

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, June 25th, 2021 at 10:18 PM

Title: Re: The Precious Treasury of the Expanse and Awakened Awareness: The Ornaments of the Definitive Secret

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps an example would be apropos. Not that I doubt you, but others may.

mutsuk said:

I just opened the book randomly and put my finger on the page with closed eyes. My finger pointed the last paragraph on p. 751 :

(P. 751) It is the final endpoint to be-accomplished, and therefore it is the fruition. This is what it taken as the path. Therefore, it is called the "fruition path." If we were to categorize that, we can follow after what is said by the great teacher Drenpa Namkha in his Nam mkha' 'phrul mdzod [Treasury of the Magical Display of Space] where it says, "The practitioner of Great Completion who accepts the difference as being self-arising, with a knife cuts the rope of everything to-be-known, and such a practitioner of Great Completion self-liberates everything into the source, the universal ground just as it is. Through that you set up [the mind] on the essential point, namely (p. 752) awakened awareness. Two things are shown. The first has ten schools of thoughts."

The original in tibetan says (vol. II, p. 81) :

de nyid bsgrub bya mthar thug pas 'bras bu yin la/ de lam du byed pa la 'bras bu lam byed pa zhes bya'o/ de la dbye na slob dpon chen po dran pa nam mkhas nam mkha' 'phrul mdzod du bkod pa'i rjes su 'brang nas/ 'dod pa tha dad pa rang shar ba'i rdzogs pa chen pos shes bya 'gris thag bcad pa dang gzhi ci bzhin nyid kyi skye mched du rang grol ba'i rdzogs pa chen pos rig pa gnad la dbab pa dang gnyis su bstan pa las/ dang po la sde bcur yod de/ nam mkha' 'phrul mdzod las/...

But just having a look at the opening homages of the book and the intention of the author following these homages are "good" examples of how problematic these renderings are... I am not criticising the choice of vocabulary (that's a personal choice and taste) but feel rather concerned with the understanding of the grammar.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, even this much somewhat incorrectly rendered:

It is the final endpoint to be-accomplished, and therefore it is the fruition. This is what it taken as the path. Therefore, it is called the "fruition path."

de nyid bsgrub bya mthar thug pas 'bras bu yin la/ de lam du byed pa la 'bras bu lam byed pa zhes bya'o/

It should be something like:

"Since that is culmination of what is to be accomplished, it is the result. That is employed as the path, [hence it is] called "employing the result [as] the path."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, June 25th, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: CoEmergent Wisdom

Content:

Yklah said:

In this sentence, "is not produced dependently", to me that seems to be contradictory to the Buddha's teaching on dependent arising. Can someone help me please ?

Malcolm wrote:

It means that your real nature has always been emptiness, and emptiness is not produced from causes and conditions. To say all phenomena are free from proliferation is to say they are empty of all extremes of being, nonbeing, and so on, in other words they are empty. In the PP Sutras, it states, "Whatever arises in dependence in truth does not arise."

Emptiness, connate, nonarising, are all synonyms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, June 25th, 2021 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: The Precious Treasury of the Expanse and Awakened Awareness: The Ornaments of the Definitive Secret

Content:

mutsuk said:

not to mention the 'gris thag bcad pa ("with a knife cuts the rope of ...") which is obviously to be corrected into gras/gros thag bcad pa (resolve, decide, understand) which Mr Brown could have least had guessed since this quite frequent expression is in dictionaries...

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. In translation, missing by an inch is the same as missing by a mile. Well, you know what they say, caveat emptor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, June 25th, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: CoEmergent Wisdom

Content:

Yklah said:

In this sentence, "is not produced dependently", to me that seems to be contradictory to the Buddha's teaching on dependent arising. Can someone help me please ?

Malcolm wrote:

It means that your real nature has always been emptiness, and emptiness is not produced from causes and conditions. To say all phenomena are free from proliferation is to say they are empty of all extremes of being, nonbeing, and so on, in other words they are empty. In the PP Sutras, it states, "Whatever arises in dependence in truth does not arise."

Emptiness, connate, nonarising, are all synonyms.

Crazywisdom said:

Coemergent comes from the Mahamudra group. And it's connected to those instructions for examining the mind. What you are describing is just emptiness from a sutra standpoint. Coemergent as a term has Mahamudra tantra origins.

Malcolm wrote:

I provided citations from one of the tantras that serve as the locus classicus for sahaja, the Hevajra Tantra, above. I've already pointed out that this term is complex. For example, there is a connate of the cause, the connate of the path, and the connate of the result, as detailed by Dombi Heruka in his Sahajasiddhi. According to him, the cause, the mind itself, is the connate nonarising reality of entities. And I provided a Saraha citation as well. So, basically, your objection is unnecessary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Can lab-grown brains become conscious? Answer: We don't care

Content:

Queequeg said:

Four types of birth - womb, egg, moisture, spontaneous

If an entity is aware, why wouldn't it be considered sentient? The manner of its genesis would seem to be a secondary characteristic, with awareness being primary.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, there is no fifth birth, manufactured.

Define "awareness."

Are Venus Fly Traps aware? Plants in genera? Does reaction to external stimuli constitute awareness?

How does a consciousness seeking rebirth appropriate brain tissue in a vat?

If you are suggesting that a machine could suddenly become conscious, how is this different than the materialist claim that consciousness is merely an epiphenomenon of having a brain?

Queequeg said:

I'll work backwards on your questions.

Asking how this is different than a materialist claim is premature.

We need to define some terms here - by machine, are we talking about engineered, lab created biological "beings" (I'll put that in quotation marks for now because we're not sure if they are beings (sattva)), or are we talking about some sort of electronic computer made with silicon circuits and chips and processors, maybe with robotic means of action? Either way, if such a thing was conscious (difficult to answer as that would go to the heart of the Hard Question), at the least, we'd have some re-evaluation to do - along the lines of Jambudvīpa v. the reality of Earth evaluation.

Malcolm wrote:

I define a machine as any engineered device, whether biological or mechanical, that performs a specific function for which it was designed.

Queequeg said:

One option would be to admit defeat to the materialists. Then we'd all be materialists. Another might involve asking and investigating a variation involving your second question... how does a consciousness seeking rebirth end up in a robot? I don't particularly see why rebirth as a robot is not possible.

Malcolm wrote:

How would it be conceived?

Queequeg said:

Regarding your second question, I'd suggest a consciousness seeking rebirth that appropriates brain tissue in a vat had the causes and conditions to end up there.

Malcolm wrote:

Then explain those: in the case of four kinds of birth you mention, the process of conception is quite well described. Consciousness in three kinds of birth appropriate reproductive material from parents at the moment they meet. Since there are no mating parents for a brain in a vat, not sure how that can work.

Queequeg said:

Your first question - what do I mean by awareness - By "awareness" I'm taking that phenomenon we are working toward realizing in contemplative practice - Buddhānā, Tathāgatagarbha, Amala Vijnana, Sunyata, etc.



Malcolm wrote:

Why? What is special about awareness as distinct from consciousness? When one is conscious, one is aware; when is unconscious, one is unaware. One cannot be aware and be unconscious.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

Queequeg said:

The relative anonymity here promotes that. Its the egalitarianism of anonymity.

Malcolm wrote:

In my opinion, anonymity leads to irresponsibility. We are a Dharma forum. We should use our proper names, as do I.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 3:32 AM

Title: Re: CoEmergent Wisdom

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness, connate, nonarising, are all synonyms.

SilenceMonkey said:

Would this also apply to co-emergent (connate) ignorance?

Malcolm wrote:

No, that is ignorance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 5:22 AM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

In my opinion, anonymity leads to irresponsibility. We are a Dharma forum. We should use our proper names, as do I.

reiun said:

A name is just a label.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course, but some labels allow us to escape responsibility to others for our

actions; while others do not. Personally, I don't value the comments of anonymous users as highly as those who use their real names. Of course, there are a number of people here who I actually know in meat space, so that is a little different, and some people have legitimate reasons for not using their real name. But most of us, men especially, have no reason not to use our real names.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 5:28 AM

Title: Re: Can lab-grown brains become conscious? Answer: We don't care

Content:

Queequeg said:

If the phenomena is obvious but doesn't fit the preordained categories, then its the categories that need to give.

Malcolm wrote:

The phenomena has not even happened yet. There are no sentient brains sitting in vats that were grown from stem cells, AFAIK.

I don't think it will ever happen, personally because I don't think vat birth will ever happen.

A better question is this: how is it that a consciousness appropriates an egg that is fertilized in vitro. Now that is an interesting question, and one requiring no speculation, since we know it occurs. I know a couple of kids like that, they are just as normal as every other kid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

"Life is suffering" is the glass-half-empty view and it taints the public perception of the dharma and (I would argue) the world-view of many students of the dharma. (And before you all jump up and say, "No it doesn't! Life is suffering!!" think how circular that might be.)

I would love us to have a better answer than that, to have a plain-English version of the First Noble Truth which reflects the deeper understanding that some of us have been working towards for years.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Birth, aging, illness, and death are suffering. Can you find any birth, aging, illness, and

death that are not suffering? Maitreya stated that isn't even a pinpoint of happiness anywhere in the three realms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

reiun said:

I'll bet you have a good definition of "real".

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the name on their driver's license.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 8:31 PM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

Inedible said:

I guess my point is that unless there is some official way for titles to be verified and given a status here, that it would be better not to have them. If only to protect idiots like me from the bad karma from assuming they aren't real and they just like the attention.

Malcolm wrote:

In fact, it was the attempt on Esangha to get people posing as ordained people on the forum, lama so and so, zen master x, bhiksu sunya, etc., that brought created the most trouble and bad feelings. Why? Because when they presented spurious or otherwise unverifiable information, we had to curtail their participation. A number of zen priests argued they were every bit as much ordained as a fully ordained bhikshu. We did not accept this position, and I still don't. But it lead to a lot of bad feeling.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 8:34 PM

Title: Re: Four Maras

Content:

Yklah said:

Hi everyone,

According to Buddhism, there are four maras: the mara of Yama the Lord of Death, the mara of the kleshas, the mara of the contaminated aggregates and the mara of the son of the deva.

I have read many times that the mara of the son of the deva makes reference to the

obstructor, the tempter that attempted to obstruct Prince Siddhartha from attaining full enlightenment. To me, this mara is very similar to the christian concept of Satan.

At some times, I have also found that this type of mara, the son of the deva, symbolizes our craving for pleasure, satisfaction and convenience.

This being the case, my question is: which meaning is correct for the mara of the son of the deva?

Malcolm wrote:

Devaputra mara refers of Kamadeva, the ruler of the highest desire realm devas. Kamadeva is the Indian analogue of Cupid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

Inedible said:

I guess my point is that unless there is some official way for titles to be verified and given a status here, that it would be better not to have them. If only to protect idiots like me from the bad karma from assuming they aren't real and they just like the attention.

Malcolm wrote:

In fact, it was the attempt on Esangha to get people posing as ordained people on the forum, lama so and so, zen master x, bhiksu sunya, etc., that brought created the most trouble and bad feelings. Why? Because when they presented spurious or otherwise unverifiable information, we had to curtail their participation. A number of zen priests argued they were every bit as much ordained as a fully ordained bhikshu. We did not accept this position, and I still don't. But it lead to a lot of bad feeling.

FiveSkandhas said:

It seems to me that one way to cut through this problem would be to get people to use the titles granted to them in the language of their tradition. Soto and Rinzai Zen both have very complex hierarchical ranking systems; if somebody is officially certified in one of these traditions they should have a rank. Which they should use.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a major difference between this forum and E-Sangha. At its peak that latter had 50,000 users. There were child predators and charlatans, people posing as teachers, etc. It was a major headache. This is why we felt we had to institute standards. At one point, I even had a to call the FBI to deal with a pedophile. Then Jundo decided to threaten to sue us, and forum began to split up. When it crashed, and the backups were lost in the process, that was the end of it. Then David copied E-Sangha, and opened Dhammawheel, then Dharmawheel.

As for titles, that's fine, but that presented another problem, especially with Zen. American Zen is not Japanese Zen, and often there is no official recognition of Zen teachers by Japanese institutions.

Also, in Tibetan Buddhism, there is no official system for handing out titles other than Geshe, Khenpo, and Tulku. It is all ad hoc. There are no official qualifications for assuming the title "Lama" other than being given the title by one's teacher or, as is often the case, moving to America and calling oneself Lama x (this is called ocean promotion). The exception to this is Geshe and Khenpo, these are rigorous 12-14 year programs, with official degrees, ranks, etc. But there are no geshe and khenpos here as far as I know.

Of course, I have various certificates from various teachers, the Kazhipa degree given to me by HH Sakya Trizen; the title *ācārya* (slob dpon) in the Sakya school granted to me by the Buddhist Chaplain of Harvard, and former administrative head for all Sakya monasteries in India; another is the "lama" title granted to me by the Nyingma abbot of a small Himalayan monastery in Solu Kumbhu region who resides in New Orleans when he is not in Nepal; and my Tibetan Medical degree from Shang Shung, etc. but I don't use those here, just as I do not advertise my teaching here (or anywhere, for that matter).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 9:49 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

rai said:

so some students have received Dzogchen teachings without following any particular cycle.

what would be benefits of progressing through the path within the particular cycle of teachings? does a cycle carry some particular blessings that make things move smoother towards liberation etc. ?

Malcolm wrote:

Dzogchen is Dzogchen, that's the main point, not the name of a cycle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, June 26th, 2021 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

That's why suffering often isn't the right word to use. It makes it seem like it's impossible to enjoy anything in life because of a constant state of agony or something.

Of course Buddhism can be used to alleviate dukkha and find a more happy, fulfilling and rich experience in our lives in society. It just won't ever be perfect, no matter how we try. And the imperfections cause us dukkha.

Malcolm wrote:

"Bhikkhus, all is burning. And what is the all that is burning?

"The eye is burning, forms are burning, eye-consciousness is burning, eye-contact is burning, also whatever is felt as pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant that arises with eye-contact for its indispensable condition, that too is burning. Burning with what? Burning with the fire of lust, with the fire of hate, with the fire of delusion. I say it is burning with birth, aging and death, with sorrows, with lamentations, with pains, with griefs, with despairs.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn35/sn35.028.nymo.html>

Any questions?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, June 27th, 2021 at 12:39 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

That's why suffering often isn't the right word to use. It makes it seem like it's impossible to enjoy anything in life because of a constant state of agony or something.

Of course Buddhism can be used to alleviate dukkha and find a more happy, fulfilling and rich experience in our lives in society. It just won't ever be perfect, no matter how we try. And the imperfections cause us dukkha.

Malcolm wrote:

"Bhikkhus, all is burning. And what is the all that is burning?

"The eye is burning, forms are burning, eye-consciousness is burning, eye-contact is burning, also whatever is felt as pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant that arises with eye-contact for its indispensable condition, that too is burning. Burning with what? Burning with the fire of lust, with the fire of hate, with the fire of delusion. I say it is burning with birth, aging and death, with sorrows, with lamentations, with pains, with griefs, with despairs.

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn35/sn35.028.nymo.html>

Any questions?

Queequeg said:

But a fire is neutral. It can be painful to the one who is burned, and because we chase our tails through samsara we are constantly playing with fire and getting burnt we can say, fire: bad. Being stupid with fire is dangerous.

This is a hinayana presentation that implies an abstemious posture toward it all. Well, 4NT is a hinayana teaching.

I'm not sure Mahayana quite approaches it the same way.

Malcolm wrote:

It most certainly does, citations to come.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, June 27th, 2021 at 1:54 AM

Title: Re: Formally Addressing Forum Users

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

But I would also note that the most divisive poster I can think of here was undeniably, verifiably authorized to teach in a recognized Japanese lineage. Didn't stop him from being wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

If its who I think it was, he was disowned by the very same lineage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, June 27th, 2021 at 8:25 PM

Title: Re: The Precious Treasury of the Expanse and Awakened Awareness: The Ornaments of the Definitive Secret

Content:

gelukman said:

Well the translators have in this case decided to use these words.

Of course it may not please the bibliophiles or poets.

Practitioners practice and keep it simple.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is this: these translations are not peer-reviewed. They are self-published.

Mutsuk is not criticizing them purely out of spite, but rather out of a concern that practitioners have accurate information at their disposal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, June 27th, 2021 at 10:33 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

LL\_C0016937.jpg

It's worth remembering that while the Dharma is eternal, from a historical perspective life certainly was pervaded by a lot more raw, in-your-face misery for most humans in ancient and medieval Asia than it is for the postmodern member of the developed world.

Personally i don't see the need to read a statement like "life is suffering" in a fundamentalist/literalist mode. When we read it more heuristically it can take on any number of nuances...I always read it in the sense of "life is pervaded by suffering." And danger lurks around every corner as a potential.

Malcolm wrote:

Kim is fighting with a figment. Buddha never said "life is suffering," he said "sarva dukkham," all is suffering. Then you have to discern what is the "all" to which he is referring. The all to which he is referring is the six sense gates.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The etymology of term to suffer:

suffer (v.)

mid-13c., "allow to occur or continue, permit, tolerate, fail to prevent or suppress," also "to be made to undergo, endure, be subjected to" (pain, death, punishment, judgment, grief), from Anglo-French *suffrir*, Old French *sofrir* "bear, endure, resist; permit, tolerate, allow" (Modern French *souffrir*), from Vulgar Latin *\*sufferire*, variant of Latin *sufferre* "to bear, undergo, endure, carry or put under," from sub "up, under" (see sub-) + *ferre* "to carry, bear," from PIE root *\*bher-* (1) "to carry," also "to bear children."

<https://www.etymonline.com/word/suffer>

Unknown said:

suffering (n.)

"patient enduring of pain, inconvenience, loss, etc.," mid-14c.; "undergoing of punishment, affliction, etc.," late 14c., verbal noun from suffer (v.). Meaning "a painful condition, pain felt" is from late 14c.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.etymonline.com/search?q=suffering>



Hence the suitability of translating dukkha as suffering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Four Maras

Content:

Yklah said:

In this case then, like human sentient beings, the life span of Kamadeva has a limit, right?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Yklah said:

Therefore, Kamadeva, before being a deva, may be was a human being, or one of the other six classes of samsaric beings, right?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Yklah said:

It seems interesting to me thinking about, for example, that the Kamadeva that tried to obstruct Guru Krakucchandra from attaining full enlightenment is a different one from the one that tried to obstruct Guru Shakyamuni .

Malcolm wrote:

It is very possible, but these gods, like Indra, Brahma, and so on, are not persons, they are positions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 4:25 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

Apologies if this is covered already elsewhere...there's over 300 pages on Ngondro and I haven't been able to read each post.

That said, what is the importance and benefit of completing Ngondro for everyday folk, not young monks and nuns who may be able finish in a shorter while? How many of you have done one, or even more Ngondro's? I'm not asking because I doubt the purpose, but I would like to hear others thoughts on why not skipping it is of value.

Malcolm wrote:

No one ever completes ngondro. It is just not like that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 5:09 AM

Title: Re: 108 Kleshas

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

The number 108 seems to have been arrived at through the following additions and multiplications:

What are the six feelings? The feelings born of sense-impression through eye, ear, nose, tongue, body and mind.

What are the eighteen feelings? There are the (above) six feelings by which there is an approach (to the objects) in gladness; and there are six approaches in sadness and there are six approaches in equanimity.

What are the thirty six feelings? There are six feelings of gladness based on the household life and six based on renunciation; six feelings of sadness based on the household life and six based on renunciation; six feelings of equanimity based on the household life and six based on renunciation.

What are the hundred and eight feelings? There are the (above) thirty six feelings of the past; there are thirty six of the future and there are thirty six of the present.

Source:

Vedana-Samyutta, from the Samyutta Nikaya

Malcolm wrote:

Those are not afflictions, those are sensations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 7:26 PM

Title: Re: Four Maras

Content:

Yklah said:

In this case then, like human sentient beings, the life span of Kamadeva has a limit, right?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Yklah said:

Therefore, Kamadeva, before being a deva, may be was a human being, or one of the other six classes of samsaric beings, right?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes.

Yklah said:

It seems interesting to me thinking about, for example, that the Kamadeva that tried to obstruct Guru Krakucchandra from attaining full enlightenment is a different one from the one that tried to obstruct Guru Shakyamuni .

Malcolm wrote:

It is very possible, but these gods, like Indra, Brahma, and so on, are not persons, they are positions.

amanitamusc said:

Are you saying they are sentient beings that fill these certain positions?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

Apologies if this is covered already elsewhere...there's over 300 pages on Ngondro and I haven't been able to read each post.

That said, what is the importance and benefit of completing Ngondro for everyday folk, not young monks and nuns who may be able finish in a shorter while? How many of you have done one, or even more Ngondro's? I'm not asking because I doubt the purpose, but I would like to hear others thoughts on why not skipping it is of value.

Malcolm wrote:

No one ever completes ngondro. It is just not like that.

TharpaChodron said:

Oh, indeed. I'm not waiting for my girl scout badge for completing Ngondro.

Malcolm wrote:

All one gets for doing ngondro is a participation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Once again, you do not (and can not) establish any connection between 'dukkha' and 'suffering' by quoting definitions or origins of 'suffering' which do not mention 'dukkha'.

Malcolm wrote:

duHkha 1 mfn. (according to grammarians properly written %duS-kha) and said to be from %dus and %kha [cf. %su-kha4]; but more probably a Pra1kritized form for %duH-stha q.v.) uneasy, uncomfortable, unpleasant, difficult R. Hariv. (compar. %{-tara} MBh. R.); n. (ifc. f. %A) uneasiness, pain, sorrow, trouble, difficulty S3Br. xiv, 7, 2, 15 Mn. MBh. &c. (personified as the son of Naraka and Vedana1 VP.); (%am) ind. with difficulty, scarcely, hardly (also %at and %ena) MBh. R.; impers. it is difficult to or to be (inf.with an acc. or nom. R. vii, 6, 38 Bhag. v, 6); %duHkham - %as, to be sad or uneasy Ratn. iv, 19/20; - %kR, to cause or feel pain Ya1jn5. ii, 218 MBh. xii, 5298.

2 duHkha 2 Nom. P. %{-khati}, to pain SaddhP.

3 duHkhabahula mfn. full of trouble and pain W.

4 duHkhabhAgin mfn. having pain as one's portion, unhappy Mn. iv, 157.

5 duHkhabhAj mfn. id. Ven2is. iv, 110/111,

6 duHkhabheSaja mf(%l)n. healing woe (Kr2ishn2a) MBh. xii, 1624.

7 duHkhAbhijJa mfn. familiar with pain or sorrow MBh. i, 745.

8 duHkhabodha mfn. difficult to be understood Nya1yas. i, 1, 37.

9 duHkhAcAra mfn. difficult to be dealt with, hard to manage MBh. iv, 274.

10 duHkhacArin mfn. going with pain, distressed R. iii, 23, 14.

11 duHkhacchedya mfn. to be cut or overcome with difficulty Hit. iv, 24.

12 duHkhacchinna mfn. cut with difficulty, tough, hard; pained, distressed W.

13 duHkhadagdha mfn. ` " burnt by affliction " , pained, distressed W.

14 duHkhadohyA f. difficult to be milked (cow) L.

15 duHkhaduHkha n. (instr.) with great difficulty Megh. 90; %{-tA} f. the uneasiness connected with pain SaddhP.

16 duHkhaduHkhin mfn. having sorrow upon sorrow BhP. xi, 11, 19.

17 duHkhagata n. adversity, calamity MBh. xii, 5202.

18 duHkhagraha mfn. difficult to be conceived Ratn. iv, 13/14.

19 duHkhahan mfn. removing pain W.

20 duHkhajAta mfn. suffering pain, distressed Pa1n2. 4-1, 52 Va1rtt. 5 Pat. ; vi, 2, 170.

21 duHkhajlvin mfn. living in pain or distress Mn. xi, 9.

22 duHkhakara mf(%l)n. causing pain to (gen.), afflicting MBh. i, 6131.

23 duHkhAkara m. a multitude of sorrows Das3.

24 duHkhakArin mfn. id. Ratn. iv, 16/17.

25 duHkhAkR to cause pain, afflict, distress S3is3. ii, 11.

26 duHkhAkula mfn. filled with sorrow Katha1s.

27 duHkhalabdhika f. ` " gained with difficulty " , N. of a princess Katha1s.

28 duHkhalavya mfn. hard to be cut or pierced (aim) Ba1lar. iv, 11.

29 duHkhAliDha mfn. consumed with grief MW.

30 duHkhaloka m. ` " the world of pain " (= %saMsAra) L. [483,3]

- 31 duHkhamaraNa mfn. having a painful death , Ma1latim. viii , 8/9.
- 32 duHkhamaya mf(%{i})n. consisting in suffering ; %{-tva} n. Sa1h.
- 33 duHkhamoha m. perplexity from pain or sorrow , despair Das3.
- 34 duHkhamokSa m. deliverance from pain MW.
- 35 duHkhAnarha mfn. deserving no pain MBh. iii , 998.
- 36 duHkhanivaha mfn. carrying pain with or after it , painful (thirst) BhP. ix , 19 , 16 ; m. a multitude of pains or evils ib. iii , 9 , 9.
- 37 duHkhAnta m. ` " the end of pain or trouble " , (with the Ma7he7s3varas) final emancipation Madhus.
- 38 duHkhAnvita mfn. accompanied with pain , filled with grief. distressed W.
- 39 duHkhaparItAGga mfn. whose limbs are surrounded or filled with pain MBh. ; %{-tA7tman} mfn. whose soul is affected with anguish ib.
- 40 duHkhapAtra n. a vessel or receptacle (= object) for sorrow Jain.
- 41 duHkhaprAya or mfn. full of trouble and pain W.
- 42 duHkhArta mfn. visited by pain , distressed MBh. i , 1860.
- 43 duHkhasAgara m. ` " ocean of pain " , great sorrow ; the world W.
- 44 duHkhasamAyukta mfn. accompanied , with pain , affected by anguish MW.
- 45 duHkhasaMcAra mfn. passing unhappily (time) R. iii , 22 , 10.
- 46 duHkhasaMsparza mfn. unpleasant to the touch MBh. v , 2046.
- 47 duHkhasaMstithi mfn. in a wretched condition , poor , miserable W.
- 48 duHkhasaMvardhita mfn. reared with difficulty W.
- 49 duHkhasaMyoga m. = %{duHkha-yoga} W.
- 50 duHkhAsika f. a condition of uneasiness or discomfort Subh. 156 Ka1d.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, June 28th, 2021 at 9:50 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Queequeg said:

If we really want, we can appropriate the term "suffering" for dukkha and make it "Buddhist". That involves teaching people what Buddhists mean by suffering.

Words like karma and mantra have worked into the lexicon. Its not out of the realm of possibility for Buddhist discourse to eventually exert an influence on the English language as it has for Asian languages.

Malcolm wrote:

I doubt dukha is going to make much headway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 12:04 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

The word suffering is intense!

Malcolm wrote:

It really means "to endure what is not pleasant."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 12:46 AM

Title: Re: 5 Precepts

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

In Tibetan Buddhism, is there a place for the 5 Precepts? Do Tibetan Buddhism practitioners take up the 5 precepts as part of their ethical conduct or just do it exclusively when one is fully ready to take the commit (meaning that the vast majority choose not to follow it)?

Malcolm wrote:

When one goes for refuge, one receives the five pratimokṣa vows to not take life, not take what is not given, to not lie, to not engage in sexual misconduct, and to avoid intoxicants.

One can observe one of these, not taking life; two, three, or all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Minobu said:

I recall suchness in the Gompa being a word that brought about a huge discussion.

All Rinpoche said to an English teacher who was present...

Well it was your people that translated and used it this way..

suchness...another fun word...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it translates tathāta. Tathā means, quite literally, "that" or "such." The "ta" is equivalent to "-ness."

The Tibetan is little better: de bzhin nyid, literally "like that itself."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 5:05 AM

Title: Re: Four Maras

Content:

amanitamusc said:

Are you saying they are sentient beings that fill these certain positions?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Tenma said:

Would this explain why Yeshe Tsogyal's past incarnations are said to have been the goddesses Ganga and Saraswati? Is the "being" fulfilling the role of Ganga, this sister of Lord Shiva, always changing and likewise Shiva? Would Saraswati be a "position" or a more "solid being" such as Avalokiteshvara, Tara, etc.?

Since the Karandavyuha Sutra mentions Brahma, Indra, Varuna, and all sorts of gods arising from the body of Avalokiteshvara, are they supposed to be literal beings that arose from the body, "conceptions/roles/positions" that arose from a certain "essence," or what? Is the position of "Prithvi," the Earth itself, always changing?

Would Hindus agree with these viewpoints of "Indra" constantly changing, "Ganga" constantly changing, etc? Or would they object and stay solid to the idea that Lord Shiva has always been the same "being" this entire time?

And finally, could you please cite where these explanations could be found? Thank you!

Malcolm wrote:

For example, Svetaketu is a deva in Tushita. All future buddhas will be Svetaketu in Tushita before their final birth as a buddha.

Khenpo Ngalo, a teacher of HH Sakya Trichen, writes:

Furthermore, it is said that countless people have become Indra and cakravartins as result of the virtue of having perceived the Buddha and thrown a single flower into the sky.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 10:04 AM

Title: Re: Manipulating thoughts versus meditation

Content:

LastLegend said:

Well if empty nature is no thing yet not obstructed or concealed, whatever arises from it is after. But you are right not attached to before or after.

jimmi said:

Is empty nature no thing? I don't know.

If empty nature is no thing, how does any thing arise from it?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Nothing does.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 9:11 PM

Title: Re: The Lankavatarasutra in early Indian Madhyamaka Literature

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Lindtner's assertion can just as easily, and more reasonably explained by the authors of the Lanka incorporating passages from MMK and other works, since the Lanka is certainly later than MMK, etc.

Aemilius said:

THE LANKAVATARASUTRA

IN EARLY INDIAN MADHYAMAKA LITERATURE

Christian Lindtner, Copenhagen, Asiaticke Studier, XLV, 1 (1992), pp.244-279

Article of Lindtner where he shows how Nagarjuna, Aryadeva and others are actually quoting from Lankavatara sutra.

some excerpts:

Close or literal allusions, or even explicit references mentioning the source, i.e. the LS, are to be found in the following early Madhyamaka texts: Madhyamakakarika (MK), Vigrahavyavartanii(W), Yuktisastika (YS), Catuhstava (CS) III (= Acintyastava), Sutrasamuccaya (SS), Bodhicittavivarana (BV), Mahayanavimsika, Bhavasamkranti and Bhavanakrama — all ascribed to Nagarjuna.<sup>6</sup>

In case of Aryadeva we have

the Catuhsataka (CS) and two minor treatises (Taisho 1639 and Taisho 1640) to which I shall revert later.<sup>7</sup>

MK XXIV.7 runs:

atra brumah iunyatydydm na tvam vetsi prayojanam /  
iiinyatdm Sunyatdrtham ca tata evam vihanyase //

Again, as above, an opponent has just (verses 1-6) claimed that Nagarjuna's doctrine of sunyata is problematic. Again we see Nagarjuna introducing his reply by calling upon the authority of a sutra, in this case LS 11.145:

sarvabhavo 'svabhavo hi sadvacanam tathapy asat /



iunyatd<m> iunyatartham vabalo pafyan vidhavati//

In a somewhat archaic fashion the sutra launches a general statement about "a fool" which Nagarjuna specifies by making it refer to a second person (se) in a particular situation (evam), namely his opponent. LS, like MK, mentions, but does not explain the two concepts sunyata and sunyatārtha, Nagarjuna, however, does explain the terms in the sequel, exactly as a sastrakara is expected to do. Apparently he also introduces a third concept not mentioned in the LS verse: the prayojana of sunyata. But this is only apparently. The LS says that all things lack svabhava, including this perfectly true and sound statement itself. As we recall, Nagarjuna expresses exactly the same idea several times elsewhere, above all in W and in this very chapter, verse 18. This is the celebrated stanza:  
yah prafityasamutpadah Sunyatam torn pracaksmahe /  
sd prajnapiti upadaya pratipat saiva madhyamam //

This verse, in other words, is an explanation of what Nagarjuna understands by the prayojana of sunyata.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: The Lankavatara-sutra in early Indian Madhyamaka Literature

Content:

Aemilius said:

That is exactly what Lindtner shows to be untrue, i.e. that Lanka would be later than Nagarjuna, Aryadeva and others.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he does not prove this, and in addition, he makes other key errors, such as attributing the bodhicittavivarana to the author of the MMK, when it is clearly a ninth or tenth century composition associated with Guhyasamaja.

Moreover, the Lanka was not translated into Chinese until 443. If the Lanka was quoted in Nagarjuna's Sūtrasamuccaya, I might be inclined to believe this, but it isn't, so I don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: 5 Precepts

Content:

Dharmasheerab said:

In Tibetan Buddhism, is there a place for the 5 Precepts? Do Tibetan Buddhism practitioners take up the 5 precepts as part of their ethical conduct or just do it exclusively when one is fully ready to take the commit (meaning that the vast majority choose not to follow it)?

Malcolm wrote:

When one goes for refuge, one receives the five pratimokṣa vows to not take life, not take what is not given, to not lie, to not engage in sexual misconduct, and to avoid intoxicants.

One can observe one of these, not taking life; two, three, or all.

PadmaVonSamba said:

When I took refuge (kagyu) the 5 were not included. So, it may vary with tradition/teacher

Malcolm wrote:

No, it does not vary between Tibetan tradition to Tibetan since we are all Mulasarvadvādhins.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Hazel said:

Removed excessive quotation.

Edit: And removed discussion about it.

Feel free to add links to definitions and/or copy and paste small excerpts (with a link) if you want to share.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali\\_query.py?qs=dukkha&searchhws=yes](https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=dukkha&searchhws=yes)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, June 29th, 2021 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: 5 Precepts

Content:

Dharmasheṛab said:

What is the mentality in Tibetan Buddhism about taking these precepts in relation to taking your own initiative? Do you always have to wait for your Lama to take initiative to give the precepts and till then one does not follow them and continue killing, stealing etc till the Lama tells otherwise. From the practitioner's point of view in Tibetan Buddhism do followers take a passive stance and not take his own initiative to take up the 5 Precepts?

Malcolm wrote:

People can, under their own initiative, follow which ever of the pratimokṣa vows they feel they can keep. Please refer to the fourth chapter of the Abhidharmakośabhaṣyaṃ.

Dharmasherab said:

Is there a reason you referred to these as 'vows' and not 'precepts'? Why did you use the word 'Pratimoksa' to refer to the 5 Precepts?

Malcolm wrote:

The term in Sanskrit is "saṃvara," in Tibetan "sdom." These two terms mean "restraint." Pratimokṣa means "personal liberation." Pratimokṣa saṃvara therefore means "the restraints one adopts for personal liberation."

Definition of precept

1 : a command or principle intended especially as a general rule of action

2 : an order issued by legally constituted authority to a subordinate official

Definition of vow (noun)

: a solemn promise or assertion

specifically : one by which a person is bound to an act, service, or condition

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 12:13 AM

Title: Re: The Lankavatarasutra in early Indian Madhyamaka Literature

Content:

Aemilius said:

That is exactly what Lindtner shows to be untrue, i.e that Lanka would be later than Nagarjuna, Aryadeva and others.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he does not prove this, and in addition, he makes other key errors, such as attributing the bodhicittavivarana to the author of the MMK, when it is clearly a ninth or tenth century composition associated with Guhyasamaja.

Moreover, the Lanka was not translated into Chinese until 443. If the Lanka was quoted in Nagarjuna's Sūtrasammucaya, I might be inclined to believe this, but it isn't, so I don't. Actually, I was wrong, the Lanka is mentioned in the Sūtrasammucaya, but even here, there is some difficulty, since the Lanka's gatha section predicts Nāgārjuna, and thereby portions of the Lanka definitely date later than Nāgārjuna himself. One would can run the Tibetan or Sanskrit texts of the Lanka through the Buddhanexus program, and find out specifically which verses in Nāgārjuna's works match, and then see whether which phrases are in which part of the Lanka, and whether they date from before or after Nāgārjuna. The Lanka was not compiled in a day, but like other Mahāyāna sūtras shows considerable evidence of multiple layers of composition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Upcoming translations of Bon texts

Content:

fckw said:

So, where have you been able to get the book from? I'm asking because I was not able to have a look at the quality of the translation myself, since I have not yet found any seller who actually has this book available.

mutasuk said:

Book Depository.

Malcolm wrote:

Amazon

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Garchen Rinpoche Yangzab Empowerment

Content:

bryandavis said:

Tsewang Dzinpa is an anuyoga system with ati view.

Malcolm wrote:

Everything that is anuyoga has an ati view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 6:59 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Hazel said:

Removed excessive quotation.

Edit: And removed discussion about it.

Feel free to add links to definitions and/or copy and paste small excerpts (with a link) if you want to share.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali\\_query.py?qs=dukkha&searchhws=yes](https://dsal.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/app/pali_query.py?qs=dukkha&searchhws=yes)

Kim O'Hara said:

Thanks, Malcolm.

The link, for those still following the discussion, is the PTS dictionary's definition of dukkha. The key points in it, from my POV, are these two paragraphs, and particularly the two sentences I have made bold text: B. (nt.; but pl. also dukkhā, e. g. S i.23; Sn 728; Dh 202, 203, 221. Spelling dukha (after sukha) at Dh 83, 203). There is no word in English covering the same ground as Dukkha does in Pali. Our modern words are too

specialised, too limited, and usually too strong. Sukha & dukkha are ease and dis-ease (but we use disease in another sense); or wealth and illth from well & ill (but we have now lost illth); or wellbeing and ill-ness (but illness means something else in English). We are forced, therefore, in translation to use half synonyms, no one of which is exact. Dukkha is equally mental & physical. Pain is too predominantly physical, sorrow too exclusively mental, but in some connections they have to be used in default of any more exact rendering. Discomfort, suffering, ill, and trouble can occasionally be used in certain connections. Misery, distress, agony, affliction and woe are never right. They are all much too strong & are only mental (see Mrs. Rh. D. Bud. Psy. 83-86, quoting Ledi Sadaw).

I. Main Points in the Use of the Word. -- The recognition of the fact of Dukkha stands out as essential in early Buddhism. In the very first discourse the four so-called Truths or Facts (see *saccāni*) deal chiefly with dukkha. The first of the four gives certain universally recognised cases of it, & then sums them up in short. The five groups (of physical & mental qualities which make an individual) are accompanied by ill so far as those groups are fraught with āsavas and grasping. ...

The PTS goes on to give sources for the second paragraph (which I might look at again after such a long gap) and then, as Heather noted, on and on and on, less usefully for most of us.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Suffer means to bear difficulty, pain, anguish, sorrow and so on. Seems like a perfect equivalent to me, apart from the *samskara dukkha*, which is not properly a kind of pain, but the general impermanence of formations. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

So if we Buddhists here can't, even when pushed, put those Sanskrit and Pali terms into other, i.e. English, words, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all. ...

Malcolm wrote:

And when we reject perfectly adequate equivalents (*dukkha* = suffering) which everyone understands immediately, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 8:49 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

So if we Buddhists here can't, even when pushed, put those Sanskrit and Pali terms into other, i.e. English, words, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all. ...

Malcolm wrote:

And when we reject perfectly adequate equivalents (dukkha = suffering) which everyone understands immediately, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all...

PadmaVonSamba said:

It's very simple.

Mind is either at peace or it is not.

The specific details, range of pervasiveness, intensity, causes of a stirring mind are all secondary considerations.

Whatever the mind is when it's not at peace is dukkha.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because dukkha is suffering, which is anything unpleasant now or in the future that we must bear.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Garchen Rinpoche Yangzab Empowerment

Content:

bryandavis said:

And.... do you play the keyboard or synth? Lol. I had a prophetic dream.

Malcolm wrote:

I used to be a musician, and played everything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

So if we Buddhists here can't, even when pushed, put those Sanskrit and Pali terms into other, i.e. English, words, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all. ...

Malcolm wrote:

And when we reject perfectly adequate equivalents (dukkha = suffering) which everyone understands immediately, it is hard to avoid the thought that we don't understand the dharma very well after all...

Kim O'Hara said:

That suggestion rests on a couple of assumptions which we have been disproving for half of this thread (190 posts and counting).

Malcolm wrote:

That's what you think, but everything is still suffering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

That suggestion rests on a couple of assumptions which we have been disproving for half of this thread (190 posts and counting).

Malcolm wrote:

That's what you think, but everything is still suffering.

Kim O'Hara said:

That's what you think.

I'm prepared to leave it at that, as I said.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

If you think there is something in samsara that is not suffering, you should go for refuge to it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 8:04 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

tingdzin said:

A little arrogant to think that no one ever gained anything from finishing ngondro, no?

"One size fits all" is not a good approach to Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

It's obvious what one gets from doing classic ngondro, one purifies traces and gathers the accumulations. But this is so obvious it hardly bears mentioning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, June 30th, 2021 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Seeker12 said:

I think in some contexts it's appropriate to not simply equate dukkha with suffering, personally. Reason being that in normal parlance, suffering implies acute suffering in the moment, which could be considered to be the type of dukkha called Dukkha-dukkha.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and this is acknowledged in traditional Indian commentaries; that is, the that term "dukha" itself refers to duhkha-duhkha. The other two dukhas are considered dukha because everything pleasant becomes a source of pain, and everything neutral falls apart.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

So like the Sutra:

- 1) nothing arises: non-arising
- 2) then everything arises from mind

Dharma is also arising from mind. The Buddha gave Dharma. But we understand Dharma and that's understanding is from our mind not the Buddha mind anymore.

Malcolm wrote:

You guys love to make the simple complicated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

So like the Sutra:



- 1) nothing arises: non-arising
- 2) then everything arises from mind

Dharma is also arising from mind. The Buddha gave Dharma. But we understand Dharma and that's understanding is from our mind not the Buddha mind anymore.

PadmaVonSamba said:  
Dharma doesn't arise from mind.  
One's understanding of dharma arises from mind.  
That understanding is your Buddha nature.  
In that sense, Buddha arises from mind.  
So, in all your spaghetti reasoning  
There are no tangles after all.

Malcolm wrote:  
There are two kinds of Dharma: the Dharma of realization and the Dharma of scripture.  
There is no third kind. The latter arises from the former. This notion that there is an eternal dharma is just an importation of the Hindu idea of Sanatana Dharma.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 5:31 AM  
Title: Re: The Lankavatarasutra in early Indian Madhyamaka Literature  
Content:  
Aemilius said:  
Study of Bodhicittavivarana by Christian Lindtner

This regrettably neglected text comprises 112 stanzas (anustubh) introduced by a brief prologue in prose. It has sometimes been grouped as a tantric work, but a glance at its contents shows how unwarranted such classification is.

Malcolm wrote:  
He is mistaken. It is a commentary on the Akṣobhyavajra bodhicitta section of the Guhyasamāja.

Aemilius said:  
The Bodhicittavivarana is never mentioned or cited by Buddhapaṇita or Candrakīrti. On the other hand it forms one of the basic authorities for Bhāvya in his most mature work, the Ratnapradīpa.

Malcolm wrote:  
The Ratnapradīpa cannot be by Bhāvavivka since it quotes Candrakīrti's commentary on the Sixty directly:

slob dpon zla ba grags pa'i zhal snga nas |  
thog mtha' med pa'i srid pa ru ||

ma rig gnyid kyis log pa yi ||  
'gro la gang gang snang de nyid ||  
brdzun de rmi lam lta bur 'dod ||

In fact, this text mentions Candrakīrti twelve times.

How Lindtner could have missed this is a mystery, but he is not a very reliable scholar.

Not only this, but the authors he mentions do not cite the Bodhicittavivaraṇa at all, I checked.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

if everything is an illusion and projection, how do fully realized individuals conduct their work to progress towards Buddhahood?

Malcolm wrote:

Fully realized persons are buddhas. There are no other kinds of fully realized persons.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 7:56 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

if everything is an illusion and projection, how do fully realized individuals conduct their work to progress towards Buddhahood?

Malcolm wrote:

Fully realized persons are buddhas. There are no other kinds of fully realized persons.

LastLegend said:

I don't equate a full blown Buddha to this:

Those who get this consciousness to disappear will then destroy the obstructing confusions of the Bodhisattvas of the ten stages. Once this consciousness is gone, then the mind is open and still, quiet, serene and calm, perfectly pure, and enormously stable.

<https://terebess.hu/zen/daman.html>

Malcolm wrote:

Then you don't understand what buddhahood is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 8:19 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

I don't equate a full blown Buddha to this:

Those who get this consciousness to disappear will then destroy the obstructing confusions of the Bodhisattvas of the ten stages. Once this consciousness is gone, then the mind is open and still, quiet, serene and calm, perfectly pure, and enormously stable.

<https://terebess.hu/zen/daman.html>

Malcolm wrote:

Then you don't understand what buddhahood is.

LastLegend said:

Okay try and let me know years later. I probably don't know what Buddhahood is. I have no pre perceptions of how it is. I just know I need to transcend consciousness and there is work to be done after.

Malcolm wrote:

You can't transcend consciousness. You can however transcend afflictive and knowledge obscurations. When you have gone beyond the obscurations of the bodhisattvas of the ten stages, you will be a buddha. If you do not understand this, you do not understand Mahāyāna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 11:35 AM

Title: Re: Information on Tibetan reception of De-bzhin gshegs-pa'i gsang-ba bsam-kyis mi-khyab-pa bstan-pa

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I'm preparing a translation of the Chinese versions of the Tathāgatācintyaguhyā Sūtra. To provide as much of a comprehensive survey as is possible with my limited knowledge of Tibetan, does anyone have information on the Tibetan reception of the sūtra beyond its usage by Candrakīrti? Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

You should run a comparison of it with the tenjur at buddhanexus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

Then he said we can transcend afflictive and knowledge...I am not sure how this is done.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence my comment about your lack of understanding of Mahayana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 9:51 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

Then he said we can transcend afflictive and knowledge...I am not sure how this is done.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence my comment about your lack of understanding of Mahayana.

LastLegend said:

You can be generous and share how's it done.

Malcolm wrote:

Knowledge is not a hindrance. Ignorance is.

First, one generates bodhicitta, the desire to liberate all sentient beings from samsara. This has two aspects, ultimate and relative. The relative aspect refers to the aspiration, and then practicing the six perfections. Ultimate bodhicitta means practicing śamatha and vipaśyanā.

One practices these two bodhicitta together, until one realizes emptiness. This is the first bodhisattva bhumi. One continues to practice, until the practice of vipaśyanā has eradicated all traces of affliction (desire, hatred, and ignorance). This happens conventionally, at the seventh bhumi. Ultimately, has eradicated all traces of grasping to personal and phenomena identity, and one attains the omniscience of buddhahood, this happens when one transitions from being a tenth stage bodhisattva to buddhahood. A buddha is a totally realized person. There is no other kind of totally or fully realized

person.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 10:16 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Hazel said:

Here's something that perplexes me. I am having a hard time seeing the the value in understanding the path after achieving the first bhumi. It's probably a sure bet I wont reach that in this lifetime, so why do I need to know what a bodhisattva practices at the seventh bhumi?

Malcolm wrote:

Because it is necessary to understand what kinds of experiences one will have on the path, even if one has not reached this or that stage.

For this reason, the paths and stages are described in detail, especially in Vajrayāna, where the goal is to attain buddhahood in a single lifetime to benefit sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Hazel said:

Here's something that perplexes me. I am having a hard time seeing the the value in understanding the path after achieving the first bhumi. It's probably a sure bet I wont reach that in this lifetime, so why do I need to know what a bodhisattva practices at the seventh bhumi?

Malcolm wrote:

Because it is necessary to understand what kinds of experiences one will have on the path, even if one has not reached this or that stage.

For this reason, the paths and stages are described in detail, especially in Vajrayāna, where the goal is to attain buddhahood in a single lifetime to benefit sentient beings.

Hazel said:

The latter part about Vajrayana is fair, but since we're in a Mahayana subforum, I'd like to press you on the first part if you're willing to entertain my fancy. Why is it necessary to understand what kinds of experiences one will have on the path, even fi one has not reached a particular stage? I'm unlikely to argue about it, I'm just curious as my lack of

understanding has meant I zone-out to those teachings, which can't be good.

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrayāna is a subdivision of Mahāyāna, not something separate.

It is necessary, because it is a vital part of the our path. If we do not understand these paths and stages, we will not know how to practice them. Zoning out in teachings is not necessarily a bad thing, more often than not it is a sign that we are eliminating traces of ignorance.

We do not want to be like horses with blinders on, only seeing what is directly in front of us on the road. This is not a good way to hear and reflect on the Dharma. Moreover, by hearing of the experiences of the paths and stages, it can cause us to be inspired about the possibility of our attaining them and cause rejoicing in those who have attained them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

Okay. So if we end traces of afflictions and left with pure consciousness, will there be arising thoughts such as they will be snatched by karma? It's still unclear what these causes or traces are. Are they not an illusion to be ended? If nothing arises, how can there be something to end?

Eradicated traces of grasping to personal and phenomena...how? sure there is a link between personal grasping to Nirvana otherwise who is experiencing Nirvana?

Malcolm wrote:

You keep confusing the two truths.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

GrapeLover said:

I recall reading a past conversation where you mentioned that shravaka arhats retain latent afflictive seeds, though they're no longer active—is it correct to think that this contrasts with a 7th bhumi bodhisattva thoroughly eliminating them?

Malcolm wrote:  
Nonafflictive traces of ignorances are retained.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 1st, 2021 at 11:41 PM  
Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism  
Content:

LastLegend said:  
Okay. So if we end traces of afflictions and left with pure consciousness, will there be arising thoughts such as they will be snatched by karma? It's still unclear what these causes or traces are. Are they not an illusion to be ended? If nothing arises, how can there be something to end?

Eradicated traces of grasping to personal and phenomena...how? sure there is a link between personal grasping to Nirvana otherwise who is experiencing Nirvana?

Malcolm wrote:  
You keep confusing the two truths.

LastLegend said:  
Rumor has it they ended afflictions and have no delusional thoughts. If they do arise thoughts, they are snatched by karma. Maybe we can have people attest that.

Malcolm wrote:  
SO you think buddhahood is the same as being insentient?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 12:22 AM  
Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages  
Content:

SilenceMonkey said:  
Imagine a Tibetan master trying to teach Dharma to a conspiracy theorist. Or a hardcore activist. Or a western philosopher. Too much to untangle! It would be much easier to teach someone without all this "education."

Malcolm wrote:  
Ahem, I know quite a few conspiracy theorists, hard core activists, and western philosophers who follow Tibetan masters, they don't seem to have the troubles you are describing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Traditional Tibetan Dharma assumes an undeveloped mind much like a fallow field.

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is completely misguided and wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

Rumor has it they ended afflictions and have no delusional thoughts. If they do arise thoughts, they are snatched by karma. Maybe we can have people attest that.

Malcolm wrote:

SO you think buddhahood is the same as being insentient?

LastLegend said:

Transformation of repository consciousness. Then Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

That is the yogacara theory. When there are no bijas in the ālayavijñāna, it transforms. What are those bijas? The afflictive and knowledge obscuration. When they are exhausted, this ālayavijñāna turns into dharmadhātu gnosis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 6:23 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Speculate all you like. It costs nothing.

But the retreat master died in 2019.

Lama Norlha passed away in 2018. There was a retreat in progress. Situ R first sent a temporary retreat master on an emergency basis, and then a permanent one. I don't



think staffing is the problem.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is the notion of realization and what it is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 11:01 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Lama Norlha passed away in 2018. There was a retreat in progress. Situ R first sent a temporary retreat master on an emergency basis, and then a permanent one. I don't think staffing is the problem.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is the notion of realization and what it is.

Tata1 said:

What do you mean?

Malcolm wrote:

People have unrealistic as well as untested ideas about realization. In reality, it's explained pretty clearly, but nevertheless people use the word "realization" quite promiscuously.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 2nd, 2021 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Information on Tibetan reception of De-bzhin gshegs-pa'i gsang-ba bsam-kyis mi-khyab-pa bstan-pa

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I'm preparing a translation of the Chinese versions of the Tathāgatācintyaguhya Sūtra. To provide as much of a comprehensive survey as is possible with my limited knowledge of Tibetan, does anyone have information on the Tibetan reception of the sūtra beyond its usage by Candrakīrti? Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

You should run a comparison of it with the tenjur at buddhanexus.

Zhen Li said:

Thank you Malcolm. I didn't find anything major. I think most of my questions would be answered by seeing the elusive Sanskrit manuscript, but the Chinese is largely unproblematic outside of figuring out Sanskrit names. It is definitely a classic

Tathāgatarbha sūtra and it surprises me that it remains untranslated to this day from any of the sources. I heard about various people preparing translations for the past few decades but nothing ever comes of it. I will post a link to my translation of both the early and later versions on DW when completed.

Malcolm wrote:

It's on the list at 84000

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Information on Tibetan reception of De-bzhin gshegs-pa'i gsang-ba bsam-kyis mi-khyab-pa bstan-pa

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I'm preparing a translation of the Chinese versions of the Tathāgatācintyaguhya Sūtra. To provide as much of a comprehensive survey as is possible with my limited knowledge of Tibetan, does anyone have information on the Tibetan reception of the sūtra beyond its usage by Candrakīrti? Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

You should run a comparison of it with the tenjur at buddhanexus.

Zhen Li said:

Thank you Malcolm. I didn't find anything major. I think most of my questions would be answered by seeing the elusive Sanskrit manuscript, but the Chinese is largely unproblematic outside of figuring out Sanskrit names. It is definitely a classic Tathāgatarbha sūtra and it surprises me that it remains untranslated to this day from any of the sources. I heard about various people preparing translations for the past few decades but nothing ever comes of it. I will post a link to my translation of both the early and later versions on DW when completed.

Malcolm wrote:

It is unlikely that this text was commonly read on its own, and its citations would mostly be mined from citations.

In the Śikṣāsamuccaya is a long citation of ff. 161a-161b, ff. 165b-166a., f.171a, 183a-183b

In Bhāvaviveka's Prajñāpradīpa, there is a citation of f. 166b, f. 167a

In the Kāyatravṛtti, there is a citation of 166.b, etc.

In Prajñāpradīpatika, f. 167, etc.

In Bodhicaryāvataraṇajika, f. 177

In Prasannapāda, f.202b,

Etc. This sūtra is most commonly, but not exclusively, cited by Indian Mādhyamikas.

There are a large number of passages from it in the

Vyākhyāyuktika, few in the Śrāvākabhūmi, the Abhisamayālmkāra commentaries

also have several.

I would say that this sūtra was more important to Mādhyamikas.

The Tibetans know this sūtra under its short title, གསང་བ་བསམ་གྱིས་མི་ཁྱབ་པའི་མདོ, the Sūtra of the Inconceivable Secret. It is regularly cited by scholars in every school.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

One loses one's life essence everytime when one releases sperm. A lot of nutrients from the blood go into making semen, so wasting it is abuse of the body.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not correct. Semen, bija, is the final waste product of the process of digesting food. The pure part of sukra is transformed in ojas, the impure part becomes the bija.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

...

Johnny Dangerous said:

I've seen a few people (actual medical professionals, not cranks) speculating that Covid might, over time - with the combination of vaccine and natural immunity - become something akin to a severe version of the common cold. There is a theory that the rhino and corona viruses that now make up the common cold were once as severe as Covid, evidently.

Hazel said:

What's the timeline here though? Does this require human evolution?

Malcolm wrote:

See above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I've seen a few people (actual medical professionals, not cranks) speculating that Covid might, over time - with the combination of vaccine and natural immunity - become something akin to a severe version of the common cold. There is a theory that the rhino and corona viruses that now make up the common cold were once as severe as Covid, evidently.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also genetic evidence among people from east asia that there was a corona epidemic there, which lasted for 20K years, ending about 5k years ago.

<https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smart-news/over-20000-years-ago-coronavirus-epidemic-left-marks-human-dna-180978088/>

Johnny Dangerous said:

In a study published on June 24 in the journal Current Biology, researchers analyzed the DNA of thousands of people from around the world from 26 populations to look for signs of ancient coronavirus epidemics. The researchers found that people living in China, Japan and Vietnam faced a coronavirus for about 20,000 years in an epidemic that ended 5,000 years ago...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My thesis is that Tibetans never bothered to understand our negative attitudes towards Christianity specifically, and religions generally.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm no. Tibetans themselves had a negative attitude towards Christianity, beginning with the expulsion of Nestorians from Tibet in the mid-8th century on up, the establishment of a Catholic church and in Ladakh, which was established in 1625 and shut down in 1640, with all the missionaries and converts exiled. The Capuchins were expelled in 1760. Catholic churches were burned, Catholics were executed, and four French missionaries were tortured and executed in Batang, Khams during the Batang uprising of 1905 ( [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Batang\\_uprising](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Batang_uprising) ).

Tibetans have a very negative attitude towards Islam and Muslims in general. Tibetan Buddhists generally have very negative attitude towards Bonpos, and the legends of Indian Mahasiddhas are filled with negative portrayals of Hindus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Matt J said:

Care to expand?

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Lama Norlha passed away in 2018. There was a retreat in progress. Situ R first sent a temporary retreat master on an emergency basis, and then a permanent one. I don't think staffing is the problem.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is the notion of realization and what it is.

The word realization, rtogs pa, is used very loosely, to describe all kinds of things. In Tibetan, it runs the gamut from merely understanding something, all the way up to realizing buddhahood. So when we hear that "X is realized", everyone thinks they know what this means, but actually, without some qualification, it is kind of a meaningless statement. Realized what? The path of accumulation, application, seeing? The creation stage? The completion stage? Emptiness? etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 1:50 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Budai said:

Celibacy is no longer a requirement in Drikung Kagyu.

Malcolm wrote:

It never was.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 2:21 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I'm an advocate for shorter and simpler retreats. Learning to crawl before entering a marathon makes sense to me. Do something until you're proficient instead of being overwhelmed by all the practices.

Malcolm wrote:

My three year retreat consisted of two sadhanas, one performed at the beginning to remove obstacles, and then the remainder of the time was focused on the other, main sadhana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

yagmort said:

imho there is no such thing as "not my thing" when it comes to practice.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure there is.

yagmort said:

thoughts like "not my thing" is what monkey mind thinks when something is threatening its position.

Malcolm wrote:

Not necessarily.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I've heard that Situ R says it is possible to become enlightened doing NgonDro.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. Ngondro contains within it all the key points of creation and completion stage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 2:57 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My three year retreat consisted of two sadhanas, one performed at the beginning to remove obstacles, and then the remainder of the time was focused on the other, main sadhana.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I like the sound of that. I also like the idea of having a bed.

Is your retreat typical for a Sakya 3 year retreat?

Malcolm wrote:

Three year retreat is not really a Sakya thing, though it has become so recently. I have no idea how other Sakya three year retreats are structured,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Matt J said:

I would be curious as to the profile of the typical Westerner who is able to take three years off to do a retreat.

Giovanni said:

I think this is accurate. A friend who was preparing for the three year and still hopes to do it, told that there was "one too many freak outs"...

Malcolm wrote:

Young, unemployed, no partner.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 3:15 AM

Title: Re: 5 Precepts

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

When I took refuge (kagyu) the 5 were not included. So, it may vary with tradition/teacher

Malcolm wrote:

No, it does not vary between Tibetan tradition to Tibetan since we are all Mulasarvadvadins.

Jangchup Donden said:

At least all the refuge ceremonies I went to (also Kagyu) were at the beginning of an empowerment and did not include the 5 precepts.

Malcolm wrote:

The five upāsaka vows are received with refuge automatically.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 7:05 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

pemachophel said:

Khyentse Wangpo didn't realize by doing Chod and Phowa,

Malcolm wrote:

The Sakyapas claim Khyentse Wangpo attained his realization through Hevajra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

To wank or not to wank, that is the question,

Whether 'tis nobler in the mind to suffer...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 9:56 AM

Title: Re: Practice of Dakini Simhamukha

Content:

fckw said:

, but then again what is more important is that you actually realize at least one dakini to a sufficient degree, no matter which one.

Malcolm wrote:

What do you mean by "realize." Why is it important to realize a dakini? What does that mean? What is a sufficient degree of realization?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 10:00 AM

Title: Re: Where can I buy a Tibetan meditation cushion?

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Hi,

So I recently moved back to the Pacific Northwest from Montreal and I got rid of my old Zen meditation cushion. The seat was quite low for me and not that comfortable to sit on.

Now I'm trying to find a new cushion (preferably ordering one online if possible), one that is more Tibetan and traditional (a higher seat and filled with buckwheat?).

However, I'm really struggling to find a place to buy it from. Ideally I would want to buy it from a dharma organization so that I can also support it, rather than finding something



on Amazon.

Any tips on where I might find one?

Malcolm wrote:

Hate to say it, but there is no such thing as a Tibetan meditation cushion. You might be thinking of a so-called gomden, which Chogyam Trungpa had invented for Westerners. Otheerwise, the cushions we use in nearly all western Dharma centers are variations on Japanese floor mats and pillows via the Zen tradition.

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zabuton>

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zafu>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is not correct. Semen, bija, is the final waste product of the process of digesting food. The pure part of sukra is transformed in ojas, the impure part becomes the bija.

Dharmasherab said:

Understood. But there must be more than one reason why monastics have to follow a celibacy vow. The most obvious of which is sense restraint. But other than this dont you think that the other reason is semen retention?

Malcolm wrote:

No, I don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

..It really all gets back to the individual teacher-pupil situation, doesn't it?

yagmort said:

yes, it does.

you made a post quoting me at the beginning, but i m not sure what is your question?

my questions were adressed to Malcolm,since he commented on my words about "not my thing", so i would like to hear some elaboration.

my point of view is that even though tibetan buddhism provide quite an array of different approaches to suit out proclivities, those approaches do not suppose to please or entertain our monkey mind. otherwise there is a danger that we reduce our practice to something merely along the lines of other toys of our monkey mind, be it our hobbies, or any other activities we use to entertain ourselves or "kill time". that especially the case for ngöndro, since we have almost no teachers who can say that ngöndro is not necessary.

Malcolm wrote:

If you don't enjoy your practice, there is no point in doing it.

The approach to so-called preliminary practices varies quite a bit from lineage to lineage. For instance, in the Sakya school, people are introduced to the practice of a major yidam, such as Hevajra, immediately, and rather than focusing accumulating ngondro, spend time learning the sadhana and focusing on maintaining the daily commitment. Generally, ngondro is something in the Sakya school which one does when one goes into a retreat. The Sakyapas did not even have a text on Ngondro specifically until the 1940's, written by a Nalendra khenpo who was inspired by Words of My Precious Teacher (full disclosure, I have translated this text and it is sitting at Wisdom, waiting to be edited). Even here, the explanation is combined with four sadhanas, and there was no separate text for Ngondro until Dezhung Rinpoche wrote one in the 1970's.

The Gelukpas also have a different approach, their "ngondro" is Lamrim in its entirety, even though they have a special set of nine 100,000 practices, but they are not prerequisites for anything. They can be done anytime one has time.

The structured ngondro program is more characteristic of Nyingma and Karma Kagyu. Drigung is very heavy on ngondro accumulations, especially in how they present the Yangzab teachings, requiring, in the older manuals, 400,000 of each. Modern teachers like Ontul Rinpoche and the late Gyalpo Rinpoche, however, relaxed such requirements.

As for "not my thing," lets say you received a Vajravārāhī initiation, but you prefer Vajrabhairava, which you have also received, there is no fault.

In general, non-Tibetans develop this uptight attitude about "doing things right." Instead of developing a broad, open, relaxed attitude, they become puritanical, insisting on some sort of orthopraxy, becoming overly self-critical, as well as critical of others, whom they feel are "not doing things right."

In reality, Ngondro is a main practice. Why? It is just three different ways of relating the guru. Properly speaking, Mandala offerings are in fact part of guru yoga. If one understands the meaning of the dissolution of the refuge tree, one can even attain complete awakening merely doing refuge. Or, if one has sufficient devotion, as Virupa says, one can attain mahamudra realization merely by serving one's guru without meditating even for a single second.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 10:32 PM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's much like the word prajna in Buddhadharma. It's can refer to any number of understandings. Whether someone realized the three kayas is going to depend on if you got full instructions on what those are, how to do that, being examined by your lama, what the signs are. It's straight forward and objective.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, signs such as seeing one hundred buddhas, visiting one hundred buddhafiels, and so on, which are a sign of attaining the first bhumi, are straight forward and objective.

Or alternately, signs such as the intense pain of pranayama practices and so on, which result when ordinary people practice completion stage practices related the nadis, vayus, and bindus, are also straight forward and objective, as are signs like smoke, fireflies, and so on, which are signs of the vayus entering the central channel. These are all "realizations."

The point is that people like to say "So and so is realized" without knowing anything about the person, other than just passing along rumors they have heard about this teacher and that. I can't tell you the number of ads I have seen for this and that teacher "praising them as highly realized" without specifying what that realization is. Calling teachers "realized" is just advertising puffery.

My guru, Chogyal Namkhai Norbu, used to reject the idea that he was a rtogs ldan, a person possessing realization, and basically said that if any of his students wanted to prove they were realized they should be able to hold their hand in fire without it becoming damaged in anyway. He said he was not able to do this, and as far as I know, none of his students ever tried to pass this test either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

... Upon completion of the CN ngondro you do the special Dzogchen preliminaries and straight into tregcho/thogal...

yagmort said:

could you please explain why Chetsün sadhana - which is a decent part of Chetsün Nyingtig if i got it correctly - is omitted?

Crazywisdom said:

It's not. You just go through all the sadhanas in the book.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how one has been instructed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

All I'm saying is that the typical four-part standard formula (and that is what it is, an institutionalized process) is what most Nyingma and Kagyu Vajrayana teachers tell most of their students to do.

Malcolm wrote:

There, fixed it for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But I catch your meaning. We put way too much importance on some woo woo power of so and so when it's not important at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, especially since it is not our power. Patrul Rinpoche discusses this in terms of pride, people boasting about their gurus as if their gurus' qualities rubs off on them.

It is as you say, if one understands the signs of the practices, it is pretty easy to know if one has reached this or that level of realization. But we are never supposed to say what that is.

Occasionally, however, some masters like Longchenpa, Tsongkhapa, or Khyentse Wangpo do let slip what realization they have attained in order to inspire disciples.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

megaman chiquito said:

This may sound superstitious but if a man wants to quit masturbation, I suggest dousing the genitals with cold water after each urination. Cold showers also help, but if you don't want full cold shower, localized icy water will help.

I learned this from a book on yogic celibacy.

Malcolm wrote:

Sounds unpleasant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 3rd, 2021 at 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Practice of Dakini Simhamukha

Content:

fckw said:

It's a practice to gain enlightenment. Like all dakini practices are. You can repel obstacles with it that are particularly connected to bad influences of female spirits, but then again what is more important is that you actually realize at least one dakini to a sufficient degree, no matter which one. They all in their own form protect against all sorts of things. Regarding your second question, typically you'd do a round of guru yoga first before doing other sadhanas, but nothing prevents you to take the dakini as the guru. Simhamukha was a practice extensively used by Guru Rinpoche, so you could even have him appear in this form and do a corresponding guru yoga, followed by the actual practice. Or you take one of his other wrathful forms like Guru Drakpur as the guru yoga followed by Simhamukha practice, followed by the actual sadhana practice. It's a bit less conventional as an approach, but nothing prevents you from doing it.

tony\_montana said:

Hi, would Vajrayogini/Vajravarahi also be considered a dakini in this sense or is she a Yidam only (or is she both).

Thanks

Malcolm wrote:

The Guru Yidam Dakini thing is Nyingma only.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Where can I buy a Tibetan meditation cushion?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Hate to say it, but there is no such thing as a Tibetan meditation cushion. You might be thinking of a so-called gomden, which Chogyam Trungpa had invented for Westerners.

Lobsang Chojor said:

Malcolm just out of interest what did Tibetans use to raise their hips for the Vairocana

posture? Just folded up robes?

Malcolm wrote:

Blankets, I imagine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 3:03 AM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's not. You just go through all the sadhanas in the book.

yagmort said:

so if "it's not" omitted, it's not part of the ngöndro, it's not part of the dzogchen proper and "upon completion of the CN ngondro you do the special Dzogchen preliminaries and straight into tregcho/thogal", where does sadhana of Chetsün sit within the context of Chetsün Nyingtig then?

i am royally confused.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, correct. This is why you need instruction. You need the wang, the lung, and the tri, which, admittedly, are not easy to obtain. You are like someone asking three different people about California. You are going to get three different answers, because we have all received it at different times from different teachers with different instructions, just like someone describing Cali who is from LA is going to have a different point of view than someone from the bay area, and someone from the Shasta region. There is no one answer, but mainly, the long sadhana is used for the empowerment and feasts. It can also be a daily practice for those who want to practice it that way. But that is not the usual approach.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Correction on Drikung...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Yangzab is different in the older manuals.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 3:24 AM  
Title: Re: is Buddha"just a man" in any tradition?  
Content:

Kim O'Hara said:  
But many [academic] scholars believe...

Malcolm wrote:  
All kinds of shit without any thing other than their opinion to back it up.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:00 PM  
Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
Sure there is.

Not necessarily.

PadmaVonSamba said:  
I began to do the traditional ngongdro many years ago. Just about everybody in our dharma group was doing it. I was never instructed to begin doing it. so, When I told my teacher (a khenpo) his response was basically "meh" or sort of, "ok whatever."  
After 11,000 prostrations I realized that I just wasn't there with it. Just going through the motions, pretending, getting a nice bump that looked like a third eye on my forehead. Totally feeding my 'monkey mind' if you want to get right down to it. I didn't continue after that.  
But there are two things I want to mention, both from very qualified teachers.  
I asked one whether ngondro was 'right' for everybody. His answer was that none of the Buddhist teachings are wrong for anybody. But not everybody is suited to every type of practice. The tradition I follow is vajrayana but I know I will really never fit the definition of a vajrayana practitioner. Maybe I am what you'd call sutrayana with some vajrayana practices thrown in.  
The other thing that a teacher said was that "ngondro" can be all types of activity. Not just the four 100,000s that have become the standard. One year I lived and worked at a retreat center in the kitchen. Cooking every day, I was told, is also ngondro. So, my understanding is that the "essential thing" (if I can say that) isn't the means as much as the ends. It is what you get out of it, the clearing away of obstacles, the "purification" (I hate that word) of one's practice. Whether it's dumping rice and jewels on a metal plate

or sweeping the shrine room floor, the point is transformation.

TharpaChodron said:

On a side note and derailing the thread, I read a comment recently online from a longtime practitioner who was saying that many of his fellow practitioners were having serious financial and health issues and were in a bad situation, given they had devoted their lives to practice and not financial security. Some committing suicide and are bordering on homelessness etc. It was a pretty shocking thing to hear. I imagine they did Ngondro and followed their teachers guidance, not that those things are connected at all to material well-being.

Malcolm wrote:

One has to work with circumstances. Teachers of Dharma are not life coaches, financial advisors, etc. ChNN always taught us that we practitioners need to take care of ourselves in a responsible way, as best we can. So it is sad that some people did not understand this point, and now feel desperate. ChNN always advised people to set up some kind of community retirement strategy, but this never happened.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:02 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's not. You just go through all the sadhanas in the book.

yagmort said:

so if "it's not" omitted, it's not part of the ngöndro, it's not part of the dzogchen proper and "upon completion of the CN ngondro you do the special Dzogchen preliminaries and straight into tregcho/thogal", where does sadhana of Chetsün sit within the context of Chetsün Nyingtig then?

i am royally confused.

Sennin said:

There's a dvd of Kyabje Khenchen Jigme Phuntsok teaching the ngondro. He explains that the refuge, bodhichitta and guruyoga is the main path of blessings, he incorporates aspects of the sadhana into the ngondro guruyoga. He explained it is totally complete this way without doing the sadhana. He explained that the tummo section is auxiliary.

That said, I did not have the fortune to meet H.H. so it's likely he taught the cycle in different ways. I don't know. Even so the way he explained it on the dvds was very informative.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, this is how it was taught to me when I received it in 1993.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:06 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

But many [academic] scholars believe...

Malcolm wrote:

All kinds of shit without any thing other than their opinion to back it up.

Kim O'Hara said:

True.

And all kinds of truth, too, with good evidence to back it up.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

In speculations about the person of the Buddha, not so much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:08 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Dan74 said:

Not sure if an entire tradition can be said to teach this, but I have heard several Zen teachers say (cue the pearl clutching....) "the Buddha was a very cleaver man"....

At the end of the day, it's what gets the job done...

Malcolm wrote:

Of course the Buddha was clever, he was a buddha. You don't get to be a buddha by being a dolt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:27 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

True.

And all kinds of truth, too, with good evidence to back it up.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

In speculations about the person of the Buddha, not so much.

Kim O'Hara said:

True. But if you go back to the post of mine which you quoted with no context (pro tip: click on the little dagger symbol on the innermost block of quoted text, and then do it again) and look at the context, you will see that I was talking about scholars' opinions of scriptures, not of the person of the Buddha.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

That's pretty much the same.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 12:30 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Understood. But there must be more than one reason why monastics have to follow a celibacy vow. The most obvious of which is sense restraint. But other than this dont you think that the other reason is semen retention?

Malcolm wrote:

No, I don't.

Dharmasherab said:

But it is a monastic offence to intentionally release semen according to the complete set of Pratimoksa rules. One needs to serve a period of penance for doing such an act.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. But it has nothing to do with some health benefit. It's also an offense for nuns to masuturbate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 7:44 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

True. But if you go back to the post of mine which you quoted with no context (pro tip: click on the little dagger symbol on the innermost block of quoted text, and then do it again) and look at the context, you will see that I was talking about scholars' opinions of scriptures, not of the person of the Buddha.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

That's pretty much the same.

Kim O'Hara said:

I'm sure you can find some way in which scriptures and the person they are centred on are "pretty much the same" but most of us have little trouble distinguishing between, say, Obama and every single one of twenty wildly divergent accounts of his presidency.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

We have no knowledge of the Buddha apart from texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 8:55 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

I'm sure you can find some way in which scriptures and the person they are centred on are "pretty much the same" but most of us have little trouble distinguishing between, say, Obama and every single one of twenty wildly divergent accounts of his presidency.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

We have no knowledge of the Buddha apart from texts.

Kim O'Hara said:

True. Which is why speculating about the person of the Buddha should be avoided (and researching him is frankly impossible, btw).

But that doesn't stop us - or scholars - researching the texts and finding out (within limits dictated by the evidence) when and where they first appeared.

I would hope that the textual study didn't cripple the spiritual study, but (this is just a personal preference and I understand that others don't necessarily share it) I always prefer knowledge to speculation or ignorance: if the truth is findable, I will say, "yes, please!" to it.

Malcolm wrote:

Since Mahāyāna sūtras and śrāvaka canons began to be written down at the same time, the bias in academic studies is towards the śrāvaka canons which were orally translated out of an earlier canon. Mahāyāna sūtras are taken as inspired writings. But this is all speculative and a matter of opinion and conjecture. They don't really take us any closer Buddha, the person. What we have are competing narratives framed for reasons we can only guess at. The eventual differences between Mahāyāna and Śrāvaka schools are unprecedented outside Indian civilization. Apart from "Hinduism" itself, what other major religion has so many trends based on so many competing and disparate narratives? One could argue that Christianity, has all kinds of trends, which is true, but all Christians share the same basic book, the New Testament, the same goes for Islam and Judaism. This is not the case with Buddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: Getting wang/lung from different lineages?

Content:

PeterC said:

You're overcomplicating things. Pretty much the only decision you need to make is the choice of the guru. Then just practice what they suggest. If you The seven line prayer and vajra guru mantra are things that any kagyu or nyingma lama will have and can give you.

Malcolm wrote:

And for that matter Sakya, Gelug, or Jonangpa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yeah but if we don't the point will be lost.

Malcolm wrote:

People have tried. For example, Margherita Island was supposed to be the it place. Of course, with the declining situation in Venezuela, that turned out not to be ideal, and anyway, only the rich people in the community could afford to build houses there. Baja was supposed to be another one, same deal.

It is not easy to set up retirement communities. Even a small one is a multi-million dollar proposition.

So now, with ChNN passed on to another dimension, it likely won't happen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Correction on Drikung...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Yangzab is different in the older manuals.

Crazywisdom said:

I never learned Yangzab actually. My lama was all about Lord Jigten Sumgon.

Malcolm wrote:

Yangzab is a branch of the Khandro Nyinthig, according to Rinchen Phuntsok, the tertön. Its more prevalent among Narthang Drigungpas and in Eastern Tibet in general. For example, one of Dudjom Lingpa's sons wrote a 300 folio commentary on the Nyinthig root text within the Yangzab that focuses on rushen, etc.

It appears to me that some Drigungpa Lamas have a somewhat ambivalent attitude towards it. It does not really fit in with the 5-fold Mahāmudra scheme.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 9:44 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

so it looks like in Chetsün Nyingtig they don't proceed to the dzogchen proper right after

ngöndro.  
am i getting something incorrectly here?

Malcolm wrote:  
Having completed the ngondro, one continues with rushen, trekcho, and thogal

Crazywisdom said:  
The ngondro is not like the usual ngondro. It's completion stage.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, it is not like the usual ngondros.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 4th, 2021 at 10:18 PM  
Title: Re: Kagyu Lineages  
Content:  
Crazywisdom said:  
But I catch your meaning. We put way too much importance on some woo woo power of so and so when it's not important at all.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, especially since it is not our power. Patrul Rinpoche discusses this in terms of pride, people boasting about their gurus as if their gurus' qualities rubs off on them.

It is as you say, if one understands the signs of the practices, it is pretty easy to know if one has reached this or that level of realization. But we are never supposed to say what that is.

Occasionally, however, some masters like Longchenpa, Tsongkhapa, or Khyentse Wangpo do let slip what realization they have attained in order to inspire disciples.

Arnoud said:  
Is that why a lot of lamas now say the signs are more compassion, less grasping and more devotion?  
It seems a little contradictory as well when the signs are seeing this and that but then people get told what they experience is just a nyam and need to just keep practicing. I guess ultimately they are all nyams until Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:  
There are signs of the mundane stages of the path, and signs of the transcendent stages of the path. For example, having dreams of purification when doing Vajrasattva are not transcendent signs. The latter only manifest when one has attained the first bodhisattva stage. The main teaching of every tradition has a detailed explanation of these in their Varjayāna paths and stages literature.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 5th, 2021 at 8:01 AM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

I agree, except that when you say "reasons we can only guess at," you are effectively closing the door on western-style historical research and (as I said) I prefer not to do that.

Malcolm wrote:

I am merely pointing out that the search for a historical Buddha or an original teaching is chimera wrought of a teleology foreign to buddhadharma itself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 5th, 2021 at 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Lululemon Founder Spends \$3.2 Million Preserving Islands in the Salish Sea

The founder of athletic apparel company Lululemon, Chip Wilson, spent \$3.2 million to purchase the small Canadian island Saturnina, and to help preserve two others in an effort to protect the Douglas fir ecosystem.

"It's overwhelming," Wilson said in an interview with Global National. "You can almost cry... where's this jewel been hiding and I've never seen it?"

In addition to Saturnina, Wilson also contributed to the purchasing of two other small islands in the Salish Sea, according to International Business Times: The West Ballenas and Lasqueti Island.

The three islands all contain rare Douglas fir ecosystems. The islands support trees that are near 400 years old, including Garry oaks and shore pines, ...

The charitable efforts started in 2020 in order to save the West Ballenas. A crowdfunding campaign was started, and students from Ballenas high school collected donations from around the world; Wilson matched these donations ...

<https://www.ecowatch.com/lululemon-founder-islands-conservation-2653631873.html>

Is this in your part of the world, Kathy Lauren?

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

She hails from Nova Scotia, so, opposite ends of Canada.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 5th, 2021 at 8:34 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

If you look at Megaman's posting history (which you may find interesting from the moderating POV, btw) you will see him "identifying as Catholic" in his Intro so contrasting the Buddha with Jesus is fair. Everyone (including Jesus) knew from the get-go that Jesus was the Son of God, i.e. essentially divine, and it is absolutely central to his (His?) story. The Buddha, on the other hand, had a normal human life up to the time he went forth, and in fact for the next forty years.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Really, you think Buddha's immaculate conception places him in the realm of being an ordinary humans?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 5th, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: The Lankavatarasutra in early Indian Madhyamaka Literature

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Rather than discussing miracles or events, as if debating history, we should be focusing on the message of the sūtra and the statements that Aemilius has kindly shared with us. How do they help us? What can they do for us on the path? Can we/how can we use them in daily life?

Malcolm wrote:

What Aemilius shared with us was a number of assertions by the late Christian Lindtner (1949-2020) about the authorship of texts in the Nāgārjuna corpus, some of which are demonstrably false.

Christian Lindtner (1949-2020) was a very strange bird. whose scholarship seems to have descended into a form of gematria: <https://www.jesusisbuddha.com/CLT.html>

Then there is his flirtation with and then reversal on the subject of the holocaust denial:



<https://dagobertobellucci.wordpress.com/2012/11/07/the-holocaust-in-danish-media-1998-2006-by-christian-lindtner/>

Zhen Li said:

Today, as far as I can judge, Holocaust revisionism has reached its main objective in demonstrating that there is no valid internal or external piece of evidence for claiming that Hitler by means of gas chambers in Auschwitz-Birkenau or elsewhere, murdered millions of Jews in cold blood. From whatever angle you look at it this claim is so absurd that it in itself becomes a most interesting problem how it can be that so many people for so long have believed in what we now safely can call the Holocaust myth. The Hitlerian gas chambers, like the alleged weapons of mass destruction of Irak ´s former dictator, have now been assigned to the realm of myth. Or, if you wish, they are mere rumors, as Dr. Faurisson phrased it in a famous note in 1979. And without a weapon of mass murder, it follows that there can be no mass murder. Thus the Holocaust, in the sense of mass murder of Jews by means of gas chambers is, if you believe in logic, a mere myth.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://holocaustcontroversies.blogspot.com/2011/10/interview-with-ex-denier-christian.html>

All and all, not a terribly reliable scholar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 5th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha"just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

If you look at Megaman's posting history (which you may find interesting from the moderating POV, btw) you will see him "identifying as Catholic" in his Intro so contrasting the Buddha with Jesus is fair. Everyone (including Jesus) knew from the get-go that Jesus was the Son of God, i.e. essentially divine, and it is absolutely central to his (His?) story. The Buddha, on the other hand, had a normal human life up to the time he went forth, and in fact for the next forty years.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Really, you think Buddha's immaculate conception places him in the realm of being an ordinary humans?

PadmaVonSamba said:

It puts him into the category of legendary mythology by indian patriarchs who felt the

need to avoid delivery through the vagina, which they likely perceived as unclean and therefore an unsuitable passage route.

Malcolm wrote:

You are confusing birth with conception.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

It puts him into the category of legendary mythology by indian patriarchs who felt the need to avoid delivery through the vagina, which they likely perceived as unclean and therefore an unsuitable passage route.

Malcolm wrote:

You are confusing birth with conception.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Yeah. I got that mixed up.

I was thinking he was born from Queen Maya's side, rather than being impregnated through her side by a white elephant with six tusks. That's perfectly reasonable, isn't it! ...whatever it takes to avoid that yoni hole I guess.

Malcolm wrote:

However you want to parse these narratives in your head is up to you. But this is the narrative that is relevant for Mahāyānīs:

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh95.html#UT22084-046-001-301>

Based on this sūtra, one can hardly claim by any measure that the Buddha was an ordinary human. To say so is to claim knowledge of facts of which no one alive today can have any personal knowledge.

That said, most people are more comfortable with their ordinary perception than the exalted vision which frame Mahāyāna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:42 AM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

...

However you want to parse these narratives in your head is up to you. But this is the narrative that is relevant for Mahāyānī s:

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh95.html#UT22084-046-001-301>

Based on this sūtra, one can hardly claim by any measure that the Buddha was an ordinary human. To say so is to claim knowledge of facts of which no one alive today can have any personal knowledge. [emphasis added]

That said, most people are more comfortable with their ordinary perception than the exalted vision which frame Mahāyāna.

Kim O'Hara said:

I can't and won't argue with that. There are, as we know, 84,000 dharma doors.

Malcolm wrote:

Only in the sense that there are 21,000 afflictions of anger (sūtra), 21,000 afflictions of desire (vinaya), and 21,000 afflictions of ignorance (Abhidharma) and 21,000 mixed afflictions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:45 AM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

However, the OP's (somewhat provocative) question was, "is there any accepted tradition of buddha being just a normal human who achieved nirvana through his own diligent efforts?" (emphasis added) and the answer, as I said here -

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=588792#p588792> - is yes. Astus presented alternative grounds for the same conclusion at <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=565056#p565056>.

Malcolm wrote:

There are all kinds of "accepted" traditions. One "accepted" tradition is that Buddha is an avatar of Vishnu. The only thing relevant here is what does the Mahāyāna tradition hold in general.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:48 AM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

There are theravadins who maintain that some of the elaborate descriptions found in Mahayana sutras, of events where the Buddha gave teachings, could not possibly have had as many attendees (or other details) as is often written, but that is a different issue. That's not about whether the Buddha was simply a human or not.

Malcolm wrote:

A nirmānakāya is in no sense an ordinary human, despite our ordinary perception being unable to comprehend how 1000 monks could fit on Vulture Peak, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:50 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

I never had any more back issues once I started doing them in the mornings. That's not a politically correct benefit, but hey, it's something!

Malcolm wrote:

The best reason to do prostrations is because they are a yoga that limbers up the nāḍis. The concept of counting 100K plus, not so interesting and even harmful to knees and backs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 8:31 PM

Title: Re: Bias in translation

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The best way to get an idea of whether there's bias involved is to study the primary languages ourselves and translate directly.

But to answer your questions, there are hundreds of people translating Buddhist texts, and hundreds of translations. It is easier to focus on a single example. I have a lot of experience now with Pali, Sanskrit, and Chinese, and a few other languages, so may be able to help with some generalisations in response to your questions.

Lotomístico said:

How much bias based on the cultural background of the author is involved? 19th century orientalist scholars perhaps trying to impose their own understanding of what Buddhism is...some even using Christian terminology (one specifically I can think of)

Zhen Li said:

If someone is directly inserting ideas not found in the source text, or excluding materials, that's going to be seen pretty quickly. Maybe you had in mind someone like I.B. Horner, who chose not to translate passages dealing with monastic sexual misconduct because it appeared offensive. A modern equivalent might be pronoun choice. The Buddha often refers to the assembly as "kulaputrāḥ" sons of good family and the

masculine pronoun is standard, but some may prefer to make it inclusive (by the way, many sūtras are gender inclusive and mention "daughters" of good family and use the feminine pronoun). It is probably standard to translate deva as god, but obviously, this could be confused with Abrahamic ideas of monotheistic gods if someone isn't familiar with Buddhism. I think, in general, a lot of the potential confusion is coming on the side of the reader—if you have read a large quantity of sūtras, you will begin to identify what terms the translator is using for what ideas. Others might be a bit harder to parse, for instance "own-being" and "inherent existence" are both common translations of sva-bhāva. So, at the end of the day, some familiarity with Sanskrit is the best solution.

Lotomístico said:

More recent translations possibly leaning towards a new agey or western rationalist overlay to Buddhism.

Zhen Li said:

Stephen Batchelor's translations of the four noble truths as the "four tasks" are obvious examples where an author's idiosyncratic philosophy can distort what the source text is saying.

Lotomístico said:

Do modern translations usually consult existing texts? Are the translators scholars in Sanskrit or classical Chinese? Or do many resort to paraphrase of existing translations?

Zhen Li said:

People tend to use the same terms that have become common place because English-speaking Buddhist audiences are familiar with them. The first lines of sutras are an example: Evaṃ mayā śrūtaṃ is literally "Thus it was heard by me," but the convention is to translate it as "Thus have I heard" removing the instrumental meaning in mayā. The full line Evaṃ mayā śrūtaṃ ekasmin samaye could be read "It was heard by me at one time" but there has been a convention, which may come from manuscripts inserting punctuation markers between śrūtaṃ and ekasmin, of reading it as "It was heard by me. At one time ..." In fact, it is not possible to know the originally intended form of this line, but convention in India eventually went with splitting it. The conventional full translation in English, which most translations go with, is "Thus have I heard. At one time ..."

In fact, the Sanskrit texts are biased inherently. The middle-Indic originals of many terms, such as sutta, are ambiguous. Sutta can be read in Sanskrit as sūkta, well spoken, or as sūtra, thread/discourse. There are good arguments that it should be read as sūkta; sūtra has lots of other uses, such as to indicate sections in grammatical texts, and doesn't necessarily have any reason to be read as sūtra. However, Pāli commentaries accept that sutta can be read as both sūkta and sūtra. That Sanskrit sticks with sūtra, and many other such translation choices, makes it inherently biased in much the same way that our English translations are biased if we are concerned with particular word choice. Even bodhisattva, from bodhisatta, is a choice between a variety of options, such as bodhiśakta. Anyway, the Sanskrit tradition decided that it is bodhisattva, and thus it has been so for two thousand years.

So, issues to keep in mind are really exclusion, interpolation, source manuscript/edition choice, and word choice.

But if you read enough, you will begin to get an idea for what the intended meaning of the Mahāyāna sūtras is. In fact, these distinctions are unlikely to make a huge impact unless one is focusing one's practice only on one translation. Read the sūtras widely and continue reading, it will pay off.

Malcolm wrote:

And of course, there is the fact that bodhisatva, hero of awakening, was “corrected” to by bodhisattva by 19th century philologists, leading to a total misunderstanding of this term.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Information on Tibetan reception of De-bzhin gshegs-pa'i gsang-ba bsam-kyis mi-khyab-pa bstan-pa

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Thank you. I will look into these references.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhanexus is a bit hard to get used to, but selecting for longer citations of 30+ characters results in more meaningful hits.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Tibetan languages-dialects or different languages?

Content:

Supramundane said:

A famous linguist once explained the difference between a language and dialect with the following aphorism:

" a language is a dialect with an army and navy "

I.e. there is no linguistic cut off or structural difference. It is simply a political distinction.

White Sakura said:

that is why maybe the term "dialect" is not fitting for the Tibetan language". German language also has dialects but every German can understand every dialect. Including Austrian dialect. Then there is Swiss German and that is not understandable for Germans from Germany. That is why Swiss German is not just called a dialect. It is rather another language. Or something in between.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they are dialects. All dialects spoken by Tibetans have undergone changes in pronunciation, but these follow regular rules, so that there are mainly differences in

colloquial terms for things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:09 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

On the other hand, a glance at thread titles on the index page will show a much broader range. Perhaps we should accept the established tradition rather than the doctrine or perhaps the team should revise the doctrine.

Malcolm wrote:

The distinction between the śrāvaka conception and the Mahāyāna conception of the Bodhisattva was well understood in India, Tibet, China, etc. While, it is certainly not my place to insist that anyone believe anything they find uncomfortable, it is certainly the case that I can point out what the Mahāyāna states about the person of the Buddha. Whether someone accepts it or not is irrelevant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I heard they were doing this in Santa Cruz also. Not sure where they are with that. Everything will be ok.

TharpaChodron said:

Not far along, from what I hear. Anyhow, about Ngondro. Prostrations seems to be a pretty big sticking point for a lot of people, understandably. In my own experience, that's actually the thing I've been able to do easiest. And as far as benefits go, I have to say that prostrations really seem to loosen up the back and limber one up pretty well. I never had any more back issues once I started doing them in the mornings. That's not a politically correct benefit, but hey, it's something!

Crazywisdom said:

I know people with serious med issues like kidneys got healed from it.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and I know people who have injured themselves for life from prostrations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 9:42 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Yklah said:

Hello to everyone, dharma brothers and sisters:

According to scriptures, the secret mantrayana teachings were taught by Guru Rinpoche, who is believed to be an emanation of Buddha Amitayus, whereas the Sutra teachings are taught by Guru Shakyamuni. My question is:

The mental continuum of Guru Rinpoche is the same as Guru Shakyamuni ? Otherwise, would be very strange to me that the Buddha of this era did not take charge to teach the whole Buddha Dharma, but only the Sutrayana part.

Thank you

Yklah

Malcolm wrote:

Guru Rinpoche, in the Nyingma school, is considered to be an emanation of Śākyamuni Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 6th, 2021 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I know people with serious med issues like kidneys got healed from it.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and I know people who have injured themselves for life from prostrations.

Könchok Thrinley said:

How would you advise people to do prostrations? Probably just take them easy and not go too fast because of some counting?

Malcolm wrote:

Learn how to do sun salutations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 7th, 2021 at 7:35 PM



Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

The term "Tantra" after about 500 BCE, in Buddhism, Hinduism and Jainism is a bibliographic category, just like the word Sutra (which means "sewing together", mirroring the metaphor of "weaving together" in Tantra). The same Buddhist texts are sometimes referred to as tantra or sutra; for example, Vairocabhisambodhi-tantra is also referred to as Vairocabhisambodhi-sutra.

Malcolm wrote:

"Tantra" according to the Buddhist tantras, just means "continuum." Further, when used in reference to the medical tantras, it means to protect (tra) the body (tanu).

But there is no Buddhist text that etymologizes the word tantra as "weaving."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 7th, 2021 at 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

There is a traditional teaching that Shakyamuni himself taught 'tantra' to King Indrabhuti, after he had first caused the Arhats to fall asleep, so that they remained unconscious of what he taught to King Indrabhuti. This story is found in The Seven Instruction Lineages of Jonang Taranatha, and elsewhere.

Malcolm wrote:

Śākyamuni Buddha did not teach the Guhyasamāja Tantra to Indrabhuti I. Śākyamuni Buddha gave Indrabhuti I the empowerment. Indrabhuti I then promulgated the tantra in his kingdom, etc.

Aemilius said:

In another version Shakyamuni taught 'tantra' in the Tushita heaven, and this teaching was later brought to earth by bodhisattva Vajrapani.

Malcolm wrote:

These are the lower tantras.

Aemilius said:

I am pretty sure that the Sravakayana teachings have gone through a process of editing and censorship in the centuries and millennia after the Parinirvana of Buddha Gautama. Originally in the teachings of Shakyamuni there was "twilight language" or sandha-bhashya, i.e. words had multiple and hidden meanings, which later becomes

characteristic of tantra only.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not correct. There is also the idea of *ldem dgongs* in *sūtra*, i.e. *catvāro 'bhisamdhayaḥ*, concealed meaning. For example, the *Abhisamayālamkāra* is the concealed meaning the *Prajñāpāramitā* class.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 7th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: is Buddha "just a man" in any tradition?

Content:

Giovanni said:

To steal an old joke. You honour the Buddha in your way and I will honour the Buddha in his way.

Kim O'Hara said:

We poke fun at the Christians for making a God in their own image, not vice versa as they claim, but I suspect each of us makes the Buddha in our own image, too. Never mind ... it's all good in the beginning, good in the middle, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Whether one takes the *Mahāyāna* account literally or not, the point is to emphasize the fact that the Buddha was an extraordinary being, whose person was inconceivable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 7th, 2021 at 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Guru Rinpoche, in the Nyingma school, is considered to be an emanation of Śākyamuni Buddha.

Seeker12 said:

In some sources, it says that only select few Nirmanakaya Buddhas such as Shakyamuni who establish a dispensation will teach vajrayana. But then it is also said for instance that each Supreme Nirmanakaya such as Shakyamuni will have a Guru Rinpoche.

In terms of... scriptural authority, I suppose, is it appropriate to consider that within each dispensation there will be Vajrayana, but it's just a matter of whether or not the initial supreme nirmanakaya teaches it specifically themselves? That is, Shakyamuni is one of the relatively few who taught Vajrayana, but Maitreya will not. Even in the dispensation of Maitreya, however, will there still be Vajrayana that is simply passed down via a different 'chain' so to speak?

I hope that's clear enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, every Buddha teaches Vajrayāna. The teaching of the rarity of Vajrayāna is merely an intentional statement meant to impress upon us that we should not take the opportunity to practice Vajrayāna lightly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 12:05 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Lineage masters say mantra is short for Manas trahi, mind protection, mantra and tantra are interchangeable.

Malcolm wrote:

While it is true that mantra is etymologized as manas + tra in the Guhyasamāja, the Vajrasikhara states, "a tantra is a saṃtāna," that "a tantra is a continuum." This definition is universal in all schools of Tibetan Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 12:16 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Yklah said:

Hello to everyone, dharma brothers and sisters:

According to scriptures, the secret mantrayana teachings were taught by Guru Rinpoche, who is believed to be an emanation of Buddha Amitayus, whereas the Sutra teachings are taught by Guru Shakyamuni. My question is:

The mental continuum of Guru Rinpoche is the same as Guru Shakyamuni ? Otherwise, would be very strange to me that the Buddha of this era did not take charge to teach the whole Buddha Dharma, but only the Sutrayana part.

Thank you

Yklah

Crazywisdom said:

Guru Padmasambhava had gurus. Namely Indrabhuti, Lawapa and Kukaraja, who are the actual root gurus. Shakyamuni taught the Kalachakra and others. The Red Book says Indrabhuti got The Book which was a root Vajrayana text, most likely Guhyagarbha, Guhyasamaja, from Shakyamuni and taught it to Kukaraja who understood it and then

taught what he understood to Indrabhuti. They both spent their lives Practicing.

Malcolm wrote:

You forgot Śrī Singha.

Also, the Indrabhuti III is the student of Padmavajra I, not his teacher. Also, it is important to note that the Padmakāra (Guru Rinpoche), Padmavajra II, and Saroruhavajra (Padmavajra I) have been conflated in Tibetan sources.

Crazywisdom said:

The sutras say when a bodhisattva reaches the 10th Bhumi they are empowered by Buddhas who shine lights on them and make prophecy. .

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, both in the Sutra of the Ten Stages, and the Lanka. But it is not exactly a Vajrayāna empowerment. Empowerment is a method by which an ordinary person can attain buddhahood, such as Indrabhuti, Dombhi Heruka, Saraha. etc., and failing that, practice sadhana enabling them to attain all the paths and stages in a single lifetime.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Imagine the injury they would get by ignoring lamas.

Malcolm wrote:

Lamas are not mystical beings beyond error. And my Lama, as you know, was not big on prostrations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Actually it is just impermanence. Buddhism reigned supreme for over 1000 years in India. The Indian flag still respects this history.

Malcolm wrote:

Until the English revived his memory through Pali sources, the Indians completely forgot about Ashoka, who in any case was a sectarian butcher until his brother's head (who was slain by accident) was brought in for the bounty Ashoka had offered on the heads of Jain monks. You can read all about it in the Ashoka-avadana. Ashoka had 18k Jains slain

for a cartoon depicting the Buddha prostrating to Mahāvira. Not very cool.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 8:47 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Zhen Li said:

But in certain cases, stridently masculine words are used to encourage disciples—men and women included there. With teachings like this it is obviously not possible to present such words to most women today as a form of encouragement, but it certainly was at a certain time and place and I know a number of women (not all from traditional South Asian cultures) who would strongly agree with these sentiments.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many women who derive benefit from supporting patriarchal culture. That does not mean patriarchal culture is a desiderata. Nor can that fact be used to excuse strident sexism. This is why such words cannot be used as an inducement for women today, and frankly, given the fact the women during the time this sutra was composed were subject to strident masculine oppression in general, it is unlikely that such words would have been read or heard by women at all, further reinforcing their completely sexist content. Why? The target of this statement is men, who fear feminization. The statement amounts to the sentiment, “if one does accept x doctrine, one is a sissy.”

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

I don't think that the tantras themselves say that they are "lower".

Malcolm wrote:

The divisions of tantra into higher and lower is clearly taught in the Vajramala Tantra, the Hevajra Tantra, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: Questions

Content:

Kurp said:

9. Can recreational drugs cause you to realize your primordial state and/or emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Kurp said:

10. Are experiences less “reliable” or “legitimate” from drug induced states than from meditative practices?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Kurp said:

11. Can siddhis be “activated” from recreational drug use, or even sex?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Kurp said:

12. If you don’t have siddhis, does that mean you are doing something “wrong” with your practice or just in your life in general?

Malcolm wrote:

Probably.

Kurp said:

My underlying question therewithin: is it safe to assume that realizing your primordial state means that you have fully integrated everything, and you no longer lean to one side or the other of any type of duality?

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on what you mean by "realization," which is very broad and ambiguous term.

Your other questions should learned at the feet of a teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 8th, 2021 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: Bias in translation

Content:

ratna said:

In case of bodhisatva, perhaps the Tibetan byang chub sems dpa' recognizes the dual meaning of satva as hero/being and tries to preserve it in translation; hence sems dpa', not byang chub dpa' bo or something like that.

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely, rather, it is calque, "bodhicitta hero."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Questions

Content:

Kurp said:

Your other questions should learned at the feet of a teacher.

Aren't you a teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but not here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Intention for rebirth in Amitabha's pure land

Content:

megaman chiquito said:

Is this pure land the one associated with Nenbutsu chant? i know in feudal japan they used beans to count nenbutsu chanting, and over the years filled large baskets!

Lotomístico said:

As I know there are different Pure Lands in Mahayana Buddhism, each of a different Buddha...the Pure Land of Amitabha (Amida Butsu in Japan, Amituofo in Chinese, other names depending on language) is probably the most well known and especially popular in east Asian Mahayana countries for reasons a Pure Buddhist could elaborate much better than I. In Japan it is called nenbutsu as you mentioned, nianfo in China and different words in other languages.

Aemilius said:

I think in the sutras only two purelands are mentioned, I maybe wrong of course, the other pureland is that of Buddha Akshobhya, who figures in the Vimalakirti nirdeśa sutra. Akshobhya appears in the Akṣobhya-tathāgatasya-vyūha Sūtra (Chinese: 阿閼佛國經; pinyin: Āchùfó Guó Jīng), which was translated during the second century CE and is among oldest known Mahayana or Pure Land texts. According to this scripture, a monk wished to practice the Dharma in the eastern world of delight and made a vow not to harbor anger or malice towards any being until he achieved enlightenment. He duly proved "immovable" and when he succeeded, he became the buddha Akshobhya.

Some buddhist schools regard the Tushita heaven where Bodhisattva Maitreya presently resides a pureland.

There is a partial translation of Akshobhya vyuha sutra in A Treasury of Mahayana Sutras :

Selections from the Maharatnakuta Sutra

Edited by Garma C.C. Chang

Malcolm wrote:

There is also the buddhafiield of Medicine Buddha, Potala of Avalokitsvara, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Intention for rebirth in Amitabha's pure land

Content:

Aemilius said:

Yes, there are some sravaka arhats who are born there...

Malcolm wrote:

No, they are emanations of Amitabha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Question on experiencing the "Heart Lamp"

Content:

White Eagle said:

Dear Forum,

After practicing a combination of Inner Fire practices with Dan Brown's teachings...

Malcolm wrote:

You need a teacher. Your experiences are just concepts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 10:06 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are many women who derive benefit from supporting patriarchal culture. That does not mean patriarchal culture is a desiderata.

Zhen Li said:

The passage is not about creating a patriarchal culture, but is addressed to people within one already.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, and some women are stakeholders in such a culture.



Zhen Li said:

All of the bhikṣuṇīs of Jambudvīpa were present.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, that is the narrative setting, we needn't take it literally.

Zhen Li said:

"Feminization" wasn't a risk for anyone at that time. The point is that discriminations and distinctions of sex do not apply in Buddha-nature (OP had the right approach, except for the subversion part).

Malcolm wrote:

The language is clearly sexist and denigrating to women. That is not the point most people will derive from such a statement. Tortured exegesis just makes it more clear that the passage is anachronistic, a reflection of a time and a culture where women are not treated as full human beings.

Zhen Li said:

You are reading the premises and ignoring the conclusion. You are seeing the vyañjana but not the artha. The context is a patriarchal culture. To make the same point today one uses different words to suit the different context, but the conclusion is the same.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is more effectively made in other sutras of this class, and as I pointed out, there are more effective sutras which address gender and its irrelevance to awakening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 7:42 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

"Feminization" wasn't a risk for anyone at that time. The point is that discriminations and distinctions of sex do not apply in Buddha-nature (OP had the right approach, except for the subversion part).

The language is clearly sexist and denigrating to women. That is not the point most people will derive from such a statement. Tortured exegesis just makes it more clear that the passage is anachronistic, a reflection of a time and a culture where women are not treated as full human beings.

You are reading the premises and ignoring the conclusion. You are seeing the vyañjana but not the artha. The context is a patriarchal culture. To make the same point today one

uses different words to suit the different context, but the conclusion is the same. The point is more effectively made in other sutras of this class, and as I pointed out, there are more effective sutras which address gender and it's irrelevance to awakening.

Zhen Li said:

I agree with your last point, but to treat these passages as simply ill-intentioned without seeing the point behind them is a bit reckless. The sūtras do not set out to hurt feelings like schoolyard bullies. If that's how we perceive it then we have to re-evaluate our perception, seeing the reasons behind skilful means, and always keeping an eye on the definitive meaning intended.

Malcolm wrote:

Casual racism may not be ill-intentioned, but it's still racism. No one can ever say it is skillful. Likewise, the casual sexism that we sometimes find in sutras and tantras, reflective of another era, is certainly not intended to harm, but it is a product of harm to sentient beings—women—in any case. There is a passage in the Sandhivakyakarana Tantra that runs something like "The single delightful vajra word is heard variously by different people according to differences in capacities," meaning that everything written down about what the Buddha said is limited by how this single vajra word was received. The consequence of this hermeneutic strategy is that anything written down about what the Buddha said can be subject to critical evaluation, and anything found wanting is not a fault to be addressed to the Buddha, but rather to those who attempted to write down what they thought he said.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 9th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Casual racism may not be ill-intentioned, but it's still racism. No one can ever say it is skillful. Likewise, the casual sexism that we sometimes find in sutras and tantras, reflective of another era, is certainly not intended to harm, but it is a product of harm to sentient beings—women—in any case. There is a passage in the Sandhivakyakarana Tantra that runs something like "The single delightful vajra word is heard variously by different people according to differences in capacities," meaning that everything written down about what the Buddha said is limited by how this single vajra word was received. The consequence of this hermeneutic strategy is that anything written down about what the Buddha said can be subject to critical evaluation, and anything found wanting is not a fault to be addressed to the Buddha, but rather to those who attempted to write down what they thought he said.

Zhen Li said:

The passage you mention is expressed in different ways in all vaipulya sūtras. This is not about writing, but about the minds of beings which perceive teachings in different ways.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is about writing, since that is the only medium by which we may explore what the Buddha is purported to have said, and writing is an intentional act that is processed through a limited mind.

And texts are relative, imperfect, edited, translated, subject to revision and emendation. They do not spring forth full formed, like Athena from the forehead of Zeus.

Zhen Li said:

The Buddha continues to manifest in many forms, and he continues to teach us in many ways other than through the words of sūtras.

Malcolm wrote:

The idea that Buddha manifests in words is just another strategy employed by those who seek to represent what the Buddha said. This does not mean they have in any respect at all faithfully executed their goal.

Zhen Li said:

If we find a certain upāya in a written text does not apply to us, we don't have to dwell on it—these upāya do not apply to you.

Malcolm wrote:

Sometimes people allowed and continue to allow their biases to slip into their representations of what they understood the Buddha to teach. The Dharma of scripture is not as reliable as the Dharma of realization. Unfortunately the latter may only be personally intuited and cannot be received from another source, such as a scripture.

Zhen Li said:

This is the point—look for the definitive meaning and don't get caught up in the particulars. The point is that all beings equally have Buddha-nature. The discriminated form of male or female does not apply on the ultimate level. At the end of the day, attributing fault is not our job as practitioners and is liable to make us incur karmic harm.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't agree that subjecting sūtras and tantras to critical evaluation involves any karmic risk at all. Quite the contrary. When we find faults in texts that represent what the Buddha said, we should note those. I don't think we can naively assume that a text that makes it into a "canon" is necessarily Buddhavacana. It is only a matter of politeness that prevents and prevented people in the past from offering criticisms.

Zhen Li said:

but we cannot know intentions or fault without the divine eye.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and that eye is sorely lacking these days. Therefore, we must rely on our own critical acumen to determine what to accept and what to reject, and not fetishize texts, which in any case are only representations of what someone thought the Buddha has said, and not necessarily what the Buddha may have actually said.

Zhen Li said:

In regards to sūtras or individual passages, this is also the case—we can pass over it if it does not apply to us, but we should be careful of saying "this is the fault of a lazy or sexist monk" unless we know for sure with the divine eye.

Malcolm wrote:

I clearly disagree. We can certainly know that not all sūtras are of the same literary quality, nor profundity, and when they detail certain ideas that are clearly discriminatory or perpetuate discrimination, we can reject those tropes as unfortunate examples of bias. Any other approach is simple casuistry. Let me give you another example—the prohibition against ordaining albinos. Simple bias and nothing more.

Zhen Li said:

we can see that sometimes the Buddha says things

Malcolm wrote:

You see, I contest the idea that Buddha ever spoke the passage in question. It is a third hand report through a translation of a text that is no longer extant in anything resembling a source text. I am not saying we need to toss the entire Nirvana Sūtra, I am saying that we can critically exclude passages that clearly reflect bias and discrimination in any text we find that purports to represent what the Buddha said in any canon in which it occurs, especially if people are likely to find such passages hurtful. YMMV

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

I don't think that the tantras themselves say that they are "lower".

Malcolm wrote:

The divisions of tantra into higher and lower is clearly taught in the Vajramala Tantra, the Hevajra Tantra, etc.

Aemilius said:

I know that Hevajra tantra says it is the absolutely highest, magnificently and utterly profound tantra. Or something like that. But for example the Tantra of the 1000 arms and 11 faces Avalokiteshvara does not say that it is "a lower tantra", this is what I intended to say.

And by the way, the text of 1000 arms Avalokiteshvara is included in the chinese and japanese collections of buddhist scriptures.

Malcolm wrote:

So is Hevajra.

Aemilius said:

If we start translating the word "tantra" with an european language word, lets say "lore" or "psychic illumination" or some other word, is it still the same thing?

Malcolm wrote:

Words are conventions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 3:03 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I have serious doubts about these Dzogchen tantra lineage claims. They sound fictional. And the books seem invented by Tibetans.

Malcolm wrote:

As opposed to books invented by Indians?

Crazywisdom said:

They also say Padmasambhava was Indrabhuti's son. So who knows? All I can gather is an Indrabhuti got Guhyasamaja. Kukaraja got Guhyagarbha.

Malcolm wrote:

Indrabhuti I supposedly lived at the time of the Buddha, thus not the putative father of Padmasambhava. The Kukkuraja lineage story is a Nyingma account, so I am not sure why you regard it as more reliable than say Dzogchen lineage histories. You seem to leaning more in direction of Sarma these, days, no worries, but the whole Kalacakra account seems wholly fictional to me.

Crazywisdom said:

No one seems ever have to refute that.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it's been refuted. But no one pays any attention to what other people say, relying only on what their own tradition claims.

Crazywisdom said:

Then there's Lawapa who got the Dakini stuff. It seems these are the first dudes to teach Vajrayana. Padmasambhava was not the first dude.

Malcolm wrote:

Luipa's teacher was Nagarjuna. The latter's teacher was Saraha I. Saraha was the one who revealed the Cakrasamvara Tantra, but Luipa was the first person to write it down. From the general Sarma POV, Saraha is the first mahasiddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 3:10 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Lineage masters say mantra is short for Manas trahi, mind protection, mantra and tantra are interchangeable.

Malcolm wrote:

While it is true that mantra is etymologized as manas + tra in the Guhyasamāja, the Vajrasikhara states, "a tantra is a saṃtāna," that "a tantra is a continuum." This definition is universal in all schools of Tibetan Buddhism.

Crazywisdom said:

I wasn't contradicting you. I agree.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I was just clarifying. I didn't feel contradicted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 3:17 AM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on Orgyen Chowang Rinpoche?

Content:

TheSynergist said:

Hi, everyone,

I want to get started with Dzogchen, and I'm trying to find a teacher. I was thinking about checking out Orgyen Chowang Rinpoche, since he's based near where I live and he seems to have some beginner-level teachings. Does anyone have any experience with/thoughts on him or his org (the Pristine Mind Foundation)?

Thanks!

Malcolm wrote:

He is a very nice person.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 4:26 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Giovanni said:

Zhen Li I simply sit at the feet of my Vajrayana teachers and attempt the best I can to put the teachings they give me into practice.

Their instructions to me seldom make reference to Sutras, they are pragmatic. When they are from written teachings they are far more likely to be commentaries or from terma. In fact most of my practice for the last 15 years has been from terma. I have followed this path in general for nearly 25 years and it suits me.

I am not claiming that all should follow this model. But there are viable alternatives to sutrayana.

Brunelleschi said:

So, you claim to not believe/take at face value the stories in the Sutras or relics left behind such as footprints. However, you believe in termas? I mean, it's not exactly a consistent set of beliefs.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you know what they say, "Consistency is the hobgoblin of the small minded..."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 5:08 AM

Title: Re: What is buddhist view of birth?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Dzongsar Khyentse often encourages people to have lots of babies and teach them Dharma, so as to spread more happiness and goodness in our world.

Malcolm wrote:

That's easy for him to say, as he does not have to raise them nor feed them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 5:09 AM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on Orgyen Chowang Rinpoche?

Content:

TheSynergist said:

Hi, everyone,

I want to get started with Dzogchen, and I'm trying to find a teacher. I was thinking about checking out Orgyen Chowang Rinpoche, since he's based near where I live and he seems to have some beginner-level teachings. Does anyone have any experience with/thoughts on him or his org (the Pristine Mind Foundation)?

Thanks!

Malcolm wrote:  
He is a very nice person.

philji said:  
But is he a very nice or even better good teacher?

Malcolm wrote:  
He is a qualified teacher. I have met him personally, many years ago.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 9:36 AM  
Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
There is only one genuine authority, your experience. You put the teachings into practice, attain the experiences, and this verifies the authority of the guru, scripture, and intimate instruction. There is no other way. If you don't have the experience, everything else is just rank dogmatism.

Crazywisdom said:  
I have serious doubts about these Dzogchen tantra lineage claims. They sound lfictional. And the books seem invented by Tibetans.

Malcolm wrote:  
As opposed to books invented by Indians?

Crazywisdom said:  
They also say Padmasambhava was Indrabhuti's son. So who knows? All I can gather is an Indrabhuti got Guhyasamaja. Kukaraja got Guhyagarbha.

Malcolm wrote:  
Indrabhuti I supposedly lived at the time of the Buddha, thus not the putative father of Padmasambhava. The Kukkuraja lineage story is a Nyingma account, so I am not sure why you regard it as more reliable than say Dzogchen lineage histories. You seem to leaning more in direction of Sarma these, days, no worries, but the whole Kalacakra account seems wholly fictional to me.

Crazywisdom said:  
No one seems ever have to refute that.

Malcolm wrote:  
Of course it's been refuted. But no one pays any attention to what other people say, relying only on what their own tradition claims.



Crazywisdom said:

Then there's Lawapa who got the Dakini stuff. It seems these are the first dudes to teach Vajrayana. Padmasambhava was not the first dude.

Malcolm wrote:

Luipa's teacher was Nagarjuna. The latter's teacher was Saraha I. Saraha was the one who revealed the Cakrasamvara Tantra, but Luipa was the first person to write it down. From the general Sarma POV, Saraha is the first mahasiddha.

Crazywisdom said:

Then what is true? How is it these methods produce the visions and such if they were made up by anonymous sources? You believe Shakyamuni did or didn't recite Mahayana to outer space avatars? Let's be honest. No lineage story is true. Totally unverifiable. Yet without lineage no Buddhahood, ever. Vajrayana is not just useful information. No one can use it without empowerment. Empowerments require unbroken lineage or no one wakes up to anything. No Dzogchen poetry will do a damn thing without empowerment. Without empowerment togal is a joke. I focused on Kukaraja because the accounts match up. Aside from having dog consorts in a poison lake at time of Marpa as Kagyu say, or if he was Indrabhuti buddy boy, he practiced ganachakrapuja at night. There are no siddhis in clever witticisms. Let's get down to brass tacks. There are unbroken lineages? Yes or no? If yes, which? If no? You can invent your lineage as you want.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 12:14 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Your conception of the Buddha is temporally (historically) limited.

Malcolm wrote:

Not at all, but texts are artifacts in time which are not and can never be perfect, flawless, representations of the Dharma the Buddha taught. Simply put, they are conditioned by the people who committed them to writing, and in writing them, their understanding and biases make themselves known to us, should we care to notice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Samdhinirmocana Sutra (Scripture on the Explication of Underlying Meaning)

Content:

Aemilius said:

I have studied and read the John Powers translation scores of times. Later I found that Thomas Cleary has also made a translation of the Samdhinirmocana sutra :

"This volume presents a landmark translation of a classical sourcebook of Buddhist yoga, the Sandhinirmochana-sutra, or "Scripture Unlocking the Mysteries," a revered text of the school of Buddhism known as Vijñānavāda or Yogācāra. The study of this scripture is essential preparation for anyone undertaking meditation exercise. Linking theory and praxis, the scripture offers a remarkably detailed and thorough course of study in both the philosophical and pragmatic foundation of Buddhist yoga, and their perfect, harmonious union in the realization of Buddhist enlightenment."

Malcolm wrote:

The 84,000 translation is much better, and shows how in numerous places Powers, etc. lost the plot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Your conception of the Buddha is temporally (historically) limited.

Malcolm wrote:

Not at all, but texts are artifacts in time which are not and can never be perfect, flawless, representations of the Dharma the Buddha taught. Simply put, they are conditioned by the people who committed them to writing, and in writing them, their understanding and biases make themselves known to us, should we care to notice.

Zhen Li said:

I agree with your statement. I differ in regard to how we can use and view sūtras as practitioners. Even an utterance from the mouth of Śākyamuni Buddha is not going to be a perfect representation of the Dharma. As the Tathāgataguhya puts it, from the time of his awakening under the Bodhi Tree to his entrance into Parinirvāṇa, the Buddha never uttered a single word. If a Dharma gate is not suited to us, our job as practitioners is not then to assume ill intent—which may or may not have been present. There are so many possibilities that are beyond our ability to fathom that it is better to withhold judgement and refocus on what is important in our individual practice. In our capacity as scholars we can certainly use critical techniques to analyse texts—I do this as well, but this is not part of my approach to texts as practitioners.

Malcolm wrote:

There are too many places in the sutras where women are put down, their ability to attain buddhahood, and so on, denied, etc. Indeed, this what the samaya against denigrating women serves to correct. Simply put, in Vajrayana it is understood that to criticize women on the basis of their gender is to criticize wisdom itself. Since the Buddha would never do this, we must accept such passages which criticize women on the basis of their gender to be errors of transcription.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 8:59 PM

Title: Re: How is the development of Siddhi's dealt with officially?

Content:

Dreams said:

Am frustrated about the matter. Can anyone with knowledge and experience knock some sense into people like me who are genuinely concerned?

Malcolm wrote:

There are two kinds of siddhi: common and supreme. The one that matters is supreme siddhi, awakening. Flying, walking through walls. and so on have nothing to do with awakening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Samdhinirmocana Sutra (Scripture on the Explication of Underlying Meaning)

Content:

Aemilius said:

I have studied and read the John Powers translation scores of times. Later I found that Thomas Cleary has also made a translation of the Samdhinirmocana sutra :

"This volume presents a landmark translation of a classical sourcebook of Buddhist yoga, the Sandhinirmochana-sutra, or "Scripture Unlocking the Mysteries," a revered text of the school of Buddhism known as Vijnanavada or Yogachara. The study of this scripture is essential preparation for anyone undertaking meditation exercise. Linking theory and praxis, the scripture offers a remarkably detailed and thorough course of study in both the philosophical and pragmatic foundation of Buddhist yoga, and their perfect, harmonious union in the realization of Buddhist enlightenment."

Malcolm wrote:

The 84,000 translation is much better, and shows how in numerous places Powers, etc. lost the plot.

<https://84000.co/new-publication-unravelling-the-intent/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Samdhinirmocana Sutra (Scripture on the Explication of Underlying Meaning)

Content:

Aemilius said:

I have studied and read the John Powers translation scores of times. Later I found that Thomas Cleary has also made a translation of the Samdhinirmocana sutra :

"This volume presents a landmark translation of a classical sourcebook of Buddhist yoga, the Sandhinirmochana-sutra, or "Scripture Unlocking the Mysteries," a revered text of the school of Buddhism known as Vijñānavāda or Yogācāra. The study of this scripture is essential preparation for anyone undertaking meditation exercise. Linking theory and praxis, the scripture offers a remarkably detailed and thorough course of study in both the philosophical and pragmatic foundation of Buddhist yoga, and their perfect, harmonious union in the realization of Buddhist enlightenment."

Malcolm wrote:

The 84,000 translation is much better, and shows how in numerous places Powers, etc. lost the plot.

Lotomístico said:

Wonderful, another translation, Keenan didn't mention this one in the intro to his BDK translation so I was unaware of it. Thankfully, I found a PDF and downloaded it.

How do you find Keenan's translation?

Perhaps Powers isn't as skillful a translator, is less familiar with the original languages, or had access to different texts?

This kind of goes back to my dialogue with Zhen Li in a different thread, regarding translation of sutras and other ancient texts.

Malcolm wrote:

Powers is a perfectly fine scholar. His translation was made three decades ago, and we understand more now about these texts than we did then. So, like all translations, it has been superseded. This goes for Keenan's, Clearly's, and so on. I generally do not favor translations from Chinese in English, where a translation can be made from Tibetan or Sanskrit directly. Nevertheless, consulting Chinese translations in the process of making a translation of a text from Tibetan or Sanskrit is absolutely required.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 10th, 2021 at 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I understand lots of folks like terma lineages.

Malcolm wrote:

Everything in Mahāyāna is a terma. So you better just stick with the Pali Canon and Hinayāna, if you want to "go for kama or old lineages."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 12:50 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are too many places in the sutras where women are put down, their ability to attain buddhahood, and so on, denied, etc. Indeed, this what the samaya against denigrating women serves to correct. Simply put, in Vajrayana it is understood that to criticize women on the basis of their gender is to criticize wisdom itself. Since the Buddha would never do this, we must accept such passages which criticize women on the basis of their gender to be errors of transcription.

Zhen Li said:

I see the sūtra as clearly positing the opposite position. You are choosing to be offended by ignoring the bigger picture and the discussion that takes place over the various fascicles. This is simply not as clear cut as you think.

Malcolm wrote:

It's pretty clear cut: "women who accept tathāgatagarbha teachings are men. Men who reject tathāgatagarbha teachings are women."

Zhen Li said:

A "transcription" error is a mistake in transferring an utterance or another text. There are transcription errors in the sūtra as we have it. But here the premises and conclusion, as well as broader context, are clear. You are just ignoring them.

Malcolm wrote:

My point, as you know, is that these texts are not necessarily accurate representations of "What the Buddha said." Since this is not well-spoken, it should not be considered valid. It's a classic example of sexist writing, and no modern, well-educated women will find the passage acceptable.

No, I am pointing out the very premise is unacceptable. If the premise is unacceptable, the conclusion cannot be acceptable. On its face, the passage clearly ranks women as inferior to men.

Zhen Li said:

Anyway, I appreciate a strong sense of justice and I don't think it is necessarily a bad thing, just be careful of letting it cause you to miss the forest for the trees. The point should be very clear from the text that for all practical purposes one's sex is irrelevant to Buddha nature.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. However, that point is made more effectively in other sūtras than this one. It is not a central or crucial passage in main body of the sūtra's argument but it is sterling example of sexism in sūtra composition. We can, of course, attempt to forensically understand why this particular statement was made, but all we will really come up with,

as we both agree, is that the passage was written at a time when women were more disenfranchised than they are now, at least in most modern countries. The significance of the passage is that it shows how disenfranchised women were when the Mahāyāna sūtras were composed. This is how we should understand passages in sutras where women are encouraged to aspire to be born as men; where buddhahood is described as desirable because beings there only have penises; other episodes where women undergo gender transformation merely upon hearing a sūtra, such as in the Māyopamasamādhi Sūtra, and so on.

Anyway, we've beat this dead horse into dog meat...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 12:54 AM

Title: Re: Samdhinirmocana Sutra (Scripture on the Explication of Underlying Meaning)

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Would you say that, in general, a Tibetan translation of a Sutra would be closer to the original Sanskrit than a Chinese one, and if so, why might that be?

Where the original Sanskrit text is available, that would seem like the ideal source, though in many cases only Tibetan or Chinese translations of many texts are available.

Malcolm wrote:

Chinese translations often show stages of accretion in a given sūtra, whereas Tibetan translations tend to show sūtra texts in their mature forms as they existed in Northern India, since sūtra translation in China started in the second century CE and only in the 8th century CE in Tibet.

Because the Sanskrit of these texts is often hard to parse, having the Chinese and Tibetan are invaluable aids for translators, since they form a kind of commentary. We are still 100 years away from having the best translations we can muster. So we do our best.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 5:28 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Terma is more or less a Padmasambhava thing which was a service to Tibet.

Malcolm wrote:

You're wrong, but that's ok.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 9:55 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Terma is more a less a Padmasambhava thing which was a service to Tibet.

Malcolm wrote:

You're wrong, but that's ok.

Crazywisdom said:

I know there are lots of terms not from Padmasambhava, like Chetsun Nyingthig or Longchen Nyingthig. Dzogchen tantras are sort of terma. Anyway Lord Jigten Sumgon said in Gongchig these are not the most profound, that the main tantras like Hevajra with the elaborate rituals are what benefit chigcharwa.

Malcolm wrote:

If you like Gongchik, then you follow that instruction. Your likes and dislikes are quite irrelevant to the paths of others, as are mine. In the end, there is only one authority, ourselves, and what we personally decide to accept and reject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 10:49 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The point of this passage is the opposite. There is absolutely no need to seek birth as a man because one has Buddha nature. Male has been redefined from biological sex.

Malcolm wrote:

If budhhanature has been redefined as male, and male has been defined as superior, it's still sexist. It's surprising you don't get this point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 10:51 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Follow...predilection and preference.

Malcolm wrote:

That's all people follow anyway. You're just doing what you are criticizing.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 12:15 PM  
Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro  
Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:  
I don't even know how that's a response to my comment but ok  
I think the topic has become "relying on the lama" vs. "relying on yourself".

Malcolm wrote:  
You pick your guru, your guru does not pick you.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 7:48 PM  
Title: Re: MPNS on Women  
Content:

Zhen Li said:  
The point of this passage is the opposite. There is absolutely no need to seek birth as a man because one has Buddha nature. Male has been redefined from biological sex.

Malcolm wrote:  
If buddhanature has been redefined as male, and male has been defined as superior, it's still sexist. It's surprising you don't get this point.

Zhen Li said:  
If women are included within male, then sex is irrelevant.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yet it is not, in fact. In this passage "woman" has been redefined to include men, along with women, who are inferior. The whole point is that "woman" exemplifies "inferior." There is no way around this, despite your struggle to gloss this.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 11th, 2021 at 11:18 PM  
Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
You pick your guru, your guru does not pick you.

Cinnabar said:  
I don't think it's that simple.

Karmic connections are outside our control.



Malcolm wrote:  
You mean you did not examine this person at all?

Zhen Li said:  
If women are included within male, then sex is irrelevant.

Zhen Li said:  
That is incorrect. Nothing about the nature of women has been denoted as inferior. Rather, the term 呵責 is translated as rebuke, scold, criticise, blame, abuse. This is indicating that females are labelled as inferior. This is entirely about words and conventions. There is no way around this no matter how much talk of an essential nature of inferiority you want to insert into the Buddha's words here—it is just not there. In fact, what you are doing is inserting assumptions you have about attitudes towards women from other texts into the wording here, which is not present. In doing this, you are distorting the teaching's clear universalistic intent and simply expressing another of your repeated biases and aversions against this sūtra. Just because you do not like the sūtra does not mean you have to ruin it for others who may take it as authoritative.

Malcolm wrote:  
You are just making it worse, for example here the MPN delivers this sexist trope just before the passage we have been discussing:

Sons of good families, and also daughters of good families, should cultivate the nature

[rang bzhin, prakṛti] of a male. Why? The nature of women is the source through which all adharmā [chos ma yin] is caused. For example, a single bee can never moisten the entire ground, and also can never be satisfied. Likewise, a woman's desire can never be satisfied...[more explication of the example]

The Tibetan translation from Chinese is very little different:

རིགས་ཀྱི་བྱ་གཞན་ཡང་རིགས་ཀྱི་བྱ་མོ་ལ་སོགས་པ་གང་ཡང་སྐྱེས་པའི་ལུས་མི་འདོད་པ་མེད་དོ། ཉེ་ཅིའི་ཕྱར་ཞེན།  
བྱ་མེད་ཐམས་ཅད་ནི་སྤྲིག་པ་ཐམས་ཅད་ཀྱི་གནས་ཡིན་པའི་ཕྱར་རོ། རིགས་ཀྱི་བྱ་གཞན་ཡང་འདྲི་སྒྲ་དཔེར་ན།  
སྤང་བའི་གཅིན་གྱིས་ནི་ས་ཆེན་པོ་འདྲི་ཆུན་པར་མི་རུས་སོ། བྱ་མེད་ཅེས་བྱ་བའི་འདོད་ཆགས་ཆོག་མི་ཤེས་པའང་དེ་དང་འབྲས་སྟེ...[Toh. 119, vol. 52, f. 152b—153a]

Further, sons and daughters of good families should never not desire the body [lus] of a man. Why? All women are the source of all wickedness [sdig pa]. Son of a good family, further, it as follows: A single bee cannot moisten the entire ground, likewise, a woman is never satisfied by desire...

It is immediately after this example that we get to the passage that we have been discussing:

རིགས་ཀྱི་བྱ་དེ་བས་ན། ཡོངས་སུ་ཐུང་ན་ལས་འདས་པ་ཆེན་པོ་འདྲི་ཐོས་ནས་བྱ་མེད་ཀྱི་རང་བཞིན་ལ་མ་ཆགས་པའི་སེམས་བསྐྱེད་པར་བྱ་སྟེ།  
སྐྱེས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་དུ་འགྲུར་བར་སེམས་བསྐྱེད་པར་བྱའོ། ཅིའི་ཕྱར་ཞེན། མདོ་འདྲི་ནི།  
སྐྱེས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་དེ་གཤེགས་པའི་སྤྱིང་པོ་ཡང་དག་པར་སྟོན་པའི་ཕྱར་རོ། སྐྱེས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་ནི། མི་ཞེས་བྱའོ། ཉེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་ནི།  
སྐྱེས་པའོ། འཛིག་ཏུན་ན་སྐྱེས་པ་ཡོད་པ་གང་ཡིན་པ་དེ་དག་ཀྱང་བདག་ཉིད་ལ་དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་སྤྱིང་པོ་ཡོད་པར་མི་ཤེས་པའི་ཕྱར་སྐྱེས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་མ་ཡིན་ནོ། ཉེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་སྤྱིང་པོ་མི་ཤེས་པ་གང་ཡིན་པ་དེ་དག་ནི།  
བྱ་མེད་ཡིན་ནོ། ཞེས་ང་ཟེར་རོ། ཉེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་སྤྱིང་པོ་བདག་ལ་ཡོད་དོ་སྟེ་སྤང་བའི་ལས་པ་གང་ཡིན་པ་དེ་དག་ནི། སྐྱེས་པའི་མཆོག་ཏུ་གཏོགས་ཏེ།  
བྱ་མེད་ཡིན་དུ་ཟེན་ཀྱང་སྐྱེས་པའི་མཆོག་ཏུ་གཏོགས་སོ། ཉེ་སྟར་ན།  
ཡོངས་སུ་ཐུང་ན་ལས་འདས་པ་ཆེན་པོའི་མདོ་ཆེན་པོ་འདྲི་ནི་དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་སྤྱིང་པོ་སྟོན་པའི་ཕྱར་དཔག་ཏུ་མེད་པ་ཡིན་ནོ། [Toh. 120, vol. 54, f. 137b]

Son of a good family, therefore, having heard this Mahāparinirvāṇa, one should generate the thought to never be attached to the nature of a woman. One should generate the thought to become the nature of a man. Why? Because this sūtra correctly explicates the male nature to be tathāgatagarbha [de bzhin gshegs pa'i snying po]. The male nature is called "man." The nature of the tathāgatagarbha is male. Where ever there are men in the world who do not know that the tathāgatagarbha exists in themselves, they lack the male nature. I call those who do not know tathāgatagarbha "women." Those who correctly know and think "Tathāgatagarbha exists in me," are the supreme among men, even such women who grasp this are included in the supreme among men. In this case, this great Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra is inestimable because it explicates tathāgatagarbha.

It is virtually impossible to sustain an argument that this passage is not predicated upon sexist attitudes towards women. Indeed, the composer of the sūtra sets up the entire passage by describing women as insatiable, and the source of all Adharma. It is not like passages written for bhikṣus that describe the perils of the female form, which are to be reversed by bhikṣuṇīs. It is clearly stating FEMALE BODIES are inherently WICKED as opposed to MALE BODIES that are inherently VIRTUOUS. You just don't get much more sexist than that.

And there is the passage in the beginning where the upāsikās mentally denigrate their female bodies as wicked (བྱད་མེད་གྱི་ལུས་ངན་ནོ་སྒྱུ་དུ་སྒྲིད་པ་ [Toh. 120 vol. 54, f. 7b]). Then there is the stock passage which declares a tathāgata only takes a male body, but displays both male and female bodies to tame sentient beings

(དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པ་ནི་རྟག་དུ་སྐྱེས་པ་ཁོ་ན་ཡིན་བཞིན་དུ་སེམས་ཅན་རྣམས་གདུལ་བའི་ཕྱིར་གཉི་གར་ཡང་སྟོན་ཏོ [Toh. 120, vol 54, f. 63b]), etc.

Now, of course I understand why you wish to maintain some sort of interpretive scheme to save the words of the text from clearly saying what they say. There is the passage where the Buddha explains his use of exaggeration with the word "all" with the following verse:

[1]All rivers wind through valleys,  
all women are deceitful,  
all groves are wooded,  
and all lords are happy. [/i]

Naturally, Mañjuśrī stands up and objects to this, and explains in short:

Not all rivers are winding,  
not all women are deceitful,  
not all groves are wooded,  
and not all lords are happy.

After Mañjuśrī's explanation, the Buddha responds with the analogy of medicine. Then there is the gender transformation of Kotaka's daughter, and the sūtra concludes shortly thereafter, at least in the Tibetan recension.

And of course, the only gender that is subject to any negative tropes in this sūtra on the basis of gender are women. So, sexist. We really should poll women on this passage, to see how they feel about. I am pretty sure of the outcome.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 4:47 AM

Title: Re: Validation statement in Vajrayana

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

Hi,

The models which stabilish how phenomena rise in Tantra teachings are directly experienced by practitioners/masters or are merely philosophical assertions?

i.e. It is said in Tantras that matter rises from consciousness (and not viveversa), is this assumption stated and confirmed by subtle experiences that can occur practicing the two stages or by inferential reasoning?

Thank you in advance

heart said:

Matter don't arise from consciousness, appearances do.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Huh? Not according to Vasubandhu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 4:51 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I know there are lots of terms not from Padmasambhava, like Chetsun Nyingthig or Longchen Nyingthig. Dzogchen tantras are sort of terma. Anyway Lord Jigten Sumgon said in Gongchig these are not the most profound, that the main tantras like Hevajra with the elaborate rituals are what benefit chigcharwa.

Malcolm wrote:

If you like Gongchik, then you follow that instruction. Your likes and dislikes are quite irrelevant to the paths of others, as are mine. In the end, there is only one authority, ourselves, and what we personally decide to accept and reject.

Crazywisdom said:

As we should both know, acceptance and rejection is illusion. I'm doing what one does when one doesn't accept or reject and keeps an open mind about what the lineage masters say is important.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means you are making a choice to accept X master as an authority. That is something you are accepting, and in the process are rejecting what other masters say.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Also it's not so much a preference as a teaching I got from a lama with a lineage, not something I researched on the internet.

Malcolm wrote:

There are clearly teachings and teachers you prefer over others. You've declared your preferences in many posts now, even going so far as to impugn the legitimacy of

Chogyal Namkhai Norbu's tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 6:43 AM

Title: Re: Validation statement in Vajrayana

Content:

heart said:

Matter don't arise from consciousness, appearances do.

/magnus

rai said:

where does the matter arise from according to that view?

Vajrasambhava said:

From karmic winds (le kyi lung)

Malcolm wrote:

Vayu is already a kind of matter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You mean you did not examine this person at all?

Cinnabar said:

Of course that is not what I meant. And that is not the logical implication of what I said.

Malcolm wrote:

Karma is not fate. Otherwise, if it were, there would be no point in examining a prospective teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 10:23 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Follow...predilection and preference.

Malcolm wrote:

That's all people follow anyway. You're just doing what you are criticizing.

Crazywisdom said:

I guess you didn't notice the part where I said I'm following my lamas' advices.

Malcolm wrote:

Which is choice you've made on your own authority and no one else's.

Crazywisdom said:

Does that mean my preference is to heed my lamas? Yes. It is.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence you are your own ultimate authority, which was my point.

Crazywisdom said:

Who is the lineage master of the 13 Tantras? Who is the primary unbroken holder of these transmissions? Was that your teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no certificate for such things. There is no primary lineage of holder of Dzogchen, Mahāmudra, the Path with Its Result, etc. The idea that there is such a thing is politics, not reality. No one owns or is the primary lineage holder of any of the Buddha's teachings. There is no patent, no trademark on the Buddha's teachings.

Lineages are not franchises nor are they intellectual property. These things have been treated as franchises in Tibet, but this is corruption.

A lineage is something that one has received, practiced, and then transmits. That's all. Everyone who receives teachings receives a lineage, which they are then responsible for preserving as best they can, through practice and realization.

Crazywisdom said:

I was told to uphold old lineages.

Malcolm wrote:

Lineages begin outside of time.

But historically, the oldest extant Vajrayāna lineages (outside of Shingon and Tendai) came to Tibet in the mid-eighth century, Guhyasamāja, Guhyagarbha, Vajrakīlaya, Śrī Heruka (aka Yangdak), etc. There may be some Sarma lineages which are contemporaneous with those brought to Tibet, but in reality the historical origins of all Vajrayāna lineages are obscure, with only lore and legend remaining, just like the origin of Mahāyāna Sūtras. That's just a fact.

All termas are based on Kama. It is a requirement of the terma tradition. And also Sarma schools we frequently see older lineages being refreshed by pure visions.

Crazywisdom said:

Who is the primary unbroken holder of these transmissions? Was that your teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

Chogyal Namkhai Norbu is among the most important Dzogchen teachers to live in the last 200 years. Everyone knows this. His predecessor, recognized by the 16th Karmapa among others, was Adzom Drukpa. Adzom Drukpa collated and printed the 17 tantras as an independent collection. So, yes, ChNN was a lineage holder of the seventeen tantras, as well as a lineage holder of Semde and Longde. Those who received these transmissions from him, and treat his memory with proper respect and devotion, are all lineage holders of these teachings as well. YMMV

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 12th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Karma is not fate. Otherwise, if it were, there would be no point in examining a prospective teacher.

Cinnabar said:

Of course that is not what I am saying at all.

I knew of my root teacher for some years before I met him. I had heard of him from dharma friends. I had an immediate, direct, and intense draw to him. So much so it was shocking just seeing his photograph. I examined him by talking to his students, to those who hosted his teachings. Other lamas who knew him. I started learning about what he taught to the best of my ability.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but nevertheless the decision was yours to make. You might have made a different decision.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 1:24 AM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

As we should both know, acceptance and rejection is illusion. I'm doing what one does when one doesn't accept or reject and keeps an open mind about what the lineage masters say is important.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means you are making a choice to accept X master as an authority. That is something you are accepting, and in the process are rejecting what other masters say.

Crazywisdom said:

Not if I didn't get taught by those masters.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm., I was talking about a teacher you have accepted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

So now you accept tulkus? Everyone does not accept this about it ChNN. But it's ok if you do. You lot are a big group in this forum, but very small and sort of odd in TB. A minority view is scewing things here. So did he authorize you to teach these things?

Malcolm wrote:

I never rejected the idea of rebirth, and even the possibility recognitions in toto. I am not enamored of the institution as it exists today.

The point is that important Kagyu, Sakya, and Nyingma institutional heads accepted him as an important reincarnation of a major tertön.

The idea that someone can authorize someone else to teach Dharma is just institutional politics. The Buddha refused to appoint an heir. People forget that in their quest for external legitimization.

But the fact of the matter is that ChNN expressed many times the wish that all his students continue his tradition in every way they could, according to their own capacity. So I do my best.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Noble Eightfold Path in light of the Lotus Sutra

Content:

illarraza said:

Here is the Noble Eightfold Path appropriate for the Latter Day:

Right Views: Viewing the Lotus Sutra as the quintessence of the Buddha's teachings.



Taikor.Taikun said:

Means to hold the Lotus Sutra as the highest teaching? Does other Sutras 'excluded' from the learning of the Dharma path?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Chogyal Namkhai Norbu is among the most important Dzogchen teachers to live in the last 200 years. Everyone knows this. His predecessor, recognized by the 16th Karmapa among others, was Adzom Drukpa. Adzom Drukpa collated and printed the 17 tantras as an independent collection. So, yes, ChNN was a lineage holder of the seventeen tantras, as well as a lineage holder of Semde and Longde. Those who received these transmissions from him, and treat his memory with proper respect and devotion, are all lineage holders of these teachings as well. YMMV

rai said:

Was Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche recognised by 16th Karmapa as reincarnation of Adzom Drukpa or as a reincarnation of Dharmaraja (I read that on wiki)?

Malcolm wrote:

They are the same. Adzom Dukpa was part of one reincarnation lineage of Pema Karpo, the line of the Dharmarajas of Bhutan, hence his title, Chogyal. The other line rests in the person of the Drukchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 2:39 AM

Title: Re: Young Asian American Buddhists are reclaiming narrative after decades of white dominance

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

Good post, Padma. As for me, personally I would like to change my DW name back to my real name, but haven't figured out how to do so. If anyone has some tips, please dm me.

Malcolm wrote:

Ask the admin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 5:22 AM

Title: Re: How to become a modern Mahasiddha - some surprising comments

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I think it is true the Tibetans are very strict about Vinaya...

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. Some are, most are pretty lax, from a strict Vinaya POV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Sutra and Tantra Teachings

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Not if I didn't get taught by those masters.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm., I was talking about a teacher you have accepted.

Crazywisdom said:

Just the teacher I could find. Luckily he was authentic Drikung Kagyu. For over 10 years I went to everything I could. I chose to go to teachings. I didn't choose what was taught or who taught it. That was chosen for me. Eventually I learned what composes a complete teaching, a complete lineage and accomplishment. I understood which teaching I had which was complete and focused on that. Then I was able to take stock in pith instructions like Gongchig or Dzogchen Upadeshas and understand the when, where, what and why it is useful. So I am very adamant it takes a foundation of an elder Buddha tantra for the pith instructions to be useful. The gurus who propound a foundation like this are indeed the best gurus with the siddhis and amazing students. Pith instructions are footnotes. No one understands a book by only reading the footnotes. Worse. Commentaries are footnotes. And pith instructions are endnotes. The tantra is the main text, unless it's a pith instruction tantra, then it's a book of endnotes.

Malcolm wrote:

One may think: "We concede that our decisions are unreliable, but when we follow the decisions of the Buddha, we are infallible." Then who decided that the Buddha is infallible? If you say, "The great scholars and adepts like Nagarjuna decided that he is infallible," then who decided that Nagarjuna is infallible? If you say, "The Foremost Lama Tsong khapa decided it," then who knows that the Foremost Lama is infallible? If you say, "Our kind and peerless lama, the excellent and great so and so decided," then infallibility, which depends on your excellent lama, is decided by your own mind. In fact, therefore, it is a tiger who vouches for a lion, it is a yak who vouches for a tiger, it is a dog who vouches for a yak, it is a mouse who vouches for a dog, it is an insect who vouches for a mouse. Thus, an insect is made the final voucher for them all. Therefore, when one analyzes in detail the final basis for any decision, apart from coming back to one's own mind, nothing else whatsoever is perceived.

— Ganden Chopel

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 7:18 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Some teachers respected ChNN some laughed at him.

Malcolm wrote:

This is calumny, one of the four verbal nonvirtues. It's also entirely unnecessary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 8:36 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

But is it a calumny?

