized for observing their religious holidays," said Zead Ramadan, a board member of the Council on American-Islamic Relations.

Among culturally alien minority groups in western countries, who but the Muslims would be so arrogant and immodest as to go issuing these sort of demands? And who but the Muslims could do so in the full assurance that the authorities would cravenly and spinelessly cave in to their demands? If Hindus, Sikhs or Buddhists demanded that their religious holidays be acknowledged, they wouldn't be given the time of day.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 5:54 PM

Title: Re: Problem with AN 5:57

Content:

Yes, I get two and half thousand hits, including the Wikipedia entry for the sutta.

I checked with the PTS and Royal Siamese editions of the Tipiṭaka (the latter is the edition from which Thanissaro usually translates), to see if he is just repeating an earlier error. The Thais, however, give its name as Ṭhānasutta, just like the Sinhalese. In the PTS edition it is not given any name in the body of the text, but the Uddāna (summary of suttas) at the end of the Nīvaraṇavagga reads:

Āvaraṇaṃ rāsi aṅgāni samayaṃ ca mātuputtikā

Upajjhāṭṭhānā kumārā Licchavī apare duve ti.

My best guess is that the word "upajjhāṭṭhānā" has been taken by Thanissaro to be the name of a single sutta. However, every non-PTS edition gives it as two words: upajjhā + ṭhānā, each of them a key word in sutta 56 and sutta 57 respectively. There's no other construal that will make the numbers add up. Thus:

1. āvaraṇaṃ = Āvaraṇasutta
2. rāsi = Akusalarāsisutta
3. aṅgāni = Padhāniyaṅgasutta
4. samayaṃ = Samayasutta
5. mātuputtikā = Mātāputtasutta
6. upajjhā = Upajjhāyasutta
7. ṭhānā = Abhiṇhapaccavekkhitabbaṭṭhānasutta
8. kumārā licchavī = Licchavikumārakasutta

apare duve ("another two") =

9. Paṭhamavuḍḍhapabbajitasutta
10. Dutiyavuḍḍhapabbajitasutta

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 8:45 PM
Title: Nivarana - the Box of Desires
Content:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 17, 2015 9:28 PM
Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community
Content:

Apparajakkhajātika, "having but little dust in one's eyes", is defined in the commentaries as having an eye of understanding that is relatively unshrouded by attachment, aversion and delusion. Whether a person fits this description cannot be known from his occupation.

On the other hand, that a person does not fit this description can be known, inter alia, from his persistence in asking stupid questions.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 18, 2015 9:26 AM
Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community
Content:
And?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 18, 2015 10:12 AM
Title: Re: U.K General Election
Content:
Interesting developments in Pakistan...

Christians in Pakistan pray for Nigel Farage and Ukip to win general election

Pastor Francis Bashir says Ukip are the only party that stand up for Christians and the Commonwealth

JACK SIMPSON Thursday 16 April 2015

The growth in popularity of Ukip in the last few years has been massive.

But now it appears the party's appeal spreads far further than first thought - and well beyond the UK's borders.

A bizarre new video shows a congregation of Pakistani Christians praying for Nigel Farage and Ukip in a bid to help them gain victory in the general election.

In the footage, members of Lahore's Royal Disciple Church are seen chanting, "We love you Sir Nigel Farage", as they pray towards a large poster of the party's leader above the caption, "God made you successful....Our prayers is with you to all members of UKIP (sic)."

And according to the church's leader, the support is not down to any points-based immigration system or call for an in-out referendum.

Instead, Pastor Francis Bashir says he is putting his support behind Ukip because it stands up for Christians and the Commonwealth.

Pakistan's Christian community of 2.5 million has been the target of increased persecution in recent times, with the number of attacks against its members increasing in regularity.

Last month saw at least 14 people die and dozens more injured in twin bombings at two churches in Lahore. Other similar attacks have left Pakistani Christians fearing for their safety.

According to Bashir, he was first made aware of Ukip when someone on Facebook asked him to pray for the party and was impressed by Farage's pledge to stand up for Judeo-Christian values.

Bashir got his son to call Farage and said that after the leader personally answered the call, the "love in the church's hearts for him increased."

Since then, Bashir has covered the church in Ukip's purple colours and conducts regular services in which churchgoers are asked to pray for Farage.

Responding to the support, Mr Farage said he was "very touched by the prayers".

<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/christians-in-pakistan-pray-for-nigel-farage-and-ukip-to-win-general-election--video-10180885.html>

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
```


document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e, s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 18, 2015 7:29 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

A “failed leftist revolution” in Britain?!? It must have been so dainty and ethereal a revolution that it passed by completely unnoticed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 18, 2015 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Dana, sila, bhavana - sutta reference?

Content:

They are classed under the name of puññakiriyavatthu, "bases for meritorious action". There are three sources: the Dīgha Nikāya's Saṅgīti Sutta, which merely lists them, and then the two Puññakiriyavatthu Suttas, one from the Anguttara Nikāya and the other from the Itivuttaka.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.36>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/it60>

This was said by the Lord...

“Bhikkhus, there are these three grounds for making merit. What three? The ground for making merit consisting in giving, the ground for making merit consisting in virtue, and the ground for making merit consisting in mind-development. These are the three.”

One should train in deeds of merit
That yield long-lasting happiness:
Generosity, a balanced life,
Developing a loving mind.
By cultivating these three things,
Deeds yielding happiness,
The wise person is reborn in bliss
In an untroubled happy world.

(Iti. 60. Ireland tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 18, 2015 11:27 PM

Title: Re: The suffix "pi": jātipi, jarāpi, vyādhapi...

Content:

Well, neither statement is really a translation of anything that the Buddha is reported as saying. Each one is no more than a proposed paraphrase.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2015 2:46 PM

Title: Free Guide to Myanmar

Content:

The Golden Path - A Myanmar Guide for Dhamma Seekers

by Joah McGee.

Description

The Golden Path, or Shwe Lan Ga Lay, is a unique guide for Dhamma seekers who wish to develop in paṭipatti (practice) and pariyatti (theory) while in Myanmar, as well as to gain an appreciation of Burmese Buddhist and monastic life. Helpful logistical information is supplemented with yogi anecdotes, historical background, scholarly research, authentic local voices, Burmese proverbs, original artwork, inspiring photographs, and wisdom from some of the country's foremost monks, nuns, and meditation teachers.

Part 1: Planning and Logistics consists of four chapters: "Planning Your Trip," "Health," "You've Landed," and "Food." Future editions will include detailed information covering hundreds of important monasteries, pagodas, and other sites throughout the Golden Land, as well as comprehensive discussion on proper behavior and customs while visiting these Burmese monastic sites, along with other cultural information.

This PDF (70MB) is printable to help facilitate those traveling. It can also be read on any eBook reader which can display PDF files, and on computers.

http://store.pariyatti.org/The-Golden-Path--PDF-eBook_p_4810.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2015 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

In parts of Thailand too. On the Chiang Mai to Phrao bus there is now a sign prohibiting pets, durians and strong-smelling fish. Of course they're not as serious about enforcing it as the Singaporeans are. Whenever I take the temple cats and dogs for their injections,

the bus conductress just turns a blind eye.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2015 5:45 PM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

Preferring merit to money, the vet already gives injections free of charge to any animals that I bring to her. But as she has never offered to come to the monastery to do it, if I asked her I would feel it necessary to make arrangements for her to be reimbursed. But given that a trip up to the mountain where I live would take her away from her surgery for almost a whole day, I suspect the fees would be rather more than our lay committee would be willing to pay.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2015 6:21 PM

Title: Re: Two Versions of Abhidhamma

Content:

The seven books of the Sarvastivada Abhidharma still survive. It's just that they are very little studied. When Tibetan Buddhists study the Sarvastivada Abhidharma they do so using compendiums and commentaries composed in a later period than the Sarvastivada Abhidharma Piṭaka. Similarly, in the Theravada the Abhidhamma is traditionally taught starting with a late compendium, Anuruddha's Abhidhammatthasangaha. The Abhidhamma Piṭaka is studied only later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2015 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Why is Tibetan Buddhism more popular than Theravada in the west?

Content:

I would suggest two further factors besides those already mentioned:

Lobsang Rampa's https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Third_Eye_%28book%29 (for the English-speaking world).

The Belgian cartoonist Georges Remi's 1960 classic, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tintin_in_Tibet (for the Buddhists of Southern Europe).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 20, 2015 11:54 AM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

The law cited in the article dates from the 1950s and seems to be a Thai equivalent of what in Britain would be the Misrepresentation of Goods Act of 1967. The underlying logic is that since no customer would knowingly buy an underripe durian (for unlike an unripe banana, an unripe durian is absolutely useless), every customer's default assumption will be that any durian offered for sale will be ripe; therefore anybody offering a durian for sale is assumed under the law to be claiming (even if only tacitly and by implication) that the fruit in question is a ripe one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 20, 2015 3:14 PM

Title: Re: The Dhamma eye: "whatever aising-dhamma cessation-dhamma"

Content:

Samaṇa Sutta (AN. ii. 238)

“Bhikkhus, ‘only here is there an ascetic, a second ascetic, a third ascetic, and a fourth ascetic. The other sects are empty of ascetics.’ It is in such a way that you should rightly roar your lion’s roar.

(1) “And what, bhikkhus, is the first ascetic? Here, with the utter destruction of three fetters, a bhikkhu is a stream-enterer, no longer subject to [rebirth in] the lower world, fixed in destiny, heading for enlightenment. This is the first ascetic.

(2) “And what is the second ascetic? Here, with the utter destruction of three fetters and with the diminishing of greed, hatred, and delusion, a bhikkhu is a once-returner who, after coming back to this world only one more time, will make an end of suffering. This is the second ascetic.

(3) “And what is the third ascetic? Here, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, a bhikkhu is of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without returning from that world. This is the third ascetic.

(4) “And what is the fourth ascetic? Here, with the destruction of the taints, a bhikkhu has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, and having entered upon it, he dwells in it. This is the fourth ascetic.

“Bhikkhus, ‘only here is there an ascetic, a second ascetic, a third ascetic, and a fourth ascetic. The other sects are empty of ascetics.’ It is in such a way that you should rightly roar your lion’s roar.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 21, 2015 6:41 AM

Title: Re: When a western monk is sick in Thailand...

Content:

A western monk is sure to have an easy time if:

- He has health insurance, or...
- He uses money and has plenty of it, or...
- He is part of some outfit like the Ajahn Chah tradition which has an abundance of wealthy lay supporters, or...
- He has a personal lay supporter of unlimited means who has offered to pay for any medical expenses he may incur. (Usually he would need to have been a monk for many years before anyone made an offer like this).

If he is not in any of these categories then his choice is between the Sangha Hospital in Bangkok and the country's state hospitals.

In the Sangha Hospital everything is free for monks. Unfortunately the place is seriously underfunded and though it maintains a very fine ICU and a passable dentistry department, nearly everything else there is substandard. A monk would be ill-advised to go there except for the most routine treatments.

As for the state hospitals, these are generally good in the larger cities but the small town hospitals are best avoided. At present most, though not all, maladies are treated free of charge for monks.

The kind of monk who might have difficulties is one who needs to take some expensive medication on a permanent basis. Hospitals prescribe medicines free of charge for monks only if they are very cheap, like Paracetamol or the commoner antibiotics, or are needed to keep the monk alive. Anything in between (e.g. expensive psychiatric medication) would probably have to be paid for and there's no guarantee that your monastery will be willing to do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 21, 2015 7:43 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

I already stated in my earlier post that it cannot be inferred from someone's occupation whether he is the sort of person ("one with but little dust in his eyes") for whom the Dhamma is intended.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 21, 2015 1:57 PM

Title: Re: Sutta search

Content:

The Saḷāyatanaṭṭhapaṇṇa Sutta, MN. 137.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 21, 2015 4:12 PM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

Just a link for anyone who may be wondering what the waxing syllables principle is all about...

<https://www.buddhismuskunde.uni-hamburg.de/pdf/5-personen/analayo/encyclopedia-entries/waxing.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 12:02 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

In general it's not a judgment that I would bother to make, for since at the present time I'm neither looking for a teacher nor taking on students, it's a matter of indifference to me whether anyone I meet is wise or not. If, however, it were not a matter of indifference, then I would gauge a person's wisdom by the questions she asks, by the sort of things that she values, and by how dispassionate and equanimous she is in the face of worldly vicissitudes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

They're a very expensive fruit. Buying one and later discovering it to be unripe is like buying a diamond and discovering it to be glass.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

No, they have to ripen on the tree. If it's unripe it means it was blown down by the wind. I believe in Malaysia they have some recipes for unripe durian, but the Thais either throw them away or try to sell them to non-connoisseurs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 7:25 AM

Title: Re: Open letter to the English Theravada Buddhist community

Content:

Since you wished to know how *I* would understand if a person is wise, it goes without saying that it would be I who decides.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 11:01 AM

Title: Re: A list of Theravada teachers that teach a true self?

Content:

What I referred to as "relatively orthodox strains of Theravada Buddhism" are also yogic traditions, but without the anti-pariyatti prejudice that's conspicuous in much of the forest tradition, and therefore characterized by a much greater concern for right view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 22, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: Jail time for selling unripe fruit.

Content:

It's about misrepresentation of what you're selling. A prison sentence is the maximum possible penalty for breaking the law that prohibits this. In practice, however, it's very unlikely that anyone would actually be sent to prison for selling unripe durians unless they were doing it systematically and on a large scale, or if they were doing it with durians for export (and thereby damaging the good name of Thai durian-growers). In less serious cases an on-the-spot fine would be the usual penalty.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 8:52 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination as Process (or not).

Content:

He was aware of it and alluded to it in his second letter to Irene Quittner, but clearly didn't accept it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 1:02 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

You haven't given the full link.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 3:48 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

Yes, inasmuch as the separatedness of the Theravada is basically rooted in the Vinaya's prescriptions for handling disputes and for ostracizing any bhikkhu or groups of bhikkhus which are incorrigible in view or recalcitrant in conduct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

No, at least not emically.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 3:58 PM

Title: Re: My guardian angel contacted me and my fiance

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 4:37 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

Because of the various English words for an association of persons, it was "club" that struck me as being the second best. The best would probably be sodality, but I decided not to use it as some non-native speakers of English might be unfamiliar with it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 4:52 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

The Dharmaguptaka does not exist any more as a Buddhist doctrinal school. It exists only as a monastic ordination lineage whose ordained members espouse Mahayana doctrines and engage in Mahayana practices.

Now if it were the case that the Dharmaguptaka school still held to Dharmaguptaka doctrines, then its difference from the Theravada would be very slight indeed. If memory serves me right, the doctrinal disagreements between the two schools were few in number and confined to relatively minor and arcane matters, such as the question of whether it's more meritorious to give a gift to a Buddha or to the bhikkhusangha. However, since the Dharmaguptaka is now wholly in the hands of Mahayana Buddhists, it differs very drastically from the Theravada.

Edit:

Similar considerations apply also to the Mulasarvastivada lineage of Tibet, though with the difference that even before this lineage had been taken over by the Mahayanists its doctrinal differences with the Theravada were a lot more momentous than those of the Dharmaguptaka with the Theravada.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

I would say that there is: (1) a sense in which the two lineages are not distinct, (2) a sense in which they are distinct, and (3) a sense in which it is a moot point whether they are distinct or not distinct.

To expand on this...

1. Assuming that the Buddha founded only one bhikkhu-sangha (and everybody except the Tibetans does assume this) and that both the Theravada and the Dhammaguttikas are descended in an unbroken lineage from that original bhikkhusangha, then obviously they are not distinct — the two lineages proceed from a common origin.

On the other hand...

2. Given that monastics in the two lineages have lived for many centuries in (more or less) geographical isolation from each other; given that even when living in close proximity to each other there is no record of their ever getting together to carry out joint sanghakammas (nor even discussing the possibility of doing so); given that one lineage has retained mainstream Indian Buddhist teachings while the other has embraced Mahayanism; given that one lineage has retained the same Vinaya throughout while the other has liberally modified it to suit East Asian conditions, etc. etc., the lineages as living traditions are distinct in the sense of having far more differences than points in common.

And finally...

3. The sense in which it is a point of dispute whether the two lineages are distinct or not distinct arises in connection with the subject of this thread.

On the one hand there are liberal bhikkhus who favour the revival of the bhikkhuni-sangha and believe that this can be done (and in recent years has been done) by cooperating with Dhammaguttika bhikshunis. On the other hand there are conservative bhikkhus who believe either that the bhikkhuni-sangha cannot be revived at all, or, that it cannot be revived in this particular way (though they would be amenable to bhikkhuni ordinations that were carried out by the Theravada bhikkhu-sangha alone).

In defence of their position, conservative bhikkhus will take their stand on the Theravada's official history of early Buddhist sectarianism as given in the *Dīpavaṃsa* and later repeated in the *Katthāvatthu Atthakathā*. According to this all of the non-Theravadin schools are schismatical. The Theravada is compared to a tree, and the other schools to thorns sprouting on the tree. Regarding the Dhammaguttikas, the official history says that the Mahisāsakas and the Vajjiputtakas broke away from the Theravada in the second century after the Parinibbana, and later the Sabbatthivādins and Dhammaguttikas broke away from the Mahisāsakas. That being so, the doubly schismatical pedigree of the Dhammaguttikas makes them unfit people to carry out sanghakammas with.

In reply, those bhikkhus who support cooperation with Dhammaguttika bhikshunis will justify their position by rejecting the Theravada's official history and championing an alternative one. This alternative one is derived from academic scholarship based on a study of the surviving chronicles of all the Buddhist schools, but without privileging any particular one of them, archaeological evidence, etc. In the revisionist history, the origin of separate schools is treated as a more or less benign development that is unlikely to have involved schism in the strict Vinaya sense. And so according to this view, Theravadin cooperation with Dhammaguttikas in ordinations or other sanghakammas would not constitute any sort of infraction and the outcomes would be lawful and valid.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 23, 2015 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

I can't think of any advantages. The main disadvantage is that for many of the club members the charismatic teacher will end up becoming more important than the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 6:28 AM

Title: Re: Duration of sasana and interval between Buddhas?

Content:

If he believes in this, then it's more than likely that he will be the sort of Buddhist who accepts the Buddhist world-view in its totality. And so the perspective from which he is looking at things will be one in which striving ardently is really the only worthwhile thing to do, no matter whether the fruit of that striving will be obtained in the present life or the next life or not for another billion lives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 7:11 AM

Title: Re: Right Speech and Sarcasm

Content:

I think that in practice sarcasm —the use of irony to mock someone— is more often than not wrong speech, but needn't always be:

“Venerable sir, I have such confidence in the Blessed One that I believe there has not been nor ever will be nor exists at present another ascetic or brahmin more knowledgeable than the Blessed One with respect to enlightenment.”

“Lofty indeed is this bellowing utterance of yours, Sāriputta, you have roared a definitive, categorical lion’s roar: ‘Venerable sir, I have such confidence in the Blessed One that I believe there has not been nor ever will be nor exists at present another ascetic or brahmin more knowledgeable than the Blessed One with respect to enlightenment.’ Have you now, Sāriputta, encompassed with your mind the minds of all the Arahants, the Perfectly Enlightened Ones, arisen in the past and known thus: ‘Those Blessed Ones were of such virtue, or of such qualities, or of such wisdom, or of such dwellings, or of such liberation’?”

(Nālandā Sutta, tr. Bodhi)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 7:23 AM

Title: Re: Right Speech and Sarcasm

Content:

Yes, like when the Buddha is dealing with brahmins who are so bloated with caste-conceit as to be unteachable. He uses sarcasm to get them off their high horses and then he teaches them Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 7:47 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

The Thais are very hospitable to foreign monks, even Mahayana ones. I've never heard of anyone being turned away. As to how long you'd be allowed to stay, typically it would be like this:

Dhammayuttika Nikaya wats: as long as you like outside the vassa. If you want to stay for vassa then you'd need to re-ordain as a Dhammayutt.

Mahanikaya wats — mainstream: as long as you like, subject to availability of accommodation. You wouldn't be required to re-ordain unless you were a Mahayana monk and wanted to stay for the vassa.

Mahanikaya wats — non-mainstream: very variable. Long-term residence will be dependent on the visiting monk's willingness to get with the program in some way or another. For example, at Wat Dhammakaya and at vipassanā centres they'll expect you to take up their particular meditation method; at some study monasteries you'll be obliged to enroll in a course; at Ajahn Chah wats they'll expect you to take up their manner of Vinaya observance, quirky way of wearing the lower robe, etc. If you're not willing to adapt then you'll only be granted residence for a short period — perhaps no more than the three nights that the law requires.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 8:31 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahm on why he was excommunicated

Content:

In those monasteries that make provision for nuns, they will normally have either their own building or their own section of the monastery with individual chalets. It's quite rare to find monks and nuns sleeping in the same building, though it happens in some places.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 10:18 AM

Title: Re: Ruth Denison, RIP

Content:

Robert Beatty's youtube channel has videos of the memorial service for Ruth on March 21st.

https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCwKROYpJjk5QrHs_bHWkbVQ/videos

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 10:50 AM

Title: Re: Kamma and the ending of Kamma

Content:

.

<http://gen.lib.rus.ec/scimag/index.php?s=karmic+nirvanic>

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 12:09 PM
Title: Re: Global Warming: Recent Data
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 2:38 PM
Title: Re: Kamma and the ending of Kamma
Content:

In a nutshell, Aronson rejects the notion popularized by Melford Spiro and Winston King of there being a complete disjuncture between Buddhism as a path of merit-accumulation leading to good rebirths and Buddhism as a path of renunciation leading to Nibbāna.

I've split the file into 3 for those with slow connections.

[./download/file.php?id=2564](#)
(421.76 KiB) Downloaded 36 times

[./download/file.php?id=2565](#)
(420.9 KiB) Downloaded 27 times

[./download/file.php?id=2566](#)
(365.91 KiB) Downloaded 26 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2015 3:24 PM
Title: Re: DN 31: Sīgālovāda Sutta - Malevolence, Meaninglessness
Content:

Anatthatā.

Thomas Rhys Davids and Maurice Walshe both translate it as "doing harm". These translations, together with that of Rev. Nārada and Nyanaponika's German one ("Schaden anzustiften froh"), all follow the commentary in taking attha (a word with many meanings) to mean "welfare", and so anattha here means "non-welfare" or "harm".

John Kelly and his colleagues have opted to take attha in the sense of "meaning", which leads them to a translation that's not really very meaningful at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 7:07 AM

Title: Re: Question about Mahasi tradition

Content:

From conversations with the late Dr. Rewata Dhamma I understand that Mahasi Sayadaw was on cordial terms with both U Ba Khin and Sri Goenka, but this is the first I've heard about a supposed teacher-pupil relationship between them. But probably Ven. Pesala would know better than I.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 7:30 AM

Title: Re: watching porn can be adultery?

Content:

Buddhaghosa was of the opinion that the age of 40-50 is the optimal decade of a person's life for developing insight. Sad to say, in my case that means I have only another 41 days to go before I exit my forties and enter the Kali Yuga of my life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 8:20 AM

Title: Re: watching porn can be adultery?

Content:

That old age is sub-optimal for the development of insight finds some support in the Anguttara Nikāya, which has several suttas about the drawbacks of old men becoming monks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 10:41 AM

Title: Re: watching porn can be adultery?

Content:

It seems to me that your conception of the the brahmacariyā is informed primarily (and almost wholly) by Hindu notions, and only secondarily (and almost incidentally) by the Buddha's teaching. In the latter the mind is what it's all about and the yogic preoccupation with physiological matters is almost wholly absent.

Take menstruation, for example. In contrast with Hindu Yoga texts (and even more so with Jewish and Islamic ones) where there are reams and reams of prescriptions and discussions about purity taboos, the appropriate sequestering of a menstruating female, and the ritual ablutions and suchlike that she has to perform to regain her purity, in the Vinaya Piṭaka the Buddha takes no more than two paragraphs to deal with the matter. The first is an allowance for menstruating bhikkhunis to make use of a sanitary cloth; the second is a specification as to the cloth's size. That's all he found it necessary to say on the subject.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 10:45 AM

Title: Re: watching porn can be adultery?

Content:

Apology accepted, and thanks for clarifying your intention.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2015 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Question about Mahasi tradition

Content:

You too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 27, 2015 7:57 AM

Title: Re: When a western monk is sick in Thailand...

Content:

We are treated exactly the same as Thai monks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 28, 2015 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Devahood & Humanhood

Content:

You seem to be thinking about rebirth more in the manner of a Theosophist than a Buddhist. Buddhist saṃsāra is not evolutionary, has no telos, but is simply pointless. Every rebirth is a dead end.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 28, 2015 9:16 AM

Title: Re: Devahood & Humanhood

Content:

Except in the unique case of a Bodhisatta (of whom it is said that Tusita is always the abode of his penultimate life), rebirth in the Tusita heaven, like rebirth in any sensual heaven, has no special significance. It's simply where some beings end up if they've performed the right kind of meritorious kammass. When their lifespan as Tusita devas is exhausted then they pass away and go to some other destination — a good one if they are ariyans, usually a bad one if they are non-ariyans, and always a bad one if they are non-ariyans with wrong view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 28, 2015 2:47 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

To See the Truth

by Ajahn Pramote Pamojjo

<http://www.dhamma.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/To-See-the-Truth.pdf>

Unusual to find a monk who identifies with the Ajahn Mun forest tradition yet grounds his meditation instructions in Abhidhammic momentarism:

"The first [aspect of watching the mind] is to avoid intending to know in advance. We just need to know the feelings that temporarily arise in the mind after they do. Let the feeling occur naturally first and then know that it has. If anger arises, know that it has. If greed arises, then know that it has. If the mind has wandered off, know that this has happened. Why must we know after the fact? This is because many of the feelings that arise are defilements of mind. Only one mind arises at a time, so a defiled mind cannot arise at the same time as a non-defiled mind. For example, anger cannot exist in the mind at the same moment that the mindfulness notices the anger. The defiled angry mind drops off and is replaced by a non-defiled mind – the one that is mindful of what just happened.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 28, 2015 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Strange search results for Nanavira

Content:

If you go to the cached page you'll see that it's drenched in adware links advertising Viagra and suchlike. See text in bold:

The aim of this web site is to make more widely available the writings of the late Ven. Ñāṇavīra Thera which, though of purchase cialis next day delivery extraordinary quality and cialis tablets sale issues depth, do not—for different reasons—attract any of the established Buddhist publishers. It is presented as a dhammadāna (gift of Dhamma) and with a deep sense of gratitude by individuals whose lives were significantly affected by an encounter with these writings, in the hope that others, too, might appreciate the right-view guidance which is offered therein. It cannot be expected that this material, which poses a clear challenge to the mainstream version of Buddhism, will gain any great popularity among the it's great! high quality levitra majority of Buddhists—Eastern or Western—but at least it can suggest an alternative approach to the Buddha's original Teaching, and perhaps serve as a useful eye-opener for those seeking an understanding of its more fundamental principles. It can also communicate the attitude of newsletter generic viagra canadian pharmacies earnestness towards Dhamma practice, which is regarded not merely as a matter of choice but rather an existential necessity. For without this basic attitude, the practice of Buddhist meditation will remain in the worldly sphere and will never be able tonolvadex without prescription bear the fruits of noble insight leading to liberation from the 'world'.

But if you go to the present page it's free of it all. So I guess the Google snapshot is from a day when the junk hadn't yet been cleared.

And if you search for "purchase cialis next day delivery" you'll find it's on thousands of sites. The reason you got only one link is because the words "though of" belong to the Ñāṇavīra site, not the adware.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2015 3:12 PM

Title: Re: e-reader for meditation books

Content:

When reading ebooks with endnotes on my laptop I make two copies of the book and open both of them — one at the page that I'm presently reading and the other at the current note. Isn't it possible to do this with kindle?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2015 7:34 PM

Title: Re: What are the hurdles hindering Dhamma propagation in the US?

Content:

Your fellow Aussie, John Safran, once paid a visit to Utah, where he engaged in Mormon-style door-knocking, preaching Darwinism and atheism to the residents of Salt Lake City. It wasn't much appreciated.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2015 3:22 AM

Title: Re: Vesak

Content:

In some years Vesak is on the same date in all Theravada countries, but in others it will be on such-and-such date in Sri Lanka and Myanmar, but then a month later in Thailand, Cambodia and Laos. I should imagine this is because of the intercalary month being inserted in different years in different countries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2015 4:55 PM

Title: Re: Rupa

Content:

I think "expressly" rather than "especially" would convey the meaning better, but otherwise it's an accurate statement of the Abhidhamma's treatment of derivative rūpa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 4, 2015 5:52 PM

Title: Re: Muslims and Meditation Centers in Myanmar

Content:

Yes, in the southern Thai provinces of Yala, Pattani and Nakhorn Sri Thammarat — strongholds of both militant Islamic and political separatist movements. As Pilgrim suggested, it's a security issue. The meditation centre staff need to be forewarned and ready to phone the police in the event of any suspicious-looking people coming to enquire after the meditator, lest they turn out to be militant Muslims intent on either snuffing their apostate brother or bombing the centre for facilitating his apostasy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 5, 2015 3:31 PM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination as Process (or not).

Content:

Certainly there can. Indeed most cognitions of impermanence fall well short of what the

Suttas call anicca-saññā, which we know (e.g., from AN.iv.395 and from the statement in several suttas that: The perception of impermanence should be developed to eradicate the conceit 'I am') to be a fairly advanced insight attainment and not just any old perception of impermanence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2015 8:44 AM

Title: Re: Having difficulty with metta practice

Content:

Why do you say that?

I am aware that New Age teachers who give guided meditations incorporating a bastardized form of mettabhāvanā are wont to say such things. When asked why happiness is universally deserved they will typically make appeal to some aspect of the monism that underlies New Age thought. But on what specifically Buddhist premise can it be asserted that everyone deserves to be happy?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2015 1:48 PM

Title: Re: giving to beggars

Content:

I agree with the meditation teacher. It is when people give directly to the homeless person that they know for sure that their gift is actually helping. If they give to a charity organization it may be used for little else than paying the executive-level salaries of the charity's administrators. But when they give directly to a homeless person then they know that he will either use their gift for his stated purpose or else he'll blow it all on booze or drugs. In the former case they will have fed a hungry man; in the latter, they will have saved the man from needing to resort to petty crime to obtain his fix.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2015 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Having difficulty with metta practice

Content:

One arouses a wish for it because it's what all beings wish for themselves. And the fact that the yogi wishes for the same for himself permits him to empathize with their wish for it, and based upon that, to arouse a wish that they may obtain the happiness that they wish for.

None of this entails entertaining any particular opinion on whether or not beings deserve happiness. In the brahmavihāras, as I understand them, the only place where a yogi needs to make any judgments of this sort is when developing muditā, where the

texts caution him that it is only the righteous successes of others that are the proper objects of his rejoicing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2015 7:40 PM

Title: Re: The State Of Asian Buddhism

Content:

But it has changed. Now every monastery has at least one Tipitaka case with a full Tipitaka in it. The problem now is a rather different one, namely, that the contents are so little read.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2015 11:08 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

A nice video explaining it all to foreigners.

http://cdn.theguardian.tv/webM/2015/05/06/150605ElectionExplainer_synd_768k_vp8.webm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2015 1:57 PM

Title: Re: Wandering Buddhist Renunciants

Content:

"Anagārika" is the most widely used term. Those who call themselves so may be observing either the 8 or the 10 precepts.

Others in use are "brahmacārī" (this is what Anagarika Munindra originally called himself), "yogāvacara" (the standard term for a full-time meditator in the Pali commentaries), and "yogī". Others that might be used, though I've never heard of anybody doing so, are pabbajita ("one gone forth") and samaṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2015 2:20 PM

Title: Re: Looking for two suttas(?)

Content:

See the suttas referred to in the Visuddhimagga's description of the balancing of the five faculties in the section entitled The Ten Kinds of Skill in Absorption.

45. 2. Maintaining balanced faculties is equalizing the [five] faculties of faith and the rest. For if his faith faculty is strong and the others weak, then the energy faculty cannot perform its function of exerting, the mindfulness faculty its function of establishing, the concentration faculty its function of not distracting, and the understanding faculty its function of seeing. So in that case the faith faculty should be modified either by reviewing the individual essences of the states [concerned, that is, the objects of attention] or by not giving [them] attention in the way in which the faith faculty became too strong. And this is illustrated by the story of the Elder Vakkali (S III 119).

46. Then if the energy faculty is too strong, the faith faculty cannot perform its function of resolving, nor can the rest of the faculties perform their several functions. So in that case the energy faculty should be modified by developing tranquillity, and so on. And this should be illustrated by the story of the Elder Soṇa (Vin I 179–85; A III 374–76). So too with the rest; for it should be understood that when anyone of them is too strong the others cannot perform their several functions.

47. However, what is particularly recommended is balancing faith with understanding, and concentration with energy. For one strong in faith and weak in understanding has confidence uncritically and groundlessly. One strong in understanding and weak in faith errs on the side of cunning and is as hard to cure as one sick of a disease caused by medicine. With the balancing of the two a man has confidence only when there are grounds for it.

Then idleness overpowers one strong in concentration and weak in energy, since concentration favours idleness. Agitation overpowers one strong in energy and weak in concentration, since energy favours agitation. But concentration coupled with energy cannot lapse into idleness, and energy coupled with concentration cannot lapse into agitation. So these two should be balanced; for absorption comes with the balancing of the two.

48. Again, [concentration and faith should be balanced]. One working on concentration needs strong faith, since it is with such faith and confidence that he reaches absorption. Then there is [balancing of] concentration and understanding. One working on concentration needs strong unification, since that is how he reaches absorption; and one working on insight needs strong understanding, since that is how he reaches penetration of characteristics; but with the balancing of the two he reaches absorption as well.

49. Strong mindfulness, however, is needed in all instances; for mindfulness protects the mind from lapsing into agitation through faith, energy and understanding, which favour agitation, and from lapsing into idleness through concentration, which favours idleness. So it is as desirable in all instances as a seasoning of salt in all sauces, as a prime minister in all the king's business. Hence it is said [in the commentaries (D-a 788, M-a I 292, etc)]: "And mindfulness has been called universal by the Blessed One. For what reason? Because the mind has mindfulness as its refuge, and mindfulness is manifested as protection, and there is no exertion and restraint of the mind without mindfulness."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2015 2:40 PM

Title: Re: Question about pleasure/pain in 8 worldly conditions

Content:

The commentator Upasena defines sukha and dukkha in this context as just pleasurable and painful bodily feelings. No specification is made as to whether the feelings are sāmisa or nirāmisa.

Reference: Nidd-a. i. 245 (the Saddhammappajjotikā's commentary to the Niddesa's exposition of the Paramatṭhaka Sutta).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2015 3:20 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

Pakistan-style tribal bloc-voting in Birmingham! Thank you multiculturalism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2015 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Question about pleasure/pain in 8 worldly conditions

Content:

But pleasures and pains don't arise through all six sense-bases. Only one kind of feeling —upekkhā-vedanā— arises with eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness, nose-consciousness and tongue-consciousness.

As for the kinds of feeling that can arise with non-sensory consciousnesses, many of these are feelings that one "does", so to speak, and not merely feelings that one undergoes. As such they don't share in the essentially passive character of the rest of the eight worldly dhammas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2015 10:42 PM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

This is a wholly gratuitous slight that does you little credit. As an expat of three decades' standing, my entire adult life has been spent living among races other than my own. During this time I've never entertained the notion that any of the said races — Thais, Burmese, Karens, Indians, Nepalese, Icelanders, Russians and Kazakhs — might be inferior to Englishmen, nor have I ever written anything to this effect.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 7:13 AM

Title: Re: Wandering Buddhist Renunciants

Content:

Yes, samaṇa is the Pali form of the Sanskrit śramaṇa. It's usually translated as 'recluse' or 'ascetic'.

Brahmacārī literally means 'brahma-farer', with brahma in this context being glossed as seṭṭha, meaning 'excellent' or 'sublime'. Taken narrowly it just means anybody who's undertaken to refrain from sex (e.g., Vin.iii.133: brahmacārī ti methunadhammā paṭivirataṃ). Taken more broadly it means one practising Buddhist asceticism in its entirety.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 9:01 AM

Title: Re: A Christian Buddha

Content:

An article of related interest — Jorge Luis Borges' lecture on Buddhism.

<http://www.southerncrossreview.org/48/borges-buddhism.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 9:17 AM

Title: Re: Question about pleasure/pain in 8 worldly conditions

Content:

The feelings present in the five-sense-door processes would be the same but there would be differences in the ensuing mind-door processes. For example, a sotāpanna wouldn't experience the somanassa and upekkhā feelings that arise with the greed-rooted cittas accompanied by wrong view. An anāgāmin and an arahant would not experience domanassa vedanā (mental unpleasant feeling), for this can only arise with hate-rooted cittas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday, Ben!

Content:

Happy birthday!

devil.jpg (170.08 KiB) Viewed 2189 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 10:36 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday, Ben!

Content:

Yes, there are photos of it awake too, but I preferred this dormant devil.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 11:47 AM

Title: Re: U.K General Election

Content:

I don't think I need take any greater care than I already do. Should any readers be so ignorant as to mistake a militant liberal secularist (and friend of Richard Dawkins) like Pat Condell for a far-right racist, or to suppose that Islam is some kind of racial affiliation, then frankly I don't care a toss whether they understand my words rightly or not. I'm not writing for dimwits like these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2015 2:16 PM

Title: Re: Question about pleasure/pain in 8 worldly conditions

Content:

Yes. I think it will be clearer if you read the whole of chapter 1, and then the "Compendium of Feeling" in chapter 3 and the account of sense-door processes in chapter 4.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2015 9:04 AM

Title: Re: What is the Meaning of Sankhāra?

Content:

The similes first appear in the Lekha Sutta (AN. i. 283) and the Puggalapaññatti (Pugg. 32), but here they are used to describe the persistence of anger in three kinds of persons. I don't know when they first came to be applied to kammās.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an03/an03.130.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2015 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination as Process (or not).

Content:

There are the Therīgāthā verses of Ambapālī, wherein an arahantī graphically describes her own ageing.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/thig/thig.13.01.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: The conceit to end conceit

Content:

There are some good thoughts on unselfishness <http://www.nanavira.org/letters/post-sotapatti/1962/51-l-14-6-june-1962>, though I doubt your friend will like them.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2015 9:49 PM

Title: Re: What would like be like for an arhat?

Content:

In English it will probably be found in the commentary to the Mūlapariyāyasutta, unless Bhikkhu Bodhi decided to omit it from his translation. It's also repeated in the Sāratthappakāsinī's commentary to the Nakulapitusutta and in the Saddhammappajjotikā's commentary to the canonical niddesa on the Mogharājasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2015 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Something Amusing

Content:

This wouldn't be a bad paraphrase of the words of one of the speakers in the Kassaka Sutta. The speaker, unfortunately, is not the Buddha, but Māra appearing in the form of a chownah.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn4.19>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 14, 2015 9:04 AM
Title: Re: Sutta - Best Attitude to Have When Giving
Content:
Perhaps the Dāna Sutta.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an07/an07.049.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 15, 2015 7:00 AM
Title: Re: watching rise and fall
Content:
In MN 36 it is done in the expectation that it might directly bring about awakening, which is to say, it is done with wrong view. In MN 20 it is done with the more modest aim of temporarily suppressing the hindrances, and even so, only as a last resort when all else has failed.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri May 15, 2015 11:31 AM
Title: Re: Something Amusing
Content:
Probably not. See, for example, the Ariyapariyesana Sutta's account of Gotama's time training with Āḷāra Kālāma. At that point Gotama was "still but an unawakened bodhisatta," and as such had no dhamma of his own, yet after his mastery of Āḷāra's oral teachings we find him already using the word samādhi, along with the names of the other five faculties:
"I reflected: 'it is not Āḷāra Kālāma alone who has saddhā, viriya, sati, samādhi, and paññā. I too have saddhā, viriya, sati, samādhi, and paññā. Suppose I endeavour to realise the Dhamma that Āḷāra Kālāma declares he enters upon and abides in by realising for himself with direct knowledge?'"
That being so, it is more likely that Gotama either learned the word samādhi from Āḷāra Kālāma or that it was a term in fairly general use among the different communities of samaṇas.

As for Ven. Vimalaramsi's much-iterated claim that the Buddha did invent the word samādhi, this is based on nothing more than his inaccurate reading of Th. Rhys Davids' preface to his translation of the Subha Sutta. RD does not in fact state that the Buddha created the word samādhi, but merely that the word isn't found in any Indian text before the Piṭakas. Such an absence is hardly surprising, for the Indian texts that predate the Piṭakas consist of collections of hymns, sacrificial manuals, and guides to fortune-telling, geomancy and casting spells. One wouldn't expect to find many words relating to bhāvanā in such texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2015 12:25 PM

Title: Re: Hardliner tries to reform Thailand's Buddhist monks behaving badly

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2015 1:19 PM

Title: The World's Religions on Evolution and Environment

Content:

Evolution, the Environment, and Religion

by Josh Rosenau

<http://ncse.com/blog/2015/05/evolution-environment-religion-0016359>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2015 1:30 PM

Title: Re: The World's Religions on Evolution and Environment

Content:

Mostly fairly predictable, I think. The only features that surprised me a little are that the Catholics aren't further to the right on evolution and that the Jehovah's Witnesses should be so freakishly different from everyone else.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 7:05 AM

Title: Re: The 3 Conceits

Content:

The conceiving by māna, though always akusala, is not always faulty in the sense of being false. As Dave mentioned, māna is presented in a ninefold scheme (in the Niddesa and the Abhidhamma's Vibhanga). This comprises the threefold scheme multiplied by three according to whether you are in fact superior, inferior or equal to the person with whom you are comparing yourself. So although all the conceits are akusala inasmuch as they all arise with attachment-rooted consciousnesses, three involve a correct perception of things ("I am better than he" — on the part of one who is better; "I am equal to him" — on the part of one who is equal; "I am inferior to him" — on the part

of one who is inferior), while the other six are grossly delusional ("I am better than he" — on the part of one who is actually equal or inferior, etc.).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 3:22 PM

Title: Re: The 3 Conceits

Content:

The Niddesa of the Khuddaka Nikāya arranges the mental factor of conceit (*māna*) into ten classificatory schemes, in ascending order from the onefold conceit to the tenfold conceit. Thus:

The onefold conceit is the mind's state of being puffed up.

The twofold conceit is conceit consisting in praise of oneself and disparagement of others.

The threefold conceit is the conceit "I am superior," the conceit "I am equal," and the conceit "I am inferior."

The fourfold conceit is conceit generated by gains, generated by fame, generated by praise, and generated by pleasure.

The fivefold conceit is: the conceit generated [by the thought] "I am one who obtains pleasing visual forms," ... "I am one who obtains pleasing sounds," ... "I am one who obtains pleasing odours," ... "I am one who obtains pleasing tastes," ... "I am one who obtains pleasing tactables."

The sixfold conceit is the conceit generated by the effective functioning of the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body and mind.

The sevenfold conceit is: conceit (*māna*), excessive conceit (*atimāna*), inordinate conceit (*mānātimāna*), self-disrespect conceit (*omāna*), over-estimating conceit (*adhimāna*), the 'I am' conceit (*asmimāna*), and false conceit (*micchāmāna*).

The eightfold conceit is conceit generated by gains, self-disrespect conceit generated by losses, conceit generated by fame, self-disrespect conceit generated by ill repute, conceit generated by praise, self-disrespect conceit generated by blame, conceit generated by pleasure, and self-disrespect conceit generated by pain.

The ninefold conceit is: (1) the conceit of a superior person who thinks "I am superior," (2) the conceit of a superior person who thinks "I am equal," (3) the conceit of a superior person who thinks "I am inferior," (4) the conceit of an equal person who thinks "I am superior," (5) the conceit of an equal person who thinks "I am equal," (6) the conceit of an equal person who thinks "I am inferior," (7) the conceit of an inferior person who thinks "I am superior," (8) the conceit of an inferior person who thinks "I am equal," (9)

the conceit of an inferior person who thinks “I am inferior.”

The tenfold conceit is conceit generated in a person on account of his birth, or clan, or family, or physical beauty, or wealth, or education, or occupation, or artistry, or knowledge, or learning, or eloquence, or whatever else may be a basis for conceit.

That which is of this type: conceit, being conceited, the state of being conceited, being puffed up, haughtiness, (flying a) flag, assumption, the mind’s longing [to wave] a banner. This is called “conceit”.

— Mahāniddeśa (Nidd. i. 80)

You will find more detailed definitions of most of the above terms in the account of conceit in the Book of Analysis. See attached file. If there is still anything unclear feel free to ask.

[./download/file.php?id=2581](#)
(303.13 KiB) Downloaded 162 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 3:55 PM

Title: Re: Ordination questions

Content:

I recall some years ago there was an American lay yogi who believed himself to be an ariyan disciple, in possession of all of the jhānas and an impressive complement of supernormal powers. As few people were taking him very seriously as a lay teacher, the man decided he would ordain as a monk and thereby gain himself some more credibility. And so with this in mind he wrote a letter in which he described all his many accomplishments and offered himself as a candidate for ordination. Not being particularly choosy about where he went, he posted a copy of this letter to every Buddhist monastery in the USA and every Yahoo Buddhist e-mail list. The result? Just a thick wad of rejection letters. Not a single monastery even invited him to come for an interview.

With this in mind, I strongly advise that you don’t make any mention of your alleged jhānas until you’re on very familiar terms with the members of the community where you propose to ordain. In their rejection of the above-mentioned yogi, the monasteries in the USA were simply playing it safe, knowing that most people nowadays who publicly boast of their high attainments are either mentally diseased or are basing their claims upon some grossly inaccurate understanding of the nature of these attainments.

As for how your meditative experience will affect your ordination and training (assuming that some monastery accepts you) this is rather difficult to predict. If you are used to

spending a lot of time in intensive samatha-bhāvanā and hope to go on doing the same, then you might find life in a British monastery (especially a Forest Sangha one) highly frustrating, for they are not set up with this sort of thing in mind. They'll probably be far more interested in any skills you may have in the fields of landscape gardening, plumbing, bricklaying spot-welding, etc. than in your aptitude for yogic ascesis. On the other hand, if you're willing to take on the training with an open and flexible mind, then you may get on just fine. One never really knows who'll make it and who won't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 5:15 PM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

In the Udāna's second Bodhi Sutta (Ud. 2) the cessation formula is in fact called "paṭiccasamuppādaṃ paṭilomaṃ". No such term is applied to DO presented in reverse in the Nagara Sutta (SN. 12.65). Is there some other place where DO in reverse is called "paṭiccasamuppādaṃ paṭilomaṃ" ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 5:48 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

No, it's sexual misconduct only if the man is already married or if the prostitute already has an appointment with another customer, in which case she falls into the "betroted" category.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Ordination questions

Content:

The usual entrance into eremitical monasticism, whether sylvan or troglodytic, is to ordain into one of the forest traditions of Thailand or Sri Lanka (Myanmar isn't a realistic option at present, because of the lack of freedom of movement), and then spend five to ten years with your teacher (or some other teacher approved by him). During this time you might occasionally go on thudong trips with a more experienced monk and thereby learn the woodcraft and other skills that you'll need for living an uncompromisingly homeless life. If this is what you wish to do, the first step would be to travel out to Asia and look for a forest monastery that appeals to you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Ordination questions

Content:

Yes, I should think so. You'll learn the rudiments of Vinaya and in the event that you find the Forest Sangha's heavily communal style to be quite insufferable, at least the experience will have resulted in an increase in self-knowledge, which in turn will ensure that your subsequent plans will be on a surer footing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2015 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Aphids ruining my kale

Content:

Aside from the precept issue, several studies have shown that introducing bishy-barnabies (as ladybirds are called in Norfolk) into one's garden won't actually help much, in large part because they're so awfully picky about which aphids they eat.
<http://www.bbc.com/earth/story/20150506-the-truth-about-ladybirds>

These ladybirds lay their eggs on leaves close to an aphid colony, but they have to be smart about it. Aphids are parthenogenetic, capable of birthing clones without the hassle of sex. This means that an aphid colony can grow extremely fast and may suddenly crash, with a few winged aphids flying off to pastures new.

To be sure that her larvae will enjoy a plentiful diet of aphids, a female ladybird must lay her eggs when the aphid colony is in its early stages. She achieves this by assessing several cues, including the density of the aphids, the honeydew the aphids produce, and the volatile chemicals released by an aphid-infested plant.

"They can also pick up one another's footprint chemicals," says Roy. There are at least 40 different components – mostly alkanes – that larvae leave in their tracks. If a female ladybird gets a whiff of them, she'll usually go somewhere else to lay her eggs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 20, 2015 9:08 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

I think you've effectively answered your own question here. The five precepts are not the sīla of a brahmacari renunciate, but rather of a householder furnished with the five strands of sense-pleasure. As such they are not really concerned with subtle levels. They're concerned with ensuring that a householder's unskilful states of mind don't find expression in grossly unskilful actions of body or speech.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 20, 2015 10:39 AM

Title: Re: Ordination questions

Content:

Nobody is likely to insist that you learn Thai, but it would be very inadvisable not to make the effort. When you're living as a monk in Thailand, any time a stranger approaches wanting to engage you in conversation, he will almost never address you in English (as he probably would with foreign non-monks), but will simply take it as a given that since you're a monk you must know Thai. I know of a very small number of long-term foreign monks in Thailand who've never bothered to learn the language at all, but they're all rather grumpy fellows who seem to have a very conflict-ridden relationship with the locals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 20, 2015 12:46 PM

Title: Re: Walking out of a burning house

Content:

Because the touch of fire on one's skin is evil.

Then the needle-haired yakkha Sūciloma went up to the Blessed One and pressed his body against him. Then the Blessed One drew away from him.

Then the yakkha Sūciloma said to the Blessed One: "You are afraid of me, ascetic."

"I am not afraid of you, sir, nevertheless your touch is evil (te sapphasso pāpako)."
(Sūciloma Sutta. K.R. Norman tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2015 9:28 AM

Title: Re: The 3 Conceits

Content:

These are certainly included, but māna is a lot broader than just these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2015 3:05 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Hi Steve,

As best I can tell, what you're saying doesn't dissent from what I said. My point, to put it another way, was simply that the third precept taken in the wholly renunciate form, abrahmacariyā veramaṇī, is a higher good, while that taken in the ameliorative form, kāmesu micchācārā veramaṇī, is a lower good. The observance of the former cuts off all kammās that provide fuel or reinforcement to sexual desire. The observance of the latter cuts off grossly harmful sexual kammās that lead to remorse in this life and bad destinations in future lives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 21, 2015 7:56 PM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

That's true with regard to the parts of the Tipiṭaka treated as authoritative by Ñāṇavīra and his followers. But elsewhere one will meet with it: once in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, several times in the Milindapañha and numerous times in the Kathāvatthu.

Pañcakkhandhe saṅkhatato passanto anulomikaṃ khantiṃ paṭilabhati. Pañcannaṃ khandhānaṃ nirodho asaṅkhatam nibbānanti passanto sammattaniyāmaṃ okkamati. (Paṭisam. ii. 240-1)

“Seeing the five aggregates as composed, he obtains acquiescence in conformity. Seeing how the cessation of the five aggregates is nibbāna, which is uncomposed, he enters into the certainty of rightness.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 6:00 AM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

Not that I can see.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 6:49 AM

Title: The Dictionary of Obscure Sorrows

Content:

<http://www.dictionaryofobscuresorrows.com/>

John Koenig's wonderful neologisms, including...

occhiolism

n. the awareness of the smallness of your perspective, by which you couldn't possibly draw any meaningful conclusions at all, about the world or the past or the complexities of culture, because although your life is an epic and unrepeatable anecdote, it still only

has a sample size of one, and may end up being the control for a much wilder experiment happening in the next room.

nodus tollens

n. the realization that the plot of your life doesn't make sense to you anymore—that although you thought you were following the arc of the story, you keep finding yourself immersed in passages you don't understand, that don't even seem to belong in the same genre—which requires you to go back and reread the chapters you had originally skimmed to get to the good parts, only to learn that all along you were supposed to choose your own adventure.

dead reckoning

n. to find yourself bothered by someone's death more than you would have expected, as if you assumed they would always be part of the landscape, like a lighthouse you could pass by for years until the night it suddenly goes dark, leaving you with one less landmark to navigate by—still able to find your bearings, but feeling all that much more adrift.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 9:08 AM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

Even though rūpakkhanda is one of the things that the puthujjana may take as self?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 12:29 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

There is no kind of sex that is entirely free of unskill, for all sex involves lust and reinforces the tendency to lust. Observance of the third precept sets a limit on the degree of unskill. By observing it one ensures that one's sex life is not disruptive of family life (one's own or others') or social harmony.

As for prostitution, I really don't understand why so many western Buddhists have this *idée fixe* about there being something inordinately evil in a man's paying a woman to have sex with him. *Ceteris paribus*, having sex with a prostitute is no more unskillful than having sex with one's wife. In fact in some respects it might even be less unskillful. For example there's far less deceit and hypocrisy involved in it. Unlike sex with one's wife, after sex with a prostitute a man can just get up, take a shower and then go read a book or meditate or something. He doesn't have to waste an hour lying in bed reluctantly feigning post-coital affection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Which Monk was this....?

Content:

I think there've been quite a few Theravadin monks who started out with either Zen training or just an interest in Zen, but if his name was mentioned here then it would most likely have been Ajahn Sumedho. All the others who come to mind have disrobed now: Patrick Kearney, Paul Breiter, Patrick Lanaghan, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 22, 2015 9:31 PM

Title: Re: The Dictionary of Obscure Sorrows

Content:

Olēka — the awareness of how few days are memorable.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 23, 2015 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Breach of the no stealing precept?

Content:

There's not enough data to give an answer — only you can know whether you picked up the vegetables with thieving intent.

Out of curiosity, why did your acquaintance throw them on the floor?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 23, 2015 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Breach of the no stealing precept?

Content:

Or perhaps the veggie thief saw that they were spec-taters — potatoes with their eyes peeled.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 23, 2015 9:54 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi and Buddhist leaders convene at White House

Content:

This is the thread in which Ven. Bodhi's letter to Ben was published, but it isn't the thread that he refers to in his letter. The latter, "New Bhikkhu Bodhi Interview", is here:

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=9670>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2015 1:16 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Your observations don't contradict the part of my post that you quoted. Nor would they contradict the part that you didn't quote ("Ceteris paribus, having sex with a prostitute is no more unskillful than having sex with one's wife") unless one disregarded the ceteris paribus ("other things being equal") qualification.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2015 8:03 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Possibly, though the problem with this theory is that the sort of Buddhists who get apoplectic, or at least voice misgivings, when they hear me expressing a generally accepting view of prostitution are in most cases socially liberal enough that they don't have any problem with people going into singles bars looking for a one-night stand. Now in the traditional Christian view, a one-night stand would be classed under "the sin of fornication" no less than prostitution would. Yet in its casualness and ephemerality a one-night stand is essentially the same as sex with a prostitute, the former being differentiated solely by the absence of payment and the fact that the woman is seldom subject to any economic duress.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2015 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi and Buddhist leaders convene at White House

Content:

Do you mean to suggest that the way of classifying the Buddha's teachings in terms of three kinds of benefit might be unsound if it were known to have been devised by a commentator fitting this description?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 12:42 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

I stated that the two acts were essentially similar in their ephemerality and casualness, which is to say, my comparison was confined to the factors of duration and significance (or momentousness).

Now as for the “fun” factor, my omission of this was not because I consider this difference to be a slight one. But nor do I agree with you that it’s a huge one. As I see it, the difference in the two cases is simply an incommensurable one. The female swingers enjoying a one-night stand and the sex-workers servicing their clients obtain two entirely different kinds of “fun” that cannot really be compared. The swingers’ fun is that of bodily pleasure. The sex-workers’ (setting aside those of them who get aroused by having sex with strangers) is the pleasure that they get from having exchanged that which they valued less (their time) for that which they valued more (their client’s money). Their “fun”, in other words, consists in the mental satisfaction generated by contemplation of a successfully concluded free-market transaction that they deem to have been favourable to their interests.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

What do you mean by “anti-prostitution” ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 10:20 AM

Title: Re: The 3 Conceits

Content:

I think the flag that the Niddesa author disapproves of is a metaphorical one. As to whether Buddhism should be represented by that famous flag designed by Col. Olcott, or by some other flag, or by no flag at all, for me this is a matter of indifference.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 10:22 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

You still haven’t properly defined your terms. Perhaps the best course is for me to offer a

catechetical summary of my views and you can decide for yourself into which of your semantically murky pigeonholes you wish to place me...

Q. Is sex with a prostitute akusala?

A. Yes, but only in the sense that all sex is akusala.

Q. Is sex with a prostitute a violation of the third precept?

A. No.

Q. Do the Pali texts offer any Buddhist grounds for objecting to prostitution?

A. Yes. It is a species of womanizing (itthidhutta) and all womanizing is treated as imprudent insofar as it tends to result in loss of wealth.

Q. Do the prostitution-related evils mentioned by several posters in this thread amount to a Buddhist objection to prostitution?

A. No. Since analogous evils can readily be found in sexual relationships of a kind that these posters would not judge morally blameworthy, their objections are specious.

Q. Should prostitution be outlawed?

A. No. Consenting adults should be free to enter into whatever contractual relationship they like regarding the enjoyment of each other's bodies, including paid-for sex. The role of the state here, as in any other contractual relationship, should not go beyond that of preventing coercion, fraud or violence.

Now it seems to me that my answers to the first four questions ought not to be a matter of argument for any Buddhists whose moral outlook is grounded in the Pali texts. As for my answer to the fifth, this is just my personal opinion and I readily concede that some Buddhists may in good conscience hold to a non-libertarian position.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Prostitutes are not included in any of the lists of persons with whom sex would be a violation of the third precept. Therefore sex with them does not violate the third precept, unless the woman also happens to be in one of the categories which are prohibited (e.g., a married woman who is engaging in prostitution).

If a Buddhist isn't breaking the third precept then his sex-life isn't at odds with the sammā-kammanta of the eightfold path.

For further discussion of the matter, see the

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=22572> thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2015 11:08 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Any Buddhist scholar who's versed in the Pali texts will confirm what I've said, including the writer at Buddhanet whom you've linked to, though without apparently understanding what he's saying.

In popular Buddhist preaching, of course, it's not a point that's much stressed, for when the subject of prostitution comes up in a typical sermon, the emphasis will usually be upon its being a species of womanizing and therefore something that's liable to be deleterious to wealth and domestic felicity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 6:51 AM

Title: Re: Joke!!!

Content:

A guided meditation from the Daleks

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Or he might define the third precept as forbidding homosexual acts or masturbation or having sex in the same room as a Buddha statue without first covering the statue's head with a piece of cloth. It will depend on where he comes from, but in all cases what he will be telling you is not the Buddha's teaching but merely how sexual morality is traditionally conceived in his culture.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 3:04 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

I think my response to your question about homosexuality in the <https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=42&t=22572&start=40#p324408> can be applied mutatis mutandis to your latest questions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

The scope of the third precept in its kāmesu micchācārā form is sexual intercourse with other human beings. As such it's not concerned with either simple masturbation or with more elaborate forms of masturbation involving the use of corpses, sheep, inflatable dolls, the gaps in a Venetian blind or the holes drilled in heated-up water melons. It's not that these things are positively permitted under the third precept, but that the precept has nothing to do with them.

That being so, Mr Man's questions are as senseless and irrelevant as if he had asked whether the third precept allows one to park on double yellow lines or to take part in dwarf-throwing contests.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 5:58 PM

Title: Re: A Talk by U Tejaniya at the Wembley Vihāra London

Content:

Thanks for the notice, bhante.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 11:46 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

If you think this statement amounts to "advocacy", then you must be using the word in some sense that's unfamiliar to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2015 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Of course it doesn't. But with rape being primarily an act of violence rather than a sensual enjoyment, it is under the first precept (in its extended application), rather than the third, that it would be proscribed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Venerable who teaches mindfulness of postures

Content:

Perhaps Achan Maha Bunchu, a teacher of Achan Naeb's method.

<http://dhammagarden.jimdo.com/the-residents/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 7:00 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

I think your "not only" is misplaced. In the case of *saparidaṇḍā* women (i.e., those whose use entails punishment) it is because hiring them for sex breaks the law of the land that it transgresses the third precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 7:09 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

A specious argument unless you would apply the same to, say, garbage-collecting (on the grounds that its workers are exposed to nasty odours), nursing (it's stressful), assembly-line work (it exposes employees to stultifying monotony), farming (hundreds killed every years by over-turned tractors), and any and every other occupation that has some accompanying hazard or unpleasantness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 7:14 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

No sex is in the spirit of Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

The amount of moral variation to be found within each of these classes makes a meaningful comparison impossible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 11:36 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

There isn't any contradiction at all between Bhikkhu Bodhi's quoted words and mine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 12:24 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sāriputta's antidotes to sloth-torpor/dullness-drowsiness

Content:

It was actually the Buddha advising a sleepy Moggallāna.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an07/an07.058.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 12:32 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sāriputta's antidotes to sloth-torpor/dullness-drowsiness

Content:

TRANSLATOR'S NOTES

* Pacalāyamāno nisinno hoti. Just below, Mp glosses the Buddha's question, "Pacalāyasi no?" with "Niddāyasi nu" ("Are you falling asleep?"). Mp: "While depending on the village for alms, Moggallāna had been practicing meditation in the grove. For seven days he had energetically practiced walking meditation and the effort fatigued him. Thus he was dozing off [in the seat] at the end of the walkway."

** The following exchange is also at MN 37.2–3, I 251–52, but with Sakka as the inquirer. Mp explains the passage thus: "Nothing (lit., not all things) is worth holding to (sabbe dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāya): here, 'all things' (sabbe dhammā) are the five aggregates, the twelve sense bases, and the eighteen elements. These are not worth holding to by way of craving and views. Why not? Because they do not exist in the way they are held to. They are held to be permanent, pleasurable, and self, but they turn out to be impermanent, suffering, and non-self. Therefore they are not worth holding to. One directly knows them by the full understanding of the known (ñātapariññāya abhijānāti) as impermanent, suffering, and non-self. One fully understands them in the same way by the full understanding of scrutinization (tīraṇapariññāya parijānāti)." The "all things" in my translation from Mp relates to the "nothing" of the sutta, since the Pāli phrase of the sutta is a negation of sabbe dhammā ("not all things"). On the three kinds of full

understanding (pariññā), see Vism 606,18–607,23, Ppn 20.3–6.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 4:12 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Since some Buddhists love going with prostitutes and do so with no moral qualms whatever, while other Buddhists (mainly American ones, it seems) gag at the very thought of it, clearly we don't have any kind of universal moral law engraved on our hearts. Your suggestion to the contrary seems as incongruous in a Buddhist context as Lyndon's Christian manqué attempt to sacralize sex and the third precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 4:29 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 6:43 PM

Title: Re: Who is the Buddha in Three refuges?

Content:

It's an excellent article by Nyanaponika, but I think you've misunderstood the terms lokiya and lokuttara. These don't apply to the refuges but rather to the act of going for refuge.

The mundane going for refuge is when a worldling makes his faith and discipleship known, whether by recitation or prostration or asking a Buddhist teacher for a meditation subject. The supramundane refuge-going is a term for the attainment of the noble fruitions, starting with stream-entry. See pages 3-6 of your link.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 9:20 PM

Title: Marek Sullivan on Sam Harris

Content:

All Good Intentions: But does Sam Harris have what it takes to be Buddhist?

by Marek Sullivan

<http://www.patheos.com/blogs/americanbuddhist/2015/05/all-good-intentions-but-does-sam-harris-have-what-it-takes-to-be-buddhist.html>

Marek is a PhD candidate in Theology at the University of Oxford (Balliol) with a research background in Buddhist philosophy and ethics, particularly Buddhist environmentalism. He has a Master's in Oriental Studies (also from Oxford), and an BA in Theology and Religious Studies from the University of Bristol. While maintaining a strong interest in Buddhist thought, he has recently shifted his focus to the contemporary phenomenon of "New Atheism," and ways in which it may distort its object of derision — religion — for ideological purposes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sāriputta's antidotes to sloth-torpor/dullness-drowsiness

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2015 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Sorry, it's actually the Uttarā-upāsikāvatthu — the story that accompanies verse 223.

The other reference is the story of the prostitute but not of the lady who hired her.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2015 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Marek Sullivan on Sam Harris

Content:

Well, maybe. To tell the truth, I only skimmed through the political stuff at the beginning of the article. It was the middle and the end — the critique of Harris via Gethin's casuistry — that mostly interested me.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 10:55 AM
Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"
Content:
Bad translation.

"By whom" correctly translates kena, but the three occurrences of kuvaṃ mean "where", not "who."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 4:25 PM
Title: Re: When to use Saddhiṃ/saha?
Content:
The sentence would be grammatically sound, but it would not have the same meaning. It would no longer mean that the farmer was using the saw as a tool, but that the saw had come alive — like the broom in The Sorcerer's Apprentice — and was itself engaged in sawing.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 4:34 PM
Title: Re: If it is okay?
Content:
The question doesn't appear to make any sense. Is "Theravada meditation" a typo for "Zen meditation" ?

If it is, and if your friend doesn't like doing it, then why doesn't he just stop?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 5:09 PM
Title: Re: Marek Sullivan on Sam Harris
Content:
Although Gethin is expounding the commentarial Abhidhamma point of view, I believe all of the key moral points that he makes can be sourced in the Suttas and Vinaya.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 5:13 PM
Title: Re: Marek Sullivan on Sam Harris
Content:
No problem. Dealing with my critics in the "Prostitution and Third Precept" thread I've

become so thick-skinned that I didn't even notice that your post might be confrontational.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 5:55 PM
Title: Re: The order of words
Content:
The word order is fine, but:

sahāyakena saha

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 7:53 PM
Title: Re: Translation of a sentence from English to Pali
Content:
It should be asse. The horses are the "direct object" — the entity directly acted upon by the verb, rather than just indirectly affected by it. That being so, the accusative ending is required.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 8:05 PM
Title: Re: When Aj Chah Don't Want to Talk
Content:
It's a story told by Paul Breiter (ex-Bhikkhu Varapañño). You'll find it in the book of recollections by Ajahn Chah's western disciples and perhaps also in Breiter's own book of memoirs, whose title I've forgotten.

http://forestsanghapublications.org/assets/book/Recollections_of_Ajahn_Chah_-_Various_Authors.pdf

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 28, 2015 8:34 PM
Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute
Content:
Not just pre-BC, but throughout its history Buddhism has flourished in societies where polygyny (and in Tibet polyandry) was tolerated and commonly practised. In some Buddhist countries this remains the case. In Thailand, for example, a form of de facto polygyny is still very common among the urban middle-class.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2015 8:53 PM

Title: Re: SN 6.15: Parinibbana Sutta — Total Unbinding

Content:

Ven. Ānanda is narrating, but Ven. Anuruddha, a mind-reading adept, is giving him the information about the Buddha's mind states.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2015 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

So what? The moral variegation among human beings is as strong an inductive case as one could wish for against the silly notion that all of us in our hearts know what's right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2015 10:08 PM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

A fastidious concern with accuracy. If someone asks about what the Buddha taught on a matter of right living, I wish to present what he taught, as well as this can possibly be construed. I am not interested in any trendy modern conceits as to what he ought to have taught.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

I haven't time now, but another day I'll post the passages relevant to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 12:07 PM

Title: Re: SN 6.15: Parinibbana Sutta — Total Unbinding

Content:

What do you mean "WE", white man?

Here in the north of Thailand —where I believe you too are living— I am constantly

hearing about living monks and mae chees who supposedly possess this or that supernormal power. And of the powers mentioned, cetopariyañāṇa / mind-reading seems to be the commonest. Whether there's any truth to these rumours is of course another story. Personally I just don't feel interested enough to go and pay any of these alleged magical yogis a visit to check them out, but you could always do so if you wanted. Though if you did it might be a good idea to take someone like James Randi with you. If they're anything like the charlatan sadhus of India, they'll probably have an impressive repertoire of conjuring tricks that won't be easy to see through if you're not in the business.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 12:08 PM

Title: Re: SN 6.15: Parinibbana Sutta — Total Unbinding

Content:

No.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 5:51 PM

Title: Re: A Review of Ven. Ñāṇavīra's "Notes on Dhamma"

Content:

Hi SDC,

It's so many years since I read Paramattha Sacca that I don't now recall whether Ñāṇavīra's reading of the sutta is one that depends on his cack-handed translation of it or one that holds good in spite of his translation. So perhaps it's better if I defer any comment until you've posted the next sections.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 6:47 PM

Title: Re: If it is okay?

Content:

Does your friend live in Nepal too? If so, and if he's in or near Kathmandu, I suggest he might get in touch with my old friend and teacher Bhikshu Jnanapurnik, a Burmese-trained Nepali monk and abbot of the Vishwa Shanti Vihara.

http://www.geocities.jp/viswa_shanti_vihar/index.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 6:57 PM

Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry

Content:

That buddhahood is the outcome of many kalpas of developing the ten perfections comes from the Jātaka, Cariyāpiṭaka and Buddhavaṃsa, and their commentaries.

That arahantship and paccekabuddhahood also require such a preparation (though not for as many kalpas as full buddhahood) comes from the

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Apad%C4%81na> and its commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 8:29 PM

Title: Re: Greetings.

Content:

Welcome.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry

Content:

I don't doubt that there are still stream-enterers.

As for modern claims to the effect that the Theravada went through a prolonged dark age where nobody ever attained anything or even believed that you could attain anything, I'm inclined to be sceptical about them. Were this really the case, then we should expect the Maitreya devotional cults that sprang up from time to time in Theravadin countries to have proven just as popular and durable as the devotional cults of mappō-preoccupied Mahayanists. As it is, the Theravadin Maitreya cults were more or less damp squibs. In contrast with Mahayanism's cults of Amitabha or Kuan Yin or of the Lotus Sutra, Theravadin Maitreya cults were ephemeral affairs, seldom lasting for more than half a century, never gaining mass appeal (not even when the cult had royal sponsorship, and not even when it was the king himself who was claiming to be Maitreya, as happened once in Burma and twice in Siam), and never spreading beyond the borders of the country where they began. What this points to is a state of affairs where Theravada Buddhists had not generally fallen into despair about the Buddha's teaching's capacity for delivering the goods.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2015 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Monk that had sexual intercourse?

Content:

Some Chinese Vinaya scholars take the phrase "without having declared his weakness"

as indicating that if a monk did declare in advance that he was too akratic to follow the rule properly, then he would be absolved if he went and broke it and was then later remorseful about it.

Theravadin Vinaya scholars disagree, for they understand the two phrases "without having renounced the training" and "without having declared his weakness" as being synonyms, both of which mean "without having disrobed".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2015 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Sexual misconduct and prostitute

Content:

Though you're entitled to your opinion, let me draw your attention to the fact that it is actually a male attitude and foible that is being mocked, not a female one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2015 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Eyes downcast...

Content:

I think you may have an inaccurate idea of what's being described here. The Buddha isn't walking with his head at a 90 degree angle like a tortoise. His head is just slightly tilted forward and his eyes are focussed on the ground a plough's length in front.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2015 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Antidotes/Practices for Restlessness-Worry

Content:

There's some good advice in the section on the hindrances in Buddhaghosa's commentary to the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/soma/wayof.html#agitation>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2015 1:52 AM

Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 30, 2015 11:03 AM
Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 30, 2015 4:46 PM
Title: Re: Upasakajanalankara
Content:
Ven. Pesala's link to the Pali text is now dead. Here's a new one:

http://gretil.sub.uni-goettingen.de/gretil/2_pali/6_suanco/upasak_u.htm

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 30, 2015 5:19 PM
Title: Re: Hello, what is this?
Content:
Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

I think your query is one that would best be put to a Buddhist teacher in the real world who has spent some time getting to know you. Online diagnoses and meditation advice aren't very reliable.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2015 8:48 AM
Title: Re: The obligatory Dhamma themed movie thread
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 31, 2015 8:29 PM
Title: Re: Hi (again)
Content:
No soporto Twitter ni Instagram. Yo utilizo Facebook principalmente para estar en

contacto con familiares y amigos más que para el Dhamma. Algunas veces brindo consejo por Skype.

There! And you don't even have to translate it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 1, 2015 5:32 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro has not read the Abhidhamma??

Content:

I would imagine the ajahn means that he hasn't read the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, which for a Thai-trained forest monk wouldn't really be at all surprising. In Thailand even most Abhidhamma scholars haven't read all of the third Basket. For example, the most widely followed Abhidhamma syllabus in Thailand, though requiring six and a half years of study, only covers five of the seven books of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, omitting the Puggalapaññatti and Kathāvatthu.

In the Thai forest tradition, the reading of a typical Thai monk who's been ordained for ten rains is likely to consist of the Nak Tham textbooks (compiled by a Thai prince over a century ago and imparting a rudimentary knowledge of Dhamma, Vinaya, Buddhist history, Thai Buddhist ceremonies, and essay/sermon composition), and books of Dhamma talks by forest ajahns. He is unlikely to have read a single book of the Tipiṭaka.

As for a typical western monk in this tradition, by the time he gets to ten rains he will probably have read the Vinaya Piṭaka, two or three Nikāyas from the Sutta Piṭaka, the Visuddhimagga, a couple of hundred novels, and a selection of the currently fashionable non-Theravadin spiritual books (which ones varying from one decade to the next: it used to be pop Zen and Carlos Castaneda; then it was Nisargadatta and Frithjof Schuon; the last I heard it was Dzogchen and Harry Potter).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2015 7:48 PM

Title: Re: Hi from poland

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 3, 2015 6:09 AM

Title: Re: Thanissaro has not read the Abhidhamma??

Content:

I would prefer to say that the Buddha did, in a manner of speaking, provide his own systematization of his teaching, but that this was largely suggestive and couched in the

form of statements of the Dhamma in brief (e.g. the elephant's footprint simile) whereas the commentators' systematization is explicit and expounded in detail.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 3, 2015 6:18 PM

Title: Re: Why did Seniya wait four years for going forth?

Content:

The same narrative occurs also in the aftermath of the conversions of Kassapa the Naked Ascetic (DN.i.176; SN.ii.21), and the four wanderers: Subhadda (DN.ii.152), Vacchagotta (MN.i.494), Māgandiya (MN.i.512), and Sabhiya (Sn.102).

The shared features, it seems, is that all of these men held exceptionally stupid wrong views prior to their conversion, yet all became arahants shortly afterwards.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 3, 2015 10:02 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha Teach Mantra Meditation?

Content:

You're probably thinking of the Humhuṅka Sutta, Ud. 3.

But the brahmin's problem is that he's a prideful jerk and not that he recites mantras. Indeed it's not even certain that he does recite mantras — this is just one opinion on what humhuṃ might mean.

Masefield's translation:

[./download/file.php?id=2611](#)

(100.76 KiB) Downloaded 77 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 4, 2015 4:27 PM

Title: Re: Protesters call on Dalai Lama to end 'persecution of Shugden Buddhists'

Content:

It has to do with one of the NKT's most oft-iterated demands over the years: that the Dalai Lama should meet Kelsang Gyatso in a public debate on the question of what sort of a creature Dorje Shugden is (i.e., an evil spirit or a Dharma-protecting wisdom Buddha). He refuses to do this and the reasons given by his supporters are basically the same as those given by Richard Dawkins for refusing to debate the evangelist Ray Comfort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 5, 2015 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry

Content:

There are accounts of bhikkhus who attained the noble paths and fruitions while on almsround, just as the food was being ladled into their bowls. On such an occasion, if the volition to give arose in the donor at the same time as the monk's attainment of the path, then the almsfood was given to a path-attainer. If the volition arose in or after the next moment, then the gift was to a fruition-attainer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2015 4:47 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday venerable Dhammanando!

Content:

Thanks everyone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2015 2:19 PM

Title: Re: It Needs Saying Buddhism is not a philosophy, science, psychotherapy, or culture. It is a religion. David Brazier

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2015 2:25 PM

Title: Re: It Needs Saying Buddhism is not a philosophy, science, psychotherapy, or culture. It is a religion. David Brazier

Content:

Or "Chicken Little" or "Henny-Penny" or the timid hare of the Duddubha Jātaka — for those of you from other parts of the world.

<http://www.pitt.edu/~dash/type2033.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2015 2:47 PM

Title: Re: Translation

Content:

Ayaṃ kāyo anicco dukkho anattā.

or:

Idaṃ rūpaṃ aniccaṃ dukkhaṃ anattā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2015 3:36 PM

Title: Re: Possibility of Stream Entry

Content:

Nine stages are from the Suttas, and the other seven (marked below with an asterisk) from the Atthakathās.

1. Nāmarūpapariccheda — defining nāma and rūpa *
2. Paccayapariggaha — discerning conditionality *
3. Sammasana — comprehending the three characteristics
4. Udayabbaya — rise and fall
5. Bhaṅga — dissolution
6. Bhaya * — fear
7. Ādīnava — danger
8. Nibbidā — disenchantment *
9. Muñcitukamyatā — desire for deliverance *
10. Paṭisaṅkhā — reflection *
11. Saṅkhārupekkhā — equanimity regarding formations
12. Anuloma — conformity *
13. Gotrabhū — change of lineage
14. Magga — path
15. Phala — fruition
16. Paccavekkhaṇa — reviewing

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen differences?

Content:

Few, if any, Tibetans would have known anything about the Pali canon. Traditionally a Tibetan's knowledge of pre-Mahayana Buddhist texts would come from quotations of passages from them in works like Vasubandhu's auto-commentary to his *Abhidharmakosa*. Unlike the Chinese Canon, the Tibetan one does not contain any of the *Nikāyas/Āgamas*. The only Pali texts translated into Tibetan were the so-called *Mahāsūtras* — a small collection of discourses whose names all begin with *Mahā-*, such as the *Mahāsuññatāsutta*. But even these seem to have been used primarily as *parittas* rather than teaching sources. (See Peter Skilling's article *Zombies and Half-Zombies: Mahāsūtras and Other Protective Measures*, *Journal of the Pali Text Society*,

Vol. XXIX, 2007).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen differences?

Content:

Not really. The Dalai Lama is alluding not specifically to the Pali canon but to similar teachings preserved by pre-Mahayana schools in general:

After the Buddha's passing, a record of what he said was maintained as an oral tradition. Those who heard the teachings would periodically meet with others for communal recitations of what they had heard and memorized. In due course, these recitations from memory were written down, laying the basis for all subsequent Buddhist literature. The Pāli Canon is one of the earliest of these written records and the only complete early version that has survived intact. Within the Pāli Canon, the texts known as the Nikāyas have the special value of being a single cohesive collection of the Buddha's teachings in his own words. These teachings cover a wide range of topics; they deal not only with renunciation and liberation, but also with the proper relations between husbands and wives, the management of the household, and the way countries should be governed. They explain the path of spiritual development—from generosity and ethics, through mind training and the realization of wisdom, all the way up to the attainment of liberation.

(from the foreward to In the Buddha's Words)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 7:06 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen differences?

Content:

No, it doesn't. As already stated, apart from the handful of "Mahāsūtras" the Tibetan texts do not include anything from the Pali Canon. At one point in Tibetan history, some eminence (Longchenpa, if I remember right) made the decision that the Āgama/Nikāya sutras of early Buddhism would not be translated into Tibetan. And so in Tibetan monasteries, the study of what they call Hinayana was always via treatises outlining the scholastic systems of the Vaibhasika and Sautrantika schools. These treatises contain quotations from the Āgama sūtras of the Sarvastivāda school and possibly other early schools. These isolated fragments of sutras, usually quoted for some polemical purpose by Vasubandhu, Kamalasila, etc., were historically the Tibetans' sole means of exposure to early Buddhist teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 10:39 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen differences?

Content:

The Tibetans' historical view was not that Hinayana=Theravada. Historically most Tibetans (excepting those living in close proximity to Burma and in the habit of trading there) had no consciousness that the Theravada even existed. The more scholarly Tibetan monks, in the course of studying shastras and chronicles, would no doubt have occasionally come across mention of an obscure Indian Hinayana school which went by the name "Vibhajyavāda". But this Vibhajyavāda would probably have been of only scant interest to them. After all, the only reason it got into the Tibetan history books was because of its members' obduracy in denying that there was an intermediate state between death and rebirth. The notion that there might be several Asian countries inhabited by tens of millions of these "Vibhajyavādins" would never have crossed the Tibetans' minds. After the Chinese invasion when refugees began fleeing the country, many were quite astonished to make this discovery.

So what's this "Hinayana=Theravada" all about? It's simply a new-fangled convention that has arisen in the last decade or two among the Tibetans in exile (or at least the more cosmopolitan of them) and their English-language translators. Many of these people have taken to using the name "Theravada" in place of "Hinayana" in an effort to be diplomatic in the ecumenical sphere. Diplomacy should not, however, blind us to the wholly ahistorical character of this equation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 3:43 PM

Title: Re: Nivarana - the Box of Desires

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 4:09 PM

Title: Re: 16 Stages of insight?

Content:

A person who has reached the noble path and fruition for the first time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 4:43 PM

Title: Re: Ananda reprimanded from Buddhist Council

Content:

The charges were arguably minor, since Ānanda hadn't acted with any ill intent, but none of them was false.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 6:59 PM

Title: Re: 16 Stages of insight?

Content:

The cutting off of the fetters occurs at ñāṇa #14, the path moment. In the case of the sakadāgāmin, anāgāmin and arahant the author of the Paṭisambhidāmagga names the fetters concerned, but in the case of the sotāpanna he inexplicably omits to do so (though he does do so later when discussing knowledge of deliverance).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Happy birthday, Modus Ponens!

Content:

Happy birthday!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2015 7:07 PM

Title: Re: Nivarana - the Box of Desires

Content:

By giving to the child himself one probably won't accomplish anything more than the short-term benefit of saving him from getting a beating that day from his master. For the long-term benefit it's a better idea to donate to one of the rescue foundations that will take these children off the street and provide them with an education and vocational training.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 3:59 AM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

It varies. The typical pattern regarding the enforcement of what I've described above would be:

Ajahn Chah's wats in Thailand: very strict. If you can't conform, then you're not welcome.

Dhammayutt forest wats in Thailand and Ajahn Chah's wats in the West: some leeway given to monks with physical handicaps.

Thai town and village wats, Mahanikaya forest wats other than Ajahn Chah's: no insistence upon sitting in these ways (though it is preferred).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 5:35 AM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

He has both legs folded back, which is how women do it. Thai males might sit this way in the presence of the king or (in the case of schoolboys) on Honouring Teachers Day. But in Thai temples, the polite posture for men usually looks like this:

nang phab-phiab.jpg (80.93 KiB) Viewed 4318 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 5:52 AM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

Very unlikely, unless you assumed a positively impolite posture, such as sitting with your legs stretched out in front and the soles of your feet pointing in the direction of the Buddha statue or the speaker.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 6:07 AM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

The people sitting behind you don't count. It's keeping your feet out of sight of what's in front of you — the King, a Buddha statue, a Dhamma teacher, etc. — that makes the posture "polite".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 11:49 AM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 3:09 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

No, it can be either leg. In fact many monks who at first can only do it one way will train themselves so that they can do it both ways. This then allows them to shift from one side to another from time to time when they have to sit through some very long talk or ceremony.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 3:25 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

The foot-pointing that Allan Pease is talking about differs in two respects from that being discussed in this thread. Firstly, he is talking about what people do unconsciously and not about deliberately assumed postures. Secondly, by "pointing" he is referring to the directing of the toes of one's feet, not the soles.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 3:56 PM

Title: Re: Nivarana - the Box of Desires

Content:

I'm afraid I don't know what's available in Sri Lanka. A good one in Thailand is Aezandra Russell's Chiang Mai-based Urban Light Foundation: "... a grassroots organization dedicated to rebuilding, restoring and empowering the lives of boys who are victims of trafficking & exploitation."

<http://www.urban-light.org>

<https://www.facebook.com/bethelightUL>

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Hi from Italy

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel,

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

In sitting meditation all three of those are used in Thailand, though with Burmese and half-lotus being the more common.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

In some wats the monks are allowed to stand up and do walking meditation if they want. In others they have to sit all night but those who find this difficult will alternate different sitting postures; e.g., one session in the Burmese posture followed by a session in the phap-phiap ("polite posture") with the left leg behind, followed by phap-phiap with the right leg behind; or a session in the half-lotus with the left foot on the right thigh followed by a session with the right foot on the left thigh.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 10:49 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

A session — as I'm using the word here — is simply the time it takes for a posture to become so unbearable that you feel obliged to change it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2015 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

It would be better if Ven. Gavesako answers as my information about this is not up-to-date. At WPN my understanding is that the policy changes from one abbot to the next. I believe cushions are in common use in Ajahn Chah wats in the west but I haven't seen it in Thailand yet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2015 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Relationship between 1st to 4th jhana and immaterial state

Content:

It's nice to see the Theravada position being presented for once in the Theravada Meditation Forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2015 9:45 PM

Title: Re: A.A.B...

Content:

I never read any of the Alice Bailey books but I do recall once having an encounter with them.

I was sixteen and had just left home and moved into a rented bedsit in Nottingham. It happened that the previous tenant had left behind his large Alice Bailey collection. After a quick perusal I determined there was nothing in them to interest me, and so I put them away into storage in case their owner should come back to claim them. Later, however, it happened, that I did discover a use for one of the books in the collection. It was the very same use that a century earlier Samuel Butler had found for John Frost's *Lives of Eminent Christians of Various Denominations*, as whimsically described by him in <http://www.authorama.com/essays-on-life-art-and-science-2.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2015 10:13 PM

Title: Re: Recommended Sutta Nipata book?

Content:

Ven. Ānandajoti has produced a very fine translation of the Suttanipāta's Parāyanavagga:

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/Texts-and-Translations/Parayanavagga/index.htm>

For the other four vaggas see K.R. Norman's *Group of Discourses*, but make sure it's the second (revised) edition published in 2001, not the earlier one entitled *The Rhinoceros Horn*.

http://store.pariyatti.org/Group-of-Discourses-Sutta-Nipata_p_2285.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2015 8:51 AM

Title: Re: A.A.B...

Content:

Indeed. I can scarcely imagine how I'd have managed without that copy of *Telepathy*

and the Etheric Vehicle (in a special large-print edition for the visually impaired) that served me for two years as a sloping desk-book.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2015 3:08 PM

Title: Re: A.A.B...

Content:

It's not very likely as your query comes about three decades too late. In many western Buddhist circles (and especially British ones) up to the early 1980's you wouldn't have had any trouble finding someone with whom to have an informed discussion about Bailey or Besant or Blavatsky or even

https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Hermione_and_Her_Little_Group_of_Serious_Thinkers/How_the_Swami_Happened_to_Have_Seven_Wives.

That was a time when the Buddhist scene in Britain (and to some extent in Canada, Australia and New Zealand) was still heavily under the influence of the Theosophy-centric Buddhist popularizer Christmas Humphreys. But then in 1983 Humphreys passed away and to all intents and purposes theosophicised Buddhism died with him. I suppose we just weren't ethereal enough for it.

It's no go the Yogi-Man, it's no go Blavatsky,
All we want is a bank balance and a bit of skirt in a taxi.
— Louis MacNeice

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2015 9:01 AM

Title: Re: Monastic life and remorse?

Content:

How does guilt differ from remorse?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2015 3:53 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

Right.

If you sat with your knees drawn up, feet flat on the floor and toes pointing forward toward the speaker, it would be considered an ungainly posture but probably no one would say anything. But if you then stretched your legs out so that your soles of your feet were pointing forward, then it's likely that Thais would start chuntering among themselves and someone might request you to sit properly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2015 5:39 PM

Title: Re: Which posture should ordained monks sit in?

Content:

No. If you're standing up, the only way you could cause offence with your feet would be by raising one foot at least ninety degrees so that its sole was pointing at the person you intended to insult. Then to make your contempt unambiguous you would jiggle your foot back and forth. In the slum districts of Bangkok you'll sometimes see drunken Thai men doing this when they're squaring up for a fight. It's similar to English football hooligans tapping the bottom of their chins and saying, "Come on then, if you think you're hard enough!" Only it's more aggressive than that, because once somebody has pointed the soles of his feet at a Thai man, he will feel that he can't back down from a fight without serious loss of face.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2015 6:02 PM

Title: Re: Teacher claims to receive teachings from Brahma god

Content:

Here's the one for the Karaṇīyametta Sutta

Ñāṇavīra wrote in one of his letters about those whose approach to the Dhamma involved "tidy-chart-making". But Dr. Ranatunga seems to be an example of a decidedly untidy chart-maker.

Nonetheless, I've downloaded his talk on the Metta Sutta and will be listening to it tomorrow, if only in the hope of making sense of his chart.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2015 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Mantras

Content:

The ajahn is probably saying 'mantra' because he's talking to an audience who won't know the correct term: parikamma, "preparatory word". A preparatory word is different from a mantra, because the meditator's focus (if she is doing the parikamma practice properly) is upon an idea rather than some audible or mentally imagined sound.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 6:31 AM

Title: Re: Economies of Merit

Content:

The transfer of substance idea — wherein one mentally resolves to give away a portion of one's merit to petas, so that it is the petas rather than oneself who enjoy its vipāka — is from the Milindapañha, not the Suttas. Like merit-transference in the Mahayana, it appears to deviate from the classical Buddhist "ownership of kamma" (kammasakatā) doctrine.

On the other hand, the idea of performing some deed of merit and then inviting "petas" (it's uncertain here whether the term means hungry ghosts, one's departed relatives, or hungry ghosts who happen to be one's departed relatives) to come and rejoice in it and thereby gain merit and relief from their sufferings, is from the Tirokuḍḍa Sutta. Here there is no deviation from classical kamma doctrine, for nothing of one's own kamma is given away; rather, one simply provides the petas with an opportunity to do something meritorious themselves.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kp7>

By the time of Buddhaghosa the Milindapañha's "transfer of substance" idea seems to have been quietly shelved in all the Theravadin scholastic literature, while the Tirokuḍḍa Sutta's view is upheld as the orthodox one. In Asian folk Buddhist practice, on the other hand, merit transference generally entails a melding of the more optimistic features of each of the two conceptions, effectively allowing people to have the best of both worlds.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 7:05 AM

Title: Re: can immaterial goods be stolen?

Content:

Two articles of interest. In the first Ven. Varado offers his views on copyright and Vinaya; in the second he discusses them with the venerables Aggacitta and Kumāra.

<http://sasanarakkha.org/articles/2007/04/copyright-infringement-and-vinaya.html>

<http://sasanarakkha.org/articles/2007/04/dialogue-on-copyright-infringement-and.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 9:41 AM

Title: Re: Who is the Buddha in Three refuges?

Content:

I'm a little mystified as to Nyanaponika's source. The ṭikā to the Mahāsatipaṭṭhāna Sutta doesn't contain any passage like this, nor does it read like anything that any ṭikā author

would say. I mean a clunky phrase like sharing in the shortcomings attached to any human institution is very modern-sounding and it's hard to imagine any Pali commentator ever using it.

Overall it reads more like the sort of thing Nyanaponika himself was wont to say when indulging in one of his German romanticist flights of fancy. Perhaps the venerable was just giving an impressionistic summary of the thoughts that came into his mind after reading the said *ṭīkā*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 10:29 AM

Title: Re: Wrong conducts in regard to sense pleasures?

Content:

MN. 13 is irrelevant to the third precept. The third precept / third kusala kamma patha is concerned solely with sexual restraint. Restraint regarding sense-pleasures in general is part of mental-development (*bhāvanā*), not precept-keeping/moral habit (*sīla*).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 1:28 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Zen differences?

Content:

But what does Reginald Ray mean by the part in bold?

That it's "inappropriate" because it misrepresents the Tibetan view (i.e. no Tibetans ever intended "Hinayana" to refer to any particular Buddhist school)?

Or by "inappropriate" is Ray (a fashionably liberal follower of Tibetan Buddhism) simply voicing a personal preference that Mahayana Buddhists should make a break with the Mahayana's traditional polemical stance and start using some politer term to refer to non-Mahayana schools?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2015 1:47 PM

Title: Re: Wrong conducts in regard to sense pleasures?

Content:

It wouldn't mean that it was fine. It would only mean that it doesn't violate the third precept and it doesn't create the kind of evil kamma that's created by performing the third akusala kamma patha.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 7:34 AM
Title: Re: Mantras
Content:
No.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 7:47 AM
Title: Re: Mantras
Content:

The locus classicus would be the Concentration section of the Visuddhimagga. Most of the forty samatha meditation subjects come accompanied by preparatory words or phrases that are traditionally recited by one who undertakes the practice. In the case of Recollection of the Buddha it would be the words for the Buddha's nine special qualities. In the case of recollection of death it would be "maraṇaṃ maraṇaṃ" ("death, death") or "maraṇaṃ bhaviṣṣati, jīvitindriyaṃ upacchijjissati" ("death will come to me, the life-faculty will be cut off"). In the case of the earth kasiṇa, "paṭhavī, paṭhavī" ("earth, earth"). Although in Asia one finds that most meditators will use the Pali words when doing these practices, this isn't actually required (as it would be in the case of a mantra practice) and indeed it would arguably be better to use one's native tongue, to ensure that one's focus really is upon the word's referent rather than upon the mere sound.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 8:12 AM
Title: Re: Mantras
Content:

In the Thai way of pronouncing it the B is like a P and the D and DH are both like T's: poot-toe.

I remember as a layman back in the early 80's, this Thai pronunciation of 'buddho' caused some problems for Athena, my Greek-Cypriot girlfriend, when she accompanied me on a weekend retreat at Chithurst Forest Monastery. This was at the time when Ajahn Sumedho was still the abbot there, but the retreat was led by his vice-abbot, the late Ajahn Ānando. The ajahn began by instructing us to mentally recite buddho while mindfully breathing: 'bud' on the in-breath and 'dho' on the out-breath. He demonstrated the method by pronouncing the syllables the Thai way: "poot-toe ... poot-toe ... poot-toe..." This resulted in a bout of giggling on the part of Athena that was so uncontrollable she finally had to leave the room. The problem, as I later learned, was that "poot-toe" sounds so much like the Greek vulgarism <https://glosbe.com/el/en/%CF%80%CE%BF%CF%8D%CF%84%CF%83%CE%B1>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 8:32 AM

Title: Re: Mantras

Content:

In any meditation-related sutta that instructs one to think such-and-such, that such-and-such is the parikamma. For example, in this translation of the <http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/khp/khp.9.budd.html>, the parikamma for mettabhāvanā is everything from the line "May all be well and secure..." up to the lines "Let none wish others harm / In resentment or in hate."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 8:40 AM

Title: Re: Who is the Buddha in Three refuges?

Content:

As far as I know, the Paramatthajotikā file that I uploaded earlier is the most comprehensive Theravadin treatment of the refuges and refuge-going.

<http://dhammadawheel.com/viewtopic.php?p=341942#p320225>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and raising children, how?

Content:

If the Bodhisatta had not gone forth, then it's likely that he and Yasodharā would have raised Rāhula in the way that military families of the officer class have throughout history raised their sons, which is to say they would have had very little to do with it. This is based on the recognition that since parents are naturally disposed to spoil and lavish affection upon their children, too much contact with them will make a boy soft. And so as a suckling Rāhula would have been entrusted to wet-nurses, in early infancy to governesses, and in later infancy and adolescence to tutors in the military and political arts.

Now if you wish to do as the Bodhisatta might have done, but are not military yourself, then I believe

<https://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/1999/apr/28/familyandrelationships.feature.s102> describes a fair civilian approximation of a good kshatriya upbringing (though as a Buddhist you might want to leave out the God stuff and the fox-hunting).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2015 9:28 PM

Title: Re: The results of kamma can be avoided?

Content:
Yes, some.

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Why-the-Buddha-Suffered/index.htm>

(Apadāna 39.10 and its Commentary. Translated by Ven Ānandajoti)

Table of Contents

Introduction

The Canonical Verses

1. Austerities
2. Slander
3. Slander
4. Slander
5. Pierced by a Rock
6. Pierced by a Splinter
7. The Elephant Nālāgiri
8. Cut with a Knife
9. A Headache
10. Eating Barley
11. Backache
12. Dysentery

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2015 3:35 PM

Title: Re: Who's sutta pitaka translation do you favor the most?

Content:

My overall favourite is that phenomenal pioneer Thomas Rhys Davids.

I love Dialogues of the Buddha, his rendering of the Dīgha Nikāya, over which the more recent one by Maurice Walshe is scarcely an improvement at all.

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh01davi>

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh02davi>

<https://archive.org/details/dialoguesofbuddh03davi>

And his Vinaya Piṭaka translation with (Hermann Oldenberg) is inferior to the later one by I.B. Horner only on account of its incompleteness. In its accuracy it is rather better than hers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2015 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Royalty in the Buddha's and Rahula's life?

Content:

The texts don't say that the Bodhisatta was more often born into a royal family than into a family of lower estate, nor even that he was more often born as a human than as, say, an animal. That many Jātakas happen to be about his former lives as a king or a prince probably reflects the fact that what kings and princes get up to tends to make for more memorable stories.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 18, 2015 6:38 AM

Title: Re: Monastic life and remorse?

Content:

So it is just a difference of degree?

I think in the Abhidhamma these would probably be treated as two terms for the same thing, namely, the mental factor of kukkucā, variously translated as regret, remorse, or worry. In the Vinaya this mental factor is usually called vipphaṭṭisāra, "remorse". It is always deemed to be unwholesome and can only arise with hate-rooted consciousnesses. On the other hand, the fact that it is unpleasant to experience means that it sometimes prompts a person to want to reform himself by giving up whatever kind of conduct gave rise to it — a case of what the Abhidhamma calls "the unwholesome acting as a condition for the wholesome".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 20, 2015 8:06 PM

Title: Re: Two sutta references sought

Content:

It's the two Dhammavihārī Suttas, A. iii. 86-89. ATI seems to have only the first:

<http://www.accesstosight.org/tipitaka/an/an05/an05.073.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 1:19 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthanasia 'humane'?

Content:

Suppose someone replaced "car" with "birth" and went on to argue that one should feel free to kill any living being one pleases, for by so doing one is merely expediting the

inevitable. Would you agree with them? If not, how would your argument differ from theirs?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 1:33 AM

Title: Re: non-visual sign?

Content:

Here:

<http://www.4shared.com/file/TDUsiK0R/vism.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 2:08 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

I don't think so. They share the two features which Dave, if I understand him right, claims will make the seeming killing an actual non-killing: both entail the same inevitable outcome, differing only in the anticipated time before the inevitable happens, and both entail acting upon a being who is suffering or will (inevitably) suffer, the two beings differing only in the degree of immediacy and palpability of their suffering.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 9:30 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

I think the heat that's typically generated when this matter comes up for discussion comes in large part from partisans on both sides trying to defend stronger positions than the Pali texts will reasonably support and failing to properly distinguish intention and motive. And so we see Buddhist critics of euthanasia denying the very possibility of a kusala motive and Buddhist defenders of euthanasia falling into the Mahayana-like error of treating a motive that is merely mitigatory as if it were exonerative.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 6:24 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

This is no exception, for the same reason as in the frog example.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Constant Jhana?

Content:

It's not the English Ñāṇamoli but the Yugoslavian one. The translation he is citing isn't his own but one of Ñāṇavīra's botch-jobs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

If the ajahn's got an opinion on what authentic jhāna is and regards rival conceptions of jhāna as mistaken, on what grounds do you think he should hold back from saying so in the public arena?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 7:35 PM

Title: Re: Shouldn't abyāpāda-saṅkappa cover avihiṃsā-saṅkappa?

Content:

Bhante,

As far as I know, the scope of vihiṃsā —like the scope of its opposite, avihiṃsā/karuṇā— is limited to actions directed at others. Have you ever met with any evidence suggesting otherwise in the texts?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

I don't see the differences as morally relevant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Constant Jhana?

Content:

In my estimation it's a serious flaw that the translation fails to preserve the connection between the kāmo on the first line and the kāmā on the second. Furthermore, there is

really no excuse for it: had the Buddha wished to say 'things' he had over a dozen words at his disposal.

How badly botched? Well, obviously not as badly as if, say, Thomas Byrom had done it. But botched nonetheless.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2015 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

N.B., This thread is about euthanasia, not meat-eating and vegetarianism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 9:05 AM

Title: Re: AN Commentary (Mp) on AN 4.28: 7 Contemplations, 18 Great Insights, 38 Meditation Objects

Content:

The seven anupassanā are another name for the first seven of the eighteen mahāvipassanā. The eighteen mahāvipassanā (translated as "principal insights") can be found here:

<https://tipitakamyanmar2.blogspot.com/2012/01/chapter-xx.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 10:24 AM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

Faulty analogy, for though many different things may all count equally as fruit, there are no grounds for thinking that many different and incompatible conceptions of 'jhāna' all equally count as the jhāna of the Buddha's teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 11:16 AM

Title: Re: Can a lay person achieve nirvana?

Content:

It's not true. Those who say this are usually either citing some traditional local folk belief or else misreporting a teaching from the Milindapañha to the effect that it isn't possible to remain in the household life after one has attained arahantship. According to this text, a householder who attains will either go forth into the homeless life within a short

period or will die.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 1:23 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

In this sutta, 'cause' is being used to include both association condition and decisive support condition, which is to say it's being used in a broader sense than in this thread. In the passage you've cited, lobha is a cause by way of decisive support condition and dosa and moha by way of association condition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 2:29 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

So if this is correct, then the jhāna-attainment rate of those who attempt samatha-bhāvanā will range from one in a million to one in a thousand million, while the jhāna-mastery rate will range from one in a hundred million to one in a trillion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 7:37 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

But this is irrelevant to the thread, for unlike in the case of pāṇātipāta, the conduct you describe is not prompted by a mental factor that aims at the ending of its ārammaṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 7:45 PM

Title: Re: How much to Practise to gain Enlightenment

Content:

No, nobody can knowingly say how long it will take. Even among those who were taught by the Buddha himself there were some who were awakened just listening to a single Dhamma talk by him and there were others who were awakened only after decades of striving.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 22, 2015 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

you seem to be doing what so many do when this topic comes up for discussion, namely, confusing intention and motive.

John kills his granny because she is terminally ill and pleads to be put out of her misery. Fred kills his granny because he is impatient to inherit her money.

The intention is identical in both cases: to kill a human being. Therefore the kamma in both cases is of an identical type: *pāṇātipāta*. The motives differ: that of John mitigates his *akusala* kamma, that of Fred aggravates it. But John's motive does not make his action into something different from *pāṇātipāta*. When an action is of an intrinsically *akusala* character (e.g., killing, stealing, lying, etc.), even the most admirable motive in the world will not transform it into a *kusala* action.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 6:57 AM

Title: Re: Can a lay person achieve nirvana?

Content:

If the Milinda is right then these lay arahants' inability to ordain will lead to their death. If the Milinda is wrong then it won't. From the point of view of one who "awaits his time as a servant his wages" either outcome is a matter of indifference.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 7:21 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

1. There is a pre-volition (*pubbacetanā*) to help the ailing dog. This is *kusala*.
2. Then arises the thought that the dog can be helped only by ending its existence.
3. Then arises a volition (*cetanā*) to end its existence. This is *akusala* in that such a volition is perforce accompanied by *vyāpāda*.
4. Acting on this volition one instructs a vet to euthanize the dog.
5. The vet does as ordered, the dog dies, and the *akusala* *kamma* patha of intentional killing is completed.

The volition that leads one to give the instruction to the vet is what determines the action to be *akusala*.

The pre-volition that came before does not determine the moral character of the action (*kusala* or *akusala*) but only the moral degree (light or weighty). Why? Because the pre-volition did not give rise to the speaking of the instructions to the vet. It was the later volition that did this and so it was the later volition that determined the moral character of the action.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 8:15 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

I disagree. Inasmuch as the Buddha states his moral pronouncements and exhortations to be made *ekamsena*, "absolutely", "definitively", "without qualification", "unequivocally", the Dhamma is certainly a species of moral absolutism.

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

“I say definitively (*ekamsena*), Ānanda, that deeds of bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct are not to be done.”

“Since, Bhante, the Blessed One has declared definitively that deeds of bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct are not to be done, what danger is to be expected in acting thus?”

“Ānanda, I have declared definitively that deeds of bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct are not to be done because in acting thus this danger is to be expected: one blames oneself; the wise, having investigated, censure one; a bad report circulates about one; one dies confused; and with the breakup of the body, after death, one is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. I have declared definitively that deeds of bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct are not to be done because in acting thus this danger is to be expected.

“I say definitively (*ekamsena*), Ānanda, that deeds of bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct are to be done.”

“Since, Bhante, the Blessed One has declared definitively that deeds of bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct are to be done, what benefit is to be expected in acting thus?”

“Ānanda, I have declared definitively that deeds of bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct are to be done because in acting thus this benefit is to be expected: one does not blame oneself; the wise, having investigated, praise one; one acquires a good reputation; one dies unconfused; and with the breakup of the body, after death, one is reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world. I have declared definitively that deeds of bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct are to be done because in acting thus this benefit is to be expected.”

(A. ii. 57-8)

“What do you think, Dhānañjāni? Suppose someone here were to behave contrary to the Dhamma, to behave unrighteously for the sake of his parents, and then because of such behaviour the wardens of hell were to drag him off to hell. Would he be able [to free himself by pleading thus]: ‘It was for the sake of my parents that I behaved contrary to the Dhamma, that I behaved unrighteously, so let not the wardens of hell drag me off to hell’? Or would his parents be able to free him by pleading thus: ‘It was for our sake that he behaved contrary to the Dhamma, that he behaved unrighteously, so let not the wardens of hell [drag him off] to hell’?”

“No, Master Sāriputta. Even while he was crying out, the wardens of hell would fling him into hell.”

[repeat the same, replacing “for the sake of his parents” with “for the sake of his wife and children ... slaves, servants, and workers ... friends and companions ... kinsmen and relatives ... guests ... departed ancestors ... devas ... king”]
(Dhānañjāni Sutta, M. 97)

“Just as the great ocean is stable and does not overflow its boundaries, so too, when I have prescribed a training rule for my disciples, they will not transgress it even for life’s sake. This is the second astounding and amazing quality that the bhikkhus see in this Dhamma and discipline because of which they take delight in it.”
(Pahārāda Sutta, A. iv. 198)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 8:48 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

Yes, for wrong speech is possible only for one in whom the three akusala roots are still unabandoned. Being unpleasant to the ear does not automatically disqualify speech from being right. See the Abhayarājakumāra Sutta.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.058.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 11:35 AM

Title: Re: Non-attachment and social issues

Content:

I don't think any of the suttas you cite support your position. They all have to do with the abandoning of māna-saṃyojana, the "fetter of conceit", and have nothing to say against

participation in campaigns for sexual equality, gay rights, or other causes relating to social justice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 1:17 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

A way where any third-rate samādhi experience gets passed as being jhāna. The easiest of all is probably the one that gets volubly advertised on Dhamma Wheel by Vimalaramsi's students. Slightly more demanding would be that of Ayya Khemā and Leigh Brasington. And so on and so forth until we get to those who teach authentic Sutta-based jhāna with no fivefold sense-consciousnesses and no thinking.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 4:12 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

It seems that we are working with different definitions of the term. Moral absolutism, as I understand it, is the position that at least some actions are intrinsically good or intrinsically bad, regardless of their consequences. In the Buddha's teachings the ten akusala kammaṭṭhāpāṭha would be examples of intrinsically bad actions.

It's true that Buddhist sīla isn't entirely absolutist; for example, the laying down of the Vinaya rules was prompted as often as not by consequentialist considerations.

However, to the extent that Buddhist ethics is concerned with kusala and akusala kamma it does assume an absolutist form: actions of body and speech by a non-arahant are always akusala when produced by a volition accompanied by greed, hate or delusion, and always kusala when produced by a volition rooted in non-greed, non-hate or non-delusion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 4:16 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

How the listener feels is irrelevant to determining whether a speech-act is kusala, akusala or (in the case of arahants) kiriyā. The speaker's intention alone determines this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 4:45 PM

Title: Re: Shouldn't abyāpāda-saṅkappa cover avihimsā-saṅkappa?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 5:50 PM

Title: Re: Non-attachment and social issues

Content:

One's judgment that some state of affairs involves an injustice needn't be conditioned by māna or rāga. For example, in the texts' treatment of sadisoḥamasmīti māna (the conceit of supposing oneself to be the equal of another), this conceit is classified as threefold according to whether one is in fact equal, superior or inferior to the person with whom one compares oneself. Now for such a classification to have any meaning presupposes that equality is something that may obtain in fact and not merely in one's conceiving of it. That beings so, there is an objective basis —a basis in reality and not merely in our conceits— to judge some state of affairs to be just or unjust and to champion this or that reforming cause on the basis of this judgment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 6:50 PM

Title: Re: Shouldn't abyāpāda-saṅkappa cover avihimsā-saṅkappa?

Content:

Quite.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

The aversion-rooted consciousness that causes one to kill has as its object the life-faculty of another being.

The mental factors that arise with that consciousness also have that other being's life-faculty as their object.

One of those mental factors, dosa, aims at the destruction of that life-faculty.

So in the present context, the object of the killer's dosa is not the dog but the life-faculty that the dog retains and which will mean suffering for the dog so long as he continues to retain it. The mental factor of dosa aims at the ending of that life-faculty.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 10:19 PM
Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm
Content:

Perhaps the wisest course for most people would be to just study the Dhamma and tend their own gardens, leaving the polemical defence of orthodoxy to those who enjoy a good argument. Life's very short and there's way too much bad doctrine and newfangled methods being taught for anyone to go around correcting all of it.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 23, 2015 10:28 PM
Title: Re: Lance Cousins, RIP
Content:
Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies' obituary by Sarah Shaw.

<http://ocbs.org/news-ocbsmain-88/374-ocbs-news-june-2015?start=1>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 5:51 AM
Title: Re: Non-attachment and social issues
Content:

Suppose that I'm a woman and on account of my sex am being paid less than a male employee for doing exactly the same job and doing it just as well as he. This state of affairs is manifestly an unjust one and if I campaign against it, then it doesn't "expose the defiled nature of the urge for equality". All it exposes is my lack of moral blindness and refusal to countenance my employer's bad habits.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 10:29 AM
Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm
Content:

It was actually Epicurus's garden I had in mind, being both the place where the man taught as well as an Epicurean symbol for ataraxia / impassibility. But I suppose Candide's will do as well.

By the way, I don't know if you propose to read Candide in French or in English translation, but if the latter, do get the Norton Critical or the Oxford World Classics edition. The earlier English renderings were all butchered by heavy bowdlerization.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 1:27 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sumedho interview: Rebirth and Pacifism

Content:

There is no mention of heaven and hell in either the Suttas' statement of the tenfold mundane right view or the commentarial elaboration of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 2:35 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka Translation

Content:

The most useful for this purpose are in fact the translations of Bhikkhu Bodhi, for he mostly translates according to the commentarial understanding and on those occasions when he departs from it he does his readers the courtesy of appending a note to let them know how the passage was understood by the commentators.

As for those translations that consciously aim to follow the commentators throughout, the quality is generally poor.

I.B. Horner had a high regard for the commentaries and attempted to translate the Vinaya Piṭaka and Majjhima Nikāya in line with their glosses. Unfortunately her grasp of commentarial Pali was very weak, so as often as not she got it all wrong, especially in her Vinaya translation.

The translations by the Myanmar Piṭaka Association show a poor grasp of English diction on the part of the translators, resulting in frequently bad choices for rendering Pali technical terms.

So, the only ones that are really worth reading are the handful of translations of individual suttas and their commentaries by Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi, along with Ñāṇamoli's translation of the Khuddakapāṭha and its commentary (Minor Readings and Illustrator).

The suttas in question are (by Bhikkhu Bodhi) the Brahmajāla, Sāmaññaphala, Mahānidāna and Mūlapariyaya, and (by Ñāṇamoli) the Sammādiṭṭhi.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 3:51 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sumedho interview: Rebirth and Pacifism

Content:

The existence of realms of devas, petas, asuras, nerayikas, etc., is certainly a part of the Buddha's teaching. But believing in all this is not a part of mundane right view. Mundane right view is essentially about acceptance of the doctrines of ownership of kamma, the

subjection to rebirth of all beings who are not free of the āsavas, and the possibility of an efficacious brahmacariyā. Acceptance of these does not necessarily entail having any particular convictions about the variety of states into which beings may be born.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 4:22 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

Since sound is cognizable only by the two kinds of ear-consciousness, all other consciousnesses—including the jhānic ones—arise in silence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 5:06 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sumedho interview: Rebirth and Pacifism

Content:

I don't know what Ajahn Sumedho's personal beliefs are with regard to the traditional Buddhist cosmology, or even whether he has any beliefs about it.

You are right that I don't agree with the ajahn's notion of this cosmology being "simply a metaphor for the whole realm of human experience". There's simply no support for this idea in the Theravada texts (nor in the Mahayana ones, as far as I know). It's just something that some modern teachers have taken to saying when trying to "speak to the condition" of audiences who are sceptical about the traditional view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 6:00 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sumedho interview: Rebirth and Pacifism

Content:

Dear Robert,

The commentaries understand opapātika to be used in two distinct senses: one in the context of the four modes of generation and the other in the context of mundane right and wrong view.

The first sense is found, for example, in the Mahāsīhanāda Sutta (MN. 12):

Katamā ca, Sāriputta, opapātikā yoni? Devā, nerayikā, ekacce ca manussā, ekacce ca vinipātikā: ayaṃ vuccati, Sāriputta, opapātikā yoni.

“What is spontaneous generation? There are devas, denizens of hell, certain human beings, and certain beings in the lower worlds; this is called spontaneous generation.

As for the second sense, in the tenfold mundane right and wrong view, the commentarial understanding is that opapātika has a broader range.
Natthi sattā opapātikā ti cavitvā upapajjanakā sattā nāma natthīti vadati.

“ ‘There are no beings who are opapātika’ — ‘Living beings who have passed away and then appeared again do not exist,’ he declares.”

(Commentary to the Sāmaññaphala Sutta)

In other words, the wrong view regarding opapātika is taken to be a denial of rebirth in general and right view an assertion of the same.

However, most English translators don’t agree with the commentaries that opapātikā has a different meaning in this second context. Consequently, they insist on translating it as if the first meaning applied throughout:

‘There is something given, something offered, something sacrificed; there is a fruit or result of good and bad actions; there is this world, there is the other world; there is mother, there is father; there are beings who are reborn spontaneously; there are good and virtuous recluses and brahmins in the world who have themselves realised by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world.’

Now when opapātika gets translated this way it does indeed look as if it’s declaring the existence of “devas, denizens of hell, human beings, and certain beings in the lower worlds” to be an essential component of mundane right view. When it’s translated the commentarial way, however, it is simply asserting the fact of rebirth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 6:11 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

The unwholesome-resultant ear-consciousness and the wholesome-resultant rootless ear-consciousness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 6:42 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

The six roots are greed, hate, delusion, non-greed, non-hate, non-delusion.

The five sensory consciousnesses all arise unaccompanied by any of these six.

In the case of the unwholesome resultant fivefold sense-consciousnesses it isn't necessary to draw attention to their rootlessness by naming them 'rootless', because every unwholesome resultant is rootless.

In the case of the wholesome resultant fivefold sense-consciousnesses it is necessary

to draw attention to their rootlessness in order to distinguish them from those wholesome resultants that are accompanied by roots.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2015 8:02 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

The terms 'wholesome' and 'unwholesome' applied to resultant consciousnesses refer not to the consciousnesses themselves but to the past karmas that gave rise to them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 3:17 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

In the Vinaya (e.g., Vin. iii. 73) and in the Suttas (e.g., D. ii. 305), the life-faculty is that which when it is cut off makes you dead. In the Abhidhamma more precise and technical descriptions are given, but as these are descriptions concerned with fostering insight development, an examination of them for our present purposes would be overkill.

As to the would-be killer's awareness of his victim's life-faculty, except in the unlikely event that he has discerned it through bhāvanā, his knowledge of it will be no more than inferential. That is, he will know of it through its effects: the continuance of vitality in the living being, as manifested in its appearance and behaviour, or else detectable via the medical monitoring devices.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

In all of the Suttas' arahant suicide narratives, the commentarial understanding is that the monks in question cut their throats as worldlings and then attained a "betwixt the stirrup and the ground" arahantship in the short space of life that remained to them.

If the commentaries are right then the suicides were acts of men whose kilesas were still intact. If the commentaries are wrong then we must treat death by one's own hand as being something other than pāṇātipāṭa, given that the Suttas unqualifiedly declare an arahant to be incapable of the latter. (There is in fact a strong Vinaya case to be made for this, quite independently of any conclusions one might draw from these alleged suicides by arahants). Either way the episodes don't provide any support for the notion that intentional killing of a living being might on occasion be an undefiled act.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 3:50 AM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

Only in the sense that the disjunction between inanimate (*aviññāṇaka*) *rūpa*, such as that of a stone or a rotting corpse, and animate (*saviññāṇaka*) *rūpa*, such as that of living humans and animals, is conceived as absolute and not merely a matter of degree.

Other than that the description's not a very comfortable fit. In vitalist theories...

1. The animating principle is usually an immaterial one. Buddhist doctrine posits both a material and a non-material *jīvitindriya*.

2. The animating principle is usually unitary. In Buddhist doctrine, besides the twofold distinction mentioned above, an instance of the material *jīvitindriya* is present in every single materiality-cluster (*rūpakalāpa*) in one's body, so in effect there are billions of them.

3. The animating principle is either everlasting or at least lasts for the duration of a being's life. In Buddhist doctrine the *jīvitindriya* is as ephemeral as any other dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 6:50 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

The suttas in question have been quoted time and time again in past *jhāna* threads. The interpretation which sees them as allowing for hearing (and the other sensory consciousnesses) to occur in *jhāna* has been refuted time and time again, notably by Sylvester.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 7:26 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Is animal euthenasia 'humane'?

Content:

No, I wasn't thinking of either of those but of an episode in the Pārājikakaṇḍa (Vin. iii. 82).

It relates that an unhappy bhikkhu, wishing to kill himself, jumped off Vulture's Peak and landed on top of a basket-maker. The basket-maker was killed but the bhikkhu survived. The matter was then reported to the Buddha. Since the bhikkhu had no intention of killing the basket-maker, obviously that action was no offence. But what about the attempted suicide? If it were the case that suicide was pāṇātipāta, then the bhikkhu's unsuccessful attempt would have amounted to an incomplete commission of the third pārājika. In that case we should expect the Buddha to have declared him guilty of a thullaccaya offence, as would be the case with a bhikkhu who made an unsuccessful murder attempt. Instead the Buddha pronounces the bhikkhu's action to be no offence at all. He then proceeds to establish a new minor rule making it a misdemeanour for bhikkhus to jump from high places.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Is Jhana biochemical?

Content:

While a yogi is in jhāna, the pīti, sukha, etc. associated with each jhānic consciousness produce mind-generated subtle-materiality-clusters throughout the length and breadth of his body, and in such profusion as to completely surround and pervade all the coarser kamma-generated, nutriment-generated and temperature-generated materiality-clusters. Hence the celebrated simile of the Mahāsakuludāyī Sutta:

“He makes the rapture and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill, and pervade this body, so that there is no part of his whole body unpervaded by the rapture and pleasure born of seclusion. Just as a skilled bath man or a bath man’s apprentice heaps bath powder in a metal basin and, sprinkling it gradually with water, kneads it till the moisture wets his ball of bath powder, soaks it and pervades it inside and out, yet the ball itself does not ooze; so too, a bhikkhu makes the rapture and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill, and pervade this body, so that there is no part of his whole body unpervaded by the rapture and pleasure born of seclusion.”

(Bh. Bodhi tr.)

Some teachers nowadays read this simile too literally, imagining that it is the pīti itself that is spreading through the body, which is not in fact the case. The jhānic pīti arises in the same place that all pīti arises: the heart-base. But though it arises only in one place in the body, there is no part of the body that fails to be affected by it.

Then upon emerging from jhāna, for some minutes or hours afterwards the sense-sphere wholesome consciousnesses in the ensuing javana-processes carry on generating subtle-materiality-clusters, thus imbuing jhāna yogis with their characteristic radiance of complexion (as in the Sutta's description of Anuruddha, for instance), elegance of posture, and buoyancy and fluidity of bodily movement.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 25, 2015 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Is Jhana biochemical?

Content:

A beautiful example of this, in the person of Preah Mahā Ghosānanda, the late Cambodian patriarch, noted for his accomplishment in the illimitable meditations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 26, 2015 11:30 PM

Title: Re: New wikipedia article, Dhyana sutras (Chan Jing)

Content:

Your quotation is from a section entitled "Doctrinal differences with other schools". In such a context the statement is quite correct: the developed Theravāda was indeed one of the ekābhisamaya or "sudden enlightenment" schools, as opposed to the anupubbābhisamaya or "gradual enlightenment" schools like the Andhakas, Sarvastivādins, Sammitiyas and Bhadrāyānikas.

Since in the Suttas one will find passages that appear to support both views, this became quite a major topic of debate at the Third Council. For the Kathāvatthu's record of this:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.9>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 26, 2015 11:44 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Michael Freedman,

The Characterization of Ānanda in the Pāli Canon of the Theravāda: A Hagiographic Study

<https://macsphere.mcmaster.ca/handle/11375/15547>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 26, 2015 11:54 PM

Title: Re: Using the robes as rags etc.?

Content:

It's still the custom to put worn-out robes to some use or other, but I don't think it's common for it to be done in precisely the way described by Ānanda. In a Thai forest

monastery the commonest use for a worn-out robe is as a water-strainer, a sunshade for one's verandah or walking meditation path, or a false ceiling to keep one's hut cool in the hot season and warm in the cool season.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 1:16 AM

Title: Re: New wikipedia article, Dhyana sutras (Chan Jing)

Content:

would apply to every single one of the modern Burmese vipassanā traditions and any other meditation traditions that take the Abhidhamma seriously. All of them hold that the three lower fetters of sakkāyadiṭṭhi, sīlabbatapārāmāsa and vicikicchā are not gradually worn away but are wiped out in a single thought-moment when the yogi arrives at stream-entry noble path consciousness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 7:23 AM

Title: Re: New wikipedia article, Dhyana sutras (Chan Jing)

Content:

In a section entitled Doctrinal differences with other schools a responsible Wikipedia contributor will be concerned with giving an accurate statement of the Theravada's distinctive features. Ekābhisamaya happens to be one of these, regardless of whether you think its compassionate to say so and regardless of what you think will appeal to the public's "better instincts".

That being so, if any amendment to the Wikipedia entry is warranted, it would consist not in excision but in amplification, e.g., an account of how the Theravada has traditionally interpreted those Sutta passages that appear to support the anupubbābhisamaya position and perhaps also some mention of those modern Theravadins who dissent from their school's traditional position on this question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 7:40 AM

Title: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

I haven't done it myself, but it looks very well-prepared and pupil-friendly.

http://www.pamc.org.sg/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=70&Itemid=68&lang=en

http://www.pamc.org.sg/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=95&Itemid=85&lang=en

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 11:46 AM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

Yes, that isn't surprising.

As their native tongue belongs to the same language family as Pali, the Sri Lankans' way of pronouncing Pali is mostly in line with the phonetic descriptions given in the ancient Pali grammars, with only two or three mispronunciations. The Thais on the other hand, will typically pronounce 15 of the Pali consonants right and the other 18 wrong:

k ... ✓

kh ... ✓

g ... ✗ (Thais mispronounce as kh)

gh ... ✗ (" kh)

ṅ ... ✓

c ... ✗ (" j)

ch ... ✓

j ... ✗ (" ch)

jh ... ✗ (" ch)

ñ ... ✗ (" y)

ṭ ... ✗ (" t)

ṭh ... ✗ (" th)

ḍ ... ✗ (" th)

ḍh ... ✗ (" th)

ṇ ... ✗ (" n)

t ... ✓

th ... ✓

d ... ✗ (" th)

dh ... ✗ (" th)

n ... ✓

p ... ✓

ph ... ✓

b ... ✗ (" ph)

bh ... ✗ (" ph)

m ... ✓

y ... ✓
r ... ✓
l ... ✓
v ... X (" w)
s ... ✓
h ... ✓
ḷ ... X (" l)
ṃ ... X (" ṇ)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 3:51 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

Actually the phonetic descriptions in the ancient grammars aren't nearly precise enough for us to know whether this rhotic consonant is meant to be a trill (/r/; /R/), a tap (/r/, /ɾ/) or an approximant (/ɹ/; /ɻ/), so any of them might conceivably be right. However, since out of these six possibilities the two kinds of trill (i.e. the alveolar and the uvular) are by far the commonest rhotic sounds in the world's languages, the odds are that the Pali r will be one or the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 4:01 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

A member has sent me a message asking how the Pali pronunciation of English-speaking Buddhists compares with that of the Sri Lankans and Thais. The short answer is that the pronunciation of most of us is nearly, but not quite, as bad as that of the Thais.

A longer answer would be that a native English-speaker who has had some elementary instruction in Pali pronunciation (e.g., enough for her to know that the "th" in Theravada is not pronounced like the "th" in think and that the Pali "c" is not like the "c" in cabin), but who does not usually make a conscious effort to get her pronunciation exactly right, will typically realise 18 consonants correctly and 15 wrongly. This is the usual pattern:

k ... X (needless aspirate inserted: e.g. Kassapa realised as Khassapa)
kh ... ✓
g ... ✓
gh ... X (aspiration neglected: e.g. Ghosa = &Gosa)
ṇ ... ✓

c ... ✓

ch ... **X** (aspiration neglected: e.g. Channa => Canna)

j ... ✓

jh ... **X** (aspiration neglected: e.g. jhāna => jāna)

ñ ... ✓

ṭ ... **X** (retroflex realised as dental or alveolar; needless aspirate inserted: e.g. ṭāma => thāma)

ṭh ... **X** (retroflex realised as dental or alveolar: e.g. ṭhāna => thāna)

ḍ ... **X** (retroflex realised as dental or alveolar: e.g. ḍiṇḍima => dindima)

ḍh ... **X** (retroflex realised as dental or alveolar; aspiration neglected: e.g. aḍḍho => addo)

ṇ ... **X** (retroflex realised as dental or alveolar: e.g. aṇṇava => annava)

t ... **X** (needless aspirate inserted: e.g. Gotama => Gothama)

th ... ✓

d ... ✓

dh ... **X** (aspiration neglected: e.g. Dhamma = Damma)

n ... ✓

p ... **X** (needless aspirate inserted: e.g. parisā => pharisā)

ph ... ✓

b ... ✓

bh ... **X** (aspiration neglected: e.g. bhojana => bojana)

m ... ✓

y ... ✓

r ... ✓

l ... ✓

v ... ✓

s ... ✓

h ... ✓

ḷ ... **X** (retroflex approximant realised as dental or postalveolar: e.g. daḷhi => dalhi)

ṃ ... **X** (nasalis simplex realised as velar nasal: e.g. iṃam => imaṇ)

Then there are two further mistakes commonly made by English-speaking Buddhists that would be impossible for a Thai to make.

1. Wrong syllabification of aspirated consonants. For example, when the Forest Sangha monks in Britain are giving the refuges and precepts one often hears them mispronouncing buddhaṃ as bud-haṃ or saṅghaṃ as saṅg-haṃ. The correct syllabification is bud-dhaṃ and saṅ-ghaṃ.

2. The failure to pronounce both consonants in a double-consonant cluster. In English, for example, "mummy" and "daddy" are pronounced /'mʌmi/ and /'dadi/, but if they were

Pali words the double-m and double-d would need to be given their full value and with a clear hiatus between them. Most English-speaking Buddhists neglect to do this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 4:33 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

Do you have a more precise link? This one leads only to a Facebook group, not to any particular talk or article.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 5:15 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

Yes. In the case of Pali my own (partial) solution to the syllabification problem is a new romanization system which I call Sundararomāna (“Elegant Roman”). Its main advantages are its elimination of the need to use two letters to represent a single Pali aspirated consonant; its elimination of all the unsightly underdots and overdots of the PTS system; and its reduction of the nasalis simplex consonant from the wide-bodied typographical nuisance it is today (i.e. ṃ or ṛṇ) into the unassuming little ring that it is in virtually every Asian Pali script:

aṃ = α°

iṃ = ĩ

uṃ = ũ

A couple of examples for comparison...

Sundararomāna:

“Pubbaṇṇaṇṇū atṭaṇṇū, niruttipadakovidō,
Suggahīṇaṇṇa gaṇḥaṇṇī, atṭaṇṇopaparikkati.”
(Ānanda, Teragāthā 1031)

Knowing what comes first and last, knowing the meaning,
well-skilled in understanding words and their interpretation,
he seizes it in a good grasp and examines the meaning.

PTS system:

“Pubbāparaṇṇū atthaṇṇū, niruttipadakovidō,
Suggahīṇaṇṇa gaṇḥāṇṇī, atthaṇṇopaparikkhati.”

(Ānanda, Theragāthā 1031)

Sundararomāna:

Kaggavisaṇṇa Sutta

Sabbesu būtesu nidāyā daṇḍa,°aviheṭṭaya aññatarampi tesa,°
Na puttamicceyya kuto sahaṃ,°eko care kaggavisaṇṇakappo.

Saṁsaggajāṭassa bhavanti sneha, snehanvaya dukkamida pahoti,
Ādīnava snehaja pekkamaṇo, eko care kaggavisaṇṇakappo.

Mitte suhajje anukampamaṇo, haṇṇeti attha paṭibaddhacitto,
Eta bhaya saṁfave pekkamaṇo, eko care kaggavisaṇṇakappo.

Vaṁso visālova yatha visatto, puttesu dāsesu ca ya āpekkā,
Vaṁsakkaṭīrova sajjamaṇo, eko care kaggavisaṇṇakappo.

Migo araṇṇamhi yatha ābaddho, yeniccaka gacchati gocarāya,
Viññū naro serita pekkamaṇo, eko care kaggavisaṇṇakappo.

PTS system:

Khaggavisāṇa Sutta

Sabbesu bhūtesu nidhāya daṇḍam, aviheṭṭhayaṁ aññatarampi tesam,
Na puttamiccheyya kuto sahaṃ, eko care khaggavisāṇakappo.

Saṁsaggajātassa bhavanti snehā, snehanvayaṁ dukkhamidaṁ pahoti,
Ādīnavaṁ snehajaṁ pekkhamāno, eko care khaggavisāṇakappo.

Mitte suhajje anukampamāno, hāṇṇeti atthaṁ paṭibaddhacitto,
Etaṁ bhayaṁ saṁfave pekkhamāno, eko care khaggavisāṇakappo.

Vaṁso visālova yathā visatto, puttesu dāsesu ca yā apekkhā,
Vaṁsakkaṭīrova sajjamāno, eko care khaggavisāṇakappo.

Migo araṇṇamhi yathā abaddho, yenicchakaṁ gacchati gocarāya,
Viññū naro seritaṁ pekkhamāno, eko care khaggavisāṇakappo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 27, 2015 8:07 PM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

I don't see how one can make such a judgment, given that the ajahn's anecdote reports only the meditator's alleged unresponsiveness to external stimuli, while relating nothing at all about his subjective experience.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 11:49 AM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

They mean exactly what they say: All the world's languages come from Pali. When Abhassara devas degenerate into humans, Pali is what they speak. If you're reborn in the Brahmā world, Pali is what you'll speak with the other Brahmā deities. If your mum had left you in the forest when you were a baby and you'd been raised by wolves, you'd have grown up speaking Pali. And having Pali as their mother tongue is one of the regularities found in all Sammāsambuddhas who appear in the world.

In saying all this, Ven. Sugatavamsa is repeating the claims made about the Pali language by the commentators, e.g., Buddhaghosa in his commentary to the Vibhaṅga, Dhammapāla in his commentary to the Udāna, Mahānāma in his commentary to the Paṭisambhidāmagga, etc.

In modern Theravada pariyatti such claim aren't made as often as they were before the invention of scientific historical philology, but one will still hear them from Asian monks whose Pali education has been according to some very traditional monastic curriculum and who haven't had any exposure to modern linguistics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 11:57 AM

Title: Re: Jhana definition by Ajahn Brahm

Content:

No.

‘In which I constantly abide’ is a rather poor translation. When a Pali verb is qualified by the adverb *niccakappaṃ* it indicates that the action it expresses is one engaged in regularly or frequently, but not necessarily continuously and without interruption. *Niccakappaṃ* most often qualifies the expression *sādhukaṃ manasikaroti*, “to pay careful attention to something” — obviously not something that anyone does, or even could do, uninterruptedly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 2:42 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

No. I think they are based on the fact that Buddhaghosa and Dhammapāla were creatures of their age, and their age was twelve centuries before the likes of Sir William Jones and Lord Monboddo — an age when there were no such things as historical philology, comparative linguistics, Indo-European studies, or the scientific investigation of language acquisition in infants. What they have to say simply reflects the state of linguistics of that time.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_linguistics

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/James_Burnett,_Lord_Monboddo

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_Jones_%28philologist%29

Buddhaghosa:

But here, as to saying that beings learn a tongue, this is only when it is told them; for a mother and father, when their children are small, lay them on a bed or on a chair and, speaking such and such words, do such and such work. The children define such and such speech of theirs thus: 'By this that is mentioned, by this that is mentioned.' As time goes on, they get to know the whole tongue.

The mother is Tamil, the father is Andhaka. The child born of them, if he hears the mother's speech first, will speak the Tamil tongue; if he hears the father's speech first, he will speak the Andhaka tongue. But not hearing either speech, he will speak the Māgadha tongue. And he who is reborn in a great forest without a village and where there is no-one else who speaks, he too, when he creates speech of his own accord, will speak only the Māgadha tongue.

And in hell, in the animal kind of generation, in the realm of ghosts, in the human world and in the world of deities, everywhere the Māgadha tongue is foremost.

Herein the rest of the eighteen tongues beginning with the Oṭṭa, the Kirāta, the Andhaka, the Greek and the Tamil, change; only this Māgadha tongue, correctly called the perfect (brahma) usage, the noble usage, does not change.

Also the Fully Enlightened One, in announcing the Buddha word of the Tipiṭaka, did so only in the Māgadha tongue.

(Sammohavinodanī 387-8; Dispeller of Delusion II. 128)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Sugatavamsa's Introductory Pali course

Content:

Niraye, tiracchānayaniyaṃ, pettivisaṃsā, manussaloka, deva-loketi sabbattha māgadhabhāsāva ussannā."

"And in hell, in the animal kind of generation, in the realm of ghosts, in the human world and in the world of deities, everywhere the Māgadha tongue is foremost."

It wouldn't necessarily imply that all animals speak the Māgadha tongue, because the same thing is said of humans too, and obviously we don't all speak it.

But as to what exactly the commentator did intend by 'ussannā' (translated here as 'foremost'), I'm not really sure. It could mean either that he thought Māgadha was the language most widely spoken by animals or that it was the best of the various languages that animals speak.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 9:50 PM

Title: Re: Constant Jhana?

Content:

Your paraphrase seems to overlook some key words in Mahākoṭṭhita's question. What he asked Sāriputta was not simply what could be known in the absence of the five senses, but what could be known by a manoviññāṇa that was entirely purified.

And so Sāriputta wouldn't have mentioned the first jhāna, which is not entirely purified, but tainted by vitakka and vicāra, nor the second, which is tainted with pīti, nor the third, which is tainted with sukha. In the Suttas no absorption state short of the fourth jhāna is ever described as "upekkhā-sati-pārisuddhiṃ", "entirely purified by equanimity and mindfulness".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2015 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to describe attainments for teaching?

Content:

The recollection of former dwellings (pubbenivāsānussati) is one of the three vijjās and the six abhiññās, both of which are classed as "dhammas exceeding the human". So if a bhikkhu tells an unordained person of any former lives that he has remembered by means of pubbenivāsānussati, and with the aim of letting the listeners know that he has this power, it would be a pācittiya offence.

On the other hand, it wouldn't be an offence for a bhikkhu to speak to unordained persons about any former lives that have been spontaneously remembered by him without any supernormal means. And possibly it wouldn't be an offence to speak of former lives that he has remembered by means of pubbenivāsānussati, but without stating that this was the means by which he remembered them. (The last point, however, is a disputed one).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 7:59 AM

Title: Re: Using the robes as rags etc.?

Content:

In most monasteries it's up to the individual bhikkhu. Exceptions are places like royal monasteries, where they tend to be rather prissy and fashion-conscious. For example, when I was living at Wat Benchamabophit (an A-category royal temple in Bangkok), if I got so little as an ink-stain on my robes I'd be pressured to change them for a new set immediately. Another exception would be the stricter forest monasteries, where monks would be expected to make their robes last for as long as possible and the robe-distribution officer may refuse to give you cloth to sew yourself a new robe if he doesn't think your present one is decrepit enough.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 11:38 AM

Title: Re: Monks/Nuns and iPads

Content:

In practice monks applying the mahāpadesas will often draw different conclusion as to the allowability of this or that, disagreeing about what it is in the Vinaya that computers, cars, telephones, etc. can be most aptly compared to.

One monk, for example, might take the view that a computer is an expensive luxury item, and as such is comparable to such prohibited items as rugs made of pure black goats' wool or ivory needlecases.

A second monk might partially agree with this, but then argue that although it's improper for an individual monk to own a computer, it's ok for the sangha to collectively own one, treating it as being among the immovable property of the monastery.

A third monk might reason that since he only intends to use the computer for communicating the Dhamma, his ownership of it is comparable to the permitted practice of owning and wearing a pair of leather sandals with multi-level soles when going on a journey to teach the Dhamma in rough terrain outside the Middle Gangetic Valley.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 1:30 PM

Title: Re: Fake Buddhist monks are the new squeegee men of New York

Content:

Inspector Garthwaite is probably using it in the British English sense, where its semantic range includes a weaker sense where something is obtained not by violence,

intimidation or coercion, but "... by importunity, strong arguments or any powerful influence" (OED).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 2:29 PM

Title: Re: Re-reading the Sutta Pitaka?

Content:

I read the *Dīḡa* and *Majjhima Nikāya*s, the *Dhammapada* and the *Suttanipata*, daily, over and over, one after the other. (And the *Abhidhamma*'s *Vibhaṅga* too).

Every couple of years I re-read the *Aṅguttara Nikāya*, the first and last *vaggas* of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*, and the *Teragāṭa* and *Terīgāṭa*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Commentaries, Abhidhamma, etc. Why bother?

Content:

And verse 97 too:

Assaddho akataññū ca, sandhicchedo ca yo naro,
Hatāvakāso vantāso, sa ve uttamaporiso.

"Indeed foremost among mankind is that man who is a faithless ingrate,
And an opportunity-wasting, vomit-eating burglar."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Resources for long-term illness

Content:

Dhammatube has some good talks by Bhikkhu Nirodho, an Aussie monk.

<https://www.youtube.com/user/dhammatube/search?query=nirodho>

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Resources for long-term illness

Content:

And welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2015 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Six Qualities of Dharm

Content:

Svākkhāto = su + akkhāto: "Well-proclaimed".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 30, 2015 8:39 AM

Title: Re: Thai traduction (3 marks)

Content:

Hi Dhammadana,

First a word of warning: with tattoos like these on your body you will be a laughingstock any time you put in an appearance in a gathering of Thais. South-East Asian tattooing generally has an apotropaic purpose (e.g. mantras and yantras for averting bullets or protecting one from snakes), while the three words that you want are popularly associated mainly with funerals.

Now of the two that you posted, the first is the Pali words *aniccam*, *dukkham* and *anattā* in Thai script. The second is the common Thai translation of these words: "mai thiang", "pen thuk", and "mai chai tua ton".

However, each of your Pali words has been written twice. They should be:

อนิจจัง

aniccam

ทุกข์

dukkham

อนัตตา

anattā

And here are the Thai translations with all the irrelevant stuff deleted:

ไม่เที่ยง

aniccam

เป็นทุกข์
dukkham

ไม่ใช่ตัวตน
anattā

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 30, 2015 8:46 AM

Title: Re: Top 3-5 favorite buddhist books and/or talks?

Content:

Two lists of five — one ancient, the other modern

- Dīgha Nikāya: Dialogues of the Buddha (T.W. Rhys Davids)
 - Suttanipāta: Woven Cadences (E.M. Hare); Group of Discourses (K.R. Norman)
 - Vibhaṅga: Book of Analysis (U Thittila)
 - Sammohavinodanī: Dispeller of Delusion (Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli)
 - Visuddhimagga: Path of Purification (Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli)
-
- André Bareau, Recherches sur la biographie du Buddha dans les Sūtrapīṭaka et les Vinayapīṭaka anciens, 3 vols.
 - Rupert Gethin, The Buddhist Path to Awakening
 - Steven Collins, Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravada Buddhism
 - Harvey B. Aronson, Love and Sympathy in Theravāda Buddhism
 - Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, The Life of the Buddha

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 30, 2015 1:41 PM

Title: Re: Thai traduction (3 marks)

Content:

The Thais have many ways of glossing and/or translating anattā, but I don't recall hearing one like that.

ไม่มีอัตตา / mai mii attaa:
hasn't an attā

ไม่มีตัวตน / mai mii tua ton:
hasn't a self

ไม่ใช่อัตตา / mai chai attaa:
isn't a self

เป็นสภาพที่บังคับบัญชาไม่ได้ / pen saphaap thii bang-khap-ban-chaai mai dai:
is a phenomenon that cannot be controlled

ไม่อยู่ในอำนาจ / mai yuu nai amnaat:
is not subject to control

เป็นสภาพว่างเปล่า / pen saphaap waang plao:
is an empty phenomenon

หาเจ้าของมิได้ / haa jao khong mi dai:
is ownerless

แย้งต่ออัตตา / yaeng tor attaa:
is opposed to attā

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 30, 2015 7:14 PM

Title: Re: Six Qualities of Dharm

Content:

To say that the Dhamma was "well-proclaimed" would mean that the Buddha made a good job of proclaiming it. To say that it was "self-proclaimed" would mean that the Dhamma proclaimed itself and the Buddha had nothing to do with it. I should think that's a pretty substantial difference.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2015 9:37 AM

Title: Re: Top 3-5 favorite buddhist books and/or talks?

Content:

I think Bareau's Recherches is an interesting and valuable complement to Ñāṇamoli's Life. Bareau's work is more specialised in that it covers a much shorter period than Ñāṇamoli's (i.e. from the Bodhisatta's going forth until the conversion of Sāriputta and Moggallāna) but his work is based upon a wider range of sources: besides Pali the professor also knew Sanskrit, Tibetan and Chinese and had read widely in the extant Vinaya texts preserved in these languages. Also he tended to be rather more adventurous and speculative than Ñāṇamoli. This isn't always a good thing, for on occasion it leads to drivel like

<https://web.archive.org/web/20130312084254/http://www.buddha-kyra.com/wife.htm>
and elicits scathing reviews like this:

[./download/file.php?id=2638](#)

(32.59 KiB) Downloaded 80 times

On the other hand, at his best Bareau gives the reader a stronger sense than any other writer of what it was like to be living in ancient Magadha or Kosala.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: Sutta reference on Buddha teaching so students leave quickly

Content:

It's mentioned also as the third of the eight great thoughts:

"When it was said: 'This Dhamma is for one who resorts to solitude, not for one who delights in company,' with reference to what was this said? Here, when a bhikkhu resorts to solitude, bhikkhus, bhikkhunīs, male lay followers, female lay followers, kings, royal ministers, heads of other sects, and disciples belonging to other sects approach him. In each case, with a mind that slants, slopes, and inclines to seclusion, withdrawn, delighting in renunciation, he gives them a talk invariably concerned with dismissing them. When it was said: 'This Dhamma is for one who resorts to solitude, not for one who delights in company,' it is with reference to this that this was said.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.30>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2015 12:22 PM

Title: Re: Sutta reference on Buddha teaching sought

Content:

Even curter according to the Majjhima Atthakathā. Simply: "Go away!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2015 12:47 PM

Title: Re: Sutta reference on Buddha teaching sought

Content:

The Sutta reference has already been given: the Mahāsuññatasutta (M. iii. 111).

What I referred to was the commentary to this, in which the words "talk invariably concerned with dismissing them" are glossed as gacchatha tumhe, "You go away!" (MA. iv. 160)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 4:32 AM

Title: Re: Top 3-5 favorite buddhist books and/or talks?

Content:

One more, just to round it up to 11 — my favourite Mahasi book...

Mahasi Sayadaw, A Discourse on the Sallekha Sutta

<http://aimwell.org/sallekha.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 5:46 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha reject atman? Let's arrive at a conclusion

Content:

That's not Ken Wheeler.

This is Ken:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 6:06 AM

Title: Re: Dhammakaya leader 'knows' the reincarnation of Steve Jobs!

Content:

I've heard that for an infant candidate to get the Dalai Lama job he has to be able to identify objects that he owned in his former life that are mixed together with objects that he didn't own. So there is an empirical test of sorts; it probably wouldn't satisfy James Randi, but it's better than nothing. By contrast, the claims of Dhammachaiyo are made solely on his own authority and gullibly accepted by Dhammakaya followers without any evidence whatsoever.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 6:36 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha reject atman? Let's arrive at a conclusion

Content:

Wheelerism in a nutshell:

- The Buddha taught that there is a false self and a true Self.
- The former is the five khandhas.
- The latter is other than the five khandhas. It is the Absolute, the Atman of the Upanishads, and a bunch of Greek things.

- The Buddhist path consists in disidentifying with the khandhas so that the true Self can shine forth in all its glory.
- Buddhists, by teaching that no self is to be found, have got the Buddha's anatta teaching all wrong and replaced it with nihilism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Dhammakaya leader 'knows' the reincarnation of Steve Jobs!

Content:

I only wish I knew. As it is I've no idea at all what things are effective in freeing people from mental enslavement to this ghastly outfit. Perhaps the best person to consult on this would be Mano Laohavanich (the former monk Mettānando) who used to be quite a big shot in the organization but is now very critical of it.

He has two Facebook pages, but I don't know which (if either) is current...

<https://www.facebook.com/mano.laohavanich>

<https://www.facebook.com/manomettanando.laohavanich>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 7:41 AM

Title: Re: Sir Nicholas Winton (1909-2015)

Content:

An interview with him when he was 104.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 8:05 AM

Title: Re: Dhammakaya leader 'knows' the reincarnation of Steve Jobs!

Content:

No, I'm afraid not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 11:52 AM

Title: Re: Theravadin limerick challenge

Content:

I've no talent for composing limericks, but it occurs to me that the challenge-word inflected in the nominative case would make for a great song title: It Takes Two Dhutaṅgo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2015 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Six Qualities of Dharm

Content:

Whether you think it's suitable or whether you think it's unsuitable, "well-proclaimed" (or "well-spoken" or "well-taught") is what the word *svākkhāto* means.

There is no "self" in *svākkhāto*. If there were a "self" in it then it would be complete nonsense, because the Dhamma gets proclaimed by a person; it doesn't proclaim itself.

Buddhaghosa on *Svākkhāto*

WELL PROCLAIMED

69. Well proclaimed: in this clause the Dhamma of the scriptures is included as well as the other; in the rest of the clauses only the supramundane Dhamma is included.

Herein, the Dhamma of the scriptures is well proclaimed because it is good in the beginning, the middle, and the end, and because it announces the life of purity that is utterly perfect and pure with meaning and with detail (see M I 179).

Even a single stanza of the Blessed One's teaching is good in the beginning with the first word, good in the middle with the second, third, etc., and good in the end with the last word, because the Dhamma is altogether admirable. A sutta with a single sequence of meaning is good in the beginning with the introduction, good in the end with the conclusion, and good in the middle with what is in between. A sutta with several sequences of meaning is good in the beginning with the first sequence of meaning, good in the end with the last sequence of meaning, and good in the middle with the sequences of meaning in between. Furthermore, it is good in the beginning with the introduction [giving the place of] and the origin [giving the reason for] its utterance. It is good in the middle because it suits those susceptible of being taught since it is unequivocal in meaning and reasoned with cause and example. It is good in the end with its conclusion that inspires faith in the hearers.

70. Also the entire Dhamma of the Dispensation is good in the beginning with virtue as one's own well-being. It is good in the middle with serenity and insight and with path and fruition. It is good in the end with Nibbāna. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning with virtue and concentration. It is good in the middle with insight and the path. It is good in the end with fruition and Nibbāna. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning because it is the good discovery made by the Buddha. It is good in the middle because it is the well-regulatedness of the Dhamma. It is good in the end because it is the good way entered upon by the Saṅgha. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning as the discovery of what can be attained by one who enters upon the way of practice in conformity after hearing about it. It is good in the middle as the unproclaimed

enlightenment [of Paccekabuddhas]. It is good in the end as the enlightenment of disciples.

71. And when listened to, it does good through hearing it because it suppresses the hindrances, thus it is good in the beginning. And when made the way of practice it does good through the way being entered upon because it brings the bliss of serenity and insight, thus it is good in the middle. And when it has thus been made the way of practice and the fruit of the way is ready, it does good through the fruit of the way because it brings [unshakable] equipoise, thus it is good in the end.

So it is “well proclaimed” because of being good in the beginning, the middle and the end.

72. Now, the life of purity, that is to say, the life of purity of the Dispensation and the life of purity of the path, which the Blessed One announces, which he shows in various ways when he teaches the Dhamma, is “with meaning” because of perfection of meaning, and it is “with detail” because of perfection of detail, as it is proper that it should be. It is “with meaning” because it conforms to the words declaring its meaning by pronouncing, clarifying, revealing, expounding, and explaining it. It is “with detail” because it has perfection of syllables, words, details, style, language, and descriptions. It is “with meaning” owing to profundity of meaning and profundity of penetration. It is “with detail” owing to profundity of law and profundity of teaching. It is “with meaning” because it is the province of the discriminations of meaning and of perspicuity. It is “with detail” because it is the province of the discriminations of law and of language (see XIV.21). It is “with meaning” since it inspires confidence in persons of discretion, being experienceable by the wise. It is “with detail” since it inspires confidence in worldly persons, being a fit object of faith. It is “with meaning” because its intention is profound. It is “with detail” because its words are clear. It is “utterly perfect” with the complete perfection due to absence of anything that can be added. It is “pure” with the immaculateness due to absence of anything to be subtracted.

73. Furthermore, it is “with meaning” because it provides the particular distinction of achievement through practice of the way, and it is “with detail” because it provides the particular distinction of learning through mastery of scripture. It is “utterly perfect” because it is connected with the five aggregates of Dhamma beginning with virtue. It is “pure” because it has no imperfection, because it exists for the purpose of crossing over [the round of rebirths’ flood (see M I 134), and because it is not concerned with worldly things.

So it is “well proclaimed” because it “announces the life of purity that is utterly perfect and pure with meaning and with detail.”

Or alternatively, it is well proclaimed since it has been properly proclaimed with no perversion of meaning. For the meaning of other sectarians’ law suffers perversion since there is actually no obstruction in the things described there as obstructive and actually no outlet in the things described there as outlets, which is why their law is ill-proclaimed; but not so the Blessed One’s Law, whose meaning suffers no perversion

since the things described there as obstructions and the things described there as outlets are so in actual fact.

So, in the first place, the Dhamma of the scriptures is “well proclaimed.”

74. The supramundane Dhamma is well proclaimed since both the way that accords with Nibbāna and the Nibbāna that accords with the way have been proclaimed, according as it is said: “The way leading to Nibbāna has been properly declared to the disciples by the Blessed One, and Nibbāna and the way meet. Just as the water of the Ganges meets and joins with the water of the Yamunā, so too the way leading to Nibbāna has been properly declared to the disciples by the Blessed One, and Nibbāna and the way meet” (D II 223).

75. And here the noble path, which is the middle way since it does not approach either extreme, is well proclaimed in being proclaimed to be the middle way.

The fruits of asceticism, where defilements are tranquilized, are well proclaimed too in being proclaimed to have tranquilized defilement.

Nibbāna, whose individual essence is eternal, deathless, the refuge, the shelter, etc., is well proclaimed too in being proclaimed to have an individual essence that is eternal, and so on.

So the supramundane Dhamma is also “well proclaimed.”

[/list]

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 8:39 AM

Title: Re: Satipatthana in the context of the 37 factors of enlightenment

Content:

I suppose Ñāṇānanda will probably be referring to someone in Sri Lanka, though I don't know to whom. Two examples that would be more familiar to western Buddhists would be Thich Nhat Hanh (e.g. *Miracle of Being Awake*) on the religious side and Jon Kabat-Zinn (e.g. *Coming to our Senses*) on the secular one. For both of these, even to say that they “overemphasize the role of attention” would be too charitable. In both the above books concentrating on what one is doing seems to be what the whole of bhāvanā is effectively reduced to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 11:37 AM

Title: Re: Arguments that Buddhism is Not Solipsism

Content:

In the first case you can simply tell them that the caricature is baseless. In the second

you can tell them that the scholarship is out of date and in any case the Yogācāra is merely one school.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 4:16 PM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

In the Suttas paṭinissagga and its synonym vossagga are the words that usually get translated 'relinquishment', 'letting go' and suchlike. What is relinquished is appropriation (ādāna) which is a term for taṇhā and upādāna.

In what sense is vipassanā a power?

Through contemplation of impermanence vipassanā is unshakable by perception of permanence, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of pain it is unshakable by perception of pleasure, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of not-self it is unshakable by perception of self, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of dispassion it is unshakable by delight, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of fading away it is unshakable by greed, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of cessation it is unshakable by arising, thus vipassanā is a power.

Through contemplation of relinquishment (paṭinissaggānupassanā) it is unshakable by appropriation (ādāna), thus vipassanā is a power.

It is unshakable, immovable and cannot be shifted by ignorance and by the defilements and aggregates that accompany ignorance, thus vipassanā is a power. This is vipassanā as a power.

(Paṭisambhidāmagga 99)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 4:31 PM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

The corresponding verbs are vossajjati and paṭinissajjati.

Etamādīnaṃ ñatvā, dukkhaṃ ārambhapaccayā,
Sabbārambhaṃ paṭinissajja, anārambhe vimuttino.

Ucchinnabhavaṇhassa, santacittassa bhikkhuno,
Vitiṇṇo jātisaṃsāro, natthi tassa punabbhavo ti.

"Knowing this peril, that 'Misery is because of exertion', giving up all exertion, for a bhikkhu who is released in non-exertion, whose craving for existence has been cut off, with calmed mind, the journeying on in [repeated] births has been crossed over. There is no renewed existence for him."

— Dvayatānupassanāsutta, Sn. 745-6 (Norman tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 8:45 PM

Title: Re: Celebrating same-sex marriage in Buddhism

Content:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Rainbow_flag_%28LGBT_movement%29

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2015 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Why Kusala is more powerful than Akusala?

Content:

Hi Thera,

There are over 20 articles on the page you have linked to. Which in particular is relevant to this thread?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 4, 2015 6:55 AM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

Yes. Paṭinissagga is the broad term and then nekkhamma is a more specialised one. Nekkhamma is paṭinissagga with respect to desire for sense-pleasures.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 4, 2015 7:49 AM

Title: Re: Top 3-5 favorite buddhist books and/or talks?

Content:

There are several other translations available, but the only one that I've ever studied alongside the Pali text is Dr. Saddhatissa's *The Suttanipāṭa — a New Translation*. I can't really recommend it, as it has neither the literary merit of Hare's nor the technical accuracy of Norman's, and his rendering of the Ratana Sutta is about the worst I've ever seen.

Other translations which I have not read (or perhaps have read but haven't studied with care) are the two pioneering translations of V. Fausbøll and Lord Chalmers, the 2001 translation by N.A. Jayawickrama, and the Access to Insight translations of individual suttas by Ajahn Thanissaro and John D. Ireland.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 4, 2015 8:14 AM

Title: Re: New Meditation Center

Content:

It's a traditional practice, but one based on the fact that in the Suttas upāsakas and upāsikās are sometimes referred to as "sāvakā gihī odātavasanā" and "sāvikā gihiniyo odātavasanā", that is, "male/female disciples who are householders clothed in white".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 4, 2015 8:31 AM

Title: Re: Top 3 (or more) favorite buddhist books or talks?

Content:

For any other fans of pioneering Pali translations, here's Fausbøll's *Suttanipāṭa*:

<https://archive.org/details/SuttaNipataTranslatedByViggoFausboll>

and here's Lord Chalmers':

<https://archive.org/details/buddhasteachings032310mbp>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 4, 2015 3:40 PM

Title: Re: Top 3 (or more) favorite buddhist books or talks?

Content:

Yes, I read them on a laptop. Whenever possible I minimise eye strain by using Calibre to convert the file into html and then opening it with a word-processor, formatting it with a non-serif font (Calibri and Candara are my favourites) in a large font size, and then saving it as a pdf. When reading it I keep the screen light pretty dim. Also I read the files with the Acrobat program set to full-screen so that I don't have the distraction of menu

bars, scroll bars, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 9:31 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Telling of what?

If one wanted to get some notion of whether progress in the Dhamma is likely to be easy or hard, can you suggest a better source than the Thera-/Therīgāthā's personal testimonies of 264 arahants and 73 arahantīs, all contemporaneous with the Buddha?

Sappadasa.jpg (122.42 KiB) Viewed 2632 times

(translated by K. R. Norman)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 10:27 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Not necessarily. It might even conduce to it if a person despairs of progress in the present life and entertains the notion that s/he might be in a better position in the next one. The Therīgāthā verses of the suicidal nun Sīhā are of interest in this connection:

Distracted, harassed by desires of sense,
Unmindful of the 'what' and 'why' of things,
Stung and inflated by the memories
Of former days, o'er which I lacked control —
Corrupting canker spreading o'er my heart —
I followed heedless dreams of happiness,
And got no even tenor to my mind,
All given o'er to dalliance with sense.

So did I fare for seven weary years,
In lean and sallow misery of unrest.

I, wretched, found no ease by day or night,
So took a rope and plunged into the wood:
'Better for me a friendly gallows-tree!
I'll live again the low life of the world.' *

Strong was the noose I made; and on a bough
I bound the rope and flung it round my neck,
When see! . . . my heart was set at liberty!

* I.e., by continuing my round of rebirths. Cf. the Western idea of suicide—to ‘put an end to it all’ — with this of ‘starting it again.’

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

You can blame the translator Olendzki for not following the Theragāthā commentary:

"Deva here means a cloud."

(ThagA. i. 134)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

What Sīhā doesn't say —though most suicidal monks and nuns do (it's a stock feature in monastic hagiography)— is that she cannot bear to go on eating the almsfood of the faithful while her mind is so in thrall to the kilesas. (Think of the Suttas' "better to swallow a heated iron ball..." simile). But assuming that this too was on her mind, then continuing as a nun while in despair of making progress would have seemed an intolerable course. On the other hand, if she was an earnest nun (which seems likely, given her attainment of arahatta) then disrobing too would not have presented itself as an option (e.g. for reasons given at the end of the Mahasuññata Sutta). So notwithstanding the risk of rebirth in a state lower than the human, Sīhā may have considered suicide the least of the three evils available to her.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Who is romanticizing them? I have brought these cases up merely as evidence in support of Zom's contention that Dhamma practice can be very difficult.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:47 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Sounds about right to me. It seems that even in the Buddha's day the figure was about two thirds:

Thus spoke the Blessed One. And while this explanation was being delivered, hot blood rose out of the mouths of sixty monks; another sixty monks abandoned the training and returned to the lower life, saying, "It is too difficult to do, Blessed One, it is too difficult to do"; while the minds of another sixty monks abandoned clinging and were liberated from the āsavas

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an07/an07.068.yaho.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 1:40 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Not according to any of my dictionaries' definitions of "romanticize". I haven't, for example, "described suicide in an idealistic or unrealistic fashion", for I haven't described it at all; nor have I "made suicide seem better or more appealing than it really is" (monks are not permitted to speak in praise of suicide); nor have I "presented suicide as fantastic, extravagant, quixotic or going beyond what is customary or practical."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 7:48 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Next time you you talk to Thai lay people, see how many of them (if any) are familiar with the teachings in the Jambūdīpa Repetition Series of the Aṅguttara Nikāya's Ekadhammavagga, <http://librarun.org/book/21839/124>. I think you'll find that most of them have very much more optimistic notions about the afterlife than what was taught by the Buddha in these suttas and will be positively astonished to be told that most humans and devas are destined for the lower realms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:10 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

That attainments were arrived at quickly proves nothing about whether they were achieved with ease or with difficulty.

“Bhikkhus, there are these four modes of practice. What four?

- (1) Practice that is painful with sluggish direct knowledge;
- (2) Practice that is painful with quick direct knowledge;
- (3) Practice that is pleasant with sluggish direct knowledge; and
- (4) Practice that is pleasant with quick direct knowledge. These are the four modes of practice.”

(Saṃkhitta Sutta, A. ii. 149)

Moreover, that some attainments were arrived at quickly in the Buddha's time — a time when ugghaṭitaññūs and vipacitaññūs were abounding — does not mean that any attainments will necessarily be arrived at quickly today, when most people are neyyas or padaparamas.

“Bhikkhus, there are these four kinds of persons found existing in the world. What four? One who understands quickly; one who understands through elaboration; one who needs to be guided; and one for whom the word is the maximum. These are the four kinds of persons found existing in the world.”

(Ugghaṭitaññū Sutta, A. ii. 135)

Bhikkhu Bodhi's notes:

(1) “The person of quick understanding is one for whom the breakthrough to the Dhamma (dhammābhisamaya) occurs together with an utterance. (Pp-a: Ugghaṭita means the opening up of knowledge (ñāṇugghāṭana); the meaning is that one knows as soon as knowledge opens up. Together with an utterance: as soon as [a statement on Dhamma] is uttered. The breakthrough occurs together with knowledge of the Dhamma of the four truths.)”

(2) “The person who understands through elaboration is one for whom the breakthrough to the Dhamma occurs when the meaning of what has been stated briefly is being analyzed in detail. (Pp-a: This is the person able to attain arahantship when, after a concise outline of the teaching has been set up, the meaning is being analyzed in detail.)”

(3) “The person to be guided is one for whom the breakthrough to the Dhamma occurs gradually, through instruction, questioning, careful attention, and reliance on good friends.”

(4) “One for whom the word is the maximum is one who—though hearing much, reciting much, retaining much in mind, and teaching much—does not reach the breakthrough to the Dhamma in that life.”

Nett 125 (Be 888) correlates these four types with the four kinds of practice (see 4:161–62): the ugghaṭitaññū puggala with one emancipated by pleasant practice and quick direct knowledge, the vipacitaññū puggala with one emancipated by either painful practice and quick direct knowledge or by pleasant practice and sluggish direct knowledge, and the neyya puggala with one emancipated by painful practice and sluggish direct knowledge. The padaparama puggala is not emancipated and thus the four alternatives do not apply.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:22 PM

Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa a Brahmin sympathizer?

Content:

He didn't. Buddhaghosa is referring to Sakka / Śakra / Indra reverencing the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 5, 2015 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa a Brahmin sympathizer?

Content:

The names of Sakka in the Abhidhānappadīpikā (a 13th century Pali thesaurus):

sakko purindado deva, rājā vajirapāṇi ca,

sujampati sahasakkho, mahindo vajirāvudho.

vāsavo ca dasasatanayano tidivādhībhū,

suranātho ca vajira, hattho ca bhūtapatya'pi,

maghavā kosiyo indo, vatrabhū pākasāsano.

The relevant ones here are Sahassakkha and Dasasatanayana, both meaning "Possessor of a Thousand Eyes" though Buddhaghosa substitutes another name with the same meaning: Dasasatalocana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 6, 2015 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Thai traduction (3 marks)

Content:

But where is the aniccaṃ, dukkhaṃ, anattā ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 6, 2015 2:35 AM

Title: Re: Thai traduction (3 marks)

Content:

Ah, I see. I mistook the vertical characters for letters from the Japanese Hiragana syllabary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 6, 2015 3:57 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

Yes. However, the subject of Siha's query is not what constitutes saddhā and the absence of saddhā, but rather, what constitutes wrong view and whether the mere absence of saddhā suffices for this.

Now it seems to me that the absence of saddhā doesn't in itself constitute wrong view any more than the presence of saddhā entails right view. For example, Sāti the fisherman's son and Ariṭṭha the vulture-trainer had saddhā in the Buddha, yet totally screwed up views. Jains, on the other hand, have no saddhā in the Buddha, yet in the Vinaya they were classed as kammasakatavādins (those who held to a doctrine of ownership of kamma). And so if a Jain monk converted to Buddhism and wished to ordain as a bhikkhu the Buddha did not require him to undergo the probationary period required of non-Buddhists who formerly held wrong views.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 7, 2015 9:15 AM

Title: Re: English Translation of the Madhyama Agama (Taisho 26)

Content:

Links to the Hamburg University website will often have a short shelf-life as the site-owners are constantly renaming pages. When a link disappears the solution (if you know the article's name) is to search the site with Google.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 7, 2015 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Arahants are not fully free from attachment, aversion and ignorance?

Content:

Broadly yes, though I think the phrase "with residual clinging" is not the best way to translate "upādisesa" as it might be taken as indicating that the arahant himself is not free of upādāna.

Better is Gethin's rendering: "that which has a remnant of attachment", meaning either that the khandhas of an arahant are the product of his past upādāna, and/or, that they may presently serve as objects of the upādāna of others.

Tadetaṃ sabhāvato ekavidhampi saupādisesanibbānadhātu
anupādisesanibbānadhātu ceti duvidhaṃ hoti kāraṇapariyāyena.

"Although from the point of view of its particular nature it [Nibbāna] is one, from a specific point of view it is two: the element of Nibbāna with a remnant of attachment and the element of Nibbāna without a remnant of attachment."
(Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha VI. 63)

Commentary

Sabhāvato ti attano santilakkhaṇena.

"From the point of view of its particular nature" — in that its particular characteristic is peace.

Upādiyati kāmupādānādīhīti upādi, pañcakkhandhasseṭṭhaṃ adhivacanaṃ, upādiyeva seso kilesehi upādiseso, tena saha vattatīti saupādisesā, sā eva nibbānadhātūti saupādisesanibbānadhātu.

"Attachment" [upādi] — what one becomes attached to by attachments [upādāna] to the objects of sense-desire etc.; it is a term for the five aggregates.

"Remnant of attachment" [upādisesa] — just the attachment that remains as a result of the [past] defilements.

"That which has a remnant of attachment" [sa-upādisesa] — that which occurs together with that [remnant]: just that Nibbāna-element is the Nibbāna-element with a remnant of attachment.

(Abhidhammatthavibhāvinī VI. 63)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 7, 2015 1:19 PM

Title: Re: Arahants are not fully free from attachment, aversion and ignorance?

Content:

Part of the upādisesa is viññāṇakkhandha. Part of viññāṇakkhandha are kiriyacittas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 7, 2015 2:41 PM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

The usual oppositions are:

Nekkhamma(-vitakka) vs. kāma(-vitakka).

(Thoughts of) renunciation vs. (thoughts of) sensual desire.

Paṭinissagga/vossagga vs. ādāna (= taṇhā + upādāna)

Relinquishing vs. appropriation (= craving + grasping)

Taṇhā vs. nibbāna

Craving vs. blowing out.

or:

Taṇhā vs. alobha

Craving vs. non-attachment

Alobha and Nibbāna might both be said to be "the exact opposite of craving", but in different senses. Alobha is the wholesome root that's directly opposed to the unwholesome root of lobha (of which craving is one form). Nibbāna is the "exact opposite" in the sense that the third noble truth is the opposite of the second: it's what puts an end to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 7, 2015 3:45 PM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

Alobha opposes all three kinds of craving; Nibbāna extinguishes all three.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 8:44 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

That's what Ajahn Sumedho and Amaro are always saying when they tell the Upaka story. But they are quite mistaken. In fact for a vāsanābhāgiya sutta (one aimed not at the generation of insight but only at planting a wholesome seed in the listener's mind) the talk to Upaka worked perfectly. The man was sufficiently intrigued to come back for more, ordained as a bhikkhu, and died a non-returner.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/upaka.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 8:53 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

My memory of listening to their talks as a layman back in the early eighties. You'll probably find some examples if you search their books for "Upaka", "first teaching", and "complete failure".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 9:03 AM

Title: Re: Sutta References Compilation

Content:

In my pre-computer days (i.e. up to 1996), my main aids for locating half-remembered Sutta passages were the PTS's Pali English Dictionary and Malalasekera's Dictionary of Pali Proper Names. If I could remember some key word from the sutta and the word was a relatively rare one, then I'd look it up in the PED and if I was lucky there would be a citation from the sutta I was after. Or if I could remember the person to whom the sutta was addressed (and provided it wasn't someone like Ānanda, with numerous suttas to his name), I'd look up his name in the DPPN and more often than not Malalasekera would have a citation for the sutta I was looking for.

Nowadays, however, things are much easier. Though I still rely on my memory of key words and names, the main resource that I use to search for them is the Sixth Council Tipitaka CD published by Goenka's organization.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 9:14 AM

Title: Re: What is the last thing to let go?

Content:

Yes, when it's being used as a term for the *tadaṅga* (substitution of opposites) kind of relinquishment. But no when it's being used as a term for the *pakkhandana* (full-arrival) relinquishment when *Nibbāna* is realised. In the latter case we are talking about an extinguishing and not a mere opposition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 6:52 PM

Title: Re: New Meditation Center

Content:

On a communal meditation retreat it's desirable that meditators wear simple, modest, loose-fitting clothes, with undistracting muted colours. The traditional all-white (or white-top-&-black bottoms) uniform of SE Asian meditation centres is as good as any for this purpose.

On the other, I wouldn't recommend that you institute any sort of dress code right from the start. In a non-Buddhist country where the preponderance of those who come to you will probably not be Buddhists but just people with an interest in meditation, if you insist on a dress code it's likely to be perceived as cult-like and controlling. You might get nobody at all showing up. So I think this would be something better postponed until you have a mature and flourishing lay community.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 7:30 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi: "Facing the Great Divide", secular and classical Theravada

Content:

I already posted a link to the entry for 'Upaka' in Malalasekera's Dictionary of Pali Proper Names. The narrative presented there and in the Pali texts cited by Malalasekera will give you the traditional view.

If you then compare that with the modern re-telling by Ajahn Sumedho, and the repetition of Sumedho's re-telling by his disciples Amaro and Sucitto and whoever else, then it will be clear that these re-tellings are about a very different Buddha from that of the Pali texts. The Buddha depicted in the Forest Sangha's modernist re-telling is a fumbling bumbling Buddha who hasn't yet got his pedagogical act together. He is not the Buddha of any of the "lion's roar" suttas. He is not a Buddha who was in full possession of the ten Tathāgata powers from the very night of his awakening. He is a very fallible Buddha who needs to make a botch of things before he can figure out how to do them right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 8, 2015 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Indra In Buddhism

Content:

Yes. Of the Buddha's various disciples in the deva world, Sakka is probably the one who features most often in the Suttas.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/sakka.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 9, 2015 9:17 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

The tenfold wrong view is expressed in rather terse phrases, some of which need unpacking. "There is no mother ... no father", for example, doesn't mean that mothers and fathers don't exist. It means that there are no obligations towards them and no value in filial piety.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 9, 2015 11:43 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

The list of items in the tenfold wrong view are those which exemplify the three niyata-

micchādiṭṭhi, "wrong views of fixed outcome", namely, acausalism, nihilism and the doctrine of kammic inefficacy. The wrongness of these views does not lie only in the sort of actions to which they might lead. Rather, it lies in the very holding of the views. That is, the very holding of any niyata-micchādiṭṭhi is in itself an unwholesome kamma. Hence the two dozen or so suttas that state rebirth in hell to be the consequence of maintaining that: "There is nothing given, nothing offered ... etc."

In short, it's very much about doctrinal purity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 9, 2015 1:28 PM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

In the Suttas one finds the thing but not the term. That is to say, the Suttas describe certain views as being wrong (e.g. acausalism) and as liable to ripen as rebirth in hell, while other views (e.g. personality view) are not described as ripening in this way. To views that ripen as rebirth in hell the commentaries apply the label niyata-micchādiṭṭhi. The term's earliest occurrence is in the Paṭṭhāna of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, though in that text no examples are given.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 9, 2015 1:51 PM

Title: Re: Indra In Buddhism

Content:

That depends on the religion. In Buddhist texts Indra is long-lived but mortal, though the station or office of Indra is immortal, in the sense that there is always a deva occupying it. In early Brahmanism Indra is conditionally immortal, with his immortality being dependent upon his getting enough Soma to drink. In post-Bhagavad Gita Hinduism he is unqualifiedly immortal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 9, 2015 2:36 PM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

Is this question intended for me? If so, then let me remark that I have not stated agnosticism about rebirth to be an example of a niyatamicchādiṭṭhi.

Certainly the positive denial of rebirth would be a niyatamicchādiṭṭhi, for by denying it one would be asserting that there are kammās that don't bear fruit (since not all kammās performed will ripen in the same life). But as for rebirth-agnostics, it seems to me that they occupy a sort of doctrinal limbo, in which they fail to arrive at either the

Buddha's right view or the fixed-outcome wrong views of outside teachers.

Within this doctrinal limbo, the tenfold view would be something like:
Giving gifts might yield fruit or it might not.

Making offerings might yield fruit or it might not.

Making sacrifices might yield fruit or it might not.

Good and bad actions might ripen as pleasant and painful vipākas or they might not.

There might be a this world or there might not.

There might be another world or there might not.

There might be duties owed to one's mother, of which the fulfillment will yield fruit, or there might not.

There might be duties owed to one's father, of which the fulfillment will yield fruit, or there might not.

Living beings might be liable to rebirth or they might not.

[Alternatively: There might be apparitionally produced beings or there might not]

There might be good and virtuous samaṇas and brāhmaṇas in the world who have realised for themselves by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world, or there might not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 10, 2015 6:07 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

I suppose it could, but it would be wrong. Your proposed parallel is premised on the mistaken assumption that "It's very much about..." is synonymous with "It's solely about..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 10, 2015 6:18 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

I would agree if you'd said that this was part of the point of it; indeed from the point of view of liberation it's the most vital part. But it certainly is not the whole of the point of it: the texts are unequivocal that the mere holding of the tenfold sammādiṭṭhi is in itself a

cause for a bright rebirth and that the mere holding of the tenfold micchādiṭṭhi/threefold niyata-micchādiṭṭhi is in itself a cause for rebirth in hell. To foster, or merely to tolerate, the persistence of a right or wrong view in one's mind is a kamma-creating act. The ox-duty ascetic practice, for example, at best leads to rebirth as an ox, but if undertaken in the belief that it leads to heaven, then it leads to hell. But the hell-conducive kamma here is not the ox-duty practice but rather the wrong view about it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 10, 2015 6:29 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

Just as you were replying I edited my post, giving the example of the ox-duty ascetic. Others would be the case of the soldier and the actor who believe that soldiering/acting will get them to heaven. But most important are the numerous suttas where the Buddha goes through the list of ten kusala and ten akusala kammāpathas and in each case states unqualifiedly that the action in question leads to heaven or hell.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 10, 2015 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

No, I certainly think that it's unwholesome. Even in those cases where the person is not a thinly-disguised ucchedavādin but is genuinely open-minded about the possibilities, genuinely in a limbo, it's still unwholesome. For either it will be a vital and momentous question for him, or it will not. If it is, then he will be wracked and enervated by the hindrance of doubt, which is always unwholesome. And if it isn't—if it's just something he shrugs his shoulders about—then he is frivolous and chaffy, and is lacking in any proper sense of proportion.

"Since there really is a world beyond..." (MN. 60)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 23, 2015 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Jack Kornfield "Psychedelics and Spiritual Practice"

Content:

With regard to the issue of intoxicants, it doesn't matter in the slightest which parts of the Suttanta and Vinaya Piṭakas one believes to be early and which one believes to be late: exhortations against surā-meraya-majja are liberally scattered throughout all of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 24, 2015 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

For an exposition of the original meditation teachings of Phra Mongkhol Thepmuni (as opposed to Wat Dhammakaya's adaptation of them), see the writings of the late Suratano Bhikkhu (Terry Magness), in particular the booklets *Vistas* and *Sammā Samādhi II*. All his published works can be downloaded here:

<http://www.triple-gem.net/BookList.html>

But caveat lector ... though Magness's exposition is a lot less far out than that of the abbot of Wat Dhammakaya, it's still pretty freaky stuff.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 24, 2015 8:34 AM

Title: Re: If there is no soul, why doesnot the mind takes rebirth as multiple entities?

Content:

Apparently not, for the mental continuum is not conceived as being capable of either generating forks or being fed by tributaries.

If it could generate forks, then it would be false to say that “consciousness is lone-faring” (*ekacaraṃ cittaṃ* — Dhp. 37).

And if it could be fed by tributaries, then it would be false to say “I am the owner of my kamma, the heir of my kamma... etc.” (*kammassako’mhi kammadāyādo* — AN. iii. 73), for I would in fact be the heir of the kammās of a plurality of beings.

As to why this is the case, I believe the question is wrongly put. The absence of forks and tributaries in the mental continuum is a sheer https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Brute_fact rather than something that stands in need of explanation. That being so, any proffered explanation will at best be no more than a restatement of the facts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 24, 2015 9:45 AM

Title: Re: If there is no soul, why doesnot the mind takes rebirth as multiple entities?

Content:

You may think whatever you like, but Buddhist doctrine is that cittas arise singly and discreetly and therefore the cittasantati has no forks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 25, 2015 6:32 AM

Title: Re: If there is no soul, why doesnot the mind takes rebirth as multiple entities?

Content:

Because ucchedavāda is not the doctrine of the ultimate non-existence of an attā.

Sassatavādins: there is an attā that is imperishable.

Ucchedavādins: there is an attā that is perishable.

Sons/daughters of the Sakyan: in the ultimate sense an attā is not to be found.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 25, 2015 5:09 PM

Title: Re: If there is no soul, why doesnot the mind takes rebirth as multiple entities?

Content:

I don't think the term is found in the Suttas. In the Abhidhamma the supramundane cittas are the eight kinds of consciousness which cognize Nibbāna, and which by that cognition cause certain fetters to be eradicated or weakened and produce an irreversible change in the mental continuum: the stream-entry path consciousness, stream-entry fruition consciousness, the once-returning path consciousness. once-returning fruition consciousness ... etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 25, 2015 7:14 PM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to touch their mothers?

Content:

No. In the Vinaya Piṭaka it is prohibited in the vinītavatthu to the second saṅghādisesa rule, though the act amounts to only a very minor offence.

Tena kho pana samayena aññataro bhikkhu mātuyā mātupemena āmasi. Tassa kukkuccaṃ ahosi: “bhagavatā sikkhāpadaṃ paññattaṃ, kacci nu kho ahaṃ saṅghādisesaṃ āpattiṃ āpanno” ti? Bhagavato etamatthaṃ ārocesi. “Anāpatti, bhikkhu, saṅghādisesassa; āpatti dukkaṭassā” ti.

Now at that time a certain monk stroked his mother for the sake of a mother's affection. He was remorseful, and said: “What now if I have fallen into an offence entailing a formal meeting of the Order?” He told this matter to the lord.

He said: “Monk, this is not an offence entailing a formal meeting of the Order, it is an

offence of wrong-doing.”

(Vin. iii. 126, = Book of the Discipline I. 211)

(The same is then repeated for a monk's daughters and sisters)

A modern commentary by Ven. Thanissaro on Saṅghādisesa 2, the parent rule to the above clause:

<http://pratyeka.org/a2i/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch05.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 26, 2015 7:36 AM

Title: Re: Looking for specific food?

Content:

Yes, that was how almsround was normally practised in those days (and still is today by Indian sadhus). Rather than the modern practice of walking continuously until a waiting lay almsgiver invites you to stop, a monk would stop silently at each house and wait until its occupants had noticed him and then either dismissed him or invited him to wait and receive food. If a monk had undertaken the *sapadānacārikaṅga* ascetic practice (i.e. that of walking an uninterrupted almsround), then he would stop indiscriminately at every house. If he hadn't, then he would stop at the houses where he knew that people would be likely to give or at those where the people were wont to give food that was agreeable to him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 26, 2015 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Looking for specific food?

Content:

It's not meat. The Pali word is *pūva* and is explained in the Vinaya Piṭaka as being a cake baked as a present for someone.

This is Vinaya Piṭaka's version of the Dhammapada Commentary's story:

At Sāvattihī in the Jeta Grove in Anāthapiṇḍika's monastery. Now at that time a woman lay-follower, the mother of Kāṇā, had faith and was virtuous. Kāṇā came to be given to a certain man in a village. Then Kāṇā went to her mother's house on some business or other. Then Kāṇā's husband sent a messenger to Kāṇā, saying: "Let Kāṇā come back, I desire Kāṇā's return." Then the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, saying: "It is awkward to go empty-handed," cooked a cake. When the cake was cooked, a certain monk walking for alms came up to the dwelling of the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother. Then the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, gave the cake to that monk. He, having gone away, told another, and she gave him a cake. He, having gone away, told another, and she gave him a cake. No sooner was a cake ready than it immediately disappeared.

A second time did Kāṇā's husband send a messenger to Kāṇā, saying: "Let Kāṇā, come back, I desire Kāṇā's return." A second time did the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, saying: "It is awkward to go empty-handed" ... it immediately disappeared.

A third time did Kāṇā's husband send a messenger to Kāṇā, saying: "Let Kāṇā, come back, I desire Kāṇā's return. If Kāṇā does not come back, I will take another wife." A third time did the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, saying: "It is awkward to go empty-handed" ... it immediately disappeared.

Then Kāṇā's husband procured another wife. Kāṇā heard: "It is said that another wife is taken by this man." She stood weeping. Then the lord, dressing in the morning, taking his bowl and robe, came up to the dwelling of that woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, and having come up he sat down on the appointed seat. Then the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, approached the lord, and having approached and greeted the lord, she sat down at a respectful distance. As she was sitting down at a respectful distance, the lord spoke thus to the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother:

"Why does this Kāṇā weep?"

Then the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, told this matter to the lord. Then the lord, having ... gladdened the woman lay-follower, Kāṇā's mother, with talk on dhamma, rising up from his seat, departed.

Now at that time a certain caravan was desirous of going from Rājagaha to the south. A certain monk, walking for alms-food, entered that caravan for alms-food. A certain lay-follower had barley-meal given to that monk. He, having gone away, told another, and he had barley-meal given to him. He, having gone away, told another, and he had barley-meal given to him. He, having gone away, told another, and he had barley-meal given to him. As soon as provisions for the journey were ready, they disappeared. Then that lay-follower said to these people:

"Masters, wait until tomorrow. As soon as provisions for the journey are ready, they are given to the masters. I will prepare provisions for the journey."

Saying: "Master, we are unable to wait, the caravan is setting out," they went away. Then as that lay-follower, having prepared provisions for the journey, was going along last, thieves robbed (him). People ... spread it about, saying: "How can the recluses, sons of the Sakyans, not knowing moderation, accept (provisions)? This (man) having given to them, going along last, was robbed by thieves."

Monks heard these people who ... spread it about. Then these monks told this matter to the lord. Then the lord in this connection, on this occasion, having given reasoned talk, addressed the monks, saying:

"Because of this, monks, I will make known a rule of training for monks, founded on ten reasons: for the excellence of the Order ... for following the rules of restraint. And thus,

monks, this rule of training should be set forth:

“If a monk, going up to a family, (who) asking, should invite him (to take) cakes or barley-gruel, two or three bowlfuls may be accepted by a monk desiring them. Should he accept more than that, there is an offence of expiation. Having accepted two or three bowlfuls, having taken them back from there, they must be shared together with the monks. This is the proper course in this case.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 27, 2015 11:54 AM

Title: Re: First day MaeChee

Content:

Anumodanā.

"Well-taught is the Dhamma, fare the Brahma-faring for making an utter end of ill!"
(Vin. i. 12, Horner trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 27, 2015 12:36 PM

Title: Re: Executioner is not guilty!

Content:

The quoted passage is a rather free paraphrase from the Dhammapada Commentary, not a strict translation of it. What the Pali says is that in response to Sāriputta's question Tambadāṭhika came to perceive that the akusala in the executions he had carried out belonged to the king rather than to himself. This perception allayed his feelings of guilt, made his mind one-pointed and permitted him to attend to Sāriputta's teaching.

What the passage does not say is that Tambadāṭhika's perception was a correct one. In fact it was incorrect, for the orthodox view is that when one person does something akusala on another person's orders, the akusala kamma belongs to both of them. In short, what we have here seems to be a compassionate resort to skilful means on the part of Sāriputta, and not a revision of standard Buddhist kamma doctrine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 27, 2015 1:41 PM

Title: Re: Why these are called Imperfections of Insight ?

Content:

Because those who are attached to them are impeded in their progress from the third ñāṇa to the fourth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 27, 2015 4:06 PM

Title: Re: Why these are called Imperfections of Insight ?

Content:

That isn't necessary, for what are described are not themselves imperfections but rather symptoms of an imperfection. In the writer's view, when the described phenomena arise in a yogi at the stage of sammasana-ñāṇa, each one is symptomatic of an excess of faith. And so the underlying imperfection in each of the twelve cases consists in an imbalance in the spiritual faculties.

If the same phenomena were to arise in other circumstances, then all of them except the first might well be unqualifiedly wholesome occurrences.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 27, 2015 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Why these are called Imperfections of Insight ?

Content:

They are alluded to in the Yuganaddha Sutta under the name of "restlessness about Dhamma" (dhammuddhaccaviggahita):

“Again, a bhikkhu’s mind is seized by restlessness about the Dhamma. But there comes an occasion when his mind becomes internally steady, composed, unified, and concentrated. Then the path is generated in him. He pursues this path, develops it, and cultivates it. As he is pursuing, developing, and cultivating this path, the fetters are abandoned and the underlying tendencies are uprooted.

(AN. 4. 170. Bh. Bodhi tr.)

Then they are individually named by Sāriputta in the Paṭisambhidāmagga's expanded version of the Yuganaddha Sutta. Finally they are expounded in detail by Buddhaghosa in the Visuddhimagga's account of sammasana-ñāṇa. As for Sarath's link, this is a typical modern exposition of the kind emanating from the Thai modified Mahasi tradition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 28, 2015 3:43 AM

Title: Re: Confusion over long retreats, e.g 3 months?

Content:

If you mean a 10-day retreat where all the meditators start on the same day, finish on the same day, and are instructed in groups (as with the Goenka courses), I haven't myself heard of such an arrangement for 3-month retreats. Generally if you go to a meditation centre for three months, then you'll get individual daily instruction from the teacher and the retreat will begin whenever you happen to show up. On the other hand, if you go to a forest monastery, then it's more likely that your stay will simply entail doing

as the monks do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 28, 2015 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Why these are called Imperfections of Insight ?

Content:

Though some of these might (for all I know) be attributable to the eighth upakkilesa, I believe that for most of them common-or-garden opinionatedness would be the likelier cause.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 28, 2015 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Why these are called Imperfections of Insight ?

Content:

Passaddhi is reckoned here as uddhacca inasmuch as it carries the insight-developing yogi away from his proper task.

How is his mind agitated by overestimation of dhammas [manifested in contemplation]?

While he is giving attention as impermanent, tranquillity arises in him. He adverts to the tranquillity thus: 'tranquillity is a [Noble One's] dhamma'. The distraction due to that is agitation. When his mind is thus agitated by overestimation, he does not correctly understand appearance as impermanent, he does not correctly understand appearance as painful, he does not correctly understand appearance as not self. Hence it was said 'His mind is agitated by overestimation of dhammas [manifested in contemplation]. There is [later] an occasion when his cognizance is internally composed again, resettled, restored to singleness, and reconcentrated. Then the path is produced in him.'

[repeat, replacing 'tranquillity' with each of the other upakkilesas]
(Paṭisam. ii. 101-2. Ñāṇamoli tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 29, 2015 2:03 PM

Title: Re: Right view with effluents

Content:

Probably. The identity or close etymological association between the words for 'sky', 'cloud', 'deity' and 'day' is so common and so widespread a feature in the ancient Indo-European languages that it would be no surprise if it went all the way back to Proto-Indo-European itself. But confining ourselves to the case of Pali, we find the word 'megha' (which unambiguously means 'cloud') used interchangeably with 'deva' in Sutta passages about rain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 29, 2015 8:48 PM

Title: Re: Top 3-5 favorite buddhist books and/or talks?

Content:

Rhys Davids' translation is not marred by the excessive abridgement of Walshe's, has much more interesting and informative footnotes, and the English is more elegant. Then with regard to accuracy, Walshe's translation, although executed a century later than RD's, does not really represent a significant improvement over it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 7:04 AM

Title: Re: Is seeing Dependent Origination a must for Nibanna?

Content:

Paññā or ñāṇa is the term for "understanding".

Paññā arises progressively through three levels: that constructed by hearing/learning (suta-maya), by thinking (cintā-maya), and by development (bhāvanā-maya).

"Seeing" (dassana) is another name for bhāvanā-maya paññā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 7:53 AM

Title: Re: Things Most Worth Living For

Content:

Walking in the mountains at dawn and in tenebrous forests at dusk.

Teaching Dhamma and English to Pgaz K'nyau hill-tribe children.

Yam (spicy Thai salads), especially yam sap-parod (spicy pineapple salad with cashew nuts) and yam ta-khrai (lemongrass salad).

Good coffee.

Reunions with old friends.

Taking care of abandoned cats.

Reading 18th century English prose, 19th century poetry, the occasional novel or biography, and academic articles in the fields of general linguistics, history and anthropology of Southeast Asia, and comparative religious studies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 8:07 AM

Title: Re: Is seeing Dependent Origination a must for Nibanna?

Content:

Generally yes. That is, the principle *yaṃ ñāṇaṃ, taṃ dassanaṃ* ("That which is called understanding is also called seeing" —Vin. iii. 91) is applicable in most cases, though there are some contexts in which the two terms have distinct meanings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Things Most Worth Living For

Content:

That one's got squid in it, which is rather different from the dish I'm talking about. The old Thai lady who regularly offers it to me makes it as a vegetarian dish like this:

Except that she throws in about ten times more chilli than this dainty Australian.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Changing My Life Around

Content:

What is the point of that?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 1:25 PM

Title: Re: Is seeing Dependent Origination a must for Nibanna?

Content:

Yes, that seems to me a good way of putting it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 31, 2015 5:06 PM

Title: Re: Book: Sartre and Early Buddhism.

Content:

It is already available online, though I don't know if this is with the author's consent. I read a copy when it was first printed and from what I can recall of it I doubt admirers of Ñāṇavīra and Ñāṇānanda will find anything in it to interest them. The author's account of Husserlian phenomenology is typical of the invariably poor stuff that's turned out by the philosophy students at Mahachula University. It's a wholly derivative and cringeworthy exposition that doesn't seem to be the fruit of any great mental effort at all. Moreover, the author does not mean "early Buddhism" in the sense that this term is used by Ñāṇavīra or in academic Buddhist studies. If memory serves me right he actually means the fully developed Theravada in its entirety. It includes, for example, the 12th century Abhidhammatthasangaha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 1, 2015 6:05 AM

Title: Re: Changing My Life Around

Content:

Wow, that's a mess all right. It makes mine look so darn boring...

Screen.jpg (171.31 KiB) Viewed 1971 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 1, 2015 6:58 AM

Title: Re: Top 3 (or more) favorite buddhist books or talks?

Content:

Thanks for the suggestion. I'll give it a try.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 1, 2015 7:12 AM

Title: Re: What is a phenomena?

Content:

Sartre's _Being and Nothingness_? Come off it.

A non-philosopher won't get anywhere with this, unless she has already completed the sort of reading described above by Khalil Bodhi (and with the addition of Hegel's Phänomenologie and Husserl's Ideen). Just to understand Sartre's introduction requires a knowledge of half a dozen Husserlian technical terms, all of them given by the author

in German.

If one's going to begin with Sartre, then the first English translation of _The Transcendence of the Ego_ by Robert Kirkpatrick and Forrest Williams would be the place to begin. The translators' introduction is especially helpful:

[./download/file.php?id=2694](#)
(225.81 KiB) Downloaded 44 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 1, 2015 9:47 AM

Title: Re: What is a phenomena?

Content:

And I might add that when making a start on Being and Nothingness, it would be worth investing in the excellent commentary to it by Joseph Catalano:

<https://www.amazon.com/Commentary-Jean-Paul-Sartres-Nothingness-Reprint/dp/0226096998>

There's also an online paper by Catalano,

<http://files.lfranchi.com/papers/catalano.lying.to.oneself.sartre.pdf>. If you can understand the paper then you should be able to understand his commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 2, 2015 1:10 PM

Title: Re: Is seeing Dependent Origination a must for Nibanna?

Content:

Quite so. It seems to me that a much commoner danger nowadays than the one that concerns Dan is the under-estimation of the importance of developing understanding at the sutamaya and cintāmaya levels. This is a prerequisite for bhāvanā-maya paññā, yet one often sees it treated as though it were an optional extra, or even (and worse) a distracting irrelevance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 3, 2015 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Monastic rules on eating

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 3, 2015 11:21 AM

Title: Re: Monastic rules on eating

Content:

A bhikkhu can practise vegetarianism or veganism and still be Vinaya-observant, provided he doesn't do it in the way that East Asian Mahayana monastics are wont to do, i.e., by issuing gastronomic directives to their lay supporters.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 4, 2015 7:32 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Gananath Obeyesekere, Imagining Karma: Ethical Transformation in Amerindian, Buddhist, and Greek Rebirth

Contents of the Buddhism-related chapters...

1. Karma and Rebirth in Indic Religions: Origins and Transformations

[...]

3. The Imaginary Experiment and the Buddhist Implications

The Transformation of the Rebirth Eschatology

Emergence of the Karmic Eschatology

Upanishadic Ethicization: The Earliest Indic Model

The Model and the Buddhist Interconnections

Ethicization in Its Historical Context:

- The Samanic Religions
- Contemporary Tribal Religions
- Ethicization, Axiology, and the Brahmanic Tradition

Nonethicized Samanic Religions: The Doctrines of the Ājīvikas

Eel-Wrigglers and Hair-Splitters: Contentious Discourses in Buddhist Thought

Ethical Transformation and the Axial Age:

- Ethical Prophecy and Ethical Asceticism
- Rationalization and the Transformation of Thought

The Limits of Innovative Thought:

- Temporality, Impermanence, Nirvana
- Karma, Causality, and the Aporias of Existence

- Ethicization, Karma, and Everyday Life
- Ascetic Religiosity and the Escape from the World

4. The Buddhist Ascesis

The Imagined Buddha

The Renunciatory Ideal in the Buddhist Imagination

The Buddha as Seer: The Life Fate of the Buddhist Dead

Samanism and Shamanism:

- Ecstasis, Enstasis, and Spirit Possession
- Ethicization and the Creation of a God-Making Machine
- Ethicization and Axiologization
- Buddhism, Axiologization, and the Vedic Tradition

Axiologization Continued: Homo Hierarchicus and Homo Aequalis in India

[...]

7. Imprisoning Frames and Open Debates: Trobriander, Buddhist, and Balinese Rebirth Revisited

Reincarnation, Procreation, and the Embodiment of the Soul

Buddhism, Procreation, and Rebirth

Balinese Rebirth: Contentious Discourses on Rebirth and Karmic Eschatologies

Methodological Postscript

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 6:30 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

The precept applies only to the property of humans. The Vinaya rules it to be no offence to take something from an animal or a peta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 8:58 AM

Title: Re: renamed::: help finding monastery???

Content:

Have you ever stayed there? I haven't done so for over twenty years, but I remember it as not particularly pleasant. Firstly it's surrounded by marshy land and therefore extremely mosquito-ridden. Secondly, Ajahn Sanong is a very popular preacher and so the wat gets very noisy and busy on weekends and uposatha days.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 11:32 AM

Title: Re: Just The Buddha?

Content:

You've got it the wrong way round. The cosmological doctrines that are invoked in response to questions about human population increase, etc., existed for millenia before anyone ever thought to raise such questions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 1:16 PM

Title: Re: Questions About Karma and Rebirth

Content:

Asian Buddhists who use the two terms indiscriminately usually do so either because of a poor grasp of English, such that they're not aware of any difference in meaning between them, or else a poor grasp of Buddhist doctrine, such that they don't distinguish the Buddhist conception of the afterlife from the Hindu one. For example, they may not be familiar with the Milindapañha's distinction between the verbs saṅkamati and paṭisandahati :-

The King said: "Revered Nāgasena, does that which does not pass over (saṅkamati) reconnect (paṭisandahati)?"

"Yes, sire, that which does not pass over reconnects."

"How, reverend Nāgasena, does that which does not pass over reconnect? Make a simile."

"Suppose, sire, some man were to light a lamp from (another) lamp; would that lamp, sire, pass over from that (other) lamp?"

"No, reverend sir."

"In the same way, sire, that which does not pass over reconnects."

"Make a further simile."

"Do you remember, sire, when you were a boy learning some verse from a teacher of verses?"

"Yes, reverend sir."

"But, sire, does that verse pass over from the teacher?"

"O no, reverend sir."

“In the same way, sire, that which does not pass over (yet) reconnects.”

“You are dexterous, revered Nāgasena.”

(Mil. 71-2, Horner tr.)

Of the two terms, “reincarnation” carries too strong a sense of something (i.e. a soul) passing over.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 1:59 PM

Title: Re: Just The Buddha?

Content:

It has always been Buddhist doctrine that some humans were humans in the life before their present one, while others have ascended into the human realm from the lower realms, and yet others have descended from the higher realms. That being so, these teachings cannot be treated as fantasies concocted as retorts to modern objections to rebirth such as "If there's rebirth, how come the world's population is increasing?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 2:04 PM

Title: Re: Questions About Karma and Rebirth

Content:

I'm afraid I'm not familiar with it. What does he say?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 5, 2015 2:42 PM

Title: Re: What Is the Meaning of Your Username and Avatar?

Content:

My Pali name, meaning “bliss of Dhamma”, was chosen by my former preceptor, Ajahn Khemadhammo, in consultation with the late Dr. Rewata Dhamma, the seniormost monk at my sāmaṇera ordination in 1984. Khemadhammo wanted to name me after Ānanda, the Buddha’s long-term attendant, but as Thai custom disapproves of giving monks the names of the Buddha’s eighty great disciples the name had to be combined with something else. Dr. Rewata suggested that Khemadhammo should give me part of his own name, either ‘khema’ or ‘dhamma’, and so ‘Dhammānando’ was what I ended up with.

The avatar is a photo taken by the German nun Ayya Phalañāṇī at my mountain hermitage in Phrao. On my shoulder is my feline companion Bajazeth, Emperor of the Turks—or ‘Bajji’ for short—named after a character in Marlowe’s Tamburlaine the Great and Händel's Tamerlano, and corresponding to the historical Sultan Bayezid I.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 6, 2015 7:00 AM

Title: Re: How do Theravadins handle statue etiquette?

Content:

If the Buddha rupa is really an old one, and not one of the thousands of modern Thai rupas that have been treated to make them look old, then the eye-opening and saksit-infusing ceremonies, and all the other superstitious mummeries, will already have been carried out. It only remains for you to place it in some elevated location in your home and to treat it respectfully.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 6, 2015 10:25 AM

Title: Re: One frame of reference develops any of the rest?

Content:

See the Satipatthana and Anapanassati Suttas. The former confirms that mindfulness of breathing is part of body-contemplation. The latter confirms that the development of mindfulness of breathing fulfils all four satipatthanas.

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.010.nysa.html>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn118>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 7, 2015 9:55 AM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to touch their mothers?

Content:

In Thailand one could do this in theory, though in practice it would be unfeasible as a long-term option for a westerner because the special monastic visa extensions are granted only to bhikkhus and mae chees. In Burma I think such visa extensions are available to anyone staying long-term in a monastery or meditation centre. As for the Forest Sangha monasteries in Britain, Ven. Gavesako will know better than I how things are now. It used to be the case that although anagarikaship was generally regarded in the FS as the first stage in a programme that would eventually culminate in bhikkhuhood, exceptions would occasionally be made for men who wanted to live the brahmachariya but were unsuitable for (or debarred from) bhikkhuhood for one reason or another.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 7, 2015 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Monastics & smiling

Content:

The 11th and 12th sekhiya rules of the Pāṭimokkha prohibit a bhikkhu from laughing loudly when in company:

11. I shall not go laughing loudly in inhabited areas.

12. I shall not sit laughing loudly in inhabited areas.

The Ruṇṇa Sutta teaches that it's childish to indulge in an excess of mirth involving the display of one's teeth and that when there's a proper occasion for a bhikkhu to smile it should be done in a measured manner. But this is a Dhamma exhortation and not a Vinaya rule.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 7, 2015 11:17 AM

Title: Re: May as well (^_^)

Content:

Thanks for the interesting intro. May I ask what it was that drew you to Santi Monastery?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 7, 2015 11:43 AM

Title: Re: Punabbhava ("re-becoming")

Content:

The Thais use this too. Phob nii / phob naa are used interchangeably with chaat nii / chaat naa. Phob is the Thai pronunciation of bhava, and chaat is how they pronounce jāti; nii and naa are 'this' and 'future'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 7, 2015 11:51 AM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to touch their mothers?

Content:

Sorry about my irrelevant earlier reply. I misread the question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 8:32 AM

Title: Re: Term for the Bodhisatta's pre-enlightenment ascetic practices

Content:

Padhāna — effort, exertion.

Kaṭukā dukkarakārikā — severe difficult-to-do tasks / austerities.

Attakilamathānuyoga — devotion to self-torment.

Dukkarakiriyā — conduct that's difficult to do.

Atidukkarakiriyāya — conduct that's extremely difficult to do.

Paṭipattidukkarakiriyā — practice consisting in conduct that's difficult to do.

Catubbidhadukkarakiriyā — the fourfold difficult-to-do conduct.

The first three are the terms the Buddha uses in the Suttas. The fourth is the usual term in the commentaries (and also in modern SE Asian usage). The rest are less common commentarial terms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 9:04 AM

Title: Re: Term for the Bodhisatta's pre-enlightenment ascetic practices

Content:

Possibly, though the commentaries do contain the term dukkaracariyā. At the lexical level this would seem to mean roughly the same as dukkarakiriyā, though in practice I believe it's usually used when speaking of the arduousness of the Bodhisatta path in its entirety (i.e. the many lifetimes of developing the paramī) rather than just the austerities that certain Bodhisattas practise in their final life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Term for the Bodhisatta's pre-enlightenment ascetic practices

Content:

They are from the same root. Cariyā is conduct. Ācāra or samācāra is proper conduct. An ācariya is one who trains someone in ācāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 9:40 AM

Title: Re: Term for the Bodhisatta's pre-enlightenment ascetic practices

Content:

Padhāna and vayāma mean about the same. For example in the Suttas' description of the four components of right effort (sammā-vayāma) each one is termed a padhāna or a sammappadhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 6:59 PM

Title: Re: AN 2.19: Kusala Sutta — Skillful

Content:

I would say so. I think that 'skilful' (a word with no moral connotations at all) is

ridiculously over-used by English-speaking Buddhists. Admittedly, the commentaries do recognize cheka, 'skilful', 'clever', as one of the meanings of kusala, but the examples that they give for this sense of the word are phrases like "a skilful acrobat" or "he drives the chariot skilfully".

In moral contexts kusala is never glossed as cheka but as ārogya ('healthy'), anavajja ('blameless'), and sukhavipāka ('[having a] pleasant ripening'). The translation 'wholesome' captures this sense much better than 'skilful'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 8, 2015 7:06 PM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

I think the Salla Sutta is the most appropriate.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/kn/snp/snp.3.08.irel.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 9, 2015 11:34 AM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

I'm not very familiar with the Buddhist funeral customs outside of Thailand, so I don't know whether the Five Subjects for Frequent Reflection are used anywhere. In Thailand they form part of the morning chanting in most monasteries, but I've never heard them chanted at a funeral.

I have heard that the Sri Lankan custom is to recite the Salla Sutta at funerals and this strikes me as a much more reasonable practice than what we do in Thailand. As there's nothing that can be done for the deceased, a funeral should serve as an occasion for salutary reflection by the living. The Salla Sutta serves this purpose.

In Thailand, however, the custom is to recite the mātikās to the seven books of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, a practice that's aimed at the benefit of the deceased rather than the people attending the funeral. The underlying belief is that the spirit of the deceased is hanging around the coffin and needs to be urged to go and get reborn. And so the chanting of the Abhidhamma is aimed at informing the spirit that the rūpadhammas that make up its corpse are no use to it anymore and so it's time to let go of attachment to it and move on. Given the Theravada's rejection of the doctrine of an intermediate state between death and rebirth, the custom is obviously an irrational superstition. There's also a certain irony to the Thai practice, considering that the Theravadin rejection of the intermediate state heresy is actually contained in one of the books of the Abhidhamma!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 9, 2015 12:46 PM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

I think that goes beyond what the texts support. They seem to allow only for the possibility of an alleviation of the sufferings of one particular sub-species of preta. Not a liberation from the preta state itself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 9, 2015 12:58 PM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

It's not that bad! In any case the chanting takes only about ten minutes at the most. One will find it done in many different styles, some of them quite beautiful and others an absolute cacophany. Something like this is probably the commonest:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 10, 2015 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

"It is the rule that whereas other women carry the child in their womb for nine or ten months before giving birth, it is not so with the Bodhisatta's mother, who carries him for exactly ten months before giving birth. That is the rule"
(Mahāpadāna Sutta, DN. 14)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 10, 2015 6:48 AM

Title: Re: Pali chanting for deceased

Content:

<http://www.dharmawheel.net>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 10, 2015 9:51 PM

Title: Re: Are the Police in the USA out of control?

Content:

To what then should we attribute such gross disproportions as those below?

1.jpeg (59.95 KiB) Viewed 2902 times

.

2.jpeg (56.18 KiB) Viewed 2902 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 10, 2015 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Are the Police in the USA out of control?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and raising children, how?

Content:

In the present case I think that's because you're taking the man's humour (in particular his auxesis and faux-curmudgeonliness) a little too literally.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 8:30 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

Bad translation. The Pali doesn't say that the Buddha was "not pleased" but only that he dismissed (or perhaps "rebuked" — *apasādesi*) *Upavāṇa*. It was the visiting devas who were not pleased, for *Upavāṇa* was obstructing their view of the Buddha.

If, however, the sutta had reported that the Buddha was not pleased with Upavāṇa, that would still fall a long way short of attributing "crotchiness" to him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha say drinking Alcohol is bad?

Content:

The Vinaya doesn't say anything about when the fifth precept for householders was first taught. It reports only the occasion when this training rule was laid down for bhikkhus. It would be true to say that this training rule didn't exist from the very beginning, but only trivially true for the same applies to all the Vinaya training rules — each one was established in the aftermath of some errant bhikkhu performing the action in question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 10:36 AM

Title: Re: Monastic rules on eating

Content:

There's no Vinaya limit as to quantity. In the Suttas the Buddha recommends that bhikkhus stop eating five mouthfuls before they feel full in order to avoid post-prandial lethargy, but he didn't make this into a Vinaya rule.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Monastic rules on eating

Content:

When monks are sick they can take the allowable medicines at any time of the day or night.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 11, 2015 9:42 PM

Title: Re: My rough plan

Content:

I can't advise you myself as I'm not up to date regarding how matters stand for those seeking ordination. However, I recommend that you try sending your queries to these people:

<http://assistthaivisa.com/>

They are very reliable and up to date, and although it's a commercial service they're

running they won't charge you for giving advice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 12, 2015 8:21 AM

Title: Re: Thanissaro on King Mongkut

Content:

It's common knowledge and there's nothing in the least remarkable about it. Traditionally for the monarchs of Siam, Burma, Laos and Cambodia, being a Bodhisattva (at least nominally) was pretty much part of the job description, along with being a Protector of the Dhamma and an incarnation of Rama, Vishnu, Shiva or Indra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 12, 2015 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro on King Mongkut

Content:

If memory serves me right, it does accord with the findings of Stanley Tambiah. King Mongkut and the other bigwigs of the early Dhammayuttika Nikāya valued the Dhamma primarily as a source of civic virtue rather than as a path to liberation. This remained the case with the Dhammayutts until the appearance of the Ajahn Sao/Ajahn Mun tradition, together with the post-war Burmese-inspired revival of Abhidhamma studies and satipaṭṭhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 12, 2015 3:45 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

It's that there was nothing wrong with Cunda's meal and it wasn't the cause of the Buddha's passing. The reason it was inedible for anyone but a Tathāgata wasn't because it consisted of bad pork or poisonous mushrooms, as modernists like to speculate. Rather, it was because a huge number of devas had infused the food with celestial oja out of a desire to acquire merit by participating in the offering of the last meal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 12, 2015 4:13 PM

Title: Re: My rough plan

Content:

It's not Wat Pah Baan Taad. It's Wat Bodhisomphorn, a Dhammayutt monastery in the town of Udorn. Very few abbots of Dhammayutt forest wats possess a license to give ordinations, and so in most cases a would-be Dhammayutt forest monk will ordain in a

city wat and then request his upajjhaya's permission to go and live in a forest wat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 12, 2015 8:21 PM

Title: Re: My rough plan

Content:

As it's an Ajahn Maha Boowa youtube channel that's hosting the video, most likely Baan Tard is the monastery they're headed for.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 13, 2015 7:00 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

The commentarial thinking is that the Buddha's death was not due to there being anything wrong with Cunda's food. The Buddha's words acquitting Cunda of any fault were spoken because there really was no fault and not merely to assuage any remorse that might arise in him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 13, 2015 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro on King Mongkut

Content:

I don't myself know what evidence there is. However, I forwarded your question to my Icelandic anthropologist friend who's a Thailand specialist. He wrote back to say that he can't provide any sources right now as he's driving around in the Arizona Desert, but will do so when he returns to his college in a few days.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 13, 2015 10:27 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

I suppose that from the commentarial point of view it would be necessary to retain a record of the event in order to show that Gotama had completely fulfilled the thirtyfold regularities common to all Buddhas, thereby leaving his attainment of anuttara sammāsambodhi beyond any doubt. The twenty-ninth regularity is "consuming a meal of flesh on the day of their Parinibbāna" (Bv-a. 298).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 13, 2015 11:20 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro on King Mongkut

Content:

<https://www.dropbox.com/s/bm86temxlh7vcdx/Gray%20%7C%20Soteriological%20State.pdf>

The 1986 PhD thesis of Christine Gray.

Though they make no mention of any formal taking of the bodhisattva vow, chapters 4 and 5 give an interesting picture of how seriously King Ramas III and IV took their bodhisattvaship.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 8:23 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 8:43 AM

Title: Re: The Writings of R. G. de S. Wettimuny

Content:

I think Wettimuny is right, though it seems curious to me that such a claim would be made by a follower of a four-Nikāya fundamentalist like Ñāṇavīra. If one's conception of arahatta were derived strictly from the Suttas, one would be unlikely to conceive of this attainment as being anything but purgative and an arahant devoid of compassion (at least of active compassion) would be perfectly possible (a position that I have in fact seen championed by some followers of Ñāṇananda).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 11:10 AM

Title: Re: Emotions and Buddhism

Content:

To say that fear arises due to craving does not mean that fear is craving. In the present case, fear would arise in a person who is not free of craving on account of the tiger's formidable capacity to frustrate his craving for existence (bhava-taṇhā).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 1:05 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

The devas' capacity (and their eagerness) to do this sort of thing is attested to in the Suttas, but the claim that they actually did so on this occasion is commentarial.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 7:17 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

In the opening section of each of his commentaries Buddhaghosa lays down the following classification for the degree of authoritativeness of different sources of Dhamma:

1. Sutta: "the well-said" = the three baskets of the Tipiṭaka.
2. Suttānuloma: "the according with the well-said" = a direct inference from the Tipiṭaka.
3. Atthakathā: "treatise on the meaning" = an ancient commentary.
4. Attanomati: "personal opinion" = the expositions and views of later generations of teachers.

In this scheme, sutta is viewed as the strongest source of authority (i.e. to be regarded as inerrant) and attanomati the weakest. So this is what's recommended, though frankly it's a recommendation that one finds more honoured in the breach nowadays. For example:

In some scholarly conservative quarters there is a tendency to treat atthakathā as being equal in weight to sutta and to dismiss non-traditional suttānulomas out of hand as being mere attanomati.

Among some "back-to-the-Suttas" Buddhists one sees the opposite tendency: a failure to recognize one's own attanomati as being just that, and then an elevation of it to the status of suttānuloma.

Among some followers of Theravadin guru cults (especially the Thai forest tradition) one finds the attanomati of this or that teacher being treated as the sole source of authority and other three viewed with uninterest or even contempt. In effect attanomati is here being elevated to the status that properly belongs to sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 14, 2015 7:26 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's suicide

Content:

Yes, the concentration of ojā was too great even for them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Emotions and Buddhism

Content:

According to the texts the abandoning of sakkāya-diṭṭhi results in an overriding of certain physiological functions that we are wont to call "instinctive".

From Numerical Discourses:

“Bhikkhus, there are these two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt. What two? A bhikkhu whose taints are destroyed and a thoroughbred elephant. These are the two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt.”

“Bhikkhus, there are these two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt. What two? A bhikkhu whose taints are destroyed and a thoroughbred horse. These are the two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt.”

“Bhikkhus, there are these two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt. What two? A bhikkhu whose taints are destroyed and a lion, king of the beasts. These are the two that are not terrified by a bursting thunderbolt.”

Commentary: “The arahant is not terrified because he has abandoned personal-existence view (sakkāyadiṭṭhiyā pahīnattā); the thoroughbred elephant, because his personal-existence view is very strong (sakkāyadiṭṭhiyā balavattā).”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

Visākhā, wife of Puṇṇavaḍḍhana and mother of Migāra, is reported in the Suttas to have been a married and highly fecund lay sotāpanna.

<http://www.softerviews.org/DPPN/visakhaa.html>

More importantly:

“There are not only one hundred, Vaccha, or two or three or four or five hundred, but far more male lay followers, my disciples, clothed in white enjoying sensual pleasures, who carry out my instruction, respond to my advice, have gone beyond doubt, become free of perplexity, gained intrepidity, and become independent of others in the Teacher’s Dispensation.”

(Mahāvacchagotta Sutta)

This refers to stream-entry. The same is repeated for the higher ariyan stages up to non-

returning (though excluding arahatta). The same is also repeated for female lay followers. The phrase “enjoying sensual pleasures” (kāmaḥogin) indicates that these spiritual virtuosos were not brahmacārīs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 7:50 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

No. Since the Sutta describes both the celibate and the non-celibate householders as being "clothed in white" the phrase merely signifies that they were householders and not monastics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 8:12 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

Only to someone led astray by Buddhadāsa. To a Buddhist of orthodox view it shows merely that strongly developed traits can persist not only during a single lifetime but also through saṃsāric time — a phenomenon abundantly attested to in the Suttas and Vinaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 7:32 PM

Title: Re: Australia's second-largest religion is being 'ignored'

Content:

Because Buddhists were called "sons/daughters of the Sakyan" in those days.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 15, 2015 9:22 PM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

It may be beneficial or detrimental. It's most likely to be beneficial when the decision to undertake it is prompted by saṃvega and the paññā that discerns the peril in sense-pleasures and the advantage of renouncing them. It's less likely to be so when a person is weak in paññā, such that his decision is prompted by something else, such as aversion or sīlabbataparāmāsa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 16, 2015 10:46 AM

Title: Re: The bombing of Hiroshima was a war crime, why is there no apology?

Content:

I would suggest that it is "just your experience". If you spent more time conversing with ābhidhammikas you'd be reporting that: "Whenever Buddhist ethics are discussed, kamma is always presented in terms of the three kusala and three akusala roots that determine the moral quality of the conascent cetanās of wholesome and unwholesome consciousnesses."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 16, 2015 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Australia's second-largest religion is being 'ignored'

Content:

Even when illusory identities are removed one may, and indeed must, still use the "names, expressions turns of speech, designations in common use in the world," only without being led astray by them. See the Poṭṭhapāda and the Araṇavibhaṅga Suttas.

<http://metta.lk/tipitaka/2Sutta-Pitaka/1Digha-Nikaya/Digha1/09-potthapada-e.html>

<http://www.bps.lk/olib/wh/wh269-u.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 16, 2015 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Pannavaddho, Uncommon Wisdom, Thai?

Content:

See the Thai edition of the talks the ajahn gave at Hampstead Vihara in 1974. In particular his answer to the question that starts: "เรื่องจิตไม่ตาย อยู่ถาวร ที่ท่านอธิบายมานี้ ..."

<http://www.luangta.com/upload/ThammaBook/content/20040116161836.doc>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 16, 2015 11:20 PM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

Let me save you a few minutes...

Migasālā *

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvathī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. Then, in the morning, the Venerable Ānanda dressed, took his

bowl and robe, and went to the house of the female lay follower Migasālā, where he sat down on the seat prepared for him. Then the female lay disciple Migasālā approached the Venerable Ānanda, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said:

“Bhante Ānanda, just how should this teaching of the Blessed One be understood, where one who is celibate and one who is not celibate both have exactly the same destination in their future life? My father Purāṇa was celibate, living apart, abstaining from sexual intercourse, the common person’s practice. When he died, the Blessed One declared: ‘He attained to the state of a once-returner and has been reborn in the Tusita group [of devas].’ My paternal uncle Isidatta ** was not celibate but lived a contented married life. When he died, the Blessed One also declared: ‘He attained to the state of a once-returner and has been reborn in the Tusita group [of devas].’ Bhante Ānanda, just how should this teaching of the Blessed One be understood, where one who is celibate and one who is not celibate both have exactly the same destination in their future life?”

“It was just in this way, sister, that the Blessed One declared it.”

Then, when the Venerable Ānanda had received almsfood at Migasālā’s house, he rose from his seat and departed. After his meal, on returning from his alms round, he went to the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said: “Here, Bhante, in the morning, I dressed, took my bowl and robe, and went to the house of the female lay follower Migasālā.... [all as above, down to] ... When she asked me this, I replied: ‘It was just in this way, sister, that the Blessed One declared it.’”

[The Blessed One said:] “Who, indeed, is the female lay follower Migasālā, a foolish, incompetent woman with a woman’s intellect? And who are those [who have] the knowledge of other persons as superior and inferior? ***

“There are, Ānanda, these ten types of persons found existing in the world. What ten?

(1) “Here, Ānanda, there is one person who is immoral and does not understand as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that immorality of his ceases without remainder.**** And he has not listened [to the teachings], become learned [in them], penetrated [them] by view, and he does not attain temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for deterioration, not for distinction; he is one going to deterioration, not to distinction.

(2) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is immoral yet understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that immorality of his ceases without remainder. And he has listened [to the teachings], become learned [in them], penetrated [them] by view, and he attains temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for distinction, not for deterioration; he is one going to distinction, not to deterioration.

“Ānanda, those who are judgmental will pass such judgment on them: ‘This one has the same qualities as the other. Why should one be inferior and the other superior?’ That

[judgment] of theirs will indeed lead to their harm and suffering for a long time.

“Between them, Ānanda, the person who is immoral, and who understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that immorality of his ceases without remainder; who has listened [to the teachings], become learned [in them], penetrated [them] by view, and who attains temporary liberation, surpasses and excels the other person. For what reason? Because the Dhamma-stream carries him along. But who can know this difference except the Tathāgata?

“Therefore, Ānanda, do not be judgmental regarding people. Do not pass judgment on people. Those who pass judgment on people harm themselves. I alone, or one like me, may pass judgment on people.

(3) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is virtuous yet does not understand as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that virtuous behavior of his ceases without remainder. And he has not listened [to the teachings] ... he does not attain temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for deterioration, not for distinction; he is one going to deterioration, not to distinction.

(4) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is virtuous and understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that virtuous behavior of his ceases without remainder. And he has listened [to the teachings] ... and he attains temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for distinction, not for deterioration; he is one going to distinction, not to deterioration.

“Ānanda, those who are judgmental will pass such judgment on them ... I alone, or one like me, may pass judgment on people.

(5) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is strongly prone to lust and does not understand as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that lust of his ceases without remainder. And he has not listened [to the teachings] ... he does not attain temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for deterioration, not for distinction; he is one going to deterioration, not to distinction.

(6) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is strongly prone to lust yet understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that lust of his ceases without remainder. And he has listened [to the teachings] ... and he attains temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for distinction, not for deterioration; he is one going to distinction, not to deterioration.

“Ānanda, those who are judgmental will pass such judgment on them.... I alone, or one like me, may pass judgment on people.

(7) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is prone to anger and does not understand as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that anger of his ceases without remainder. And he has not listened [to the teachings] ... he does not attain temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for

deterioration, not for distinction; he is one going to deterioration, not to distinction.

(8) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is prone to anger yet understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that anger of his ceases without remainder. And he has listened [to the teachings] ... he attains temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for distinction, not for deterioration; he is one going to distinction, not to deterioration.

“Ānanda, those who are judgmental will pass such judgment on them.... I alone, or one like me, may pass judgment on people.

(9) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is restless and does not understand as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that restlessness of his ceases without remainder. And he has not listened [to the teachings] ... he does not attain temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for deterioration, not for distinction; he is one going to deterioration, not to distinction.

(10) “Then, Ānanda, there is one person who is restless yet understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that restlessness of his ceases without remainder. And he has listened [to the teachings], become learned [in them], penetrated [them] by view, and he attains temporary liberation. With the breakup of the body, after death, he heads for distinction, not for deterioration; he is one going to distinction, not to deterioration.

“Ānanda, those who are judgmental will pass such judgment on them: ‘This one has the same qualities as the other. Why should one be inferior and the other superior?’ That [judgment] of theirs will indeed lead to their harm and suffering for a long time.

“Between them, Ānanda, the person who is restless, and who understands as it really is that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, where that restlessness of his ceases without remainder; who has listened [to the teachings], become learned [in them], penetrated [them] by view, and who attains temporary liberation, surpasses and excels the other person. For what reason? Because the Dhamma-stream carries him along. But who can know this difference except the Tathāgata?

“Therefore, Ānanda, do not be judgmental regarding people. Do not pass judgment on people. Those who pass judgment on people harm themselves. I alone, or one like me, may pass judgment on people.

“Who, indeed, is the female lay follower Migasālā, a foolish, incompetent woman with a woman’s intellect? And who are those [who have] the knowledge of other persons as superior and inferior?

“These are the ten types of persons found existing in the world.

“Ānanda, if Isidatta had possessed the same kind of virtuous behavior that Purāṇa had, Purāṇa could not have even known his destination. And if Purāṇa had possessed the

same kind of wisdom that Isidatta had, Isidatta could not have even known his destination. In this way, Ānanda, these two persons were each deficient in one respect.”

NOTES

* A part-parallel of 6:44, with similar setting but different contents.

** Ce pettā pi yo; Be pitāmaho, Ee pettā piyo. PED explains pitāmahā (under pitar) as “grandfather,” which seems unlikely here. PED, under pettāpiya (epic Skt pitṛvya), gives “father’s brother, paternal uncle,” which can thus support Ce and Ee if the spaces are eliminated. See too pp. 1758–59, note 1330.

*** I take Ce –ñāṇo here to be a misprint for –ñāṇe, which occurs in the repetition of the statement toward the end of the sutta. In 6:44, Ce has –ñāṇe in both places.

**** Dussīlyaṃ aparisesaṃ nirujjhati. Mp: “Here, the five kinds of immorality are abandoned by the path of stream-entry; the ten [courses of unwholesome kamma], by the path of arahantship. At the moment of fruition they are said to have been abandoned. By nirujjhati the text here refers to the moment of fruition. A worldling breaks virtuous behavior in five ways: by committing a pārājika offense, by giving up the training, by joining another sect, by reaching arahantship, and by death. The first three lead to the decline of development, the fourth to its growth, and the fifth neither to decline nor growth. But how is virtuous behavior broken by reaching arahantship? Because a worldling can have extremely wholesome virtuous behavior, but the path of arahantship leads to the destruction of wholesome and unwholesome kamma; thus it is broken in that way.” This, it should be pointed out, is explained from the Abhidhamma standpoint, according to which an arahant’s actions, being mere activities (kiriya) without kammic result, are not classified as either wholesome or unwholesome. In the language of the suttas, however, they would be described as extremely wholesome.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 6:02 AM

Title: Re: Australia’s second-largest religion is being ‘ignored’

Content:

No, it isn’t necessary to publicly announce that one is a Buddhist if one is disinclined to do so. Unless one joins an outfit like Soka Gakkai, one won’t usually find among Buddhists that obsession with ‘witnessing’ that one finds so often among, say, evangelical Protestants and Muslims of a certain stripe. On the other hand, it is necessary to be truthful. When asked about one’s religious affiliation, the truthful answer, if one has gone for refuge, is “I am a Buddhist.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 7:06 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

Not really. In fact Schmitthausen's findings were that:

1. In the early Buddhist texts there are sporadic mentions of a pre-Buddhist belief in plants as living, sentient beings.
2. These texts offer no conclusive evidence as to whether the Buddha and his disciples accepted these beliefs.
3. In later texts the belief is explicitly rejected.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 8:04 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

The Suttas don't say.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 8:25 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

In the Aṅguttara-ṭīkā, and in the Vajirabuddhi, the Sāratthadīpanī, and other Vinaya commentaries to the 11th Pācittiya rule and to the Vinaya Piṭaka's account of the origin of the vassa retreat, the belief that plants possess the body-faculty (kāyindriya) is described as "mere imagining" on the part of Jains and naked ascetics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 9:00 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

The translation is by Sister Uppalavaṇṇā, who is extremely clumsy and careless. It might be less direct, but it's not a faithful translation of any of the passage's three variant readings.

Burmese: bālā abyattā ammakā ammakapaññā: foolish incompetent little nanny with a little nanny's intellect.

Sinhalese: bālā abyattā ambakā ambakapaññā: foolish incompetent mango-girl with a mango-girl's intellect.

Thai: bālā abyattā andhakā andhakapaññā: foolish incompetent blind woman with a blind woman's intellect.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 9:14 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

As I've said already:

1. In the early Buddhist texts there are sporadic mentions of a pre-Buddhist belief in plants as living, sentient beings.

2. These texts offer no conclusive evidence as to whether the Buddha and his disciples accepted these beliefs.

If you read the Vinaya Piṭaka you will find Prof. Schmitthausen has correctly represented matters. Reading it without the commentary there is no way of telling whether the Buddha himself held that plants possess the kāyindriya or was just ordering his monastic disciples to act in accordance with this widely held belief in order to avoid unnecessary social friction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Romantic Love

Content:

Counting against such a possibility is the fact that the parallel sūtra in the Chinese Saṃyukta Āgama characterizes Migasālā in virtually identical terms.

However, to anyone suspecting an interpolation by a misogynistic scribe I would note that the Pali word used for "woman" in the phrase "woman's intellect" is not one of the common words for a woman, but a rather rare and unflattering one. That being so, the passage cannot reasonably be construed as implying that weakness of intellect is characteristic of women in general.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Looking for Sutta about who sees

Content:

Moḷiyaphagguna Sutta

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn12.12>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 11:57 AM

Title: Re: What is the very first thing I should do?

Content:

Especially Ñāṇamoli's version of his life, now available in a free (and legal) download:

http://store.pariyatti.org/Life-of-the-Buddha--According-to-the-Pali-Canon--PDF-eBook_p_1412.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 17, 2015 6:52 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Janet Gyatso (ed.)

In the Mirror of Memory - Reflections on Mindfulness and Remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism

CONTENTS

Donald S. Lopez

Memories of the Buddha

Padmanabh S. Jaini

Smṛti in The Abhidharma Literature and the Development of Buddhist Accounts of Memory of the Past

Nyanaponika Thera

The Omission of Memory in the Theravadin List of Dhammas: On The Nature of Saññā

Collett Cox

Mindfulness and Memory: The Scope of Smṛti from Early Buddhism to the Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma

Paul J. Griffiths

Memory in Classical Indian Yogācāra

Alex Wayman

Buddhist Terms for Recollection and Other Types of Memory

Rupert Gethin

The Mātikās: Memorization, Mindfulness, and the List

Janet Gyatso

Letter Magic: A Peircean Perspective on the Semiotics of Rdo Grub-chen's Dhāraṇī Memory

Paul Harrison

Commemoration and Identification in Buddhānusmṛti

Matthew Kapstein

The Amnesic Monarch and the Five Mnemic Men: "Memory" in Great Perfection (Rdzogs-chen) Thought

Edward S. Casey

Remembering Resumed: Pursuing Buddhism and Phenomenology in Practice

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 7:56 AM

Title: Re: Deadly blast rocks Thailand capital

Content:

If it's southern Muslim terrorists, then planting a bomb in the vicinity of the Erawan shrine will reduce the likelihood of killing a fellow Muslim. If it's political terrorists, see Ven. Gavesako's links for the background.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 8:48 AM

Title: Re: Resources: Phenomenology

Content:

Edward S. Casey, Remembering Resumed: Pursuing Buddhism and Phenomenology in Practice.

[./download/file.php?id=2702](#)

(483.76 KiB) Downloaded 117 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 9:10 AM

Title: Re: The bombing of Hiroshima was a war crime, why is there no apology?

Content:

Like Yeats a century and a half later, Burke was talking about the triumph of evil in a society, not in the minds of individuals.

Turning and turning in the widening gyre
The falcon cannot hear the falconer;
Things fall apart; the centre cannot hold;
Mere anarchy is loosed upon the world,
The blood-dimmed tide is loosed, and everywhere
The ceremony of innocence is drowned;
The best lack all conviction, while the worst
Are full of passionate intensity.

<http://www.potw.org/archive/potw351.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 9:19 AM

Title: Re: The bombing of Hiroshima was a war crime, why is there no apology?

Content:

Assuming of course that it was actually Burke who said it, which is a matter of doubt.

On my traditionalist conservatism forum we had a lengthy thread about this famous quotation a few years ago. Though it's always attributed to Burke, none of us could actually find it in any of his extant works. The closest we got to it was this:

“When bad men combine, the good must associate; else they will fall one by one, an unpitied sacrifice in a contemptible struggle.”
(Thoughts on the Cause of the Present Discontents, 1770)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 4:52 PM

Title: Re: Deadly blast rocks Thailand capital

Content:

I'm aware of that, but it's irrelevant here, for the conflict in the south of Thailand is not one between rival sects of Muslims.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 7:04 PM

Title: Re: Deadly blast rocks Thailand capital

Content:

It now looks as if both theories are wrong. The authorities are looking for the backpacker in the video below who was filmed leaving his backpack by the shrine. He doesn't look like a Thai at all.

if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =

```
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 18, 2015 7:58 PM

Title: Re: What has humanity actually achieved?

Content:

“rising above the apes”

“conquering and extirpating the dragons and monsters of the brine”

“evolving the moral theme”

“marching forward across the centuries to broad conceptions of compassion, of freedom, and of right”

And above all, the beautiful Ciceronian oratory that allowed Churchill to put all the above into a single paragraph...

“House of Many Mansions” Speech, 20 January 1940

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Transcript:

<http://www.churchill-society-london.org.uk/Joybells.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 20, 2015 9:10 AM

Title: Re: Feedback on Site Update

Content:

On MacOS it works fine with the Chrome, Safari, Firefox, Tor and Camino browsers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 20, 2015 10:21 AM

Title: Re: The obligatory Dhamma themed movie thread

Content:

Interpreting "Dhamma-themed" rather liberally, here is Pashana Bedhi from the 1968 BBC children's serial The Herbs. When I was about three, Pashana was my very first exposure to Indian religiosity in general, and in particular to the celebrated simile of mistaking a rope for a snake.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

“Suppose a timid man is pursued by a snake in a forest and flees from it as fast as he can, then if he sees a length of rope in the place he has fled to, he is fearful, anxious and will not even look at it.

“Here is the application of the simile. The time when the bhikkhu has the gross physical matter as his object is like the time when the man was threatened by the snake. The time when the bhikkhu surmounts the gross physical matter by means of the fourth jhāna of the fine-material sphere is like the man’s fleeing as fast as he can. The bhikkhu’s observing that even the matter of the kasiṇa is the counterpart of that gross physical matter and his wanting to surmount that also is like the man’s seeing the length of rope in the place he had fled to and his unwillingness to look owing to fear and anxiety.”

(Visuddhimagga, ch. 10)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 21, 2015 11:51 AM

Title: Re: Melodic patterns in sutta recitations

Content:

My connection is too slow to watch your videos, but yes, there are logical explanations for all the regional styles of chanting, though discerning the patterns in the chants' melodies would be an easier task for a phonetician than for a musician or poet.

For example, in the most widely used method of chanting in Thailand, each Pali syllable is treated as if it were a Thai syllable and then pronounced according to the tonal rules of Thai. To a listener with no training in phonetics this will be most easily noticed in the following syllables, all of which have to be pronounced with a rising tone:

khā, khī, khū, khe, kho, khaṇ, khañ, khaṇ, khan, kham, khaṃ
chā, chī, chū, che, cho, chaṇ, chañ, chaṇ, chan, cham, chaṃ
ṭhā, ṭhī, ṭhū, ṭhe, ṭho, ṭhaṇ, ṭhañ, ṭhaṇ, ṭhan, ṭham, ṭhaṃ
thā, thī, thū, the, tho, thaṇ, thañ, thaṇ, than, tham, thaṃ
phā, phī, phū, phe, pho, phaṇ, phañ, phaṇ, phan, pham, phaṃ
sā, sī, sū, se, so, saṇ, sañ, saṇ, san, sam, saṃ

hā, hī, hū, he, ho, haṇ, hañ, haṇ, han, ham, haṃ

Why? Because in the Thai tonal system it's the rule that whenever one of the so-called "high-class consonants" (kha, cha, tha, pha, sa, ha) is followed by a long vowel, or by a short vowel and then a nasal consonant, then that syllable will always require a rising tone. But this is just one tonal rule; there are about a dozen more one would need to learn to fully grasp the system. That being so, unless one is willing to learn the whole Thai tonal system, a would-be Thai-style chanter will find it far easier to just imitate chanters who do know it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 21, 2015 9:44 PM

Title: Re: Joke!!!

Content:

Dorothy & Toto.jpg (29.66 KiB) Viewed 2879 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 21, 2015 9:50 PM

Title: Re: Devas Remembering Past Lives

Content:

Yes. All beings of apparitional birth recall their former life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 21, 2015 9:55 PM

Title: Re: Devas Remembering Past Lives

Content:

Yes, I did read it in a reliable source, but I'm afraid I've forgotten what it was.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 22, 2015 1:01 PM

Title: Re: Deadly blast rocks Thailand capital

Content:

Zachary Abuza's analysis of the likely culprits

<http://asiapacific.anu.edu.au/newmandala/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Matrix.pdf>
International groups

Hezbollah: very low.

Jl: very low.

IS: moderate-high.

Uighur: low.

Domestic groups

Red Shirts: moderate.

Southern Insurgents: moderate-high.

<http://www.seasiaanalytics.com/SEAsiaanalytics.com/About.html>

Zachary Abuza, PhD is Principal of Southeast Asia Analytics, an independent consultancy on Southeast Asian politics and security affairs.

He served as Professor of Political Science and International Relations at Simmons College, Boston from 1996-2010; and 2012-2014. From 2010-2012 he served as Professor of National Security Strategy at the National War College at the National Defense University in Washington, DC.

He received his B.A. from Trinity College (1991), and M.A.L.D. (1994) and Ph.D. (1998) from the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University.

Dr. Abuza specializes in security issues and politics in Southeast Asia. He has written widely on the issues of insurgency and terrorism, political risk, governance and democratization, and political economy. He is the author of Conspiracy of Silence: The Insurgency in Southern Thailand (2008), Political Islam and Violence in Indonesia (2006), Militant Islam in Southeast Asia (2003), and Renovating Politics in Contemporary Vietnam (2001). He authored the Southeast Asian chapter in the acclaimed, study Leaving Terrorism Behind. In addition, he has authored four monographs on security issues in Southeast Asia.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 23, 2015 6:36 AM

Title: Re: My guardian angel contacted me and my fiance

Content:

It's from the Sabrahmakasutta, which is found in both the Aṅguttara Nikāya (in both a short and an expanded form) and the Itivuttaka:

Sabrahmaka Sutta (expanded version)

With Brahmā

(1) "Bhikkhus, those families dwell with Brahmā where at home the mother and father are revered by their children. (2) Those families dwell with the first teachers where at home the mother and father are revered by their children. (3) Those families dwell with the first deities where at home the mother and father are revered by their children. (4)

Those families dwell with the gift-worthy where at home the mother and father are revered by their children.

“‘Brahmā,’ bhikkhus, is a designation for mother and father. ‘First teachers’ is a designation for mother and father. ‘First deities’ is a designation for mother and father. ‘Gift-worthy’ is a designation for mother and father. And why? Mother and father are very helpful to their children: they raise them, nurture them, and show them the world.”

Mother and father are called “Brahmā,”
and also “first teachers.”

They are worthy of gifts from their children,
for they have compassion for their offspring.
Therefore a wise person should revere them
and treat them with honor.

One should serve them with food and drink,
with clothes and bedding,
by massaging and bathing them,
and by washing their feet.

Because of that service
to mother and father,
the wise praise one in this world
and after death one rejoices in heaven.

(A. ii. 70. Bh. Bodhi tr.)

Sabrahmaka Sutta

With Brahmā

This was said by the Lord, said by the Arahant, so I heard:

“Living with Brahmā are those families where, within the home, mother and father are respected by their children. Living with the early devas are those families where, within the home, mother and father are respected by their children. Living with the early teachers are those families where, within the home, mother and father are respected by their children. Living with those worthy of adoration are those families where, within the home, mother and father are respected by their children. ‘Brahmā,’ bhikkhus, is a term for mother and father. ‘Early devas’ and ‘early teachers’ and ‘those worthy of veneration’ are terms for mother and father. For what reason? Because mother and father are very helpful to their children, they take care of them and bring them up and teach them

about the world.”

Mother and father are called
“Brahmā,” “early teachers”
And “worthy of veneration,”
Being compassionate towards
Their family of children.

Thus the wise should venerate them,
Pay them due honour,
Provide them with food and drink,
Give them clothing and a bed,
Anoint and bathe them
And also wash their feet.

When he performs such service
For his mother and his father,
They praise that wise person even here
And hereafter he rejoices in heaven.

This too is the meaning of what was said by the Lord, so I heard.

(Itivuttaka 109-110. John Ireland tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 23, 2015 7:05 AM

Title: Re: Lumbini, Kapilavastu, Kusinara sites now in doubt.

Content:

It will no doubt matter to historians specialising in that particular period, but there is no reason why it should matter to a person engaged in Buddhist practice. From the point of view of Dhamma it's a lot of fuss about nothing, to which the line from Christmas Humphreys quoted earlier by Kusala will suffice as a retort. Humphreys' line is in fact a modern restatement of a classical Buddhist response to questions about whether the Buddha ever existed and whether his life and character accurately match that of the protagonist of the Suttas. It's an approach to the question found in writers as diverse as Nāgasena and Dharmakīrti, and will serve as a fine riposte to all your jejune posts aimed at arousing doubt in Buddhists.

"We have an efficacious Dharma that leads to the end of suffering. If it didn't come from Gautama then it must have come from somebody else. From whomsoever it came, him we call 'the Buddha'."

— Dharmakīrti (sorry no source; I'm just paraphrasing from memory)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 23, 2015 7:21 AM

Title: Re: My guardian angel contacted me and my fiance

Content:

Though it doesn't actually contain the statement about one's parents being Brahmā, it's certainly a rhetorically ingenious way of praising saddhā, sīla, dāna and paññā.

I recall that it was from a Tibetan teacher that I first heard the Sutta's simile about carrying one's parents on one's shoulders for a hundred years. I've heard it from many Tibetan teachers since, but they always seem to miss the point. I would guess that the Tibetans must learn the simile from some text that quotes only the beginning of the Sutta, but omits the middle and the end, for when a lama quotes it, it's not in order to eulogise saddhā, sīla, etc., but merely to deliver some mawkish homily on filial piety.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 23, 2015 7:36 AM

Title: Re: Deadly blast rocks Thailand capital

Content:

Buddhist monks in Thailand are expected to do all sorts of peculiar things.

When King Bhumibol Adulyadej dies, Buddhist priests will place nine sheets of gold leaf inscribed with sacred text on the nine principal parts of his body, according to the fifteenth-century palace law that governs royalty. Members of his family and the Royal Wardrobes Department will dress his corpse in silk clothes – including gloves, socks and a hat – as well as ‘heavy gold bracelets, anklets, and rings, and a golden mask ... symbolic of the radiant visage of a god’. A gold ring will be placed in his mouth. After a pause, his body will be manoeuvred into a seated position:

The trunk is lifted, the palms joined opposite the face by means of an iron clamp, a sort of wedge is placed under the chin, and the knees are lifted to the level of the hands and tied in a sitting position. The corpse, thus seated, is placed on sixteen long strips of cotton material, the ends of which are raised and tied over the top of the head.
(Quaritch Wales, 1931)

Bhumibol's personal crown will be placed on his head, and ‘a heavy gold chain studded with diamonds’ around his neck. Then ‘the dead king ... arrayed in richer attire than he ever wore in his lifetime’ will be wedged inside an inner urn ‘of silver, with a lid that can be hermetically sealed’, which is in turn placed inside an octagonal outer urn ‘of great magnificence, being of gold ornamented with the nine gems and capped by a tapering pyramidal spire’. This will be taken to the Grand Palace and placed on a catafalque under a nine-tiered white umbrella. His body will remain inside the urn for months or years, as monks chant continuously day and night beside it and Bhumibol's favourite dishes, prepared by palace chefs, are placed in front of the catafalque at mealtimes.

— Andrew MacGregor Marshall, *A Kingdom in Crisis - Thailand's Struggle for Democracy*

in the Twenty-first Century, pp. 208-9

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 23, 2015 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Lumbini, Kapilavastu, Kusinara sites now in doubt.

Content:

Nothing if one's motive is good and one does it well. But in your case, though I don't care to guess at what your motive might be, I can say with confidence that you're not doing it very well. Neither as a scholar, nor as a Socratic gadfly. In your thread about the Buddha's last meal you revealed yourself as a careless reader of texts, and in the present thread you show a complete lack of understanding as to what is important to Buddhists and what is not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 24, 2015 3:38 PM

Title: Re: One meal a day and gallstones

Content:

This is the website of the one in Bangkok.

<http://www.priest-hospital.go.th/>

But as the site doesn't seem to host any papers on gallstones in either English or Thai, it will probably be best to send the owners an e-mail: <mailto:prh@priest-hospital.go.th>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 25, 2015 7:37 AM

Title: Re: Who ordains? Introverts/Extroverts?

Content:

It seems to depend on whether they are convert monks or Asian monks who were raised in Buddhist families. The former I have observed to be predominantly introverted and the latter about equally divided.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 25, 2015 3:38 PM

Title: Re: Thai translation help

Content:

I think Western music which has reached an international audience, or whose creator intends that it will do so, would be more naturally referred to as don-trii saakon than don-trii farang. Saakon is from the Sanskrit sākalya, meaning 'universal', but in Thai

usage it tends to imply 'western'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 25, 2015 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Devas Remembering Past Lives

Content:

If you're speaking of spontaneous recall of a former life in hell, then I don't know what it would be like for the person as I've never heard of it happening (at least not from any source that I would consider trustworthy).

On the other hand, if you mean recall of former lives by means of pubbenivāsānussati, then I don't think there would be any risk of mental damage. This attainment depends upon the fourth jhāna and so with his post-jhāna upekkhā a meditator is well steeled against any distress that an unpleasant memory might otherwise have provoked.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 25, 2015 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Thai translation help

Content:

It's very common, though one has to learn on a case by case basis when to use each term. Chewing gum, for example, is called หมากฝรั่ง ("white man's betel") and parsley is ผักชีฝรั่ง ("white man's cilantro"), but western-style boxing is called มวยสากล ("universal boxing") and the adjective or adverb แบบสากล ("universal-style") in practice means "western-style" or often simply "modern".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 26, 2015 5:35 AM

Title: Re: Thai translation help

Content:

Yes, it's common. It's not one of the words that's specific to literary Thai, nor is it a PC word, nor is it simply interchangeable with ฝรั่ง. There are some contexts where you would use one word, some where you'd use the other, some where either can be used and both will have the same meaning, and some where either can be used but their meanings will be different. Hence my earlier statement: one has to learn on a case by case basis when to use each term.

In the case of นักท่องเที่ยวสากล, this would mean global or international tourists and wouldn't necessarily imply westerners.

If a Thai wants to say 'westerners' but doesn't want to use ฝรั่ง (e.g. if she doesn't want to

limit the term to Caucasians from western countries) then she would say ชาว (or คน) ตะวันตก. In this context if one were to replace ตะวันตก with สากล it would no longer mean either 'Caucasian' or 'westerner', but rather a 'cosmopolitan person' [of any nationality].

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 2, 2015 12:37 PM

Title: Re: King Ajatasattu

Content:

In the Vinaya Piṭaka's Cūḷavagga (Vin. ii. 184-203, Book of the Discipline V. 259-285) you'll find the full account of Ajātasattu both conspiring with Devadatta and being himself directly involved in the first of the three assassination attempts.

In the Sutta Piṭaka you'll find only a few fragmentary details from the story and no mention of the conspiracy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 3, 2015 6:10 PM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

No, I don't think so. Their mistake is one that's quite common among Thais who either don't know that there's a well-established tradition of anglophone Pali scholarship, or who do know but are too lazy or conceited to consult it. When such people wish to find the English translation for a Pali Buddhist technical term, instead of looking it up in, say, a Pali-English dictionary, or in the Buddhist dictionaries of Phra Payutto or Nyanatiloka, or in English translations of Pali texts, they will look up the Thai translation of the Pali term in Thai-English dictionaries. The problem with this method is that a Thai-English dictionary, even if it be one of the better ones, will ordinarily confine itself to translating the more common senses of the Thai word. But the Buddhist sense of the word will as often as not be one of the less common ones, at least in everyday Thai usage. Consequently most Thai-English dictionaries will be unlikely to give the desired sense at all, while the senses that they do give will be either irrelevant or only tenuously related to the desired one.

Now in the case of thīna, the official Thai translations of this term consist of four kham-khao-khuu (คำเข้าคู่ — “alliterative paired words”), most likely imported from classical Khmer; these are: hot-hoo, seuang-seum, thor-thae and thod-thoi. And as you will see below, it's only in the case of the word seuang-seum that the Thai-English dictionaries supply anything that comes close to the Buddhist meaning:

1. Hot-hoo (หดหู่)

- McFarland: curl up (like fresh leaves when held against a fire or like a millipede when

touched).

- Haas: sad, depressed, dejected, downhearted, despondent, heartsick.
- Sethaputra: shrunken in spirit, downhearted, depressed.
- Thiengburanathum: low-spirited, dejected, sad, to droop, to curl up, to wither.

2. Seuang-seum (เซื่องซึม)

- McFarland: slow, drowsy, dilatory.
- Haas: slow, inactive, lifeless.
- Sethaputra: slow, sluggish, depressed.
- Thiengburanathum: inactive and drowsy.

3. Thor-thae (ท้อแท้)

- McFarland: weakened, exhausted, enfeebled, tottering.
- Haas: feel dejected, downcast, in low spirits.
- Sethaputra: lose heart, be discouraged, daunted.
- Thiengburanathum: disheartened, weakened, downcast, in low spirits.

4. Thod-thoi (ถดถอย)

- McFarland: retreat, move backwards.
- Haas: -
- Sethaputra: retreat, be disheartened, quail.
- Thiengburanathum: move back, withdraw.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 3, 2015 6:26 PM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to touch their mothers?

Content:

Touching one's mother without lust incurs only a dukkaṭa offence. Since dukkaṭas are classed as light offences (in fact the second lightest of all), not heavy ones, it's a minor NO.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 6, 2015 5:39 PM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

For the average Thai Buddhist, to have learned about thīnamiddha at all would be as improbable as it would be for the average British Anglican to have learned about the

deadly sin of accidie. That is to say, thīnamiddha is the sort of specialised term whose use would be largely confined to exceptional Thai Buddhists — scholar monks and those of the laity who frequent either Abhidhamma study groups or meditation centres.

In Abhidhamma study groups they will often use one or another of the four Thai translations of thīna, but the precision of abhidhammic description would militate against any confusion of it with, say, domanassa. Then in Thai meditation circles, thīnamiddha (along with the rest of the hindrances) is usually left untranslated and from listening to discussions and meditation interviews I sense that it has much the same semantic range for Thais that it does for English-speaking Buddhists.

There are, however, a number of other Pali terms that Thai-speaking and English-speaking Buddhists understand quite differently because of how they're commonly translated into these two languages. Saṃvega is a good example of this. Since the 1950's nearly all English translators have followed Ñāṇamoli in translating it as "sense of urgency", which seems to be a faithful rendering of the Buddhist understanding. But the common Thai translation, "ความสลัดใจ / khwaam salod jai" ("world-weariness"), seems more reflective of what saṃvega means in classical Indian dramatic theory.

The American monk Tan Dick Silaratano in his translation of the "great saṃvega" episode in Acharn Mun's biography translates it as "sense of sadness", which is probably a faithful reflection of what the average Thai forest monk expects saṃvega to be like.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 6, 2015 6:11 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016

Content:

I generally favour the candidate who has most in common with Thomas Jefferson and Calvin Coolidge. This time it seems to be Rand Paul.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 28, 2015 6:06 PM

Title: Re: Greater Magadha

Content:

Whereas you, presumably, think that it is a reaction to the Upaniṣadic idea? But if so, what exactly would you mean by that? Are you making the bold claim that there wouldn't be any anattā teaching had there been no Upaniṣadic attā teaching? Or the more modest claim that the manner in which the anattā teaching is formulated would be different from what it presently is?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Sep 29, 2015 1:54 PM
Title: Re: Greater Magadha
Content:

I don't think you've really answered my question. If I may put it another way...

Would you consider sakkāya-diṭṭhi, attavāda and asmi-māna to be universal afflictions among the unenlightened, and for which the development of insight into the anattā-ness of dhammas is the remedy? Or do you conceive them as afflictions that only troubled Indian adherents of Upaniṣadic philosophy, making anattā effectively irrelevant for anyone who is not an adherent of this philosophy (or some other philosophy resembling it)?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Sep 29, 2015 2:03 PM
Title: Re: POTUS 2016
Content:

Neither. Though I'm a little mystified as to why you and Tilt think that I might be trying to be funny.

If I were an American, then small-government Republicanism is what I should want to vote for. Among past US Presidents, who would be a better exemplar of this than Silent Cal? Among current Republican candidates, who better than Rand Paul?

<http://www.economist.com/news/books-and-arts/21572176-americas-30th-president-has-been-much-misunderstood-when-less-led-more>

<http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424127887323807004578282212160724672>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 30, 2015 10:03 PM
Title: Re: What is neutral feeling?
Content:

Nose-consciousness arises only with upekkhā-vedanā, but the term refers to consciousness of odours. Consciousness of the tactile sensations in one's nose would come under body-consciousness, which can only be accompanied by pleasant or painful feeling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 1, 2015 6:41 PM

Title: Re: What is neutral feeling?

Content:

No. At the moment of cognizing an odour *vedanā* is always *upekkhā*. The pleasurable (*somanassa*) and unpleasurable (*domanassa*) *vedanās* that arise in response to desirable and undesirable odours do not arise in the sense-door process when the odour itself is cognized. Rather, they arise in a subsequent mind-door process.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 1, 2015 7:36 PM

Title: Re: What is neutral feeling?

Content:

In short, because the Buddha's way is a way of analysis (*vibhajjavāda*).

In insight development it is important for overcoming the "perception of compactness" (*ghanasaññā*) that is one of the things fuelling the idea of a self. In the case of mental phenomena, misconceiving the cognizing of the unpleasant odour and the response to it as being a unitary experience would be one example of a perceived compactness that needs dismantling.

From the *Visuddhimagga*:

"... there are those people who, while teachable, have fallen into assuming a self among the five aggregates owing to failure to analyze them; and the Blessed One is desirous of releasing them from the assumption by getting them to see how the [seeming] compactness of mass [in the five aggregates] is resolved; and being desirous of their welfare, he first, for the purpose of their easy apprehension, taught the materiality aggregate, which is gross, being the objective field of the eye, etc.; and after that, feeling, which feels matter as desirable and undesirable; then perception, which apprehends the aspects of feeling's objective field, since "What one feels, that one perceives" (*M I* 293); then formations, which form volitionally through the means of perception; and lastly, consciousness, which these things beginning with feeling have as their support, and which dominates them."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 2, 2015 6:12 AM

Title: Re: What is neutral feeling?

Content:

That *upekkhā* is the *vedanā* in a sense-door cognition and then *somanassa*, *domanassa* or *upekkhā* in the subsequent mind-door process, applies to eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness, nose-consciousness and tongue-consciousness.

Body-consciousness, as Dave has remarked, is the exception. Here it is *sukha-vedanā*

or dukkha-vedanā in the sense-door process, followed by somanassa, domanassa or upekkhā in the subsequent mind-door process.

The reason for this difference is attributed to body-consciousness arising from a collision between primary rūpas, while with the other four sense-consciousnesses it's a collision between a primary-rūpa object but a derivative-rūpa sensorium.

From the Manual of Abhidhamma:

It should be noted that while the four pairs of sense consciousness other than body-consciousness are accompanied by equanimous feeling, body-consciousness arises in connection with either pleasure or pain. The Atthasālinī explains that in the case of the four doors—eye, ear, nose, and tongue—the sense object, which is derived matter, impinges on the sense faculty, which is also derived matter. When this happens, the impact is not strong, as when four balls of cotton placed on anvils are struck by four other balls of cotton. Thus the resulting feeling is neutral. But in the case of the body, the object consists of three of the primary elements—earth, fire, and air. Thus when the object impinges on body-sensitivity, its impact is strong and is conveyed to the primary elements of the body. This is comparable to four balls of cotton being struck by hammers: the hammer breaks through the cotton and hits the anvil. In the case of a desirable object the body-consciousness is a wholesome-resultant and the concomitant bodily feeling is physical pleasure, in the case of an undesirable object the body-consciousness is an unwholesome-resultant and the concomitant bodily feeling is physical pain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 3, 2015 8:01 AM

Title: Re: Lacking Samvega/motivation

Content:

Jasper Carrott on "How much time have I got left?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 5, 2015 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Beginning to notice family is also to be let go

Content:

What does the Bhaddekaratta Sutta have to do with it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 6, 2015 6:14 AM

Title: Re: American Buddhist Monk living in Thailand Needs Help!

Content:

You might also contact Hannah via her Facebook page:

<https://www.facebook.com/hannah.zorn.7>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 6, 2015 6:04 PM

Title: Re: American Buddhist Monk living in Thailand Needs Help!

Content:

Fine, thanks — enjoying a pleasant vassa on a northern Thai mountain. Hope all's well with you too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 6, 2015 6:27 PM

Title: Re: Mahasi quote

Content:

It's from the sayadaw's talks on the Sallekha Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 7, 2015 6:04 AM

Title: Re: Right speech

Content:

That's how the Theragāthā commentary explains it, as well as the commentaries to parallel passages in the Saṃyutta Nikāya and Suttanipāta.

"Na tāpaye ti" vipphaṇṇasārena na tāpeyya.

"Would not torment [oneself]" means "would not torment [oneself] with remorse".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 12, 2015 8:03 PM

Title: Re: Gun Violence and the Paradox of our Time

Content:

Posted last week on Steve Elliott's Facebook page:

I am a responsible gun owner.

I bought my first gun when I was 12. It was a Browning 12-gauge shotgun, and I saved money from my paper route and cleaning a drive-in restaurant to buy it in time for dove season. In the years before I could legally drive, I'd tie the Browning across the handlebars of my bike and ride to the fields outside town to hunt.

I've owned several guns since, and own a handgun now. I bought that gun to keep my family safe, and lock it up to keep them safe from it. Like I said, responsible.

And so while I'd like to believe I'm not part and party to the gun violence that stains America, I can't. My grandmother shot and killed herself with a gun, and a few years ago my father shot and didn't quite kill himself with one. My stepbrother died in a murder-suicide with a gun, and the husband of one of my sister's co-workers was killed in a mass shooting.

None of that happened with my gun, of course, but after every new mass shooting, I'm reminded that I bear a portion of the responsibility for our nation's gun violence. There are too many guns to do anything about it, the gun lobby says. Regulations are a slippery slope that only limit the rights of responsible gun owners, they say.

My gun is being used to argue against common-sense laws and policies that could reduce gun violence in America, arguments I find unconscionable. That's what being a responsible gun owner means today – I'm responsible. I've been uneasy about that for a while now, and ashamed to admit it's taken two more mass shootings for me to do anything about it.

That ended today. Today I disassembled my handgun, a 9mm Ruger, clamped the pieces in a vice and cut them in half with an angle grinder. I'm sending the proper paperwork into the state to report it destroyed.

None of us individually can stop gun violence in America, but as a responsible gun owner, I will no longer be used as a justification for doing nothing about it. Today I did what I could. Today there is #ONELESSGUN.

11231103_10208144202231626_1545321832655355832_o.jpg (49.95 KiB) Viewed 1570 times

<https://web.facebook.com/steve.elliott.792/posts/10208144209951819>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 12, 2015 9:11 PM

Title: Re: Good temples to stay at in Thailand as a lay guest

Content:

I think very few Thai monasteries require guests to shave their heads, unless they are embarking upon an ordination programme. The best choice will hinge on how long you intend to stay and how you wish to occupy your time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 1:45 AM

Title: Re: Teacher claims to receive teachings from Brahma god

Content:

Physician, heal thyself!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 9:56 AM

Title: Re: What is the name of that Process that believe it is SELF?

Content:

The mental factors responsible for 'I-making' and 'mine-making' are the threefold papañca of taṇhā, diṭṭhi and māna. These three arise with lobhamūla akusala-cittas. The bhavaṅga, being merely a passive vipāka-citta, is not accompanied by these three and therefore cannot be held responsible for generating the illusion of self.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 10:19 AM

Title: Re: What is the name of that Process that believe it is SELF?

Content:

My post had to do with the micro-scale of Abhidhammic momentarism, whereas you seem to be alluding to the macro-scale of the three-life exposition of dependent arising. It is in the context of the latter that saṅkhāras are treated as belonging to the past, and in the same context, bhava (not bhavaṅga), is treated as a future event.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Joke!!!

Content:

Pedants revolt.jpg (74.26 KiB) Viewed 3702 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 10:57 AM

Title: Re: The real meaning of Musavada

Content:

Ordinarily no, but one can conceive of scenarios in which he would be in breach of it. For example, the landlord asks him if he's damaged anything and he replies "no". Or suppose it's in the tenant's contract that he is obliged to disclose to the landlord any

damage that occurs during his occupancy. If he remains silent out of a wish to deceive the landlord and avoid hassle and the landlord assumes from this silence that no damage has occurred, then the deceit is successful and the precept has been broken. That no words have been spoken doesn't make any difference. In effect the tenant finds himself in the same position as a bhikkhu when the Pāṭimokkha is being recited, who, when the reciter asks the bhikkhus: "Are you pure [with regard to the section of rules that I've just recited]?" remains silent even though he knows that he has broken one of them. The bhikkhu's silence in this context is adjudged to be an offence of false speech in full awareness.

However, if there is no contract imposing such an obligation, and if the landlord doesn't ask, then remaining silent is not blameworthy with respect to truth-telling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 10:13 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

It's up to them. Generally the older a man is when he ordains the less likely it is that he'll pursue a scholarly vocation. There are, however, exceptions, like a certain Thai man a few years ago who ordained in old age and completed the ninth grade of Parien in his late eighties.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2015 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Mara

Content:

If that's the whole story, how would you square it with all the suttas that report Māra's visits to the Buddha and his arahant disciples? Has an arahant not abandoned the five hindrances?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 14, 2015 12:54 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

They are not perceived negatively at all. In fact in the case of Bali Yai, any Thai scholar monk you talk to (even those trained in the native Parien system) will readily admit its superiority over Nak Tham & Parien. One reason that so few Thai monks choose to enroll in it is because it's perceived as too difficult. Bali Yai is a demanding course with a huge volume of material to be memorised each day. Moreover, the Burmese-trained monks who teach it tend to be very hard taskmasters who are quick to expel any monk who can't keep up. Most Thai monks are just too lazy to put in the necessary effort, or

else they don't have the requisite study skills and attention span.

Then a second reason is that because of the foreignness and lack of official standing of the Bali Yai curriculum, a monk who opts for it over the Parien course will miss out on a number of worldly advantages. For example, he won't get the title "Phra Mahā", he won't get any cash prizes for doing well in exams, he won't get a royally-sponsored cremation when he dies, his scholarly success will not be likely to translate into any promotions in the sangha hierarchy. He won't even be qualified to teach in a state-run Pali school, even though his grasp of Pali will be overwhelmingly superior to that of the monks who are thus qualified.

In one way, however, all of this is quite a good thing. The absence of worldly advantages means that if you go along to an institution where Bali Yai or Abhidhammajotika is being taught, you'll get to meet an inspiring bunch of monks who are really earnest in their study of the Dhamma. These are therefore great places for a newly-ordained western monk to go along to and meet good kalyānamittas. By contrast, if you go to institutions where Nak Tham and Parien are being taught, you'll encounter a rather mixed bag of monks — a few good ones, no doubt, but with a deplorable admixture of mediocrities and rascals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 14, 2015 6:38 PM

Title: Re: heinous crimes

Content:

The texts state that anyone who commits one of the five anantariyaka karmas is debarred from the possibility of penetrating to Dhamma during that lifetime, no matter how he subsequently feels and no matter what he subsequently does. And so though Ajātasattu was in fact remorseful, it wouldn't have made any difference even if he hadn't been.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 16, 2015 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Do we have an astral body?

Content:

This is just clumsy reading on Walshe's part. The Suttas don't say that we actually have such a body. What they say is:

1. Certain annihilationists believe that we have one and that it gets destroyed.
(Brahmajāla Sutta)
2. Certain yogis who've mastered the fourth jhāna are capable of manufacturing one.
(Ayogaḷa Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 16, 2015 2:17 PM

Title: Re: Do we have an astral body?

Content:

It means that they fly bodily through the air like birds, though relying upon the iddhipādas rather than wings.

As for astral travel, I'm not sure what people mean by it, but perhaps it corresponds to those Sutta passages that describe how a certain person disappears from Jeta's Grove and then instantaneously reappears somewhere else.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 16, 2015 4:06 PM

Title: Re: Which diet are you?

Content:

I should think that would be 'eleemosynatarian', from the Latin eleemosyna (alms), from the Greek ελεημοσύνης.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 17, 2015 9:58 AM

Title: Where is Ajahn Hāsapañño?

Content:

Somebody has sent this Canadian monk a gigantic parcel, addressed to Wat Doi Mae Pang — the monastery of the late Luang Poo Waen, situated at the foot of the mountain where I'm spending the rains retreat. Though I've never actually met Hāsapañño, I understand that he does sometimes reside there. But the postman, failing to find him there, handed the package to a Thai monk. The monk, presumably acting on the principle that farang monks are all more or less fungible, passed it on to the headman of my village, who brought it up the mountain on his motorcycle and delivered it to Ayya Phalañāṇī, who then delivered it to me.

Can anyone help me bring this game of pass the parcel to a conclusion by telling me where Ven. Hāsapañño currently resides?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 17, 2015 7:37 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

That would in fact be true of most Western monks here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 17, 2015 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Where is Ajahn Hāsapañño?

Content:

We are now in communication by e-mail. Thanks!

DEAD LETTERS

The report was this: that Bartleby had been a subordinate clerk in the Dead Letter Office at Washington, from which he had been suddenly removed by a change in the administration. When I think over this rumor, hardly can I express the emotions which seize me. Dead letters! Does it not sound like dead men? Conceive a man by nature and misfortune prone to a pallid hopelessness, can any business seem more fitted to heighten it than that of continually handling these dead letters, and assorting them for the flames? For by the cart-load they are annually burned. Sometimes from out the folded paper the pale clerk takes a ring—the finger it was meant for, perhaps, moulders in the grave; a banknote sent in swiftest charity—he whom it would relieve, nor eats nor hungers any more; pardon for those who died despairing; hope for those who died unhoping; good tidings for those who died stifled by unrelieved calamities. On errands of life, these letters speed to death.

Ah, Bartleby! Ah, humanity!

(Herman Melville, <http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/11231.html.images>)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 19, 2015 3:07 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

The books of Rajasap word-lists that are used in Thai schools are available at almost any local bookshop. I'm not aware of anything that's been published in English, but then I don't really keep up to date with this field. In my own case, apart from studying one of the word-list books (mostly to learn the Rajasap terms that a Bangkok monk in a royal wat needs to use in his daily interactions) I learned Rajasap mostly by reading a few volumes from the Thai Tipiṭaka before I started learning Pali.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 19, 2015 5:19 PM

Title: Re: The dhammas of papanca

Content:

As I understand it, what is called 'proliferation' simply IS these three mental factors. Their arising wouldn't necessarily be one at a time; it would be either taṇhā + diṭṭhi in the case of greed-rooted consciousness associated with wrong view, or taṇhā + māna in the case of greed-rooted consciousness dissociated from wrong view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 19, 2015 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Can anger be prevented from arising?

Content:

Yes, that can happen and one will sometimes hear Theravada teachers who are either clumsy with language, or ignorant of conditional relations, or influenced by Mahayanists, refer to this as a "vipāka". But they are quite wrong to do so — it's a different causal condition that is responsible here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 20, 2015 8:07 AM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

My point was that it isn't actually that difficult.

I mean Middle English is not a completely foreign language to a speaker of modern English, in the way that Old English is:

Aðweah mē of sennum, sāule fram wammum,
gāsta Sceppend, geltas geclānsa,
þā ðe ic on aldre æfre gefremede
ðurh lichaman lēðre geðōhtas.

Though you may not have understand much from the Grene Knyzt passage that I posted, there will probably be some words from it that you immediately recognize, some that you can guess at, and some that you're quite clueless about. But as the grammar of the language is substantially similar to that of modern English, the learning process will consist in little more than looking up the meanings of the third class of words. Similarly, for a Thai to learn Rajasap will consist in little more than memorizing word lists.

I have to go out now, so I'll address the rest of your post later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 20, 2015 7:03 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

Not really, apart from the point that you noted in your follow-up post.

I think the only Thai monks who have any idea of how Pali ought to be pronounced are those who've been to study in India or Sri Lanka. The 19th century educator Prince Vajirañāṇavarorasa made an effort to improve things in this regard, but it never came to anything. One of the books that a Thai monk will study when he takes the Parien course is Akkharavidhī, a work on Pali phonetics by the prince. In the book's preface Prince V. describes how to pronounce those Pali consonants that are not found in the Thai phonemic system, but as this part of the book isn't tested in the exams most teachers just skip it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 20, 2015 7:37 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

In some chanting books you'll also meet with a special character called yamakkan which looks like this:

◌̐

It's inserted between two consonants that in Pali are supposed to be pronounced as one, but where Thais would naturally tend to insert a hiatus. For example 'hitvā' should be pronounced hi-tvā, but the Thais would naturally syllabify it hit-ta-vā. The yamakkan is inserted between the t and the v to remind them not to:

หิตฺว

In practice, however, I've never known any Thai chanters to pay the yamakkan the darndest bit of notice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 20, 2015 8:54 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

Romanized Pali is widely used in Thailand by non-Thai autodidacts and then to a lesser extent in the monastic universities (e.g. if a Thai research scholar is writing an article for a foreign publication). The PTS Dictionary can be found in most university libraries, along with those of the Siam Society and the World Fellowship of Buddhists — not that it's really needed now that we have a digital edition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Ghitassara Sutta

Content:

Most of the Tipiṭaka isn't included in the ATI site. What is there is simply whatever is available in English, is not copyright-protected, and happens to appeal to the site-owner. For a more comprehensive collection it would now be better to go to <https://suttacentral.net/>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 7:28 AM

Title: Re: Ghitassara Sutta

Content:

If you mean of the Anguttara Nikāya (the collection containing the Ghitassara Sutta), then yes, Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation, Numerical Discourses, is available in paperback.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 5:32 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

I can't imagine it being very well received. In Thailand a Rajasap-speaking Buddha is simply what everybody's accustomed to. It's not like in English-speaking Christendom where people are used to hearing the Bible quoted in multiple translations in a variety of linguistic registers. The Thais expect to hear/read the Buddha depicted as speaking Rajasap in much the way that certain marginal Christian groups (e.g., Ulster Calvinists and American fundamentalist Baptists) expect Jesus to be speaking the Jacobean English of the King James Bible. If they watch some Hollywood Biblical epic where the actors are all speaking from a trashy modern Bible translation — the Good News Bible or the New Identity Politics Bible (with Inclusive Language for Loony Feminists) — it just makes them cringe.

Buddhadāsa, as I mentioned above, did set a precedent for an alternative approach, but it doesn't seem to have been taken up by any of his eminent disciples.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 8:44 PM

Title: Re: The dhammas of papanca

Content:

I'm afraid I'm in the dark as to what you mean by the "dhamma of contemplation", so I can't say how it would be distinguished from the dhammas of proliferation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Can anger be prevented from arising?

Content:

The beautifully-written Āghātaṭṭhavinaya (“Removal of Resentment”) section of the Visuddhimagga’s chapter on the brahmavihāras (= ch. IX, paragraphs 14-39 in Ñāṇamoli’s translation) contains a rich panoply of methods for the removal of habitual anger towards a particular person. These methods are very effective. Anyone who experiments with them until he finds the one that works best for him, and then applies himself assiduously to it, can expect to become cooler, happier and less anger-prone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 21, 2015 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Would it be too late to ordain at 60 years old?

Content:

The Vinaya doesn't set any upper age limit for when a man may ordain. Certain monasteries do set such a limit, but these are the exception, not the norm.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 5:11 AM

Title: Re: Can anger be prevented from arising?

Content:

Yes, in the Abhidhamma it's called aṭṭhānakopa and is the tenth of the ten kinds of anger. Getting angry:

1. Through thinking: “He acted for my harm.
2. Through thinking: “He is acting for my harm.”
3. Through thinking: “He will act for my harm.”
4. Through thinking: “He acted for the harm of one pleasing and agreeable to me.”
5. Through thinking: “He is acting for the harm of one pleasing and agreeable to me.”
6. Through thinking: “He will act for the harm of one pleasing and agreeable to me.”
7. Through thinking: “He acted for the benefit of one displeasing and disagreeable to me.”
8. Through thinking: “He is acting for the benefit of one displeasing and disagreeable to me.”
9. Through thinking: “He will act for the benefit of one displeasing and disagreeable to me.”
10. For no obvious reason.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 7:34 AM

Title: Re: Can anger be prevented from arising?

Content:

The object of the mental factor of aversion (dosa cetasika) in general may be either a living being or a saṅkhāra. But dosa arises in a variety of modes and not all modes are capable of taking both kind of object as their ārammaṇa. For example, malice (byāpāda) and cruelty (vihimsā) are directed only towards living beings. But anger (kodha) may take either as its ārammaṇa, even if you yourself only ever get angry with living beings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Understanding cetasikas as fleeting dhammas

Content:

The Paṭisambhidāmagga is a pretty large text. Which part of it do you see as relevant to Phil's query?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 10:40 AM

Title: Re: Understanding cetasikas as fleeting dhammas

Content:

In the case of, say, the conceit "I am better than him", why do you find this readily conceivable as something that can last for a minute or so, but difficult to conceive of as lasting for only a few mind-moments? Why must it be ongoing for a longish period in order to be a plausible (or even an intelligible) conception?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 12:20 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

I think the typical response would be something like: "What does the translator think he's doing? Doesn't he have any เคารพ [respectful consideration, "reticence", "prudence", etc.]? Can't he tell high from low?"

I can't imagine it winning much approval. In the Tipiṭaka it's the Buddha who's doing most of the talking and in Thai literary conventions a prince is supposed to talk like a prince. If you used ordinary literary Thai then you'd be representing the Buddha as if he were not a scion of royalty, which would be likely to offend the Thai sense of hierarchical propriety.

Ajahn Buddhādāsa, as I mentioned before, could get away with having the Buddha talk like a Bangkok wide boy, but that was a rather special case. The ajahn had carved a niche for himself as a sort of avant-garde religious showman and people expected him to go about saying and doing outrageous things. Likewise foreign monks in Thailand can

get away with having the Buddha speak ordinary Thai when we're giving talks, because nobody expects us to know any better. But what is treated as excusable when we do it probably wouldn't be if it were done by anyone else.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2015 6:22 PM

Title: Re: Understanding cetasikas as fleeting dhammas

Content:

Yes, I think that you're right in the sense that there would need to be a complex narrative build-up in the cognitive processes that preceded the arising of the conceit.

In the case of the "I am better than him" conceit (*seyyoham'asmī'ti māna*), the *Vibhaṅga* classifies this as threefold according to whether it's being entertained by someone who really is better than the other person with respect to the quality under consideration (i.e., a conceit with some basis in reality), or by someone who is actually equal to, or actually inferior to, the other person with respect to the said quality (i.e., two conceits grounded in delusion).

Where this conceit is of the reality-based kind, the *Vibhaṅga* describes it thus:

Therein, of one who is better, what is the conceit thus, "I am better"? Herein a certain one who is better by birth, or by clan, or by good family, or by beautiful body, or by property, or by study, or by sphere of work, or by sphere of craft, or by branch of science, or by learning, or by intelligence, or by one reason or another, places himself as better than others. He, depending thereon, causes conceit to arise ... This, of one who is better, is called the conceit thus, "I am better".

(*Vibh.* 353-4; *The Book of Analysis*, para. 869. tr. U Thittila)

So, it seems to me that for such a conceit to occur, there would previously have needed to be cognitive processes in which the quality in question (birth, family, body, property, etc.) of oneself, and that of the other, was marked by *saññā*; and then processes involving a comparison of the two *saññās*, i.e., in which the two past *saññās* are placed in juxtaposition as the *ārammaṇa* of a single consciousness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2015 5:38 AM

Title: Re: Understanding cetasikas as fleeting dhammas

Content:

Each of the three conceits is threefold, according to whether one is in fact what one's conceit supposes one to be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2015 5:40 AM

Title: Re: Why one meal a day?

Content:

The jury is out!.jpg (89.56 KiB) Viewed 25505 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2015 1:51 PM

Title: Re: What is the meaning of Asava ?

Content:

See the discussion of the three (var. four) āsavas in Har Dayal's The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhist Sanskrit Literature pp. 116-134. Though published 83 years ago, I believe it's still the best and most thorough treatment of the term in English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2015 3:42 PM

Title: Re: What is the meaning of Asava ?

Content:

In the attached files.

./download/file.php?id=2784

(387.44 KiB) Downloaded 189 times

./download/file.php?id=2782

(334.42 KiB) Downloaded 126 times

./download/file.php?id=2783

(346.4 KiB) Downloaded 121 times

./download/file.php?id=2780

(156.6 KiB) Downloaded 119 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2015 7:11 PM

Title: Re: What is the meaning of Asava ?

Content:

I would rather not. As Dayal's work is already a précis of a great many points derived from a great many sources, I think any further abridgement will fail to do it justice. It deserves to be studied just as it is.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 6:26 AM

Title: Re: What is the meaning of Asava ?

Content:

This should cut the mustard.

<http://workupload.com/file/jDSj0zYX>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 6:38 AM

Title: Re: Little help needed

Content:

Ten Bases of Meritorious Action (puññakiriyavatthu)

(an expanded version of the more familiar threefold puññakiriyavatthu, comprising dāna, sīla, and bhāvanā)

1. Dāna, generosity.
2. Sīla, moral habit.
3. Bhāvanā, mental cultivation.
4. Apacāyana, reverence.
5. Veyyāvacca, service.
6. Pattidāna, sharing merit.
7. Pattānumodanā, rejoicing in the meritorious deeds of others.
8. Dhammassavana, hearing the Dhamma.
9. Dhammadesanā, teaching the Dhamma.

10. Diṭṭhujukamma, straightening one's view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 7:07 AM

Title: Re: Schism

Content:

When two groups of monks are in dispute as to whether something is Dhamma or not-Dhamma, Vinaya or not-Vinaya, the Vinaya terms it a "conflict in the Order" (saṅgharuci). It becomes a "schism in the Order" (saṅghabheda) only when they're so much at odds with each other that they won't perform saṅghakammas together.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 9:08 AM

Title: Re: Schism

Content:

Correction: It should read...

"...only when they're so much at odds with each other that they won't carry out the Uposatha observance together."

In practice of course, monks who won't carry out the Uposatha together probably won't carry out any other saṅghakammas either. Nevertheless, it is the willingness to listen to a Pātimokkha recital together that formally defines whether monks are in communion or not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Schism

Content:

I'm afraid I'm not at all well-informed about inter-Nikāya relations in Sri Lanka. I suspect, however, that when they're living in Sri Lanka they probably don't (especially not in the case of ordinations and the Pātimokkha recital) but when living elsewhere in the world (and especially in Western countries) they may choose to drop Nikāya sectarianism for reasons of diplomacy. For example, in Britain it's not uncommon for a Kaṭhina ceremony to be jointly carried out by monks from half a dozen different Nikāyas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 10:40 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

I'm afraid there's no solution at present. If one is going to keep cats then one just has to bite the bullet and accept the necessity of compromising either on ahiṃsā or on one's pets' health. Even the product you've been using up to now isn't fully ahiṃsā-compatible: Lufenuron may not kill the adult fleas but it does kill their larvae.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 10:47 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

Here's a useful chart showing all the flea-related products and what they do.

http://www.marvistavet.com/html/body_flea_product_comparison.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 11:31 AM

Title: Re: What is saṅghakammas ?

Content:

They are Vinaya-prescribed communal acts such as: ordination, confession, penance, probation, rehabilitation, uposatha, kaṭhina, pavāraṇā, establishing a sīmā, appointing robes-distributors, medicine-distributors and other saṅgha officers, resolving cases of dispute and accusation, declaring a monk insane or recovered from insanity, censure, demotion, banishment, reconciliation, suspension for not seeing an offence, suspension for not making amends for an offence, suspension for not giving up a wrong view, rescinding of a disciplinary act, overturning the almsbowl, etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 3:55 PM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

Luckily I'm not faced with this dilemma. I live at the summit of a cold mountain where there aren't any fleas to speak of and the only bugs that afflict our cats and dogs are blood-sucking ticks and leeches. These are large enough that they can be manually removed without harming them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2015 5:14 PM

Title: Re: What is saṅghakammas ?

Content:

I haven't heard of a case in modern times where the monk had to be suspended because he persisted in his wrong view throughout the admonition and three remonstrations. The closest that I know of was in the 1970s when the Thai sangha threatened an action against Phra Kittivuddho for espousing the view that there is no bad kamma in killing a Communist. But then he recanted his view—or at least tempered it a little— so the transaction didn't go ahead.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2015 7:07 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

Yes, but it is mitigated by one's wish for the cat's welfare.

WHY FLEAS ARE BAD

There are over 1900 flea species in the world. We are concerned with only one: Ctenocephalides felis, the cat flea. This is the flea that we find on our pets (cats, dogs, rabbits, and other species) in 99.9% of cases and in order to understand how to control the damage caused by this tiny little animal, you should learn all you can about it.

WHAT KIND OF DAMAGE CAN FLEAS CAUSE?

It would be a grave mistake to think of the flea as simply a nuisance. A heavy flea burden is lethal, especially to smaller or younger animals. The cat flea is not at all selective about its host and has been known to kill dairy calves through heavy infestation. Conditions brought about via flea infestation include:

- Flea Allergic Dermatitis
(remember, fleas do not make animals itchy unless there a flea bite allergy)
- http://www.marvistavet.com/html/flea_anemia.html
- http://www.marvistavet.com/html/feline_infectious_anemia.html
(a life-threatening blood parasite carried by fleas)
- <http://www.marvistavet.com/html/bartonella.html>
(does not make the cat sick but the infected cat can make a person sick)
- <http://www.marvistavet.com/html/tapeworm.html>
(not harmful but cosmetically unappealing)

REMEMBER THAT MOST PET OWNERS HAVE NO IDEA THAT FLEAS CAN KILL

This is so important that we will say it again: Most pet owners have no idea that fleas can kill. On some level, it is obvious that fleas are blood-sucking insects but most people never put it together in their mind that enough fleas can cause a slow but still life-threatening blood loss. This is especially a problem for elderly cats allowed to go outside. These animals do not groom well and are often debilitated by other diseases. The last thing a geriatric pet needs to worry about is a lethal flea infestation and it is especially important that these animals be well protected.

Also consider that in about 90% of cases where the owner tells us the pet does not have fleas, we find obvious fleas when the animal is flea combed. Despite the TV commercials, the educational pamphlets, the very common nature of the parasite, there are still some very large awareness problems in the public and a multitude of misconceptions.

FLEA MYTHS WE HEAR NEARLY EVERY DAY:

Myth: My pet cannot have fleas because he lives entirely indoors.

Fact: Fleas thrive especially well in the well-regulated temperatures of the home.

Myth: My pet cannot have fleas because if there were any fleas they would be biting (insert name of someone in the family reportedly sensitive to flea bites). Since this person is not being bitten, there must not be any fleas.

Fact: Despite *Ctenocephalides felis*' ability to feed of a wide variety of hosts, this flea definitely prefers not to feed on human blood unless absolutely necessary. A newly emerged adult flea is very hungry and may well take a blood meal from the first warm body it finds. An adult flea knocked off its normal host will also be very desperate to find a new host and may feed on the nearest warm body it can find. In general, adult fleas regard human blood as a last choice and humans tend not to be bitten unless flea population numbers are high.

Myth: We do not have fleas because we have only hard wood floors.

Fact: Fleas love to develop in the cracks between the boards of hard wood floors.)

Myth: My pet cannot have fleas because I would see them.

Fact: One cannot expect to see fleas as many animals are especially adept at licking them away. Sometimes all we see is the characteristic skin disease.

http://www.marvistavet.com/html/1_why_fleas_are_bad.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2015 7:22 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

Evolution.

There is a brain parasite that causes 30-90% of humans (the figure varies from one country to another, with the French being most susceptible to it) to be attracted to cats and to not find the smell of their urine unpleasant. There is no parasite that causes any comparable effect with regard to fleas.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Toxoplasma_gondii
<http://elitedaily.com/women/cats-literally-suck/709388/>

In short, our fondness for cats is simply delusional and were we to see them as they really are, then we would surely say with the Aussie poet Peter Porter: "Death to the Cats!"

MORT AUX CHATS

There will be no more cats.
Cats spread infection,
cats pollute the air,
cats consume seven times
their own weight in food a week,
cats were worshipped in
decadent societies (Egypt
and Ancient Rome), the Greeks
had no use for cats. Cats
sit down to pee (our scientists
have proved it). The copulation
of cats is harrowing; they
are unbearably fond of the moon.
Perhaps they are all right in
their own country but their
traditions are alien to ours.
Cats smell, they can't help it,
you notice it going upstairs.
Cats watch too much television,
they can sleep through storms,
they stabbed us in the back
last time. There have never been
any great artists who were cats.
They don't deserve a capital C
except at the beginning of a sentence.
I blame my headache and my
plants dying on to cats.
Our district is full of them,
property values are falling.
When I dream of God I see
a Massacre of Cats. Why

should they insist on their own
language and religion, who
needs to purr to make a point?
Death to all cats! The Rule
of Dogs shall last a thousand years!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2015 7:27 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

Yes, I know. Intentional killing, it's said, is always caused by dosa. But that dosa may be mitigated or aggravated by the pre-volition (pubba-cetanā) that gives rise to it; or in modern parlance, the motive. If the pre-volition is to alleviate a cat's suffering then the akusala kamma of killing the fleas is less weighty than it would otherwise be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 27, 2015 4:21 AM

Title: Re: moral dilemma flea control & no more program??

Content:

I didn't say that it was, only that humans are conditioned to treat it as such.

If in its future evolution the flea should succeed in establishing a symbiotic relationship with some brain parasite that can both neutralize the effects of *Toxoplasma gondii* and establish in humans a preference for itchiness over cuddliness, then our attitude towards the two animals could well undergo a reversal. Who knows, we might even end up keeping dogs and cats merely as food for our pet fleas, ticks and cestodes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 27, 2015 4:11 PM

Title: Re: About Sotapanna

Content:

Although a sotāpanna can be reborn as a human, in Pali sources from the Canon to the Sub-commentaries, there are no accounts of this actually happening. Every single person who dies as a sotāpanna gets reborn as a deva. And so given the absence of any authoritative description of mental and behavioural development in infant congenital sotāpannas, nothing said in answer to your questions could amount to more than conjecture. Better become a sotāpanna yourself, then you'll have it all sussed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 27, 2015 5:22 PM

Title: Re: What Is A Monk's Curriculum ?

Content:

It depends what you mean by “devoted practitioners”.

I’d say that they tend to be devoted practitioners of some things but not of others.

For example, if I were to describe the typical strengths and weaknesses of Thai Buddhists in relation to the ten bases of merit (puññakiriyavatthu) my assessment would be something like this:

Formidably strong in dāna, apacāyana, pattidāna, and pattānumodanā.

Strong in veyyāvacca and dhammassavana.

Average in bhāvanā.

Weak in dhammadesanā and diṭṭhujukamma (largely on account of the poor standard of monastic education).

Extremely weak in sīla.

On the other hand, if you are using ‘practitioner’ as it’s often used in Western Buddhist circles, to denote a person who regularly practises formal meditation, then the answer would be the same for Thailand as for all the Theravada countries of Asia: a great many people do, but they amount to only a minority of the Buddhist population as a whole.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 28, 2015 7:05 AM

Title: Re: Thai Language

Content:

พุทธวจนะในธรรมบท (Sathienpong Wannapok’s translation of the Dhammapada into non-Rajasap literary Thai). It also has a good English translation by him.

<http://www.dhammajak.net/board/viewtopic.php?t=8869>

คู่มืออุบาสก อุบาสิกา (The chanting book of Wat Suan Mokkh with Ajahn Buddhādāsa’s interlinear Thai translation. As well as the standard Thai morning and evening chanting it also contains a selection of passages from those Suttas that Ajahn Buddhādāsa was particularly fond of).

<https://tinyurl.com/ox49vx5>

Audio of the evening chanting (Pali and Thai translation) of the above book by the monks of Wat Suan Mokkh

<http://www.buddhadasa.com/dhammasound3/watevening.html>

Same for the morning chanting, together with the chanting book's Sutta passages.
<http://www.buddhadasa.com/dhammasound4/watmorning.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 28, 2015 7:25 AM

Title: Re: Evidence of reincarnation

Content:

Not necessarily, bhante, for the translation "Is not born again into this world" might well be alluding to the use of loka in the Suttas' stock description of once-returning and non-returning.

The description for once-returning contains the phrase: "After coming back to this world only one more time, he will make an end to suffering," while the one for non-returning has: "... due to attain Nibbāna there without returning from that world."

In these two passages, the phrases "to this world" (imaṃ lokam) and "from that world" (tasmā lokā) refer respectively to the Kāmaloka and to the Suddhavāsa heavens.

And so though the Amaravati rendering is a rather free one, the part you quoted doesn't seem to me quite as bad as most translations from Pali into Amaravati-speak.

I did, however, spot a few errors in the earlier verses, notably the rendering of suvaco as "gentle in speech" instead of "easily spoken to", "tractable", and of subharo as "unburdened" instead of "an easy burden [for others]", the over-vague rendering of santindriyo as "peaceful", and the all-too-common misrepresentation of "the mother and her only child" simile.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 28, 2015 12:52 PM

Title: Happy Birthday to Anagarika!

Content:

Āyu vaṇṇo sukhaṃ balaṃ!

flea-worm-tick.jpg (145.63 KiB) Viewed 981 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 29, 2015 2:38 PM

Title: Re: unwholesome formations

Content:

Nyanatiloka is stating the Abhidhammic doctrine that restlessness is a mental factor common to all unwholesome consciousnesses, but sloth-&-torpor are mental factors that arise only with some unwholesome consciousnesses.

This does not mean that one mental factor leads to the other. What it means is that whenever there is sloth and torpor there will ALWAYS be restlessness, but when there is restlessness, there will only SOMETIMES be sloth and torpor.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 29, 2015 6:23 PM

Title: Re: A poetry thread.

Content:

THERMOPYLÆ

by Constantine P. Cavafy

Honour to those who in their life
Set out and guard Thermopylæ.
Never wavering from duty;
Just and forthright in all their actions,
Though yet with mercy and compassion;
Generous when rich, and when
Poor, still in small measure generous,
Helping again, as they can;
Always speaking forth the truth,
Yet without malice for the deceitful.

A higher honour indeed is due
When they foresee (as many do)
That Ephialtes* will in the end appear,
And the Medes will eventually break through.

(translated from the Greek by Evangelos Sachperoglou)

* Ephialtes: the treacherous goatherd who betrayed the Spartans by leading the Persians through an old trail which allowed the latter to encircle and outflank the defenders, leading to their ultimate defeat at the hands of the Persians' allies, the Medes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 30, 2015 9:14 PM

Title: Re: unwholesome formations

Content:

They are not opposite qualities. Sloth-&-torpor are opposed by the jhāna factor of vitakka, and restlessness by the jhāna factor of sukha.

If you think that they are opposite qualities, I suspect it's because you are taking these words in their familiar English sense (which is at best conveys only a crude approximation of their meaning) rather than in their abhidhammic sense. Here is the fourfold description of them in terms of characteristic, function, manifestation and proximate cause:

Uddhacca: Restlessness (or agitation) has the characteristic of disquietude, like water whipped up by the wind. Its function is to make the mind unsteady, as wind makes a banner ripple. It is manifested as turmoil. Its proximate cause is unwise attention to mental disquiet.

Thīna: Sloth is sluggishness or dullness of mind. Its characteristic is lack of driving power. Its function is to dispel energy. It is manifested as the sinking of the mind. Its proximate cause is unwise attention to boredom, drowsiness, etc.

Middha: Torpor is the morbid state of the mental factors. Its characteristic is unwieldiness. Its function is to smother. It is manifested as drooping, or as nodding and sleepiness. Its proximate cause is the same as that of sloth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2015 7:14 AM

Title: Re: Confused how to apply basic principles

Content:

is not really a virtue in the Buddha's teaching. Though he does say in the Dhammapada:

He who sees others' faults

And is ever censorious-

Defilements of such a one grow

Far is he from destroying them.

this doesn't completely preclude making moral judgments; it just means that it's our own faults that should be our primary concern. The Buddha also tells his followers to avoid fools and consort with the wise; obviously to do this one needs to make judgments about who's a fool and who's wise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 2, 2015 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Can a buddha get confused?

Content:

This was also one of the problems that troubled King Milinda.

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/sbe36/sbe3603.htm>

(Scroll down to the fiftieth dilemma: On the Buddha's After-Doubt)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Evidence of reincarnation

Content:

Sir A. J. Ayer, the logical positivist guy, had a pretty good one. He argued that it would be sufficient for the truth of the belief that the man standing beside you is Julius Caesar reincarnated if that man had all the memories that one would ordinarily expect of Julius Caesar, and if he had some verified memories that appealed to facts that were not in any way items of public information. (See *The Problem of Knowledge*, ch. 5. Penguin Books 1962)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Evidence of reincarnation

Content:

The cited sutta has to do with the chances of a human rebirth among beings who've fallen into the lower realms, and so is not particularly relevant to Lazy Eye's point. The relevant sutta (or rather a whole vagga of suttas), is in the *Aṅguttara Nikāya's* Ekanipāta (A. i. 35-8). In these it is stated that exceedingly few devas and humans get reborn as devas or humans: the overwhelming majority get reborn in the lower realms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 8:28 AM

Title: Re: It's Paul Davy's Birthday!

Content:

Happy birthday, Paul.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 8:54 AM

Title: Re: Story of the man and the bear

Content:

Though Ajahn Amaro has changed the sex of the bear-owner and a number of other details, the essential narrative is from a fictional story by the Swedish psychiatrist Axel

Munthe.

You'll find a translation on page 52 of this online anthology:

<https://tinyurl.com/nnmxqk7>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Story of the man and the bear

Content:

Perhaps the ajahn believes the tale is true. It might be that he was told it by some plausible and persuasive bloke he met on a train who swore on his children's eyes that it really happened.

Then again, it might even be the case that the ajahn is right. I mean one can't exclude the possibility of such a thing happening both in life and in fiction (though it would be remarkably unbearable behaviour).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Story of the man and the bear

Content:

Here's another good story about a man and his bear, this time from 11th century Iceland. It's a beautiful illustration of the themes of integrity, generosity, and the two
<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/an/an02/an02.119.than.html>.

<http://www.northvegr.org/misc%20primary%20sources/misc%20lore%20translations/002.html>

And here's William Miller's lengthy analysis of the tale:

https://www.academia.edu/2281595/Audun_and_the_Polar_Bear.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 5:53 PM

Title: Re: Can a buddha get confused?

Content:

What do mean by "verbal saṅkhāra"? Are you referring to Brahmā Sahampati's request?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 7:26 PM

Title: Re: Can a buddha get confused?

Content:

Yes, in the traditional Theravadin understanding the Buddha's hesitation to teach is treated as merely a ploy to instigate an intervention by Brahmā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

With any contested moral issue, when things seem to be getting overly complicated, the ethic of reciprocity (aka https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Golden_Rule) will usually suffice to cut through the sophistry and dictate a felicitous conclusion. In the present case I think we all know perfectly well that if our livelihood depended upon receipt of royalties for our creative work, then we would feel robbed if people were making use of our work in a way that bypassed paying us our due. How then can we treat others like that?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2015 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

In the case of the second precept it is certainly determined in part by the secular powers, excepting only those cases where there is a conflict between what would be deemed punishable by Kings and what would be deemed blameworthy by the wise. In these cases obviously the judgment of the wise gets prioritised, in the same way that in the monastic Vinaya the requirement that bhikkhus "conform to the wishes of the King" is abrogated in cases where the King's wishes are unrighteous.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 4:10 AM

Title: Re: Can a buddha get confused?

Content:

Certainly not. Read again Nāgasena's solution to Milinda's dilemma quoted above and consider its implications (with especial reference to the Buddha's omniscience).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

Your personal magnanimity and largesse towards copyright-violators has no bearing whatever on the moral question. It's like saying: "Pickpocketing is morally blameless because if any pickpocket wanted to pick my pocket I'd cheerfully hand over whatever he wanted. It's only greedy possessive people who don't want their pockets picked."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 4:05 PM

Title: Re: Luang Por Prasit...getting to Wat Pah Moo Mai?

Content:

I don't know anything about the monastery, but this is the full address:

Wat Pa Moo Mai,
Ban Hua Pa Ha, Moo 2,
Tambon Mae Taeng,
Amphoe Mae Taeng,
Chiang Mai Province 50150.

วัดป่าหมูใหม่
บ. ห้วยป่าห้ำ หมู่ 2
ต. แม่แตง
อ. แม่แตง
จ. เชียงใหม่, 50150

If you show it to the staff at the hotel or guesthouse they'll be able to advise you on travel arrangements.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 4:41 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

As Kim noted, you're overlooking a rather elementary distinction. It's certainly possible to steal by making an unauthorised use of an original scholarly production in which a portion of the Dhamma happens to be preserved, but whose copyright has not yet expired. To take one example...

Back in 1993, that quagmire syndicate of rogues that calls itself Wat Dhammakaya decided that the Dhamma could not be copyrighted. Since it couldn't be copyrighted, they reasoned that they, being a Buddhist institution, were fully entitled to take all of the Pali Text Society's English translations of Pali texts and put them onto a CD for free

distribution. The PTS then threatened to sue for copyright breach and its then President sent the following e-mail to the members of an academic Indology LISTSERV:

Date: Mon, 25 Oct 1993 08:46:08 EDT
From: mailto:xxxxxxx@vax.oxford.ac.uk
Subject: Pali Tipitaka on CD-ROM

From: K.R. Norman, President of the Pali Text Society

BUDDHISM AND INDIAN STUDIES

IMPORTANT - PLEASE NOTE VERY CAREFULLY

You may have received a communication from Professor Witzel of Harvard informing you that the Dhammakaya Foundation has completed the input of the whole of the Pali Tipitaka on CD-ROM, and will be distributing it free.

Please take note that the material which the Foundation proposes to distribute in this way is the property of the Pali Text Society, of which I am President. The Foundation has no right to copy the material on CD-Rom and distribute it in that or any other way. We have been negotiating with the Foundation for some time with a view to possible copying and distribution, but the negotiations have not been completed, and any copying, distribution and use are therefore in breach of our rights.

Please also take note that we reserve the right to take legal action to enforce our rights in this important material against those who disregard them.

The Pali Text Society is a non-profit-making organisation established for many years and dedicated to the advancement of the study of Pali texts and the Pali language. The material which the Dhammakaya Foundation has put on CD-ROM represents many years of work and original research by this Society's scholars. Any legal proceedings which we institute will be necessary to enable us to carry out the purposes for which this organisation was founded. The pursuance of academic studies everywhere becomes impossible if the rights of others are abused as is happening in this case.

Though for a time the Dhammakaya rogues tried to take the moral high ground by bleating about how the Dhamma "couldn't be copyrighted", in the end their lawyers warned them that they could expect to get their arses badly kicked in the courtroom and so they backed down.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 5:04 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

Then I suspect you are falling into an excessive literalism.

Or, in the jargon of Bible translators, it may be that you're semantically acceding too much to form-equivalence and too little to dynamic-equivalence.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dynamic_and_formal_equivalence

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2015 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Breaking the precepts

Content:

No. Giving someone a gift of intoxicants, poisons, or weapons is a failing in a Bodhisatta's practice of the perfection of giving but not a breach of the fifth precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 12:05 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

In the present instance, what secular law can do is to furnish criteria as to when something does or doesn't count as "property". Without such criteria there will be no grounds for determining whether the second precept has been kept or broken. If the legislators should happen to be virtuous, non-frivolous, skilled in precedent, etc., then we can expect that their definitions will be good ones that ensure justice for all. If not, then their criteria must be disregarded and recourse be had instead to the judgment of the wise. But this wouldn't be a step to be taken lightly, given the difficulty of arriving at a consensus as to who counts as wise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

The texts' definition of "the not-given" (e.g. Khp-a. 26) doesn't limit it to material things. Rather, it encompasses anything that's lawfully and blamelessly been taken possession of by another.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

In their vagueness and paucity of stipulations, your questions in their present form are about on a par with asking: "If somebody were to say something to somebody, would he be breaking the fourth precept?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 8:24 AM

Title: Re: Sutta Nipata Commentary

Content:

There isn't any published translation of the Suttanipāta Atthakathā.

However, the Khuddakapāṭha shares three suttas with the Suttanipāta (the Maṅgalasutta, Ratanasutta and Karaṇīyamettasutta) and the commentary to this has been translated in Ñāṇamoli's Minor Readings and Illustrator.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 9:25 AM

Title: Re: Maranasati (Mindfulness of Death/Charnel Ground Reflection)

Content:

The practice of maraṇānussati doesn't entail any risk if it's practised for just a short period each day in order to prevent a slide into complacency (e.g. as a part of the five subjects for frequent recollection).

The potential for danger comes when a meditator decides to make it his main preparatory subject, so that his mind is adverting to it continually (and ideally uninterruptedly) throughout his waking hours. For a beginner this is something that can only be safely undertaken in retreat conditions and under the close supervision of a good meditation technician who's familiar with all the ways that a meditator can go astray with this practice. Four of these are mentioned in the Visuddhimagga:

- Soka: When recollecting the inevitable future death of some loved one he feels sorrow.
- Pāmojja: When recollecting the inevitable future death of an enemy or disagreeable person he feels gladness.
- Asaṃvega: When recollecting the death of neutral persons he feels the same indifference felt by corpse-disposers and so there is no sense of urgency.
- Santāsa: When recollecting the inevitability of his own death he experiences anxiety.

Besides these there are also the pitfalls involved in any kind of bhāvanā, of which the commonest is that of mistaking an akusala state for a kusala one. With maraṇānussati it's particularly common for a meditator to get into a very highly strung and emotionally volatile state which he imagines to be saṃvega (because he does feel great urgency) but actually is not (it's an aversive state — as evidenced by the meditator's liability to explode if anyone interrupts him or if he's required to perform some pedestrian task in the monastery).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 3:37 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

No, I don't think you could. As you may know from the

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/an/an03/an03.067.than.html> a straightforward answer is just one of four ways to answer a question. Your question doesn't really lend itself to such an answer. Rather, it's a question that demands either a counter-question: "What contractual obligations accompany the DVD? In what country?"

Or else an analytical treatment:

"It would be a breach of the precept if the DVD were accompanied by such and such terms and conditions and were borrowed in such and country, but not if it were accompanied by some other terms and conditions, or no terms and conditions at all, and not if the borrowing took place in some other country, etc., etc."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2015 8:52 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

It is undoubtedly an imperfect yardstick but nonetheless a basically rational one. The second precept is broken only when what is taken is truly the property of another. To whom or what, then, should we turn for our definition of what qualifies something as being someone's property? The laws of the state are *prima facie* the most obvious answer, given that the existence of a state (i.e. of a set of enforceable legal rights) is a precondition of property in any form.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 7, 2015 1:40 PM

Title: Re: AN 8.20 - Did Bouddha reject Bhikkhu Sangha ?

Content:

It isn't that there's any positive allowance to do so, but merely the absence of a prohibition against it. Though in expelling the miscreant, the sangha's actions would have to be limited to wrestling or judo moves like grabbing and pulling. Any kicking or punching of the monk would be a *pācittiya* offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 7, 2015 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Thai vs. Sri Lankan monks

Content:

No. The etiquette governing lay-monastic interactions is substantially similar throughout Theravadin Asia. Such differences as exist are mere punctilios, ignorance of which will be unlikely to be the cause of any serious gaffes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 7, 2015 7:46 PM

Title: Re: A poetry thread.

Content:

A sonnet declaring support for intellectual property and disdain for opponents of strong copyright protection.

A Plea for Authors, May 1838

Failing impartial measure to dispense
To every suitor, Equity is lame;
And social Justice, stript of reverence
For natural rights, a mockery and a shame;
Law but a servile dupe of false pretence,
If, guarding grossest things from common claim
Now and for ever, She, to works that came
From mind and spirit,* grudge a short-lived fence.

“What! lengthened privilege, a lineal tie,
For ‘Books’!” Yes, heartless Ones, or be it proved
That ’tis a fault in Us to have lived and loved
Like others, with like temporal hopes to die;
No public harm that Genius from her course
Be turned; and streams of truth dried up, even at their source!

— William Wordsworth

* Cf. An essentially similar argument in prose, that was advanced some decades later by Herbert Spencer:

“By those who have legislated, as well as by those who have considered the question from an ethical point of view, the proper duration of copyright has been a problem not easily solved: should it be for the author and his descendants without limit, or for his life and a term of years after, or for his life only? There is no obvious reason why property of this kind should not be subject to the same laws of possession and bequest as other property. If it be said that the language, knowledge, and other products of past culture used by the author or artist, belong to society at large; the reply is that these mental products of civilization are open to all, and that an author or artist has not by using them diminished the ability of others to use them. Without abstracting anything from the common stock, he has simply combined with certain components of it something exclusively his own—his thoughts, his conclusions, his sentiments, his technical skill:

things which more truly belong to him than do any visible and tangible things to their owners; since all of these contain raw material which has been removed from the potential use of others. So that in fact a production of mental labor may be regarded as property in a fuller sense than may a product of bodily labor; since that which constitutes its value is exclusively created by the worker. And if so, there seems no reason why the duration of possession in this case should not be at least as great as the duration of possession in other cases.”

— <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/spencer-the-principles-of-ethics-vol-2-lf-ed>, vol. II, ch. xiii. The Right of Incorporeal Property.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 7, 2015 7:58 PM

Title: Re: Thai vs. Sri Lankan monks

Content:

But these are trifling differences in matters of ritual, not important differences in laymen's behaviour. The OP's query concerns the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 8, 2015 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Physical action is more important than Intention

Content:

These examples don't contradict ihrjordan's claim. If you think that they do, then you are probably muddling intention and motive.

<http://www.differencebetween.net/language/words-language/difference-between-motive-and-intention/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 9, 2015 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Etymology of saṅkhāra / saṃkhāra

Content:

Both changes are of a common and entirely regular sort. See the the treatment of Sandhi, Assimilation and Strengthening in chapters 2-4 of Duroiselle's Pali grammar.

<http://www.pratyeka.org/duroiselle/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 9, 2015 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Physical action is more important than Intention

Content:

This is typical of the caricaturing of one's opponent's position that was so common in Indian religious polemic of that period, though more so in canonical texts than in the commentarial ones. In the latter (dating from a later period) Indian debate became a more gentlemanly affair, with polemicists taking great care to represent their opponent's view accurately before taking a sledgehammer to it.

I believe a correct statement of the Jains' and Buddhists' respective views on the baby and the gourd would be something like this...

Buddhist view: only intentional acts are karmas. Intentions (and not outcomes) determine whether a karma is kusala or akusala.

Jain view: all acts are karmas. Outcomes (and not intentions) determine whether an act is kusala or akusala. Intentions affect only the degree of kusala or akusala.

And so when a man roasts a live baby thinking it's a gourd, the Jains would say that his action is an akusala karma because a baby gets killed, but the akusala is lessened by the fact that his intention was to roast a gourd and not to kill a baby.

The Buddhist view would be that since he had no intention of killing a baby, his act was not an akusala karma at all.

And when a man roasts a gourd thinking it's a live baby, the Jains would say that there is no akusala karma for no baby is killed. The Buddhist view would be that he commits the akusala karmapatha of malice (*byāpāda*), by virtue of the fact that he intends to kill a baby, but not the akusala karmapatha of *pāṇātīpāta*, since no baby gets killed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 9, 2015 11:18 AM

Title: Re: Etymology of *saṅkhāra* / *saṃkhāra*

Content:

Duroiselle describes the *ka* to *kha* change as occurring "not infrequently". Personally I've never researched the texts with a view to ascertaining its frequency, though my impression is that it occurs more frequently with the prefixes 'pura', 'upa' and 'pari' than it does with 'saṃ'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 9, 2015 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Physical action is more important than Intention

Content:

My understanding is that motive and intention are both *cetanās*, but the former arises earlier and is a partial condition for the arising of the latter. In order to further distinguish

them, the commentators give the name 'pubba-cetanā', pre-intention, to the one that arises earlier and 'muñca-cetanā', 'undertaking-intention', to the one that arises after and directly produces some action of body or speech.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 9, 2015 1:51 PM

Title: Re: Facts about Floaters

Content:

When I saw the title I thought it was about lumps of human excreta that rest on the water's surface and refuse to be flushed down the toilet, either because of aeration ("strong swimmers") or excess of fat ("toxic turtles").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 7:18 AM

Title: Re: Etymology of saṅkhāra / samkhāra

Content:

Since the 'karo' in 'taṇhaṅkaro' is not preceded by 'pura', 'saṃ', 'upa', or 'pari', your example is not an exception to aphorism 594 of Kaccāyana, which states:

Pura'sam'upa'parīhi karotissa kha kharā vā tappaccayesu ca.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 9:09 AM

Title: Re: "Evil" unwholesome deeds.

Content:

The words that 'evil' is used to translate are pāpa (a noun or adjective) and pāpaka (exclusively a noun). They are the opposite of puñña, usually translated as 'merit'.

Edit: the above paragraph should read: The words that 'evil' is used to translate are pāpa (a noun or adjective) and pāpaka (exclusively an adjective). They are the opposite of puñña, usually translated as 'merit'.

Unlike 'evil' —the usual English translation— pāpa encompasses moral badness of all degrees and not just extreme badness. Were it not for its unwieldiness, 'demeritorious' might arguably convey the sense better. Other than that, the word's semantic range fairly closely corresponds to that of 'evil', including even some of the more figurative uses of the latter. An 'evil rumour', for example, is a pāpasadda ('evil sound').

From the PTS's Pali English Dictionary:

Pāpa (adj. nt.) [Vedic pāpa, cp. Lat. patior≈E. passion etc.; Gr. ph_ma suffering, evil; talai/pwros suffering evil]

1. (adj.) evil, bad, wicked, sinful A ii.222 sq. (and compar. pāpatara); Sn 57; Dh 119 (opp.

bhadra). Other compar./superl. forms are pāpiṭṭha S v.96; pāpiṭṭhata Vin ii.5; pāpiyyasika D iii.254. See pāpiya.

2. unfertile (of soil) S iv.315.

3. (nt.) evil, wrong doing, sin Sn 23, 662; Dh 117 (opp. puñña) 183; Pv i.66; 112; iv.150; DhA ii.11. pp. pāpāni Sn 399, 452, 674; Dh 119, 265.

Compounds

Pāpiccha having bad wishes or intentions Vin i.97; D iii.246; S i.50; ii.156; A iii.119, 191, 219 sq.; iv.1, 22, 155; v.123 sq.; Sn 133, 280; It 85; Nd2 342; Vism 24 (def.); VbhA 476; Pāpicchatā evil intention A iv.160, 165; DhA ii.77.

Pāpakamma evil doing, wickedness, sin, crime D iii.182; It 86; Sn 407; Dh 127; Vism 502; VbhA 440 sq.; PvA 11, 25, 32, 51, 84.

Pāpakammanta evil-doer, villain S i.97.

Pāpakammin id. M i.39 Dh 126.

Pāpakara id. Sn 674.

Pāpakarin id. Dh 15, 17.

Pāpadassana sinful view Pv iv.355.

Pāpadhamma wickedness, evil habit Dh 248, 307; Pug 37; DhA iii.4; PvA 98; as adj. at PvA. 58.

Pāpadhammin one of evil character or habits Pv i.117.

Pāpaparikkhaya decay or destruction of demerit (opp. puñña°) Pv ii.615.

Pāpamitta an evil associate, a bad companion (opp. kalyāṇa°) M i.43, 470; D iii.182.

Pāpamittatā bad company, association with wicked people A i.13 sq., 83; iv.160, 165; D iii.212; Dhs 13, 27; Vbh 359, 369, 371.

Pāpasaṅkappa evil thought Sn 280.

Pāpasīla bad morals Sn 246.

Pāpasupina an evil dream (opp. bhaddaka) Vism 312; DhA iii.4.

Pāpaka (adj.) [fr. pāpa] bad, wicked, wretched, sinful Vin i.8; S i.149, 207; v.418 (p. akusala citta); Sn 127, 215, 664; Dh 66, 78, 211, 242; J i.128; Pv ii.716 (=lāmaka C.); ii.93; Pug 19; Dhs 30, 101; Miln 204 (opp. kalyāṇa); Vism 268 (=lāmaka), 312 (of dreams, opp. bhaddaka). —f. pāpikā Dh 164, 310;

Apāpaka without sin, innocent, of a young maiden (daharā) Th 2, 370; Vv 314; 326 (so expld by VvA, but ThA explns as faultless, i.e. beautiful).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

But the Anattalakkhaṇa Sutta is not really probative in this matter. Indeed followers of

the Frauwallner/Thanissaro “strategic” interpretation, or of the various Vedantic or neo-Puggalavādin interpretations, are in the habit of citing this very same sutta in support of their heterodox views.

Better is the Alaggadūpama Sutta (MN. 22) and the passages cited above by Tilt.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 10:59 AM

Title: Re: "Who is Buddhist?"

Content:

I suspect this is just something they say to put non-Buddhist meditators at their ease. The fact is that in the Suttas to go for refuge is to become an upāsaka or upāsikā. (See the quotation posted earlier in this thread by Pilgrim). Buddhaghosa goes even further: merely approaching a Buddhist teacher and asking to be taught a meditation subject is in his view tantamount to going for refuge and therefore to converting.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 11:11 AM

Title: Re: "Evil" unwholesome deeds.

Content:

'Wholesome' and 'unwholesome' are the standard translations of kusala and akusala. Though lexically different, the two sets of attributes apply to identical referents, so whatever is pāpa is akusala and whatever is puñña is kusala.

The point of using them both together, as in the stock phrase "evil unwholesome things" (pāpakā akusalā dhammā) is most likely for emphasis.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Etymology of saṅkhāra / saṃkhāra

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2015 11:55 PM

Title: Re: Monks and masturbation

Content:

In the origin story behind each Vinaya training rule the Buddha simply decrees that the transgressive act will be an offence of such and such class. He doesn't offer

justifications for his decision as to which class it will be included in.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2015 12:31 AM

Title: Re: "Who is Buddhist?"

Content:

I think he was.

Anyone who goes to the Dhamma for refuge is a 'Buddhist'.* One of the ways of doing this (in fact it's the highest way) is by attaining the ariyan path. And since every Buddha has attained the ariyan path, it follows that every Buddha has gone to the Dhamma for refuge and so every Buddha is a Buddhist.

* Or a Sakyaputta, a Sakyadhīta or whatever other designations were in use in bygone ages before the hybrid word 'Buddhist' was invented.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2015 7:13 AM

Title: Re: "Who is Buddhist?"

Content:

To the extent that an arahant is a social animal he will certainly identify himself in various ways for the sake of conflict-avoidance (*araṇa*) and conformity with mundane conventions. The difference is that he won't be inwardly deceived by these adopted identifications. Ven. Mahākassapa, for example, would travel long distances every Uposatha day in order to meet fellow bhikkhus and hear the Pātimokkha recital. He didn't say: "In the ultimate sense no 'bhikkhu' exists and no 'Mahākassapa' is to be found in the khandhas, so I don't need to show up."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2015 11:14 AM

Title: Re: That's "rent," not "murder" :)

Content:

The dukkaṭa offence is to beat an animal or to engage in a non-penetrative sexual act with it. Taking its property is no offence. Unless of course the animal has an owner, but in that case the theft would be from him and not from the animal.

At one time a number of monks, descending from Mount Vulture's Peak and seeing the remains of a tiger's kill, had it cooked.

[...]

“Monks, there is no offence when it is the property of an animal.”
(Vin. iii. 58)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Nov 11, 2015 4:22 PM
Title: Re: "Evil" unwholesome deeds.
Content:
Whoops! I do indeed. Thanks for the correction.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Nov 11, 2015 8:55 PM
Title: Re: Mindfulness During Driving
Content:
The link doesn't seem to be working — I just get a 403 page.

On another page at the same site there is a list of downloadable books by the above-mentioned theras, but they seem to be all in Sinhala.

<http://www.savanatasisilasa.org/BooksByChandawimalaThero.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 11:15 AM
Title: Re: Collecting Eggs
Content:
That's getting off pretty lightly. Far worse fates are reported to have befallen egg thieves.

For example, the crow in the Dhammadhaja Jātaka story pretends to be a spiritually advanced yogi who can survive on air alone, but then he goes and eats other birds' eggs when nobody's looking. Eventually he gets caught and put to death.

Worse still is the fate of the young girl who steals a hen's eggs in the background story to Dhammapada verse 291. This triggers off a vendetta cycle, in which the infuriated hen vows vengeance and she and the girl then spend the next five hundred lifetimes alternately killing each other's offspring.

He who seeks happiness for herself by causing suffering for another,
Being closely associated with hatred, he is not free from hatred.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 1:42 PM

Title: Re: Collecting Eggs

Content:

The moral is about not nursing grudges. The story doesn't suggest that the girl was doing anything wrong in taking the eggs. Rather, the hen was wrong to resent it. But then in the story's subsequent unfolding they are both in the wrong, for neither will let go of her anger.

Burlingame's translation:

XXI. 2. "Not Hatred for Hatred..."

291. Whoever by causing suffering to others...

This religious instruction was given by the Teacher while he was in residence at Jetavana with reference to a certain woman who ate the eggs of a hen.

The story goes that in a certain village named Paṇḍupura, not far from the city of Sāvatti, there dwelt a certain fisherman. One day as he was on his way to Sāvatti, he saw some tortoise's eggs lying on the bank of the river Aciravatī. Taking these with him, he went to Sāvatti, where he stopped at a certain house and had them cooked. As he was eating the eggs, he gave a single egg to a girl who lived in that house. The girl ate the egg and after she had done so, would have nothing more to do with hard food. So her mother took a single egg from the nest of a hen and gave it to her to eat. She ate the egg, and her liking for this kind of food became so strong that after that she would herself take hen's eggs and eat them.

The hen, observing that every time she laid eggs the girl would take them and eat them, took offense and conceived a grudge against her. And she made the following Earnest Wish, "When I have passed out of this state of existence, may I be reborn as an ogress able to devour your children." So when the hen died, she was reborn in that very house as a cat. When the girl died, she was reborn in that very house as a hen. The hen laid eggs, and the cat came and ate them. Again the second time she ate them, and again the third.

Then said the hen, "Three times you have eaten my eggs, and now you desire to eat me too. When I have passed out of this state of existence, may I be able to devour you and your children." When she passed out of that state of existence, she was reborn as a leopardess. When her enemy died, she was reborn as a doe. When the doe brought forth young, the leopardess came and ate both the young and the doe.

Thus in each of five hundred successive states of existence they devoured each other and brought suffering one upon another. Finally one of them was reborn as an ogress and the other as a young woman of family at Sāvatti. (From this point on the story runs the same as that given in the Commentary on the Stanza beginning, "For it is not by hatred that hatreds are quenched." Only in this case the Teacher, after pronouncing the

words “Hatred is quenched by love, not by hatred,” expounded the Law for the benefit of both women by pronouncing the following Stanza,)

291. Whoever by causing suffering to others seeks to win happiness for himself,
Becomes entangled in the bonds of hate; such a man is never freed from hatred.

At the conclusion of the lesson, the ogress became established in the Refuges, took upon herself the Five Precepts, and was freed from hatred. Her enemy was established in the Fruit of Conversion. The assembled company also profited by the lesson.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 2:12 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

The phrase in the Sabbāsava Sutta (MN 2) is “There is no self for me” (natthi me attā).

The Ānanda Sutta’s phrase is “There is no self” (natth’attā).

Natthi me attā ≠ natth’attā.

And so the common practice by fans of the Frauwallner/Thanissaro “anattā strategy” of citing the Buddha’s dismissal of natthi me attā as a “fetter of views” (in the Sabbāsava Sutta) as a way of explaining his silent response to natth’attā (in the Ānanda Sutta) is a blatant equivocation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness During Driving

Content:

Thanks!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 10:31 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

You are not addressing my point. Let me give one oft-quoted specimen of Thanissaro’s equivocation, from his article The Not-Self Strategy:

The evidence for this reading [i.e. of the anattā teaching] of the Canon centers around four points:

[...]

3. Views that there is no self are ranked with views that there is a self as a "fetter of views" which a person aiming at release from suffering would do well to avoid.

<http://www.urbandharma.org/udharma/strategy.html>

But this is simply false. What is ranked among the fetter of views in the Sabbāsava Sutta is not: "There is no self" but rather the ucchedadiṭṭhi: "There is no self for me."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 10:37 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

The singular sense of dhamma, "doctrine", "truth", reality", etc. and the plural sense, "phenomena", "mental objects", "things", etc. are both very common in the Suttas.

In the phrase sabbe dhammā anattā, the letter 'ā' at the end of 'dhammā' shows it to be plural.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2015 11:22 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

The word can have all of its various meanings in both the singular and plural, but in practice certain meanings more commonly apply when the word occurs in the singular and other meanings more commonly when it occurs in the plural. For example, dhamma in the sense of "teaching" is most often singular; it occurs in the plural only when referring to the doctrines of a plurality of teachers such as the six sectarians.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 13, 2015 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

"Categorical" in the context of this thread means "without qualification" and derives from Ajahn Thanissaro's translation of pañha ekamsabyākaraṇīya as "question that should be answered categorically".

The question "Is there a self?" would be a pañha ekamsabyākaraṇīya if it were possible to truthfully answer it with either a straight yes or a straight no. Theravāda orthodoxy holds that it is indeed a question of this type and that the correct answer is no.

Thanissaro dissents from this orthodoxy and holds the question to be a pañha ṭhapanīya, or "question to be set aside".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 13, 2015 1:57 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

It isn't. To have answered in a qualified way would have meant treating the question as one that requires an analytical answer (vibhajjabyākaraṇīya pañha) and replying with something along the lines of: "There is a sense in which self exists and a sense in which it doesn't..." or "I affirm a self of this kind, but not of that kind..."

From Bhikkhu Bodhi's endnote to the sutta:

We should carefully heed the two reasons the Buddha does not declare, "There is no self": not because he recognizes a transcendent self of some kind (as some interpreters allege), or because he is concerned only with delineating "a strategy of perception" devoid of ontological implications (as others hold), but (i) because such a mode of expression was used by the annihilationists, and the Buddha wanted to avoid aligning his teaching with theirs; and (ii) because he wished to avoid causing confusion in those already attached to the idea of self. The Buddha declares that "all phenomena are nonself" (sabbe dhammā anattā), which means that if one seeks a self anywhere one will not find one. Since "all phenomena" includes both the conditioned and the unconditioned, this precludes an utterly transcendent, ineffable self.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 13, 2015 7:29 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

Actually I do. The "concrete basis" is the kind of contexts in which sabbe dhammā anattā appears. Some examples have been posted already. Here's a further one: "This is how the Blessed One disciplines his disciples, Aggivessana, and this is how the Blessed One's instruction is usually presented to his disciples: 'Bhikkhus, material form is impermanent, feeling is impermanent, perception is impermanent, formations are impermanent, consciousness is impermanent. Bhikkhus, material form is not self, feeling is not self, perception is not self, formations are not self, consciousness is not self. All saṅkhāras are impermanent; all dhammas are not self.' That is how the Blessed One disciplines his disciples, and that is how the Blessed One's instruction is usually

presented to his disciples.”

(MN. 35)

If you wish to propose that in a context like this dhammā is more reasonably taken to mean 'truths', then I submit this is a position that needs arguing, not just baldly asserting as you've been doing up to now. And to argue on the grounds that 'truth' is the primary meaning of dhamma just won't cut it, because the claim is false.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 14, 2015 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

See the Pārileyya Sutta.

“And how, bhikkhus, should one know, how should one see, for the immediate destruction of the taints to occur? Here, bhikkhus, the uninstructed worldling, who is not a seer of the noble ones and is unskilled and undisciplined in their Dhamma, who is not a seer of superior persons and is unskilled and undisciplined in their Dhamma, regards form as self. That regarding (samanupassanā), bhikkhus, is a formation (saṅkhāra). That formation—what is its source, what is its origin, from what is it born and produced? When the uninstructed worldling is contacted by a feeling (vedanā) born of ignorance-contact, craving arises: thence that formation is born.”

(SN iii. 94ff. Bodhi tr.).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 14, 2015 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

You offer no argument for this but merely assume MN 2's natthi me attā to be synonymous with natth'attā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 14, 2015 10:55 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

There are few statements of the Buddha more categorical than the Alagaddūpama Sutta's: “Actually and in truth, bhikkhus, there obtains neither a self nor what pertains to a self” (attani ca, bhikkhave, attaniye ca saccato thetato anupalabbhamāne).

The context:

Attani vā, bhikkhave, sati attaniyaṃ me ti assā ti?
Evaṃ, bhante.

“Bhikkhus, if there were a self, would there for me be what pertains to a self?”

“Yes, bhante.”

Attaniye vā, bhikkhave, sati attā me ti assā ti?
Evaṃ, bhante.

Or, bhikkhus, if there were what pertains to a self, would there for me be a self?”

“Yes, bhante.”

Attani ca, bhikkhave, attaniye ca saccato thetato anupalabbhamāne, yampi taṃ
diṭṭhiṭṭhānaṃ: ‘so loko so attā, so pecca bhavissāmi nicco dhuvo sassato
avipariṇāmadhammo, sassatisamaṃ tatheva ṭhassāmī ti: nanāyaṃ, bhikkhave, kevalo
paripūro bāladhammo ti?
Kiñhi no siyā, bhante, kevalo hi, bhante, paripūro bāladhammo ti.

But bhikkhus, since actually and in truth there obtains neither a self nor what pertains to a self, then this basis for views: ‘That which is the self is the world; after death I shall be permanent, stable, eternal, not of the nature to change; I shall persist for an eternity’—would this not be wholly and utterly a fool’s Dhamma?

“What else could it possibly be, bhante, but wholly and utterly a fool’s Dhamma!”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Nov 14, 2015 3:17 PM
Title: Re: Rita Gross
Content:
Yes, that's Sally Gross. She too has passed on.

<http://remembered.co.za/sally-gross-16882>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Nov 14, 2015 11:12 PM
Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?
Content:
I think it's actually your assumption that is wrong. You assume that the sutta permits a distinction to be made between (1) regarding something as self and (2) being able to perceive self, with the Buddha disapproving only of the former.

However, in assuming this you've simply been misled by a less than satisfactory translation. The word *anekavihiṭaṃ* in the phrase *anekavihiṭaṃ attānaṃ ... samanupassanti* doesn't mean "anything". It means "in diverse ways". As such, both the items in your imagined distinction would fall under that of which the Buddha is disapproving.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 15, 2015 3:42 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

I'd first have to ask you what you mean by "true", and secondly what you would understand it to mean were *sabbe dhammā anattā* to be translated as "All truths are not self" (if this is in fact how you think it ought to be translated).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 15, 2015 9:31 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha categorically denied the existence of an eternal self or a separate self?

Content:

You have done no more than re-phrase your earlier question. If you're too lazy to define your terms, then obviously there's no way for me to ascertain whether what you're asking of me is possible. The question you've asked me is a *paṭipucchābyākaraṇīya pañha* — a question that requires a counter-question as its answer. My counter-questions are:

1. What do you mean by "true"?
2. What would it mean to you if *sabbe dhammā anattā* were to be translated as "All truths are not self"?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 15, 2015 11:57 AM

Title: Re: What does it mean by radiant consciousness?

Content:

Yes, that is indeed what the commentaries define it as.

Which means that several of the posts in this thread are not at all in line with the rules for the Abhidhamma and Classical Theravada forums. A quick reminder for anyone posting here:

The Abhidhamma and Classical Theravada sub-forums are specialized venues for the discussion of the Abhidhamma and the classical Mahavihara understanding of the Dhamma. Within these forums the Pali Tipitaka and its commentaries are for discussion purposes treated as authoritative. These forums are for the benefit of those members who wish to develop a deeper understanding of these texts and are not for the challenging of the Abhidhamma and/or Theravada commentarial literature.

Posts should also include support from a reference, a citation (Tipitaka, commentarial, or from a later work from an author representative of the Classical point-of-view).

Posts that contain personal opinions and conjecture, points of view arrived at from meditative experiences, conversations with devas, blind faith in the supreme veracity of one's own teacher's point of view etc. are all regarded as off-topic, and as such, will be subject to moderator review and/or removal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 15, 2015 6:27 PM

Title: Re: Paris

Content:

.

<http://www.unz.com/jderbyshire/the-ancient-enemy>

“They have no faces ... only eyes.”

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 16, 2015 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Paris

Content:

Take your pick.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 16, 2015 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Paris

Content:

Indeed they are. Or do you have some better label for, say, the kind of culturally unassimilable scum depicted in the video below?

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 22, 2015 11:36 PM

Title: Re: Death or annihilation as the end point

Content:

But the absence of blokes in robes (or rather in togas and sporting long beards) is as much of a liability as an asset. In pre-Christian times the Stoics were organized into philosophical guilds, but with the extinction of the guilds there's no longer anything like a Stoic saṅgha to provide guidance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 22, 2015 11:58 PM

Title: Re: The etymology of "sutta"

Content:

Well, it could have been, but there is no reason at all to think that it was. Had the reciters wanted to refer to the Buddha's discourses as "what we heard" then they could simply have used the unmodified past participle suta as a noun.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 23, 2015 3:14 AM

Title: Re: A Manual to Life - Enchiridion

Content:

Lovely comparison of a wife to an onion at 6:49.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 23, 2015 7:32 AM

Title: Re: Different agreement on conditions need to be fulfilled

Content:

Number 1 is an overly free translation. The Pali is just *musā*. *Musā* without *vāda* would in this context mean a false fact (e.g., that something seen was not seen, something not seen was seen, etc.) rather than a false expression of that fact. A more literal translation of the four would be:

1. *Musā hoti*: “There is a falsehood”.
2. *Taṃ vatthu viṣaṃvādanacittaṃ paccupaṭṭhitaṃ hoti*: “There is manifested a citta aiming at deception with respect to that matter [i.e. the falsehood].
3. *Tajjo vāyāmo*: “There is an effort due to [that citta].”
4. *Paraviṣaṃvādanaṃ viññāpayamānā viññatti pavattati*: “There occurs a [bodily or verbal] communication causing another to understand that deceitful utterance.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 23, 2015 6:17 PM

Title: Re: Different agreement on conditions need to be fulfilled

Content:

I think that the reason for the difference between the three-factored and four-factored formulation will either be that suggested above by Ven. Pesala (i.e. that a higher standard is incumbent upon monastics), or else that it's simply that the three-factored one is more practical in a legalistic framework like the Vinaya. It means that if a bhikkhu tells a lie and later feels remorseful, he doesn't need to go tracking down all the people who were listening to him to find out whether they understood him or not, in order to determine if he's obliged to confess an offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 24, 2015 12:54 AM

Title: Re: A Manual to Life - Enchiridion

Content:

That's what he was: Epictetus was born into slavery. Among their household slaves, many upper-class Romans would own philosopher-slaves, whose job was to do their masters' thinking for them. That's what Epictetus was for many years until he was released some time after Nero's death.

The Christian father Origen tells a famous story of how early in Epictetus's life some sadistic master was amusing himself by squeezing his slave's leg in a vice.

"If you tighten it any more, you'll break my leg," said Epictetus.

The master gleefully tightened it further and there was suddenly a loud crack.

"There, I told you so!" said Epictetus.

(It's reported that Epictetus walked with a limp for the rest of his life and in portraits he's often represented leaning on a crutch).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 24, 2015 2:14 PM

Title: Re: Different agreement on conditions need to be fulfilled

Content:

It means that the two Vinaya rules against false speech (i.e. the fourth pārajika and first pācittiya) are slightly more easy to break than the corresponding fourth precept of a layperson, for a deliberate lie spoken by a bhikkhu will always be an offence, while the same spoken by a layperson will be an offence only if it's actually understood by somebody.

I don't see how one can draw any general conclusion from this about the consequences of transgression in the two case. Nor is it really clear what you mean by 'consequences'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2015 2:51 PM

Title: Re: Anumodana

Content:

No. Bhava and bhavāhi are the second person singular of the verb bhavati in the imperative mood: "Be ... !" or "May you be ... !"

For the first person singular the imperative would be bhavāmi, but in practice it's more usual to use the form homi from the verb hoti.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2015 6:15 PM

Title: Re: Anumodana

Content:

Metri causa.

If both phrases were in prose and the writer wanted to use the same form for each, then they would be:

"Sukhī dīghāyuko bhava" and "Sukhī dīghāyuko bhavāmi".

Or:

"Sukhī dīghāyuko hohi" and "Sukhī dīghāyuko homi".

But they are in fact found in verse, and since the proto-form is "sukhī dīghāyuko bhava" using such forms as "sukhī dīghāyuko bhavāmi" or "sukhī dīghāyuko homi" for the first person wouldn't conform to the metre. And so although "sukhī dīghāyuko ahaṃ" would more naturally be taken to mean "I am happy and of long life", the listener is expected to take the implied copula ("to be") as being in the imperative mood: "May I be happy and of long life!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2015 6:31 PM

Title: Re: The etymology of "sutta"

Content:

No. Both śruti and its Pali cognate suti are formed with a suffix that creates a noun of state from the passive form of the verb (i.e. Sanskrit śrūyāte and Pali suyati).

It's true, of course, that in English we need to use a past participle to translate it, ("that which has been heard/listened to"), but this is only because like all modern languages in the Germanic family (excluding Icelandic and Faroese) English has lost the proto-Germanic feature of using bound morphemes to express valency-reduction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2015 10:34 PM

Title: Re: The etymology of "sutta"

Content:

Well, you've got one over me there. Though I've eaten the stuff virtually every day for the last eight years, I wouldn't have a clue how to cook it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Questions on Abhidhamma (Bikkhu Bodhi)

Content:

It refers to the number of wholesome roots present in one's consciousness at the moment of rebirth. The rootless have none; the double-rooted have non-greed and non-hate; the triple-rooted have non-greed, non-hate and non-delusion. It is said that only triple-rooted beings are capable of making decisive progress in the Dhamma during their present life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Hello from Toronto

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel. There are no restrictions as to where you may post.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 7:40 AM

Title: Re: Buddhajayamaṅgala Gāthā

Content:

By stating the tempo, how many tones you could discern, and whether the articulation was predominantly staccato or legato.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Aspect_of_music

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 11:19 AM

Title: Re: Buddhajayamaṅgala Gāthā

Content:

The terms don't apply to cetasikas but to the aggregate-continuum, which may be viewed as either staccato or legato, according to whether the ābhidhammika is engaged in analysis or synthesis.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 11:38 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

J.W. de Jong, A Brief History of Buddhist Studies in Europe and America.
First published in The Eastern Buddhist Vol. VII, 1974.

Fascinating history of the extraordinary bees that have buzzed in buddhologists' bonnets over the years. For example:

After having retold the legend of the Buddha in great detail, Kern arrives at his interpretation. Like Senart he considers the Buddha to be a solar god. However, Kern is much more astronomical in his exegesis than Senart. The twelve nidāna are the twelve months of the year. The six heretical teachers are the planets. His first predication takes place in midsummer. For this reason the Middle Way is its theme. Kern never hesitates in his identifications with stars, planets and constellations. Senart's system of interpretation is based upon a careful examination of the Vedic and Brahmanical literature but one finds nothing similar in Kern's book. One observes with some astonishment that his categorical statements have been able to carry away even such a

sober-minded and cautious scholar as Barth, who was willing to consider the courtezans as mother-goddesses, the six heretical teachers as the six planets and the rebellion of Devadatta as the struggle of the moon with the sun (Oeuvres de Auguste Barth, I, Paris, 1914, p. 335). However, Barth believed that the legend of the Buddha contains historical elements which had been handed down since the time of the Buddha. Even Senart was willing to admit that historical elements had been connected secondarily with the mythical biography of the Buddha (op. cit., pp. 442-444) but for him the mythical and historical elements belonged to two entirely different traditions. (pp. 26-7)

Luckily the magnificent Thomas Rhys Davids and Herman Oldenberg then came along to set everyone straight.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2015 5:05 PM

Title: Re: What can a layperson do? How far can a layperson go?

Content:

There are plenty of reports of householders attaining arahatta. What is not reported is any case of a householder attaining arahatta and then continuing to live as a householder. In post-canonical texts this is said to be impossible: after arahatta a householder either goes forth into the homeless life or passes away.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 2, 2015 6:17 PM

Title: Re: Inspiring University President stands up against intellectual infantilization

Content:

<http://www.intercollegiatereview.com/index.php/2015/11/18/how-safe-spaces-kill-human-dignity/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 2, 2015 6:25 PM

Title: Re: Bad Action

Content:

Yes. The word translated as "results" in the OP is vipāka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 2, 2015 7:29 PM

Title: Re: Inspiring University President stands up against intellectual infantilization

Content:

<http://www.amerika.org/science/safe-spaces-must-be-destroyed/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 3, 2015 12:13 AM

Title: Re: How can one prevent oneself from performing any bad kamma or "mixed kamma"?

Content:

* Presumably the writer means <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Enkrateia>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 3, 2015 1:25 AM

Title: Re: Bad Action

Content:

For example, a man successfully robs a bank and now he's rich and can live the life of Riley, which he will probably deem "a good result". But when that akusala kamma yields its vipāka, the result will be a painful one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 3, 2015 3:08 AM

Title: Re: How can one prevent oneself from performing any bad kamma or "mixed kamma"?

Content:

Indeed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 3, 2015 4:40 PM

Title: Re: The Lost Factor in the Buddha's Path to Happiness

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 4, 2015 6:12 PM

Title: Re: What can a layperson do? How far can a layperson go?

Content:

There have been self-declarations of arahantship by some individuals, but none that seem credible to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 5, 2015 10:45 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

I've just received news of a new regulation for foreign nationals wishing to ordain in Thailand. They are now required to bring a copy of their police record in their native country and submit it to their upajjhāya before ordaining. As I haven't yet seen a copy of the regulation I don't know whether it requires that the candidate have a completely clean record or merely that it be free of serious crimes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 7, 2015 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Good resources in non-English languages

Content:

The <http://www.budsas.org/uni/u-thanhtinh-dao/ttd-00.htm> (Visuddhimagga) by Phật Âm (Buddhaghosa), translated into Vietnamese by Thích Nữ Trí Hải.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 8, 2015 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

Well, not really. The last good state-instituted sangha reforms were in Thaksin's day. The latest is actually a national security measure. It seems the Thai authorities have received an intelligence report that some Muslims have entered the Kingdom with the aim of carrying out terrorist attacks on Russian tourists in Pattaya. There's a concern that they may try to disguise themselves as monks and the new regulation is the junta's response to this.

Suspects.jpg (25.66 KiB) Viewed 29295 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 9, 2015 5:28 PM

Title: Re: A poetry thread.

Content:

EUROPE - A PROPHECY

History repeats itself, Napoleon said:

The first time as tragedy,
The second time as farce. – As for the third?
Well I remember a book I read,
Decades ago, it must be,
If memory serves me well,
By a wry Italian guy – Barzini?
A sort of socio-philosophical commentary
On the nations of Europe.

Each one got a chapter,
And in the one on Germany
He illustrated the strange case
Of pre-war Berlin and the protean types
That changed shape nightly
In crowded back-street revue bars:
All sexes mingled and commingled
And nobody knew or cared who was doing
What or where or when to who.

And that would've been fine on its own -
"Chacun à son goût," as they say.
Tradition was dead anyway, discredited
By the horrific error of The Great War,
Society was rightly breaking down – and with it,
Man's psyche seemed to be dissolving
Into its constituent drives and forces:
All and any notions of identity and justice
Were up for grabs, to say the least.

And then, as now, the world was run by bankers,
The currency was more debauched
Than the politicians it bought in parliament,
A wheelbarrow of banknotes bought you a carrot
If you were lucky – and a mugging if you weren't;
Since the streets outside were battlegrounds
Between lunatics of blood-soaked political persuasions
Who caved each others' brain-boxes in with pipes
Presumably to try and fit ideas into each other's heads.

Anyway, even this would've been fine, as I say;
But then the reactive revolution changed style,
A collective bout of bourgeois propriety
Spread like flu, and suddenly people in uniforms
Started to break down the doors to the clubs
And torch them and at the end of it all,
Framed in the dim-lit doorway
Was a funny little man with a moustache

Whom nobody could take seriously.

— James Robert Matthew Murphy

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 10, 2015 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Martial Law in Thailand

Content:

Two ambassadors in hot water.

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/09/thailand-police-investigate-us-ambassador-defamed-monarchy>

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/thailand/12040849/Thai-junta-criticises-British-ambassador-for-supporting-law-breakers-over-student-detentions.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 10, 2015 1:12 PM

Title: Re: Joseph Goldstein's income

Content:

The teachers at IMS are not paid salaries (only donations from those attending their courses) but the maintenance and administrative staff are. So if Goldstein is salaried (and I don't know whether he is or not) it would presumably be recompense for his work as the centre's director rather than for the teachings he gives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 10, 2015 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Bodhi Vandana

Content:

There is a Northern Thai version in which the preceding verse praises seven trees under which past Buddhas awakened. So it might be that *ete* on the first line is a demonstrative pronoun referring back to those trees, while *ime* is an adjective qualifying the tree immediately in front of the worshipper. In that case the latter would have to be read as an honorific plural, though it really ought to be *imā* since *bodhi* is a feminine noun.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 11, 2015 12:50 AM

Title: Re: nikaya for lay people

Content:

In terms of the proportion of suttas that are either addressed to them or at least address their concerns, I would say the Majjhima Nikāya for brahmacārī householders and the Aṅguttara Nikāya for kāmabhogī householders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 11, 2015 12:48 PM

Title: Re: Martial Law in Thailand

Content:

It gets sillier every day. This is almost worthy of Onion ...

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/10/thai-man-arrested-facebook-like-photo-king>

Thanakorn Siripaiboon, 27, a worker in a car-parts factory, was arrested in Samut Prakan, near Bangkok, and charged with sedition, lese-majeste and computer crimes, said Col Burin Thongprapai, a legal officer for the junta.

“On 2 December, he clicked ‘like’ on a doctored photo of the King and shared it with 608 friends,” Burin said, adding that he had confessed to the charges and faced up to 32 years in jail.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2015 7:30 AM

Title: Re: Inspiring University President stands up against intellectual infantilization

Content:

For example:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2015 7:47 AM

Title: Re: Reality vs. Concepts

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2015 11:10 AM

Title: Re: Yogacara Vijñapti-mātra

Content:

There is no reason to think that Vasubandhu was ever affiliated with the Theravāda. His main pre-Yogacāra work, the Abhidharmakośakārikā, is an exposition in brief of the main tenets of the Sarvāstivāda Abhidharma (essentially a Sarvāstivādin equivalent of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha), while his auto-commentary to the same (the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya) is in large part a critique of this Abhidharma system from a Sautrāntika point of view. In the latter text the Theravādins make an occasional appearance (under the name "Vibhajyavādins") but their views are either rejected or merely reported, with no suggestion that the author is sympathetic to them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2015 11:38 AM

Title: Re: Why so gloomy?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2015 11:46 AM

Title: Re: Inspiring University President stands up against intellectual infantilization

Content:

Sure, but the linked article doesn't do that. It describes a particular context in which each of the questions would be boorish and insensitive. It doesn't say that each question is necessarily and invariably wrong to ask.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 12:44 AM

Title: Re: How did you transition your diet?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Bodhi Vandana

Content:

I don't think there is any such thing as an honorific singular in Pali. An honorific plural is when a word's form is plural even though its meaning is singular; as for example when Queen Elizabeth says "we" instead of "I" when giving a formal address, or when the Buddha says "mayam" instead of "aham".

If the verse you quoted is preceded by the "seven trees" one, then ete would just be a normal plural referring back to those trees.

As for ime being an honorific plural, this is merely my conjecture as I can't see any other way to make sense of the first line. Though I should note that in standard Pali the honorific plural is normally limited to the first and second person pronouns (just as in Old Icelandic, Vulgate Latin, and many other classical Indo-European languages) — e.g, Buddhas and Kings may refer to themselves as mayam instead of aham and their disciples/subjects are wont to address them as tumhe instead of tvam.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 2:25 AM

Title: Re: Commentary Majjhima Nikaya

Content:

There are published translations of Buddhaghosa's commentaries to the Mūlapariyaya Sutta (Bhikkhu Bodhi), the <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/wheel377.html> (Ñāṇamoli), and the <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/soma/wayof.html> (Soma Thera).

There is also an unpublished translation of the entire Papañcasūdanī (Buddhaghosa's MN commentary), but I don't know whether it's possible to obtain a copy. It was done for the PTS by the late Sayādaw U Ñāṇika, with some help from Maurice Walshe and Lance Cousins. But U Ñāṇika's English was rather poor and as his translation didn't meet the PTS's standards it was rejected.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 5:17 AM

Title: Re: Commentary Majjhima Nikaya

Content:

I don't think there are any books expounding all or most of the MN suttas from a classical Theravadin perspective (which is what this sub-forum is concerned with). On the other hand, plenty of ink has been expended on comparative studies of the Pali Majjhima Nikāya and the Chinese Madhyama Āgama, notably by the Vietnamese monk Thích Minh Châu and the German Ven. Anālayo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 11:30 AM

Title: Re: Commentary Majjhima Nikaya

Content:

I didn't check carefully when I posted the link, but just assumed that it was since everything else on the website (at least everything that I'm familiar with) seems to be. However, having now investigated further I see that: (1) the book is presently being offered for sale by Pariyatti Press, and (2) that the owner of <http://www.dhammatalks.net> appears to be no respecter of intellectual property, (http://www.dhammatalks.net/copy_right_issues.htm). So, I'm going to remove the link now. Thanks for the notice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 4:23 PM

Title: Re: In the caves of withdrawal from the world

Content:

Hi Boris,

Though I've been a lifelong fan of Rudyard Kipling I'm a little mystified as to the connection between nekkhamma and the hanging of Danny Deever. What connection do you see?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 7:13 PM

Title: Re: Heavy Kamma

Content:

He wouldn't be sure whether he was defeated or not. If the victim is killed the bhikkhu is defeated, but not if he isn't. In cases like this, where a bhikkhu suspects he might be defeated but isn't sure, Buddhaghosa advises as follows:

1. Under no circumstances should the bhikkhu be told that he is defeated ("...for hard to obtain is the sight of Buddhas, but harder still to obtain is pabbajjā and upasampadā.").
2. He should be instructed to go to a solitary place and apply himself to his meditation subject. If he succeeds in attaining upacāra-samādhi then he should be informed that he is not defeated. (The assumption here is that a defeated bhikkhu would be incapable of doing this).
3. If he fails, then the sangha should recite the verses from the <https://suttacentral.net/en/an3.40> and then leave him to judge for himself whether it's prudent to remain in the robes or not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 8:24 PM

Title: Re: varadakkhiṇeyyo

Content:

I would take the vara in varadakkhiṇeyyo as the superlative adverb varaṃ and translate:

"The Saṅgha purified, most worthy of gifts."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 15, 2015 8:35 PM

Title: Re: In the caves of withdrawal from the world

Content:

Okay, I get it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 7:28 AM

Title: Re: The destruction of lust, the destruction of hatred, the destruction of delusion: this, friend, is called Nibbana.?

Content:

The Visuddhimagga's fuller discussion can be found in the attached file. See in particular Buddhaghosa's response to questions 4 and 5.

[./download/file.php?id=2829](#)

(114.71 KiB) Downloaded 146 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Colours and Jhanas

Content:

Not really. In the English translation it might appear that the colours of the different lotuses are being highlighted, but one wouldn't get this impression when reading the sutta in Pali. It's simply that Pali lacks any word for lotuses in general and has only words for particular kinds of lotuses (kamala, uppala, paduma, puṇḍarīka, etc.), each recognisable principally by its colour. And so in Pali you simply cannot speak about lotuses without saying what colour they are.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Colours and Jhanas

Content:

Yes, though there are about a dozen Pali names for lotuses, in the Suttas the combination *uppalāni vā padumāni vā puṇḍarikāni vā* is an especially common one, occurring time and time again. However, given that this combination is used in quite a variety of contexts and is never accompanied by any explanation as to why these ones in particular are being mentioned, I'm disinclined to think that there is any deep significance to it. Perhaps it's just a stock phrase reflecting the fact that these happened to be the most common kinds of lotus at that time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 12:26 PM

Title: Re: Colours and Jhanas

Content:

Probably not. In the Suttas "dressed in white cloth" (*odātavatthavaśanā*) is functionally about the equivalent of "dressed in civvies". That is to say, it's a stock phrase for describing the clothes of just about anybody except homeless ascetics and soldiers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 1:19 PM

Title: Re: Colours and Jhanas

Content:

"Wrapped" is used above to translate *pārupitvā* ("having put on...", "having clothed oneself in..."). This is the absolutive form of *paridahati*, the standard Pali verb to denote a person's putting on or wearing his upper garment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 16, 2015 1:48 PM

Title: Re: wholesome vs unwholesome

Content:

Attempting to surmount one's wrath and generate *mettā* in a fraught situation involving other people is unlikely to succeed unless one has already made very considerable progress practising *mettā-bhāvanā* in retreat conditions. For anyone else mindfulness and *upekkhā* will be a better resort in such situations. One arouses *upekkhā* by reminding oneself of ownership of *kamma*. For example: "All beings are the owners of their *kamma*, heirs of their *kamma*. That the other driver is making a wazzock of himself doesn't oblige me to do so too."

See also the <https://suttacentral.net/en/sn11.4>.

‘One who repays an angry man with anger
Thereby makes things worse for himself.
Not repaying an angry man with anger,
One wins a battle hard to win.

“He practises for the welfare of both,
His own and the other’s,
When, knowing that his foe is angry,
He mindfully maintains his peace.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2015 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Buddha had a specific way of defining "All"..what was it?

Content:

It's the normal practice of the commentators that when some important technical term crops up for the first time in whatever Nikāya they are commenting on they will either refer the reader to the discussion of it in Buddhaghosa's Visuddhimagga (if there is one) or, if the term is not discussed in the Visuddhimagga, then they will give a more or less exhaustive list of all the senses of the term, with examples from the Suttas to illustrate each sense. Later, with any subsequent occurrences of the term, they will refer the reader back to their earlier discussion, stipulating which of the given definitions applies in the current context.

Now it just so happens that the Sabbasutta is the first discourse in the Saṃyutta Nikāya in which sabba ("all") is used in a technical fashion and so Buddhaghosa takes the opportunity to define its different senses.

Pace Thanissaro, the Commentary's treatment of this discourse is not "very peculiar". It's not even a little bit peculiar. It's simply Buddhaghosa doing what he (and other commentators) always do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2015 3:59 AM

Title: Re: The destruction of lust, the destruction of hatred, the destruction of delusion: this, friend, is called Nibbana.?

Content:

One view: the yogi develops insight, comes to see the danger in conditioned dhammas, becomes disenchanted and turns away from them. Conditioned by this turning away there at some point arises a consciousness (the ariyamaggacitta) which takes Nibbāna, the unconditioned dhamma, as its object. The arising of this maggacitta has the effect of destroying particular fetters, starting with sakkāyadiṭṭhi, vicikicchā and

sīlabbataparāmāsa. With the fourth arising of a maggacitta one becomes an arahant and all of the ten fetters and three unwholesome roots are destroyed. The irreversible destruction of these defiling dhammas (and of the dukkha to which they give rise) may also be termed 'Nibbāna' but this is a figurative use of the term.

Another view: the yogi develops insight, comes to see the danger in conditioned dhammas, becomes disenchanted and turns away from them and the fetters and defilements are gradually destroyed. When all of them have been destroyed he is an arahant. The irreversible absence of kilesas in him is Nibbāna and Nibbāna is nothing else but this.

The first is the understanding of Theravādin ābhidhammikas and conceptions similar to it seem to have been shared by all the Indian Abhidharma-based schools. The second is the understanding of the Sautrāntikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2015 7:49 AM

Title: Re: Colours and Jhanas

Content:

Right, though outside of the present context the verb normally refers specifically to the wearing (or putting on) of garments on the upper part of one's body, in contrast with nivāseti which is used in connection with the lower garments.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2015 9:21 AM

Title: Re: Kingdom farewells late Supreme Patriarch of Thailand

Content:

Yes, I was one of them, way back when I was a Dhammayutt. Another was Ven. Panyavaro, the Aussie monk who runs the Buddhnet site. He and I ordained in the same ceremony before going up to Wat Pa Ban Tard.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2015 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Can anyone attain Nibbana?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2015 12:31 AM

Title: Re: What is Cetana?

Content:

Wanting what someone else has is not issā but abhijjhā ("covetousness"). This is reckoned to be the worst of the various modes of lobha, hence its alternative name, avisamalobha, "lawless greed".

As for issā, this is not wanting what someone else has, but rather resentment at the fact that they've got it and you haven't. In practice abhijjhā will often generate issā, and vice versa, but not always so. For example, when a pickpocket steals someone's wallet he certainly covets it but it's doubtful that he resents his victim's possession of it. In fact it's more likely that he'll be pleased at his possession of it, for otherwise it wouldn't be available for the pickpocket to steal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2015 7:18 AM

Title: Re: Can anyone attain Nibbana?

Content:

I wouldn't say that. In fact it's about as specific as you can get: it's a classification of people according to the speed and ease with which they may obtain penetration of the Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2015 4:45 PM

Title: Re: Can anyone attain Nibbana?

Content:

Regarding the last sentence, I would add that although the padaparama puggala is not to be emancipated in the present life, nevertheless his task is exactly the same as that of the neyya puggala, i.e., "[Obtaining] instruction, questioning, careful attention, and reliance on good friends."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2015 4:57 PM

Title: Re: Dispensation of Buddha

Content:

There is no evidence for this whatsoever, and much evidence to the contrary. Essentially it's an unsupported faith claim, most likely generated by an excess of proselytical zeal, Burmese national chauvinism and wishful thinking. You will find analogous superiority claims in virtually all the modern Burmese and Thai meditation traditions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 19, 2015 4:37 PM

Title: Re: Dispensation of Buddha

Content:

If they say what they believe to be the case, but what they believe isn't in fact the case, then it's not false speech; it's just a mistake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 19, 2015 5:12 PM

Title: Re: Buddha had a specific way of defining "All"..what was it?

Content:

[./download/file.php?id=2841](#)

(143.82 KiB) Downloaded 50 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 19, 2015 11:47 PM

Title: Re: Buddha had a specific way of defining "All"..what was it?

Content:

The commentaries to both texts understand it to be so, glossing "knower of all" (sabbavidū) as knowing all dhammas of the four planes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 21, 2015 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Usage of "lābha" in the suttas

Content:

Tasmā have jāgariyaṃ bhajetha,
Ātāpī bhikkhu nipako jhānalābhī.

Therefore be devoted to vigilance,
An ardent bhikkhu, a discerning jhāna-attainer.
(Iti 42)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 21, 2015 12:33 PM

Title: Re: Usage of "lābha" in the suttas

Content:

There's no question that this is an ancient problem, as evidenced, for example, by the various theras and therīs in the Suttas who are brought to the point of suicide by their failure to attain. But I just don't think it very probable that this is what's being addressed

in the Lābhicchā Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 21, 2015 10:07 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Chah Memorial week 2016

Content:

You may have better luck posting your query to the Isaan section of the Thai Visa forum:

<http://www.thaivisa.com/forum/forum/32-isaan-forum/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 26, 2015 11:19 PM

Title: Re: euthanasia

Content:

In fact it has. In pre-modern Siam and Burma the laws were adapted in part from various brahminical Dharmaśāstras and in part from the Vinaya Piṭaka and its Atthakathā and Ṭīkāś, while jurisprudential procedure was based almost wholly upon the forensics of the monastic Vinaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 26, 2015 11:57 PM

Title: Re: euthanasia

Content:

The origin story tells of an unhappy bhikkhu who tried to kill himself by jumping off Vultures' Peak, only to land on top of a basketmaker. The basketmaker was killed but the bhikkhu survived. The question then arose as to whether his action constituted a breach of the third pārājika rule against intentionally killing a human being. The Buddha ruled that the killing was no offence but then laid down the prohibition against jumping from a height. The interpretation of this rule is disputed. In the Milindapañha the phrase attānaṃ pātetabbaṃ is quoted in one of the dilemmas and appears to have been understood as a figurative expression for any method of committing suicide. This interpretation is later made explicit in the Samantapāsādikā, wherein all acts of suicide by bhikkhus are adjudged dukkaṭa offences.

Some Vinaya scholars, however, have argued that at its inception the rule had nothing at all to do with suicide but simply prohibited jumping from a height for any reason. For example, in Bangkok I once jumped down off a library stool after retrieving a book from a high shelf and was immediately scolded by the monk librarian (a Vinaya scholar who dissented from the suicide interpretation) for jumping rather than climbing down. In his scolding he cited this very rule.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 1:53 AM

Title: Re: Happy Birthday David N. Snyder!

Content:

መልከም ልደት

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 2:17 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and fallacies of idol worship

Content:

To judge from the OP's article, this thread has to do with the Islamic (or at least one Muslim's) assessment of Buddhism and not with a Buddhist assessment of Islam. Please stay on topic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Give your 5 best links on Buddhism

Content:

1. <http://blogs.dickinson.edu/buddhistethics/>
2. <http://dhammagarden.jimdo.com/texts/>
3. <http://www.wattamaoh.org/> (mostly Thai)
4. <http://www.tipitaka.org>
5. <http://www.budsas.org/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 2:55 AM

Title: Re: God Jul

Content:

The Norwegian origin of "A partridge in a pear tree."

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 11:52 AM

Title: Re: Does the bliss of Nibbana "arise"?

Content:

"Subject to..." is a common way of translating dhamma or dhammin when these are suffixed to certain nouns, such as:

jarāḍhammo: subject to old age.

marañadhammo: subject to death.

uppādavayadhammino: subject to arising and disappearance.

anuppādadhammo: not subject to arising.

Etc. Other translations that have been used are "under the law of...", "liable to...", "of the nature of/to... " and Ñāṇamoli's "inseparable from the idea of..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 1:13 PM

Title: Re: Does the bliss of Nibbana "arise"?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 27, 2015 1:49 PM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

With all due respect, Jordan, did you give even a half-moment's thought to the nonsense you've written here? Do you seriously suggest that lying to save someone's life will make us more likely to murder the persons whose murders we are hoping to prevent?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 12:24 AM

Title: Re: US & UK: Are we really developed?

Content:

I didn't look at the other pages, but the statistics on the one above are worthless:

- No source or date given.
- The title is a misnomer for the figures are not of the relative crime rates of different nations but merely of the number of crimes committed annually in each country, without any regard to its population size. It goes without saying that bigger countries are likely to have more crimes per annum than smaller ones.
- No statement as to whether the figures are for the crimes reported or for the successful criminal prosecutions. If it's the former then one would need to reckon with the national habits of reporting crimes; e.g., if your home gets burgled in Britain then you'll almost certainly call the police, but in rural Thailand people are more likely to just shrug their shoulders and say "aniccam." But if the figures are for successful prosecutions, then one would need to factor in the relative efficiency and freedom from corruption of the police and judiciary in different countries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 1:23 AM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

No, I haven't yet offered any view on the OP's question. My post merely pointed out that the arguments you offered for your own view seemed poorly thought out and unconvincing.

Were I to offer a view of my own it would be on similar lines to that which I've posted in a number of past threads on moral dilemmas, such as

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=22244&p=317789#p317789>,

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=42&t=23927&p=342767#p342767> and

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=42&t=23927&p=343111#p343037>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 2:07 AM

Title: Re: Theravada Temples: Taking the Refuges and Culture

Content:

I think it would be worth your paying the wat a visit. I've never been there myself but I have a slight acquaintance with Ajahn Chali, the meditation teacher there, from many years back. He struck me as quite an expansive fellow who was serious about reaching out to western Buddhists, so I doubt he'll be running the wat as merely a Thai cultural

centre (though that will no doubt be one of its functions).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Setting up Buddha shrine

Content:

I've been in several Burmese and in one Chinese Buddhist home where this was done, albeit for different reasons. In the case of the Burmese it was because they didn't have enough rooms in their home to allot one room for a shrine, and so they had to install the rupa in a room that was in regular use. However they didn't want the rupa to be just another household ornament and so they would keep it hidden from view except when meditating or performing puja. In the case of the Chinese it was because the rupa was kept in a woman's bedroom and she thought it would be undecent to undress in front of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 4:29 AM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

No. In Buddhist countries (especially in Tibet) one will encounter popular superstitions to the effect that by doing such and such one will be purified of lots of unwholesome kamma, but these superstitions have no basis in the Pali texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 10:57 AM

Title: Uposatha Calendars for 2016

Content:

Courtesy of Ven. Ānandajoti, image files and a pdf of five calendars, showing the Uposatha days for Sri Lanka, Myanmar, Thai Mahanikaya, Thai Dhammayuttika Nikaya, and the Chinese Mahayana.

<http://records.photodharma.net/notices/uposatha-calendars-2016>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 12:02 PM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

Yes, it does. The Vinaya is explicit on this point. If you remain silent in response to a question, hoping that your silence will be construed in a particular way by the listener,

and if that construal is a false one (e.g. if you hope that the Gestapo officer will conclude that there are no Jews in your home and then go away), then you've lied.

Regarding your other post, I'm afraid I'll have to delay replying as I've got a lot of proof-reading to do over the next couple of days.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 12:06 PM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

"From the principle of truthfulness Kant draws the grotesque conclusion that I must even reply with an honest "yes" to the enquiry of the murderer who breaks into my house and asks whether my friend whom he is pursuing has taken refuge there. In such a case self-righteousness of conscience has become an outrageous presumption that blocks the path of reasonable action. Responsibility is our total and realistic response to the claim of our neighbour; but this example shows in its true light how the response of a conscience which is bound by principles is only a partial one."

— Dietrich Bonhoeffer, Ethics p. 221

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 12:47 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and fallacies of idol worship

Content:

I accept your first point.

As for the second, this is still off topic. The question of whether those who accuse Buddhists of idol worship are also idol worshippers is irrelevant to the question of whether the charge is factual.

I might add, however, that since one of the hadiths in the Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī collection states that the Kaaba is "a stone that can neither benefit nor harm" (Vol. II, Hajj, ch. 56, Hadith 675), it's rather questionable whether bowing in its direction would in fact fit any of the usual definitions of idol worship.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 6:17 PM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

For example in the Nidāna to the Pātimokkha:

Yadi saṅghassa pattakallaṃ, saṅgho uposathaṃ kareyya, pāṭimokkhaṃ uddiseyya. Kiṃ saṅghassa pubbakiccaṃ? Pārisuddhiṃ āyasmanto ārocetha, pāṭimokkhaṃ

uddisissāmi. Taṃ sabbeva santā sādhukaṃ suṇoma manasikaroma. Yassa siyā āpatti,
so āvikareyya. Asantiyā āpattiyā tuṇhī bhavitabbaṃ. Tuṇhībhāvena kho panāyasmante
parisuddhāti vedissāmi. Yathā kho pana paccekapuṭṭhassa veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti.
Evamevaṃ evarūpāya parisāya yāvatatiyaṃ anussāvitāṃ hoti. Yo pana bhikkhu
yāvatatiyaṃ anusāviyamāne saramāno santiṃ āpattiṃ nāvikareyya,
sampajānamusāvādassa hoti. Sampajānamusāvādo kho panāyasmanto antarāyiko
dhammo vutto bhagavatā. Tasmā saramānena bhikkhunā āpannena visuddhāpekkhena
santi āpatti āvikātabbā, āvikatā hissa phāsu hoti.

"I will recite the Pātimokkha (while) one and all of us present listen properly and pay attention to it. He for whom there may be an offence should reveal it. If there is no offence, you should become silent. By your becoming silent I shall thus know that the venerable ones are quite pure. For as there is an answer for each question, so it is proclaimed up to the third time in an assembly like this. Whatever monk remembering while it is being proclaimed up to the third time that there is an existent offence and should not reveal it, there comes to be conscious lying for him. Now, conscious lying, venerable ones, is a thing called a stumbling-block by the Lord. Therefore the existent offence should be revealed by a monk who remembers that he has fallen (into an offence) and who desires purity; for when it is revealed there comes to be comfort for him."

(Vin. i. 102-3; Horner translation)

For the larger context and the commentary on terms go to

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd2> and scroll down to "Allowance to recite the Pātimokkha".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 6:20 PM

Title: Re: US & UK: Are we really developed?

Content:

Perhaps indignation at their hypocrisy — the discovery that the men whom they so generously support, supposing them to be fields of merit, are not in fact what they suppose them to be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 28, 2015 6:48 PM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

Each to his own taste. To me one of the few redeeming features of Saṃsāra is the fact that kusala dhammas wield more power than akusala ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 29, 2015 2:15 PM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

Akusala Dhammas

1. The three unwholesome roots, i.e., the mental factors of attachment, aversion, and delusion.
2. The other unwholesome mental factors that can only arise when one of the unwholesome roots is present, such as shamelessness, envy, stinginess, sloth, torpor, etc.
3. Any morally neutral mental factors that arise simultaneously with the three unwholesome roots: feeling, perception, intention, attention, zest, one-pointedness, energy, etc.
4. The consciousness that arises with all of the above.
5. Body-door, speech-door and mind-door kammas generated by the above.

Kusala Dhammas

1. The three wholesome roots: freedom-from-attachment, freedom-from-aversion, and freedom-from-delusion.
2. The beautiful mental factors that can only arise when one of the wholesome roots is present, such as a sense of shame, mindfulness, faith, compassion, etc.
3. Any morally neutral mental factors that arise simultaneously with the three wholesome roots: feeling, perception, intention, attention, zest, one-pointedness, energy, etc.
4. The consciousness in which all of the above arise.
5. Body-door, speech-door and mind-door kammas generated by the above.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 29, 2015 3:48 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and fallacies of idol worship

Content:

I quite agree and in effect said as much myself when agreeing with Pasada's first point.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 29, 2015 4:14 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Chah Website/Talk In Thai

Content:

<http://www.baanjomyut.com/pratrididok/cha/09.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 29, 2015 4:23 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism and fallacies of idol worship
Content:
And it was to this that I was responding.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 29, 2015 7:33 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism and fallacies of idol worship
Content:
But the scope of shirk isn't limited to just that. In the Kitab al-Asnam and other Islamic chronicles of monotheism (and deviations therefrom) some of the latter-day pagans are depicted not as forsaking Allah but as simply carrying on the idolatrous observances they'd inherited from their forefathers; Allah had been long forgotten by them. Yet they still get classed as mušrikūn.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 30, 2015 8:02 PM
Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya
Content:
But it has nothing to do with Wat Dhammakaya. It's some other monks who were going around the malls of Chiang Mai soliciting money.

<https://web.facebook.com/chayuti.janrakongtong/posts/10153152550081831?pnref=story>

<http://bangkok.coconuts.co/2015/12/30/monk-flips-man-who-refuses-make-donation-buddhism>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 30, 2015 10:46 PM
Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?
Content:
The point of interest here is the Buddha's decision to use the more specialised na lajjā rather than the more general ahirika to express the idea of shamelessness. Although both words mean “shameless”, na lajjā carries the implication that the shamelessness in question is a persistent defect of character. In the Vinaya, for example, whereas a bhikkhu who is totally lacking in respect for the training rules and transgresses them all the time is referred to as alajjī, a bhikkhu who is not of this type but who happens to fall

into a transgression on one particular occasion is referred to as ahirika. And so in this context to be a recluse "who is not ashamed to tell a deliberate lie" most likely means to be one in whom mendacity is a deeply ingrained trait. As such it has no bearing upon the case of an habitually truthful person telling a one-off lie, as in our Gestapo officer scenario.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 31, 2015 1:19 AM

Title: Re: doubt

Content:

Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Vibhaṅga version.

Doubt about...

1. The Teacher.
2. The Dhamma.
3. The Saṅgha.
4. The training.
5. The ultimate beginning of living beings.
6. The ultimate end of living beings.
7. Both the beginning and the end of living beings.
8. Specific conditionality and dependently arisen dhammas.

Niddesa version.

Doubt about...

- 1 - 4. The four noble truths.
- 5 - 8. Same as 5-8 above.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 31, 2015 11:11 AM

Title: Re: Help with the Abhidharma wikipedia article

Content:

Typos and missing or erroneous diacritics:

Abdhidhamma — Abhidhamma

Abhidhammattha-saṅgha — Abhidhammatthasaṅgha

Abhidhammatthasaṅgha — Abhidhammatthasaṅgha

Abhidhammavātara — Abhidhammāvatāra

Abhidharmakosa — Abhidharmakośa

Abhidharmakosabhasya — Abhidharmakośabhāṣya

Abhidharmakosha — Abhidharmakośa
Abhidharmasamayapradīpikā — Abhidharmasamayapradīpikā
Abhidharmikas — Ābhidharmikas
Adhidhamma — Abhidhamma
agamas — Āgamas
aisvarya — aiśvarya
alayavijnana — ālayavijñāna
Alu — Aḷu
Ananda — Ānanda
Anutika — Anuṭikā
Asanga — Asaṅga
Ashoka — Aśoka
Atman — Ātman
Atthakatha — Atthakathā
Banarsidarass — Banarsidass
bhavanga — bhavaṅga
Dhammasangani — Dhammasaṅgaṇī
Dhatukatha — Dhātukathā
Dhatukaya — Dhātukāya
Hetuvada — Hetuvāda
Jiva — Jīva
Jnanaprasthana — Jñānaprasthāna
Katha Vatthu — Kathāvatthu
Kathavatthu — Kathāvatthu
Khāṇavāda — Khaṇikavāda
Khemappakarana — Khemappakaraṇa
ksanika — kṣaṇika
laksana — lakṣana
Madhyamaka — Mādhyamaka
Mahabhivasa — Mahāvibhāśa
Mahaprajnaparamita — Mahāprajñāpāramitā
Mahasanghika — Mahāsāṃghika
Mahavibhasa — Mahāvibhāśa
Mahayana — Mahāyāna
Mahayanists — Mahāyānists
Mahisasaka — Mahīśāsaka
mahisasakaversion — Mahīśāsaka version
Mohavicchedani — Mohavicchedanī
Mulatika — Mūlaṭikā
Nagarjuna — Nāgārjuna
Namacaradipak — Nāmacāradīpaka
Namarupapariccheda — Nāmarūpapariccheda
Nikaya — Nikāya
Nikayas — Nikāyas
nippariyaya — nippariyāya
Nirvana — Nirvāṇa
Nyayanusara — Nyāyānusāra

Pancappakaranatthakatha — Pañcappakaraṇatthakathā
paramannu — paramāṇu
paramanu — paramāṇu
paramānu — paramāṇu
pariyaya — pariyāya
Parmatthavinicchaya — Paramatthavinicchaya
Paticcasamupada — Paṭiccasamuppāda
Patthana — Paṭṭhāna
pitaka — piṭaka
prajna — prajñā
prajnapti — prajñapti
Prajnaptisastra — Prajñaptiśāstra
Prajñaptivadins — Prajñaptivādins
Prakaranapada — Prakaraṇapāda
Pudgalavada — Pudgalavāda
Pudgalavadins — Pudgalavādins
Puggala Pannatti — Puggalapaññatti
Puggalapannatti — Puggalapaññatti
rupa — rūpa
rūpa — rūpa
Rūpa — Rūpa
Ruparupavibhaga — Rūpārāpavibhāga
rūpas — rūpas
sabhaava — sabhāva
sabhāga — sabhāga
Saccasamkhepa — Saccasaṅkhepa
sahabhu — sahabhū
Samghabhadra — Saṃghabhadra
Sammohavinodini — Sammohavinodanī
samutpada — samutpāda
Sangitiparyaya — Saṅgītiparyāya
Sariputra — Śāriputra
Sariputrabhidharmasastra — Śāripūtrābhidharmaśāstra
Sariputta — Sāriputta
Sarvastivada — Sarvāstivāda
Sārvastivāda — Sarvāstivāda
Sarvāstivādan — Sarvāstivādin
Sarvastivadas — Sarvāstivādins
Sarvastivadin — Sarvāstivādin
Sarvastivadins — Sarvāstivādins
sastra — śāstra
Sautrantika — Sautrāntika
Shannagarika — Channāgārika
sūksma — sūksma
Sutra — Sūtra
sutras — sūtras
Sutta Nipata — Suttanipāta

Suttapitaka — Suttapiṭaka
svabhava — svabhāva
svalaksana — svalakṣana
Theravāda — Theravāda
Theravadin — Theravādin
Theravadins — Theravādins
Tipitaka — Tipiṭaka
treat is — treatise
Vaibhasika — Vaibhāṣika
Vaibhasikas — Vaibhāṣikaa
Vainasikas — Vainaśikas
Vaisheshika — Vaiśeṣika
Vatsiputriya — Vātsīputrīya
Vibhajyavada — Vibhajyavāda
Vibhajyavāda — Vibhajyavāda
Vibhanga — Vibhaṅga
Vibhasa — Vibhāṣa
Vibhasa-sastrins — Vibhāśasāstrins
Vijnanakaya — Vijñānakāya
Vijñanakaya — Vijñānakāya
vipāka — vipāka
vipassana — vipassanā
Vism-mhp — Vism-mhṭ
Yogacara — Yogācāra

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 31, 2015 3:20 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth - who cares?

Content:

I think Nicolas's point is a response to the OP's contention that any possible future life is not something worth caring about because the continuing sense of personal identity will be broken by our failure to remember this life. And so according to this view in the next life (if there is one) we shall be a wholly different person.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 31, 2015 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Heavy Kamma

Content:

Although there aren't any cases exactly like these in the Vinītavatthu, there can be little doubt that both would be pārājika offences.

1. If it were claimed that the change of mind rendered the bhikkhu innocent of pārājika, then the general maxim that would follow from this would be: "In any scenario where a

bhikkhu, intending to kill a man, makes an effort (whether by his own hand or by inciting another) aimed at bringing that death about, and where that effort is such as will make the fulfilment of the bhikkhu's intention irrevocable, he will be held innocent of pārājika if he changes his mind at any point between the making of the effort and the victim's death.

2. But this would be an absurd maxim. For example, it would mean that if a bhikkhu stabbed a man, intending to kill him, but the victim took a minute or two to die, if the bhikkhu were to regret his decision and change his mind about wanting the man dead during those minutes, then he would be innocent of pārājika. The difference between this scenario and yours is only the time-span, for in both scenarios the bhikkhu has made an effort that is irrevocable.

3. Furthermore, the maxim would be contradicted by those Vinaya cases where a bhikkhu aims to kill someone by setting a deadly pitfall trap. Even if he changes his mind, unless or until he fills in the hole he has dug he will be held responsible for any death that results from someone falling into it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 1, 2016 12:55 PM

Title: Re: Happy New Year

Content:

สวัสดีปีใหม่

Sawatdee pee mai!

Here it's twelve hours old already.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 2, 2016 7:41 PM

Title: Re: Who can't become a monk or nun?

Content:

Mere eligibility for the draft doesn't count as an obstacle in the Vinaya, though if some country decided that it did count and that those eligible could not ordain, then the Sangha would have no choice but to conform.

Thailand has a selective conscription system, in which all the young men who are eligible for the draft have to pick a rubber ball out of a box and are conscripted if they pick the wrong colour (though in the case of rich kids it's usual for their parents to pay a bribe to the conscripting officer to enable their son to evade it. Hence the cannon fodder in the Thai military consists overwhelmingly of peasant lads). The national policy regarding ordination is that mere eligibility for the draft doesn't debar a man from ordaining, but if he's already gone along to the conscription office and picked the wrong

ball (and his parents haven't paid the requisite bribe) then he can't ordain until he's done his two years in the military.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 2, 2016 8:36 PM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

I don't think one can really generalise about this because remorse affects different people in different ways. One person might be led to repent of his misdeed and turn over a new leaf, while another might be led to lose himself in drink, drugs, and mindless distractions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 2, 2016 8:49 PM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

Both unwholesome actions and the mental causes of these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 3, 2016 12:04 AM

Title: Re: Who can't become a monk or nun?

Content:

I don't know if things are still the same today, but it used to be the case that the ordained were not obliged to submit to the ball-selecting ceremony and so only got conscripted if they disrobed while still young enough for the draft.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 3, 2016 8:02 AM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

Just a couple of general observations...

1. 'Musā' Doesn't Mean 'Non-Factual'

In Pali factually false and factually true statements are not indicated by the terms *musāvāda* and *saccavāda*, but rather by *abhūtavāda* ("speech on what is not [the case]") and *bhūtavāda* ("speech on what is [the case]") respectively.

As for *musāvāda* and *saccavāda*, although these get popularly translated as "false

speech” and “truthful speech”, this is misleading, for in fact they have nothing to do with truth or falsity. For an utterance to be *musāvāda* it does not have to be false (*abhūtavāda*); it’s enough that the speaker believes it to be false. And for a statement to be *saccavāda* it does not have to be true (*bhūtavāda*); it’s enough that the speaker believes it to be true.

In short, *musāvāda* and *saccavāda* hinge entirely on whether it’s the speaker’s intention to communicate a falsehood or a truth. As such the terms would be better translated as dishonest speech and honest speech.

To illustrate the point, consider the following Vinaya scenarios (in connection with the fourth *pārājika* rule — a prohibition against making false claims about spiritual attainments) and the Buddha’s verdict on them:

1. Factual and honest (*bhūta, sacca*): A bhikkhu believes that he has attained the first *jhāna* and has in fact done so. He informs a fellow bhikkhu of his attainment. Verdict: no offence.
2. Non-factual and dishonest (*abhūta, musā*): A bhikkhu believes that he has not attained the first *jhāna* and has not in fact attained it. Yet he informs a fellow bhikkhu that he has attained it. Verdict: a defeating offence.
3. Non-factual but honest (*abhūta, sacca*): A bhikkhu believes that he has attained the first *jhāna* but has not in fact attained it. He informs a fellow bhikkhu of [what he mistakenly believes to be] his attainment. Verdict: no offence.
4. Factual but dishonest (*bhūta, musā*): A bhikkhu believes that he has not attained the first *jhāna* but has in fact attained it (i.e. he attained it but didn’t realize he had done so). He informs a fellow bhikkhu that he has attained it [even though he thinks that he hasn’t]. Verdict: a defeating offence.

2. Rounding up or down when telling people the time

I think that the relevant teaching in this connection is the *Araṇavibhaṅga Sutta* (“Exposition on Non-Conflict”). Among the ways of not creating conflict that the sutta details, one is the instruction that “one should not flout the normal/accepted/commonly agreed usage” (*samaññaṃ n’ātidhāveyya*).

When asked the time, the accepted usage will vary from one situation to another. For example, if the questioner is a doctor recording the time of a patient’s decease on a death certificate, or someone who wants to ascertain the accuracy of his own timepiece, then clearly a precise answer is being sought and the accepted usage would be to give him one. But in response to more casual enquiries about the time such precision is not being sought and the accepted usage is to round up or round down to

the nearest five minutes or quarter of an hour. If it's nearly 12 noon but one insists on replying "It's 11:58 and 36 seconds" the response will at best seem peculiar and at worst might be construed as sarcastic or as an expression of passive-aggressive irritation. It's highly unlikely that the questioner will think: "Goodness, what an admirably honest fellow this is!"

As for musāvāda in this connection, I think this would hinge principally upon what sort of answer the speaker believes the questioner to be soliciting. For example:

He believes an accurate answer is being sought but gives an approximate one with the intention of deceiving: blameworthy on account of musāvāda.

He believes an accurate answer is being sought but gives an approximate one out of mere laziness or habit: not musāvāda but blameworthy because it flouts accepted usage.

He believes an approximate answer is being sought, but gives an exact one out of a concern for complete honesty: not musāvāda but blameworthy on account of over-scrupulosity that leads him to flout accepted usage.

Or so it seems to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 3, 2016 3:18 PM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

What seems "funny" to me is that someone like yourself who professes to be an absolutist on the issue of veracity should post a slanderous falsehood like the one above.

The following contributors to this thread appear to think it morally defensible to deceive a would-be murderer in order to save innocent lives:

Cittasanto

David Snyder

Dhammanando

Khalil Bodhi

Leon-nl

Mr Empty

Mr Man

No_Mind

Samseva

Now I don't recall what these posters' views are on the issue of intellectual copyright

(except my own of course), but I do know that not one of them has ever written to justify “murdering in the hope of some greater outcome”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 3, 2016 3:54 PM

Title: Re: Who can't become a monk or nun?

Content:

It has nothing to do with their infectiousness (the idea that it does is a modern one with no support in the texts). The rule was laid down because the five maladies were rife in Magadha in the Buddha's time and it happened that Jīvaka, the physician to King Bimbisāra and the bhikkhusangha, was the best person to treat them. And so men were getting ordained just so that they could get free treatment from Jīvaka. In the end Jīvaka became overburdened with treating bhikkhus all the time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 3, 2016 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Evidence of reincarnation

Content:

The Theravada teaching is that rebirth occurs without any interval between one life and the next. Some non-Theravada schools teach that there is an intermediate state between the two lives.

This difference of opinion leads to different interpretations of the terms "beings who have come to be" and "beings seeking to be". Those who believe in an intermediate state take "beings who have come to be" as referring to those who have already been reborn, while "beings seeking to be" is taken as referring to those who are still waiting in the intermediate state.

The Theravada commentators offer two possible interpretations of the terms"

1. "Beings who have come to be" = those which have already emerged from a womb or hatched from an egg. "Beings seeking to be" = those which are still inside the womb or egg.

2. "Beings who have come to be" = arahants. "Beings seeking to be" = worldlings and sekhas. The meaning is that an arahant has been born but won't be born any more, but worldlings and sekhas are still subject to further existences.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 2:00 AM

Title: Re: When is it ok to lie?

Content:

"Murder" is a legal term. It's the unlawful killing of one human by another with malice aforethought. Nobody here has ever sought to justify that, not even in the Euthanasia thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Mindfulness Inc: Buddhist practice beyond religion

Content:

I think Wilson is simply going along with the widespread assumption that prior to the rise of the modern lay meditation movements the Theravada laity didn't meditate at all. But this is really no more than an assumption. If we stick strictly to the evidence all we can really say is that we have very little idea about what the Theravada laity got up to in pre-modern times. All we know about are those activities that leave traces, e.g., getting one's name engraved in stone because one has made a large donation to some monastery construction project. Practising meditation wouldn't leave any such traces.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 10:40 AM

Title: Re: Happy birthday Khalil Bodhi!

Content:

Happy birthday!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 10:49 AM

Title: Re: posture

Content:

A talk by James Baraz on the method of Ajahn Naeb, a Thai laywoman who specialised in mindfulness of the postures.

<http://dharmafeed.org/teacher/86/talk/2571/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 1:17 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness Inc: Buddhist practice beyond religion

Content:

Precept-keeping is a momentary event. It consists in the arising of one of the abstinence mental factors (virati cetasika) on any occasion when one is aware of an opportunity to break a precept. The abstinence mental factor holds one back from the

act of transgression and the kusala cetanā that arises conascently with it creates sīlamayapuñña (“meritorious kamma produced by an act of virtuous restraint”). Since the abstinence mental factor and the kusala cetanā can only arise in a wholesome consciousness, and since mindfulness is present in every wholesome consciousness, it follows that precept-observance is absolutely inseparable from mindfulness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 3:05 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness Inc: Buddhist practice beyond religion

Content:

I think in the part of the talk that you're alluding to Wilson is making an historical point rather than a Buddhist doctrinal one. He is talking about what monks and laity actually did in pre-modern times, not about what they were supposed to do. Moreover he appears to be referring to the intensive cultivation of mindfulness rather than just the occasional arisings of it that are required for dāna and sīla. And so his claim is that such intensive cultivation was in pre-modern times the exclusive province of monastics. He may be right or wrong on this point, but either way I don't think any conclusion can be drawn from this about whether he has a good or a bad understanding of the Buddha's teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness Inc: Buddhist practice beyond religion

Content:

I would assume that at least some of them did, given the Buddha's glowing praise for this observance.

“So it is, Vāsetṭha, so it is! If all khattiyas would observe the uposatha complete in eight factors, that would lead to their welfare and happiness for a long time. If all brahmins ... vessas ... suddas would observe the uposatha complete in eight factors, that would lead to their welfare and happiness for a long time. If the world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans, would observe the uposatha complete in eight factors, that would lead to the welfare and happiness of the world for a long time. If these great sal trees would observe the uposatha complete in eight factors, that would lead to the welfare and happiness of these great sal trees for a long time, [if they could choose]. How much more then for a human being!”

(AN.iv.259 — Bodhi trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 4, 2016 7:10 PM

Title: Re: [MN 86] Fallacy of Aṅgulimāla Paritta

Content:

Would you happen to know if the Milindapañha's list of parittas (including the Aṅgulimālaparitta) is found also in the shorter Chinese version, the Nāgasena Bhikṣu Sūtra?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2016 8:15 AM

Title: Re: Any named female devas in the Tipitaka?

Content:

When female devas appear in the Tipiṭaka they are seldom given names. A few exceptions:

Kokanadā

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn1.39>

Cūḷakokanadā

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn1.40>

The three daughters of Māra: Taṇhā, Arati and Ragā

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn4.25>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2016 10:56 AM

Title: Re: Any named female devas in the Tipitaka?

Content:

It's more complicated. In Pali if one wants to be specific about a deva's sex one uses deva or devaputta for the male and devī or devadhītā for the female. As for "devatā", though this is popularly used in Thailand for the female of the deva species, in Pali it doesn't imply either sex. In fact the named devas in the Devatā-samyutta mostly have male names.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2016 2:43 PM

Title: Re: Any named female devas in the Tipitaka?

Content:

No, that's Brahmās.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2016 5:27 PM

Title: Re: [MN 86] Fallacy of Aṅgulimāla Paritta

Content:

My query had nothing to do with asserting the superiority of one school over another, or of one school's canon over another school's canon. It's simply that the presence or absence of some mention of the Aṅgulimālaparitta in the Nāgasena Bhikṣu Sūtra is evidentially relevant to assessing the relative likelihood of the two possibilities suggested in this thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 6, 2016 9:41 AM

Title: Re: Please, ordination exam???

Content:

The monks are receiving certificates testifying to their completion of the training course for Thai dhammadūta monks in foreign countries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 6, 2016 8:24 PM

Title: Re: What is in a monk's bowl?

Content:

It's common in the more ascetic meditation traditions, but isn't the norm in the less ascetic or in the non-ascetic ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 7, 2016 7:04 AM

Title: Re: What is in a monk's bowl?

Content:

No. Though in some ill-informed quarters one will find that the actual Vinaya principle that a monk may eat only what has been offered to him has been transformed into the faux Vinaya principle that he must eat everything that has been offered to him (i.e. in order to please the donors). This faux principle is a major cause of obesity in the sangha. For example, one sometimes goes along to a meal invitation at someone's house where all the donor's friends and neighbours have brought along their own contribution to the meal. While you're eating some of the laypeople will sit there watching to make sure that you're partaking of their personal contribution. If their contribution should go untouched for a few minutes they'll start dropping hints to the invited monks to take some of it or even importunately badgering them to do so. This is motivated by the belief that their merit will grow according to how much of their offering the monks eat — a belief that was in fact rejected by the Theravadins at the Third Council.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 7, 2016 11:20 AM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

I would suppose because this is a term whose semantic range is broad enough to encompass all of the items the Buddha considered relevant in the generation of kusala and akusala.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 12:39 AM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

Owing to the ripening of weighty kamma from the distant past — weighty kamma of the kind that persists indefinitely until it yields a vipāka, as opposed to kammas that have a fixed limit on the time when they can do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 8:33 AM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

It means origination. Of the four ways that rūpa dhammas are originated one is kamma-samuṭṭhāna which is responsible for producing:

1. The eight inseparable materialities present in the nine kinds of kamma-generated materiality-clusters.
2. The five sensoria: eye-sensitivity, ear-sensitivity, etc.
3. Masculinity and femininity faculties.
4. Life-faculty.
5. Heart-base.
6. Space.

Kamma alone is said to produce items 2-5. The others are produced by kamma only when they arise in a kamma-generated materiality-cluster.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 12:39 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

That is the translator's (and Zom's) opinion.

However, the term "dwelling with the immeasurable" (appamāṇavihārī) is used in two

different senses in the Suttas. In some it refers to one who has developed the brahmavihāras (or one of them) to an unlimited degree (i.e. to the point of regarding all beings without distinction with the attitude of the brahmavihāra in question). Then in other Suttas appamāṇavihārī is a term for an arahant. The commentary to the Loṇakapallasutta takes the word in the second sense.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Why Kusala is more powerful than Akusala?

Content:

I don't have one. It's the kind of "Why?" question that I wouldn't ask.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 1:08 PM

Title: Re: Who is worthy to teach the Dhamma, are these teachers a trust worthy source?

Content:

It surely isn't. Though there's no doubt, as you say, that Uppalavaṇṇā lived an exemplary life as a Buddhist ascetic, still, her translations are atrocious, as will be evident to even a novice in Pali who tries reading them alongside the original. In fact they are so clumsy, so flawed, and so riddled with lacunae that I'm surprised the Suttacentral folks even deem it worthwhile linking to them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 3:52 PM

Title: Re: Hello from UK

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

I don't see any contradiction to reconcile. They are two different suttas, in which appamāṇavihārī is used in one sense in one and in another sense in the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 8:48 PM

Title: Re: Who is worthy to teach the Dhamma, are these teachers a trust worthy source?

Content:

Yes, but I don't know why they don't use Gradual Sayings, the pioneering PTS translation, which I believe is among those which the PTS recently put into the public domain. It's nowhere near as good as Bhikkhu Bodhi's, but very much better than Uppalavaṇṇā's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Should we modify the Buddha's teaching so it appeal to other religions and the western audience?

Content:

The general opinion among peer-reviewed academic Bible scholars is that the theory has no merit whatever.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

The Sagāthakasutta (SN. ii. 232) and a parallel passage in the Itivuttaka's Sakkārasutta (Iti. 73-5):

Yassa sakkariyamānassa, asakkārena cūbhayaṃ,
Samādhī na vikampati, appamāṇavihārino.

Taṃ jhāyinaṃ sātatikaṃ, sukhumam diṭṭhivipassakaṃ,
Upādānakkhayārāmaṃ, āhu sappuriso itī ti.

“Whether he is showered with honour,
Shown dishonour, or offered both,
His concentration does not vacillate
As he dwells in the measureless state.

“When he meditates with perseverance,
An insight-seer of subtle view
Delighting in the destruction of clinging,
They call him truly a superior man.”
(Bodhi trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

Appamāṇa by itself...

Vatthasutta (SN. v. 70)

Satisambojjhaṅgo iti ce me, āvuso, hoti, ‘appamāṇo’ti me hoti, ‘susamāraddho’ti me hoti, tiṭṭhantañca naṃ ‘tiṭṭhatī’ti pajānāmi. Sacepi me cavati, ‘idappaccayā me cavatī’ti pajānāmi.

[Sāriputta:]

“If it occurs to me that there is the mindfulness enlightenment factor, it occurs to me that it is measureless, and it occurs to me that it is well undertaken; and while it is remaining I know that it remains; and if it falls away in me, I know that it falls away in me owing to specific conditionality.”

[repeat for the rest of the seven bojjhaṅgas]

(SN v. 70)

Paṭisambhidāmagga commenting on the above (Paṭisam. ii. 127):

Kathaṃ appamāṇo iti ce me hotī ti bojjhaṅgo? Pamāṇabaddhā kilesā, sabbe ca pariyuṭṭhānā, ye ca saṅkhārā ponobhavikā appamāṇo nirodho acalaṭṭhena asaṅkhataṭṭhena. Yāvatā nirodhūpaṭṭhāti tāvatā appamāṇo. Iti ce me hotīti bojjhaṅgo.

“How is there an enlightenment factor thus: ‘It occurs to me that it is measureless’? Defilements are bound up with [the limitation of] measure, and so are all obsessions, and those formations that produce renewed being; cessation is measureless in the sense that it is immobile and in the sense that it is unformed. As long as cessation is established, so long is there an enlightenment factor thus: ‘It occurs to me that it is measureless’.

(Ñāṇamoli trans.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 8, 2016 9:41 PM

Title: Re: I'd feed a starving child before a healthy arahant

Content:

Yes, that's right. What makes the difference is (1) that with saṅghadāna the giver mentally determines that the gift is for the saṅgha as a whole (even though it may be only one bhikkhu who receives it) and (2) that she indiscriminatingly gives it either to the first bhikkhu she sees or to whichever bhikkhu the saṅgha has appointed to receive it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Thai translation help needed

Content:

It's not a full address but just the centre's name and the province:

Sathaan Patibat Tham Nanachat Pa Auk Tawya, Saakhaa Prathet Thai
(Translation: International Dhamma Practice Place of Pa Auk Forest Monastery, Thailand Branch)
Ang Thong Province,
Central Thailand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 7:24 AM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

This sutta isn't talking about the development of the illimitables alone, but about the development of them as the basis for insight development culminating in what Thanissaro translates as "awareness-release" (i.e., paññā-vimutti). So the kammās can only ripen in that life as there isn't going to be another one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 7:32 AM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

It is a translation of puññākiriyaṅkamma, "bases of meritorious activity". In the Suttas (e.g., Puññākiriyaṅkamma-sutta, AN. iv. 241) these are given as three: dāna, sīla and bhāvanā. In the commentaries the three are expanded to ten, though all ten are said to be contained within the three given in the Sutta list.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 7:42 AM

Title: Re: Are some monks asexual?

Content:

As a fair number of humans are asexual (1% according to one British study) and as this isn't a hindrance to ordaining, it's a reasonable assumption that there are probably some asexual monks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 7:50 AM

Title: Re: I'd feed a starving child before a healthy arahant

Content:

Though there are many monastic nikāyas it is generally assumed by Buddhists that all of their ordination lineages extend back to the Buddha's time. So in that sense Buddhist

monastics constitute one sangha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 10:18 AM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

I would suppose so, inasmuch as there won't be much opportunity for akusala kammās to ripen in the *Suddhāvāsa*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 3:48 PM

Title: Re: Thai translation help needed

Content:

Chomrom Phutthakhun. Chomrom means a circle, a gathering or a place where people gather. Phutthakhun is the Thai pronunciation of *buddhaguṇa*, meaning the nine special qualities of the Buddha. It's the name of a Burmese-inspired Buddhist organization in Bangkok.

<https://web.facebook.com/ChmrmPhuththkhun>

<http://www.puthakun.org/>

Both pages are Thai-only.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 3:54 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

For a commentary-informed account of this (and your later questions), see Mahasi Sayadaw's *Brahmavihāra Dhamma*, available from Ven. Pesala's website.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 4:21 PM

Title: Re: Are some monks asexual?

Content:

Sexual desire isn't the only reason why a monk might disrobe. Here are a few others that I've known of:

- Boredom.

- Loss of faith.
- Ill health.
- Inability to observe the Vinaya.
- Despair at one's ability to progress.
- Parental pressure.
- Temptation resulting from the monk's receiving a large inheritance.
- The belief that the monastic state is a less than optimal one for teaching Dhamma in the West.
- Some kilesa other than sexual desire; e.g., a musically inclined monk might miss music or a gourmet monk might miss the kind of food that he likes. Many Thai monks disrobe because they want to do boxing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2016 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

It isn't simply that. You are making the same mistake as Ajahn Thanissaro (in One Tool Among Many) when he claims that the Buddha never told his disciples: "Go do vipassanā!" The compilation you've made, and from which you (and Thanissaro before you) draw your conclusions, consists only of a handful of extracts from suttas that happen to contain the noun vipassanā. But to be anything like a comprehensive survey you would need to cover also those containing the verb vipassati, not to mention the hundreds of suttas where insight is expounded without using either of these words (e.g., any sutta containing phrases like: "X should be seen as it really is with right understanding").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 12:10 AM

Title: Re: First Jhāna Vitakka in Early Buddhism

Content:

They should display if you set your browser to Unicode-8 encoding and your font settings to a Unicode font that includes Chinese characters.

Anyhow, they are...

jue and nian.jpg (18.56 KiB) Viewed 2649 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 8:22 AM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

I didn't mean to imply that you were. Only that like Thanissaro you base your conclusions upon too brief a compilation and one that doesn't take into account the full range of vipassanā-relevant teachings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 8:39 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

There is no chance, since none of the eligible Somdets is a Wat Dhammakaya monk. The closest would be the abbot of Wat Paknam, the temple in Thonburi where the founders of Wat Dhammakaya learned the sammā arahaṃ meditation method.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 11:16 AM

Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?

Content:

My own compilation would include, for example, three of the five vaggas of the Saṃyutta Nikāya (i.e., the Nidāna-, Khandha- and Saḷāyatana-vaggas), along with much of the SN's Mahāvagga. The aforesaid are concerned with little else but vipassanā-bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 1:39 PM

Title: Re: Stephen Batchelor's "After Buddhism." Yale University Press, 2015

Content:

It's clear from chapter 3 that Batchelor is quite aware of the traditional account: "Whether we accept the traditional account of the awakening as having occurred in the course of one moonlit night beneath a pipal tree in Uruvelā (Bodh Gaya)..." but doesn't agree with it: "... or we accept what I think is the more likely course, that it occurred gradually over many years of studying, learning, reflecting, discussing, arguing, and meditating in various groves and cities throughout northern India..." and has substituted a conception of awakening that's probably informed more by his training in Korean Zen than by his study of the Suttas. On the whole the book seems to be his most strongly Zen-influenced one since The Faith to Doubt.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 10:44 PM
Title: Re: Shipping gifts to monastics
Content:
The merit wouldn't be affected.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jan 10, 2016 11:05 PM
Title: Re: About "Female & Male"
Content:
I'm quite sure that there isn't any textual support for this claim. It was one of Ajahn Buddhādāsa's quirkier notions that the Hindu use of 'dharma', in the sense of one's caste-based social duty, applied in Buddhism also. As far as I know this was a claim that he made simply on his own authority and without citing any Sutta in support of it.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 7:21 AM
Title: Re: Ways of making significant good kamma?
Content:
There is no need to be more specific (let alone to respond to your sarcasm). It is evident from those suttas containing such words and phrases as 'vipassanā', 'vipassati', 'yathābhūtaṃ pajānāti' etc., that vipassanā is intimately and essentially bound up with the aggregates, elements, sense-bases, dependent arising, and the comprehension thereof. Therefore any suttas on these matters are vipassanā-related suttas. Hence the whole of the three named vaggas from the SN are relevant.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 11:14 AM
Title: Re: Can you follow the Noble Eight Fold Path by just observing the breath?
Content:
Sammā-samādhi is what the translator has chosen to render as "right rapture", though it's a use of "rapture" that's probably informed by the translator's reading of Christian contemplative writings <http://sacred-texts.com/chr/tic/tic21.htm>, rather than its everyday sense.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 11:48 AM
Title: Re: Are dead bodies more heavier than the live body?
Content:

Yes to both, but in the sense of their being more sluggish or less sluggish (the primary old Indic sense of garu and lahu) rather than of their being greater or lesser in mass (the sense in which these terms might be used by a physicist).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 12:57 PM

Title: Re: Can you still ordain at age 50?

Content:

There is no upper age limit in the Vinaya. Certain monasteries set their own limit, but only a small number. See this thread:

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=30&t=24968>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 1:02 PM

Title: Re: Pali Dictionaries

Content:

I would think he is probably referring to the dictionary of Robert Caesar Childers, though it's publication date is actually 1872-5. An online copy:

<https://archive.org/details/adictionaryplil00chilgoog>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Can you follow the Noble Eight Fold Path by just observing the breath?

Content:

The speaker is actually Ven. Kumārakassapa, not the Buddha.

I would think that in this sort of context (i.e. a rather propaedeutic exposition of the Dhamma) the right view referred to would be the “accompanied by āsavas” kind: “There is what is given, sacrificed, and offered; there is fruit and result of good and bad actions; there is this world and the other world; there is mother and father; there are beings spontaneously reborn; there are in the world ascetics and brahmins of right conduct and right practice who, having realized this world and the other world for themselves by direct knowledge, make them known to others.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 11, 2016 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Music legend David Bowie dies

Content:

There's one inaccuracy in it. It wasn't Trungpa but another Karmakagyu teacher, Chime Rinpoche, who told him to forget Buddhism and just follow music.

WITHOUT TIBET HOUSE, there may never have been a David Bowie.

Young David Jones was 13 when he developed an interest in Buddhism after reading "The Rampa Story" by T. Lobsang Rampa. Over the next four years, his interest in Buddhism and Tibet grew until he was visiting the Tibet House in London up to four times a week.

"One day, I walked into the office and it was empty," Bowie said, calling from his New York office. "I went down the stairs and saw a man in saffron robes. He said, in very broken English, 'You are looking for me.' I realized years later that it was a question, but as a 16-year-old, I took it as a statement: 'You are looking for me.'"

The man in the saffron robes, Chime Yong Dong Rinpoche, became Jones' guru for several months.

"After a few months of study, he told me, 'You don't want to be Buddhist,'" Bowie said. "He said, 'You should follow music.'"

<http://www.newsday.com/entertainment/music/stardust-memories-without-tibet-house-david-bowie-never-may-have-gotten-ziggy-with-it-now-the-pop-star-returns-the-favor-by-performing-at-the-annual-benefit-concert-1.396658>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 12, 2016 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Stephen Batchelor's "After Buddhism." Yale University Press, 2015

Content:

Okay, but I didn't mean to suggest that Batchelor was necessarily a reliable spokesman for the Korean Zen tradition — something I'm unqualified to judge; moreover, in the "Great Doubt" chapter of Confession of a Buddhist Atheist he cheerfully admits that he isn't. What I wrote would probably have been better expressed: "Batchelor has substituted a conception of awakening that's informed by the change in view he underwent during his training in Korean Zen rather than by his present study of the Suttas."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 12, 2016 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Silence Vows

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd4>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 7:00 AM

Title: Re: Silence Vows

Content:

Perhaps you mean this...

Paññā Sutta (AN. iv. 151-5)

“Bhikkhus, there are these eight causes and conditions that lead to obtaining the wisdom fundamental to the spiritual life when it has not been obtained and to its increase, maturation, and fulfillment by development after it has been obtained. What eight?

[...]

(7) “In the midst of the Saṅgha, he does not engage in rambling and pointless talk. Either he himself speaks on the Dhamma, or he requests someone else to do so, or he adopts noble silence. This is the seventh cause and condition that leads to obtaining the wisdom fundamental to the spiritual life when it has not been obtained and to its increase, maturation, and fulfillment by development after it has been obtained.”

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 7:45 AM

Title: Re: New Translation Project from Sutta Central

Content:

The practice of leaving all of the Pali technical terms untranslated is actually the standard way of translating Pali Buddhist texts in Asia. It was also successfully used (though not quite as consistently as in Asia) by some of the Franco-Belgian translators like Étienne Lamotte and Louis de La Vallée-Poussin.

I wouldn't consider it to be impractical. Though it does have the drawback of making the translated text look overly forbidding and unapproachable to the newcomer, it also has the advantage of allowing the reader to presuppositionlessly build up his own meaning-picture of each term solely by considering what the texts have to say about it, rather than having this picture distorted by the irrelevant connotations found in some word from his native tongue.

I wish Sutta Central would do it this way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 12:25 PM

Title: Re: masturbation what's wrong?

Content:

From Wikipedia's entry for John Harvey Kellogg (inventor of the breakfast cereal Kellogg's cornflakes).

Views on Sexuality

[...]

He was an especially zealous campaigner against masturbation; this was an orthodox view during his lifetime, especially the earlier part. Kellogg was able to draw upon many medical sources' claims such as "neither the plague, nor war, nor small-pox, nor similar diseases, have produced results so disastrous to humanity as the pernicious habit of onanism," credited to one Dr. Adam Clarke. Kellogg strongly warned against the habit in his own words, claiming of masturbation-related deaths "such a victim literally dies by his own hand," among other condemnations. He felt that masturbation destroyed not only physical and mental health, but the moral health of individuals as well. Kellogg also believed the practice of this "solitary-vice" caused cancer of the womb, urinary diseases, nocturnal emissions, impotence, epilepsy, insanity, and mental and physical debility; "dimness of vision" was only briefly mentioned.

Masturbation prevention

Kellogg worked on the rehabilitation of masturbators, often employing extreme measures, even mutilation, on both sexes. He was an advocate of circumcising young boys to curb masturbation and applying phenol to a young woman's clitoris. In his Plain Facts for Old and Young, he wrote:

"A remedy which is almost always successful in small boys is circumcision, especially when there is any degree of phimosis. The operation should be performed by a surgeon without administering an anesthetic, as the brief pain attending the operation will have a salutary effect upon the mind, especially if it be connected with the idea of punishment, as it may well be in some cases. The soreness which continues for several weeks interrupts the practice, and if it had not previously become too firmly fixed, it may be forgotten and not resumed."

[...]

"Kellogg thought that masturbation was the worst evil one could commit; he often referred to it as "self-abuse". He was a leader of the anti-masturbation movement, and promoted extreme measures to prevent masturbation. In addition, Kellogg thought that diet played a huge role in masturbation and that a bland diet would decrease excitability and prevent masturbation. Thus, Kellogg invented Corn Flakes breakfast cereal in 1878. He hoped that feeding children this plain cereal every morning would help to combat the urges of "self-abuse".

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Harvey_Kellogg

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 1:53 PM

Title: Re: Stephen Batchelor's "After Buddhism." Yale University Press, 2015

Content:

As noted above, the householders in question were not arahants. In any case, it wasn't the commentarial view that a householder couldn't achieve arahatta, but only that he couldn't achieve it and thereafter remain a householder.

Here is the sutta with Bhikkhu Bodhi's endnote:

"Bhikkhus, possessing six qualities, the householder Tapussa has reached certainty about the Tathāgata and become a seer of the deathless, one who lives having realized the deathless. What six? Unwavering confidence in the Buddha, unwavering confidence in the Dhamma, unwavering confidence in the Saṅgha, noble virtuous behavior, noble knowledge, and noble liberation. Possessing these six qualities, the householder Tapussa has reached certainty about the Tathāgata and become a seer of the deathless, one who lives having realized the deathless."

[repeat for the twenty others]

Note

It is often claimed that this series of suttas testifies to a large number of lay arahants during the Buddha's time. This, however, is a misunderstanding. For we find on this list Anāthapiṇḍika, Pūraṇa (or Purāṇa), and Isidatta, all of whom were reborn in the Tusita heaven (see 6:44 and MN 143.16, III 262,1). We also find Ugga of Vesālī, who is said (at 5:44) to have been reborn among the mind-made deities, and Hatthaka, who is said (at 3:127) to have been reborn in the Aviha heaven of the pure abodes. The terms used to describe these lay followers are descriptive of all noble ones from stream-enterers on up. They all have unwavering confidence (aveccappasāda) in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha, have "reached certainty about the Tathāgata" (tathāgate niṭṭhaṅgata), and are seers of nibbāna, the deathless (amataddasa). See 10:63, where certainty about the Buddha is ascribed to disciples at levels lower than arahantship. The statement that these people have noble liberation (ariyena vimuttiyā) is unusual, but Mp glosses it "by the liberation of the fruit of trainees" (sekhaphalavimuttiyā). Quite a different formula is used to describe an arahant. In the Nikāyas there are no recorded cases of laypeople who attained arahantship and then continued to lead the lay life. Those who do attain it entered upon the homeless life soon after their attainment, like Yasa at Vin I 17,1–3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 2:40 PM

Title: Re: Stephen Batchelor's "After Buddhism." Yale University Press, 2015

Content:
Roger Jackson's review.

[...]

My own chief objection to Batchelor's previous work is that in his quest to justify his particular version of Buddhism, he has, with scant methodological self-awareness and insufficiently rigorous argument, cherry-picked Buddhist literature (especially the Pali canon) for evidence of his views. Unsurprisingly, he has discovered that what he thinks Buddhism ought to be in our era turns out to be what Buddhism was at the beginning, evidence to the contrary notwithstanding. Batchelor's conflation of ideological prescription and historical description—the ought and the is—has probably undermined his credibility with critically informed readers more than his radical prescription for contemporary Buddhism—with which, I suspect, many such readers might in various ways agree.

I'm happy, then, to report that in his latest and most ambitious work, *After Buddhism: Rethinking the Dharma for a Secular Age*, Batchelor makes a sustained and serious attempt to argue for his vision of Buddhism, primarily through a theoretically self-conscious, historically informed, and linguistically nuanced analysis of the Pali canon and other early sources. The book is perhaps not quite the work of "systematic theology" Batchelor claims, but it is a careful, honest, and typically eloquent exposition of what he believes and why he believes it.

[...]

<http://www.lionsroar.com/review-stephen-batchelors-after-buddhism/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 3:02 PM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

These descriptions are from the list of the thirty-two marks of a mahāpurisa. Was it also normal for the ancient Aryans to have forty teeth, sheathed penises and webbed fingers?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 3:55 PM

Title: Re: masturbation what's wrong?

Content:

That masturbation, if not done excessively, is a harmless and blameless enjoyment does in fact appear to be the prevalent view among educated people throughout the developed world, excepting only those with a religious commitment (Roman Catholic, for example) which instructs them otherwise.

I don't think this has any particular effect on these people's practice of the threefold training. If they decide to ordain or to become brahmacāri householders, then they simply take on the monkish perspective on masturbation and stop doing it. (Whether this will be a hard or an easy thing to do doesn't seem to be much affected by what beliefs about masturbation one was raised with). If they remain kāmabhogī householders then the practice (for those who do it) simply persists as one of the various non-transgressive sensual pleasures that they may enjoy from time to time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 5:26 PM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

The marks along with their past causes:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn30>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Silence Vows

Content:

In the Kolita Sutta (SN. ii. 272-4) noble silence is defined as the second jhāna, but the Saṃyutta Commentary then extends the range of the term:

There the Venerable Mahāmoggallāna addressed the bhikkhus thus: “Friends, bhikkhus!”

“Friend!” those bhikkhus replied. The Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said this:

“Here, friends, while I was alone in seclusion, a reflection arose in my mind thus: ‘It is said, “noble silence, noble silence.” What now is noble silence?’

“Then, friends, it occurred to me: ‘Here, with the subsiding of thought and examination, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the second jhāna, which has internal confidence and unification of mind, is without thought and examination, and has rapture and happiness born of concentration. This is called noble silence.’”

Bhikkhu Bodhi's note

Spk explains that the second jhāna is called noble silence (ariya tuṇhībhāva) because within it thought and examination (vitakka-vicārā) cease, and with their cessation speech cannot occur. At 41:6 (IV 293,24-26) thought and examination are called the verbal formation (vacīsaṅkhāra), the mental factors responsible for articulation of speech. But, Spk adds, when the Buddha says “either speak on the Dhamma or observe noble silence” (e.g., at MN I 161,32-33), even attention to a meditation subject can be considered noble silence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 13, 2016 8:58 PM

Title: Re: offering dana - onion and garlic

Content:

It shouldn't be. Although there is a prohibition against bhikkhus consuming garlic (except as a medicine when afflicted with a sickness for which garlic is the only cure) there is also a widely held view that this rule applies only to garlic eaten by itself and not to garlic cooked with other foods. I believe this opinion is universally accepted in the Thai forest tradition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 14, 2016 7:52 AM

Title: Re: Relationship with non buddhists.

Content:

Indeed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 14, 2016 7:57 AM

Title: Re: Silence Vows

Content:

There might in English be broad everyday uses of "thought" in which perceptions and feelings would be included, but in the above sutta "thought" is used to translate vitakka which neither is nor contains feeling or perception.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 14, 2016 9:11 PM

Title: Re: offering dana - onion and garlic

Content:

I doubt it, for Thai monks love garlic and as the Forest Sangha monks are often fed by Thai laypeople I should imagine that they too wouldn't have any problem with it (though Ven. Gavesako would be better placed than I to answer this).

As far as I know it's only East Asian Mahayana monks who would decline a food offering containing onions or garlic. For them the consumption of these is prohibited both in their recension of the Vinaya and by their Bodhisattva vows, and without the Theravadin loophole for cooked garlic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2016 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a sutta

Content:

I think you mean Dhammapada 294-5, though misremembered somewhat. It's not about attachment to one's parents, but rather that mother and father are metaphors for craving and conceit.

Mātaraṃ pitaraṃ hantvā, rājāno dve ca khattiye,
Raṭṭhaṃ sānucaraṃ hantvā, anīgho yāti brāhmaṇo.

Mātaraṃ pitaraṃ hantvā, rājāno dve ca sotthiye,
Veyagghapañcamaṃ hantvā, anīgho yāti brāhmaṇo.

Having slain mother (craving), father (self-conceit), two warrior-kings (eternalism and nihilism), and destroyed a country (sense organs and sense objects) together with its treasurer (attachment and lust), ungrieving goes the holy man.