Malcolm wrote:

Making repeated hearsay statements intended to cause people to question another person's integrity are certainly calumnies. However, not my karma. This board is completely irrelevant to the Buddhist world. It has no influence nor sway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Despite all the complicated rhetoric, it amounts to a doctrine common to all schools—the mind is inherently pure, and afflictions are merely adventitious.

Tatsuo said:

I also vaguely remember there being a concept of stages with one stage being "verbal identity". How does full enlightenment (anuttara-samyak-sambodhi) look like in Tendai thought?

Seishin said:

Going back to your original question, what you mention here are the Six Identities (六即 Rokusoku). To use Paul Swanson's translation;

1) Identity in principle/reality 理即 (risoku), that all things are inherently endowed with

the Buddha-nature and the principle of reality as the threefold truth; One single thought-moment is identical with the principle of the tathāgata-garbha.

2) Verbal identity 名字即 (myōji-soku), to hear the words concerning the dharma and reach an intellectual understanding;

3) Identity in contemplative practice 觀行即 (kangyō-soku), to meditate on and practice reality as threefold truth;

4) Identity in outer appearance 相似即 (or resemblance; sōji-soku), to become related, or have a semblance to, true enlightenment, to sever all obstacles of mistaken views and thoughts of this triple world;

5) Identity in partial realization 分證即 (bunshō-soku), to have complete insight into the threefold truth and awake from all ignorance;

6) Ultimate identity 究竟即 (kukyō-soku), ultimate enlightenment

These are essentially the 42 Bodhisattva stages (minus the 10 faiths)

Zhiyi's own explanation of these can be summed up as (again using Paul Swanson's translation);

1) a poor person has a house with a store of [buried] treasure, but does not know about it.

2) A friend points this out, and they come to know about it.

3) They clear away the weeds and dig,

4) until gradually they come near to getting [the treasure].

5) They approach and open the treasure, and

6) they exhaustively take it out and use it.

Here, you can see how the Store of Treasure can be understood as Hongaku.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 10:26 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Some teachers respected ChNN some laughed at him.

Malcolm wrote:

This is calumny, one of the four verbal nonvirtues. It's also entirely unnecessary.

Crazywisdom said:

There's nothing nonvirtuous about truth. I know who I spoke with and what I witnessed.

Your claim, everyone knows... Is just not true. You believe, some believe... Ok. That's true.

Malcolm wrote:

Your comment is hearsay, and since it really has nothing to do with anything in this thread, other than your obvious dislike of me, well...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 11:20 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I think your expectations are somewhat unrealistic.

Crazywisdom said:

...go to the top of the lineages with unbroken old tantras and get the teachings there...

yagmort said:

i am not saying i got legit point of view, but the way i see it, even if you do this, i don't imagine Khenpo Namdrol will be sitting there next to you all the long way through giving you pith instructions and finding his way to catch you off-guard to give a skull-cup of alcohol coupled with a shoe slap in your face to get you to realize true nature of things.

wang and probably some personal instructions is the most one can expect from Khenpo Namdrol, and then you'll be sent to some other tutor who will probably become your actual teacher.

call me old-fashioned or deluded, but i do believe guru and disciple have to have intimate connection for the things to work. not saying you have to be buddies to chuckle about something, but your guru should be able to see you through to guide you and kind of cater things for a set of your own peculiarities. for me it is hard to be a disciple of some one who i don't know at all as a person. i like people raw and close, with all their character and warts, not some distant lama who i need to create my own ideas about.

i am not really fond of institutionalized tibetan buddhism. as a westerners we are here, lineage holders are there, and we have this huge chunk of institution between us. as i see it, it is much less a matter of our choice than it is of what is available, in terms of teachers.

feel free to correct me if i am mistaken

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 13th, 2021 at 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I like you a lot. You're very dedicated. I take issue with some stuff you say re dharma.

Malcolm wrote:  
For example?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

You take a novel interpretation of lineage and teaching based on your research and translations.

Malcolm wrote:

No. My understanding of these things comes from my gurus, including Khenchen Rinpoche, whose student I have been since 1993.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 1:32 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don't see anything back handed about it, he seems to be saying that ChNN produced an eclectic group of students who are not fundamentalists, I think he's right on that.

Malcolm wrote:

We are definitely not fundamentalists. At lot of us don't even think we are Buddhists...though this is an error.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: How to become a modern Mahasiddha - some surprising comments

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Tibetans have better continuity of Vinaya lineage. Theravada had some gaps and later renaissance. Not all. Theravada had a rough history.

Malcolm wrote:

You have a source for those assertions?

Here is a fairly decent review of the history of Vinaya:

<https://thubtenchodron.org/2007/08/arguments-full-ordination-women/>

So, not as good as you have asserted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 4:35 AM

Title: Re: How to become a modern Mahasiddha - some surprising comments

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Tibetans have better continuity of Vinaya lineage. Theravada had some gaps and later renaissance. Not all. Theravada had a rough history.

Malcolm wrote:

You have a source for those assertions?

Here is a fairly decent review of the history of Vinaya:

<https://thubtenchodron.org/2007/08/arguments-full-ordination-women/>

So, not as good as you have asserted.

Crazywisdom said:

It's true Tibetan women have to go to China or Taiwan.

Malcolm wrote:

And Vinaya in Tibet collapsed completely in the 9th century, which is more to the point, and was not restored for over 100 years.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 6:18 AM

Title: Re: How to become a modern Mahasiddha - some surprising comments

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's true Tibetan women have to go to China or Taiwan.

Malcolm wrote:

And Vinaya in Tibet collapsed completely in the 9th century, which is more to the point, and was not restored for over 100 years.

Crazywisdom said:

But got restored.

Malcolm wrote:

As was the Theravadin Sangha in Shri Lanka. However, the Theravada Sangha in Burma has enjoyed a continuous presence since at least the 3rd century CE.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 6:21 AM

Title: Re: How to become a modern Mahasiddha - some surprising comments

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's true Tibetan women have to go to China or Taiwan.

Malcolm wrote:

And Vinaya in Tibet collapsed completely in the 9th century, which is more to the point, and was not restored for over 100 years.

SilenceMonkey said:

What do you mean the vinaya "collapsed"? Do you mean the lineage was broken?

Malcolm wrote:

The three remaining monks in central Tibet fled Langdarma, and the so-called lower Vinaya was not reintroduced to Tibet until the late 10th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

So anyways, back to Ngondro

Since when did 100,000 turn into 1,200,000 guru mantra accumulations? As if it wasn't hard enough, somehow I wasn't listening when they explained the instructions. Does everybody do this?

Malcolm wrote:

It was always 100k per syllable...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 7:05 PM

Title: Re: nyima trakpa's terma

Content:

mingweicello said:

hi everyone. I just bought an volume of nyima Trakpa's terma in both tibetan and Chinese. (over 500 pages in pecha form)I don't how if his terma has been taught in the West, and are there any translation already published? I asked dzogchen Rinpoche (the



one based in Kham), he told me nyi trak's teachings are quite popular in Dzogchen monastery and Yaching. Yaching gumpa even include his works into a new edition of rinchen terzo currently, which, actually go against Jamgon Kongtrul's original plan to exclude him.

Malcolm wrote:

Not as far as I know. But His completion stage manual on Karling shiro has been taught, translated, and published.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 7:07 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It was always 100k per syllable...

Cinnabar said:

How did the standard accumulation of om vajra guru for ngondro become 10M then? And how did the standard accumulation of 7 line prayers for ngondro become 100k?

Malcolm wrote:

It is not 10 million. The amount of 7 line prayer was always roughly 10%.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 11:34 PM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Really shame that the Mahaparanirvana Sutra couldn't adopt our modern, "enlightened" PC views of gender,.

Genjo Conan said:

Plenty of classical Buddhist texts explicitly rejected the sort of sexism represented here, so please don't make this some "oh no, the SJWs are ruining Buddhism" deal.

Lotomístico said:

Fair enough, you're right, I see your point. But for me it does seem strange that such a late Mahayana text would express such a view (coming after the Lotus Sutra, which rejects such ideas)

Malcolm wrote:

These texts were composed in separate, isolated communities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: nyima trakpa's terma

Content:

mingweicello said:

hi everyone. I just bought an volume of nyima Trakpa's terma in both tibetan and Chinese. (over 500 pages in pecha form)I don't how if his terma has been taught in the West, and are there any translation already published? I asked dzogchen Rinpoche (the one based in Kham), he told me nyi trak's teachings are quite popular in Dzogchen monastery and Yaching. Yaching gumpa even include his works into a new edition of rinchen terzo currently, which, actually go against Jamgon Kongtrul's original plan to exclude him.

Malcolm wrote:

Not as far as I know. But His completion stage manual on Karling shidro has been taught, translated, and published.

heart said:

Do you mind telling me where?

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Wallace's natural liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Cinnabar said:

How did the standard accumulation of om vajra guru for ngondro become 10M then? And how did the standard accumulation of 7 line prayers for ngondro become 100k?

Malcolm wrote:

It is not 10 million. The amount of 7 line prayer was always roughly 10%.

Cinnabar said:

Several of my teachers said 10M om vajra gurus and 100k of seven line prayers is standard.

Malcolm wrote:

Instructions vary from teacher to teacher, but the standard number for any short mantra is 100k per syllable. Anyway, numbers don't matter. Quality matters.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 14th, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Actually it is just impermanence. Buddhism reigned supreme for over 1000 years in India. The Indian flag still respects this history.

Malcolm wrote:

Until the English revived his memory through Pali sources, the Indians completely forgot about Ashoka, who in any case was a sectarian butcher until his brother's head (who was slain by accident) was brought in for the bounty Ashoka had offered on the heads of Jain monks. You can read all about it in the Ashoka-avadana. Ashoka had 18k Jains slain for a cartoon depicting the Buddha prostrating to Mahāvira. Not very cool.

Aemilius said:

I have wondered what was this cartoon with Mahavira and Buddha like? -At the time of Ashoka there has not been any human-like representations of Buddha, according to the normative academic view.

"Although India had a long sculptural tradition and a mastery of rich iconography, the Buddha was never represented in human form, but only through Buddhist symbolism. This period may have been aniconic.

"Artists were reluctant to depict the Buddha anthropomorphically, and developed sophisticated aniconic symbols to avoid doing so (even in narrative scenes where other human figures would appear). This tendency remained as late as the 2nd century CE in the southern parts of India, in the art of the Amaravati School (see: Mara's assault on the Buddha). It has been argued that earlier anthropomorphic representations of the Buddha may have been made of wood and may have perished since then. However, no related archaeological evidence has been found.

"The earliest works of Buddhist art in India date back to the 1st century BCE. The Mahabodhi Temple at Bodh Gaya became a model for similar structures in Burma and Indonesia. The frescoes at Sigiriya are said to be even older than the Ajanta Caves paintings."

Malcolm wrote:

The earliest stoneworks. In any case, these was a Jain cartoon, not a Buddhist one. So I don't see the problem. Humans having been drawing pictures for millenia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Right view

Content:

yinyangkoi said:

Hello, when I apply right view to the present moment, I eventually come to the conclusion that I would need to become a monk and live in a monastery or become a hermit (leave the householder life) if I want to continue with the noble eightfold path.

Malcolm wrote:

That is the śravāka path. The Mahāyāna path is the six perfections and it is not necessary to do that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

heart said:

This in the Longchen Nyingtik where the Guru Yoga is considered the outer Guru sadhana.

Cinnabar said:

Well. That is what I was thinking as an example.

There are other examples too.

I was asking what the origins were.

Malcolm wrote:

According to the Ngondro Text from KDL's treasures:

Also, the minimum amount is one hundred thousand per syllable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 1:18 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

Lotomístico said:

The writings and commentaries of ancient Buddhist writers seem to be unaware of this, apparently believing them to be the literal words of Shakyamuni and composed in their completed forms originally as they had them.

Malcolm wrote:

In India, there was quite a bit of discussion and there is internal evidence in the sūtras themselves of attempts to parse Buddhavacana into neyārtha and nītārtha, which can be seen as a strategy to politely dismiss other's sūtras in preference for one's own.

Indians were not naive idiots, and were undoubtedly aware that the provenance of

Mahāyāna sūtras were widely contested.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 2:29 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Cinnabar said:

Means I'll never accumulate the 7 line prayer.

Malcolm wrote:

The seven line prayer is not a mantra, per se. It is a supplication, and the standard amount for it is 100k.

However if you wanted to accumulated it by syllable, it would be 4.9 million. Totally doable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 3:33 AM

Title: Re: Kakushi Nenbutsu: Forbidden underground heterodox Pure Land

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

Each of these schools has its own sovereign leader, and this has exactly the same functions as a pope or patriarch has in Catholicism or the Orthodox Church.

Malcolm wrote:

This is quite mistaken. There is no pope in Buddhism at all. The Buddha himself forbid it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism's solution to abject poverty

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Every day I'm confronted with extreme poverty when I walk out the door, beggars with small children or even children alone asking for food or spare change, Monday I was especially horrified by the sight of a young family (mom, dad, 2 young kids) rummaging through a heap of garbage bags looking for perhaps something of value and eating leftover food, can't society do better somehow? What is the solution, if any? Buddhism is primarily about relief from suffering in every tradition, what practical solutions can Buddhism offer to solve these problems? Because I'm feeling overwhelmed and I'm really not sure what I can do, I try to give spare change but this not a lasting solution.

Any ideas or suggestions are much appreciated.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not a job for Buddhism. This a job for the state. Buddhists can act on their conscience, however, and try to address these issues as best they can.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 4:32 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism's solution to abject poverty

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Every day I'm confronted with extreme poverty when I walk out the door, beggars with small children or even children alone asking for food or spare change, Monday I was especially horrified by the sight of a young family (mom, dad, 2 young kids) rummaging through a heap of garbage bags looking for perhaps something of value and eating leftover food, can't society do better somehow? What is the solution, if any? Buddhism is primarily about relief from suffering in every tradition, what practical solutions can Buddhism offer to solve these problems? Because I'm feeling overwhelmed and I'm really not sure what I can do, I try to give spare change but this not a lasting solution. Any ideas or suggestions are much appreciated.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not a job for Buddhism. This a job for the state. Buddhists can act on their conscience, however, and try to address these issues as best they can.

Lotomístico said:

So Buddhism can provide no lasting solutions to human suffering?

Malcolm wrote:

Your title is "Buddhism's solution to abject poverty."

2. "Master Gotama, what is the reason, what is the condition, why inferiority and superiority are met with among human beings, among mankind? For one meets with short-lived and long-lived people, sick and healthy people, ugly and beautiful people, insignificant and influential people, poor and rich people, low-born and high-born people, stupid and wise people. What is the reason, what is the condition, why superiority and inferiority are met with among human beings, among mankind?"

3. "Student, beings are owners of karmas, heirs of karmas, they have karmas as their progenitor, karmas as their kin, karmas as their homing-place. It is karmas that differentiate beings according to inferiority and superiority."

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.135.nymo.html>

Change your karma, change your future lives.

Lotomístico said:

Governments in much of the world are either incapable or unwilling to do anything about this and countless other problems faced by humanity. I was hoping Buddhism could offer solutions to human suffering, a person who cannot feed, clothe nor otherwise provide for themselves isn't going to sign up for a meditation course, basic needs must be met.

Malcolm wrote:

Governments are responsible for feeding, clothing, and providing for those who cannot provide these basic necessities for themselves. And you have left out most sentient beings. Who is going to take care of feeding, clothing, and otherwise providing for animals, insects, etc? Why restrict your domain to humans?

Change your karma, change your future lives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism's solution to abject poverty

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Could we say, then, that Buddhism is primarily focused (as are many if not most religions) on afterlife or future lives?

One could also see the negative aspect of seeing suffering people and saying, "well, it's their karma" as a way of easing one's conscience or absolving one's responsibility to be socially conscious. I experienced that in India and Thailand where many expressed this attitude to me. Of course, Karma is the teaching of Buddhism (and Hinduism), but naturally if we help a needy person, isn't that, too, a result of karmic causes?

A similar attitude about karma could be applied to a tyrant or evil ruler, or genocide, other injustices in the world, should one act? Speak up? Do something? Or take a more passive approach and see it as something we can do nothing about? For many, Karma could become a form of fatalism, and one could also see how a bad ruler or the wealthy could use it to justify their behavior and tell the poor and oppressed to just "accept their lot".

Encountering Dharma is certainly a result of Karma, as are the conditions that would facilitate the ability to practice it.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism is about personal evolution. If enough people evolve personally, the changes you want to see will happen. I wouldn't hold my breath though.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 5:48 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism's solution to abject poverty

Content:

Lotomístico said:

Could we say, then, that Buddhism is primarily focused (as are many if not most religions) on afterlife or future lives?

One could also see the negative aspect of seeing suffering people and saying, "well, it's their karma" as a way of easing one's conscience or absolving one's responsibility to be socially conscious. I experienced that in India and Thailand where many expressed this attitude to me. Of course, Karma is the teaching of Buddhism (and Hinduism), but naturally if we help a needy person, isn't that, too, a result of karmic causes?

A similar attitude about karma could be applied to a tyrant or evil ruler, or genocide, other injustices in the world, should one act? Speak up? Do something? Or take a more passive approach and see it as something we can do nothing about? For many, Karma could become a form of fatalism, and one could also see how a bad ruler or the wealthy could use it to justify their behavior and tell the poor and oppressed to just "accept their lot".

Encountering Dharma is certainly a result of Karma, as are the conditions that would facilitate the ability to practice it.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism is about personal evolution. If enough people evolve personally, the changes you want to see will happen. I wouldn't hold my breath though.

Lotomístico said:

No, I'm not terribly optimistic myself, the fact that suffering is increasing in so many ways, people committing so many evil deeds and subsequently reaping the results in this or future existences.

Malcolm wrote:

Suffering is not increasing. You are just seeing it more clearly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Cinnabar said:

Welcome to the club.

From what I'm reading here— neither do I.

Danny said:

Just being honest.

The heart is open.. the dakinis don't lie.

If they walk you back is for a reason.

Sorry .. being a bit cryptic.



Handed off ... and was like nah... not ready  
Lol

Cinnabar said:  
What are you talking about?

Malcolm wrote:  
Does it matter ?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 8:41 PM  
Title: Re: MPNS on Women  
Content:

Zhen Li said:

At core, all is illusion except for Dharmakāya—so we have to be careful about supposing that positivistic logic which springs from within delusion somehow removes possibilities for something beyond our patterned view of reality.

Malcolm wrote:  
Even Dharmakaya is illusory.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 9:15 PM  
Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro  
Content:

Cinnabar said:  
What are you talking about?

Malcolm wrote:  
Does it matter ?

Cinnabar said:  
Well I am wanting to learn, so, yes?

Malcolm wrote:  
I don't think you are going to learn anything from Danny's statement.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 15th, 2021 at 10:20 PM  
Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The notion to take what lamas say with a grain of salt and trust the books, well, that's not Vajrayana.

Malcolm wrote:

So you are essentially saying, contra the Buddha:

"Follow the person, not the Dharma."

Do I have that right? Do you have a citation from a tantra handy, which says one should follow whatever a guru tells one to do, even if it is contravenes Dharma principles? Or have I misunderstood you?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

GrapeLover said:

Zhen Li posits that the Lotus Sutra does not present particularly contradictory views on women, since the nāga king's daughter transforms into a physical male before becoming a bodhisattva and then a Buddha. If she had remained physically female, this would be more contradictory.

Malcolm wrote:

But this is consistent with the idea that in order to attain anuttarasamyaksambodhi, one must do so in a male body. And this is also an inherently sexist idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

Tibetan is matriarchal society.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, it isn't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 2:11 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

You guys are liberal I get it, but doesn't make your thoughts more accurate.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually it does. If you investigate carefully, you will find reality has a liberal bias.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

Facts:

Women do child birth and more nurturing to their child. Same in the animal kingdom. This is example of women have heavier karma. No?

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is an example of how women have more opportunity to generate merit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

You guys are liberal I get it, but doesn't make your thoughts more accurate.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually it does. If you investigate carefully, you will find reality has a liberal bias.

LastLegend said:

Accurate how? You would need to provide specific examples if you assume there isn't a karma different between a male and a female. It doesn't make them less becoming a Buddha if they pursue Dharma.

You would need to give specific examples on how women and men think behave through body speech and mind which associate with karma. It requires observation. If you want to say they are not different.

Malcolm wrote:

I was responding to your assertion about liberals not having more accurate thoughts. Of course we do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen and Vajrayana

Content:

Katty3n said:

Hello my friends in Dharma.

I practice Vajrayana for a quite few years and I got interested in Dzogchen teachings. I've read few books of Chogjal Namkhai Norbu and watched his teachings I feel like this is what I was looking for I feel connection. How can I combine those two ways? I'd like to get Transmission and start practicing Dzogchen. How can I do this? Who can give it me? Right now I'm still doing my Ngondro Practice. I live in Ireland, I've tried to contact Dzogchen community but no one replied to me.

Malcolm wrote:

Chogyal Namkhai Norbu passed away in 2018. These days, no one gives transmission inside of Dzogchen Community. You should however check in with the Shang Shung in London, they are doing online courses based on ChNN's teachings etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 3:04 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

Facts:

Women do child birth and more nurturing to their child. Same in the animal kingdom. This is example of women have heavier karma. No?

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is an example of how women have more opportunity to generate merit.

LastLegend said:

If the opportunity in them arises and allows them to do so.

Malcolm wrote:

Merely being a mother has great merit, much more than being a father.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 3:34 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

If the opportunity in them arises and allows them to do so.

Malcolm wrote:

Merely being a mother has great merit, much more than being a father.

LastLegend said:

Well we might be working with the following assumptions:

Malcolm wrote:

The assumption I work with is that we cannot say anything about anyone's karma unless we are buddhas ourselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 4:20 AM

Title: Re: MPNS on Women

Content:

LastLegend said:

traditional couples (up to 100 years old) worldwide have to say about gender equality if it is real issue for them.

Malcolm wrote:

Ask the wives. The husbands will have no clue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 16th, 2021 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But you recall the story of Tilopa and Naropa and the 12 trials? He told Naropa to jump off a cliff; to go attack a wedding parade, etc. Naropa did it and broke his body.

Malcolm wrote:

It's pretty clear from the way the narrative paints the story, Naropa did not understand his teacher properly, and kept getting himself in trouble. On the other hand, Naropa hampered his own realization by ignoring Tilopa's command not to debate nonBuddhists.

Crazywisdom said:

But more to the point are you suggesting ngondro contravenes dharma principles?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 17th, 2021 at 1:50 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Another instance you make novel point, not at all how Kagu tell it.

Malcolm wrote:

I assume you are referring to this, "Naropa hampered his own realization by ignoring Tilopa's command not to debate nonBuddhists."

My point is not a novelty, nor is the fact that Nyan Lotsawa's eye witness account describes Naropa as being very fat, with henna-dyed hair, carried about on a palanquin by four strong men, and mobbed by large crowds wherever he went.

There are different accounts in different lineages. The account I am drawing from is part of the Naropa Khechari lineage. This transmission does not exist in Kagyu, only Sakya [and more recently, Geluk].

Crazywisdom said:

Obviously, you are right and all the Kagyu are deluded.

Malcolm wrote:

I am not certain why you think I have it in for Kagyupas, but it is incorrect to think that I do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 17th, 2021 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: lerab lingpa's commentary on chetsun Nyingthig

Content:

mutasuk said:

while Barron renders only the meaning.

Malcolm wrote:

sort of...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 17th, 2021 at 3:00 AM

Title: Re: Importance and Benefit of Ngondro

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's was said to me, ngondro is to tan a rigid mind, tan it and make it supple, like soft lambskin leather.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and so that is an instruction for you, not for everyone.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 2:51 AM  
Title: Re: Music time  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 3:12 AM  
Title: Re: lerab lingpa's commentary on chetsun Nyingthig  
Content:  
Danny said:  
The Lamentation of Rudra

Would be interested to know a little about this. Nothing specific, just in general.

Thanks

Malcolm wrote:  
It is a chapter from the Stainless Confession Tantra. The Inexpressible confession chapter is more profound, however.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 5:09 AM  
Title: Re: lerab lingpa's commentary on chetsun Nyingthig  
Content:  
Danny said:  
The Lamentation of Rudra

Would be interested to know a little about this. Nothing specific, just in general.

Thanks

Malcolm wrote:  
It is a chapter from the Stainless Confession Tantra. The Inexpressible confession chapter is more profound, however.

Danny said:  
Thanks bro. I'll look into it.  
So I'm guessing that would be an inserted aspect of a "ngondro" for the Chetsun? Like a purification.  
Shower of blessings type of thing?

Malcolm wrote:  
it is often recited following Vajrasattva practice, or is inserted in the confession part of the Ganapuja in many Nyingma sadhanas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Subjective feel

Content:

Rick said:

Thanks!

Do you (does anyone) know of a good teaching (text, audio, video) on the skandhas? They're a big part of how I view reality/consciousness, but I never really explored them in depth.

Malcolm wrote:

Chapter 1, Abhidharmakośa.

There is also an entire text on them alone, by Vasybandhu, translated by Artemus Engle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: Are things that make you feel good bad?

Content:

Inedible said:

Of all their students, how many are Enlightened? How many are keeping at it and likely to succeed? How many have dropped out? He was expecting to have all those questions thrown right back at him. He said that one or two of his students are becoming Enlightened every year and that the number is going up due to publishing his books.

Malcolm wrote:

Basic question: what do you think "enlightenment" is? What does it mean to be "enlightened"?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Are things that make you feel good bad?

Content:

Inedible said:

Between Jed and Editor, they tell a convincing story. It is easy to follow along and put aside disbelief, like watching a movie. If you go somewhere and it says "Free Enlightenment" on the door that doesn't guarantee that what goes on inside has anything to do with Enlightenment. Jed said so in his books. And just because it says Enlightenment on the cover, that doesn't prove anything about what happens in the



pages. My job is to scrub toilets, not defend Jed. I just wish people would read his books more carefully and get a better grip on what he actually wrote instead of reacting too quickly.

Malcolm wrote:  
Bad answer.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 10:12 AM  
Title: Re: Are things that make you feel good bad?  
Content:  
Inedible said:  
Maybe I didn't understand the question. But the real person that Jed is based on has died at 74 years old. He died young. I just wish we could have had him here to answer for himself.

Malcolm wrote:  
I didn't ask them. I asked you. I have to assume if you cannot answer, you do not know. And if you don't know, your representation of someone's "enlightenment" is just a vague, ill-defined concept you have.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 7:26 PM  
Title: Re: Does each individual have a samaya?  
Content:  
Yklah said:  
We all have existed since beginningless times: does it involve that we all have a samaya with the Guru ?

Malcolm wrote:  
No. Samayas only last one lifetime, and must be taken again in the next life. Only bodhisattva vows persist over lifetimes.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 7:27 PM  
Title: Re: The karmic consequences of keeping pets  
Content:  
Empty Cloud said:  
Dear Dharma friends,  
It has been said that there are serious karmic consequences in keeping pets.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, you have to deal with their shit constantly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 18th, 2021 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Ishvara in early root Tantra

Content:

Danny said:

Ishvara in context of the special, or spiritual self, and not the moniker for Shiva?

Malcolm wrote:

Huh?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 19th, 2021 at 12:01 AM

Title: Re: Ishvara in early root Tantra

Content:

Danny said:

Sure,

the god of delight Etrid Isvara

And...

I received my body from the prefect Isvara, and in the abode of light rays, that is the  
speech of our teacher,  
I find bliss to be natural

Malcolm wrote:

What is this from?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 19th, 2021 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Ishvara in early root Tantra

Content:

Danny said:

Dra Thalgyur

Malcolm wrote:

dga' byed dbang phyug is the person who receives the tantra from the Buddha. It has  
nothing to do with a spiritual self, it is the name of a devaputra.

This translation is very mistaken.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 19th, 2021 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: Sanskrit/Chinese/Tibetan dictionaries?

Content:

akuppa said:

Hi all,

I am attempting to work though the Sanskrit of Vasubandhu's thirty verses. I only have an intermediate knowledge of Sanskrit - I have worked though a text book and can comfortably read (but perhaps not fully grasp) Sutras such as the Diamond but never mastered the various past tense constructions, but can look them up when needed. Verse and especially philosophical verse is another story. One problem I am having which I hope someone can help me with is that dictionaries such as the Monier-Williams do not cover specialised Buddhist vocabulary and I am having to rely on translations to figure out the meaning of some words. So my question is where do such translators get thier meanings from? What are the standard dictionaries used for the study of Sanskrit Mahayana Buddhist texts? Even Edgerton's BHS dictionary doesn't seem to cut it.

I am also hoping to move on to Chinese and perhaps even Tibetan, so if members could point me towards dictionaries that cover that period I would be grateful.

Malcolm wrote:

Conze's Materials for a Dictionary of the Perfection of Wisdom Literature

[https://archive.org/details/materialsfordictionaryoftheprajnaparamitaliteratureedwardconze\\_202003\\_865\\_I](https://archive.org/details/materialsfordictionaryoftheprajnaparamitaliteratureedwardconze_202003_865_I)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 19th, 2021 at 10:35 AM

Title: Re: The karmic consequences of keeping pets

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, we either have to stay out of the water, or we have to learn to friggin' swim.

Malcolm wrote:

And then there is the constant problem with shit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 19th, 2021 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Mice-proof rice

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Just as a random question, do you think there would be a world-wide demand for a

natural/biodegradable plant-based product that looks just like dry, uncooked rice, but that mice and insects would not be attracted to?

Malcolm wrote:

You mean for offering bowls, to support symbolic offerings, rather than just water?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 20th, 2021 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Mice-proof rice

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

This, and possibly for mandalas too

985ED237-A703-4423-8BAF-A7230A60E390.jpeg Just as a random question, do you think there would be a world-wide demand for a natural/biodegradable plant-based product that looks just like dry, uncooked rice, but that mice and insects would not be attracted to?

Malcolm wrote:

You mean for offering bowls, to support symbolic offerings, rather than just water?

Well, for bowls you can use anything. Sand, etc.

For mandala, should be grains as it is specified—unlike what is in the offering bowls.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 20th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Ishvara in early root Tantra

Content:

Danny said:

So to sum up, the joyful delightful son or daughter of the great lord ishvara,( or not ) born spontaneously (or not depending on understanding of karma) in the lap of a god deva in Tustia heaven.

Malcolm wrote:

dga' byed dbang phyug is just the name of a person, in Sanskrit, Nandikeśvara, literally "the lord of Nandi the Bull," a reference, possibly, to Shiva.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 20th, 2021 at 10:42 PM

Title: Re: The karmic consequences of keeping pets

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Good thing none of this applies to Tibetan Buddhism, since we do not read either the

Upasaka Precepts Sūtra, nor do we read the Brahmajala Sūtra.

In the Madhyamaka tradition of bodhisattva vows, the issue of animal husbandry is not mentioned. Avoiding the five wrong livelihoods is mentioned in the Yogacāra tradition. But there is nothing at all about keeping pets.

jmlee369 said:

Ven. Dhammika limits himself to Pali sources as far as I know, whereas the Mahayana canon does in fact have something to say on this matter. Two sets of bodhisattva precepts preserved in the Chinese canon, the Upasaka Precept Sutra and Brahma Net Sutra have a minor precept against keeping animals. The former against raising cats and foxes, the latter against raising cats, dogs, foxes, pigs, and other such animals.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 20th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism

Content:

Beginner's Mind said:

Anyway about Grace. My friend once told me that Buddhism differs from some of the other contemplative traditions in that it does not offer Grace.

clyde said:

Regarding grace, in Christian terms it means a spontaneous, unmerited gift of salvation.

I think this Zen saying comes close, "Enlightenment is an accident. Spiritual practice makes us accident prone."

And I think (and I know others will object) that the words of the Buddha upon his awakening, "Unprovoked is my release," expresses the sense of grace.

Malcolm wrote:

The closest thing to grace in Buddhism is the Pure Land concept of "other power."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 20th, 2021 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Validation statement in Vajrayana

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Isn't matter just a result of paticca-samuppada ("conditioned co-production")? Just another phenomenon that arises from good old causes n' conditions and passes away when they are no longer aligned to produce the matter in question?

Malcolm wrote:

According to Abhidharma, yes, the universe arises by virtue of dependent origination, as the result of the dominant condition, from the collective actions of all sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 3:25 AM

Title: Re: The karmic consequences of keeping pets

Content:

Aemilius said:

the law of karmic causes and effects.

Malcolm wrote:

However, the details differ depending on which tradition one is depending on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 3:26 AM

Title: Re: Are forums still a thing?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

They are slowly fading, Reddit and similar are sort of replacing them. I am old-ish and I prefer this format. I won't do modern social media generally. I stopped once I realized it was making me unhappy, and that in some ways it is designed to.

Malcolm wrote:

Reddit is awful—poorly designed, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 3:50 AM

Title: Re: Non-attachment, non-craving, that attitude of detachment from the world in general....

Content:

Arjan Dirkse said:

Your salvation does not lie in sex or chocolate or vacations.

Malcolm wrote:

Damn!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 3:50 AM

Title: Re: Are forums still a thing?

Content:

narhwal90 said:

reddit reminds me of usenet with a html facelift.

Malcolm wrote:  
You mean a botched facelift...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 8:36 AM  
Title: Re: Discipline and motivation  
Content:

Jokingfish said:  
I've been wondering, how can one tell person's distance to spiritual awakening, how close is he or she, me or you?

I can guess that spiritual awakening is magic magic no distance you're free here and there always and never, but seriously speaking, how to tell if someone is close to actually finding it?

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:  
Find a teacher, learn the path.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 9:27 AM  
Title: Re: MPNS on Women  
Content:

Zhen Li said:  
Coming back to the topic of the thread, the question is whether the MPNS's comments on this matter are subverting conventional gender norms. Yes they are.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, it just reinforces them.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 10:12 PM  
Title: Re: Pan-dreamlike nature  
Content:

Viach said:  
Namely, the dreamlike nature of samsara "legalizes" the so-called "miracles" in Buddhism, for the content of a (karmic) dream has no rigid rules. "Miracles" are homogeneous to the essence of dreams.  
Therefore, I also do not see any problems with the fact that Mount Sumeru was the

content of the collective karmic dream at the time of Buddha , and today the content of the collective karmic dream is the so-called "scientific progress" and the "mythology" of Mount Sumeru., for dreaming is total, and its content is plastic and determined exclusively by the accumulated karma of living beings.

Malcolm wrote:  
So, a cittamatin.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 10:15 PM  
Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism  
Content:

clyde said:  
Regarding grace, in Christian terms it means a spontaneous, unmerited gift of salvation.

I think this Zen saying comes close, "Enlightenment is an accident. Spiritual practice makes us accident prone."

And I think (and I know others will object) that the words of the Buddha upon his awakening, "Unprovoked is my release," expresses the sense of grace.

Malcolm wrote:  
The closest thing to grace in Buddhism is the Pure Land concept of "other power."

Zhen Li said:  
Other power is essentially a subject-dependent idea. For the Buddha upon his awakening, it is the same thing in essence but without the subject-practitioner. This is why all forms of attainment of Buddhahood, from the Pure Land perspective, are said to be attained through reliance upon Other Power.

There's another Zen saying about how you cannot polish a tile expecting to make a mirror; you cannot sit in meditation expecting to attain Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, it's inherently dualistic. For there to be an other, there has to be a self.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, July 21st, 2021 at 10:46 PM  
Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism  
Content:

clyde said:



Regarding grace, in Christian terms it means a spontaneous, unmerited gift of salvation.

I think this Zen saying comes close, "Enlightenment is an accident. Spiritual practice makes us accident prone."

And I think (and I know others will object) that the words of the Buddha upon his awakening, "Unprovoked is my release," expresses the sense of grace.

Malcolm wrote:

The closest thing to grace in Buddhism is the Pure Land concept of "other power."

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

The substance of which is Namu Amida Butsu

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure why one would not recite Namu Amitabha Buddha. In essence, this is a kind of buddhānusmṛti.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 1:49 AM

Title: Re: Translation

Content:

yagmort said:

ཇི་བཙུན་འཇམ་དཔལ་ཡང་འགྲུབ་བྱུང་ནས།

Malcolm wrote:

འཇམ་དཔལ་དབྱངས་

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Heatwave England

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Currently in a week long heatwave in England

Any dharmic advice on how to cope with it? 5 days in more or less

Malcolm wrote:

Hydrate. Get a fan. Put ice in bowl. Direct fan over the bowl of ice. Sit in front of that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 5:26 AM

Title: Re: Heatwave England

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
Currently in a week long heatwave in England

Any dharmic advice on how to cope with it? 5 days in more or less

Malcolm wrote:  
Hydrate. Get a fan. Put ice it in bowl. Direct fan over the bowl of ice. Sit in front of that.

Hazel said:  
Unfortunately swamp coolers don't work in high humidity. At least that's what I've heard.

Malcolm wrote:  
They work.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 5:32 AM  
Title: Re: Is samsara meant literal or not  
Content:

seeker242 said:  
The Buddha gained this insight for himself by doing a whole boatload of meditation practice.

Malcolm wrote:  
Most of which was pointless since in the end he understood that all of his incorrect meditation, in which he engaged for years, was suffering and the cause of suffering.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 5:42 AM  
Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism  
Content:

Matylda said:  
Other power is just another expression for no-I or no-self.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not the way it is described by Zhen Li and others.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 5:50 AM  
Title: Re: Chariot Example in Chandrakirti  
Content:

Subcontrary said:

If I were to tell Chandrakirti that I concede that a chariot depends on its parts, what might his line of reasoning be from that place, to the conclusion that the chariot doesn't ultimately exist at all?

Thank you for any light you can shine on this topic!

Malcolm wrote:

The chariot can not be found in any of its parts, one of its parts or separate from its parts, therefore, there is no "chariot" at all, apart from an imputation, "chariot," upon an assembly of parts. The part you are missing is functionality. In order for a thing to be accepted as conventionally existent, prior to analysis, it must perform its imputed function successfully. Upon analysis, even if a given thing properly performs its function, it cannot be found in the collection of its parts, even though it still continues to function.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 12:13 PM

Title: Re: Pan-dreamlike nature

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

HHDL disagrees strongly with what you have quoted below.

Viach said:

(Translation from Russian ( <https://m.vk.com/@zemlizezmi-suschestvuet-li-gora-meru> )  
Google Translate)

Rinchen Tenzin Rinpoche:

One of the students recently asked me if during the mandala offering it is possible to offer not Mount Meru with four continents, but something else - for the reason that it is difficult to believe in the existence of this mountain. Like, we don't see it anywhere, and its existence has not been proven by science. I want to clarify this point for everyone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 12:41 PM

Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism

Content:

Matylda said:

Other power is just another expression for no-I or no-self.

Malcolm wrote:

Not the way it is described by Zhen Li and others.

Matylda said:

Could be. In fact I am ignorant of Chinese PL teachings. But I am sure about the meaning Shinran taught. And there is no other way of understanding tariki or true shinjin, unfortunately interpreted in the West as faith, just like faith in God etc.

7) We celebrate the calm and lucid mind. While our inclusion of Buddhist contemplative practice acknowledges the value we place on inner silence through meditation, the heart of Shin practice lies in deep hearing which is about integrating heartfelt spirituality with daily living by developing a praxis of mindfulness on Amida's unconditional grace, honest self-reflection, and the cultivation of compassion for all sentient beings, including ourselves....

14) We believe that true religious transmission only comes from the grace of the Primal Vow and is not conferred to us by any form of genetic connection through a priestly or monastic lineage or ancestor. We do not accept any form of the religious primogeniture system, the practice of hereditary succession of the religious teachers from the oldest male heir. Only by merit or grace alone can such positions be granted.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://bffct.org/bff/nasba/religious-principles/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 22nd, 2021 at 9:37 PM

Title: Re: Grace in Buddhism

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Another analogy, just because Buddhism emphasises generosity, and Jesus also emphasised generosity, does not make Buddhism Christian in any sense. Similarity in one principle which many religions hold in common is really not enough to say that one religion, or the translations of terms is coming from one other religion. Buddhists do prostrations, Muslims do prostrations. Buddhism is not therefore Muslim or influenced by it.

So, if in Jōdo Shinshū faith alone is the cause of birth in the Pure Land (which is what Shinran holds), and if Christianity also suggests that faith alone is the cause of birth or resurrection into heaven (however they phrase it) So, I think it is very inaccurate to say Shin texts are "full of Christian protestant terms."

Matylda said:

Well christian terminology in English shin texts is just historical fact. so, i have nothing to say more about it

Malcolm wrote:

The first definition of grace, in English, is:

Definition of grace (Entry 1 of 2)

1a : unmerited divine assistance given to humans for their regeneration or sanctification

Now, I agree with both you and Zhen Li that "grace" is not an appropriate word to use in Buddhадharma, on the other hand, you can forgive people for seeing what is referred to as the "primal vow" as a form of grace: "unmerited divine assistance given to humans for their regeneration or sanctification." And I guarantee you, despite your misgivings, many Westerners are inclined to see such concepts in light of "grace," just as many people confuse the Tibetan "byin rlabs (adhiṣṭhāna)", i.e., "conferred or transformed through power," aka blessings, for something like grace.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

Dharmalight889 said:

What is the Tibetan view of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana? I know the practices may be different, although do Tibetans view the other paths as an authentic way to reach Buddhahood in one lifetime?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no view because traditionally, Tibetans were unaware of what was happening in Japan. However, in modern times HH Sakya Trizin had opportunity to discuss this with senior Shingon leaders, and they found no essential difference in how yoga tantra is practiced in Tibet and Japan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Shingon and Tendai both have evolved unique features that make them different from the lower Tantras as formulated by Himalayan Buddhists.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not factually correct, at least with regard to Shingon.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen and Vajrayana

Content:

St00qen said:

I've been doing a lot of reading and research regarding transmission in the different communities. Is this still true about the Dzogchen Community? That no one gives transmission inside?

Malcolm wrote:  
Correct, not at this time.

St00qen said:  
That also leads me to assume it's not required?

Malcolm wrote:  
Required.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 4:12 AM  
Title: Re: Astro(nomy/logy)  
Content:  
Viach said:  
Does Kalachakra Tantra clearly distinguish astronomy from astrology? (or are both called the same term and, therefore, do not differ in any way?)

Malcolm wrote:  
The best book on this subject is Henning's Kalacakra and the Tibetan Calendar.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 11:53 AM  
Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London  
Content:  
FiveSkandhas said:  
This woman is a self-proclaimed "crusader" against fraudulent scammers posing as Buddhist monks. Interesting encounter.

Malcolm wrote:  
That lady is a total jerk.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 9:22 PM  
Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana  
Content:  
Seishin said:  
Some also say that Tendai and Shingon aren't even Tantra, being such an early form, and are more correctly described as Mantrayana.

Malcolm wrote:  
There is no difference between Mantrayāna and Vajrayāna, the term comes from what are termed in late Indian parlance, the "lower tantras." It is worth noting that the division into four divisions of tantras comes from the explanatory tantras of

Guhyasamaja. Prior to this, in the mid 8th Century, Buddhaguhya, the major commentator on the Mahavairocana Abhisambodhi, divided tantras into three classes, kriya, carya, and yoga. He was a contemporary of Kukai and Saicho.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

On the other hand doesn't this man's behavior slander the Sangha (and thus the Three Jewels)?

Malcolm wrote:

That is his problem, and not ours. Still, that lady is a total jerk.

FiveSkandhas said:

He is denigrating actual members of the Sangha and defrauding normal citizens.

Malcolm wrote:

There are actual members of the Monastic Sangha who do much worse things than panhandling.

FiveSkandhas said:

In Hong Kong one fake Buddhist actually grossed over 1 MM HKD this way.

Malcolm wrote:

"A sucker is born every minute"

P.T. Barnum

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

She probably had some bad experiences with being cheated by fake monks or rinpoches and feels she needs to expose them.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, she is just an uptight busybody with nothing better to do with her time than harass beggars.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

mabw said:

Five Skandhas posted a picture of a group of Chinese guards saluting the Chinese flag. The problem is...? What exactly? Are people in Japan, Russia, Finland etc...allowed to salute the flag?

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is not the soldiers saluting their flag, the problem is where that flag is flying. Tibet is not a part of China. Tibet was subjected to foreign occupation by a hostile nation in 1959. Free Tibet!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 23rd, 2021 at 10:09 PM

Title: Re: Different Forms of Achi Chokyi Drolma

Content:

tony\_montana said:

There is an Achi Empowerment to be held tomorrow, conducted by H.E. Tritsab Gyabra Rinpoche [poster above]. I notice that there are three pictures of Achi in the poster one dark-blue of wrathful appearance with a vajra and kila - what form in that? I'm only familiar with the standing peaceful Achi and the semi-wrathful Achi on horse-back. But this poster seems to show different forms altogether.

Malcolm wrote:

It is probably the terma of his predecessor, which as Achi as guru, deva, and protector.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 12:10 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Nemo said:

The China hate is some crazy shit now. I had some criticism of China in the past but now with all the insane State Department/CIA propaganda I spend more time talking up the accomplishments of Deng.

Malcolm wrote:

What's the point? Deng's liberal reforms have largely been reversed, and Xi is a total



autocrat. China is engaged in some serious nationalism these days, and that is not a good thing. They have a total surveillance state, one that makes Britain's look amateurish.

I have Chinese friends in China, and they tell me that the level of state control is worse than you can possibly imagine, and very brutal. They are getting out as soon as they can.

Just because some dumb rednecks have taken out their xenophobia on anyone who looks remotely Asian does not mean that China isn't a serious threat to world stability, one exacerbated and inflamed by the last guy in the White House.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Here's a useful site for anyone who wants to ensure their money does more good than harm - <https://www.banktrack.org/>

Malcolm wrote:

The economy is total. This is just yuppy vanity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 5:19 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

Danny said:

Malcolm, is this a caste system? Kalachakra, Guhyasamaja etc predominantly for the ruling class? Regents, lords, kings etc? Kings and lords, regency unable or unwilling to relinquish their lifestyles.

Malcolm wrote:

The story of the origins of Guhyasamaja have to do with Indrabhuti's inability to give up his 1000 wives. But in reality, anuttarayoga tantra is for śūdras; kriya is for brahmins; carya is for kṣatriyas; and yoga tantra is for vaiśyas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 8:35 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Here's a useful site for anyone who wants to ensure their money does more good than

harm - <https://www.banktrack.org/>

Malcolm wrote:

The economy is total. This is just yuppy vanity.

Kim O'Hara said:

Not quite, and not quite. It's true that we can't do much, but it's not true that we can't have any effect at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Mitigation time is over. Now it is time batten down the hatches while 800 years (guesstimate) of an unstable climate takes hold.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 10:01 AM

Title: Re: Chariot Example in Chandrakirti

Content:

Subcontrary said:

People would laugh if I told them that there isn't really any such thing as rabbits, and they would laugh even harder if I told them they themselves don't even exist, but eventually I would like to be able to convince others of the reality of Madhyamaka, if indeed it is reality.

Malcolm wrote:

Why would you tell people there is no such thing as rabbits? Or People? The subtle object of negation is inherent existence; not existence, which is the coarse object of negation. Once one understands the subtle object of negation, the coarse object of negation naturally falls away. But some people are able to infer the subtle object of negation from the coarse object of negation, and thus they do not negate the appearance of a thing, only its essence, which is its existence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Chariot Example in Chandrakirti

Content:

Subcontrary said:

but Aryadeva writes (chapter 5, verse 3; or verse 103) thus:

"The Sage has power over what should be done and what should not be done, and what should be said and what should not be said. Therefore, what reason is there for saying that the All-Knowing One is not omniscient?"

Malcolm wrote:

This means that the Buddha knows everything about paths, not things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 11:48 AM

Title: Re: Chariot Example in Chandrakirti

Content:

Subcontrary said:

is there some difference I haven't detected between saying "there is no such thing as rabbits" and "rabbits are unreal?"

Malcolm wrote:

There are such things as rabbits, which is why you can say they are unreal. If there were no such thing as rabbits, what would could be described as unreal?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

But in reality, anuttarayoga tantra is for sūdras; kriya is for brahmins; carya is for kṣatriyas; and yoga tantra is for vaiśyas.

Matylda said:

So if one is not from any of these classes, then there is no tantra for the unfortunate? Foreigners not included?

Malcolm wrote:

We are shudras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Mitigation time is over. Now it is time batten down the hatches while 800 years (guesstimate) of an unstable climate takes hold.

Kim O'Hara said:

I'm having trouble reconciling that position with the bodhisattva vows, Malcolm.

At the most basic level, we are advised to show compassion to all sentient creatures. In

daily life that includes such simple actions as turning aside our foot to avoid crushing an insect on the path, or perhaps picking up the insect and putting it somewhere safe. Also such simple actions as helping a blind person cross the street, so it's not just animals and not (in spite of what some self-proclaimed Buddhists say) just a matter of purely dharmic help.

Looking now at climate change ... it is already driving extreme weather events and bringing daily misery to people all round the world (but especially to the people who have done least to cause it - people in developing nations.) And it is not monolithic, not an all-or-nothing thing like an asteroid impact, and we can still make it less bad than it otherwise would be. Sure, we could have done more, and done it more easily, ten or twenty years ago. But we can still do it now and we will still be able to do it next year. (We will probably still be able to do something in five, ten or even twenty years' time, too, but the time frame makes no difference to the argument.)

On what grounds, then, do you think it is morally or dharmically correct - or even acceptable - to just 'batten down the hatches' and let the rest of the world suffer?

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

You didn't understand. What I meant is that we have to evacuate unsustainable places like the American west, etc., as well as design and build weather resistant structures, etc. We've screwed the climate. We are going to have to wait it out after we go zero carbon, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 24th, 2021 at 9:24 PM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

Giovanni said:

What a very interesting thread...so what about the fruits of these practices? Are there for example records of attainment of the Rainbow Body in Shingon or Tendai?

Malcolm wrote:

Legend has it that Kukai is in eternal samadhi in a cave on Mt. Koya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 25th, 2021 at 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan View of Tendai and Shingon Vajrayana

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We are shudras.

Matylda said:

Thank you.

So nn-Indian people could practice only highest tantra?

Malcolm wrote:

It's the most effective kind in this degenerate age, so yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 25th, 2021 at 5:52 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You've clearly never travelled there. I can't say for the rest of China, but when I was in Xining, there were empty 20 story residential towers everywhere. In Lhasa, the police presence was extremely heavy.

Nemo said:

The China hate is some crazy shit now. I had some criticism of China in the past but now with all the insane State Department/CIA propaganda I spend more time talking up the accomplishments of Deng.

Malcolm wrote:

What's the point? Deng's liberal reforms have largely been reversed, and Xi is a total autocrat. China is engaged in some serious nationalism these days, and that is not a good thing. They have a total surveillance state, one that makes Britain's look amateurish.

I have Chinese friends in China, and they tell me that the level of state control is worse than you can possibly imagine, and very brutal. They are getting out as soon as they can.

Just because some dumb rednecks have taken out their xenophobia on anyone who looks remotely Asian does not mean that China isn't a serious threat to world stability, one exacerbated and inflamed by the last guy in the White House.

Nemo said:

Deng's main goal was not liberalism. He lifted 1.5 billion people out of extreme poverty, created an affluent middle class of over 300 million and refused to become an oligarchy by having executed roughly 1 billionaire every 40 days for crimes against the state/corruption. This was the strongest period of growth and the largest amelioration of poverty in the history of not just capitalism but the world. China was so cool back then I thought of retiring there. Foreigners were treated really well.

This week the Biden admin tries to get Daniel Hale 9 years in prison for leaking that 90% of drone kills are innocent bystanders. America brags about bombing Somalia and Afghanistan and quietly bombs another dozen countries. Pushes deadly starvation

sanctions against Cuba, Venezuela, N Korea, Iran and Syria. And that is just the highlights of the last 7 days.

Peter C told me something I didn't believe many months ago when I was talking about the poor rural Chinese countryside. My information was only 12 years old. I remembered some extreme rural poverty and thought people living alongside pigs and ducks without proper toileting would cause future pandemics. He said that poverty was basically gone. I thought impossible, no country can develop that fast. So I reached out and checked. Turns out those "ghost cities" are 70% full with poor rural people that needed proper homes. Once I saw through that Western lie I found a bunch more. Try asking some Muslims about the genocide in Xinjiang. Muslims seem to think it never happened. They do think America paid Tajik terrorists to create terror networks there though. I think it's time Americans realize they are the most propagandized people on earth right now. An evil global empire of oligarchs with a stranglehold on the entire world. Start minding your own business sickos. You are unwittingly becoming Pentagon employees.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 25th, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

mabw said:

Okay, I am going against my own self-imposed rule of not commenting on this issue any more. But seriously, just a little surprised no one raised the issue of Afghanistan. The US went in, created a ruin, the whole thing went south, and now leaves, with the president saying "We did not go in there for nation building". I was like...what? So the military went in, destabilised the entire region (allegedly Malcolm says China is a threat to global stability) and now wishes to wash their hands off the whole matter. I mean, the US is the one with the foreign policy of spreading democracy worldwide, and so far as I have seen, has not seen ANY successes.

Malcolm wrote:

Afghanistan was already in ruins from the Russian invasion. The Taliban was harboring Bin Ladin. Bush II screwed up by extending the war.

mabw said:

I see America unceasingly trying to meddle in the affairs of other people, only to create very messy situations after that. Then, America walks away.

Malcolm wrote:

China has been meddling in the affairs of the nations on its border for more than a thousand years.

mabw said:

As for Xinjiang and Tibet, I am not proud of China's record there. Only thing I can say is,

China lets go of those 2 places, a dozen other groups will start asking for independence. It is as messy a situation as Israel vs Palestine, The UK vs Scotland and Ireland, Spain vs Catalonia, India vs Kashmir. Except for the first, few seems to talk about those places much though. India imposes an internet blackout in Kashmir, little mention. China does that, the whole world screams. China is of course a very flawed country. Maybe someone can point out a utopia on Earth?

Malcolm wrote:

You are being disingenuous. You know very well China is in Tibet for its water and other resources. The Chinese Government is crushing Tibetan culture and language, using the USA treatment of Native people as an excuse. China is engaged in a systematic campaign of ethnic cleansing of Tibet, etc. Your objections amount to this: other people did it, so why complain about the Chinese Gvt.?

mabw said:

I really do not want politics to affect my discussions because I genuinely intend to learn only about Dharma on this forum. Hopefully, I'll have better success at biting my tongue after this. And sorry if I stepped on anybody's toes.

Malcolm wrote:

You didn't step on any toes, you tripped over your own feet.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, July 25th, 2021 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

China has been meddling in the affairs of the nations on its border for more than a thousand years.

mabw said:

America beyond the Pacific.

Malcolm wrote:

We saved China from Japanese aggression. Without the US going beyond its Pacific shores, who knows how long the Japanese occupation of Mainland China would have continued?

Your objections amount to this: other people did it, so why complain about the Chinese Gvt.?

I suppose so. I am just asking for people to apply the same standard. I already said, I am not proud of what the Chinese Govt has done. But it's a case of a pot calling the kettle

black.

Not even remotely. America, as imperfect as it is, constantly, throughout our history has succeeded in two things: transferring power peacefully, improving the rights and freedoms of its citizens. And because it IS a democracy, citizen activism is vital in that struggle. But there is no opportunity for such a struggle in totalitarian regimes, with its heavily intrusive state interference at every level of civil life.

Contrary to your assertion, the American project of spreading democracy has been successful in many countries, such as Germany, Japan, S. Korea, etc. open societies are inherently healthier and more vital than closed societies. Whereas the totalitarian project has failed in more places than it succeeds. The CCP will not stand for more than another 20 years or so. Sooner or later common Chinese citizens will rise up, and China will splinter. Han nationalism is as bankrupt and morally indefensible as any other kind of nationalism. We live on one planet only, we better learn that lesson quick. So cut out the "whataboutism." It's a bad argument.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 12:04 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The CCP will not stand for more than another 20 years or so. Sooner or later common Chinese citizens will rise up, and China will splinter.

mabw said:

Okay, history will tell. Whether it does or doesn't, China is not my country, so it is not for me to comment. But if it is being deliberately sped up by outside forces to serve their interests then I hope you, as do I, will disagree with that.

Malcolm wrote:

China's grip on water resources in Asia is inherently problematical. For example, they intend to divert the Tsangpo to China, and they already control the flow of water to India. They also control the Irrawaddy and the Mekong as well. These water resources do not belong to China. The world has a right to exercise pressure on China to change their behavior.

BTW, without US investment, China would still be a struggling, second world economy. You should recall this the next time you complain about US meddling. I would have preferred a different outcome, but the last guy in office ruined 50 years of geopolitics because he was incompetent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 3:51 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"



Content:

Nemo said:

Why can't Americans just mind their business and let other countries decide their own destiny? No one wants your "help". The world has realized your help is a cover for stealing resources for an imperialist oligarchy. At least you can respect us enough to be honest.

Malcolm wrote:

Given the choice between Pax Americana and Pax Chinensis, I pretty sure which one is preferable, and it's not the latter. That's just reality. Anyway, Canada always goes along with whatever the US policy is, in general. We had four years of quasi-isolationism, and the dictators had a free ride. Once again, anonymous guys on the internet and their war stories don't mean jack.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 6:28 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Nemo said:

You are the saddest pawn.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, the saddest pawn is the anonymous guy on the internet who has completely given up.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 10:18 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Nemo said:

Americans seem utterly convinced that the fall of America is the end of the world.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. But a collapse of the Atlantic Consensus will have very negative consequences for everyone, including Canadians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 7:25 PM

Title: Re: "Negative phenomenology" and the "second explosion of suffering"

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I support Metzinger's call for a total moratorium on the creation of machines with even

the potential to suffer until we truly get a handle on this issue.

Malcolm wrote:

It is impossible. Sentience cannot be created. All examples of sentient life we observe arose out of a lengthy evolutionary process of self-organization.

Vajrasambhava said:

Hi Malcolm,

As you said, sentient life have a process of self-organization, what about non sentient life? i.e Do a plant or a tree have a process of self-organization? If so, what "force" can give rise to self-organization in non sentient life if they don't have a consciousness to give rise to a self-organization process?

Thanks a lot

Malcolm wrote:

All life is self organizing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: "Negative phenomenology" and the "second explosion of suffering"

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

Hi Malcolm,

As you said, sentient life have a process of self-organization, what about non sentient life? i.e Do a plant or a tree have a process of self-organization? If so, what "force" can give rise to self-organization in non sentient life if they don't have a consciousness to give rise to a self-organization process?

Thanks a lot

Malcolm wrote:

All life is self organizing.

Vajrasambhava said:

So if even non-sentient life is self organizing, is it not the "mind/consciousness" the self organizing element "sine qua non"?

Malcolm wrote:

Self-organization, autopoiesis, does not require a "force" and it cannot have a first cause. We do not understand the origins of life at all, nor the origins of consciousness, all we know is that there are life and consciousness and these are compounded, and compounded phenomena cannot arise without cause and condition. Since we cannot a

first cause for this, we must infer they are self-organizing, from beginningless time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 11:39 PM

Title: Re: Question about karma

Content:

tobes said:

Another great European philosopher - Kant, probably the greatest - argued that if a murderer comes to your doorstep and asks 'is so and so in your house?' even then, you should not lie!

A very extreme argument. But nonetheless, I'm kind of on board with this: samsara is created by so many subtle little deceptions, half of them dressed up as "morally right."

Undressing, being naked, being 100% honest = Dharma in my book.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. If a hunter asks you which a deer is going, you either say you didn't see any deer or you point him in the opposite direction. Mahāyāna 101. It is totally permissible to lie to prevent someone or some creature from being harmed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Question about karma

Content:

tobes said:

Silence is almost always better.

Malcolm wrote:

Well?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, July 26th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: "Negative phenomenology" and the "second explosion of suffering"

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

So if even non-sentient life is self organizing, is it not the "mind/consciousness" the self organizing element "sine qua non"?

Malcolm wrote:

Self-organization, autopoiesis, does not require a "force" and it cannot have a first cause. We do not understand the origins of life at all, nor the origins of consciousness, all we know is that there are life and consciousness and these are compounded, and compounded phenomena cannot arise without cause and condition. Since we cannot a first cause for this, we must infer they are self-organizing, from beginningless time.

Vajrasambhava said:

Thanks Malcolm, this make sense.

But for example, how non sentient life is conceived to rise according Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

Dzogchen cosmology is basically Abhidharmakośa cosmology, despite much confusion which has ensued because of an incorrect understanding of Kongtrul's Myriad Worlds. In other words, the container universe is a result of our collective karma, and plants are part of that container universe.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Varieties of Dharma Practice

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

You have chanting as a subset of meditational practice, but I'd add liturgical practice as well. I'm not sure that the practice of, e.g., chanting the Heart Sutra or reciting dharanis really fits in the meditation bucket.

Malcolm wrote:

Samadhi is part of bhavana, so is chanting, so part of the meditation (aka cultivation) bucket.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 3:20 AM

Title: Re: Varieties of Dharma Practice

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

You have chanting as a subset of meditational practice, but I'd add liturgical practice as well. I'm not sure that the practice of, e.g., chanting the Heart Sutra or reciting dharanis really fits in the meditation bucket.

Malcolm wrote:

Samadhi is part of bhavana, so is chanting, so part of the meditation (aka cultivation) bucket.

Genjo Conan said:

Well, yes, these are different types of cultivation. I don't think it follows that liturgy is therefore a subset of meditation--unless you're defining meditation much more broadly

than I would.

Malcolm wrote:

Creation stage and completion stage require the recitation of liturgies, which are guided manuals. Indeed, śamatha is defined as the process of reciting a sadhana, which contains all nine stages of śamatha, up to focusing on each aspect of the visualization, prior to reciting the mantra, etc.

Supplications, offerings, praises, mantra recitation, etc, are all contained within these texts. Just look at the Princeton Dictionary of Buddhism, you will see what I mean.

Śamatha and vipaśyanā take many forms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 4:05 AM

Title: Re: Varieties of Dharma Practice

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

even if not formal "Meditation" with a capital M.

Malcolm wrote:

It is formal meditation practice, with a capital M.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Nemo said:

Americans seem utterly convinced that the fall of America is the end of the world.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. But a collapse of the Atlantic Consensus will have very negative consequences for everyone, including Canadians.

Nemo said:

What you mean is the end of America as a unipolar hegemon. This is an utterly unique thing in the history of the world. It's only lasted 30 years. I'm not even sure anyone else would want to be a global hegemon. That this is a given is exactly the crazy I'm talking about. The last 30 years have not been as great as you imagine them to be. 184 countries representing 94% of the world's population being ignored in the UN is not a good thing. The US is a rogue state that cannot imagine any sort of democratic restrictions on its bloody global empire.

Get help.

Malcolm wrote:

You're not living in the real politik world. America didn't ask for the Pax Americana, it was bequeathed to us by your royal family after the war, and Canada, the UK, France, Germany, and so on, have depended upon it ever since. And when Trump threatened it, being a Russian asset, Western Europe freaked.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 11:14 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Eh, as a Western European I can safely say that Western Europe didn't freak

Malcolm wrote:

Your leaders did, and that's just a fact.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Svalaksana said:

This does not mean that it will stay that way forever, but I guess it depends on whether Russia or China make a clear, unambiguous, unwarranted first aggression.

Malcolm wrote:

Two words: Ukraine, Taiwan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, July 27th, 2021 at 11:18 PM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Svalaksana said:

American intervention in the Middle East

Malcolm wrote:

All ultimately traceable to European imperialism and its policy failures. We inherited your imperialism, and tried to clean up your mistakes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

How many countries has the U.S. bombed since WW2 I stopped counting at fifty

I think there is some rose colored glasses being worn regarding U.S. Imperialism here

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. Real politik is the opposite of rose colored glasses.

US imperialism is just a continuation of Western European imperialism. But I'd pick Pax Americana over Pax Chinensis etc., any day.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 1:44 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Tammuz said:

This is not a Mahayana or Vajrayana topic, but I don't know where else to post the question to competent people.

I have read that Siddharta Gautama is said to have had practical experience in battle, not just combat training as traditionally passed down.

This seems very doubtful to me, so I would like to ask here whether such a thing is actually claimed in an old biography.

Thanks in advance.

Malcolm wrote:

He reputedly trained in the martial skills of his day, horsemanship, archery, swordsmanship, wrestling, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 3:03 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Keep in mind, just as when we refer to "Prince" Siddhartha, saying he was a warrior is merely using a label, and we fill in what that label refers to with our imagination. Being a member of a certain caste in India would both define and limit you to some extent, even back then, but could also mean practically anything within those limits. Obviously not every person born into warrior caste is going to march around with a sword all the time ...or even ever hold one.

Malcolm wrote:

It is quite questionable whether the Buddha's tribe was actually part of the caste system. For example, his father, "the king," was an elected chief, and there was no hereditary kingship in the Buddha's tribe. So his being a "prince" is a western affectation that does not even begin to address his actual position in the Śākya tribe. The brahmins were simply not that present in Greater Maghada, and there is evidence that the brahmins to the west seriously looked down upon these primitives who buried their chiefs in burial mounds. While it is certainly improbably that kings of Tibet descended from Mountain Licchavis, what is true is that Tibetans adopted Iranian-Scythian custom of interring their btsan pos, chiefs, in burial mounds as well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 5:22 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

How many countries has the U.S. bombed since WW2 I stopped counting at fifty

I think there is some rose colored glasses being worn regarding U S. Imperialism here

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. Real politik is the opposite of rose colored glasses.

US imperialism is just a continuation of Western European imperialism. But I'd pick Pax Americana over Pax Chinensis etc., any day.

Nemo said:

Does China have ability and drive to take over the entire world unopposed but for America. What an exciting myth you created.

You are a liberal Malcolm. Invented by the people who wanted to get rid of monarchs but keep their slaves.

Malcolm wrote:

As I have pointed out, we just inherited the mess you monarchists created with your imperialism.

No, liberalism was a 19th century political movement, which give capitalists political power in European governments. Anyone who has studied history knows this.

As for white supremacy in America, you don't have to tell me. I know about it much better than you. I live here. Been surrounded by it all my life. Of course, the Canadians are little better, given their track record with native people. How many dead children were buried in your Indian schools? Canada is just as f\*&ked as the USA. But I still rather live under Pax Americana. You are free to move to China, your new favorite



totalitarian gvt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 5:29 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Bristollad said:

UK vs Scotland is somehow similar to China and Tibet? How do you reckon that? Scotland and England joined together in the Act of Union of 1707 which was passed in the Scottish and English parliaments to form the United Kingdom - they were not invaded.

Malcolm wrote:

Ahem. My family (McNab) was ethnically cleansed from Scotland in the late 18th century during the Highland Clearances to make way for sheep.

So from a Highlander's point of view, Scotland was most certainly invaded by England.

Bristollad said:

I won't hold my breath for the Chinese government to allow self-determination for Tibetans or any others. As Malcolm said, Tibet is too strategically important especially in terms of the control of water supply and other natural resources.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 6:34 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Bristollad said:

Ahem, the Highland Clearances were not carried out by English landowners but by Scottish ones... e.g. the Duchess of Sutherland. I believe the McNab estates were foreclosed on and sold to the 4th Earl of Breadalbane, John Campbell. see <https://www.clanmacnabsociety.com/post/the-notorious-chief>

Malcolm wrote:

The Sutherlands were a British family.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/George\\_Leveson-Gower,\\_1st\\_Duke\\_of\\_Sutherland](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/George_Leveson-Gower,_1st_Duke_of_Sutherland)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 6:41 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Bristollad said:

I believe the McNab estates were foreclosed on and sold to the 4th Earl of Breadalbane, John Campbell. see <https://www.clanmacnabsociety.com/post/the-notorious-chief>

Malcolm wrote:

Not all McNabs lived in the region of Breadalbane. In any case, I know the story as related by my grandmother.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Bristollad said:

For instance, The McNab, clan leader of the McNabs was an Hanoverian supporter and fought on the Hanoverian side. Now when and if Scottish people want to dissolve the union and become an independent nation once more, I fully support their right to self-determination.

Malcolm wrote:

You weren't responding to me, but since you mention it, it's true John McNab supported the Hanovers, since my other relatives, the Campbells, were pro-British, and had converted to the Presbyterian Church, but large portion bunch of my kin were Jacobites as well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 9:19 AM

Title: Re: "Xi Jinping is my spiritual leader"

Content:

Svalaksana said:

The US quite literally inherited nothing, to be perfectly fair. And to classify conjuring imaginary WMDs, invading sovereign nations and getting embroiled in endless conflicts, ousting governments and creating a power vacuum from which extremist groups with genocidal tendencies emerged, thereby destabilizing the entire region along the way, as "cleaning up mistakes", notwithstanding the disapproving management by the leaders of some of the countries, seems rather odd.

Malcolm wrote:

You really need to study the history of European colonialism. Just how many countries did England, France, Portugal, Spain, and Holland invade and exploit? Let's toss in Italy and Germany for good measure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, July 28th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Buddha also said in sutras your caste is what you do not to whom you're born.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, indeed he did. However, we can see in later literature a sort of brahminization of Buddhism, to the point where even creatures like nāgas are divided into four varnas, and so on, and brahmins being part of the deal in terms of royal rites in Thailand, and so on. So we tend to think of the Buddha as being a kṣatriya, when in fact it is unlikely that Buddha was part of the varna system at all, and thus such appellations are irrelevant to his actual social status. In other words, legend has it that Buddha left his royal heritage behind him. But as the chiefs of the Śākya were elected, it is unlikely he had the obligation of being a royal heir, hence not a prince. In other words, later legends about the person of the Buddha are to him as Arthurian romances are to the original Arthur.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 1:46 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Tantra includes a lot about castes, stuff on deities represents the four castes, etc. But keep in mind there was a proto culture shared with Iran which is very old. Zoroastrian temple fires must have ash from the hearths of four classes workers as well. The notion was diffused. The Brahmins just formalized the hell out of it. Buddha spoke about castes in sutras, obviously he knew about them, he referred to himself in terms of consistent with his status. The fact that his father was elected doesn't mean anyone could get elected. Only chiefs got elected, and his father was elected the big chief by chiefs. So it's the same thing as a Kshatriya. There were other later tribes that got assimilated into Kshatriya like Jats, based on their warlike ways. Jats are recent and some older Kshatriya look at them as like worker class. So this sort of talk is as old as India.

Malcolm wrote:

You should check out Bronkhorst's historical work.

The original system among Indo-Europeans was based on three main classes: priests, warriors, and farmers. The four class system was a later development, unique to India. Also, there was great fluidity between these three classes, meaning one could be all three. The main point is that Buddha's folks interred their important people in Kurgans.

The Brahmins thought this was barbaric, and in early texts, referred to the people who lived in Magadha as demons, not even human.

The Scythians, unlike their Iranian cousins, did not do homa offerings. Also, the warrior class was considered the foremost class, with priests and farmers, second and third. We see this in the Buddha's teachings in the Pali canon as well. After the Sakas invaded India in 145 BCE, after they gained power in Gandhara, they strongly supported Buddhism, and continued to enjoy power even after they were made vassals of the Kushana Empire. But there were likely Scythians in the army of Ashoka's father, Chandragupta Maurya. One presumes they were well-acquainted with the ill-fated Śākya tribe that was decimated by Kosalians during the Buddha's lifetime.

Scholars such as Beckwith and Witzel make very convincing arguments that the Śākyas in Magadha are in fact Indo-Scythians from an earlier migration.

Highland Scots, incidentally, claim to be descendants of the Scythians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 2:29 AM

Title: Re: New guy to Tantra

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yoga implies to link or yoke oneself to something, practice, a deity, etc. Yoga only means "poses" to Westerners because of the popularization of Yoga as exercise. Physical poses and exercises exist in Vajrayana, but generally "Yoga" here has a much broader meaning.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how it is etymologized. For example, Srivasta Ramaswami, my guru of yoga, explains this word is often mistranslated by yoga scholars. We commonly hear that yoga means 'to yoke', from the Sanskrit word 'yuj'. But it is actually a derivative of the word 'yuja' which means 'peace of mind', or 'samadhi', which is the 8th limb of yoga.

Likewise, Tibetan, the early translators translated the term yoga as rnal 'byor. Rnal is from "rnal ma," which means perfect, true, and actual, and here, fundamental.

"byor here means to settle. So in this context, yoga means "to settle into one's authentic fundamental condition."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 3:29 AM

Title: Re: Is samsara meant literal or not

Content:

yinyangkoi said:

How can there be karma and rebirth if there is no self?

Malcolm wrote:

If there was a self, there could not be karma and rebirth. As for the first instance, a self, being uncompounded and permanent, cannot generate effects which are impermanent. As for the second, how can something uncompounded and impermanent be reborn since it is self-existing?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: One thought at a time

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

It is taught that the mind can only perceive one thing at a time.

For example, looking at an citrus orange, we are aware that it is both round, and orange-color, and our experience is that we perceive color and shape simultaneously. But it is taught that this is an illusion, that instead, we perceive color and shape alternately, although so rapidly, it appears as occurring simultaneously.

However, there is also the point that buddhism makes, which is that all phenomena are composites. So, regardless of what phenomenal object your mind is perceiving, it is always more than just one thing, because it is always a composite.

How would you reconcile this?

Malcolm wrote:

Composites are imputed as single entities on the basis of direct perceptions of composite entities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen in Germany

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Mahasandhi is definitely a spurious back translation. Taking a look at the man ngag lta ba phreng ba, Padmasambhava discusses creation stage (utpannakrama), completion stage(sampannakrama)and great completion stage, i.e mahasampannakrama.

However, in English, "Great Perfection" is just fine.

Tendzin Mingyur said:

Berzin translates it the same way <https://studybuddhism.com/de/tibetischer-buddhismus/tantra/mahamudra-und-dzogchen/was-ist-dzogchen>

The point here is not the translation, but what teachings are given. At least in my humble opinion. Gangteng Tulku Rinpoche offers Dzogchen teachings coming from the Pema Lingpa lineage. He will teach students everything from Khorde Ruzhen, Thregchöd, Thögal and Bardo, after you finished a good amount of Ngöndro (min. 10%). And he will give these teachings on a regular basis in closed retreats. If you are interested in Maha- or Anuyoga practices like Tsalung, Thrulkuhor, Tummo or other things these are also given. This year he gave teachings on what Padmakara translates as 'Finding Rest in Illusion', which is one famous text of Longchenpa (due to corona it was an online teaching). We also invited Khenchen Pema Sherab, who is the teacher of our resident lama in Europe to give lungs for the 17 Dzogchen tantras and other teachings. At the moment our European resident lama Khenpo Karma Wangyal is giving a teaching cycle via zoom on Jigme Lingpa's Yönten Dzö.

We don't do much advertisement, because our group is small and we all have jobs, but it exists for over 24 years now.

lelopa said:

Berzin is not the number 1 lotsawa of my choice

Tendzin Mingyur said:

Well Padmakara translation group uses Great Perfection in the translation of the Zintri of Kunzang Lamai Shelung, Lama Chönam and Sangye Khandro in the Ambrosia Ocean of Sublime Explanations as well as in the translation of the Tsig Dön Dzö, Eric Pema Kunzang uses the same in Blazing Splendor, it is also used this way in the translation of Dudjom Rinpoche's History and Fundamentals of the Nyingma School as Richard Barron does it in the translation of Dudjom Lingpa's Nang Jang. Bob Thurman translated Mahasandhi as Great Connection in his recent teachings with Dr. Nida, referring to Sandhi as connection, but translates the tibetan term Dzogchen as Great Perfection. Even Keith Dowman, known to invent his own translation like Pixels, Matrix and stuff, uses it in his translation of Longchenpas Chöying Dzö. Maybe it is just me, but I feel that this is quite a well established term for the translation of Dzogchen/Mahasandhi.

Sorry for the off topic discussion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 9:09 PM

Title: Re: New guy to Tantra

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yoga implies to link or yoke oneself to something, practice, a deity, etc. Yoga only means

"poses" to Westerners because of the popularization of Yoga as exercise. Physical poses and exercises exist in Vajrayana, but generally "Yoga" here has a much broader meaning.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how it is etymologized. For example, Srivasta Ramaswami, my guru of yoga, explains this word is often mistranslated by yoga scholars. We commonly hear that yoga means 'to yoke', from the Sanskrit word 'yuj'. But it is actually a derivative of the word 'yuja' which means 'peace of mind', or 'samadhi', which is the 8th limb of yoga.

Likewise, Tibetan, the early translators translated the term yoga as rnal 'byor. Rnal is from "rnal ma," which means perfect, true, and actual, and here, fundamental.

"byor here means to settle. So in this context, yoga means "to settle into one's authentic fundamental condition."

Crazywisdom said:

All these yoga gurus have to be the guy who shows everyone else got it wrong and push their pet system... The word they all know is Yōg... And It's all any of them say going back to Bhagavad Gita and Upanishads. Find me the word Yuja in Upanishads. It's just like OM. Know one knows where the symbol came from. All they know is it's old. Indian history is a dense fog. They were shitty record keepers. It's mostly guesswork. And the thing about Sanskrit is there are huge lists of cognate terms. Try looking up words in a Sanskrit dictionary. So many words mean multiple things and many words have the same meaning. The idea of one original root is BS, just like we cannot know who's got the purest vajra lineage. I have to concede that. Note on that however, there is a way to know how Indians practiced tantra. Besides what stuff means is not very important, everyone know yoga is for peace of mind, bija and Asana don't mean anything. They are functional.

Malcolm wrote:

You've completely misunderstood the point of my post, but perhaps it is because I did not provide enough context.

Rnal'byor in no way means joining two things together. This is consistent with Ramaswami's contention, where he is discussing Patanjali's Yoga Sutras.

In other places he agrees that the word yoga can mean jointing two things together, for example Bhakti yoga, etc. but the term "yoga," as it was understood by Tibetans, under advisement from their pandita informants, meant "resting in the natural state."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: New guy to Tantra

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen in Germany

Content:

yagmort said:

what lotsawas here think of Duff's translation of mahasandhi as "great junction"?

Malcolm wrote:

Since it is based on spurious back translation, not much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, July 29th, 2021 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

mitsuk said:

Those I know who practice the Gongpa Zanthe follow the manual of Tulku Tsullo.

Malcolm wrote:

Only in Eastern Tibet. For example, HH Taklung Tsetrul Rinpoche did not have the transmission for this manual and never taught it. He relied only on the nyams khrid alone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen in Germany

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Tony Duff's strong insistence that Mipham and even Longchenpa were zhentongpas is really off-putting.

Malcolm wrote:

In both cases this is completely false, and he should know better, since in Longchenpa's last major writing, the commentary on the treasury of the dharmadhātu, he clearly states that the view of Dzogchen is philosophically the same as Prasanga, aka Candrakīrti's presentation of Madhyamaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 4:59 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:



Crazywisdom said:

Buddha knew what caste was. He knew what Brahmins were. He saw himself as Kshatriya, because he said so in sutras.

Malcolm wrote:

That's not really very clear anymore. He didn't say anything in any sūtras at all.

We have, at best, oral records committed to writing hundreds of years after the Buddha, during which time all of India had undergone centuries of cultural upheaval and transformation because of the fall of the Achaemenid Empire on its borders, the arrival of the Greeks, writing, etc.

Do these records, whether Mahāyāna or śrāvaka convey much of the essence of what the Buddha must have taught, certainly.

Crazywisdom said:

He tried to turn the notion into a spiritual value. The fact that some group from some region thought Buddhas group were demons, because of their different customs just confirms this. I'm sure the feeling was mutual. There were competing notions of caste and who got to be number 1, and still is.

Malcolm wrote:

Very worth reading:

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/294688170\\_Buddhism\\_in\\_the\\_Shadow\\_of\\_Brahmanism](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/294688170_Buddhism_in_the_Shadow_of_Brahmanism)

Also there is this:

The most uncertain of the categories we discussed in the Suttas is the fourfold vaṇṇa (Skt varṇa) system. At least the broad application of the label at the Buddha's time and location is doubtful. The four classes (khattiya, brāhmaṇa, vessa, sudda) do appear frequently in the Suttas without a label, yet we cannot escape the impression that what we find in the Suttas is a formula from a later time which was then inserted into the Suttas.

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/336305296\\_Early\\_Buddhism\\_and\\_Caste](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/336305296_Early_Buddhism_and_Caste)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 8:47 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It would be attributed to cabals of anonymous men writing under Buddha as a nom de plum.

Malcolm wrote:

The Mahabharata, the Puranas, etc., were composed by anonymous men. Why should Mahayana Sutras and tantras be any different? Especially considering that the tantras did not begin to be written down until 6th century at the earliest.

There was no writing in India, as far as we know, prior to the Mauryan Empire.

Speaking of Indian cultural habits, putting words in the mouths of historical, legendary, and mythical figures seems to be very much their habit. Somewhat like the way we write historical dramas with dialogue that John Adams, for example, never spoke in actuality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

thanks mutsuk, but i am not.

is there an adequate and accurate english translation of Gongpa Zangthal ?

i think Stéphane was being asked by Chime Rigdzin Rinpoche to make one, but i am not sure if he is going to make it..

Malcolm wrote:

It's four volumes long. My translation, Buddhahood in This Life, is one of the more important texts in this cycle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Prostrations -- from standing or from kneeling

Content:

Ayu said:

I was told, they are done from standing, but then they may differ: full prostrations by lying on the floor

or half prostrations by touching the ground with 5 points: the forehead, two hands and two knees.

Malcolm wrote:

The first is Vikramashila style, the second, Nalanda style.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: New guy to Tantra

Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
So you're saying Tibetans agree with Ashtanga Yoga.

Malcolm wrote:

While there are certainly texts in the Tenjur that define "yoga" in line with the idea of joining two things together, such as uniting method and wisdom, we also find definitions such as the one is a commentary on the Fifty Verses of Guru Devotion, "Yoga is a samadhi that transcends the world." Likewise, in the Yoga Sutras, we find the line, "Yoga is the cessation of transformations of the mind." Of course the philosophical base of the two traditions is not the same: the former being rooted in Madhyamaka, the latter in Saṃkhya, but the definitions are more or less the same.

Given that there is no way to derive joining two things from "rnal 'byor" at all, one assumes that the idea of the Indian panditas of eighth century who assisted Tibetan translators was more oriented towards the resting in the natural state idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

mutsuk said:

Apparently there is indeed one complete translation of the 4 volumes by Katarina Turpeinen. I haven't seen it and I don't know if she also did the Kadak Rangjung Rangshar.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and there is also mine, including the Kadag Rangshar, which has been sitting in manuscript for ten years. But it is not edited and not in publishable form.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, July 30th, 2021 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: New guy to Tantra

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Samadhi doesn't imply a natural state. It's literally means mental sameness. You have to work to get there...

Malcolm wrote:

I am just telling you what the Tibetan term "rnal 'byor" actually means. rnal refers to "rnal ma." 'Byor in this context is defined through its synonym, babs, which means to settle.

In Tibetan, to join is "sbyor ba," for example in *rlung gi sbyor*, which is "vāyu yoga." So generally, *rnal 'byor* means one thing; *sbyor ba* means another. So a *rnal 'byor pa* is one who is able to rest or settle into their real condition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The arguments the guy makes in his earlier book would basically put most of earlier sects, all of Mahayana and Vajrayana in the category of stuff lifted from other traditions and/made up by Buddhists to try and make things fit. Like Shabkar wrote, Some say Self, Dharmakaya, Rigpa, etc., It's all the same by different names. I think the author you cited would argue this is definitely not what Buddha taught or meant to teach...

Malcolm wrote:

So, do you literally believe the events of the *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa Sūtra* happened? Do you believe the Buddha flew through the air to Śrī Lanka to have a buddy to buddy conversation with rakṣasa king, Ravana, as the *Lankāvatāra* portrays? Do you literally believe thousands of monks and bodhisattvas can fit on Rajagriha?

More to the point, does it actually matter if these things happened in history, or is the content and message of these texts more important?

If you decided that these events did not happen in history, that they were a kind of religious fictional narrative, would you lose confidence in Mahāyāna teachings? And if you did lose confidence in Mahāyāna teachings, wouldn't that mean the provenance of a teaching is more important to you than its doctrine?

When it comes to history, I read historians; when it comes to tenets, I read panditas; when it comes to the meaning of sūtras, I read the charioteers, Nāgārjuna, and the rest; when it comes to Vajrayāna, I read the mahāsiddhas, like Virupa, Indrabhuti, etc. I am perfectly comfortable adapting my perspective based on what is useful in that moment. Here, in the academic forum, what is useful is history and modern scholarship.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Help me understand Anatta

Content:

Seitaka said:

Well the Pali cannon technically is a part of Mahayana too in the form of the Agamas,

Malcolm wrote:  
No, this is not correct.

Seitaka said:  
what does parinirvana look like for Madhyamaka?

Malcolm wrote:  
Madhyamaka asserts a nonabiding nirvana, since it is a Mahāyāna system.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 1:32 AM  
Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..  
Content:  
Queequeg said:  
By understanding that the world is our mind, we enter the Sudden and Perfect path.

Malcolm wrote:  
How is this different than the yogacāra assertion?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 1:38 AM  
Title: Xi's Gamble  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
An article in Foreign Affairs:

Xi's Gamble  
The Race to Consolidate Power and Stave Off Disaster

By July/August 2021

Xi Jinping is a man on a mission. After coming to power in late 2012, he moved rapidly to consolidate his political authority, purge the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) of rampant corruption, sideline his enemies, tame China's once highflying technology and financial conglomerates, crush internal dissent, and forcefully assert China's influence on the international stage. In the name of protecting China's "core interests," Xi has picked fights with many of his neighbors and antagonized countries farther away—especially the United States. Whereas his immediate predecessors believed China must continue to bide its time by overseeing rapid economic growth and the steady expansion of China's influence through tactical integration into the existing global order, Xi is impatient with the status quo, possesses a high tolerance for risk, and seems to feel a pronounced sense of urgency in challenging the international order.

Why is he in such a rush? Most observers have settled on one of two diametrically

opposite hypotheses. The first holds that Xi is driving a wide range of policy initiatives aimed at nothing less than the remaking of the global order on terms favorable to the CCP. The other view asserts that he is the anxious overseer of a creaky and outdated Leninist political system that is struggling to keep its grip on power. Both narratives contain elements of truth, but neither satisfactorily explains the source of Xi's sense of urgency.

A more accurate explanation is that Xi's calculations are determined not by his aspirations or fears but by his timeline. Put simply, Xi has consolidated so much power and upset the status quo with such force because he sees a narrow window of ten to 15 years during which Beijing can take advantage of a set of important technological and geopolitical transformations, which will also help it overcome significant internal challenges. Xi sees the convergence of strong demographic headwinds, a structural economic slowdown, rapid advances in digital technologies, and a perceived shift in the global balance of power away from the United States as what he has called "profound changes unseen in a century," demanding a bold set of immediate responses.

By narrowing his vision to the coming ten to 15 years, Xi has instilled a sense of focus and determination in the Chinese political system that may well enable China to overcome long-standing domestic challenges and achieve a new level of global centrality. If Xi succeeds, China will position itself as an architect of an emerging era of multipolarity, its economy will escape the so-called middle-income trap, and the technological capabilities of its manufacturing sector and military will rival those of more developed countries.

Yet ambition and execution are not the same thing, and Xi has now placed China on a risky trajectory, one that threatens the achievements his predecessors secured in the post-Mao era. His belief that the CCP must guide the economy and that Beijing should rein in the private sector will constrain the country's future economic growth. His demand that party cadres adhere to ideological orthodoxy and demonstrate personal loyalty to him will undermine the governance system's flexibility and competency. His emphasis on an expansive definition of national security will steer the country in a more inward and paranoid direction. His unleashing of "Wolf Warrior" nationalism will produce a more aggressive and isolated China. Finally, Xi's increasingly singular position within China's political system will forestall policy alternatives and course corrections, a problem made worse by his removal of term limits and the prospect of his indefinite rule.

Xi believes he can mold China's future as did the emperors of the country's storied past. He mistakes this hubris for confidence—and no one dares tell him otherwise. An environment in which an all-powerful leader with a single-minded focus cannot hear uncomfortable truths is a recipe for disaster, as China's modern history has demonstrated all too well.

## A MAN IN A HURRY

In retrospect, Xi's compressed timeline was clear from the start of his tenure. China had

become accustomed to the pace of his predecessor, the slow and staid Hu Jintao, and many expected Xi to follow suit, albeit with a greater emphasis on economic reform. Yet within months of taking the reins in 2012, Xi began to reorder the domestic political and economic landscape. First came a top-to-bottom housecleaning of the CCP. The party had repeatedly demonstrated its ability to weather domestic storms, but pressures were building within the system. Corruption had become endemic, leading to popular dissatisfaction and the breakdown of organizational discipline. The party's ranks were growing rapidly but were increasingly filled with individuals who didn't share Xi's belief in the CCP's exceptionalism. Party cells in state-owned enterprises, private companies, and nongovernmental organizations were dormant and disorganized. Senior-level decision-making had become uncoordinated and siloed. The party's propaganda organs struggled to project their messages to an increasingly cynical and tech-savvy citizenry.

Xi took on all these problems simultaneously. In 2013 alone, he initiated a sweeping anticorruption drive, launched a "mass line" campaign to eliminate political pluralism and liberal ideologies from public discourse, announced new guidelines restricting the growth of the party's membership, and added new ideological requirements for would-be party members. The size of the party mattered little, he believed, if it was not made up of true believers. After all, he noted, when the Soviet Union was on the brink of collapse in the early 1990s, "proportionally, the Soviet Communist Party had more members than [the CCP], but nobody was man enough to stand up and resist."

Xi Jinping is a man on a mission.

Next on Xi's agenda was the need to assert China's interests on the global stage. Xi quickly began land reclamation efforts in the South China Sea, established an air defense identification zone over disputed territory in the East China Sea, helped launch the New Development Bank (sometimes called the BRICS Bank), unveiled the massive international infrastructure project that came to be known as the Belt and Road Initiative, and proposed the Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank.

Xi continued to slash his way through the status quo for the remainder of his first term and shows no signs of abating as he approaches the end of his second. His consolidation of power continues uninterrupted: he faces no genuine political rivals, has removed term limits on his tenure in office, and has installed allies and loyalists in key positions. New research centers are dedicated to studying his writings and speeches, party officials publicly extol his wisdom and virtue, and party regulations and government planning documents increasingly claim to be based on "Xi Jinping Thought." He has asserted the CCP's dominance over vast swaths of Chinese society and economic life, even forcing influential business and technology titans to beg forgiveness for their insufficient loyalty to the party. Meanwhile, he continues to expand China's international sphere of influence through the exercise of hard power, economic coercion, and deep integration into international and multilateral bodies.

Many outside observers, myself included, initially believed that the party's inability to contain the outbreak of COVID-19 highlighted the weaknesses of China's system. By the summer of 2020, however, Xi was able to extol the virtues of centralized control in

checking the pandemic's domestic spread. Far from undermining his political authority, Beijing's iron-fisted approach to combating the virus has now become a point of national pride.

## A UNIQUE MOMENT

Xi's fast pace was provoked by a convergence of geopolitical, demographic, economic, environmental, and technological changes. The risks they pose are daunting, but not yet existential; Beijing has a window of opportunity to address them before they become fatal. And the potential rewards they offer are considerable.

The first major change is Beijing's assessment that the power and influence of the West have entered a phase of accelerated decline, and as a result, a new era of multipolarity has begun, one that China could shape more to its liking. This view took hold as the U.S. wars in Afghanistan and Iraq became quagmires, and it solidified in the wake of the 2008 financial crisis, which the Chinese leadership saw as the death knell for U.S. global prestige. In 2016, the British vote to leave the European Union and the election of Donald Trump as president in the United States fortified the consensus view that the United States, and the West more generally, was in decline. This might suggest that China could opt for strategic patience and simply allow American power to wane. But the possibility of a renewal of U.S. leadership brought about by the advent of the Biden administration—and concerns about Xi's mortality (he will be 82 in 2035)—means that Beijing is unwilling to wait and see how long this phase of Western decline will last.

The second important force confronting Xi is China's deteriorating demographic and economic outlook. By the time he assumed office, China's population was simultaneously aging and shrinking, and the country was facing an imminent surge of retirees that would stress the country's relatively weak health-care and pension systems. The Chinese Academy of Social Sciences now expects China's population to peak in 2029, and a recent study in *The Lancet* forecast that it will shrink by nearly 50 percent by the end of the century. Although Beijing ended its draconian one-child policy in 2016, the country has still recorded a 15 percent decline in births during the past 12 months. Meanwhile, the government estimates that by 2033, nearly one-third of the population will be over the age of 60.

Contributing to these woes is China's shrinking workforce and rising wages, which have increased by ten percent, on average, since 2005. Larger paychecks are good for workers, but global manufacturers are increasingly moving their operations out of China and to lower-cost countries, leaving a rising number of low-skilled workers in China unemployed or underemployed. And because only 12.5 percent of China's labor force has graduated from college (compared with 24 percent in the United States), positioning the bulk of the country's workforce to compete for the high-skilled jobs of the future will be an uphill battle.

Directly related to this worrying demographic picture is the slowdown of China's economy. With annual GDP growth having dropped from a high of 14 percent in 2007 to the mid-single digits today, many of the long-standing problems Beijing had been able



to sweep under the rug now require attention and a willingness to accept economic and political pain, from unwinding the vast sea of indebted companies to demanding that firms and individuals pay more into the country's tax coffers. At the heart of China's growth woes is flagging productivity. Throughout the first several decades of the post-Mao reform period, realizing productivity gains was relatively straightforward, as the planned economy was dissolved in favor of market forces and droves of citizens voluntarily fled the countryside for urban and coastal areas and the promise of higher-wage jobs. Later, as foreign companies brought investment, technology, and know-how to the country, industrial efficiency continued to improve. Finally, the massive amounts spent on infrastructure, especially roads and rail, boosted connectivity and thus productivity. All of this helped a poor and primarily agricultural economy rapidly catch up with more advanced economies.

Yet by the time Xi assumed power, policymakers were finding it increasingly difficult to maintain momentum without creating unsustainable levels of debt, just as they had done in response to the 2008 global financial crisis. What is more, the country was already saturated with transportation infrastructure, so an additional mile of road or high-speed rail wasn't going to add much to growth. And because almost all able-bodied workers had already moved from the countryside to urban areas, relocating labor wouldn't arrest the decline in productivity, either. Finally, the social and environmental costs of China's previous growth paradigm had become both unsustainable and destabilizing, as staggering air pollution and environmental devastation provoked acute anger among Chinese citizens.

Perhaps the most consequential shifts to have occurred on Xi's watch are advances in new technologies such as artificial intelligence, robotics, and biomedical engineering, among others. Xi believes that dominating the "commanding heights" of these new tools will play a critical role in China's economic, military, and geopolitical fate, and he has mobilized the party to transform the country into a high-tech powerhouse. This includes expending vast sums to develop the country's R & D and production capabilities in technologies deemed critical to national security, from semiconductors to batteries. As Xi stated in 2014, first-mover advantage will go to "whoever holds the nose of the ox of science and technology innovation."

Xi also hopes that new technologies can help the CCP overcome, or at least circumvent, nearly all of China's domestic challenges. The negative impacts of a shrinking workforce, he believes, can be blunted by an aggressive push toward automation, and job losses in traditional industries can be offset by opportunities in newer, high-tech sectors. "Whether we can stiffen our back in the international arena and cross the 'middle-income trap' depends to a large extent on the improvement of science and technology innovation capability," Xi said in 2014.

New technologies serve other purposes, as well. Facial recognition tools and artificial intelligence give China's internal security organs new ways to surveil citizens and suppress dissent. The party's "military-civil fusion" strategy strives to harness these new technologies to significantly bolster the Chinese military's warfighting capabilities. And advances in green technology offer the prospect of simultaneously pursuing

economic growth and pollution abatement, two goals Beijing has generally seen as being in tension.

## THE PARANOID STYLE IN CHINESE POLITICS

This convergence of changes and developments would have occurred regardless of who assumed power in China in 2012. Perhaps another leader would have undertaken a similarly bold agenda. Yet among contemporary Chinese political figures, Xi has demonstrated an unrivaled skill for bureaucratic infighting. And he clearly believes that he is a figure of historical significance, on whom the CCP's fate rests.

In order to push forward significant change, Xi has overseen the construction of a new political order, one underpinned by a massive increase in the power and authority of the CCP. Yet beyond this elevation of party power, perhaps Xi's most critical legacy will be his expansive redefinition of national security. His advocacy of a "comprehensive national security concept" emerged in early 2014, and in a speech that April, he announced that China faced "the most complicated internal and external factors in its history." Although this was clearly hyperbole—war with the United States in Korea and the nationwide famine of the late 1950s were more complicated—Xi's message to the political system was clear: a new era of risk and uncertainty confronts the party.

The CCP's long experience of defections, attempted coups, and subversion by outside actors predisposes it to acute paranoia, something that reached a fever pitch in the Mao era. Xi risks institutionalizing this paranoid style. One result of blurring the line between internal and external security has been threat inflation: party cadres in low-crime, low-risk areas now issue warnings of terrorism, "color revolutions," and "Christian infiltration." In Xinjiang, fears of separatism have been used to justify turning the entire region into a dystopian high-tech prison. And in Hong Kong, Xi has established a "national security" bureaucracy that can ignore local laws and operate in total secrecy as it weeds out perceived threats to Beijing's iron-fisted rule. In both places, Xi has demonstrated that he is willing to accept international opprobrium when he feels that the party's core interests are at stake.

At home, Xi stokes nationalist sentiment by framing China as surrounded and besieged by enemies, exploiting a deeply emotional (and highly distorted) view of the past, and romanticizing China's battles against the Japanese in World War II and its "victory" over the United States in the Korean War. By warning that China has entered a period of heightened risk from "hostile foreign forces," Xi is attempting to accommodate Chinese citizens to the idea of more difficult times ahead and ensure that the party and he himself are viewed as stabilizing forces.

Xi has placed China on a risky trajectory, one that threatens the achievements his predecessors secured.

Meanwhile, to exploit a perceived window of opportunity during an American retreat from global affairs, Beijing has advanced aggressively on multiple foreign policy fronts. These include the use of "gray zone" tactics, such as employing commercial fishing boats to assert territorial interests in the South China Sea and establishing China's first

overseas military base, in Djibouti. China's vast domestic market has allowed Xi to threaten countries that don't demonstrate political and diplomatic obedience, as evidenced by Beijing's recent campaign of economic coercion against Australia in response to Canberra's call for an independent investigation into the origins of the virus that causes COVID-19. Similarly, Xi has encouraged Chinese "Wolf Warrior" diplomats to intimidate and harass host countries that criticize or otherwise antagonize China. Earlier this year, Beijing levied sanctions against Jo Smith Finley, a British anthropologist and political scientist who studies Xinjiang, and the Mercator Institute for China Studies, a German think tank, whose work the CCP claimed had "severely harm[ed] China's sovereignty and interests."

Mao Zedong and Deng Xiaoping demonstrated strategic patience in asserting China's interests on the global stage. Indeed, Mao told U.S. President Richard Nixon that China could wait 100 years to reclaim Taiwan, and Deng negotiated the return of Hong Kong under the promise (since broken by Xi) of a 50-year period of local autonomy. Both leaders had a profound sense of China's relative fragility and the importance of careful, nuanced statesmanship. Xi does not share their equanimity, or their confidence in long-term solutions.

That has sparked concerns that Xi will attempt an extraordinarily risky gambit to take Taiwan by force by 2027, the 100th anniversary of the founding of the People's Liberation Army. It seems doubtful, however, that he would invite a possible military conflict with the United States just 110 miles from China's shoreline. Assuming the PLA were successful in overcoming Taiwan's defenses, to say nothing of surmounting possible U.S. involvement, Xi would then have to carry out a military occupation against sustained resistance for an indeterminate length of time. An attempted takeover of Taiwan would undermine nearly all of Xi's other global and domestic ambitions. Nevertheless, although the more extreme scenarios might remain unlikely for the time being, Xi will continue to have China flaunt its strength in its neighborhood and push outward in pursuit of its interests. On many issues, he appears to want final resolution on his watch.

## THE MAN OF THE SYSTEM

Xi's tendency to believe he can shape the precise course of China's trajectory calls to mind the economist Adam Smith's description of "the man of system": a leader "so enamored with the supposed beauty of his own ideal plan of government, that he cannot suffer the smallest deviation from any part of it." In order to realize his near-term goals, Xi has abandoned the invisible hand of the market and forged an economic system that relies on state actors to reach predetermined objectives.

Critical to this shift has been Xi's reliance on industrial policy, a tool of economic statecraft that had fallen out of favor until near the end of the tenure of Xi's predecessor, Hu, when it began to shape Beijing's approach to technological innovation. The year 2015 marked an important inflection point, with the introduction of supersized industrial policy programs that sought not just to advance a given technology or industry but also to remake the entire structure of the economy. These included the Made in

China 2025 plan, which aims to upgrade China's manufacturing capabilities in a number of important sectors; the Internet Plus strategy, a scheme to integrate information technology into more traditional industries; and the 14th Five-Year Plan, which outlines an ambitious agenda to decrease China's reliance on foreign technology inputs. Through such policies, Beijing channels tens of trillions of yuan into companies, technologies, and sectors it considers strategically significant. It does this by means of direct subsidies, tax rebates, and quasi-market "government guidance funds," which resemble state-controlled venture capital firms.

Thus far, Beijing's track record in this area is decidedly mixed: in many cases, vast sums of investment have produced meager returns. But as the economist Barry Naughton has cautioned, "Chinese industrial policies are so large, and so new, that we are not yet in a position to evaluate them. They may turn out to be successful, but it is also possible that they will turn out to be disastrous."

Xi believes he can mold China's future as did the emperors of the country's storied past. Related to this industrial policy is Xi's approach to China's private-sector companies, including many of the technological and financial giants that just a few years ago observers viewed as possible agents of political and social change. Technological innovation put firms such as Ant Group and Tencent in control of critical new data flows and financial technology. Xi clearly perceived this as an unacceptable threat, as demonstrated by the CCP's recent spiking of Ant Group's initial public offering in the wake of comments made by its founder, Jack Ma, that many perceived as critical of the party.

Xi is willing to forgo a boost in China's international financial prestige to protect the party's interests and send a signal to business elites: the party comes first. This is no David and Goliath story, however. It's more akin to a family feud, given the close and enduring connections between China's nominally private firms and its political system. Indeed, nearly all of China's most successful entrepreneurs are members of the CCP, and for many companies, success depends on favors granted by the party, including protection from foreign competition. But whereas previous Chinese leaders granted wide latitude to the private sector, Xi has forcefully drawn a line. Doing so has further restricted the country's ability to innovate. No matter how sophisticated Beijing's regulators and state investors may be, sustained innovation and gains in productivity cannot occur without a vibrant private sector.

## GRAND STRATEGY OR GRAND TRAGEDY?

In order to seize temporary advantages and forestall domestic challenges, Xi has positioned himself for a 15-year race, one for which he has mobilized the awesome capabilities of a system that he now commands unchallenged. Xi's truncated time frame compels a sense of urgency that will define Beijing's policy agenda, risk tolerance, and willingness to compromise as it sprints ahead. This will narrow the options available to countries hoping to shape China's behavior or hoping that the "Wolf Warrior" attitude will naturally recede.

The United States can disprove Beijing's contention that its democracy has atrophied and that Washington's star is dimming by strengthening the resilience of American society and improving the competence of the U.S. government. If the United States and its allies invest in innovation and human capital, they can forestall Xi's efforts to gain first-mover advantage in emerging and critical technologies. Likewise, a more active and forward-looking U.S. role in shaping the global order would limit Beijing's ability to spread illiberal ideas beyond China's borders.

Unwittingly, Xi has put China into competition with itself, in a race to determine if its many strengths can outstrip the pathologies that Xi himself has introduced to the system. By the time he assumed power, the CCP had established a fairly predictable process for the regular and peaceful transition of power. Next fall, the 20th Party Congress will be held, and normally, a leader who has been in charge as long as Xi has would step aside. To date, however, there is no expectation that Xi will do so. This is an extraordinarily risky move, not just for the CCP itself but also for the future of China. With no successor in sight, if Xi dies unexpectedly in the next decade, the country could be thrown into chaos.

Even assuming that Xi remains healthy while in power, the longer his tenure persists, the more the CCP will resemble a cult of personality, as it did under Mao. Elements of this are already evident, with visible sycophancy among China's political class now the norm. Paeans to the greatness of "Xi Jinping Thought" may strike outsiders as merely curious or even comical, but they have a genuinely deleterious effect on the quality of decision-making and information flows within the party.

It would be ironic, and tragic, if Xi, a leader with a mission to save the party and the country, instead imperiled both. His current course threatens to undo the great progress China has made over the past four decades. In the end, Xi may be correct that the next decade will determine China's long-term success. What he likely does not understand is that he himself may be the biggest obstacle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 2:17 AM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Queequeg said:

By understanding that the world is our mind, we enter the Sudden and Perfect path.

Malcolm wrote:

How is this different than the yogacāra assertion?

Queequeg said:

That's a good question. In general, I don't think it is, except that Zhiyi argued that the mind only position is incomplete. So, for instance, Yogacarins would say the cup is the mind. Zhiyi argued that it could also be said that the mind is the cup. Yogacarins erred in identifying the mind as the reference point, where as Zhiyi argued that any dharma

could be the reference point against which everything else is said to arise.

Malcolm wrote:

We've had this conversation before. How is this more profound than the *karana-hetu* of the Sarvastivadins, that is, the principle that all phenomena are the causes of all other phenomena other than themselves?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 3:12 AM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Queequeg said:

Well, I don't think Zhiyi would say phenomena are causes of all other phenomena. That would imply what he calls a vertical relationship, which he says is not correct. I think the key here would be the *ichinen* - one thought-moment, ie. *ksana*. He's not talking about successive moments that would suggest linear cause and effect. That's the "sudden" part of the "Perfect and Sudden". Or "beyond time".

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhist causality, even in *śrāvakayāna*, is sequential, momentary, and simultaneous. This is why we have serial dependent origination, momentary dependent origination, and simultaneous dependent origination (where all 12 limbs function simultaneously).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 4:02 AM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Queequeg said:

Yeah, all I can say is I don't think Zhiyi devolved to the sarvastivadin position as you describe it.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, the three dependent originations pretty much covered every possible causal relationship. I would not call it a devolution.

Queequeg said:

And I can't say much more than the above. Back to the Yogacarins, as I said, it wasn't that he said the Yogacarins were wrong, he said they were incomplete in arguing mind-only. His critique is that mind-only sets up a one way dynamic, and he was arguing that it could equally be said that the object gives rise to the mind, rhetorically.

Malcolm wrote:

That's not a rhetorical position—its the position of most Mādhyamakas, other than the few who opt for a mind-only presentation of relative truth, when deconstructing perception through ultimate analysis.

Queequeg said:

As far as I understand, in terms of the way the 18 dhatus work, each triad arises together - eye in contact with form is eye consciousness. We can say form and eye consciousness are functions of the eye, or, form and eye are functions of eye consciousness, or eye and eye consciousness are functions of form. By going through those three tentative possibilities, we can temper attachment and preference to any one of those formulations. It also casts each dharma in a slightly different light bringing a little more insight.

Malcolm wrote:

This still does not go beyond the śrāvaka formulation. Which is ok, because that is the base line for understanding how things like perception work.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 4:40 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Credibility is important. Liars lie for a motive. Either the miraculous accounts happened or they didn't. If they didn't, probably the text is irrelevant at best.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think it is quite that simple. We are divorced by two thousand years from the conditions on the ground that led to the rise of Mahāyāna, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

My lama swore Pachung could fly. I saw some pretty miraculous stuff around those guys. One must have an open mind. Not everything is explained.

Malcolm wrote:

On the contrary, everything is explained, for examples, things like the ṛddhipatis, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

He also makes some pretty big leaps of logic, like if something wasn't mentioned it means he didn't know about it. I'd have to look again, but he uses this tactic to frame his main arguments often,: see his logic on why 12 links was probably a later addition.

Malcolm wrote:

This is because there are several formulations of the nidanas, and they are not consistently presented.

Crazywisdom said:

He drops many many unsupported assumptions to prove his points. Although he makes some good ones, too. The passages he selected as probably emblematic of Buddha's intent, tone, modus operandi, rings true. They have a raw and natural feel of someone trying to get his point across, rather than someone trying to organize ideas for memorization, or to wax philosophical to split hairs.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha was interested in philosophy only in so far as it reduced people's concepts.

Crazywisdom said:

Similarly, do you really believe there is such a thing as 3 incalculable kalpas? Do you really believe your blood of past lives can fill the universe? Do you really believe the Buddha taught all these different paths, like bhūmis and 5 paths? Is it at all necessary to know any abhidharma? Or is it all superfluous?

Malcolm wrote:

I personally accept rebirth and think that Buddhadharma is pointless and makes no sense without accepting both rebirth and karma.

Whether the person we call "Gautama Buddha" actually taught all of these texts we now have in person or not is not important to me. What matters to me is what these texts say, and there is a remarkably consistent thread running through all of them.

The Abhidharma is the original attempt to systematize the disordered nature of the Buddha's oral teachings. The Theravadins wrapped it up in a myth of Buddha ascending to the heavens to teach the devas. The Sarvastivadins were more honest, and asserted they were the summaries of the Dharma by senior arhats.

Crazywisdom said:

Vajrayana somehow has a way to make meditation easier. It's like a car. It's got handles and buttons. And then there's the bonus of magical wizardry.

Malcolm wrote:

This is because Vajrayāna takes into account the anatomy of the human body as a vehicle for liberation and yogic experience, something alluded to in the śrāvaka and Mahāyāna canon, but not made explicit.

Crazywisdom said:

From his book on Brahmins, it's hard not to notice that's what Brahmins are about. He mentions very succinctly Nagarjuna's point that reality is just words is a fallacy. And



Mahayana is all about it, and hence Vajrayana's magical formulae, or sort of based on a fallacy.

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrayāna invokes some very ancient pre-Buddhist concepts about reality and language, but repurposes them for its own ends.

Crazywisdom said:

That simplicity is very convincing.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 8:09 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think it is quite that simple. We are divorced by two thousand years from the conditions on the ground that led to the rise of Mahāyāna, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

They lied because that was cool 2000 years ago?

Malcolm wrote:

No one considers dramatizations to be lies. For example, Plato's Socrates was based on a real person, but was used as a literary device to express Plato's ideas. In other words, Plato always put the best argument in the mouth of Socrates, but there is little doubt that these words were rarely if ever the actual words of Socrates. Likewise, Mahayana arose at the same time as the Ramayana and so on, use similar themes, etc. Is the Ramayana or the Bhagavad Gita a lie? Did Ravanna conspire to steal Sita? Was there ever even a person named Ravanna or Sita? If there was never a person named Ravanna, then what does that do to the credibility of the Lanka in your view?

Or what about the fact that the Blazing Tongue of the Dakini tantra, the principle source on the origins of Mahakala and Mahakali, borrows the narrative of Shiva destroying Tripura in order to explain the origins of Mahakala and borrows the narrative of Ravanna seducing Sita to explain the origins of Shri Devi and Remati? Is this a lie, or is there something else to be considered in these examples?

You seem to be making the claim that if the Mahayana sutras and tantras do not portray actual historical events, if tales of the lineage like Buddha flying to Oddiyana to meet Indrabhuti I, or giving the Kalacakra inside a stupa in South India, are dramatic stories rather than historical events, it's all a bust. You might feel that way, but I don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: abhisamayalankara resources

Content:

Humanic said:

Anyone have any idea about resources/texts in English to study the abhisamayalankara? Preferably from a gelugpa source.

Malcolm wrote:

Tsongkhapa's commentary has been translated and published by Spareham.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, July 31st, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's an interesting issue. So in Guhyagarbha the wrathful mandala chapter 15 gives this long story about how Heruka tamed Tarpa Nagpo. It is an allegory. An allegory has a purpose, it is meant to crystalize a value. In this case the value is the most essential point of tantra, the mandala, mantra, etc.

In the case of Ramayana and Bhagavat Gita probably these are somewhat like that, but these were contrived by Brahmins establish themselves as the heirs of Rishis, the kingmakers and right hand to ancient bloodlines. So, total lie. Motives for control.

In the tantra example you give, it would fall under allegory. And Buddhist tantra tends to try to use allegory like this to upend the status quo, which was Brahmanism.

Malcolm wrote:

Seems to me you are using a double standard: fiction if it is nonbuddhist, allegory if it is buddhist.

Crazywisdom said:

But these are meant to be stories. Fiction IS a lie.

Malcolm wrote:

No, fiction is not necessarily a lie, as you admit above. It can be intentional, to make a point.

Crazywisdom said:

Maybe no one but the educated knows that. But it is a lie. It's lie meant to reveal a truth. That's why they give out prizes.

Malcolm wrote:

A lie, strictly speaking, is something said to deceive someone else. But I see no evidence of deliberate deception.

Crazywisdom said:

What is the point of telling a fictional story about how a sutra or tantra was found? It is not meant to reveal a truth. It is meant to legitimize it and hide the truth, which is Buddha never said it.

Malcolm wrote:

Only in a most narrow, literalist sense. And there are myriad strategies to justify what people set down as the words of the Buddha, from declaring the Buddha never said anything to the idea that the Buddha's words are interpreted variably by whoever hears them. When it comes to the Tantras, for example, they do not even necessarily claim to be taught by the Buddha. For example, the tradition of the Laghusamvara Tantra claims it was never taught by the historical Buddha, but rather, by the *nirmāṇakāya* who presently dwells in the twenty-four places in Jambudvīpa. Is this a lie, a legend, or a myth?

Crazywisdom said:

Bronkhorst uses his method to prove or attempt at least that there are many things in the canon which Buddha never taught. I think most relevant to this discussion is liberating knowledge. He is more or less saying Buddha never talked much about the emptiness of dharmas and therefore that all of Mahayana and Vajrayana would have to be the fruit of a particular school of scholars who focused on that being the most important point. Whereas, for Buddha it was one important point but not the most important point. The most important point was seeing the end of suffering.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but I brought up Bronkhorst mainly because his research calls into question a lot of earlier European ideas about India circa 400 BCE, ideas which have been widely adopted by Indians as well as Westerners. As to your last point, there are many Theravadins who would likely agree with him.

Crazywisdom said:

Insofar as the emptiness of skandhas are the emptiness of dharmas, of course the Mahayana, like Heart Sutra and Vajrayana like mandala of five dhyani buddhas is useful, like a tool in a toolbox of tools, but I'm afraid unnecessary. They lead to the same point, perhaps with better precision. But the fanciful notions about buddhahood being the major and minor marks, emanations on planets and all that are in the category of uselessness.

Malcolm wrote:

The PP Sūtras dispensed with the idea of buddhahood being identifiable in characteristics.

In any case, no one ever said Mahāyāna and Vajrayāna were necessary for liberation, the claim is that they are necessary for buddhahood. Liberation and buddhahood are not the same thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Isn't it because Americans have this weird thing for (European) royalty and dominate the entertainment industry?

Malcolm wrote:

We don't really. We look at royalty as a quaint and charming oddity that we have abandoned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Queequeg said:

Yeah, all I can say is I don't think Zhiyi devolved to the sarvastivadin position as you describe it.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, the three dependent originations pretty much covered every possible causal relationship. I would not call it a devolution.

Queequeg said:

I'm not sure cause and effect as you have in mind applies to the view explained through ichinen sanzen. "Since suffering and its causes do not exist..." I don't think its any sort of conventional view. As I understand, its the view taught in, for instance, the Heart Sutra: There is no suffering, no cause of suffering, no end to suffering, no path to follow.

Malcolm wrote:

Which actually means:

There is suffering, a cause of suffering,  
an end to suffering, a path to follow.

Why? "Matter is empty, emptiness is matter; apart from matter there is no emptiness;

apart from emptiness there is no matter, the same for sensation. perception, formation, and consciousness."

The Heart Sūtra is merely saying there is no inherent suffering, cause, end, or path, and that the two truths, samsara and nirvana, etc., are inseparable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Isn't it because Americans have this weird thing for (European) royalty and dominate the entertainment industry?

Malcolm wrote:

We don't really. We look at royalty as a quaint and charming oddity that we have abandoned.

Danny said:

Lol Washington was a king in all but name.

Malcolm wrote:

That is just false. There was a man, Colonel Lewis Nicola, who suggested to Washington that as the chief executive of the nascent republic, he be named "king." Washington flat out rejected this suggestion. And as history shows, he transferred his power peacefully to the next president. Kings only transfer power, generally, through death or murder.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Danny said:

Lol Washington was a king in all but name.

Malcolm wrote:

That is just false.

Danny said:

The fears of the day were that Washington was a king, without the ritual, checking for a dick, and the blood of the Roman eagle confirmation.

Malcolm wrote:

Whose fears?

Danny said:

Also the fears were what fills the “void” after reactionary forces had secured a political empty space, the illegal redistribution of wealth and land...

Malcolm wrote:

Huh? Which "reactionary forces" are you referring to?

Danny said:

False no...

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 2:43 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Which Nirmanakaya is that? Vajradakini? Visionary.

Malcolm wrote:

The nirmāṇakāya of Mahāvajradhara by the name of Śrī Heruka. So, not visionary, meant to be taken literally as you indicate below, which is why people spend time going to the 24 places, and renaming place in Tibet after them, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

especially in the Chakrasamvara situation. It is meant to say this happened there. How can that be? It's a miraculous claim.

Malcolm wrote:

This is one of the bases to the claim that in this degenerate age, the Laghusamvara cycle is the most effective.

Crazywisdom said:

Sure Buddhahood, and you have to swallow hook line and sinker for all the extra stuff Mahayana and Vajrayana say is missing from "liberation,"

Malcolm wrote:

Principally, what is missing from liberation is two-fold omniscience, that's what you have to swallow. But that omniscience is limited.

Crazywisdom said:

also as Bronkworst points out Mahayana/Vajrayana is based on the fallacy that reality is just words.

Malcolm wrote:

Where does he make this claim? He is incorrect, of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 3:10 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Danny said:

Typical gaslighting

Malcolm wrote:

Typical ambiguous claims not backed by any facts whatsoever.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Danny said:

Callender sided with the Jeffersonian Democratic-Republican Party, which believed in a limited federal government that would allow states to determine their own future.

Republicans, as they were known until 1828 when they would become the Democratic Party, believed Congress had principal power in national affairs, since it was closer to the states and the people. A too-powerful executive, supported by a large army, would encourage monarchism. Republican distaste for the monarchy inspired their support for the freedom-loving revolutionaries in France over Great Britain's king.

Malcolm wrote:

There was never any danger that Washington was going to become a king.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 5:34 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Danny said:

Washington was offered a "crown" of sorts, no matter how a king's crown was broken into many parts.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not in actuality.

Danny said:  
Thankfully he rejected as you say, but to say there was no memory and fear of another lord protector, A tyrant is unreasonable.

Malcolm wrote:  
We rejected the monarchy and its trappings. We still do. The conflict between the Federalists and the Republicans had to do with how slavery was going to be handled more than anything else.

Danny said:  
Washington and his successor Adams were viewed as Federalists and with suspicion.

Malcolm wrote:  
They were viewed with such suspicion in the South. In New England, the Federalists were the dominate party until they collapsed in 1816. And a majority of the founders were Federalists. They were absolutely opposed to any aristocracy. Nevertheless, they were pro-British in general. They lost their popularity largely as result of the War of 1812.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 5:36 AM  
Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam  
Content:

heart said:  
People in tukdam are dead. They don't breathe, their hearts don't beat. So it would be very weird if there was any brain activity.

Malcolm wrote:  
But they do breathe, while in Thukdam, the inner respiration has not ceased.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 8:34 PM  
Title: Re: Refuge name conundrum  
Content:

suerafatodd said:  
Hello all - hope you're well. I'm writing with a question regarding a refuge name I received.

I was previously a member of the Shambhala community, which (as I'm sure many know)



has been up-ended by the revelation of an abuse scandal (both recent and historical). I took refuge with a representative of the so-called "Sakyong" before all of this was revealed - I was given a refuge name. I consider refuge names to be tools for self-reflection. Somehow, after everything that has happened, I feel as though that name (that tool) isn't even valid since it was conferred by someone who I do not consider to be a legitimate teacher. I am writing to get opinions on how to relate to this name given the circumstances. Is it a legitimate tool for me, or something to disregard?

This is purely a psychological issue for me and may seem trivial, but that name feels like some sort of tether tying me to the "Sakyong," that community and the whole situation. The reality of the situation is that I want nothing to do with it and do not want to be tethered to it psychologically or otherwise. That is why it is eating me up. I'd appreciate any advice anyone may have.

heart said:

Take refuge again with a teacher you have full confidence in. In general refuge to the Buddha, Dharma and Sangha have nothing to do with various Tibetan lineages so the person you take refuge with should feel like a solid representation of the three jewels.

/magnus

Aemilius said:

Oh really?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, really.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 8:51 PM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

PeterC said:

What america does have, which is at the core of its society, is an aristocracy. Large parts of society are organized in such a way as to entrench it.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no genuine form aristocracy in America. There is sort of a Hollywood glitter version of it, but no one takes it seriously.

There is a burgeoning billionaire class that has benefitted through a tax code that benefits them and against discriminates people who make far less than they do. Time to bust up some monopolies...

As to Kim's observation—the Kennedys were not and are not a dynasty. Neither are the

Bushes. Neither family is competent enough to maintain power in a Democracy—and that's the point right?

The Hanover/Windsors are a dynasty. They've held the throne of England since the mid-18th century, through through six regents. But we Yankee Doodles kicked them out during the reign of the first king in their dynasty, George the III, the architect of the modern British identity, flag and all. And we sent the Tories who did not want participate in the US packing to Canada or back home to England. Australia became the new Georgia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

He remarks on Nagarjuna using a linguistic example of, "when I traveled in the road, I traveled on the road," as proof of traveling twice. Nagarjuna uses this example to show the illusory nature of appearance. Bronkworst uses this example to show Nagarjuna's use of linguistic devices stems from a fallacious assumption in Mahayana, that reality is nominal. When in fact names are just labels atop felt experiences. Babies don't have words, but the have countless experiences. That's why they giggle and cry.

Malcolm wrote:

He is a historian, not a Buddhist I don't expect him to grasp the nuances of Madhyamaka, rejections of moving movers, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The nirmāṇakāya of Mahāvajradhara by the name of Śrī Heruka. So, not visionary, meant to be taken literally as you indicate below, which is why people spend time going to the 24 places, and renaming place in Tibet after them, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

That's a truth claim, see?

Malcolm wrote:

Not in any hard legal sense.

For example, another "truth" claim concerns the existence of a kingdom named Shambhala and a huge war that is supposed to happen with Muslims in 400 years or so.

Some people take this literally. Other people see it as an allegory of a personal, spiritual battle, as it is presented in the gnosis chapter.

Kālacakra is recognized as a valid system today by everyone; but during the 14th century there was still considerable doubt about its validity in Tibet.

All of these claims are truth claims for those who accept them, and are not truth claims for those who do not. For example, the treasure system is still widely rejected/ignored by many Tibetan Buddhists, especially in Geluk, Jonang, and more conservative bastions of Sakya.

So, in general, in Buddhadharma, one tends to ignore the scriptures for which one does not feel affinity, no one fears rejecting or ignoring the truth claims made by proponents of this or that school, and it has been this way since the rise of Mahāyāna, and even among śrāvaka schools we see this dynamic, i.e., "We don't read that sūtra, so it does not apply to us."

Crazywisdom said:

This is one of the bases to the claim that in this degenerate age, the Laghusamvara cycle is the most effective.

So if that's true it will be most effective. Is it? How can we know?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, practice five-fold Mahāmudra or Vajrayoginī in the Drigung system and find out.

I suspect these claims of effectiveness are a kind of puffery. Their validity rests on accepting certain assumptions.

The Laghusamvara system was certainly the most widely practiced tantric cycle in India. It has the most explanatory tantras, commentaries, and sādhanas. More of the Eighty-Four Mahāsiddhas practiced it than any other system. Today, it remains the most widely practice system in Tibetan Buddhism, extensively practiced in Sakya, Kagyu, and Gelug, with the central lineages in all three schools descending directly from Naropa, either through Mal Lotsawa Rinchen Drak (Sakya, Geluk) or Marpa Lotsawa (Dwagpo Kagyu, Geluk), and is practiced more widely than Hevajra, Guhyasamāja, Kālacakra, not to mention more obscure systems like Caturpitha, Mahāmaya, Candamahārośana, Buddhakāpala, and so on.

But more importantly, for Indians, the origin story of Heruka of the Laghusamvara has everything to do with the conquest of Shiva and Umadevi, sited in and around places in India that people actually travelled to and at one point, could identify with certainty. Later, when these pithas, upithas, and so on became less identifiable, the pilgrimage became an inner one, with the Ghantapāda body mandala system, etc.

None of these claims can be verified in any sort of objective way for anyone but oneself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

PeterC said:

They'd like you to think so, but really the roots of most "royal" families in Europe are extremely shallow, particularly the windsors.

Malcolm wrote:

Depth of ancestry is obviously not a measure of the ability to take or be thrust into power. And yes, they are all cousins who all held all the thrones. When you read nineteenth century marxist and anarchist tracts excoriating elites, well, this is the people they were talking about.

PeterC said:

Victoria's son, Edward, should have been styled prince of saxe-coburg und gotha, but they felt 'Windsor' sounded more British than a barely-relevant Germanic name.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

PeterC said:

Philip Schleswig-Holstein-Sonderburg-Glucksburg - whose grandfather was a king, albeit of a rather unimportant Kingdom, but whose father really wasn't anything except a nazi collaborator - got his wife, liz Windsor, to promote him to Prince and had his family changed to Mountbatten, which again sounds reassuringly British.

Malcolm wrote:

Absolutely.

PeterC said:

It's all a mirage. They repurpose discarded titles ennobled with the merest fragment of DNA and claim that they've been around forever. The key skill is the pretence.

Malcolm wrote:

All kings are fools, as Aryadeva points out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 10:13 PM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

heart said:

People in tukdam are dead. They don't breathe, their hearts don't beat. So it would be very weird if there was any brain activity.

Malcolm wrote:

But they do breathe, while in Thukdam, the inner respiration has not ceased.

heart said:

I don't think that breath is physical.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it is physical, since it involves the element of air.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 1st, 2021 at 10:16 PM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

And if none of those methods would reveal anything, according to Occam's Razor the closest conclusion would be to assume from a scientific standpoint that tukdam is just a myth people tell each other, a story to inspire, but nothing to be taken seriously by anyone scientifically inclined. And that in turn should be very unsettling for any practitioner, because it means that what our lineage masters have told us is not reliable from a scientific perspective.

Malcolm wrote:

Occam's razor might also tell us that modern science is not up to the task of explaining the death processes of people who have mastered a serious level of samadhi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

heart said:

I don't think that breath is physical.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it is physical, since it involves the element of air.

heart said:

Well, dead people don't breath so it indicate some other kind of movement.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

People in thugdam still have inner respiration. They are not dead until the father and mother's element meet at the heart center, etc., no matter what standard of death is held by Western Medicine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Did Siddharta Gautama have battle experience?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Philosophers, logicians and mathematitians also talk about truth claims. But point taken. I have practiced this cycle for many years, so I guess I can admit it's effectiveness in tantric means. Still wondering if it's what Buddha had intended

Malcolm wrote:

From our perspective, a buddha intended it. And it really depends on how much one thinks "Buddhism" is only the recorded words of a particular human being who lived in India roughly 2500 years ago.

But more to the point, we cannot expect our legends and myths to correspond to an empirical examination of facts in modern history, archaeology, and text criticism. And frankly, when it comes to practicing our traditions, we shouldn't really care. Empirical facts are part of impure vision, not the experiential vision of yogins and yoginis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Refuge name conundrum

Content:

KathyLauren said:

Many people in Tibetan traditions take refuge in Guru, Buddha, Dharma and Sangha.

Malcolm wrote:

Only if they have actually received empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 2:31 AM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Minobu said:

i get that matter is empty of inherent existence...

how does emptiness become matter....did you misspoke.

Malcolm wrote:

If I misspoke, the Buddha misspoke, because I was just directly quoting the Heart Sūtra.

Since matter and emptiness are inseparable, whatever is matter is empty, and whatever is empty is matter. To extend the quote, whatever is a sensation is empty, whatever is empty is a sensation, etc. There is actually a means of understanding this four-fold emptiness. My teacher, Lama Migmar, explains it in detail here:

Minobu said:

i was happy to see you admitting that there is suffering...

it might not be inherent but it does exist...

Malcolm wrote:

I never, ever, suggested otherwise, anywhere, in any forum.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 4:10 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

I've been increasingly surprised over the past year and a half by not only the extent of anti-vaxx sentiment within the Dzogchen Community, but also the extremity of that sentiment.

Malcolm wrote:

These people are idiots. I know people who have departed from Tenerife because of this issue, because they do not feel safe around the anti-vaxx crowd.

dharmafirststeps said:

Some people are simply too distrustful to take the vaccine, but I'm also seeing significant numbers of people with really really wild conspiratorial views, and even sadder, aggressively haranguing vajra siblings about it.

Malcolm wrote:

They can f\*&k off.

dharmafirststeps said:

Unfortunately this isn't just limited to a few crazies, but includes respected members of the Community, people in positions of authority, long time dedicated practitioners etc (admittedly the views and behaviour among these groups are at least less extreme). The Community WhatsApp group in my own country has mostly just become a vehicle for spreading anti-vaxx media.

Malcolm wrote:

You should not follow it then.

dharmafirststeps said:

Without the guidance of a living teacher I guess it allows for more flourishing of wild ideas.

Malcolm wrote:

ChNN would have been first in line. That's how stupid these people are. They all seems to forget the extreme protection ChNN was afforded from the flue in 2017 and onward. 2015/2016 was really the last year you could go up, greet him and shake his hand.

Their idea, as dumb as it is, is to do lots of protector pujas, as if that is going to protect them from getting covid21 [Delta]. So dumb.

Yes, do protector pujas, but also get a f76cking vaccine shot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 4:14 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Maybe you don't have a complete list

Seitaka said:

Yes these are just some major ones, 84,000 Dharma doors would be kind of hard to list huh?

Malcolm wrote:



Pretty easy actually: 21,000 for ignorance (Abhidharma), 21,000 for desire (Vinaya), 21,000 for hatred (sūtra), and another 21,000 for mixed afflictions (mixed teachings).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Norwegian said:

So, if you want to use Buddhist talking points, there's that whole compassion and caring about others aspect which is important to consider. And I would hope that whoever is in the Dzogchen Community are capable of considering this.

Malcolm wrote:

There has always been a deficit of compassion in the DC, not in Rinpoche, but in many of his students, especially the ones who fantasize that they are not Buddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 4:24 AM

Title: Re: How Bhikshu Svagata drinks (too much) alcohol

Content:

Aemilius said:

It seems evident that the Mahāsāṃghika Vinaya is the earlier version...

Malcolm wrote:

<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/t/why-the-mahasa-ghika-is-not-the-earliest-vinaya/7458>

Aemilius said:

To sum up, the sources that Prebish invokes to prove the earliness of the Mahāsaṅghika Vinaya either are weak (Bareau and Pachow), mistaken (Hofiger), sectarian (Fa-xiang), or in fact prove the very opposite of what Prebish wants (Frauwallner, Roth, Cousins). Worryingly, Prebish has repeatedly misrepresented his sources.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 8:02 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Danny said:

Callender sided with the Jeffersonian Democratic-Republican Party, which believed in a limited federal government that would allow states to determine their own future. Republicans, as they were known until 1828 when they would become the Democratic Party, believed Congress had principal power in national affairs, since it was closer to the states and the people. A too-powerful executive, supported by a large army, would encourage monarchism. Republican distaste for the monarchy inspired their support

for the freedom-loving revolutionaries in France over Great Britain's king.

Malcolm wrote:

There was never any danger that Washington was going to become a king.

Crazywisdom said:

To the contrary, the power of a president as a king was of paramount concern to the founders.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, not exactly, that's why they chose the term "president" rather than "king." Of course they are concerned about hereditary leadership, but they nipped that in the bud, that's why no one was worried about Washington becoming a king.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 8:03 AM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

PeterC said:

What America does have, which is at the core of its society, is an aristocracy. Large parts of society are organized in such a way as to entrench it.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no genuine form aristocracy in America. There is sort of a Hollywood glitter version of it, but no one takes it seriously.

There is a burgeoning billionaire class that has benefitted through a tax code that benefits them and against discriminates people who make far less than they do. Time to bust up some monopolies...

As to Kim's observation—the Kennedys were not and are not a dynasty. Neither are the Bushes. Neither family is competent enough to maintain power in a Democracy—and that's the point right? ...

Kim O'Hara said:

Sorry, Malcolm, but we're clearly using slightly different meanings of the term.

<https://www.imdb.com/title/tt0081856/>

I rest my case.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:  
Ummm... what did I say about Hollywood glitter?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 8:06 AM  
Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?  
Content:

Bristollad said:  
As elitist as having a constitutional monarchy seems, even as a socialist I'm just grateful our head of state isn't another bloody politician.

Malcolm wrote:  
Monarchism dies hard, even when monarchs don't do shit but spend money on pomp and circumstance. Anyhow, the UK has not had a legitimate monarch since the Stuarts were usurped.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 9:23 AM  
Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?  
Content:

Bristollad said:  
As elitist as having a constitutional monarchy seems, even as a socialist I'm just grateful our head of state isn't another bloody politician.

Malcolm wrote:  
Monarchism dies hard, even when monarchs don't do shit but spend money on pomp and circumstance. Anyhow, the UK has not had a legitimate monarch since the Stuarts were usurped.

PeterC said:  
Not even. The country has been illegitimately occupied ever since the Normans killed Harold Godwinson in October 1066.

Malcolm wrote:  
Around the same time Chetsun Senge Wangchuk received the 17 tantras.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 10:33 AM  
Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
very concerned about limiting the role of the executive.

Malcolm wrote:

Washington was a founder. I was responding to a specific claim about Washington, i.e., that people feared HE would want to become a king. Washington was no prince, he singly handedly started the war that ultimately led to the American Revolution, the French and Indian War of 1754-1763, and he owned slaves. My point was that no one feared that Washington had royal ambitions, despite a robust conversation about the undesirability of having a king at the head of the new republic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: What's with all the monarchism being fed to kids?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yes, that's very important. It seems many do not shed this childhood fantasy, however.

Malcolm wrote:

For years I have observed many people here waxing nostalgic about Dharma kings. This fantasy is deeply embedded in the Tibetan Buddhist imagination, even in westerners.

For example, such images permeate the lower initiations of Vajrayāna, superficially modeled on the coronation of an Indian monarch. Trungpa borrowed various customs from Asian countries, combined them with his imagination of British mannerisms, cooked this all up into a new dish, and served monarchism to western disciples. We still have people who take the Kālacakra empowerment stirred by utopian fantasies of a coming world paradise run by tenth-stage bodhisattva rulers, hoping to be reborn as soldiers in the army of Rudra Cakravartin. And of course we have famous Tibetan Buddhist teachers today who complain bitterly about Democracy on a regular basis.

And more to the point, virtually all of our lineage heads were religious rulers.

Of course, this sentiment is understandable in societies like Tibet, and basically everywhere else, which were run by despots, tyrants, and warlords. But such imagery, though evocative, is much less powerful in a Democratic society

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 2nd, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Three thousand thoughts in a single life moment..

Content:

Minobu said:

Thank you Loppon malcolm for responding

Malcolm wrote:

The Heart of the Perfection of Wisdom

I n Sanskrit: Bhagavati prajnaparamitahrdaya

In Tibetan: Bcom Idan 'das ma shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa'l snying po

In English: The Heart of the Perfection of Wisdom, the Bhagavati

Thus have I once heard:

The Blessed One was staying in Rajagrha at Vulture Peak along with a great community of monks and great community of bodhisattvas, and at that time, the Blessed One fully entered the meditative concentration on the varieties of phenomena called the Appearance of the Profound. At that very time as well, holy Avalokitsevara, the bodhisattva, the great being, beheld the practice itself of the profound perfection of wisdom, and he even saw the five aggregates as empty of inherent nature. Thereupon, through the Buddha's inspiration, the venerable Sariputra spoke to holy Avalokitsevara, the bodhisattva, the great being, and said, "Any noble son who wishes to engage in the practice of the profound perfection of wisdom should train in what way?"

When this had been said, holy Avalokitsevara, the bodhisattva, the great being, spoke to venerable Sariputra and said, "Sariputra, any noble sons or daughters who wish to practice the perfection of wisdom should see this way: they should see insightfully, correctly, and repeatedly that even the five aggregates are empty of inherent nature. Form is empty, emptiness is form, Emptiness is not other than form, form is also not other than emptiness. Likewise, sensation, discrimination, conditioning, and awareness are empty. In this way, Sariputra, all things are emptiness; they are without defining characteristics; they are not born, they do not cease, they are not defiled, they are not undefiled. They have no increase, they have no decrease.

"Therefore, Sariputra, in emptiness there is no form, no sensation, no discrimination, no conditioning, and no awareness. There is no eye, no ear, no nose, no tongue, no body, no mind. There is no form, no sound, no smell, no taste, no texture, no phenomenon. There is no eye-element and so on up to no mind-element and also up to no element of mental awareness. There is no ignorance and no elimination of ignorance and so on up to no aging and death and no elimination of aging and death. Likewise, there is no suffering, origin, cessation, or path; there is no wisdom, no attainment, and even no non-attainment.

"Therefore, Sariputra, since the bodhisattvas have no obtainments, they abide relying on the perfection of wisdom. Having no defilements in their minds, they have no fear, and passing completely beyond error, they reach nirvana. Likewise, all the Buddhas abiding in the three times clearly and completely awaken to unexcelled, authentic, and complete awakening in dependence upon the perfection of wisdom.

"Therefore, one should know that the mantra of the perfection of wisdom - the mantra of great knowledge, the precious mantra, the unexcelled mantra, the mantra equal to the unequalled, the mantra that quells all suffering - is true because it is not deceptive. The mantra of the perfection of wisdom is proclaimed:

tadyatha - gate gate paragate parasamgate bodhi svaha!

Sariputra, a bodhisattva, a great being, should train in the profound perfection of wisdom in that way."

Thereupon, the Blessed One arose for that meditative concentration, and he commended holy Avalokitsevara, the bodhisattva, the great being. "Excellent!" he said. "Excellent! Excellent! Noble child, it is just so. Noble child, it is just so. One should practice the profound perfection of wisdom in the manner that you have revealed - the Tathagatas rejoice!" This is what the Blessed One said.

Thereupon, the venerable Sariputra, the holy Avalokitsevara, the bodhisattva, the great being, and that entire assembly along with the world of gods, humans, asuras, and gandharvas, all rejoiced and highly praised what the Blessed One had said.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 1:58 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

They feel that, since they cannot be vaccinated, requiring the vaccine is unduly discriminatory and creates a two-tiered dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense, your center's leaders are protecting their health.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

I don't think you're going to get a definitive answer that's not also tied up in sectarianism.

Malcolm wrote:

The answer is simple, and not sectarian at all, since it is mentioned in every sūtra and tantra that discusses Buddha's awakening.

The highest meditation is Vajropama Samadhi, since only it has the ability to obliterate all traces of the two obscurations in their entirety.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 4:16 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Its distressing and quite confusing in some ways, but it is very different than the previous situation.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is that with Delta, vaccinated people are likely contagious if infected. Since they are vectors of transmission, it is unwise to abandon masks indoors, and social distancing outdoors, even if vaccinated. This protects everyone. Who cares if it seems excessive?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 4:25 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Its distressing and quite confusing in some ways, but it is very different than the previous situation.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is that with Delta, vaccinated people are likely contagious if infected. Since they are vectors of transmission, it is unwise to abandon masks indoors, and social distancing outdoors, even if vaccinated. This protects everyone. Who cares if it seems excessive?

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don't have an issue with masking, I think it's a reasonable precaution, especially among people who are higher risk for breakthrough infection. The folks I practice with have chosen not to for now. I am personally ok with that too, but will change the second they want to.

I think that for many people there is a reasonable balance to be struck between safety and mental health, socializing, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Since Trump, and because of him, the world is exponentially more dangerous now than it was say, six years ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

KeithA said:

I...am have trouble finding any compassion for the folks who choose not get vaccinated.

Malcolm wrote:

You wear masks to protect them, right? Even though they are idiots? Well, that's compassion.

Anyhow, you should see the anti-vaxx shit show over on DW engaged.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 5:30 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Speaking of which:

<https://www.msn.com/en-us/health/medical/study-less-than-1-of-fully-vaccinated-people-experiencing-breakthrough-covid-infections/ar-AAMRbnM?ocid=winp1taskbar>

I know they are applying the precautionary principle due to the snot/viral load test, but my guess is that as things play out we will see that vaccinated people are just not spreading this very much. We will see.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm....Ptown?

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/07/31/us/covid-outbreak-provincetown-cape-cod.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 6:42 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's the sole reason the CDC revised their guidance.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Speaking of which:

<https://www.msn.com/en-us/health/medical/study-less-than-1-of-fully-vaccinated-people-experiencing-breakthrough-covid-infections/ar-AAMRbnM?ocid=winp1taskbar>

I know they are applying the precautionary principle due to the snot/viral load test, but my guess is that as things play out we will see that vaccinated people are just not



spreading this very much. We will see.

Malcolm wrote:  
Ummm....Ptown?

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/07/31/us/covid-outbreak-provincetown-cape-cod.html>

Johnny Dangerous said:

I can't read the article because I don't subscribe, but from what I've read that was an atypical study demographically - big group of people flocking to one area. It might mean something substantial on the larger scale or it might not, just like the viral load thing. Another issue is, AFAIK a vaccinated testing positive for Covid does not necessarily imply transmissibility.

<https://sfist.com/2021/07/22/delta-not-causing-more-breakthrough-covid-cases-expert-say-and-maybe-asymptomatic-cases-shouldnt-count/>

Yes, the Delta variant is more contagious, but experts say there's little evidence so far that it's infecting more vaccinated people than would likely have been infected, statistically speaking, by any of the earlier variants. The Pfizer and Moderna vaccines also both seem to be highly effective at protecting people against getting sick from the Delta variant, but maybe only 80% effective at preventing infection completely. BTW, It's people like Paul Offit saying stuff like this, not some kook: "I think we are misusing the term breakthrough," he says. "If someone who is fully vaccinated is subsequently hospitalized or killed by the virus, that's a breakthrough case." The New York Times also discussed breakthrough cases today, reporting on a widely talked-about outbreak of cases that came out of Provincetown, Massachusetts, where an estimated 66,000 mostly gay people gathered into crowded spaces over the week of July Fourth. Around San Francisco, an unknown number of people who returned from Provincetown were infected and some anecdotally became sick — but the Provincetown Board of Health has only recorded 256 cases among the vaccinated, with 66 among people who then traveled home out of state (though this seems like a likely undercount). Even if the true number is three times that, it still represents a relatively small number among the tens of thousands of vaccinated people partying in Provincetown that week.

Etc...so, no, these small scale studies and findings are not proof of widespread infection among the vaccinated, and indeed so far there is no data for that. Might there be? Sure, we will have to see. Is it prudent to wear masks in mixed areas...yeah, I mean, to a degree it always was.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 8:05 AM  
Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas  
Content:

KeithA said:

I...am have trouble finding any compassion for the folks who choose not get vaccinated.

Malcolm wrote:

You wear masks to protect them, right? Even though they are idiots? Well, that's compassion.

Anyhow, you should see the anti-vaxx shit show over on DW engaged.

KeithA said:

I am sure there is a spectrum of reasons. We tend focus on the ones dying so they can "own the libs". Yeah, idiots. But even them, maybe even especially them, need compassion, not anger. Tough sledding, though.

Unpopular opinion for another day: Engaged Buddhism is just virtue signaling. I won't be venturing over there any time soon.

Malcolm wrote:

There is nothing engaged about DW engaged, it mainly a platform for Nicholas Weeks to spew far right wing bullshit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 8:46 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

China Covid: Concerns grow as Delta outbreak spreads

Authorities are carrying out mass testing and have imposed sweeping lockdowns across 15 provinces.

Read in BBC News: <https://apple.news/AmweK72XZQye1BqkbDpnpHQ>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 10:12 AM

Title: Re: Texts that destroy ""scientific" materialism

Content:

tobes said:

Madhyamaka and Dzogchen have the same view and the same intent: undoing those entrenched beliefs such that genuine experience can arise.

Malcolm wrote:

However, madhyamaka is purely analytical, whereas dzogchen, etc., are experiential. But yes, the view is same.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: how empty is our reality?

Content:

Alastair said:

But the cells are real, just the way we see them as an object is illusional?