Having slain mother, father, two brahman kings (two extreme views), and a tiger as the fifth (the five mental hindrances), ungrieving goes the holy man.
(Buddharakkhita tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2016 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Any named female devas in the Tipitaka?

Content:

No. It means that anyone reborn as Brahma will not be female in that life. It would probably have been better to translate purisa and itthī as 'male' and female' here, for although 'man' and 'woman' are literally correct they are liable to lead to just such a misunderstanding owing to these terms applying to humans only in English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2016 11:09 AM

Title: Re: Any named female devas in the Tipitaka?

Content:

According to the Sammohavinodanī the faculties of masculinity and femininity (two kinds of rūpa dhamma) arise only in beings of the sense-sphere. This would mean that Brahmas, strictly speaking, are sexless. Nonetheless they are conventionally designated 'male' on account of their presenting a male appearance — an appearance that includes the presence of non-functioning male genitalia.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2016 11:36 AM

Title: Re: How does monks memorise Sutta?

Content:

There have been some non-Burmese monks who've taken the Dhammacariya and Vimamsa exams, so I imagine they'd be allowed to take the Tipitakadhara one if they wanted to. But I don't think it's likely to happen, since (as far as I know) outside of Burma there's no living tradition of memorizing even a single Nikāya, let alone the whole Tipitaka. Even within Burma a monk needs to go to one of several monasteries that specialize in memorization-training (and where they do almost nothing else) and such training has to start from early childhood. But non-Burmese who go to study in Burma are usually already over twenty, making it too late to embark upon such a course.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2016 12:38 PM

Title: Re: How does monks memorise Sutta?

Content:

I don't know if they're allowed to, but no layman ever has.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 16, 2016 7:38 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Scriptures prophesizing Prophet Muhammad.

Content:

In his mystical writings (the Commentary on the Forty Hadith, for example) the ayatollah undoubtedly had some astute and insightful things to say about the contemplative life that may well have been born of personal experience. Nonetheless I rather doubt that he "meditated at all times". For example, do you suppose the ayatollah was meditating while he was busily urging the killing of Jews, Baha'is, members of the People's Mujahedin, and Salman Rushdie?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 16, 2016 3:56 PM

Title: Re: Two branches of the same tree

Content:

It certainly isn't orthodox Theravada, but one will hear it from many a Mahayana Buddhist who's been influenced by either the Tathāgatagarbha Sūtras or the Japanese <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hongaku> concept, or by both. And considering how much of a melting pot western Buddhism is, it wouldn't be too surprising to find Theravadin teachers spouting the same spiel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 17, 2016 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Enlightenment from giving

Content:

It's a poor translation and needs to be corrected before it is interpreted.

Pali: "Macchariyānaṃ pahānāya samucchedāya brahmacariyaṃ vussati.

Thanissaro: "With the abandoning and eradication of the five forms of stinginess, the holy life is fulfilled."

Thanissaro appears to have taken pahānāya and samucchedāya (the nouns pahāna and samuccheda in the dative case) to be absolutive forms of the verbs pajahati and samucchindati. But the actual absolutive forms would be pahāya and samucchetvā.

As for vussati, I'm not sure what Thanissaro has taken it to be, but it is in fact the verb vasati (to live) in the passive voice.

Bhikkhu Bodhi renders the line correctly:

Bodhi: "The spiritual life is lived for the abandoning and eradication of five kinds of miserliness."

How to interpret it? I don't think there's very much to say really. It's just one of numerous Anguttara suttas that enumerate the various defiled states for whose abandoning the brahmacariyā is lived.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 18, 2016 2:02 PM

Title: Re: Teacher claims to receive teachings from Brahma god

Content:

The page, and indeed the entire site, appears to be in Sinhalese – a language familiar to only a few of our regular posters. Have you anything relevant in English?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 18, 2016 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Doubting supernatural side of Buddhism

Content:

Vern Lovic — a Thailand-based writer, photographer, meditator and snake-conservationist.

<http://www.vernlovic.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 12:05 AM

Title: Re: What Ahosi kamma really is?

Content:

That's true of the peroration to the sutta, but not of what Ven. Mahākoṭṭhita says before he gets to the peroration, i.e., his referring to various kinds of kamma, denoted according to whether, when and how each kind will ripen. One of those kinds is called "an action [whose result] is not to be experienced (avedaniya kamma)".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 9:41 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

I wrote a little on this matter two years ago:

<http://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=14&t=339&start=120#p266510>

I don't expect his appointment to have much impact. Firstly he's in his nineties, so is unlikely to be in the job very long. Secondly, as best as I can gauge, the man's a diplomat and negotiator at heart and as such is more concerned with promoting harmony between competing factions than with taking sides. Thirdly, he'll be so busy with social duties that much of his power will have to be delegated to other Wat Paknam monks, some of whom are not at all enamoured with Wat Dhammakaya. Fourthly, even if some other Somdet were to get the top job, I'm pretty sure Wat Dhammakaya would just go overboard to corrupt him too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Visiting Tailand

Content:

That would depend on how much free time you have (i.e. it wouldn't be much use to drive all that way if you weren't going to spend at least a week there) and how important it is to you to go to this monastery in particular (as opposed to, say, one of the forest wats in Lamphun Province itself). Having spent five years in Lamphun during my first stay in Thailand, my own recommendation would be that you take a one-hour drive south-east and pay a visit to Sayadaw Gandhasāra at Wat Tha Ma O in Lampang or a one-hour drive south to see Ajahn Sanit at Wat Huai Bong in the Li District of Lamphun. But if it's particularly an Ajahn Chah wat that you're looking for (or at least a samnak where monks in that tradition like to stay) then I know there are at least 3 such places in Lamphun. I can't remember their names now, but Ajahn Sanit could probably help you out here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 1:19 PM

Title: Re: Is this a betrayal?

Content:

Do you mean in the future during the present life or in a post-mortem future life?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 4:31 PM

Title: Re: Vinaya-Piṭaka Mahā-Vibhaṅga translation by Ven Suddhaso

Content:

The Mahāvibhaṅga is only concerned with the Bhikkhu and Bhikkhuni Patimokkhas. The rule about displaying psychic powers to the unordained is outside the Pātimokkha and found in the Vinaya's Cūḷavagga.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd15>

Scroll down to:

Now at that time a block of sandal-wood of costly choice sandal-wood had accrued to a (great) merchant of Rājagaha...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2016 5:30 PM

Title: Re: Vinaya-Piṭaka Mahā-Vibhaṅga translation by Ven Suddhaso

Content:

I don't know anyone who has, but if one were to count every single procedural instruction (i.e. for ordinations, confession, uposatha, kathina, etc.) in the Mahāvagga and Cūḷavagga as a "rule", then the total would be at least in the hundreds and possibly a thousand or two.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 20, 2016 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Practicing true patience

Content:

Dhammapāla' Eleven Reflections for Fortifying Patience

1. Ete sattā khantisampattiyaṃ abhāvato idhaloke tappanti, paraloke ca tapanīyadhammānuyogato.

“Those beings who lack patience are afflicted in this world and apply themselves to actions which will lead to their affliction in the life to come.”

2. Yadipi parāpakāranimittaṃ dukkhaṃ uppajjati, tassa pana dukkhassa khettabhūto attabhāvo bījabhūtañca kammaṃ mayāva abhisaṅkhataṃ.

“Although this suffering arises through the wrong deeds of others, this body of mine is the field for that suffering, and the kamma which is its seed was sown by me alone.”

3. Tassa ca dukkhassa āṇaṇyakāraṇametam.

“This suffering will release me from the debt of that kamma.”

4. Apakārake asati kathaṃ mayhaṃ khantisampadā sambhavati.

If there were no wrong-doers, how could I accomplish the perfection of patience?”

5. Yadipāyaṃ etarahi apakārako, ayaṃ nāma pubbe anena mayhaṃ upakāro kato.

“Although he is a wrong-doer now, in the past he was my benefactor.”

6. Apakāro eva vā khantinimittatāya upakāro.

“A wrong-doer is also a benefactor, for he is the basis for developing patience.”

7. Sabbepime sattā mayhaṃ puttasadisā, puttakatāparādhesu ca ko kujjhissati.

“All beings are like my own children. Who becomes angry over the misdeeds of his own children?”

8. Yena kodhapisācāvesena ayaṃ mayhaṃ aparajjhati, svāyaṃ kodhabhūtāveso mayā vinetabbo.

“He wrongs me because of some residue of anger in myself; this residue I should remove.”

9. Yena apakārena idaṃ mayhaṃ dukkhaṃ uppannaṃ, tassa ahampi nimittaṃ.

“I am just as much the cause as he for the wrong on account of which this suffering has arisen.”

10. Yehi dhammehi apakāro kato, yattha ca kato, sabbepi te tasmim eva khaṇe niruddhā kassidāni kena kopo kātabbo.

“All those dhammas by which wrong was done, and those to whom it was done—all those, at this very moment, have ceased. With whom, then, should you now be angry, and by whom should anger be aroused?”

11. Anattatāya sabbadhammānaṃ ko kassa aparajjhati.

Since all dhammas are not self, who can do wrong to whom?"

(Paramatthadīpanī, 298)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2016 4:07 AM

Title: Re: Hello from Wyoming, USA

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel, and thanks for the nice expansive introduction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2016 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Is this a betrayal?

Content:

No. He might betray her either by infidelity or by abandoning her after promising not to do so [i.e. in the present life]. But a vow to the effect: "I will love you and be with you forever [i.e. throughout our future lives]" is not really a vow at all. That is to say it's not an earnest and sober contractual undertaking that might actually be fulfilled. Rather, it's something that in the very nature of things cannot be fulfilled and as a speech-act is typically no more than a hyperbolic declaration of the ardour the lover presently feels.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2016 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Is this a betrayal?

Content:

No, for as I've already said it's not a vow but a different sort of speech act. It happens to take the form of a vow but in fact serves a different performative function. For other examples of this see the article below.

8. I promise not to bore you with my lecture.

This is not in fact a commitment speech at all. For a successful speech act one must, among other things, be in the position to realize what one promises. But what one 'promises' in is to produce a certain effect in the hearer that is, of not being bored; however, it is outside the power of the speaker to guarantee such an effect. I would like to call such cases optatives; they express the wish to produce a certain effect in the hearer or hearers.

Optatives are double-edged. They on the one hand bind the speaker to a certain course of action and in the other convey to the hearer the information that the speaker has so bound himself. What differentiates them from commitment is that the proposition of the speech acts is something which cannot be realized by the speaker but is dependent on a subjective reaction of the hearer. The question of the hearer's reaction to the speaker's utterance is important in other cases as well which then lead to speech act not being successful.

https://www.uni-due.de/~lan300/08_A_Promise_is_a_Promise_%28Hickey%29.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2016 6:57 PM

Title: Re: What is this chanting style?

Content:

It sounds typically Sri Lankan to me, though it might also be one of the styles used by Indian Ambedkarite Buddhists, which also tend to have a sing-song melody to them. If no one here can tell you the name of the style you might try enquiring of Ven. Anandajoti via his Facebook page.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2016 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Abhassara Brahma

Content:

The mere fact that a being happens to be an Ābhassara Brahmā doesn't allow one to draw any conclusion as to whether he still has the fetter of byāpāda, for some of them may have attained sotāpatti or sakadāgāmitā as humans and then anāgāmitā after rebirth in the Ābhassara. Others may be worldlings with all ten fetters fully intact.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Is it possible and would be ok to become a monk with a serious mental problems

Content:

There are many monasteries where you could live as a layman observing the eight precepts and without being required to ordain. I think that might be the best way for you to start.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 9:36 AM

Title: Re: What is this chanting style?

Content:

I've just been discussing this with Ven. Anandajoti. Though neither of us can identify the style, one thing we noticed is that it's not actually the monks in the video who are doing the chanting. Watch it again and you'll see that the chanting continues even while the monks are prostrating. And so the appearance of the monks wouldn't be relevant to identifying the chanting style.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 11:03 AM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

Envy (issā) is resentment at the fact that they have it and you don't. As envy always arises in an aversion-rooted consciousness, and as every aversion-rooted consciousness has sadness of mind (domanassa) as its concomitant feeling, disappointment always goes hand in hand with envy. It isn't, however, identical to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 1:33 PM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

I agree.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 1:54 PM

Title: Re: Thailand's Bhikkhunis

Content:

She's of Chinese descent and the temple was founded by her mother Voramai (Bhikṣuṇī Tatao Fatzu), a Taiwan-ordained Mahayana nun. The Mahayana statuery was there before Dhammānandā took over. Though as Mike remarked, its presence would be unremarkable in a modern Thai wat even if it weren't for this history.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2016 4:56 PM

Title: Re: Om Mani Padme Hum in Pali?

Content:

It would be the same as in Sanskrit except for a shortening of the vowel in the last word. Sanskrit: Oṃ maṇi padme hūṃ.

Pali: Oṃ maṇi padme huṃ.

Also 'padume' would be the more regular Pali form for the third word, though one might shorten it to 'padme' metri causa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 9:25 AM

Title: Re: Abhassara Brahma

Content:

Your chart seems to be faulty. The destruction by wind is correctly represented but the chart presents the Parittābhā and Appamāṇābhā Brahmā-worlds as surviving the destruction by fire and the Parittāsubhā and Appamāṇāsubhā Brahmā-worlds as surviving destruction by water. Neither of these is the case:

“Herein, there are three kinds of contraction: contraction due to water, contraction due to fire, and contraction due to air (see MN 28). Also there are three limits to the contraction; the Ābhassara (Streaming-radiance) Brahmā- world, that of the Subhakiṇha (Refulgent-glory), and that of the Vehapphala (Great-fruit). When the aeon contracts owing to fire, all below the Ābhassara [Brahmā-world] is burnt up by fire. When it contracts owing to water, it is all dissolved by water up to the Subhakiṇha [Brahmā-world]. When it contracts owing to air, it is all demolished by wind up to the Vehapphala [Brahmā-world].”

(Path of Purification VIII 30)

Here's the account in full:

[./download/file.php?id=2886](#)

(127.51 KiB) Downloaded 98 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 9:30 AM

Title: Re: Buddha and anger

Content:

Something like that. Here's a relevant discussion from the Milindapañha:

‘Venerable Nāgasena, it was said by the Elder Sāriputta, the commander of the faith: “The Tathāgata, brethren, is perfect in courtesy of speech. There is no fault of speech in the Tathāgata concerning which he should have to take care that no one else should know it.” And on the other hand the Tathāgata, when promulgating the first Pārājika on the occasion of the offence of Sudinna the Kalanda, addressed him with harsh words, calling him a useless fellow [...] Now if the first statement be correct, the allegation that the Tathāgata called Sudinna the Kalanda a useless fellow must be false. But if that be true, then the first statement must be false. This too is a double-pointed problem now put to you, and you have to solve it.’

‘What Sāriputta the Elder said is true, O king. And the Blessed One called Sudinna a useless fellow on that occasion. But that was not out of rudeness of disposition, it was merely pointing out the real nature (of his conduct) in a way that would do him no harm. And what herein is meant by “pointing out the real nature.” If any man, O king, in this birth does not attain to the perception of the Four Truths, then is his manhood (his being born as a man) in vain, but if he acts differently he will become different. Therefore is it that he is called a useless fellow. And so the Blessed One addressed Sudinna the Kalanda with words of truth, and not with words apart from the facts.’

‘But, Nāgasena, though a man in abusing another speaks the truth, still we should inflict a small fine upon him. For he is guilty of an offence, inasmuch as he, although for something real, abused him by the use of words that might lead to a breach (of the peace).’

‘Have you ever heard, O king, of a people bowing down before, or rising up from their seats in respect for, or showing honour to, or bringing the complimentary presents (usually given to officials) to a criminal?’

‘No, if a man have committed a crime of whatever sort or kind, if he be really worthy of reproof and punishment, they would rather behead him, or torture him, or bind him with bonds, or put him to death, or deprive him of his goods.’

‘Did then the Blessed One, O king, act with justice or not?’

‘With justice, Sir, and in a most fit and proper way. And when, Nāgasena, they hear of it the world of men and gods will be made tender of conscience, and afraid of falling into sin, struck with awe at the sight of it, and still more so when they themselves associate with wrong-doers, or do wrong.’

‘Now would a physician, O king, administer pleasant things as a medicine in a case where all the humours of the body were affected, and the whole frame was disorganised and full of disease?’

‘No. Wishing to put an end to the disease he would give sharp and scarifying drugs.’

‘In the same way, O king, the Tathāgata bestows admonition for the sake of suppressing all the diseases of sin. And the words of the Tathāgata, even when stern, soften men and make them tender. Just as hot water, O king, softens and makes tender anything capable of being softened, so are the words of the Tathāgata, even when stern, yet as full of benefit, and as full of pity as the words of a father would be to his children. Just, O king, as the drinking of evil-smelling decoctions, the swallowing of nasty drugs, destroys the weaknesses of men’s bodies, so are the words of the Tathāgata even when stern, bringers of advantage and laden with pity. And just, O king, as a ball of cotton falling on a man raises no bruise, so do the words of the Tathāgata, even when stern, do no harm.’

‘Well have you made this problem clear by many a simile, Very good, Nāgasena! That is

so, and I accept it as you say.’

[End of the dilemma as to the Buddha’s harsh words to Sudinna.]

(tr. Th. Rhys Davids)

And here's the Vinaya passage that King Milinda was referring to:

“Is it true, Sudinna, that you had sexual intercourse with your former wife?”

“It is true, Master.”

The Buddha, the Master, rebuked him: “Foolish man, it is not suitable it is not becoming, it is not proper, it is unworthy of a recluse, it is not allowable, it is not to be done. How could you go forth in such a well-proclaimed Dhamma and training and not be able for life to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life? Have I not taught the Dhamma in many ways for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of passion; for the sake of freedom from bondage, not for the sake of bondage; for the sake of non-grasping, not for the sake of grasping? When the Dhamma has been taught by me for the sake of dispassion, how can you be intent upon passion? When the Dhamma has been taught by me for the sake of freedom from bondage, how can you be intent upon bondage? When the Dhamma has been taught by me for the sake of non-grasping, how can you be intent upon grasping? Friend, has not the Dhamma been taught in many ways by me for the waning of passion, for the subduing of intoxication, for the restraint of desire, for the abolition of clinging, for the annihilation of the round of existence, for the destruction of craving, for fading away, for cessation, for extinguishment? Have I not in many ways declared the abandoning of sense pleasures, the full understanding of the perception of sense pleasures, the abolishing of thirst for sense pleasures, the elimination of thoughts of sense pleasures, the stilling of the fever of sense pleasures?

“It would be better, foolish man, for your male organ to enter the mouth of a terrible and poisonous snake than to enter a woman. It would be better for your male organ to enter the mouth of a black snake than to enter a woman. It would be better for your male organ to enter a charcoal pit, burning, ablaze, afire, than to enter a woman. Why is that? Because for that reason you might die or experience deadly suffering, but you would not on that account, at the breaking up of the body after death, be reborn in the plane of misery, a bad destination, the abyss, hell. But for this reason, at the breaking up of the body after death, you might be reborn in the plane of misery, a bad destination, the abyss, hell. Foolish man, you have practised what is contrary to the true Dhamma, the common practice, the low practice, the coarse practice, that which ends with a wash, that which is done in private, that which is done wherever there are couples. You are the forerunner, the first performer of many unwholesome things. It will not give rise to confidence in those without it, nor increase the confidence of those who have it, but it will hinder confidence in those without it and it will cause some with confidence to change their minds.”

(tr. I.B. Horner)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 2:09 PM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

I'll reply later today. I just need to look up a definition...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 11:07 PM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

There is a difference of opinion among teachers of Abhidhamma on this point. Suppose that Bill, a low-paid unskilled worker, observes that Fred, his wealthy stockbroker neighbour, has just bought himself a brand new Ferrari. Each time Bill thinks about Fred and his Ferrari various unwholesome mental factors arise:

1. Sometimes he craves a Ferrari of his own.
2. Sometimes he wants to have Fred's Ferrari.
3. Sometimes he resents Fred on account of his possession of something that he himself lacks (and is unlikely to obtain).
4. Sometimes his resentment is directed at the situation, i.e. a state of affairs in which another person possesses something that he doesn't. If he's a petulant socialist type, for example, he might deem it an "injustice" that Fred gets to ride around in a Ferrari while he himself must make do with a 1970 Volkswagen.

Now all ābhidhammikas would agree that #1 is ordinary greed (lobha) and #2 is perverse greed (avisama lobha), otherwise known as covetousness (abhijjhā).

As for the other two, some ābhidhammikas would say that #3 is envy (issā) and #4 aversion (dosa). Others would put it the other way around. And so the difference of opinion here is over the question of whether envy takes a person or a situation as its object.

Those who hold that envy is directed only at persons (this is actually the majority view) would argue along these lines:

1. The mental factor directly opposed to envy is sympathetic joy (muditā).
2. Sympathetic joy, like all the brahmāvihāras, incontestably takes only living beings as its object.
3. In any case where a wholesome and an unwholesome mental factor are directly opposed, their range of possible objects is identical (for if it were otherwise then it would not be possible for the wholesome mental factor to completely displace the unwholesome one, or vice versa. But this is in fact possible).

4. Since sympathetic joy takes only living beings as its object, the possible objects of envy are likewise living beings.

As for the minority view, wherein envy is held to consist in Fred's resentment at the situation, this is defended by appeal to the Abhidhamma's fourfold description of *issā*, which, *prima facie* does seem to indicate that it is Fred's possession of the Ferrari, rather than Fred himself, that is the object of the mental factor:

"Envy] has the characteristic of being bitter about the successes [possessions, prosperity, accomplishments] of another.
Its function is to take no delight in [or be discontented with] the successes of another.
Its manifestation is antipathy on account of that.
Its proximate cause is the success of another."
(Dhs-a. 257)

It seems to me, however, that this argument is not a strong one. It is weakened by the fact that in the fourfold description of *muditā* (a mental factor which nobody disputes takes a living being as its object) the same proximate cause is given as for envy:
"Sympathetic joy has the characteristic of gladness.
Its function is freedom from envying.
Its manifestation is the destruction of discontent [*arati* – another term for *issā*].
Its proximate cause is the success of living beings."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 11:28 PM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

Marrying a woman much younger than oneself doesn't break the third precept but isn't recommended. In the *Parābhavasutta* the Buddha includes it as one of twelve causes of failure in life.

"When a man, past youth, doth wed
A maid with rounded breasts
And cannot sleep for jealousy:
A source of failure that."
(Sn. 110)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 24, 2016 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Pali chants to show respect to teachers

Content:

The sound files are still obtainable via Wayback Machine.

https://web.archive.org/web/20121029173803/http://learningthai.com/sound/chanting_04.mp3

https://web.archive.org/web/20121029173821/http://learningthai.com/sound/chanting_05.mp3

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 12:46 AM

Title: Re: Enlightenment from giving

Content:

Yes, but macchariya is not a form of greed, nor even a mental factor that arises with greed. Rather it's a hate-related mental factor — a loathing of the idea of giving or sharing one's possessions with others.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Enlightenment from giving

Content:

The Buddha used other terms for this, notably, "diligence/negligence (appamāda/pamāda) with regard to wholesome dhammas".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Walking meditation (cankama) in Thai forest tradition

Content:

The instruction may have its source in Dhammapāla's *ṭikā* to the *Visuddhimagga*. In commenting on Buddhaghosa's recommendation that a bhikkhu intent on meditation should reside in a place where the resort for almsfood is located to the north or the south, Dhammapāla explains that this is in order to avoid getting the sun in his eyes when walking to and from the village.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 3:06 AM

Title: Re: Walking meditation (cankama) in Thai forest tradition

Content:

Yes, you're right – I didn't read the OP carefully enough.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 9:28 AM

Title: Re: Is it insulting for non buddhist to have a Buddha tattoo?

Content:

That it's "only Amitābha" isn't likely to make much difference. In those regions where offence might be taken at a Buddha tattoo, few people will be iconographically literate enough to tell an Amitābha tattoo from a Gotama tattoo, or even tell either of these from a tattoo of Mahāvira the Jain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

Yes, though if it's a stream-entrant there would be only the craving and not the envying of Steve. Even in the case of a worldling one can easily conceive situations where a man covets another's wife but without envying her husband. (Confessions of a Window Cleaner and other Robin Askwith bedroom farces from the seventies would be a good fictional example of this. The window-cleaning protagonist isn't in the least envious of the husbands whose wives' sexual favours he enjoys; if anything he relishes the fact that he can enjoy these favours while leaving it to the husbands to support the women).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 10:39 AM

Title: Re: Is it insulting for non buddhist to have a Buddha tattoo?

Content:

Mahāvira is recognisable from his nakedness — he doesn't have a robe over his left shoulder as Buddha statues do. As for distinguishing Amitābha from Gotama Buddha, this is a little trickier though the Wikipedia entry gives some indications...

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Amit%C4%81bha#Iconography>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 11:11 AM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

If you mean 'minors' as defined by the laws governing the age of consent, then having sex with them would break the third precept in that they are "women whose use incurs punishment".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 11:19 AM

Title: Re: Envy definition

Content:

I think there was actually a potential source of confusion in my post, namely, my neglecting to state that what the two interpretations are disagreeing about is not a single situation but rather, (1) an occasion when there arises both aversion and envy, and (2) an occasion when there arises aversion alone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 25, 2016 12:32 PM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

Which Sutta?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 26, 2016 8:02 AM

Title: Re: Suttas on walking meditation technique?

Content:

Though they don't actually answer your question, below are the Vinaya passages relevant to the Buddha's allowance for a caṅkama (translated by I.B. Horner as "a place for pacing up and down in") along with various ancillary regulations.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd15>

(Scroll down to: At present, Lord, monks are very ill with their bodies full of (bad) humours...).

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd12>

(Scroll down to: A monk under probation should not sit down on the same seat with a regular monk...).

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd5>

(Scroll down to: Now at that time the Lord was pacing up and down without sandals in the open air...).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

I mean currying favour with monks in positions of power by making huge donations to their wat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 1:11 PM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

Okay, but being a minor and being under someone's protection aren't really equivalent terms. The former is a secular term meaning one who hasn't yet reached the age of sexual consent or the age when one is legally an adult. The Sutta phrase "a woman protected by her mother (father, brother, husband, etc.)" doesn't carry any implications about her age.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 7:05 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

The Majjhima-ṭīkā takes your quotation from the Dvedhāvitakka Sutta to be a description of what the Nettippakaraṇa calls “abandoning by suppression through the power of reflection” (paṭisaṅkhāna-balena vikkhambhana-pahāna). This is a feature of the development of calm /samatha.

Robert, on the other hand, was speaking of the development of insight /vipassanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 9:39 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

The comprehension by insight of the three characteristics takes care of the hindrances of kāmaccanda, byāpāda and kukkuccha. But a complete description of the suppression of the five hindrances in insight development would be:

- First insight knowledge (defining nāma and rūpa): doubt.
- Third insight knowledge (comprehension of the three characteristics): sensual desire, ill will, remorse.
- Fourth insight knowledge (rise and fall): sloth and torpor, restlessness.

Now it may be that it's one of the three characteristics in one of the five hindrances that is the object of insight in the third insight knowledge. However, this wouldn't be in one and the same moment when the hindrance is present. Rather, the object would be a hindrance that has just ceased.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 10:01 PM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

It is, rather, to assert that deliberate suppression is not the only way in which the hindrances may become absent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2016 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Big Buddhist park project upsets southern Thai Muslims

Content:

Though Buddhists are a minority in Pattani, that doesn't mean there aren't a lot of them. In fact there are about 100,000 Buddhists in the whole province. As the province in question is about the size of the English county of Derbyshire or the American state of Rhode Island, most of those 100,000 would be within about an hour's drive of the Buddhist park. In recent years, thanks largely to Saudi funding, there's been no end of new mega-mosques springing up all over the North and Northeast of Thailand, where (except in Mae Hong Son and a couple of other places) Muslims are pretty thin on the ground. In no case that I know of does the Muslim population dwelling within a one-hour catchment area of these new mosques even approach the figure of 100,000. In some it doesn't reach even 1,000. In <http://www.nationmultimedia.com/national/Buddhists-in-Nan-take-a-stand-against-mosque-30255206.html> it's only sixty Muslims! Moreover, construction of several of these mosques has been given the go-ahead despite strong objections from Buddhist locals. In the case of the mega-mosque in Nan, for example, I don't recall Waedueramae and Worawit, or any other Muslim leaders, urging the the province's sixty Muslims to be reasonable, respect the wishes of Nan's 400,000 Buddhists and build something a little less extravagant.

In short, barring the possibility of the Pattani site being Muslim-owned, I am inclined to see the objections raised thus far as just another case of Islamic double standards and grievance-mongering.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 28, 2016 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

Opinions vary.

Some would take "woman protected by her parents" to apply to any woman of any age who is still living in her parents' home.

Some would exclude adult women who, though still living with their parents, have been

given a free rein with regard to relationships.

Some would exclude adult women who are already earning their own living and paying their parents rent, and would pay no regard to her parents' wishes. In other words, they would look upon her parents as her landlords rather than her protectors.

Of these three I'm personally inclined to favour the second.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 28, 2016 7:41 PM

Title: Re: Make partner sexually happy in Buddhism

Content:

As I've never studied the relevant ethnographic data, I'm afraid I can't offer an informed opinion as to the desirability of relationships where there's a large age gap.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 7:03 AM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

There are several suttas (the <https://suttacentral.net/en/mn29>, for example) describing how a man might go forth, achieve some measure of success in bhāvanā (of a kind that falls short of knowledge of destruction of the āsavas), but whose progress is then halted owing to satisfaction with that success. One may conclude from such suttas that the progress described, and the practices which gave rise to it, are not in and of themselves the "path toward vipassanā".

But perhaps our point of disagreement here is really over the meaning of "path toward vipassanā". I would use the term to refer only to those things that are directly the cause for the arising of insight and which cannot do otherwise than give rise to insight. It's my impression that you're using it in a broader sense than this, e.g., that if a person is described as developing insight on the basis of the fourth jhāna, then the efforts that lead to the attainment of that jhāna would also be included by you in the category "path toward vipassanā". I wouldn't classify these efforts so, for it's quite possible (and outside of the Buddha's teaching it's the norm) that the fourth jhāna will not issue in insight.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 9:27 AM

Title: Re: Doubt is fully eliminated only by Arahants?

Content:

This is irrelevant, for Santa was speaking of a case where the smoker does not doubt the harmfulness of smoking.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Shelter at the root of a tree

Content:

Many Thai thudong monks will carry a bottle of paraffin (US 'kerosene') with them. Besides using it as fuel for a lamp you can also leave a circle of it around your sitting place. This repels the crawling bugs. The krot mentioned by Ven. Pesala keeps away the flying ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Addition of diacritical marks

Content:

Mac users can install the EasyUnicode keyboard:

<http://www.tipitaka.org/keyboard/>

Keystrokes

All the Pali and Sanskrit diacritics are produced with the option key:

opt a: ā

opt i: ī

opt u: ū

opt g or k: ṅ

opt c or j: ñ

opt t: ṭ

opt d: ḍ

opt n: ṇ

opt m: ṁ

opt l: ḷ

opt r: ṛ

opt s: ś

opt x: ṣ

opt h: ḥ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Shelter at the root of a tree

Content:

In Thailand thudong monks consider tents allowable and in fact in recent years I've noticed them rapidly supplanting the umbrella and mosquito net as the portable shelter of choice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 11:38 AM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Shelter at the root of a tree

Content:

No, those are the eight things that a monk must have. They are not a limit on what he may have.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Shelter at the root of a tree

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Doubt is fully eliminated only by Arahnats?

Content:

This is obviously not true, for if all smokers thought this then no smokers would ever quit. What you're describing is just one way in which certain smokers try to suppress the worry they feel about their addiction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2016 1:18 PM

Title: Re: Shelter at the root of a tree

Content:

It might be better if venerables Pesala, Gavesako or Kumāra weighed in here as property-ownership is quite a heavily disputed area of Vinaya and I don't myself have

any expertise in it. Certainly the Vinaya prohibits the saṅgha from giving any of its collectively owned land or dwellings to be owned by an individual bhikkhu, but I gather there's some disagreement about whether this should be extended to prohibit a bhikkhu's continuing to own land that he had before ordaining or his accepting a donation of land (for his personal use) from householders after ordaining.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 30, 2016 10:45 AM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

Your quotation from Sāriputta does not in fact contradict Robert's point that the path is one of seeing.

Firstly, chandarāgavinaya would be more accurately translated: "the removal of desire and lust".

Thanissaro's decision to translate vinaya as if it were a gerund ('subduing'), when in fact it's a noun of state, gives the false impression that the elimination of chanda and rāga is something that one does, as opposed to being something that happens when dhammas have been correctly seen.

Secondly, if you research how rāgavinaya (along with dosavinaya and mohavinaya) are used in the Suttas, you will see that Sāriputta's statement to the monks may be paraphrased: "Our teacher, friends, teaches Nibbāna." For example:

"The removal of desire and lust [chandarāgavinaya], the abandonment of desire and lust [chandarāgappahāna] for these five aggregates affected by clinging is the cessation of suffering."

(MN. 28)

That it would be a mistake to conclude from Sāriputta's words that the immediate task facing one is to make an active and deliberate effort to squelch one's desires will be evident from any of the numerous suttas expounding the way to rāgavinaya. I'll leave you with one example (it will have to be my last for a few days, for I'm going to be offline while our local satellite receiver undergoes repairs):

"And what, bhikkhus, is the escape in the case of material form? It is the removal of desire and lust, the abandonment of desire and lust for material form. This is the escape in the case of material form.

"That those recluses and brahmins who do not understand as it actually is the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape as escape in the case of material form, can either themselves fully understand material form or instruct another so that he can fully understand material form—that is impossible. That those recluses and brahmins who do understand as it actually is the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape as escape in the case of material form, can either themselves fully understand material form or instruct another so that he can fully understand material form—that is possible."

(MN. 13)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 9:51 AM

Title: Re: The causes for wisdom

Content:

The *ṭikā* does nothing of the kind. On the contrary, it treats the two kinds of suppression as two different things. It states that in the non-arahant defilements may be suppressed by either mundane *jhāna* or by insight. In the case of the former the suppression is effected by the *jhāna* factors, while the path leading to it may entail deliberate acts of suppression of the kind outlined in the *Vitakkasaṇṭhānasutta*. As for suppression by insight (*vipassanā-vikkhambhana*), every instance of this described in the texts consists in the displacement of something *akusala* or flawed or inferior by the arising of some kind of knowledge. There isn't a single case where it consists in the *akusala* thing being suppressed by a deliberate act of will.

Some examples of suppression by insight:

- Perception of permanence (*niccasaññā*) is displaced by the perception of impermanence (*aniccasaññā*).
- Perception of pleasure (*sukhasaññā*) is displaced by the perception of suffering (*dukkhasaññā*).
- Perception of self (*attāsaññā*) is displaced by the perception of not-self (*anattāsaññā*).
- Delight (*nandi*) is displaced by knowledge of disenchantment (*nibbidā*).
- Greed (*rāga*) is displaced by knowledge of dispassion (*virāga*).
- Origination (*samudaya*) is displaced by knowledge of cessation (*nirodha*).
- Appropriation (*ādāna*) is displaced by knowledge of relinquishment (*paṭinissagga*).
- Perception of compactness (*ghanasaññā*) is displaced by knowledge of destruction (*khaya*).
- Accumulation (*āyūhana*) is displaced by knowledge of disappearance (*vaya*).
- Perception of everlastingness (*dhuvasaññā*) is displaced by knowledge of transience (*vipariṇāma*).
- Signs (*nimitta*) are displaced by knowledge of the signless (*animitta*).
- Desire (*paṇidhi*) is displaced by knowledge of the desireless (*appaṇihita*).
- Voluntary adhesion (*abhinivesa*) is displaced by knowledge of emptiness (*suññatā*).
- Voluntary adhesion due to grasping at an essence (*sārādānābhinivesa*) is displaced by insight into dhammas at the level of higher understanding (*adhipaññādharmavipassanā*).
- Voluntary adhesion due to delusion (*sammohābhinivesa*) is displaced by knowledge and vision according to reality (*yathābhūtañāṇadassana*).
- Voluntary adhesion due to reliance [on formations] (*ālayābhinivesa*) is displaced by knowledge of the peril [in formations] (*ādīnava*).
- Non-reflection (*appaṭisaṅkha*) is displaced by reflection (*paṭisaṅkha*).
- Voluntary adhesion due to the fetters (*saṃyogābhinivesa*) is displaced by knowledge of turning away (*vivaṭṭa*).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 10:30 AM
Title: Re: Interpreting the story of Gen Siha's meal
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 11:00 AM
Title: Re: Interpreting the story of Gen Siha's meal
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 11:28 AM
Title: Re: Interpreting the story of Gen Siha's meal
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 12:36 PM
Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti
Content:
One's body is unaffected by weapons, poisons or fire when in nirodha-samāpatti. Even the Rājagirika sect, whose members held that it's possible to die while in this samāpatti, agreed that this could not happen by way of weapons, poisons or fire. The Theravada view at the Third Council is that while in nirodha-samāpatti it's not possible to die by any means whatever.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kv15.9>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 2:09 PM
Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti
Content:

No, it's long extinct. It never seems to been much more than a regional spin-off of the Andhakas (i.e. the school of Andhra Pradesh), so tiny that it didn't even make the list of eighteen.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 12, 2016 5:20 PM

Title: Re: What do experienced lay buddhists or monks do throghout the day?

Content:

It's a Burmese practice based on the Navaṅguposatha Sutta and comprising the usual eight uposatha precepts + mettabhāvanā.

<https://suttacentral.net/si/an9.18> (Sinhala)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2016 6:41 AM

Title: Re: Interpreting the story of Gen Siha's meal

Content:

The assumption here is that General Siha took his Jainism very seriously, with his life governed by Jaina ethics. There are, however, a couple of things that militate against this. Firstly there's the fact that he was in military service, despite being affiliated with a dharma whose right livelihood teachings were so stringent that they prohibited even farming as an occupation for its adherents (lest one accidentally kill a worm or something). Secondly there's the commentarial gloss on 'Nigaṇṭhasāvaka' ('disciple of the Jains'), the term used to describe General Siha whenever he makes an appearance in the Sutta and Vinaya Piṭakas. The interesting thing here is that whenever commenting on this term in connection with Siha the commentators pointedly depart from their usual definition of 'sāvaka'. Normally when a person is described as being 'a disciple of teacher/group X' the commentators will gloss it as 'He listens to and heeds the exhortation of X'. But General Siha is never described in this way; instead his discipleship is described in both Sutta and Vinaya commentaries as consisting merely in his being 'a steward and a giver of the (four) requisites to the Nigaṇṭhas'. Thirdly there's the fact that in the one and only reported encounter between Mahāvīra and Siha the latter does not "listen to and heed" the former's exhortation: he goes to visit the Buddha even though Mahāvīra has warned him not to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2016 7:22 AM

Title: Re: Study guide

Content:

Though to most enquirers I would give the same recommendation as Katavedi and Mike, given your own interests you might find this more meditation-oriented anthology of

greater relevance:

<https://www.amazon.com/Sayings-Buddha-Translations-Nikayas-Classics/dp/019283925X>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2016 9:54 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti

Content:

If you look in Points of Controversy you'll find family tree charts depicting the relationship of the different schools according to three different sources. In the Theravādin chart (based on the Dīpavaṃsa) the Theravāda is simply the original Buddhism out of which all the other schools grew. In the Sarvastivadin chart of Vasumitra the Theravada isn't mentioned. In Bhavya's chart the Vaibhadyavāda is probably the Theravāda (Vaibhadyavāda is the Sanskrit for Vibhajjavāda, the Theravāda's alternative name).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2016 6:03 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti

Content:

It doesn't actually say that. The problem is that the translator has chosen to use 'trance' for both the impercipient attainment (which is available to any worldling who cultivates the fourth jhāna while committed to the wrong view that saññā is the cause of all suffering) and the attainment of the cessation of feeling and perception (available only to a small minority of anāgāmins and arahants).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2016 6:26 AM

Title: Lord Avebury, RIP

Content:

Avebury 2.jpg (88.55 KiB) Viewed 4288 times

Avebury4.jpg (67.61 KiB) Viewed 4288 times

Avebury.jpg (495.07 KiB) Viewed 4288 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2016 9:41 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti

Content:

The attainment is said to be the outcome of a mode of practice called the “development of dispassion towards perception” (saññāvirāga-bhāvanā). The Pali texts deal only very cursorily with this, presumably because it’s deemed to be a wrong practice that leads only to rebirth as an impercipient deva – a rather useless achievement unless you like the idea of spending five hundred aeons as a de facto stone.

In the Sammohavinodanī Buddhaghosa merely states:

“Of the non-percipient beings” means “of the beings lacking perception.” Certain persons, having gone forth in dispensations outside [of the Buddha’s teaching], perceive a defect in consciousness (citta), [thinking]: ‘being greedy, hateful or deluded depends on consciousness; but a state free of consciousness would be beautiful – it would be Nibbāna in the present life.’ They then generate dispassion towards perception (saññāvirāga) and developing the fifth attainment (samāpatti) in conformity with this [view] they are reborn there [i.e., in the realm of the impercipient beings]. At the moment of their rebirth only the aggregate of matter (rūpakkhandha) is produced. If they are reborn standing, they stand only; if sitting, they sit only; if lying down, they lie only. They then remain for five hundred kalpas just like painted statues. After that their bodies disappear and a sense-sphere perception arises leading those [former] devas to realize that their [non-percipient] body has now passed away.
(Vibh-a. 520-1)

Some non-Theravādin writers went into the matter in somewhat more detail. Dan Lusthaus’s Buddhist Phenomenology gives a useful overview of how different schools conceived of the difference between asaññā-samāpatti and saññāvedayita-nirodha-samāpatti. See attached file.

[./download/file.php?id=2924](#)

(219.33 KiB) Downloaded 207 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2016 12:24 PM

Title: Re: Japan may change temple icon to avoid Nazi confusion

Content:

By the time Hitler set about designing the Nazi flag, the runic swastika (as found on the Sæbø sword, for example), along with all the other European forms of the swastika, had long since ceased to serve any but a decorative function. For Europe the swastika no longer symbolized anything. And so Hitler was in effect appropriating not the runic but the Indian swastika (learned of from his dabbling in the writings of Blavatsky and other occultists).

The grotesqueness of such an appropriation lies in the fact that whereas Nazism, like all fascisms, was noted for (indeed virtually defined by) its advocacy of "redemptive violence", all of the Asian religious traditions making use of the swastika have ahimsā as one of their cardinal teachings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 4, 2016 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Need References: Did Siddhartha have an orgy the night he left Kapilavastu?

Content:

I think what you may be referring to is the Vinaya's narrative of the going forth of Yasa. In later poetical biographies of the Buddha the episode not infrequently gets misassigned to Prince Gotama.

Here's the Vinaya account:

At that time in Benares there was a young man of family, the son of a (great) merchant, delicately reared, called Yasa.

He had three mansions, one for the cold weather, one for the hot weather, one for the rains. Being ministered to by bands of female musicians for four months in the mansion for the rains, he did not come down from that mansion. Then while Yasa, the young man of family, was possessed of and provided with the five kinds of sense-pleasures, and was being ministered to, he fell asleep first and his suite fell asleep after him, and an oil lamp was burning all through the night.

Then Yasa, the young man of family, having awoken first saw his own suite sleeping, one with a lute in the hollow of her arm, one with a tabor at her neck, one with a drum in the hollow of her arm, one with dishevelled hair, one with saliva dripping from her mouth, muttering in their sleep, like a cemetery before his very eyes. Seeing this, his peril grew plain, and his mind was set on disregarding it. Then Yasa, the young man of family, uttered a solemn utterance: "What distress indeed, what affliction indeed."

Then Yasa, the young man of family, having put on his golden sandals, approached the door of the dwelling. Non-human beings opened the door, thinking: "Let there be no obstacle for the going forth from home into homelessness of Yasa, the young man of family." Then Yasa, the young man of family, approached the city-door. Non-human

beings opened the door, thinking: “Let there be no obstacle for the going forth from home into homelessness of Yasa, the young man of family.” Then Yasa, the young man of family, approached the deer-park at Isipatana.

At that time, the Lord having risen in the night towards dawn, was pacing up and down in the open air. The Lord saw Yasa, the young man of family, coming in the distance: seeing him, having come down from (the place) where he was pacing up and down, he sat down on an appointed seat. Then Yasa, the young man of family, when he was near, uttered this solemn utterance to the Lord: “What distress indeed, what affliction indeed.” Then the Lord spoke thus to Yasa, the young man of family: “This, Yasa, is not distress, this, Yasa, is not affliction. Come, sit down, Yasa, I will teach you dhamma.”

Then Yasa, the young man of family, thinking: “It is said that this is not distress, that this is not affliction”, exultant and uplifted, having taken off his golden sandals, approached the Lord; having approached, having greeted the Lord, he sat down at a respectful distance. As he was sitting down at a respectful distance, the Lord talked a progressive talk to Yasa, the young man of family, that is to say, talk on giving, talk on moral habit, talk on heaven, he explained the peril, the vanity, the depravity of pleasures of the senses, the advantage in renouncing them.

When the Lord knew that the mind of Yasa, the young man of family, was ready, malleable, devoid of hindrances, uplifted, pleased, then he explained to him the teaching on dhamma which the awakened ones have themselves discovered: ill, uprising, stopping, the Way. And just as a clean cloth without black specks will take a dye easily, even so (as he was sitting) on that very seat, dhamma-vision, dustless, stainless, arose to Yasa, the young man of family, that whatever is of a nature to uprise, all that is of a nature to stop.”
(Vin. i. 14-16, tr. I.B. Horner)

And here’s the Mahāsaṅghika poet-monk Aśvaghoṣa describing the same thing happening to the Bodhisatta:

The king, the father, knew that his son’s mind was certain and could not be changed. He just had to do his utmost to hold him back. “Why the need for more words!”

He increased the exquisite happiness of the five desires with the ladies even more. Night and day suffering was warded off, so that [the Crown Prince] would certainly not wish to go forth.

The ministers in the land came to the Crown Prince and extensively spoke of the rules of propriety, urging him to comply with the king’s command.

When the Crown Prince saw that the king, his father, was sad and wept, his tears flowing, he momentarily returned to his palace. Sitting upright, he pondered in silence.

The ladies in the palace held him dear. They surrounded him and waited upon him. They observed him, gazing at his face. They gazed at him unblinking, just like a deer in the

autumn forest, looking straight at the hunter.

The Crown Prince's whole complexion was like a mountain of real gold. The singing women all looked at him and, listening for his instructions, waited for the expression of his voice. They observed his thoughts with reverence, just as that deer in the forest.

Gradually sunset arrived. The Crown Prince dwelled in the dark night, but his light was very bright, just as the sun shining on Mount Sumeru.

While he was sitting on his seat with the seven precious things, perfumed with fine sandalwood, the multitude of ladies surrounded him and played gandharva music. It was just like the son of Vaiśravaṇa and the many fine sounds of celestial music.

What the Crown Prince had on his mind was the highest happiness of renunciation. Even though [the ladies] brought many fine sounds, they still were not in his heart.

Then the celestial sons of the pure abodes knew that the Crown Prince's time had come, and that he would surely go forth. They suddenly transformed and descended. Disdainful of the multitude of singing women, they caused them all to fall asleep.

The bearing [of the women] was uncontrolled. [With bodies] bent and lax, they showed their ugly appearance. They were numb, their faces alternately turned downward or upward. Their musical instruments were scattered in disarray. Some leaned sideways or had fallen over, and others looked as if they had been dropped into an abyss.

Their necklaces were like dragging chains, and their garments were swathed around their bodies. Some were lying down on the floor, clasping the zither, like someone who is experiencing suffering. Their yellow and green garments were spread out, just like broken karṇikāra flowers.

With loose limbs they leaned against the walls, eyes closed, their shape like a hanging horn-bow. Some held on to a window with their hands and looked like strangled corpses. They groaned incessantly and gasped deeply. They were repugnant, sniveling and salivating.

With disheveled hair they showed their ugly appearance. They looked like mad people. Flower garlands were hanging across their faces. Some were lying face down on the floor, and some were trembling all over, just like a lone shivering bird.

Their bodies bent, they leaned on each other like pillows, hands and feet entwined. Some knit their brows and frowned, and some closed their eyes and opened their mouths. All kinds of bodies were dispersed, scattered about like corpses after an untimely death.

The Crown Prince then sat up and observed the ladies. They had all been utterly majestic before, talking and laughing, their thoughts ingratiating and clever. They had been bewitching and ingenious in seduction, but now they all were repugnant.

“If the nature of woman is such, how can one hold them dear? When bathing and making use of ornaments, they deceive the minds of men. I have understood now! I will certainly go forth, without any doubt!”

(Buddhacarita fasc. I. ch. v, 48-64 tr. Charles Willemen)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 4, 2016 12:32 PM

Title: Re: Dealing with a hardcore JW in my family

Content:

So you can tell your father that if this is true then it's no big deal whether you become a JW or not, for should their religion turn out to be true you'll be sure to take full advantage of the opportunity that Jehovah offers to the resurrected unrighteous goats.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 4, 2016 2:22 PM

Title: Re: What do experienced lay buddhists or monks do throughout the day?

Content:

Sometimes the precept is split into two, as in the ten precepts of a sāmaṇera; sometimes it's a single precept, as in the eight uposatha precepts. I don't know of any particular reason for this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 6, 2016 5:40 PM

Title: Re: Viññāṇaṃ anidassanaṃ & appaṭiṭṭha viññāṇa, 2 types nibbana?

Content:

You have to double the p (appaṭigha), then you'll find it in the DN's Saṅgītisutta and the SN's Sallasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 6, 2016 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Happy Birthday Bhante Dhammanando!!

Content:

Thanks everyone!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 6, 2016 7:41 PM

Title: Re: Tiramisu and precept breaking

Content:

Well, I'm afraid you're mistaken, as even a very cursory survey of the Suttavibhaṅga's adjudications will show you.

Intention is what makes an action a skilful or an unskilful kamma. But moral restraint in the Vinaya has a much broader scope than just avoiding unskilful kammās. It's concerned also with the maintenance of communal harmony within the sangha and harmonious relations between sangha and laity.

Certain kinds of action are objectively disruptive of this; that is, the disruption produced is quite independent of the bhikkhu's intention for doing those actions. The Vinaya rules that prohibit such actions are therefore more likely to be ranked as acittaka than sacittaka (i.e. they'll be rules where the bhikkhu's state of mind and motivation is treated as irrelevant).

In this connection you might also look up the ten reasons the Buddha gave Upāli for his establishing the Pāṭimokkha. It is clear from these that (contrary to a statement in one of your later posts in this thread) there is actually a strong utilitarian component to the Vinaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 7, 2016 10:10 AM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

Shakyamuni images in which he is depicted in a Vinaya-compliant patchwork robe are actually quite common in Tibetan statues and line drawings.

That the Buddha isn't normally shown with a shaven head probably reflects the wish of artists to emphasize his status as a mahāpuruṣa rather than as a śramaṇa. You can't do both: either you make him a skinhead ascetic or you depict him (as far as is artistically possible) in full possession of the thirty-two major and eighty minor marks of a great man; several of the minor marks have to do with his head-hairs.

Having said that, I do recall seeing sketches of a shaven-headed Buddha used as illustrations in a number of 19th century English and American works on the Buddha and his teaching. I think Warren's Buddhism in Translation was one of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 7, 2016 2:40 PM

Title: Re: Tiramisu and precept breaking

Content:

The "very unlikely situation" he refers to concerns a breach of the fifth saṅghādisesa rule,

a prohibition against acting as a matchmaker. Breaking a saṅghādisesa is the next worst thing after committing a defeating offence. Twelve of the thirteen saṅghādisesa rules are sacittaka, but matchmaking is acittaka and the rule prohibiting it can be accidentally broken even by an arahant. The "very unlikely situation" is one related in Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Commentary where an arahant bhikkhu hears that his parents have become estranged and makes efforts to reconcile them (this is something the Vinaya permits). But unbeknownst to the bhikkhu, his parents have in fact already divorced and so his efforts to get them back together technically amount to matchmaking. Since this rule is acittaka the bhikkhu's ignorance of his parents' true state doesn't excuse him and so he has to confess a saṅghādisesa and do a six-day penance for it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 7, 2016 3:01 PM

Title: Re: Tiramisu and precept breaking

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 7, 2016 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Buddha talked to Acharn Mun?

Content:

I suppose the Buddha could if this supposed "primordial citta" was a part of his doctrine. But there's no good reason to think that it was. And if you click on MikeNZ's links to Ajahn Sujāto's blog you'll see there are plenty of reasons to think that it wasn't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 8, 2016 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Tiramisu and precept breaking

Content:

It's not actually Bhikkhu Bodhi's commentary, but rather his paraphrase of the Paramatthajotikā's four factors of transgression:

Surādīnañca aññataraṃ hoti, madanīyapātukamyatācittañca paccupaṭṭhitaṃ hoti, tajañca vāyāmaṃ āpajjati, pīte ca pavisaṭi ti.

Ñāṇamoli:

(1) There is one or other of the things beginning with liquor.

(2) Cognizance of desire to drink an intoxicant is established.

(3) One undertakes the appropriate effort.

(4) When [the intoxicant] has been drunk it is absorbed.

Mahamakut University translation:

1. ของมีนเมา มีสุรา เป็นต้นอย่างใดอย่างหนึ่ง
(something or other intoxicating, starting with surā).

2. จิตคิดอยากจะดื่มของมีนเมา
(citta that thinks and wants to drink something intoxicating).

3. ความพยายามเกิดแต่จิตนั้น
(an effort arises from that citta).

4. ดื่มเข้าไปในลำคอ
(one drinks and swallows).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 8, 2016 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Tiramisu and precept breaking

Content:

No. Ignorance is exculpatory only where it has the effect of cancelling out one or more of the factors of transgression.

For example, when a person squashes a bug that he didn't see, he hasn't broken the first precept because his ignorance of the bug's presence cancels out the two factors of perception of a living being and the intention to kill it. But if he deliberately kills a bug because he is ignorant of the meaning of the first precept and thinks that it only applies to killing humans and mammals, then the factors of transgression would be complete.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 8, 2016 6:13 PM

Title: Re: What, exactly, is "the seen"?

Content:

The diagram leaves one wondering what exactly the man in the Mahāsāropama Sutta was looking for.

Seyyathāpi puriso sārattthiko sārāgavesī sārāpariyesanaṃ caramāno...

“It is as though a man needing heartwood, seeking heartwood, wandering in search of

heartwood...”
(Ñāṇamoli)

“It is like a man walking about aiming at the pith, seeking for the pith, looking about for the pith...”
(I.B. Horner)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 10, 2016 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Favourite quote from the Pali Canon

Content:

And then the Blessed One Vipassī, Arahant and Perfectly Awakened One, recited the Pātimokkha to the community of bhikkhus, thus:

“Patience and forbearance are the highest austerity; ‘Nibbāna is the highest’ say the Buddhas. He is not truly called ‘one gone forth’ who injures others, nor ‘an ascetic’ who harms another.

“The avoidance of all evil; the cultivation of the wholesome; the cleansing of one’s mind: this is the message of the Buddhas.

“Not abusing, not injuring and restraint under the Pātimokkha; knowing moderation in eating, secluded lodgings and exertion in the higher mind: this is the message of the Buddhas.”

(Ovādapātimokkha from the Mahāpādāna Sutta, DN. iii. 49; = Dhp 183-5)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 11, 2016 11:24 AM

Title: Re: Manopubbaṅgamā dhammā - renditions?

Content:

In their insertion of "all" translators are probably being influenced either by the detailed discussion of the Dhp. verses in the Peṭakopadesa or (more likely) by consideration of a closely related passage found in two suttas in the AN's Accharāsaṅghātavagga:

“Bhikkhus, whatever qualities (ye keci dhammā) are unwholesome, partake of the unwholesome, and pertain to the unwholesome, all of them (sabbe te) have the mind as their forerunner (manopubbaṅgamā). Mind arises first followed by the unwholesome qualities.”

“Bhikkhus, whatever qualities are wholesome, partake of the wholesome, and pertain to the wholesome, all of them have the mind as their forerunner. Mind arises first followed by the wholesome qualities.”

(AN.i.11)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 11, 2016 1:44 PM

Title: Re: Manopubbaṅgamā dhammā - renditions?

Content:

Yes, it's remarkable what flights of philosophical fancy readers of Dhp. 1-2 can venture into when they attend only to the first line and overlook the part about speaking and acting with a pure/impure mind and the consequences of this. I remember once listening to an American monk (an admirer of Ñāṇavīra) dilating at great length on the phenomenological importance of understand the priority of mano to dhammā in structural rather than temporal terms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 12, 2016 11:21 AM

Title: Re: is there any good vipassana retreat in india?

Content:

The correct url is <http://www.dalhousietheravadabuddhistretreats.org/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 12, 2016 12:05 PM

Title: Re: the great Nibbana = annihilation, eternal, or something else thread

Content:

Oh come on, you can do better than this. This kind of talk from Maha Boowa and his disciples is just an intellectually lazy tactic for ensuring that the irrationalist tendencies and textually unsupported views of his tradition are quarantined from any possible criticism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 14, 2016 1:44 PM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

I have just uploaded a romanized version of the Royal Siam Tipiṭaka here:

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=0Bw2ZpMqGylXcVUFRSmtPeTJFbUU>

It's one that I made myself by converting the Thai files from <http://www.84000.org>

I haven't proofread it, however, other than checking and correcting phonetically impossible consonant clusters and suchlike. Nor does it seem to have been proofread by the monks at Mahachulalongkorn University who originally scanned and OCR'd the

hard volumes. So I'd say it's in a similarly raw condition to the Sri Lankan digital Buddha Jayanti Tipiṭaka. At most it might come in handy if you want to do a quick and dirty check on alternative readings.

The format is plain text, Unicode encoding, Unix line breaks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 14, 2016 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Dying without attaining Sotapanna

Content:

“Bhikkhus, the Dhamma well proclaimed by me thus is clear, open, evident, and free of patchwork. In the Dhamma well proclaimed by me thus, which is clear, open, evident, and free of patchwork, those who have sufficient faith in me, sufficient love for me, are all headed for heaven.”

(Vammikasutta)

Bhikkhu Bodhi: MA says that this refers to persons devoted to the practice of insight meditation who have not reached any supramundane attainment. Note that they are headed only for heaven, not for enlightenment, though if their practice matures they can attain the path of stream-entry and thus gain assurance of enlightenment. The expression saddhāmattaṃ pemamattaṃ might be rendered “simply faith, simply love” or “mere faith, mere love” (as it sometimes is), but this could not explain the guarantee of rebirth in heaven. It therefore seems obligatory to take the suffix matta here as implying a requisite amount of faith and love, not simple possession of these qualities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 14, 2016 10:43 PM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

The text files are all compressed with <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/7z>.

Mac users should be able to expand them with the Keka program:

<http://www.kekaosx.com/en/>

Windows users with 7z Extractor:

<http://www.7zextractor.com/>

The text file when opened should look like this:

Screen Shot.png (107.3 KiB) Viewed 27474 times

Let me know if you have any problems.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 16, 2016 4:37 AM

Title: Re: Monk gets to the root of Thai problems

Content:

To champion the poor is not to valorise poverty.

I should imagine that what Professor Somrit has in mind are texts like the Cakkavatti-sihanāda Sutta, in which taking care of the poor is prescribed as a royal duty, the neglect of which is likely set off a chain of unwished for consequences.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn26>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 16, 2016 3:46 PM

Title: Re: Global Warming: Recent Data

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 20, 2016 10:09 PM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

It has no bearing on the issue at all, for merely having sex causes defeat for a bhikkhu, whether or not the woman is impregnated by it. In the later evolution of the rule it doesn't even have to be a woman: sex with men or with animals also came to be made into a pārājika offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 5:39 AM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

Yes. Ajahn Brahmalī's translation of the passage is here: <https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-bu-vb-pj1>.

Scroll down to "At one time Sudinna, the son of a prominent merchant, lived in a village called Kalandaka..." for the full story.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Niddesa, Apadana and Petakopadesa. When translation?

Content:

It's the romanised Pali edition. Ñāṇamoli's Piṭaka Disclosure is the only published translation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 12:59 PM

Title: Re: Did God create everything that exists?

Content:

That arahants' actions and speech don't amount to new kamma isn't because they don't think or intend. It's because they're free of the three unwholesome roots.

“Bhikkhus, there are these three causes for the origination of kamma. What three?

Greed is a cause for the origination of kamma; hatred is a cause for the origination of kamma; delusion is a cause for the origination of kamma.

(Nidānasutta, AN. i. 134)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 2:35 PM

Title: Re: Question about jhana

Content:

He is perhaps referring to the Abhidhammic doctrine of the priority of ripening of kammās at the time of death:

1. Weighty kamma
2. Death-proximate kamma
3. Habitual kamma
4. Reserve kamma

On the positive side the attainment of jhāna, and on the negative side the committing of one of the five anantariyaka kammās, are said to take priority over the other three kinds of kamma in determining one's rebirth.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 6:08 PM
Title: Re: Question about jhana
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 7:01 PM
Title: Re: Victims of Communism
Content:

But to judge from the links given in the first and subsequent posts, my impression is that it's Marxist revolutionary communism that the OP has in mind, and not kibbutzim, workers' cooperatives and other voluntaristic movements.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 21, 2016 9:20 PM
Title: Re: Wrong mindfulness
Content:

In the Suttas wrong mindfulness is mentioned but not really defined. The Majjhima Commentary, however, understands it to be the unskilful recalling of things past, as described in the Anuttariya Sutta:

“Here, someone recollects the gain of a son, a wife, or wealth; or else they recollect various kinds of gain; or else they recollect an ascetic or brahmin of wrong views, of wrong practice. There is this kind of recollection; this I do not deny. But this kind of recollection is low, common, worldly, ignoble, and unbeneficial; it does not lead to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, peace, direct knowledge, enlightenment, and nibbāna.”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 22, 2016 12:34 AM
Title: Re: Did God create everything that exists?
Content:

I'm not sure I understand what you're saying here. Do you mean that when the Buddha was teaching, say, the five ascetics in the Deer Park, the ascetics' past kamma magically caused the Dhammacakkappavattanasutta to be uttered by him? That there was no thought or deliberation on the Buddha's part?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 22, 2016 12:50 AM

Title: Re: anti/Natalism

Content:

No. The Jātakas are stories, mostly commentarial, of the Buddha's former lives. The "origin stories" (nidāna) are the narratives in the canonical Vinaya Piṭaka about how each of the Pātimokkha rules came to be laid down. The tradition treats them as historical.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 22, 2016 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Did God create everything that exists?

Content:

Kamma would be quite fittingly called a "magical force" if it were really the case that it had the power to cause arahants to do things to you without any intention on their part! As it is, such a conception of kamma and vipāka has no support whatever in the Buddha's teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 23, 2016 11:01 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Shayne Clarke, Family Matters in Indian Buddhist Monasticisms.

The author is interviewed in the latest Tricycle:

<http://tricycle.org/magazine/rules-for-pregnant-nuns-married-monks/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 23, 2016 7:21 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Not right at the moment. The surprising things Clarke has to say seem to be based mostly on non-Theravadin recensions of the Vinaya that I'm little acquainted with. Having only just received a copy of the book I'll need to read it before I can evaluate the claims he makes in the interview.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 24, 2016 8:44 PM

Title: Re: 3 Exhortations to Ven. Mahakassapa

Content:

Other occurrences of sātasahagata in the Suttas concern the classification of different types of samādhī, but no connection is made with mindfulness of the body in particular.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 24, 2016 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Repulsiveness of food

Content:

Attached is the account of the practice in the Vimuttimaggā. It's similar to the Visuddhimagga's (linked to earlier in the thread) but shorter and with the ten aspects of repulsiveness reduced to eight.

[./download/file.php?id=3063](#)

(134.38 KiB) Downloaded 172 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 24, 2016 9:16 PM

Title: Re: UK leaves EU

Content:

Which of course was the whole idea behind our joining in the first place!

Senior Whitehall official, Sir Humphrey Appleby, explains the dastardly plan to a rather naive MP ...

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 25, 2016 8:19 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kv8.2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 25, 2016 9:29 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

By the way, in case you didn't already know, there is a 3-volume Sinhala translation of the Kathāvatthu by Ven. Paṇḍita Kodāgoda Ñāṇaloka available online.

http://www.aathaapi.net/tipitaka/48.OTAP_KathaVatthu_Prakarana_1.pdf

http://www.aathaapi.net/tipitaka/49.OTAP_KathaVatthu_Prakarana_2.pdf

http://www.aathaapi.net/tipitaka/50.OTAP_KathaVatthu_Prakarana_3.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 25, 2016 2:58 PM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

These are three of the five kinds of anāgāmin. <https://suttacentral.net/en/sn46.3>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 25, 2016 10:33 PM

Title: Re: Metta Training: Wat Phleng

Content:

I dropped in on Ajahn Chatchai some years ago to pose some questions about mettabhāvanā.

I wouldn't count on there being anyone there who speaks English. Though in residential meditation centres there will often be a translator on hand, Wat Phleng isn't this kind of place. It's a tuppenny ha'penny Bangkok funeral temple that happens to have a meditation teacher in residence, Ajahn Chatchai, who leads day-long meditation sessions for the general public once a week.

If you go by taxi make sure that the driver takes you to the right Wat Phleng, for there are two wats of this name in the same district of Bangkok. To distinguish them the larger and more famous one of the late Ajahn Praderm is called Wat Phleng Vipassanā, while the smaller one that you want is called Wat Phleng Bang Phlat. The taxi drivers know it as Wat Phleng Jaran 75 because of its location on the Jaran Sanitwong Road. This is the address:

Phra Mahā Chatchai Rakkhitacitto,
Wat Phleng Bang Phlat (or Wat Phleng Jaran 75)

Soi Phanurangsi, Jaransanitwong 75,
Yi Khan Sub-district,
Bangphlat District,
Bangkok 10701.

พระมหาฉัตรชัย รักชิตจิตโต
วัดเพลงบางพลัด (วัดเพลง จรฺญ๑ ๗๕)
ซอยภาณุรังษี จรฺญ๑สนทวงศ ๗๕
แขวงบางยี่ขัน
เขตบางพลัด
กทม๑ ๑๐๗๐๑

And here it is on

<https://www.google.co.th/maps/place/Wat+Phleng+Bang+Phlat/@13.7948108,100.4861921,17z/data=!4m5!3m4!1s0x30e29bcd988629af:0xca351792368aa34a!8m2!3d13.7948108!4d100.4883808>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 25, 2016 11:02 PM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

Beings subject to rebirth are called “gandhabbas” when they've died and are about to be reborn, but it's not usual to call them that at any other time.

“Sir, we know how the descent of an embryo comes about. Here, there is the union of the mother and father, and the mother is in season, and the gandhabba is present. Thus the descent of an embryo comes about through the union of these three things.’
(Aslāyanasutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 26, 2016 4:10 PM

Title: Re: HAPPY BIRTHDAY COORAN!!

Content:

Happy birthday.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 7:14 AM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Analayo's Lectures on the Madhyama-āgama

Content:

I’m not sure which is to be preferred from a doctrinal point of view, but as far as philology goes “bare” and “purified” are both possible renderings.

Whereas the prefix-modified visuddha and parisuddha are unambiguously concerned with purity, the unmodified suddha has a broader range of meanings, one of which is ‘mere’, ‘simple’, ‘plain’, ‘bare’. In the commentaries it will sometimes be glossed with the delimiting indeclinable particle eva: ‘just’, ‘only’.

For example, the suddhakesā in the Vinaya’s second saṅghādisesa rule is “mere hair” (as contrasted with hair that’s been decorated with garlands, gems or whatever). Or the suddhasaṅkhārapuñja of the Vajirasutta is not a “purified mass of compositions” but a “mere mass of compositions”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 7:51 AM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Analayo and bare attention

Content:

I found his arguments for "direct path" quite convincing. Your objection regarding convolutedness might hold water if the cessation of suffering depended on one's doing each and every thing described in the sutta, but plainly it doesn't, for the Ānāpānassatisutta (for example) makes a complete path out of just mindfulness of breathing.

In my opinion, if there is any fault in Anālayo's presentation it's that he is rather too charitable to the exclusive "only path" interpretation.* Firstly, I think it's questionable whether this is really a faithful paraphrase of any of the five commentarial glosses on ekāyana; secondly, even if I were to agree with Anālayo that the fourth gloss can be paraphrased this way, I would still consider it the least probable of the possibilities offered on account of the huge philological and semantic stretch that it requires.

* In saying that I don't mean to suggest that satipaṭṭhāna is not the only way, but merely that this is unlikely to be what is being said here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 7:56 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

From trusted textual authority. Unless we happen to be Buddhas or highly accomplished jhāna dudes, in which case it would be from recollection of former lives and/or the deva eye that sees the decease and rebirth of beings according to their kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 8:04 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

The gandhabba is nearly always spoken of in conventional rather than abhidhammic terms: it's merely a deceased being approaching rebirth and the kind of specificity that you're asking for simply isn't given.

I think I once came across some Abhidhamma passage which identified the gandhabba with certain cittas in the death-process cittavāṭhi, but I don't recall the details now.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 10:42 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

I think you may be mixing the Sri Lankan folk conception of the cuti- and paṭisandhi-cittas with the Abhidhammic one. In the latter they are not disembodied ghosts in search of a new home but consciousnesses in the mental continuum, just as evanescent as any other citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 11:47 AM

Title: Re: The mechanism of gandhabba

Content:

The arising of the cuti-citta ("cutting-off consciousness") is death. It is this, and not any occurrence in one's body, that marks the end of one's life in that state.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 6:29 PM

Title: Re: UK leaves EU

Content:

If you mean "pesquisas de boca-de-urna", these are "exit polls" in English. "Urna" by itself is a "ballot box".

The national broadcasting media in the UK always commission such polls at general elections, but at the EU referendum they opted not to do so because of the higher than usual chance of getting a wrong result. The problem they faced was that the result in each area was to be reported by local authorities that didn't correspond (geographically or demographically) to the normal general election voting wards, and secondly, because voter allegiance wasn't split along party lines and so pollsters would have needed to base their calculations on a variety of more or less ad hoc assumptions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 27, 2016 6:55 PM

Title: Re: "Moderation in what is beneficial"?

Content:

"What is beneficial" (sappāya) isn't glossed in the commentary to this particular sutta, but in other contexts it's taken to mean either one or another of the four requisites or else some combination of these (most commonly food and medicine).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 27, 2016 9:42 PM

Title: Re: The World's Top Ten Most Generous Countries

Content:

I wouldn't have thought so.

It may nonetheless be of some tangential interest to note that among the first written languages of the Germanic family, Old English does have the distinction of expressing the earliest recorded praise for the virtue of generosity. It's contained in a collection of 9th century kennings illustrating the meaning of the Anglo-Saxon runes. Of the runes ƿ (feoh, 'wealth', = F) and X (gyfu, 'gift', = G) it is said:

ƿ

Feoh byþ frofur fira gehwylcum;
sceal ðeah manna gehwylc miclun hyt dælan
gif he wile for drihtne domes hleotan.

X

Gyfu gumena byþ gleng and herenys,
wraþu and wyrpſcype and wræcna gehwam
ar and ætwist, ðe byþ oþra leas.

"Wealth is a comfort to every man,
Yet every man must share it mightily
If he wishes to meet the Measurer's mercy."

"Generosity is the grace and praise of men,
and warmth and worthship to all exiles:
sustenance for him who is stripped of all else."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 27, 2016 10:31 PM

Title: Re: Buddha's teaching from programmer's view

Content:

This link isn't working.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 27, 2016 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Buddha's teaching from programmer's view

Content:

Thank you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 12:37 AM

Title: Re: The World's Top Ten Most Generous Countries

Content:

That's one of the criteria, but there are two others: rendering assistance to a stranger and being engaged in full-time voluntary work. The top and bottom ten in each group...

Most generous in helping a stranger

Iraq 81

State of Libya 79

Kuwait 78

Somalia 77

United Arab Emirates 75

Malawi 74

Botswana 73

Sierra Leone 73

United States of America 73

Saudi Arabia 73

Least generous

Latvia 33

Slovakia 32

Paraguay 32

Czech Republic 31

Croatia 30

Serbia 28

Madagascar 28

Japan 25

Cambodia 25

China 24

Most generous in donating money

Myanmar 91
Indonesia 75
Australia 73
Malta 73
New Zealand 71
Iceland 70
United Kingdom 69
Norway 67
Netherlands 66
Ireland 66

Least generous

Greece 9
Senegal 9
Palestinian Territories 8
Togo 8
Democratic Republic of Congo 8
Zimbabwe 8
Tunisia 6
China 6
Yemen 5
Morocco 4

Most generous in full-time voluntary work

Turkmenistan 60
Myanmar 55
Indonesia 50
Sri Lanka 49
United States of America 46
New Zealand 44
Philippines 42
Kenya 42
Honduras 41
Ireland 40

Least generous

Cote d'Ivoire 7
Macedonia 7
Romania 7
Bulgaria 7
Yemen 6
Armenia 6

Serbia 5
China 4
Bosnia and Herzegovina 4
Egypt 4

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Mala - Garland or tool

Content:

In fact they are pretty common in SE Asia. Many Thai and Burmese Buddhists use them as an aid when engaged in one or another of the recollection practices (anussati).

In the Vinaya wearing a mālā is considered a breach of the eighth of the ten precepts of a sāmaṇera and so presumably the same would be so with the seventh of the eight householder's precepts. To get around this problem some mālā-wearers in Thailand will make a point of not referring to their mālā as a mālā (and correcting anyone who does call it that), but instead using the term luuk borikam, "preparatory [meditation] beads".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Why First Precept?

Content:

"Sentient beings" is most commonly used by translators of Mahayana texts as a rendering of the Sanskrit word sattva or satva. Pali translators usually render the cognate word satta as "beings", "living beings" or "creatures".

Lexically the "sentient" in "sentient being" doesn't correspond to anything in either the Sanskrit or the Pali word. Rather, it's a translators' explanatory addition, perhaps for the purpose of making it clear that the term includes animals but not plants. In this respect it enjoys a slight advantage over the renderings "beings" and "living beings", which don't make this clear, and over "creatures", which might be misconstrued as limiting it to animals and excluding humans, devas, petas, etc.

Unfortunately the rendering also has the drawback of generating a lot of bootless discussion about the limits of sentience etc., based on the assumption that the word 'sentient' in this context is more semantically pregnant than it actually is.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 11:07 PM

Title: Re: Why First Precept?

Content:

In Pali there are three common terms for living beings: satta, bhūta and pāṇa. Each seems to have a narrow meaning specific to itself and then a broader meaning. In their broader meanings the three terms are synonymous, each of them a term that covers all saṃsāric beings who have been born in any of the thirty-one planes.

When used in their narrow sense:

Satta means animal. (Its Sanskrit cognate is the source of the Thai sat).

Bhūta ("one who has come to be") is synonymous with amanussa ("non-human"), a term that can refer to all beings except humans and animals, but most commonly to those normally invisible creatures that more or less share this world with us; for example, petas, tree devas, mountain devas, nāgas, and suchlike.

Pāṇa literally means "breathing being" and is most often used in connection with the sort of beings that it's possible for humans to kill: animals, other humans, and some kinds of amanussas.

Regarding the translation of these terms, I think "sentient being" would be best avoided altogether. Firstly because of the reason stated in my last post. Secondly because not all of them are in fact sentient: the impercipient devas live out their days without ever experiencing anything at all, yet the commentary to the Mahānidāna states that they are to be included in the phrase sabbe sattā ("all beings") on account of their being subject to the cycle of saṃsāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Mala - Garland or tool

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 28, 2016 11:38 PM

Title: Re: My criticism of english-speaking buddhist

Content:

To quote from Michael Pye's book:

Since translations of the [Lotus Sūtra's] story of the burning house have now found their way into popular anthologies, and since it is rather verbose when given in full, a very brief summary of the story itself will suffice here. A wealthy old man has a great house with only one door. The house is in a decrepit state, and a fire breaks out, threatening to engulf all the man's children who are absorbed in play within the house. The old man calls them in vain, then resorts in desperation to skilful means (fang-pien). Knowing the kinds of things which they all like he calls out that there are goat-carts, deer-carts and

bullock-carts waiting for them outside the door. Upon this they all come scrambling out of the house and are saved from the flames. The three kinds of carts are nowhere to be seen, but instead the old man gives to each one a still more splendid chariot, beautifully ornate and drawn by a white bullock.

The question is then raised, by way of comment on the story, as to whether the old man was guilty of a falsehood. Śāriputra's answer to this is that he was not, but it is not only this judgement which is interesting but also its justification. The emphasis is put not on the fact that the children received a better vehicle than intended, which might after all be taken to cover their failure to receive the specific kinds which were originally promised. Rather, the discrepancy is justified by the fulfilment of the old man's intention to bring them out from the flames. Even if they had not received any cart at all it would have been inappropriate to speak of a falsehood, because the original thought of the old man was: 'I will get my children to escape by a skilful means.'
(Skilful Means: a Concept in Mahayana Buddhism, pp. 27-8)

So, assuming Pye's summary to be accurate, it would seem that the stance attributed to pseudo-Śāriputra in the Lotus Sūtra is that a lie told for a good purpose is not really a lie at all. If that's the case then the sūtra's self-referential assertion of its protagonist's veracity must perforce be an unconvincing one for an adherent of the Theravada (and probably of any of the pre-Mahayana Indian Buddhist schools), for it can be upheld only by embracing the sūtra's departure from the earlier Indian Buddhist understanding of what lying and truth-telling are all about (i.e. that the former occurs with any act of communication that aims to deceive):

The cetanā setting up the bodily and vocal effort to mislead, with the intention of deceiving others, is termed 'musāvāda.' Alternatively: 'musā' is applied to a thing which is not genuine or does not exist, and 'vāda' means the representation of that as actual or true. The characteristic of 'musāvāda' is the volition of one desirous of representing to others an untrue thing as true, which gives rise to a corresponding [bodily or vocal] intimation.
(Dhs-a. 98-9; Expositor I. 131)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 30, 2016 11:04 AM

Title: Re: Is turning to reiki going for refuge?

Content:

In general, in choosing to seek treatment from a particular kind of medical practitioner one would neither be performing any of these five actions towards the practitioner nor viewing his treatment as "one's highest value". Therefore this wouldn't amount to a breach of one's refuge-going.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 3, 2016 5:26 PM

Title: Re: Metta Training: Wat Phleng

Content:

He didn't do so when I was there, but perhaps Anagarika could offer you a more up-to-date picture. I've sent him a note.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 5, 2016 8:12 AM

Title: Re: what do no-selfers think the aggregates are?

Content:

It seems you've got the wrong Rumi. The poster almost certainly means the Persian Sufi poet, Jalal ad-Din Muhammad Rumi, and not the Bangladeshi jihadist, Aminul Islam Rumi.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 5, 2016 8:22 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arhant / Anagami if his body was destroyed while he is in Nirodha Samapatti

Content:

Not according to the Theravada.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 5, 2016 9:36 AM

Title: Re: Interpenetrationality

Content:

I know little about Buddhist art, but the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta pointedly contrasts the non-weeping arahants with the weeping non-arahants:

Then, when the Blessed One had passed away, some bhikkhus, not yet freed from passion, lifted up their arms and wept; and some, flinging themselves on the ground, rolled from side to side and wept, lamenting: "Too soon has the Blessed One come to his Parinibbana! Too soon has the Happy One come to his Parinibbana! Too soon has the Eye of the World vanished from sight!"

But the bhikkhus who were freed from passion, mindful and clearly comprehending, reflected in this way: "Impermanent are all compounded things. How could this be otherwise?" (DN. 16)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 7, 2016 1:37 PM

Title: Re: Ordain as a monk and still stay vegetarian/vegan?

Content:

Assuming you mean Sunyataram, this is the address of the wat:

Samnak Pa Sunyataram,
Tambol Prang Phen,
Amphoe Sangkhlaburi,
Kanchanaburi 71240

สำนักป่าสุญญตาราม
ตำบล ปรางค์เพล
อำเภอ สังขละบุรี
จังหวัด กาญจนบุรี 71240

And its Facebook page:

<https://web.facebook.com/%E0%B8%AA%E0%B8%B3%E0%B8%99%E0%B8%B1%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%9B%E0%B9%88%E0%B8%B2%E0%B8%AA%E0%B8%B8%E0%B8%8D%E0%B8%8D%E0%B8%95%E0%B8%B2%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%B2%E0%B8%A1-%E0%B9%80%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%B4%E0%B8%87%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%B0%E0%B9%80%E0%B8%A7%E0%B8%B5%E0%B8%A2%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%B2%E0%B8%8D%E0%B8%88%E0%B8%99%E0%B8%9A%E0%B8%B8%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%B5-1649463855305359>

I would remark, however, that abstention from meat can be practised at nearly any monastery in Thailand, excepting those of Ajahn Maha Bua and his disciples, where it's expressly prohibited.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 8, 2016 6:17 AM

Title: Re: Walking with a purpose

Content:

What is beneficial is recollection of the special qualities of the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha. One of the stated benefits of these recollection (anussati) practices is that one comes to live as if one were in the presence of whichever of the three jewels one is recollecting. As Buddhaghosa states:

When a bhikkhu is devoted to this recollection of the Buddha, he is respectful and deferential towards the Master. He attains fullness of faith, mindfulness, understanding and merit. He has much happiness and gladness. He conquers fear and dread. He is able to endure pain. He comes to feel as if he were living in the Master's presence. And

his body, when the recollection of the Buddha's special qualities dwells in it, becomes as worthy of veneration as a shrine room. His mind tends toward the plane of the Buddhas. When he encounters an opportunity for transgression, he has awareness of conscience and shame as vivid as though he were face to face with the Master. And if he penetrates no higher, he is at least headed for a happy destiny.

When a bhikkhu is devoted to this recollection of the Dhamma, he thinks: "I never in the past met a master who taught a law that led onward thus, who possessed this talent, nor do I now see any such a master other than the Blessed One." Seeing the Dhamma's special qualities in this way, he is respectful and deferential towards the Master. He entertains great reverence for the Dhamma and attains fullness of faith, and so on. He has much happiness and gladness. He conquers fear and dread. He is able to endure pain. He comes to feel as if he were living in the Dhamma's presence. And his body, when the recollection of the Dhamma's special qualities dwells in it, becomes as worthy of veneration as a shrine room. His mind tends towards the realization of the peerless Dhamma. When he encounters an opportunity for transgression, he has vivid awareness of conscience and shame on recollecting the well-regulatedness of the Dhamma. And if he penetrates no higher, he is at least headed for a happy destiny.

When a bhikkhu is devoted to this recollection of the Community, he is respectful and deferential towards the Community. He attains fullness of faith, and so on. He has much happiness and bliss. He conquers fear and dread. He is able to endure pain. He comes to feel as if he were living in the Community's presence. And his body, when the recollection of the Sangha's special qualities dwells in it, becomes as worthy of veneration as an Uposatha house where the Community has met. His mind tends towards the attainment of the Community's special qualities. When he encounters an opportunity for transgression, he has awareness of conscience and shame as vividly as if he were face to face with the Community. And if he penetrates no higher, he is at least headed for a happy destiny.

(Path of Purification, ch. VII)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 8, 2016 9:55 AM

Title: Re: I have a question regarding IQ and mental stability

Content:

It's the same disciple whom Santa referred to, except that his name is Cūḷapanthaka in the Pali texts. His story is recorded in the Dhammapada Commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 8, 2016 3:59 PM

Title: Re: Walking with a purpose

Content:

In the Aṅguttara's Appaṇṇaka Sutta (AN. i. 114), pacing back and forth and sitting are the

two postures specified for a bhikkhu devoted to wakefulness. He is said to be devoted to wakefulness when all his waking hours are devoted to purging his mind of obstructive qualities (defined in the Aṅguttara Commentary as the five hindrances) in these two postures:

“And how is a bhikkhu intent on wakefulness? Here, during the day, while walking back and forth and sitting, a bhikkhu purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. In the first watch of the night, while walking back and forth and sitting, he purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. In the middle watch of the night he lies down on the right side in the lion’s posture, with one foot overlapping the other, mindful and clearly comprehending, after noting in his mind the idea of rising. After rising, in the last watch of the night, while walking back and forth and sitting, he purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. It is in this way that a bhikkhu is intent on wakefulness.

(Appaṇṇaka Sutta, AN. i. 114)

While he is pacing up and down, there are any number of things that a bhikkhu might be doing to purify his mind of obstructive qualities.

If he is developing sampajañña while walking, then in satipaṭṭhāna-bhāvanā this would be included under body-contemplation. But it doesn’t follow from this that “walking meditation is all about mindfulness of the body”. He might be developing any of the four satipaṭṭhānas or any of the objects used in samatha-bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 8, 2016 10:19 PM

Title: Re: Refuge in Whole Sangha, not in Ariya Sangha

Content:

This phrase (or the alternative one which substitutes “bhikkhuni-saṅgha”) is used in the Suttas by freshly converted outsiders (i.e. by persons who know nothing of the Ariya-saṅgha), not by the Buddha’s longstanding disciples. In the Vinaya’s account of the evolution of bhikkhu ordination, at the stage when upasamapadā was granted by recital of the three refuges, the formula was “saṅghaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi” and not “bhikkhusaṅghaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi”. Likewise with the refuge-going formula for sāmaṇeras.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 8, 2016 10:28 PM

Title: Re: Walking with a purpose

Content:

From the detailed description of the qualities of the Sangha it's clear that it's the Noble Sangha that is the proper subject of one's recollection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 9, 2016 9:27 AM

Title: Re: Refuge in Whole Sangha, not in Ariya Sangha

Content:

The distinction is between a provisional understanding of the refuge object and a higher understanding. It has nothing to do with householder versus homeless renunciate. The provisional understanding is that of a newly converted outsider (who may be a householder or a homeless renunciate) who goes for refuge to the only sangha that he knows of: the one that he can see, which is the bhikkhusangha. The higher understanding is that of one who has been instructed; he too may be either a householder or a homeless renunciate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 9, 2016 10:03 AM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 9, 2016 2:28 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 11, 2016 11:13 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

No, sukun or <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sakina> is native to the Semitic language family. It corresponds to Hebrew <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Shekhinah> and Aramaic shekinta, but not to anything in the classical Indic languages.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 13, 2016 7:24 AM

Title: Re: POTUS 2020, part 1

Content:

Trey Gowdy as the GOP candidate — not a prediction, just a hope.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 13, 2016 7:54 AM

Title: Re: Zen

Content:

One of the four kinds of attachment-rooted consciousness accompanied by wrong view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 13, 2016 1:39 PM

Title: Re: Beginner Terminology and Kathavatthu 9.2

Content:

The canonical Kathāvatthu simply presents debates on controversial views and interpretations, but without ever stating who holds the views in question. The attribution of the views to particular schools comes from the Kathāvatthu Commentary and the translator proceeds on the assumption that this attribution is correct.

"Controverted point" is the translator's rendering of vatthu. This too is from the Commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 14, 2016 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Beginner Terminology and Kathavatthu 9.2

Content:

The translations of both the Kathāvatthu and its commentary are among the works on which the PTS has removed copyright restrictions. Both are available from archive.org

Points of Controversy

<https://archive.org/details/PointsOfControversyKathavatthu>

The Debates Commentary

https://archive.org/download/TFIC_ASI_Books

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 14, 2016 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Zen

Content:

Yeah, so they say. Nevertheless, I'm personally persuaded by the Japanese Critical Buddhists (i.e., Matsumoto Shirō and his merry men) that tathāgatagarbha is an un-dhammic and anti-dhammic doctrine, being merely an ātman by another name.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 14, 2016 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Translations of the Niddesa of the Khuddaka Nikaya?

Content:

As far as I know there isn't yet any complete translation of the Niddesa. There are, however, about twenty quotations from it in the Path of Purification, Ñāṇamoli's translation of the Visuddhimagga, including the oft-quoted verses on momentarism that are available at Access to Insight.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 14, 2016 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Vietnamese Language

Content:

Thiện Phúc's dictionary of Buddhist terms. Available in three formats:

Vietnamese - English

English - Vietnamese

Sanskrit/Pali - Vietnamese

<http://thuvienhoasen.org/p10a11807/tu-dien-phat-hoc-thien-phuc>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 14, 2016 9:06 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

Actually there's been one for over a century — the Nostratic hypothesis of the Danish linguist Holger Pedersen. In his scheme the Semitic family of languages is claimed to derive from Proto-Afro-Asiatic and the Indo-European family from Proto-Eurasiatic. Each of these source families is then claimed to derive from Proto-Nostratic.

It is, however, a controversial thesis, with linguists about evenly divided between believers, sceptics and agnostics.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nostratic_languages

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Holger_Pedersen_%28linguist%29

Nostratic.png (23.88 KiB) Viewed 1955 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 15, 2016 9:26 AM
Title: Re: leonard cohen dead at 82
Content:
Last interview.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 15, 2016 6:22 PM
Title: Re: 5 times to achieve awakening Sutta
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 15, 2016 6:50 PM
Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Nov 16, 2016 2:53 PM
Title: Re: What happens to the past Kamma of Arahants?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 17, 2016 10:47 AM
Title: Re: new interpretation of samsara and patisandhi from my experience
Content:
“For you are the heir of your deeds.”

“And this is not the kind of deed to bring you to full enlightenment...”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 19, 2016 12:38 PM

Title: Re: new interpretation of samsara and patisandhi from my experience

Content:

I think there's a serious error in your reading. The Udāna passage states that the unborn provides the means of escape from the born. It doesn't say that the unborn makes the born. Still less does it say that the unborn "is something that creates and manages our thoughts." You seem to be turning nibbāna into something like the puggala of the Puggalavādins.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 19, 2016 1:54 PM

Title: Re: The Official Dhamma Wheel Cat Thread

Content:

Mort aux Chats

There will be no more cats.
Cats spread infection,
cats pollute the air,
cats consume seven times
their own weight in food a week,
cats were worshipped in
decadent societies (Egypt
and Ancient Rome), the Greeks
had no use for cats. Cats
sit down to pee (our scientists
have proved it). The copulation
of cats is harrowing; they
are unbearably fond of the moon.
Perhaps they are all right in
their own country but their
traditions are alien to ours.
Cats smell, they can't help it,
you notice it going upstairs.
Cats watch too much television,
they can sleep through storms,
they stabbed us in the back
last time. There have never been
any great artists who were cats.
They don't even deserve a capital C
except at the beginning of a sentence.
I blame my headache and my

plants dying on to cats.
Our district is full of them,
property values are falling.
When I dream of God I see
a Massacre of Cats. Why
should they insist on their own
language and religion, who
needs to purr to make a point?
Death to all cats! The Rule
of Dogs shall last a thousand years!

(Peter Porter)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 20, 2016 6:39 PM

Title: Re: new interpretation of samsara and patisandhi from my experience

Content:

How does any of this support your position?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 22, 2016 1:31 AM

Title: Re: World Chess Championship 2016

Content:

Karpov offered Osipov a draw but he refused it and then lost on time.

1. d4 Nf6
2. c4 e6
3. Nc3 Bb4
4. a3 Bxc3+
5. bxc3 c5
6. dxc5 Na6
7. Bg5 Nxc5
8. Nf3 b6
9. g3 h6
10. Bxf6 Qxf6
11. Nd4 Bb7
12. f3 O-O
13. Bg2 Ba6
14. f4 Rac8
15. O-O Bxc4
16. f5 e5
17. Nf3 d5

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 8:06 AM

Title: Re: What does the "Red Pill" mean

Content:

The Industrial Revolution: The Beginning of the End of Male Space

Before the Industrial Revolution, you could find most men working in or around the home. This was a time of self-sufficient small farmers and noble artisans. A man used his home as his place of business and, consequently, homes were designed to accommodate the needs of the dirty work of farming, blacksmithing, and leatherworking. When you work every day in dirt and grime, you can't worry about taking off your boots so you don't soil the rug. That just slows down the work!

Additionally, the home design luxuries we take for granted today just weren't available to people in this agrarian society. Carpeting, wallpaper, drapes and even glass windows were items reserved for the very wealthy.

Consequently, the home had a predominately masculine vibe. Exposed beams, dirt floors, and earthen fireplaces were the norm. Tools were left here and there, guns hung above the fireplace, the sheep dog came in and out as he pleased, and a man didn't think about wiping his feet before he came inside. He didn't have to worry about a nagging wife getting on to him for mucking up the place because the place was already mucked up. But little did men know that the days of a male-centered abode were numbered.

By the middle of the 19th century, the Industrial Revolution was in full swing. Families moved from the country to the city, and men left home to work in the factories. Women, of course, stayed home to run the household. Thus a strict work/home dichotomy developed, with women given domain over the latter. The Cult of Domesticity, popular during this time, encouraged middle and upper class women to make the home a "haven in a heartless world" for her husband and children, a place where a man could relax and feel comforted after a long day of toiling in the trenches. Without an earthen floor and sawdust shavings everywhere, the possibility of keeping things clean and tidy became attainable, and women bought carpets, white drapes, and flower-filled vases in the name of creating a soft oasis for their husbands. But what they really had made was the type of place a woman would feel most comfortable, and men fled their doily-laden home to spend time at the bars and fraternal lodges with their boys. The home had become female space.

More here:

<http://www.artofmanliness.com/2010/01/10/the-decline-of-male-space/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 10:25 AM

Title: Re: What does the "Red Pill" mean
Content:
No idea at all.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 12:06 PM
Title: Re: What does the "Red Pill" mean
Content:
You're a walrus!? Now I don't mind most marine mammals, but walruses? I could do without walruses!

sjw.jpg (171.05 KiB) Viewed 2414 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 12:10 PM
Title: Re: What does the "Red Pill" mean
Content:
Among those regularly posting at the moment I can think of five whom I know to be women.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 12:43 PM
Title: Re: What does the "Red Pill" mean
Content:
I'm not surprised, for I too had never given it any thought until at the age of 32 I read Virginia Woolf's attempt to account for the absence of any female Shakespeare in https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A_Room_of_One%27s_Own. Woolf attributes this in large part to the lack of female space during the period in question.

If a woman wrote, she would have to write in the common sitting-room. And, as Miss Nightingale was so vehemently to complain,—“women never have an half hour...that they can call their own”—she was always interrupted. Still it would be easier to write prose and fiction there than to write poetry or a play. Less concentration is required. Jane Austen wrote like that to the end of her days. 'How she was able to effect all this', her nephew writes in his Memoir, 'is surprising, for she had no separate study to repair to, and most of the work must have been done in the general sitting-room, subject to all kinds of casual interruptions. She was careful that her occupation should not be suspected by servants or visitors or any persons beyond her own family party. Jane Austen hid her manuscripts or covered them with a piece of blotting-paper.

<http://gutenberg.net.au/ebooks02/0200791h.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 24, 2016 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Carefull attention to the hindrances?

Content:

"Careful", "wise", "proper" and "reasoned" have all been used by different translators to translate the 'yoniso' in 'yoniso manasikāra'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 26, 2016 8:13 AM

Title: Re: Is Buddha higher than Arahant?

Content:

Sometimes they do and sometimes they don't. The problem here is that the Indian Mahayanists were inconsistent in their conception of an arahant. In some texts he is conceived exactly as he is in Theravadin texts (i.e., he is katakaraṇīya — "one who has done what had to be done"), while in others he's represented as an inferior and only semi-liberated being who still has more work to do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 27, 2016 7:59 AM

Title: Re: Yoga in the Pali Canon

Content:

The reference given in Mallinson's article is to the Bodhisatta's austerities in the Mahasihanada Sutta.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn12>

The author assumes that the words, "I was one who squatted continuously, devoted to maintaining the squatting position," can be identified with a particular āsana in Haṭha Yoga texts. It seems to me that the brevity of the Buddha's account makes such an identification highly tenuous.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 27, 2016 9:35 AM

Title: Re: Yoga in the Pali Canon

Content:

No. The divine eye (dibbacakkhu) is something attainable only after mastery of the

fourth jhāna and the supposed third eye is a non-Buddhist notion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 28, 2016 9:52 AM

Title: Re: Serial killer kittens?

Content:

You can reduce the number of successful bird kills by 40% by attaching a bell to your cat's collar. You can reduce it by 87% by having your cat wear a <https://catgoods.com/>, a <http://www.birdsbesafe.com/>, or just a bright-coloured <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Scrunchie>. The relative inefficacy of collar-bells is owing to the fact that many cats are smart enough to stifle the bell while stalking prey.

I don't think there is any way to train an adult cat to embrace ahimsā and refrain from hunting smaller creatures. Those cute cats that one sees in youtube videos living pacifically, or even amicably, alongside budgerigars, mice, hamsters, etc., have been socialized this way from kittenhood.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 28, 2016 10:42 AM

Title: Re: 2 very intelligent men

Content:

Barbara Drescher is quite interesting on this...

<http://www.skeptic.com/author/barbara-drescher/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 28, 2016 11:08 AM

Title: Re: 2 very intelligent men

Content:

There's a 3-part post, comprising:

Why Smart People Are Not Always Rational

<http://www.skeptic.com/insight/why-smart-people-are-not-always-rational/>

More On Why Smart People Are Not Always Rational

<http://www.skeptic.com/insight/more-on-why-smart-people-are-not-always-rational/>

Why Smart Doesn't Guarantee Rational, Part III

<http://www.skeptic.com/insight/why-smart-doesnt-guarantee-rational-part-iii/>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 28, 2016 11:25 AM
Title: Re: 2 very intelligent men
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 28, 2016 11:44 AM
Title: Re: Morality of killing in war
Content:

Given that Siha was a Licchavi it's possible he was only a peacetime general. I think the only reported military conflict involving Licchavis came three years after the Buddha's passing when Ajatasattu invaded their territory.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 10, 2016 7:33 PM
Title: Re: Entrance to the vinaya Vol 2
Content:

When you're next in Bangkok you can get a very cheap copy from the Mahamakut bookshop on Phra Sumen Road in Banglumpoo. It's just opposite the front entrance to Wat Boworniwet and looks more like an office block than a bookshop.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 11, 2016 8:04 PM
Title: Re: Do bhikkhus who justify abortion risk becoming parajika?
Content:
No, it wouldn't.

I googled for source of your quote and read the full <http://subhuti.withmetta.net/2016/12/05/buddhism-and-abortion/>. It's rather poor and seems to have been written without consulting the Vinaya Piṭaka's detailed exposition but only the bare training rule as it's found in the Pāṭimokkha.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 14, 2016 2:46 PM
Title: Re: Seeking advice on the best way to apply Ajahn Mun's dhutanga kammaṭṭhāna practice in modern times

Content:

I think Ajahn Mun's path would be best replicated in the present time by ordaining and getting one's formative training in a Thai Dhammayutt forest wat and then (after five years or so) moving to Sri Lanka and following in <http://dharma-records.buddhasasana.net/texts/bhante-guttasila-remembers-ven-nanavimala-transcript footsteps>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 14, 2016 4:34 PM

Title: Re: Seeking advice on the best way to apply Ajahn Mun's dhutanga kammaṭṭhāna practice in modern times

Content:

I see that there's now a whole website devoted to the late therā:

<http://ven-nyanavimala.buddhasasana.net/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 15, 2016 12:08 PM

Title: Re: What is the "self-doer" in AN 6.38?

Content:

It's a mistranslation. The words found in the body of the sutta are attakāra and parakāra, meaning 'self-determination' and 'determination by others'. The word attakārī occurs only as one of the variant readings of the name of the sutta.

"Self-determination" and "determination by others", together with "personal determination" (purisakāra) are among the things that are repudiated in the fatalistic teaching of Makkhali Gosāla. I can't recall how they are formally defined in the commentaries, but I do recall that the most useful source is the commentary to the Sāmaññaphala Sutta, translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi as Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship. If anyone has a copy perhaps they would care to post the definitions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 16, 2016 7:39 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism and God

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 18, 2016 2:22 PM

Title: Re: Is the dhamma in hell realms?

Content:

Not in classical Theravadin texts, but the motif is common in Thai and Laotian folk Buddhism, in the form of Phra Malai. Some believe this hell-preaching being to have been an arahant from Sri Lanka and spiritual heir to Mahāmoggallāna, while others identify him with the Mahayana figure Phra Kasitikappa Phothisat (= Bodhisattva Kṣitigarbha).

Try googling “Phra Malai” or พระมัลลย์

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 19, 2016 1:41 AM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

My thoughts exactly! What a close shave he had.

He reminds me of one of the less unfortunate of Thomas Hardy's ill-starred lovers — the one who forgot his walking stick one day:

OUTSIDE THE WINDOW

“My stick!” he says, and turns in the lane
To the house just left, whence a vixen voice
Comes out with the firelight through the pane,
And he sees within that the girl of his choice
Stands rating her mother with eyes aglare
For something said while he was there.

“At last I behold her soul undraped!”
Thinks the man who had loved her more than himself;
“My God—’tis but narrowly I have escaped. -
My precious porcelain proves it delf.”
His face has reddened like one ashamed,
And he steals off, leaving his stick unclaimed.

— <http://fullonlinebook.com/poems/satires-of-circumstances-in-fifteen-glimpses/vph.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 19, 2016 10:02 AM

Title: Re: Questions re: right livelihood - samma ajivo

Content:

Mam̐savaṇijjā refers to the trade of butchery, but in the older rather than the more recent sense of the word. In the older usage a butcher was one whose trade was slaughtering tame animals and selling their flesh. Nowadays most people called "butchers" (at least in the industrialized countries) are really only meat traders who don't actually kill the animals whose flesh they sell. This occupation would not be included in the term mam̐savaṇijjā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 19, 2016 8:52 PM

Title: Re: Questions re: right livelihood - samma ajivo

Content:

It wouldn't be included under wrong livelihood unless it was of a kind that involved cheating the patrons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 21, 2016 11:52 AM

Title: Re: Turns out Libertarians have the highest IQ

Content:

The complete article is here:

<http://www.aft.org/sites/default/files/periodicals/Wineburg.pdf>

And the links in the

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A_People%27s_History_of_the_United_States#Critical_reception_for_Zinn's_book offer some rather more abrasive critiques.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 22, 2016 10:45 AM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 23, 2016 1:18 PM

Title: Re: Dying without attaining Sotapanna

Content:

Contextually it seems that the terms sagga-parāyana and niraya-parāyana have only to do with one's destination immediately after the present life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 23, 2016 2:31 PM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

To not appreciate that the Buddha's doctrine is a doctrine of asceticism, at least with respect to its highest ends, and to not understand that, "The pursuit of sensual happiness in sensual pleasures ... is low, vulgar, the way of worldlings, ignoble, and unbeneficial," (Vin. i. 10; SN. v. 421) is already to be misguided. But to go further and take methods prescribed for ascetic ends and apply them to the pursuit of enhanced hedonic enjoyment is to go risibly astray.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 23, 2016 5:08 PM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

The supposed transformation of passions posited by Tantric Buddhists (as opposed to the abandoning of them taught by the Buddha) is premised upon the Sarvāstivādin conception of dharmas, i.e. that dharmas are entities that persist through the three periods of time. If they didn't persist in this way there would be no possibility of grasping hold of a nasty dharma, so to speak, and transforming it into a nice one. However, since the Sarvāstivādin conception of dharmas was soundly refuted by Moggalliputtatissa at the Third Council we may safely dismiss the Vajrayāna's preaching.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kv1.6>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 24, 2016 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

I think it was poorly phrased by me. Rather than "premiered upon..." I ought to have written, "... compatible with the Sarvāstivādin conception of dharmas, but contradicted by the Theravādin conception."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 24, 2016 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

Ultimately it's done by cutting off the fetter of conceit by attaining arahatta, whereupon one ceases to conceive: "I am better than...", "I am inferior to ..." or "I am equal to..."

In the meantime, as a non-arahant I do it by just minding my own business and not concerning myself with others' tastes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 26, 2016 3:38 PM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

Thanissaro's translation of the line isn't quite right. Bhikkhu Bodhi's rendering of *modanti kāmakāmino* as "they rejoice, enjoying sensual pleasures" is more accurate.

It means that those living as described will enjoy celestial pleasures in the next life. The teaching, however, has no bearing on what I wrote, for it's not concerned with a method prescribed for ascetic ends. In the *Methunasutta* (AN.iv.54) to desire heavenly rebirth is said to be a blotch on the *brahmacariyā*.

"... he does not look at a householder or a householder's son enjoying himself furnished and endowed with the five objects of sensual pleasure, but he lives the spiritual life aspiring for [rebirth in] a certain order of devas, [thinking]: 'By this virtuous behavior, observance, austerity, or spiritual life I will be a deva or one [in the retinue] of the devas.' He relishes this, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. This, too, is a breach, flaw, blemish, and blotch of the celibate life. He is called one who lives an impure celibate life, one who is fettered by the bond of sexuality. He is not freed from birth, from old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish; he is not freed from suffering, I say."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 26, 2016 4:19 PM

Title: Re: The case against Reality

Content:

I don't think it's a terribly common position, but assuming that 'blame' here means 'attribute to', then among British philosophers the description would fit one or two of the Cambridge Platonists, all the Berkeliens (i.e., Berkeley himself, A.A. Luce, Arthur Collier, and—in their juvenilia— Alexander Campbell Fraser and Thomas Reid), and then a few modern oddballs like the mystically inclined Paul Brunton and the unmystical John Foster.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 28, 2016 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Trump vs. Bush

Content:

Yes, the forenames would be of assistance here. I was just about to compose a

disquisition on the relative merits of Percy Bush and Harvey Trump, when it suddenly struck me that the OP might not in fact be referring to these two British cricketers but rather to some other Bush and Trump of a less glorious stripe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 29, 2016 7:07 AM

Title: Re: Sex positive movement

Content:

Oh? It's hard to imagine a rabble being very much roused by Prof. Pepper's cerebral blend of Marx according to Althusser, Freud according to Lacan, and the grace-based Buddhism of Shinran Shōnin. I doubt many among the rabble would even understand it; I certainly don't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 30, 2016 12:15 PM

Title: Re: Past Buddhas and Earth

Content:

For details of the past Buddhas see the two tables in Rhys Davids' translation of the Mahāpādāna Sutta.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn14>

For the Buddha Metteyya see the Cakkavattisihanāda Sutta.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn26>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 30, 2016 2:23 PM

Title: Re: Pali Term: Satipaṭṭhāna

Content:

The 'upaṭṭhāna' or 'paṭṭhāna' in 'satipaṭṭhāna' have no connection with either of the above words, no matter which of the possible derivations one opts for:

Most likely derivation: upaṭṭhāna = upa + √ṭhā

Less likely: paṭṭhāna = pa + √ṭhā

Least likely: upaṭṭhāna = u + pa + √ṭhā

The elements pa, u and upa are verbal prefixes (upasagga), not nouns. Duroiselle summarises their principal meanings:

U (= Skt. ud): upwards, above, up, forth, out.

Upa: unto, to, towards, near, with, by the side of, as, like, up to, (opposed to apa), below, less.

Pa (= Skt. pra): onward, forward to, forth, fore, towards, with. It expresses beginning.

But he also remarks:

The prefixes or prepositions, called in Pāli upasagga, are prefixed to verbs and their derivatives; they have been, on that account, called verbal prefixes. They generally modify the meaning of the root, or intensify it, and sometimes totally alter it; in many cases, they add but little to the original sense of the root.

Charles Duroiselle, A Practical Grammar of the Pāli Language

Some examples of word-modification with the above prefixes...

u

√khip, to throw = ukkhipati, to throw up, get rid of; ukkhepanaṃ, excommunication.

√chid, to cut = ucchindati, to cut off.

√ṭhā, to stand = uṭṭhahati, to stand up, rise, uṭṭhānaṃ, rising.

√har, to take = uddharati, to draw out. uddharaṇaṃ, pulling out.

The prefix u also reverses the meaning of a few verbs:

√pat, to fall = uppatati, to leap up, spring up.

√nam, to bend = unnamati, to rise up, ascend.

upa

√kaḍḍh to drag = upakaḍḍhati, to drag or draw towards, to draw below or down.

√kar, to do = upakaroti, to do something towards unto; viz, to help, upakāro, help, use; upakaraṇaṃ, instrument (lit. doing with).

√kam to step, go = upakkamati, to attack, (lit. to go towards).

pa

√bhā, to shine = pabhāti to shine forth, to dawn. pabhā, radiance.

√bhū, to be = pabhavati, to begin to be, viz., to spring up, to originate.

√jal, to burn = pajjalati, to burn forth, to blaze.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 30, 2016 3:39 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu nissaya training

Content:

No reason is given for prescribing this particular duration.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 30, 2016 4:57 PM

Title: Re: Mount Meru/"Sumeru"

Content:

The mountain is present in the Tipiṭaka but infrequent. Of its seven Pali names, Neru is mentioned once in the Apadāna and four times in the Jātaka verses, Sineru five times in the Saṃyutta and five times in the Anguttara, Meru twice in the Jātaka, Tidiva once in the Cariyāpiṭaka, twice in the Jātaka and once in the Vimānavatthu; Sumeru, Ādhāra and Tidivādhāra are found only in the Commentaries.

The Pali commentarial elaboration goes into about the same amount of detail that you'll find in, say, Vasubandhu and his commentators. The material has had considerable influence on the representation of Buddhist cosmology in SE Asian Buddhist art, but doesn't seem to play a prominent part (if any) in the way the Dhamma is nowadays expounded in Theravada countries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 30, 2016 5:55 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

While I don't think you're "completely deluded", I do think it might pay you to be more discriminating in your choice of English dictionary, especially when it comes to highly polysemous idiomatic verbs. On the website that you linked to the only entry that was anywhere near satisfactory was #4 from the American Heritage Dictionary of Idioms (which you didn't quote).

To conclude, here is the Oxford lexicographers' full list:
to turn out

1. Turn out. (See simple senses and out adv.)
2. To change from one's normal condition, to 'put out'; or to divert from one's course.
3. To cause to go or come out; to drive out or forth, to expel; also, to fetch or summon out.
4. To drive or put out (beasts) to pasture or to the open, or (pheasants, etc.) into a covert.
5. To dismiss or eject from office or employment.
6. To put (things) out of a house, room, or receptacle; to empty out by sloping or inverting the containing vessel.
7. To clear (a receptacle or room) of its contents; to empty (usually for the sake of examining or re-arranging the contents).
8. To put or throw (land) out of cultivation.
9. To put out, extinguish (a lamp, gas) by turning a tap or the like.
10. To finish making and get off one's hands; to dispose of as a finished product; to

produce (usually implying rapidity, facility, or skill).

11. To equip, 'rig out', 'get up'.

12. To refer to, look up: = turn up.

13. To alter the position of so as to bring it to the outside. (In quot. with figurative allusion.)

14. To direct or cause to point outwards.

15. To turn aside and go out; to go away, depart, 'clear out'; to go forth, sally forth (usually with the notion of some compelling force, or of leaving a place of safety or comfort for one of danger or discomfort).

15. To get out of bed.

16. To leave one's abode and betake oneself to some outside occupation. spec. (Austral. slang) to become a bush-ranger.

17. To abandon one's work; to go out on strike.

18. To bend or be directed outwards. (intr. of n.)

19. To come about in the end or issue; to result, eventuate. Now always with adv., advb. phr., or as; †also absol. (obs. rare: nearly = turn up).

20. To come to be, become ultimately (and so be found or known to be).

21. To be ultimately found or known, to prove to be (without the implication of having become).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 31, 2016 4:03 AM

Title: Re: Recieved alcohol as gift

Content:

<http://phickle.com/wine-vinegar-how-to/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 31, 2016 4:21 AM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 31, 2016 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Pali Term: Satipaṭṭhāna

Content:

The conjecture will no doubt serve well as an edifying (albeit ersatz) folk etymology, but as far as historical philology goes it's quite untenable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 22, 2017 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Linguistics Reason: Ananda Memorized Sutta For The Other, But Sariputta Memorized Abhidhamma That Buddha Directly Ta

Content:

I think you have jumped to a wrong conclusion here. Our member Buddha Vacana is from France and (as far as I know) has no connection with the พุทธวาทะ organization of Phra Kukrit Sotthiphalo in Thailand. Nor (as far as I know) does Buddha Vacana make any use of the พุทธวาทะ organization's software application. That they are both called "Buddhavacana" is just a coincidence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 30, 2017 3:48 PM

Title: Re: Please tell me more about Theravada Buddhism

Content:

I'm an occasional reader of several Thai-language Dhamma forums. They're actually not much different from Dhamma Wheel. The content of the discussions is substantially similar to here, with the only conspicuous difference being the manner of interaction between members. Dhamma discussion among Thai Buddhists is generally more akin to a ballroom dance than to a debate.

For what the OP seems to be looking for it might be better to check out a forum for Thai amulet enthusiasts. Most of these are in Thai, but there is an English one here:

<https://amuletforums.com/>

Edit

I mean in particular the General Buddhism sub-forum of the above:

<https://amuletforums.com/forums/general-buddhism.17/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 31, 2017 8:08 AM

Title: Re: Sources on the manipulation of sila

Content:

The meaning of your question seems a little opaque to me. Could you perhaps phrase it some other way?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 31, 2017 4:13 PM

Title: Re: Original teachings of the Buddha

Content:

In mainland Indian Buddhism, both mainstream and Mahāyāna, the Theravāda was referred to by other names, usually either

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Vibhajjav%C4%81da> or names like Tambapaṇṇiya, Tāmraparṇiya and Tāmraśāṭiya, derived from <http://ocbs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Tambapan%CC%A3n%CC%A3iya-and-Ta%CC%84mrās%CC%81a%CC%84t%CC%A3iya.pdf>.

As for the name 'Theravāda' (or its Sanskrit cognate), this was generally used in mainland India in the same way that it's used in Pali chronicles like the Dīpavaṃsa, i.e., as a collective name for all of the non-Mahāsaṅghika schools.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 31, 2017 7:12 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

From Sam White's blog...

ANTI-TRUMP FURY AND PROGRESSIVE PREJUDICE

[...]

... Or how about Sunday Times writer India Knight? She got the ball rolling with a light-hearted, homicide-themed tweet. Subsequently deleted, it read “The assassination is taking such a long time.”

Having garnered attention but turned off anyone who isn’t so much into political murder, she then came out with this stunning piece of anti-Islamic stereotyping:

India.jpg (81.24 KiB) Viewed 2067 times

“He” refers to Trump, and according to outraged, trigger-happy Knight, Muslims are so thin-skinned and eager to blow things up that they can be radicalized in their hundreds just by listening to the American president speak. In her world, followers of Islam might be liable to kill people whose politics they disagree with. And bizarrely, just like Nanjiani, she is implying this as part of her argument against Trump’s order.

Liberal progressives who like to throw around accusations of bigotry and racism are sometimes in possession of their own disguised prejudices. They mask them behind platitudes, while exchanging virtue signals with their co-saints. But as the

above tweets show, you don't have to look hard to see their true nature. It's revealed not in expressions of hatred, but in conspicuous compassion, through patronising vast groups of people, by blurring individuals into demographic blocks, and through the simpering low expectations inherent in the fallacy of cultural relativism.

A concern now is that the mixture of virtue signalling, exaggeration, and ramped up outrage we've seen over the past couple of days sets the tone for the rest of Trump's time in office, and distracts from the real details. Perhaps more than any previous president, he must be held scrupulously to account. But there's only so much right-on fury that normal people can stomach, and placard wielding, angry marches are limited in both usefulness and wider appeal.

If the anti-Trump rage never subsides, and is accompanied by a constant undercurrent of physical menace, then it will quickly become little more than white noise, and would-be allies will start to melt away. Those who really want to make sure that Trump is kept under close scrutiny need to stick to the facts, cut out the radical posturing, and try to keep their emotions in check.

<https://upallnight.tokyo/2017/01/31/anti-trump-fury-and-progressive-prejudice/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 1, 2017 4:16 PM

Title: Re: Original teachings of the Buddha

Content:

By Mahāyāna Āgamas I take it you mean the Dīrgha-, Madhyama-, Saṃyukta and Ekottara-āgamas, right? But if so, why do you call them Mahāyāna Āgamas?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 2, 2017 3:29 AM

Title: Re: Original teachings of the Buddha

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 2, 2017 2:36 PM

Title: Re: Original teachings of the Buddha

Content:

Ko pana vādo paccuppanassa!

This is a phrase used in many suttas in the SN's Khandhavagga and Saḷāyatanavagga. The "Ko pana vādo..." part is an idiom used for expressing rhetorical questions regarding something that the speaker deems to be obvious. Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of it is unfortunately a bit flat and doesn't really express the rhetorical force. For example: Cakkhum, bhikkhave, aniccaṃ atitānāgataṃ; ko pana vādo paccuppannaṃ!

"Bhikkhus, the eye is impermanent, both of the past and the future, not to speak of the present." (Bodhi)

The sense might be better conveyed by:

"Bhikkhus, both the eye of the past and the eye of the future are impermanent. Why even bother to speak of the eye of the present?"

When translated so, the implication is that the impermanence of the eye in the present is of a kind more evident than that of the eye of the past and the eye of the future. Why should that be so? The Theravada answer to this question (based on the verses in the MN's <http://www.accesstinsight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.131.nana.html>) is that the eye of the past has ceased to be, or more literally, it's been "left behind" (yad'atitaṃ taṃ pahīnaṃ), while the eye of the future "is as yet unreached" (appattaṃ anāgataṃ). And so the impermanence of the one is knowable only via memory and that of the other via inference. The eye of the present, by contrast, is neither left behind nor unreached.

Unsurprisingly then, the impermanence of the eye in the three times is to elicit different responses in the disciple:

"Seeing thus, bhikkhus, the instructed noble disciple is indifferent towards the eye of the past; he does not seek delight in the eye of the future; and he is practising for revulsion towards the eye of the present, for its fading away and cessation."

Notice that it is non-action that is advocated regarding the eye of the past and future. It is the eye of the present alone that can be acted upon, for it is this eye alone that exists. Likewise with the other āyatanas and (in the Khandhavagga) the khandhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 2, 2017 7:11 PM

Title: Re: Dispeller of Delusion; Chapt. 16, Classification of Knowledge

Content:

In Sutta usage, the terms attano kammaṃ ("one's action"), sakakammaṃ ("one's own action") and attanā kataṃ kammaṃ ("action done by oneself") are synonymous and one will indeed find them applied to wholesome and unwholesome actions alike.

In the commentaries, however, in some contexts the word saka has a connotation that is not adequately conveyed by the usual translation "one's own". The connotation is that the thing in question is not only one's own but that it is suitable and fitting for oneself. Unwholesome actions, inasmuch as they obstruct flourishing, conduce to pain, etc., are not "fitting for oneself" (saka) even though they may be "one's own" (attano). [*]

Let me therefore propose an alternative translation to Ñāṇamoli's:

Herein, the three kinds of bodily bad conduct, the four kinds of verbal bad conduct and the three kinds of mental bad conduct are not called 'kamma appropriate for oneself'. The ten kinds of good conduct in the three doors is called 'kamma appropriate for oneself'. Whether it is [done] by oneself (attanā) or by another, all unprofitable [kamma] is not called 'kamma appropriate for oneself'. Why not? Because it destroys benefit (attha) and promotes harm. Whether it is [done] by oneself or by another, all profitable [kamma] is called 'kamma appropriate for oneself'. Why? Because it destroys harm and promotes good.

[*] The commentarial use of saka might be profitably compared with that of the Latin proprius, which etymologically is the source not only of 'property' (i.e., that which one owns), but also of 'proper' (i.e., correct and suitable).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 2, 2017 7:45 PM
Title: Re: Pure Land Buddhism and the Pali Canon
Content:
Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

May I ask what kind of Pure Land Buddhist you are? I seem to detect in your post a mélange of three rather different (though not necessarily discordant) perspectives on this strand of Mahayanism: the Shin, the mainland East Asian, and the Tantric.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 3, 2017 5:27 AM
Title: Re: The Two Wheels
Content:
At E-sangha he used to say that they could incarnate as medicinal herbs. The source in both cases is Mahayana —Shantideva— though I don't think most Mahayanists would go for M's hyper-literalist reading of what is surely intended as poetry:

I am the protector of the unprotected and the caravan-leader for travellers. I have become the boat, the causeway, and the bridge for those who long to reach the further shore.

May I be a light for those in need of light. May I be a bed for those in need of rest. May I be a servant for those in need of service, for all embodied beings.

For embodied beings may I be the wish-fulfilling jewel, the pot of plenty, the spell that always works, the potent healing herb, the magical tree that grants every wish, and the milch cow that supplies all wants.

(Bodhicaryavatara III. 17-19)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 3, 2017 7:03 AM
Title: Re: The Two Wheels
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 3, 2017 6:03 PM
Title: Re: Is the End of Suffering Actually Possible?
Content:
He may appear angry to you, but actually it's quite possible to deliver a stern and strongly-worded reprimand without being inwardly angry at all. Ask any school teacher.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 4, 2017 4:06 PM
Title: Re: Killing Rats
Content:
Have you considered getting a cat? With the right sort its mere presence should keep the rats at bay.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 4, 2017 10:18 PM
Title: Re: Killing Rats
Content:
Well, the idea is to select a spayed female of the kind of breed that will be content to stay in the house (though not so passive that she won't bother to hunt). An American shorthair or a Chinese Li Hua, for example.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 4, 2017 11:46 PM
Title: Re: Misunderstanding the Buddha
Content:

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 5, 2017 11:02 AM

Title: Re: In orthodox Theravada is there such a thing as physical/material?

Content:

Indeed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 5, 2017 4:53 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

In the suttas its provenance is given as Brahmanic rather than Shramanic; it's said to be found in the brahmins' hymns. Then according to Buddhaghosa, prognostication by the 32 marks is taught to brahmins by devas from the Suddhāvāsa shortly before the birth of each Buddha or cakkavatti-rājā, so that they'll be able to recognize them. But then after each Buddha's parinibbāna the science quickly falls into desuetude and disappears.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 5, 2017 5:08 PM

Title: Re: Bai Sutthi?

Content:

It depends how temporary it is. For example, if it's just a weekend ordination to make merit for your mum at her funeral then most abbots won't bother, but for a 3-month vassa ordination they usually will.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 6:25 AM

Title: Re: Alternatives to "moments"

Content:

It is to be found in many texts that predate the Visuddhimagga. For example, the Mahāniddeśa, Apadāna and Paṭisambhidāmagga of the Suttanta Piṭaka; the Kathāvatthu, Yamaka and Paṭṭhāna of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. Not to mention its pre-Visuddhimagga occurrences in the works of non-Theravādin schools.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 12:13 PM

Title: Re: America First

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 6:28 PM

Title: Re: Arabic Language

Content:

https://think2behumain.blogspot.com/2016/06/pdf_85.html

The Dhammapada. Translated by Saadi Youssef

https://think2behumain.blogspot.com/2016/06/pdf_60.html

Claude B. Levenson, Le Bouddhisme. Translated by Muhammad Ali

I expect there'll be more. The places to look are sites

<https://kotobmamno3a.wordpress.com/> which specialize in etexts of books that are banned in some Arab-speaking countries. Unfortunately this will mean wading through dozens of texts relating to evangelical Christianity, anti-Islamic polemics, and defences of the theory of evolution.

Alternatively you might try searching for the word الدامابادا ("al-Damapada"). The Dhammapada is available from several hundred Arabic sites and some of them may have other Buddhist texts too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 8:04 PM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

When one sets a lethal rat trap because one wishes to kill a rat, there is no possibility of the first precept not being broken should a rat be killed by it.

Keeping a dog or a cat, on the other hand, is something that one might do in the hope that its mere presence would deter the rats. Of course if one acquired the animal in the hope that it will kill rats, then I suppose it wouldn't be any different from setting a lethal trap. Likewise, if one saw a rat and ordered the dog to kill it, then it wouldn't be any different from hiring a contract killer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 8:18 PM

Title: Re: Arabic Language

Content:

You might also put your query to Arjuna Pranidhi Uddiyana, the editor of the Arabic

section at the Berzin Archives. Though the Archives are actually Vajrayanist in orientation, nevertheless their materials tend to treat the Theravada much more fairly and accurately than is usually the case with Tibetan outfits.

<https://www.facebook.com/Pure.Aspiration>

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCVwS9VRonC7B1QaRKVassxQ>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

The only sort of pet-keeping that would perforce entail breaking the first precept is where the animal is of a kind that needs to be fed live prey, such as a pogona or a boa constrictor.

As for breaking the first precept "by implication", there isn't any such thing. Either the transgressional factors of object, perception, intention, effort and outcome are present in their entirety or they're not. In the case of the typical cat fancier or dog lover, there's no particular reason for any of the factors to arise on account of their pet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 6, 2017 11:14 PM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

If the pet-owner is so spectacularly ill-informed about ophidian ethology that he honestly expects the python's interest in the rat to be recreational rather than gastronomic, then I suppose we must acquit him of blame in the event of the rat's premature demise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 7, 2017 5:48 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a meditation group in Bristol, UK

Content:

The Buddhist Directory at <http://www.buddhanet.net> lists just two Theravadin groups in Bristol. One is affiliated with the Samatha Trust, while the other describes itself as a vipassanā group, affiliated with Gaia House, which meets regularly at a Quaker meeting house. It doesn't say which vipassanā tradition it is affiliated with, but you might find the answer on one of these sites:

<http://www.bristolmeditation.org.uk/>

<http://gaiahouse.co.uk/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 7, 2017 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Hello from darkest Yorkshire

Content:

From one Yorkshireman to another, welcome to Dhamma Wheel. I hope it will prove valuable for you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 8, 2017 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Alternatives to "moments"

Content:

But they are already alienated, simply by virtue of their membership of a different canonical community.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 9:51 AM

Title: Re: Monotheistic religions are the productions of Mara (Devil)

Content:

The Buddha isn't reported to have met any of the six prominent samaṇa teachers of his day, but it's only in the case of Sañjaya Belaṭṭhaputta that any reason is given for the failure to meet. As the Dhammapada Atthakathā has it:

Now it was a distinguishing trait of the Elder Sāriputta that he always held a teacher in profound respect. Therefore said he to his friend, "Friend, let us inform our teacher, the wandering ascetic Sañjaya, that we have attained the Deathless. Thus will his mind be awakened, and he will comprehend. But should he fail to comprehend, he will at any rate believe what we say to be true; and so soon as he has listened to the preaching of the Buddhas, he will attain the Path and the Fruit."

Accordingly the two wandering ascetics went to Sañjaya. When Sañjaya saw them, he asked, "Friends, did you succeed in finding anyone able to show you the Way to the Deathless?"

"Yes, teacher, such a one have we found. The Buddha has appeared in the world, the Law has appeared, the Order has appeared. You, sir, are walking in vain unreality. Come, sir, let us go to the Teacher."

"You may go; I cannot go."

"For what reason?"

"In the past I have gone about as a teacher of the multitude. For me to become a pupil again would be as absurd as for a chatty to go to the well. I shall not be able to live the

life of a pupil.”

“Do not act thus, teacher.”

“Never mind, friends, you may go, but I cannot go.”

“Teacher, from the moment of the Buddha’s appearance in the world the populace will take perfumes, garlands, and so forth in their hands and will go and do honor to him alone. Let us also go there. What do you intend to do?”

“Friends, which are more numerous in this world, the stupid or the wise?”

“Teacher, the stupid are many, the wise are few.”

“Well then, friends, let the wise men go to the wise monk Gotama, and let the stupid come to stupid me. You may go, but I shall not go.”

“You will become a famous man, teacher!” said his two former pupils, and departed.
(tr. Burlingame, Buddhist Legends)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 10:53 AM

Title: Re: Visuddhimagga Summary?

Content:

For the Sila section there is Damien Keown's article Morality in the Visuddhimagga.

<http://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8593>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 11:13 AM

Title: Re: Sutta which teachers meditation on a flower

Content:

It sounds like the Dhammapada Commentary's background stories to Dhammapada 285 & 377.

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/20-09.htm>

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/25-08.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 11:39 AM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 12:15 PM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

The absence of violence. "No sentient beings were harmed in the making of this movie."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

First of all, why does the Buddha give similes or metaphors of any sort? The answer is that sometimes he gives a simile because a disciple specifically requests that he do so. More often, however, a simile is given unsolicited. On these occasions the Buddha usually justifies his doing so with the stock phrase; "... because some intelligent people here understand the meaning of what is said by means of a simile." As far as I know, the texts (the Pali ones at least) don't delve into the question of precisely why some intelligent people understand things more readily this way. (Though the attached file below may give you some ideas about this). For our present purposes, however, the explanation for their efficacy doesn't really matter. All that matters is that some persons in the Buddha's audience understood things better when they were presented in figurative terms.

That being so, the frequency of martial subjects as the vehicle of comparison in the Suttas' similes and metaphors may be credited to the Buddha's having a substantial number of followers who would best understand a teaching when it was presented to them using tropes of this sort. That shouldn't come as much of a surprise when we look at the list of the Buddha's most prominent disciples and observe how many of them were of kshatriya upbringing.

Theories of metaphor, from M.H. Abrams' A Glossary of Literary Terms (10th edition)

[./download/file.php?id=3460](#)

(90.57 KiB) Downloaded 7 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 9, 2017 8:56 PM

Title: Re: Contemporary threats to free speech

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 10, 2017 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

May I first of all ask whether the following would be a fair statement of your present position:

- The Buddha teaches the cutting off of greed, hate and delusion as the highest aim for a sentient being.
- The course of practice that this entails is represented by a rich variety of imagery, whose tropes include the botanical, the horticultural, the mercantile, the gastronomic, etc. Then in some Suttas the tropes are martial – relating to success in battle and suchlike.
- What is martial is violent.
- Therefore the cutting off of greed, hate and delusion is violent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 10, 2017 2:32 PM

Title: Re: Contemporary threats to free speech

Content:

Have you any notions as to what may have caused this decline in civility?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 7:28 AM

Title: Re: I have attained the fruition of Anagami

Content:

The member hasn't logged in for the last fortnight.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 7:53 AM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

I don't think this is something that is generally the case, though it might be justly said in connection with the Vajrayana and certain teachers in the Thai forest tradition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

It's not bad, but why waste olive oil, which costs a fortune in Thailand, when the most common of the country's non-lethal traps will cost you only one little lump of sticky rice per rat?

1.jpg (41.73 KiB) Viewed 2679 times

2.jpg (63.83 KiB) Viewed 2679 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 5:39 PM

Title: Re: Contemporary threats to free speech

Content:

Hi Lyndon,

You say that a lot of them don't impress you. Would I be right then in concluding that at least some of them do impress you?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 8:03 PM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

The secret (as I learned from a visiting thudong monk) is to lightly toast the ball of sticky rice over a candle flame before attaching it to the dangling pin. Doing it this way I would catch a rat virtually every night and the captures only came to an end when the whole family had been safely removed.

I also made a modification to the trap by using a hacksaw to cut off the bottom quarter inch of the trapdoor. The resulting gap is too small for the trapped rat to escape through, but it ensures that its tail doesn't get damaged when the door snaps shut.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 11, 2017 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

These threads always remind me of Jasper Carrott's "I've got this mole..." sketch.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 8:35 AM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

Yes, they undoubtedly were, but I think for the most part this didn't result in any serious misrepresentation of the Buddha's teaching. Mostly it just entailed the translators' use of terms that would nowadays strike a person well-informed about Buddhism as a bit odd or even funny. For example, the translation of vassa-vasāna as "Buddhist Lent" or sāmaṇera as "deacon".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 11:10 AM

Title: Re: Great Doubt

Content:

Sure there's room for tentativeness. It is for the tentative, the hesitant and the sceptical that the <https://suttacentral.net/en/mn60> is intended. In this sutta, one whose doxastic commitment is spurred by consideration of "lucky throws" and "unlucky throws" is certainly being tentative, yet the Buddha calls her "wise".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 11:30 AM

Title: Re: Anger Rebound During Metta?

Content:

In the Brahmavihāra chapter of the Visuddhimagga, Buddhaghosa describes ten different ways for bringing about the subsidence of anger that may arise while practising mettabhāvanā. His account conveniently collates and expands upon most of what is said about this in the Suttas. You might try experimenting with these until you find which one works best for you.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/PathofPurification2011.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 11:51 AM

Title: Re: Mahadma Agama and other Mahayana texts

Content:

It can be downloaded from the translator's personal website.

http://www.thezensite.com/ZenTeachings/Translations/PlatformSutra_McRaeTranslation.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 2:05 PM

Title: Re: Does anybody know where I can request some of these chanting books?

Content:

I'm not 100% sure, but I believe it's one that was compiled by the American Ed Stauffer when he was a monk at Wat Boworniwet from 1985-7. After he disrobed he set up a computer typesetting company in Bangkok and printed a few copies of the book. I don't think it will be easy to get hold of a copy now, but if you want to get in touch with Ed (assuming he's still alive), his company is/was called COMSET Ltd.

May I ask where you encountered it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 12, 2017 9:13 PM

Title: Re: What are 18 types of perceptions (Sanna)?

Content:

In the Tipiṭaka it's only in the Paṭisambhidāmagga that all eighteen are collated, especially in the opening chapter, the Nāṇakathā. Individually, or in smaller numerical groups, many also appear in various suttas of the Aṅguttara Nikāya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 13, 2017 8:21 AM

Title: Re: AN 10.177 Jāṇussoṇī Sutta. To Janussonin.

Content:

The sutta says that it's possible to benefit beings in the peta/preta realm and nowhere else.

The Milindapañha narrows it down further, stating that there are four kinds of peta, of which only one, the paradattūpajīvī, is able to benefit from the gifts of humans.

“Three of the four classes of peta do not receive it: those who feed on what has been

vomited up, those who are tormented by hunger and thirst, those who are consumed by craving.” (Mil. 294)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 13, 2017 8:48 AM

Title: Re: Principles of right speech in argumentation

Content:

When Theravada monks disagree about a point of Dhamma or Vinaya, they may well debate the matter, but nowadays it's seldom that the debate will be in the public arena, except of course when it takes the form of publishing articles. A few examples in recent years:

Thanissaro vs. Anālayo on bhikkhuni ordination.

Bodhi vs. Thanissaro on war.

Critics of Ñāṇavīra vs. proponents of Ñāṇavīra.

Proponents of Thanissaro's view of jhāna vs. proponents of Brahmavaṃso's view.

Sujāto vs. Winton Higgins on secular Buddhism.

Etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 13, 2017 10:37 AM

Title: Re: Principles of right speech in argumentation

Content:

Sorry, I haven't kept a record of the links. I could probably find them with Google, but so could you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 14, 2017 7:09 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Bodhi on War and Thanissaro's rebuttal

Content:

It has been known to do so.

For about two centuries, the hashashin specialized in assassinating their religious and political enemies. These killings were often conducted in full view of the public and often in broad daylight, so as to instill terror in their foes. Assassinations were primarily carried out with a dagger, which was sometimes tipped with poison. Due to being immensely outnumbered in enemy territory, the hashashin tended to specialize in covert operations. Hashashin would often assimilate themselves in the towns and regions of their targets and, over time, stealthily insert themselves into strategic positions. They did not always kill their targets, however, preferring at times to try to

threaten an enemy into submission. This could sometimes be accomplished with a dagger and a threatening note placed on an enemy's pillow. The assassin group was indeed feared enough so that these threats were sometimes taken seriously, as in the case when Saladin, the Muslim Sultan of Egypt and Syria, made an alliance with the rebel sect in order to avoid more attempts on his life. One of these attempts involved the Assassins placing a poisoned cake on Saladin's chest as he slept, with a warning note to desist from his military exploits.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Assassins>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 14, 2017 8:47 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Bodhi on War and Thanissaro's rebuttal

Content:

As far as I know, venerables Bodhi, Thanissaro and myself are all of one mind in regarding the act of intentional killing as being always an akusala kamma. On this point there's no dispute.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 15, 2017 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Killing Rats

Content:

Congratulations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 15, 2017 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Bodhi on War and Thanissaro's rebuttal

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 15, 2017 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Bodhi on War and Thanissaro's rebuttal

Content:

Actually my first post to this thread wasn't aimed at suggesting anything. It was a factual correction on a point of history.

And I don't think you've got it quite right about the Assassins' method. It wasn't that they killed "very violently" (there's nothing especially violent about using a poison-tipped

dagger) that made them feared. Rather, it was the fact that no tyrant or warlord was safe from them. No matter how well you guarded yourself, the Assassins could still find a way to get to you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 15, 2017 10:05 AM

Title: Re: more controversial views of theravada buddhism

Content:

Lance Cousins' critical review of Anderson's book is an interesting read:

<http://blogs.dickinson.edu/buddhistethics/files/2010/04/cousins0111.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 16, 2017 3:39 AM

Title: Re: Nessajika: Sleeping upright not lying down

Content:

Actually the latter appears to have observed almost all of the dhutangas.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/thag16.7>

Finally, in the MN's Sappurisa Sutta the sitter's practice, along with some other austerities, is included in a list of several good practices that certain monks undertake for bad reasons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 16, 2017 4:37 AM

Title: Re: The myth of "Sthaviravada"

Content:

That doesn't follow. Mutual intelligibility isn't always a two-way street. Modern Icelanders, for example, can read and readily understand the Old Icelandic verse of Egil Skallagrímsson, the 10th century Viking. But it's highly unlikely that Egil would make any sense of a Halldór Laxness novel. For a start he would be completely flummoxed by all the neologisms.

A speaker of the Vedic language, if presented with, say, a play by Kālidāsa, like Egil Skallagrímsson would have to deal with a mountain of neologisms, but unlike Egil he would also have to confront a radically altered grammar.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 16, 2017 4:32 PM

Title: Re: Executive Action of Deportations

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 11:31 AM

Title: Re: POTUS 2020, part 1

Content:

One possible connection is that one can easily imagine the new president launching an economy-boosting scheme like this:

At one time the awakened one, the Lord was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove at the squirrels' feeling-place. Now at that time Vesālī was prosperous and flourishing, full of folk, thronged with people, and it was well off for food; and there were seven thousand seven hundred and seven long houses, and seven thousand seven hundred and seven gabled buildings, and seven thousand seven hundred and seven parks, and seven thousand seven hundred and seven lotus-tanks. There was the courtesan Ambapālī, beautiful, good to look upon, charming, she was possessed of the utmost beauty of complexion, was clever at dancing and singing and lute-playing, much visited by desirous people and she went for a night for fifty, and through her Vesālī shone forth all the more.

Then the urban council of Rājagaha went to Vesālī on some business. The urban council of Rājagaha saw that Vesālī was prosperous and flourishing, full of folk, thronged with people, and well off for food; and (they saw) the seven thousand seven hundred and seven long houses ... seven thousand seven hundred and seven lotus-tanks, and Ambapālī, the courtesan, beautiful, good to look upon, charming ... and (they saw) that through her Vesālī shone forth all the more. Then the urban council of Rājagaha, having transacted that business in Vesālī, came back again to Rājagaha; they approached King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha; having approached they spoke thus to King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha:

“Sire, Vesālī is prosperous and flourishing ... and through her Vesālī shines forth all the more. It were good, sire, if we too might establish a courtesan.”

“Well now, good sirs, do find such a girl as you might establish as a courtesan.”
(Vin. i. 268)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 12:56 PM

Title: Re: Is Māra traditionally considered a "deva"?

Content:

Your source is actually G.P. Malalasekera's Dictionary of Pali Proper Names. The full entry with endnotes is available from Ven. Pesala's site:

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/mara.html>

Nyanaponika didn't compile a dictionary, as far as I know. His teacher Nyanatiloka did, and upholds the orthodox five-māra view (i.e. four figurative meanings and one literal): Māra: (lit. 'the killer'), is the Buddhist 'Tempter-figure. He is often called 'Māra the Evil One' (pāpimā māro) or Namuci (lit. 'the non-liberator', i.e. the opponent of liberation). He appears in the texts both as a real person (i.e. as a deity) and as personification of evil and passions, of the totality of worldly existence, and of death. Later Pāḷiliterature often speaks of a 'fivefold Māra' (pañca-māra): 1. M. as a deity (devaputta-māra), 2. the M. of defilements (kilesa-m.), 3. the M. of the aggregates (khandha-m.), 4. the M. of the kamma-formations (kamma-m.), and 5. Māra as death (maccu-m.).

As a real person, M. is regarded as the deity ruling over the highest heaven of the sensuous sphere (kāmāvacara), that of the paranimmitavasavatti-devas, the 'deities wielding power over the creations of others' (Com. to M. 1). According to tradition, when the Bodhisatta was seated under the Bodhi-tree, Māra tried in vain to obstruct his attainment of Enlightenment, first by frightening him through his hosts of demons, etc., and then by his 3 daughters' allurements. This episode is called 'Māra's war' (māra-yuddha). For 7 years M. had followed the Buddha, looking for any weakness in him; that is, 6 years before the Enlightenment and one year after it (Sn. v. 446). He also tried to induce the Buddha to pass away into Parinibbāna without proclaiming the Dhamma, and also when the time for the Buddha's Parinibbāna had come, he urged him on. But the Buddha acted on his own insight in both cases. See D. 16.

For (3) M. as the aggregates, s. S. XXIII, 1, 11, 12, 23. See Padhāna Sutta (Sn. v. 425ff.); Māra Saṃyutta (S. IV).

http://www.budsas.org/ebud/bud-dict/dic3_m.htm

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 4:30 PM

Title: Re: SN 16.1 Santuṭṭhi Sutta. Content.

Content:

Usually he is referred to in the Suttas as Mahākassapa (= Skt. Mahākāśyapa), though sometimes—as in the present case—it's shortened to Kassapa. This is actually his brahmin clan name; his personal name was Pippali.

http://aimwell.org/DPPN/maha-kassapa_thera.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 6:12 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2020, part 1

Content:

Not in any very obvious way.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 6:20 PM
Title: Re: Five-Māras

Content:
The view that the term 'Māra' is to be understood as having five applications.

In ancient times it was opposed to the views of certain non-Theravadin schools who posited more than five or less than five applications.

Nowadays it's mostly opposed to the views of those modernists who hold that the term is always to be understood figuratively, thereby denying the existence of Māra devaputta.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 17, 2017 9:10 PM
Title: Re: I am literally on the 8th jhana right now (sarcasm)

Content:
This is how I'm tempted to deal with it...

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

But so far I've always managed to resist the temptation. In practice, unless the person specifically sought me out, looking for confirmation, I just wouldn't involve myself with it.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 18, 2017 12:34 PM
Title: Brahmacariyā among the devas
Content:

Actually, though this is said surprisingly often by certain modern Buddhist teachers, there is no report of the Buddha ever doing so. At the Third Council the Theravādins explicitly rejected the view (propounded by the Sammitīyas) that "there is no living of the brahmacariyā among the devas".

<https://suttacentral.net/en/kv1.3>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 18, 2017 3:47 PM

Title: Re: Brahmacariyā among the devas

Content:

Fair enough. If you would rather not have the above comment quoted, I'll be happy to delete this thread too. I just thought that this particular point was worth remarking on as the error seems so widespread nowadays.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 18, 2017 3:55 PM

Title: Re: Brahmacariyā among the devas

Content:

Certainly in the commentaries there are lots of episodes where devas attain stream-entry while listening to a Dhamma talk. As for the Suttas, there are mentions of certain devas being ariyans, but I'm not sure if there are any which describe someone becoming an ariyan as a deva. There might be, but I can't immediately think of one. The Sakkapañha Sutta has Sakka declaring himself to be a stream-entrant, but afaik it's not stated in the Suttas whether he attained sotāpatti as a human or as a deva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Brahmacariyā among the devas

Content:

The Visuddhimagga on the Buddha's epithet "Satthā deva-manussānaṃ".

TEACHER OF GODS AND MEN

He teaches (anusāsati) by means of the here and now, of the life to come, and of the ultimate goal, according as befits the case, thus he is the Teacher (satthar). And furthermore this meaning should be understood according to the Niddesa thus:

“Teacher (satthar)’: the Blessed One is a caravan leader (satthar) since he brings home caravans (sattha). Just as one who brings a caravan home gets caravans across a wilderness, gets them across a robber-infested wilderness, gets them across a wild-beast-infested wilderness, gets them across a foodless wilderness, gets them across a waterless wilderness, gets them right across, gets them quite across, gets them properly across, gets them to reach a land of safety, so too the Blessed One is a caravan leader, one who brings home the caravans, he gets them across a wilderness, gets them across the wilderness of birth” (Nidd. I 446).

Of gods and men: devamanussānaṃ = devānañ ca manussānañ ca (resolution of compound). This is said in order to denote those who are the best and also to denote those persons capable of progress. For the Blessed One as a teacher bestowed his teaching upon animals as well. For when animals can, through listening to the Blessed

One's Dhamma, acquire the benefit of a [suitable rebirth as] support [for progress], and with the benefit of that same support they come, in their second or third rebirth, to partake of the path and its fruition.

Maṇḍūkā, the deity's son, and others illustrate this. While the Blessed One was teaching the Dhamma to the inhabitants of the city of Campā on the banks of the Gaggarā Lake, it seems, a frog apprehended a sign in the Blessed One's voice. A cowherd who was standing leaning on a stick put his stick on the frog's head and crushed it. He died and was straight away reborn in a gilded, divine palace, twelve leagues broad in the Tāvātimsa heaven. He found himself there, as if waking up from sleep, amidst a host of celestial nymphs, and he exclaimed, "So I have actually been reborn here. What deed did I do?" When he sought for the reason, he found it was none other than his apprehension of the sign in the Blessed One's voice. He went with his divine palace at once to the Blessed One and paid homage at his feet. Though the Blessed One knew about it, he asked him:

"Who now pays homage at my feet,
Shining with glory of success,
Illuminating all around
With beauty so outstanding?"

"In my last life I was a frog,
The waters of a pond my home;
A cowherd's crook ended my life
While listening to your Dhamma" (Vv. 49).

The Blessed One taught him the Dhamma. Eighty-four thousand creatures gained penetration to the Dhamma. As soon as the deity's son became established in the fruition of stream-entry he smiled and then vanished.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 9:49 AM

Title: Re: American Exceptionalism

Content:

I asked an Afghan Facebook friend. Apparently they sing the Milli Surood, a Pashto song with a bit of Arabic tacked on at the end. With its listing of all the nation's tribes it reminds me a little of the Anglo-Saxon poem http://www.phil-fak.uni-duesseldorf.de/fileadmin/Redaktion/Institute/Anglistik/Anglistik_I/Downloads/Archiv/S_S_06/VL06_Widsith.pdf. And it's definitely MUCH more exceptional than God Bless America.

In translation:

This land is Afghanistan

It is the pride of every Afghan

The land of peace, the land of the sword

Its sons are all brave.

This is the country of every tribe:
Land of Baluch, and Uzbeks,
Pashtoons, and Hazaras,
Turkman and Tajiks with them.
Arabs and Gojars, Pamirian,
Nooristanis, Barahawi, and Qizilbash.
Not to mention the Aimaq and the Pashaye.

This Land will shine for ever
Like the sun in the blue sky
In the chest of Asia.
It will remain as the heart for ever.
We will follow the one God
We all say, Allah is great!
We all say, Allah is great!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 12:04 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga

Content:

I don't think it's really a substitute. The Paṭisambhidāmagga has a lot of helpful material that isn't found in the Visuddhimagga. For example, its description of the eighteen faults (aṭṭhārasa upakkilesa) that may occur in the beginning stage of ānāpānassati isn't mentioned in the Visuddhimagga's account of this method, nor in any other commentary except the Saddhammappakāsinī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 12:25 PM

Title: Re: Brahmacariyā among the devas

Content:

As this passage comes from an account of how to practise buddhānussati, recollection of the qualities of the Buddha, I would suppose that it's the Buddha's special ability that it aims to highlight. There are other passages, however, that speak of animals benefiting in one way or another when taught Dhamma even by non-Buddhas. There are a couple of examples mentioned in Rita Langer's Buddhist Rituals of Death and Rebirth.

<https://tinyurl.com/zccd6xq>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 1:12 PM

Title: Re: Brahmachariyā among the devas

Content:

No. It means that every sound is either intrinsically desirable or undesirable, but beings are unequal in their capacity to discern which it is. If one hears a desirable sound and finds it desirable, then one is perceiving it as it really is, but if one doesn't enjoy it, it's because of mental distortion (*vippallāsa*). In the stories mentioned in my link, the frog, the parrot and the 500 bats had the requisite accumulations to be able to recognize desirable sounds as desirable and respond appropriately.

And so it's not that the sound itself "produces both wholesome and unwholesome" but that the mental processing of it does.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 1:23 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga

Content:

No.

The Eighteen Kinds of Knowledge of Imperfections

The following are obstacles to concentration:

- (i) The internally distracted consciousness of one who follows with mindfulness the beginning, middle, and end of the in-breath.
- (ii) The externally distracted consciousness of one who follows with mindfulness the beginning, middle, and end of the out-breath.
- (iii) A state of craving consisting of desire for, and expectation of, in-breath.
- (iv) A state of craving consisting of desire for, and expectation of, out-breath.
- (v) Longing for the obtaining of the out-breath by one wearied by the in-breath.
- (vi) Longing for the obtaining of the in-breath by one wearied by the out-breath.
- (vii) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the in-breath when one adverts to the sign.
- (viii) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the sign when one adverts to the in-breath.
- (ix) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the out-breath when one adverts to the sign.
- (x) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the sign when one adverts to the out-breath.
- (xi) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the out-breath when one adverts to the in-breath.
- (xii) Consciousness which wavers in regard to the in-breath when one adverts to the out-breath.
- (xiii) Consciousness which runs after the past (breaths) and is attacked by distraction.

(xiv) Consciousness which looks forward to the future (breaths) and is attacked by wavering.

(xv) Slack consciousness attacked by indolence.

(xvi) Over-exerted consciousness attacked by agitation.

(xvii) Consciousness which is attracted and attacked by greed.

(xviii) Consciousness which is discontented and attacked by ill will.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga

Content:

Perhaps pirated editions may be available, but not legal ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 19, 2017 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

He was still alive on 30th November last year.

<https://www.facebook.com/Laurence-of-Embracia-1536075609963440/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 20, 2017 10:35 AM

Title: Re: A people who claims he is arahat and he smokes a lot of cigarettes and drinks coffee

Content:

All of the known Vinayas of Indian Buddhist schools are the same in this matter:

A bhikkhu who believes himself to be an arahant tells a fellow bhikkhu or bhikkhuni of his attainment: no offence.

A bhikkhu who believes himself to be an arahant tells an unordained person of his attainment: a middling offence (pācittiya) that can be cured by confession.

A bhikkhu who knows himself to be not an arahant tells anyone —monastic or householder— that he is an arahant: a defeating offence.

In all cases it's irrelevant whether the bhikkhu has actually attained anything or not. In the second scenario guilt lies in his disclosure to a householder, while in the third it lies in his intention to deceive.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 20, 2017 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Thai police raid Dhammakaya temple in hunt for wanted monk

Content:

<http://www.bangkokpost.com/opinion/opinion/1201409/officials-may-be-wishing-monk-has-fled>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 21, 2017 10:36 AM

Title: Re: Looking for Russian speaking Teachers

Content:

Though the English page doesn't mention it, the Russian page states that there won't be any more courses in Russian because Ajahn Hubert is returning to teach in Latvia.

Do you know where Mae Chee Nadezhda is living nowadays? Last I heard she was acting as assistant teacher to a Russian bhikkhu somewhere in Thailand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 21, 2017 10:53 AM

Title: Re: Is Māra traditionally considered a "deva"?

Content:

I couldn't get the link to work, but this one does:

<https://tinyurl.com/zqgfs79>

As it's an 11MB file from the very slow website of the University of Peradeniya, if you have problems then try downloading after midnight when the Sri Lankans have gone to bed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 21, 2017 2:34 PM

Title: Re: The whole body, not the heart, as "seat of consciousness": the Buddha's view

Content:

In the Kiṭṭāgirisutta, body-witnesses are so called because they contact the list of attainments with their body (kāyena phusitvā). The commentary takes body here as meaning the nāmakāya (i.e. consciousness + all the mental factors except for the jhāna factors themselves), not the rūpakāya:

"kāyena phusitvā" ti saha-jātanāmakāyena phusitvā

"Having reached/contacted [the attainment] with the body" means having reached/contacted with the conascent body of mental [factors].
(MA. iii. 191)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 22, 2017 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Pali Term: Nimitta

Content:

The link's dead. Use this:

<http://web.archive.org/web/20160410071256/http://www.globalbuddhism.org/15/cox14.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 22, 2017 10:01 AM

Title: Re: Marine Le Pen and monasticism

Content:

I don't think so. I saw an interview with her where the question was posed regarding Catholic nuns. She replied that the law would not apply to "les religieux et les religieuses", meaning monks, priests, nuns or any other professional religious persons who are required to wear special costumes.

The same position was taken by Jacques Myard, a politician from Les Républicains (a centre-right party), who defended the French government's position in the Doha debate on whether France was right to ban the niqab.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 22, 2017 12:11 PM

Title: Re: Obsessive-Compulsive Disorder

Content:

But I hadn't heard that the Magisterium had declared scrupulosity to be a blameless neurological disorder. Do you have a source for that?

In the Pali commentaries scrupulosity is treated as a mode of the hindrance of worry and a near-enemy of zeal for the training (sikkhākāmatā).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 22, 2017 1:24 PM

Title: Re: Marine Le Pen and monasticism

Content:
I doubt it.

It may seem quite reasonable to a non-Frenchman that if a niqab counts as an "ostentatious religious symbol", then so should a turban. But the outlook of Le Pen and her people isn't informed by this kind of reasoning. Their outlook is informed by the French Enlightenment conception of the <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2012/entries/rousseau/#IdeGenWil> (volonté générale), or rather, to one particular (and rather extreme) form that this conception has taken. In short, if Le Pen gets her way, niqabs will be banned because lots of French don't like them or the people who wear them. The Sikh turban will not be banned because few French care one way or the other about turbans or the people who wear them. The "ostentatious religious symbol" talk is merely a pretext.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 23, 2017 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Which jhanas are necessary to attain Nibbana?

Content:

It isn't safe to assume this, for to do so entails the further assumption that one can crave only for things that one has experience of, but this latter assumption is empirically false. One can crave, for example, to visit a country that one has never visited before.

What it is safe to assume is that since everyone's attainment of arahatta entails his abandoning of the fetters of rūpa-rāga and arūpa-rāga, the said fetters are in some way inherent in the constitution of the non-arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 23, 2017 6:29 AM

Title: Re: How to deal with "found cash"?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 23, 2017 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Āgama translation questions

Content:

Do you know what Indic word it translates?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 23, 2017 12:23 PM

Title: Re: Āgama translation questions

Content:

Possibly visaṅkhāra then. In the earliest Pali sources the word is only found in Dhammapada 154.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 24, 2017 12:53 AM

Title: Re: exact meaning of the fetter "attachment to rites and rituals" & the term "precept"

Content:

It can be either sīla or sikkhāpada ("training clause").

And so for "five precepts" one will meet with both pañca sīlāni (or, as a compound, pañcasīlaṃ) and pañca sikkhāpadāni.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 24, 2017 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Sakka

Content:

For the Dhammapada Commentary's account go to the link below and scroll down to "The Story of Magha".

<https://www.bps.lk/olib/wh/wh287-p.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 24, 2017 10:43 AM

Title: Re: Sakka

Content:

And for the account in the SN's Sakkasamyutta see the following suttas:

Sakka's vows

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn11.11>

Sakka's names

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn11.12>

The poor man

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn11.14>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 24, 2017 7:38 PM

Title: Re: Taking refuge in attachment, aversion and ignorance?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 25, 2017 10:12 AM

Title: Re: Taking refuge in attachment, aversion and ignorance?

Content:

I find your solution a little too easy; more of an explaining away than an explaining. It would be plausible if the Buddha was represented as automatically and instinctively revering the Dhamma from the get-go, but the two suttas don't depict the Buddha's reverence for the Dhamma in this way. They depict it as involving a decision on his part – a decision made as the outcome of some mental deliberation. It wasn't automatic: the newly awakened Gotama had to have a think about it. Though this decision was made not long after his enlightenment, nonetheless, it was made after it. That is to say, it wasn't part and parcel of the enlightenment experience like the paṭisambhidās or the tathāgatabalas. And so on the face of it the suttas seem to be saying that there was an interval in between the enlightenment and the deliberation under the Ajapālanigrodha tree during which the Buddha did not live "honouring, revering, and dwelling in dependence upon the Dhamma alone"; and that this living without an object to revere was a felt lack on his part.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 25, 2017 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

Would you happen to know what became of Susaṇṇā, the Australian nun whom Khantipālo ordained? As a mae chee she came to spend the vassa with us at Wat Pa Ban Tard in 1986. After Khantipālo's disrobing I heard that she had ordained as a sāmaṇerī somewhere, but since then I've lost track of her.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 25, 2017 5:05 PM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

Assuming that I've guessed right, I don't know of any particular text that says what the therā says, but it's something that might be readily inferred from the Abhidhamma's

description of these faculties.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 25, 2017 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

No. The sense-faculties are rūpa-dhammas generated by past kamma. The spiritual faculties are nāma-dhammas generated by one's encountering various kinds of wholesome influence and having the vāsanā to respond appropriately to them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 9:56 AM

Title: Re: Elements Of Unethical For Verdict 4 (Of 5), 8, 10 Sila

Content:

It seems to be a google (or some other computer-generated) English translation of a Vietnamese article on Vinaya. This can be seen from the fact that a number of Vietnamese words have been left untranslated and the article is for the most part unintelligible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 10:50 AM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

Perhaps because the brahmavihāras's objects (i.e. living beings) are concepts (paññatti), not dhammas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

All four brahmavihāras are dhammas. But what they take as their objects (ārammaṇa) are concepts.

In the case of karuṇā and muditā the ārammaṇa can only ever be a living being.

In the case of adosa (freedom-from-hate) and tatramajjhataṭṭā (neutrality), the ārammaṇa may be either a living being or a saṅkhāra. But when adosa occurs in the mode of mettā-brahmavihāra, or when tatramajjhataṭṭā occurs in the mode of upekkhā-brahmavihāra, the ārammaṇa can only be living beings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 2:52 PM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

The article doesn't say this. Rather, the Wiki contributor has offered eye/vision faculty as a translation of cakkhundriya to reflect two competing opinions (one realist and the other phenomenological) as to the nature of these faculties.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 6:05 PM

Title: Re: Are there seven Indriya for an Arahant?

Content:

The indriyas that are cetasikas will take the same ārammaṇa as the citta with which they arise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 6:21 PM

Title: Re: Taking refuge in attachment, aversion and ignorance?

Content:

Sorry, I overlooked your reply. Nothing really to add at the moment, though the hindsight narrative suggestion seems an interesting possibility.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 26, 2017 7:08 PM

Title: Re: Wat Dhammakaya

Content:

I don't think it's correct to call the terrorist attacks and atrocities in Thailand's far South "Islamic terror attacks" any more than it would be to call the Thai army's atrocities there "Buddhist terror attacks". The perpetrators in the former case are indeed Muslims, but their actions are carried out in the cause of Malayan nationalist separatism, not Islam. In other words, as in the case of Northern Ireland in the 1970's, it's not in essence a religious conflict; rather, it's a political conflict with an exacerbating religious dimension to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 27, 2017 10:43 AM

Title: Re: Tea and coffee at temples

Content:

In most Thai and Sri Lankan temples they are permitted to monks and laity alike. In some Burmese temples tea is not permitted after midday for monks or for laity observing the eight precepts. The reason is that it's considered to be a food rather than a medicine because of the Burmese practice of fermenting tea leaves and eating them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 27, 2017 4:25 PM

Title: Re: How common is stream entry?

Content:

There are said to be several stages in the disappearance of the Saddhamma, with two different schemes describing this: one a five-stage one and the other a three-stage one. In both schemes the disappearance of ariyan attainments (adhigama-antaradhāna) is only the first stage.

Then, according to the five-stage scheme...

After the first disappearance there is still practice but it's a practice that's incapable of yielding the highest fruits in the present life. But after some time people give up practising. This is the second disappearance, called paṭipatti-antaradhāna.

Even though practice has disappeared, the scriptures still exist and are still studied. But after some time even study comes to be neglected and disappears. This is pariyatti-antaradhāna.

Nevertheless a remnant of the monastic saṅgha still exists, albeit scarcely more than a token saṅgha, knowing nothing of the Dhamma and hardly observing any Vinaya. But even this eventually disappears. This is called līṅga-antaradhāna. I think līṅga here means something like an outward visible sign of something.

Then, some time after the saṅgha has disappeared the Buddha's bodily relics disappear. This is called disappearance of the elements dhātu-antaradhāna. Only then is the dark age in between Sammāsambuddhas said to begin.

In the three-stage scheme the last two stages are omitted.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 28, 2017 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Tea and coffee at temples

Content:

I've never tried the Burmese product.

For three years I lived in a Northern Thai mountain village where it was too high to grow rice and so the main crop was mieng — green tea that's munched like chewing gum with a bit of salt. Despite long and frequent exposure to it, I was never able to acquire a taste for it. To me it's just unbelievably bitter and horrible.

miang.jpg (78.57 KiB) Viewed 7843 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 3, 2017 9:34 AM

Title: Re: A manual of the Dhamma by Ledi Sayadaw

Content:

Not much of a controversy, really. Virtually all Theravadin teachers, Eastern or Western, hold to the traditional view, which is that stated by venerables Bodhi and Thanissaro. I believe Ajahn Brahm is completely on his own in his quirky contention that the ariyaśaṅgha is a subset of the monastic saṅgha. More to the point, the sole proof he offers doesn't really prove his point at all. His argument, in a nutshell, is:

1. One of the nine special qualities of the ariyaśaṅgha is that it is “worthy of gifts” (dakkhiṇeyya).
2. The bhikkhu and bhikkhunī saṅghas live off gifts, but householders don't.
3. Therefore the ariyaśaṅgha is limited to ariyan bhikkhus and ariyan bhikkhunīs; ariyan householders, ariyan devas, ariyan brahmās, etc., are not members of it.

In the Suttas, however, it is not only the ariyaśaṅgha that is said to be dakkhiṇeyya. One's parents are also described in this way. Secondly, even if it were only the ariyaśaṅgha that was described as dakkhiṇeyya, the fact that a person is said to be worthy of gifts carries no implication that he is someone who lives off that which he is worthy of. Most parents, for example, don't live off their children's gifts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 3, 2017 10:57 AM

Title: Re: A manual of the Dhamma by Ledi Sayadaw

Content:

Yes, I would suppose so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 3, 2017 1:24 PM

Title: Re: A manual of the Dhamma by Ledi Sayadaw

Content:

I was checking to make sure that I'd remembered Ajahn Brahm's argument correctly and discovered that the article in question has now been removed from the Dhammaloka website.

It is still available, however, from Binh Anson's site:

<http://www.budsas.org/ebud/ebdha177.htm>

It wouldn't surprise me if Ajahn Brahm has now changed his mind on the issue. The dodgy (and absurdly supercilious) article was written many years ago, before his association with monks like Brahmali and Sujāto.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 4, 2017 2:39 AM

Title: Re: Are you using your head or the heart?

Content:

From karuṇā and paññā.

Through his wisdom the bodhisattva perfects within himself the character of a Buddha, through his compassion the ability to perform the work of a Buddha. Through wisdom he brings himself across (the stream of becoming), through compassion he leads others across. Through wisdom he understands the suffering of others, through compassion he strives to alleviate their suffering. Through wisdom he becomes disenchanted with suffering, through compassion he accepts suffering. Through wisdom he aspires for nibbāna, through compassion he remains in the round of existence. Through compassion he enters saṃsāra, through wisdom he does not delight in it. Through wisdom he destroys all attachments, but because his wisdom is accompanied by compassion he never desists from activity that benefits others. Through compassion he shakes with sympathy for all, but because his compassion is accompanied by wisdom his mind is unattached. Through wisdom he is free from "I-making" and "mine-making," through compassion he is free from lethargy and depression.

So too, through wisdom and compassion respectively, he becomes his own protector and the protector of others, a sage and a hero, one who does not torment himself and one who does not torment others, one who promotes his own welfare and the welfare of others, fearless and a giver of fearlessness, dominated by consideration for the Dhamma and by consideration for the world, grateful for favors done and forward in doing favors for others, devoid of delusion and devoid of craving, accomplished in knowledge and accomplished in conduct, possessed of the powers and possessed of the grounds of self-confidence.

(Dhammapāla, <http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel409.html>)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 4, 2017 3:21 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a sutta: on visiting monks

Content:

“Here, student, some man or woman does not visit a recluse or a brahmin and ask: ‘Venerable sir, what is wholesome? What is unwholesome? What is blameable? What is blameless? What should be cultivated? What should not be cultivated? What kind of action will lead to my harm and suffering for a long time? What kind of action will lead to my welfare and happiness for a long time?’ Because of performing and undertaking such action...he reappears in a state of deprivation...But if instead he comes back to the human state, then wherever he is reborn he is stupid. This is the way, student, that leads to stupidity, namely, one does not visit a recluse or brahmin and ask such questions.

“But here, student, some man or woman visits a recluse or a brahmin and asks: ‘Venerable sir, what is wholesome? What is unwholesome? What is blameable? What is blameless? What should be cultivated? What should not be cultivated? What kind of action will lead to my harm and suffering for a long time? What kind of action will lead to my welfare and happiness for a long time?’ Because of performing and undertaking such action...he reappears in a happy destination...But if instead he comes back to the human state, then wherever he is reborn he is wise. This is the way, student, that leads to wisdom, namely, one visits a recluse or brahmin and asks such questions.

(Cūḷakammavibhanga Sutta)

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn135>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 4, 2017 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a sutta: on visiting monks

Content:

The same list of questions is found also in the DN’s Cakkavatti-Sīhanāda and Lakkhaṇa Suttas. Also in the paracanonical Peṭakopadesa, citing a sutta that’s now missing from the Canon.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn26>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn30>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 5, 2017 7:28 AM

Title: Re: 2 versions of foundations of mindfulness

Content:

No, it was for virtually the opposite reason. It was to ensure that the Dhamma recited by Ānanda and the Vinaya recited by Upāli would gain acceptance as authoritative on

account of its endorsement by the rest of the five hundred arahant bhikkhus. See these links for the Vinaya's account of the two councils...

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd21>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd22>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 5, 2017 4:32 PM

Title: Re: 2 versions of foundations of mindfulness

Content:

I'm afraid I'm not really the person to consult on a matter like this, for I treat the Pali sources as authoritative and I don't do "higher criticism".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 6, 2017 11:11 AM

Title: Re: supernormal powers

Content:

In a Buddhist context the wrong term would be "supernatural", for iddhis, abhiññās and vijjās are conceived as the natural products of certain kinds of mind-development, as opposed to, say, divine gifts.

As for "supernormal", this would be the right term to use in a Buddhist context, for the normal average person does not have these cognitive capacities. Hence the description of them as uttarimanussadhammā, "dhammas exceeding the [merely] human".

See the discussion in chapter IX of Jayatilleke's

http://www.ahandfulofleaves.org/documents/Early%20Buddhist%20Theory%20of%20Knowledge_Jayatilleke.pdf.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 6, 2017 12:49 PM

Title: Re: I want to read the Visuddhimagga but...

Content:

Kalupahana is referring mainly to Buddhaghosa's exposition of Abhidhamma; in particular his theory of dhammas and the doctrine of momentariness. He is saying that these were shared by a number of Buddhist schools (which is indisputable) and then hinting that Buddhaghosa may have been influenced by these schools in his own exposition of the dhamma theory and momentariness (which is a more conjectural and controversial, and in my opinion, more doubtful claim). To quote him at greater length than the Wiki article does:

In the commentary on the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, Buddhaghosa makes a very important remark regarding the theory of moments (khaṇa-vāda). He says, “herein, the flowing present (santatipacuppanna) finds mention in the commentaries (atthakathā), the enduring present (addhā-paccuppanna) in the discourses (sutta). Some say (keci vadanti) that the thought existing in the momentary present (khaṇa-paccuppanna) becomes the object of telepathic insight.” This account leaves the upholders of the theory of moments unidentified. The identification was made only by Ānanda, who compiled subcommentaries on Buddhaghosa’s commentaries a few centuries later. The theory, even according to Buddhaghosa, was found neither in the discourses nor in the commentaries preserved at the Mahāvihāra, which Buddhaghosa was using for his own commentaries in Pali. Yet this momentary telepathic insight (khaṇika-samādhi) appears as an extremely important theory in his Visuddhimagga.

Furthermore, Buddhaghosa utilized the theory of moments rather profusely in this and other works, especially in his explanation of the functioning of the mind and of the experience of material phenomena. It is important to note that the application of the theory of moments in explaining insight or intuition was popular in the Mahāyāna schools before and after Buddhaghosa, while its use in the explanation of empirical phenomena was common among the Sarvāstivādins and Sautrāntikas. It is not possible to say whether the monks of the Mahāvihāra were aware of the far-reaching consequences of Buddhaghosa’s adoption of the theory of moments. There is no question that it did change the character of the original teachings introduced by Mahinda immediately after Moggalliputtatissa’s refutation of the heretical views during the third century B.C.

In any case, what Kalupahana notes as being shared with other schools does not include any of those things that made the Mahāyāna so objectionable in the eyes of mainstream Indian Buddhists. For example, it has nothing to do with things like the Mahāyāna’s offensive depiction of the arahant (including some of the Buddha’s greatest arahant disciples), its slide towards antinomianism and superstition, the claimed co-opting of autochthonous spirits and deities, the extravagant multiplication of ritual, the mendacious claims regarding the provenance of its sūtras, etc. etc. Kalupahana’s claim is merely that Buddhaghosa’s Abhidhamma shares some features with other abhidharma systems, including one Mahāyāna one (i.e. that of the Yogācārins). In short, even if Kalupahana is right, it ought not to be a cause for concern.

Here is the chapter in full:

[./download/file.php?id=3513](#)
(227.45 KiB) Downloaded 134 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 6, 2017 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Should we change the Sutta, if we find a grey area, to reflect our personal opinion and understanding?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 6, 2017 11:30 PM

Title: Re: POTUS 2016, part 3

Content:

Indeed.

<https://youtu.be/rAdUuGsi30g?t=5>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 7, 2017 10:58 AM

Title: Re: Does anybody know where I can request some or these chanting books?

Content:

That would increase the likelihood that it is indeed Ed Stauffer's book. Ajahn Suchart, the abbot of Wat Yan, would often come to stay at Wat Boworniwet at the time when Stauffer was a monk there and they stayed in the same section of the wat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 7, 2017 1:23 PM

Title: Re: Desert Island books religious/secular/mixture

Content:

Just the Dhamma texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 8, 2017 4:16 PM

Title: Re: Gavesī Sutta

Content:

Observance of the 5, 8, 10, 227 or 311 precepts is a more fundamental restraint (saṃvara) than moderation in eating.

But moderation in eating is a higher / more refined training in restraint than observing the five precepts.

See the Mahā-assapura Sutta.

<http://www.leighb.com/mn39.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 8, 2017 5:19 PM

Title: Re: Parinibbana according to the commentary tradition

Content:

This summarizes what can be found in many places in the commentaries. For example, Path of Purification ch. XVI para. 73.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 8, 2017 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Commentary

Content:

From the Atthasālinī (Dhs-a. 325): the non-generation of further rūpa dhammas by the cuticitta of an arahant ("decease-consciousness of saints")...

Expositor II 424a.jpg (430.73 KiB) Viewed 2318 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 8, 2017 7:32 PM

Title: Re: Gavesī Sutta

Content:

Then he'll be refining his saṃvara in a different order from that prescribed in the Mahā-assapura Sutta. There isn't, however, anything necessarily amiss in that, for the sutta's prescription is aimed at monks. The serious lay practitioner is at liberty to go about such refinement in the order that best suits his disposition and circumstances.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 12, 2017 12:54 AM

Title: Re: why turn the wheel?

Content:

From the Paṭisambhidāmagga:

‘Dhammacakkaṃ’ ti kenaṭṭhena dhammacakkaṃ? Dhammañca pavatteti cakkañcāti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Wheel of the Dhamma: in what sense ‘Wheel of the Dhamma’? [The Blessed One] sets rolling the Dhamma and that itself is the Wheel, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Cakkañca pavatteti dhammañcāti: dhammacakkaṃ.

He sets rolling both the Wheel and the Dhamma, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammena pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

He sets rolling by means of the Dhamma, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammacariyāya pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

He sets rolling by means of the habit of the Dhamma, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme ṭhito pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Standing in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme patiṭṭhito pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Established in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme patiṭṭhāpento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Establishing others in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme vasippatto pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Attained to mastery in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme vasiṃ pāpento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Making others attain to mastery in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme pāramippatto pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Attained to perfection in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme pāramiṃ pāpento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Making others attain perfection in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme vesārajjappatto pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Attained to assurance in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhamme vesārajjam pāpento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Making others attain assurance in the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaṃ sakkaronto pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Honouring the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaṃ garuṃ karonto pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.

Respecting the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaṃ mānento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
Revering the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaṃ pūjento pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
Venerating the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaṃ apacāyamāno pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
Reverencing the Dhamma, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaddhajo pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
With the Dhamma as his flag, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammaketu pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
With the Dhamma as his banner, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Dhammādhipateyyo pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
With Dhamma dominant, he sets rolling, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Taṃ kho pana dhammacakkaṃ appaṭivattiyaṃ samaṇena vā brāhmaṇena vā devena vā
mārena vā brahmunā vā kenaci vā lokasminti: dhammacakkaṃ.
And that Wheel of the Dhamma is not to be stopped by any samaṇa or brahmin or deva
or Māra or Brahmā or by anyone in the world, thus it is the Wheel of the Dhamma.

Saddhindriyaṃ dhammo. Taṃ dhammaṃ pavattetīti: dhammacakkaṃ.
The faith faculty is a dhamma and he sets that dhamma rolling, thus it is the Wheel of
the Dhamma.

(Repeat for the faculties of energy, mindfulness, concentration and understanding; five
powers, seven enlightenment factors, and eightfold path).

(Paṭisam. pp. 159-60)

From the commentaries:

Dhammacakkaṃ ti: desanāñāṇassapi paṭivedhañāṇassapi etaṃ nāmaṃ. Tesu
desanāñāṇaṃ lokiyaṃ, paṭivedhañāṇaṃ lokuttaraṃ.

“Wheel of the Dhamma: this is a term for teaching knowledge and realization knowledge.
Of these, teaching knowledge is mundane, realization knowledge is supramundane.”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 12, 2017 7:09 AM
Title: Re: why turn the wheel?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 12, 2017 7:31 PM

Title: Re: A. Brahm's When Does Human Life Begin..?

Content:

Nobody in this thread has proposed that the gandhabba of the <https://suttacentral.net/en/mn38> is the same as the celestial musicians who feature in the SN's <https://suttacentral.net/sn31>.

On the other hand, it's not implausible to suppose that the Buddha's choice of the word 'gandhabba' (rather than any of the other words he might have used) in the Mahātaṇhāsāṅkhaya Sutta was influenced by the folk belief that gandhabbas (in the celestial musician sense) were in some way connected with fecundity and a successful conception.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 12, 2017 10:49 PM

Title: Re: why turn the wheel?

Content:

No, I haven't, but then I'm not very well-versed in Indian archaeology. There are a few mentions of kilns (kumbhakārapāka) in the suttas, but in connection with pot-making rather than brick-making. The Parivīmaṃsana Sutta, for example.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn12.51>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 12, 2017 10:52 PM

Title: Re: A. Brahm's When Does Human Life Begin..?

Content:

To show that one is singular and the other plural.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 14, 2017 4:15 AM

Title: Re: Vibration and Vipassana

Content:

The relevant sources here are the Senāsaṇa Sutta's account of the characteristics of a suitable lodging and the Visuddhimagga's list of eighteen faults that make a monastery a place to be avoided by meditators. In neither of these is there any mention of good or

bad vibrations (unless by "bad vibrations" one merely means "noise"). Concern about vibrations, whether of people or of places, is a quirk of the U Ba Khin/Sri Goenka tradition that doesn't seem to have any solid foundation in the Pali texts.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an10.11>

<https://tinyurl.com/hxgp579>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 15, 2017 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Interesting thing about the Abhidhammattha Sangaha

Content:

Though the matter isn't discussed in his extant writings, Anuruddha would almost certainly have gone along with the commentarial understanding of *viññāṇaṃ anidassanaṃ*. The commentators did not regard *viññāṇaṃ* in this context as having anything to do with any sort of consciousness. Rather, they considered *viññāṇaṃ* in the sense of 'consciousness' and *viññāṇaṃ* in '*viññāṇaṃ anidassanaṃ*' as being two homonyms (i.e., words identical in sound and spelling but different in meaning). And so according to this view, the one is a noun and the other a modified form of *viññātabbaṃ* ("should be known"). If we translate *viññāṇaṃ anidassanaṃ* according to this understanding, then the correct rendering would be: "the non-manifestive [= *Nibbāna*] should be known", rather than the familiar rendering of "non-manifestive consciousness".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 18, 2017 3:55 PM

Title: Re: Who are these Devas responsible for creation?

Content:

In the case of the *Nimmānarati* devas, I think "creating", rather than, "creation", would more accurately and unambiguously convey the *nimmānaṃ* component of *Nimmānarati*.

On the other hand, there are other contexts where the sense would be better conveyed by "creation", or even adjectivally by "creative". For example, *issaranimmānahetu* in the *Devadaha Sutta*:

Sace, bhikkhave, *sattā issaranimmānahetu sukhadukkhaṃ paṭisaṃvedenti*; *addhā, bhikkhave, nigaṇṭhā pāpakena issarena nimmitā yaṃ etarahi evarūpā dukkhā tibbā kaṭukā vedanā vediyanti*.

"If, monks, the pleasure and pain which creatures undergo are due to creation by an overlord, certainly, monks, the Jains were created by an evil overlord in that they now experience such painful, severe, sharp feelings."

(I.B. Horner)

If the pleasure and pain that beings feel are caused by the creative act of a Supreme God, then the Nigaṇṭhas surely must have been created by an evil Supreme God, since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

(Bodhi)

"If beings experience pleasure & pain based on the creative act of a supreme god, then obviously the Nigaṇṭhas have been created by an evil supreme god, which is why they now feel such fierce, sharp, racking pains.

(Thanissaro)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 18, 2017 4:39 PM

Title: Re: Robe Colors

Content:

<http://www.elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinight/html//lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc2/bmc2.ch02.html>

Scroll down to "Robes of the following colors should not be worn..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 18, 2017 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Who are these Devas responsible for creation?

Content:

Petas. Or more precisely, they're vemānikapetas: ghosts experiencing the vipāka of mixed dark and light kamma, who get to spend half of their time living like a deva in their own celestial mansion, and the other half experiencing the privations of a preta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 19, 2017 1:45 AM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

Lersi or reusii (เรอสี) is just the Thai pronunciation of the Sanskrit ṛṣi (Pali isi), meaning a hermit or sage. He might practise tantric methods, but not necessarily.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 19, 2017 9:56 AM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

The coiners of terms like “Tantric Theravāda” and “Theravāda Tantrism” are following the practice in academic Buddhist and Hindu studies of defining what counts as ‘tantric’ and what does not in a polythetic manner (i.e. based on Wittgenstein’s conception of “https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Family_resemblance”) rather than the monothetic way that would be employed by Tibetans.

As Donald Lopez summarizes the approach:

Another approach would be to employ the notion of polythetic classification. In monothetic classification, the composition of a conceptual class is determined by the invariable presence of certain common properties found in each and every member of that class. In a polythetic classification, however, no single feature is deemed necessary or sufficient for inclusion in the class. The members of the class do not share a single feature in common, but are grouped together based on the greatest number of features in common, with no a priori decision as to the relative importance of these multiple features. Under a polythetic classification, tantra, instead of being reduced to some essence, would constitute the intersection of certain of a larger number of family resemblances. The features constituting this family serve as descriptions rather than criteria. Among these features, one would immediately include elements such as those listed by Gombrich in his definition above, that is, elements that commonly occur in texts called tantras, such as mantras, mudrās, and maṇḍalas. To these one could quickly add the importance of the guru, abhiṣekha (empowerment), vajra (diamond or thunderbolt), sukha (bliss), sahaja (“together-born”), and siddhis (powers). From here, one could move to traditional characterizations of tantra as a form of practice that is secret, easy, and rapid in its effect, based upon the premise that reality resides in the mundane. In modern studies, tantric texts are described as highly ritualistic, antinomian, and nonspeculative, evincing nonduality and often setting forth an elaborate esoteric physiology of cakras and nāḍīs that give special importance to the genitals.

Elaborations on Emptiness: Uses of the Heart Sutra. p. 86

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 19, 2017 11:33 AM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

The Vinaya texts don’t say anything about debts owed to creditors whom the candidate for ordination has forgotten about or who can’t be tracked down. They do say, however, that an ordination will still be valid even though the candidate is in debt. That is to say, being in debt is not included among the absolute impediments to ordination, such as being a matricide, a seducer of bhikkhunīs, etc.

If having unpaid (and presently unpayable) debts troubles you, then before ordaining you might perhaps deposit a sum of money with a trusted friend or a solicitor, with instructions to use it to repay any creditors who happen to show up later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 19, 2017 12:17 PM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

It's just a shorthand locution. It spares us the inconvenience of having to say: "A socially marginal religious phenomenon, arising within a traditionally Theravadin cultural milieu but sharing a certain family resemblance with Tantrism".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 19, 2017 1:24 PM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

Yes, with regard to Brahminism and Shamanism. But the Buddhist component is not early Buddhism, but rather the very late-stage Buddhism of India's monastic universities. Of all the Buddhist nations in Asia, the Tibetans are probably the least well-informed about early Buddhism, largely as a consequence of Atiśa's decree that the Āgama sūtras should not be translated into the Tibetan language.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 20, 2017 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth as a Brahma

Content:

The Kaṇṭhaka story is from the commentaries; the Maṇḍūkā story from the Vimānavatthu verses:

Ko me vandati pādāni, iddhiyā yasaṣā jalam,
Abhikkantena vaṇṇena, sabbā obhāsayam disā ti.

Maṇḍūkohaṃ pure āsiṃ, uḍake vārigocaro,
Tava dhammaṃ suṇantassa, avadhī vacchapālako.

Muhuttaṃ cittapasādassa, iddhiṃ passa yasañca me,
Ānubhāvañca me passa, vaṇṇaṃ passa jutiñca me.

Ye ca te dīghamaddhānaṃ, dhammaṃ assosum gotama,
Pattā te acalaṭṭhānaṃ, yattha gantvā na socare ti.

The Blessed One:

"Who is it that salutes these feet of mine, blazing with iddhi and fame, lighting up all directions with surpassing complexion?"

Maṇḍūkā the deva:

“I was in the past a frog in the water, with water for my pasture; whilst hearing your Dhamma a cowherd slew me.

“Though of devotion of heart for [only] a moment, [yet now] behold my iddhi and fame; and behold my majesty, behold my complexion and brightness.

“And as for those who heard your Dhamma for a long length of time, Gotama, they have reached the immovable ground where having gone they sorrow no more.”

(Vv. 77, translation adapted from Masefield's)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 20, 2017 12:34 PM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

Mid to late 19th century translations of Pali texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 20, 2017 2:33 PM

Title: Re: Future resolution of division in US society?

Content:

I can see that it might seem depressing from a third party's point of view, but what about that of the toilet cleaner himself? If he has no talent for anything else, or lives in circumstances where nothing else is permitted or available to him, then isn't it more likely that viewing his lot in this way would be a source of consolation rather than an incitement to depression?

Granted, it isn't a Buddhist way of regarding kamma, for in the Buddhist view though the particular circumstances of one's birth are regarded as wholly kammically determined, one's subsequent trajectory is not. Nonetheless, I should think that believing something like this would at least grant our toilet cleaner some contentment and equanimity. If nothing else it would save him from the alternative—one that would be truly depressing—namely, to be a toilet cleaner who's tormented by the notion that he's missing out on being something better.

Now John at the bar is a friend of mine,
He gets me my drinks for free.
And he's quick with a joke, or to light up your smoke
But there's someplace that he'd rather be.

He says, "Bill, I believe this is killing me,"
As a smile ran away from his face
"Well, I'm sure that I could be a movie star

If I could get out of this place."

Oh, la la la, di da da,
La la, di da da da dum... etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 20, 2017 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Loka

Content:

In the commentarial understanding all of the different senses of 'loka' are understood to be derived from the same verbal root (i.e., $\sqrt{\text{luj}}$) and to be united by the shared feature of liability to crumbling (lujjana) and disintegration (palujjana).

As such, the different senses of the word would be examples of polysemes (words of the same spelling but of different but nonetheless related meanings) rather than homonyms (words identical in spelling and pronunciation but entirely different in meaning).

Chart A.jpg (188.14 KiB) Viewed 1520 times

See this Wikipedia entry for examples.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Homonym>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 20, 2017 10:18 PM

Title: Re: Loka

Content:

No, not always, though this is the sense of loka that merits the most attention as far as the development of understanding is concerned.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

The Buddha said it was for people "who feel" (vediyamānassa).

"In dependence on the six elements the descent of a future embryo occurs. When the descent takes place, there is name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, there

are the six sense bases; with the six sense bases as condition, there is contact; with contact as condition, there is feeling. Now it is for one who feels that I proclaim: ‘This is suffering,’ and ‘This is the origin of suffering,’ and ‘This is the cessation of suffering,’ and ‘This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.’”

– <https://suttacentral.net/en/an3.61>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 5:50 PM

Title: Re: States of Theravada Buddhism in years 700-1950

Content:

But Kāliyuga is a Hindu concept. Except among the Tibetans it has no more bearing upon Buddhism than Anno Domini or At-taqwīm al-hijrī or Discworld’s Century of the Fruitbat.

As the Buddha’s dispensation still exists, we must presently be in one or another of the five dispensational yugas:

Vimuttiyuga – Age of liberation.

Samādhīyuga – Age of concentration.

Sīlayuga – Age of moral habit.

Sutayuga – Age of learning.

Dānayuga – Age of generosity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 6:05 PM

Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

The term ‘to one who feels’ can mean either to one who merely undergoes or is subject to feeling (vedanaṃ anubhavati) or to one with some capacity to know or to understand the nature of the feelings that he undergoes (vedanā jānāti). The Aṅguttara Commentary gives examples of each usage and then takes the second sense as being the one applicable here. It then adds:

[Now it is for one who feels] that I proclaim: ‘This is suffering,’ means: To a being capable of understanding I proclaim, cause to realize, cause to know: ‘This is dukkha, to this extent there is dukkha, and there is no dukkha beyond or apart from this.’”

[Likewise with the other four truths].

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 6:42 PM

Title: Re: How does Dependent Origination apply to formless (Arupavacara) beings?

Content:

Nāma and manāyatana are present in them. See the Dispeller of Delusion (Vibhaṅga Commentary) vol. I. pp. 213-218.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 6:47 PM

Title: Re: How does Dependent Origination apply to formless (Arupavacara) beings?

Content:

I've uploaded the pages here:

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=0Bw2ZpMqGylXcQi0tX0RISnZCNEk>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Nibbana

Content:

Vedanā arises in all beings in all realms except for the impercipient devas.

However, the fact that all people are subject to feeling is irrelevant here, for it is the second sense of "one that feels", not the first sense, that applies here: one with some capacity to know or to understand the nature of the feelings that he undergoes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 8:23 PM

Title: Re: How does Dependent Origination apply to formless (Arupavacara) beings?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 21, 2017 9:50 PM

Title: Re: How does Dependent Origination apply to formless (Arupavacara) beings?

Content:

There would be no cognizance of visible objects, sounds, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 22, 2017 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Looking for quote about vexation and past lives...

Content:

Not in any Pali source. In early Buddhist texts this question (like the similar question as to where karmas are stored before they yield their vipāka) simply doesn't come up for discussion. In later texts, dating from when Buddhists did start discussing these matters, what you describe wasn't how the Theravādins fielded the question. What you describe sounds more like the sort of thing the Pudgalavādins would say.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 22, 2017 10:32 AM

Title: Re: States of Theravada Buddhism in years 700-1950

Content:

I think what "Age of X" means here is not that X is necessarily very common or conspicuous, but rather that it's the highest that beings in that age are capable of aspiring to and achieving.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 24, 2017 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Spiritual Obstacles

Content:

Either professing that ariyans don't exist ("There are no good and virtuous samaṇas and brahmins in the world who have realised for themselves by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world") or else denying the ariyan qualities of a particular person.

From the Visuddhimagga:

"Revilers of Noble Ones": being desirous of harm for Noble Ones consisting of Buddhas, Paccekabuddhas, and disciples, and also of householders who are stream-enterers, they revile them with the worst accusations or with denial of their special qualities; they abuse and upbraid them, is what is meant.

Herein, it should be understood that when they say, "They have no asceticism, they are not ascetics," they revile them with the worst accusation; and when they say, "They have no jhāna or liberation or path of fruition, etc.," they revile them with denial of their special qualities. And whether done knowingly or unknowingly it is in either case reviling of Noble Ones; it is weighty kamma resembling that of immediate result, and it is an obstacle both to heaven and to the path. But it is remediable.

The following story should be understood in order to make this clear. An elder and a young bhikkhu, it seems, wandered for alms in a certain village. At the first house they got only a spoonful of hot gruel. The elder's stomach was paining him with wind. He thought, "This gruel is good for me; I shall drink it before it gets cold." People brought a

wooden stool to the doorstep, and he sat down and drank it. The other was disgusted and remarked, "The old man has let his hunger get the better of him and has done what he should be ashamed to do." The elder wandered for alms, and on returning to the monastery he asked the young bhikkhu, "Have you any footing in this Dispensation, friend?" — "Yes, venerable sir, I am a stream-enterer." — "Then, friend, do not try for the higher paths; one whose cankers are destroyed has been reviled by you." The young bhikkhu asked for the elder's forgiveness and was thereby restored to his former state.

So one who reviles a Noble One, even if he is one himself, should go to him; if he himself is senior, he should sit down in the squatting position and get his forgiveness in this way, "I have said such and such to the venerable one; may he forgive me." If he himself is junior, he should pay homage, and sitting in the squatting position and holding out his hand palms together, he should get his forgiveness in this way, "I have said such and such to you, venerable sir; forgive me." If the other has gone away, he should get his forgiveness either by going to him himself or by sending someone such as a co-resident.

If he can neither go nor send, he should go to the bhikkhus who live in that monastery, and, sitting down in the squatting position if they are junior, or acting in the way already described if they are senior, he should get forgiveness by saying, "Venerable sirs, I have said such and such to the venerable one named so and so; may that venerable one forgive me." And this should also be done when he fails to get forgiveness in his presence.

If it is a bhikkhu who wanders alone and it cannot be discovered where he is living or where he has gone, he should go to a wise bhikkhu and say, "Venerable sir, I have said such and such to the venerable one named so and so. When I remember it, I am remorseful. What shall I do?" He should be told, "Think no more about it; the elder forgives you. Set your mind at rest." Then he should extend his hands palms together in the direction taken by the Noble One and say, "Forgive me."

If the Noble One has attained the final Nibbāna, he should go to the place where the bed is, on which he attained the final Nibbāna, and should go as far as the charnel ground to ask forgiveness. When this has been done, there is no obstruction either to heaven or to the path. He becomes as he was before.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 25, 2017 1:53 AM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

Given Theravadin premises, one could theoretically conceive of a being whose mental continuum was characterized by (1) an absence of any unripened meritorious kamma that would be the cause for his encountering a Buddha, a Buddha's disciple, a Dhamma book, etc., and (2) an absence of any wholesome disposition that would lead to his performance of such a meritorious kamma. Such a being, if he existed, would in effect be eternally debarred from the possibility of awakening.

Now as far as I know the Pali texts don't assert that there are any such beings, but nor do they deny that there might be. Though I personally doubt that there's anyone quite so unfortunate as this, nevertheless, if such a being did exist it wouldn't violate the teaching of impermanence. Being destined to remain permanently a puthujjana does not entail being possessed of a permanent self; it entails merely the permanent absence of those factors that would lead one to cease being a puthujjana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 25, 2017 2:28 AM

Title: Re: extroverts versus introverts

Content:

I think you will find that suttas promoting good companionship, association with the wise, and suchlike, are actually just as frequent as those promoting seclusion and solitude.

Note also that in Dhammapada 61 (and even in verses 11-12 of the Rhinoceros Horn Sutta) it is companionship with the wise that's presented as the norm, while solitude is the resort when the norm is unavailable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 25, 2017 10:02 AM

Title: Re: how to dispose a buddha statue

Content:

I think the OP is using 'dispose' in the older sense of 'arrange' or 'set up', not the modern sense of 'get rid of'. In Spanish the cognate verb 'disponer' still retains the same meaning as the Latin source.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 25, 2017 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

The doctrine of aniccatā has to do with the impermanence of saṅkhāras. An absence of something is not a saṅkhāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 25, 2017 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

No more so than with the mental continuum of any other saṃsāric being. They're all conceived as enjoying a kind of quasi-permanence, having existed since time without beginning, being eternally separate from each other continuum, and condemned to continue existing until ignorance and craving have been rooted out. But the quasi-permanence of a cittasantāna doesn't make it an atmān for it's wholly constituted of dhammas that are radically impermanent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 5:50 AM

Title: Re: how to dispose a buddha statue

Content:

I think my position would be the same as Ven. Pesala's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 11:42 AM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

It would happen most often with temporary ordinations. Men who are going to be in robes for just a few weeks or months will not be expected to pay off their mortgage loan or bank overdraft beforehand any more than they will be expected to give away all their money.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 11:45 AM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

I doubt it. The Ittha Sutta seems to suggest that mere aspiration for something isn't a lot of use.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an5.43>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 11:58 AM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

There is apparently a Mahayana text which maintains that we already are such beings! That is, every being in the universe with the potential for enlightenment exited the building long ago and those of us left behind are all icchāntikas (albeit in the milder Yogācārin sense of the term: a being condemned to transmigrate for ever, but not

necessarily confined to the lower realms). I can't remember the name of the text now, but it was mentioned by the British scholar Stephen Hodge on a now-defunct forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 2:26 PM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 4:15 PM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

I don't think it was a doctrine that actually had much historical influence. It just represented one little pocket of Yogācārin thought and in the long run was trounced by the more optimistic Buddha Nature teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 4:22 PM

Title: Re: Iconism vs Aniconism

Content:

The making of icons is neither advocated nor prohibited in any ancient Pali sources. The evidence for a supposed prohibition is very slender, consisting in just one statement preserved in a non-Theravadin recension of the Vinaya.

As for the *Dīgha Nikāya*, I can only think of one passage that has any bearing on the issue (or at least one sometimes hears it cited as if it had a bearing on it). This is the account of the eight assemblies in the *Mahāparinibbāna Sutta* (DN. ii. 109). The Buddha relates how he would change his appearance to that of a *kṣatriya*, a *brāhmaṇa*, a householder, a *samaṇa*, a *Cātumahārājika deva*, a *Tāvatiṃsa deva*, a *Māra* or a *Brahmā* when going to teach Dhamma to assemblies of these beings. The passage is cited by Burmese Buddhists in justification of their depicting the Buddha wearing royal ornaments, as for example with the *Mahāmyatmuni Buddha*, which is intended to represent the Buddha's form when visiting devas.

I know, Ānanda, that after approaching countless hundreds of assemblies of the *Tāvatiṃsa devas*, that there, before settling down, before conversing, and before entering upon discussion, whatever their appearance was, my appearance would become, whatever their voice was, my voice would become, and I instructed, roused, enthused, and cheered them with a talk about the Dhamma, and while I was speaking they did not know me and would ask: 'Who is this speaking, a deva or a man?' and having instructed, roused, enthused, and cheered them with a talk about the Dhamma,

I disappeared. And when I had disappeared they did not know me and would ask: 'Who is this who disappeared, a deva or a man?'

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn16>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 4:35 PM

Title: Re: Who are your mother and father?

Content:

In the Vinaya it varies. For example, the prohibition against ordaining a parricide applies only to one who has killed his biological mother or father. But the requirement that one should have one's parents' permission to ordain extends to anyone who has carried out a parental role in one's upbringing. For example if your biological parents gave you up for adoption and then had nothing further to do with raising you, then you would need the permission of your adoptive parents but not your biological ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 26, 2017 7:08 PM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

But nobody has actually said that. You seem to be conflating two different icchāntika conceptions.

Dhammānando (based on the Theravāda Abhidhamma's theory of conditional relations): it's a theoretical possibility (though empirically very improbable) that a being might screw up so badly that he would cut off both the possibility of enlightenment and the possibility of ever doing anything meritorious and so be condemned to drift in the lower realms for ever.

Some Mahāyānists (based on one interpretation of the Yogācāra Abhidharma's theory of gotras: all existing beings have in fact cut off the possibility of awakening for ever. They haven't, however, cut off the possibility of acquiring mundane merit and therefore all realms of existence are open to them except the Pure Abodes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Iconism vs Aniconism

Content:

The commentary too...

"Whether the others are white, black, or brown, the Teacher is golden-coloured. But this is stated with reference to shape. And the shape alone is perceived by them. It is not the

case that the Blessed One becomes like a foreigner or like one wearing pearl earrings; he sits there in the form of a Buddha. But they see him as having the same shape as themselves. Some speak with a broken voice, some with a cackling voice, some with the voice of a crow, but the Teacher always has the voice of Brahmā. This is stated with reference to the language. For if the Teacher is sitting in a king's seat, they think, 'The king speaks sweetly today.' When the Blessed One departs after speaking, and they see the [real] king arrive, they wonder: 'Who was that?'... Even though they investigate, they do not know. Then why does the Buddha teach the Dhamma to them if they do not know? To plant impressions (vāsanatthāya). For when the Dhamma is heard even in such a way, it becomes a condition for the future. Thus he teaches out of consideration for the future."

(Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the commentary to the parallel passage in the AN)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Can someone knowledgeable please fix the wikipedia page on Subhuti?

Content:

Apparently it's an ongoing problem with Wiki's English-language Buddhism pages. Ven. Sujāto:

And yes, this has been an issue on Wikipedia. Some time ago, for example, it was common on Wikipedia to see Pali words transliterated in Devanagari. It was rightly objected that Devanagari, a modern Indian script, has never been used for writing Pali, and Roman script is the universal convention for international Pali. However the Buddhist editors had to struggle against Hindutva editors. I haven't kept up with this debate, but I haven't seen such problems recently, so perhaps the argument is over.

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/sutta-central-websites-article-on-wikipedia-an-urgent-help-needed/2475/6>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Is there an "anyone can reach enlightenment" view?

Content:

As I've already said, the notion got trounced by the Buddha Nature doctrine. It's merely an historical footnote.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 9:51 AM

Title: Re: What is monkey mind?

Content:

The simile is from the Assutavāsutta. Note Bhikkhu Bodhi's comment:

"It should be noted that neither the sutta nor the commentary interprets the monkey simile here as saying that the untrained mind is as restless as a monkey; the point, rather, is that the mind is always dependent on an object."

And his translation of the simile:

"It would be better, bhikkhus, for the uninstructed worldling to take as self this body composed of the four great elements rather than the mind. For what reason? Because this body composed of the four great elements is seen standing for one year, for two years, for three, four, five, or ten years, for twenty, thirty, forty, or fifty years, for a hundred years, or even longer.* But that which is called 'mind' and 'mentality' and 'consciousness' arises as one thing and ceases as another by day and by night. Just as a monkey roaming through a forest grabs hold of one branch, lets that go and grabs another, then lets that go and grabs still another, so too that which is called 'mind' and 'mentality' and 'consciousness' arises as one thing and ceases as another by day and by night.**

(SN. ii. 94-5)

Translator's notes

[*] Because this body ... is seen standing for a hundred years, or even longer. Spk: (Query:) Why does the Blessed One say this? Isn't it true that the physical form present in the first period of life does not last through to the middle period, and the form present in the middle period does not last through to the last period?... Isn't it true that formations break up right on the spot, stage by stage, section by section, just as sesamum seeds pop when thrown on a hot pan? (Reply:) This is true, but the body is said to endure for a long time in continuous sequence (paveṇivasena), just as a lamp is said to burn all night as a connected continuity (paveṇisambandhavasena) even though the flame ceases right where it burns without passing over to the next section of the wick.

[**] Spk: By day and by night (rattiyā ca divasassa ca): This is a genitive in the locative sense, i.e., during the night and during the day. Arises as one thing and ceases as another (aññadeva uppajjati, aññaṃ nirujjhati): The meaning is that (the mind) that arises and ceases during the day is other than (the mind) that arises and ceases during the night. The statement should not be taken to mean that one thing arises and something altogether different, which had not arisen, ceases. "Day and night" is said by way of continuity, taking a continuity of lesser duration than the previous one (i.e., the one stated for the body). But one citta is not able to endure for a whole day or a whole night. Even in the time of a fingersnap many hundred thousand of koṭis of cittas arise and cease (1 koṭi = 10 million). The simile of the monkey should be understood thus: The "grove of objects" is like the forest grove. The mind arising in the grove of objects is like the monkey wandering in the forest grove. The mind's taking hold of an object is like the monkey grabbing hold of a branch. Just as the monkey, roaming through the forest, leaves behind one branch and grabs hold of another, so the mind, roaming through the grove of objects, arises sometimes grasping hold of a visible object, sometimes a sound, sometimes the past, sometimes the present or future, sometimes an internal object, sometimes an external object. When the monkey does not find a (new) branch it does not descend and sit on the ground, but sits holding to a single leafy branch. So too,

when the mind is roaming through the grove of objects, it cannot be said that it arises without holding to an object; rather, it arises holding to an object of a single kind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 10:13 AM

Title: Re: What is monkey mind?

Content:

Another monkey simile:

“The craving of one given to heedless living grows like a creeper. Like the monkey seeking fruits in the forest, he leaps from life to life (tasting the fruit of his kamma).” (Dhammapada 334; Theragāthā verses of Mālun̄kyaputta)

The use of a monkey as a simile for the mind can be found in the Visuddhimagga’s description of meditation on the thirty-two parts of the body:

As to successive leaving: in giving his attention he should eventually leave out any [parts] that do not appear to him. For when a beginner gives his attention to head hairs, his attention then carries on till it arrives at the last part, that is, urine and stops there; and when he gives his attention to urine, his attention then carries on till it arrives back at the first part, that is, head hairs, and stops there. As he persists in giving his attention thus, some parts appear to him and others do not. Then he should work on those that have appeared till one out of any two appears the clearer. He should arouse absorption by again and again giving attention to the one that has appeared thus.

Here is a simile. Suppose a hunter wanted to catch a monkey that lived in a grove of thirty-two palms, and he shot an arrow through a leaf of the palm that stood at the beginning and gave a shout; then the monkey went leaping successively from palm to palm till it reached the last palm; and when the hunter went there too and did as before, it came back in like manner to the first palm; and being followed thus again and again, after leaping from each place where a shout was given, it eventually jumped on to one palm, and firmly seizing the palm shoot’s leaf spike in the middle, would not leap any more even when shot—so it is with this.

The application of the simile is this. The thirty-two parts of the body are like the thirty-two palms in the grove. The monkey is like the mind. The meditator is like the hunter. The range of the meditator’s mind in the body with its thirty-two parts as object is like the monkey’s inhabiting the palm grove of thirty-two palms. The settling down of the meditator’s mind in the last part after going successively [from part to part] when he began by giving his attention to head hairs is like the monkey’s leaping from palm to palm and going to the last palm, when the hunter shot an arrow through the leaf of the palm where it was and gave a shout. Likewise in the return to the beginning. His doing the preliminary work on those parts that have appeared, leaving behind those that did not appear while, as he gave his attention to them again and again, some appeared to him and some did not, is like the monkey’s being followed and leaping up from each place where a shout is given. The meditator’s repeated attention given to the part that in

the end appears the more clearly of any two that have appeared to him and his finally reaching absorption, is like the monkey's eventually stopping in one palm, firmly seizing the palm shoot's leaf spike in the middle and not leaping up even when shot.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 27, 2017 12:46 PM

Title: Re: What is monkey mind?

Content:

Two further ways:

1. For those who know Pali:

Download the Chaṭṭhasaṅgīti Tipiṭaka CD (or use the online version at the Goenka website) and search it for all the Pali words for 'monkey'. If you don't know all the Pali words for 'monkey', then open the Abhidhānappadīpikā (Moggallāna's 13th century Pali thesaurus) and look up one that you do know. You'll then find all the others listed in the same quatrain:

makkaṭo vānaro sākhā,
migo kapi valīmukho,
palavaṅgo, kaṇhatuṇḍo,
gonāṅgulo ti so mato.

(verse 614)

Typically the first few names will be the ones found in the Tipiṭaka, the next few only in the commentaries, while the last two or three will be artificially generated cognates of Sanskrit or Sinhala words that have no existence outside of grammarians' imaginations. Having found these words you can then search for them on the Tipiṭaka CD. If, however, you're a Mac-user like me, then it will be better to convert all the CD's text files to Unicode romanized Pali and then search them with some program like BBEdit. This will save you having to invest in some expensive crossover program that will allow Windows programs to be used on a Mac.

2. For those who don't know Pali:

Download the whole of the Sutta Central website: <https://suttacentral.net/downloads>
Remove all the files that are in languages you don't know, especially those in Chinese, which are enormous in number and greatly slow down text searches. Then use BBEdit or whichever text-search program you prefer to search for 'monkey'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 28, 2017 12:05 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Would that by any chance be Phra Ṭhitavaṇṇo in Dusit? If so, we used to be virtual neighbours: he at Wat Somanas and I at Wat Benchamabophitr. I've never read any of his books, but I've always found his talks to be of a very high standard.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 29, 2017 8:33 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Teachings on Social and Communal Harmony. Chapter I. Right Understanding

Content:

I think so. In the commentarial understanding *ariyasāvaka* in some contexts means "disciple who is an ariyan", while in others it means "disciple of the ariyans". In the latter sense the term includes virtuous worldlings (*kalyāṇa putthujjana*).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 29, 2017 9:40 AM

Title: Re: Psychotherapy

Content:

Oh? So Thomas Aquinas (13th century) might have been religious, but Augustine of Hippo (4th century) couldn't have been, right? But on what basis do you make this claim? What has changed between the time of Augustine and Aquinas that would permit one of the saints to be denoted "religious" and the other not?

Edit

To put the question more simply: Since we know that the Latin source of the word 'religion' is attested to well before the 13th century (e.g. in the Pagan Cicero and the Christian St. Jerome), what change of meaning did it undergo between 1200 and 1300 CE? Who was responsible for this?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 29, 2017 10:40 AM

Title: Re: sila and pain

Content:

"And what, bhikkhus, is the way of undertaking things that is painful now and ripens in the future as pleasure? Here, bhikkhus, someone by nature has strong lust, and he constantly experiences pain and grief born of lust (*rāgajaṃ dukkhaṃ domanassaṃ*); by nature he has strong hate, and he constantly experiences pain and grief born of hate; by nature he has strong delusion, and he constantly experiences pain and grief born of delusion. Yet in pain and grief, weeping with tearful face, he leads the perfect and pure holy life. On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in a happy destination, even in the heavenly world. This is called the way of undertaking things that is painful now and ripens in the future as pleasure.

(*Cūḷasamādāna Sutta*, MN. 45)

The Majjhima commentary doesn't say why he obtains a good rebirth, but I would suppose that it would be through the power of the *sīlamayapuñña* ("merit constituted

by moral habit”) that he accumulates by his restraint.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 30, 2017 11:42 PM

Title: Re: How old are you?

Content:

I've made it into one.

To make one yourself in future, just start a new topic and then scroll down to "poll creation" and click on it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 31, 2017 1:48 PM

Title: Re: does anyone know of good asubha resources?

Content:

In his Buddhist Meditation and Depth Psychology the American psychiatrist (and Buddhist) Dr. Douglas Burns also remarks to the same effect:

A cartoon in an American medical magazine shows four senior medical students standing together. Three are engaged in active conversation. Only the remaining one turns his head to take notice of a pretty nurse. The caption beneath the cartoon reads: "Guess which one has not done twelve pelvic examinations today." It is doubtful that many persons outside of the medical profession will appreciate the meaning, but to medical students and interns it speaks a reality. During his months of training in obstetrics and gynecology the medical trainee must spend many hours engaged in examining and handling the most repulsive aspects of female genitals. As a result he finds the female body becoming less attractive and his sexual urges diminishing. During my own years as a medical student and intern, this observation was repeatedly confirmed by the comments of my co-workers, both married and single. As we have seen, the same principle is utilized in the sections of the Discourse on repulsiveness and the cemetery meditations.

Other aspects of scientific and medical training can produce results similar to those sought in the latter three body meditations. Chemistry, biochemistry, and histology foster an objective way of viewing the body which is virtually identical to the contemplation of elements. Anatomy, of course, is similar to the contemplation of repulsiveness. And in hospital training the persistent encounter with old age, debilitation, and death continuously reinforces the words of the cemetery meditations: "Verily, also my own body is of the same nature; such it will become and will not escape it." Similarly, in order to acquire a vivid mental image of the cemetery meditations, Buddhist monks occasionally visit graveyards to behold corpses in various stages of decay. However, such experiences bear fruit only if one takes advantage of them and avoids the temptation to ignore and forget.

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/burns/wheel088.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 31, 2017 5:58 PM

Title: Re: does anyone know of good asubha resources?

Content:

Going through the thread I see that no-one's mentioned Jonathan Swift yet. When I was a child my first ever exposure to the concept of asubha came from reading Swift's close-up account of the Brobdingnagian Maids of Honour going about their toilet in Gulliver's Travels. And so in the present thread I should like to propose as a "Good Asubha Resource" The Lady's Dressing Room, Swift's no-holds-barred account of Strephon's disenchantment when he went peeping in his beloved Celia's closet.

<http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/dressing.html>

Women, however, may prefer this modern adaptation in which the maligned Celia gets a chance to reply to Strephon:

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

While the easily triggered may prefer the equally satirical (though poetically and asubhaically inferior) response to Swift by The Lady Mary Wortley Montagu:

<http://homes.chass.utoronto.ca/~cpercy/courses/t-montagu.htm>

*

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 31, 2017 7:14 PM

Title: Re: Petavatthu & Vimānavatthu in English.

Content:

A scanned copy of the pioneering Jean Kennedy/Henry Gehman translation is available here:

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.282259>

This is only of the canonical part (i.e. the verses). A later translation by Peter Masefield

(Vimāna Stories, Peta Stories) includes the commentary too, both the background story and word glosses.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 1, 2017 7:04 AM

Title: Re: does eating a human brain destroy one's credibility as a religious scholar?

Content:

<https://www.jihadwatch.org/2017/02/reza-aslan-why-he-is-not-a-muslim>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 2, 2017 1:36 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Teachings on Social and Communal Harmony. Chapter I. Right Understanding

Content:

I think they are just making explicit a distinction that in the suttas is only implicit. Take for example the Sarada Sutta:

Seyyathāpi, bhikkhave, saradasamaye viddhe vigatavalāhake deve ādicco nabhaṃ abbhussakkamāno sabbaṃ ākāśagataṃ tamagataṃ abhivihacca bhāsate ca tapate ca virocati ca. Evamevaṃ kho, bhikkhave, yato ariyasāvakassa virajaṃ vītamalaṃ dhammacakkhuṃ uppajjati, saha dassanuppādā, bhikkhave, ariyasāvakassa tīṇi saṃyojanāni pahiyanti: sakkāyadiṭṭhi, vicikicchā, silabbataparāmāso.

“Bhikkhus, just as, in the autumn, when the sky is clear and cloudless, the sun, ascending in the sky, dispels all darkness from space as it shines and beams and radiates, so too, when the dust-free, stainless Dhamma-eye arises in the ariyasāvaka, then, together with the arising of vision, the ariyasāvaka abandons three fetters: personal-existence view, doubt, and wrong grasp of behavior and observances. (AN. i. 242)

Now we know that the arising of the Dhamma-eye is synonymous with arrival at stream-entry, but in this sutta the person is already being denoted 'ariyasāvaka' before the Dhamma-eye arises. Yet before the eye arises he is a worldling, not a noble. And so here one can only conclude that prior to the arising of the Dhamma-eye the person is being referred to as an 'ariyasāvaka' because he is a disciple of the noble ones, not because he is a noble one himself.

Just going by memory, I believe examples of this kind are quite common in the Aṅguttara Nikāya, but are found rarely (if at all) in the Majjhima and Saṃyutta Nikāyas; in these two nikāyas the persons denoted 'ariyasāvaka' are in nearly every case stream-entrants or higher.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 2, 2017 10:22 AM
Title: Re: Anapana Redux
Content:

Stentorian claims to the effect: "The true path was long lost, but thankfully through my personal reading of the Suttas I have rediscovered it. Re-opened are the gates to the Deathless!" are made by many Buddhist teachers. Yet it's hard to find any two of them whose conception of the "true path" tallies.

That being so, what would be extremely foolish would be to embrace this or that teacher's approach merely on the strength of his making such claims; and especially if one's embracing of it is in the spirit of *Idam'eva saccam mogham'aññan ti*, "This alone is truth, all else is vanity!"

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 2, 2017 6:18 PM
Title: Re: Anapana Redux
Content:

Assāsa-passāsa always meant in- and out-breathing and the evidence for this in the suttas is overwhelming. For example, if you read the Buddha's account of his pre-enlightenment practice of breath-suspension in the Bodhirājakumāra or Mahāsaccaka Sutta, you will surely agree that to replace "in-breaths and out-breaths" with "cleansing the mind of fetters" would just result in utter absurdity.

"I thought: 'Suppose I were to become absorbed in the trance of non-breathing [appāṇaka jhāna]!' So I stopped the in-breaths [assāsa] & out-breaths [passāsa] in my nose & mouth. As I did so, there was a loud roaring of winds [vātā] coming out my earholes, just like the loud roar of winds coming out of a smith's bellows ... So I stopped the in-breaths & out-breaths in my nose & mouth & ears. As I did so, extreme forces sliced through my head, just as if a strong man were slicing my head open with a sharp sword... Extreme pains arose in my head, just as if a strong man were tightening a turban made of tough leather straps around my head... Extreme forces carved up my stomach cavity, just as if a butcher or his apprentice were to carve up the stomach cavity of an ox... There was an extreme burning in my body, just as if two strong men, grabbing a weaker man by the arms, were to roast & broil him over a pit of hot embers. And although tireless persistence was aroused in me, and unmuddled mindfulness established, my body was aroused & uncalm because of the painful exertion. But the painful feeling that arose in this way did not invade my mind or remain.

<http://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.036.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 2, 2017 6:53 PM
Title: Re: Anapana Redux

Content:

I think it might be better to raise your questions in a new thread, as we shall be moving well away from the subject of ānāpānassati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 3, 2017 8:35 AM

Title: Re: Cultural Marxism

Content:

No, as Dhamma Wheel's biggest Roger Scruton fan I can assure you his voice is much more nasally than your narrator's. For example...

I believe the fellow in your video is Thorium, aka James Alexander, and he's voicing his own views rather than Scruton's. In Scruton's Palgrave-MacMillan Dictionary of Political Thought "cultural Marxism" isn't even dignified with a mention, let alone an entry. <https://tinyurl.com/kdacoww> and <https://tinyurl.com/kxapl2y> do get entries but Scruton's description conforms to the consensus understanding rather than the American conspiracy theory one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 3, 2017 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

Just follow the psalmist's advice: "Put not thy trust in princes nor in any child of man."

Or as the Buddhist version goes...

Dwell with yourself as your own island, with yourself as your own refuge, with no other refuge; dwell with the Dhamma as your island, with the Dhamma as your refuge, with no other refuge. And how does a bhikkhu dwell with himself as his own island, with himself as his own refuge, with no other refuge; with the Dhamma as his island, with the Dhamma as his refuge, with no other refuge? Here, a bhikkhu dwells contemplating the body in the body, ardent, clearly comprehending, mindful, having removed covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world. He dwells contemplating feelings in feelings ... mind in mind ... phenomena in phenomena, ardent, clearly comprehending, mindful, having removed covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

"Those bhikkhus either now or after I am gone, who dwell with themselves as their own island, with themselves as their own refuge, with no other refuge; with the Dhamma as their island, with the Dhamma as their refuge, with no other refuge—it is these bhikkhus who will be for me topmost of those keen on the training."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 4, 2017 3:53 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

You seem to be overlooking the final part of the Buddha's pre-parinibbāna exhortation. You will be dwelling with the Dhamma as your island and refuge by the practice of the four satipaṭṭhānas, not by putting your trust in this or that person. Time spent wondering whether 'tis nobler to trust the Dalai Lama or Glenn Wallis is time spent seeking another refuge; it is not time spent developing the satipaṭṭhānas. If you've reason to trust them, then do so. If you've reason not to, then don't. If you're uncertain whether to trust them or not, then ask yourself whether this uncertainty bugs you. If it doesn't, then your non-knowledge of these teachers' trustworthiness doesn't signify. If it does bug you, then it's an opportunity to practise contemplation of dhammas with vicikicchā, the fifth of the five hindrances as your object. By so doing you will be dwelling with yourself as your own island, with yourself as your own refuge, with no other refuge; with the Dhamma as your island, with the Dhamma as your refuge, with no other refuge.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 4, 2017 4:19 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

Sorry, but I have looked at a few pages of the Pure Dhamma website and find the Pali scholarship there just a congeries of philological and grammatical absurdities, and the Sutta interpretations based upon it entirely without merit. Specifically:

- * The uncritical assumption that two Pali words that begin with the same letters, or that just happen to look a little alike, must be related.
 - * The unevidenced assumption that any two Pali or Sinhala words that look a little similar must be cognates.
 - * The assumption that what a Pali loanword now means in Sinhala is the same as what it originally meant in Pali, and that what it is now understood to mean in Pali is a corrupted understanding.
 - * The taking of the inflectional endings of nouns as being separate words.
- Etc. Etc.

Ven. Pesala the other day described the site-owner as making "a schoolboy's mistake". I would say that's being a little unkind to schoolboys. A schoolboy monk with just two or three months Pali study under his belt just couldn't make the kind of ridiculous errors that I observed on every page that I looked at.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 4, 2017 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Words - Meanings

Content:

puppharāsimhā = puppha + rāsi + mhā

"From a heap of flowers" or "because of a heap of flowers".

It's "heap of flowers" in the ablative case. The grammatical case is shown by the ending -mhā.

Though I hate to discourage you, if you haven't even got around to learning the inflectional endings of Pali nouns yet, then a project like this is way over your head. Even a well-seasoned Pali scholar would find it quite a challenging text. Best to read a Pali primer first.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 4, 2017 6:27 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

No, I would say not. It may exhibit one or two of the features of it, but not enough of the significant ones to really qualify. One characteristic of Buddhist messianic cults is that they tend to have some clearcut notion of when and why things allegedly started to go bad. This will be attributed to, say, the creation of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, the commentaries of the Mahāvihāra, the decline of the yogāvacara tradition in mediaeval Ceylon, the Dhammayutt-instituted reforms/screw-ups of Siamese monastic education, or suchlike. In the Ajahn Mun tradition there isn't any universally-held conception of Buddhist doctrinal history beyond the very vague one of uneducated Thais in general.

Moreover, the tradition's founding claim is merely that Ajahn Sao and Ajahn Mun arrived at arahatta at a time when "the whole Buddhist world" (i.e. Siam) thought it impossible. But it's not claimed that they did this as a result of some entirely new discovery (like, e.g., Luang Phor Sodh's discovery of the Dhammakaya) nor by correctly interpreting Sutta teachings that had long been misinterpreted (like, e.g., Ven. Waharaka).

The tradition's only revelatory feature, as far as I know, is Ajahn Maha Bua's claim that Ajahn Mun's visions of past arahants led him to see the correct way of observing certain Vinaya rules, how walking meditation should be done, and certain other minutiae of monastic life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 4, 2017 6:42 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

What I said is that assāsa-passāsa plainly means in- and out-breaths even in the suttas, contrary to Pure Dhamma's claim that this was a later misunderstanding of the suttas. I mentioned the Mahāsaccaka and Bodhirājakumāra Suttas as examples.

With this you partially concurred, but with the qualifier that this is merely the wrong Hindu understanding of breath meditation that the Buddha rejected. However, there are also suttas dealing with the kind of breath meditation that the Buddha approves, and in these too assāsa-passāsa plainly means the in- and out-breath.

Now there are indeed suttas where assāsa *by itself* has meanings other than 'in-breath'; e.g. the Kālāma Sutta, where it means 'comfort' or 'assurance'. There are none, however, where it has the fanciful meaning assigned to it by the Pure Dhamma website.

Sorry, must go now...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 5, 2017 12:47 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Words - Meanings

Content:

If it's particularly mediaeval devotional verse that interests you, then the following should get you fairly quickly to the point where you can manage at least a hack-level translation...

1. Buddhadatta's Pali Course vol. I. Study the whole book, paying especial attention to the inflectional endings of nouns. Should take about 6 weeks.

2. Ditto, vol. II. Just the chapter on Pali compounds. Learn to appreciate all the various ways in which two Pali words joined together might be semantically related to each other. 2 weeks.

3. Ditto vol. III. Skim through the whole book, chiefly with the aim of boosting your vocabulary. 4 weeks.

4. Try reading some existing verse translations alongside the Pali text. You'll find a lot of good material on Ven. Ānandajoti's website. In particular:

Narasīhagāthā - Verses about a Lion of a Man.

Buddhakhettā & Buddhāpadāna (tr. Barua)

Two translations of the Jinacarita:

The Life of the Victorious Buddha (tr. Ānandajoti)

The Career of the Conqueror (tr. Charles Duroiselle, from archive.org)

Lakkhaṇa Sutta – Suttanta on the Marks (tr. Usha McNab, from the Samatha Trust website)

Verses from the Vessantara Jātaka (tr. Fausboll)

One last thing: get a copy of R.C. Childers' Pali-English dictionary. This is by far the best English source for the vocabulary of late Pali texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 5, 2017 1:25 PM

Title: Re: Non-Thai Theravāda Forest Traditions?

Content:

Where did you hear it reported that Ajahn Mun was a Tipiṭaka memorizer?

Ajahn Maha Bua's biography of Ajahn Mun quotes him as saying:

"What's the purpose of all that learning anyway? It doesn't make sense to me. I can't figure it out. I haven't learned any grade of Pāli studies – not one. I have learned only the five kammaṭṭhāna [head-hair, body-hair, nails, teeth, skin] that my preceptor gave me at my ordination, which I still have with me today. They are all I need to take care of myself."

Even allowing for a bit of hyperbole on Ajahn Mun's part, it doesn't sound like a monk with any great enthusiasm for gantha-dhura.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 5, 2017 2:33 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Words - Meanings

Content:

Yes, indeed.

Your earlier post, by the way, with its musical analogy, brought back a happy memory of Cook & Moore's Welsh piano teacher sketch.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 5, 2017 8:18 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

The nicca in anicca has nothing to do with the adjective iccha (wishing) or the noun icchā (a wish) or the verb icchatī (to wish).

The colloquial Sinhala pronunciation of it is actually a mispronunciation when judged by the phonetic descriptions in the ancient Pali grammars. When Sri Lankans pronounce Pali words their commonest mistake is to make aspirated consonants into non-

aspirates and non-aspirated consonants into aspirates. This can be seen in the unorthodox romanization system used at the Pure Dhamma site:

gathi instead of gati
hethu-pala instead of hetu-phala.
micca-ditthi instead of micchā-diṭṭhi
satipattana instead of satipaṭṭhāna
Etc., etc.

By contrast, this is the international standard used by indologists for over a century:

ක ඛ ග ඝ ඞ
ka, kha, ga, gha, ṇa

ච ඡ ජ ඣ ඤ
ca, cha, ja, jha, ña

ට ඨ ඩ ධ ඳ
ṭa, ṭha, ḍa, ḍha, ṇa

ත ථ ද ධ න
ta, tha, da, dha, na

ප ඵ ඛ භ ම
pa, pha, ba, bha, ma

ය ර ල ව ස හ ළ ො
ya, ra, la, va, sa, ha, ḷa, ṃ

Conclusion

The Pure Dhamma website offers a variety of revisionist readings of the Pali Suttas based upon the site-owner's (or his guru's) claimed re-discovery of supposed hidden meanings of key Pali terms.

These proposed hidden meanings, when not presented merely as bald assertions, are defended by resort to Pali philological analysis.

But since the site-owner is demonstrably incompetent in both Indic philology in general and Pali in particular his arguments are undeserving of credence. Rather than leading to the true understanding of the Dhamma via the revelation of higher (but long-concealed) meanings, they lead only to baloney.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 5, 2017 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Stand Against Suffering

Content:

Looking at the full passage it seems to be a PC thing. It's the phrase kulitthiyo kulakumāriyo that they've translated as "the vulnerable", though it actually means "women and girls". Presumably the aim is to placate feminists of a certain stripe. I mean the kind who profess to find it patronising and offensive when men hold doors open for them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 6, 2017 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Non-Thai Theravāda Forest Traditions?

Content:

Interesting. When I was living in a mountain hermitage in Phrao, passing thudong monks would sometimes come and stay with me for a night or two. The younger ones would typically carry a copy of the Pāṭimokkha and a book of paritta chants. The older ones (who had presumably already memorized the Pāṭimokkha and the parittas) would often have the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, along with a pocket-sized edition of the Pubbasikkhāvaṇṇanā (a 19th century Thai Vinaya commentary).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 6, 2017 9:51 PM

Title: Re: Courage in the face of versatility and supremacism regarding the Dharma?

Content:

When I was in Thailand in the 1980s Ajahn Buddhādāsa influenced many and Ñāṇavīra Thera a few. Nowadays the principal influence seems to be academic scholarship on Buddhist sectarian history.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 7, 2017 7:40 PM

Title: Re: wisdom and compassion developed equally

Content:

There are sutta passages from which the general idea can be inferred, but the explicit treatment of the complementarity of wisdom and compassion is more a commentarial theme. Here's the best-known Pali example:

From the Paramatthadīpanī, Dhammapāla's commentary to the Cariyāpiṭaka

Like the aspiration, great compassion (mahākaruṇā) and skillful means (upāyakosalla) are also conditions for the pāramīs. Therein, "skillful means" is the wisdom which transforms giving (and the other nine virtues) into requisites of enlightenment.

Through their great compassion and skillful means, the Great Men devote themselves to working uninterruptedly for the welfare of others without any concern for their own

happiness and without any fear of the extremely difficult course of conduct that great bodhisattvas must follow. And their nature is such that they are able to promote the welfare and happiness of beings even on occasions when they are merely seen, heard of, or recollected, (since even the sight, report, or thought of them) inspires confidence.

Through his wisdom the bodhisattva perfects within himself the character of a Buddha, through his compassion the ability to perform the work of a Buddha.

Through wisdom he brings himself across (the stream of becoming), through compassion he leads others across.

Through wisdom he understands the suffering of others, through compassion he strives to alleviate their suffering.

Through wisdom he becomes disenchanted with suffering, through compassion he accepts suffering.

Through wisdom he aspires for nibbāna, through compassion he remains in the round of existence.

Through compassion he enters saṃsāra, through wisdom he does not delight in it.

Through wisdom he destroys all attachments, but because his wisdom is accompanied by compassion he never desists from activity that benefits others.

Through compassion he shakes with sympathy for all, but because his compassion is accompanied by wisdom his mind is unattached.

Through wisdom he is free from “I-making” and “mine-making,” through compassion he is free from lethargy and depression.

So too, through wisdom and compassion respectively, he becomes his own protector and the protector of others, a sage and a hero, one who does not torment himself and one who does not torment others, one who promotes his own welfare and the welfare of others, fearless and a giver of fearlessness, dominated by consideration for the Dhamma and by consideration for the world, grateful for favors done and forward in doing favors for others, devoid of delusion and devoid of craving, accomplished in knowledge and accomplished in conduct, possessed of the powers and possessed of the grounds of self-confidence. Thus wisdom and compassion, as the means for attaining each of the specific fruits of the pāramitās, is the condition for the pāramīs.

(Translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi in Treatise on the Pāramīs)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 7, 2017 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Giving With One's Own Hand

Content:

The banker's delivery of the money isn't dāna at all because he's not parting with anything of his own.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 7, 2017 10:31 PM

Title: Re: Why Leftists have shifted their focus away from important issues

Content:

ISIS mice, infiltrated into Disneyland Paris.

ISIS Mice.jpg (59.61 KiB) Viewed 1829 times

Unhappily for ISIS, the rodent recruitment campaign fizzled out after the Salafist scholar Muhammad al Munajjid issued his fatwa against Mickey Mouse.

Kill Mickey.jpg (54.74 KiB) Viewed 1829 times

<https://youtu.be/j7lpMIhR6Yg>

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 7, 2017 10:42 PM

Title: Re: To possess the Noble Eightfold Path

Content:

The commentaries explain the phrase as referring to the simultaneous arising of all eight of the path-factors at the ariyan path-consciousness-moment. But to grasp what this means one needs to understand how the Eightfold Path is conceived in the Abhidhamma. Do you? If not I can go over it tomorrow.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 8, 2017 11:53 AM

Title: Re: [MN 111] Fallacy of Anupadadhammavipassana while in a jhana

Content:

Arguments don't get much more QED than that. With a single sentence Tilman Vetter cuts asunder endless pages of baloney from the promoters of jhāna-lite.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 8, 2017 2:20 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Between attā (Skt. atmān) and atthaṃ (Skt. arthaṃ) there is neither any historical etymological relationship nor any overlap in meaning.

However, Lal's error with regard to these two words is of a different kind from those that he makes with regard to the 'saṃ' in 'saṃsāra'. Whereas errors of the latter sort arise from a simple failure to understand what kind of a language Pali is (i.e. his treating it as if it were an https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Agglutinative_language language when in fact it's primarily a https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Fusional_language one), in the the case of attā and atthaṃ the source of error appears to be: (1) the absence of the aspirated consonant [tʰ] in the modern Sinhala phonemic system, which leads Sinhalese to pronounce 'attā' and 'attha' identically, and (2) Lal's eccentric belief that how a modern Sinhalese pronounces a Pali word gives us clues as to its deeper hidden meaning.

Like Ven. Pesala I'll make this my final contribution to this thread. Breaking butterflies on a wheel is boring.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 28, 2017 2:18 PM

Title: Re: are mosquito nets "cheating"?

Content:

Yes, and fans too.

Now at that time bhikkhus were pestered by mosquitoes. They told this matter to the Blessed One. He said: "I allow, bhikkhus, a mosquito-net."
(Vin. ii. 119)

Now at that time a mosquito-fan accrued to the saṅgha. They told this matter to the Blessed One. He said: "I allow, bhikkhus, a mosquito-fan."
(Vin. ii. 130)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 28, 2017 2:24 PM

Title: Re: Temporary ordination in Thailand

Content:

As Ven. Clyde hasn't logged in for a couple of months it might be better to contact him via his Facebook page.

<https://web.facebook.com/clyde.brannan>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 28, 2017 10:38 PM

Title: Re: are mosquito nets "cheating"?

Content:

He could if it had been given to him by a layperson for his personal use. If it was a mosquito net borrowed from the store of the monastery he was residing at, then it would depend on that monastery's in-house rules.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 29, 2017 11:41 AM

Title: Re: are mosquito nets "cheating"?

Content:

Monastic property is rather a complicated and contested issue. See the following from Ven. Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code:

Monastic Buildings and Property

<http://www.elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinsight/html///lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc2/bmc2.ch07.html>

Lodgings

<http://www.elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinsight/html///lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc2/bmc2.ch06.html>

Inheritance

<http://www.elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinsight/html///lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc2/bmc2.ch22.html>

Tenth Nissaggiya Pācittiya Rule

<http://www.elibrary.ibc.ac.th/files/accesstoinsight/html///lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/bmc1.ch07-1.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 29, 2017 2:03 PM

Title: Re: are mosquito nets "cheating"?

Content:

I'm sure that the rules and regulations that you need to follow to be a law-abiding Sri Lankan citizen are far numerous and more complicated than the monastic Vinaya. Nevertheless, in the course of a typical day it's unlikely that you'll spend a lot of time thinking about all those rules (unless you happen to be a lawyer). There are some (e.g. traffic laws) that you'll obey out of sheer habit and there are others (e.g. not murdering people) that you'll obey because it never occurs to you to do otherwise. Then there are some laws that you might need to think about, but only every now and then, such as when you're filling in a tax declaration.

The Vinaya is much the same in this regard: some rules a monk follows out of habit because that's how he was trained in his formative years, and others because it doesn't occur to him to do the prohibited action. Then every now and then there'll be some event (e.g. the establishing of a monastery *sīmā*) that requires the monk to give a bit of thought to the matter and maybe hit the books if he's forgotten the details.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 30, 2017 2:47 PM

Title: Re: The Bodhisattva Ideal in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

The age of a manuscript (of whatever sort) will provide a basis for determining the age of its contents only in cases where it can be known: (1) that the manuscript is a "first edition" of the work it preserves; and (2) that the work it preserves was a written or printed text from the very outset, not, say, an orally transmitted one, later committed to writing or print. For example, it's legitimate to appeal to the relative age of manuscripts, foul papers or printed editions when assessing whether Hamlet is older than Twelfth Night or Twelfth Night older than Hamlet.

However, in the case of Indian and Central Asian Buddhist manuscripts neither of these conditions obtains. And so for the purpose of dating it's irrelevant whether the oldest extant manuscripts happen to preserve mainstream Buddhist texts or Mahayana Buddhist texts.

What is relevant to the question is the fact that with the suttas in the Pali nikāyas, and with those in the Chinese āgamas and Sanskrit fragments of āgamas, we have texts that show every indication of having been originally orally transmitted. By contrast, with most Mahayana sutras we have texts that self-referentially show themselves to have been literary artefacts from the very outset. Given the non-use of writing in the early transmission of the Buddha's teaching, the orality of the Pali suttas and the literariness of the Mahayana sutras make it a reasonable inference that the former are several centuries earlier than the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 30, 2017 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Tea and coffee at temples

Content:

They look a bit namby-pamby to me. And what's the advantage of the element not coming into contact with the water? Won't that just mean that it takes longer to boil?

anex.jpg (8.47 KiB) Viewed 7170 times

Nothing beats a nice old-fashioned whistling kettle.

whistling kettle.jpg (169.71 KiB) Viewed 7170 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 31, 2017 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Maranasati (Mindfulness of Death/Charnel Ground Reflection)

Content:

I think the opening poster used the word maraṇasati by mistake. It's clear that what he actually had in mind were the nine cemetery contemplations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 1, 2017 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Maranasati (Mindfulness of Death/Charnel Ground Reflection)

Content:

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/Texts-and-Translations/Kayagatasati/index.htm>
(MN. iii. 88)

<https://suttacentral.net/si/mn119>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/dn22> (DN. ii. 290)

<https://suttacentral.net/si/dn22>

<https://tinyurl.com/yanh6est> (AN. ii. 322)

<https://suttacentral.net/si/an6.29>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 1, 2017 7:34 PM

Title: Leaves and Moss

Content:

Ajahn Brahm's story in his Truckload of Dung book appears to be a liberal adaptation of an anecdote that the late https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Trevor_Leggett would often tell when talking about his Zen training at Eihei-ji. It's not a very satisfactory re-telling however. Compared with the original, Ajahn Brahm's version suffers a complete loss of verisimilitude and concludes a bit feebly and obscurely.

This is how the original goes (or rather one of the originals, for Trevor used to tell the story a lot) ...

LEAVES and MOSS

In some Japanese Temples, moss is cultivated as a symbol of inner realization. Its progress cannot be forced, and the cultivation in fact amounts to removing the obstacles to the natural growth. If they are patiently and continuously got rid of, however, it makes a surprisingly rapid advance. Moss, like realization, has a great inner strength against even extremes of change in the environment; under very warm or very dry conditions, mosses can become dormant, and quickly revive and grow again when conditions improve. If they feel like it, some of them can keep on growing even on hot, dry and exposed rocks.

Most of them, however, grow best in shady and moist environments, and so in the temple gardens where they are cultivated, small trees are planted which shed their leaves at different times of year, thus providing a certain amount of shade almost all the time. A huge training temple like Eihei-ji of the Soto Zen sect has a good number of courtyards covered with moss, and one of the daily jobs is to do some weeding out of competitors, and then to sweep the moss clear of fallen leaves. This is done with a light broom of twigs, and there is quite an art to it: if the strokes are too heavy, the surface of the moss is damaged, but if the strokes are not strong enough, the leaves are not taken up. So it has to be done just right, and then the piles of leaves are put into sacks and burnt to help heat the bath. After the sweeping is over, the unbroken lines of the undulating green carpet are a rewarding sight.

The job, however, may involve little irritations. When one is sweeping a courtyard, and the part that has been done is taking on its pristine appearance, a breeze dislodges a few more leaves. One goes back and picks them up, only to see a couple more redly blotting the ground somewhere else.

When I was first given a courtyard to sweep, I thought to myself (as foreigners tend to do): 'Well, I may not be so good as some of these professionals at sitting in meditation, and perhaps I don't always understand 'what's said to me, but this I can do, and I'll do it perfectly - absolutely perfectly-'

To me that meant sweeping every last leaf from the moss, as I had been asked to do. It was surprising, and then infuriating, to find that it seemed impossible to get the desired result; the first day I left the place spotless, having made a last quick circuit picking up the few newly fallen ones, but as I took the sack and turned to go, I saw a few more come down. There was no time to go back yet again.

I evolved a strategy, which I tried out the next day. Before beginning to sweep, I visited each tree in turn and shook it furiously, in both senses of the word. I was then still fairly strong, and knew how to use my strength. Every leaf that was even beginning to weaken its hold on the tree came down in the shower with all the others. Then I happily swept them all up into piles, and the piles into the sack. No leaves remained to defile the perfect carpet of the place. As I moved off triumphantly, I noticed a monk watching me. He said: "Leggett San, don't you think that was a bit extreme?" I replied. shortly: "Well, it got all the leaves up." "Yes," he said, "Yes, it did. But you know, we sweep these places everyday. If a few leaves come down after we've finished, we shall take them up the next day. And just a few of them might make an attractive pattern, don't you think?" I remembered a Chinese poem: "One spot of red in a sea of green." I don't know if he was referring to that; anyway, I suddenly felt a bit uncivilized.

So I stopped fighting the trees. Years afterwards I came across a Japanese poem by a great Japanese master named Mamiya, written early this century. The experience I had in mind helped me to appreciate it:

We sweep up the fallen leaves in the garden,
But we don't hate the trees for dropping them.

It doesn't apply only to leaves.

Better still, listen to the man himself, who was a masterful raconteur...

<https://www.tlayt.org/yoga-and-zen-say-we-can-begin-to-see-and-express-beauty/>

(A slightly different telling of it from the version I quoted)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 2, 2017 7:07 AM

Title: Re: Maranasati (Mindfulness of Death/Charnel Ground Reflection)

Content:

What is nothing to do with maraṇasati? If you're referring to the three suttas I linked to, they were offered as canonical sources for the cemetery contemplations, not for maraṇasati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 2, 2017 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Why grammar still matters in the 21st century

Content:

A headline from today's Grauniad:

Trump just passed on the best deal the planet has ever seen

<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2017/jun/01/trump-paris-climate-deal-planet>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 22, 2017 7:18 AM

Title: Re: Going to Heaven after we die

Content:

All apparitionally-born beings are said to recall their former life. This would include devas and nerayikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 22, 2017 1:24 PM

Title: Re: Going to Heaven after we die

Content:

Firstly, nihilism (natthikavāda), haphazardism or acausalism (ahetukavāda) and the doctrine of the inefficacy of action (akiriyavāda). See the <http://www.wisdompubs.org/book/middle-length-discourses-buddha/selections/middle-length-discourses-60-apannaka-sutta> for details.

And secondly, any other views that have the aforementioned as their consequence. For example, the fatalism of Makkhali Gosāla entails both ahelikavāda and akiriyavāda.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 22, 2017 5:42 PM

Title: Re: Does atheism and existentialism lead to existential crisis ?

Content:

Not really. He served in a meteorological unit monitoring weather balloons and never saw any action. After the fall of France he spent just nine months as a POW before being released on account of his bad eyesight.

Perhaps the worst dukkha he encountered in his life —in the aftermath of experimenting

with mescaline— were persistent hallucinations that he was being pursued by giant crustaceans.

<https://bluelabyrinths.com/2015/06/18/sartres-existential-lobsters/>

<https://philosophynow.org/issues/67/Crabs>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 25, 2017 6:04 PM

Title: Re: Pali Script?

Content:

The scripts are https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ge%27ez_script and Tibetan, but I don't know what the texts are. The likelihood, however, is that the first will be something from either Ethiopian Judaism or the Ethiopian Orthodox Church and the second will be something Buddhist.

Edit: a friend tells me that the Tibetan text is for a Hayagriva practice — a Tibetan deity with a horse sticking out of his head.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 25, 2017 10:23 PM

Title: Re: Pali Script?

Content:

An Ethiopian member of my linguistics forum, tells me that the Ge'ez text is an Amharic prayer to St. Mary. The letters printed in red ink are ማርያም ወላዲት አምላክ = Māriyāmi weladīte āmilaki = Mary, Mother of God.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 26, 2017 7:22 PM

Title: Re: The Ten Perfections: A Study Guide by Thanissaro Bhikkhu

Content:

The idea that cultivation of the paramīs is specifically for buddhahood and cultivation of the eightfold path specifically for arahantship is a Mahāyāna innovation.

The Pali texts that treat of the ten paramīs present them as dhammas to be cultivated by everyone, not just those intent upon anuttara sammāsambodhi. And so according to this conception, the difference between the arahant's path and the bodhisatta's lies, firstly, in the duration of paramī-cultivation required, and secondly, in the degree to which they are cultivated. For example, in the cultivation of the perfection of giving the Theravādin would-be arahant isn't required to undertake the fivefold great sacrifice (i.e., of wealth, wife, children, limbs and life) that would be required of a Theravādin

bodhisatta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 27, 2017 3:42 PM

Title: Re: Confused about Bhikkhu Sujato's translation of Thag 1.1

Content:

The Theragāthā commentary says that 'deva' in this context means 'cloud'. Some translators accept the commentary's gloss and render the term 'cloud' or 'sky'. Others reject the gloss and render it 'deva'. Yet others aren't sure, so they hedge their bets: My small hut is roofed, pleasant, draught-free; rain, (sky-) deva, as you please; my mind is well-concentrated, released; I remain zealous; rain, (sky-) deva.
(K.R. Norman)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 1:15 PM

Title: Re: The Caste System in Buddhist Countries

Content:

It's of Aryan provenance and isn't influenced by Buddhism. Rather, it influences Buddhism in certain ways. For example, a Sinhalese who wants to become a monk will be likely to ordain in the Nikāya with which his caste is historically associated.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 2:13 PM

Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?

Content:

When Christian evangelists are proselytizing to East Asian Pure Land Buddhists it is a common opening tactic to try to meet the Pure Lander halfway: "We fully agree with you that man can't save himself by his own efforts and needs divine aid ... etc., etc." Having come to this agreement they then try to convince the Pure Lander that it makes more sense to put your trust in an historical figure like Jesus rather than a mythical figure like Amitābha.

But is it really common in Theravada countries? In twenty-three years living in Thailand I've bumped into plenty of evangelists and have never known them to argue by casting doubt on the Buddha's historicity. Their techniques are just the usual Protestant stock-in-trade:

- The watchmaker argument for God's existence.
- C.S. Lewis's "Liar, lunatic or Lord" argument for Jesus's divinity.
- "The Buddha's in his grave, but Jesus's tomb is empty!"

Etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 2:44 PM

Title: Re: The Caste System in Buddhist Countries

Content:

"Segregated" is way too strong. The situation nowadays is that each Sri Lankan sub-nikāya consists preponderantly of monks born into some particular caste. If a Sinhalese wants to ordain then he'll be likely to select the sub-nikāya that has been historically associated with his caste. He isn't, however, obliged to do so. It's similar to how when a man from the rural provinces of Thailand goes to ordain in Bangkok he will be likely to select a monastery whose monks are mostly from his region; e.g., Wat Benjama if he's from the North; Wat Somanat if he's a southerner; Wat Mahathat if he's a Northerner etc. This simply reflects the human tendency to prefer the company of one's own people.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 3:36 PM

Title: Re: The Caste System in Buddhist Countries

Content:

No. The adverse consequences for a Sinhalese ordaining in a nikāya associated with another caste than his own would be merely mundane. For example, Rev. Nārada Thera (the author of *Buddhism in a Nutshell* and translator of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*) was from a low caste but ordained in a sub-nikāya of the Amarapura Nikāya that was associated with one of the higher castes. Despite his seniority, scholarly accomplishments and worldwide missionary work, for most of his life Nārada's name would be passed over in favour of some junior or less-accomplished monk whenever the nikāya's elders were appointing one of their monks to some high office or teaching post.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Female Buddhists, rape, and the 1st precept

Content:

The case of impregnation of a nun via rape is not explicitly covered in the Vinaya. I would assume that the same provisions would apply as with any other kind of pregnant nun:

Now at that time a certain woman had gone forth among the nuns when she was already pregnant, and after she had gone forth she was delivered of a child. Then it occurred to that nun: "Now what line of conduct should be followed by me in regard to this boy?" They told this matter to the Lord. He said: "I allow her, monks, to look after him until he attains to years of discretion." [1]

Then it occurred to that nun: ‘It is not possible for me to live alone, nor is it possible for another nun to live with a boy. Now, what line of conduct should be followed by me?’ They told this matter to the Lord. He said: “I allow them, monks, having agreed upon one nun, to give her to that nun as a companion. And thus, monks, should she be agreed upon: First, that nun should be asked; having asked her, the Order should be informed by an experienced, competent nun, saying: ‘Ladies, let the Order listen to me. If it is pleasing to the Order, the Order may agree upon the nun So-and-so as companion to the nun So-and-so. This is the motion. Ladies, let the Order listen to me. The Order is agreeing upon the nun So-and-so as companion to the nun So-and-so. If the agreement upon the nun So-and-so as companion to the nun So-and-so is pleasing to the ladies, they should be silent; she to whom it is not pleasing should speak. The nun So-and-so is agreed upon by the Order as companion to the nun So-and-so. It is pleasing to the Order; therefore it is silent. Thus do I understand this.’”

Then it occurred to that nun who was the companion: ‘Now what line of conduct should be followed by me in regard to this boy?’ They told this matter to the Lord. He said: “I allow them, monks, to behave in regard to that boy exactly as they would behave to another man, except for sleeping under the same roof.” [2]

Notes from Vinaya Commentary

1. Until he is able to eat and wash himself properly.
2. The mother is able to lie down and having put the child on her breast to wash it, make it drink, feed it and adorn it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Lumbini, Kapilavastu, Kusinara sites now in doubt.

Content:

I'm not, however, interested in proving it wrong. Nor am I interested in proving wrong any claims to the effect that the locations of the four sites have been misidentified. As I understand the above sutta, the beneficial effect of pilgrimage to these sites arises from the faith that the pilgrims bring with them and the recollections that they undertake while visiting them, rather than from any magical quality inherent in the sites themselves.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 28, 2017 10:07 PM

Title: Re: Lumbini, Kapilavastu, Kusinara sites now in doubt.

Content:

I'll leave the addressing of it to those who share your conviction that the issue is a

momentous one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 29, 2017 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Female Buddhists, rape, and the 1st precept

Content:

The consensus among Vinaya scholars is that a drug that works by preventing conception is blameless, while one that works by inducing abortion is not. I can't really comment on RU486 in particular as I've never heard of it before. (I'm afraid I'm about thirty years behind the times with regard to the particulars of birth control methods).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 4, 2017 11:25 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

To what is it an exception? Meat, fish and eggs are consumed daily in all Mahayana countries by most Mahayana Buddhists. The only conspicuous exceptions —the Mahayanists who take seriously the anti-meat injunctions in the Lankavatara and Shurangama Sutras— are East Asian bhikkhus and bhikkhunis, along with a tiny handful of the more dedicated lay bodhisattvas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 5, 2017 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Is unvirtuous Sangha an immeasurable field of merit?

Content:

And so an even more prudent giver will determine her gift as being for the sangha rather than for any individual bhikkhu. In order for it to count as saṅghagatā dakkhiṇā the gift should be given to whichever bhikkhu the sangha appoints to receive it or to the first bhikkhu that the giver happens to meet, without discriminating between good and bad bhikkhus. (If a giver sets out to give saṅghagatā dakkhiṇā but then discriminates, spurning one bhikkhu and then selecting a more impressive-looking one, then her gift will revert to being pāṭipuggalikā dakkhiṇā, which means that even if the recipient happens to be an arahant, the gift will not be as meritorious as it would have been if she'd stuck to her original plan).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 5, 2017 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Is unvirtuous Sangha an immeasurable field of merit?

Content:

I've found the reference. It's in the Sayadaw's Discourse on the Bhara Sutta.

<http://aimwell.org/mahasi.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 5, 2017 5:23 AM

Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 12:49 PM

Title: Re: Trumpcare is immoral

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 8:51 PM

Title: Re: name change

Content:

The forum software doesn't allow members to change it themselves, but if you notify one of the admins they will do it for you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 8:59 PM

Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?

Content:

And then perhaps you will get an inkling of why your apologetic ardour elicits so little enthusiasm here. The historicity of the Buddha simply doesn't matter in Buddhism in the way that the historicity of Jesus matters in Christianity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Looking for source of story about the monkey offering honey to Buddha & the parileyya elephant

Content:

The elephant story is in the Vinaya's account of the schism at Kosambī.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd10>
(Scroll down to the section entitled On going to Pārileyyaka)

The monkey story is from the Dhammapada Atthakathā.

<http://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/01-05.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 10:05 PM
Title: Re: Aussie Buddhists - 6 min documentary
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 6, 2017 11:52 PM
Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jul 7, 2017 12:31 AM
Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?
Content:
Whether it is well-supported in the Bible, or whether it is ill-supported in the Bible, the idea of everlasting conscious torment — at least mental, but usually physical too — has historically been the dominant Christian conception of hell. And it was of Christianity that you were earlier speaking, not the Bible.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jul 7, 2017 12:54 AM
Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?
Content:
You are misinformed. Catholic Purgatory is not hell but a waystage to heaven. In the Catholic view of the afterlife, the unsaved go to eternal hell; those who died as saints go directly to heaven; those who are saved (i.e. Roman Catholics) but still have unabsolved venial sins or mortal sins that have been confessed and absolved, but not sufficiently punished, go to Purgatory and then are let into heaven after a period of purifying torture.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 7, 2017 3:04 AM

Title: Re: jhana similes in Vism? Where?

Content:

Yes. They're in the 7th and 8th chapters of the Vimuttimagga, but nowhere in the Visuddhimagga.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 8, 2017 8:15 AM

Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?

Content:

I refer you again to the earlier quotation from your fellow Mahayanist, Dharmakīrti. But this time maybe try giving it a little thought.

In my case, I would be sufficiently impressed with the teachings of the Pali Canon that I would call whomever gave those teachings "a Buddha". This would not oblige me to take up or defend any particular view regarding the historicity of Gotama and the degree of accuracy with which Buddhists have reported his life story. (As a matter of fact I do assume that Theravada Buddhists have reported it accurately, but I wouldn't sink into dismay if it were proven that they hadn't).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 8, 2017 11:52 PM

Title: Re: The Historical Jesus or the Historical Buddha?

Content:

And for yet others there may simply be a spontaneous arising of faith upon a mere encounter with something Buddhism-related — a phenomenon that ābhidhammikas would attribute to natural decisive support condition. Simply and crudely put, it means that one has been a Buddhist in a former life and acquired a strong taste for it that effects one's attitude towards it in later lives.

In none of the above would convictions about the Buddha's historicity play any crucial role in the arising of saddhā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 9, 2017 3:16 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Sentence Analysis: "no ajānato no apassato"

Content:

The words are the negative forms of passam and jānam. They may function as

participles, adjectives or nouns. Their inflections are the same as those of mahā. With the -ato inflection they will usually be either a dative ("for one who sees") or a genitive of time ("when one sees", "when seeing").

1.jpg (281.21 KiB) Viewed 1418 times

2.jpg (450.25 KiB) Viewed 1418 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 10, 2017 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Is contraception mentioned in the Pali Canon?

Content:

As for abortion, my impression is that the general attitude towards it is similar to that which prevailed in western Christian countries before the 1960's: they're legal and women do have them, but it's regarded as a very shameful thing to do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 10, 2017 1:36 PM

Title: Re: Is contraception mentioned in the Pali Canon?

Content:

There's no doubt that a bhikkhu would be doing so in the case of a postcoital birth control pill that works by inducing an abortion and cannot work in any other way.

But the case that you bring up, where the pill may work either by preventing conception or by inducing an abortion, is obviously a little trickier. Looking at it from the woman's point of view, I think the closest analogy in the Vinaya would be the case of a bhikkhu who sweeps the leaves on a path where there are many insects. His intention is to sweep the path and not to kill the insects, but he knows that there is a chance that some insects may in fact be killed by his sweeping. Would he commit the pācittiya offence of killing an animal if any insects did in fact get killed? The Buddha's ruling is that he would not, in spite of his foreknowledge that such a thing might happen.

And so if a woman after sex were to take a pill of the kind under discussion, with the wish to prevent conception but aware of the possibility that it might instead result in an abortion, then she would be in an analogous position to this bhikkhu. And any bhikkhu who had suggested to her to take such a pill would be in an analogous position to the abbot who had ordered the leaves to be swept. Or so it seems to me.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jul 10, 2017 9:24 PM
Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate
Content:
It's explained by Dara O'Briain at 3:40

"Anyone can call themselves a 'nutritionist'. 'Dietician' is the legally protected term. 'Dietician' is like 'dentist'. 'Nutritionist' is like 'toothologist'."

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 11, 2017 12:25 AM
Title: Re: Should we practice in a certain way because we feel it is working for us personally ?
Content:
From where did you learn this? In Pali sources all that is said about the Suttavādins is that they were a school that split off from Saṅkantas who split off from the Kassapikas who split off from the Sabbatthivādins who split off from the Mahiṃsāsakas. Nothing at all is reported of their doctrines or practices or stance regarding the Visuddhimagga's meditation instructions.

If we accept the conjecture of some modern scholars that Saṅkanta may be another name for the Sautrāntika (making the Sautrāntikas the parent school of the Suttavādins), then it's improbable that they had even heard of the Visuddhimagga, for the Sautrāntikas were located in Gandhara (= modern North-West Pakistan) and had no presence in Sri Lanka.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 11, 2017 12:39 AM
Title: Re: New forest monastery in Norway
Content:
For a sāmaṇera ordination only one is required, the preceptor.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 11, 2017 5:04 PM

Title: Re: Serious problems in buddhist Thailand

Content:

The Telegraph is certainly one of the most respected newspapers in the world. In fact all the British broadsheets —both left and right— would fit this description on account of the care that they take to keep news reporting separate from editorial comment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 14, 2017 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Which sutta is this Pali from?

Content:

Vinaya Piṭaka, Section on the first defeating offence

<https://suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-bu-vb-pj1>

Bhayabherava Sutta (MN. 4)

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn4>

Verañja Sutta (AN. iv. 172)

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.11>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 14, 2017 7:54 AM

Title: Re: Which sutta is this Pali from?

Content:

Hello Shin Mei,

Nice to see you around.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 14, 2017 7:25 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

The various Pali words for ‘teacher’ and ‘student’ can be broadly divided into two classes, which we might call the relative and the non-relative. In the early texts (and especially in the Vinaya), the relative terms are used when speaking of X being the teacher of Y, or of Y being the student of X. They would not be applied to X if X is a teacher who doesn’t presently have any students, nor to Y if Y is a student who doesn’t presently have any teacher. The non-relative ones would be used no matter whether X presently has any students or whether Y presently has any teacher; in other words, they would function either as titles or as descriptions of what the person habitually spends

his time doing.

Relative terms for a teacher

ācariya / ācariyaka
ācarī / ācarinī
kammaṭṭhānadāyaka
nissayadādika
nissayadāyaka
pavattinī
upajjhā
upajjhāya / upajjha

Relative terms for a student

antevāsika / antevāsī / antevāsini
nissitaka
paccagū / paṭṭhagū
paddhacara / baddhacara
piṭṭhi-ācariya
saddhivihārī / saddhivihārika / saddhivihārinī
sissa

Non-relative terms for a teacher

dassetu
desetu
desika
dhāretu
gaṇī / gaṇācariya
garu / guru
lokagaru
pavattu
pubbācariya
satthu
vādī
vinetu
viññāpetu

Non-relative terms for a student

chatta
kumāra
māṇava / māṇavaka
neyya
sekha

With regard to the relative terms there are certain common correspondences. For example, the pupil of an upajjhaya is usually a saddhivihārī; the pupil of an ācariya is usually an antevāsī or a sissa; the bhikkhunī pupil of a pavattinī is usually a saddhivihārinī or a sahaṇṇinī; etc.

So, in the case of the passage you cited in your post, the use of the relational antevāsī should indicate to the reader that Brahmadaṭṭa is not just a student, but rather the student of some other named person, i.e., Suppiya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 15, 2017 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Which sutta is this Pali from?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 15, 2017 12:34 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

The distinction that I drew between relational and non-relational terms for 'teacher' and 'pupil' comes from observing how the various terms are employed in all the Pali texts that I've studied over the years. If I had to single out just one text as being particularly instructive in this matter, it would be the Vinaya Piṭaka.

Then for less commonly used terms, many of which aren't found in the Vinaya, the source I've found most valuable is the <https://tinyurl.com/ycdndqqe> to the Abhidhānappadīpikā, a 13th century Pali thesaurus.

Lastly, it's helpful to have copies of the Pali-English dictionaries of Rev. A.P. Buddhadatta and Robert C. Childers. The Abhidhānappadīpikā and its ṭīkā were two of the principal sources for the entries in these dictionaries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 17, 2017 1:27 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 17, 2017 4:46 PM

Title: Re: Kamma vipaka in this life

Content:

See the <https://suttacentral.net/en/dn32> and <https://suttacentral.net/en/an5.42> Suttas.

But more importantly, the <https://suttacentral.net/en/thag4.10>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 17, 2017 5:01 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

The dictionaries of course contain a great many words that are not found in the Canon but are artificial words formed from Sanskrit. As such they won't be of any interest to those who are interested only in the canonical language. I wouldn't see this as a problem however.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 18, 2017 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

A few that come to mind:

The preface to R.C. Childers' <https://archive.org/details/adictionaryplil00chilgoog>

Chapter IX ('The Augustan Age') of G.P. Malalasekera's

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.57270>

The introduction to Franklin Edgerton's

<https://archive.org/details/BuddhistHybridSanskritGrammar>

Subhūti's translation of Moggallāna's

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.292635>

Amarasimha's http://sanskritdocuments.org/doc_z_misc_amarakosha.html (the Sanskrit thesaurus that influenced Moggallāna's Abhidhānappadīpikā and from which many of mediaeval Pali's neologisms were derived)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 18, 2017 4:08 PM

Title: Re: According to Classical Theravada, what is reborn?

Content:

... purisassa viññāṇasotaṃ ... ubhayato abbocchinnaṃ ... — "A man's stream-of-consciousness that is uninterrupted between both [this world and the next]."

The phrase is unique to this sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 19, 2017 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

In a predominantly fusional language like Pali, nouns can be formed from verbs rather more liberally than they can in a predominantly analytic language like English. From the English verbs 'to teach', 'to instruct' and 'to train' one may derive 'teacher', 'instructor' and 'trainer', but it wouldn't normally occur to a native English speaker to turn 'to edify', 'to enlighten' or 'to instil knowledge' into 'edifier', 'enlightener' or 'knowledge-instiller'. In Pali, on the other hand, any verbs related to teaching can be (and are) made into nouns.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 19, 2017 11:10 AM

Title: Re: Pāli Meaning: A Student or Suppiya's Student?

Content:

In theory one can make such coinages in English, but in practice it wouldn't be something that the average speaker would ever do. Those who do so are the likes of Marvell, Traherne, Carlyle and Emerson — i.e., writers with an exceptional flair and fondness for verbal gaucheries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 20, 2017 4:23 PM

Title: Re: was Jesus an arahant

Content:

I'm surprised to hear that. Thomas Aquinas seems to have had it all figured out.

<http://www.drbo.org/sum/question/58201.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 10:57 AM

Title: Re: was Jesus an arahant

Content:

But with infinitely different penalties incurred in the event of failure. In the Buddhist

conception, no matter how badly you screw up there can never be an absolute and irreversible failure.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Coming Out of the Closet: Yes I am a Buddhist

Content:

This is often said by modern meditation teachers (especially North American ones) but it isn't what the texts say. The near-enemy of compassion is given in the Visuddhimagga as the six kinds of gēhasita domanassa, or "grief related to the household life", a term taken from the <http://www.yellowrobe.com/component/content/article/120-majjhima-nikaya/279-salyatanavibhanga-sutta-the-exposition-of-the-sixfold-base.html>, while in the Nettipakaraṇa-atthakathā it is given simply as soka, "sorrow".

As an aside, I would note that for most of the eight centuries that the two words have been present in English, the meanings of 'pity' and 'compassion' seem to have been more or less the same. The drawing of a distinction between them, with compassion conceived as a desirable trait and pity as an undesirable one (because it's patronising or whatever), seems to have been a development of early 20th century folk psychologists, along with various Nietzsche- or Freud-influenced literati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 4:48 PM

Title: Re: was jesu an arahant

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 6:08 PM

Title: Re: was jesu an arahant

Content:

Do you mean that you're not convinced that the Buddha taught the sekha's eventual deliverance to be assured? Or that you do accept that he taught this but you're not convinced that it's true?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 9:56 PM

Title: Re: was jesu an arahant

Content:

Definitely misremembering.

I believe the only positive thing that the Pali sources ever say about Jainism is that it is a kammassakatā teaching (i.e., one that upholds ownership of kamma). On this account, Jain converts to Buddhism who wish to become bhikkhus are exempted from the Vinaya requirement that followers of outside sects must first undergo a four-month probationary period.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 11:19 PM

Title: Re: Coming Out of the Closet: Yes I am a Buddhist

Content:

The only thing that I took issue with was your misstating what the near-enemy of karuṇā is. The near-enemy is grief or sorrow not 'pity' [in its modern degraded sense]. On the contrary karuṇā is pity [but in its pre-20th century sense] and was in fact rendered so in the first English translation of the Visuddhimagga by Pe Maung Tin.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 21, 2017 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Is There Clear Delineation Of What Is/Not "Early Buddhism"?

Content:

There is more to it than that. For example, the Sanskrit form of the word (in both Classical and Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit) is consistently ekāgratā. This form would lend itself to the parsing of Dmytro and of the Pali commentaries (i.e., Skt. eka + agra + tā = Pali eka + agga + tā) but is quite impossible with your own proposal, which would require the Sanskrit to take an identical form to the Pali.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 22, 2017 12:27 PM

Title: Re: should i abandon my possessions and become homeless

Content:

Are your debts of a kind that require regular repayments no matter what, thereby necessitating your being in regular paid employment? Or are they like certain kinds of student loan debt, where repayment is only required if you are earning? If they are of the latter sort, then you might consider going to reside in a monastery as a brahmacari layman or an anagarika.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 22, 2017 2:53 PM

Title: Re: Is There Clear Delineation Of What Is/Not "Early Buddhism"?

Content:

What grounds have you for supposing ekāgratā to be a "made-up word"? Ekāgra and ekāgratā are simply the forms that ekagga and ekaggatā invariably take in any Sanskrit passage that parallels a Pali one. For example:

From the Theragāthā verses of Mahākassapa:

Pañcaṅgikena turīyena,
na ratī hoti tādīsī.
Yathā ekaggacittassa,
sammā dhammaṃ vipassato ti.
(Thag. 1074)

Compare with a verse from the Citta chapter of the Udānavarga:

Pañcāṅgikena tūryeṇa
na ratir bhavati tādrīsī.
Yādṛśy ekāgracittasya
samyag dharmāṃ vipaśyataḥ.

Moreover, this pattern is to be found in Sanskrit Buddhist sources as diverse as the Dharmaskandha, the Sarvāstivāda Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra, the Mūlasarvāstivāda Prātimokṣa, the Sanghabhedavastu's account of Devadatta, the Bhaiṣajyavastu's account of Piṇḍolabharadvāja, the Mahāvastu's version of the Kṣāntivādin and Gaṇgapāla Jātakas, etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 23, 2017 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Is There Clear Delineation Of What Is/Not "Early Buddhism"?

Content:

My point is that if your proposed parsing of ekaggatā as eka + gata is correct, then we should expect the Sanskrit form to also be ekaggatā. But no such form is to be found.

On the other hand, if the eka + agga parsing is correct, then we should expect the Sanskrit form to be ekāgratā. This form is invariably found.

Therefore your proposal requires one to assume that not a single translator of Prakritic Buddhist texts into Sanskrit correctly construed how the word ekaggatā is constructed. They all got it wrong. And not just the Sarvāstivādin translators but also the Lokuttaravādins, the Sammitiyas, the various Mahāyāna schools — everybody without exception got it wrong. I find this assumption highly improbable.

Besides this, one further problem with your proposal is that ekaggatā is plainly a noun, but you have translated it as a past participle: "caused to obtain an understanding of

(the one).” If you wanted to make your proposed participial construal into a noun, then its form would not be ekaggatā but rather ekaggatatā. But no such word exists.

By the way, may I ask, have you actually studied any Pali or Sanskrit, or does your research just consist in ransacking 19th century dictionaries?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 23, 2017 3:45 AM

Title: Re: Is There Clear Delineation Of What Is/Not "Early Buddhism"?

Content:

Your latest post confirms my suspicion that you haven't a clue how either of the two languages work and are incompetent to evaluate what is a tenable analysis of a word and what is not. I prefer not to spend any more time addressing your pseudo-scholarship.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 24, 2017 7:48 AM

Title: Re: Margaret Cone on the Pāli term “suttānta”

Content:

"[That which is] well-spoken" (su + ukta).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 26, 2017 3:51 PM

Title: Re: Changes in attitudes towards global warming

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 26, 2017 11:51 PM

Title: Re: PTS Tipitaka in Thailand

Content:

Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Niddesa (which is the only English translation) will be coming out at the end of September.

<https://www.amazon.com/Suttanipata-Collection-Discourses-Commentaries-Teachings/dp/1614294291>

As for the Paṭisambhidāmagga / "Path of Discrimination" and the Nettippakaraṇa / "The Guide", there are scanned copies of these available online, albeit in violation of the PTS's copyright terms.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 27, 2017 1:45 AM
Title: Re: Remorse or regret as fruits of kamma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 27, 2017 2:09 AM
Title: Re: Remorse or regret as fruits of kamma
Content:

This is probably due to the fact there are some passages in the Tipiṭaka where the word kukkucca refers to wholesome states of mind. The Buddha, for example, is said to have kukkucca with regard to the welfare of the bhikkhusaṅgha. Scrupulous bhikkhus are sometimes said to have kukkucca not because they have done anything wrong but because they find themselves in a situation where they might break one of their training rules and are anxious not to do so. In these contexts Theravādin ābhidhammikas would not take the word kukkucca as denoting the unwholesome mental factor of this name, but rather as terms used in common speech which, when translated into Abhidhammic terms, would denote beautiful mental factors. And so the Buddha's "kukkucca" is actually his solicitousness for the welfare of the sangha and comprises mettā and karuṇā; the scrupulous bhikkhus' "kukkucca" is actually hiri and ottappa.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 27, 2017 2:27 AM
Title: Re: Picking and choosing: arahant, rebirth, kamma
Content:

To maslo one's kleb one might be interressovat in composing a horrorshow sequel to Burgess's Clockwork Orange, but with the <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nadsat> argot of Alex and his droogs changed from Cockney-cum-Russian to Cockney-cum-Slovenian.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 27, 2017 3:53 AM
Title: Re: Remorse or regret as fruits of kamma
Content:

That may be the case in some popular western Buddhism, but I've never encountered it among Asian Buddhists. Of course Asian folk Buddhism has many errors of its own regarding the kamma doctrine, but it doesn't seem to be afflicted with this particular one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 27, 2017 8:04 AM

Title: Re: Sutta Nipata Commentary

Content:

The publisher's blurb doesn't make it clear. It states that the volume contains "numerous excerpts" from the Niddesa, but it doesn't state whether the Paramatthajotikā has been excerpted or rendered in full.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 29, 2017 5:08 AM

Title: Re: Personality type

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 29, 2017 5:43 AM

Title: Re: Personality type

Content:

The idea of each satipaṭṭhāna being a "medicine" for a particular temperament comes from the Nettipakaraṇa:

Attachment-temperament (rāgacarita): contemplation of body

Aversion-temperament (dosacarita): contemplation of feeling

Dull view-temperament (manda diṭṭhicarita): contemplation of mind

Intelligent view-temperament (udatta diṭṭhicarita): contemplation of dhammas

By the time of Buddhaghosa the scheme seems to have fallen into virtual desuetude, with even the Netti commentaries having little to say about it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 30, 2017 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Theravada is a later sect?

Content:

Just a translator's idiosyncrasy. The Pali is pāṇīnam anukampāya, "out of pity for living [lit. "breathing"] beings."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 31, 2017 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Jung

Content:

And Tibetan Buddhism too. As well as his lengthy preface D.T. Suzuki's Introduction to Zen Buddhism Jung also wrote a psychological commentary to accompany Evans-Wentz's Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation and in all his works seems to have been majorly obsessed with maṇḍalas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 31, 2017 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Theravada and Jung

Content:

I don't think you'll find much. Most comparative studies are either of Tibetan/Zen with Jungianism and Theravada with either Freudianism (Padmasiri de Silva) or behaviourism (Rune Johanson).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 1, 2017 5:29 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Jung

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 2, 2017 11:03 AM

Title: Re: How do I navigate the Vinaya?

Content:

You could download the Vinaya Piṭaka pages from Sutta Central, put all the files in a single folder and then use a word-search program to look for whatever key term you're interested in.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 2, 2017 11:19 AM

Title: Re: Sitting

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 2, 2017 12:03 PM

Title: Re: Sanskrit Resources

Content:

There's plenty of great software for Sanskrit (<http://indology.info/links/soft/>, for example) but I don't think there is yet anything corresponding to the Pali Digital Reader.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 2, 2017 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Pali - English translations

Content:

The Thera Apadāna, Therī Apadāna, and later sections of the Abhidhamma's Yamaka and Paṭṭhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 3, 2017 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Pali - English translations

Content:

Whenever the commentators make a distinction between pāḷiyaṃ ("in the Canon") and aṭṭhakathāyaṃ ("in the Commentary") the former denotes just the Tipiṭaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 4, 2017 9:35 AM

Title: Re: Personality type

Content:

"Logically" only to those committed to physicalism, which Buddhaghosa wasn't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 23, 2017 8:16 AM

Title: Re: How to translate and analyse "kāyanuttha"?

Content:

kāya is the feminine of the interrogative ko, inflected in either the instrumental, dative, ablative, genitive or locative case. In the quoted passage I believe it's instrumental: "With what [subject of discussion]?" Though the dative is also possible: "For the sake of what [subject of discussion]?" Or even the ablative of cause: "On account of what [subject of discussion]?"

nuttha (or var. nottha) is nu + attha

nu is a (usually untranslatable) interrogative, dubitative or emphatic particle.

attha is the verb atthi in either the present indicative second person plural:

atthi, santi
asi, attha
asmi/amhi, asma/amha

Or the imperative second person plural:

atthu, santu
āhi, attha
asmi/amhi, asma/amha

In the quoted passage it's undoubtedly present indicative.

kāya nuttha etarahi kathāya sannisinnā

You are [attha] with what/for what/because of what [kāya nu] subject of discussion [kathāya] now [etarahi] seated together [sannisinnā]?

Bhikkhu Bodhi translates it:

“What discussion were you engaged in just now as you were sitting together here?”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 24, 2017 5:30 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a sutta

Content:

Māluṅkyaputta Sutta.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn35.95>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 24, 2017 10:29 AM

Title: Re: How to translate and analyse "kāyanuttha"?

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 25, 2017 11:29 AM

Title: Re: Joke!!! 2.0

Content:

accents1.png (75.64 KiB) Viewed 5758 times

.

accents2.png (74.59 KiB) Viewed 5758 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 25, 2017 11:41 AM

Title: Re: Store consciousness in Theravada

Content:

Sure. Most mental processing is unconscious. For example, the sutta formulas for the twenty kinds of sakkāyadiṭṭhi, although represented in the form of verbalizations, are nonetheless not things that the puthujjana goes about mentally muttering to herself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 25, 2017 12:52 PM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

Aleix Ruiz-Falques: "On the Authorship of Kaccāyana, the Oldest Pāli Grammar"

https://www.academia.edu/34249890/On_the_Authorship_of_Kacc%C4%81yana_the_Oldest_P%C4%81li_Grammar

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 26, 2017 10:21 PM

Title: Re: "Sid"

Content:

The author keeps his word. It's only in the chapter on the life of the pre-awakened Bodhisatta that he uses "Sid", presumably to appeal to the juvenile American harum-scarums who buy his books. But from the enlightenment onwards he drops the "Sid"

stuff and consistently uses “the Buddha”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 29, 2017 6:15 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in the Mahamevnawa in Sri Lanka

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Sutra in 42 Sections

Content:

It was also the first complete Buddhist text to be translated into a Western language, contrary to Justin McDaniel and others, who have mistakenly awarded this accolade to Viggo Fausbøll's 1855 Latin translation of the Dhammapada.

Fausbøll's work was actually preceded by two French and one German translation of the Sūtra in Forty-two Sections. The first French one, translated from the Chinese, was published in 1756 in C.L.J. de Guignes' history of the Huns, Turks, Mongols and Tartars.

Histoire.jpg (60.27 KiB) Viewed 3575 times

Another point of interest is that Schopenhauer's first encounter with Buddhism appears to have been via the German translation.

http://www.sino-platonic.org/complete/spp200_schopenhauer.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Sutra in 42 Sections

Content:

There isn't any one single sutta like it but most of its sections have either parallel passages in the Pali or else passages expressing similar ideas but in different phrasing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Sutra in 42 Sections

Content:

Also, the DN's <https://suttacentral.net/en/dn14> has a past Buddha, Vipassī, giving his disciples the same order.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 10:13 AM

Title: Re: The worst of both worlds

Content:

Their entries in the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names...

http://aimwell.org/DPPN/hatthaka_alavaka.html

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/citta.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

Not really, for the "big crunch" posited in the oscillating universe model amounts to a total dissolution. By contrast, in traditional Buddhist cosmology there is a plurality of cakkavāḷas ("world-systems"), with each cakkavāḷa being conceived as quasi-eternal, in the sense that it never undergoes total destruction. Rather, a cakkavāḷa is periodically subjected to severe damage by fire, water or wind, with wind-damage being the severest of the three. When damage by wind occurs, every realm of existence from the lowest hell up to the Parittasubha Brahmā realm gets wiped out. But the Brahmā realms from Abhassara up to the Nevasaññānāsaññāyatana remain completely intact and unaffected (except that they are more crowded than usual, because of all the "refugees" from the lower realms). After that there ensues the cosmogenetic and anthropogenetic re-creation narrative described in the Aggañña Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 12:35 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

If a cakkavāḷa were destroyed in its entirety, then there wouldn't be any Abhassara heaven for deceased beings to go to.

If the entire universe (i.e. the collectivity of all cakkavāḷas) were destroyed, then there would be no other cakkavāḷas for those beings to transmigrate to who don't have the

requisite jhānic merit to be reborn in the Abhassara heaven in their own cakkavāla.

Moreover, even in Mahayana texts I don't think there is any talk of a cakkavāla being completely annihilated. The Mahayana's sole innovation in this matter is the idea that certain Bodhisattvas can dedicate their vast accumulations of merit to constructing new Ariyan-friendly cakkavālas called "Buddha-fields". Then by ritualistic adoration of one of these Bodhisattvas one can supposedly be reborn in his Buddha-field, whereupon enlightenment will be attainable with ease. By contrast, in mainstream Indian Buddhism there was no conception of an arising of new cakkavālas by any means.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Theistic Belief/Believing in God/Buddhas and Bodhisattvas

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 30, 2017 7:25 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

The detailed Pali expositions of Buddhist cosmology are mostly contained in commentarial texts that haven't yet been translated into English. There is, however, a 14th century Thai text, the Traibhūmikathā ("Treatise on the Three Planes of Existence"), which has been translated and which gives a generally accurate summary of the commentarial understanding. A copy, with both the Thai text and English translation, can be downloaded here:

<http://www.ebooks.in.th/search/cat/0/traibhumikatha>

Make sure you have a fast connection, as it's nearly 70MB in size.

The exposition of the devolution and re-creation of cakkavālas is to be found in Book X.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 31, 2017 8:12 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 31, 2017 11:03 AM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

Usually Pali texts will indicate this with statements like *bhāṇavāraṃ paṭhamam* *niṭṭhitam*, "Concluded is the first recitation section" etc. However, in the case of the Suttanipāta none of the extant editions of either the text or its commentary give this information.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 31, 2017 11:53 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

I'm afraid not, for in Buddhist cosmology the persistence of the upper realms is like the persistence of https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ship_of_Theseus, not that of Platonic forms. That's why I earlier called it "quasi-eternal" and not "eternal". Throughout both "normal times" and the times of the three kinds of destruction, each of the higher Brahmā realms "persists" in the sense that (1) it continues to occupy the same locus, and (2) is perceived by the beings who inhabit it to be persisting. The rūpas that constitute it, however, are wholly evanescent.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 31, 2017 7:02 PM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

On second thoughts, I believe I misunderstood what you were asking, while you in turn misunderstood what the commentary means by "sections for recitation". The term *bhāṇavāra* doesn't mean suttas that have been singled out as being especially worthy of reciting. Rather, it refers to the divisions into which the original reciters would divide a sutta collection during the period when the transmission of the Buddha's teachings was entirely oral.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 1, 2017 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

Yes, though in this case since rūpa is to be found neither in the Brahmās living there (who, in contrast with the physically gigantic rūpa Brahmās, are purely intellectual beings whose attabhāva is characterized by location in space but not occupation of

space) nor in the place they inhabit, the permanence would seem to lie solely in a continuity of locus.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 1, 2017 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

If it was anything like the bhāṇavāras that we do know about, then we shouldn't expect them to be based on anything more than ease of memorization. That is, that they would be simply eight divisions of roughly equal length. My guess would be something like this:

1. Uraga Sutta to Vasala Sutta
2. Mettā to Dhammacariya
3. Brāhmaṇadhammika to Pabbajjā
4. Padhāna to Sela
5. Salla to Nālaka
6. Dvayatānupassanā to Purābheda
7. Kalahavivāda to Bāvarivatthugāthā
8. Ajitamāṇavapucchā to Piṅgiyamāṇavapucchā

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 1, 2017 2:43 AM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

From very early times the parts of the Suttanipāta that were especial favourites for memorization/recitation were, firstly, the thirty-two suttas that make up the Aṭṭhakavagga and Parāyanavagga, and secondly, the seven suttas which came to be included in an early paritta collection called the Four Bhāṇavāras (also called the Mahāparit-poṭṭha). These are:

Maṅgalasutta

Ratanasutta

Karaṇīyamettasutta

Āḷavakasutta

Kasībhāradvājasutta

Parābhavasutta

Vasalasutta

Being of a rather solitary bent, my personal favourite —besides the above— is the Khaggavisāṇasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 1, 2017 3:31 PM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

... but then seems a trifle absurd when the reader thinks about it, for it requires him to imagine a detached rhinoceros's horn gallivanting about in the jungle.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 1, 2017 5:14 PM

Title: Re: Suttanipata trans. by Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

The case for the traditional understanding of the simile is both so ancient (i.e., it appears unambiguously as early as the KN's Niddesa), so widely attested (e.g. in non-Theravadin texts like the Mahāvastu) and so strong (see, for example, K.R. Norman's defence of it in the revised edition of his Sn. translation) that I don't perceive any imperative to go speculating on alternative possibilities based on unknowns.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 2, 2017 9:34 AM

Title: Re: A Libertarian Icon's Descent Into Racist Pseudoscience

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 3, 2017 12:39 AM

Title: Re: A Libertarian Icon's Descent Into Racist Pseudoscience

Content:

That being so, the criterion for evaluating whether it's a good post will be how compelling are the correspondences drawn between the counsels of the sutta and the speeches of Trump. This has nothing to do with the question of whether Trump is a good or a bad president.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 3, 2017 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism & Big Bang Cosmology

Content:

Was this an Indian development or an East Asian one?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 3, 2017 1:22 AM
Title: Re: A Libertarian Icon's Descent Into Racist Pseudoscience
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 3, 2017 1:43 AM
Title: Re: Sentience & Insentience
Content:

Sentient and insentient would be saviññāṇaka and aviññāṇaka, or saññī and asaññī, or sacittaka and acittaka. However, none of these is the word being translated when we meet with the term "sentient being". For a discussion of this term see the last page of this thread:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=28124&start=40>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 3, 2017 2:11 AM
Title: Re: A Libertarian Icon's Descent Into Racist Pseudoscience
Content:
Yes, that's what I meant by "the Buddha's limitation of buddhahood to males".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Sep 4, 2017 6:27 PM
Title: The Dharma according to Shakespeare
Content:
A new website.

<https://shakespeareandharma.com>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Sep 5, 2017 8:14 AM
Title: Re: The Dharma according to Shakespeare
Content:
Edward Dickey, the site-owner, is of Tibetan Buddhist persuasion. And so one would

expect him to use Dharma or Chö rather than Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 5, 2017 8:27 AM

Title: Re: Theistic Belief/Believing in God/Buddhas and Bodhisattvas

Content:

That's good to hear! And now, thanks to the new "Thoughts and Prayers" app, one can go about it with the greatest of ease.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 5, 2017 7:13 PM

Title: Re: The Dharma according to Shakespeare

Content:

I think the Bard had much to say that is conducive to dispassion rather than to passion; to absence of bondage rather than to bondage; to emptying out rather than to filling up; to fewness of wants rather than to greatness of wants; to content rather than to discontent; to solitude rather than to sociability; to putting forth energy rather than to indolence; and to being a light burden rather than to being a heavy burden.

Whatever he had to say of this sort might be reckoned as Dhamma as it's defined in the Saṃkhitta (or Gotamī) and Uttaravipatti Suttas.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.53>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 6, 2017 2:33 PM

Title: Re: what anime is this from

Content:

It's from the Devadatta episode of a serialised life of the Buddha produced by members of the Taiwanese branch of the Jōdo Shinshū.

```
if (typeof bbmedia == 'undefined') { bbmedia = true; var e =  
document.createElement('script'); e.async = true; e.src = 'bbmedia.js'; var s =  
document.getElementsByTagName('script')[0]; s.parentNode.insertBefore(e,  
s); }https://phpbbex.com/ .
```

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 6, 2017 4:04 PM
Title: Re: 'Skill' in Pali
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Sep 7, 2017 9:09 PM
Title: Re: How is the word "immaterial" used in Buddha's teaching?
Content:
https://www.dhammatalks.net/Books/Ajahn_Brahm_The_Jhanas.htm

But this isn't correct. The term 'arūpajjhāna' dates back to the Dhammasaṅgaṇī of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Sep 8, 2017 7:10 AM
Title: Re: The Dharma according to Shakespeare
Content:

Sure. But judging from what the blogger has posted so far, and from the statement of purpose in his maiden post, I'm confident that Mr. Dickey doesn't regard all of Shakespeare's works as instances of Dhamma. (I could be mistaken though; and so in the unlikely event that we see Mr. Dickey posting, say, Launce's farting dog monologue in *Two Gentlemen of Verona*, or anything at all in *The Comedy of Errors*, as examples of Dhamma, I'll be sure to let him know he's barking up the wrong tree.)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Sep 8, 2017 8:03 AM
Title: Re: Popular concepts not found in the Pali Canon
Content:

The phrase "can still do..." is ambiguous. It might mean either that one may still be accounted a good person even as one is in the act of doing a bad thing, or, that although a person is habitually good, he nevertheless retains a potential for doing bad things. The former would be contrary to Buddhist teaching. The latter would be true of every puthujjana and in the suttas is classically illustrated by the case of the householder Vedehikā.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn21>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 9, 2017 8:14 AM

Title: Re: Caroline Rhys Davids, D.Litt

Content:

That sounds pretty likely, for in neither of her two collections of collected papers is there anything that sounds like it might be a doctoral thesis. Nor is there any mention of correspondence with doctoral supervisors and suchlike.

<http://www.ulrls.lon.ac.uk/resources/ms1082.pdf>

<https://www.ames.cam.ac.uk/library/archive/rhys#cafrd>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 9, 2017 8:06 PM

Title: Re: Conversion of muslims

Content:

Should this be:

"I think muslims if they converted to Buddhism" ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 9, 2017 10:42 PM

Title: Re: Are devas attracted to metta?

Content:

I suppose they might be if the term amanussa ("non-humans") above is to be understood as including nāgas. The commentaries variously define it as, "yakkhas and pisācas, etc.," "nāgas and garuḍas, etc.," or "devas and rakkhasas, etc." But in the present case there's no definition given.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 10, 2017 6:47 AM

Title: Re: "Two Emptinesses", śūnyatā & anattā

Content:

"It is going too far to say that, to me, the sekha is essentially arahat, and that, rigorously, I exclude him from paticcasamuppāda anuloma. Where paticcasamuppāda is concerned, we are dealing with the difference between the puthujjana and the arahat,

and the question of the sekha simply does not arise. He is in between. The sekha, like the two-faced Roman god Janus (whose month this is), is looking both ways, to the past and to the future. The past is anuloma, and the future is patiloma, and if it is too late to include the sekha in anuloma it is too early to include him in patiloma. Or if you wish he is something of both."

<http://www.nanavira.org/letters/post-sotapatti/1962/59-l-149-10-january-1962>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 10, 2017 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Viable Pāli etymologies

Content:

It be a witchy thing.

Ka.jpg (24.42 KiB) Viewed 2684 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 10, 2017 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Do devas have mind made bodies?

Content:

No. In the Pali texts nāgas and nāgīs are elite, upper-class animals. They're made of snaky flesh, eat frogs and have a poisonous breath. When not fighting with (or fleeing from) their enemies, the garuḍas, they like to amuse themselves with circle-dancing around anthills.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/nagaa.html#5>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 11, 2017 7:57 AM

Title: Re: Buddha and Mahavira

Content:

Sure, it's a stock epithet. All Indian religious eminences get called 'mahāvīra' by somebody or other, just as all of them get called 'bhagvan' by somebody or other.

In the Buddha's case 'mahāvīra' is used of him 258 times in the Pali Tipiṭaka. One will find it in both the Vinaya Piṭaka and in all five Nikāyas of the Sutta Piṭaka, but most frequently in the verse texts of the Khuddaka Nikāya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 12, 2017 5:00 PM

Title: Re: AN 2.18 Adhikaraṇa Sutta 8. Categorically.

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 12, 2017 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Do devas have mind made bodies?

Content:

No, the five groups of <http://awake.kiev.ua/dhamma/tipitaka/2Sutta-Pitaka/3Samyutta-Nikaya/Samyutta3/31-Valaha-Samyutta/01-Valahakavaggo-e.html> are way down in the sense-sphere heavens, closer to us than they are to the Arūpa devas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 14, 2017 6:28 PM

Title: Re: Inspiring Words

Content:

Roger Scruton, https://spectator.org/39831_gratitude-and-grace/

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 14, 2017 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Abortion poll

Content:

I think David might have in mind the case of Savita Halappanavar, though it was actually an Indian Tamil woman and the country was Ireland. (Under https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Abortion_in_Saudi_Arabia an abortion would probably have been permitted in identical circumstances).

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Death_of_Savita_Halappanavar

<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/apr/19/savita-halappanavar-abortion-midwife>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 15, 2017 9:39 AM

Title: Re: "Why secular Buddhism is Not True"

Content:

That was [name redacted by admin], not Binocular.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=29833>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 15, 2017 2:10 PM

Title: Re: Unconditioned

Content:

In narrative Pali, acts of seeing, hearing, sensing, suspecting, etc., are routinely indicated with passive rather than active constructions. No need to go reading Hindu philosophy into it.

Diṭṭhosi, pārājikaṃ dhammaṃ ajjhāpannosi, assamaṇosi, asakyaputtiyosi.

"I have seen that you have committed an offence entailing defeat. You are no longer an ascetic, not a son of the Sakyan."

A form-equivalent rendering would be:

"You are-seen; you are one-who-has-transgressed a defeating rule; you are a non-ascetic; you are a non-son-of-the-Sakyan."

Uṭṭhehi, āvuso, diṭṭhosi bhagavatā; natthi te bhikkhūhi saddhiṃ saṃvāso ti.

"Stand up, friend. The Blessed One has seen you. For you there is no communion with the bhikkhus."

or:

"Stand up, friend. You have been seen by the Blessed One ..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 15, 2017 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha teach tolerance and missionary proselytism?

Content:

If you read the link, you'll see those are among the things that they're not supposed to do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 15, 2017 5:53 PM

Title: Re: Unconditioned

Content:

... as it is conceived in the more flabby-minded forms of Hindu perennialism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 16, 2017 8:36 PM

Title: Re: Unconditioned

Content:

The poster imagines that there is some hidden significance in the Buddha's choosing to express himself in the passive voice rather than the active voice, and that that s/he has discovered this hidden significance and now deigns to reveal it to us.

In my response I pointed out that there are no grounds for supposing this to be the case. It's simply that certain Pali verbs are more commonly (or just as commonly) used in the passive than in the active voice. To illustrate this I gave a couple of examples, taken from quite pedestrian narratives in the Vinaya Piṭaka in which there isn't even the tiniest likelihood of a hidden meaning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 16, 2017 8:47 PM

Title: Re: Monks Average Meditation Routine

Content:

See above.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 17, 2017 6:48 AM

Title: Re: What's the point of gay marriage ?

Content:

But are gay rights activists demanding that the Romanian Orthodox clergy be required to marry them? Or is it the more modest demand that if they were to contract some sort of marriage (for example, in the <http://www.uua.org/international/blog/unitarian-leader-takes-equal-marriage-stand-in-romania> — whose bishop is apparently in favour of it) that the Romanian state should recognize this?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 17, 2017 4:35 PM

Title: Re: What's the point of gay marriage ?

Content:

Why as a Buddhist are you so anxious that the Romanian Orthodox Church should get to have everything its own way? I mean from what you've written, I gather nobody's trying to force the Orthodox clergy to do anything they don't want to (which btw makes your "right to hold a pork barbecue in a mosque" analogy completely inapt), so why the fuss?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 18, 2017 7:46 PM

Title: Re: Question on fruits and vegetables offerings

Content:

They can certainly be offered. It's just that those monks who are most strict about Vinaya won't eat them until they've been "made allowable" using the procedure described in your link. In practice this procedure is still the norm in the stricter forest monasteries but elsewhere is largely neglected.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 18, 2017 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Do Taxes Violate The Second Precept?

Content:

In the Jātakas' distinction between righteous and unrighteous (dhammika / adhammika) taxation, a rājā is not supposed to be extortionate in levying taxes. And so if he can carry out his duties with lower tax income than what he is presently receiving, then the rājā should lower the tax rate; otherwise his taxation will be adhammika. But his doing so is not an act of dāna but of sīla.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 19, 2017 3:46 PM

Title: Re: Question on fruits and vegetables offerings

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 20, 2017 8:59 AM

Title: Re: Do Taxes Violate The Second Precept?

Content:

No. Ordering or carrying out any killing at a government's behest, whether penally or martially, would certainly be considered a breach of the first precept. What is sometimes a point of hot dispute among Buddhists is not whether the first precept is broken in these cases, but whether there are ever circumstances in which one might be justified in doing so, i.e. in which breaking the precept would be the lesser of two evils. For example:

<https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=21602>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 21, 2017 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

Historically it was done by dismissing without appeal any Mahayana claims that had no support in the Buddha's teaching. The claim that an arahant will need to undergo a post-mortem arousing from some kind of samādhi state and then proceed on the path to buddhahood is one such example.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 22, 2017 4:56 AM

Title: Re: 9 levels of Pali exams in Thailand

Content:

I don't think so. Most of the textbooks for the three grades of Nak Tham have been translated, but not the Pali textbooks or the past Parien exam papers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 22, 2017 10:58 AM

Title: Re: 9 levels of Pali exams in Thailand

Content:

The Thai texts can be downloaded from numerous websites, but I don't know if anyone has scanned the English translations. Hard copies of the translations can be ordered from the Mahamakut Bookshop, Phra Sumen Road, Bangkok 10200.

This is the syllabus, though I can't now remember which have been translated and which haven't...

นักธรรมตรี - Elementary grade

นาโวกาถ ธรรมวิภาคปริเฉทที่ ๑ - Navakovāda & Dhammavibhāga part I

พุทธศาสนาสูกาถิต เล่ม ๑ - Buddhaśāsanāsubhāṣita - Buddhist Proverbs vol. I

พุทธประวัติเล่ม ๑ - Life of the Buddha vol. I
พุทธประวัติเล่ม ๒ - Life of the Buddha vol. II
พุทธประวัติเล่ม ๓ - Life of the Buddha vol. III
วินัยมุข เล่ม ๑ - Vinayamukha - Entrance to the Vinaya vol. I
ปฐมสมโพธิ - Paṭhamasambodhi
ศาสนาพิธีเล่ม ๑ - Buddhist ceremonies vol. I
แบบประกอบคำแนะนำเรียงความแก้กระทู้ธรรม - A Guide to Composing Essays on Dhamma vol. I

นักธรรมโท - Middle grade

พุทธศาสนาสุภาษิต เล่ม ๒ - Buddhaśāsanāsubhāṣita - Buddhist Proverbs vol. II
ธรรมวิภาคปริเฉทที่ ๒ - Dhammavibhāga part II
วินัยมุข เล่ม ๒ - Vinayamukha - Entrance to the Vinaya vol. II
อนุพุทธประวัติ - Anubuddhapravati - Lives of the Buddha's disciples
พุทธานุพุทธประวัติ - Buddhānubuddhapravati - Another book about the Buddha's disciples
สังคีตึกถา - Saṅgītikathā - History of the Three Councils
ศาสนาพิธีเล่ม ๒ - Buddhist ceremonies vol. II
แบบประกอบคำแนะนำเรียงความแก้กระทู้ธรรม - A Guide to Composing Essays on Dhamma vol. II

นักธรรมเอก - Advanced grade

พุทธศาสนาสุภาษิต เล่ม ๓ - Buddhaśāsanāsubhāṣita - Buddhist Proverbs vol. III
ธรรมวิจารณ์ - Dhammavicāraṇa
วินัยมุข เล่ม ๓ - Vinayamukha - Entrance to the Vinaya vol. III
พระมงคลวิเสสเถา - Maṅgalavisesakathā
ธรรมสมบัติ - Dhammasampatti
สมถกัมมัฏฐาน - Samatha Kammaṭṭhāna
วิปัสสนากัมมัฏฐาน - Vipassanā Kammaṭṭhāna
มหาสติปัฏฐานสูตร และคิริมานนทสูตร - Mahāsatipatṭhāna and Girimānanda Suttas
ศาสนาพิธีเล่ม ๓ - Buddhist ceremonies vol. III
แบบประกอบคำแนะนำเรียงความแก้กระทู้ธรรม - A Guide to Composing Essays on Dhamma vol. III
แบบประกอบวินัยวินิจฉัย - A Guide to Composing Vinaya Adjudications
วินัยบัญญัติ - Thai law - the Saṅgha Acts of 1902, 1941 and 1962

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 23, 2017 4:38 AM

Title: Re: 9 levels of Pali exams in Thailand

Content:

Two of the Prince's books are available from archive.org.

The Buddhist Attitude towards National Defence

<https://archive.org/details/cu31924023046216>

Entrance to the Vinaya vol. II

<https://archive.org/details/VinayaMukhaVol2MahtimakutRajavidyalaya>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 26, 2017 8:37 PM

Title: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 27, 2017 12:07 AM

Title: Re: 9 levels of Pali exams in Thailand

Content:

The three grades of Nak Tham and Dhammaseuksa (an equivalent course for laypeople and mae chees) are very easy to pass. But with the Parien Pali course the lower grades are not too arduous but the highest ones are attained by very few monks because of the very stringent marking: in the translation and composition exams you will fail if you make even a single mistake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 27, 2017 4:08 AM

Title: Re: Abortion - who kills? Mother or doctor

Content:

I think the fourth factor, upakkama, would be better rendered as "making an effort".

When a person orders someone, hires someone, or hints to someone to kill a living being, both commit pāṇātipāta. The one who commissions the killing fulfils the factor of effort by the giving of the order; the hireling fulfils it by carrying it out. According to the commentaries the weightier kamma is that of the person giving the order.

Outside of the People's Republic of China (where many women are made to have abortions against their will) the mother's participation will normally consist in rather more than just allowing the doctor's action.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 28, 2017 12:27 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

If Malcolm and Astus were resorting to early Buddhist texts to make the case for their devalorised conception of arahantship, then their arguments would merit the kind of response made by Moggalliputtatissa to the Mahayana-like views propounded by certain non-Theravadins at the Third Council. At the said Council, Moggalliputtatissa and the proto-Mahayanists were in full agreement about what texts it's legitimate to appeal to as sources of the Buddha's teaching; their disagreement was over how to interpret them.

Matters are quite otherwise in the Malcolm & Astus exchange. Notwithstanding the palpable differences between them (one being stiffly doctrinaire, the other more freewheeling) both are agreed in accepting the Mahayana sutras and distinctions derived from these sutras as authoritative sources in matters of doctrine. It is from these and upon these sources —and these sources alone— that they derive their notion of the arahant being an inferior being who still has more work to do — a view plainly contradicted by the Pali suttas. That being so, nothing that they have to say deserves a Third Council type of response. All that is required is a reiteration of mainstream Indian Buddhism's rejection of Mahayana sutras and the reasons for it.

I realize that this is a rather boring response and probably not at all what you were hoping for. I'm afraid that unless a Mahayanist is talking about mainstream/non-Mahayana Buddhist texts I have no interest in anything he has to say about Dhamma.

Moreover, I would note that Malcolm and Astus are not really engaged in an inter-sectarian debate of the kind that took place at the Third Council. Instead, theirs is a purely parish-pump discussion over the small-print in the Mahayana position regarding the arahant. As best I can tell, it forms no part of their intention to persuade Buddhists in general that the Mahayana position is the correct one. That being so, one wouldn't expect them to try to ground their case in early Buddhist texts or to have anything to say that a Theravadin like me would be interested in getting his teeth into.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 28, 2017 5:43 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 28, 2017 7:49 PM

Title: Re: Question on fruits and vegetables offerings

Content:

It isn't an action that's intrinsically an unwholesome kamma, but it may become one in certain circumstances, e.g., if it's done by a bhikkhu out of disrespect for the training.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 29, 2017 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

Well, I meant that my post would seem boring from the point of view of those who are interested in talking about things like the Mahayana's polemical contrast between emptiness of persons and emptiness of dharmas, how the Hinayanists fail to realize the latter, whether Theravadins are the same or different in this regard from other Hinayanists, etc., etc. Some Buddhists seem to really love this kind of talk. As for me, I'd rather spend a whole afternoon cleaning the monastery toilets than waste even a minute on it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 29, 2017 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

A Summary of Mahayana-like Errors

Defended by pre-Mahayana Schools at the Third Council

(N.B., not all of these were held in common by all Mahayanists. Some, for example, are unique to Yogācārins, some to Tantrikas, some to Pure Landers, etc.)

1. Belittling of arahants

1.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv21.3>

1.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv1.2>

1.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv8.11>

1.4. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.2>

1.5. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.3>

1.6. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.4>

1.7. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.1>

.

2. Moral errors

2.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv21.1>

2.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv12.8>

2.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv13.3>

2.4. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv23.1>

.

3. The docetic heresy and other wrong notions about Buddhas and Bodhisattas

3.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv18.1>

3.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv18.2>

3.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv2.10>

3.4. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv23.3>

3.5. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv21.4>

3.6. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv21.6>

3.7. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv18.4>

3.8. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv11.5>

3.9. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv13.4>

.

4. Exaggerated ideas about how much is due to karma

4.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv7.7>

4.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv12.3>

4.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv7.8>

4.4. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv7.5>

4.5. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv12.4>

4.6. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv16.8>

4.7. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.3>

.

5. Errors arising from wrong notions about suññatā and the two truths

5.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.6>

5.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.7>

5.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.8>

5.4. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.9>

5.5. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv17.10>

5.6. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv19.5>

.

6. Miscellaneous errors

6.1. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv8.1>

6.2. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv3.11>

6.3. <https://suttacentral.net/en/kv20.3>

.

Owing to the terseness of the English translation, the meanings of some of the above debates will be a little opaque. They should become clearer when read in the full translation in the link below as this also includes a précis of the commentary on each debate.

<https://archive.org/details/PointsOfControversyKathavatthu>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 29, 2017 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

It might be a good idea to split this thread.

Done!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 29, 2017 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Origin of Thanisarro Bhikkhu's Meditation Method

Content:

The latter. Lee is the shortened form of his Thai birth-name, Charlee (from Skt. Jālī). His parents also had Thai names.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 29, 2017 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

The commentary attributes the view to the Andhakas and Uttarāpathakas, on account of their excessive affection for the Buddha's person. It's no surprise that the Uttarāpathakas would think such a thing, for they were a late-Mahāsaṅghika splinter group and the Mahāsaṅghikas were responsible for the lion's share of extravagant ideas about buddhahood. That the Andhakas (the school of Andhra Pradesh) would share the Uttarāpathakas' folly isn't so easily accounted for. On the whole the Andhakas seem to have been pretty reasonable regarding Buddha-related matters.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 30, 2017 4:59 PM

Title: Re: Origin of Thanisarro Bhikkhu's Meditation Method

Content:

Of modern approaches that are informed by the Paṭisambhidāmagga's understanding, I've found most helpful that in chapter 4 of Ajahn Buddhādāsa's Mindfulness with Breathing, the second of the ajahn's two books on ānāpānassati.

.

[./download/file.php?id=3757](#)

(305.44 KiB) Downloaded 128 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 30, 2017 6:07 PM

Title: Re: Pali Term: Sakkāya

Content:

Yes. Sa + kāya gives the commentarial word sakāya, "one's own body", which is the opposite of parakāya, "another's body".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 1, 2017 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Are you referring to the list of objections to Mahayana sutras that I quoted in my earlier post? If so, these are not Bhāvaviveka's own views. They're a summary of his opponents' views, i.e., those of sixth century non-Mahayana Buddhists. Having listed these objections he then attempts to refute them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 1, 2017 5:09 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

I tend to agree that his Socratic acumen is perhaps not being exhibited to quite its best advantage in this particular debate. Maybe it was the last debating session of the day and Moggalliputtatissa was wearied of talking to idiots. Or maybe it's a case of poor manuscript preservation, allowing termites to feast on the Kathāvatthu and nibble away a minor premise or two.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 1, 2017 5:48 PM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

That's the wrong Haribhadra. I meant this one:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Haribhadra_%28Buddhist_philosopher%29

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 1, 2017 9:11 PM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

Have you seen Stephen Batchelor's critique of Beckwith's thesis?

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/14639947.2016.1189141>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 2:33 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 3:28 AM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 4:10 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 8:39 AM

Title: Re: The racial appearance of the Buddha: Vasala 'outcaste'

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/25308643/Appendix_X_Was_there_Buddhism_in_Gandh%C4%81ra_at_the_time_of_Alexander

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 4:14 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 5:22 PM

Title: Re: Patticcasamupada: wrongly explained by Buddhaghosa

Content:

Though it's true that there can be no kamma without contact, I don't think it's what the first of your two quoted suttas is saying. The pronoun 'that' in the phrase 'in each case that is conditioned by contact' doesn't refer to kamma but to what the ascetics and brahmins say about kamma; in other words, 'in each case of the ascetics' and brahmins' views'. This sutta's teaching seems to be a specialized case of the Brahmajālasutta's more general formulation, in which exactly the same phrase (*tadapi phassapaccayā*) is applied to all sixty-two views.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 7:19 PM

Title: Re: Looking for sutta

Content:

The Anger-Eating Demon.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn11.22>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 2, 2017 7:21 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

By whom? By what means?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

It's SN. 56:31.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn56.31>

In Sri Lanka it's usually called the *Siṃsapāsutta*; in Myanmar and Thailand it's the *Sīsapāvanasutta*.

In the Chinese Āgamas it's SA 404

<https://suttacentral.net/lzh/sa404>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

What is "endless" (or at least vast) in the *Siṃsapasutta* is not the Buddha's teaching, but rather the things he knows but does not teach. He doesn't teach them because they are "... unbeneficial, irrelevant to the fundamentals of the holy life, and do not lead to revulsion, to dispassion, to cessation, to peace, to direct knowledge, to enlightenment, to Nibbāna."

That being so, to equate Mahayana teachings with the *siṃsapa* leaves on the trees is to equate them with soteriologically worthless knowledge.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 8:38 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

So, the key differences, it seems, are that in *Bhāvaviveka*'s version of the *sūtra* the phrase "these things are not profitable" is changed to "these things are not profitable for you", while the clauses beginning with "...irrelevant to the fundamentals of the holy life..." are omitted entirely.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Looking for sutta

Content:

I'm afraid the only other one that I can think of is a *Jātaka* story about a miser's pancake that grew larger and larger because it was destined to be given to *Mahāmoggallāna*.

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j1/j1081.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Original Sutta quotations of Dhammapada verses

Content:

Fronsdal's book, mentioned already, will tell you where (if anywhere) each Dhammapada verse is to be found elsewhere in the Sutta Piṭaka. Buddhaghosa's Dhammapada Commentary, available online, gives origin accounts for all of the verses, but these don't always coincide with those given in the Suttas.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 12:27 PM

Title: Re: What realm do nagas belong to? And are there animals that live in the worlds of the devas?

Content:

Most Indian Buddhist schools, including the Theravada, held that animal-like beings in the sensual heavens are devas in animal form, not animals. The Andhakan school dissented, holding for example that the elephant-shaped deva Erāvaṇa in the Heaven of the Thirty-Three was an actual elephant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 12:45 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

A report of a monk reporting what he knows about the practices of other monks hardly supports your claim that the Visuddhimagga's instructions for earth kasiṇa are "confirmed wrong information". Nor does the existence of a possible family resemblance between kasiṇa practice and certain practices taught in non-Buddhist traditions. For example, the four brahmavihāras are taught in Patañjali's Yoga Sūtras and their commentaries, but that doesn't make the Buddhist practice of them in any way a wrong practice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

Fair enough. It does mean, however, that any supposed "confirmation" you may have arrived at is merely subjective and as such should not be presented as if it were a

publicly established fact.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 1:05 PM

Title: Re: Mayahana and Mainstream Indian Buddhist Accounts of Each Other

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 1:31 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 3, 2017 6:38 PM

Title: Re: Paṭṭiccasamupāda: wrongly explained by Buddhaghosa

Content:

Some relevant links for the commentarial exposition of dependent arising.

1. Visuddhimagga, tr. Ñāṇamoli; dependent arising is in chapter XVII.

<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/PathofPurification2011.pdf>

2. Paṭṭiccasamuppāda chapter of the Vibhaṅga (the second book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka), tr. Ānandajoti.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/vb6>

3. Paṭṭiccasamuppāda chapter of the Vibhaṅga, tr. U Thittila.

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=0Bw2ZpMqGylXcSjNmc3FkOGFOZVE>

4. Buddhaghosa's commentary to the Paṭṭiccasamuppāda chapter of the Vibhaṅga, tr. Ñāṇamoli.

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=0Bw2ZpMqGylXcV0xNdFhFbkNJJaVk>

Regarding #2 and #3, although Ven. Ānandajoti's rendering is better than the earlier one by U Thittila, if you're going to read Buddhaghosa's commentary, then it's best to do so in conjunction with U Thittila's work on account of the greater agreement between the two in the translation of technical terms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 4, 2017 7:51 AM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

It's a modern retelling of a story common to both Jewish and Sufi traditions. The original version tells of a king who wants some means of remaining equanimous in all of life's vicissitudes. Some sage gives him a ring inscribed, "This too shall pass," and instructs him to look at it whenever he's confronted with any triumph or disaster.

The modern version is a little more elaborate and tells of two brothers whose father dies and leaves them with two rings, one gold and the other silver. When they're dividing their inheritance the greedy elder brother insists on taking the gold ring and leaving the silver one to his younger sibling. The silver ring, however, proves to be the more valuable because it's inscribed with the maxim, "This too shall pass."

I don't know who composed the modern version, but if you google you'll find it on lots of New Age and self-help websites.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 4, 2017 12:10 PM

Title: Re: What realm do nagas belong to? And are there animals that live in the worlds of the devas?

Content:

The commentaries classify supaṇṇas/garuḷas/garuḍas as birds, which would place them in the animal realm. But since, like nāgas, they have the power to assume human form, I would be inclined to call them super-animals too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 4, 2017 6:31 PM

Title: Re: What realm do nagas belong to? And are there animals that live in the worlds of the devas?

Content:

Yes, you can take advantage of all four of the ways that a dog learns, but especially observational learning for encouraging Dhamma-compatible allelomimetic behaviour in the dog, and Skinnerian operant conditioning to ensure that if the dog encounters the Dhamma in a future life as a human he'll be positively disposed towards it.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dog_training#How_dogs_learn

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 6, 2017 4:39 AM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

It would be interesting to see what it was you read.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 6, 2017 5:27 AM

Title: Re: Pali name "Natthiko"

Content:

But if so, then they used the wrong word, for the 'annihilationism' here translates ucchedavāda not natthikavāda.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 6, 2017 5:50 AM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

"There is no self" is the middle view between the extreme views of "I am/have a self that is eternal" and "I am/have a self that is perishable."

Your statement is the claim of certain modern protestant Buddhists, neo-Pudgalavādins, Hindus, Theosophists, &c. Mine was the dominant orthodoxy in Buddhist India.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 6, 2017 6:32 AM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

Actually your statement is from one particular construal of the Buddha's silence in that sutta — a construal that happens to be favoured by certain modern protestant Buddhists.

Mine is from another way of construing the Buddha's silence — a way favoured by the Theravāda commentators.

.

Bodhi.jpg (349.08 KiB) Viewed 2778 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 6, 2017 8:48 PM

Title: Re: Who are the (modern) protestant Buddhists?

Content:

My usage of the term is like that of the social scientists who first coined it. A protestant Buddhist is the opposite of a traditional Buddhist. However, since people who reject or disregard traditional Buddhism, do so in different ways and to differing degrees, a classical kind of definition, framed in terms of essential features, necessary and sufficient conditions, etc., isn't going to be very serviceable here. Better would be a fuzzy definition grounded upon the notion of <http://www.philosophy-index.com/wittgenstein/family-resemblance/>.

One might, for example, draw up a list of ten or so features of traditional Buddhism that it is common for modernists, anti-clericals, secular Buddhists, etc., to reject. Those who score from 8 to 10 would definitely merit the monicker "protestant Buddhists"; those scoring 0 to 3 would definitely be traditional Buddhists; everyone in between would be a hybrid, showing tendencies in both directions, though in most cases one direction or the other is likely to be more pronounced.

Sorry, I can't write any more now as I'm occupied with the Devorohana festival and a fellow monk's funeral.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 7, 2017 5:53 PM

Title: Re: Why is the Visuddhimagga so influential, when it introduces teachings not sourced in the Pali Canon?

Content:

Thanks for the reference. I'm afraid that neither the passage as a whole nor any of the phrases that you've highlighted in it will lend any support to your pet theory about a soul in Buddhism.

The chapter from which the passage is taken is describing the commentarial understanding of what happens at the momentary abhidhammic level when a person attains stream-entry. In the commentarial understanding, stream-entry consists in the arising of a consciousness called "supramundane" (lokuttara) because it has Nibbāna as its object. But the consciousness that cognizes Nibbāna does not have any features that would make it a self or a soul. It isn't something everlasting, nor even long-lasting, but is just as ephemeral as every other kind of consciousness. And being something that arises in dependence upon conditions, the supramundane consciousness is neither a controller of anything nor under anyone's or anything's control.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 8, 2017 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Sutta help (finding certain texts)

Content:

It's in both the Dhammacetiya Sutta (MN. 89) and Mahāsakuludāyi Sutta (MN. 77).

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn77>

<http://awake.kiev.ua/dhamma/tipitaka/2Sutta-Pitaka/2Majjhima-Nikaya/Majjhima2/089-dhammacetiya-e1.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a new way

Content:

Greetings and welcome to Dhamma Wheel,

from Dhammanando and his three cats.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Evola: Dharma for Fascists

Content:

I think that at the time it was published Evola's book was probably the finest account of early Buddhism (and particularly early Buddhist asceticism) in several decades. One would probably need to go all the way back to Thomas Rhys Davids' *Buddhist India* to find a work of comparable quality.

It's also quite beautifully written, though the credit here may possibly be due to Musson/Ñāṇavīra, the translator, for Evola's other books in English read horribly and have no literary merit at all.

As for the fascism business, that's hardly an issue here. If the reader skips the last two chapters, where the author is lauding the Samurai, he'd be hard-pressed to assign any particular political bias to Evola.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 3:54 AM

Title: Re: Evola: Dharma for Fascists

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 4:32 AM

Title: Re: Sunlun Sayadaw method

Content:

Actually the interest in Ajahn Lee's approach had already been established to a certain extent during the pioneering days of the lay vipassanā movement in America. The person responsible was the veteran German monk Ven. Vimalo (now, as a layman, Vimalo Kulbarz). Although Vimalo's original training had been under Mahasi Sayadaw at Sasana Yeiktha, he later took up Ajahn Lee's practice using Thanissaro's translation of *Keeping the Breath in Mind* and was teaching it to Germans and Americans about two decades before Thanissaro himself returned to the States.

<http://imsrc.dharmaseed.org/teacher/793/talk/43211/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 8:19 AM

Title: Re: History of Buddhism

Content:

Étienne Lamotte, *Histoire du bouddhisme indien* (1958); English translation: *The History of Indian Buddhism*, (1988).

Though much of Lamotte's scholarship has now been superceded, his work is still required reading in Buddhist history courses simply because nobody has yet produced any work of comparable thoroughness and detail.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 1:21 PM

Title: Re: Sunlun Sayadaw method

Content:

See also their online books.

<https://www.samatha.org/explore-publications/texts>

Two that are worth downloading are their translation of the DN's *Lakkhaṇasutta* and *Abhidhamma Papers*.

Lance Cousins, the late co-founder of the Samatha Trust, was a great Dīgha Nikāya

enthusiast and would use the Lakkhaṇasutta's account of the Buddha's thirty-two marks (and their past life kammic causes) as the basis for a rather elaborate and visually rich form of buddhānussati. As for Abhidhamma Papers, this was a collective production based on a group study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha led by Lance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 2:07 PM

Title: Re: Any followers of Thanisarro Bhikkhu who drink?

Content:

Going for refuge to the Three Jewels, or (according to the commentaries) to any one of the Three Jewels.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 9, 2017 6:10 PM

Title: Re: Any followers of Thanisarro Bhikkhu who drink?

Content:

But maintaining outward restraint while inwardly seething with desires to do perform unwholesome acts isn't the end of the journey. It's just a way-stage on a path of progressive development. And while the risk you describe may be a real one for some people, surely it's a much lesser risk than that entailed by the abandoning of any effort at restraint.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Who are the (modern) protestant Buddhists?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 4:45 PM

Title: Re: Sunlun Sayadaw method

Content:

Thanks! I've just signed up for it. If anyone else wishes to do so there is still time. Though the link states that the course starts on 9th October, Peter Harvey in his e-mail says it's actually the 14th.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 5:42 PM
Title: Re: Palenglish fallacies
Content:
It's a bit long.

Atimānissa ekamsavibhajjapaṭipucchābyākaraṇīyapañhaṃ ṭhapanam vā mūgasūkarova
tuṇhībhanam vā vipaṭipatti.

“The fallacy that consists in a conceited person's setting aside of a question that merits either a direct answer, an analytical answer, or an answer with a counter-question, or else his remaining silent [in response to the question] like a dumb pig.”

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 6:32 PM
Title: Re: Forest Monasteries around Lampung or Chiang Mai
Content:
Regarding #2, exactly how eremitical do you want it to be? I mean do you wish to be entirely by yourself with little or no interaction with other monks? Or is it enough that you'll be alone for the greater part of the day?

As for #3, you don't really need to concern yourself with it. If it's a forest wat it will be quiet; if it's in Thailand it will be hygienic.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 7:06 PM
Title: Re: History of Buddhism
Content:
The poster's request was for an "authoritative book", not a cheap one.

On Buddhist history you don't get much more authoritative than the Belgian indologist Louis de La Vallée-Poussin and his star pupil Monsignor Lamotte — a Jesuit who mastered seven Asian languages and for four decades is reported to have spent every day but Sunday studying Buddhist texts from dawn until late into the night.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 10, 2017 10:31 PM
Title: Re: Sunlun Sayadaw method
Content:
But no such stipulation is found in the Suttas or the Visuddhimagga or in any other Theravadin source. The status of the claim in the Theravada is not that of a "traditional

understanding" but merely that of a widely held modern opinion, though not by any means a universally held one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 7:05 AM

Title: Re: relationship between a healthy body and enlightenment

Content:

I think it's an over-generalization. In the Suttas there are no arahants under the age of seven and the commentaries say that seven is in fact the minimal age for any ariyan attainment. They also say that the fifth decade of one's life is the optimal age. After that the task becomes increasingly difficult because of the decline in mental sharpness (nipuṇatā). In the first of the Vuḍḍhapabbajitasuttas, nipuṇatā is given as the first of the five qualities that are seldom found in those who go forth in old age.

As for strong health, this is essential for development of the jhānas, but not for insight development.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 7:49 AM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

I think this is a false dichotomy. The Buddha used no end of terms that were also used by brahmins and/or Jains. They are "Buddhist terms" nonetheless, for each of them was used by the Buddha in his own way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 12:55 PM

Title: Re: uposatha

Content:

All four are uposatha days for eight-precept observance, though for the monastic sangha only the full and new moons are for Pāṭimokkha recital.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 1:14 PM

Title: Re: Names of Dīgha-nikāya suttas

Content:

I don't think so. In the Nettipakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa you will find a lot of sutta passages being quoted and then classified as being an utterance of such-&-such type or serving such-&-such purpose. But neither work treats any whole suttas in

this way and very few of the quoted passages are from the Dīgha Nikāya — just 2 in the Peṭakopadesa and 4 in the Nettipakaraṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 2:55 PM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened westerners?

Content:

In your question you offered the alternatives that either "enlightened is actually a Buddhist term" or "enlightened is a term that has migrated from another Indian philosophical/religious school". But these possibilities are not mutually exclusive. It could be that the enlightenment-related terms that the Buddha frequently used (e.g., *bujjhati*, *bodhi* and *buddha*) existed before the Buddha's time but that he adopted and adapted them in his own teaching, just as he did with a great many Jain and Brahminical terms. And so the terms would then be both derivative and impeccably Buddhist.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/False_dilemma

<http://wiki.c2.com/?FalseDichotomy>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 4:49 PM

Title: Re: relationship between a healthy body and enlightenment

Content:

The "mundane concentration" referred to is the development of *samatha-bhāvanā* with the mundane *jhānas* as its aim.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 5:17 PM

Title: Re: ordaining in theravada and zen?

Content:

The rule that you cite is in the *sacittaka* class, meaning that culpability is contingent upon certain mental factors — knowledge, perception, intention, or some combination of these. It's not an *acittaka* rule where the mere act is an offence, regardless of what the *bhikkhu* knows, perceives or intends.

That being so, it's irrelevant whether Zen is actually inside or outside the *Buddhasāsanā*. If the *bhikkhu* perceives it as being inside, then he cannot be said to have the intention of ordaining outside.

That's not to say that the act wouldn't be blameworthy on other grounds; just not under the terms of this particular rule.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 5:35 PM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

I remember Christmas Humphreys, the British Buddhist popularizer, would often tell the story of Epictetus's equanimity when his sadistic master was torturing him by squeezing his leg in a vice.

"If you tighten the vice any more, my leg will break," said Epictetus.

The master gleefully went on tightening it. There was a sharp crack.

"There," said Epictetus, "I told you that my leg would break."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 13, 2017 10:36 PM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 12:04 AM

Title: Re: Prompted/unprompted cittas in the suttanta

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Names of Dīgha-nikāya suttas

Content:

I'm afraid I have no opinion at all. Moreover, it sounds as if you have already gone into this matter much more deeply than I ever have (or am ever likely to), and so even if I did have an opinion, telling it to you would be rather as if "a needle-seller would think he could sell a needle to a needle-maker," to quote <https://suttacentral.net/en/sn16.10>.

Having said that, if I ever did feel an uncontrollable urge to have an opinion on this, I think I should probably concur with Sāmaṇera Bodhesako that the Dīghabhāṇakas likely started out as bhikkhus who happened to live in close proximity to villages and were

much more occupied than the other groups of bhāṇakas in preaching to householders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 8:22 AM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

The Cynics were passable enough, I suppose, if one's taste runs to pratyekabuddhas. Still, they never produced anyone comparable to that trio of mensches: Cato the Younger, Musonius Rufus and Epictetus.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 11:11 AM

Title: Re: uposatha

Content:

The lay observance is in the Cātumahārāja Sutta; the monastic one somewhere in the Vinaya's Khandhakas.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an3.37>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 4:08 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma: Is an abortion killing a living being?

Content:

No. In regard to pregnancy, the first precept has solely to do with not killing a human that has been conceived. But conceiving a child in the first place is not treated even as a desideratum, let alone an obligation in the Buddha's teaching.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 4:24 PM

Title: Re: cheerios commercial

Content:

The Lone Ranger doesn't seem especially annoying. If you want to see how annoying a cowboy commercial can be, try searching youtube for the "Milky Bar Kid".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 14, 2017 4:50 PM

Title: Re: Stoicism and Buddhism

Content:

Well, anybody can afford it. If you have a Stoic outlook on life, then not "doing relatively well in the material sense" is treated merely as an *aproêgmena* (dispreferred indifferent), not as an evil. It's not an evil because its power to impede *aretê* and *eudaimôn* is not absolute and in the case of the Stoic sage has been wholly eradicated.

As to whether one can manage to have it, I think probably not (at least not via Stoic methods) given the Stoic writers' admissions of personal failure that I mentioned in an earlier post. Nonetheless, even attempting it and falling short led to some pretty class acts on the part of the more virtuous Romans.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 21, 2017 6:58 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist quote reference

Content:

1. Yena yena hi maññanti tato taṃ hoti aññathā.

“For in whatever way they conceive, the fact is ever other than that.”

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.113.than.html>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/ud3.10>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/snp3.8>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/snp3.12>

2. Yañhi bhikkhave maññati, yasmim maññati, yato maññati, yaṃ meti maññati, tato taṃ hoti aññathā.

“For, bhikkhus, whatever one conceives, whatever one conceives in, whatever one conceives from, whatever one conceives as ‘mine’—that is otherwise.”

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn35.31>

<https://suttacentral.net/en/sn35.91>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 21, 2017 7:56 AM

Title: Re: Better to kill oneself than to marry a "hideous widow": Thoughts on Nanavira's suicide

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 21, 2017 8:53 AM
Title: Re: About 'Hatha Yoga' by Yogi Ramacharaka
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 21, 2017 9:01 AM
Title: Re: SN 16.10 Bhikkhunūpassaya Sutta. The Bhikkhunīs' Quarters.
Content:
Ven. Mahākassapa was ordained first.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 21, 2017 10:40 AM
Title: Re: Buddhist quote reference
Content:
The difference is that some translators render *hoti* as 'is' and others as 'becomes'.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 22, 2017 2:59 PM
Title: Re: Original Pali Reference of the Eight Great Merits Stanza
Content:
I've never heard of this before and suspect it may be some regional composition. The terms *aṭṭha puññāni*, *aṭṭhapuññaṃ* and *puññāni aṭṭha* don't appear in any text on the CSCD. The closest I can find is the *aṭṭha puññābhisandā* of AN.iv.245, but the eight items are completely different.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an8.39>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 22, 2017 7:22 PM
Title: Re: Story about Deerghayu or similar name
Content:
The full story in the Dhammapada Atthakathā can be read here:

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/08-08.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 22, 2017 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Mahaparinibbana sutta - Pukkusa's golden robes

Content:

Siṅgivaṇṇaṃ means gold-coloured.

Actually the siṅgī part can also mean ginger, but here the commentary defines it as gold (suvaṇṇa).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 22, 2017 11:13 PM

Title: Re: Original Pali Reference of the Eight Great Merits Stanza

Content:

The Sinhala Wikipedia gives the Mahāvaṃsa as the source, but I can't find it. Although each of the eight is individually mentioned in the Mahāvaṃsa as having been performed by this or that king, they are never grouped together under the heading of aṭṭha mahākusala, nor under any other heading. Perhaps some commentator on the Mahāvaṃsa decided to group them so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 23, 2017 6:50 AM

Title: Re: Original Pali Reference of the Eight Great Merits Stanza

Content:

The best online edition of the Pali text of the Mahāvaṃsa is the one at the GRETIL site:

http://gretil.sub.uni-goettingen.de/gretil/2_pali/3_chron/mahava_u.htm

I can't paste the relevant passages, however, because I have no idea which occurrence of each of the key terms was the one that the composer of the Eight Great Merits Stanza had in mind. The offering of kaṭhina robes, for example, is mentioned in no fewer than twelve gāthās.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 23, 2017 1:42 PM

Title: Re: Debt to ones parents

Content:

The important part is the part in bold type, which astonishingly has gone quite unremarked in this thread.

I once wrote about it <https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=23072#p330745>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 23, 2017 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Debt to ones parents

Content:

I take this sutta to be a rhetorically elaborate and ingenious encomium to the four qualities of dāna, sīla, saddhā and paññā. I don't believe that it was ever intended as a prescription regarding our duties to our parents. I think those who read it the latter way (e.g., everybody in this thread!) are making the very same mistake that Tibetan lamas make (though without the lamas' excuse that they've only got the first half of the sutta available to them).

If one were to compare the Samacitta Sutta with other discourses in the Canon, it would not be with those like the Sigalaka Sutta, which do indeed give prescriptions regarding domestic obligations. Rather, it would be with a discourse like the Itivuttaka's Dāna Sutta, where the Buddha says that if a person knew the benefit of generosity as well as he does, he wouldn't eat even a single meal without inviting someone to come and share it. In saying this the Buddha is rhetorically (and perhaps hyperbolically) impressing upon his listeners the value of dāna. He is not laying down the prescription: "My disciples should not eat solitary meals. Before sitting down to eat they should always look around for somebody with whom to share it."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 23, 2017 7:16 PM

Title: Re: What is it about Hollywood?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 23, 2017 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Debt to ones parents

Content:

Note that the Samacitta Sutta does not ascribe the debt to the fact that a child's parents conceived him and his mother then carried him to term. It ascribes it only to actions performed by the parents for the child's sake after he was born. That being so, I believe the sutta is most reasonably read as describing what is typically the case, rather than what is invariably so. In that case, there wouldn't be a debt of gratitude towards parents who had neglected to "care for the child, nourish him, and introduce him to the world."

Note also that in the Sigalovāda Sutta the child's first filial duty is phrased: 'I will support them who supported me,' which might be taken as suggesting that the child's obligation

is contingent upon his parents' having fulfilled theirs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 12:50 AM

Title: Re: This precious human birth?

Content:

Replacing the Mahāyānic "precious" with the correct phrase, "difficult to obtain", I would make the following observations:

1. It isn't just the human state, but a whole bunch of things that are described as "difficult to obtain". For example, the appearance of a Buddha, an occasion for listening to the Dhamma, the opportunity to go forth into the homeless life, etc.
2. The point of all the teachings that speak of such-and-such being hard to obtain is to counter any tendency to complacency. That being so...
3. If one feels skeptical about the claim that a human birth is something hard to obtain, one can always focus on something else that is incontestably hard to obtain, such as the sight of a Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 10:48 AM

Title: Re: jhānaṃ why not jhāne

Content:

Where did you find this? The normal expression is [paṭhamam ... dutiyam, etc.] jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati — "Having entered [the first second, etc.] absorption, he abides [in it]."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 1:12 PM

Title: Re: This precious human birth?

Content:

I can't say for sure. Perhaps you haven't yet embraced the Buddhist world view. Or perhaps you have but it's not yet very visceral or hasn't yet become the lens through which you habitually see things.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 5:05 PM

Title: Re: jhānaṃ why not jhāne

Content:

I don't think it makes any sense. Abiding in jhāna, with jhāna in the accusative, is

normally expressed in the way I described in my earlier post.

The locative *jhāne* is most commonly used when one wants to describe the mental factors that are present in *jhāna*. I've never seen it used with *viharati*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 5:19 PM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

The ordination would still be valid under Vinaya, but there may be consequences for the *bhikkhu* under secular law. For example, in Thailand if a debtor ordains as a *bhikkhu* (or goes into debt after ordaining) and then his creditors come chasing after him, if he can't or won't pay them, then under one of the Sangha Acts he would be forced to disrobe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 24, 2017 7:21 PM

Title: Re: *jhānaṃ* why not *jhāne*

Content:

The word was *jhānaṃ*, which can only be nominative or accusative singular. The dative plural would be *jhānānaṃ*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 25, 2017 6:01 PM

Title: Re: How and where to ordain?

Content:

Though there are a number of drawbacks to ordaining in the West, getting fed isn't usually one of them. The main problem in my view is that of over-exposure: as a *bhikkhu* in the West you're in effect something of a public figure right from day one, and at a stage in your training when you should really be as anonymous, withdrawn and low-key as possible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 1:17 AM

Title: Re: Is this a proper test for solipsism ?

Content:

Since it seems you are only allowing "yes", "no" or "don't know" as admissible answers, clearly the test is useless. All three of these answers will show that the person is not a solipsist:

"Yes" = My family do exist now and will continue to exist after I die.

"No" = My family do exist now but will cease to exist after I die.

"Don't know" = "My family do exist now, but I don't know whether they will continue to exist after I die.

Might we then say that a solipsist is anyone who declines to give one of these three answers?

Unfortunately no, for there are

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=16&t=30460#p442223> for rejecting the question than solipsistic ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 7:48 AM

Title: Re: lu Mien Buddhism - what tradition does it resemble?

Content:

It seems to be just regular mainland East Asian Mahayana. lu Mien is not the name of a Buddhist tradition but rather of the Sino-Vietnamese ethnic group that founded the temple. In Thailand they're called Yao.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/lu_Mien_Americans

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 8:20 AM

Title: Re: Is this a proper test for solipsism ?

Content:

The question of whether Ñāṇavīra and Ñāṇānanda are reading the Kaccāna Sutta correctly is logically distinct from the question of whether their reading of it would entail solipsism. It seems to me that only the second question is really relevant to the current topic, namely, whether your proposed test for ferreting out solipsists is a sound one.

Is there any particular post in your link (or anywhere else) where you think that you've demonstrated beyond doubt that solipsism is a necessary consequence of their reading of this sutta?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 11:02 AM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

In Thailand foreign monks have to apply for a visa extension once a year. The application requires a sponsorship letter from one's abbot, and a form signed by the abbot, the head monk of the district and the head monk of the province. It's usually fairly routine

though once in a while you might run into an awkward monk who doesn't want to sign the form or who imposes some extra bureaucratic conditions of his own, like demanding that you provide him with letters of approval from the head monk of the sub-district or the village headman or the sheriff of the local police. Monks are also required to report to the immigration police once every three months.

At the age of fifty you'll be eligible to apply for a retirement visa which is permanent, though you'll still need to report to the immigration police regularly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 1:35 PM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

No, you have to have some high-ranking Thai monks who are willing to back your application. But if it ever became public knowledge that a foreign monk was being sued by a creditor, then he would have a hard time finding anyone willing to back him. And if the plaintiff's case seemed strong enough for a court to accept it, then the monk would be required to disrobe even before the case was heard. The Thais don't want to see monks appearing as respondents or defendants in a court room.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 4:34 PM

Title: Re: Regarding paying off ALL of ones debts first.

Content:

I didn't say that it necessarily would. I was just describing what would happen in Thailand if it did.

In general I think that it would amount to a pretty bad start in monastic life if one ordained in the full knowledge that one had debts of a kind that one could be sued for. As for student debts of the kind where repayment is only required when one is engaged in paid employment and where there is no requirement to pay if one is not earning, these seem to be something of a grey area. As far as I know debts of this kind didn't have any counterpart in the Buddha's time. I think in Thailand most abbots probably would accept a man in this state, but whether it would be agreeable to the man's own conscience is another story.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 26, 2017 10:06 PM

Title: Re: AN 3.10 Mala Sutta. Stains.

Content:

Many other examples are given of things that may look like macchhariya but are not.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Oct 27, 2017 1:12 PM
Title: Re: Looking for a sutta/verse
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 29, 2017 10:50 PM
Title: Re: Victims of Communism
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 29, 2017 11:26 PM
Title: Re: Is this a proper test for solipsism ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 30, 2017 12:11 AM
Title: Re: Ven. Dhammanando Appreciation Thread
Content:
Najlepša hvala.

Thanks everyone.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Oct 31, 2017 2:14 PM
Title: Re: Sam Harris and Robert Wright
Content:

It's probably too soon for there to be an edited transcript, but this link will allow you to download auto-generated subtitles from the youtube version.

<http://downsub.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.youtube.com%2Fwatch%3Fv%3Di9SGs89x8lY>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 1, 2017 1:18 PM

Title: Re: Animals Reborn In Heaven?

Content:

His opinion is merely that such a rebirth would not be due to karmas performed as an animal but rather to unripened karmas performed in former human lives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 1, 2017 7:01 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha and sleep

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 1, 2017 10:58 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha and sleep

Content:

I don't know if the texts ever state that they were of equal length, but the Vibhaṅga commentary states that the middle watch is one sixth of the day and night, which would make it a four-hour period. In Thailand, since daylight and darkness are roughly twelve hours each throughout the year, the middle watch is taken to be what I stated. In Bihar and Uttar Pradesh I suppose that the time when the middle watch begins would be subject to some seasonal variation, though its duration would still be four hours.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 2, 2017 11:54 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha and sleep

Content:

No. In fact it wouldn't transgress any Vinaya rule at all. The offence would be against the Dhamma principle of devotion to wakefulness (jāgariyānuyoga).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 2, 2017 12:35 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha and sleep

Content:

I suppose the wording would allow such a reading, though this isn't how it's usually

understood.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 3, 2017 3:10 AM
Title: Re: Happy Birthday Retro!!!
Content:
Happy birthday!

.

Pepe.jpg (183.12 KiB) Viewed 1917 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Nov 4, 2017 6:15 AM
Title: Re: sutta reading
Content:
Frank hasn't logged in here since August, but he's at Sutta Central nearly every day.

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/u/frankk/summary>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Nov 5, 2017 1:16 PM
Title: Re: False admonishment?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Nov 5, 2017 4:03 PM
Title: Re: False admonishment?
Content:

One could deny the admonisher leave to speak on account of, say, his ineptness or ignorance. If he doesn't accept that he's inept or ignorant and believes that his case is sound, then he would be obliged to pursue it by calling a meeting of the sangha, where hopefully wiser heads would prevail.

In the unlikely event that an entire monastery consisted of Dhammic anosognosiacs,

the Vinaya wouldn't be of much help, but nor would anything else. In practice, however, I should imagine such a monastery would quickly acquire a certain notoriety and prudent bhikkhus would simply stay away from it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 6, 2017 8:36 AM

Title: Re: The arising of the four paths endures for only one mind-moment

Content:

Ābhidhammikas accept that there are eight kinds of individuals, but maintain that since path-attainment is followed immediately by fruition-attainment, four of the eight individuals don't last for very long.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 6, 2017 7:48 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

I think you're oversimplifying. There are some Buddhist moral precepts that are wholly independent of what any worldly law might decree (e.g., the first, fourth and fifth); there are others that are not. The second precept is of the latter sort. Although it cannot be equated with worldly law, nor can it be wholly separated from it, for the key term "what is not-given" (*adinnaṃ*) is (in part) to be understood with reference to what the laws of the land decree as counting as property.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 7, 2017 1:34 AM

Title: Re: 8 conditions for samma-sam-buddha

Content:

The prior development of the ten perfections for many aeons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 7, 2017 11:07 AM

Title: Re: 8 conditions for samma-sam-buddha

Content:

No. A person might have attained the *jhānas*, *vimokkhas* and mundane *abhiññās*, yet not have sufficient *paramī* for arahantship when he encounters a Buddha. Or he might have sufficient *paramī* for arahantship but lack the aforesaid accomplishments. To be eligible for a Buddha's prediction of *sammāsambodhi* he needs to have both.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 7, 2017 6:22 PM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

If something is *dinnam*, "given", it means either (1) nobody owns it or (2) Smith, the person who owns it, chooses to give it to Jones without any coercion or deception on Jones's part. If Smith doesn't choose to do so, then it's *adinnam*, "not given", and therefore an improper thing for Jones to take.

Where secular law comes into play is with regard to defining what counts as "owned" and "ownerless". This will vary from one society to another and one age to another, but whatever it happens to be when and where one is living must be accepted. For example, in the Buddha's time it was the custom for rag-robe-wearing bhikkhus to go into charnel grounds, remove the winding sheets from corpses and sew them into robes for themselves. This was a permitted practice because the laws of that time regarded the cloth on a corpse as ownerless. But as far as I know this is not generally the case today, and so if a bhikkhu went into a modern city morgue or funeral parlour, unwrapped the cloths from some corpses and then carried them away to use as robe-material, he would be taking what is *adinnam* because such cloth is nowadays deemed to have an owner.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 8, 2017 4:01 AM

Title: Re: Does illegal downloading violate the 2nd precept?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 9, 2017 5:46 AM

Title: Re: Animal Rebirth

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 9, 2017 8:24 AM

Title: Re: Why did Buddha passed away in fourth Jhana?

Content:

If the *sayādaw*'s right, then realizing *Parinibbāna* after emerging from only the second *jhāna* would not be dwelling in the "bliss of the absorptions to the full". It would be like a

traveller departing after embracing and kissing only his sisters and his cousins and his aunts, but forgetting his parents and children.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 10, 2017 11:31 AM

Title: Re: The arising of the four paths endures for only one mind-moment

Content:

While locomotion on a cycle-path takes no steps at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 10, 2017 12:34 PM

Title: Re: The arising of the four paths endures for only one mind-moment

Content:

You are still mistaking the inessential for the essential. What makes a path a path is that it leads from one thing to another. It may be short in distance or it may be long, or in some cases it may be a path of such a kind that any talk of distance would be a category mistake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 12, 2017 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi on the errors of modern mindfulness

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 12, 2017 5:09 PM

Title: Re: not pooping everyday

Content:

Uppalavanna is not a very competent translator. The verb *asuci muccati* means to have a nocturnal emission, not to strew excreta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 12, 2017 5:19 PM

Title: Re: Bikkhu Bodhi on the errors of modern mindfulness

Content:

Spiny spoke of "suttas [in which] there is the idea of turning away from the conditioned, and towards the unconditioned." The sutta I cited is certainly an example of this. In this

case it happens to be first jhāna that is the conditioned thing that one turns away from. In other suttas the phrase is used in connection with other things that one turns away from, having come to realize their coarseness in comparison to the unconditioned.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 12, 2017 5:42 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 12, 2017 5:50 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Shame (hiri) is what restrains one from unwholesome acts by way of self-regard. Lack of shame (ahiri) is its opposite.

"Lack of remorse" is just a bad translation. Ottappa is moral caution or regard for consequences. It's what restrains one from unwholesome acts either by consideration of how they will be viewed by others or out of regard for their undesirable consequences. Anottappa is its opposite: moral recklessness or disregard for consequences.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 13, 2017 3:40 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 14, 2017 12:42 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

The translation is I.B. Horner's.

On Sutta Central if someone posts a link to an English translation, like this:

<https://suttacentral.net/en/mn61>

you can find out who the translator is by removing the "en" from the url:

<https://suttacentral.net/mn61>

which will take you to a page where all the site's available translations of the sutta are listed and the translators identified.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 14, 2017 4:00 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 15, 2017 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Can old PDFs be converted into functional eBook formats?

Content:

The <https://calibre-ebook.com/> program is great for most ebook format conversions, but those involving pdf files are an exception — though the program can do it, the results are highly unsatisfactory, as the program makers themselves admit.

What I normally do is to convert the pdf to an html file with Acrobat Pro. I then open the html file with Nisus Writer, format it in my preferred way and save it as an epub. Finally I use Calibre to convert the epub to a mobi file for my Kindle.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 15, 2017 5:25 PM

Title: Re: New Analyo Bhikkhu Book to be Released

Content:

The adverb just would imply "a populist Dharma teacher and nothing more." Do you seriously think that this is the venerable's intention?

Personally I think: "... regularly supplementing his scholarly expositions of the Dhamma with more popular ones," would be both a more charitable way of putting it and probably closer to the truth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 15, 2017 6:07 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

I don't know of anything better than "moral shame" for hiri, while for ottappa I'm torn

between "moral caution" and "regard for consequences".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 15, 2017 6:38 PM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

I think it's fearfulness of his anger.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 15, 2017 10:20 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

This might be the case on some other planet, but on ours the next uposatha is the new moon day on the 18th.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 12:21 AM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Assuming that they are good standards, hiri and ottappa are the two mental factors that ensure that you do live up to them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 2:00 AM

Title: Re: New Analyo Bhikkhu Book to be Released

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 8:42 AM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Bhagavaṃ mūlakā no dhammā, Bhagavaṃ nettikā, Bhagavaṃ paṭisaraṇā.

“Our teachings are rooted in the Blessed One, guided by the Blessed One, take recourse in the Blessed One.”

Goes without saying, eh?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 10:00 AM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 11:21 AM

Title: Re: AN 10.76: What do shame, remorse, and negligence refer to?

Content:

Besides being "guardians of the world", hiri and ottappa also make up two of the <https://tinyurl.com/yb48pfbt> (bala) upon which the eight path factors depend. For example, without them there would be no possibility of right speech, right action and right livelihood for there would be nothing to predispose one against their contraries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 3:17 PM

Title: Re: personal attack vs ad hominem

Content:

As the TOS phrase is "ad hominem attack" and not "ad hominem argument", I should have thought it obvious that the proscribed behaviour was bad manners and not bad reasoning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 6:08 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha and sleep

Content:

No idea. If there is, maybe it would like apartment 306, where lying down is enforced 24/7.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 16, 2017 8:33 PM

Title: Re: A woman reporting a monk?

Content:

So if a monk teaches a woman, speaking more than the permitted number of sentences and without another male present, then clearly he breaks the above rule.

As to whether a woman has any recourse when a monk breaks it, in theory she does, under the second of the two
http://www.chinabuddhismencyclopedia.com/en/index.php/Buddhist_Monastic_Code_I:_Chapter_6_Aniyata_by_Thanissaro_Bhikkhu rules. Whether this will mean much in practice will depend on how seriously Vinaya is taken in the tradition the monk belongs to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 17, 2017 12:15 AM

Title: Re: A woman reporting a monk?

Content:

I don't know. Almost certainly there'll be differences of opinion among Vinaya scholars. If it hasn't already started, I expect sooner or later there'll be committees of Vinaya scholars holding meetings to discuss how such and such Vinaya rule is to be applied in online interactions. Maybe after some months or some years rulings will be issued.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 17, 2017 8:27 AM

Title: Re: Using Iddhi for Personal Gain

Content:

Not in the Pali suttas. There is, however, a German translation of a Tibetan gterma called *Die Große Rumpelstilzchen Sūtra*. It was discovered in the mid-19th century by a pair of Hessian tertöns called the Brothers Grimm and reveals a secret technique for converting straw into gold. Unfortunately using it carries the unwelcome obligation of having to give away one's first-born child to an evil dwarf.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 17, 2017 10:19 AM

Title: Re: List of rules for monks relevant for lay women

Content:

Below is a list of all of the rules in the *Pāṭimokkha* (though not all of the rules in the whole of the Vinaya) that are in some way connected with women. I've omitted those that concern only *bhikkhunīs*, female wanderers or queens.

Pārājika: Rules entailing expulsion from the Sangha (Defeat)

1. Should any *bhikkhu* — participating in the training and livelihood of the *bhikkhus*, without having renounced the training, without having declared his weakness — engage in sexual intercourse, even with a female animal, he is defeated and no longer in affiliation.

3. Should any bhikkhu intentionally deprive a human being of life, or search for an assassin for him, or praise the advantages of death, or incite him to die (saying,): "My good man, what use is this evil, miserable life to you? Death would be better for you than life," or with such an idea in mind, such a purpose in mind, should in various ways praise the advantages of death or incite him to die, he also is defeated and no longer in affiliation.

[The Vinaya's extended treatment of this rule includes a prohibition against performing abortions or advising a woman to have one]

Saṅghādisesa: Rules entailing an initial and subsequent meeting of the Sangha

2. Should any bhikkhu, overcome by lust, with altered mind, engage in bodily contact with a woman, or in holding her hand, holding a lock of her hair, or caressing any of her limbs, it entails initial and subsequent meetings of the Community.

3. Should any bhikkhu, overcome by lust, with altered mind, address lewd words to a woman in the manner of young men to a young woman alluding to sexual intercourse, it entails initial and subsequent meetings of the Community.

4. Should any bhikkhu, overcome by lust, with altered mind, speak in the presence of a woman in praise of ministering to his own sensuality thus: "This, sister, is the foremost ministration, that of ministering to a virtuous, fine-natured follower of the celibate life such as myself with this act" — alluding to sexual intercourse — it entails initial and subsequent meetings of the Community.

5. Should any bhikkhu engage in conveying a man's intentions to a woman or a woman's intentions to a man, proposing marriage or paramourage — even if only for a momentary liaison — it entails initial and subsequent meetings of the Community.

Aniyata: Indefinite rules

1. Should any bhikkhu sit in private, alone with a woman on a seat secluded enough to lend itself (to sexual intercourse), so that a female lay follower whose word can be trusted, having seen (them), might describe it as constituting any of three cases — entailing defeat, communal meetings, or confession — then the bhikkhu, acknowledging having sat (there), may be dealt with in line with any of the three cases — entailing defeat, communal meetings, or confession — or he may be dealt with for whichever case the female lay follower whose word can be trusted described. This case is indefinite.

2. In case a seat is not sufficiently secluded to lend itself (to sexual intercourse) but sufficiently so to address lewd words to a woman, should any bhikkhu sit in private, alone with a woman on such a seat, so that a female lay follower whose word can be trusted, having seen (them), might describe it as constituting either of two cases — entailing communal meetings or confession — then the bhikkhu, acknowledging having sat (there), may be dealt with in line with either of the two cases — entailing communal

meetings or confession — or he is to be dealt with in line with whichever case the female lay follower whose word can be trusted described. This case too is indefinite.

Pācittiya: Rules entailing confession

6. Should any bhikkhu lie down together (in the same dwelling) with a woman, it is to be confessed.

7. Should any bhikkhu teach more than five or six sentences of Dhamma to a woman, unless a knowledgeable man is present, it is to be confessed.

44. Should any bhikkhu sit in private on a secluded seat with a woman, it is to be confessed.

45. Should any bhikkhu sit in private, alone with a woman, it is to be confessed.

67. Should any bhikkhu, by arrangement, travel together with a woman, even for the interval between one village and the next, it is to be confessed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 17, 2017 10:38 AM

Title: Re: Who can ordain a Samaneri?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 19, 2017 1:44 PM

Title: Re: Master of mindfulness, Jon Kabat-Zinn

Content:

It seems an awful long way from bhāvanā on the banks of the Nerañjarā to fusion cuisine dining in Nantucket. I'm not sure if this is quite what the Buddha had in mind when he said that "satipaṭṭhāna is helpful everywhere."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 19, 2017 1:51 PM

Title: Re: Are there any account of Sotapanna was reborn as a human while Buddha alive?

Content:

In every reported case, canonical and commentarial, they were reborn as devas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Nov 19, 2017 3:57 PM
Title: Re: Master of mindfulness, Jon Kabat-Zinn
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 20, 2017 12:52 PM
Title: Re: Right Speech: Getting Personal
Content:

... coupled with an obstinate persistence in this error even after multiple clarifications and corrections had been patiently presented to you.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 20, 2017 1:04 PM
Title: Re: Feeding on rapture
Content:

"Feeding on rapture" pītibhakkha by itself is also found in three of the Dīgha Nikāya suttas: the Brahmajāla, Pāthika, and Aggañña.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 20, 2017 10:13 PM
Title: Re: Right Speech: Getting Personal
Content:

"Obstinate" is qualifying "persistence", by which I meant a course of behaviour, not a state of mind.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 20, 2017 10:41 PM
Title: Re: Master of mindfulness, Jon Kabat-Zinn
Content:

I don't think that and I haven't implied that.

I regard religious affiliation as a matter of self-definition and would never presume to tell a self-described Buddhist that she isn't one. If she happens to like Kabat-Zinn's books then I'd regard her as a Buddhist with lousy literary taste, not a non-Buddhist. I would just hope that she would sooner or later move on to more reliable sources of Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 22, 2017 12:40 PM

Title: Re: The path of the Bodhisattva in Theravada Buddhism

Content:

I don't think it's really precise enough, for it would apply equally to a Sammāsambuddha and a Paccekabuddha. It would also apply to the last remaining arahant disciple of a Buddha after all the others have passed away.

What distinguishes a Sammāsambuddha is his rediscovery of the Dhamma in an age when it has been lost and his founding of a dispensation (sāsana) to preserve and transmit it. A Paccekabuddha also rediscovers the Dhamma but does not found a sāsana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 22, 2017 10:55 PM

Title: Re: The path of the Bodhisattva in Theravada Buddhism

Content:

In the commentarial treatment of the Sammāsambuddha, Paccekabuddha and Arahant, there are differences regarding the length of time that they have to develop the perfections, how many of the ten Tathāgata powers they can possess, how far back they can see their former lives, etc, etc. But the essential difference between the first and second is whether or not they start a dispensation, while that between both of these and the third is whether bodhi was attained by personal discovery or by being taught.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 23, 2017 2:44 PM

Title: Re: Alternative Forms of Vipassana

Content:

Jack Kornfield's Living Buddhist Masters is available from archive.org, https://archive.org/details/bub_gb_8lnEkEp5FtEC.

The relevant chapters for dry insight are those on all of the sayādaws in the book, plus U Ba Khin and Ajahn Naeb.

Other resources for the Bhaddanta U Vilāsa / Ajahn Naeb method:

Frank Tullius, <http://www.vipassanadhura.com/PDF/vipassanabhavana.pdf>

James Baraz, <http://www.dharmaseed.org/teacher/86/talk/2571/>

Ajahn Naeb,

https://web.archive.org/web/20081015140307/http://www.roundfree.org:80/roundfree_achannaeb.htm

Ajahn Prani Samreungrat

./download/file.php?id=3828
(404.01 KiB) Downloaded 119 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Master of mindfulness, Jon Kabat-Zinn

Content:

Rāhula was only seven and newly ordained, so the Buddha gave him an exhortation on sīla. It's in the Cūḷarāhulovāda Sutta that he is given an insight-related discourse that leads him to arahatta.

<http://www.wisdompubs.org/book/middle-length-discourses-buddha/selections/middle-length-discourses-147-cularahulovada-sutta>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 4:45 AM

Title: Re: How do you use the quote button in DW?

Content:

The function doesn't exist.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 4:59 AM

Title: Re: Are Vipassana Nanas silly?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 3:09 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

Between the calendars of Thailand, Sri Lanka and Myanmar, and between those of the Mahānikāya and Dhammayuttika Nikāya within Thailand, it's not uncommon for there to be a one-day difference in the calculation of uposatha days. I don't think there is ever a 2-day difference.

According to the Thai Mahānikāya calendar the eighth day of the waxing moon will be on 26th November.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 3:22 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

And it appears to be on this date in all the other calendars too. You can compare them here:

<https://dharma-records.buddhasasana.net/texts/uposatha-calendars-2017>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 6:18 PM

Title: Re: The case against coffee (important)

Content:

Over the years I've experimented with virtually every coffee-making device, with the exception of the cezve (as I don't much like Turkish coffee) and the vacuum coffee-maker (which I only recently learned about). Still, despite the insistence of some of my Thai colleagues that nothing beats coffee filtered through an old bowl-wiping cloth...

.

cloth.jpg (145.79 KiB) Viewed 5752 times

.

I always revert in the end to my good old moka:

.

moka.jpg (83.77 KiB) Viewed 5752 times

.

While for grinding the beans I use this nice manual grinder from Vietnam. From time to time people offer me electrical grinders, but I decline their offers as I've never known one whose friction didn't burn the beans at least slightly.

.

grinder.jpg (48.32 KiB) Viewed 5752 times

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 24, 2017 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

The calendars show only the full moon and new moon uposathas. The other uposathas always fall on the eighth day after each of these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 12:39 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism and Islam in Asia: A Long and Complicated History

Content:

India's Mughal rulers were broadly divided between (1) religiously zealous Muslims who wanted to forcibly convert the infidels and exterminate the recalcitrant, and (2) avaricious Muslims who preferred not to convert the infidels but to let them remain in their unbelief so that they could be fleeced via the jizya tax. Hinduism survived largely because the venal rulers happened to outnumber the pious ones and because large numbers of Hindus chose to pay jizya rather than convert. The enforcement of these tributary payments lasted from the 11th to the 19th century, with occasional interruptions, notably under the (relatively) enlightened rule of Akbar.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jizya#India>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 1:33 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

Yes. Two great uposathas, when monks hold a Pāṭimokkha recitation, and two lesser uposathas on the eighth days of the waxing and waning moons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 5:07 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

Yes, some people do it like that. Others, as Mike mentioned, will prefer to follow the calendar of the particular tradition that they're affiliated with. For example, the Dhammayutt calendar if they're involved with Wat Metta or some other Dhammayutt wat, the Mahānikāya calendar if they're involved with an Ajahn Chah monastery, the Burmese calendar if it's a Burmese vihāra, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 5:27 PM

Title: Re: Who is Mara?

Content:

Opaṭṭika has both a narrow and a broad sense. In its narrow sense it means beings born apparitionally, such as devas, pretas and hell beings. In its broad sense it is connected with the upapāta part of cutūpapāta(-ñāṇa), "(knowledge of) the passing away and reappearance of beings". In other words, it refers to any being who has been reborn.

In the commentaries opaṭṭika in the context of mundane right view is understood as being used in the broad sense. And so according to this understanding, the proper translation will not be, "There are apparitionally generated beings", but rather, "There are beings who reappear/get reborn." Mundane right view here is belief in rebirth, not belief in devas, māras, brahmās, petas, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 7:04 PM

Title: Re: Master of mindfulness, Jon Kabat-Zinn

Content:

The Buddha's policy seems to have been to give whatever kind of teaching would conduce to the highest good that his listeners were capable of. In this case, apparently, it was conversion to the Dhamma, not penetration of the Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 25, 2017 8:39 PM

Title: Re: What is it about Hollywood?

Content:

Well, one can always read Hamlet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 26, 2017 12:28 AM

Title: Re: AN 7.72 [AN 7.68] Aggikkhandhopama Sutta. The Mass of Fire Comparison.

Content:

It's just a stock description of a very bad bhikkhu. In the Āsamsasutta a bhikkhu of this description is called "without hope", as contrasted with the bhikkhu "with hope" and the bhikkhu "beyond hope".

Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation, using "one without expectation", "one full of expectation", and "one who has overcome expectation," ...

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an3.13>

And Nyanatiloka's German rendering of a parallel passage in the Puggalapaññatti, using „hoffnungslos“, „hoffnungsvoll“ and „hoffnungsgestillt“ ...

<https://suttacentral.net/de/pp2.3>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 26, 2017 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Right Speech: Virtue Signaling

Content:

MRDA is a response that could use a bit of clarification when addressed to someone who doesn't know what "All animals are equal..." means. I mean it could easily be mistaken as referring to the heteronymous Serbian footballer, Dragan Mrđa. And if it was, it would be all your fault!

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/MRDA_%28slang%29

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 27, 2017 7:43 AM

Title: Re: Theravada Buddhism and Trans Folk

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 27, 2017 4:21 PM

Title: Re: Theravada Buddhism and Trans Folk

Content:

It is common for miscellaneous Vinaya rules to be inserted in places where they have only a tangential connection with the general context. I would suppose this to have been a decision based on the mnemonic consideration that even a tangential connection is better than no connection at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 27, 2017 6:03 PM

Title: Re: Theravada Buddhism and Trans Folk

Content:

Not according to the Vinaya commentary on the quoted passages, which attributes the changes to kamma and says that they occurred overnight while the bhikkhu and bhikkhuni were sleeping. There are a few other sex-change stories in the commentaries (I can't locate them now) and in every case the change is represented as an unplanned (and unwelcome) one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 28, 2017 10:00 AM

Title: Re: Animal Rebirth

Content:

In Dhammapada 37 a citta is said to be "singly-occurring". From this it follows that a mental continuum cannot throw out branches. One citta is followed by another citta, not by two simultaneously arising cittas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 28, 2017 10:26 AM

Title: Re: Monastic use of cosmetics

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 28, 2017 10:36 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

A friend posted this on her Facebook page. The Thai caption, wan phra yai, is a pun. Normally it would mean the "great/major uposatha day", but in the present context its other possible meaning seems more fitting: "the day of the big monk".

.

wanphrayai.jpg (36.56 KiB) Viewed 5665 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 2:08 PM

Title: Re: Pleiades, Elves & BuddhaDharma

Content:

Elves!? Who says elves know how to cut well?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 4:08 PM

Title: Re: Contemporary threats to free speech

Content:

I think the most recent report on how American opinion is divided on these questions is last month's publication of a survey commissioned by the Cato Institute: The State of Free Speech and Tolerance in America.

<https://www.cato.org/survey-reports/state-free-speech-tolerance-america>

It's very long and I haven't myself digested it yet, so I'm posting it as something of interest, not as something that will prove you wrong.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 4:41 PM

Title: Re: Pleiades, Elves & BuddhaDharma

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 6:21 PM

Title: Re: Buddhanet.net - Down or Gone?

Content:

Probably technical issues. The site is working fine for me today, but a few days ago it was unavailable.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 8:52 PM
Title: Re: Driving is
Content:
An Opinion on a Matter of Public Safety

“Air Bag” sounds like eminent sickness
This device should not be permitted
General Motors was right to suppress it
and wrong to have relented
and Nader should stay out of it.

Driving is based on alertness
whether that be loose or tight
Those who let their attention wander
must not be encouraged to survive
by a bag full of air.

— <http://cuneiformpress.com/wp-content/uploads/Dorn-Hello-La-Jolla-Complete.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Nov 29, 2017 9:42 PM
Title: Re: Driving is
Content:
Yeah, they have their uses, I suppose.

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 30, 2017 10:22 AM
Title: Re: Animal Rebirth
Content:
It's a theoretical possibility but there are no narratives of it happening. For it to happen the animal would need to have developed jhāna in a former life as a human. Then, at the end of its animal life, it would be necessary that there be no weighty kamma or death-proximate kamma or habitual kamma capable of ripening at that time. Such circumstances would provide the occasion for the ripening of the jhānic reserve kamma. In practice I think this would only be likely to happen if the animal was very short-lived; otherwise it's almost certain that it will have created habitual kamma and that this will take priority.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 30, 2017 5:28 PM

Title: Re: Kasina meditations taught by the Buddha or no?

Content:

Aren't you confusing arūpaloka (i.e. the realm where formless beings live) with arūpajjhāna (a meditative state attainable by humans) ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 1, 2017 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Joke!!! 2.0

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 1, 2017 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Buddha's skin colour

Content:

Not in the Lakkhaṇasutta, but he does elsewhere.

<https://suttacentral.net/en/an4.35>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 2, 2017 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Buddha's skin colour

Content:

It does more than that:

Vassakāra gives his view of the characteristics of a mahāpurisa.

The Buddha gives his view.

Vassakāra expresses approval of the Buddha's view and goes on to say that the Buddha possesses those characteristics.

The Buddha confirms that he possesses them.

Given what has preceded it, the Buddha's confirmation is tantamount to asserting his own mahāpurisa-ness.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 2, 2017 2:06 PM
Title: Re: 2018 World Cup
Content:
The World Cup draw.

Group A Russia, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, Uruguay
Group B Portugal, Spain, Morocco, Iran
Group C France, Australia, Peru, Denmark
Group D Argentina, Iceland, Croatia, Nigeria
Group E Brazil, Switzerland, Costa Rica, Serbia
Group F Germany, Mexico, Sweden, South Korea
Group G Belgium, Panama, Tunisia, England
Group H Poland, Senegal, Colombia, Japan

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 3, 2017 7:06 AM
Title: Re: 2018 World Cup
Content:
1. England
2. Iceland
3. Anyone as long as it's not Belgium, Germany or Argentina

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 3, 2017 1:38 PM
Title: Re: Buddha's skin colour
Content:
I know. It is nonetheless relevant as a response to the claim that the Buddha doesn't describe himself as a mahāpurisa.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 4, 2017 5:37 AM
Title: Re: Buddha's skin colour
Content:
They certainly are, for in the Vassakārasutta the first of the four features of a great man of great wisdom includes the words, "... is one who has established the manyfolk in the ariyan method" (bahussa janatā ariye ñāye patiṭṭhāpitā). This is a descriptor that is only ever applied to Sammāsambuddhas.

That being so, the only difference between mahāpurisa in the Vassakārasutta and mahāpurisa in (some of) the thirty-two marks contexts is that in the former it is a term

for Sammāsambuddhas alone, while in the latter it may denote either Sammāsambuddhas or Wheel-turning Monarchs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 4, 2017 7:53 AM

Title: Re: Ordain as a monk and still stay vegetarian/vegan?

Content:

One needs to distinguish between the requirements and prohibitions of Vinaya and those of popular custom.

The Vinaya prohibits a bhikkhu's eating of anything that hasn't been offered to him. It doesn't, however, require him to accept everything that's offered. Nor does it require him to eat everything that he's accepted.

Popular Asian custom, on the other hand, deems it bad form for a bhikkhu to decline any lawful food offering. In some places it's also deemed courteous for a bhikkhu to eat anything he's accepted if the donors are watching him.

The confusion of custom with Vinaya often leads to the erroneous assertion that the Vinaya requires bhikkhus to accept and eat everything they're offered.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 4, 2017 8:22 AM

Title: Re: what skills are invaluable

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 5, 2017 8:14 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Thailand

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 6, 2017 6:15 PM

Title: Re: Looking for meditation guidance over Skype

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 6, 2017 6:34 PM

Title: Re: Looking for meditation guidance over Skype

Content:

See also this talk by Lance Cousins, the co-founder of the Samatha Trust:

<http://journal.samatha.org/issues/2015-16/samatha-meditation-and-insight-meditation-complementary-or-competing>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 6, 2017 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Looking for meditation guidance over Skype

Content:

And no charge at all for their online Skype course.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 12:40 AM

Title: Re: Gods goddesses worship in Thailand

Content:

Phra Mae Thoranee/Dharaṇī (พระแม่ธรณี) or Phra Sii Wasuntharaa / Phra Śrī Vasundharā (พระศรีวสุนธรา) is the earth goddess and is popular with almost everyone.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Phra_Mae_Thorani

There is also a rice goddess called Mae Phosop (แม่โพสพ), or Mae Khosok (แม่โคสก) in the North and Northeast of the country.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Phosop>

https://web.archive.org/web/20070526103719/http://www.awakenedwoman.com/pairin_rice_mother.htm

These are the three main ones. Then a couple of minor ones are Phra Suratsawadee (พระสุรัสวดี) = Sarasvatī, who's popular among artists and entertainers, and Phra Mae Khongkha (พระแม่คงคา). Goddess of the Ganges and, by extension, of all rivers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 10:58 AM

Title: Re: Will certain Buddhists on DW please stop disparaging other faiths

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 11:18 AM

Title: Re: I disrobed and returned to "normal" life

Content:

I think the kind of Thai monks you're talking about would probably reply that you're presenting a false dichotomy here. They would say that their "personal spiritual way of life" consists in accumulating merit as they don't believe themselves to have the paramī to attain anything higher in the present life. And that the way they aim to accumulate merit is by devoting themselves to this or that approved social role: sangha administration (in the case of urban bureaucrat monks), monastic education (in the case of Pali teachers, Abhidhamma teachers, etc.) or preaching dāna and sīla, performing apotropaic rituals, interceding in village disputes, etc. (in the case of village monks).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 12:35 PM

Title: Re: This Diagram

Content:

It's an Abhidhamma chart of the 89 or 121 kinds of citta. Starting from the left...

1st column

The first four rows are the 12 unwholesomes.

The second three rows are the 18 rootless resultants.

2nd column

8 great wholesomes.

8 great resultants.

8 great functionals.

The rest are the 15 refined-form and 12 formless jhāna cittas and the 8 or 40 supramundane cittas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 5:07 PM

Title: Re: Will certain Buddhists on DW please stop disparaging other faiths

Content:

Whom do you have in mind? Which recognized Islamic scholar either rejects naskh / "abrogation", or interprets it differently from Modus?

I can personally think of one scholar who did reject it, claiming that true Islam is to be found only in the peaceful tolerant Mecca revelations and that the later and nastier Medina ones should be discarded on the grounds that they had only a provisional relevance. Unfortunately the scholar in question didn't become mainstream and in 1985 he was hanged for apostasy and heresy.

<https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2006/09/11/the-moderate-martyr>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahmoud_Mohammed_Taha

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 5:27 PM

Title: Re: Will certain Buddhists on DW please stop disparaging other faiths

Content:

This doesn't really answer my question. You charged Modus with advancing interpretations of the Quran that are "in direct contradiction to those of recognized Islamic scholars." But the interpretive principle that Modus referred to — that the Medina revelations abrogate the Mecca ones whenever the two conflict — is about as mainstream as you can get.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Will certain Buddhists on DW please stop disparaging other faiths

Content:

But no mention of any rejection of naskh by anybody in the Islamic mainstream.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 7, 2017 5:42 PM

Title: Re: Will certain Buddhists on DW please stop disparaging other faiths

Content:

But this is a Meccan revelation. Members of the "heretical" Muslim sects referred to in my earlier post may quote the "no compulsion" passage in good faith, but when mainstream Muslims do so (without mentioning that it's abrogated by the intolerant Medina revelations) it's nearly always an exercise in dissimulation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 9, 2017 4:50 AM

Title: Re: This Diagram

Content:
Indeed.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 9, 2017 11:44 AM
Title: Re: If life is suffering, then wouldn't it be unethical to have children?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 10, 2017 9:57 AM
Title: Re: General question about confession of wrong doing.
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 10, 2017 2:24 PM
Title: Re: How to exercise sense restraint in instances where aversion might arise?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 10, 2017 5:55 PM
Title: Re: How to exercise sense restraint in instances where aversion might arise?
Content:
Because whereas the lower fetters are eliminated by vision, the higher ones are to be eliminated by development.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 10, 2017 8:17 PM
Title: Re: How to exercise sense restraint in instances where aversion might arise?
Content:
It's the stock description of the attainment of stream-entry, found in dozens of suttas. The one I quoted is the MN's Brahmaya Sutta. Sutta Central links to Sister Uppalavaṇṇā's translation of it, which is probably rubbish. Here's the Ñāṇamoli/Bodhi one:

<https://tinyurl.com/ydejdl3k>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 10, 2017 8:24 PM

Title: Re: How to exercise sense restraint in instances where aversion might arise?

Content:

Okay.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 12, 2017 8:04 AM

Title: Re: the 5th precept

Content:

The Sigalovādasutta commentary defines surā and meraya as two kinds of alcoholic beverage and majja as any substance that intoxicates (taṃ sabbampi madakaraṇavasena "majjaṃ").

The Surāmerayasutta commentary repeats the Sigalovādasutta's definitions of surā and meraya, and then defines majja as either: (1) both surā and meraya together, or (2) any non-alcoholic substance (surāsavavinimutta) whose consumption causes intoxication (madanīya).

The Khuddakapāṭha commentary offers two glosses of majja: (1) as an adjective ("besotting") qualifying surā and majja, and (2) the same as the Surāmerayasutta commentary:

Majjan ti tadubhayameva madaniyaṭṭhena majjaṃ, yaṃ vā panaññaṃ kiñci atthi madaniyaṃ, yena pītena matto hoti pamatto, idaṃ vuccati majjaṃ.

"Both these are 'besotting' in the sense of causing intoxication; or alternatively, whatever else there is that causes intoxication, by consuming which one becomes mad and negligent, is called 'besotting'."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 12, 2017 2:19 PM

Title: Re: What everyone participating in forums should understand

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 12, 2017 10:07 PM

Title: Re: What everyone participating in forums should understand

Content:

I can't say for sure, for though I've heard that accounts of Dr. Bell are to be found in many people's memoirs, I've only read one myself, that of the Unstan folklorist Jessie Saxby. According to her, Bell was like Holmes in every way but one, namely, that he was kinder than Holmes and more interested in getting the innocent acquitted than in bringing the guilty to justice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 13, 2017 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Religion quiz

Content:

1. Theravada Buddhism (100%)
2. Jainism (99%)
3. Orthodox Quaker (90%)
4. Hinduism (89%)
5. Sikhism (85%)
6. Orthodox Judaism (71%)
7. Unitarian Universalism (65%)
8. Seventh Day Adventist (60%)
9. Taoism (58%)
10. Mahayana Buddhism (57%)
11. Liberal Quaker (52%)
12. Mormon (52%)
13. Eastern Orthodox (50%)
14. Roman Catholic (50%)
15. Jehovahs Witness (47%)
16. Mainline - Liberal Christian Protestants (44%)
17. Islam (43%)
18. Scientology (43%)
19. Bahai (42%)
20. Secular Humanism (41%)
21. Neo-Pagan (37%)
22. New Age (36%)
23. Mainline - Conservative Christian Protestant (34%)
24. Reform Judaism (33%)
25. Non-theist (27%)
26. Christian Science Church of Christ, Scientist (22%)
27. New Thought (22%)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 13, 2017 8:13 AM
Title: Re: Religion quiz
Content:
Probably.

I always seem to get something unexpected in the third place. This time it's Orthodox Quakerism. In the past I've had Mormonism and Neo-Paganism.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 13, 2017 3:16 PM
Title: Re: Religion quiz
Content:
Well done! I doubt I shall ever pass it myself. I keep giving the same answers every time, only changing my mind about how much emphasis to place on each answer.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 13, 2017 5:06 PM
Title: Re: Yogic practice in Sutta-Nipata
Content:
I doubt it has anything to do with the khecarī mudrā. The Pali says: "jivhāya tāluṃ āhacca". That is, the tongue is in contact with the hard palate. Not with the velum or nose cavity.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 13, 2017 5:46 PM
Title: Re: Political Compass
Content:
Authoritarian right, but only just, and looking pretty moderate for a UKIP voter.

.

chart.jpg (18.38 KiB) Viewed 3015 times

.

March of the Mods.JPG (76.01 KiB) Viewed 3015 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 15, 2017 2:39 PM
Title: Re: Why telling lie is so bad?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 15, 2017 11:17 PM
Title: Re: Why telling lie is so bad?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 16, 2017 6:11 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism and alcohol
Content:
Have you considered going to Austria? Your westerly neighbours have an excellent state health service, coming in 9th place in the World Health Organization's ranking of national healthcare systems, while Hungary ranks a miserable 66th.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 16, 2017 6:32 PM
Title: Re: Trump. And why I hate him.
Content:
If the horse's ass is a jenny, then we can expect a hinny to come out of her.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 17, 2017 11:40 AM
Title: Re: Report on UK "Faith Schools"
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 18, 2017 8:33 AM
Title: Re: Compassion in Theravada
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 18, 2017 6:24 PM
Title: Re: Members Bios - please contribute yours
Content:
Oh? Are you planning to nail someone's head to a coffee table?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 19, 2017 3:28 PM
Title: Re: Did the Buddha live & pass away in Sri Lanka?
Content:
The distance is actually only 250 km. But even 350 km would still be doable. In the British army the training of the Gurkha regiments includes marching 70 km a day in Himalayan mountainous terrain with a 50 lb backpack. The route to Sarnath, by contrast, is mostly flat and the Buddha would have had only an almsbowl to carry.

.

map.jpg (80.75 KiB) Viewed 626 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 19, 2017 3:41 PM
Title: Re: Is Life Actually Worth Living?
Content:
An old thread on Benatar:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=16&t=23194>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 19, 2017 5:20 PM

Title: Re: 10 perfections?

Content:

The param̐/further shore etymology is usually associated with the Mahayana's Prajñāpāramita sūtras. I don't think it occurs in any Pali sources earlier than the mediaeval sub-commentaries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 19, 2017 9:29 PM

Title: Re: Compassion in Theravada

Content:

The commentary to the Cariyāpiṭaka.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel409.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 20, 2017 5:33 PM

Title: Re: how to choose a date

Content:

The dragons being fought by St. Georgina are now so small one would think the game was hardly worth the candle.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 20, 2017 8:15 PM

Title: Re: Is Life Actually Worth Living?

Content:

I would say that there's considerable overlap between those things that the Buddhist texts regard as saṃvega-generating and those things that lead anti-natalists to claim that begetting children is morally indefensible. The drawback is that the latter comes accompanied by un-dhammic stuff and so would need to be carefully sifted.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 21, 2017 10:00 AM

Title: Re: All dhammas are personal, not public

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 21, 2017 4:34 PM

Title: Re: All dhammas are personal, not public

Content:

None of the suttas in this saṃyutta state what the dhammas of dhammānupassanā are.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 21, 2017 11:18 PM

Title: Re: Winter Solstice

Content:

It's ignored. We use a lunar calendar, so the sun is only relevant for determining day and night.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 3:07 PM

Title: Re: Tribal law (common law) vs Civilized people law (civil law)

Content:

Here's the same writer explaining matters to an American audience:

<https://home.isi.org/node/190>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 3:12 PM

Title: Re: Tribal law (common law) vs Civilized people law (civil law)

Content:

And Dame Hazel Genn, QC...

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 4:02 PM

Title: Re: question about gītassara sutta!

Content:

The Thais, oddly enough, have chosen to name one of their styles of chanting after the very thing one isn't supposed to do.

Buddhamaṅgalagāthā in the sarabhañña / sawraphanya style.

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 4:35 PM
Title: Re: All dhammas are personal, not public
Content:
Dhammo and dhammā.

That is, the singular form more often (though not always) means the Dhamma rather than dhammas. The plural more often (though not always) means dhammas rather than the Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 5:33 PM
Title: Re: question about gītassara sutta!
Content:
No, I didn't say that. I don't know whether what the Thais call "sarabhañña-style" is the same as what goes by this name in the suttas. In my post I merely remarked on the oddity of naming a style of recitation after something the Buddha disapproved.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 6:48 PM
Title: Re: question about gītassara sutta!
Content:
Whoops.

Thanks for the correction.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 22, 2017 7:32 PM
Title: Re: All dhammas are personal, not public
Content:
If you make the two words into a compound, its initial (pre-inflected) form will be buddhadhamma. When it's the subject of a sentence it will take an -o inflection: buddhadhammo.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 23, 2017 11:15 AM

Title: Re: I got a tax cut! What will I do with it?

Content:

It's usually called GDP ("gross domestic product") in English. I don't think many readers will have heard of produit intérieur brut.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 24, 2017 11:53 AM

Title: Re: All dhammas are personal, not public

Content:

Dhātu Sutta

“Pathaviḍhātu, bhikkhave, aniccā vipariṇāmi aññathābhāvī.

“Āpodhātu ... tejodhātu ... vāyodhātu ... ākāsadhātu ... viññāṇadhātu aniccā vipariṇāmi aññathābhāvī.

“Yo, bhikkhave, ime dhamme evaṃ saddahati adhimuccati, ayaṃ vuccati ‘saddhānusārī’.

“Monks, the earth property is inconstant, changeable, alterable.

“The liquid property... The fire property... The wind property... The space property... The consciousness property is inconstant, changeable, alterable.

"One who has conviction & belief that these phenomena (dhammā) are this way is called a faith-follower..."

(SN. iii. 227)

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn25/sn25.009.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 24, 2017 3:42 PM

Title: Re: I got a tax cut! What will I do with it?

Content:

Lyndon's "Trickle Up" theory was discussed in this thread...

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=28735>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 25, 2017 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Merry Christmas!

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 27, 2017 12:30 PM

Title: Re: the 5th precept

Content:

Yes if you're a bhikkhu, for the Vinaya classes the 51st Pācittiya as an acittaka rule - one where the mere act is an offence and the bhikkhu's knowledge, perception and intention are treated as irrelevant.

No if you're a sāmaṇera, for the Khuddakapāṭha Commentary makes intention relevant in the case of the fifth of the ten precepts.

Probably not if you're layperson. The texts don't actually say so, but one wouldn't expect a five-precept layperson to be required to hold to a more scrupulous standard than a ten-precept sāmaṇera.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 28, 2017 12:27 PM

Title: Re: Are there any EBT suttas not found in the paali collection?

Content:

Those who don't know any of the relevant languages would best begin with those non-Pali collections that Sutta Central has in English translation. Unfortunately owing to copyright issues with Ven. Anālayo's translations the only ones presently available are a small number by Ven. Ānandajoti, Sāmaṇerī Dhammadinnā, and Marcus Bingenheimer...

Sanskrit Arthaviniścaya

<https://suttacentral.net/arv>

Tibetan Upāyikā texts

<https://suttacentral.net/up>

Second Part of the Chinese Saṃyukta Āgama

<https://suttacentral.net/sa-2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 28, 2017 3:26 PM

Title: Re: How to get over being wronged?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 28, 2017 5:34 PM

Title: Re: the 5th precept

Content:

In Vinaya texts there is never any stated reason as to why guilt under one rule depends upon mens rea, while under another actus reus suffices. One can always conjecture of course, and in the present case I suspect the aim may be to foster in bhikkhus a heightened circumspection about anything they put in their mouths.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 12:03 AM

Title: Re: Watching defilements come and go

Content:

The wordplay is well-known in Thailand because the standard Thai translation of 'arahant' (based on one of the Visuddhimagga's niruktis) means 'one far from defilement'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 6:31 AM

Title: Re: Are there any EBT suttas not found in the paali collection?

Content:

You would need to ask him. We're not acquainted.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Watching defilements come and go

Content:

The Arahā Sutta is in the Aṅguttara Nikāya's Book of Sevens, so three of the ten fetters are omitted: rūpa-rāga, arūpa-rāga and uddhacca.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 7:09 PM

Title: Re: Doubt is fully eliminated only by Arahants?

Content:

Well, you're in good company – Socrates, as reported by Aristotle, seems to have shared your intuition. On the other hand, it is not shared by those whose intuitions tell them that humans have multi-part souls whose parts sometimes conflict with each other, and that akrasia is due to a conflict between passion and reason, or whatever.

Buddhist ābhidhammikas would agree that what your intuition tells you is true in the ultimate sense, for it's not possible for the wholesome and the unwholesome to be present in one and the same citta and cittas arise only one at a time. But even ābhidhammikas would concede that a rapid oscillation between wholesome and unwholesome javana processes can produce the appearance of a moral struggle even though in any one single moment there is no struggle – just a good impulse or a bad one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Are there any EBT suttas not found in the paali collection?

Content:

My understanding is that they are free but that the copyright is held by that Japanese Mahayana outfit that distributes Buddhist Gideon Bibles to Asian hotels. I've forgotten its name now.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Doubt is fully eliminated only by Arahnats?

Content:

No. When a particular defilement has been eliminated by "cutting off", as happens with the ariyan attainments, then its further arising is an impossibility.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 29, 2017 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Alone not lonely

Content:

Firstly, adopt an eremitical life only if your natural inclinations happen to lie that way and not because you feel it's something you ought to do or that you'll hasten your progress in Dhamma by doing so (you probably won't).

Secondly, have a feline, canine or equine companion with you.

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/health/alternative-medicine/3342048/Pets-are-better-than-Prozac.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 31, 2017 1:39 PM

Title: Re: Is Ganges river back flow in Varanasi?

Content:

Of course not. It's an abbhutadhamma or miracle story. It would hardly have been worth reporting if the dish had just acted normally and floated in the direction one would expect it to float.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 31, 2017 2:29 PM

Title: Re: Is Ganges river back flow in Varanasi?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 31, 2017 7:20 PM

Title: Re: Is Ganges river back flow in Varanasi?

Content:

The power of augury operating via dhammaniyāma, prophetic dreams, earthquakes occurring at pivotally auspicious moments, marvels wrought by saccakiriyās, etc. are all impeccably Buddhist, even if they happen not to find favour with protestant Buddhists of the drearily modernist sort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 31, 2017 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Why does Dalai Lama do the things he does?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 7:29 AM

Title: Re: -yūṃ ending (randhayūṃ)

Content:

Optative third person plural randheyyūṃ shortened to fit the metre.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 8:24 AM
Title: Re: Parajika
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 10:02 AM
Title: Re: Buddhist monk jumped off motorway bridge
Content:

I didn't know Colin, but to judge from the photos on his Facebook memorial page I would guess that he was relatively new to Buddhism, for as recently as 2015 he was pictured drinking and sea-fishing.

https://web.facebook.com/cnashwba/photos_albums

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 10:24 AM
Title: Re: Parajika
Content:

I don't know if there's any mention of this being done in the early texts, but it wouldn't be at all surprising. If shameless bhikkhus resorted to it, then it seems likely that shameless wanderers and ascetics of other persuasions would have done so too.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 4:15 PM
Title: Re: -yumu ending (randhayumu)
Content:

You do need to know the active voice optative endings as it's a very common grammatical mood...

1. -eyyāmi -eyyāma
2. -eyyāsi -eyyātha
3. -eyya -eyyumu

And it can also be helpful to be able to recognize the middle voice optative endings, for although these are much less common they are sometimes used in Pali verse in place of the active endings in order to fit the metre...

1. -eyyaṃ -eyyāṃhe
2. -etho -eyyavho
3. -etha -eraṃ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 2, 2018 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Parajika

Content:

The Pali has mahācora, lit. "great thief", and I.B. Horner rendered it so. But the version of the English Vinaya at Sutta Central has been greatly revised, in part to correct Horner's errors, but also to present the whole work in a much more modernised and demotic idiom.

While the corrections are certainly welcome, the modernising and vulgarising of the translation are not always well-conceived. For example, neither Horner's literal rendering "great thief" nor Sutta Central's free and vulgar rendering "gangster" are good translations of mahācora — a term that denotes a master thief, as opposed to a thief's apprentice. "Great thief" fails to convey this, while "gangster" is simply misleading, for a mahācora is not necessarily a member of any gang.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 3, 2018 2:39 PM

Title: Re: Feminism for men

Content:

Same question: what learned behaviours would result in a Biddulph-reared boy "definitely stay[ing] a virgin for ever"?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 4, 2018 1:06 PM

Title: Re: Catholicism and Buddhism

Content:

Mary.

Avalokiteśvara, a male Bodhisattva, didn't appear until mid-2nd century CE in the 25th chapter of the Lotus Sūtra and didn't undergo his Chinese sex change until several centuries later.

The veneration of Mary, by contrast, features almost from the beginning of Christian history.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 4, 2018 5:54 PM

Title: Re: Catholicism and Buddhism

Content:

I've never heard this claim before. As far as I know the white elephant was merely Mahāmayā's dream.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 4, 2018 6:20 PM

Title: Re: Do plants feel pain?

Content:

The author was actually Dr. Bhagchandra Jain Bhaskar. Dr. Hiralal only wrote the foreword. It's available here:

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.320363>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 10, 2018 4:41 AM

Title: Re: Grammatical Rules Regarding "vā"

Content:

The English distinction between “either x or y” and “x or y” is merely stylistic, not semantic, and has no equivalent in Pali.

In their discussion of vā Pali grammarians drew a distinction between vikappana and sampiṇḍana, that is, a disjunctive ‘or’ and a conjunctive ‘and’.

Vikappana

samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā

Sampiṇḍana

bhūtā vā sambhavesī vā

sabbe sattā bhavantu sukhittā

(Karaṇīyamettasutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 10, 2018 8:53 AM

Title: Re: How common is stream entry?

Content:

I assume that these texts carry some weight with you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 10, 2018 9:57 AM

Title: Re: How common is stream entry?

Content:

No. All grades of sekha disciple, from sotāpanna to anāgāmin, have seen Nibbāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 11, 2018 8:27 AM

Title: Re: How common is stream entry?

Content:

I don't think it's out of place. Being in the General Theravada forum just means that posters are at liberty to dissent from and to challenge the commentarial understanding, whereas in the Classical Forum one is required to assume for discussion purposes that the Abhidhamma and Commentaries get things right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 11, 2018 10:33 AM

Title: Re: Pa Auk In The West

Content:

But this stipulation applies only to bhikkhus ordained from five to ten rains who wish to be released from nissaya early, i.e., before they become theras. It doesn't apply to monks of ten rains or more, for whom release from nissaya is automatic, even if they haven't memorised a single gāthā.

Are you saying that learned Burmese theras in the Pa Auk tradition are not aware of this rather elementary point of Vinaya?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 11, 2018 10:53 AM

Title: Re: masturbation what's wrong?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 11, 2018 11:35 AM

Title: Re: masturbation what's wrong?

Content:

One of the ten kinds of masturbation described in Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Commentary is called *dānaṃ dassāmīti sukkavisaṭṭhi*, "emitting semen with the aim of giving a gift." For example, a man might ejaculate onto an anthill out of a compassionate wish to feed the ants.

However, in their innovatively erotic Christology, Cook and Moore seem to have had something else in mind when citing Matthew 6:3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 31, 2018 3:09 AM

Title: Re: mettā in commentarial tradition (refutation)

Content:

But in the remainder of your post I don't think you've quite succeeded at this.

There are two questions here:

1. Can what the suttas call "mettā" be aptly compared to maternal love?
2. Can an affirmative answer to the above question be supported by appealing to the mother simile in the Mettasutta?

Thanissaro is giving a no answer to the second question: repudiating the common use made of the Mettasutta in support of the "mettā = maternal love" comparison. But your post seems aimed at arguing for a yes answer to the first question and as such doesn't really touch on what Thanissaro is saying.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 31, 2018 5:33 AM

Title: Re: Paccekabuddhas ... can't teach? or don't teach?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 31, 2018 12:01 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Scholar Steven Collins Dies at 66

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 31, 2018 2:49 PM

Title: Re: mettā in commentarial tradition (refutation)

Content:

To put it less pedantically:

In pop Buddhist presentations of mettabhāvanā, verse seven of the Karaṇīyamettasutta is often read as saying that one should love all beings as a mother loves her only child.

Thanissaro thinks that they're wrong to read it this way. In his construal it is the mettā-ful state of mind that is to be developed as a mother guards her only child.

The point of my post was to show that the grammar of the passage clearly supports Thanissaro's construal, not the pop Buddhist one.

And so when you stated that you disagreed with Thanissaro and were going to substantiate this I would have expected you to present some argument showing that the simile doesn't mean what Thanissaro thinks it means; rather, it means whatever you think it means.

Instead you posted a reply that doesn't touch on the Mettasutta at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 1, 2018 4:03 AM

Title: Re: Bhikkhunis is not Aj Brahm's project.

Content:

Well, they might. It would depend — precisely as it does with Thai monks — on what the mae chee has spent her time doing. For example, if she's an old peasant lady of little education who's ordained out of a wish to devote herself to a life of service in order to accumulate merit for the next life, and if she aspires to nothing more than this, then naturally no Thai is going to think of consulting her on matters of Dhamma. But nor would they think of consulting an ignorant village monk (whose motivation will in many cases be very similar to the aforementioned mae chee) on matters of Dhamma.

For a more balanced picture, dealing with an aspect of mae chee-ship seldom addressed in Western texts, see the attached article on the role of mae chees in Thai monastic education.

Steven Collins and Justin McDaniel: Buddhist 'Nuns' (mae chi) and the Teaching of Pali in Contemporary Thailand

[./download/file.php?id=4098](#)

(397.57 KiB) Downloaded 92 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 1, 2018 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Can we become Buddhas?

Content:

What does perhaps originate with modern EBT studies is the insistence on the second reading being the historically original one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 1, 2018 5:37 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Six articles by Rupert Gettin

https://www.academia.edu/24132029/The_M%C4%81tik%C4%81s_Memorization_Mindfulness_and_the_List

https://www.academia.edu/24142623/Wrong_view_micch%C4%81-di%E1%B9%AD%E1%B9%ADhi_and_right_view_samm%C4%81-di%E1%B9%AD%E1%B9%ADhi_in_the_Therav%C4%81da_Abhidhamma

https://www.academia.edu/24142507/Bhava%E1%B9%85ga_and_Rebirth_According_to_the_Abhidhamma

https://www.academia.edu/24132372/The_Five_Khandhas_Their_Treatment_in_the_Nik%C4%81yas_and_Early_Abhidhamma

https://www.academia.edu/11728668/On_some_definitions_of_mindfulness

https://www.academia.edu/33205031/He_who_sees_dhamma_sees_dhammas_dhamma_in_early_Buddhism

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 2, 2018 1:21 PM

Title: Re: Enlightenment is difficult...

Content:

Only if one supposes that "highest" is to be taken literally.

The commentators, however, recognized both a literally superlative use of *uttama* and a merely hyperbolical use.

When it's to be understood as literally superlative the commentary's gloss is "foremost, acme" (seṭṭha agga). When it's to be taken as commendatory hyperbole, the gloss is "distinguished, excellent" (visiṭṭha pavara). The Maṅgala Sutta is an example of the latter.

"So many highest superlatives achieved by man are followed by new higher; and dwindle into comparatives and positives!"
(Thomas Carlyle, The French Revolution)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 2, 2018 9:26 PM

Title: Re: What is the difference between God's plan and Kamma?

Content:

If it's that sort of God you have in mind then the answer's easy: The law of kamma and vipāka doesn't play favourites. That sort of God does.

"Jacob have I loved, but Esau have I hated," (and before they were even born!)

<https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=Romans+9&version=AKJV>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 2, 2018 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Enlightenment is difficult...

Content:

and then the less literal sense of "extremely good" which has been the word's dominant meaning for the last three centuries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 3, 2018 12:34 AM

Title: Re: What is the proper method for reading lists in suttas?

Content:

Suppose you were tasked with drawing up a list of a number of items and the particular order in which they were to be listed didn't really matter. How would you go about it? Instinctively what you would probably do is to list them in the order that sounded most natural and pleasing to the ear. Each language has its own (usually unstated) conventions governing this. English, for example, is an example of a "waning syllables language", which means that a native speaker will start by listing the items whose names have the most syllables and then gradually work down to those which have the

least. For example, if you were listing the names of adherents of the world's religions, it would sound most euphonic if you put the Zarathustrians and Spiritualists first and the Sikhs, Jains and Jews last.

Pali and Sanskrit, on the other hand, follow the waxing syllables principle: begin with the shortest words and then gradually move up to the longest.

So, any time the Buddha lists a number of items, observe whether or not the list's sequence is waxing syllables-compliant. If it is, then it tells you that the order is probably of no doctrinal significance. For example:

nacca-gīta-vādita-visūkadassana
"dancing, singing, music, unseemly shows."

mālā-gandha-vilepana-dhāraṇa-maṇḍana-vibhūsanatṭhānā
"garlands, perfumes, cosmetics, ornaments and adornments."

āhuneyyo pāhuneyyo dakkhiṇeyyo añjalikaraṇiyo
"worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation."

But if the Buddha's list is non-compliant then it tells us that the order of items probably matters. For example, it might mean that they constitute a progressive sequence of development, as with the Maṅgalasutta's thirty-eight blessings or the seven bojjhaṅgas:

sati, dhammavicayo, viriyo, pīti, passaddhi, samādhi, upekkhā
"Mindfulness, investigation of dhammas, energy, zest, calm, concentration, equanimity."

Or the factors of the Eightfold Path.

One caveat, however, is that the above only applies when the items are listed in one and the same sentence or paragraph. If they are listed in separate paragraphs, as is often the case with the lists in the Aṅguttara Nikāya, then all bets are off.

Attached files:

Ven. Anālayo, Waxing Syllables (entry in the Encyclopedia of Buddhism, ed. G.P. Malalasekera)

Mark Allon, The Oral Composition and Transmission of Early Buddhist Texts (in Indian Insights: Buddhism, Brahmanism and Bhakti, ed. Peter Connolly and Sue Hamilton)

./download/file.php?id=4101
(328.6 KiB) Downloaded 41 times

./download/file.php?id=4102
(461.13 KiB) Downloaded 15 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 3, 2018 10:04 AM
Title: Re: Enlightenment is difficult...
Content:

This equation doesn't accurately reflect the weakened use of "extremely" in modern English. Perhaps in bygone days it would have been thought a solecism to say, "Mangos are extremely sweet, but mangosteens are sweeter still," but nowadays it wouldn't raise the eyebrows of even the most officious grammar Nazi.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 4, 2018 9:43 PM
Title: Re: Does Noble Eightfold Path include both Samatha and Vipassana?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Apr 5, 2018 5:07 PM
Title: Re: Creating a Practice When Life is Hard
Content:
<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/soma/wayof.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Apr 12, 2018 8:28 PM
Title: Re: Western Teachers of the Thai Forest Tradition
Content:
I'm not presently in touch with them, but if they're living in Thailand it's unlikely they'll lack the four requisites.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 13, 2018 3:34 PM

Title: Re: Bill V. on Theravadan nihilism

Content:

I think it is implicitly, for in the SN's Asaṅkhatasamṃyutta it is called dhuva, "the stable", which in sutta accounts of eternalism is one of the synonyms of nicca:

At that time, monks, an evil wrong view came to have accrued to Baka the Brahmā like this: 'This is permanent (niccam), this is stable (dhuvam), this is eternal (sassatam), this is entire (kevalam), this is not liable to passing away (acavanadhammam), this is not born, does not age, does not die, does not pass away, does not uprise, and there is not another further escape from this.'

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 13, 2018 5:09 PM

Title: Re: Is the idea that Nibbāna is seen at each of 4 stages of awakening canonical?

Content:

It's straightforwardly inferable from the Suttas. Were it the case that the sotāpanna had not seen Nibbāna, then it couldn't be said of him that he had seen the third noble truth. The Suttas, however, say that he has seen all four of the noble truths:

"But when one sees with correct wisdom
The truths of the noble ones—
Suffering and its origin,
The overcoming of suffering,
And the Noble Eightfold Path
That leads to suffering's appeasement—
Then that person, having wandered on
For seven more times at most,
Makes an end to suffering
By destroying all the fetters."
(SN. ii. 185-6)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 13, 2018 7:04 PM

Title: Re: vsm asubha

Content:

Clearly enough nirodha and uparujjhati cannot be synonyms, for one is a noun and the other a verb. What are synonyms, however, (at least in some contexts) are the verbs nirujjhati (from which we get nirodha) and uparujjhati.

The answer to the question, "Why would two different terms be used here?" is simply metri causa.

Generally in prose passages nirodha is used in conjunction with its etymological

kinsman nirujjhati. But in Pali verse nirujjhati doesn't always fit the metre and so other verbs will be substituted. In the case of the Ajitamāṇavapucchā, Ajita has posed his questions in the śloka metre, which comprises 8 syllables per pāda and 16 per line, and so the Buddha—following the convention of the day—replies in the same:

Yattha nāmañca rūpañca, asesam uparujjhati,
Viññāṇassa nirodhena, etthetam uparujjhati.

Since using the four-syllable nirujjhati would have produced a metrically defective pāda, the five-syllable uparujjhati is substituted. In other metres the replacement verbs indicating “to cease” include vūpasammati, attham gacchati, samati, upasamati, and paṭippassambhati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 14, 2018 5:46 PM

Title: Re: Boran kammatthana

Content:

You could try paying a visit to the lay teacher Nai Boonman Poonyathiro at his tektites and fossils shop. His English is reasonable and his daughter Kathi's is fluent. I don't know whether he would call his method "boran kammatthan", but the meditation instruction that I've received from one of his disciples seems to bear at least a family resemblance to it.

House of Gems

1218 Charoenkrung Road

Bangkok

http://houseofgems.info/about_us.php

Map.gif (9.16 KiB) Viewed 5591 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 16, 2018 12:40 PM

Title: Re: Right Livelihood & sattavaṇijjā - business in humans or in beings?

Content:

Presumably because the commentary glosses the term that way (sattavaṇijjā = manussavikkayo, "the sale of humans"), and on this occasion he believes the commentary to be correct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 16, 2018 1:48 PM

Title: Re: What is Facebook?

Content:

Impressively efficient of Holy Mother Church to bless them in large batches like that. In Thailand I've only ever seen monks blessing individual motorcycles.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 19, 2018 12:37 PM

Title: Re: Which view on DO resonates with you the most?

Content:

Pali text of Visuddhimagga ch. XVII with line-by-line English and Russian translations:

<https://www.theravada.su/node/2332>

(To remove the Russian just uncheck the box marked "Русский khantibalo")

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 26, 2018 11:09 PM

Title: Re: vinaya rule against ordaining in two traditions

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 26, 2018 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Looking for resources on particularly Islamic Meditation techniques

Content:

A very thorough account of the Shi'ite understanding and practice of the "inner jihad" ...

Ayatollah Khomeini, <https://www.al-islam.org/forty-hadith-an-exposition-second-edition-imam-khomeini> - An Exegesis of Surat Al-Tawhid and Some Verses of Surat Al-Hadid

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 27, 2018 4:10 PM

Title: Re: vinaya rule against ordaining in two traditions

Content:

The Vinaya Commentary's explanation is that since they were members of the Buddha's own clan it could be safely assumed that Sakyan titthiyas would be deferential towards their clansman's Dhammavinaya and would not be seeking ordination in order to find fault with it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 28, 2018 7:36 PM

Title: Re: Why many Buddhist monks are over weight?

Content:

In Thailand I think a major contributory cause of obesity among town and village monks is the wholesale neglect of the Kathāvatthu, the Abhidhamma Piṭaka's record of the debates at the Third Council. Not only is the text not included in the national Pali syllabus but even in the Abhidhamma colleges they don't teach it.

If Thai Buddhists would take the time to read the Kathāvatthu's

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv7.5> debate then they would realise that it's wrong view to hold that merit increases with utility, which at present most of them do in fact believe. Having discarded this wrong view, when inviting monks to their homes for a meal they will stop trying to coax us to eat as much as possible out of the superstitious belief that the more we eat the merit they'll get. And the senior monks in turn will stop nudging the junior monks, saying: "Go on, try and eat a little more to encourage the donors' faith!"

And so with the revival of Kathāvatthu studies, Thai monks will stop flopping about like beached whales and become restored to the gracile and willowy slenderness that befits a samaṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 28, 2018 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Why many Buddhist monks are over weight?

Content:

When the home owner has provided all the food herself then it's less likely to happen. But if the guests have each brought along an item of food then it's common for them to sit watching the monks while they eat to ensure that their particular offering is being consumed. When the meal's about halfway through if none of the monks have touched it or are eating only a little of it, it's then that the hinting begins: "Oh luang por, have compassion for me. I really need some merit, but you haven't eaten any of the water buffalo's afterbirth that I brought!" At that point the senior monk will start pointing to the dishes that nobody has eaten and giving orders to his juniors to "Chalong satthaa chao baan!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 1, 2018 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Sexual intercourse with other woman with the consent of wife

Content:

In the suttas diṭṭhadhamma-nibbāna is in some places a term of censure (as in your quoted passage) but in others it's a term of approval. See for example:

Devadūtasutta, MN iii. 178-87

Dhammakathikasutta, SN. ii. 18

Nalakalāpīsutta, SN. ii. 115

Dhammakathika and Dutiyadhammakathikasuttas, SN. iii. 163-5

Dhammakathikapucchasutta, SN. iv. 141

Diṭṭhadhammanibbānasutta, AN. iv. 454

Sambodhisutta, AN. iv. 351

“Though warned by the divine messengers,
Full many are the negligent,
And people may sorrow long indeed
Once gone down to the lower world.
But when by the divine messengers
Good people here in this life are warned,
They do not dwell in negligence
But practise well the noble Dhamma.
Clinging they look upon with fear
For it produces birth and death;
And by not clinging they are freed
In the destruction of birth and death.
They dwell in bliss for they are safe
And reach Nibbāna here and now.
They are beyond all fear and hate;
They have escaped all suffering.”
(Devadūta Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 2, 2018 10:43 AM

Title: Re: Does buying fenced goods result in unwholesome karma?

Content:

From Ajahn Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code:

Receiving stolen goods.

Accepting a gift of goods or purchasing them very cheaply, knowing that they were stolen, would in Western criminal law result in a penalty similar to stealing itself. However, neither the Canon nor the commentaries mention this case. The closest they come is in the Vinitavatthu, where a groundskeeper gives bhikkhus fruit from the orchard under his care, even though it was not his to give, and there was no offense for

the bhikkhus. From this it can be inferred that there is no offense for receiving stolen goods, even knowingly, although a bhikkhu who does so would not be exempt from the civil law [sic. I think he means secular law - Dhammanando] and the consequent proceedings, in the course of which the Community would probably urge him to disrobe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 3, 2018 1:25 AM

Title: Re: Does buying fenced goods result in unwholesome karma?

Content:

The policy in Thailand is that any bhikkhu who is arrested and charged with a criminal offence will be forced to disrobe even before the case has been tried. This doesn't have any basis in the Vinaya however.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 4, 2018 10:41 PM

Title: Re: What does "saṅkhāya uccārapassāvaṃ sandhāreti" mean here?

Content:

I take Bhikkhu Bodhi to be referring to the expression "to be anal-retentive". If I'm right, and if his conjecture is right, then it would mean for example a monk who acts in a very fastidious and pernickety way about minor rules of Vinaya, not because he really takes sīla seriously but because he wants householders to think that he does.

The phrase doesn't occur anywhere else in the canon and isn't defined in the commentaries. The Vinaya Piṭaka contains the similar-sounding vaccaṃ sandhāreti, "to retain one's faeces", but this is used only in a literal sense:

Now at that time monks relieved themselves in the privy according to seniority. Newly ordained monks, having arrived first, waited and through restraining themselves (vaccaṃ sandhārentā), they fell down fainting. They told this matter to the Lord. He said: "Is it true, as is said, monks?" "It is true, Lord." Having rebuked them, having given reasoned talk, he addressed the monks, saying:

"Monks, you should not relieve yourselves in a privy according to seniority. Whoever does (this), there is an offence of wrong-doing. I allow, you monks, to relieve yourselves according to the order of arrival."

(Vin. ii. 221)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 6, 2018 6:46 PM

Title: Re: The original meaning of "viññāṇa"

Content:

The Paṭiccasamuppāda-vibhaṅga Sutta defines viññāṇa:

“And what, bhikkhus, is consciousness? There are these six classes of consciousness: eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness, nose-consciousness, tongue-consciousness, body-consciousness, mind-consciousness. This is called consciousness.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn12.2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 6, 2018 8:39 PM

Title: Re: The original meaning of "viññāṇa"

Content:

I see.

You'll find it discussed by Joanna Jurewicz in her article Playing with Fire and perhaps in some of the other ones too.

<http://uw.academia.edu/JoannaJurewicz>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 7, 2018 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Amod Lele: Buddhaghosa on Seeing Things as They Really Are

A 3-part article. The first two parts have been posted already, while the third is yet to come.

<http://indianphilosophyblog.org/2018/04/15/buddhaghosa-on-seeing-things-as-they-are-1/>

<http://indianphilosophyblog.org/2018/04/29/buddhaghosa-on-seeing-things-as-they-are-2/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 8, 2018 8:25 AM

Title: Re: Need details

Content:

I think you mean the impercipient beings, asaṅṅasattā. In their human existence they arrived at the so-called impercipient attainment, but this isn't the same as the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 8, 2018 11:42 AM

Title: Re: Concept of Five Tathāgatas in Theravāda?

Content:

Yes, but from the fifth to the thirteenth centuries Cambodian Buddhism was predominantly Mahayanist with considerable Tantric input.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Buddhism_in_Cambodia

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 8, 2018 6:45 PM

Title: Re: Need details

Content:

Meanings needs to be gleaned from how terms are used and what the texts say about them. An examination merely of their etymology and manner of formation won't by itself be adequate.

The asaññā-samāpatti is not the same as nirodha in the sense of cessation of suffering, for those who attain it are reborn as impercipient devas and so remain saṃsāric beings.

Nor is asaññā-samāpatti the same as nirodha in the sense of the attainment of the cessation of apperception and feeling (saññāvedayita-nirodha-samāpatti). The principal differences:

Asaññā-samāpatti depends upon: (1) the fourth jhāna; (2) the wrong view that some neutral mental factor (usually saññā, though it could be any neutral factor) is the cause of dukkha; (3) a special mode of cultivation called saññāvirāga-bhāvanā undertaken by a yogi after emergence from the fourth jhāna.

Saññāvedayita-nirodha-samāpatti depends upon: (1) attainment of the four jhānas and four ārūpas; (2) being already an anāgāmin or arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 8, 2018 7:25 PM

Title: Re: Need details

Content:

That the explanation fails to confirm your prejudices hardly makes it unreal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 2:29 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

Given the commentaries frequent praise of truthfulness, it would be quite in conformity with them to say that one doesn't care if one doesn't care.

.

Saccena vinā sīlādīnaṃ asambhavato paṭiññānurūpaṃ paṭipattiyā abhāvato ca.
Saccadhammātikame ca sabbapāpadhammānaṃ samosaraṇato. Asaccasandhassa
apaccayikabhāvato āyatiṇca anādeyyavacanatāvahanato. Sampannasaccassa ca,
sabbaguṇādhiṭṭhānabhāvato. Saccādhīṭṭhānena sabbabodhisambhārānaṃ
pārisuddhipāripūrisāmatthiyato.

“Without truthfulness, the qualities of moral habit and so on are impossible, and there can be no practice in accordance with one's vows. All evil dhammas converge upon the transgression of truth. One who is not devoted to truth is unreliable and his word cannot be accepted in the future. On the other hand, one devoted to truth secures the foundation of all noble qualities. With truthfulness as the foundation, he is capable of purifying and fulfilling all the requisites of enlightenment.”

(Cariyā-a. 299-300)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 10:00 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

What I meant by "I don't care..." is "I attach no importance to..."

Whether or not it's fitting to attach no importance to someone's views on Dhamma depends, I think, on who the person is. For example, if I hear that scholars of the calibre of Bhikkhus Bodhi or Anālayo, or Professors Gethin or Harvey, have voiced some view differing from my own, then I would care. I would want to look into the matter to see what texts and what chain of reasoning had led them to their views. As these are men who've earned the right to have their views on Dhamma taken seriously, to dismiss anything they say without troubling to investigate it would strike me as rash and imprudent.

But in the case of the Layt — and for reasons that I'm sure are as obvious to you as they are to me — the boot's on the other foot.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 12:11 PM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

They would be relevant in cases where a different sense of "to care" is intended by the speaker and where "I don't care" would mean more or less: "I don't have mettā and karuṇā."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 4:44 PM

Title: Re: Garava Sutta - Pali translation assistance

Content:

while the latter is favoured by Ven. Sujāto along with the Thai translators of both Mahachula and Mahamakut Universities.

I'll address the other questions later unless someone beats me to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 6:10 PM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

It might get to you less if you would do the monk the courtesy of accepting his clarification of what he means: "I attach no importance to..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 9, 2018 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Garava Sutta - Pali translation assistance

Content:

When a noun is used as the initial or medial item in a compound it will most often take its pre-inflected form (i.e., the form in which it is listed in most dictionaries). And so sāvakānaṃ saṅgha (community of disciples), for example, will become sāvakasaṅgha, not sāvakānaṃsaṅgha. In the case of saddhammagaruno, the compound is to be analysed as saddhamme (locative singular) + garuno. When made into a compound saddhamme reverts to its pre-inflected form: saddhamma.

As for saddhammo, this is in the nominative case as the subject-patient of a passive sentence: saddhammo garukātabbo, "the Good Dhamma should be revered." But as mentioned already, most translators have opted to translate it as the object of an active sentence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 10, 2018 8:06 AM

Title: Re: Accusative Case vs Locative Case

Content:

Dative: ñātinaṃ, relatives.

Accusative: suciṃ paṇītaṃ ... kappiyaṃ pānabhojanaṃ, pure, excellent, suitable drink and food

2. With other verbs it's merely a grammatical convention that this verb governs this case and that verb governs that case. Semantically there's no discernible reason for it.

3. Sometimes it's uncertain whether a verb is an example of #1 or #2.

4. Some verbs are inconsistent with regard to which case they govern. For example, the object of dubbhati (to injure) will sometimes be in the locative and sometimes in the dative (and for no obvious reason).

In the case of nibbindati I would be inclined to class it as #3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 10, 2018 10:54 AM

Title: Re: What are these Ajahn Chah sangha monks' names?

Content:

Possibly the American monk Ajahn Santacitto (now the layman Stephen Saslav). But I'm not certain since I never got to meet Santacitto in person.

<https://www.budsas.org/ebud/see-way/love-and.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 10, 2018 11:34 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 10, 2018 1:41 PM

Title: Re: Prediabetes

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 11, 2018 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Garava Sutta - Pali translation assistance

Content:

This passage has generated a lot of discussion among scholars on account of its use of the accusative form dukkhasamudayaṃ (and later dukkhanirodhaṃ), when what the reader would expect to see are the masculine nominative forms dukkhasamudayo and dukkhanirodho.

In the first of the links below Bhikkhu Anālayo summarizes the various hypotheses that have been advanced to resolve the problem. The other files and links are to some of the works that he refers to.

Bhikkhu Anālayo, 2006. The Ekottarika-āgama Parallel to the Saccavibhaṅga-sutta and the Four (Noble) Truths". Buddhist Studies Review, 23.2: 145–153.

<https://journals.equinoxpub.com/index.php/BSR/article/view/734>

Peter Harvey, 2009. The Four Ariya-saccas as 'True Realities for the Spiritually Ennobled'— the Painful, its Origin, its Cessation, and the Way Going to This – Rather than 'Noble Truths' Concerning These". Buddhist Studies Review, 26.2:197–227.

https://www.academia.edu/33846046/The_Four_Ariya-saccas_as_True_Realities_for_the_Spiritually_Ennobled_the_Painful_its_Origin_its_Cessation_and_the_Way_Going_to_This_Rather_than_Noble_Truths_Concerning_These

Rune Johansson, 1973. Pali Buddhist Texts Explained to the Beginner, 23-5.

[./download/file.php?id=4288](#)

(337.02 KiB) Downloaded 102 times

Also of interest, though I can't find an online copy:

K.R. Norman, 1984. "The Four Noble Truths: A Problem of Pāli Syntax". In L.A. Hercus (ed.), Indological and Buddhist Studies, Volume in Honour of Professor J.W. de Jong on his 60th birthday, 377–391, Delhi: Sri Satguru.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 11, 2018 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Garava Sutta - Pali translation assistance

Content:

And for readers of German this is the 1940 article that first broached the problem:

Friedrich Weller. Über die Formel der vier edlen Wahrheiten. Orientalistische Literaturzeitung, 43.3/4: 73–79.