Malcolm wrote:

Cells are also composed of parts, there is nothing in the universe that is not composed of parts. So when those things are examined, they are found to empty. Empty does not mean "unreal," per se. It means empty of independent, aka inherent, existence. But things are also empty of dependent existence as well, since that is merely another form of inherent existence. Things are dependently originated, and thus they are empty and dependently designated. This is the middle way.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 9:46 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Seitaka said:

I understand it: my body, my choice.

Malcolm wrote:

I suppose you support abortion rights as well, correct? It is after all the slogan of the pro-choice movement.

Now when it comes to choice about whether to be vaccinated or not:

State laws establish vaccination requirements for school children. These laws often apply not only to children attending public schools but also to those attending private schools and day care facilities. States may also require immunization of healthcare workers and of patients/residents of healthcare facilities.

<https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/imz-managers/laws/index.html>

Seitaka said:

Bodily autonomy and freedom of choice should be upheld at all costs because once rights and freedoms are taken, even if they are taken for a supposedly good cause or safety, they are rarely given back and therefore in the future can be subject to abuse.

Malcolm wrote:

This is false. For example, as above, all children in public school in the USA are required to receive vaccinations for mumps, measles, etc. Of course, if their parents choose not to school them in the public school system, they are free not to. But most schools require these vaccines for children, whether public or private.

Seitaka said:

Furthermore the institutions which are supporting the infringement of that bodily

autonomy and freedom of choice (various governments, mass media, big tech, big corporations, etc.) are known to promote values, actions, and ways of thinking completely contrary to the Dharma, for example hedonism, licentiousness, materialism, and even sometimes outright hatred toward groups that they do not like. As such I am not sure why any Buddhist would place his trust in these institutions.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not the case. When, during the Buddha's day, monks committed civil crimes, they were turned over to the civil authorities. The world at large has always promoted values, actions, and ways of thinking that are contrary to the Dharma. But we live in the world with other people. Therefore we have to get along with other people who are not Buddhists. This means we have to accommodate and adjust to the presence of governments, media, tech, large corporations.

If you live in a democracy, which you I assume you do, you should participate in your government. Otherwise, your voice will not be heard.

If you are not vaccinated against covid19, not only are being you irresponsible to your fellow citizens, but you are being stupid about your own health.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 9:48 PM

Title: Re: how empty is our reality?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Empty does not mean "unreal," per se.

White Sakura said:

then why did the Buddha give the example of moon reflected in water or mirage? The water in the mirage is really unreal. There is also no moon in the water.

Malcolm wrote:

Is a mirage a real mirage or not? Does it arise from its own causes and conditions or not? Is the reflection a real reflection or not?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/03/business/tyson-vaccine-mandate.html>

Unknown said:

Tyson Foods, one of the nation's largest meat processors, said on Tuesday that it would require vaccines for its U.S. workers — about half of whom remain unvaccinated.

The mandate will extend to employees in its offices and in the field. The poultry supplier is requiring its leadership team to be vaccinated by Sept. 24 and the rest of its office workers by Oct. 1. Frontline employees have until Nov. 1 to be fully inoculated, extra time the company is providing because there are “significantly more frontline team members than office workers who still need to be vaccinated,” a Tyson spokesman said.

Malcolm wrote:

Good. More companies need to follow suit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: how empty is our reality?

Content:

White Sakura said:

it is a real mirage.

Malcolm wrote:

Case closed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 10:31 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The answer is simple, and not sectarian at all, since it is mentioned in every sūtra and tantra that discusses Buddha's awakening.

The highest meditation is Vajropama Samadhi, since only it has the ability to obliterate all traces of the two obscurations in their entirety.

Seitaka said:

But what is the specific methodology or meditative practice by which such a samadhi can be attained? Obviously following the Buddhist path as a whole, but any particular practice which was seen as especially effective in attaining such?

Malcolm wrote:

Take your pick. But they all involved varying approaches to śamatha and vipaśyanā. They all require prajñā. So, best to cultivate that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 3rd, 2021 at 10:34 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The answer is simple, and not sectarian at all, since it is mentioned in every sūtra and tantra that discusses Buddha's awakening.

The highest meditation is Vajropama Samadhi, since only it has the ability to obliterate all traces of the two obscurations in their entirety.

reiun said:

From Buddhistdoor.net, only the following is explained:

"vajropama-samādhi

'Diamond-like concentration', so called because, like a diamond that can cut through all things, it is the last stage in the abandonment of defilements; whatever defilements that have remained are all abandoned in this samādhi."

Without going to too much trouble, can you kindly provide your own take on this term, or point to a robust internet-accessible reference, please? (I'm sure the lead-up this stage is important, too.) Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Vajropama-samādhi is the nirvikalpa samādhi of an ārya, someone who has realized emptiness already. Ordinary nirvikalpa samādhi merely leads to birth in the realm of unconscious devas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 12:03 AM

Title: Re: Texts that destroy ""scientific" materialism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

However, madhyamaka is purely analytical, whereas dzogchen, etc., are experiential. But yes, the view is same.

tobes said:

Yes, I don't deny this. Also, I didn't suggest that Vajrasambhava study Madhyamaka - I suggested that by studying materialism, s/he will be naturally led to a Madhyamaka kind of open ended skepticism. i.e. in lieu of the manifold of contradictions, inconsistencies and leaps of faith that arise in the materialistic enterprise.

Vajrasambhava said:

Yes that's why! In my actual condition the only thing may could help me is Dzogchen, I have to experience the natural condition of myself in order to verify such things

experientially. Anyway, right now I'm far from it, and the only thing I'd like to know it's: Is to experience "myself as non-ending-with-is-body" possible through direct perception (as in Dzogchen) or this is not directly-knowable?  
If anyone could explain me this, it'd be really helpful

Malcolm wrote:

It is directly knowable through being able to remember past lives and directly perceive the minds of others

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

narhwal90 said:

I got vaccinated and conform to mask policy- I don't want to be the guy who catches covid and brings it home to my family, or elsewhere for that matter. How would that freedom feel if your kid caught covid from you and died on a ventilator in the hospital?

Seitaka said:

That's what I am, freedom of choice, choice to vaccinate and mask up or freedom not to.

Malcolm wrote:

Its a bullshit argument.

Seitaka said:

Your example doesn't falsify the statement that freedoms once given away are often never given back and the potential that has for future abuse by institutions which may become or are already corrupt, as is a near constant trend throughout the history of mankind.

Malcolm wrote:

Yawn.

Seitaka said:

bodily autonomy

Malcolm wrote:

Your physical autonomy is not as important as the lives of people you will take through your ignorance and indifference.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 2:11 AM

Title: Re: Minnesota Teen Prepares for Life as a Reincarnated Lama

Content:

Lucas Oliveira said:

Minnesota Teen Prepares for Life as a Reincarnated Lama

Malcolm wrote:

Poor kid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 2:11 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Seitaka said:

Bodily autonomy would be the idea that I have the right to choose what I do with my own body. For example, if I told you that you must get a tattoo on your forehead for the safety of the community and that refusal to do so would lead to punishment of some sort, that would be an infringement of your bodily autonomy. And let's say you agreed, surrendering your right of choice relating to your body could then be used in others ways if a powerful institution so desired since such a precedent has been set by your willing concession, so now you have to get your ears removed for the safety of the community or we will punish you. See how important freedom of choice and bodily autonomy is?

Malcolm wrote:

This is a stupid argument.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: how empty is our reality?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So when those things are examined, they are found to empty. Empty does not mean "unreal," per se.

White Sakura said:

Things are not unreal per se, because it is a real mirage /illusion, that causes their appearance.

Malcolm wrote:

The appearance is not unreal, is it? The appearance is just empty.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Bristollad said:

I think you need to think about it from a different angle. It's not about your rights not to be forced to do something to prevent the virus from spreading, it should be about your responsibility to do what you can to protect others from the virus spreading.

Seitaka said:

Yes, this is why I say we must ban automobiles. Think about it, not only do automobile drivers often kill themselves in accidents, they frequently kill wildlife and pedestrians who don't even drive cars. Since safety is the top priority and car accidents kill so many each year, it is your responsibility to not drive one to protect others, I mean it's not really fair that shortening your travel time from point A to point B should put my and others lives at risk. Just one less car related death is worth their complete removal I say.

Malcolm wrote:

Dumb. Get lost troll.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 4:16 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Seitaka said:

But on the topic, what is the survival rate of this virus for people under 80 and who have no preexisting conditions again?

Malcolm wrote:

What is the medical cost of every hospitalized person? About 75k.

How many people have been hospitalized? As of July 24, 190k.

$75k * 190K = 14,250,000,000$

That is 14 billion dollars in health care squandered on your irresponsibility and others like you—oh, but Mah Raghts...dumbass.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Vajropama-samādhi is the nirvikalpa samādhi of an ārya, someone who has realized emptiness already. Ordinary nirvikalpa samādhi merely leads to birth in the realm of unconscious devas.

Astus said:

Would you perhaps have some sources in mind for the above connection between nirvikalpa and vajropama samadhi? I couldn't find much on nirvikalpa samādhi by a search of various possible translations (無分別三昧/三摩地/定), unless you meant nirvikalpa jñāna (無分別智). As for the samadhi leading to the heaven of unconsciousness (無想天), that's usually called asaṃjñi samāpatti (無想定).

Malcolm wrote:

It is also called nirodhasamapatti. If a commoner attains this, it is asaṃjñi samāpatti.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:01 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

In parsing the original question, the mistake is that meditation is a subset of practice, not separate. Vajropama Samadhi is quite clearly a stage attainment. How does it help liberate all sentient beings? Unless this is spelled out and actualized in right practice (on behalf of all sentient beings), I would contend that it is not the highest or most powerful form of practice. The problem, as I see it: it is a static individual achievement. Walking around with that medal pinned to one's chest means nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

It can't be attained without Mahayana bodhicitta. One doesn't need this samadhi to attain arhatship. And it's force in Hinayana practitioners is too weak to burn away all obscuration. I never said it was insight. Buddhahood itself is ultimately driven by wisdom, not method. But Vajropama samadhi is indispensable for buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

In fact, had we had an equitable distribution in place, we would likely not be dealing with the Delta variant right now. And thanks to vaccine hesitancy, no doubt there are other variants on their way.

Malcolm wrote:

People just need to follow science. While not all antivaxxers are climate deniers, there is

a considerable overlap.unfortunately, this was all caused by tolerating fascist trends in government masking as “conservative” or “libertarian.”

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:17 AM

Title: Re: Texts that destroy ""scientific" materialism

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

Anyway as you told me, a bit of Madhyamaka can be surely useful, but actually I don't think to solve my wrong conceptuality adopting another conceptualism, even if It's a deconstructive one. I think i have to cut right through all this conceptualizing, and Madhyamaka (at least in the early approaches) cannot do this.

Malcolm wrote:

If Madhyamaka is causing you to be more conceptual, the fault is not Madhyamaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

But Vajropama samadhi is indispensable for buddhahood.

reipun said:

Which is a static achievement not necessarily related to the liberation of all sentient beings, thus not the highest or most powerful practice, unless actualized.

Malcolm wrote:

You can't actualize it until you are on the verge of buddhahood, that is the point. And it's not static at all. Vajropamasamadhi is the fire of ultimate jnana. It's the heat of the fire of wisdom.

The method by which one arrives there is not that important, the point is arriving there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:43 AM

Title: Re: Refuge name conundrum

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

The question is:

“So do you also think that taking refuge with Tibetan Lama you have to become a Vajrayana practitioner? Would you break the refuge if you practiced Zen or Pure Land Buddhism?”

...and I answered it. Sometimes yes, and sometimes no.

There's no "breaking refuge".

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, refuge can be broken. Easily.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Which is a static achievement not necessarily related to the liberation of all sentient beings, thus not the highest or most powerful practice, unless actualized.

Malcolm wrote:

You can't actualize it until you are on the verge of buddhahood, that is the point.

reiun said:

Yes indeed. Vajropama samadhi is not the "highest and most powerful practice". It is just a stage. Buddhahood, in the liberation of all sentient beings, is.

Malcolm wrote:

It's definitely the highest and most powerful samadhi involved in aiding sentient beings, it's not merely a "stage." Without it there would be no ability aid all sentient beings with absolute impartiality.

I mean, it all depends on whether or not one thinks buddhahood is the most precious thing ever. I do, YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: how empty is our reality?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The appearance is not unreal, is it? The appearance is just empty.

White Sakura said:

You could not solve the problem that the water in the mirage is unreal.

Malcolm wrote:

A mirage is empty of water. It's merely an appearance that is mistaken for water. The point of the example is that appearances are deceptive, not that they do not exist. In

order for an appearance to be deceptive, the appearance has to be real. No one is deceived by a nonexistent mirage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

haha said:

one still has to realize bhutatathata.

Malcolm wrote:

That is realized on the first bhumi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 4th, 2021 at 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

This is easier said than done, since science is being written on this as we speak.

Malcolm wrote:

The science of vaccines is settled.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

This is easier said than done, since science is being written on this as we speak.

Malcolm wrote:

The science of vaccines is settled.

Dan74 said:

I think that what is settled, is your mind, Malcolm, on a great many issues, while the science of the COVID vaccines is far from settled.

Malcolm wrote:

Its settled.

Dan74 said:

When it comes to the mRNA vaccines, the FDA added a warning on them about the risk of heart inflammation barely a month ago.

<https://edition.cnn.com/2021/06/25/health/fda-covid-vaccine-heart-warning/index.html> Does this sound settled?

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Dan74 said:

And when it comes to J&J and AZ, the lower risk of very serious blood clots is now accepted as being causally related to the vaccines.

Malcolm wrote:

Known issue with this technology. It has to do with the type of virus that they put the spike in.

Dan74 said:

Is anything else going to emerge? I hope not. Perhaps more minor things.

And when it comes to long term effects of the mRNA vaccines, how can we do anything other than speculate, given that they are new technology?

Malcolm wrote:

mRNA vaccines are unlike older vaccines, there is no live virus. The idea they alter one's genetic code is bullshit.

Dan74 said:

For full disclosure: both my wife and I are fully vaccinated (she with BionTech-Pfizer, I with Moderna).

Malcolm wrote:

That's the responsible approach.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Obviously, it's not the same sort of problem as people with looney ideas, but it I don't think everyone who hasn't been vaccinated is that crazy, and in those cases how people

dialogue over this stuff matters.

Malcolm wrote:

They just need to get their shit together. Anyway, the market has already decided for everyone that everyone needs to be vaccinated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

In terms of "highest form of . . . practice" (vs. highest form of samadhi), I would say it is actualizing the "ability [to] aid all sentient beings with absolute impartiality." See, for example, any decent discussion of the last of the Ten Ox-herding Pictures.

Malcolm wrote:

The question was not the highest form of practice, that is clearly the bodhisattva yāna in toto.

The question was, what is the highest form of meditation, by which people generally mean some kind of meditative absorption (samapatti) or samadhi. I answered that question very precisely.

You are answering a question different than the one that was asked.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 1:06 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

I couldn't find the term Vajropama samapatti here:

<http://www.tibetanbuddhistencyclopedia.com/en/index.php?search=vajro+samapatti&title=Special%3ASearch&go=Go>

Malcolm wrote:

This is not a reliable source of information.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

That's not the full story, the full story is that 13 people studied who at least some people in the Tibetan Buddhist community believed were in tukdam were studied and had no activity detectable by the machine used.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means nothing at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

...either tukdam is accessible to scientific materialist investigation or it's not.

Malcolm wrote:

Thugdam is not a falsifiable phenomena.

fckw said:

That is, either there are physical correlates or there are none.

Malcolm wrote:

There are various signs. If western technology is not up to snuff in measuring these signs, well, that is not the fault of people in post-mortem samadhi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

yagmort said:

düdjom khandro nyingthig?

Malcolm wrote:

Not an earth terma.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 4:18 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

If it's not "falsifiable" it's not accessible to any scientific method - no matter whether it's scientific materialist one nor Vajrayana.

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring only to Western science. It certainly falsifiable in Vajrayāna. Do the practice, get the result. Many people have done so, and reported they have attained the results. When people do not get results, they are practicing incorrectly.

fckw said:

As I said: Either tukdam has or it does not have a physical correlate. Stating "there are signs" does not clarify this point.

Malcolm wrote:

There are signs. I suggest you read a book on the subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 7:20 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

haha said:

one still has to realize bhutatathata.

Malcolm wrote:

That is realized on the first bhumi.

haha said:

According to interpretation of thirty-verses, it is the bhutatathata related with grahya and grahaka (i.e. for first bhumi / dharsanamarga). In vajropamasamadhi, it means bhutatathata related with asrayaparavritti. They have categorized understanding of the bhutatathata while progressing in the path.

From another presentation according to Misrakabhidharmahridayasastra, the Knowledge of Extinction (ksayajnana) and the Knowledge of Non-Arising (anutpadajnana) proceed after vajropamasamadhi.

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps, but there is no actual difference in the object being realized.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 7:22 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The question was not the highest form of practice, that is clearly the bodhisattva yāna in toto.

The question was, what is the highest form of meditation, by which people generally mean some kind of meditative absorption (samapatti) or samadhi. I answered that question very precisely.

You are answering a question different than the one that was asked.

Seitaka said:

Which in your experience or according to your studies of Buddhism is the highest or most powerful form of meditation or practice?

Malcolm wrote:

My point still stands.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 8:09 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

PeterC said:

The argument that we don't know everything is not, of itself, a good argument. At this point, we know enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence, settled.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Is the Pali Canon seen as legitimate / correct-view for Mahayana Buddhists?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Hello everyone!

I'm an inquirer into Mahayana Buddhism (I'm currently attending a Zen Buddhist center at my temporary location; I'll be moving back to my main residence and have to find another Buddhist Temple / Center in a couple of weeks).

I wanted to get started reading, studying, and meditating on the Sutras, and considering that I'm not set in a specific school yet (due to these circumstances - there's a Zen place and Vietnamese place that both seem welcoming, but I'll have to check them out myself when I get there - who knows) - I've decided that the best place to start off are the bodies of text common to most traditions - namely the Tripitaka - as I was under the impression that most Mahayana schools use a Sanskrit or East-Asian language version of the Pali Canon and then build off of it with additional sutras - so I bought the "Long Discourses of the Buddha" translated from the Pali Digha Nikaya by Maurice Walshe. It was on sale for half off, so I bought it for \$25.

However, to my dismay, I've found out after purchasing it that what I read online was only sort of true, because while it seems that there is incredible overlap between the Pali and Sanskrit / East-Asian canons such that they seem to be based off the same texts and early doctrines of the Buddha, the Pali canon has additional sutras not in the Sanskrit / East-Asian tradition and some sutras outright substantively differing in content.

So...with that being said...are the Theravada texts still seen as legitimate / orthodox / authentic by the Mahayan Buddhist? Are they legitimately teachings by the Buddha? Are they worth reading? Is there anything "heretical" or wrong-view in these texts that I should be worried about?

Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

Legitimate, but not to read to the exclusion of Mahayana, which is more profound and has a higher view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 8:15 PM

Title: Re: Bitcoin

Content:

gelukman said:

The fiat currency aka ordinary money. It is on more shallow ground than cryptocurrency.

Malcolm wrote:

You really need to read up on the history of money. Money maintains its value for two reasons: 1) it is back by a hard commodity, such as gold or silver 2) it is backed by a government guarantee. Of the two, the latter has proven to be much more stable.

Cryptocurrency is backed by neither, hence, a speculative investment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

PeterC said:

The argument that we don't know everything is not, of itself, a good argument. At this point, we know enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence, settled.

Dan74 said:

There are several issues here. Firstly, the argument that the science is not settled was advanced to support the position that one has grounds for being cautious about getting vaccinated. It may well be that on the balance the right decision is indeed to vaccinate, but this doesn't mean that everyone who doesn't see it that way is an idiot.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, they pretty much are.

Dan74 said:

As to the actual question "do we know enough", three months ago when we got vaccinated, I thought so. Since then the cardiac inflammation stuff came out, but didn't significantly alter my view, but now we get some worrying data from Israel and the US, pointing to the current vaccines lasting for a short time and potentially offering no protection insofar as getting infected and spreading the virus is concerned.

Malcolm wrote:

No. The mRNA vaccines are still effective after six months:

<https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/nejmc2103916>

As for cardiac inflammation:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/04/health/myocarditis-covid-vaccine.html>

Dan74 said:

For every one million Americans immunized with a coronavirus vaccine, about 60 develop temporary heart problems, according to a study published on Wednesday in the journal JAMA Network.

The complications were all short-lived, the researchers found. And these heart problems are far more common among patients who develop Covid-19, outside experts noted.

It seems to me that we could be heading into the antibiotic disaster-like situation. Antibiotics were being overprescribed and as the result drug-resistant bugs were able to develop. Now with nearly a billion people receiving one shot of the vaccine, if they still catch the virus, that's a lot of opportunity for the virus to evolve vaccine resistant variants.

Malcolm wrote:

Part of the settled science behind vaccines is not allowing virus to spread uncontrolled so they can evolve vaccine-resistant varieties like Lambda. That is settled science. The nice thing about evolution is that it is governed by mathematical probabilities, so such variants can also be predicted.

Dan74 said:

I might be seeing it wrong, but there seems to be a danger there. If the vaccines are no longer effective at stemming the spread, but only the severity, then they are only a temporary stopgap, until a new resistant variant that might be very hard to vaccinate against evolves.

Malcolm wrote:

When people cast doubt on vaccines, they increase vaccine hesitancy. When vaccine hesitancy increases, more unvaccinated people become infected, and increase the possibility of mutations. At base it comes down to public health vs. personal health. The idea that people have a right to not take vaccines (barring a demonstrable threat to their health that overrides the public interest) has already been settled by the supreme court in the USA in the 1905 Jacobson v. Massachusetts decision:

“The good and welfare of the Commonwealth, of which the legislature is primarily the judge, is the basis on which the police power rests in Massachusetts,” Harlan said “upon the principle of self-defense, of paramount necessity, a community has the right to protect itself against an epidemic of disease which threatens the safety of its members.”

The issue of compulsory vaccinations for attendance of school was settled in 1922, Zucht v. King.

<https://constitutioncenter.org/interactive-constitution/blog/on-this-day-the-supreme-court-rules-on-vaccines-and-public-health>

So, not only is the science settled, so is the law.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: How Many Mahayanas Were There? - David Drewes new paper

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think Drewes' thesis here is correct. Supposed contradictions between Mahāyāna sūtras are clearly outweighed by that which they have in common and there are no explicit rejections of sūtras or doctrines, only claims to supercede alternative views. His other claim that people who viewed themselves as bodhisattvas viewed themselves as being such for many lives and not as having originated the corpus but as revealing it, is also illustrative.

The point about terminology is also incisive. Vaipulya, vevulla, or vaitulya sūtra instead of Mahāyāna sūtra makes a lot of sense. In the eyes of a Mahāyānist what distinguishes these sūtras? Surely it is their length and profundity. If it took so long for Buddhists to differentiate Mahāyāna from non-Mahāyāna, these may have been seen simply as the long and profound sūtras among the shorter āgamas sūtras.

Where Drewes is mistaken, I think, is continuing to simply ignore passages that refer to books when he suggests that writing and books were not important or worshipped in the Mahāyāna. Also, he conflates (purposefully?) Schopen's claim that the sūtras were worshipped in homes or shrines rather than caityas (there are sūtras in caityas in Nepal btw) as a rejection of the idea of book worship. Most of the Mahāyāna sūtras advocate writing them and worshipping them in book form, even in the same sentences in which readers are encouraged to memorise and recite them. In most pre-modern cultures with the use of books, they are used not in place of oral cultures but in support of them. The sūtras clearly advocate both the writing and worship of the sūtras in book form, and their memorisation and recitation. This is what still happens today in most Buddhist cultures with anything except the longest vaipulya sūtras. Even then, sections are extracted for memorisation and recitation, like the Universal Gate Chapter of the Lotus Sūtra. There are references to book worship in Indian sources starting as early as Faxian and throughout the śāstra materials, it continues in most Buddhist cultures. I sense he is sticking to his guns and assuming everyone is onboard with him, when it is glaringly obvious that he should admit that he may have gone a bit far at some points.

Malcolm wrote:

Same guy who rejects the idea the Buddha even existed...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Title: Re: How Many Mahayanas Were There? - David Drewes new paper

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Where Drewes is mistaken, I think, is continuing to simply ignore passages that refer to books when he suggests that writing and books were not important or worshipped in the Mahāyāna. Also, he conflates (purposefully?) Schopen's claim that the sūtras were worshipped in homes or shrines rather than caityas (there are sūtras in caityas in Nepal btw) as a rejection of the idea of book worship.

Malcolm wrote:

For example, when Mahāsiddha Virūpa (8th-9th century) was in South India, having been recruited as by a Hindu King for his expertise in Sanskrit, he was busted for prostrating to a copy of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā rather than a Śiva linga. One can well imagine that taking this sūtra as an object of devotion was extremely common, particularly among the educated, Buddhist elites. It's my personal favorite, along with the

Samcayagathas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

PeterC said:

All eminently sensible. Yet here we are, over a century later, and people are still presenting the same sort of arguments that Jacobson offered at the turn of the last century.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you know, "My body, my choice."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 5th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Amida Butsu

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Nichiren appears to have taken a very dim view of pure land teachings:

Those who rely on such evil teachers as Hōnen...and believe in the Amida...Sutra are going farther and farther into the fire or deeper and deeper into the depths of the water. How can they possibly escape agony? They will doubtless fall into the fiery pits of the hell of repeated rebirth for torture, the hell of black cords, and the hell of incessant suffering, or sink into the icy depths of the hell of the crimson lotus and the hell of the great crimson lotus.

-"Hell Is the Land of Tranquil Light"

Queequeg said:

He thought exclusivist Pure Land, like Honen's teachings, were evil. He didn't think the same of more traditional Pure Land - he just considered them provisional teachings.

Malcolm wrote:

Aren't internecine polemics fun?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

BTW if you are worried about the virus mutating the sanest thing is to support vaccination to a point where we (maybe) reach something like herd immunity, the places these variants are developing tend to be where the virus can just rip through an unvaccinated population.

Malcolm wrote:

Dan is referring to the spread of MRSA, aka Methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus*, which evolved in response to an overuse of antibiotics. But viruses do not easily develop resistance to vaccines, neither do bacteria:

There are some reasons to be optimistic that the coronavirus will not become resistant to vaccines. Several years ago, Dr. Kennedy and Dr. Read presented an analysis of the difference between resistance to drugs and vaccines. Neither bacteria nor viruses evolve resistance to vaccines as easily as they do to drugs, they wrote. Smallpox vaccine never lost its effectiveness, nor did the vaccines for measles or polio, despite years of use...

And there are numerous varieties of vaccines in development. The first two approaching approval in the United States both use a significant chunk of viral RNA to train the immune system. Other vaccines that are in development use the whole virus. And different vaccines deliver the virus or part of it in different ways, all of which could prompt a different immune response.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2020/11/27/science/covid-vaccine-virus-resistance.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Amida Butsu

Content:

Minobu said:

he entire deathbed as long as you chant something at that moment what ever you did in your life has no consequence ...you get a free ride to Pure land...this is corruption if you ask me...and basically what was literally being sold to the public during Nichiren's time.

Malcolm wrote:

Your time frame is too short. Think about all the nonvirtue we have engaged in since beginningless time. But even the force of all of that cannot prevent someone from being born in Sukhavati if at the time of their death they focus single-heartedly on Amitābha Buddha. There are various ways to parse how the Pure Land Sūtra are supposed to be read, but recall, even Angulimāla, after murdering 999 people, attained arhatship. And his sūtra is one of the main tathāgatagarbha sūtras. There is considerable precedent for the idea that one's conduct in life is not necessarily a negative, determining factor in whether one can take birth in the pure lands.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 1:23 AM

Title: Re: Amida Butsu

Content:

Queequeg said:

Nichiren affirmed the possibility of practice in Mappo, taking advantage of the adversity presented by Mappo as opportunity to engage in vigorous practice in the manner of Sadaparibhuta who went around honoring all beings as buddhas to be. I challenge anyone living these days, in this chaotic, degrading world, to try that practice. It is HARD. But that's what Nichiren said should be the practice now.

Malcolm wrote:

The key point of Vajrayāna is seeing all beings as buddhas NOW, not as buddhas-to-be. But there are methods, easy, not difficult, and so on, for those who are interested.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 1:54 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

<https://www.businessinsider.com/covid-transmission-vaccinated-people-risk-of-resistant-variant-2021-7?r=US&IR=T>

The vaccines are not themselves at fault, except that they are just not as effective anymore.

Malcolm wrote:

Define "effective."

Dan74 said:

Perhaps unrealistic, but that would've worked a great deal better.

Malcolm wrote:

No shit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Mutation/evolution occurs by process of elimination. It's essentially like playing 20 questions where all the wrong guesses are eliminated but one correct answer survives.

Antibiotics and antivirals may knock out 99.9% of the “bad guys” but the bad guys aren’t all exactly identical and a few survive. If they can’t successfully replicate and spread (from one person or animal to another) they will go completely extinct. Hurray! But if .01% (and that can easily be a million bad guys) can survive and spread, then they are known as a “variant”.

So, it’s not that medicines “cause” mutations. It’s that whatever survives is able to spread and grow.

Malcolm wrote:

Apples and oranges. We are talking about vaccines, not drugs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 1:57 AM

Title: Re: Amida Butsu

Content:

Queequeg said:

the Vajrayana approach is based on...

Malcolm wrote:

Yoga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

All I am saying is that it appears to me to be a risk.

Malcolm wrote:

And hence my point, we have a social right to institute "draconian" measures to stop this illness. Time for being pleasant to antivaxxers is just over. Period.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 3:15 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

All I am saying is that it appears to me to be a risk.

Malcolm wrote:

And hence my point, we have a social right to institute "draconian" measures to stop this illness. Time for being pleasant to antivaxxers is just over. Period.

FiveSkandhas said:

That's a bit strong, sir.

Malcolm wrote:

The law is very clear.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Anyway, I am not personally willing to turn off democracy or related principles out of a desire for public safety, particularly when this is now a preventable disease, anyway.

Malcolm wrote:

Since when does the law have nothing to do with Democracy?

The 1905 SCOTUS decision is absolutely clear. Communities have the legal right to mandate vaccines for its citizens in public health emergencies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 3:20 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Dan74 said:

We know a few from both kinds. They are neither necessarily bad people, nor morons, but closed to any argument to the contrary.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means at best they are morons...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 3:34 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Anyway, I am not personally willing to turn off democracy or related principles out of a desire for public safety, particularly when this is now a preventable disease, anyway.

Malcolm wrote:

Since when does the law have nothing to do with Democracy?

The 1905 SCOTUS decision is absolutely clear. Communities have the legal right to mandate vaccines for its citizens in public health emergencies.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah no, I'm married to an attorney, it's not that simple.

Malcolm wrote:

It's that simple. The reason why you have vaccinate your kids to send them to school is from a later SCOTUS decision. We just have not had such stupid people + the internet to cause this level of ignorance around the science of vaccines until now. We've also all forgotten what it was like growing up with the threat of polio, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 4:46 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I agree with this too. And the more we restrict civil liberties, the more the paranoid conspiracies of the anti-vaxxers will appear to be confirmed in the flesh.

Malcolm wrote:

Requiring vaccinations in a public health emergency is not restricting civil liberties, in fact it is the opposite. It's also completely lawful.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Agree. Someday we may find a "super vaxx" but until then this is something we will have to live with, as our ancestors lived with bouts of smallpox, for example. Only COVID (in iterations so far) is orders of magnitude less lethal than smallpox was.

Malcolm wrote:

The medical cost is much higher. 14 billion dollars so far in the US alone, 75k per hospitalization on average. Coddling time for these idiots is over. Time to get serious is far overdue.

But as long as everyone caters to the delicate "feelings" of these antivaxx snowflakes, for that long we just continue the pandemic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My point still stands.

reiun said:

There is no healthy reason evident to belabor this. You say "meditation" was the question, vs "meditation or practice" per Seitaka. Just try to let it go.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is that there is a point on which all Mahayana schools agree: in order to attain buddhahood, one has to eradicate all taints. If one does not do this, even if one's practice is impartial compassion which benefits sentient beings, even if one's wisdom is that of a tenth stage bodhisattva, it is still contaminated, so not the highest.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 6:19 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

In between the lockdowns I attended a Boxing gym (yeah, yeah it was distanced and whatnot, about as safe as you could get during that time, so save your finger wagging if you're contemplating it, not the point), this gym was like...80% young black and hispanic men, and the coach was a black man who grew up in South Central LA, was a veteran, probably has had a life so much harder than mine that I can't even fathom it. Not even probably, I talked to him enough to know it's true.

I would hear them talk politics and vaccination and it was some paranoia, conspiracies, a general distrust of authority. In their case I get it, while it may be wrong, I can at least empathize with why they would be paranoid. They aren't just "morons" that can be dismissed out of hand, and reducing them to that seems unproductive and shitty. I don't know what the solution is to convincing them.

The idea that everyone who has not gotten vaccinated is some rural strictly ideological right wing conspiracy nut holed up in his shed is just not accurate at all, even when just looking at demographics of who is lagging. It's exactly the kind of media-created blinder that makes white liberal America constantly shoot itself in the foot. If anything I think it's apathetic young people that people should be worried about when concerned with vaccine hesitancy. Purely anecdotal, but of all the conversations I've had or overheard

about people justifying not getting vaccinated, young people saying they weren't doing it because they weren't worried about dying were a good chunk.

Malcolm wrote:

In general, I am talking dumbass white people. I understand the issues around trusting white people black people have. My family is mixed race.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 6:22 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reipun said:

There is no healthy reason evident to belabor this. You say "meditation" was the question, vs "meditation or practice" per Seitaka. Just try to let it go.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is that there is a point on which all Mahayana schools agree: in order to attain buddhahood, one has to eradicate all taints. If one does not do this, even if one's practice is impartial compassion which benefits sentient beings, even if one's wisdom is that of a tenth stage bodhisattva, it is still contaminated, so not the highest.

reipun said:

At Dai Bosatsu Zendo one of our prayers included the phrase "in order to continue our practice for all beings". This is the reason for attaining buddhahood, to make this practice the highest. It is just a step. There can be no higher purpose than to practice on behalf of others, to dedicate it to the liberation of all beings. As Heart Sutra says, "attainment too is sunyata".

Malcolm wrote:

And no one does that practice better than a buddha. So, still the attainment of buddhahood is the highest practice, along with its attendant samadhis and so on. It's impossible to attain buddhahood in absence of Mahayana bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reipun said:

At Dai Bosatsu Zendo one of our prayers included the phrase "in order to continue our practice for all beings". This is the reason for attaining buddhahood, to make this practice the highest. It is just a step. There can be no higher purpose than to practice on behalf of others, to dedicate it to the liberation of all beings. As Heart Sutra says,

"attainment too is sunyata".

Malcolm wrote:

And no one does that practice better than a buddha. So, still the attainment of buddhahood is the highest practice, along with its attendant samadhis and so on. . .

reiun said:

The highest practice is the actualization of the attainment of buddhahood, not the attainment itself.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean once you have the attainment you stop practicing it? That does not correspond to how I understand buddhahood. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

The highest practice is the actualization of the attainment of buddhahood, not the attainment itself.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean once you have the attainment you stop practicing it? That does not correspond to how I understand buddhahood. YMMV.

reiun said:

I have no idea how you would legitimately conclude that. Actualization of attainment is practice.

Malcolm wrote:

I can't understand why you are bothering to object to my initial point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 7:57 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Because I believe achieving buddhahood is not the highest practice. Actualization of buddhahood, imo, is.

Bristollad said:

I don't want to intrude but personally, I don't understand how you can make a

distinction between achieving Buddhahood and actualisation of Buddhahood. A buddha without effort continually works for the benefit of all sentient beings, that's what achieving Buddhahood means...

Malcolm wrote:

I tried to explain that, but to no avail.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: How Many Mahayanas Were There? - David Drewes new paper

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I am not sure if Tibetans have the idea that you must consecrate a sūtra also before using it in rituals, but that is certainly prevalent in Nepal and appears in the Kriyāsaṃgrahapañjikā of Kuladatta.

Malcolm wrote:

We just put the text on our heads, as a symbolic prostration.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 9:10 PM

Title: Re: How Many Mahayanas Were There? - David Drewes new paper

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Where Drewes is mistaken, I think, is continuing to simply ignore passages that refer to books when he suggests that writing and books were not important or worshipped in the Mahāyāna. Also, he conflates (purposefully?) Schopen's claim that the sūtras were worshipped in homes or shrines rather than caityas (there are sūtras in caityas in Nepal btw) as a rejection of the idea of book worship.

Malcolm wrote:

For example, when Mahāsiddha Virūpa (8th-9th century) was in South India, having been recruited as by a Hindu King for his expertise in Sanskrit, he was busted for prostrating to a copy of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā rather than a Śiva linga. One can well imagine that taking this sūtra as an object of devotion was extremely common, particularly among the educated, Buddhist elites. It's my personal favorite, along with the Saṃcayagathas.

Zhen Li said:

There are also stele of the Prajñāpāramitā Devī indicating book worship at the base, not to mention the original idea of putting the Prajñāpāramitā pustaka on the lotuses of Prajñāpāramitā Devī as well as Cundā and Mañjuśrī and others is clearly playing on the idea that Buddhists worship these books.



Manuscripts from the time are also covered in vermillion and incense stains, just like images. This hardly makes sense if Buddhists were just producing them en masse just to stuff them away in a library. Besides its constant appearance in Mahāyāna sūtras, the Śikṣāsamuccaya and a number of other śāstras bring this up multiple times as an important part of practice.

I think this also relates to the idea prevalent in a lot of Buddhist practices that you cannot "just read" a sūtra. You have to honour it first. In East Asia it has been reduced to a verse, but in Nepal the ritual that precedes opening a sūtra can take half an hour to perform. One example of this procedure in Tibetan is found in Tōh. no. 4252, Pustakapāṭhopāya. I am not sure if Tibetans have the idea that you must consecrate a sūtra also before using it in rituals, but that is certainly prevalent in Nepal and appears in the Kriyāsaṃgrahapañjikā of Kuladatta.

Malcolm wrote:

To add to this however, most refuge visualizations include visualizing a cliff composed of all the Sutras and Tantras, on the rear petal of the refuge tree, and this is performed daily, more than once.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 9:11 PM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are signs. I suggest you read a book on the subject.

shagrath said:

Could you please suggest some books on tukdam, signs?

Malcolm wrote:

Any book on the death process in Tibetan Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Heart Sutra Applied

Content:

bodhiye said:

Is the Heart Sutra used as a meditation guide by anyone or utilized in some practical way? Are there any books/commentaries about applying the Heart Sutra's teachings in everyday life?

Malcolm wrote:

You should obtain

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Because I believe achieving buddhahood is not the highest practice. Actualization of buddhahood, imo, is.

Bristollad said:

I don't want to intrude but personally, I don't understand how you can make a distinction between achieving Buddhahood and actualisation of Buddhahood. A buddha without effort continually works for the benefit of all sentient beings, that's what achieving Buddhahood means...

reiun said:

I wouldn't try to refute that theory for the twenty-some cosmic buddhas of mythology, fwiw. You can consider this outside of Buddhism, but my theory is that I don't believe any human will be perfect and not struggle, regardless.

Malcolm wrote:

So you actually reject buddhahood. Interesting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 11:07 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Actually, I like the theory of buddhahood quite a bit, but it is unrealistic. I prefer to keep an open, if skeptical, mind. It works as an aspiration for us all, certainly.

Malcolm wrote:

It seems we are not discussing the same thing. Hence the disconnect.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: Heart Sutra Applied

Content:

Dan74 said:

I find the assertions of the Heart Sutra to be a great starting point of investigating. "Form does not differ from emptiness". What does this mean to me right now? Right this moment, how does this apply? This cup next to me I grasp with my senses, with my hand, with my cognition, this form, how is it empty? I grasp it as an object, a thing out there, separate to me and to other objects, but how can this be so, since it is unable to

be except in relation to others. The table supports it. Light travels from it to my eyes and the signal is then relayed to the brain. It hold my coffee, which gives it its identity as a cup - its function of holding a liquid. Etc Etc... When I start experiencing the world around me, not as a collection of discrete entities separate to me , myself separated from the world of things, but rather a flow of relationships, of phenomena, the grasping loosens a little.

"No form, no feeling..." How can there be no feeling? That pushes me to investigate feeling. What is it? Does it arise, does it change? Does it cease? What is it before I label it this or that? Pay careful attention to it. Are there different kinds? Etc..

Malcolm wrote:

It's material aggregate actually, the rūpaskandha; not form, the object of the eye, rūpāyatana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

Dharmasagara said:

The Zabsang Khandro Nyingthig is the earth terma of Düdjom Lingpa, a huge collection of sadhanas of all types.

Malcolm wrote:

I assumed he meant the Khandro Thuktik.

Dharmasagara said:

By contrast, the Khandro Thugthig by Düdjom Lingpa is indeed a gongter mind treasure.

As nyingthig and thugthig carry practically speaking the same meaning, mixing up the two cycles is a frequent occurrence.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 6th, 2021 at 11:14 PM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

yagmort said:

do, even though it looks like a rather rare occurrence that an earth terma contains tregchö/tögel section, it is not unheard of. hence me asking about \_most recent\_ earth termas with tregchö/tögel.

Malcolm wrote:

The Vima Snying thig is an earth terma, though it is typically included with bka' ma, it is not actually bka' ma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 12:54 AM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Vima Snying thig is an earth terma, though it is typically included with bka' ma, it is not actually bka' ma.

yagmort said:

interesting.

who had concealed it and who has revealed it?

also, do we have accurate datings?

Malcolm wrote:

It was concealed by Chetsun Senge Wangchuk. It was taken out of a cave in O'yuk, Tsang with the assistance of the guardian, Dorje Lekpa, around c. 1117-1118 by Zhangton Tashi Dorje (1197-1167).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

yeshegyaltsen said:

The Khandro thugthig was revealed by Dudjom Rinpoche, not Dudjom Lingpa

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

...

It was concealed by Chetsun Senge Wangchuk. It was taken out of a cave in O'yuk, Tsang with the assistance of the guardian, Dorje Lekpa, around c. 1117-1118 by Zhangton Tashi Dorje (1197-1167)...

yagmort said:  
thanks.

Malcolm, do one get Vima Nyingthig empowerment as a part of Nyinthig Yabzhi empowerment only?

also, if a master gives Nyingthig Yabzhi empowerment (or any other major cycle empowerment for that matter), does it mean he/she is accomplished in this cycle?  
i don't think i understand this point.

some masters are the lineage holders for so many cycles, like düdjom tersar, pema lingpa termas, northern treasures, longchen nyingthig etc., does that mean they have mastered them all, ie they not only give you a wang for a specific cycle, but are also accomplished in all of them and qualified to teach them, check your progress, understand your difficulties, correct mistakes, clear misunderstandings and give advice? not just give you a wang?

Malcolm wrote:

Dzogchen is Dzogchen, as they say gcig shes kun grol, knowing one liberates all. In this case, many lamas who have not mastered thogal beyond the second vision (and most lamas have not) nevertheless give Dzogchen empowerments and teachings. And, if you understand and have experience in Dzogchen, one does not need to "master" all these cycles to teach them (providing you have received them), since the basic points of Dzogchen man ngag sde are identical in every system. The main difference will be whatever yidams are associated with this or that cycle as supports. For example, ChNN freely picked and chose from what he considered the best from older termas, and presented them in that way, not bothering to or even thinking it necessary to give the entire cycle from which this or that Dzogchen instruction was drawn. At base, Nyinthig Dzogchen practice is summed up in four points: mind-training, rushan, trekcho, and thogal. The rest of it is ancillary. For example, to practice Yeshe Lama, all you really need is the empowerment of Thigle Gyacan, and the lung and rig pa'i rtsal wang of Ye shes lama. You don't need the entire Longchen Nyinthig. Just the Dzogchen portion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 3:41 AM

Title: Re: trekcho/tögel earth terma?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

... In this case, many lamas who have not mastered thogal beyond the second vision (and most lamas have not) nevertheless give Dzogchen empowerments and teachings...

yagmort said:

so what's your take on this? Togden Shakya Shri, whom i hold in a rather high regard, has said that one can only teach dzogchen when one has accomplished third vision of tögel. that sounds about right, but then comes my confusion as to how can i assess that? presumably Togden Shakya Shri didn't mean it as a task of a disciple but thought it as a

reference for a sincere teacher to follow, but nowadays.. as you said and i agree, "most lamas have not"..

Malcolm wrote:

While this is a desideratum since such a teacher will definitely be an ārya, don't hold your breath or spend much time worrying about whether or not so and so has reached this level of practice. Liberation is not like glitter, it does not rub off on the student. One still has one's own work to do. As long as the teacher has authentic experience of the first vision, they can correctly guide you.

that clarifies, thank you. what about Vima Nyingthig? do one need whole Nyingthig Yabzhi wang?

No, just the Vima Nyinthig wang.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 3:53 AM

Title: Re: Is the Pali Canon seen as legitimate / correct-view for Mahayana Buddhists?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Legitimate, but not to read to the exclusion of Mahayana, which is more profound and has a higher view.

frankie said:

A superficial and merely technical understanding would probably concur. It is interesting to note, however, how many practioners notice after 'beginning' with the Pali canon, before moving onto the 'higher view Mahayana/Vajrayana, that they eventually arrive at the fascinating 'destination of no destination' where they discover that, for example, the Four Noble Truths, are embedded within and experiently realised to be contained in the 'highest views'. It seems this is why the savviest teachers are not too keen on higher-lower discriminations.

The lower/higher dichotomies then become a source of ironic humour. informed by this, one can read again the Pali canon and the 'higher teachings and find the whole experience vibrates with instantaneous recognition and profound meaning. No differences, unless there is remaining a faulty determination to hold onto them.

Malcolm wrote:

Tell that to Nāgārjuna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 6:06 AM

Title: Re: Achi Chokyi Drolma Yidam

Content:

Ayu said:

You should ask your teacher, because experience shows that different teachers give very different explanations to different students.

fckw said:

And yet the same sadhana text exposes the same letters to all practitioners without the slightest individual adaptations!

So, who is then right: The teacher who provides individualized explanations, or the sadhana text that does not?

Malcolm wrote:

The teacher, of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 8:43 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Bristollad said:

I don't want to intrude but personally, I don't understand how you can make a distinction between achieving Buddhahood and actualisation of Buddhahood. A buddha without effort continually works for the benefit of all sentient beings, that's what achieving Buddhahood means...

Malcolm wrote:

I tried to explain that, but to no avail.

Crazywisdom said:

Buddhahood is not achieved, remember? Buddhahood is spontaneous beneficial activities of body, speech and mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it is. There is a difference between the basis and the result. The basis is called the basis because it's nature has not been realized. That's what the path is for. Even though these three things are just the same in suchness, the result does not happen without the path. That's just the way it is. Just observe yourself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 8:47 AM

Title: Re: Anatman and the Tulku

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Tulkus or yangsis, are a Tibetan cultural strategy for preserving the legacies of esteemed persons. Some of them might actually be the rebirths of their predecessors. By far the majority are not, they are just blessed that way through ritual installments.

Conrad Resmar said:

Hi All:

I have a basic difficulty in reconciling the two concepts that are mentioned in the subject heading of my post. My understanding of no-self and of the doctrine of rebirth is that there is no discrete, individually intact personhood that gets reborn; rather a (somewhat mysterious) stream of karmic effects and aspects of a life are what persists.

But the tulku seems to some degree like an example of a reborn personality, or individuality, even down to the ability to remember objects from a former existence. I'm sure this difficulty, or apparent conflict, has been written about somewhere, but I'd be glad to hear your thoughts or be provided with references to look into.

By extension I have a similar curiosity about how to understand the apparently stable personhood or identity of beings identified in Vajrayana tradition (boddhisattvas, deities, dakinis). They seem to preserve their identity or individual identifying marks in a way that transcends a single lifetime.

Grateful for your any helpful input. Thanks!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 10:39 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Basis and result are both dynamic, not static.

Malcolm wrote:

That does matter. One is cause; the other, result.

reiun said:

The path is actualization

Malcolm wrote:

.

Yes, but that actualization is limited and impaired by the amount of traces of obscuration of affliction and knowledge one possesses. Buddhas are not limited or impaired in this way. The way they achieve this matters. Therefore, the highest practice is the attainment of buddhahood. That has requisites.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

reiun said:

Actualizatuon of Buddhahood is not limited by anything.

Malcolm wrote:

So, right now you have no limitations?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Base, path and result are indivisible, right?

Malcolm wrote:

From the perspective of suchness, but not from the perspective of a person, who has not abandoned what is to be abandoned and has not realized what is to be realized. That means us.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 7:59 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The vajra body is not physical.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, yes it is, which is why it is important understand the development of the body. Entire texts are devoted to thus topic, and it is covered in such tantras as the Cakrasamvara cycle, etc., as well as the Blazing Lamp, etc.

Luckily “heart” does not mean the organ, but the region below the organ, and above the diaphragm.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 8:04 PM

Title: Re: Is the Pali Canon seen as legitimate / correct-view for Mahayana Buddhists?

Content:

frankie said:

"The third (Noble) truth is the Truth of Cessation. Related to the Truth of Cessation is recognizing emptiness and the nature of one's mind. Emptiness and the nature of one's mind, which is Buddha nature or Buddha essence are not different, they are actually inseparable. What is the nature of this natural state of the mind, this buddha nature? It has complete happiness and joy; it doesn't have any suffering or illness. It's like that all the time. That is what we call resting in happiness." (MIngyur Rinpoche).

Of course there are a million quotables who will gainsay or support this. I guess it comes down to who we decide to hitch our wagon to and the experiences we have.

Malcolm wrote:

The shravakayana texts do not describe the path of buddhahood, period. You can check with Nagarjuna on that in the Ratnavali.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Your lama disagreed.

Malcolm wrote:

That is not so. Anyway, all this is explained very clearly in such texts as Baidurya sngon po by Desi Sangye Gyatso, the Third Karmapa, Gyalwa Yanggonpa, etc.

Crazywisdom said:

There are different perspectives on this. There are no organs corresponding to the Lalan, rasana or central channel.

Malcolm wrote:

Also false. Kalacakra clearly states that the lower end of the central channel is the rectum, and the rasana and lalana discharge urine and semen respectively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

So what is that? All there is down there is intestines. The nervous system is sympathetic. That's why sometimes when you have an itch on your cheek you itch on your leg as well. These channels correspond to energetic pathways based on networks of nerves, not one specific physical thing.

Malcolm wrote:

The way you visualize the vajra body does not correspond to how it physically exists in your body, just as the way you visualize yourself as a deity, sans viscera, does not correspond to how your body actually exists.

There is no such thing as "energy." There are five elements, that is all. Vāyu is just the element of air that exists inside the body. If the vajra body is not physical, there would be no way it could cause pain, or in the case of the eyes, for example, be damaged by over exposure to light sources, etc. In fact, it could not be damaged at all by anything, including surgery.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Josef said:

The channels are not physical in the sense of being a part of the gross anatomical structure of the body but they are "embodied" as light, and are the support for the development of our physical form.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, they are actually just the nerves, arteries, blood vessels, lymphatic system, and other passageways of the body, spoken of in a concealed way in the tantras. "Light" is not a sixth element.

There is a common saying in among Tibetan doctors, "That which the secret mantra tantras conceal in symbols is discussed openly in the medicine tantras."

I am going to leave this topic here, because it is not suitable for discussion (by me at any rate) beyond this point. You know, samaya and all that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:18 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Base, path and result are indivisible, right?

Malcolm wrote:

From the perspective of suchness, but not from the perspective of a person, who has not abandoned what is to be abandoned and has not realized what is to be realized. That means us.

Crazywisdom said:  
Abandon what? Vajrayana doesn't abandon anything.

Malcolm wrote:

We are not really discussing Vajrayāna here, but rather, common Mahāyāna. But even in Vajrayāna, one still abandons the two obscurations, which is necessary for attaining the two kāyas. What we don't abandon in Vajrayāna is sense objects, which are used in the path of transformation when we are connected with that method through ripening empowerments and liberating instructions, such as sleeping yogas, waking yogas, washing yogas, eating yogas, yoga of passion, yoga of creation, completion, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Josef said:

The channels are not physical in the sense of being a part of the gross anatomical structure of the body but they are "embodied" as light, and are the support for the development of our physical form.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, they are actually just the nerves, arteries, blood vessels, lymphatic system, and other passageways of the body, spoken of in a concealed way in the tantras. "Light" is not a sixth element.

There is a common saying in among Tibetan doctors, "That which the secret mantra tantras conceal in symbols is discussed openly in the medicine tantras."

I am going to leave this topic here, because it is not suitable for discussion (by me at any rate) beyond this point. You know, samaya and all that.

Josef said:

Interesting.

Looking forward to discussing more in a suitable environment.

Malcolm wrote:

Examine the gestation of the body in the Tibetan medical paintings. Then read descriptions of the formation of the body in various tantric texts. What would the point identifying the stages of the gestation of a human embryo with the ten avatars of Visnu mean if we were not discussing the development of the physical body? The formation of all channels in the body are described in the tantras as being governed by the five elements. How could this be possible if the channels and elements in the channels (vāyu, bindu) are some woo woo form of ill-defined "energy"? The Buddha discussed

only six dhātus: earth, water, fire, air, space, and consciousness. He did not describe a seventh called "light."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Is the Pali Canon seen as legitimate / correct-view for Mahayana Buddhists?

Content:

frankie said:

Thanks Malcolm, no need. I have no reason to disbelieve you have done so. Outside of that received information, who knows, your beliefs may be another thing.

Malcolm wrote:

You are mistaking the presence of teachings such as the four truths of nobles in Mahāyāna sūtras for some equivalence with the śrāvaka presentation. For example, Dzogchen is considered to be the third truth of nobles. There is no contradiction there.

What is missing from the śrāvaka path is profound bodhicitta and profound emptiness, just as what is missing from the common Mahāyāna path is the many methods which are easy, swift, and suitable to be practiced by the very intelligent who wish to achieve a result equivalent to the common Mahāyāna path in a more reasonable time frame than three incalculable eons.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 7th, 2021 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Abandon what? Vajrayana doesn't abandon anything.

Malcolm wrote:

We are not really discussing Vajrayāna here, but rather, common Mahāyāna. But even in Vajrayāna, one still abandons the two obscurations.

Crazywisdom said:

Also a gloss. They are seen as prajna

Malcolm wrote:

Not a gloss. The two obscurations are something to be purified in Vajrayāna. That does not mean they substantially exist. For example, Śākyamitra's Mahāmudrāyogāvatāraṇḍārtha it states, "After migrating beings complete the accumulation of merit, they completely abandon the great mass of the two

obscurations." Or Ratnarakṣita's commentary on the Laghusamvara, which states, "Gradually abandoning the two obscurations and accomplishing mahamudra to serve all migrating beings is the stated purpose." Even Tilopa states in his Mahāmudropadeśa:

For example, though darkness accumulates for a thousand eons,  
the mass of darkness is dispelled by a single lamp;  
likewise, a moment of the luminosity of one's mind  
will dispel all misdeeds and obscurations gathered for an eon.

So, while one can certainly argue over method, one cannot argue that in order to attain buddhahood, one must abandon or remove the two obscurations.

Naropa, in his Sekkodeśa commentary on the empowerments of Kālacakra, also discusses the need to abandon the two obscurations. In fact, he discusses four obscurations there, the usual two, plus obscurations of māra and samapatti.

Frankly, you are just not going to find Indian masters who negate the necessity of abandoning the two obscurations and gathering the two accumulations. Even in the Dzogchen tradition, this is necessary, as Khenpo Ngachung points out. The means may be different but the necessity is still there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 12:07 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Josef said:

Interesting.

Looking forward to discussing more in a suitable environment.

Malcolm wrote:

Examine the gestation of the body in the Tibetan medical paintings. Then read descriptions of the formation of the body in various tantric texts. What would the point identifying the stages of the gestation of a human embryo with the ten avatars of Visnu mean if we were not discussing the development of the physical body? The formation of all channels in the body are described in the tantras as being governed by the five elements. How could this be possible if the channels and elements in the channels (vāyu, bindu) are some woo woo form of ill-defined "energy"? The Buddha discussed only six dhātus: earth, water, fire, air, space, and consciousness. He did not describe a seventh called "light."

Josef said:

That makes perfect sense. I used light there for lack of a more precise term/personal understanding. Perhaps a different topic but would there be an argument for the channels etc in our realm being a subtle form of the elements similar to the embodied

beings in the form and formless realms? I think that notion was influencing my perspective. Basically, that the channels were the support for the development of the corporeal body but not as coarse.

Malcolm wrote:

Coarse or subtle, there is nothing in this universe that is not made of the five elements, including the form and formless realms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Highest form of meditation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I know all this. But the use of the word abandon doesn't quite work in pith instructions.

Malcolm wrote:

To abandon is spong. Spong is from prahāṇa. n. relinquishing , abandoning , avoiding

Are you giving pith instructions here? Is that what you are doing?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 2:33 AM

Title: Re: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

maliciously destroying the Bamiyan statue...

Malcolm wrote:

That's not what actually happened. The statues at Bamiyan were targeted because the UN was spending millions of dollars to restore them as UN cultural heritage monuments, and none of the money was being spent in the local communities.

Anyway, Śāntideva discusses the issue of destroying statues of the Buddha...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The point is these channels like Lalana and rasana are woo woo, because they have no concrete physical correspondence.

Malcolm wrote:

They do actually. I just pointed out what Kālacakra says of them.

In his commentary on the medicine tantras, Desi points out that the avadhuti, for example, is physical, but can only be identified in living bodies.

In the dgongs pa zang thal, an outer, inner, and secret avadhuti is discussed. The outer is the spinal cord, specifically identified as such, the inner is the aorta, specifically identified as such, and the secret one is the very fine channel that Desi discusses.

The descriptions of these things in the body are too precise and specific for them not to be physical structures in the body.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The point is these channels like Lalana and rasana are woo woo, because they have no concrete physical correspondence.

Malcolm wrote:

They do actually. I just pointed out what Kālacakra says of them.

In his commentary on the medicine tantras, Desi points out that the avadhuti, for example, is physical, but can only be identified in living bodies.

In the dgongs pa zang thal, an outer, inner, and secret avadhuti is discussed. The outer is the spinal cord, specifically identified as such, the inner is the aorta, specifically identified as such, and the secret one is the very fine channel that Desi discusses.

The descriptions of these things in the body are too precise and specific for them not to be physical structures in the body.

Dechen Norbu said:

What about prana, Malcolm, is it physical?

I think I once heard someone saying it was physical, but not material. Can't precise who exactly...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because it is the air element, prāṇavāyu, one of the five vāyus, along with apanā, udanā, samanā, and vyanā. It's part of the rūpaskandha, the aggregate of matter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 3:42 AM

Title: Re: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:



Queequeg said:  
maliciously destroying the Bamiyan statue...

Malcolm wrote:  
That's not what actually happened. The statues at Bamiyan were targeted because the UN was spending millions of dollars to restore them as UN cultural heritage monuments, and none of the money was being spent in the local communities.

Anyway, Śāntideva discusses the issue of destroying statues of the Buddha...

bodhiye said:  
Is there any expiation for such people who desecrate Buddha statues. destroy sutras/religious literature etc. ? What can be done to mitigate their bad karmic results?

Malcolm wrote:  
Nothing.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 4:40 AM  
Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?  
Content:

Dechen Norbu said:  
What about prana, Malcolm, is it physical?  
I think I once heard someone saying it was physical, but not material. Can't precise who exactly...

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, because it is the air element, prāṇavāyu, one of the five vāyus, along with apanā, udanā, samanā, and vyanā. It's part of the rūpaskandha, the aggregate of matter.

Dechen Norbu said:  
Thank you.  
But is it material? Afaik it can't be detected by any measuring instruments. I'm not really sure what physical but not material might mean. Electromagnetic fields are physical but not material.  
If prana is physical, we should somehow detect it, no? Is it just a technological problem?

Malcolm wrote:  
prāṇa vāyu is just inhaled air, If you stop breathing, you die. Apanā vayu is just the function of expelling feces, urine, sperm, menstrual blood, and babies, and farts. Samanā vayu is just the action of the small intestine on food. Udana vāyu is talking, etc.

All these functions are governed in general by the air element, which manifests in our experience as the motile quality of matter.

What has happened is that new age ideas about prāṇa have so infected our thinking, when we look at Buddhist texts, there are all these cobwebs we have to peel from our eyes.

In particular, when it comes to anatomy, Tibetans were just better at it than the Chinese, Indians, Persians, and even the Greeks. The Tibetans cut up a lot more human bodies than any other culture in the world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 4:52 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

maliciously destroying the Bamiyan statue...

Malcolm wrote:

That's not what actually happened. The statues at Bamiyan were targeted because the UN was spending millions of dollars to restore them as UN cultural heritage monuments, and none of the money was being spent in the local communities.

Queequeg said:

That's a stretch. Those statues could have been massive tourist traps and brought millions.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a stretch, there was a news item about this recently.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:08 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Dechen Norbu said:

And the gandharva is riding on air or something after we die?

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, in the bardo, the all-basis consciousness is mounted up the mahapranavayu, according to the Vajramala Tantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:17 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

Well, so a tibetan doctor has to directly experience tsa lung (as in Dzog-Rim) in order to understand subtle anatomy and cure his patients?

Malcolm wrote:

It helps considerably.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:19 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

That's a stretch. Those statues could have been massive tourist traps and brought millions.

Malcolm wrote:

Its not a stretch, there was a news item about this recently.

Queequeg said:

I'd like to see that. I can't believe thats what the Taliban were upset about.

Malcolm wrote:

I searched for it, could not locate it. But this was a recent account of their basic grievance against UNESCO in general. They thought they were being ripped off. They could give a shit about statues. Their destruction of Buddhist art and relics was a reaction against the west, nothing to do with Buddhism at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 10:08 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Dechen Norbu said:

And the gandharva is riding on air ir something after we die?

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, in the bardo, the all-basis consciousness is mounted up the mahapranavayu, according to the Vajramala Tantra.

Dechen Norbu said:

Yes, I learned that. What is that prana in relation to the body while we are alive?

Malcolm wrote:

It's the air we breathe. You might say it is the refined air we breathe, processed by our

lungs. The five elements in the body are refined elements, which is why we spend so much energy separating wastes from the body, parts of the outer elements we can't absorb or don't need to absorb.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 10:16 AM

Title: Re: Not sure where to go

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

This is a popular idea right now.

It is highly debatable.

PeterC said:

Is it popular? It is flat out wrong.

yinyangkoi said:

Why is it wrong? Buddha said himself there is no free will since there is no self that can have any. Also since everything is conditioned, what you desire and any other phenomena that manifests is just a result of conditioning.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha never discussed free will. It is a philosophical issue of interest only to Christians.

What the Buddha said is that will is action.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:13 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Air doesn't govern. Everything you are saying is woo woo. It's not like you brought some grounded objectivity into this subject. It's not like you calling the central channel the aorta somehow makes wisdom real. Wisdom is not a thing.

Josef said:

From what perspective are you asserting that vayu doesn't "govern" the functions of the body?

I would also be curious to know what makes you think "wisdom" isn't a thing? Are you talking about yeshe/jnana when you make this assertion?

Crazywisdom said:

Air doesn't make decisions. It's gas. The body metabolizes it. What governs in the cellular anatomy is mitochondria. There's no wisdom atom, like there is a gas atom. Yes, I'm referring to prājña.

Malcolm likes to diss Kalachakra as being about mythical kings. But for this, physical channels, it's right, because it gives him a chance to make propaganda about Tibetan medicine which he has an interest in. He says how we visualize is not how they exist in body. But how they exist in body is irrelevant. How we visualize is what we do with them. We practice yoga. They have no use without this. What's a yogi supposed to do with his aorta? It's nonsense. The tantras describe the embryo to show how we can reverse this process at death or conscious be reborn as Nirmanakaya.

In fact, has absolutely nothing do with an aorta. ChNN said the central channel is not physical. He said it doesn't matter what size you visualize. Tibetan medicine, like Ayurveda is antiquated using ancient modalities. Fire is not an element. Wind is not an element. Go see the periodic table of elements. There's no Mount Meru. There's no Jambudvīpa. Alchemy is debunked. Astrology is debunked. All of these vestiges from the past in tantra need to be weeded out. The relevant part is peace of mind.

I'm waiting to see which vein is Lalana and rasana. Which 16 channels come out of the heart? Some completion stages make this important. Others don't. In some sense this but of tantra is outmoded as well.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, well you go practice Vajrayana with your novel interpretations and understandings.

I stuck with what the texts say, not what random people in the internet say.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:17 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Gyalwa Yangonpa says that doctors like to say the channels are all physical but yogis have a different view.

Malcolm wrote:

Some yogis do, some yogis don't.

When practicing yoga, they are visualized as light, but then, so is ones entire body. When diagnosing an illness, however, the very same channels are understood to be physical structures in the body.

There is an entire literature called geg sel, very little of which has been read by Westerners, which deal with yogic illnesses problems and to remedy them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 8:22 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Ok, so there's actually quite a lot about this on english wikipedia, under the heading "1998 to 2001, under the Taliban" see:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Buddhas\\_of\\_Bamiyan](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Buddhas_of_Bamiyan)

Then again, it is not like the Taliban are tolerant of other religious traditions. I mean there seems to be a tradition of salafi-jihadists destroying the religious symbols of other traditions. E.g. ISIS destroying statues of the virgin Mary/older ME religions in Syria. Talibans of course aren't exactly a big fan of their shia-muslims cousins either.

The Taliban did not just destroy these statues. They went into museums in Kabul and destroyed every Buddhist artifact they could find.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. But I don't think it really had much to do with Buddhists. It had to do with anti-western sentiments.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 9:50 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Dechen Norbu said:

What about those channels that pop through the eyes? We don't have any physical structure matching those.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, in fact we do. And those channels are very explicitly described, in detail, in the commentaries, as physical entities subject to growth, persistence, and decay. After 26 years of age, the 72000 nāḍīs decay at a regular rate.

The nāḍīs are held to be passageways. Passageways for what? Bindus, red bindus, white bindus, etc, which are moved around by vāyu (which just means air in Sanskrit). What do these bindus come from? Sixteen bindus come from our parents, eight red, and eight white. The rest comes from the food that we eat. Where do the five vāyus come from? The air we breath.

When we practice completion stage practices, as I said before, we visualize these channels as made of light, in bodies that we visualize as made of light. However, the

bindus that are contained within them are physical, no? I mean, otherwise, what is it in karmamudra that one is retaining, reversing, spreading, and distributing uniformly? Light? What is the bliss in the body one is feeling? Merely visualized bliss or is it physical bliss?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Some yogis do, some yogis don't.

When practicing yoga, they are visualized as light, but then, so is one's entire body. When diagnosing an illness, however, the very same channels are understood to be physical structures in the body.

There is an entire literature called *geg sel*, very little of which has been read by Westerners, which deal with yogic illnesses/problems and to remedy them.

Dechen Norbu said:

What about those channels that pop through the eyes? We don't have any physical structure matching those.

Crazywisdom said:

Right. The piths say there are channels from eyes going down side of neck into heart. Malcolm will say it's a physical nerve. But there is no such eye nerve going into the heart from sides of neck.

Malcolm wrote:

You just keep going on confusing yourselves and other people. You are misrepresenting not only the texts, but you are misrepresenting what I've said on the matter.

It's fine, but I am out. Be happy, hope your novel interpretations work out for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 10:26 PM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

So what's a white or a red bindu? Blood cells? Tantra didn't know what cells were.

Vajrasambhava said:

What Malcolm is explaining (tell me if i'm wrong) is that these things are material and physical. Beacuse in Vajrayana all the channels, winds and bindus are made of subtle matter. So, even if is subtle it's still matter.

Malcolm wrote:

There are only six dhātus in the realm of buddhadharma, earth, air, fire, water, space, and consciousness. Anything that is not consciousness or space is matter. And in some tantric systems (Kālacakra specifically), even space is composed of matter.

The body is composed of refined matter, which is processed out of the food that we eat.

It is impossible to understand these systems of yoga without understanding the medical perspective of the human body that was held by the authors of the tantras, etc. People who ignore this just wind up creating a strange goulash of their own fabrications, not grounded in any text, based on whatever opinion of day they are holding, as we see here. So as I said, I am out, this is not a serious place to discuss these issues or much of anything else connected with Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 8th, 2021 at 11:52 PM

Title: Re: Download the Kangyur and Tengyur

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Hi everyone,

Where can one download the Kangyur and Tengyur in Tibetan? There is a stupa being built in Argentina, and a Dharma friend asked where they could download these sacred texts and put them on a thumb drive for the stupa.

We live in the modern age!

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.tbrc.org/#!specials/selected/canon>

Magnetic storage is not very durable. Best if they download, print out, wrap them properly, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

Taikor.Taikun said:

To some Buddhists, they feel obligated to protect the Dharma, the monastery, the Sangha, every images n names of the Buddhas n Bodhisattvas.



Malcolm wrote:

Verbally assaulting people in public is just rude, and possibly illegal, no matter what one's reasons may be.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

karmadhatu said:

Hii,

Although I know that main reason of practising dharma is to attain ultimate state of buddha for benefit all beings, but dharma also providing relative benefits, so I am in state that somehow I am not able to find girlfriend, so my question is, how can I ask help from Tara to help me with this matter? Is it necessary to do whole sadhana and somewhere there to put my request of helping to find girlfriend? Or is it also ok just to imagine Tara, say some mantras, or to do 7 limb prayers, or? please some advices.

Thanks a lot

K

Malcolm wrote:

Be careful of what you ask for. You just might get it.

But no, Tāra is not going to help you find a girlfriend. Her job is to protect you from eight fears, but loneliness is not included among those eight. However, if you practice sincerely, and develop your positive qualities, you will likely attract a suitable partner with whom you can share the Dharma. Otherwise, frankly, as far as I am concerned, it is better to be alone than be with someone who does not practice the dharma, or at least have sincere faith in the dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 3:39 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Anti-Western is underselling it. These people want to convert the world by the sword. Anyone not with them is against them.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, they just want to be left alone in their medieval world. They've been invaded again and again, and the same thing happens every time: empires die, and they continue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 7:17 AM

Title: Re: I'm back

Content:

DGA said:

Hi Everyone,

I was pretty active at DharmaWheel for a long time, and then I wasn't for a couple years. But I think I'm back again? What am I doing?

I'm thankful DharmaWheel is here and I'm happy to be participating

Malcolm wrote:

That wears off...welcome back, I think?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Flu does not overwhelm hospitals.

Johnny Dangerous said:

It is you choosing to put them at greater risk of the virus, and greatly increasing the risk of them getting it, depending on behavior and circumstance. -You- are morally culpable for that, particularly if you are somewhere that people have to be - let's say a grocery store -, and you are walking around with no protection at all, yet insisting that you don't need to take any mitigation measures.

shoewy said:

Personally I am still undecided as to whether or not I am taking the vaccine or gene therapy depending on who you ask. I have a 'heart condition' and I simply find the evidence to be insufficient at this point regarding long term effects on the heart and overall impact. Of course the same could be said of Covid itself. To be honest I often find the confidence on both sides questionable. I have the good fortune to be able to do nearly everything I want to do from home so I am in a position to manage risk more than your average person.

However I would like to delve a little deeper into your statement regarding being 'morally culpable'. Firstly would you equate morally culpable to generating bad karma in this example? In my country we don't have to wear masks anymore, even in grocery stores, and practically nobody does. Everybody here has the option to get vaccinated and therefore if they wanted to they are 'protected' from the virus. You could make the same argument here that when I go grocery shopping without being vaccinated and without wearing a mask that there is a risk of spreading the disease so would I be morally

culpable in this case or generating bad karma?

Or would you view it differently in my case because of the social acceptance and consensus regarding mitigating measures and the fact that everybody has access to the vaccine? The latter seems to me to be of particular importance, also in relation to your remark regarding the subordination of their rights to your own.

I would also be interested to know where you draw the line if at all in comparison to the flu phenomenon. If you don't fair enough. If you do is it the nature of the virus itself whether it be mortality or morbidity or is it more concerning the second order effects? I am more so asking in relation to the current state of affairs and less so the period of the initial forced lockdowns due to icu's being overflowed and lack of understanding regarding the virus itself.

The herd immunity is a bit of a strange one for me. It's a virus with a very low mortality and the danger overwhelmingly pertains to specific vulnerable groups for which, at least in my country, there is now a vaccine available and basically everybody else who deems it necessary. You could argue that there remains a higher chance to contract the virus if one was to come in contact with someone that is unvaccinated and perhaps a very slight chance they would get subsequent complications from that but at that point we are dealing with percentages that are most likely equal if not less than a normal flu especially regarding mortality and morbidity so again where do you draw the line at that point?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 10:33 AM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

In Bokar Rinpoche's book on Tara ("Tara the Feminine Devine") he says that she's okay with worldly requests. Helping with those types of requests can lead a person to making more meaningful requests, such as for Dharma.

He also says that since we see life dualistically she looks like a deity to us. However since she sees things as non-duality she knows she's no different than our own mind.

I like that way of putting it.

Malcolm wrote:

Still not going to get this person a girlfriend.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Anti-Western is underselling it. These people want to convert the world by the sword. Anyone not with them is against them.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, they just want to be left alone in their medieval world. They've been invaded again and again, and the same thing happens every time: empires die, and they continue.

Queequeg said:

That sounds about right, actually.

So, how long before the Chinese give it a try?

Malcolm wrote:

Ten years.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Wait for Novavax or worst case take Sinopharm or one of the inactivated virus vaccines

Much much milder side effects for both as far as I've seen.

Adenovirus vectors seem worse than mRNA.

Malcolm wrote:

Had Pfizer, zero side effects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I think you'd be an idiot not to get the vaccine.

Malcolm wrote:

Seconded. The heart inflammation issue is a rare, and thankfully, very short term sequela of the mRNA vaccines.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 9:09 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

So, how long before the Chinese give it a try?

Malcolm wrote:

Ten years.

Queequeg said:

It will be part of their Belt and Road initiative.

Malcolm wrote:

Until the Taliban decides they are being ripped off by the Chinese, and that won't take long at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

In Bokar Rinpoche's book on Tara ("Tara the Feminine Devine") he says that she's okay with worldly requests. Helping with those types of requests can lead a person to making more meaningful requests, such as for Dharma.

He also says that since we see life dualistically she looks like a deity to us. However since she sees things as non-duality she knows she's no different than our own mind.

I like that way of putting it.

Malcolm wrote:

Still not going to get this person a girlfriend.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Oh ye of little faith.

Malcolm wrote:

Why would Tārā, she who protects from eight fears, ever wish the suffering of change upon anyone? In any case it is a misuse of the teachings. Falls under, "If one is attached to this life, one is not a dharma practitioner."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 10:48 PM

Title: Re: Bitcoin

Content:

cky said:

Try to step back from the "currency" idea for a moment and replace it with the concept of a simple asset or commodity, maybe like a piece of art, antiques, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Bitcoin is definitely an antique among crypto currencies.

cky said:

Needs to be backed by a nation state?

No. It's simply barter trade if you will, currency is exchanged for the right to move a certain amount of digital data from place A to place B. That's all.

Malcolm wrote:

So, you are saying that bitcoin, or cryptocurrencies need actual currencies in order to be of value. And those currencies maintain their value because of confidence the market has in central banks. Hence, cryptocurrencies do depend on the present system of fiat currency.

cky said:

No utility?

Try sending your aunt in South Africa a few dollars. See how long it takes. Now try it with Bitcoin.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, dude, paypal, xoom, western union, etc., all much easier and far more secure.

cky said:

Crash is coming?

People have been saying this since Bitcoin was at \$5. It's getting old. We're at \$40,000. Institutional investors are trading it. Young people put it into their investment portfolios. It's volatile for sure, but so far, long-term investment has paid off quite well.

Malcolm wrote:

Tulip Mania—single bulbs were being sold for the equivalent of 2.6 million dollars (3000 guilders) in today's money and more.

Sheep Mania—a single merino sheep in the US in 1807 cost \$23,221 in today's money (\$1000). By 1809, the price had crashed to ten percent of that number.

Some people made money, most people lost money—that is how it goes with speculative "investments."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 9th, 2021 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

Minobu said:

, "If one is attached to this life, one is not a dharma practitioner."

also how does one who is attached to this life ....do dharma practice then...

Malcolm wrote:

Reflect on the certainty of death and the uncertainty of when it will happen, and the recognition that at death one can take nothing other than Dharma practice into the next life. This way, the dharma actually becomes the dharma.

And no, Tāra is not going to find any one a girlfriend or a boyfriend. That's just ridiculous.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 2:54 AM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Why would Tārā, she who protects from eight fears, ever wish the suffering of change upon anyone? In any case it is a misuse of the teachings. Falls under, "If one is attached to this life, one is not a dharma practitioner."

xabir said:

Makes sense, but how should this be interpreted:

1.-27

This will dispel the heap of suffering

Inflicted by grahas, infectious diseases, and poisons,

Even in other beings.

If chanted twice, thrice, or seven times, 1.-28

Those who want children will come to have them,

Those who seek wealth will come to have that,

Each and every wish will be fulfilled,

And obstacles, entirely vanquished, will be no more.

1.-29

This completes the praise to the Blessed Tārā as spoken by the completely perfect Buddha.

Malcolm wrote:

As long as these aspirations are based on one's wish to practice dharma and support dharma, then no problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: I'm back

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: If you sincerely want to 'dive deep' into the Saṃdhinirmocana Sūtra

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

If you sincerely want to 'dive deep' into the Saṃdhinirmocana Sūtra I recommend these works by John Powers in this order...

Malcolm wrote:

Then one needs to read the new translation at 84000, where the translator shows the many cases where Powers made errors.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 5:31 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Josef said:

The channels are not physical in the sense of being a part of the gross anatomical structure of the body but they are "embodied" as light, and are the support for the development of our physical form.

Malcolm wrote:

Nah, they are actually just the nerves, arteries, blood vessels, lymphatic system, and other passageways of the body, spoken of in a concealed way in the tantras. "Light" is not a sixth element.

Jangchup Donden said:

So then what is light? Some combination of fire and air?

Malcolm wrote:

Ordinary light is a product of either combustion or chemical reaction (fire flies), etc.



When we practice a deity, we imagine that it is in the form of light, but this light is the light of consciousness. We use visualizations to manipulate our physical body to produce various results, to experience various kinds of bliss, overcome illnesses, and so on. Sentient beings are composed of six things: earth, water, fire, air, space, and consciousness. Apart from these six dhātus, there is nothing else out of which sentient being is formed. It's pretty simple.

When one becomes accustomed the Buddhist view of the elements as well as the formation of the body, then much speculation vanishes.

If someone holds that there are no physical correlates to nāḍīs, vāyus, and bindus, then they must admit such visualizations are entirely imaginary and have no basis in conventional reality and no effect on the body.

Not only does such an assertion harm the basis of Vajrayāna teachings in general, it harms Dzogchen teachings as well. People who maintain such a view and call their practice "mahāmudra" or "atiyoga" are just practicing sutrayāna śamatha and vipaśyanā, which of course have no profound methods connected with the body. It is a farce to then discuss the harm to the body maṇḍala which may be entailed by surgery, suicide, and so on, since such a maṇḍala will also be just an imaginary conceptual construct.

Certainly someone might decide that this presentation of the universe is medieval, does not correspond with scientific materialism and so on. That's perfectly fine. But then it does not make much sense for them to engage in the creation stage and completion stage, ganacakras to please imaginary ḍākinīs, tormā offerings to imaginary dharmapālas, and so on, nor to engage in the practice of caṇḍī yoga, karmamudra, and so on, much less trekcho and thogal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: What happens to the Mandala in case of heart transplantation?

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

I congratulated Malcolm for his way to write it down so clear and strong, that's all

Malcolm wrote:

Thank you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 9:55 AM

Title: Re: If you sincerely want to 'dive deep' into the Saṃdhinirmocana Sūtra

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

I am glad Googling 84000 got me to the reference!

As to "the many places Powers made errors", I would like to know wither the errors changes the outcome of his diverse arguments, [especially as regarding the 'pivot' or 'progressive' model of transformation], or if just his 'making errors' means he ought be taken out with the trash.

Malcolm wrote:

Some of the errors are substantive. I am not saying Powers' contribution isn't important. But all translations are subject to improvement. I've always said this. Also, Gregory Forgues' introduction is quite excellent and well written.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 8:29 PM

Title: Re: Help from Tara

Content:

karmadhatu said:

Hii dharma friends

thank you very much for all answers, I really appreciate it. Yes, my main point is to find girlfriend who is dharma practitioner and I really believe that this can improve my practise, and also her:-) But I also think that is better to be alone then to have girlfriend without interest about dharma. Yes, I think that Tara maybe not bring me a girlfriend directly:-) but she can make circumstances for finding her, she give blessing to find her more easy way then normal

So again thank much to all your answers

Malcolm wrote:

Well, then you will have to go to where the Buddhist girls are...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 8:38 PM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

Taikor.Taikun said:

To some Buddhists, they feel obligated to protect the Dharma, the monastery, the Sangha, every images and names of the Buddhas and Bodhisattvas.

Malcolm wrote:

Verbally assaulting people in public is just rude, and possibly illegal, no matter what one's reasons may be.

SilenceMonkey said:

Depends on the extent of the harm they've caused. If there is a cult leader brainwashing people and taking their money, I think behavior like hers would be warranted. Less than

that, some fake tulku going around cheating people out of their money may also justify such verbal abuse. Fake monks on the street asking for money peacefully... maybe not. But if anyone was going to talk sense into them, it might be people like our chinese lady here.

Malcolm wrote:

Where I come from, people have a right to dress however they like, for whatever reason. And it is still assault, and it is still unlawful behavior.

SilenceMonkey said:

Looking from another angle... If you wanted a fake monk or fake lama to stop deceiving people, how would you get them to stop? Would you stand there all day with them, holding a sign saying "Don't give him money. He's fake."? Wouldn't last very long...

Malcolm wrote:

The only thing one can do is pass laws against panhandling.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 10th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

But I do think the Dharma is as important to protect as Democracy.

And of course this begs the question... How much of a threat are panhandlers in Buddhist robes, really?

Malcolm wrote:

The only way to protect Dharma is to practice Dharma.

If panhandlers in Buddhist robes were really a threat to the Dharma, the Dharma would have vanished more than 2000 years ago. There have been imposter monks for as long as there has been a real Buddhist sangha.

No, far more dangerous to the Dharma than beggars wearing religious clothes panhandling in the streets are corrupt bhikṣus, whose only discipline is wearing robes without maintaining the vows they represent, while they collect money from naive devotees for their various monastery projects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring only to Western science. It certainly falsifiable in Vajrayāna. Do the

practice, get the result. Many people have done so, and reported they have attained the results. When people do not get results, they are practicing incorrectly.

fckw said:

That's a fair statement - in this case it's simply not accessible to Western science. As I said: The entire approach can rightfully be called "scientific" in its own way. As you express: Do the practice, get the results, see for yourself. However, it also means in reverse that the idea of bodies not decomposing à la tukdam must be put ad acta as fairy tales. (The corresponding science is still outstanding, though.) Tukdam, according to this logic, is ONLY and EXCLUSIVELY an "inner" phenomenon, whatever that may mean in detail.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no. There are recorded cases of practitioners like Sangye Tenzin, a Sakya Lama, who remained in Thukdam for 9 days:

<https://sakyagurudarjeeling.wordpress.com/rinpoches/people/>

And there are external signs when Thukdam is finished.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 1:19 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

That's a fair statement - in this case it's simply not accessible to Western science. As I said: The entire approach can rightfully be called "scientific" in its own way. As you express: Do the practice, get the results, see for yourself. However, it also means in reverse that the idea of bodies not decomposing à la tukdam must be put ad acta as fairy tales. (The corresponding science is still outstanding, though.) Tukdam, according to this logic, is ONLY and EXCLUSIVELY an "inner" phenomenon, whatever that may mean in detail.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no. There are recorded cases of practitioners like Sangye Tenzin, a Sakya Lama, who remained in Thukdam for 9 days:

<https://sakyagurudarjeeling.wordpress.com/rinpoches/people/>

And there are external signs when Thukdam is finished.

fckw said:

Did the standards applied by those observing tukdam's outer signs satisfy the standards commonly held by "Western" science? I have often heard such claims, but

never seen any reliable proof, as in nearly all cases those involved in the situation and making both observations and statements about the post-mortem state commonly cannot be called unbiased, given the usually shared history they have with the deceased person.

Malcolm wrote:

People have been observing thukdam for more than 2000 years in all Buddhist schools.

Anyway, from last year:

<https://www.tribuneindia.com/news/schools/tibetan-scholar-in-rare-meditative-state-after-death-128361>

fckw said:

On examination, it revealed the blood pressure of the body to be at 86, quite close to a living human, the CTA said.

Additionally, the suppleness of the skin, the apparently undecomposed state of the internal organs, the facial glow and warmth was noted under close examination.

It was supplemented by an examination of the neural activity of the brain of the deceased on July 28 and August 1 by a Taiwan University's psychology professor and his assistants who noted significant activity

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.buddhistdoor.net/news/tibetan-monk-shows-no-signs-of-decay-26-days-after-clinical-death>

fckw said:

The Central Tibetan Administration (CTA) reports that Geshe Tenpa Gyaltsen, a Buddhist scholar at Gaden Jangtse Monastery in southern India, who was declared dead some 26 days ago, has shown no signs of physical decay or decomposition. It is believed that the monk has entered a rare tantric meditative state known as thukdam (Tib: ཐུག་དམ་).

The thukdam state, which has been observed in a number of advanced tantric practitioners in recent years, is a meditative condition in which the individual's consciousness is believed to remain in the body despite and beyond physical death. This is believed to postpone the usual signs of decay. Tibetan Buddhist literature describes a glow on the face and warmth in the body of the deceased, making them appear to be alive.

The Tibetan term thukdam is a combination of “thuk,” meaning mind, and “dam,” referring to the meditative state of samadhi or concentration. As recently reported, scientific studies of this state are underway. Most recently in August, the Taiwan-based Tibetan Buddhist monk and scholar Geshe Jampa Gyatso entered the state. Thereafter his body was observed by scientists from Academia Sinica, the pre-eminent academic research institution in Taiwan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

By the way, there is a deeper reason why I keep asking these questions. This is quite a personal one, and has little to do with the subject of discussion. I have had the suspicion for quite a few years now that Vajrayana (as well as other ancient wisdom traditions from Asia) are subject to an insufficient differentiation of subjective and objective world phenomena. The two are not clearly distinguished.

Malcolm wrote:

That's because the distinction is ultimately quite arbitrary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 1:39 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

fckw said:

In ancient India a mantra was believed by many to be able to kill someone. Current post-modernists generally don't believe that.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, it happens, whether they believe it or not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: Achi Chokyi Drolma Yidam

Content:

fckw said:

And yet the same sadhana text exposes the same letters to all practitioners without the slightest individual adaptations!

So, who is then right: The teacher who provides individualized explanations, or the sadhana text that does not?

Malcolm wrote:

The teacher, of course.

fckw said:

Of course. But why then do people in this forum (including me) so much enjoy bashing

other teachers who have views diverging from the ones by one's own teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

Self-righteousness, attachment to views, sectarianism, and general affliction masking as "concern." We see it all the time.

fckw said:

I mean, shouldn't they know that every teacher simply provides individualized explanations according to his/her own view, and must be right according to your statement?

Malcolm wrote:

In Vajrayāna practice, there are four authorities, not only one: guru, scripture, intimate instruction, and experience. They must reinforce each other and not contradict each other.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 2:27 AM

Title: Re: Scientific study on brain activity of practitioners in tukdam

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So this seems like a strange study, because they are not actually claiming to find the state, what they are saying (seemingly) is that they accept the state already exists, and that this or that outcome of brain imaging, EEG etc. is a result of that state.

Malcolm wrote:

One of leads on the study was Daniel P. Brown, so it is not surprising at all. And, three of the others are at the Center for Mindfulness.

Poppy L.A. Schoenberg

University of Massachusetts Medical School, Center for Mindfulness, Department of Medicine, Division of Preventive and Behavioral Medicine, Shrewsbury, MA, USA

Andrea Ruf

University of Massachusetts Medical School, Center for Mindfulness, Department of Medicine, Division of Preventive and Behavioral Medicine, Shrewsbury, MA, USA

Judson A. Brewer

University of Massachusetts Medical School, Center for Mindfulness, Department of Medicine, Division of Preventive and Behavioral Medicine, Shrewsbury, MA, USA

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Is the marketing of Buddhism valid, or a result of tanha?

Content:

Heimdall said:

"Buddhists don't believe in God" (The devas? The Brahma realm? The Buddhas and Bodhisattvas themselves?)

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism rejects a creator god. They don't necessarily reject all "supernatural" creatures.

Heimdall said:

"Buddhists don't believe in good and evil" (Then why are some actions good karma and some actions bad karma? Also, would it be wrong to inhibit the Dharma?)

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhists accept karma and its results.

Heimdall said:

"The Buddha was just a man" (...I don't think this is correct at all)

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha was an extraordinary human being.

Heimdall said:

"The Buddha on his death bed told us to find the truth by ourselves; therefore, we shouldn't have to find a spiritual teacher, and we should be able to figure out the truth for ourselves" (Then why did the Buddhist disciples establish a Sangha, and teach that starting a schism in the Sangha is a "surefire" way to end up in the Hell realms - I think this is completely misunderstood)?

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, no. This is not true. It is true Buddha did not appoint an heir. He told his senior disciples that the dharma was to be their teacher. He clearly did not mean that we were to dispense with teachers after he departed.

Heimdall said:

"Buddhists don't believe in converting others, and imposing your views on others (But isn't the preaching of the Dharma an act of good karma, as is the same of converting others?)

Malcolm wrote:

Most Buddhists think that conversion is pointless. If you have developed the roots of virtue in past lives, this is shown by meeting the dharma in this life.



Heimdall said:

"Buddhism isn't a 'Faith-based religion' - in fact, it's an empirical, knowledge based religion that science supports" (Even though Faith in the Dharma is an act of good karma, and institutional science has different philosophical assumptions than Buddhism - so the two can't be completely compatible [i.e., science is logically positive / materialist, while Buddhism is not]).

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism is a religion, with nonfalsifiable beliefs, such as karma, rebirth, and so on.

Heimdall said:

"Buddhism isn't as sexually restrictive as Catholicism" (even though masturbation of all forms is seen as "sexual misconduct", the Dalai Llama (and many other historical Buddhist teachers) interpret this to mean all non pro-creative forms of sex, and I don't see how Tinder hookups aren't viewed as selfish, "tanha" actions - not to mention mere sex as a Buddhist monk is usually enough to get you defrocked).

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on the local culture.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Meido said:

I recognize this is not a dedicated Zen forum. But the custom in most that are is that TOS will forbid such discussion, and delete topics that cross that line.

Malcolm wrote:

Still looking for that cheat sheet...damn! got the soup all over my shirt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Fake monk called out, made to remove robes on streets of London

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

But I do think the Dharma is as important to protect as Democracy.

And of course this begs the question... How much of a threat are panhandlers in Buddhist robes, really?

Malcolm wrote:

The only way to protect Dharma is to practice Dharma.

SilenceMonkey said:

Well... that's clearly not true. There are many means of protecting the Dharma. Other than that, I would tend to agree with what you wrote.

Malcolm wrote:

It's clearly true. How can a person who does not practice the Dharma protect it? In any case, the Dharma, as a relative institution, is compounded and therefore impermanent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 7:58 PM

Title: Re: Anti-vaxx sentiment in western sanghas

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

You know what? This isn't even worth it, across the board. You and Malcolm are going to keep thinking that everyone who won't get vaccinated is basically worthless, unethical and dumb....

Malcolm wrote:

Unless they have valid medical reason for not getting vaccinated, they endangering the lives of both themselves and others. That is unethical, and it is dumb.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: I'm back

Content:

DGA said:

Anyway, that's a sample of life's rich pageant. That's what I've been doing with my life of late.

Malcolm wrote:

The three realms are impermanent;  
migrating beings' birth and death is equivalent to watching a show;  
a being's life is like a flash of lightening in the sky;  
passing by as swiftly as a mountain waterfall.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Texts that destroy ""scientific" materialism

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

It is directly knowable through being able to remember past lives and directly perceive the minds of others

Malcolm, thank you so much...it helps me a lot.

Is it possible to gain such abilities practicing Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and any other system of Buddhist meditation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 11th, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: Is the marketing of Buddhism valid, or a result of tanha?

Content:

Heimdall said:

I agree that Buddhism doesn't mandate proselytism like Islam or Christianity, but someone must've shared the Dharma and marketed it to convert the entire continent of Asia (it's not like the entire continent of Asia descends from India).

Malcolm wrote:

The adoption of Buddhism in Asian countries outside India proper was largely a result of royal decree, not proselytization of the masses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 6:07 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That's not what actually happened. The statues at Bamiyan were targeted because the UN was spending millions of dollars to restore them as UN cultural heritage monuments, and none of the money was being spent in the local communities.

ssmcnq said:

The incidents at Bodhgaya ? The incidents at Borobudur ? Nalanda? Maldives?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think the Taliban were involved in that. However, the incident in Bodhgaya, and elsewhere were prompted by the Myanmar regime's treatment of the Rohingya, right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddharma study

Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
before

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 9:41 PM  
Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddhism study  
Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:  
In this sense, I feel that 'rebirth' is a somewhat clumsy and misleading term

Malcolm wrote:  
Not at all, it is a translation of punarbhāva, "re-existence", literally speaking.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 10:02 PM  
Title: Re: Online Teaching Series/Courses  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
[https://onlinelearning.fpmt.org/index.php?lang=es\\_utf8](https://onlinelearning.fpmt.org/index.php?lang=es_utf8)

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 10:37 PM  
Title: Re: Achi Chokyi Drolma Yidam  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
<https://diginole.lib.fsu.edu/islandora/object/fsu%3A254364>

This paper contains an extensive discussion of Achi, including a translation of one of her important hagiographies, etc.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 10:51 PM  
Title: Re: Ultimate truth  
Content:  
Rick said:  
Anam Thubten (from The Fragrance of Emptiness ):

"Seeing the groundlessness of the relative truth is the ultimate truth."

In non-Shentong view, is that the ultimate ultimate truth? Or is there an ultimate

ultimate truth: nonduality, tathata, \_\_\_\_\_ ?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the absence of inherent existence of conventional entities is ultimate truth. That absence is nonduality, tathāta, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

Is that what Anam Thubten meant by groundlessness?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. As I understand it, he is a Gelukpa by training.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Meido said:

Even if one does not choose to rely upon them, though - and even if one ignores the fact that most of what is important in Zen practice is still largely transmitted orally...

Malcolm wrote:

Astus does not believe this, and thinks that reading things in books is sufficient.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 12th, 2021 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

narhwal90 said:

The day I am told I can't discuss what I please with whom I please is the last day I attend there.

Malcolm wrote:

You should never become a Vajrayāni.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Meido said:

Soto Zen also has such secret practice instructions transmitted orally and with kirigami, but these are not something to which lay practitioners will be privy.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, speaking, AFAIK, Western teachers are not directly privy yet to such things, which, as I understand from Matylda, are only to be found among the most senior lineage masters of the Soto school. I could be wrong, and she can correct me, but this is what I understood from her posts on the subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

His teachers were Nyingmas, as far as I know. Would that affect his meaning of 'groundlessness?'

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. And no, he was educated in the Geluk system, like most people who learn Dharma in Amdo, where Geluk is the dominant school. That has nothing to do with what tantric systems he practices or teaches. I have a friend who knows him quite well and lived with him for some years.

Even so, "groundless" means "without a basis," apratiṣṭhāna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddhism study

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

In this sense, I feel that 'rebirth' is a somewhat clumsy and misleading term

Malcolm wrote:

Not at all, it is a translation of punarbhāva, "re-existence", literally speaking.

PadmaVonSamba said:

But "re-existence" implies "existence" which makes the whole thing easy to be misunderstood.

What I mean by clumsy and misleading is that there needs to be better English language vocabulary to really grasp what is being suggested, otherwise it's very easy for someone to assume there is a truly existing being who then becomes another truly existing being.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's the point of the Buddhist presentation. We accept rebirth, but not rebirth of a soul, etc. We assert rebirth must be predicated on absence of inherent existence, and that it will not work otherwise.

The Indians did not have "better vocabulary" so the Buddhists just worked with what they had before them. Generally, Indians who accepted rebirth (and not all Indians did) assumed there was some essence or entity that went from one life to another. What we are dealing with here in the West is the Shirley McLaine version of reincarnation, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

frankie said:

There is something appealing and immediately accessible in his books and online teachings. They almost seem too easy and accessible, almost as if they are designed to cleverly slip by a cognitive process that would otherwise be designed to say' "Just hang on a minute there!"

Rick said:

My impression from two retreats I did with Anam Thubten a few years back:

He makes an effort to speak to the western mind: vocabulary, content, tone. (He often jokes around, gets his audience to relax with humor.) But when it comes to the basics, bodhicitta and rigpa and enlightenment, he's earnest and passionate. And afaik (hearsay), he has extensive training and skill as a formal dharma debater. He might be too loose and westernized for some, for people like me he's quite perfect.

Malcolm wrote:

I have no personal opinion about him nor do I know anything about him, other than what I related above. I never met him, but I hear he is a nice guy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 9:51 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

how can we ignore the plight of women in Afghanistan?

Malcolm wrote:

We shouldn't. Don't mistake my comment for apathy, it was an observation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddharma study

Content:

ddorje said:

Thanks to everyone who responded, very interesting.

To those who adopted or accepted the view of rebirth (re-existence as Malcolm pointed out) - what convinced you of this view?

Would you say that it was:

1. something you came to through the logic presented in the canon (e.g, all things emerging from a cause and the example of the light of a candle being the same but not identical) and wouldn't have accepted it without this presentation
2. something you accepted in a leap of faith/trust (after some reading and contemplation of course)
3. something that is a belief that enables the rest of the tradition you rest follow and respect
4. or something else entirely?

[I should say I'm asking this to understand how best to approach questions in the community about this topic that comes from a place of understanding. Appreciate your responses]

Malcolm wrote:

The materialist explanation of the origins of consciousness never made sense to me, even as a child.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Achi Chokyi Drolma Yidam

Content:

Danny said:

In a country of dharma practioners, why protect the dharma? From what?

Malcolm wrote:

Samaya breakers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 11:23 AM



Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddhharma study

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

We talk about the mind leaving one body and going to another, but this may be completely backwards. It's the body that comes and goes, isn't it? Perhaps the mind doesn't really go anywhere.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, it is the mind that goes. The body, after death, just remains (lus) and decomposes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 11:25 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the soluton to a koan

Content:

seeker242 said:

To assert that there is, is just incorrect.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently, Meido has a different idea than you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 11:27 AM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Except for kleśas, which according to hongaku are not truly real. That's the basic issue there.

Malcolm wrote:

Are they truly real in any Buddhist school, or are they just dependently arisen phenomena, and therefore, empty (i.e. not truly real)?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 12:14 PM

Title: Re: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Nemo said:

Now. Taliban have been very impressed with the economic development in areas of Xinjiang and want to bring that to Afghanistan.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, putting a million plus people in concentration camps is an excellent way to boost an economy...free labor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 12:17 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

seeker242 said:

It's not "my idea". It's the Kwan Um schools idea.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, he apparently has a different idea than your school. He is after all entitled to his feelings on the issue, whether or not you care.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddhharma study

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

We talk about the mind leaving one body and going to another, but this may be completely backwards. It's the body that comes and goes, isn't it? Perhaps the mind doesn't really go anywhere.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, it is the mind that goes. The body, after death, just remains (lus) and decomposes.

PadmaVonSamba said:

If it goes, it has a location.

Where is the mind located?

Malcolm wrote:

Heart cakra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Except for kleśas, which according to hongaku are not truly real. That's the basic issue there.

Malcolm wrote:

Are they truly real in any Buddhist school, or are they just dependently arisen phenomena, and therefore, empty (i.e. not truly real)?

Caoimhghín said:

"Real" IMO is a utility that the Buddhas use to teach. The utility corresponds with the condition of the sentient beings they teach. This is how Āryanāgārjuna is able to declare that all things are, are not, are and are not, and neither are nor are not, and then declare it "the teaching of the many Buddhas." Only the conventional is like this. Ultimately, no one is taught. Conventionally, sentient beings are taught in a rhetorical 84,000 ways. It is a violation of the integrated middle to insist that no one is taught and that the conventional is false. Similarly, it is a violation, or diminution, of the conventional to say that all sentient beings are Buddhas and that they've no need for a basis, a path, a result, etc. As I see things, it's a matter of basic confusion between the two truths.

Malcolm wrote:

You are avoiding the question. Are afflictions substantial entities that need to be removed or not? After, all, the Buddha also describes them as adventitious in the shravakayana as well. Certainly, it is dumb to say that one is a Buddha while under the influence of afflictions, but that's not being questioned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 8:41 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Astus does not believe this, and thinks that reading things in books is sufficient.

Astus said:

Danyuan greatly esteemed Yangshan, and said to him...

Malcolm wrote:

I don't see how these charming anecdotes relate to your previously stated position about the self sufficiency of autodidact Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Are they truly real in any Buddhist school, or are they just dependently arisen phenomena, and therefore, empty (i.e. not truly real)?

Caoimhghín said:

This is how Āryanāgārjuna is able to declare that all things are, are not, are and are not, and neither are nor are not, and then declare it "the teaching of the many Buddhas."

Queequeg said:

Does he actually say that? I believe Nagarjuna argues that none of those positions is tenable.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Nāgārjuna actual does say this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Nemo said:

Now. Taliban have been very impressed with the economic development in areas of Xinjiang and want to bring that to Afghanistan.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, putting a million plus people in concentration camps is an excellent way to boost an economy...free labor.

Nemo said:

Do you have any proof that is what is going on from a reliable third party?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. People I know in China.

Nemo said:

it's weird that none of the Muslim countries surrounding China think that happened.

Malcolm wrote:

What are you talking about? The Taliban in recent talks guaranteed the Chinese that they would not support Uighurs nor harbor them.

More importantly, follow the money.

Then there is this:

<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/11/16/world/asia/china-xinjiang-documents.html>

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/7/8/uighurs-timeline>

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/7/2/pakistan-imran-khan-china-uighurs>

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/7/8/uk-government-urged-to-hold-china-to-account-over-uighurs>

The Chinese did this to Tibetans as well, and are still interning Tibetans in concentration camps in large numbers.

<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-china-54260732>

<https://unpo.org/article/21403>

<https://www.news18.com/news/opinion/opinion-mass-internment-camps-forced-population-swap-is-tibet-the-next-xinjiang-3394826.html>

<https://www.smh.com.au/world/asia/china-forces-500-000-tibetans-into-labour-camps-20200922-p55xyk.html>

<http://www.asianews.it/news-en/Like-the-Uyghurs,-Tibetans-locked-up-in-re-education-camps-%28I%29-51131.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Are afflictions substantial entities that need to be removed or not?

Caoimhghín said:

Ultimate, there are neither sentient beings nor afflictions. Conventionally, there are sentient beings who suffer on account of afflictions. As for their being "substantial entities," that is not even necessarily true conventionally, nor is it even necessarily true of all Śrāvaka Buddhisms.

Malcolm wrote:

So, we are in agreement that afflictions are not substantial entities to be removed, and I assume from your answer that you agree they are adventitious, rather than innate.

Now then, is the luminosity of the mind innate or adventitious?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 13th, 2021 at 11:14 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

My understanding of the integrated middle is that these two contradictory truths are non-contradictory. Both are "true." Hongaku would have only one truth be true. It would have nirvāṇa be real and saṃsāra be false. I can comment more on this later.

Malcolm wrote:

Nāgārjuna does say:

"Since the Buddha has declared that nirvana alone is true,  
what wise person would not imagine the rest was not false?"

The two truths inseparable, but are only true for sentient beings. Buddhas do not see two truths, but only one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 12:11 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

boda said:

Sectarian bias, of course.

Malcolm wrote:

Total nonsense. And uncalled for.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddharma study

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

If it goes, it has a location.

Where is the mind located?

Malcolm wrote:

Heart cakra.

PadmaVonSamba said:  
So, the heart chakra moves?

Malcolm wrote:  
No, since it is part of the body.

You've taken the contemplative analysis of the mind over the cliff.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 5:44 AM  
Title: Re: Rebirth: A worldview accepted before or after Buddharma study  
Content:  
PadmaVonSamba said:  
Thank you. It's nice to have one's efforts recognized by a distinguished authority.

Malcolm wrote:  
I am just saying that this contemplative analysis is misapplied when it comes to practical things like explaining death, rebirth, and the bardo, etc.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 10:54 AM  
Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
I'm not all that familiar with it, but I understand in Yogacara there are Three Natures - Parikalpitasvabhava, Paratantrasvabhava, and Parinirvanasvabhava. The first two are false, not true. Only the third has reality, is true.

Malcolm wrote:  
That's not at all correct. The absence of the Imagined nature in the dependent nature is the perfected nature.

The dependent nature is both empty and not empty. This is the Yogacara idea of the middle way.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 11:13 AM  
Title: Re: What's the best-smelling / flavor of incense, and where do you buy from?  
Content:

TharpaChodron said:

Thank you for such a great guide to incense, I learned a lot. Must save for reference.

Malcolm wrote:

Everything is a matter of taste of course, but in my estimation, Mindroling #2 in the blue box is the best. It's made in Tibet. Can be bought from potalagate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 10:18 PM

Title: Re: Anuttara-samyak-sambodhi in Tendai

Content:

Queequeg said:

I'm not all that familiar with it, but I understand in Yogacara there are Three Natures - Parikalpitasvabhava, Paratantrasvabhava, and Parinispannasvabhava. The first two are false, not true. Only the third has reality, is true.

Malcolm wrote:

That's not at all correct. The absence of the Imagined nature in the dependent nature is the perfected nature.

The dependent nature is both empty and not empty. This is the Yogacara idea of the middle way.

Queequeg said:

Thank you. I need to understand that better. On the syllabus.

Malcolm wrote:

Madhyāntavibhāṅgakārikā and its bhaṣyaṃ, translated by D'Amato as Distinguishing the Middle, or as translated by the Dharmacakra Translation Committee, Middle Beyond Extremes.

The imagination of the unreal exists.

No duality exists in it.

Also that emptiness exists,

hence it is neither empty nor not empty.

That being so, everything is explained—

it is the middle way,

because of its existence, its nonexistence, and its existence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhūmis without knowing?

Content:

Fee said:



My question: According to your knowledge, is it possible for a bodhisattva to be on one of the higher bhūmis without knowing it himself?

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is not possible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 14th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

prsvrnc said:

So I guess I'm interested in how and why Mahayana Buddhism decided to incorporate Indra (Brahma, etc.) into their cosmology of the world and the various layers of interpretation there. It seems Mahayana Buddhism mentions them in passing but doesn't spend a lot of time discussing their importance or why they exist at all.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha interacted with devas, so they have been present from the start:

Inda, Soma, and Varuna,  
Bharadvaja, Pajapati,  
Candana, Kamasettha too,  
Kinnughandu, Nigahandu,

50. Panada, Opamanna too,  
Devasata and Matali,  
Cittasena and Gandhabba,  
Nala, Raja, Janesabha,

51. Satagira, Hemavata,  
Punnaka, Karatiya, Gula,  
Sivaka, Mucalinda too,  
Vessamitta, Yugandhara,

52. Gopala, Suppagedha too,  
Hiri, Netti, and Mandiya,  
Pañcalacanda, Alavaka,  
Pajjunna, Sumana, Sumukha, Dadamukkha,  
With these Serisakka.

"These are the Yakkhas, mighty Yakkhas, the commanders, the chief commanders to whom (the molested one) should inform, cry aloud and shout saying: 'This Yakkha is seizing me, takes possession of me, is harassing me, assailing me, is harming me, and harming me intensely, and this Yakkha would not let me go!'"

"This, Happy One, is the Atanata protection whereby monks and nuns, laymen and laywomen may live at ease, guarded, protected, and unharmed.

"Happy One, we now take our leave of you; for we have many duties to attend to (so said the four Great Kings)."

"Great Kings, it is time for your departure" (replied the Buddha).  
<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/dn/dn.32.0.piya.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 15th, 2021 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

Anam Thubten (from The Fragrance of Emptiness ):

"Prajnaparamita, or transcendent wisdom, is the nonconceptual understanding of the absolute."

1. If emptiness is the heart of ultimate truth, would prajnaparamita be the experiential realization of emptiness?

2. Does "understanding of the absolute" mean the same thing as "understanding of the ultimate truth?"

Malcolm wrote:

As for 1) yes. As for 2) the term don dam or paramārtha, is rendered in english as either "ultimate meaning" or "absolute meaning."

" In both cases it refers to emptiness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 15th, 2021 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

Is emptiness \*the\* definitive Madhyamaka teaching? Mahayana teaching, Vajrayana, Tantra? Buddhist teaching?

Is realizing emptiness the brassiest brass ring? (Anam Thubten used to speak of enlightenment as the brass ring.)

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. Yes. Yes. Yes. Yes. Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 15th, 2021 at 5:07 AM

Title: Re: Lungta where have all the prayer flags gone?

Content:

DGA said:

I'm noticing that there's less variety in Lungta than there used to be available for purchase here in the US, and they seem to go out of stock quicker.

Is there a bottom to this trend? What to expect moving forward?

Malcolm wrote:

Supply chain disruption.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 15th, 2021 at 9:46 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

frankie said:

We are still dharma pups in the west,

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. We are the vanguard, the bodhisattvas who chose birth in the border lands during the degenerate age.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 6:06 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

. It's now blatantly clear that the government in Kabul was nothing but a front for the US.

Malcolm wrote:

We have all known, since 2002, that this was never going to end well.

My support for our expedition there ended in 2002 when I heard we were using cluster bombs on civilians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 6:08 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

"Seeing the groundlessness of the relative truth is the ultimate truth."

Malcolm wrote:

Why should there be anything more?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 9:47 AM

Title: Re: Ultimate truth

Content:

Rick said:

"Seeing the groundlessness of the relative truth is the ultimate truth."

Malcolm wrote:

Why should there be anything more?

Rick said:

If that's all there is ... if the brass ring is to realize that brass rings are empty ... then the whole imputed edifice of meaning and value and worth comes tumbling down. The infrastructure vanishes, the ground beneath my feet. I'm in freefall. Unless you've got the danger gene (definitely not me!), what's to like about this?

Malcolm wrote:

It's called liberation. What's not to like about it?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 8:05 PM

Title: Re: What's the best-smelling / flavor of incense, and where do you buy from?

Content:

Queequeg said:

aloeswood - my preference.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you will like Agar 30 incense from Tibet. Its main ingredient is aloeswood, but has other herbs to balance it out. It is also a Tibetan Medical formula for excess vata. Can be ground and consumed as medicine.

Incense should be medicinally formulated. Its not just something to make your place smell better. There is a long ayurvedic tradition of inhaling smoke for lung health, etc. The origin of most incense in Buddhadharma derives from this tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: What's the best-smelling / flavor of incense, and where do you buy from?

Content:

Queequeg said:  
aloeswood - my preference.

Malcolm wrote:  
Then you will like Agar 30 incense from Tibet. Its main ingredient is aloeswood, but has other herbs to balance it out. It is also a Tibetan Medical formula for excess vata. Can be ground and consumed as medicine.

Incense should be medicinally formulated. Its not just something to make your place smell better. There is a long ayurvedic tradition of inhaling smoke for lung health, etc. The origin of most incense in Buddhadharma derives from this tradition.

Archie2009 said:  
A search only turns up Agar 31. Is that it?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 9:18 PM  
Title: Re: Jodo Wasan  
Content:  
Zhen Li said:

There are a few understandings of bodhicitta in Vajrayāna. On the one hand there is "relative bodhicitta" which is aspiring to attain awakening and engaging in bodhisattva behaviour to attain it. "Absolute bodhicitta," on the other hand, is closer to the understanding in Jōdo Shinshū, where it might be understood as a mind that cognises emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:  
These two kinds of bodhicitta are common Mahayana teachings. Relative bodhicitta in Vajrayana specifically refers to bindu, the yoga of which cause the realization of ultimate bodhicitta.

The rousing of bodhicitta is always a mind free of affliction, like a lotus that grows from muck, even in an afflicted person. How one rouses it is less of an issue than rousing it. Also, rousing bodhicitta in this life is taken as proof one has done so before. Unlike other vows, which expire at death, bodhicitta vows are only taken once. The afflicted state of an individual is of no consequence at all with respect to rousing of the two bodhicittas. After all, Shakyamuni Buddha first roused bodhicitta in hell.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 9:54 PM  
Title: Re: What's the best-smelling / flavor of incense, and where do you buy from?

Content:

Queequeg said:

aloeswood - my preference.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you will like Agar 30 incense from Tibet. Its main ingredient is aloeswood, but has other herbs to balance it out. It is also a Tibetan Medical formula for excess vata. Can be ground and consumed as medicine.

Incense should be medicinally formulated. Its not just something to make your place smell better. There is a long ayurvedic tradition of inhaling smoke for lung health, etc. The origin of most incense in Buddhadharma derives from this tradition.

Queequeg said:

Excess vata - maybe that's why I'm instinctually drawn to it. It does make me feel good.

Can you explain a little bit about the Agar 31 and how it works?

Malcolm wrote:

Agar in general is very heavy, it is also cold, which one might think is bad for vata, but it's heaviness is the key to counteracting the light quality of vajra. This incense uses three different types of agar, i.e lignum aloes. Generally Japanese incense only uses the aromatic variety.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Matylda said:

Moreover talking about koans-dokusan, even talking about ones own practice is considered to be serious breach of Jukai vows.

Astus said:

Which precept is it against?

Malcolm wrote:

It's clearly just against the rules in Japanese Zen, according to Matylda and Meido, etc. It is probably is considered idle speech.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 10:13 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Astus said:  
Which precept is it against?

Malcolm wrote:  
It's clearly just against the rules in Japanese Zen, according to Matylda and Meido, etc. It is probably is considered idle speech.

KeithA said:  
It's also considered bad form in Kwan Um to talk about kong an's passed, and generally speaking, no one talks about practice stuff when we are just chatting before or after practice in the real world. It's better for the op to discuss his questions with the teacher. But, I don't think the op's questions come anywhere near a precept violation, and certainly not to the level of being removed here in DW.

All this talk about Westerners and newcomers reminds of the discussions about "cradle Catholics" I hear sometimes. Round and round...

Malcolm wrote:  
I don't have a horse in this race. However, my first experiential exposure to Buddhism was a weekend at Daibosatsu Zendo when I was 16, in 1978.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 10:38 PM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:

Kim O'Hara said:  
I'm trying to think of any conflict between guerillas on their home ground and conventional forces far from theirs that ended well for the conventional forces. None come to mind.

Malcolm wrote:  
Occupation troops have no stake in a war when the purpose isn't total eradication or complete subjugation of an indigenous population and settlement. This has been obvious since Alexander's campaigns.

The US never intended to settle Vietnam, nor Afghanistan, nor Iraq (and no, the amount of oil never was a reason for us to go into Iraq, lining the pockets of defense contractors, on the other hand, definitely a reason. The largest concentration of wealth in the US, actually the world, is in Washington DC area).

The success of the Chinese campaign against Tibet, for example, is based on the fact that the CCP always intended to settle the Tibetan plateau with Han Chinese.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

PeterC said:

The US could then have declared victory and gone home, and would probably be safer than it is today, now that it's spent two decades creating a generation of new enemies.

Malcolm wrote:

Largely correct. But that wasn't our goal. Our stated goal was hunting down OBL. We were looking in the wrong country, actually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's clearly just against the rules in Japanese Zen, according to Matylda and Meido, etc. It is probably is considered idle speech.

Astus said:

In Japan they use the bodhisattva precepts of the Brahmajala Sutra. No idle speech included there.

Malcolm wrote:

I am quite sure that despite whatever literalism you would like to resort to, idle speech, one of the four verbal misconducts, is implicitly included.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 16th, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: what is the difference between mahayana and theravada and tibetan buddhism

Content:

haha said:

Mahayana has twofold divisions: Paramitayana and Mantrayana. The former is explained being based on the philosophy of the Sautrantikas, Yogacaras and Madhyamikas. And the latter is explained being based on the philosophy of the Yogacaras and Madhyamikas.

From another narrative, the Mahayana regards there is only one vehicle; ultimately, even sravaka (both gotras) also enters into Buddha vehicle. Somewhere Asanga quoted that even Sakyamuni Buddha (or any Buddha) dwelled many eons in Sravaka Nirvana and then ultimately entered into the Buddha vehicle.



Theravada is just a branch of Sravaka vehicles whereas Tibetan Buddhism is just a branch of Mahayana, especially the Vajrayana/Mantrayana; it has several sects (black hat, yellow hat, old one, etc.) lol

Malcolm wrote:  
"black hat"

You mean the Karma Kagyu?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 12:32 AM  
Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan  
Content:  
Matt J said:

The issue I've heard around it is that talking about it promotes conceptualization, i.e. "words and letters Zen."

Malcolm wrote:  
What is idle speech other than the physical expression of rampant conceptualization?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 1:20 AM  
Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan  
Content:  
Matt J said:

Idle speech has always struck me as purposeless or pointless speech. Here, we are talking about promoting wrong view, which seems more serious.

Malcolm wrote:  
Idle speech comes from wrong view.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 1:24 AM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Boy, it sure did us a lot of good once we found him and extra-judicially killed him.

Malcolm wrote:  
Since he willingly confessed to the crime, well, a trial was just not in the offing, no matter who would have been president. It was a performative action.

Did it do us any good? No. Does capital punishment ever do any good? No.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I wasn't terribly upset about his death personally, but it's just another example of American hypocrisy and disregard for the rule of law except where it suits our interests.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if OBL had managed to escape to America, he certainly would have been entitled to due process, etc., under the constitution (hence Gitmo, which is not part of the USA). However, *Zavyadas v. Davis*:

"It is well established that certain constitutional protections available to persons inside the United States are unavailable to aliens outside of our geographic borders. But once an alien enters the country, the legal circumstance changes, for the Due Process Clause applies to all 'persons' within the United States ..."

This is the legal theory under which OBL, Anwar al-Awlaki, and others have been killed by the United States, and will continue to be killed. They are not ignoring the rule of law. SCOTUS has decided that the law does not apply to noncitizens who run afoul of us, and hence complaints about "extra-judicial killings" fall on deaf ears.

Here is a rather long article on the subject of the rights of non-nationals, where I found the cited 2001 SCOTUS opinion.

<https://scholarship.law.georgetown.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1302&context=facpub>

One conclusion this professor reaches is:

With the exception of the bans on slavery and torture, most constitutional rights are not absolutes, but presumptive protections that may be overridden by compelling showings of governmental need and narrow tailoring.

I am quite certain that the government lawyers in the Bush, Obama, Trump, and now Biden administrations are using exactly this reasoning to kill foreign enemies summarily.

But he continues:

My claim is not that such categorical balancing is inappropriate, but that we should not cheat on the balance by drawing the line differently for non-nationals and citizens.

While the definition of most constitutional rights contains an implicit consequentialist balance, the balance should be struck equally for all - even if it might appear convenient or politically tempting to strike it differently for some.

Johnny Dangerous said:

There's that, as well as the larger picture which is a War or Terror that caused untold misery both at home and abroad.

Malcolm wrote:

We agree.

Johnny Dangerous said:

At least that part of the of the effort was spearheaded by that utter bastion of liberalism and peace, Barack Obama, making even grosser.

Malcolm wrote:

Obama is an expert in constitutional law. I am quite certain that his decision to kill OBL was predicated on the above SCOTUS decision.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Remember all that bull shit?

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. Vividly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 3:05 AM

Title: Re: what is the difference between mahayana and theravada and tibetan buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

"black hat"

You mean the Karma Kagyu?

haha said:

It is saying something in a humorous way: Gelug for yellow, Karma Kagyu for black, old one for Nyingma.

Malcolm wrote:

When some people say "black hat" they mean Bonpos.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 3:43 AM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Heimdall said:

"The dark pit", "the abyss", "the Dark Night of the Soul", etc.

What's the Buddhist answer

Malcolm wrote:

The concept does not exist in Buddhadharma. There is no god, so there is no spiritual crisis precipitated by wishing to unite with god.

Heimdall said:

I don't see the point of anything any more for myself - nothing will ever truly lead to satisfaction in any meaningful degree to me.

Malcolm wrote:

As Santideva states:

All suffering comes from working for only one's own happiness.

All happiness comes from working for the happiness of others.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 3:52 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

KeithA said:

It's also considered bad form in Kwan Um to talk about kong an's passed, and generally speaking, no one talks about practice stuff when we are just chatting before or after practice in the real world. It's better for the op to discuss his questions with the teacher. But, I don't think the op's questions come anywhere near a precept violation, and certainly not to the level of being removed here in DW.

All this talk about Westerners and newcomers reminds of the discussions about "cradle Catholics" I hear sometimes. Round and round...

Malcolm wrote:

I don't have a horse in this race. However, my first experiential exposure to Buddhism was a weekend at Daibosatsu Zendo when I was 16, in 1978.

KeithA said:

Zen doesn't seem to be good subject for forums.

Malcolm wrote:

Very little experiential dharma is. Forums are good for exploring general Buddhist concepts, but trying to discuss practice on open forums, well, not so much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

The President unquestionably has the authority to repeal previously-enacted Executive Orders, but EO 12,333 has never been repealed.

Malcolm wrote:

That we know of. There are PPD's, aka HSPD's, NSPD's, etc. They are generally secret and also have the force of law.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 5:59 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

With the exception of the bans on slavery and torture, most constitutional rights are not absolutes, but presumptive protections that may be overridden by compelling showings of governmental need and narrow tailoring.

I am quite certain that the government lawyers in the Bush, Obama, Trump, and now Biden administrations are using exactly this reasoning to kill foreign enemies summarily.

But he continues:

My claim is not that such categorical balancing is inappropriate, but that we should not cheat on the balance by drawing the line differently for non-nationals and citizens.

While the definition of most constitutional rights contains an implicit consequentialist balance, the balance should be struck equally for all - even if it might appear convenient or politically tempting to strike it differently for some.

Queequeg said:

They'd need to set up one of those secret courts, like they do with NSA applications for wire taps. Presumably, the judges would stop egregious murders in the name of national security, but would probably green light most applications.

Malcolm wrote:

Then there is this, which sets precedent and authorizes the President to:  
to use all necessary and appropriate force against those nations, organizations, or

persons he determines planned, authorized, committed, or aided the terrorist attacks that occurred on September 11, 2001, or harbored such organizations or persons, in order to prevent any future acts of international terrorism against the United States by such nations, organizations or persons.

<https://fas.org/sgp/crs/terror/R41809.pdf>

As such, combined with the 2001 SCOTUS decision concerning the question of whether noncitizens outside the US are entitled to due process, and the 2001 Authorization to Use Military Force (AUMF, P.L. 107- 40), its pretty clear that the US Government considers its decision to detain people in Guantanamo Bay and to kill people like OBL, etc., perfectly lawful. Also, this legitimizes as lawful, in the US Government's eyes, the covert action it took in Pakistan. Also, in the case of OBL's killing, members of Congress were alerted, and as police power rests in the hands of the legislature, as Congress signed off on it, which they did, from the US Government's point of view, all perfectly legal. So, while we can complain the US was not following the rule of law, it is pretty clear it thinks it did.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 7:43 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

the White House Office of Legal Counsel is staffed by very good lawyers, so they're very good at finding ways to tell the President yes. That's how we get torture memos.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 9:21 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

I think it was poor planning on Biden's part, not guts. They had ample time to plan and execute this exit. I'm not saying Trump would have handled it better, but I'm pretty sure everyone here would be blaming Trump for this unholy mess if he was president. It's Biden's administration's mistake, ultimately. And I voted for Biden. Maybe pointing fingers is futile, but hypocrisy is still hypocrisy.

Malcolm wrote:

Hypocrisy is the least of it. Poor planning. Decades of Bad foreign policy. The only way this changes is legislatively. And that is difficult.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Dating the Bamyān Diamond Sūtra ect...

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

Thanks. And I will track down that post by Osborn.

See: <http://hub.hku.hk/handle/10722/181019>

They will request your name and e-mail as an agreement to follow the rules.

Zhen Li said:

The abstract that is publically available there summarises the relevant argument quite well: While there are chiasmic structures in both the opening and closing chapter clusters, they also persist throughout the entire sūtra. So, they probably were composed at the same time. That being said, it is possible for such things to be inserted by a redactor into parts that were composed separately.

While many other scholars besides Conze had ur-sūtra theories, claiming that the original core was different parts of the sūtra, I think that most would agree that his claim about the first two chapters is too simplistic. But Conze also admits that the Vajracchedikā, for instance, is not based on any part of the Aṣṭa. A lot of the dhāraṇi and esoteric based Prajñāpāramitā stuff also is not based on the Aṣṭa. But the Heart Sūtra is based on portions of a longer version (25,000 if I recall correctly) which itself is based on the Aṣṭa. So, Conze was not claiming that all of Prajñā literature is based on the first two chapters of the Aṣṭa, but only a certain strand of it.

Malcolm wrote:

Round and round the theories go,  
Where they end no one can know...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 9:59 AM

Title: Re: Jodo Wasan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The rousing of bodhicitta is always a mind free of affliction, like a lotus that grows from muck, even in an afflicted person. How one rouses it is less of an issue than rousing it. ... The afflicted state of an individual is of no consequence at all with respect to rousing of the two bodhicittas.

Zhen Li said:

Yes, this is the point here. There is nothing about the deluded mind that can give rise to bodhicitta. While Shinjin carries with it other qualities besides bodhicitta, it is for this reason that it is said that with Shinjin "one attains nirvāṇa without severing afflictions."

Malcolm wrote:

You missed the point, bodhicitta (lotus) can only grow in a contaminated mind (muck).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 12:08 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

... Decades of Bad foreign policy...

Kim O'Hara said:

From the outside, it often looks as though this is fundamentally based on American Exceptionalism: that it's okay for the US to do stuff (like killing non-nationals, anywhere in the world) that it somehow isn't okay for other nations to do.

Is that how it appears to Americans? Some Americans, at least?

Malcolm wrote:

Our foreign policy in thus respect is founded on the Monroe Doctrine, the notion we have the right to interfere militarily anywhere in North America if it's in our interest to do so. We expanded our concept of this sphere of interest during the Spanish American war, and further extended it due to WWI and our 1918 Expedition to Siberia to confront The Red Army. Effectively, US foreign policy, initiated by an interest in securing our backyard, included the entire yard. I'd be very surprised if this changed anytime soon.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 12:21 PM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Freedom from suffering. Suffering does not mean "suffering" in the Buddhist paradigm as I'm using it (how one's will and mind reacts to phenomena), but the natural ordinary mental and physical responses to phenomena that naturally arise and need to be suppressed through work (which in of itself is the suffering of natural ordinary and mental physical phenomena)

PadmaVonSamba said:

If you look at externals for the source of happiness, you won't find anything that lasts.



Malcolm wrote:  
One won't find it inside either.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 12:49 PM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:  
PeterC said:

That said. The one thing that I think they did right is actually write down a legal framework for it, however much we disagree with that framework. That means it becomes open to review by legislators, potentially also courts, it can be debated, future administrations can revisit it and discuss whether it made sense, etc.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, that was part of my point. One can't just label my government lawless, they went to great pains to justify any actions under the patriot act and renewal of the AUMF as lawful. I don't agree with my government about this and have voted for years for the better of the two imperialist parties in the US, since the Greens here, etc., are largely even more incompetent than the people in charge now. At least Biden has attempted to restore some institutional memory, though why anyone would want to work in gvt. after the Trump shitshow is beyond me.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 1:16 PM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:

Kim O'Hara said:  
From the outside, it often looks as though this is fundamentally based on American Exceptionalism: that it's okay for the US to do stuff (like killing non-nationals, anywhere in the world) that it somehow isn't okay for other nations to do.

Is that how it appears to Americans? Some Americans, at least?

Malcolm wrote:  
Our foreign policy in thus respect is founded on the Monroe Doctrine, the notion we have the right to interfere militarily anywhere in North America if it's in our interest to do so. We expanded our concept of this sphere of interest during the Spanish American war, and further extended it due to WWI and our 1918 Expedition to Siberia to confront The Red Army. Effectively, US foreign policy, initiated by an interest in securing our backyard, included the entire yard. I'd be very surprised if this changed anytime soon.

PeterC said:  
The Philippines would probably date the expansion of the backyard to 1898 when the

US invaded and occupied their country in breach of various treaties it had signed. Nobody seems to care much about that story, though.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that was part of the Spanish American war.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Dating the Bamyán Diamond Sutra ect...

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Round and round the theories go,  
Where they end no one can know...

Zhen Li said:

Where it ends for a practitioner is to simply accept it as buddhavacana and that historical speculation is not part of the Buddhist path.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. We agree on this point. But people keep spinning out theories, engaging in endless proliferation, it's gotten to the point where Buddhology means studying the endless speculations of western scholars.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

This might not be a popular idea, but I don't think democracy is necessarily the most important element in a stable society. I would argue a powerful, self sustaining, self interested civil bureaucracy might be more critical. Look at India - there is no way that country should be able to hold together but for their love of bureaucracy.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, they inherited that from Britain. Before Britain, India was a collection of small, independent principalities, resembling pre-unification Italy and Germany. India was forged by British Empire.

We definitely lost our way in Afghanistan. This debacle will come to be known as Biden's Folly. While certain Il Douche got the ball rolling, Biden did not play this round of bocci well at all. People falling off of US planes...f&^k. That more or less tells the rest of the world what they can expect from the USA. I'd say that 2024 is more in play than it was a month ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

fckw said:

Huh? So who is Amithaba and why does the entire pure land school pray to him to be reborn in Dewachen? Of course you could split hairs and argue that people only do that in order to find perfect circumstances to practice, or that deities are supposed to be not inherently self-existing, or make any other such philosophical statement - but in applied daily life of Buddhists, how is that actually any different from relying on deities in a soteriological manner? The vast majority of Buddhists actually don't give a fig whether the deities to which they pray are as real or not as Hindu deities, only people in this forum do. And, while they might believe to be very representative of Buddhists around the globe, fact is: they aren't. Majority of Buddhists actually don't write or speak English, so you won't find them in this forum.

Malcolm wrote:

Amitābha is not a mundane deity. Amitābha is a buddha, a tathāgata. Arguably, one might suppose that Sukhavati is not really different than Vaikuntha in intent. Certainly the description of Vaikuntha in the Bhagavata Purana is arguably identical in many ways to the description of Sukhavati, apart from the presence of women:

Vishnu/Narayana resides in Vaikuntha with Lakshmi, the goddess of fortune, in palaces with crystal walls. The parks there shine like final liberation itself, and contain wish-fulfilling trees, which blossom all the year round. There are fragrant winds, and creepers dripping with honey near bodies of water. Cries of exotic birds mingle with the humming of bees, and magnificent flowers bloom everywhere. Devotees of Vishnu along with their beautiful wives travel in aerial vehicles made of jewels, emeralds and gold, but the beautiful smiling residents of this realm cannot distract the minds of the opposite sex, since everyone is absorbed in Krishna

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Vaikuntha>

These descriptions have their literary origin in the descriptions of the Persian gardens of Cyrus and Darius:

[https://www.gardenvisit.com/history\\_theory/library\\_online\\_ebooks/ml\\_gothein\\_history\\_garden\\_art\\_design/persian\\_gardens\\_cyrus\\_darius](https://www.gardenvisit.com/history_theory/library_online_ebooks/ml_gothein_history_garden_art_design/persian_gardens_cyrus_darius)

It is true what you say that most Buddhists in the world have naive faith, in that they are Buddhists principally for cultural reasons, focusing on merit accumulation for a better rebirth. But that's ok. It's a valid path as it is taught by the Buddha.

What Buddhists around the world do not expect, unlike Hindus, is that they will attain liberation by praying at their local wat, temple, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

I get everyone complaining about how this is going down. There is no orderly way to withdraw from a war with your tail between your legs and an enemy yelling yahoo and shooting their guns in the air as they roll into town. Of course there is going to be a panic and a rush for the doors. What was the alternative? Keep the bombing campaign going in the Kabul suburbs while asylum applications are being processed? Please.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no way two ways about it. Biden is messed up. Defense Secretary Austin in particular messed up. There are any number of ways this could have gone better. Desperate people falling to their deaths off of US transport planes onto the tarmac is just not a good look for "nation building."

What we did not do was build infrastructure, roads, etc. We spent 88 billion on training their army and police, and only 33 billion on infrastructure. Where do you think that money should have been spent? I know where we ought to have spent it. But as we all know, the war on terror was warped our sense of priorities. We spent years looking for terrorists around the world, only to find the most dangerous terrorists are in our own backyard, tweeking on Qanon meth.

American hegemony is preferable for many reasons to a Chinese hegemony. But we screwed up because we actually had no policy for administering Afghanistan other than the Neo-con, "Lets stay for a hundred years" as Bolton was stating this morning.

Queequeg said:

This is why I said it was brave of Biden to take this one for the team. It would have politically been easier to muddle through and keep the war going with a string of excuses for another decade. It would have just been putting this debacle off.

Malcolm wrote:

I think Biden was distracted. Understandable, but not acceptable. He may very well lose the next election because of this—and that is terrifying. There is an entire military that is pissed at him, who think their entire effort— dead, wounded, and all— was a complete waste of time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 11:47 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

PeterC said:

The U.S. military, at times joined by British forces, has been conducting air strikes on targets in Afghanistan for over a week as part of the administration's efforts to capture bin Laden and his associates.

Malcolm wrote:

This is where this adventure lost my support, as soon as this was made public in October, 2001.

PeterC said:

The United States dropped about 1,228 cluster bombs containing 248,056 bomblets between October 2001 and March 2002.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 17th, 2021 at 11:55 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Texts in the Gelug Tradition

Content:

Schopenhauer said:

What would you say are the most important texts in the Gelug tradition? Besides the works of Tsong-Kha-Pa.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on which angle you are sussing out.

Take a look at the Library of Tibetan Classics, that will give you some idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The United States dropped about 1,228 cluster bombs containing 248,056 bomblets between October 2001 and March 2002.

Tlalok said:

So crazy the Taliban came back.

Malcolm wrote:

They never left.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 7:46 AM

Title: Re: Astro(nomy/logy)

Content:

Danny said:

Actually it's astrology/cosmology from the fundamental tantra of manjushri.

36 houses on the celestial sphere - 12 are the most influential on the world, ruled by 27 stars.

It's all around page 156 - 159 in Kongtrul's  
Myriad Worlds.

What's interesting to me is that the stars named are all the same Arabic and Greek names we use today.

Would have been very nice if the stars named in the tantra could have been left original and cross referenced with the Arabic and Greek names. That would have been cool.

Hmm

Malcolm wrote:

Cornu's book has these cross referenced.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/17/us/politics/afghans-deaths-us-plane.html?smid=url-share>

No words.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Mitra-Sauwelios said:

Now of course, in Buddhism, there is no atman, but there is the clear light."

Malcolm wrote:

This is just the innate purity of the mind, i.e. its emptiness.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
the dharmakaya,

Malcolm wrote:  
This just the realization of that emptiness.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
Buddha-nature,

Malcolm wrote:  
Is just luminosity, the innate purity of the mind, which is its emptiness.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
the Ground.

Malcolm wrote:  
The basis [gzhi] just represents the emptiness one has not realized.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
The atman or Brahman of Hinduism is understood not to be a God—which would just be the self once more—, but the subtlest and "deepest" level of the mindstream—which is ultimately the cosmic process or the flux of phenomena—itself.

Malcolm wrote:  
This is rooted in Samkhya. Samkhya and Buddhadharma are not compatible. In Samkhya, the five elements are the final evolutes of prakṛti. In Buddhadharma, the five elements are not evolutes of one primordial substance. Further, there is no permanent knower in Buddhadharma.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 11:28 PM  
Title: Re: Music time  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, August 18th, 2021 at 11:32 PM  
Title: Re: Music time  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/17/us/politics/afghans-deaths-us-plane.html?smid=url-share>

No words.

Norwegian said:

After seeing this and the depressing clip of it happening, the first thing I come across afterwards is Lauren Boebert making jokes about the people falling into their deaths, and then, reading about Sean Hannity plugging MyPillow while talking about Kabul...

<https://www.mediamatters.org/sean-hannity/sean-hannity-plugs-my-pillow-americans-family-stuck-kabul>

...

Malcolm wrote:

At least the Afghani people are fighting back:

<https://www.nytimes.com/live/2021/08/18/world/taliban-afghanistan-news>

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/8/18/evacuations-from-kabul-speed-up-as-taliban-promises-peace-live>

The training wheels are off. It is now up the Afghan people to fight their own democracy and self-determination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: How to figure out the solution to a koan

Content:

Matylda said:

So if your people practice koans in their own unique way, what for they try to confront teachers of other traditions, who know nothing about it? And why to claim that they gave any recognition?

Malcolm wrote:

A classic example:

Dr. Mark Epstein recalls an encounter between Kalu Rinpoche and Korean Zen master Seung Sahn that took place twenty years ago at the home of a Harvard professor....Seung Sahn opened the debate, reaching into his gray robe and removing an orange. With classic Zen theatrics he held the orange toward his opponent's face and yelled: "What is it?!" The elderly lama just continued to finger his prayer beads. Seung Sahn tried again, holding out the orange and demanding to know: "What is it?!"... while



everyone waited for the old lama to manifest unfettered Mind, he remained silent. Finally, Kalu Rinpoche whispered to his translator. Then the translator said (to paraphrase) "Rinpoche wants to know," "What's the matter with this guy? Hasn't he ever seen an orange before?"

<https://tricycle.org/magazine/dumbfounded-dharma/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 4:58 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

fckw said:

Or did I misunderstand something here?

Malcolm wrote:

Pratyekabuddhas are not on the bodhisattva bhumis at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 6:53 AM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Mitra-Sauwelios said:

Malcolm, yes, I know the things I mentioned are just the innate purity of the mind, i.e. its emptiness. And I already thought things like the Ground (gzhi) were just upayas, as you seem to suggest. Still, that does mean it's the case that such things are often presented as a kind of substitute for atman or Brahman: Shentong, for example, claims that absolute reality is not empty of self-nature, only of other-nature;

Malcolm wrote:

The term "ground" is incorrect for gzhi (sthana), though it has gained wide usage. It's a hangover from Western philosophy.

As for gzhan stong, it's not exactly like that. But that is too complicated a discussion.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:

and Svatantrika claims that emptiness is not itself empty.

Malcolm wrote:

???

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 8:22 PM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
is in between Being and non-Being, namely a Becoming.

Malcolm wrote:  
Again incorrect, as this implies the third extreme. Nagarjuna also rejects “becoming,” just as he rejects “going” and so one.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 10:26 PM  
Title: Re: The Heart Sūtra as a Dhāraṇī - Silk  
Content:

Zhen Li said:  
I haven't had a chance to go through this yet, but perhaps to add a bit to the ongoing discussions on Prajñāparamitā here, there's a new article on the Heart Sūtra by Jonathan Silk.

[https://www.academia.edu/50907811/The\\_Heart\\_Sutra\\_as\\_dharani](https://www.academia.edu/50907811/The_Heart_Sutra_as_dharani)

Malcolm wrote:  
Nothing really new here, just another forensic analysis and a negation that Hōryūji manuscript is the oldest extant version of the Heart Sūtra.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 10:42 PM  
Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?  
Content:

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
is in between Being and non-Being, namely a Becoming.

Malcolm wrote:  
Again incorrect, as this implies the third extreme. Nagarjuna also rejects “becoming,” just as he rejects “going” and so one.

PadmaVonSamba said:  
I don't think ‘becoming’ in this sense means establishing, to become some thing, but rather, it refers to a sort of ongoing emergence.

Malcolm wrote:  
Which Nāgārjuna negates:

An existent does not arise from an existent.  
An existent does not arise from a nonexistent.  
A nonexistent does not arise from an existent.  
A nonexistent does not arise from a nonexistent.  
Where then, is there arising?

PadmaVonSamba said:

It's like the brief moment of transition in the morning, of becoming awake from being asleep.

Malcolm wrote:

Nāgārjuna would negate that under the same logic he negates going, becoming, and so on.

"Apart from have awakened or not awakened, there is no [present] awakening."

Actually, the idea of "becoming" is a Jain idea, which involves the notion that an entity can simultaneously exist and not exist. Nāgārjuna refutes this in the Sixty.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Suppose if you could stretch that brief moment out, into a continuous awakening, like a fountain that just keeps gushing water. I think what is being suggested is like that. Attainment isn't a finite or fixed state. It is, you might say, "infinitely happening".

Malcolm wrote:

Again, this is not a view found in the teachings of the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

tobes said:

They would be very sobering figures. I've heard a few of Wallace's teachings, and I like this about his approach. It's usually qualified by 'it is possible, but not for most of us.' One might call this 'not very inspiring,' but it is also \*irrefutably\* true.

Malcolm wrote:

Since we are discussing Dzogchen teachings here, what Wallace says is just not the case.

tobes said:

I think being grounded on where one is on the path (if indeed, one has even managed to accomplish entering one) and where one can realistically hope to go in one's lifetime (given one's punya and level of effort) is super important.

Malcolm wrote:

The promise of Vajrayāna teachings in general is liberation in this life, at the time of

death, in the bardo, or within seven to sixteen births.

The blanket promise of Dzogchen teachings is liberation in this life, at the time of death, in the bardo, or in a natural nirmanakāya buddhafiield, no exceptions, even if one cannot find time to practice much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 19th, 2021 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Matt J said:

Wallace has had some ideas that aren't always echoed by other teachers. For example, 24 hour samadhi for the first jhana, and mastering the jhanas as a prerequisite for Dzogchen.

Malcolm wrote:

Wallace has never properly studied Longchenpa. Had he done so, he would not be promulgating these ideas. But it does keep his retreats full.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

There seemed to be a lot of Gelugpas in the retreats that formed the basis for Wallace's Wisdom Experience restricted Dzogchen courses. When discussing Madhyamaka Wallace routinely turns to Tsongkhapa's interpretation (compatibility issues?).

Malcolm wrote:

That just fine.

Archie2009 said:

His Gelug background continuously shows, for example in repeatedly stressing achieving śamatha as a basis for recognising rigpa being acceptable to a particular Gelug lama he knows. "That ought to do it." As if I would value the judgement of a Gelug lama most of all in such matters. To me it felt like Dzogchen viewed through a Gelug lens sometimes. Please correct me if I'm wrong or being unfair.

Malcolm wrote:

There really isn't any difference between trekcho, kagyu/geluk mahamudra, khordey yermey, etc. Just differences in terminology and approach. But it is best not to mix them all up.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 2:38 AM  
Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
Important to notice, because Buddha said so is not a reason. Buddha said to check for yourself.

Malcolm wrote:  
Its a reason.

Crazywisdom said:  
"Excellent, Sariputta. Excellent. Those who have not known, seen, penetrated, realized, or attained it by means of discernment would have to take it on conviction in others that the faculty of conviction... persistence... mindfulness... concentration... discernment, when developed & pursued, gains a footing in the Deathless, has the Deathless as its goal & consummation;

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 9:37 AM  
Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?  
Content:

tobes said:  
Do you really believe that everyone who enters the Vajrayana or Dzogchen paths will be liberated in that lifetime?

If not, then Wallace is right.

Malcolm wrote:  
If liberation means, as it does, irreversible freedom from being under the power of afflictions at some point in one's life, then he is quite wrong.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 9:47 AM  
Title: Re: Choiceless awareness  
Content:

Rick said:

Happy to:

Choiceless awareness is posited in philosophy, psychology, and spirituality to be the state of unpremeditated, complete awareness of the present without preference, effort, or compulsion.

It's a quote from Wikipedia's article on choiceless awareness:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Choiceless\\_awareness](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Choiceless_awareness) and like most Wikipedia articles, it should be taken with a grain of salt. But I think it's quite good.

Key is the choiceless part. Often it only applies to the awareness itself. But Krishnamurti stipulated that everything in the process needed to be fully choiceless:

He did not offer any method to achieve such awareness; in his view application of technique cannot possibly evolve into, or result in, true choicelessness – just as unceasing application of effort leads to illusory effortlessness, in reality the action of habit. Additionally, in his opinion all methods introduce potential or actual conflict, generated by the practitioner's efforts to comply. According to this analysis, all practices towards achieving choiceless awareness have the opposite effect: they inhibit its action in the present by treating it as a future, premeditated result, and moreover one that is conditioned by the practitioner's implied or expressed expectations.