./download/file.php?id=4289
(155.45 KiB) Downloaded 226 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 12, 2018 7:32 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

... a convention contradicted by a wealth of citations from native English speakers.

In the Araṇavibhaṅgasutta this is called samaññāya atisāra, "an overstepping of agreed usage."

"Here, bhikkhus, insistence on provincialisms and overstepping of agreed usage is a state beset by suffering, vexation, despair, and fever, and it is the wrong way. Therefore this is a state with conflict.

"Here, bhikkhus, non-insistence on provincialisms and non-overstepping of agreed usage is a state without suffering, vexation, despair, and fever, and it is the right way. Therefore this is a state without conflict.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 12, 2018 7:34 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

The writers and Oxford lexicographers were cited by me to illustrate English usage, not to serve as exemplars of any particular moral excellence. That being so, the extent to which they evince goodwill and good faith is quite beside the point.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 12, 2018 10:24 AM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

To "deprogram" those who mistakenly believe themselves to have attained it, since the real sotāpanna and the delusional puthujjana may both feel certitude.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 12, 2018 3:45 PM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

Collectively all those that deal with the subject of vicikicchā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 13, 2018 8:24 AM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 13, 2018 9:44 AM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

The Ratanasutta doesn't specify exactly how naughty it's possible for sotāpannas to be (a much debated subject on which Dhamma Wheel already has several threads). It says only: (1) that they are incapable of committing the "six great crimes", and (2) that any evil karmas of body, speech or mind that they do commit will not be concealed by them. The six great crimes are the usual five (patricide, matricide, etc.) together with taking refuge in an outside teacher.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kp6>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 13, 2018 11:41 AM

Title: Re: Bollywood Buddha ZeeTV series

Content:

In the Canon the Nālaka Sutta

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/snp3.11>

And in the Commentaries the Nidānakathā pp. 157-9 (with the name Kāḷa Devala)

<https://archive.org/details/buddhistbirth00daviuoft>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 13, 2018 12:01 PM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

I don't think that follows. "[He] often did not leave until 11 p.m." doesn't mean that he never left until that time. Also the Scotch Congregationalists were pretty strict sabbatarians in those days, so on Sunday he could have spent the morning preaching and the afternoon playing with sand-monsters.

.

Murray and the Monster.jpg (19.05 KiB) Viewed 2616 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 13, 2018 3:24 PM

Title: Re: On not caring

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 14, 2018 9:47 PM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

Oh? Are you referring to the ten <https://www.amazon.com/Mahasutras-P-Skilling/dp/0860133745> and suchlike or do you mean that the canon contains complete Āgamas?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 14, 2018 10:34 PM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

It was stated in a post by Malcolm Smith on the old E-sangha, but I didn't keep a copy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 15, 2018 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

There is no mention in your link of even one Āgama. The sūtra sub-link in it consists

mostly of Mahāyāna sūtras, with the Āgamic texts being limited to the handful of mahāsūtras.

<http://read.84000.co/section/O1JC114941JC14668.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 15, 2018 11:16 PM

Title: Re: Labyrinths and Mazes

Content:

For the rest of the story...

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j2/j2134.htm>

It's not exactly a maze, but certainly a very tortuous route that the parrot has to take to find the "middle mango".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 16, 2018 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Tantric Theravada?

Content:

I don't think that was universally the case. Many a Ch'an/Zen master, for example, was also a Tripitaka master, and one didn't become one of those without knowing the Āgama sūtras. Dōgen Zenji, for example, in his Shōbōgenzō seems to cite the Āgamas nearly as often as he does Mahāyāna texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 16, 2018 10:57 AM

Title: Re: Buddhists and copyright

Content:

In the Vinaya smuggling goods through customs to avoid paying duty on them is theft, even though nothing is taken. Here the theft consists not in taking but in evading what one ought to pay.

I think those who argue that adinnādāna necessarily involves the physical movement of something are being over-literal in a way that they almost certainly wouldn't be with any of the other precepts. Nobody argues, for example, that it's not false speech when you tell a deliberate lie in a written letter or a Morse code message, on the grounds that you're not actually speaking.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 16, 2018 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Why did the Buddha's monks shave their heads & beards?

Content:

However, the rule happens to appear in the midst of a lot of other rules that are aimed at curtailing vanity, and so it's widely assumed that this is likely to be the purpose here too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 17, 2018 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Why did the Buddha's monks shave their heads & beards?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 17, 2018 8:23 AM

Title: Re: Why did the Buddha's monks shave their heads & beards?

Content:

It's a term that stands for any kind of clothes that are characteristic of householders. Paccekabuddhas are gone-forth persons and so dress accordingly in rags.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 18, 2018 6:43 PM

Title: Re: Harry, Meghan and my Papañca

Content:

You can cheer yourself up with this delightful talk by historian David Starkey who takes a rather more optimistic view.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 18, 2018 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Harry, Meghan and my Papañca

Content:

A positive regard for monarchy is something that any classical Theravadin might arrive at upon discovering that the Buddha's conception of the social contract was essentially a prefiguration of that found in Hobbes's Leviathan. Having said that, I've never heard of any monastery where being a royalist was either a job requirement or something that the community would attempt to instil in an ordination candidate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 18, 2018 9:20 PM

Title: Re: no birth without rebirth

Content:

The belief that a certain stage arrived at early in a Bodhisattva's career is the equivalent of stream-entry is a doctrinal innovation peculiar to the Mahayana's daśa-bhūmi conception of the path to Buddhahood. It's not to be found in any early Buddhist texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 18, 2018 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Why can't conceit and wrong view arise together?

Content:

An additional reason is that when wrong view is present, then the proximate cause of conceit is absent, the latter being diṭṭhivippayutta-lobha, greed dissociated from wrong view.

As for the example you give, the Abhidhamma doesn't deny that conceit and wrong view may sometimes arise in close temporal propinquity, nor that there may be causal relations between one and the other. All that's denied is the possibility of their simultaneous presence in one and the same citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Why can't conceit and wrong view arise together?

Content:

It will be better if you ask again after finishing the second chapter, for then you'll have a better grasp of the general characteristics of cittas and cetasikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 2:56 AM

Title: Re: no birth without rebirth

Content:

Among Indian Buddhist schools a gandhabba/gandharva was universally understood to be a deceased being who was about to be reborn. I don't think there were any dissenting opinions on this point.

What they did disagree about was the nature of the being in question. The schools which held to the doctrine of an intermediate state claimed that it was a subtle-bodied being or (in the case of the Pudgalavādins) an indescribable being who was waiting in

that intermediate state. The schools which held to instantaneous rebirth (which includes the Theravāda) maintained that it was only conventional truth to speak of the gandhabba as a being; in ultimate truth the gandhabba was a term for the rebirth-linking consciousness.

By the way, the article on the gandhabba by Wijesekera (the one praised by Bhikkhus Bodhi and Sujāto) is available online. You'll find it on pages 176-212 of his Buddhist and Vedic Studies.

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.463583>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 11:22 AM

Title: Re: Harry, Meghan and my Papañca

Content:

Reuters TV will start its coverage online at 4:30 ET. Here's a <https://www.reuters.tv/live> if you'd like to watch. They will also be streaming via https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__itunes.apple.com_us_app_reuters-2Dtv_id944245256&d=CwMFaQ&c=4ZIZThykDLcoWk-GVjSLm9hvvzvGv0FLoWSRuCSs5Q&r=kTRVny-p3a9nLlpEIVjMcC-id0cvgdSEKb6dpLOEhwl&m=ezQTZR_7C7NvJ5iWqDlEro7jz7pPZ_lcvZwPKpPx35M&s=zxFKPvlkjVI9q7KoCgkqh6s9ujJ6uFyS1TTVcUtBug&e= and https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__play.google.com_store_apps_details-3Fid-3Dcom.thomsonreuters.reuterstv&d=CwMFaQ&c=4ZIZThykDLcoWk-GVjSLm9hvvzvGv0FLoWSRuCSs5Q&r=kTRVny-p3a9nLlpEIVjMcC-id0cvgdSEKb6dpLOEhwl&m=ezQTZR_7C7NvJ5iWqDlEro7jz7pPZ_lcvZwPKpPx35M&s=EnlPwTlzM4_CTBOkqnnhkrPdxp4AF_32PuWnmm_WOaA&e= apps, https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__channelstore.roku.com_details_114091_reuterstv&d=DwMFaG&c=B73tqXN8Ec0ocRmZHMcntw&r=a01O9QqtYwkBhERK3zjeACzdWyzF0S18P8yb6uBevAo&m=J-1clk7oOMope-Oqf-DQ6DWfoqhU9rdDig3hM-ofP_c&s=mXe5rp74RPb6b9VBb6Hiliqea4I00B_N__0WllYEdrk&e=, https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.amazon.com_Thomson-2DReuters-2DTV-2DVideo-2DNews_dp_B075RDWBG9&d=DwMFaG&c=B73tqXN8Ec0ocRmZHMcntw&r=a01O9QqtYwkBhERK3zjeACzdWyzF0S18P8yb6uBevAo&m=J-1clk7oOMope-Oqf-DQ6DWfoqhU9rdDig3hM-ofP_c&s=VWRM-tvUPLMXtkU6WDY5_cPuwStTR9E3h1_4mG6tZZU&e= and https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__itunes.apple.com_us_app_reuters-2Dtv-2DVideo-2Dnews_id944245256-3Fmt-3D8&d=DwMFaG&c=B73tqXN8Ec0ocRmZHMcntw&r=a01O9QqtYwkBhERK3zjeACzdWyzF0S18P8yb6uBevAo&m=J-1clk7oOMope-Oqf-DQ6DWfoqhU9rdDig3hM-ofP_c&s=9Z2N4xTSYx_X5-FSAchRCBrvPAXDt9Y1fBPNmSoCKYw&e=

<https://www.vanityfair.com/style/2018/05/royal-wedding-order-of-service, including two unexpected musical choices.>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 4:01 PM

Title: Re: no birth without rebirth

Content:

If he had, then he would have stayed around for only seven lives at the most. As it is, no such thing is mentioned in either of the Ghaṭikāra Suttas (M.ii.46-8; S.i.34-5), which report only that Jotipāla was inspired with Kassapa Buddha's teaching and became a bhikkhu.

The Buddhavaṃsa (Bu. 62) adds that he mastered the ninefold dispensation and that Kassapa Buddha predicted his buddhahood.

The Milindapañha (Mil. 223) has him attaining the samāpattis and mundane abhiññās, and then getting reborn in the Brahmā world. It's also (along with the Apadāna) the source of the belief that it was Jotipāla's insulting speech about Kassapa that made it necessary for him to practise austerities for six years as Gotama.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 5:43 PM

Title: Re: Why can't conceit and wrong view arise together?

Content:

To revert to your earlier example, suppose a Christian thinks to herself: "(1) Christians will go to heaven for ever; (2) Buddhists will go to hell for ever; (3) Going to heaven is better than going to hell; (4) Therefore it's better to be a Christian than a Buddhist; (5) I'm a Christian; (6) Therefore I'm better than I would be if I were a Buddhist; (7) And if I'm better than I would be if I were a Buddhist, then I must be better than anyone who is in fact a Buddhist."

Some of these thoughts are reflections based on wrong view, while others are reflections involving conceited comparison of oneself with another. Isn't it self-evident that the Christian can't be doing the two things at the same time? In any moment when she is occupied with thinking about the implications of Christian eschatology, then she's not occupied with comparing herself with another. In any moment when she's occupied with comparing herself with another, then she's not occupied with thinking about Christian eschatology.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 19, 2018 5:49 PM

Title: Re: Cakkhu Sutta SN 18.1. The Eye, etc.

Content:

I would want to read Mun-keat's article before commenting.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 20, 2018 2:33 AM

Title: Re: no birth without rebirth

Content:

My belief (and that of Theravāda orthodoxy) is that all rebirths are instantaneous. I suspect that the concept of an intermediate state was invented by corrupt branches of the sangha, probably with the aim of: (1) pandering to the desires of mourners for a more consolatory view of the afterlife and (2) making money out of them. (I won't, however, be drawn into an argument on the subject, for it's already been flogged to death).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 20, 2018 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Why can't conceit and wrong view arise together?

Content:

There is no general answer to this. Rather, it's a question would need to be addressed on a case by case basis. In some cases it's very easy to understand why two cetasikas couldn't arise together, e.g., sloth with restlessness, or sympathetic joy with envy, or wisdom with delusion. In other cases we need to give careful attention to all four items in the cetasika's fourfold description, i.e. not just its characteristic but also its function, manifestation and proximate cause.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 22, 2018 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Trump and the NHS

Content:

Trump Derangement Syndrome

<http://knowyourmeme.com/memes/trump-derangement-syndrome>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 22, 2018 1:53 PM

Title: Re: Harry, Meghan and my Papañca

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 30, 2018 8:29 AM

Title: Re: Can I apply Anatta to inanimate objects?

Content:

A living body is “with consciousness” (saviññāṇaka) while a dead one is “with consciousness departed” (apetaviññāṇa).

“Before long, alas, this body will lie on the earth, discarded, with consciousness departed, like a useless log of wood.”

(Dhammapada 41)

“Before long my body, with consciousness departed, will be carried to the charnel ground, discarded like a log of wood, despised even by my own relatives.”

(Therīgāthā verses of Sumedhā Therī)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 30, 2018 9:52 AM

Title: Re: Can I apply Anatta to inanimate objects?

Content:

1. The Pali terms used for living beings in the context of the first precept (i.e., satta and pāṇa) don't include plants.

2. One Pali term for living beings that does (in some contexts) include plants (i.e. bhūta) is never used in connection with the first precept.

3. In the monastic Vinaya the rule that prohibits the damaging of plants is entirely separate from those relating to the killing of living beings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 30, 2018 10:06 AM

Title: Re: The best UFO report I've ever read

Content:

Which rather suggests that it might be an advertising gimmick by Ferrero, the Italian confectionery manufacturers. They're a pretty shameless lot who'll stop at nothing to get people to buy their teeth-rotting piddling little mints, at one point even appropriating Dick Tracy in pursuit of this end.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 30, 2018 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Not Feeling the Breath

Content:

Peter Harvey, with whom I've been taking an online meditation course for the last six months, lays a lot of stress on diaphragmatic breathing. One source that he recommended to me and which I found very helpful is a series of six videos by the singing instructor Marnell Sample:

<https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLE6sSBqFLoybs5HwL48E7Dy6MCZFfb-ug>

The second video is particularly good.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 31, 2018 4:43 AM

Title: Re: Compassion for Women

Content:

That's true with regard to the fifth and eighth bhikkhuni pārājika rules, where the same acts would be the lesser (though still weighty) offence of saṅghādisesa if committed by a bhikkhu.

On the other hand, homosexual acts on the part of a bhikkhu would be pārājika if they involved penetration, while lesbian acts on the part of a bhikkhuni would at most be pācittiyas. Masturbation by a monk is a saṅghādisesa, but again only a pācittiya for a bhikkhuni.

The Vinaya has lots of asymmetries like this. Though I've never bothered to do it, I suspect that if one counted up all those where bhikkhus are held to a stricter standard than bhikkhunis, and then all those where bhikkhunis are held to a stricter standard than bhikkhus, they'd roughly balance each other out.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 31, 2018 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Compassion for Women

Content:

I think Ajahn Thanissaro's introduction to his Buddhist Monastic Code is a fine overview of how one should go about interpreting Vinaya.

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/vinaya/bmc/Section0006.html>

As to how it should be followed, see the Non-Derive Suttas in the AN's Book of the Sevens:

<https://suttacentral.net/an7>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 31, 2018 9:44 PM

Title: Re: What is the Vipaka of Samatha meditation?

Content:

Samatha-bhāvanā and its synonym samatha-kammaṭṭhāna are mainly commentarial terms, though the former does occur once in the Piṇḍapāṭapārisuddhi Sutta in the uncompounded genitive form samatha-vipassanānaṃ bhāvanāya.

More common in the suttas are expressions involving the verb bhāveti from which bhāvanā derives:

samathaṃ bhāveti - develops samatha.

samathapubbaṅgamaṃ bhāveti - develops samatha first.

samatho bhāvito - samatha [that is/has been] developed.

samatho bhāvetabbo - samatha should be developed.

samathaṃ bhāvayato - of one developing samatha.

bhāvehi samathaṃ - Develop samatha!

Other sutta expressions include:

samathanimittaṃ yonisomanasikārabahulikāro - one who makes much of proper attention to the samatha sign.

cetosamathamanyuttā viharatha - Dwell devoted to mental samatha!

samathaṃ paṭipādesiṃ - I practised samatha.

cetosamathe yogo karaṇīyo - devotion with regard to mental samatha is [something] to be done.

ajjhataṃ cetosamathaṃ anuyuñjati - he pursues mental samatha internally.

paccattaṃ samathaṃ labhāmi - I personally obtain samatha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 1, 2018 9:32 AM

Title: Re: What is the Vipaka of Samatha meditation?

Content:

If samatha is developed to the point of appanā-samādhī, the vipākas are (1) rebirth in a Brahmā realm and (2) the form-realm resultant consciousnesses (rūpāvacara-vipākacitta) that arise while dwelling there (and which cannot arise in any other realm).

If samatha development falls short of appanā-samādhī, the types of vipāka will be the same as those produced by sense-sphere great wholesome consciousnesses on any occasion of doing something meritorious.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 1, 2018 4:49 PM

Title: Re: What is the Vipaka of Samatha meditation?

Content:

It should be 'inferior', not 'minor'.

In the commentaries each jhāna is called inferior (hīna) if the yogi has just attained it, 'medium' (majjhima) if it's been developed to a limited extent, and 'superior' (paṇīta) if it's been mastered. Each of the three leads to rebirth in a successively higher Brahmā realm.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 1:04 AM

Title: Re: What is the Vipaka of Samatha meditation?

Content:

It's classifying it as a sense-sphere consciousness rather than a form-sphere one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 4:06 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha predict world revolution?

Content:

The Mahāsupina Jātaka's sixteen dreams are the only thing in your link that is from the Pali texts. All the other prophetic material is Thai home-grown stuff, mainly from the outer fringes of the forest tradition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 8:26 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha predict world revolution?

Content:

As are the Mahayana sutras, the Burmese Zandok (folk Jātaka) literature, the Thai Mahamalai, Tibetan termas, channelled messages of Elizabeth Clare Prophet, dialogues of Bahauallah with the Buddha in the Bahai heaven, and much else whose attribution to the historical Buddha no scholar worth his salt would take seriously.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 2:52 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha predict world revolution?

Content:

Then I think you may be in for a long search. The ajahn in question is an indiscriminating writer of sensationalist works that draw upon anything and everything prophetic or New Agey that he happens to have heard about (Mother Shipton, Shirley MacLaine, Nostradamus, Taoists, Native Americans... etc.).

If you an especial interest in the prophetic content of the Pali suttas, I would recommend you start with the Anāgatabhayāni Suttas ("Discourses on Future Dangers") in the Aṅguttara Nikāya's Book of the Fives. (Though I should warn you that you might be a little disappointed if you're hoping to find the kind of claptrap that was in your link).

<https://suttacentral.net/an5>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 3:07 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha predict world revolution?

Content:

You will probably have better luck at Palungjit, a Thai language forum aimed at those for whom Buddhism is chiefly about thaumaturgy rather than liberation.

<https://palungjit.org/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 8:38 PM

Title: Re: Brahma Sutta AN 4.63. Brahma Sutta

Content:

Here's the complete article:

.

[./download/file.php?id=4386](#)

(350.13 KiB) Downloaded 425 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 2, 2018 9:51 PM

Title: Re: What was the first book of suttas you read?

Content:

On my own.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 3, 2018 2:46 PM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Politics

Content:

Also, with regard to the Cakkavattī Sutta itself some people draw a quite different lesson from the redistributive part of it than that drawn by left-wing Buddhists. I remember when the sutta came up for discussion in a Facebook group for Buddhist conservatives and libertarians there were no fewer than five different readings (one socialist and four conservative - MRDA!) proposed and defended.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 7:49 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Politics

Content:

It's the two Goose King birth stories (Mahāhaṃsa Jātaka and Cullaḥaṃsa Jātaka) in the PTS romanised Pali edition. Translations:

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j5/j5027.htm>

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j5/j5026.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 8:45 AM

Title: Re: How to say "Thank You"

Content:

In his Aids to Pali Conversation and Translation Rev. A.P. Buddhadatta gives “Thuti atthu,” – most likely a modern coinage.

https://dhamma.ru/paali/aids_to_pali_conversation.pdf

In Pali texts the idiomatic functional equivalents would be “anumodanā” (when the person being thanked has done something meritorious), “sādhū”, and “sundaram”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 9:22 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Politics

Content:

I don't know. I'm afraid Sutta Central doesn't work on my computer - I just get blank pages.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 9:54 AM

Title: Re: The Story of the Hero

Content:

The link seems to have changed.

<https://kusalagavesi.wordpress.com/1eng/>

The story is quite similar to Ven. Ānanda Maitreya's Pseudo-Pilgrims.

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=21&t=23368>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 10:39 AM

Title: Re: How to say "Thank You"

Content:

On any occasion when you wish to express approval or appreciation for what another has said or done. If what has been said or done has been said or done for your benefit, then saying "sādhū" would be a speech-act identical to saying "thank you".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 5, 2018 2:14 PM

Title: Re: The Story of the Hero

Content:

Other than the shared theme of liberation I don't see much resemblance myself. The main point of Ven. A.M's story —the subsequent concealing of the path to liberation— has no parallel in Plato's cave allegory.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Allegory_of_the_Cave

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2018 1:08 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha predict world revolution?

Content:

Thais with a serious interest in Dhamma don't waste their time talking to the gullible nitwits at the Palungjit Forum. This is where they go:

larndham.org

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2018 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Happy Birthday Ven Dhammanando!

Content:

Thank you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2018 9:22 AM

Title: Re: Does Theravada have a practice similar to Tonglen in Mahayana?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2018 1:00 PM

Title: Re: Should Buddhist monks read a passage from Sutta Pitaka when attending to funeral blessings?

Content:

In Sri Lanka isn't it already the custom to recite the Salla Sutta at funerals? I'd always supposed that it was because it's given as such in the chanting book of the Chiswick Vihāra, a Sri Lankan temple in London.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/snp3.8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 6, 2018 2:12 PM

Title: Re: Should Buddhist monks read a passage from Sutta Pitaka when attending to funeral blessings?

Content:

The most widespread practice in Thailand is that each evening four monks will be invited to recite the *mātika* to each of the seven books of the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* while seated beside the coffin, either at the deceased's home or in a special funeral *sālā* in the local *wat*. This is usually done each evening for at least three days before the cremation. The *Abhidhamma* recitation may or may not be accompanied by a sermon by the senior monk present, though it nearly always will be on the day of the cremation. The practice is premised on the popular belief in an intermediate state: the spirit of the deceased is assumed to be still hanging around the body and chanting *Abhidhamma* encourages it to move on.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 8, 2018 1:33 PM

Title: Re: Is the term "cessation of greed, hatred & delusion" in the suttas?

Content:

Then in the *peyyālas* to this passage:

1. *Abhiññāya* is replaced with *pariññāya*, *parikkhayāya*, *pahānāya*, *khayāya*, *vayāya*, *virāgāya*, *nirodhāya*, *cāgāya*, and *paṭinissaggāya*.

2. *Rāgassa* is replaced with *dosassa*, *mohassa* ... *kodhassa*, *upanāhassa*, *makkhassa*, *paḷāsassa*, *issāya*, *macchariyassa*, *māyāya*, *sāṭheyyassa*, *thambhassa*, *sārambhassa*, *mānassa*, *atimānassa*, *madassa* and *pamādassa*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 8, 2018 9:03 PM

Title: Re: The Idea of the Historical Buddha

Content:

That wasn't originally a name, but rather an epithet based on his tribe. It's rarely used in early Buddhist texts but assumed great importance in Mahayana ones, where it became in effect the normative name for the Buddha, the earlier names and epithets being largely sidelined by it. As the pioneering Pali scholar Robert C. Childers remarked: "It is rather as if some eccentric Christian sect were to insist on Jesus being referred to in no other way than "Lion of the Tribe of Judah."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 9, 2018 11:24 AM

Title: Re: Have you used the thematic guide to the Numerical Discourses (AN)?

Content:

None of the above.

Unless it's something like Finnegans Wake or Being and Time I generally prefer to read books unguided.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 10, 2018 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Have you used the thematic guide to the Numerical Discourses (AN)?

Content:

All the passages that logical positivists love to quote when they're heaping ridicule on the whole thing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 10, 2018 2:28 PM

Title: Re: Have you used the thematic guide to the Numerical Discourses (AN)?

Content:

At present the works of Heidegger are of no interest to me at all. I did, however, read Being and Time in 1986 as there was something of a craze for existentialism and phenomenology among Western bhikkhus in Thailand and I wanted to see what the fuss was all about.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 10, 2018 2:45 PM

Title: Re: Purge of Thai sangha

Content:

I think keeping a regular concubine would probably be the least common way for unchaste monks to pursue their irregularities. As it isn't something that laypeople would tolerate, any monk doing so would need to do it secretly, which for most monks would be logistically impossible. For example, in Thailand if a monk is seen regularly spending the night at the home of a single woman, widow or divorcee, then the neighbours are likely to phone the police, who will then launch a nighttime raid on the house. Likewise if a woman is seen sneaking into a monk's quarters after dark.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 11, 2018 4:48 PM

Title: Re: Khmer Temple Song/Chanting for Nirvana Day

Content:

As the word gets inconsistently romanised as smot, smut, smaut, smoth ... etc., you'll probably find a lot more using the Khmer spelling: ស្លូត

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 11, 2018 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Should Buddhist monks read a passage from Sutta Pitaka when attending to funeral blessings?

Content:

Actually the rites do sometimes go on for a long time here too, especially for senior monks, aristocracy and royalty. The heat isn't a problem as most wats nowadays are equipped with long yen - large, ornate, refrigerator coffins inside which the smaller wooden coffin will be placed. From a long yen manufacturer's advert:

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 12, 2018 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Should Buddhist monks read a passage from Sutta Pitaka when attending to funeral blessings?

Content:

It wouldn't be very good for that purpose as there is only one opening at the coffin's end. So once you'd drunk the lemonade near the entrance you would have to crawl inside the freezing-cold coffin to reach the bottles further away.

For keeping one's drinks cool a more suitable option would be this coffin with an air-conditioning device embedded in the lid:

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 12, 2018 7:56 PM

Title: Re: On Impossibility of Guiding the Dead to a Better Destination by the Living Kin

Content:

I believe this too corresponds to some different term in the suttas, but what it is escapes my memory at the moment. I'll let you know when it comes back to me.

In any case, in the form of the verb pattānumodati we first meet with pattānumodanā in the Yasodharā section of the Therī Apadāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 13, 2018 12:16 AM

Title: Re: milestone for western Theravada:

Content:

Done.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 13, 2018 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Should Buddhist monks read a passage from Sutta Pitaka when attending to funeral blessings?

Content:

Yes. And then on the day of the cremation this one is chanted just before the pyre is lit:

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/books/ChantingGuide/Section0045.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 14, 2018 11:56 AM

Title: Re: Gradual practice

Content:

May I ask what you mean when you speak of the Nepali boy being able to confirm his claims? Are you referring just to his ability to sit for lengthy periods or is there something more than this?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 14, 2018 5:14 PM

Title: Re: What is merit?

Content:

As others have said, merit is synonymous with wholesome kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 14, 2018 6:26 PM

Title: Re: What is merit?

Content:

It was indeed. Thank you!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 14, 2018 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Shambhala international

Content:

You can find one <http://www.bartleby.com/40/51.html>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 15, 2018 4:01 PM

Title: Re: in my opinion the buddha knew science and technology

Content:

What bearing does this have on the thread's topic?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 17, 2018 2:01 AM

Title: Re: Ten grounds Vs Eighteen grounds of a schism

Content:

One is preserved in the the Anguttara Nikāya's Book of the Tens and so perforce must comprise ten items; the other is in the Vinaya Piṭaka, where it is not subject to such a numerical constraint.

Both lists are correct, but in the list of eighteen, items 11 to 18 are to be understood as an expanded enumeration of items 9 and 10 common to both lists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 17, 2018 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Reading Mahayana books

Content:

"Kaśyapa/Kassapa" is a one of the gotra names for those of the brahmin class, and so there are quite a few disciples with this name.

The Kassapa/Kaśyapa whom Chinese Ch'an Buddhists made their first Indian patriarch is a different character from the fire-worshipping Kassapa whose conversion swelled the ranks of the early saṅgha. The former was Mahākassapa, aka Pippali; the latter were three brothers, Uruveḷakassapa, Gayākassapa, and Nadīkassapa, along with their respective disciples.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 17, 2018 4:33 PM
Title: Re: Reading Mahayana books
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 17, 2018 7:57 PM
Title: Re: Reading Mahayana books
Content:

I think that in general the tendency in the Theravada is for teachers to be assessed on their merits, rather than on fictitious connection to some lineal forebears. Exceptions to this are rare, but one does meet with them occasionally, for example in the case of the U Ba Khin tradition.

<http://www.vridhamma.org/Myanmar-Teacher-Disciple-Tradition>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 18, 2018 8:04 AM
Title: Re: Reading Mahayana books
Content:

I once met a member of Soka Gakkai who had never even heard of the four truths and eightfold path, but I think this was rather exceptional. In general Mahayanists will be acquainted with them and will accept them as foundational.

As to where they learn them from, with the Tibetans the primary source is probably Vasubandhu's auto-commentary to his Abhidharmakośa; with East Asians it's the Āgama sūtras and/or the older strata of Prajñāpāramitā sūtras.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 18, 2018 8:23 AM
Title: Re: Reading Mahayana books
Content:

Probably. At least here in Thailand a Tripitaka cabinet containing the hundred or so volumes of the Chinese Tripitaka seems to be a standard feature in the Chinese and Vietnamese temples that I've visited.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 20, 2018 7:23 AM
Title: Re: Ten grounds Vs Eighteen grounds of a schism
Content:
te imehi dasahi vatthūhi

Thanissaro: On the basis of these eighteen grounds...
Bodhi & Sujāto: On these ten grounds...

All three translators have treated the case as ablative in form but locative in meaning. To do that is to favour an exceptional and esoteric possibility over a normal-practice one. I would treat it as a common-or-garden ablative of cause:

"Because of these ten grounds..."

For āveṇi I prefer Thanissaro and Bodhi's "separately" to Sujāto's "autonomously". The latter adds a degree of complexity that is not present in the Pali term.

The other differences seem to be matters of phrasing rather than meaning.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 24, 2018 2:37 AM
Title: Re: bad knees. want to ordain. is it possible?
Content:

There are plenty of monasteries in Thailand where meditation practice is an entirely solitary activity, undertaken in the privacy of one's kuti, and so you would be free to sit in a chair. In such a place the only times you would need to sit on the floor would be during the fortnightly Pātimokkha recital, which takes about 45 minutes, and (in wats where communal eating is mandatory) during the morning meal, which would be for about 20 minutes.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 24, 2018 4:32 AM
Title: Re: bad knees. want to ordain. is it possible?
Content:

Most wats affiliated with Burmese dry insight traditions like that of Mahasi Sayadaw, and quite a number of wats affiliated with the Dhammayutt forest tradition of Ajahn Mun, would fit the description I gave in my earlier post. But as to which particular wats would be good for Westerners to train in, I'm afraid I can't really advise you. I've been living mostly alone and isolated for some years, have seldom travelled anywhere or met any other Western monks; consequently I'm completely out of the loop and behind the times with regard to suitable and unsuitable wats.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 25, 2018 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma disappears, could that mean..?

Content:

Dhamma in the sense of a phenomenon isn't the same as dhamma in the context of Dhamma-ending Age. In the case of the latter it is a Buddha's teaching that is referred to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 26, 2018 4:33 PM

Title: Re: full Buddhavamsa in English

Content:

Of the "translations" listed on the Wikipedia page....

1. Rev. Morris's isn't a translation at all but rather the PTS romanised Pali text.
2. U Vicittasārābhivamsa's is the writer's own narration of the lives of the twenty-four Buddhas. It happens to be an extremely good narration, but it's not a translation of the Buddhavamsa.
3. M.V. Takin's I'm not familiar with.
4. Those of Law and Horner are earlier and later PTS translations, respectively. As far as scholarly apparatus goes there isn't much to choose between them; both translators were capable Pali scholars and both were fond of footnotes. Though I haven't compared the two renderings against the Pali text, I suspect that Horner's will be the better one, both because it was done later than Law's and because Horner had also translated the commentary to it: published as Clarifier of the Sweet Meaning. Law's translation got a slightly unfavourable review from E.J. Thomas in the Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society, though this seems to have been prompted more by the reviewer's aversion to the content of the text than by the quality of the translation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 27, 2018 12:58 AM

Title: Re: Does a Buddha Suffer after Enlightenment

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 27, 2018 6:08 PM

Title: Re: Do buddhist monks need their parents approval to disrobe?

Content:

Obtaining their parents' approval is not a Vinaya requirement for sāmaṇeras to disrobe, but in practice it would virtually always be necessary if they haven't yet reached the age of majority. A Buddhist abbot with such young boys in his charge would exercise an in loco parentis responsibility comparable to that of the headmaster of a boarding school. And so like the headmaster, the abbot isn't just going to let a six-year-old unilaterally decide to quit and walk out unless he knows that the parents are agreeable to this and ready to receive their son.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 27, 2018 10:13 PM

Title: Re: Do buddhist monks need their parents approval to disrobe?

Content:

It isn't required by Vinaya and so in theory a monk could just change into lay clothes, walk out of the monastery and tell the first passing stranger he meets: "I'm giving up the training and returning to the lower life of a householder." In practice, however, it would be unthinkable to do it in such a casual way. Also in Thailand omitting the disrobing ceremony could result in legal difficulties for the ex-monk.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 29, 2018 6:56 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

The terms Lal lists are not stages in a citta's evolution but rather the synonyms for "citta", as given in the Niddesa and Paṭisambhidāmagga of the Sutta Piṭaka and the Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Vibhaṅga of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. The stages of a citta are referred to in the Abhidhamma commentaries as the sub-moments of arising, persistence and dissolution (uppāda, ṭhiti, bhaṅga).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 30, 2018 10:18 AM

Title: Re: Hell from doing metta?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 30, 2018 1:22 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

There are actually ten terms in all; your two articles inexplicably omit the mind-consciousness-element (manoviññādhātu).

None of the sources that you cite describe the ten terms as being stages in a citta's evolution. Nor do any other Pali texts describe them so.

On the other hand, many texts explicitly state that the terms are synonyms for citta. Indeed the author of the Nettipakaraṇa—which I understand is a text that meets with your approval—cites several of the terms for the precise purpose of illustrating what the word "simile" (vevacanaṃ) means. (See the Netti's Vevacanahāravibhaṅga, "Analysis of the Mode of Conveying Similes"; Nett. 53-4).

The very idea that a momentary citta might undergo some sort of change in character (e.g., a pure citta becoming impure, or vice versa) would contravene one of the most elementary premises of Abhidhammic momentarism, namely, that each momentary citta has but a single jāti. A citta of one jāti (e.g. a kusala citta) may arise, pass away and then be followed by a citta of a different jāti, but a citta does not undergo a change of jāti during the brief span of its existence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 1, 2018 10:05 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 1, 2018 1:13 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

If the terms are synonyms, then any arising of viññāṇa is an arising of viññāṇakkhandha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 21, 2018 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Which Sutta is this ?

Content:

It's from the Girimananda Sutta ... sort of. You won't find it, however, in the Girimananda Sutta as it's preserved in the Anguttara Nikaya. Rather it's from an early 20th century Thai paraphrase of the sutta by Somdet Upali, which came to be included in the syllabus for the Nak Tham course. The paraphrase is a very expansive one, perhaps a dozen times longer than the sutta itself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 24, 2018 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Loving kindness developed for 7 years

Content:

I don't think it offers any support for either of the competing opinions on this matter, for it concerns a bodhisatta. Though not a sotāpanna, a bodhisatta is by nature free from the possibility of rebirth in any of eighteen "inauspicious states" (abhabbaṭṭhānāni), one of which is hell.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/bodhisatta.html#TheBodhisattasCareer>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 25, 2018 8:19 AM

Title: Re: Incest (genetics)

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 25, 2018 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Non ill will in pali

Content:

I would say definition rather than translation. That is, in the Abhidhamma's treatment of the second factor of the Eightfold Path, thoughts of non-ill-will (abyāpāda-vitakkā) are equated with thoughts of mettā, and thoughts of non-harming (avihimsā-vitakkā) are equated with thoughts of karuṇā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 25, 2018 12:10 PM

Title: Re: When was Gotama a sotapanna?

Content:

In the Suttas' account of a Buddha's enlightenment he attains knowledge of the destruction of the āsavas in the third watch of the night.

In the more detailed commentarial account this destruction is effected by the arising of the four Ariyan path and fruition consciousnesses in rapid succession.

With the arising of the path of stream-entry, diṭṭhi āsava is destroyed.

With the arising of the path of once-returning, kāma āsava is weakened.

With the arising of the path of non-returning, kāma āsava is destroyed and bhava āsava weakened.

With the arising of the path of arahatta, bhava and avijjā āsava are destroyed.

So according to this understanding the Bodhisatta was a virtuous worldling (kalyāna-puthujjana) until the end of the middle watch of the night and then at some point during the last watch he was very briefly a sotāpanna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 25, 2018 4:51 PM

Title: Re: When was Gotama a sotapanna?

Content:

You mean the other two fetters? In the case of misapprehension of habitually undertaken and vowed observances (sīlabbataparāmāsa), this is regarded as a form of wrong view and so its destruction would be included in the destruction of diṭṭhi āsava.

In the case of doubt (vicikicchā), its destruction isn't mentioned when one is describing stream-entry in relation to the four āsavas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 26, 2018 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddha can't tell "yes I will"?

Content:

What's described in the quoted sutta is the Buddha's only way of responding affirmatively to the fifty or so invitations he gets in the Sutta and Vinaya Piṭakas. The same response is used regardless of the sex of the inviter, most of whom are male.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 27, 2018 1:53 AM

Title: Re: "ta" in arahatta

Content:

No, the ending is -tta (= Sanskrit -tva), the same as found in abstract nouns like naggattaṃ (the state of being naked, nakedness); nānattaṃ (the state of being diverse, diversity); mohattaṃ (the state of being deluded); sātattaṃ (sweetness), etc. As a former of abstract nouns it has the same function as -tā but the nouns that it forms are neuter rather than feminine.

If one wished to form a term for "arahantship" using the -tā suffix, then it would be arahantatā, but this is a very late and rare coinage found only in a couple of ṭīkāś from Sri Lanka's mediaeval period.

For arahattaṃ there is also the commentarial nirukti:

Arahattaṃ attani asantaṃ ‘atthi me’ ti

“Arahantship means the non-existence of [the conceit] ‘This is mine’ within oneself.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 27, 2018 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Avici hell

Content:

What makes Avīci Avīci is that the suffering undergone there has no pause or respite (vīci), not that it has no end.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 27, 2018 6:20 PM

Title: Re: Differences with the Pāḷi for chanting?

Content:

If you're chanting in a group use the group's preferred version. If you're chanting alone use whichever one you prefer. For example, when I recite the Suttanipāta in the privacy of my kuti I use my own version which is heavily informed by K.R. Norman's preferences among the variant readings. But when I'm chanting parittas with a group of Thai monks I'll use the Royal Siamese version of Suttanipāta parittas like the Karaṇīyametta, Ratana and Maṅgala Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 28, 2018 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Paradox of absence of imperative mood.

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 28, 2018 10:14 PM

Title: Re: pharitvā in brahmaviharas

Content:

You are confusing the verbs pharati and paharati. Pharitvā ("having pervaded") is the absolutive of the former, while that of the latter is paharitvā ("having beaten").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 29, 2018 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana experienced at mind-sense base? Nope it is not.

Content:

What then could cognize it if not manāyatana? To propose another āyatana would be to make Nibbāna into a visible object, sound, taste, odour or tangible. To propose an agent of cognition outside the āyatanas would be to posit another "all".

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/vb2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 29, 2018 2:33 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Masters are in hell?

Content:

The Ekottarikāgama has a considerable amount of very late and dodgy material in it. I suspect that the sutra you cite postdates the period when certain Buddhists had come to view Ālāra and Uddaka as proponents of the Saṃkhyā philosophy, despite the total absence of evidence for this in early sources.

The Pali commentaries, along with several non-Theravādin Buddha biographies, present a more credible report in which the two ascetics are reborn in the formless realms corresponding to their meditative attainments: Ākiñcaññāyatana in the case of Ālāra and Nevasaññānāsaññāyatana in the case of Uddaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 29, 2018 2:02 PM

Title: Re: Pronounce Mae Chee Kaew

Content:

IPA: /mɛː tʰɛː kɛːw/.

IPA with tone marks: /mɛ̃ː tʰɛ̃ː kɛ̃ːw/

Mary Haas system: /mɛ̃ɛ̃ chii kɛ̃ɛ̃w/

/mɛː/ is exactly like ‘mare’ as it is pronounced in RP English, i.e., without the American or Southwest English rhotacization.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Rhoticity_in_English

/tʰɛː/ is not exactly like the chee in ‘cheese’ but it’s close enough. If you want to be a perfectionist, the consonant /tʰ/ is an https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Voiceless_alveolo-palatal_affricate, while the ch in cheese is /tʃ/, an https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Voiceless_palato-alveolar_affricate.

/kɛ:w/ - If you say 'care' without rhoticizing it, then add 'oo', and then try to pronounce both sounds together without any hiatus, then you'll have a fair approximation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 30, 2018 4:41 AM

Title: Re: Hand movement during meditation

Content:

If the arm movements are just up and down (as stated in the OP), then it's more likely to be the method of Ajahn Dhammado, the late abbot of Wat Sai Ngam in Suphanburi. Dhammado (not to be confused with Ajahn Lee Dhammado) was the teacher of Ajahn Jumnien and Chris Titmus.

I've never practised the method myself and frankly can't make head or tail of it. Here's an exposition by his Thai disciple Phra Paññāvuḍḍho:

<http://ftp.budaedu.org/ebooks/pdf/EN173.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 30, 2018 9:32 PM

Title: Re: Climate change will make heatwaves very dangerous for monks

Content:

South, not Southeast, Asia. In the accompanying charts the alleged future danger zones where Buddhists live are Bangladesh and the far North of Sri Lanka, not Cambodia and Thailand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 12:20 PM

Title: Re: Help with R. Gethin's article on Abhidhamma/Abhidharma

Content:

I don't think there is anything more than what's on that page - i.e., just Gethin's brief introduction to the OUP's Abhidhamma/Abhidharma bibliography.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 12:25 PM

Title: Re: Help with R. Gethin's article on Abhidhamma/Abhidharma

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 12:39 PM

Title: Re: DhammakAya TipiTaka edition

Content:

If you have a gmail account you could upload it to Google Drive and then post a download link:

<https://www.google.com/drive/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 3:08 PM

Title: Re: Why prayer was performed on the first and fifteenth of each month ?

Content:

The matter of lunar observance days comes up most often in the Vinaya Piṭaka in connection with the fortnightly recital of the Pāṭimokkha, and in the Aṅguttara Nikāya in connection with the benefits that come to householders who observe the eight precepts on these days.

The Vinaya's Uposatha Khandhaka describes how the custom evolved in the bhikkhusaṅgha:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd2>

The relevant Aṅguttara suttas are found mainly in the Uposatha Vagga in the Book of the Eights.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/an8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 3:58 PM

Title: Re: samatha retreats/teachers

Content:

Though it isn't quite what your asking for, the Samatha Trust — a UK-based but Thailand-derived lay meditation group — will be holding its next online course from the 9th October. The course is free of charge, with instruction via weekly Skype interviews with one's teacher and uploaded instruction files.

<https://www.samatha.org/online-course>

I think that for most people this might be a better way of going about things as hardly

any of the really good meditation teachers in Thailand speak English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 1, 2018 4:05 PM

Title: Re: Information about Abhidhamma

Content:

It's available online and certainly would be a good way to get one's bearings regarding the contents of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.210336>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 5, 2018 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Quick death is worse than torture?

Content:

No. There seems to be an error in the translation. There are actually three related scenarios but the translator's compression of the text doesn't make this clear:

1. The monks start a forest fire not intending to kill anyone but some people get burned to death: no offence (because they weren't aiming to kill anyone).
2. The monks start a fire intending to kill people and some people do get killed: a defeating offence.
3. The monks start a fire intending to kill people but nobody is killed: grave offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 6, 2018 6:09 PM

Title: Re: Taking Refuge Phonetic Pronunciation

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 6, 2018 8:56 PM

Title: Re: Tips for renewing my enthusiasm?

Content:

Have you checked in the World Buddhist Directory at Buddhanet?

<http://www.buddhanet.info/wbd/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 7, 2018 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Can an Arahant improve their understanding after awakening?

Content:

A Tathāgata and a Paccekabuddha are both persons in the suttas but are not synonymous. "Tathāgata" occurs in numerous suttas and is one of the more "numinous" titles of the Buddha.

"Paccekabuddha" is a much rarer term in the suttas and refers to another kind of enlightened person. Like Sammāsambuddhas (such as Gotama) Paccekabuddhas awaken by their own efforts rather than under a Buddha's guidance. Unlike Sammāsambuddhas, Paccekabuddhas don't establish a Buddhasāsanā.

Isigili Sutta - some names of past Paccekabuddhas.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.116.piya.html>

Khaggavisāṇa Sutta - traditionally held to be a collection of Paccekabuddhas' sayings.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/snp1.3>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 7, 2018 1:21 AM

Title: Re: Taking Refuge Phonetic Pronunciation

Content:

This is quite a clear recording...

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 7, 2018 11:41 AM

Title: Re: Can an Arahant improve their understanding after awakening?

Content:

The traditional Theravada nirukti for pacceka (Sanskrit pratyeka; Prakrit patteya) is paṭi + eka (Skt. prati + eka). Hence, "singly", "individually". This nirukti seems to be very widely (though not universally) accepted by modern scholarship.

A rival nirukti from the Sanskritic Buddhist schools derives it from pratyaya (= Pali paccaya), meaning causal condition. Here the term is understood as referring to the links in paṭiccasamuppāda. This derivation is what informs the Northern Buddhist notion that Pratyekabuddhas awaken by personal discovery of the twelve

paṭiccasamuppāda nidānas.

To avoid talking at cross purposes I'd prefer not to address your other questions as they seem to be premised on a use of the terms "paccekabuddha" and "tathāgata" that's quite alien to both the Theravada and to every other form of Buddhism. Indeed in virtually all of the posts in which you have brought up these terms, your understanding of them seems to be informed by the meanings they bear in Blavatsky's Theosophy and the works of various Vedanta-centric New Age writers. The allegedly "esoteric" meanings assigned to the terms in these works have only a very tenuous connection (if any) with what they mean in Buddhism.

The attached file is Ria Kloppenborg's very thorough study of the Paccekabuddha as he appears in Pali sources.

[./download/file.php?id=4577](#)
(271.18 KiB) Downloaded 74 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Aug 8, 2018 6:19 AM
Title: Re: paṇḍaka
Content:

The Vinaya, which requires that the early years after his ordination (at least the first five, and ideally the first ten) have to be spent living in dependence on a teacher. In practice this will virtually always entail living in a community. Admittedly in practice this is a rule that's more honoured in the breach nowadays, and so if a man wanted to just get ordained and then go gallivanting off by himself he could probably get away with it. He wouldn't, however, be doing things properly.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Aug 8, 2018 11:48 AM
Title: Re: paṇḍaka
Content:

Yes. The allowance applies in situations where there is no bhikkhu available who is qualified to give nissaya. A bhikkhu taking advantage of it needn't be a skilled practitioner. However, to avoid committing the offence of living without nissaya before he's attained the requisite seniority he has to make a resolve to take nissaya with a qualified therā as soon as one comes along.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Aug 8, 2018 1:04 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Andrew Dicks, Enlightening the Bats: Sound and Place Making in Burmese Buddhist Practice

<https://dc.uwm.edu/etd/803/>

Jeffrey Wayne Bass, The Practicality of the Abhidhammattha-Sangaha

http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_gradthes/4476/

Athukorala Kanthie, Identity, Gender, and Class: Contributions from the Abhidhamma for self and social transformation, with a case study of a women's housing collective in Namibia

https://scholarworks.umass.edu/dissertations_1/2328/

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 9, 2018 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Suttas for the Householder

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 9, 2018 3:54 AM

Title: Re: Suttas for the Householder

Content:

Nothing would happen to the monk, for ordaining without one's parents' permission isn't deemed a serious enough infraction to invalidate an ordination. But the preceptor who ordained him might have to confess a misdemeanour.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 9, 2018 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Āṇi sutta: a question on pali text

Content:

No, for the adjectival form is *bāhira* and the addition of *-ka* is precisely for the purpose of forming a noun from it.

Having said that (and as Mike quotes Bhikkhu Bodhi saying in the other *Āṇisutta* thread), the *sāvaka* in *sāvakabhāṣita* is understood in the commentaries as being the disciples of outsiders, not the disciples of the Buddha. I'm told that this way of construing the passage is supported also in the Chinese translations of Sanskrit *sūtras* containing the word *śravakabhāṣita*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 10, 2018 8:11 AM

Title: Re: SN 20.7 Āṇi Sutta. The Drum Peg.

Content:

That doesn't seem to be the commentators' intention, for in contexts where the *sāvaka* in *sāvakabhāsita* plainly refers to Buddhists, they limit the term to the Buddha's personal disciples, giving the example of the speakers in the Mahā- and Culla-vedalla Suttas. And so in the eyes of the commentators an opinion voiced by Buddhaghosa or by you or me wouldn't count as *sāvakabhāsita*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 10, 2018 8:18 AM

Title: Re: Āṇi sutta: a question on pali text

Content:

I'm sure you get my point, though it's possible of course that I'm mistaken. I'll look into the matter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 12, 2018 11:31 AM

Title: Re: "Ko nu kho"? "What" or "who"?

Content:

In the great majority of cases the context alone will suffice to show whether "what?" or "who?" is the more apt translation of *ko*. In your second passage, for example, clearly "What?" is needed, for the answer to the question is a mode of behaviour, not a person.

In cases where either translation might arguably make sense, the translator will probably base his decision either on (1) His knowledge of typical/natural ways of framing questions in sutta usage; it will sometimes happen that one of the two options, though semantically possible, would amount to an inelegant or unnatural way of phrasing the question; (2) His knowledge of Buddhist doctrine.

In the case of your first passage, if "What?" were used in place of "Who?" then it's hard to see why it would be an "unfit question", for elsewhere in the suttas we do find the Buddha saying things like "contacts contact," "feeling feels", etc., and so it would actually be an easily answerable question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 12, 2018 5:55 PM

Title: Re: Suttas for the Householder

Content:

When helping other Westerners to get ordained in Thailand, I've encountered a few very strict abbots who required the candidates to provide written evidence that they had obtained their parents' consent (and wouldn't have ordained them without it), but these were the exception. The great majority didn't even ask about it. And so in practice matters will most often hinge on how strict the candidate is going to be with himself. If he has failed to obtain his parents' consent it would be easy enough for him to cut corners and get ordained anyway, but obviously it would be a highly inauspicious way to begin. For a start, it would mean having to lie to his two ācāriyas during the ordination ceremony interrogation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 12, 2018 7:12 PM

Title: Re: SN 20.7 Āṇi Sutta. The Drum Peg.

Content:

No, it's a bizarre mistake by the PED compilers, given that the "four pairs of persons, eight kinds of individuals" who make up the sāvaka-saṅgha include arahants and that certain persons known to have been arahants (e.g. Kumārakassapa in the Payasisutta) are called "sāvaka". Perhaps the compilers were confusing sāvaka and sekha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 13, 2018 8:24 AM

Title: Re: Captivates the Mind of a Man

Content:

When the third precept is expounded in the suttas it is done by listing the classes of women with whom a man should not have sexual relations. Not only is there no discussion of what observance of the precept would mean for men of non-heterosexual orientation, there isn't even anything said about how a heterosexual woman should observe the precept. Would you conclude from this that kāmesu micchācārā is an impossibility for a woman?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 14, 2018 1:25 AM

Title: Re: Order of Precedence

Content:

Yes and yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 14, 2018 2:49 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Nonsense. There are hundreds of parallel passages in Sanskrit Buddhist texts where Pali nicca appears as Sanskrit nitya, anicca as anitya, attā as ātmān, and anattā as anātmān.

There are no occurrence of these words in the forms that we should expect if there was any truth in your teacher's hare-brained theories.

Below I give some examples of parallels from the Pali Dhammapada and Sanskrit Udānavarga (not a composition of any naughty Europeans!)

Nicca / Nitya

attā have jitaṃ seyyo
yā cāyaṃ itarā pajā
attadantassa posassa
niccaṃ saññatacārino
(Dhammapada 104)

ātmā hy asya jitaḥ śreyāṃ
yac ceyam itarāḥ prajāḥ
ātmadāntasya puruṣasya
nityaṃ saṃvṛtacārīṇaḥ
(Udānavarga 23/4)

Anicca / Anitya

sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā ti
yadā paññāya passati
atha nibbindatā dukkhe
esa maggo visuddhiyā
(Dhammapada 277)

anityāṃ sarvasaṃskārāṃ
prajñayā paśyate yadā
atha nirvidyate duḥkhād
eṣa mārgo viśuddhaye
(Udānavarga 12/5)

Attā / Ātman

anupubbena medhāvī
thokathokaṃ khaṇe khaṇe
kammāro rajatasseva
niddhame malam attano
(Dhammapada 239)

anupūrveṇa medhāvi
stokaṃ stokaṃ kṣaṇe kṣaṇe
karmāro rajatasyaiva
nirdhamen malam ātmanaḥ
(Udānavarga 2/10)

Anattā / Anātman

sabbe dhammā anattā ti
yadā paññāya passati
atha nibbindati dukkhe
esa maggo visuddhiyā

sarvadharmā anātmānaḥ
prajñayā paśyate yadā
atha nirvidyate duḥkhād
eṣa mārgo viśuddhaye
(Udānavarga 12/8)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 14, 2018 3:50 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

The point of my post was to show that European scholars did not err in treating Pali anicca as a cognate of the Buddhist Sanskrit anitya. And so on with the other words.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 14, 2018 3:55 AM

Title: Re: how do we know what the buddha looked like?

Content:

In Pali sources there is no mention of the question ever being raised.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 15, 2018 12:11 PM

Title: Re: Order of Precedence

Content:

I've no idea what caused the use of āvuso to decline (assuming it was ever a common practice, for which there seems to be no evidence one way or the other). I do know of a few monks who've taken to using the address in their online interactions, but I'm not one of them. It seems to me that the practice has fallen into such desuetude that

resorting to it now would be as ceremonious and affected as trying to revive an archaism like "sirrah".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 16, 2018 3:06 PM

Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits

Content:

In the Milindapañha the benefit of dedicating the merit of a gift to one's deceased relatives is limited to those who have been reborn as just one of the four sub-species of peta. It's explicitly denied that there can be any benefit to those reborn in hell, heaven, as animals or in the other three peta sub-species. Curiously nothing is stated one way or the other about those reborn as humans.

Rhys Davids' translation:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mil6.3.4>

I.B. Horner's:

[./download/file.php?id=4602](#)

(284.67 KiB) Downloaded 94 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 16, 2018 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits

Content:

No. When the term *paradattūpajīvī* is applied to humans (e.g., in the Muni Sutta and the Mātanga Jātaka) it refers to living off others' gifts of food, as practised by those gone forth into the homeless life. But applied to petas it means those of them who subsist on merit dedicated to them by humans.

*Khettūpamā arahanto, dāyakā kassakūpamā,
Bijūpamaṃ deyyadhammaṃ, etto nibbattate phalaṃ.*

*Etaṃ bijaṃ kasi khettaṃ, petānaṃ dāyakassa ca,
Taṃ petā paribhuñjanti, dātā puññaṇa vaḍḍhati.*

“Like a field are the arahants, like farmers are those who give;
Like seed is the merit-offering: from this the fruit is produced.

“This seed, field and cultivation are (desirable) for both the petas and the giver;
The petas make use of it, whilst the donor grows through that merit.”

(Petavatthu 1)

See the attached file for the commentary to these verses.

.

[./download/file.php?id=4603](#)
(243.81 KiB) Downloaded 96 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Aug 17, 2018 1:51 AM
Title: Re: sankappa equivalent with vitakka or not?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Aug 17, 2018 2:22 AM
Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits
Content:

With humans it can be beneficial if the chanting is done in their presence and if all the factors that make a paritta recital efficacious are fulfilled. For details of these see Mingun Sayadaw's Great Chronicle of the Buddhas, pp. 537-42.

<https://www.bps.lk/olib/mi/mi014.pdf>

With animals it seems very unlikely to me that the factors could be fulfilled. Nevertheless I do it anyway, for example when I see a dog get run over and it's obvious that its death is imminent.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Aug 17, 2018 10:05 AM
Title: Re: What is palāsa : (m.) leaf; foliage; malice; spite.?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Aug 17, 2018 1:32 PM
Title: Re: Why Believe Commentaries? [From Transfer/Sharing merit limits]

Content:

Whether one believes them or disbelieves them, loves them or hates them, consulting later texts is very often the only possible way of ascertaining what important terms in the earlier texts mean.

An hour ago, for example, I replied to a post enquiring about the meaning of *palāsa*. In my reply I cited the definition given in the *Sammohavinodanī*, Buddhaghosa's commentary to the *Vibhaṅga*. Had I attempted to answer the question relying solely on the *Suttas*, I could only have told the poster three things:

- (1) *Palāsa* is a defilement.
- (2) *Palāsa* is a cause for decline in *sekha* disciples.
- (3) *Palāsa* is something that makes a *bhikkhu* not dear to his fellow *bhikkhus*.

That's all! The *Suttas* never define the term, nor do they ever present it in any context from which its meaning might be plausibly inferred. Presumably the Buddha was addressing audiences to whom the word *palāsa* was so well-known as to need no defining. We ourselves, sad to say, are not in that position.

Had I resorted to the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*, then I could have told the poster a little bit more, but not very much. For example, I could have told him that *palāsa* is an anger-related state and is twinned with another defilement called *makkha*, whose precise meaning is also impossible to determine from the *Suttas*. I could have told him that its synonyms are *paḷāsāyanā*, *paḷāsāhāra*, *vivādaṭṭhānaṃ*, *yugaggāha* and *appaṭinissagga* ("being domineering", "state of being domineering", "causing dispute", "competing" and "not giving in") — none of which are defined in the *Suttas* and for which I can only give translations based on how the commentaries define them.

In short, had I been committed to relying on the *Suttas* alone I should scarcely have been able to shed any light on the word's meaning at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 17, 2018 3:20 PM

Title: Re: Why Believe Commentaries? [From Transfer/Sharing merit limits]

Content:

Simply by virtue of the fact that they will be reading translations of *suttas*, new people will ineluctably have some sort of commentator defining and interpreting for them,

How do the translators know what Pali words mean? They look them up in dictionaries. How do the compilers of Pali dictionaries know what they mean? See my last post.

And when it happens that some translator decides that the commentators were in error on such and such point and proceeds to translate according to his personal understanding, it doesn't mean that his readers will thereby have evaded having a commentator define and interpret for them. It's just means that it will now be the

modern translator rather than the ancient commentator who is doing the defining and interpreting.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 18, 2018 4:50 PM

Title: Re: What is palāsa : (m.) leaf; foliage; malice; spite.?

Content:

Like any defilement, palāsa is a state of mind. It may well be a cause for manipulative behaviour but it doesn't follow that it can be equated with it.

There's another word, however, palāsī, which means a person who has palāsa, a domineering person. This term could refer either to those who have domineering urges and act on them or to those who merely have them but forbear acting on them. In the former case it could be applied to a manipulative person, but also to those who indulge in oneupmanship by other means.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 18, 2018 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits

Content:

As far as the subject of parittas is concerned, the Milindapañha and commentaries are our only source of information. As the Buddha rejected haphazardism (ahetukavāda) there must be some kind of causal factors that make parittas work. Those stated in the commentaries seem very plausible to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 19, 2018 1:16 PM

Title: Re: Islamic connections from: AN 7.63 Bhariyā Sutta. Kinds of Wives.

Content:

The Buddha and Muhammad seem to be saying quite different things. In effect:

Muhammad: A husband may beat his wife if she persists in disobedience.

The Buddha: A wife who is patient when threatened by her husband is superior to a wife who gets angry.

In the Sabbāsava Sutta patience is prescribed as the appropriate response to "ill-spoken, unwelcome words." It doesn't follow that the Buddha approves of those who speak such words.

In the Kakacūpama Sutta it's deemed admirable to not get angry when being sawn to

pieces by bandits with a two-handed saw. It doesn't follow that the Buddha approves of bandits who practise their carpentry skills in this manner.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 20, 2018 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits

Content:

It's an example of a tendency found in folk Buddhism everywhere, namely, that if the official Theravada doctrine seems comfortless or unpalatable, then it's likely that in popular belief and practice it will be replaced by something more consolatory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 21, 2018 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Transfer/Sharing merit limits

Content:

The morning one was composed by King Rama IV. The evening one is probably rather older since we find it used in all Theravāda countries, but it doesn't come from any canonical source.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 21, 2018 7:56 AM

Title: Re: Steve Saslav/Ajahn Santacitto

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 23, 2018 12:28 PM

Title: Re: A bird chanting Buddha name ?

Content:

There are several Jātakas that tell of the Buddha or his disciples making saccakiriyaṃ during previous lives as animals.

The Bodhisatta as a baby quail

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j1/j1038.htm>

Sāriputta as a nāga

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j5/j5011.htm>

The Bodhisatta as a peacock

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j4/j4055.htm>

As another peacock

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j2/j2012.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 23, 2018 4:06 PM

Title: Re: A bird chanting Buddha name ?

Content:

The narrative convention in Jātaka tales is that when Bodhisattas get born as animals, through the power of their paramī they become rather remarkable animals in one respect or another.

One can't assume, however, that the skills attributed to them will necessarily be shared by all animals. And so, if, for example, a conflagration should break out in the rubber forest where I'm now spending the rains retreat, I should prefer to trust in the local fire brigade rather than in the mystical chanting powers of baby quails.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 24, 2018 8:04 PM

Title: Re: A bird chanting Buddha name ?

Content:

The Pali texts have stories of such things happening, but they are very few in number and with no suggestion that what was done by the animals in question could be done by any old animal.

You'll find a few such stories in the attached file, the opening chapter of Rita Langer's book on Sri Lankan Buddhist funerary procedures.

.

[./download/file.php?id=4606](#)

(273.49 KiB) Downloaded 55 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 27, 2018 7:43 PM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

I was commenting on the pronunciation given in the link supplied by Sabbamitta:

<http://wisdomandwonders.org/itp/>

I don't know who the speaker is, but it sounds like a Sinhalese of advanced years, not Dhammaruwan.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 27, 2018 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Pali pronunciation

Content:

Naturally, since I don't have the necessary equipment to produce an acoustic spectrogram of the recording, which I think is the only way one could objectively demonstrate the sound to be [dʒa] and not [ja].

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 28, 2018 11:42 AM

Title: Re: what is the opposite of nibbidā?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 29, 2018 10:19 AM

Title: Re: The three shrines

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 29, 2018 5:01 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

There's no way that a scholar of Kalupahana's calibre would suppose the Saddharmapuṇḍarīka to have started its life as a Sarvāstivādin work.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 29, 2018 5:07 PM

Title: Re: The three shrines

Content:

No. A sārīrika cetiya is a shrine containing the Buddha's bodily relics. This is not

unqualifiedly disapproved in the Kāḷiṅgabodhi Jātaka, but it has to be built after his parinibbāna and not while he's still walking around.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 29, 2018 7:52 PM

Title: Re: The three shrines

Content:

Those holding to the first of the above opinions might argue that there was nothing amiss in mentioning disapproved cetiyas along with approved ones, for the disapproval of the former was only temporary.

Those holding to the second opinion might point to all the numerous suttas in which good and bad things are included by the Buddha in single lists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 30, 2018 4:13 PM

Title: Re: medicine , career and medicine

Content:

Same principle applies. If you were a bhikkhu you wouldn't be allowed to study medicine. If you happened to have acquired medical skills before ordaining then you could use them to treat (1) fellow monks; (2) family members; (3) anybody at all if it was an emergency. However, it would be considered wrong livelihood if you took any payment for this or even if you offered your services in order to curry favour with people. For lay Buddhists in the medical profession none of this applies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 30, 2018 4:51 PM

Title: Re: Abortion

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:46 AM

Title: 'Anicca' and 'anattā' in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Instead it is claimed that anicca needs to be understood as aniccha, attā as attha, and anattā as anatta, as taught by Abhayaratanaṅkara. Furthermore it is claimed that this supposedly correct understanding of these terms, though blatantly in conflict with the

Mahāvihāra Atthakathās (not to mention the understanding of all Indian Buddhist schools whose texts survive), can nonetheless be supported by three exegetical works preserved in the Khuddaka Nikāya: the Paṭisambhidāmagga, the Nettipakaraṇa and the Peṭakopadesa.

Below I shall append a collection of passages from these three texts which I hope will suffice to show that this is not in fact the case. I trust it will be clear from these that not only is it not “impossible” to translate anicca as “impermanent” and anattā as “not-self” (or else with synonyms of these), but that it really isn’t feasible to translate them in any other way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:48 AM

Title: Re: ‘Anicca’ and ‘anattā’ in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Formal definitions of anicca and aniccānupassanā

Tattha katamo aniccaṭṭho? Piḷanaṭṭho aniccaṭṭho pabhaṅgaṭṭho sampāpanaṭṭho vivekaṭṭho aniccaṭṭho, ayaṃ aniccaṭṭho.

Herein, what is the meaning of anicca? The meaning of pressure is the meaning of anicca; the meaning of not nicca; the meaning of ephemeral; the meaning of causing to terminate; the meaning of seclusion [from nicca] is the meaning of anicca. This is the meaning of anicca.

(Peṭakopadesa 140)

Aniccato ti, aniccānupassanā ... palokato ti, aniccānupassanā ... calato ti, aniccānupassanā ... pabhaṅguto ti, aniccānupassanā ... addhuvato ti, aniccānupassanā ... vipariṇāmadhammato ti, aniccānupassanā ... vibhavato ti, aniccānupassanā ... saṅkhatatoti, aniccānupassanā ... maraṇadhammato ti, aniccānupassanā.

“Seeing the five aggregates as ‘anicca’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘disintegrating’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘fickle’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘perishable’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘unenduring’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘subject to change’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘due to be annihilated’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘conditioned’ is contemplation of anicca.

“Seeing ... as ‘subject to death’ is contemplation of anicca.

(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 241f)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:51 AM

Title: Re: 'Anicca' and 'anattā' in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Anicca and arising-and-passing-away

Aniccan ti kiṃ aniccaṃ? Pañcakkhandhā aniccā. Kenatthēna aniccā?
Uppādavayaṭṭhēna aniccā.

“‘Anicca’ — What is anicca? The five aggregates are anicca.”

“In what sense are they anicca?”

“They are anicca in the sense of arising and passing away.”

(Paṭisambhidāmagga i. 192)

Tattha katamā aniccasaññā? ‘Sabbe saṅkhārā uppādavayadhammino’ ti ca yā saññā
sañjānanā vavatthapanā uggāho, ayaṃ aniccasaññā. Tassā ko nissando?
Aniccasaññāya bhāvitāya bahuḷikatāya aṭṭhasu lokadhammesu cittaṃ nānusandhati na
sandhati na saṇṭhahati, upekkhā vā paṭikkūlatā vā saṇṭhahati, ayamassā nissando.

“Herein, what is perception of anicca?”

“Any perception, perceiving, defining or apprehending that ‘All dhammas are of the
nature to arise and pass away’, this is perception of anicca.”

“What is its outcome?”

“When perception of anicca is developed and made much of, then the eight worldly
dhammas [gain, loss, fame, disrepute, praise, blame, pleasure and pain] do not keep
linking up with, connecting with or moulding the mind; [rather] it is either equanimity or
revulsion that moulds it. This is its outcome”

(Peṭakopadesa 126)

Saṅkhatalakkhaṇānaṃ dhammānaṃ samanupassanalakkhaṇā aniccasaññā, tassā
uppādavayā padaṭṭhānaṃ.

“Perception of anicca has the characteristic of discerning dhammas that have the
characteristic of being conditioned. Its footing is arising and passing away.”

(Nettippakaraṇa 27-8)

Saṅkhatānaṃ dhammānaṃ vināsaggahaṇalakkhaṇā aniccasaññā, tassā udayabbayo padaṭṭhānaṃ.

“Perception of anicca has the characteristic of apprehending the destruction of conditioned dhammas. Its footing is arising-and-passing away.”
(Peṭakopadesa 127)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:53 AM

Title: Re: ‘Anicca’ and ‘anattā’ in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Anicca = destruction; anattā = coreless or empty

Kathaṃ ‘sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā’ ti sotāvadhānaṃ, taṃpajānanā paññā sutamaye ñāṇaṃ?

‘Rūpaṃ aniccaṃ khayaṭṭhenā’ ti ... sotāvadhānaṃ.

“How is it that understanding of applying the ear thus: ‘All saṅkhāras are anicca’ is knowledge consisting in what has been heard?”

“The ear is applied thus: Materiality is anicca in the sense of destruction.”

(Repeat for the other aggregates and all the 201 knowable dhammas)

(Paṭisambhidāmagga i. 37)

Kathaṃ vedanāya upaṭṭhānaṃ viditaṃ hoti? Aniccato manasikaroto khayatupaṭṭhānaṃ viditaṃ hoti ... anattato manasikaroto suññatupaṭṭhānaṃ viditaṃ hoti. Evaṃ vedanāya upaṭṭhānaṃ viditaṃ hoti.

“How is the appearance of feeling recognized? When he gives attention [to feeling] as anicca, the appearance as destruction is recognized; ... when he gives it attention as not attā the appearance as emptiness is recognized. This is how the appearance of feeling is recognized.”

(Paṭisambhidāmagga i. 178)

Aniccato manasikaroto kathaṃ saṅkhārā upaṭṭhanti? ... Anattato manasikaroto kathaṃ saṅkhārā upaṭṭhanti? Aniccato manasikaroto khayato saṅkhārā upaṭṭhanti ... anattato manasikaroto suññato saṅkhārā upaṭṭhanti.

“When he gives attention to saṅkhāras as anicca, how do they appear to him? ... When he gives attention to saṅkhāras as not attā, how do they appear to him?”

“When he gives attention to formations as anicca, they appear to him as destruction ... When he gives attention to formations as not attā, they appear as empty.”
(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 48)

Kathaṃ ‘sabbe dhammā anattā’ ti sotāvadhānaṃ, taṃpajānanā paññā sutamaye ñāṇaṃ?
‘Rūpaṃ anattā asāraḥkaṭṭhenā’ ti sotāvadhānaṃ.

“How is it that understanding of applying the ear thus: ‘All dhammas are not attā’ is knowledge consisting in what has been heard?”
“The ear is applied thus: Materiality is not attā in the sense of lacking any core.”

(Repeat for the other aggregates and all the 201 knowable dhammas)
(Paṭisambhidāmagga i. 37)

Rūpaṃ atītānāgatapaccuppannaṃ aniccaṃ khayaṭṭhena ... anattā asāraḥkaṭṭhenāti tulayitvā tīrayitvā vibhāvayitvā vibhūtaṃ katvā rūpanirodhe nibbāne khippaṃ javatīti: javanapaññā.

“Having calculated and judged and clarified and made clear that past, future and presently-arisen materiality is anicca in the sense of destruction ... and not attā in the sense of lacking any core, it soon gives the impulse to the cessation of materiality, Nibbāna, thus it is called ‘impulsive understanding’.”
(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 200)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:56 AM

Title: Re: ‘Anicca’ and ‘anattā’ in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

A formal definition of anattā

Tattha katamo anattaṭṭho? Anissariyaṭṭho anattaṭṭho, avasavattanaṭṭho, akāmakāriṭṭho parividaṭṭho, ayaṃ anattaṭṭhoti.

“Herein, what is the meaning of anattā?”

“The meaning of unamenability to lordship-rule is the meaning of anattā. The meaning of unsusceptibility to the wielding of power, the meaning of unsusceptibility to be done with as one wishes, the meaning of being secluded from identification. This is the meaning of anattā.”

(Peṭakopadesa 140)

This is Ñāṇamoli’s rather stilted rendering. The Thai one published by the Bhumibalo Bhikkhu Foundation is much simpler:

.

[./download/file.php?id=4612&mode=view](#)

.

“The meaning of having no boss, the meaning of having no self, the meaning of not being subject to control, the meaning of [dhammas] not acting according to one’s wishes, the meaning that nothing can penetrate [them]. This is the meaning of anattā.”

What is anattā is ‘other’, etc.

Paratoti, anattānupassanā .. rittatoti, anattānupassanā ... tucchatoti, anattānupassanā, suññatoti, anattānupassanā, anattatoti, anattānupassanā ... asāraakatoti, anattānupassanā.

“Seeing the five aggregates as ‘other’ is contemplation of not-attā.

“Seeing ... as ‘hollow’ is contemplation of not-attā.

“Seeing ... as ‘vain’ is contemplation of not-attā.

“Seeing ... as ‘empty’ is contemplation of not-attā.

“Seeing ... as ‘not attā’ is contemplation of not-attā.

“Seeing ... as ‘lacking any core’ is contemplation of not-attā.

(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 241f)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 7:59 AM

Title: Re: ‘Anicca’ and ‘anattā’ in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and

Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Miscellaneous quotes on anattā

Yā ca anattānupassanā yā ca suññatānupassanā, ime dhammā nānatthā ceva nānābyañjanā ca, udāhu ekatthā, byañjanameva nānanti? Yā ca anattānupassanā yā ca suññatānupassanā, ime dhammā ekatthā, byañjanameva nānaṃ.

“Contemplation of not-attā, and contemplation of emptiness — are these dhammas different in meaning and different in phrasing, or are they one in meaning and only the phrasing is different?

“Contemplation of not-attā, and contemplation of emptiness — these dhammas are one in meaning and only the phrasing is different.”

(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 63)

Dhammesu dhammānupassī viharanto ‘anattani attā’ ti vipallāsaṃ pajahati ... attavādupādānena ca anupādāno bhavati.

“One who dwells contemplating dhammas as dhammas abandons the hallucination that there is attā in the not-attā, ... and with regard to clinging to self-doctrines he becomes one who is free of clinging.”

(Nettipakaraṇa 84)

Cattārome, bhikkhave, saññāvipallāsā cittavipallāsā diṭṭhivipallāsā. Katame cattāro? ... Anattani, bhikkhave, attāti saññāvipallāso cittavipallāso diṭṭhivipallāso.

“Bhikkhus, there are these four hallucinations of perception, hallucinations of mind, hallucinations of view. What four? [...] Seeing attā in what is not attā is an hallucination of perception, an hallucination of mind, an hallucination of view.”

(Paṭisambhidāmagga ii. 80)

[Here Sāriputta is quoting the Buddha’s words in the Vipallāsasutta (AN. ii. 52). The grammar of the passage is sufficient to show the error of equating attā and anattā with attha and anattha. The word anattani can only be anattā in the locative singular case. Anattha in this sentence would need to take the form anatthasmiṃ, anattamhi or anatthe.]

Paṭhame vipallāse ṭhito kāme upādiyati, idaṃ vuccati kāmupādānaṃ.

Dutiye vipallāse ṭhito anāgataṃ bhavaṃ upādiyati, idaṃ vuccati bhavupādānaṃ.

Tatiye vipallāse ṭhito saṃsārābhinandinīṃ diṭṭhiṃ upādiyati, idaṃ vuccati diṭṭhupādānaṃ.

Catutthe vipallāse ṭhito attānaṃ kappiyaṃ upādiyati, idaṃ vuccati attavādupādānaṃ.

“Established in the first hallucination [which perceives attractiveness in what is unattractive] one clings to sensual desires; this is called clinging to sensuality.
“Established in the second hallucination [which perceives sukha in what is dukkha] one clings to future existence: this is called clinging to existence.
“Established in the third hallucination [which perceives nicca in what is anicca] one clings to the view that delights in saṃsāric continuance; this is called clinging to views.
“Established in the fourth hallucination [which perceives attā in what is not-attā] one clings to that which one has supposed to be an attā; this is called clinging to self-doctrines.”
(Nettipakaraṇa 115f)

Tattha katamā anattasaññā? ‘Sabbesu dhammesu anattā’ ti yā saññā sañjānanā vavatthapanā uggāho, ayaṃ anattasaññā. Tassā ko nissando? Anattasaññāya bhāvitāya bahulikātāya ahaṅkāro cittaṃ nānusandhati na sandhati, mamaṅkāro na saṇṭhahati, upekkhā vā paṭikkūlatā vā saṇṭhahati, ayamassā nissando.

“Herein, what is perception of anattā?”
“Any perception, perceiving, defining or apprehending that ‘All dhammas are anattā’, this is perception of anattā.”
“What is its outcome?”
“When perception of anattā is developed and made much of, then ‘I’-making does not keep linking up with, connecting with or moulding the mind; [rather] it is either equanimity or revulsion that moulds it. This is its outcome”
(Peṭakopadesa 126)

Khandhadhātu-āyatanesu attādhimuttassa nānādhātu-anekadhātu-vinibbhogam-apaccavekkhato anattasaññā na upaṭṭhāti.

“Perception of anattā does not become established in one who, believing in an attā in the aggregates or elements or bases, does not recollect the resolution into the different and plural elements.”
(Peṭakopadesa 129)

Tattha niccasaññādhimuttassa aparāparacittapavattiyaṃ santatiṃ paṇāmento apaccavekkhato aniccasaññā na upaṭṭhāti.

“Herein, the perception of anicca does not become established in one who believes in the perception of nicca because of non-reviewing of the process of mental alteration in the [mental] continuum.”
(Peṭakopadesa 128)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 8:11 PM

Title: Re: 'Anicca' and 'anattā' in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

I will later, though it may take me a while as there's roughly seven times as much material on dukkha in these three texts as there is on anicca and anattā. The Peṭakopadesa and the Netti in particular are very rich in dukkha-related passages, for the underlying premise of these hermeneutics texts is that every word the Buddha ever uttered is in some way related to one or another, or several, of the four noble truths; the principal task of a commentator is that of bringing out this relevance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Does this five pungent flavours prohibited for monastic consumption ?

Content:

The Vinaya requirement is not that we have to accept what's given to us, but rather that we can't consume any edible unless it has been given to us.

In the case of being offered garlic, the answer is in Volovsky's quotation from Ajahn Thanissaro's BMC:

"An alternative interpretation, accepted by many Communities, is that the original prohibition is against eating garlic by itself. Following this interpretation, garlic mixed with other ingredients would be allowable even when one is not ill."

Though if my experience in Thailand is anything to go by, one might need to replace "many Communities" with "virtually all Communities".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 1, 2018 8:52 PM

Title: Re: petavatthu

Content:

There is a pioneering translation of both texts, Petavatthu and Vimānavatthu, available here:

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.282259>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 2, 2018 7:46 PM

Title: Re: 'Anicca' and 'anattā' in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa

Content:

Usually it's ñeyyadhamma but the Patisambhidamagga uses abhiññeyyadhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 3, 2018 10:16 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Dietary & Lifestyle Recommendations

Content:

See MN 125 and this discussion of it at Sutta Central.

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/three-watches-of-the-night/6944>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 6, 2018 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Momentariness

Content:

Mind and matter (both internal and external), but with the momentarism of the mind (i.e. of cittas and cetasikas/caittas) coming in for the most discussion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 7, 2018 3:26 PM

Title: Re: What is Māyā (Deceit) in the Buddhist teachings?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 7, 2018 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Momentariness

Content:

But by what is the body seen standing all these years? By the eye of flesh, maṃsacakkhu.

Abhidhammic momentarism, however, is not an account of how things appear to the eye of flesh, but of how they appear to the developed paññindriya of an accomplished

yogi. As such, there isn't any conflict between what is said in this sutta and what is said in momentarist theory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 9, 2018 1:27 AM

Title: Re: petavatthu

Content:

The "Siamese theologians" (!) never excluded the Petavatthu from printed editions of the Canon.

I suspect what Gehman meant is that the said theologians did with the Petavatthu exactly what they did with the Dhammapada and the Jātaka: printed the verses (which are canonical) in the Tipiṭaka but the background stories (which are commentarial) separately.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 10, 2018 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Marks of existence sutta

Content:

We did once have a thread pointing out that the convention of referring to aniccatā, dukkhatā and anattatā as the "three characteristics" (tilakkhaṇaṃ or tīṇi lakkhaṇāni) is a post-canonical development, unexampled anywhere in the Tipiṭaka.

But I don't recall any thread relating the bolder hypothesis that you describe, though I am familiar with it (and I've no doubt missed many threads). The claim that Theravādins inserted dukkhatā later and that in earliest Buddhism the lakṣaṇa probably conformed to one of the Mahāyāna-favoured formulations (e.g., "saṃskāras are anitya, dharmas are anātmān, nirvāṇa is peace", or something like that) was advanced by Thich Nhat Hanh and Hsing Yun. As with most of this duo's revisionist hypotheses, it's very poorly argued and afaik no scholar in early Buddhist studies takes it seriously.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 10, 2018 6:45 PM

Title: Re: what's on your raft? (the indispensable sutta passages to memorize)

Content:

In the Northern Thai sub-tradition with whose monks I've been loosely affiliated for the last couple of decades we have two chanting cycles, one used on even-numbered days, the other on odd-numbered days and Uposathas. The first of the cycles is simply the Bangkok one that was composed by King Rama III or Rama IV (I forget which of the two it was) and then imposed willy-nilly on the whole country. The less said about that the better, as it's dull as ditchwater. The other more interesting cycle is an abbreviated

version of an old Lanna one. It comprises the following:

1st day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Inviting the devatās

(sarajjaṃ sasenaṃ sabandhuṃ narindaṃ...)

(2) Pubbabhāganamakāra

(namo tassa bhagavato...)

(3) Saraṇagamanāṃ, Lanna-style going for refuge

(buddhaṃ jīvitaṃ yāvanibbānaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi...)

(4) Sambuddhe

(sambuddhe aṭṭhavisañca, dvādasañca saḥassake...)

(5) Namokāraṭṭhakagāthā

(namo arahato sammāsambuddhassa mahesino...)

(6) Verses for initiating a paritta cycle

(ye santā santacittā...)

(7) Rājato

(rājato vā corato vā manussato vā...)

(8) Maṅgala Sutta

(Sn. 46-7)

(9) Jayamaṅgala-aṭṭhagāthā

(bāhuṃ saḥassamabhinimmitasāvudhantaṃ...)

(10) Bhojanasutta-gāthā

(= AN. iii. 42)

(11) The Bodhisatta's ten perfections / Itipi so mahājaya

(Itipi so bhagavā dānapāramīsampanno...)

(12) Temiyo / Ten former lives of the Buddha

(temiyo nāma bhagavā...)

(13) Sukho Buddhānaṃ

(comprising Dh. 194, verses from the Mahākappina Sutta, SN. ii. 284, and Dh. 204)

(14) Taṅkhaṇikapaccavekkhaṇaṃ (morning) / Atītapaccavekkhaṇaṃ (evening)

(15) Dhātupaṭikūlapaccavekkhaṇaṃ

(16) Pattidānagāthā (morning), Uddissanādhiṭṭhānagāthā (evening)

(17) Asking forgiveness of Triple Gem, etc.
(vandāmi buddhaṃ sabbaṃ me dosaṃ...)

(18) Asking forgiveness of senior monk
(vandāmi bhante sabbaṃ aparādhaṃ...)

(19) Therābhūtiṭṭhagāthāyo
(verses praising the merits of Khrubar Srivichai and Khrubar Prommajak)

Parts 1-2 and 13-19 are chanted every day, so I won't list them again.

3rd day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Namakārasiddhigāthā
(yo cakkhumā mohamalāpakaṭṭho...)

(2) Namokāraṭṭhakagāthā
(namo arahato sammāsambuddhassa mahesino...)

(3) Ratana Sutta
(Sn. 38-42)

(4) Cullamaṅgalacakkavāḷa
(sabbabuddhānubhāvena...)

(5) Verses from the Aggappasāda Sutta
(AN. ii. 35)

(6) Keṇiyānumodanagāthāyo
(= verses starting aggihuttaṃ mukhā yaññā... in the Sn's Sela Sutta)

5th day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Karaṇīyametta Sutta
(Sn. 25-6)

(2) Khandha Paritta
(= verses from the Ahirāja Sutta, AN. ii. 72-3)

(3) Mora Paritta
(= verses from the Mora Jātaka, Jāt. ii. 33-4)

(4) Vaṭṭaka Paritta
(= verses from Vaṭṭaka Jātaka, Jāt. i. 214-5)

(5) Mahāmaṅgalacakkavāḷa
(siridhitimatitejojayasiddhimahiddhi...)

(6) Vihāradānagāthā
(= Vin. ii. 147-8. sītaṃ uṇhaṃ paṭihanti...)

7th day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Dhajagga Sutta
(SN. i. 218-20)

(2) Ratanattayappabhāvasiddhigāthā
(araḥaṃ sammāsambuddho lokānaṃ anukampako...)

(3) Devatādissadakkhiṇānumodanāgāthā
(verses from the DN's Mahāsudassana Sutta or Udāna's Pāṭaligāmiya Sutta. yasmiṃ padese kappeti...)

(4) Devatābhisammantanagāthā
(yānīdha bhūtāni samāgatāni...)

Morning chanting for the Aṭṭhaṃī Uposatha

(1) Aṭṭhavīsatibuddha Paritta
(namo me sabbabuddhānaṃ dvattiṃsā varalakkaṇo...)

(2) Metteyyo
(metteyyo uttaro rāmo...)

(3) Verses relating to the four protective meditations:

(3.1) Buddhānussati
(anantā vitthāraguṇaṃ...)

(3.2) Mettabhāvanā
(attuppamāya sabbesaṃ sattānaṃ...)

(3.3) Asubha
(aviññāṇasubhanibhaṃ saviññāṇasubhaṃ...)

(3.4) Maraṇānussati
(pavātādipatulyā yassāyusantatiyā khayaṃ...)

(4) Vipassanābhūmipāṭha
(pañcakkhandhā rūpakkhandho...)

(5) Mettāpharaṇa
(puratthimāya disāya puratthimāya anudisāya...)

(6) Buddhō Sabbaññū

(buddho sabbaññū taññāṇo...)

(7) Buddho Maṅgalasambhūto

(buddho maṅgalasambhūto sambuddho dīpaduttamo...)

Evening chanting for all Uposatha days

(1) Asking forgiveness of the Five Jewels

(namāmi buddhaṃ guṇasāgarantaṃ...)

(2) Lanna Uposatha day vandanā

(yo sannisinno varabodhimūle...)

(3) Kammatṭhāna - a long chant comprising the pubbabhāga and saraṇagamanam, verse summaries of the first three anussatis and kāyagatāsati, Dhammapada 41, the four elements, five khandhas, three characteristics, and verses to the Vepullapabbata Sutta.

(4) Pañca Mahāpariccāga - a very long (and for me deadly boring) vandanā that pays homage to almost everything that's sacred in the cakkavāḷa.

9th day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Āṭānāṭṭiya Paritta

(2) Aṅgulimāla Paritta

(3) Bojjhaṅga Paritta

(4) Abhaya Paritta

(5) Devatā Uyyojanagāthā

(6) Jaya Paritta

(7) Hiri-ottappasampannā

11th day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Dhammasaṅgiṇī mātikā

(kusalā dhammā akusalā dhammā...)

(2) Vinaya

(= opening paragraphs of the first pārājika's origin story)

(3) Sutta

(= opening paragraphs of the Brahmajāla Sutta)

(4) Opening paragraphs of the seven books of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka...

(4.1) Dhammasaṅgaṇī

(4.2) Vibhaṅga

(4.3) Dhātukathā

(4.4) Puggalapaññati

(4.5) Kathāvatthu

(4.6) Yamaka

(4.7) Mahāpaṭṭhāna

(5) Sappaccayā

(= Cūḷantaradukka passage of the Dhammasaṅgaṇī)

(6) Paṃsukūla

(6.1) For the deceased

(6.2) For self-reflection

(6.3) For the living

(7) Tirokuḍḍakaṇḍapacchimabhāga

(= last four verses of the Tirokuḍḍa Sutta)

13th day of waxing or waning moon

(1) Pabbatopamagāthā

(= verses from the Pabbatūpama Sutta, SN. i. 101-2)

(2) Ariyadhanagāthā

(= verses from the Dalidda Sutta, SN. i. 232, or Theragāthā verses of Sirimitta)

(3) Dhammaniyāma Sutta

(aka Uppāda Sutta, AN. i. 286)

(4) Tilakkhaṇādigāthā

(= Dh. 277-279, & 85-89)

(5) Paṭiccasamuppāda anuloma and paṭiloma

(6) Paṭhamabuddhabhāsita-gāthā

(= Dh. 153)

(7) Buddha-udānagāthā

(= verses to the first three suttas of the Udāna)

(8) Bhaddekarattagāthā

(= verses to the MN's Bhaddekaratta Suttas)

(9) Devatā-uyyojanagāthā
(dukkhappattā ca niddukkhā...)

Morning chanting for full moon and new moon Uposathas

(1) Paṭiccasamuppāda anuloma and paṭiloma

(2) Paṭhamabuddhabhāsitagāthā
(= Dh. 153)

(3) Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta

(4) Yo dhīro
(comprising verses from Vin. i. 38, Vin. i. 40 and the Udāna's Sāriputta Sutta)

(5) Yo kho Ānanda
(= the Buddha's last speech in the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta)

(6) Ākāsaṭṭhā
(ākāsaṭṭhā ca bhummaṭṭhā devā...)

(7) Buddhō Sabbaññū
(buddho sabbaññū taññāṇo...)

(8) Buddhō Maṅgalasambhūto
(buddho maṅgalasambhūto sambuddho dīpaduttamo...)

Now that I'm living alone, although I still more or less follow the above cycle, I have made a few supplements and a few replacements of those chants that I find tedious. The shorter ones listed below I chant in full every day, while the longer ones are spread over several days.

Sīla-related

(1) Dasadhamma Sutta
(aka Pabbajita-abhiṇha Sutta, AN. vi. 87-8)

(2) Bhikkhupātimokkha
(I recite a third of it each day)

Sutta passages customarily chanted in Thailand after a Pātimokkha recital:

(3) Ovādapātimokkha

(= Dhp. 184, 183, 185)

(4) Verses from Tāyana Sutta
(SN. i. 49)

(5) Aparihāṇiyādhamma Sutta
(aka Paṭhamasattaka Sutta, AN. iv. 21-2)

(6) Chasārāṇiyadhamma Sutta
(AN. iii. 288-9)

Samādhi-related

(1) Thirty-two marks of a Great Man in the Lakkhaṇa Sutta
(chanted daily as I do a visualisation practice based on them)

(2) Twenty suttas in the SN's Ānāpānasamṃyutta

(3) Ānāpānakathā in the Paṭisambhidāmagga

(4) Full versions of the sutta passages cited in brief in the Visuddhimagga's
Brahmavihāra chapter

Paññā-related

(1) Aṭṭhaka and Parāyana Vaggas of the Suttanipāta

(2) DN's Saṅgīti and Dasuttara Suttas

(3) Visuddhimagga's chapter on the five aggregates
(Path of Purification ch. XIV)

(3) Sutta passages quoted in the Visuddhimagga's chapter on the faculties and truths
(Path of Purification ch. XVI)

(5) Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha chapters 1, 2 & 6.

Miscellaneous

(1) Mahāsamaya Sutta
(because it's beautiful to chant and I want to be on friendly terms with any yakkhas,
gandhabbas, nāgas, etc. that might be hanging around)

(2) Āṭānāṭiya Sutta
(ditto)

(3) Uppātasanti

(I'm not really sold on this one, but it was a great favourite of my late Burmese Pali teacher, so I chant it once a month for auld lang syne)

(4) Abhiṇhapaccavekkhaṇaṃ

(5) Salla Sutta
(Sn. 112-113)

(6) Sigalovāda Sutta

(7) Parābhava Sutta

The last two are useful to know if you're unexpectedly called on to give a talk to laypeople and can't think of anything to say. Likewise with the Salla Sutta if it's a funeral sermon that's required.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 10, 2018 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Marks of existence sutta

Content:

Nor was I accusing you of doing so; nor even suspecting it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 11, 2018 1:18 AM

Title: Re: Any teachers follow Ariyavamsa Patipada ?

Content:

What is your source for this description?

In the Ariyavaṃsa and Saṅgīti Suttas the first three ariyavaṃsa practices are the mental ones of being contented with any robes, lodgings or almsfood one happens to get. They also include the verbal practice of not praising oneself on account of one's contentment. And so if any bhikkhu were in fact contented in the manner described, you wouldn't know because he wouldn't tell you.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an4.28>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 11, 2018 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Marks of existence sutta

Content:

If 'lakkhaṇa' wasn't available to me, then the only sutta terms I can think of are those

found in the AN's Uppādāsutta.

Using Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation, that would mean 'three laws' (dhātu), 'three stabilities of the Dhamma' (dhammaṭṭhitatā), or 'three fixed courses of the Dhamma' (dhammaniyāmatā).

Using Ajahn Thanissaro's: 'properties', 'steadfastnesses of the Dhamma', 'orderlinesses of the Dhamma'.

And the second sermon might then be Khandhadhammaṭṭhitatā or Khandhadhammaniyāmatā Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 11, 2018 10:23 AM

Title: Re: Any teachers follow Ariyavamsa Patipada ?

Content:

In Thailand there are probably several thousand monks who practise items 1, 2 and 4 in your description, but making one's robes out of discarded pieces of cloth (as practised by Ajahn Mun) is very uncommon nowadays. No doubt at least some of the monks in question are meditation teachers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 11, 2018 1:42 PM

Title: Re: assada adinava and nissarana

Content:

They don't have one, but if one were needed, then "four noble truths compressed to three" would do, based on the equivalences given in the Nettipakaraṇa Atthakathā:

dukkha = ādinava

samudaya = assāda

magga & nirodha = nissaraṇa

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 12, 2018 8:31 PM

Title: Re: what's on your raft? (the indispensable sutta passages to memorize)

Content:

There's considerable variation between wats. At one extreme there are some forest wats where you'd expected to memorise nearly as much as city-based scholar monks (e.g., virtually everything in the Dhammayut chanting book at Access to Insight). Then at the other extreme there are places like Wat Pa Baan Taad where a monk might easily get away with knowing only the meal-time blessing chant and the sutta passages chanted

after the Pāṭimokkha recital, because this is the only chanting they ever do.

A fairly common pattern, however, would be something like this:

1. Meal-time blessing (anumodanā) chants to be learned as soon as possible; ideally within a week or two of arriving.
2. King Rama IV-style morning and evening services to be learned during the first month or two. Also, if it's a wat where a probationary period as a sāmanera is required, then you might be expected to learn the seventy-five sekhiya rules and Sāmanerasikkhā during this period.
3. More frequently-chanted suttas and parittas – chiefly those that make up the Jed Tamnaan and Sib-song Tamnaan paritta cycles – to be learned during the first year or two.
4. The Pāṭimokkha - some time during the first five years. Though in recent years fewer and fewer wats have been insisting on this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 12, 2018 11:09 PM

Title: Re: what's on your raft? (the indispensable sutta passages to memorize)

Content:

I think it would be better to wait until you're in a monastery or you're almost certain to develop chanting habits that are at odds with the style used in your wat, and so will then have to waste time unlearning them. Even the ordination can't really be prepared for in advance unless you know where you're going to be - Dhammayuts and Mahanikaya Ajahn Chah wats use different formulas for the ordination liturgy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 13, 2018 4:42 AM

Title: Re: Star Water Blessing...

Content:

Gāthā Mae Thoranee

tassā kesīsato yathāgaṅga sotam pavattanti
mārasenā patiṭṭhātuṃ asakkonto palāyimsu
pāramitānubhāvena mārasenā parājītā
disodisaṃ palāyanti vidaṃsenti asesato.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 13, 2018 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Star Water Blessing...

Content:

If you read French, the gāthā is discussed by Grégory Kourilsky on pp. 197-99 of his doctoral thesis:

La place des ascendants familiaux dans le bouddhisme des Lao

www.theses.fr/2015EPHE5032.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 13, 2018 9:51 AM

Title: Re: Star Water Blessing...

Content:

Sorry, this is the corrected link:

<https://www.theses.fr/2015EPHE5032.pdf>

I'm afraid I don't know anything about the matter beyond what's stated in Kourilsky's thesis. I've spent most of my years in the North of Thailand, but the custom you're asking about seems to belong to the Northeast and Laos.

Anyhow, this is the Kourilsky's French translation of the gāthā:

“De ses cheveux [l'eau] s'écoulait comme le flot des eaux du Gange. Alors, l'armée de Māra, incapable de tenir, prit la fuite. Par la puissance des Perfections (parāmitā), l'armée de Māra fut défaite. Ayant été détruit, elle se dispersa dans toutes les directions, sans qu'il n'en reste rien.”

["From her [i.e., Mother Thoranee's] hair [water] flowed like the stream of water of the Ganges. Then, the army of Māra, unable to hold, fled. By the power of the perfections (parāmitā) Māra's army was defeated, having been destroyed and scattered in all directions, with nothing left."]

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 15, 2018 12:28 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

Bhante,

Having now read your article, I am certainly one of those who would question what you write. I question it, however, not because it's at odds with what is popularly taught by

Buddhist teachers in the West, but because it's both textually and historically uninformed, with no citations provided in support of one its most pivotal contentions. I refer here (as Sam Vara did earlier in this thread) to your claim that a woman should be considered "guarded by her father [mother, brothers, etc.]" so long as she remains an unmarried woman and these people are still living. That is, she will still be *piturakkhitā*, *māturakkhitā*, etc., even if she has left home, obtained employment and established an independent life for herself. Your argument up to now seems to amount to no more than: "This is what modern Asian Theravādins believe, so it must be right." But this just won't do. In the *Kathāvatthu* we can find at least twenty views that were rejected as heretical at the Third Council, but which are nowadays widely believed in Asian Theravādin countries; in some cases even widely believed by learned *ajahns* and *sayadaws*.

Furthermore, I question what you say because my own investigation (admittedly many years ago) of the terms *piturakkhitā*, *māturakkhitā*, etc., led me to quite different conclusions. I began by surveying every occurrence of these terms in the *Tipiṭaka*, *Atthakathā* and *Ṭīkā*, and then ventured further afield by examining their use in Jainist *sūtras* and Brahminical legal texts. My conclusions, in brief, were:

1. Guardianship of the *X-rakkhitā* type is limited to custodial situations. That is, if Susan is not regularly domiciled with X, then she cannot be said to be *X-rakkhitā*.
2. The view of modern Asian Theravādins that you champion is not only not supported in the Pali Buddhist texts, it's not even supported in the (far more paternalistic) Brahminical works like the *Dharmaśāstra* or Medhātithi's commentary to the Laws of Manu.
3. I strongly suspect that the modern Asian view is a case of wanting to have your cake and eat it. In bygone ages the normal practice was that a daughter would reside at home until her menstrual cycle began and would then be wedded off at the earliest opportunity. But now we have parents who want to send their daughters away to college (which may entail their going away to another city or country) and yet they retain an emotional need for ownership and control of their daughters. To get the best of both worlds they've invented the fiction that *piturakkhitā*-ship is for life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 1:20 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 1:41 PM

Title: Re: Throwing food

Content:

In Thai wats some of it will be eaten by the laypeople who brought it, some by the temple boys or any laypeople who've come to work in the wat, some (in town and city wats) by beggars, and some by the wat's cats, dogs and chickens. In a large wat on a festival day the surplus will often be enormous, and so the leftovers will be loaded in a truck and distributed to the local orphanages.

The only place I've seen food being thrown away was at Wat Pa Baan Taad. Because of Ajahn Maha Bua's fame, at weekends there would coachloads of merit-makers coming from all over Thailand – sometimes a thousand or more people bringing food for just 52 monks and novices. After the meal some meat would be kept aside for the ajahn's dogs and some bananas for his parrot and squirrels. Everything else would be dumped in a deep pit and burned.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 2:02 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

This isn't quite correct. If you were to search the Pali texts for the masculine forms *piturakkhito*, *māturakkhito*, etc., you would come up empty-handed. Likewise if you searched Brahminical texts for the cognate Sanskrit terms. No male is ever described in this way. In saying this I don't of course mean to imply that a male child was not subject to some sort of guardianship, nor that it would be morally blameless to have sex with him. My point, rather, is that in the boundaries set by King Mahāsammata, the very particular (and peculiarly Indian) mode of guardianship called *rakkhakā* was applicable to females only.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

But the passage doesn't say that "kamma is the only thing we will inherit from life to life. It says that we shall be the heirs of our kamma, not that we shall be the heirs of our kamma and nothing else. If you were the heir to your kamma and nothing else, then the ripening of some past kusala kamma might have caused you to encounter the Buddha's teaching but it wouldn't have caused you to respond to it in the way that you have. For example, if it wasn't for natural decisive support condition (*pakatūpanissaya-paccaya*) you'd have been incapable of any sort of response beyond that of flopping about like a beached sea cucumber.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 2:36 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

What do you mean by this? The first sentence seems to contradict everything that you've been saying up to this point. What are sammā- and micchā-kammantā if not right and wrong actions?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 17, 2018 10:20 PM

Title: Re: Throwing food

Content:

I don't think that it would be, at least not in the case of any of the normal ways in which people get rid of excess food.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 18, 2018 11:39 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and Sex: Sexual Misconduct

Content:

Now when young Thin Thin is reading chemistry at Keble College, Oxford, while her daddy sits smoking cheroots in Mandalay, in what (uncontrived) sense can it possibly be said that the latter is guarding, watching over or wielding authority over his daughter?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 20, 2018 7:07 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 20, 2018 7:18 PM

Title: Re: Wrong Livelihood: Monk's Alms round

Content:

So, unless one can either read a monk's mind or else knows his character well through long acquaintance, it seems a bit imprudent to publicly accuse him of wrong livelihood merely because his praise for his supporters, and so on, might be interpreted as proceeding from evil wishes and an ambition for gain, honours and renown.

According to Dhammapāla kindly or affectionate speech has harsh speech as its far-

enemy and ingratiating flattery as its near-enemy. As with all kusala things and their near-enemies, the one is easily mistaken for the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 20, 2018 7:52 PM

Title: Re: JE Carpenter, digha nikaya

Content:

He was a Unitarian minister and Sanskrit scholar. He assisted Thomas Rhys Davids with the editing of the romanised Pali editions of the Dīgha Nikāya and its commentary, but I don't think he translated any Pali texts.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Joseph_Estlin_Carpenter

The other Dīgha Nikāya translations beside Walshe's are those of Th. Rhys Davids and the Burmese Sāsanā Piṭaka Association.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 21, 2018 9:41 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

I'm actually already familiar with all the canonical texts in which the ten terms (not nine!) are used.

I was replying, however, to your earlier claim that the said terms are: "...discussed in detail mostly in the three commentaries included in the Tipitaka: Patisambhidamagga, Petakopadesa, and Nettippakarana."

But they are not! They are not even briefly discussed in these texts. Moreover, in no Pali text whatever are the terms ever expounded in a manner that lends any support to your teacher's "nine-stages-in-a-citta's-life" theory. In all texts that expound the terms in detail they are treated as synonyms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Chant vs Abhidhamma

Content:

What is chanted in that link is only a tiny portion of each of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka's seven books. It comprises:

1. Dhammasaṅgaṇī: first paragraph after the conclusion of the mātikā ("matrix", i.e. the opening summary of contents).

2. Vibhaṅga: first paragraph of the book.
3. Dhātukathā: first paragraph of the book.
4. Puggalapaññatti: first paragraph after the conclusion of the mātikā.
5. Kathāvatthu: a paragraph describing the Theravāda's opening sally in the first debate against the Pudgalavādins.
6. Yamaka: first paragraph of the book.
7. Paṭṭhāna: just the mātikā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 3:17 PM
Title: Re: Suttas where bhikkhuni teach rebirth ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 3:49 PM
Title: Re: Are posthumous gifts considered acts of generosity, and do they make merit?
Content:
No. Although nowadays this sort of thing is very widely believed in Buddhist countries, the ancient Pudgalavādin belief that "merit increases with utility" (pari-bhoga-maya-puñña-diṭṭhi) was rejected by the Theravādins at the Third Council.

.

[./download/file.php?id=4646](#)
(142.59 KiB) Downloaded 112 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 5:54 PM
Title: Re: Why it is called self-becomed ?
Content:
Rather than the over-literal "self-become", sayambhū would be better translated either more expansively as "one who has become [what he is] by himself", or else more freely as "self-made man". The monicker means more or less the same as anācariyaka, "one

without a teacher” (with which it is often juxtaposed). Both appellations are applied to sammāsambuddhas and paccekabuddhas to distinguish them from sāvaka arahants (whose enlightenment is owing to a teacher’s guidance).

Sayambhun ti sayameva aññāpadesaṃ vinā pāramiyo pūretvā adhigatabuddhabhāvanti attho.

“Sayambhū”: by himself alone, independent of another’s instruction, having fulfilled the perfections, he has arrived at a Buddha’s state” is the meaning.
(Buddhavaṃsa Atthakathā)

Paratoghosena vinā sayam’eva bhūtā paṭividdhākuppāti.

“Independent of the voice of another, by himself alone he has become one who has broken through to the Immovable state.”
(Visuddhimagga Mahāṭīkā)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 6:31 PM

Title: Re: Why it is called self becomed ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 23, 2018 6:46 PM

Title: Re: Suttas where bhikkhuni teach rebirth ?

Content:

I suppose one can't rule it out, but I think that if it were so, it would be quite remarkable for there to be no Vinaya rule to that effect.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 24, 2018 10:17 PM

Title: Re: discourses nowhere define "virtues dear to the noble ones" or do they?

Content:

But nor do they leave us entirely in the dark, for they ascribe to them eight characteristics. The first four, starting with unbroken, all mean more or less the same thing. They tell us what it is in the manner of their observance that makes these virtues pleasing to Ariyans. It is that the manner of observance is immaculate.

As for the last four attributes, these provide the clue as to what the said virtues are. Just look through the suttas to see what things are described with one or more of these terms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 25, 2018 7:41 PM

Title: Re: discourses nowhere define "virtues dear to the noble ones" or do they?

Content:

No, I composed my reply before I had seen yours.

(I'll reply to the other posters later this week).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 25, 2018 8:29 PM

Title: Re: Seeking scriptural source for "all defilements temporarily suppressed when in jhana"

Content:

If it's the case that the arising of uddhacca is concomitant with the arising of any kind of akusala state, then it follows that no akusala state can be present on any occasion when uddhacca is absent.

So it certainly makes logical sense. One can only reject the conclusion by denying the factualness of the premise.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 26, 2018 10:30 AM

Title: Re: Suttas where bhikkhuni teach rebirth ?

Content:

And is there any particular conclusion that you think can be drawn from these observations?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 28, 2018 1:13 AM

Title: Re: discourses nowhere define "virtues dear to the noble ones" or do they?

Content:

The Sarakāṇi episode shows that such a notion was around at the Buddha's time. That is, there were definite public expectations as to how a sotāpanna (or someone thought to be one) would behave.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 28, 2018 8:29 PM

Title: Re: Question and answers website by Ven. Dhammanando

Content:

Hi Sarath,

Though I appreciate the gracious proposal, I'm afraid I have to decline it. My posting here and at Sutta Central and Facebook already takes up all the time (i.e., an hour and a half a day) that I'm prepared to devote to online stuff.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 29, 2018 6:50 PM

Title: Re: Chiang Mai visit?

Content:

In the cool season.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 29, 2018 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Question and answers website by Ven. Dhammanando

Content:

These days it's almost entirely communication by private message. I have found myself being involuntarily added to no end of Facebook Buddhist groups but I don't usually read or post to any of them. Every few months I manually remove my name from each group and click the button that stops the moderators from re-adding me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 29, 2018 7:14 PM

Title: Re: For Monks Only: travelling by vehicles

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 30, 2018 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Why don't people remember their past lives according to the suttas?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 1, 2018 8:42 AM
Title: Re: Eyes Open Or Closed During Practice?
Content:
Cakkhupala did.

<https://www.tipitaka.net/tipitaka/dhp/verseload.php?verse=001>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 1, 2018 8:49 PM
Title: Re: Who attained enlightenment on the 7th day as a king
Content:
It's the background story to Dhammapada 171.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/13-04.htm>

Edit:

On second thoughts, the story of Santati is a better fit. Both stories have a dying nautch-girl, but only in the second does anyone get enlightened.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/10-09.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 1, 2018 9:47 PM
Title: Re: discourses nowhere define "virtues dear to the noble ones" or do they?
Content:
No, I was alluding to his inability to transfer his allegiance to an outside teacher.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Oct 1, 2018 9:52 PM
Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873
Content:
There are three scanned copies at archive.org

<https://archive.org/search.php?query=peebles%20christianity>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 2, 2018 8:55 AM

Title: Re: Bhante Sujatos and karmic snobbery.

Content:

Well, not really. The methods employed in modern academic scholarship of the early Buddhist texts are adapted from those used in biblical "Higher Criticism". This is something that didn't get started until the European Enlightenment(s) and has nothing remotely like it in traditional/monastic Buddhist scholarship.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Higher_criticism

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 2, 2018 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873

Content:

I wonder, are you familiar with Gunapala Dharmasiri's Buddhist Critique of the Christian Concept of God? If not, I commend it to your attention as a book that will probably prepare you for about 90 percent of the brickbats that philosophy undergrads are likely to hurl in your direction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 2, 2018 4:33 PM

Title: Re: Bhante Sujatos and karmic snobbery.

Content:

Certainly. Starting, it seems, with the third sermon: a talk on fire to fire worshipers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 2, 2018 4:49 PM

Title: Re: Bhante Sujatos and karmic snobbery.

Content:

I would be inclined to put it the other way round and say that Samyaksambodhi has nothing to do with Enlightenment.

What I mean by this is, firstly, that Enlightenment was being used as a term for a certain period in European intellectual history long before anyone used it to translate Bodhi, and secondly, that it's not really a very good translation. Awakening would be more accurate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 3, 2018 8:36 AM

Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873

Content:

I'll take a look at the Peebles book and get back to you.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 3, 2018 8:38 AM

Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873

Content:

./download/file.php?id=4661

(164.83 KiB) Downloaded 66 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 3, 2018 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873

Content:

Hi Miguel,

This is what I've come up with so far. I have about another 40 pages to go.

I don't know whether there is more than one edition of Peebles' book, but the page numbers for the notes below are based on

<https://archive.org/details/THEGREATDEBATEBUDDHISMAAndChristianityFACETofACEPeeblesJ.M.MohattiwatteGunandaDeSilva/page/n1>.

* * * * *

10. Buddha speaking of a Rahan named Thamula, said..

Thamula is the Burmese pronunciation of Sāḷha Thera, mentioned in the Mahāsudassana and Mahāparinibbāna Suttas.

10. Nāgasena, a Buddhist missionary before the Christian era, said...

The quotation seems at best a very crude paraphrase of what the Milindapañha and Nāgasena Bhikṣu Sūtra say about Nibbāna.

12. Sin will come back upon the sinful...

Dhammapada verses 125, 71, 160 & 165, 1, 16, 23.

16-17. The following constitutes the ethical code...

Five sīlas and ten kusala kammaṭṭhāras, though very amusingly translated, e.g.,
sammādiṭṭhi = Thou shalt not follow the doctrines of false gods.

21. To me said this High Priest...

Rev. Sumaṅgala's conception of Nibbāna seems to be that of Sir Edwin Arnold's Light of Asia (1879) rather than any Buddhist text.

21. The Buddhist Catechism...

Of Col. W.S. Olcott.

26. Thoubat wished to see him...

Thoubat is the Burmese pronunciation of Subhadda.

40-41. In proof of this, he quoted the following...

Samanupassanā and Khandha Suttas, SN. iii. 46-47

42. The following extracts will bear out this statement...

Vibhaṅga Sutta, SN. ii. 2-4

42-43. Priests, I will preach to you sabbaṃ...

Sabba Sutta, SN. iv. 15

43. Again, according to the following authorities...

Vibhaṅga Sutta, SN. ii. 2-4

43. What is nama? Sensation, perception...

Abhidhamma Piṭaka, Vibhaṅga 136

43-44. Again, in the Milindaprasne it is stated...

Nāmarūpapaṭisandahanapañha, Mil. 49.

44. But from the following quotation it would appear...

Upaya Sutta, SN. iii. 53-54

44-45. Again, from the following quotations...

Sammohavinodanī, Pakiṇṇakakathā, Vibh-a. 21.

46. Now from the following extracts it will be seen that Buddha...

Anattalakkhaṇa Sutta, SN. iii. 66-68.

46-47. It is also stated, as will be seen from the following extracts...

Sahetu-anatta Sutta, SN. iii. 24.

47. The same is stated respecting the Ayatanas...

Ajjhattānattahetu Sutta, SN. iv. 130-131

48. In defining death, it is stated...

Sammādiṭṭhi Sutta, MN. 9.

48. In the advice given by Buddha to the priests to cast away all desire...

Chandarāga Sutta, SN. iii. 27

48-49. In the Mahapadhana Suttam it is stated...

Mahāpadāna Sutta, DN. 14.

50-51. And now with reference to the second point...

Aññatarabrāhmaṇa Sutta, SN. ii. 75-76.

51. Again King Milinda asked Nāgasena the following question...

Aññakāyasaṅkamanapañha, Mil. 72.

51-52. Again, the following passages occurred in one of the comments...

Visuddhimagga, Kaṅkhāvitaraṇavisuddhiniddesa, Paccayapariggahakathā. = Path of Purification ch. XIX § 22.

52. In consequence of the power of actions performed by beings...

Untraced.

52. Again, defining what birth was, in various parts of Buddhist literature...

Vibhaṅga Sutta, SN. ii. 2-4

52-53. Speaking of Khandhas and Ayatanas, it is said...

Untraced.

56. ... not a different being...

Dhammasantatipañha, Mil. 41-42

59-60. The following Pali extract from the Kathawastu...

Kvu. 30; Points of Controversy 28-29

62. If it were some substance that they meant by Atma, surely it would not be difficult to confine it by locking up a dying man in an airtight chest...

Cf. Payasi Sutta, DN. 23

74. In illustration of the fact that words have different meanings...

Vin. i. 86.

75. and quoted the following passage from the Samyutta Nikaya...

Paṭiccasamuppāda Sutta, SN. ii. 1

79. defined to be...

Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta, SN. v. 421

85. and he would now quote a passage from the Buddhist Scriptures..

Sammohavinodanī - Viññāṇapadaniddesa, Vibh-a. 163

89. The Buddhist doctrine concerning man was...

Tiṇakaṭṭha Sutta, SN. ii. 178

92. It was said of the wife of the Emperor Bimbisara...

Thusa Jātaka, Jāt. 338

93. He would refer to a few of the thirty-two good and cheerful omens and wonders...

Nidānakathā p. 151. (Th. Rhys Davids' translation is available from archive.org)

104. In the first place, Buddha's own mother died...

Acchariya-abbhūta Sutta, MN. 123.

104. Even beasts died by the roaring...

Sīha Sutta, SN. iii. 84-85.

104. Aggohamasmi lokassa...

Acchariya-abbhūta Sutta, MN. 123.

108. Give me your two children as an alms offering...

Vessantara Jātaka, Jāt. 547.

109. yodun...

Sinhala pronunciation of yojana.

109. it is said in Buddhist works that if the ropes and strings...

Cariyā-a. 41.

110. For instance, in Mahawagge it is said that Buddha...

Vin. i. 4-6.

110-111. he decided on preaching his Dhamma to Alarakalama...

Vin. i. 7.

114-115. Even the sage Buddhaghosa was so conscious of the difficulty of rightly explaining...

Visuddhimagga - Paṭiccasamuppādakathā. Path of Purification ch. XVII. § 25.

116. The doctrine of causation is enunciated...

Paṭiccasamuppāda Sutta, SN. ii. 1

116-117. Though, when it is said curd is made...

Visuddhimagga - Abhiññāniddesa. Path of Purification ch. XIII. § 107.

- Paññābhūminiddesa, Path of Purification ch. XVII 167.

- Diṭṭhivisuddhiniddesa, Path of Purification ch. XVIII 29

117. The Patthanaprakarana of Abhidharma also has the following...

Paṭṭh. i. 24-25

Full paragraph:

Ahetukaṃ dhammaṃ paṭicca sahetuko dhammo uppajjati hetupaccayā:

vicikicchāsahagataṃ uddhaccasahagataṃ moham paṭicca sampayuttakā khandhā;

paṭisandhikkhaṇe vatthum paṭicca sahetukā khandhā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 4, 2018 6:39 PM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

I think you've misunderstood the translator's English idiom:

"There is no fetter bound by which the householder Ugga of Hatthigāma might return to this world," in simpler English means "Ugga doesn't have any fetter that would cause him to return to this world," which means that it's not possible for him to return to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 4, 2018 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

No, but it describes a person who is one. The feature attributed to Ugga wouldn't apply if he wasn't one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 4, 2018 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

You haven't yet supplied any reason for why we might reasonably suppose this to have happened. If you don't have any reason then

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hitchens%27s_razor can be applied to all your "What ifs?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 5, 2018 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

An arahant doesn't return to any world.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 5, 2018 7:23 PM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

Now this has been done. The posters who've done it have not sought to convince you that the anāgāmin-related suttas are reliable for this wasn't asked about. They have merely answered the question quoted above: Whether the cited suttas are reliable or unreliable, this is what they say...

If you now want to advance the claim that the cited suttas are not reliable, then the burden of proof is on you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 5, 2018 7:38 PM

Title: Re: Cut down the forest (lust), but not the tree?

Content:

The Pali commentators understand "not a tree" more prosaically as merely serving the purpose of disambiguation, i.e., of making it clear that it's vana in the sense of 'lust' that has to be cut down, not vana in the sense of 'forest'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 5, 2018 8:16 PM

Title: Re: Chiang Mai visit?

Content:

Since the end of last year's rainy season I've been living in a kuti in a rubber forest in the Phrao District of Chiang Mai. I'm about 4 km from Wat Doi Mae Pang, the monastery of the late Luang Poo Waen.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 5, 2018 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Why sakadagami and anagami disciples not found ?

Content:

Sometimes it is, but I think you'll find that "one with āsavas extinguished" is a much commoner term when referring to named individuals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 6, 2018 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Chiang Mai visit?

Content:

It's about 100 km from the Changpeuak bus station to the market town of Phrao. Wat Doi Mae Pang is about 16 km before Phrao.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 8, 2018 12:12 PM

Title: Re: How to Pronounce Theravada

Content:

Your proposed transliteration makes 'r' the final consonant of the first syllable when in fact it's the initial consonant of the second syllable.

Also, the insertion of a hyphen between the 't' and the 'h' gives the misleading impression that there is a hiatus, making the monosyllable 'The' into a bisyllable. I suggest:

tay-ra-vah-duh

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 8, 2018 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Threefold request for help: Christian-Buddhist debates of 1862-1873

Content:

157-158. He would have died at the appointed day...

Commentary to the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta, DN. 16

158-159. and the last stage, that of the complete destruction of relics...

Mohavicchedanī & Manorathapūraṇī.

160. but his omniscience was not of such an unpleasant nature...

The Buddha's sabbaññuta-ñāṇa is discussed in many places in the Milindapañha. I think the monk probably alludes to the Sabbaññūbhāvapañha, Mil. 74.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 10, 2018 11:21 PM

Title: Re: [MN 111] Fallacy of Anupadadhammavipassana while in a jhana

Content:

This talk of the rarity of the word adhimokkha in the suttas seems a bit of a to me.

Though the word may be rare, what it denotes most certainly is not. The idea is conveyed most often by *adhimuccati*, the verb from which *adhimokkha* derives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 11, 2018 4:44 AM

Title: Re: Birth control and Buddhism

Content:

Perhaps because the Buddha taught that one should "see danger in the slightest fault". If a birth control pill might act as an abortifacient, then in taking it one might end up killing a human being.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 13, 2018 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Birth control and Buddhism

Content:

My response was concerned only with those means of birth control that may either work by preventing conception or by inducing abortion, with no certainty as to which outcome will occur.

Methods that can only do one thing or the other are pretty black and white as far as kamma is concerned. With one you're killing a human being, with the other you're not.

But with methods that are of variable outcome I think it is better to appeal to other considerations than kamma in counselling against their use. Ahimsa and compassion, for example. Appealing to kamma may simply lead someone to recklessly rationalize that she'll use the pill with the intention of preventing conception and if it happens to result in an abortion... too bad, it wasn't what she intended, so no *akusala kamma*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 16, 2018 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha ever state flatly...

Content:

We don't. We cannot understand it if we've resolved in advance that we're not going to follow the Buddha's own example by being *vibhajjavādins*, that is, "makers of distinctions". The distinction between the afflictive kind of desire that is eliminated by arahantship and the non-afflictive kind that is not, is essential to understanding how one can be a Buddha or an Arahant and still be capable of purposive action.

If someone were to say: "Without allowing ourselves to be diverted by any talk about racquets, balls and nets; baselines, sidelines and service lines; the rules of play and the

scoring system, let's instead focus on the central question: What exactly is tennis?" then he would be making his question unanswerable by his dismissal of the very things that we need to talk about if we are to explain what sort of a thing tennis is.

This is exactly what you are doing with your dismissal of what you call: "textual gymnastics and picking on which Pali words mean what, defining desire, chanda, wishing, lobha, and on and on, and using nuanced understanding of ancient and modern language..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 17, 2018 2:41 PM

Title: Re: The Satipatthana Sutta a forgery?

Content:

Despite its slightly misleading title, this thread is actually about the Mahāsatipaṭṭhāna Sutta. It's concerned with the thesis in Ven. Sujāto's book, History of Mindfulness, (linked to in the opening post) that in early Buddhism the objects of the fourth satipaṭṭhāna were just the hindrances and seven enlightenment factors. All of the other dhammānupassanā items given in the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta, along with the expanded account of the four noble truths in the Mahāsatipaṭṭhāna Sutta, are claimed to be later additions by ābhīdhammikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 19, 2018 8:10 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha ever state flatly...

Content:

What we call 'desire' in English corresponds to so many different things in Pali that any statement to the effect that "the arahant has ended desire" cannot be accepted without considerable qualification. The things corresponding to 'desire' in the Buddha's teaching can be broadly divided into three classes: firstly, those which are eradicated in an arahant; secondly those which are left wholly intact (and in certain arahants may even be increased); and thirdly, those which have become attenuated and modified.

Examples:

Eradicated desires

Three kinds of craving (taṇhā): for sense-pleasure, being and non-being.

Four kinds of grasping: for sense-pleasure, view, habitual and vowed observances, and self-doctrines.

The unwholesome root of lust/attachment (lobha/rāga akusalamūla).

The sensuality and being inflows (kāmaśava, bhavāśava).

Intact desires

Desiring the welfare and happiness of all beings (mettā).

Desiring that suffering being be free from suffering (karuṇā).

Desiring that successful and happy beings continue in their success and happiness (muditā).

Attenuated and modified desires

Desire-to-act (chanda).

Deciding/resolving upon (adhimokkha).

Volition/intention (cetanā).

These are attenuated in the sense that they no longer aim at anything unskillful. They are modified in the sense that actions proceeding from them are non-kamma-generating for an arahant.

As for aversion and fear, these are entirely eradicated in an arahant. But their absence does not prevent the arahant from acting in certain prudent ways that in a non-arahant would typically be prompted by aversion or fear. For example, when the needle-haired yakkha leaned his body towards the Buddha, the Buddha leaned away to avoid getting pricked.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 23, 2018 1:56 PM

Title: Re: Jambudipa

Content:

Tissārāma is another name for the Mahāmeghavana in Anuradhapura.

Etc., etc., etc.

In conclusion, if you want to resort to conspiracy theory to bolster your nationalist conceit, you'll need to go much further back than the twilight days of the British Raj. To judge from your nation's chronicles, it must have been the ancient Sinhalese themselves who fomented a plot to deny their island the honour of being the Buddha's birthplace!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 23, 2018 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Jambudipa

Content:

As for the individuals involved, there are dozens of them: past Buddhas, yakkhas, kumbhaṇḍas, gandhabbas; some named and some not. Who in particular would you like to know about?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 24, 2018 7:38 PM

Title: Re: Birth control and Buddhism

Content:

As I've already said, as far as abstention from killing is concerned there's nothing morally problematic about contraceptives, i.e., methods employed to prevent conception from taking place. I'm afraid I don't see what relevance vegetarianism might have here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 25, 2018 6:35 PM

Title: Re: Why don't we follow Noble Tenfold Path?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 25, 2018 7:11 PM

Title: Re: Birth control and Buddhism

Content:

As there wasn't any such means of birth control in the Buddha's day unsurprisingly there are no canonical teachings on the subject. So all we have are personal opinions (attanomati). Mine, as already stated, is that a birth control method that might act as an abortifacient is best avoided, for in using it one might end up killing a human being, even though one didn't intend this and was hoping merely to prevent conception. The killing of a human is a most unfortunate thing to happen to the human that gets killed, even in scenarios where it doesn't result in any unwholesome kamma for the person responsible.

Still, as I said, it's just one monk's attanomati, so you needn't feel obliged to agree.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 29, 2018 4:01 PM

Title: Re: The Self and Control

Content:

<https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gostak>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 30, 2018 10:18 AM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

I know a mnemonic technique that will help you, but may I first enquire how much time per day you are able and willing to devote to it?

There are about fifteen-and-a-half thousand syllables in the Pali text of the Dhammapada, so if you memorise five hundred syllables per day (i.e., the equivalent of twenty-nine haikus or three and a half sonnets), then you will have the whole Dhammapada committed to memory in just thirty-one days. Start on All Saints' Day and you'll be finished by St. Grwst's Day.

But you'll need to spend an hour and a half a day on it, and in three sessions with at least a 3-hour interval between them: a 45-minute session for writing out the day's text and preparing the mnemonicons, a 30-minute one for oral recital (first with the text, then with the mnemonicons and finally by memory alone), and a 15-minute one for revision of the verses memorised the day before.

Let me know if you're interested and have enough time. If you're interested but don't have an hour and a half per day to spare, then let me know how much time you do have so that I can make the necessary adjustments.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 7, 2018 1:01 AM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

Attached is the file for 31-day memorising of the Dhammapada. Tomorrow I'll post instructions on the method.

[./download/file.php?id=4683](#)

(698.61 KiB) Downloaded 136 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 9, 2018 1:00 PM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

Apologies for the delay. The instruction file is on my laptop, whose battery is unfortunately flat and whose power cable is not working. I'll post the guide next week when the new cable comes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 10, 2018 11:19 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Sujato's Four Nikaya translations as Ebooks—October 2018

Content:

He states his reasons here...

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/translating-the-four-nikayas/341>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 14, 2018 9:29 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Quite right! It is from how they are pronounced by modern Englishmen —not Romanians— that we learn both the correct pronunciation of Classical Latin words, and, more importantly, their deeper and hidden meanings.

And so for a little diversion, let's take a look at what happens when we do with English and Latin what Waharakaist philology does with Sinhala and Pali...

1. The possessive plural of 'octopus' is octopuses'.
2. Octopuses' ends in es'.
3. 'Essene' begins with es.
4. If in a single language two syllables of two different words happen to be spelled the same, then they must mean the same.
5. Therefore there is a connection between Essenes and octopuses.
6. The deeper meaning of Latin words can be discerned by listening to how they are pronounced by modern Englishmen.
7. Though the Romans pronounced the -seni in Esseni as 'saynee', Englishmen have preserved the word's deeper/hidden meaning by spelling the word Essene and pronouncing the -sene part as 'seen'.
8. Therefore its deeper meaning is 'seen'.
9. Therefore the Essenes were Jewish ascetics who had visions of octopuses.

With the exception of items #4 and #6, each premise and conclusion in this jaw-droppingly absurd syllogism merely replicates one or another of the kinds of philological "reasoning" found on the Pure Dhamma website. Premises #4 and #6 serve merely to make the argument a little more transparent than the Waharakaist ones, by stating explicitly what the Pure Dhamma site-owner just quietly and naïvely assumes to be the case with Sinhala and Pali.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 15, 2018 9:46 PM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

2. Read the text through as many times as is necessary for your recital to be fluent. There are a few words that you may stumble over at first. In particular when pronouncing *kāsāvamarahati*, *vantakasāvassa* and *kāsāvamarahati* make sure that you're pronouncing the long and short vowels correctly. If you need help with the pronunciation, listen to Bhikshu Bodhijñāna's reading:

.

The pace of your recital should be somewhat slower than normal conversational speed – roughly that of T. S. Eliot reciting the Four Quartets:

.

Note that your aim at this stage should be solely that of attaining correctness and fluency rather than that of memorising anything.

3. Once your recital is fluent take a sheet of paper and copy out the text in full from the pdf file that I posted earlier. Do this very slowly, repeating each word aloud four or five times as you write it.

4. Then take another sheet of paper and copy out Mnemonicon A, reciting the full word as you copy each syllable:

.

[./download/file.php?id=4692&mode=view](#)

As you copy, try to remember what the full word is without looking at the text. If you can't, then cheat by looking at the text, but always try to exert your memory first.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 15, 2018 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

5. Pause, take a deep breath and close your eyes for a minute or two to clear your head. Read the whole text again and then copy out Mnemonicon B using the same procedure as for Mnemonicon A.

.

[./download/file.php?id=4693&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 15, 2018 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

6. Pause and read the whole text again as in stage 5. Then copy out Mnemonicon C, this time attempting to recite the whole line after writing each syllable. As in stage 4 try to rely initially on your memory alone and cheat only when necessary.

.

[./download/file.php?id=4694&mode=view](#)

7. Transfer the merit of your dhamma-dhāraṇa to all beings.

Session Two, ca 30 minutes.

1. Read the full text.
2. Recite the text using Mnemonicon A, cheating only when necessary.
3. Do the same using Mnemonicons B and then C.
4. Recite the full text using your memory alone.

If you should fail, then don't increase the time beyond 30 minutes, but rather try reducing the workload on subsequent days (e.g. by one verse per day) until you find how much you can comfortably manage. As you become more skilled at memorising you will find that this amount will gradually increase. For most people it will eventually plateau at about 2000 syllables a day, at which rate it is possible to memorise the whole of the Dīgha Nikāya in about eight months.

Session Three, ca 15 minutes.

1. Recite the material that you memorised the day before. Try at first to do this from memory alone. If you fail, then try doing it using Mnemonicon C. If that fails (though it shouldn't!) then use Mnemonicon B, and if that fails, then Mnemonicon A, before reverting to memory alone.
2. Recite the material that you memorised three days before.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 15, 2018 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Memorizing Suttas - Methods?

Content:

One more point: in the first session some people find it easier if they copy the text and mnemonicons first, leaving the oral recital (stage 2) until last. Try both and see what works for you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 15, 2018 10:19 PM

Title: Re: The Gandhabba

Content:

Some years ago I looked up all the commentarial and sub-commentarial discussions of the gandhabba to see what ābhidhammikas identified it with when giving a paramattha exposition of the concept. Given the Classical Theravāda's rejection of the antarābhava I was anticipating that it would be equated with either the cutting-off consciousness or rebirth-linking consciousness.

What I found, however, is that none of the accounts of the gandhabba in the Atthakathās and Tīkās ever take the step of identifying it with anything abhidhammic. The three glosses of the term (tatrūpagasatto, gantabbo and uppajjanakasatto) all belong just as much in the sphere of conventional truth as the term gandhabba itself.

By the way, note the correct spelling of the Pali for “intermediate state”: antarābhava. Your spelling, antarabhāva, would mean either ‘insideness’ or else would be the second person singular imperative of antarabhāveti, the causative form of antarabhavati, “to disappear”.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 16, 2018 6:29 PM

Title: Re: The Gandhabba

Content:

Yes. Assuming ‘gandhabba’ to be a term whose referent would have been understood by the Buddha's listeners (an audience of unconverted brahmins in the Assalāyanasutta and the goofball Sāti in the Mahātaṇhāsankhayasutta) to be a living being rather than a dhamma, then the said referent would be a paññatti, not a dhamma, and as such would belong within the sammuti field of discourse.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 4, 2018 3:44 PM

Title: Re: Can a sotāpanna committ suicide?

Content:

In the Pali texts it seems to be the other way around. The Vinaya has a story of a bhikkhu who attained jhāna but didn't realise that he had done so, but there are no accounts of ariyan disciples who weren't aware of their ariyan attainments.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 4, 2018 4:20 PM

Title: Re: A Trojan horse: Thanissaro bhikkhus response to Bhikkhu Analayo

Content:

It's here...

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/a-trojan-horse-thanissaro-bhikkhus-response-to-analayo/11354>

It's just reached the 150th post.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 4, 2018 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Can a sotāpanna committ suicide?

Content:

Sure, puthujjanas can mistakenly think that they're arahants, but arahants can't mistakenly think that they're puthujjanas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 12, 2018 1:17 AM

Title: Re: Script Converter

Content:

It will convert any of the scripts to any of the others. Just click on the dropdown menu at the top right and select one of the romanised schemes (there are several to choose from). This is Lanna converted to IAST:

.

[./download/file.php?id=4712&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 14, 2018 10:16 AM

Title: Re: What's the meaning of "pañcā nodhi sattodhisā, siyuṃ dvādasapuggalā"?

Content:

pañcā nodhi sattodhisā, siyuṃ dvādasapuggalā" should be written:

pañc'ānodhisatt'odhisā, siyuṃ dvādasapuggalā."

Form-equivalent translation:

"Five with unspecified intentness, seven with specified intentness, would be twelve individuals."

Explanatory translation:

"The [objects of] the five [ways of developing loving-kindness] with unspecified intentness and the [objects of] the seven [ways of developing lovingkindness] with specified intentness are [altogether] twelve kinds of individuals."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 14, 2018 1:21 PM

Title: Re: What's the meaning of "pañcā nodhi sattodhisā, siyuṃ dvādasapuggalā"?

Content:

One possibility is that odhisā = odhi + esā.

But as there are many errors in the CSCD edition of the Caturārakkhadīpanī another possibility is that the word is a misspelling of odhiso, one of the word's two forms in the instrumental singular (the other being odhinā) but nearly always functioning adverbially. When transcribing from Ledi Sayadaw's Burmese Pali it wouldn't be too difficult to mistake သ္မိဓိသော for သ္မိဓိသ.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 15, 2018 1:46 PM

Title: Re: Star Water Blessing...

Content:

On a Thai multi-tiered home shrine one might find almost anything placed on the lower tiers below the Buddha statue. For example:

- * Pictures of one's parents and favourite ajahns.
- * Brass mini-stupas containing the ashes of deceased relatives.
- * An offering tray loaded with the owner's collection of Buddha amulets.

- * Hindu gods.
- * Jīvaka Komārabhacca, Saṅkaccaya, Hotei, Kwan Yin, etc.
- * Photos of the King and Queen, silver and gold parasols and other monarchy-related emblems.
- * Scraps of cloth with mantras and maṇḍalas drawn on them.
- * A photo of the manager or captain of whatever football team the owner supports.

And of course Mae Thoranee. Actually it needn't be her — any old mermaid will do. Many Thais in Iceland and Denmark have scaled-down replicas of Copenhagen's Den lille Havfrue on their shrines.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 17, 2018 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Ven. Nanavira: "Sotapanna is completely free of dukkha."

Content:

Unless my memory's at fault, I'm quite sure that Ñāṇavīra did not hold the view your informant attributes to him and I don't think he ever discussed the Salla Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 17, 2018 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Translation of sutta Sumanabuddhavaṃso

Content:

The text was translated by I.B. Horner as Chronicle of the Buddhas (published in the PTS's Minor Anthologies series), and its commentary as Clarifier of the Sweet Meaning. I don't think either of these translations are among those which the PTS has placed in the public domain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 18, 2018 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Mindfulness vs full consciousness

Content:

Ven. Aggacitta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 18, 2018 7:46 PM

Title: Re: Is buddhism difficult? Why?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 15, 2019 3:47 PM
Title: Re: Are there any Nanoviraist monasteries?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 15, 2019 6:02 PM
Title: Re: Nikkhepavāra/Paccaya niddessa/translation...
Content:
This is U Nārada's translation from the first volume of the Book of Conditional Relations, published by the Pali Text Society.

[./download/file.php?id=4753](#)
(70.84 KiB) Downloaded 125 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 12:38 PM
Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat
Content:
The translator that you quote above (Bhikkhu Bodhi) half follows the commentary but has either intentionally or inadvertently left out the stipulation that limits the case to bhikkhus.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 3:35 PM
Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat
Content:
It's not considered to be a violation of the first precept. In the Vinaya the consumption of unallowable meat was only made a misdemeanour (dukkaṭa). If it amounted to intentionally killing living beings then it would have been included in the class of offences entailing expiation (pācittiya) along with the prohibitions against killing animals, throwing away water containing living beings, etc.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 3:39 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

Your post is dependent on a translation that is dependent on a commentary. The quoted translation differs from the earlier translation of Horner only in that the translator has followed the commentary partly rather than entirely.

If we were to entirely reject what the commentary has to say on this matter then we should be wholly in the dark as to what “seen, heard or suspected” might mean. You wouldn't be able to claim any more authority for your view than: “My personal hunch is that the phrase ‘seen, heard or suspected’ probably means ‘blah, blah, blah...’”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 4:04 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 4:43 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

What kind of bad kamma would it be?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 24, 2019 5:32 PM

Title: Re: What are the ways in which a monk can disrobe or be disrobed?

Content:

Being one who has committed one of the four defeating offences.

Being one of eleven kinds of person who shouldn't have been ordained in the first place:

a paṇḍaka;

a non-human being;

a hermaphrodite;

a person who had previously posed as a bhikkhu without having been ordained;

an ex-bhikkhu who had previously gone over to an outside teaching without first giving up his status as a bhikkhu;

a patricide;

a matricide;

an arahanticide;

a man who has sexually molested a bhikkhunī;

a man who has maliciously injured a Buddha to the point of causing him to bleed;
a man who had previously caused a schism in the Saṅgha.

I wish you success in resolving this problem.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 25, 2019 9:05 AM

Title: Re: What are the ways in which a monk can disrobe or be disrobed?

Content:

Suppose two bhikkhus, Tissa and Nāga, decide that Buddhism is nonsense and Jainism is the true faith. Both now wish to become Jain monks but they go about it in different ways.

Tissa formally renounces his bhikkhuhood and then goes to the Jains and gets ordained by them. Nāga, who's in a great hurry, doesn't bother renouncing his bhikkhuhood but just goes straight to a Jain ashram and while still ordained as a Buddhist bhikkhu gets himself ordained as a Jain monk.

Both are now ex-bhikkhus, but whereas Tissa has become an ex-bhikkhu in an approved manner, Nāga has made himself a titthiyapakkantaka ("one who departed to the outsiders"), which is the equivalent of committing a pārājika offence.

If in the future the two of them regain their faith in the Dhamma, Tissa will be allowed to re-ordain as a bhikkhu after undergoing a four-month probation, but Nāga is banned for life from ordaining.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 25, 2019 6:26 PM

Title: Re: What are the ways in which a monk can disrobe or be disrobed?

Content:

The absolute prohibition against ordaining a titthiyapakkantaka is from the Vinaya's Mahāvagga, but with no definition, nor even the slightest clue, as to what such a person might be. The definition (including the identifying of such persons as de facto pārājika) is from the Vinaya Atthakathā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 25, 2019 6:52 PM

Title: Re: What are the ways in which a monk can disrobe or be disrobed?

Content:

It's a matter that seems to be differently dealt with from one nikāya to another. So, depending on the nikāya the consequences might be:

1. None at all — the man continues to be treated as a Theravādin bhikkhu in good standing.
2. Expulsion from membership of the nikāya but not from bhikkhuhood.
3. Treatment as a titthiyapakkantaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 27, 2019 12:16 AM

Title: Re: Does eating meat violate the second precept?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 27, 2019 12:58 AM

Title: Re: Ascetics and brahmins (Samaṇa Brāhmaṇā) Enlightened ones or Priests

Content:

To those who are samaṇabrāhmaṇā either in the sense of virtuous ascetics of any persuasion or in the sense of noble disciples, but with a special emphasis on the meritoriousness of gifts to the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 27, 2019 4:02 PM

Title: Re: Ascetics and brahmins (Samaṇa Brāhmaṇā) Enlightened ones or Priests

Content:

I don't have any texts at my fingertips, but going from memory the two main criteria for judging the worthiness of outsiders is (1) whether they teach the doctrine of ownership of kamma; (2) whether they correctly teach the distinction between kusala dhammas and akusala ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 27, 2019 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Ascetics and brahmins (Samaṇa Brāhmaṇā) Enlightened ones or Priests

Content:

Not generally but only when it is being used in the second sense.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 28, 2019 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Ascetics and brahmins (Samaṇa Brāhmaṇā) Enlightened ones or Priests

Content:

Any that teach kammassakatā, the doctrine that one is the owner of one's kamma.

Bear in mind, however, that what counts as kammassakatā seems to have been conceived fairly liberally by the Buddha. For example, as I mentioned in my reply to Doodoot, the Buddha was willing to recognise the Jains as kammassakatavādins even though there were some important differences between his conception of kamma and that of Mahāvira.

With that in mind, it seems to me that most religions have teachings whose implications are similar to those of kammassakatāvāda. The exceptions would be those religions committed to a fatalistic and/or grace-based soteriology.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 28, 2019 2:51 PM

Title: Re: Dealing with tragedy

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 28, 2019 6:52 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

The normal intentions that arise when humans select among a range of available foods are directed towards relieving their hunger and/or giving pleasure to their palates. I doubt anyone in the history of human gastronomy has ever gone into a restaurant and ordered a pistache de mouton or a lamb chop because he wanted to cause more sheep to be killed, or ordered huîtres grillées because he wanted to cause more oysters to be caught. The mere anticipation that one's choosing meat or fish might contribute to such an outcome doesn't suffice to make this one's intention.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 29, 2019 11:34 AM

Title: Re: Are my future parents already here?

Content:

In Pali usage when A and B are conversing, any time A says "mātā" (or some other familial term) it always means "your (i.e. B's) mother" unless: (1) A uses some possessive pronoun to indicate that it's his own mother or some third party's mother, (2) A uses some indefinite pronoun (e.g. aññatara) to indicate that it's some unspecified mother, or (3) A and B are siblings, in which case it means "our mother".

Taṃ kho pana te etaṃ pāpakammaṃ. Neva mātārā kataṃ na pitārā kataṃ...

"That evil action was done by you. It was not done by [your] mother, it was not done by [your] father..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 30, 2019 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Do you have faith in celibacy?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 30, 2019 4:03 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

Not necessarily. Buddhist vegetarians who advocate vegetarianism using the same kind of consequentialist arguments that are used by non-Buddhist vegetarians wouldn't be misrepresenting the Buddha's teaching, for they wouldn't be representing (or claiming to represent) the Buddha's teaching at all. In my opinion it would be best if they stuck to doing just this.

The problem is when they try to argue their case by invoking teachings like, say, the description of the first precept or the Buddha's teachings on kamma. When they do this they always end up talking nonsense and misrepresenting the teachings in question. In the case of kamma, for example, either they'll go astray by invoking a Jain-like conception of kamma in which the intention prompting one's action is treated as irrelevant, or else they'll play fast and loose with the word "intention", mistakenly supposing the semantic range of this word in English to be co-extensive with that of cetanā in the Pali suttas.

In your case, however, I don't know whether or not you are erring in this way because it's not clear whether the argument in your earlier post was meant to be grounded in dhammic kamma theory or extra-dhammic consequentialism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 30, 2019 4:20 PM

Title: Re: The "three rules" of eating meat

Content:

As I've already said, the "meat pure in three respects" teaching is not part of the sila of householders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 30, 2019 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu, Bhikkhuni and food

Content:

The modern practice (mostly in Thai forest wats) of requiring that offered food that has been touched by a layperson or sāmaṇera should be re-offered before it can be eaten is derived from clause #5.

In my opinion the clause does not apply to food that has been touched by a bhikkhunī because throughout the Vinaya bhikkhunīs are classed as upasampanna.

But Ajahn Thanissaro disagrees. His argument is based on clause #1. In Vinaya a bhikkhu who undergoes a spontaneous sex change is thereafter classified as a bhikkhunī. And so Thanissaro reasons that if food touched by a bhikkhu who's spontaneously changed into a bhikkhunī is to be reckoned as no longer offered, then so should food offered by the rather more common congenitally female bhikkhunīs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 30, 2019 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu, Bhikkhuni and food

Content:

Yes, for them it's pācittiya 122.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 31, 2019 2:56 PM

Title: Re: Who are your favourite non-Buddhist philosophers?

Content:

I expect that <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chrysippus>, the great systematizer of Stoicism, would be my favourite if any of his 700 books had survived. Unfortunately they're all lost, so I have to make do with Epictetus and his teacher, Musonius Rufus.

Cora Lutz, <https://archive.org/details/MUSONIUSRUFUSSTOICFRAGMENTS>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 2, 2019 7:48 AM

Title: Re: Who are your favourite non-Buddhist philosophers?

Content:

I don't know how it happened.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 3, 2019 7:17 AM
Title: Re: Translation error in MN 10
Content:
It's not an error.

Just as the '-s' in 'jumps' tells you that it must be 'he' or 'she' or 'it' who is doing the jumping, so the -mi in gacchāmi tells you that it's 'I' who is going.

In a predominantly fusional language like Pali it's often not necessary to use a pronoun, but it is necessary when translating into a predominantly analytic language like English.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 3, 2019 7:44 AM
Title: Re: Translation error in MN 10
Content:

You could omit the pronoun if your aim was to translate it into pidgin English. But if it's standard English you're aiming at, then to omit the pronoun would be to overstep normal usage – something the Buddha advised against in the Araṇavibhaṅgasutta.

It isn't essential, however, to use the present continuous — the simple present, "I go", will do just as well.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 3, 2019 9:47 AM
Title: Re: My view of anatta. By samsarictravelling/Ai (Dinh) Le.
Content:

It needn't be Thanissaro's in particular. In the modern academic study of Buddhism the notion that anattā might have been intended merely as a strategic way of regarding things has been proposed and debated since the 19th century.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 3, 2019 10:50 AM
Title: Re: My view of anatta. By samsarictravelling/Ai (Dinh) Le.
Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 3, 2019 2:06 PM

Title: Re: Translation error in MN 10

Content:

If one is really anxious to eliminate the word 'I', the easiest solution would be to translate the phrase into indirect speech. But you'll still need a pronoun, only now it will be 'he'.

Pali

Bhikkhu gacchanto vā 'gacchāmī'ti pajānāti;
ṭhito vā 'ṭhitomhī'ti pajānāti;
nisinno vā 'nisinnomhī'ti pajānāti;
sayāno vā 'sayānomhī'ti pajānāti.

Form-equivalent (i.e., 'literal') translation

A bhikkhu going is aware: 'go';
or stood is aware: 'am stood';
or seated is aware: 'am seated';
or lain is aware: 'am lain'.

Dynamic-equivalent translation in direct speech

When going a bhikkhu is aware: 'I am going';
or when standing he is aware: 'I am standing';
or when sitting he is aware: 'I am sitting';
or when lying down he is aware: 'I am lying down'.

Dynamic-equivalent translation in indirect speech

When going a bhikkhu is aware that he is going;
or when standing he is aware that he is standing;
or when sitting he is aware that he is sitting;
or when lying down he is aware that he is lying down.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 4, 2019 9:23 AM

Title: Re: (Again) Dealing with sexual desire

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 5, 2019 2:11 PM

Title: Re: The great Abhidhamma Pitaka authenticity debate

Content:

Both of your quoted passages are to be found in the Vibhaṅga, the first in the analysis according to the Abhidhamma method (abhidhammabhājanīya), the second (taken from the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta) in the analysis according to the sutta method (suttabhājanīya). The latter stipulates the three kinds of craving, while the former doesn't, for in the Abhidhamma method all three are just different modes of a single cetasika. Neither amounts to a claim that craving alone is the cause of suffering, but merely that craving is the thing that needs to be made to cease if suffering is to cease.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 5, 2019 3:40 PM

Title: Re: The great Abhidhamma Pitaka authenticity debate

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 5, 2019 4:28 PM

Title: Re: Does the Buddha is the ori Buddha ?

Content:

Mahāvīra is represented as having arahant among his epithets in both early Buddhist and early Jain texts, and bhagavan in early Jain texts. As far as I know he only gets called buddha in Śvetāmbara devotional texts from a much later period, where it features as the very last of his 26 honorifics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 7:27 AM

Title: Re: The great Abhidhamma Pitaka authenticity debate

Content:

The Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta also mentions only craving as dukkhasamudaya. This doesn't mean that the suttas hold craving to be the only cause. Likewise with the Abhidhamma. In both cases we are presented with "a teaching in brief", the complete understanding of which requires the larger doctrinal context to be taken into account.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 8:06 AM

Title: Re: The great Abhidhamma Pitaka authenticity debate

Content:

The "devas called 'beings without perception'" (asaññasattā nāma devā) can also be found in DN. 1, 15, 24, 33, 34, and AN. 9:24

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 10:45 AM

Title: Re: What was the reason behind the development of new buddhist vehicles?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 3:32 PM

Title: Re: POLL: From one dhamma to the next

Content:

In chronological order:

1. Yamaka: rising and falling, with no stipulation about the presence or absence of an overlap.

2. Buddhaghosa's writings: model 3.

3. Ānanda in his Mūlaṭīkā to the Dhammasaṅgaṇī appeals to the Yamaka to dissent from Buddhaghosa's view and argue for Model 1.

4. Various writers defend Buddhaghosa's view and propose a different way of reading the Yamaka than that of Ānanda. By the time of Anuruddha (12-13th century) Model 3 has become the unchallenged orthodoxy in the Theravādin mainstream and seems to have remained so ever since.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 4:04 PM

Title: Re: Sanghas near Chicago?

Content:

Buddhanet's World Buddhist Directory returns 19 results for Theravadin centres in Illinois.

<https://tinyurl.com/ybnn34hg>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 8:39 PM

Title: Re: What is clinging to rules and vows (sīlabbatupādānaṃ) ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 6, 2019 8:47 PM

Title: Re: What was the reason behind the development of new buddhist vehicles?

Content:

By “other possible interpretations” do you mean others that are deemed credible by modern textual scholars or others that merely reiterate the Mahayanists’ traditional view of their sūtras’ provenance?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 7, 2019 3:27 PM

Title: Re: Tied to Mara (The evil one) Negative emotions.

Content:

I wonder if you're aware that the merit of developing the arūpajjhānas is of a kind that ripens in the arūpa heavens and cannot ripen anywhere else? That being so, it's not the kind of merit that will bring you those things in which you've expressed an interest: "sex, wealth, health, luxury apartment rentals on the beach."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 7, 2019 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Tied to Mara (The evil one) Negative emotions.

Content:

I recommend you take a look at what the development of the jhānas will entail in the Buddha's gradual training.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.125.horn.html>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn39>

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.107.horn.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 8, 2019 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

Richard Gombrich discussing his latest book, Buddhism and Pali, with his former student Alexander Wynne.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 9, 2019 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Reference on the Buddha tasting food?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 10, 2019 8:07 PM

Title: Re: AN: book of 7: sutta 73

Content:

Some are mentioned in the Jātakas as being the Buddha in former lives. Others were outsider ascetics, but possessed of mundane right view and mastery of mettabhāvanā. You can look them up in the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names to see which is which.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/index.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 11:36 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a citation on Dana

Content:

In English:

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j5/j5028.htm>

In German:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/de/ja535>

I suspect you may have encountered it either at DSG or in Nina van Gorkom's contribution to a BPS collection of essays on dāna, edited by Bhikkhu Bodhi.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/various/wheel367.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 1:49 PM

Title: Re: New book from Venerable Analayo

Content:

Is this a typo? Shouldn't it read: "...overcoming drowsiness is an advanced practice." ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 5:00 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro Bhikkhu's anatta,'no self' believers,& my idea of "destroying the successive links of Dependent Origination"

Content:

What all forms of annihilationism share is the positing of a self that is perishable. But annihilationism needn't entail the identifying of this self with one's physical body — this just happens to be the commonest form of it in modern times. In the Brahmajāla Sutta, however, the perishable self posited by an annihilationist might be any of seven things:

1. Material form composed of the four primary elements (rūpī cātumahābhūtikā).
2. Divine, having material form, pertaining to the sense sphere, feeding on edible nutriment (dibbo rūpī kāmāvacaro kabalīkārāhārabhakkho).
3. Divine, having material form, mind-made, complete in all its limbs and organs, not destitute of any faculties (dibbo rūpī manomayo sabbaṅgapaccaṅgī ahinindriyo).
4. Belonging to the base of infinite space (ākāsānañcāyatanūpago).
5. Belonging to the base of infinite consciousness (viññāṇañcāyatanūpago).
6. Belonging to the base of nothingness (ākīñcaṇṇāyatanūpago).
7. Belonging to the base of neither perception nor non-perception (nevasaññānāsaññāyatanūpago).

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 6:27 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro Bhikkhu's anatta,'no self' believers,& my idea of "destroying the successive links of Dependent Origination"

Content:

Ajahn Brahmali is a Norwegian monk and a close associate of Ajahn Brahmavamso.

I agree with him that "void of self" would be a good translation of anattā and certainly more in line with the Pali commentaries' privative understanding of the an- prefix. However, although translating it in this way would undermine the Vedantic interpretation of anattā that one sometimes encounters, I'm not sure that it would have much effect on Ajahn Thanissaro's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 6:55 PM

Title: Re: Differences in translations - DN 31 Sigalovada . Traditional commentary?

Content:

The first is correct; the second seems to be informed by some modernistic imperative.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 9:06 PM

Title: Re: "Empty of self" includes "empty of intrinsic nature" (Sabhāva).

Content:

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/08-02.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 10:19 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro Bhikkhu's anatta,'no self' believers,& my idea of "destroying the successive links of Dependent Origination"

Content:

I shall continue to take my definition from the Brahmajāla Sutta, not from you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 10:37 PM

Title: Re: "Empty of self" includes "empty of intrinsic nature" (Sabhāva).

Content:

As the commentaries tell it, certain bystanders acclaimed him as an arahant on account of his ruggedly ascetic appearance after he was shipwrecked. Then he came to deludedly imagine that they might be right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 11, 2019 10:52 PM

Title: Re: "Empty of self" includes "empty of intrinsic nature" (Sabhāva).

Content:

I'm very sorry about that. I seem to have pressed the wrong button - edit instead of reply. If you have a copy of the original please send it to me and I will paste it in. If not, I'll ask a mod to delete the post.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 1:24 AM
Title: Re: Are collective apologies valid?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 3:31 AM
Title: Re: "Empty of self" includes "empty of intrinsic nature" (Sabhāva).
Content:

That Bāhiya in the time of Kassapa Buddha "died as a worldling" (puthujjanakālakiriyaṃ katvā) is explicitly stated in the commentary to the Bāhiya Sutta in the Udāna Atthakathā, Ud-a 82. In this passage Bāhiya's former brother, now a non-returner deva in the Suddhāvāsa, is reported as informing Bāhiya of this fact while in the process of disabusing him of his belief that he's an arahant.

But even if it there were no explicit statement, the same could be inferred from many different things, starting with the phrase mentioned already: visesaṃ nibbattetuṃ asakkontā. Then there is his admission to the Buddha in the Apadāna that he was on a wrong path; the Paramatthajotika's description of one of his fellow five bhikkhus, Sabhiya (who also died without distinction in the time of Kassapa Buddha), as being an 'outsider' in the time of Gotama Buddha; and the mere fact that he had fallen into wrong view (impossible even for a stream-entrant) by wrongly supposing himself to be an arahant.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 8:06 AM
Title: Re: Underworld
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 10:43 AM
Title: Re: Happiness does NOT exist
Content:
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv2.8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 10:55 AM

Title: Re: Happiness does NOT exist

Content:

The statement, "I teach only dukkha and its cessation", though well-known and oft-quoted, is actually found in only two suttas (and how the sentence should be understood and translated <https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/did-the-buddha-only-teach-dukkha-and-its-cessation/9357>).

Statements to the effect that Dhamma is taught "for the welfare and happiness of the manyfolk" occur countless times.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 12:42 PM

Title: Re: Many failed relationships divorced lost custody of child and 35 years old living alone

Content:

As the OP hasn't logged in since the day after she joined six months ago, it seems likely that the posts from cappuccino's onwards are all unwitting soliloquies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 12, 2019 3:45 PM

Title: Re: what does "nibbindati dukke" mean in the famous verses of the Dhammapada?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 6:34 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga, anyone?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 7:33 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga, anyone?

Content:

On Sutta Central only the Dhamma-cakka-pavattana-vāra (i.e., the Buddha's first sermon followed by the Paṭisambhidāmagga's canonical commentary to it) is listed as having parallels. But even here I don't know if the parallels are merely to the

Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta (which would of course be no surprise) or to the canonical commentary too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga, anyone?

Content:

I find a high degree of accuracy in the translator's construal of the Pali grammar and syntax. What makes it off-putting to many readers is his flirtation with dubious experimental renderings of technical terms. But it's not a big problem, for at least Ñāṇamoli has gone for consistency in this; so one just needs to get used to the fact that by, say, "ideas", he means dhammā, or by "the True Idea" he means dhammo, etc.

Ideally it's best to read the translation alongside the Pali text or else familiarise oneself in advance with the translator's glossary at the end of the book.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 8:07 PM

Title: Re: Patisambhidamagga, anyone?

Content:

Not to worry. I didn't mean to suggest that reading it would handicap you, but merely that: (1) Compared with Gethin I don't think Warder is particularly helpful in orienting the reader, and (2) some readers find him so boring that having read his intro they abandon their plan to read the text.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Siddhartha was exiled?

Content:

The Rohiṇī River incident is narrated in the Dhammapada Commentary.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/15-01.htm>

The Wikipedia entry seems to added some fanciful details from modern Ambedkarite biographers of the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 13, 2019 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Lineage

Content:

If we're talking about the ordination lineages of bhikkhus and bhikkhunīs, the relevant term is paramparā, which in its approved Vinaya sense (as opposed to its disapproved Sutta sense) first appears in the Parivāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Lineage

Content:

Vamsa is used for this. A less common term is pavenī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Relationships in the Pure Land

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an5.43>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 1:07 PM

Title: Re: Are there Dhammayut groups without 'eternal citta' belief

Content:

The Thai phrases to google for are those that mean "citta that never dies", e.g., "จิตที่ไม่เคยตาย", "จิตที่ไม่ตาย", "จิตไม่ตาย", "จิตไม่เคยตาย", etc. Nearly all the hits are from sites devoted to Bua and the Buddho Boys.

From the man himself:

.

.

And his prankster disciple, Ajahn Sing Thong:

<http://www.dhammathai.org/monktalk/dbview.php?No=741>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 6:31 PM

Title: Re: Relationships in the Pure Land

Content:

It can't be moved there. You will need to join <https://dharma.wheel.net>, if you're not already a member, and then start a thread there.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Lineage

Content:

Gocara. Its opposite is agocara. They are sometimes translated as "one's own pastures" (= the four satipaṭṭhānas) and "foreign pastures" (= five kāmagaṇas).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 14, 2019 7:31 PM

Title: Re: Lineage

Content:

I wouldn't myself translate the apadāna in Mahāpadāna as "lineage". An explanatory rendering would be something like "trans-saṃsāric spiritual career". That is, the interval from the moment a being has a life-changing encounter with a Buddha until the moment s/he arrives at either arahantship, solitary buddhahood or perfect buddhahood, is that being's apadāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 7:04 PM

Title: Re: "Ariyasāvaka" in DN 31 for householders ???

Content:

In the commentaries ariyasāvaka is sometimes defined in a manner that supports the remark from Bhikkhu Bodhi quoted earlier in this thread — that is, it's defined in a way that seems not exclude the virtuous worldling. For example, "An ariyasāvaka is a disciple of the noble one, the Buddha" (ariyasāvako ti ariyassa buddhassa sāvako).

Indeed sometimes it is defined in a way that would explicitly include the worldling, e.g., "One desirous of arriving at the state of a disciple" (sāvakabhāvaṃ upagantukāmo).

DN 31, however, is not an example of this, for here the disciple spoken of is equated with a sotāpanna. This seems reasonable to me, for the sutta speaks of the disciple in question not being led astray by the four agati. If a worldling were intended here, then we should expect not a description but an exhortation: "The disciple should not let himself be led astray...!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Lineage

Content:

My impression is that the vamsa in Buddhavaṃsa doesn't actually mean "lineage". Rather, it seems to mean about the same as "apadāna" as I described it in my earlier post. In the Buddhavaṃsa Pāli, each of the Buddhas has his own buddhavaṃsa, which isn't a lineage but rather is an apadāna-like summation of the decisive events in his spiritual career.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Modern Saddaniti translations?

Content:

Not in English, but there's a very fine Thai one by Sayādaw Gandhasārābhivaṃsa.

Edit:

And another Thai one (Dhātumālā only) by the Bhūmibalo Bhikkhu Foundation. A scanned copy of this is available online:

http://bhumibalo.org/?page_id=769

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 10:45 PM

Title: Re: "Ariyasāvaka" in DN 31 for householders ???

Content:

And most puthujjanas can manage to refrain from murdering their mothers. Nonetheless it's only after arrival at stream-entry that one is guaranteed not to murder her, for it is only then that matricide (and the rest of the anantariyaka kammās) cease to be possibilities.

The four agatis are things by which the puthujjana and the sotāpanna might both be led astray. The difference is that the sotāpanna will be certain to recognise his error and correct it, while the puthujjana may or may not do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Sperm Donation

Content:

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/vinaya/bmc/Section0011.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 17, 2019 11:32 PM
Title: Re: micchā ditthi
Content:
Icchantika.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Icchantika>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 18, 2019 7:46 AM
Title: Re: Lineage
Content:
Now there may be some term that means “the designated number of Buddhas for the type of aeon in question” or “the Buddhas belonging to the aeon in question”, but if there is I don’t know what it is.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 18, 2019 8:46 AM
Title: Re: Is Dependent Origination deterministic?
Content:
It's a popular (though inaccurate) paraphrase of the third kind of pāṭihāriya in the <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn11>, DN 11.

See also: David Fiordalis,
https://digitalcommons.linfield.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.com/&httpsredir=1&article=1000&context=relsfac_pubs

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 18, 2019 9:00 AM
Title: Re: Is Theravada anti creativity?
Content:
With respect to creativity the Theravada amounts to a happy middle way that successfully avoids the two extremes of Gothic Zen and Baroque Vajrayana.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 19, 2019 10:48 PM

Title: Dealing with Dangerous and Annoying Animals

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/38369868/How_to_Deal_with_Dangerous_and_Annoying_Animals_A_Vinaya_Perspective

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 6:49 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

And when "proper arguments" are offered —as they they have repeatedly been, both here and at Sutta Central— you make a fool of yourself by responding with ill-tempered ad hominem retorts (like <https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=46&t=26749&p=485212#p485212>) rather than anything remotely resembling a reasoned rebuttal. Your changed posting style since you converted to this outfit doesn't say much for Waharakaism as a path to dispassion!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 9:06 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Happily Lal does not get to lay down the rules for what would constitute a proper discrediting of the Waharakaist hermeneutic.

In the eyes of any scholar informed about the character of the Pali language, an approach to translating it in which its word-formation is treated as agglutinative (as in the Tamil language) will be seen as wrong-footed from the get-go.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 9:15 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Yes.

And is Pali an agglutinative, a fusional or an isolating language? This too is a simple question.

If you think it's fusional, then you should quit playing about with the particle *saṃ* in the ridiculous way that you do. Fusional languages just don't work like this. The *saṃ* in *tesaṃ*, for example, is an inflectional ending and has absolutely nothing to do with the prefix *saṃ* in *saṃsāra*.

But if you think that it's an agglutinative language, like Tamil, or an isolating language, like Chinese, then you need to go back to school.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 10:50 AM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

No, no, no, no, no! as the blessed Margaret Thatcher would say.

I answered your question, now it's your turn to answer mine.

What kind of language do you imagine Pali to be with regard to word-formation?

If your first principles are all wrong, then anything derived from the said principles will most likely be wrong too. As a retired physics teacher you hardly need me to tell you that. Now my repeated contention has been that the Waharakaist approach to construing the meaning of Pali words is based on a number of erroneous assumptions, some explicitly stated and others merely tacit. One of the tacit ones is that it's legitimate to analyse Pali words as one might analyse words in an agglutinative language. Hence the importance of my question:

What kind of language do you imagine Pali to be with regard to word-formation?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 3:19 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

I don't know. My hope —and it's only the very faintest of hopes— is that the questions might spur him and his partners in crime to read up on the subject of word-formation in different types of language and then come to realise the absurdity and untenability of what Waharakaists do with Pali words.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 20, 2019 11:27 PM

Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero

Content:

Yes, I saw it the first time around. But what was pseudo-philological silliness when posted in January doesn't become something different when it's re-posted in February.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 21, 2019 6:01 AM
Title: Re: ..inclines to nibbana
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 21, 2019 10:31 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 21, 2019 11:01 PM
Title: Re: samatha retreats/teachers
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 22, 2019 12:41 AM
Title: Re: Pali Grammar - Eight Cases
Content:

Below is a summary, but it's a very simplified one, for with the exception of the vocative each of the eight cases has several other uses beside the one stated here.

Nominative (shows subject)
bhagavā sāvatthiyaṃ viharati
The Blessed One lives at Sāvattī.

Accusative (shows object)
devatā bhagavantaṃ abhivādeti
A devatā salutes the Blessed One.

Instrumental (shows agency)
bhagavatā sikkhāpadaṃ paññattaṃ hoti
A training rule is laid down by the Blessed One.

Dative (shows recipient)
namo tassa bhagavato

Homage to the Blessed One!

Ablative (shows source)

imaṃ dhammaṃ bhagavatā āgacchati

This teaching comes from the Blessed One.

Genitive (shows possession)

ujupaṭipanno bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho

Of upright conduct is the order of disciples of the Blessed One.

Locative (expresses location)

dukkhavedanā bhagavati uppajji

A painful feeling arose in the Blessed One.

Vocative (used for addressing someone)

namo te bhagavā

Homage to thee, O Blessed One!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2019 2:19 AM

Title: Re: name that fallacy

Content:

I don't think you've shown this to be so.

When a Pali noun or adjective is joined into a compound it will revert to its pre-inflected form — a form that conveys no information at all about its grammatical number or grammatical case.

When compounded, the genitive singular sabbassa and the genitive plural sabbesaṃ will both become sabba-; singular kāyassa and plural kāyānaṃ will both become kāya-. And so the sabbakāya- part of sabbakāyappaṭisaṃvedī could be either sabbassa kāyassa (“of the whole body”) or sabbesaṃ kāyānaṃ (“of all the bodies”). Which of the two (if either) is right needs to be determined in some other way than merely looking at the form of the compound.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2019 10:22 AM

Title: Re: Hello from the land of Buddha!

Content:

The first Pali thesaurus, Moggallāna's Abhidhānappadīpikā, was modelled on a Sanskrit thesaurus, the Amarakośa, composed by a Kerala Buddhist called Amarasimha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2019 11:02 AM

Title: Re: Pali Grammar - Eight Cases

Content:

I suppose so, though it would be best to make up one's own, for what would carry memorable associations for one person might not for someone else. For example, I would associate the ablative case with ablation, as in...

Global warming is ablating the ice from Iceland's Vatnajökull glacier,

but a bodybuilder might prefer to connect the ablative with abs in some way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 22, 2019 11:49 AM

Title: Re: What are some good books/resources to learn metta meditation from?

Content:

A few hints from the Abhidhamma...

Since the proximate cause of mettā is the perception of what is loveable or endearing in a being, rather than just picturing the people in your mind, you might try narrowing things down a bit by bringing to mind some admirable quality they possess.

Since the specific characteristic of mettā is desiring the welfare and happiness of beings, you might try bringing to mind the sameness of your own desire for happiness and that of other beings.

Since the manifestation of mettā is the removal of annoyance, I recommend that you don't neglect the preliminary practice of recollecting the dangers in anger and the advantages in patience, as this serves both to energise and to properly orientate mettābhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 23, 2019 6:42 AM

Title: Re: name that fallacy

Content:

2. Attempt to establish what the compound might mean from something else in the Suttas (though I'm not sure if there is anything else).

3. Translate according to one's personal hunch about what the compound might mean (or perhaps to conform to the understanding of whatever modern meditation system one happens to be committed to).

Now to answer your question about "other possibilities", if a translator opts for #3 there is virtually no limit to the number of ways the compound might be parsed, given that: Its first two items might be singular or plural; they might be in almost any grammatical case; and it might be any of several types of Pali compound.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 23, 2019 1:16 PM

Title: Re: name that fallacy

Content:

Yes. At the time of my earlier posting that was one of the passages I had in mind. I didn't mention it because I was misremembering it as being a commentarial definition rather than a Paṭisambhidāmagga one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 23, 2019 2:40 PM

Title: Re: Has anyone cultivated breathing meditation and attained liberation ?

Content:

I would say that things are a lot trickier nowadays for the would-be ānāpānassati meditator, on account of the plethora of conflicting opinions about the proper way to practise it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 23, 2019 6:39 PM

Title: Re: Are there such phrases in the canon?

Content:

In the Suttas ariya aṭṭhaṅgika magga in the accusative case is the object of four verbs:

understands as it really is: yathābhūtaṃ pajānāti

teaches: deseti

develops: bhāveti

makes much of: bahulīkaroti

The last two, I suppose, are what people have in mind when they speak of practising the path.

Alternatively, it might be that the usage is derived from the fact that the ariyan eightfold path is also called the "practice that leads to the end of suffering" (dukkhanirodhagāminī paṭipadā).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 23, 2019 9:12 PM
Title: Re: Stock Phrase: nāhaṃ kvaṇi kassaci kiñcanatasmim...
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 24, 2019 4:06 PM
Title: Re: Are there such phrases in the canon?
Content:
Or perhaps Ajahn Thanissaro has lengthened.

As far as I know, he alone renders paṭipadā as "way of practice". With other translators it's just "way", "practice" or "method".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 25, 2019 8:27 AM
Title: Re: Suttas on the destruction of the world by fire, wind, water?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 25, 2019 10:11 PM
Title: Re: Do Thai Forest Monasteries pay for long-time-foreign-monks' Visas?
Content:
All visa extensions have to be paid for by somebody. In forest monasteries where the Vinaya money rules are strictly observed (e.g., all of the Ajahn Chah forest wats and some of the Dhammayut ones) the payment will be made by the monastery's lay committee. In less strict forest monasteries (e.g., Wat Suan Mokkh) the foreign monk will have to pay the fee himself, though if he doesn't have any money of his own the abbot or some other senior monk will almost certainly give it to him.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 26, 2019 9:38 AM
Title: Re: Do Thai Forest Monasteries pay for long-time-foreign-monks' Visas?
Content:
I'm afraid I've no idea. We're at opposite ends of the country and I haven't been to the

South in about 15 years.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 1, 2019 5:19 PM

Title: Re: how to deal with demons

Content:

I've never myself been troubled by any kind of amanussa — perhaps because I recite the Āṭānāṭiya Sutta once a week. However, in Thailand I have often been requested to take part in exorcism ceremonies for haunted houses, haunted rice fields and haunted people (most often women who've been having recurrent bad dreams and decided that ghosts are responsible for them). The commonest procedure with haunted people is to wrap them up in a white cloth, as one would with a corpse, and then perform a normal funeral service. This is supposed to fool the ghost into thinking that the woman's dead, so it will go away and bother someone else. It seems that this does usually have the desired effect of ending the bad dreams.

With the haunted houses and rice fields the ceremony is usually a lengthy paritta recital, with the Āṭānāṭiya Sutta (either in full or just the section starting vipasissa namatthu...) taking pride of place.

Perhaps the best thing would be to start by yelling out to Inda, Soma, Varuṇa and the rest of the gang whenever the ghost makes its presence felt. If that doesn't work then consult the monks at your local temple.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 5, 2019 8:34 PM

Title: Re: What is tiracchānakatham?

Content:

and a few others, likes accountancy and mathematics.

And yet a translator needs a single word that will cover all these different things, and so the question here is: What feature do they all have in common? "Bestiality" seems to me a highly unlikely answer. The commentators' answer is that their shared feature is that they are "horizontal" in the sense that none of them lead upwards "to heaven or liberation". Though I've never seen any translator use it, I personally think "pedestrian arts" would best convey the sense.

Likewise with tiracchāna-kathā. When pursuing their respective occupations, a perfumier who talks about perfumes, a chef who talks about food and drink, a general who talks about battles, a draper who talks about clothes, etc., are hardly engaged in speech that could be called "bestial" in either of the senses given above. But when a bhikkhu, or a householder who's serious about bhāvanā, takes to prattling about these matters it's another story.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 8, 2019 5:48 PM

Title: Re: Possibility of ordination?

Content:

In his Buddhist Monastic Code Ajahn Thanissaro is careful to make it clear when he is expounding something from Buddhaghosa's Vinaya commentary (or from an even later sub-commentary) rather than from the canonical Vinaya Piṭaka. Everything quoted by Polar Bear is an exposition of what is stated in the Vinaya Piṭaka, except for the sentences beginning, "The Commentary adds..." and "According to the Commentary..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 11, 2019 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics

Content:

And I see that your posts to the two maths forums have failed to elicit even a single reply. This isn't at all surprising, for rather than trying to meet the mathematicians halfway, by presenting your query in terms comprehensible to those with no prior acquaintance with the niceties of Abhidhamma, you've simply copied and pasted your opening post in this thread. No wonder you got booted out of the physics forum!

I wonder what's the probability of an online English-speaking maths enthusiast knowing what a satta-paññatti or an avijjamāna-paññatti might be?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 12, 2019 7:26 AM

Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics

Content:

Actually it is infinite. For example:

Game 1

1. Nc3

1-0

Game 2

1. Nc3 Nc6

0-1

Game 3

1. Nc3 Nc6
2. Nb1
1-0

Game 4

1. Nc3 Nc6
2. Nb1 Nb8
0-1

Game 5

1. Nc3 Nc6
2. Nb1 Nb8
3. Nc3
1-0

The players might continue indefinitely in this fashion, merely moving their queen's knight back and forth, adding one extra move in each new game, and with neither ever bringing any game to an early close by invoking the threefold repetition rule or the fifty-move rule. To proceed in this manner obviously wouldn't make for much of a spectator sport, but there's no denying that each game would be unique.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 12, 2019 6:02 PM

Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics

Content:

You have moved the goalposts. The Shannon number isn't concerned with "all possible chess games".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 12, 2019 7:14 PM

Title: Re: Minimum size of the Organism we should care about.

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 12, 2019 7:51 PM

Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics

Content:

Your video does no more than repeat your previous post, for it's about Shannon's number. Shannon's number is concerned with "sensible" chess games —those in which both players are making an effort to win— of about 40 moves. Shannon's number has no bearing on "all possible chess games". The latter would include games in which both players simply moved the queen's knight back and forth, while Shannon's number would not.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 12, 2019 10:54 PM
Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 7:14 AM
Title: Re: What will happen if i stop using snuff?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 9:17 AM
Title: Re: Let's Pray Daily - Virtual Vihara
Content:
Namāmi buddhaṃ guṇasāgarantaṃ
I salute the Buddha, whose virtues are immeasurable as the ocean.

Namāmi dhammaṃ sugatena desitaṃ
I salute the Dhamma taught by the Sugata.

Namāmi saṅghaṃ munirājasāvakaṃ
I salute the Sangha of disciples of the King of Sages.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 1:14 PM
Title: Re: Why Nibbana comes before the Path ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Where can I buy meditation tent or crot in Bangkok?

Content:

Go to Wat Suthat ("the Temple of the Giant Swing") in Phra Nakhorn District. Just by the wat there's an entire street (I can't remember its name) where the shops sell nothing but monks' stuff.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Symbolism and Blasphemy

Content:

It might be better to enquire at our sister forum, as it's mainly for adherents of Tantric Buddhism that the OM symbol is imbued with significance.

<https://dharmawheel.net/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 13, 2019 11:20 PM

Title: Re: Symbolism and Blasphemy

Content:

I think you're referring to the Buddhist Society on Ecclestone Square. But the logo is for the London Buddhist Centre, which is the old Bethnal Green fire station, purchased and converted by the FWBO in the 1970's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 14, 2019 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Everything happens for a reason

Content:

No and no. The Buddha's universe has no teleology to it and no event has any significance beyond that which an individual assigns to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 15, 2019 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Theravada against mathematics

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 15, 2019 6:07 AM
Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero
Content:
Wishing you a speedy recovery.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 15, 2019 6:30 AM
Title: Re: What is best next to Theravada?
Content:
But a not so cool way of making themselves bald: plucking their hair out rather than shaving it. Ouch!

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 15, 2019 6:45 PM
Title: Re: Everything happens for a reason
Content:
I wouldn't see them as an exception, for their telos (putting an end to existence) is a self-chosen one. It's not built into the fabric of things like the telos of Christians ("loving God and enjoying Him for ever") which they believe to have been prescribed for them by their Maker.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 16, 2019 4:55 AM
Title: Re: What are your ideas about Pa Auk method ?
Content:
"Works" in what sense?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 16, 2019 11:27 PM
Title: Re: What are your ideas about Pa Auk method ?
Content:
Thanks for the elaboration.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 18, 2019 1:42 PM
Title: Re: What is the one?
Content:
"All beings subsist on food."
(sabbe sattā āhāraṭṭhitikā)

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kp4>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 18, 2019 2:46 PM
Title: Re: The Drawbacks & Dangers of Sensual Craving
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 19, 2019 8:28 AM
Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?
Content:
An Edition and Study of the Buddhānussati in the Pāli Caturārakkhā-aṭṭhakathā,
Supranee Panitchayapong

https://www.academia.edu/38466468/An_Edition_and_Study_of_the_Buddh%C4%81nussati_in_the_P%C4%81li_Catur%C4%81rakkh%C4%81-a%E1%B9%AD%E1%B9%ADhakath%C4%81

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 19, 2019 7:04 PM
Title: Re: space, uncompounded?
Content:
It is according to the Theravāda. But you are quoting the Avataṃsaka Sūtra, a Mahāyāna text. It was characteristic of Indian Mahāyāna schools (and before them, of the Sarvāstivādins) to invent new lists of asaṃskṛta dharmas besides nirvāṇa. Space was a popular candidate for inclusion in these lists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 22, 2019 1:45 PM

Title: Re: Equanimity in SFoE , fourth jhana and four Brahma vihara

Content:

Anne Murphy,

https://www.academia.edu/36533473/The_Ten_Kinds_of_Equanimity_Upekkh%C4%81

–

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 22, 2019 2:03 PM

Title: Re: Quibble on Buddhadasa's teachings

Content:

As the sayādaw was a Dīgha-bhāṇaka from a very early age he would certainly have known the familiar list of ten from DN 33.

The list he actually gives is unfamiliar to me. It's almost like that of the Abhidhamma's Vibhaṅga except that the eighth fetter should be envy (issā) not vibhavarāga (a term that's not found anywhere in the Tipiṭaka or Atthakathās).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 22, 2019 5:24 PM

Title: Re: Equanimity in SFoE , fourth jhana and four Brahma vihara

Content:

What the Saḷāyatanaṭṭhapaṇṇāsa Sutta calls gehasitā upekkhā is an instance of upekkhā vedanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 22, 2019 5:40 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and mahayana

Content:

Not according to the Vinaya Piṭaka's account of the Council – an account that is corroborated in several non-Theravādin chronicles.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd22>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 22, 2019 5:59 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and mahayana

Content:

What is relevant is that the account says nothing about the Theravadins adding new rules. Rather, it tells of the Vajjiputtaka monks wanting to not follow certain rules, to observe certain rules more laxly, and in general to adopt the principle that whatever is the customary practice of one's teacher should be taken as correct.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 28, 2019 9:34 PM

Title: Re: regarding tomb worlds

Content:

I think you may be referring to the saying, Natthi loke anāmatam, "There's nowhere in the world where someone hasn't died." It's from the verses to the Upasaḥa Jātaka:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja166>

It's also quoted in the Dhammapada Commentary's background story to Dhpm. 75:

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/05-15.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 29, 2019 2:57 AM

Title: Re: Going to the forest

Content:

Though most translators render ārañṇaka senāsana as "forest dwelling", Ajahn Thanissaro's translation of it as "wilderness lodging" is probably more faithful to the meaning. The Vinaya defines it as any lodging that's more than five hundred bow-lengths (i.e., roughly a kilometre) from the nearest human settlement. And so the presence of trees is not a requirement for an abode to qualify as an ārañṇaka senāsana. It could be on a beach, a treeless mountain, a desert, or even a raft in the middle of a large lake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 29, 2019 3:44 AM

Title: Re: neutering a cat?

Content:

Don't forget the Babbu ("Cats") Jātaka, wherein four greedy felines come to a bad end.

<http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j1/j1140.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Mar 29, 2019 6:49 AM
Title: Re: neutering a cat?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Mar 30, 2019 10:33 PM
Title: Re: A Pali equivalent for "reification" ???
Content:
The word is mostly used by translators of Sanskrit or Tibetan Mahayana texts as a rendering of three different words:

1. satkāyadr̥ṣṭi ("reifying view") = Pali sakkāyadiṭṭhi
2. prapañca = papañca
3. samāropana = ditto (but in Theravāda texts it's not a bad thing; it's the sixteenth of the Nettipakaraṇa's "sixteen modes of conveying", translated by Ñāṇamoli as "coordination").

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 1, 2019 12:43 AM
Title: Re: What (kamma) causes a person to be Pandaka?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 1, 2019 8:27 AM
Title: Re: Need help identifying some items found at a store.
Content:
<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Saraswati>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 1, 2019 3:48 PM
Title: Re: Theravada and mahayana
Content:
The use of a "middle man" or saṅgha steward (veyyāvaccakara) for this purpose is something the Vinaya explicitly allows under the tenth nissaggiya pācittiya rule and the Meṇḍaka allowance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 1, 2019 10:19 PM

Title: Re: Theravada and mahayana

Content:

I don't know what you're trying to say here. I cited the rule because it clearly shows that it was the ancient practice to use a lay steward to handle money matters.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 4:10 PM

Title: Re: Whats Anicca?

Content:

I suspect because of its linguistic register. It's a term that is most often used in everyday human affairs (e.g., temporary secretary, temporary arrangement, temporary accommodation, etc.) rather than in philosophical discussion about existents.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 6:44 PM

Title: Re: Want first jhana? NWBH: Not What but How

Content:

The two passages will seem incompatible only if one assumes that the viewing of dhammas as impermanent, etc., is done while in jhāna (as Ajahn Thanissaro teaches). But Ajahn Brahm's approach, like the Visuddhimagga's, assumes that it is done after emergence from jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 7:24 PM

Title: Re: Whats Anicca?

Content:

I wouldn't regard it as a point in its favour, but rather as skating close to an "overriding of agreed usage" — something the Buddha advised against in the Araṇavibhaṅga Sutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 8:17 PM

Title: Re: Whats Anicca?

Content:

I said "skating close to it", by which I didn't mean that "temporary" would be in any way misleading, but merely that it would sound gauche and that (I suspect) is why

translators don't use it (which was what your original query was about). What would make it gauche is simply that it's not an adjective that philosophers normally have recourse to when discussing change and ephemerality.

Note that one element of agreed usage is conformity to the appropriate register.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Register_%28sociolinguistics%29

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Whats Anicca?

Content:

In his higher (and distinctive) teachings — those concerned with the development of paññā and attainment of liberation — the Buddha seems to have used the terms that were employed by the various samaṇa communities of his day, sometimes in the same sense that the other samaṇas used them and sometimes in a new sense of his own devising. Some of these also happened to be everyday terms; others were not.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 2, 2019 10:53 PM

Title: Re: Whats Anicca?

Content:

Most certainly. Or do you suppose that words like, say, anattā, indriya, asaṅkhata, rūpakkhandha, paṭiccasamuppāda, ubhatobhāgavimutta ... etc., etc., would have been part of the everyday diction of water-bearers at the parish pump, merchants in a Magadhan marketplace and Licchavī women having a chinwag while baking their chappatis?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 25, 2019 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Looking for sutta about Buddha "even-minded" ???

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 27, 2019 9:23 AM

Title: Re: These go to eleven: the significance of the number 11 in the EBT

Content:

MN 33

"... possessed of eleven qualities, [a bhikkhu] cannot become one to reach growth, increase and maturity in this Dhamma and Discipline."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 28, 2019 3:12 AM

Title: Re: These go to eleven: the significance of the number 11 in the EBT

Content:

As only one of the eleven items (i.e., #10) is exclusively applicable to those gone forth, if I were in your position and of your persuasion I should focus on the other ten.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 28, 2019 3:31 PM

Title: Re: Buddha and Mahavira

Content:

Not likely, I think. Even if the story of Jaina textual losses is true, the biography of the teacher would likely have proven quite resilient, being preserved in folk memory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 28, 2019 5:43 PM

Title: Re: Karma defined as intention before Buddha?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 29, 2019 10:26 AM

Title: Re: Should a monk stay standing when questioning, in the courts in Burma, Thailand, Sri Lanka ?

Content:

He should do what the court requires. Not to do so would be contempt of court, which, depending on the country, would be either a civil or criminal offence. A monk committing such an offence would also be committing the Vinaya offence of non-conformity to the wishes of rulers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 29, 2019 5:14 PM

Title: Re: Karma defined as intention before Buddha?

Content:

In the non-arahant, it is cetanā alone that makes a performance count as a kamma, but it is not cetanā alone that determines the weightiness of that kamma. The weightiness is determined by multiple factors, one of which is the degree of purity of the being whom the action affects. In the case of dāna, other factors affecting the weightiness of the kamma include:

- The nature of the gift: giving a gift of Dhamma, for example, is more meritorious than giving a material gift.
- Instigation: giving a gift on one's own initiative is more meritorious than giving a gift because someone else has coaxed one into doing so.
- View: a gift given by a believer in ownership of kamma is more meritorious than one given by a disbeliever in it.
- The "widow's mite" principle:

"Some provide from the little they have,
Others who are affluent don't like to give.
An offering given from what little one has
Is worth a thousand times its value."
— <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn1.33>

- The pre-volition (pubbacetanā) or motive for giving: a motive free of attachment makes the giving more meritorious than a motive accompanied by attachment. For example, giving a gift aiming at the welfare of the recipient is more meritorious than giving it out of greed for merit, or to ingratiate oneself with the recipient, or hoping that the recipient will offer an even better gift in return, etc.
- The after-volition (aparācetanā): rejoicing in having given a gift is more meritorious than regretting having done so.

And a few others that I don't remember right now, but you'll find them in the Wheel publication *Dāna: The Practice of Giving*, especially in Lily de Silva's contribution.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/various/wheel367.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 29, 2019 5:45 PM

Title: Re: Should a monk stay standing when questioning, in the courts in Burma, Thailand, Sri Lanka ?

Content:

The Vinaya Piṭaka doesn't set any limitations on the rule's scope.

Buddhaghosa's commentary (Vin-a. v. 1068) takes it as applicable to any just law (dhammika kamma) established by the king, but not to unjust (adhammika) laws.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 29, 2019 7:20 PM

Title: Re: Kamma defined as intention before Buddha?

Content:

Thank you. And you too!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 30, 2019 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Generosity as Poison

Content:

Few people will arrive at the deathless in this lifetime; for the rest to do so will require further encounters with the Dhamma in future lifetimes.

For any such encounter to be edifying it will need to occur while in a station not lower than the human.

To arrive at such a station and to encounter the Dhamma requires merit.

Merit is acquired by dāna, sīla and bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 1, 2019 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Let's discuss Mount Sineru!

Content:

It's already been thoroughly studied by John Snelling, the late editor of the Middle Way.

<https://www.amazon.com/Sacred-Mountain-Travellers-Pilgrims-Universal/dp/0856921734>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 1, 2019 1:44 PM

Title: Re: 'The Tightest Addiction' Poll

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 5, 2019 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Let's discuss Mount Sineru!

Content:

I take the Buddha's mention of Sineru in one of four ways depending on the context...

1. As referring to some particular Himalayan mountain whose identity is now unknown. Though Kailāśa is the traditional and popular candidate this seems unlikely to me. It's reported, for example, that Raṭṭhapāla could see Sineru's peak from the rooftop of his home way down in Thullakoṭṭhita, so it would need to have been a more southerly mountain than Kailāśa.
2. As a fictionalism spoken in conformity with the geographic vohāra of his day.
3. As a mytho-poetic transformation of either #1 or #2 into the axial feature of a moral topography rather than a physical one.
4. As the instrument of a simile whose tenor is hugeness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 5, 2019 6:22 PM

Title: Re: Would a sotapanna kill a mosquito?

Content:

"Sentient being" is how some translators (mostly those working with Mahāyāna texts) have chosen to translate the pāṇa- part of pāṇātipāta. It literally means a "breather". Most translators render it as "living being" or "creature".

I would guess that those who opt for "sentient being" do so with the aim of making it clear that the term refers to saṃsāric beings and doesn't include other kinds of living things such as plants, fungi, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 6, 2019 12:58 AM

Title: Re: upekkha relationship to kamma-saka (owner of ones actions)

Content:

I don't think it is ever explicitly stated in the Tipiṭaka.

At AN 5.57 the benefit of recalling ownership of kamma is that of dissuading oneself from misconduct.

At AN. 5.161, developing upekkhā towards someone you resent and recollecting the fact that he's the owner of his kamma are two distinct practices:

mettā;

karuṇā;
upekkhā;
paying him no mind;
recalling ownership of kamma.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 6, 2019 5:40 AM
Title: Re: No self theory do I get it right?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 6, 2019 4:18 PM
Title: Meyerowitz-Katz on Moderate Drinking
Content:
The rest of the article:

<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/may/06/heres-why-moderate-drinking-is-probably-not-good-for-you>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 8, 2019 4:23 PM
Title: Re: Christmas?
Content:
Where did this happen? In which colonised Asian country did the colonisers try to foment division between Theravada and Mahayana Buddhists?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 8, 2019 5:30 PM
Title: Re: Christmas?
Content:
The British?? What kind of an answer is that? My question was:

In which colonised Asian country did the colonisers try to foment division between Theravada and Mahayana Buddhists?

If such a thing had happened, it could only have happened in a colonised country where both Theravada and Mahayana Buddhists were present in significant numbers. There are two possible candidates: French Indochina (i.e., Cambodia, Laos and Vietnam;

especially the last) and Burma, where the Mahayana is practised by a sizable Chinese minority.

Your article deals only with Sri Lanka where there was no significant Mahayana presence during the British colonial period. Unsurprisingly the writer doesn't so much as mention the Mahayana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 8, 2019 7:16 PM

Title: Re: Christmas?

Content:

I think you misremember. What I have said, when discussing the early history of Buddhism in Britain, is that the Theosophical Society played an important role in giving a platform to Buddhist teachers and Buddhist ideas. The effect of this was that for a time the Theosophical take on anattā (which is essentially a Vedantic take) was a very influential one. But with the decline of interest in Theosophy, coupled with the production of better translations of Buddhist texts and the guidance of traditionally-trained Buddhist teachers from Asia, the Vedantic take on anattā is nowadays much less influential among practising Western Buddhists, while among academic scholars of Buddhism it has been almost universally rejected as untenable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 9, 2019 12:02 AM

Title: Re: upekkha relationship to kamma-saka (owner of ones actions)

Content:

I don't know in what text the AN. 5.57 passage first came to be used liturgically or contemplatively in connection with upekkha-bhāvanā. Ven. Ānandajoti might know.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 9, 2019 10:46 AM

Title: Re: Buddha and Mahavira

Content:

There is no ha in buddha. The syllabification is bud + dha, not budd + ha.

To put it another way, the three consonants in बुद्ध are ब, द and ढ. The last gets romanized as dh, but the h is merely to show that the consonant is aspirated. It doesn't represent a separate consonant.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 9, 2019 11:04 AM
Title: Re: Invisible (hidden or secondary) war?
Content:
The Cullakāliṅga Jātaka

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/si/ja301>

<https://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/j3/j3002.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 12, 2019 2:51 AM
Title: Re: The shortest path to eradicate Mana (self-view) is to bow down to someone!
Content:
And only one kind of māna — the rather gross kind consisting in pride in one's tribal affiliation.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 12, 2019 3:42 PM
Title: Re: The shortest path to eradicate Mana (self-view) is to bow down to someone!
Content:
No. If it followed without fail that the act of bowing to somebody caused māna to be uprooted, then sīlabbataparāmāsa wouldn't be a fetter. It would be the pinnacle of Dhamma practice.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 12, 2019 3:49 PM
Title: Re: The shortest path to eradicate Mana (self-view) is to bow down to someone!
Content:
The disciples in the Vinaya account were bowing down to a person, the ex-barber Upāli.

No doubt followers of outside doctrines will want to "spiritualize" the event by saying that they were bowing to his Buddha nature, his atman or whatever, but there's really no need to invoke such ideas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 12, 2019 4:59 PM
Title: Re: The shortest path to eradicate Mana (self-view) is to bow down to someone!

Content:

They are replete with doctrines. So much so that at least a third of ancient Indian dharma-related literature is in the polemical genre: adherents of the six orthodox Brahminical darśanas writing to defend their own school's doctrines and refute those of the other five, along with those of the Buddhists, Jains, Ajīvikas and Carvakas; adherents of the extra-Brahminical darśanas refuting the doctrines of the Brahminical ones, along with each others'; adherents of the Bhakti cults writing treatises on why their god is the best god, etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 13, 2019 7:24 PM

Title: Re: beneficial in the beginning...

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 13, 2019 7:37 PM

Title: Re: Using blindfolds for meditation?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 14, 2019 9:00 AM

Title: Re: Secular Buddhism

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 14, 2019 11:06 AM

Title: Re: Secular Buddhism

Content:

I forgot to post a link to the usenet thread. It's here:

https://groups.google.com/forum/#!msg/talk.religion.buddhism/SmrLFJRh_Ok/518JSZa25OQJ;context-place=msg/talk.religion.buddhism/5-YQ_m4yBdY/hDzNXkXLKU8J

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 15, 2019 3:25 PM

Title: Re: What additional ethics you find in Buddhism which are not found in other religions?

Content:

Gaze not about the streets of the city and wander not through its squares.

(Sirach 9:7)

The Jews have most of the Sigalovāda Sutta ethics covered in the Book of Proverbs, the Book of Sirach (aka "Ecclesiasticus") and their other wisdom books.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 16, 2019 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Abortion sources

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 16, 2019 4:59 PM

Title: Re: How to translate SN 56.47 ???

Content:

As the context is a rhetorically rich one, it's not unreasonable to take paveseyya sylleptically, i.e., as bearing the meaning "to cause [his neck] to enter into [the yoke]" in the first clause, and "to procure/obtain [the human state]" in the second clause.

Bhikkhu Bodhi's rendering is a little freer than this, but not misleadingly so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 16, 2019 5:29 PM

Title: Re: How did Aṅgulimāla clear the vast amounts of dark karma he incurred by murdering hundreds of innocents, in a few yea

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 16, 2019 7:38 PM

Title: Re: How to translate SN 56.47 ???

Content:

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Clause>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Finite_verb

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nonfinite_verb

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 18, 2019 3:04 PM

Title: Re: Western teachers - Burmese ordination/traditions

Content:

I think the Burmese connection is a little tenuous in Ven. Punnadhammo's case. As far as I know he didn't train in Burma but learned the Mahasi method before ordaining at Wat Pa Nanachat. His teacher was the householder yogi Kema Ananda (Eric James Bell).

Kema Ananda learned it in Canada from the Canadian monk Ven. Ānanda Bodhi (aka Leslie Dawson, aka Namgyal Rinpoche).

Ānanda Bodhi learned it in Thailand from Phra Jodok Ñāṇasiddhi (aka Chao Khun Dhammadhīrārājamahāmuni), the founder of Section 5 (the vipassanā section at Wat Mahathat in Bangkok). Ānanda Bodhi also spent some time in Burma, but his training there wasn't with Mahasi but with the healing and pagoda-building monk U Thilawuntha.

And Phra Jodok Ñāṇasiddhi learned it at the Mahasi Centre in Rangoon, being instructed by Sayādaws Āsabha and Indavaṃsa. Sayādaw Āsabha was later to move to Thailand and found Wat Vivekasom in Chonburi, which, along with Section 5, was one of the two pioneering places for the teaching of this method in Thailand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 18, 2019 3:38 PM

Title: Re: Diaries of a monk

Content:

The English Soto Zen nun Roshi Jiyu-Kennett, published two volumes of diaries describing her training in Japan, under the title *The Wild White Goose*.

<https://www.amazon.com/Wild-White-Goose-Roshi-Jiyu-Kennett/dp/0930066022>

But most monks who keep diaries either don't publish them at all or else they use them as the basis for memoirs or autobiographies rather than publishing them as diaries, e.g., *Getting Off* by Sāmaṇera Bodhesako, *Life as a Siamese Monk* by Kapilavaḍḍho (Richard Randall, aka William Purfurst), and various books by Sangharakshita.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 20, 2019 4:04 PM

Title: Re: Do stream-winners start from scratch when they get reborn?

Content:

Not necessarily, for there's an alternative possibility that lots of sotāpannas have been reborn as humans but that their stories were just not deemed interesting enough to make it into the literature.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 20, 2019 4:19 PM

Title: Re: Do stream-winners start from scratch when they get reborn?

Content:

My very speculative answer would be as follows:

If a human sotāpanna were reborn as a deva, then he wouldn't need to start from scratch for it's the norm that humans reborn by means of apparitional arising (opapātika) have perfect recall of their previous human life. And so the deva would recall the fetters he had eradicated, the insight knowledge that he had gained, and the path by which he did it.

If a human sotāpanna were reborn as a human, then I would expect him to be still in possession of the purity he had gained but not of the insight knowledge acquired nor of the path by which it was acquired. And so being free of the first three fetters there would be an in-built limit on the extent to which he might go astray in matters of diṭṭhi and sīla. Nevertheless I expect that he would still need to re-encounter the Dhamma if he is to continue to make progress, unless in his early childhood he's fortunate enough to experience a spontaneous recall of his former life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 23, 2019 12:18 PM

Title: Re: Are Buddha, Dhamma, and Sangha a product of Mara?

Content:

Yes, in a certain sense.

The Dhamma (in the sense of pariyatti dhamma) and the Sangha arise dependent on a Buddha; a Buddha arises dependent on bodhi; and bodhi arises dependent on at least three of the five Maras.

If there was no Mara as death, then there would be no incentive for a Bodhisatta to seek the deathless, hence no bodhi.

If there was no Mara as the khandhas, then there would be no bodhi, for bodhi depends on developing insight into the khandhas.

If there was no Mara as the instigator of kamma, then there would be no bodhi, for kamma -the suttas say- is "one's vehicle for going beyond."

Some Mahyanists (e.g. fans of the Vimalakirti Nirdeśa Sūtra) would probably want to put in a good word for all five Maras, but as this isn't the Connections sub-forum I'll leave it at three.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 31, 2019 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Let's play a game: Russian doll, ditch the books, cel phone, paper and pencil

Content:

Why do you think that it must contain the five ariya iddhi and the first five of the six abhiññāyo?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 1, 2019 1:30 PM

Title: Re: Could someone help with finding chanting text of anatta-lakkhana sūta?

Content:

The extra words tht you heard may have been the three traditional introductory verses, which in some monasteries are chanted just before eva.m me sūta.m.

yanta.m sattehi dukkheṇa ñeyya.m anattalakkha.na.m |
attavaadaattasaññaana.m sammadeva vimocana.m ||

sambuddho ta.m pakaasesi di.t.thasaccaana yogina.m |
uttari.m pa.tivedhaaya bhaavetu.m ñaa.namuttama.m ||

yantesa.m di.t.thadhammaana.m ñaa.nenupaparikkhata.m |
sabbaasavehi cittaani vimucci.msu asesato |
tathaa ñaa.naanusaarena saasana.m kaatumicchata .m |
saadhuuna.m atthasiddhattha.m ta.m suttanta.m bha.naamase ||

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 9, 2019 3:09 AM

Title: Re: Star Water Blessing...

Content:

Popular images of a fat monk bearing some resemblance to the Chinese Hotei images. The monk is the Buddha's arahant disciple Mahakaccana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 2, 2019 1:34 AM

Title: Re: Parajika

Content:

I'm afraid I can't really tell you much about the errors in Horner's MN translation because I read it when I was 16 and hadn't yet learned any Pali and so was in no position to evaluate it. In the four decades since then I've never re-read it and it's only on rare occasions that I've even consulted it.

Assuming, however, that the errors in her MLS are similar in character to those in her Vinaya, most often they'll arise from the fact that she's aiming to translate according to the commentarial glosses but at a period in her life when her grasp of commentarial Pali was rather shaky. So not infrequently she simply misunderstands what the commentary is saying. Probably the easiest way to avoid (or at least to minimize) falling into error when reading the MLS would be to compare it with the Ñāṇamoli/Bodhi translation. Where the two differ the rendering in the latter will most often be the better one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 2, 2019 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Old decrepit Arahant feels pain, and pain is dukkha

Content:

But your quotation from the Salla Sutta doesn't say anything about the khandhas disintegrating. Nor does the definition of cessation in the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta:

"And this, monks, is the noble truth of the cessation of dukkha: the remainderless fading and cessation, renunciation, relinquishment, release, and letting go of that very craving."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 2, 2019 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Old decrepit Arahant feels pain, and pain is dukkha

Content:

In the definition of cessation that I quoted from the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta, the phrase "that very craving" includes vibhava-taṇhā. With vibhava-taṇhā absent there is nothing in the arahant's makeup that could serve to instigate suicide. Hence the much-iterated Theragāthā phrase:

N'ābhinandāmi maraṇaṃ, n'ābhinandāmi jīvitāṃ,
Kālaṇṇa paṭikaṅkhāmi, nibbisaṃ bhatako yathā.

"I delight not in death; I delight not in life;
But await my time, as a hireling his wages."
— Thag. 606 et al.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 3, 2019 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Are you claiming that khandhas is not dukkha?

Content:

I'm saying that your definition of nirodha as "disintegration of the khandhas" is at odds with how it is defined in the Buddha's first sermon and, moreover, is unsupported anywhere else in the suttas. In this — as in so many other things — your error seems to arise from an inability to step outside the box of mediaeval Gelukpa scholasticism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 6, 2019 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Name of the Buddha

Content:

In the Asian Theravāda cultural milieu I don't sense that Sakyamunī is a very widely known epithet, save among scholars, readers of Mahayana literature (e.g., Thai converts to Soka Gakkai use it all the time), and chanting enthusiasts (the Ratanasutta being a very popular paritta).

So, though the Mahayanists didn't invent 'Sakyamunī', they do appear to have originated the practice of using it as the Buddha Gotama's principal epithet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 7, 2019 12:17 PM

Title: Re: Worshipping to the gods in early Buddhism

Content:

In the Adhipateyyasutta one of the things taught as conducive to making an effort to abandon the unwholesome is the belief that devas might be watching you.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an3.40>

And in the Apanṇakasutta belief in and reflection upon the arūpa realms is taught as conducive to disenchantment with rūpa.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn60>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 7, 2019 6:36 PM

Title: Re: How would you respond to this?

Content:

Just post a link to any of the online debunkings of the story, from both Buddhists:

<http://www.buddha.sg/htm/faq/faq01.htm>

and from the more sensible of the Burmese Christians:

<https://etb-pseudoscience.blogspot.com/2012/04/christians-debunk-resurrection-of.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 7, 2019 9:44 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

With which post are you disagreeing?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 9, 2019 5:56 PM

Title: Re: Causes for gratitude

Content:

The Dakkhiṇāvibhaṅgasutta (MN 142) and Gotamīsutta (AN 8:51). In each the Buddha grants favours to Mahāpajāpati (i.e., ordaining women and accepting a robe offering) after being reminded by Ānanda of what Mahāpajāpati has done for him. Had the Buddha lacked a sense of gratitude Ānanda's appeals would have fallen on deaf ears.

<https://suttacentral.net/an8.51/en/sujato>

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/Texts-and-Translations/Short-Pieces/Dakkhinavibhangasuttam.htm>

There is also a passage, though I can't find it right now, where the recently awakened Buddha expresses gratitude to the Bodhi tree for the shelter it had provided him. A later (non-Theravadin) text, the Lalitavistara, takes the account even further, representing the Buddha as spending seven days standing and staring at the tree in his gratitude towards it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 9, 2019 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Causes for gratitude

Content:

At the moment of receiving the appropriate mental attitude is one of rejoicing in the donor's merit, while the bodily and verbal behaviour is that required by the Vinaya — in particular the sekhiya rules. In the case of receiving almsfood one of the sekhiyas requires that it be received appreciatingly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 10, 2019 10:00 AM

Title: Re: Types of Kamma

Content:

See chapter 5 of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha.

https://www.saraniya.com/books/meditation/Bhikkhu_Bodhi-Comprehensive_Manual_of_Abhidhamma.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 11, 2019 3:10 PM

Title: Re: Canadian monk to be disrobed after admitting to sexual relations

Content:

In Thailand even a monk who confesses to a pārājika offence will be required to recite the formula for returning to the household life. It's basically a safety precaution. Suppose that the monk is mistaken and hasn't in fact committed a pārājika. If he were to just take off his robes and walk away, conceiving himself to be a householder when he's in fact still technically a monk, then he might proceed to engage in some action that would make him really pārājika. But if he recites the disrobing formula, officially returns to the household life and then later comes to realize that he's innocent, then he'll be free to re-ordain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 11, 2019 4:19 PM

Title: Re: Canadian monk to be disrobed after admitting to sexual relations

Content:

This is the last news I heard of him.