Is there any Buddhist practice that is similar to either of these two flavors of choiceless awareness?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing. Mental factors always arise with consciousness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Question about mindfulness in Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

dpcalder said:

Do Tibetans also believe in simply being mindfully aware of our activities throughout our daily lives, without passing positive or negative judgment on them, the way that Theravada Buddhists do?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

tobes said:

Do you really believe that everyone who enters the Vajrayana or Dzogchen paths will be liberated in that lifetime?

If not, then Wallace is right.

Malcolm wrote:

If liberation means, as it does, irreversible freedom from being under the power of afflictions at some point in one's life, then he is quite wrong.

While it's quite impossible for a high level bodhisattva not to know they are highly realized, it's entirely possible for a bodhisattva on the impure bhumis to be unaware that they are in fact on the bhumis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 10:05 AM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Mitra-Sauwelios said:

Yet surely Nagarjuna does not negate dependent arising. The question he asks is not a rhetorical question to which the answer is self-evidently "nowhere" (except perhaps in a paradoxical sense, "in no absolute location"). Instead, his point is precisely that what arises dependently is neither an existent nor a nonexistent (or both an existent and a nonexistent: conventional truth and ultimate truth, respectively).

Malcolm wrote:

To assert "becoming" is to assert a nonexistent becomes an existent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 7:05 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

While it's quite impossible for a high level bodhisattva not to know they are highly realized, it's entirely possible for a bodhisattva on the impure bhumis to be unaware that they are in fact on the bhumis.

prsvrnc said:

To be on the impure bhumis, the bodhisattva must have already had a direct cognition of emptiness. How could they not know that they've had that direct cognition?

Malcolm wrote:

They forget, because of rebirth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 20th, 2021 at 7:11 PM

Title: Re: How does one escape "the dark pit"?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

To assert "becoming" is to assert a nonexistent becomes an existent.

Mitra-Sauwelios said:  
No, that's just your faith in grammar talking.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nagarjuna:

Without relying on the relative, the ultimate will not be understood;  
Without realizing the ultimate, nirvana won't be obtained.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, August 21st, 2021 at 3:37 AM  
Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
Important to notice, because Buddha said so is not a reason. Buddha said to check for yourself.

Malcolm wrote:  
Its a reason.

Crazywisdom said:  
"Excellent, Sariputta. Excellent. Those who have not known, seen, penetrated, realized, or attained it by means of discernment would have to take it on conviction in others that the faculty of conviction... persistence... mindfulness... concentration... discernment, when developed & pursued, gains a footing in the Deathless, has the Deathless as its goal & consummation;  
Nonsequitur. Your quote does not follow from my response This quote is about nirvana not the existence of devas. Devas are only important as a teaching on karmic perception and conceptual samadhi. Seeing or believing in devas is not important for anything.

Malcolm wrote:  
The five abhijnas are included here, for example, the devacakshu.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, August 21st, 2021 at 10:55 PM  
Title: Re: Most Important Texts in the Kagyu Tradition  
Content:

Schopenhauer said:  
What would you say are the most important texts in the Kagyu tradition?

Malcolm wrote:



Uttaratantra  
Hevajra Tantra  
Jewel Ornament.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 22nd, 2021 at 2:38 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

I think the idea that there is a sort of broad, innate awareness which we lose when we narrowly choose 'this or that' is also expressed in the famous Zen writing:

Malcolm wrote:

Refusing to choose is a choice.

There is no awareness that is separate from the mind itself.

The mind always is involved with accepting and rejecting.

Thus, there is no such a thing as "choiceless awareness."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 22nd, 2021 at 6:38 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

Krishnamurti regarded thought as limited, and that to experience the unlimited, if it existed, something other than thought was called for. He called this intelligence and said that being choicelessly aware in the present moment might enable intelligence to manifest.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no kind of awareness intelligence that can be found outside the mental aggregate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 22nd, 2021 at 8:41 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The mind always is involved with accepting and rejecting.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Actually, it's not. You are in fact unconsciously aware of a lot more sensory stimuli than

you are consciously aware of, that also you have no positive or negative feelings about.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as “unconsciously aware.”

If you are unconscious you are unaware, and vice versa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 23rd, 2021 at 7:57 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

muni said:

awareness with choice sounds as grasping

Rick said:

That thought had occurred to me also. If awareness is taken to mean nondual awareness, then \*all\* awareness is choiceless. It's happening right now, effortlessly, all you need to do is ... be aware of it.

Does that sound about right to you?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as nondual awareness. Your definition proves my point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 23rd, 2021 at 8:30 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Nonsequitur. Your quote does not follow from my response This quote is about nirvana not the existence of devas. Devas are only important as a teaching on karmic perception and conceptual samadhi. Seeing or believing in devas is not important for anything.

Malcolm wrote:

The five abhijnas are included here, for example, the devacakshu.

Crazywisdom said:

Heresay isn't evidence. Seeing devas is meaningless.

Malcolm wrote:

There are three acceptable authorities in Buddhadharma: direct perception, inference, and testimony of reliable witnesses, such as the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 23rd, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Heresay isn't evidence. Seeing devas is meaningless.

Malcolm wrote:

There are three acceptable authorities in Buddhadharma: direct perception, inference, and testimony of reliable witnesses, such as the Buddha.

Crazywisdom said:

Sure. Who is the most recent witness of this Indra coming into position? Buddha? Then we will have to scrutinize if Buddha really said this. Overall, this fanciful talk does Buddhism no good.

Malcolm wrote:

So, instructing people to recognize the three deviations of bliss, clarity, and nonconceptuality to prevent birth in desire, form, and formless realms should just be ignored? We no longer accept birth realms other than the animal and human realm? What about rebirth itself? Is all this “fanciful talk”?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 23rd, 2021 at 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as nondual awareness.

Rick said:

If awareness is taken to mean a subject (awarer) and an object (awared), nondual awareness makes no sense.

If awareness is taken to mean no subject, no object, just awareness, nondual awareness would be the right term for it.

We all know subject/object awareness exists (conventionally), we experience it 10,000 times a day. As for whether subject/object-free 'pure' awareness exists, well, that's (way!) above my pay grade, though I'm sure Buddha said something definitive about it.

Malcolm wrote:

The term “awareness” itself implies a subject and an object. One cannot be aware of a nondual awareness, by definition, since it cannot be reflexively aware.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 23rd, 2021 at 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The term “awareness” itself implies a subject and an object. One cannot be aware of a nondual awareness, by definition, since it cannot be reflexively aware.

PadmaVonSamba said:

While that may be true, the subject/object dichotomy is not the same as the subject engaged in “choiceless awareness”.

It’s like, if someone hands me a lunch menu, yes there is a difference between me and the menu. But if I say, “oh bring me whatever—it doesn’t make any difference to me” this is like the meditator who simply observes. And at some point, the distinction between observer and that which is observed (subject and object) becomes moot. When choosing ceases, it ceases to be a cause. It is no longer a contributing factor supporting the subject/object duality.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just just a form of indifference. What’s profound about that? This not even shamatha, much less insight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is just just a form of indifference. What’s profound about that? This not even shamatha, much less insight.

PadmaVonSamba said:

So, how is not clinging to the three poisons not practicing indifference?

Malcolm wrote:

The three poisons are the cause of grasping, not objects of grasping.

Freedom from the three afflictions arises from recognizing how they are the direct cause of actions that result in suffering. One refrains from grasping objects of desire, for example, because one understands how that leads to the suffering of change. One

refrains from grasping objects of anger, understanding how that leads to the suffering of suffering, and one refrains from grasping objects of ignorance, because one understands how that leads to the suffering of pervasive formations.

PadmaVonSamba said:

How is generating compassion towards both friends and enemies not practicing indifference?

Malcolm wrote:

Indifference is often mistaken for equanimity, especially by beginners. An indifferent person will not generate compassion towards either friends or enemies. A bodhisattva may have equanimity, but they are never indifferent towards sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 1:44 AM

Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Tsering Gyurme said:

IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Malcolm wrote:

Every time you take any empowerment or initiation, you are making a promise to hold that deity as your yidam. Hence you can have hundreds, there is no limit.

The key of course is to practice all yidams in one yidam, all mantras in one mantra, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Danny said:

Indifference is not neutral, it's

Either lazy or non caring.

So to my stupid mind it carries negative intentions.

A non position.. is a position.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Indifference can mean that.

It also means not holding an opinion for or against.

Suppose a hungry stray cat shows up at your door, and you happen to have two cans of cat food. One is fish and the other is chicken. Out of a sense of caring, you want to feed the cat. Do you care which can you open? Probably not. You may be totally indifferent as far as which can is opened, as long as the cat is fed.

This shows that indifference itself has nothing to do with compassion. Indifference towards whether the cat starves or not is a different issue. Likewise, one can have awareness without picking and choosing, and still practice compassion.

Malcolm wrote:

Practicing compassion is a choice. So no, you cannot have awareness free of choices. You may not care whether you feed a cat tuna or chicken as long as it is fed, but that does not mean your action is "indifferent." The goal of feeding the cat is a choice, the food is secondary. And you do have to choose which can. The cat isn't going to choose for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It is sort of sticking out like a sore thumb nobody sees Indra or any other deva.

Malcolm wrote:

What makes you think that anyone other than those endowed with the devacaksu saw devas during the Buddha's day? And its well known devas don't generally hang out with humans. They only like humans with pure discipline. There is no much of that these days...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 8:32 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

First, here you are conflating compassion and awareness.

Malcolm wrote:

No.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Next, yes. One is primary, one is secondary. That's the point. They are not the same thing.

Last, I could easily tear the labels off the cans and not know which is which, making the fact of choosing a moot point, just as when one generates compassion to all beings

regardless of what label they have: human, animal, preta, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

That's fine, but it does not render one indifferent.

PadmaVonSamba said:

One can rest in awareness that is free of conceptualizations. No?

Malcolm wrote:

Depend on what one means by "free."

PadmaVonSamba said:

Since 'choosing' is a type of conceptual activity, then if one is resting in a non-conceptual state, one would not be engaged in a conceptual activity, such as 'choosing'.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people have this idea that "resting in a nonconceptual state" means a state of absence of thoughts. But this is a very incorrect idea. The mind is always with concepts. Its function is thinking. Since there can be no awareness in absence of a mind, it is clear that "resting in a nonconceptual state" does not mean being in a state with no conceptual activity. It means resting in state where one is not dominated by conceptual activity. It's not possible to stop conceptual activity. Go ahead, try. Get back to me on that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 5:38 PM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's not possible to stop conceptual activity. Go ahead, try. Get back to me on that.

PadmaVonSamba said:

to simply rest the mind without conceptualizing things? Sorry, but I don't find that too difficult. Just don't try too hard. I think a lot of people who meditate can do it.

Malcolm wrote:

Conceptualization is the natural function of the mind. The mind conceptualizes automatically. As long as one is breathing, one is conceptualizing. Whether one is resting the mind or not, the mind goes right on conceptualizing. "Resting the mind" does not mean "rest in a concept-free state." Because people think it does, they incorrectly meditate, resulting in birth as animals or unconscious devas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 5:39 PM

Title: Re: Atisha about Padmasambhava?

Content:

Viach said:

Has Atisha ever said anything about Padmasambhava? (I can't find it in any way)?

Malcolm wrote:

Not my knowledge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 5:41 PM

Title: Re: Xi's Gamble

Content:

RobertoKhorviano said:

First fully accept Tibet into China

Malcolm wrote:

The Tibetan people will never stand for this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It is sort of sticking out like a sore thumb nobody sees Indra or any other deva.

Malcolm wrote:

What makes you think that anyone other than those endowed with the devacaksu saw devas during the Buddha's day? And its well known devas don't generally hang out with humans. They only like humans with pure discipline. There is no much of that these days...

Crazywisdom said:

For all you know the verses about devas were just a rhetorical device for dramatic effect. And well known to whom? To guys who never saw a deva? This is more like how many angels can fit on the head of a pin.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, so for you it's all metaphor and poetry. So much for your criticisms of novel interpretations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 24th, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person



Content:

Crazywisdom said:

For all you know the verses about devas were just a rhetorical device for dramatic effect. And well known to whom? To guys who never saw a deva? This is more like how many angels can fit on the head of a pin.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, so for you it's all metaphor and poetry. So much for your criticisms of novel interpretations.

Seeker12 said:

Indeed, the modern habit of picking and choosing to fit our understanding.

Malcolm wrote:

One should not be too harsh with old CW. We all pick and choose. None of us accepts Mt. Meru, per se, though it is pretty clear that cosmology is based on a pan Indo-European+ idea of an axial mountain. In Buddhist epistemology, however, the category of the knowable includes hidden phenomena, which are not accessible to the ordinary perceptions of human beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

to simply rest the mind without conceptualizing things? Sorry, but I don't find that too difficult. Just don't try too hard. I think a lot of people who meditate can do it.

Malcolm wrote:

Conceptualization is the natural function of the mind. The mind conceptualizes automatically. As long as one is breathing, one is conceptualizing. Whether one is resting the mind or not, the mind goes right on conceptualizing. "Resting the mind" does not mean "rest in a concept-free state." Because people think it does, they incorrectly meditate, resulting in birth as animals or unconscious devas.

PadmaVonSamba said:

I think we are talking about two very different things.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no awareness apart from a mind that is aware. There is no skandha of

awareness, there is no āyatana of awareness, nor is there a dhātu of awareness. Awareness is a mental factor (caitta, sems byung) which accompanies a mind (citta, sems).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

That thought had occurred to me also. If awareness is taken to mean nondual awareness, then \*all\* awareness is choiceless. It's happening right now, effortlessly, all you need to do is ... be aware of it.

Does that sound about right to you?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as nondual awareness. Your definition proves my point.

Crazywisdom said:

Nondual awareness means not liking or disliking, not contriving self or other. It means freedom from extremes. This is fundamental Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Which skandha does "nondual awareness" belong to? "Self and other" is a knowledge obscuration, which even tenth stage bodhisattvas have.

Freedom from extremes means being free from reified notion of existence and nonexistence due to not understanding dependent origination. It does not mean rooting around like a dog or a pig in the garbage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

I think the idea that there is a sort of broad, innate awareness which we lose when we narrowly choose 'this or that' is also expressed in the famous Zen writing:

Malcolm wrote:

Refusing to choose is a choice.

There is no awareness that is separate from the mind itself.

The mind always is involved with accepting and rejecting.

Thus, there is no such a thing as "choiceless awareness."

Crazywisdom said:

From early suttas to Vajrayana pith instructions the one constant is to develop a mind free from acceptance and rejection. Do you deny this?

Malcolm wrote:

I think this principle is completely misunderstood. Why? We are also told from the early sutras on up through Vajrayāna teachings that we must accept this and reject that, for example, we must reject nonvirtue and accept virtue, and so on, develop the wisdom to know what to accept and what to reject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 1:09 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Also especially Kagyu said visions of deities and such are just effects in channels and they are just illusions.

Malcolm wrote:

Not especially Kagyu, this is common in all schools. The inner body gives rise to external appearances because there is a correlation between them. For example, it is held that bardo beings, pretas, hell beings, and devas do not see the sun or the moon because they lack the red and white bodhicittas since they are apparitionally born.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 2:02 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But in truth Buddha did not care two whits about the deva realms.

Malcolm wrote:

He certainly understood and taught that birth as a deva was a less than desirable outcome for Dharma practitioners. But he also understood that for some people, birth in deva realms was all they aspired to, so he taught the vehicle of humans and devas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Nondual awareness means not liking or disliking, not contriving self or other. It means freedom from extremes. This is fundamental Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Which skandha does "nondual awareness" belong to? "Self and other" is a knowledge obscuration, which even tenth stage bodhisattvas have.

Freedom from extremes means being free from reified notion of existence and nonexistence due to not understanding dependent origination. It does not mean rooting around like a dog or a pig in the garbage.

Crazywisdom said:

Self and other is dual. Without these nondual. Skandhas are dual.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, is one ever without the skandhas? Is there such a thing as a sentient beings that has no skandhas?

Even the Buddha had skandhas. So according to your logic, the Buddha was hopelessly caught in dualism.

The Buddha taught very clearly that freedom from existence and nonexistence, from proliferation of extremes, was his teaching of dependent origination. There really isn't any other kind of absence of duality in the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 8:07 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But in truth Buddha did not care two whits about the deva realms.

Malcolm wrote:

He certainly understood and taught that birth as a deva was a less than desirable outcome for Dharma practitioners. But he also understood that for some people, birth in deva realms was all they aspired to, so he taught the vehicle of humans and devas.

Crazywisdom said:

What matters is Buddha's lesson

Malcolm wrote:

Which depends on the inclination of the person being taught.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

haha said:

People do always cherry-picking in their logic, and forget the casual relation with their claim and assertion. Here I am being a devil advocate. According to so called Abhidharma, Caturmaharajakayikas reside on the Mt. Meru whereas the Thirty-three Gods are at the summit of Meru (it is related to Indra). If there is no hair of the turtle (Mt. Meru), sir, you are not buying the garment of turtle hair (Maharajakayikas and Indra's abode). If there is no Mt. Meru, where do those gods reside? (lol)

Malcolm wrote:

Meru is a transfiguration of the Tibetan plateau, with Jambudvipa, India, located to the south. Ptolemy mentions the Kurus quite independently of and 6 centuries prior to Vasubandhu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 8:50 PM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

And what you are saying is that 'going non-dual' is impossible to begin with. If that's the case, why do so many teachers and teachings emphasize it? Why is it taught that the nature of all phenomena is emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

All phenomena are the same in that they are ultimately empty, just as all fires are the same in that they are hot. But all phenomena are not the same, nor are all fires the same.

PadmaVonSamba said:

And once that emptiness is seen, then even what appears as dualistic phenomena have 'one taste'.

Malcolm wrote:

All fires are hot. All phenomena are empty.

PadmaVonSamba said:

The inseparability of samsara and Nirvana...

Malcolm wrote:

Samsara and nirvana are inseparable indeed, because when samsara is thoroughly understood, that is nirvana, to paraphrase Nāgārjuna.

PadmaVonSamba said:

It is interesting to me, however, that one argues the mind cannot conceive without duality (which by definition implies more than one object) and at the same time argue that the mind can only conceive one object at a time.

Malcolm wrote:

No, mind cannot be conceived without duality, because, relatively speaking, without an object and a sense organ, there will be no sense consciousness. Unless one wishes to assert that all phenomena are "mind-only," one must accept this dualistic state of affairs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, August 25th, 2021 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Anyway, 'choiceless awareness' is not the same thing as 'choosing to be unaware'.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a supportable concept in buddhadharma. It's just a term that makes some people feel wise when they utter it, even though it is basically meaningless in a Buddhist context.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

As Krishnamurti understood it (afaik) choiceless awareness is awareness of objects, as they happen to arise in consciousness: you hear a sound, stay with it (without thinking about it) for as long as the mind wants to stay with it, then you feel a breeze, then smell a pancake, and so on. That doesn't sound like shamatha without an object to me, but as it is no doubt obvious as the dickens, I'm no expert.

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhadharma, this is called "following objects" and "being distracted."

In stable śamatha combined with mindfulness, one registers sense objects as they arise, but one never follows them. In Dzogchen, one makes contact with all sense objects, but one does not follow them or drift along with them. That is how "one-pointedness" is defined in the latter system.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

What matters is Buddha's lesson

Malcolm wrote:

Which depends on the inclination of the person being taught.

Crazywisdom said:

It's also depends on two truths.

Malcolm wrote:

Which are inseparable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 1:24 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

Thanks, Malcolm. Assuming I understand what Krishnamurti meant, his notion was that by being choicelessly aware of objects and events in the present moment, choiceless 'right' action ensues.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no guarantee of this. Right action comes from śīla, discipline.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 1:58 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

It's almost as if Krishnamurti used the analytical language of nondual traditions, philosophers, and psychoanalysts ... but used it to point to things like a poet might point to things: vividly but vaguely. Just my take!

Malcolm wrote:

It's important differentiate epistemic nondualism with ontological nondualism. The former is recognition that dependent origination makes it impossible for one to adhere to views of permanence and annihilation, in other words, the middle way free from all extremes. The latter is the idea that there is only one thing without a second and that all diversity is a false perception of one thing. The latter view is not compatible with buddhadharma at all, including dzogchen. Dzogchen teachings directly negate the latter form of nondualism in many places, not to mention the other buddhist systems.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

Jiddu said o'er and o'er again: Any form of discipline, no matter how subtle, limits freedom.

Malcolm wrote:

Then he was an idiot. Without śīla, there is no samadhi, without samadhi, there is no prajñā.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: Indra is a position, not a person

Content:

Heimdall said:

Like seriously - what is there to be gained by such needless (emphasis on need less) antagonism? Nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

It's clearly for shits and giggles, with nothing better to do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Fee said:



But if, for example, one has realized all this, is born again and does not receive such training:

Has one then really "forgotten"? I can't even imagine that one can actually fall back into complete ignorance from such a stage.

Is this really possible? Or do I get something wrong?

Malcolm wrote:

These are qualities, not realizations. However, in each birth after attaining the path of seeing, it becomes easier and easier to meet the teachings and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 2:47 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Rick said:

From Commentaries on Living by Krishnamurti:

You use discipline, control, as a means to gain tranquillity, do you not? Discipline implies conformity to a pattern; you control in order to be this or that. Is not discipline, in its very nature, violence? It may give you pleasure to discipline yourself, but is not that very pleasure a form of resistance which only breeds further conflict? Is not the practice of discipline the cultivation of defence? And what is defended is always attacked. Does not discipline imply the suppression of what is in order to achieve a desired end?

Suppression, substitution and sublimation only increase effort and bring about further conflict. You may succeed in suppressing a disease, but it will continue to appear in different forms until it is eradicated. Discipline is the suppression, the overcoming of what is. Discipline is a form of violence; so through a 'wrong' means we hope to gain the 'right' end. Through resistance, how can there be the free, the true? Freedom is at the beginning, not at the end; the goal is the first step the means is the end. The first step must be free, and not the last. Discipline implies compulsion, subtle or brutal, outward or self-imposed; and where there is compulsion, there is fear. Fear, compulsion, is used as a means to an end, the end being love.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, he is an idiot. Śīla in Sanskrit means "to cool down." He was not a very-well educated man in matters of the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 7:37 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Well Tilopa said the conceptual keeping of precepts obscures the luminosity.

Malcolm wrote:

And Buddha Vajradhara stated that maintaining the three vows is the root of the path.

But I guess we all just have to be buddhas before we can walk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Does it suggest some grand consciousness and oneness that we are all tapped into?

Malcolm wrote:

Such an entity is strictly refuted in Buddhadharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, August 26th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Atisha about Padmasambhava?

Content:

Viach said:

On the way, Atisha did not understand who Padmasambhava was, or, on the contrary, understood very well who he was and therefore ignored him deliberately.

Malcolm wrote:

It is unlikely that Atisha was unaware of Padmasambhava. Atisha was at Samye and expressed astonishment at the number of Sanskrit Manuscripts held there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 1:06 AM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Does it suggest some grand consciousness and oneness that we are all tapped into?

Malcolm wrote:

Such an entity is strictly refuted in Buddhadharma.

Heimdall said:

Even apparently? (e.g., I apparently have a self, but in reality, there is no self)

Malcolm wrote:

Even apparently. A nominal self is admitted in Buddhadharma. But there is no teaching in Buddhism of a cosmic consciousness even nominally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 4:17 AM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Even apparently? (e.g., I apparently have a self, but in reality, there is no self)

Malcolm wrote:

Even apparently. A nominal self is admitted in Buddhadharma. But there is no teaching in Buddhism of a cosmic consciousness even nominally.

Jesse said:

The closest thing would be Vijnana.

Malcolm wrote:

One's consciousness is an appearance for oneself. A cosmic consciousness is not. Hence the former can be designated nominally, the latter cannot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 4:20 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhūmis without knowing?

Content:

Fee said:

But if, for example, one has realized all this, is born again and does not receive such training:

Has one then really "forgotten"? I can't even imagine that one can actually fall back into complete ignorance from such a stage.

Is this really possible? Or do I get something wrong?

Malcolm wrote:

These are qualities, not realizations. However, in each birth after attaining the path of seeing, it becomes easier and easier to meet the teachings and so on.

Fee said:

Thank you, that is helpful. And also a bit more positive, because as I understand your reply, nothing is actually really "lost", but a potential remains and makes understanding increasingly easier.

You will probably have noticed it already: I am not yet so firm and trained in these things. That's why I now ask another question, which probably seems stupid, but is actually meant seriously:

What exactly is the difference between qualities and realizations? I have now been

thinking about this a little longer and have also searched through various books, but I couldn't find anything.

For me, the two are very closely related. But this is more a feeling than actual knowledge. Therefore, I would be very interested in the difference.

Malcolm wrote:

Thew five paths, the paths of accumulation. application, seeing, cultivation, and no-more leaning are realizations.

The ten bhumis, which begin with the path of seeing, and are included on the path of cultivation, are measurements of progressive qualities due to cultivation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 4:43 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Lhasa said:

Recognition of the Nature of Mind is the realization of the path of Seeing?

Malcolm wrote:

No. Realizing the nature of the mind is the path of seeing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Lhasa said:

And what is the difference between Recognition and Realizing? If one has Recognized, then what?

Malcolm wrote:

Cultivation on the Vajrayana paths of accumulation and application. There is no such thing as introduction to the nature of the mind in sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Atisha about Padmasambhava?

Content:

Viach said:

It turns out that he deliberately ignored Padmamambhawa. But why?

Malcolm wrote:

How is it that you conclude he deliberately ignored Padmasambhava? He never mentions Darikapa either. Or Luipa, Virupa, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Jesse said:

If one can hallucinate singular selves, why can't they hallucinate a unified self?

Malcolm wrote:

A self nominally designated on the basis of the aggregates is quite different than a universal designated on nothing at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 9:57 PM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Matt J said:

Well, it's not based on nothing at all. They just assemble a different story based on the elements available.

Malcolm wrote:

An imputation of a self on the basis of the aggregates actually possesses a basis of imputation, something which is directly perceived, i.e. the aggregates.

Not so for a universal consciousness. What is its specific basis of imputation? The universe? Since that has never been directly perceived by anyone, how can it form a basis of imputation for a self? It is a mere imputation without a basis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 10:46 PM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Matt J said:

God is not posited as an object among objects, or as having parts, so this would be called a category error.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Matt J said:

Whether one's belief is adequately justified is another matter, but it is not invented whole cloth out of nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

From a Buddhist point of view, it is invented whole cloth, out of nothing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Matt J said:

Personally, I think all this "backwards in time" stuff is taking a metaphor literally.

Metaphorically, we compare time to physical objects, such as rivers or land.

Accordingly, we can move back and forth along a river or a piece of land, so why not with time?

But time is not like that at all, that is just a spatialized concept. The past is waiting somewhere in the multiverse like our backyard waiting to be discovered. If I were to reify time, I would say everything is always here all at once, and in constant flux. All connection with any sort of past (i.e. memory) occurs here and now.

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhadharma it is generally held that our perception of time is dependent upon outer objects.

"I would say everything is always here all at once..."

Such a view winds up with the same contradictions identified in Sāṃkhya. The Sarvāstivādin are so-named because they held that "all that exists," meaning that past, present, and future all exist simultaneously. Vasubandhu dispenses with the Sarvāstivādin theory in chapter 2 of the Kōśabhaṣyaṃ.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, August 27th, 2021 at 11:19 PM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhadharma it is generally held that our perception of time is dependent upon outer objects.

Matt J said:

I've never encountered an "outer object," only mind-based appearances. So...

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense, Bishop Berkeley. Appearances without apparent objects are, frankly, impossible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 12:00 AM

Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Inedible said:

Congratulations. When you are talking to the first one, that's the one. When you talk with the second one, that's the one.

Malcolm wrote:

One does not talk to yidams. They are methods for practice, not beings to interact with.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Matt J said:

BB's deconstruction of external objects was spot on. It was his affirmation of idealism that is problematic. Take it as a non-affirming negation.

Malcolm wrote:

You did not make a non-affirming negation.

Matt J said:

Or are you saying that inner and outer are established existents?

Malcolm wrote:

Where this exists, that exists. In other words, without contact, there can be no sensation, etc. You are suggesting that sense consciousnesses arise in absence of contact. Not even the yogacarins negate subject and object conventionally. In Madhyamaka, we just accept things as they appear to ordinary people. Ordinary people experience objects.

Matt J said:

Can show me a mind-independent object? A colorless, shapeless, odorless, tasteless, silent so-called matter underlying these appearances?

Malcolm wrote:

Without contact, no sensation—six and seven in the limbs of dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: What are the major literary work of the 17 Nalanda Masters and the major commentaries to their work?

Content:

Padmist said:

What are the most popular, major works of the 17 Nalanda Masters and the commentaries to their work?

Malcolm wrote:

<https://fpmt.org/mandala/archives/mandala-for-2012/july/the-seventeen-pandits-of-nalanda-monastery/>

<https://www.shambhala.com/the-seventeen-panditas/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 3:15 AM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Matt J said:

I'm with Mipham and Gendun Choephel on this one.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually you are not. It is not the case that either scholars asserts there are no outer objects. See below.

Mipham:

In reality, if we apply reasoning, then not only at an ultimate level, but also conventionally speaking, arising is never really observed. If production were observable and proven conventionally, then it would follow that conventionally true phenomena such as the aggregates and elements would become immune to ultimate analysis. It would also follow that ultimate or truly existent arising would not be refuted. Since Mipham here admits that aggregates and elements are conventionally true, he also admits that outer objects are conventionally true. The aggregate of matter, for example, includes the five sense organs and the five sense objects.

GC: There are those who fear that if vases, pillars, and so on were refuted through reasoning, everyone would come to espouse nihilistic views of nonexistence. Their worries are pointless. For in the case of ordinary, everyday beings who are looking at a vase in front of them, how is it possible that a nihilistic view regarding the vase to be utterly nonexistent could arise?



Here, GC admits there are other objects. How could be otherwise?

Matt J said:

Even if such an outlook did happen to arise in someone, he or she would directly cognize that the vase can still be seen and touched. Therefore, if a mind naturally arose that thinks, "The vase is appearing to me, but while appearing, it is utterly nonexistent," that is the Middle Way view known as "the two-fold collection of appearance and emptiness that cognizes how appearing phenomenon do not exist in the way they appear." How is that nihilism?

Malcolm wrote:

Here, GC also admits there are outer objects. How could it be otherwise? I never maintained that there were truly existent outer objects. I just stated that madhyamakas accept outer objects, as both of your citations show. It matters very little if we call them "clearly apparent nonexistents" as do Mipham and GC, following Gorampa, or "mere existents," following Tsongkhapa and his followers. The point is actually the same.

Matt J said:

"he or she would directly cognize that the vase can still be seen and touched."

Malcolm wrote:

Based on contact, there is sensation. Our sense of time, as Vasubandhu states, is based on objects. This is conventionally true.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 7:36 AM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Matt J said:

A "clearly apparent nonexistent" apart from, or external to mind is incoherent.

Malcolm wrote:

It depends on what one understands by the term.

The term is meant to unify the two truths, not support a mind-only presentation.

You should consult Gorampa's Differentiation of Views, where he disputes Tsongkhapa's claim that only the Prasangika Madhyamaka system supports external objects conventionally. Without Gorampa, there is no Mipham or Ganden Chopel, since they largely hew to his presentation of Madhyamaka in general.

And that is also clearly besides the point in this thread. The conventional buddhist position on time is that it depends on outer objects. Specifically it is measurable in units of moments of thought. No outer object, no thought, no time.

A real madhyamaka does not waste time disputing conventional truth. In conventional truth, there are outer objects, hence there is time, etc. We only dispute ultimate existence, not things like vases, pillars, chairs, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 8:55 AM

Title: Re: Faith & Reason

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I've been told that faith is a form of unawareness. However it is unawareness configured in such a way so as to most readily become enlightened awareness.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on what kind of faith one is referring to. Śraddha, dad pa, normally translated as faith, is a mental factor that brings clarity to the mind. I would not call that unawareness. However, there is blind faith, and that is a kind of ignorance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 8:55 PM

Title: Re: Faith & Reason

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Let's take the example faith in karma and reincarnation. Ordinary beings cannot directly know it to be true. That "not knowing" is unawareness by definition. However once buddhahood is realized, a being can then see the workings of karma, and faith in that doctrine is no longer an issue.

Malcolm wrote:

Incorrect. There are three sources of authority in Buddhadharma: direct perception, inference, and testimony of reliable witness. As for the latter, since we can trust the Buddha's teachings on the four truths of nobles, we can infer that his teachings on rebirth and karma are correct. Moreover, one does not even need to be an awakened person to have recall of past lives, meaning that anyone who develops sufficient samadhi can observe these things for themselves. Since many yogis and awakens people have indeed confirmed this, we can accept karma and rebirth as true on the basis of that authority. Thus testimony is considered a valid form of knowledge, and therefore, in this instance, faith is not a form of ignorance, but an informed belief. It is only materialists who believe the only valid form of knowledge is direct perception. You are not a materialist, are you?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Inedible said:

What use would you have for a tutelary deity you can't communicate with?

Josef said:

Tutelary deity is probably not the best translation of yidam. Yidam is more of a reference ones commitment to practicing that path, and in Vajrayana practice this primarily is through reliance on the manifestation of the deity. The idea of "tutelary" doesn't really correspond to the meaning of the word.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, pledged deity (yid dam lha, samadana devatā) is more accurate, though the term also translates iṣṭadevatā, chosen or favored deity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: So much Pain and Confusion.

Content:

ConfusedOne said:

I've come here for a bit of help. I've read these forums for a while and many of the members seem to be very knowledgeable; thank you

Malcolm wrote:

The cure for your situation is cultivating loving kindness and compassion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 9:51 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

3. did Kunzang Dechen Lingpa mostly practiced Dūdjom Tersar Tröma ? if not then what else? also, what kind of practices his own termas contain, if that is possible to say?

Malcolm wrote:

KDL's Termas have seven cycles in general: Guru Rinpoche Yizhin Gyalpo, Kunzang Thukthik (a standing form of Guru Rinpoche), Drollo, Troma, Dechen Karmo, Kurukulla, and Simhamukha. The main three roots are Guru Rinpoche Yizhin Gyalpo, Dechen Karmo (Yeshe Tsogyal) and Drollo. There are many other practices as well.

He also has an earth terma as well, called Tsasum Drildrup, three roots combined into one practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: So much Pain and Confusion.

Content:

ConfusedOne said:

I've come here for a bit of help. I've read these forums for a while and many of the members seem to be very knowledgeable; thank you

Malcolm wrote:

The cure for your situation is cultivating loving kindness and compassion.

ConfusedOne said:

TBH, that's the one really good thing I've taken away from Buddhism so far. I no longer see insects as insignificant creatures. Color on someone's skin seem not so different anymore. People's words seem to matter a lot less now. And finally, I feel so bad for these people with hundreds of millions of dollars yet never seem satisfy. They have enough to last them 10 life times yet keep chasing; every time the number increases there is that fleeting feeling of joy that is gained and people mistaken it for purpose, not realising that they've chased and will continue to do so for many more lives to come in the hopes of finding satisfaction.

Malcolm wrote:

A practitioner has to fly on two wings: emptiness, to cut attachment to existence; compassion, to cut attachment to nonexistence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, August 28th, 2021 at 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Has anyone tamed the ego in terms of mental health

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Dharma practice in particular (once a person is stable enough) I think leads to mental and emotional resilience on a deep level, which is actually more important than "taming" anything.

Malcolm wrote:

The term "taming" ('dul ba, damya) really refers to the process of obtaining the mental and emotional resilience on a deep level. When one has tamed one's afflictions, even if they are still present in the mind stream, one has reached the level of patience. Patience (bzod pa, kṣānti) is the quality of resilience you are referring to.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 12:47 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Well Tilopa said the conceptual keeping of precepts obscures the luminosity.

Malcolm wrote:

And Buddha Vajradhara stated that maintaining the three vows is the root of the path.

But I guess we all just have to be buddhas before we can walk.

Crazywisdom said:

Tilopa was a manifestation of Vajradhara. He talked about nonaction and no path to walk.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and he also talked about something to do and somewhere to go, hence his instructions on the six dharmas. He understood that not everyone was born a mahāsiddha. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 2:02 AM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Matt J said:

The error I think it is presuming that other spiritual practitioners are less intelligent, less discerning, less experience based, etc. than we are.

Malcolm wrote:

They may be more intelligent, more discerning, and have more experience (whatever that means), but outside of Buddhadharma, they don't have correct view. This is why the Buddha declared in many sūtras that outside of his dharma and vinaya, there were no stream entrants, etc., in other words, no awakened people.

Also, he excluded the possibility of pratyekabuddhas while his Dharma was present in the world. Of course, no one is binding you to accept this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 9:47 AM

Title: Re: can you reincarnate backwards in time?

Content:

Matt J said:

I don't know about that. There are plenty of teachings about how all appearances are mind, etc. What, if anything lies beyond those appearances is unknowable, and wouldn't really exist anyway.

Malcolm wrote:

Appearances (snang ba) are one thing. Apparent objects (yul snang) are another. The former is the basis for the latter. For example, water, amrita, pus and blood, and boiling metal are appearances; the liquid substance upon which these appearances are based is an apparent object.

However, I am not going to continue to discuss this because well, I have better things to do than try and disabuse people of their attachment to views. Especially since they live in the real world, and if their kid was hit by a car they would not be thinking, hmmm, this is just an appearance of my own mind, therefore, I have no one to sue but my own mind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Choiceless awareness

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

True. He taught the Six Dharmas for those of lesser intelligence.

Malcolm wrote:

That's the point. And it is very clear what the tantras say. For example, the Hevajra Tantra states:

The creation stage  
and the completion stage,  
the two stages in which to dwell evenly,  
are the dharma explained by Vajradhara.

There are many such citations in the tantras. Also Nāgārjuna states in the Five Stages:

Those wishing to practice the completion stage,  
should abide well in the creation stage.

The method is the gradual path  
said by the Buddha to be like a staircase.

So here, it is without dispute that Vajrayāna practice is a (comparatively) gradual path for those who do not attain awakening during the empowerment. It would be great if we were all like Saraha and Indrabhūti I, and attained awakening during the empowerment. But we aren't and we don't, and that's why we practice sādhanas, maintain samayas, and so on, the usual work of Vajrayānis. It is also recognized in Dzogchen teachings that most people cannot practice the direct Dzogchen path, as indicated by Mañjuśrīmitra,

and hence we practice the indirect path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But if you can provide a quote from a tantra that says no lama knows the level of students, I might believe you.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no citation from any tantra I know of that says a guru can do so. This idea is inferred from the notion that those on the bhumis can know the minds of others. But most gurus are not bodhisattvas on the bhumis, despite endless propaganda about tulkus and so on. In fact, the Vajrayāna system was taught so that ordinary people can transmit the teachings, and that is stated in the tantras. There are examples of this in the 84 Mahāsiddhas, for example, the tale of Śāntipa and Kotalipa. The former gave empowerment to the latter, and the latter attained mahamudra siddhi. To expressed his gratitude, Kotalipa flew through the air to visit Śāntipa, who did not recall him, but when confronted with Kotalipa's realization, Śāntipa requested teachings and attained mahamudra realization himself. A realized guru is not required by a student who has faith that their guru is a buddha. Most of us do not have this sincere faith, even though we brag about this and that teacher's realization constantly. This is why main reason why people do not realize the fruit of Vajrayāna teachings in one lifetime.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Your / "a" Buddhist interpretation of Jungian Synchronicities?

Content:

Matt J said:

Maybe those are provisional teachings for people who lack confidence in Buddhism or who feel insecure about their practice.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is a simple observation that only dependent origination is correct view, and that this is the unique teaching of the Buddha. We can always make excuses and object to this and that. But at the end of the day we have to shit or get off the pot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:27 AM

Title: Re: Faith & Reason

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

There are three sources of authority in Buddhadharma: direct perception, inference, and testimony of reliable witness.

"Testimony of reliable witness" means "taking something on faith" in common parlance.

Nice to see you supporting the validity of taking something on faith!

Malcolm wrote:

You have not been paying attention then. I have always maintained that there are three authorities in Buddhism, and have quoted the Eastern Gatehouse Sutta frequently to make this point. But this faith is a reasoned faith, and not a mere "accepting it because someone said something" faith.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 11:35 AM

Title: Re: The attainment in chan according to ten bhumis standard

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Wonderful. What stage was Linji on? Or Huangbo? Could Dogen manifest simultaneously in one million Buddha realms, or just ten thousand? Do you have a citation for that?

Malcolm wrote:

The point missed here is that bhumis do not refer to realizations, paths do. Bhumis are just measures of qualities.

In terms of awakened people, there is the path of seeing (first bhumi), and the path of cultivation (second through tenth). These two paths make up the ten bhumis. The path of no more learning is buddhahood.

The point is that when one has reached the path of seeing and entered the path of cultivation, buddhahood is inevitable, in some lifetime or another.

So, Dogen was pointing out something important. On the other hand, the realization of a buddha and that of a first stage bodhisattva are not really that different. They have realized the same emptiness. The difference is only the level of cultivation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

In the Manjugosha Vajra Song, Saraha says



"Just by hearing of mahamudra  
for one instant: Regardless of possessing or not possessing the vessel, One attains  
suchness in one life by a mere show of it."

Malcolm wrote:

If one is a so called chigcharwa. However, Zhigpo Dudtsi, a famous Dzogchen master,  
pointed out, "Apart from Saraha in India and Ling Repa (founder of the Drukpa lineage) in  
Tibet, I have not found a single sudden realizer even though I have searched far and  
wide."

Crazywisdom said:

That is, as Hevajra says,

"Unspoken by others, the co-emergence  
Cannot be found anywhere.  
Be it known that it is [found]  
By following the guru till the end,  
And your own merits."

Malcolm wrote:

This is a reference to the third empowerment. This citation is also slightly incorrect. It is  
missing "time," which refers to the third empowerment.

Crazywisdom said:

But everyone should be clear about what the intelligent can do.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, clearly we are not "intelligent."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But at the same time, and I think ChNN also said this, for a lama to give direct  
introduction, the rigpa'i tsal wang, that lama must have a realization of rigpa.

Malcolm wrote:

What CHNN actually said is that if a prospective teacher wants to give transmission of  
Dzogchen teachings and does not have confidence, then they should stick to giving  
empowerments of Dzogchen, including the rig pa'i rtsal dbang, in a formal, detailed way.

KDL said much the same thing to me personally, albeit slightly differently. He stated that  
if the guru has little realization or the student has little faith, then the transmissions  
should be done in an elaborate way, following ritual manuals in a detailed fashion. If on

the other hand the guru has realization or the student has great faith, then things can be done in a much simpler way.

Crazywisdom said:

Even in two stages a lama must have accumulated the mantras and pujas and there should be some signs.

Malcolm wrote:

The minimum requirement stated in the tantras is that one has done the approach retreat and the fire puja, i.e. by number.

Crazywisdom said:

I think the implication here is that you must be a guide to a place you know.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally speaking, this is sound. This is why we both agree beginners should, if possible, rely on lineage heads when seeking empowerments.

However, my point in a now deleted post is that there are students of various capacities, and ratcheting everything up to the level of mahasiddhas every time someone mentions the gradual path is counterproductive, just as when someone is talking about setting a table with silverware, immediately jumping to how the table does not exist because it is empty, etc. is also counterproductive.

You will certainly agree that there can be no mahāmudra realization without complete devotion to one's guru. Most people do not have that level of devotion, especially in the beginning, and usually only because of past life cultivation of the Vajrayāna path. Hence the reason we regularly make aspirations to encounter our guru in lifetime after lifetime. And, as we know, people usually overestimate their own level of competency.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Anyway this transmission was given to us several times over the course of many years. Clearly HH Drikung Chetsang and Garchen Rinpoche and the lamas they guide thought it was worth doing.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, I received this transmission from Garchen Rinpoche when he gave the Five Fold Mahamudra in Cambridge, MA, 2001.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, August 29th, 2021 at 10:20 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But at the same time, and I think ChNN also said this, for a lama to give direct introduction, the rigpa'i tsal wang, that lama must have a realization of rigpa.

Malcolm wrote:

What CHNN actually said is that if a prospective teacher wants to give transmission of Dzogchen teachings and does not have confidence, then they should stick to giving empowerments of Dzogchen, including the rig pa'i rtsal dbang, in a formal, detailed way.

KDL said much the same thing to me personally, albeit slightly differently. He stated that if the guru has little realization or the student has little faith, then the transmissions should be done in an elaborate way, following ritual manuals in a detailed fashion. If on the other hand the guru has realization or the student has great faith, then things can be done in a much simpler way.

Crazywisdom said:

Even in two stages a lama must have accumulated the mantras and pujas and there should be some signs.

Malcolm wrote:

The minimum requirement stated in the tantras is that one has done the approach retreat and the fire puja, i.e. by number.

Crazywisdom said:

What ChNN actually said was the two have try to be in the same state.

Malcolm wrote:

You do understand that ChNN said a lot of things at a lot of different times, right?

Crazywisdom said:

And yet if someone can sit tight lipped and open minded there are in Vajrayana and Dzogchen pith instructions and short anuyoga deity methods that open up the possibility for a swifter route than the major tantras.

Malcolm wrote:

Frankly, most of the puffery in various Vajrayāna systems is somewhat overblown, and meant primarily to rouse enthusiasm in potential students. Long sadhanas are for beginners.

Crazywisdom said:

Related with this thread Buddhism pith instructions do have something like choiceless awareness. Tilopa's Upadesha is many ways of instruction on that.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, here we will have to disagree. Tilopa's instructions are not instructions to remain in a passive state sans vipaśyanā. It is very clear when you examine Krishnamurti, that this is what he is advocating.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 30th, 2021 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Arnoud said:

I guess the question that remains is if Vipashyana is something where the mind is active or not as that seems the difference between your (Malcolm and CW) views?

Malcolm wrote:

The mind is always active. For example, Tilopa's dictum "Don't think" does not mean "Be an inanimate object." It means don't let oneself be ruled by or grasp onto concepts. That only works is if one has authentic vipaśyanā.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 30th, 2021 at 4:31 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Passing By said:

Speaking of yidam sadhana and Dzogchen.....Is there even any difference between divine pride, viewing everything as the display of the deity/mandala and trekcho?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the former is the creation stage, the latter is the completion stage without objects.

Ideally these are practiced in tandem, but beginners are generally encouraged to practice first one, then the other, from elaboration to nonelaboration. I've been at this for 30 years. I have met very few people, less than a handful, who are capable of practicing trekcho in absence of some support.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 30th, 2021 at 5:14 AM

Title: Re: All for what?

Content:

Justmeagain said:

We moved house recently. The stress was untenable. The inadequacy of the whole process in this country left me with no sleep, tense during the day, unable to sit as I was obsessed with finding somewhere for my family to live. It was without doubt an experience I will NEVER willingly partake of again. Renting for us from now on. We are now renting a beautiful a 200 year old farmhouse up in the hills in Somerset.

Why disappointed? Because all the years of sitting, the cold mornings, the retreats, the chanting and the study meant nothing. Because when I needed that inner resource to help me manage and cope it wasn't there. I reacted like someone who had never sat on a cushion in their life.

I struggle gather the inspiration to sit now.

Maybe I should have gone to church instead!!!

Probably misguided but there it is.

Malcolm wrote:

If you think you are a basket case now, imagine how homicidal you would be otherwise. Just a thought.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 30th, 2021 at 7:45 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But if you can provide a quote from a tantra that says no lama knows the level of students, I might believe you.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no citation from any tantra I know of that says a guru can do so. This idea is inferred from the notion that those on the bhumis can know the minds of others. But most gurus are not bodhisattvas on the bhumis, despite endless propaganda about tulkus and so on. In fact, the Vajrayāna system was taught so that ordinary people can transmit the teachings, and that is stated in the tantras. There are examples of this in the 84 Mahāsiddhas, for example, the tale of Śāntipa and Kotalipa. The former gave empowerment to the latter, and the latter attained mahamudra siddhi. To expressed his gratitude, Kotalipa flew through the air to visit Śāntipa, who did not recall him, but when confronted with Kotalipa's realization, Śāntipa requested teachings and attained mahamudra realization himself. A realized guru is not required by a student who has faith that their guru is a buddha. Most of us do not have this sincere faith, even though we brag about this and that teacher's realization constantly. This is why main reason why people do not realize the fruit of Vajrayāna teachings in one lifetime.

tobes said:

It's not fair/right to expect consistency across different threads, but it is striking how you argued so robustly against this very point on the bhumi/Alan Wallace thread.

Malcolm wrote:

Huh? Which point, there are several. Here to make this easier:

- a. There is no citation from any tantra I know of that says a guru can do so.
- b. A realized guru is not required by a student who has faith that their guru is a buddha.
- c. Most of us do not have this sincere faith, even though we brag about this and that teacher's realization constantly. This is the main reason why people do not realize the fruit of Vajrayāna teachings in one lifetime.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, August 30th, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Passing By said:

but you're not meant to be visualizing purelands all the time since it's referring to appearances/experiences in general.

Malcolm wrote:

In post-equipoise yogas, all appearances are the deity, all sound is mantra, all thoughts are gnosis. These are the three 'khyer so, the three attitudes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

So Dzogchen has Ekajati, Rahula and Dorje Legpa as its protectors.

Does Mahamudra have its own protectors?

Malcolm wrote:

Mahākāla and Mahākāli are the general protectors of secret mantra. All lineages practice these two protectors. Of all protectors, they are the most reliable, and are found in many tantras, both old and new.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

yagmort said:

do we even have undistorted lineages anymore? i got the impression whatever it was Tilopa has taught is no more. they used to practice yidam as development stage and 6 dharmas of Naropa for upper door and karmamudra for lower door as completion.. things have changed.. nothing stays the same in sansara

Malcolm wrote:

This is a difficult point in Tibetan Buddhism. The Sakyapas assert that there is no path of mahāmudra independent of the two stages, the Kagyupas do. The decision as to who is technically correct is above my pay grade. Both the Sakyapas and the Kagyus have produced many masters who realized mahāmudra. So, it is best to decide on a lineage, follow it, and not get involved in polemical disputes over these issues.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

conebeckham said:

In general, the Sarma schools practice their own traditional forms of Mahakala and Mahakali.

Malcolm wrote:

The iconography of which is entirely based on Nyingma tantras...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Lhasa said:

"Realization", as a word, has been so over used and misused. In the Buddhist context, what does it mean, are there synonyms? I'm trying to get past my hindu/new age imprints.

Malcolm wrote:

"Realization" (rtogs pa) means combining understanding (go ba) with experience (nyams myong).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

In the Kagyu context these are primordially inseparable.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the case in Vajrayāna in general. However, most people cannot practice these things in this way, hence Vajradhara recommended a gradual approach for us stupid, unintelligent people who need baby steps.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Not very prominent in Drikung Kagyu.

Malcolm wrote:

I received the lung for all the Drikung Dharmapālas many years ago (1991). Mahākāla was prominent in the texts translated for the Frederick, MD. Dharma Center by Khenchen Konchok Gyaltzen, where I imagine they are still in use today.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Mahākāla and Mahākāli are the general protectors of secret mantra. All lineages practice these two protectors. Of all protectors, they are the most reliable, and are found in many tantras, both old and new.

Crazywisdom said:

Not very prominent in Drikung Kagyu.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Yamantaka is in Garchen Drikung

Malcolm wrote:

Yidam, not dharmapāla.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 4:57 AM



Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Danny said:

Which one of the three Khorlo Demchok lineage do drikung practice?

The 64 ? Also please what yum position is vajradakini? Wrapped around or one leg planted?

Thanks

Crazywisdom said:

They have Vajravarahi also wrapping both legs held up by Chakrasamvara.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is the five-deity Ghantapāda Cakrasamvara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Not very prominent in Drikung Kagyu.

Malcolm wrote:

I received the lung for all the Drikung Dharmapālas many years ago (1991). Mahākāla was prominent in the texts translated for the Frederick, MD. Dharma Center by Khenchen Konchok Gyaltzen, where I imagine they are still in use today.

conebeckham said:

I would imagine Chakshipa, yes?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and crow headed Mahākāla etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 7:32 AM

Title: Re: Mahamudra Dharma Protectors

Content:

conebeckham said:

In general, the Sarma schools practice their own traditional forms of Mahakala and Mahakali.

Malcolm wrote:

The iconography of which is entirely based on Nyingma tantras...

conebeckham said:

Interesting. The Eight Chapter Tantra, 25 Chapter Tantra and 50 chapter Tantra were early translations? It's interesting, given that so many of these Mahakala forms are linked with various Sarma yidams.....Hevajra and GurGon, Demchok and ChakShipa, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

It is actually a tantra called the "mkha' 'gro me lce.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 7:39 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Ok get a topic going for that. What's the use of refuting Coemergent Mahamudra?

Malcolm wrote:

No one refutes the name. Everyone teaches a species of Connate Mahāmudra, including the Sakyapas.

It is the method that is under dispute, and whether the way things that are presented by some early Kagyu masters is the way things were actually presented by Indian masters.

If you are interested in such polemics you can read Sakya Pandita's Three Vows and Clarifying the Sage's Intent. His objections went unanswered by Kagyupas for nearly three centuries.

We really don't need to litigate this in this forum. It's above our pay grade. It's best left for Khenpos to argue about. It's what they get paid for.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 7:42 AM

Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

They have Vajravarahi also wrapping both legs held up by Chakrasamvara.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is the five-deity Ghantapāda Cakrasamvara.

Crazywisdom said:  
They are practicing as one Yab yum.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nevertheless, this descends from Ghantapāda, whether it is one, five, or the sixty-two deity body mandala version. There is also the simplified sahaja aka natural version, with one face and two arms.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 8:21 AM  
Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?  
Content:  
Danny said:  
I realized it's also the color of the faces,  
Not just the yum posture ..it's so complex

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 8:21 AM  
Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
They are practicing as one Yab yum.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nevertheless, this descends from Ghantapāda, whether it is one, five, or the sixty-two deity body mandala version. There is also the simplified sahaja aka natural version, with one face and two arms.

conebeckham said:  
Doesn't Ghantapada's system stem from Luipa's? (whose Samvara has the same "both legs up/wrapped around" iconography, BTW)...

I do understand that Drikung's sadhana is in the Ghantapada lineage.....

Malcolm wrote:  
Luipa's system emphasizes the creation stage; Kṛṣṇa's emphasizes the creation stage and completion stage in equal measure; Ghantapāda's system emphasizes the completion stage.

conebeckham said:  
whose Samvara has the same "both legs up/wrapped around" iconography, BTW

Malcolm wrote:  
True, there are mainly differences in the retinue depictions.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 9:24 PM  
Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?  
Content:  
Danny said:  
So I'm saying in order.. Luipa, then Ghantapāda's

Cuz at some point 3 really became two. Not three

Cuz there was a blending,  
...

It's not super clear

It's actually super fascinating.

Malcolm wrote:  
There three because Luipa wrote the first Cakrasamvara Sadhana, Ghantapada and Krishnacarya composed their own based on their own realization, but actually they are all in the same lineage.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 11:41 PM  
Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?  
Content:  
Danny said:  
So I'm saying in order.. Luipa, then Ghantapāda's

Cuz at some point 3 really became two. Not three

Cuz there was a blending,  
...

It's not super clear

It's actually super fascinating.

Malcolm wrote:

There three because Luipa wrote the first Cakrasamvara Sadhana, Ghantapada and Krishnacarya composed their own based on their own realization, but actually they are all in the same lineage.

Danny said:

Ok, sure but there's by my reckoning, 10 tantras on Heruka chakrasamvara?

Malcolm wrote:

There are several. According to the Naropa Guhya-anta tradition, there are five main tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, August 31st, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: IS it possible to have 2 yidams?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

They are practicing as one Yab yum.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, this descends from Ghantapāda, whether it is one, five, or the sixty-two deity body mandala version. There is also the simplified sahaja aka natural version, with one face and two arms.

tony\_montana said:

Hi, forgive me but I need to ask a kinda silly question: If a person receives the empowerment of the sahaja-Chakrasamvara (like in Drikung Kagyu and other Kagyu lineages) can this person also self-visualize as the 12-armed Chakrasamvara?

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure. Probably not. However Sahaja firms are for completion stage

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 1st, 2021 at 2:37 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Sarah Harding says in the introduction to "Creation and Completion" that when practicing Mahamudra your winds naturally go into the central channel, so it is not mentioned. But you can also do the same thing by drawing the winds into the central channels via the Yogas. So the Yogas are Completion Stage practice in their own right.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there are three inner empowerments, and there are completion stage practices

which correspond to each one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 1st, 2021 at 4:27 AM

Title: Re: Fiction with Buddhist influences

Content:

PeterC said:

Mishima's Sea of Fertility tetralogy. The ingredients are all Buddhist, although the story isn't really about the Dharma. It's heavy going and a little fascist in places (notably Running Horses), but it's an important work.

Malcolm wrote:

A little fascist? Mishima was a lunatic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 4:00 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa

Content:

tobes said:

Point C. i.e. the critique of Wallace was that he was being 'less than inspiring' for assuming that most people will not attain liberation on this life. Yet this is a very pragmatic, justified and fair assumption as you point out here (but not there).

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, he was being less than inspiring.

Here, I am pointing out the cause of lack of success in Vajrayāna practice (lack of devotion to one's guru as a buddha in fact), and for those who care to see it, the remedy (devotion to one's guru as a buddha in fact).

On the other hand, Nāgārjuna stated in the Pañcakrama:

When falling off of a mountain peak,  
some think they are not falling, even though they are falling  
When the beneficial instruction of the guru is received,  
some think they are not liberated, even though they are liberated.

So you see, I am pretty consistent, even across posts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 4:03 AM

Title: Re: Lama Lena Testimonies/Credentials

Content:

Matt J said:

Is it possible she is using kyerim in a broader way than people are used to?

Malcolm wrote:

Creation stage is creation stage. It has no broader meaning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 4:13 AM

Title: Re: Anam Thubten

Content:

clyde said:

But Anam Thubten has a sense of humor, something that is missing from the suttas,

Malcolm wrote:

Not if you know how to read them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 7:10 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

And that's a wrap.

Ten days from now will be the 20th anniversary of 9/11.

We need to turn inward. We've neglected too much domestically. The world out there will need to take care of itself and not expect the US's involvement, for good or bad.

Arnoud said:

I think most of the world agrees with that. And would have preferred that from the start.

Sādhaka said:

Ron Paul's been saying that for decades.

Malcolm wrote:

Libertarian-style isolationism is inadequate in every respect to issues we face in the modern world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 7:12 PM

Title: Re: Anam Thubten

Content:

clyde said:

But Anam Thubten has a sense of humor, something that is missing from the suttas,

Malcolm wrote:

Not if you know how to read them.

clyde said:

Perhaps, but nowhere, at least as far as I know and no search of the AccessToInsight website, does one find in the suttas “the Buddha laughed”.

Malcolm wrote:

You find many places where the Buddha smiles.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 7:26 PM

Title: Re: Kalachakra in Dzogchen Community

Content:

RobertoKhorviano said:

All the more reason to switch from long Kalachakra empowerments to much simpler Anu-Ati style way of the transmission (without discussing details here: like the Kalachakra empowerment used on Tenerife). This way giving empowerment would be less taxing for HHDL's human vehicle.

Malcolm wrote:

Gelukpas and Sakyapas won't accept theses kinds of empowerments as ripening empowerments, generally speaking.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Domestically, if the Dems can hold on at the mid-term,

Malcolm wrote:

Yesterday, SCOTUS may handed the midterms to the Dems.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 2nd, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Domestically, if the Dems can hold on at the mid-term,

Malcolm wrote:

Yesterday, SCOTUS may handed the midterms to the Dems.

Queequeg said:

The Texas abortion ruling? That law is crazy.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. That and Covid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Then on 226 of same book there's a quote from Lord Jigten Sumgon that says the culminating devotion is not providing service for a long time or making great offerings, it's seeing the guru as Dharmakaya.

Malcolm wrote:

And Virupa asserts that by serving the guru one can attain mahāmudra without meditating at all, if one is of the highest capacity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: Minnesota Teen Prepares for Life as a Reincarnated Lama

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

It seems puberty is usually what derails western tulkus. Celibacy is a hard sell for a male teenager that has had access to porn.

Malcolm wrote:

It derails a lot of Tibetan tulkus as well. Porn is everywhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: Anam Thubten

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You find many places where the Buddha smiles.

clyde said:

Yes, the Buddha smiles (It's a significant event in the Zen tradition.), but nowhere is it recorded that he laughs or that he causes others to laugh.

heart said:

Probably because the people who wrote it down, centuries after it happened, lacked a sense of humor.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

One of the listed qualities of arhats is that they do not laugh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 2:35 AM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

Täpa said:

It claims the bowls are used for over 2500 years by monks.

Malcolm wrote:

It is, frankly, a fraudulent claim. One has to question the ethics of the folks who make this shit up.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Then on 226 of same book there's a quote from Lord Jigten Sumgon that says the culminating devotion is not providing service for a long time or making great offerings,

it's seeing the guru as Dharmakaya.

Malcolm wrote:

And Virupa asserts that by serving the guru one can attain mahāmudra without meditating at all, if one is of the highest capacity.

Crazywisdom said:

That also seems to be what Dzogchen tantras say, it comes by way of apt descriptions. It seems all these pith instructions are in agreement.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 4:16 AM

Title: Re: purity

Content:

DGA said:

I'm reading Drung, Deu, and Bon. In the translated excerpts in that text, I see frequent reference to or appeal to purity. The "pure race." the pure teachings.

What is translated as "pure" in this context, and what is meant by it?

thank you

Malcolm wrote:

Page number, chapter, thanks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 4:16 AM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It is, frankly, a fraudulent claim. One has to question ethics of the folks who make this shit up.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Not the only fraudulent claim on that website

Täpa said:

Thank you all for the fast replies. I know Bon is frequently accused of plagiarism and things like that by other Tibetan schools. And now again they might dig their own grave

with this? It might be a silly 'mistake' if this really is nonsense.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just an appeal to people with new age tendencies. You may notice that Bonpos do not teach their serious curriculum of Madhyamaka, Abhidharma, etc. These texts, though borrowing from Buddhist texts, are not simply copies of Buddhist texts as commonly thought.

The modern Bonpos focus on rituals, and so on, things that have marketing appeal to a certain kind of Westerner. As far as I know, aside from singing bowls, with is complete and utter nonsense, virtually everything else one sees these geshe teach is sourced in authentic Bon traditions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 4:19 AM

Title: Re: Anam Thubten

Content:

heart said:

I believe you, but the Buddha wasn't an arhat.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, actually he was.

Tathāgata arhat samyak sambuddha is his common title.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Future of Tibetan Tantric Buddhism

Content:

Chenrezig said:

The future of Tibetan Tantric Buddhism is not diminished in any way over 70 years but instead gained the world attention becoming the most important faith in the world.

Malcolm wrote:

This is somewhat overblown.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 5:58 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

conebeckham said:

It's one interpretation, I suppose, but the point is that uncontrived devotion is an overwhelming state of mind, but one which is very lucid and direct, which serves to focus--and in the proper circumstances, instructions will "take"--the student will have an experiential glimpse, a direct glimpse, without conceptualization. Frankly, the whole point of Tummo is also to create a similar state of mind, an overwhelming but lucid mind of bliss, to achieve the same purpose.

Crazywisdom said:

Honestly I don't know what overwhelming has to do with anything. Tummo of bliss is an example wisdom. The point of devotion as a path is direct perception, which comes from pith instructions. It's not the same at all. So have to disagree.

conebeckham said:

Both an experience of extreme devotion,

Malcolm wrote:

Aka Mos gus pa'i rtsal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 7:49 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Domestically, if the Dems can hold on at the mid-term,

Malcolm wrote:

Yesterday, SCOTUS may handed the midterms to the Dems.

PeterC said:

You mean Texas? It's going to help, but may not be enough.

It's also quite possibly the right decision. The really insidious thing about the Texas taliban's law is that it turns the whole of the population into the enforcers. It creates a cause of action for any citizen against any doctor or patient. That's socially pretty horrible, but it's also quite clever, because that makes it a lot harder for SCOTUS to review before there is an actual case.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a patently illegal law.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 7:51 AM

Title: Re: Anam Thubten

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, actually he was.

Tathāgata arhat samyaksambuddha is his common title.

heart said:

arhat = buddha?

SilenceMonkey said:

\* namo tassa bhagavato arahato samma sambuddhassa \*

Arahant is one of the praises of Lord Buddha Shakyamuni ~ You'll find it in a number of sutras, as well as general praises of the Buddha. It means "Worthy One" according to the Theravadins.

བཙུང་ལྷན་འདས་དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པ་ དག་བཙུང་པ་ ཡང་དག་པར་རྫོགས་པའི་སངས་རྒྱས་དཔལ་རྒྱལ་བ་ཤུག་ལྷན་འཛུལ་ལོ།

CHOM DĀN DĀ DE ZHIN SHEG PA DRA CHOM PA YANG DAG PAR DZOG PĀI SANG GYĀ  
PĀL GYĀL WA SHAKYA THUB PA LA CHHAG TSHĀL LO

(transliteration courtesy of FPMT)

Malcolm wrote:

It's funny, that's how Tibetans translate Jain use of the term, rather than "destroyer of the enemy."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 6:03 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

conebeckham said:

Both an experience of extreme devotion,

Malcolm wrote:

Aka Mos gus pa'i rtsal.

rai said:

which gives 0 results in google

Malcolm wrote:

It refers to the quality of devotion, literally “ the power of devotion” .

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 6:06 PM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

Lhasa said:

I have a singing bowl that came from the estate of a high Sakya lama, an abbot, who brought it out of Tibet in the 1950's. It is hand carved, crudely, rough, not polished, not pretty, not commercial. Rather ugly, really. It was used in tantric water rituals. It has a wonderful sound. This was long before the new age bowls appeared.

Garchen Rinpoche is now sharing a recording of a gong-like 'bowl' from Gar monastery in Tibet. He says it is a 'liberation by hearing' sound and he is playing it now before his live-stream teachings. You can hear it on his youtube live stream videos from the last month or so.

Malcolm wrote:

I've been in the Sakya school for thirty years. Water offerings, yes, sound healing with metal bowls, no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 6:08 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

For those who don't know, this law bans abortions after the sixth week and then authorizes anyone to bring a lawsuit against anyone who performs or assists anyone obtain an abortion, awarding them \$10,000 and attorneys fees and costs if they win. This means someone who loses this case as a defendant will have to pay \$10,000 and the plaintiff's attorney fees and costs that could easily be in the six figure range. One of these cases could bankrupt a doctor or counselor. You can bet anti abortion organizations will line up to support these cases. No one will want to do these procedures.

You can bet red states will all copy this law.

It's a shit show.

Malcolm wrote:

GOP solution to demographic crisis?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

The US should not have got involved in the first place back in 2001.

Malcolm wrote:

Another SCOTUS debacle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

What should have been the response?

Malcolm wrote:

What we did in Abbottabad. Waited, watched, and then eliminated OBL when we had the chance. No reason at all to spend 2 trillion dollars on nothing.

47,245 civilians died in this war. Seems a little excessive, not to mention the number of civilians who died in Iraq. Total numbers here as of 2019:

<https://watson.brown.edu/costsofwar/files/cow/imce/papers/2019/Direct%20War%20Deaths%20COW%20Estimate%20November%2013%202019%20FINAL.pdf>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Aka Mos gus pa'i rtsal.

rai said:

which gives 0 results in google

Crazywisdom said:

Because it's arcane knowledge that only he knows. It's an exotic combination of



characters that dazzles the eye....

Malcolm wrote:

Cone knows Tibetan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

Greet!

What off-the-cushion practices are good for deepening one's relationship with emptiness?

Many thank!

Rick

Malcolm wrote:

Regarding all phenomena as dreams and illusions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 11:46 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Queequeg said:

Dharmasherab says the US should never have gone into Afghanistan in the first place

Malcolm wrote:

I agree.

Queequeg said:

and I would like to know what the correct response should have been to 9/11 if it didn't involve going into Afghanistan.

Malcolm wrote:

Covert ops, not an invasion. Drone strikes, the usual things people don't like but we do anyway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 3rd, 2021 at 11:48 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Sādhaka said:

There was a reason for some people.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, a lot of people on the beltway lined their pockets, most of that 2 trillion was spent here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Thou shall bring no false idols before me

Content:

Jesse said:

I would prefer to see a technologically advanced society which is guided/governed by great Bodhisattvas.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just philosopher king ideology. It does not work in reality. I am fine with the conventional wisdom of ordinary people, even if it is far, far less than perfect.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Recommended Reading Before The Indian Classics

Content:

Padmist said:

Before I embark on reading the Indian Classics (Nagarjuna, Asanga, Vasubandhu, etc), their commentarial work, shastras, treatises, (MMK, 5 Maitreya Texts, Abhidharmakośakārikā, etc) are there books you'd recommend I read first to make reading these classics easier to understand?

Malcolm wrote:

Sakya Pandita's Clarifying the Sages Intent, Gampopa's Ornament of Liberation, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

What off-the-cushion practices are good for deepening one's relationship with

emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

Regarding all phenomena as dreams and illusions.

Rick said:

Life is but a dream?

Malcolm wrote:

no more real than last night's dream, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

Schopenhauer said:

What are the most important empowerments in the Sakya tradition, besides the Hevajra and Lamdre empowerments?

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrayoginī

Then in no particular order:

Vajrakīlaya

Sarvavidyā

Guhyasamāja

Vajrabhairava

Cakrasamvara

Mahākāla

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Because it's arcane knowledge that only he knows. It's an exotic combination of characters that dazzles the eye....

Malcolm wrote:

Cone knows Tibetan.

Crazywisdom said:

Hanji

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

Which means all the bogeymen in my life (fears, neuroses, sorrows, suffering, grief) are just that ... bogeymen!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. But this ability to regard everything as dreams and illusions in post-equipoise ought to arise from profound confidence in emptiness, otherwise, it may fall into a kind of nihilism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Thou shall bring no false idols before me

Content:

Jesse said:

I still believe systems such as democracy would have a place, however with a better educated, less deluded public, society could elect beneficial public servants, based on merit and skill; rather than politics, greed, and the other asinine qualities we now base our elections on.

Malcolm wrote:

Eliminate the GOP and your wishes will be granted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 4:48 AM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Covert ops, not an invasion. Drone strikes, the usual things people don't like but we do anyway.

Queequeg said:

That's the only answer I've gotten to the alternative to getting involved in Afghanistan, and it involves getting involved in Afghanistan.

Malcolm wrote:

It does not involve a full scale ground invasion.

Queequeg said:

OBL and his gang were responsible. There's no version of reality where the US does not go after him.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but a ground war? 2 Trillion? Come on.

Queequeg said:

I don't know where you guys were on 9/11 and in the aftermath. I was in NYC, and a couple drone strikes and special ops was not going to satisfy the urge for revenge.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, so we punished people who had nothing to do with, by claiming we were going after people we had supported with advanced tactical weaponry since the Carter years. Makes a lot of sense. Really, it was a total failure of leadership on every level.

Queequeg said:

People were lining up at the recruiting station. Americans were going to kick ass after such a direct attack like that. There was no alternative to a lot of death and destruction.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there is often no alternative when American stupidity gets involved. We just decided to punish Muslims for allowing OBL to exist, and killed a million people in the process. It's indefensible. It is a war crime.

Queequeg said:

There was another message there - that was if you harbor people like OBL, expect to get your ass whupped.

Malcolm wrote:

But that did not happen, just like it did not happen in Vietnam, etc. And actually the Taliban was willing to hand over OBL:

<https://www.baltimoresun.com/bal-te.attacks15oct15-story.html>

There was a diplomatic solution, but Bush was under the influence of Darth Cheney. and opted to ignore it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It refers to the quality of devotion, literally “ the power of devotion” .

rai said:

thank you!

Danny said:

So what’s the devotion? And why’s it “powerful”?

Malcolm wrote:

It's how, combined with recognition of the mind essence, one realizes mahāmudra through guru yoga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 6:05 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

Life is but a dream?

master of puppets said:

don't believe life is a dream.

for an awakened can not be.

because he is awakened.

Malcolm wrote:

That’s why an awakened one is awake. Even the Buddha said life is just like last nights dream, sheesh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 8:16 AM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness"

Content:

Danny said:

So what’s the devotion? And why’s it “powerful”?

Malcolm wrote:

It's how, combined with recognition of the mind essence, one realizes mahāmudra through guru yoga.

Crazywisdom said:

Well seeing the guru as Vajradhara is enough. Milarepa taught the guru is an illusion.

Malcolm wrote:

Is the mind essence different than Vajradhara? If so, please explain how. Is the mind essence established as something that truly exists? If so, please explain how. If you can't, then your distinctions are like saying this pure water is better than that pure water.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 9:20 AM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrayoginī

n8pee said:

Why is this?

Malcolm wrote:

Apart from Lamdre, Naropa's Khecari is the most important set of instructions in Sakya. It's easy to practice, profound, and complete. According to the Sakya Tradition, it's the ultimate practice lineage from the Cakrasamvara tantra tradition as preserved by this school.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 7:17 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

You guys want to say powerful overwhelming devotion. But tears and emotion and all that is just attachment, opinion and bias.

Malcolm wrote:

Where did I call for tears and emotion? I said that in guru yoga, mahamudra is realized through merging the power of devotion with recognition of the nature of the mind, that's all. It's a different path than the two stages, but produces a similar gnosis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

I might. Or I might just be restraining my speech about \*Texans to Americans.

Malcolm wrote:

There, fixed it for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 8:17 PM

Title: Re: purity

Content:

DGA said:

Here are a few examples that caught my eye. I'm sure I glossed over more.

Drung, Deu, and Bon

Chapter 1, part 4, quoting from "Birth In Ling"

Of course, I notice these are all quotations from the same text. I assume there are at least shades of meaning that distinguish the above from the below:

Chapter 8, section 1:

(p 106)

Malcolm wrote:

"Oh great, pure, divine race!" (p 6)

lha sde dkar po: here "pure" is translating dkar po, or "white." sde is not usually translated as race. It is basically a military term, and means "division, section, or segment." But given the context, I see why Adriano has chosen race (usually given for rigs).

"let the pure (dkar po) people of Ling sing and dance!" (p 7)

"the deities have chosen a man from among the pure (dkar) Ling." (p 9)

"may his birth be like an ornament for the pure (dkar po) Ling!" (p 9)

"Dkar po" here as denotes good, virtuous, etc.

"as men do not distinguish good from evil, and do not know how to maintain purity (gtsang) and avoid impurity (dme), they create a basis for negativity"

gtsang here has the connotation of moral purity, chastity, proper sexual conduct; while dme has the connotation of adultery and incest.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 8:23 PM

Title: Re: purity

Content:

tingdzin said:

so no basis for "race pride" in the bad sense.

Malcolm wrote:

Khampas clearly think they are not Bodpas. Also the gtsang pas really distinguish themselves from the dbu pas, etc. But it is more regional than racial. They all come from the four clans (rus).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Sunrise said:

The Buddha was skillful allowing the Sangha, who were beggars, to eat meat (not intentionally killed for them).

Malcolm wrote:

He also never discussed the diets of lay people.

Aemilius said:

He did discuss the livelihood of lay persons.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, which had the side effect of leading to a de facto caste system where butchers were considered the lowest of the low, because in Buddhist countries everyone ate meat and still do.

But the Buddha actually defined meat pure in three ways as acceptable, including in a Mahāyānā context, which you will discover if you read Bhavaviveka's treatment of the issue which I have presented here elsewhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 4th, 2021 at 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Some discussion on Tilopa (split from "Choiceless awareness")

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Didn't you also say an impartial mind is impossible? That one must choose wisdom? It would appear you're own evaluation of the situation would make Mahamudra practice impossible.

Malcolm wrote:

I said "choiceless awareness" was impossible. Awareness, by its very definition, is always awareness of something. I am pretty sure I did not say that one "chooses" transcendent gnosis. Of course, there are all kinds of things one chooses in order to discover that gnosis, such as a teacher, lineage, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:11 AM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

climb-up said:

Maybe this Rinpoche had some positive experiences with sound healing, thought they were meaningful and useful and just assumed that the historical claims were true?

Malcolm wrote:

2500 years? There wasn't even Buddhism in Tibet 2500 years ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 7:49 PM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

climb-up said:

Maybe this Rinpoche had some positive experiences with sound healing, thought they were meaningful and useful and just assumed that the historical claims were true?

Malcolm wrote:

2500 years? There wasn't even Buddhism in Tibet 2500 years ago.

climb-up said:

But he's a bönpo right? So he'd be going by that timeframe?

Malcolm wrote:

2500 years ago, there was only the Buddha, in India.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

I might. Or I might just be restraining my speech about \*Texans to Americans.

Malcolm wrote:

There, fixed it for you.

Kim O'Hara said:

Thanks. My bad.

I was actually going to write ...about some Americans to other Americans... which would have been better still because it would cover the point TharpaChodron made. I think I will have to wait until my next life to start aspiring to perfection in speech.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Well, all of this is actually Australia's fault....Rupert Murdoch....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Aemilius said:

He did discuss the livelihood of lay persons.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, which had the side effect of leading to a de facto caste system where butchers were considered the lowest of the low, because in Buddhist countries everyone ate meat and still do.

But the Buddha actually defined meat pure in three ways as acceptable, including in a Mahāyānā context, which you will discover if you read Bhavaviveka's treatment of the issue which I have presented here elsewhere.

Aemilius said:

"Pure in three ways" doesn't hold water. Each person who eats meat habitually or sporadically creates demand for the production of meat in the future. This is how the market works, and nowadays most people know it. At the time of Shakyamuni the science of economics and market analysis had not yet developed, and this example of

"pure in three ways" was accepted, but it can't be accepted anymore.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it can. The issue is volition, not economics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 8:16 PM

Title: Re: Not wanting to practice unless my suffering is high

Content:

Jesse said:

Either way I appreciate all of the input, and advice. Bliss is honestly about the only thing that will motivate me to practice when I'm in a rut like currently. If I can manage to get some of that going maybe it will carry me a ways away from my current stagnant position.

Malcolm wrote:

You are always suffering, you just don't recognize it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

master of puppets said:

I don't know

Crazywisdom said:

The foam gathers and goes down a wide gullet.

master of puppets said:

can say many things...I will ask, what is good what is bad, really?

you may as well disregard..

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Future of Tibetan Tantric Buddhism

Content:

Chenrezig said:

The 5th built the Potala still under Mongolian support...

Malcolm wrote:

No, he expanded it. It was originally constructed by Songtsam Gampo.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

Striving to realize emptiness with good texts but no living teacher/sangha and with a good off-cushion but no on-the-cushion practice ...

A fool's errand? Or a good path (of the 84,000) for the right person? (A fool?)

Malcolm wrote:

This is just intellectualism. It is like being a stone in the bottom of the ocean. No matter how wet the surface becomes, the water never penetrates inside.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: translation of Dra Talgyur and its commentary by Vimalamitra

Content:

yagmort said:

it was announced some time ago that translation of Dra Talgyur and its commentary by Vimalamitra is in progress.

<http://melong.com/the-drathalgyur-all-penetrating-sound-tantra/>

since Chogyal Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche and Elio Guarisco passed away, what is the status of this project?

Malcolm wrote:

It never started. It however is my next project, with the encouragement of Adriano Clemente. It is a long text, so, maybe it will be published in four years. I think it has already been translated into French by JLA as far as I know.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 9:58 PM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

Rick said:

Well at least the stone can take solace from knowing it is immersed in water. And, who knows, maybe a crack will form and some will seep inside?

Malcolm wrote:

If you just want follow your own trip, why bother asking questions?

You don't understand the meaning of refuge, that's your basic problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:02 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Unknown said:

Let me be clear from the onset that I do not claim to be enlightened. I probably botched my opportunity because (1) I was not working with a teacher, and (2) I am not Buddha. (But then had I been working with a teacher I doubt if I would have made this discovery. And if I had become enlightened, I'm not sure if I'd be working through the details involved in writing this explanation.)

Malcolm wrote:

Since you don't have a teacher, did not train with a teacher, etc., you should not be writing explanations as if you are a teacher. It's like someone who never studied medicine writing prescriptions. It's highly unethical.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

If you can cite this method being taught by an ordained teacher, I'd love to see it!

Malcolm wrote:

There are many errors in your presentation. Too many to enumerate.

Your motivation is not the point. The fact that you are proffering meditation advice without having trained under a qualified teacher is the point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:34 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The fact that you are proffering meditation advice without having trained under a qualified teacher is the point.

JimTempleman said:  
I'm just trying to clarify an earlier teaching.

Malcolm wrote:  
When an unqualified physician prescribes medicine, they harm the patient, and thereby, their own reputation.

You should try studying the dharma properly, before you presume to teach others.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:36 PM  
Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion  
Content:

Rick said:  
Yes I am not fond of committing to one thing.

Malcolm wrote:  
Then, Ferdinand, you will never get anywhere.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:57 PM  
Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 10:58 PM  
Title: Re: translation of Dra Talgyur and its commentary by Vimalamitra  
Content:  
yagmort said:  
thanks Malcolm, both for the reply and your efforts.  
excuse my ignorance, what about vima nyingthig? was any of it translated? any ideas about full cycle translation?

Malcolm wrote:  
Bits and pieces, three phrases of Garab Dorje, seven nails of Shri singha, etc.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, September 5th, 2021 at 11:21 PM  
Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

I'm trying to explain how my own practice & experience can readily be interpreted in terms of the Four Noble Truths. My problem is that if I don't present it as a system, the points I'm making won't hold up.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many errors in your presentation. Too many to enumerate.

JimTempleman said:

– My errors are innumerable; I vow to listen to all of your criticism with an open mind.

Malcolm wrote:

To begin with, you need a qualified teacher. Start there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

. If you think the presentation is flawed, I'd like to hear how you would correct it.

Malcolm wrote:

This is why you need a teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 12:42 AM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

climb-up said:

But he's a bönpo right? So he'd be going by that timeframe?

Malcolm wrote:

2500 years ago, there was only the Buddha, in India.

climb-up said:

But is that how Bönpo see it?

I thought that Bönpo trace their founding to Tonpa Sherab Miwo who they place in 16,000s BCE.

Malcolm wrote:

No comment. As far as sound healing with singing bowls go, there was no such thing



before the 1980's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

But just to be clear, in the meantime, whatever animals have been raised for slaughter will still be slaughtered, whether they end up in a butcher shop or sold for pet food. The producers won't spend another penny on feed if there's no payoff in it.

Malcolm wrote:

A lot of vegans own pets, to whom they feed meat.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: The Origin Of Tibetan Singing Bowls

Content:

climb-up said:

Well, yeah. But that's different than whether someone is intentionally lying or has taken claims made on good faith.

Malcolm wrote:

Caveat emptor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 2:07 AM

Title: Re: purity

Content:

Heimdall said:

It's not a bad thing to embrace your own cultural heritage as a good thing. It only gets bad if it goes too far.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Isn't the concept of "my heritage", which means everything created by other people in the past, basically plagiarism?

Heimdall said:

Whether you like it or not, your own cultural experience defines who you are and how you perceive the world.

I mean let's look at you - you worked in an incense shop. The idea of that in my cultural experience is totally foreign; here in the West people don't generally do that. Yet all those experience, all the incense smells you've experienced, the people you've worked with - to some extent, they all are a part of who you are. Without your culture, you wouldn't have been Buddhist, because your ancestors gave you the necessary foundation stones to find Buddhism.

So you should be thankful for your ancestors for that.

As another example, if you are born and raised in a Western country, most people are not genuinely aware of how much the Judeo-Christian framework consciously and unconsciously influences their perceptions, down even to the level of political movements and socio-political philosophy, conceptions of "good" and "evil", and down even to the level of basic cultural custom.

Elaborating that, in Christianity, unlike any other religion in the world, the lower-classes are seen as having intrinsic moral value due to the fact that they suffer more and they less prone to being slaves to materiality. "Blessed are the poor in spirit, for theirs is the Kingdom of Heaven", "It's easier for a camel to enter through the eye of a needle than a rich person to enter the Kingdom of Heaven". Additionally, both Judaism and Christianity have this utopian fantasy where the world will eventually collapse, and the good will enter the Heavenly Jerusalem.

In my understanding, this conception of "the moral superiority of the lower classes" is totally alien to Buddhism. The Buddha himself was an upper-class prince. Sure, we should help the poor, and sure, the upper classes may be prone to spiritually destructive practices (In the Buddha's own words, "living like a Deva"), but everyone here has karma to work out and should strive to achieve enlightenment. There's nothing inherently valuable about being lower class or morally evil about being upper class - a Buddhist king has to keep the eight precepts anyways. And the place we find ourselves in are a product of Karma anyways.

But given the background of Judeo-Christian values, is it any wonder why Marx, and his contemporary disciples, have totally embraced this worldview of "oppressor and oppressed" by various identity groups where the oppressed, by virtue of being oppressed, is seen as morally superior? Or that Marx and his followers have this utopian vision about the social structures collapsing and ushering in an egalitarian utopia like some kind of Heavenly Jerusalem on Earth? The only reason why these political frameworks got such a holding in the West is likely a product of Judeo-Christian values where "good" is defined as "poor, oppressed, detached, meek" and bad is "rich, powerful, greedy, Caesar", and the relatability of the corrupt world withering away and a

perfect one coming in.

Even down to expressions like "God bless you" when someone sneezes or "God damn it" or "What the hell", all products of Judeo-Christian influence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 2:08 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

Danny said:

<https://www.fox5ny.com/news/boxer-jeanette-zacarias-zapata-dies-days-after-fight>

Zapata, from Mexico, suffered a series of power punches in the corner of the ring. After a solid uppercut, she seemed stunned near the end of the fourth round. A final right hook knocked her mouthguard out and left her unable to return to her corner after the bell rang.

Malcolm wrote:

Boxing should be illegal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I think a harm reduction approach is the sanest one, if one wants to focus their energies on things like this.

Malcolm wrote:

The best way to reduce the harm of boxing is not to do it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 3:02 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I think a harm reduction approach is the sanest one, if one wants to focus their energies on things like this.

Malcolm wrote:

The best way to reduce the harm of boxing is not to do it.

Johnny Dangerous said:

That worked out fantastically with the prohibition of alcohol, drugs, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Just expressing my opinion JD. I also think guns should be illegal and the second amendment should be repealed. Again, just an opinion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 9:21 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

If I had a teacher I'm not sure that he or she would feel comfortable with my way of taking everything apart & putting it back together.

reipun said:

Sorry, that comes off as just a dodge. It sounds more like you are trying to assert superiority or unassailability.

"teacher" comes up with Ctrl-F 54x in this thread, so I will belabor it just once more, but with a quote from someone not already participating:

It must be stressed that there is no true Zen practice without a teacher.

-Meido Roshi

This has obvious implications for what comes out of your practice. But also know that a Zen teacher might actually support or validate your experience. Evaluating a student's work is what good Zen teachers are expert at. Perhaps it is your own comfort level at risk.

Malcolm wrote:

You can lead a horse to water, but you can't make it drink.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 8:47 PM

Title: Re: translation of Dra Talgyur and its commentary by Vimalamitra

Content:

krodha said:

How terrible.

yagmort said:

it is.

Malcolm, will you make use of the work has already done by the original team? will Adriano and Jim continue to be a part of the project or it will be entirely your personal work?

Malcolm wrote:

Starting from scratch. But of course, I will consult Adriano where needed, and I have the support of Lama Chonam, and Tulku Dakpa, who will assist me when I need it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Aemilius said:

"Pure in three ways" doesn't hold water. Each person who eats meat habitually or sporadically creates demand for the production of meat in the future. This is how the market works, and nowadays most people know it. At the time of Shakyamuni the science of economics and market analysis had not yet developed, and this example of "pure in three ways" was accepted, but it can't be accepted anymore.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it can. The issue is volition, not economics.

Aemilius said:

In the market analysis monks and other persons are nameless individuals called consumers of goods. Because this market exists, it can be known how much meat has to be produced in the coming years to satisfy the market need for it. The consumption of meat is the driving force, it causes the production of meat, i.e. the raising and slaughtering of animals and processing their meat. The market is not really concerned with the volitions of the meat consumers. The volitions of consumers do not change the mechanism of it. As long as people want to eat meat, there is the market for it. Monks and other people are equally just nameless consumers, whose habits create the demand for meat, right now and in the future.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but prohibition is not against eating meat, it is against killing. Meat does not suffer. It's dead flesh. One can't kill it. Seeing, requesting, or killing an animal for meat involves karma and it's result. Buying a steak in the market does not. The market argument is a valid one from the point view of climate change etc., but it's irrelevant to liberation.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 11:11 PM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
Clearly you are aware of this history. It amazes me journalists don't harp on this.

Malcolm wrote:  
Many of them are too young for this to be on their radar. The average age of a journalist in the US is 39.

This story does not sell newspapers.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 11:13 PM  
Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan  
Content:  
Queequeg said:  
We don't have packs of orphans living in garbage dumps.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, they live out of dumpsters, since we have largely banned landfills.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 6th, 2021 at 11:58 PM  
Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means  
Content:  
JimTempleman said:  
Had I been working with a teacher I would have reported it. I have no idea what he or she might have made of it. You might not know it, but there is a fairly extensive branch of Soto Zen that pretty much ignores samadhi, treating it as just 'scenery' along the never ending path of Zazen.

Malcolm wrote:  
Please define samādhī.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 3:06 AM  
Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means  
Content:  
JimTempleman said:  
Had I been working with a teacher I would have reported it. I have no idea what he or she

might have made of it. You might not know it, but there is a fairly extensive branch of Soto Zen that pretty much ignores samadhi, treating it as just 'scenery' along the never ending path of Zazen.

Malcolm wrote:

Please define samādhi.

JimTempleman said:

Giving you my definition or Master Sheng Yen's definition won't address my reference above your question.

I was referring to the phenomena described in the post: "Are Zen teachers awakened?"

You can find here: <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?f=69&t=34065>

Malcolm wrote:

Which post? There are 13+ pages.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 3:08 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

Malcom, I think narhwal90 just confirmed my point:

Malcolm wrote:

We are not talking about Soto Zen here. This is the general meditation forum. Please define samādhi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

Malcom, I think narhwal90 just confirmed my point:

Malcolm wrote:

We are not talking about Soto Zen here. This is the general meditation forum. Please define samādhi.

reiun said:

A general definition we all might agree on would be "meditative absorption". If not talking Soto, then not Tibetan, Nichiren, etc. either. Or Rinzai, whose Four Categories

are most familiar to me.

Malcolm wrote:

That does not answer the question, it only leads to another question, what is meant by "meditative absorption?"

My point is, how can someone know if they are in samādhi if they cannot define it? What are its characteristics? These things are very precisely defined by in Buddhadharma. There are very precise indicators for what a samādhi is, and what a samādhi isn't. There are also very many different kinds of samadhis, hundreds and thousands of them.

People throw these terms around promiscuously, as if they understand what they mean, but frankly, in my experience, people often have no idea what they actually mean.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: What y'all think?

Content:

Danny said:

<https://www.wsj.com/articles/college-university-fall-higher-education-men-women-enrollment-admissions-back-to-school-11630948233>

Malcolm wrote:

Too much time spent on Halo, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 4:40 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That worked out fantastically with the prohibition of alcohol, drugs, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Just expressing my opinion JD. I also think guns should be illegal and the second amendment should be repealed. Again, just an opinion.

TharpaChodron said:

Can we keep football?

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. You will all be forced to watch Ted Lasso until your eyes bleed.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 4:44 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

frankie said:

It's sometimes good just to be honest with oneself.

Eating meat is not karmically optimal...it is not compassionate.

Malcolm wrote:

Eating meat that is pure in three ways is a neutral karma, like drinking water and most of our activities. It can be transformed through intention. It can be compassionate. One merely needs the method to make it so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

I know a 13 year old girl who is boxing, she is also of Mexican-American heritage. I detest how dangerous and violent this "sport" is, but to her she feels it's empowering. She told me she goes to fight in boxing matches and says to herself, "I'm not here to make friends, I'm here to make progress." It is twisted that in order for some to feel they have some power, they end up being turned into "fighters", like Roman slaves/Gladiators pleasing the elites. It's always the poorest who find boxing as their way up, be it in Cuba, Mexico, you name it. Rich white dudes don't box. They don't need to.

Malcolm wrote:

My distaste for boxing began when I was in 7th grade, and some guys in Gym class were hassling me for having long hair (1974). The coach, a major asshole, gave us boxing gloves, and had us fight in front of the whole class. Needless to say, I more or less just kept my head down. It sucked. Also, all the guys on the football team sucked too. Hence my distaste for both sports.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 7:35 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Vajrasambhava said:

Hi Malcolm,

Don't you think that buying a steak in the market is directly or indirectly involved in the process of requesting meat, ergo killing Animals?

Malcolm wrote:

No, for many reasons which have been outlined in this thread.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 7:40 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

TharpaChodron said:

I know a 13 year old girl who is boxing, she is also of Mexican-American heritage. I detest how dangerous and violent this "sport" is, but to her she feels it's empowering. She told me she goes to fight in boxing matches and says to herself, "I'm not here to make friends, I'm here to make progress." It is twisted that in order for some to feel they have some power, they end up being turned into "fighters", like Roman slaves/Gladiators pleasing the elites. It's always the poorest who find boxing as their way up, be it in Cuba, Mexico, you name it. Rich white dudes don't box. They don't need to.

Malcolm wrote:

My distaste for boxing began when I was in 7th grade, and some guys in Gym class were hassling me for having long hair (1974). The coach, a major asshole, gave us boxing gloves, and had us fight in front of the whole class. Needless to say, I more or less just kept my head down. It sucked. Also, all the guys on the football team sucked too. Hence my distaste for both sports.

TharpaChodron said:

For sure. I've never been fond of gym class and dumb jocks myself. Then you find out later in life that they aren't all morons, they're sometimes working class heroes, some maybe even Rhodes Scholars. But not Tom Brady, that guy is a douche.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't have anything against football, other than the fact I would never allow any kid of mine to play. I also have nothing against boxers or football players. It's the sports I object to.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 7:49 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Please define samādhi.

JimTempleman said:

Samadhi, or what is also referred to as "meditative absorption," "unified mind," and "one-pointedness of mind." There are, however, many levels of samadhi, some shallow, some deep.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, samadhi is one-pointedness. It's a mental factor all sentient beings have, all the time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 6:36 PM

Title: Re: The Q-hole status: September 2021

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Does the "QAnon" conspiracy theory / freakshow / online cult / all-round mess still exist as of autumn 2021? Are there still "drops" being made? Any die hard believers left?

Or did the whole thing die a merciful death?

I ask because I came across somebody who claimed it not only still exists as a phenomenon but is actually "still growing."

I found the latter claim hard to swallow. I personally have heard nothing about it in months. But who knows what goes on in dark corners of the internet? It remains a worrisome issue. People have lost family members to this nonsense.

Malcolm wrote:

It's evolved, but still going strong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 6:42 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

In the future would you find the expression: 'The Method of the Noble Truths' more acceptable?

Malcolm wrote:

It's not the four noble truths, it's the four truths of nobles.

The only method in these four truths is the eightfold path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 6:52 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Aemilius said:

In the market analysis monks and other persons are nameless individuals called consumers of goods. Because this market exists, it can be known how much meat has to be produced in the coming years to satisfy the market need for it. The consumption of meat is the driving force, it causes the production of meat, i.e. the raising and slaughtering of animals and processing their meat. The market is not really concerned with the volitions of the meat consumers. The volitions of consumers do not change the mechanism of it. As long as people want to eat meat, there is the market for it. Monks and other people are equally just nameless consumers, whose habits create the demand for meat, right now and in the future.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but prohibition is not against eating meat, it is against killing. Meat does not suffer. It's dead flesh. One can't kill it. Seeing, requesting, or killing an animal for meat involves karma and it's result. Buying a steak in the market does not. The market argument is a valid one from the point view of climate change etc., but it's irrelevant to liberation.

Aemilius said:

The animal has been killed because of one's desire for meat. It is the functioning of the market. Demand creates production. Consumers do not directly kill animals, but their habit of eating meat causes the slaughtering of animals. If no one wanted to eat meat, the animals would not be killed. The market is caused by one's desire for meat. Buying a steak keeps the market going.

Malcolm wrote:

If people stopped killing animals for food (fat chance of that happening), then there would be no meat to purchase. I would be fine with that. Hydrocarbon extraction is also killing the planet, but no one is going to stop driving anytime soon, or using the internet to vocalize their deeply-felt opinions, so, we mustn't pretend that being vegetarian is saving any being from anything. Also, there is no relationship between diet and liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 6:55 PM

Title: Re: Taliban - Split from: Prayer for Afghanistan

Content:

PeterC said:

The depressing thing is that everyone knew where this was headed long, long ago.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, and Biden wanted out a decade ago. He opposed the surge, etc.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 7:19 PM  
Title: Re: The Q-hole status: September 2021  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
<https://apple.news/AMnTPRkBgQGWrtaV5cX1PA>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 7:20 PM  
Title: Re: vaccine bodhicitta etc  
Content:  
rai said:  
if you accept a 3rd dose of covid vaccine before grandpa in Ethiopia get his 1st are you breaking the bodhisattva vow?

...well how about if you are under 40 and get the first dose before grandpa in Haiti...

Malcolm wrote:  
Of course not. In order to assist others, a bodhisattva must preserve themselves.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 9:31 PM  
Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means  
Content:  
JimTempleman said:  
Something happened that night that transformed Gautama into the Buddha. Let's not argue about what it was this time, just accept that it was a change.

Malcolm wrote:  
The Buddha gave a very detailed account of his awakening. So there is no need to argue what it was. It is quite well known.

He first recalled 90k+ lifetimes, understood that these lifetimes were a result of karma, suffering. He then entered into the eight dhyānas to eliminate traces for rebirth in their corresponding lokas, but seeing for each of them that they were suffering, that there was a cause for that suffering, there was a cessation for that suffering, and a means to bring about that cessation. He then entered Vajropama Samadhi, eradicated all traces connecting him with samsara. That's it and that's all. No altered states of consciousness, etc. There was also an episode with Papayin Māra, aka Kamadeva, just prior to his final awakening.

Samadhi, concentration, etc. create traces in rebirth in ordinary people. This is why it is said by many awakened masters prajñā must be cultivated first. What is prajñā? Right view, the first of the eight limbs of the path of nobles.

Observing the rising, abiding, and passing away of thoughts is not in itself profound. Even a child can do this. That does not constitute right view. Right view is discussed here:

<https://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.117.than.html#s1>

If you wish to understand what samādhi is in Mahāyāna, then you should consult this sūtra, in particular chapter 13.

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh127.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

I'm actually trying to fit a modern understanding of human perception into the Buddhist framework, and not the other way around.

Malcolm wrote:

This will never work. This is your first error, that is, feeling you can "fit a modern understanding of human perception into the Buddhist framework." If it isn't broken, there is no need to fix it. Otherwise, the assumption you are making here is that Buddhas teachings are inadequate to the times. To present this point of view on a traditionalist Buddhist website is the very height of hubris.

JimTempleman said:

How can anyone possibly cut off Chan or Zen from the origin of Buddhism? I guess its specifically the methods of practice that you want to keep segregated. When you look back at the history of the development of Buddhism in, say China, where do you see this kind of segregation taking place? I guess Dogen should have stayed in Japan.

Malcolm wrote:

You are not practicing Chan or Zen. You cannot practice Chan or Zen by reading a book and then trying to meditate. Chan and Zen are oral traditions in which working with a teacher is not only recommended, but is mandatory. The same is true of Theravada, Tibetan Buddhism, and so on.

JimTempleman said:

If that were the case throughout the history of Buddhism there would only be a single lineage. Don't teachers adopt skillful means suitable to each individual?

Malcolm wrote:

You are not a teacher, or so you have said. Also, this is overblown. The teachings are not

adapted to persons, they are adapted to afflictive profiles and levels of intelligence. We have three afflictions, desire, hatred, and ignorance, and everyone has some mixture of these. When it is said there are 84,000 dharma skandhas, this is reference to the teachings meant to address these three afflictions, separately and combined. These afflictions cause us to engage in actions, and those actions result in suffering in this and future lives. In general, we practice three trainings: discipline to counteract desire; samādhi to counteract hatred; and wisdom to counteract ignorance. Practicing discipline eliminates rebirth in the three lower realms. Practicing samādhi eliminates rebirth in the desire realm; and practicing wisdom eliminates rebirth in the three realms altogether. This is from the point of view of our own personal benefit. Developing bodhicitta, the wish to attain full buddhahood for the benefit of sentient beings involves practicing the six perfections for the benefit of others.

The whole point of the Dharma is to reverse this cycle of endless, uncontrolled rebirth in the three realms, both for ourselves and for others. If one does not accept rebirth, there is no point in practicing Buddhadharma at all, because one is negating the very point of practicing Buddhadharma to begin with.

JimTempleman said:

And how you exactly do you keep them from learning through experience?

Malcolm wrote:

Even the Buddha had to deal with Māra when he was on the seat of awakening. We have far more issues with Māra than the Buddha, since we are still ordinary, unawakened people, and our capacity for being deceived is far greater than our capacity to ascertain where we have erred. Every tradition of Buddhadharma has many teachings concerning experience, and how to judge an authentic experience from a deceptive experience (most of them). The problem is that, without a teacher, one will be unable to ascertain the difference, just a person with no knowledge of jungle plants will be unable to ascertain which ones will sustain them and which ones will kill them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 9:58 PM

Title: Re: The Q-hole status: September 2021

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Didn't HBO out Ron Watkins as "Q"?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 9:59 PM

Title: Re: vaccine bodhicitta etc

Content:

rai said:

if you accept a 3rd dose of covid vaccine before grandpa in Etiopia get his 1st are you breaking the bodhisattva vow?

...well how about if you are under 40 and get the first dose before grandpa in Haiti...

Crazywisdom said:

A vaccine prevents harm to others which if you catch Covid you can cause harm and death. So based on basic ahimsa one should get the vaccine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

KathyLauren said:

You craved it, therefore you demanded it, therefore the store stocked it, therefore the butcher killed it. No amount of magic can break that chain of karma. The killing was done for you, even if the butcher didn't know who you were.

Malcolm wrote:

"Karma is intention and what proceeds from intention." I have my karma, a butcher has theirs. There is no magical connection which transfers a butcher's karma to me, no chain of karma, per se, unless I actually order a butcher to slaughter an animal on my behalf, see it butchered on my behalf, or hear of it was butchered on my behalf.

If what you say is true, then every vegetable one consumes is also attended by someone's intention somewhere to produce food and prevent other sentient beings from eating it by killing them, before that food is sent to market for consumption.

Your logic is very faulty from the point of view of karma. If you want to discuss the economics of industrial agriculture, its deleterious environmental impacts, its contribution to climate change, water pollution, soil degradation, and so on, that's a completely different conversation, and one I am happy to have.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

frankie said:

You have the desire and intention to eat the meat...fueling the demand and thereby associating your mindstream with the actions. You eat the meat - completion.



Malcolm wrote:

The issue, again, is not eating. It is killing. Because people do not really understand karma, they import all kinds of strange notions into their understanding. The Buddha did not list meat-eating under the ten nonvirtues, only killing. And to be involved in that nonvirtue one has to either kill a being oneself or deliberately, volitionally, encourage someone to do so. Picking up a chicken breast does not meet that test. It simply doesn't. That is why the Buddha taught that it was permissible to eat meat pure in three ways.

frankie said:

Not a "magical connection" - a causal link.

Malcolm wrote:

Causation is not necessarily karma. Karma is a very specific kind of causation.

If you wish to understand this in a more precise way, then consult chapter 4 of the Abhidharmakośabhaṣyaṃ.

If we accept your idea, even organic agriculture involves you in killing for food, due to use of pesticides and so on. But vegetarians always come up with excuses for why it is not the same...forgetting that the Buddha forbade monastics to farm because of the number of creatures killed by the occupation of farming—from tilling to harvesting. But someone has to grow food so people can eat. Thus we have this idea of the golden age, where we lived off fruit from trees, uncultivated grain crops, and so on, where our food consumption involved no nonvirtue on the part of anyone. But we do not live in that world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 7th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Gotta say Malcolm that sounds more than a tad Jesuitical. If I did not demand meat, there would be no reason for the butcher to kill it.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that is not just not how things work, karmically speaking.

Knotty Veneer said:

I may not bear the same karmic debt as the one who takes the life but if they killed it because I and people like me would buy it, I am implicated in the death.

Malcolm wrote:

You are implicated in all kinds of things because you are a living breathing creature on this planet. That does not mean you bear a karmic debt for climate change, mass extinctions, and so on, that are presently occurring. In fact, if humans were to stop eating meat (which will never happen), cows, and so on would be rendered extinct within centuries. We tend to kill any large animals we don't use, unless we keep them as pets. The best survival strategy for land animals is to remain domesticated for their products. Of course no one wants to hear this, but it's a fact.

In any case, diet and liberation are not connected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

frankie said:

Speaking for myself and others I know, though, we are not all hippy dippy, greeny beanie, idealistic types. Many people now are also persuaded simply from a practice perspective by the moral relatability and compassion aspects. In addition, looked at positively, people often find there is a sort of mental purification that could be seen as concomitant to the necessity of Shila practice in calming down the surface mind to more easefully allow access to deeper levels.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, people have many theories. For example, the Hevajra Tantra states, "those with compassion eat meat."

frankie said:

Now, in your dedicated training and experience you may know this not at all to be a requirement. And, as you say, there are great teachers in full agreement with you. Of course, equally, there are many who will say otherwise.

Malcolm wrote:

As I pointed out, Bhavaviveka hashed all this out in the Mahāyāna context in the Tarkajvala hundreds of years ago. Meat pure in three ways is acceptable. There was once a suffering animal. But not when you buy a steak, etc. in a market. A steak, lacking a consciousness, does not suffer even if you burn it to a crisp or cut it into a thousand pieces. The point is not diet, it's liberation.

The other issues, climate change, industrial agriculture, are all separate issues that are not related to the whether there is negative karma involved in eating meat pure in three ways.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

In the future would you find the expression: 'The Method of the Noble Truths' more acceptable?

Malcolm wrote:

It's not the four noble truths, it's the four truths of nobles.

JimTempleman said:

The Four Noble Truths can also be called The Four Truths of Nobles, or the Four Ennobling Truths. It's just that, at least in the West, they are most frequently referred to as The Four Noble Truths.

Malcolm wrote:

They are specifically defined as truths that āryas see.

...

JimTempleman said:

Where is that written?

Malcolm wrote:

Methods are connected with paths. The only path mentioned in the four truths of nobles is the eight-fold path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 2:37 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Aemilius said:

In the present world animals are slaughtered for nameless customers. If you buy meat, you are a nameless customer. You are a link in the chain of meat production.

Malcolm wrote:

Meat was always slaughtered for nameless, unidentified customers. But the prohibition is against eating you have killed, have ordered to be killed, or was specifically killed for an identified person, oneself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 2:39 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

All of this talk about karma, while interesting, is really completely irrelevant to veganism.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, which is why Veganism is completely irrelevant to Buddhism. One can be a Vegan Buddhist, just as one can be a Omnivore Buddhist, but vegan idealism is not Buddhism and is not found in the teaching of the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 3:05 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

Yet, veganism is certainly in line, and in accordance with, with the Buddhist teaching on non-violence as the way animals are treated is extraordinarily violent. The Buddha does not approve and never has approved of what goes on at a slaughterhouse and he certainly never gave any of them financial support.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha was mendicant, so he didn't buy anything, let alone meat. But he certainly consumed meat purchased from butchers by lay people. That's just a fact.

Another fact is that Buddha neither approved of nor disapproved of anything related to samsara. He taught a method of release from samsara, and while there were other śrāmanas, like Mahāvira, who advocated diet idealism as vital in pursuit of liberation, Buddha refused to go that route, even when his life was threatened by his cousin for not insisting on vegetarianism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 3:11 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

Yet, veganism is certainly in line, and in accordance with, with the Buddhist teaching on non-violence as the way animals are treated is extraordinarily violent. The Buddha does not approve and never has approved of what goes on at a slaughterhouse and he certainly never gave any of them financial support.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha was mendicant. But he certainly consumed meat purchased from butchers by lay people. That's just a fact.

seeker242 said:

He consumed it, but he did not purchase it. That's just a fact. It's also just a fact that purchasing it inevitably supports its production.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but that is not related to whether it is permissible to eat meat pure in three ways. It is permissible. Case closed. It is also a fact that Buddha refused to institute vegetarianism. It is also a fact that the prohibition against killing applies principally to killing humans. Killing animals is a minor offense, on par with picking the leaves off of trees and drinking alcohol. So it is pretty clear that diet was not a foremost consideration for the Buddha. As I have also acknowledged, monastics were not permitted to farm, because of the principle of ahimsa, and for that same reason, he instituted the rains retreats, to prevent monks from harming creatures on the roads. It's also a fact that like an apple, a steak does not suffer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 3:42 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha gave a very detailed account of his awakening. So there is no need to argue what it was. It is quite well known.

JimTempleman said:

You realize the different Suttas say different things, right. I'm not saying they contradict each other, just cover different ground.

Malcolm wrote:

The account of the night the Buddha attained awakening as mentioned in the suttas is very consistent.

Samadhi, concentration, etc. create traces in rebirth in ordinary people. This is why it is said by many awakened masters *prajñā* must be cultivated first.

In Silent Illumination stillness and insight (*prajñā*) are practiced together, according to Master Sheng Yen.

One must distinguish mundane, contaminated *prajñā* of ordinary people like us, from the *prajñā* of āryas. Of course, one always practices *śamatha* and *vipāśyanā* in tandem, ideally. It is impossible to make progress in either in absence of a qualified teacher.

Certainly not in 35 minute sitting sessions.

Let me just take this phrase from chapter 13: 'it is devoid of cessation '

Just because the *saṃādhi* itself is devoid of cessation, that does not mean that the method for entering into it did not involve the cessation of other 'things.' Come to think of it, how can it not?

“The wise know that they are without thought,

Are devoid of thought, and that there is no object. [F.44.a]

They have eliminated without remainder  
Every conception of cessation and noncessation.  
You keep on talking about arising and cessation. This itself indicates you have not understood the truth of dependent origination.  
I never claimed to have reached the deepest level of this samādhi.

But I did experience this for about 30 minutes straight:  
"There are no notions, there are no concepts,  
There is nothing to be grasped, there is nothing to be shown,  
And there is no object for the mind.  
Therefore it is called samādhi."  
I doubt it. You are basically claiming to be an awakened person by making this claim.  
In fact, it's more like the 'fixed-frame' of an unmoving mind.  
The is a śrāvakayāna error.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 3:48 AM  
Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate  
Content:

seeker242 said:  
It's just a fact that purchasing it supports the violence against animals, Case closed.  
Doesn't matter if you intend for it to or not.

Malcolm wrote:  
Purchasing a carrot also supports violence against animals. Case closed. Doesn't matter if you intend for it to or not.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 3:59 AM  
Title: Re: So sad  
Content:

Genjo Conan said:  
That said, I agree with Johnny that combat sports are not nearly as dangerous as they're usually portrayed. Most training--like, 90+ percent--is about grooving in movement patterns, rather than trying to whomp the other dude. Even competition: a lot of people compete in combat sports, and most people come out of it OK.

Malcolm wrote:  
I have trained in Aikido and a little bit of Taichi.

Aikido came in useful, in defending other people. I never personally needed to use

Aikido to defend myself.

Tai chi, on the other hand, I did not like, or least I did not like the instructor's approach, who insisted on connecting all the movements with a blow and its effects on an opponent. It turned me off to Tai Chi permanently.

Tibetan martial arts are more straight forward: wrestling, archery, and hacking away at enemies with swords. No pretension towards subtlety or art.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:00 AM

Title: Re: vaccine bodhicitta etc

Content:

rai said:

if you accept a 3rd dose of covid vaccine before grandpa in Etiopia get his 1st are you breaking the bodhisattva vow?

...well how about if you are under 40 and get the first dose before grandpa in Haiti...

Crazywisdom said:

A vaccine prevents harm to others which if you catch Covid you can cause harm and death. So based on basic ahimsa one should get the vaccine.

rai said:

it seems the vaccinated are getting infected and transmit the new variants so it is mostly protecting oneself (while having 2 shots when others has none)

Malcolm wrote:

That is not that common, despite the hysteria in the press.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:01 AM

Title: Re: vaccine bodhicitta etc

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

This can be reduced to: If you eat a meal to stay alive in your wealthy home country while people in less prosperous situations are going hungry...

rai said:

you got 2 doses , some still could not get the first one, not good analogy

Malcolm wrote:

Frankly, this is a result of karma, as all inequality is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:35 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

"Karma is intention and what proceeds from intention." I have my karma, a butcher has theirs. There is no magical connection which transfers a butcher's karma to me, no chain of karma, per se, unless I actually order a butcher to slaughter an animal on my behalf, see it butchered on my behalf, or hear of it was butchered on my behalf.

If what you say is true, then every vegetable one consumes is also attended by someone's intention somewhere to produce food and prevent other sentient beings from eating it by killing them, before that food is sent to market for consumption.

Your logic is very faulty from the point of view of karma. If you want to discuss the economics of industrial agriculture, its deleterious environmental impacts, its contribution to climate change, water pollution, soil degradation, and so on, that's a completely different conversation, and one I am happy to have.

KathyLauren said:

No one is suggesting that one person's karma is transferred to another. I am talking only about your karma. You craved meat. Therefore you purchased it. Therefore the store will stock it again in future. Therefore the butcher will kill again in future. That is a chain of actions that you set in motion, intentionally. None of it is incidental or inadvertent. It is your intention that that happen. So it is your karma. No number of middlemen can insulate you from the fact that it is your intention that the killing be carried out.

Malcolm wrote:

No, this represents a gross misunderstanding of karma and its results.

I am not responsible for what a butcher does unless I direct him or her to engage in killing directly. Likewise, even if I see a person killed in front of me, unless I ask for that person to be killed, or approve of the action, it is not my karma.

I don't approve of killing of animals for food, actually. I also think it is wasteful to just dump their carcasses in a landfill.

KathyLauren said:

I am familiar with all the rationalizations that Buddhist carnivores use to pretend that they have no responsibility. None of them are valid. You are responsible.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a rationalization, it's a fact, from a karmic point of view.

I accept responsibility for my participation in the world economy, and I know, for a fact that even if I did not eat meat, not one less animal would die because of my choice, nor



would one more animal die because I eat meat. The fact is that the supply of meat, poultry, etc., outstrips its demand by a considerable and significant margin. There is no "just in time" slaughtering of animals.

KathyLauren said:

No sentient beings are intentionally killed for my vegetables. I grant that some die by accident. That is unfortunate. But unlike the production of meat, it is not intentional.

Malcolm wrote:

You cannot make that argument for produce and grain purchased in a market. Virtually no one, unless they grow and can all their own food can make this claim. Grain production is responsible for the deliberate killing of millions of animals and billions of insects every year, and none of those deaths are accidental, none of the violence wrought upon those creatures is accidental. The principle fertilizer for rice grown in the West is feather meal, etc.

KathyLauren said:

The arguments about environmental degradation, climate change, etc. are valid, but I agree they are not the subject of this discussion. Which is why I did not raise them. You should not either.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, they should be raised, because the argument that there is a karmic burden from eating meat pure in three ways is a faulty.

There are many humanitarian reasons not to eat meat. There are so health reasons not to eat meat. There are many environmental reasons not to eat meat. There are many reasons related to economics and social justice not to eat meat. But there are really no valid reasons not to eat meat that is pure in three ways, when we are confining the conversation to what the Buddha has said on the subject, and masters such as Bhavaviveka.

Buddha did not teach us that a) karma was destiny and b) that liberation was related to our diets.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

It's just a fact that purchasing it supports the violence against animals, Case closed. Doesn't matter if you intend for it to or not.

Malcolm wrote:

Purchasing a carrot also supports violence against animals. Case closed. Doesn't matter if you intend for it to or not.

seeker242 said:

Not nearly as much as purchasing meat does. Case closed.

Malcolm wrote:

Go ahead, rationalize away the violence you are inflicting on animals.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:41 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

Not nearly as much as purchasing meat does. Case closed.

Malcolm wrote:

Go ahead, rationalize away the violence you are inflicting on animals.

seeker242 said:

You mean like you are doing?

Malcolm wrote:

I have not done that. I only pointed out that like you, I am not directly involved in harming any living creature. That's actually the point. You may choose to disagree, but then you have to rationalize your position. I don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:43 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

So you're saying: Please don't proliferate anything new. We have more than we can deal with. And we have no capacity whatsoever to find the common thread that would allow us to integrate any of the old stuff. And we don't want to let anybody study the problem of proliferation because anything new would be considered conceptual, while everything old is considered Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

You don't understand the old stuff. You are a relative newbie. You have not even done any serious retreat.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I don't approve of killing of animals for food, actually.

KathyLauren said:

Your actions indicate otherwise.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually they don't, despite whatever you may choose to believe about my choices.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

And the fact remains, you give more support to animal violence than I do.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually that is not correct. I support no more than do you. Eating meat /= violence against sentient beings, unless you kill them yourself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 5:21 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

And the fact remains, you give more support to animal violence than I do.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually that is not correct. I support no more than do you. Eating meat /= violence against sentient beings, unless you kill them yourself.

seeker242 said:

No, actually that is not correct. Purchasing meat = supporting more violence against

sentient beings than purchasing carrots does. And you don't need to kill them yourself because the animals don't care who is killing them.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it really doesn't. We do not actually have any firm figures for the number of animals and insects that are killed in agriculture, accidentally or otherwise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 5:39 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

Are you saying that anything that might be learnt by attempting this has no possibility value to Buddhism itself. If so, you're the one being presumptive.

Malcolm wrote:

The dharma, as it is said, is good in the beginning, good, in the middle, and good in the end. There is nothing that can be added to it by ordinary people.

JimTempleman said:

There is nothing in that paragraph that says I'm practicing Chan/Zen. I study their texts & practice (my interpretation) of their method.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, this is what is known in Buddhadharma as a personal fabrication.

JimTempleman said:

Fascinating!

"The teachings are not adapted to persons, they are adapted to afflictive profiles and levels of intelligence." So who does the profiling, you or your teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, people meet the dharma that is suited to them, and their teachers, based on roots of virtue cultivated in past lives. Some people have the unfortunate karma to read dharma books and never meet the living dharma.

The whole point of the Dharma is to reverse this cycle of endless, uncontrolled rebirth in the three realms, both for ourselves and for others. If one does not accept rebirth, there is no point in practicing Buddhadharma at all, because one is negating the very point of practicing Buddhadharma to begin with.

I view life & death as a beginnings & endings that takes place at many levels - the beginning & ending of: a thought, an interaction with another person, waking up & going to sleep, etc. That way when I die, if I don't get reincarnated I won't have any regrets.

Negating literal rebirth, etc., is explicitly defined as wrong view by the Buddha. One can certainly be agnostic about it, but if one does not accept that ending rebirth is the central existential goal of the Buddha, one has not understood the Buddha's intention. My question was: how do you keep teachers from every learning to improve what & how they teach. And your answer was that you learn how not to be deceived. Does that mean that once you can no longer be deceived, your teaching is perfect and therefore cannot be improved? Where can I find the list of perfect teachers? Buddhадharma is a lineage, like a seal and its stamp. Buddhадharma cannot be improved, its source was perfect.

You can find many perfect teachers, you just have to decide that you want to study with a teacher, gather merit, and seek them out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 5:41 AM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

seeker242 said:

No, actually that is not correct. Purchasing meat = supporting more violence against sentient beings than purchasing carrots does. And you don't need to kill them yourself because the animals don't care who is killing them.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it really doesn't. We do not actually have any firm figures for the number of animals and insects that are killed in agriculture, accidentally or otherwise.

Arnoud said:

If the Buddha didn't equate killing humans and animals in the karmic sense, wouldn't he have made a distinction between killing mammals and insects? That would make sense to me.

Malcolm wrote:

As for the latter, it does not seem that he did, hence the prohibition against digging in the ground, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 5:42 AM

Title: Re: Collection of Sadhanas & Collection of Tantras

Content:

Schopenhauer said:

I have heard about two empowerments called The Collection of Sadhanas and The Collection of Tantras within the Sakya tradition. From what I have researched, The

Collection of Sadhanas are the collected sadhanas of the Sakya tradition compiled by Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo and Jamyang Loter Wangpo and The Collection of Tantras are the collected tantras of all of the various schools of Tibetan Buddhism also compiled by Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo and Jamyang Loter Wangpo. Beyond that, I haven't been able to find much more about this subject. Does anyone know more about these empowerments? Has anyone received these empowerments, and if so where and by who?

Malcolm wrote:

These take many, many, months to bestow.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 8:56 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This itself indicates you have not understood the truth of dependent origination.

JimTempleman said:

I understand that rather well.

Malcolm wrote:

No, I didn't think you have understood it all.

JimTempleman said:

have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was living among the Kurus. Now, the Kurus have a town named Kammasadhamma. There Ven. Ananda approached the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to the Blessed One, sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to the Blessed One: "It's amazing, lord, it's astounding, how deep this dependent co-arising is, and how deep its appearance, and yet to me it seems as clear as clear can be."

[The Buddha:] "Don't say that, Ananda. Don't say that. Deep is this dependent co-arising, and deep its appearance. It's because of not understanding and not penetrating this Dhamma that this generation is like a tangled skein, a knotted ball of string, like matted rushes and reeds, and does not go beyond transmigration, beyond the planes of deprivation, woe, and bad destinations.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/dn/dn.15.0.than.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 9:21 AM

Title: Re: Re Mipham's Tashi Tsikpa

Content:

pemachophel said:

It is Lhachen/Mahadev, not Chakrasamvara, according to all the commentaries I have seen as well as thangkas and wall frescoes.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's Takkiraja, one of the three red power deities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 6:52 PM

Title: Re: Collection of Sadhanas & Collection of Tantras

Content:

Schopenhauer said:

I have heard about two empowerments called The Collection of Sadhanas and The Collection of Tantras within the Sakya tradition. From what I have researched, The Collection of Sadhanas are the collected sadhanas of the Sakya tradition compiled by Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo and Jamyang Loter Wangpo and The Collection of Tantras are the collected tantras of all of the various schools of Tibetan Buddhism also compiled by Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo and Jamyang Loter Wangpo. Beyond that, I haven't been able to find much more about this subject. Does anyone know more about these empowerments? Has anyone received these empowerments, and if so where and by who?

Malcolm wrote:

These take many, many, months to bestow.

Schopenhauer said:

Are these empowerments regularly (and by regularly I mean at least once or twice a decade) given to lay people then? I can imagine if these empowerments take months, it might be something only given to monastics.

Malcolm wrote:

Lay people attend, but there is usually no or very limited translation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 7:06 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

PeterC said:

If someone wants to offer empowerments received from ChNNr, they can, and it's up to everyone to decide whether they want to receive them from that person or not.

treehuggingoctopus said:

I concur, but, as you know, even this is just a reading of the situation. Many SMS instructors vehemently reject the idea.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, some SMS instructors state that rebirth is false, while others teach that rig pa is a universal consciousness, like brahman. So, really, who cares what they think as a group? It's quite clear many of them really have no clue and are not themselves qualified teachers, despite their certificates.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 7:10 PM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My distaste for boxing began when I was in 7th grade, and some guys in Gym class were hassling me for having long hair (1974). The coach, a major asshole, gave us boxing gloves, and had us fight in front of the whole class. Needless to say, I more or less just kept my head down. It sucked.

tingdzin said:

Barbaric! Was that in Texas by any chance?

Such experiences led me to study martial arts.

Malcolm wrote:

Western Massachusetts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 7:53 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Supramundane said:

I think what some of the members here are trying to convey is that these are very deep concepts that cannot be learned overnight without considerable reflection, study and proper guidance.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. Some of us have been studying and practicing dharma since the mid-eighties, under qualified teachers, and have even gone so far as to become proficient in one or more primary Buddhist languages, as well as earning formal degrees in the subject in Buddhist institutions.

The idea that someone, from books, with no education or training in dharma, can "discover" something overlooked for 2500 years is as preposterous as the notion that a five year old will be able to make any significant contribution to neural net research, let



alone grasp anything more of it than the barest of rudiments. It's actually insulting. Unfortunately, in this intellectual climate, such dilettantism all too common.

So, Jim, just as you would have us respect your expertise in the area in which you earned your PhD, you should respect ours. Frankly, you are still in kindergarten, as far as Dharma is concerned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 7:58 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Tenma said:

Does anyone know the origin of the manta mispronunciation story (the one about the hermit who mispronounces "Om Mani Padme Hum" for years)? I'm trying to look for an academic telling of it or at the very least, the original source it was in.

Thank you!

Malcolm wrote:

No, but you should try to pronounce mantras as close to Sanskrit as you can.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 9:50 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

Shohaku Okumura uses the term "network of interdependent origination" in his book Realizing Genjokoan. He defines it as: The absolute, total, or universal reality of interconnectedness.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not the meaning of the term "pratītyasamutpāda." Dependent origination is not mutual or inter- dependence.

In Buddhadharma, there are three schemes of causation: general causation is covered under the the six causes and the four conditions. One of those causes is called *kāraṇahetu*, which means generative cause, it is also called the dominant condition. What is a generative cause? It means that all things are causes of all other things apart from themselves. It is therefore, not an efficient cause, but rather, a formal cause. You can read about these six causes and four conditions in Abhidharma.

The next causal scheme is dependent origination. The Buddha taught that dependent origination does not apply to inanimate things, only to living beings. The general theory is "Where that exists, then this exists. From the arising of that, this arises." The specific

theory is the twelve limbs, which have four presentations: static, serial, momentary, simultaneous.

The final theory of causation is karma and its results.

JimTempleman said:

Interdependent co-arising seem to be the enormous 'living root' that affords non-dual awareness.

Malcolm wrote:

Nondual is quite buzzword these days. Most people, including you, do not understand what the term "advaya" means in Buddhadharma. Now there is a connection between dependent origination and nonduality in Buddhadharma, but it has nothing to do with nondual awareness, because there is no such thing.

JimTempleman said:

Turns out that most respondents don't want to touch its content with a hundred foot pole.

Malcolm wrote:

If someone wrote a post on neural net theory, which was predicated on insufficient learning, would you "touch its contents," or would you tell that person to go to school and get it right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

Supramundane said:

When I was a young monk, I practiced Chan Buddhism by myself in a graveyard for ten years and later in a mountain cave for an additional two years. I did not have a teacher to guide me, but—propelled by devotion—I followed a method of practice that Bodhisattva Guanyin, also known as Avalokiteshvara, teaches in the Śurangāma Sutra. This method, called Perfect Penetration through Hearing, relies not on any words or concepts but on listening to silence.

[https://wikkorg.wordpress.com/2021/07/08/listening-to-silence /](https://wikkorg.wordpress.com/2021/07/08/listening-to-silence/)

He was ordained as a novice monk in 1973 at the age of 25 under Venerable Master Hsing Yun at Fo Guang Shan, and entered Tsung Lin Buddhist College at the same time.[2] The next year, he went to a mountainous area of Taipei city, Waishuanghsi(外雙溪), and meditated there for over eighteen hours a day.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hsin\\_Tao](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hsin_Tao)

So, had teachers and certainly some instructions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

All I am saying is that the decision of any student of ChNN to start teaching will be inevitably contested (and it will get ugly in no time).

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone who was a student of ChNN is a lineage holder. He made this clear in so many teachings. The fact that some people rely on a letter written in 2014 that ChNN was strongly pressured to write in a moment of institutional anxiety as a result of his serious illness in Brazil in 2010, is well, sad.

The situation in the DC is clear. The DC is for direct students of ChNN only. That has no bearing on the continuation of the teachings that ChNN disseminated to the world.

treehuggingoctopus said:

PS. SMS instructors denying rebirth (and thus throwing Precious Vase to the dustbin). Rich and strange, this world is.

Malcolm wrote:

It takes all kinds.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 8th, 2021 at 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Re Mipham's Tashi Tsikpa

Content:

pemachophel said:

I've seen a couple of different renderings in English of the line that goes:

DEM-CHOG DOD-PAI GYAL-PO DE-CHEN-TER

Does this line refer only to Chakrasamvara and His attributes, i.e., "King of Desire, Treasure of Great Bliss," or does it enumerate Chakrasamvara, Takkiraja, and another Deity named Treasure of Great Bliss? If it's the latter, does anyone know Who the Treasure of Great Bliss is? A quick Google search turned up nothing.

Thanks.

SilenceMonkey said:

I'm looking at a prayerbook compiled and edited by Namchak Khen Rinpoche of Ewam. His translation is:

"Sangwa Yeshe Vajravarahi; Chakrasamvara, King of Desire; Treasure of Great Bliss;"

It seems that "Treasure of Great Bliss" is a separate deity. There is a note saying this refers to Shiva.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a commentary on this by rme sprul bstan 'dzin rgya mtsho, a student of Khenpo Jikphun.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:01 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

Subjective matters are always at least 10x more difficult to gauge. (& I've done a lot of 'usability' testing).

I cannot fault you're responses to me. It's clear that you're giving me what you believe I need to hear. I thank you for that. I wish you the best in your studies.

Malcolm wrote:

These things are not subjective.

Dhyāna/samādhi/samapatti states, in Buddhadharma, are defined by specific mental factors which arise in predictable and repeatable fashions.

These things are discussed in Abhidharma, which concerns the first principles upon which Mahāyāna exegesis, including Chan/Zen are predicated.

The observation of the arising, abiding, and passing away of concepts in the mind is an instruction for beginners in every school of Mahāyāna Buddhism, at least those that actually engage in the cultivation of śamatha and vipaśyanā.

Further, there are many manuals, such as Asanga's text on śamatha, Kamalashila's manuals on cultivation and so on, as well as a very influential set of meditation manuals, which had great influence on people like Dogen, etc., by the fifth century Chinese master Chih-I. You should study them (which a teacher).

Buddhism has an extremely rich literature on contemplative phenomenology, if you will, a literature that most people have no access to, because most of it is still locked away in Sanskrit, Pali, Tibetan, Chinese, and Japanese. Further, all of the great masters spent years mastering these curriculums, combining their study with practice. This is why your

post and subsequent remarks have met with general incredulity. You are simply out of your depth here.

Since you are a modern, educated person, you have the Western attitude that somehow these pre-modern systems, which are not based on a modern medical understanding of anatomy and physiology, need to be helped in some way, an attitude that is frankly mere cultural chauvinism, not grounded in any facts. For example, while in Tibetan medicine they did not recognize things such as neurons, etc., they certainly were aware of circulation, the connection between the brain, sense organs, and the functions of limbs and organs in the body via nerves, since at least the 10th century (they dealt with a lot of traumatic injuries from warfare, and their methods of diagnosing organ and brain damage from traumatic injuries are remarkable and accurate). One of the consequences of this attitude is that you feel, based on a couple of short, classical texts, that you have somehow grasped the entirety of Buddhadharma and are now in a position to offer your esteemed opinion on such matters, arrogating to yourself the position of having discovered "a brand new method of using the the 4NT as a skillful means." You haven't discovered anything new.

Even more ridiculous, you somehow insist that if your English phraseology is not found in classical texts, somehow this validates your so-called "discovery," as if all this is merely an exercise in creating a computational algorithm based on your conceptual observation of rising, abiding, and passing away of thoughts. You certainly do not know how to do meditation according to Buddhist instructions. You do not know how eliminate lethargy, nor avoid agitation, and a hundred other flaws and obstacles one confronts in meditation. You are talking to people, who in some cases, have spent years in solitary retreats practicing between 10-12 hours a day for extended periods of time.

So you must forgive us for finding your tone hubristic and arrogant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The story I heard was about a Nyingma Vajrakilaya yogi who said Chili Chilaya and because of faith could pass his phurba thru solid rock.. And he ran into Sakya Sapan who corrected his pronunciation saying he should say it closest to Sanskrit Kili Kilaya. After he had doubt and lost his Siddhi. Then he went back to saying it his way and got his faith and power back. The moral of the story is that faith is the more important factor than technical accuracy.

Tata1 said:

Yes Chnn told that story all the time and advice to pronounce the mantras how you received them

Malcolm wrote:

There is two schools of thought about this. I prefer Sakya Pandita's advice on this issue. He says that while one may achieve results though mispronounced mantras, if one has sincere faith, even so the result will be much slower. If you pronounce them clear and correctly, the result will be faster.

Some lamas insist that you have to pronounce mantras the way they are received, but this makes no logical sense at all. Why? Because someone did not correctly pronounce the mantra they received from the original Indian master who introduced them to the mantra.

The Chilli Chilaya story never happened. It also makes no sense. There is a similar story about the Fifth Dalai Lama who saw an old lady from his window doing korwa around a stupa. She also had an umbrella of light over her head. So he disguised himself and went to ask her what her practice was. She said "Kalacakra." He asked how she was pronouncing that mantra, and it was wrong. So he corrected her, and the next day he saw that her umbrella had disappeared, so he ran down and told her that he made an error, etc. you get the drift. This is also just an excuse Tibetans make for poor pronunciation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

This is the kind of talk that i dont find helpful at all. Talking about sms instructors(or any other person for that matter) with no name and criticising them because of things the supposedly said or believe.

Malcolm wrote:

These are real things real SMS instructors have said subsequent to Rinpoche's passing. Naming names won't help anyone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

PeterC said:

And by insisting that absolutely nobody is qualified to give any empowements, it seems they think the right answer is for all of his own termas to die out.

Malcolm wrote:

Not just his own dream transmissions, his own lineage for every empowerment and reading transmission he ever gave as well. That is a huge body of work.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:42 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

This doesn't solve the root problem...

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, you said it, and that is what is being discussed. That does not diminish the DC's present activities. But people in the DC are getting old. Time is passing, and we are living in time, as CHNN said over and over and over again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Tata1 said:

I prefer to follow Chnn advice on this one. Makes more sense to me

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we are all free to follow whatever advice we like.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Tenma said:

Does anyone know the origin of the manta mispronunciation story (the one about the hermit who mispronounces "Om Mani Padme Hum" for years)? I'm trying to look for an academic telling of it or at the very least, the original source it was in.

Thank you!

Malcolm wrote:

No, but you should try to pronounce mantras as close to Sanskrit as you can.

nightbloom said:

This has always made sense to me, e.g, svAhA instead of Soha. Padme instead of pay-may, and so on. Question is whether this can be considered a slight against one's guru.

Malcolm wrote:

It's never a slight against one's teacher to correctly practice the Dharma. It says in no sūtra or tantra anywhere that there is a penalty for correctly pronouncing mantras. There are statements concerning mumbling, not reciting clearly, and so on.

Tibetans cannot pronounce, without retraining, the syllble ṣa in the middle of a mantra. They cannot make that sound, thus bhaiṣajya, always is pronounced bhekhenze, aṣṭa is also akha, etc. Most of these errors come from Tibetans reading transcriptions of Sanskrit, but relying on the Tibetan pronunciations of ཅ་ཆ་ཇ་ཏ་, which are used to represent ca, cha, ja, and ṣa. Sounds English speakers generally have trouble with are ṛi, ḷi, ṭa, ṭha, ḍa, ṇa, and ṣa. Also Tibetan regularly confuse འ when it is used for va, rather than ba, since in texts often Tibetan transcriptions do not use the full འ་, but short hand, འ, leading to pronunciations such as badzra for vajra, etc., or in extreme cases benzar. We and Tibetans also have a hard time with long and short vowels, a and ā, for example.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 1:54 AM

Title: Re: The Noble Truths as Skillful Means

Content:

JimTempleman said:

All I meant by 'subjective' here is that no one except a highly trained teacher or a Bodhisattva can know what another person's mental state is.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, correct, and part of that training is learning how to discover these mental factors that are associated with contemplative states experientially, so one can guide others. While it is not rocket science, it is knowledge that is earned with a lot of sweat equity and guidance from qualified people, like Meido, and so on. I have heard good things about Guo Gu as well. There are a number of Korean Son centers out there as well.

I am a Tibetan Buddhist, so, I am not that familiar with the Chan/Zen/Son scene in the US.

But the basic principles are the same: find a teacher, rely on their guidance, do as much retreat as one's life will permit; most importantly, be humble. Buddhadharma is so vast, no one can master it all. But that is not necessary, all one has to do is stick with one qualified practice in a qualified lineage under the guidance of a qualified teacher/s, and then one will generate true bodhicitta, overcome one's afflictions, understand emptiness, and rouse great compassion for all sentient beings, with a bit of concerted effort and study. When all this is complete, one can say one is really on the Mahāyāna path of liberation

My advice, especially with Zen and Chan, is that there are a lot of fools out there



pretending to be internet Zen masters, teachers of "Nonduality" and so on, who are really just bolstering their own egos and lining their pockets. Avoid them like you would avoid sleeping with someone who has syphilis. Not everyone with a book published by Wisdom or Shambhala is really a qualified teacher. So be careful who you choose as a mentor.

JimTempleman said:

Please forgive me if I came across that way.

I respect the path you are on & thank you for your advice.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. Please take our collective advice to heart. In this life, at this moment, you are a beginner, please begin to act like one.

You are welcome.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 8:57 AM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

KristenM said:

Have you seen the movie "Fighting with my Family"? It's about WWE wrestling so not exactly the same thing but it's actually a very funny and endearing movie, imo. Much better than I thought it would be. I didn't mean to sound like I was belittling the poor or anyone who boxes, sorry if that is how it came across.

Malcolm wrote:

Young Rock is kind of fun, if you are bored.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 8:59 AM

Title: Re: Collection of Sadhanas & Collection of Tantras

Content:

Schopenhauer said:

Are these empowerments regularly (and by regularly I mean at least once or twice a decade) given to lay people then? I can imagine if these empowerments take months, it might be something only given to monastics.

Malcolm wrote:

Lay people attend, but there is usually no or very limited translation.

Schopenhauer said:

Do you know how often these empowerments are given and by who?

Malcolm wrote:

About once a decade or so, by whoever is the Sakya Trizin, or the head of Ngor, or Tshar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 7:22 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, but you should try to pronounce mantras as close to Sanskrit as you can.

biryani said:

This might seem like a silly question, but what about the seven line prayer? Since it's in Tibetan, should the last line be pronounced as Tibetans do or should it be Guru Padma siddhi hum?

Thank you!

Malcolm wrote:

Padma, IMO.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 7:27 PM

Title: Re: So sad

Content:

KristenM said:

Have you seen the movie "Fighting with my Family"? It's about WWE wrestling so not exactly the same thing but it's actually a very funny and endearing movie, imo. Much better than I thought it would be. I didn't mean to sound like I was belittling the poor or anyone who boxes, sorry if that is how it came across.

Malcolm wrote:

Young Rock is kind of fun, if you are bored.

KristenM said:

I'll look into it. The Rock has that particular talent where he always plays himself and it works, so darn likeable.

Malcolm wrote:

It's an impromptu history of pro wrestling from the 70's onwards. It's also predicated on the idea of The Rock running for president in 2030 (entirely plausible). He spares himself no humiliation, BTW.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 7:34 PM

Title: Re: is hayagriva a dharmapala

Content:

tingdzin said:

A few scholars like Karmay and Davidson have attempted to sort out the Indrabhuti stuff, which varies widely from source to source, even within the Nyingmapa, so a lot of different conclusions can be drawn if you rely on that alone..

Malcolm wrote:

It's pretty clear that Indrabhuti was unknown to Tibetans prior to the mid 10th century. I will be discussing the three Indrabhutis in Sakya sources in my forthcoming translation of the gdams sngags mdzod, vol 6. When I consolidate my reasearch on it for the intro, I will drop it on the fora.

Thus, even Nyingma depends on gsar ma sources for everything they know about this figure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I know well-schooled buddhists who say they don't believe in reincarnation.

Harimoo said:

Then they are suffering from wrong view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Harimoo said:

If by reincarnation, they mean reincarnation as it is understood by theosophists, I don't think so.

Malcolm wrote:

If they deny rebirth, the continuation of a series of aggregate from this life to the next, then yes; if they merely negate an atman that takes rebirth, than no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

NYT quiz - if there were six political parties in the US, based on your views, which one would you likely belong to?

<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2021/09/08/opinion/republicans-democrats-parties.html?smid=url-share>

I would be on the socially liberal end of the Labor Party, which sounds about right.

Malcolm wrote:

Progressive Party, of course. As far to the left as you can go, but not all the way down in the left hand corner.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 9:37 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Some mantras like terma mantras came originally in Tibetan pronunciation. So like in Dorje Drolo there's not much choice. It's Tibetan style. I don't think the Sanskrit transliteration will work.

Malcolm wrote:

According to Situ Panchen, the Drollo mantra is actually "Apabrahmsa." There is an established tradition that the dro wo lod is a corruption of khro dalokottara. However, the mantra is as it is.

There are some mantras, like Black Mañjuśrī, which are clearly not all Sanskrit, same for the Kilaya "razor mantra." Especially in protector practices there are a lot of mantras that are mixed Sanskrit and Tibetan. Believe it or not, Dilgo Khyentse advised the Vajradhātu translators to translate the Tibetan words into English and recite those with English mixed with Sanskrit. Black Mañjuśrī has "snying mgo la chod" in the mantra meaning "sever the heart and head." Imagine handing that out to beginners.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I agree with Malcolm it's better to pronounce the mantra correctly from the beginning. The lesson is not that one should pronounce them how you received them but to recite mantra with faith and confidence, free from doubt.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is an important point. That's why even Sapan allowed that mantra recited with full confidence and devotion, even if a bit wrong, would be effective.

The Chilli Chilaya story is just a bit of Nyingma butt hurt meant to denigrate Sapan's text, "How to pronounce Mantras" in his collected works. In that text he also covers Sanskrit regional pronunciations. The man had 30 Indian pandita tutors and spoke fluent Sanskrit, despite having never visited India. He was more Indian than Tibetan. Since Sapan was quite famous even in India, six tirthika panditas came to Tibet to debate him and lost,. He was also extremely handsome and charismatic, leading to no small amount of jealousy on the part of his detractors.

Gyalpo Rinpoche told me that the Drikung War with Sakya was entirely Drikung's fault. What he shared with me was that someone misheard Sapan talking about Jigten Sumgon, for whom Sapan had tremendous respect, even though there were points of disagreement. This man went back to Drikung and spread a false rumor that Sapan was slandering Jigten Sumgon. The rest is history.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 9:53 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Harimoo said:

the instructors who teach yantra yoga with wicca BS

treehuggingoctopus said:

"Wicca BS" is a tad offensive, you know.

Offensiveness aside: Wicca and YY, who would have guessed.

Malcolm wrote:

What I really want to know is whether or not they are practicing Yantra naked in the woods at night on full moons, Beltane, Samhain, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 9:55 PM

Title: Re: The Serious Curriculum

Content:

mutusuk said:

Malcolm wrote elsewhere:

You may notice that Bonpos do not teach their serious curriculum of Madhyamaka, Abhidharma, etc.

You have to put that into context. What Malcolm meant is that Bönpos do not give these teachings to Westerners.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that is what I meant. Not that these Bon curricula are not taught in Bon academies in India, Nepal, and Tibet.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: The Serious Curriculum

Content:

mutsuk said:

In Menri, there were throughout history teachers who would be doubtful about Dzogchen. For instance, the current Lopon Trinley Nyima had a philosophy teachers (Madhyamaka, and so forth) who would not accept Dzogchen as genuine. This is a bit extreme, sure, but not unheard of...

Sādhaka said:

Well that's interesting.

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps they were Bon Geshees who also trained at Geluk monasteries, where Dzogchen doubt is high.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Toenail said:

Is it okay to have sex with someone's partner, if they are in an open relationship? Or does it break the sexual misconduct lay vow? I feel like the essence of this vow is not to destroy relationships and causing someone to cheat, no?

Malcolm wrote:

The point of the vow with respect to others partners is developing a trustworthy character and being immune to grudges.

Personally, I would never sleep with someone in an "open relationship." It's just asking for trouble.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I will never vote for regressive, destructive woke nonsense.

Malcolm wrote:

"Wokeness" is just a meme pushed by Fox News as a dog whistle for racists, both consciousness and unconsciousness.

However the term "woke" has a venerable history in black community in the US, dating the 1930's:

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Woke>

"I advise everybody, be a little careful when they go along through there – best stay woke, keep their eyes open."

--Scottsboro Boys, Leadbelly

I will certainly use the term, just like the term "Yankee" for New Englanders, which came originally from a satiric song originally sung by the Redcoats, Yankee Doodle Dandy. Much to the chagrin of the British troops it was adopted as a marching song by the Continental Army, rather in the same way Trumpsters flocked to Clinton's disastrous appellation for them, "deplorables."

To the tune of Turn the Beat Around:

Turn the meme around  
Love to hear repercussions  
Turn it upside down  
Love to hear repercussions  
Love to hear it...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Origin of the Mantra Mispronunciation Story?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

That war story is really a shame

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Tibetan politics are brutal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 10:56 PM

Title: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=597342#p597342>

Nightbloom stated:

In accordance with Bodhicitta, I've refused vaccination entirely. My reasoning is as follows: The dangers posed by the virus are lesser than those posed by the re-construction of public life around medical security...

This is an entirely bogus argument. SCOTUS ruled in 1905 that people have an obligation to be vaccinated if the government decided that in public health emergencies, based on science, that vaccine mandates were entirely warranted despite individual objections.

Get vaccinated, save someone's life. If you don't, your invocation of bodhicitta is a complete and utter joke.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I oppose vaccine passports on civil liberties grounds,

Malcolm wrote:

You've already lost that battle in court. Just sayin...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: The Serious Curriculum

Content:

mutsum said:

Yes, that's a good point. But there are some counter examples.

Malcolm wrote:

I did not mean that every Bon geshe who studied with Geluks would have this attitude, only some.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 9th, 2021 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I oppose vaccine passports on civil liberties grounds,

Malcolm wrote:

You've already lost that battle in court. Just sayin...

Johnny Dangerous said:

According to what?

Malcolm wrote:

SCOTUS. How to you think Cambridge, MA knew who had been vaccinated and who hadn't? The state has an absolute right to identify and record those people who have been vaccinated and those who have not, and enforce quarantines on those who have not been vaccinated by any means deemed necessary, including vaccine "passports." It's really no different than issuing driver's licenses. You don't object to driver's licenses based on civil liberties grounds, do you? You certainly do not want unlicensed drivers with no insurance on the roads, correct? It has been a long standing practice in the US that you would have to carry with you a record of vaccinations to travel abroad.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 12:01 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I would like to see sunset provisions and limitations put on them, but I agree they are clearly happening to one degree or another.

Malcolm wrote:

Try getting your kid into a Florida school without having a record of all their vaccinations available. There is no difference. It's the same thing. People just don't like the word "passport."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

'Papers please' for daily movement and activities is not ok.

Malcolm wrote:

During a pandemic, it certainly is.

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, what you are talking about is not what I am talking about. Read up the position of the ACLU or the EFF on them if you want to know more. It's obvious you haven't looked at the issue in detail, and assume I am talking about the standard practice of vaccination proof being required for school, international travel, etc. I'm not, and neither are the civil liberties orgs concerned with them.

Malcolm wrote:

I would not go to a restaurant these days that did not insist on proof of vaccination. I do not want to be the 1 in 5000 vaccinated people who get a breakthrough infection. I know people who have had breakthrough infections, and they suck. You know this too. People's daily movements are not as important as getting this pandemic under control. You may have a different opinion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Zazen and emptiness

Content:

Rick said:

Is zazen emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

The real question is, is there anything that isn't?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 3:29 AM

Title: Re: Zazen and emptiness

Content:

Rick said:

Tathata?

Dogen said zazen is enlightenment. Would he also have said zazen is emptiness?

Is the act of doing zazen (correctly) as close as one can get to 'doing'/embodying emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

Tathāta = śūnyatā. They are synonyms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 3:36 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Hi Bob:

oldbob said:

One way would be to bring in a recognized Dzogchen Master, (or Masters) from another Dzogchen lineage(s) to give DI and read the Tibetan texts for the Lung Permissions.

Malcolm wrote:

This has been suggested and already discarded.

oldbob said:

This was performed by ChNN many times. Recordings of this are available, or it also would be possible to have a senior student lead the practice.

Malcolm wrote:

Rinpoche stated innumerable times that one could not receive direct introduction from a recording.

oldbob said:

If someone says they have received permission from ChNN in a dream to have access to read and practice all of his Teachings, who can counter this? Then no one can stop someone else from having access to all the Teachings.

Malcolm wrote:

No one will believe them.

oldbob said:

If it was also allowed to have the transmission of the Lung readings from the recordings of ChNNR,

Malcolm wrote:

Rinpoche also said countless times, "No lungs from recordings."

oldbob said:

The key point is that there needs to be a way forward – now – that allows for a continuation of the Transmission Lineage through easy and regular Direct introductions, and Lung Reading Authorizations, combined with easy access to lineage holders and teaching materials.

Malcolm wrote:

I personally think the only way forward is for Adriano to accept responsibility for giving transmissions and empowerments, especially of the Longsal teachings. I have personally told him this. I think he is the most qualified person to do so.

That's my 2 cents.

M

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 3:37 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I also think that he probably sees things with precedent - mandates from employers and schools for example- as some sort of overreach.

I don't,

Malcolm wrote:

Good, since these things are supported in the 1922 SCOTUS decision about vaccinating schoolchildren.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 3:39 AM

Title: Re: Re Mipham's Tashi Tsikpa

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

Refers to Chakrasamvara according to Orgyen Tobgyal Rinpoche.

Malcolm wrote:

Takkirāja is a form of Cakrasamvara. Surprise, surprise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Zazen and emptiness

Content:

Rick said:

I didn't know that!

What about the other part:

Is "Zazen is enlightenment" (more or less) the same as "Zazen is emptiness?" Or am I

making a categorical error?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no awakening sans realizing emptiness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Zazen and emptiness

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

[ Or would they still say Tathata = Sunyata?

Malcolm wrote:

They would still say tathatā is śūnyatā because it is devoid of everything that is not a quality of buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 7:38 PM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Interesting, Manwon and Peter C^.

I've actually been talking about this topic in my personal life today; and also about Coptic Christianity as well, believe it or not.

Probably just 'coincidence' though

PeterC said:

My general theory on this is that, to put it bluntly, use of hallucinogenic drugs makes you in some way temporarily stupid, such that ordinary things seem profound. If you take drugs with the hope of having a profound experience, and your mind is saying "look here, this seems profound", then you will choose to convince yourself that it really is profound. We are exceptionally good at persuading ourselves, particularly when we don't realize that's what we're doing. People see what they want to see.

Malcolm wrote:

A friend called me up recently, all excited because as he had taken a variant of DMT and he had remembered countless past lives...when I asked him who he had been in his past life, after ribbing him about his past life as Cleopatra, he sheepishly admitted he could not remember any of them...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Here's a handy cheat-sheet on the latest IPCC report -

<https://www.climatecouncil.org.au/resources/what-does-ipcc-latest-report-mean/>

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

My short term transition strategy:

<https://www.ford.com/trucks/f150/f150-lightning/2022/>

And it can run my house for three days in a blackout....without a diesel generator...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Lazy Lubber said:

Why? Say a monk has sex with one woman seeking a deluded merit by having sex with a monk, similar to a rock star groupie. Then as a layman, this ex-monk starts sleeping with prostitutes or whoever he can sleep with. Surely, he causes more harm to himself outside of the Sangha.

Malcolm wrote:

I wonder than, what you make of the Mahāsiddha Virūpa...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 10th, 2021 at 10:13 PM

Title: Re: Simhamukha

Content:

Lobsang Chojor said:

I recently received the jenang of the Lion Faced Dakini (Simhamukha) coming from Bari Lotsawa to Chogye Trichen Rinpoche and then my guru.

I was wondering if there are any resources on the deity, the practice or the history available?

Malcolm wrote:

From the text

Lobsang Chojor said:

When Bari Lotsawa was in Nepal, he debated the tīrthika Bhavyarāja. Since he was defeated Bhavyarāja, the latter became angry and said, "You will die in seven days through a maledictory mantra!"

The Lotsawa scoffed. The tīrthika said, "You must abandon your deity, the Three Jewels, and convert to doctrine and burn your text with the golden wrap in the fire."

Bari Lotsawa said, "This life is impermanent and short, won't enter your doctrine, nor will I abandon the deity, the Three Jewels"

In order to force Bari's death, the tīrthika said, "You will exhibit death in seven days."

Bari scoffed again and reported this story to his guru, Vajrāsanapāda. Vajrāsanapāda said, "I have a method. Make offerings to the Three Jewels, and prepare a feast offering for the ḍākinīs and supplicate them!" Ha

Having been foretold that the ḍākinīs would come, Bari carried out the instruction, and at midnight, Ḍākinī Siṃhamukha, with the eye of gnosis, arrived in the sky in front of him, in the center of a fire. She said "There is no need to scoff, underneath a boulder shaped like a yak at Vajrāsana, there is the so-called "wealth practice of all the ḍākinīs", also called "a longevity practice," and called "a repelling rite for repelling the mighty and powerful," the supreme protection against weapons and the crusher of enemies. If there is a mandala, it will free from the destruction of the evil māras. It assists in protection from all gods and demons. It will cause those who use mantras of power and malediction to vomit blood. It will prevent harm from poison and weapons. One cannot be harmed even by the practice of a thousand mantras. Since one will sleep happily, it is enough. Since it is an instruction that is auspicious and effective, take it out and promulgate in a single lineage. One should not engage in the meditation and recitation for more than a week. If one practices without breaks and without speaking, the signs will come." The she vanished.

The lotsawa went to that place, and there was such a boulder, and under the boulder, there was a golden box. In that box was the heart essence of ten million ḍākinīs written on red silk. When Bari removed that, a great apparition appeared. Bari wrote that down in gold letters and wore it on his body. Since he recited the mantra for seven days. the tīrthika vomited blood and died.

Having heard that the tīrthika died, he related the story to Guru Vajrāsanapāda. The Guru said, "You didn't die, but if he hadn't died, it would have been better. It is not correct to slay tīrthikas, even though they have entered an errant path. It would have been sufficient for you to merely wear the mantra on your body. The disciple did not really listen to the guru. Since you recited the mantra, he died. Since you have to purify this misdeed, you should sponsor some teachings."

Malcolm wrote:

There you have it. This is the origin story of Siṃhamukha practice in Bari Lotsawa's lineage, according to the Sakya Thirteen Golden Dharmas, which is the tradition you

received as written by Namkhai Palzang in the sgrub thabs kung btus. This is from the text your lama probably used. There is a slightly longer story set down by Tsharchen with more details at the beginning of the cycle. It looks like the account Khyentse Wangpo received and was set down in the Rinchen Terzod garbles some details present in Tsarchen's account.

There are also minor differences between the account above and Tsarchen's such as there being several boxes, one of agate, one made of "rhinoceros hide," one made of bodhitree wood, one made of silver, one made of gold, one made of turquoise, one made of sapphire, and one made of ruby, one inside the other other.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 11th, 2021 at 2:39 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I had the same attitude. But things vary by region and generation. I've spoken with many people in Brazil about this and especially the young people are very comfortable with this sort of relationship, as it's become normal.

Malcolm wrote:

Promiscuity is common when one is young and cute. One's 20's are for f&^king.

Crazywisdom said:

I'll note I've observed the reason why jealousy and possessiveness doesn't seem to come into play is sexuality is very very casual and has no meaning beyond a physical release. Folks take friendships more seriously instead. Also it is not common for young people here to want to become apaixonados, to fall passionately in love. They don't want anything serious and want to keep things light and detached.

Malcolm wrote:

It was the same when I was young.

Crazywisdom said:

For me it was like listening to aliens talk about relationships. But it's strangeness make me key in, ask questions and listen. I've come away from it with mixed feelings. On the one hand no seems sincerely interested in anyone except themselves.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you said young people.

Still, if someone is stepping out on their partner, open relationship or not, well...



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 11th, 2021 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Giovanni said:

When William James experimented with Nitrous Oxide he became convinced that he had discovered the Secret Of The Universe.

He wrote it down so he wouldn't forget. The next day he read what he had written, it said

"Hogamus higamus man is polygamous.

Higamous hogamous woman monogamous."

Malcolm wrote:

Well, nitrous does get you high along with destroying brain cells...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 11th, 2021 at 8:25 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Messages Image(353694953).png (999.75 KiB) Viewed 188 times

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 11th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Toenail said:

I was looking for dharma advice, not moral advice etc. Is it really against the sexual misconduct vow if both consent?

Malcolm wrote:

I was not giving either dharma or moral advice, I was giving common sense advice. Of course, then there is the question of whether one is sleeping with a non-practitioner or not. It's technically just a branch downfall, if it is just ordinary sex. It's a root downfall, if you are visualizing them as your consort.

I personally still think it is a bad idea, but if both partners are in agreement and the person you are sleeping with has told the other person of their intention to sleep with you, no problem. Just make sure you wear your party hat.

I have however seen situations where one person thinks they are in a monogamous relationship, and the partner who wants to step outside the relationship claims to the new love interest they are in an open relationship. Now, this is not a case of sexual misconduct on your part, because you were misled, but it is sexual misconduct on their part. Sexual misconduct includes "adultery" in its non-legal sense, that is, when a

person screws around on someone with whom they have a monogamous commitment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 11th, 2021 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Ngondro Out of Order?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The Nyingmapas I know do the prayers for all the practices each session. However they can accumulate whatever they want of each section. For instance they can, in a single session, accumulate 100 prostrations, 300 Vajrasattva, zero Mandalas, and 200 Guru Yogas. But they have to total 111k for each for them to finish.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends. 100k is just a nice round number.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Lazy Lubber said:

Why? Say a monk has sex with one woman seeking a deluded merit by having sex with a monk, similar to a rock star groupie. Then as a layman, this ex-monk starts sleeping with prostitutes or whoever he can sleep with. Surely, he causes more harm to himself outside of the Sangha.

Malcolm wrote:

I wonder then, what you make of the Mahāsiddha Virūpa...

Crazywisdom said:

Many samaya downfalls?

Malcolm wrote:

I think he has the siddha exclusion clause for samaya violations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Sādhaka said:

(of course the lower is always subsumed within the higher, and also always within context)

Malcolm wrote:

So I guess libertarianism is basically at the śrāvaka level, politically speaking.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 4:27 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Heimdall said:

Also, traditionally speaking, afaia, in Tibetan Buddhism, any non-procreative sex was sexual misconduct for centuries.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm...no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:00 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Do you have a quote on this samaya? I cannot find any details about sexual activity samaya.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhist Ethics, page 261; the 7th root downfall, disclosing secrets. This includes using a partner who has not taken empowerment (first branch downfall) to practice actual karmamudra with them (since it is an explicit secret mantra ritual procedure).

Buddhist Ethics, page 265; the first branch downfall, to rely on a consort who lacks samaya, has broken samaya, etc.

In West, it is a lonely world for the single, lay Vajrayāna practitioner.

At best, if one's partner is not a Vajrayāni, one's practice will really never get anywhere and one will have obstacles. And if one tries to practice actual karmamudra with them, performing the creation and completion stage with them as required, it is a root downfall. I don't think 21 Vajrasattvas a day will keep Yama away in that case.

This is why the Tantras such as Hevajra and so on, have instructions on how to train a suitable mudra step by step. Mudra practice also exists in seventeen tantras, so there is no easy out there either.

Crazywisdom said:

But this is about karmamudra. Just having sex isn't relying on a consort.

Malcolm wrote:

No, its not just about karma mudra. Read the book. However you free to interpret it anyway you like. I know how it is understood in the traditional context. We are not

supposed to engage in these behaviors with ordinary desire, that's covered under the eight special samayas of mother tantra. That's also discussed in the Kongtrul book.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:04 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Perhaps shouting "theater" in a crowded fire (hijacking the thread with wit or scholarship) is not appropriate in a time like this where timely action on the part of Members of the IDC might avert calamity.

Malcolm wrote:

All your concerns are quite valid, Bob. There are some obvious obstacles to all your suggestions. I have had convos with people at the highest levels of the DC hierarchy about these very issues. It's a frustrating set of issues. They are also frustrated and making the best of a very uncertain situation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:22 PM

Title: Re: 8 Great Charnel Grounds

Content:

nightbloom said:

Anybody know of any good visual representations of these? Especially in the context of a mandala (Kurukulla's preferably)? Would be very helpful.

Malcolm wrote:

They are standard, though the names vary from sadhana to sadhana, but their features are the same in all mandalas and should not be discussed here, since their meaning is very profound.

You can see representations of them at Himalayan Art.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

Now people seem to think DC is the enemy as if they are guilty for the situation.

Malcolm wrote:

No, no one thinks this.

But Rinpoche left no instructions about how the DC was going to continue if, as seems to be the case, his physical heirs had no interest in continuing the DC.

So, at this point, the DC, while quite active at present, is moribund.

But its ok. There are hundreds of tertons who left huge collections of treasures that are no longer practice by anyone, anywhere, anymore. Only dribs and drabs of this and that are practiced. Bits and pieces.

There is more than enough teachings out there to bring the whole world to liberation, even if no more sadhanas, tantras, etc. were ever revealed.

The DC is now closed. That's just a fact.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:45 PM

Title: Re: 8 Great Charnel Grounds

Content:

nightbloom said:

Anybody know of any good visual representations of these? Especially in the context of a mandala (Kurukulla's preferably)? Would be very helpful.

zerwe said:

There is a representation as a visual/learning aid where each are isolated or fragmented individually and discussed. This is available on Yamantaka.org or on the previous iteration of that particular site.

Shaun

Malcolm wrote:

You would have to have had an Vajrabhairava empowerment to access that site.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Buddhist morality

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Interesting articles - thanks - but they don't support the prevalence of feuds so much as inter-community conflict or warfare.

Attack the next village, kill all the men and boys, take the women as slaves or wives, take all their food and land - standard operating procedure for a depressingly long segment of human history.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Kim,

The pastoralists who did so were all patrilineal clans. This corresponds very neatly with Maria Gimbutas' Kurgan hypothesis:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kurgan\\_hypothesis](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kurgan_hypothesis)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Soul with unfulfilled desires

Content:

firewheel said:

Hi Members,

According to the Buddhist scriptures, what happens to the soul if a person passes away with unfulfilled desires?

Will the soul get to be reborn again as a human to fulfill his desires?

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

According to Buddhist scriptures, there is no soul at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

KristenM said:

Interesting take on "Wokeness."

<https://www.penguinrandomhouse.com/books/696856/woke-racism-by-john-mcwhorter/>

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/09/10/opinion/systemic-racism-education.html>

Hope you don't get a paywall.

Archie2009 said:

John McWhorter talks sense. Some people here have got partisan horse blinders on,

however.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, how are white only covenants in deeds all over the United States not systemic racism?

How is the gradual defunding of public schools in North Carolina, etc., after desegregation, and the rise of private white only schools posing as Christian academies not systemic racism?

His thesis, that some disparities we see may originate in the sociology of Black people, may be true, however, how can he claim that very sociology was not formed by the deeply racist, post-reconstruction period in the US? Long and short of it, he can't.

The arguments for systemic racism in America are far stronger than those against. But I know white people, Bill Maher, etc., take comfort in the soothing words of the few Black intellectuals who seek to disarm its more serious implications. Indeed, Friday, Bill was going off about wokeness again with George Will, and just repeated Fox News talking points. He was pretty unhappy his other guest, Christina Bellantoni pushed back hard against his assertions. He also, cluelessly, went off on the so-called Black national anthem, forgetting that the original poem on which our national anthem is based, explicitly supports slavery.

Btw,, the Queen is a BLM supporter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Malcolm, John McWhorter does not deny the existence of systemic racism. (I watched the following video a couple of months ago and saved it, so I'm just going to post the link here. I might rewatch it this afternoon.)

Malcolm wrote:

I am aware. My point was that people like Bill M use his critiques as a basis for undermining a CRT, etc., as a whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Sādhaka said:

(of course the lower is always subsumed within the higher, and also always within context)

Malcolm wrote:

So I guess libertarianism is basically at the śrāvaka level, politically speaking.

Sādhaka said:

Well I would say that for anyone who is not on the Bhumis, politics altogether is at or below the level of the vehicle of gods & men.

Malcolm wrote:

,

I am grading things based on the level of self-interest here. Of course politics is completely worldly, below vehicle of devas and humans.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

[https://apple.news/A\\_wcNgKiTTaSlbBR\\_qKuvw](https://apple.news/A_wcNgKiTTaSlbBR_qKuvw)

Unknown said:

Thomas Schramm, who graduated from Harvard-Westlake last spring, believes the woke/anti-woke debate is “more of a parent problem than a student problem. Parents who didn’t necessarily know what was being taught, or who didn’t understand what was being taught, reached their own conclusions,” Schramm says. “A lot of this is students who are on Zoom at home, their parents are in the same room with them, and they’re hearing a lot of this information that’s being taught to their kids, and they might not get the full context of what’s going on.”

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 12th, 2021 at 11:48 PM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

frankie said:

Just for absolute clarity, though, and to make my personal position clear: those inclined to take drugs for spiritual advancement/insight are self-indulgent mugs - end of.

Malcolm wrote:

Not all, most are just confused and following false guides.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Simhamukha



Content:

fckw said:

It is possible that Lama Vajranatha has some additional material collected about this particular lineage of Simhamukha, you might want to inquire with him on this topic.

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not. His lineage is mainly Ayu Khandro's Terma and Khandro Thugthig.

Also the nyingma account is totally different.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Nemo said:

It's an interesting talk but I think the missed point is how different people can be. You can be in virtuous multipartner relationships that turn into lifelong friendships.

Malcolm wrote:

Never seen it happen. Someone always gets burned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Simhamukha

Content:

fckw said:

It is possible that Lama Vajranatha has some additional material collected about this particular lineage of Simhamukha, you might want to inquire with him on this topic.

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not. His lineage is mainly Ayu Khandro's Terma and Khandro Thugthig.

Also the nyingma account is totally different.

fckw said:

Briefly checked.

Malcolm wrote:

This book has nothing to do with the Bari Simhamukha in the Thirteen Golden Dharmas, other than Khyentse Wangpo including the lo rgyus. Vajranatha's book is a translation of the Rinchen Terzo manual by Khyentse Wangpo. It's a completely different practice than what is found in the Thirteen Golden Dharmas.

The Bari Lineage is bka' ma; the Bodongpa lineage is gter ma. They are separate practices and lineages and should not be mixed together.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 1:17 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Toenail said:

I was very interested in Ayahuasca and planned to take it next year in neatherlands with peruvian shamans. Then I read this book: 'Singing to the Plants: A Guide to Mestizo Shamanism in the Upper Amazon' on associated shamanism.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, a very interesting book. Quite authoritative.

Toenail said:

It really put me off. It seems like a powerful agent, but the result is probably delusion even if it feels pleasant.

Malcolm wrote:

Ayahuasca in particular can open oneself up to provocations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 1:48 AM

Title: Re: Simhamukha

Content:

fckw said:

Briefly checked.

Malcolm wrote:

This book has nothing to do with the Bari Simhamukha in the Thirteen Golden Dharmas, other than Khyentse Wangpo including the lo rgyus. Vajranatha's book is a translation of the Rinchen Terzo manual by Khyentse Wangpo. It's a completely different practice than what is found in the Thirteen Golden Dharmas.

The Bari Lineage is bka' ma; the Bodongpa lineage is gter ma. They are separate practices and lineages and should not be mixed together.

fckw said:

Ah, my confusion then. Thanks for clarifying!

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, it is understandable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 1:50 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It really put me off. It seems like a powerful agent, but the result is probably delusion even if it feels pleasant.

Ayahuasca in particular can open oneself up to provocations.

Toenail said:

Could you elaborate on that? It sounds very interesting and a bit magical. I dig stuff like that.

Malcolm wrote:

It was not interesting to the person who experienced it. They were quite troubled by it.

They had taken Ayahuasca in a park in New Jersey of all places. After they were troubled by provocations for some time.

You know from your reading that one can meet entities while in this state. Sometimes they are malevolent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Toenail said:

Why explicitly in that state though? Do spirits find you easier or so? What is happening when you take Ayahuasca?

Malcolm wrote:

One, people often take Aya because they want to meet plant guides. So there is an expectation of meeting such beings, since it is part of the lore.

Two, the people who lead such sessions are often thralls of provocations themselves, IMO.

As you rightly pointed out, it is all pretty low level. If it has value, it has value for people in that indigenous culture only.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 2:55 AM

Title: Re: Double lung transplant

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Hey!

I just had a double lung transplant a few days ago. I'm doing fine at this point, but any extra good wishes especially for loss to the donor family would be nice. Thanks!

Malcolm wrote:

Holy shit!!!

Well, I hope you are breathing easier now...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 3:59 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

Kurp said:

TL;DR — I don't know if it breaks any vows, but if you're lying to your partner(s), you ain't doing it right most likely.

Malcolm wrote:

If you are lying to your partner, you are a) lying, which is a pratimokṣa violation b) engaging in sexual misconduct, which is another. So yeah, this man, if he is a Buddhist, has broken his vows consistently. Adultery is sexual misconduct. If someone has a claim to you by mutual agreement, then you are violating that promise by stepping outside the relationship.

Anyway, its mostly guys that want to do the polyamory thing. This is pretty well known. Women put up it with because???

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 4:02 AM

Title: Re: Having sex with someone's partner

Content:

fckw said:

Speaking of which: Did not the Hevajra Tantra state something about "frequenting others' wives"? Obviously, the question arises how to interpret that part of the text.

nightbloom said:

iirc, such commandments are usually understood to refer to she who is the \*universal wife\*.

Malcolm wrote:

Its not really proper to discuss this here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

PeterC said:

I strongly suspect that the reason this is being debated in such a heated way is that there has been a concerted effort to create political tension over this, as it is a potentially inflammatory wedge issue. "Vaccine passports" are just the newest addition to a long list of topics such as "death panels", "critical race theory", "black-on-black violence" or take your pick of other slogans.

And actually it's almost impossible to have a discussion about whether "mandating" "vaccine passports" is a good or a bad thing, because you have to actually define what you're talking about. Proof of vaccination to enter certain premises? Participate in certain events? How prevalent would this be? What level of government enforces it? Maintains records? Who has access to the records? Are there medical exemptions and how obtained? Are we taking a position of default exclusion, or default inclusion? Do private individuals and companies get to decide whether to include or exclude? Etc etc. We don't know, and that's the point.

That said I would hold a few basic truths to be self-evident here:

1. Different societies can reasonably come to different consensus on what the role of the state is in public health. Some countries will opt for monitoring of all individuals' movements and health conditions. Other societies will decide that the state should have zero involvement. There's nothing intrinsically good or bad about any of these positions.
2. There are, within the US, many very different societies that will have very different views on this, stratified by geography, wealth, race, etc. It is almost inconceivable that there could be a nationwide consensus with broad support.
3. It is completely possible to implement these tracking systems in a privacy-protecting, non-intrusive way.
4. It is almost certain that no US governmental authority is sufficiently competent to achieve #3
5. It is absolutely certain that any US governmental entity will abuse its authority while doing #3 to give more power to law enforcement by the backdoor
6. It is completely consistent with historic practice that certain activities require proof of medical status, which may include vaccination, and I believe it lies well within the remit of emergency powers at both federal and state level.
7. It is completely rational, given what we know about the coronavirus, that a society should seek to implement a system that tracks who is unvaccinated and prohibits them

from engaging in certain activities.

Finally - the post at the start of this thread by Nightbloom is insidious, hypocritical BS dressed up in pseudodharma. I believe the technical term is concern trolling. This is the sort of behavior that should get people kicked off the site.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yup.

And this:  
Considering Delta spreads regardless of people being vaccinated or not, This is quite wrong. Vaccination definitely inhibits the spread of delta, and breakthroughs only occur in 1 out of every 5000 fully vaccinated people. The fact is that our medical system is being crushed, and medical staff are quitting in droves because 40 percent of the population persists in believing lies and conspiracy theories, egged on by politicians like Desantis, Abbot, and so on, who should be jailed for their perfidy.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 7:51 PM  
Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Yup, all this bitching and moaning about privacy is exactly that.

BTW, it was not the Taliban that attacked us, Jesse, it was the Saudis. So yes, we have been working with those who attacked us since 9/11/2001.

Queequeg said:  
All this huffing and puffing.

In NYC, proof of vaccination is required to enter restaurants, concerts, museums, etc. At the venue, we are asked to show our vaccine card and ID. That's it. Don't like it? forego sitting down for sushi. Take out is still available.

I am thrilled with this. It brings a level of comfort that is priceless.

If you're worried about getting tracked, your first step should be getting rid of your phone and getting off the internet. People worrying about a candle when the whole house is burning down.

smh

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

CRT, Intersectionality, Queer Theory, Fat Studies, etc are not serious subjects. They are unscientific postmodernism infused BS. And divisive. And, yes, often racist or lead to racism.

Malcolm wrote:

Intersectionality and “identity” politics grew out the recognition in 1970’s by black radical lesbians that white radical lesbians wanted them to abandon black men. Black lesbians pushed back against this by pointing out they had a set of issues on the basis of the fact that not only were they lesbians, and thus subject to discrimination, but they were also Black, and subject to yet another layer of discrimination their white colleagues would never experience. So they refused to bow to the pressure put on them by the white lesbians to abandon Black men in the continuing struggle of Black people to secure their civil rights.

Of course, the real identity politics was the identity politics of the heterosexual, patriarchal, racist, white majority,

And no, they are not themselves racist nor lead to racism. Racism against who? “Whites?” That idea is completely unsupported

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 8:05 PM

Title: Re: Physics Metaphor application to Buddhist concepts - an exercise

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

One need not posit primordial purity. This model adapts the notion of ‘no physics nor space before the emergence of space time for physics to take place in.’

Kim O'Hara said:

I like that one.

It also happens to not conflict with Buddhist doctrine about beginningless time.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm, yeah, actually it does. It also contradicts dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 10:42 PM

Title: Humsvaranadini Tara for Attraction Empowerment

Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Tuesday Sept 14th

Humsvaranadini Tara for Attraction Empowerment

with Khenpo Migmar , SEPT 14th  
7 pm to 9 pm  
OPEN TO PUBLIC

<https://mangalamstudio.us3.list-manage.com/track/click?u=46a986a2f56499482b3923b0c&id=73eedd9b87&e=76ddd6b560>  
password 'lama'

[DONATIONS ACCEPTED]( <https://mangalamstudio.us3.list-manage.com/track/click?u=46a986a2f56499482b3923b0c&id=eb14468ee3&e=76ddd6b560> )

**\*\*6 Weeks Online Humsvaranadini\*\* <strong>Tara Retreat**  
**Tuesday Sept 14th -Oct 19th</strong>**

**<strong>Requirement for Retreat:**  
**Application and Arya tara Book**  
**available below on Amazon</strong>**

**[\*\*APPLY HERE\*\*]( <https://mangalamstudio.us3.list-manage.com/track/click?u=46a986a2f56499482b3923b0c&id=c979434792&e=76ddd6b560> )**

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 11:51 PM  
Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is quite wrong. Vaccination definitely inhibits the spread of delta, and breakthroughs only occur in 1 out of every 5000 fully vaccinated people. The fact is that our medical system is being crushed, and medical staff are quitting in droves because 40 percent of the population persists in believing lies and conspiracy theories, egged on by politicians like Desantis, Abbot, and so on, who should be jailed for their perfidy.

Jesse said:

<https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/variants/delta-variant.html>

Fully vaccinated people with Delta variant breakthrough infections can spread the virus



to others.

Malcolm wrote:

Note, I did not say that fully vaccinated people could not spread the virus. But to spread the virus, one has to be infected with the virus, and breakthrough infections are 1 in 5k.

Jesse said:

The breakthrough cases your talking about are those who get deathly ill, and hospitalized.

Malcolm wrote:

No. Breakthrough cases are when anyone is INFECTED, whether they show symptoms or not. From 8/26/21:

Breakthrough Covid Cases: Uncommon and Often Mild, but Not Always

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/26/health/covid-breakthrough-infection.html?searchResultPosition=3>

One in 5,000

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/09/07/briefing/risk-breakthrough-infections-delta.html?searchResultPosition=1>

Jesse said:

How small are the chances of the average vaccinated American contracting Covid?

Probably about one in 5,000 per day, and even lower for people who take precautions or live in a highly vaccinated community.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 13th, 2021 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

And I still think it's nonsense to point to a global pandemic and say "it's the young people who did this."

Malcolm wrote:

Right, we all know who did this: the GOP.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: washing zendras

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I have just been told at the dry cleaner's that they can clean my zendras all right, but are fairly sure the maroon will bleed, and what I will pick up in a week will be an immaculately clean and doubtlessly fragrant pink shawl.

They may be right. So the question is, how does one do it?

Please feel free to share your success stories. The two-fold objective is still to clean the striped thing properly while keeping the stripes and preserving their original colours.

Thanks in advance.

Malcolm wrote:

How to take care: The real handmade Raw silk Meditation shawl are stiff to begin with however after many wash it gets softer. The genuine Bureh which means Raw silk in Tibetan and Bhutan needs to be worn a number of times before the silk starts to relax. Some people prefer to give them a cold hand wash to speed up this process, also good idea to add little amount of Vinegar while washing to retain the color from running.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

On CRT: To piggyback of what QQ said, unfortunately CRT rarely touches on common class grievances.

Malcolm wrote:

Race, in America, is class, IMO.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

CRT as a method of legal analysis was relatively uncontroversial until very recently. People could agree or disagree, but it was put in the same basket as Legal Realism or Law & Economics: another analytical tool. My decidedly non-woke law school had at least one CRT-based seminar, for example.

Malcolm wrote:

The hysteria over CRT is just another example of right-wing race baiting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 1:23 AM

Title: Re: washing zendras

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

Thank you, Malcolm!

My summer zendra is silk and pashmina; the winter one is cotton. Since I could afford them, I somehow doubt either is pure silk -- but maybe it does not matter? Maybe vinegar will lock the colours in?

Malcolm wrote:

Use Woolite and cold water. But test small area first to see if it bleeds. The cotton one should not bleed. But test it first.

Cold water to keep the colors bright.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

On CRT: To piggyback of what QQ said, unfortunately CRT rarely touches on common class grievances.

Malcolm wrote:

Race, in America, is class, IMO.

Queequeg said:

That's a little too reductionist, I think. There are numerous underprivileged and deprived classes. Race defines many of them. And by that we could talk about poor Scotch Irish in Appalachia or my French Canadian ancestors, both underprivileged groups who have been in N. America as long as Africans who were brought over as slaves and who have historically suffered discrimination, or even those rural yankees you live among.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is pretty much race based. Poor whites in the US were systematically given rights denied to Blacks and Indigenous people.

The Scots-Irish were the last peoples from the Britain proper come here in any numbers, migrating principally in the 18th and 19th century. What is true is that slave trade was increasing rapidly at the same time the Scots-Irish began coming over here. But you know, 1619.

Time to reread Zinn.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

That's a little too reductionist, I think. There are numerous underprivileged and deprived classes. Race defines many of them. And by that we could talk about poor Scotch Irish in Appalachia or my French Canadian ancestors, both underprivileged groups who have been in N. America as long as Africans who were brought over as slaves and who have historically suffered discrimination, or even those rural yankees you live among.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is pretty much race based. Poor whites in the US were systematically given rights denied to Blacks and Indigenous people.

The Scots-Irish were the last peoples from the Britain proper come here in any numbers, migrating principally in the 18th and 19th century. What is true is that slave trade was increasing rapidly at the same time the Scots-Irish began coming over here. But you know, 1619.

Time to reread Zinn.

Queequeg said:

We'll have to agree to disagree. The treatment of blacks in N. America is among the great injustices that define the United States. But, we could also include the genocide of Native Americans right up there.

Malcolm wrote:

I have not even begun to get started on that issue.

Queequeg said:

There's also been discrimination against brown and yellow people, not at the same levels of horror and impact.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, most of the brown people you are talking about are Mestizos or outright Indios....and Asians in post-Civil War 19th century America? Brutal oppression.

Queequeg said:

There has also been systematic discrimination, de jure and de facto, against various white ethnic groups.

Malcolm wrote:

Against late 19th century and early 20th century immigrants such as Jews, Italians, Greeks, Irish, etc? Sure, but they were not considered "white" until the 1960's.

So again, race is class in America.

Queequeg said:

I simply don't see why all other forms of discrimination need to be effaced to acknowledge discrimination against blacks in N. America.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, it is pretty simple: if you are not white, you are discriminated against as a class. If you manage to pass for white, or can shake off your ethnic background, you suffer less discrimination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Anyway, that doesn't mean that poor whites and blacks are of different classes, it means the ruling class tried to drive a wedge between the two in ways that are pretty obvious, since it is going on all around us and was a huge part of the Trumpnpresidency.

Malcolm wrote:

They succeeded, by giving poor whites privileges in the 18th century, and then again following the failure of Reconstruction, creating two classes, and giving advantages to one of them which still persist today in our society. You know which one, of course.

To say that race is not class in America is to ignore the basic facts of our history.

In America, Race is Class.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A good summary of CRT:

<https://www.edweek.org/leadership/what-is-critical-race-theory-and-why-is-it-under-attack/2021/05>

This is what uninformed people state about CRT, and these are all the talking points bandied about by conservatives:

"One conservative organization, the Heritage Foundation, recently attributed a whole host of issues to CRT, including the 2020 Black Lives Matter protests, LGBTQ clubs in schools, diversity training in federal agencies and organizations, California's recent ethnic studies model curriculum, the free-speech debate on college campuses, and

alternatives to exclusionary discipline—such as the Promise program in Broward County, Fla., that some parents blame for the Parkland school shootings. “When followed to its logical conclusion, CRT is destructive and rejects the fundamental ideas on which our constitutional republic is based,” the organization claimed.

This is what they wish to deny:

The theory says that racism is part of everyday life, so people—white or nonwhite—who don’t intend to be racist can nevertheless make choices that fuel racism.

This is what Archie is worried about.

Unknown said:

Some critics claim that the theory advocates discriminating against white people in order to achieve equity. They mainly aim those accusations at theorists who advocate for policies that explicitly take race into account. (The writer Ibram X. Kendi, whose recent popular book *How to Be An Antiracist* suggests that discrimination that creates equity can be considered anti-racist, is often cited in this context.)

Malcolm wrote:

All these people oppose Affirmative Action, one of the best policies for ending class disparities in our lifetime.

Unknown said:

Fundamentally, though, the disagreement springs from different conceptions of racism. CRT puts an emphasis on outcomes, not merely on individuals’ own beliefs, and it calls on these outcomes to be examined and rectified. Among lawyers, teachers, policymakers, and the general public, there are many disagreements about how precisely to do those things, and to what extent race should be explicitly appealed to or referred to in the process.

Malcolm wrote:

This is what people can't stand, that their very existence is owed to a racist set of social and economic conditions, even though they may not themselves possess racist beliefs. However, what I observe, is that the people who most offended by this idea often wind up becoming full blown racists. I have seen it happen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 3:03 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Kimberle Crenshaw (she who coined the term "intersectionality"--which, like CRT itself, has come to mean something different than it initially did) springs to mind. Much of her work focuses specifically on race and gender, but she certainly includes a class

analysis in her work. For example, from the <https://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1052&context=ucf> in which she coined the term, here's her description of the problem:

Malcolm wrote:

And here is an article from 2017, where she fleshes out the falsity of post-racial America:

<https://thebaffler.com/salvos/race-to-bottom-crenshaw>

Genjo Conan said:

Within the Obama-era bid to characterize America's newly transformed social order as "post-racial," a striking bit of legerdemain took hold. The term worked both to de-historicize race in American society and, perversely enough, to reframe the idea of racism as something that was very much the opposite of the lived experience of race in America. Under this inside-out account of our racial history, a post-racial America was, by definition, a racially egalitarian America, no longer measured by forward-looking assessments of how far we have come, but by congratulatory declarations that we have arrived.

In one sense, there's nothing conceptually new about this. For two decades, an entire industry of lawyers, politicians, pundits, and foundations rallied around the banner of colorblindness in an effort to convince judges, policymakers, and voters that the project of racial reform was completed long ago.[2] Colorblindness fueled a host of right-wing projects throughout the 1990s and the early twenty-first century, including Ward Connerly's assault on both affirmative action and the collection of racial data,[3] along with efforts by others to attack the Voting Rights Act and Title VII. With the rhetoric of colorblindness thus conscripted as a justification of first resort for rolling back the gains of the civil rights revolution, moderates and liberals—together with the traditional civil rights establishment—regarded it with a good deal of justified suspicion. In his 2000 presidential run, for example, Al Gore likened the colorblind rhetoric of the nineties GOP to a "duck blind" offering cover to the forces of racial reaction.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 3:14 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

c'mon, man. keep backing up and you're going to end up agreeing with my characterization of the myriad problems, this nest of fear and loathing, we call the United States.

Malcolm wrote:

At base, the problem in this country is mostly racism. JD forgets that the labor movement in its early days was largely an immigrant movement by people who were not

considered white at all, apart from the Germans, who had tight control over the Socialist Party in this country, and dominated it, discriminating against Italians and so on. And then of course, there was the anti-semitism issue with Socialism as well, that is, it was regarded as a Jewish plot, until WWII made it unfashionable to openly hate Jews.

Remember, part of the reason Sanders lost the primary in 2016 is that he was not very clued into race. He was all about class too. He has since repaired that myopia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 3:39 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Howard Zinn would never make a claim like that, in fact it's somewhat contrary to the entire philosophy of A People's History. Zinn was a socialist, and beyond the fact that he acknowledged the specific, deep seated racism in American history, I don't see how you think his work has anything to do with this reductionist approach.

Malcolm wrote:

It may not be his point of view, but it is what I drew from his work.

Johnny Dangerous said:

IIRC He goes into detail in fact about how the American ruling classes used racial animus as a weapon to keep any kind organization happening around shared interest with poor whites and blacks.

Malcolm wrote:

But the point is, those divisions are now embedded and have stake holders. And while socialists might think that all race issues are solved with socialist solutions, that's a pipedream, from my perspective.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

From my point of view oppression to use CRT parlance is driven mainly by economic relationships and their relationship to power, though it can certainly manifest in other ways.

Malcolm wrote:

I think this is too reductionist. I always have.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

From my point of view oppression to use CRT parlance is driven mainly by economic relationships and their relationship to power, though it can certainly manifest in other ways.

Malcolm wrote:

I think this is too reductionist. I always have.

Johnny Dangerous said:

You just wrote 'race is class', which is too reductionist for me, it's just a statement of the obvious fact that some people are oppressed worse than others...

Malcolm wrote:

Because of their skin type....that has nothing to do with economics, that has to do with pure bias. Now, you can try and explain away such prejudice as a function of class tensions, etc....but I think it is an insufficient explanation, particularly when the standard trope of older white leftists is to try and gloss racial issues as mere economic issues...hence CRT, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

PeterC said:

personally think Marx is one of the most consistently correct and also largely misrepresented writers of the last few centuries.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, by both his detractors and his admirers. The principle conceit of Marxism, is that it is "scientific."

But even more than Marx, Engles is quite under appreciated, and arguably, is a more nuanced thinker.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

PeterC said:

Most of the furore about CRT is purely manufactured. Few of those criticizing it can offer an adequate definition of it. But the proponents of the broad genre of critical theory have really not done themselves a favor by obfuscating some important basic ideas in a veil of opaque and self-referential terminology.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the Achilles heel, of the left in general.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 7:56 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

You just wrote 'race is class', which is too reductionist for me, it's just a statement of the obvious fact that some people are oppressed worse than others...

Malcolm wrote:

Because of their skin type....that has nothing to do with economics, that has to do with pure bias. Now, you can try and explain away such prejudice as a function of class tensions, etc....but I think it is an insufficient explanation, particularly when the standard trope of older white leftists is to try and gloss racial issues as mere economic issues...hence CRT, etc.

Johnny Dangerous said:

What do you mean it has nothing to do with economics? Have you ever looked at the comparative households incomes of white and black families? Of course the oppression of black people is economic, forty acres and a mule etc...it has always been like that. Does every bit of the oppression they experience come more from racial or class animus? That's a tough question but none of the socialists I hung out with would ever answer it the way you are saying they would, making this conversation a refutation of a straw man, which is pointless.

Malcolm wrote:

The oppression of black peoples has economic consequences, but the cause is not is merely that they don't get to share the profit of their labor, the reason they don't get the same share as whites, all other things being equal, is that they are Black. Color, as a basis for for class, is far older in history than labor. It seems to be mostly an Indoeuropean issue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 7:57 PM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Vajrasvapna said:

The common conversion about karma states that the positive and negative effects that a person experiences are only a product of their actions, therefore, deserved. However, such a position contradicts Mahayana Buddhism's principle of interdependent origination.

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is not correct at all.

First the question of “deserved” is false. Karma is unerring, and its result is commensurate with the intention that produced it.

Mahayana Buddhism follows roughly the same principles of karma proposed by Sarvastivadins in Abhidharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 8:04 PM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Kurp said:

I once saw a YouTube clip of a now deceased controversial teacher saying that “[practitioners who know powerful black magic] can steal your good karma for themselves.”

Malcolm wrote:

No chance. Karma is nontransferable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 8:48 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

this question must have been already asked but i can not seem to find any posts.. when did Dzogchen as a path of rushen/tregcho/togal first appear? did it appear as a set of all 3, or some parts appeared earlier/later? what about thögal, specifically?

Malcolm wrote:

Late tenth, early eleventh century, with the production of the man ngag sde tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Jesse said:

Seems to be the case, but I can't find the same numbers, the only CDC article I could find was the one I linked, which was a 4 month study, which had rates between 5% up to 8%, with one month having 18% of all cases being in vaccinated, and was from 3 U.S. Jurisdictions, April 4–July 17, 2021.

Malcolm wrote:

The article details where those stats are from.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Was there a shaman conducting the ceremony or were they taking it like drugs?

SilenceMonkey said:

There was some kind of person leading this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:17 PM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Toenail said:

What spirit class? How did the provocations manifest? Dreams?

Malcolm wrote:

Dreams and waking, etc. No idea what spirit class. Probably a preta. Most so called "spirits" are pretas. Pretas are not just miserable beings in states of despair, there are also so-called "glorious pretas."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: What cognitive skills does one need?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The most important cognitive skill is faith in the person one selects as a teacher. Without that, there is no hope for any progress at all in any Buddhist path, let alone Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

master of puppets said:

Another's karma can effect your karma. what's wrong with that?

Malcolm wrote:

Um...no. Why don't you learn about the subject first, and then share your opinion.

You can start with the Karmasiddhiprakarana by Vasubandhu, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

PeterC said:

The anti-inequality campaign has become an incoherent mess - to the point where I can't even think of a meaningful term to describe what their objective is, when we can summarize the objectives of the other side very easily.

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly, to point out things that white people in America are unaware of because of our cultural narcissism.

The term "karen," for an entitled, clueless middle-aged white women seems to have bubbled up in the last decade or so from the Black zeitgeist. Exhibit 1, a karen being berated by her husband in front of two Black people she started harassing at a gas station:

This is meaningful, because it shows that white people in this country are not all as thick as bricks, myopically addicted to Tucker Carlson.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

is there any connection to particular names? Vimalamitra, specifically?

can we say there were 2 approaches: Padmasambhava was a proponent of mahayoga where Dzogchen was a great completion of 2 stages, and Vimalamitra's one where Dzogchen was an independent approach with its own set of practices (rushen/regchö/thögal)?

Malcolm wrote:

Even Man ngag sde is connected with the two stages in meaningful ways. For example, one reads in the "Mind Mirror of Vajrasattva" Tantra that the three inner tantras are to be practiced in union. There are lengthy passages in the commentary of the sgra thal 'gyur commentary covering Vajrayoginī practice and so on. The Lama Yangthik has a three roots practice, etc, etc.

The same is true of sems sde, and klong sde.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

A long time ago, I tried to understand all that stuff. But I'm basically lazy, found fellow grad students who dropped this kind of jargon into regular conversations unbearable bores, and was attached to my identity as a simple skater. F that noise. Especially when these problems could be, and their solutions, could be talked about in ordinary, colloquial language.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is that white americans, are in general, unaware of or choose to ignore the fact that racism in this country is still a huge issue, as you yourself acknowledge.

Why would the people causing the problem have the answer for it?

If you don't properly diagnose an illness, you cannot treat it effectively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

ok, but do we know who first wrote down dzogchen as rushen/tregcho/thogal? when it first became elaborated that way?

Malcolm wrote:

This is a pretty recent development. Maybe a late 20th century development.

You are trying to tease out a very complicated set of issues. It won't work. Some teachers teach in the way above, most do not. That's because it depends on the person, and every person needs different things.

You should just find a teacher you trust, and practice exactly the way they prescribe. All this angst about this system and that system, the conflict between what western historians claim and what the tradition asserts and so on, is all a waste of your time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Aemilius said:

"Another misunderstanding is that everything that happens to us is the result of our past karma. The Buddha said that the belief that everything a person experiences is due to their past karma (pubbekatahetu) is a false and pernicious view leading to fatalism (A.I,173). In fact, Buddhism recognized at least five broad causes of why things happen, of which karma is only one, the others being the operation of natural laws (dhamma niyàma), biological laws (bija niyàma), physical laws (utuniyàma) and psychological laws (cittaniyàma, As.854).", Guide To Buddhism A To Z, Kamma

A = Aṅguttara Nikāya, ed. R. Morris, E. Hardy, PTS London 1885-1900

AS = Atthasālinī. ed. E. Muller, PTS London 1897

Malcolm wrote:

If you accept the Theravada presentation as definitive...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 14th, 2021 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

hmm, ok.

i don't have angst, but i neither have much clarity regarding all that dzogchen undercurrents, so i am trying to gain some understanding.

Malcolm wrote:

In general, these days Dzogchen is Longchenpa's Dzogchen, at least as far as how Buddhists present it. Longchenpa is the gold standard, as ChNN stated many times.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

The Civil Rights movement was successful when it appealed to common humanity - "I have a dream that one day little black boys and girls will be holding hands with little white boys and girls."

Malcolm wrote:

The Civil Rights movement (which is not over by a long shot) succeeded because in 1965 (when I was 2 and nine months old) white people in the North finally saw Black people being treated like this in the South on their TVs:

Selma was what catalyzed the Johnson Administration to do finally something about segregation in the South, once and for all. It lead directly to the Voting Rights act, subsequently gutted in our lifetime by SCOTUS.

Queequeg said:

We need the technical data to identify where the unfairness plays out and could be balanced.

Malcolm wrote:

CRT is an analytical tool for just that.

Queequeg said:

You mentioned affirmative action as one of the most effective equalizing policies. I agree with that. And I don't look at it as some Kumbaya happy ever after policy where we all live and work in a respectful, multicultural paradise. In fact, it pisses a lot of people off and in some sense makes things worse. I expect blacks who get their foot in the door to be as self-interested in getting other blacks into the institutions as Irish were bent on getting other Irish into the Northeast cities' police and fire departments a century ago. I expect these policies to play out with all the self interest of white supremacy, even as the motivation of the policy is about a fundamental fairness and shared humanity.

Malcolm wrote:

The funny thing about the Irish in America is that they too were contending with the issue of white supremacy. But there is one crucial difference between Black people and the Irish, their skin tone. That's why after Kennedy, the Irish became fully "white." One of my bosses grew up in Massachusetts when "Irish Need Not Apply" signs were common in Boston. That's also why the Irish in S. Boston reacted so strongly to bussing in the



early 70's, because they were jealous of their new found "whiteness."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Like I said, equality isn't going to be some kumbaya moment. Its going to be that time when everyone has an equal chance to elbow each other and grab the money and power off the table. Governments role is not to force people to be nice and kind. Its to keep the game fair and the field level.

Malcolm wrote:

What I am saying is that "whiteness" is what many people of European descent were able to move into, after a long struggle of dealing with white supremacy in America.

<https://www.theatlantic.com/galleries/anti-immigrant-cartoons/41/>

<https://oac.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/hb4t1nb029/?brand=oac4>

But one thing a Black person in the US can never do is become white, because skin tone.

Our treatment of Native people is also a great problem. SCOTUS got it right when they handed back 40% of Oklahoma back to the Native population there. The Cherokee were smart never to settle for cession.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: washing zendras

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Don't wash it let the blood sweat and tears of years of Vajrayana practice saturate it

Malcolm wrote:

Gross.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 1:10 AM

Title: Re: What cognitive skills does one need?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The most important cognitive skill is faith in the person one selects as a teacher. Without that, there is no hope for any progress at all in any Buddhist path, let alone Dzogchen.

Charlie123 said:

What is the method for increasing faith in our teachers?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to reflect on their kindness, compassion, wisdom, and qualities over and over again until you feel it in your bones.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 2:01 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

Voted for the nazi party. ? Where? That's pretty low and disgusting.

Malcolm wrote:

He means the AfD.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Ayahuasca in particular can open oneself up to provocations.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Does Cannabis cause provocations?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not as far as I know. Some lamas might disagree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Toenail said:

What do you mean by glorious pretas? Those who move through space?

Malcolm wrote:

They are powerful, not like ordinary pathetic pretas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Now Fox News isn't as terrible as say msnbc or cnn...

Malcolm wrote:

Oh it is far worse. They out right lie and promulgate conspiracy theories. MSNBC is not news, it is just opinion. CNN only runs four or five stories a day, over and over again, but their journalism is just fine, if not terribly deep.

Sādhaka said:

Anyway, Malcolm, you sure seem to like to fuel division, like the news outlets do; whether wittingly or unwittingly.

Malcolm wrote:

Gee, why can't we all just get along...

I have my perspective on these worldly events, if they upset you, don't read my posts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.sapiens.org/column/race/caucasian-terminology-origin/>

Unknown said:

The term "Caucasian" originated from a growing 18th-century European science of racial classification. German anatomist Johann Blumenbach visited the Caucasus Mountains, located between the Caspian and Black seas, and he must have been enchanted because he labeled the people there "Caucasians" and proposed that they were created in God's image as an ideal form of humanity

And the label has stuck to this day. According to Mukhopadhyay, Blumenbach went on to name four other "races," each considered "physically and morally 'degenerate' forms of 'God's original creation.'" He categorized Africans, excluding light-skinned North Africans, as "Ethiopians" or "black." He divided non-Caucasian Asians into two separate races: the "Mongolian" or "yellow" race of Japan and China, and the "Malayan" or "brown" race, which included Aboriginal Australians and Pacific Islanders. And he

called Native Americans the “red” race.

Blumenbach’s system of racial classification was adopted in the United States to justify racial discrimination—particularly slavery. Popular race science and evolutionary theories generally posited that there were separate races, that differences in behavior were tied to skin color, and that there were scientific ways to measure race. One way racial differences were defined was through craniometrics, which measured skull size to determine the intelligence of each racial group. As you can imagine, this flawed application of the scientific method resulted in race scientists developing a flawed system of racial classification that ranked the five races from most primitive (black and brown races), to more advanced (the Asian races), to the most advanced (the white, or Caucasian, races). Even though the five-race topology was later disproven, “Caucasian” still has currency in the U.S.

One reason we keep using the term “Caucasian” is that the U.S. legal system made use of Blumenbach’s taxonomy. As early as 1790 the first naturalization law was passed, preventing foreigners who were not white from becoming citizens. But according to Mukhopadhyay, Blumenbach’s category of “Caucasian” posed a problem because his classification of white also included some North Africans, Armenians, Persians, Arabs, and North Indians. The definition of Caucasian had to be reinvented to focus the ideological category of whiteness on northern and western Europe. The term, even though its exact definition changed over time, was used to shape legal policy and the nature of our society.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 4:29 AM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

Toenail said:

What do you mean by glorious pretas? Those who move through space?

Malcolm wrote:

They are powerful, not like ordinary pathetic pretas.

Toenail said:

Are they called 'glorious pretas'? What is the tibetan word for it?

Malcolm wrote:

Dpal ldan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 7:26 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is meaningful, because it shows that white people in this country are not all as thick as bricks, myopically addicted to Tucker Carlson.

Danny said:

This is just assholeism.

and the idiots are winning the war.

Looking for deeper meaning is just more assholeism

It's a self licking icecream cone.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm, there is no deeper meaning to find...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 7:35 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Danny said:

This is just assholeism.

and the idiots are winning the war.

Looking for deeper meaning is just more assholeism

It's a self licking icecream cone.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm, there is no deeper meaning to find...

Danny said:

Right so why you perpetuate something else?

Malcolm wrote:

It was pretty funny, actually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 15th, 2021 at 7:10 PM

Title: Re: What cognitive skills does one need?

Content:

Charlie123 said:

What is the method for increasing faith in our teachers?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to reflect on their kindness, compassion, wisdom, and qualities over and over again until you feel it in your bones.

Toenail said:

Do you have tips for how to do it?

Malcolm wrote:

One has to work at it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Vajrasvapna said:

Your argument is grounded in authority, not logic.

Malcolm wrote:

What is karma? Please define your terms.

I'll go first. "Karma is volition, and what proceeds from volition."

Volitions spawn verbal and physical acts.

There are three kinds of karma: when meritorious, the result of karma is happiness and birth in higher realms when the conditions for their ripening assemble; when nonvirtuous, result is suffering and birth in lower realms when the conditions for their ripening assemble; and when neither meritorious nor nonvirtuous, result is neutral sensations and do not affect rebirth.

What you are referring to is karmaphala, the result of karma and karmavipāka, the ripening of karma.

The result of karma will ripen solely on oneself, and it cannot be interfered with or prevented by anyone else other than oneself. Not even a buddha can remove someone else's karma.

I never implied that one could not be influenced in positive or negative ways, nor that one could not influence others in positive and negative ways. But influencing others in positive and negative ways is still only's one own karma. And people's response to your influence is their own karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

Oh, and they now do the bidding of the DNC...

Malcolm wrote:

Oh for lord sake's, what rubbish. Zuck is a Trumpster.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

KristenM said:

I've been to events where I was the only white person, supporting the cause. At one I was pretty dismayed by what I heard from the speaker. That all white people are an inferior race of degenerate homosexuals. When they started putting up images of art from ancient Greece depicting homosexuals and saying all whites were disgusting and brought homosexuality to the earth, that's when I said, "Huh?" Yet everyone else was nodding their heads in agreement.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, did you find yourself in a meeting of 5 percenters or something?

<https://www.academia.edu/8737494>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Mani Kabum transmission requirements

Content:

Hazel said:

Can anyone read this terma/text? A teacher of mine teaches from this. There's a transmission (presumably of the given chapter) at the start of every class, but I am unsure if that's required to partake in reading it. I am unsure if it's acceptable to watch

the videos if I'm not there for the transmission or whether or not I can read it on my own.

heart said:

Khenpo Sodargye? If it is he require that participate in the lung live.

/magnus

Hazel said:

Not Khenpo Sodargye, but good to know. The lama in question is not famous.

Is the lung for each chapter or is it one lung for the whole book?

Malcolm wrote:

can be given chapter by chapter or all at once. Lama's choice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

They have decidedly taken the side of the DNC. Trump is banned from FB btw.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they took the side of their lawyers. They are not pro-DNC. You have no basis for this opinion.

Facebook is pro \$\$\$ and whoever will let them earn as much as possible.

Joe Biden's Fight With Facebook Is Just Beginning:

<https://time.com/6081656/biden-facebook/>

U.S. Revives Facebook Suit, Adding Details to Back Claim of a Monopoly:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/19/technology/ftc-facebook-antitrust.html>

<https://techcrunch.com/2021/08/29/move-fast-and-break-facebook-a-bull-case-for-antitrust-enforcement/>:

All three branches of the federal government are heating up their pursuit. In the Senate, an unusual bipartisan coalition is emerging, with Senators Amy Klobuchar (D-MN), Mark Warner (D-VA), Elizabeth Warren (D-MA) and Josh Hawley (R-MO) each waging a war from multiple fronts.

In the House, Speaker Nancy Pelosi (D-CA) has called Facebook “part of the problem.”



Lina Khan's FTC is likewise only getting started, with unequivocal support from the White House that feels burned by Facebook's disingenuous lobbying. The Department of Justice will join, too, aided by state attorneys general. And the courts will continue to turn the wheels of justice, slowly but surely.

Thus, your assertion that the DNC is in cahoots with Facebook is rated false.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

You might be alarmed to learn that they really don't give a shit, it's nothing more than politics, power plays, and catering to whoever they see as being of more benefit to themselves, and their profits.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course FB does not care. Zuck is a sociopath.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

They took the side of the DNC during the last election.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they did not.

Jesse said:

It depends what you mean, they have blatantly taken the DNC's side politically in-so-far as elections are concerned.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they have not.

Jesse said:

Banning the other sides most popular candidate is exactly that, taking a side.

Malcolm wrote:

That happened after the election, because he tried to stage a coup, that is, illegally

remain in office beyond his elected term.

Jesse said:

If Trump had won the election, do you really believe he would be 'suspended' or banned from social media?

Malcolm wrote:

Which goes to prove my point. Facebook is not in cahoots with the DNC.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Mani Kabum transmission requirements

Content:

Hazel said:

Not Khenpo Sodargye, but good to know. The lama in question is not famous.

Is the lung for each chapter or is it one lung for the whole book?

Malcolm wrote:

can be given chapter by chapter or all at once. Lama's choice.

Hazel said:

But one chapter is insufficient to read all of the book, correct?

Malcolm wrote:

Most of the Mani Kabum is history, a history describing the origin of Buddhism and its arrival in Tibet during the reign of Srongtsan Gampo, and a description of his reign. Most of it can certainly be read without transmission. For some of it, one should have empowerment of the King's Tradition of Avalokiteśvara. Those are the Vajrayāna instructions at the end of the second volume of the text.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 2:25 AM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Vajrasvapna said:

Mahayana philosophy deny the self-existence of beings and dharmas even in the relative level. So no self, no reaping. Maybe the right thing to say is illusory being have illusory reaping experiences.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, which amounts to saying that one's karma ripens upon oneself. You don't really need to add the illusory part.

Vajrasvapna said:

But what I disagree is with the view that only a being own actions influence the reaping.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you disagree with the Buddha:

"I am the owner of my actions,[1] heir to my actions, born of my actions, related through my actions, and have my actions as my arbitrator. Whatever I do, for good or for evil, to that will I fall heir.

Vajrasvapna said:

Some Vajrayana Buddhists divide a being in many levels, that separate after death.

Malcolm wrote:

Which Vajrayāna Buddhists are those?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

KristenM said:

I've been to events where I was the only white person, supporting the cause. At one I was pretty dismayed by what I heard from the speaker. That all white people are an inferior race of degenerate homosexuals. When they started putting up images of art from ancient Greece depicting homosexuals and saying all whites were disgusting and brought homosexuality to the earth, that's when I said, "Huh?" Yet everyone else was nodding their heads in agreement.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, did you find yourself in a meeting of 5 percenters or something?

<https://www.academia.edu/8737494>

KristenM said:

Sadiki Bakari. I must have been at one of his secret teachings because on Youtube he is more psy-ops, Covid is a hoax type of stuff.

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely Five Percenter adjacent:

“We must fullstand that ‘God’ is reality. If you do not overstand reality, you have absolutely no sense of ‘God’ or the concept. You are basing the ‘God’ concept according to your interpretation or most likely someone else’s interpretation which is a misinterpretation of true reality, and therefore the misinterpretation of truth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

KristenM said:

Sadiki Bakari. I must have been at one of his secret teachings because on Youtube he is more psy-ops, Covid is a hoax type of stuff.

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely Five Percenter adjacent:

“We must fullstand that ‘God’ is reality. If you do not overstand reality, you have absolutely no sense of ‘God’ or the concept. You are basing the ‘God’ concept according to your interpretation or most likely someone else’s interpretation which is a misinterpretation of true reality, and therefore the misinterpretation of truth.

KristenM said:

Honestly, I had no idea what I was walking into. My friend invited me and said he thought I was one of the few white people who could handle truth. But everyone looked cool, not a bunch of guys wearing robes.

Malcolm wrote:

Well read that pdf I posted. Its interesting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:38 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

His attempt at a coup was merely incidental to his banning, it served as a convenient reason for it, nothing more.

Malcolm wrote:

It was the cause of his being banned from Twitter, it wasn't merely incidental. BTW, I think you've confused FB and Twitter. Twitter, definitely liberal. FB, home of the Trumpsters.

Jesse said:

the coup attempt was not over after the election either,

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, the election was on November 3rd, the insurrection was on January 6th. He continued to press his false claims after his term was up and he still does.

Jesse said:

the only reason trump isn't in office right now is because the old guard republicans ditched him, Cheney, Bush, Pence, McConnell type republicans.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no. The reason he is not in office is because he lost the election, and everyone in the Gvt. did their jobs, like they were supposed to do, according to the law.

Jesse said:

Had they fully supported his election stealing claims, and doubled down, we'd be under a Trump dictatorship ATM.

Malcolm wrote:

But they didn't and they wouldn't, for a number of reasons, the principal one being that what Trump wanted was illegal, and they swore an oath to the Constitution, not to Trump.

Jesse said:

Trump would not be banned from Social media.

Malcolm wrote:

Seems like you are pretty angry that Trump is not permitted on these platforms. Why is that?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:41 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Jesse said:

There are plenty of politicians who have committed genocide, Coup d'états, and committed acts of violence against their citizens still on FB.

Genjo Conan said:

Well, that's true. But the fact that Abiy Ahmed, say, remains on Facebook while Trump has been suspended doesn't show that the DNC is pulling the strings.

You might be alarmed to learn that they really don't give a shit, it's nothing more than politics, power plays, and catering to whoever they see as being of more benefit to themselves, and their profits.

I'm a socialist, so yeah man, my mind is frak blown to learn that a giant corporation is unprincipled, thanks for the heads up.

Jesse said:

Your welcome.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Omniscience

Content:

puggily said:

Frequently I hear in prayers about gaining the omniscience of the Buddha and this has led me to question this particular aspect. One of the reasons I left monotheistic religions is that I do not believe in a god that is omniscience, omnipresent, omnipotent, etc.

My question is: am I confusing my past experience of what omniscience means in Buddhism? Am I putting a western slant to an eastern idea which may view this heavily laden term differently? Any advice is needed. Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

A buddha is omniscient about the \_nature\_ of all dharma and the extent of dharmas within their field of perception (and dharmas here is a very specific technical term), but more specifically it refers to their knowledge of all paths of liberation; not their insights into string theory.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

What's the logic behind Zuck being a Trumpster? Just because they're active on his platform?

I don't know much about Zuck's politics, but he sounds pretty lefty on most issues:

[https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mark\\_Zuckerberg](https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mark_Zuckerberg)

Malcolm wrote:  
Zuck hates regulation, so does Trump.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:51 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:

Jesse said:  
I am stating facts.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, you are not. You are stating opinions.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 3:53 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:

Jesse said:  
The law is written by those who claim power, by whatever means they can, lawful or not.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, that is really not the case. But it is cynicism like yours that contributes to the decline of democracy, rather that strengthens and reinforces it. And that is exactly what people like Trump want to see. They want to see you alienated, angry, and feeling that your vote and voice do not matter. That's how they win, every damn time.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 4:13 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:  
Jesse said:  
Bernie sanders was about the only candidate who did.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 4:38 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:

Jesse said:

Cynicism ceases being cynicism the moment the world proves you right 90+% of the time, then it's just reality.

Malcolm wrote:

So you feel you are right, 90+% percent of the time. Man, I wish I had that confidence about the world. The older I get, the more I understand that I don't know very much.

Jesse said:

I voted for Biden because he was the lesser of the two evils, and I'd do it again. That doesn't mean a damned thing, the DNC is every bit as evil as the RNC.

Malcolm wrote:

We live in a two party system. It's not by design, but it just works out that way. The DNC is not the Democratic Party, and I am not a Democrat. However, the Democratic party is far, far better than the GOP. If you don't see that...

Jesse said:

They are power strongholds that represent interests that do not align with regular peoples. They represent the rich, the elite, corporations.

Malcolm wrote:

You have a vote and a voice. If it matters so much to you, then use them. Don't just bitch about these things on Dharmawheel. Democracy is slow, it is messy, and often dissatisfying to those who want thing to change overnight. But it works.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 4:41 AM

Title: Re: The Buddha's Omniscience

Content:

Kurp said:

I've observed some so called "enlightened" beings, and my theory is, they are either omniscient and don't care what the truth is (because: non-duality), or they are just as clueless and easily manipulated as everyone else. Maybe "the Buddha" plays favorites and is easily persuaded after getting his freak on. Who knows?

But when you think about it... if you have a bunch of highly attained beings in a room together, can they really see into one another's past / present / future with the utmost clarity? Or will there be trickery afoot to throw each other off track?

Just some silly musings from someone who doesn't have a clue about anything.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, I am not sure what you mean by "enlightened."

Awakened people certainly make errors and so on, and have various kinds of limitations.



Only buddhas, the fully awakened, are error-free in their conduct and knowledge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 6:34 AM

Title: Re: Argument against common conversion about karma

Content:

Vajrasvapna said:

However Gnostic teaching have being adopted as Dzogchen in Tibet.

Malcolm wrote:

Bullshit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Best translation Nagarjuna middle way

Content:

nightbloom said:

Thanks for these. Any others? My understanding is that Conze's old translations are not very well-regarded at this point.

Malcolm wrote:

They are just fine, though a bit dated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

KristenM said:

Bernie Sander's video about people losing faith in government and democracy doesn't imo fully address the deep seated mistrust of US government that a lot of people hold. The five percenters don't trust anyone in the US government. I can't blame them, even if I don't agree with them.

Malcolm wrote:

Regressive forces want us to lack confidence in the gvt. What they really want us to do is to lose confidence in ourselves. That's where tyranny begins, beginning with the first tyrant, Pisistratus, he was thrust into power because Athenians lost confidence in Democracy, that is, themselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Well read that pdf I posted. Its interesting.

PeterC said:

Interesting is one way of putting it. I thought the nation of islam were out there. These guys' belief system is a whole new level of bizarre

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and then you have the Wu Tang Clan combing this with their concept of Buddhism...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 16th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Nadereme said:

I am sometimes a bit fascinated as to why so many Buddhists seem to have strong political opinions/views and sometimes are borderline extremists. Discussions can turn emotional and strong quickly. To me it is just more grasping.

Malcolm wrote:

I am always fascinated by how some Buddhists feign indifference to politics, as if the plight of their fellows is of no concern to them at all. There is all kinds of grasping out there, including indifference.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Nadereme said:

You're acting like the medium is inherently bad.

Malcolm wrote:

It is.

You might read "In Absence of the Sacred: The Failure of Technology and the Survival of the Indian Nations by Jerry Mander.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

PeterC said:

Interesting is one way of putting it. I thought the nation of islam were out there. These guys' belief system is a whole new level of bizarre

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and then you have the Wu Tang Clan combining this with their concept of Buddhism...

Queequeg said:

Wu Tang got their name from the Saturday afternoon Kung Fu matinees...

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

<https://archive.org/details/AmirFatirCollection/MothershipConnection/mode/2up>

By Amir Fatir^. Of course not everyone is going to agree with his interpretations; but his interpretations are interesting.

Malcolm wrote:

Tantric Soul Mates in the Quran says it all....

<https://archive.org/details/AmirFatirCollection/TantricSoulMatesInTheQuran/page/n1/mode/2up>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: Practices and Insight into bacterial Infections

Content:

Donny said:

Does anyone know what practices are suggested in dealing with bacterial infection or what Insight tibetan Medicine has in these infections?

Malcolm wrote:  
The best practice is to take antibiotics.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 1:39 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:  
Nadereme said:  
You're acting like the medium is inherently bad.

Malcolm wrote:  
It is.

You might read "In Absence of the Sacred: The Failure of Technology and the Survival of the Indian Nations by Jerry Mander.

Toenail said:  
Or the unibomber manifest.

Malcolm wrote:  
Umm, very different approaches, and very different authors, the former serving life in prison...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 1:41 AM  
Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?  
Content:  
Sādhaka said:  
Amir Fatir's interpretations are probably considered fringe by most N.O.I. members.

But some of his interpretations I think are onto something, despite 'Quranic Tantric Soulmates' lol And even if he's off on that one, maybe there is a little something to it in context....

Anyhow, there even seem to be some interesting connections to the Moors, Ismailis, Drew Ali, Fard Muhammad, Elijah Muhammad, and 'the Secret Chiefs' of early American secret societies, H.P. Blavatsky, John Yarker, Paschal Beverley Randolph (the latter—like Fard Muhammad—was 'mulatto', was a founder of an Rosicrucian society and was supposedly an advisor of Abraham Lincoln).

Malcolm wrote:  
Likely through Prince Hall Masons:

<https://www.blackpast.org/african-american-history/prince-hall-masons-1784/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 2:44 AM

Title: Re: Good source for practice items?

Content:

nightbloom said:

Yeah - I didn't mean to suggest that 108 bead malas aren't suitable for practice. Just that most online vendors I've seen have a pretty limited selection of ritual tools, and seem to cater to new age sensibilities.

Anyway, I think you're right. I'll have to string my own.

Malcolm wrote:

A mala should have 108 beads, plus the guru bead.

Potala Gate:

<https://potalagate.com>

Tibetan Spirit

<https://tibetanspirit.com/collections/malas>

There are others. as well, if you look around.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 7:17 AM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Man Behind Critical Race Theory

How Derrick Bell's pioneering work gave rise to critical race theory.

Read in The New Yorker: <https://apple.news/AqOnqlwHvSZS1XWSjwBAkig>

Unknown said:

For the past several months, however, conservatives have been waging war on a wide-ranging set of claims that they wrongly ascribe to critical race theory, while barely mentioning the body of scholarship behind it or even Bell's name. As Christopher F. Rufo, an activist who launched the recent crusade, said on Twitter, the goal from the start was to distort the idea into an absurdist touchstone. "We have successfully frozen their brand—'critical race theory'—into the public conversation and are steadily driving up negative perceptions. We will eventually turn it toxic, as we put all of the various cultural insanities under that brand category," he wrote. Accordingly, C.R.T. has been defined as Black-supremacist racism, false history, and the terrible apotheosis of wokeness. Patricia Williams, one of the key scholars of the C.R.T. canon, refers to the ongoing

mischaracterization as “definitional theft.”

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 6:38 PM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Toenail said:

I am thinking of getting a piercing. Is it against buddhist ethics or vows or so? E.g. counting as mutilating ones body etc?

Malcolm wrote:

Demonstrably unhealthy, and you’ll never pee correctly again, if you thinking of getting a Prince Albert.

Also, as a Vajrayana practitioner, arguably a bad idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 6:45 PM

Title: Re: Quiz - Which Political Party would you belong to?

Content:

PeterC said:

Then these stories get picked up by black kids in NY who can't speak a word of Chinese and incorporated into even more bizarre belief systems.

Malcolm wrote:

And great rap music.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 7:35 PM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Toenail said:

I am thinking of getting a piercing. Is it against buddhist ethics or vows or so? E.g. counting as mutilating ones body etc?

Malcolm wrote:

Demonstrably unhealthy, and you’ll never pee correctly again, if you thinking of getting a Prince Albert.

Also, as a Vajrayana practitioner, arguably a bad idea.

Toenail said:

Because it is a violation of vows?

I would never get it through the tip, but I like how frenulum piercings look.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no explicit vow against, but piercing the body opens it to infection, and they are permanent open sores. But it's your dick, so you do whatever you want to it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 7:36 PM

Title: Re: Good source for practice items?

Content:

nightbloom said:

I think I found the source for Beer's numbers. It is, as I suspected, an Indian scripture. Anyway - probably not an important thing to fixate on, and one's natural inclinations and experiences will undoubtedly vary, but carefully tailoring physical supports to one's practices can lend the latter strength.

Regarding yak bones - the mala I was looking at is painted red, with brass inlay. The color and general vibe seemed right, and you wouldn't necessarily realize it's bone just by looking at it. But I'm going to hold off on this one, I think, due to the wrathful associations.

Malcolm wrote:

Yak bone is an inferior substance. Don't use.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 7:36 PM

Title: Re: Good source for practice items?

Content:

nightbloom said:

My practice text does not specify a bead count, but I have read that malas for use with Lotus family activities should have 25. Beer says this in his encyclopedia of Tibetan symbols (and gives numbers for the other activities as well), but I believe I've seen it elsewhere as well. Thoughts? Also, material: red sandalwood is specified for my practice, but this tree is endangered, and I would prefer to substitute it with something else.

Malcolm wrote:

The material and number for males is specified in tantras

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Good source for practice items?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yak bone is an inferior substance. Don't use.

nightbloom said:

Assuming this applies also to Nepalese water buffalo?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. Mālas should only be made from substances prescribed in the tantras. They include, gold, silver, copper, iron, pearl, coral, crystal, human bone, etc. But in general these substances are for activities. Bodhiseed mālas are the ones for all activities and general use.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 17th, 2021 at 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Thoughts on Ajahn Sona's video series on Buddhist Cosmology?

Content:

Heimdall said:

I should also point out a few things as well:

1. The monks themselves evidently don't take the mythology too literally - they demonstrate that the Ancient Indians believed the whole world consisted of the Subcontinent of India and nothing else - something obviously not true. Moreover, in their later video on the "Northern Continent", they use two completely contradictory sources in elaborating what the "Northern Continent" is, and these two sources seem unreconcilable - one source describes the Northern Continent as some kind of Utopian post-agricultural-revolution Garden of Eden, another source describes it as a realm of floating cities where Yakas (Demonic Ogres) have slave ownership over human beings (perhaps, soteriologically, the two sources aren't so unreconcilable when you look at something like the Soviet Union, or, more pertinently, Mao China)

Malcolm wrote:

Uttarakuru is the northern steppes, and also Ptolemy refers to people there as "Kurus." So this ancient geography was shared between the Occident and Orient.

And it's pretty clear that this was a typological cosmology, treated differently in different sources, which Indian Buddhists in the classical period would have been familiar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Toenail said:

Because it is a violation of vows?



I would never get it through the tip, but I like how frenulum piercings look.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no explicit vow against, but piercing the body opens it to infection, and they are permanent open sores. But it's your dick, so you do whatever you want to it.

Toenail said:

Doesnt the wound close though?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not really.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 2:25 AM

Title: Minutes of Florida GOP Committee on Health Policy.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

As seen on Twitter:

Hello everyone, and welcome to this meeting of the Florida GOP Committee on Health Policy. We're meeting today in this parking lot behind a Hooter's because Dale, our treasurer, died of COVID-19 last night and he had sole access to the accounts, so we couldn't rent out our usual conference room space in the Best Western. Apologies for any inconvenience and thoughts and prayers to Dale's family members who have not also died of COVID-19.

My name is Tad Horkington, and I'm honored to have been named president of the committee following the tragic death of Thomas Bilgenut, the interim president who last week died of COVID-19. Tom had, of course, replaced Hugh Frank, our previous president who died two weeks ago of COVID-19, along with his entire family and the youth football team he coached.

We will not read minutes from last month's meeting, as our committee secretary, Henry Sanford is presently hospitalized with COVID-19. We wish him and his loved ones well, send our thoughts and prayers and commend his courageous work on the "MASKS ARE TYRANNY!" float that appeared in the Labor Day parade in Vero Beach. Hopefully we can honor Henry and his team at our next meeting, assuming they are all off their ventilators or out of quarantine.

Getting to business, we need to sign off on the anti-vaccine-mandate statement that was put together by Belinda Thompson prior to her death from COVID-19. Thoughts and

prayers to Belinda's family, all of whom were infected by Belinda at the vaccine protest she organized in a sealed tent outside the Granada Plaza Publix in Dunedin.

The statement, which Belinda composed using her iPhone's voice dictation feature, reads: "The Florida GOP Committee on Health Policy hereby denounces Sleepy Joe Biden's TYRANNICAL attempt to COUGH mandate vaccines for anyone COUGH anywhere or at any COUGH time. We encourage all righteous COUGH Americans to stand up against this COUGH COUGH COUGH unlawful government overreach." I would propose we vote to approve that statement, but unfortunately, due to COVID-19 illnesses we do not have a quorum and, in fact, I am the only person in attendance today, and even I barely made it as I'm feeling a little under the weather. Jan Dodson, who is the only committee officer allowed to change the rules on voting, is unfortunately visiting her husband Zeke who is in Tampa General Hospital's COVID ward. They won't let her in because she patriotically refuses to wear a mask, so kudos to Jan for standing in the parking lot holding a sign that reads "STAY STRONG, ZEKE AND DON'T LET THEM MICROCHIP YOU!!"

COUGH! Excuse me. I'm sure it's just a cold. I will now conclude this meeting of the Florida GOP Committee on Health Policy. COUGH! I feel a bit feverish, so I'm going to go into the Hooter's without a mask and get a beer and some wings. God bless America.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 2:28 AM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Hazel said:

Mod note: I think this is a fine thing to discuss, however I encourage folks to keep discussion to the dharma related implications of this piercing which was the initial question. We're dangerously close to the medical advice prohibition.

Malcolm wrote:

Its not a medical procedure, which is why you can get it done in a tat parlor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 3:16 AM

Title: Re: Bodily possession?

Content:

Humblepractioner said:

Hi there,

Does anyone have any knowledge or experience of seemingly being controlled by something other than one's own mind? Of one's body doing things one doesn't want to do, and of having severe reactions to even thinking about basic Dharma concepts like benefitting beings?

This has been my experience and it is quite troubling, to understate it. I am desperate for help with this, because I have no idea what to do and who can help me get rid of this.

Malcolm wrote:  
Seek medical help.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 3:17 AM  
Title: Re: Good source for practice items?  
Content:  
yagmort said:  
...when did bodhi seeds become widespread as mala beads material and why did they get their status.

Malcolm wrote:  
In the Kriya tantras, 7-8th century.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 8:10 PM  
Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?  
Content:  
Supramundane said:  
One might say that the goal of cessation is to end rebirth, but we may also say that the goal of cessation is to reach enlightenment; and we may also conclude that the goal of cessation is to enter Nirvana.

Malcolm wrote:  
The first question is, what do you mean by enlightenment. It is not at all clear.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 8:13 PM  
Title: Re: Penis piercing  
Content:

Archie2009 said:  
Crystal meth is also pleasurable.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not really.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 9:25 PM

Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?

Content:

Supramundane said:

I think it must be meaningful that enlightenment and Nirvana are not mentioned at all in the Four Noble Truths and the Noble Eightfold Path.

Malcolm wrote:

Nirodha and nirvana are synonyms.

So you have suffering, its source, and its cessation. These are not prescriptive terms, they are diagnostic terms. Then there is the eight fold path, which is prescriptive.

Awakening means recognizing these four things as truths. When one is not an ārya, these are the mundane four truths. When one has realized them through direct knowledge, they are the ārya's four truths:

"And, monks, as long as this knowledge & vision of mine — with its three rounds & twelve permutations concerning these four noble truths as they actually are present — was not pure, I did not claim to have directly awakened to the right self-awakening unexcelled in the cosmos with its devas, Maras, & Brahmas, with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & commonfolk. But as soon as this knowledge & vision of mine — with its three rounds & twelve permutations concerning these four noble truths as they actually are present — was truly pure, then I did claim to have directly awakened to the right self-awakening unexcelled in the cosmos with its devas, Maras & Brahmas, with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & commonfolk. Knowledge & vision arose in me: 'Unprovoked is my release. This is the last birth. There is now no further becoming.'"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 18th, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Why would you mutilate yourself like that??

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 1:11 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Queequeg said:

The recall rule is flawed. Too easy to force a recall vote. Just as it's too easy to have referenda added to the ballot. In theory these are nice democratic ideas but in reality turn into easy tools for obstruction and populism.

As for the rest... People who own \$800000 houses might like the idea of affordable housing, but NIMBY. See the Westchester NY housing settlement fiasco. The towns of Scarsdale and Rye will consistently vote blue, but suggest building affordable housing in

their neighborhood and you will see all manner of meeting the letter of the law while making a travesty of the spirit, while quietly supporting politicians who promise to obstruct and gut the law.

Draught... State sponsored rain dances?

Malcolm wrote:

People are already leading CA in droves. They are coming east. Central Valley is the new dustbowl. They are mostly moving to AZ, NM, and MT, That should turn TX, MT, and AZ bluer. CA's climate will not recover for a millennia. Toast is about the right word.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 3:29 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Queequeg said:

The recall rule is flawed. Too easy to force a recall vote. Just as it's too easy to have referenda added to the ballot. In theory these are nice democratic ideas but in reality turn into easy tools for obstruction and populism.

As for the rest... People who own \$800000 houses might like the idea of affordable housing, but NIMBY. See the Westchester NY housing settlement fiasco. The towns of Scarsdale and Rye will consistently vote blue, but suggest building affordable housing in their neighborhood and you will see all manner of meeting the letter of the law while making a travesty of the spirit, while quietly supporting politicians who promise to obstruct and gut the law.

Draught... State sponsored rain dances?

Malcolm wrote:

People are already leading CA in droves. They are coming east. Central Valley is the new dustbowl. They are mostly moving to AZ, NM, and MT, That should turn TX, MT, and AZ bluer. CA's climate will not recover for a millennia. Toast is about the right word.

Archie2009 said:

Isn't AZ also a candidate for becoming unliveable due to climate change?

Malcolm wrote:

Depends where one is, but yeah, parts are very dry.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 4:45 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

KristenM said:

And honestly, I'd rather live in the desert than have winters.

Malcolm wrote:

New England winters are awesome. They build character.

In all seriousness though, the water table in the Central Valley has dropped fifty feet in the past 70 years or so (thanks to irrigation), and the infrastructure has suffered badly for it. California cannot sustain the number of people living there, and no, you can't have the Great Lakes... You'll have to drain Lake Tahoe first, at the very least. "This land is my land, this is land is your land" stuff went out with Trump.

Expect the US to split into four major regions in the next 100 years.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 11:33 AM

Title: Re: Penis piercing

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Crystal meth is also pleasurable.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really.

KristenM said:

Why is it not really pleasurable? (

Malcolm wrote:

If you e ever done meth you will understand why. It's a rush, but it's not that pleasurable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 7:52 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

No. And I don't believe you seriously think I'm saying that. I already said that I think we should have concentrated in getting a safe (!) traditional vaccine out the door, so that \*nobody\* would have to be a test subject.

Malcolm wrote:

Thus statement is complete and total nonsense. The traditional vaccines are far less effective than mRNA vaccines. Moderna had a fully functioning vaccine in 48 hours. The

FDA was way behind the curve on this one. Now, thus vaccine has been rolled out to literally billions of people. There are virtually no negative effects, and to call people “test” subjects just feeds into anti-vaxxer bullshit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Give over @nightbloom, I don't want to hear it.

nightbloom said:

Yes, I know. I think that what you, and some others want, is to drown your doubts, misgivings and pain in expressions of rage and contempt toward socially-approved bogeymen. Frankly, some of you guys are totally poisoned with hatred, and I don't expect to change your minds. But I know there are people lurking who privately agree with at least some of what I've said. I just don't want them to think that they're alone.

Malcolm wrote:

There are all kinds of idiots out there who think the way you do on this subject. You can find them holding stupid signs in front of hospitals and government buildings all over the world. Sadly. People like you are killing people. Get a clue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 9:09 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

Yes, I know. I think that what you, and some others want, is to drown your doubts, misgivings and pain in expressions of rage and contempt toward socially-approved bogeymen.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't have any doubts. I would have signed up for the Moderna vaccine in March 2020.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

I'm not making a case for social media, I'm just interested to get to the root of what people see as the problematic parts. "Shutdown social media" is too vague for a real

policy, there would have to be specific functionality that it banned.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not social media that is the issue, it is Facebook, specifically, that is a cancer gnawing away at social comity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

PeterC said:

No, that is exactly what we do not need, because it would be a waste of time. All the arguments and potential solutions have been rehearsed above in the thread many times. The DC will not reach a consensus, all its members will die off first.

Malcolm wrote:

Even if we did, all of this material is not actually owned by the Dzogchen Community proper. It is all owned by family, virtually all of it.

So, Bob's desiderata is all based on a single misconception, that is, a misconception about who owns and is heir to ChNN's intellectual property.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Well Oldbob, I agree about the archive for the most part, but I don't expect it to change.

Malcolm wrote:

To reiterate, Bob's desiderata is all based on a single misconception, that is, a misconception about who owns and is heir to ChNN's intellectual property.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 9:29 PM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

So what about it should be made illegal...

Malcolm wrote:

It needs to be broken up for antitrust reasons, and what remains needs strict federal



oversight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 19th, 2021 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The argument is just nonsensical, it's disconnected.

FYI I was (mostly) opposed to the lockdowns on the grounds of the collateral damage they've caused - I still feel this way about them, and I suspect history will prove me right on them.

Malcolm wrote:

Spanish flue: compare Philly with St. Louis. The former never locked down, and suffered long term economic damage. The latter locked down hard, and their economy recovered much more rapidly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The most locked down countries are the now the ones that will have the hardest time reaching endemicity or any kind of herd immunity.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as herd immunity. We don't want COVID to become endemic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The most locked down countries are the now the ones that will have the hardest time reaching endemicity or any kind of herd immunity.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as herd immunity. We don't want COVID to become endemic.

Johnny Dangerous said:

It's going to be endemic now. The scientific consensus is trending that way pretty heavily. It makes vaccination that much more important, because we all have a future date with Covid now.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because we were impatient and opened up too early.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It's going to be endemic now. The scientific consensus is trending that way pretty heavily. It makes vaccination that much more important, because we all have a future date with Covid now.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because we were impatient and opened up too early.

Johnny Dangerous said:

No, that's just not correct to the best of my knowledge. New Zealand pretty much admitted it will be endemic now, and they were on super lockdown. The  $r_0$  of delta makes endemicity almost a given, without a 100% vaccine, which AFAIK is pretty much impossible with this kind of virus. None of the places that did heavy lockdowns are faring well with Delta, for the reasons I've mentioned, and the fact that they were late to the vaccination party. The UK is doing ok due to the vaccination rate. The places with no immunity (via natural infection and vaccines) are in the worst position following heavy lockdowns. That's of course not an argument for people going out and catching Covid - the dramatic drop in the risk of severe disease and death is the part of the vaccines that is most important, and taking on Covid without being vaccinated is a real crapshoot, one where the dice are more loaded the older one is.

Malcolm wrote:

The very reason Delta happened is because India, under a right wing government, did not lock down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Dear all and All,

This is long to read but there is much to put on the table - that is timely. So please do your best!!!

It should be noted that apparently, the intellectual property rules both in Europe and in the US have only a 35-year life. That means that perhaps the material from before September 1986, is now in the public domain, and that each year, perhaps more and more material will be in the public domain. As of now, this includes 7 years of Teaching including Tregchod and Togyal.

Malcolm wrote:

International copyright law specifies a period of 75 years from the death of the author. This includes recordings, videos, etc. You are confusing patents with copyright.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: The Nirvana Sutra News

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I don't mean to be so negative about these things, but we need academia to accept translation as legitimate work and allow scholars to shift their attention from churning out these useless articles which say everything about nothing, and start translating texts and building up a good quality English Tripitaka. If they annotate their translations well enough, they can make all the same arguments they make in these articles, while benefitting both fellow scholars who will read the notes and practitioners who will focus on the contents of the text.

Malcolm wrote:

Strongly agree, however, I think academia is not up the task.

I personally don't like translations that are overly annotated. It is because of annotation, actually, that nothing gets translated in a speedy and efficient way. People are too worried about covering their asses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Arnoud said:

Do you really feel America had a hard lockdown? Compared to my family in Europe, the US was rather lax. I guess it depends on where you were so maybe speaking for the whole of the US is impossible anyway.

Malcolm wrote:

The "lockdown" in the US was a joke.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 1:52 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

California will be fine. It will hire out all those Harvard and MIT folks to solve everything as it always has. BTW GN's big initiative is to pass a bill that allows every homeowner to split their lots and build duplexes on them to solve affordable housing. There's going to be a huge home selling rush and probably folks moving to CA. The water is down now due to drought. The rain will come eventually.

Malcolm wrote:

Forest fires, drought, etc. will only intensify. CA will have to get its water from the Pacific. Doable.

Speaking of MIT folks, the one ray of hope on the horizon is fusion. It's actually happening:

<https://news.mit.edu/2021/MIT-CFS-major-advance-toward-fusion-energy-0908>

Crazywisdom said:

Someday in a hoped-for future, when there may be thousands of fusion plants powering clean electric grids around the world, Zuber says, "I think we're going to look back and think about how we got there, and I think the demonstration of the magnet technology, for me, is the time when I believed that, wow, we can really do this."

The successful creation of a power-producing fusion device would be a tremendous scientific achievement, Zuber notes. But that's not the main point. "None of us are trying to win trophies at this point. We're trying to keep the planet livable."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Wouldn't it be better to responsibly publish everything now with links to lineage holders who can provide DI and LRAs?

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, Bob, but I wouldn't hold my breath.

But in any case, these days to new students apparently have to sign non-disclosure agreements in their own blood...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

I appreciate the thoughtful, nuanced argument here, but I don't agree. I don't think it's "grandstanding" to reject vaccination.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's downright idiotic.

nightbloom said:

it's because people are saying "No," to various measures.

Malcolm wrote:

Because they are selfish idiots.

nightbloom said:

Even if the above wasn't true - I fail to see why I *\*should\** take the vaccine.

Malcolm wrote:

So that you reduce the chance that your body passes on the infection to those with weaker immune systems than yours, oh selfish one.

nightbloom said:

Anyway, the bottom line is that vulnerable people *\*should\** be vaccinated, and everyone else should be left alone.

Malcolm wrote:

No, everyone should be vaccinated. There are no other solutions to pandemics than vaccination.

nightbloom said:

P.S, I've heard the same things you have, regarding the virus being here to stay.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because of idiots like you, specifically. BTW, your bodhicitta is shit, it means nothing. You might as well pack it in as Māhāyāni. You are about as far away from a Mahāyāna practitioner as I can imagine. You are so selfish, you cannot even take a little jab if it prevents one person from becoming ill. Pathetic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

This is a completely non falsifiable, pointless claim.

Malcolm wrote:

Delta came from India. The DNA proves it. Covid spread there uncontrolled for months because the Modi gvt. chose to believe their own Trumpian bullshit rather than protect their citizens.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 5:05 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

You're one of the strangest people on this forum, Malcolm. So much knowledge, but such a striking lack of awareness regarding your impact on other people's thought processes. I'm very glad you're here, but I wish you'd chill out.

Malcolm wrote:

I am quite aware of my impact on other people's thought processes, and as long as people like you continue to behave like irresponsible fools, you are going to hear about every time you pipe with your bullshit. Get the goddamn jab. You are supposed to be a bodhisattva, that means putting others ahead of yourself. So far, I see no evidence of that from you at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 5:19 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

We're prepared to accept it, because this is what we believe to be right.

Malcolm wrote:

Fools all then. You have no right to expect help from anyone when you become homeless, because of your unwillingness to abandon your very basic wrong views, your ignorance about causes and their effects. Not only are you hurting yourself, but you are dragging other people down with you. SMH.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 5:21 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, Bob, but I wouldn't hold my breath.

But in any case, these days to new students apparently have to sign non-disclosure agreements in their own blood...

treehuggingoctopus said:

And doing so they ensure that as long as they proceed accordingly they will never be part of the DC that is here already.

Tata1 said:

I think people need to be more patient. Only 3 years had passed since rinpoche passed away. Yeshe is giving transmission which is a good thing, but he is doing it formally for the first time. Expecting him to sit on the throne and tour the world giving DI while also giving it to 6000 people online like some sort of DI vending machine is unrealistic and not fair to impose that on someone.

If Rinpoche had faith in him as well as his daughter thats enough for me personally. But things need time to unfold, for yeshe and for rinpoches other students.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeshe is not a member of the Dzogchen Community, and his event in Merigar to be held shortly is not a DC event.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 5:23 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

I welcome any attempt to demonstrate that I'm wrong about these things.

Malcolm wrote:

Just read the NYT. If you don't believe the NYT, you are a hopeless paranoic.

99 percent of all people in hospitals today are people like you who refused vaccination.

Delta is a far more severe infection than the original covid bug as well. SMH.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

, you don't understand the issue, there are really good reasons to oppose a "papers please" society -and- what might amount to a form of national ID.

Malcolm wrote:

There is nothing wrong with national ids. They make eminent sense.

Papers please would be an issue if it applied to, interstate travel, but it won't. Anyway, Real ID is a form of national id, rolled out at the state level.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

Like everyone said, the important thing is that transmission is being given.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe. Or Maybe it will be a PowerPoint presentation on ChNN's life and work. We won't know. It's not a Dzogchen Community event.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

, you don't understand the issue, there are really good reasons to oppose a "papers please" society -and- what might amount to a form of national ID.

Malcolm wrote:

There is nothing wrong with national ids. They make eminent sense.

Papers please would be an issue if it applied to, interstate travel, but it won't. Anyway, Real ID is a form of national id, rolled out at the state level.

KristenM said:



How do you feel about undocumented immigrants and a national ID? Do you think we should have any sort of border checks?

Malcolm wrote:

We have border checks already, for this people who cross into the US at ports of entry. Undocumented immigrants who are presently here should be given green cards. Most illegal immigration into this country from Mexico and Central America represents policy failures of the US going back decades and even centuries. With climate change, we are going to have to figure out how to handle increasingly large numbers climate refugees. Personally, I think we just combine Canada down to Panama into a EU-like trade/currency zone with free movement between all citizens of member nations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

tinylocusta said:

we want such a person to appear, we need to practice ourselves, instead of pushing Adriano and so on.

Malcolm wrote:

No one is pushing anyone. But if one wishes someone to teach, they must be asked.

As for this weekends event, we will never know what happened.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I think Biden's latest mandate probably cemented Trump 2.0's victory...

Malcolm wrote:

Doubt it. There are two types of people in America right now, fortunately the sane people outnumber the insane by 20 percent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

tinylocusta said:

What they need is someone who can present their real nature in the context of the illusion they are currently living in, from Tik Tok to quantum physics.

Malcolm wrote:

And this is how Secret Mantra, including Dzogchen, degenerates. Apparently you also were not paying attention to Rinpoche, when he chided people for their criticisms of creation stage because of the ancient Indian costumes.

These things, quantum physics to Tiktok, are irrelevant to the question of liberation and freedom from rebirth. If someone does not accept rebirth, they cannot teach Dzogchen, much less Buddhadharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: The opponents, Shantideva refutes first

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

He's trying to prove his point against assumed positions by other schools, all of which are fallacious and silly.

White Sakura said:

that's what I also thought. The Svatantrikas, how silly.

Malcolm wrote:

"Svatantra" and Prasanga are positions invented by Tibetans. It has nothing to do with the facts on the ground in Indian Madhyamaka.

Tsongkhapa is a wonderful teacher, but you should not imagine that his presentation is by any means the definitive one. It is not even the definitive one in Geluk, since there are many different trends in Geluk, and not even all famous Geluk scholars agree with everything Tsongkhapa wrote.

Śantideva does not address other Madhyamakas. He addresses only other tenet systems.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

Rinpoche thought and stated that yeshe can teach. That's it for me, regardless of what yeshe said in a meeting or not.

Malcolm wrote:

Leading students is not a simple matter of giving an introduction and then disappearing. It is a commitment to lead them on the path in a proper way. For example, like the

commitment ChNN made to his students for decades and 600+ retreats.

It is not some technical issue, which is what everyone treats it as, it is not merely a question of mechanics, "Have DI, then travel."

The DC is, at present, running the risk of becoming a strange thing, unnormal, as the Boss used to say.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?

Content:

Supramundane said:

but since cessation of thought

Malcolm wrote:

Error, the third truth is not "cessation of thought."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

And who says yeshi wont lead his students?

Malcolm wrote:

Time will tell, as always. But the thing is, it is the whole DC, not just a select cohort who signed NDA's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Simon E. said:

Seeing the Lama as pure is about you. Not about them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 20th, 2021 at 11:26 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

I prefer not to speculate of a meeting i was not a part of. For example friends who where there had a total different view on what happened that the one held by some forum members here, including the issue of yeshe students.

Kurp said:

Maybe taking this conversation to the Sangha app, where many more IDC members communicate, would be best?

I almost guarantee the conversations there regarding these topics will prove more fruitful than discussing them here in a circular manner with the same 10 (mostly anonymous) people.

Malcolm wrote:

The reason why these issues get discussed here is that there is not point in discussing these things inside community spaces. Nothing changes, people with money make the decisions, everyone else just watches and has opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?

Content:

Supramundane said:

Nirodha is not cessation of thought? What is ceased then?

Malcolm wrote:

The causes and conditions for samsara. Hence the constant refrain, 'Birth is ended" and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 1:24 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Hurricanes and floods will also intensify on the other side of the Miss. Anyway, being near one of the largest fresh water supply on Earth, Amazon, not to mention Pantanal, well, at least for now.... Sigh of relief.

Malcolm wrote:

Western New England is too far away from the coast for hurricanes and floods to have much impact. Eastern New England, that's another story.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 2:08 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Bob:

We know.

oldbob said:

Please make the effort to read the actual words of ChNN about who can teach and what he allowed his children to teach.

Malcolm wrote:

If one goes by that letter and takes it literally, Dzogchen Community is dead in the water and sinking rapidly. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 3:01 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Yes, the words of ChNN in the two communications of 2016, as to who can teach, mostly relate to the specific situation while he was alive, but they also pointed to the present time, when we are being asked to observe ourselves, work with circumstances, do our best and collaborate.

Please read the actual words of ChNN, in both communications of 2016 as to who can teach, and look for what is applicable to our world today.

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=598719#p598719>

Malcolm wrote:

Well, as far as I know, there is basically no one in the community right now, apart from Adriano, who actually has the necessary skills in Tibetan and English to give empowerments. It is simply not enough to copy the meaning empowerments (don dbangs) Rinpoche used to give, let alone the more complicated empowerments such as Longsal empowerment, or the empowerments for SMS, etc.. One has to be scholarly enough to know how to read the texts. Many people imagine that a direct introduction is enough. It may be for a few people with fantastic past life accumulations, but for most people it is not sufficient. This is why Rinpoche recommended that SMS people receive the Guhyagarbha, an Anuyoga empowerment in concise or long form, and the Khandro Nynthig empowerment.

There are really an endless source of issues here that cannot be addressed in any comprehensive way by the IDC, and they have made it clear that there is nothing they can do.

Suppose someone starts giving empowerments and so on, of Mandarava. How can the DC sanction these? They can't. So, the DC still sinks. etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Vaccination Recalcitrance Posing as Compassion

Content:

nightbloom said:

An articulate explanation for a healthy person's rejection of the vaccine and the social policies associated with it. He nails it with his comments on "biopolitics."

<https://www.firstthings.com/web-exclusives/2021/09/why-i-didnt-get-the-covid-vaccine>

Malcolm wrote:

No, he does not. He miscites studies, relies on the opinions of people who do not specialize in epidemiology, lies about what people like Fauci have said throughout this pandemic. Moreover, this man is a fundamentalist Christian. Why you would believe anything this lunatic says is just well, He is an Anti-Lockean, that is to say, his very intellectual impulses are anti-democratic and Christian dominionist.

This man says:

Christians are called to speak the truth to one another and to assume the moral risks of speaking truth in public.

And yet, he is a total liar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 3:26 AM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

So yes; Seeing the Lama as pure is about you. Not about them.

Malcolm wrote:

This was a note to the mods that this was a Zombie thread.

Zombies, not being alive, have no buddhanature, no more than a rock has buddhanature.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 4:19 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Suppose someone starts giving empowerments and so on, of Mandarava. How can the DC sanction these? They can't. So, the DC still sinks. etc.

I also want to add, that the qualifications of who can teach Dzogchen are very specifically spelled out by Longchenpa in texts such as the Treasury of the Dharmadhātu, its commentary, based in authoritative Dzogchen Tantra like the Kun byed rgyal po, etc. One has to know how to give empowerments, understand secret mantra in general, have done the retreats, be skilled in the views of the various yānas, be able to answer questions, etc., etc. Its not sufficient to make a loud noise, like scaring a flock of pigeons.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 5:31 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

It is distressing that these things are not only unknown by most of us DC members but would invite utter disbelief and ridicule when pointed out.

Malcolm wrote:

This is because many times people were more interested in getting to the Meribar and partying after the teachings than paying attention to what the Boss was actually saying.

M

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

So yes; Seeing the Lama as pure is about you. Not about them.

Malcolm wrote:

This was a note to the mods that this was a Zombie thread.

Zombies, not being alive, have no buddhanature, no more than a rock has buddhanature.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:  
Don't zombies have awareness?

Malcolm wrote:  
If they did, they would not be dead people in various stages of decomposition.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 8:54 PM  
Title: Re: The Serious Curriculum  
Content:

tingdzin said:  
Bonpo Kanjur/TenjuR

Malcolm wrote:  
Here you are:

<http://xxb.qiongbuwang.com/index/category/id/23.html>

Mother tantras:

<https://www.dropbox.com/s/ghrxna22f22cnhx/18%20Mother%20Tantra%20copy.pdf?dl=0>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 9:10 PM  
Title: Re: Regular Caffeine Consumption Affects Brain Structure  
Content:

Sādhaka said:  
Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen Rinpoche recommended rhododendron as an alternative; and even went as far as suggesting that tea caffeine can be an cause for lower realm rebirth. Rhododendron actually seems to be a strong adaptogen.

Malcolm wrote:  
Be careful, most rhododendron species are toxic. He was talking about a specific type of rhododendron native to E. Europe through Asia. I did not hear this personally, but he must have been referring to what is known as Dali (དལིལ་པོ་). The leaves (call Ba lu, བ་ལུ) and flowers of the plant Rhododendron primulaeflorum are used in Tibetan Medicine. A decoction made of the leaves is very strongly diuretic. The flowers are used in chulen.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Paging through Richard Barron's excellent translation of the Precious Treasury of Basic Space and I found NO /NO reference to who can teach Dzogchen. Not one. (I enjoyed reading this again!!!) Maybe someone was using a different translation. I am old and fuzzy-headed so maybe I missed something.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is specified in the commentary in great detail in chapter 11, only very briefly in the root text, in the same chapter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Perhaps requirements for Wangs and Lungs are put forwards by scholars...

Malcolm wrote:

No, these things are stated very clearly in the Dzogchen tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 9:29 PM

Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?

Content:

Supramundane said:

This would mean that enlightenment is different from nirodha.

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhi is what leads to cessation. This all very clearly explained in Abhidharmakośa, which is itself a commentary on the four truths of nobles.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 9:32 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Queequeg said:

Thought this might offer a nice bookend to the conversation about right wing paranoia about wokeness.

Malcolm wrote:

As I have been saying all along, who is afraid of the opinions of freshman in college?

The whole hysteria around CRT and wokeness has been manufactured by the right, in order to limit the free speech of the left, as the article cogently points out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Why is enlightenment never mentioned in 4NT and 8FP?

Content:

Supramundane said:

I would like to read that, Malcolm. In some sutras the two seem to be conflated, but i agree that they are different.

Nirodha is a verb; nirvana a noun, are they conceptually different?

Or just two ways of expressing the same thing?

Malcolm wrote:

They are two ways of expressing the same thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Or - we can collaborate and create a new Dzogchen Community...

Malcolm wrote:

Where in ChNN's words or writings is it suggested that creating a "new" Dzogchen Community is viable?

Strange.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 11:22 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

As I have been saying all along, who is afraid of the opinions of freshman in college?

Queequeg said:

Insecure college professors.

Malcolm wrote:

They need to get over it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 21st, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Archie2009 said:

NY Times is part of clown world.

When students search the campus with baseball bats in hand for supposed racist professors something is off.

Malcolm wrote:

That did not happen: timeline here:

<https://www.theolympian.com/news/local/education/article175061841.html>

Archie2009 said:

This happened to Bret Weinstein at Evergreen State College in 2017 literally because he refused to take a day off.

Malcolm wrote:

Only an idiot refuses to take a paid day off.

He was also engaged in performative silliness. It paid off. He and his wife also received 500K for their troubles. Now he is a major player in the Covid Antivaxx movement, so a total idiot. It's also telling that he blames "postmodernism" and "critical theory" for his woes. What a putz.

More performative silliness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 12:03 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Archie2009 said:

The whole US progressive social justice movement pivots on performative hysteria.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean like this?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I'm wondering how much of an issue the current laws/rules on shoplifting in California are. The videos on the internet of thieves on bikes riding through stores filling their bags unopposed are otherwordly. Is that mostly San Fransico? How do Californians feel about this? Zero punishment for theft below \$950. Unreal.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's because the prisons are filled with lots of people who got long terms for holding \$50 of cocaine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I'm wondering how much of an issue the current laws/rules on shoplifting in California are. The videos on the internet of thieves on bikes riding through stores filling their bags unopposed are otherwordly. Is that mostly San Fransico? How do Californians feel about this? Zero punishment for theft below \$950. Unreal.

Queequeg said:

The demise of civilization portrayed on conservative media are grossly exaggerated to get your heart rate going. You should thank them for the cardio workout. CVS/Walgreens (or whatever chain on the West Coast) will still report record earnings and the knuckleheads caught on someone's iphone will continue to suffer the life of a knucklehead.

Archie2009 said:

It sounds to me like many have become desensitized to theft, robbery and violence.

Malcolm wrote:

It's also wildly exaggerated by the right wing media.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

but most of the 'soft censorship', (in fact nearly all of that I've seen) has been a result of this brand of juvenile wokeness within the discourse on the left.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because people are threatened by freshman in college. Give me a break.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:23 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I'm wondering how much of an issue the current laws/rules on shoplifting in California are. The videos on the internet of thieves on bikes riding through stores filling their bags unopposed are otherwordly. Is that mostly San Fransico? How do Californians feel about this? Zero punishment for theft below \$950. Unreal.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's because the prisons are filled with lots of people who got long terms for holding \$50 of cocaine.

Archie2009 said:

Yes. That's shameful.

Malcolm wrote:

Under Penal Code 484(a) PC, California law defines the crime of petty theft as wrongfully taking or stealing someone else's property when the value of the property is \$950.00 or less. Petty theft is a misdemeanor punishable by probation, fines, restitution and up to 6 months in county jail.

<https://www.shouselaw.com/ca/defense/penal-code/484/>

It is not really as horrifying as it sounds. But I am sure the Daily Mail and the New York Post are all riled up about it. Putzes all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: Regular Caffeine Consumption Affects Brain Structure

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Rhododendron Primuliflorum isn't so easy to procure.

[https://www.etsy.com/search?q=rhododendron+tea&order=most\\_relevant&view\\_type=gallery](https://www.etsy.com/search?q=rhododendron+tea&order=most_relevant&view_type=gallery)

The other two varieties of Rhododendron that I mentioned found in the above Etsy link, are made for human consumption.

I wonder if either of them are similar enough to Rhododendron Primuliflorum....

Malcolm wrote:

R. Primuliflorum is the species identified by Tibetans for use. I cannot be certain of Dali in other countries, like Mongolia. Sometimes different plants substituted with the same names, like this Sagan Daly (R. Adamsii), which is clear adapted from Tibetan Medicine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:48 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

"Collaborate"

ChNN

Malcolm wrote:

No connotation of "new" there, Bob.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I just saw ... on social media

Queequeg said:

I think your problem starts there.

Archie2009 said:

The recordings aren't faked, you know. Also, remember what the George Floyd protests started with?

Malcolm wrote:

Archie, these thefts are by organized by gangs, which means they are felonies, and eventually they will be prosecuted as such.

In the meantime, do you really expect security guards to put themselves in harms way

for Walmart?

This is confined to San Francisco, where there is a terrible housing problem. This is not a result of social policies gone awry, this is a result of tech overlords and their hordes of minions driving housing prices through the roof over the past 20 years.

There are 100,000 thousand people living on the street or living out of cars in CA right now. It's pretty messed up, we all agree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

but it does make the left wing landscape here amazingly ineffective and self-facing.

Malcolm wrote:

It's always been like that, as far as I can remember.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

So I am proposing a new Dzogchen Community based on the Teachings of ChNN, with the spirit of ChNN being the living Teacher.

Through dreams, visions, and praying with strong faith, many have taken Transmission from Teachers who are no longer in their body.

I think that this will work for many practitioners - both old and new. If someone claims that they have received a Transmission / permission from ChNN how can anyone say that they did not. This is an entirely subjective experience. So certainly this works (or should work) for SSF to allow the purchase of practice materials and to allow the replay of recorded material.

ob

Malcolm wrote:

If they can get permission from ChNN in a dream, then they should read all his books and listen to all his teachings in a dream too.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 2:44 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Of course, the Members of this Dzogchen Community can have complete access to the Digital Archive and the Transcript Archive once they have received ChNN's permission for this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

but most of the 'soft censorship', (in fact nearly all of that I've seen) has been a result of this brand of juvenile wokeness within the discourse on the left.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because people are threatened by freshman in college. Give me a break.

Crazywisdom said:

You've obviously never been the reason for a college sit in.

Malcolm wrote:

I have lived in college towns for my entire life. Ithaca, the Happy Valley (Western Ma), Cambridge, Burlington, VT., Boston, and back to the Valley again. I've seen more sitins than I can remember. Freshman come and go, get on with their lives, forget about their youthful political passions, get married, have families, etc.

What freshman in college think is just not a big deal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

mutusuk said:

Or you may say you don't need any such authority and in this case, anybody can claim anything. I am really not sure this is what Rinpoche would have wanted.

Malcolm wrote:

It's all subjective, don't you get it? We just need to have a dream and demand any teaching we want or all of them. Whose to say we had the dream or didn't have the dream? It's a perfect system. Who needs a living guru, when we have the Living Sprit of Lord ChNN Christ to guide the way.



Sheesh. Come on. Get with the times, mutsuk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

climb-up said:

There are lamas who are qualified to pass on ChNN's transmission, and will/are,

Malcolm wrote:

Who?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Kurp said:

and still did not receive transmission

mutsuk said:

What do you mean by this? Transmission is not intransitive in Dzogchen, so it should a transmission of... Are you referring to direct introduction?

Kurp said:

<https://www.dzamlinggar.net/en/dzogchen/direct-transmission>

Malcolm wrote:

Sadly, this history is completely wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:34 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Kurp said:

<https://www.dzamlinggar.net/en/dzogchen/direct-transmission>

DIRECT TRANSMISSION

(...)

mutsuk said:

Ok, so this means direct introduction (ngo sprod). If you attended a teaching (webcast or live) during which the DI was given you have received that transmission but understanding it is different. I read somewhere some DC people saying stuff like "Oh I

was there, he gave it, but actually I did not received it" and things like that. Sorry but this is nonsense. The DI is about understanding the nature of the mind. It is easy to understand if you don't expect a magic trick that is going to make you a Buddha right away because understanding Rigpa has never liberated anyone on the spot. So during DI what you should expect is to have a clear understanding of the Emptiness-Clarity of your mind. This understanding is the knowledge (rig-pa) of the natural state. Again, if you don't project unrelated expectations on this, then it is very easy to understand. In a sense, you cannot "not have received it", in particular since Rinpoche gave it in a very clear and simple way. However, to transmit that DI yourself, you need to have your understanding of it validated by the master and then obtain his formal authorization.

Malcolm wrote:

These are actually Donwangs. They originally fell on the birth anniversaries of Garab Dorje, Guru P and Adzom Drukpa, and on these days we would do gurus yogas at the time of their birth. Then, ChNN switched giving to empowerments of Garab Dorje and Padmasambhava coordinated by video on these dates, and then finally, web casts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:35 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Good one, bob.

oldbob said:

UNOFFICIAL

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Dear Shang Shung Foundation,

This email is to legally certify that I have contacted ChNN in a dream and have received his permission to study and practice all of his Teachings.

I have his permission to receive a copy of the complete Digital Archive and the complete Transmission Archive in whatever condition of editing they are currently in - at the actual cost of the digital media. He said that I could have this for my practice use only and that I should not share this with anyone else, and I agree to this. He said that I should make sure that the Digital Media is returned to SSF after I have finished with it.

Please supply a quotation as to what it would cost for a copy of the digital media and for shipping to the following address:

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

---

Sincerely yours,

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Gar/Ling: \_\_\_\_\_

Membership Number: \_\_\_\_\_

Please send to:

mailto:m.k@shangshunginstitute.org

ob:world

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

climb-up said:

Do fully qualified lamas who give teachings and have also received ChNN's transmission not exist?

Malcolm wrote:

Other than Tsultrim's few practices, and perhaps Lama Denys in France, no one who is doing with the express permission of ChNN. People who do so are taking it upon themselves to do so. It's between them and the Dharmapālas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:47 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

climb-up said:

Do fully qualified lamas who give teachings and have also received ChNN's transmission not exist?

Malcolm wrote:

Other than Tsultrim's few practices, and perhaps Lama Denys in France, no one who is doing with the express permission of ChNN. People who do so are taking it upon

themselves to do so. It's between them and the Dharmapālas.

climb-up said:

Of course and, if they're public it's also between them and their students.

But didn't you recently post here that permission to teach was a modern political innovation and not a requirement from the tantra?

If someone has received the empowerments, done the retreats and the study and has the necessary level of realization (which is obviously difficult, that's true with any teacher right?) then they are qualified to pass on the teachings.

Is that not right?

Malcolm wrote:

Its not a modern innovation, per se, but the fact is that most people who start teaching do so when their guru passes away, and usually, to preserve the lineage, not promote themselves. It is ideal if one receives permission from one of one's gurus to teach. It is not necessary to receive permission from each and every one, however. Tulkus kind of have permission built in.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 4:48 AM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Don't zombies have awareness?

If they did, they would not be dead people in various stages of decomposition.

They have appetite.

Malcolm wrote:

So do Venus Flytraps.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

climb-up said:

Aren't there some empowerments that literally include a permission, or even encouragement, to teach?

I'm blanking on the name of the one I'm thinking of, but I thought that was an explicit thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is called the bka' gtad, the entrustment of the doctrine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

This email is to legally certify that I have contacted ChNN in a dream and have received his permission to study and practice all of his Teachings.

Danny said:

There's precedent...

Malcolm wrote:

Not really, you didn't understand the point of that story at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 7:48 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Tenma said:

Lmao, as a freshman here, duly noted!

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, when you get to 60, you'll understand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 9:11 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Predictable Backlash to Critical Race Theory: A Q&A With Kimberlé Crenshaw

<https://www.thenation.com/article/politics/critical-race-kimberle-crenshaw/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 22nd, 2021 at 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Danny said:  
There's precedent...

Malcolm wrote:  
Not really, you didn't understand the point of that story at all.

Danny said:  
Yeah I did. The point was Rinpoche said he was totally focused in trechod. That he was committed to that, and eventually was informed, nudged, hey! What about your togal?  
Malcolm  
Don't under cut...

Malcolm wrote:  
The point of that story is that ChNN was being too cautious and allowing his instructions to go to waste because he was not applying them.

And appearances in a dream are just ones own mind, nothing else. ChNN had a remarkable mind.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 12:34 AM  
Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity  
Content:  
Tlalok said:  
In 28 Days Later the Zombies are living humans infected with rabies, they are definitely sentient beings in that case.

Malcolm wrote:  
The name of the virus in 28 days later is "Rage", not rabies. In other news:  
"Danny Boyle has revealed he's working on a follow-up to 28 Days Later.

The director told The Independent that a third film is in the works with Ex Machina filmmaker Alex Garland, who wrote the 2002 original.

"Alex Garland and I have a wonderful idea for the third part," he said. "It's properly good."

He continued: "The original film led to a bit of a resurgence in the zombie drama and it doesn't reference any of that. It doesn't feel stale at all. He's concentrating on directing his own work at the moment, so it's stood in abeyance really, but it's a you-never-know."

Sequel 28 Weeks Later, directed by Juan Carlos Fresnadillo, was released in 2007.

Tlalok said:  
The question of "does a philosophical zombie have buddha nature" is an interesting

challenge though.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Try that in New England.

Malcolm wrote:

That happened. Weed was legal here before it was legal in CA. And:

<https://www.marijuanamoment.net/new-massachusetts-bills-would-decriminalize-all-drugs-and-study-regulated-sales-of-psychedelics/>

You can see from this article that this is a country-wide movement, and often supported by Republicans as well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 1:44 AM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Maybe so. But core generational values tend to stick around. It's demographics and it does matter.

Malcolm wrote:

I've seen a lot of college radicals become middle age conservatives, and even trump voters...just sayin...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 1:55 AM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Don't zombies have awareness?

Malcolm wrote:

If they did, they would not be dead people in various stages of decomposition.

zerwe said:

What about Vetalis? And, Vajravetali?

Shaun

Malcolm wrote:

Vetalas are a kind of spirit that reanimates a corpse. It's pretty hard to kill spirits.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 3:04 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

tinylocusta said:

There are so many things people are confused about here. A simple example: the empowerments for the three inner tantras mentioned in the Precious Vase. When you read that fragment it is clear it is for people following the SMS training, and during this training there is something to learn about each of these.

Malcolm wrote:

And Rinpoche made it very clear that everyone in the DC is to follow the base of SMS. So then?

tinylocusta said:

As entering the way of Mantra without receiving an initiation is negative, of course.

Malcolm wrote:

Dzogchen is part of Mantra. Without empowerment, no Dzogchen. You want citations? I can give you many.

The sgra thal 'gyur is the gold standard here, and the sgral thal 'gyur insists that empowerment, samaya, etc., are all important. So does Longchenpa, which Rinpoche held up as the gold standard of Tibetan masters, no merely once, but many times.

tinylocusta said:

Rinpoche describes it and gives some alternatives for people who can't do that. It is perfectly normal. The suggestion that what Rinpoche was giving to everybody for His whole life works only if you are extremely lucky and that now people should flock to other teachers to receive Dupa Do and Guhyagarbha makes no sense!

Malcolm wrote:

Since Rinpoche never gave the Guhyagarbha or long Anuyoga empowerment, his suggestion that people should receive then could only mean that people should seek out qualified teachers elsewhere, and receive them.

tinylocusta said:



(btw when you go to Blye [???] to receive Guhyagarbha you may want to ask earlier if you receive the whole thing, because normally it's given in parts.)

Malcolm wrote:  
It takes three days.

tinylocusta said:  
Such statements are in direct contradiction to what He was teaching.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, they are not.

tinylocusta said:  
Instead of receiving these initiations, people who haven't woken up should repeat what they received and sing the SoV. Of course if someone is doing SMS and studies the three inner tantras, that's a different thing.

Malcolm wrote:  
So now you are in a position to tell people what they ought and ought not do? You are just an anonymous voice on the internet, hiding behind a nym. If you had any courage whatsoever, you would post in your real name.

tinylocusta said:  
Some things seem to be said just for the sake of being said, I see no other reason. For example that people don't understand the qualifications of the teacher because they prefer to party...

Malcolm wrote:  
There are a lot of people in the DC who have been following Rinpoche for years, who still know nothing. It's not his fault. But it's good they have faith in him. At least that much will gain them birth in a dharma family in their next life.

tinylocusta said:  
Anyone who follows SMS is well aware of these things, regardless of their leisure preferences. In the Precious Vase Rinpoche quotes several pages about the necessary qualifications of teachers from Adzom Drugpa and Patrul Rinpoche.

Malcolm wrote:  
And people never read these things. Or if they read them, they forget them, and so on.

tinylocusta said:  
There are many more false things written here but I feel like I would act wrongly by discussing them.

Malcolm wrote:

Then your remarks are kind of pointless, no?

tinylocusta said:

Also, for everything I've written above you can easily find 10 counter-arguments and discuss these ad nauseam. I have no interest in these kinds of discussions; what I'm asking you - that is people blaming everybody outside - to reflect a bit how much of it is a projection of your minds and how beneficial or harmful are the things you write here.

Malcolm wrote:

No one is blaming anyone for anything. We are just observing the real situation. The real situation is that the DC Is dead in the water and sinking fast. All compounded things are impermanent. C'est la vie.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Kurp said:

Maybe Rinpoche saw how the community couldn't collaborate well and he was okay with things dying out over time.

Malcolm wrote:

He actually said it would be like Buddha's original sangha of monks, which broke into eighteen divisions. And that division was foretold by a dream of King Kṛkin, during the time of Buddha Kāśyapa. Kṛkin had a dream where he saw eighteen men tugging on one sheet of cloth, but the Buddha Kāśyapa interpreted the dream for him, saying it represented the sangha of Buddha Śākyamuni splitting into eighteen divisions, but the cloth itself would remain whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

He actually said it would be like Buddha's original sangha of monks, which broke into eighteen divisions. And that division was foretold by a dream of King Kṛkin, during the time of Buddha Kāśyapa. Kṛkin had a dream where he saw eighteen men tugging on one sheet of cloth, but the Buddha Kāśyapa interpreted the dream for him, saying it represented the sangha of Buddha Śākyamuni splitting into eighteen divisions, but the cloth itself would remain whole.

Virgo said:

You know I forgot about that completely. This is direct evidence that Rinpoche either knew directly or felt very, very strongly that this would happen, because he fully believed this.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

The reality is that people have opinions, some people are threatened by those opinions, and make samaya threats, etc., forgetting that they are just imposing limitations on other people, trying to shut down uncomfortable conversations.

Now, there are certain natural limitations, like for example the one that says that one has to have a living teacher to enter secret mantra, and so on. That's one teacher has to measure up to certain qualifications to be a teacher. And the fact that these days, a perfect teacher is almost impossible to find.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 6:10 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

The thing is, part of the DC is a cult

Malcolm wrote:

There, fixed it for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 6:22 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

Its a different person?

Knotty Veneer said:

Khentin Tai Situpa is a leading figure in the Karma Kagyu lineage. Guru of the 17th Karmapa Ogyen Trinley Dorje. He recognised the 12th Trungpa tulku many years ago. Tai Situpa is considered an emanation of Guru Rinpoche - I don't think he is the only one either. I think many important lamas in the Nyingma and Kagyu schools are considered as such.

Malcolm wrote:

Amitabha, actually, to the Karmapa's Avalokiteshvara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 7:23 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

tinylocusta said:

The unique approach of Rinpoche that stems from His meeting with Changchub Dorje is the presentation of Dzogchen as a complete path.

Malcolm wrote:

False. This was not unique to Changchub Dorje, etc.

tinylocusta said:

Other teachers have never done that. They were focused on preserving the totality of Buddha's teaching as presented in their tradition, starting with Vinaya (+presenting Tibetan "folklore", seeing it being destroyed and dying out). I have received various Dzogchen teachings from different teachers but they were always presented in the context of Vajrayana, especially the three inner tantras.

Malcolm wrote:

This was also ChNN's approach. It's unavoidable.

tinylocusta said:

So the first unique aspect of Rinpoche was to present Dzogchen as an independent path.

Malcolm wrote:

False. Not unique to ChNN. This has been in Nyinthig teachings since the 12th century, and before.

tinylocusta said:

The second - related - was aiming not only at "spiritual people", but the general population. This was not the case in Tibet: Dzogchen was often closely guarded and not taught openly, given only after a long training etc. Giving it openly is a recent phenomenon.

Malcolm wrote:

False, it was one of the most widespread and easily available teachings in Tibet. There are more manuals on Dzogchen than any other single teaching.

tinylocusta said:

Someone mentioned the concept of reincarnation. When you realize the nature of mind, you discover reincarnation doesn't exist, that you have never transmigrated.

Malcolm wrote:

False. Many people have discovered the nature of their mind, and yet they still continue to take rebirth. Thus is why most dzogchen practitioners, as ChNN stated many times, awaken in the bardo of dharmata after their minds separate from their bodies. You should really properly educate yourself before you continue to make yourself look ignorant.

tinylocusta said:

. So I see no conflict here: you could say that dbangs are necessary in order to practice Dzogchen and I can say they are not, and we're both right depending on semantics.

Malcolm wrote:

No, you would be wrong to say Dzogchen does not require empowerment, period.

tinylocusta said:

The third unique aspect of Rinpoche's teaching was going back to the roots.

Malcolm wrote:

Not in the manner you imply.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

I have no ill will towards Yeshe at all...

Malcolm wrote:

None of us do. We just want him to shit or get off the pot so the DC can get on with its life.

dharmafirststeps said:

Your posts about Yeshe seem incongruent with his own words about himself.

Malcolm wrote:

Highly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 7:57 PM

Title: Re: What if seeing a lama as pure was less about lifting a lama up and more about bringing purity

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's a moot point bc zombies are fictional.

PeterC said:

OK I'll bite. (No pun intended.) There are examples in nature of sentient beings being taken over by fungi. Read the link below with caution because it is pretty disgusting.

<https://www.nationalgeographic.com/animals/article/cordyceps-zombie-fungus-takes-over-ants>

Now - does the zombie ant still have Buddhanature?

Malcolm wrote:

One word: Matango

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Maybe so. But core generational values tend to stick around. It's demographics and it does matter.

Malcolm wrote:

I've seen a lot of college radicals become middle age conservatives, and even trump voters...just sayin...

KristenM said:

You don't say...

Malcolm wrote:

Funny thing is, this guy was always a conservative catholic, remember "Polly, I'm not an animal," the Pistol's anti-abortion song?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

There's just been a few posts that seem to interpret not seeing Yeshe as a viable leader/teacher for the community as being hostile towards him.

Malcolm wrote:

It's the opposite. Yeshe has done nothing but express hostility towards the DC since his father's passing (and for several years prior), blaming people like the D'Angelo brothers for stealing his father from him, when in fact, it was his father's choice with whom he spent time. Rather than being angry at the students his father surrounded himself with and to whom he dedicated his life, Yeshe should direct his unhappiness at its true source. If he wants to be left alone, the DC should leave him alone. But he should also get out of the way, and stop this unhealthy tango.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I do not think that it is correct to say that Rinpoche presented Dzogchen as a complete self-contained path, fullstop.

Malcolm wrote:

If he did, he would have only presented trekcho and thogal, following empowerment. In fact, he mostly focused on trekcho, and only very rarely did he teach thogal.

What ChNN understood, finally, from Changchub Dorje was the meaning of the teaching on the basis (gzhi) a.k.a the primordial state a.k.a the nature of one's own mind, in Dzogchen. That was the topic that had eluded ChNN in his previous studies and teachings he had received. If one does not understand the Dzogchen teaching on the basis, one cannot understand the Dzogchen path.

This is why he taught the way all Nyingma teachers do, extensively teaching on gzhi khregs chod combined with anuyoga transformation practices until people are ready to practice the path, lhun grub thogal, which almost no one does seriously. In this respect he was very traditional. He also tried to explain to people that the unelaborate path of Dzogchen, of the Nyingthig teachings, the utterly secret unsurpassed cycle, was beyond the nine yānas, a fact stated in the seventeen tantras themselves as well as all major Nyingthig cycles, and countless commentaries. In fact, ChNN taught Dzogchen in an utterly traditional way, as anyone who has extensively studied the length and breadth of Dzogchen teachings knows, and has not fallen for the bullshit propaganda some people in DC repeatedly drone, which mainly derives from an incorrect understanding of the Kun byed rGyal po and other sems sde texts. ChNN repeatedly stated that sems sde concerned the teaching on the basis, and that in essence, it was about khregs chod. If one does not understand that basis, one can do Ati guru yoga and sing the SOV until the cows come home, but it isn't really Dzogchen practice. Authentic teachers of Dzogchen spend years emphasizing the teaching on the basis to their students until they get it right. ChNN was exactly that kind of teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Funny thing is, this guy was always a conservative catholic, remember "Polly, I'm not an animal," the Pistol's anti-abortion song?

Knotty Veneer said:

Lydon was an avid Thatcherite back in the day. The Sex Pistols were never a protest band - their whole plan was to sell out and see how many people bought the records

even though they were laughed at openly by the band. All that anti-monarchy stuff was just to garner tabloid inches.

Malcolm wrote:

Even so, great rock and roll, even if it was a swindle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 9:57 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

tinylocusta said:

They seem quite distinct to me, even though they are not labelled as such. Whenever there is a mandala built gradually from the elements etc., you have Mahayoga. Some sadhanas even speak of "Mahamudra" at the end. When you have instant manifestation, usually it means Anuyoga.

Malcolm wrote:

Anuyoga has two systems: one gradual, one instant. Mahāmudra in Nyingma does not mean the same thing as mahāmudra in the gsar ma tantras. But in any case, ChNN affirmed countless times that the result of the two stages and the result of Dzogchen were the same.

tinylocusta said:

As to the tradition of practicing the three inner tantras together, it is omnipresent in Nyingma. Yes, the Nyinghtigs exist, but they are always being practiced in the context of Vajrayana, and some of them have more Mahayoga than Anuyoga.

Malcolm wrote:

And in Dzogchen Community. For example, the medium thun, which combines the system of Mahāyoga with the system of Anuyoga and the system of Atiyoga.

You are confusing "Nying thig," like klong chen snying thig as a fashionable name, with the term snying thig, for example Vima snying thig, which is strictly about the utterly secret unsurpassed cycle of the man ngag sde tantras. They are not the same thing at all.

tinylocusta said:

As for Yeshe, I'd prefer not to speculate about Him or His intentions.

Malcolm wrote:

You are free to take anyone you like as a teacher, and devotionally capitalizing the indefinite pronouns when referencing them. It's fine with me. Weird to do so, but whatever.



We don't need to speculate. Yeshe made his attitude towards the broader community, as well as Buddhadharma, clear as a bell.

The criteria for following a teacher are clearly laid out in the Dzogchen tantras and elsewhere. ChNN hit every one of those marks. Why would I need another teacher? ChNN was a perfect teacher, who I studied and practiced under for 26 years. I don't need another Dzogchen teacher in this life, other than the ones I already have studied with. You have a different idea, and that is your choice. No one is criticizing you or anyone else, or and telling you or anyone else that you or anyone else cannot take Yeshe as a guru. That's strictly between you and him. Any criticism offered to you here concern your deficiencies of learning, evident in your bombastic pronouncements and misstatements of fact.

tinylocusta said:

My aim writing here was to ask people to reflect before using offensive words against Him. I had honestly thought these were accidental and that people would reflect and adjust their attitude. But it is obvious now that at least in some cases it was not intentional but done on purpose so basically all that I wrote was in vain.

Malcolm wrote:

No one here wrote any thing offensive about Yeshe Namkhai. Not one word. The only person offended here is you. And you decided to be offended, then self-righteous, as if you have any business trying to condition other people at all. This is all on you, not on us.

tinylocusta said:

Or worse, maybe provoked even more slander.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no slander here. No one is saying that Yeshe is a bad or evil person, or that by choosing to leave the community he did something inherently wrong. His actions certainly confuse a lot of people. But he is just an ordinary person in a human body with human problems, just like everyone else. Some people are disappointed he did not don the mantle. Personally, I could care less. But I do think his little dance with the community is harming the community, and that he ought to be in or be out, rather than one foot in the door and one foot out.

tinylocusta said:

I prefer to follow the advice of my teachers and be careful about the consequences of my actions and I feel it will be better if I don't post here anymore because the result seem to be more negative than positive. Again, I'm very sorry if I gave rise to any negative emotions. We are all Vajra brothers and sisters, and I sincerely apologize to all of you.

Malcolm wrote:

You should worry about your own negative emotions, since that is what caused you to post your missives here in the first place. But since you don't believe in karma, it doesn't matter. There are no consequences to your actions at all. Bye.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Funny thing is, this guy was always a conservative catholic, remember "Polly, I'm not an animal," the Pistol's anti-abortion song?

Knotty Veneer said:

Lydon was an avid Thatcherite back in the day. The Sex Pistols were never a protest band - their whole plan was to sell out and see how many people bought the records even though they were laughed at openly by the band. All that anti-monarchy stuff was just to garner tabloid inches.

Queequeg said:

Isn't the punk ethos fundamentally nihilist in view?

Malcolm wrote:

I wouldn't say that, as a former punk rock musician from the late seventies/early eighties. It was a rejection, principally, of arena rock and commercialism, attended with a lot of social justice concerns in fact, for example the Pop Group, the Slits, Crass, etc. Sure, a lot of it was just adolescent good fun. Grunge was much more nihilistic than Punk. Punk, if anything, was pretty idealistic, in a disappointed sort of way. The sixties did not work out the way they were supposed to.

Queequeg said:

Isn't Trumpism basically nihilist trolling?

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 10:08 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

reiun said:

Instead, let freshmen campaign for social justice and respect.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a good use of their time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Try that in New England.

Malcolm wrote:

That happened. Weed was legal here before it was legal in CA. And:

<https://www.marijuanamoment.net/new-massachusetts-bills-would-decriminalize-all-drugs-and-study-regulated-sales-of-psychedelics/>

You can see from this article that this is a country-wide movement, and often supported by Republicans as well.

Crazywisdom said:

I get you're in love with you're homeland. What little time I spent in Boston, I can tell you that you guys have racism issue, as well as people being A-holes.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, the Boston Irish are pretty racist. But I lived mostly in Cambridge, and Cambridge is more like Berkeley, just smaller.

Crazywisdom said:

Maybe it's better in other places. But overall the East Coast is just not my cup of tea.

Also I'm not in love with CA or the West Coast or the USA for that matter. I'm just saying CA is not about to implode in apocalyptic proportions. That's just your fantasy and rah rah for MA, which ... Meh...

Malcolm wrote:

We all know that Mad Max was set in CA.

Crazywisdom said:

California is a rip off. There's elitism going on there which basically destroys everything that ever made CA cool, especially SF. The state is a giant business meeting. Super boring.

Malcolm wrote:

That's pretty funny.

Crazywisdom said:

I spent my formative years in Southern Oregon around racists that Jim Crowed me. I hate those kind of people. In my opinion that Trump gave those A-holes a great sense of

empowerment. With the court appointments, etc., The USA is screwed dude. They basically won. Random killings of Asians coast to coast.

Malcolm wrote:

Oregon is state founded on racism. It was written into their constitution, as you surely know.

<https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2019/04/08/how-the-south-won-the-civil-war>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 23rd, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Fear of Woking

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Isn't the punk ethos fundamentally nihilist in view?

I wouldn't say that, as a former punk rock musician from the late seventies/early eighties. It was a rejection, principally, of arena rock and commercialism, attended with a lot of social justice concerns in fact, for example the Pop Group, the Slits, Crass, etc. Sure, a lot of it was just adolescent good fun. Grunge was much more nihilistic than Punk. Punk, if anything, was pretty idealistic, in a disappointed sort of way. The sixties did not work out the way they were supposed to.

Queequeg said:

Good points.

Maybe it would be better to identify different streams in punk. When I think of the Sex Pistols, I don't think of social justice. I just think of a big, loud middle finger to the proverbial man. And I think there is a strain of punk that follows down that stream - I'd say it culminated with GG Allin, running around an NYU student lounge naked and flinging his shit at people.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this was the Malcolm McLaren version.

Queequeg said:

And then there are the militant punks who very easily could be transformed into Brown Shirts. I think you can discern those impulses down through the skinhead scene to the present in groups like the Proud Boys. Yeah yeah, Ian McKay and Henry Rollins were progressive skinheads - but they're also overbearing, holier than thou ass holes - a few shades away from leftist authoritarians.

Malcolm wrote:

Gavin Mcleod was musician in punk band in Canada.

Queequeg said:

Ian McKay and Henry Rollins

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely not skinheads. They didn't even have shaved head, apart from McKay and they had no fashion sense at all.

"Skinhead" was a fashion, which ultimately came from merging the hard mod fashion with Jamaican Rude Boy fashion in the late 60's. To be a skinhead required that you wore the right gear, levis, eight or ten-eyelet DMS, skinny braces, Fred Perry, etc., and importantly, football! It started here because people liked the look of Selector, the Specials, Madness, and so on. Then Oi! started getting promoted first in England, then here.

I was a skinhead in the early 80's, because of Ska music and Oi!. I played in a reggae band in Boston, etc. I saw the whole scene go to shit because of the white power assholes, circa 1982 onward. Plus Skinhead fashion was cool in the Industrial Music scene, and that did lead some people into neonationalist territory, like Death in June, etc. West coast punks with leather jackets and Frye motorcycle boots were something else, same with Minor Threat, who wore sneakers for lord's sake. And even if these US punks had DM's, they generally never knew how to lace them properly, so they looked pretty clueless.

I abandoned that fashion completely in 1985 when I saw a ten year old on a skateboard dressed exactly like me. But it was a good look and since I was working in food service the whole time, from 1980-1986 or so, it served me well.

Queequeg said:

One of my Trumpist cousins was a skinhead who with his gang of righteous dudes would fight NeoNazis and White Power skinheads in Trenton. The slip is easier than we might have thought looking at those guys when they were 17.

Malcolm wrote:

Some guys never grow out of the "our gang" mentality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is why he taught the way \_all\_ Nyingma teachers do, extensively teaching on gzhi khregs chod combined with anuyoga transformation practices until people are ready to practice the path, lhun grub thogal, which almost no one does seriously.

fckw said:

Just to understand this sentence - what do you mean, "almost no one does seriously"? What's lacking here, right effort, or right view (and thus understanding of the path), or

anything else? In what sense do you mean people are not ready to practice lhund drup thogal?

Malcolm wrote:

In general, people should not practice thogal until they have understood the view, khregs chod, and stabilized it very firmly. That view is not an intellectual view, but is based on the experience of the nature of the mind during empowerment. That experiential view should be very stable. ChNN taught thogal very infrequently, largely because it is clear he had doubts about people's stability in the view.

Now, of course, there is no one who will continue those transmissions in the DC unless or until something changes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: The Mess at the Texas Border

Content:

Queequeg said:

WTF is going on?!!

Malcolm wrote:

Racism in action. White man on horse beats down a Black man on foot. Same old story in Texas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 12:40 AM

Title: Re: The Mess at the Texas Border

Content:

Queequeg said:

Of course, a lot of us don't know about this because they just found Gabby Petito's body and the manhunt is on for her boyfriend.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently, f\*\*cks are only given if you are a white, female blogger. Countless native women and WOC go missing every year, and no f\*\*ks are given at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
Cambridge is probably cool, but expensive.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yup, once they eliminated rent control, that was it.

Crazywisdom said:  
I didn't see any ref to Oregon in the article but I know the history.

Malcolm wrote:  
Did you know there is a community of Confederate exiles living in Brazil?

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Confederados>

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/New\\_Texas](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/New_Texas)

Belize as well:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Confederate\\_settlements\\_in\\_British\\_Honduras](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Confederate_settlements_in_British_Honduras)

Mexico:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/New\\_Virginia\\_Colony](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/New_Virginia_Colony)

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 1:16 AM  
Title: Re: Fear of Woking  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
I abandoned that fashion completely in 1985 when I saw a ten year old on a skateboard dressed exactly like me.

Queequeg said:  
Sorry. That might have been me.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nah, it was probably Ben Affleck.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 1:19 AM  
Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu  
Content:  
oldbob said:  
or 3) from the spirit of ChNNR via the World-wide Transmission of the Guru Yoga of

Garab Dorje, on the web, as was done by ChNNR at many times before.

Tongnyid Dorje said:

Seriously? from the spirit of ChNNR?

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, it's going to get a whole lot weirder then this, strange people will start hanging out shingles saying they were authorized by ChNN in dreams and visions to be Dzogchen teachers. And since there is freedom of religion in most places in the "first" world, no one will be able to stop them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 2:07 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

No, that's incorrect, Malcolm.

Malcolm wrote:

ok.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Chögyal Namkhai Norbu never authorized any SMS teacher to give Initiations, Direct Transmission in any form, or Lungs, so such an activity can not be recognized by ATIF.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, the DC is dead in the water.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 2:55 AM



Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Virgo said:

Menpa Malcolm,

Is there a reason people can't be relaxed, happy, and collaborative?

Why do people always seem to be aggressive, unhappy and strongly opinionated, so often?

Malcolm wrote:

Self-grasping.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=381061#p381061>

It remains for each individual to work out their spiritual path - with diligence.

Malcolm wrote:

In any case, the whole principle of hereditary lineages is unworkable and not what the Buddha intended at all:

1. Now the Blessed One spoke to the Venerable Ananda, saying: "It may be, Ananda, that to some among you the thought will come: 'Ended is the word of the Master; we have a Master no longer.' But it should not, Ananda, be so considered. For that which I have proclaimed and made known as the Dhamma and the Discipline, that shall be your Master when I am gone.

<https://accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/dn/dn.16.1-6.vaji.html>

So it is at present. The method of how to find a teacher and rely on a teacher exists in the sutras and tantras of the Buddha. The words of our teacher, Chogyal Namkhai Norbu are fully in accordance with the words of sūtra and tantra, and there is no contradiction with them at all.

The institutional paralysis of the DC will eventually pass, or not, but even if ChNN's direct lineage dies out, his mark on the world will be noted. Fortunately, there are sufficient numbers of people out there who can properly pass on the essence of the Dzogchen teachings.