<https://forum.thaivisa.com/topic/720939-phra-yantra-amaro-quietly-returns-to-thailand/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 11, 2019 4:52 PM

Title: Re: Canadian monk to be disrobed after admitting to sexual relations

Content:

I'm not sure, but I suspect it's for the same reason that the monks of the Santi Asoke Sangha wear a non-standard colour. Since they regard themselves as bhikkhus they have to wear robes of some sort. But since they're officially considered to be not bhikkhus (for invalid ordination in the case of Santi Asoke, for pārājika in the case of Yantra) if they were to wear normal robes then they'd be liable to arrest in Thailand for impersonating bhikkhus.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 12, 2019 3:36 PM

Title: Re: Birth is ended ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 12, 2019 7:36 PM

Title: Re: Birth is ended ?

Content:

I wouldn't say that because I don't understand what it means. I wonder if you could phrase it in some other way?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 12, 2019 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Birth is ended ?

Content:

Even before I encountered the Dīgha Commentary my understanding of the phrase had always been identical to that of the commentator. I can't think of any simpler or better way of explaining it than it already has been:

"It is the birth which would have arisen if the path had not been fully developed."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 13, 2019 6:22 AM

Title: Clearing up Misconceptions about Kamma

Content:

A very fine exposition given by Canadian Abhidhamma student Rob Moulton at the request of the Buddhist Gem Fellowship.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 13, 2019 6:48 PM

Title: Re: Layman's Handbook of Dhamma

Content:

Perhaps the Upasakajanalankara. Or Ven. Dr. Saddhatissa's Buddhist Ethics, which is much informed by this text.

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=3176#p327202>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 13, 2019 9:11 PM

Title: Re: What is nirvana/heaven?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 13, 2019 11:43 PM

Title: Re: What is nirvana/heaven?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 14, 2019 12:35 PM

Title: Re: Theravada school (Mahavihara tradition) comes from the Tamrashatiya school

Content:

I think it would be more accurate to say:

"The branch of the Vibhajyavāda school in Sri Lanka came to be referred to by Buddhist writers in India (well, two of them at least) as the 'Tāmraśāṭīya'. Tāmraśāṭīya is an ancient name for the Ceylonese that may be either an inept sanskritization of Tambapaṇṇīya (the Pali name for the Ceylonese) or else a back-translation into Sanskrit of the Tibetan name for the Ceylonese."

But to say as the OP does that "the Mahavihāra Theravāda comes from the Tāmraśāṭīya" is about as trivially true as "Anglicanism comes from English Christians" or "Russian Orthodoxy comes from the Russians."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 16, 2019 8:06 AM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

There's a scanned copy of the Jinakālamālī here (Pali in Thai script and Thai translation):

<http://www.finearts.go.th/chiangmailibrary/2016-08-20-05-05-37/book/154.html?page=1>

But the chapter entitled Atidūrenidāna, "Stories of the Long Distant Past", doesn't name any Buddha before the sāramaṇḍakappa in which Sumedha met Dīpaṅkara.

Nor does the Dīgha Atthakathā, which can be read at the Goenka Tipiṭaka website:
<https://www.tipitaka.org/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 16, 2019 1:38 PM

Title: Re: Sallekha Sutta: Personal Goals

Content:

Make the following changes:

Both sexes

mayam'ettha > aham'ettha

bhavissāmā'ti > bhavissāmī'ti.

Female

brahmacārī > brahmacārinī

sammādiṭṭhī > sammādiṭṭhinī

sammāsati > sammāsatinī

sammāsamādhī > sammāsamādhinī

sammāñāṇī > sammāñāṇinī

sammāvimutti > sammāvimuttinī

anupānāhī > anupānāhinī

amakkhī > amakkhinī

apaḷāsī > apaḷāsini

anissukī > anissukinī

amaccharī > amaccharinī

amāyāvi > amāyāvinī

anatimānī > anatimāninī

ottāpī > ottāpinī

upaṭṭhitassatī > upaṭṭhitassatinī

asandiṭṭhiparāmāsī anādhānaggāhī suppaṭinissaggi > asandiṭṭhiparāmāsini

anādhānaggāhinī suppaṭinissaggini

Male

avihiṃsakā > avihimsako
paṭiviratā > paṭivirato
abyāpannacittā > abyāpannacitto
sammāsaṅkappā > sammāsaṅkappo
sammāvācā > sammāvāco
sammākamantā > sammākamanto
sammā-ājīvā > sammā-ājīvo
sammāvāyāmā > sammāvāyāmo
vigatathīnamiddhā > vigatathīnamiddho
anuddhatā > anuddhato
tiṇṇavicikicchā > tiṇṇavicikiccho
akkodhanā > akkodhano
asaṭhā > asaṭho
atthaddhā > atthaddho
suvacā > suvaco
kalyāṇamittā > kalyāṇamitto
appamattā > appamatto
saddhā > saddho
hirimanā > hirimano
bahussutā > bahussuto
āradhaviṛiyā > āradhaviṛiyo
paññāsampannā > paññāsampanno

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 17, 2019 4:17 AM

Title: Re: Latest announcement from Amaravati monastery. (Good dhamma inc)

Content:

That's not correct. The -o ending in Jayasāro is nominative, not vocative. The -a in Jayasāra happens to be morphologically vocative, though when used as a monk's name it's usually regarded as being pre-inflected, i.e., as being in the form one would meet with in a Pali dictionary.

In any case the practice in Thailand is that the name a monk is given at his ordination is always in the nominative case. This is true of all monks and doesn't indicate anything at all about a monk's status. The only thing different about Ven. Jayasāro, Amaro, etc. is that they use their Pali names all the time, which is a peculiarity of the Ajahn Chah tradition. The general practice in Thailand is that monks use their lay name prefixed by Phra or Tan.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 17, 2019 4:39 AM

Title: Re: if you witness a crime

Content:

Actually when translating lists of items, a lapse in mindfulness will more often lead to the omission of one of the middle items than it will to the omission of the last. Typically what happens is that the translator finds himself in two minds about how to render a word (e.g. "Should I translate *mātāpitu* as 'mother and father' or as 'parents'? How did I do it in my translation of other suttas? I'd better check...") and so he decides to skip it for the time being and come back to it later. If he's translating at the phenomenally fast pace that Bhante Sujāto was, then it's no surprise if he occasionally forgets his resolve to return to the missing phrase.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 17, 2019 8:41 AM

Title: Re: Sallekha Sutta: Personal Goals

Content:

You're welcome.

By the way, if you haven't already seen it, I highly recommend a book of talks on the Sallekhasutta by Mahasi Sayadaw. It's available on Ven. Pesala's website:

<http://www.aimwell.org/sallekha.html>

Also, I think the best English translation of the sutta is probably that of Nyanaponika Thera. The link below also includes his introduction to the discourse:

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nyanaponika/wheel061.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 17, 2019 5:34 PM

Title: Re: Sampajañña vs sampajāno ???

Content:

In general when a Pali noun and adjective are both formed from the same roots and prefixes their underlying meaning will be the same in the majority of contexts. There may, however, be a few contexts where the adjective bears some distinct meaning that doesn't apply to the noun, or vice versa.

For example, the adjective *sampajāna* sometimes means 'deliberate', as in the Vinaya expression '*sampajāna-musāvāda*', but as far as I know the noun *sampajañña* never means 'deliberateness'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 17, 2019 7:49 PM

Title: Re: Sampajañña vs sampajāno ???

Content:

Since sampajañña in its technical sense is present only in wholesome consciousnesses, one can't simultaneously have sampajañña and be motivated to tell a lie.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 18, 2019 8:18 PM

Title: Re: Practitioners in the SW England

Content:

<http://www.buddhanet.info/wbd/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 6:03 AM

Title: Re: How do I repent breaking the five precepts?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 7:01 AM

Title: Re: How do I repent breaking the five precepts?

Content:

As it happens, that's also my understanding. I would note, however, that Bhikkhu Subhūti has argued for a rather more constraining interpretation of what it means to be "protected by one's parents".

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=32761>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 12:58 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Studies Review 35 (2018) (request)

Content:

This one is available from Peter Harvey's academia.edu page.

https://www.academia.edu/32919392/Lance_Cousins_1942_2015_An_Obituary_Appreciation_and_Bibliography

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 3:18 PM

Title: Re: How do I repent breaking the five precepts?

Content:

Thanks for your reply bhante. I think we're in full agreement here, except for what I've quoted above. I don't see any evidence in Bhikkhu Subhuti's article (linked below), nor in his posts to the related thread, that his views support forced marriage. The venerable's error, in my opinion, is his belief that an unmarried woman is to be regarded as "protected by her father" and/or "protected by her mother" so long as either or both parents are still alive, irrespective of her age, irrespective of whether she is still living with them.

<https://americanmonk.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/Theravada-Buddhism-and-Sex-extended.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 5:52 PM

Title: Re: How do I repent breaking the five precepts?

Content:

Would they still be considered so if they went to study abroad or to work in a different city? Or would parents simply not permit such a move?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 19, 2019 7:54 PM

Title: Re: How do I repent breaking the five precepts?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 20, 2019 11:03 PM

Title: Re: 5 precepts

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Aug 20, 2019 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

The Buddhavaṃsa is based on a much longer time frame than the ninety-one aeons of the Mahāpadānasutta and Āṭānāṭiya Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 21, 2019 1:49 AM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

No stranger than the fact that Ānanda becomes "Anon" in Thai and "Kun dga' bo" in Tibetan, or that Mahākassapa becomes "Da Jia She" in Chinese.

If a text is in Pali then we may anticipate that any proper name imported from another language will be Pali-ized, either by having its meaning translated into Pali or its pronunciation modified to fit the Pali phonemic system.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 21, 2019 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Vajrapani in Pali Canon

Content:

The only other occurrence is in the Cūḷasaccakasutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn35>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 21, 2019 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

Surely what it means is that the fact that their names are preserved in Pali provides no clue at all as to where they flourished, just as "Alfredus Magnus" provides no clue that Alfred the Great was a Saxon from Wessex, or as "Carolus Magnus" provides no clue that Charlemagne was King of the Franks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 21, 2019 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Vajrapani in Pali Canon

Content:

The Theravāda and Mahāyāna Vajrapāṇi conceptions are both derived from the Vedic deity Indra.

The different spellings are simply owing to the fact that in Pali you can't have a j followed by an r, and so Skt. vajra takes the forms vajira or vajīra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 22, 2019 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

He was pointing to Roseapple Island – a name for the quarter of the human realm that's visible to us and in which Buddhas appear, as opposed to the other three quarters that are invisible to us and in which they don't appear. It's true, of course, that in the Buddha's day, Roseapple Island happened to be the Middle Region of India. But as an indexical term with a shifting referent, Roseapple Island wasn't always India in the past and needn't always be India in the future.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 22, 2019 12:34 PM

Title: Re: Seeking contact email of Ven. Pannobhasa

Content:

Hi Bhante,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

The address Ven. Paññobhāsa gave on his old blog is nippapanca(at)gmail(dot)com

If this isn't current, then you could try leaving him a comment on his new blog:

<https://politicallyincorrectdharma.blogspot.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 22, 2019 1:56 PM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

Many known societies have had counterparts to the four varṇas.

For example, if 14th century England had been a Pali- or Sanskrit-speaking society, then we should expect the knight, the squire, the yeoman, the man-of-law and the summoner in Chaucer's General Prologue to the Canterbury Tales to be called kśatriyas. The prioress, nun, nun's priests, monk, friar, clerk, parson, pardoner and canon would be the brāhmanas and brāhmiṇīs; the host, merchant, franklin, shipman, physician, manciple, reeve, and Wife of Bath would be vaiśyas; while the haberdasher, carpenter, weaver, dyer, tapester, cook, ploughman and miller would be śūdras.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 22, 2019 4:19 PM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

There is a resemblance inasmuch as both groups are the key figures in the established religion of their respective times. Suppose that some Buddha, living in a society stratified like ancient Magadha, recalls a previous Buddha who'd lived in a society that was stratified like 14th century England. In order to convey to the Magadhan audience the social class into which that Buddha had been born he would have needed to resort to the stratifying terms with which they were familiar. Or, to borrow a term from Bible translators, he would need to resort to https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dynamic_and_formal_equivalence since no form-equivalence is available.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Aug 22, 2019 4:46 PM

Title: Re: Buddhas before Lord Tanhankara

Content:

That's beside the point, for I didn't say "a 14th century English society", but "a society that was stratified like 14th century England".

I could (and probably should) have chosen some other society, say, ancient Sumeria. But the point would still stand: if someone in Magadha is attempting to describe the social position of some person in a non-Magadhan society of a different epoch, he will need to resort to terms with which Magadhans are familiar. That being so, the Buddha's resorting to the 4-varṇa scheme doesn't oblige us to assume that all past Buddhas arose in India.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 23, 2019 6:14 AM

Title: Re: Appropriate way of writing verse 204?

Content:

Among the several variant readings, the one you give in your post has been favoured by most modern Dhammapada editors, on the grounds of its conformity to pathyā siloka, the Dhammapada's dominant metre.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 23, 2019 12:40 PM

Title: Re: Is it wholesome to eat unfertilised eggs?

Content:

Like me, Chownah lives in the north of Thailand where boiled cow's afterbirth (tôm hók wua) is considered quite a delicacy.

,

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 23, 2019 8:27 PM

Title: Re: The 3rd precept for lay person

Content:

Those strictures aren't to be found in the Pali Canon, nor in the extant early texts of any other Indian Buddhist school. According to José Ignacio Cabezón's magisterial study, *Sexuality in Classical South Asian Buddhism*, they first make their appearance in the *Daśākuśalakarmapathanirdeśa*, a treatise on the ten unwholesome kammic courses composed by Āśvaghoṣa in the first or second century CE.

I attach chapter 8 of Cabezón's book, which will probably tell you far more than you (or anyone else) ever wanted to know about this rather sticky subject.

[./download/file.php?id=5181](#)

(347.82 KiB) Downloaded 65 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 23, 2019 8:28 PM

Title: Re: The 3rd precept for lay person

Content:

Endnotes to Cabezón's article.

[./download/file.php?id=5182](#)

(313.62 KiB) Downloaded 52 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 24, 2019 6:06 AM

Title: Re: Is it wholesome to eat unfertilised eggs?

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj2/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Aug 24, 2019 6:24 PM

Title: Re: Is it wholesome to eat unfertilised eggs?

Content:

If a monk sees, hears or suspects that the omelette was made from a fertilized egg, and that the egg was cooked just for him, then I think the same considerations as those pertaining to meat and fish would apply. In practice, however, a monk nowadays will seldom have reason to see, hear or suspect such a thing.

In my own case, the last time I refused the offering of an egg was in 1997. In that year I was spending the vassa in an abandoned WW II bunker on an eider duck farm on the northern coast of Iceland. My almsfood came mostly from the local duck farmers and their Thai wives. Since all the ducks in the neighbourhood were free range I had strong grounds for suspecting that any cooked duck eggs offered to me would be both fertilized and cooked specially for me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 25, 2019 6:41 AM

Title: Re: Another "Moin"

Content:

Welcome back.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Aug 25, 2019 9:28 AM

Title: Re: Is it wholesome to eat unfertilised eggs?

Content:

Yes.

If you buy a dozen eggs at Tesco's and put them in an incubator you won't get any chicks. Either the eggs will be from a battery farm, in which case they'll be unfertilized, or they'll be from a free range or organic farm, in which case they may once have been fertilized, but the embryos will have been killed by refrigeration.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Aug 26, 2019 2:24 PM

Title: Re: Translating "dhammaṃ" in dhammavicayasambojjhaṅgo ???

Content:

No, not in this context. The limiting adjective taṃ narrows down the possible referents

to some item that has already been mentioned. The only candidate here is the *bojjhaṅga* referred to in the preceding sentence.

If one wanted to say "the Dhamma" in this context, one would use just *dhammaṃ* with no *taṃ*.

There are other contexts in which "the Dhamma" would be defensible as a dynamic equivalent rendering of "*taṃ dhammaṃ*" (though a form-equivalent rendering will always be "that Dhamma"), but they differ from your example in that "the Dhamma" has been mentioned or alluded to in an earlier sentence.

For example, in the Thai morning chanting: *Tam'ahaṃ dhammaṃ sirasā namāmi*.

Or the *Punabbasutta*, SN10.7:

*Jarāmarañamokkhāya, yaṃ dhammaṃ abhisambudhaṃ,
Taṃ dhammaṃ sotumicchāmi, tuṇhī hohi punabbasūti.*
<https://suttacentral.net/sn10.7/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Aug 28, 2019 11:42 AM

Title: Re: Japanese-speaking Theravada monasteries or monks?

Content:

Interesting. This year I'm spending the rains retreat in Li District and didn't realise that I had some Japanese neighbours. I do know the monastery (it's in the same sub-district as the monastery of my old teacher, Ajahn Sanit), but I haven't visited in over thirty years. Is Phra Nopadon still the abbot?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2019 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Is it wholesome to eat unfertilised eggs?

Content:

The *Amagandha Sutta* is irrelevant, for it's merely about the consumption of meat not being a defilement; it's not about killing animals for meat or cooking eggs.

Sinhala

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/si/snp2.2>

English

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/snp2.2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Aug 30, 2019 12:54 AM

Title: Re: Mara

Content:

True, he did say that, but in saying it he wasn't offering a comprehensive description of Māra, but merely a context-specific one. Nyanaponika makes the comment in a footnote to his translation of the Rāgasutta (Iti 68) and he is defining it in line with the commentary to the sutta, which identifies māra in that context with kilesa māra and abhisāṅkhāra māra. Nyanaponika wasn't claiming (as the modernists often do) that Māra is nothing but a figure of speech, thereby denying the existence of Māra devaputta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2019 6:59 AM

Title: Re: Arahant is giving Dana to another Arahant?

Content:

Oh? Then you'd better notify your fellow Goenkaites so that they can expunge the Sāriputtattheramātupetivatthu from their website and the next edition of their Tipiṭaka CD.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2019 11:37 AM

Title: Re: Arahant is giving Dana to another Arahant?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2019 2:49 PM

Title: Re: without insight, there is no true metta, karuna, equanimity, symp joy etc?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 2, 2019 4:11 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

I doubt anyone could do that with any degree of certainty. As far as I know, all that can be said with certainty is that:

1. The Tipiṭaka tells us nothing about the meaning of pāṭihāriyapakkha.

2. The Saṃyutta and Aṅguttara commentaries give us two quite different accounts of it.
3. The sub-commentaries offer no resolution of the discrepancy in the commentaries' accounts.
4. In the Asian Theravadin cultural milieu knowledge of the significance of pāṭihāriyapakkha is not present even in folk memory, let alone in any living observance.

And more speculatively...

5. The fact that pāṭihāriyapakkha gets mentioned about forty times in the commentaries but only twice in the sub-commentaries might be taken as suggestive evidence that the decline of this observance took place some time between the composition of these two bodies of texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 4, 2019 3:09 PM

Title: Re: Spelling

Content:

I think Sutta Central's discussion forum in its earlier form may be responsible for this. With the original software if you wrote the citation without gaps, then a link to the translation would be automatically generated.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 5, 2019 6:52 AM

Title: Re: Why three times ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 5, 2019 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Root of Piti

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 6, 2019 9:52 AM

Title: Re: Root of Piti

Content:

Yes, I took the นครธรรม/Nak Tham course at Wat Benchamabophitr in the late 1980s and was the first Western Mahanikaya monk to complete it. Though not the first of all

Western monks – two American Dhammayutts, Ajahn Thanissaro at Wat Asokaram, and Phra Kantasīlo at Wat Boworniwet, preceded me by a decade. If you're competent in Thai and have a fairly good memory it's not difficult. If I remember right, the Ministry of Education classes Nak Tham Ek as the equivalent of completing the third grade of high school.

Your mentioning Nak Tham has actually jogged my memory and contrary to what I wrote in my earlier post I have in fact encountered the fourfold list of sāsanaṇapuggala, sāsanaṇavatthu, etc. One of the minor subjects studied in Nak Tham is Buddhist ceremonies, using a 3-volume textbook called ศาสนพิธี. I think the scheme is found in the first or second volume.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 6, 2019 10:21 AM

Title: Re: Root of Piti

Content:

That's true of non-Thai monks living here. But with the Thais, nearly every village or town monk will be required to take at least Nak Tham Tree and in recent years even the abbots of some forest wats have had their monks do it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 6, 2019 7:33 PM

Title: Re: What exactly does the Pali term "parinibbāyino" mean ????

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 8, 2019 6:11 PM

Title: Re: How difficult it is to obtain human life ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 8, 2019 6:31 PM

Title: Re: How difficult it is to obtain human life ?

Content:

Yes, I got that. But the figure is so staggering (even more so for termites!) I couldn't resist posting it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 8, 2019 6:39 PM

Title: Re: Is it worth it to resist your well-deserved bad karma?

Content:

No, it would be going to the extreme of self-mortification. It might perhaps meet with the approval of Nigaṇṭha ascetics, but in the Cūḷadukkhakkhandha Sutta the Buddha ridiculed the idea.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn14>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 9, 2019 8:52 AM

Title: Re: MN 138 upekkha-sukha error in pali CST4 source, should correction be sukha-kāyena, or sukha-kayassa?

Content:

As far as I know, in the commentaries kāyena is never glossed as purisena, puggalena, attabhāvena or anything else to this effect.

The places where Ven. Sujāto translates kāyena as "personally" seem to be those where the commentary gives the gloss saḥajāta-nāmakāyena ("with the conascent mental body") or simply nāmakāyena.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 10, 2019 11:01 PM

Title: Re: Complete Patimokkha Chant in Pali PDF, anyone?

Content:

If you are planning to study the Pātimokkha, I recommend you also download Ven. Ñāṇatusita's word-by-word analysis of it.

https://drive.google.com/open?id=15pDKbu4mliHV-v5ijaqEce253fvx_Yv7

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 11, 2019 3:04 AM

Title: Re: "Householder" etymology

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 11, 2019 11:33 AM
Title: Re: what is a dhammakkhanda?
Content:
And its meaning is explained in the Atthasālinī:

.

[./download/file.php?id=5193&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 11, 2019 1:38 PM
Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club
Content:
That's just your opinion. The Theravāda understanding of cātuddase pannarase aṭṭhamiyā ca is that uposatha falls on the fourteenth day when it's a 14-day half-month, on the fifteenth day when it's a 15-day half-month, and on the eighth day of every half-month.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 11, 2019 5:22 PM
Title: Re: Complete Patimokkha Chant in Pali PDF, anyone?
Content:
<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/learning-the-pa-imokkha/11774>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 11, 2019 7:21 PM
Title: Re: Complete Patimokkha Chant in Pali PDF, anyone?
Content:
This is the Thai version in Devanagari.

[./download/file.php?id=5194](#)
(217.04 KiB) Downloaded 90 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Sep 12, 2019 4:32 PM
Title: Re: Complete Patimokkha Chant in Pali PDF, anyone?

Content:

Yes, for that you need either the Vinaya Piṭaka or some modern work like Ajahn Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code.

This will give you the Vinaya Piṭaka's background stories (and subsequent evolution) of all of the rules in the monks' Pātimokkha:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb>

This does the same for the nuns' Pātimokkha:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bi-vb>

And this does it for all the Vinaya rules and procedures that fall outside the Pātimokkha:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 13, 2019 1:38 AM

Title: Re: What is Nibbana?

Content:

Nibbāna can be one, two, three or four.

For one, two and three see pages 391-4 of Sayādaw U Silānanda's Handbook of Abhidhamma Studies.

<http://www.abhidhamma.com/Abhid-Lectures-2.pdf>

As for the fourfold nibbāna, this is based on whether the attainer is a sotāpanna, sakadāgāmin, anāgāmin or arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 18, 2019 2:12 AM

Title: Re: vivicca, a term put together with 2 words?

Content:

The noun viveka and participle vivicca are related, being formed from the same prefix and verbal root, but there's no connection at all with anicca.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 19, 2019 5:32 PM

Title: Re: What's "Laughing Wisdom" ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 19, 2019 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Eyes Open?

Content:

No, in the Pali texts nothing is stated on the matter. Nowadays you will encounter a variety of views, such as:

1. The eyes should always be kept open.
2. The eyes should always be kept closed.
3. It doesn't matter whether they are open or closed.
4. It does matter: they should be closed when energy is stronger than concentration (to avoid restlessness), but open when concentration is stronger than energy (to avoid sloth and torpor).
5. It depends on the meditator: some fare better with eyes open, some with eyes closed.

But each view is just the opinion of one teacher or another, one meditation sub-tradition or another.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 19, 2019 11:16 PM

Title: Re: Is there creator god actually there?just asking

Content:

Not there, not here, not anywhere.

<http://www.buddhismtoday.com/english/philosophy/maha/027-Dharmakiirti.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 20, 2019 1:36 PM

Title: Re: Story of a small giant

Content:

What is the source of this story? 140kg would be roughly the weight of an adult giant panda.

At a weightlifting contest in Pattaya yesterday, a Chinese Olympic weightlifter won a gold medal and broke the world record for a snatch lift in the 61kg class by lifting just 145kg.

<https://www.iwf.net/2019/09/19/li-fabin-seized-gold-irawan/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 21, 2019 12:45 AM

Title: Re: looking for citation, pīti and sukha of 4 jhānas compared to dying of thirst, seeing water in distance, and drinking

Content:

The answer is in the next paragraph of the sutta:

* thirsty men from the four directions = men from the four varṇas.

* entering the lotus pond = their going forth in the Tathāgata's dhammavinaya, developing the brahmavihāras, attaining inner calm.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 21, 2019 11:44 PM

Title: Re: looking for citation, pīti and sukha of 4 jhānas compared to dying of thirst, seeing water in distance, and drinking

Content:

I think most of what I would say has already been said by Volo. To sum up:

- Pīti is never referred to as a vedanā in any Pali text whatever.
- In the Suttanta Piṭaka pīti is never really defined, except by a list of ten synonyms (i.e., pāmojjaṃ, modanā, āmodanā, pamodanā, hāso, pahāso, vitti, tuṭṭhi, odaggaṃ and attamanatā cittassa), given in the Niddesa and Paṭisambhidāmagga.
- The classification of pīti as an item in saṅkhārakkhandha doesn't originate with the commentaries but goes back to the Abhidhamma Piṭaka's Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Vibhaṅga.
- That the second ānāpānassati tetrad corresponds to vedanānupassanā doesn't oblige us to conclude that the pītipaṭisaṃvedī in this tetrad is a vedanā, for the tetrad also includes cittasaṅkhārappaṭisaṃvedī. Cittasaṅkhārā includes saññā, which is certainly not a vedanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 22, 2019 12:12 AM

Title: Re: looking for citation, pīti and sukha of 4 jhānas compared to dying of thirst, seeing water in distance, and drinking

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 22, 2019 2:02 AM

Title: Re: looking for citation, pīti and sukha of 4 jhānas compared to dying of thirst, seeing water in distance, and drinking

Content:

The Atthasālini translation ("The Expositor") is among the texts that the PTS has made legally available in its entirety. You can get scanned copies of the two volumes from archive.org

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.92596>

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.282115>

The Sammohavinodanī (Vibhaṅga Atthakathā), translated by Ñāṇamoli as "Dispeller of Delusion" is unfortunately not yet legally available.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 22, 2019 2:33 AM

Title: Re: looking for citation, pīti and sukha of 4 jhānas compared to dying of thirst, seeing water in distance, and drinking

Content:

Are these the passages you are referring to? If so, where in the first passage does it say that kāya means the physical body? The commentary doesn't define it so. In fact it repeats the Saṃyutta Commentary's definition that I quoted in my last post.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 22, 2019 7:12 AM

Title: Re: Ancient texts of meditation

Content:

In the case of Ajahn Lee, the Vimuttimagga wouldn't have been an option as it was translated into Thai only twenty years ago. The ajahn died in 1961.

As for Ledi Sayadaw and the inventor of the Kanni method, for nearly all Burmese monks the Visuddhimagga has long been the traditional mainstay for bhāvanā. I don't know if there is a Burmese translation of the Vimuttimagga, but even if there was one, it would be regarded by the Burmese as a heterodox text on account of its non-Mahāvihāra provenance.

As for the Yogāvacara manual, almost nobody uses it because almost nobody can understand it (though Anāgarika Dhammapāla was reportedly a big fan). It was most probably intended as a text to be used in conjunction with oral instruction, but there's no longer any living tradition of bhāvanā associated with it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 23, 2019 1:28 PM

Title: Re: Ancient texts of meditation

Content:

I've heard it claimed that Luang Phor Reusee Lingdam, late abbot of Wat Jantharam Thasung in Uthai Thani, had mastered manomaya-iddhi and could teach it, but I don't know if it's true or how he taught it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 23, 2019 2:06 PM

Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?

Content:

No. If a bhikkhu does so, then unless he is sick he will be breaking pācittiya 39 if he asks for any of the nine kinds of fine foods (i.e., ghee, fresh butter, oil, honey, sugar/molasses, fish, meat, milk, curds) or committing a dukkaṭa offence if he stipulates any other kind of food.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 24, 2019 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?

Content:

In Vinaya one doesn't escape culpability by having a non-allowable request conveyed via a messenger.

For example, there's no difference between hiring a hitman to have someone snuffed and sending a messenger to hire a hitman to have someone snuffed.

And so if the layperson is carrying the placard because the monks have told him to do so, and if the monks are not sick, and if the message stipulates the vegetarian foods: ghee, fresh butter, oil, honey, sugar, milk or curds, then it would be a pācittiya.

If the same conditions obtain but the placard doesn't stipulate which particular vegetarian foods the dainty monks are craving for, then it would be a dukkaṭa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 24, 2019 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?

Content:

Well, yes, he could be. But seriously folks ... in the real world it seldom if ever happens

that a layperson spontaneously appoints himself as a monk's ambulatory herald – walking in front of him on almsround and proclaiming to all and sundry what a gastronomically correct offering would be.

Any time you witness such a scene it's almost certain that the monk in question is a militant vegetarian (someone like Phra Phothirak or Ajahn Yantra) and is using the almsround precisely for the purpose of promoting his favourite dietary choice. And the placard-carrying herald is just a lay disciple doing what he's told.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 24, 2019 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?

Content:

If you are asking if his dietary commitment will exempt him from observing pācittiya 39, then the answer is no. The training rule gives only occasions of sickness as grounds for exemption.

There won't, however, be any Vinaya fault if he practises vegetarianism by simply not eating any meat or fish that are offered to him. It's when he makes an effort to engineer what sort of foods get offered to him that he runs the risk of committing an offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Sep 24, 2019 2:21 PM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

Thanks for posting this report.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 7:21 AM

Title: Re: Ancient texts of meditation

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 7:34 AM

Title: Re: Sharing merit

Content:

It should be:

ākāsaṭṭhā ca bhummaṭṭhā
devā nāgā mahiddhikā |
puññantaṃ anumoditvā
ciraṃ rakkhantu sāsanaṃ ||

May those devas and nāgas of great power,
stationed in the sky or on the earth,
having shared in this merit
guard the Dispensation for a long time!

The version with loka in it doesn't make sense and doesn't conform to the metre.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 8:06 AM
Title: Re: New beings/minds formation
Content:
Don't the two issues boil down to the same thing?

If the statement, "There's no beginning to saṃsāra" is true, then the statement, "Some beings in saṃsāra are new" must be false. For these beings to be "new" their saṃsāra would have needed to have had a beginning.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 9:09 AM
Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?
Content:
Except on occasions of sickness, ANY efforts made by bhikkhus to induce laypeople to offer them the kind of food they prefer will always involve a departure from the dhammic virtues of "contentment with any kind of almsfood" (itaṛitarapiṇḍapāta-santuṭṭhi) and "contentment with whatever gains happen to come one's way" (yathālābha-santuṭṭhi).

Now if a bhikkhu is a clever legalist he may be able to devise all sorts of ways of getting what he wants that are not technically violations of any Vinaya rule. For example, merely saying "I don't eat meat" (or publishing a book in which you announce the same) wouldn't transgress pācittiya 39 in the way that "Give me vegetarian food!" would. But if your purpose in saying it is to induce laypeople to offer you vegetarian food, then you've abandoned the dhammic virtues of itaṛitarapiṇḍapāta-santuṭṭhi and yathālābha-santuṭṭhi, even though your Vinaya is technically pure.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 9:35 AM

Title: Re: No local Theravada Sangha

Content:

I second that.

<https://www.samatha.org/what-we-offer/classes/norwich-0>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Sep 25, 2019 10:04 PM

Title: Re: New beings/minds formation

Content:

If a new living being (which is to say, a new saṃsāra - in the non-figurative sense), were to arise, then since that being had not existed before, its arising would contradict the sutta statement that saṃsāra is without any conceivable beginning. For that being there would be a beginning; there would be "a first point to avijjā", there would be a first point of which one could say, "Before this there was no ignorance, afterwards it came into being."

Therefore, the notion of a new being arising is at odds with how saṃsāra is conceived in the suttas, whether considered in either its literal or in its figurative sense.

Is this any clearer?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2019 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Almsround monk can request for vegetarian foods ?

Content:

It's not uncommon for this to happen with newly-ordained monks who haven't yet adapted to eating only in the mornings. But this isn't the usual reason why some senior monks grow fat. It's more often because they go too far in trying to please their lay donors. This is also why fat monks are a rarer sight in forest wats than in town and village wats. In a forest wat after the food's been offered and the blessing given, the lay people will usually leave the sālā and let the monks eat in peace, rather than hovering about the table, offering more food when monks' plates are empty and badgering them to eat it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2019 12:07 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Akiñcano - "With the Right Understanding" (Phenomenological Explorations of the Pāli Suttas)

Content:

It's a different Akiñcano.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Sep 26, 2019 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Temple in remote areas needs some suggestions in acquiring electricity

Content:

It depends how much electricity is needed. I once spent three years on a mountain and got by with two car batteries, a 12v-to-240v inverter and a small solar panel for recharging the batteries. But then my needs were quite minimal. I was only using electricity to light a fluorescent reading lamp and recharge a laptop. To boil water I would light a fire as the inverter didn't supply enough wattage and when we held nighttime public meetings I would use candles since large fluorescent lights would have exhausted the batteries too quickly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 27, 2019 1:05 PM

Title: Re: Temple in remote areas needs some suggestions in acquiring electricity

Content:

I think it can be done for much less than that. From the pictures you posted it seems the monks are presently using a centralized battery system for the whole monastery. If I were designing the setup I'd decentralize it and supply each monk's kuṭi with:

One Voltaic Systems solar panel

\$79

[./download/file.php?id=5248&mode=view](#)

One Bestek 300W Power Inverter DC 12V to 230V AC Converter

\$37

Two Ultra Max LI7-12, 12v 7Ah lithium ion batteries

\$116 x 2 = \$232

Total: \$348 x 30 monks = \$10,440

Or less if the existing solar panels can be transferred to the kutis and if (some of) the existing batteries are still usable.

To this one would need to add the cost for electrifying the kitchen and sala, both of which would require more robust (and more expensive) systems than the kutis. But the total will still be a lot less than \$30k and you won't be losing up to 30% of your energy via distribution as you will with a centralized system. Also, it will be more aesthetically

pleasing for you won't have all those ugly wires hanging about overhead.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 27, 2019 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Temple in remote areas needs some suggestions in acquiring electricity

Content:

Lack of a visible sun isn't an insuperable problem. It just means that the batteries won't charge as fast and so you'll need at least one spare battery. In my own case, during the hot season if I connected a battery to the solar panel at dawn it would be fully charged by the time I'd finished breakfast. In the cool season it would take until noon. In the wet season, when there were usually thick mountain clouds all day long, it would take from dawn to dusk.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Sep 27, 2019 8:15 PM

Title: Re: Insights cannot be discuss

Content:

It's a little too vague to be able to declare it true or false. To be more specific:

If the insight amounts to an ariyan attainment, e.g., stream-entry, and if the attainer is a bhikkhu, then it can't be made known to an unordained person.

Whether the insight is a low- or a high-level one, if the attainer is not ordained then the texts don't impose any limitation on declaring it or discussing it. However, some meditation teachers and traditions have their own rules or advisories, usually counseling the exercise of discretion in this matter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 28, 2019 3:11 AM

Title: Re: Insights cannot be discuss

Content:

In the origin story to the rule the concern seems to be that if such declarations were permitted, then monks would make them for the sake of their livelihood.

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pc8/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 28, 2019 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

I agree that it's open to being read that way, but it doesn't supply any confirmation that this way of reading it is correct. It's also open to being read as the Theravāda tradition reads it, i.e., by taking the three specified days as being three possible days on which uposathas might fall subject to the vagaries of the calendar, rather than as three days in every month on which uposathas will invariably fall. According to the former reading, uposathas fall on the eighth day of every half-month, on the fourteenth day (but not the fifteenth) when it's a 14-day half-month, and on the fifteenth day (but not the fourteenth) when it's a 15-day half-month.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Sep 28, 2019 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Insights cannot be discuss

Content:

Indeed. A peculiarity of this rule, along with the fourth pārājika, is that it doesn't prohibit the very behaviour that led to its promulgation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 29, 2019 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Translation questions about satipatthana & anapanasati

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 29, 2019 1:01 PM

Title: Re: Jhanas, Misconceptions that have arisen regarding the Four Rupa Jhanas.

Content:

Because the type of virtuoso described in the Sāmaññaphalasutta is one who has arrived at cessation in the sense of dukkhanirodha, not cessation in the sense of saññāvedayita-nirodha-samāpatti. It is only for one aspiring to the latter that the āruppas are a prerequisite.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 29, 2019 7:13 PM

Title: Re: Translation questions about satipatthana & anapanasati

Content:

On second thoughts, I think it was a mistake to class ānāpāne above as locative. Since the gerund ārabha comes from the verb ārabhati which governs the accusative case, ānāpāne will almost certainly be accusative plural. This won't, however, necessitate any

change to the above translation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Sep 29, 2019 7:49 PM

Title: Re: Translation questions about satipatthana & anapanasati

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Sep 30, 2019 5:35 PM

Title: Re: Jhanas, Misconceptions that have arisen regarding the Four Rupa Jhanas.

Content:

I wouldn't rule out the possibility, but in the surviving pre-Buddhist Upanishads I don't think there's anything whose name or description bears any resemblance to saññāvedayita-nirodha-samāpatti.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2019 10:33 AM

Title: Re: Translation questions about satipatthana & anapanasati

Content:

I'm consistently keen on Pali grammar. If you yourself were keen on it, or were just willing to spend a few hours on it, you might have learned by now that...

In Pali, as in English, whatever word may serve as an adjective may serve also as a noun.

In Pali, in contrast with English, one cannot always know with certainty when a word is serving as an adjective or as a noun. Whereas in English this can be seen from the use of a definite article ("the good, the true and the beautiful," "how are the mighty fallen") or an indefinite article ("a philological incompetent like ToVincent"), in Pali there are no devices for indicating this.

Consequently the distinction between nouns and adjectives in Pali is nowhere near as obvious or as cut and dried as it is in English. Much of the time one simply has no idea if a word is functioning as one or the other. Suppose, for example, we are tasked with translating the salutation:

namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa

The words bhagavā, arahanta and sammāsambuddha may each be either an adjective or a noun:

bhagavā: blessed / blessed one
arahanta: worthy / worthy one
sammāsambuddha: perfectly awakened / perfectly awakened one

And the word tassa might be either a demonstrative pronoun ('to him') or a demonstrative adjective ('to that').

And so there are numerous plausible ways of translating the above salutation:

All adjectives:

Homage to him who is blessed, worthy and perfectly awakened!

All nouns:

Homage to him, the Blessed One, Worthy One, Perfectly Awakened One!

Homage to that Blessed One, Worthy One, Perfectly Awakened One!

A combination of the two:

Homage to that Blessed One who is worthy and perfectly awakened!

Homage to that blessed Worthy One who is perfectly awakened!

Homage to that blessed and worthy Perfectly Awakened One!

Homage to him, the blessed Worthy One who is perfectly awakened!

Etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 1, 2019 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Translation questions about satipatthana & anapanasati

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 2, 2019 2:01 PM

Title: Re: A Buddhist school without monks

Content:

If you mean monks in the sense of bhikkhus/bhikṣus, then all the traditional Japanese Buddhist schools are monk-free. That is to say, the lineage of bhikkhu ordination doesn't exist in Japan except in a handful of recently established Chinese and Theravada monasteries. Likewise the Taego Buddhist Order of Korea, being non-celibate, has effectively ceased to be an order of bhikṣus.

But if we're taking "monks" to include any kind of full-time religious clerics, whether celibate or not, whether possessing a Vinaya lineage or not, then there are quite a number of Buddhist organizations and movements that lack any such persons.

Firstly there are organizations which are all-lay in their membership but nevertheless maintain cordial relations with the bhikkhusaṅgha and occasionally invite monks to teach. For example, the Samatha Trust in Britain and Spirit Rock and the Insight Meditation Society in the USA.

Secondly there are all-lay organizations that are simply uninterested in the bhikkhusaṅgha (or any other kind of Buddhist clerics). This would probably apply to most North American vipassanā communities, Goenkaites, lay Nichirenist groups in Japan (with the exception of Soka Gakkai), and many of the numerous "tea and biscuits" Buddhist societies that meet in members' homes.

Thirdly there are lay organizations that maintained (or in the case of the Triratna Buddhist Order / FWBO used to maintain) a critical or even hostile stance towards Buddhist clericalism. Sometimes the hostility is selective (e.g. Soka Gakkai's towards the priests of the Nichiren Shoshu) and sometimes it's directed against all comers (e.g., the FWBO from the 70's to the mid-90's).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 2, 2019 10:51 PM
Title: Re: Anantarika kamma in the suttas
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 5, 2019 7:23 AM
Title: Re: Discouraged Feet Pointing Direction
Content:

It doesn't mean that. It means having the soles of your feet, or of either foot, directed towards the image. For example, if you sit down with your legs stretched out in front of you.

In Thailand lifting up a leg and showing someone the sole of your foot is a gesture of extreme contempt.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 5, 2019 5:47 PM
Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali
Content:
Not an adverb or indeclinable, but the instrumental singular of the
[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demonstrative so](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demonstrative_so).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 6, 2019 3:28 AM
Title: Re: Ethical conduct loved by the nobles ones
Content:
See this past thread:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=32807>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 6, 2019 9:44 AM
Title: Re: Mystic beings
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 6, 2019 2:40 PM
Title: Re: Mystic beings
Content:
Which relieves me of the burden of responding to your uninformed comments about it. Ananda Coomaraswamy, to take one example, wasn't a swami but (inter alia) a Sri Lankan expert on yakṣas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Oct 6, 2019 6:24 PM
Title: Re: Is there something wrong with the way monastic community organised these days?
Content:
Of course a monastery can say NO. It's just that they usually don't, either because the monks are too fond of their creature comforts or else fearful of offending some important lay supporter.

At Wat Pa Ban Tard we used candles for light, got water for bathing from a well and water for drinking from rainwater tanks. Ajahn Maha Bua would constantly get wealthy lay supporters from Bangkok begging to be allowed to make merit by sponsoring the installation of electricity and running water. He always said no.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 6, 2019 9:51 PM

Title: Re: Byapada & dosa

Content:

In the Abhidhamma the mental factor of aversion (dosa cetasika) has many different modes. Vyāpāda and vihiṃsā are two of them.

Vyāpāda may have either a saṅkhāra (e.g., a painful bodily feeling) or a living being as its ārammaṇa. It aims at bringing that ārammaṇa to non-existence by way of its destruction or death.

Vihiṃsā takes only living beings as its ārammaṇa and aims at their hurt or injury, bodily or mental.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 8, 2019 3:17 PM

Title: Re: Do it exist creaturs that never will become liberated?

Content:

In later times, however, some Mahayanists took to speculating and debating about the matter. A minority of them held that certain beings were so bad as to be eternally debarred from the possibility of awakening. The majority view denied this and asserted the indestructibility of Buddha nature.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 8, 2019 3:52 PM

Title: Re: what is meaning of this word "opening"

Content:

Āyatana here is glossed in the commentary as kāraṇa, 'cause', and in the sub-commentaries as upanissaya, 'decisive support condition'. For a description of the latter see the Compendium of Conditionality, chapter VIII of the Abhidhammatthasangaha.

[https://what-buddha-](https://what-buddha-said.net/library/pdfs/Comprehensive_Manual_of_%20Abhidhamma.pdf)

[said.net/library/pdfs/Comprehensive_Manual_of_%20Abhidhamma.pdf](https://what-buddha-said.net/library/pdfs/Comprehensive_Manual_of_%20Abhidhamma.pdf)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 9, 2019 10:58 AM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

[./download/file.php?id=5269](#)

(413.79 KiB) Downloaded 10 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 9, 2019 12:40 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 9, 2019 4:56 PM
Title: Re: Amazing Sutta audio
Content:
They are lots of ways to download videos from youtube. I use MacX YouTube Downloader from <https://www.macxdvd.com>

Some other ways...

<https://www.wikihow.com/Download-YouTube-Videos>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 9, 2019 6:12 PM
Title: Re: Just a few questions on pronunciation, spelling and grammar
Content:
अरहन्त

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Oct 9, 2019 8:45 PM
Title: Re: Visuddhimagga: pīti included in the formations aggregate
Content:
Pīti isn't intrinsically wholesome but is reckoned as wholesome when it arises in a wholesome consciousness or as unwholesome when it arises in an unwholesome (i.e., a greed-rooted) consciousness. And so the Abhidhamma lists pīti not in the class of twenty-five beautiful mental factors (sobhaṇa cetasika) but rather in that of the six miscellaneous mental factors (pakiṇṇaka cetasika), i.e., vitakka, vicāra, adhimokkha, vīriya, pīti and chanda.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 10, 2019 6:47 AM

Title: Re: Jhanas, Misconceptions that have arisen regarding the Four Rupa Jhanas.

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn70>

As for Dharmaśrī, his only jhāna-related innovation is that in contrast with most of his predecessors he has virtually nothing to say on the subject. His Abhidharmasāra mentions them only very briefly in connection with the attainment of non-returnership.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 10, 2019 11:33 PM

Title: Re: Third precept

Content:

Women keeping brahmacārī vows (i.e., bhikkhunīs, sāmaṇerīs, sikkhamānās and eight-precept upāsikās) and (in later texts) consanguineous female relatives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 11, 2019 12:42 PM

Title: Re: Mahayana /Vajrayana attitude with Pali Canon?

Content:

When they get to the fifth aspiration I sometime have trouble keeping a straight face. It rather reminds me of how St Augustine used to pray when he was still a decadent young playboy in Carthage: Domine da mihi castitatem et continentiam, sed noli modo ("O Lord, grant me chastity and continence, but not just yet." Confessions VIII 7)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 11, 2019 3:32 PM

Title: Re: Third precept

Content:

The early texts don't go further than specifying the kind of sexual partners who are off limits. The specifications taught by some Mahayana teachers regarding appropriate and inappropriate methods and orifices, right and wrong places and times, etc., all come from very late texts and aren't found in any Theravadin sources at all. The East Asians usually get them from the Upāsakaśīla Sūtra and the Tibetans from Vaśubandhu's auto-commentary to the Abhidharmakośa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 12, 2019 12:07 PM

Title: Re: Nekkhamma

Content:

though "desire for sense pleasures" would be more accurate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 12, 2019 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

As uppāda is masculine, uppādāya is dative singular: "for the arising...". A more literal rendering than B. Sujāto's would be:

Yopi hetu / yopi paccayo

And that which [is] the cause / and that which [is] the condition

cakkhussa uppādāya / sopi anicco.

for the arising of the eye / that also is impermanent

"The cause and condition for the arising of the eye are also impermanent."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 13, 2019 3:53 PM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

Because it's the subject of the sentence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 15, 2019 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Five Antaraya Dharma?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 16, 2019 7:31 PM

Title: Re: Paying taxes and second precept

Content:

80% of the tax revenue is spent on mosques? Are you quite sure? This doesn't sound like a believable figure even for the six remaining Islamic theocracies, let alone semi-secularized nations like Malaysia and Indonesia.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 17, 2019 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Find a Sutta

Content:

The Kālāma Sutta is the one that comes immediately to mind.

Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation...

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an3.65>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 17, 2019 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Paying taxes and second precept

Content:

<https://sasanarakkha.org/2007/01/07/dialogue-on-copyright-infringement-and-vinaya/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 17, 2019 3:57 PM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

No. "Ye manussā cutā" means "who have passed away as humans"; all nominative plural.

If you wanted to say "passed away from humanity (or from the human state)" then you would use manussattā, the ablative singular of manussatta, as in the Itivuttaka's Dānasutta:

annañca datvā bahuno, dakkhiṇeyyesu dakkhiṇaṃ,
ito cutā manussattā, saggaṃ gacchanti dāyakā.

Thanissaro:

Having given food

as an offering

to those worthy of offerings,

many donors,

when they pass away from here,

the human state,

go to heaven.

Ireland:

Having given much food as offerings

To those most worthy of offerings,

The donors go to heaven

On departing the human state.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 17, 2019 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Paying taxes and second precept

Content:

Yes. The episode is placed in the Vinaya's second pārajika section. All the acts judged to be defeating offences in this section are acts of stealing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 17, 2019 9:09 PM

Title: Re: Paying taxes and second precept

Content:

No. Incomplete commissions of defeating offences are ruled to be either grave offences (thullaccaya) or misdemeanours (dukkaṭa), depending on how close the bhikkhu came to succeeding. With either of these classes of offence the remedy is simple confession.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 18, 2019 5:50 PM

Title: Re: Brahmachariya

Content:

The story is common knowledge among monks in the Ajahn Chah tradition, but I should be surprised if it's found anywhere in print. It's just not the kind of biographical detail that Thais would normally put into books.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 12:12 AM

Title: Re: What is the difference between Sakkhayaditthi and Atthanuditthi?

Content:

It seems to be a typo on Bhikkhu Bodhi's part, for the BJT, Sixth Council and Royal Siamese editions all read the same and with no variant readings reported.

In the Pali, SN. 35.165 (Micchādiṭṭhipahānasutta) has aniccato; SN 35.166 (Sakkāyadiṭṭhipahānasutta) has dukkhato; and SN 35.167 (Attānudiṭṭhipahānasutta) has anattato. But Bhikkhu Bodhi translates as if all three read aniccato.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 12:58 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

With feminine nouns in i, the -iyā inflection could be either dative or genitive, but in the present case there's no doubt that it's the former. This can be seen from passages where it's a masculine or neuter noun that's being praised. For example: asubhāya vaṇṇaṃ bhāsati. Asubha is either masculine or neuter, and so here the -āya ending is unambiguously dative.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

The ending -to can indicate either (1) an ablative of separation, as in: dukkhato mutto, "freed from suffering," or, (2) an instrumental adverb in the sense of "by way of its being..." or "with regard to its being..."

Cakkhuṃ aniccato passati, "He sees the eye with regard to its being impermanent." But since this sounds a bit unwieldy, most translators will render it in more natural English: "He sees the eye as impermanent."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 2:03 PM

Title: Re: In which level the grasping (upadana) is eliminated?

Content:

The higher fetters of attachment to rūpa and arūpa existence are still present in the non-returner and both are included in kāmupādāna. Therefore kāmupādāna is fully abandoned only at arahantship.

(Btw, note that the kāma in kāmupādāna is kilesa-kāma, not vatthu-kāma. So it doesn't mean "sensual pleasures" and nor is it limited to desire for sense-sphere objects).

The other three upādānas (diṭṭhupādāna, sīlabbatupādāna and attavādupādāna), being attachment to three different kinds of wrong view, are all abandoned at stream-entry.

Diṭṭhupādāna = clinging to any kinds of wrong view except sīlabbatupādāna and attavādupādāna.

Sīlabbatupādāna = clinging to the view that purification is effected by rules or vows, or by both rules and vows.

Attavādupādāna = 20 kinds of sakkāyadiṭṭhi

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Jhanas and rebirth as a god

Content:

I take it that you're referring to the gods in the Brahmā world, since no jhāna at all is needed for rebirth as a deva in the six heavens of the sense-sphere.

For the possibility of rebirth in the Brahma world you need to attain jhāna.

For such a rebirth to become probable, you need to "develop and make much" of the jhāna you've attained. That is, entering and abiding in jhāna needs to be undertaken daily.

For developing supernormal powers you need mastery of jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 19, 2019 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

When you use the suffix -to, you add it to the pre-inflected form of the noun or adjective (i.e. the form in which they appear in most dictionaries). Dukkha + to, "from suffering".

Dukkhatā means "state of suffering" and is not relevant here. If one added -to to this (though in practice it's never done), then the word would be dukkhatāto.

Time for evening pūjā now. I'll return to your other questions later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 25, 2019 3:14 AM

Title: Re: Approaching the meaning of Sati, within Sammāsati and Paṭiccasamuppāda

Content:

The phrase is an example of a locative absolute construction. For details see Warder's Introduction to Pali pp. 103-4.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 25, 2019 5:37 AM

Title: Re: Looking for the best word by word translation of the patimokkha

Content:

If you just want to read the Pātimokkha, then Ajahn Thanissaro's translation is very good.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/vin/sv/bhikkhu-pati.html>

If you want to study it, then get Bhante Ñāṇatusita's word-for-word translation and grammatical analysis.

https://drive.google.com/open?id=15pDKbu4mliHV-v5ijaqEce253fvx_Yv7

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 25, 2019 4:54 PM

Title: Re: Arahant or Rahat?

Content:

Linguist David Crystal on how we can know how Shakespeare's language was originally pronounced.

.

With dead languages matters are a little trickier and the results a great deal less certain, but it's still possible to arrive at a ballpark approximation.

An old Reddit thread on the subject:

https://www.reddit.com/r/askscience/comments/1i9m30/how_do_we_know_what_ancient_languages_sounded_like/

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2019 6:06 PM

Title: Re: Arahant or Rahat?

Content:

Assuming that the phonetic descriptions given in the ancient Pali grammars are correct, then the modern way of pronunciation that comes closest to this is that of Indian and Bangladeshi bhikkhus. Typically they'll get all the sounds correct except the palatals ca and ja.

After the Indians the next best are the Sinhalese. Their main mistake is either to fail to aspirate the aspirated consonants (e.g., dha as da, ṭha as ṭa) or to hypercorrect by pronouncing non-aspirates as aspirates, e.g., mettā as metthā.

As for modern SE Asian ways of pronunciation, these are all very poor, with at least half of the consonants mispronounced. The pronunciation of the Thais and Cambodians is about equally bad; that of the Laotians is a bit worse and that of the Burmese the worst

of all.

The typical pronunciation of an English-speaking Western bhikkhu will contain about the same number of mistakes as that of the Thais. Our main ones are not bothering to distinguish retroflex and dental consonants, but realizing both types as alveolars, aspirating ka, ta and pa, incorrect syllabification when a vagga consonant is followed by an avagga, turning doubled consonants into single ones (e.g., dhammaṇ as /damaṇ/), and turning the vowel in unstressed syllables into a schwa (e.g., a British Buddhist will probably pronounce buddha as /'budə/, while an American will do so as /'būdə/).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2019 6:56 PM

Title: Re: What do Deva and Brhame do?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 26, 2019 11:11 PM

Title: Re: What do Deva and Brhame do?

Content:

Siva in Pali sources is definitely a sense-sphere deva. I'm not sure about Veṇhu. I believe he's only mentioned in the Mahāsamaya Sutta and there his name appears immediately after that of a number of Brahmā devas but immediately before some sense-sphere devas from the Yama heaven, so it's not very clear what he himself is supposed to be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 27, 2019 8:13 AM

Title: Re: What do Deva and Brhame do?

Content:

I don't know if they can or not, but I've never come across a text whose narrative reports them doing so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2019 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Arahant or Rahat?

Content:

Yes. Just like modern phoneticians, the commentators and grammarians describe the place and the instrument of articulation of each consonant and vowel, whether the

consonant is voiced or unvoiced, aspirated or unaspirated; whether the vowel is long or short, monophthongal or diphthongal; whether the syllable is light or heavy, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2019 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Font

Content:

It's one of the obsolete pre-Unicode fonts, but I don't know which one.

It isn't Normyn or Mytimes, my old favourites, so it will probably be either LeedsBit PaliTranslit, Indic Times, VriRomanPali, Skt Times, CSX, or Titus Indo-Aryan. Or some other that I haven't heard of.

If you know the title of the book from which the chapter is taken you could see if it's available as a PDF. If you don't (or if it isn't) then you could either download all the Indic fonts from Andy's Pali page and see if any of them work:

<http://www.tipitaka.net/pali/andy/palfon.htm>

or you could open the page in your word processor and make the following changes:

î - Ā
Œ - ā
´ - ī
è - ū
˘ - ō
˝ - ṛ
È - Ñ
º - ṇ
— - ñ
Ê - ṭ
¶ - ḍ
ö - ṇ
ê - Ś
ſ - ś
· - ṣ
ú - ḥ
μ - ṁ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2019 10:55 AM

Title: Meditation retreats - sundry issues (split from "Monastics and suicide")

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 28, 2019 12:21 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

In the Buddha's day if a new monk knew some Dhamma, then he was free to teach it. See, for example, the newly-ordained Assaji teaching Sāriputta and leading him to stream-entry; and then, immediately after, Sāriputta teaching Moggallāna and leading him to stream-entry.

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd1/en/horner-brahmali#Kd.1.23.1>

But as for modern "guided meditation retreats", these didn't have any counterpart in the Buddha's day. Unsurprisingly then, there are no ancient stipulations as to who may or may not lead one. There are merely the conventions that came to be framed in much later times by different sub-traditions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 7:38 AM

Title: Re: Meditation retreats - sundry issues

Content:

This is a bit ambiguous. Just to clarify, do you mean...

"The rule within the Goenka tradition is that members may not teach but may share and discuss the Dhamma as they wish."

Or:

"The rule is that members may not teach but may share and discuss the Dhamma with their kalyānamittas in the Goenka traditon [but not with others]"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 9:09 AM

Title: Re: Unorthodox enlightenment

Content:

But the "orthodox notion" here is that the arahant's actions are no longer productive of kammic merit or demerit. To characterize him as "essentially amoral" seems a very unfortunate choice of words. To be amoral is to lack any sense of moral and immoral, but this can't be said of an arahant, for two of an arahant's ten asekha powers are hiri-bala and ottappa-bala.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Meditation retreats - sundry issues

Content:

Okay. So it seems that our difference is a merely semantic one. When I speak of "teaching the Dhamma" I'm referring to any act of communicating the Dhamma.

For example, when two kalyānamittas discuss the Dhamma together I would say that they are teaching each other.

Or if someone quotes a sutta passage to me and asks me to explain its meaning, then he's teaching me by way of "reminding of what one has heard before" and I'm teaching him by way of "clarifying the meaning" (assuming that I manage to explain it correctly).

For you, on the other hand, it seems that "teaching Dhamma" has the very narrow (and rather newfangled) sense of "instructing people in meditation".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Vissudhimagga - path of purification review

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 6:12 PM

Title: Re: Can monks go traveling ?

Content:

If the travelling is to inappropriate places, such as taverns, the homes of single women, etc., or if the sights the monk wants to see involve music, dancing and other such entertainments, then the Vinaya would prohibit this.

As for the kinds of sight-seeing and travelling that the Vinaya doesn't prohibit, some of them may still be inappropriate for reasons of Dhamma. If a monk were to regulate his life very strictly according to the Vanapatthasutta, then he wouldn't undertake travelling without good reason. And the Vanapatthasutta grants only one good reason for a non-arahan bhikkhu to move from one location to another, namely, his present location is one in which "unestablished mindfulness doesn't become established, an unconcentrated mind doesn't become concentrated, undestroyed āsavas don't come to destruction and he doesn't attain the unattained supreme security from bondage."

<http://www.yellowrobe.com/home/120-majjhima-nikaya/349-mn-17-vanapattha-sutta->

jungle-thickets.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Arahant or Rahat?

Content:

I wrote of Kaccāyana's grammar, not Aggavaṃsa's Saddanīti.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 29, 2019 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Can monks go traveling ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 2:17 AM

Title: Re: How Anathapindika got so rich

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 3:17 AM

Title: Re: Meditation retreats - sundry issues

Content:

I call your conception of "teaching Dhamma" narrow because in effect it reduces the whole of the Dhamma to but one of its parts: bhāvanā.

I call it newfangled because the reduction of Dhamma to bhāvanā (or the claimed sufficiency of bhāvanā alone) are notions that seem to be unattested before the 20th century rise of lay mass meditation movements. Certainly they're unattested in the suttas, where the Buddha's 'gradual training' is one in which considerable groundwork needs to be laid down before bhāvanā even becomes a possibility. See, for example, the Majjhima Nikāya's Cūḷahatthipadopama, Bahuvedanīya, Sekha, Mahā-assapura and Gaṇakamoggallāna Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 6:02 AM

Title: Re: New kind of a temple!!

Content:

The khaṇḍas (vertical panels) on a monk's upper and outer robes may number 5, 7, 9 or 108. The monk seems to be wearing a 108-khaṇḍa robe. In bygone days this was the sort of robe that monks would sew for themselves if they only had small scraps of cloth to use. In modern times we're never short of large pieces of cloth and so robes of this sort are seldom seen, but there's nothing un-Theravadin about them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Unorthodox enlightenment

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 2:11 PM

Title: Re: Arahant or Rahat?

Content:

... of no interest at all.

See E.G. Kahr's Exploring the Saddanīti.

http://www.palitext.com/JPTS_scans/JPTS_1992_XVII.pdf

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 30, 2019 7:54 PM

Title: Re: New kind of a temple!!

Content:

Because the Vinaya's specifications don't offer that option.

I mean the robes are supposed to be a bhikkhu's uniform and though we're granted some degree of latitude regarding design, types of material and permitted colours, if a bhikkhu is to be recognized as a bhikkhu then the latitude has to have some limits. Otherwise we could just sew our robes according to any design that took our fancy and the resulting lack of uniformity would mean that the uniform would become a non-uniform.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 3, 2019 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Unorthodox enlightenment

Content:

I'm pretty sure that if a monk went about declaring, say, that it's okay for monks to have sex, then he'd get rebuked for it. But I've never heard of a monk doing this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2019 10:39 AM

Title: Re: Boran kammatthana

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 4, 2019 11:46 AM

Title: Re: Difference between the Tipitaka and the Pāli Canon

Content:

The Pali Canon and the Tipiṭaka are the same thing. They don't include the commentaries.

The Three Baskets (tipiṭaka, tīṇi piṭakāṇi)

= "Root Canon" (mūlapāḷi)

= "Ninefold Dispensation of the Master" (navaṅga satthusāsana)

= "Speech of the Buddha" (buddhavacana)

* * * * *

The Three Baskets with their commentaries (atthakathā), sub-commentaries (ṭīkā), clarifiers of knotty terms (gaṇṭhipadatthavaṇṇanā), clarifiers of grammar and syntax (yojanā), concordances (nissaya), disciplinary adjudications (vinaya-vinicchaya) etc., etc.

= "Books" (poṭṭhakāṇi)

= "Texts" (gambhīrā)

= "Scriptural Doctrine" (pariyattidhamma)

* * * * *

In papers by modern academic scholars you might occasionally see a commentarial work like the Visuddhimagga being referred to as "canonical". In calling it so they are referring to its de facto status in Theravadin countries rather than its de jure status in the ancient tradition.

You might also see a canonical work like the Niddesa or the Paṭisambhidāmagga being

referred to as a "commentary". In calling it so they are not claiming that it's an atthakathā but are merely referring to the character of its literary genre.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 4, 2019 12:30 PM
Title: Re: Ace Buddha
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 4, 2019 2:23 PM
Title: Re: Boran kammattana
Content:
This is covered in Choompolpaisal's earlier article:

The Ancient Theravāda Meditation System, Borān Kammaṭṭhāna: Ānāpānasati or 'Mindfulness of The Breath' in Kammattana Majjima Baeb Lamdub

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1HX7aNPK7_9jqYpU3JB_QNt84HegS43SX

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 5, 2019 11:04 AM
Title: Re: puñña papa
Content:
When the words are used as terms for judging the moral character of kammās, the difference is only in the phrasing. Whatever is puñña is kusala, and vice versa. Whatever is pāpa is akusala, and vice versa.

It's only in other contexts, outside of good and bad thoughts, words and deeds, that the words take on distinctive meanings. For example, one could use kusala to describe "a skilful acrobat", but not puñña. Or one could describe a snake's bite as pāpa, but not as akusala.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 5, 2019 8:31 PM
Title: Re: Is British Library keeping the secrets of original Tipitaka?
Content:
The truth has long been available to anyone who cares to consult Rev. Somadasa's 7-volume catalogue of the museum's Sri Lankan collection. Unsurprisingly there's no

mention of "the original Tipiṭaka", for the said collection will have become worm or termite food about two millennia ago.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2019 9:44 PM

Title: Re: What are the different Pali manuscripts?

Content:

Nirayaṃ upapannaṃ is correct. Uppannaṃ in this context is a typo.

Upapanna is the past participle of upapajjati.

Uppanna is the past participle of uppajjati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 5, 2019 9:58 PM

Title: Re: Satva

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2019 1:45 AM

Title: Re: DW memorial thread

Content:

Sally Gross, Founder and Director of Intersex South Africa

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2019 12:04 PM

Title: Re: Is British Library keeping the secrets of original Tipitaka?

Content:

Not if the copy was inscribed on ola leaves in a tropical climate in a pre-electrical age.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Palm-leaf_manuscript

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2019 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma VS Vinaya - ist MILK an allowable drink or not?

Content:

But the context is not one that's concerned with specifying at what time of day the various types of beverage are allowable. It says nothing at all about the Buddha allowing or not allowing anything. In short, it has nothing to do with Vinaya.

Your friend's mistake, I think, is that when the Pali pāna is being used as a loanword in monastic Thai it normally bears the narrow sense: "beverage that monks can drink after midday"; and so I guess he is wrongly assuming that this is what it means in Pali. In fact it simply means 'beverage'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2019 10:57 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma VS Vinaya - ist MILK an allowable drink or not?

Content:

There are some extracts from the Mahāniddeśa in Bhikkhu Bodhi's Suttanipāṭa translation, but not of this particular passage. He has generally only selected passages that are of some doctrinal interest. An illustration of the meaning of "drink" by giving sixteen examples of things you can drink is not the sort of passage that would be likely to interest him.

Here's my rather quick translation of the second list of eight:

1. kosambapānaṃ - soapberry juice
2. kolapānaṃ - jackal jujube juice
3. badarapānaṃ - jujube juice
4. ghatapānaṃ - perhaps liquid ghee, though the Thai translation has Cynometra cauliflora juice
5. telapānaṃ - water mixed with oil
6. payopānaṃ - milk
7. yāgupānaṃ - the water that rice has been cooked in
8. rasapānaṃ - flavoured water

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 6, 2019 11:46 PM

Title: Re: Why it is called ugly ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

I would use "hard" or "difficult" for kiccho.

Ven. Ānandajoti's "rare" is more usually used when the word is dullabho, though even here the more literal rendering would be "difficult to obtain".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Ignorance and Delusion -- Sutta?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 7:41 AM

Title: Re: Why it is called ugly ?

Content:

You're probably thinking of the Udayin-Sāriputta exchange in AN 9:34.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 8:02 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

manussapaṭilābho = manussattapaṭilābho = manussattassa paṭilābho

"The gaining of the human state," with manussatta (the normal form in Pali prose) being shortened to manussa to fit the Dhammapada metre.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 9:58 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

The problem with that translation has more to do with idiom, usage and semantics than grammar. To express that meaning one would use lābha, not paṭilābha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 7, 2019 11:19 AM

Title: Re: Help requested for basic lessons in how to translate Pali

Content:

Paṭilābha is most often the act of obtaining; it may also be the thing obtained, but usually isn't.

Lābha is most often the thing obtained; it may also be the act of obtaining, but usually isn't.

In short, the two words can be synonymous, but in most contexts are not.

If one is talking about those things that are obtained with difficulty by humans then lābha would be the natural choice. If one is talking about it being difficult for humans to obtain things, then it would be paṭilābha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 8, 2019 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma VS Vinaya - ist MILK an allowable drink or not?

Content:

Sādhū.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 6:43 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the 8 Jhana?

Content:

(i) one who abides in lovingkindness can easily apply his mind to a beautiful colour kasiṇa and quickly attain the beautiful liberation (i.e., jhāna based on a colour kasiṇa);

(ii) one who abides in compassion recognizes the danger in form and thus develops the base of the infinity of space, which is the escape from form;

(iii) one who abides in altruistic joy apprehends the joyful consciousness of beings and thus easily enters the base of the infinity of consciousness;

(iv) one who abides in equanimity is skilled in diverting his mind from pleasure and pain, and thus can easily divert it to the absence of any concrete entity in the base of nothingness.

The above is Bhikkhu Bodhi's précis. For the full account see Path of Purification IX 120-123.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 11:32 AM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

As this is tangential to what the OP is enquiring about it would be better to raise your question in the Connections to Other Paths forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 11:38 AM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 11:48 AM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

His MN reference is to the argument in the Cūḷasaccaka Sutta

<http://www.suttas.com/mn-35-culasaccaka-sutta-the-shorter-discourse-to-saccaka.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 12:16 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddha did not say that the world is round?

Content:

It's from the 30th sūtra in the Chinese Dīrgha Āgama. Some parts of it have parallels in the Pali Tipiṭaka:

Kokālika Sutta AN 10.89; SN 6.10; Snp 3.10

Turūbrahma Sutta SN 6.9

Devadūta Sutta AN 3.36; MN 130

But there's no Pali parallel to the sūtra's long section on the earth's geography.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 12:31 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddha did not say that the world is round?

Content:

If you read the sūtra in the BDK link (it's the very last one, starting on page 151) you'll see it's quite a composite work, combining some material that's typical of the Nikāyas as a whole with other material of a kind that in the Theravada texts would be more typical of the commentaries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 9, 2019 5:47 PM

Title: Re: Looking for suttas

Content:

Evaṃ nissayasampanno, bhikkhu āraddhavīriyo,
Bhāvayaṃ kusalaṃ dhammaṃ, yogakkhemassa pattiyaṃ,
Pāpuṇe anupubbena, sabbasaṃyojanakkhayanti.

“So any bhikkhu, strong in will, who to the Refuge flies,
Who cherishes all good, and goes the way Nirvana lies,
By slow degrees will bring about destruction of all ties.”

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja156>

“Mendicants, when these four times are rightly developed and progressed, they gradually lead to the ending of defilements. What four? A time for listening to the teaching, a time for discussing the teaching, a time for serenity, and a time for discernment.

It's like when it rains heavily on a mountain top, and the water flows downhill to fill the hollows, crevices, and creeks. As they become full, they fill up the pools. The pools fill up the lakes, the lakes fill up the streams, and the streams fill up the rivers. And as the rivers become full, they fill up the ocean.

In the same way, when these four times are rightly developed and progressed, they gradually lead to the ending of defilements.”

<https://suttacentral.net/an4.147/en/sujato>

Anupubbena medhāvī,
thokaṃ thokaṃ khaṇe khaṇe.
Kammāro rajatasseva,
niddhame malamattano.

The sage gradually, little by little, moment by moment,
should remove the stain from himself, as a smith removes the stain from silver.
Dhp. 239

Ye ca sante upāsanti, sappaññe dhīrasammate,
Saddhā ca nesaṃ sugate, mūlajātā patiṭṭhitā.

Devalokañca te yanti, kule vā idha jāyare,
Anupubbena nibbānaṃ, adhigacchanti paṇḍitā ti.

But those who do attend the peaceful ones
—wise, esteemed as sages—
and whose faith in the Holy One
has roots planted deep,
they go to the realm of the gods,
or are born here in a good family.
Gradually those astute ones
reach extinguishment.”

<https://suttacentral.net/an3.57/en/sujato>

So, Ānanda, the purpose and benefit of skillful ethics is not having regrets. Joy is the purpose and benefit of not having regrets. Rapture is the purpose and benefit of joy. Tranquility is the purpose and benefit of rapture. Bliss is the purpose and benefit of tranquility. Immersion is the purpose and benefit of bliss. Truly knowing and seeing is the purpose and benefit of immersion. Disillusionment and dispassion is the purpose and benefit of truly knowing and seeing. Knowledge and vision of freedom is the purpose and benefit of disillusionment and dispassion. So, Ānanda, skillful ethics progressively lead up to the highest.”

<https://suttacentral.net/an10.1/en/sujato>

When a bhikkhu has good friends,
And is reverential and respectful,
Doing what his friends advise,
Clearly comprehending and mindful,
He may progressively attain
The destruction of all fetters.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/iti17>

Sīlakkhandhe patitṭhāya,
satiṃ paññañca bhāvayaṃ.
Pāpuṇiṃ anupubbena,
sabbasaṃyojanakkhayaṃ ti.

Established in all the practices of virtue,
Developing mindfulness and understanding,
Gradually I attained
The end of all fetters.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/thag16.7>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 10, 2019 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a modern spoken language that shares many similarities with Pali vocabulary

Content:

I think Bengali and Chakma would meet the greatest number of your criteria. Bengali would probably be the better of the two as Chakma learning resources are very limited and hard to find.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bengali_language

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chakma_language

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 10, 2019 8:17 PM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

The Suttas mention kasiṇas, but in a manner so terse and opaque that it's hard to understand what they're all about. The commentaries, especially the Visuddhimagga, are the source of the detailed description of how to use kasiṇas to develop jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 11, 2019 10:06 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

DN 33 & 34

MN 77

AN 1, the Aparā-accharāsaṅghātavagga

AN 10:25; 10:26; 10:29.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 11, 2019 11:57 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

Just one further remark: though it's in the commentaries that we first find the detailed method for developing jhāna using kasiṇas, the earliest explicit connection between kasiṇa and jhāna is found in the Abhidhamma's Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Vibhaṅga.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ds2.1.2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 11, 2019 1:49 PM

Title: Re: Looking for pali source

Content:

Avijjāvāraṇaṇā

Avijjāvāre _dukkhe aññāṇaṇ _ti dukkhasacce aññāṇaṇ, mohassetam̐ adhivacanaṇ. Esa nayo _samudaye aññāṇaṇ _ti-ādīsu. Tattha catūhi kāraṇehi dukkhe aññāṇaṇ veditabbaṇ antogadhato vatthuto ārammaṇato paṭicchādanato ca. Tathā hi tam̐ dukkhasaccapariyāpannattā dukkhe antogadham̐, dukkhasaccañcassa nissayapaccayabhāvena vatthu, ārammaṇapaccayabhāvena ārammaṇaṇ, dukkhasaccañca etaṇ paṭicchādeti, tassa yāthāvalakkaṇappaṭivedhanivāraṇena, ñāṇappavattiyā cettha appadānena.

Samudaye aññāṇaṇ tīhi kāraṇehi veditabbaṇ vatthuto ārammaṇato paṭicchādanato ca. Nirodhe paṭipadāyañca aññāṇaṇ ekeneva kāraṇena veditabbaṇ paṭicchādanato. Nirodhapaṭipadāya hi paṭicchādakameva aññāṇaṇ tesam̐ yāthāvalakkaṇappaṭivedhanivāraṇena, tesu ca ñāṇappavattiyā appadānena. Na pana tattha antogadham̐, tasmim̐ saccadvaye apariyāpannattā. Na tassa tam̐ saccadvayaṇ vatthu, asahajātattā. Nārammaṇaṇ, tadārabha appavattanato. Pacchimañhi saccadvayaṇ gambhīrattā duddasaṇ, na cettha andhabhūtaṇ aññāṇaṇ pavattati. Purimaṇ pana vañcaniyaṭṭhena sabhāvalakkaṇassa duddasattā gambhīraṇ, tattha vipallāsaggāhavasena pavattati.

<https://tipitaka.org/romn/cscd/s0201a.att1.xml>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 12, 2019 3:34 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a modern spoken language that shares many similarities with Pali vocabulary

Content:

Bengali has all eleven Pali aspirates, along with the Sanskrit ṛh:

.

[./download/file.php?id=5330&mode=view](#)

But Sinhala has only one:

.

[./download/file.php?id=5331&mode=view](#)

As for Pali words in their respective lexicons, the difference isn't in the number of them but in the fact that in Sinhala they occur mostly as loanwords, but in Bengali mostly as ancient Prakritic cognates.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 12, 2019 4:05 PM

Title: Re: Poll: the most difficult precept for you?

Content:

Sakkāra means being shown reverence or held in esteem by others.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 13, 2019 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Why does a streamenterer only have 6 lives left to enlightenment?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 13, 2019 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a modern spoken language that shares many similarities with Pali vocabulary

Content:

No.

When linguists call a language "dead" they don't mean that it's no longer used for anything. They mean that it no longer has any native speakers. If it no longer has any speakers at all, then they call it "extinct". By these criteria Pali and Latin are dead languages; Trojan and Frankish are extinct languages.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Why does a streamenterer only have 6 lives left to enlightenment?

Content:

In the commentaries it is sometimes glossed as rebirths in two or three further states of

existence and sometimes more narrowly as two or three rebirths in high-caste human families.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 10:03 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the 8 Jhana?

Content:

It's the the fourth jhāna consciousness but with a formless ārammaṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 10:39 AM

Title: Re: An mistake needs to be corrected!

Content:

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/24-10.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 11:01 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

You can only experience it without joy. The possible mental factors are the same as those in the fourth rūpa jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 2:12 PM

Title: Re: Why does a streamenterer only have 6 lives left to enlightenment?

Content:

Both glosses are from the commentaries. The kola in kolaṅkola is a modified form of kula, which in Indian texts in general refers to any families except low-caste ones.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 2:33 PM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

None of the arūpa attainments are accompanied by muditā. These attainments are all just modifications of the fourth jhāna: the same mental factors but a different kind of ārammaṇa. Muditā can only be present up to the third jhāna. It can't be present in the fourth because it always arises with somanassa vedanā. The vedanā in the fourth jhāna

is upekkhā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 7:12 PM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

The development of mettā, karuṇā and muditā can lead to the third jhāna.

The development of upekkhā can lead to the fourth jhāna.

The development of mettā may later make it easier to attain jhāna using a colour kasiṇa.

The development of karuṇā may later make it easier to enter the base of the infinity of space.

The development of muditā may later make it easier to enter the base of the infinity of consciousness.

The development of upekkhā may later make it easier to enter the base of nothingness.

No brahmavihāra development leads directly to infinity of space, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 14, 2019 9:28 PM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

It's intended as a paraphrase of it, or rather of its unabridged Visuddhimagga form.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 15, 2019 6:36 PM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

Some (notably Richard Gombrich) have argued that it can, but I don't find them persuasive.

Firstly, the insufficiency of the brahmavihāras alone seems to have been the position of all Indian Buddhist ācāryas who wrote on the subject.

Secondly, all of the texts that revisionists cite to support their view (e.g., the last verse of the Karaṇīyamettasutta) can just as plausibly, if not more plausibly, be interpreted to support the orthodox position.

Thirdly, the revisionists' position requires them to deny the canonicity of several sutta passages that blatantly contradict their view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 15, 2019 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Things to consider when proceed to undertake celibacy?

Content:

Though not written from a Buddhist perspective, Martin Poulter's <http://www.faqs.org/faqs/alt-sex/celibacy/> might be a good place to start.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 15, 2019 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

Sīhā's arrival at arahatta indicates that at some point she must have been doing something right.

Her near-suicide shows that even someone ripe for the highest attainment might yet be susceptible not only to suicidal mentation but even to the act itself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 15, 2019 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

She had received instruction adequate for her to attain arahatta and her accumulations were sufficient to render her ripe for this attainment. Yet despite this, she was still capable of falling into improper attention and a wish to commit suicide.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 15, 2019 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

Yes, the arahants' verses in the Theragāthā and Therīgāthā are included in the Sutta Piṭaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 16, 2019 1:43 AM

Title: Re: How four Brahma Viihara connected with the Jhana?

Content:

Sure.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 17, 2019 8:56 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Nibbāna isn't a state of samādhi, but it's in a state of samādhi that it's apprehended.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha addresses himself as the Buddha ?

Content:

The reasons adduced by him might well be persuasive to those Buddhists who think methodological naturalism an appropriate approach to the suttas, but there's no reason a Buddhist believer should feel obliged to accept them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

In reflection (paccavekkhaṇa), which doesn't take place in a deep samādhi state, the arahant can apprehend the fact that he's free of attachment, aversion and delusion. But when we speak of him apprehending nibbāna in this sense we're using 'nibbāna' rather loosely to refer to the lived experience of being without defilement. When we're talking about what the mind actually cognizes at the moment of awakening (and on later occasions whenever entering the fruition attainment), then we're talking about something that always involves a jhānic consciousness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

There's no cognizing nibbāna on an occasion when the mind is deluded.

On the occasion of awakening, nibbāna is cognized by a mind that is jhānicly concentrated.

But on most occasions when the mind is jhānicly concentrated the object of cognition will be the meditation subject, not nibbāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 4:25 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Since even the non-returner isn't yet free of the fetter of avijjā, it goes without saying that the sotāpanna is still fettered with it. But I don't see how this is connected with the manner in which nibbāna is attained.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 4:34 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Can you quote the sutta you have in mind?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 6:14 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

I've already said that they haven't done so. They have abandoned wrong view, however, and therefore micchāpaṭipatti avijjā too.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 7:27 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 9:47 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 18, 2019 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

Bhante Sujāto translates samādhī as "immersion", Bhikkhu Bodhi as "concentration".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 19, 2019 12:32 PM

Title: Re: Is there a place on the internet to find commentaries and sub commentaries?

Content:

The Vipassanā Research Institute's Pali romanized edition

<http://www.tipitaka.de/roman/atthakatha/index.html>

<http://www.tipitaka.de/roman/tika/index.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 19, 2019 1:50 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

There are no hindrances while they are in jhāna. When there are not in jhāna they may still experience those hindrances that have not yet been abandoned by cutting off.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 19, 2019 6:43 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

A contradiction? I'd call it a lack of imagination if someone finds it impossible to conceive of a being who, despite being free of sense-desire and ill will, is nonetheless still subject to some degree of mental stiffness and agitation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 3:59 AM

Title: Re: All powers should be eliminated to become an Arahant?

Content:

"Making much of", "carrying on", "establishing", "maintaining", "augmenting", and "properly instigating". But no talk of "eliminating".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 8:18 AM

Title: Re: Is there a place on the internet to find commentaries and sub commentaries?

Content:

The ones that are legally available online are:

- * Buddhist Birth Stories / Jātaka Atthakathā (stories and verses only, not the word commentary)
- * Buddhist Legends / Dhammapada Atthakathā (stories and verses only, not the word commentary)
- * Psalms of the Brethren & Sisters / Theragāthā and Therīgāthā Atthakathā (stories and verses only, not the word commentary)
- * The Expositor / Dhammasaṅgaṇī Atthakathā
- * The Debates Commentary / Kathāvatthu Atthakathā
- * The Path of Purity & The Path of Purification / Visuddhimagga (2 translations)

Translated but still subject to PTS or Wisdom Pubs copyright:

- * Suttanipāta Atthakathā (Bhikkhu Bodhi)
- * Dispeller of Delusion / Vibhaṅga Atthakathā (Ñāṇamoli)
- * Minor Readings and Illustrator / Khuddakapāṭha Atthakathā (Ñāṇamoli)
- * Itivuttaka Atthakathā (Peter Masefield)
- * Udāna Atthakathā (Peter Masefield)
- * Petavatthu and Vimānavatthu Atthakathā (Peter Masefield)
- * Buddhavaṃsa Atthakathā (I.B. Horner)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 3:13 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

Also (at greater length) in the Milindapañha.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mil5.4.5>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 4:07 PM

Title: Re: Is nibbana a state of immersion ?

Content:

The five hindrances have to be absent on the occasion of any kind of exalted attainment, whether jhānic or ariyan. But their temporary absence on the occasion of certain peak experiences is not synonymous with their irreversible abandonment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 5:51 PM

Title: Re: should I marry or be single?

Content:

Just a quibble...

If you mean Cleopatra VII, she was Caesar's squeeze, not his wife. She first married her two younger brothers, Ptolemaeus XIII and XIV, and then the triumvir Marcus Antonius.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Sotapanna has abandoned all remorse forever?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 10:14 PM

Title: Re: How to recover after heartbreak

Content:

I don't think it started with that. Divorce in Britain, for example, started skyrocketing just as soon as it became easy to obtain. And this was at a time when unmarried cohabiting relationships were rather exceptional, widely disapproved and still commonly referred to as "living in sin".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 20, 2019 10:46 PM

Title: Re: Any restrictions on marrying more than 1 wife / husband ?

Content:

Ven. Pandita discusses this in his latest article in the Journal of Buddhist Ethics.

<https://blogs.dickinson.edu/buddhistethics/2019/07/27/sexual-misconduct-in-early-buddhist-ethics/>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 21, 2019 7:35 AM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 21, 2019 8:26 AM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 21, 2019 3:32 PM
Title: Re: Non-parajika reasons for disrobing?
Content:
<https://www.bangkokpost.com/thailand/politics/395505/brown-robed-forest-monks-disdain-change-to-orange-garb>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 22, 2019 8:35 AM
Title: Re: We can't change the past. So isn't the past permanent?
Content:
Like any present knowledge of the past, it requires that: (1) past khandhas have been; (2) past khandhas have been noted/marked by saññā; (3) the mental continuum is unbroken. It doesn't require the continuance of past khandhas into the present.

See the Kathāvatthu's refutation of the Sarvāstivāda.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv1.6>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 22, 2019 4:08 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:
Though I'm not one of those who's said that (or who thinks it), I'll reply anyway...

I think that voluntary euthanasia would be much worse than suicide by one's own hand. Whereas it's a matter of debate whether suicide should be classed as pāṇātipāta (I've argued in the past <https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=23927&start=195#p343438>), there's no debate that if you instruct a doctor to kill you then you're instigating him to commit pāṇātipāta; if you instruct him to kill some sick relative then you both commit pāṇātipāta.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 22, 2019 9:30 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:
It would be wrong livelihood.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 22, 2019 11:05 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:
I don't understand your question. Did you mean "... not a Buddhist"?

If so, the term 'pāṇātipāta' is not used only with regard to the first of the five precepts, but also of the first of the three kinds of bodily misconduct and the first of the ten akusala kammaṣaḍḍhā. A non-Buddhist doctor who performs euthanasia wouldn't be described as breaking the first precept, for he hasn't undertaken them, but he would be said to have committed kāyaduḥkharita and an akusala kammaṣaḍḍhā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 22, 2019 11:29 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:
Of course he would. Why would you think otherwise?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Nov 23, 2019 7:29 AM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:
I don't accept your premise. A doctor performing euthanasia does have the intention to kill, even if he's just following orders.

The best that can be said for him is that an akusala kamma performed at another's prompting is less weighty than an unprompted akusala kamma. But that's pretty small comfort when the kamma is as weighty as killing a human.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 23, 2019 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

Well, I wouldn't put it quite like that.

The Buddha taught that there is mixed "dark and bright kamma with a dark and bright ripening". Some instances of this are quite widely approved and so they get given complimentary or euphemistic names like "compassionate killing", "altruistic stealing", "white lies", etc. While one might question how dhammically appropriate such designations are, it would be going too far to say that they're terms without referents.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 25, 2019 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Samadhi is death !

Content:

But it has nothing to do with the Buddhist use of the term.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahasam%C4%81dhi>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 25, 2019 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Samadhi is death !

Content:

That's not relevant to my point, which is that the use of samādhi to refer to the death of enlightened beings is exclusively Hindu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 25, 2019 11:06 PM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 26, 2019 12:15 AM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

It seems so, unless there were other ailments that were thought too trifling to be worth recording.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 26, 2019 2:56 PM

Title: Re: Situation awareness

Content:

The third sort of rendering is "self-possession" or something like it. This was used a lot in the pioneering days of Pali studies but has been abandoned now. It seems to have been informed by attention to those Sutta passages in which sampajāno comes as one of a string of adjectives giving a seemingly physical description of how a person acting mindfully will appear to an observer.

As for Ven. Sujāto's rendering, I would guess this would be based on an approach like Ñāṇavīra's, but I don't know if he's ever stated this to be the case.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 26, 2019 3:37 PM

Title: Re: Ābhādhātu, subhadhātu

Content:

Another name for the āloka-kasiṇa and the jhāna developed on the basis of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 26, 2019 6:36 PM

Title: Re: Ābhādhātu, subhadhātu

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 27, 2019 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Situation awareness

Content:

If they were jhāna-attainers then they would have had sampajañña of a sort even before they met the Buddha. But it would have been the sampajañña of the samatha-level kind - the kind that sees only the peril in sense-desire.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 27, 2019 10:34 PM

Title: Re: Situation awareness

Content:

The distinctively Buddhist type would be that which discerns the three characteristics at the vipassanā level.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 28, 2019 6:37 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Mun honoured by UNESCO

Content:

Their names have been added to the list of persons whose anniversaries are celebrated in association with UNESCO.

This is an announcement of their nomination in February this year:

<http://www.thailandtoday.in.th/news-update/culture/1958>

Their acceptance:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Thai_anniversaries_celebrated_in_association_with_UNESCO

The criteria for a nation's nominations being accepted:

<https://en.unesco.org/celebrations/anniversaries-criteria>

It doesn't appear to be especially about "world peace" and only the Thai newspapers seem to be spinning it this way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 30, 2019 2:57 PM

Title: Re: Taungpulu Sayadaw

Content:

His student Rina Sircar has published a book, The Psycho-Ethical Aspects of Abhidhamma, but I haven't read it and don't know if it's informed by Taungpulu's teaching.

<https://www.amazon.co.uk/Psycho-Ethical-Aspects-Abhidhamma-Rina-Sircar/dp/0761813233>

At Dhamma Seed there are some talks by the American nun Dhammadinnā who was ordained by the sayādaw. I haven't listened to them myself, so again I don't know how Taungpulu-influenced they might be.

<https://dharmaseed.org/teacher/504/talk/18679/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 30, 2019 3:43 PM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

The materialist is only one kind of ucchedavādin. The Brahmajālasutta describes six others. As ucchedavādins they all agree that there's a self that gets zapped at death, but disagree about its nature before it gets zapped.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 30, 2019 4:22 PM

Title: Re: Eating at inappropriate times is as bad as consuming alcohol?

Content:

I don't think that's so.

Suppose Tissa, Citta and Nāga all undertake the uposatha precepts.

Tissa consumes food in the vikāla because his clock is showing the wrong time and he believes it's still morning.

Citta consumes food in the vikāla knowing that it's the vikāla but being of the view that there's nothing akusala in transgressing a precept one has undertaken.

Nāga does the same as Citta but knows that what he's doing is akusala.

They have all broken the sixth precept, but only Citta's transgression involves wrong view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 1, 2019 5:24 AM

Title: Re: Nibbana and samsara are identical. Change my view.

Content:

But there's no such thing as "the view in general". For different Mahayana teachers and different Mahayana schools the claim that saṃsāra is nirvāṇa has meant all sorts of different things. For some examples see the attached article by George Rupp: The

Relationship between Nirvāna and Samsāra - An Essay on the Evolution of Buddhist Ethics.

.

./download/file.php?id=5361
(460.49 KiB) Downloaded 52 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 1, 2019 9:44 PM
Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?
Content:
Just click on the link that I posted earlier.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 1, 2019 10:18 PM
Title: Re: Who came first?
Content:
The thread's still there but Bibek Sharma's post got hidden after being down-voted too many times. You have to click to make it appear.

<https://www.quora.com/Why-should-anyone-practice-Mahayana-Buddhism-when-Theravada-Buddhism-is-closer-to-the-actual-teachings-of-Gautama-Buddha>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 2:19 PM
Title: Re: Classical, orthodox Theravada teachers who reject flux?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 2:30 PM
Title: Re: Classical, orthodox Theravada teachers who reject flux?
Content:
Removed off-topic posts - those concerned with teachers who neither were, nor ever claimed to be, exponents of "classical Theravada" (i.e. the form of Theravāda which treats the Abhidhamma and commentaries as authoritative on doctrine).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 3:17 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 8:14 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:

This is a popular folk belief in Buddhist countries, not a teaching found in any Buddhist texts.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 8:59 PM
Title: Re: Monastics and suicide
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 2, 2019 11:20 PM
Title: Re: Classical, orthodox Theravada teachers who reject flux?
Content:

That's probably because of the somewhat loose wording in Thanissaro's paraphrase, which might make it appear that the bhavaṅga is a persistent entity when in fact it's conceived by ābhidhammikas as comprising a succession of momentary cittas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 1:23 AM
Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?
Content:

It's only "illogical" if you assume that the precise manner in which a kamma is performed will be the precise manner in which its ripening will be experienced and that the ripening cannot take any other form than that. But that would be a Hare Kṛṣṇa-like conception of kamma and vipāka, not a Buddhist one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Classical, orthodox Theravada teachers who reject flux?

Content:

Ajahn Brahm is a sutta-based Buddhist who has no liking for the Abhidhamma. He differs from most others of this persuasion by virtue of the fact that his views on contested issues happen to coincide with those of the commentators much more often than is the case with most other sutta-based Buddhists. But I've no idea what he thinks about momentarism.

Ajahn Chah was part of a guru-centric rather than text-centric tradition. Nevertheless he did recommend his monks to read the Visuddhimagga and there are a lot of statements in his talks which seem to indicate an acceptance of momentarism at least in its broad outline

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 9:55 AM

Title: Re: Classical, orthodox Theravada teachers who reject flux?

Content:

Go to the Ajahn Chah page at Access to Insight.

<https://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/thai/chah/index.html>

The very last item is a 700-page pdf file of his talks. Just download it and then search for the words 'moment' or 'khaṇika'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 12:07 PM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

That a kamma may ripen in more than just one way can be seen from many sutta teachings and narratives. You might start with the two Kammavibhangasuttas, MN 135 and 136.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 12:14 PM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

It would seem so, for if the Buddha had regularly suffered hardship in this regard there

would have been no reason to single out the Verañjā episode for any special attention.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Why-the-Buddha-Suffered/10-Eating-Barley.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 3:55 PM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

No. Repentance is valuable in that it sets you on the right course for the future, but (pace the Tibetans) it doesn't destroy your past karmas or turn them into something different.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 4:07 PM

Title: Re: Monastery may be destroyed by fire in the next few days

Content:

https://www.bps.lk/olib/bl/bl091_Khantipalo_Buddha-Bush--Seeing-Dhamma-in-Nature.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 3, 2019 6:05 PM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

Nobody has claimed that it's inevitable that A will be harmed by B. Natural decisive support condition just makes it slightly more likely that the kamma (especially if it's a weighty one) will ripen through the agency of B than through the agency of any other being.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 10:31 AM

Title: Re: What type of sickness Buddha had over lifetimes ?

Content:

Pakati-upanissayapaccaya or Pakatūpanissayapaccaya

"Decisive support is the most prominent condition relating non-simultaneous phenomena. It signifies the powerful causal influence one thing may exert on another when they are separated by an interval of time – either a moment's lapse (object decisive support), immediate succession (proximity decisive support), or an extended

period (natural decisive support)."

- Bhikkhu Bodhi, Great Discourse on Causation

For details see chapter 7 of Nina van Gorkom's The Conditionality of Life - An Outline of the Twenty-four Conditions as taught in the Abhidhamma.

<https://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/conditions/d/doc2907.html>

<https://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/conditions/d/doc2908.html>

The whole work in a single file:

<https://ia800501.us.archive.org/24/items/TheConditionalityOfLife/cond.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 1:25 PM

Title: Re: Teachers who teach/taught that parinibbana/anupadisesa nibbana is the end of all forms of consciousness?

Content:

Please stay on topic. The thread is concerned with who teaches the view in question, not about whether the view is right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 4:18 PM

Title: Re: bhāvitakāyo as developing physical endurance ?

Content:

I'm travelling today, so can't consult my books. Just going from memory, I believe bhāvitakāyo and abhāvitakāyo are defined in the commentaries as possessing/lacking restraint with regard to the five bodily doors; in other words, indriyasamvara and the lack of this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 5:14 PM

Title: Re: Teachers who teach/taught that parinibbana/anupadisesa nibbana is the end of all forms of consciousness?

Content:

I think what you describe is what's taught by virtually all teachers in traditions where the Abhidhamma and commentaries supply the theoretical underpinnings for bhāvanā. For example, in all of the modern Burmese dry insight traditions anupādisesa nibbāna will be conceived this way. Likewise in samatha-vipassanā traditions like that of Pa Auk Sayadaw.

It actually might be easier to answer your question by listing the teachers who don't teach this but instead assert some kind of postmortem continuance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 5:47 PM

Title: Re: Is it strange to oppose the Lotus Sutra but be ok with the Pureland Sutras?

Content:

Can you state what your reasons are for not regarding the Sukhāvatīyūha Sūtras with the same disdain as you have for the Saddharmapuṇḍarīka Sūtra? Without knowing these I don't see how one could make any judgment as to whether your position is a strange one or not.

It wouldn't of course be a strange position for certain Japanese Buddhists to take, given the often ferocious historical rivalry between those sects which hold the Saddharmapuṇḍarīka to be the Buddha's highest teaching and those which hold that only the Sukhāvatīyūha is of any use in the present degenerate age. But since you've described yourself as "holding a sort of Theravada position" I guess your reasons wouldn't be quite the same as those of a follower of Hōnen or Shinran.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 7:46 PM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

Being free of both personality view and the 'I am' conceit arahants don't hold to even the subtlest conception of 'self'. That being so, they would be neither of the view that there's a self that's perishable nor that there's a self that's eternal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 8:20 PM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

It would seem so. If you read how the arahant monks and nuns of the Theragāthā and Therīgāthā speak of their impending death, the commonest refrain is "I delight not in death, I delight not in life," which is then followed either by, "I await my time like a hireling his wages" or "I await my time clearly comprehending and mindful." None of them voice even the slightest anticipation of anything after that in the way that Christian saints, Islamic martyrs and suchlike usually do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 4, 2019 8:34 PM

Title: Re: Sex only for procreation

Content:

This is what the Tibetans say, but they get it from Aśvaghoṣa, not the Buddha.

In the Buddha's teaching on sexual misconduct there are no instructions as to what manner of sexual acts householders should or shouldn't engage in. The sole concern is who they do it with.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2019 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Permission of parents in Sri Lanka ordination

Content:

I think what the monk means by this rather reckless statement is that ordination candidates can in practice get away with not having their parents' permission even though the Vinaya requires that they do have it and ought not to be ordained if they don't have it.

In other words, you do need to obtain your parents' permission if you wish your ordination to be fully in line with the Buddha's ordinances. Failure to obtain that permission, however, is not included in the list of procedural defects that are serious enough to cause an ordination to be invalid.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 6, 2019 11:04 AM

Title: Re: Sex is always unwholesome

Content:

A classical Theravadin view would be a momentarist view.

With a typical sexual act between two persons in love, there will be moments of mettā, which are wholesome, moments of lust, which are unwholesome, and moments of visual consciousness, auditory consciousness, olfactory consciousness, etc., which are kammically neutral.

The unwholesome moments, however, will not amount to an akusala kammaṭṭhāna (an unwholesome kamma with the power to cause a bad rebirth), provided you're not doing it with someone you shouldn't be (which would be the akusala kammaṭṭhāna of sexual misconduct) or lusting after someone you shouldn't be (which would be the akusala kammaṭṭhāna of covetousness).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 7, 2019 1:52 PM
Title: Re: Permission of parents in Sri Lanka ordination
Content:
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn82>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 7, 2019 2:56 PM
Title: Re: Is "expedient means" explicitly taught in the abhidhamma?
Content:
Abhidhamma has to do with aggregates, elements, sense-bases, dependent arising, etc., when these are expounded as such, rather than in relation to living beings.

Upaya has to do with skilful teaching tactics that are appropriate to the disciple's condition, like the Buddha promising the besotted Nanda five hundred celestial nymphs if he remains a monk.

The two things don't really have anything to do with each other, unless it happens that the upaya consists in teaching someone Abhidhamma.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 7, 2019 6:16 PM
Title: Re: Canonical reference that arahants were/are doctors, firefighters, politicians, etc.?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Dec 7, 2019 8:43 PM
Title: Re: Sex only for procreation
Content:
I've never heard of any who teach this. If they did I don't think they'd get away with it. In Thailand, for example, even eight-year-old Buddhist Sunday School kids can recite the "Two Fives and Three Fours" - a Pali chant listing the factors of transgression for each of the five precepts.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Dec 8, 2019 11:34 PM
Title: Re: Online Retreats

Content:

Though it's not exactly a retreat, the Samatha Trust — a UK-based lay meditation group — has an annual online course. Unfortunately it runs from October to June, so you'd have to wait until next year to enrol. The course is free of charge, with instruction via weekly Skype interviews with one's teacher and uploaded instruction files.

<https://www.samatha.org/online-course>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 9, 2019 9:03 AM

Title: Re: Pada parama vs normal non buddhist layman

Content:

Which of the four types you are has nothing to do with whether you're a Buddhist or a non-Buddhist, a householder or a monastic. Bāhiya, for example, before meeting the Buddha, was both a non-Buddhist and an ugghaṭitaññū. Sunakkhatta was both a Buddhist monk and a padaparama.

As for the lower realms, all puthujjanas are vulnerable to rebirth in them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 9, 2019 7:02 PM

Title: Re: How is meditation practiced in other Buddhism sects?

Content:

Not the Visuddhimagga, for they have their own meditation manuals based on the ideas peculiar to each school. For example, Kamalaśīla's

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bh%C4%81van%C4%81krama> and Atiśa's

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bodhipathaprad%C4%ABpa> for the Tibetan schools; Koan collections like the https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Blue_Cliff_Record and

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Gateless_Barrier for the Ch'an school; the

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Longer_Sukh%C4%81vat%C4%ABvy%C5%ABha_S%C5%ABtra and

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Shorter_Sukh%C4%81vat%C4%ABvy%C5%ABha_S%C5%ABtra Sūtras for the Pure Land schools, etc., etc.

I think Thich Nhat Hanh makes use of the Chinese translation of a non-Theravadin version of the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta, but I haven't heard of anyone else doing so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 9, 2019 9:08 PM

Title: Re: vipassanāñāṇa is not a superior human state?

Content:

Your writer seems to be referring to Buddhaghosa's gloss on the word ñāṇa in Vin-a II 495-6. But since the Vinaya Piṭaka has defined this as the three vijjās, I don't see how it could be "incorrect" of Buddhaghosa to exclude lower levels of insight knowledge, i.e., those which fall short of the noble paths and fruitions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 10, 2019 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Either Buddhism is pure nihilism or dependent origination must be reinterpreted?

Content:

How does that follow?

The fact that, say, trees exist dependent on soil, water, sunlight, the seeds from which they grew, etc., surely doesn't mean that no single tree exists. It just means that no tree is its own cause and no tree exists independently.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 10, 2019 1:23 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

I understand pāṇātipāta as having only to do with the killing of other beings.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 10, 2019 1:48 PM

Title: Re: Monastics and suicide

Content:

I wouldn't generalize because I think it would be different sorts of action for different sorts of people. Or in abhidhammic terms, I think suicide might be prompted by any of the eight greed-rooted cittas, either of the two hate-rooted cittas or any of the eight great wholesome cittas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 10, 2019 2:03 PM

Title: Re: vipassanāñāṇa is not a superior human state?

Content:

Deliberate lies about things other than states exceeding the human would in most cases be a breach of the first pācittiya rule.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 10, 2019 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Translating sabbam natthi ???

Content:

Again unlikely. The words khayadhamma and vayadhamma are what are normally used to characterize something that's arisen and is subject to passing away.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 12, 2019 12:23 PM

Title: Re: Permission of parents in Sri Lanka ordination

Content:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=1243>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 14, 2019 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Chah speaks of "convention"

Content:

Probably either sommoot (สมมุติ or สัมมติ) or banyat (บัญญัติ), the Thai pronunciations of sammuti and paññatti.

Sometimes the loanwords are used by forest ajaans in exactly the way the Pali commentators do. Other times they're used in peculiarly Thai or peculiarly forest tradition ways.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 14, 2019 6:04 PM

Title: Re: The cause of cycle of birth and death ?

Content:

I expect that this idea (or something rather like it) would make sense to Sāṃkhya-Yogins, Jains and Goenkaists. But in the Pali texts the fact that some sotāpannas are single-seeded, some clan-to-clan and some seven-times-at-most isn't attributed to previous life kamma but rather to the relative strength in them of the five faculties.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 14, 2019 11:38 PM

Title: Re: The cause of cycle of birth and death ?

Content:

For their meaning see these two threads:

<https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=4419>

<https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?t=24977>

And in the second thread download the Har Dayal article that I uploaded.

They are ended by the attainment of arahatta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 15, 2019 8:21 AM

Title: Re: Uposatha drinks

Content:

In Thailand you can. In many Burmese monasteries tea is classified as a food because of the local practice of fermenting tea leaves and eating them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 15, 2019 8:27 PM

Title: Re: The cause of cycle of birth and death ?

Content:

I don't think the texts relating to the āsavas ever state an order of abandoning. If one were derived inferentially from the account of the abandoning of the fetters, I expect it would be:

diṭṭhāsava: abandoned by the sotāpanna.

kāmāsava: abandoned by the anāgāmin.

bhavāsava: abandoned in part by the anāgāmin, fully by the arahant.

avijjāsava: abandoned by the arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 15, 2019 11:32 PM

Title: Re: The cause of cycle of birth and death ?

Content:

You've raised objections of this sort several times before but were never satisfied with anyone's answers because you didn't accept the ten-fetter formula as buddhavacana. Rather, you rejected it as

<https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=31104#p455724> and

<https://dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=31104&start=15#p455841>.

That being so, since I don't think you're actually open to persuasion in this matter, and

since I don't hope to improve on the answers you've already been given, I'll keep my reply brief and would prefer not to pursue the matter with you beyond this present post.

- What is called 'avijjā' occurs in both gross and subtle forms.
- What are called the 'āsava of avijjā' and the 'fetter of avijjā' are broad terms that encompass all forms of avijjā.
- The elimination of grosser forms of avijjā by attainment of the lower ariyan paths suffices to eliminate diṭṭhāsava and kāmāsava, but...
- does not eliminate the underlying tendency to avijjā (avijjānusaya).
- So long as the underlying tendency to avijjā is intact, the āsava of avijjā and the fetter of avijjā cannot be said to be eliminated.
- The arahant alone has eliminated the underlying tendency to avijjā.
- Therefore the arahant alone has eliminated the āsava of avijjā and the fetter of avijjā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 17, 2019 4:53 PM

Title: Re: Permission of parents in Sri Lanka ordination

Content:

I wouldn't call it immoral, because I would see it as compensation rather than a bribe.

Bribes are payments made to dishonestly induce people to do something other than what it's their duty to do. But it's not a parent's duty either to let his son go forth or to prohibit him going forth. It is, however, a Buddhist son's duty to care for his parents in their old age. That being so, I would see the proffered payment to the parents not as a bribe, but rather as compensation for the fact that after going forth he won't be in a position to carry out his filial duties in full.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 20, 2019 7:38 PM

Title: Re: In which sutta does the Buddha explain what no self means?

Content:

The answer to your question will be the same as the answer to any "Who...?" question asked with regard to an arahant:

No kallo pañho, - "Not a valid question."

See the Moliyaphagguna Sutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn12.12>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 20, 2019 8:08 PM
Title: Re: Significance of the foot touching the earth?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 20, 2019 8:44 PM
Title: Re: The meaning of "abhi" ?
Content:

"About" is the meaning of some of the cognate words of abhi in other languages: Latin ambi; Old Irish imb; Old High German umbi; Anglo-Saxon ymb, etc.. It's not among any of the glosses proposed either by the ancient grammarians or by modern philologists.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Dec 20, 2019 10:38 PM
Title: Re: The meaning of "abhi" ?
Content:

The traditional glosses on the abhi- in Abhidhamma are atireka ('extra', 'further') and visesa ('special').

Theravada tradition tends to lay especial stress on the second of these two prefixes. What makes the abhidhammic mode of exposition "special" is that it's "non-figurative" (nippariyāya) and definitive (nītattha). Now it does happen that Buddhaghosa and his heirs regard the Abhidhamma as a "higher teaching", but they regard it so because its contents are held to be "truth in the highest sense" (paramattha-sacca), not because they think the prefix abhi- means "higher".

As for atireka, this is the understanding of -abhi that tends to be favoured by modern academic scholars. For Theravadin ābhidhammikas, the Abhidhamma is "extra/further Dhamma" in the sense of being what was taught by the Buddha in addition to the Suttas, or going further than the Suttas. Modern scholars on the other hand, tend to construe it as meaning a further elaboration of the Dhamma by the Buddha's disciples in their own words.

As for the "abhi- as 'about'" theory, I don't think any scholar worth his salt would claim that it means that. I suspect what may have happened here is that the person proposing this idea looked at the entry for abhi- in the PTS dictionary, noted what the cognates of the prefix mean in other languages (these are given at the start of the entry) and then not bothered to read any further.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 21, 2019 8:43 AM

Title: Re: Significance of the foot touching the earth?

Content:

In the Aṭṭhakanāgarasutta venerable Ānanda taught eleven doors to Nibbāna. Touching the earth with your feet isn't one of them.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn52>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 21, 2019 3:43 PM

Title: Re: Buddha did not teach 12 dependent arising links

Content:

Starting with Frauwallner in the 1950s, various academic scholars proposed that the twelvefold paṭiccasamuppāda as we have it now was actually a synthesis of several shorter and older versions. No two of them seem to have agreed on the nature of this alleged synthesis. This wiki entry gives a summary of some of them:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Prat%C4%ABtyasamutp%C4%81da#Synthesis_of_older_versions

But the entry omits the theory that seems to have enjoyed the longest vogue (i.e., at least a decade!), that of the Japanese scholar Hajime Nakamura. Though like Nakamura's once-fashionable positing of the Suttanipāta as the proto-Canon, his paṭiccasamuppāda synthesis theory was a dead parrot by about the mid-1980s. See the attached file.

.

[./download/file.php?id=5413](#)

(373.29 KiB) Downloaded 62 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 21, 2019 4:03 PM

Title: Re: Significance of the foot touching the earth?

Content:

The Buddha described the four satipaṭṭhānas as the "ekāyano path for the purification of beings". Ekāyano is glossed in several ways in the Niddesa and commentaries. See Dmytro's thread on the term:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=5587>

and the discussion in Ven. Anālayo's Satipaṭṭhāna - the Direct Path to Realization, pp. 27-9

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 21, 2019 5:00 PM

Title: Re: Buddha did not teach 12 dependent arising links

Content:

I reject them. I think that compared with the orthodox view (I mean the view deemed orthodox by all Indian Buddhist schools) that the twelvefold dependent arising was what the Buddha himself taught, these modern revisionist theses all fall foul of Occam's razor.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 22, 2019 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Buddha did not teach 12 dependent arising links

Content:

In the context of dependent arising the suttas define avijjā as non-knowledge of the four truths:

"And what, bhikkhus, is ignorance? Not knowing suffering, not knowing the origin of suffering, not knowing the cessation of suffering, not knowing the way leading to the cessation of suffering. This is called ignorance."

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn12.2>

So while there may be room for discussion about the nature of this "not knowing", there's none with regard to what it is that's not known.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 22, 2019 8:45 PM

Title: Re: The meaning of "abhi" ?

Content:

Well, I'm simply astonished to hear this.

But if it's Anālayo, then I guess I'll have to back-pedal on my "no scholar worth his salt..." remark.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 23, 2019 6:23 PM

Title: Re: Fire/Lotus buds on Buddha statues

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 23, 2019 10:43 PM

Title: Re: Fire/Lotus buds on Buddha statues

Content:

It's not that the flame is meant to look like a turban, but rather that artistic representation of the uṣṇiṣa was in the earliest days of Buddha images turban-like but later took on other forms. But the variant forms continued to be referred to as uṣṇiṣas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 23, 2019 10:57 PM

Title: Re: what is upasama-anu-s-sati?

Content:

This argument seems to assume that the practice of the recollection of peace would be analogous to, say, recollection of dāna or recollection of sīla, in which one would need to have given some gifts or observed some sīla in order to have something to recollect.

It seems more likely to me that it would be analogous to the recollection of death – a practice that doesn't entail being able to remember any past deaths, but rather bringing to mind the inevitability of one's future death. Or to the recollection of the Buddha or the Saṅgha, which don't require one to be a Buddha or a noble disciple, but merely to know about and have faith in the special qualities of these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 24, 2019 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Fire/Lotus buds on Buddha statues

Content:

Just search google images for Gandhara (or Mathura) + Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 24, 2019 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Why is anattā translated as [no self]?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 24, 2019 8:12 PM

Title: Re: what is upasama-anu-s-sati?

Content:

Can you expand on that? I don't understand what you're trying to say.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2019 12:22 PM

Title: Re: Symbolic meaning of Buddha's mother and step-mother

Content:

I don't think any explanation is given for Mahāmāyā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2019 11:00 PM

Title: Re: Symbolic meaning of Buddha's mother and step-mother

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 25, 2019 11:53 PM

Title: Re: user on this forum with buddhanussati (itipiso...) in signature

Content:

It's from the the chanting book of the Buddhist Society of Western Australia, but I don't know who the translator is. As it contains the politically incorrect and gender non-inclusive word "men" I guess it's probably not Ven. Sujāto's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 1:08 AM

Title: Re: Symbolic meaning of Buddha's mother and step-mother

Content:

She gave birth only to the Bodhisatta, who frustrated the prophecy by going forth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Rishi, Seers, Lersi

Content:

The word ṛṣi takes the form isi in Pali. In the suttas it gets applied to various sorts of

persons. Perhaps the closest to what you're describing would be the isi Asita in the Nālakasutta:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/snp3.11>

But the term is also applied to the paccekabuddhas in the Isigili Sutta and elsewhere to arahants or just sages in general.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 8:41 AM

Title: Re: Rishi, Seers, Lersi

Content:

There are men here who call themselves ṛṣīs and dress up in the way that ṛṣīs are traditionally depicted in Thai art. But I couldn't say how much of it is genuine. My impression from a distance is there's quite an air of charlatanry and phoniness about the whole ṛṣī scene. I mean I've never heard of any of them living simple lives in forests or mountain caves like the ṛṣīs of old. All the ones I hear about are living comfortably in urban apartments and making an easy dollar by fortune-telling and other low arts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 3:53 PM

Title: Re: Lack of progress

Content:

The second part has now been posted.

https://politicallyincorrectdharma.blogspot.com/2019/12/why-ive-almost-stopped-meditating-part_15.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 4:41 PM

Title: Re: Symbolic meaning of Buddha's mother and step-mother

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 26, 2019 4:44 PM

Title: Re: Manchester UK like-minded associate quest!

Content:

If you are looking for like-minded people to rent with, some of the centres will probably

have notice boards where you could put up an ad for this purpose.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 27, 2019 6:49 PM

Title: Re: More effort in 2020

Content:

Best wishes for a single-minded new year. But do please drop by when you have the time and inclination; your contributions aren't in the least insipid.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2019 5:48 PM

Title: Re: Paying taxes and second precept

Content:

I would say not, for transgression of the second precept is bodily misconduct (kāyaduccarita) and as such requires some action of the body. It can't be transgressed by a purely mental action, let alone a mental omission.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2019 6:23 PM

Title: Re: How do I distinguish verb conjugations?

Content:

You can know it from its form in the present tense third person singular, which is the form given in all Pali dictionaries. For most practical purposes the seven can be reduced to five groups:

1st, 2nd and 3rd conjugations: ending -ati.

4th conjugation: ending -uṇāti or -oti.

5th conjugation: ending -āti.

6th conjugation: ending -oti

7th conjugation: ending -eti or -ayati

For purposes of inflection and recognition, if you see a verb ending in -ati it's unnecessary to know if it's 1st, 2nd or 3rd conjugation. Likewise if you see a verb ending in -oti it's unnecessary to know if it's 4th or 6th conjugation. Being able to distinguish the aforementioned only becomes necessary when one is attempting to derive a verb's appropriate form from its root, in which case one will need to look it up in treatises on verbal roots like the Saddanīti Dhātumālā or the Dhātuppadīpikā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2019 6:42 PM

Title: Re: In remembrance of Bhikkhu Samahita

Content:

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=23927&start=195#p343438>

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=25231&start=140#p366282>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 28, 2019 10:16 PM

Title: Re: In remembrance of Bhikkhu Samahita

Content:

That someone dies by their own hand doesn't allow us to make any particular determination as to what their destination is likely to be. Like anyone else, if they've performed a weighty kamma at some time in their life, then the destination will be determined by that. If not, then it might be determined by death-proximate kamma. If not, then by habitual kamma. If not, then by reserve kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 29, 2019 1:08 AM

Title: Re: In remembrance of Bhikkhu Samahita

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 30, 2019 1:34 PM

Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 30, 2019 1:41 PM

Title: Re: Tip of the nose

Content:

See this thread on the meaning of parimukhaṃ.

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=23&t=5636>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2019 1:45 PM
Title: Re: Free PTS eBooks
Content:
Anumodanā!

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2019 2:53 PM
Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 30, 2019 6:05 PM
Title: Re: S.N. Goenka says: only use one kind of meditation...why?
Content:
Over the years I've heard four reasons given.

The first is that the use of multiple methods means superficiality in each of the methods. Goenka uses the simile of digging a well: hitting water (or oil) is more likely if you dig one well deeply rather than lots of shallow wells.

The second is based on Goenka's rather New Agey vibes theory. Each meditation method supposedly produces certain kinds of vibrations peculiar to itself. Non-Goenkaite methods will generate vibrations that impede progress in Goenkaite meditation. (This preoccupation with vibrations is also the reason Goenkaites are advised not to even sit in meditation groups with people who are practising other methods, let alone learn from them).

The third is a stronger version of the second: not only will doing other methods impede your progress, it's also alleged to be dangerous for the practitioner's mental health.

The fourth reason has to do with devas. The reason the Goenka vipassanā method has been successfully transmitted unbroken for the past 2500 years is that there are Ariyan devas who watch over it and protect those who practise it. If significant numbers of practitioners start mixing the method with others, then it will become impure and the devas will withdraw their protection.

Of these four, the first two are from Goenka himself; the other two are what I've heard

from assistant teachers and may or may not be what Goenka teaches.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 31, 2019 1:49 AM

Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?

Content:

No. To revert to my earlier example of acts and things to be avoided, as taught in the Sabbāsavaṣutta — killing oneself expecting that one will thereby cease to exist would be like going to a place frequented by fierce elephants (bulls, dogs, etc.) and expecting to be safe. Or like going into a cesspit or sewer and expecting not to stink. Or like associating with bad friends and expecting not to be badly influenced or to acquire a bad name. They're all imprudent things to do, but doing them doesn't violate any moral precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 31, 2019 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Fire/Lotus buds on Buddha statues

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 31, 2019 11:35 AM

Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?

Content:

Perhaps for the same reason that wasting your own money isn't included in the second precept, or trying to talk yourself into believing a falsehood isn't included in the fourth precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 31, 2019 2:23 PM

Title: Re: Why animals, birds and insect do not become Ghosts after death?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Dec 31, 2019 4:23 PM

Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?

Content:

I don't think the point can be made with the third precept, for in this case the wronged party (e.g., a cuckolded husband) isn't wronged in a way that's quite analogous to being killed, robbed or lied to.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 1, 2020 9:40 PM

Title: Re: S.N. Goenka says: only use one kind of meditation...why?

Content:

As Goenka claimed that vibrations are all that exist, I would guess that he was probably following his teacher, U Ba Khin, who used this word as an eccentric translation of the Pali word dhātu. So, if one accepts this as a defensible translation, then one could say that Goenka's vibration theory is supported by the suttas. In practice of course, nobody outside of U Ba Khinist and Goenkaist circles would be likely to accept this rendering of the word. I mean it doesn't fall even within the (somewhat broader) semantic range of its Sanskrit cognate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 1, 2020 11:18 PM

Title: Re: Regarding the term, 'Yathābhūtañāṇadassanam'

Content:

Bhū, from which we get the verb bhavati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 2:37 AM

Title: Re: Why the Buddha never forbade suicide ?

Content:

Do you have a source for these criteria?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 5:37 AM

Title: Re: What is Dathu (eliments) Manasikara?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 5:26 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a text

Content:

No, the story comes from various apocryphal Chinese sources. It's not found in the Pali, though it shows clear influence from the <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja540>.

For a discussion of it see chapter 2 of Kenneth Kuan Sheng Ch'en's Chinese Transformation of Buddhism,
https://drive.google.com/open?id=16i0LTRWimXS_wWKfkHSpAKZ-luDesVxP

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Ven. Pilasse Chandaratana's doctoral thesis:

"Divergent Doctrinal Interpretations on the Nature of Mind and Matter in Theravāda Abhidhamma: A study mainly based on the Pāli and Sīṃhala Buddhist exegetical literature"

To obtain the paper go to the link below, fill in your name and email address and confirm that you're not a robot. A download link will then be posted to you.

<https://hub.hku.hk/bitstream/10722/182309/1/FullText.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 8:23 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a text

Content:

Not in the pālī, atthakathā or ṭīkā. I can't of course guarantee that such a story is not to be found in some less official source in the Theravādin cultural milieu, e.g., a Burmese apocryphal Jātaka text or something like that.

Justindesilva mentioned the Petavatthu, but the only relevant story there (or rather in its commentary) consists in Moggallāna helping out a female peta (not a hell being) who had formerly been Sāriputta's mother.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a text

Content:

Yes, you're right. Moggallāna was the reporter of the episode.

I notice that the version of the story given at Suttacentral (that of Ven. Kiribathgoda Gnanananda) contains a mistranslation which makes it appear that she was the mother of both Sāriputta and Moggallāna in their former lives.

<https://suttacentral.net/pv14/en/kiribathgoda>

For the correct translation (Peter Masefield's - with the full commentary too) see:

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=1HCSzPSDxEswFYNymjgBgdF9xzUSH-74z>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Regarding the term, 'Yathābhūtañāṇadassanam'

Content:

I'm not aware of any contexts where yathābhūta could be substituted for paccuppanna, or vice versa. Nor do the commentaries ever gloss either term with the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 2, 2020 11:19 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a text

Content:

Anybody can perceive amanussas if the amanussas are willing to be perceived, that is, if they choose to reveal themselves to the human sense organs. But those with the requisite iddhi can perceive them whether or not they wish to be perceived.

On his own admission Ven. Sāriputta didn't even have the power to see a paṃsupisācaka. But not being blind or deaf, he had the capacity to see and hear amanussas that wished to be seen or heard by him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 3, 2020 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Isn't mindfulness absurd?

Content:

I moved the post here as it was off topic in the Goenka thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 3, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: Looking for a text

Content:

Yes, though I don't recall this being mentioned in the Dhammapada commentary. It is mentioned in the Saṃyutta commentary to the Uttiyasutta and the Dīgha commentary to the Mahāparinibbānasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 3, 2020 12:01 PM

Title: Re: Sotapanna is not a fixed state!!

Content:

Only if doing such things would cause the re-arising of embodiment view, doubt, misapprehension of habitual and vowed observances and other abandoned fetters. This is certainly not a possibility that the Abhidhamma would countenance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 4, 2020 8:31 PM

Title: Re: What does "'burning up' its own support" mean?

Content:

I'm not really sure.

If sannissayaḍḍāharasā is translated as "burning up its own support", as Bhikkhu Bodhi does, then I've no idea what it could mean. That is, I don't know what it could be that both supports rāga and gets burned up by rāga.

My own inclination would be to translate sannissaya according to the way it's used in the Niddesa, the only canonical text where the term appears. In that case it would be "one's own support". That would be in line with all those suttas where it's oneself that is burned up by one's lust.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 4, 2020 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Why I'm an Epicurean and not a Buddhist

Content:

Only when the term's being used in its popular or slanderous sense, which is usually written with a lower-case e.

When it's written in the upper-case, I think only a human, and maybe a sense-sphere deva, could be one. My cat, for example, shows every indication of being a hedonist, but no sign of being an atomic materialist, a seeker of aponia and ataraxia, or a believer in the doctrine that free will is made possible by certain atoms occasionally moving in a random and irregular fashion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 4, 2020 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

In Thailand there are Thai translations of the whole of the Tipiṭaka and all the Atthakathās. There's also a translation of the Tipiṭaka into Kham Meuang, the dialect of the North. Only a small selection of Ṭikās have been translated, mainly those to the Vinaya and Abhidhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Monks are allowed to keep pets?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Monks are allowed to keep pets?

Content:

In the Vinaya there's no explicit allowance, nor any prohibition. But there are passing mentions of monks keeping pets and without the Buddha objecting to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 5:01 AM

Title: Re: Monks are allowed to keep pets?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 8:23 AM

Title: Re: Was Bahiya an Arahant when he met Buddha?

Content:

Kṛtyagñāna (Pali: kiccañāṇa) is the knowledge of the task that accompanies each of the four truths, i.e., that dukkha is to be known, craving abandoned, cessation realized and the path developed. How could one possibly know the tasks if one didn't know the truths that they pertain to?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 8:41 AM

Title: Re: S.N. Goenka says: only use one kind of meditation...why?

Content:

The commentaries take this verse as a description of how the minds of arahants (and only arahants) naturally are.

Is this what Goenka teaches too? Or is he teaching that non-arahants should endeavour to maintain their minds in this state? If so, then it would render the whole verse redundant for it would in effect reduce it to one of the lower blessings, namely, khanti, which was already covered in an earlier verse.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 10:23 AM

Title: Re: Monks are allowed to keep pets?

Content:

I would say that Buddharakkhita's words are expressive of a view that sides with dispassion. But since the texts don't recognize the possibility of psittacine stream-entry, presumably it would fall some way short of the ariyan right view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 5, 2020 10:20 PM

Title: Re: The Pali word "vo" ???

Content:

The vo here isn't actually an enclitic. It's an indeclinable particle added for emphasis.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 8:49 AM

Title: Re: Why I'm an Epicurean and not a Buddhist

Content:

With what do you propose to replace it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Do you know any good quotes to tell to a control freak?

Content:

You could quote Dhammapada 11-12 and tell them they're mistaking the non-essential

for the essential.

Mind you, if it's an Ajahn Chah tradition monastery it probably won't do you any good. With the tradition's ever-increasing emphasis on regimentation, mistaking the non-essential for the essential now seems to be hardwired into everyone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 5:11 PM

Title: Re: The Pali word "vo" ???

Content:

Another example, from the Mahā-assapurasutta, MN 39:

Samaṇā samaṇāti vo, bhikkhave, jano sañjānāti. Tumhe ca pana ke tumhe ti puttā samānā samaṇāmhā ti paṭijānātha; tesam vo, bhikkhave, evaṃ samaññānaṃ sataṃ evaṃ paṭiññānaṃ sataṃ ye dhammā samaṇakaraṇā ca brāhmaṇakaraṇā ca te dhamme samādāya vattissāma, evaṃ no ayaṃ amhākaṃ samaññā ca saccā bhavissati paṭiññā ca bhūtā. Yesañca mayaṃ cīvarapiṇḍapātasenāsanagilānappaccayabhesajjaparikkhāraṃ paribhuñjāma, tesam te kārā amhesu mahapphalā bhavissanti mahānisaṃsā, amhākañcevāyaṃ pabbajjā avañjhā bhavissati saphalā saudrayā ti.

“‘Recluses, recluses,’ so the people know you, monks, and you, on being asked: ‘Who are you?’ should acknowledge: ‘We are recluses.’ Such being your designations, monks, such being your vocations, thus you should train yourselves, monks: ‘We will go forward undertaking those things that are to be done by recluses, that are to be done by brahmans; thus will this designation of ours become true and the vocation real; and the gifts of those things we make use of: robe-material, almsfood, lodgings, medicine for the sick, will come to be of great fruit, of great advantage to us; and this our going forth will come to be not barren but fruitful and growing.’

(I.B. Horner tr.)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 7:43 PM

Title: Re: The Pali word "vo" ???

Content:

Yes. Sati is the locative singular form.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

I don't know. It's not available on the Mahapali or Bhumibalo Bhikkhu websites and I don't know what others might be likely to host a copy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 6, 2020 8:47 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

If you mean "catch up" in the sense of publishing English translations of those Pali texts that have up to now only been translated into Asian languages, then going by present trends I don't think there are any grounds for thinking that English will ever catch up. By "present trends" I mean chiefly mean the policies of publishing outfits like the Pali Text Society, Wisdom Publications, Shambala Press, etc. None of these are interested in commissioning translations of as-yet-untranslated Pali commentaries etc., for the simple reason that extremely few people outside of academia are interested in reading them. As for those within academia, if they're doing Theravada or early Buddhist studies, they will normally be expected to learn Pali and so won't need translations.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 7, 2020 1:01 AM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

I said "extremely few", not "no one". The reasons that come to mind are, firstly, that a great many English-speaking Buddhists are not interested in reading ancient Buddhist texts of any sort. They prefer to just read and listen to modern teachers. Secondly, of those who do read ancient texts, some deliberately avoid the commentaries because they've picked up a prejudice against them from some modern source that they trust. Of those who haven't picked up such a prejudice, some might dip their toes in, usually by reading the Visuddhimagga, but then find much that they either don't understand, or find boring or disagree with.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 7, 2020 8:28 AM

Title: Re: BBC article on ex-monk

Content:

I've never been there but I know that it's the monastery of Ajahn Ganha, a Dhammayutt forest monk but one with a close connection to Ajahn Chah.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 7, 2020 10:02 AM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

Yes, they're translated into Ratchasap (= Skt *rājaśabda*), the form of Thai spoken in the royal court, presumably on the grounds of the Buddha being born a prince. And so anything connected with the Buddha – the parts of his body, his possessions, his actions, etc. – are described using Ratchasap words rather than regular Thai ones. For example, the Buddha doesn't just "see" (เห็น); rather, he "disposes his holy eye to see" (ทรงพระเนตรเห็น).

In Thai schools Ratchasap isn't taught until the third year of high school. Before Thaksin became prime minister and hugely increased education funding, many of the poorer rural Thais were only educated up to the third or fourth grade of primary school, in effect making the Thai Tipiṭaka an inaccessible text for them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 7, 2020 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Tipitaka translation in Buddhist countries

Content:

Though Pali is the best of the four to learn, it's valuable to supplement this with either Sinhalese, Thai or Burmese. Doing so gives one access to much more comprehensive Pali dictionaries than are available in English. It's also much easier to read the commentaries in these modern languages than it is in Pali. When reading commentarial Pali every sentence seems like a jigsaw puzzle that needs solving, but when these are translated into modern languages all of the heavy lifting (e.g., unravelling long compound words and trying to figure out the syntax) has been done for you by the translators.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 7, 2020 11:35 PM

Title: Re: What is the reason sexual abstinence ranking number 1 ?

Content:

Within any particular class of offence there's no reason to think that the order in which the rules are listed is meant to reflect the kammic weightiness of transgressing them.

In the saṅghādisesas, for example, masturbation is listed before initiating a schism in the sangha, despite the latter being an anantariyaka-kamma. In the nissaggiya-pācittiyas, keeping an extra robe for more than ten days is listed before accepting money or causing a gift that was intended for the sangha to be given to oneself. In the pācittiyas, digging the earth is listed before intentionally killing an animal or beating up a fellow bhikkhu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 9, 2020 7:09 PM

Title: Re: Is there restriction on consumption of water for monks?

Content:

Because no circumstance arose that necessitated this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 10, 2020 1:19 AM

Title: Re: Is there restriction on consumption of water for monks?

Content:

Indeed. You could take an 80,000 gallon portable water tank to the temple and your sīla will still remain intact

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 22, 2020 12:03 AM

Title: Re: What is Vibh 83?

Content:

It's page 83 of the Pali Text Society's romanized Pali edition of the Vibhaṅga, the second book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

Pali text

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/pi/vb3>

U Ṭhittila's English translation

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/vb3>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 22, 2020 8:58 AM

Title: Re: What is Vibh 83?

Content:

So, the opposite term that you asked about refers (at least in this context) to rūpa that is not grasped by craving or false view. Elsewhere, however, the grasped/not-grasped description refers to whether the rūpa is generated by kamma or generated by the other three causes of rūpa: mind, temperature or nutriment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 23, 2020 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Pali Dictionaries

Content:

For Mac-users there's the Easy Unicode keyboard layout.

<http://www.palitext.com/subpages/EasyUnicode5.zip>

Just download and open the zip file, place the keyboard in the keyboard folder of your system library and then open keyboard preferences and select it. Use the option key to type diacritics, thus:

option a = ā

option i = ī

option u = ū

option g or k = ṅ

option t = ṭ

option d = ḍ

option n = ñ

option c or j = ñ

option l = ḷ

option m = ṃ

Sanskrit

option r = ṛ

option h = ḥ

option s = ś

option x = ṣ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 24, 2020 8:44 PM

Title: Re: What is Vibh 83?

Content:

Yes and yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 25, 2020 6:59 PM

Title: Re: Hiyyamāne ??

Content:

Jahati, from √ha.

The verb's passive form is hīyati and present participle hīyamāna. But in verse hīy- sometimes changes to hiyy- to fit the metre.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 26, 2020 2:49 AM

Title: Re: SN Goenka - Theravada Dhammaduta extraordinaire

Content:

Similarly, one may reasonably expect that if the Buddha of the Pali suttas were to encounter what nowadays goes by the name "Buddhism", he would praise whatever in it merits praise and reject whatever in it merits rejection.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 27, 2020 12:27 AM

Title: Re: SN Goenka - Theravada Dhammaduta extraordinaire

Content:

Which is precisely what I do take it to mean. I even take the term to include the offshoot known as U Ba Khin-style vipassanā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 27, 2020 1:35 AM

Title: Re: SN Goenka - Theravada Dhammaduta extraordinaire

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 28, 2020 3:32 AM

Title: Re: How to forgive when the other person continues to harm?

Content:

When you say "forgiveness" are you talking about the mental attitude of not harbouring resentment towards those who've wronged you? Or do you mean it in the more transactional sense of formally granting a pardon to such people?

I sense that most posters are assuming the former meaning to be the intended one. But if it's the latter then I think the answer would be that forgiveness is something that it's appropriate to grant to those who recognize their wrongdoing as such and are contrite about it. (In the case of bhikkhus it's not only appropriate but obligatory). It's not, however, something to be practised at all where these conditions don't obtain. If the person doesn't recognize his wrongdoing as such, then one's granting of forgiveness will be perceived by him as a presumptuous act rather than a kindly one. Or if he knows that he's done wrong but doesn't care (as seems to be the case in your example), then he's not yet deserving of forgiveness.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jan 28, 2020 5:44 AM
Title: Re: dhammo have rakkhati dammacāriṃ
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 31, 2020 7:06 PM
Title: Re: Pall Petters/tattoo
Content:
You can get the Pali names for the terms that interest you from Nyanatiloka's Buddhist Dictionary.

https://www.budsas.org/ebud/bud-dict/dic_idx.htm

Then you can use the Aksharamukha tool to convert the words from romanized Pali into any of eighty different Asian scripts.

<https://aksharamukha.appspot.com/converter>

Just paste the word in the column on the left and click "auto-detect". Then use the drop-down menu on the right to select which script you want to convert it to.

For example, Devanagari...

.

[./download/file.php?id=5517&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 31, 2020 7:07 PM
Title: Re: Pall Petters/tattoo
Content:
Or Sora Sompeng...

.

[./download/file.php?id=5518&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jan 31, 2020 7:09 PM
Title: Re: Pall Petters/tattoo
Content:
Or even Buginese...

.

[./download/file.php?id=5519&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 4, 2020 10:27 AM
Title: Re: "The Buddha and his Dhamma" by Ambedkar
Content:
Ambedkar's book shares much the same defects as Paul Carus's Gospel of the Buddha and as such doesn't really deserve to be taken seriously as a work of scholarship. Like Carus, Ambedkar is completely indiscriminating as to sources, e.g., placing very late and heavily romanticised Buddha biographies like the Mahāvastu and Lalitavistara on the same footing as the suttas. Also like Carus, he exercises a great deal of poetic license. If Ambedkar thinks that the Buddha ought to have said or done such and such, then he'll have him say it and do it even if there's no textual support at all.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 4, 2020 10:43 AM
Title: Re: source of the story
Content:
It sounds like a misremembered account of Ghosaka as related in the Dhammapada Atthakathā.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/02-01.htm>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 4, 2020 5:23 PM
Title: Re: the great rebirth debate
Content:
If you're asking whether this might be a tenable interpretation of Nāgasena's simile, the answer is no. This should be evident from the question to which the simile forms part of the answer: when someone is reborn, is he the same person or a different person from

the one who passed away?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 4, 2020 6:54 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

You're missing the point. King Milinda's question has nothing to do with one's relationship with one's parents. Parents aren't even mentioned. It has to do with whether identity can be predicated of a person in this life and in the next life: are they the same or different? Nāgasena rejects both possibilities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 4, 2020 7:46 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

Are you asking about a being who dies on the other side of the universe and then gets reborn as me? If so, then my answer would be the same as Nāgasena's: neither "same person" nor "different person" fits the case.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 5, 2020 11:22 AM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

How can I claim that my parents and I are different persons? Are you seriously asking that?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 5, 2020 6:57 PM

Title: Re: Who can post?

Content:

If you click on the main page link below you will see all the various forums. Just click on whichever one seems appropriate for the topic you wish to post about.

<https://dhammawheel.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 8:23 AM

Title: Re: Becoming a monk

Content:

Could you expand on what sort of person you're talking about?

Suppose it was someone who had difficulty sitting on the floor because of, say, old age and being long-accustomed to sitting in chairs, or because of arthritis or some such thing, then the Vinaya wouldn't prohibit his being ordained. On the other hand, it would be quite difficult (though not insuperably difficult) for him to find a monastery that would accept him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT

Content:

The Vinaya doesn't allow the ordination of napuṃsakas (men born without testicles) or opakkamikas (men who've lost their testicles), but this is the first time I've heard it claimed that a bhikkhu would have to disrobe if he were to lose his testicles after getting ordained.

I've just posted a query about it to Sutta Central.

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/the-meaning-of-pa-aka-in-light-of-the-vedic-and-jain-scriptures/12894/38>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT

Content:

No, the Vinaya treats missing fingers as a less weighty concern than missing testicles. Fingerless men aren't supposed to be ordained, but if they are then the ordination is allowed to stand. But if a eunuch gets ordained he has to disrobe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 2:23 PM

Title: Re: Becoming a monk

Content:

Is this expected to be a permanent malady or is it something that might be remedied by exercise and/or medical treatment?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 2:33 PM
Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT
Content:

The prohibition on ordaining eunuchs is not one of the rulings that's preceded by a reasoned discourse on why the ruling is being made. This is most often the case with rulings given in the Khandhakas, the section of the Vinaya Piṭaka that covers procedural matters. For example, in the case of those persons who are absolutely prohibited to be ordained, it's only the ruling on animals that's accompanied by a reason: animals are incapable of growth in the Dhammavinaya.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 8:13 PM
Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT
Content:

No. It merely means that unlike with the case of animals, the Buddha didn't give any reason for the absolute prohibition against ordaining eunuchs.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 8:37 PM
Title: Re: Becoming a monk
Content:

It will be best to find out and get it fixed if possible. Otherwise your opportunities will be very limited.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 8:56 PM
Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT
Content:

For me at the moment that would be a very big "if".

I'm quite positive that in the Vinaya Piṭaka there's no direct statement to the effect that a monk must disrobe if he loses his testicles after ordaining. That being so, Paññobhāsa's view will probably be either (1) his own inference from something or other in the Vinaya Piṭaka; (2) something stated in the commentaries; or (3) some Burmese Buddhist folk belief with no textual support.

At present I'm leaning most strongly towards #3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 6, 2020 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Change of username

Content:

Send a message to one of the two admins:

<https://dhammawheel.com/memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=53>

<https://dhammawheel.com/memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 7, 2020 7:39 AM

Title: Re: Who can post?

Content:

My pleasure.

Yes, I'm a bhikkhu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT

Content:

Your quarrel here is with Ven. Paññobhāsa, not me. I've already voiced my scepticism about his opinion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 8:28 AM

Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT

Content:

I doubt your late teacher would. Goenkaji knew the Vinaya rules well and required bhikkhus who took his meditation courses to observe them to the last dot and comma.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 9:03 AM
Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 2:33 PM
Title: Re: Pannobhasa on LGBT
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 8, 2020 11:35 PM
Title: Re: How I become a monk in Ajaan Suchart Monastery?
Content:
I've joined the three Ajaan Suchart-related threads into one. Please don't start any more.
– Moderator

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 9, 2020 2:45 AM
Title: Re: what is the pali text for this chanting clip?
Content:
The link doesn't work. It just takes me to the login page of weibo.com

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 9, 2020 10:00 AM
Title: Re: what is the pali text for this chanting clip?
Content:
It's from a merit dedication chant, but in the last half line the verb should be (and in Thai chanting books is) in the imperative mood: phusantu.

bhavagg'upādāya, avīci heṭṭhato,
etth'antare sattā, kāy'ūpapannā,
rūpī arūpī ca, asaṇṇī saṇṇino,
dukkhā pamuccantu, phusantu nibbutim.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 9, 2020 6:14 PM
Title: Re: Bare awareness is temporary?
Content:
"You read", "you can", "experience".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 9, 2020 9:45 PM
Title: Re: jhana vs silent illumination or other zen methods
Content:
That the Bodhisatta's two teachers were of Sāṃkhya affiliation isn't reported in any Buddhist texts composed before the Common Era, nor in any Theravadin texts at all. Nothing that is said about their views in the suttas would support this classification of them. The mere fact that Ālāra and Uddaka had two different conceptions of the summum bonum militates against the idea that they were both adherents of a single school.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 10, 2020 8:07 PM
Title: Re: How I become a monk in Ajaan Suchart Monastery?
Content:
If you went to live there Tan Suchart would (I expect) be the teacher (ācāriya) with whom you have dependence and who would give you your training in Vinaya, monastic etiquette, meditation etc. But he wouldn't be the preceptor (upajjhaya) who oversees your bhikkhu ordination ceremony. In Thailand it's very often the case that a bhikkhu's upajjhaya is a rather nominal figure with whom he has very little to do once he's been ordained.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 12, 2020 3:20 AM
Title: Re: Why do people like Dancing?
Content:
<https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/newstoppers/howaboutthat/3883838/Doing-the-Hokey-Cokey-could-be-hate-crime.html>

Some Glasgow Rangers supporters being hateful:

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 12, 2020 9:51 AM

Title: Re: Why do people like Dancing?

Content:

Just reporting the views of others. I'm nowhere near woke enough to be able to see how hateful hokey-cokey dancing is.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 12, 2020 7:30 PM

Title: Re: Inclusiveness and equality ?

Content:

I too find the notion of "the best kind of impartiality" a little puzzling. The expression doesn't occur anywhere else in the Tipiṭaka and no commentary gives any elaboration of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 12, 2020 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Is the use of the word "puthujjana" denigrating?

Content:

No. The expression in its literal sense ("[logs] cut to a standard size", as opposed to those that are cut according to a customer's specifications) dates from the 1880s, and in its figurative sense ("average", "mediocre") from the 1920s. Since the mill in "run-of-the-mill" is a motorized lumber mill, it can't serve as a literal translation of any idiom that predates the invention of the steam-powered circular saw in the early part of the Industrial Revolution.

Whether it's defensible as dynamic-equivalent translation would hinge on whether the idiom is a living or a dead metaphor. I guess where Thanissaro comes from it's probably a dead metaphor (i.e., those who encounter it don't immediately think of lumber mills or other kinds of motorized factory), but in some parts of the English-speaking world it's still a living one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 12, 2020 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Extirpating viruses ?

Content:

"Sentient beings", "samsaric beings" or "transmigrating beings" are commonly used by translators of Tibetan Mahayana texts to translate སེམས་ཆེན་ / sems can (lit. "with a mind"),

which is the Tibetan translation of the Sanskrit satva or sattva.

Most Pali translators render the cognate satta as "creatures", "living beings" or just "beings". If they add "sentient" it would probably be to make it clear that plants and suchlike aren't included in the term, though it's not really a good way of going about it. The impercipient beings, for example, are certainly sattas / samsāric beings, but they live out their lives wholly insentient.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 13, 2020 3:16 PM

Title: Re: Why not take refuge in Nibbana?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 13, 2020 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Is the use of the word "puthujjana" denigrating?

Content:

Puthujjana exists as a loanword in modern Thai, pronounced butuchon.

Outside of technical discussions of Buddhist doctrine, the word functions almost exactly like "son of Adam" (or "daughter of Eve") in English. That is, it basically means "human" or "person", but in a way that stresses one's own or another's fallibility, moral frailty or turpitude.

The conventions governing the words' use are rather similar in both languages:

1st person: used self-deprecatingly. ("My inner Adam got the better of me"; "I'd love to ordain, but I'm too much of a butuchon").

2nd person: rarely used at all, except when it's a human addressed by some other class of being (e.g., the djinns in the Arabian Nights address men as "sons of Adam"; a Thai monk telling the Bāhiya story might have Bāhiya's brother – a deva – address him as butuchon)

3rd person: used wryly or jocularly when speaking of the faults of others (especially if they involve drunkenness, gluttony or sexual peccadilloes).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 13, 2020 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Diabetic problem in ordination

Content:

Yes, there's no Vinaya objection to diabetics ordaining. The Thai sangha has lots of them. You would just have to look either for a wat where the monks take two or three meals in the morning or for one with a laissez faire policy, where monks take their food to their kuti after returning from almsround and are then free to take as many meals as they want between dawn and noon.

In effect this would rule out forest wats in the Ajahn Mun or Ajahn Chah traditions, but would be no problem in any town or village wat and in those forest wats where the dhutaṅga observances are not made obligatory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 14, 2020 2:05 AM

Title: Re: Diabetic problem in ordination

Content:

Not necessarily.

To be usable by bhikkhus they do of course need to have been offered to the saṅgha, but not necessarily to the particular bhikkhu who consumes them. In Asian monastic practice they would more often have been offered to the monastery as a whole because it's widely known by laypeople that a gift to the saṅgha is more meritorious than a gift to an individual. Having been offered, they're then placed in the monastery's store to be distributed by whoever's acting as the monastery's "distributor of trifles" (appamattakavissajjaka).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 4:08 PM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to read books in their kuti?

Content:

Wat Rampoeng Tapotaram. I know the wat and its abbot. It's a Mahasi-style meditation centre. In all such centres no reading is permitted during periods of intensive practice, e.g., during the centre's 26-day introductory course. During these periods virtually all one's waking hours will be spent doing alternate walking and sitting meditation. Outside of periods of intensive practice you'll be free to read whatever you like, though of course it will be best during your formative period to just stick to Dhamma and Vinaya texts.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 4:43 PM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

It depends whether you're talking about his head or his heart.

I'd say he's a Theravādin by ordination and largely (though not wholly) classical Theravādin in view, but with a strong emotional attraction to certain features of the Mahāyāna, in particular the bodhisatva ideal and East Asian devotional rituals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Cryptids and Deities

Content:

The Traibhūmikathā ("Treatise on the Three Worlds") is a medieval Thai text based on the Pali commentaries that will probably tell you more than you ever wanted to know about devas, asuras, petas, etc.

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=1eGQK1diD-MG-HJA2w2V-QqHVsmJEEBcv>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 6:20 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

"A rose by any other name..."

The sutta name for it is *saṃvattanikaṃ viññāṇaṃ*, translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi and I.B. Horner as "evolving consciousness", by Thanissaro as "leading-on consciousness", by Sujāto as "consciousness headed that way". See the *Āneñjasappāyasutta*, MN 106.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.106.than.html>

Edit:

And *viññāṇasota* in the *Sampasādanīyasutta*, DN 28.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 7:36 PM

Title: Re: the great rebirth debate

Content:

You've omitted the part about this occurring with the breakup of the body at death.

Or do you mean to say that you accept the possibility of rebirth into the *arūpa* realms but not into *rūpāvacara* or *kāmāvacara* ones?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 15, 2020 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Are monks allowed to read books in their kuti?

Content:

I live in northern Thailand, but not in any fixed location. I never go to Bangkok, but if you come to the north then it should be possible to meet up. Just send me a message if/when you reach Chiang Mai.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 16, 2020 6:26 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Cryptids and Deities

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an11.11>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 16, 2020 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Why don't we re-collect on Brahama?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 17, 2020 3:16 PM

Title: Re: Kamma bhava & upapatti bhava

Content:

Do you mean bhava or bhāva?

(I know 'bhava' is what you wrote, but since you neglected the diacritics when writing 'rūpa' as 'rupa' it's open to doubt whether you meant bhava or bhāva).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 25, 2020 2:36 PM

Title: Re: 10 great question to prove arhantship

Content:

See the Maḥāpañhāsutta (aka Paṭhamapañhāsutta). The Kumārapañhā cited by Samvara is an abbreviated version of this.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an10.27>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 25, 2020 2:59 PM

Title: Re: Monks/nuns and the Internet

Content:

I'm still using the same rather un-smart 15-year-old Nokia. Mainly as a meditation timer and alarm clock since it doesn't have any sim card in it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 26, 2020 6:28 PM

Title: Re: Referring to the Buddha non-reverentially

Content:

Which part? "Our man" or "nominalist"?

And by "non-reverential" do you mean "not expressing reverence" or "expressing irreverence"?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 28, 2020 7:03 PM

Title: Re: Elements definition

Content:

For the English translation see paragraphs 384-389 of the attached file.

[./download/file.php?id=5531](#)

(423.69 KiB) Downloaded 37 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 28, 2020 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Going forth without enlightenment?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2020 9:29 AM

Title: Re: A short talk for laypeople by Ajahn Nyanamoli

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2020 10:59 AM

Title: Re: What suttas support the orthodox Theravada position that matter exists and all is not imaginary or mind only?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 3, 2020 2:05 PM

Title: Re: SN 22.95 Phena Sutta is not about emptiness (sunnata)

Content:

Except in all the places where it isn't.

Admittedly the noun *suññatā* is more often auspicious than inauspicious in the suttas, particularly in *samāpatti*-related contexts. But with the adjective *suñña* it's actually the other way round.

Whether *suñña* is auspicious or inauspicious in any given context has to be determined by asking: "Empty of what?"

For example, there's no auspiciousness indicated when outside systems are described as "empty of ascetics" (*suññā samaṇehi*, MN 11), or when Mogharāja is told to "look upon the world as empty" (*suññato lokaṃ avekkhassu*, Snp. 4.16) or when bhikkhus are advised to view the aggregates "as impermanent, as suffering, as a disease, as a tumour, as a barb, as a calamity, as an affliction, as alien, as disintegrating, as empty, as not self" (*aniccato dukkhato rogato gaṇḍato sallato aghato ābādhato parato palokato suññato anattato*, MN 64).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2020 11:32 AM

Title: Re: *Idaṃ* this and *Idaṃ* that

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 4, 2020 6:06 PM

Title: Re: *Idaṃ* this and *Idaṃ* that

Content:

Possibly. To judge from the translations at Sutta Central, Sinhala translators do seem to favour using two "thises" (මෙය ... මෙය).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2020 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Idam̐ this and Idam̐ that

Content:

This differs from the rendering in the Mahachula translation of the Tipiṭaka only in that the latter uses koh on the first and third lines and jeung on the second and fourth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 5, 2020 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Aorist Rules

Content:

You could in theory, but in practice this is only ever done with the verb atthi.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2020 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Aorist Rules

Content:

Adding an a- is quite common, but not when the verbal root begins with a vowel.

In all there are three ways of forming the aorist. See the attached file for Duroiselle's account.

[./download/file.php?id=5541](#)

(92.98 KiB) Downloaded 89 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2020 9:50 PM

Title: Re: Idam̐ this and Idam̐ that

Content:

I take much the same view as Mike. It simply wouldn't cross my mind to use two thises for different referents, except in cases where they're things I can point to with my fingers (but even then I'd still be more likely to use this and that).

Looking at the translations at Sutta Central, I notice that the translators into European languages (except Ñāṇavīra) are unanimous in using "this, that".

English – this ... that
German – dieses ... jenes
Dutch – het een ... het ander
Norwegian – det ene ... det andre
Russian – это ... это
Czech – toto ... ono
French – ceci ... cela
Spanish – esto ... aquello
Portuguese – isso ... aquilo
Italian – questo ... quello

But the Asian translators seem to be divided:

This ... this

Burmese – ဤ ... ဤ [but then in parentheses they add avijjā after the first 'this' and saṅkhāra after the second]
Japanese – これ ... これ
Thai – สิ่งนี้ ... สิ่งนี้
Sinhala – මෙය ... මෙය

This ... that

Indonesian – ini ... itu
Vietnamese – cái này ... cái kia
Chinese – 這個 ... 那個

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2020 9:56 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

A comparative study of the Pali, Chinese, Sanskrit and Tibetan versions of the Sāmaññaphalasutta...

Graeme MacQueen,

<https://archive.org/details/astudyofthesramanyaphalasutragraememacqueen/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 6, 2020 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Idam this and Idam that

Content:

The locative absolute wouldn't imply that it is or that it isn't. The use of such a clause is every bit as ambiguous as a "When..." clause is in English. That is, it may express either subsequence or simultaneity, either 'if' or 'when', and either a causal relation or a non-causal one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Idaṃ this and Idaṃ that

Content:

As for the temporal issue, I suspect the ambiguous locative of the first and third lines was used advisedly, for some of the relations that follow, like consciousness and nāmarūpa, may be simultaneous, while others, like birth and death, cannot be so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 11:59 AM

Title: Re: Sarvastivada is still exist?

Content:

In the Theravāda the cardinal doctrine of the Sarvāstivāda (that dharmas persist through the three periods of time) is considered to have been successfully refuted at the Third Council.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv1.6>

Even the Tibetan followers of the Sarvāstivāda regard its central tenets as only provisionally true, hence its traditional classification as the lowest of the four tenet systems.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Without right view can one attain right concentration ?

Content:

No. The texts apply several names to the four jhānas or eight samāpattis when developed in the absence of right view, but "right concentration" isn't one them. The usual ones are a "pleasant abiding in the here-and-now" and "abandonment by suppression".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 3:14 PM

Title: Re: Without right view can one attain right concentration ?

Content:

All jhānic attainment involves abandoning by suppression, but for one without right view none of the higher kinds of abandoning are possible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 3:38 PM

Title: Re: Without right view can one attain right concentration ?

Content:

Your question seems to assume that this passage is a definitive teaching and one that describes all the sufficient as well as all the necessary conditions for sammā-samādhī. But it isn't.

To discount the importance of right view in this matter is as if someone were to quote the <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn12.23> and then ask: "Why doubt that everybody who suffers will be sure to attain nibbāna?" Or were to quote the <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an10.1> and then ask: "Why doubt that everybody possessed of sīla will be sure to attain nibbāna?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 3:43 PM

Title: Re: Idam this and Idam that

Content:

Right.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 3:45 PM

Title: Re: Without right view can one attain right concentration ?

Content:

No. Sorry, it's just my hasty typing. The word 'Ariyan' shouldn't be there.

The wrong views abandoned by substitution of opposites are of the coarse diṭṭhigata kind, like the 62 of the Brahmajālasutta. But one needn't have yet arrived at stream-entry to have abandoned these wrong views at the level of "the heard" sutamaya and "the thought" cintāmaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 7, 2020 5:42 PM

Title: Re: Without right view can one attain right concentration ?

Content:

It can be experienced by a jhāna attainer before stream-entry but it would be productive of taints (āśava) and liable to ripen in rebirth, and so wouldn't yet be reckoned an Ariyan path factor. In kammic terms, it would be a bright kamma leading to a bright result, not a neither-bright-nor-dark kamma leading to neither a bright result nor a dark result.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 8, 2020 6:39 PM

Title: Re: Idaṃ this and Idaṃ that

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2020 10:08 AM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

I already do. For me it's been clear for decades that whereas mainstream Indian Buddhism (the Buddhism of the "eighteen" Schools) is one religion divided into competing traditions of interpretation, the Mahayana is something else altogether.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2020 5:34 PM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

According to the Milindapañha, being any one of the following...

1. an animal.
2. a ghost.
3. a holder of wrong view.
4. a deceiver.
5. a matricide.
6. a patricide
7. an arahant-killer.
8. a fomentor of schism.
9. an injurer of the Buddha.
10. one in communion with the monastic saṅgha by theft (i.e., who falsely pretends to be ordained)
11. one who committed apostasy while formerly ordained.
12. a violator of nuns.
13. a transgressor of one of the thirteen saṅghādisesa rules who hasn't yet undergone

the required penance and rehabilitation.

14. a eunuch.

15. an hermaphrodite.

16. a human child less than seven years of age.

will prevent one from arriving at Ariyan penetration.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mil6.3.8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 13, 2020 8:17 PM

Title: Re: 8FP

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2020 12:36 AM

Title: Re: fire, poison & sword

Content:

The seventh benefit of mettā cetovimutti is obtained only during those moments when the yogi is actually in this samāpatti, not when he has emerged from it. See Nāgasena's discussion of a related question in the Milindapañha's

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mil5.4.6>.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 14, 2020 6:20 PM

Title: Re: Are some deva (deities) not opapatika?

Content:

Terrestrial devas are catuyonika, that is, they can be born in any of the four ways.

Celestial devas from the Heaven of the Four Great Kings upwards are all opapātika.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 15, 2020 3:17 PM

Title: Re: Coronavirus?

Content:

<https://medium.com/@tomaspuero/coronavirus-act-today-or-people-will-die-f4d3d9cd99ca>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 16, 2020 8:19 PM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

A couple of quibbles...

Firstly, the aspirations of Pure Land Buddhists are usually directed toward the Happy Land (Sukhāvatī) rather than Happy Farting (Sukhavāti).

Secondly, I believe among Japanese Amidist priests, those of Shinran's Jōdo Shin school greatly outnumber those of Hōnen's Jōdo school. Of the two, it's only the priests in the latter minority school who can be said to be "striving for birth in Sukhāvatī" (i.e. by mantra recitations, petitionary prayers etc.). Those of the Jodo Shinshū believe there's nothing to strive for: their birth in Sukhāvatī is assured and so their religious life consists in saying thank you to Amida, not in asking him for anything.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2020 2:40 AM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

In the commentaries it would be explained with reference to the idea that both jhānic and ariyan attainment depend on possession of a triple-rooted life-continuum (tihetuka bhavaṅga), i.e., one with the full complement of three wholesome roots. Certain congenital abnormalities, including the two in question, were viewed as symptomatic of the rebirth-linking consciousness (and thus of the subsequent bhavaṅga) being at best double-rooted, i.e. of lacking the wholesome root of non-delusion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2020 9:38 AM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

Since the ubhatobyañjanaka is included in Vinaya's short list of persons absolutely disqualified from ordaining, it would seem that long before the Milindapañha this was seen as a deeply problematic condition, even though no explanation was offered as to why this was so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2020 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science

Content:

It seems quite unremarkable to me. In most religions apologetics is something that only a tiny minority of enthusiasts concern themselves with, while apologetics involving scientific testing interests only a minority of a minority. And so the fact that very few Buddhists can be bothered, say, to pursue Ian Stevenson's brand of research (or even to read the man), or to engage in hypnosis aimed at past-life regression, or to master the rebirth "proofs" of Dharmakīrti (if they're of a Tibetan persuasion) is no more remarkable than the fact that few Christians can be bothered to take part in experiments aimed at testing the efficacy of healing prayer. Religious people, by and large, have other fish to fry.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 17, 2020 1:18 PM

Title: Re: Where does the Universal Well-Being chant come from?

Content:

This is from the Abhiṇhapaccavekkhitabbāhāna Sutta, AN 5.57, et al.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2020 5:39 AM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

I don't think it's worth worrying about, for the task is the same regardless of what one is capable or incapable of achieving in the present life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 18, 2020 3:07 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science

Content:

There's really no "if" about it. A fideistic approach to the Dhamma is the Buddhist norm; it's how the vast majority of Buddhists go about things. In certain Mahayana schools fideism's the only game in town, but even in the Theravada a critical or skeptical approach to the Dhamma is the exception. The suttas frankly acknowledge this and don't privilege one approach over the other.

As to why the Buddha would bother to state his credentials, the first thing to note is that most of the time he doesn't. That is, in the great majority of suttas he simply teaches the Dhamma to some enquirer and says nothing at all about himself. On those occasions

when he does do so (e.g. before teaching the five ascetics in the Deer Park), it seems to be with the aim of getting the listeners into an appropriately receptive frame of mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2020 1:39 AM

Title: Re: The ethics of being indifferent about whether one harms others

Content:

I doubt anyone has ever claimed that such a monk would be blameless. What might be claimed (and rightly so) is that a monk who neglected to save somebody's life wouldn't on that account be held guilty of the third pārājika offence (homicide). But we're talking here about a purely legal judgment: since the third pārājika rule prohibits killing but doesn't impose any positive obligation to save lives, it's impossible to transgress it by doing nothing. But the absence of such an obligation under the terms of this training rule doesn't mean that no blame would attach to a monk who could easily have saved someone but neglected to do so. Being merely not guilty of a particular pārājika doesn't equate with all-round blamelessness. For example, if a monk embarks on a criminal career of mugging old ladies and stealing schoolchildren's dinner money, he could avoid committing the second pārājika simply by never extracting more than five māsakas from each of his victims. But though this precaution will prevent his being held guilty of pārājika, I don't suppose many Buddhists will call him blameless!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2020 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science

Content:

Your Lourdes comment was a counter to my point that only a minority of religious people occupy themselves with evidentiary apologetics. But it was an irrelevant counter since the Lourdes pilgrimage wasn't intended to serve any such purpose.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 20, 2020 9:31 PM

Title: Re: The ethics of being indifferent about whether one harms others

Content:

I would say that to ask such a question is to miss the point. The divine abidings are abstract Platonic meditations to be optimally developed by a socially uninvolved quietistic hermit living in a cave or under a tree, and for the sake of becoming a super-yogi (and thence an arahant), not a super-philanthropist or a super-boy-scout. If you don't agree, I invite you to re-read the first and last lines of the Metta Sutta to refresh your memory on how the whole thing is framed.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 22, 2020 8:42 AM
Title: Re: Shared karma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 22, 2020 1:31 PM
Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 22, 2020 3:30 PM
Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science
Content:
You are putting the cart before the horse.

A correct understanding of how arahants behave should be based on how the texts describe their behaviour, not on fancies plucked out of thin air.

Armed with this understanding you will then be in a position to pose informed questions. I mean questions similar in character to those which King Milinda asked Nāgasena: "Given that the suttas predicate quality x of the Buddha, how come the Buddha was capable of doing action y? Isn't action y at odds with quality x?"

Then, armed with answers to these questions, you'll finally be in a position to construct an arahant-testing kit that's grounded in what the texts actually say about arahants rather than your own ungrounded and fanciful figments.

But if you can't even be bothered to ascertain what sort of behaviour the texts attribute to the Buddha and his arahant disciples, then by all means continue with your needle-haired yakkha talk.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Mar 22, 2020 4:33 PM
Title: Re: "Venerable Buddhaghosa was a Hindu!"
Content:

1. Find a sutta passage that is at odds with the view of one or another of Hinduism's six

darśanas and see how Buddhaghosa interprets it.

2. If he attempts to harmonize the sutta passage with the said darśana, then we can conclude that he was a Hindu.

3. If he upholds the incompatibility of the two, then we can conclude that he was not an adherent of that darśana. He might, however, have been a Hindu belonging to one of the other five.

4. Repeat 1-3 with sutta passages that are at odds with the other five darśanas. If we find (as we surely will) that the commentator consistently interprets each passage in a way that upholds its incompatibility with the darśana in question, then we may rightly conclude that he was not a Hindu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 22, 2020 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth admission would collapse modern science

Content:

Not my problem, for I don't even believe in the possibility of an arahant testing kit and I think anyone who bothers to acquaint himself with what the texts predicate of arahants would come to the same conclusion. The most that could be done would be to disprove that so-and-so is an arahant, but even that could only be done if the claimant were to give himself away by either expressing some view that an arahant couldn't hold or indulging in some behaviour that the texts say is impossible for an arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2020 7:16 AM

Title: Re: "Venerable Buddhaghosa was a Hindu!"

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2020 8:38 AM

Title: Re: "Venerable Buddhaghosa was a Hindu!"

Content:

I think you might be confusing Buddhaghosa with the Chinese translator Xuanzang. It's reported of the latter that he was once challenged to a debate by a brahmin. The terms of the debate was that whoever lost would both convert and become the other's slave for life. It's said that Xuanzang treated his slave well.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 23, 2020 7:01 PM

Title: Re: Rapture during Breath Meditation

Content:

It's found in three suttas in the Majjhima Nikāya

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn39>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn77>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn119>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2020 8:47 AM

Title: Re: "Venerable Buddhaghosa was a Hindu!"

Content:

The Cārvākas were hardcore materialists like Ajita of the Hairy Blanket and as such had nothing to say about karma, except to deny its efficacy.

Your phrase "Cārvākan school of Hinduism" is a contradiction in terms. The Hindus classed the Cārvākas as nāstikas, along with Buddhists, Jains, Ājīvikas and Ajñanas. In fact the Cārvākas were regarded as the very worst sort of nāstikas, for whereas the other four were content to merely deny the authority of the Vedas, the Cārvākas rejected matters of the spirit tout court.

I suspect what you mean, however, is the Sāṃkhya school of Hinduism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 24, 2020 6:23 PM

Title: Re: "Venerable Buddhaghosa was a Hindu!"

Content:

No.

"Heretical in the eyes of Hindus" \neq "An heretical school of Hinduism".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2020 8:49 AM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

Of the thirteen rules, although #5 can be broken even by an arahant, and #6 and #7 can be broken with only lightly akusala intention, the remaining ten all seem to involve very weighty akusala.

That being so, I would guess that a bhikkhu who commits one will likely be hindered by strong remorse if he hasn't yet confessed, undergone the mānatta penance and been rehabilitated.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2020 10:10 AM

Title: Re: Four Bases of Meritorious Qualities

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2020 3:42 PM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

What do you mean?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2020 6:48 PM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

The chapter of monks residing on the donated land, and (if the law requires it) whichever secular authorities have jurisdiction in the matter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 25, 2020 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Is Nature Self Aware?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 8:28 AM

Title: Re: Canki Sutta: What is meant by conviction?

Content:

Your question assumes that the decision to visit is always a reasoned one. The traditional Buddhist assumption, on the other hand, is that merely getting to hear about the Buddha or his teaching is due to the ripening of some past wholesome kamma, while being moved to go and pay him a visit or to learn more about his teaching would be attributed to other past life conditions (chiefly what the Abhidhamma calls 'natural decisive support condition'). And so the brahmin Sela, for example, feels moved to go and visit the Buddha merely after hearing the word 'buddho' mentioned at a wedding feast.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 2:27 PM

Title: Re: Yamaka Sutta ideas - please help

Content:

Several phrases are used in polemical texts...

Na sundaram – "inelegant". Used when what is said is not actually wrong but has been clumsily or misleadingly expressed.

Na yujjati or na yuttam – "Not tenable." Used when what is said is wrong.

Chaḍḍaniyam – "To be discarded [like rubbish]." Used when what is said is wrong and you want to be mildly rude.

Saṅkārayakkhavācā - "The words of a rubbish heap demon!" Used when what is said is wrong and you want to be very rude.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 3:04 PM

Title: Re: Canki Sutta: What is meant by conviction?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 3:41 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma for difficult times - resources

Content:

Four talks on the Ratana Sutta by Ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi.

.

.

.

.

Accompanying handout:

[./download/file.php?id=5570](#)
(48.88 KiB) Downloaded 55 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 7:57 PM

Title: Re: Canki Sutta: What is meant by conviction?

Content:

If you wish. But the sound "buddho" didn't affect any of the other guests at the wedding feast. Why only Sela? Reportedly the gut feeling was the consequence (via natural decisive support condition) of Sela's having built a mansion for Padumuttara Buddha in a former life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 27, 2020 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Canki Sutta: What is meant by conviction?

Content:

Yes, I take your point.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2020 7:08 AM

Title: Re: How is the coronavirus affecting your Dhamma practice?

Content:

Nearly two pages of off-topic posts removed. Do please pay attention to the thread title.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2020 5:25 PM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

The duration of the punishment may be short or long or indefinite, depending on how the offender conducts himself. Ajahn Thanissaro deals with it in Buddhist Monastic Code book II ch 20.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2020 6:14 PM

Title: Re: The Great Vegetarian Debate

Content:

This seems empirically false to me.

I've called myself a Buddhist for forty years and this morning I consumed grilled muntjac ribs without the slightest difficulty.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 30, 2020 10:08 PM

Title: Re: The Great Vegetarian Debate

Content:

They're hillbillies who eat whatever greens, roots and berries the village women can forage in the nearby woods, and whatever animals or birds the village men can shoot with their homemade muskets. The latter on a typical day will be mostly squirrels and pheasants, but occasionally they'll get lucky and come home with a wild pig or a muntjac.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2020 4:37 PM

Title: Re: Information about Abhidhamma

Content:

There's no belief about the origins of any Buddhist text that is entirely uncontested. "Uncontestedness" can be truthfully asserted only when we confine ourselves to some limited sphere of opinion. For example, your view regarding the lateness of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka will probably be uncontested by professors of Buddhist studies in secular universities. The contrary view (i.e., that the Abhidhamma was taught by the Buddha in elaborated form to the deva Santussita and in condensed form to Ven. Sāriputta), will be uncontested in all the Abhidhamma schools and in most of the

monasteries of Myanmar and Thailand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2020 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Dry Insight and Stream-Entry

Content:

Those suttas (e.g., AN 9.12) in which the sotāpanna and sakadāgāmin are said to be "fulfillers with respect to moral habit" (sīlesu paripūrakārī), but not "fulfillers with respect to concentration" (samādhismiṃ paripūrakārī), in contrast with the anāgāmin and arahant who are fulfillers with respect to both.

Also, all the narratives of people meeting the Buddha for the first time and attaining sotāpatti not while meditating but either while listening to a Dhamma talk or while thinking afterwards about the content of the talk.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 31, 2020 9:22 PM

Title: Re: Diṭṭhaṃ suttaṃ mutaṃ viññātaṃ pattaṃ pariyesitaṃ anuvicaritaṃ manasā...

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2020 4:27 PM

Title: Re: What are the karma which cause inability to attain 4 stages of enlightenment in this very life?

Content:

Arahants can be said to be subject to the law of kamma in the sense that they may still experience the vipāka of wholesome and unwholesome kammās they performed before attaining arahatta.

Arahants can be said to be free from the law of kamma in the sense that any actions they perform after arahatta generate neither wholesome nor unwholesome kamma.

An arahant who killed someone by accident would be innocent of any Vinaya offence. If it happened that the state prosecuted and punished him, the relationship between the accidental killing and the punishment would not be an example of a kamma and its vipāka. In other words, not every result of an action is called a vipāka; a vipāka is a very particular kind of result.

Suppose, for example, that the state's punishing of the arahant causes him some bodily pain. It might be that this pain is an akusala vipāka, but it would not be the akusala

vipāka of the accidental killing (being accidental, the killing wouldn't have been a kammic action at all, not even if a non-arahant had performed it). It would have to be the vipāka of some presently-unripened (and unknown) ill deed done before arahatta was attained.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2020 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?

Content:

Unless you are prepared to argue that it's only meat-eaters, and not vegetarians, who can be self-deceived about the intentions that underlie their food purchases, then bringing up the possibility of such self-deception is blatantly a red herring. The fact that a vegetarian can be just as self-deceived as a meat-eater (as a matter of fact, I think vegetarians are MORE likely to be self-deceived in this matter ... but that's an argument for another day) means that the possible self-deception on both sides cancel each other out, making it an irrelevant consideration.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 4, 2020 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Samanera precepts render invalid for bhikkhu ?

Content:

Whatever set of sīla is undertaken later will wholly abrogate and supersede any set of sīla that was undertaken earlier and without any need for the older set to be formally renounced

For example, if a five-precept-keeper takes the eight precepts, then the third-precept obligation to avoid sex with unsuitable partners will be replaced by an obligation to refrain from all sex. If an eight-precept-keeper takes the five precepts, then he'll be free again to have sex with suitable partners, eat after midday, sleep on high beds, etc., even though he never formally renounced his undertaking to abstain from these things.

Similarly, when a sāmaṇera takes higher ordination, his 10 precept commitment will be abrogated and superseded by his obligation to train by the rules in the Pāṭimokkha and the Khandhakas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2020 11:02 AM

Title: Re: What happened to the 84000 temples built by King Asoka?

Content:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Decline_of_Buddhism_in_the_Indian_subcontinent

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2020 12:06 PM

Title: Re: Samanera precepts render invalid for bhikkhu ?

Content:

The Khandhakas are the Vinaya texts containing all the rules that fall outside the 227 that get recited in the fortnightly uposatha meetings. In the Pali Vinaya they comprise the Mahāvagga and Cūḷavagga.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2020 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2020 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources

Content:

Pyi Phyoo Kyaw's doctoral thesis:

Conditional Relations in Burmese Buddhism

<https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/83947018.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 5, 2020 9:03 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

I don't understand your point. Pascal, Samvara and I were talking about being self-deceived regarding one's gastronomic intentions. Playing dumb about them is something else altogether. Indeed the two things are virtually the opposite of each other. A person playing dumb aims to deceive others. A self-deceived person isn't playing dumb; he is dumb - at least with regard to whatever it is he is self-deceived about.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2020 6:56 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Do you happen to know if there's a digital copy of the full text of Nārada's Guide? I know the second volume is available from archive.org but I haven't been able to find the first volume anywhere.

<https://archive.org/details/ConditionalRelGuideToCRPIIVol2/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2020 7:05 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

I recall you saying recently that you're a Hindu brahmin by birth. Do you read Hindi? If so, then you can get Bhikkhu Jagadish Kashyap's 6-volume Hindi translation from archive.org

Just search the site for "Paṭṭhāna" and then select the versions that have been scanned well.

<https://archive.org/search.php?query=Pa%E1%B9%AD%E1%B9%ADh%C4%81na>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2020 10:38 PM

Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?

Content:

<http://www.aimwell.org/DPPN/garula.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 6, 2020 10:45 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

Thanks a lot for the link. I haven't actually read volume 2. Though I've had it for quite a while I was putting off tackling it until I could get hold of volume 1.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 7, 2020 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Papanca

Content:

Nor do the Pali commentaries every gloss it this way.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 7, 2020 11:39 PM
Title: Re: Lockdown Stress
Content:
<https://suttacentral.net/mn20/en/horner>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 8, 2020 5:17 AM
Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate
Content:

Sure. And that knowledge may lead the more sensitive and thoughtful among them to adopt a vegetarian diet on the basis of the sort of arguments proposed by secular advocates of vegetarianism. But they go too far when they try to argue that this is something required by Buddhist sīla or that one would be performing unwholesome kamma by not following their example.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 8, 2020 3:09 PM
Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate
Content:

It's a case of 'may' rather than 'does'. In both Buddhist kamma theory and Vinaya case adjudication the relationship between one's anticipation of the likely outcomes of an action and the intention that prompts the action doesn't involve the kind of inevitability that some simple-minded vegetarian Buddhists insist on assigning to it. Why? Because though agents may have foreknowledge of a plurality of likely outcomes of their actions they are held to intend only one of these and it is this, and this alone, that determines the action's moral tone.

For example, when a vegetarian drives to the supermarket to buy some frozen peas, if it's a hot summer's day it might occur to her that if she goes ahead with her decision it will most likely result in a host of bugs coming to their death on her car windscreen. If she's a scrupulous Jain this thought will stop her in her tracks. If she's a Buddhist it won't (or at least it needn't). The vegetarian Buddhist, if she understands kamma doctrine correctly, knows that by proceeding as planned she will not be breaking the first precept if any bugs do get splattered, for her intention is to go and buy frozen peas, not to splatter bugs.

The Vinaya is quite explicit on this: when bhikkhus sweep the leaves on a forest path they know that their sweeping, however carefully done, will be sure to kill an insect or two. But provided their intention is merely to sweep the path and not to kill insects they will not be required to confess a breach of the training rule against killing animals.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 9, 2020 12:41 AM

Title: Re: Coronavirus

Content:

A useful tip if she's called upon to conduct a Coronavirus wedding.

.

[./download/file.php?id=5586&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 9, 2020 3:34 PM

Title: Re: Arguments

Content:

Your claim is that the avyākata questions were invented "centuries after the Buddha". So that would mean they date from a time when Indian Buddhism had split into a couple of dozen competing schools. How odd, then, that they should all end up with an identical list of questions not to be answered! Not just the mainstream schools, but even the Mahayanists. How do you suppose that happened? Did the heavy-handed abbots all copy each other's list of questions? Didn't even one heavy-handed abbot have the imagination to come up with a list of his own?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Arguments

Content:

When I stated that the Indian schools preserved identical lists of questions, this observation wasn't intended to refer only to what can be gleaned from presently extant canonical texts. To take one example, we know that exposition of the avyākata questions, and the polemical invoking of these, was a major concern among the four or five Pudgalavādin schools. We know this despite the fact that no Pudgalavādin recension of the Tripiṭaka has survived. We know it both from the surviving Pudgalavādin śāstras and from the arguments attributed to the Pudgalavādins in the polemical texts of their opponents.

So again, how would this have come about? Did heavy-handed Pudgalavādin abbots borrow the list from heavy-handed Sarvāstivādin abbots? Did they both borrow it from heavy-handed Theravādin abbots? And what about the Sautrāntikas? Those guys had no use even for Abhidharma texts, let alone Mahāyāna ones. So how did their heavy-

handed abbots come by the list?

And again, why didn't the heavy-handed abbots of each school just make up their distinctive lists?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 1:06 AM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

That's probably because you live in a country where most of the snakes are non-venomous.

Now before I address the rest of your points, I should like to ask if you would mind clarifying the purpose of your post. Is it your contention that, (1) I am misrepresenting the Theravādin teaching on kamma, sīla and ahimsā, or (2) that the Theravāda is misrepresenting the Buddha's teaching on these matters, or (3) that the Buddha himself was in error and perhaps should have taught these things differently?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Arahants

Content:

The full account of the debate is here...

<https://suttacentral.net/kv1.2/en/aung-rhysdavids>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Arguments

Content:

The Mahayanists in Indian Buddhism were in no position to tyrannize anyone. Their status was rather like that of the charismatic movement in modern Christianity, in the sense that they were a movement that had no independent existence (at least not until a very late period) but rather arose within several mainstream Buddhist schools and came to be frowned at but tolerated in some (e.g., the Sarvāstivāda) and rigorously suppressed in others (e.g., the Mahāvihāra Theravāda). But even in those schools which tolerated them the Mahāyānists were a small minority and in no position to go throwing their weight around.

As for the "wiping out" of schools by the Mahayana, I take it you mean the fact that the Sarvāstivāda and Dharmaguptaka schools eventually became wholly Mahāyāna in their

doctrinal allegiance. But this is a state of affairs that arose outside of India and dates from a far later time than that which is under consideration here (i.e., in connection with the avyākata questions). That being so, it would make no sense at all to appeal to the Mahāyāna hegemony in East Asia or Tibet as a way of accounting for the avyākata questions being the common property of all Indian Buddhist schools.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 2:41 AM
Title: Re: Arguments
Content:
I see.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 3:49 AM
Title: Re: Buddhism, the Bhagavad Gīta and the Mahābhārata
Content:
According to Vaishnavite sources the Bhagavad Gīta has existed since the very beginning of the recreation of the universe after the last mahāpralaya. It was first taught to Sūrya, the sun god, two million years ago, and most recently to Arjuna 5,000 years ago.

For Vaishnavites of a fundamentalist persuasion (e.g., the ISKCON folks) these figures are to be taken literally and the bhakti texts that report them would count as evidence. For historians they would be unsupported faith claims.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 4:34 AM
Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa an Ajivikan?
Content:
When Buddhaghosa is quoting the ancients' refutations of Makkhalī's views, then he will also quote the views themselves. Otherwise no.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 8:19 AM
Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa an Ajivikan?
Content:
If Buddhaghosa had held the view that you attribute to him in the first part of your post, then it would have been illogical of him to also hold that a living being is liberated after X number of births. Rather, he would have held that "living being" is just a meaningless

noise with no referent of any sort and so even the option of describing liberation with reference to impersonal processes in a mental continuum would have been unavailable to him.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 11:07 AM
Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa an Ajivikan?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 11:25 AM
Title: Re: Was Buddhaghosa an Ajivikan?
Content:
No. The expressions "doesn't obtain" (na upalabbhati) or "isn't to be found" (na vijjati) are Indian ways of saying "does not exist".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 1:06 PM
Title: Re: Information about Abhidhamma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 1:14 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism, the Bhagavad Gīta and the Mahābhārata
Content:
I did read it when I was a teenager. Not having re-read it since then, I'm afraid my memory of it is much too rusty for me to give an informed answer to your first two questions. As for the third, there are lots of English translations and some are available online. I've no idea which one is considered the best by those qualified to judge the matter. No_Mind or Binocular might know.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 10, 2020 2:28 PM
Title: Re: Dhamma for difficult times - resources
Content:

The English monk Ven. Bodhidhamma, a Mahasi-trained teacher and founder of the Satipanya Buddhist Retreat Centre, is giving daily talks on his youtube channel. The live talks seem to get deleted as soon as they're over, so to catch them it's a good idea to subscribe so as to be notified.

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC9VUwz45IDTMak1Qk-pMCVw/featured>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2020 12:21 AM

Title: Re: basic doubt but important

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2020 1:29 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

When asked, Ajahn Chah denied that he was an arahant and said that he still had a lot more work to do. So I was told by my former preceptor, Ajahn Khemadhammo.

As I recall, the arahantship accusation started to be levelled against him almost immediately after his death in 1992. By about 1994 it had become a fait accompli that Ajahn Chah had been an arahant when alive, despite his own protestation to the contrary. I don't know why. Perhaps it was a case of devoted disciples thinking: "the true Messiah always denies his own divinity".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2020 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

The two monks who've influenced and inspired me the most are most certainly innocent of the charge. I don't mind at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 11, 2020 6:47 PM

Title: Re: Celibacy is the one thing that cannot be dropped. Change my mind.

Content:

The Buddha seems to have taken a different view, for in the Vinaya a Buddhist householder who wants to ordain can do so at once, while a renunciate ascetic in an

outside teaching is required to first undergo a period of probation. This seems to indicate that right view was deemed a primary concern and a disposition to celibacy a secondary one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2020 7:10 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism, the Bhagavad Gita and the Mahābhārata

Content:

The figure usually given by neo-pagans and loony feminists is nine million victims for the whole of Europe. This wiki entry gives an account of the figure's dodgy history:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Feminist_interpretations_of_the_Early_Modern_witch_trials

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2020 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

The short answer is that a mental continuum in which mundane right view has never arisen will be one in which the two conditions for the arising of supramundane right view ("the voice of another" and "proper attention") are absent. And so it will not be possible.

A more detailed answer based on the Peṭakopadesa and Nettippakaraṇa, and Dhammapāla's commentary to the latter...

1. Supramundane right view arises dependent on two conditions, one external, the other internal.
2. The external cause is parato ghosa, "the voice of another", meaning some kind of encounter with a correct exposition of the Dhamma, or rather of those elements of the Dhamma that are specifically concerned with generating supramundane right view.
3. The internal cause is yoniso manasikāra, proper attention.
4. An encounter with "the voice of another" is dependent on a past cause: dānamaya puñña, merit consisting in the giving of gifts.
5. The arising of "proper attention" is dependent on two causes, one present and one past.
6. The present cause is cintāmayā paññā, understanding consisting in thinking.
7. The past cause is sīlamaya puñña, merit consisting in moral habits.

8. The past merit referred to in #4 and #7 is not just any kind of dānamaya or sīlamaya puñña. Rather, it is dānamaya and sīlamaya puñña generated by a ñāṇasampayutta mahākusalacitta, a great wholesome consciousness associated with insight.

9. Any meritorious act proceeding from a great wholesome consciousness associated with insight will be accompanied by mundane right view.

Conversely...

1. A being in whom mundane right view is habitually absent, or wrong view habitually present, may perform both meritorious and demeritorious deeds, but the former will not be generated by great wholesome consciousnesses associated with insight.

2. Not being generated by wholesome consciousnesses associated with insight, the merit will not be of the kind required to give rise to an encounter with the "voice of another" or the arising of "proper attention".

Etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2020 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Readers of Dhamma Wheel who haven't given any gifts in the present life, or who have given gifts but have never held mundane right view, will get to encounter the voice of another owing to dānamaya puñña made in a former life when they did hold mundane right view.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2020 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 12, 2020 9:40 PM

Title: Re: My concerns and doubts about Buddhism and Buddhists

Content:

Why should it? As the Dhamma is more easily admired than practised, surely the odd thing would be if there were no discrepancy.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 6:28 AM

Title: Re: numerology of EBT sutta numbering

Content:

Given that the Hindu-Arabic decimal system wasn't invented until early in the Common Era, it's unlikely that the sutta-reciters would have thought of "a hundred and eleven" as comprising three ones, any more than they would have thought of the number as comprising a C, an X and an I (as it would have been in Rome).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 10:07 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 10:37 AM

Title: Re: Clinging aggregates and what is that self view

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Clinging aggregates and what is that self view

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/mn76/en/horner>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 10:56 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

To me too.

Though to be fair I should add that even in the Ajahn Mun tradition explosive ajahns are the exception, not the norm. Much more common are quiet and retiring fellows like Ajahns Khao, Thate and Waen.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism, the Bhagavad Gīta and the Mahābhārata

Content:

You are confusing dāna ('giving', from the root dā, to give) with dhana ('wealth', from the root dhā, to divide).

Neither of the two has any connection with sādhana, which the ancient Sanskrit grammarians derived from the root sādḥ, to succeed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 12:34 PM

Title: Re: Programming is wrong livelihood?

Content:

The translation is fine. As the full list of low arts that are improper livelihoods includes the practice of medicine, it's obvious that it's not intended to refer to householders' ways of making their living. For example, we don't find the Buddha suggesting to Jīvaka the physician that he ought to find some other way of earning his daily bread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 2:03 PM

Title: Re: My concerns and doubts about Buddhism and Buddhists

Content:

The actually lived religion would be my criterion too, but I would base my judgment on a religion's virtuosos, not its manyfolk.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Presumably they are posters who don't look upon the texts I mentioned as valid sources. I'm not sure whether their views could be shown mistaken on the basis of the first four Nikāyas alone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 2:48 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

No, not a mental breakdown, but first motor neuronal problems and then loss of consciousness until his death several years later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 3:12 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

A meritorious kamma belonging to the sense sphere can be carried out by a consciousness associated with knowledge (*ñāṇasampayutta citta*) or a consciousness dissociated from knowledge (*ñāṇavippayutta citta*). What differentiates them is whether or not the mental factor of non-delusion (*amoha cetasika*, = *paññā*) is present or absent. When this factor is present, then the giving of a gift, for example, will be done with the understanding that the act is kusala. To understand an act as kusala is to understand that it's nature is to ripen as sukha. One giving a gift with this understanding can be said to possess mundane right view, for all of the ten propositions that constitute mundane right view ("There is what is given, etc.") are just variant expressions of a single principle: ownership of kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 5:47 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

I don't think you will find very much. None of the three was at all given to self-advertisement.

The late U Dhammānanda is highly regarded among Pali scholars in Thailand for his having introduced the Burmese pariyatti system here, but isn't much known outside of Pali study circles. The late Phra George is now probably little known outside of Austria, where, after disrobing, he spent his last ten years or so running a meditation centre in Vienna. Ajahn Sanit is hardly known outside the sub-district of Lamphun where his monastery is located.

[./download/file.php?id=5590&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 6:36 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

is in the Suttas called "right view affected by taints, partaking of merit, ripening in the acquisitions" or "right view as a wholesome kammic course".

In the Abhidhamma's Dhammasaṅgaṇī it's called "accomplishment/success in view", diṭṭhisampadā.

In the Abhidhamma's Vibhaṅga it's called "knowledge of ownership of kamma", kammassakatañña.

In the commentaries it's called "mundane right view", lokiya sammādiṭṭhi.

None of these four terms is applied to understanding dependent arising.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 6:49 PM

Title: Re: Programming is wrong livelihood?

Content:

By analogy with butchery it would be wrong livelihood in the case of the owner of the company and those employees who are required to kill the mice or to give the order for them to be killed. It wouldn't be wrong livelihood for those employed in unrelated activities.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 7:11 PM

Title: Re: My concerns and doubts about Buddhism and Buddhists

Content:

If they're so inclined they could do as I do. If not, there isn't really any general suggestion I can make, for different people will be satisfied with different things.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 7:17 PM

Title: Re: numerology of EBT sutta numbering

Content:

Maybe. The problem is that afaik we don't know how old that numbering system is either. In the Abhidhamma Piṭaka we meet also with a system of numbering paragraphs by the letters of the Pali alphabet. Did this come later? Or might it be a relic of an older numbering system that was once used for the Suttas too?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 7:26 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Nobody is disputing that. But the meaning of mundane and supramundane right view isn't a matter of opinion. The texts give both terms clear definitions and only the latter has to do with insight-related topics like dependent arising.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 13, 2020 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

If that's what it was, then the texts would have defined it so. They didn't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 6:08 AM

Title: Re: Programming is wrong livelihood?

Content:

The common translations of tiracchāna as "debased", "animal" or "bestial" are excessively negative. If it wasn't such an unfortunate double entendre, the literal translation "horizontal arts" would capture the sense best. The basic idea is that these are arts/skills of a kind that don't lead upwards, i.e., to jhāna, dispassion, cessation, nibbāna. For this reason they're improper for a samaṇa to be occupying himself with, being distractions from the pursuit of jhāna, etc. They are not improper for a householders, whose lives are either not devoted to the same ends as a samaṇa or are at least are not devoted to them with the same intensity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 6:40 AM

Title: Re: Asubha

Content:

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.119.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 7:09 AM
Title: Re: Veram
Content:
There's no connection.

Veramaṇī is from viramati; vera from *vīrayati (a verb found only in grammars).

Ironically it's vera, not veramaṇī, that's related to 'virtue'.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 12:20 PM
Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana
Content:
Are you referring to Arthid Sheravanichkul's paper in that book?

If so, then "historically" here just means "in Siam for a short period in the late 19th and early 20th centuries".

What Sheravanichkul reports happening is that some upper-class Siamese were educated at international schools by foreign teachers using English language textbooks. And so they learned their Buddhism from reading the likes of Rhys Davids, E.J. Thomas, Max Muller, etc. And from these writers they learned that there were two types of Buddhism, the Hīnayāna and the Mahāyāna and that the Buddhism of Siam was of the former type. And so they came to make this usage their own.

In Burma and Sri Lanka there was apparently a parallel trend among Buddhists who were educated at British colonial schools. Indeed in Sri Lanka the use of "Hīnayāna" seems to have continued for quite a long time among the native Buddhist intelligentsia. I recall in Iceland I used to know a very old Sinhalese lady who had been educated at a posh girls' school in Kandy. She had then lived most of her life abroad, working for the UN, and become cut off from her Sinhalese and Buddhist roots. At our first meeting she struggled to recall the "facts" about Buddhism that had been instilled in her as a girl, at one point asking:

"Reverend, do please remind me ... I'm always getting the two mixed up ... are we Sinhalese Buddhists the Hīnayāna or are we the Mahāyāna?"

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 12:42 PM
Title: Re: Translation of ma189 parallel to mn117

Content:

"Not parallel" because they're different.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 7:11 PM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

When I first came here in 1985 it was still common to hear upper-class Thais educated at Prince Royal's College refer to the bhikkhusaṅgha as "the Buddhist church" and sāmaṇeras as "deacons" (terms used by Henry Clarke Warren in his 1896 Buddhism in Translations). Even to this day the hospital for Buddhist monks in Bangkok is called...

.

Priest Hospital.jpg (63.19 KiB) Viewed 3823 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 14, 2020 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

As this is the General Theravada rather than the Connected Paths Forum, I've moved to a new thread a sub-thread that seemed to have at best a highly tenuous connection with Theravada teaching.

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?f=16&t=36821>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Transcendental Right View without first having Mundane Right View?

Content:

Cyclical? Did the Buddha ever say: "With death as condition arises ignorance"?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Questions from Student

Content:

I believe the private messaging function becomes operative after a new member has

sent three or four posts, so you're nearly there.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 8:57 AM

Title: Re: Is Cannabis oil available in pharmacy in Thailand?

Content:

I've often seen it in the medical stores of Thai monasteries, which means it's probably quite readily available – the sort of thing that you could buy at Boots.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 12:19 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism, Bhagavad Gīta, Mahābhārata, witch-burning etc.

Content:

Then do so if you wish to make such allegations.

Now back to the Bhagavad Gīta...

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Mundane vs supermundane jhana

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 6:06 PM

Title: Re: Doubt about buddha's dhamma propagation

Content:

Perhaps when the Buddha scanned the universe he divined that all the humans with the greatest potential for enlightenment happened to be living in Magadha and Kosala, while Rome and Athens were inhabited by persons with little accumulation of paññā pāramī who had all been dung beetles in their former life.

Now that would account for it! As would any of half a dozen or so other speculations that I might dream up if I put my mind to it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 15, 2020 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Doubt about buddha's dhamma propagation

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism, Bhagavad Gīta, Mahābhārata, witch-burning etc.

Content:

By all means report any post you see that you believe violates the TOS.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 8:31 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism, Bhagavad Gīta, Mahābhārata, witch-burning etc.

Content:

Off-topic posts removed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Asubha

Content:

Buddhaghosa's warning finds much anecdotal support from stories emanating from the Ajahn Mun tradition, where asubha is much emphasised. In the typical story the monk ends up going haywire and having sexual fantasies about the female corpse he keeps staring at.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 3:05 PM

Title: Re: What is Pajanati?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 3:30 PM

Title: Re: Full Awakening via Mindfulness of Death Or Corpse

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 4:23 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach we have choice? (aka The Great Free Will v Determinism Debate)

Content:

To argue, "Someone of Makkhali's view would reject free will, therefore someone who rejects free will would be of Makkhali's view" is to commit the fallacy of affirming the consequent. $(P \rightarrow Q, Q) \rightarrow P$

There are countless views besides Makkhali's which, if held, would logically entail the rejection of free will.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach we have choice? (aka The Great Free Will v Determinism Debate)

Content:

An afterthought...

It occurs to me that there's a more elementary problem in beanyan's argument: rejection of free will would not necessarily be entailed by Makkhali's view, at least as we know it from the suttas. To hold that the actions beings perform are soteriologically irrelevant because everybody is liberated after they've reincarnated enough times doesn't amount to taking any particular stand on the free will question. That is, it would be equally compatible with a determinist, a voluntarist or a compatibilist understanding of willed actions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 10:31 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist Paradoxes I Still don't understand

Content:

You've misunderstood what I wrote. My point wasn't that he was formerly acclaimed an arahant but now isn't. It's the other way round. He wasn't formerly acclaimed an arahant but now is.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Liberation only within the Dhamma

Content:

Cūḷasīhanādasutta, MN 11: Other samaṇas and brāhmaṇas might teach full comprehension of the first three kinds of upādāna, but not the fourth.

Sekhasutta, SN 48:53: No other samaṇa teaches so true a Dhamma.

Kosambiyasutta, MN 48: No other samaṇa or brāhmaṇa possessed of a view such as I possess.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 16, 2020 11:47 PM

Title: Re: Liberation only within the Dhamma

Content:

It's not reckoned as happening outside, for every Paccekabuddha needs to have been first "triggered" by a Sammāsambuddha in a former life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2020 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Intention

Content:

One would be acting with the thought of harming. The unwholesome kamma would probably be exacerbated by one's wrong views that the victim was doing something bad and that shooting him is doing something good.

I've left unanswered those where I don't think enough detail has been given.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2020 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha teach we have choice? (aka The Great Free Will v Determinism Debate)

Content:

So forget the afterthought. But the earlier post still stands.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2020 1:53 AM

Title: Re: Intention

Content:

I prefer to make this my last post in this thread.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: what is problem with yogacara school ?

Content:

Almost entirely the latter. It does still survive in Japan as the Hossō sect but like with most of Japan's old-but-very-tiny sects the survival is only nominal, with its priests occupied with caretaking tourist temples, not with the study and exposition of Yogācārin texts or the practice of Yogācārin methods.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 17, 2020 5:55 PM

Title: Re: what is problem with yogacara school ?

Content:

Thanks for the correction. I was repeating what I had been told by a Shingon monk, which was to the effect that all the six schools of Nara were either extinct (like the Sanron-shū/Mādhyamaka) or more or less moribund.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 18, 2020 6:09 PM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

I don't the matter is quite as simple as you represent it. As I see it, there are two uses of śrāvakayāna that are offensive and two that are not:

1. Inoffensive when used merely as a term for the path that leads to arahantship.
2. Inoffensive (at least in intent) when modern Mahayanists use it in order to avoid using the 'H' word.
3. Offensive when applied to a non-Mahayana Buddhist school to assert the Mahayana polemical claim that non-Mahayanists understand only #1 and know nothing about the path to buddhahood. Historically this seems to have been the main purpose for which the name was coined.
4. When applied to the Theravada, the term's use is offensive on the grounds of presumption. The school has never referred to itself as "the disciples' vehicle" (indeed the very word sāvakayāna is not to be found in any Pali canonical or commentarial text), and so giving it a name its followers don't recognize is as impertinent as calling an Inuit an "Eskimo" or a Pgaz K'Nyaw a "Karen".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2020 2:18 PM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

Sigh. I was trying to express the point in a jargon-free manner. What I meant of course was the polemical claim that non-Mahayanists understand only the path that leads to the khīṇāsava-ñāṇa of a Buddha's arahant disciple, but not that which leads to the sabbaññuta-ñāṇa of a sammāsambuddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 19, 2020 10:43 PM

Title: Re: What needs to be done so that Theravada is never called Hinayana

Content:

If one made that one's criterion then all utterances would necessarily be non-polemical and non-derogatory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 20, 2020 2:41 AM

Title: Re: What is this chant?

Content:

But I see they've mistranslated it. Either the Pali should be changed to namassāma or the French to Je me prosterne...

<http://vivekarama.fr/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/PUJA-version-moine-et-nonne.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 20, 2020 8:34 AM

Title: Re: Will most people really go to the three lower dimensions? (animal womb, hell, ghost realm)?

Content:

It makes sense to me, for elsewhere the suttas say that any of the ten unwholesome kammic courses (akusala kammaṭṭhāna) can be a cause for rebirth in the lower realms. If that's the case, then I think the wide prevalence of just two of the ten —frivolous speech and wrong view— would more than suffice to bring about the outcome that your sutta describes.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 3:30 AM
Title: Re: Kamma of disseminating wrong dhamma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 4:03 AM
Title: Re: The European Pagan Connection
Content:
With the Old Norse...

Sāma and Sabala - Garmr and the Fenris-wolf
Yama - underworld goddess Hel
Pāricchattaka tree - Yggdrasil
Varuṇa - Óðinn
Pajāpati - Týr

And many others I've forgotten. For Norse https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gabriel_Turville-Petre and https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Georges_Dumézil are the guys to read.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 4:19 AM
Title: Re: Taking 2 refuge
Content:
It's puzzling why a Dhammapada-onlyist would be worrying his head about paccekabuddhas of all things!

But for your information, proponents of classical Theravāda would not say that. Rather, they would say: "There were paccekabuddhas, there will be paccekabuddhas, and there may be paccekabuddhas right now in any cakkavāḷa that's presently in the dark period between the disappearance of one buddhasāsanā and the arising of the next one."

In short, all that's denied is the possibility of paccekabodhi in any given cakkavāḷa at a time when that cakkavāḷa's buddhasāsanā is still intact.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 8:17 AM
Title: Re: Taking 2 refuge
Content:
I don't see how this would follow from what I wrote. There might, for all I know, be all

sorts of people who say that paccekabuddhas are entirely impossible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 9:45 AM

Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?

Content:

Eh? What the Buddha intended in his pronouncements on the subject of meat-eating and vegetarianism has nothing to do with a topic about vegetarianism on a Buddhist forum??

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 12:21 PM

Title: Re: Questions about monk's robes & things

Content:

There's no consensus on this. Some monks (e.g., Ajahn Thanissaro) insist on wearing no extra clothes beyond those made allowable in the Vinaya. Others (in fact most) apply the great standards to argue for the allowability of extra clothes in cold climes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 12:51 PM

Title: Re: Did Hakamaya Noriaki ever write his proposed article demonstrating that Yogacara is not Buddhism?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 1:49 PM

Title: Re: Questions about monk's robes & things

Content:

Most town and village monks don't observe the Vinaya rules that limit the number of robes and so they would just put on a spare lower robe. A Vinaya-observant monk, when washing the lower robe, would wear his rains bathing cloth (that's something I didn't mention in my last post). With the upper and outer robes it's not really an issue as these don't need to be worn inside the monastery except during ceremonies. So monks would just schedule the washing so that they can be sure the upper and outer robes will have dried before they need to wear them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 1:58 PM

Title: Re: Questions about monk's robes & things

Content:

A forest monk whose robes are dyed with jakfruit chips wouldn't wear any of them when sleeping because semen leaves a permanent stain when it comes into contact with this kind of dye. Instead he would wear his rains bathing cloth which is dyed with red clay. For a monk with chemically dyed robes this isn't an issue and he probably will sleep in his normal lower robe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 2:36 PM

Title: Re: who don't want to be known as a good person

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 4:46 PM

Title: Re: Agamas divergence from Pali Canon, still practiced?

Content:

No, I didn't mean that. Nor do I see how this could be inferable from anything I said in reply to Sati1. Since I stated that there ARE Mahayanists who make a point of studying the Āgamas, how could I possibly have meant that the said Āgamas are of interest only to Theravādins?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 4:52 PM

Title: Re: Karma of disseminating wrong dhamma

Content:

I guess you're alluding to the fact that some MSS include 'sickness' in suttas defining the first noble truth and some don't.

If I myself were ever in any doubt as to what belongs and what doesn't belong in each of the four ariyasaccas, my way of allaying the doubt would be to consult those two hermeneutical masterpieces, the Nettipakaraṇa and Peṭakopadesa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 5:02 PM

Title: Re: Taking 2 refuge

Content:

In the fully-developed conception of paccekabodhi it isn't reckoned as happening "outside of Buddhism" because the path of the pacceka-bodhisatta requires that he meet at least one sammāsambuddha and be taught by him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 5:19 PM

Title: Re: who don't want to be known as a good person

Content:

Coincidentally, only this morning I posted something to Sutta Central on a rather similar matter. So I'll be lazy and just post a link:

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/question-about-snitching-and-right-speech/15846>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 9:58 PM

Title: Re: the great vegetarian debate

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Taking 2 refuge

Content:

I think it's an extremely improbable scenario, but if it happened then we'd be arahant disciples.

Just like there are anāgāmins in the Pure Abodes who attain anāgāmitā during the dispensation of one Buddha and then arahatta during the dark period or during the dispensation of the next Buddha or even during the dark period after the next Buddha. Their attaining it during one of the dark periods doesn't mean that they get called paccekabuddhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Kamma of disseminating wrong dhamma

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 11:14 PM

Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?

Content:

Hey, stop equivocating, you slippery eel. What was stated to be out of order was your attempt to quash discussion of what the Buddha said, and what he meant, on the subjects of vegetarianism and meat-eating.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 11:26 PM

Title: Re: Karma of disseminating wrong dhamma

Content:

Not necessarily, for what they offer might be different but not mutually contradictory. For example, an exposition of the first precept using the Abhidhamma method will look rather different to one using the Sutta method.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 24, 2020 11:33 PM

Title: Re: Karma of disseminating wrong dhamma

Content:

So one could imagine one monk expounding the matter according to the text in black and another according to the text in blue.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?

Content:

yathā ahaṃ tathā ete,
yathā ete tathā ahaṃ,
attānaṃ upamaṃ katvā,
na haneyya na ghātaye.

“Reflecting: ‘As I am, so are they;
As they are, so am I,’
Having taken oneself as the criterion,
One should not kill or cause others to kill.”
(Nālakasutta, Sn 705; cf. Dh. 130)

The expression na ghātaye is defined as giving someone an order to kill. No Theravāda

text extends its scope to include the kind of imagined causal relationships on which secular arguments (or those in the Lankavatara and other spurious Mahayana sūtras) are based.

And so what you call the Buddha's approval of taking the animal's perspective was taught in connection with killing by one's own hand or giving another an order to kill. The context is not one of grocery shopping.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 12:46 AM
Title: Re: Taking 2 refuge
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 1:18 AM
Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?
Content:
But who has claimed this? All I'm claiming is that the advocated extension is not an obligatory one and should not be proposed as such.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 8:58 AM
Title: Re: The European Pagan Connection
Content:
I think so. Though not so much Māra in heaven (Lord of the Paranimittavasavattī realm) but more Māra down on earth forever making a nuisance of himself.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 10:15 AM
Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?
Content:
Does it?

If I was the dandelion in this picture I expect I'd be making petitionary prayers to Ceres, Flora, Freyja and Sif for cow 56 to be slaughtered as quickly as possible.