And with any teacher of course, caveat emptor. There are many people out there who show a deer tail, but sell horse meat. Every teacher needs to be examined, as does every student.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

This is one of the reasons that I personally always look with some skepticism on claims of "Well Rinpoche said it should be like this" about everything under the sun, particularly when they are not backed up by quotes from Rinpoche himself.

Malcolm wrote:

ChNN said many things to many people, some statements directly contradicting other statements. The notion one can take in a whole gem with a thousand facets by looking at only one facet is a delusion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 3:43 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

So Chogyam Trungpa Rinpoche is back?

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how seriously one takes tulku recognitions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 3:48 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

This is one of the reasons that I personally always look with some skepticism on claims of "Well Rinpoche said it should be like this" about everything under the sun, particularly when they are not backed up by quotes from Rinpoche himself.

Malcolm wrote:

ChNN said many things to many people, some statements directly contradicting other statements. The notion one can take in a whole gem with a thousand facets by looking

at only one facet is a delusion.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I agree with that, even when quotes are provided they tend to be open to interpretation and not directly linked to the claim. At least they are quotes though. I have seen all manner of claims made about the DC, the status and importance of membership, what Rinpoche wanted with this, that or the other thing, with \*no\* quote attached at all. I find it amazing that anyone would even consider claims framed like that, but maybe that's just me. Personally, I know how organizations work (and well, don't work) and so I am very skeptical about organizational claims made based on hearsay on Rinpoche's words.

Malcolm wrote:

Sat in on a hundred Gakyil meetings, and heard a hundred people claiming this was Rinpoche's vision and that was Rinpoche's vision, all fighting with each other. If you want to truly learn how to break samaya, join a Gakyil.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 4:12 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

climb-up said:

Something like that right?

Malcolm wrote:

Hopefully, we will do our best.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 8:25 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

re: Malcolm on Tulku

So either CTR didn't really reincarnate...

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but no one actually knows where.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Skandhas in all schools of Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

johnwhi said:

1. Do all modern schools of Mahayana Buddhism believe that every person is made up of skandhas?

2. Do all modern schools of Mahayana Buddhism allow Buddhists, Buddhas and Bodhisattvas to believe that other people consist of skandhas such as form, sensations, perceptions, mental activity or formations and consciousness, or are only Buddhists who have not yet come to enlightenment allowed to believe in it?

Thanks

Malcolm wrote:

1. Yes.

2. The aggregates are a common teaching in Mahayana, taught by Buddhas and high bodhisattvas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

Would it be right or wrong to say:

1. The person who died is dead, gone, no more, not going to return or reincarnate.

2. The person who reincarnated is a NEW person, a different person, not the same guy who died.

heart said:

Last life you where a goat and now you are padmist, are you the same guy?

Sentient beings don't have an ego/self that is travelling from one life to an other, this is a basic buddhist teaching. The self is an illusion. Tulkus supposedly don't really have even the illusion of a self their actions are a reflection of their circumstances.

/magnus

Padmist said:

Would you say then that the goat completely died, ceased to exist, vanished and that this new Padmist is a completely different entity?

Malcolm wrote:

Nothings transfers from this life to the next, but aggregates are serially connected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Thinking about the 7th Root Downfall

Content:

nightbloom said:

But is it acceptable to speak, in very general terms, about the logic of tantric practice? For instance, can I explain what the four activities are, or talk in broad terms about creation and completion stage? The role of the yidam, pure perception, etc?

Malcolm wrote:

What you do is you recommend a book by a lineage master that discusses these issues in general terms. If they buy it, they are interested. If they don't, they are not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yes I am aware. You run into folks from those Nazi expat colonies who took child brides and crazy stuff. But at least in Cities you never see it. Brazil is a giant party.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, September 24th, 2021 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

Didn't they show up at his monastery anyway and hold some sort of enthronement ceremony for Mukpo Jr.?

Nobody in their right mind would entrust anyone's education to that group

Knotty Veneer said:

I'm not sure - I know Shambhala were late to the party for the XIIth Trungpa (as well as for the 17th Karmapa!). My teacher the late Akong Rinpoche, I believe, was one of his main benefactors for many years (and his organization Rokpa may still be).

Shambhala has little to do with the traditional teachings of the Trungpa lineage and even though some members (and former members like Pema Chodron) practise within the Kagyu tradition to some degree, I think they are their own thing. So while it is good that Shambhala help with some money, their interest is not really with the Trungpa

lineage so much as with the teachings specific to the 11th Trungpa. Whether the current Trungpa will take any of those up, we wait to see. I cannot imagine him though requesting a lineage transmission from Osel Mukpo the current holder though, so it's probably unlikely.

Malcolm wrote:

At this point the Shambhala lineage is not even Buddhist. It has become a strange cult of Gesar, with a bit of Bon and Kalacakra mythos tossed in for good measure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

At this point the Shambhala lineage is not even Buddhist. It has become a strange cult of Gesar, with a bit of Bon and Kalacakra mythos tossed in for good measure.

Knotty Veneer said:

Would agree. Always considered its relationship to Tibetan Buddhism, the same as that of Mormonism to mainstream Protestantism. An American pastiche of the original. A new religion for a new continent. A bit of hokum.

It has never really taken off in Europe. We are not impressed by absolute monarchies so much any more. It's strange that the US, given its founding myth, would be the seed bed for a spiritual monarchical movement.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, the Shambhala thing found its home in Canada, because Americans do not like kings in general. Canada is a monarchy, at least, the Queen thinks so:

<https://www.royal.uk/canada>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yes I am aware. You run into folks from those Nazi expat colonies who took child brides and crazy stuff. But at least in Cities you never see it. Brazil is a giant party.

This film is fictional.

Malcolm wrote:  
Of course it is.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 12:35 AM  
Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California  
Content:  
Crazywisdom said:  
Crime here is economic, alcohol and drug related.

Malcolm wrote:  
And environmental...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 4:46 AM  
Title: Re: Thinking about the 7th Root Downfall  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
What you do is you recommend a book by a lineage master that discusses these issues in general terms. If they buy it, they are interested. If they don't, they are not.

nightbloom said:  
Of the available introductory works, is there one that stands out to you? I bypassed most of these.

Malcolm wrote:  
Approaching the Buddhist Path, HHDL.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 4:50 AM  
Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California  
Content:  
Crazywisdom said:  
The US is the worst offender.

Malcolm wrote:  
No.

<https://epi.yale.edu/epi-results/2020/component/epi>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 4:52 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

Great. So characteristics carried through? Can we say then that Padmist is a totally different new persona and not in any way connected to that goat who died except that goats karma/characteristics/habits got transferred to the newly born guy (Padmist)?

Malcolm wrote:

No, you cannot say that.

No entity passes from this life to the next, but the aggregates of the life are serially connected to the aggregates of the next, so there is a continuum.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I've been told that Lama Norlha didn't give permission for any of his people to do solitary retreats. Apparently he thought you needed other irritating people around to demonstrate to yourself the limitations of your practice. Without them you might think you're making a lot more headway than you really are.

heart said:

It is a question of logistics, teachings, empowerments and pith instructions should be delivered at the right moment. Solitary retreat is for those that already have experience and no need for a teachings and so on. Also a solitary retreat can be any length so no need for the three year format. Read Jamgon Kongtrul's Retreat Manual.

/magnus

conebeckham said:

I agree with all of this, too. 3 year retreat is sorta like "college" in our lineage. It's a training ground and requires supervision at various points.

also, some of the practices require more than one person, really--I can't imagine someone doing some of the drupchos on their own. You just can't cover all the necessities.

Malcolm wrote:

It all depends on the kind of three year retreat.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 9:14 AM

Title: Re: Why are sand mandala's actually destroyed?

Content:

Hazel said:

So I was under the impression that sand mandala destruction was meant to be a reminder of impermanence. However, I recently heard (second hand) that a monk said this was not the case.

Is there a meaning other than the one I assumed?

I suspect based on the second hand paraphrasing that it might have been a joke that flew over this person's head.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it's connected with completion stage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 9:16 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

Great. So characteristics carried through? Can we say then that Padmist is a totally different new persona and not in any way connected to that goat who died except that goats karma/characteristics/habits got transferred to the newly born guy (Padmist)?

Malcolm wrote:

No, you cannot say that.

No entity passes from this life to the next, but the aggregates of the life are serially connected to the aggregates of the next, so there is a continuum.

Padmist said:

You meant the 2nd part right?

We can't say this -> "that goats karma/characteristics/habits got transferred to the newly born guy (Padmist)"

But can I say this? -> When you die, you just die, it's over. No reincarnation or resurrection or anything. If "you" are reborn, it isn't you at all. It's a totally different new guy.

Malcolm wrote:  
Both positions are wrong.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 7:10 PM  
Title: Re: Skandhas in all schools of Mahayana Buddhism  
Content:  
Aemilius said:

"In the Samyukta Agama, the Buddha asks the ascetic Shrenika Vatsagotra if the Tathagata (another name for a buddha) is the same as the skandhas, and Shrenika says, "No, Bhagavan." Again the Buddha asks if the Tathagata is separate from the skandhas, and again Shrenika answers, "No, Bhagavan." The Buddha then asks if the Tathagata is inside the skandhas. Again Shrenika answers, "No, Bhagavan." The Buddha then asks if the skandhas are inside the Tathagata. Once more Shrenika says, "No, Bhagavan." Finally the Buddha asks if the Tathagata is not the skandhas, to which Shrenika answers, "No, Bhagavan". Likewise, in the Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines, the Buddha says that enlightenment is neither inside the skandhas nor outside them, nor both inside and outside them, nor other than the skandhas."

The Heart-sutra, Translation and Commentary by Red Pine

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, because thus would make the tathagata and bodhi a self.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 7:13 PM  
Title: Re: Not sure where to go  
Content:

Ardha said:  
I can just sit and be while taking in everything around me, not having to be anywhere or do anything. But there is stuff I want to do and like doing, but what I get is that Buddhism would have me just sit blissed out in a room with four walls and never do anything else but eat and sleep.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, That's Samkhya. Buddhism wants you to get out and help people.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 7:15 PM  
Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No entity passes from this life to the next, but the aggregates of the life are serially connected to the aggregates of the next, so there is a continuum.

yagmort said:

i have hard time distinguishing between the meaning of terms like consciousness, mind, awareness and intelligence.. so if i use a loose term "primordial awareness", then when and where it fits into this scheme?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, this is an English word. So it is hard to know what it is supposed to mean unless you give more context.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 7:17 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

Perhaps it would be easier to grasp rebirth and self if you tried instead to grasp the opposite, the True Self,

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing in Buddhadharma. Suchness is not a self, as the very passage you cite states.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 7:19 PM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Kelwin said:

Not only that, if you want to reach realization, the 3 year retreat is actually a terrible way to do it. Anytime you feel like you're getting to know a practice, you already have to learn the next one and complete all the related accumulations.

Malcolm wrote:

Unless, like myself, you focus on one sadhana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 8:58 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

It's mentioned in the Perfection of Wisdom Sutra, Maha Prajna Paramita. I share your

misgivings. But there it is.

Malcolm wrote:

No, the term "true self" is not used in any Prajñāpāramita sūtra.

One interpretation could be that there is a trend in Mahayana to speak in positives, even though it is controversial since it could mislead some people.

Supramundane said:

Remember that, although the Buddha rejected an eternal self, he never advocated no self.

Malcolm wrote:

False.

Supramundane said:

The middle way is in between, and I think that's what is meant by the True Self in this sutra: the correct conception of self, which is in between the eternal and the nihilistic.

Malcolm wrote:

Not, this is not correct. There is nothing in the middle which can be termed "a self," true or otherwise.

Supramundane said:

But usually Buddhism expresses itself in terms of negations --- not negatives--- but negations. And thus true self is controversial, but we do see it in certain sutras where Buddhahood is spoken as a 'womb' or an 'embryo'.

Malcolm wrote:

No, there we just see the term "self" used. How? As in the Uttaratantra commentary by Asanga, the term ātmapāramitā refers to a kind of two fold purity: freedom from the taint of general and specific characteristics, posited as freedom from the eternalist atman of nonbuddhists and the annihilationist anatman of śrāvakayānists.

And no, tathāgatagarbha is not "buddhahood." For example, the Lanka equates it with the ālayavijñāna.

Supramundane said:

If we speak of it as a womb, it is pure potential, but if we speak of it as an embryo, that means that there is something there. It is a positive.

Malcolm wrote:

No, there isn't anything "there."

Supramundane said:

I think that if we are careful in judicious, it's okay to speak in positives, such as true self and true mind as opposed to false self and false mind.

Malcolm wrote:

All concepts of self are false imputations.

Supramundane said:

In the Surangama sutra --- one which you quote frequently and one which I believe you are currently reading, my friend --- I hate to tell you, but there are 149 references to true mind, true eternity, true bliss, true purity, and yes, true self. Do not mistake true with eternal, however. As I stated above, I believe 'true' refers more to a true conception of self, i.e. a non-self.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't accept that this is a valid sūtra. It is a Chinese pastiche.

Supramundane said:

The other sutras which refer to Buddhanature in the positive are the Platform Sutra, the Queen Srimālā of the Lion's Roar Sutra, the Sutra of Complete Enlightenment, Mahaparanirvana Sutra, among others.

Malcolm wrote:

The Platform Sūtra is not a sūtra.

Nevertheless, the second turning of the wheel is definitive, not the third. This is easily proven through both scripture and reasoning.

With respect to the tathāgatagarbha doctrine, if understood correctly, it can be understood as definitive, understood as you have presented it above, "If we speak of it as a womb, it is pure potential, but if we speak of it as an embryo, that means that there is something there. It is a positive," this is just eternalism, not better than the Hindu concept of self. So no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Most of these Vajrayana paths require group practice for accomplishment, which is what you find at a 3 Year Retreat.

Malcolm wrote:

This is strictly a Kagyu and Nyingma thing, and a late development as well. Sakyapas and Gelukpas do these solo, after having received the complete transmission for everything needed to accomplish the retreat. Of course they have consulting teachers

who guide them through the material.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's well established the US's emissions of green house gases over the 20th century until now is by far the largest contribution to global warming, and therefore owes the world damages in the form of enormous investments domestic and internationally. Global industrialization was largely a US project.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it was also a Soviet and Chinese project. One cannot isolate the US in this. Economies have always been global, as are environments. Europe also industrialized, especially England. You can say that the global north, meaning US and Western Europe have a debt to the global south, but that is a different issue and involves a lot more than just climate degradation.

Crazywisdom said:

Given there is about ten years to fix 120 years of damage, the US has a moral obligation to fund this and use it's power to get everyone else to chip in.

Malcolm wrote:

Can't be fixed. Mitigation and preparation, however, that can be done.

Crazywisdom said:

However, the government in the US is weak. Nothing will happen until there's a massive disaster. Which brings us back to California. At least Newsom has a vision.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a massive disaster happening right now. People are not cognitively wired to perceive slow-moving disasters. That's why that fool in Brazil is cutting down rainforests as fast as he can and South America is in an epic drought that is only going to get worse. Things are not going to get better. Climate refugees are already a thing from Africa and Central America. The US and Western Europe are going through fits of authoritarianism because of the fact that people are on the move, and more of them will be on the move for the next 500 years and no one is preparing for that. Syria, for example, is a directly result of climate change. The Arab Spring was originally caused by farmers protesting water shortages. It then turned into a civil war. Much the same thing will happen in the Western US, especially with lunatics like the Bundys. Water wars used to be common in the 19th century, with feuds between farmers and ranchers. This is why there is a complicated water allocations in CA and other western states which are now being upended. It all looks pretty grim to me. That's why I selected to live in the area of the

United States that has the largest continuous forest. Water. It wasn't just because I was raised here. It was a conscious choice. There are a lot of places "cooler" than New England, but there are not many places in the US with sturdy 200 year old houses, ample trees, etc. There are 25 million acres of deciduous tree between PA and ME. Where there are trees, there is water. Where trees are cut down, there is drought.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: Two recent BDK publications:

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Thanks for the reply. Seems reasonable to have a look at Xuanzang's translation, expecting a clearer understanding of East Asian Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Xuantsang is a valuable resource for understanding Yogacāra thought in the 6th century India. This is his main value.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 9:47 PM

Title: Re: The four causes of rebirth in Dewachen (Sukhavati)

Content:

Mirror said:

And my question is: Are these four causes really necessary for rebirth in the Pure land (without which we can not be born there)?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, they are all necessary. And all four of those causes are found in the Aspiration of Samantabhadra, so it is sufficient to recite that. Of course, as mentioned above, there are Vajrayāna methods with supplement those or surpass them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

Also, the platform Sutra is not a Sutra, why not?

Sort of like the way Pluto is not a planet? LOL

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's a biography of Huineng.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 10:14 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

Also, the platform Sutra is not a Sutra, why not?

Sort of like the way Pluto is not a planet? LOL

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's a biography of Huineng. It and other Chinese texts spurious and otherwise are irrelevant in this forum.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 10:15 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

I stand by my claim that the Buddha never declared that there is no self;

Malcolm wrote:

You would be tragically wrong, in that case.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 11:13 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

I wouldn't want that!

If you say there is absolutely no self, is this not tantamount to nihilism?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course not. There is a "self" which serves as a nominal designation for aggregates, but there is no actual self that is one, all, or separate from the aggregates.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: The four causes of rebirth in Dewachen (Sukhavati)

Content:



明安 Myoan said:

As stated above, bodhicitta here is in the framework of Vajrayana teachings and practice.

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhicitta is the defining feature of Mahayana, period.

明安 Myoan said:

In Japanese Pure Land, too, one aspires to be born in Amida Buddha's Pure Land in order to save all sentient beings.

Malcolm wrote:

Thus it is a Mahayana path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, September 25th, 2021 at 11:31 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Supramundane said:

I wouldn't want that!

If you say there is absolutely no self, is this not tantamount to nihilism?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course not. There is a "self" which serves as a nominal designation for aggregates, but there is no actual self that is one, all, or separate from the aggregates.

Supramundane said:

But "the nominal designation" you refer to is false, i.e. an illusion.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but the Buddha allowed it for the purpose of discourse.

Supramundane said:

You seem to be opting for a no self. Isn't there room for a non-self?

What about our Buddhanature....

Malcolm wrote:

"No self" is non-affirming negation. It does not fall into any extreme, since an existent self is not being negated.

"Non-self" is an affirming negation since it affirms there is a self that remains to be proven, hence it falls into both extremes at once.

Buddhanature is a provisional teaching for those who can't fully accept emptiness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 12:28 AM

Title: Re: The four causes of rebirth in Dewachen (Sukhavati)

Content:

明安 Myoan said:

Yes, no disagreement here.

In Jodo Shu Buddhism, one approaches the matter of fulfilling this Mahayana Vow through the Three Minds and Four Modes of Practice, which center around Amida Buddha.

Malcolm wrote:

Right. I was only giving support to the OP.

In Indo-Tibetan Buddhism, aspiring for birth in Sukhavati is baked in, encompassed in the Bhadracaryapranidhana, as mentioned, the whole, or portions of which are recited daily.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 12:37 AM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Most of these Vajrayana paths require group practice for accomplishment, which is what you find at a 3 Year Retreat.

Malcolm wrote:

This is strictly a Kagyu and Nyingma thing, and a late development as well. Sakyapas and Gelukpas do these solo, after having received the complete transmission for everything needed to accomplish the retreat. Of course they have consulting teachers who guide them through the material.

Crazywisdom said:

The Guhyagarbha is not a late development.

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring to the style of three year retreat as composed by Kongtruk in his manual. The institutional

Three year retreat is modern. Originally the idea of a three year retreat comes from kakacakra, which was the elite system practiced by kagyus, sakyapas (and Jonang) and Gelukpas during the 13th and 14th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's true the major powers share the blame. But the stats show US dwarfs the rest in pollution historically. Things are changing. China plays a larger role currently. Highly doubtful China helps this situation going forward. And convincing Putin is a nonstarter.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Crazywisdom said:

Deforestation is certainly terrible. Bolsonaro didn't invent it. He's definitely not helping. His days are also numbered.

Malcolm wrote:

We'll see. Brazil was a dictatorship before, it can be one again, very easily.

Crazywisdom said:

But one hardly can picture the vastness of the Amazon rainforest. It's quite literally an ocean. It's almost as large as the entire USA. It's not just the Amazon either. The amount of fresh water in South America is mind boggling. Doom prognosis of a dry South America is overblown.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. That's what people thought about forests on the west coast. This article outlines the scope of the issue:

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2021/09/24/argentina-brazil-south-america-drought/>

Crazywisdom said:

North America is far drier and in much worse trouble. No doubt there's water in your side. The problems will come from flooding and topsoil runoff leading to deforestation. It seems nobody is safe.

Malcolm wrote:

That's mostly a midwestern and western problem. But yes, notions of safety need to be redefined.

Crazywisdom said:

Speaking of oceans, destruction of fisheries and the ocean floor by giant dragnets plays a much larger role in global warming than previously known. That is happening at a

frightening pace. In essence once the oceans are ruined, everything will be ruined. So reforestation and greenhouse gas reductions won't be enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. Kill the plankton, everything else on top dies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That's why I selected to live in the area of the United States that has the largest continuous forest. Water. It wasn't just because I was raised here. It was a conscious choice. There are a lot of places "cooler" than New England, but there are not many places in the US with sturdy 200 year old houses, ample trees, etc. There are 25 million acres of deciduous tree between PA and ME. Where there are trees, there is water. Where trees are cut down, there is drought.

KristenM said:

Sounds great. Hey, I'd kind of like to move, at least have the option. But no one pays even close to the pay here in California for my line of work. I'll possibly move out of state when I retire. If it's not too late. Or just buy an electric RV and travel the world like some Mad Max Apocalyptic Road Warrior.

Malcolm wrote:

Unsustainable means for our grandchildren. I am sure you will be just fine in CA for the foreseeable. You still have Lake Tahoe to ravish.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Deforestation of the Amazon as of 2019:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

KristenM said:

Sounds great. Hey, I'd kind of like to move, at least have the option. But no one pays

even close to the pay here in California for my line of work. I'll possibly move out of state when I retire. If it's not too late. Or just buy an electric RV and travel the world like some Mad Max Apocalyptic Road Warrior.

Malcolm wrote:

Unsustainable means for our grandchildren. I am sure you will be just fine in CA for the foreseeable. You still have Lake Tahoe to ravish.

KristenM said:

I hope so, but then being an Apocalypse Road Warrior sounds kinda groovy. I already have this thing picked out.

<https://www.canoo.com/canoo/>

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know, I am still hankering for the Ford 150 Lightning...YMMV

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 1:46 AM

Title: Re: The four causes of rebirth in Dewachen (Sukhavati)

Content:

明安 Myoan said:

Yes, no disagreement here.

In Jodo Shu Buddhism, one approaches the matter of fulfilling this Mahayana Vow through the Three Minds and Four Modes of Practice, which center around Amida Buddha.

Those who make this heartfelt aspiration for the bodhisattva way Will be free of all lower rebirths,

Free of harmful companions,

And will quickly see Amitabha, Infinite Light.

.....

When the moment of my death arrives,

By eliminating all obscurations

And directly perceiving Amitabha,

May I go immediately to Sukhavati, Pure Land of Great Joy.

Having gone to Sukhavati,

May I actualize the meaning of these aspirations,

Fulfilling them all without exception,

For the benefit of beings for as long as this world endures.

Born from an extremely beautiful, superlative lotus In this joyful land,

the Buddha's magnificent mandala,

May I receive a prediction of my awakening

Directly from the Buddha Amitabha.

.....

Through creating limitless positive potential  
By dedicating this prayer of Samantabhadra's deeds,  
May all beings drowning in this torrent of suffering,  
Enter the presence of Amitabha.

Through this king of aspirations, which is the greatest of the sublime,  
Helping infinite wanderers in samsara,  
Through the accomplishment of this scripture dazzling with  
Samantabhadra's practice,  
May suffering realms be utterly emptied of all beings

Malcolm wrote:

[https://fpmt.org/wp-content/uploads/prayers/king\\_of\\_prayers\\_c5.pdf](https://fpmt.org/wp-content/uploads/prayers/king_of_prayers_c5.pdf)

The aforementioned four causes of birth in Sukhavati are complete in this aspiration prayer, which is found at the end of the Gandhavyuha, and provides the overall framework for all Tibetan Buddhist liturgies and practices.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

KristenM said:

I hope so, but then being an Apocalypse Road Warrior sounds kinda groovy. I already have this thing picked out.

<https://www.canoo.com/canoo/>

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know, I am still hankering for the Ford 150 Lightning...YMMV

KristenM said:

Oh yeah, that Ford F-150 is cool. I'm in-between wanting a truck and a van. Decisions decisions.

Malcolm wrote:

I know, right? but I think the F-150 will be more intimidating.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 1:55 AM

Title: Re: Re:BDK publication Madhyāntavibhāga-Bhāṣya THE DEBATE

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

What do YOU think?

Malcolm wrote:

Then there is Geoffery Forgue's theory that the three natures actually refer to the three turnings of the wheel, which you can read about in the intro to his new translation of the Samdhinirmocana...

Karl Brunholzl pretty much supports the the idea that the original model was the pivot theory model, and that the progressive model was a later development.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 2:17 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

Au contraire, mon ami...

SilenceMonkey said:

"They're not even a real country anyway."

Malcolm wrote:

It's important to remember this was all brought on the the kid's addiction to the Terrance and Phillip show:

Hence the Blame Canada campaign.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Virgo said:

The Amazon is actually becoming a carbon source now rather than a carbon sink

according to scientists.

Tough times ahead.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. That's cause so much of it is burning:

<https://www.sustainability-times.com/environmental-protection/the-amazon-is-no-longer-a-carbon-sink-its-a-carbon-source/>

Other researchers have recently found that tropical forests all around the planet are losing their ability to store carbon effectively with the carbon sink capacity of several African forests alone set to decline by 14% within a decade. At the same time, the carbon sink capacity of the Amazon's forests will drop to zero by 2035.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 4:26 AM

Title: Re: Two recent BDK publications:

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

Malcolm

do you know with which sutra or teacher the non- pivot theory emerged? Because Joy found evidence that the pivot theory occasionally showed up in works mostly using the other. That means both metaphors were viewed as situationally useful in the course of an exposition.

Thanks

Leo

Malcolm wrote:

According to a personal conversation with D'amato many years ago, he asserted that the progressive theory can be found the Mahāyānasūtralaṃkāra, resembling the gzhan stong idea that the perfected is empty of the imagined and the perfected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 4:27 AM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

[

I was referring to the style of three year retreat as composed by Kongtruk in his manual.



The institutional

Three year retreat is modern. Originally the idea of a three year retreat comes from kakacakra, which was the elite system practiced by kagyus, sakyapas (and Jonang) and Gelukpas during the 13th and 14th century.

Virgo said:

Malcolm would you happen to know what cycle in the Kalacakra the three year, three month, three day time period is derived from?

Does it have to do with the aspects of body, speech, mind, and the fortress?

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

It has to do with the length of a mahājñānavāyu. Every thirty-second breath is a jñānavāyu, It is asserted somewhere in the text that one can achieve buddhahood inside of one great jñānavāyu. It has to do with the number of jñānavāyu in a single day, multiplied by a specific number of days to reach this cycle of a mahājñānavāyu. I am sorry, but I don't recall the precise formula.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 4:33 AM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It has to do with the length of a mahājñānavāyu.

Virgo said:

Ah, thanks.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

This is also one of the reasons why in khumbhaka, one wants to be able to retain the hold for at least 2.6 minutes (if there are 21600 respiratory cycles in a 24 hour period, we breathe once every five seconds). If one times it all correctly, with time of day, which nostril, etc. it is possible to breathe only jñānavāyus. But don't try this without parental supervision.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:12 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

You meant the 2nd part right?

We can't say this -> "that goats karma/characteristics/habits got transferred to the newly born guy (Padmist)"

But can I say this? -> When you die, you just die, it's over. No reincarnation or resurrection or anything. If "you" are reborn, it isn't you at all. It's a totally different new guy.

Malcolm wrote:

Both positions are wrong.

Padmist said:

Can we say that there is a continuation of consciousness, mind, memory?

Malcolm wrote:

The aggregates are serially connected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:13 AM

Title: Re: The four causes of rebirth in Dewachen (Sukhavati)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, they are all necessary. And all four of those causes are found in the Aspiration of Samantabhadra, so it is sufficient to recite that. Of course, as mentioned above, there are Vajrayāna methods which supplement those or surpass them.

Mirror said:

Please can you give me some examples of those Vajrayana methods, so that I can learn more about them? Thank you

明安 Myoan thank you very much for that passage from Honen.

Malcolm wrote:

Transference of consciousness is one such method. Practiced with some diligence, it is not hard to obtain a positive sign.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:15 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California  
Content:

KristenM said:

Sounds great. Hey, I'd kind of like to move, at least have the option. But no one pays even close to the pay here in California for my line of work. I'll possibly move out of state when I retire. If it's not too late. Or just buy an electric RV and travel the world like some Mad Max Apocalyptic Road Warrior.

Malcolm wrote:

Unsustainable means for our grandchildren. I am sure you will be just fine in CA for the foreseeable. You still have Lake Tahoe to ravish.

Kim O'Hara said:

I really wish I could agree, Malcolm, but I can't.

Malcolm wrote:

I wasn't joking at all. We are leaving our grandchildren an unsustainable future.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:19 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

DGA said:

I'm just trying to figure out what to do with these lapel pins

Malcolm wrote:

Hang on to them, they'll be collectible someday. Especially the early bacon and eggs pin of Shambhala level 5.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:25 AM

Title: Re: Two recent BDK publications:

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

Malcolm

do you know with which sutra or teacher the non- pivot theory emerged? Because Joy found evidence that the pivot theory occasionally showed up in works mostly using the other. That means both metaphors were viewed as situationally useful in the course of an exposition.

Thanks

Leo

Malcolm wrote:

According to a personal conversation with D'amato many years ago, he asserted that the progressive theory can be found in the Mahāyānasūtralaṃkāra, resembling the gzhan stong idea that the perfected is empty of the imagined and the perfected.

Correction, empty of the imagined and dependent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:27 AM

Title: Re: Re:BDK publication Madhyāntavibhāga-Bhāṣya THE DEBATE

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

What do YOU think?

Zhen Li said:

I would have to begin reading from the ABCs of Yogācāra as I am not really conversant any of these terms.

Malcolm wrote:

Yogacara sputtered to a halt partly because it is overly analytical. But it appeals to philosophers. Madhyamaka is actually more yogic than Yogacara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:33 AM

Title: Re: A different kind of meditation on death

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

Whatever your thoughts about cardboard coffins, thinking about what you will be buried in beats avoiding thinking about death altogether.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

I don't care how my corpse is disposed of. It'll probably be cremated, though.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:00 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Can we say that there is a continuation of consciousness, mind, memory?

Yes. In Mahayana there's a storehouse consciousness, the 8th consciousness, that goes from one life to another. Memory, habit, & karma remain associated with it—but not personality. That gets thoroughly shuffled.

Malcolm wrote:

This is included in the aggregates. Nothing transfers from this life to the next. Not even traces, karma or anything else. But since actions do not inherently exist there is nothing existent to prevent their ripening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:05 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Can we say that there is a continuation of consciousness, mind, memory?

Yes. In Mahayana there's a storehouse consciousness, the 8th consciousness, that goes from one life to another. Memory, habit, & karma remain.

PadmaVonSamba said:

I'm not so sure about that.

Yes, storehouse consciousness.

Continuous after the body dies?

Then what's the difference between

Alaya vijnana, and atma?

Malcolm wrote:

Ones part of the aggregates, the other is not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:20 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is included in the aggregates. Nothing transfers from this life to the next. Not even traces, karma or anything else.

undefineable said:

Awareness?

Even if copied continually from moment to moment? As some element of the aggregates?

Malcolm wrote:

awareness is a mental factor, so part of the formations aggregate, and yes momentary.

undefineable said:

Because they're just aspects of parts of a process?

Malcolm wrote:

Because of dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:24 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Then what's the difference between

Alaya vijnana, and atma?

Malcolm wrote:

Ones part of the aggregates, the other is not.

PadmaVonSamba said:

(Sorry... that was a rhetorical question.

I should have simply said, "otherwise there would be no difference between alaya vijnana and atma")

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, mistaking alaya as a self is an error.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:56 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Nothing transfers from this life to the next. Not even traces, karma or anything else.

undefineable said:

Does anything even transfer within lives? Might it be 'enlightening' (with a very small 'e' .. ) to imagine the skandhas+nidanas becoming 'shaken up' between lives - or perhaps thawed before freezing again-?

Malcolm wrote:

Nothing transfers from this moment to the next moment, but the aggregates are serially connected, all the down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 7:50 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

Great. So characteristics carried through? Can we say then that Padmist is a totally different new persona and not in any way connected to that goat who died except that goats karma/characteristics/habits got transferred to the newly born guy (Padmist)?

Malcolm wrote:

No, you cannot say that.

No entity passes from this life to the next, but the aggregates of the life are serially connected to the aggregates of the next, so there is a continuum.

fckw said:

Buddhists rarely discuss whether the continuum or the aggregates are eternal or not, have an identity or not, or are subjected to time or not.

Malcolm wrote:

That's just not true. They are beginningless, momentary, identityless, and subject to time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 7:52 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

3. If a toddler, a suspected tulku perhaps, recognizes a string of beads that belonged to someone else who has died, and says, "these are mine" how does that work when, without a 'self' or truly existent "me" involved as a prerequisite, (something that carries over from one life to the next) that "mine" is an impossibility?

Malcolm wrote:

Even tenth stage bodhisattvas have enough of a trace of the knowledge obscuration to have not discarded the habit of imputing a nonexistent "I" onto their aggregates, when not resting in equipoise on emptiness. This is much stronger on the lower bhūmis.

Basically, the yogacarins assert a carrier medium, the alaya. This is rejected by Madhyamaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

cky said:

Just letting you know that the tone is disrespectful towards students of Chögyam Trungpa Rinpoche. Its not your lineage and you dont like it, we get it.

Malcolm wrote:

I have no problem with students of CTR or of Shambhala.

Shambhala itself, however has become something quite strange under the leadership of Osel Mukpo.

Going for refuge to mythical Rigdens? The obsessive focus on Gesar? Really? How is this Buddhadharma? Then there is Mukpo himself, who is in the process of an ugly divorce from Shambhala International, because the latter recognize that the former is a liability and not an asset.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

. I reckon boomers' kids - even in the affluent countries - are going to have a pretty tough time through the second half of their lives.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence my mention of grandchildren.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 8:58 PM

Title: Re: Three Year Retreat Schedule

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is also one of the reasons why in khumbhaka, one wants to be able retain the hold for at least 2.6 minutes ( if there are 21600 respiratory cycles in a 24 hour period, we breath once every five seconds). If one times it all correctly, with time of day, which nostril, etc. it is possible to breath only jñānavāyus. But don't try this without parental supervision.

Arnoud said:



When you were studying with Ramaswami did he say anything about the length of time of Kumbhaka?

Malcolm wrote:

Overall, no. But in his system, he emphasized antarakhumbhaka, holding out, while mentally reciting the gayatri mantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: Love & Compassion for Bodhisattvas?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Although we take vows of bodhisattvas, he observed that Christians often have more love and compassion. Sweeping statement, I know... but it left a lot of us thinking.

Malcolm wrote:

Also false.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Love & Compassion for Bodhisattvas?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Although we take vows of bodhisattvas, he observed that Christians often have more love and compassion. Sweeping statement, I know... but it left a lot of us thinking.

Malcolm wrote:

Also false.

SilenceMonkey said:

I think the compassion he was talking about is the amount of love we have, not talking about the vows we take. People may take a bodhicitta vow but have little to no love in their heart.

Anyway, I think the teaching the teacher was giving was addressing the difficulty chinese (taiwanese) people have with expressing love and emotion.

Malcolm wrote:

Even when one takes the bodhisattva vow under false pretenses , it results in buddhahood, as the episode with Mara taking the bodhisattva vow in the (authentic) Surangama Samadhi sutra shows. So, I don't buy it at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

undefineable said:

<https://www.britannica.com/topic/alaya-vijnana>

It seems the alaya is also subject to change... {"it's turtles all the way down" if we're not careful I guess[?]}

All this begs the question (given that impression Buddhist doctrine can give of asserting a timeless backdrop to object-consciousness) of where the Buddhist picture of 'primordial awareness' fit into the picture. Skandhas purified of Self-concept perhaps?

Malcolm wrote:

What do you mean by “primordial awareness?” It’s not at all clear. Ye shes?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

What do you mean by “primordial awareness?” It’s not at all clear. Ye shes?

undefineable said:

I meant the quality of being aware - "before" (-behind which-) it becomes awareness/consciousness of some particular thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Doesn’t exist. Even the word does not permit it. Consciousness is always with objects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: Love & Compassion for Bodhisattvas?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I think the compassion he was talking about is the amount of love we have, not talking about the vows we take. People may take a bodhicitta vow but have little to no love in their heart.

Anyway, I think the teaching the teacher was giving was addressing the difficulty chinese (taiwanese) people have with expressing love and emotion.

Malcolm wrote:

Even when one takes the bodhisattva vow under false pretenses , it results in buddhahood, as the episode with Mara taking the bodhisattva vow in the (authentic) Surangama Samadhi sutra shows. So, I don't buy it at all.

SilenceMonkey said:

Sure. But we're talking about happiness and love in our hearts, here and now.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no happiness in samsara. Christian's compassion is largely performative and not sincere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, September 26th, 2021 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

Over the years I met many of Chögyam Trungpa Rinpoche's student and they have been utterly serious about their practice. That is worthy of respect in my book.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think there are many of them left in Shambala.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Nothing transfers from this moment to the next moment, but the aggregates are serially connected, all the down.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Can you talk more about this here "serially connected" business? What does that mean?

Malcolm wrote:

It means that the aggregates are a continuous stream of momentary events, the preceding moment being the cause of the next, hence they are serially connected. This is stated quite clearly by Nāgārjuna in the Verses on Dependent Origination. He writes:

6) Although the aggregates are serially connected,  
the wise are to comprehend nothing has transfers.

Therein, the aggregates are the aggregates of matter, sensation, perception, formations,

and consciousness. Those, called 'serially joined', not having ceased, produce another produced from that cause; although not even the subtle atom of an existent has transmigrated from this world to the next.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 1:43 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

There were other vajrayana teachers in the west before and at the same time as Mukpo, it's not like he was the only game in town.

Malcolm wrote:

No, but he was the only person who had a publisher/book store owner as one of his students. CTR's relationship with Sam Bercholz, more than any other single factor, was responsible for his swift rise and success in opening Dharma centers throughout North America. He founded Vajradhātu in 1973, the same year his first major book came out, Cutting Through Spiritual Materialism. Indeed, it was among the first books on Buddhism I ever read, along with Myth of Freedom, Three Pillars of Zen, Zen Mind Beginners Mind, Zen Bones, Zen Flesh, etc. in 1978. By the time I went to work in bookstore owned by member of Vajradhātu, Trident Books in Boston, in 1987. The Regent scandal was in the making, since Trungpa had died earlier that year. I never did join the local Dharmadhātu. I did do a couple of Shambhala levels, but found the teachers that I encountered in that program extremely unimpressive and pompous. There were also clear problems with rampant sexual harassment of new female students and wide-spread alcoholism in that sangha. But this seems to be a problem in every large sangha that I can think of.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 3:30 AM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Virgo said:

Malcolm is a boomer.

Malcolm wrote:

Barely. I am between generations, !962. To young to be a boomer, to old to be a Gen Xer. You can consider me a member of the Blank Generation:

I was sayin let me out of here before I was even born--it's such a gamble when you get a face

It's fascinatin to observe what the mirror does  
but when I dine it's for the wall that I set a place  
I belong to the blank generation and  
I can take it or leave it each time  
I belong to the \_\_\_\_\_ generation but  
I can take it or leave it each time  
Triangles were fallin at the window as the doctor cursed  
He was a cartoon long forsaken by the public eye  
The nurse adjusted her garters as I breathed my first  
The doctor grabbed my throat and yelled, "God's consolation prize!"  
I belong to the blank generation and  
I can take it or leave it each time  
I belong to the \_\_\_\_\_ generation but  
I can take it or leave it each time  
To hold the t.v. to my lips, the air so packed with cash  
then carry it up flights of stairs and drop it in the vacant lot  
To lose my train of thought and fall into your arms' tracks  
and watch beneath the eyelids every passing dot  
I belong to the blank generation and  
I can take it or leave it each time  
I belong to the \_\_\_\_\_ generation but  
I can take it or leave it each time  
I belong to the blank generation and  
I can take it or leave it each time  
I belong to the \_\_\_\_\_ generation but  
I can take it or leave it each time  
--Richard Hell, circa 1975.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: Ice is melting on the North Pole

Content:

Tlalok said:

I can't wait to see what the later 21st century is going to be like!

Malcolm wrote:

One notes that that last year photos are available is 2015.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

But the ones and zeros of my post is not restricted to my own computer either.

Malcolm wrote:

The term used in the text is "dngos po," which means thing, existent, entity, etc. Basically, the yogacarins assert a carrier medium, the alaya. This is rejected by Madhyamaka.

'nuff said.

The Madhyamakas reject is an unnecessary appendage, since all consciousnesses are just the aggregate of consciousness which is give different names when performing different functions. The reason it is rejected by Madhyamakas is that the yogacarins define the ālaya as a consciousness that engages in no processes of perception.

Nāgārjuna II, in the Bodhicittavivarana equates the yogacāra theory with a magnet that just blindingly attracts iron fillings. Jayānanda, in his commentary on Candra's Intro to the Middle Way has a novel take on ālayavijñāna that I have mentioned before. He states that the actual ālaya, the storehouse, if you will, is emptiness, and the vijñāna is what perceives it, hence the term ālayavijñāna properly understood, would mean "the consciousness that apprehends emptiness." This is very close to the meaning of mahāmudra and dzogchen when they talk of the dhātu and jñāna/vidya being inseparable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 5:14 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

Over the years I met many of Chögyam Trungpa Rinpoche's student and they have been utterly serious about their practice. That is worthy of respect in my book.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think there are many of them left in Shambala.

heart said:

I think you are right, most of them I know had issues with Trungpa jr. long before the current situation.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Anyway, they seem to have badly gone off the rails. It no longer resembles the organization Trungpa left behind, warts and all. I have concerns that the Dzogchen Community will also go this way.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 7:13 AM  
Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?  
Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:  
To me Nagarjuna's Madhyamaka is provisional.

Malcolm wrote:  
That's because you don't understand it. But you can't find any fault with it. So you just pout.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 7:56 AM  
Title: Re: Love & Compassion for Bodhisattvas?  
Content:

SilenceMonkey said:  
Sure. But we're talking about happiness and love in our hearts, here and now.

Malcolm wrote:  
Christian's compassion is largely performative and not sincere.

SilenceMonkey said:  
That's just your opinion.

Anyway, if we're talking about happiness... your saying there's no happiness in samsara kind of invalidates the question of whether people are happy or not in the first place. If it doesn't matter whether people are happy, why make it a subject of debate?

Malcolm wrote:  
It matters that people mistake happiness for suffering, pleasure for pain, and so on. Buddhist compassion is not performative. Its free from reference.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 8:41 AM  
Title: Re: Thinking about the 7th Root Downfall  
Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

That's just your opinion.

Anyway, if we're talking about happiness... your saying there's no happiness in samsara kind of invalidates the question of whether people are happy or not in the first place. If it doesn't matter whether people are happy, why make it a subject of debate?

Malcolm wrote:

It matters that people mistake happiness for suffering, pleasure for pain, and so on. Buddhist compassion is not performative. Its free from reference.

SilenceMonkey said:

Yes, our teachings of compassion are incredible. Whether we have that kind of compassion in our hearts is another question...

Malcolm wrote:

Compassion is simply the wish that someone be free from suffering and it's causes. That's it. Nothing more, nothing less. Buddhist compassion has nothing to do with performative sentimentality, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 8:45 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think there are many of them left in Shambala.

heart said:

I think you are right, most of them I know had issues with Trungpa jr. long before the current situation.

/magnus

SilenceMonkey said:

I went to an event at a shambhala center last weekend. There were a couple people there who had a palpable spiritual quality, old students of Chogyam Trungpa. But for the most part it seemed the culture was pretty worldly... just my impression (and judgement). I think it's hard to practice authentically as a Dharma community without the guidance of an enlightened master.

Malcolm wrote:

It's very totally open to question whether CTR was an "enlightened master." He got away with far more than Sogyal ever did.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 8:48 AM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

To me Nagarjuna's Madhyamaka is provisional.

Malcolm wrote:

That's because you don't understand it. But you can't find any fault with it. So you just pout. I'll

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Tetralemma, non—affirming negation, yeah I get it. It just doesn't resonate with me.

Malcolm wrote:

No, you don't get it at all. If you did, you wouldn't say such silly things like the above. As I said, you're just pouting because you can't actually find fault with Madhyamaka, but it is frightening to you, because it hits you where you live.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 9:05 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

That's fair. It's also fair to question whether he was leading people in the direction of enlightenment. Personally, I think he did.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe. So did Sogyal and a lot of other flawed teachers. And like Sogyal, he alienated a lot of people from the path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: Thinking about the 7th Root Downfall

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

. It's emotion and energy that can be felt by the people involved.

Malcolm wrote:  
Buddhist Compassion is not an emotion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 8:05 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Wisdom is always needed. If you can't arrive at emptiness through Madhyamaka you have to find another way.

Madhyamaka is an intellectual construct. What's needed is the experience of mind's true nature, which is not an intellectual construct. And there's a handful of ways to do that. Not all of them utilize discernment.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is a deconstruction of Buddhist intellectualism, which is why yogacarins and gzhan stong pas dislike it so much. That's why without proper understanding of Madhyamaka, people reify their experience of the nature of mind into something which is either existent (yogacara/gzhan stong) or nonexistent (gelug). It is for this reason Atisha declared that one must rely on Candrakirti for liberation. An experience of the nature of the mind is not enough for liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Love & Compassion for Bodhisattvas?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

. It's emotion and energy that can be felt by the people involved.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhist Compassion is not an emotion.

SilenceMonkey said:

It's not a klesha, but sure it's an emotion. And others will feel your compassion in their emotions. Same goes for lovingness and kindness བྱམས་པ་ and love བརྟེན་པ་.

In fact, compassion is often described as a sadness when thinking about the suffering of others.

Malcolm wrote:

Compassion (karuna) is the wish that others be free from suffering and the causes of that suffering. That's all it needs to be. It's not an emotion. It's not a mental factor. It's not an affliction, though in ordinary people, it is afflicted, since it is generally partial. But what it is not is sentimental, since it must be accompanied by equanimity. Buddhist compassion is utterly different than the maudlin sentimentality which passes for

compassion among Christians. Buddhist compassion, ultimately, is focused more on the causes of suffering, than the suffering itself, which is a ripened result of karma, and about which not much can be done in many cases.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

I think the point is, there's not some kind of unbroken entity that moves from one moment to the next, or one lifetime to the next.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, there is no entity.

PadmaVonSamba said:

But rather, what happens here and now triggers the arising of what will happen there and then.

It becomes the cause of something specific to occur later.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Sogyal did not have much in the way of retreat or study experience but he was very well connected and had the gift of the gab. The title did most of the work for him. And his students wanted to believe he was something special.

Malcolm wrote:

Which is important for them, and proper in every respect. The same goes for the students of Trungpa. Despite whatever misgivings I have about both of these teacher's conduct, they knew the rules, did the retreats, etc., even if they may have used the "unconventional behavior" card too much to excuse what was, frankly, gross misbehavior, some of it completely abusive by modern standards.

Knotty Veneer said:

For TBists, until we can learn to identify teachers by the quality of their actions and not just rely on the titles and the praises of their friends and students, we will see more Osel

Mukpo's and Sogyal Lakars.

Malcolm wrote:

We will see more of them anyway. As you point out, the history of Indo-Tibetan Buddhism is full of characters whose behavior is quite appalling. It is not like there is going to be a Church of Reformed Tibetan Buddhism, though the Ngorpas and the Gelugpas also tried. Tibetan history is full of warlord gurus like Lama Zhang, sorcerers like Rwa Lotsawa and Milarepa, libertines like Drukpa Kunlay and more recently, Reting Rinpoche, semi-Buddhist mystics with wrongs views like Sanggye Kargyal, etc., etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: using Ashwagandha as incense?

Content:

Toenail said:

I'm on holiday in Tenerife and I bought some Ashwagandha powder for a friend. In case he doesn't like the taste, could it be used as incense? He uses powdery incense on charcoal. Is Ashwagandha aslo burned in traditional use?

Malcolm wrote:

No. not that I am aware.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Converting to dzogchen?...

Content:

Kurp said:

I was thinking of this earlier and thought I'd ask here what it means, since I am unable to ask the original source.

I once read an email where a dzogchen practitioner said, "I've converted another one."

What does that even mean? I'm assuming she was referring to dzogchen, and was implying that she converted a person to... dzogchen?? If that is what she meant, then how does one "convert" someone to dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

You can't convert anyone to anything. Either people have the good fortune to meet Dzogchen teachings or they don't. It's a karmic thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 10:31 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

I agree that one should try to see their teacher as something special - up to the point where the evidence of their eyes tells them something different. The problem is people did speak out but were sidelined and ignored.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, for a whole host of reasons.

Knotty Veneer said:

A lot of people refused to accept the evidence of their eyes and their own common sense where Trungpa's and Sogyal's and Osel Mukpo's conduct was concerned.

Malcolm wrote:

And now we have to wait and see whether the paternity test for Karmapa OTD proves to be positive or not, should there be one. How many Karma Kagyus will refuse to accept the results if they are positive? And if there isn't one, because that case in Canada is settled out of court, how many Karma Kagyus will insist that the settlement does not prove anything? How can a lineage accept a person accused of rape as a lineage head, as long as there is any doubt as to their innocence or guilt?

This story has huge implications for Tibetan Buddhism, no matter which way it turns out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: On Rebirth - Is it the same guy?

Content:

Padmist said:

How is it that some Buddhists think that the reborn person would know some details of his or her past?

Malcolm wrote:

It's a continuum. The way one remembers past lives is that in a state of samadhi, one recalls events in reverse. Recollection of past lives is an abhijñā, not special to Buddhism. But it does depend on development of samadhi. For example, when you recall what happened to you 15 years ago, there is no actual presence of any of the events of 15 years ago. They all do not exist. You cannot say they are in your mind, nor can you deny your memory of them. Nor can you claim there is some entity that stayed in your mind which allows you to recall them. But you still recall some events from 15 years ago.

The same applies to past lives. The aggregates are serially connected, so there is some relationship with your past lives. Just the same, they do not exist now, and your ability to access those memories depends on your skill in samadhi, just as your ability to recall past events in this life depends on your present mental clarity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, September 27th, 2021 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Converting to dzogchen?...

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I would ... not take that person as an authority, providing they were even serious.

Kurp said:

They were quite serious by the context of the email. As a matter of fact, she bragged how she was able to convert more than one person. She almost made it sound like a competition; as if she was doing well and the other person receiving the email was far behind in their efforts to convert more, too.

Malcolm wrote:

Whoever she was, she is an egotistical idiot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Nemo said:

I think hierarchy is an add on.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, of course it is. This is Tibetan culture we are dealing with here, not Dharma. At least as far as tantras go, there is no mention of tulku recognitions, etc. This is a 12th century Tibetan innovation.

The point of the tantras is that everyone is initiated to the level of a cakravartin. Everyone is the sovereign of their own mandala.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So did Sogyal and a lot of other flawed teachers.

Harimoo said:

Hi,

This sentence made me ask myself 2 questions :

-How can we assume that there is no flawed teacher in any given lineage ?

Malcolm wrote:

We can't. In this kali yuga, all teachers are flawed. The goal is to choose teachers with least amount of flaws.

Harimoo said:

-Do flawed lineage always disappear by their own ?

Malcolm wrote:

The lineage is ultimately more important than the individual teacher, as long as the rules are followed and empowerments are transmitted properly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

(...) semi-Buddhist mystics with wrongs views like Sanggye Kargyal, etc., etc.

Harimoo said:

Acharya,

who is this guy ?

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.jstor.org/stable/43391257?refreqid=excelsior%3A0b3c277f21a64eb223999ffa85bf0a8a>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 4:52 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Kurp said:

Maybe Rinpoche saw how the community couldn't collaborate well and he was okay with things dying out over time.

Malcolm wrote:

He actually said it would be like Buddha's original sangha of monks, which broke into eighteen divisions. And that division was foretold by a dream of King Kṛkin, during the time of Buddha Kāśyapa. Kṛkin had a dream where he saw eighteen men tugging on one

sheet of cloth, but the Buddha Kāśyapa interpreted the dream for him, saying it represented the sangha of Buddha Śākyamuni splitting into eighteen divisions, but the cloth itself would remain whole.

Kurp said:

Speaking of My Reincarnation, Malcolm, is this you in the background?:

Malcolm wrote:

Yup

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

tobes said:

The question is: what can we learn from all of these examples?

I'm increasingly coming to the view that lo-fi/ minimal institution is the best way forward. Lama Lena style.

Padmist said:

That the West doesn't deserve Vajrayana

Malcolm wrote:

Of course we do. It's the only thing that works in the Kali Yuga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Karma Dorje said:

Everyone who received the transmission from the Master, practices according to instructions, and achieves the signs of practice can then transmit the practice to others. Organizations don't own the transmission. At best they can set certain standards for who can teach and how the teachers conduct themselves in public.

The real question is who one trusts. Putting trust in organizations to perform due diligence seems perilous out of the gate. If one has already received transmission from ChNNR and understood the central point clearly, one can trust in that. All that is left is practicing with confidence.

If we want Rinpoche's terma to prosper, it's on each of us to practice with the same enthusiasm we clutch our pearls at each new imagined outrage. We must ourselves



become trustworthy guides. All the rest is simply musical chairs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 4:56 AM

Title: Re: Tenerife center

Content:

Toenail said:

Is it worth a visit? I'm in the south of tenerife right now for holidays.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 8:00 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

That the West doesn't deserve Vajrayana

Malcolm wrote:

Of course we do. It's the only thing that works in the Kali Yuga.

Constructelf said:

So you're saying that Theravadins, Zen practitioners, Pure Landers, and other non-Vajrayana Buddhists are deluded and wasting their time following impotent Dharma? Because without qualification or clarification, it does seem like that's what you're saying.

Malcolm wrote:

No dharma is a waste of time. But some are more relevant than others in this time. We are in the Tibetan Buddhist forum, here, and my statement is standard fare in our tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 8:01 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

frankie said:

Otherwise, it is pretty narrow-minded and quite dangerously misleading.

Malcolm wrote:

Care to debate the point? The problem with that is that we don't have a common basis to debate this because you won't accept the authorities I will cite (the tantras). Therefore you won't accept the reasonings. But you also can't refute my position through reasoning for a number of reasons, not least of which there is no authentic Mahayana sutra that teaches a method for a beginner to realize buddhahood in one lifetime.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Description of Akanishta

Content:

Seeker12 said:

I'm aware there are different ways to understand the term Akanishta, but I'm curious if in any of the ways, there are descriptions of a pure land similar to how there are extensive descriptions of Sukhavati. That is, descriptions with characteristics of a certain type.

Are there any sources that discuss this?

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there is an extensive literature on the subjecting Tibetan sources.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 7:11 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Lingpupa said:

I have doubts about a couple of things Malcolm has said, one factual and one more theoretical. Regarding Sogyal, he said that he:

did the retreats, etc.,

A close analysis of his known history, and his own claims about himself, strongly suggests not only that there was no time in his early life during which he could have undertaken more than light studies of the dharma, and there is no question of there being any years during which he could have undertaken a longer retreat (such as a three-year retreat). As far as I know, he didn't in any case claim to have done such a retreat, but if I'm wrong it would be interesting to know what exactly were the years in which this was supposed to have happened. He had a good English education, the gift of the gab, a pushy mother and a thirst for admiration. Poor lad!

Malcolm wrote:

Sogyal himself made no pretense towards being a ritual lama or of having done large

amounts of retreat, though he did do long retreats, for example, a year long Kilaya retreat, etc in the 1990's. He generally had other lamas give empowerments to his students. CTR on the other hand definitely did retreats when he was quite young and in fact gave the entire Rinchen Terzod in Tibet while still a teenager. Many lamas in the Gelug and Sakya school never do three year retreats. It's not a requirement.

More theoretically, Malcolm also said: my statement is standard fare in our tradition.

Lingpupa said:

The fact that it is standard fare is clearly true,

Malcolm wrote:

Do I have to justify Vajrayana teachings in the Vajrayana forum? Seriously? If people want to find out why this is true, they can become Vajrayana Buddhists, otherwise they can piss off.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 7:14 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

nightbloom said:

My impression of tantric practice in India is that sadhanas were not usually recited - or at least, that they were not written with the explicit intent that the sadhaka recite them (with the exception of mantras within them, and so on). Does anyone have a sense of when and why this changed in Tibet? I am relatively new to practice, but it seems to be the norm that the practitioner is expected to \*read\* the sadhana line by line while simultaneously engaging in visualizations, rather than treat the text itself simply as a set of instructions.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a false impression.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 7:19 PM

Title: Re: Newsom Beat the Recall, Now Comes the Hard Part: Governing California

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

You might like to read this and compare it with what you're seeing at home.

<https://www.factcheck.org/2020/01/setting-the-record-straight-on-climate-change-and-arson-in-australias-bushfires/>

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, no. The women in question has an arson record. The prof? We'll see what the verdict is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 7:22 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Lingpupa said:

did the retreats, etc.,

More theoretically, Malcolm also said: my statement is standard fare in our tradition. The fact that it is standard fare is clearly true, but it is hardly a justification. It would be rather like saying, "that's my groupthink, so it's true."

frankie said:

Think of it as Buddhist advertising.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not merely advertisement. Or do you think that when the Buddha asserted there was no awakening outside his dharma and vinaya, he was just shilling for business?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 8:38 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

frankie said:

Think of it as Buddhist advertising.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not merely advertisement. Or do you think that when the Buddha asserted there was no awakening outside his dharma and vinaya, he was just shilling for business?

frankie said:

Ouch...pulling the boss on me! No, but if he did say exactly that without further exegesis, discussion, room for movement or dispensation, then... I contend that it's horseshit. With all due love and respect.

Malcolm wrote:

He asserted that outside his dharma and discipline there were no stream entrants, once-returners, never-returners, and arhats, and that the doctrines of other teachers were devoid of such persons, that is, awakened persons.

He stated this in more than one sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 8:42 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Do I have to justify Vajrayana teachings in the Vajrayana forum? Seriously? If people want to find out why this is true, they can become Vajrayana Buddhists, otherwise they can piss off.

Lingpupa said:

Yes, you do, for as long thinking people are still allowed into the forum. If questioning is not allowed, the forum should be made closed or secret.

Malcolm wrote:

So you are suggesting an overall change to DW forum rules, I take it. The previous posts were not "questioning," they were assertions that core statements made by the Buddha in the tantras must be false. Hence my response that debate on the point would not be possible, since there is no common basis for a debate on the issue.

Lingpupa said:

And if your "piss off" was directed at me, then all I can say is "piss off yourself". Otherwise I'll just take it as a rhetorical comment directed at straw men.

Malcolm wrote:

It was directed at those who are not Vajrayana Buddhists who have opinions about it based on nothing more than their opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 8:52 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

MiphamFan said:

I remember that ChNN said that he suggested back in the pre-cultural revolution days that monasteries should start contributing to the labour economy before the communists came, so they could adapt to the modern world. They accused him of

being a communist and ignored his suggestions.

Malcolm wrote:

At one time, ChNN's politics were very left wing. Just look at the number of radical leftists among his early group of students, it might not be an accident that Merigar was sited in Tuscany, which is a very heavily socialist region of Italy, where Communist parties are weekend events, seen regularly in Castel Del Piano, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

That's interesting I didn't realise that. I was surprised to find the prevalence of right wing views among community members these days.

Malcolm wrote:

That's more of Eastern European trend, post-Stalinism, combined with Western European anti-Muslim sentiments, which have been prevalent in the DC since the second Iraq war. In general, US DC people are bleeding heart liberals.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 10:02 PM

Title: Re: Rigpa Shedra East

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Anyone have experience studying at Rigpa Shedra East, and would be happy to share their experience of it?

Malcolm wrote:

Khenchen Namdrol is one of the most qualified teachers alive today. I am quite sure that the people up under his direction are qualified to teach what they been assigned to teach.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 10:07 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

MiphamFan said:

I remember that ChNN said that he suggested back in the pre-cultural revolution days that monasteries should start contributing to the labour economy before the communists came, so they could adapt to the modern world. They accused him of being a communist and ignored his suggestions.

Malcolm wrote:

At one time, ChNN's politics were very left wing. Just look at the number of radical leftists among his early group of students, it might not be an accident that Merigar was sited in Tuscany, which is a very heavily socialist region of Italy, where Communist parties are weekend events, seen regularly in Castel Del Piano, etc.

heart said:

I used to live in Italy in the early 80's and Monte Amiata where Merigar is was a region that had many abandoned farms. People felt that picking olives was too difficult and moved to the cities. So buying a place was quite cheap. When it comes to politics often it seemed that half the people where communists and the other half fascist so dinner could become quite heated.

Still I love Italy.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that's completely true.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Ice is melting on the North Pole

Content:

Aemilius said:

There is some suspicion around concerning the possible cause for there not being googlemap pictures or webcam pictures available from the North Pole, when googplemap images are easily found of Antartica. Are they hiding something from us? What?

Malcolm wrote:

No one is hiding anything:

<https://climate.nasa.gov/images-of-change>

There are just more interesting satellite photos to see than the north pole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, September 28th, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

tony\_montana said:

Is there supposed to be benefit in reciting the sadhana texts themselves, as if they had mantric potency in and of themselves (like stotras)?

and if so, is it therefore preferable to read the sadhanas in Tibetan so as to derive the full mantric benefits or is reading the english (or some other language) translation the same?

Malcolm wrote:

Reciting the text has the function of engaging the lower levels of the nine stages of śamatha, which are perfected when focusing in the deities attributes. This how it is explained by Padmavajra.

There is virtually no benefit in reciting a text in a language one does not understand and cannot pronounce correctly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

frankie said:

I am not one who is convinced of everything in sutras, commentaries or from teachers.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the Vajrayāna forum, and so, Vajrayāna rules.

frankie said:

Please take notice of the various sub-fora on the front page and further sub-fora within sub-fora. As a general matter, discussions in sub-fora should relate to their designated subjects. For instance, Tibetan Buddhism should be discussed in the Tibetan Buddhism sub-forum, and East Asian Buddhism should be discussed in the East Asian Buddhism sub-forum. Similarly, in further specialized sub-fora, discussions should be limited to the relevant subject.

Please take further notice that it is not appropriate to question or critique teachings and practices of traditions in sub-forums dedicated to those particular traditions. For



example, do not challenge the core Dharma concepts and principles of Pure Land Buddhism in the Pure Land sub-fora.

Questioning and debating the teachings and traditional interpretations of general or specific Buddhist traditions is permitted in the Open Dharma sub-forum only. However, such discourse must be conducted sensitively and reasonably argued and grounded. Unfounded or arbitrary critiques will be subject to moderation.

Malcolm wrote:

That is how things work at DW. If you want to take umbrage at statements in the tantras that assert that only Vajrayāna is an effective vehicle for liberation in this age, that's fine (but do so in another forum, like Open Dharma), but I am not at all clear you understand why such teachings are found in said classes of literature. It isn't mere puffery, as you suggested above. Your critique fails the test of arbitrariness, since you admit above it is all just based on your personal opinion. So even the Open Dharma forum, it might not fly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 12:14 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

frankie said:

I am not one who is convinced of everything in sutras, commentaries or from teachers. My preference is to compare and contrast, both with myself, experience, and also that of others. Ask questions, consider other viewpoints, and not get too sucked into stuff that smells cultish, overly prescriptive and doctrinaire, without full recourse and allowance for honest, open query and questioning.

PeterC said:

Have fun with your DIY dharma

Malcolm wrote:

But Peter, this person worked in BUDDHIST PUBLISHING. I guess this means something. What, I am not sure, but it means they read some BUDDHIST BOOKS. All in all, just another anonymous person on the internet with a boatload of opinions for which they never need take responsibility.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 12:54 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Therefore study the English subtitles of the text to get to understand the meaning, and also learn how to pronounce the Tibetan or Sanskrit.

Would be better than reciting it in English, IMO.

Malcolm wrote:

No, not for most people and certainly not a sadhana of any significant length.

After all, Tibetans NEVER recited transliterated Sanskrit sadhanas. Why should we be expected to do so. It's bullshit. Just lazy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: Description of Akanishta

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there is an extensive literature on the subjecting Tibetan sources.

Seeker12 said:

Are there any English translations available that you know of? Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Myriad worlds is one place you can look.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

I don't really see the DC choosing leaders who happen to be rapists with drug problems, so the odds of that are low.

Malcolm wrote:

That's not the "off the rails" I was referring to. I was referring some strange new interpretations of Dzogchen that are percolating up.

PeterC said:

The risk with the DC is of inability to move on leading it to becoming a retirement home for an increasingly small number of practitioners.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, I was at the Tsegylgar third memorial ganapuja last night. I was among the youngest there, and I am 59.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Another common misperception is that Buddhism is "nontheistic" as opposed to atheistic.

Nicholas2727 said:

I was listening to the Wisdom Podcast and Robert Thurman as the guest and there was a small segment where he came out and said the opposite. That Buddhism is nontheistic, not atheistic since it accepts the idea of many gods. I remember this comment from awhile ago and went back to see if you or anyone could clarify since it seems you and him are saying the opposite, but both are very well studied.

Malcolm wrote:

An atheist is someone who rejects a creator god. We may accept that there are many kinds of sentient beings.

Nicholas2727 said:

: belief in the existence of a god or gods

specifically : belief in the existence of one God viewed as the creative source of the human race and the world who transcends yet is immanent in the world

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhism, devas are just other sentient beings in samsara, no big deal.

We are atheists, as we reject utterly the idea outlined in red. To call ourselves non-theists is just a cute way to avoid plainly stating the fact that we reject the central tenet of all Abrahamic religions, and a number of Indian ones as well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 1:53 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Therefore study the English subtitles of the text to get to understand the meaning, and also learn how to pronounce the Tibetan or Sanskrit.

Would be better than reciting it in English, IMO.

Malcolm wrote:

No, not for most people and certainly not a sadhana of any significant length.

After all, Tibetans NEVER recited transliterated Sanskrit sadhanas. Why should we be expected to do so. It's bullshit. Just lazy.

Chenda said:

I've been told by some peers that dharanis should be recited in whichever language they were revealed, specifically the Seven Line Prayer which I used to recite in Sanskrit (as translated by DH Narayana Prasad Rijal) but now opted to memorize the Tibetan just because I'm under the impression that it is the proper way to do it.

Malcolm wrote:

If one can memorize short supplications in Tibetan or Sanskrit, this is excellent. Try reciting a 60 folio sadhana in transliteration...ughhhh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 1:54 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Nadereme said:

Some of you are turning into soccer moms. Yes there are always risks with social media but it's foolish to think just making it go away will solve stuff.

Malcolm wrote:

We don't want to just make it go away, we want to break it up and drown it in a bathtub.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 2:27 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Well they say Tibetan has blessings. Can be. What is so special about a Sanskrit syllable then?

Malcolm wrote:

Mantras and dharāṇīs are the utterances of the Buddha, uttered for a specific purpose, connected with a path.

As to Tibetan language itself carrying blessings, no, I don't buy that it is any more special than any other language, nor do I buy that Sanskrit is somehow a special language either. If it were, then why are we not all reciting the Gayatri, and so on? The Buddha rejected śruti, and so should we.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 2:31 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

zerwe said:

The approach based on H.E. Zong Rinpoche's advice all depends upon our own capacity, understanding, etc... but, he highlighted that at a certain point reciting words may become a hindrance to our concentration and deepening of our experience of the Yidam. Level 1, we recite everything. Level 2, the we understand enough to be able to recite everything and engage in the practice with enhanced concentration. Level 3 is where with sufficient experience and understanding "certain elements are automatically performed and experienced rather than recited."

Maybe someone else would care to verify or expand upon this, but it seems to make sense from a practice point of view.

Shaun

Malcolm wrote:

Sadhanas are written for beginners, the longer ones are for the least experienced. But one should also be able to recite a text and have it automatically trigger the required visualizations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

But one should also be able to recite a text and have it automatically trigger the required visualizations.

dharmafirststeps said:

Any tips for getting to that point? Or is it just a case of doing it enough?

Malcolm wrote:

Practice makes perfect.

At some point, As Zong Rinpoche pointed out, one can discard text and just do the visualizations, and if you can remember then, the offerings, praises and so on from memory.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
That's a false impression.

nightbloom said:  
Can you explain why you think Indian sadhakas recited their sadhanas word for word?  
Given the way some of these are written, ("Do this, visualize that, if you do not have X  
and you can substitute Y,") without any metrical structure or anything, this seems  
doubtful to me. Tibetan sadhanas seem a little different.

Malcolm wrote:  
Just how many Indian Sadhanas have you actually consulted? I've looked at very many  
(in Tibetan translation).

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 4:53 AM  
Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?  
Content:

nightbloom said:  
Can you explain why you think Indian sadhakas recited their sadhanas word for word?  
Given the way some of these are written, ("Do this, visualize that, if you do not have X  
and you can substitute Y,") without any metrical structure or anything, this seems  
doubtful to me. Tibetan sadhanas seem a little different.

Malcolm wrote:  
Just how many Indian Sadhanas have you actually consulted?

nightbloom said:  
Enough to generalize. I'm thinking of visualizations described at some length in the  
Vairocana Tantra, and a few of the less cryptic Yoginitantras and others from equivalent  
classes. It's also been a while, but I think many of the visualizations described in the  
Sadhanamala lack meter.

Malcolm wrote:  
Why do you think meter is important in a sadhana? Many are just in prose.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 4:55 AM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

On the flip side the technology we have has opened up doors for Vajrayana practice via online teachings and empowerment's which hitherto wasn't possible in India and Tibet.

Malcolm wrote:

That may not be a good thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 5:05 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

]

Because of lack of secrecy to the detriment of Secret Mantra?

Malcolm wrote:

Among other things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 5:45 AM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

]

Because of lack of secrecy to the detriment of Secret Mantra?

Malcolm wrote:

Among other things.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

I suppose we are in the third phase of Vajrayana now it's global and online and in the west so to say.

I wonder how long it can survive

Are the other issues related to say poor samaya?

Malcolm wrote:

I am just not sure how sound it is to give full empowerments over the web. There are some problems with this, and no agreement about what is correct and not correct. But it really cannot be the case that it is "whatever my lama says is correct."

Meaning empowerments are a different story, there are good and sound reasonings to think these are fine over the web. Even so, being in the same space as the teacher is better, in my opinion.

More importantly, I think that the online empowerment thing makes the whole thing a bit cheap. Then there is the issue of some teachers indiscriminately streaming live teachings to facebook with absolutely no restrictions on who can see them, and so on. There are a whole lot of issues with so called Facebook Dharma Teachings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 5:46 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

nightbloom said:

To cut to the chase, is there something specific that makes you think sanskrit sadhanas were meant to be recited...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, reading them in the bstan 'gyur as well as commentaries on them, and the way these translations were practiced as such by early lotsawas in Tibet, for example Rinchen Zangpo and Drokmi, before Tibetans started writing their own sadhanas based in Indian material.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 7:03 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Buddha did not speak Sanskrit.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure he did. He was educated.

Crazywisdom said:

These are utterances by awesome yogis a thousand years later. We talked about this. You affirmed they are not imposters if the information is Buddhist.

Malcolm wrote:

Mere details. The point is that they were uttered by the Buddha or blessed by the Buddha to do so. Time doesn't matter much here.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

nightbloom said:

To cut to the chase, is there something specific that makes you think sanskrit sadhanas were meant to be recited...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, reading them in the bstan 'gyur as well as commentaries on them, and the way these translations were practiced as such by early lotsawas in Tibet, for example Rinchen Zangpo and Drokmi, before Tibetans started writing their own sadhanas based in Indian material.

nightbloom said:

You could be right, but this puts us in the position of believing that Indian yogins were saying things like "On a full moon, in a lonely place, construct the mandala out of such-and-such, and say this mantra 100x while gazing at the sky" while they are actually doing these things.

Malcolm wrote:

No one recites such instructions in Tibetan sadhanas.

nightbloom said:

I know that most Tibetan sadhanas also contain a few such instructions and that these parts get read aloud, obviously, but it's also clear that many parts are meant to be recited.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 7:59 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

At some point, As Zong Rinpoche pointed out, one can discard text and just do the visualizations, and if you can remember then, the offerings, praises and so on from memory.

treehuggingoctopus said:

Ha. I started doing it on my own, kinda spontaneously (and only with the practices I know half by heart). Loppon-la, how popular is such a view among Tibetans?

nightbloom said:

I would like clarification on this as well, because I very much prefer to do it this way.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to follow the instructions of your guru. In general, much more emphasis is placed on reciting every word (which are meant to be recited) in Nyingma sadhanas, which is why they are universally in verse, from beginning to end, (including the parts not meant for recitation).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 8:10 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I was listening to the Wisdom Podcast and Robert Thurman as the guest and there was a small segment where he came out and said the opposite. That Buddhism is nontheistic, not atheistic since it accepts the idea of many gods. I remember this comment from awhile ago and went back to see if you or anyone could clarify since it seems you and him are saying the opposite, but both are very well studied.

Malcolm wrote:

An atheist is someone who rejects a creator god. We may accept that there are many kinds of sentient beings.

Nicholas2727 said:

: belief in the existence of a god or gods

specifically : belief in the existence of one God viewed as the creative source of the human race and the world who transcends yet is immanent in the world

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhism, devas are just other sentient beings in samsara, no big deal.

We are atheists, as we reject utterly the idea outlined in red. To call ourselves non-theists is just a cute way to avoid plainly stating the fact that we reject the central tenet of all Abrahamic religions, and a number of Indian ones as well.

Arnoud said:

Isn't that a very narrow definition of atheism? Most common definitions include not believing in any supernatural being. Not just a creator god.

Malcolm wrote:

Do we actually believe in any gods, that is, take refuge in any samsaric being. I contend that is what "belief" entails in the notion that theists believe in god or gods. Strictly

speaking, if Buddhist believe in “gods”, narrowly speaking, that’s makes us theists.

Funnily. Definition of a nontheist is:

: a person who does not believe that there is a god or gods : a person who is not a believer in theism

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 8:54 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

nightbloom said:

But you must have seen some of these Indian practices that consist almost solely of such instructions in conjunction with mantras, right? Some of them are in the scriptures themselves, and some are sadhanas generated on the basis of the scriptures (e.g, Sadhanamala).

Malcolm wrote:

I have to ask, do you have the empowerment for any sadhana? The Sadhanamala is not commonly given and actually requires training to understand how it is practiced, since it is series of sadhanas that follow a standard template

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 8:59 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

In contemporary common parlance, an atheist is an materialist who rejects out of hand any possible continuity of consciousness after physical death.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, I am a lifelong atheist who accepts rebirth and things that go bump in the night. YMMV.

You do realize the theists in India classified us as nastikas, along with carvakas, right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:01 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

We are in many respects much more closely aligned with these people than we are with "atheists."

Malcolm wrote:

You may be. I am not. Not into all that derivative Platonic and Neoplatonic bullshit. It's actually the opposite of Buddhist teachings, which are nominalist, not realist,

Your assertion above is indefensible. You should study tenet systems more carefully before spouting such nonsense.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

After all, Tibetans NEVER recited transliterated Sanskrit sadhanas. Why should we be expected to do so. It's bullshit. Just lazy.

n8pee said:

frak thank you. This has been my belief since day one (20 years ago) and yet I still encounter dharma centers that haven't translated their texts/prayers. Why?!

Malcolm wrote:

Laziness plus superstition,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:40 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

After all, Tibetans NEVER recited transliterated Sanskrit sadhanas. Why should we be expected to do so. It's bullshit. Just lazy.

n8pee said:

frak thank you. This has been my belief since day one (20 years ago) and yet I still encounter dharma centers that haven't translated their texts/prayers. Why?!

PadmaVonSamba said:

In the English/ Tibetan-language sadhanas that I am familiar with, The Tibetan syllables fit the meter of the melody nicely (along with the occasional run-on line). For me, it's 'read and learn about the meaning of what is being expressed in the text. Then when "singing" it, just sing it in Tibetan"  
...and then, not worry about it.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, we (not me) need to have the literary talent to compose sadhanas in English that can set to melody, etc. for group practice. This shit of westerners “reciting” “Tibetan” they can’t properly pronounce much less understand must end. This is not an issue for personal practice, we don’t need verse for that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

And it's not a healthy one.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. Why should I believe in anything? Beliefs are crutches. However, dependent origination is not a belief. It’s what you directly experience, whether you know it or not. And dependent origination is all you can experience. And nothing can be correctly explained in absence of dependent origination. This is atheism to the core.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:02 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

So the mechanics of this aggregates. Where are they? Where are these aggregates? Are they in our mind, outside, in some metaphysical space/domain?

Malcolm wrote:

Where to begin. If you don’t know what the aggregates are, you do not understand what you are from a Buddhist point of view. At base you are mind/matter.

One of your aggregates is material, made of the five material sense organs and five material senses objects. It’s called the material aggregate.

The other four aggregates are consciousness and the mental factors.

The aggregates of mental factors are three: sensation, perception, and formations. Sensation is the mental factor of the sensations of pleasure, pain, happiness, sadness and indifference. Perception is the mental factor that coordinates discernment of one object from another. There are 51 mental factors in the aggregate of formations. That list can be sought elsewhere.

Consciousness, the knower, is the mental subject perceiving all this. That subject lacks all true identity, any identity it possesses is a mere, designated identity imputed on a false conceptual construct, I-am, which has no more existence than an illusion. It’s

present moment of cognition is nonconceptual, the handling of that immediate perception by mental factors is conceptual, both in terms of memory consciousness and speculative consciousness.

That's it. That's all you are. Five aggregates.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

And it's not a healthy one.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. Why should I believe in anything? Beliefs are crutches. However, dependent origination is not a belief. It's what you directly experience, whether you know it or not. And dependent origination is all you can experience. And nothing can be correctly explained in absence of dependent origination. This is atheism to the core.

Nicholas2727 said:

First, thank you for your earlier reply which explained more on the athiest view of Buddhism. But aren't there some beliefs we take in Buddhism? And especially in Mahayana/Vajrayana?

Malcolm wrote:

No. Vajrayana is an understanding of a kind of profound dependent origination which also requires no belief in anything. For that matter neither does rebirth, karma, etc. All of these are automatically validated when dependent origination is properly understood. So if you want to understand all these, understand dependent origination. It's the Buddha's most subtle teaching, and explicating it, with varying degrees of success is whole point of Abhidharma, Yogacara, Madhyamaka, and Vajrayana.

These four should be understood in ascending order.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:38 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

How are the Five Skandhas related to the Five Koshas (if at all)?

Malcolm wrote:

They are not at all related.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:40 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

According the 'Theosophical Septenary', just above the Five Koshas (Five aggregates(?)), you have Buddhi (blos) and Atma. And above those Seven (after the 'Ring Pass-not'), you have the Three Kayas.

Also, there is:

Sattva, Jnana, sems (Citta), blos (Buddhi), and yid (Manas)....

Malcolm wrote:

Who gives a flying f\*\*k what those Victorian grifters, amateurs, and dilletantes had to say?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:49 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Anyway, I think Analayo is correct that the original BDK Dīrghāgama translation is not reliable. This is just a small example. But having Theravādans who also have an "early Buddhist" revival agenda to translate Āgamas can end up distorting things too. Like I pointed out with regard to Buddhaghosa, the traditional Theravāda perspective on things is closer to Mahāyāna thinking than many of these modernists like to imagine.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a great pity Ralpacan ordered translation of the Agamas to cease.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 8:22 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Because otherwise, what need is there for formal Sadhana practice at all? I certainly don't need to sit on a cushion and chant a cake recipe in order to visualize what the cake should look like and to take it through its beginning, middle, and completion stage. I just have to follow the recipe.

Malcolm wrote:

As I mentioned, sadhana recitation, for beginners, is a form of shamatha. This is how it is presented by mahasiddha Padmavajra.

Yes, it's a recipe, which has stages, etc., as well as precise bases of purification, purifiers, and results of purification. For serious personal practice, a beginner should seek to do the middle length or long version of a sadhana. Sadhanas are not just "how fast can I get to the mantra". Actually, mantra recitation is a post-equipoise practice, which generally comes AFTER the two stages, though thus not universal. The various stages in a sadhana, as mentioned above, have various specific functions related to purifying traces of the past life, conception, gestation, birth, and so on. They also epitomize the attainment of buddhahood in a single lifetime, from the initial thought of awakening to nonabiding nirvana, which normally takes three uncountable eons to achieve. So, there are important reasons to both understand the words and not rely on shorter sadhanas, as well as carefully reciting the words of the text so they trigger the appropriate visualization—clearly, quickly, and with focus. Short sadhanas do not have all these features, and are just for commitment maintenance, not liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:31 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Also, going back to the character of Vajrapāṇi, he is often characterised as being a product of a Buddhification of Herakles, but I don't see this anywhere in the textual references to him.

Malcolm wrote:

In the Pali canon, a figure named Vajrapāṇi is described as a yakṣa:

Now at that time the yakkha Thunderbolt-bearer, taking his iron thunderbolt which was aglow, ablaze, on fire, came to stand above the ground over Saccaka, the son of Jains, and said: "If this Saccaka, the son of Jains, does not answer when he is asked a legitimate question up to the third time by the Lord, verily I will make his skull split into seven pieces."

<https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/mn35>

Here we see Vajrapāṇi in his early role as dharmapāla. He is not, as some people



erroneously claim, a form of Indra. Indra is never a yakṣa.

There is a continuity with this identification of Vajrapāṇi in lower tantras as Guhyapati, lord of secrets, meaning lord of the Guhyakas, a class of Yakṣas who live in the north. In Kriya tantra, for example, one notes that only Vajra family deities require secrecy in their practice.

Also in the tantras, Vajrapāṇi, in his form known as Bhūtaḍāmara, is also considered the general of the dharmapālas, as he was able to successfully subdue Yakṣa Mahākāla where Hayagrīva was unable to do so (which may be throwing shade on Hayagrīva as an important Vedic deity, a preserver of the Vedas), in the Buddhist version of the destruction of Tripura, which resulted from an epic class struggle between the asuras and devas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Surely he could have gathered oceans of Bodhisattvas to Vulture's Peak.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, in someone's samadhi, there are no limitations to what may appear, depending on the depth of that samadhi. But there are definitely some physical limitations from the point of view of ordinary conventional perception. Since that is the base line for communicating with people, in general, we should confine ourselves to that and not expect people to believe in miracles.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 9:57 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Varis said:

Based off the fact that he knew the Gāyatrī mantra we can assume that at some point in his life he studied the Vedas and therefore could speak Sanskrit.

Malcolm wrote:

In CW's defense, I know the Gayatri Mantra, and I never studied the Vedas.

However, the reason I say he knew Sanskrit is that he regularly chatted with Brahmins in Sanskrit, and tweeted them on their arrogance toward the speech of low caste bhīṣas, causing him to declare his teachings should be taught in local vernacular. Hence my insistence that serious sadhana practice should be done in one's own language.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's not mere details that the texts were not said by Buddha. Maybe they were blessed by Vajradhara.

Malcolm wrote:

They are the same person.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Well you're aware of these varied specific terms quite well, are you not?

Could you give us a crash-course on their subtle distinctions, in laymen's terms at least?

Malcolm wrote:

The five kośas are from the Taittīriya Upanishad.

They simply do not relate at all to anything in Buddhism.

Sādhaka said:

Perhaps also related to the Eight Consciousnesses?

Malcolm wrote:

Not even remotely.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Can I use a mala?

Content:

bodhiye said:

I haven't received Vajrayana empowerments. Can I buy and use a mala for chanting the name/recollection of Buddhas and Bodhisattvas?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:08 PM

Title: Re: Bhumis in context

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

How should one regard the bhumis in an applicable sense in terms of one's own practice?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, until you are on the bhumis, they are of no relevance at all. While one is not on the bhumis, one is either on the path of accumulation or the path of application, and most of us are on the first one, the path of application.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:15 PM

Title: Re: Mahayana Mahaparinirvana Sutra

Content:

Queequeg said:

For the less learned, can you explain that?

Malcolm wrote:

For Yogacārinś, emptiness exists, it is strictly defined as an affirming negation; a village is empty of a city, and so on. Asanga explicitly invokes the emptiness described in the Cullasuññata sutta in a rebuke to Madhyamakas.

Queequeg said:

I've gotten around to following up on this reply.

This rebuke of Asanga is kind of a strawman, is it not? As I understand this might apply to emptiness as an analytical tool applied to dharmas, but does not apply to the so-called emptiness of emptiness.

Moreover, while the emptiness described in the sutta is sort of comparable to madhyamaka, its really describing progressive meditative practice through the four dhyanas up to insight. Its not exactly comparable to emptiness analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Asanga is saying that emptiness, correctly understood, is like that emptiness in the Cullasuññata sutta, and the Madhyamakas go too far and negate too much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Varis said:

I disagree. The Gayatri mantra during the time of the Buddha was not an openly known thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it was, the Buddha talks about it openly, in one passage declaring it is the supreme of all mantras, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:49 PM

Title: Re: Bhumis in context

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

How should one regard the bhumis in an applicable sense in terms of one's own practice?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, until you are on the bhumis, they are of no relevance at all. While one is not on the bhumis, one is either on the path of accumulation or the path of application, and most of us are on the first one, the path of application.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Right. So why is it even taught?

My understanding is that the Buddha didn't teach things that had no relevance to practice.

Is it supposed to inspire practice?

Has anyone ever known of a practitioner even getting close?

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha always taught the whole path, whatever path he was teaching, in sūtra and tantra, so that people would understand their experiences on the path. One of the main reasons is that so that people will not mistake their experience, thinking they have realized something they have not, for example, emptiness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's not mere details that the texts were not said by Buddha. Maybe they were blessed by Vajradhara.

Malcolm wrote:

They are the same person.

Crazywisdom said:

Vajradhara is not a person. A person is a sentient being. Sentient beings have afflictions. Vajradhara is the dharmakaya. Siddhis who recognize that can bless mantras with dharmakaya connection, unless one wants to believe Sanskrit itself emanates from primordial space like Vedantins do.

Malcolm wrote:

The Dharmakāya is not separable from the rūpakāya, just being the mind of a buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:05 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The lesson of understanding what's being taught is a good lesson. If one learns which lesson is being taught in a Vajrayana sadhana it's obvious one must visualize, which cannot be done in a language one doesn't understand. Same with prayers like Bodhicitta and 7 Limbs. The meaning is what matters.

Anyway, Indians recited these sadhanas in languages they understood, obviously. So did Tibetans. Accurate translation is essential.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is my point. I have actually made this point over and over again over the years. The Sakyapas started this trend, in fact. HH Sakya Trichen translated the main Sakya sadhanas (Middle Length Hevajra and Vajrayogini) into English in 1968. It was furthered by CTR in Vajradhātu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, September 29th, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Mahayana Mahaparinirvana Sutra

Content:

Queequeg said:

I've gotten around to following up on this reply.

This rebuke of Asanga is kind of a strawman, is it not? As I understand this might apply to emptiness as an analytical tool applied to dharmas, but does not apply to the so-called emptiness of emptiness.

Moreover, while the emptiness described in the sutta is sort of comparable to madhyamaka, its really describing progressive meditative practice through the four dhyanas up to insight. Its not exactly comparable to emptiness analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Asanga is saying that emptiness, correctly understood, is like that emptiness in the Cullasuññata sutta, and the Madhyamakas go too far and negate too much.

Queequeg said:

In your opinion, is Asanga's critique correct or is this a polemical position? Is this directed at a particular school of Madhyamaka or is this a critique of Nagarjuna himself?

Malcolm wrote:

I think Asanga's point is incorrect, and it may not be directed at Nāgārjuna directly. The reason for this is that Yogacārin's have always tried, without success in my opinion, to reconcile their very technical doctrine with Madhyamaka, even composing commentaries texts like 400 Verses of Aryadeva to explain where Madhyamakas get it wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

In CW's defense, I know the Gayatri Mantra, and I never studied the Vedas.

Varis said:

I disagree. The Gayatri mantra during the time of the Buddha was not an openly known thing. The traditional rule for reciting the Gayatri is that it is never supposed to be chanted aloud to prevent non-initiates from hearing it.

During the upanayana ceremony the Gayatri is whispered directly into the ear for the same reason.

Crazywisdom said:

Therefore Buddha would not have known the Gayatri since it was reserved for initiated

Brahmins.

Malcolm wrote:

No, for anyone who was twice born, not just brahmins.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

adherence to progressive/left politics, and so on.

Malcolm wrote:

Unsurprisingly, I am a left-wing progressive. I feel much more at ease in the company of atheists than I do in the company of Christians. I least I know the former are pro-democratic. In this I stand in good company with men like Ethan Allen, Jefferson, Franklin, Washington, and other notable atheists of the American revolution.

Christianity, Islam, Judaism, etc are anti-democratic by nature, whereas Buddhism is not. It probably has to do with the Platonic and Neo-platonic origins of their philosophy and theology. Qabala, for example, is just reheated neoplatonism.

It is also not surprising in the least that Buddhists, in ancient India were lumped together with the carvakas by other schools, since we reject śruti, varna, etc, basically everything in the "Laws of Manu." The only difference between us and materialists, even today, is that we accept rebirth and karma, they do not.

As I mentioned before, Buddhism in all its forms is a kind of nominalism; we reject that pādārthas aka universals are real. The acceptance of the real existence of universals is a characteristic of right wing philosophy everywhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Mahayana Mahaparinirvana Sutra

Content:

Queequeg said:

In your opinion, is Asanga's critique correct or is this a polemical position? Is this directed at a particular school of Madhyamaka or is this a critique of Nagarjuna himself?

Malcolm wrote:

I think Asanga's point is incorrect, and it may not be directed at Nāgārjuna directly. The reason for this is that Yogacārinś have always tried, without success in my opinion, to

reconcile their very technical doctrine with Madhyamaka, even composing commentaries texts like 400 Verses of Aryadeva to explain where Madhyamakas get it wrong.

Queequeg said:

Thank you. That makes sense.

Malcolm wrote:

That's "composing commentaries on texts like..."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Therefore Buddha would not have known the Gayatri since it was reserved for initiated Brahmins.

Malcolm wrote:

No, for anyone who was twice born, not just brahmins.

Crazywisdom said:

So now you're saying Buddha was a Kshatriya?

Malcolm wrote:

According to tradition, yes, that is the point of view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 2:01 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Varis said:

I disagree. The Gayatri mantra during the time of the Buddha was not an openly known thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it was, the Buddha talks about it openly, in one passage declaring it is the supreme of all mantras, and so on.



Crazywisdom said:  
I don't believe this at all.

Malcolm wrote:  
Ok. You don't have to. It is not a requirement.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 2:04 AM  
Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism  
Content:

nightbloom said:  
Funny how it just so happens to work out that the Dharma is compatible, in every way, shape and form, with progressivism as it exists in 2021.

Malcolm wrote:  
You should read the Ratnavali. Nāgārjuna had very progressive views about health care, social safety nets, prison reform, elimination of capital punishment and so on. Buddha himself was anti-caste, anti-militarism, etc.

nightbloom said:  
This is a naked attempt to bring the Dharma in under the umbrella of the current political and social zeitgeist, and nothing more. Totally transparent.

Malcolm wrote:  
It is not an attempt. Western Buddhists tend to be left-wing progressives, except in Eastern Europe, where they tend to lean right, because of their experience with Stalinism. The first time I met a Republican Buddhist I was honestly very shocked. I personally do not see how you can square right wing politics with bodhicitta. Why do you think we were so hard on you about vaccinations? You are going to be very unhappy in the Dharma in America if you can't deal with progressives.

Tibetans themselves tend to be a bit reactionary, because most of them are monarchists.

Noted that you did not deal with the actual content of the post.

Mod note: Between this post and the next post by DGA, a whole bunch of off topic or ad hominem posts have been removed.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I don't believe this at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok. You don't have to. It is not a requirement.

Crazywisdom said:

Apparently you didn't either. You were formerly into historical analysis vis a vis Duckworth's(SP?) books, but now you've decided to go with traditional religious renditions.

Here's what you said...

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=591623#p591623>

Malcolm wrote:

Different paradigms for different occasions. Historically speaking, it is unlikely Buddha taught Mahāyāna, let alone the tantras, etc., was a kṣatriya, etc. But from the point of view of tradition, he did all these things. I don't worry about the contradictions between these points of view.

Now we are really off topic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Uggghhh:

<https://www.audible.com/pd/Podcast/B08JJQL65R>

In episode 9 of this podcast, Una Marera reports seeing Trungpa french-kissing a thirteen year old girl in a Boulder Dharmadhātu event with other adults present.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 3:23 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

conebeckham said:

If you learn Tibetan and read and study, participating in rituals can be a very transformative experience, and I have yet to hear any English (or other Western language) version of such rituals that is as powerful and affecting. But this could just be me.

Malcolm wrote:

It doesn't help that a lot of sadhanas use words like "holy" and "sacred" and so on, bringing to mind a Catholic or Episcopalian mass, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 4:28 AM

Title: Re: How difference between Chan and Zen.

Content:

KeithA said:

So, I am not sure why some native Asians seem to struggle with our practice.

Malcolm wrote:

They (lay Asians) generally do not practice meditation. They light incense, bow, and do a little chanting. That's about it.

Meditation is the job of religious professionals. And, I read an interesting book recently, Zen Ritual: Studies of Zen Buddhist Theory in Practice. It emphasized the fact that in many respects, in Zen temples in Japan, there was a lot of less meditation than one might expect, and that a large portion of temple activities were oriented towards ministering to the needs of the lay population with various kinds of rituals.

SeekNothing said:

Is this really true? My experience has been with one of the Taiwan Chan groups, but they certainly emphasize meditation, and their origin is in Asia (and in the US the majority of the lay sangha is Asian, and all the monks I have seen). If you mean Japanese Zen specifically then I have no idea. But I also know devout people in mainland China that mediate frequently as well.

Is it the case that it depends more on the organization or tradition than the country?

Are people making a distinction here between Chan and Zen but then lumping Seon and Thein together with Zen?

Malcolm wrote:

The largest group of Asian Buddhists in the US are pure landers. And among the Thai, etc., Theravadin communities, mostly lay people use the Sangha as a support for dana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 4:45 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

conebeckham said:

If you learn Tibetan and read and study, participating in rituals can be a very transformative experience, and I have yet to hear any English (or other Western language) version of such rituals that is as powerful and affecting. But this could just be me.

Malcolm wrote:

It doesn't help that a lot of sadhanas use words like "holy" and "sacred" and so on, bringing to mind a Catholic or Episcopalian mass, etc.

conebeckham said:

Sure. Heck, even calling Kundun "HHDL" is somewhat fraught, IMO. I think all translations are approximate. Including Tibetan translations from Sanskrit.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and all translations are commentary, as an article I was reading by Jonathon Silk this morning pointed out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 4:46 AM

Title: Re: Rupa

Content:

Viach said:

The rupa (form) in the so-called waking state and the rupa in the lucid dream state are the same rupa or is there no rupa at all in the lucid dream state?

Malcolm wrote:

None at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 5:07 AM

Title: Re: Vehicle of the gods and humans

Content:

naljor said:

What is actually the vehicle of gods and humans in dzogchen teachings of nine vehicles? Just low of karma or non buddhist spiritual practices?

Malcolm wrote:

It is the practice of the ten virtues and the four brahma viharas, which lead to rebirth in

higher realms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Vajrayana. How do I begin my path?

Content:

ElenaTheo said:

Hi dear forum members,

And...the question is: where the heck should I start?

Malcolm wrote:

First find a qualified guru. Then, receive empowerments. Then follow their instruction carefully.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 8:26 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

DGA said:

Reframing part of the conversation:

if you can't respect that people you disagree with on some issues are people you can learn from, then you're really going to struggle with Buddha Dharma. And nearly everything else.

nightbloom said:

I agree entirely. I think few of the things that are really important in life are cut and dry, obvious, accessible to "common sense." I'm completely happy to practice the dharma and work with people with different politics, so long as this is reciprocated and we try to avoid treating one another as bad faith actors.

I regret accusing Malcolm of cynicism, and retract it.

Malcolm wrote:

One thing that is cut and dry is that Buddhism has far more in common with atheism than theism. So much so, it is basically a form of atheism. But many Buddhist are attached to Ideas of spirituality, and so atheism makes them uncomfortable..

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

One thing that is cut and dry is that Buddhism has far more in common with atheism than theism. So much so, it is basically a form of atheism. But many Buddhist are attached to Ideas of spirituality, and so atheism makes them uncomfortable..

PadmaVonSamba said:

Someone I know once jokingly referred to Buddhism as "Atheistic Hinduism"

Malcolm wrote:

That might be true, but only if Buddhism's theory of karma and rebirth even remotely resembled the Hindu concepts of the same, but it doesn't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 10:04 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

To be crystal clear, I do not intend to conflate all of these things. There is a reason why I chose to practice Buddhism and not something else. But the attempt to distance Buddhism from other traditions and place it close to contemporary atheist materialism is hard to see as anything more than an opportunistic rhetorical move designed to preserve the appearance of Buddhism's "appropriateness" within modern society. In other words, it's branding, and a rather pernicious form of branding, in my opinion...

This is even more obvious when one reflects that Buddhist practice is overflowing with things that resemble practices in other traditions (prayer, renunciation, magic) that are explicitly reviled and mocked by materialist culture.

For the record, I find the term "Spirituality" distasteful and avoid using it because of its vagueness.

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone mocks each other's nonfalsifiable beliefs, movement atheists have many nonfalsifiable beliefs also. But that's not the point, Buddhists offer natural mechanisms which explain all of theirs, and none of them involve relying any external force. These system, Trika, Advaita, no need to mention Samkhya, etc., are all realist schools. Thus they are limited because they do not understand dependent origination.

Among western schools, Buddhism most closely resembles Epicureanism, then after that, Hume. Of course, we tear them apart too, but they are the closest.

I forgot to mention it, Epicurus is the father of modern, Western atheism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 10:48 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

That might be true, but only if Buddhism's theory of karma and rebirth even remotely resembled the Hindu concepts of the same, but it doesn't.

My understanding is that the only difference between the two is Hindus believe the continuity between lives has an unchanging identity, and Buddhists do not.

Malcolm wrote:

No, the Hindu concept of reincarnation is much stranger, much more like Pythagorean metempsychosis than the Buddhist understanding of dependent origination and karma. It's pretty strange. Also different Hindu schools have different ideas about the specifics but they all, in the end, assert a permanent, ultimate entity, and we do not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 11:08 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Padmist said:

So about the reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa, how come he doesn't seem to have the same continuation of Chogyam Trungpa's favorite pastime? What happened to the memory, habits, etc?

Malcolm wrote:

Because he is not the same person, probably not even the actual rebirth of Trungpa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 7:37 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

So now you're saying Buddha was a Kshatriya?

Virgo said:

Yes, he was. And also at that time in India Kshatriyas and Brahmins were pretty equal in the caste system. Only later were they eclipsed by Brahmins.

Virgo

Crazywisdom said:

You will have to prove that with evidence. The evidence supports the contrary that the Buddha's land had no exposure to Brahminism, and that the Vedic culture was still isolated in the Punjab with no diffusion into Magadha.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is what Bronkhorst concludes. His arguments are compelling, but not conclusive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Why not cross the Guru Bead?

Content:

Chenda said:

[Mod note: This topic was split from "Can I use a mala?"]

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=600405#p600405>

Knotty Veneer said:

A few things I was told:

Don't cross the guru bead when reciting mantras.

Don't show off your mala - it's not jewellery.

Don't take it into the bathroom.

A practical point:

Best to use a simple wooden or bodhi seed mala, IMO. Beads made from semi-precious stones tend to break easily if you drop your expensive fancy mala!

Chenda said:

While we're at it, is it really important not to cross the guru bead? I always did, and it never made sense why we should not cross it nor why it's considered disrespectful.

Malcolm wrote:

It's mainly to accurately count sets of 100.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

Were the Jonangpas realist? If not, why are their assertions so easily mistaken for realism? If so, are they still Buddhist? Rhetorical questions, but I'm sure you take my point.



Malcolm wrote:

The Jonangpas are Buddhist because they go for refuge to the three jewels and engage in Buddhist training.

They are “realists, vastuvadins” because they are a subspecies of Yogacara attempts to interpret Nagarjuna through the treatises of Maitreya. Their nearest Indian exponent is Ratnakarashanti, who asserts the ultimacy of gnosis, etc.

There are three realist Buddhist tenet systems: Sarvastivada, and other shravakayana schools, Sautrantikas, and Yogacara. But here Buddhist realism means something different than the assertion of universals as real, like the Nyaya school, etc. it means asserting that disparate particulars are real or ultimate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

The humiliation of a nun at a public teaching was impossible to cover up...

Malcolm wrote:

Unless you personally know someone who was there, how sure are you of your understanding of the episode?

I do know people who were there, and well, let's just say, according to them, this is not what others claim it was.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 9:05 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Because he is not the same person, probably not even the actual rebirth of Trungpa.

Padmist said:

Thank you.

In the case that it is the reincarnation of CTR, we can say that he is not the same person.

He is a different guy.

heart said:

Please understand that this is Malcolms opinion on this particular tulku and his well known opinion on tulku system as it is today, not a general statement on reincarnation.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, rebirth is one thing, tulkus quite another.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 9:05 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Because he is not the same person, probably not even the actual rebirth of Trungpa.

Padmist said:

Thank you.

In the case that it is the reincarnation of CTR, we can say that he is not the same person. He is a different guy.

heart said:

Please understand that this is Malcolms opinion on this particular tulku and his well known opinion on tulku system as it is today, not a general statement on reincarnation.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, rebirth is one thing, tulkus quite another.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Why not cross the Guru Bead?

Content:

lelopa said:

Here the big bead is called Mt. Meru:

<https://www.mahamala.com/the-indian-tradition/>

Malcolm wrote:

However, in Buddhadharma we count with the left hand, not the right.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Someone I know once jokingly referred to Buddhism as "Atheistic Hinduism"

Malcolm wrote:

That might be true, but only if Buddhism's theory of karma and rebirth even remotely resembled the Hindu concepts of the same, but it doesn't.

MiphamFan said:

Can you point to any sources on this?

Malcolm wrote:

It is super weird, actually:

Life does not end at the death of the physical body. The body dies but the soul does not. It lives on in a counterpart of the physical body which is called the astral body. The astral body is made of astral matter and resides in a world not unlike this one, called the Devaloka or Second world. In other words, in order to perfect itself, to spiritually unfold and evolve, the soul lives on in another body after death, the astral body. At the right time, according to its karma, it is reborn into a flesh body. Thus the astral body, with the soul within it, enters a new physical body. This same cycle is repeated many times until the soul spiritually unfolds and reaches a certain state of perfection or mature evolution. These repeated cycles of births and deaths are known as samsara. The soul passes from one physical body to another. Each time it does so, the Hindu says, the soul has reincarnated. This is the process to which the name "reincarnation" is given.

Therefore, the Hindu does not believe in a single life on earth, followed by eternal joy or pain. Hindus know that all souls reincarnate, take one body and then another, evolving through experience over long periods of time. To a Hindu death is not fearsome. Like the caterpillar's metamorphosis into the delicate butterfly, death does not end our existence but frees us to pursue an even greater development. The soul never dies. It is immortal. Physical death is a most natural transition for the soul, which survives and, guided by karma, continues its long pilgrimage until it is one with its creator, God. Reincarnation is the natural cycle of birth, death & rebirth, called samsara. When we die, the soul leaves the first world physical body, it lives for a while in the Devaloka, the Second World, before returning again to earth, the Bhuloka or First World.

<https://www.hinduismtoday.com/hindu-basics/karma-and-reincarnation/>

This devaloka is the moon, actually. And according to Shankara, one's atman becomes vapor which rains down on plants, and then this soul gradually moves through the plant and animal kingdoms, eventually one becomes human again. I am sure the metaphor is based on the monsoon seasons in India.

MiphamFan said:

Thus, according to Hinduism, life in the ancestral heaven lasts longer, but it still is a temporary because eventually every soul that goes there has to return to the earth to continue its mortal existence. A soul may enjoy great pleasures in the ancestral heaven, but eventually its enjoyment has to end like any pleasant dream. Once its karma is exhausted, the individual soul falls down from the heights of heaven through rain and returns to the earth to participate once again in the turmoil of the unstable earthly phenomena and the ocean of births and deaths (samsara).

The scriptures explain how each soul, having the size of an atom, enters a new body in the mother's womb upon conception and begins its rebirth. The suggested return journey starts with the falling down of the individual souls to the earth along with rain drops from the ancestral heaven, which is located in the moon. When they fall upon earth along with rain, each soul becomes deposited in the earth along with the seeping rainwater. There, they enter plants or trees through the water they absorb and become part of their sap. When those plants or trees are consumed by humans or animals they enter their bodies. Those souls which enter animal bodies may either take animal birth or await until they are consumed by humans to take human birth according to their karma. When a soul enters a male body through the aforesaid process, and if that person is destined to be its father, it becomes part of his semen (retas). From there it enters the body of female through sexual intercourse, if she is destined to be its mother, and settles in her womb inside the fertilized egg awaiting its rebirth.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.hinduwebsite.com/reincarnation.asp>

MiphamFan said:

I think in general reincarnation-accepting religions are still closer to us than mainstream Abrahamic religions though.

Malcolm wrote:

Superficially only. Hindus use karma and reincarnation to enforce the caste system. Buddhists don't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Here's a report of the incident I was referring to - what do you informants say happened differently?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, for starters, he did not punch her very hard, it was a kind of a running joke between them, nevertheless he was mad. Second, he and she hugged and giggled immediately after the famous punch. And there is the third point, which is that the nun in question completely disagreed with how this was covered by the media, is still a loyal student of Sogyal, and refused to press charges of assault. But of course her point of view is brushed off as being a mere cult member cluelessness and blind devotion.

Now, let me clarify, Sogyal did have a penchant for hitting his students with his famous backscratcher. He hit someone I know in the head with it quite solidly once. My friend claims that this blow allowed him to understand the nature of the mind. It cut right through all his bullshit. I believe him, because this person has a very good understanding of Dzogchen teachings. I am pretty confident that Sogyal had a very good understanding of Dzogchen teachings as well. Having a good understanding of Dzogchen teachings does not necessarily make one a nice person to be around.

Now, I myself would prefer to be humiliated in front of 300 people by being yelled on a hot mic for being a young, arrogant scholar (as happened with Chogyal Namkhai Norbu in 1992, which by the way sealed the deal for me about ChNN), some people get it by being hit in public, others by being hit with sandals, backscratchers, etc. I am not saying that we have to stay with gurus who we feel are abusive or appear abusive. I am saying we need to be careful about how we judge the interactions of other people with their teachers. The people who wrote the letter, and the people who have come forward about their experience of Sogyal, felt abused. Others, experiencing just the same conduct at the same time, did not, and defended their teacher. I cannot condemn either side for the way they behaved.

In the end, it is caveat emptor, on the part of both the teacher and the student. The teacher has to examine the student well. The student has to examine the teacher well. It is clear that many Rigpa students did not examine the teacher well; it is equally clear the teacher did not examine the students well. So, in the end, they both suffered. While I would not blame his ex-students, it is pretty clear to me that Sogyal died in a state of profound sadness, and died earlier than he would have otherwise as a result of the whole thing. And people cannot give it up, still they incessantly criticize Sogyal as the Tibetan Guru Bogeyman, honestly, there are worse teachers out there, in the past and also still active, I am quite sure.

Many Asian teachers, from a Western point of view, have very poor boundaries. It's ok to have boundaries, but one should understand that in the traditional guru disciple relationship in Vajrayāna Buddhism, those boundaries can be sorely tested. Most of the problem these days arises from this kind of misunderstanding. Some of it is cultural. In

old Tibet, if a renowned guru wanted to sleep with someone, it was regarded as an honor, bringing fortune to everyone, for obvious reasons which are not spiritual at all and totally patriarchal and sexist. Here, if a guru wants to sleep with someone, he or she is immediately a creep, a pervert, a libertine, a scoundrel, because we have a different set of values derived from how we view the clerical trade in West, and what kind of boundaries should be observed. If one is priest, celibacy; if one is minister, one should be in a strictly monogamous union.

In the end, we need to be careful about who we take as our teachers, just as they need to be careful about who they choose as students.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 11:22 PM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Thus it further lends weight to the notion the Pali Canon is not a reliable source of historical facts about Buddha's life.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, agreed. Good thing we don't practice history, though. The Mahāyānis had a transcendent view of the Buddha as a person. But we also do not practice text criticism.

But I do understand your point. If we are going to talk about empirical history, we have to be honest about things like the repurposing of legendary Indian persons like <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Vararuchi> (Bramze mchog sred), considered one of the most highly educated panditas in India, into the manifestation of Padmasambhava called Loden Chogse (blo ldan mchog sred) or Brilliant Vararuci, etc.

If we are going to go by tradition, then these are two different persons.

We need to be able to shift between these two perspectives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 11:33 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

I do not think the point of view you are espousing is useful anymore, Malcolm. And to be honest, is redolent of the kind of excuses one often hears from those "senior students" who turned a blind eye to Trungpa, Osel Mukpo, Michael Roach and so forth.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, then come up with a list of professional standards for Vajrayāna gurus, Zen

masters, etc., which they have to meet in order to teach Buddhism in your country, along with remedies when they violate professional codes of conduct. Because otherwise, these kinds of things will just continue. The problem is a little thing we have in democracies, called "freedom of religion."

Knotty Veneer said:

And I don't think Sogyal was a great guru - I think he just had a really good editor.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't either. Neither was Trungpa, in my opinion. But thousands of people still think so. And many people who studied with Trungpa also have good understandings of the Dharma at present and are good practitioners. Are we going to throw them under the bus because we don't like their teacher? Are we going to claim that whatever they may have realized is bogus? That just does not work in Vajrayāna. In Vajrayāna, what matters is regarding your teacher to be a Buddha, period. Not like a buddha, but a Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, September 30th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

The BBC is running a series called "Life at 50C". Here's one episode, with others in the sidebar.

<https://www.bbc.com/news/av/science-environment-58724297>

I thought I should put it in this omnibus thread rather than keep multiple climate-change threads cluttering up the board.

Kim

Queequeg said:

A lot of that story about the river has to do with idiotic water laws in the US, as GC has touched on recently. That said, the drought affecting Western N. America is real.

Meanwhile, I'm having to figure out how to keep soil on the slopes in my back yard in the face of high rainfall.

...

I just found out that the knotweed that has invaded the area was originally introduced to control erosion. I guess they didn't realize that it would outcompete almost everything else, except the various fast growing vines that now blanket disturbed landscapes here - also invasives. The thought did cross my mind that maybe I should reintroduce

knotweed into my yard and let it grow on the slopes, but my gut loathing of that plant snuffed that line of thought.

I often wonder what the landscape will look like when humans stop tending it.

Malcolm wrote:

What time frame are you talking about? Right now, there is a lot of shitty underbrush in NE forests. If there is a drought here, we are all doomed by fires, which will be apocalyptic.

Queequeg said:

Will the giant hardwoods native to this area of N. America slowly recover?

Malcolm wrote:

The Chestnuts are gone, extinct. They were the dominant hardwood species. Maples were farmed, grown as sugar bush.

So no. And there is no controlled burning anymore, which is how the native people used to keep underbrush down so it was easier to hunt and travel.

Queequeg said:

I'm exposing them to ideas about frugality, balance, harmony, coexistence and stewardship with an anthropomorphic, spiritual flavor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

DGA said:

Examples: I don't mix with white supremacists, but many of my peers seem to take a "both sides have good points" approach to, say, holocaust denial

Malcolm wrote:

Me either, and the both-siders are full of shit. Same goes for anti-vaxxers or people who will not do the responsible thing and get vaxxed, whatever their excuse may be, barring a medical waiver.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 12:20 AM

Title: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Ann [Glieg] reflects on her experiences as a Buddhist scholar on the receiving end of white rage:

Steve: "Scary, postmodern virus infects North American Buddhism."



Me: "Thanks for showing us what PoC Buddhists have to deal with every day in their sanghas, Steve."

Steve: "Keep playing the victim."

Me: "I notice your Twitter profile says "Zen Beginner," maybe you could learn something from the Zen teachers in this book, who have been practicing for decades. Stretch that Zen Mind, Beginner's Mind, Steve!"

Steve: deletes thread and blocks me.[1]

The preceding was a short exchange I had with Steve, a stranger, on Twitter, after I tweeted about the publication of George Yancy and Emily McRae's 2019 edited collection *Buddhism and Whiteness*. The book contained essays by Buddhist scholars and scholar-practitioners examining both how whiteness operates in Buddhist practice and academic communities, and what resources Buddhist thought and practice offer for challenging whiteness. While this was the first academic collection to attend to whiteness in Buddhism, Buddhists of Color have been confronting whiteness in American Buddhism for over two and a half decades. The landmark 2000 compilation *Making the Invisible Visible: Healing Racism in our Buddhist Communities*, for instance, shared that for many years the white Euro-American sangha has been resistant to efforts by People of Color to raise awareness of racism in Buddhist communities. <https://www.shilohproject.blog/why-are-white-buddhists-so-angry-white-rage-and-buddhist-studies-scholarship/>

Seems to be a real thing. We see a lot of here in DW, sadly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhist Studies Has a Whiteness Problem

<https://contendingmodernities.nd.edu/global-currents/buddhist-studies-whiteness/>

Unknown said:

Decolonizing Buddhist Studies

Religious studies is finally beginning to come to terms with its colonialist past. Discussions related to decolonizing religious studies are becoming increasingly prominent, not only in forums like this blog, but also in places like the annual meetings of the American Academy of Religion, the main academic gathering for scholars of

religion in the US. We still have a long way to go, but the fact that these conversations are even happening is promising.

Within religious studies, however, scholars of Buddhism have remained largely absent from these discussions. Buddhist studies, on the whole, has not acknowledged, let alone addressed, issues of colonization, white supremacy, and the erasure of Asian people and cultures within the field. And with the news of a white man murdering Asian women on March 16, 2021, an attack that followed in the wake of increased anti-Asian violence related to misinformation about the coronavirus pandemic, scholars of Buddhist studies need to acknowledge where we stand in all of this, beyond simply expressing our outrage at specific incidents of explicit hate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Queequeg said:

That said, I don't know about the mix you have up in the northern Berkshires, but here, we have tulip and various red and white oaks that grow really tall - 150'+. Not as big as the chestnuts used to grow, but still pretty massive. Ailanthus and other weed trees don't survive in those stands. Even the norway maples seem to be in check.

Malcolm wrote:

Sugar Maple, Oaks, Pines, Hemlock, Ash, Locust, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

...mindless planet-killing virus...

Malcolm wrote:

That would be our present economic system, free-market capitalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 1:25 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Don't sleep with your students. Don't physically or sexually assault them. Make sure your finances are transparent. It's not really so difficult?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is a little difficult.

Let's start the last item, obviously money run through nonprofits has to be transparent by law. Personal gifts, dana, is private, not subject to taxation, etc., nor should it be.

Moving on the first item, there is no actual reason it is necessarily wrong for teachers to sleep with students, as long as it is consensual. There are some people who will argue that it can never be consensual. I don't buy that argument.

As for the second item, these are legal terms. If someone assaults someone this is either a misdemeanor or a felony, depending. If a student, for example, receives a blow from a teacher, and declines to press charges, that will generally be the end of it and should be the end of it. If they are beaten to a pulp, that is a different matter. Sexual assault is more serious, because that is always a crime. You neglected to mention verbal assault, BTW.

For example, in America, in the 1960's, it was permissible for elementary school teachers to slap students. I got slapped once, in second grade. Parents generally felt this was ok. By the 1980's, this was no longer ok. These things are never so cut and dry as people want to make them.

In some states in the US, it is illegal for licensed minister to sleep with a parishioner. In most, it is not. At this point, very few Buddhist teachers are licensed members of the clergy. Generally, it is because such licensure depends on some kind of ordination and endorsement by a religious body which shows the member is in good standing, etc., and the vast majority of Buddhist teachers are not ordained and do not belong to these kinds of organized religious groups. So, it is really not as simple as you want it to be, with your reductionist set of guidelines. Many Tibetan male lay teachers active today pursue relationships among their students, if they are not married (and sometimes, even if they are, sometimes even if they are ordained). I could give you a list but in the interest of people's privacy, I am not going to. Frankly, what people do in their private lives is none of our business, as long as it is not criminal. I know a lot of people who are disappointed that Sogyal did not live long enough to be taken to court again. People point to the San Francisco Zen Center as a place which gives a good road map, but Richard Baker never stopped teaching, not ever. People still excuse Seungsahn's behavior, though, frankly, again, what people do on their own time is their own business. His Kwan Um centers are widespread in America, they are all over the place. It's such old news though, I think most new students have no idea. Maybe they are entrance counseled about it, I don't know. NKT, still going strong, after myriad sex and ethics scandals. Shambhala will continue. Diamond Mt. shut down, but Michael Roach is still out there, even being implicated in the death of one of his closest students did not stop him.

So, the only course is to make sure you examine the teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Seems to be a real thing. We see a lot of here in DW, sadly.

Archie2009 said:

Indeed. Punctuality is White Supremacy culture as the National Museum of African American History and Culture rightly pointed out in a now sadly retracted jpeg chart posted on their website. And DW is so punctual, every time I press the Submit button my contribution is immediately added to the thread in question.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty accurate chart. Describes most of the things I find cringy about US culture and white people here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 1:43 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Another one:

<https://www.lionsroar.com/the-maras-of-privilege/>

Unknown said:

“Are you studying the religion of wokeism or the religion of Buddhism?”

“Perverting the dharma with identity politics.”

“Keep playing the victim.”

“Sheer nonsense.”

Malcolm wrote:

I have heard exactly the same tropes here.

She continues:

This is some of the blowback I've got from my work challenging racism and promoting diversity, equity, and inclusion in Buddhism. While much of the response to my research has been positive, it has also been the target of defensiveness and derision from some white Buddhists, and resentment and rage from others.

I have been attacked personally and accused of being a "pseudo-scholar" and of "attempting to pervert the dharma by means of identity politics." Self-identified alt-right Buddhists (yes, there is such a thing) have gone as far as creating a podcast ridiculing me and two other Buddhist Studies scholars for our work on racial justice in American Buddhism.

Yup, and we have a thriving community of Alt-right Buddhists over on DW engaged, and some right here on our own forum. You know who you are, so I don't need to name names.

This is good, sure to provoke howls of outrage:

Joy Brennan, a fellow Buddhist scholar-practitioner, and I recently gave a collaborative workshop on "Collective Liberation: Theory and Practice," at Zen Mountain Monastery, which explored racial justice work from a Buddhist perspective. We identified whiteness as a manifestation of the demon Mara, the personification of the three poisons.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 2:18 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

The problem with letting things be as they are and caveat emptor is that abusers and their enablers hide their abuse until it's often too late. We cannot continue to put all the responsibility on students. Dharma organizations need to be proactive.

Malcolm wrote:

Many teachers, most I would hazard, do not belong to Dharma organizations.

Knotty Veneer said:

And sorry I no longer buy that striking anyone is a valid means of purifying their karma or pointing out the nature of mind. That's Tibetan BS based on mythical namthars and we should reject it without exception.

Malcolm wrote:

So you reject Patrul's own testimony with Do Khyentse? That is not mythical, not even slightly.

There is another lama, a famous Sakya lama by the name of Dezhung Ajam, who lived in the early part of the 20th century in Derge, a student of Adzom Drukpa. He reports a similar incident with a stonemason he met in Kham, again, personal testimony, not

myth. The incident was that there was this man who was building a wall on the side of the road. But as soon as the wall was built on one side of the road, he would tear it down stone by stone and build it on the other side. Dezhung Ajam got the idea that the man might be a practitioner of separation of samsara and nirvana, so he asked the man what he was doing, and the man struck him on the head with the stone he was carrying. Deshung Ajam reports that right there he had vivid experience of the nature of his mind, and even though he never knew the name of the mad stonemason, he always referred to this man as one of his root gurus.

And then of course there is my friend.

So according to you, this is all invalid.

Knotty Veneer said:

I can't see why a teacher cannot refuse to teach anyone he is in a relationship with.

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry, but that's ridiculous. So a person should refuse to teach a person they are in a long standing relationship with? A spouse for example? A life partner? Sorry, I have to repeat it, that's just ridiculous.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Is Ichinen Sanzen still valid with current knowledge of the Lotus Sutra?

Content:

Queequeg said:

The gist I get from questions like this is that fundamentalism is a loser's game.

Malcolm wrote:

Denying textual facts is kind of a fundamentalism, don't you think?

I mean we know that Kumarajiva's translation is not even completely his. It was augmented by others. Anyone after him could have added these ten items to his recension of the Lotus before it reached its present form.

It does not invalidate the whole Tendai strand of thinking, necessarily. It just undermines its canonical basis. But there is not reason to assume anyone was creating exegesis on this text in bad faith.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 2:33 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

What you get from buddhism depends a lot on what you want from Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, but we are not talking about Buddhism, we are talking about Buddhist studies, which is dominated by old white guys like me (cringe).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Ok. Some of it sounds good, other things sound more performative and reminded me of Rob Henderson talk about luxury beliefs:

Malcolm wrote:

I would say that Buddhism is very much a luxury belief system, which is why there are barriers to inclusion. Precious human birth and karma being two of the main barriers.

If there is a fault in these articles, they do not take this into account. They are treating Buddhism like it is an evangelistic religion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Is Ichinen Sanzen still valid with current knowledge of the Lotus Sutra?

Content:

Queequeg said:

As for those ten factors, they are such an important set of principles in Tiantai that they've received a lot attention. I've never read any suggestion that they were inserted by anyone other than Kumarajiva. Rather, as pointed out, they are found in the Dazhitulun, attributed to Nagarjuna and translated by Kumarajiva also, so its pretty certain this was Kumarajiva's doing.

Malcolm wrote:

I would vote for a margin note that migrated into the text. I see this all the time in my work with Tibetan texts.

Queequeg said:

What's the canon but the set of texts you assert is official? What is canonical? These are fuzzy subjects. Like I said, err too conservative and we might just be left with some aphorisms about the golden rule attributed to the Buddha.

Malcolm wrote:

I like the table strategy myself. Put all your scriptures on a table in a room. Lock the door (make sure you have the only key). Come back the next day to see which ones are on the floor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 3:08 AM

Title: Re: Is Ichinen Sanzen still valid with current knowledge of the Lotus Sutra?

Content:

Queequeg said:

LOL. I can't read that fast.

Malcolm wrote:

That's how the Christians did, at the council of Nicea. The ones still on the table were then considered canonical.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Anger is because of self grasping

Malcolm wrote:

Do tell...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Rupa

Content:

Arnoud said:

Don't want to speak for Malcolm but I think he translates Rupa as matter so that can't "exist" in the dream state. That's all mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends, but matter is for the material aggregate, which is made of the four elements; form on the other hand is the object of an eye consciousness. But since one is asleep, its all mental consciousness and objects, so not form either.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 3:54 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Yeah, I don't oppose the idea of de-colonization and de-orientalization of Buddhist studies and it would be good if sanghas were more mixed - especially with majority population and people with roots in buddhist countries.

Malcolm wrote:

Personally, I don't either. Its pretty boring reading paper after paper reading some white guy's opinions of other white guys opinions on some brown guy's composition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 6:26 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Of course not. This is critical race theory and its ilk.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm no, not in the least. But it also has nothing to do with the articles I posted. So why don't you keep it on topic and stop trolling the thread.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 6:27 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

What is white rage?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:36 AM

Title: Re: Is Ichinen Sanzen still valid with current knowledge of the Lotus Sutra?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That's how the Christians did, at the council of Nicea. The ones still on the table were then considered canonical.

ronnymarsh said:

That's not the subject of the topic, but the Christian canon has not been decided in

Nicaeaajjjjjjjjj

Malcolm wrote:

Voltaire's story is pretty good though.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:40 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Chestnuts are gone, extinct. They were the dominant hardwood species.

Genjo Conan said:

The American Chestnut isn't extinct, but it is critically endangered.

Malcolm wrote:

You are familiar with functional extinction, I am sure.

Genjo Conan said:

My mom grew up Pittsfield and East Lee; your neck of the woods, I think. The house she lived on in East Lee is on Chestnut Street, just up the hill from the Turnpike. There haven't been any chestnuts there in a long time.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, about 45 minutes and an hour and ten minutes west, respectively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:45 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

What about the black people who agreed, supported and voted for Donny Trumpet? Are they displaying white rage as well?

Malcolm wrote:

What about Jews who collaborated with Nazis in the Warsaw Ghetto, and the French in Vichy France, Blacks who collaborated with the Apartheid regime, etc? Who can understand the thinking of people who collaborate with their enemies, other than the

perception they will personally benefit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:52 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. And the alternative was putting an elderly, senile conservative...[/quote]

Well, joe isn't senile, and he did make a deal with Bernie. Joe also has more experience in the Federal gvt. Than any other president in American history. That may or not be an advantage, but it's undeniable.

Archie2009 said:

Democrats get to do nothing but vote conservatives into the WH, yet love labelling anyone who dissents alt-right. Even if they have voted for actual socialists and greens their entire life. Pretty funny, right?

Malcolm wrote:

It's a two party system. Not by design, but practically speaking that's how it has worked out. Voting for third parties is a wasted vote, but what does any of this have to with the topic, Archie?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

What about the black people who agreed, supported and voted for Donny Trumpet? Are they displaying white rage as well?

Malcolm wrote:

What about Jews who collaborated with Nazis in the Warsaw Ghetto, and the French in Vichy France, Blacks who collaborated with the Apartheid regime, etc? Who can understand the thinking of people who collaborate with their enemies, other than the perception they will personally benefit.

Svalaksana said:

But I really meant my question, because I'm trying to understand the concept. Are those black people displaying white rage as well?

Malcolm wrote:

This whole line of inquiry is off topic for the thread. I guess people just don't want to deal with the issues raised, which ironically confirms Ann Gleig's thesis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

But I really meant my question, because I'm trying to understand the concept. Are those black people displaying white rage as well?

Malcolm wrote:

This whole line of inquiry is off topic for the thread. I guess people just don't want to deal with the issues raised, which ironically confirms Ann Gleig's thesis.

Svalaksana said:

I don't see how, really. The concept is mentioned in the thread title, one would assume that an understanding of it would be relevant for engaging with the discussion. Can you please explain what white rage is more specifically, so that I or other users unacquainted with it may provide their input and further add to the development of the issue in here?

Malcolm wrote:

I suggest you read the articles. I think they frame the issue quite well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:24 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

positioning Buddhism alongside contemporary atheism is very frequently a social/cultural move, and not just a philosophical claim.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, no, I identified a couple of westerners philosophers, who I think bolster my point quite well.

The problem here is that you seem to believe that being an atheist entails adhering to logical positivism.

It fact, the essence of atheism is denying supernatural causation to explain natural phenomena. Like modern atheists we reject first cause, prime movers, and creators. Like modern atheists, we assert ethics should be grounded in rationality, rather than divine ordinances. As Candrakirti pointed out, the only difference between us and materialists is that we accept karma and rebirth. Otherwise, our points of view are more similar than they are different.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:26 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

Anyway, I didn't mean to stir political shit up in this thread, but it seems to be unavoidably headed in that direction, so I think I'll just excuse myself from further argument.

Malcolm wrote:

No, we are talking about is philosophical similarities between Buddhists and materialists which cause us to share a common atheistic outlook.

What I have observed, having been in the Dharma for 30 years, is that people with theistic tendencies fit uneasily into Buddhadharma, and tend to reify theism in their understanding of Buddhadharma. For example, I first studied Madhyamaka etc., with Malcolm David Eckle, who is an expert on Bhavaviveka. I was very surprised to learn he as a Christian, and as much as he admired Madhyamaka, he was relieved he was not a Buddhist. Or Paul Williams, who wrote a popular book on Mahayana, and after a long career as a Buddhist academic, converted to Catholicism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:35 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

I don't see how, really. The concept is mentioned in the thread title, one would assume that an understanding of it would be relevant for engaging with the discussion. Can you please explain what white rage is more specifically, so that I or other users unacquainted with it may provide their input and further add to the development of the issue in here?

Malcolm wrote:

I suggest you read the articles. I think they frame the issue quite well.

Svalaksana said:

Is it a fair categorization to say then that white rage is a reactionary ideological trend that seeks to undermine the social progress and justice among black communities and to limit or dispell the dialogue concerned with those subjects?

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, pretty much. We've already seen some stellar examples in this thread,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:44 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

In the '60s when Shenpen Hookam asked Trungpa what she should read to better understand Buddhism, he said "Meister Eckhart".

Malcolm wrote:

And we should trust Trungpa's judgement because...?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:18 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

In the '60s when Shenpen Hookam asked Trungpa what she should read to better understand Buddhism, he said "Meister Eckhart".

Malcolm wrote:

And we should trust Trungpa's judgement because...?

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Because at the time he was studying Comparative Religion at Oxford. And of course he was educated as a tulku.

Malcolm wrote:

I take it you are aware there is no record of Trungpa being enrolled at Oxford? That it is an unsubstantiated claim he made, just as he also falsely claimed be the supreme abbot of Zurmang.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:44 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

At least for me the backstory and justifications are not important. What matters is what happens at the empowerment and the following practices. Guhyagarbha has this long story about Rudra taking over the universe. It's not important that it be true. What's important is the meaning about karma. Guhyagarbha is pretty neat bc it explicitly says it was taught in Akansitha which in the commentary is inside one's body.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is the common theme in Nyingma tantras, for which Guhyagarbha is original template.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Simple fix. Actually practice Buddhism. You know... leave home. Go homeless. Wander in foreign lands. Be a foreigner. Be poor. Learn to negotiate your own otherness... It's humbling.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally the fix for Buddhist Studies is to practice Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:03 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

We used to have someone post here that knew him in those days. Too bad this didn't come up while he still participated. Maybe next time he checks in we can ask him about it.

Malcolm wrote:

There is actually no record of him being matriculated into Oxford, at any of its colleges. It does not mean he didn't attend some classes. It's would be like me saying I went to Harvard (did not matriculate) when in fact I just took some courses in a program I lost interest in matriculating into.

However, there is literally no record of Trungpa at Oxford.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:41 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And we should trust Trungpa's judgement because...?

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Because at the time he was studying Comparative Religion at Oxford. And of course he was educated as a tulku.

Those are some pretty impressive credentials.

nightbloom said:

In my view, his academic credentials are irrelevant - you should read Eckhart in light of the Vajrayana-Mahayana because there are genuine sympathies between the two,(

Malcolm wrote:

You mean to say Eckhardt talks about dependent origination? News to me.

nightbloom said:

People should read Eckhart and find out for themselves.

Malcolm wrote:

I have, there are no similarities.

Eckhardt is a theist. Mahayana in toto rejects Theism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:00 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You mean to say Eckhardt talks about dependent origination?

nightbloom said:

No. My point is that it's not important that he doesn't talk about dependent origination.

Malcolm wrote:

Dependent origination is the Buddha's central insight. If one is going to compare Buddhadharma with any other thought, it has to be in light of dependent origination. Any other comparisons are at best superficial and trivial.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:24 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Where are you getting your info?

Malcolm wrote:

Oxford. There is a pdf copy of a letter circulating from 2019, in which Oxford states it has no record of his enrollment or attendance at any of its colleges for the period of 1963-1967.

Further, the Spalding Trust Visiting Fellowship in Comparative Religion is at Cambridge, not Oxford. However, there could have been one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:38 AM

Title: Re: When did "recitation" of Sadhanas become the norm?

Content:

Pema Rigdzin said:

I'd hazard a guess that Malcolm's point about beginners turning to longer sadhanas is for people for whom the path of transformation is their main approach.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but Dzogchen practitioners can benefit by understanding these in detail and experientially too.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:30 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Dependent origination is the Buddha's central insight. If one is going to compare Buddhadharma with any other thought, it has to be in light of dependent origination. Any other comparisons are at best superficial and trivial.

nightbloom said:

I couldn't disagree more, and happily, I think I'm in the majority opinion in this regard.

Malcolm wrote:

Your be wrong, again. "Whoever sees dependent origination, see the Dharma. Whoever sees the Dharma, sees me."

And as usual you offer no reasonings, merely opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:40 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PeterC said:

If you don't realize that interdependent origination is the distinctive point of Buddhist philosophy then I'm afraid you need to go study the basics before you start offering opinions on the Dharma. You're not in any sort of majority on this one

nightbloom said:

To clarify, I'm not disagreeing that dependent origination is the heart of Buddhism. What I'm taking issue with is this part of the statement:

Malcolm wrote:

If one is going to compare Buddhadharma with any other thought, it has to be in light of dependent origination. Any other comparisons are at best superficial and trivial.

nightbloom said:

The soteriological impulse driving Buddhism, the experience of the 'unsatisfactory' nature of ordinary worldly experience, from the 4 noble truths onward, is not unique to Buddhism. Neither is the desire to share 'salvation' with others. Neither is its attempt to effect the total transformation of the practitioner via gnostic insight and discipline. Nor is the notion that "As it is without, so too is it within," and so on, or the emanationist flavor of tantric cosmology/physiology (so conspicuously overlapping with its Indian sibling traditions such as Shaivism, etc), or the alchemical logic of its ritual, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

All of these, in Buddhism, are articulated through dependent origination. Buddhist tantric cosmology? There isn't one. The cosmology of Buddhist tantras is just the same as sutra, barring Kalacakra, which offers some minor spins.

I suspect, as above, that you require atheists to be physicalists, but that's far too narrow a definition. For example, like Buddhism, Early Samkhya is also atheist.

nightbloom said:

None of those things...\*require\* shunyata.

Malcolm wrote:

Without shunyata, none of things work, that is, lead out of samsara. But it seems you are of a fan of perennialism. No wonder you are confused on the subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Politically I am really not sure that his claims are accurate. There are plenty of atheist dictatorships,

Malcolm wrote:

Stalinism just replaces God with the State. But in reality, they don't encourage free thinking, which is a hallmark of atheist thought, from Kapila, through the Buddha, right up through today.

MiphamFan said:

and I think a lot of these esoteric groups have always been more tolerant of political and religious diversity even in the West — quite a few of the American colonists, besides the Puritans, came from various Hermetic-influence, the products of the Radical Reformation rather than the Magisterial Reformation that came to dominate Europe.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh dear, the Freemasons, who were largely deists, which was a polite way of saying one was an atheist, back in the day.

MiphamFan said:

I am not saying that any religious group is pre-disposed to any kind of politics,

Malcolm wrote:

Theism shows a marked trend towards imperialism and oppression of others views, that stretches back millennia, and even Communism is an offspring of the Abrahamic religions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 7:50 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

And by the way, the "we" you're talking about isn't as united as you'd like to think. I'm happy to know many who feel other than you and would dismiss you as a bigot in this

conversation.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, people feel all kinds ways about all kinds of things, but we, unlike you, back, our assertions with Buddhist facts, not feelings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

My only qualm with the term "white rage" is the classification of "white", for this appears to single out a racial group as exclusively responsible for the behaviour and thought. In my mind this sounds divisive and not very correct, and I wonder if it would make more sense to classify it perhaps as "anti-black rage", "reactionary rage" or "retrograde rage".

Malcolm wrote:

“White” is pretty accurate, since whites in the US are suffering from demographic anxiety, and tend to react with rage at the concept that maybe, just maybe, we don’t deserve the privilege that white supremacy has deeded us.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:47 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

“White” is pretty accurate, since whites in the US are suffering from demographic anxiety, and tend to react with rage at the concept that maybe, just maybe, we don’t deserve the privilege that white supremacy has deeded us.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Perhaps not, but white or black, we all enjoy the same privilege of coffee, fruit, rice, and other “third world” products in the United States.

Malcolm wrote:

But we don't, actually. Ever heard of a food desert? Yes, they exist in white communities as well, but they overwhelmingly dominate the landscape of PoC, cities, etc.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Just as vegans can’t help but depend on meat-eaters in a society, Everybody in the

United States, like it or not, benefits from imperialism. That's the inconvenient truth of dependent origination.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people (white people) benefit more than others (black, brown) etc.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Yes, try to make the world a better place. But keep in mind, it takes having some privilege in order to do so. None of us has perfectly clean hands.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course, but in order to not waste privilege, one has to recognize one possesses it, no?

The point here of course, is that white men in Buddhist studies do not seem to recognize their privilege at all. And when questioned about, they become angry and defensive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

The reason why dependent origination is so pivotal to why Buddhist is essentially atheist, is because belief in a god or gods is, ultimately, a direct reflection of a belief in a self/soul/atman.

In short, if nothing can be found to contain a "self", then no "self" truly exists. And if no self truly exists, then no god is needed in order to create one.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but some people apparently are so freaked out by secular modernism, they react very badly to the word "atheist". Probably a symptom of having read too much Evola and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Can the five elements be considered metaphysics?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Read this recently from a Buddhist writer:

Vajrayana five element system: keep it or chuck it? For a contemporary presentation.

(It's amazing useful considering that its factual basis is just false, plus it's metaphysics and metaphysics is always Bad.)

Do you consider the claim that the five elements don't have a factual basis, and are metaphysics to be valid?

Malcolm wrote:

No, the five elements are a phenomenology of matter, and are described that way in Abhidharma through Vajrayāna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Of course, but in order to not waste privilege, one has to recognize one possesses it, no?

PadmaVonSamba said:

Actually, I don't think so. White left/progressives actively supported, and were involved in the civil rights movement for decades without any sense of self-guilt. But, admittedly, the keyword term was "addressing the needs of the under privileged". In other words, they didn't (and most white Americans still don't) see themselves as above the bar, even though they may recognize that others are below the bar.

Is there even such a concept as overprivileged?

I don't think so. Maybe there should be.

Malcolm wrote:

There is such a concept as "overprivileged."

As far as guilt goes, recognizing that one has privilege does not involve guilt at all. People who feel guilty for having it often then wish to dispel their feelings of guilt by negating the fact that they are privileged. Alternately, there are some who feel entitled to their privilege, and believe in their blessed, little hearts that they are better than other people.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Angry is one thing. Defensive is another.

Malcolm wrote:

Strange how often they go hand in glove.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Ice is melting on the North Pole

Content:

Aemilius said:

Seriously, if you can photograph the ice-sheet on Antarctica from space, you should be able to that on the North Pole also.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Arctic\\_sea\\_ice\\_decline](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Arctic_sea_ice_decline)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Which of Sheng Yen's Dharma Heirs recieved yinke?

Content:

Aemilius said:

If you only trust a formal Inka or transmission, it means that you do not trust your own mind, your own perception, your own mind's capacity to see and recognize enlightenment.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, it's done such a great job of recognizing "enlightenment," whatever that is, since beginningless samsara, who needs any help?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

However, it seems to me that some non-mainstream Abrahamic sects have more democratic views, e.g. Quakers, Mennonites etc.

Malcolm wrote:

The Quakers are interesting phenomena. Keeping track of these new religions in America though, gives me a headache.

MiphamFan said:

Also, I still feel that we have common ground with realist polytheists. Not sure it's in the Bodhicaryavatara or another text but there is at least one Indian Buddhist text that says that between realism and annihilationism, it's better to be a realist.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a statement in the Ratnavali where it is held that it is better to be an eternalist than an annihilationist (Of course, in the Yuktiṣaṣṭika, Nāgārjuna declares that having negated nonexistence, the source of faults, one must then reject existence). But this can be seen as defensive move on the part of Buddhists, because the actual works of Indian materialists have been erased from history. We have no Lokayati texts. What we

known of them comes from parodies and lampoons. But to be an ucchedavadin means really, to negate rebirth. But it does not mean one affirms powerful divinities as having any role at all one's liberation.

MiphamFan said:

From another PoV we are polytheists, we just don't have a supreme deity.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, we really are not. Polytheism attributes control of the world through various functions of external deities. We certainly give lip service to such concepts, but again, the Buddhist thought about such beings is much like that of Epicurean thought:

Lucretius presents Epicurus' chief achievement as the defeat of religio. Although this Latin word is correctly translated into English as 'religion', its literal meaning is 'binding down', and it therefore serves Lucretius as a term, not for all attitudes of reverence towards the divine, but for those which cow people's spirits, rather than, as he thinks such attitudes should, elevate them to a joyful state of tranquility.

.....

Either way, what is not in doubt is that the gods' role as moral ideals is paramount in the Epicurean system. And this is the function Lucretius too gives them, especially in the proems to books 1, 3, 5 and 6. The gods live a supremely tranquil life, never disquieted by either favour or anger towards us. By contemplating them as they truly are we can aspire to achieve that same blissful state within the confines of a human lifespan. But Lucretius adds another dimension to this theology: What Lucretius effectively asserts is that, on a Euhemeristic ranking, Epicurus is a far greater god than Ceres or Bacchus, held to have originally been the institutors of, respectively, agriculture and wine, and also a far greater god than the divinized Hercules. For Hercules rid the world merely of literal monsters like the Hydra, but it's not as if there aren't plenty of wild beasts left in the world to terrorize us today. Epicurus on the other hand has offered us real and permanent salvation from monsters, namely those truly frightful monsters that haunt our souls, such as insatiable desires, fears, and arrogance.

.....

Lucretius was both admired and imitated by writers of the early Roman empire, while in the eyes of Latin patristic authors like Lactantius he came to serve as the leading spokesman of the godless Epicurean philosophy. His poem subsequently survived in two outstanding 9th-century manuscripts (known as O and Q), which following the poem's rediscovery by the papal secretary Poggio Bracciolini in 1417 (for this fascinating story see Greenblatt 2011) became the basis of the Renaissance editions. It was through Lucretius, along with the Latin translation of Diogenes Laertius' Life of Epicurus, that Epicurean ideas entered the main philosophical (especially ethical) debates of the age. However, despite his extensive impact in literary and philosophical circles—he is, for example, among the writers most assiduously cited by Montaigne—Lucretius struggled for two centuries to shake off the pejorative label of 'atheist'.



<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/lucretius>

The impact of the Epicurean thought on the Enlightenment is much neglected.

As I have often mentioned, if I were to select a western philosophy to emulate, it would be that of Epicurus and Lucretius.

Here is another tidbit:

Epicurus rejected the conventional Greek view of the gods as anthropomorphic beings who walked the earth like ordinary people, fathered illegitimate offspring with mortals, and pursued personal feuds.[111] Instead, he taught that the gods are morally perfect, but detached and immobile beings who live in the remote regions of interstellar space.[112] In line with these teachings, Epicurus adamantly rejected the idea that deities were involved in human affairs in any way.[110][113] Epicurus maintained that the gods are so utterly perfect and removed from the world that they are incapable of listening to prayers or supplications or doing virtually anything aside from contemplating their own perfections.[112] In his Letter to Herodotus, he specifically denies that the gods have any control over natural phenomena, arguing that this would contradict their fundamental nature, which is perfect, because any kind of worldly involvement would tarnish their perfection.[113] He further warned that believing that the gods control natural phenomena would only mislead people into believing the superstitious view that the gods punish humans for wrongdoing, which only instills fear and prevents people from attaining ataraxia.[113]

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Epicurus>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Norwegian said:

I am not sure for how long you've been a student of Chögyal Namkhai Norbu, but it cannot have been for that long.

Malcolm wrote:

Matthias, Bob was there at the big bang. The first time ChNN ever came to the US.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

Looking at this made me realize there has been a lot of deep dives into some topics listed here. Reading it all has been very useful, but I would be curious to hear some more posts based on the original intention of the post, clearing up misconceptions/misunderstandings about Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, the number one misconception is that we have anything remotely in common with Theistic religions, other than valuing compassion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Facebook is bad

Content:

Toenail said:

What are good and sound reasonings for giving donwangs online?

Malcolm wrote:

They are based solely on visualizations, no substances are involved at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: What to do with Tsok alcohol

Content:

Toenail said:

Now with this tsok alcohol, I dont really want to drink it on other days, because of what I said before, but I also cannot throw it away, because it is tsok/holy or whatever.

Malcolm wrote:

You can disposed of it in a clean place.

Toenail said:

I also feel hesitant to give it to visitors, because they dont have Samaya. Sometimes I admit, for example with my superstitious polish friend who is not a buddhist, I offered her some saying it is blessed by the buddhas. I feel like she has some kind of superficial faith and she is respectful. But she is not a tantric practitioner. Any tips?

Malcolm wrote:

After a feast has been blessed as remainders, you can give the food to others. Many people do not understand that when the remainders are blessed, everything is now a remainder. But it is also no longer really consecrated for the feast.

Toenail said:

Happy dakini day by the way!

Malcolm wrote:

Happy Dakini Day to you too.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:00 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Svalaksana said:

My only qualm with the term "white rage" is the classification of "white", for this appears to single out a racial group as exclusively responsible for the behaviour and thought. In my mind this sounds divisive and not very correct, and I wonder if it would make more sense to classify it perhaps as "anti-black rage", "reactionary rage" or "retrograde rage".

Malcolm wrote:

"White" is pretty accurate, since whites in the US are suffering from demographic anxiety, and tend to react with rage at the concept that maybe, just maybe, we don't deserve the privilege that white supremacy has deeded us.

Zhen Li said:

Is it just demographics?

Malcolm wrote:

It is now.

Zhen Li said:

Was what happened to the indigenous Americans a result of demographic anxiety?

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, that was white supremacy in full force. That's what we have inherited.

Zhen Li said:

What American authors characterise as white rage is another term for tribalism. It is a manifestation of rage, and when coming from the dominant group, it is particularly threatening and ethically problematic. In this sense, white rage is a real thing and is an issue. But there's no gene for it.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, just as there is no "gene" for whiteness. Whiteness is a constructed identity. Why? Because people who formerly were not considered "white" (mostly Catholics) keep being moved up the "Caucasian" ladder. There is no white culture. Just as there is no Western Civilization. These are all myths of white supremacy.

Zhen Li said:

I think the latter scenario is more likely in Canada, but let's see.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, there is a lot of white rage in Canada, and it is increasing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:03 PM

Title: Re: What to do with Tsok alcohol

Content:

Toenail said:

You are saying also the remaining tsok on the table is now free for all, people outside the mandala etc? What about heretics? Should they still have faith or could we present it as ordinary food to them?

Malcolm wrote:

You can give it to a beggar in the street, you just present it as ordinary food, which, now the feast is over, it is again. Technically, according to Sapan you can even eat drink the serkyem and eat the protector offerings since this is HYT, but most people don't do that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:05 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Offerings to Dharmapalas, local guardians etc in sang and serkyem are basically what an anthropologist would call "do ut des" kinds of relationships no?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, Serkyems are just a Tibetan custom. Placating local entities is for the purpose of staving off problems. But these are aprotropaic relationships with other sentient beings, who are on the wheel of samsara, no different than paying taxes to the town, state, feds, to keep them off your back.

Dharmapālas like Mahākāla are manifestations of bodhisattvas on the stages. So they are included in our refuge. Making offerings to them increases our merit. Merit has the effect of preventing obstacles, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:17 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?f=48&t=8318&p=102251&hilit=advaita%20greg#p102251>

Malcolm wrote:

Now, again, I am not saying that if you practice Advaita you will become a buddha -- I honestly do not know. But I am saying that when you study these things, philosophically, at any rate, it is very hard to show the difference between Advaita and Madhyamaka. The main difference between them is that Hindus accept the Vedas as self-originated and Buddhists do not.

Right, because Shankara via Gaudapada, used Madhyamaka arguments to defeat his Hindu colleagues. So context.

But in Dzogchen we accept that Dzogchen tantras are self-originated, that they arise directly out of the sound of dharmatā. So, this is not really very different than what the Vedic scholars believe. For example, the Song of the Vajra is just the intrinsic sound of dharmatā, the state of realization of Samantabhadra and Samantabhadri in union.

Yes, from the point of view of mere words, not much different; from the point of view of meaning, very different.

Though Dzogchen tantras do take pains to differentiate themselves from Upanishadic doctrines of the atman, these very same ideas get used in Dzogchen in a very similar way -- which is why there is a rebuttal in Dzogchen tantras of certain ideas we find in the Upanishads so we don't run out and say "The Upanishads teach the same thing as Dzogchen".

Yes, Indian Tantras and Dzogchen tantras occupy a milieu that shares a myth space with nonBuddhists. But the ways in which these myths are employed are completely different from one another.

So we can find a lot of parallels in Dzogchen and non-Buddhist teachings.

Sure, we can find a lot of parallels in Buddhism and nonBuddhist teachings in general: they have śīla; we have śīla; they practice compassion, we practice compassion. They have a version of karma, we have a version of karma. This is all true, but what distinguishes us from them, is that we are insiders, our liberation comes from understanding our condition, and we reject external liberation of any kind. Of course, some will argue that the nondual Hindu traditions, and even Samkhya, is similar-- they also find their liberation inside, however, they are eternalists and reject dependent origination, so they do not really find their liberation inside.

The one main difference between Dzogchen and most non-Buddhist traditions is that in Dzogchen there is a definite rejection of creation by a creator. Even in Advaita, on a relative level, they accept Ishvara as a creator. So this is an important difference.

Don't beleive it when people say that Kun byed rgyal po is a Buddhist creator myth. It is not true. Kun byed gyal po refers to the mind. It does not mean Samantabhadra is a primordial creator deity or a kind of Buddhism theism. People who claim this like Alan Wallace and Eva Dargyay-Neumier are mistaken.

And here is the rub. We are atheists.

But as Chogyal Namkhai Norbu says, "God" can be understood as a symbol of one's primordial state. So we do not necessarily have to reject "God" if we are Dzogchen practitioners, if by "God" we mean our own primordial potentiality and the primordial

potentiality of everything.

And this so-called "god" aka basis [gzhi] is just a nonexistent mere appearance, that is, our primordial potentiality also has no real existence, which is stated over and over again in countless Dzogchen tantras.

For those whom emptiness is possible, everything is possible.

For those whom emptiness is not possible, nothing is possible.

-- Nāgārjuna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 1st, 2021 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is no white culture. Just as there is no Western Civilization. These are all myths of white supremacy.

PadmaVonSamba said:

A funny thing about that: if you tell a conservative that America is biased towards Christians, whites, they will deny it, but if you tell them that America should become more culturally diverse, they will say no, this is a country based on western culture.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 12:03 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but some people apparently are so freaked out by secular modernism, they react very badly to the word "atheist". Probably a symptom of having read too much Evola and so on.

nightbloom said:

No, I'm not a perennialist or a "Traditionalist" or any of those things, and in invoking the perspective of humanistic analysis (e.g. anthropology, etc), I don't think I sounded like one. It really should be uncontroversial to recognize that if alien scholars or whatever showed up, they would recognize that what's going on in the Christian monastery and what's going on in a Buddhist monastery are similar in important ways and quite distinct from what's going on out there in Dawkins-land.

Malcolm wrote:

If Aliens arrived from space, and saw Christians, Atheists, and Buddhists meeting in three large buildings, they would be unable to distinguish at all the difference between the three groups.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 12:11 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The identitarians, by which I mean far-right conservatives and alt-righters who call the kettle black, need to be dealt with before the actual ground-level racism and white supremacy in Buddhist studies can be dealt with.

Zhen Li said:

How do we deal with them? To win someone over, you have to allow them to see your point of view from their point of view. Do you continue to frame it in antagonistic terms or try to find a new way of approaching the matter?

Unlimited tolerance must lead to the disappearance of tolerance. If we extend unlimited tolerance even to those who are intolerant, if we are not prepared to defend a tolerant society against the onslaught of the intolerant, then the tolerant will be destroyed, and tolerance with them.—In this formulation, I do not imply, for instance, that we should always suppress the utterance of intolerant philosophies; as long as we can counter them by rational argument and keep them in check by public opinion, suppression would certainly be most unwise. But we should claim the right to suppress them if necessary even by force; for it may easily turn out that they are not prepared to meet us on the level of rational argument, but begin by denouncing all argument; they may forbid their followers to listen to rational argument, because it is deceptive, and teach them to answer arguments by the use of their fists or pistols. We should therefore claim, in the name of tolerance, the right not to tolerate the intolerant. We should claim that any movement preaching intolerance places itself outside the law and we should consider incitement to intolerance and persecution as criminal, in the same way as we should consider incitement to murder, or to kidnapping, or to the revival of the slave trade, as criminal.

Malcolm wrote:

-- Karl Popper

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

The real 'acid test,' for this entire discussion is whether you could even get a typical "atheist"

Malcolm wrote:  
Define "typical atheist" please?

nightbloom said:  
to talk or think about Buddha-nature to begin with (without even getting into the question of whether it possesses or lacks genuine existence).

Malcolm wrote:  
There are a lot of Zen people who are confirmed atheists who do not even believe in rebirth who happily talk about buddhanature.

nightbloom said:  
Because so much of all of this really has less to do with the existence or non existence of the deity, or with realism vs. nominalism than it does a kind of basic orientation toward the underlying problems & potential of human life. That is where all of this starts.

Malcolm wrote:  
There are all kinds of atheists interested in existential problems. It seems you utterly discount this.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 1:26 AM  
Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
There are all kinds of atheists interested in existential problems. It seems you utterly discount this.

nightbloom said:  
No, of course not. I'm not talking about Nietzsche here.

Malcolm wrote:  
I hope not, and he was not at all who I had in mind. But whatever.

nightbloom said:  
For this whole conversation, I've been trying to make the point that atheism has become almost unavoidably entangled in popular consciousness with an extremely crass materialism that forecloses on the possibility of anything we might describe as 'liberation' on the final level (and instead looks toward technology, for instance, to extend worldly existence and eliminate pain).

Malcolm wrote:  
I don't agree. And we are not talking about Joe Shmoe's opinion of atheism.

And materialism does not foreclose the possibility of liberation. It merely defines it



differently, just as Hindus, Christians, etc. define liberation differently we do. This is where looking at Epicurean thought is useful.

Materialists (and not all atheists are materialists) are looking to alleviate their existential anxieties in this life, before they die. The Secular Humanist movement is an example of materialist atheists who are not merely money-grubbing Walter Gecko types, or futurists, etc:

<https://secularhumanism.org/a-secular-humanist-declaration/>

Of course they do not accept rebirth, and so on. But I find this far more palatable than Christianity, or any other form of theism.

In short, I am happy to be a godless atheist, who also happens to accept rebirth and karma aka Buddhist. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: What to do with Tsok alcohol

Content:

Toenail said:

Is it Ok to eat/drink the guru plate/cup the next day

Malcolm wrote:

It's ok to eat/consume it on the same day. Five minutes after you are done.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Can the five elements be considered metaphysics?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

He's probably not very well known here. He's an Aro guy called David Chapman, I think he's mostly known in tech/science circles rather than traditional Buddhist ones.

Malcolm wrote:

He is very well known around here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Who today in the Dzogchen Community is so realized that they can challenge someone's claim that they have received permission in a dream from ChNN?

Malcolm wrote:

We are not going to challenge it, but it is unlikely we will believe it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

But e.g. animists, shamans, and many other folk religions (Chinese, Indian, Japanese, etc etc) which are labelled "polytheist" do pretty much the same thing in apotropaic relationships, no? It's unlikely that many of them have "creator deities" in the Abrahamic sense too. Polytheists don't necessarily grovel in front of deities too, they might sometimes "punish" deities by hitting their images or different things.

Malcolm wrote:

But we are not polytheists in this sense at all.

MiphamFan said:

So the Buddhist worldview is similar to them or at least has space for such relationships with sentient beings that we can't normally physically perceive.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddhist world view is only similar in that we have an expanded notion of what kinds of possibilities there are for sentient beings to take birth as. All these "gods" are for us just mundane sentient beings. Hence, we really are not polytheists, strictly speaking. We do make allowances for animist customs and so on, however, and always have from the time of the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 2:08 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

"Oh, you think this is because you're black? Why are you so obsessed with your race? The Buddha teaches us that human beings have no intrinsic natures like 'black' and

'white or 'oppressor' and 'oppressed.' Have you read the Dharmapada? It can help you get out of this kind of thinking."

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is a problem, and how women, Black people, etc., are routinely treated by white, hetero, male Buddhists who have no idea the privilege they possess. And no idea how easy it is to lose that privilege in their next life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Praying or making offerings to local deities, etc. has no soteriological purpose in Buddhism and in fact one breaks their refuge vows should one do so.

Malcolm wrote:

Sadhu sadhu.

Johnny Dangerous said:

That point really can't be overemphasized and exists from the Pali Canon on up "they go to shrines and forest for refuge, this is no secure refuge" etc...

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. Seems like some people here need a refresher on refuge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

Or to be more direct, even if we acknowledge the imperfect nature of translation, do you think that describing a bhikṣu as a "monk" metaphorically distorts the terrain badly?

Malcolm wrote:

Literally it means "beggar."

bhikṣu m. a beggar, mendicant, religious mñmendicant (esp. a Brahman in the fourth Aśrama or period of his life, when he subsists entirely on alms) Mn. MBh. &c. (cf. RTL. 55 n. 1); a Buddhist mendicant or monk Katha's. Lalit. (cf. MWB. 55); a partic.

The Tibetans translate the term as dge slong, the one dedicated to virtue, the one in whom virtue has arisen, depending on how the term slong ba is read.

It is not at all an accurate translation of bhikṣu. But it is what it is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 2:17 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Praying or making offerings to local deities, etc. has no soteriological purpose in Buddhism and in fact one breaks their refuge vows should one do so.

nightbloom said:

...I assume that you are distinguishing this from, for instance, offerings granted to yakshas or nagas and so on in the context of pacifying/enlisting obstructors.

Malcolm wrote:

He means that if you take any of these worldly beings as a refuge it breaks your refuge vows, not that one is prohibited from making offerings to them. Making offerings to them does not have any soteriological value, apart from whatever merit one gains from doing so. When we offer a gektor, for example, it is to banish sentient beings that would have a negative reaction to the Dharma and try to cause problems for the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I'll also add, controversially I'm sure, that the present anti-racist paradigm is very capitalist-friendly...

Malcolm wrote:

Market forces...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 3:48 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Unknown said:

That means deconstructing and disrupting what was the dominant narrative for a long time, which was the Founders' regime of natural rights. One of the institutional vehicles for it was the Civil Rights Act of 1964, which was meant to fulfill the promise of the Declaration of Independence for Black Americans coming out of segregation. But the courts and administrative agencies quickly turned against the color-blind, equal-opportunity vision of the founding

Malcolm wrote:

What a joke, did he somehow forget that Native people had no rights under the constitution and that slaves were counted as 3/5's of a person? What a douche.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 3:50 AM

Title: Re: Do you need initiation / transmission of the Longchen Nyingtik Ngondro?

Content:

Padmist said:

You can't just read WOMPT? Do you have to have an initiation/transmission for it?

Malcolm wrote:

its better of you have the transmission for the uncommon ngondro section. The common ngondro section is all sutra based.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 5:36 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Sherab Rigdrol said:

If anyone wants to buy me a copy of the Ati Treasury of Contemplation it would mean the world!!!

Malcolm wrote:

It's an SMS book.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

What is the God you believe in or reject?

Malcolm wrote:

Have you been reading the thread?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

KristenM said:

Religion, in particular Christianity, is virtually dying and close to nonexistent in America. Unlike Dharmawheel may portray it to be. The U.S. is a majority secular country, where people scoff at religion and churches are empty except for the occasional funeral or wedding.

Malcolm wrote:

You haven't been to Georgia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:19 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Powerful pretas, the kings of the pretas, are said to be as powerful as devas....

Malcolm wrote:

Both are just sentient beings on the wheel. You can become a deva too. Or a preta.

That's quite different than gods like the Olympic pantheon. The only god who really behaves like that in Buddhism is Papayin Mara, aka Kamadeva. And his actions are more on the deceiver end of things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

At this point, I would say that there's something of a "caste" of people who are overwhelmingly secular...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and I hope that population increases, because their influence is not broad enough. America is secular nation. The present motto was only installed in the 50's as part of the red scare.

This directly relates to the point. Once I was with relatives and the question of god came up. I said I don't believe in god, they replied, well you believe in the Buddha. As you can imagine, they had no idea who the Buddha actually was. Their expressions were priceless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Where is this Medicine Buddha mantra from?

Content:

Constructelf said:

In the Drikung Kagyu's Medicine Buddha sadhana The Drop of Ambrosia, the following mantra is given as the long mantra for recitation:

TADYATHA / GHUME GHUME / I MINI MINI / MATI MATI / SAPTA TATHAGATA / SAMADHYA  
/ DHISH THATE / A TE MATE PALE / PAPAM SHODHANI / SARVA PAPAM NASHAYA /  
MAMA BUDDHA / BUDDHOT TAME / UME KUME / BUDDHA KSHETRA / PARI SHODHANI  
/ DHAMENI DHAME / MERU MERU / MERU SHIKHARE / SARWA ANKALA / MRITYU NAWA  
RENI / BUDDHE SU BUDDHE BUDDHA DHISH THITE NARA KSHAN TUME / SARVA  
DEWA / SAME A SAME / SAMANVA HARAN TUME / SARWA BUDDHA BODHISATWA /  
SHAME SHAME / PRASHAMAN TUME / SARWA ITYUPA / DRAWA BHYA DHAYA / PURANI  
PURANI / PURA YAME / SARWA AHSHAYA / BEDURYA PRATI BHASE / SARVA PAPAM  
KSHYAYAM KARI SWAHA/

That specific sadhana is the only place I've seen this mantra used. I've never seen it referenced anywhere else, not in an article or teaching, nor in a practice text from outside the Drikung Kagyu school. In all other Medicine Buddha practices I've seen, the long mantra is this, or some variation of it:

OM NAMO BHAGAVATE BHAISHAJYE / GURU BAIDURYA / PRABHA RADJAYA /  
TATHAGATAYA / ARHATE SAMYAKSAM BUDDHAYA / TADYATHA / OM BHAISHAJYE  
BHAISHAJYE MAHA BHAISHAJYE [BHAISHAJYE ] / RAJA SAMUDGATE SVAHA

Does anybody know where the first mantra is from, and if it's specific to the Drikung Kagyu or if other traditions use it as well? Every other source I've seen so far uses the second mantra.

Malcolm wrote:

It's the long dharani from the sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

When the majority is Latino, how do you know they will share the liberal white attitude on race—or does it matter at that point?

Malcolm wrote:

They do already in Mexico,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Who says that white Buddhists are angry anyway? Isn't the issue that they (we) are complacent?

Zhen Li said:

Buddhism is, by nature, politically complacent.

Malcolm wrote:

You are dreaming. Buddhists is just as politically active as any other religion. Just look at Buddhist history. Come on...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

KristenM said:

Religion, in particular Christianity, is virtually dying and close to nonexistent in America. Unlike Dharmawheel may portray it to be. The U.S. is a majority secular country, where people scoff at religion and churches are empty except for the occasional funeral or wedding.

Malcolm wrote:

You haven't been to Georgia.

KristenM said:

Neither have you.

Malcolm wrote:

I was just there. Had dinner a great Vietnamese restaurant in Buckhead. There are churches everywhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:



MiphamFan said:

What do you think is so different from how they view their gods vs this definition?

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhism, devas, yakshas and pretas, and so on, are of importance only in as much as they don't cause problems for humans.

There is no penalty for not accepting them as real.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Archie2009 said:

People like Queequeg and Malcolm here are zealots trying to shut down anyone mentioning this.

Perhaps the best way to fight this nonsense is with ridicule?

Malcolm wrote:

Not zealots, just see things for what they are; unlike you, apparently. The Civil Rights movement did not end in 1965.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

KristenM said:

The rate of U.S. church membership has declined sharply in the past two decades after being relatively stable in the six decades before that. A sharp increase in the proportion of the population with no religious affiliation, a decline in church membership among those who do have a religious preference, and low levels of church membership among millennials are all contributing to the accelerating trend.

Malcolm wrote:

In GA thus is accounted for by influx of people from the North.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I'll give some examples that bother me. I see a Black San Francisco social justice activist working for the local government calling her Asian students house n\*\*\*\*\*s on Twitter without consequence.

Malcolm wrote:

Not cool.

Archie2009 said:

I see Black males beating elderly Asians to a pulp being blames on White Supremacy (huh?).

Malcolm wrote:

Whoever said that was an idiot.

Archie2009 said:

I hear nonsense repeated that White people have no culture.

Malcolm wrote:

In America? Completely true. Unless by "culture" you mean Hallmark Holidays, sports, strip malls, and Country Western.

Archie2009 said:

That all White people are born racist.

Malcolm wrote:

Idiotic.

Archie2009 said:

I see a need for revenge on the part of a lot of these activists.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, PoC have been pretty f\*\*cked over in America.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bruce%27s\\_Beach](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bruce%27s_Beach)

<https://mappingprejudice.umn.edu/what-are-covenants/>

It goes on and on.

Archie2009 said:

Defund the police actaully means abolish the police to the core of true believer activists.

Malcolm wrote:

Defund the police is facially dumb. It almost lost the Democrats the election. But what it actually means is stop having white majority police departments in black and latin majority communities.

Archie2009 said:

The current social justice movement is not a continuation of the Civil Rights movement from the 1960s.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, actually it is.

Archie2009 said:

They are ideologically incompatible.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. It just doesn't conform to your rosy picture of a color-blind society where everyone has equal opportunity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Then again, what does this have to do with buddhist studies and communities? The problem relates more to Orientalization and impact of colonialism on Asia/Asians(South, East, Southeast) in the US and Europe. This has little or nothing to do with black Americans, no?

Malcolm wrote:

Thanks for trying to keep it on topic. Archie's responses perfectly supports this: Twenty years later, the same white resistance is all too visible in Steve's Twitter tantrum about Buddhism and Whiteness, a response which, ironically, performs the very thing he was denying existed. Drawing on similar responses, I want to make visible a specific expression of whiteness—what African American historian Carol Anderson has identified as “white rage”—directed at scholars of and scholarship on religion and racial justice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

What are you talking about? Clearly you get your news from a discrete, reality challenged echo chamber.

Otherwise you'd know most of these people you are excited about are just bozos with megaphones but no real power - you'll notice with some exceptions, these people don't get elected. Their super power is actually limited to getting in your head and raising your blood pressure.

Malcolm wrote:

I got the impression old Arch is from England. Correct me if I am wrong, but his impressions do not derive from living here and seeing how things really are.

He is also someone who is certainly not Buddhist academy adjacent. He may not actually realize how dominated it is by old white guys. Every Buddhist studies program in America that I can think of is run by old white guys. Which is ironic, considering that in America, at any rate, women outnumber men in Buddhism by significant margin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

Ah. It's not just distorted... It's completely abstract!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, he does not seem to realize that CRT was something that emerged in law schools, and that it was noncontroversial until the right wing media decided to make it a controversy by inventing the story, entirely false, that it was being pushed on grade schoolers in all white communities.

In reality, the backlash over CRT is entirely the work of people in the White Identity movement. We know this, because they outed their goals quite publicly.

<https://www.newyorker.com/news/annals-of-inquiry/how-a-conservative-activist-invented-the-conflict-over-critical-race-theory>

Why is there backlash? For the same reason that in the 1930's schools in the US were forbidden to teach about economic inequality, etc. In reality, the backlash against CRT has resulted in censorship in American schools. Teachers, in many GOP controlled school districts, are no longer allowed to teach about the Civil Rights movement, and many other topics because it might make fragile white schoolchildren feel bad about

themselves. F\*\*cking snowflakes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Virgo said:

All this kind of thread does is create arguments between practitioners.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

That's ok.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PeterC said:

Have you ever wondered who organizes it? It's not the president or any politician, it's a christian lobbying group that has half the senate in their pocket.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, scary group. Illuminati. not really, but they wield enormous influence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 11:13 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Virgo said:

All this kind of thread does is create arguments between practitioners.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:

That's ok.

Virgo said:

But it can lead to resentment and cause others not to collaborate.

Virgo

Malcolm wrote:  
That's on them.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 11:15 PM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
We should give more focus on coming together, the dharma is unifying in and of itself.

Malcolm wrote:  
You need to study the history of Tibet. And Japan. And China.

This Shangri-la picture of Dharma is, as it has always been, a fantasy.

Why do you think there were eighteen schools? Because they could not get along even though they had the same teacher. So the Buddha said, "If you cannot get along, go your separate ways."

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, October 2nd, 2021 at 11:16 PM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
Yes that's Samsara as Dharma practitioners however we can work together for harmony we have that in our toolbox if we want it.

Queequeg said:  
Can't work out the harmony if we don't figure out who is playing the wrong note.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
That is neverending

Malcolm wrote:  
This is also

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 12:03 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Seems to me to be a lot of white people objecting to the idea that there is actually a problem:

While studying for my Divinity degree at Naropa University, a professor of mine asked me in Zen kōan fashion the question: “Does a Bodhisattva get Angry?” Now, why I, a Black man, was given this kōan is questionable, however, I would like to think in my respect for this teacher, that they were very aware of the potential for anger for a person of color in this society and not simply stereotyping me as another “angry Negro.”

I can’t remember my exact answer, but I am sure that it was a load of bull about experiencing anger vs. acting out of anger. I gave the common liberal religious response that I was expected to give, my assimilation was confirmed with a smile. However, that answer is misleading and a non-sequitur, klesha, by definition, takes over your mind, your well being, your identity and you can’t simply and dispassionately experience klesha, i.e., powerful emotions, such as, passion and aggression.

...

In a recent article posted by Noriyuki Ueda and published in Tricycle, His Holiness the Dalai Lama speaks about anger and his words seem to contradict those aforementioned words of the Buddha, and even His Holiness’ own words on anger. When speaking of anger and social injustice, His Holiness differentiates between an anger that is motivated by hatred and an anger that arises in response to injustice.

In response to the question of whether we can transform anger to something more acceptable like compassion, His Holiness explains that this second anger, anger in response to injustice, doesn’t go away so easily. He says “anger toward social injustice will remain until the goal is achieved. It has to remain.” I, for the life of me, cannot reconcile this with the words of the Buddha, the words of Shantideva in the Bodhicaryāvatāra, not even in my tantric wrathful-compassion practices.

<https://www.elephantjournal.com/2014/12/do-bodhisattvas-get-angry-a-response-to-to-the-killing-of-eric-garner/>

Personally, I am not angry, but I am concerned. And I think the Trump Presidency has exposed a vein of racism in this country that lay dormant. It's a vein that threatens our democracy. Not sure if you are from the US, but frankly, this is no time to be complacent. If what passes for democracy fails in the US, it will fail everywhere else.

Confronting that racism requires facing it directly, and exposing it where it is. But this makes white people uncomfortable, understandably, especially white buddhists, it seems. Well, good, it should make you uncomfortable. You need to feel uncomfortable.

It is necessary for you to feel uncomfortable. Because if you are not uncomfortable you are not paying attention, and your dharma is just pabulum to feed your egos.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Virgo said:

Again this has nothing to do with anybody here, nor with the specific content of this thread. I just feel this platform is not the best for me.

Malcolm wrote:

That's fine, but when the subject it brought up among white buddhists it is either crickets or "why can't we all just get along."

Sad.

People do not realize that casual and systematic racism in the White Buddhist community, including the Academy, in the US has real impacts on Black people interested in Buddhism. Ask my Black students. They will tell you this very clearly. The point of this thread is to expose this in the Buddhist Studies world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Toenail said:

...until future technology saves us.

Malcolm wrote:

If underlying economic conditions for said technology to emerge exists, which seems unlikely. It seems more likely that we will devote most of those resources to war, as is the case now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:



Zhen Li said:

Mind sharing? The problem presumably is that people don't know this side of the story because no one is telling it.

The focus is on white people, but unless they hear what the problems are and have them clearly laid out, they're not going to admit they exist.

Malcolm wrote:

This thread started out that way, but was immediately derailed by a white guy who has an attitude about CRT.

Zhen Li said:

In fact so much of this thread just reads as shaming, sometimes with aggressive speech, the refusal to admit racism, but not establishing what the crimes they're being accused of are.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if people would address the actual point of the thread...rather than freaking out over whether they are personally being accused being white supremacists, it might get somewhere.

But for some reason, white people feel so guilty about racism, they can never discuss it without feeling shame. Pity. I don't feel shame for being born a white person. I do feel that white people are sheltered from the effects of racism in this country. We did an enormously successful job of instituting apartheid in the US. It was not dismantled in 1963 and 1965. It still exists. It exists in all of our institutions and in our communities, including Buddhist communities. For example, I was at a teaching in Alameda CA. in 2019. Out of three hundred people, there were a few Chinese people, a few Tibetans, a few Latinos, two or three trans people, some gay people, but mostly whites, and not a single Black person. And this is in a place one mile from Oakland. Now I am not saying there are no Black people who use this temple. There may be. I don't live there. But in CA and elsewhere, most Tibetan Buddhist communities have almost no Black participation. Now, we can rationalize this with things like throwing karma, precious human birth, but that is in some sense bullshit. In my experience, Dharma communities are not welcoming to Black people, over all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

What is the Academy or a given sangha supposed to do though, some form of affirmative action, or? I gave the example earlier of groups of white Buddhists buying the right signs, or having committees etc. that are really just 'look we are not racist' backslapping.

Malcolm wrote:

I agree.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I genuinely don't know what insular white sangha should do about this problem. Then again, none of the people I practice with are racist or reactionaries, just liberals who mean well.

Malcolm wrote:

They should reach out, they should extend themselves. For example, I have one student and understanding that he was isolated, etc., I visited him personally, because I had communicated with him for many years and I had an opportunity to do so when I was in his part of the country. I am acquainted with his family. He was invited by other white teachers to visit them. But no one actually went to visit this person in their home, to see who they were. If you don't make people feel welcome, they will not show up.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

ismael said:

If you think that direct introduction meant an empowerment in the eyes of CNN, that means you didn't listen very often to his webcasts

Malcolm wrote:

It means you listened with your ears closed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

Whenever this discussion comes up, I am compelled to point out - SGI is the most racially diverse Buddhist community that I know of.

Malcolm wrote:

That is a fact, actually. The vast majority of Black Buddhists are Nichiren Buddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Personally I've always lived grown up in a multicultural area so I've never really felt white privilege.

Malcolm wrote:

You have it, just because you have not felt it, it is there and it is real.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Maybe there are privileges? In other ways I'm not privileged.

Malcolm wrote:

Privilege in this sense means never having to worry that if you are pulled over by the police, it will result in your unlawful death. It means not having to deal with racist Karens who call the police because you happen to be walking on a public street in your own neighborhood. There are so many ways in which, as a white person in America, or England for that matter, you are privileged. Waking up to your own privilege is the first step to helping black and brown people overcome the racism they experience daily and you experience, well, never.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

May all beings attain peace whomever they are for me it's not really a strong issue because of where I'm from.

Malcolm wrote:

You are dreaming.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Bodhicitta doesn't discriminate anyway and nor do I

Malcolm wrote:

You don't need to, people have already done it for you, and for centuries. That's part of what it means to recognize your privilege. Refusing to recognize your privilege means refusing to acknowledge the exploitation and suffering that allows you, a white person, to be a Buddhist, to have a precious human birth. You have freedom and endowments because you live in a place built on the suffering of others. You don't have to feel guilty, like you personally did something wrong, you just need to recognize it, and acknowledge that this is fact.

And as far as the subject of this thread goes, this brings us right back to the issue of

white rage in the Buddhist academy, and among Buddhists. We have already seen plenty of it in this thread. Accusations heaped against the scary "other" that wants to remind us that there are real disparities among people, and that they will not be resolved by pretending we have gone beyond racism in America, or for that matter, Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Yes I understand your point

The US was built on the destruction of the Native Indians and so on

Malcolm wrote:

As was Spain, Holland, England, and France, indeed all of Western Europe, one way or another, beginning with the Crusades.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Yes I understand your point

The US was built on the destruction of the Native Indians and so on

Malcolm wrote:

As was Spain, Holland, England, and France, indeed all of Western Europe, one way or another, beginning with the Crusades.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

I had a friend in my town who was British Moroccan he was bullied at school because of it.

He said it was so hard to be bullied about the colour of your skin

Malcolm wrote:

There, now you have begun to discover your privilege. Of the many things about which you may have possibly been bullied, which are legion amongst cruel school children, you were not bullied because you were brown.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Main thing I've been discriminated about is being a serious Buddhist in the West by other westerners who don't understand it

Malcolm wrote:

And that's only because you volunteered this information. Had you kept silent, people would have no cause to discriminate against you. But, did this discrimination extend to employment opportunities, etc.? Or were you socially ostracized? These distinctions are important. Being discriminated against because of conscious choices we have made sucks. Being discriminated against because of things we have no control over, like the color of our skin, disabilities, etc. well and truly sucks in ways that being discriminating against because we did not get into a club because we did not look fashionable enough to a doorman will never be.

You see, if you do not recognize a form of suffering, you cannot have compassion for the person experiencing it. This is why the discussion of privilege, etc., as well as the absurd lengths white conservatives (and some PoC too, like Dinesh Desouza, etc.) go to rail against the idea, as well as try to discredit things like CRT, etc. is important for Buddhists to acknowledge and engage. It exposes to us a level of suffering which we have been insulated from, because of structural disadvantages baked into our system, especially in America. Structural disadvantages such as the racial covenants in real estate, millions of which still exist in the language of many deeds to houses, especially in communities in the Midwest through California that were built after the WWI.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 2:29 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Yes and my friend being an activist to promote Arabic rights which I now understand better

Malcolm wrote:

Thank you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 3:25 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

I don't know what the situation is in America - but aren't most black americans christian (protestant)? See: <https://www.pewforum.org/religious-landscape-study/racial-and-ethnic-composition/>

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that but that is not likely to remain that way. Black church attendance is also declining in the US:

<https://www.christianitytoday.com/news/2021/february/black-church-african-american-christians-pew-survey.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

At this point it's almost looks like I'm saying "black people only like devotional practices" or something, Which is not true at all, and actually would reflect the exact bias that Malcolm was complaining about were I to believe it. I mean, no people are a monolith. I see approaches in other groups with similar makeup that just seem ..pandery, rather than effective.

Malcolm wrote:

Just to be clear, this is an issue in American and European Buddhism as a whole, not only Tibetan Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 4:22 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It is, but there is a legitimate cultural gulf to contend with, not only racism.

Malcolm wrote:

We traversed that gulf. No reason other people cannot, if shown genuine welcome. But people are clueless. Another Black student of mine complained to me recently about the casual racism he regularly experiences in other dharma groups he participates. I responded to him directly about his feelings, and clarified, that as a white guy, there

were things he was experiencing that I was not able to truly appreciate, having never experienced such things, but that I was glad he brought to my attention, and that he should not let such instances slide.

He said:

It's odd trying to understand karma as someone on the receiving end of racism.  
Imagine that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 5:57 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

DGA said:

debt

Malcolm wrote:

Interesting book:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Debt:\\_The\\_First\\_5000\\_Years](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Debt:_The_First_5000_Years)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 7:29 AM

Title: Re: Accumulated merit urgent

Content:

Bikkhu87 said:

Can some powerful being like Amida Buddha help me...

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Bikkhu87 said:

do I need to accumulate merit for myself?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 11:51 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

. It has changed some but I still see Christianity all over the place, and outside of liberal

enclaves, it still appears pretty "in your face" at times to me.

Malcolm wrote:

Where I live. Most of the churches have BLM signs, etc up., and most of the Christians seem to be "social" rather than devout Christians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 8:16 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PeterC said:

Now you're just being ridiculous. Atheists absolutely do not enjoy a position of disproportionate social influence. The Christians do. What is the representation of nominal Christians in Congress, or state houses, vs the professed representation in the general population? How does that compare to those professing other religions or no religion?

nightbloom said:

I didn't claim that Christians aren't still able to wield political power. Recent legislation in Texas proves that. But there are forms of power besides explicit political power. The secular "caste" I'm referring to overlaps heavily with what people sometimes called the "PMC" (professional managerial class), tends to be educated, concentrated in management, journalism, education, entertainment, the arts and so on. Tends to be wealthy, but not always... and ultimately, status and virtue/piety are often prized above raw wealth. It's largely, but not entirely, white. Tends to be "irreligious" (though I think politics substitute for religion in this case), if not outright hostile to religion. Leans (further and further) left.

It's not the sole power in our culture, but it's influential, despite its small size. It's not a perfect comparison, but I think it's better described as a kind of informal caste (with initiation largely conferred through education) rather than a class. In fact, I think that one could learn a lot about it by studying the history of caste in India. I'm thinking of the way brahmins historically held onto their power (which waxed and waned, of course) via their \*purity\* codes and control over knowledge.

I also suspect that the reason why this thread has been so heated is because many western Buddhists belong to this caste, share its attitudes, material concerns, and so on. Hard to leave behind one's conditioning entirely, but Buddhists should make an effort, in my opinion.

PeterC said:

More fact-free assertions.



Malcolm wrote:

Yup. Only a matter of time before George Soros gets invoked.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 8:34 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Also, white people, especially liberal white people who are inclined to be open to non-Abrahamic religions, have a guilt complex and feel like it is part of their practice of openness and cultural appreciation to be a member of a foreign group—especially that of an oppressed minority like Tibetans.

Malcolm wrote:

This is not a description of the white Americans who are Tibetan Buddhists, or Zen Buddhists, etc., that I recognize.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

When people here talk about "whiteness" in the US and mention specific cultural factors - in fact that chart that posted earlier is illustrative actually, they are mostly talking about a specific flavor and tendency of Anglo-Saxon protestant culture here.

Malcolm wrote:

A strong motivating factor for latinos and asians to join protestant evangelical churches is to associate with the privilege they perceive in white society.

Its different for Blacks, they have a strong and independent form of Christianity, which unsurprisingly, is very focused on social justice issues.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Anyway Cormac MacCarthy writes mainly about the West, which is IMO it's own thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on where you are in the West. The Northwest had a lot of white settlers who were refugees from the Confederacy, which is why, as you know, Oregon was founded as a White ethnostate—no Blacks allowed.

The Dust bowl folks mostly moved to SOCAL, where they became migrant workers until WWII, but actually, many of those Dust bowl people were also post-confederacy refugees.

Then you had folks like my mother's maternal great grandfather, who moved to North Dakota from Norway when he was 11, and became a very successful Norwegian cowboy in the latter half of the 19th century, after the Civil War.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

But everyone knows perfectly well that Buddhists in the U.S tend to come from a specific stratum of our society: often well-off, educated, white, left-leaning.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. We know. This is not the fact-free assertions to which Peter was referring. In my personal experience, left-leaning people (as opposed to radical leftists) are more open-minded and accepting of cultures differing from than their own. Education also has great deal to do with this—but not STEM education, rather humanities education—because people study things like literature, anthropology, philosophy, etc., tend to be more flexible thinkers. People educated in STEM programs are as likely to tack right as left, because STEM programs do not teach humanities. The great sadness I feel in the American educational system is the lack of comprehensive humanities education in grade 1-12 education. So many of our kids arrive in college barely able to read and write. They are good at filling in circles with graphite pencils though.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

But anyway, what did you take issue with above, in that case?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think midlevel, corporate managers wield much power, frankly. They are not brahmins in any sense at all.

They are just cogs in the corporate machine. They certainly do not wield anything like the power the bourgeoisie did in the mid-19th century.

Otherwise, managers are just paper pushers locked in a hell of endless meetings to schedule more meetings for projects that are always over-budget and never come in on time.

As for the Kochs, their dad was a founder of the John Birch Society—those people have been trying to dismantle the New Deal from day one, the pricks. Libertarians suck. Their doctrine goes right back to John Calhoun...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 9:37 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Actually it's still present in Tibetan Buddhism, termas are still being discovered and practitioners experience dag nangs.

Malcolm wrote:

And termas are not universally accepted, for example, most Gelukpas, Sakyapas of the Ngor tradition, and I would hazard, Jonangpas (since Taranatha took a dim view of termas) are skeptical of the terma tradition. Pure vision teachings are acceptable in these traditions, however, not entirely so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

Just be a kind human being. A supportive friend. Reach out to let people know they are cared about and appreciated.

PeterC said:

Discussions about race in any context seem always to degenerate into white people offering all sorts of opinions about non-white people. A lot of non-white people in the US experience obstacles that white americans don't really understand. They would do much better just to be welcoming, to listen and to be helpful, and not to overthink it.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is that there is a huge amount of effort to erase thus fact, by white people.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Just saw an ad on Facebook for an A. H. Almaas talk about Dzogchen:

<https://online.diamondapproach.org/a-h-almaas-lecture-series-dzogchen-understanding-garab-dorjes-three-vital-points-or-ahls5-fa21>

It doesn't mention it here, but the Facebook add said that he will talk about why "Norbu's" approach didn't really work in the west, and there's a great deal of misunderstanding in western students. He will apparently share how westerners can understand it more like Tibetans.

Anyone know the history here? I've heard of Almaas spoken about respectfully a few times in the DC, I thought I remembered hearing that he's a student of ChNN.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 3rd, 2021 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

. But how different is that from saying "all lives matter"?

Malcolm wrote:

If Black lives don't matter, then not all lives matter. Case in point Gabby Petitto, as opposed to the hundreds of black and native women murdered every year.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Tibetan Traditions and Being Vegan?

Content:

James84 said:

Is it possible to ordain in any of the Tibetan traditions and stay vegan? I have debated on posting this since I know the vegan/vegetarian topic can spark a lot of debate and controversy, but I can not find any information about it online so I wanted to ask here since many seem knowledgeable. Coming from the East Asian traditions I know it is possible there, but unsure on Tibetan traditions. Metta

Malcolm wrote:

Sure. There is no requirement to eat meat in Buddhism. However, in all schools you are not allowed to reject food which is donated to you. The exception to this are those

bhikshus who adopt the ten ascetic vows.

In East Asian traditions, monks are generally expected to be vegetarians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

But a good teacher should know when and how to break that egotism and pull the rug out from under you.

Malcolm wrote:

The best teachers let you break your own ego, then it never comes back.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Ordination in Tibetan Traditions and Being Vegan?

Content:

James84 said:

Is it possible to ordain in any of the Tibetan traditions and stay vegan? I have debated on posting this since I know the vegan/vegetarian topic can spark a lot of debate and controversy, but I can not find any information about it online so I wanted to ask here since many seem knowledgeable. Coming from the East Asian traditions I know it is possible there, but unsure on Tibetan traditions. Metta

Könchok Thrinley said:

Absolutely no problem. Here is a good bunch of resources.

<http://www.shabkar.org/vegetarianism/index.htm>

All I would only advise is to realise that dharma should be a priority not some dietary preference. I personally try to be vegan as much as possible, however when food with meat is offered I take it as it creates a link between me and the person and they are being generous in however small amount and since I am on the path (however badly and trust me I am very bad at this) sooner or later I will attain enlightenment hopefully (probably in billions of eons, but still that is something) and so I will be able to benefit them.

Also during tsok I take the meat if it is there as them the rules.

We have to realise that veganism is still seeing things through materialistic viewpoint. They care only about the animals current life not other lives. While dharma cares also about the future lives. So try to make connection with the animals, say mantras in front of them and most importantly do not create bad views of masters and disciples based

on what they eat or not eat.

Few months back I saw vegans bashing a theravada monk for saying when monks are allowed to eat food, citing one "quote" from Buddha and completely ignoring the rest. That is bad, he did nothing wrong just shared the teachings.

So yeah... to end my ramble. Ofc you can be vegan buddhist, there is a plenty of us. Also whatever I wrote is just my view. No need to take it too seriously.

James84 said:

Thank you for your reply. How would it work if a monk was vegan and the monastery was having tsok? I understand that if they were offered meat they would have to accept it, but not consume it themselves.

Malcolm wrote:

As long as you never become a practitioner of Highest Yoga Tantra, this will never be a problem and you will never have to participate in a tsok.

James84 said:

Although with meat being a part of tsok, how would that work for a monk trying to be vegan or vegetarian? Could they simply visualize themselves eating it, or must consumption of meat be taken during these rituals? If it is required that leads me to believe one could not be fully vegan and a Tibetan monastic.

Malcolm wrote:

You are generally required to just taste it, at minimum. Otherwise, it is a serious infraction. However, these days, Karma Kagyu monasteries are favoring meatless tsoks, even though I don't agree with this practice.

The best way to avoid this issue in Tantric teachings is to pursue only the lower tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

So, the question is, what is the reason why a Buddhist center which is open and welcoming to everyone would mostly/only attract people from a certain demographic?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, because they do not reach out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

We publicize our events where we can, use the Buddhanet email list for intra-sangha communication type stuff back in the days that we had in person retreats yearly, people put flyers at the college, etc. I feel like specific "outreach" events targeted to racial and other demographics get ethically dicey in all sorts of ways.

Malcolm wrote:

I see your point, since we do not, in general, evangelize. However, I believe there are many young people of color who are doubtless looking for an alternative in their spiritual life to theism. Both the young men I referred to earlier were involved with Vaishnavism prior to abandoning that and becoming interested in Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 9:31 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

"The term professional–managerial class (PMC) refers to a social class within capitalism that, by controlling production processes through superior management skills, is neither proletarian nor bourgeois. This group of middle class professionals is distinguished from other social classes by their training and education, typically business qualifications and university degrees,[1] with occupations including academics, teachers, social workers, engineers, managers, nurses, and middle-level administrators.[2] The professional–managerial class tends to have incomes above the average for their country.[3]"

...

Edit: this thread went off the rails a long time ago, and probably ought to be split off from the original one and moved somewhere else. I don't like the idea that people come here looking for information about Buddhism and discover that every thread devolves into a 5 page long political flame war.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this exactly who, I am talking about. All of them. They voted for Trump, in large numbers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 8:27 PM

Title: Re: Vajrasattva root text/tantra

Content:

Toenail said:

Always wondered about what the root tantra of Vajrasattva is. Where the mantra etc is first mentioned. Is it translated? Is there an empowerment for it?

Malcolm wrote:

Sarvatathagata-tattvasamgraha, the root tantra of yoga tantra. Originally, there was no separate empowerment for this deity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

.

The thing that changed in me was connected to developing bodhicitta from extremely slight to a little less slight. And I kind of realised that politics always = asura mentality. It is always about victory, and about vanquishing "those immoral" others. This can be coarse to the degree of actual violence, or extremely subtle, to degree of the merest thought of righteousness justifying moral-political superiority. If one retains this in the mindstream, one will part from bodhicitta.

Malcolm wrote:

The Asura mentality means being jealous of what others have and feeling cheated by them. The deva mentality means being proud of one's status and entitled to one's possessions, without caring for others.

The lesson of the destruction of the city Tripura for us is not that devas should overcome the asuras in a vicious class struggle, but rather, the devas should contribute to the welfare of the asuras because the trunk of the wishfulfilling tree grows through their land, so they have rights to its fruit also. Politics done right, like FDR, Johnson, etc, keep this in mind. Politics done wrong, the GOP since Hoover, ignore this to our collective peril.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 9:11 PM

Title: Re: Vajrasattva root text/tantra

Content:

Toenail said:

Always wondered about what the root tantra of Vajrasattva is. Where the mantra etc is first mentioned. Is it translated? Is there an empowerment for it?



Malcolm wrote:

Sarvatathagata-tattvasamgraha, the root tantra of yoga tantra. Originally, there was no separate empowerment for this deity.

Toenail said:

What does it say about the mantra?

Malcolm wrote:

It's used for purifying misdeeds and downfalls.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

If Catholicism with its Roman mysticism, unmolested by the Protestant revolution had encountered Japanese Mahayana, the conversations between Tendai acharyas and Catholic monks - if we could suspend the missionary impulses of the Catholics - might have been an interesting encounter between two catholic approaches that each entertained great intellectual flexibility and comparable mysticism.

Malcolm wrote:

We already have an example this. A Jesuit priest went to Tibet:

Mission to Tibet recounts the fascinating eighteenth-century journey of the Jesuit priest ippolito Desideri (1684 - 1733) to the Tibetan plateau. The italian missionary was most notably the first european to learn about Buddhism directly with Tibetan scholars and monks - and from a profound study of its primary texts. while there, Desideri was an eyewitness to some of the most tumultuous events in Tibet's history, of which he left us a vivid and dramatic account.

Desideri explores key Buddhist concepts including emptiness and rebirth, together with their philosophical and ethical implications, with startling detail and sophistication. This book also includes an introduction situating the work in the context of Desideri's life and the intellectual and religious milieu of eighteenth-century Catholicism.

And Jesuits were in Japan, but it seems Francis Xavier took no pains to learn about any form of Buddhism. And as you know, the Catholics attempted to purge Buddhism from Kyushu, beginning in 1562.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Well, the Bodhisattva is trying to save beings too.

Malcolm wrote:

Is that why there is so much white rage in Buddhist studies?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Title: Re: What are your thoughts on DMT and the entities people claim to encounter?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I listened this this interesting interview today with the author of "The Body Keeps the Score," Bessel Van Der Kolk. Among other alternative therapies, he talks about the benefits of MDMA in healing trauma and personal limitations.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/24/opinion/ezra-klein-podcast-van-der-kolk.html>

Malcolm wrote:

There is no doubt that these kinds of drugs, when used as MEDICINE, can be beneficial. It is when they are used for pure recreation, for example, in hot sweaty dance clubs, that things become more dicey, or as "therapy" by unscrupulous new agers who have no clue what they are doing:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Aemilius said:

And thus Paul Harris or anyone else would be completely, or at least to some extent, free from the grasp of limited, distorted, false, and materialistic view of history.

Malcolm wrote:

Modern historical method is not false, it is, as much as possible, empirical and evidence-based. It is limited in so far as the evidence that can be mustered is limited.

Assertions by the ancients that cannot be empirically verified or disproven are left aside as unproven— not false, not true, just unverified. Things like the geocentrism, etc., which are demonstrably false, given the evidence, of course ought to be left in the

dustbin of mistaken notions. Axial mountain myths are understandable and inspiring, but in the end they are just myths.

Also ancient scholars weren't dummies. For example, Sakya Pandita shows, based on textual sources, namely the Mahābharata, that identifying Kailash as Mt. Meru is impossible. Ancient scholars too had their empirical standards of evidence, especially ancient Buddhist scholars. The thing about empirical knowledge is that it changes with the evidence, as it should.

When one is writing history, one must adhere to what can be empirically shown with evidence. Otherwise, it is not history at all. It is just opinion and conjecture. The very real inability to distinguish between opinion and conjecture on the one hand, and evidence on the other, is one of the great failings of the modern educational system, which has largely abandoned rationality in favor of technology. Some of the stupidest, most gullible people I have ever met are really good at math, engineering, and applied science. But when it comes to anything else, dumb as rocks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 10:53 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

If Catholicism with its Roman mysticism, unmolested by the Protestant revolution had encountered Japanese Mahayana, the conversations between Tendai acharyas and Catholic monks - if we could suspend the missionary impulses of the Catholics - might have been an interesting encounter between two catholic approaches that each entertained great intellectual flexibility and comparable mysticism.

Malcolm wrote:

We already have an example this. A Jesuit priest went to Tibet:

Mission to Tibet recounts the fascinating eighteenth-century journey of the Jesuit priest ippolito Desideri (1684 - 1733) to the Tibetan plateau. The italian missionary was most notably the first european to learn about Buddhism directly with Tibetan schol ars and monks - and from a profound study of its primary texts. while there, Desideri was an eyewitness to some of the most tumultuous events in Tibet's history, of which he left us a vivid and dramatic account.

Desideri explores key Buddhist concepts including emptiness and rebirth, together with their philosophical and ethical implications, with startling detail and sophistication. This book also includes an introduction situating the work in the context of Desideri's life and the intellectual and religious milieu of eighteenth-century Catholicism.

And Jesuits were in Japan, but it seems Francis Xavier took no pains to learn about any form of Buddhism. And as you know, the Catholics attempted to purge Buddhism from Kyushu, beginning in 1562.

Queequeg said:

I wonder if things would have been different if the Jesuits had arrived in Japan by themselves without armed trade missions? I'm guessing the isolation of Tibet limited the efforts of Europeans to open direct trade, and so Jesuits like Desideri showed up pretty much on their own and were forced to navigate individually, whereas the Jesuits in Japan came with some imperial power that maybe enabled their missionary arrogance and closed their mind to more open engagement, and conversely, got them greater suspicion from the samurai who would see them not as relatively harmless nerds but rather the apparatus of those greedy traders with dreams of colonization.

Malcolm wrote:

It as not all roses:

However, it would appear that about the time that Gioachino reached Rome, persecution of the Capuchins broke out in Lhasa. The jealous Tibetan monastic community viewed the open patronage of the missionaries by Polhanas and other highly placed secular officials with increasingly intolerable disfavor. The tension increased until one day in May 1742 when several hundred furious Gelugpa lamas invaded the royal palace and upbraided Polhanas for his partiality. The Tibetan ruler, terrified of meeting the same fate as his unfortunate predecessors, immediately declared that the Capuchin priests had fallen from his favor. The frightened king of Tibet also forbade the missionaries from preaching Christianity in the country, except to outside traders. The Tibetan government further ordered that local converts be hunted down, placed in Chinese wooden collars (cangue), and flogged. Tremendously frustrated by this turn of events, the Capuchin fathers began to realize that the time had arrived for them to abandon their work. A momentary compromise was reached between the Capuchins and the Lhasa authorities when Polhanas reluctantly allowed the priests to preach only on condition that they should declare Tibetan Buddhism to abound in goodness and perfection. The friars lingered on in Lhasa for another two and a half years until April 1745 when the valiant Father Orazio della Penna finally acknowledged himself beaten, and resolved to abandon the mission.

<https://www.usfca.edu/sites/default/files/pdfs/report-36-dec-2004.pdf>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I am suggesting that the dichotomy between literalism and symbolism is not manifest in

premodern Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

The distinction between literalism and symbolism is an extremely important part of Vajrayāna exegesis, especially in the tantras.

But we see it in the sūtras too, where we find the Buddha exhorting people to kill, steal, etc.

So, I think you cannot make argument you are proposing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 4th, 2021 at 11:46 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

On Nagarjuna's part, when you read his major works, you realize that his entire foundation is only the Agamas, particularly those of the Sarvastivada school.

Malcolm wrote:

No. His foundation was Mahāyāna, which is made clear in the Ratnavali.

In the MMK and its branches, he criticized views found in all the śrāvaka schools. Āryadeva was himself also clearly a Mahāyānī.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 12:10 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

However, the truth is, many of us prefer to practice the religion how it was historically practiced, disconnected from Western ("white") interpretations that use Buddhism as an insipid front to advance certain Western sociopolitical opinions.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a fantasy. There is no way you can practice Buddhadharma in a hermetically sealed environment that ignores where you are.

Heimdall said:

The narrative of "majority" identity groups oppressing "minority" identity groups and the

oppressed identity groups, by virtue of being oppressed, have morally correction sociopolitical opinions, is a Western theory that has nothing to do with Buddhism, and to the extent that it's affected Asian Buddhism, that's by virtue of Western corruption.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as an ideal-type, pure Asian Buddhism. Demonstrably, Buddhism has been affected by ideas from the west nearly from its inception, for example, the adoption by the Bactrian branch of Sarvāstivādin school of Aristotle's four causes, as well as Greek atomism, etc.

What is new, for Buddhism to deal with in the West is the West's history of imperialism, genocide, and slavery, and how this has negatively impacted people of non-European ancestry, for example, the near-extinction of Buddhism in Śrī Lanka under the British, the purge of Buddhism in Japan, following nationalist and modernist impulses when Japan was engaged in a process of assimilation to modern capitalism, and so on. This continues as westerners of European descent— blind to their economic privilege which they received as the inheritors 500+ years of Western imperialist expansion and oppression—adopt Buddhism without seeing that their privilege, when it goes unrecognized, can serve to limit the participation of people of non-European descent in Buddhist teaching and practice in the United States, Canada, England, France, Germany, and so on, including people of descent from Buddhist countries.

For example, when I was in China, many Tibetans were quite jealous of the amount of teachings I had received, and I experienced the same comments from monks from India. White people in America and Europe are given special privileges and access to teachings often unobtainable for common, average Tibetans.

Heimdall said:

By the way, if "whiteness" was such a problem that we should dismiss social opinions by virtue of genetics, we should disavow Buddhism altogether, considering the Buddha, according to the 32 marks, had blue eyes.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many people who have blue eyes who are not "white." "Blue eyeness" is a recessive gene, which has only existed in human populations for 6,000 to 10,000 years or so.

Of course, we do have to keep in mind that people with blond hair were forbidden to ordain as monks at one time. So there is that.

But you seem to think this is about dismissing social opinions on the basis of genetics. By your statement, I can see you spent absolutely no time with the articles cited. So, react away, since that what reactionaries do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 12:16 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

These questions of adaptation were a matter of intense debate in the 13th century when Sakya Pandita cautioned his fellow Tibetans, "Since there is nobody in the three realms wiser than the Buddha, one should not adulterate the sutras and tantras that he taught. To do so is to abandon the doctrine and disparage the Noble Ones."

Malcolm wrote:

People who quote Sakya Pandita need to be careful, lest they be hoisted on their own petard.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That's a fantasy. There is no way you can practice Buddhadharma in a hermetically sealed environment that ignores where you are.

Heimdall said:

Cool, so why are you claiming that those who are different than you, and come from a different environment than you, are morally inferior by virtue of Buddhadharma? If not by Buddhadharma, then what's your intent posting this on a Buddhist forum.

Malcolm wrote:

Non sequitur—please show me where I made such a claim.

Heimdall said:

A "Cultural" Hegelian dialectic is not one of those features, and to shun Western corruption of Buddhism while using Western ideas disguised as Buddhism is hilarious,

Malcolm wrote:

Non sequitur—please me where I once invoked Hegel or Marx.

Heimdall said:

See my other post, don't think Buddhist countries aren't without bloodshed. There's a reason why Koreans hate Japan.

Malcolm wrote:

Non sequitur—please show me where I implied that Buddhist countries are free from wars and bloodshed.

Heimdall said:

Yes, because the grouping of an entire group of people by virtue of their skin pigmentation, and then using that grouping to draw socio-political moral truths, is absolutely stupid.

Malcolm wrote:

Non sequitur—please show me where I made that claim.

Heimdall said:

I agree that Westerners should not be re-interpreting Buddhism through Western eyes, including Judeo-Christian (especially American Protestant, "Protestant Work Ethic") normative behavior, but those who subscribe to Liberal sociopolitical should realize they stand in glass houses.

Malcolm wrote:

Non sequitur—please show me where I advocated interpreting Buddhism through a western lens.

Heimdall said:

Their own interpretation of the world is purely Western, so who are you to stone Angulimala?

Malcolm wrote:

Your responses consists of nothing but non sequiturs. What are you so mad about? Try reading the articles rather than behaving like another defensive white guy whose privilege is being questioned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

So I can reassure he did take care when quoting Sakya Pandita.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, he really didn't. I am Loppon Kunga Namdrol, also of the Sakya school. HH Sakya Trichen is one of my main teachers too, from whom I have received all the main teachings of the Sakya school. I have also received the transmission for Sapan's Three Vows, so I am intimately familiar with its contents. Sapan did not approve of termas, which Jampa Thaye practices (Konchog Chidu). Hence, hoisted in his own petard.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:11 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship



Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Is that why there is so much white rage in Buddhist studies?

PadmaVonSamba said:

Is there!??

nightbloom said:

No. "White rage" is an abusive rhetorical weapon

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty clear you did not read the articles as well. Sigh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

For example, this:

Malcolm wrote:

What are you so mad about? Try reading the articles rather than behaving like another defensive white guy who privilege is being questioned.

nightbloom said:

The point is to represent your opponent as a hysterical cry-baby, while indicating that one has risen above such crude defensiveness and attachment to privilege oneself. It's manipulative and underhanded.

Malcolm wrote:

More reaction rather than addressing the issue. It's amazing how accurate Ann Glieg is on this subject. White guys get questioned on their privilege, they react defensively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

This tends to look like a specific set of things when we're talking about upper-middle class whites, and especially upper-middle class white liberals (who dominate Buddhist

Studies).

Malcolm wrote:

That is why is so ironic that they, upper middle-class, liberal, white men are the ones who are the most reactive to this point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

I'll throw the "non sequitur" back at you because this isn't me refuting a claim you made. I simply said that it's highly probable that your purpose here was to morally shun by virtue of Buddhadharma, otherwise you wouldn't have posted it here.

Malcolm wrote:

No, my purpose was that I thought Ann Gleig's experience with white men in Buddhist studies was interesting, and that it should be shared.

Heimdall said:

Non sequitur—please me where I once invoked Hegel or Marx.

Any time you use contemporary Liberal Western socio-political models that posit one identity group "systemically oppressing" another by virtue of identity alone and the amorphous "social structures" in place, you necessarily imply Marx and Hegel because that "class binary" of "oppressor" and "oppressed" is simply the Marxist dialectical structure except the "classes" are swapped with identity groups.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, ever hear of racial covenants? Black slaves being counted as 3/5ths of a person for electoral demographics. The 1830 Indian Relocation Act? Apartheid?

Heimdall said:

Non sequitur—please show me where I implied that Buddhist countries are free from wars and bloodshed.

Again, throwing the non sequitur back at you, because that wasn't my claim. My claim was that you can apply this same dialectical structure to Buddhist countries imposing religion and oppressing minority groups too, albeit to a lesser extent than the Catholic and Protestant West.

Malcolm wrote:

Your comment remains a non sequitur. And, the notion that one class might oppress another certainly did not begin with Marx, or Hegel. The Buddha was quite concerned about it as well, which is why he rejected varna, the idea that birth made you a better person.

Heimdall said:

Non sequitur—please show me where I made that claim.

In your original post and in this post, where you claim the problem of "angry whiteness" and that I'm a "defensive white guy". You are necessarily rooting moral aptitude and political opinions in identity. You don't know anything about me, much less that I am an "angry white guy", yet you are presuming so because you necessarily connect moral aptitude and political opinions with identity.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually I don't claim the problem of angry whiteness. I posted an article about a women in academia's real world experience with angry white guys, who sound an awful lot like you. It'ss both funny and sad. I think that amounts to tragedy.

Heimdall said:

Non sequitur—please show me where I advocated interpreting Buddhism through a western lens.

By advocating for an interpretation of Buddhism through Western Liberal socio-political ideology, you are necessarily doing so, whether you claim otherwise.

Malcolm wrote:

But I wasn't, which is why your responses are so hilariously off the mark. I was talking about a WESTERN ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE called BUDDHIST STUDIES which often has nothing to do with Buddhism at all. But please, continue on your quixotic campaign.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

The ones in the OP? No, I didn't, I admit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Heh, I can agree with his general tone here but it is a funny quote to use when someone is practicing an "innovation" of sorts I.e. Terma. Maybe he just wrote it with his Sakya hat on.

Malcolm wrote:

No, since he cites Padmasambhava in the end. For early Sakyapas like Sapan, Padmasambhava was an important imperial period figure, but he and others in his milieu were very resistant to the nascent mythopoeia about Padmsambhava by Nyangral, Guru Chowang, and others in the late 12th and the 13th century Nyingma scene connected with the burgeoning treasure tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

The ones in the OP? No, I didn't, I admit.

I skimmed them. I thought the second one had some substance, though I agree with Heimdall that the framing reflects an ideological orientation that has many serious problems. It's unfortunate, because what's legitimate in the critique will ultimately be dragged down with the political movement that currently monopolizes discussion of these topics.

Malcolm wrote:

Another fact free assertion.

nightbloom said:

The first article, on the other hand, was terrible, and a good example of what I described in my above post. Someone expressed contempt for the author's ideas - she took this as proof that her ideas are valid and any poor reception of them reflects pathological defensiveness.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty clear you did not read the article carefully.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:22 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Anyway, the point I'm trying to make here is that your mockery of Heimdall...

Malcolm wrote:  
I did not mock anyone.

nightbloom said:  
and your treatment of his remarks as indicative of a psychological affliction, rather than a viewpoint rooted in his own observations, is abusive and illustrates exactly how this kind of political rhetoric gets weaponized in personal disputes.

Malcolm wrote:  
Sorry, but his response was a series of complete and total quixotic non sequiturs. But go ahead and ride to his rescue, Sancho Panza...which brings to mind the fact that the Cervantes novel was set right after the expulsion of the Moriscos, the Moors, for well, their identity. By whom? By a bunch of racist, xenophobic white guys:

<https://www.jstor.org/stable/2953315>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:28 AM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:  
Genjo Conan said:  
They're just "oh noes SJWs in Buddhism."

nightbloom said:  
Why does thinking/saying "oh noes SJWs in Buddhism" necessarily reflect "white rage" and not, for instance, simply an observation that the ideological framework of her argument is faulty and harmful? I don't understand why scorn for her argument is different from scorn for any other argument that the scorner thinks is bad.

Malcolm wrote:  
You did not address any substantive part of her post. You and our friend Heimdall have committed at last these two fallacies: hasty generalization and genetic fallacy.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:30 AM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:  
nightbloom said:  
Her article is basically "people on twitter rejected my critique of their cultural niche and made fun of me." It reeks of narcissism.

Malcolm wrote:  
Let's add to that fallacies in which you have indulged: the ad hominem.

nightbloom said:

But this is a bad critique embedded in a very specific ideological paradigm.

Malcolm wrote:

Two points you have failed to demonstrate. So again, more fact free opinions from nightbloom.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Why does thinking/saying "oh noes SJWs in Buddhism" necessarily reflect "white rage" and not, for instance, simply an observation that the ideological framework of her argument is faulty and harmful? I don't understand why scorn for her argument is different from scorn for any other argument that the scorner thinks is bad.

Malcolm wrote:

You did not address any substantive part of her post. You and our friend Heimdall have committed at last these two fallacies: hasty generalization and genetic fallacy.

nightbloom said:

Which part(s) did you think was most substantive? If I've been unfair, I'll do it justice.

Malcolm wrote:

Try reading it again. Genjo Conan already gave you a hint.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Thus today we see many attempts to "address" various oppressions within the context of capitalism, leaving capitalism intact as the dominant mode of social relations. E.G, "we need more black CEOs," corporate inclusivity, a whole industry of activists selling books and seminars and so on.

Malcolm wrote:

As long as we have capitalism (for the long term), yes, we need to have more black ceo's,

inclusivity, and so on. That requires no thought at all. We live in a capitalist world, for the time being, and so we have to deal with these issues in the context of capitalism. In what other context can we deal with them?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Norwegian said:

Care to share with us the names of the leftists who are guilty as charged, as you accuse them, and mention which texts they wrote related to this? Especially since you say "so much of 21st century leftism", as that comes across as a rather serious and significant amount. There must be a lot, so names and titles would be helpful.

nightbloom said:

I tried to respond to this a moment ago, and it got lost in the void. Anyway, no, I'm not going to give you an annotated bibliography on the subject. But see Johnny's post above - it's true that the old class-based Marxist orthodoxy gave way to a much broader critique of power (with its own strengths, but also many weaknesses). And what has happened, in the long run, is that capitalism has in some sense "recuperated" all of these hazier criticisms. Thus today we see many attempts to "address" various oppressions within the context of capitalism, leaving capitalism intact as the dominant mode of social relations. E.G, "we need more black CEOs," corporate inclusivity, a whole industry of activists selling books and seminars and so on.

Norwegian said:

OK got it. No names, no nothing, just vague generalizations and accusations.

Malcolm wrote:

The technical term was coined by Peter C: "fact free opinions."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:11 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, he really didn't.....Sapan did not approve of termas, which Jampa Thaye practices (Konchog Chidu). Hence, hoisted in his own petard.

Dharmasherab said:

So this is based on the disagreement between whether termas are approved or not? Is it? How does that change one's understanding? In this instance what is your understanding

of what Sakya Pandita mentioned?

\*HH Sakya Trichen is my main teacher in Vajrayana (I am new to Vajrayana and joined in 2016).

Malcolm wrote:

Well, I have been around in 1989.

My point was and is, one needs to be careful in invoking Sapan when complaining about "progress," if you yourself are engaged in practices which Sapan scoffed at—in Jampa Thaye's case, both Kagyu Mahāmudra and the terma tradition. Trying to position yourself as a Buddhist conservative using Sapan as an authority when yourself engage in practices of which Sapan plainly rejected, well, a little inept. Otherwise, I am sure Jampa Thaye is a nice fellow. I never met him.

Dharmasherab said:

In this instance what is your understanding of what Sakya Pandita mentioned?

Malcolm wrote:

One should rely on a doctrine taught by the Buddhas, realized by mahasiddhas, commented upon by panditas, and translated by the lotsawas. That's it. All of Thaye's other remarks are just so much conservative whinging that have nothing to with Buddhadharma. I mean, what are we to make of Aśoka murdering 18,000 Jains over a satirical cartoon? Continue to revere him as the ideal Dharmarāja? Come on.

This, "The rejection of progress as incompatible with the very nature of dharma..." is a ridiculous assertion, as ridiculous as those people whom Salya Pandita chided for rejecting medicine because some people imagine, foolishly, that accepting medicine to cure illness means one has no faith in Dharma.

He directly contradicts himself in the very next passage:

The Mahayana notion of universal enlightenment should not, however, be misunderstood as a claim that progress toward Buddhahood is somehow structured into the very nature of the world, and that we are always reaching ever closer to it. Instead, its sense is that all beings will obtain enlightenment because they are primordially pervaded by buddhanature, the true nature of reality itself.

If the true nature of reality is buddhanature (it isn't, only sentient beings have buddhanature, not rocks and trees) then progress towards buddhahood is structured into the nature of the world.

This is also poorly written, "Buddhism offers a contrary idea of history. It teaches us that history, as the manifestation of samsara, is essentially cyclical in nature." Buddhism does not teach anything at all about history. History is a modern, empirically-based discipline, which did not exist in the time of the Buddha. At best, during the time of the



Buddha, there was only "Itihasa," that is, just so stories.

The funny thing, he could be criticizing the right wing author, Francis Fukuyama here, "The notion of inevitable progress has been so tenacious that today's dominant liberal and Marxist ideologies, which have in one way or another sought to replace Christianity, have swallowed its historical narrative without demur. They have merely recast it in terms of an inevitable social and intellectual progress culminating in the end of history itself." Of course, Fukuyama retreated from his neoconservative ideals in the wake of the Iraq war:

<https://www.spiegel.de/international/interview-with-ex-neocon-francis-fukuyama-a-model-democracy-is-not-emerging-in-iraq-a-407315.html>

Finally he says, in contradiction to his whole spiel, "The task before us in the 21st century is not to alter the timeless message of the Buddha, but, once we have received it fully (a process which may well have some way to go!), to present it in the language and organizational forms most appropriate for the contemporary situation."

This happens organically anyway. There is no need to contrive this, especially by going off like some Buddhist William F. Buckley Jr. on the supposed tragedies of "liberalism." What people have to do is learn Tibetan, receive the teachings, do the retreats, and pass on the teachings. Personal politics has very little to do with this process. But when people begin citing people like Sapan, who was a strict formalist when it came discerning which teachings were of valid provenance as opposed to Tibetan innovations, they had better make sure they are not hoisting themselves on their own petards.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

I tried to respond to this a moment ago, and it got lost in the void. Anyway, no, I'm not going to give you an annotated bibliography on the subject. But see Johnny's post above - it's true that the old class-based Marxist orthodoxy gave way to a much broader critique of power (with its own strengths, but also many weaknesses). And what has happened, in the long run, is that capitalism has in some sense "recuperated" all of these hazier criticisms. Thus today we see many attempts to "address" various oppressions within the context of capitalism, leaving capitalism intact as the dominant mode of social relations. E.G, "we need more black CEOs," corporate inclusivity, a whole industry of activists selling books and seminars and so on.

Norwegian said:

OK got it. No names, no nothing, just vague generalizations and accusations.

Brunelleschi said:

Ok, come on. To claim that there has not been a shift from a focus on class to a wider focus on issues such as race (I take it you're familiar with the term intersectionality) is not correct.

Malcolm wrote:

And what's the problem with that, other than it makes old schools Marxists uncomfortable. After all, Black people were seriously marginalized in the Socialist movement in the United States as well. Nevertheless, there are many Black leftists who wish to tone down the topic of race, people like Cornell West, etc.

Other black intellectuals, like Keeanga-Yamahtta Taylor, point out that in America:'

Brunelleschi said:

“Not only do Black people suffer class oppression,” said Professor Taylor of Princeton, “they also suffer racial oppression. They are fundamentally more marginalized than white people.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2020/08/14/us/adolph-reed-controversy.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:28 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

This book is foundational in Western Academia, read it.

Malcolm wrote:

No it isn't. I for one have never heard of this book until today.

I think you are confusing this with Zinn's People's History of the United States, which is very wide spread in schools in the US. You should read it. It's a thought provoking book.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:48 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

...it is even the only text quoted in Nagarjuna's Mulamadhyamakakarika

Malcolm wrote:

One, this is quite well known. But a little misleading. Many people have overlooked the fact that the maṅgalam of the MMK is a formula found in the PP sūtras.

Thus, this factoid does not have the implication you seek, i.e. that Nāgārjuna only based himself on the Agamas, since it is directly contradicted by other Mahāyāna works he composed.

The reason he only cites that verse is because the śravaka scholars who were his contemporaries did not understand the meaning of dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Why do you think Ven Nāgārjuna would have been using Sarvāstivādin āgamasūtras necessarily?

Malcolm wrote:

Good question, since he was quite likely a Sammitiya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 3:53 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Conflating those things is just incorrect.

Malcolm wrote:

The people most fixate on race these days are the right. They are the ones who are losing it over CRT and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:05 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Why do you think Ven Nāgārjuna would have been using Sarvāstivādin āgamasūtras necessarily?

Malcolm wrote:

Good question, since he was quite likely a Sammitiya.

Caoimhghín said:

The interlocutor in the Madhyamakaśāstra is apparently Sammitiya. It would make sense if Ven Nāgārjuna was a dissident from the same, critiquing it from an insider's

perspective and putting authentic words into his interlocutor's mouth in the MMK.

Malcolm wrote:

yes, we infer this from Nāgārjuna's sole state preference, that is, for the avipranāśa theory of karmic residuum, that and the fact that the Sammitiya school was dominant in Andra Pradesh, where he apparently resided.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:13 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Buddhism should not get involved in politics. Whatever the political solutions that we have are there because of the political issues that they promise to address. One of the truths of all conditioned things is that all things that are conditioned are impermanent. The issues we have now will eventually undergo different changes and at some point they will become irrelevant. Therefore the political solutions which were meant to address those issues will also become irrelevant. The gaze of the public as well as the commitment of activists are shifting from one issue to another from time to time. When issues are no longer relevant they will move on to the next big issues. They will occupy one bandwagon and when that is of no use then they will move onto the next big bandwagon.

Malcolm wrote:

The technical term for this is "Spiritual bypassing."

Dharmasherab said:

We have already seen this with the hippy movement where hippies were seen in the public eye and the media as being active against the Vietnam War.

Malcolm wrote:

This political act did more to end the Vietnam war than any other:

Thích\_Quảng\_Đức\_self-immolation.jpg (22.22 KiB) Viewed 337 times

Dharmasherab said:

I do question whether Buddhism is just used as a platform or launchpad to propagate people's political agendas. I don't want to mention names but there are so called 'teachers' who instill politically progressive views in their teachers where those who receive the teachings won't be able to clearly distinguish between what is Buddhist and what is political.

Malcolm wrote:

Don't worry. I clearly distinguish between Dharma and my political views. But just as a politically conservative teacher is likely to influence their students to have a

conservative point of view, the same is true of politically liberal teachers. Luckily, reality is on the side of the liberals.

Dharmasherab said:

In the centres of Lama Jampa Thaye, discussion on politics is discouraged.

Malcolm wrote:

But he is clearly a conservative and feels no compunction at all in expressing his conservative viewpoint. There is a word for that, help me out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I do think that sometimes dynamics of pockets of the left create what I'd call 'angry young white boy' syndrome, but that's another story.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, excesses of youth and all that. My excesses of youth happened in bars, not in rallies, right or left. And I hate political rallies, they remind me of high school sporting events. The only time in my life I ever went to one was a Bernie Rally in 2015. It was awkward and weird.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:43 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Ideas do create, or at least condition, our perception of reality.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and one of things that stands out as a collateral damage of "ideas" is the harm they cause people when dangerous ideas are allowed to flourish unopposed, like the idea one can attain liberation by throwing oneself onto a trident, or that in a few years, since Armageddon is going down, so we have to spend absurd amounts of money subsidizing Israeli defense, or that we have to have a \$700 billion+ defense budget, etc. Hence, Buddhists had better be involved in the political life of their nations, or just be navel gazers who get rolled over by whoever the local warlords are, Muslims, Communists, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:51 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

If I had a personal critique of the intersectionalists, thatd be it. It's not a moral critique at all, but a tactical one.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, just keep in mind that it all grew out of black radical feminist lesbians in the mid-70's explaining to their white colleagues that no, they were not going to abandon black men because of the racism that black people continued to experience, which their white counterparts did not and never would.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

Toenail said:

I took home some office appliances today from work because I need it at home. If I use it for a while and return it at some point, have I stolen it? Also that stuff is company property, it has no single owner. The whole thing seems complicated. It is a serious question I have, not a joke.

Malcolm wrote:

It is stealing. It was not given to you to take home.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

GrapeLover said:

The Theravada vinaya and associated commentary say there is no offence if a bhikkhu takes an object with the intention of returning it later.

Malcolm wrote:

This is a little different than borrowing someone's rake.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 5:01 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

deemphasized or treated with outright hostility in places on the left today.

Caoimhghín said:

This is very true. No one is less welcome than "allies" on a "radical queer" outing, I can say from experience. I was briefly a member of a YorkU club called TBLGAY, "Trans, Bisexuals, Lesbians, Gays, and Allies at York University."

There was a huge hullabaloo over the supposed overemphasis on "allies" by having them in the acronym. It was changed to "and Asexuals," who are not an oppressed minority and never have been unless they were women, in order to disinclude "allies." They also banned non-POCs from the club collective. Stupid things happen at universities that people blow out of proportion. I was quite offended at the time, but got over it. And the idiot ideologues who ran the club into the ground after I and many others left were replaced by normal people. Life goes on. I don't even think of YorkU anymore hardly.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, indeed, no one cares what freshman think, including most former freshman.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

and have still found many of the younger people...

Malcolm wrote:

are generally impossible to work with anyway...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 5:37 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

The entire doctrine of Nagarjuna is based on what is expounded in this Sutra, and it is even the only text quoted in Nagarjuna's Mulamadhyamakakarika

Caoimhghín said:

Why do you think Ven Nāgārjuna would have been using these Sarvāstivādin āgamasūtras necessarily?

ronnymarsh said:

Because he is a bhikkhu ordained by the Sarvastivada tradition. The Mahayana Buddhist schools are all heirs of the Sarvastivada school.

Malcolm wrote:

And your proof is? Atisha, for example, was a Mahāsaṃghika, this is well known.

ronnymarsh said:

If you take any bhikkhu ordained in the Tibetan tradition, you can see that he was ordained by the vinaya Mulasarvastivada, the one who at the root (mule) is the sarvastivada school.

Malcolm wrote:

Mūlasarvāstivādin is considered by historians to be a later tradition than the Sarvāstivādin tradition.

ronnymarsh said:

Likewise, if you take a fully ordained bhikkhu in the Chinese and Korean lineage (and in the traditional schools of Nara in Japan), they will be ordained by the Dharmaguptaka school, which is also a derivation of the Sarvastivadins.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe.

ronnymarsh said:

Not all adherents have this notion, but basically we Mahayanists are the continuation of this Northern branch of Sthaviravada.

You see, take the lineage of all the patriarchs of Zen Buddhism, for example, as well as Shakyamuni Buddha's lineage in Tiantai, Huayan and Pure Land Buddhism.

In all these lineages we will start with Mahakashyapa, then Ananda, then Sanavasa, then Upagupta. So far, both the Theravada lineage and the Mahayana lineage have the same patriarch.

Malcolm wrote:

Ronny, the Mūlasarvāstivādins trace their line to Rahula, Buddha's son. Not to Upagupta.

ronnymarsh said:

From that point on, Theravada won't have any more patriarchs, but we will. After Upagupta we have Dhrtaka, then Miccaka, then Vasumithra, and others. These are all renowned monks related to the Sarvastivada school, up to the 14th patriarch, Nagarjuna.

The 21st is Vasubhandu, from the Yogacara school, and the list continues (in mutual agreement) to the 24th, Simhabodhi.

Afterwards Ch'an/Zen puts three names linking Simhabodhi to Bodhidharma, but that is not accepted among the other Buddhist Mahayana traditions, however, until the 24th all are in agreement on the succession.

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry, this is all unsupportable speculation.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 6:18 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

An analogy - saying that Social Justice ideology has no crossover with Marxism...

Malcolm wrote:

You've said some pretty silly things in this thread, but this tops it. You do realize that "social justice" was something that emerged from Anglo-American analytical philosophy in the late 1960's? No Marxism there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Why does thinking/saying "oh noes SJWs in Buddhism" necessarily reflect "white rage" and not, for instance, simply an observation that the ideological framework of her argument is faulty and harmful? I don't understand why scorn for her argument is different from scorn for any other argument that the scorner thinks is bad.

Genjo Conan said:

White hostility toward racial progress--or indeed, to discussions about race--is a pretty well-recognized phenomenon, and it tends to take well-recognized forms. As I read Gleig's piece, the problem is not that some take issue with her argument. As I read Gleig's piece, the criticism she's complaining about doesn't concern the substance of her work (unless you feel that "keep playing the victim," or calling Gleig a "dharma pervert" is substantive criticism), but is rather a substance-free attack that is consistent with those patterns of white hostility. It is different from free-floating snark or scorn because it follows those patterns.

Put it this way: if I beat up a black man because we got in a bar fight, it's simple battery. If I beat up a black man while calling him the n-word, it might be a hate crime. There's the action, and then there are the circumstances attendant to the action. Those attendant circumstances don't change the nature of the action, but they change how we interpret it.

nightbloom said:

The truth is that even careful, reasoned argument with people who are principally concerned with "antiracism," "racial justice" or "abolishing whiteness" will frequently be

taken as denial. I know from experience how quickly the viewpoints involved become unfalsifiable. It is really not so different from the kind of Christian who claims that everyone knows, in their heart of hearts, that the Christian revelation is true, but that we're all in denial about it out of pride, insecurity or resentment. Any argument against this position will be taken as just more refusal to see "the truth," and eventually this behavior provokes a backlash. Are some people insecure and unwilling to view themselves as participants in a harmful culture? Obviously (and frankly, I think this applies often to leftists, who refuse to acknowledge how self-serving and counterproductive their efforts are) - but all the rhetoric about "white fragility" and "white rage" is much more sweeping than that.

Take a step back. We're in history here together, not outside of it. The dominant ideological and moral paradigms are not categorically different from the ones that went before, and all the same behavioral patterns are still in play. Fundamentally, some of you guys aren't so different from a bunch of church ladies sitting around and clucking about the unbelievers who "hate Christ and love themselves" or whatever, and socially speaking, it does for you what it used to do for them.

Malcolm wrote:  
More fact free opinions.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 7:01 AM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
More fact free opinions.

nightbloom said:  
^ You're doing a white rage right now.

Malcolm wrote:  
More like white boredom.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 7:05 AM  
Title: Re: When does one "steal"?  
Content:  
SilenceMonkey said:  
DJKR has said (with reference to illegal downloading) that if what you take is more than the cost of lunch (\$5 US), it is an offense.

Malcolm wrote:  
Dzongsar is hardly someone we can consider a vinayadhara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

An analogy - saying that Social Justice ideology has no crossover with Marxism...

Malcolm wrote:

You've said some pretty silly things in this thread, but this tops it. You do realize that "social justice" was something that emerged from Anglo-American analytical philosophy in the late 1960's? No Marxism there.

Zhen Li said:

It might be worthwhile identifying what Marx's view of justice was.

For Marx, there is a normative justice that is conditioned by the existing mode of production. So Liberal justice as it exists today would certainly be seen as a manifestation of the bourgeois mode of production. By making people focus on social justice as defined by popular contemporary opinion, whatever it is, true justice or injustice is being obfuscated. So, a true justice, grounded in a distinction of actual evil actions encompasses avoidably depriving humans of value through the exploitation of their labour, alienating them from their labour (which is the source of their human flourishing), as well as actual physical (not culturally specific or normative, e.g. liberally defined) harm committed on people (which may include dehumanising exclusion of certain races and sexes). But he also seems to suggest that the normative justice and injustice corresponds to the character (no doubt conditioned by the mode of production) of the people within a society, e.g.

Ludwig Feuerbach & the End of Classical German Philosophy, I said:

“A particular governmental measure – Hegel himself cites the example of ‘a certain tax regulation’ – is therefore for him by no means real without qualification. That which is necessary, however, proves itself in the last resort to be also rational; and, applied to the Prussian state of that time, the Hegelian proposition, therefore, merely means: this state is rational, corresponds to reason, in so far as it is necessary: and if it nevertheless appear to us to be evil, but still, in spite of its evil character, continues to exist, then the evil character of the government is justified and explained by the corresponding evil character of its subjects. The Prussians of that day had the government they deserved.

“Now, according to Hegel, reality is, however, in no way an attribute predicable of any given state of affairs, social or political, in all circumstances and at all times. On the contrary.”

Malcolm wrote:

Thanks, but that's not really from where the modern idea of social justice is derived.

Think Rawls instead.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 7:58 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

Again, it shares similar presuppositional roots as Marxism, such as the inherent evil of dominance and the total constructionism of society at large.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, no. Apparently you are unfamiliar with the dialogue between John Rawls and Robert Nozick. Continental Marxists don't really have a role here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:29 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

Again, it shares similar presuppositional roots as Marxism, such as the inherent evil of dominance and the total constructionism of society at large.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, no. Apparently you are unfamiliar with the dialogue between John Rawls and Robert Nozick. Continental Marxists don't really have a role here.

You keep ignoring the fact the justice arguments emerged among American lawyers and philosophers of law, like my dad. Marxism isn't taken seriously by such people, at least not philosophically. Full disclosure, he was on the Nozick side of the argument.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:32 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, no. Apparently you are unfamiliar with the dialogue between John Rawls and Robert Nozick. Continental Marxists don't really have a role here. You keep ignoring the fact the justice arguments emerged among American lawyers and philosophers of law, like my dad. Marxism isn't taken seriously by such people, at least not philosophically.

Zhen Li said:

He's not saying it is Marxism or from Marxism, he's saying it shares the same presuppositions.

Malcolm wrote:

But it doesn't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:37 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

He's not saying it is Marxism or from Marxism, he's saying it shares the same presuppositions.

Malcolm wrote:

But it doesn't.

Zhen Li said:

It shares some.

Malcolm wrote:

The basis of these arguments comes from amendments passed after the Civil War. It's not ideological at all. That's what people fail to understand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 9:07 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

. Attaining the happiest state of being for every citizen is a reasonable goal, but the idea that there is a way beyond human ignorance through political means, rather than Dharma, and that there is a final state to be achieved where the world looks like Queens, is irrational.

Malcolm wrote:

Most people are not Buddhists. We, as Buddhists, are obligated to help them achieve those aims, in so far as they are ethical and just.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Edit: to clarify, I'm saying that much of the discourse around "whiteness," "white rage," "toxic whiteness," and other such maladies is totally governed by the dynamic in the above paragraph.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you have not applied your thought experiment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 9:49 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

This is very much practiced in Tibetan Buddhism, when practitioners in conjunction with Vajrayana initiations are encouraged to experience monastic life momentarily with a momentary ordination, as well as

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry, but you are suffering from some severe misconceptions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 7:59 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Conflating those things is just incorrect.

Malcolm wrote:  
The people most fixate on race these days are the right. They are the ones who are losing it over CRT and so on.

Heimdall said:  
You LITERALLY started this thread on WHITENESS IN WESTERN BUDDHISM.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes. Mostly because people on the right are losing it over this stuff. And it was confined to Buddhist Studies, not Western Buddhism. But you apparently have some other trip going. This subject really gets your goat.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:04 PM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:

tingdzin said:  
the idea that there is a way beyond human ignorance through political means, rather than Dharma, and that there is a final state to be achieved where the world looks like Queens, is irrational.

Well put, by the way.

Malcolm wrote:  
As I said, most people are not interested in Dharma, and never will be. The point is not ending human ignorance, that will never happen.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:09 PM  
Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
Sadly, we find some of our Buddhist brothers and sisters seizing on the Buddha's Golden Words to deny and gas light efforts to fix these ruptures in our communities.

Malcolm wrote:  
Well, in Buddhist Academia, they prefer to be left alone with their forensic examinations.

As for these other issue you bring up, imagining that there is some religious solution in and of itself is completely naive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 8:12 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

More important than any of this stuff about Mahāsāṃghikas is, "Does the list that includes 'a city of gandharvas' feature in any non-Mahāyāna sūtra that you know of?" Earlier, you made a very extreme claim that Venerable Nāgārjuna only cites non-Mahāyāna sūtras. This appears to be very wrong. This wrong claim IMO is more serious than "Buddhist sectarian history can be simplified to sects that are permissive and sects that are impermissive."

Malcolm wrote:

It's a waste of time. Ronny has so many misconception it is not worth addressing them because he is not open to being corrected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

As for our sanghas, have you read the Vinaya recently? Its full of egalitarianism, notions of fairness, and a host of secular ideals and procedural processes, and its by definition, Dharma. It has worked pretty well to keep the communities going for 2500 years.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, if it has a downfall, that lies in its treatment of women.

Queequeg said:

Shock, horror exclaims the peanut gallery, how can you criticize the Buddha's teaching?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, as everyone who has studied the issue knows, the Vinaya was assembled following the parinirvana of the Buddha, as well as the assemblage of its rules and procedures, which is why bhikṣus from one lineage cannot participate in the poṣadha rites of another lineage, and the reason why the ordination process and rules of the sangha vary widely.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 10:16 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

"Nāgārjuna in Context," p. 213, Walser mentions the Dīpavaṃsa, a sectarian historical chronicle of Sri Lanka, which contains this claim in it.

Zhen Li said:

Interesting.

Malcolm wrote:

They certainly would have rejected Abhidhamma, with its claim to be taught by the Buddha directly. But they certainly did not reject Abhidharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

If we take the view that the vinaya developed after the parinirvana, then we can take a more realist approach and say, we've always navigated the secular world and our rules have always reflected that.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and in Vinaya, the Buddha explicitly leaves all of these issues to secular authorities, since Dharma is not political system nor a governing body, nor should it ever be. This does not mean that we should abandon all political awareness, as the Niti śāstras demonstrate. This is the reason several of them were translated into Tibetan, such as Canakya's treatise on kingship, and has been a subject of interest to Tibetan masters right down to Mipham, who wrote a treatise on politics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 10:23 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

In the age of Dharma decline, it is not possible for vinaya to be upheld.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence another reason for following Vajrayāna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 10:48 PM

Title: Re: On two questions; the omnipotence of Buddha and the omnipotence of merit

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The mind of a Buddha is unfathomable.

Malcolm wrote:

That's the answer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies

Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Buddhism fundamentally is realistic in accepting that the world doesn't necessarily progress.

Malcolm wrote:

The difference between Buddhism and conservatism, at base, is that Buddhism maintains a positive outlook on human nature, on sentient being nature.

Buddhism understands that things, conventionally speaking, are born, grow, decline, and perish, and that the process of growth and expansion is inhibited or enhanced by positive and negative actions among sentient beings.

We can find many examples in the Buddha's teachings where he insisted on fairness—one of the most crucial was his insistence that Dharma be taught in the local vernacular. Another was his criticism of varna. "Suvarna" means good color, i.e. gold. The varna system in ancient India was a social color-coding, much like we have today in West, the other end of the Indo-European culture sphere. So it is not surprising that white supremacy exists among Buddhists and the Buddhist Studies academy. It is not surprising that the de facto position of Indo-Europeans has always been supremacist feelings of superiority towards people of darker skin tones (Rome vs. Carthage, for example). We find this all over Indo-European myth and literature. The Indians, Buddhist (in contrast to the Buddha's own sensibilities on the subject) and Hindu alike, kept a careful record of their decimation and subjugation of people with darker skin tones.

It's time Western Buddhists started waking up to the "darker" (perhaps "whiter" is more apropos here) side of our own history, including the reception of Buddhism by Protestant philologists who imputed onto Buddhism a Calvinist apophaticism more in keeping with their own prejudices. It's worth looking at how whiteness in the Academy has skewed Buddhist Studies, and that is the point of this thread. It's not really about Buddhism per

se.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 11:39 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Queequeg said:

The vinaya does actually set up the sangha as a governing body with rules and procedures for its regulation,

Malcolm wrote:

For bhikṣus, bhikṣunīs, śramaṇeras, and śramaṇerikās only.

Queequeg said:

and as I pointed out, its rules addressed the inequality of the wider society. This is clear from the explanation of seniority as the determining factor in rank within the community, overriding all secular bases of rank.

Malcolm wrote:

In the sense that no one was barred from entering the homeless life in the Buddhist sangha.

We have the same type of seniority ranking in Congress, unions, companies, and so on.

Queequeg said:

Its true the sangha was generally supposed to be apolitical, but dharma has always been applied to secular life and held out ideals about how political life should be conducted - the Jataka tales include many stories of the Buddha's past lives as righteous kings and leaders. The Buddha often counseled kings and numerous masters wrote guidance for rulers.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, in those past lives, the Buddha was not a bhikṣu, etc. When the Buddha counseled kings, it was usually to not invade someone else.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 5th, 2021 at 11:46 PM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

One doesn't have to look at this micro issue and necessarily blame the entire social

fabric at large for it. .

Malcolm wrote:

The social fabric of America is racist to the core, was founded on racism, and is still racist.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:05 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think you make a good point here. The implication of social justice ideology and other progressive ideologies contain the presupposition that there's a city on the hill at the end of the road. It is inherently Christian and Jewish in its underpinnings. Buddhism fundamentally is realistic in accepting that the world doesn't necessarily progress.

Heimdall said:

Exactly.

Social justice ideology and other progressive ideologies (including Marxism) borrow varying Judeo-Christian conceptions of this linear progress of human history...

Malcolm wrote:

Fact free opinion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

That's like claiming that the Libertarian movement is nothing more than Thomas Jefferson and the Founding Fathers.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, Libertarianism's roots can be traced back to the pro-slavery southern Senator, John Calhoun. The main arguments he outlined are still used today by douches like Rand Paul and his ilk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:16 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship  
Content:

Heimdall said:

You LITERALLY started this thread on WHITENESS IN WESTERN BUDDHISM.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. Mostly because people on the right are losing it over this stuff. And it was confined to Buddhist Studies, not Western Buddhism. But you apparently have some other trip going. This subject really gets your goat.

Heimdall said:

It does...

Malcolm wrote:

You might want to look at that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

Also, you are wrong. See the Frankfurt School.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, this is all irrelevant. The social justice movement begins in Analytical Philosophy, with John Rawls:

John Rawls, who died on November 24, raised modern political philosophy from the pit of Marxist and linguistic analysis and revived it as a serious subject for citizens of the real world. He believed that answering age-old practical questions about liberty and justice was the proper work of political philosophers. His own answers were ingenious, deeply thought through, and provocative. They aroused the passionate interest of other philosophers and drew scholars from other disciplines, including economics, into the discussion.

<https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2002/12/john-rawls-and-the-politics-of-social-justice/377209/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

And you might want to look at why you are so fixated on melanin amounts as determinative of personal motivations and political ideologies.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, I am not, it is racists who are, that's why Native Americans were not even allowed to vote in the US until the 1950's, black people were denied mortgages and still are, based on red lining, etc.

I guess you are not an American, so you really don't have any clue what we are actually talking about. And if you are, you live in some fantasy land I don't inhabit. I live in a country where Trump was elected president, because he is a racist, because of white rage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Firstly, can we tone down the rhetoric here?

Heimdall said:

Sure, but this whole thread started with the accusation that White Buddhists are "filled with rage" (implying hatred) because they don't share the same ideological beliefs as OP

Malcolm wrote:

You don't read very carefully. But you certainly have demonstrated Ann Gleig's thesis admirably.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 12:47 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

One doesn't have to look at this micro issue and necessarily blame the entire social fabric at large for it. .

Malcolm wrote:

The social fabric of America is racist to the core, was founded on racism, and is still racist.

Heimdall said:

Well, there's so much to unpack in that one statement that we aren't going to agree anyways.

Malcolm wrote:

Not much to unpack. It's in the constitution, though amended; it's in the original poem from which our national anthem was taken, etc., etc.

If you don't understand this, you don't understand America.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 1:11 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

Notwithstanding that you've contradicted yourself and admitted yourself as racist (after all, your ideology merely comes from the 13th and 14th amendments, from a totally racist and unsalvageable system)

Malcolm wrote:

Silly and sillier.

These two amendments were meant to fix the constitution. But the 14th were the place where birth citizenship was recognized (excluding native americans), etc. The 14th reads in part:

All persons born or naturalized in the United States, and subject to the jurisdiction thereof, are citizens of the United States and of the State wherein they reside. No State shall make or enforce any law which shall abridge the privileges or immunities of citizens of the United States; nor shall any State deprive any person of life, liberty, or property, without due process of law; nor deny to any person within its jurisdiction the equal protection of the laws.

The Social Justice movement is based in this principle, and reinforced by the 15th, 20th, 24th, and the 26th (though that mostly applies to teenagers).

These amendments are necessary because America is a country still steeped in racism and white, male privilege. That also plays out our universities and in Buddhist Studies, sadly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

What an incompetent attempt to spin anti-racism as racism present in this thread.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it's pretty Tucker Carlsonesque.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 1:15 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

I agree there is structural racism and it is a problem,

Malcolm wrote:

Finally...

Heimdall said:

but I think the solutions provided by progressives today in terms of methodology and goals are counterproductive to actually healing the wounds and only make things worse.

Malcolm wrote:

And your solution is?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

"Structural racism" is such an amorphous and esoteric term to begin with that it's hard to even discuss it without it being used to proscribe a certain ideological solution.

Malcolm wrote:

So now you are backtracking....

Structural racism is Jim Crow. Structural racism is voted suppression. Structural racism is racial covenants. In short, there is nothing amorphous or esoteric about the term at all.



You remind me of this recent movie:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

You seem to be actually agreeing with the intersectionalists and crt people that racism is built into our culture. Further, it is difficult if not impossible to untangle political structures from culture.

Malcolm wrote:

Given 'em enough rope, and they all hang themselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:07 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Heimdall said:

but is a result of our culture.

Malcolm wrote:

Which is white and favors white people, and white men in particular.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:08 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Wasn't the initial criticism towards the two researchers whose writing came off as a stereotype as a certain kind of leftist (or "leftist"). This paragraph reads like parody: Where do we go from here? Honestly, I don't know. As a white person with a Ph.D. in Buddhist studies, this is a difficult issue to acknowledge, and I'm genuinely uncomfortable writing about this. My entire career is a direct result of the Orientalist assumptions and colonialist attitudes that I mention here, and acknowledging these issues calls my own status and privilege into question. Now the thread has of course strayed from that.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, because some people did not actually read the article, they just reacted to the term "white."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Singhamukha

Content:

Paulo said:

If a person has received the Empowerment of Vajrayogini, can he engage in Singhamukha's sadhana without receiving her empowerment?

PeterC said:

No

Malcolm wrote:

Seconded.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Framing the diagnosis of America as either racist or premised upon racism as an admittance of personal racism is not a competent framing of anti-racism as racism, IMO.

Malcolm wrote:

But it is pretty much Tucker Carlson's m.o..

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:19 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The big difference is that according to the socialist \*it is only organizing around class\* that can actually bring lasting reform or sweeping change.

Malcolm wrote:

The article I mentioned as about one such black professor who agrees with this sentiment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 2:46 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's time Western Buddhists started waking up to the "darker" (perhaps "whiter" is more apropos here) side of our own history, including the reception of Buddhism by Protestant philologists who imputed onto Buddhism a Calvinist apophaticism more in keeping with their own prejudices. It's worth looking at how whiteness in the Academy has skewed Buddhist Studies, and that is the point of this thread. It's not really about Buddhism per se.

nightbloom said:

The Protestant flavor of Buddhist studies historically is quite obvious, but it's not clear to me that this is "whiteness" or racism. Is disdain for ritual and devotional practices racist?

Malcolm wrote:

It can be, of course.

nightbloom said:

The people we're talking about have the same allergy to European Christian (Catholic/Orthodox) ritual and so on.

Malcolm wrote:

You've seen some racist cartoons of Irish, Italian people in 19th century American newspapers I presume? Not to mention Mexicans, Chinese, etc. and so on. For example, we have the very obvious racism of Laurence Waddell in *The Buddhism of Tibet, or Lamaism*, who was obsessed with Aryan civilization:

From 1917 until his death, aged eighty-five, in 1938 Laurence Austine Waddell wrote an elaborate and painstakingly detailed narrative of old world prehistory that identified the Aryan race as the root of all progress, innovation and civilisation in the past five thousand and five hundred years. Waddell's hyperdiffusionist and virulently racist writings on archaeology and ancient history were widely read in Britain, influencing the works of Fascist intellectuals, such as the medievalist J. H. Harvey, and the modernist poet Ezra Pound (Casillo 1985; Macklin 2008). Today his works, particularly his book *The Phoenician Origin of Britons, Scots and Anglo-Saxons* (1924), circulate among far-right groups, and can be found on the internet.

<https://www.archaeologybulletin.org/articles/10.5334/bha.20106/>

Here is an interesting thesis that delves into very subject, taking Rhys Davids theories on race and so on into account.

<https://scholars.wlu.ca/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3083&context=etd>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Right, because some people did not actually read the article, they just reacted to the term "white."

Brunelleschi said:

Yeah, sure I agree. I don't really feel this topic ought to bring forth such intense emotion. I feel it is unwarranted and quite unfortunate.

Malcolm wrote:

Me either, but whatever, their emotional turmoil doesnot belong to me.

Brunelleschi said:

Also, many modern scholars seem to very aware of colonial view and Orientalism of the past.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, it was fashionable to be aware of that for a while ala Edward Said...

Brunelleschi said:

...many doctorates seem to be well off, some literally nobility. Because they're the ones that can take risks in terms of education.

Malcolm wrote:

Studying the religion and culture of Buddhism in academia is an occupation for the privileged, including Ann Gleig, which she recognizes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 4:57 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

boda said:

I read about a dozen of the personal stories in the Making the Invisible Visible ( <https://www.spiritrock.org/document.doc?id=9> ) paper and didn't find what I expected. The closest that met my expectations was like, "I'm an African American woman who feels most comfortable around people like myself ... and a white lady looked at me funny during a retreat." Frankly, I'm relieved that the reports are not far worse. Maybe they save the worst for last?

Malcolm wrote:

Here is an interesting fact. Chogyal Namkhai Norbu refused to return to South Africa, because no Africans ever came to his teachings...and he decided it was because of white exclusion...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 7:19 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Re: Waddell & racializing cartoons regarding Irish, Italians, etc, yes, I'm aware. It seems significant to me though that all of these examples are almost 80 years old, and today the generic category of "whiteness" now excludes many of these people who used to be (ambiguously) excluded from it.

Malcolm wrote:

It goes to character, and the fact that there are some people will never be able to graduate to "whiteness" in our society.

nightbloom said:

despite being a Trump-voting "right wing" white person...

Malcolm wrote:

Sheeeeeeeeeiiiiit, so now you admit it. SMH.

nightbloom said:

Edit: incidentally, Malcolm - I think some of the trouble with this "whiteness" shit is that it enables things like the following: your argument for the essentially atheist character of Buddhism the other day could easily have been framed as a manifestation of "whiteness," (because secularism is whiteness blah blah)

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, such thinking is a product of a white person of privilege (me). I am a strong advocate of secularism, though not like the French, who want to outlaw hijab, turbans, malas, and any other external religious garb in public office and schools.

nightbloom said:

and anything you said in defense of it could be represented as more of the same. By locating the "problem" not in the object of discussion, but in a miasma emanating from one's opponent, you discredit and neutralize them.

Malcolm wrote:

"White Identitarianism" is the main problem in America, and it has been well, since

Europeans started coming to these shores.

nightbloom said:

It's one of the reasons why communities full of leftists who are receptive to "whiteness" discourse tend to devolve into internecine personality conflicts where people use the accusation of whiteness to secure power for themselves and sabotage their opponents.

Malcolm wrote:

More fact free opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 7:23 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Trump-voting "right wing" white person

Malcolm wrote:

Voting for a racist makes you a racist. F\*\*k off.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:22 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies Scholarship

Content:

nightbloom said:

Trump-voting "right wing" white person

Malcolm wrote:

Voting for a racist makes you a racist. F\*\*k off.

nightbloom said:

No, it really doesn't. But anyway, it's worth pointing out that you, too, voted for a racist in 2020, and a more insidious one insofar as it's more successfully camouflaged in the case of Biden and the paradigm he represents. There really isn't a way not to, except to not vote at all.

Malcolm wrote:

You people will say anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:23 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

And for an ācārya, one of the most easily angered people I've ever encountered.

Malcolm wrote:

If you think I am angry, you really aren't paying attention.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 10:07 AM

Title: Re: Why Are White Buddhists So Angry? White Rage And Buddhist Studies  
Scholarship

Content:

Zhen Li said:

And for an ācārya, one of the most easily angered people I've ever encountered.

Malcolm wrote:

If you think I am angry, you really aren't paying attention.

Zhen Li said:

A lot of people need to work on their presentation of agreeableness online. You cannot read gestures or vocal tones in text, so it is necessary to be extra careful in this regard.

Malcolm wrote:

No, all that is necessary is to be consistent. I've been doing this for 25 years. This a meta conversation at this point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 7:12 PM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje  
Content:

Paul2020 said:

Many thanks for the link justsit . I just read the article. It seems to me to be good news. I'm not sure what Kagyu sub-school my temple is affiliated with, but I will ask the next time I'm there. But with the rapprochement between the two Karmapas, as people have noted, it may no longer be a particularly contentious issue.

Thanks - as usual - for everyone's responses.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, but now there are other storm clouds on the horizon for OTD.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 7:19 PM

Title: Re: Pung Gyen diety or dieties?

Content:

Dharmaswede said:

When I google Pung Gyen, I get one female deity – but the text I have says deities. Is it one or several?

Any great source with more in-depth info on Pung Gyen?

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Not enough info. What text?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Pung Gyen diety or dieties?

Content:

Dharmaswede said:

When I google Pung Gyen, I get one female deity – but the text I have says deities. Is it one or several?

Any great source with more in-depth info on Pung Gyen?

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Not enough info. What text?

There is a dhāraṇī called the ārya-dhvaja-agrakeyūra-nāma-dhāraṇī, aka dpung rgyan. But it is not a deity practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 8:42 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

Things are becoming authoritarian because the social issues are becoming so numerous that both sides are externalizing the issues to political figures and ideology.



Malcolm wrote:

Some people in America, for example, are waxing authoritarian because a deeply racist man, an American fascist named Donald J. Trump, encourages them to externalize their social anxieties onto "crime and drugs," (aka Black people) and "illegal aliens" (aka people from Mexico and Central America), and "China" (aka, the country whose labor costs were sufficiently low that Americans could buy a lot of cheap shit at Walmart, Amazon, etc.).

Henry Wallace wrote in 1944:

The dangerous American fascist is the man who wants to do in the United States in an American way what Hitler did in Germany in a Prussian way. The American fascist would prefer not to use violence. His method is to poison the channels of public information. With a fascist the problem is never how best to present the truth to the public but how best to use the news to deceive the public into giving the fascist and his group more money or more power.

....

The American fascists are most easily recognized by their deliberate perversion of truth and fact. Their newspapers and propaganda carefully cultivate every fissure of disunity, every crack in the common front against fascism. They use every opportunity to impugn democracy. They use isolationism as a slogan to conceal their own selfish imperialism. They cultivate hate and distrust of both Britain (in 2021, the EU) and Russia (In 2021, China). They claim to be super- patriots, but they would destroy every liberty guaranteed by the Constitution. They demand free enterprise, but are the spokesmen for monopoly and vested interest. Their final objective toward which all their deceit is directed is to capture political power so that, using the power of the state and the power of the market simultaneously, they may keep the common man in eternal subjection.

[https://www.cbsd.org/cms/lib/PA01916442/Centricity/Domain/1864/Henry%20Wallace\\_The%20Danger%20of%20American%20Fascism.pdf](https://www.cbsd.org/cms/lib/PA01916442/Centricity/Domain/1864/Henry%20Wallace_The%20Danger%20of%20American%20Fascism.pdf)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

DJKR has said (with reference to illegal downloading) that if what you take is more than the cost of lunch (\$5 US), it is an offense.

Malcolm wrote:

Dzongsar is hardly someone we can consider a vinayadhara.

SilenceMonkey said:

You should probably disprove it with scripture instead of an ad hominem attack.

Malcolm wrote:

He is not a bhikṣu, he is not even a śrāmanera. He is an upāsaka. My point was not an ad hominem attack, it was a factual observation.

There no cap on what someone is allowed to take without being given.

Now, there are laws in various countries that govern downloads, for example, in Canada, it is not illegal to download things placed in the internet illegally. In the US, it is.

The actual language is "do not take what has not been given," not "Take what has not been given as long as it does not exceed US \$5."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 8:55 PM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

Toenail said:

Also it has no single owner.

Malcolm wrote:

Legally, like in the US, in Germany corporations are persons, so yes, it does have a single owner, just to clarify that for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I think it is simplistic to blame it all on Trump. He is as much a manifestation of the phenomenon as he is a driver of it.

Malcolm wrote:

He is its embodiment, for the moment, that center around which it churns. And, he tried to overthrow the government...so...I am not going to be forgiving him or anyone who voted for him for some time. They'd best steer clear of me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:32 PM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Then how do you explain the quotes above from Wisdomlib?

Malcolm wrote:

The actual amount that causes a bhikṣu defeat, according to Kongtrul, is the value of a bushel of barley, about \$4.75 in today's market. So, if a bhikṣu scams a White Chocolate Mocha Venti at \$4.75 they are defeated. And, if they downloaded a movie illegally, valued at a 5.99 rental, they would be defeated as well.

But this does not apply to lay people, for obvious reason, which when spelled out, there is no such thing as a defeat for an upāsaka and two, upāsakas are permitted to carry money and so on, hence such a cap for a defeat is irrelevant and taking anything that is not given is breach of one's upāsaka vow. That's my point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

He has a unique personality and persona.

Malcolm wrote:

Malignant narcissism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

To keep this balanced and in line with my first post - the Left has authoritarian impulses, but they are tempered by commitments to democratic ideals as well as a center that is right leaning and highly suspicious of far left ideas. Bernie has a cult following but he also stands for democratic ideals and so would never even think of positioning himself as an authoritarian figure.

Norwegian said:

Are you referring to the Democratic Party as the left?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think so. There are the Democrats, who are mostly centrist, about where the Republicans were in the 1950's, and then there are Progressives, largely encouraged by Bernie Sanders, who are about where Democrats were in the 1930's, 1940's and 1960's—New Deal and the Great Society. The GOP has been systematically trying to dismantle this since FDR passed SSI.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:48 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

He has a unique personality and persona.

Malcolm wrote:

Malignant narcissism.

Queequeg said:

My diagnosis is, "dangerous ass hole."

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, in layman's terms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I just started reading the new Bob Woodward book about the January 6th congress insurrection. Like all his books, it's fascinating and eye opening. I just finished a passage where the Heads of the Joint Chiefs of Staff was reassuring both Pelosi and the Chinese government vthat he would personally make sure Trump would not be able to launch a nuclear war as a justification for a power grab. This was a serious concern at the time.

Trump or course comes across as totally unhinged.

In some ways I think January 6th was more significant than 9/11.

Malcolm wrote:

he recently remarked that his run in 2024 was going to be all about revenge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 10:11 PM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Don't you think the vows are more lenient for lay people, though?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not really. However, going for refuge everyday restores any broken vows.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 10:37 PM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Norwegian said:  
But that requires the absence of the American right, and the presence of a much more progressive American left, and I don't see that happening any time soon.

Malcolm wrote:  
The boomers are dying, and young people America trend left. About 70% of millennials favor democratic socialism over capitalism as it exists presently. The problem is getting them to the polls.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 11:00 PM  
Title: Re: Facebook is bad  
Content:  
Tlalok said:  
It has to be broken up.

Malcolm wrote:  
Strongly agree.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 11:47 PM  
Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?  
Content:

Dharmasherab said:  
You contradict yourself. First you say that Lama Jampa not encouraging conversations about politics as being 'conservative'.

Malcolm wrote:  
We can assume he is conservative because he excludes conservatives in this passage:

"The notion of inevitable progress has been so tenacious that today's dominant liberal and Marxist ideologies..."

Only a conservative would have a problem with liberals being a dominant voice in political discourse. Clearly he is anti-marxist as well. But it is false that liberalism is dominant in Britain since it has a Tory Government.

Dharmasherab said:

As for me, I have been to his centres and I do not hold any political views (I am politically neutral).

Malcolm wrote:

No you aren't. You complain about liberals on the alt-right Dharmwheel:

Social Justice Warriors (SJWs) are basically modern progressive liberals.

Here are two good videos which explains about it from a rational point of view.

Before you watch just keep aware that not all criticisms against SJWs come from the conservative/right. As for me I was left wing and since the left wing got hijacked by SJWs I left the left to become politically neutral (as in I don't use my vote in government elections).

<https://www.dharmawheel.org/viewtopic.php?p=16888#p16888>

Dharmasherab said:

There were also liberals who came to his groups except that regardless of political beliefs people had they all had to abide by the rule of not engaging in political discussion in his groups. The Buddha refers to discussion on politics as 'animal talk' and this type of talk is discouraged for those who are ordained as monastics. So it is also a good training rule for those who come to Lama Jampa's Buddhist groups to learn Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

I have no problem with him or his rule in his centers, but pretending he isn't a conservative is naive. Pretending that you are neutral is also ingenuous, since you clearly aren't neutral. I expect monastics to be more honest.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 6th, 2021 at 11:48 PM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

It explains why politics will always let us down and won't give us ultimate happiness.

Malcolm wrote:

They are not supposed to bring us ultimate happiness. There are two kinds of happiness: temporary and ultimate.

Since most people will not benefit from practicing Buddhadharma, well, what else do you suggest for them? Christianity?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I agree with Dharmasherab.

If you get involved in politics, you get involved in illusions of the world and lose the bigger picture. The lifeline of the Dharma does not depend upon political regimes...

Malcolm wrote:

This is a position that does not stand up to an examination of the historical fortunes of Buddhadharma in various countries, both in India and without.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 12:20 AM

Title: Re: La Palma vulcano eruption

Content:

Aemilius said:

Ufo-contactee Billy Meier, or his extra terrestrial sources, made a prediction concerning the volcano on La Palma some three decades ago. What is happening now is mild compared to the predictions of Billy Meier. No lives have been lost, only some buildings. It could have been much worse.

Malcolm wrote:

That guy is a total fraud, an antisemite, and a homophobe.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Fundamentally I am uncomfortable saying "the Dharma pervades our entire life--but not this part." Politics are an aspect of the world in which we live. Engaging in politics is not necessarily conducive to liberation, any more than putting on robes, or taking a bath, or using the toilet are conducive to liberation. But just as those things can be conducive to liberation, so too, I think, can be engaging in politics.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhists have been engaged in politics since the time of the Buddha. The Buddha himself was consulted concerning politics and rulership. But spiritual bypassing is a trend...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 12:40 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Genjo Conan said:

I think this is a slightly-more-sophisticated-than-usual version of bothsidesism: sure, something like half the Republicans in the country think that we should have done a coup to install Trump on the throne, but some kids in balaclavas set fire to a garbage can, so really who's to say where the authoritarianism lies?

Malcolm wrote:  
USA:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:16 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I personally think the mainstream left in the US has an authoritarian streak, it just tends to center around a blunt notion of 'common good' (you can see it with attitudes around COVID response, for example) and is IMO way less damaging than right wing authoritarianism, by far. It still has some ugly possibilities I think, but at this point they don't compare.

Malcolm wrote:  
Public health trumps personal freedom: example, swimming in the public water supply; prescriptions for addictive pharmaceuticals; vaccine requirements to attend schools, and so on.

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Right wingers have made such threats though, even on this forum!

Malcolm wrote:  
Leftist violence in the US, since WWII, has almost always been against symbols and property. Even the Weathermen were not out to kill anyone. Of course, the right always gets its knickers in a twist when some shit gets burned down somewhere, and half the time they are lighting the fires and breaking the windows themselves to make peaceful protestors look bad.

Who has the guns in the USA? It certainly isn't the Left, for the most part.



Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:18 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:  
FiveSkandhas said:  
amusing images...

Malcolm wrote:  
Maybe you can reach "ascendent" in Sukhavati, but it ain't happening here in this Sahaloka. Even the Buddha had to deal with murderous kooks.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:23 AM  
Title: Re: Different Sets of the Bodhisattva Vows  
Content:  
FiveSkandhas said:  
Correct me if I'm wrong but there seems to be a difference between "Bodhisattva Precepts" and the "Bodhisattva Vow(s)."

Malcolm wrote:  
The term in Sanskrit is samvara, which means restraint, hence we have the bodhisattva samvara, "the restraints of a bodhisattva." "Precepts" and "vows" are just English renderings of the same Sanskrit term.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:32 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:  
I'm not getting into it again, a lot of you guys arguing with me about this stuff weren't even up on the science,

Malcolm wrote:  
That's false. We just have a difference of opinion.

Johnny Dangerous said:  
and I can tell you don't do jobs where you deal with the consequences of Public Health policies, so you don't even understand the context of the critiques I made. There's a gulf there we're not crossing anytime soon.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, I understood them at the time. Understanding does not mean agreement.

Johnny Dangerous said:

At least I know y'all hearts are in the right place, but the act of associating me with antivaxx sentiments (wasn't you) was IMO the sort of intellectual dishonesty that often characterizes 'left authoritarianism'...if we can even call it that. It's not a huge deal, but is indicative of a trend I've observed.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, whoever did that was just dumb.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I agree fully about violence on the left though, I have been part of militant left groups in the past and even the most militant of them paled in comparison to the milder Rightwing militants.

Malcolm wrote:

Leftwing groups tend to frown on nationalism, but that is the core of far-right ideology.

Of course, now we have to distinguish between the political left and the environmental left, because some of the radical environmental left often make a common cause with the far-right, Edward Abbey comes to mind...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

There are modern, western leftists who actively praise the DPRK, think that Stalin was good, actually, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, takes all kinds...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

nightbloom said:

None of the demonizing, moralizing and threatening ("they had better steer clear of me" - or what?) convinces anyone of anything, except that your politics reflect your position in our society.

Malcolm wrote:

Hey, your guy tried to overthrow the government. You all demonized yourselves for

supporting him. HRC had it right: what bunch of deplorables.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

nightbloom said:

Frankly, I couldn't stand the casual cruelty of my peers pretending to care about collective welfare while representing half the population as a mass of evil barbarians who should be seen and not heard.

Malcolm wrote:

No, not half. Not after 1/6/2021. Only the real deplorables stand behind Cheeto Furher now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:07 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

nightbloom said:

Mods & admin: please consider closing this sub-forum. There are already dozens of other places to discuss politics, and what's going on here is totally poisonous: nobody is convincing anyone of anything, and the acrimony just reaches out to contaminate the rest of the forum.

Norwegian said:

If you don't like it, don't participate in it. Engaged Buddhism is an integral part of Mahayana, and that includes politics. So, deal with it.

Malcolm wrote:

Even better, he can go hang out in the alt-right Dharmawheel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:10 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

nightbloom said:

nobody is convincing anyone of anything...

Malcolm wrote:

You are never going to convince anyone here that Trump and his followers are anything but fascists, fascists who tried to take over the US Government illegally.

Now buzz off.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Different Sets of the Bodhisattva Vows

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

The Brahma Net Sutra is in 2 parts. The first is an Avatamsaka type exposition and is indeed supposed to be confused. The second is often translated separately and is supposed to be quite alright.

PDF <https://bdkamerica.org/download/1959>

I have been studying this

PDF <https://bdkamerica.org/download/1859> Taishō 1488

Volume 24

The Sutra on Upāsaka Precepts sets forth the moral code to be observed by lay Buddhists. The word upāsaka in the title is Sanskrit for layman. In the sūtra, Sujāta is taught the moral code to be observed by lay followers of Buddhism. Therefore the text is also known as the Sujāta-sūtra after the central figure. Prescribing the moral code as so-called Mahāyāna Precepts or Bodhisattva Precepts, the work was especially valued in Mahāyānist China.

This work is considered to be an augmentation and adaptation on Mahāyānist principles of the Sujāta-sūtra found in the Dīrghāgama (Taishō 1), Madhyamāgama (Taishō 2), and other works. Because of this relationship to previous texts, and because the quotations it shares from various Mahāyāna sūtras, The Sutra on Upāsaka Precepts provides valuable source material for tracing the history of the development of the Buddhist canon.

Source

Skt. Upāsakaśīla-sūtra. Translated into the Chinese by Dharmakṣema as Youposaijie jing (優婆塞戒經). 7 fascicles.

I want to take the Upāsakaśīla lay person's vows.... but have long gotten out of touch with any sangha here in Eugene. [grim experience]

... we do have two reputable Zen centres, but I don't know what's possible that way and I'm an incremental kind of guy.

Malcolm wrote:

In Mahāyāna you can take the bodhisattva vows without a preceptor, and they include the lay vows.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:29 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Constructelf said:

Yeesh, and the site's called "Dharma Wheel Engaged" too, how did that site of all places become an alt-right hotbed? You'd think that place would be about stuff like Plum Village, Fo Guang Shan, and Buddhist Peace Fellowship, not 4chan lite.

Malcolm wrote:

An old mod from E-Sangha, Retro, aka SethRich, morphed into a right wing nutjob on Dhammawheel. He and Nicholas Weeks tend to dominate that board.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

The intersection of Evangelical Christians and 1/6 Insurrectionists is remarkable. (Like how I slipped that intersection thing in there? LOL)

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly you are a SJW wanker out to destroy my Amerika!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 3:33 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

God died and unmoored a big chunk of humanity.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, the first thing that got old nightbloom riled up was atheism ——> white rage ——> Trump confession ——> now wants to shut down our free discussion of things we care about. Kind of reminds me of old Cheetoh Furher demanding that we stop teaching about racism in school, because little white children might get their feelings hurt. And his ridiculous 1776 commission because he did not like the 1619 project...and we haven't even gotten started on the 1492 project.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 4:08 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

nightbloom said:

My last contribution to this ugly mess (I promise):

I'm not a fascist and I didn't endorse any of what was done on 1/6...

Malcolm wrote:

It started November 4th, and it still continues. But I don't see you turning your back on Trump and fascism. Supporting Trump is supporting fascism. He is a fascist. People who vote for fascists are either dupes or collaborators. Which are you?

nightbloom said:

(which, incidentally, I recognized as an imminent trap for the right before it occurred, since it has provided people like you with the rhetorical justification you need in order to push for increased force/surveillance/exclusion of your enemies).

Malcolm wrote:

You should really get help for that paranoia. I repeat, there are NO microchips in the vaccines.

nightbloom said:

I shouldn't even have to say this, actually, since it has nothing to do with the point I made earlier, and you only said any of this in order to sidestep my remarks about how your total scorn for your political opponents reflects the detachment and narcissism common to your social caste.

Malcolm wrote:

So now you essentialize people on the basis of your perception of their "caste." That really is an alt-right way of looking at the world. It is also petulant, immature, and whiny. Khakis and Tiki torches.

Fascists and their fellow travelers on the right deserve nothing but scorn for their beliefs, and compassion for their intractable, political delusions.

nightbloom said:

Bottom line, to all involved: the abusive nature of the political discourse on this forum is going to harm your practice and the value of this forum (one of the few really decent Buddhist internet resources for English speakers).

Malcolm wrote:

Most of us here don't like fascists and fascist sympathizers. Those who do are wise enough to keep their mouths shut about it.

And remember, you introduced yourself here with a ridiculous spiel about how

"bodhicitta" was preventing you from being vaccinated.

Now buzz off.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 4:39 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Cheeto Führer is bloody hysterical. I'll keep that one!

Malcolm wrote:

He is the only leader (if you can call him that, more like a walking plague) HH Dalai Lama ever parodied in public. That speaks volumes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Cheeto Führer is bloody hysterical. I'll keep that one!

Malcolm wrote:

He is the only leader (if you can call him that, more like a walking plague) HH Dalai Lama ever parodied in public. That speaks volumes.

Norwegian said:

In one interview he even motioned his index finger towards his own head, in a "guy's mentally unhinged" gesture...

Malcolm wrote:

It was even better, HHDL used one hand to imitate Trump's ridiculous and desperate comb-over, and with the other, his tiny little mouth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Gregory Wonderwheel said:

Mind (citta) is unconditioned, does not increase or decrease, is not born or annihilated, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

No, citta just a synonym for vijñāna and manas. They are given different names

depending the frame of reference: conceptual thinking (citta), nonconceptual direct perception (vijñāna) and memory (manas).

Everything in the five aggregates is afflicted and compounded. Of course, everything in the five aggregates ultimately does not arise, cease, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

He did give advice to rulers but that doesn't mean that he occupied political positions.

Malcolm wrote:

One does not have a political position to be involved in politics. If one is giving advice to rulers, that is unavoidably political.

Dharmasherab said:

Spiritual bypassing is a typical catchphrase that is part of the SJW labelling culture to silence any statement which does not fit with their narrative.

Malcolm wrote:

No, "Spiritual bypassing", a term from psychology, refers very specifically using one's religious practice as an excuse not to deal with the world, wars and all. The term was coined in 1984 by a Buddhist practitioner, the late John Welwood, the director of the East/West Psychology program at the California Institute of Integral Studies.

Here is a good definition for you:

Spirituality is a fundamental dimension of wellness. However, scholars have noted that not all spiritual processes are healthy. One of those processes is spiritual bypass, defined as a defensive psychological posture cultivated by a tendency to privilege spiritual beliefs or experiences over and against psychological needs creating a means of avoiding or bypassing difficult emotions or experiences.

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322111006\\_A\\_phenomenology\\_of\\_spiritual\\_bypass\\_Causes\\_consequences\\_and\\_implications](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322111006_A_phenomenology_of_spiritual_bypass_Causes_consequences_and_implications)

Politics is difficult. A lot of people use their spiritual beliefs as an excuse for not dealing that difficulty, fleeing the world, rather than dealing with it. For example, the way Buddha dealt the enslavement of the Śākya. He watched. He did not flee. He observed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 5:37 AM



Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Dependent Origination is the process by which Ignorance (the cause) leads to suffering (the effect).

Malcolm wrote:

More precisely, the way affliction causes karma, which results in suffering. Each of the 12 limbs are either affliction, karma, or suffering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 5:38 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Okay, I'd like to ask you to be civil and on topic. While mocking pumpkin spice ex-president is fun it only derails the topic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

narhwal90 said:

Would you all talk this way in front of Sakyamuni?

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty much.

Just to add, I doubt he would be disturbed our conversation, nor would he be very interested.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:06 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Unknown said:

where John Quincy Adams's campaign painted Andrew Jackson as a murderer

Malcolm wrote:

JQA was correct, actually. Jackson murdered plenty of Creeks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:12 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Unknown said:

“In the 1980s, when I became a Republican, the GOP took pride in describing itself as the ‘party of ideas,’” Boot wrote. “But under (former President Donald) Trump’s leadership, Republicans have reclaimed their old reputation, dating back to the 1950s, as the ‘stupid party.’”

Malcolm wrote:

—Max Boot

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

More precisely, the way affliction causes karma, which results in suffering. Each of the 12 limbs are either affliction, karma, or suffering.

Dharmasherab said:

As in Karma being an offshoot of Samskara?

Malcolm wrote:

The exact scheme is laid out in the Abhidharmakosha, chapter 4.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:28 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Gregory Wonderwheel said:

Mind (citta) is unconditioned, does not increase or decrease, is not born or annihilated, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

No, citta just a synonym for vijñāna and manas. They are given different names depending the frame of reference: conceptual thinking (citta), nonconceptual direct perception (vijñāna) and memory (manas).

Everything in the five aggregates is afflicted and compounded. Of course, everything in the five aggregates ultimately does not arise, cease, etc.

Gregory Wonderwheel said:

No, citta, vijnana, and manas are all different designations for different phenomena of

mind (citta) and are not merely synonyms.

Malcolm wrote:

Take it up with Vasubandhu and Asanga. This is not debatable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Gregory Wonderwheel said:

As I see it, afflictions do not cause our karma,

Malcolm wrote:

Both Vasubandhu and Nagarajuna disagree with you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 10:03 AM

Title: Re: Best way to accept things out of my control?

Content:

Heimdall said:

What's the best way to accept things like that out of my control?

Malcolm wrote:

Enjoy the ride, hold on tight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 8:13 PM

Title: Re: Secret "Keyword Warrants" revealed through mistakenly leaked docs. Scary.

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Have any of you fine people heard about "Keyword Warrants"? Apparently the US government has been secretly ordering Google to turn over data on anyone who googles certain words.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, it's a public platform, not private. Use at your own risk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 8:19 PM

Title: Re: Different Sets of the Bodhisattva Vows

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

Thanks Malcolm... this never occurred to me. But I think going through looking at the sanghas in my environment is worth trying first. I have no idea, beyond two Zen groups and five Tibetan tantric groups what's out there in the Eugene Oregon area. I know Hosso still somewhat exists in Japan, but here in Northwest? I would be floored.

Malcolm wrote:

The yogacara bodhisattva vows are given in Geluk. There is a Geluk center in Portland.

Otherwise, upasaka vows can be received from any upasaka, as long as they know how to impart them correctly.

And if you've ever attended any kind of empowerment at all, you have them already. And they are restored by the simple act of reciting the seven limb prayer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Dan74 said:

Political threads on DW are basically a club with a homogenous agenda and very little robust debate. Out of the regulars, only JD sometimes tries for balance and if anyone else steps in to question some of the prevailing views, they are promptly set upon and it's not pretty. I've given up and suggest you do too and leave people to their fun.

Malcolm wrote:

Debate is only possible when there are agreed upon facts. Trumpistas live in a fact-free universe of slogans and prejudices, much like fascists of every stripe, and some left-wing populists as well. These people openly supported an overthrow of the US gvt. Trump, etc., have certainly lost the right to hold office again under the fourteenth amendment. It remains to be seen if the GOP grows some balls, but I doubt it. They have been totally cowed by the Cheetoh Furher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

PeterC said:

One of the major problems with politics in the US is the absence of a political group that

supports the idea that the state should provide everyone with a basic, decent quality of life. That people should be able to be free from fear of not having food, medical care, education, housing - in short, that they can survive. This is not an ideal that is embraced by the Democratic party, except for a few within them, and those few are marginalized.

Malcolm wrote:

The progressive wing is getting stronger. The sign of that is that Biden largely supports our agenda.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

Something to be said about the leadership of a simple and flawed but idealistic Irishman who knows he's meeting God sooner than later.

Malcolm wrote:

He understands that the true reason Trump squeaked by 2016 was electoral apathy in the face of sustained GOP slash and burn of the social safety net. That, and rampant, engineered sexism towards HRC.

The GOP can't win on the merits anymore, they know that, so they resort to electoral necromancy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Effort to supplant Tibetan language

Content:

Queequeg said:

I don't know if they will succeed in snuffing out the minority languages, but its kind of comical that they're trying to convert everyone to one of the most complicated and inefficient written lanaguages.

These Han. smh.

Malcolm wrote:

The reality is that Chinese is already the default language of educated Tibetans in the PRC and has been for years, partly because the regional dialects of Tibetans are largely unintelligible to one another.

The ones who suffer are rural Tibetans who refuse to learn Chinese.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:19 PM

Title: Re: Dependent Origination in One Sentence

Content:

Queequeg said:

I suspect you guys are comparing different descriptive formulations that use common vocabulary with different meanings.

Malcolm wrote:

We are talking about aggregates here. The Manovijnana includes all minds, citta, etc.

But at base I am right, as a quick perusal of the dhatu chapter of the Kosha will show.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: Meditation posture...straight arms, 'vulture shoulders'...how common is it ?

Content:

lhaksam.dorje said:

It seems rare to see images of people (yogis, deities, anyone) in this posture. Is this a fringe Kagyu thing ?

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is not a fringe Kagyu thing. This is common in all schools when doing certain prāṇāyāma practices.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:46 PM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I listened to it quite a while ago. I think he makes excellent points. He addresses the objections that have been brought up in this thread. The foundation is essentially that the priority is that which can make lasting change for the most significant number of people.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a pretty funny thing to say for a man whose monarch is the titular head of the

Church of England. In 2011, only 0.5 percent of the population of England was Buddhist. His principle teacher, and mine, has been the political head of a refugee community since 1959. The Sakya Throne holders are one of the oldest political families in the world, barring only the Japanese Emperor.

I have nothing against David Stott (Jampa Thaye) personally. I am sure he is a nice fellow. But I think his views on politics are at best, quaint. For example, he opposes women's choice, usually a position associated with religious conservatives—though it has been hotly denied here that Stott is a conservative at all.

Zhen Li said:

That means the primary focus is attaining Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

99.99 percent of Buddhists won't even attain the path of seeing in this life. Are they to stick their heads in the sand while the world roles over them and their loved ones like a Juggernaut? Certainly the Buddha did not recommend this for upāsakas.

Zhen Li said:

On a secondary level, in this life, we should do good and recognise that the avenues by which people pursue doing good by political means are either disingenuous or useless.

Malcolm wrote:

So, Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., HH Dalai Lama, Bishop Tutu are doing useless things? HH Dalai Lama is a liberal by any standard. He is a staunch supporter of democracy, and political engagement. Why? Because Tibet turned its back on the world, and as a result, was invaded by the PRC:

For thousands of years people have been led to believe that only an authoritarian organization employing rigid disciplinary methods could govern human society. However, because people have an innate desire for freedom, the forces of liberty and oppression have been in continuous conflict throughout history. Today, it is clear which is winning. The emergence of peoples' power movements, overthrowing dictatorships of left and right, has shown indisputably that the human race can neither tolerate nor function properly under tyranny.

Although none of our Buddhist societies developed anything like democracy in their systems of government, I personally have great admiration for secular democracy. When Tibet was still free, we cultivated our natural isolation, mistakenly thinking that we could prolong our peace and security that way. Consequently, we paid little attention to the changes taking place in the world outside. We hardly noticed when India, one of our closest neighbours, having peacefully won her independence, became the largest democracy in the world. Later, we learned the hard way that in the international arena, as well as at home, freedom is something to be shared and enjoyed in the company of others, not kept to yourself.

<https://www.dalailama.com/messages/buddhism/buddhism-and-democracy>

[HHDL was not invited to the White House of Herr Trump. People should note that.]

If I had to choose between Mr. Stott's vision of the world, and HH Dalai Lama's vision, well, you know I will choose the latter. His Holiness is the foremost human being alive today. May he continue to enjoy long life and health for the benefit of us all on this small globe in space.

Zhen Li said:

By the way, offering advice to politicians is not the same as getting involved in contemporary democratic politics. Current political systems attempt to be all-encompassing and give all citizens the illusion that they are a part of it. This is an aberration in world history.

Malcolm wrote:

So you are skeptical of representative democracy. Ok. Noted.

Zhen Li said:

Politics in the past was the matter of private family property on the part of ruling dynasties.

Malcolm wrote:

Not everywhere in history. For example, the Śākya tribe elected their chief. It was not, as has been misunderstood, a hereditary position, like the Kṣatriya varna.

Zhen Li said:

It is safe to say that the Buddha did not address the issue of involvement in politics at all, except that discussing politics constitutes wrong speech.

Malcolm wrote:

Citation please.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

PeterC said:

Every possible term has been occupied by one side or another. We're missing a neutral, commonly-agreed term to refer to people as people.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess we need to Occupy Merriam-Webster's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 9:56 PM



Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

We've always known that we needed someone who would just commit to policies that actually help regular people.

Malcolm wrote:

We've had those policies. They keep being gutted.

Biden knows this, and sided with Sanders. But unfortunately, there are two people in the Senate who are more interested in serving themselves than serving the 44 million people majority they represent as a whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 10:02 PM

Title: Re: Secret "Keyword Warrants" revealed through mistakenly leaked docs. Scary.

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Although if they have some kind of secret agreement that puts you at risk, you don't have all the information at hand to evaluate whether or not you should use the service.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, in this case, I support that. People who survive sexual assaults need to be protected, and abusers often track people down, sometimes years after the crimes.

The issue identified in this article is that the feds actually identified one of the victims accidentally-- this is mostly a problem of unregulated tech. Google, Facebook, etc. need to be broken up.

But, honestly, if a keyword search subpoena results in someone being convicted for 1/6/21...I am all for it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Largest Buddha statues in the world (top 10)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My personal favorite:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Attain assurance of birth in the Pure Land; that's the only way in this age. The Buddha didn't advocate political action but liberation.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddha did not advocate liberation for everyone. Only for those who departed to the homeless life. For lay people, he certainly advocated they participate in their community life and so on.

As for assurance of birth in the pure land, there is no nirvana somewhere other than samsara. Seeking nirvana apart from samsara will never work. Instead, as Nāgārjuna quips, thorough knowledge of samsara is nirvana.

<https://suttacentral.net/dn2/en/sujato> said:

There are some ascetics and brahmins who, while enjoying food given in faith, still engage in unworthy talk. This includes such topics as talk about kings, bandits, and ministers; talk about armies, threats, and wars; talk about food, drink, clothes, and beds; talk about garlands and fragrances; talk about family, vehicles, villages, towns, cities, and countries; talk about women and heroes; street talk and well talk; talk about the departed; motley talk; tales of land and sea; and talk about being reborn in this or that state of existence. They refrain from such unworthy talk. This pertains to their ethics.

Malcolm wrote:

This is fine for śrāvakayānis. But we are Mahāyānis, at least I am. The Buddha taught:

Upāli, bodhisattvas are not deceived by and do not fear afflictions that gather beings together; but bodhisattvas are deceived by and fear the afflictions that forsake beings.

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh68.html#UT22084-043-005-154>

This sūtra should be required reading for Mahāyānis.

The purpose of democracy is "to form a more perfect union," to bring people together through their common desires and goals. You may not believe that, but I personally am a strong advocate of secular democracy, as is HHDL.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

There's no evidence that the Śākyas elected their Mahārāja...There is not a shred of evidence to support it.

Malcolm wrote:

So you claim. But there is evidence that the Buddha was familiar with the concept of electing chieftains as found in the Aggañña Sutta, etc. The reference to the Kṣatriyas in this sutta could very well be post Aśoka interpolation, considering Bronkhorst's pretty convincing argument that the Śākas were outside the Vedic caste system entirely.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

If the "Trumpistas" are in a fact free universe...debate should be permitted.

Malcolm wrote:

Not anymore. They lost that right with the insurrection.

Heimdall said:

Less well known [than other paradoxes] is the paradox of tolerance: Unlimited tolerance must lead to the disappearance of tolerance. If we extend unlimited tolerance even to those who are intolerant, if we are not prepared to defend a tolerant society against the onslaught of the intolerant, then the tolerant will be destroyed, and tolerance with them.—In this formulation, I do not imply, for instance, that we should always suppress the utterance of intolerant philosophies; as long as we can counter them by rational argument and keep them in check by public opinion, suppression would certainly be most unwise. But we should claim the right to suppress them if necessary even by force; for it may easily turn out that they are not prepared to meet us on the level of rational argument, but begin by denouncing all argument; they may forbid their followers to listen to rational argument, because it is deceptive, and teach them to answer arguments by the use of their fists or pistols. We should therefore claim, in the name of tolerance, the right not to tolerate the intolerant. We should claim that any movement preaching intolerance places itself outside the law and we should consider incitement to intolerance and persecution as criminal, in the same way as we should consider incitement to murder, or to kidnapping, or to the revival of the slave trade, as criminal.

Malcolm wrote:

--Karl Popper, An Open Society and its Enemies.

Heimdall said:

If "being morally correct" means believing that a politician is a secret hidden fascist that you have to figure out through the dog-whistles, and if you vote for that politician because of the hidden fascism,

Malcolm wrote:

Trump's fascism is hardly hidden. Its been out in the open all along, along with his racism and xenophobia.

Heimdall said:

Calling right-wingers Nazis is just as callous as the right calling you guys "closet commies" by the way.

Malcolm wrote:

I agree. I would never call Max Boot, David Frum, George Will, William F. Buckley Jr., etc., fascists. I reserve that for the people who support Trump's false claims.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 7th, 2021 at 11:33 PM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Queequeg said:

More conservative talking points. People in glass houses, buddy.

Malcolm wrote:

He is a libertarian. He voted for the guy who ran on legalizing weed. He threw his vote away on Gary Johnson in 2016 and wasted his vote in 2020, buy his own admission.

Libertarians are weird.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

Clinton was a sociopath whose political principles change on a whim on whatever gets her more power.

Malcolm wrote:

She was certainly ambitious, sociopath, not so much, unless one thinks all ambitious people are sociopaths.

Heimdall said:

Gary Johnson may have been a pot head, but I thought he would've been the best candidate.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok. Voting for third parties wastes your vote.

Heimdall said:

I was too disillusioned in 2020 to vote.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to be more pragmatic, not so emotional. Now, before you go off and tell me I am emotional. I am not, really. I'm just mean.

Heimdall said:

Doesn't change the fact, that they are conservative talking points, and they aren't invalid.

Malcolm wrote:

Conservative talking points these days rarely stand on the merits. Mostly they are just warmed over Hayek/Nozick-style libertarianism: i.e., the function of the state is merely to provide security for markets, and that's about it; central planning of the economy, bad; free markets, good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 12:11 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

The question if it being an insurrection is still hotly debated because the only evidence supporting insurrection is Trump's flaming rhetoric contesting the election, which galvanized supporters to breach the government's buildings - It's not an evident fact like Hitler's "Beer Hall Putsch"

Malcolm wrote:

You really have not been paying attention. Let me guess, you refuse to read the Times, the Post, etc., like our buddy, nightbloom.

Trump's peeps had a systematic plan, which they executed, to try and overturn the election illegally. And yes, it is an evident fact.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 12:35 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

She was certainly ambitious, sociopath, not so much, unless one thinks all ambitious people are sociopaths.

Heimdall said:

She changes her political positions every 4 years. In 2012 she thought the Republicans were stuck in the Cold War days and tried to "reset" relations with Russia; from 2016 onwards now she thinks that Russia is such a subversive political enemy that they hijacked the elections and are primary enemy numero uno.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean you expect people to just have the same outlook day in and day out, without changing their perspective?

Heimdall said:

She was one of the most outspoken opponents of gay marriage from the the early 2000s to 2008, where she suddenly shifted her opinion.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, she is a methodist.

Heimdall said:

From the 90s she was for international free trade via NAFTA, then during the 2016 election she was against it suggesting that NAFTA needed to be changed, and then when Trump started contesting China's trade practices she thought it was World War III with Trump affecting our economic relations with China.

Malcolm wrote:

She was right.

Heimdall said:

Also, American capitalistic growth has become so obscenely large thanks to technology and the internet that if you want to get to the top of the private sector business world, no amount of ambition will save you from the sharks who will devour you without a second of remorse, because competition is simply that intense.

Malcolm wrote:

What does that have to do with HRC?

Heimdall said:

Your father is a lawyer...

Malcolm wrote:

My late father was a college professor at Smith and a small town defense lawyer. He never worked in a firm. He was a conservative republican in a hyper-liberal community.

Heimdall said:

And really, Trump is just as ambitious as Clinton is - the only difference is that Trump

manifests his sociopathy through honesty, Clinton hides it by checking the marks on "appropriate" social behavior - but studying her only reveals she's really no different than Trump

Malcolm wrote:

We can agree to disagree. I personally think she is a victim of a sustained, 25 year, sexist smear campaign. Don't get me wrong, I voted for her out of necessity. I don't care for her personally. But I am sufficiently mature that what I value in a candidate is competence, not perfection, and HRC was a very competent secretary of state, she was also a decent senator. Yes, the DNC screwed Bernie, but parties are private organizations, and are not part of the Constitution, and the judge ruled that Bernie had no case.

She is quite different from Trump. She stepped aside. She could have contested those 77,000 votes, demanded recounts and so on. But she did not. She accepted that she lost the Electoral College even though she won the popular election by 4 million plus votes. She played by the rules. He did not. She understands how to govern. He is a dangerous grifter whose only interest is lining his pockets at our expense. She would have made a fine president.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 12:36 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

I also try to avoid sensationalist headlines because of how misleading they can be.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you don't read the articles below the headlines. SMH.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 12:58 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You mean you expect people to just have the same outlook day in and day out, without changing their perspective?