./download/file.php?id=5608&mode=view

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 11:56 AM

Title: Re: Eating time

Content:

The taking of the three extra precepts on Uposatha days or during meditation retreats is to promote the development of the three <https://suttacentral.net/an3.16/en/sujato>. And so the sixth precept assists with moderation in eating, the seventh with guarding of the sense-faculties, and the eighth with devotion to wakefulness.

For bhikkhus limiting the time of eating has the additional purpose of ensuring that we don't cause needless bother to householders by going into the village for alms at all hours of the day and night.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 3:15 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

It couldn't happen like that. The groups of bhāṇakas were rather like the crafts guilds of mediaeval Europe. Let's suppose you were, say, a majjhimbhāṇaka. You would have been subjected to stringent testing before you even got admitted to the group and your continued membership of it was contingent on your regular attendance at sessions with other majjhimbhāṇakas to ensure that standards were maintained. If you neglected this or didn't maintain a faultless recitation then you'd be kicked out of the guild.

The Majjhima Nikāya is divided into recitation portions and at each session one of these would be selected and recited using the same four methods first described in the Vinaya Piṭaka and still in use today by Hindu Veda-reciters:

Paḍaṃ - less accomplished and more accomplished reciters recite in unison, beginning and ending together.

Anupadaṃ - the most accomplished reciter begins a line, the less accomplished join in, and they end together.

Anvakkhamaṃ - the most accomplished reciter recites the beginning syllable of a line together with the less accomplished. The latter then has to complete the line by himself.

Anubyañjanaṃ - a group of the more accomplished reciters recite one line, and the less accomplished reciters then recite the next line by themselves.

In short, oral preservation was thorough and systematic, with nothing haphazard or left

to chance.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 6:09 PM

Title: Re: Eating time

Content:

Yes, you would be doing the right thing. Expressing yourself in this way is exactly what the Buddha advises people to do if they wish to safeguard the truth and if the matter is not one on which they have direct knowledge.

See the Caṅkī Sutta.

<https://accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.095x.than.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 8:06 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

The Vinaya Piṭaka stipulates that a bhikkhu must (among other things) be "learned" (bahussuta) before he can be released from the obligation to live in dependence on a teacher.

The Vinaya Atthakathā gives as the minimal standard for being bahussuta memorization of:

- dve mātikā - the two Pātimokkhas (i.e. for monks and nuns).
- cattāro bhāṇavārā - the four Rounds for Recital (a collection of parittas).
- tisso anumodanā - three kinds of chant for rejoicing in someone's merit, comprising those used at mealtimes (saṅghabhatte anumodanā), on auspicious occasions (maṅgalesu anumodanā) and on inauspicious occasions (amaṅgalesu anumodanā).
- dhammasāvanatthāya suttanta - At least one sutta that can be used as the basis for giving a sermon. The suggested examples are the Andhakavinda, the Mahārāhulovāda and the Ambaṭṭha.
- The liturgies (kammavācā) used for various kinds of formal act, like uposatha, confession, pavāraṇā, kaṭhina, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 25, 2020 11:08 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

With the exception of Burmese vinayadharas and tipīṭakadharas, I think it's rather uncommon nowadays for monks to memorize the nuns' pātimokkha. As for the rest of the texts, most monks would probably know them all by the time they got to about five rains, though in the case of the cattāro bhāṇavārā monks outside of Sri Lanka would be more likely to memorize their own national arrangements of paritta chants.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 4:09 PM

Title: Re: Why only lying is included as wrong speech in five precepts?

Content:

They're not included in those. I think you may be confusing the aṭṭha (or aṭṭhaṅga or uposatha) sīla with the ājīvaṭṭhamakasīla.

Eight precepts

1. abstention from killing
2. abstention from stealing
3. abstention from unchastity
4. abstention from false speech
5. abstention from intoxicants
6. abstention from taking food at the wrong time
7. abstention from dancing, music shows, etc.
8. abstention from high or large beds

Precepts with right livelihood as the eighth

1. abstention from killing
2. abstention from stealing
3. abstention from sexual misconduct
4. abstention from false speech
5. abstention from divisive speech
6. abstention from harsh speech
7. abstention from frivolous speech
8. right livelihood

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 5:22 PM

Title: Re: The Buddhagūṇas

Content:

Some of the ten Tathāgata powers are exclusive to Buddhas, while others can be attained (albeit to a lesser degree) by the more adept disciples.

The Paṭisambhidāmagga is the go-to text for the systematic treatment of this subject. Its mātikā lists a total of seventy-three kinds of understanding (including the Tathāgata powers) and states that the first sixty-seven are held in common with disciples and the last six are not:

Knowledge Shared by Disciples (ñāṇāni sāvakasādhāraṇāni)

1. sotāvadhāne paññā sutamaye ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of applying the ear is knowledge of what consists in the heard (learnt).

2. sutvāna saṃvare paññā sīlamaye ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of restraint after hearing (learning) is knowledge of what consists in virtue.

3. saṃvaritvā samādahane paññā samādhībhāvanāmaye ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of concentrating after restraining is knowledge of what consists in the development of concentration.

4. paccayapariggahe paññā dhammaṭṭhitiñāṇaṃ

Understanding of embracing conditions is knowledge of the causal relationship of ideas.

5. atītānāgatapaccuppannānaṃ dhammānaṃ saṅkhipitvā vavatthāne paññā sammāsane ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining past, future and present ideas, after generalization, is knowledge of comprehension.

6. paccuppannānaṃ dhammānaṃ vipariṇāmanupassane paññā udayabbayānupassane ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of contemplating presently-arisen ideas' change is knowledge of contemplation of rise and fall.

7. ārammaṇaṃ paṭisaṅkhā bhaṅgānupassane paññā vipassane ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of contemplating dissolution after reflecting on an object is knowledge of insight.

8. bhayatupaṭṭhāne paññā ādīnave ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of appearance as terror is knowledge of danger.

9. muñcitukamyatāpaṭisaṅkhāsantiṭṭhanā paññā saṅkhārupekkhāsu ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of desire for deliverance, of reflexion, and of composure, is knowledge of the kinds of equanimity about formations.

10. bahiddhā vuṭṭhānavivaṭṭane paññā gotrabhuñāṇaṃ

Understanding of emergence and turning away from the external is change-of-lineage knowledge.

11. dubhato vuṭṭhānavivaṭṭane paññā magge ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of emergence and turning away from both [the external and internal] is knowledge of the path.

12. payogappaṭippassaddhi paññā phale ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of tranquillization of the tasks is knowledge of fruition.

13. chinnavaṭumānupassane paññā vimuttiñāṇaṃ

Understanding of contemplating what is cut off is knowledge of deliverance.

14. tadā samudāgate dhamme passane paññā paccavekkhaṇe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of insight into ideas then arrived at is knowledge of reviewing.

15. ajjhavavavattāne paññā vatthunānante ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining internally is knowledge of difference in the physical basis.

16. bahiddhāvavattāne paññā gocaranānante ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining externally is knowledge of difference in the domains [of the physical bases].

17. cariyāvavattāne paññā cariyānānante ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining behaviour is knowledge of difference in behaviour [of consciousness].

18. catudhammavavattāne paññā bhūminānante ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining four ideas is knowledge of difference in plane.

19. navadhammavavattāne paññā dhammanānante ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of defining nine ideas is knowledge of difference in idea.

20. abhiññāpaññā ñātattthe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as abandoning is knowledge in the sense of giving up.

21. pariññāpaññā tīraṇattthe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as direct knowledge is knowledge of the meaning of what-is-known.

22. pahāne paññā pariccāgaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as full understanding is knowledge of the meaning of judgment (investigation).

23. bhāvanāpaññā ekarasaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as developing is knowledge in the sense of single function (taste).

24. sacchikiriyaṇāpaññā phassanaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as realizing is knowledge in the sense of sounding.

25. atthanānatte paññā atthapaṭisambhida ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in meaning is knowledge of discrimination of meaning.

26. dhammanānatte paññā dhammapaṭisambhida ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in ideas is knowledge of discrimination of ideas.

27. niruttinānatte paññā niruttipaṭisambhida ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in language is knowledge of discrimination of language.

28. paṭibhānanānatte paññā paṭibhānapaṭisambhida ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in perspicuity is knowledge of discrimination of perspicuity.

29. vihāranānatte paññā vihāraṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in abiding is knowledge of the meaning of abiding.

30. samāpattinānatte paññā samāpattaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in attainment is knowledge of the meaning of attainment.

31. vihārasamāpattinānatte paññā vihārasamāpattaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of difference in abiding and attainment is knowledge of the meaning of abiding and attainment.

32. avikkhepaparisuddhattā āsavaśamucchede paññā ānantarikasamādhimhi ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of cutting off of cankers due to pureness of non-distraction is knowledge of concentration with immediate [result].

33. dassanādhipeyyaṃ santo ca vihārādhigamo paṇītādhimuttatā paññā araṇavihāre ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as predominance of seeing, and as achievement of a peaceful abiding, and as resoluteness on the sublime goal, is knowledge of abiding without conflict.

34. dvīhi balehi samannāgatattā tayo ca saṅkhārānaṃ paṭippassaddhiyā soḷasaḥi

ñāṇacariyāhi navahi samādhicariyāhi vasibhāvatā paññā nirodhasamāpattiyā ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as mastery owing to possession of two powers, to the tranquillization of three formations, to sixteen kinds of behaviour of knowledge, and to nine kinds of behaviour of concentration, is knowledge of the attainment of cessation.

35. sampajānassa pavattapariyādāne paññā parinibbāne ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the termination of occurrence in one who is fully aware is knowledge of extinguishment.

36. sabbadhammānaṃ sammā samucchede nirodhe ca anupaṭṭhānatā paññā samasīsaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the complete cutting off of all ideas, of their cessation, and of their non-reappearance, is knowledge of the meaning of same-headed-ness.

37. puthunānattatejapariyādāne paññā sallekhaṭṭhe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of separation, of difference and unity, and of termination of fires, is knowledge of effacement.

38. asallīnattapahitattapaggahaṭṭhe paññā vīriyārambhe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of the meaning of exertion in those possessed of bestirring and endeavour is knowledge of the application of energy.

39. nānādharmappakāsanatā paññā atthasandassane ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of explaining different ideas is knowledge of demonstrating meanings.

40. sabbadhammānaṃ ekasaṅgahatānānattekattapaṭivedhe paññā
dassanavisuddhiñāṇaṃ
Understanding of penetrating the includability of all ideas as one, and of their difference and unity, is knowledge of purity in seeing.

41. veditattā paññā khantiñāṇaṃ
Understanding due to what is recognized is knowledge as choice.

42. phuṭṭhattā paññā pariyoḡāhaṇe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding due to what is touched is knowledge of fathoming.

43. samodahane paññā padesavihāre ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of combination is knowledge of abiding in [the reviewing of ideas as] parts.

44. adhipatattā paññā saññāvivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding due to what is given predominance is knowledge of turning away through perception.

45. nānatte paññā cetovivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of difference is knowledge of turning away by the will.

46. adhiṭṭhāne paññā cittavivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of establishing is knowledge of the turning away of cognizance.

47. suññate paññā ñāṇavivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of voidness is knowledge of the turning away of knowledge.

48. vosagge paññā vimokkhavivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of relinquishment is knowledge of turning away by liberation.

49. tathaṭṭhe paññā saccavivaṭṭe ñāṇaṃ
Understanding of the meaning of suchness is knowledge of turning away in the actualities.

50. kāyampi cittampi ekavavatthānatā sukhasaññañca lahusaññañca
adhiṭṭhānavasena ijjhanatṭhe paññā iddhividhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the meaning of succeeding by defining body and cognizance as one and by steadying easy perception and quick perception is knowledge of the kinds of success (supernormal powers).

51. vitakkavipphāravasena nānattekattasaddanimittānaṃ pariyogāhaṇe paññā
sotadhātuvisuddhiñāṇaṃ

Understanding of fathoming sound signs in their difference and unity is knowledge of purification of the ear principle.

52. tiṇṇannaṃ cittānaṃ vipphārattā indriyānaṃ pasādavasena
nānattekattaviññānacariyā pariyogāhaṇe paññā cetopariyañāṇaṃ

Understanding of fathoming behaviour of consciousness in its difference and unity by means of confidence [and non-confidence] in the [six] faculties due to intervention by three types of cognizances is knowledge of penetration of wills (hearts).

53. paccayappavattānaṃ dhammānaṃ nānattekattakammavipphāravasena
pariyogāhaṇe paññā pubbenivāsānussatiñāṇaṃ

Understanding of fathoming ideas conditionally-arisen through intervention of difference and unity in action is knowledge of recollection of past life.

54. obhāsavasena nānattekattarūpanimittānaṃ dassanaṭṭhe paññā
dibbacakkhuñāṇaṃ

Understanding of seeing the meaning as signs of visible objects in their difference and unity by means of illumination is knowledge of the divine eye.

55. catusaṭṭhiyā ākārehi tiṇṇannaṃ indriyānaṃ vasībhāvatā paññā āsavānaṃ khaye
ñāṇaṃ

Understanding as mastery of three faculties in sixty-four aspects is knowledge of exhaustion of cankers.

56. pariññatṭhe paññā dukkhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the meaning of full-understanding is knowledge of suffering.

57. pahānatṭhe paññā samudaye ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the meaning of abandoning is knowledge of origin.

58. sacchikiriyaṭṭhe paññā nirodhe ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the meaning of realizing is knowledge of cessation.

59. bhāvanaṭṭhe paññā magge ñāṇaṃ

Understanding of the meaning of developing is knowledge of the path.

60. dukkhe ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of suffering.

61. dukkhasamudaye ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of the origin of suffering.

62. dukkhanirodhe ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of the cessation of suffering.

63. dukkhanirodhagāminiyā paṭipadāya ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of the way leading to the cessation of suffering.

64. atthapaṭisambhīde ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of discrimination of meaning.

65. dhammapaṭisambhīde ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of discrimination of ideas.

66. niruttipaṭisambhīde ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of discrimination of language.

67. paṭibhānapaṭisambhīde ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of discrimination of perspicuity.

Knowledge not Shared by Disciples

(ñāṇāni asādhāraṇāni sāvakehi)

68. indriyaparopariyatte ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of penetration of others' faculties

69. sattānaṃ āsayānusaye ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of beings' biases and underlying tendencies

70. yamakaṇṭhīre ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of the Twin Metamorphosis (Marvel)

71. mahākaruṇāsamāpattiyā ñāṇaṃ

Knowledge of the Great Compassion

72. sabbaññutañāṇaṃ

Omniscient Knowledge

73. anāvarenañāṇaṃ

Unobstructed Knowledge

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 5:40 PM

Title: Re: Why only lying is included as wrong speech in five precepts?

Content:

None of the ten akusala kamma patha are ever "okay". But that doesn't mean that when two women come to a temple on uposatha days, take the eight precepts and then launch into a discussion of the Abduction of Sitā (the Pali commentators' standard example of frivolous speech) they'll be breaking the precepts they've just taken. It would of course be preferable if they found something better to talk about.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 6:14 PM

Title: Re: Is fishing breaking the precept?

Content:

No.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 6:26 PM

Title: Re: Why only lying is included as wrong speech in five precepts?

Content:

It's not unreasonable.

What would be unreasonable would be to argue:

Those given over to frivolous speech are disbelieved.

Fred is disbelieved.

Therefore Fred is given over to frivolous speech.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 26, 2020 7:20 PM

Title: Re: Why only lying is included as wrong speech in five precepts?

Content:

I meant that you were committing (or at least your claim rested upon) an elementary logical fallacy.

The fact that a person of frivolous speech will not be believed doesn't allow us to infer that a person who is disbelieved must be of frivolous speech. He might be disbelieved for some other reason altogether. Perhaps he's reputed to be an habitual liar. Perhaps the person he's talking to is of a highly suspicious nature. Perhaps he's got a nervous disorder that makes him seem shifty... etc.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 28, 2020 2:14 PM
Title: Re: Eating time
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 28, 2020 10:03 PM
Title: Re: theravada attitude towards yogacara and madhyamaka
Content:

If Nāgārjuna had been a Sarvāstivādin – even a dissident Sarvāstivādin – he would presumably have been familiar with Devaśarman's Abhidharmavijñānakāyapādaśāstra, the fifth book of the Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma Piṭaka. One of the principal aims of this text, taking up most of the first two chapters, is to defend the Sarvāstivādin conception of dharmas against criticisms of it coming from a school called the Vibhajjavāda.

Is it just a coincidence that Vibhajjavāda is the Sanskrit form of Vibhajjavāda, the name by which the Theravāda usually referred to itself in those days?

Unlikely, for the particular Vibhajjavādin whom Devaśarman is concerned to refute is none other than Moggalliputtatissa, the Theravādin debater at the Council of Patna. And so though it may be true (for all I know) that Nāgārjuna had never studied the Pali Abhidhamma, if he had been a Sarvāstivādin it's unlikely that he would have been unfamiliar with the Pali Abhidhamma's conception of dhammas.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Vijnanakaya>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 28, 2020 10:09 PM
Title: Re: theravada attitude towards yogacara and madhyamaka
Content:

The Theravāda, though concentrated in the South and Sri Lanka, was certainly present in the North, going by the name 'Vibhajjavāda'.

The fact that Mahayana polemics are not directed principally against the Vibhajjavāda/Theravāda is not because they knew nothing about it, but because their polemical assault on mainstream Indian Buddhism appears to have been prioritized in proportion to the size of each school. And so the mammoth-sized Sarvāstivāda came first, followed by the two largest of the Pudgalavādin schools, and with the medium-sized Vibhajjavāda/Theravāda coming perhaps in fourth or fifth place.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 28, 2020 11:47 PM

Title: Re: theravada attitude towards yogacara and madhyamaka

Content:

The Dīpavaṃsa and the Kathāvatthu Commentary say that the Mahīṃsāsakas seceded from the Theravādins during the second century after the parinibbāna. Then later (the sources don't say how much later) the Dhammaguttiyas (Dharmaguptakas) and Sabbatthivādins (Sarvāstivādins) split from the Mahīṃsāsakas.

<https://archive.org/details/in.gov.ignca.8719/page/n15/mode/2up>
(see pages 2-5)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 29, 2020 6:34 PM

Title: Re: Eating time

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/mn65/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 30, 2020 1:29 PM

Title: Re: Eating time

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 30, 2020 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Eating time

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 11:03 AM

Title: Re: AI: What is a sentient being?

Content:

The entity must be heir to a past saṃsāric continuum in which ignorance and craving were not extinguished.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 12:14 PM

Title: Re: AI: What is a sentient being?

Content:

I think that to distinguish a robot that's a saṃsāric being from an extremely cleverly programmed but non-saṃsāric robot might not be possible by any scientific means. It would take some kind of yogic gnosis, e.g., mastery of the fourth jhāna and then development of the second of the three knowledges.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 6:43 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

36 pages would be just one page longer than the Mahamakut Press romanised Pali edition of the Bhikkhupāṭimokkha, a text that tens of thousands of monks know by heart.

But for number-crunching purposes it might be better to do our counting by the syllable rather than the page, since different editions of the Tipiṭaka vary in their number of pages and different pages vary in their quantity of text. And so...

Pāṭimokkha, : 16,647 syllables.

Pali Tipiṭaka (Burmese Sixth Council edition): 9,565,764 syllables.

$9,565,764 \div 16,647 \approx 575$

So, going by syllable count memorising the Tipiṭaka is the equivalent of memorising the Pāṭimokkha 575 times.

Typical length of time to memorise the Pāṭimokkha...

Western monks: 8-12 weeks

Thai and Sri Lankan monks: 6-8 weeks

Burmese monks: 2-4 weeks

Time it would take to memorise the Tipiṭaka if one proceeded at the same rate as above...

Western monks: 88 to 133 years

Thai and Sri Lankan: 66 to 88 years

Burmese: 22 to 44 years

And so it's no surprise that Myanmar's the only Theravādin country with tipiṭakadharas. Nor any surprise that ca 20 years is in fact the minimum length of time that it takes the most proficient Burmese monks to complete the task – a task that all of them

commence in early childhood.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Sakadagamin and ekabijjī

Content:

It depends what we're using as our yardstick. The difference between the two of them is very much less than the difference between either of them and a worldling.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Al: What is a sentient being?

Content:

This seems to give rise to the same problem as the English translation "sentient being". In effect it leaves one class of saṃsāric being out of account: those Brahmā gods that go by the name "unconscious/impercipient beings" asaṇṇa-satta (Skt. asaṃjñi-sattva). The translation would imply either that an unconscious being is not in fact a being, or that it is a being but, despite its name, it's not in fact unconscious.

I suspect this may be the reason some recent translators of Tibetan texts have taken to using "samsaric being" or "transmigrating being" in place of "sentient being". Translators of Pali texts abandoned the term many decades ago, in favour of "living beings", "creatures" or just "beings", but I notice that Ven. Sujāto has now brought it back again.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Al: What is a sentient being?

Content:

There are contexts where the word satta can be (and is) properly applied to arahants and buddhas, in conformity with worldly linguistic conventions. One example would be the thought, "May all living beings be happy! (sabbe sattā sukhitā hontu)".

Another, I think, would be this thread, where the concern is merely to describe what distinguishes that which is a satta from that which is not, and where the general or public understanding of satta seems to be assumed. In contexts like these two, an arahant will be reckoned a satta until khandha-parinibbāna.

Then there is another more dhammically inhouse usage of satta (as in the sutta cited by Doodoot) where the term has ceased to be applicable to an arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 1, 2020 11:39 PM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

Well, I've met three of the Tipiṭaka sayadaws when they came to visit Thailand. However, as they seldom travel abroad ordinarily one would need to go to Myanmar and visit one of the monasteries that specialize in training bhāṇakas. For example, the Tipiṭaka Nikāya and Sunlungu monasteries in Yangon, or the Dhammānanda Monastery in Mingun.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 1:06 AM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

If they were relevantly qualified scientists, I doubt they'd consider the monks' achievement all that remarkable once they'd been provided with a description of the highly unusual and specialised training they'd undergone. Or at least it would be nowhere near as remarkable as the achievements of mnemonists like Yanjaa, Gregor von Feinaigle, Wang Feng, Shas Pollak, Astrid Plessl, Gunther Karsten, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 2:02 AM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

You are over-generalising. In the case of bhāṇakas this is actually something that varies from one monk to another. There are some monks for whom <https://dhammapadaedmw.blogspot.com/2013/09/dhammpada-241.html> strictly applies and whose repertoire will soon be lost if they don't make a regular practice of rehearsing everything they've memorised. Obviously this sets a limit on how much new material they can learn, since there are only so many hours in the day. But then there are other monks who memorise something once and it stays with them for ever, no matter how much more material they memorise later.

Which class a monk falls into seems to depend largely on how much of a role mnemonics played in his schooling, and especially in his primary school education. For example, most Western monks hardly had to memorise anything at school except maybe the times table, some sappy passages from Romeo and Juliet and a few French irregular verbs, and there are hardly any of us who can retain memorised material without regular repetition of it. By contrast, a Thai monk educated in a state primary school will have spent about half of each day in rote-learning, while a Burmese in a monastery school will have done virtually nothing else.

Another factor is whether a monk knows Pali and understands the meaning of what he's memorised. In Thailand most city monks do and most forest monks don't. I've noticed that in the forest monasteries I've stayed at the pāṭimokkha-reciters would make a point of practising their recital nearly every day, while monks in city monasteries only did so on the day before an uposatha day when it was their turn to be the reciter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 2:24 AM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

Well, if you personally doubt it I guess that settles the matter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 3:24 AM

Title: Re: How did historical Buddha looked like?

Content:

Sorry, but in all this world with its devas, māras and brahmās, I know of no link that could prove persuasive to you.

Still, I have told you where you might go if you wish to investigate the matter yourself. Just take a flight to Yangon, show up at the Tipiṭaka Nikāya Monastery with a few volumes of the Tipiṭaka in your backpack, and read out random lines to the monks and see if they can complete them.

Oh, and another thing that you might wish to try is the Dhammanando method for memorising the Dhammapada and Dīgha Nikāya. Not necessarily for memorising these particular texts, but for any lengthy text that's dear to your heart. Perhaps a Cathy Newman script. You will then know for yourself just how proficient the human memory can be and will be glad to abandon your present rather impoverished conception of this.

I outlined the method in the thread linked below.

<https://dhammawheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=32978&start=15>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 8:38 AM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 11:49 AM

Title: Re: Sakadagamin and ekabijji

Content:

Because ekaṃyeva mānusakam bhavam ("just one more human existence") and sakideva imam lokam ("just once to this world") are terms that differ not only in phrasing but also in meaning.

"What is the difference between a once-returner and a one-seeder? For a one-seeder there is at most one rebirth-linking (paṭisandhi); for a once-returner there is at most two. This is the difference between them."
(Pugg-a. 198)

An ekabijji, if he attains no higher fruit in this life, is guaranteed arahatta in his next life, which will be in the human realm.

A sakadāgāmin, if he attains no higher fruit in this life, is reborn as a deva. If he attains no higher fruit in that life, he is guaranteed arahatta in the life after that, which will be in the human realm. If one attains sakadāgāmitā as a deva, then it's the other way round: deva > human > deva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Hi! im newbie, really interested on Bikkhuni existence.

Content:

Hi Mika,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Regarding the thread title, do you mean that you're interested in how bhikkhunīs live? Or in the question of whether bhikkhunīs exist?

Best wishes,
Dhammanando

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 2:52 PM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

How can it be said to "fit" when it generates the interpretive puzzlement that you expressed in your opening post?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Sakadagamin and ekabijī

Content:

The suttas don't say "reborn only once". They say that the sakadāgāmin returns only once to "this world". Which world would this be? The Puggalapaññatti Commentary understands it to mean the world in which he happened to attain once-returnership, which may be either the human world or the deva world.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 5:40 PM

Title: Re: What is the best time to practice meditation in the morning?

Content:

It's best to get up as early as possible, but not so early that you spend the rest of the day walking about like a zombie. Having got up, the best time is after a cup of tea and a shower, but before breakfast.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 6:05 PM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

But since the spine isn't the alimentary canal, being subject to backaches is hardly incompatible with having a stomach whose enzymes can catalyze the breakdown of celestial oṇa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

The commentator doesn't say that devas don't know not to eat it, nor that they might be tempted to eat it. He merely says that they wouldn't be able to digest it if they did eat it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 7:21 PM

Title: Re: Sakadagamin and ekabijjī

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Memorization and the Oral Tradition

Content:

Some footage from the Tipitaka Examination of 2016-2017, held at the Sixth Buddhist Council Cave, Yangon

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 9:54 PM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

The info is from the commentaries. They don't specify exactly what would happen if a deva did attempt to eat human food, but since the Buddha didn't want them eating it, presumably it would be something undesirable. Perhaps the indigestible food gives the deva dyspepsia and this makes him grumpy – one of the four causes of death for devas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 10:19 PM

Title: Re: In terms of visa, is Sri Lanka the easiest country to ordain and stay?

Content:

If a monk is over 50 then it's very easy for him to get a permanent retirement visa in Thailand. If he's under 50 then any kind of permanent visa here would be a virtual impossibility. He would just have to keep applying for an extension once a year. In theory he would have to leave after ten years (or after five years if he comes from another Asian Buddhist country), but in practice this regulation is rarely enforced. The Thai authorities just use it as a pretext from time to time to get rid of a monk who's incurred their disapproval in some way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 2, 2020 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

I don't recall ever reading about devas sleeping. Maybe they don't; they could be the

happy equivalent of the never-sleeping and never-blinking damned souls in Sartre's No Exit.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2020 11:30 AM

Title: Re: Throwing away food in water with no bacteria in it

Content:

I don't know what the range of fatal grumpiness would be. The usual example is some lovelorn deva brooding resentfully over the fact that the celestial nymph he's besotted with is more interested in some other deva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2020 1:03 PM

Title: Re: In terms of visa, is Sri Lanka the easiest country to ordain and stay?

Content:

I don't know which case you might be referring to, but having his visa application refused after living in Thailand ten years doesn't necessarily mean that the monk was of bad behaviour. It may just mean that Thais found him annoying. In practice this is the sort of thing that's most likely to happen to a monk who's very mentally rigid and self-opinionated and not willing to conform to the Thai way of doing things. For example, a monk who's very intent on following the rules only as they're given in the Vinaya Piṭaka might refuse to shave his hair and beard once a fortnight or once a month (the common Thai practice) because the Vinaya only requires them to be shaved once every two months. His full beard and substantial head of hair will attract attention wherever he goes and sooner or later the district head monk will get to hear about the farang hippy monk. He'll then be summoned and ordered to shave more often. If he doesn't comply, a report will be sent to the National Office of Buddhism and when he applies for his 11th year visa extension he'll be told that sadly the regulations don't allow foreign monks any further extensions after ten years.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2020 1:05 PM

Title: Re: In terms of visa, is Sri Lanka the easiest country to ordain and stay?

Content:

No. I've lived here a total of 25 years, which is two and half times longer than the regulations allow, but they haven't booted me out yet.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2020 1:49 PM

Title: Re: Ganthadhura and Vipassanadhura?

Content:

They're mentioned in four Dhammapada Commentary stories in all...

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/01-01.htm>

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/01-06.htm>

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/01-14.htm>

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/English-Texts/Buddhist-Legends/24-01.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 3, 2020 2:02 PM

Title: Re: Ganthadhura and Vipassanadhura?

Content:

This is the same passage posted by Ven. Pesala, along with with Burlingame's translation. As you can see, the translation's a bit out of date.

"Bhante, imasmiṃ sāsane kati dhurāṇi" ti?

"Reverend Sir, how many Duties are there in this religion?"

Ganthadhuraṃ, vipassanādhuranti dveveva dhurāṇi bhikkhū"ti

"Two Duties only, monk: the Duty of Study and the Duty of Contemplation."

"Katamaṃ pana, bhante, ganthadhuraṃ, katamaṃ vipassanādhuran" ti?

"Reverend Sir, what is meant by the Duty of Study, and what is meant by the Duty of Contemplation?"

"Attano paññānurūpena ekaṃ vā dve vā nikāye sakalaṃ vā pana tepiṭakaṃ buddhavacanaṃ uggaṇhitvā tassa dhāraṇaṃ, kathaṇaṃ, vācanaṃ idamaṃ ganthadhuraṃ nāma."

"The Duty of Study necessitates gaining a knowledge of the Word of the Buddha in a manner conformable to one's understanding, the mastery of one or two Nikāyas, or indeed of the whole Tipiṭaka, bearing it in mind, reciting it, teaching it."

"Sallahukavuttino pana pantasenāsanābhīratassa attabhāve khayavayaṃ paṭṭhapetvā sātaccakiriyavasena vipassanaṃ vaḍḍhetvā arahattaggahaṇanti idamaṃ vipassanādhuraṃ nāmā" ti.

"On the other hand the Duty of Contemplation, which leads to Arahatsip, involves frugal living, satisfaction with a remote lodging, fixing firmly in one's mind the idea of decay and death, and the development of Spiritual Insight by persistent effort."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 4, 2020 3:03 AM
Title: Re: Soul theories and the Dhamma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 4, 2020 8:25 AM
Title: Re: Soul theories and the Dhamma
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 4, 2020 10:00 AM
Title: Re: 4th method is understanding our own mind?
Content:
No, the last method is the one that does require jhāna.

The other three methods correspond to the inferential ones used in the
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cold_reading of a modern mentalist and the
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Forensic_linguistics profiling of a modern criminologist.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 4, 2020 1:08 PM
Title: Re: Why doesn't a human be united as a global citizen?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 4, 2020 8:31 PM
Title: Re: Why doesn't a human be united as a global citizen?
Content:
The OP started two identical threads. Since replies had been posted to both of them I merged the threads rather than deleting one of them. The unforeseen effect of this merger was to erase all the votes that had been cast up to that point. So, if you wish your vote to "count" (whatever that might mean here) then please click again on your preferred option.

Members wishing to have a political rather than Dhamma-related discussion of the OP's

question are invited to do so on
https://dharma.wheel.org/search.php?search_id=active_topics

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 5, 2020 2:43 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:
Dr. Ana Perez-Chisti:

Causation, Correlation and Liberation in Abhidhamma - An Analysis of Paṭṭhāna Nyāya

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=1OQDWP2PwblMzpHP14NHsYmUf5iPRrySW>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 5, 2020 2:57 PM
Title: Re: Jhana
Content:
"Placing the mind" and "keeping it connected" are how Ven. Sujāto translates the jhāna factors of vitakka and vicāra. Here's a link to his blog where he explains the thinking behind his rendering of the first term:

<https://sujato.wordpress.com/2012/12/06/why-vitakka-doesnt-mean-thinking-in-jhana/>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 5, 2020 5:40 PM
Title: Re: Is it possible to have a private not pad?
Content:
It's possible to use the private message function for this. Although DW (in contrast with DWM) doesn't allow drafts to be saved, it's possible to save your notes simply by posting them to yourself.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue May 5, 2020 6:35 PM
Title: Re: Is it possible to have a private not pad?
Content:
I don't know. Perhaps the draft-saving function was bestowed upon DWM by some celestial Bodhisattva.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 12:01 AM

Title: Re: Is traveling to a certain country to visit a few of its monasteries the wisest choice?

Content:

With me it's been almost entirely a word-of-mouth thing. That is, I would go to stay with this monk or that monk after hearing him recommended or praised by some other monk whose judgment I respected.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 12:36 AM

Title: Re: Is traveling to a certain country to visit a few of its monasteries the wisest choice?

Content:

Unfortunately all but one of the monks I trained with and used to recommend based on personal experience are now deceased. The one who's still living, Ajahn Sanit Buddhavanṃso, is now very frail and inactive.

Though I've never met him myself, Sayadaw U Tejaniya seems very promising.

<https://ashintejaniya.org/>

Otherwise, it would probably be better to ask a younger monk who's better acquainted than I am with the rising generation of Theravadin teachers. My days of roving about visiting teachers are long passed, so I'm pretty out of the loop.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 7:52 AM

Title: Re: Eckhart Tolle. Your opinion?

Content:

Indeed. That Eckhart fellow is always doing things. If one's looking for a guru who's skilled at doing nothing, I should think that the Croatian Braco (Josip Grbavac) would be the best option.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 8:02 AM

Title: Re: Is traveling to a certain country to visit a few of its monasteries the wisest

choice?

Content:

There are quite a number of monks who log in and post from time to time, but I think Ven. Pesala is the only one to do so with any regularity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 12:26 PM

Title: Re: killing bugs

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 6, 2020 9:37 PM

Title: Re: 4th method is understanding our own mind?

Content:

It's acquisition depends on the fourth jhāna but it's done after emergence from jhāna, not while in it. It's accurate when the skill is mastered, but not while one is still developing it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2020 8:44 AM

Title: Re: Got my copy

Content:

The Pali reading seems the more probable one to me. Firstly, the spirit of the phrase, "you yourselves do not have pure wisdom... etc." is not the Buddha's characteristic way of speaking to those who haven't yet converted; secondly, for the letter of the phrase there is no parallel even when he's speaking to those who have converted; and thirdly because the Pali *kaṅkhaṇīyeva pana vo ṭhāne vicikicchā uppannā* does have parallels in the SN's *Pāṭaliya* and *Kutūhalasālā Suttas* and two guilds of Theravādin reciters (i.e., the *saṃyutta-bhāṇakas* and *aṅguttara-bhāṇakas*) are less likely to have got it wrong than just a single guild of Sarvāstivādin *madhyama-bhāṇakas*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 7, 2020 1:19 PM

Title: Re: Help Finding an Agama

Content:

I don't know of any translation of the Chinese parallel, but Ernst Waldschmidt has a German translation of the *Nivṛtasūtra*, a parallel *sūtra* from the Sanskrit fragments of the *Saṃyukta Āgama*.

<https://digi.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/diglit/tripathi1962>

The link is to scanned pages from Fünfundzwanzig Sūtras des Nidānaśāmyukta (Berlin, 1962), but if you don't read German, just click on the site's OCR option and then copy and paste into Google translate. It's eight pages in all, for Waldschmidt's a German philologist of the old school, and so half of each page consists of footnotes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2020 3:33 AM

Title: Re: Syntax of "maraṇa dhammo"

Content:

The meaning is basically the same, but with one emphasizing "being of such a nature" and the other "not yet being free".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2020 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

I think if I were a Jain, the ascetic practice of luñcana alone would persuade me to remain a householder for life.

A Jain woman tearing out her hair before her ordination as a nun...

.

Warning: not for the sensitive!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2020 12:21 PM

Title: Re: Syntax of "maraṇa dhammo"

Content:

The word maraṇaṃ in maraṇaṃ anatito is certainly accusative.

By the way, if you're female the forms will end in -dhammā and anatītā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2020 3:02 PM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

As to why Jains in particular do it, I don't know. If you google "Jainism plucking hair" you'll find the Jains themselves giving quite a few different explanations, not to mention some Jain reformists demanding that the practice be ended. Interestingly the latter want it ended not for the obvious reason that it hurts like hell, but because they hold that each strand of hair is a one-facultied living being and so plucking it out is contrary to ahimsā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 8, 2020 11:31 PM

Title: Re: mano loke piyarūpaṃ sātārūpaṃ

Content:

No. Adding -rūpa to a word has a similar effect to adding -dhamma. The commentaries gloss the suffix with -jātika: "being", "having", "naturally", "belonging to the class/type [named in the first part of the compound]". Hence:

"Agreeable by nature and pleasant by nature."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 12:55 AM

Title: Re: mano loke piyarūpaṃ sātārūpaṃ

Content:

Then it would seem to more of a calque (and a rather thoughtless one) than a translation of the sense.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 11:13 AM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

My post had no aim but that of clarifying a translation over which zzzzzz was puzzled. In fulfilment of this aim no more words were needed than those which I wrote.

I wish you the speediest of recoveries from your disappointment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 12:24 PM

Title: Re: Morning routine

Content:

Then the Sammohavinodanī (Vibh-a. 345), states that the middle watch of the night (a bhikkhu's sleeping time) amounts to one sixth of the day and night (rattindivassa chaṭṭhakoṭṭhāsasaṅkhāta) and so would presumably be four hours.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 4:47 PM

Title: Re: Morning routine

Content:

I don't know, but I suspect that the first and last watches, unlike the 4-hour middle watch, would increase and decrease in length according to the hours of daylight in each season. So in India this would mean they would vary from three and a half to four and a half hours. See this old thread on Discourse Central:

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/three-watches-of-the-night/6944>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 6:48 PM

Title: Re: Mano-sancetanakarahara

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Mano-sancetanakarahara

Content:

Food is not attractive when considered in terms of its origin and its destination once we've swallowed it; even before we swallow it it's not attractive when considered as merely elements. But thanks to the three perversions we are blind to this. Because of saññāvipallāsa we perceive it as beautiful; because of cittavipallāsa we cognize it as beautiful; because of diṭṭhivipallāsā we adopt the view that it's beautiful.

<https://suttacentral.net/an4.49/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Killing a yakkha not parajika offence

Content:

The deliberate killing of a yakkha, like the deliberate killing of any living being, has the potential to cause a bad rebirth. But this is not something that can be inferred from the fact that it's called a "grave offence."

The names of the different classes of Vinaya offence are legal ones and don't in themselves convey any information about kammic weightiness. "Grave offence" is a name given either to (1) an attempt to commit a pārājika or a saṅghādisesa offence that failed (e.g., starting to steal something but then changing your mind mid-act) or (2) a completed action that resembles a certain pārājika or saṅghādisesa offence but which was not judged serious enough to qualify for the full offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Mano-sancetanakarahara

Content:

Bear in mind that 'attractive' and 'unattractive' here have to do with all five sense doors, not just the eye.

So when you go to a restaurant and the waiter comes with the menu, would you just say to him: "Forget the menu; just bring me a plate of food. Anything will do" ?

Or would you open the menu and make a selection according to which dish has the most appeal to you?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 9, 2020 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Killing a yakkha not parajika offence

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2020 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

I don't think so. Trichotillomania is irrational, but what the Jains do is quite logically consistent with their wrong view. If you hold that liberation requires all past karmas to be burned up, then it makes perfect sense to inflict extreme pain on yourself so that the said karmas (or at least the akusala ones among them) get burned up more quickly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2020 12:25 PM

Title: Re: Morning routine

Content:

Sure. And from these descriptions you can infer what sort of tasks monks were expected to perform in a typical day.

But if you're looking for a Sutta or a Vinaya text that prescribes a daily routine like, say, the one used on a Goenka meditation course, then you won't find any such thing. In practice each monastery establishes its own in-house regulations about what things are to be done at what time. These regulations will vary greatly according to what kind of monastery it is.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 10, 2020 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Killing a yakkha not parajika offence

Content:

The weightiness of the three is legal but not necessarily kammic. For example, fomenting a schism in the saṅgha is legally a saṅghādisesa but kammically it's one of the five anantariyaka kammās and therefore more kammically more weighty than almost any pārājika offences.

Or building yourself a hut that's a few inches too large is a saṅghādisesa and therefore legally entails a heavier penalty than an unsuccessful attempt to murder someone, which would be only thullaccaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2020 4:00 AM

Title: Re: The Buddhagaṇas

Content:

Mastery of the jhānas is a necessary condition for supernormal power, but not a sufficient condition. If it were a sufficient condition, then Sāriputta's prowess in the jhānas would have allowed him to do everything that Mahāmoggallāna could do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2020 12:57 PM

Title: Re: lay person want to eat simple like monk help

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 11, 2020 4:53 PM

Title: Re: What are The Benefits of Sila?

Content:

It's from that BDK anthology from Japan, The Teaching of Buddha, found in hotel rooms all over Asia.

The book's contents are all referenced at the end, but it's been done very poorly. In the present case, there are 5 unnumbered paragraphs on page 192 and 3 references at the end, but no indication of which reference is to which paragraph. The first two references use an unintelligible numbering system and the third is to a Mahāyāna sūtra:

1 SN 1-6-59

15 AN

20 Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra

.

[./download/file.php?id=5650&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 9:30 AM

Title: Re: Do we have an idealised image of Nibbana and the Buddha?

Content:

Another in a similar vein – though by a psychologist rather than a literatus – is Rune Johansson's The Psychology of Nirvana, esp. chapter 17.

<https://archive.org/details/ThePsychologyOfNirvana/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 10:22 AM

Title: Re: Do we have an idealised image of Nibbana and the Buddha?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 10:29 AM

Title: Re: Tathāgata and self case

Content:

Not eel-wriggling, but wholly in line with the tracklessness and tracelessness of the arahant, as taught in the one and only text that you acknowledge to be buddhavacana:

yesaṃ sannicayo natthi, ye pariññātabhojanā |
suññato animitto ca, vimokkho yesaṃ gocaro |
ākāse va sakuntānaṃ, gati tesāṃ durannayā ||

yassāsavā parikkhīṇā, āhāre ca anissito |
suññato animitto ca, vimokkho yassa gocaro |
ākāse va sakuntānaṃ, padaṃ tassa durannayā ||

Those for whom there is no accumulation,
who have fully comprehended nutriment,
whose domain is empty and signless release,
their destination is untraceable, like that of birds in the sky.

He whose āsavas are destroyed,
who is not dependent on nutriment,
whose domain is empty and signless release,
his track is untraceable, like that of birds in the sky.

(Dhammapada 92-3; cf. Patna Dharmapada 87, 270; Udānavarga 29:26, 29:29)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 12:03 PM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

Sorry, but I seldom reply to private messages unless they're concerned with moderatorial matters. As for public threads about jhāna (especially debates on what counts as "true jhāna"), I almost never post to them unless it's merely to offer some minor note of clarification that won't get me embroiled in a never-ending debate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 4:42 PM

Title: Re: Do we have an idealised image of Nibbana and the Buddha?

Content:

Okay, but just in case you hadn't noticed, the link I gave is actually to a pdf file of the whole book.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 10:03 PM

Title: Re: m̐ sadda.m akattha

Content:

There are several ways to form a prohibitive.

Mā + imperative

Mā kassaci ārocehi.

Mā + aorist

Mā bhagavantaṃ abbhācikkhi.

Mā tumhe nānā viharittha.

Evaṃ me rūpaṃ mā ahosi.

Mā + imperfect

Khaṇo ve mā upaccagā.

Mā with no verb at all, but with an assumed copula

Mā bhagavantaṃ sītaṃ.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Do we have an idealised image of Nibbana and the Buddha?

Content:

In the commentarial view, the behaviour of Buddhas can't be explained in the way that the Buddha explains Pilindavaccha's quirks, for Buddhas – unlike arahant disciples – are said to have completely eliminated all past saṃsāric conditioning.

But it's not in the commentaries but in the Milindapañha that we first see discussions of certain aspects of the Buddha's behaviour that some might consider (and King Milinda did consider) at odds with what one might expect of someone free from greed, hate and delusion. I'll post some examples tomorrow, if no one else does in the meantime.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 12, 2020 10:46 PM

Title: Re: Do we have an idealised image of Nibbana and the Buddha?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 7:55 AM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

Sure, it's fair to ask. And it's my prerogative to answer with silence if I see no good likely to issue from a discussion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 8:31 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

The commentary to #10 says that it's no transgression for a monk to dig someone out of a pit they've fallen into, or give orders for the person to be dug out, but if the monk himself falls into a pit, neither action is permitted. He should wait for someone to come and rescue him. And if nobody comes? Tough luck. *Pulchrum est pro fide mori*. Even if somebody does come, the monk just has to hope that they'll dig the earth on their own initiative; he can't order them to do so.

Likewise, in the commentary to #11 analogous principles apply in cases where (1) someone gets trapped under a fallen tree, and (2) the monk himself gets trapped.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 9:38 AM

Title: Re: Peripheral nonsense?

Content:

Yes, but with the very important caveat that which particular activities will tend to assist in this, and which will tend to impede, is not self-evident. It's something that needs to be learned, not assumed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 11:53 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

The Bodhisatta wasn't a bhikkhu at the time. Buddhist householders can dig the earth to their heart's content.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 12:29 PM

Title: Re: Poll: What do you consider authoritative?

Content:

I think if this poll was on a Thai language Buddhist forum, nearly all lay followers of the forest tradition would tick this box.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 1:59 PM

Title: Re: Sick Relatives

Content:

When a monk disrobes, for whatever reason, he always loses his seniority and starts at zero vassas when he re-ordains.

Most Theravadin sub-traditions would allow him to re-ordain as a bhikkhu immediately. One exception would be the Ajahn Chah tradition, where things are more varied. For example, if the ex-monk had been away for a long time, then some ajahns might require him to start from square one: doing time as an anagarika and a samanera before being granted bhikkhu ordination again.

As for age limits, in those monasteries that have them (btw most don't) this would be the sort of case where they might make an exception for a particular individual, especially if he'd been a good monk the first time round and they thought his presence would benefit the community.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 3:47 PM

Title: Re: Sick Relatives

Content:

In the Vinaya the minimum age to become a bhikkhu is 20. There isn't any maximum age.

Certain monasteries, however, have set a maximum age in their own in-house rules.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 7:23 PM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

Here are links to a few of the threads. I'm afraid some are rather lengthy, but you can save time by skipping all the ill-informed posts from the Vimalaramsi and Brasington followers and just attending to the posts of Sylvester, Sujāto and Brahmali (in effect representing the Theravada position as it was at the time of the Third Council), and

those of Frank and Silence (in effect representing the position taken at the same council by the Pubbaseliya school).

As at the Third Council, both sides believe their position to be the correct reading of the suttas and neither side is basing its case on later works like the Visuddhimagga. Unfortunately one of the two Pubbaseliya posters (yes, I mean you, Frank!) insists on begging the question by calling his own view "the straight EBT interpretation", and poisoning the well (and begging the question) by dubbing his opponents' view "the revised Visuddhimagga interpretation".

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/hearing-sounds-in-samadhi-jhana/7784>

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/vitakka-vicara-jhana-factors/2589>

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/piti-sukha-kaya-in-jhana-mental-physical-or-both/4096>

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/can-you-hear-sound-and-feel-body-in-jhana/3819>

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/ebts-which-indicate-the-experience-of-the-body-disappears-while-meditating/11438>

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/parisuddhena-cetasa-pariyodatena-and-citte-parisuddhe-pariyodate/8540>

And if your enthusiasm hasn't waned after the above, you'll probably find a few more with google:

<https://www.google.com/search?q=site%3Adiscourse.suttacentral.net+frankk+sylvester>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Eighty Minor Marks in Pāli literature

Content:

Here's the Milinda-ṭīkā's list, which seems to be in a different order from the sayadaw's.

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/Texts-and-Translations/Dhammatthavinicchaya/35-Secondary-Characteristics.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 10:51 PM

Title: Re: Eighty Minor Marks in Pāli literature

Content:

If the terms meant that a Buddha proceeded in exactly the manner of these four animals, the gait wouldn't be strange; it would be impossible, for the locomotion of two bipeds – a Buddha and a goose – can hardly be expected to bear much resemblance to that of three quadrupeds. Presumably what it means, however, is that his manner of proceeding was in certain respects like that of each of these animals.

For example, he may have raised his leg high in the manner of a goose, presented an unstoppable mien like that of an elephant, flexed his shoulders with the confidence of a lion, and stamped his foot down firmly like a bull.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 13, 2020 11:34 PM

Title: Re: Eighty Minor Marks in Pāli literature

Content:

The authorship of this work and its *ṭīkā* seems to be something of a mystery. Malalasekera has a two-page discussion of it in his Pali Literature of Ceylon.

<https://archive.org/details/ThePaliLiteratureOfCeylon/page/n115/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2020 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Sick Relatives

Content:

Yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2020 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

I expect that would be a good start. Just don't say, "Bhante, shall I dig you out?" for he won't be able to answer yes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2020 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Sick Relatives

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 14, 2020 7:57 AM

Title: Re: Jain asceticism is way too hardcore

Content:

It would be a very uncompromising observance of "seeing danger in the slightest fault" and "not transgressing a rule even for life's sake".

In practice I'm sure that most bhikkhus would in fact compromise, by digging themselves out and then confessing a pācittiya offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 15, 2020 5:48 PM

Title: Re: Nagarjuna wants Mahayanists to fear śrāvakas as one who loves life fears beheading

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2020 6:45 PM

Title: Re: Killing a yakkha not parajika offence

Content:

But it does nothing of the sort. The most Nāṇananda might claim is that if his conjectural reading were the correct one, then **one** of the possible arguments for the antarābhava would fail. But this wouldn't affect the other arguments made by the antarābhavavādin schools.

(btw. I'm not myself a believer in the intermediate state and this post shouldn't be taken as a defence of it. It's merely a criticism of a poor refutation of it.).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2020 8:08 PM

Title: Re: paccattaññeva parinibbāyati

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2020 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Is there a list with the name and information for each monastery in Thailand?

Content:

The list is hosted on the website of the National Office of Buddhism. But as you say, it's only in Thai and the info is limited to each monastery's name, address and nikāya.

<http://www3.onab.go.th/2019/02/12/wattotalsummaryreport31012562/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2020 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Jhana in the Mahabharata ?

Content:

As the Samatha forum is concerned only with samatha-bhāvanā as it's understood and practised in the Theravāda tradition, I've moved your post (and the replies to it) to the Connections to Other Paths forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 16, 2020 9:41 PM

Title: Re: cannot become arhant while having buddha becoming view?

Content:

But these are specifications of the maximum number of lives remaining, not the number of lives that each type of sekha disciple must undergo. If it were the case, for example, that a sattakkhattuparama sotāpanna had no choice but to undergo the full seven lives, then there would have been no point in all the teachings on the factors that hasten or impede a sekha's subsequent progress to the final goal. The Buddha could have saved his breath and just said: "Wait it out!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2020 11:51 AM

Title: Re: vinaya related to cotton (silkworm)

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2020 3:16 PM

Title: Re: vinaya related to cotton (silkworm)

Content:

The allowability of silk was a subject of debate among Chinese Buddhists, but not among Theravādins as far as I know. See Stuart Young's papers:

https://www.academia.edu/34907686/_Bald-headed_Destroyers_of_Living_Things_Buddhist_Identity_in_the_Silk_Cultures_of_Medieval_China

https://www.academia.edu/32671197/An_Indian_Silkworm_God_in_China

https://www.academia.edu/32671274/FOR_A_COMPASSIONATE_KILLING_CHINESE_BUDDHISM_SERICULTURE_AND_THE_SILKWORM_GOD_A_SVAGHOS_A

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 17, 2020 10:52 PM

Title: Re: cannot become arhant while having buddha becoming view?

Content:

Commentarial Theravāda doctrine is the potential for arahantship, like that for paccekabodhi or anuttara sammāsambodhi, comes about through multi-life development of the ten paramīs, with differing lengths of time needed for each attainment. Thus:

Wisdom-predominant Buddhas: four incalculables and 100,000 aeons

Faith-predominant Buddhas: eight incalculables and 100,000 aeons

Energy-predominant Buddhas: sixteen incalculables and 100,000 aeons

Paccekabuddhas: two incalculables and 100,000 aeons

Chief disciples: one incalculable period and 100,000 aeons

Great disciples & mother, father, son and attendant of a Buddha: 100,000 aeons

Ordinary arahant disciples: 100-1,000 aeons

And so those who start as worldlings and advance through all four ariyan paths and fruits in a single life will not have started as complete beginners.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 1:11 AM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

Chapter XVIII - nāmarūpapariccheda

Chapter XIX - paccayapariggaha

Chapter XX - sammāsana

Chapters XX - XXI - udayabbaya

Chapter XXI - bhaṅga, bhayatupaṭṭhāna, ādīnava, nibbidā, muñcitukamyatā, paṭisaṅkhā, saṅkhārupekkhā, anuloma

Chapter XXII - gotrabhū, magga, phala, paccavekkhaṇa

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 6:49 AM

Title: Re: cannot become arhant while having buddha becoming view?

Content:

We can make an effort *as if* we already have sufficient paramī for stream-entry or higher in the present life. If we do in fact have sufficient paramī then our efforts may yield success; if we don't, then our efforts will contribute to our paramī development for the future.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 9:36 AM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

They are not mentioned by name in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. Rather, the catuparamatthadhamma scheme is how the commentaries construe the material in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka as being organised.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 10:51 AM

Title: Re: cannot become arhant while having buddha becoming view?

Content:

I don't know. But the Indians have always been pretty good at maths and I suppose the data might come from recollection of former lives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 2:27 PM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

If we're approaching this issue emically, i.e., from the classical Theravada's own presuppositions, then anything stated about paramatthadhammas that is to be found in the commentaries but not to be found in the Tipiṭaka would be viewed as a commentarial detail, not a commentarial invention. Remember the old commentaries (i.e. the ones that Buddhaghosa and Dhammapāla were translating from) are also held to date from the First Council.

The short answer to your question is that there are some features of the paramatthadhamma conception that are found in the Tipiṭaka (e.g., the notion of a dhamma's function, *rasa*, appears in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, while its characteristic, *lakkhaṇa*, appears in the Nettippakaraṇa), some that are derived inferentially from the Tipiṭaka, and some that have come down to us on the authority of the commentaries alone. In short, three out of the classical Theravada's four sources of authority are

represented – all of them except "personal opinion".

To say more than that I would need to know which aspects of the paramatthadhamma conception you have in mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 18, 2020 5:03 PM

Title: Re: head splitting

Content:

But the Ani Sutta that you rejected earlier in this thread isn't about how emptiness is conceived in the Mahayana.

The "discourses connected with emptiness" that it refers to are defined elsewhere as those discourses that deal with things that the Buddha declared to be empty (i.e. of self or what pertains to self), namely, khandhas, dhātus and āyatanas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2020 11:05 AM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

I would guess that Bhikkhu Bodhi probably has in mind the Kathāvatthu and its commentary, in particular the very first debate, "On the Person" (Puggalakathā) and perhaps the debate with the Sarvāstivādins on whether a dhamma persists through the three periods of time. If you don't have a copy already, B.C. Law's translation of the Kathāvatthu Atthakathā is available online:

https://archive.org/details/debatescommentaryatthakathabclaw_178_p/mode/2up

Points of Controversy, Shwe Zan Aung's translation of the Kathāvatthu itself, is available from Sutta Central, though it's better to get a scanned copy from archive.org as the Sutta Central version lacks the footnotes.

Other than that I don't get the impression that the Abhidhamma Piṭaka itself had much influence on the general commentarial conception of the nature of a dhamma. To the extent that their claims about the nature of a dhamma are inferential ones, the commentators more often cite passages from the Suttanta Piṭaka, in particular the Khandha and Saḷāyatana-vaggas of the SN, and the Paṭisambhidāmagga, Nettippakaraṇa, Niddesa and Milindapañha of the KN.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

Everything that's classified as a paramattha dhamma in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is also classified as such in the Atthakathās. So with regard to content there's no innovation here on the part of Anuruddha. Then the order in which the four are arranged by Anuruddha seems to be loosely modelled on that of the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, where cittas and cetasikas are covered in the first book, the Cittuppādaṅga, matter in the second, the Rūpaṅga, while nibbāna is first mentioned in the third book, Nikkhepaṅga, and treated in detail in the fourth, the Aṭṭhakathāṅga.

So as far as I can tell Anuruddha's only innovation in this connection is his giving the scheme a name: catuparamatthadhamma – a term that doesn't seem to appear in any text before the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2020 9:29 PM

Title: Re: Is there such a kind of rule

Content:

Not in any Indian Vinaya. They sound more like the absurdly ritualistic regulations that you find in the Rule of Baizhang, as used in Chinese Ch'an monasteries. There's an English translation of it

https://web.archive.org/web/20130210114955/http://www.bdkamerica.org/digital/dBET_T2025_Baizhang_2006.pdf if you want to check.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 19, 2020 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Buddha and Statecraft

Content:

But I think it could be improved still further by replacing "decree" with "establish", to show that it isn't just laws that are referred to here, but longstanding traditions, institutions and practices of every sort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 20, 2020 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Buddha and Statecraft

Content:

The kshatriya states of the Vajjis, Licchavis and Mallas seem to have been birds of a feather in their political arrangements, so although we're told only a little about each, by putting all the material together we get quite a rich picture of how they carried on. These are their entries in the DPPN...

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/vajji.html>
<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/licchavi.html>
<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/malla.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 20, 2020 5:46 PM
Title: Re: What exactly the status of the Sotapanna?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 21, 2020 8:07 AM
Title: Re: Is there such a kind of rule
Content:
It's not an ancient fan. It's a modern ceremonial fan that indicates that its owner bears the rank of "chao khun".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2020 2:54 PM
Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?
Content:
If you were reborn as a nāga you wouldn't be scared of snakes. You'd be their boss.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2020 3:14 PM
Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?
Content:
But that doesn't mean you wouldn't like it if it became your body architecture.

I'm reminded of a story from the commentaries where an evil queen gets reborn as some kind of blood-sucking insect, but with the ability to recall her former life. While sitting at a roadside with another beetle of the same species she sees a royal chariot going by. She tells her fellow beetle that the king riding in the chariot is her former husband. The other beetle asks her if she still feels any wifely affection for him. The evil-queen-turned-beetle scoffs at the idea and replies that if she got the chance she'd happily suck every drop of blood from the king's body to feed her present beetle husband.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2020 4:29 PM
Title: Passing of the abbot of Wat Pa Ban Tad
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2020 6:58 PM
Title: Re: Right View and anicca
Content:

In those suttas that actually say something about anicca-saññā (as opposed to those that merely mention it by name) it appears to be associated with an advanced level of insight. The commonest context is that of the practice by which a non-returner abandons the "I am conceit" (by developing anicca-saññā) and advances to arahatta. The next most common is in connection with the attainment of stream-entry.

In the Abhidhamma anicca-saññā is taken to be the saññā that arises conascently with either sammā-diṭṭhi of the eightfold or sammā-ñāṇa of the tenfold path.

According to this understanding, the saññā in anicca-saññā isn't being used in any special sense; it's just the plain old third aggregate. If it didn't arise conascently at moments of insight, then the experience wouldn't be "marked"; not being marked it wouldn't be remembered; with no remembrance there would be no development - just moments of insight that occur and are immediately lost.

And so to answer your question, since the saññā in anicca-saññā is just the plain old third aggregate, it can't be the same as sammā-diṭṭhi, which is a mode of paññā, not saññā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 23, 2020 9:33 PM
Title: Re: Right View and anicca
Content:

Your question seems to be based on the assumption that bhāvanā-maya paññā is the only kind of paññā. But this isn't the case. Understanding via hearing/learning (suta-maya paññā) and understanding via thinking (cintā-maya paññā) both precede understanding via development.

Not only can there be paññā before one starts to practise, there MUST be or it will be wrong practice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2020 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Passing of the abbot of Wat Pa Ban Tad

Content:

No. As with his late teacher's charitable enterprises, the money would be from personal donations to Ajahn Sudjai himself. Monastery funds can't be diverted to such ends and can only be spent on the needs of the sangha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2020 11:38 AM

Title: Re: Passing of the abbot of Wat Pa Ban Tad

Content:

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2020 1:52 PM

Title: Re: Subtle body

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2020 4:06 PM

Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?

Content:

Start with chapters 5 and 6 of G.P. Malalasekera's

https://archive.org/details/paliliteratureofceylonmalalasekeranum_713_i, (1928)

Then for more depth, chapter 5 of Oskar von Hinüber's

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1euzliOveckiDY2QGnXOeQ4MSHPEK62X_

Then:

Toshiichi Endo,

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1vBdM0lu4qPRDQz0t6_TZr0VgM64tDB5i, (1997)

And if you can manage to find a copy:

Toshiichi Endo, *Studies in Pali Commentarial Literature: sources, controversies and insights*, (2013)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 24, 2020 8:15 PM

Title: Re: 3 things + 3 more

Content:

The Dīgha and Majjhima Nikāyas, and the Dhammapada.

Or, if you want it narrowed down...

DN 15, MN 22, and the Dhammapada's Brāhmaṇavagga.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2020 6:51 AM

Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 25, 2020 10:14 AM

Title: Re: Passing of the abbot of Wat Pa Ban Tad

Content:

I've read three different (though not necessarily incompatible) explanations offered in the Thai language press: that Ajahn Sudjai had expressed a wish for a quick and unfussy funeral; that cremating the body without delay would serve to minimize the size of the crowds attending the funeral (i.e. only the locals would be able to make it) and thus reduce the risk of Covid infection; and that the condition of the ajahn's body would have been a health hazard if it wasn't cremated quickly.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2020 12:48 AM

Title: Re: What is Nāga world and Supanna world? where are they located?

Content:

As you can see from the Vinaya narrative above, at least some nāgas are animals, but I'm not sure if it's the case that all of them are.

For example, are the nāga followers of Virūpakka in the Cātummahārājika heaven animals? Or are they devas of serpentine form? I've never seen any explicit statement either way, but I think the Theravāda position ought to be that they are devas, for at the Third Council the Theravādins rejected the claim of the Andhakas that there might be animals living in the heavenly realms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2020 1:07 AM

Title: Re: When sotapanna dark kamma ripen...

Content:

Since the ripening of a dark kamma at the moment before death would bring about rebirth in one of the four lower realms, and since the sotāpanna is unqualifiedly stated to be freed from being reborn in those realms, it follows that there must be something in the nature of a sotāpanna that makes it impossible for a dark kamma to ripen at that moment.

The Mahānāmasutta, quoted earlier by Rob, tells us what that something is: the sotāpanna's saddhā, sīla, suta, cāga and paññā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2020 1:32 PM

Title: Re: When sotapanna dark kamma ripen...

Content:

We are not using the expression in the same way. I'm referring to the kamma whose vipāka determines one's next birth, not the kamma whose vipāka causes one's death.

Owing to an unripened dark kamma, a sekha disciple may meet his death by violence, but the kamma that determines his next birth will not be a dark one, for the possibility of a dark kamma ripening at that moment will be over-ridden by his accumulation of those qualities stated in the Mahānāmasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2020 5:50 PM

Title: Re: When sotapanna dark kamma ripen...

Content:

The traditional understanding is that if someone has committed one of those five, then it's a certainty that the ripening of this kamma will be what determines their next birth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 26, 2020 6:06 PM

Title: Re: Passing of the abbot of Wat Pa Ban Tad

Content:

How would I know?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 27, 2020 7:03 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 27, 2020 5:14 PM
Title: Re: Was the Buddha attached to rites & rituals (silabbatupadana) ?
Content:
In general use accayo maṃ accagamā means something like, "I blundered," "I screwed up," or "I committed a faux pas."

It's only in Vinaya contexts that the meaning of accaya needs to be conveyed by the word "transgression", as in the class of offences called thullaccaya, "weighty offence".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 27, 2020 5:19 PM
Title: Re: Living with intact sila is making me more confident man in soceity and many more
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 27, 2020 5:39 PM
Title: Re: Nagarjuna wants Mahayanists to fear śrāvakas as one who loves life fears beheading
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed May 27, 2020 6:11 PM
Title: Re: Was the Buddha attached to rites & rituals (silabbatupadana) ?
Content:
I do wish people would get out of the habit of using the archaic translation "attachment to rites and rituals" for silabbataparāmāsa. The fact that a 'rite' is the same thing as a 'ritual' should alone be enough to alert readers to the unlikelihood of this being the

correct rendering of sīla and vata.

To answer your question, there is no outward behaviour whatsoever that would allow us to reliably infer: "This person has sīlabbataparāmāsa; he misapprehends/is attached to precepts and vowed observances."

A sotāpanna might spend all day long undertaking precepts and vowed observances (or performing rites and rituals, if you will) without his actions involving either misapprehension or adhesion to sīla or vata.

Conversely, a puthujjana may be up to his eyeballs in sīlabbataparāmāsa even though the sīla and/or vata he observes are very minimal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2020 7:15 PM

Title: Re: Avijja and moha

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2020 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Te atthe anusāsati

Content:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Historical_present

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2020 7:48 PM

Title: Re: Te atthe anusāsati

Content:

Yes. "Those [te] matters [atthe]." Third person accusative plural.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 27, 2020 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Was the Buddha attached to rites & rituals (sīlabbatupadana) ?

Content:

Well, that was my point. Your and beanyan's objection to this part of the story is based on a translation of accayo that overstates things.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2020 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Was the Buddha attached to rites & rituals (silabbatupadana) ?

Content:

Yes. In different contexts the term is glossed by the commentators as either aparādhā or atikkama, according to whether the act or speech was closer to a mistake in etiquette or to a failing in sīla.

This distinction is also reflected in the work of Pali-to-Thai translators who use "transgression" (kwaam luang-lamoed / ความล่วงละเมิด) or "offence" (aabat / อาบัติ) in Vinaya contexts, but "fault" or "flaw" (thot / โทษ) in contexts where it's merely an accidental blunder.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 28, 2020 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Avijja and moha

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 6:11 AM

Title: Re: Nibbāna & Asaṅkhata

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 6:37 AM

Title: Re: Was the Buddha attached to rites & rituals (silabbatupadana) ?

Content:

I wouldn't translate it any differently, except to replace "transgression" with something like "blunder", "gaffe", "faux pas", etc. The point is, the whole exchange is a boilerplate formula that's invariably used in the suttas when someone is asking the Buddha's pardon for something or other. It's extremely unlikely that they all used identical phrases to do so or that the Buddha always used identical phrases in his response. But in an orally preserved text it would be a needless burden to have to record precisely how things were worded on each occasion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 6:18 PM

Title: Re: Do western philosophies have anything similar to precepts or Vinaya?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 6:35 PM

Title: Re: bahusaccena

Content:

Bāhus(s)acca is formed from bāhus(s)uta with the addition of the -ya suffix (used to denote "the state of..."), followed by consonant assimilation. Analogous formations are:

paṇḍiccaṃ from paṇḍita

vepullaṃ from vepula

kāruṇṇaṃ from kāruṇā

kosallaṃ from kusala

sāmaññaṃ from samaṇa

gelaṇṇaṃ from gilāna

ādhipaccaṃ from adhipati

muṭṭhassaccaṃ from muṭṭhassati

sohajjaṃ from suhadaya

pārisajjaṃ from parisā

maddavaṃ from mudu

āsabhaṃ from usabha

Etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 7:29 PM

Title: Re: The Raft Simile

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 29, 2020 8:25 PM

Title: Re: bahusaccena

Content:

The one posted by Volo seems good on noun declensions and verb conjugations, but it doesn't have the endings used to form primary and secondary derivatives. For these chapter 13 of Duroiselle's grammar is the best I can think of.

<http://www.pratyeka.org/duroiselle/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 11:00 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth is ended

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 11:49 AM

Title: Re: I am offering a full day Mudita Meditation retreat this saturday on line

Content:

You may need to contact Cedric via his homepage as he hasn't logged in since the day he joined and posted his ad.

<https://www.cedricreeves.com/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 12:22 PM

Title: Re: shocked to see sariputta is a reincarnation of Hindu god Krishna

Content:

Rouse, one of the 19th century translators of the Jātakas, proposed that the story of Kaṇha in the Ghata Jātaka borrowed from the history of Kṛṣṇa in the Harivaṃśa Purāṇa. I've never read the latter, but Dutt's translation is online if you want to check it out:

<https://archive.org/details/AProseEnglishTranslationOfHarivamsh>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 1:15 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth is ended

Content:

In your talent for inaptness you and Roger are birds of a feather, differing from each other only with regard to the particular sense of the word you've decided to fixate upon.

.

Roger Irrelevant.jpg (38.89 KiB) Viewed 1188 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 1:43 PM

Title: Re: nāma-rūpa in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Where the suttas define nāma as vedanā, saññā, cetanā, phasso, and manasikāro the commentators view this as a summary treatment in which the first two items refer to their eponymous khandhas, while the next three have been selected to represent all the fifty cetasikas that are included in saṅkhārakkhandha. The Vibhaṅgasutta's commentary states that the basis for selecting these particular three is their presence in even the weakest kinds of citta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Is there a hidden message in Buddha's teaching?

Content:

He doesn't say that they are later additions, but that they are not "safe bet" arguments and no one knows if they date from the Buddha or are later additions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 3:02 PM

Title: Re: shocked to see sariputta is a reincarnation of Hindu god Krishna

Content:

That's certainly how Jātaka stories are viewed and represented in all Buddhist traditions. But academic scholars and contributors to Wikipedia don't take it as a given that a religious tradition's emic view of its own texts is necessarily the truth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 3:38 PM

Title: Re: shocked to see sariputta is a reincarnation of Hindu god Krishna

Content:

I've never contributed to Wiki, but I understand that they have a ban on original research by the contributors. And so in the case of the Jātakas, both emic and etic accounts of these texts would need to be based upon and to cite published works.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 30, 2020 4:05 PM

Title: Re: nāma-rūpa in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

The detailed accounts of dependent arising that I'm familiar with (i.e., those of the Visuddhimagga, Vibhaṅga Atthakathā and Nidānasutta Atthakathā) don't stipulate in detail the roles played by each of the cetasikas that comprise nāma. Having briefly stated what the cetasikas are, from then on they just treat of nāma as a whole. I assume that this is because nothing needs to be added to what is stated about each of these cetasikas elsewhere.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 31, 2020 12:52 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

That might well happen if the person doesn't like snakes. But it would happen in a later javana process than the one in which the hose was first misapprehended as a snake.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 1, 2020 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

Where in the Vinaya is this stated?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 1, 2020 10:52 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

You seem to be using "associated" in its common sense, but the OP (or rather the text that he alludes to) is using it in its technical abhidhammic sense.

In the Abhidhamma's theory of conditional relations, "association condition" (sampayutta-paccaya) doesn't mean any old kind of causal relationship. For nāmadhamma A to be classed as "associated with" (sampayutta) nāmadhamma B...

1. A and B must arise simultaneously.
2. A must be the conditioning factor of B, the conditioned factor.
3. They must take the same ārammaṇa.
4. They must have the same physical base.
5. They must cease simultaneously.

The Abhidhamma holds that wrong view can only be conascent and associated with an attachment-rooted consciousness, not an aversion-rooted or a delusion-rooted one. The fact that wrong view might be present in an earlier or a later javana process from one involving aversion-rooted cittas would not amount to an "association with..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 1, 2020 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

I don't know. I'm afraid I can't make any sense of what you're trying to say.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2020 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

No. Though the one kind of citta conditions the other, both the attachment-rooted citta and its accompanying wrong view, would have ceased before the aversion-rooted citta arose. Take the case where the view is sakkāyadiṭṭhi:

A series of sense-doors processes whose vedanā is painful bodily feeling is followed by a series of attachment-rooted (lobhamūla) javanas accompanied by the wrong view 'I am this feeling' or 'this feeling is mine' or 'this feeling' is in me', which in turn is followed by aversion-rooted javanas in which the diṭṭhi-appropriated painful bodily feeling becomes the ārammaṇa of aversion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2020 1:31 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

Not just "can be..." but "always is...." in the sense that the aversion and the wrong view always arise in separate moments.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2020 10:09 PM

Title: Re: Rāhula

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 2, 2020 10:43 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

Some cittas arise with one or another of the three unwholesome roots or three wholesome roots. Those that do are rightly called lobhamūla, dosamūla, mohamūla, alobhamūla, adosamūla or amohamūla cittas. Those in which these roots are absent (e.g. eye-consciousness) are called rootless.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 3, 2020 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Rāhula

Content:

You're confusing the Buddha with Saṅgāmaji. There's no such story about Rāhula.

<https://suttacentral.net/ud1.8/en/anandajoti>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 4, 2020 3:52 AM

Title: Re: Commentary and the Commentarial Tradition

Content:

It's based on Nibbāna as it was taught by the Buddha and as his teachings were preserved in the Pali Canon. And so when –as often happens– someone joins a Theravada forum and immediately announces that he's attained Nibbāna and would like to set Theravadins straight about all the things the Canon gets wrong, it's unlikely that his doctrinal emendations will meet with a ready reception. "For us all dhammas are rooted in the Blessed One" ... and not in every Tom, Dick or Harry who believes himself to be an arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 4, 2020 12:36 PM

Title: Re: Commentary and the Commentarial Tradition

Content:

Some have been translated; most haven't. There've already been plenty of DW threads about what's available.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 4, 2020 2:57 PM
Title: Re: Commentary and the Commentarial Tradition
Content:
Right. Hence the need for saddhā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 4, 2020 6:04 PM
Title: Re: Which to purchase, Vibhanga or Commentary?
Content:
I would.

But if you want the Book of Analysis with its intro and notes (these have been removed from the Sutta Central edition), a scanned copy is legally available at archive.org

<https://archive.org/details/Vibhanga/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 4, 2020 9:47 PM
Title: Re: Why Theravada?
Content:
Off-topic posts removed. The thread is about why members chose the Theravada. If you wish to talk about why you didn't choose it or what you believe to be deficient about it, please start a new thread.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 5, 2020 12:38 AM
Title: Re: On your own authority
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 5, 2020 3:26 PM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:
Only one, as far as I know: U Kyaw Khine's 1996 translation of the Dhammasaṅgaṇī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 6, 2020 12:26 PM

Title: Re: itivādappamokkhānisamsattham

Content:

... this is also repeated in the Critical Pali Dictionary, but it doesn't fit naturally in any of the contexts where it occurs and appears to be just a wild guess based on an imagined connection with itivutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 11:44 AM

Title: Re: Our personal experience

Content:

Thrice already you've flounced out of the forum (departing with some choice Parthian shots) when your non-dualist antinomian ideas didn't get any traction. And thrice you've slunk back in again, barely able to stay away for even a week. And now you threaten a fourth departure.

I wonder, Peter, can all who attain the PeterC86 version of liberation expect to become similarly petulant, irresolute and unstable in their conduct? And if so, why would they ever wish to aspire to such a state?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 12:21 PM

Title: Re: Cittas not resultant from kamma? Wrong!

Content:

In the Abhidhamma cittas and cetasikas are not the same thing. The former is a momentary consciousness, the latter are the various mental factors that arise simultaneously with each citta.

Some cittas are kamma-resultants (vipākacittas), some are not. If a citta is a kamma-resultant then its accompanying cetasikas will also be kamma-resultant. If a citta is not, then its cetasikas won't be either.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 12:29 PM

Title: Re: Why is there no hatred associated with wrong view?

Content:

In future when posting to the Abhidhamma sub-forum please try to ground your posts in the Abhidhamma, not in your personal <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/folkpsych-theory/> (i.e., "a psychological theory constituted by the platitudes about the mind ordinary people are inclined to endorse").

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 12:33 PM
Title: Re: drinks after noon
Content:
Yes.

For monks molasses are allowable as a tonic after midday. On the basis of the four great references (the Vinaya ones, not those in the Parinibbānasutta) this is universally agreed to extend to refined sugars like glucose, fructose, sucrose, etc.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 1:35 PM
Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion
Content:
Not in the very same moment, but during a single meditation session one might do both.

For example, when developing karuṇā-bhāvanā with an enemy as the object, if resentment should arise toward that person then it's recommended that one resort to the resentment-overcoming practices used in mettā-bhāvanā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 3:31 PM
Title: Re: Our personal experience
Content:
I'm not sure what you mean. I delete each PM as soon as I've answered it and I don't see any PM from you in my inbox. Perhaps I deleted it in error.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 4:13 PM
Title: Re: drinks after noon
Content:
Yes, but "sickness" includes fatigue in the case of the five tonics and thirst in the case of fruit juice.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 5:41 PM

Title: Re: I'm done with laylife.

Content:

Where to go would depend in large part on what you're proposing to do when you've been ordained.

For example, if your plan is to spend most of your time doing Goenka-style meditation, then that would effectively rule out all the monasteries where some other meditation system is taught and insisted upon. As there aren't (afaik) any monasteries where Goenka meditation is the main practice, you'd need to find one where monks are free to practice whatever system they like. That would be possible in the Dhammayutt forest tradition, for example, or the Ajahn Chah tradition.

But there may be a further limitation if you're the sort of Goenka practitioner who will only meditate either with other Goenkaites or alone. In virtually all Ajahn Chah monasteries, and in quite a lot of Dhammayutt forest monasteries, monks will be required to attend morning and evening chanting and group meditation, which means you'll have to sit with people engaged in non-Goenkaite practices. To avoid this you'd need to find a monastery where even a newly-ordained monk would be allowed to keep to himself and get on with his own practice. I don't know of any monastery in the West that would be prepared to accept you on those sort of terms, though there are quite a few in Asia that would.

On the other hand, if you're more flexible than the average Goenkaite, or if your plan is to devote your time chiefly to study, then the opportunities will be broader.

Then there's the matter of your wife and children. If your mind is really made up that the marriage is finished, then it would be desirable for you to make some kind of solid legal settlement before embarking on monastic life. You'll need to ensure that you fulfil the Vinaya requirement of being free from debt, which in the West means that your family will need to be left properly provided for. To just hand over all your property to your wife and then leave, trusting in nothing more than an oral agreement, wouldn't be a very satisfactory way of doing this. It could backfire later if your wife changed her mind and decided she wanted more.

One last thing ... I think you need to cool down and slow down a little. If you go to a monastery expressing yourself in the frenetic and feverish manner that you've been doing on DW this last few days, they'll think you're unstable and will be unlikely to even let you stay, let alone treat you as a serious candidate for the monkhood.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 6:29 PM

Title: Re: I'm done with laylife.

Content:

I can't say unless you clarify what you aim to do once ordained.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 7, 2020 8:01 PM

Title: Re: I'm done with laylife.

Content:

I don't know of any monastery in the West that would be likely to take you. Probably best to wait till international travel becomes possible again and then go to Asia.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 6:16 AM

Title: Re: Cittas not resultant from kamma? Wrong!

Content:

But Ajahn Maha Bua wasn't an ābhidhammika. I doubt there's any monk in the Ajahn Mun tradition who would be a reliable source for understanding the Abhidhamma.

Abhidhamma is best learned the classical Abhidhamma texts and from those modern teachers who've devoted their lives to the study of these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 7:02 AM

Title: Re: I'm done with laylife.

Content:

When you're senior enough to live independently then anything's possible, but in your formative training the kind of set-up they have in Dhammayutt forest wats will come closest to what you describe, except the bit about only coming to the monastery at night; that wouldn't be permitted.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 2:07 PM

Title: Re: People are ...?

Content:

Just to be contrary...

It seems most prudent to me to assume that every new person you meet is evil (and perhaps incorrigibly so) unless or until they prove themselves otherwise. In so doing:

1. One will never suffer from disappointed expectations.
2. One will occasionally be in for a pleasant surprise when the assumption turns out to be mistaken.

3. Since it's stated in numerous suttas that the great majority of humans are headed for rebirth in the lower realms (which obviously doesn't come about as a reward for being virtuous) one's assumption will more often than not be in line with the Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 4:15 PM

Title: Re: Moderation in food, 6th precept and weight loss

Content:

cattāro pañca ālope, abhuvā udakaṃ pive |
alaṃ phāsuvihārāya, pahitattassa bhikkhuno ||

With four or five lumps still to eat
Let him then end by drinking water;
For energetic bhikkhus' needs
This should suffice to live in comfort.
(Theragāthā 983)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 4:47 PM

Title: Re: Moderation in food, 6th precept and weight loss

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

From a long-term point of view (i.e., the next life and the life after it) developing mettā jhāna wouldn't be much of a "backup plan", for non-Ariyan Brahmā deities are mostly reborn in the lower realms after their jhānic merit is exhausted.

In the event that you don't attain stream-entry in this life, you will need to ensure that you will continue to be reborn in states of existence where edifying encounters with the Dhamma can take place. For that, kāmāvacara rather than rūpāvacara merit is what's needed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 8:09 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

Mettā jhāna is absorption attained through the practice of mettabhāvanā. It isn't possible to enter jhāna with some other nimitta and then switch to developing mettā while in that jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 8, 2020 11:34 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

Not while in the jhāna, but one could do it after emerging from it. Indeed that would be a particularly good time to do it, since it's normal for the mind to be "pure and bright, unblemished, free from defects, malleable, wieldy and steady" for some duration after emergence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 1:57 AM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

I'm not sure what you would have me conclude from the links on your page. The first two are to passages in the Vibhaṅga that don't even mention the brahmavihāras. The next two are to the entire texts of the Vimuttimagga and Visuddhimagga.

Let me remark for now that according to the Dhammasaṅgaṇī the attributes of a citta while in mettā jhāna include stasis (ṭhiti), full stasis (saṇṭhiti), absorbed stasis (avaṭṭhiti), absence of divergence (avisāhāra), non-distraction (avikkhepa), and absence of thought being diverted (avisāhaṭamānasatā).

This doesn't sound like a state in which the sort of discursive mentation posited by Buddhists of the neo-Pubbaseliya persuasion would be likely to be taking place.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Does Buddhism recommend that kind of Poojas on behalf of Davas other than offering merits?

Content:

See the commentary here:

<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=ftnADQAAQBAJ&pg=PA682#v=onepage&q&f=false>

e

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 5:35 PM

Title: Re: Can the devas who saw the Buddha teach the exact Dhamma?

Content:

Just going from memory, I don't recall any narratives about the Suddhāvāsa anāgāmins and arahants interacting with any humans other than the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 5:36 PM

Title: Re: Can the devas who saw the Buddha teach the exact Dhamma?

Content:

Please keep the posts "classical". Off topic and non-compliant ones will be removed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 6:55 PM

Title: Re: Planes of humans and animals

Content:

A late 16th century spelling of 'smooth'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

Can you quote the paragraphs from each text that you are interpreting in this way?

I don't see in either account any description of mental recitation of the body parts going on while one is in jhāna. As far as I can tell, in both texts the recitation is part of the description of the pre-jhāna preparatory work.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 9, 2020 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Strange experience with a theravada monk. Please help to understand this monk.

Content:

I don't think it would be applicable, for it seems he is now a lay teacher, not a monk. The

photos showing him in robes date from five years ago, while all the recent ones show him dressed in white.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 1:05 AM

Title: Re: Strange experience with a theravada monk. Please help to understand this monk.

Content:

I expect you'll find out when you go to them, but I'm afraid I've no acquaintance with these sort of matters.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

Kāmāvacara cittas are those belonging to the sense-sphere, as opposed to those belonging to the refined form (rūpāvacara), formless (arūpāvacara) and supramundane (lokuttara) spheres.

Examples would include the cittas belong to the five sense-doors, the unwholesome cittas (greed-rooted, hate-rooted, delusion-rooted) and the great wholesome cittas (the consciousnesses responsible for the generation of non-jhānic merit, including the preliminary development of any meditation subject).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 10:56 AM

Title: Re: Can the devas who saw the Buddha teach the exact Dhamma?

Content:

Many examples of what? The Bhaddekaratta Sutta has nothing to do with devas who were taught by past Buddhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 4:13 PM

Title: Re: Mahāyāna Ideas in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 4:37 PM

Title: Re: Keeping muscles strong?

Content:

Jogging down the high street wouldn't be in line with the restrained behaviour in public places enjoined by the sekhiya rules. On the other hand, since it wouldn't be any offence to do so on monastery grounds, presumably the monk means that it's not a customary thing for monks to do and would likely attract criticism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 4:45 PM

Title: Re: Mahāyāna Ideas in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Even a non-bodhisatta yogi, if he had successfully developed mettā- and karuṇā-bhāvanā as illimitables, would be capable of generating an aspiration to do some meritorious deed "for the sake of all beings" even though only a finite number of beings would concretely benefit from deed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 5:04 PM

Title: Re: Fourth precept question

Content:

It can be inferred from the commentarial definitions already quoted: the person who is reckoned to be engaged in such and such trade is the one whose income comes from the sale of the goods or service in question. His employees get their income from their service to him and as such are not themselves traders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 5:09 PM

Title: Re: Keeping muscles strong?

Content:

Nobody would object if a monk practised yoga in the privacy of his own room, but in some monasteries it wouldn't be acceptable to do it in public view.

Even jogging is allowed in certain monasteries. I don't know if they still do, but in the 1980s some of the Chithurst monks used to go jogging in the nearby woods, including the then abbot, Ajahn Sumedho.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 10, 2020 6:01 PM

Title: Re: Can the devas who saw the Buddha teach the exact Dhamma?

Content:

Sorry, I misread it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2020 9:28 AM

Title: Re: Fourth precept question

Content:

What if he was? Following his boss's orders still wouldn't make him into a trader.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: People are ...?

Content:

No and yes. No in the sense that social Darwinism shouldn't be advocated by Buddhists as a desirable state of affairs, but yes in the sense that the "war of all against all" should be acknowledged, firstly, as having been the state of nature before the social contract (the account of this in the King Mahāsammata episode of the Aggañña Sutta matches point for point that in Hobbes's Leviathan) and secondly, as being the state to which humanity is ever-labile to revert.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2020 3:40 PM

Title: Re: Did Thanissaro Bhikkhu really make such a comment on the attainments of Pa-auk and Mahasi??

Content:

This is a bit odd. If Dr. Chu thinks that making such judgments is "very arrogant", then why quote the words of anybody on the matter?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2020 8:08 PM

Title: Re: People are ...?

Content:

If the suttas are true, then my assumption is in line with reality. As to what kind of spiral one sets up, surely this will depend on one's words and deeds towards others, not one's assumptions about their probable character.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 11, 2020 11:34 PM

Title: Re: lifespan of other beings

Content:

The Abhidhamma Piṭaka's Vibhanga gives the lifespan in each of the realms of devas and brahmās.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/vb18>

Scroll down to: Age Limit

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2020 2:06 PM

Title: Re: about 3rd precept

Content:

They don't. Nor do they call sex inside marriage 'wholesome'. In the suttas no sexual acts of any sort are ever called wholesome. In relation to sex 'wholesome' is applied only to certain acts of sexual abstention —with inappropriate partners in the case of 5-precept-observers; with anyone at all in the case of 8-precept-observers— not to any act of sexual indulgence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 12, 2020 3:25 PM

Title: Re: lifespan of other beings

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2020 12:04 AM

Title: Re: about 3rd precept

Content:

The different sets of sīla are concerned only with bodily and verbal actions. The effort to refrain from such thoughts comes under the training in samādhī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2020 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Sick Relatives

Content:
Splendid.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 13, 2020 9:33 AM

Title: Re: 16 insight knowledges in the Visuddhimagga?

Content:

The main canonical source is the Paṭisambhidāmagga in which fourteen of the ñāṇas are described, i.e. all except nāmarūpapariccheda and anuloma).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 2:26 PM

Title: Re: People are ...?

Content:

But even an uninstructed puthujjana can have his heroic moments. If it were otherwise there'd be no chance of liberation for anyone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 2:52 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Thanissaro's The Buddhist Monastic Code ???

Content:

He is quoting from the Vinaya Piṭaka.

Note that when Ven. Thanissaro refers to the "Vibhaṅga", he doesn't mean the Abhidhamma's Vibhaṅga but rather the Vibhaṅga (sometimes called the Suttavibhaṅga) of the Vinaya Piṭaka.

The Vinaya Piṭaka is divided into the Vibhaṅga (covering the rules of the bhikkhu and bhikkhuni pātimokkhas), the Khandhakas (comprising the Mahāvagga and Cūḷavagga and covering all the rules and procedures that fall outside of the pātimokkhas), and the Parivāra (a systematized presentation of all the Vinaya rules according to their shared and distinct features).

Pali text of the Vibhaṅga's third pārājika rule

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj3/pli/ms>

Translation by I.B. Horner, amended by Bh. Brahmali

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj3/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 3:10 PM
Title: Re: Ven. Thanissaro's The Buddhist Monastic Code ???
Content:
<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd1/en/horner-brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 3:35 PM
Title: Re: Question on energy
Content:
Yes, they're two names for the same thing.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 7:53 PM
Title: Re: Monastics protesting social injustice
Content:
Welcome back. Haven't seen you for years.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 9:15 PM
Title: Re: Ven. Thanissaro's The Buddhist Monastic Code ???
Content:
I'm completely in agreement with your conclusion that a monk should have no truck with assisting or condoning abortions at any stage of a pregnancy. But I don't agree with the reasoning that leads you to it.

1. For the conception or birth of a human, or the arising of a deva, the participles upapanna, uppanna, jāta, sañjāta, nibbatta, abhinibbatta and pātubhūta are all instantiated in the texts and virtually interchangeable. The most that can be said is that upapanna is used more frequently in this sense than uppanna, while uppanna is used more frequently for the arising of phenomena.

2. The standard expressions for a woman's coming to know of her pregnancy speak of the awareness arising in her heart (hadaye) or mind (mane/manamhi), or of it occurring to her or within her. Nowhere is it spoken of as arising in her belly (kucchismiṃ). Nor is the knowledge referred to as citta or viññāṇa.

3. Besides the improbability of your interpretation, there's also a logical flaw in what you infer from it. If we define human life as starting from the time when a woman is aware that she's pregnant, it won't follow that there'll be zero scope for a monk assisting or condoning an abortion. It will actually make such assisting or condoning permissible in

some circumstances.

For example, a woman might inform a monk that she's recently had a one-night stand and doesn't know if she's pregnant but is worried that she might be. The monk could then provide her with an abortifacient or recommend one to her. If it turned out that she was pregnant and an abortion resulted, the monk could then claim to have done nothing wrong: "She told me that she wasn't aware that she was pregnant, but human life only begins when the mother is aware."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Vibhaṅga and Conception

Content:

Yes. The description is of what is cognizable about an embryo, not what an embryo cognizes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 14, 2020 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Vibhaṅga and Conception

Content:

You may be right. I think perhaps I'd better let Rob field these questions. It's a long time since I last studied the rebirth process and I'm very rusty on it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2020 9:04 AM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2020 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

They are part of the Vinaya Piṭaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 15, 2020 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection
Content:
The account states that they were lying down.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 15, 2020 10:35 PM
Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection
Content:
I think it's more likely the larvae of one of the species of Himalayan ghost moth. The larvae themselves don't have any aphrodisiac properties, but a parasitic fungus called *Ophiocordyceps sinensis* that grows on the larvae is much prized for this purpose.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2020 8:51 AM
Title: Re: The Pali word "Mahecca"
Content:
Those two are the Sanskrit forms.

Sanskrit
alpa + iccha > alpeccha
mahā + iccha > maheccha

Pali
appa + iccha > appiccha
mahā + iccha > mahiccha

Appiccha is having few or moderate wishes. Mahiccha is wanting a lot or being ambitious.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 16, 2020 9:59 AM
Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection
Content:
Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

How would you like me to be "more specific"?

In the case of the two stories about the arahant bhikkhus who were assaulted while sleeping I already provided a link to a translation of the relevant section of the Vinaya Piṭaka. Here it is again:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2020 8:18 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

The link I gave was to all of the translations of the passage maintained at Sutta Central.
This is to the English one:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj1/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 16, 2020 9:49 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

https://archive.org/stream/9TheBuddhaPeerlessBenefactorOfHumanityUShweAung/Tipitaka/PatisambhidamaggaThePathOfDiscriminationtr_ByVen_NanamoliCompleteOcred#mode/1up

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 12:19 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Thanissaro's The Buddhist Monastic Code ???

Content:

On the other hand, in Vinaya definitions of the types of pregnant woman, such knowledge is expressed using saññā, as in the expressions:

gabbhiniyā gabbhinisaññā - when a pregnant woman thinks she's pregnant.

gabbhiniyā vematikā - when a pregnant woman is in doubt about whether she's pregnant.

gabbhiniyā agabbhinisaññā - when a pregnant woman thinks she's non-pregnant.

agabbhiniyā gabbhinisaññā - when a non-pregnant woman thinks she's pregnant.

agabbhiniyā vematikā - when a non-pregnant woman is in doubt about whether she's pregnant.

agabbhiniyā agabbhinisaññā - when a non-pregnant woman thinks she's non-pregnant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 12:38 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

It doesn't mean that. If the girl wasn't considered to be a human being then the monk's action would not have been ruled an offence entailing suspension. (The allusion here is to the second saṅghādisesa rule which prohibits a monk's touching a human female with lustful intent).

The question in this scenario is whether the monk's action, deplorable as it was, amounted to a violation of the first pārājika rule (prohibiting sexual intercourse) or the third pārājika rule (prohibiting the deliberate killing of a human being). In both cases the answer is no, since the monk didn't have intercourse with her and didn't intend to kill her.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 12:49 PM

Title: Re: What Dhamma Book are you reading right now?

Content:

There isn't any book by Sāriputta like this. Perhaps you are thinking of either the Sāriputtasamyyutta in the Khandhavagga of the Samyyutta Nikāya or the Anupāda Sutta of the Majjhima Nikāya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 1:37 PM

Title: Re: Help to translate....

Content:

The suttas never explain the meaning of this phrase, but the section on dhammānussati in the Visuddhimagga gives nine explanations.

Tattha pariyattidhammo tāva svākkhāto ādimajjhapariyosānakalyāṇattā
sāttasabyañjanakevalaparipuṇṇaparissuddhabrahmacariyappakāsanattā ca.

Herein, the Dhamma of the scriptures is well proclaimed because it is good in the beginning, the middle, and the end, and because it announces the life of purity that is utterly perfect and pure with meaning and with detail.

Yañhi bhagavā ekagāthampi deseti, sā samantabhaddakattā dhammassa
paṭhamapādena ādikalyāṇā, dutiyatatiyapādehi majjhekalyāṇā, pacchimapādena
pariyosānakalyāṇā.

1. Even a single stanza of the Blessed One's teaching is good in the beginning with the first word, good in the middle with the second, third, etc., and good in the end with the last word, because the Dhamma is altogether admirable.

Ekānusandhikaṃ suttaṃ nidānena ādikalyāṇaṃ, nigamanena pariyosānakalyāṇaṃ,
sesena majjhekalyāṇaṃ.

2. A sutta with a single sequence of meaning is good in the beginning with the introduction, good in the end with the conclusion, and good in the middle with what is in between.

Nānānusandhikaṃ suttaṃ paṭhamānusandhinā ādikalyāṇaṃ, pacchimena pariyosānakalyāṇaṃ, sesehi majjhekalyāṇaṃ.

3. A sutta with several sequences of meaning is good in the beginning with the first sequence of meaning, good in the end with the last sequence of meaning, and good in the middle with the sequences of meaning in between.

Apica sanidānasauppattikattā ādikalyāṇaṃ, veneyyāṇaṃ anurūpato atthassa aviparītātāya ca hetudāharaṇayuttato ca majjhekalyāṇaṃ, sotūnaṃ saddhāpaṭilābhajananena nigamanena ca pariyosānakalyāṇaṃ.

4. Furthermore, it is good in the beginning with the introduction giving the place of and the origin giving the reason for its utterance. It is good in the middle because it suits those susceptible of being taught since it is unequivocal in meaning and reasoned with cause and example. It is good in the end with its conclusion that inspires faith in the hearers.

Sakalopi sāsanaadhammo attano atthabhūtena sīlena ādikalyāṇo, samathavipassanāmaggaḥalehi majjhekalyāṇo, nibbānena pariyosānakalyāṇo.

5. Also the entire Dhamma of the Dispensation is good in the beginning with virtue as one's own well-being. It is good in the middle with serenity and insight and with path and fruition. It is good in the end with Nibbāna.

Sīlasamādhīhi vā ādikalyāṇo, vipassanāmaggehi majjhekalyāṇo, phalanibbānehi pariyosānakalyāṇo.

6. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning with virtue and concentration. It is good in the middle with insight and the path. It is good in the end with fruition and Nibbāna.

Buddhasubodhitāya vā ādikalyāṇo, dhammasudhammatāya majjhekalyāṇo, saṅghasuppaṭṭipattiyā pariyosānakalyāṇo

7. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning because it is the good discovery made by the Buddha. It is good in the middle because it is the well-regulatedness of the Dhamma. It is good in the end because it is the good way entered upon by the Saṅgha.

Taṃ sutvā tathatthāya paṭipannena adhigantabbāya abhisambodhiyā vā ādikalyāṇo, paccekabodhiyā majjhekalyāṇo, sāvakabodhiyā pariyosānakalyāṇo.

8. Or alternatively, it is good in the beginning as the discovery of what can be attained by one who enters upon the way of practice in conformity after hearing about it. It is good in the middle as the unproclaimed enlightenment of Paccekabuddhas. It is good in the

end as the enlightenment of disciples.

Suyyamāno cesa nīvaraṇavikkhambhanato savanenapi kalyāṇameva āvahaṭṭi ādikalyāṇo. Paṭipajjiyamāno samathavipassanāsukhāvahanato paṭipattiyāpi kalyāṇaṃ āvahaṭṭi majjhakalyāṇo. Tathāpaṭipanno ca paṭipattiphale niṭṭhite tādibhāvāvahanato paṭipattiphalenapi kalyāṇaṃ āvahaṭṭi pariyosānakalyāṇoti.

9. And when listened to, it does good through hearing it because it suppresses the hindrances, thus it is good in the beginning. And when made the way of practice it does good through the way being entered upon because it brings the bliss of serenity and insight, thus it is good in the middle. And when it has thus been made the way of practice and the fruit of the way is ready, it does good through the fruit of the way because it brings unshakable equipoise, thus it is good in the end.

Evam ādimajjhapariyosānakalyāṇattā svākkhāto.

So it is “well proclaimed” because of being good in the beginning, the middle and the end.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Help to translate....

Content:

I've never seen it interpreted that way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 6:51 PM

Title: Re: Help to translate....

Content:

In Sāriputta's Vinaya-ṭīkā the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta is given as an example of a sutta with a single sequence of meaning and the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta as an example of one with several sequences of meaning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Upasakajanalankara

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/4084857/Sunaya%C5%9Br%C4%AB_s_Up%C4%81sakasa%E1%B9%81var%C4%81%E1%B9%A3%E1%B9%ADaka_and_Up%C4%81sakasa%E1%B9%81var%C4%81%E1%B9%A3%E1%B9%ADakavivara%E1%B9%87a_An_Edition_and_Translation – An Edition and Translation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

Perhaps. Or perhaps he gave her some kind of infection. The precise means by which she met her death isn't specified.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 17, 2020 8:50 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

The story is from the *Suvaṇṇasāma Jātaka*, with the procreation scene being discussed at length in the *Milindapañha*'s question on descent into the womb (*gabbhā-vakkan-ti*). It isn't from any Vinaya ruling and the act that led to the conception of the Bodhisatta as *Suvaṇṇasāma* isn't sexual intercourse as the Vinaya describes it (i.e., the penis penetrating the vagina, anus or mouth of a woman or a female animal or the anus or mouth of a man or a male animal). Indeed both the *Jātaka* and the *Milindapañha* explicitly state that the couple conceived in this manner precisely because they were brahmacaris and wanted to avoid intercourse.

Here's the *Jātaka*:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja540>

And a German translation of the *Milindapañha*'s discussion (Thomas Rhys Davids of the Pali Text Society apparently thought it too naughty to be translated into English):

<https://suttacentral.net/mil5.1.6/de/nyanatiloka-nyanaponika>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 18, 2020 9:50 AM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

In Vinaya, as in most secular legal systems, if a single action happens to be a transgression of more than one class of offence, a penalty will be imposed on the offender according to whichever is the most serious class of offence committed. And so if your conjecture that the girl was injured is correct, since injuring her would be a less serious offence than touching her with lustful intent, it is the latter that the monk would be required to confess and undergo *mānatta* penance for. As such it's not surprising that it doesn't come up for discussion in a section of the Vinaya concerned only with *saṅghādisesas*.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 10:36 AM
Title: Re: Hello
Content:
Hi Sadi, welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 11:35 AM
Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection
Content:

If I understand you correctly, you think that the monk's action ought to have been made a pārājika offence rather than a saṅghādisesa offence because an action so heinous needs to be guarded against with a much stronger deterrent than it presently is.

If that is what you're saying, then I think your claim is based on the mistaken assumption that the desirability of stronger or weaker deterrence was the criterion for making one kind of action a saṅghādisesa and another a pārājika. But that wasn't the criterion at all. The criterion was whether after performing a particular unskillful action the bhikkhu would thereafter be curable or incurable (i.e., capable or incapable of making progress in the brahmacariyā in the present life after he has repented and undergone penance). The attainment of the ten Tathāgata powers puts one into a strong position to make such a judgment. A two-month retreat in Burma probably doesn't.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 2:55 PM
Title: Re: Heretic
Content:

A Buddhist belonging to an heretical school is called a paravādī (lit. "other-doctrinist"), as opposed to sakavādī ("own-doctrinist"). Both terms are indexical, i.e., their referent will change according to who is using it. And so in the Kathāvatthu and its commentary the sakavādīs are those holding to the Theravāda understanding, while the paravādīs are those holding to the understanding of the Sabbatthivāda, Andhaka, Kassapiya, etc. But in a Sabbatthivāda text the Theravādīs would be among those classed as paravādīs.

As for non-Buddhists, there's no end of terms for these: bāhirakas, titthiyas, aññatitthiyas, paṇḍaraṅgas, micchādiṭṭhikas, vitaṇḍavādīs, natthikas, diṭṭhigatikas, lokāyatikas, aceḷakas, nigaṇṭhas, jaṭilas, jaṭādharaṅgas, pāsaṇḍikas, hetukas, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 3:30 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and penile erection

Content:

No, it doesn't. The evil deeds one does before ordaining that would make one incurable don't include all acts of murder, but only matricide, patricide and arahanticide. It is the act of murdering a human (any human) after ordaining that would be an incurable offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 5:56 PM

Title: Re: What is the sutta spoken about in this video?

Content:

He means the Venāgapura Sutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an3.63>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 20, 2020 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Functional types of mind (kiriya-citta) dissociated from wisdom (paññā)

Content:

In a non-arahant the cutting-off consciousness (cuti-citta) ends the santati (the mental continuum of a single lifetime) but not the santāna (the mental continuum that endures throughout saṃsāric time). It is followed by a rebirth-linking consciousness.

In an arahant the cuti-citta is not followed by a relinking consciousness and so is the final event in both the santati and the santāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2020 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Functional types of mind (kiriya-citta) dissociated from wisdom (paññā)

Content:

There's no relinking (or rebirth-linking, as some translate it) consciousness for an arahant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2020 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Away for more than 10 years.

Content:

Hi, nice to see you again.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2020 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Venerable Ananda discourse needed

Content:

See Hellmuth Hecker's biography of him. The author gives citations for all of the many sutta passages he quotes, so you can then go to Sutta Central if you want to read any of them in full.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/hecker/wheel273.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 21, 2020 6:48 AM

Title: Re: Functional types of mind (kiriya-citta) dissociated from wisdom (paññā)

Content:

The sekha disciples haven't yet abandoned the fuel that leads to relinking. All three still have the fetter of ignorance; the sotāpanna and sakadāgāmī have the fetter of desire for sense-sphere existence; the anāgāmī has the fetters of desire for refined form and formless existence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2020 2:14 PM

Title: Re: Can I be happy without an external object?

Content:

The observation that the adjective "unconscious" can be used in a manner whose factual basis nobody would contest is just an irrelevant distraction when it is precisely the contested sense of the term that is the subject of discussion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 24, 2020 3:24 PM

Title: Re: Realms, metaphor vs reality

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 25, 2020 6:50 PM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jun 25, 2020 6:59 PM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 26, 2020 11:22 PM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 26, 2020 11:42 PM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:
The revered person needn't be a Buddhist teacher or even a Buddhist. The proximate cause of mettā is sattānaṃ manāpabhāvadassanaṃ the "beholding of what is endearing in beings", meaning whatever kusala qualities are noticeable in them. The point of beginning with a person one reveres is simply that their possession of such qualities will be more conspicuous than in others and so the arousing of mettā will be easier.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 27, 2020 1:45 AM
Title: Re: Sati(mindfulness) as a point of branching out, Sutta
Content:
It's nothing like that. The verse is just a summary of the titles of the ten suttas in the preceding vagga. Dasāti = dasa + iti, which means "thus are the ten [suttas]". It has nothing to do with sati.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 27, 2020 3:21 AM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:
It doesn't to me.

Beholding the personal qualities that make a person endearing to others is a different thing from beholding the successes or good fortune (sampatti) that have come to that person. The latter is the proximate cause of muditā.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 27, 2020 9:59 PM
Title: "Advice about Advice"
Content:
<https://archive.org/details/AdviceAboutAdvice/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 28, 2020 2:54 PM
Title: Re: Why no metta for opposite gender?
Content:
You may become less so if you attend more to Buddhist texts and less to what Buddhists disagree about.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 28, 2020 6:58 PM
Title: Re: Discuss about Jhanas means it is show off?
Content:
There are two relevant rules for monks and nuns.

The fourth pārājika rule, prohibiting false claims:
<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj4/en/brahmali>

The eighth pācittiya rule, prohibiting even true claims when talking to unordained people:
<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pc8/en/brahmali>

There's also a good commentary on all the ramifications of these two rules in Ajahn Thanissaro's Buddhist Monastic Code.

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/vinaya/bmc/Section0010.html#Pr4>

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/vinaya/bmc/Section0016.html#Pc8>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2020 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Discuss about Jhanas means it is show off?

Content:

The Buddha, like his arahant disciples, naturally refrains from any action that would be loka-vajja, for he is free of akusala states of mind. But as for those rules whose transgression would be merely paṇṇati-vajja, the Buddha may (and does) keep them or break them as he sees fit.

For a bhikkhu to inform a householder about some attainment he has would not necessarily be done with an akusala state of mind and so the offence would be only paṇṇati-vajja. But the Buddha, as mentioned above, is not bound by paṇṇati-vajja rules.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2020 8:04 PM

Title: Re: why dorje shugden is hated?

Content:

If I were an adherent of the Tibetan religion I would avoid joining a sect that requires one to worship this creature because his name always makes me think of Mollie Sugden. And so I'd probably have a hard time keeping a straight face during Dorje Shugden pujas. Notice that it's not just their names that might lead one to confuse the two, but they even wear similar headgear:

.

[./download/file.php?id=5759&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 28, 2020 10:15 PM

Title: Re: difference between mudita (virtuous joy) pīti (rapture), and late Theravada mudita as brahmavihara

Content:

Unless I happened to be using muditā as my main preparatory object, I would see this as an occasion when karuṇā would be the more fitting attitude, for the success here is an anticipated one rather than a present one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2020 2:28 AM

Title: Re: difference between mudita (virtuous joy) pīti (rapture), and late Theravada mudita as brahmavihara

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 29, 2020 2:45 AM

Title: Re: Source of The Lost Son story

Content:

I suspect either some Vietnamese pseudepigrapha or (more likely) a fable that Thich Nhat Hanh just made up himself. Certainly it's not any Indian source, not even a Mahayana one, as should be obvious from the last two sentences, which belong to a literary form that just wasn't used in ancient India:

"Sometime, somewhere, you take something to be the truth. If you cling to it so much, even when the truth comes in person and knocks on your door, you will not open it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 30, 2020 9:31 PM

Title: Re: difference between mudita (virtuous joy) pīti (rapture), and late Theravada mudita as brahmavihara

Content:

Certainly there's an etymological link between muditā and pāmojjaṃ.

From the root √mud we get the verb modati and its more complex derivatives: anumodati, abhhanumodati, abhippamodati, pamodati, samanumodati, sampamodati, sammodati, etc. Then from modati we get the nouns mudā and muditā, and from pamodati the nouns pamodo, pāmujjaṃ, pāmojjaṃ and pamodanā.

But derivation from a common root is nowhere near sufficient to establish synonymity. In English, for example, 'piety' and 'pity', both come from the Latin pietās, yet the two things have scarcely anything to do with each other. Likewise, the fact that muditā and pāmojjaṃ both come from √mud shows only a morphological relationship, not a semantic one.

Now when it happens that two Pali words share a common root, there are four or five semantic possibilities, namely, that the words will be:

1. Completely different in meaning:

vinayo ('discipline'), nāyako ('leader') and nayo ('method'), from the root √nī;
ñātako ('relative') and viññāṇaṃ ('consciousness') from √ñā.

2. Different in meaning but having some degree of underlying family resemblance:
ñāṇaṃ, viññāṇaṃ, saññā and paññā, from $\sqrt{\text{ñā}}$.

3. Synonymous to the point of being fungible:
nāyako and netti ('guide', 'leader') from $\sqrt{\text{nī}}$;
ñātako and ñāti ('relative') from $\sqrt{\text{ñā}}$;
pajānanā and paññā, also from $\sqrt{\text{ñā}}$.

4.a. Synonymous but not fungible because of unstated conventions that one word will be used in certain contexts and the other in other contexts:
cittaṃ and ceto, from $\sqrt{\text{cint}}$.

4.b. Synonymous but not fungible because even though their referent involves essentially the same idea, it is being realized in grammatically different parts of speech:
soko ('sorrow'), socanā ('sorrowing') and socitattaṃ ('sorrowfulness'), from $\sqrt{\text{suc}}$.

Of these possibilities, #2 and #4.b are the most commonly encountered, closely followed by #1, and with #3 and #4.a coming a very poor third. In fact #1, #2 and #4.b so hugely outnumber all other possibilities in their frequency that a prudent policy would be always to make one of them our default assumption unless or until we encounter textual evidence showing that something else is to be preferred.

Now in the case of muditā and pāmojjaṃ, I think we both agree in rejecting #1. We can also rule out #4.b on the grounds of non-applicability, since the formation of pāmojjaṃ has entailed having a prefix added to the root.

Of the remaining possibilities, on purely statistical grounds the order of likelihood is #2, followed at a considerable distance by #3, and then at an enormous distance by #4.a.

And so my preference would be for #2, on the grounds that: (1) I'm presently unaware of any textual evidence that would override statistical probability, and (2) there seems to be an absence of overlap in what the suttas predicate of the two qualities. For example, MN 62 speaks of muditā as something to be developed for the sake of abandoning discontent; this is never said of pāmojjaṃ; AN 10.2 and 11.2 speak of pāmojjaṃ as something that arises spontaneously from non-remorse due to virtuous conduct; this is never said of muditā; MN 15 and 151 speak of pāmojjaṃ as something that arises from attention to the absence of various faults in oneself; no sutta says this of muditā. Etc., etc.

Assuming that you wish to champion #3 or #4.a, your task would be to adduce textual passages that would convincingly override the above-mentioned statistical likelihood, not to mention the negative textual evidence. If the remainder of your post was meant to be an attempt to do this, then it's not a very successful one, inasmuch as it contains no argument at all but just question-begging translations of pāmojjaṃ and pamudita – two of the very terms whose meaning is being contested.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2020 9:04 AM

Title: Re: Killing a yakkha not parajika offence

Content:

You don't kill them. If bad yakkhas bother you, you call on good yakkhas to come to your aid. Like it says in the Atanatiya Sutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn32>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2020 9:11 AM

Title: Re: Pleasure to meet you

Content:

Hi Sóley,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

By the way, are you from Iceland?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2020 8:17 PM

Title: Re: Is it a schism making action?

Content:

If you'd read the Thanissaro article that Grigoris linked to when you posted a similar question on DWM then you would know already that it's impossible for a layman to cause a schism. Only monks can do that. Here's the link again:

https://info-buddhism.com/sangha_schism.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 1, 2020 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Is it a schism making action?

Content:

Let's.

The logical thing would be to learn the meanings of saṅgharāji and saṅghabheda by looking at what Buddhist texts have to say about them, rather than naively assuming that their meanings will be simply whatever notions happen to pop up in our heads when we see their English translations ("conflict in the sangha" and "schism in the

sangha"). But I sense from your last two posts that the logical approach doesn't really interest you at all, so I'll leave you to wallow in your opinions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2020 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Is it a schism making action?

Content:

Is the Buddha reliable enough for you?

"Upāli, a bhikkhunī cannot split the saṅgha even if she attempts to provoke a schism.

"A sikkhamānā cannot split the saṅgha even if she attempts to provoke a schism.

"A sāmaṇera cannot split the saṅgha even if he attempts to provoke a schism.

"A sāmaṇerī cannot split the saṅgha even if she attempts to provoke a schism.

"An upāsaka cannot split the saṅgha even if he attempts to provoke a schism.

"An upāsikā cannot split the saṅgha even if she attempts to provoke a schism.

"Upāli, only a regular bhikkhu, belonging to the same communion and living within the same monastic boundary can split the saṅgha."

(Vin. ii. 204)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2020 8:23 AM

Title: Re: Pleasure to meet you

Content:

Ókei, ég skil.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 2, 2020 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Advice regarding donning robes

Content:

In that case, when you're inside the monastery wear the upper robe in the hom dong (หมุดทอง) style until you can get hold of a robe that fits you properly.

.

See demonstration starting at 2:40.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2020 12:08 AM

Title: Re: difference between mudita (virtuous joy) pīti (rapture), and late Theravada mudita as brahmavihara

Content:

But it's not similar at all:

1. The formation of samāhita and samādhi consists in two different grammatical forms – a participle and a noun – being derived from a single verb, samādahati.

By contrast ... the formation of pāmojjaṃ and muditā consists in two identical grammatical forms - two nouns - being derived from two different verbs, pamodati and modati.

2. The semantic connection between samāhita and samādhi is completely uncontroversial, both from the point of view of traditional and modern scholarship.

By contrast ... the alleged semantic connection between pāmojjaṃ and muditā is controversial; it's not traditional and you're the first (and only) modern interpreter I've come across who proposes it.

3. In the suttas the semantic connection between samāhita and samādhi is contextually supported by an abundance of evidence.

By contrast ... there is no context in the suttas that would oblige us to take pāmojjaṃ as referring to or implying muditā, or muditā as referring to or implying pāmojjaṃ.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2020 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Is it a schism making action?

Content:

The sīmā. In practice it will most often mean the boundary of a single monastery.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 3, 2020 11:58 PM

Title: Re: difference between mudita (virtuous joy) pīti (rapture), and late Theravada mudita as brahmavihara

Content:

As noted above, the difference is that one has to do with brahmavihāras and the other

I'm afraid I haven't time to cover the rest of your post as I'm logging out now and won't be online again till the end of vassa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 1, 2020 6:08 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddha did not include his teaching as a view in the Brahmajala Sutta?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 3, 2020 12:10 PM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

It should be saṅkhārā.

At Vinodh Rajan's Aksharamukha website you can convert text between different Pali or Sanskrit scripts, with more than 80 to choose from.

<https://aksharamukha.appspot.com/converter>

[illegible]

•

./download/file.php?id=6007&mode=view

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 3, 2020 12:40 PM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

Here's the syllabification:

•

./download/file.php?id=6008&mode=view

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 3, 2020 2:58 PM

Title: Re: Memorization and the Oral Tradition

Content:

It's not in the Pali Canon. I do recall Ven. Sujāto writing about this somewhere and I think he said it was in the instructions for reciting monks (bhāṇakā) in a Vinaya text of the Mahīśāsaka school. It included the advice that if you've forgotten where the Buddha was staying when he taught a particular sutra, just say that it was at Sāvattī in Jeta's Grove.

In Pali sources the instructions for bhāṇakā don't contain anything like this. In fact they consist almost entirely of directives concerned with good pronunciation (i.e., which kinds of mispronunciation can be tolerated in a bhāṇaka and which can't) and grammatical correctness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 4, 2020 11:22 AM

Title: Re: evametaṃ

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 4, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: Milindapañha's incorporation into the canon

Content:

The differences are much greater than that. For a start the Milinda is about twice as long as the NBS. The first three of its seven sections more or less correspond to the whole of the NBS. See Thích Minh Châu's comparative study:

<https://www.budsas.org/ebud/milinda/ml-00.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 4, 2020 12:29 PM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

The latter. It's called a virāma and tells the reader not to add an A to the consonant.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Virama>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 6, 2020 12:10 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha Ever Visit Sri Lanka?

Content:

My impression, bhante, is that the three visits of Gotama Buddha to Sri Lanka, along with those by the past Buddhas Kassapa, Koṇāgamana and Kakusandha, are universally accepted by traditionally-minded Asian scholar monks. The source of these visits is not limited to the Sinhalese vaṃsa texts but also includes the atthakathās.

The most detailed account outside of the Mahāvamsa can be found in Jayawickrama's <https://archive.org/stream/PaliCommentariesCollection/00%20Samantapasadika%20Bahiranidana%2C%20Inception%20of%20Discipline%20and%20Vinaya%20Nidana%20-%20N.A.%20Jayawickrama%20%28Sacred%20Books%20of%20the%20Buddhists%20Vol.21%29%20London-1962%20%28272p%29#page/n5/mode/2up>, a translation of the introductory section of Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Atthakathā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 7, 2020 5:34 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha Ever Visit Sri Lanka?

Content:

Not the commentary to the Mahāvamsa (which was composed five centuries after Buddhaghosa, so could hardly have been one of his sources), but rather a commentary called the Mahāvamsa, i.e., the now-lost Sinhala work of this name, which Oldenberg believes to have been just another name for the Mahā-atthakathā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 7, 2020 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Pali sources on the time after the mahāparinibbāna to First Council (including)

Content:

In canonical sources it's only in the Pañcasatikakkhandhaka of the Vinaya Piṭaka's Cūḷavagga.

<https://www.tipitaka.org/romn/cscd/vin02m3.mul10.xml>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 8, 2020 2:42 PM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

I've just checked and it seems there's no way of telling how the consonant cluster -bb- would have been written because it doesn't occur in any examples of Ashokan Magadhi. For example, the Pali sabba becomes sarva, as in Sanskrit.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 8, 2020 3:44 PM

Title: Re: Did the Buddha Ever Visit Sri Lanka?

Content:

Sorry, but I don't understand what you mean by: "while Atanatiya Sutta speaks of Yakkas, Naga, kumbanda and Nagas with a social history only of Sri Lanka."

And I don't understand your question. Discarded by whom?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 8, 2020 4:44 PM

Title: Re: What is the meaning of Ṭhānissaro ?

Content:

Anybody born on a Wednesday in the daytime who ordains as a bhikkhu in Thailand, Laos or Cambodia will be given a Pali name beginning with a retroflex consonant. If he's born on a Wednesday night then he'll get a name beginning with one of the first four vagga consonants. If he's born on a Sunday it will begin with a vowel, etc., etc. In short, each day of the week has a set of letters associated with it and so if you know a Thai-ordained bhikkhu's name you can always tell which day of the week he was born on:

Sunday: a, ā, i, u, o

Monday: k, kh, g, gh

Tuesday: c, ch, j, jh, ñ

Wednesday daytime: ṭh

Wednesday nighttime: y, r, l, v

Thursday: p, ph, b, bh, m

Friday: s, h

Saturday: t, th, d, dh, n

As for the meaning of "Ṭhānissaro", this is a bit uncertain. The word doesn't occur even as a common noun, let alone a person's name, in any canonical or commentarial Pali texts. In Sanskrit it occurs as Sthāneśvara, a genitive tappurisa compound which can mean either a regional governor (lit. "Lord of the Place") or a place name ("God's Place") - a region of the Punjab that was once a stronghold of the largest Pudgalavādin school.

In Pali, however, its meaning is uncertain because (1) the Thai publishers of dictionaries of monastic names differ in how they analyse and translate the compound and (2) none of them translate the ṭhāna part - they just import it; unfortunately ฐานะ / ṭhāna has much the same range of meanings in Thai as it does in Pali, so one can't know for sure

which is the intended one.

A couple of examples:

One online dictionary treats it as an instrumental dependent-determinative (tatiyā-tappurisa) compound:

ผู้เป็นใหญ่ด้วยฐานะ

"Chief/lord by way of ṭhāna".

And another as a locative dependent-determinative (sattamī-tappurisa):

ผู้เป็นใหญ่ในฐานะ

"Chief/lord in/in ṭhāna (or with regard to ṭhāna)".

And yet another as:

ผู้มีฐานะอันยิ่งใหญ่

"One who has a truly great ṭhāna."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 8, 2020 9:29 PM

Title: Re: Can the path of Theravada be entered at will?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 9, 2020 2:17 AM

Title: Re: "Killing" the unworthy aspirants

Content:

The sutta is a description, not a prescription. It's not giving directions as to what Buddhist communities should do, but rather describing what the Buddha and "wise fellow brahmacārīs" (viññū sabrahmacarī) do do. And since viññū sabrahmacarī refers to a monk's fellow monks, the sutta has to do with a monastic community's in-house treatment of monastics who prove unteachable. It has nothing to do with their treatment of lay visitors to their monastery.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 9, 2020 11:29 AM

Title: Re: Pali Translation: 'This will also change'

Content:

It has one: an overdot placed to the right of its consonant:

.

./download/file.php?id=6021&mode=view

= dhammaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 9, 2020 4:14 PM

Title: Re: Disrobing - Thai term

Content:

The colloquial verb is สึก [suk] if it's voluntary or จับสึก [tɕàp suk] if it's enforced.

The formal verb is ลาสิกขา [la: sɨk-khǎ:].

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 9, 2020 9:20 PM

Title: Re: What is this debate thing in Mahayana?

Content:

There is this from your own country...

Buddhism and Christianity - Being an oral debate held at Panadura between the Rev. Migettuwatte Gunananda, a Buddhist Priest, and the Rev. David de Silva, a Wesleyan Clergyman

<https://archive.org/details/THEGREATDEBATEBUDDHISMAAndChristianityFACETofACEPeeblesJ.M.MohattiwatteGunandaDeSilva/page/n1/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 9, 2020 11:50 PM

Title: Re: "Killing" the unworthy aspirants

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 10, 2020 6:07 PM

Title: Re: all buddhist sects the same?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 1:39 AM

Title: Re: heartwood is same sāra as in saṃsāra?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 2:50 PM

Title: Re: what made buddha enlightened?

Content:

Though even it hadn't been explicitly stated it could have been derived inferentially from general sutta teachings about the understanding of dependent arising being a prerequisite for any kind of awakening.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 3:26 PM

Title: Re: Kotikanna -looking for more information

Content:

The only known disciple of that name was Soṇa Kuṭikaṇṇa (or Koṭikaṇṇa). But his special quality was being "foremost of bhikkhu disciples who are excellent speakers", not that of attaining quickly.

The disciple who was foremost in attaining higher knowledge quickly was Bāhiya Dāruciriya.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/sona.html>

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/bahiya.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 6:52 PM

Title: Re: Vitamin D

Content:

Personal attacks (and replies to the same) removed. Do try to keep it civil, gentlemen.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 7:33 PM

Title: Re: Kotikanna -looking for more information

Content:

Not very much. Besides the Udāna's Soṇasutta and the Aṅguttara's declaration by the Buddha of his special quality, there is just:

1. His Theragāthā verses.

<https://suttacentral.net/thag5.11/en/sujato>

2. The Vinaya's account of his going forth.

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd5/en/horner-brahmali>

3. Potted biographies in the commentaries to the Aṅguttara Nikāya and the Theragāthā.

Only the latter has been translated.

<https://archive.org/details/psalmsofearlybud02davi/mode/2up>

(pp. 202-204)

But his name never made it into the Jātakas or the Apadānas, so I guess he was a relatively minor major disciple.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 11, 2020 7:36 PM

Title: Re: Vitamin D

Content:

Don't worry. None of the removed posts were yours or Samseva's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 12, 2020 2:12 PM

Title: Re: translate this line from MN 69 cmy, on āruppa

Content:

Cūḷa Dhammapāla isn't correcting Buddhaghosa. The gist of his first sentence is that Buddhaghosa says what he does because there's no divorcing the attainment of the arūpasamāpattis from that of the rūpasamāpattis. The rest is just saying at length what Buddhaghosa said in brief.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2020 9:50 AM

Title: Re: what made buddha enlightened?

Content:

In the commentaries arahants are sometimes called sāvaka-buddhas.

__Buddhā_ti catusaccasambodhena buddhā; te ca pana sāvakabuddhā,
paccekabuddhā, sammāsambuddhāti tividhā.

"Awakened Ones" means those awakened by awakening to the four truths. And they are threefold: awakened disciples, privately awakened ones, perfectly awakened ones.
(Ud-a 58)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2020 12:41 PM

Title: Re: Where to buy "Clearing the Path"?

Content:

[my emphasis]

Given the ostensible commitment to dhammadāna I wonder, how do venerables Ñāṇamoli, Hiriko and the rest justify SELLING works that in the past (before these monks got their hands on the publishing rights) were always given away free?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 13, 2020 12:59 PM

Title: Re: what made buddha enlightened?

Content:

Sammāsambuddhas extinguish the āsavas by their own unguided efforts, establish a sāsana and found a saṅgha to preserve it.

Paccekabuddhas extinguish the āsavas by their own unguided efforts but don't establish a sāsana or found a saṅgha.

Sāvakabuddhas extinguish the āsavas by efforts made under the guidance of a sammāsambuddha or one of his contemporary or later ariyan disciples.

"Perfectly" or "rightly" are the commonest translations of the sammā part of sammāsambuddha. For the meaning see the account of buddhānussati in the Visuddhimagga.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 14, 2020 5:43 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist birthdays

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 14, 2020 6:28 PM

Title: Re: all buddhist sects the same?

Content:

"Ekamṣena" in the suttas is the word the Buddha uses on those occasions when he wants to make as strong and uncompromising a declaration as possible.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 15, 2020 2:36 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

What has led you to think that?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 15, 2020 2:40 PM

Title: Re: Loving kindness (metta) and compassion

Content:

I should have thought that this (or some other course aimed at insight development) would be the main plan for a serious practitioner, not the backup.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 16, 2020 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Swami Sarvapriyanand?

Content:

In Buddhist texts the renunciation of the household life is never referred to as saṃnyāsa, nor Buddhist monks or nuns as saṃnyāsins. The avoidance of the term is almost certainly deliberate and aimed at distinguishing the Buddhist model of renunciation (which ideally is undertaken when one is still young) from the Brahminical "four stages of life" (āśrama) model, in which saṃnyāsa is the fourth and final stage and normally undertaken in old age.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 17, 2020 10:53 AM

Title: Re: Swami Sarvapriyanand?

Content:

I don't think you do. You don't understand because you don't listen. You are so intent on spamming Dhamma Wheel with half-baked infantile notions picked up from Vaishnavism, Nichirenism and New Age perennialism that you fail miserably to understand anything that anybody here is saying. In effect you are just talking to yourself, learning nothing and contributing nothing of even the slightest interest or value. For someone who's set himself the Bodhisattvic task of enlightening all beings I'm afraid your performance to date has been most disappointing. Your posts thus far have been about as enlightening as the Viz comic's "Man in the Pub - Britain's most ill-informed columnist".

.

[./download/file.php?id=6038&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 17, 2020 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Ingram, et al - "Hard Core Dharma" & claims of attainment

Content:

I don't think so. But if you don't wish to read all of it, page 2 alone should suffice to show how radical a breach there is between Ingram Dhamma and Buddha Dhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 18, 2020 2:31 PM

Title: Re: Questions about stream entry

Content:

Kapila, the founder of the Hindu Sāṃkhya school, is not regarded by ANY Buddhists – even Mahayanists – as a "past avatar" of the Buddha. Nor do the Vedas identify him as an avatar of the Buddha, for the simple reason that the Vedas know nothing about the Buddha. The very notion of an "avatar", though arguably comparable to the Mahayana's "nirmāṇakāya" conception, is completely foreign to Theravāda Buddhism.

But all of this is really beside the point, for this is not the Connections to Other Paths forum, and so discussion of Kapila's views is completely out of place here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 19, 2020 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Cigarettes

Content:

<https://www.amazon.co.uk/Allen-Carrs-Easy-Stop-Smoking/dp/1405923318>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 19, 2020 2:35 PM

Title: Re: translate this line from MN 69 cmy, on āruppa

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 2:13 PM

Title: Re: help with a mother's request

Content:

If I'm not too late, I would suggest...

1. A Buddha image in the "benefitting his mother" posture.

In Thai: ปางโปรดพระพุทธรมารดา

2. A Buddha image in the "forbidding his relatives to fight" posture.

ปางห้ามญาติ

3. An unalome inside a lotus flower.

อุณาโลมในกลีบบัว

For some examples, search google images for the Thai phrases.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 3:10 PM

Title: Re: Looking for a Sutta... Knowledge of Evil

Content:

I don't know of a teaching about kamma like that, but in Vinaya the distinction between an offence and a non-offence often hinges on what the bhikkhu knew or didn't know before he performed the action.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 7:55 PM

Title: Re: help with a mother's request

Content:

It should look like this:

.

./download/file.php?id=6060&mode=view

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 8:40 PM
Title: Re: The Atoms
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 8:49 PM
Title: Re: help with a mother's request
Content:
Yes.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Oct 22, 2020 11:48 PM
Title: Re: Looking for a Sutta... Knowledge of Evil
Content:
That's true, but Milinda didn't bring up those factors. He was solely concerned with the question of the agent's knowledge or non-knowledge.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 12:55 AM
Title: Re: Faith and Reliability
Content:
Try telling that to <https://aerolites.blogspot.com/2006/12/seven-spiritual-ages-of-mrs-marmaduke.html>. Or the <https://web.archive.org/web/20040706010039/http://history.wisc.edu/sommerville/367/Vicar%20of%20Bray.htm>. Or any of https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_people_who_made_multiple_religious_conversions.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 4:47 AM
Title: Re: The Buddhas birth
Content:

The most elaborate commentarial account is given in the introductory section of the Jātaka Atthakathā:

<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/05.10%20Jataka%20Commentary%20Jatakattakatha%2C%20only%20Nidanakatha%2C%20The%20Story%20of%20Gotama%20Buddha%2C%20vol.1%20-%20N.A.%20Jayawickrama%20%28294p%29/page/128/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 5:02 AM

Title: Re: Four Noble Truths

Content:

They are actually Ajahn Sumedho's words, not floaty's.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 6:59 AM

Title: Re: Faith and Reliability

Content:

Not in the case of the third link, which includes, for example, the multiple leaps to faith of St Augustine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 12:39 PM

Title: Re: What are those things in Thai monasteries called?

Content:

I've never seen laypeople offering water to monks "in a ritualized way". Are you referring to the ritualized pouring of water (i.e., for merit dedication) after they've presented their food to the monks? If so...

For the act of pouring water to dedicate merit Thais don't use the common verb "to pour water" (i.e., เทน้ำ / thei nam) but a special verb, กรวดน้ำ / kruat nam, that's only ever used in this context.

The water container is just called a ที่กรวดน้ำ / thii kruat nam ("thing that you use to kruat nam").

The little bowl that you pour the water into is called a ฐาน / thaan ("base").

The two items together are called a ชุดกรวดน้ำ / chut kruat nam ("a kruat nam set").

.

kruat nam.jpg (16.1 KiB) Viewed 1440 times

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 1:43 PM
Title: Re: The Buddhas birth
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Oct 23, 2020 2:03 PM
Title: Re: What are those things in Thai monasteries called?
Content:

I don't know of any standard way of referring to it in English. It's rather too small to be called a "jug", "pitcher", "ewer" or "amphora". "Carafe", "flagon" and "decanter" all have unwelcome associations with booze. A flask is usually of glass, not brass. So what does that leave us with? Just "vessel" and "container", afaik. Perhaps: "a pattidāna pouring vessel".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 24, 2020 12:30 PM
Title: Re: What are those things in Thai monasteries called?
Content:

I don't think so. When Thai royalty do kruat nam they use the same utensils as anyone else. The only difference is that the act and the utensils get called by longer and fancier names. In Royal Court Thai kruat nam is song lang thaksinothok (ทรงหลังทักษิโนทก) and the thii kruat nam is a phra tao thaksinothok (พระเต้าทักษิโนทก).

The ceremony you describe sounds more like พิธีสงฆ์น้ำพระ / phithee song nam phra — the Songkran ceremony of bathing Buddha statues and the stūpa-shaped brass reliquaries containing your deceased relatives' ashes.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Oct 24, 2020 3:59 PM
Title: Re: khanti (patience) and khama (patient) are coming from the same root right?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Oct 25, 2020 9:02 PM

Title: Re: The Nirvana of the Arhat and the Nirvana of the Buddha, and also the difference between an Arhat and a Buddha.

Content:

One, as mentioned by SDC, is that the Buddha is the "is the originator of the path unarisen before", while arahant disciples are followers of that path.

A second is that there are certain special cognitive abilities – supernormal powers and the like – that are possessed by a Buddha but not by any of his arahant disciples.

A third is that with regard to the special cognitive abilities that are possessed by both the Buddha and certain of his more accomplished arahant disciples, the Buddha possesses them in a superior degree.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2020 12:14 AM

Title: Re: What is considered to be a Thai Buddhist "Temple"

Content:

It could be a samnak song — a place where monks live but which hasn't been officially recognised as a wat by the state; though in practice it's common that even a samnak song will have 'wat' in its name, especially if it's been established for a long time and the local villagers think of it as a wat.

Or if it's in some remote mountain location it could be an asom thammajarik — one of the hundred or so rudimentary monasteries established by the Thai state in the 60's and 70's for missionary monks to go and teach Dhamma to hill tribe villagers and try to wean them off communism and opium-growing.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2020 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Dhammadhatu

Content:

The dhammadhātu comprises either twenty dhammas or sixty-nine, depending on whether saṅkhārakkhandha gets counted as one dhamma or fifty (i.e. the fifty cetasikas). The list of thirty is:

Feeling aggregate, perception aggregate, formations aggregate, water element, masculinity, femininity, heart-base, life-faculty, nutriment, space, bodily intimation, vocal intimation, lightness, malleability, wieldiness, production, continuity, decay,

impermanence, nibbāna.

(vedanā, saññā, saṅkhārā, āpodhātu, purisattam, itthattam, hadayavatthu, jīvitindriya, āhāra, ākāśadhātu, kāyaviññatti, vacīviññatti, lahutā, mudutā, kammaññatā, upacaya, santati, jaratā, aniccatā, nibbāna)

Or in brief...

1. Three mental aggregates: feeling, perception, formations (= fifty-two cetasikas);
2. Sixteen subtle rūpas: setting aside the twelve gross rūpas (the five sensory pāsādas and the objects of the fivefold sensory consciousness), the remaining sixteen are subtle rūpas;
3. Nibbāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2020 5:29 AM

Title: Re: Seeking rebirth in Tushita heaven

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2020 12:58 PM

Title: Re: origin and meaning of this symbol

Content:

You could try asking the chairman of the Samatha Trust, Dr. Paul Dennison, who's a great enthusiast for Khmer and Thai yantras, mantras, tattoos, etc.

napaul(at)tiscali(dot)co(dot)uk

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Oct 26, 2020 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Seeking rebirth in Tushita heaven

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 27, 2020 6:31 PM

Title: Re: Seeking rebirth in Tushita heaven

Content:

It depends what you mean by "teaching the Dhamma." If you merely mean delivering moral exhortations to his companions, along the lines of: "Gifts are to be given, the sīlas are to be kept, the uposatha is to be observed, etc." then there's no disagreement between us, for in the Jātakas the Bodhisatta is often represented doing just this.

But if you mean teaching an ariya-making Dhamma, then it would imply that bodhisattas in Tusita have already discovered the middle way and eightfold path. In the case of Gotama it would further imply that he was a wiser being in his penultimate life than he was in his final life. That is, he knew all about the middle way as a deva in Tusita, but did not know about it as a human in Magadha, and so had to first spend twenty-nine years doing kāmāsukhallikānuyoga and then six years doing attakilamattānuyoga before he was able to discover something that in his former life he'd known all along. To me that's a quite ridiculous notion.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Oct 28, 2020 1:56 PM

Title: Re: Wonderful re-birth story from Sri Lanka!

Content:

I don't think it's due to merit. Just as the devas in the Vimānavatthu can recall the meritorious deeds as humans that got them to heaven, even so the petas in the Petavatthu can recall the stingy and avaricious behaviour as humans that led to their becoming petas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 29, 2020 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Theravadan Shikantaza?

Content:

I hadn't heard that before. Do you have a source for it?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 29, 2020 11:57 AM

Title: Re: Theravadan Shikantaza?

Content:

Thanks.

I know from old preceptor, Ajahn Khemadhammo, that Ajahn Chah liked to read Ajahn Buddhādāsa's Thai translations of the English translations of certain classical Ch'an teachers (e.g., Wong Mou-lam's Sutra of Hui Neng and John Blofeld's Teachings of Huang Po). And I gather from Paul Breiter's memoirs that those of the ajahn's western

disciples who had a background in Zen would sometimes read out passages from the Zen books they were reading, translate them into Thai and ask for his comment. But this is the first I've ever heard of him commissioning a translation of Zen Mind Beginners' Mind. As far as I know, there's only one Thai translation of this book, that of Nara Suphakrote, whose first edition was published only in 2014.

จิตใหม่ หัวใจเซน ("New Mind, Heart of Zen")

.

[./download/file.php?id=6077&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 30, 2020 12:22 PM

Title: Re: Good thief vs Bad thief

Content:

But the recognition that a vicious act can be mitigated is not only compatible with moral absolutism, in fact it's normal for it. That is, in almost every absolutist system (with the possible exception of Stoicism) it is readily admitted that goodness and badness come in degrees, and that the vice in a vicious act can be mitigated or aggravated by the agent's motive.

What absolutists will not admit is that such mitigation could ever alter the character of the vicious act by changing it into a virtuous or neutral act, for absolutists are committed to the view that certain types of act are intrinsically virtuous or vicious.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 30, 2020 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Good thief vs Bad thief

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 31, 2020 1:22 PM

Title: Re: Good thief vs Bad thief

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 31, 2020 1:32 PM

Title: Re: Good thief vs Bad thief

Content:

I think Theravada Buddhist ethics would be a species of absolutism even if it didn't have a belief in vipāka, simply because of its unqualifiedly intentionalist understanding of what makes an action akusala. Whatever the situation or the motive or the eventual outcome of an action, if it's generated by a defiled state of mind then it's akusala. Period.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 31, 2020 5:29 PM

Title: Re: Reference for Nāgita story about Kathina

Content:

It's the Nāgita Apadāna, an apocryphal former life story of Ven. Nāgita that's not included in the Pali canon or commentaries, nor available in English translation afaik.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2020 4:01 PM

Title: Re: Reference for Nāgita story about Kathina

Content:

As I said, it's in the Nāgita Apadāna - an apocryphal text, but one that happens to be popular in Sri Lanka and Burma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2020 6:41 PM

Title: Re: All about Paccekasambuddhā

Content:

If you haven't already done so, I recommend you get Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Suttanipāta and its commentary and read the commentary to the Khaggavisāṇa ('Rhinoceros Horn') Sutta, which is traditionally understood to be a collection of sayings of paccekabuddhas.

Then get Bhikkhu Anālayo's paper, Paccekabuddhas in the Isigili-sutta and its Ekottarika-āgama parallel. Its bibliography gives just about everything relevant that's been published in English or German up to 2010.

One work of particular interest is Martin Wiltshire's book, Ascetic Figures before and in Early Buddhism.

Another is K.R. Norman's Pratyekabuddhas in Buddhism and Jainism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2020 8:17 PM

Title: Re: Translation help needed

Content:

See the discussion in Michel Jacq-Hergoualc'h's book, *The Malay Peninsula: Crossroads of the Maritime Silk Road (100 BC - 1300 AD)*.

He gives the diacritics and quotes a much better translation by J. Allen:

.

[./download/file.php?id=6098&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2020 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Translation help needed

Content:

This is the H.G. Quaritch Wales article from the *Journal of the Malayan Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*.

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.281674/page/n17/mode/2up>

And a more legible photo in Xavier Thaninayagam's *Tamil Culture*.

https://archive.org/details/tamil-culture-by-xavier-thaninayagam-adigalar-volume-1-12_202008/page/n3563/mode/2up

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 1, 2020 9:48 PM

Title: Re: attato

Content:

It's called an *apañcamy'atthepi to*: "A -to whose meaning isn't ablative."

If you take a noun of any gender in its pre-inflected form and add the inflection -to it's more likely to convey an ablative meaning than anything else. But if it doesn't, then it's called an *apañcamyatthepi to*.

An *apañcamyatthepi to* can indicate any oblique case, though instrumental is the commonest.

As an instrumental it will quite often have the effect of turning the noun into an adverb.

Sometimes there are several meanings possible. For example, ādito can be ablative ("from the beginning"), locative ("in the beginning") or an instrumental adverbial ("initially"). Likewise piṭṭhito: "from the back", "at the back" or "behind".

Attato is another ambiguous one. But I see Assaji has already got it covered.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 2, 2020 11:40 AM

Title: Re: attato

Content:

More literally: "...what is false should be unravelled by you as false."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2020 6:42 PM

Title: Re: khanti (patience) and khama (patient) are coming from the same root right?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 3, 2020 6:52 PM

Title: Re: Goenka: a bodhisatta?

Content:

Ben doesn't post here now, but he can be contacted via his Facebook page.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2020 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Newly Joined

Content:

Where does the Buddha say this?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 4, 2020 2:21 PM

Title: Re: Newly Joined

Content:

You speak of "the Buddha's teachings", but the Pāsādikasutta speaks of the

brahmacariyā. In sutta usage brahmacariyā may refer either to celibacy (as in the Cūḷahatthipadopamasutta MN i. 179), to the samaṇa life in general (as in the Rathavināsa-sutta MN i. 147), or to the noble eightfold path (as in Paṭhamā-aññatarabhikkhusutta SN v. 7). But in none of these three senses is its meaning co-extensive with the Buddha's teachings as a whole. The Buddha taught on countless subjects that have nothing at all to do with the brahmacariyā in any sense of the word.

Then you speak of a person having "wrong view", but the Pāsādikasutta speaks of a person "not seeing". To not see is not the same as to see wrongly; that is, it pertains to avijjā rather than to micchādiṭṭhi.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2020 10:10 AM

Title: Re: If Theravada is true how do you explain anecdotal experiences with Buddhas?

Content:

Well, we have tertöns of a sort in Thailand too. They're mostly itinerant forest monks who report meditative visions of buried Buddha statues, relics, amulets, etc. and when people dig in the spot indicated by the monk, sure enough the monk's prediction proves correct.

How can this happen if Theravada isn't true?

Actually the way it happens is that a rascally monk, ambitious to acquire a name for supposed thaumaturgical skills, is just unearthing stuff that he buried himself. It was a popular con trick from the 60s to the 80s, but now the Thais have sussed it out and so the practice has greatly waned.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 5, 2020 11:43 AM

Title: Re: The irredeemable nature of this world

Content:

On similar lines to the passage cited by Samvara, but more expansive, are the eighty-nine reflections that prompt a Buddha to teach, as given in the Mahākaruṇā-samāpatti chapter of the Paṭisambhidāmagga.

1. Āditto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is burning.

2. Uyyutto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life drives on.

3. Payāto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life moves on.

4. Kummaggappaṭipanno lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is on the wrong road.

5. Upanīyati loko addhuvo.

The world has no lastingness and is led on.

6. Atāṇo loko anabhissaro.

The world has no shelter and no protector.

7. Assako loko, sabbaṃ pahāya gamanīyaṃ.

The world has nothing of its own, it has to leave all and pass on.

8. Ūno loko atīto taṇhādāso.

The world is incomplete, insatiate, and the slave of craving.

9. Atāyano lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is without shelter.

10. Aleṇo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is without shield.

11. Asaraṇo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is without refuge.

12. Asaraṇībhūto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is no refuge.

13. Uddhato loko avūpasanto.

The world is agitated and uncalm.

14. Sasallo lokasannivāso, viddho puthusallehi; tassa natthañño koci sallānaṃ uddhatā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is wounded by darts, pierced by many darts; there is none other than myself to draw out the darts.

15. Avijjandhakārāvaraṇo lokasannivāso aṇḍabhūto kilesapañjarapakkhitto; tassa natthañño koci ālokaṃ dassetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is darkened by a shadow of unknowing, with a locked dungeon of defilement; there is none other but myself to show the light.

16. Avijjāgato lokasannivāso aṇḍabhūto pariyonaddho tantākulakajāto gulāguṇḍikajāto muñjapabbajabhūto apāyaṃ duggatiṃ vinipātaṃ saṃsāraṃ nātivattati.

Worldly life goes in ignorance, it is blind, it is enclosed in an egg of ignorance, is a tangled skein, a knotted ball of thread, a matted web of tares, is not exempt from the

round of rebirth in states of deprivation, unhappy destinations and perdition.

17. Avijjāvisadosasaṃlutto lokasannivāso kilesakalābhūto.

Worldly life is infected by the corruption of the poison of ignorance, is a mire of defilement.

18. Rāgadosamohajaṭājaṭito lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci jaṭaṃ vijaṭetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is a maze of greed, hate and delusion; there is none other than myself to unmake the maze.

19. Taṇhāsaṅghāṭapaṭimukko lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is involved in a web of craving.

20. Taṇhājālena otthaṭo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is enveloped in the net of craving.

21. Taṇhāsotena vuyhati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is carried away by the stream of craving.

22. Taṇhāsaññojanena saññutto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is fettered by the fetter of craving.

23. Taṇhānusayena anusaṭo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is underlain by the underlying tendency to craving.

24. Taṇhāsantāpena santappati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is tormented by the torment of craving.

25. Taṇhāpariḷāhena pariḍayhati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is anguished with the anguish of craving.

26. Diṭṭhisāṅghāṭapaṭimukko lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is involved in the web of views.

27. Diṭṭhijālena otthaṭo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is enveloped in the net of views.

28. Diṭṭhisotena vuyhati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is carried away by the stream of views.

29. Diṭṭhisaññojanena saññutto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is fettered by the fetter of views.

30. Diṭṭhānusayena anusaṭo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is underlain by the underlying tendency to views.

31. Diṭṭhisantāpena santappati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is tormented by the torment of views.

32. Diṭṭhipariḷāhena pariḍayhati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is anguished with the anguish of views.

33. Jātiyā anugato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is committed by birth.

34. Jarāya anusato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is underlain by ageing.

35. Byādhinā abhibhūto lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is haunted by affliction.

36. Maraṇena abbhāhato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is struck down by death.

37. Dukkhe patiṭṭhito lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is based on suffering.

38. Taṇhāya uḍḍito lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is caught up by craving.

39. Jarāpākāraparikkhitto lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is hemmed in by the wall of ageing.

40. Maccupāsenā parikkhitto lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is hemmed in by the snare of death.

41. Mahābandhanabandho lokasannivāso: rāgabandhanena dosabandhanena mohabandhanena mānabandhanena diṭṭhibandhanena kilesabandhanena duccaritabandhanena; tassa natthañño koci bandhanaṃ mocetā, aññatra mayā.
Worldly life is bound by great bonds: by the bond of greed, by the bond of hate, by the bond of delusion, by the bond of conceit, by the bond of views, by the bond of defilement, by the bond of misconduct. There is none other than myself to free it from the bonds.

42. Mahāsambādhappaṭipanno lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci okāsaṃ dassetā, aññatra mayā.
Worldly life has entered a great crowded tunnel; there is none other than myself to show the wide open space.

43. Mahāpalibodhena palibuddho lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci palibodhaṃ chetā, aññatra mayā.
Worldly life is impeded by a great impediment; there is none other than myself to sever its impediment.

44. Mahāpapāte patito lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci papātā uddhatā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has fallen into a great chasm; there is none other than myself to lift it out of the chasm.

45. Mahākantārappaṭipanno lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci kantāraṃ tāretā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has entered a great wilderness, there is none other than myself to get it across the wilderness.

46. Mahāsaṃsārappaṭipanno lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci saṃsārā mocetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has entered upon a great roundabout; there is none other than myself to free it from the roundabout.

47. Mahāvidugge samparivattati lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci viduggā uddhatā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is blocked up in a great ravine; there is none other than myself to lift it out of the ravine.

48. Mahāpalipe palipanno lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci palipā uddhatā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life founders in a great slough, there is none other than myself to lift it out of the slough.

49. Abbhāhato lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is vulnerable.

50. Āditto lokasannivāso: rāgagginā dosagginā mohagginā jātiyā jarāya maraṇena sokehi paridevehi dukkhehi domanassehi upāyāsehi; tassa natthañño koci nibbāpetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is burning with the fire of greed, the fire of hate, the fire of delusion, the fires of birth, ageing and death, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair; there is none other than myself to extinguish the fires.

51. Unnītakō lokasannivāso haññati niccamatāṇo pattadaṇḍo takkarō.

Worldly life, like one led off to execution is punished with never any shelter, like a malefactor whose sentence is carried out upon him.

52. Vajjabandhanabaddho lokasannivāso āghātanapaccupaṭṭhito; tassa natthañño koci bandhanaṃ mocetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life is bound together by vile things and is founded upon hurtfulness; there is none other than myself to free it.

53. Anātho lokasannivāso paramakāruṇhappatto; tassa natthañño koci tāyetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has no helper and has reached a state of utter wretchedness; there is none other than myself to shield it.

54. Dukkābhitunno lokasannivāso cirarattaṃ piḷḷito.

Worldly life is overwhelmed by suffering, and has long been oppressed by it.

55. Gadhito lokasannivāso niccaṃ pipāsito.

Worldly life is ever hungry, ever thirsty.

56. Andho lokasannivāso acakkhuko.

Worldly life is blind and sightless.

57. Hatanetto lokasannivāso aparīṇāyako.

Worldly life has lost its leader and has no guide.

58. Vipathapakkhando lokasannivāso añjasāparaddho; tassa natthañño koci ariyapathaṃ ānetā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has got lost on the wrong way and missed the straight road; there is none other than myself to lead it to the noble way.

59. Mahoghapakkhando lokasannivāso; tassa natthañño koci oghā uddhatā, aññatra mayā.

Worldly life has gone adrift on the great flood; there is none other than myself to rescue it from the flood.

60. Dvīhi diṭṭhigatehi pariyuṭṭhito lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is obsessed by two kinds of views.

61. Tīhi ducçaritehi vippaṭipanno lokasannivāso.

Worldly life goes wrong with three kinds of misconduct.

62. Catūhi yogehi yutto lokasannivāso catuyogayojito.

Worldly life is yoked by four yokes.

63. Catūhi ganthehi ganthito lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is knotted with four knots.

64. Catūhi upādānehi upādiyati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life clings with four kinds of clinging.

65. Pañcagatisamāruḷho lokasannivāso.

Worldly life has embarked upon five destinations.

66. Pañcahi kāmaguṇehi rajjati lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is dyed with greed for the five dimensions of sensual desire.

67. Pañcahi nīvaraṇehi otthaṭo lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is blocked by five hindrances.

68. Chahi vivādamūlehi vivadati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is disputed with six roots of dispute.

69. Chahi taṇhākāyehi rajjati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is dyed with greed by six classes of craving.

70. Chahi diṭṭhigatehi pariyuṭṭhito lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is obsessed by six kinds of view.

71. Sattahi anusayehi anusaṭo lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is underlain by seven underlying tendencies.

72. Sattahi saññojanehi saññutto lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is fettered by seven fetters.

73. Sattahi mānehi unnato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is proud with seven conceits.

74. Aṭṭhahi lokadhammehi samparivattati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is attended by eight worldly ideas.

75. Aṭṭhahi micchattehi niyyāto lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is fixed by eight wrongnesses.

76. Aṭṭhahi purisadosehi dussati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is corrupted by eight corruptions of man.

77. Navahi āghātavatthūhi āghātito lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is annoyed by the nine grounds for annoyance.

78. Navavidhamānehi unnato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is haughty by means of the ninefold conceit.

79. Navahi taṇhāmūlakehi dhammehi rajjati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is dyed with greed by means of the nine ideas rooted in craving.

80. Dasahi kilesavatthūhi kilissati lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is defiled by the ten grounds for defilement.

81. Dasahi āghātavatthūhi āghātito lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is annoyed by the ten grounds for annoyance.

82. Dasahi akusalakammapathehi samannāgato lokasannivāso.
Worldly life is possessed of the ten wrong courses of action.

83. Dasahi saññojanehi saññutto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is fettered by ten fetters.

84. Dasahi micchattehi niyyāto lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is fixed in ten wrongnesses.

85. Dasavatthukāya micchādiṭṭhiyā samannāgato lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is possessed of the ten-based wrong view.

86. Dasavatthukāya antaggāhikāya diṭṭhiyā samannāgato lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is possessed of the ten-based view assuming finiteness.

87. Aṭṭhasatatanhāpapañcasatehi papañcito lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is diversified by the one hundred and eight varieties of diversification by craving.

88. Dvāsaṭṭhiyā diṭṭhigatehi pariyuṭṭhito lokasannivāso.

Worldly life is obsessed by sixty-two classes of view.

89. Ahañcamhi tiṇṇo, loko ca atiṇṇo ahaṃ camhi mutto, loko ca amutto; ahañcamhi danto, loko ca adanto; ahaṃ camhi santo, loko ca asanto; ahaṃ camhi assattho, loko ca anassattho; ahaṃ camhi parinibbuto, loko ca aparinibbuto; pahomi khvāhaṃ tiṇṇo tāretuṃ, mutto mocetuṃ, danto dametuṃ, santo sametuṃ, assattho assāsetuṃ, parinibbuto pare ca parinibbāpetuṃ.

I have crossed over and the world has not crossed over, I am liberated and the world is not liberated; I am controlled and the world is uncontrolled; I am at peace and the world is not at peace; I am comforted and the world is comfortless; I am extinguished and the world is unextinguished; I, having crossed over, can bring across; I, being liberated, can liberate; I, being controlled, can teach control; I, being at peace, can pacify; I, being comforted, can comfort; I, being extinguished, can teach extinguishment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 6, 2020 8:37 PM

Title: Re: The meaning of envy in the context of the sutta

Content:

Yes, always so. Although there are some innocuous senses of 'envy' in colloquial English, all the Pali nouns and verbs that get translated as 'envy' exclusively have to do with unwholesome states of mind.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 6, 2020 9:37 PM

Title: Re: The meaning of envy in the context of the sutta

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 6, 2020 10:54 PM

Title: Re: The meaning of envy in the context of the sutta

Content:

When the words are being used in their traditional sense, envy doesn't have "a jealousy component". It's a completely different thing.

Wanting to be like another person would never be an example of what the Buddha calls 'envy' (issā, ussuyā). Whether it would be a good or a bad thing would obviously depend on what sort of person you wanted to be like and in what respect you wanted to be like him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 7, 2020 5:46 AM

Title: Re: Udana Parallels

Content:

There are three English and one German translation of the Udānavarga, whose chapter on Nirvāṇa parallels much of Ud 8.1-8.4. The only one that I know to be available online is the 1883 English translation from the Tibetan by Rockhill:

https://archive.org/details/udanavargatibetandhammapada_202003_991_y/page/n151/mode/2up

The others are the 1911 German translation from the Tibetan by Hermann Beckh:
Udanavarga: Eine Sammlung buddhistischer Sprüche in tibetischer Sprache

The 1974 translation from the Chinese by Charles Willemsen:

The Chinese Udanavarga. A Collection of Important Odes of the Law (Fa Chi Yao Sung Ching).

And the translation by Dhammajoti, also from the Chinese. I've never seen a copy, so I don't know what its title is.

Also, Ven. Ānandajoti has produced a critical edition of the Sanskrit text of the Udānavarga, but I don't think he has translated it yet. The Nirvāṇa chapter:

<https://www.ancient-buddhist-texts.net/Buddhist-Texts/S1-Udanavarga/26-Nirvana.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Nov 8, 2020 1:54 AM

Title: Re: DW Chat

Content:

I think the only way it can be done is by opening a word processor, clicking on "Show emoji and symbols" and then copying and pasting whichever you want to use.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6127&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 10, 2020 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Attacks by non-humans?

Content:

And also in the sutta accounts of the axe-wielding Vajirapāṇi hovering over the head of the Buddha's interlocutor when he's not playing fair in debate.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2020 4:52 PM

Title: Re: is it true at ariyas have max 7 life?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2020 4:56 PM

Title: Re: The Questions of Metteyya

Content:

Be more expansive, please. What doesn't fit what?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 11, 2020 5:24 PM

Title: Re: Words about "nibbana" & "parinibbana" ????

Content:

It should be analysed as paccattaṃ + eva. The first word is formed from paṭi + attāṃ. It's the same word as in the last of the special qualities of the Dhamma: paccattaṃ veditabbo viññūhi - "to be personally known by the wise".

Eva here probably means "only".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 12, 2020 10:38 AM

Title: Re: Attacks by non-humans?

Content:

I guess these two fellows in Pieter Bruegel's "Triumph of Death" must be quarter zombies; they've got the two-wheeled cart and the bell, but are lacking a sword.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6144&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 13, 2020 12:56 PM

Title: Re: Advice on dealing with Christian friends who want to convert you?

Content:

And if you're a married woman, your Christian friends may conclude: "Oh dear, her husband's obviously had her killed and replaced with a malfunctioning Stepford Wife. Our Lord wasn't crucified to save robots ... let's find some other victim."

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 14, 2020 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist practice as a monastic in another religion?

Content:

I think the "firm conclusion" is so trivially true that it deserves no serious place in one's planning for the future.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 16, 2020 3:25 PM

Title: Re: How to translate "vimocayaṃ" ???

Content:

It differs in that it's a verb and these are nouns, but they are formed from the same root and prefix and their meanings are closely related.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 17, 2020 4:32 PM

Title: Re: Why Theravada if you are suddanta?

Content:

Well, that's not surprising, for 'suddanta' just means 'sutta'. It isn't the name of a Buddhist sect, a Vinaya lineage or a school of interpretation.

In Sanskritic Buddhism the name 'Sautrāntika' is given to a school whose hermeneutic prioritised the sūtras over the (Sarvāstivāda) abhidharma. But the Pali equivalent, suddantika, isn't used for this purpose. In the Vinaya a suddantika is a monk who memorises suttas; it's not the name of a school.

The Sinhalese chronicles and Kathāvatthu Commentary mention a school called the Suttavādins and some have suggested that these may be identical with the Sautrāntikas. They may be right but there's no certainty about it because Pali sources tell us only that the Suttavādins were an offshoot of an offshoot of the Sarvāstivādins, but don't tell us anything about their views.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Nov 17, 2020 11:58 PM

Title: Re: What is vilātaṃ?

Content:

It's a sedan or palanquin, but in this context a funeral bier. The crowd is decorating it with pieces of coloured cloth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 19, 2020 6:42 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

Two quotes backing up what, bhante? That the ajahn rarely talks about darkness as essential? Or that most people complain that staying at his monastery is quite useless?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 19, 2020 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

But in your article I don't see two quotes from his books, or even one quote, about the alleged uselessness of staying in the ajahn's monastery. And I don't see two quotes, or

even one quote, about the ajahn "rarely talking about darkness as essential."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 20, 2020 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

I wonder, bhante, how did you come to know that: "Most people complain that staying at his monastery is quite useless"?

I mean it's hard to credit that even a third or a half, let alone a majority, of those who stay at Bodhinyana feel it imperative to contact Ven. Subhūti or his Czech friend to let them know what a rotten time they had. And I assume that neither you nor your Czech friend are in the habit of sending Bodhinyana guests a customer satisfaction questionnaire to be filled in after their departure. Whence then comes your information? Aussie devas perhaps?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 20, 2020 3:33 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

I think you're confusing me with JamestheGiant. I've neither met Ajahn Brahm nor stayed at his monastery.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 20, 2020 3:54 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

This and the rest of your post appears to be intended for JamestheGiant, so I'll leave it to him to respond if he wishes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 20, 2020 4:57 PM

Title: Re: why westerners dont beleive in after life world

Content:

I don't know the reason for their reticence, but the difference isn't hard to describe.

Reincarnation

vāsānsi jīrṇāni yathā vihāya

navāni grihṇāti naro 'parāṇi
tathā śarīrāṇi vihāya jīrṇānya
nyāni sanyāti navāni dehī

"As a person sheds worn-out garments and wears new ones, likewise, at the time of death, the soul casts off its worn-out body and enters a new one."

(Bhagavad Gītā 2:22)

The body dies & the soul gets a new body & the body dies & the soul gets a new body & the body dies & etc., etc.

Resurrection

"And as it is appointed unto men once to die, but after this the judgment..."

(Hebrews 9:28)

The body dies & the soul goes into a dormant state & at the end of the world the Angel Gabriel blows his trumpet & the souls of all the dead come out of hibernation, the elements of their bodies come back together again and the souls reanimate them & each body-and-soul is judged and consigned to eternal heaven or hell.

(At least this is one common version of the story, though the Christians do have quite a few others).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 20, 2020 5:14 PM

Title: Re: why westerners dont beleive in after life world

Content:

NT scholars have proposed at least five views as to what the disciples may have been thinking when they raised the possibility that the man was born blind as a punishment for sins committed before he was born. The reincarnationist hypothesis is one of them, but it's the least favoured one by both believers and secular scholars. It seems only New Age loons give it any credence.

Last time I checked the consensus was that the disciples probably had in mind the rabbinical idea that a baby may commit sins while in the womb. One text, for example, has Esau making threats against his twin brother Jacob if Jacob didn't allow Esau to be born first.

The oddest of the theories is that the man was born blind in order to punish him proactively for some grave sin that God foresaw he was going to commit later.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 21, 2020 2:54 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 23, 2020 7:12 AM
Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana
Content:
According to the OP:

PS maintains that the mind's object when in jhāna is the counterpart sign (paṭibhāga nimitta).

AB maintains that it's pīti and sukha.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Nov 23, 2020 11:34 PM
Title: Re: It is wrong to say: "Samsara has no beginning" or "Samsara is beginningless"
Content:
I think it's quite correct to say that "saṃsāra is beginningless".

The beginninglessness of saṃsāra may be inferred simply from the fact that saṃsāra depends on avijjā, avijjā depends on nutriment, and part of that nutriment is prior instances of avijjā.

Moreover, in the commentaries "without a discoverable beginning" (anamatagga) and "with no beginning" (anādimati) are used interchangeably, while expressions like "is not manifest" (na paññāyati), "is not to be seen" (na dissati), "is not to be found" (na vijjati) and "does not obtain" (na upalabbhati) are all common Indic idioms for "does not exist".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 24, 2020 2:52 PM
Title: Re: the great rebirth debate
Content:

The sutta says "sentient being", not "human being". So, when read your way the Buddha's statement would simply be false. It would be as easy as pie to find a sentient being whose ancestors had never interbred with one's own ancestors, e.g., any animal that reproduces asexually.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2020 11:44 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

There's no need for that at the moment. Discussion of right and wrong notions about jhāna is quite within Dhamma Wheel's terms of service.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2020 1:03 PM

Title: Re: How does Buddhism explain Hindu moksha and Shaktih

Content:

I should hope that it would be a rather sceptical one and informed by the Kevaddhasutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn11>

Perhaps some day there'll be an encounter between this guru and James Randi, but should it ever happen I don't fancy the guru's chances. The stunts in the videos are no more remarkable than what any second-rate stage conjuror can do, and indeed are much less impressive than what the bushy-haired Sathya Sai Baba could do; yet even his tricks were shown to be fraudulent.

If, however, they turned out to be genuine paṭihāriya, from a Buddhist point of view it wouldn't necessarily mean that the guru was any good. The psychic feats of the Buddha's errant disciple Devadatta were also genuine.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2020 3:43 PM

Title: Re: Zoroastrian influence in Buddhism?

Content:

See Charles Goodman's reply ("Neither Scythian nor Greek: A Response to Beckwith's Greek Buddha and Kuzminski's Early Buddhism Reconsidered") in the attached file. Or any of the online reviews in quality Indological or Hellenic studies journals.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6177](#)

(350.26 KiB) Downloaded 97 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Nov 25, 2020 4:42 PM

Title: Re: How does Buddhism explain Hindu moksha and Shaktih

Content:

Oh, I hadn't heard about it.

But never mind - India has quite a few Randi types of her own.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 3:20 AM

Title: Re: How Buddha taught

Content:

In samatha-bhāvanā there are elements of both. The recommendation of asubha for lust types and mettabhāvanā for hate types would be an example of the former. The recommendation of buddhānussati, dhammānussati, etc. for faith types would be an example of the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 6:58 AM

Title: Re: How does Buddhism explain Hindu moksha and Shaktih

Content:

I wouldn't feel obliged to explain anything unless the guru had first convinced me that he was indeed omniscient and omnipotent, or at least vastly more knowing and powerful than is ordinarily considered possible. It would take a lot more to convince me than the cheap hocus-pocus in your videos. I mean I could just go to Khaosan Road in Bangkok and meet Indian street conjurors who make an easy dollar performing the same kind of tricks for the entertainment of tourists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 1:56 PM

Title: Re: Is anatta based off of manifestation from nothing?

Content:

I don't think the matter has been correctly explained to you.

Suppose that in a single mental continuum there are two successive consciousnesses, A and B. According to abhidhammic momentarism (khaṇikavāda) the arising of consciousness B is dependent on the passing away of consciousness A. (In the parlance of the Paṭṭhāna's conditional relations theory, A and B are causally related by way of absence condition, disappearance condition, contiguity condition and proximity condition).

You seem to be misunderstanding this to mean that the disappearance of A is all that's needed for the arising of B — it's the sole and sufficient cause for it. But *khaṇikavāda* doesn't claim anything of the sort. No consciousness could arise merely because the consciousness that preceded it had passed away. All kinds of other factors are needed (both past and present), depending on what kind of consciousness it is. For example, if B is an instance of eye-consciousness, then its arising would be due in part to past kamma, for eye-consciousnesses are classed as kamma-resultant consciousnesses (*vipāka citta*).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 2:27 PM

Title: Re: How long to attain first jhana?

Content:

Even if we grant that Thanissaro is right to favour the Royal Siamese reading, there's still the question of whether he has translated it properly. Frankly I don't think he has. The Pali word *eka*, outside of compounds, is much much more often used as a limiting adjective than as a numeral. For example, *eko piḥhako* would more probably mean "a certain dungbeetle" than "one dungbeetle". Most translators would opt for the second rendering only if the context clearly indicated that *eko* was being used as a numeral (e.g., if the passage was a description of somebody counting dung-beetles).

Even the Thai translators, who like Thanissaro use the Royal Siamese edition, don't render the passage in the way that he does. They translate *ekā saññā* as "a certain kind of perception" (สัญญาอย่างหนึ่ง), not as "one perception" (สัญญาหนึ่ง).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 2:57 PM

Title: Re: I believe that by logically accepting the premises of madhyamika and yogachara one would become a Tirthika

Content:

Your post isn't in any way concerned with connections to the Theravada and deals with a topic that would be more appropriately discussed on Dharma Wheel Mahayana.

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Nov 26, 2020 7:30 PM

Title: Re: What are the history and significance of the Talipot fan?

Content:

Talipot leaves are one of the five things that bhikkhus are allowed to use for stuffing their mattresses.

If the Buddha had a fan it would most likely have been of palmyra, since this is what he allowed bhikkhus to use.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 27, 2020 2:44 PM

Title: Re: It is wrong to say: "Samsara has no beginning" or "Samsara is beginningless"

Content:

I'm not familiar with this.

There is of course the deva Rohitassa, who went further and further spatially seeking the end of the world but failing to find it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 27, 2020 5:52 PM

Title: Re: What are the history and significance of the Talipot fan?

Content:

Presumably at some point in history some bhikkhus applied the four mahāpadesas and reasoned that since the Blessed One allowed the leaves of *Borassus flabellifer* for fan-making, the leaves of *Corypha umbraculifera* ought to be allowable too, on account of their resemblance.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6185&mode=view](#)

.

[./download/file.php?id=6186&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Nov 27, 2020 11:07 PM

Title: Re: "Is it possible to accept Nagarjuna's argument and remain a Theravadan?"

Content:

Echoing Lewis, I wonder, are we not entitled to say of Nāgārjuna:

“Either the man was a very bad writer, or else Madhyamakas are very bad readers. In deference to their number and their reputation, we choose the first alternative; though, as you will observe, it will work out to the same result if we chose the second.” ?

.

./download/file.php?id=6188
(202.49 KiB) Downloaded 14 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 28, 2020 4:52 AM

Title: Re: What are the history and significance of the Talipot fan?

Content:

To keep cool. There's also a Vinaya allowance to accept and use a whisk for scaring away flies.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 28, 2020 1:37 PM

Title: Re: What are the history and significance of the Talipot fan?

Content:

No apology is called for. I replied tersely to your last post because I was about to go out, not because I was annoyed by it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 28, 2020 3:15 PM

Title: Re: What are the history and significance of the Talipot fan?

Content:

Your second picture is of Phra Malai (= Sri Lankan arahant Maliyadeva), not the Buddha.

Here's a similar one, but with the Buddha seated behind him.

.

./download/file.php?id=6191&mode=view

.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Phra_Malai

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Maliyadeva>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 28, 2020 7:54 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

If we go with the more optimistic figure (one in a hundred), then it means that one in a million can become a Visuddhimagga-style jhānalābhī. If we go with the more pessimistic figure, then it will be one in a thousand million. And so for Ajahn Brahmavamso to produce, say, ten jhānalābhīs, he would need to have at least ten million meditating disciples according to the optimistic figure, or a thousand million meditating disciples according to the pessimistic figure.

Though I've been told that Ajahn Brahmavamso has even more followers on Facebook than the Dalai Lama, I'm pretty sure that they don't number in the tens of millions. Certainly not the thousands of millions. And so the fact that he replies: "Not many," would not serve to cast any doubt at all on whether his teaching was an efficacious one by Visuddhimagga criteria. For even when Visuddhimagga standards are maintained to the last dot and comma, at best only one meditator in a million can expect to enjoy success.

I'd like to end this post by asking you, bhante, have you ever put to Pa-Auk Sayadaw the question that you put to Ajahn Brahmavamso? If you have, what was the sayadaw's answer?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 28, 2020 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

There was no need to quote the entire post that you were replying to. In future please trim any unnecessary content.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 10:33 AM

Title: Re: DN1 question

Content:

No, it's a downward movement. Ābhassara is a second-jhāna heaven, but the empty palace is in the Mahābrahmā heaven which is only first jhāna. You'll find a lot of your questions addressed in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Brahmajālasutta, its commentary and extracts from its two subcommentaries.

<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/01%20DN%2001%20Brahmajala%20Sutta%2C%20The%20Discourse%20All%20Embracing%20Net%20of%20Views%20-%20Bhikkhu%20Bodhi%28OCRed%29%20%28372p%29>

The question in your opening post, however, is not addressed at all.

On those occasions when the commentators leave something unexplained it seems to be for one of four reasons:

1. Avoidance of superfluity: the explicandum has already been explained elsewhere.
2. Avoidance of moronsplaining: the meaning of the word, phrase, fact or thing is too obvious to need explaining.
3. Avoidance of category mistake: the fact is not an explicandum but rather a brute fact and as such cannot be explained.
4. Mystery: there's no obvious explanation for why the word, phrase, fact or thing are not treated as explicanda.

(This isn't an official Theravāda taxonomy, by the way, but just something I cobbled together myself).

In the present case, we know from elsewhere that it is due to greater or lesser accumulations of merit that there is variety in the longevity, beauty etc. of devas and brahmās. So this would be an example of #1. But there is no explanation anywhere as to why the brahmā with the most merit gets to arise first. It's possible, of course, that this is also due to merit, but nowhere is this actually stated. And so I wouldn't rule out the possibility that the absence of explanation is an example of #3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 12:59 PM

Title: Re: "Is it possible to accept Nagarjuna's argument and remain a Theravadan?"

Content:

Chamo is Channa, the bodhisatta's charioteer. He was called Khemaka in a former life, recounted in the Golden Goose Jātaka.

<https://suttacentral.net/ja534/en/francis>

As far as I know the simile of the chariot never occurs in connection with Channa in Pali sources.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 8:10 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Brahmavamso's Dark Jhana

Content:

Which according to the Visuddhimagga would require the sayadaw to have a following that outnumbered the present population of the world. Unless you mean that 999 out of those 1000 are devas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Is there a Scientific explanation to "Colored light rays that came out of the Buddha's body"

Content:

The display of the six-coloured aura in the fourth week is from the Atthasālinī (Expositor I p. 16-17).

<https://archive.org/details/dli.csl.3696>

That of the seventh week is in the Vinaya's account of the Buddha's taming of the nāga at Uruvelā.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd1>

A fairly comprehensive list of sources relating to the Buddha's physical appearance, both ordinary and supernormal, can be found in chapter 3 of Toshiichi Endo's "https://archive.org/details/theravadabuddhaintheravadabuddhismastudyoftheconceptofbuddhainpaliliteraturetoshiichiendo_122_N - a Study of the Concept of Buddha in the Pali Commentaries".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 10:08 PM

Title: Re: "Is it possible to accept Nagarjuna's argument and remain a Theravadan?"

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Nov 30, 2020 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Those rejecting Abhidhamma Pitaka itself (regardless of commentaries) are not actual Theravadins (nor Vibhajjavadins)

Content:

Until people decided that it had. Then 'rose' would simply have come to denote a different referent.

Adhammasammataṃ kho pana, vāseṭṭha, tena samayena hoti, tadetarahi dhammasammataṃ.

“What at that time, Vāseṭṭha, was agreed to be adhamma, is now agreed to be dhamma.”
(Aggañña Sutta)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 10, 2020 10:24 AM

Title: Re: thina-middham : sloth and torpor: mental, physical, both?

Content:

It's not that they were once two different words that are now taken to be the same, but that they've always been variant forms of the past participle of the same verb, just as 'dreamed' and 'dreamt' have always been variant past participles of 'dream'.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 10, 2020 10:44 PM

Title: Re: thina-middham : sloth and torpor: mental, physical, both?

Content:

So, it seems to me that arati is wholly mental; tandī is both bodily and mental (the Dispeller of Delusion later defines it as "bodily idleness due to defilement"); likewise vijambhitā, which is later defined as "bodily shifting due to defilement"; bhattasammada is wholly bodily; and cetaso līnattaṃ wholly mental.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2020 2:49 PM

Title: Re: Kamma and its Ripening in the Abhidhamma

Content:

Differences of opinion over what should be attributed to kamma and what shouldn't first seem to have cropped up at the Third Council. And so the principal Pali sources would be the Kathāvatthu and its commentary, where half a dozen or so of the Council's debates are on the subject: "Is X caused by kamma?" and with the Theravādin debater always arguing for a negative answer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2020 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Under the table

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2020 10:28 PM

Title: Re: What sutta was the concept of "krya citta" based on?

Content:

and also the contrary error of some modernists who draw antinomian conclusions from passages like Dhammapada 39, claiming that an arahant is amoral and no longer observant of any moral restraint.

From the Kathāvatthu Atthakathā:

.

[./download/file.php?id=6219&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 12, 2020 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Under the table

Content:

Though never systematically worked out, the Buddha's conception of the basis for political legitimacy seems to me to have been a combination of the two: a Hobbes-like social contractualism in the Aggaññasutta and a Burke-like prescriptivism in the Vajjisutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 13, 2020 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Kamma and its Ripening in the Abhidhamma

Content:

The conclusion does happen to be factually correct, but the premise on which it's based isn't Theravada teaching but rather a modern scholar's conjecture as to how the Pali commentators might have grappled with the question of a kamma's ontological status in the interval between its performance and its ripening, if the question had interested them (which apparently it didn't).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 13, 2020 11:14 PM

Title: Re: Poll on homogeneity in a monastery

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Dec 14, 2020 2:22 PM
Title: Re: Under the table
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 15, 2020 12:06 AM
Title: Re: Under the table
Content:

See, for example, the Vinaya's account of the run-up to the Second Council. The good monk, Yasa, son of Kākaṇḍakā, has authority, but the corrupt monks of Vesālī have power.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/pi-tv-kd22>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Dec 15, 2020 10:16 PM
Title: Re: Under the table
Content:

Maybe. It did cross my mind, but then I figured the poster was probably smart enough to see the difference between, say, Rishi Sunak delivering his annual budget speech in the House of Commons and Henry Hill saying, "F*** you, pay me!" in Goodfellas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Dec 16, 2020 11:51 PM
Title: Re: Under the table
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Dec 17, 2020 12:04 AM
Title: Re: Under the table
Content:

In Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Atthakathā the general Vinaya obligation to conform to the wishes of rājās is qualified with a statement to the effect that this doesn't apply when those wishes are unrighteous/unjust/ (adhammika).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 17, 2020 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Under the table

Content:

No. For example, if you replace Rishi Sunak with Sir Thomas Cromwell and Henry Hill with Reggie Kray, then I would probably find the gangster more likeable than the chancellor of the exchequer. But this wouldn't alter my judgment that the one is carrying out a lawful office and the other is engaged in crime.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2020 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Gay and Buddhism

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2020 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Bojjhangaparitta and healing

Content:

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?p=332862#p332862>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2020 1:13 PM

Title: Re: Bojjhangaparitta and healing

Content:

I'm afraid I don't know of any that are specifically for that purpose. Probably better to give them warm clothes, food, first aid materials and cash. I suspect that some random Buddhist chanting parittas at them would be as annoying as those officious Xian evangelists who make a practice of sitting down and praying with them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2020 10:28 PM

Title: Re: Balangoda Ananda Maitreya Thero

Content:

Some years ago I posted one of his parables here, Forest and the Way Out, originally entitled Pseudo-Pilgrims.

<https://buddhismnow.com/2011/10/28/forest-and-the-way-out-by-ananda-maitreya/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 18, 2020 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Kalāpa in the Four Nikāyas

Content:

Actually Piya fully accepts rebirth, as one might expect of a veteran Brahmavamso acolyte. His article is arguing for an allegorical rather than literal reading of the suttas' descriptions of hell, not a rejection of the doctrine of rebirth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Dec 19, 2020 2:34 PM

Title: Re: Bojjhangaparitta and healing

Content:

Well, maybe, though I would note that this is not what the monk himself believes, for he's committed to the Milindapañha's view and modestly disclaims that his paritta healing feats might have anything to do with the fact that it's he who is doing the chanting. Which leads me to wonder if there might not be a plausible intermediate position here, i.e., that a paritta's efficacy is not dependent on any inherent power in its words, but might be dependent on the chanter believing that there is such a power.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 20, 2020 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Bojjhangaparitta and healing

Content:

"We find..." ?

Who has found these things?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Dec 20, 2020 2:21 PM

Title: Re: Your take on pre-sectarian Buddhism

Content:

What you asked for was members' opinions on what original Buddhism was like. One such opinion is that of Classical Theravādins. It seems a silly sort of thread to start if you're only interested in hearing opinions that happen to coincide with your own.

Welcome, anyway, to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 21, 2020 7:13 AM

Title: Re: Your take on pre-sectarian Buddhism

Content:

An alleged ur-Buddhism with no numerical lists (not even the four noble truths), based only on the Suttanipāṭa's Aṭṭhakavagga and Parāyanavagga, and essentially similar to the dhamma of the eel-wiggler Sañjaya Belaṭṭhaputta, was the pet theory of the Japanese scholar Hajime Nakamura in the late sixties. I gather it didn't have many takers among Nakamura's fellow Japanese, but when his book, Indian Buddhism - A Survey, was translated into English, the theory enjoyed about five minutes of fame in the Buddhist studies departments of American universities, before being discarded in favour of other conjectures.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 21, 2020 9:21 AM

Title: Re: Esoteric Theravada - Kate Croby

Content:

In their Saturday morning zoom sessions the UK-based Samatha Trust has recently hosted a series of talks on yogāvacara meditation / borān kammaṭṭhāna by Dr. Paul Dennison, a student and practitioner of this approach since the 1960s. The talks have now been uploaded to youtube.

Contents

Talk 1: Invocation

Talk 2: The 1st & 2nd Rupa Jhanas

Talk 3: The 3rd & 4th Rūpa Jhānas

Talk 4: 1st and 2nd Arūpa Jhānas

Talk 5: The 4th & 5th Arūpa Jhanas

Talk 6: The Path

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 23, 2020 4:03 PM

Title: Re: Analayo's article on Ingram

Content:

Within the doctrinal scheme to which Ingram is supposedly committed (i.e., the commentarial 16-ñāṇa series), your proposal would be an impossibility. Since at the 16th ñāṇa the yogāvacara discerns which fetters have been abandoned by him and which fetters still remain, it can't happen that an attainer of stream-entry might mistakenly imagine himself to be an arahant. And so either the man's an arahant or he's

a deeply misguided puthujjana, but he can't be anything in between.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 24, 2020 5:14 PM

Title: Re: Direct Knowledge

Content:

Though I don't often agree with Ajahn Thanissaro, on this occasion I don't think the Buddha's checklist would conflict with the ajahn's claim that stream-entry is an earth-shattering experience that imparts a sense of certitude to those who attain it. Why not? Because there are other kinds of religious experience, altered states of consciousness, etc., which are also earth-shattering, which also impart certitude to those who undergo them, but which are not stream-entry. Lectures IX and X of William James's <http://gutenberg.org/ebooks/621> have quite a catalogue of these. Yet because of the certitude, sense of assurance, loss of anxiety, etc., that they give, they may easily be mistaken for stream-entry. Hence the need for a check list to distinguish a justified certitude from an unjustified one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 24, 2020 7:58 PM

Title: Re: Direct Knowledge

Content:

To me it's quite conceivable that someone could have an experience that he mistakenly takes for stream-entry and that this could give rise to a delusion-based certitude that's stable enough to persist for the rest of his life. As a matter of fact, I think it happens quite a lot. Now a genuine stream-entrant may not feel any need to have his attainment confirmed by a checklist (so great is his certitude) but the same might be true of the deeply deluded puthujjana just described. Hence the need for criteria that go beyond mere subjective certitude; not so much because the genuine stream-entrant's certitude needs confirming, but because the deluded puthujjana's certitude needs disconfirming.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 24, 2020 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Direct Knowledge

Content:

I don't see any such implication, any more than I would see the Buddha's occasional engagement in paccavekkhaṇa regarding his state as implying that his awakening wasn't earth-shattering.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 24, 2020 11:45 PM

Title: Re: Direct Knowledge

Content:

Practically speaking, in the present age I don't think that either of these would be likely to serve as a satisfactory yardstick, owing to the lack of consensus on what is meant by a sotāpanna's possession of the "sīla pleasing to Ariyans" and on the correct understanding of dependent origination.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Dec 25, 2020 2:46 PM

Title: Re: Christmas

Content:

For Western monks in Thailand Christmas Day is not much different from any other, except that many Thais very thoughtfully go out of their way to make us feel at home by laying on special Christmas fare. And so on almsround this morning, as well as the usual sticky rice, boiled bamboo shoots, etc., I was given thirty-seven tangerines (on a normal day it would be just two or three) and a funny red hat.

The only change to my normal routine will be at 10 pm Indochina time / 3 pm GMT, when I tune in to listen to Queen Elizabeth's Christmas message. Here's the youtube link for anyone who wants to join me:

<https://www.youtube.com/user/TheRoyalChannel>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2021 12:41 PM

Title: Re: Frank Yang is DONE!

Content:

And dhammic norms.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2021 1:01 PM

Title: Re: covid vaccine: yea or nay?

Content:

The poll has no "presently undecided" option, which is the position I'm in at the moment.

I'm living in Amphoe Li, which is the largest, but least populous, district of Lamphun Province. In the entire province we've had only four cases (all now recovered) and none at all in Amphoe Li.

At least that was how matters stood until yesterday, when I was informed by our village headman that an Amphoe Li sāmanera had just tested positive. He lives in a monastery about 60 km away. If the virus starts spreading and gets within 20 km then I shall probably get vaccinated; otherwise I'd prefer not to, or at least postpone doing so until a lot more testing has been done.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2021 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Pūjeti - offer and honor (Narada Pali Course)

Content:

The verb means to honour or worship, but in practice the manner of worship denoted by pūjā is one that involves either a literal offering (flowers, candles, incense, verses of praise, etc.) or a figurative one, as in patipatti-pūjā, honouring the Buddha by means of one's practice. I guess it's for this reason that Nārada opted for "offer".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 5, 2021 5:20 PM

Title: Re: Pūjeti - offer and honor (Narada Pali Course)

Content:

Well, the ablative would just about make sense, though I'm pretty sure it wouldn't be the sense intended by Nārada. We could take it as being the ablative of cause. For example, a fellow sees a sea of daffodils fluttering and dancing in the breeze, has a Wordsworth-like epiphany and is thereby triggered to offer the Buddha a lighted candle:

"Because of the flowers he makes an offering to the Buddha."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 6, 2021 12:50 PM

Title: Re: covid vaccine: yea or nay?

Content:

The condition being, "...but only if the virus comes too close for comfort."

But couldn't this just as readily be an example of "no with conditions"? -

"I'll not be vaccinated unless the virus comes too close for comfort."

So contrary to what I said in my earlier post, perhaps both of these options are instances of "presently undecided", distinguished only by which conditional conjunction one happens to prefer: "unless..." or "only if..."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 6, 2021 7:56 PM

Title: Re: we are all inter-connected

Content:

I don't think it's accepted or rejected in the Theravada.

What would be rejected, however, is the notion, entertained in some Mahayana schools (and Engaged Buddhist circles) that the supposed universal interconnectedness of sentient beings is not only a fact but is in some way a dhammically momentous or soteriologically vital fact. If it's a fact at all, then from a Theravada pov it's a purely mundane and dhammically irrelevant fact. Even if universal interconnectedness obtains, in the Buddha's teaching it's only a very tiny proportion of connections that are valued and treated as mattering. For example, those between kalyānamittas, between sangha and laity, parents and children, rulers and citizens, employers and employees, etc.

By contrast, the fact that there may be some lobster crawling about on the bed of the North Atlantic who happens to have been my Auntie Edna in its former life doesn't amount to a connection that matters.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 7, 2021 12:47 PM

Title: Re: we are all inter-connected

Content:

I understood the OP's query to be about what view the Theravada takes, or might take, regarding the supposed interconnectedness of all sentient beings. In replying what I had in mind was the general idea, not any particular Mahayana formulation of it. It may well be that my droll example isn't in line with how interconnectedness is conceived in, say, the two Chinese schools mentioned by Coemgenu, nor in TNH's dumbed-down and sentimentalised version of the same. On the other hand, it is pretty much in line with how Tibetan Buddhists are wont to talk. For example, whereas the Buddha merely said that it would be difficult to find someone who had not at some time been one's mother, the Tibetans insist that ALL sentient beings without exception have undoubtedly been one's mother in some past life or other. And to judge from the frequency with which they say this (and the patently fallacious argument for it that they all seem to have memorised) I gather they not only deem it a fact, but a fact of the highest importance.

Regarding the idea that the supposed interconnectedness of all beings helps one to realise anattā, if this were true then we should expect to find some mention of this in the hundreds of anattā-related suttas in the SN's Nidāna, Khandha and Salāyatana vaggas. But we don't find any such thing at all. Perhaps such a notion is present in Mahayana sutras, but the OP is enquiring about the Theravada view

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 7, 2021 4:33 PM

Title: Re: we are all inter-connected

Content:

In the Ariyan discipline it's about this fathom-long body.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 7, 2021 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Australian story!

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2021 5:46 PM

Title: Re: mettā meditation

Content:

May I ask, in your effort to generate mettā are you doing anything else besides mentally reciting formulas like "May all beings be well"? Or do you think that these formulas, along with the mere wish for mettā to arise, are all that's needed?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2021 6:40 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro Bhikkhu's definition of 'compunction' and 'ottappa'

Content:

This is true in the sense that the suttas don't contain any explicit statement delimiting the occasions when ottappa might arise.

Nevertheless, I think we may reasonably infer that the term refers solely to something that arises before some contemplated unwholesome action and whose arising restrains us from doing it. I would infer this from the fact that:

1. Compunction, regret or remorse arising after the performance of an unwholesome act is consistently denoted either by vippatisāra or kukkucca (defined in the commentaries as synonyms), never by ottappa.

2. Vippatisāra and kukkucca are consistently represented as unwholesome states, while ottappa is consistently represented as a wholesome one. The suttas have nothing positive to say about the first two terms and nothing negative to say about the third.

3. If ottappa referred to the remorse that arises after an unwholesome act, then it would be hard to see how it could be anything but another name for vippatisāra or kukkucca. This, however, would be inconsistent with #2.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2021 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Thanissaro Bhikkhu's definition of 'compunction' and 'ottappa'

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 9, 2021 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Revealing counterfeit Dhamma: Poems of Matty Weingast published in "The First Free Women" as a version of the Therig

Content:

As far as Indian Buddhist literature goes, it was certainly a standard practice to compose new texts that included considerable imaginative embellishment of the old texts. But it wasn't a standard practice to claim that these new texts were translations of the old texts.

For example, when Asvaghosa wrote an account of the Bodhisatta's time with Ālāra Kālāma he fabricated the extra detail that Ālāra was a teacher of the Hindu Sāmkhya school and gave what he claimed was a summary of Ālāra's philosophy. There's no evidence for this at all. But what Asvaghosa did not do (but which this rascally Weingast fellow would most likely have done) was to try and peddle his work as a translation of the Ariyapariyesanasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 10, 2021 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Newly Joined

Content:

An "introduction thread" is a thread in which new members introduce themselves to the forum. Like this one.

Any thread that you start will be a "new thread" at the time when you start it. This present thread was new a few weeks ago. But now it's old.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2021 6:40 AM

Title: Re: Adolf Hitler

Content:

I think it must be somebody else who wrote this. For the last two decades my view has been that traditionalist/Burkean conservatism is dhammic, revolutionary communism and fascism adhammic, and most other ideologies dhammically neutral (i.e. neither supported by nor in conflict with the Buddha's teaching).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2021 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Adolf Hitler

Content:

Yes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2021 1:34 PM

Title: Re: Adolf Hitler

Content:

The part in bold is the chief problem, the notion of state violence as redemptive, as opposed to its being occasionally a necessary evil; the gratuitous belief in the justice of expanding one's territory (Hitler's obsession with Lebensraum, Mussolini's greed to own North Africa); the "cleansing" of one's nation by exterminating this or that despised ethnic or sexual minority group, along with all one's political opponents; and the abandonment of constitutionality and the rule of law and their replacement by essentially capricious and despotic acts of state, carried out "without ethical or legal restraint".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 15, 2021 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Adolf Hitler

Content:

But I didn't make any such argument. I don't fetishize democracy and the "suspension of democratic liberties" in Paxton's definition of fascism is not among the features that I singled out as adhammic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 16, 2021 7:51 AM

Title: Re: why bhikkhu say jhana easily accused parajika

Content:

I've never heard anybody say this, but if they did then they'd just be revealing their

ignorance of Vinaya. The relevant offences are falsely claiming to have attained jhāna, which is a pārājika offence, and truthfully claiming to have attained jhāna when speaking to an unordained person, which is a pācittiya offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 16, 2021 8:57 PM

Title: Re: why bhikkhu say jhana easily accused parajika

Content:

But the rule isn't limited to false claims of arahantship. It also includes false claims about the lower paths and fruits and the jhānas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 17, 2021 2:59 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Sumedho moving back to England permanently?

Content:

I don't have any info beyond what's in the video and the text description that accompanies it. The latter states only that the ajahn will be leaving to spend the vassa in England. It doesn't speak of it as a permanent move.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 17, 2021 11:13 PM

Title: Re: Kusala and punna

Content:

Kusala means 'wholesome' or 'skilful'; puñña means 'merit' or 'meritorious'. In that sense they are different.

All the dhammas that are called 'wholesome' are also called 'meritorious'; all the dhammas that are called 'meritorious' are also called 'wholesome'. In that sense they are the same.

In contexts having to do with the way to liberation, good states are more likely to be termed kusala than puñña; in contexts having to do with obtaining a bright rebirth, good states are more likely to be termed puñña than kusala. In that sense they are different. This isn't an invariable rule, however, and there are plenty of exceptions

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 18, 2021 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Meritorious deeds

Content:

I think the teaching you have in mind may be that on the five qualities of high-minded and low-minded lay disciples. The fifth quality of the high-minded disciples is that they give alms and pay respects to monks and nuns within the Buddhasāsanā before doing so to those outside the Buddhasāsanā. Low-minded disciples do it the other way round. But it's not taught that there's any fault in giving to the outsiders.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 18, 2021 7:39 PM

Title: Re: hi, im Indigo

Content:

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

The signs of the Buddha Metteya's coming are said to include the following:

The dispensation of Gotama Buddha will have entirely disappeared.

Billions of years will have then elapsed.

The lifespan of humans will be 80,000 years, with women getting married at the age of five hundred.

There'll be only three kinds of malady afflicting humans: hunger before meals, lethargy after meals and old age.

India's capital will be called Ketumati and will be located on the site of what is now Varanasi.

The whole of India will be covered in 4-inch long soft green grass and all the country's plants will be thornless.

The world will be ruled by a wheel-turning monarch called Sankha and the Bodhisatta Metteyya will be the son of Subrahma, the monarch's chief counsellor, and his wife Brahnavatī.

You can read more here.

<https://archive.org/details/THECOMINGBUDDHAVen.S.Upatissaw>

The main point, as Coconut noted, is that the next Buddha's coming is neither now nor any time soon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 19, 2021 9:18 PM

Title: Re: "Gata" translated as "Immersed"

Content:

Why would he wish to do that?

The OP is concerned with whether the rendering is a good one or not, not with what the translator's reasons might be for translating as he does.

Judging the quality of a translation merely requires competence in the source language, the target language and the material being translated. It's not necessary to know anything at all about the translator's reasons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 20, 2021 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Do we need a friend in life?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 20, 2021 11:11 AM

Title: Re: Kusala and punna

Content:

In English the word "intention" includes not only the act or fact of intending but also the thing intended. And so it is no solecism to speak of the "intention of the criminal justice system". The "intention" here is either the end, purpose or telos aimed at by the creators of the said system or else it's *raison d'être*.

(Auf Deutsch: "Ende/Ziel/Daseinszweck der Strafjustiz").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 20, 2021 9:45 PM

Title: Re: "Gata" translated as "Immersed"

Content:

The *sāmanera*'s idiolect is neither English nor mutually intelligible with English.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 20, 2021 10:11 PM

Title: Re: "Gata" translated as "Immersed"

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2021 1:34 PM

Title: Maria Heim on love and compassion in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Full interview:.

<https://www.buddhistinquiry.org/article/love-and-compassion-in-the-visuddhimagga/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 21, 2021 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Simpler life

Content:

And so the ostensibly rebellious and carefree life imagined by romantic idealists, when actually pursued, may end up proving every bit as hollow as a conventional life of domestic conformity. Doomed either way!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2021 1:46 AM

Title: Re: People you have on your ignore list should not trigger notifications

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 22, 2021 7:46 PM

Title: Re: People you have on your ignore list should not trigger notifications

Content:

If the badgered member sends a message of complaint to a mod or reports the badgering post, and if the mod judges the complaint to be justified, then the badgering member will be instructed to desist. In practice they usually do so. If they don't then they're given warnings or suspensions.

It is necessary to complain though, for moderators don't keep a close watch on who's feuding with whom.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 23, 2021 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Anyone able to help translate?

Content:

I can see that this might be of some use in Sri Lanka, where people need to put their names on waiting lists if they want to offer dāna in certain very popular monasteries, and where fights sometimes break out if dāyakas show up to offer food on somebody else's day.

On the other hand, I doubt there'd be much call for it in the Buddhist countries of SE Asia. Thai laypeople, for example, are normally delighted when they see that others have showed up to offer alms too, for it means that when the monks have finished eating there'll be a bigger feast for everyone. Poor rural folk in particular are especially pleased when they see affluent families from the cities show up, for it means that when the food is shared they'll get to eat all sorts of dainties they wouldn't ordinarily be able to afford.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 26, 2021 6:30 PM

Title: Re: A doctrinally comprehensive guide to achieving Nibbana?

Content:

Ñānamoli's translation of the Visuddhimagga.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/index.html>

Soma Thera's translation of the Vitakkasanthāna Sutta and its commentary.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/soma/wheel021.html>

Soma Thera's translation of the Satipatthana Sutta and its commentary.

<https://tinyurl.com/yygml98n>

Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Sāmaññaphala Sutta and its commentary.

<https://tinyurl.com/y2e5deum>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 26, 2021 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Was Alan Watts a hypocrite?

Content:

I don't think so.

Since Watts didn't try to keep his drinking and drug-taking a secret, he wasn't a hypocrite in the old sense of the word – one who pretends to virtues he doesn't have. Like the māyāvī of the suttas.

Nor can he be called a hypocrite in its new sense (one who doesn't practise what he preaches), for he didn't preach the virtue of sobriety.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jan 26, 2021 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Judgement

Content:

If – as seems to be the case – you wish to proselytize the politico-legal views of Freemen on the Land, the Sovereign citizens movement, or some other conspiracist outfit, I suggest you take it to Dharma Wheel Engaged.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jan 27, 2021 11:44 AM

Title: Re: Was Alan Watts a hypocrite?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 28, 2021 4:51 PM

Title: Re: Soul plane

Content:

Enough already. Take your "sovereign citizen" claptrap somewhere else.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2021 2:45 PM

Title: Re: Statues

Content:

Donald Swearer, Hypostasizing the Buddha: the ritual of Buddha image consecration in Northern Thailand

<https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/73340411.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2021 2:52 PM

Title: Re: Statues

Content:

Off topic posts removed.

Those who have nothing to say in reply to the OP's query are kindly requested to stay out

of the thread. Thank you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 29, 2021 5:58 PM

Title: Re: Statues

Content:

The statues that are made in situ are most often made by teams of itinerant artisans if it's a village wat or by locally based ones if it's a town wat. They learn the trade by apprenticeship, but I don't know anything about the details of it.

Then there are also a lot of statues that are mass-produced in workshops or factories and then purchased for donation to a wat.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 30, 2021 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Can somebody provide a grammatical analysis for this sentence?

Content:

Word for word:

hetupaccayoti - 1. ROOT CONDITION.

hetū - the roots.

hetusampayuttakāṇaṃ - which are associated with roots.

dharmāṇaṃ - to the states.

taṃsamutṭhānānañca - and ... produced thereby.

rūpāṇaṃ - the matter

hetupaccayena - by root condition.

paccayo - not translated by Nārada, presumably because it would make the already rather stilted English even more stilted. If one were to translate it, then it would come just after the title:

What is called "root condition" is the condition [consisting] in roots related to the states... etc.

1. Paccayo at the end is singular because hetupaccayo at the beginning is singular.
2. Taṃ is morphologically accusative here, but not semantically so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 30, 2021 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Three and half years old Sri Lankan child talk about Dependent origination.

Content:

The figures that you then give don't really support this claim, for they are the devas'

maximum lifespan, not the average. But not every deva has enough merit to reach the maximum lifespan, just as not every human has enough to reach "a hundred years or a little over a hundred" - the human maximum for the present aeon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 31, 2021 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Three and half years old Sri Lankan child talk about Dependent origination.

Content:

... then your point would still stand. But why arbitrarily stop at 75%? In commentarial narratives about opapātika beings, some pass away on the very same day that they apparitionally arose; e.g., devas with minimal puñña, hell-beings and ghosts with minimal pāpa.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 4, 2021 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Emphasis on Suttas in Precolonial Times

Content:

This framing of the matter isn't correct. To speak of a 20th century "return to the suttas" on the part of the monks of Burma and Siam implies that there had previously been a neglect of them. But the Suttas had never been neglected; the scholar monks of the 18th and 19th centuries were expected to know them like the backs of their hands. In Burma they still are.

The radical innovation of the colonial period and its aftermath wasn't that monks returned to reading the Suttas, but rather that a small number of monks began to read the Suttas in a different way. Whereas in pre-colonial days the Suttas had always been understood through the medium of the Abhidhamma and Commentaries, in the 20th century some monks set these texts aside and began interpreting the Suttas according to their own lights and /or according to whatever insights might be provided by historical philology. At the outset this development was entirely Western-inspired.

For example, Ajahn Buddhadasa's writings on Buddhist history, Pali textual stratification and advocacy of "Suttas and nothing but the Suttas" are almost entirely derivative.

Essentially they're Thai-language paraphrases of what the ajahn had read in E.J.

Thomas's *Life of the Buddha as Legend and History* (1927) and *The History of Buddhist Thought* (1933), and B.C. Law's *History of Pali Literature* (1933).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 8, 2021 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Laws of Brahminism

Content:

<https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pitrs>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 11, 2021 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Source for the Pāli Canon in English

Content:

Is your Penguin Classics Dhammapada the old one by Juan Mascaro or the new one by Valerie Roebuck? If it's the old one then I should warn you that it's notoriously bad.

Either way, welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 12, 2021 12:16 PM

Title: Re: Where are the Buddha images and statues where he looks human and follows his own vinaya rules?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2021 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Fire Sermon: what day?

Content:

Yes, the report that it was five days after the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta is from the commentaries and chronicles: J.i.82; iv.180; Dpv.i.34; MA.i.390; AA.i.57, 84).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2021 2:49 PM

Title: Re: Fire Sermon: what day?

Content:

The canon doesn't say. The commentaries say it was after the fifth vassa after the Buddha's enlightenment.

Also, with regard to the Brasington thesis in the other thread (i.e., that Ānanda was much younger than the Buddha and only a teenager when the bhikkhunīsaṅgha was established), the commentaries say that they were actually of the same age. Brasington would no doubt retort that he doesn't accept the commentaries. But the problem then is that his own argument depends on the commentarial fixing of the date of the bhikkhunīsaṅgha's founding. Either Brasington doesn't know this, or he does know it but is just cherry-picking those commentarial passages that will support his pet theory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2021 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Fire Sermon: what day?

Content:

AN 8.51 gives no indication one way or the other as to whether Ānanda was the Buddha's attendant at the time.

Given Ananda's cousinship with the Buddha, along with his much-iterated devotion to the Buddha's person, it wouldn't be surprising to find him living in close proximity even before being appointed as attendant.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 13, 2021 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Lor Buddha the Mahavir

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 14, 2021 12:49 PM

Title: Re: What is Panca Sila?

Content:

Pahāna: abandoning.

Avītikkama: non-transgression

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 14, 2021 12:52 PM

Title: Re: What is Panca Sila?

Content:

If that's what the monk is saying then he's talking nonsense. The terms he gives are not the five precepts. They're just stock commentarial glosses on the meaning of the word sīla.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 14, 2021 1:47 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism

Content:

For a full account of sangharaji and sanghabheda
<https://tinyurl.com/dus78htd>

(Scroll down to: "Should any bhikkhu agitate for a schism in a Community in concord...).

In modern monastic practice it's virtually inconceivable that there could ever arise a schism in the proper Vinaya sense of the term. For example, monks who don't like the sort of reforms being mooted by Aussie neo-Sautrāntikas simply won't go to stay in an Aussie neo-Sautrāntika monastery. And so there's no realistic chance that two factions dwelling within a single Aussie neo-Sautrāntika *sīmā* (one a sensible traditionalist one, the other up to its eyeballs in newfangled egalitarian ideas) could fall out so badly with each other that they end up holding separate Pātimokkha recitals, etc.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Feb 14, 2021 1:56 PM
Title: Re: What is Panca Sila?
Content:
Yes and no.

Yes in the sense that each of these five ways of expounding *sīla* is exemplified in one sutta or another.

No in the sense that there's no single sutta that exemplifies all five. The collating of different ways of expounding a topic is what commentators do.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 15, 2021 12:41 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism
Content:
It wouldn't be either. You don't foment a schism by moving out of a monastery. You foment a schism by staying put and proceeding in the way described in the link that I gave earlier.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Feb 15, 2021 12:56 AM
Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism
Content:
Though the suttas warn about the drawbacks of going forth in old age, the Vinaya doesn't make old age or frailty an impediment to ordination.

Certain kinds of physical disability are treated in the Vinaya as an impediment to

ordaining, but they all fall in the class of non-absolute prohibitions, i.e., the sangha shouldn't ordain such persons and commits a minor offence by doing so, but the ordinations are nevertheless allowed to stand

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2021 7:47 AM

Title: Re: Anyone know any good books on the 18 schools of Buddhism in early times?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 15, 2021 3:34 PM

Title: Re: Aniccam, Dukkham, Viparinama Dhammam?

Content:

No. Sarath has written it wrong. It's a single word, with dhamma having an adjectival function: vipariṇāmadhammā. "Subject to change"; "of the nature to change"; "transient". Its formation is the same as that of words like jātidhamma, jarādhama, etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 16, 2021 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Vessantara Jataka

Content:

King Milinda also had some problems with this jātika. In the link below Nāgasena responds to the king's objections.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mil6.3.1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 16, 2021 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism

Content:

As far as I know, nobody is proposing to abolish certain of the Vinaya rules in order to bring the Dhammavinaya to an end.

What some are proposing is the removal of rules that they believe to have been added later rather than having been established by the Buddha.

I don't approve of any such changes.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 16, 2021 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Vessantara Jataka

Content:

The Jātaka Commentary doesn't use the Netti method. I suppose you could if you wanted to but there wouldn't be much point to it. For example, you don't need a refined hermeneutic whose aim is to distinguish which of the four noble truths a text is concerned with when you're dealing with a body of texts that never steps outside of dukkha and samudaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 16, 2021 1:02 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism

Content:

Obligations of this sort are of a localized character.

For example, if I should ever come to learn that a bhikkhu living in my vicinity had committed a weighty offence, then I'd have an obligation to act on this knowledge by notifying other bhikkhus. The Vinaya prohibits me from just turning a blind eye and staying quiet about it. But this doesn't translate into an obligation to do something about badly-behaving bhikkhus everywhere.

Similarly regarding bhikkhunīs...

The Chinese-ordained Thai bhikkhunīs living in my vicinity are doing their best to follow the Vinaya to the letter, including the eight garudhammas. As far as I know they're not contemplating any modifications to the Vinaya. Nor have they the slightest interest in the project of trying to determine what the original bhikkhunī Vinaya might have been like, based on this or that academic speculator. On the contrary, they take it as given that the Vinaya as we have it now is the Vinaya as the Buddha established it. Armed with this conviction, they make their best effort to live their lives in conformity with it.

As for what the nuns in the USA and Australia might be getting up to, I don't consider it any of my business. The superintending of them is the responsibility of those monks with whom the the nuns live in dependence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 16, 2021 6:52 PM

Title: Re: What would happen with an independant junior monk?

Content:

In Thailand they do have to.

For example, when I'm on thudong I can show up at any monastery in the country and the Thai sangha regulations will require the resident monks to accommodate me for up to three nights if I'm in good health or as long as necessary if I'm sick. The rule applies to visiting monks of all nikāyas and even to visiting Mahāyāna monks. The only exemptions are if the monastery is completely full or if the head monk of the district has issued an order declaring me persona non grata in all the monasteries under his jurisdiction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 17, 2021 3:20 PM

Title: Re: What is Ariya Upavada?

Content:

In later texts it's extended to include the denial of so-and-so's ariyan attainment, despite the attainment being genuine.

In Sri Lankan folk Buddhism it's extended farther to include any kind of slight directed against an ariyan. So it's here that it comes to mean something akin to "blasphemy" and its use often takes an accusatory form.

For example, if I were to say that the wayward monks and cult founders whose videos Sarath is constantly posting to Dhamma Wheel are a bunch of clueless jackasses, then it's likely that those who have faith in these monks will charge me with ariya-upavāda and warn me of the dire kammic consequences of my words.

The same happens in Thailand with those who voice scepticism about the claims of, say, Ajahn Chah, Ajahn Maha Bua or the late abbot of Wat Paknam. Then, over time there will grow up among the starry-eyed faithful a store of urban legends about the sorry ends that people came to because they spoke critically of these teachers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 17, 2021 3:40 PM

Title: Re: Dhamma and egalitarianism

Content:

What is "Buddhism matrix" ?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 17, 2021 3:55 PM

Title: Re: Purify citta with patience

Content:

Do you just want the verb in the infinitive: "to purify..." ?

If not –that is, if you want a proper sentence – then you'll need to specify the person (first, second or third), the number (singular or plural) and the mood (indicative, optative or imperative, i.e., purifies, should purify, purify!).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 17, 2021 9:31 PM

Title: Re: What is Ariya Upavada?

Content:

Ariya-upavāda has to do with every type of ariyan disciple.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 18, 2021 2:59 AM

Title: Re: Monasteries around Ubon Ratchathani???

Content:

I took a look at the monastery's Facebook page and saw that the abbot's name is ပုံမ, which would normally be transliterated Poom or Pum and pronounced /pûm/.

If he likes to spell it Bomb this will probably be an example of the playful romanization of names that Thais often use.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 18, 2021 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Source for the Pāli Canon in English

Content:

That may be so, but since they are English translations of Chinese translations of Sanskrit texts from a non-Theravadin canon the appropriate place to post them is the resources thread of the Early Buddhism forum.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=29&t=3167>

In the present thread, where the OP is enquiring about English translations of Pali texts, your links are off topic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 18, 2021 2:42 PM

Title: Re: Acupuncture and Vipassana

Content:

You could try consulting Dr Claudia Pillat. She's an Austrian vipassanā teacher who for two decades was in charge of pain management for cancer patients at a hospital in

Vienna. Acupuncture was part of her repertoire of treatments and she's also been known to use it on painstricken meditators during retreats.

<https://www.vipassana.at/%C3%BCber-mich/>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 18, 2021 7:41 PM
Title: Re: Vessantara Jataka
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 19, 2021 1:24 PM
Title: Re: Vessantara Jataka
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 19, 2021 1:55 PM
Title: Re: Vessantara Jataka
Content:

Funnily enough, when I was answering the OP's question about how the story might be read, I did initially propose a Kierkegaardian reading of it based on K's Fear and Trembling, an extended philosophical meditation on the Abraham and Isaac story. But it was getting a bit too complicated (too many things to explain to those not already familiar with Kierkegaard's thought) so I deleted it.

In a nutshell: Vessantara may be viewed as a knight of infinite resignation...

.

who is transitioning into a knight of faith...

.

and whose wife and children pariccāga exemplifies the teleological suspension of the ethical characteristic of the latter kind of knight...

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Feb 23, 2021 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Esoteric Theravada - Kate Croby

Content:

A recent zoom talk on the Dīgha Nikāya by Pali scholar Sarah Shaw. Like her late teacher Lance Cousins, Dr Shaw treats the "mythical" suttas of the DN as meditation texts.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 24, 2021 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Should you practice ten Paramis as a prerequisite of mediation?

Content:

In the Theravādin conception of them, the paramīs are a special kind of merit - differing from other kinds in that they are undertaken and developed for the sake of bodhi rather than samsāric sukha.

In the case of jhāna, it's merit consists in the remoteness of the citta from unwholesome states associated with the kāmaloka. Since this remoteness in all of its forms is already fully comprehended under the standard list of ten paramīs, to add a supposed jhānaparamī would be just painting legs on a snake.

For example...

The citta's remoteness from lobha, kāmacchanda, etc., comes under dāna, nekkhamma, khanti and upekkhā.

Its remoteness from dosa, byāpāda, etc., comes under khanti, mettā and upekkhā.

Its remoteness from moha and vicikicchā comes under paññā and adhiṭṭhāna.

Its remoteness from thīnamiddha comes under viriya and adhiṭṭhāna.

Its remoteness from uddhacca-kukkucca comes under sīla, khanti and sacca.

Its remoteness from doubt comes under paññā and adhiṭṭhāna.

Its remoteness from ahiri and anotappa comes under sīla and sacca.

And so the development of the ten paramīs both supports the two guardians of the world and opposes the three akusala roots and the five hindrances.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 25, 2021 10:31 AM

Title: Re: Should you practice ten Paramis as a prerequisite of mediation?

Content:

An afterthought...

For whodunnit fans, perhaps the real Mystery of the Missing Paramita is why the Mahayana's progenitors decided to exclude sacca-pāramī / satya-paramitā, the perfection of veracity, from both their sixfold and tenfold lists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 25, 2021 1:42 PM

Title: Re: How can Dependant Origination be established?

Content:

Can you define the terms "true arising" and "absolute dependent origination"?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 27, 2021 6:01 PM

Title: Re: sutta reference on dāna

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 28, 2021 11:05 AM

Title: Re: How can Dependant Origination be established?

Content:

Indeed. It seems that in this thread, as in the last one on Nagarjuna, the OP mistakes oracularity for argumentation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Feb 28, 2021 5:45 PM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

Laurence Mills, as he now calls himself, was still alive in November last year when he celebrated his 88th birthday at the nursing home in Australia where he's lived for the last few years. It's most likely that he's still alive now as there haven't yet been any death announcements or obituaries, which there surely will be when he does finally take his leave.

Regarding his status, many years ago he disrobed from being a Theravada bhikkhu in order to pursue his interest in Dzogchen. Later he was re-ordained as a novice in the Vietnamese sangha. I don't know whether he is still technically ordained or not, but all the photos from recent years show him in lay clothes.

Here's a Facebook page dedicated to him and managed by his supporters and friends.

<https://m.facebook.com/Laurence-Mills-1536075609963440/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 1, 2021 4:15 AM

Title: Re: How do the modernist hell-deniers interpret AN 3.36?

Content:

According to the commentaries the nirayapālas are vemānikapetas and Lord Yama is the vemānikapetarājā.

A vemānikapeta is a being who, owing to the ripening of mixed dark and bright kamma, gets to spend half his time in a celestial mansion (vimāna) and the other half in a peta state. The vemānikapetarājā is their chieftain.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 2, 2021 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Kāmāsavo

Content:

Cognativity doesn't suffice to "show" anything at all about a word's meaning, for where two words are etymological cognates their meanings may be...

The same: French chat and English cat.

Or similar: German Hund and English hound.

Or different: sovereign and soprano.

Or even opposite: guest and host.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 2, 2021 5:51 PM

Title: Re: Kāmāsavo

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 2, 2021 6:37 PM

Title: Re: Online Ph.D in Buddhist Studies

Content:

I suggest you post your query to H-Buddhism. Good luck.

<https://networks.h-net.org/h-buddhism>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 2, 2021 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Online Ph.D in Buddhist Studies

Content:

First you have to sign up. Have you done that yet?

<https://networks.h-net.org/user/register>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 3, 2021 2:57 PM

Title: Re: Online Ph.D in Buddhist Studies

Content:

Then I'm afraid I don't know what the problem is. There's a help desk here that might help.

<https://networks.h-net.org/help-desk>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 3, 2021 3:45 PM

Title: Ven. Pandita on the third precept

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/35658593/Sexual_Misconduct_in_Early_Buddhism_A_New_Approach_Draft_

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 3, 2021 6:24 PM

Title: Re: Ven. Pandita on the third precept

Content:

One is safe so long as hiri and ottappa are habitual states. These are the mainstay of sīla, being relatively easy to arouse. Letting go is harder and so most people can't rely upon their ability to do it on each occasion when a temptation presents itself.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 5, 2021 4:46 PM

Title: Re: Proper Understanding About Right Livelihood

Content:

If someone were to consider the reasons (as given in the commentaries) for why these five occupations are wrong livelihood, and were then to observe that these same reasons would also apply to occupations that didn't exist in the Buddha's time, and were then to include these too in wrong livelihood, then he wouldn't really be making any change to the wrong livelihood teaching. In fact he would be doing exactly what Vinaya scholars do when they apply the mahāpadesas to adjudge whether something that exists now but didn't exist in the Buddha's time should be allowable or unallowable for a bhikkhu. To make such reasoned judgements is to apply the teaching, not to change it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 5, 2021 5:03 PM

Title: Re: Is mind and chit the same?

Content:

In the Abhidhamma and its commentaries citta and mano are the same thing.

In the Suttas, the passages mentioning citta and mano are of three kinds:

1. Those where it's clear that they denote the same thing.
2. Those where it's clear that they denote different things.
3. Those where it's a point of dispute whether they denote the same thing or different things. In this third case it's usual for ābhidhammikas to hold that the two terms are the same and for suddhāntikas to hold that they're different.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 5, 2021 8:42 PM

Title: Re: Proper Understanding About Right Livelihood

Content:

I don't presently have any opinion as it's a subject I know nothing about..

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 3:05 PM

Title: Re: What to do about tipitaka.fandom.com

Content:

Spelling note:

Tipiṭaka - Three Baskets.

Tipitika - a child with three fathers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 3:19 PM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana a product of Mara?

Content:

If one is still "experiencing what is agreeable and what is disagreeable," then one is still alive

<https://suttacentral.net/iti44/en/ireland>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 3:42 PM

Title: Re: Which Theravada school is the closest to early Buddhism?

Content:

Obviously the diversity of opinion on this is one of the factors that makes it likely there'll be a diversity of answers to the OP's question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 3:50 PM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana a product of Mara?

Content:

The Suddhāvāsas, Pure Abodes, are the five Brahma realms into which anāgāmins are reborn and where they will attain arahatta.

What has this to do with the question of whether nibbāna is experienced in this life?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 5:08 PM

Title: Re: Proper Understanding About Right Livelihood

Content:

No, not on a subject that I've never researched or given any thought to.

I assume that Buddhists who are earnest about right livelihood and who are considering employment in the GMO field will already be acquainted with the arguments of both the advocates and the critics, and so will already be far better placed than I to weigh up the potential benefits and harms of such employment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 5:19 PM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana a product of Mara?

Content:

As I read it, the statement from the London Buddhist Vihara is probably contrasting the Buddhist soteriology with that of outside teachings in which the highest good is experienced only after death.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 6:45 PM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana a product of Mara?

Content:

The highest good obtains both before and after. It is experienced only before. (Unless we are using "experienced" only in the sense of "undergone", not in the sense of "felt").

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 6, 2021 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Which Theravada school is the closest to early Buddhism?

Content:

The scholar may be "modern" but he does no more than reiterate what Vasumitra (and perhaps Bhavya) say.

Here's a much more thorough article on the name by Lance Cousins...

<https://tinyurl.com/38s23xvt>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 1:34 AM

Title: Re: Which Theravada school is the closest to early Buddhism?

Content:

It works all right for me. But you will find a link to the article on this page:

<https://ocbs.org/lance-cousins/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 1:50 AM

Title: Re: Is Nibbana a product of Mara?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 9:53 AM

Title: Paul Trafford on the Fifth Precept

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/34976455/Avoiding_pam%C4%81da_An_analysis_of_the_Fifth_Precept_as_Social_Protection_in_Contemporary_Contexts_with_reference_to_the_early_Buddhist_teachings

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Source for the Pāli Canon in English

Content:

With the exception of the Dhammasaṅgani and Yamaka each of the seven books has only one English translation so far. The Dhammasaṅgani and Yamaka have two, of which the more recent ones are better (as is usually the case with translations of Pali texts).

Dhammasaṅgani

A Buddhist Manual of Psychological Ethics (C.A.F. Rhys Davids, 1900)

Dhammasaṅgani (U Kyaw Khine, 1996)

Vibhaṅga

Book of Analysis (U Thittila, 1969)

Dhātukathā

Discourse on Elements (U Nārada, 1962)

Puggalapaññatti

Designation of Human Types (B.C. Law, 1922)

Kathāvatthu

Points of Controversy (S.Z. Aung, 1915)

Yamaka

Book on Pairs (U Nārada, 1998)

Book of Pairs and its Commentary (L.S. Cousins and C.M.M. Shaw. Only first two of the three parts complete).

Paṭṭhāna

Conditional Relations (U Nārada, 1969. Only first two of three parts complete)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 1:17 PM

Title: Re: Paul Trafford on the Fifth Precept

Content:

It's paultraf. An Englishman with a Thai mother. I've never met him myself, but I knew his mother quite well as she was one of the regulars at the Burmese vihara I used to attend in the early 80's.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=1678>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Mar 7, 2021 10:18 PM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arahant if nobody gives food, shelter, and clothes?

Content:

If no humans offer him food it's possible that devas may feed him through the pores of his skin, as they once wished to do with Mahākassapa. If that doesn't happen then he'll "mindfully await his time like a hireling his wages."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 8, 2021 5:05 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arahant if nobody gives food, shelter, and clothes?

Content:

Well, they did wish to feed Mahākassapa, who was actually a great disciple (mahāsāvaka), not a chief disciple (aggasāvaka). But what the devas' general bhikkhu-feeding policies might be, I've no idea.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 8, 2021 6:05 AM

Title: Re: What will happen to an Arahant if nobody gives food, shelter, and clothes?

Content:

The two chief disciples, Sāriputta and Moggallāna, are higher. After them come the eighty great disciples.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 8, 2021 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Source for the Pāli Canon in English

Content:

That's not a translation. It's the romanised Pali.

The Dhammasangani is the one I recommended.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 9, 2021 7:32 AM

Title: Re: Discouragement and perfectionism in virtue

Content:

Kāmadā Sutta, SN 2.6

[Kamada:]

So hard it is to do, Lord,

It's so very hard to do!

[Buddha:]

But still they do what's hard to do,

Who steady themselves with virtue.

For one pursuing homelessness,

Content arrives, and with it joy.

[Kamada:]

So hard it is to get, Lord,

This content of which you speak!

[Buddha:]

But still they get what's hard to get,

Who delight in a tranquil mind.

The mind of those, both day and night,

Delights in its development.

[Kamada:]

So hard it is to tame, Lord,

This mind of which you speak!

[Buddha:]

But still they tame what's hard to tame,

Who delight in senses at peace.

Cutting through mortality's net,

The nobles, Kamada, proceed.

[Kamada:]

So hard it is to go, Lord,

On this path that gets so rough!

[Buddha:]
Still nobles, Kamada, proceed
On paths both rough and hard to take.
Those who are less than noble fall
On their heads when the path gets rough.
But for nobles the path is smooth
— For nobles smooth out what is rough!

(Olendzki tr.)

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn02/sn02.006 olen.html>

Other translations...

<https://www.dhammadwheel.com/viewtopic.php?t=21642>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 9, 2021 3:44 PM
Title: Re: Questions about monk life
Content:
They grew up and put away childish things.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 10, 2021 4:58 PM
Title: Re: Homosexuality
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 10, 2021 7:16 PM
Title: Re: Homosexuality
Content:
Nope, still not right. Let me help you out....

"The evidence consists in the fact that pandakas are not mentioned in those suttas that were believed to be early by the Taiwanese Mahayanist Yinshùn Dǎoshī, whose sutta stratification scheme happens to be the favoured one at Sutta Central. As such my argument should persuade those who accept this scheme, but not those who favour other stratification schemes, nor those who reject stratification tout court."

There!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 13, 2021 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Homosexuality

Content:

Since the Buddhist perspective is a non-theistic one, it can't be said that bodies are "designed" at all, let alone designed for one sort of sexual act but not another.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 13, 2021 5:46 PM

Title: Re: the lounge

Content:

It's technically possible to bring it back, but I don't see any good reason to do so. Do you?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 15, 2021 12:47 AM

Title: Re: Homosexuality

Content:

As far as I'm aware, the specification of certain types of sexual act (oral and anal sex, and masturbation) as being intrinsically breaches of the third householder's precept (regardless of whom one's partner might be) is a peculiarity of Tibetan Buddhism, based on late Sarvāstivādin texts. The Buddha in the suttas doesn't go into such matters at all and confines himself to listing improper partners. Likewise the later Theravādin texts.

As for homosexuals, the suttas don't specify what would be an improper partner for them, but the majority opinion among Theravada teachers is that they should try to observe analogous restraints to those of a heterosexual layperson, i.e., to be faithful to their partner and to not enter into relations with someone who's already spoken for or who's still under the guardianship of his/her family members .

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 15, 2021 1:35 PM

Title: Re: Homosexuality

Content:

I can't remember which one it is. I think the source is given in Peter Harvey's book on Buddhist ethics.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 15, 2021 5:46 PM

Title: Re: Theravāda, Anatta, and Mindstreams

Content:

For moral motivation, the recognition of the sentience of others, along with the golden rule, are deemed sufficient. Adding the concept of a supposed "sanctity of life" to the mixture would be just painting legs on a snake.

"All tremble at the rod. All fear death. Comparing others with oneself, one should neither kill nor cause to kill."

Dhammapada 129

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 17, 2021 1:04 PM

Title: Re: SuttaCentral 2021: we are live!

Content:

I can't make head or tail of the new format.

Could someone kindly tell me how I would go about finding, say, the Pali text of MN 2?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 17, 2021 5:36 PM

Title: Re: SuttaCentral 2021: we are live!

Content:

Thanks Paul and BKh.

I can't understand why everyone's enthusing about this latest version. I could find what I was looking for much more quickly and easily with the older version and quickest and most easily of all with the very first version.

Actually the first version (still surviving as legacy.suttacentral.net, but unfortunately no longer updated) is still my first port of call, simply because I have a slow connection and it loads much faster than its newfangled successors.

"Old truths, old laws, old boots, old books and old friends are the best."

(An old Polish saying)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 18, 2021 9:35 AM

Title: Re: Jesus is the Only Way?

Content:

This story is decades old and has been largely disowned by Christian missionary outfits in Asia.

<https://web.archive.org/web/20130410063245/http://www.ccgmm.org.au/index.php?g=articles&a=0036>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Source for the Pāli Canon in English

Content:

And so *ceteris paribus* we can usually (though not invariably) anticipate that a later translation will be superior to an earlier one.

To this general rule there are two exceptions: (1) those where the later translator is simply less capable than the earlier one (e.g., Walshe's DN and Horner's Milinda are inferior to the earlier ones by Thomas Rhys Davids, because the earlier translator was a lot more intelligent than Miss Horner and had a lot more years of Pali study behind him than Maurice Walshe); and (2) verse translations where the later translator has decided to prioritize the creation of good poetry over fidelity to the text's meaning (e.g., as a translation of the Suttanipāṭa E.M. Hare's Woven Cadences is far better poetry than the pioneering rendering by Fausboll, but if it's accuracy you want, then Fausboll's the man.

Or at least Fausboll would be the man if it weren't for the fact that his translation has been superseded by those of Norman, Jayawickrama and Bodhi. Why superseded? Because Fausboll, though arguably the greatest of all 19th century Western Pali scholars, only had one version of the Suttanipāṭa to translate from and it happened to be a bad one. The three later scholars had many editions to consult, as well as the commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Sutta Nipata in Russian from 1899

Content:

It's by Nikifor Ilarionovich Gerasimov from Fausboll's English translation. There's also a digital version of it:

<http://www.theravada.ru/Teaching/Canon/Suttanta/suttanipata.htm>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 2:38 AM

Title: Re: Homosexuality

Content:

I think your spell-checker has changed viriya into virus.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Which pali word is negativity ?

Content:

"Negativity" is a psychobabble term for discontent.

Who is the translator?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Which pali word is negativity ?

Content:

As for arati's meaning, though in some places its a- prefix is merely privative (i.e. mere absence of rati) this isn't common. Meanings like discontent, boredom, resentment and, in later texts, envy are more usual.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 20, 2021 10:02 PM

Title: Re: why attainments are not impermanent?

Content:

The anāgāmin has cut off the fetter of ill will. The fetter is now permanently absent in him.

This doesn't contradict the teaching that all sankhāras are impermanent, for an absence of something isn't a sankhāra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Mar 23, 2021 3:37 AM

Title: Re: sarcasm

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Mar 23, 2021 5:55 AM
Title: Re: sarcasm
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 24, 2021 11:25 AM
Title: Re: Book Study: Early Buddhist Meditation Studies (Analayo)
Content:

I suggest you first read the Mahāvagga of the Samyutta Nikāya in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation (Connected Discourses vol II), and then Soma's translation of the Satipatthāna Sutta and its commentary:

<https://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/soma/wayof.html>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 24, 2021 8:16 PM
Title: Re: Jhana in other traditions
Content:

3. The Cousins article that Gethin alludes to:

Lance S. Cousins, The Stages of Christian Mysticism and Buddhist Purification: The Interior Castle of St. Teresa of Avila and The Path of Purification of Buddhaghosa

https://www.academia.edu/4364149/The_stages_of_Christian_mysticism_and_Buddhist_purification

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 25, 2021 7:06 AM
Title: Re: Venerable Gyōnen on Japanese Śrāvakayāna
Content:

That the Dharmaguptaka school was founded by a monk of that name is corroborated in Tibetan sources. There's a translation of them in Rockhill's Life of the the Buddha and the Early History of his Order, derived from Tibetan works in the Bkash-hgyur and the Bstan-hgyur.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 25, 2021 10:24 AM

Title: Food Fights and Table Manners

Content:

https://www.academia.edu/40264143/Food_Fights_and_Table_Manners_food_bodies_and_ideology_in_the_d%C4%81na_encounter_of_Pali_Buddhism?email_work_card=view-paper

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 25, 2021 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Venerable Gyōnen on Japanese Śrāvakayāna

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 26, 2021 5:15 AM

Title: Re: Book Study: Early Buddhist Meditation Studies (Analayo)

Content:

I think sati is a beautiful cetasika.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 26, 2021 6:28 AM

Title: Re: Saḷāyatana - etymology?

Content:

The retroflexes ḍ and ḷ are phonetically similar and when occurring as the final consonant in a syllable are virtually interchangeable. Rather like the phonetically similar labials b and v when occurring as initial consonants: byāpāda vs vyāpāda.

And so it's common to find a Pali word that is spelled with one consonant in one edition of a text, but with the other in another edition. Likewise it's common to meet with words that are spelled with ḍ in Sanskrit but ḷ in Pali, or with ḷ in Sanskrit but ḍ in Pali.

When cha ('six') occurs as the initial morpheme in a compound and is followed by a morpheme beginning with a vowel, it will usually change to chaḷ-, as in chaḷabhiññā, 'six higher knowledges'. The change of cha to saḷ- is much less common. In fact I can't immediately think of any example other than saḷāyatana.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 26, 2021 9:22 AM

Title: Re: Book Study: Early Buddhist Meditation Studies (Analayo)

Content:

No. There might, however, be the illusion of being simultaneously mindful and hindrance-afflicted.

Suppose the mental continuum underwent a prolonged oscillation between hate-rooted unwholesome javana processes and wholesome javana processes in which the preceding hate-rooted cittas were the object. If the wholesome processes involved mahākusala cittas *dissociated* from knowledge, then the absence of paññā in such cittas might later lead one to misconstrue what had happened and fall into the Sarvāstivāda error of non-retrospective mindfulness of defiled states.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 26, 2021 6:33 PM

Title: Re: Do you need jhana to attain nibbana ?

Content:

I'm mystified as to why you think this sutta passage lends any support at all to your view. It seems to me to be completely neutral on the disputed question.

You may take the word 'abiding' in the passage that you've highlighted in bold as referring to the first jhāna. I take it to be the abiding in the deathless element.

You may take the words that I've highlighted in blue as referring to an action undertaken while still in the first absorption. I take it to be an action undertaken after emergence from it.

And so the passage, though amenable to both readings, isn't really probative of either of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 27, 2021 1:00 PM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

Anyone wishing to discuss jhāna in relation to Hindu methods are invited to start a new thread in Connections to other Paths.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 27, 2021 3:15 PM

Title: Re: Can we accept secular Buddhism as Buddhism?

Content:

In which academic discipline(s) is it the consensus that Buddhism needs to be

categorised as something other than a religion? And what does the consensus hold that it should be categorised as?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 27, 2021 3:59 PM

Title: Re: Do you need jhana to attain nibbana ?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Mar 27, 2021 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Ordination (pabbaja) for gays

Content:

No, it's uncommon.

Most monasteries go along with what is stated about pandakas in Buddhaghosa's Vinaya Commentary. According to this, although [what we nowadays call] "homosexuals" are a class of pandakas, they don't belong to that sub-class of pandakas who are prohibited to ordain.

Thai monasteries that prohibit the ordination of homosexuals tend to be ones where either the abbot is a traditionally raised ethnic Chinese (e.g., the late Ajahn Buddhādāsa) or where a large number of lay supporters are from the urban Chinese commercial or professional classes. Wat Dhammakaya would be an example of the latter.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Mar 29, 2021 3:13 PM

Title: Re: Trustworthiness of Early Commentaries

Content:

1. There are several questions on which a philologist qua philologist wouldn't take any position at all. That is, whatever his private convictions may be, so long as he's wearing his philologist's hat you're unlikely to find him opining on such things as supernormal powers, patisambhidās, paths and fruits.

2. Since it's an indisputable fact that the commentators had named texts available to them that are no longer extant, the "Having more ancient materials in hand..." clause ought to be "high" for all three.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 3:41 AM
Title: Re: Do you need jhana to attain nibbana ?
Content:
No. What leads you to suppose that I might think that?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 4:42 AM
Title: Re: Are the Mahāyāna "sutras" such as Shurangama Sutra real Buddha's teaching?
Content:
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja77>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 5:24 AM
Title: Re: Are the Mahāyāna "sutras" such as Shurangama Sutra real Buddha's teaching?
Content:
Yes, at the Third Council the Theravādins went quite strongly for "karmic minimalism". That is, in the dozen or so debates on whether such-&-such was caused by the ripening of past kamma, Moggalliputtatissa's answer was always no.

Is the earth caused by kamma? (Moggalli vs the Andhakas)
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv7.7>

Is sound caused by kamma? (Moggalli vs the Mahāsaṅghikas)
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv12.3>

Is everything caused by kamma? (Moggalli vs the Rājagirikas and Siddhatthikas)
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv17.3>

Can kamma make one fall away from arahantship? (Moggalli vs the Pubbaseliyas and Sammitiyas)
<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/kv8.11>

Etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 7:27 AM
Title: Re: Buddha statue with gold-rimmed spectacles
Content:
With the white skin he looks more Armand Henrion-esque.

<https://arthistoryproject.com/artists/armand-henrion/>

.

[./download/file.php?id=6502&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 4:57 PM

Title: Re: What are the actual differences between "Hard" and "Soft" jhanas?

Content:

Nobody claims that this is the purpose of jhāna-samādhi. What is claimed in the classical Theravada is that:

1. This is what authentic jhāna is like. (Though "losing all sense of mind" would need changing to "establishing an intensively focussed and non-ratiocinative state of mind").
2. The state of mind that supervenes upon emergence from it (i.e., what the Suttas describe as "concentrated, pure and bright, unblemished, free from defects, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability") is the optimal one for insight development.
3. The purpose of jhāna is to arrive at the post-jhānic state described above and while in it develop insight by attention to the features of the now-vanished jhāna factors.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Mar 31, 2021 7:46 PM

Title: Re: What are the actual differences between "Hard" and "Soft" jhanas?

Content:

I don't think any texts represent it as happening in that way.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 1, 2021 3:32 AM

Title: Re: What are the actual differences between "Hard" and "Soft" jhanas?

Content:

The point, as I see it, is that this teaching serves as a valuable diagnostic tool for distinguishing authentic jhānic cittas from certain kinds of sense-sphere cittas that readily lend themselves to being mistaken for jhāna cittas. In particular:

- Greed-rooted cittas, whose accompanying pīti and sukha are of uncommonly great strength.

- Great wholesome cittas dissociated from knowledge, whose accompanying pīti and sukha are of uncommonly great strength.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 1, 2021 4:04 PM

Title: Re: Can We Hear Sound in Jhāna?

Content:

While "elder" in English can be applied as well to things (like texts) as to persons, "thera" in Pali cannot. Only certain persons (i.e., bhikkhus of more than ten rains and arahants) can be called theras.

The theras in "Theravāda" are the "ancient teachers" (purāṇācariyā) or simply the ancients (purāṇā). These comprise the 500 arahants at the First Council, the 700 at the Second, the 1,000 at the Third and the commentary-teachers (atthakathācariyas) who preserved the works that were later to be translated by Buddhaghosa, Dhammapāla, et al.

And so the criterion for assessing whether any given exposition of the Dhamma is "more Theravāda" or "less Theravāda" is conformity to or deviation from the doctrine (vāda) preserved and propounded by the aforementioned persons. The relative antiquity of the texts preserved by these persons is quite irrelevant to carrying out such an assessment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 1, 2021 5:24 PM

Title: Re: You can hear sounds in the four jhanas, AN 10.72, and is 'Theravada' an oxymoron?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 2, 2021 3:07 AM

Title: Re: What are the actual differences between "Hard" and "Soft" jhanas?

Content:

I'm afraid I find your post unintelligible.

Your observation about contact at the five sense doors not making a jhāna doesn't seem a propos of anything that I (or anyone else) has said. In the debate about the nature of jhāna neither side claims that such contact makes a jhāna. Rather, the disagreement is about whether such contact is compatible with jhāna - whether it can occur simultaneously with jhāna. "No," say the classical Theravādins. "Yes," say some

(though not all) of the protestant Buddhist revisionists.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 2, 2021 3:17 AM

Title: Re: Can We Hear Sound in Jhāna?

Content:

I don't see how it's "nitpicking" to point out that you are applying to the word "thera" a meaning that it simply doesn't have, for your argument depends on the erroneous premise that it does have this meaning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 2, 2021 10:38 PM

Title: Re: What are the actual differences between "Hard" and "Soft" jhanas?

Content:

It's both my mother tongue and one of the languages in which I was an accredited translator for the Icelandic Foreign Ministry. I was also in charge of testing other would-be translators. Had any candidate ever proposed that "contact at the five senses means you are not in jhana" might be faithfully paraphrased as "contact does not a jhana make," I'd have failed him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 2, 2021 11:43 PM

Title: Re: if the age of the earth and other planets is less than 10,000 years old would is be compatible with buddhism?

Content:

It might if it were, but since it isn't it doesn't.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 3, 2021 12:10 AM

Title: Re: Can We Hear Sound in Jhāna?

Content:

I replied to your post in good faith.

If your intended meaning was something other than what I took it to be, then I can assure you I did not know this at all, let alone "perfectly well".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 5, 2021 11:38 AM

Title: Re: What resources exist dealing with the claim that Nibbana is the True Self?

Content:

In the Thai language the most influential work is a 450-page critique called Koranii thammakai (The Dhammakaya Case) by Phra Prayudh Payutto (Bangkok 1999).

https://archive.org/details/The_dhammakaya_case?q=%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%93%E0%B8%B5%E0%B8%A7%E0%B8%B1%E0%B8%94%E0%B8%98%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%A1%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%B2%E0%B8%A2

As far as I know there's no English translation yet, but it's been frequently quoted in English-language books, articles and doctoral theses dealing with Wat Dhammakaya.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 4:22 AM

Title: Re: My name is

Content:

In modern spoken Pali:

Kinnāmo'si?

Ahaṃ Devadatto nāma.

Kathaṃ tava sarīrapavatti?

Thuti atthu; aham'accantanirogī viharāmi.

What is your name?

My name is Devadatta.

How are you?

Thank you; I am quite well.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 4:44 AM

Title: Re: My name is

Content:

It's the creation of a handful of 20th century Sri Lankan and Burmese monks, notably Rev. A.P. Buddhadatta. It's used by Asian scholar monks of different nationalities if they have no other language in common. I've also heard that Richard Gombrich required his students to speak exclusively in Pali after they'd completed the first semester of his course.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 8:37 AM

Title: Re: My name is

Content:

For anyone interested in learning spoken Pali, Rev. Buddhadatta's Aids to Pali Conversation and Translation is available online.

https://dhamma.ru/paali/aids_to_pali_conversation.pdf

And if you want to converse about things like the English Restoration (Aṅgalikarājapaṭisaṅkharāṇa), the Labour Party (Āyāsapakka), cinematography (calacittavijjā), the enfranchisement of women (itthibhujissakaraṇa), the Episcopal Church (dhammādhikārāyatta-devāyatana), helicopters (vyomayānavisesā) and nuclear submarines (paramāṇuvīsayantodakanāvā), then you'll also need Buddhadatta's English-Pali Dictionary.

<https://archive.org/details/MahatheraEnglishPaliDictionary2>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 11:47 AM

Title: Re: My name is

Content:

It's the stock phrase when visiting a sick person. I don't think we have any record of how healthy people would make phatic enquiries after each other's health. The precise words they used have been effectively concealed by the preference for a descriptive summary, "upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi, sammodaniyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇiyaṃ vītisāretvā.." rather than direct speech.

"... having approached, he exchanged greetings with the Blessed One; having exchanged greetings of friendliness and courtesy..."

(MN 18)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 4:34 PM

Title: Re: Restlessness fetter

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 6:50 PM

Title: Re: Restlessness fetter

Content:

Worry is classed as an unwholesome mental factor but not as a fetter. Its abandoning by the non-returner is an Abhidhamma teaching. Worry can't arise in a non-returner because it arises only in a hate-rooted consciousness and non-returners no longer experience these. Also, it arises only in the aftermath of committing a sense-sphere moral transgression, but this too is not possible for a non-returner, since he has no hate and his remaining attachment is only for rūpa and arūpa existence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Sallekha

Content:

No. As I understand it, the semantic range of sallekha is about the same as that of tapas. Like tapas it can be used in a negative sense to refer to the extreme austerities of ascetics outside the Buddha's teaching, and in a positive sense to refer to the kind of asceticism the Buddha approves of.

I can't imagine why Ven. Suddhaso thought that "humility" would be an apt rendering, nor why Ven. Sujāto opted for "self-effacement". But if you raise the question at Discourse Sutta Central I'm sure the latter will be happy to explain his reasoning.

Horner's "expunging" and Bhikkhu Bodhi's "effacement" both seem fine to me, as does the Thai explanatory rendering "ธรรมเป็นเครื่องขัดเกลากิเลส", "dharma that serve as the means for the attrition of defilements".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 6, 2021 7:51 PM

Title: Re: Why monks don't say "I don't know"?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 1:14 PM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

And the fact that Ven. Aññāṅkondañña attains stream-entry at the end of the discourse seems to answer the OP's question as to whether a failure to show sufficient reverence might impede one's attainment of the fruit. The answer, as Ven. Pesala noted, is not if it's an unwitting and unintentional faux pas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 1:29 PM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

I didn't say that addressing the Buddha as 'friend' was the cause for stream-entry, only that it needn't be an impediment to attaining it, even though it's not a respectful way to address a Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 2:00 PM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

No problem.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 2:18 PM

Title: Re: Ants 🐜 (Consciousness & Self-awareness)

Content:

That was certainly the case with myrmecologists in the 19th and early 20th centuries, but I understand from a trusted zoologist friend that modern ones tend to be less doctrinaire about it. Since the answer hinges on the question of whether the semantic range of "pain" is broad enough to include non-mammalian forms of nociception (which ants do have), the dominant myrmecological tendency nowadays is to delegate the question to philosophers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 4:19 PM

Title: Re: How influential is vows in Buddhism?

Content:

No. There are two relevant Pali terms: sikkhāpada, which means a rule or clause of training, and sīla, which means something habitually practised. Neither means "vow".

The accompanying verb is samādiyati, to undertake or take upon oneself. Hence,

Pāṇātipātā veramaṇī sikkhāpadaṃ samādiyāmi.

I undertake the rule of training [consisting in] abstinence from killing.

If the above were to be paraphrased as, "I undertake the vow to abstain from killing", it would no longer be a form-equivalent translation of the Pali, but nor would the meaning

have been significantly altered as far as I can see.

In practice, translators of Pali texts tend to opt for form-equivalence here, while translators of Chinese and Tibetan Mahayana texts tend to use constructions that use the word *vow*, either as a noun or a verb. But whether the latter is intended as (1) a paraphrase, (2) a dynamic-equivalent rendering, or (3) a form-equivalent rendering of how the precept has been translated into Chinese or Tibetan, I've no idea. I did raise the question on Discourse Sutta Central a few weeks ago, but none of the resident Mahayanists seemed to know.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dynamic_and_formal_equivalence

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 5:06 PM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

I think the same considerations would apply in all cases where one person addresses another in a manner that doesn't conform to the conventional norms of respectful greeting: if it's deliberately unfriendly or disrespectful then it's unskillful. If it's not due to any "inner fault" (*dosantara*) but to something else then it's blameless, as in the case of Pilindavaccha's addressing his fellow monks as *vasalas*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 7:16 PM

Title: Re: Ants 🐜 (Consciousness & Self-awareness)

Content:

What I stated regarding the majority view among entomologists is what I was told by a zoologist friend who until his retirement was in charge of the public education department at London Zoo.

But it's not difficult to find representatives of entomological opinion in all its glorious variety...

To find entomologists who hold that insects feel no pain, try googling: insects "cannot feel pain" entomologist

For those who hold the opposite, try: insects "do feel pain" entomologist.

For those who are agnostic on the question, try: insects "feel pain" "jury is still out" entomologist

For those who hold that it's more a question for philosophy than biology, try: insects "feel pain" philosophical entomology

To reduce the quantity of tabloid clickbait and woo, limit your searches to academia.edu

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 8, 2021 9:46 PM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

Had Ven. AK persisted in using "friend" after being corrected, then presumably it would have been an act of deliberate disrespect and therefore an impediment. But suppose he had continued to use "friend" because the Buddha had not corrected him, then it wouldn't have been an impediment. In the Dhātuviṅgaṣutta and its commentary, Ven. Pukkusaṭi uses "friend" right up until the attainment of non-returning. Only then does he realise that he's been conversing with the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 9, 2021 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Ants 🐜 (Consciousness & Self-awareness)

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 9, 2021 9:58 AM

Title: Re: Share Sinhala, Burmese and Thai Resources

Content:

At the funerals of wealthy Bangkok Thais it's customary for the relatives of the deceased to sponsor the publication of a Dhamma book, copies of which will be distributed to guests attending the cremation. It's also the custom for one copy of the book to be donated to the Thammasat University library and another to the library of Wat Boworniwet, the head monastery of the Dhammayuttika Nikāya.

In recent years the monk librarians at Wat Boworniwet have been scanning their collection of funeral books and uploading them to archive.org. So far scans of 3,873 books have been uploaded.

<https://archive.org/details/thaicremationcopy>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 9, 2021 11:20 PM

Title: Re: āloko
Content:
Just cakkhum.

Dhammesu is rendered "regarding teachings" in the translation you posted.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 10, 2021 11:56 PM
Title: Re: giving beggars question
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 12:37 AM
Title: Re: Puredhamma.net Warning !!!
Content:
Actually Lal does engage with those who post to his thread. It's just that most members who do so quickly conclude that the game isn't worth the candle.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 2:07 AM
Title: Re: Who/What actually is "the created buddha" mentioned in relation to six suttas connected to Mahāsamaya Sutta?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 2:44 AM
Title: Re: Puredhamma.net Warning !!!
Content:
In the phrase saṅ-khā-ra -nirodhā viññāṇa nirodho neither the word "kamma" nor the word "vipāka" appears.

So what your complaint seems to boil down to is that neither Ven. Ānandajoti nor Ven. Sujāto have provided expansive (or explanatory) translations that would be in line with your understanding of dependent arising. This could mean either that they don't wish to provide an explanatory translation of any sort but only a form-equivalent one (one that translates only the words that are actually there), or, that their understanding of dependent arising happens to be different from yours, or both. As such, their renderings

will be at fault only if the Waharakaist interpretation of dependent arising is the correct one and all its competitors are in error. I strongly doubt that either of the two monks would accept this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 3:24 AM

Title: Re: On the Origin of the Buddhist Arthakathás

Content:

At the beginning of the Dīgha Commentary there is first the Ganthārambhakathā, the author's opening verses, then the Nidānakathā, a prose preface, and then begins the Brahmajālasuttavaṇṇanā, the commentary to the Brahmajālasutta. The account of the first three councils is given in the Nidānakathā.

In some editions of the commentary, however, the title Brahmajālasuttavaṇṇanā comes immediately after the Ganthārambhakathā, while the title Nidānakathā is missing, giving the impression that the account of the councils is part of the Brahmajālasutta commentary. Presumably Childers was working with an edition of this sort.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Will the people who call the arahants just by name, attain Nibbana?

Content:

It's a directive concerning how bhikkhus are to address each other after the Buddha's passing. As with the previous examples discussed, I think the consequences of non-compliance would depend on the speaker's knowledge and intention. For example, I doubt there would be any ill effects if a newly ordained bhikkhu addressed a senior bhikkhu by his name or as āvuso if he hadn't yet been instructed in this protocol and intended no disrespect.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 7:23 AM

Title: Re: Puredhamma.net Warning !!!

Content:

On the contrary, it has EVERYTHING to do with it.

When a translator opts for an explanatory translation, as you do, he will add extra words with the aim of making the meaning clearer than it would be if he were opting for a form-equivalent (or "word-for-word") translation. His choice of extra words will be determined by what he understands the meaning to be. His understanding of the meaning will depend on which interpretation of dependent arising he is committed to.

For example, A.P. de Zoysa, the Sinhalese translator at Sutta Central, has opted for an explanatory translation just like you. But de Zoysa's understanding is the opposite of yours: he thinks that it's විඤ්ඤා විපාක (vipāka viññāna) that ceases and so translates accordingly. The Burmese translator opts for ပဋိသန္ဓေဝိညාဏ် (rebirth-linking consciousness).

By contrast, the Thais and the European language translators have all opted for the form-equivalent rendering that you so vehemently object to: simply "consciousness".

Thai: วิญญาณ

Both English translators: consciousness

Both Dutch translators bewustzijn

German: Bewußtsein

Norwegian: bevissthet

Italian: coscienza

Spanish: conciencia

Portuguese: consciência

Both Russian translators: сознание

In short, Sutta Central offers two translations that are informed by the Mahāvihāra commentarial interpretation, a dozen or so that are compatible with just about any interpretation, but none at all that comport with or are supportive of the Waharakaist eccentricity. In your anti-Sutta Central crusade it seems you've really got your work cut out for you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 6:10 PM

Title: Re: Puredhamma.net Warning !!!

Content:

In the three-life interpretation, the consciousness that ceases is the rebirth-linking consciousness that would have heralded a future birth but which now, owing to the cessation of ignorance, will not do so. With no rebirth-linking consciousness there will be no new birth. With no new birth there will be no further phassa or vedanā.

So that's one way to reconcile the fact that consciousness is said to cease with the fact that the Buddha and arahants appear to go on cognizing and contacting and feeling.

It's not, however, the only way. The Buddhādāsa people and the Ñānavīra people, for example, each have their own very different take on what cessation of consciousness means. (Perhaps DooDoot and SDC might kindly give a brief account of what cessation of consciousness means according to these two interpreters).

So my point then is this: the Waharakaist conception of the cessation of consciousness is not the only way of explaining how it is that the Buddha cognizes and feels even

though consciousness has ceased. There are actually a plurality of cogent ways of accounting for this. That being so, your objection to the Sutta Central translation of viññāna as simply "consciousness" falls flat, for it depends on the premise that there is no way but the Waharakaist way to account for the above and therefore the only correct translation is an explanatory one that presupposes the correctness of the Waharakaist interpretation and adds extra words in support of this presupposition.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 11, 2021 7:43 PM

Title: Re: Puredhamma.net Warning !!!

Content:

I don't use the term with derision. I use it merely to distinguish your and your teacher's interpretation of Theravada Buddhism from other schools of interpretation. If you'd care to suggest some other name I shall be happy to comply with your wishes. Only don't expect me to call it Buddha Dhamma, for I'm not an adherent of it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 12, 2021 12:18 PM

Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'

Content:

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?p=37595#p37595>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 12, 2021 2:22 PM

Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'

Content:

Actually I don't dispute that this is what mettā is like. The disagreement is about whether the Mettasutta actually says this. I agree with Ajahn Thanissaro (a very rare occurrence!) that this is an incorrect reading of the mother and child simile.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 12, 2021 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Interesting Q&A in Vimuttimagga

Content:

The Visuddhimagga refers to the practitioner as a "yogāvacara" ("one who's at home in exertion") nearly as often as it refers to him as a "bhikkhu". The word first appears in the Patisambhidāmagga and by the mediaeval period it's virtually the default term for a meditator, especially in meditation manuals that stress jhāna. I suspect this was also the term used in the original Pali of the Vimuttimagga.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 10:20 AM
Title: Re: i dont like the term 'unbound'
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 10:57 AM
Title: Re: Kalama Sutta
Content:

Your questions presuppose an interpretation of the Kālāmasutta in which the entire discourse is regarded as a teaching for everyone.

However I don't take the sutta that way. Rather, I take the negative injunctions in the first half of the sutta as a counsel to undecided outsiders only. I don't think they have anything to say to one who has gone for refuge out of faith.

Quite the contrary in fact. Without anussava, paramparā, itikirāya and piṭaka-sam-padā-na there would be no transmission or learning of the teaching, and thus no possibility for sutamayā paññā. Without takka and naya there would be no development of cintāmaya paññā. Without ākāra-pari-vitak-ka or diṭṭhi-nij-jhā-nak-khan-ti or bhabbarūpatā or samaṇo no garūti (or some combination of these) there would be no preference on the part of a worldling for focusing upon the Buddha's teaching rather than something else.

I do, however, take the positive injunctions in the second half of the Kālāmasutta as a teaching for all.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 11:04 AM
Title: Re: i dont like the term 'unbound'
Content:

The consciousness mysticism certainly is, for viññānam anidassanam is not nibbāna.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 12:23 PM
Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'
Content:

Yes if we take majja to be a noun ("an intoxicating thing"). But no if we take it to be an adjective qualifying the two previous nouns ("[surā and meraya] that are intoxicating"). The commentaries acknowledge both readings as possible, without favouring one or the other.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 1:38 PM

Title: Re: Is Nirodha Samapatthi (the cessation of perception and feelings) an aspect of consciousness hence within the five ag

Content:

No. It's the human equivalent of being an impercipient deva: no cittas, no cetasikas and only one aggregate, the rūpadhammas in the rūpa-santati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 13, 2021 2:04 PM

Title: Re: Is Abhidhamma the Buddha's teaching?

Content:

The translators who translate sankhārakkhandha as "aggregate of volitional formations" do so because, (1) the suttas define this aggregate as cha cetanākāyā, "the six classes of volition" (i.e., the volitions that arise in connection with visible forms, sounds, odours, etc.) and never define it in any other way, and (2) because they dissent from the Abhidhamma's expansion of just cetanā to the fifty cetasikas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 14, 2021 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Is Nirodha Samapatthi (the cessation of perception and feelings) an aspect of consciousness hence within the five ag

Content:

See the Path of Purification, chapter XXIII sections 16-52

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/PathofPurification2011.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 14, 2021 2:51 AM

Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'

Content:

Majjapāna - intoxicating drink - is an example of majja being used as an adjective.

Majjavikkaya - trading in intoxicants - is an example of majja being used as a noun.

Majjapa is also an example of majja being used as a noun. Since the suffix -pa means "a drinker" (of any kind of beverage) and since majjapa means a drunkard, it's safe to assume that *in this compound* majja refers only to alcoholic drinks of some kind. The word doesn't, however, suffice to show that the meaning of majja *in general* is limited to alcoholic drinks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 14, 2021 4:05 AM

Title: Re: Where to Ordain --philosophy matching

Content:

It's a monastery in the tradition of the late Acharn Naeb Mahaniranonda, a laywoman who taught Abhidhamma and a form of kāyānupassanā based on contemplation of dukkha in the four postures. I don't know if she's alive, but the resident meditation teacher for many years is/was Acharn Naeb's disciple, Acharn Prani Samreungrat, also a laywoman. The monastery is in two sections, with the monks in one section practising Acharn Naeb-style meditation under Prani's guidance, and those in the other section studying Pali and Abhidhamma.

There are a few translations of articles and talks by Acharns Naeb and Prani here:

<https://www.sites.google.com/site/roundfree/texts>

The Vinaya observance in the monastery is probably the strictest in the whole of Thailand; slightly stricter than in the Ajahn Chah tradition and very much stricter than any Dhammayutt forest wat that I've seen.

To train there it will probably be necessary to know Thai, for none of the resident teachers speak English and no translators are available.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 14, 2021 8:05 PM

Title: Re: Sallatha Sutta SN 36.6 - The Arrow (or dart, thorn)

Content:

The scope of what's comprehended under the first arrow cannot be limited to kāyasamphassajā vedanā alone, for feelings of this type are only sukha or dukkha, yet the sutta's account of the first arrow speaks also of adukkhamasukhā vedanā. This suggests that the said feelings may also be cakkhusamphassajā, sotasamphassajā, ghānasamphassajā or jivhāsamphassajā (which are always neutral), and manosamphassajā, which may be somanassa, domanassa or neutral.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 15, 2021 3:03 AM

Title: Re: Do we have to learn Abhidhamma to gain Wisdom?

Content:

I haven't heard of Buddhaghosa's recommendation being carried out in Myanmar or Thailand. In the former I doubt any abbot would wish (or even dare) to prohibit the teaching of Abhidhamma, while in the latter abbots aren't in the habit of prohibiting the teaching of anything.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 15, 2021 2:41 PM

Title: Re: Nanda

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 15, 2021 6:35 PM

Title: Re: How to reconcile time spans in the canon with history

Content:

I don't myself believe that it would do any harm to take it as "only allegorical". One should note, however, that among the scholastic writers on cosmology in all Indian Buddhist schools nobody did in fact take it that way. Rather, their outlook was informed by an assumption that we might call "geographical eternal recurrence". The basic ideas can be summed up thus:

Each world-system undergoes a periodic destruction and then re-evolves.

The periodic destructions are of three kinds: by water, fire or wind, with wind being the most destructive (i.e. it destroys the greatest number of realms, leaving only the very highest heavens intact).

The human and animal realms, along with hell, the ghost world and the six sensual heavens all get completely destroyed every time.

When re-evolution takes place, everything gets reconstituted exactly as it was before, not just in broad outline but right down to the smallest details. For example, not only will each world-system invariably consist of thirty-one planes, but there will also invariably be a Vejayanta Palace, a Cittalatā grove and a Pāricchattaka tree in the Heaven of the Thirty-three; the Cittalatā grove will invariably have an asāvatī creeper growing in it that blossoms once every thousand years (so that devas can tell the time!); the Mahāniraya part of the hell realm will invariably have a Vetaraṇī caustic river running through it, into which tyrants and abortionists will be reborn; etc., etc.

Likewise with the human realm: it will invariably comprise four great continents with a Mt. Sineru in the middle; the Jambūdīpa continent will invariably be the place where Buddhas will arise; geographically Jambūdīpa will invariably have a Himalayan mountain range with 84,000 peaks, among which there'll always be a Mount Vultures' Peak; the cities will always number 20,000, 40,000, 60,000 or 84,000, among which there'll always be a Benares, a Kapilavatthu, a Sāvattihī, a Rājagaha, etc., etc.

And so from the perspective of geographical eternal recurrence, statements to the effect that the Bodhisatta was once born in Benares 60,000 kotis of kalpas ago pose no problem at all - it would simply mean Benares in one of its former "incarnations".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 15, 2021 11:00 PM

Title: Re: අටුවාවීමර්ශනය - අටුවාවන්හි නෙහලපෙන තන් අති වූයේ කෙසේ ද?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 16, 2021 8:29 AM

Title: Re: Early schools

Content:

If you want the full monty, then there's Étienne Lamotte's 870-page History of Indian Buddhism.

If that's too long for you, then there are two fairly reliable but much shorter works, both largely derivative upon Lamotte's research:

Nalinaksha Dutt, Buddhist Sects in India

Hirakawa Akira, History of Indian Buddhism: from Sakyamuni to Early Mahayana

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Nanda

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 4:38 PM

Title: Re: Sallatha Sutta SN 36.6 - The Arrow (or dart, thorn)

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha say "let forget the words, let the meaning have remained"?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 6:51 PM

Title: Re: What tradition do you follow?

Content:

Probably pīti. The Vajracchedikā is noted for its tendency to generate this in a first-time reader.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Sallatha Sutta SN 36.6 - The Arrow (or dart, thorn)

Content:

If the temperature is the same as your body's there'll be no feeling, not neutral feeling. If it goes up or down slightly the feeling is likely to be pleasant. If it goes up and down considerably the feeling will be painful. At no point is it adukkhamasukha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 17, 2021 9:44 PM

Title: Re: What tradition do you follow?

Content:

The Diamond Sutra's Sanskrit name. Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra, Diamond-cutter Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 18, 2021 2:08 PM

Title: Re: Commentary Review - How did the inconsistencies in the commentaries come about?

Content:

Also here, along with many other translated Pali commentaries and chronicles:

<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/00%20Samantapasadika%20Baharanidana%2C%20Inception%20of%20Discipline%20and%20Vinaya%20Nidana%20-%20N.A.%20Jayawickrama%20%28Sacred%20Books%20of%20the%20Buddhists%20Vol.21%29%20London-1962%20%28272p%29>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 18, 2021 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Right way to practice Brahnavihara

Content:

From the commentarial point of view sammāsamādhī is presupposed in the sutta's seventh and eighth stanzas, for unlimited pervasion of any given brahmavihāra requires jhāna.

Also, in one of the "gradual training" suttas of the Majjhima Nikāya the development of mettā as an illimitable is actually preceded by the development of jhāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 18, 2021 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Asura realm

Content:

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn56.41>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 19, 2021 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Asura realm

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 19, 2021 3:22 AM

Title: Re: Asura realm

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 19, 2021 3:36 PM

Title: Re: Abhidhamma makes things really easy regarding interpretations of Dhamma

Content:

As this isn't the Pali Forum, would you please in future supply an English translation for any Pali passages that you post. Thank you.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 19, 2021 4:45 PM

Title: Re: sati n samma sati

Content:

Not always. For example, the Buddha said that Alara and Uddaka had sati, but clearly it wasn't sammā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 19, 2021 8:59 PM

Title: Re: sati n samma sati

Content:

No. Ekaggatā is a universal cetasika and therefore in itself morally neutral. It comes to be reckoned as wholesome or unwholesome or undeclared according to the moral tone of the citta in which it arises.

That's not the case with sati, which is intrinsically beautiful and as such cannot co-exist with the unwholesome cetasikas present in, say, a greed-rooted consciousness.

The Suttas do speak of micchā-sati, but in the Abhidharma this is not identified with sati cetasika

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 20, 2021 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Asura realm

Content:

No. But some humans were figuratively compared to asuras by the Buddha. For actual asuras let me repost the link to Malalasekera's dictionary:

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/asura.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 20, 2021 5:05 PM

Title: Re: sati n samma sati

Content:

I don't think either term is applicable. The Pāsarāsisutta says that the Bodhisatta's teachers had the faculty of mindfulness (satindriya) and the rest of the five faculties. The said faculties were sufficiently well developed to make possible the attainment of the highest and second highest of the formless attainments, but not sufficiently for attainment of the ariyan path.

Since their satindriya didn't bring them to the ariyan path it doesn't count as the sammāsati of the ariyan path. But since it did bring them to the formless attainments it cannot have been something unwholesome and so couldn't have been micchāsati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 20, 2021 7:59 PM

Title: Re: sati n samma sati

Content:

The fact that an occurrence of sati doesn't bring about the ending of defilements doesn't make it micchā-sati.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 20, 2021 8:03 PM

Title: Re: sati n samma sati

Content:

No. There's no right concentration without right mindfulness.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 3:25 PM

Title: Re: Can we accept secular Buddhism as Buddhism?

Content:

Then it will most likely be Safari's in-built spelling checker that's causing the trouble. If you dislike its intrusion, it can be disabled in the Edit menu.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 3:51 PM

Title: Re: Buddhagosa Arahant hood

Content:

The actions of arahants generate no new merit, but that doesn't mean that they can't make use of their accumulated store of merit to make efficacious saccakiriyās. As, for example, in the case of Angulimāla and the woman in labour.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 6:26 PM

Title: Re: Ignorance is to be shun, rejected not dissolved or getting rid of

Content:

One wouldn't be moving away from it merely by quoting a couple of suttas. It's how one interprets them that determines whether one's understanding is aligned with that of the classical Theravada or a departure from it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Did Buddha say "All worldlings are mad"?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Anupubbikathā

Content:

No, the anupubbikathā as a whole is only ever given in uddesa or outline form. For a niddesa or detailed exposition one needs to refer to the teachings on each topic in other suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 22, 2021 11:10 PM

Title: Re: Ignorance is to be shun, rejected not dissolved or getting rid of

Content:

And do you think that your sutta quote is at odds with this? If so, how?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 23, 2021 7:24 AM

Title: Re: Did Buddha say "All worldlings are mad"?

Content:

If you mean that a knowledge of this is innate in all people just by virtue of their being human (as some theists believe), I don't think this is in line with Dhamma. In the latter, a combination of samsāric inheritance and present-life upbringing will generate a moral sense in some but not in others.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 23, 2021 8:04 AM

Title: Re: nirujjhanti and nirodhā

Content:

The form nirodhā is the noun nirodha in either the nominative plural (cessations) or the ablative singular (from cessation, because of cessation).

Phassanirodhā vedanānirodho.

"Because of cessation of contact [there is] cessation of feeling."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 23, 2021 1:23 PM

Title: Re: B. Sujato third jhāna, "The body as metaphor", more like out of context, out of his body, out of his mind

Content:

It's the result of orthographic hypercorrection. In Pali phonology there are ten aspirated stops, while in modern Sinhala there are none at all. Consequently....

Sinhalese who know English but have no indological learning will typically spell Pali words exactly as they pronounce them: budda, damma, sangga, metta, upekka, dukka, samudaya, niroda, magga, Sujato, Kapilavattu.

Indologically well-educated Sinhalese will spell them correctly: buddha, dhamma, saṅgha, mettā, upekkhā, dukkha, samudaya, nirodha, magga, Sujāto, Kapilavatthu.

Indologically semi-educated Sinhalese will tend to hypercorrect. With their smattering of indological learning they know that some Pali stops need to be written with an 'h' in English, but they often forget which ones they are and find themselves inserting an 'h' in places where it's not needed. And so in trying too hard to get things right, they end up getting things wrong: buddha, dhamma, saṅgha, metthā, upekkhā, dukkha, samudhaya, nirodha, maggha, Sujātho, Kapilavatthu.

Edit:

I should add that a number of these hypercorrections are of long standing and widely accepted (e.g., mettha for mettā and numerous Pali proper nouns). Consequently one will sometimes find them being used even by Sinhalese who know better.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 11:30 AM
Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing
Content:
Part 2 now posted.

https://politicallyincorrectdharma.blogspot.com/2021/04/on-relinquishing-my-mahathera-status_23.html

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 4:51 PM
Title: Re: Scientific experiments prove God exists
Content:
When linking to videos please include a precis of their contents. And would you also please state what connection this thread has with the Theravada. (If there isn't one then it doesn't belong on Dhamma Wheel. Try the Dharma Paths forum instead). Thank you.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 9:33 PM
Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing
Content:
I watched the above video. In it Paññbhāso relates an episode where he loses his temper with a poorly behaved Burmese monk and pushes him off a chair. He doesn't admit to inflicting any further violence upon him. He states also that this is the only occasion during his thirty years in the robes when he has been violent towards a fellow monk.

So when you say, "he recounts tales of beating up monks in Burma" and (in a later post), "he has been openly violent against Sangha elders to boot -- and he's proud of it. He makes videos about it to tell the world, do you mean to imply that there are other videos than the one you posted - videos in which Paññobhāso contradicts himself by admitting to multiple attacks on multiple monks, involving rather more serious violence than pushing them off chairs?

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 9:49 PM
Title: Re: unsolved question
Content:
I think the Wiki entry below, along with the links in it, should answer the questions.

<https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sacca-kiriya>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing

Content:

Well, I'm not actually standing up for Paññobhāso (for whom I have little interest or enthusiasm) but rather for Dhamma Wheel's terms of service, which prohibit unsubstantiated attacks. The allegation that Paññobhāso has beaten up a plurality of Burmese monks is hardly substantiated by a video in which he admits to pushing one Burmese monk off a chair.

As I'd prefer not to watch them, could I just ask, do either of your two latest videos serve to substantiate your allegation?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Apr 24, 2021 11:59 PM

Title: Re: unsolved question

Content:

Yes, they accumulate demerit by their predation, which is one of the reasons the animal realm is so hard to get out of. On the other hand, the demerit is typically less weighty than when killing is done by humans, owing to the absence of hateful deliberation beforehand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Are there mendicants among the Nagas?

Content:

This isn't at odds with the Vinaya account referred to earlier, for the grounds of the Buddha's refusal to ordain nāgas was the absence of the brahmacariyā in the animal realm, which doesn't mean the absence of dhammic virtues that fall short of a complete brahmacariyā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Are there mendicants among the Nagas?

Content:

No, it seems clear enough to me. But let me try expressing it in a different way:

This isn't at odds with the Vinaya account referred to earlier, for the Buddha's refusal to

ordain nāgas was on account of the impossibility of animals living the brahmacariyā. This doesn't, however, exclude the possibility of animals developing dhammic virtues of a lower order.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 3:49 PM

Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?

Content:

Arūpajjhānas are the Dhammasangani's term for what in the Suttas are called the four āruppas or the fifth to eighth of the vimokkhas.

Rūpajjhānas are the commentaries' term for what in the Suttas are simply called jhānas.

I don't think either term is found in the Suttas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 3:52 PM

Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?

Content:

Bhante Gunaratana is mistaken. The term first appears in the Abhidhamma Pitaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 5:21 PM

Title: Re: Behaviour of monks during sickness

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 5:44 PM

Title: Re: Can we accept secular Buddhism as Buddhism?

Content:

By this criterion the whole of Japanese Buddhism would be "not a form of Buddhism", with the possible exception of the tiny Ritsu (Vinaya) sect. Is this your view?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 6:06 PM

Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?

Content:
By whom?

In the Theravāda all three baskets of the Tipiṭaka are classed as "root text" (mūlapāli), or as we loosely translate it, "canon".

Some academic scholars may refer to the books of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka as "commentaries", but in doing so they don't mean to imply that they belong with the Atthakathā texts. Rather, they are using the word "commentary" to describe the literary genre of the Abhidhamma's contents, just as they might describe, say, the Saccavibhangasutta as a "commentary" on the Dhammacakkappavattanasutta. But when "commentary" is being used in this way, the Theravāda's in-house terms would be niddesa or veyyakarana or vibhanga.

In the case of Bhante Gunaratana, even in his academic writings he sticks to the Theravāda's nomenclature, not that of academia.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 7:26 PM
Title: Re: unsolved question
Content:

If a human eats an animal then he benefits by acquiring nutrients from it. But that doesn't mean that animals are born for that purpose. I mean it's not like in some theistic religions where it's taught that animals are given by God for the use of humans. In Buddhism the existence of animals isn't regarded as a feature in any divine plan, for the Buddha's teaching isn't theistic.

As for the saccavacana matter, see the wiki link that I posted earlier and get back to me if anything is still unclear.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Apr 25, 2021 8:30 PM
Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?
Content:

I understand saññā here to be the perception that was present in the fourth rūpajjhāna, which was of the nimitta.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 5:09 AM
Title: Re: Can we accept secular Buddhism as Buddhism?
Content:

In the case of the monastic ordination lineages of the Theravada, the Dharmaguptaka and the Mulasarvastivada, we're talking history.

In the case of Zen's supposed lineages of Indian and Chinese patriarchs, we're talking pious fiction. It seems that the said lineages were concocted in China to make Buddhism more palatable in a culture heavily steeped in ancestor worship. The historical Mahākassapa would no doubt have been very surprised to learn that he was actually the first Indian Patriarch of Ch'an Buddhism. Similarly Āśvaghoṣa is unlikely to have known that he was an Indian patriarch of the Kegon-shū. And heaven knows how Nāgārjuna managed the tricky task of being patriarch of half a dozen East Asian schools.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 5:23 AM

Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?

Content:

All samatha-bhāvanā entails the use of a preparatory sign. But when the meditator starts to make progress the details concerning nimittas will vary from one meditation subject to another; e.g., some subjects will give rise to a counterpart sign, but others to only a learning sign.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 8:33 AM

Title: Re: Jhana

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd1/en/brahmali>

So when the passage is correctly translated it doesn't contradict the traditional understanding that at this point the two monks are still sekhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 10:19 AM

Title: Re: Where is the term "rupa jhana" found in the suttas?

Content:

Last week I gave you a link for the English translation of the Visuddhimagga. The nature of the nimitta for each of the forty meditation subjects is described in it. This is way off topic in the Early Buddhism forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 2:39 PM

Title: Re: Difference between Faith and Definite Conclusion?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Apr 26, 2021 3:16 PM

Title: Re: unsolved question

Content:

Because the human digestive system, unlike that of a cow, is such that we derive considerable benefit from the nutrients in animals, limited benefit from the nutrients in cabbages, and scarcely any benefit at all from the nutrients in grass. Now if you're asking why our digestive system happens to be like this, rather than like that of a cow, then this is really a question for a biology forum. It's not a dhammic concern at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 6:20 PM

Title: Re: Gurus in Vajrayana

Content:

Well, they certainly say this, but is there any compelling evidence that they actually mean it? Have you personally known any Vajrayanists who did what they're supposed to do in this regard? Any would-be disciples who spent years evaluating a lama or lamas who spent years evaluating a would-be disciple, before either of them accepted each other? Does this ever actually happen?

Or is it (as I suspect) that all this talk about mutual evaluation is little more than a mealy-mouthed platitude that gets trotted out for the sake of damage control every time there's yet another lama-related sex abuse scandal? -

"Oh, it's a terrible tragedy how Rinpoche treated her. But you know it does sort of serve herself right, doesn't it? I mean if only she'd done what the books say and spent *at least* ten years checking the teacher out, then she wouldn't be in this mess, would she?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 6:47 PM

Title: Re: why greeds occurs

Content:

It occurs in relation to things of the kāma sphere owing to improper attention (ayoniso manasikāra) regarding the sign of the beautiful (subha-nimitta).

It occurs in relation to things of the rūpa and arūpa spheres owing to the failure to see:

"This too is bondage."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 7:52 PM
Title: Re: Jhana
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 8:04 PM
Title: Re: Jhana
Content:

Here and throughout the episode, Ven. Brahmali and Horner both agree in rendering adhigacchati as "attain".

I would like to dissent from this agreement. The verb adhigacchati has a strong sense, "to attain", and a weaker sense, "to discover", "to come to know about", "to learn of". I think that since it is only sekha-ship that they have arrived at (this is quite explicit in Moggallāna's case), it would be better to go with the weaker sense: "come to know of the deathless".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 8:19 PM
Title: Re: Jhana
Content:

I understand EBT folks are divided over whether MN 111 counts as early or not, but I don't know which side Ven. Brahmali takes.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 9:42 PM
Title: Re: Brahma Sahampati - non returner
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Apr 27, 2021 11:53 PM
Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing

Content:

Then it's a jolly good thing that we've got you here to warn us about him! I mean if there's one thing Dhamma Wheel's famous for it's our gigantic vanguard of Julius Evola fans. The forum these days seems to be positively teeming with them. I might have been in danger of becoming one myself if I hadn't learned from you that he was a fascist of all things. Phew, what a relief.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6585&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 12:36 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing

Content:

Since I'm largely in agreement with Malalasekera, I can't imagine why you wish to draw a contrast between his views and mine. The only place where we differ is that I think he somewhat overstates the extent to which the bhikkhusangha is democratically constituted.

For example, in the Vinaya procedures for the settlement of disputes the verdict of the majority is virtually the last resort, to be used only when the other (undemocratic) procedures have failed. Moreover, there are certain kinds of dispute that cannot be settled by democratic means at all. Disputes about whether something is dhamma or adhamma, vinaya or avinaya, for instance, are deemed far too momentous to be decided by a mere show of hands.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 1:17 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Pannobhasa is disrobing

Content:

As a Don Quixote fan I was giving you a nice girl guide salute as a token of thanks for the amusement your windmill-tilting has afforded me.

.

[./download/file.php?id=6586&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 6:57 AM
Title: Re: It depends what you mean by rebirth
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 4:01 PM
Title: Re: DN 2: I perform a miracle, B. Sujato claims Buddha had an impoverished language and was forced to redefine 'body' as
Content:
seems to completely miss the mark. Translating kāyena as "personally" isn't redefining anything as anything. The proper way to challenge Sujāto's translation, if that's your aim, would be to make a case for why kāyena ought not to be treated as an idiomatic expression.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 4:30 PM
Title: Re: Sal trees to be Stream-Winners ? (Sarakaani Sutta)
Content:
I understand it to be exactly what it seems: very high praise for the ability to distinguish the well-said from the ill-said. And so by implication we may take it as a strong exhortation to develop such an ability in ourselves.

Since Sarakāni had died a stream-entrant, presumably he had this ability and presumably his possession of it was potent enough that it somehow overrode the fact that he was addicted to drink.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 6:49 PM
Title: Re: Feeling not due to past kamma
Content:
The vipāka of past unwholesome kamma doesn't take the form of another person deciding to assault you. In other words, your past unwholesome kammās don't have the power to magically trigger other people to hate you and to wish to do you harm (as the Hare Krishnas and some adherents of the Mahayana believe). Within the Theravāda this point is quite uncontroversial.

The controversial issue is this...

Suppose somebody assaults you and the resulting injuries cause you much bodily pain.

Would these painful feelings be:

1. always the vipāka of past karmas?
2. never the vipāka of past karmas (i.e., the pain is due to the assault alone)?
3. sometimes the vipāka and sometimes not (and perhaps with no way of knowing for sure)?

This point is a disputed and with all disputants maintaining that the Sivakasutta is supportive of (or at least compatible with) their own view.

Theravādin ābhidhammikas (and probably ābhidhammikas of all Indian Buddhist schools) would answer that all painful bodily feelings are due to the vipāka of past kamma, though not all of them are due to past kamma alone.

The EBT folks, on the other hand, seem to be divided between those like Ñānavīra Thera who argue for #2, and those who tend to a slightly agnostic view of kamma, who usually opt for #3.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 7:08 PM

Title: Re: Asmi mana

Content:

Self view, personality view, person-pack view, embodiment view, etc., are all different ways of translating sakkāyadiṭṭhi.

"I am conceit" is nowadays the usual way that asmi-māna gets translated. "Self view" wouldn't be a good translation because māna and diṭṭhi are two distinct mental factors.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 7:48 PM

Title: Re: can i achieve nirvana when i don't believe in Reincarnation

Content:

I don't know what Ajahn Thanissaro meant by his words, but if those same words had been written by me they would mean this:

The "understanding" being described would be:

1. Paññā constituted by development (bhāvanāmayā) in the case of sotāpannas who had developed knowledge of former lives beforehand;
2. Paññā constituted by hearing and thinking (sutamayā and cintāmayā) in the case of attained-to-view sotāpannas;

3. Paññā constituted by hearing alone alone in the case of faith-liberated sotāpannas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Sal trees to be Stream-Winners ? (Sarakaani Sutta)

Content:

Why does anyone resort to hyperbole of any sort?

Chiefly in order to intensify one's utterance in such a way that it makes a more striking, and therefore more memorable, impression upon the audience.

"If learning to tell subhāsita from dubbhāsita could lead even a brainless dumb tree to enlightenment, just think what it could do for me!"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Apr 28, 2021 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Sal trees to be Stream-Winners ? (Sarakaani Sutta)

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 9:28 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

It is abstention from killing that is said to have longevity as it's vipāka, though the effect of such abstention won't be experienced until the next life. The maximum possible span of our present life was unalterably fixed at the moment of conception and cannot be lengthened by any means at all. It can, however, be shortened - by akusala acts, especially that of killing, and by poor lifestyle choices.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 1:20 PM

Title: Re: Breakoff from "Gurus in Vajrayana"

Content:

Yes, though the fortnightly Pātimokkha recital isn't a special instance, for the laity are excluded from the sīmā in all formal transactions of the Sangha, except those in which a layperson happens to be the subject of the transaction.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 3:42 PM

Title: Re: Stored food?

Content:

Not necessarily. If it's nuns or laypeople who store the food, and if they do so on their own initiative and not because bhikkhus have issued orders or dropped hints to this effect, and if the place of storage is somewhere other than the bhikkhus' rooms, and if it's the nuns or laypeople who reheat the food and offer it to the bhikkhus the next day, then the food would be allowable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Stored food?

Content:

Yes, it can be anyone except a bhikkhu or bhikkhunī.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 7:11 PM

Title: Re: Stored food?

Content:

In terms of how they live, bhikkhus are expected to observe the 227 training rules of the Pātimokkha, along with the hundreds of supplementary rules in the Khandhakas; sāmaṇeras are only required to observe the ten precepts and the 75 sekhiya dhammas (rules that govern decorum in relation to walking, sitting, eating, etc.). A man has to be at least twenty to become a bhikkhu, but to become a sāmaṇera he only needs to be old enough to earn a living by scaring crows.

In Thailand and Burma the majority of sāmaṇeras are teenagers or boys and most of them will be ordained as bhikkhus as soon as they reach the age of twenty. In Sri Lanka, on the other hand, it's not uncommon for men to choose to remain sāmaṇeras all their lives, for one reason or another.

According to the Vinaya the Buddha introduced sāmaṇera-ship when his son Rāhula wanted to go forth into the homeless life. As the Buddha had already set twenty years as the minimum age for becoming a bhikkhu and Rāhula was still under twenty, the Buddha decided to introduce a new level of monastic life involving a less onerous training than that of bhikkhus and bhikkhunīs.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Apr 29, 2021 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Difference between Faith and Definite Conclusion?

Content:

If he's a sotāpanna then his certitude about the Dhamma, along with any verbal expressions he makes of it, can't possibly be instances of idaṃsac-cā-bhi-ni-vesa, for this knot is already abandoned in him.

If he's a puthujjana Buddhist, then it may or may not be.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 30, 2021 11:52 AM

Title: Re: Uposatha days and European lunar calendar

Content:

I was told by a Thai ajahn who claims (plausibly imo) to be in regular conversation with devas that the four Regent Kings are quite aware of the fact that Buddhists in different countries and monks in different nikāyas observe the Uposatha on different days. On account of this knowledge they nowadays make their weekly survey of the human realm a three-day affair to ensure that no Uposatha-observers get omitted from the report they deliver to Sakka. If this is true, then so long as one's Uposatha observance falls within a ballpark range of the correct date it won't pass unnoticed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 30, 2021 12:38 PM

Title: Re: Difference between Faith and Definite Conclusion?

Content:

In the case of puthujjanas other than oneself I don't think one can know for sure whether or not their expressions of certitude arise from idaṃsac-cā-bhi-ni-vesa. Nor is there any need to know this, nor any value in knowing it. Idaṃsac-cā-bhi-ni-vesa in oneself is the thing to watch out for.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 30, 2021 12:49 PM

Title: Re: Difference between Faith and Definite Conclusion?

Content:

I can't immediately think of any case where a sekha disciple is said to explain something wrongly - in a manner that's directly contrary to Dhamma. It wouldn't surprise me if they sometimes teach something that's right as far as it goes but which turns out to be suboptimal or inappropriate for the person addressed, for this can happen even with asekhas; like the time Sāriputta gave a brahmin a teaching that led him to rebirth in the Brahmā world, not realising that the brahmin actually had the

potential for stream-entry.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Apr 30, 2021 1:49 PM

Title: Re: What type of Jhana meditation Buddha practiced?

Content:

In Hardy's novel, as in Gray's Elegy, the crowd is "madding" (i.e., frenzied), not "maddening".

"Far from the madding crowd's ignoble strife,
Their sober wishes never learn'd to stray;
Along the cool sequester'd vale of life
They kept the noiseless tenor of their way."

<https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/44299/elegy-written-in-a-country-churchyard>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Carana

Content:

The "seven good states" referred to are faith, a sense of shame, a regard for consequence, learning, energy, mindfulness and understanding (saddhā, hiri, ottappa, suta, viriya, sati and paññā).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 3:00 AM

Title: Re: Can these Mahayana Four dependences be used in a Theravada context?

Content:

I think that from a classical Theravāda pov, the first is correct, the second is a false dichotomy, the third is overstated and the fourth is so trivially true that it's strange the Mahayanists thought it even needed saying.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Which of these Mahayana/Vajrayana traditions are most compatible with the Palicanon and Theravada traditions?

Content:

From Etienne Lamotte's summary of the Indic sources of the catuhpratisarana I get the

impression that it was the common property of Sanskritic Buddhism in general.

https://archive.org/details/buddhisthermeneuticsdonaldlopezs.jr.mlbd_787_L/page/n9/mode/2up

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 2:25 PM

Title: Re: Carana

Content:

I would conjecture that the commentator is limiting carāṇa to those things that are indispensable to attainment of the deathless.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 4:04 PM

Title: Re: Buddha's wife (wives)?

Content:

But the texts never refer to her as "the Buddha's wife" or even "the Buddha's former wife". In Pali literature as a whole, by far the commonest designation for her is Rāhulamātā, "Rāhula's mother". Other names (or possibly epithets) are Bhaddakaccānā (in the suttas) and Yasodharā, Bimbā, Bimbādevī and Bimbāsundarī (in later texts).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 4:15 PM

Title: Re: Where to find a monastery that does not bow to statues?

Content:

In Thailand I know of only two.

One is Wat Suan Mokkh of the late Ajahn Buddhādāsa, where they bow to a giant boulder instead. (Or at least they used to in the 1980's; I don't know what their current practice is).

The other is the controversial Santi Asoke group, founded by the now-defrocked monk Phra Phothirak. They don't bow to anything.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Santi_Asoke

https://web.archive.org/web/20110708104241/http://www.bunniyom.com/insight2_the%20man%20behind%20santi%20asoke.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 4:49 PM

Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'

Content:

I think what is wrong here, or at least inadequate, is the overly narrow understanding of the term *pamāda* conveyed by the translation "carelessness".

Not that any of the other English translations (negligence, unawareness, laziness, unconscientiousness, etc.) are any better, for they all share the common defect of being like the blind men who touch only one part of the elephant.

What in Pali is called *appamāda* comprises three things: mindfulness, understanding and energy/effort (*sati*, *paññā*, *virīya*). When any of the three is weakened or destroyed, the result is *pamāda*. Whatever causes such a weakening or destruction is a *pamādaṭṭhāna*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 5:04 PM

Title: Re: 'drink and drugs that cause carelessness'

Content:

Yes, but I'm afraid I've forgotten precisely where it is. I recall that it's based on the equation of *appamāda* with the common sutta phrase "*ātāpī sampajāno satimā*" ("ardent, clearly comprehending and mindful"), with *ātāpī* identified with *kusala viriya*, *sampajāno* with *paññā* and *satimā* with *sati*.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 5:44 PM

Title: Re: Has Paramatthamañjūsā a burmese or english translation ?

Content:

Which *Paramatthamañjūsā* are you asking about? *Dhammapāla*'s *Visuddhimagga Mahāṭīkā* or *Vepullabuddhi*'s *Abhidhamma* treatise?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 1, 2021 7:43 PM

Title: Re: Which of these Mahayana/Vajrayana traditions are most compatible with the Palicanon and Theravada traditions?

Content:

As I see it, there's an unbridgeable abyss between the two traditions, for in the one tradition only a peaceable, morally-restrained, *ahimsā*-practising *samaṇa* can be accepted as an *arahant*, while in the other even a cat-murdering antinomian cutthroat can pass muster as an enlightened master.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 2, 2021 6:23 AM

Title: Re: Which of these Mahayana/Vajrayana traditions are most compatible with the Palicanon and Theravada traditions?

Content:

And when an antinomian Ch'an Buddhist darkens our doorstep, why Sir, let us lock up our cats!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 2, 2021 2:24 PM

Title: Re: What type of Jhana meditation Buddha practiced?

Content:

Why wouldn't this be technically possible?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 3, 2021 12:40 PM

Title: Re: Which of these Mahayana/Vajrayana traditions are most compatible with the Palicanon and Theravada traditions?

Content:

Rev. Roy Catchpole. 1944-2020

.

[./download/file.php?id=6612&mode=view](#)

I think I may have gone a little off topic here.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 3, 2021 4:52 PM

Title: Re: Difference between Maha Chulalongkorn Rajavidyalaya and Mahamakutarajavidyalaya editions of Tipitaka

Content:

The Mahachula and Mahāmakut Tipiṭakas are not two different editions of the Pali Tipiṭaka. Rather, they are two different Thai translations of a single edition of the Pali, namely, the Royal Siamese edition. The Mahamakut translation is twice as long as the Mahachula, for it also includes a translation of the Atthakathā.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 4, 2021 12:48 PM

Title: Re: Pali Sutta beginning with 'Moli'

Content:

There are only two: the Moliyaphagguna, mentioned above, and the Moliyasivaka...

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn36.21>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 4, 2021 12:53 PM

Title: Re: Dhammapada verse 267

Content:

It means that the acts of an arahant create neither kusala nor akusala kamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 5, 2021 7:09 AM

Title: Re: Guptaka/Gauptika

Content:

Sanskritic -pt- always becomes -tt- in Pali

Guptaka can be Guttaka or Guttiya, e.g. Dhammaguttiya for Dharmaguptaka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 5, 2021 1:53 PM

Title: Re: Fake Speech

Content:

tl;dr

"True" and "false" don't apply to most phatic speech-acts, for the contexts in which they're uttered are tacitly understood by both parties as ones in which facts are neither sought nor expected nor conveyed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 6, 2021 6:41 AM

Title: Re: Fake Speech

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 8, 2021 12:36 PM

Title: Re: The Problem With Hell

Content:

When we're sekhas and therefore free of the risk of arising in lower realms. Until then prudence is always advisable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 8, 2021 12:48 PM

Title: Re: Where exactly is "Here" ?

Content:

When the phrase is used to translate *diṭṭhadhammika* (e.g., when *jhāna* is described as "a pleasant abiding in the here and now" or when certain of the Buddha's teachings are said to be "for the sake of welfare in the here and now"), the "here" is that portion of the *okāsaloka* which is accessible to your sense-bases and the "now" is the duration of your present life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 8, 2021 5:17 PM

Title: Re: The Problem With Hell

Content:

If so, this isn't an account of where beings are mostly headed in normal times. Rather, it has to do with a very special time when normal patterns don't apply.

When they know that a world-system's destruction is imminent, *anāgāmin* and arahant devas from the *Suddhāvāsas* come down to earth in human guise precisely in order to promote the development of *jhānic* merit that will enable beings to obtain rebirth in the *Abhassara* realm or higher. Those beings who don't heed their teaching won't make it to *Abhassara* but will instead be compelled to transmigrate to a lower (i.e., sub-*Abhassara*) realm in a different world-system.

In our time, however, we don't yet have such *Suddhāvāsa* devas walking among us.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 7:33 AM

Title: Re: Persons of the Path and the Paramis

Content:

I don't think the Pali texts ever make such a connection. I suppose it might be possible to do so inferentially on the basis of suttas like AN. 9.12, where a connection is made

between the four stages and the degree of fulfillment of sīla, samādhi and paññā. The general conception, however, is that each of the stages is the outcome of development of all ten perfections.

<https://suttacentral.net/an9.12/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Black Wool in Nissaggiya Pācittiya (monastic rules entailing forfeiture and confession)

Content:

For rules contained in the two Pātimokkhas you need to look in the Bhikkhuvibhanga and Bhikkhunīvibhanga.

The Khandhakas (comprising the Mahāvagga and Cullavagga) deal with rules that lie outside the Pātimokkhas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the four (or three) dharma/dhamma seals?

Content:

It depends what you mean.

Are the four propositions that constitute the seals found in Pali sources? Yes, all four are in the suttas.

Are all four ever listed together under the name catulakkhaṇa? No.

Or under some other name? No.

Are the four propositions individually referred to as lakkaṇas? No, only the first three are.

Are they ever presented as a criterion for whether or not a teaching can be accepted as Buddhist? No, not even in commentarial sources.

Is the word lakkaṇa (= Skt. lakṣaṇa) ever glossed as a "seal". No, in Pali sources it's consistently understood to mean a "characteristic".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 9:17 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the four (or three) dharma/dhamma seals?

Content:

The General Theravada forum is okay as a place for members to query whether Mahayana teaching X has a Theravada equivalent. If the thread develops into a protracted discussion about the meaning of X then it will be moved to the Connections forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the four (or three) dharma/dhamma seals?

Content:

The first three are botched versions of Dhammapada 277-279. The fourth is "Nirvana is peace."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 10:06 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the four (or three) dharma/dhamma seals?

Content:

I've already told you.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Four_Dharma_Seals

https://encyclopediaofbuddhism.org/wiki/Four_seals

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 9, 2021 10:51 AM

Title: Re: Money with jhana

Content:

In what way have you been hindered by lack of a large bank account?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Money with jhana

Content:

Sorry, I misread the question. Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 6:29 AM

Title: Re: Is dhammawiki.com article on 'Last thought moment' correct?

Content:

I think the very fact that the Buddha did make a point of visiting the dying, or sending an arahant disciple to visit them, or, at the very least, sending them some instruction via messenger, suggests that he did regard the time of death as an especially crucial time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 6:38 AM

Title: Re: Is dhammawiki.com article on 'Last thought moment' correct?

Content:

No, there's no mention of any such thing. When the Jains were badmouthing Sīha after he transferred his allegiance from Mahāvīra to the Buddha the worst they could come up with was that he'd had an ox slaughtered to feed the Sangha. Even that charge was baseless.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/siha.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 5:45 PM

Title: Re: Is dhammawiki.com article on 'Last thought moment' correct?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 6:20 PM

Title: Re: The Problem With Hell

Content:

As Buddhism rejects the doctrine of a world creator, surely the Buddhist equivalent of God or Allah or Yahweh would be sky flowers or the sons of a barren woman or the horns of a hare.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 7:15 PM

Title: Re: What Sutta? on the enlightenment of the monks and different achievements

Content:

I can't think of one exactly like that, but try these three ...

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn12.70>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn32>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn70>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 10, 2021 7:32 PM

Title: Re: micchādhimokkho/viparitādhimokkho (Abhidhamma question)

Content:

For negative applications of the term in the suttas it would be better to look at the use of its source verb, *adhimuccati*, and its past participle *adhimutta*.

As for the noun, see its use in the chapter on *paticcasamuppāda* in the Abhidhamma's *Vibhanga* and its commentary.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 11, 2021 10:24 PM

Title: Re: The Problem With Hell

Content:

They don't create the universe or even a single world-system. The *nimmānarati devas* have the power to create things for their own amusement. The *paranimittavasavatti devas* have the power to order other devas to do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 14, 2021 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Metta Translation

Content:

Would you care to say more? Though there are certainly quite a few flawed translations of the *Mettasutta* as a whole, all the Sutta Central renderings of this particular verse seem fine to me. Even the one by the hacks at Amaravati seems passable.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 14, 2021 2:38 PM

Title: Re: White clad followers

Content:

"Householders dressed in white" (*gihī odātavasanā*; Skt. *grhī avadātavasanā*) is simply a term for householders in general, presumably based on the most commonly worn colour. All Indian religions used the term and it doesn't specify that the persons referred to belong to any particular class or caste or creed. To specify this, other words need to be added. For example:

Upāsakā gihi odātavaśanā sabrahmacārino.

"Male lay followers (of the Buddha) who are white-clad celibate householders."

Upāsakā gihi odātavaśanā kāmabhogino.

"Male lay followers (of the Buddha) who are white-clad householders enjoying pleasures of the senses [i.e., who are not celibate]."

Nigaṇṭhassa Nāṭaputtassa sāvakā gihi odātavaśanā.

"Male disciples of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta who are white-clad householders."

Gihi odātavaśanā acelakasāvakā.

"White-clad householders who are disciples of naked ascetics."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 14, 2021 9:58 PM

Title: Re: Viññātesu & Rūpesu

Content:

Contextually when rūpa and viññāta occur in the locative case, the meaning is most often "in/with regard to..."

idha diṭṭhasutamutaviññātesu, piyarūpesu hemaka;

chandarāgavinodanaṃ, nibbānapadamaccutaṃ.

"In regard to likeable forms here seen, heard, sensed, and cognized, Hemaka, the dispelling of desire and passion for them—this is the undying Nibbāna."

Hemakamāṇavapucchā, Sn. 5.9

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 14, 2021 10:16 PM

Title: Re: The word buddha

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/snp3.7/en/mills-sujato>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 15, 2021 7:06 AM

Title: Re: White clad followers

Content:

The brahmacārī vs kāmabhogī distinction has celibate vs non-celibate as its basic meaning, but then each term has other ramifications. In the case of kāmabhogī the extended meaning encompasses any sort of conduct that's at odds with renunciate

norms and values. For example, in the Vinaya any time bhikkhus are seen to be overly acquisitive or to be indulging in any kind of luxury, the stock criticism of the laity is: "Just like kāmabhogī householders!"

In the case of brahmacārī the extended meanings are several. I'll post them later today.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 16, 2021 11:11 AM

Title: Re: Transmitting wrong dhamma is slandering

Content:

In the context of AN 2.23 and similar suttas, "slandering" is just a klutzy translation by Ajahn Thanissaro, along with several others who put too much trust in the PTS dictionary and don't consult other sources.

The verb abbhācikkhati *can* mean to calumniate or accuse, but it also means to misrepresent or misreport. Unfortunately the PED gives only the first meaning. There's little doubt that in AN 2.23 "misrepresent" (as used by Bhikkhus Bodhi and Sujāto) is the intended meaning.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 16, 2021 12:22 PM

Title: Re: Digha Nikaya Commentaries

Content:

Translations of the commentaries to four of the DN Suttas are available at archive.org.

The four are the Brahmajāla, Sāmaññaphala, Mahānidāna and Sampasādaniya Suttas.

<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/01%20DN%2001%20Brahmajala%20Sutta%2C%20The%20Discourse%20All%20Embracing%20Net%20of%20Views%20-%20Bhikkhu%20Bodhi%28OCR%29%20%28372p%29>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 16, 2021 12:37 PM

Title: Re: Help with Pāli

Content:

Sabbehi me piyehi vinābhāvo ("I shall be separated from all that is dear to me") will get it down to 24 characters, unless spaces count as characters.

In that case try, Piye hi me vinābhavo (I shall be separated from what is dear to me").

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 16, 2021 5:56 PM
Title: Re: Transmitting wrong dhamma is slandering
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 16, 2021 10:19 PM
Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada
Content:
How can it include what it doesn't have?

You said the same thing six years ago, but it was wrong then and hasn't become right in the meantime.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?p=341013#p341013>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon May 17, 2021 4:26 AM
Title: Re: White clad followers
Content:
The six senses of "brahmacariyā" according to the commentaries, with examples from the Suttas...

1. Abstinence from sexual activity as an uposatha day observance.

“He undertakes the rule of training to abstain from what is not-brahmacariyā.”

2. Abstinence from sexual activity for the sake of samādhi and the path.

“Having abandoned what is not-brahmacariyā, he is one who lives the brahmacariyā (i.e., is celibate).”

3. The life of a samaṇa.

“Do you, friend, live the brahmacariyā under our Blessed One?”

“I recollect, Sāriputta, living a brahmacariyā possessing four factors.”

4. The Dhamma

“I will not attain final nibbāna, Evil One, until this brahmacariyā of mine is successful, abundant, widespread, and popular.”

“This brahmacariyā is successful and flourishing.”

5.The path

“This noble eightfold path, bhikkhu, is the brahmacariyā, that is, right view, right thought, right speech, etc.”

“But this brahmacariyā of mine, Pañcasikha, is for complete disenchantment.”

6. Marital fidelity

“We do not transgress against our wives,
and our wives do not transgress against us.
Except for them, we live the brahmacariyā.
Therefore our young ones do not die.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 18, 2021 5:32 AM

Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada

Content:

That's not so. The traditional Theravada view is that it's possible for householders to attain arahatta, but not possible for them to continue in the household life after doing so. This is corroborated by the fact that in the suttas we find several householder non-returns but no householder arahants.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 18, 2021 5:56 AM

Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada

Content:

then what matters is whether the texts deemed canonical in the Vajrayāna tradition include the Pali Tipiṭaka. The answer is no.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 18, 2021 6:30 AM

Title: Re: Paññobhasa's reflections

Content:

Not really. Sāmaṇeraship is a kind of limbo state, which in early Buddhism seems to have been occupied exclusively by juveniles who wanted to be bhikkhus but weren't yet

old enough. Since a sāmaṇera "has gone forth" (pabbajjita) he is never referred to as a householder, but since he's "not yet fully accepted" (anupasampanna) he is never referred to as sangha and doesn't participate in transactions of the sangha.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 18, 2021 12:20 PM

Title: Re: Early Buddhism and the oral tradition

Content:

<https://archive.org/details/OngWalterOralityAndLiteracy/mode/2up>

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Walter_J._Ong

<https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Orality>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue May 18, 2021 6:15 PM

Title: Re: White clad followers

Content:

Though I can't absolutely rule out such a possibility, I doubt it.

If that were the case, then I should somewhere expect to find passages where a contrast is drawn between householders dressed in white (indicating that they're disciples of somebody) and householders dressed in some other colour (indicating that they're not). But there aren't any. The only things that "dressed in white clothes" is ever contrasted with are "dressed in ochre clothes (of one gone forth)" and "dressed in soiled clothes".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 19, 2021 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Early Buddhism and the oral tradition

Content:

The text at this link should be kosher, though it only allows the book to be borrowed for an hour at a time, not downloaded.

<https://archive.org/details/oralityliteracyt00ongw>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 19, 2021 7:40 PM

Title: Re: Early Buddhism and the oral tradition

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 19, 2021 7:54 PM

Title: Re: Uttarakuru lifestyle in jambudivipa?

Content:

In Jambudīpa we have millions of homeless people who live in most respects like the humans in Uttarakuru, but with the difference that they don't usually possess the Uttarakuru humans' contentment. Actually even when Uttarakuru humans move to Jambudīpa they can only retain their contentment by bringing some of their Uttarakuru creature comforts with them. For example, when Sakka arranged for Jotiya to be married to a young maiden from Uttarakuru, the bride insisted on bringing her wish-fulfilling magic saucepan with her so that she wouldn't suffer any gastronomic hardships.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 20, 2021 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Uttarakuru lifestyle in jambudivipa?

Content:

More to the point, we can see Tibetans, Mongolians and Kashmiris, which means that they belong to Jambudīpa, the one quarter of the human realm that is visible to us, as opposed to the three quarters (Uttarakuru, Aparagoyāna and Pubbevideha) that are invisible to us

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 20, 2021 6:43 PM

Title: Re: Transliterating Lao Script Pali

Content:

Have you tried using Vinodh Rajan's Aksharamukha converter?

<https://aksharamukha.appspot.com/converter>

It's also available as an Android program.

<https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=org.cordova.quasar.aksharamukha>

If you type in "dhamma", selecting IAST for the input text and Lao for the output, then the word will be given in its popular form: ທັມມະ

But if you select Lao Pali for the output, then it will appear in its scholarly form: ທັມມ

Likewise with all the aspirates:

kha gha cha jha ṭha ḍha tha dha pha bha
khā ghā chā jhā ṭhā ḍhā thā dhā phā bhā
khi ghi chi jhi ṭhi ḍhi thi dhi phi bhi
khī ghī chī jhī ṭhī ḍhī thī dhī phī bhī
khu ghu chu jhu ṭhu ḍhu thu dhu phu bhu
khū ghū chū jhū ṭhū ḍhū thū dhū phū bhū
khe ghe che jhe ṭhe ḍhe the dhe phe bhe
kho gho cho jho ṭho ḍho tho dho pho bho

Popular

ຂະ ຄະ ຈະ ຊະ ຖະ ທະ ຜະ ພະ
ຂາ ຄາ ຈາ ຊາ ຖາ ທາ ຜາ ພາ
ຂິ ຄິ ຈິ ຊິ ຖິ ທິ ຜິ ພິ
ຂີ ຄີ ຈີ ຊີ ຖີ ທີ ຜີ ພີ
ຊຸ ຄຸ ຈຸ ຊຸ ຖຸ ທຸ ຜຸ ພຸ
ຊູ ຄູ ຈູ ຊູ ຖູ ທູ ຜູ ພູ
ເຂ ເຄ ເຈ ເຊ ເຖ ເທ ເຜ ເພ ເຜ
ໂຂ ໂຄ ໂຈ ໂຊ ໂຖ ໂທ ໂຜ ໂພ ໂພ

Scholarly

ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຖາ ຖາ ຜາ ຜາ
ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຖິ ຖິ ຜິ ຜິ
ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຖີ ຖີ ຜີ ຜີ
ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຖ ເຖ ເຜ ເຜ
ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຖ ໂຖ ໂຜ ໂຜ

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 20, 2021 7:02 PM

Title: Re: Transliterating Lao Script Pali

Content:

I forgot to mention, you also have the option of the older Lao Dam script.

ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຂ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຂາ ຖາ ຖາ ຜາ ຜາ
ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຂິ ຖິ ຖິ ຜິ ຜິ
ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຂີ ຖີ ຖີ ຜີ ຜີ
ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຊ ຖ ຖ ຜ ຜ
ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຂ ເຖ ເຖ ເຜ ເຜ
ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຂ ໂຖ ໂຖ ໂຜ ໂຜ

?? ?? ?? ?? ?? ?? ?? ?? ?? ??

??? ??? ??? ??? ??? ??? ??? ??? ???

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 21, 2021 3:19 PM

Title: Re: Stream enterer have more than 7 times rebirth !

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri May 21, 2021 7:51 PM

Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 22, 2021 5:00 AM

Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada

Content:

Only a few have survived, but many were composed that are now known about only by their names.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 22, 2021 5:40 AM

Title: Re: from Mahayana to Theravada

Content:

Yes, I meant that they don't stipulate whether they're meant for monastics or laity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 22, 2021 5:59 AM

Title: Re: Angels and Needles

Content:

AN 2.36

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 22, 2021 6:16 AM
Title: Re: Angels and Needles
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 22, 2021 10:18 AM
Title: Re: Bad Makkhali
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 22, 2021 2:02 PM
Title: Re: Torture in the Buddha's Time
Content:
"La journée sera rude." ["It's going to be a rough day."]
- Robert-François Damiens, on being sentenced to be publicly tortured to death

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Robert-Fran%C3%A7ois_Damiens

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 22, 2021 2:27 PM
Title: Re: How likely the Buddha make an error ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 22, 2021 5:35 PM
Title: Achim Beyer on Sudinna Kalandaputta
Content:
https://www.academia.edu/40301746/A_Case_for_Celibacy_The_Sudinna_Tale_in_the_P%C4%81li_Vinaya_and_Its_Interpretation

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 23, 2021 7:04 PM
Title: Re: anaj-jhāpanno: Is this a causative for dhyana jhana, or "fire burning" jhāpeti?

It's nothing to do with either of those..

If we go with the reading as it stands, then the meaning would be "not having transgressed", "blamelessly", "innocently".

As it's implausible that anajjhāpanno could mean this, I suspect that the commentator was working with a text that actually read anajjhapanno, a variant reading found in other suttas in conjunction with amucchito. But as this is a *lectio difficilior* variant, I suspect what happened is that some latterday scribe decided to hypercorrect it to its present form. (Rather than the principle of modern textualists that the more difficult reading is to be preferred (*lectio difficilior potior*) traditional Theravādin scribes seem to have tacitly favoured its opposite: *lectio facilius potior*, "the easier (i.e., less problematic) reading is to be preferred").

I'm locking this thread, since after fifteen pages and several requests to do so, the OP has neither substantiated nor attempted to substantiate the contention in the thread's title and opening post.

•

[./download/file.php?id=6643&mode=view](#)

Content:

Yes, assuming of course that my conjecture is right.

If it's wrong then I'm simply mystified as to why the commentator would gloss the term as taṇhāya anottaḥo apariyonaddho.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 26, 2021 6:38 AM

Title: Re: Confession for lay people

Content:

Confession in what sense? Do you mean that there's a lot of emphasis on the ritualistic recital of a confession formula, e.g. as the opening part of certain Mahayana pujas? Or do you mean that Mahayanists are encouraged to regularly approach a kalyanamitra to tell him all about their misdeeds, as Roman Catholics would do with their priest?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 26, 2021 6:55 AM

Title: Re: How to pronounce Theravāda

Content:

To be really pedantic, IPA is the only game in town...

[t̪h̪eːrəʋɑːd̪ə]

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 26, 2021 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Confession for lay people

Content:

The Vinaya requires that if a bhikkhu commits an offence in the daytime he should confess it before sunset; if he commits one at nighttime he should confess it before dawn. If he neglects to do so he commits the dukkata offence of concealing an offence. But if there's no bhikkhu to confess to, or if the only bhikkhu available has himself committed the very same offence (and is therefore prohibited from receiving his confession), then he can avoid a dukkata by making a mental resolve to confess as soon as he meets a suitable bhikkhu.

In modern monastic practice, the bhikkhus in strict monasteries will follow the above to the letter. In lax monasteries they will "save up" their offences until the next Uposatha day and then make general confession just before the Pātimokkha recital.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 27, 2021 3:51 PM

Title: Re: Saddhammappakāsinī

Content:

This is the link to the Chatthasangiti edition for mobile users. I don't know if it will work on computer browsers too.

<https://tipitaka.org/ios/romn/atthakatha/suttapitaka-atthakatha/khuddakanikaya-atthakatha/patisambhidamagga-atthakatha.html>

And this is from the Thai Tipiṭaka:

https://84000.org/tipitaka/read/?index_31

But it's not so easy to navigate if you can't read Thai. For each chapter in the text there are seven links. The three relevant ones are:

1. [PALI ROMAN] - gives the Patisambhidamagga chapter in question in romanised Pali, but based on the Royal Siamese edition, not the PTS.

2. AtthakathaPaliRoman - gives the commentary to the chapter in question in romanised Pali. Also based on the Siamese edition of the commentary.

3. อรรถกถา - gives the Thai translation of the commentary to the chapter in question. You might then be able to get the gist of the meaning using Google translator, but mostly you'll probably get gibberish.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 29, 2021 9:47 AM

Title: Re: Vatican urges Buddhists, Christians to a culture of care and solidarity

Content:

When you've answered Sam Vara's question, can you tell me if I'll be making a long journey over water any time soon? (I'm Gemini, if that's any help).

.

[./download/file.php?id=6648&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun May 30, 2021 11:11 PM

Title: Re: married but separated?

Content:

It depends on how separated they are.

If they've become estranged (e.g., after a quarrel) and are now living apart, but haven't yet decided what to do, then they should be regarded as still a couple. Sex with either of them would break the third precept.

Likewise if they've separated and one wants a divorce but the other doesn't and still hopes to save the marriage.

But if they've separated, have both agreed to a divorce and are just waiting for this to be legally finalized, then they are no longer classed as a couple.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 9:36 AM

Title: Re: married but separated?

Content:

Whether it's legal or not will vary from country to country. But my answer wasn't concerned with what's permitted by law. It was based on Vinaya rulings about what counts as a couple - particularly in connection with the fifth sanghādisesa rule which prohibits bhikkhus acting as matchmakers. Under this rule a bhikkhu is permitted to mediate to help an estranged couple to reconcile, but only if they haven't yet divorced. Trying to get them to reconcile when they've already divorced would count as matchmaking.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 10:14 AM

Title: Re: Feminines of adjectives

Content:

See the list of possible forms in chapter 6 of Duroiselle.

<http://www.pratyeka.org/duroiselle/>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 1:20 PM

Title: Re: Feminines of adjectives

Content:

There aren't any reliable rules for determining whether the feminine form of any given masculine noun will end in ā, ikā, akā, ī, ikinī, nī or inī, or whether one has a choice of endings (e.g., khattiyā or khattiyāni for khattiya). All that any grammar can provide is a survey of the various attested patterns, which is what chapter 6 does.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 3:59 PM

Title: Re: married but separated?

Content:

It's okay if it's Dhamma-based counsel, as opposed to, say, setting up shop as a psychotherapist. When I lived in Iceland about a third of the Icelanders who showed up on my doorstep were from Alcoholics Anonymous. They'd reached step #11 in the Twelve Step program, where one is encouraged to take up some practice of prayer or meditation, and were shopping around for advice on how to do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 5:42 PM

Title: Re: DN 31: Sigalovada Sutta — The Buddha's Advice to Sigalaka

Content:

Michel Clasquin's MA thesis on this sutta.

Early Buddhist interpersonal ethics : a study of the Singalovada Suttanta and its contemporary relevance

https://www.academia.edu/3612052/Early_Buddhist_interpersonal_ethics_a_study_of_the_Singalovada_Suttanta_and_its_contemporary_relevance

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 5:45 PM

Title: Re: Feminines of adjectives

Content:

The same goes for adjectives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 6:30 PM

Title: Re: Right view and Nibbana

Content:

The only reply is one that talks solely about your interlocutor's drug use and mental state, and contains no sutta citations at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon May 31, 2021 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Right view and Nibbana

Content:

No. Only that the removed post in no wise addresses the questions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 1, 2021 10:43 AM

Title: Re: A Manual of the Excellent Man

Content:

I don't know of any English language sources for the Ledi vs Sumangalasāmi controversies, other than the handful discussed in Bhikkhu Bodhi's CMA.

The Pali of Ledi's Paramatthadīpanī is available online from the Goenka folks and on their Tipiṭaka CD.

The phrases to look for are na yujjati or na yuttam ("this is untenable") and na sundaram ("this is inelegant"). The former phrase is used when Ledi is challenging the substance of Sumangalasāmi's interpretation; the latter is used when he agrees with the substance but thinks the author has used clumsy, ambiguous or misleading phrasing.

Edit:

I forgot to mention that Sumangalasāmi's work was translated by R.P. Wijeratne and then put into publishable form by Ven. Pesala and Rupert Gethin. It's available from the PTS as Summary of the Topics of Abhidhamma.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 3, 2021 4:29 PM

Title: Re: Work hard play hard

Content:

It exists only in the sense that a small number of individual Sri Lankans have converted to Zen, Vajrayana, Soka Gakkai, etc. But not in the sense that the Vetulyavāda of ancient times has survived unbroken to the present day. The heresy was extirpated centuries ago.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 3, 2021 5:13 PM

Title: Re: Jesus is the Only Way?

Content:

The two kinds of wrong view are asymmetrical. Holding to annihilationism is

unavoidably an unwholesome mind-door kamma, for one can't espouse it without also espousing kammic inefficacy. Whether the same is true of eternalism depends on what it's conjoined with. For example, eternalism + theistic determinism is just as bad as annihilationism, but eternalism + the doctrine of ownership of kamma (or a doxastic commitment that's functionally analogous to this) is no impediment to merit accumulation and a bright rebirth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 3, 2021 6:50 PM

Title: Re: The Vinaya as a detailed legal system

Content:

Here there's a rather lengthy thread on the subject, with the American monk Ven. Subhūti arguing for the correctness of the popular modern Burmese understanding of the third precept and me arguing that this understanding is a deviation from how the precept was understood in ancient times. My contributions start on the second page.

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=42&t=32761>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 3, 2021 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Criminal Background

Content:

No, it's one of the many impediments that aren't asked about in the ordination interrogation. What you're referring to is the requirement that one not be required for military service.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 4, 2021 5:19 PM

Title: Re: Theravāda and Suttavādins

Content:

We know from Buddhaghosa's introduction to the Atthasālinī that there were individual bhikkhus who didn't admit the Abhidhamma Piṭaka to be buddhavacana. Though he doesn't identify them, it seems likely that he is talking about bhikkhus of Theravada Vinaya lineage, for it is specifically the Theravada Abhidhamma Piṭaka that they were rejecting. I can think of three possible reasons why they might not have wished to form a breakaway school:

1. There may have been too few of them.
2. It may have been politically inexpedient. That is, the Mahāvihāra could have called upon royal power to suppress them, just as it did with the Abhayagiri and Jetavana Viharas.

3. They had other fish to fry. That is, their desire to just get on with their own practice may have weighed more heavily with them than any missionary zeal to persuade Ceylonese Buddhists to revert to what they imagined to have been the proto-Canon.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 5, 2021 8:22 PM

Title: Re: The Vinaya as a detailed legal system

Content:

Sure, nobody in the thread is disputing that. The disagreement is about what it means to be protected by one's parents and at what point a girl or woman ceases to be so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 6, 2021 1:37 AM

Title: Re: is anyone not scared of death?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 6, 2021 5:59 PM

Title: Re: The Pali term 'parinibbāyī' ???

Content:

Note that I've taken the adverb tattha as being used in its temporal sense rather than its locational or spatial ones: "in due course", "eventually", "sooner or later".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 12:54 AM

Title: Re: The Pali term 'parinibbāyī' ???

Content:

I've never heard anyone claim that parikkhayā always refers to full extinguishment.

If only the destruction of the first three or first five fetters is stated, then it's surely self-evident that it is only stream-entry or non-returning that is referred to, not full extinguishment.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 11:04 AM

Title: Re: The Theravada Abhidhamma with Bhikkhu Bodhi

Content:

Multiple posts removed that violate the terms of service for the Abhidhamma and Classical Theravada sub-forums.

Note that for discussion purposes the Abhidhamma Piṭaka and Pali commentaries are treated as authoritative in these two sub-forums. When replying to a post here, if your intention is to make the case that the Abhidhamma or commentaries are in error (e.g., that they conflict with so-and-so's conception of what early Buddhism taught), then copy the post you're replying to and paste it into a new thread in some other forum, e.g., General Theravada or Early Buddhism.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 11:13 AM

Title: Re: The Pali term 'parinibbāyī' ???

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 3:06 PM

Title: Re: Which heavens may one attain stream entry?

Content:

In theory in all of them except the realm of impercipient beings and the four formless realms. I suppose we could also add the five Pure Abodes since you need to be already a non-returner to get born in one.

In practice, however, it's noticeable that attainment narratives get fewer and fewer the higher you go. In fact accounts are rare for any realm higher than Tavatimsa. Whether this because attainment happens less often in the higher heavens or merely because narratives of any sort about these places are rather thin on the ground, I've no idea.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 4:53 PM

Title: Re: MN 125 in pictures, vism. and ajahn brahm "real jhana"

Content:

This thread has to do with the controversy about what jhāna is. The controversy about whether jhānic development is necessary is off topic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 5:29 PM

Title: Re: Personal experience of the heavenly realms

Content:

Split from the thread "Which heavens may one attain stream entry?" in the Beginners Forum.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 5:42 PM

Title: Re: MN 125 in pictures, vism. and ajahn brahm "real jhana"

Content:

If Frank's thread doesn't interest you, then stay out of it. Or, if you wish to argue for the uselessness of this kind of discussion, then start a thread of your own.

.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 8, 2021 6:33 PM

Title: Re: Why are ancient statues of Buddha depicted as sitting in full-lotus?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 2:02 AM

Title: Re: Which heavens may one attain stream entry?

Content:

Nothing is said in the texts about stream-entry being easier to attain in one heaven rather than another. All we have to go by are the attainment narratives and in most of these the attainers are actually terrestrial devas. But as I remarked earlier, nothing much can be concluded from this because of the paucity of any sort of narratives involving the higher devas and brahmās.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 5:30 AM

Title: Re: Why are ancient statues of Buddha depicted as sitting in full-lotus?

Content:

Art historians who posit an Hellenic influence on early Buddha statues are not referring to their postures or mudras. What they're referring to is, firstly, the very idea of making statues of one's heroes, and secondly, to the statues' facial features.

Having said that, cross-legged Greek statues do exist but they're not common. The

Greek sculptors preferred to have seated subjects sitting on chairs or thrones.

Here's one example, a cross-legged anonymous philosopher at the Acropolis.

[./download/file.php?id=6679&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 6:23 AM

Title: Re: Atman in Buddhism? (Nikaya)

Content:

See the posts of member ancientbuddhism in the "Anattā thread".

<https://www.dhammadownload.com/viewtopic.php?f=24&t=24760>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 6:45 AM

Title: Re: What is the kamma result of a monk who eats after noon time?

Content:

In between these two extremes there's the bhikkhu who is respectful of much of the bhikkhu's training but not of this particular rule. In commentarial narratives it seems to be common for such to be reborn as pretas of the kind encountered by Ven.

Mahamoggallāna in the Vinaya's account of the fourth pārājika rule.

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pj4/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 12:00 PM

Title: Re: Why are ancient statues of Buddha depicted as sitting in full-lotus?

Content:

Archaeology and historiography.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 9, 2021 1:35 PM

Title: Re: 108 recitations of Itipiso a day

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 10, 2021 4:26 PM

Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?

Content:

The differences between different regional recensions of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka are much slighter than those in the different recensions of the other two Piṭakas. Just randomly select any page from any of the seven books and you'll see for yourself that the variant readings are very seldom anything but the same word spelled different ways.

For example, these are the 23 variants in the Kāmāvacarakusala section of the Dhammasaṅgaṇī's Cittuppādaṅga. Of these 20 are just variant spellings, two are obvious misspellings, and one is a different but synonymous word.

vīriyindriyaṃ → viriyindriyaṃ (bj, sya-all, pts-vp-pli1)

vīriyabalaṃ → viriyabalaṃ (bj, sya-all, pts-vp-pli1)

kāyapassaddhi → kāyappassaddhi (sya-all)

cittapassaddhi → cittappassaddhi (sya-all)

kāyujukatā → kāyujjukatā (bj, pts-vp-pli1, mr)

cittujukatā → cittujjukatā (bj, pts-vp-pli1, mr)

cetayitattaṃ → sañcetayitattaṃ (sya-all); samcetayitattaṃ (pts-vp-pli1)

anusandhānatā → anusandhanataṃ (si, mr); anusandhanatā (sya-all, pts-vp-pli1)

vīriyārambho → viriyārambho (bj, sya-all, pts-vp-pli1)

ussoḷhī → ussoḷhi (bj, pts-vp-pli1)

vīriyabalaṃ → viriyabalaṃ (bj, sya-all, pts-vp-pli1)

asammussanatā → apammussanatā (bj); asammusanatā (sya-all)

bhūrī → bhūri (si)

iriyānā → irīyanā (bj)

hirī → hiri (bj, pts-vp-pli1)

paṭipassaddhi → paṭippassaddhi (bj, sya-all)

paṭipassambhanā → paṭippassambhanā (bj, sya-all)

paṭipassambhitattam → paṭippassambhitattam (bj, sya-all)

adussanā adussitattam → adūsanā adūsitattam (sya-all)

abyāpajjo → avyāpajjho (bj); abyāpajjho (cck); avyāpajjo (pts-vp-pli1)

ujukatā → ujjukatā (bj, pts-vp-pli1)

cittujukatā → cittujjukatā (bj, pts-vp-pli1)

ṭhapetvā → thapetvā (mr)

<https://suttacentral.net/ds2.1.1/pli/ms>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 11, 2021 10:49 AM

Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?

Content:

The main sources for the Theravādin emic view are the introductions to the Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Kathāvatthu commentaries. The said view is that six of the seven books never changed - they're the same now as they were when recited at the First Council. The exception is the Kathāvatthu, which at the First Council was recited only in summary form (i.e., a prediction of what heresies would arise and outline accounts of how to refute them) and assumed it's current expanded form only at the Third Council when the debates had taken place and the heresies had been refuted.

The etic views (i.e., those of academic scholars and monks influenced by them) are many and various, but afaik nobody has proposed that the Abhidhamma Piṭaka underwent any further revision after the Third Council, with the exception of the Kathāvatthu which is held to consist of an early stratum of pre-Ashokan heresies and a later stratum of (mainly proto-Mahayana) heresies that arose later. The Abhidhamma Piṭaka as a whole is held to be chronologically stratified (e.g., the Dhammasaṅgaṇī and Vibhanga are early, the Yamaka and Patthāna late), but afaik nobody posits any stratification within any of the Piṭaka's books, with the exception of the Kathāvatthu.

Three influential sources of etic opinion are

Fumimaro Watanabe, Philosophy and Its Development in the Nikāyas and Abhidhamma

David Kalupahana, A History of Buddhist Philosophy: Continuities and Discontinuities

Erich Frauwallner, Studies in Abhidharma Literature and the Origins of Buddhist

Philosophical Systems

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 11, 2021 3:27 PM
Title: Re: Buddhism and Capitalism.
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 11, 2021 6:04 PM
Title: Re: Why buddhist monks being called samana ?
Content:
In all three cases the term denotes ariyan ascetics.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 12, 2021 1:48 PM
Title: Re: Why buddhist monks being called samana ?
Content:
In my opinion it would be better not to. Listeners may think that they are using it in its valorized sense and claiming ariyan attainment.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 12, 2021 4:34 PM
Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?
Content:
In the Atthasālinī's account (see the link below) it was taught to devas who'd gathered from ten thousand world-systems, so hardly secretive. Ven. Sāriputta was taught an abridged version and transmitted this to his five hundred pupils. Ven. Ānanda recited it at the First Council, but whether he learned it from Ven. Sāriputta or from one of his pupils isn't stated in the Atthasālinī.

<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.92596/page/n25/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 12, 2021 5:39 PM
Title: Re: Is it compulsory to accept Abhidhamma as a part of doctrine to be considered as Theravada?

Content:
Just a list of synonyms meaning "subjective".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jun 12, 2021 11:54 PM
Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?
Content:
In the case of the Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma Piṭaka, each of its seven books is attributed to some named ācariya. I don't know what the other schools claimed regarding theirs.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 13, 2021 3:25 PM
Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?
Content:
Yes, the account has the Buddha descending each day to teach the Abhidhamma to Ven. Sāriputta in a form that's digestible to humans (who unlike devas can't sit still for three months). While doing this he leaves behind a mind-made replica of himself that continues teaching the devas.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 13, 2021 7:31 PM
Title: Re: Pali Resources
Content:
Thanks. I've put asterisks under all the dead links so that if anyone notifies me of updated links to the same resources I can add them.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 14, 2021 5:27 AM
Title: Re: How many versions of canonical Theravada Abhidhamma exist?
Content:
Considering the thread's current trajectory, I believe it belongs more properly in the Early Buddhism than in the Abhidhamma sub-forum. I've moved it accordingly.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 14, 2021 8:31 PM
Title: Re: Can a monk tell his followers that he is not fully enlightened?

Content:

I've sometimes done this myself, but usually I just reply that laypeople should never ask a bhikkhu about his attainments, for such a question is in effect an invitation for the bhikkhu to commit a Vinaya offence.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 14, 2021 9:21 PM

Title: Re: Pali Resources

Content:

Chris's resources file now updated, with thanks to Assaji for the new links.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 11:33 AM

Title: Re: Can a monk tell his followers that he is not fully enlightened?

Content:

Not arahantship. The bhikkhu attained jhāna but without realizing that it was jhāna he had attained. Later, presumably for the sake of name and fame, he boasted that he had attained jhāna even though he believed that he hadn't. Even though what he was saying was factual he was adjudged pārājika because his intention was to deceive.

The Vinaya has no analogous cases of bhikkhus arriving at ariyan attainments but not realising it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 12:19 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk tell his followers that he is not fully enlightened?

Content:

In Ven. Jayasara's post Bhante G. wasn't asked if he was a sotāpanna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 12:45 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk tell his followers that he is not fully enlightened?

Content:

The attainment of all the ariyan paths and fruits are insight knowledges. As such, there would be no way that a sotāpanna's arrival at sakadāgāmitā and the resultant attenuation of kāmarāga and byāpāda could be mistaken for an attenuation of these due to some non-ariyan cause, like a decline in the body's testosterone production in old age, a regular abiding in jhāna or whatever.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 4:18 PM

Title: Re: Translating "satipaṭṭhānānaṃ" in dative case ???

Content:

Would you be referring to Bhante Sujāto's theory to this effect? If so, I would note that even he doesn't allege the entire suttas to be fraudulent, but merely that in their proto-form they were much shorter, with dhammānupassanā being limited to just the five hindrances and seven enlightenment factors.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 4:59 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk tell his followers that he is not fully enlightened?

Content:

No, at the lower levels of insight one is still a worldling, albeit a kalyāna one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 8:10 PM

Title: Re: Unable to open a post

Content:

I don't know why my post initially failed to appear, so I reposted it and now it does. This is the first time this has happened to me.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 15, 2021 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Tasawwuf and Theravada

Content:

Posts split from the topic "Jesus is the only way?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 17, 2021 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Translating "satipaṭṭhānānaṃ" in dative case ???

Content:

I was referring to his book A History of Mindfulness in which DN 22 is referred to as the "Pitldown Sutta". Nearly everyone I encounter who takes a dim view of this sutta does so under the influence of this book and so I thought this might be the case with you. Since it isn't, the point of my post was rather beside the point.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 17, 2021 8:35 PM

Title: Re: anattā”ti and natthattā”ti

Content:

The constructions "There is no + substantive" and "There isn't a + substantive" differ only in phrasing, not in meaning.

There is no elephant in the room = There isn't an elephant in the room.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 18, 2021 10:21 AM

Title: Re: Focusing like an Owl

Content:

I suppose one could assume that, but I don't think it would be a reasonable assumption at all.

Firstly the meditating bhikkhus are described as "possessed of moral habit and of a lovely nature" (sīlavantā kalyāṇadhammā) - words that strongly imply that they were doing things right and weakly imply that they were ariyasāvakas.

Secondly the words "He meditates, premeditates, out-meditates, and mismeditates ... just as a jackal on a river-bank waiting for fish," are the tendentious judgment of hostile Māra-inspired householders. Why would anyone want to assume that they'd got things right?

Suppose I said to you, "I saw some Muslims praying in the marketplace today. They were baying and bawling, squealing and squalling, yowling and yawping, ululating and caterwauling like banshees, and annoying the heck out of everybody with their uvular consonants." Which would be the more reasonable assumption:

"Dhammānando's report is that of a hostile witness who has an aversion to Islam or to praying in public places or to the sound of the Arabic language."

Or:

"The Muslims weren't praying properly?"

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 18, 2021 1:59 PM

Title: Re: Focusing like an Owl

Content:

Thanks for the clarification.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jun 18, 2021 2:06 PM
Title: Re: Sam Vara returns as a moderator
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jun 22, 2021 7:34 PM
Title: Re: 108 recitations of Itipiso a day
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 23, 2021 10:25 AM
Title: Re: Question metta
Content:
<https://suttacentral.net/an3.68/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 23, 2021 12:43 PM
Title: Re: The Dhamma is simple (if we want it to be)
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 23, 2021 1:17 PM
Title: Re: Did Buddha prohibit monks from criticises another monk on the basis of Vinaya or the Dhamma teaching?
Content:
<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pc64/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Jun 23, 2021 1:42 PM

Title: Re: Overlord and Mara

Content:

As for the meanings of their names, Abhibhū literally means "One Become Superior" and Pajāpati literally means "Lord of the Generation".

I think "Overlord" would be a defensible rendering for either name (if one is going to insist on translating them), though if the text contains both then it would be better to give them different names.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 24, 2021 11:43 AM

Title: Re: Question metta

Content:

Only if you use some construction that serves the same purpose. For example, you can abbreviate a well-known list of items by just naming the first item and then adding -ādi to it. It literally means "beginning with ..." but performs the same function as "et cetera".

https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=%C4%81di&searchhws=yes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 24, 2021 12:36 PM

Title: Re: Usefulness of Learning Prosody

Content:

In traditional monastic education the study of chandalakṣaṇa serves two main purposes.

The first is to make a monk competent to decide between variant readings in Pali verse works by considering which of the variants best fits the metre, or even proposing tentative readings that are not found in any extant editions at all. This then allows him to do the kind of work that's been done by the likes of K.R. Norman and Ven. Ānandajoti, namely, producing high quality critical editions of works like the Dhammapada and Suttanipāta, and translations based on the same.

The second is to enable the monk to compose versified works of his own.

If you email Ānandajoti (or contact him on Facebook) he may be able to offer you some further reasons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jun 24, 2021 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Overlord and Mara

Content:

The word can be both a proper noun, meaning Māra the Malign, and a common noun, meaning the members of Māra's host.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jun 25, 2021 2:28 PM

Title: Re: Are all ariya-sacca paramattha sacca?

Content:

All four truths are treated in the Abhidhamma as paramattha dhammas.

All forms of dukkha are ultimately comprehended under the five khandhas. The truth of the origin of dukkha, along with each factor of the eightfold path, are identified with particular mental factors; and Nibbāna is the unconditioned element.

Right speech, action and livelihood consist in the arising of abstinence mental factors (virati cetasika).

The five hindrances likewise comprise seven mental factors when they are described abhidhammically.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 1:18 PM

Title: Re: Usefulness of Learning Prosody

Content:

I think it's rare nowadays for monks to compose an entire work in Pali verse, but it's very common for Asian scholar monks to compose a Pali verse preface and colophon to any works that they intend for publication. If it's a critical edition of an ancient text then it's virtually obligatory to do so in order to assure the reader that you're qualified for the task.

Also, in Thailand if you're the resident poet monk in one of the royal monasteries, then you'll occasionally be called upon to compose funerary verse, epithalamia and other kinds of pièce d'occasion connected with the doings of the royal family and the Sangharāja.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 2:06 PM

Title: Re: Suttas which say we should oppose people who say bad things or distort dhamma?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 2:12 PM

Title: Re: What remains when the nidanas cease?

Content:

No, they are the twelve items that make up the commonest way of describing dependent arising: ignorance, formations, consciousness ... birth, aging and death. The six sense bases are just one nidāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 3:14 PM

Title: Re: in Abhidhamma book 2 Vibhanga, what does it mean to be derived from suttas versus derived from Abhidhamma?

Content:

No.

To understand the arrangement in the Vibhanga and the distinction between suttabhājanīya and abhidhammabhājanīya I recommend you download U Thittila's translation and read R.E. Iggledon's lengthy introduction, esp. pages xxix onwards.

https://archive.org/details/vibhanga_202009

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 4:13 PM

Title: Re: 10th Century Theravada

Content:

Robert Buswell doesn't actually state any of the things that your Wikipedia entry attributes to him. He was merely the editor of the Encyclopedia of Buddhism but the relevant entry was composed by Patrick Pranke, a former bhikkhu and now a buddhologist and Burma specialist at Louisville. If nobody here can answer your queries satisfactorily you might try contacting Dr. Pranke himself. He's a very friendly and approachable prof. He and I go back a long way, so feel free to mention my name.

<https://www.linkedin.com/in/patrick-pranke-6598bb38>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jun 26, 2021 10:07 PM

Title: Re: in Abhidhamma book 2 Vibhanga, what does it mean to be derived from suttas versus derived from Abhidhamma?

Content:

The subject of the debate seems easy enough to understand: the Andhakas hold that the dhammas that are the objects of mindfulness are themselves mindfulness. The Theravādins disagree

What's puzzling, at least to me, is how on earth anyone could come to hold such an absurd view. With most of the Kathāvatthu debates one can easily empathise with how the paravādins came to arrive at the views they did, but in this case it seems quite a mystery. Then the other difficulty is following the reasoning in Moggalliputtatissa's refutation, which to me is clear enough in a few places but mostly rather opaque.

Sorry I can't be of much help here. If you haven't already seen it, here's the commentary:

[./download/file.php?id=6721&mode=view](#)

[./download/file.php?id=6722&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 7:53 AM

Title: Re: in Abhidhamma book 2 Vibhanga, what does it mean to be derived from suttas versus derived from Abhidhamma?

Content:

I understood (or perhaps misunderstood) the question in your OP to mean something like, "Is the suttabhājanīya exposition intended to be merely quotations from the suttas and exegesis of the same?" It was to this (imagined) question that I replied in the negative.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 8:16 AM

Title: Re: The Buddhist Schools of the Small Vehicle - The Mahāsāṃghika

Content:

I think the text you're alluding to (whose name I can't remember) is a sort of Jain riposte to the Buddhist refutation of Jain kamma theory in the MN's Upāli Sutta. It represents a Buddhist as arguing that since kamma is cetanā, a bhikkhu who eats a breadfruit believing it to be a baby is guilty of cannibalism, while a bhikkhu who eats a baby believing it to be a breadfruit enjoys a blameless meal.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Why recollection of your Sila (Silanussati) and Dana (Caganussati) is better than observing Sila and Dana?

Content:

So if you met a very hungry person, do you think that offering him a couple of peanuts would be just as meritorious as offering him a full meal (assuming you could afford both)?

I think the monk's statement is correct provided that we add the gigantic qualification: "other things being equal."

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Why recollection of your Sila (Silanussati) and Dana (Caganussati) is better than observing Sila and Dana?

Content:

Answered by Sunnat.

If you've not already seen it, the BPS has a good collection of articles on dāna, comprising:

Introduction (Bhikkhu Bodhi)

The Practice of Giving (Susan Elbaum Jootla)

Giving in the Pali Canon (Lily de Silva)

Giving from the Heart (M. O'C. Walshe)

Generosity: The Inward Dimension (Nina van Gorkom)

The Perfection of Giving (Acariya Dhammapāla)

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/various/wheel367.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 3:09 PM

Title: Re: Venerating Tara

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 6:18 PM

Title: Re: Arahants and Lying

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 8:16 PM
Title: Re: Arahants and Lying
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jun 27, 2021 8:26 PM
Title: Re: Arahants and Lying
Content:

When observing the eight precepts on Uposatha days you aren't pretending to be like an arahant in all respects. You are imitating an arahant's conduct "in just this respect" (imināpi añgena).

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 28, 2021 12:22 PM
Title: Re: Pudgalavādin Abhidharma
Content:
Two highly regarded academic studies...

Bhikshu Thich Thien Chau, *The Literature of the Personalists of Early Buddhism*

https://archive.org/details/literatureofthepersonalistsofearlybuddhismnumbhikshuthic/htheinchaumlbd_541_P/mode/2up

Leonard Priestley, Pudgalavada Buddhism - The Reality of the Indeterminate Self.
https://archive.org/details/pudgalavadabuddhismpriestleyleonard_202003_503_u

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jun 28, 2021 12:42 PM
Title: Re: Bad dana
Content:

I doubt any meat that you see in the supermarket was killed for the sake of monks.

One kind of situation where there will be strong grounds for such suspicion is when there's a large gathering of monks in a remote rural location, e.g., at the funeral of a famous forest ajahn. Some monks who are strict about this rule will either eat

vegetarian food for the duration of their stay or will simply avoid attending such events, knowing that it's a near-certainty that animals will be killed for the sake of the attending monks.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 28, 2021 1:14 PM

Title: Re: Does Pāli have a "Prāṭisākhya" ?

Content:

In the ancient Pali grammars, starting with Kaccāyana, the function of a prāṭisākhya is performed by the sandhikappa with which most grammars commence. Whether there are any Pali texts that are exclusively prāṭisākhyas, I don't know. I wouldn't be at all surprised if there were, as it's the sort of thing one could easily imagine a Sanskrit-literate mediaeval Burmese monk composing, but I don't know of any actual examples.

Aleix Ruiz Falqués has much to say on the subject in his Role of Pāli Grammar in Burmese Buddhism.

<https://kabbasetu.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/Ruiz-Falques-2017-Role-of-Pali-Grammar.pdf>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jun 28, 2021 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Demon and Mara

Content:

The appellation "yakkha" gets applied to quite a variety of beings, including the Buddha himself on one occasion. Best to start with the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/yakkha.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 5:09 AM

Title: Re: Parajika - Consequences

Content:

Just to clarify, has your friend already returned to lay life or does he continue to wear the robe?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 5:40 AM

Title: Re: Are all ariya-sacca paramattha sacca?

Content:

Kāmacchanda = lobha

Byāpāda = dosa

Thīnamiddha = thīna and middha

Uddhaccakukkucca = uddhacca and kukkucca

Vicikicchā = vicikicchā

And thus the five become seven.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 12:41 PM

Title: Re: Demon and Mara

Content:

Because it's a term with a wide range of applications, just like a "nāga" can be an ordinary snake, a magical snake, an elephant, an arahant or the name of a certain tribe.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 6:22 PM

Title: Re: About dana and the term sponsorship

Content:

The related verb is upaṭṭhahati and action noun upaṭṭhāna. Upaṭṭhāna is indeed classed as a form of dāna.

All three words are ambiguous, however, for a personal attendant (e.g., Ven. Ānanda) is also called an upaṭṭhāka.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 7:02 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism, free speech and Right speech.

Content:

I don't know about worldwide, but within Europe freedom of speech was unthinkable before Milton's Areopagitica and even after Milton the broadening of the scope of the conception was quite a gradual one.

Something like this:

John Milton: freedom of the press but no tolerance of "popery, and open superstition," nor that which is "impious or evil absolutely either against faith or manners."

Spinoza: freedom of speech, "but not out of anger, hatred, or a desire to introduce any change in the state on one's own authority".

Locke: freedom of speech, but only within the law and not for “opinions contrary to human society, or to those moral rules which are necessary to the preservation of civil society”.

Montesquieu: liberty, but not “unlimited,” consisting “only in the power of doing what we ought to will, and in not being constrained to do what we ought not to will”.

Kant: freedom of speech, but not of action (“argue, but obey”).

Jefferson and Paine: liberty of the individual as against government, but not against “public opinion” or “society”.

Macaulay: freedom, but under conditions of “order and moderation”.

Tocqueville: liberty, but not “without morality, nor morality without faith”.

J.S. Mill: freedom of thought, speech and action absolute and inviolable except where it harms others.

(Based on historian Gertrude Himmelfarb's Looking into the Abyss).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jun 29, 2021 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism, free speech and Right speech.

Content:

I think that could only be justly said of Milton, who basically wanted freedom of expression for dissenting Protestants who expressed the same views as he did, but not so much for anyone else.

In any case, the whole point of my supplying the timeline was to show what an historical novelty is the liberal conception of free speech that most of us nowadays take for granted, and what a long time it took us to arrive at it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jun 30, 2021 9:35 AM

Title: Re: In Praise of Virtue

Content:

The next one in the list is also worth a listen....

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 1, 2021 10:38 AM
Title: Re: Paññavuddho Bhikkhu - introduction
Content:
Hi Venerable,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jul 2, 2021 12:23 PM
Title: Re: Parajika - Consequences
Content:

Neither of your statements are supported in the Pali texts, but rather seem to reflect notions common in Chinese folk Buddhism, where it's typically held that a pārājika monk is either entirely beyond hope for the rest of his present life, or, that his only hope lies in submitting himself to Amitabha or Kwan Yin or some other imaginary entity from the Mahayana pantheon.

The correct position is this...

- The four pārājika offences are all instances of akusala kammāpathas.
- Any of the ten akusala kammāpathas may be the cause for birth in the lower realms if it happens to be the particular kamma that gets to determine your next birth.
- Since a pārājika offence is an especially weighty instance of an akusala kammāpatha, there is a higher than usual chance that it will be the kamma that gets to determine your next birth.

So that's the bad news. As for the good news....

- A "higher than usual chance" doesn't mean an inevitability. If the defeated monk has done the honourable thing and disrobed, and if he repents and is earnest in his pursuit of puñña, then the likelihood of his misdeed being the determinant of his next birth can be attenuated or even voided. In other words, provided you haven't killed your parents or an arahant, a pārājika offence is not an anantariyaka kamma.
- The door to stream-entry in the present life remains open. Although the texts acknowledge obstruction by weighty akusala kamma as one of the things that can prevent attainment in the present life, none of the lists of these types of kammā mentions pārājika offences. The lists include the five anantariyakas, apostasy committed while one is still ordained as a monk, committing a saṅghādisesa offence and not having yet undergone penance and rehabilitation for it, and living "in communion by theft". The last category would include pārājika bhikkhus who remain in the robes, knowingly concealing their guilt, but it doesn't include those, like your friend,

who have confessed their offence and returned to lay life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 2, 2021 5:15 PM

Title: Re: antevāsūpaddavo

Content:

Was it the Mahāsuññatasutta? If so...

Ñānamoli: "the pupil's undoing".

Thanissaro: "the student's undoing".

Sujāto: "peril for a spiritual practitioner".

I.B. Horner: "affliction for pupils".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 3, 2021 4:08 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

The commentary to the Cūḷakammavibhaṅgasutta.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 3, 2021 4:24 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

The speaker doesn't make it an either/or thing in this way. On the contrary, he acknowledges (as virtually all scholars of Indian Buddhist history do) that Islam was one factor in Buddhism's decline and disappearance. He sides, however, with those historians who see Islam as playing a minor rather than a major role in the decline.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 3, 2021 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

This thread is about the causes of the pre-modern near-disappearance of Buddhism from the Indian sub-continent. Its later 20th century revival is off-topic.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 3, 2021 11:07 PM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

Those activities might increase the likelihood of your being able to live out the full life-span that was handed to you at conception. They wouldn't add to your years in this life, though abstention from killing might add to them in a future human life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 3, 2021 11:23 PM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

Yes, that's the Mahāparinibbānasutta. The commentary takes the word kappa to mean his full life-span rather than aeon. In other words, by means of the iddhipādas the Buddha could have lived on to be a hundred if Ānanda had petitioned him to do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 4, 2021 5:40 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

Yes, that's another word for it.

https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=%C4%81yu&searchhws=yes

https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=kappa&searchhws=yes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 4, 2021 5:48 PM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

That would be a baseless assumption.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 5, 2021 10:40 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

In the lifespan specification, "a hundred years or a little more", the phrase "a little more"

(appamā vā bhiyyo) is rather vague. Obviously "a hundred years more" would be far too much, but "25 years more" might well fit within the range.

My main point, however, is that if you did live to be 125, it would not mean that you had been conceived with a lifespan of, say, 100, but had managed to extend it by 25 years. Rather it would mean either that you'd been conceived with a lifespan of 125 and had lived it in full and then passed away due to exhaustion of the āyusankhāras, or, you had been conceived with a lifespan of more than 125 years but had died an untimely death, e.g., because of killing living beings in the present life or because of unhealthy habits.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 6, 2021 10:03 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

But if you're going to side with the non-Theravadin understanding of "kappa" here, then it wouldn't be "another thousand or few thousand years." It would be millions of years.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 6, 2021 10:40 AM

Title: Re: 8 precept and life span

Content:

See attached file.

[./download/file.php?id=6734](#)

(475.72 KiB) Downloaded 41 times

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 6, 2021 4:28 PM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

[./download/file.php?id=6735&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 7, 2021 6:29 PM

Title: Re: Bhikkhu Bodhi's "The Buddha's Teaching As It Is"

Content:

As antobudh66 hasn't logged in for the last four years, I'm afraid you're unlikely to get a response to your queries.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 9, 2021 6:05 PM

Title: Archaeology of Indian Buddhism - introductory course

Content:

A course of thirteen lectures given earlier this year by Jason D. Hawkes, Numata Visiting Professor of Buddhist Studies at Leiden University.

Lectures

<https://video.leidenuniv.nl/channel/The%2BArchaeology%2Bof%2BBuddhism/201230153>

Dr Hawkes' LinkedIn profile

<https://www.linkedin.com/in/jason-hawkes-477a03145?originalSubdomain=uk>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 10, 2021 4:30 PM

Title: Re: Recommendation for a Pali-English dictionary?

Content:

There is the Pali Text Society's Pali English Dictionary, which can be searched here:

<https://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/pali/>

There are also pdf copies of it available somewhere online.

But by far the best is Margaret Cone's dictionary. Three volumes have so far been published, which will take you up to the letter bha.

https://store.pariyatti.org/A-Dictionary-of-Pali-Dr-Margaret-Cone-3-Volume-Set_p_2114.html

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 10, 2021 6:28 PM

Title: Re: Why obsession ?

Content:

My impression is that he fails to realise that there are actually two Pali verbs with the form anuseti. These are homonymous cognates of two different Sanskrit verbs.

And so we have anuseti #1, corresponding to the Sanskrit anuśeti, and meaning to lie

latent, to underlie, to inhere; and anuseti #2, corresponding to the Sanskrit anuseti, and meaning to cling to, to be occupied with, to have an obsession with.

The fact that in Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit the spelling of anusaya (in the context of the seven anusayas) is anuśaya, not anusaya, tells us that anuseti #1 is the relevant verb and so "underlying tendency" (or something to that effect) is the correct translation.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 10, 2021 6:43 PM

Title: Re: Lifespan in Buddha's time

Content:

I think you should read the Arakasutta, AN 7.74 for what the Buddha said about lifespan in his generation, and then the Cakkavattī-sihanādasutta, DN 26, for his account of how human lifespan increases or decreases according to whether humans in general are given to virtuous or vicious habits, and not according to the mere passing of time.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 10, 2021 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Help me im confused and scared if im going to the deepest part of hell

Content:

It means "the Buddha" in Indonesian and Malayan.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Lifespan in Buddha's time

Content:

Whether you find the sutta logical or illogical, my citing it does at least answer your question as to what the suttas teach about the increase and decrease in longevity. That is, it corrects the erroneous suggestion in the OP that these increases and decreases occur merely through the elapse of time and instead makes them dependent on the general state of human virtue.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 1:52 PM

Title: Re: Mara question

Content:

In the case of human beings, even tree devas can kill us if they want to. Happily they don't usually want to. And nor does Māra. What Māra wants is that beings living in his world - the kāmaloḥka - stay in that world and don't move beyond it.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 2:30 PM

Title: Re: Lifespan in Buddha's time

Content:

But the time span that the Cakkavattīsutta is referring to is one that extends far beyond recorded history. As such, the claim we're discussing is not subject to falsification by what we know (actually very little) of historical fluctuations in human longevity.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 2:59 PM

Title: Re: The full moon and Buddha vs the lunatics?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 3:29 PM

Title: Re: Lifespan in Buddha's time

Content:

Now you're mixing up two different things:

1. The Cūlakammavibhangasutta's teaching on individual longevity in the next life and how this is affected by a person's individual killing of living beings or his individual abstention from this.

2. The Cakkavattīsutta's teaching on the general longevity of the human populace over an extended period in particular eras and how this is affected by the general state of human virtue.

Up to now in this thread we've been discussing 2 and nothing but 2. But now you've suddenly reverted to 1 - a topic we already discussed in that earlier thread, but which is irrelevant to the present one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 4:21 PM

Title: Re: International Institute of Theravada

Content:

The stubble on Ven. Maggavihārī's chin is merely a sign that he shaves his beard only when he shaves his head - a common practice among Sri Lankan forest monks.

The Vinaya prohibits the growth of a long beard but doesn't require a bhikkhu to be always clean-shaven.

<https://www.dhammatalks.org/vinaya/bmc/Section0040.html>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 11, 2021 5:27 PM

Title: Re: Lifespan in Buddha's time

Content:

That's an obvious non sequitur. The fact that animals coexist with humans in every era doesn't mean that humans will always kill them in every era. Nor does it mean that in those eras when they do kill them they will always do it with the same frequency.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 12, 2021 12:13 PM

Title: Re: The Mathematics of Buddhaghosa

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 12, 2021 8:17 PM

Title: Re: The Mathematics of Buddhaghosa

Content:

Comparing Nyanatiloka's rendering with Nyanamoli's I note two important differences. The first is the one you brought up in your post:

Nyanamoli:

"previously completed his development"

Nyanatiloka:

"in früherem Leben noch keine geistige Entfaltung geübt hat"

("exercised any spiritual development in previous lives")

The Pali is *pubbe abhāvitabhāvano*, which would literally mean "[one] undeveloped in development in the past." Though there are many places where contextually we need to take *pubbe* as referring to a person's *samsāric* past (i.e., not just the past of his present life), it doesn't seem at all evident that the context here requires us to do so. On the other hand, since Nyanatiloka wasn't the sort of man to go pulling things out of thin air, I would guess that his more expansive translation may reflect a gloss from one or another of the commentaries to the *Visuddhimagga*.

The second important difference concerns the two numbers:

Nyanamoli:

"only one in a hundred or a thousand can do it."

Nyanatiloka:

"nur einer unter Hunderten oder Tausenden ist dazu imstande"

("only one out of hundreds or thousands can do it").

In the Pali the numbers are indeed given in the plural: satesu sahassesu vā. So here I think Nyanatiloka's translation is to be preferred.

Note that the fact that the numbers are in the plural makes the figure even vaguer than it is in the English translation. This in turn adds weight to the figurative interpretation proposed by Coëmgenu rather than the mathematico-literalist one assumed by the OP.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 12, 2021 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Phra Khantipalo

Content:

Thank you.

By the way, the Khantipālo book that Ajahn Nissarano praises in his talk, Buddha, My Refuge, is available from the Buddhist Publication Society as a pdf file.

<https://www.bps.lk/library-search-select.php?id=bp409s>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 13, 2021 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Did Ven buddhaghosa really say in his visuddhimagga that in the end one should merge with the nimitta ?

Content:

Could you quote the sayadaw's own words? The meaning of your paraphrase isn't very clear. For example, which nimitta are you talking about? Parikamma, uggaha or paṭibhāga?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 13, 2021 12:55 PM

Title: Re: Did Ven buddhaghosa really say in his visuddhimagga that in the end one should merge with the nimitta ?

Content:

Thanks for the clarification.

Since the sayadaw doesn't speak of the delimiting or extending of the sign, I would suppose that his account is intended as a description of the earlier "method for guarding of the sign" (rakkhaṇavidhi).

For the Visuddhimagga's account of the same, the OP might like to look at Path of Purification IV 34ff.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 14, 2021 3:08 PM

Title: Re: Akkosa Sutta and kamma

Content:

In the case of intentional killing, for the kamma to come to completion depends on something external to the killer, namely, the termination of the life faculty in his victim.

But the four kinds of unskilful verbal kamma differ from killing in that nothing external is required for their completion. If I tell you a deliberate lie, for example, then I commit the akusala kamma of false speech merely by speaking the falsehood to you. The completion of the kamma does not depend on your believing my lie. Even if you disbelieve me, even if you don't understand what I'm saying, or even if you don't hear me, will make no difference at all to the fact of transgression. Nor will these variables affect the weightiness of the transgression.

The above applies also to divisive speech, harsh speech and frivolous speech. And it applies both to kammic weightiness and to legal weightiness in the context of Vinaya offences.

For example, in the case of false speech, the Vinaya offence is equally weighty whether or not anyone believes the bhikkhu's lies. In the case of divisive speech, the offence is the same whether or not the bhikkhu succeeds in sowing division. In the case of insulting speech, it's the same whether or not the victim feels upset. And in the case of frivolous speech, it's the same offence whether or not anyone laughs when a bhikkhu tells one of the prohibited kinds of jokes (i.e., jesting about the Buddha, Dhamma, Sangha or training).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 14, 2021 9:58 PM

Title: Re: The Mathematics of Buddhaghosa

Content:

As I already pointed out, this is a mistranslation. The figure is actually "one out of hundreds or one out of thousands."

Going with your literalistic take ... "out of hundreds" would mean any number between 200 and 999; "out of thousands would mean any number between 2,000 and 999,999.

That's some ball park!

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 14, 2021 10:28 PM

Title: Re: The Mathematics of Buddhaghosa

Content:

Probably because he was a brahmin before he was a Buddhist and the apprenticeship of his youth almost certainly included a thorough grounding in Brahminical rhetoric (alaṅkāraśāstra). And so as an expository writer we find him constantly enlivening his prose by means of all kinds of alaṅkāric devices: upamās, atīśayoktis, rūpakas, ādidīpakas, kāvyaliṅgas, aprastutaprasaṃsās, etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 14, 2021 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Population reduction

Content:

No. With the lone exception of the prediction made at the time of the founding of the bhikkhuni-sangha, the prophetic material in the canon never stipulates any time period for when something will come to pass. Instead it merely describes tendencies (especially among bhikkhus), events and patterns of events.

See, for example, the four Anāgatabhayāni Suttas ("Discourses on Future Dangers") in the Anguttara Nikāya and the Great Dreams Birth Story in the Jātakas.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an5.77>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an5.78>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an5.79>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/an5.80>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ja77>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 15, 2021 3:36 AM

Title: Re: Paranimmitavasavatti Realms and Devas

Content:

They're actually a bit of both. The heavenly side of the Māras is that they sincerely wish for beings to perform deeds of merit of the kind whose vipāka will manifest in the sense-

sphere. Dāna and sila, for example. So long as you're doing just this and nothing more, Māra won't mess with you. Indeed there are even accounts of Māra positively encouraging such activities.

What vexes Māra and triggers him to act demonically is when someone sees the danger and drawback in sense-pleasures and starts taking steps that will lead him out of the Kāmaloka. In other words, Māra doesn't like people undertaking samatha-bhāvanā, for if they're successful in attaining rūpa and arūpa states, then they'll come to view sense-pleasures as coarse. And he certainly doesn't like people undertaking vipassanā-bhāvanā, for if they're successful in attaining supramundane states, then even rūpa and arūpa states will be viewed by them as coarse, which will place them completely outside of Māra's range. And so it's in order to proactively obstruct any such success that Māra and his host may start to play rough with people.

To give another political simile, Māra might be compared to a well-intentioned but misguided communist dictator who is reluctant to allow his citizens to travel abroad. His reluctance stems from the knowledge that once citizens see how much more pleasant life is in capitalist countries, they're sure to become disillusioned with the communist project.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jul 15, 2021 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Did Ven buddhaghosa really say in his visuddhimagga that in the end one should merge with the nimitta ?

Content:

And so as with most modern Burmese meditation systems, there may be room for debate on the question of whether the Visuddhimagga is being correctly read and applied by the sayadaw, but there isn't any dispute that he intends this to be the foundational text of his system.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 16, 2021 3:58 PM

Title: Re: Monastics accepting medicine

Content:

As BKh mentioned, there is a Vinaya rule that bhikkhus should conform to the wishes of kings, i.e., obey secular laws.

There is also an exception to the rule in cases where the king's wishes are contrary to Dhamma.

So what if bhikkhus are living in a country whose government decrees that everyone must be vaccinated?

Since the average bhikkhu is in no better position than anyone else to judge whether getting vaccinated is a good or a bad thing, we can reasonably anticipate that there'll be much the same diversity of opinion among bhikkhus as there is among the general populace. And so those bhikkhus who think that it's a good thing will "conform to the wishes of kings" by getting vaccinated. Those who think it's a bad thing will regard the king's wishes as contrary to Dhamma and so won't view the mandatory vaccination law as one that they're obliged to obey.

For the time being, however, the question seems academic, for no country has yet made vaccination mandatory.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 16, 2021 4:59 PM

Title: Re: Did Ven buddhaghosa really say in his visuddhimagga that in the end one should merge with the nimitta ?

Content:

Yes, thanks for the clarification.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jul 16, 2021 5:56 PM

Title: Re: Monastics accepting medicine

Content:

No, it's not a defeating offence.

If a bhikkhu temporarily dresses in householders' clothes because his robes were stolen (e.g. while bathing) it's no offence.

If he does so for any other reason it's a misdemeanor.

If he continually dresses like a householder then he can be banished by the sangha for persistent bad conduct. He will then remain banished until he abandons the prohibited practice and applies for the banishment to be lifted.

At least this is what the Vinaya prescribes. But in modern Thailand and Myanmar the state would take the matter out of the hands of the sangha by arresting the improperly dressed monk and forcibly disrobing him.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 17, 2021 2:00 AM

Title: Re: What is wisdom n compassion according to Buddha's teachings ?

Content:

That's all. There's nothing said here about whether women are equally capable of attainment, or less capable or more capable than men. They are merely said to be capable, with no comparison made to men's capability at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 17, 2021 9:33 AM

Title: Re: Tipitaka protection act Sri Lanka

Content:

<https://ceylontoday.lk/news/proposed-tripitaka-conservation-bill-a-challenge-within>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 17, 2021 5:12 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka protection act Sri Lanka

Content:

I can't immediately think of any statement in the suttas to that effect. In the commentaries, on the other hand, it's the kind of thing that gets said about the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, and especially about its seventh book, the Patthāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 17, 2021 5:23 PM

Title: Re: Tipitaka protection act Sri Lanka

Content:

<https://www.ft.lk/opinion/Catch-22-of-the-Tripitaka-Conservation-Act/14-719566>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 17, 2021 8:13 PM

Title: Re: What is wisdom n compassion according to Buddha's teachings ?

Content:

In the case of the garudhammas, I think that those of us who accept them as buddhavacana and believe that they should be upheld should not seek reconciliation with those who either deny that they are buddhavacana or who accept them as buddhavacana but believe that nowadays they should be discarded.

I mean it's not as if there's anything intrinsically good about "reconciliation". Sometimes you have to be against something, and especially in cases where a "reconciliation" would likely amount to no more than a fudge.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 18, 2021 11:16 AM

Title: Re: Yama devas

Content:

Though some modern scholars have speculated that there may once have been a connection between the Yāmas (i.e., the inhabitants of the Yāma heaven) and the Yamas (i.e., Yama, the lord of the underworld, and his retinue), in Pali sources the Yāmas and the Yamas have nothing to do with each other. The former are devas, the latter are vemānikapetas, i.e., beings whose mixed kamma causes them to spend half their time living like devas and the other half living like ghosts.

See their respective entries in the Dictionary of Pali Proper Names.

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/yama.html>

<http://aimwell.org/DPPN/yaamaa.html>

For mnemonic purposes:

A long A Yāma is a celestial faery,
A short A Yama is downright scary.
But I'm willing to bet a silk pyjama
No one's ever met a double M Yamma.

(with apologies to Ogden Nash)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jul 18, 2021 12:20 PM

Title: Re: Termination of volitional kamma

Content:

This seems like a straw man to me. To say that there are some kammass which may not ripen until the distant future is not to deny that there are other kammass which will ripen in this life or the next life. And to say that some presently experienced vipākas may be from kammass performed in the distant past is not to deny that other vipākas may be from kammass more recently performed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 12:49 AM

Title: Re: Termination of volitional kamma

Content:

As I already said, nobody is claiming that an arahant's unripened kammass might be unlimited in number. But there's no logical necessity why their finite number should require all of them to have been performed in recent lives only.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 1:09 AM

Title: Re: The Bodhisattva Ideal in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

It's non-standard but macrons are to be found in romanised editions of Moggallāna's grammar, for Moggallāna (in contrast with Kaccāyana) held that e and o could be either long or short, depending on how many consonants followed. They're also found in some treatises on Pali prosody.

ettha, ēsa

oṭṭha, gōṇa

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 1:31 AM

Title: Re: What is wisdom n compassion according to Buddha's teachings ?

Content:

What would count as evidence? And what do these questions have to do with the topic?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 1:49 AM

Title: Re: What is wisdom n compassion according to Buddha's teachings ?

Content:

The evidence would be people following the teaching and being successful in attaining the ariyan paths and fruits. The commentaries and chronicles have plenty of accounts of such successes during the period in question.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 10:12 AM

Title: Re: Can a monk refuse to teach dhamma ?

Content:

But a mahāthera who claims to have a "secret teaching" would be a highly untypical and unrepresentative Theravādin.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 10:33 AM

Title: Re: Can a monk refuse to teach dhamma ?

Content:

But this is plainly not the case. The great majority of Theravada monks are Asian village monks, most of whom will at the very least give a dhammadesanā to the laity on every Uposatha day, as well as funeral sermons and weekly talks to school pupils. The next largest group are city monks; of those with more than about ten rains, the majority will be full-time teachers.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 2:42 PM

Title: Re: Termination of volitional kamma

Content:

Moggallāna and Angulimāla represent two contrasting cases.

Past-life kamma is only applicable in the case of Moggallāna, whose untimely death is said (in the commentaries) to have been the vipāka of murdering his parents in a past life. In the case of Angulimāla, his post-arahatta tribulations are stated to be the vipāka of the murders committed by him in the present life.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 3:31 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk refuse to teach dhamma ?

Content:

No doubt it would "make sense" in the sense that the monk would have some motive for declining to answer. Whether the motive was good or bad I couldn't say.

There can be good motives for such behaviour, as in the Buddha's silence in response to Vacchagotta's questions. And then there can be bad ones, as with the evasions of the endless equivocators of the Brahmajālasutta.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sn44.10>

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/dn1>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 4:06 PM

Title: Re: Can a monk refuse to teach dhamma ?

Content:

Is this the fellow with the "secret teaching"? If so, why are Theravada Buddhists even giving him the time of day? It should be an absolute red flag for them.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jul 19, 2021 6:53 PM
Title: Re: Can a monk refuse to teach dhamma ?
Content:
See the Velāmasutta.

<https://suttacentral.net/an9.20/en/sujato>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 20, 2021 5:43 AM
Title: Re: Infected by virus due to kamma ?
Content:
No, that doesn't follow.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Affirming_the_consequent

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 20, 2021 6:44 AM
Title: Re: Sex is always unwholesome
Content:
Funnily enough, when I first arrived at Wat Pa Ban Tard in 1985 I learned that there had been another English monk, also called Dhammanando, who had lived at the wat a few years before me. I was told that he was gay but luckily had a very low sex drive and so living in an all-male community was no problem for him. Nevertheless, in the end he disrobed. Apparently he had been a classical musician before he ordained and after a decade as a monk he finally decided (pace Ñāṇavīra) that he really couldn't live without Beethoven.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 20, 2021 6:47 AM
Title: Re: Sex is always unwholesome
Content:
Please give a source when claiming to quote the Buddha.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Jul 20, 2021 2:26 PM
Title: Re: The Mind of Māra and Is Samsara / Māra in itself impermanent?

Content:

Yes, both the office of Māra and the current office-holder are impermanent.

The office-holder is impermanent, for he's a mortal deva. The office itself outlasts the office-holder, but is impermanent nonetheless. It can only last as long as the Paranimittavasavatti heaven lasts and the said heaven gets periodically destroyed.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Jul 20, 2021 5:49 PM

Title: Re: Beings with little dust in their eyes

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 6:56 AM

Title: Re: Beings with little dust in their eyes

Content:

In canonical texts the term is usually (perhaps always) found in contexts where the central focus is on the Buddha and his "Buddha eye" (or his Tathāgata power of discerning the faculties of beings - in the commentaries the two things are treated as synonymous) not the beings with little dust in their eyes, and so naturally not much is said about the latter. The passage I posted earlier is about as expansive as the canon gets on the subject and the commentaries don't add much more.

In the commentaries it's a recurring theme that EVERY Buddha puts on a show of not wanting to teach the Dhamma, precisely in order to induce Brahmā Sahampati to make an appearance. Then when word gets around that Sahampati himself has requested the Buddha to teach, it will give the teaching more credibility. The Buddhavamsa commentary goes as far as making this one of the thirty regularities (dhammatā) in the final life of every Buddha. And yes, after being requested, each Buddha will then survey the world with his Buddha eye.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Infected by virus due to kamma ?

Content:

Your conclusion would necessitate a sutta that declares former-life thuggishness to be either the sole possible cause, or at least one of the necessary conditions, for all human sickness. But there isn't one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 2:37 PM

Title: Re: Pāpimā Devaputta Pajāpati Māra Namuci

Content:

Māra devaputta is used to specify that you're talking about the deva called Māra, as opposed to the figurative senses of the word: māra as the aggregates, māra as death, māra as the defilements, etc.

The others are epithets.

Māra: Killer

Māroti sattānaṃ kusalaṃ māretīti māro, kāmadevo.

"Māra: a desire-world deity; he kills what is wholesome in living beings, thus he is called "Māra".

Papimā: Evil One.

Pajāpati: Lord of this Generation.

Adhipati: Overlord.

Namuci: Grasper or Captor.

Pamattabandhū: Kinsman of the Heedless.

Antaka: End-maker.

Kaṇha: Dark One.

Maddana: Intoxicator.

Dabbaka: Obdurate / Persistent One.

Kandapa: Drinker of Tears.

Ratipati: Lord of Delight.

Pingalacakkhu: Red-eyed One.

Kāma: Desire

Kusumāyudha: Wielder of Flower Weapons.

Etc., etc.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 4:39 PM

Title: Re: Beings with little dust in their eyes

Content:

The Buddha eye by which this could be accomplished is a faculty unique to Buddhas. It's not shared even by very psychically accomplished disciples like Anuruddha and Moggallāna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 4:59 PM

Title: Re: Infected by virus due to kamma ?

Content:

I don't think I can make it much clearer, but I'll have a try...

MN 135: Some thuggish people are reborn in the lower realms. Others are reborn as sickly humans.

Proposed inference from MN 135: All the doctors and nurses who fell sick and succumbed to the virus did so because of past-life thuggishness.

This inference is a non sequitur. It depends on the unstated assumption that there can be no instance of fatal sickness that is not caused (at least in part) by past-life thuggishness. But neither MN 135 nor any other sutta supports this assumption.

Also, though I didn't mention it earlier, it depends on the unstated assumption that the vipāka of thuggishness can not only cause one to be reborn as a sickly human but can also cause a healthily born human to later become sick. While the latter may be true, it's not inferable from what MN 135 actually says.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Jul 21, 2021 7:40 PM

Title: Re: Poetry

Content:

Four come to mind...

Yann Lovelock, a veteran supporter of the Burmese vihara in Birmingham.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Yann_Lovelock

Grevel Lindop, a longstanding member of the Samatha Trust.

https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Grevel_Lindop

<https://grevel.co.uk/about/>

Paul Merchant, Oregon-based British poet. I don't know if he identifies as a Theravada Buddhist, but back in the 80s he was one of the regulars at Ajahn Khemadhammo's former monastery in Kenilworth.

<http://oregonpoeticvoices.org/poet/77/>

James Robert Matthew Murphy

An occasional Chithurst visitor and fine poet, but his work is only visible to his Facebook friends, so you'll need to look him up and add him.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 22, 2021 12:48 PM
Title: Re: Infected by virus due to kamma ?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Jul 22, 2021 2:54 PM
Title: Re: Ceto-Vimutti
Content:
It's a noun and the compound is traditionally treated as either an instrumental or a genitive tappurisa.

Instrumental

"Deliverance [from defilements] by [the training of] the thought-process."

Genitive

"Deliverance of the thought-process [from defilements]."

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jul 23, 2021 11:45 AM
Title: Re: Sex is always unwholesome
Content:
Clearly this sutta is a neyyāttha teaching, for the form of a woman doesn't obsess the mind of a male homosexual, nor the form of a man the mind of a lesbian, nor the form of either sex the mind of an asexual.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Jul 23, 2021 2:41 PM
Title: Re: Astro(nomy)/logy
Content:
The above seems to mostly fall under astronomy up to the words "such will be the result...", but after that it's all astrology.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jul 24, 2021 5:37 PM

Title: Re: Ceto-Vimutti

Content:

It's an adaptation of the rendering "thinking process" used in volume II of Margaret Cone's dictionary.

I came across it when the volume was first published and initially didn't much take to it. In fact I thought it nearly as dodgy as Thanissaro's ridiculous rendering. However, having learned to hold Cone's scholarly judgment in high regard I decided to look into the matter. I went through the Tipiṭaka checking every occurrence of ceta and its compounds, along with the commentarial glosses to the same. I found there was no place where "thinking process" didn't fit, many places where it seemed the best fit, and even a couple where it seemed the only reasonable fit. And so I was converted, began using it in my own dhammacintā and bhāvanā, and was pleased with the changes this wrought.

In my post, however, I shortened "thinking" to "thought" just to make it one syllable less of a mouthful.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Tue Oct 19, 2021 11:24 AM

Title: Re: diṭṭhamattam, etc.

Content:

The second item in the compound is matta, not atta.

https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=matta&searchhws=yes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 21, 2021 4:50 PM

Title: Re: Why does Bodhisatva look for a mother?

Content:

In the commentarial texts the Bodhisatta surveys the world and foresees the circumstances of his final birth, e.g., whether his family will be khattiyas or brahmanas.

The change of this act of foreseeing into an act of choosing is a folk Theravada misunderstanding of what the texts say. A Bodhisatta's birth, like anyone else's birth, is determined by his kamma. For example, the fact that he will always be either a khattiya or a brahmana is not because he has any choice in the matter, but because by the time of his final life his accumulated merit will always guarantee birth in whatever happens to be the highest varna.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 21, 2021 5:29 PM

Title: Re: English Poems To Translate to Pali for Intermediate Learners ?

Content:

I agree with Coëmgenu, it's best to start with something a little less ambitious than Robert Frost.

HUMPTY DUMPTY

Humpati Dumpati kuḍḍe nisīdati,
Humpati Dumpati kuḍḍā opatati

Sabbe rañño assā sabbe rañño mantī,
Humpatim paṭisaṅkharitum na sakkonti.

But if you really must start with Frost, I'd suggest Fire and Ice as a relatively easier one to start with...

Some say the world will end in fire,
Some say in ice.
From what I've tasted of desire
I hold with those who favor fire.

But if it had to perish twice,
I think I know enough of hate
To say that for destruction ice
Is also great
And would suffice.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 21, 2021 5:40 PM

Title: Re: Why does Bodhisatva look for a mother?

Content:

To clearly discern what's happening is not the same as choosing it to happen.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 22, 2021 7:37 PM

Title: Re: Why does Bodhisatva look for a mother?

Content:

Choosing death wilfully is of course an easy enough thing to do.

But where are these supposed cases of practitioners choosing the circumstances of their next birth? Are you referring to Pali texts or to Tibetan hagiographies and suchlike? If it's the former, then the closest we get to this is that a person might wish for such and such type of birth (e.g., in a Brahmā heaven, or in a place where he can be reunited with his spouse, or as a human in the time of some future Buddha), make an effort to cultivate the appropriate sort of merit and then keep his fingers crossed that things will eventuate according to his wishes. It would be rather a stretch to call this "choosing" one's next birth

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 28, 2021 7:24 AM

Title: Re: Why does Bodhisatva look for a mother?

Content:

This doesn't answer my question regarding a source where such a thing is reported. Are you talking about accounts that a Theravada Buddhist would want to take seriously or about Chinese or Tibetan folk myths and suchlike?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 28, 2021 9:09 AM

Title: Re: 'The Four Sublime States' by Nyanaponika Thera

Content:

Some would argue that Nyanaponika's statement is contradicted in the Buddha's discourse to Moliyasīvaka.

<https://suttacentral.net/sn36.21/en/bodhi>

On the other hand, it's not contradicted if the said discourse is read according to the commentarial understanding.

To summarize the two readings of the sutta:

Sutta-onlyist Theravadins

Wrong view: all painful feelings arise from the ripening of past kamma.

Right view: some painful feelings arise from the ripening of past kamma. Others arise from other causes and have nothing to do with past kamma.

Classical Theravadins

Wrong view: all painful feelings arise solely from the ripening of past kamma.

Right view: some painful feelings arise solely from the ripening of past kamma. Others

arise from past kamma operating in conjunction with other causes (i.e., bile disorders, phlegm disorders, etc.).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 28, 2021 12:48 PM

Title: Re: 'The Four Sublime States' by Nyanaponika Thera

Content:

I hadn't yet read your post at the time I was replying.

However, your sutta quote seems to me to be quite neutral on the question raised in the OP. That is, the proposition, "Whatever they do, for good or for evil, to that will they fall heir," is logically compatible with both Nyanaponika's claim that everything which befalls us is vipāka and also with the contrary view that only part of what befalls us is so. The quote doesn't say that we are the heirs of our kamma and nothing else, but nor does it rule out such a possibility.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 28, 2021 2:52 PM

Title: Re: 'The Four Sublime States' by Nyanaponika Thera

Content:

I agree. And as such it neither supports nor contradicts Nyanaponika's claim.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Oct 28, 2021 6:07 PM

Title: Re: Significance of spheres in Thai iconography

Content:

As for the crystal balls, these weren't very much in evidence when I first came to Thailand in the early 1980's and at that time were uniquely associated with the meditation practice taught at Wat Paknam and Wat Dhammakaya and their respective satellites. That one nowadays sees them all over the place is probably a consequence of Wat Dhammakaya's expansionism

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 29, 2021 10:33 PM

Title: Re: 'The Four Sublime States' by Nyanaponika Thera

Content:

Can you be more expansive? It's not clear to me what you're asking.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Oct 29, 2021 10:48 PM

Title: Re: Why does Bodhisatva look for a mother?

Content:

But no such inference is possible.

The sutta merely affirms that the Bodhisatta was mindful and aware during the rebirth process. But you made this point earlier and I didn't dispute it. What I disputed is whether the fact of his being mindful at this time allows the inference that the Bodhisatta chose where he would be reborn. To me that doesn't seem to follow at all. A person can be mindful and aware both when deliberately performing an action and when passively undergoing some experience. As such, your sutta quote is neutral on the question of whether the Bodhisatta selected the circumstances of his birth.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 30, 2021 6:18 PM

Title: Re: 'The Four Sublime States' by Nyanaponika Thera

Content:

Yes

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 30, 2021 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Paṭṭhāna Pāḷi Chanting

Content:

A common Burmese rationale (much encouraged by the late Patthana Sayadaw, U Narada) is similar to that which leads some Chinese Mahayanists to devote themselves to the memorisation and recitation of the Shurangama Sutra. They do so believing that this sutra will be the first one to be lost to the world when the sāsanā is declining. Therefore as long as there are some people who devote themselves to preserving this sutra, the longevity of the sāsanā is assured. And because those who do this are ensuring the sāsanā's survival, they accumulate a vast amount of merit. The Burmese reasoning is much the same except that it's the Patthana that's believed to be the first text that will disappear.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Oct 30, 2021 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Paṭṭhāna Pāḷi Chanting

Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Nov 2, 2021 5:01 PM
Title: Re: whose Buddhism is truest?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Nov 4, 2021 7:13 AM
Title: Re: Abhidhamma Resources
Content:
It didn't work for me. This link is for the pdf

http://abhidhamma.com/Patthana_light_Nanavamsa.pdf

And this one for the epub

http://abhidhamma.com/Patthana_light_Nanavamsa.epub

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 5, 2021 9:35 PM
Title: Re: what does ariya savaka and sekha actually mean?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Nov 5, 2021 11:45 PM
Title: Re: what does ariya savaka and sekha actually mean?
Content:
Once the sangha has declared a family to be sekha-sammata then it comes under the protection of the rule quoted. That is, bhikkhus can no longer just show up uninvited in the expectation of being given alms.

I'll address the other questions tomorrow.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Nov 6, 2021 2:22 PM

Title: Re: what does ariya savaka and sekha actually mean?

Content:

And my answer to that is that what the sekha pierces through wisdom is Nibbāna as glimpsed at the time of the sekha path and fruition attainments.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 6, 2021 7:11 PM

Title: Re: what does ariya savaka and sekha actually mean?

Content:

That their seeing of it isn't the same as an asekha's possession of it can be seen from any of the suttas that describe sekhas as disciples who still have more work to do.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Nov 6, 2021 9:46 PM

Title: Re: what does ariya savaka and sekha actually mean?

Content:

No.

Inferential knowledge (anvaye ñāṇa) is indicated in the suttas by a number of stock phrases, but the phrase "having pierced it through with wisdom, he sees" (paññāya ativijjha passati) is certainly not one of them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 8, 2021 4:28 PM

Title: Re: Present or Past

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 8, 2021 5:34 PM

Title: Re: Maria Heim on love and compassion in the Visuddhimagga

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 9, 2021 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Best first world country to live as buddhist?

Content:

Though not all are First World countries, these would be my own preferences...

Western Europe

Iceland, Switzerland, Andorra or Liechtenstein

Eastern Europe

Poland or Hungary

Middle East

Israel

Northern Africa

Morocco

West Africa

São Tomé and Príncipe

East Africa

The Seychelles

Central Africa

Nowhere

Southern Africa

Botswana

North America

One of the Southern states of the USA, probably Georgia.

Central America

Belize or Costa Rica

South America

Argentina

Central Asia

Nowhere

Southern Asia

The Maldives

Eastern Asia

Macau or Taiwan

Southeast Asia

Singapore or East Timor

Oceania

Fiji, the Solomon Islands, the Pitcairns, or pretty well anywhere except those two hotbeds of woke dreariness called Australia and New Zealand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 9, 2021 10:58 AM

Title: Re: Budddhist cosmology and heirarchical structures

Content:

I think my signature hints at the answer: it's a hierarchy of peacefulness, rarifiedness, ethereality.

Cappuccino's proposal of a hierarchy of purity is tempting, but doesn't seem to quite cut it. It breaks down when we get up to the higher echelons of the Brahmā world, for the five Pure Abodes, inhabited solely by anāgāmins and arahants, are ranked lower than the four formless realms, in which many of the beings are worldlings and therefore less pure than the inhabitants of the world beneath them.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Dec 13, 2021 12:09 PM

Title: Re: Budddhist cosmology and heirarchical structures

Content:

It seems to me that the Suddhāvāsas are part of samsāra. For example, the fifth type of anāgāmin, the uddhamsota-akanitthagāmi, starts off being born in the lowest of the Pure Abodes and then is born four more times, each time ascending to a higher Abode until he attains arahatta in the Akanittha realm. But even if this type didn't exist and all anāgāmins were to attain arahatta in whichever Abode they first arose, the Abodes would still count as samsāric, inasmuch as they are places within which one arises and from which one passes away.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Dec 15, 2021 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Snp 5.17 missing 'birth'?

Content:

Guesswork translations like this may or may not be "in line with Dhamma", but they will very seldom convey the Pali meaning accurately.

Firstly, santāpa is a noun, not a past participle: "torment". The past participle of the verb santappati is either santatta or santāpita.

Secondly, jāte isn't jāti.

The latter means "birth". The former is the past participle *jāta* ("born", "arisen") in the accusative case, as it is qualifying *manuje* ("humans") which is the object of the sentence.

But even if the word was *jāti*, to translate it as "tormented by birth" the word *jāti* would need to be the first item in the compound and the participle second. It's just like in English compound-formation, where we say "ill-gotten" and "grass-covered", not "gotten-ill" and "covered-grass".

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Dec 16, 2021 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Snp 5.17 missing 'birth'?

Content:

No doubt that happens, but the burden of proof here lies with the one proposing that the original reading was something other than what it is now. For example, K.R.

Norman's translation of the Suttanipāṭa contains many revised readings, but he doesn't just pull these out of thin air. Most of his proposals are advanced on the grounds that they would better fit the particular metre in which the verse is written. But no such case can be made for *jāte* originally reading *jāti*, for here the metre requires that the second vowel be a long one.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 1, 2022 1:49 PM

Title: Re: Jesus the Messiah and Buddha

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 2, 2022 12:31 PM

Title: Re: VLOG#29: The Ultimate Comeback Kid

Content:

I haven't watched the video, but if he's referring to *kāyapassaddhi* and *cittapassaddhi* then one source would be the *Kāyasutta*, SN 46:2.

<https://suttacentral.net/sn46.2/en/bodhi>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Jan 3, 2022 12:27 PM

Title: Re: VLOG#29: The Ultimate Comeback Kid

Content:

I recall when Ven. Samahita first began posting to various online forums he would often use out-of-date translations like Kindred Sayings for the SN and Gradual Sayings for the AN. But as I never followed him closely I don't know if he continued to do so.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 13, 2022 3:59 PM

Title: Re: Do negative thinkers go to hell?

Content:

Yes, if the thoughts consist in any of the three mind-door unwholesome kammass, i.e., covetousness, malice or wrong view. (The third is traditionally taken as referring to the extremer forms of wrong view that deny ownership of kamma: fatalism, haphazardism, moral nihilism, etc.).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 13, 2022 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Do negative thinkers go to hell?

Content:

I think there are two questions here.

Firstly, what does it take to create one of the three kinds of mental akusala kammass (covetousness, malice, wrong view)?

Secondly, having created such a kamma, how likely is it that it will be this kamma, not one of the millions of others, that gets to be the one that determines our next birth?

The traditional answer to the first question is that it takes very little at all. For example, in the case of wrong view the commentary to the Sāmaññaphalasutta states that the kammass is created merely by ahetukavāda, natthikavāda or akiriyavāda persisting in the mental continuum for the duration of seven javana cittas.

See pages 77-81 in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation.

<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/01%20DN%2002%20The%20Fruits%20of%20Recluseship%2C%20The%20Samannaphala%20Sutta%20and%20its%20Commentaries%20-%20The%20Fruits%20of%20Recluseship%20-%20Bhikkhu%20Bodhi%2C%20BPS-Kandy%2C2008%281989%29%20%28197p%29/page/77/mode/2up>

The second question seems to take us into acinteyya territory, for there are just so many variables. The relevant teaching is that of the fourfold order of ripening in chapter 5 of the Abhidhammatthasangaha and chapter 19 of the Visuddhimagga.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Jan 13, 2022 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Do negative thinkers go to hell?

Content:

Thoughts of burning would be an instance of vihimśā (the mode of dosa that aims at the affliction of its ārammana). Thoughts of killing would be an instance of vyāpāda (the mode of dosa that aims at the non-existence of its ārammana).

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 14, 2022 7:28 AM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 14, 2022 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Nibbana under the effect of ayahuasca

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 14, 2022 2:50 PM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 14, 2022 5:15 PM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

Having lived for a decade in Iceland I can assure you it's quite possible to get by there without killing or eating fish. Although the fishing industry is a major part of the country's export sector it isn't very labour intensive and employs only about 10,000 of the country's 217,000 labour force (about 5,000 on the trawlers and 5,000 in the processing factories). And so the great majority of Icelanders never need to kill a fish to appease their hunger.

But suppose, for discussion's sake, there is some place in the world where fishing really is essential for survival and where the entire population is obliged to participate in it. In that case, my view would be that, (1) the Dhamma is unlikely to take root there; (2) those with the potential for sotāpatti are unlikely to be reborn in places where there's no Dhamma; (3) in the unlikely event of sotāpatti being attained in such a place, the attainers of it would emigrate or die rather than kill fish.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 7:09 AM
Title: Re: Björn Natthiko Lindeblad
Content:
Hi Sam Vara,

Your second link is to the Swedish-only version. Here's the one with English subtitles:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 7:20 AM
Title: Re: Nibbana under the effect of ayahuasca
Content:
Ah, what a shame.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 7:43 AM
Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?
Content:
<https://archive.org/details/PaliCommentariesCollection/05.01%20Khuddakapatha%20Commentary%2C%20Minor%20Readings%20and%20Illustrator%20%28PTS%29%20%28OCRed%29%20%28384p%29/page/n3/mode/2up>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 9:01 AM
Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?
Content:
If you are asking if it can be inferred from your past breaches of the first precept that you are now a sotāpanna, then no, no such inference can be drawn.

If you are asking if it can be inferred from your past breaches of the first precept that you are not now a sotāpanna, then again, no such inference can be drawn. That is, you

might, for all I know, have repented and established yourself in purity of sila at some point since your last breach of the precept.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Path attainment

Content:

That's true enough if you're going shopping in your own neighbourhood. But an apter simile, it seems to me, would be a shopping trip in a strange town where you know neither where the shops are nor by what route they can be reached. On a shopping trip in such a town it would be no solecism to speak of attaining/discovering the path to the shops as a prelude and a prerequisite to attaining the shops.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 15, 2022 9:59 AM

Title: Re: If you become a Sotapanna will you know that?

Content:

The abandoning of certain defilements by a sotāpanna is an "abandoning by cutting off" (samucched-pahana). This means that it's an irreversible abandoning; the three fetters are cut off, never to arise again. As such, the sotāpanna's state is not one from which he can fall away.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Jan 21, 2022 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Ajahn Pramote & "out of control"

Content:

I don't think there's anything distinctive or unusual in what the ajahn is quoted as saying in this thread.

Any Thai teacher giving an exposition of anatta that's informed by the commentarial understanding will frequently use the phrase mai pen pai nai amnaat (ไม่เป็นไปในอำนาจ), which is the Thai translation of the Visuddhimagga term avasavattana.

Example:

“Yaṃ dukkhaṃ tadanattā”ti pana vacanato tadeva khandhapañcakaṃ anattā. Kasmā? Avasavattanato, avasavattanākāro anattalakkhaṇaṃ.

Those same five aggregates (which are impermanent and suffering) are not-self because of the (sutta) phrase 'What is suffering is not self.' Why? Because there is no exercising mastery over them. The mode of insusceptibility to the exercise of mastery is

the characteristic of not-self.

(Visuddhimagga Ch. XXI)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 22, 2022 4:10 PM

Title: Re: Buddha wasnt bald-headed !

Content:

It's not customary to do so and I've never heard of it happening. However, if a barber were to offer a bhikkhu a free shave or if a layperson were to offer to pay for one, then there's no prohibition against accepting the offer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Jan 22, 2022 4:34 PM

Title: Re: Buddha wasnt bald-headed !

Content:

The razor that you're given at your ordination is a straight-edge, but in Thailand nowadays very few monks ever use it. The preferred tool is an old-fashioned 3-piece single-blade Gillette with the safety bar removed.

.

[./download/file.php?id=7467&mode=view](#)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sun Jan 23, 2022 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Buddha wasnt bald-headed !

Content:

Exactly, "bald" is the wrong word.

In Pali the relevant words are, firstly, *accha* and *khalita*, which mean bald (i.e., lacking hair in places where hair would be expected); secondly, *muṇḍa* or *muṇḍita*, which mean with one's head hair closely shaven; thirdly, *kesamassum avahaṭa*, meaning with one's hair and beard both shaven; fourthly, *virala*, meaning that one is going bald or has very thin hair"; and fifthly, *bhaṇḍu*, which can mean either bald or shaven.

In the texts the Buddha is described as *muṇḍa* or as *kesamassum avahaṭa*, but never as *accha*, *khalita*, *virala* or *bhaṇḍu*. He, along with his disciples, is also jeered by *brāhmaṇas* using the derogatory expression *muṇḍaka samaṇaka*, "shaveling ascetic".

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun Jan 23, 2022 10:58 PM
Title: Re: Pali Dictionaries
Content:
Hi Kåre,

Nice to see you back.

Margaret Cone gave an interview back in 2015 when she was still working on the third volume. In it she said that she didn't expect to complete the fourth in this life. If that's still how matters stand today, then I suppose if/when it gets completed will depend on whether there's some other scholar willing to carry the baton.

.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Jan 24, 2022 7:47 AM
Title: Re: The teachings of Ven. Waharaka Abhayaratanalankara Thero
Content:
I should imagine that like Ven. Ñānavīra he is going with the variant reading sabbatopaham̐. But whereas Ñānavīra parses this as sabbato + apaham (the negated present participle of pabhavati or pahoti) and translates as "wholly non-originating", Ven. Sujāto's parsing would be sabbato + paham, the latter being the present participle of pajahati, to abandon.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Feb 3, 2022 7:07 PM
Title: Re: Stream Entry and rebirth- seven bhava before Nibbana could mean many more than seven lives?
Content:
It's the Pilindavacchasutta in the Udana.

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/ud3.6>

The Vinaya story you're probably thinking of concerns someone else - a monk who after meals would involuntarily regurgitate his food because he'd been an ox in five hundred former lives.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 4, 2022 5:39 PM

Title: Re: Who is Vimalakirti?

Content:

The characters who feature in Mahayana sutras are of broadly two kinds: the fictionalised and the fictitious.

The fictionalised consist mainly of the Buddha and his arahant disciples, but with non-arahants like Anathapindika and Devadatta putting in an occasional appearance.

The fictitious consist mainly of mythical and godlike Buddhas and Bodhisattvas (Manjushri, Avalokitesvara, Amitabha and suchlike) but also human Bodhisattvas like Sudhana in the Avatamsaka Sutra and Dragon Girl in the Lotus Sutra.

Since Vimalakirti doesn't feature in any non-Mahayana source we can place him in the second category.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 5, 2022 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Who is Vimalakirti?

Content:

To start with a clarification of my terms.

Where a text's character is based upon an historical personage but is being portrayed with much poetic license, then I call him "fictionalized". Shakespeare's Cymbeline, for example, is a fictionalised version of the Celtic king Cunobelinus. Mahākasyāpa in Mahayana sutras is a fictionalized version of the Mahākassapa of early Buddhist texts.

As for "fictitious", by this I mean where a character is either wholly a product of someone's imagination (like Shakespeare's Prospero and Caliban) or else a borrowing of someone else's fictitious product (like Shakespeare's Shylock).

Neither term can be equated with "not in our normal sense experience". Sakka, Sahampati, Manjushri and Kwan Yin are all outside our normal sense experience, but the first two are reported to exist in texts that Theravadins deem authoritative, while the other two are just Mahayana fictions.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat Feb 5, 2022 6:47 PM

Title: Re: Who is Vimalakirti?

Content:

Sure, but that's no concern of mine.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Tue Feb 8, 2022 9:23 PM
Title: Re: Hello from Dhammanando
Content:
Hello. Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 9, 2022 2:17 AM
Title: Re: Hello from Dhammanando
Content:
Sure. Perhaps you'd like to start a thread about it.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Wed Feb 9, 2022 2:44 AM
Title: Re: Help in Time of Need
Content:
There's a sort of Buddhist Gideon Bible published by a Japanese outfit called BDK. It's been translated into about forty languages and can be found in hotel rooms all over Asia. Its contents are mainly from the Nikayas and Āgamas, but it also includes passages either from Mahayana sutras or else non-Mahayana texts that have been influential in East Asia (the Lalitavistara, Mahavastu and suchlike).

<https://bdk-seiten.com/scripture-download.php?lang=en>

Then there's a thematically arranged book by the Aussie monk Ven. Shravasti Dhammika, Guide to Buddhism A-Z.

<http://www.buddhisma2z.com/subject.php>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 11, 2022 11:07 AM
Title: Re: Seven factors of enlightenment is not limited to Buddhists?
Content:
"Faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration and wisdom" are elsewhere in the suttas termed either indriyas or balas, not bojjhangas.

Perhaps your monk is inferring that the indriyas are what's intended here, and then further inferring that someone possessing the indriyas will also possess the bojjhangas. But for him to claim that, "the Buddha very clearly said that Alarakalama and

Uddakarama also had the seven factors of enlightenment," seems to be going too far.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 11, 2022 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Stream Entry and rebirth- seven bhava before Nibbana could mean many more than seven lives?

Content:

The Pure Dhamma page linked to in the OP offers only one proof text in support of this contention: the account of Bimbisara in the Janavasabha Sutta. But as santa100 pointed out, the sutta doesn't actually support the view at all.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 14, 2022 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Attā nirattā na hi tassa atthi

Content:

<https://suttacentral.net/snp4.3/de/nyanaponika>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Mon Feb 14, 2022 10:38 AM

Title: Re: Jataka births- how all during the time of Brahmadatta?

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed Feb 16, 2022 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

One would observe the precept from dawn on the 16th until dawn on the 17th.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 17, 2022 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Pali Pronunciation Critique

Content:

The pronunciation seems ok, but I noticed some mistakes in the syllabification.

1. Only the initial syllable of a Pali word can begin with a vowel. Every medial and final syllable has to begin with a consonant.

For example, dipamattano is syllabified as "dī-pa-mat-ta-no", not "dīp-am-at-tan-o."

2. The consonants are divided into vaggas (stops) and avaggas (liquids). The vaggas are the 25 consonants from ka to ma. The rest are avaggas.

When a vagga follows another vagga they are pronounced separately:

pubba = pub-ba

Likewise when an avagga follows another avagga:

tassa = tas-sa

But when an avagga follows a vagga they are pronounced together:

patvā = pa-tvā, not pat-vā

ratyo = ra-tyo, not rat-yo

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Feb 17, 2022 7:49 AM

Title: Re: Uposatha Observance Club

Content:

He may strengthen his motivation to observe the Uposatha precepts by reading and regularly re-reading the various Anguttara Nikaya suttas that outline the advantages in doing so.

When tempted to break a precept he may resist the temptation by resort to the three ādhipateyyas ("authorities", "predominances", "bases of self-governance").

<https://suttacentral.net/an3.40/en/bodhi>

But if he's such a deep-dyed akratic that the ādhipateyyas don't work for him, then he may seek out more enkratic Buddhist friends with whom to spend the Uposatha, rather than spending it alone.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Feb 18, 2022 2:15 PM

Title: Re: Pali Pronunciation Critique

Content:

The avagga cluster vh occurs (e.g., jivhā, "tongue"; avhayati/avheti, "to call") but isn't common. Commoner ones are vy, yh, lh. All such are examples of the second case, except where the first consonant is a pure nasal.

jivhā = ji-vhā [*]
avyāpāda = a-vyā-pā-da
mūḷho = mū-ḷho

Pure nasal

aṃsa = aṃ-sa

[*]. But since vh isn't a native phoneme in most SE Asian languages, the tendency in practice is to ignore the rule and insert a schwa or some other unstressed vowel between the two consonants. And so in Thai Pali chanting, depending on the region, jivhā is variously realised as:

/t̪ʰiwəha:/ with inserted schwa
/t̪ʰiwaha:/ with open front unrounded vowel, or...
/t̪ʰiwuwa:/ with closed back unrounded vowel

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Fri Feb 18, 2022 10:55 PM
Title: Re: Good Indian History Books?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 19, 2022 2:31 PM
Title: Re: Skilful Thoughts of Renunciation
Content:

This is a question-begging question, for it simply assumes that abyāpāda is nothing more than the absence of ill will, i.e., that the a- prefix in abyāpāda is privative rather than invertive.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 19, 2022 2:38 PM
Title: Re: Skilful Thoughts of Renunciation
Content:

I don't think so. If the commentary is right to equate abyāpāda with mettā, then it would mean that the monk begins with a mind of mettā that's of a limited extent and then proceeds to develop it to an unlimited extent.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 19, 2022 3:16 PM
Title: Re: Pali Pronunciation Critique
Content:
Yes, I believe so.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 19, 2022 4:19 PM
Title: Re: Skilful Thoughts of Renunciation
Content:

If the commentaries are right in their understanding of abyāpāda-vitakka and avihimsā-vitakka (and you haven't yet shown them to be wrong), then all ariyan disciples develop mettā and karuṇā, for without these there'd be no eightfold path but only a seven-and-one-third-fold path.

Now if you can offer me some substantive reasons for why avyāpāda and avihimsā can only be conceived as mere absences and not as anything positive, then I'll be glad to hear them. But if all you can bring to the table are more question-begging declarations as to what abyāpāda and avihimsā must be, then I'll let this be my final reply in this thread.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat Feb 19, 2022 4:44 PM
Title: Re: Clad in the refuse's rag robe and asubha real practice experience?
Content:
Hi venerable,

Welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

If the Dhammanando you're seeking is the Burmese Pali teacher and abbot of Wat Tha Ma O, I'm afraid he passed away some years ago. But if it's his student, the English Dhammanando, then that would be me.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu Mar 3, 2022 4:32 PM
Title: Re: The Eye
Content:
The word cakkhussa comprises two homonyms. One is the genitive of the noun cakkhu, but the other is an entirely different word, an adjective that's cognate with Skt. cakṣuṣya.

The latter isn't a very common word.

An example (AN 5.208):

Dantakaṭṭha-sutta

“Pañcime, bhikkhave, ādīnavā dantakaṭṭhassa akhādane. Katame pañca? Acakkhussaṃ, mukhaṃ duggandhaṃ hoti, rasaharaṇiyo na visujjhanti, pittaṃ semhaṃ bhattaṃ pariyonandhati, bhattamassa nacchādeti. Ime kho, bhikkhave, pañca ādīnavā dantakaṭṭhassa akhādane.

Pañcime, bhikkhave, ānisaṃsā dantakaṭṭhassa khādane. Katame pañca? Cakkhussaṃ, mukhaṃ na duggandhaṃ hoti, rasaharaṇiyo visujjhanti, pittaṃ semhaṃ bhattaṃ na pariyonandhati, bhattamassa chādeti. Ime kho, bhikkhave, pañca ānisaṃsā dantakaṭṭhassa khādane”ti.

Chew Sticks

“Mendicants, there are these five drawbacks of not using chew sticks. What five? It’s not good for your eyes, you get bad breath, your taste-buds aren’t cleaned, bile and phlegm cover your food, and you lose your appetite. These are the five drawbacks of not using chew sticks.

There are these five benefits of using chew sticks. What five? It’s good for your eyes, you don’t get bad breath, your taste-buds are cleaned, bile and phlegm don’t cover your food, and food agrees with you. These are the five benefits of using chew sticks.”

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 3, 2022 5:57 PM

Title: Re: Monks and Thai Government Hospitals

Content:

In 26 years living here as a monk I've had three hospital stays (one government hospital and one private, and one stay in a sangha hospital), dozens of dental check-ups, and one trip to an A&E on account of the above-mentioned earphone incident. Also, for five years I was on the team of visiting chaplains at the Sangha hospital in Bangkok.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 3, 2022 6:40 PM

Title: Re: byādhidhammānaṃ

Content:

Byādhidhammānaṃ (var. vyādhidhammānaṃ) is the form that the adjective byādhidhamma would take if the noun that it qualifies is in the dative or genitive plural.

Its meaning is "subject to sickness" or "of the nature to get sick".

This is an example where it's being used in the dative plural:

Byādhidhammānaṃ, āvuso, sattānaṃ evaṃ icchā uppajjati: ‘aho vata mayaṃ na byādhidhammā assāma; na ca vata no byādhi āgaccheyyā’ti. Na kho panetaṃ icchāya pattaḃbaṃ.

To beings subject to sickness, friend, there comes the wish: ‘Oh, that we were not subject to sickness! That sickness would not come to us!’ But this is not to be obtained by wishing.

(MN 141)

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu Mar 3, 2022 8:40 PM

Title: Re: The Eye

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Fri Mar 4, 2022 11:02 AM

Title: Re: Match the Buddha's teachings

Content:

Hi, welcome to Dhamma Wheel.

I have a couple of suggestions regarding your videos.

Firstly, when a block of text is being displayed it would be better to let it stand for a few seconds longer so that viewers can read it all without needing to pause the video.

Secondly, it would be better to add subtitles since some of the Burmese monks speak heavily-accented English that's hard to understand.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Fasting for uposatha...

Content:

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 12:50 PM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

This doesn't conflict with what Dza Patrul was quoted as saying. Patrul wouldn't accept that he's mixing up vice and virtue. Rather, he would claim that one and the same action might be a vice when performed by an aspirant to arahantship or paccekabuddhahood (because it transgresses Hinayāna sīla), but a virtue when performed by a Mahāyāna Bodhisattva (because it's required by the Secondary Vows of a Mahāyāna Bodhisattva's sīla).

The two kinds of sīla are based on wholly different premises. The former is based on complete avoidance of actions of body and speech that are regarded as necessarily arising from defiled states of mind. The latter is based on premises like, "the end justifies the means" and "charity covereth a multitude of sins". For a Mahāyāna Bodhisattva, when the two sīlas conflict, conformity to the Secondary Vows is adjudged the virtuous course.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 1:12 PM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

This too is irrelevant, for the quotation from Dza Patrul isn't a Vajrayāna teaching. That is, it's neither a Tantric teaching nor an exposition of a common Mahāyāna teaching from a Tantric perspective. Rather, it's an exposition of a common Mahāyāna teaching (i.e., the Secondary Vows) from a common Mahāyāna perspective.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 4:17 PM

Title: Re: how many brahmas are there at present?

Content:

The Baka Jātaka has 10,000 Brahmās attaining arahatta, so that gives you a minimum figure. I don't know of any data for a maximum figure.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 8:03 PM

Title: Re: Why does Vasavatti not stop Mara?

Content:

There are two reasons.

The first is that if Vasavattī tried to launch an assault on the territory held by Māra and

his host, then he would probably lose. One must bear in mind here that the geo-political status of Māra's territory in Paranimittavasavattī is not that of a sovereign enclave, like the Vatican City State in Italy or Lesotho in South Africa, but rather, that of a pene-exclave. A pene-exclave is territory that's located in country A and belongs to country A, but is only accessible from country B. An example in the human realm would be Kleinwalsertal, an Alpine valley in Austria. It belongs to Austria but you can't get to it from Austria because the Alps are in the way. Instead, you need to drive to Germany and enter via the Bavarian town of Oberstdorf. Similarly, if Vasavattī wants to enter Māra's territory, he has to descend to Nimmānaratī and then enter the territory from below. Consequently, if he attempted to attack Māra and his host, then he would face exactly the same tactical disadvantage as Vepacitti and the asuras when they attempt to attack Tāvātimsa from below.

As for the second reason, I'll save that for another day.

By the way, you may be wondering why it is that Māra's territory is a pene-exclave and not an enclave. Unlike with Kleinwalsertal there are no whopping great mountains obstructing the way. So why can't Vasavattī travel there directly? A for anyone who can guess the answer.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 9:06 PM

Title: Re: how many brahmas are there at present?

Content:

This one.

<https://suttacentral.net/ja405/en/francis-neil>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

Like Patrul he then goes on to repeat the same claptrap for the rest of the akusala kammāpathas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 10:33 PM

Title: Re: Why does Vasavatti not stop Mara?

Content:

It certainly takes considerable merit to get to one of the six sensual heavens. Having got there, the average deva, though typically somewhat better than the average human, still

has plenty of defilement. Even puthujjana Brahmā devas have, and sensual devas are greatly inferior to these.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Wed May 3, 2023 11:34 PM

Title: Re: Origin of blessing

Content:

It's from the Mahāvihāra's oldest extant paritta collection, variously titled the Parittapotthaka, the Catubhāṇavara or the Pirit Potha. I don't know when it was compiled, but it must predate Buddhaghosa because he includes it in a list of texts that a bhikkhu needs to have memorised before he can be released from dependence on a teacher.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

... then it would no longer involve a breach of the first precept and so would cease to be relevant to the point Asanga wants to make, namely: The end justifies the means and killing people (and the rest of the akusala kammaṭṭhāpāthas) are highly meritorious acts when done by Mahāyāna Bodhisattvas for the right reasons.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Why does Vasavatti not stop Mara?

Content:

No, Māra's retinue resides with Māra. I don't know what kind of relations exist between the Paranimittavasavattī and Nimmānaratī devas.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Fasting for uposatha...

Content:

The commentary takes siyā kukkuccaṃ siyā vipphaṇṇasāro to mean that Bhaddāli is worried that he won't be able to live the brahmacariyā his whole life if he's only permitted a single meal.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 4, 2023 7:14 AM
Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path
Content:

Note that the passage doesn't say that the Bodhisatta will actually be "tortured in hell for four incalculables and 100,000 eons". It just says that his zeal is such that he would be willing to. In fact in the Theravada conception of bodhisattvaship a Bodhisatta is never reborn in hell after receiving his prediction of buddhahood.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 4, 2023 12:35 PM
Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path
Content:
"If anyone carrying around this body were to claim to be healthy even for a moment, what is that due to other than foolishness?"
(Nakulapitasutta, SN22.1)

And so it goes without saying that my health is bad – though much less so than that of almost anyone else I know. Thanks for asking.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 4, 2023 1:17 PM
Title: Re: how many brahmas are there at present?
Content:
I believe so, but I don't think it's common.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Thu May 4, 2023 3:26 PM
Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path
Content:
I don't think you've understood my exchange with Tamdrin.

The phrase "sugarcoating things" was not used in connection with the Bodhisatta path, but in connection with the contrast between Mahāyāna texts that make it sound easy to embark upon as opposed to Theravādin ones that make it sound exceptionally hard.

I get the impression from your last couple of posts that you think I have some problem with bodhisattvaship. If that's so, then you must be confusing me with someone else. Since I've no problem with it at all and have never disputed that its roots lie in the suttas, I don't know why you keep harping on about this.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 3:40 PM

Title: Re: Why does Vasavatti not stop Mara?

Content:

Well tried, but no.

Two clues...

In the suttas what does Māra do when he's animated?

And how do high-ranking devas move about?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 6:15 PM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

If I wish to become a Bodhisattva...

Will I need to be a male human?

Will I need to be a homeless renunciate?

Will I need to have already mastered the eight vimokkhas in this life?

Will I need to be someone whose past development is sufficient for me to attain arahantship in this very life if I chose to pursue this?

Will I need to be someone whose zeal and compassion are such that I can say in good faith: "I shall gladly be tortured in hell for four incalculables and 100,000 eons if bodhisattvaship requires this of me!"

Will I need to appear before a Sammāsambuddha, make known to him my resolve and receive from him a prediction of my eventual buddhahood?

In Theravāda expositions of bodhisattvaship, the answer to each question would be yes. As far as I know, in Mahāyāna expositions the answer would be no.

Or do you know of an exception? Do you know of a Mahāyāna treatise on entrance to the Bodhisattva path in which it's a prerequisite that the aspirant be already a highly accomplished dhammic virtuoso?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Why does Vasavatti not stop Mara?

Content:

But by "devas" I just meant those in the six sensual heavens.

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Thu May 4, 2023 10:03 PM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

It was only the commencement that I was asking about, not the complete path. At which point is a Mahayanist accounted a "Bodhisattva"?

After mahābodhi-praṇidhāna? After undertaking the bodhisattva-saṃvara? When he starts developing the brahmavihāras? After some development of bodhicittotpādaḥ? After some lifetimes of developing the paramitās? After receiving a Buddha's vyākaraṇa?

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 6, 2023 5:41 AM

Title: Re: Fasting for uposatha...

Content:

But whether or not reasons are given, any conscientious monk will assume that the Buddha knew what he was doing, for to assume otherwise would be illogical for one who has taken the Buddha as his refuge and gone forth in his Dhammavinaya.

For further examples see the Medicine chapter of the Mahāvagga.

<https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-kd6/en/brahmali>

Author: Dhammanando

Date: Sat May 6, 2023 6:02 AM

Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path

Content:

Mahayana texts that exhort people to undertake bodhisattvaship give much the same reasons as those which we find in the chapter on Great Compassion in the Paṭisambhidāmagga or in Dhammapāla's Treatise on the Paramīs. None that I've seen contains any hint that it might be fun. They do, however, (pace asahi) present the entrance into bodhisattvaship as a far less demanding undertaking than Pali sources do.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 6, 2023 10:48 AM
Title: Re: perception of anatta has the characteristic...
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 6, 2023 2:12 PM
Title: Re: Bodhisatta Path
Content:

Ajātasattu: “Just as if on being asked about a mango a man were to describe a breadfruit-tree, or on being asked about a breadfruit-tree he were to describe a mango, so Pūraṇa Kassapa, on being asked about the present fruits of the homeless life, explained non-action to me.”
(Sāmaññaphalasutta, DN 2)

Similarly, asahi, upon being asked how and when a non-Bodhisattva becomes a Bodhisattva, spends two posts describing how a novice Bodhisattva becomes a Super-Bodhisattva.

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sat May 6, 2023 2:54 PM
Title: Re: Fasting for uposatha...
Content:

I think it was actually cleared up on Sunday, when Frank kindly posted a link to a page on his blog, on which all or most of the sutta passages relevant to bhojane mataññutā are conveniently collated.

<https://lucid24.org/tped/g/goldcraft/index.html#3.1.1>

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Sun May 7, 2023 9:39 PM
Title: Re: What is scanning? What is the Pali word?
Content:

Author: Dhammanando
Date: Mon Mar 25, 2024 8:22 PM
Title: Re: Looking for Sutta (Anguttara) for Lobha Dosa Moha

Content:

Rāgo kho āvuso appasāvajjo dandhvirāgī, doso mahāsāvajjo khippavirāgī, moho mahāsāvajjo dandhvirāgī.

“Lust, friends, is slightly blameworthy but slow to fade away; hatred is very blameworthy but quick to fade away; delusion is very blameworthy and slow to fade away.”

(Aññatitthiyasutta, AN3.68. Bh. Bodhi tr.)