Heimdall said:

Not when it's every 3 years and whenever it just so happens to be politically expedient. She changes her opinion on many things whenever it's politically expedient.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, that's politics.

Heimdall said:

I don't think there's been a single issue that she agreed with Trump on; despite being very nationalistic, he had some genuine Liberal beliefs like foreign policy and international trade.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm...we really must disagree here. He hired a dumpster fire for a professor, Peter Navarro, who is a true kook, to handle his international trade policy. His foreign policy amounted to bending over for Putin at every turn and alienating every leader in the EU. His "foreign policy" was a series of photo ops for the rubes back home and nothing more. Pompeo was a walking nightmare, believe me, I have friends who work at State. Trump dismantled the State Dpt., and ruined 75 years of delicate diplomacy. Ted Cruz, whom I could refer to with some choice words, is interfering with its rehabilitation under Biden. Frankly, Trump is the most incompetent president that was ever elected.

Heimdall said:

That suggests she doesn't have a real valid vision for the country. Sanders had a vision. Clinton does not.

Malcolm wrote:

One does not need a vision to govern. One needs to understand how to govern. People place too much importance on things like "new ideas," "vision." Bernie does not have "vision." He wants to, and I agree, to restore the New Deal and the Great Society and improve it. That's called "governing." Not "vision."

Heimdall said:

While I disagree with Sanders's idealism, I would've voted for him had he won the primaries.

Malcolm wrote:

We can agree on that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

My only moralizing criticism has been criticism of moralizing.

Malcolm wrote:

Pot, kettle, black.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:25 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

I disagree, I think what's appealing with conservatism is this (genuine) feeling that our nation's metanarrative has been subverted by materialistic corporate Liberal elites into this weird conception of "Giant corporations know what's best for the country" that uses this Pseudo Social-Justice paradigm to censor opposition.

Malcolm wrote:

The paragraph you just wrote is mere jingoistic claptrap.

Heimdall said:

Example: the mayor of Philadelphia, Jim Kenney, is so insanely corrupt and connected to giant corporate entities it's ridiculous. Yet he will lecture you to your face about how he's helping black communities through diversity programs, and how you're bigoted if you oppose his policies.

Malcolm wrote:

So I guess you are saying that you are both anti-capitalist and anti-liberal.

Heimdall said:

This country is no longer about individual liberty, democracy, and equal opportunity for all. It's now a Neo-Feudalistic society where the people commanding the masses aren't people wearing gold crowns and celibate Italians in Red and White tunics - rather, it's a caste of wealthy narcissists wearing suits and ties.

Malcolm wrote:

This country was founded by men of their age, some of whom, like Franklin, opined that the only people who ought to be allowed into government service were the descendents of the original patriots. This country was founded by rich white men, for rich white men, on behalf of, you guessed it, rich white men. This country was not, originally founded on the ideals of equal opportunity for all. It was founded on the idea of equal opportunity for a white, landed gentry.

When Washington was elected, 1789, only 6% percent of the population of the US was eligible to vote. In 1790, the immigration act was passed, declaring that only free white immigrants could naturalize. It was only in 1856 that every state permitted all white men to vote. In 1870, the 15th amendment was passed, allowing black men to vote. Jim Crow was promptly instituted. Women were not permitted to vote until 1920. While Native people were granted citizenship in 1924, they were not permitted the vote in US Elections in every state until the year I was born, 1962.

Now, what was that about this country being about liberty, democracy, and equal opportunity for all? If one is black, non-white, or female, your liberty, democracy, and equal opportunity was a hard-won battle fought against rich white men. And it still is.

Here is a useful guide for you to see the history of voting rights in the US:

<https://a.s.kqed.net/pdf/education/digitalmedia/us-voting-rights-timeline.pdf>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

Agree to disagree; while Trump's foreign policy was bad in many areas; relatively speaking, I thought it was a step up in many areas compared to Obama and Bush.

Malcolm wrote:

Trump didn't do anything. Compared to Obama, he was an obvious putz when it came to international affairs. He did not even invite HH Dalai Lama to the White House, a blunder of epic proportions. Instead he wasted his time trying to win over the North Koreans who have no reason to love us at all.

Heimdall said:

Fair point, but proper governing, in my opinion, includes some level of transparency regarding what you hope to achieve.

Malcolm wrote:

HRC is a neoliberal globalist. Like me. The only reason that policy led to Trump was burning up the New Deal under Bill Clinton. That was the Democrats fatal error. And why did they do it? Vision instead of governance. But I am quite certain HRC would not have made the same errors as her hubby.

In my ideal world there would be international free trade, open borders, and safety nets in all countries. But that requires a level of ability to govern that human beings have not yet achieved, and possibly never will.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

Furthering my point, the whole association of the United States with Free Market economics was a product of the 19th century...

Malcolm wrote:

Clay's American System was economically disastrous for the the US in the long run. Trump's attempt to resurrect, under the bad advice of Bannon and Navarro, was ill-advised, just as it failed under Hoover, when he tried to resurrect it. It was inevitable that the US would adopt the British System.

Heimdall said:

No, I'm against unregulated capitalism to a degree as it currently exists, and I'm anti-Liberal.

Malcolm wrote:

Your second statement is meaningless. You have not defined who it is that you mean, unless of course, it is just Democrats in general, which is silly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

I think as significant as unregulated capitalism is the degree to which capitalism has negatively affected our culture, including "the only goal in life is to work for a giant company, be wealthy, and have sex with pretty people"

Malcolm wrote:

News for you friend, capitalism is the religion of America.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Thinking of abandoning Buddhism and its teachings

Content:

Bikkhu87 said:

I have been thinking for a long time that Buddhism is perhaps not for me,

Malcolm wrote:

You don't have a teacher, that's your main problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:  
Contemporary Progressive Ideology.

Malcolm wrote:  
Well, so you oppose universal health care, vastly reducing military expenditure, mitigating climate change, immigration reform, abortion rights, taxing the ultra wealthy, repairing our national infrastructure, etc.? Because that's what constitutes the core ideology of contemporary progressives.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 2:16 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Heimdall said:  
One of my fears of contemporary Liberalism is how contaminated it is by that cultural narrative. It evidently is.

Malcolm wrote:  
I don't think you have a sound grasp of history——Capitalism and Liberalism have been hand in glove since Adam Smith (granted, however, that his Theory of Moral Sentiments is a more important book).

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 3:16 AM  
Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life  
Content:

Heimdall said:  
One of my fears of contemporary Liberalism is how contaminated it is by that cultural narrative. It evidently is.

Malcolm wrote:  
I don't think you have a sound grasp of history——Capitalism and Liberalism have been hand in glove since Adam Smith (granted, however, that his Theory of Moral Sentiments is a more important book).

Heimdall said:  
Socialism as a concept didn't exist at the time of Adam Smith. Try again.

Malcolm wrote:  
Trivial distinction. Adam Smith may not have used the term capitalism to describe his observations about political economy, but he was skeptical of trade barriers and

correctly saw that tariffs were regressive instruments. He was one of the first people to argue for international trade liberalization. He was not an advocate of unregulated markets, but he was generally opposed to tariffs. And he was certainly a capitalist, as was the Buddha. Compare these two statements: "Capitol is that part of man's stock which he expects to afford him revenue."

By dividing wealth into four parts,  
True friendships are bound;  
One part should be enjoyed;  
Two parts invested in business;  
And the fourth set aside  
Against future misfortunes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

because Progressive ideology encompasses certain philosophical outlooks I disagree with

Malcolm wrote:

Such as, apart from CRT, which you clearly do not understand...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

ronnymarsh said:

This is the dating originated from Theravada literature, our tradition puts its existence around the 10th century BC.

Malcolm wrote:

No, for example, Śākyasrībhadra places the Buddha's parinirvana roughly at the same time as the conventional dating suggests.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 7:51 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

In the following line, the Buddha admits that desire ("afflictions that gather") is still a minor misdeed.

Malcolm wrote:

Which he states is of no consequence, since bodhisattvas don't mind remaining in samsara for a long while.

And you seem to forget, I follow uncommon Mahayana.

More tomorrow.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 8:06 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think you have a sound grasp of history—Capitalism and Liberalism have been hand in glove since Adam Smith (granted, however, that his Theory of Moral Sentiments is a more important book).

Heimdall said:

Socialism as a concept didn't exist at the time of Adam Smith. Try again.

Tlalok said:

Henri de Saint-Simon. Socialism (although not with that name) absolutely existed at the time of Adam Smith. What are you on about?

Republicans, before they went mask off (lol) and revealed themselves to be Nativists / Fascists / Christian Dominationists were classical liberals.

When cornered, internet alt-rightistas will resort to word-salad as an attempt to drown the discourse, it's a classic tactic when your arguments are facile.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it's it's called, "if you can't bedazzle them with your brilliance, baffle them with your bullshit."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 8:08 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

You guys can refute me as Liberal internet crusaders defeating cis-fascist scum or whatever

Caoimhghín said:

Where on earth, save for your own obsessed mind, do trans issues have any part in anything said in this thread?

Heimdall said:

By virtue of being part of contemporary progressive ideology

Malcolm wrote:

So, you have a problem with trans people too? Is it philosophical, or does it have to do with how or where they pee?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 8:11 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

The ideology behind it is.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean Caitlyn Jennings is a progressive ideologue? That's news to me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 8:39 AM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

What are we talking about here, a stapler and some paper clips?

Malcolm wrote:

In the Sakya school, even so much as a rice husk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 10:10 AM

Title: Re: Authoritarianism and the Meaning of Life

Content:

Heimdall said:

The ideology behind it is.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean Caitlyn Jennings is a progressive ideologue? That's news to me.

KristenM said:

I think you mean Caitlyn Jenner. Caitlyn Jennings is a trans country music star, and probably a great name for a cowpunk band.

Malcolm wrote:  
Either will do.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 10:22 AM  
Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?  
Content:

Zhen Li said:  
In fact, the approach taken by Shinran is the same, although it comes at the topic from a different direction. But this does not transform the nature of śīla, it just reframes it: Shinran wrote in a letter, "Do not take a liking to poison just because there is an antidote." This was in order to put an end to that wrong understanding. It by no means implies that evil can obstruct one's attainment of birth.

Malcolm wrote:  
The reason why peacocks have brilliant plumage is that they live on poisonous plants in the jungle. The reason the fire of gnosis blazes is that it is fueled by affliction.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 10:37 AM  
Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?  
Content:

Koso Wasan 40 said:  
Obstructions of karmic evil turn into virtues;  
It is like the relation of ice and water:  
The more the ice, the more the water;  
The more the obstructions, the more the virtues.

Zhen Li said:  
This doesn't mean "go out looking for trouble," so to say.

Malcolm wrote:  
In the end, the point of the sutra passage I shared with you is that whatever one does, including politics, and everything mentioned in that sutra passage you quoted, is positive as long as it is combined with aspirational bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 7:43 PM  
Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?  
Content:

Zhen Li said:



In my opinion just mixing is not the point. The primary motivation should be bodhicitta. Otherwise, people will take it as a license to do evil. In this way also we have to be careful of to whom one is giving what teaching.

Malcolm wrote:

As bodhisattvas, desire is workable. Anger is not. The perfect, they say, is the enemy of the good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 7:49 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Heimdall said:

So in Vajrayana and Mahayana Buddhism, prayers or mantras are said to purify Karma; that is, to nip it and face its consequences now rather than later.

How exactly does this work? Is it your own internal recognition which does it? For the mantras said to particular Buddhas and Bodhisattvas (mainly in Vajrayana), do the beings themselves purify the Karma? Are the Buddhas synonymous with Karma itself, so that identifying the karma through them means you will experience less devastating effects?

Malcolm wrote:

It's the four powers of confession that serve this function, there is the object in front of whom one is confessing, remorse for misdeeds and downfalls, confidence that the deed has been purified, and resolve not to engage in such deeds again.

But, since we have been in samsara since beginningless time, it is unrealistic to imagine all one's karma and its traces can be purified.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 8:55 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Aemilius said:

I wonder, if Vasubandhu recited and followed the Bodhisattva pratimoksha, and discussed with his brother Asanga and Asanga's community of Mahayanists, how could he have been living in a Sravakayana community?

Malcolm wrote:

They were bhikkhus. Simple as that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

thomaslaw said:

You consider Tantric deity practices in Buddhism were/are nontheists and atheists.

Could you give some explanations or concrete details for that? Thanks.

Aemilius said:

The dictionary definition of theism is that you believe in the existence of one or several supernatural beings. In this sense Buddha himself is a theist, because the beings in the six realms exist, and enlightened beings exist.

Buddhism is considered atheist or nastika in Indian traditional thought. You can look at the concepts astika and nastika.

An important point is that Buddhism denies that world is created by Ishvara or some other divinity; self and world are created by Pratitya samutpada, Dependent origination, according to the Dharma.

Buddha teaches that deities cannot do so much for one self as one's own well directed mind can do for one self (Dhammapada).

Some Suttas where Buddha discusses with Devas [http://buddhadust.net/dhamma-vinaya/pts/sn/01\\_sagv/sn01.02.001-010.rhyc.pts.htm](http://buddhadust.net/dhamma-vinaya/pts/sn/01_sagv/sn01.02.001-010.rhyc.pts.htm)

thomaslaw said:

Thanks for your reply.

Yes, I agree with you; I do not have any issues regarding Buddhism is non-theistic but also not atheistic, according to the mentioned basic Buddhist teachings/dharmas (such as the six realms, Dependent origination) based on the suttas/sutras.

But my question is: Why do you consider Tantric deity practices were/are nontheists and atheists?

Malcolm wrote:

Because they are generally applied Abhidharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

In other words, call yourself an atheist if you want; yet there's little reason to believe that doing so is this profound or great thing, or insist on an implication that others ought to do so.

Malcolm wrote:

What one labels oneself is irrelevant. Buddhism negates two fundamental tenets of theism: 1. uncaused creation of the universe and its inhabitants by a supreme being. 2. Salvation dependent on a relationship with said supreme being. In other words, no god created you, and Jesus/Allah, etc. are not going to save you.

If you ask any theist, they will tell you you are an atheist for denying creation and salvation. They won't give a fig about your acceptance of rebirth, worldly devas in the deva realms, and so on. To them, you are a godless atheist. And they are right.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 8th, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

As I've pointed out here before (not just to you two^, but to anyone reading here), the texts and many Lineage Masters have said that before the Path of Seeing, it's not possible to help sentient beings (of course in the meantime, obviously aim to not harm them); and stay in solitude doing practice at least until you attain the First Bhumi.

Malcolm wrote:

Huge copout.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes?

Content:

bodhiye said:

I just learned that a Rinpoche (connected to a translating project) isn't a monk but is an upasaka. I read that one lineage head who was in the news recently for some alleged acts isn't a monk. Both persons dress like monks. I assumed they are fully ordained, vinaya observing Bhikshus based on their attire and appearance.

Malcolm wrote:

Business suit.

bodhiye said:

Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes? Are non-Bhikshus permitted to wear attires that resemble a monk's robes?

Malcolm wrote:

Because they were raised in monasteries, had received śrāmanera vows at some point, and are more comfortable in that attire than upāsaka attire. And these Lamas are usually Nyingmapas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Atheism is so ubiquitously associated with "scientific skepticism" that the two are often synonymous for people.

Malcolm wrote:

Good, Buddhists are skeptics too. That's why in ancient India, they had the most robust epistemology and were the only school which argued that their tenets should be accepted on the basis of rationality and confirmation, rather than acceptance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's the four powers of confession that serve thus function, there is the object in front of whom one is confessing, remorse for misdeeds and downfalls, confidence that the deed has been purified, and resolve not to engage in such deeds again.

But, since we have been in samsara since beginningless time, it is unrealistic to imagine all ones karma and its traces can be purified.

Sādhaka said:

In the above manner at any rate.

Malcolm wrote:

This system of four powers is also shared with Vajrasattva.

There is no way to remove all the karmic traces from beginningless time. What one can do is attain buddhahood, and prevent them from meeting conditions for ripening. Good Luck!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

would be time much better spent than debating politics.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, well, since you disapprove of such things, don't do it.

But here we are not talking about politics, and one common misconception about Buddhism is that it is religion on par with other theistic religions.

Sādhaka said:

DALAI LAMA: If you reach some higher spiritual experience, spiritual state, then I think it is difficult. The Buddhist concept — everything comes and happen due to law of causality: cause and effect, cause and effect, cause and effect. This indicates there's no central, absolute cause or creator. So since Buddhism do not have a concept of creator, some scholars say Buddhism is not a religion, but science of mind. So Buddhism also kind of atheism.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.pbs.org/wnet/religionandethics/1999/06/04/june-4-1999-the-dalai-lama/13354/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Atheism is so ubiquitously associated with "scientific skepticism" that the two are often synonymous for people.

Malcolm wrote:

Good, Buddhists are skeptics too. That's why in ancient India, they had the most robust epistemology and were the only school which argued that their tenets should be accepted on the basis of rationality and confirmation, rather than acceptance.

Caoimhghín said:

Not skeptics in the same sense, they weren't.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty much. Candra notes the only difference between us and lokayatis is that we accept karma and rebirth. Otherwise, not much difference.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

Toenail said:

Also it has no single owner.

Malcolm wrote:

Legally, like in the US, in Germany corporations are persons, so yes, it does have a single owner, just to clarify that for you.

Crazywisdom said:

Those are idiot laws about the rights of fictional persons, who's rights and privileges exceed natural person's. See deities everywhere rob them blind.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, since they are laws, we are bound to respect them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 2:29 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

commences at rigpa'i tsal wang.

Malcolm wrote:

This does not guarantee anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 3:45 AM

Title: Re: Illuminating deep dive into CRT and its ideological underpinnings from a socialist perspective

Content:

Archie2009 said:

A very worthwhile long read from a Marxist perspective.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty much annihilates the contention of yourself and others that CRT is Marxist in inspiration:

The pseudo-left tendencies in the orbit of the Democratic Party, for their part, are arguing that, in one or another way, critical race theory and similar postmodern identity theories should be appreciated by socialists or even harmonized with Marxism.

....

While genuine Marxists certainly oppose the drive by the Republicans to purge the schools of “unpatriotic” literature, it must be made clear that critical race theory, for its part, has absolutely nothing in common with Marxism. And is replete with the usual circular firing squad tendencies of the far left.

And the usual, laughable assertions that Marx is "scientific": What Marx discovered was nothing less than the law-governed dynamic driving the development of human civilization, based on a scientific examination of the development of productive forces, tracing the way that social classes correspond to specific social relations of production which arise from and then come into contradiction with those forces. Looking back over the entire preceding history of mankind, Marx was able to confirm everywhere the operation of these laws of socioeconomic development, providing new insight into the past. What a bunch of jingoistic drivel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 3:53 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

“The hook of compassion and the ring of faith.”

I guess somebody should tell the lamas to eliminate that teaching.

Malcolm wrote:

So you think that atheists are incapable of compassion and faith. Interesting. False, but interesting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Matt J said:

Very few lamas would survive the august critiques of Dharmawheel.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

“The hook of compassion and the ring of faith.”

I guess somebody should tell the lamas to eliminate that teaching.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, they squabble amongst themselves on Tibetan language websites all the time, with equal fervor. You should have seen the years long debate over whether ChNN was a

Bonpo or not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 3:57 AM

Title: Re: Thinking of abandoning Buddhism and its teachings

Content:

Matt J said:

Such ideas fundamentally misunderstand what it means to be conscious. Logically, adopting such ideas leads one to the Dan Dennett situation of denying that there is any consciousness at all, which is patently absurd.

Malcolm wrote:

In Dennett's case, it must true. The man is a mere automaton spewing bad ideas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 4:01 AM

Title: Re: Illuminating deep dive into CRT and its ideological underpinnings from a socialist perspective

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Still, a very worthwhile read in exposing the influence of postmodernism etc. on your beloved anti-scientific 'social justice' movement.

Malcolm wrote:

And Marxism is scientific? Oh please. Give me a break.

The so-called social justice movement aka the civil rights movement, never pretended to be "scientific." I have no idea where you got this idea, nor why it is of any particular value that social justice movements be "scientific."

And as far as postmodernism goes, what's wrong with postmodernism? I mean, postmodernism isn't very modern anymore. Postmodernism is just warmed over structuralism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 4:07 AM

Title: Re: Illuminating deep dive into CRT and its ideological underpinnings from a socialist perspective

Content:

Malcolm wrote:



BTW, got love the millenarian impulse of the closing paragraph.

Unknown said:

The coming revolutionary upheavals around the world will bring hundreds of millions of people into struggle. The forces exerted on the revolutionary movement will be tremendous. A movement that is cracked and fractured along racial or national or gender lines will not be able to withstand those forces and will quickly break apart the moment real pressure is brought to bear. A world movement that can weather the revolutionary maelstrom must be prepared to advance a unified world perspective, applicable to all workers, from a shared understanding of its own history to its basic philosophical foundations and method, class orientation, conception of the epoch and strategy for victory. This is the real strength of a political movement—the glue that will hold it together through any crisis.

Malcolm wrote:

Poor Marxists. They are just like Christians and Muslims, anticipating a world revolution (judgement day) that will never happen (thank goodness).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

I think that though some teachers did those things I think fewer are likely to get away with it now and nor should they be allowed to.

Malcolm wrote:

There are terms of Padmasambhava, I won't reveal which one, that detail methods for consecrating beautiful young women as "liberation through touch." There are a lot of things in Vajrayāna that will really upset you. I suggest you don't look too hard at it. Vajrayāna is not for people with lots of concepts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 5:24 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Not skeptics in the same sense, they weren't.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty much. Candra notes the only difference between us and lokayatis is that we accept karma and rebirth. Otherwise, not much difference.

Caoimhghín said:

Did the Lokāyatas accept their own form of Buddhas? I guess everyone is a Buddha one they're dead according to them?

Malcolm wrote:

Lokayatis are Hedonists on the lines of Epicurean Hedonists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Matt J said:

I've found that they seem to work not by eliminating one's karma, but accelerating the fruition.

Könchok Thrinley said:

This is a point I have seen quite often. And I mean ... it probably kind of probably works like that but I am not sure entirely. Anyone has something to back this point?

Malcolm wrote:

This is a popular idea in the west. I have never ever seen any Indian or Tibetan text that makes this assertion. I think it can be consigned to the dustbin of pop Buddhism, personally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 6:24 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Take it up with the Lineage Masters:

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a copout for them, the copout is yours. You are using their words as an excuse to inaction. "Oh, I have not realized emptiness, so, I am just going have nice thoughts and prayers for the suffering in the world, but I am not going to actually do anything about it, because I am just a poor unawakened schmuck in samsara."

If anything the Jataka tales should inform you to have exactly the opposite approach. What lineage master is great than the Buddha? Where's your bodhisattva courage?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 6:43 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

I think that though some teachers did those things I think fewer are likely to get away with it now and nor should they be allowed to.

Malcolm wrote:

There are terms of Padmasambhava, I won't reveal which one, that detail methods for consecrating beautiful young women as "liberation through touch." There are a lot of things in Vajrayāna that will really upset you. I suggest you don't look too hard at it. Vajrayāna is not for people with lots of concepts.

Knotty Veneer said:

I know these stories of outrageous acts are titillating and exciting but they should not be used to continue a culture where people are abused. In 25 years as a practitioner, I've yet to meet anyone who was enlightened or even helped by insults, blows, or sexual advances.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, our experience differs, as I pointed out.

Knotty Veneer said:

And unfortunately the consensus seems to be here that those who are abused by fake gurus have no one but themselves to blame since they did not do the required due diligence.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on what you mean by "abuse." If you sleep with a teacher, did not insist on committed relationship first, and find out he or she has other partners they did not tell you about, it may be disheartening, but that is not abuse, unless they have an STD they knowingly passed onto you.

If you are studying with a teacher, but find that in the course of their studies they are verbally abusive, you can leave.

If you find out that a teacher is physically assaulting students, that's a matter for the police, for example, like the famous Merwin Party in Boulder. What CTR did there was actually illegal.

Knotty Veneer said:

These vulnerable people will always exist and they will always be taken advantage of because the power structures in religious organizations depend on those at the top being morally scrupulous. Unfortunately, the power given to those at the top makes that very difficult for any but the real deal not to be corrupted by it.

Malcolm wrote:

This is why there is so much teaching in Vajrayāna about the need to be very careful who one takes as a guru and who one takes as a student. Otherwise, It can end disastrously for everyone, as it did in the case of Sogyal. He did not perform due diligence, neither did they

Knotty Veneer said:

And even if there are teachers who really can introduce the nature of mind, say, through blows or sex or whatever, rules like I'm suggesting will not inhibit them. If a teacher can bring about such an experience in such a manner no one is abused and no one is gonna complain.

Malcolm wrote:

Now, you are making sense.

Knotty Veneer said:

By not having such rules however, the psychos and the self-deluding get a free pass to continue taking advantage of the vulnerable and gullible.

Malcolm wrote:

There are rules, but people do not take the time to learn them. They just run after So and so Rinpoche, thinking he is enlightened, and when they find out Rinpoche is a womanizer and a drunk, they really have no one to blame but themselves for not examining them more closely. In cases where there is criminal conduct, that is a matter for the authorities. That's been my position all along.

What's much worse, actually, is teachers who have no qualities or credentials to give empowerments, etc., who do so anyway, people who receive ocean promotions, etc.

Generally, if people are worried about such issues, they should make sure their teacher is fully ordained monk or nun who keeps their vows scrupulously. But people like lay teachers because they hang out, have a beer, eat a burger, chat, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 6:47 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Do you think it could have been some misunderstanding of teachers saying that slight suffering if used skillfully can help us avoid bigger consequences in future lives (such as hunger and thirst in nyungne and purifies causes of being born as a hungry ghost eg.)?

Malcolm wrote:

We have to use logic. Small karmas result in huge ripening. Small sufferings are not

going to remove huge karmas.

We accumulate merit because that is good karma. We do so to keep ourselves of the realms of rebirth where negative karmas will ripen fully.

If people really want to understand how this works, they need to study chapter 4 of the Koshabhasyam. For example, if one takes rebirth in the form realm, karma generated in the desire realm cannot ripen there. So it is delayed. Karma can only ripen in the realm in which it was created.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 7:36 AM

Title: Re: The Heart Sutra...sufficient for Enlightenment?

Content:

Heimdall said:

I attended a Zen Center a while back that combined both Pureland Buddhism and Chan / Zen Buddhism, and the Abbot made the claim that the Heart Sutra is technically all that is needed for Enlightenment.

Is this true?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, provided you are willing to work for three incalculable eons towards Buddhahood. There is no path in the Heart Sutra, it even says so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 7:54 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

undefineable said:

Or is this just 'pop Buddhism' too - as far as anyone knows?

Malcolm wrote:

Again, one has to use reasoning, and not merely accept the words in the sūtras literally, at face value.

Suffering is a ripened result. If you experience some suffering, that is ripened action.

But in the real point here is not to try and ripen all our negative karma in this life. It's impossible. We have been taking birth since beginningless time. We have created infinite potentials for karma. The idea that a headache is going to wipe all that away is, well, aspirational.

Of course, since we are in the desire realm, as are the hell realms, animal realms, and so on. Any karma we as humans here can ripen in those lower states and vice versa. But

Buddha never taught us that deliberating engaging in ascetic practice where we voluntarily undergo torment will result in liberation.

If someone has a headache, yes, that is a result of action, as all painful, pleasant, and neutral sensations are. Does it eliminate the negative action of taking birth in hell realms? Maybe. But banging your head against the wall is not going to have that effect.

The idea that practice results in suffering is mistaken. For example, some people believe that if you practice tonglen, you will take on the suffering of others. But Sapan ridicules this notion, pointing out that engaging in virtuous practice cannot possibly result in suffering. Likewise, the idea that increased suffering is a necessary result of dharma practice is frankly a wrong view and a misunderstanding of the sutra passages Vasana pointed to.

Sakya Pandita would definitely frown on this statement by Karma Chagme:  
Take on all vices, sins, and obscurations from previous lifetimes. Then everything that would result in immense suffering in miserable states of existence in other lifetimes is purified simply by suffering from illness in this life  
Sapan would consider this a misunderstanding of the meaning of tonglen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:10 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I can't give an exact source, but here here on DW I've seen ChNN quoted as saying, "We have plenty of gods. We just don't have one main one."

Malcolm wrote:

We have plenty of world gods. They are just working stiffs like you and I,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:17 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I can't give an exact source, but here here on DW I've seen ChNN quoted as saying, "We have plenty of gods. We just don't have one main one."

PeterC said:

Absolutely. I offer incense to Brahma from time to time. But even Mahabrahma is still caught in samsara

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, it's kind of like giving a tip...or sometimes a bribe....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:27 AM

Title: Re: When does one "steal"?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Those are idiot laws about the rights of fictional persons, who's rights and privileges exceed natural person's. See deities everywhere rob them blind.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, since they are laws, we are bound to respect them.

SilenceMonkey said:

I don't think karma changes depending on the country you're in.

Malcolm wrote:

Definitions of property do, and affects the karma of taking what is not given.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:52 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I can't give an exact source, but here here on DW I've seen ChNN quoted as saying, "We have plenty of gods. We just don't have one main one."

PeterC said:

Absolutely. I offer incense to Brahma from time to time. But even Mahabrahma is still caught in samsara

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

So then what, you draw the line at Chenrezig?

Malcolm wrote:

Avalokiteshvara is a high level bodhisattva, not a worldly deva like Brahma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 8:46 PM

Title: Re: Illuminating deep dive into CRT and its ideological underpinnings from a socialist perspective

Content:

Archie2009 said:

What is unscientific and quite mad about the CRT movement and its offshoots like Intersectionality is however clearly articulated in the WSWS article. It is that which upsets me. It is a fair piece of writing if you disregard the Marxist framework.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't agree. The article is mostly a bunch of typical far-left whining about pseudo leftism.

And as far as science goes, I don't really understand why, in your view, CRT needs to be scientific. It's not science, it's an analytical tool used by lawyers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Well all I can say to that is if any teacher thought they could introduce me to the nature of mind by means of a blow, they'd better get it right first time!

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on your faith.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Largest Buddha statues in the world (top 10)

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Between these two, in the centre, I would have a sculpture of a nondescript plain empty chair, perhaps even a fold-up chair like one that you might take out for a barbecue. That's my idea of some good pretentious Buddhist art, not that any of the actual Buddhist art presented in this thread is pretentious.

Malcolm wrote:

That will only work if you also have a statue of Clint Eastwood debating with it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes?

Content:

MiphamFan said:



Well, because they are not actually monks robes sometimes.

Dzongsar Khyentse Rinpoche for example doesn't actually wear monks robes per se, real monk's robes have the yellow collar thing. Look at Khenpo Tsultrim Lodro to compare:

If they wear full monks robes and actually broke their vows then it's a different story.

Malcolm wrote:

The yellow collar thing is not part of Vinaya. Most of the fully ordained monks I know do not wear the dongkha. And the yellow is a Geluk thing, actually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Recently I have been thinking about this and what would be an upasaka clothing in the Tibetan buddhist tradition? For example if one wanted to have a seperate set of clothing for retreats or for important days in the buddhist calendar.

Malcolm wrote:

White trousers and shirt, dresses for women.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

I'd say that sparking a conversation about how to chose a master and how a student teacher relationship should and could look like would be more successful.

Malcolm wrote:

That's what I've been saying all along. Caveat emptor. As Peter points out, having a board is no guarantee, since a board will all be students as well, with vested interests in coverups, etc.

Even FPMT, who generally do a good job of assigning Geshe's to their centers failed terribly with Dagri, right? And it took them years to get to get rid of him.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Aemilius said:

I wonder, if Vasubandhu recited and followed the Bodhisattva pratimoksha, and discussed with his brother Asanga and Asanga's community of Mahayanists, how could he have been living in a Sravakayana community?

Malcolm wrote:

They were bhikshus. Simple as that.

Aemilius said:

They were Mahayana bhikshus or bodhisattva bhikshus, they had a different pratimoksha.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they didn't. For example, to take the bodhisattva vows in Asanga tradition, one had to have already received prātimokṣa vows in a separate rite.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 10:28 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Arnoud said:

Don't know if this was mentioned but there is a new podcast called uncoverage about growing up in Shambhala Boulder.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, pretty appalling so far. Makes me doubly glad I never met CTR when I had the chance, back in 1978. I'd already encountered Edo, and he turned out to be damaged goods as well.

The kids who went up to tail of the tiger, on a field trip from my school, came back and reported that everyone, including Trungpa, were shitfaced the entire time they were there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: Illuminating deep dive into CRT and its ideological underpinnings from a

socialist perspective

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

IBRAM X. KENDI writes:

Republican operatives have buried the actual definition of critical race theory: “a way of looking at law’s role platforming, facilitating, producing, and even insulating racial inequality in our country,” as the law professor Kimberlé Crenshaw, who helped coin the term, recently defined it. Instead, the attacks on critical race theory are based on made-up definitions and descriptors. “Critical race theory says every white person is a racist,” Senator Ted Cruz has said. “It basically teaches that certain children are inherently bad people because of the color of their skin,” said the Alabama state legislator Chris Pringle.

...

If you want to understand why I’ve made these arguments, you first need to recognize that for decades, right-wing thinkers and judges have argued that policies that lead to racial inequities are “not racist” or are “race neutral.” That was the position of the conservative Supreme Court justices who recently upheld Arizona’s voting-restriction policies. Those who wish to conserve racial inequity want us to focus on intent—which is hard to prove—rather than the outcome of inequity, which is rather easy to prove.

...

How should thinkers respond to monstrous lies? Should we mostly ignore the critics as Matsuda has, as I have? Because restating facts over and over again gets old. Reciting your own work over and over again to critics who either haven’t read what they are criticizing or are purposefully distorting it gets old. And talking with people who have created a monologue with two points of view, theirs and what they impute to you, gets old.

[https://apple.news/A-Wnaisu8R6qmp\\_dF4h5sfQ](https://apple.news/A-Wnaisu8R6qmp_dF4h5sfQ)

Frankly your Marxist article is just a rehash of right wing talking points with a Trotskyist spin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 11:17 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Matt J said:

It is probably popular in the West because it is often taught by Buddhist teachers from various countries and traditions, and broadly experienced by students. Buddhism is after all an oral tradition.

Malcolm wrote:

What happens, when we begin to practice dharma, is that we begin to notice suffering in ways we never did before. But the idea that virtuous practice can cause negative karma to ripen is a deeply mistaken idea. That negative karma is going to ripen when the causes and conditions for its ripening are present, and not before. Only a buddha has the omniscience to determine what causes and conditions lead to the ripening of karma for this and that person. For example, the point of Vajrasattva and other methods in Vajrayana is to eliminate traces of karma before they meet conditions for ripening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 11:19 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

It's not very popular to invoke "Theravada" rules into the Vajrayana context. But the Buddha did lay down the law as far as interaction between ordained and laypersons. I have a friend who is a Thai monk. He's meditated in a forest with tigers walking past him. But if a woman sits next to him, he jumps.

Malcolm wrote:

The rules in Mahayana are a bit different.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 9th, 2021 at 11:39 PM

Title: Re: Thinking of abandoning Buddhism and its teachings

Content:

Queequeg said:

The last thing we want is a bunch of tech bros designing the world.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, we hope they leave for Mars, ASAP.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

ismael said:

If you think that direct introduction meant an empowerment in the eyes of CNN, that means you didn't listen very often to his webcasts

Malcolm wrote:

It means you listened with your ears closed.

Damchö\_Dorje said:

So a direct introduction in the context of an anniversary practice would not be the rigpa'i tsal wang?

Would you say it is an authorization to practice guru yogas, such as those in the Guru Yoga book?

Would that imply samaya is not present from a direct introduction?

I am not doubting this commentary, but merely working to understand this because I have not understood.

Malcolm wrote:

What I am saying is that DI is an empowerment in the eyes of ChNN.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Paul2020 said:

Malcolm, what are the storm clouds brewing?

Ayu said:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=582690#p582690>

The topic is locked, because the evidence is not really clear now. But the Karmapa (OTD) seems to have admitted, he is possibly the father of that child.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also a rape lawsuit (civil) being brought against him in New York.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

justsit said:

Have the child's DNA test results been publicly reported?

Malcolm wrote:

I am not sure how far in discovery the Canadian lawsuit has proceeded.

Nor, for that matter, the rape suit in NY.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My understanding is that she claims to be his wife, and she is suing him for alimony. That's technically different than child support.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Paul2020 said:

I won't comment further on these particular accusations since I have no prior information and am completely ill-equipped to have a viewpoint.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, until the matter is adjudicated in court, there is no point in having an opinion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

This analysis of the "city of gandharvas" simile is from the Mahāprajñāpāramitopadeśa. That is a commentary on the Mahāprajñāpāramitāsūtra.

Why does the explanation from the simile of the city of gandharvas appear in a compendious commentary on the Prajñāpāramitā?

For one, because Venerable Nāgārjuna cites the Prajñāpāramitā in the MMK when he mentions the gandharva city.

ronnymarsh said:

Friend, referring to prajnaparamita does not mean quoting the Prajnaparamita Sutras.

Prajna Paramita is an element of general Buddhism that appears in the Agamas/Nikayas, and no additional text is needed for any Buddhist to use in their literature, as Buddhavamsa in Nikayas..

<https://web.archive.org/web/20160228214656/http://static.sirimangalo.org/pdf/buddhavamsa.pdf>

[https://web.archive.org/web/20160214113936/http://dhammatalks.net/Books14/Mingun\\_Sayadaw-The\\_Great\\_Chronicle\\_of\\_Buddhas\\_Vol-1\\_Part-2.pdf](https://web.archive.org/web/20160214113936/http://dhammatalks.net/Books14/Mingun_Sayadaw-The_Great_Chronicle_of_Buddhas_Vol-1_Part-2.pdf)

Believing that Nagarjuna had access to the Prajnaparamita texts is an anachronistic

belief for today, as the vast scientific literature demonstrates that most of these texts did not even exist when Nagarjuna lived.

Caoimhghín said:

The problem here is that you are making this up. There is no such scientific literature demonstrating that.

Why did you link to those two books? Care to contextualize? They don't seem very relevant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 3:00 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Ayu said:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=582690#p582690>

The topic is locked, because the evidence is not really clear now. But the Karmapa (OTD) seems to have admitted, he is possibly the father of that child.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also a rape lawsuit (civil) being brought against him in New York.

AlexanderS said:

Is that another woman other than the one from the canadian case?

Malcolm wrote:

No, same woman.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 3:01 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

For those whom emptiness is possible, everything is possible.

For those whom emptiness is not possible, nothing is possible.

-- Nāgārjuna.

Damchö\_Dorje said:

What does it mean "for those . . . everything is possible"? It seems poetic.

Malcolm wrote:

It means that everything is subject to a rational explanation because of emptiness. Not that you can jump off a building and expect to float.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 3:43 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

If he doesn't demand a paternity test(and is negative) then his side of the Karma Kagyu is basically screwed right?

If so, he will be financially responsible for whatever the court decides.

How that effects the wider Karma Kagyu remains to be seen.

AlexanderS said:

I frankly can't see why he doesn't insist on one to settle the whole thing.

Malcolm wrote:

I can think of a reason...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

If he doesn't demand a paternity test(and is negative) then his side of the Karma Kagyu is basically screwed right?

If so, he will be financially responsible for whatever the court decides.

How that effects the wider Karma Kagyu remains to be seen.

Malcolm wrote:

I think rape charge will more consequential...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 4:10 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Norwegian said:

<https://mcolaw.com/case-studies/karmapa/>

First hit on Google on "Karmapa rape New York" without the quotation marks.

justsit said:



The video at that site has text in English and Chinese??

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 7:26 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Celibacy is easy when you're in your 60s+. Asking a child to be celibate for life isn't fair.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people, like HHDL seem to do ok.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 7:46 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

For Lucretius, there are gods, but they don't intervene/are unreliable, therefore, no point in praying, making offerings etc.

For Mahayana Buddhism, there are Buddhas and Bodhisattvas who endlessly intervene (efficaciously),.

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhisattvas are human beings (in our dimension). And all they can really do is give teachings. They do not supernaturally intervene. The idea that they can and do is, well, superstitious.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 8:33 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Guess I will give it a listen.

But as someone who kind of enjoys some of Trungpa's books which are on more traditional subjects (such as 4 Noble Truths) the question for me is. How long can we separate the author and the work? And should we even bother when someone is this well crazy?

Malcolm wrote:

There are better, more accurate, texts out there these days. Trungpa books are anachronistic, and because of his conduct, problematical.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:13 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Celibacy is easy when you're in your 60s+. Asking a child to be celibate for life isn't fair.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people, like HHDL seem to do ok.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

HHDL wasn't exposed to the internet as a child.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither was OTD. Anyway, you are seriously going to blame the internet? Maybe the dude's just not up to the role.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:30 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

But there are other dimensions. And in so many Mahayana texts, traditions and practices, one orients towards them. Pure Land might be the most robust example, but as a matter of degrees it is ubiquitous everywhere in the Mahayana except those places deeply touched by a modernist, secularist impulse, of the kind you seem to be defending here.

Malcolm wrote:

These things are quite relative and provisional. There is no buddhafiield outside of one's own mind. There is no nirvana that can be found somewhere else.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:09 AM

Title: Re: 17th Gyalwang Karmapas: Ogyen Trinley Dorje and Trinley Thaye Dorje

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

He isn't happy with people's expectations of him. He's said so publicly. If that's what

you mean by “role”, I think you’re right.

Malcolm wrote:

He has been accused of rape. If it is found that indeed he is guilty of said offense, he needs to retire, because it would be a farce for him to continue as the nominal head of a lineage. It would be bad for the Dharma for him to continue in such a role. He would need to hand it over to the other guy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

His translations may not be traditional, but they were an expression of genius. Everything he wrote, said and did was an outrageous expression of Shunyata. He defied everyone's notions of what was possible or sane, and showed people something so far outside of conventions of society that if one goes along with his program, expectations and the very foundations of ego collapse.

We can debate Trungpa for centuries, but he may just remain a profound source of creative inspiration for Buddhists who want to blast through the confines of worldly and spiritual conventions.

He was so many things... How could anyone possibly form a true conclusion about him?

If anything, he has mass appeal to western society far beyond the orthodoxy of Mahayana Buddhism. He's the reason why so many of us are here today, studying and practicing in the Tibetan tradition. He moved an entire continent.

I think the topic of insanity is especially prescient with someone like Trungpa, who was clearly playing with the insanity of western culture. He was swimming in insanity itself.

In the end, I think it's what we want him to represent. Everyone sees just their own image of him, merely light refracted through the prism of society. How we view someone like Trungpa speaks volumes more about us than it could ever say about him.

Do we dare deify him? Do we dare to tear him down? Do we even dare ignore him, and everything that he was?

Trungpa was a bold challenge to our vision of Buddhism in the modern world.

Malcolm wrote:

You’ve clearly drunk the koolaid, which is sad, because this means that people will

continue with this strange imagination that it is necessary for a teacher to be a sociopath, and given the number of animals he actually tortured, to signal their realization.

Now, ChNN was an actual genius and polymath.

Most of Trungpa's success was a function of his corporate support from the Karma Kagyus and ability to raise money (a lot if it from a cocaine dealer). But he was f\*cked. He sexually assaulted a woman in public in front of 300 students, with his vajra guards looking on, reaching up under her dress and fondling her vagina. True story, told to me by an eyewitness, the guard who was present.

Frankly I tire of hearing how outrageous and enlightened Trungpa was. He was a sociopath with no empathy. The notion he was what the West, meaning America, needed at the time is utter bollocks. Western Buddhists lionize Trungpa to the detriment of Buddhism as a whole.

It's all coming out now, all the terrible stories, and frankly, anyone who thinks the carnage and destruction Trungpa left in his wake is a sign of awakened conduct just has not properly studied the Dharma. It's really a sad episode in the history of Buddhism. Nothing to lionize and uphold as an example.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 8:11 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

Maybe controversy is partly a motor in Tantra, the famous left hand path. Jigme Lingpa writes in his "entering the city of omniscience"; "At all times and in all circumstances, may the wish to conform to conventional expectations not arise for even an instant. If, due to the power of strong habits, such deluded intentions occur, may they not succeed." Like I said in another thread, read Elisabeth English book Vajrayogini. Being small-minded and prudish never been the path of tantra. Trungpa Rinpoche was a tertön and tertöns are rather weird, at least in my limited experience.

/magnus

Könchok Thrinley said:

I mean sure... but there is being a weird tertön and you know ... creating a cult where everybody is drunk all of the time until you yourself pass away because of it. And in between drinks abusing your students such as making and letting a crowd strip down naked two people who preferred to stay in their room instead of partying.

heart said:

I can assure you that none of the Trungpa students I met been drunk. They all been

serious dharma practitioners that spent long time in serious retreat. The occasion you hint at was a ganachakra.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

I can assure you that alcoholism was so pervasive a problem in Vajradhatu, they had serious discussions about it regularly,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 8:46 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

I don't doubt that but what I said still stands. Like most centers the vajradhatu seem to have a lot of problems.

Malcolm wrote:

I think your experience is of the European Vajradhātu, with their cute little brownshirt uniforms.

I am talking about the Americans. And the American centers were a hot mess. I remember once that one of the regents handlers asked me to find him some weed. I didn't, but they asked.

I went to so many parties where these serious practitioners, and yes they were, would get completely shitfaced, regularly, and had been doing so since for a decade and more.

There is no use in trying to pretend that Vajradhatu wasn't a deeply f\*\*cked up organization with rot that started at the head.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 8:51 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

Does that mean he could not, or should not give empowerments and teachings? No. He met the requirements for giving empowerments (approximation retreats etc) and was clearly a competent teacher of the Vajrayana. However bad his conduct he would purify

it with self-empowerment at the time of giving the wang. The vajra master does not have to be enlightened to confer empowerment.

Malcolm wrote:

He clearly had more ritual education than education in śāstra.

PeterC said:

Does the claim that you're a tertön give you some sort of special dispensation from morality? No, not really.

Malcolm wrote:

Many people imagine it does, and this idea comes from the terma tradition itself.

PeterC said:

There's a broader point here. The point of engaging in outrageous conduct is that you don't care about worldly opprobrium. You take lower-caste consorts, live in graveyards, etc - this was conduct that was reviled, and would make you an outcast.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, like Darikpa, they were high caste Buddhists, who were ordered by their teacher, in this case Luipa, to take low caste professions in cities where they were completely unknown.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Kunchok Thrinley asked how can we hold him in our minds with reverence after all of this madness. This is a profound question... And necessary for a practitioner of Vajrayana.

Malcolm wrote:

No, not for anyone who is not his student. I am not his student. He is not even a lineage master of mine. I am free. It is not a profound question at all. If he is your guru, then you have the obligation to keep a pure view of him. If not, no obligation at all.

I am not going to say anymore, because people's feelings are already hurt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:24 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:  
heart said:  
I never been to a Vajradhatu center, so I know nothing about that.

Malcolm wrote:  
Well, that explains it then. Your contact with Vajradhatu people was cursory and brief.  
You never saw them in their own environment.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:27 PM  
Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism  
Content:

tobes said:  
For Lucretius, there are gods, but they don't intervene/are unreliable, therefore, no point in praying, making offerings etc.

For Mahayana Buddhism, there are Buddhas and Bodhisattvas who endlessly intervene (efficaciously),.

Malcolm wrote:  
Bodhisattvas are human beings (in our dimension). And all they can really do is give teachings. They do not supernaturally intervene. The idea that they can and do is, well, superstitious.

SilenceMonkey said:  
I think many people (including myself) have a different experience. There were times when my gurus supernaturally intervened when I was in the shit. It was eye opening.

Malcolm wrote:  
And how is this testimony different than saying, "Jesus answered my prayers?" With what faculty of higher perception did you ascertain it was your guru who "supernaturally" intervened?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:36 PM  
Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism  
Content:

tobes said:  
But there are other dimensions. And in so many Mahayana texts, traditions and practices, one orients towards them. Pure Land might be the most robust example, but as a matter of degrees it is ubiquitous everywhere in the Mahayana except those places deeply touched by a modernist, secularist impulse, of the kind you seem to be defending here.

Malcolm wrote:

These things are quite relative and provisional. There is no buddhafiield outside of one's own mind. There is no nirvana that can be found somewhere else.

tobes said:

Yes but nonetheless when one starts talking about buddhafiields and nirvana, one is a very long way from the Charvakas.....

Malcolm wrote:

Modern carvakas certainly accept the existence of other worlds.

Nirvana? Nirvana is just the cessation of afflictions. Carvakas assert that death is nirvana. Buddha encountered one right after his awakening, Ajita Kesakambali. He is reported to have said:

There is no such thing as alms or sacrifice or offering. There is neither fruit nor result of good or evil deeds. A human being is built up of four elements. When he dies the earthly in him returns and relapses to the earth, the fluid to the water, the heat to the fire, the wind to the air, and his faculties pass into space. The four bearers, on the bier as a fifth, take his dead body away; till they reach the burning ground, men utter forth eulogies, but there his bones are bleached, and his offerings end in ashes. It is a doctrine of fools, this talk of gifts. It is an empty lie, mere idle talk, when men say there is profit herein. Fools and wise alike, on the dissolution of the body, are cut off, annihilated, and after death they are not.

It seems that they were reacting to same blind ritualism the Buddha scorned.

tobes said:

i.e. it's not just karma and rebirth that distinguishes the two. It is also something about how mind is understood.

Malcolm wrote:

We do not really know exactly what the Carvakas thought, because all that remains of them are parodies of them in Hindu and Buddhist works.

Factually speaking, the Carvaka school is perhaps the oldest philosophical school in India and was very popular until the 12th century.

If I didn't accept rebirth and karma, I would certainly be a materialist. Belief in rebirth and karma is not necessary for leading a moral life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:37 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:



Wasn't one of your teachers the Dalai Lama's staff rainmaker?

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

For Lucretius, there are gods, but they don't intervene/are unreliable, therefore, no point in praying, making offerings etc.

For Mahayana Buddhism, there are Buddhas and Bodhisattvas who endlessly intervene (efficaciously),.

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhisattvas are human beings (in our dimension). And all they can really do is give teachings. They do not supernaturally intervene. The idea that they can and do is, well, superstitious.

MiphamFan said:

Then what do you make of the various rituals for mundane purposes? Wealth, health, prosperity and so on?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, let me ask you. If you don't perform them or sponsor them, will they work?

Has anyone every practiced a long life ritual and attained true immortality? We hear stories, but no proof.

MiphamFan said:

Like ChNN's parents sponsoring a monk to do a Tara retreat for them to have a son?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, we hear these kinds of stories. Perhaps it helped. But why wouldn't Tara just intervene of her own accord?

In reality these methods function through dependent origination: developing merit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

And they say before Buddha's awakening he was attacked by Mara.

Malcolm wrote:

The manner in which the Buddha successively overcame the four maras is well known. He also understood that physically torturing himself was not getting him anywhere, that's why he accepted food.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

On the other hand, there are stories from people I respect and find credible about events that don't seem to have a materialist explanation. ChNN's accounts of helping his uncle retrieve termas for example and his teaching on various action mantras.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, everyone is too afraid to point out the obvious explanation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

On the other hand, there are stories from people I respect and find credible about events that don't seem to have a materialist explanation. ChNN's accounts of helping his uncle retrieve termas for example and his teaching on various action mantras.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, everyone is too afraid to point out the obvious explanation.

Arnoud said:

For a dull person such as myself, what is the obvious explanation?

Malcolm wrote:

I leave you to your own ruminations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I'm just saying, all kinds of things happen. You just have an anti-all of this ideology. Maybe you came to these conclusions with your own super knowledge. But I know what happened with me, and I'm sure many others had pretty hard to believe experiences.

You can't really talk about what you don't know. If something like this hasn't happened to you personally, that's your reference.

Malcolm wrote:

I just know that confirmation bias is very strong, and has cognitive rewards.

I have no incentive to give people's miracle stories credence at all. If I won't extend this credulity to Christians and Hindus, why would I extend it to Buddhists?

It is said the Buddha was able to levitate, and by the same token the Buddha also explained to us that such abilities were not indications of awakening.

The true miracle of Dharma is bodhicitta, because it is so rare.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:52 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I really think that maybe you just haven't had experiences that would challenge this belief system of yours.

Malcolm wrote:

I prefer not to have beliefs, as much as possible.

Your statement here is no different than a Christian telling me I have not experienced miracles because I haven't let Jesus into my heart.

There are no such thing as miracles. Just dependent origination, causes and conditions that are not understood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I really think that maybe you just haven't had experiences that would challenge this belief system of yours.

Malcolm wrote:

I prefer not to have beliefs, as much as possible.

Your statement here is no different than a Christian telling me I have not experienced miracles because I haven't let Jesus into my heart.

SilenceMonkey said:

It may be true... or may not.

But you do already have a belief. A belief of anti-"belief".

Malcolm wrote:

No, I am not anti-belief either. I just don't find having beliefs, ideas which are not reasonably inferred or a product of my own personal experience, terribly useful.

I generally consider beliefs to belong to the category of rampant proliferation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

This is all getting a bit abstract.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because you are not being specific.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

This is all getting a bit abstract.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because you are not being specific.

SilenceMonkey said:

Neither are you.

You say there are no miracles because all of what happens is cause and effect. But miracles also come about through cause and effect. Some merely choose to call it a "miracle" while you don't.

Malcolm wrote:

A miracle is normally considered a supernatural phenomenon that defies rational explanation.

I say, as does the Buddha, there are no phenomena, other than space and cessations, that are uncompounded, which arise in absence of cause and condition. I am not asserting we can explain all causes and conditions, I am saying that everything that happens is compounded and impermanent, and that there is no way around this fact.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:18 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Anyway... it's getting abstract and difficult to evaluate because Buddhists often don't talk about spiritual experiences they've had. It's against the Bodhisattva way.

Malcolm wrote:

One, that's not true. Bodhisattvas are even permitted to lie about their experience and realization if it helps sentient beings come to the path.

Buddhists, especially Tibetan Buddhists, blather on about their experiences ad nauseum.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:29 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Arnoud said:

So what someone calls a miracle, such as leaving a foot or hand print in rock, you call causes and conditions? Or are you saying that's just superstition and made to look like a print?

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly, such claims are rubbish, but if someone could do so, it would be along the lines of gaining control over the four elements through samadhi, like the arhat who self-immolated by having gained control over fire by meditating on fire kachina.

Such miraculous abilities are widely reported in traditional literature of all cultures, but never reproduced in front of witnesses.

I can report however that the weather was always terrible around ChNN. He was also remarkably successful in casinos too. However he once quipped to me when shown a picture of one of these miracles of a modern lama who stakes his reputation on such miracles, “get me some concrete and I can do that too.” So you see, my skepticism has some basis.

The word “sham” comes from “shaman.”

As for Ngakpa Rinpoche, his weather making abilities were inherited, and involved controlling nagas. He was quite good at this, which is why he was hired.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Thinking of abandoning Buddhism and its teachings

Content:

Queequeg said:

The last thing we want is a bunch of tech bros designing the world.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, we hope they leave for Mars, ASAP.

Sādhaka said:

Aren't a lot of those guys ones who push many pc and/or left agendas though? I'm not saying that they are sincere in their doing so; but just that they seem to be doing it whatever reasons they may have.

I mean isn't amazon, google, apple, etc. with their pc/leftism more or less tech-bro driven?

Of course there are the Elon Musk types who I guess could be considered more 'conservative'-leaning tech-bro. At the same time it also looks like Musk (see microchip in brain) is all about the very transhumanist agenda that he claims to warn us about....

Malcolm wrote:

Tech bros are mostly libertarians, actually. People who work in marketing, etc., not so much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

And they say before Buddha's awakening he was attacked by Mara.

Malcolm wrote:

The manner in which the Buddha successively overcame the four maras is well known. He also understood that physically torturing himself was not getting him anywhere, that's why he accepted food.

Crazywisdom said:

You missed the point entirely. No in Kagyu are self torturing. They are masters of dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

I was not responding to your Kagyu boosterism. I was responding to the idea that this might be connected in someone's mind to karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:47 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

And they say before Buddha's awakening he was attacked by Mara.

Malcolm wrote:

The manner in which the Buddha successively overcame the four maras is well known. He also understood that physically torturing himself was not getting him anywhere, that's why he accepted food.

Crazywisdom said:

Objection. Nonresponsive, irrelevant, misleading, abuse of process

Malcolm wrote:

This isn't court.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 10th, 2021 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I don't think there is a perfect resolution for all of this... except to find ways to purify and attain enlightenment in other ways.

PeterC said:

There's nothing really requiring any resolution. There's no great mystery here. The facts are what they are.

SilenceMonkey said:

What requires resolution is our karma.

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly his.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Why do you say that gurus are unable to intervene in non-physical ways when their students are in trouble?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know what you mean by "nonphysical ways."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Why do you say that gurus are unable to intervene in non-physical ways when their students are in trouble?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know what you mean by "nonphysical ways."

SilenceMonkey said:

From before:

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhisattvas are human beings (in our dimension). And all they can really do is give teachings. They do not supernaturally intervene. The idea that they can and do is, well, superstitious.

I still don't know what you mean. Like standing on a train track in front of a speeding train and praying to Avalokiteshvara to avert the train? Pretty sure that won't work.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

You missed the point entirely. No in Kagyu are self torturing. They are masters of dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

I was not responding to your Kagyu boosterism. I was responding to the idea that this might be connected in someone's mind to karma.

Crazywisdom said:

Objection. Conclusory. Badgering. You didn't respond. The point is obstacles are not self inflicted. They are a valid part of the path at least for some.

Malcolm wrote:

We are talking about different things. Of course there are obstacles on the path.

Crazywisdom said:

They are not overcome by reading Vasubandhu. They are overcome by understanding the highly refined teachings on karma by Buddha in sutras and tantras.

Malcolm wrote:

Good luck with that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

They might have an intuition or hear a voice, or maybe not be aware of any of it, but will come out safe nevertheless.

Malcolm wrote:

As I understand things, all of our happiness and suffering is the blessing of the guru.

I personally wouldn't find a mental whisper to be the extraordinary power of my guru. But that's just me. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 12:34 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

They might have an intuition or hear a voice, or maybe not be aware of any of it, but will come out safe nevertheless.

Malcolm wrote:

As I understand things, all of our happiness and suffering is the blessing of the guru.

I personally wouldn't find a mental whisper to be the extraordinary power of my guru. But that's just me. YMMV.

SilenceMonkey said:

Hearing voices is really just one among many. But I'm happy to discontinue this debate and let you enjoy the rest of your weekend.

Malcolm wrote:

We are not debating. You are being intentionally vague.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 1:21 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Who said anything about inaction?

I'm just saying that one can generate more merits via studying and Dharmic visualization methods (assuming that they are connected to methods from the Lineage Masters), than one could through political activism; let alone more 'concrete' methods, e.g. Yantra/Tummo, lower gate/door practices (done correctly and with proper preparation of course), Trekcho retreats, the Visions, etc. and the Five/Six Liberations for others.

Malcolm wrote:

More merits for whom? Yourself?

Sādhaka said:

Therefore what I'm implying above would be the epitome of action; whereas politics is not only less meritorious, but is likely more often than not an form of mental-laziness and distraction.

Malcolm wrote:

It is for mentally lazy and distracted people.

Sādhaka said:

And the words of the Buddha in the Jataka tales and general lower vehicles are—even though they are never wrong and are true in the right context—of course more outer-level/exoteric.

Malcolm wrote:

When it comes to helping sentient beings, they could care less whether you are an arhat or a bodhisattva, or a ordinary person.

Sādhaka said:

This being said, there's no way to mince the quotes from the Lineage Masters that I posted; it's pretty straightforward:

Without attaining the Bhumis, one cannot really help sentient beings at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, then you better get busy if you are going to be any use to anyone and stop wasting your precious human birth owning the libs on buddhist chat forums.

It is pretty useless to quote advice one is not following.

Sādhaka said:

Where's your bodhisattva courage?

Well this is an wrong question for an number of reasons, mainly in the context of the reasons I've posted above; however since I myself have not been nearly as diligent as I could be, and have very little qualities to speak of, you're question here to me personally isn't wrong. It just isn't right for the reasons that you were motivated to ask it. I.e. along the lines of "you're not summoning Bodhisattva courage, because you're advocating for focusing on practice instead of getting involved with politics").

Malcolm wrote:

No, I am questioning your distinction between "practice" and and the bodhisattva conduct of the six perfections. Bodhisattvas have the courage to remain in samsara for a long time, eons, aiding sentient beings, going through the paths and stages slowly, life after life. Even if one is a practitioner of secret mantra, one needs to have this courage.

Bodhisattvas can practice the six perfections through their engagement in benefitting sentient beings through their political advocacy for universal health care, etc., things Nāgārjuna recommended in the Garland of Gems.

You seem to have this idea that being involved with politics is all about theories. In

reality, it is all about outcomes: clean air, clean water, clean environment, preventing habitat loss, equal rights, peace, etc. Working for these things is bodhisattva activity. For example, ChNN's ASIA is a political organization. ChNN was never afraid to work in the political world. We cannot do very much on our own about these things, but we can help where we can, and that is also a part of our practice.

The other thing you neglect about your Lineage Masters is that they all lived in monarchies, not democracies. In absolute monarchies, of the kind that most pre-modern people lived under, to be involved in political life was to be involved in either working with or working against factions in a court. Their concept of politics is completely different than ours. There was no democracy. But democracy demands educated participation from those who benefit from it. The Buddha himself advocated citizen engagement in their country. He expected people to support their rulers, follow the laws, and so on. Well, we don't have kings anymore. We have Constitutions, which are better than kings, in every possible way. What I am saying is that there is no contradiction between the conduct of a bodhisattva and political engagement in a democracy, like voting, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I think two worlds, different but bordering on each other, are conflated here. One is the world of general weirdness, bizarre tastes and actions, quirks and eccentricities and incomprehensibility. All of which may be charming, disturbing or both. The other world is one in which there is abuse going on. Here there is no charm, just hurt. As far as I know, Tibetans not only can tell the two apart, but do not hesitate to deal very harshly with teachers whose unconventionality goes beyond the recognised limits of its convention. Westerners are another matter.

Malcolm wrote:

Like all conversations about Trungpa, it's essentially useless. There are those who will always apologize for his most egregious excesses, using the excuse that he was a tertön and so on.

Other people will be properly horrified when they discover what kinds of things he did to his students, animals, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 2:20 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Unknown said:

Hameed Ali stated that the third word of Garab Dorje signifies that continuation in the state 24/7.

Malcolm wrote:

He is completely wrong about that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

Chokling Rinpoche had some really strange behaviour at times that I can't explain but that doesn't change the fact that I owe him a lot and always felt inspired by being close to him.

Malcolm wrote:

Chokling Rinpoche may have been eccentric (never met him), but he never tortured animals, AFAIK. But this is not about Chokling Rinpoche. He is irrelevant here.

heart said:

Sogyal

Malcolm wrote:

Sogyal is irrelevant here.

heart said:

I guess that if you go looking you will find people being horrified over the behaviour of all Tibetan masters teaching here or in the east.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess if the confirmed stories of the torture of dogs and cats doesn't turn one's stomach and can be excused merely as "strange behavior," one can excuse all kinds of behaviors on behalf of supposedly "enlightened masters."

heart said:

We all know there is absolutely no happiness in Samsara.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but torturing defenseless animals and sexually assaulting women in public certainly doesn't make things better.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 4:07 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

A Buddhist approach to politics can and probably should transcend 'regular' dualistic politics.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, normally I would agree, but then Trump happened.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 4:34 AM

Title: Re: When is the right time to go for refuge?

Content:

Paul2020 said:

At what point in your path do people feel it is appropriate to take your vows and formally go for refuge in the buddha, dharma and sangha?

Malcolm wrote:

Whenever you feel you would like to.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 5:11 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The Precious Human Rebirth requires some stability.

Malcolm wrote:

So in a democracy, that requires citizen participation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 5:11 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

A Buddhist approach to politics can and probably should transcend 'regular' dualistic politics.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, normally I would agree, but then Trump happened.

PadmaVonSamba said:

So, oh wise one, what would you do, if you were a Buddhist who leans very socialist, whose spouse has become a trump supporter? Not a wacky Qanon person, but would vote for him again?

Malcolm wrote:

Hope he doesn't run.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 5:15 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

....it profoundly damages the (trust in the) Buddhadharma as well. As even this very thread testifies.

Malcolm wrote:

No, you don't get it. We're supposed to do the Catholic Church thing: deny, coverup, etc.

Anyway, the way things are going Shambhala International and Trungpa's estate will be sued into bankruptcy by survivors. Its only a matter of time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 5:38 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The Precious Human Rebirth requires some stability.

Malcolm wrote:

So in a democracy, that requires citizen participation.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I agree. Voting is important. Too many people have died horrible deaths to give me that opportunity. To waste it is disrespectful. But I do it knowing there's no end to it.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course, there is no end to the suffering of activities, but we still have to vote.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 5:55 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of

Padmasambhava?

Content:

Josef said:

Seems like Ginsberg liked the idea of dharma but preferred to keep his standing with NAMBLA.

Malcolm wrote:

In her 2002 book Heartbreak, Andrea Dworkin claimed Ginsberg had ulterior motives for allying with NAMBLA

Josef said:

In 1982, newspapers reported in huge headlines that the Supreme Court had ruled child pornography illegal. I was thrilled. I knew Allen would not be. I did think he was a civil libertarian. But, in fact, he was a pedophile. He did not belong to the North American Man/Boy Love Association out of some mad, abstract conviction that its voice had to be heard. He meant it. I take this from what Allen said directly to me, not from some inference I made. He was exceptionally aggressive about his right to frak children and his constant pursuit of underage boys.

Malcolm wrote:

Did you run into Ginsberg in Gelek Rinpoche's scene in Mich?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 7:17 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

Equating nirvana to the mere cessation of form expressed by Kesakambali is nihilism any way you look at it.

Malcolm wrote:

It isn't nihilism, but it certainly is annihilationism.

The so,e point I am making here is that Buddhism has far more in common with epicurean hedonism than it does any of the theistic traditions. HH Dalai Lama also understands Buddhism to be a form of atheism,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 9:37 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

Interestingly Epicuranism suffers from the same fate as the Charvakas: most of what we



know about it comes from hostile and polemical critical sources.

I don't agree with your basic point though. The fact that Buddhism makes a distinction between mind and matter (something HHDL also asserts), draws it far far closer to the Samkhya

Malcolm wrote:

Kapila's Samkhya is also an atheist system.

tobes said:

So: atheistic (pre-Yoga) Samkhya. Sure. Charvakas or Epicureans: only if one wants to give away dependent origination, FNT's etc.

Malcolm wrote:

We are not really certain what Carvakas believed about these things, but we know Epicurean thought pretty well, and they did not accept first causes, accepted conditional formation of entities, recognized the impermanence of all things, recognized that life was basically characterized by suffering, and so on, accepted the existence of mind, located in the chest, etc. The principle difference is that they rejected substance dualism, but this a position later rejected in Vajrayana also. They did assert the mind dissipated at death. But this difference I've already assented to.

tobes said:

Not liking right-wing Christians isn't a good reason for giving those things away.....

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry, but my point of view is not simple reactionary mindlessness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 9:42 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I really think that maybe you just haven't had experiences that would challenge this belief system of yours.

Malcolm wrote:

I prefer not to have beliefs, as much as possible.

Your statement here is no different than a Christian telling me I have not experienced miracles because I haven't let Jesus into my heart.

There are no such thing as miracles. Just dependent origination, causes and conditions that are not understood.

Nicholas2727 said:

Do you believe the stories of the Mahasiddha's then? I am no expert on them and just heard a few short stories from books or videos but some of them seem rather strange to me. Virupa killing a bird then bringing it back to life as well as changing the direction of a river, Milarepa flying around and many others. Again I know very little about the Mahasiddha's and the details of their stories but they honestly push me away a bit so I would be curious how you understand this.

Malcolm wrote:

They are stories, legends. That's it. If Virupa had actually stopped the sun in the ninth century, it would have been recorded around the world. It's a symbol,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 9:52 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

Do you believe the stories of the Mahasiddha's then? I am no expert on them and just heard a few short stories from books or videos but some of them seem rather strange to me. Virupa killing a bird then bringing it back to life as well as changing the direction of a river, Milarepa flying around and many others. Again I know very little about the Mahasiddha's and the details of their stories but they honestly push me away a bit so I would be curious how you understand this.

Malcolm wrote:

They are stories, legends. That's it. If Virupa had actually stopped the sun in the ninth century, it would have been recorded around the world. It's a symbol,

Nicholas2727 said:

Exactly my thought as well. Thank you for the clarification

Malcolm wrote:

Same thing with reversing the Ganges. The Ganges is a symbol of the central channel, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 11:02 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

conebeckham said:

The very definition of "change" is contradictory to what is meant by "inhering"

Rick said:

As I understand it, the common definition of inherent is essential, as in "humanity's inherent (essential) nature." But it could be that in the Buddhist context inherent means unchanging. (Would be good to know the original term that was translated to inherent existence.)

Malcolm wrote:

Inherent existence is a translation of svabhava, which literally means “self-existent.”

Asserting that change is self-existent is a contradiction in terms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 8:06 PM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

The real problem we face is the drive to reject pluralism and replace it with some fantasy of one view/one set of values.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism is a form of atheism. Simple as that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Inherent existence is a translation of svabhava, which literally means “self-existent.”

Asserting that change is self-existent is a contradiction in terms.

Rick said:

I don't know what 'self-existent' means in this context.

Malcolm wrote:

Self existent entities are immutable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 8:20 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

always keep up with morality of our western world

Malcolm wrote:

It's not an east-west thing. More hand waving. Anyway, you never met trungpa. He isn't your teacher, you just like his books.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

always keep up with morality of our western world

Malcolm wrote:

It's not an east-west thing. More hand waving. Anyway, you never met trungpa. He isn't your teacher, you just like his books.

heart said:

Yes he wasn't my teacher but if I received a Vajrayogini empowerment from him I wouldn't throw that away for gossip, true or not.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you are not paying attention with all posts flying...no expects people to denounce trungpa if they actually have samaya with him. On the other hand, rituals are easy to perform. Explaining Madhyamaka is difficult.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Self existent entities are immutable.

Rick said:

Well there you go!

If inherent existence means svabhava,  
and svabhava means self-existent,  
and self-existent means immutable ...  
then, by definition, an inherently existing entity is unchanging.

Malcolm wrote:

And by definition cannot exist...since nothing at any time, any where, can arise from itself, from another, from both, or without a cause.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: What are texts in the Agamas that are not in the Nikayas?

Content:

Aemilius said:

They were Mahayana bhikshus or bodhisattva bhikshus, they had a different pratimoksha.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they didn't. For example, to take the bodhisattva vows in Asanga tradition, one had to have already received prātimokṣa vows in a separate rite.

Aemilius said:

It is difficult to know, as we know only little about the daily life in the Mahayana communities that existed in India. I have heard it explained that you need to have the Refuge vow and atleast one of the Five lay precepts as a basis for taking the Bodhisattva vow, in either of the two bodhisattva vow lineages that exist in the Tibetan tradition.

Malcolm wrote:

It's quite easy to know, actually. The Madhyamaka tradition does not require the possession of prātimokṣa vows before taking the bodhisattva vow, since they are bestowed during the rite itself. They are not bestowed during the Yogacara rite, and need to be bestowed beforehand. The Indian manuals for these are to be found in the Tenjur.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 11th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

So I think a mature attitude is very much needed.

Malcolm wrote:

If maturity requires lionizing animal torture, pedophilia, knowingly infecting students with HIV, dosing people with hallucinogens without their consent, sexual harassment of nuns, forced labor of juveniles, etc., etc., you can keep it.

Also, the idea that these kinds of behaviors would have been tolerated by the Buddhist community in ancient India and Tibet is ludicrous at best.

There is a very good reason why Lha Lama Yeshe Ö composed Differentiating Dharma from Nondharma where he criticized mistaken interpretations of the practices of union and liberation, as well as other erroneous practices. Then of course, we have the example of Sakya Pandita, who criticized many mistaken practices that spread amongst Tibetans. I am sure he would have been absolutely critical of Trungpa.

You invoke Virupa as an example of unconventional behavior, since indeed after practicing for decades, and meeting the nirmaṇakāya, Nairatmya, and receiving the Hevajra Tantra from her, eventually he was hounded out of his monastery, exiting by walking over the lotus pool on lotus leaves, causing the monastery to realize they had accidentally expelled a mahāsiddha from the bhikṣu sangha, someone who had actually been their chief upādhyāya. When we examine Virupa's life, however, we do not find that he harmed anyone, other than maybe giving a few people heat stroke and flooding a few homes. Quite the opposite, in fact—he put an end to Shaivaite animal sacrifices in many places in South India, and made the people promise to only present Shiva with offerings of vegetarian food and fruit. Virupa derided "unconventional behavior" in his dohas, as did Saraha.

The great translator, Rinchen Zangpo, was able to cause Sangye Kargyal to fall to the ground with a mere glance-- the latter having a habit of teaching while he was levitating.

Jetsun Drakpa Gyaltsen, whom history records only demonstrated the secret mantra path of application, not even a mahāsiddha, technically speaking, was able levitate his vajra and bell during his sadhana according to the brief accounts of his life.

Now, I see no evidence at all that Trungpa was such a mahāsiddha. I observe a man, deeply flawed, who had the institutional backing of Karma Kagyu school, for whom he was an "earner," who also was charismatic, intelligent, likable, and very self-destructive, as many people with serious narcissistic personality disorders often are. He garnered the admiration of many when he was a unicorn, a Tibetan with a smattering of a western education, who spoke English fairly well, though not as well as one would be believe from his very heavily-edited books. He ran his students deeply into debt to pay for the 16th Karmapa's trip, debts that were only finally paid off after his death. Sexual harassment of women in his centers by meditation instructors was endemic from the beginning, as was alcoholism, etc. The problems in his centers were quite enormous. Turnover was very high, membership was iffy at best. Financial problems were very prominent in Vajradhātu by the early 1980's for reasons that are easy to understand. And now, people are beginning to talk, like the Steinbecks, who report that in Boulder, Trungpa's cocaine habit was \$40,000 per annum, about to a gram to two grams a day in 1977 prices.

People keep on talking about how this is all "Western" moralizing. But that, of course, is nonsense. Tibetans would have never put up with this business for a second. Tibetans were not rubes. In general, Tibetans themselves were quite allergic to people who expressed unconventional behavior. Tibetans are quite prudish and conventional as a rule.

The reality is that since the time of Sakya Pandita and now, there has been a lot of malpractice in Tibetan Buddhism. There is a lot of malpractice in Tibetan lineages as they have spread to the West. It is not healthy to spend our time lionizing these modern "mahāsiddhas" whose main siddhi seems to have been fund raising from Westerners and Chinese people, who, when exposed to scrutiny, are revealed to be deeply flawed human beings. Justifying their behavior through legends of mahāsiddhas of the past is naive at best and nonvirtuous at worst.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Universal healthcare to get prescribed a bunch of drugs to make lobbyists & politicians rich, instead of them providing people with actual useful health advice and treatment?

Malcolm wrote:

No, universal health care so that when you have cancer, your medical bills don't involve bankruptcy and foreclosure.

Sādhaka said:

Regardless, I like the idea of all people being able to get treated and healthy no matter their financial situation.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that's universal healthcare. You get sick. You show up for treatment. You go home. No bill.

Sādhaka said:

Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche saying we can have all the peace summits we want, and it sounds nice, but where does change really come from?

Malcolm wrote:

That's because outcomes are more important than ideology.

Sādhaka said:

Along those lines, from what I remember him saying. I don't see how voting for a republican who receives Monsanto lobby money or military-industrial-complex lobby money vs an democrat one who does too (or vice-versa) helps much.

Malcolm wrote:  
Outcomes are more important than ideology.

Sādhaka said:  
Working for these things is bodhisattva activity. For example, ChNN's ASIA is a political organization. ChNN was never afraid to work in the political world. We cannot do very much on our own about these things, but we can help where we can, and that is also a part of our practice.

If one is confident that he's at least a on-the-Bhumis Bodhisattva, then for him it is proper; and for us, if we're his students then it is only logical to support his endeavors (I personally have contributed to ASIA, although not as much as to other DC projects).

Malcolm wrote:  
Copout.

Sādhaka said:  
As far as this Republic goes, the Constitution isn't even really respected anymore.

Malcolm wrote:  
This is the kind of apathy that destroys democracies. It proves the right wing propaganda is succeeding, at least with you.

Sādhaka said:  
In any case, my point is that Rongzompa and others have stated quite clearly with little room for interpretation, that one cannot really help sentient beings before Awakening.

Malcolm wrote:  
Don't make the perfect the enemy of the good. That's what you are doing here.

Sādhaka said:  
All the Lineage Masters went into retreat, and even if we can't; then at least we can spend our free time outside of our jobs studying and doing whatever practice we can.

Malcolm wrote:  
That practice can involve anything beneficial to sentient beings. One does not need to be a rocket scientist to figure that out.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:09 AM  
Title: Re: Question about inherent existence  
Content:



PadmaVonSamba said:

Buddhism would argue that there are only dynamic processes. There are no unchanging phenomena. All that occurs in phenomenal 'reality' is continuous changing of conditions.

So, it's not even matter of a thing changing into another thing. There's not even the moment of a thing.

Rick said:

Yes, the 'thing' is the transformation, the endless becoming.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no becoming. There is no transformation. Things do not arise out of nothing. One thing does not become another thing.

Understanding dependent origination is not easy, though people think it is easy, but the mind shys away from attempts to deprive it of objects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:21 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

However, I do feel it's very important for contemporary students to know, in all this talk of reforming the Vajrayana...

Malcolm wrote:

There is no need to reform Vajrayāna. If teachers simply followed their mahāyāna vows, there would be no problems. There are no Vajrayāna vows which force one to engage in unconventional behavior. Vratācaryā, brtul shugs spyod pa, literally "the practice of strict observance" should only be engaged in when one has arrived at the secret mantra path of application, and it is fairly well specified in tantras. Yes, there are recommendations that when one's guru should behave a little strangely, one should give it a pass. Unfortunately, naive people in the West seem to feel that "strange behavior" extends to conduct which is clearly criminal.

Cue endless recitation of Tilopa and Naropa, which is the only story anyone can ever really come up with as a justification.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Rick said:

Yes, the 'thing' is the transformation, the endless becoming.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no becoming. There is no transformation. Things do not arise out of nothing. One thing does not become another thing.

Rick said:

Good catch, what I wrote applies to process thinking, not Buddhism. When I see a similarity between two views, I sometimes fall into equating things that are not equal. I blame it all on my love of distillation! And, yes, I thought I 'got' dependent origination when I first read an introduction to it, now five years later I keep discovering how incomplete my understanding is. Same for emptiness, the two truths, karma, rebirth, and all the other Buddhist goodies.

Malcolm wrote:

Arising from cause and condition is subtle, not easy to understand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

heart said:

Yes he wasn't my teacher but if I received a Vajrayogini empowerment from him I wouldn't throw that away for gossip, true or not.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you are not paying attention with all posts flying...no expects people to denounce trungpa if they actually have samaya with him. On the other hand, rituals are easy to perform. Explaining Madhyamaka is difficult.

Toenail said:

I feel like I could do it and I'm not very smart though.

Malcolm wrote:

What is the antecedent for "it" in this sentence? Madhyamaka?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Recently I have been thinking about this and what would be an upasaka clothing in the Tibetan buddhist tradition? For example if one wanted to have a seperate set of clothing for retreats or for important days in the buddhist calendar.

Malcolm wrote:

White trousers and shirt, dresses for women.

windoverwater said:

This gives the impression that there is some problem with women wearing trousers to a more formal dharma event. What's the deal with that?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no problem with women wearing trousers in general. However, most lamas would prefer women wore knee length dresses or skirts at formal dharma events.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 12:57 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

The same Do Khyentse Yeshe dorje who gave him pointing out instructions, drunk, after having dragged him by his hair and spat in his face, yes an action that would be labelled as abusive today.

Malcolm wrote:

And that compares to 40k annual cocaine budget how?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 1:05 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

PS. Do Khyentse Yeshe Dorje Rinpoche's unpleasantness is pure Sunday school sweetness and charm compared to torturing animals or raping someone.

Malcolm wrote:

Next, Sonam will bring up the fact that Do Khyentse hunted animals for a living.

[https://treasuryoflives.org/biographies/view/Do-Khyentse-Yeshe-Dorje/TBRC\\_p698](https://treasuryoflives.org/biographies/view/Do-Khyentse-Yeshe-Dorje/TBRC_p698)

Although he would receive students in his encampment he would also wander the region in the guise of a deer hunter, allegedly reviving the animals he struck down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 1:17 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

Yeah my understanding was that Yidams were aspects of my own enlightened mind, not some self-existent other being. So to refer to them as gods is not even remotely correct. I think the similarity in iconography with Hindu deities may lead to confusion for some people.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also the fact that in kriya tantra people practice by addressing the deity as external, like Tāra, for example, for common siddhis; a kind of practice that is enjoyed by brahmins, which also depends heavily on ritual purity and so on. So, because Vajrayāna is a path of skillful means, it employs people's theistic tendencies. But this vanishes in carya tantra, where the deity is understood as a symbol of the nature of the mind and one visualizes oneself as the deity. By the time we get to HYT, this is all completely abandoned, since now we are to understand, at the time of the result, that all phenomena we experience—aggregates, sense bases, and sense elements—are the display of our own gnosis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 1:39 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I guess that sooner or later fans of these modern-day crazy wisdom "mahasiddhas" will start trying to persuade us that Trungpa could actually fly, that Osel Tendzin could really contain HIV in his body (and that those he allegedly passed it to got it elsewhere), etc. One cannot argue with faith. I just wish that Trungpa/Sogyal, etc. lovers kept loving these legendary past teachers while having eyes wide open regarding the present and future ones. Sadly, they do not, at least in my experience.

Malcolm wrote:

In any case such conduct is strictly condemned in texts such as the commentary on the Kalacakra Tantra, Vimalaprabha, and so on. It even declares in one passage that the great tulzhugs is brahmacarya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

And even in reaching Heat on the Path of Application, there's probably still risk of falling when attempting to engage in said intentional behavior.

Malcolm wrote:

There are three stages: weak, medium, and strong. The first is practiced in secret, the second, in your back yard, only the third can be carried out in the marketplace.

Sādhaka said:

Is there any one Tantra or Commentary that goes into detail on this application of the Five Paths more-so than other Tantras?

Malcolm wrote:

There is a commentary by Jetsun Drakpa Gyaltsen on Vajrayāna abhisamaya. Lamdre itself has very detailed though terse teachings on this as well,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Knotty Veneer said:

And worst of all, they've been convinced that if they pay taxes so everyone in society has access to medical care, they are somehow being robbed. It's ludicrous!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is pretty stupid...but Americans...we are pretty freaking dumb. A large percentage of us want to put a criminal back in the white house.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 3:14 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Okay, thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

According to Jetsun Rinpoche, once you have hit strong heat, the sign is that one's vajra and bell floats when practicing. At this point, one can no longer break samaya. It's more or less equivalent to highest mundane dharmas on the sutra path of application.

Just for reference, HH Dalai Lama has recently stated he is on the sutrayāna path of application's highest mundane dharmas. In order for him to realize the path of seeing, he says he needs to perfect śāmatha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 3:39 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Okay, thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

According to Jetsun Rinpoche, once you have hit strong heat, the sign is that one's vajra and bell floats when practicing. At this point, one can no longer break samaya. It's more or less equivalent to highest mundane dharmas on the sutra path of application.

Just for reference, HH Dalai Lama has recently stated he is on the sutrayāna path of application's highest mundane dharmas. In order for him to realize the path of seeing, he says he needs to perfect śāmatha.

GrapeLover said:

When / where was it he said this, just for interest? In 2018 he was still only aspirational about reaching the path of preparation in this life

( <https://www.dalailama.com/news/2018/teaching-the-heart-sutra-and-stages-of-meditation> )

Malcolm wrote:

I must have misunderstood, or seen someone misrepresenting what HHDL said.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 3:43 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

The relative Siddhis are part of the teachings; and I doubt that the mention of them is there only to lure people into following the path and nothing more.

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly, but having developed them, one can benefit beings. I see little evidence that people are developing them these days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 3:52 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

By and large Americans are completely hoodwinked. It's funny because people talk so much here about freedom and liberties, but for most people I know the thing that limits their freedom more than anything is their employer.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, the major debate now about over the \$3.5 trillion budget that Biden wants to pass is handwringing over whether people will want to go back to work for EMPLOYERS. People like Manchin and Sinema don't want to encourage an "entitlement culture." They are such fools.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 4:43 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Matt J said:

That's too weak of a correlation in my mind. The correlation in my experience is very tight. Of course, I say "seems" because who knows what's actually happening. Of course, the dharma is not responsible for the accumulation of karmic potential to begin with.

In Theravada Abhidhamma-based teaching it is fairly explicitly taught that meditation will lead to some deep, disturbing things to arise if one practices seriously and intensely. As the mind settles, karmic seeds ripen in an environment where there is no clinging/grasping. Some of this can get very intense--- one descriptor is the terror of a mother watching her last son being executed. The idea is that one prepares oneself for this via meditation. I've heard similar teachings across the Mahayana.

I think the emphasis on only positives is misleading, and often catches students off

guard. Very few teachers IME recognize this and adequately prepare students for this.

Malcolm wrote:

There is simply is no basis for claiming that the true practice of Dharma can cause suffering.

To reply to the OP, the Letter to a Friend states:

One who in the past was heedless  
but later becomes heedful  
such as Nanda, Angulimala, Ajatasatru and Udayana,  
is beautiful like the moon free of clouds.

Ārya-caturdharmanirdeśa-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra states:

Maitreya, if a bodhisattva possesses four qualities, they will purify all accumulated nonvirtuous actions. If it is asked which four, the four are repentance, relying on bodhicitta, cultivating antidotes, and turning away from faults.

The Bodhicaryāvatara states:

Even if one commits an utterly unbearable nonvirtue,  
one is instantly free by relying on [bodhicitta],  
just as [one is free] from great fear by relying on a hero.  
For what reason would the cautious not rely on [bodhicitta]?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 4:44 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Sādhaka said:

The relative Siddhis are part of the teachings; and I doubt that the mention of them is there only to lure people into following the path and nothing more.

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly, but having developed them, one can benefit beings. I see little evidence that people are developing them these days.

Toenail said:

Why do you think the weather was always terrible around Norbu Rinpoche? I noticed this also.

Malcolm wrote:

Eight classes.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 4:58 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

Toenail said:

Why do you think the weather was always terrible around Norbu Rinpoche? I noticed this also.

Malcolm wrote:

Eight classes.

Toenail said:

I remember eight or nine years ago or so, he was giving a Dorje Drolo Wang from tenerife. The internet connection was very bad. I was in Asia at the time, but they said it was because of horrible storms in tenerife. I would expect him to control these classes or I would think they pay homage with sun light or cool breezes and so on. How do you explain this? I know he was clairvoyant and could interact with these beings.

Malcolm wrote:

Does one always interfere with children when they are making a ruckus, or only when absolutely necessary?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

But it is a monastic offence to intentionally release semen according to the complete set of Pratimoksa rules. One needs to serve a period of penance for doing such an act.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, because unless it is nocturnal emission, one has come under the influence of strong desire-- which is fine for lay people, not renunciants.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:02 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

excessive masturbation.

Malcolm wrote:

Excess anything is bad for you, including excess water. But you certainly are not going to suggest we stop drinking water because excess water can kill us, right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:03 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Tibetan monks—if they have a good teacher who takes these kinds of things into account—are likely taught Trul Khor in order to be able to control the sexual impulse.

Malcolm wrote:

This is immensely silly. The Sakya masters ridicule the idea that there is any inherent benefit to conserving semen, in relation to the misconception that some people have that the tantric vow of never giving up jasmine-like bodhicitta refers to semen.

Tibetan and Ayurvedic doctors understand that semen is a waste product. Geez. How many times do we have to go through this?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:07 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

I find this obsession with masturbation and no nut november and no fap movements quite silly. I mean ... come on. Seriously what is so bad about touching your willy? Do you feel you are doing it way too much? Well then try getting better things to do, that ought to stop you. But obsessing over masturbation is not helpful. Not to mention that I don't really see what benefit is there for us upasakas.

Malcolm wrote:

I think what they need is a device that gives them a shock anytime they touch it apart from having a whizz. Aversion therapy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:14 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Interesting.

But then how could one possibly regress before the Eight Bhumi, if the above is the case?

Malcolm wrote:

Once one hits the path of seeing, one has reached a certain kind of nonretrogression. At that point one will always take birth in the three upper realms. Buddha births as an animal indicate that he was exhibiting the path below the Mahāyāna patience on the path of application. This is one of the reasons why in other threads, I do not accept the idea that one must be a bodhisattva on the bhumis to help sentient beings. If one is any kind of bodhisattva one can help sentient beings directly, as the Jatakas show.

Of course, an eighth stage bodhisattva on up can emanate as any kind of being in the three realms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:15 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

breaking one's Bodhisattva vows in one's next lifetime before getting the chance to receive Tantric and/or Dzogchen Empowerment again?

Malcolm wrote:

One can only break bodhisattva vows by abandoning aspirational bodhicitta. Even if you break all of the other ones, if you never abandon to root of bodhicitta, you have not broken them completely.

I used to think it was important to achieve buddhahood as fast as possible. I no longer think it is that important. What's important is helping sentient beings. Buddhahood is a desiderata to be sure, but not the most important thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Tibetan monks—if they have a good teacher who takes these kinds of things into account—are likely taught Trul Khor in order to be able to control the sexual impulse.

Malcolm wrote:

This is immensely silly. The Sakya masters ridicule the idea that there is any inherent benefit to conserving semen, in relation to the misconception that some people have that the tantric vow of never giving up jasmine-like bodhicitta refers to semen.

Tibetan and Ayurvedic doctors understand that semen is a waste product. Geez. How many times to we have to go through this?

Toenail said:

There is a known hyped teacher that tells students to eat their semen after masturbation. This is rubbish and has no benefit? I dont do this btw, LOL.

Malcolm wrote:

Who is this person so we can laugh at them?

I mean, there is some protein in semen, but I'd rather eat an oyster.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:28 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Virgo said:

What are your thoughts on that?

Malcolm wrote:

Why put off till later what we can do now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 5:44 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Toenail said:

There is a known hyped teacher that tells students to eat their semen after masturbation. This is rubbish and has no benefit? I dont do this btw, LOL.

Malcolm wrote:

Who is this person so we can laugh at them?

I mean, there is some protein in semen, but I'd rather eat an oyster.

Toenail said:

It is just hearsay. It means I heard it from an at that time close student of his. So technically I did not hear it from him. I do not want to misrepresent what he said or

claim I heard it directly from him if I did not. His name sounds similar to some kind of chinese cabbage.

Malcolm wrote:  
Lama Bok choy?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 6:09 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I'd say that it is simply that he is able to emanate as animals in order to help them to some degree, due to the very fact of his having attained Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, that depends on the narrative you want to follow, really. If it pleases you to think the Buddha achieved Buddhahood a gazillion eons ago, that's fine, and I agree, being a Mahāyāni, but the whole point of the Jatakas and everything up to his demonstration of the twelve deeds was to demonstrate how a bodhisattva practiced the path, soup to nuts, and one cannot take birth as an animal if one has reached the patience of the path of seeing. So, even if he was "emanating" as the Hare King, it was to indicate how bodhisattvas below the path of seeing are to conduct themselves.

The bodhisattva path is arduous, deliberately so. It involves helping sentient beings right from the beginning through the six perfections.

One of the things you seem to forget is that bodhisattvas on the impure stages forget their realization during death, rebirth, and conception, and have to take rebirth again and again as ordinary bodhisattvas until they meet the path again. So what, are you claiming that you should only help sentient beings when you have reattained the path of seeing, that could be thousands of years from now.

And I not talking about attending political rallies. I am talking about being a nurse, doctor, etc., all the right livelihoods that we ought to follow as Buddhist practitioners. I am not talking about being a political activist. I am talking about being an ordinary human being motivated by bodhicitta.

BTW, Trungpa's teacher, Khenpo Gangshar, went around rousting people out of retreat telling them to get off their asses and go help people, whether they were realized or not. He is Trangu Rinpoche's teacher. He was also reckoned to be a great dzogchen lineage master. So you see, not all Lineage Masters have the exact same idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 6:31 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?  
Content:

Sādhaka said:

Longchenpa in his Treasury of Philosophical Systems says that the Tantric Path (which is also a Mahayana Path of course), is basically easy (not mention is supposed to be able to be achieved within a single lifetime). I can't remember the exact quote, but part of it was something like, regarding Tantra & Dzogchen, paraphrased: '...that it is swift and has few difficulties'.

This is somewhat relative of course. I mean most of us in this contemporary society don't have the leisure time to study a lot, and dedicate our entire life to practice; or even have the possibility of learning complex Tantric Yogas etc. (but perhaps where there's a will there's a way) even though we've received Empowerments.

Therefore yea who knows, it could be thousands of years....

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if you keep your samaya very well, if you do not manage to wake up in this life or the bardo, then within seven lifetimes or sixteen. The later is still like a thousand years in the future.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 7:37 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Also, even contemporary mainstream western doctors admit that you temporarily deplete your zinc & selenium stores with an single ejaculation.

Malcolm wrote:

Citation please.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 8:52 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

But I also suspect it has emerged dialectically in the context of American religio-politics, and this context has pushed you too firmly into a position of hostility towards theism/theists.

nightbloom said:

The entire conversation is totally pre-defined by that context. This is already implicit in assertions made in this thread and elsewhere that theism leads to noxious politics, anti-democratic attitudes, etc. It's fine to think that, but it would be great if we could be up front about what's actually going on here when we assert (1) the descriptive accuracy of categories such as theist/atheist, and (2) the unambiguous position of Buddhism on one side or the other.

Malcolm wrote:

It is unambiguous that Buddhism denies any form of a prime mover, first cause, or ex nihilo creation by a supreme being. Thus alone caused theists in every tradition that have encountered Buddhism to see it as atheist, nastika.

As far as the political ramifications of theism go, it is irrefutable that every distinctly monotheist tradition has been imperialistic and oppressive by nature. Not all theistic traditions are necessarily monotheistic. However, since theistic traditions just reflect human absolute monarchies, even the tolerant theistic religions are anti-democratic and despotic by nature.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 9:13 AM

Title: Re: Why do some lay teachers of Tibetan traditions wear maroon monk robes?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

Kind of a side question but what is the difference between the different kind of undershirts (probably not the right word) that monastics wear? I have seen just a solid red, a solid yellow and many like in this picture with the yellow stripe down the middle.

jmlee369 said:

I mentioned the different colours of the donkha briefly in an earlier post in the thread.

Nicholas2727 said:

Your earlier post seems to be going over the outer robe I was referring to the vest worn under their robe. Unless I misunderstood your post. I was referring to how some monks are seen wearing a red vest, some a yellow vest and some a red vest with the yellow stripe down the middle.

Malcolm wrote:

That's what Dongkha is, the "vest", which is actually part of nuns gear in ancient India.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I'd like to see actual medical research on the subject. None of these assertions are

evidence based.

A little digging shows that Horrobin was a quack.

Sādhaka said:

I couldn't necessarily vouch for the following website overall, but there is some citation within the following quote:

<https://www.healthaid.co.uk/healthaid-blog/Could-It-Be-Zinc-Deficiency>

"Frequent sex and masturbation can be one of the key causes of zinc deficiency. David Horrobin, M.D. and Ph.D. from Oxford University, declared that, "The amount of zinc in semen is such that one ejaculation may get rid of all the zinc that can be absorbed from the intestines in one day. This has a number of consequences. Unless the amount lost is replaced by an increased dietary intake, repeated ejaculation may lead to a real zinc deficiency with various problems developing, including impotence... It is even possible, given the importance of zinc for the brain, that 19th century moralists were correct when they said that repeated masturbation could make one mad!" Also Carl C. Pfeiffer, Ph.D., M.D., in his book on zinc stated: "In a zinc-deficient adolescent, sexual excitement and excessive masturbation might precipitate insanity.""

<https://www.menshealth.com/sex-women/a19543996/sex-diet-foods-and-menu/>

...low zinc stores have been blamed for decreases in semen volume and testosterone levels, explains Sara Brewer, M.D., author of Better Sex. "Each ejaculation can expend up to 5 milligrams of zinc, or one-third of your daily allowance,"

If one gets enough zinc and selenium (and also eat animal products in general, as has been mentioned before), then maybe it's not an huge concern.

But there's also the problem of addiction and dopamine issues with wanking too. Like I said in my earlier post, it's not something that is always easy to "do just everyone once in awhile".

Therefore why not practice Yoga and/or get into a healthy sexual relationship instead (in the latter case, even if there is occasional ejaculation happening; there at least is not the same level of addiction and dopamine issues going on as with masturbation).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 9:27 AM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So many of these whiners moaned about 'losing the freedom' to the 10 bucks a month or whatever in union dues but we're oblivious to the fact that it was their employer chomping to privatize their jobs.



Damchö\_Dorje said:

Sounds like short-sighted thinking to me—unionization boosts wages over the long term, but people were put off by losing the dues.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I agree with Chomsky on unions, I think they are a form of political organizing that positively affect nearly everyone, and the effects of unionization trickle into all other kinds of areas and bring overall social improvement. Not to say there aren't corrupt unions and whatnot, but there are also some damn good ones who I trust as political entities -far- more than I trust any politician.

As someone who worked lots of crap jobs for years, I'm just amazed at the fact that so many working people will willingly give up any bargaining power or autonomy they could have at work in favor of "work at will" - it just shows how effective the anti-union propaganda effort has been here.

Malcolm wrote:

Right to work laws are anti-union by design, in the same, right to farm laws are anti-environmentalist by design,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

And yet, the only place where political liberalism arose was deeply theistic Europe, designed, engineered and built by theists.....

Malcolm wrote:

Political liberalism arose first in the British colonies, spearheaded by devotees of Lucretius, who were highly influenced by Locke and Hume (definitely an atheist, possibly influenced by Buddhism) also quite influenced by Lucretius.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 9:45 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

1. Buddhism has frequently employed royal imagery and metaphors. It's all over the place in initiation rites, in the imagery of the mandala, the iconography of the deities, the concept of the cakravartin, and so on.

Malcolm wrote:

The one possible, and likely reading of this was that such tropes were subversive, as were a Buddhist claims that our version of fire pumas were more effective than the Vedic tradition, etc.

No longer were only people who were Kshatriyas by birth eligible to be anointed as cakravartins....now, everyone was.

Other readings might hold that much as the liberal movement in Mid-19th century continental Europe pushed for political power, the mercantile class in ancient India, the main patrons of Buddhism, liberalized their own influence by sponsoring the very public rituals that characterized much of early Esoteric Buddhism,

And prior to that, the obvious clash between Kshatriyas and Brahmins is quite evident in Pali literatures and so on, thus, also subversive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 10:01 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

The funny thing about this argument is that Epicureanism is itself extremely politically quietist. It's an ascetic, world avoiding tradition. Epicurus gets savaged by people like Cicero for having no fidelity to civil society.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Epicureanism was politically quietistic in the Ancient world.

On the other hand, in the colonies it fueled political and religious dissent. This is obvious when one examines the first American atheist book, authored by Ethan Allen, and so on. Lucretius poem was regularly targeted by Christians in the colonies, and so called Deists were regularly excoriated for their atheism and Naturalism. It's not an accident that they used the term "nature's god."

I suggest you read Nature's God: The Heretical Origins of the American Republic

tobes said:

The best illustration of the power and impact of America's original philosophical radicalism may be discovered in the first sentence of the nation's first founding document. Many historians today take for granted that the reference in the preamble of the Declaration of Independence to "the laws of Nature and of Nature's God" amounts to a gesture of conventional piety—and no doubt it was written partly in order to be read in this way. Religious conservatives today routinely celebrate it as proof that America

was founded as a Christian nation. These and similar interpretations serve mainly to express some deep and persistent assumptions about the nature of human experience: that we govern ourselves through acts of faith; that all authority must rest on the assertion of belief in some higher authority; and that all would be well if we could return to the simple faith of our fathers.

Yet “Nature’s God” properly belongs to the radical philosophical religion of deism. It refers to nothing that we commonly mean by the term “God,” but rather to something closer to “Nature.” It tells us that we are and always have been the source of our own authority; that we govern ourselves not through acts of faith but through acts of understanding; and that if we should find ourselves beholden to some other imagined authority, this can only mean that we have constructed the conditions of our own servitude. The Declaration of Independence—precisely where it superficially seems to invoke the blessing of the established religion—really stands for an emancipation of the political order from God.

Malcolm wrote:

Any reading of the Federalist Papers will confirm the above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

tobes said:

I only think it's significant in relationship to the assertion that theism can only lead to absolutism/monarchies etc.

Malcolm wrote:

One of the chief early complaints about Buddhism was that it undermined the social order...

Thus is also true of early Christianity, but for starkly different reasons.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 10:19 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Actually it seems to me that the pre-Christian European pagans weren't really anti-democratic.

Malcolm wrote:

They weren't really theists either. There is no evidence they possessed a systematic theology.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 11:01 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha nowhere mentions sex work as sexual misconduct. Independent, unmarried people are free to do as they wish. If people are in polyamorous relationships, they are also free, since it is all consensual.

Heimdall said:

The Buddha very clearly prohibits sensual dancing, ornaments, and entertainment as a violation of the eight precepts.

Malcolm wrote:

These are fast day vows.

Heimdall said:

The Buddha also very clearly prohibits "sexual misconduct", which at the very least means sex rooted in lust.

Malcolm wrote:

No. It does not mean sexual activity which is a product of desire, you are simply wrong in this point.

The rest of your post is irrelevant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 11:28 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

These are fast day vows.

Heimdall said:

Yes, as ideals for the lay people. Ideals. Not "exceptional behavior that's no longer relevant in our day and age".

Malcolm wrote:

The Upavasa vows have only ever been one day vows for lay people to emulate the conduct of arhats twice a month.

Heimdall said:

Why is sexual misconduct one of the 8 precepts?

Malcolm wrote:

You don't seem to understand the parameters of sexual misconduct.

There are four categories of sexual misconduct when defined from the point of view of the individual: upasaka, upavasa, shramanera, and bhikshu. Eight, when multiplied by gender.

For the latter three, sexual misconduct is any sexual conduct, including masturbation, for the duration the vow is maintained. In the case of the upavasa, the fast day vow, only 24 hours.

Otherwise, for the upasaka, sexual misconduct is defined in terms of partner, place, time, and orifice. A wrong partner is another's spouse, partner, or fiancé, a minor, someone under guardianship, or a close relative. Wrong place means in public, a shrine or temple. Wrong Time means daytime. Wrong Orifice means oral or anal. That's it, this is all described in chapter four of the Abhidharmakosha by Vasubandhu, which is definitive on this subject for Sarvastivadin upasakas like myself.

One is not required to observe the vow of refraining from intoxication and sexual misconduct (the latter depends on the former for upasakas) if one decides one does not wish to hold all five vows. One can be a three vow holder, observing only the restraints from killing, stealing, and lying.

Of course, in Vajrayana, it goes without saying that desire is employed in the path,

As Zhen Li points out, the Tibetan tradition only recognizes Indian source texts of verifiable provenance for such issues.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

The same Do Khyentse Yeshe dorje who gave him pointing out instructions, drunk, after having dragged him by his hair and spat in his face, yes an action that would be labelled as abusive today.

Malcolm wrote:

And that compares to 40k annual cocaine budget how?

Sonam Wangchug said:

How much do you think Virupas stolen Bar tab was worth?

Malcolm wrote:

A few rupees for a few liters. And it wasn't stolen. The king paid his bill.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

That is where we differ, you view him as a man backed by the "Institution of the Karma Kagyu"...

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. You can keep your pure vision. It's just as much a conceptual proliferation as my impure vision. The difference is, I don't need to spend any time at all using casuistry to explain away all of the appalling things Trungpa is reported to have done, which often have third and fourth sources.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Then there is the glaring fact that U-tsang and for instance Khampas are very different.

Malcolm wrote:

You do know that Longchenpa wrote a scathing piece of verse blaming Khampas for ruining his college, right?

Sonam Wangchug said:

Is that good old Sakyapa puritanism I hear?

Malcolm wrote:

Western Buddhism could use a bit of that right now. That's why I brought up Lha Lama Yeshe Ö.

You seem to really get off on relating stories about teachers and their unconventional conduct.

I prefer stories about truly great beings like Sapan, Longchenpa, Ngorchon, Tsongkhapa, etc.

The stories of the Indian Mahāsiddhas often cannot be taken literally. That's why, for example, in the Caryagiti, the inner meaning of many of their dohas is exposed.

Moreover, as I pointed out, both Virupa and Saraha poke fun at those who do not really understand the meaning of mahāmudra, etc., making fun of people who ape vratacaryā without understanding its purpose, which is to test one's own stability. And here, there are clear signs of when one is ready to begin that conduct. In the case of Tilopa and Naropa, Tilopa was testing Naropa's stability, since Naropa had been practicing Vajrayāna for years already. But frankly, to bring up Sogyal and Trungpa, their students had no stable equipoise to test, actually. Thus, presenting their actions as "unconventional behavior" in order to benefit their students, who I will remind you were by every measure beginners in the Dharma, is a false pretense, and a dangerous one.

Frankly, I think that Tibetans as a whole have taken away, in many instances, the wrong message from their reception of the Mahāsiddha tradition. Not only that, but the fragmented way the Mahāsiddha tradition has been received by Western Buddhists has caused many of us to become deviants and enablers of deviants, excusing deviant behavior and lauding frauds as awakened beings because we really can't know who is and who isn't realized. That means depending on anyone's authority other than our own eyes and ears is a huge error. We can only observe whether someone's behavior and teachings correspond with the Dharma as it is taught in the sūtras or tantras or not.

I refer frequently to Sapan's Three Vows because he gives clear instruction about how to evaluate anything that presents itself as Dharma. Of course, you won't read it, because it will offend you, since he questions everything that Tibetans do, apart from what is actually found in the sūtras and tantras and that which agrees with what is found in the sūtras and tantras.

You can claim until the cows come home that this master and that master is realized, but you don't know this from your own realization and clairvoyance. This is the main reason your missives, Sonam, and others like them, are such pious farces.

We don't need outrageous "teachers." We need teachers who can guide people and train them to the level where their vajras and bells levitate in space and beyond. And we are not even talking about the Vajrayāna path of seeing here.

Now of course, I assume that my principle gurus are realized beings. I am also sufficiently aware of my own limitations to understand that this is strictly for my own benefit, this is my concept. It is not an objective fact. This is why on the one hand I feel free to share my unfavorable opinion of Trungpa, Sogyal, etc., and on the other hand, encourage their students to maintain pure perception of them despite whatever opinion I may have, because as Peter pointed out, the former was a qualified vajrācarya, and as you pointed out, the latter did have a sound understanding of Dzogchen according to Nyoshul Khenpo, at least intellectually—and Dzogchen, like dependent origination, is not easy to understand.

You on the other hand insist that the realization of this person and that person you mention is an objective fact, and that therefore, whatever they do is the action of a bodhisattva on the stages. That is, I am sorry to say, is completely deluded. It is not even

conventionally deluded, it is fully deluded. You cannot possibly know this. You can only believe this. It maybe a useful belief for you. However, insisting that your subjective beliefs are objective facts is sad, and possibly harmful to others.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 10:52 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Heimdall said:

If we are strictly going off of what the traditional sources tell us, I'm not projecting Western mores anywhere near to the degree that many on this thread are, like Malcolm claiming that "sex work" and "polyamorous relationships" are fully in line with Buddhist mores.

Malcolm wrote:

Lets see, Central Tibetans were often polyandrous, Eastern Tibetans are often polygamous, as were Indian men, like the Buddha himself. The Buddha counted active sex workers among his disciples, like Ambapali, who met the Buddha towards the end of his life. He certainly never condemned her, and even accepted her invitation to dinner:

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Amrapali>

What were you saying about traditional sources, now?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

So his opinions are not blankets for other lineages.

Malcolm wrote:

He is the greatest living scholar-practitioner of Tibetan Buddhism alive today. His opinions have weight for everyone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 11:36 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Toenail said:

I refer frequently to Sapan's Three Vows because he gives clear instruction about how to evaluate anything that presents itself as Dharma. Of course, you won't read it, because



it will offend you, since he questions everything that Tibetans do, apart from what is actually found in the sūtras and tantras and that which agrees with what is found in the sūtras and tantras

How to read it? Is it translated?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, A Clear Differentiation of the The Three Codes translated by Rhoton.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 12th, 2021 at 11:52 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Related News:

Shambolic International has decided to remove itself from the authority of Mukpo:

Here is a letter of protest about it:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 12:14 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Related News:

Shambolic International has decided to remove itself from the authority of Mukpo:

Here is a letter of protest about it:

Constructelf said:

Is whatever Blaine is reacting to in this letter public yet, or is it still internal/private?

Malcolm wrote:

Its public.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 12:16 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

There are very eminent Nyingmapa masters who did not agree.

Malcolm wrote:

They would not be able to defeat him in debate on any subject, from vinaya to Dzogchen.  
No one alive can.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

He requested teaching from them.

Malcolm wrote:

And they requested teachings from him. They all received many empowerments from him, in fact (with the exception of Chatral Rinpoche who both refused to give teachings to HHDL or attend teachings by HHDL).

But your point as has nothing to do with anything. In Geluk people debate their teachers all the time. It's expected.

I am just saying that they could not defeat him in debate, on any subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 12:54 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Heimdall said:

He was given several women as a handsome young prince by his father to tempt him to remain a prince but only married one of them. And then he renounced her anyways by becoming a monk.

Malcolm wrote:

You really have this wrong.

Heimdall said:

There on his perfect couch, he lay surrounded by his wonderful retinue of consorts, who all resembled goddesses. All the girls were virtuous, agreeable, and wholesome in conduct.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://read.84000.co/translation/UT22084-046-001.html#UT22084-046-001-701>

You are right about one thing, he gave it all up, consorts and all.

Heimdall said:

First of all, I would like to know what actual sources show that Amrapali was actually a prostitute.

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddhist tradition makes it clear she was a very high-priced call girl, in other words, a sex worker. You can look up her entry in the Princeton Dictionary of Buddhism on page 36.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

It's a travesty that they gave the name Mipham to Mukpo Jr.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, HH Penor Rinpoche never really displayed the best judgement in recognizing western tulkus...and I know of a Tibetan disaster or two as well, but decorum prevents me from discussing it. But, that said, he recognized a lot of tulkus, not all of them were likely to turn out good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:10 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

as to the 2nd point, I would say that is subjective.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. HHDL is a master of sūtra, tantra, and the teachings of all four schools.

There are some who are expert in two schools, almost none expert in three. But he is expert in all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: The best English translation for "P'owa"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Best is probably a matter of preference. It's transliterated 'pho ba in Wylie.

Malcolm wrote:

"Transference" is just fine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:21 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

He is, but to say he would defeat anyone living in debate, is an opinion, one which is impossible to prove at that, and one that some do not agree with.

Malcolm wrote:

You are the only person I have encountered that would constitute 'some,' though I supposed some ego-maniac khenpo in the other three schools might disagree because they follow either gzhan stong, Gorampa, or Gorampa's little brother, Mipham. But I am very certain HHDL has read it all. I remember HHDL chastising the Gelukpas because he thought the Bonpos were better at debate. I bet that got their goat, because the Bonpos learn debate from the Gelukpas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:25 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. HHDL is a master of sūtra, tantra, and the teachings of all four schools.

Sonam Wangchug said:

He is, but to say he would defeat anyone living in debate, is an opinion, one which is impossible to prove at that, and one that some do not agree with.

AlexanderS said:

I doubt HDLL could take on Malcolm

Malcolm wrote:

Are you kidding? I wouldn't last 15 seconds. I am quite sure a 15 year old in any decent shedra would have me wrapped up in knots in ten minutes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

I think that would be very tactless, disrespectful and corny to pit two eminent teachers in imaginary philosophical battles vs each other.

Malcolm wrote:

Not at all. Debate was the main sport of Tibet. I just know that Gelukpa geshes are generally more well educated than khenpos in the other schools, and in particular, this is true these days. That may be due to the resources the Ganden Phodrang has that other schools do not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

AlexanderS said:

I think you could do it if it was entirely in English. I was very dissapointed in HDLL's english when I attended his teachings.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, that would not be representative at all. My education, compared to HHDL's, or any serious geshe or khenpo is like high school education compared to a PhD. In terms of Tibetan degrees I have two: a bka' bzhi pa (four doctrines) from His Holiness Sakya Trichen, and sMan pa bka' chu pa (medicine/ten doctrines) degree from Tso Ngon Medical College. Pretty educated in the Dharma for a westerner, pretty average to less than average for a Tibetan Shedra.

any way,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 2:01 AM

Title: Re: Evergrande should make you nervous

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah my parents were organic farmers for a while, it's a noble thing and all but doesn't scale for large scale agriculture very well.

Malcolm wrote:

Things have changed. There are huge organic farms in Bakersfield. My friend's parents own one. Its massive, on the level of Iowa cornfields.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Practicing Dharma, itself, is not the cause for suffering to occur. It's not like suddenly because you are sitting on the cushion or doing visualizations that now all these demons are released.

But, it's like a journey, a road trip. If your car never leaves the driveway, you won't experience anything. As soon as you hit the highway there are going to be bumps and potholes. It's because you are making progress on the journey itself. It's not because there's anything being caused by the vehicle.

The only difference is that the bumps and potholes are things you yourself created in the past.

Crazywisdom said:

Suffering emerges for a dharma practitioner who has doubts and enters non dharma or confuses the path.

Malcolm wrote:

Then axiomatically they are not practicing Dharma. But this of course is why we supplicate the lineage so that our mind turns to dharma, dharma becomes the path, the path removes delusion, and delusion arises as gnosis. Right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 2:18 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We don't need outrageous "teachers." We need teachers who can guide people and train them to the level where their vajras and bells levitate in space and beyond. And we are not even talking about the Vajrayāna path of seeing here

Arnoud said:

I don't understand your view on this. Leaving prints in rock is fake but floating vajra and bell is possible. How do you reconcile or choose between them?

Malcolm wrote:

I didn't say that leaving footprints on rocks were fake. I said that such things can be and are faked. I clearly stated that to be able to do that, one would have to have some power over four elements, like the arhat who self-immolated at the end of his life by entering into the fire element, as a result of his previous practice on the fire kachina.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 2:35 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Arnoud said:

Those of you who have listened to episode 9 of the uncoverage podcast and still defend Trungpa should really be ashamed of yourselves.

Malcolm wrote:

Don't worry, they are shameless. Remember, they judge their teachers not on their actions, but on the number of accolades and endorsements they received from other lamas, whom they think are awakened based on further accolades and endorsements by even more lamas. It's just accolades and endorsements all the way down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Arnoud said:

I sincerely hope you at least partially wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

Even in the selection of food and drink  
for a single day,  
one applies a variety of means for tests of quality.  
And in the building of houses or the making of clothes  
or any other kind of undertaking  
an array of selective tests is made  
to determine quality and competence.  
Even in trivial business transactions

in buying and selling horses, gems,  
and the like, one proceeds only  
after research has been done and inquiries  
made of everyone.  
Such diligence is seen  
even in the petty affairs of this life.  
Yet when it comes to the quality of this  
of this Noble Religion,  
though the quality of their own lives  
from here on out depends on it,  
people do not make any investigation at all—  
as if it were just dog food!  
Instead they cling devotedly to whatever teaching  
comes their way.

They are seen to thoroughly examine  
a guide hired for a single day,  
or a spouse wed for a single lifetime,  
and only then to accept them.

Yet although their interests—  
from now until they have become  
fully enlightened—depend on the choice  
of an excellent preceptor, they accept  
anyone they meet as their master,  
like goods hastily bought in the time of shortage.

Ah, this age of Decline is astonishing!  
People make great effort  
where none is required,  
but in the selection of teachers and religious teachings  
where diligence is truly needed,  
they are seen to be satisfied with any at all.

—— Sakya Pandita, A Clear Differentiation of the Three Codes, SUNY, 2002, pg. 176-177.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of  
Padmasambhava?

Content:

Arnoud said:

Those of you who have listened to episode 9 of the uncoverage podcast and still defend  
Trungpa should really be ashamed of yourselves.

Knotty Veneer said:



And what I don't get is that, horrible and indefensible though Osel Mukpo's actions were, they pale compared to the range and quantity of things Trungpa did. And yet, both factions in Shambhala refuse to see him as anything other than enlightened.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 3:43 AM

Title: Re: Are we all destined for Buddhahood?

Content:

ConfusedOne said:

Because samsara is endless and infinite, does that mean we are all eventually destined for Buddhahood?

Malcolm wrote:

Not necessarily.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:29 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Anyway I hope that the surviving polytheist peoples of the world today can still survive into the future. The Kalash, various tribes all over the world etc. Doubt they really have systematic theologies too.

Malcolm wrote:

They also don't have empires.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:16 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

MiphamFan said:

Anyway I hope that the surviving polytheist peoples of the world today can still survive into the future. The Kalash, various tribes all over the world etc. Doubt they really have systematic theologies too.

Malcolm wrote:

They also don't have empires.

nightbloom said:

I don't know..... when I think about the behavior of the pre-Christian Romans, or the Celts & Germans, I definitely don't come away with the feeling that polytheism is particularly peaceful.

Malcolm wrote:

Who made the claim they were?

nightbloom said:

The only reason why the infamously violent Celts didn't murder and enslave everyone on the Italian peninsula is because they were much more disorganized and fractured by constant internal warfare than the Romans (whose rise to power was probably provoked in part by their encounter with these invading tribesmen).

Malcolm wrote:

The Roman Empire was consolidated under Augustus. The Romans however did not bind their empire together with a unified belief system. That's why Rome fell, but Christianity ruled Europe for 1500 years in the remains of the former Roman Empire.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:25 AM

Title: Re: Important New Publication: Dhāraṇīsaṃgraha, Hidas

Content:

Zhen Li said:

This may be of interest to some members:

Hidas, Gergely, Powers of Protection: The Buddhist Tradition of Spells in the Dhāraṇīsaṃgraha Collections, Berlin: De Gruyter, 2021

<https://library.oapen.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.12657/50224/9783110713367.pdf>

Malcolm wrote:

Useful. Thanks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:28 AM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Virgo said:

If people don't know how to judge a tree by it's fruit, there isn't too much that can be done for them.

Virgo

Knotty Veneer said:

I don't think Mukpo's actions were genetic. I think they were a product of the groupthink that exists in Shambhala. If you set up a belief system where you refuse to apply societal norms to the leader, it's almost inevitable he will not apply them himself. I am by no means excusing Mukpo but I doubt many people would act differently when surrounded by that type of unthinking adulation and apparent lack of consequences.

PeterC said:

Mukpo Jr was heavily abused as a child, then put into a position where he was adulated and told he has complete power over his followers, people who considered Mukpo Sr's conduct as the "authentic" dharma. The results should not be surprising to anyone.

If you do the right retreats and learn the right rituals you are qualified to give empowerments. If you spend enough time studying you are capable of explaining the Dharma. But you could still be completely unqualified as a guru because you lack the qualities. And you could also be a terrible human being because of the psychological damage you've sustained, in the case of Mukpo Jr.

This is why, contrary to the assertions of our friend Sonam, you cannot just take the endorsement of other lamas, however famous they are, at face value, because they give these endorsements far too freely and rarely go back on them when things go wrong. You have to do your own due diligence.

Malcolm wrote:

For the refrain: Ah, this age of Decline is astonishing!  
People make great effort  
where none is required,  
but in the selection of teachers and religious teachings  
where diligence is truly needed,  
they are seen to be satisfied with any at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:43 AM

Title: Re: Let's talk about common misconceptions of Buddhism

Content:

nightbloom said:

I don't know..... when I think about the behavior of the pre-Christian Romans, or the Celts & Germans, I definitely don't come away with the feeling that polytheism is particularly peaceful.

Malcolm wrote:

Who made the claim they were?

nightbloom said:

The only reason why the infamously violent Celts didn't murder and enslave everyone on the Italian peninsula is because they were much more disorganized and fractured by constant internal warfare than the Romans (whose rise to power was probably provoked in part by their encounter with these invading tribesmen).

Malcolm wrote:

The Roman Empire was consolidated under Augustus. The Romans however did not bind their empire together with a unified belief system. That's why Rome fell, but Christianity ruled Europe for 1500 years in the remains of the former Roman Empire.

nightbloom said:

Weren't you arguing that mono-theism in particular tends to lead to an impulse towards conquest?

Malcolm wrote:

Romans were not so much interested in conquest as they were in land and defense. Thus began with the Celts launching raids against Rome beginning 390 bc. Then there was the era of the Punic wars, etc. But during this period Rome did not actually subjugate their defeated enemies, they just forced them to pay tributes. The period of garrisoning Roman troops in conquered lands really didn't begin until the end of the Republic, and the rise of the Imperium, but even here, Romans were generally more like raiders than conquerors. They really didn't have a program to spread their culture to other nations, unlike ideologically motivated theists such as Christians and Muslims.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

end on how one evaluates "practicing Dharma". It might be the case that I practice Dharma quite badly. I'm lazy, inattentive, forgetful, uncaring, and stingy.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a slight twist on this:

I supplicate the guru so that dharma becomes the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:19 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:  
Sādhaka said:  
Malcolm,

The guy was a respected M.D. from Oxford; and if he fell off the wagon and became an “quack”, then whatever; but I did a little digging myself, and well, just read the wikipedia article on him, and since it’s wikipedia it likely has an leftist & pro-pharma slant. Therefore it’s probably not going to give his side of the story.

Malcolm wrote:  
I did not derive this idea from Wikipedia. The Medical establishments respect for him in Britain is not all you think it is, and you still have not provided any evidence-based studies for the claim you are making, which is essentially a medical claim.

Sādhaka said:  
Yoga practice

Malcolm wrote:  
Monks practice with a hastamudra, a lag gi phyag rgya.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:21 PM  
Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic  
Content:  
Dan74 said:  
Then his tetralemma

Malcolm wrote:  
Rejects actual positions people held in Ancient India, it is not a logical formula, as you correctly induce.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:22 PM  
Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic  
Content:  
Caoimhghín said:  
the tetralemma...

Malcolm wrote:  
Rejects actual positions people held in Ancient India, it is not a logical formula in the modern sense.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:23 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

PeterC said:

The stuff that goes on with indian gurus is on a whole different level. But all the same excuses are used - it was for the student's benefit, the guru didn't take pleasure in it, other great gurus have said he's an enlightened being, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Accolades and endorsements all the way down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:26 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

This board has been pretty hard on crypto/blockchain from what I've seen. I've been skeptical/agnostic on it myself, but am starting to see an inkling of positive and practical use in web 3 and decentralized apps.

This tweet from Naval Ravikant sums it up: Web 2: Users are the data, corporations own the platform, and the code is closed.

Web 3: Users own their data, contributors own the platform, and the code is open. Anyone else geeky enough to have an opinion on this stuff?

Malcolm wrote:

Web 4: Corporations buy everything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

This board has been pretty hard on crypto/blockchain from what I've seen. I've been skeptical/agnostic on it myself, but am starting to see an inkling of positive and practical use in web 3 and decentralized apps.

This tweet from Naval Ravikant sums it up:

Anyone else geeky enough to have an opinion on this stuff?

Malcolm wrote:

Web 4: Corporations buy everything.

Queequeg said:

If they bought it, that would at least imply a bargained for exchange. Nah. More likely, they just figure out how to take it.

Malcolm wrote:

The simplest way to take things is to buy them. You just make an offer no sane person (who is by now piss poor and struggling) can refuse. Data will be the new blood. Right now, we are so dumb, we just give our data away.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

Queequeg said:

This brings me back to something I'm becoming more and more convinced of everyday - the left is making a huge strategic mistake by not emphasizing "fairness". Everyone knows what fair play is, and everyone, even cheaters, know where the lines are. This is what should be emphasized in every situation and then the particular obstacle to fairness is easily identified and its remedy measurable. We have all of this language and logic worked out in common law - it doesn't need to be reinvented.

Malcolm wrote:

Agreed. However, Bernie does emphasize it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Hazel said:

I've been watching myself sleep (creepy!) and have noticed some things about types of thoughts, both as falling asleep and while awake.

Here "thought" refers to auditory thoughts.

\* There's a thread of thought I'm holding onto deliberately.

Malcolm wrote:

Mindfulness.

Hazel said:

\* There's a thread of thought I wander off on without really realizing it or being very aware of it until after the fact.

Malcolm wrote:  
Distraction.

Hazel said:  
\* There's a series of disjointed thoughts that don't really connect or make logical sense. I often notice this after the fact as I'm falling asleep.

Malcolm wrote:  
Conceptuality.

Hazel said:  
\* Babble. Chatter that's not quite clear what's being thought, but just makes the sound of thought. Like someone mumbling.

Malcolm wrote:  
Conceptuality

Hazel said:  
\* Babble (not my voice). Incoherent words from an assortment of voices I might have heard throughout the day. This happened to me a LOT as a kid often as a cacophony of different voices, but less frequent and less intense as an adult.

Malcolm wrote:  
Conceptuality

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:35 PM  
Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?  
Content:  
dharmafootsteps said:  
I'm still very much on the fence about whether web 3 will take off at all, and whether it will have a positive impact if it does, but I think there's quite a lot of misunderstanding in the thread so far, which doesn't lead to any meaningful discussion.

Malcolm wrote:  
Web 3 is Web 2. There is no significantly new technology here. Blockchain is old tech, and not efficient.

The basic OSI model is still the same, really the only difference now is that the physical layer has gone wireless, but the data link layer, the network layer, etc. are still based on TCP/IP.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:36 PM



Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

narhwal90 said:

thinking maybe in 10-15 years Amazon/Microsoft/Google will have sunk claws deep enough into their customers to have worn the shine off.

Malcolm wrote:

Subscription software is annoying.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Giovanni said:

The problem is that those who see all teachers as perfect, not just their own, will invent more elaborate woo woo stories to excuse it.

Josef said:

This is because their actual practice is incredibly fragile. So fragile is their faith that they have to just throw hoops to excuse the abuses of people they have never even met in order to feel secure in their identity as Buddhists.

Malcolm wrote:

Its kind of like white fragility amongst white conservatives—constantly accusing liberals of brittleness, when in reality it is they who are brittle, when their cherished icons are found wanting.

I also find it of interest that the most arch conservative voices in all of this come from establishment Nyingmapas, who, of course, are the least conservative when it actually comes to innovations. One detects a little insecurity there? I imagine they must freak out when they hear that Chogyal Namkhai Norbu dismissed the notion that every word attributed to Guru Rinpoche in the Rinchen Terdzo, for example, could actually have been set down or spoken by Guru Rinpoche. He didn't give a percentage...he just said that it was impossible that it all could possibly come from Padmasambhava.

This is why harping on "This one and that one is a tertön" really makes no sense. Of course, if a terma does not contradict the teachings of the Buddha, there is no reason to immediately condemn it and say, "This is a false Dharma," as long as it is correct in its essentials; the same goes with dream teachings, pure visions, and the like, which are found in ALL schools. I also practice termas, so I am not criticizing termas per se (most of the Sakya and Nyingma sadhanas in my cyclical practice regimen were composed by Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo). But I am critiquing the constant refrain heard here that the conduct of tertöns is absolutely beyond all judgement. This is just gaslighting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 10:07 PM

Title: Re: Evergrande should make you nervous

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I'm kind of surprised that no one around here has brought this^ up.

Now those towards the further left would often see Russell Brand as an “conspiracy theorist” and those towards the further right seem to see him as an gatekeeper; however one of the biggest red-flag things that he pointed out in the above video is:

<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/partnership/partners/?id=2983>

See under the heading “Partners”^.

Those corporations are as unsustainable as you can get.

Malcolm wrote:

Page has been hacked.

<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/partnership/partners/?id=2983>

All it says is Monsanto. But Monsanto is not even Monsanto anymore. It was bought by Beyer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 10:13 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

dharmaf footsteps said:

I'm still very much on the fence about whether web 3 will take off at all, and whether it will have a positive impact if it does, but I think there's quite a lot of misunderstanding in the thread so far, which doesn't lead to any meaningful discussion.

Malcolm wrote:

Web 3 is Web 2. There is no significantly new technology here. Blockchain is old tech, and not efficient.

The basic OSI model is still the same, really the only difference now is that the physical layer has gone wireless, but the data link layer, the network layer, etc. are still based on

TCP/IP.

dharmaf footsteps said:

Right, if you go far enough down it's the same technology, but what's new is building on top of the blockchain isn't it?

Malcolm wrote:

TCP/IP is already a kind of blockchain. You sent data out in packets with unique ids, they find the fastest route to the target, and the data layer reassembles the packets, etc., until its presented to the the user.

dharmaf footsteps said:

We're only on cusp of that. Currently if I want to engage with a web application it's running on a remote server with a remote database locked away by the corporation that owns it. With web3 the applications runs on decentralised networks that the users participate in, those participants of the network own it and are involved in its governance. If it's profit making, they are the recipients, not a single centralised corporation. In fact it all sounds rather socialist no?

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is, as been discussed elsewhere, is the trust issue. Corporations are never going to trust anonymous users to maintain data integrity of the block chain database. Blockchain might be useful for supply chains, but only if controlled by the suppliers and distributors themselves.

dharmaf footsteps said:

Whether this vision will be pulled off or not I don't know, but if it does it would seem that it will radically changes things. Imagine all the users of Facebook owned it, voted on its use, decided if it was going to use paid advertising for example, and if so receive the benefits of that revenue between them.

Malcolm wrote:

For this reason alone, your vision is a pipe dream. Or maybe, bong dream is more apropos these days, since no one smokes opium anymore.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: There's a reincarnation of Chogyam Trungpa and emanation of Padmasambhava?

Content:

Josef said:

It is very much like the pseudo-patriotism of the American right.

Malcolm wrote:

There is an interesting and noticeable correlation between the Nyingma pseudo-conservatives and the American right, noticeably, they both spend an inordinate

amount of time bitching about American liberals on Facebook.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:23 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

The difference with web3 is you have to share your code...

Malcolm wrote:

And the companies like Apple will take it and incorporate it into their products. Case in point: MacOS is based on FreeBSD. I am sure the unix boys who wrote it are regretting it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Very Kagyu of you today. Let's play the flip game. The guru us an illusion. The Yeshe Lama is one's own mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. It is a formula found in Sakya texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: Working With Spirits Towards Worldly Goals

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

I've recently come to learn however that it's considered a minor transgression of vows to make offerings to worldly spirits.

Malcolm wrote:

False.

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

Specifically, it said sacrifices such as animals or living beings, but it did seem to read as generally anything to do with worldly spirits is to be refrained from, other than pacifying practices or karmic debts.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, no live sacrifice. Generally, unless HYT, no meat.

But there are offerings to worldly spirits, for example, there is the Jvalamukha Water offering to pretas. It is a sutra rite, anyone can do it without transmission.

And in HYT, there are offerings made to Indra, and so on, the eight naga kings, etc. These are all worldly beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Any thoughts on web 3?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

The difference with web3 is you have to share your code...

Malcolm wrote:

And the companies like Apple will take it and incorporate it into their products. Case in point: MacOS is based on FreeBSD. I am sure the unix boys who wrote it are regretting it.

narhwal90 said:

It is an alarming trainwreck inside. I ran an file/email server on MacOS for a while, for a small independent business- each successive OS update would subtly break things; there is a tremendous amount of undocumented magic stuff that happens with little regard to backwards compatibility. I eventually punted all the server functions over to a Linux box w/ raid and have lived a calmer and more peaceful life ever since.

Malcolm wrote:

To a hammer, everything is a nail.

But these days, I would not bother running an in-house mail server.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 13th, 2021 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Prayer Wheel Questions

Content:

Seeker12 said:

I wonder if it would be distracting or confusing for me to know that there are two different mantras inside

Malcolm wrote:

No, it would not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 12:52 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

If it is something that is seen as inherently harmful (be it because it shows too much lust, or damaging energies or whatever),

Malcolm wrote:

Anal sex can mess up the penetratee's downward voiding vāyu. And the penetrator can get E. coli, etc., infections from it. The former is the energetic issue. The latter is the hygiene issue. Also aggressive fellatio (gagging) can cause problems with both prāna vāyu (responsible for swallowing) and the ascending vāyu (talking etc.).

Likewise, intercourse during menstruation can cause problems for women.

But obviously in India we can see oral and anal sex were well known and understood, for example the Khajuraho, etc.

<https://www.holidify.com/pages/sex-temple-in-india-4413.html>

And in the end is really none of my business what people do, solo, in couples, or in groups.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

But from your personal standpoint do you see any reason for modern practitioners with condoms, lubes, douches, privacy etc etc to follow these prohibitions (together with the other ones such as not during day, etc which do not directly harm partner/s)?

Malcolm wrote:

Nope.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 5:27 AM

Title: Re: Evergrande should make you nervous

Content:

Sādhaka said:

big gov

Malcolm wrote:

Is here to stay. Someone has to keep those pesky, juvenile delinquent red states in line.

Anyway, the blue states pay for the red states. If they don't want the big bad government interfering in their affairs, they need to reject the massive federal stipends we send them to pay for their absurdly poor governance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 6:53 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Toenail said:

How can we restore the winds after doing all these things you mentioned?

Malcolm wrote:

Good question. Refrain from doing them, if you have disturbed the winds.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 9:08 AM

Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

the tetralemma...

Malcolm wrote:

Rejects actual positions people held in Ancient India, it is not a logical formula in the modern sense.

Caoimhghín said:

IMO, it is precisely because the Buddha uses a simple two-valued logic that the tetralemma is not a logical proposition. In a system with more than two valid logical values, let's say with "true," "false," and "truthy-falsey;" the tetralemma can be construed as a logical proposition. It can't be construed so with simple two-valued logic.

Malcolm wrote:

You are missing the point. Some proposed that existents arise from existent (Samkhya), others proposed they arose from nonexistents (Vaishesika), still other from existents and nonexistents, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 8:06 PM

Title: Re: Working With Spirits Towards Worldly Goals

Content:

Earl Grey said:

Could you please share information on where to find this, how to do it, and perhaps if you are willing, your own experience in it?

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure were you can kind the Jvalamukha rite, though there is a stray translation of mind out in the wild of it. Otherwise, the HYT material needs to be learned from your teacher and tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 14th, 2021 at 8:10 PM

Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You are missing the point.

Caoimhghín said:

I disagree. I never mentioned the "point" of the tetralemma, merely that it uses a two-valued logic.

Malcolm wrote:

My point, which everyone seems to either ignore or miss, is that these negations referred to real positions people held. That's all. Therefore, discussing them as if they are any more than simple negations is mistaken.

Other than the dispute between Sakya and Geluk over whether two or four negations are appropriate with respect to ascertaining the ultimate, you will not find, in Indian Buddhist texts, a treatment of the so-called tetralemma as a logical device on its own, unlike say syllogisms, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 15th, 2021 at 3:41 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Matt J said:

That's absolutely terrible in my mind that people would make others feel adharmic for one's sexual orientation. Traditional Buddhism has a lot of things wrong with it--- beliefs in flat earth, strange models of atoms, Mount Meru as the center of the universe, and bigotry especially toward women and people with different sexual orientation/gender identities. I don't think we should accept such things simply because some ancient worthy said so. And there are plenty of teachers out there who agree.

Heimdall said:

One's knowledge on gravity is distinct from how one should conduct their life in relation to other human beings.

If instead of changing ourselves to the Dharma, we demand the Dharma to change to ourselves, don't you fear that you may not be practicing Dharma to begin with?



Malcolm wrote:

We all do our best. That's all anyone can expect. Our karma belongs to ourselves alone, so, unless we are harming someone, what we do and how we practice is no one's business. Savitri Devi's view were perverse, beyond the wrong views she held as a pseudo Hindu.

Further, taking an inordinate interest in what other people do in their bedrooms as well as having a lot of judgement about it is rather pathetic, no? It's none of our business.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 16th, 2021 at 8:24 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Heimdall said:

I got a translation of Thich Nhat Han's book on Buddhist ceremonies, prayers, and various sutras, and during one of the opening prayers, there is an explicit prayer to "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana, the Sun".

While I do not question Thich Nhat Han's wisdom given his experience as a monk and his Plum Village movement, there's a part of me that red flagged this questioning of this was really from Buddhism.

While searching for Bodhisattva Gaia, I only found references to his work and Plum Village.

Was this him incorporating Western ecological theological concepts into Buddhism where it didn't belong? Is there an equivalent to Gaia in Zen Buddhism that I didn't see before? Why would Earth be a Bodhisattva other than sunyata (but wouldn't that be like making a prayer to a monkey because the monkey is Sunyata)?

Malcolm wrote:

Prithvi = Gaia Vairocana is a name for the sun.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 16th, 2021 at 8:29 PM

Title: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Toenail said:

There is a known hyped teacher that tells students to eat their semen after masturbation. This is rubbish and has no benefit? I dont do this btw, LOL.

Malcolm wrote:

Who is this person so we can laugh at them?

I mean, there is some protein in semen, but I'd rather eat an oyster.

Adamantine said:

I hope not on the half-shell? Those little guys are still alive, so that's sadly adharmic...

Malcolm wrote:

Oysters are not sentient. Even vegans eat them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 16th, 2021 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: Ice is melting on the North Pole

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Gaping hole opened up in 'Last Ice Area' of the Arctic, NASA images show

<https://mashable.com/article/arctic-climate-change>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 17th, 2021 at 2:44 AM

Title: Re: Ice is melting on the North Pole

Content:

Inedible said:

This isn't a new thing. Shipping lanes are opening up and resources such as gold, diamonds, and natural gas are becoming available. Now that so much North Pole ice is going away we are already fighting over who gets to exploit the new opportunities up there.

Malcolm wrote:

The point of my post was to respond to Amelius' complaints about absence of photos.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 17th, 2021 at 2:46 AM

Title: Re: Working With Spirits Towards Worldly Goals

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

I've recently come to learn however that it's considered a minor transgression of vows to make offerings to worldly spirits.

Malcolm wrote:

False.

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

Specifically, it said sacrifices such as animals or living beings, but it did seem to read as generally anything to do with worldly spirits is to be refrained from, other than pacifying practices or karmic debts.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, no live sacrifice. Generally, unless HYT, no meat.

But there are offerings to worldly spirits, for example, there is the Jvalamukha Water offering to pretas. It is a sutra rite, anyone can do it without transmission.

And in HYT, there are offerings made to Indra, and so on, the eight naga kings, etc. These are all worldly beings.

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

Leaving the HYT and practices that are still relatively Buddhist in nature aside (I had to quote the whole post however so that I can hopefully post this), your first point on it being a minor transgression is false is what I wanted to investigate further.

I came under the impression due to a portion of a text stating that in the Jonang Kalachakra tradition, It could have been a misunderstanding on my end, but that is how i initially interpreted it. The book to my knowledge is not restricted, so I can find and cite the passage if that helps any. Your response indicates however that this is not a common view or practice, so i did want to see if you have any insight into the Jonang Kalachakra practices?

Malcolm wrote:

Post the passage....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 17th, 2021 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Adamantine said:

I hope not on the half-shell? Those little guys are still alive, so that's sadly adharmic...

Malcolm wrote:

Oysters are not sentient. Even vegans eat them.

ManiThePainter said:

Are molluscs not sentient?

Malcolm wrote:  
No, I don't think so.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, October 17th, 2021 at 8:10 PM  
Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation  
Content:

Adamantine said:  
This article cites relevant scientific sources, seems the little ones do experience pain and react to predators..it's just not that simple to comprehend or quantify such a different form of experience.

<https://medium.com/@jd.feliz/the-case-for-vegans-eating-oysters-mussels-other-invertebrates-961747367305>

Malcolm wrote:  
Every argument introduced here can also be made about plants.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, October 18th, 2021 at 4:23 AM  
Title: Re: History of Gelug and Rime Gelugpas  
Content:

Javierfv1212 said:  
I was wondering what are some good sources for the history of the Gelug school in general (not just of individual figures like the Dalai Lamas). Particularly I am interested in the later periods (after the great 5th) since there doesn't seem to be a lot of sources on this. Who were the greatest and most influential scholars and practitioners? What were the big events?

Also, a related question I have concerns the Rime movement and Gelug figures. So far I can only find one Gelug figure that was associated with the nonsectarian study and practice movement, Minyak Kunzang Sonam. Of course, there is also Shabkar, but he is before the rise of Rime proper. Were there others?

Malcolm wrote:  
Tsongkhapa was a nonsectarian master. And there are many others in the history of the Geluk schools. Indeed, in Geluk, rivalry amongst different colleges was far more intense than extra-sectarian impulses.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, October 18th, 2021 at 4:28 AM  
Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation  
Content:

Adamantine said:

I hope not on the half-shell? Those little guys are still alive, so that's sadly adharmic...

Malcolm wrote:

Oysters are not sentient. Even vegans eat them.

Crazywisdom said:

Mollusks are in the animal family. Vegans by definition do not eat animals. You'd have to prove that claim.

Malcolm wrote:

Bivalves are not sentient. Google oysters + sentience + vegan. You will discover there is no consensus among vegans on this issue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 12:58 AM

Title: Re: History of Gelug and Rime Gelugpas

Content:

Javierfv1212 said:

Also, a related question I have concerns the Rime movement and Gelug figures. So far I can only find one Gelug figure that was associated with the nonsectarian study and practice movement, Minyak Kunzang Sonam. Of course, there is also Shabkar, but he is before the rise of Rime proper. Were there others?

PeterC said:

There's always Gendun Chopel, though I'm sure the Gelugpas won't claim him as one of theirs...

Brunelleschi said:

He was an interesting figure but apparently he was an avid visitor of brothels. Also the fact that D\*nald L\*pez, that famous hater of all things good and true, seems fond of him makes me a bit skeptical.

Malcolm wrote:

I personally enjoyed hanging out with Don Lopez. He is quite bright and far more open-minded than he gets credit for. And as for Ganden Chopel, he was a very interesting character indeed, and his mastery of Madhyamaka is very evident in his Ornament of Nagarjuna's Intent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 5:56 AM

Title: Re: Killing animals... Is it acceptable in Dzogchen

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Only if you can bring them back to life.

Michael126unknown said:

Can we kill or hunt if we are a Dzogchen practitioner, or should we avoid killing animals unless it is necessary?

Further, may the meat/corpse from a dying animal be given in any type of offering practice (At least visualizing it as offered) or would it be disrespectful (not sure if this is the right term) toward the deities?

Thank you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 8:06 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Right, it's definitely a misunderstanding for people to conflate Vairocana with the sun. The sun is limited, and Vairocana is unlimited.

Malcolm wrote:

Vairocana is an alternate name for the sun, Surya. This is well known.

Zhen Li said:

As for Gaia Bodhisattva, actually, I don't think it is Pṛthivī. I cannot find Pṛthivī mentioned as a bodhisattva in any text, only as a devā. Probably the appropriate equivalent would Vasudhārā Bodhisattvā (持世菩薩). These are often conflated but I can't find any texts that make the identity explicit.

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely Pṛthivī. Vasudhara is Laxmi, not Mother Earth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, it is probably not meant to specifically be Pṛthivī

Malcolm wrote:

Pṛthivī was called to witness the Buddha's awakening when he made the bhumisparśa mudra. This passage, "when we touch the Earth" is a reference to bhumisparśa mudra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 10:20 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Heimdall said:

they'll kill you to prove their point about their loving god

I'm glad there's no Buddhists in history who did the same thing.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, they didn't kill heathens for not believing in their god, in the case of Shri Lanka for example, they just killed them for lebensraum—millions, according to the Dipavamsa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Rick said:

1. What does 'designate' mean in "impermanent collections of causes and conditions are designated by mere conceptual labels?"

2. Does this passage explain why there is no becoming, no transformation (from your quote above) ?

Malcolm wrote:

A collection appears, it is then given a designation.

In order for there to be becoming and transformation, there should be an entity which comes into being and is transformed.

When the meaning of "arising through conditions" is understood, at that point, the meaning of dependent origination is understood, and at that point, emptiness is also understood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 10:43 PM

Title: Re: Working With Spirits Towards Worldly Goals

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

The worship of spirits is considered wrong when the sacrifice of a living being such as an animal is involved. This includes making offerings to spirits of the dead, nature spirits,, or any unseen beings related to prosperity, good fortune, and the like.

So the first half of course is obvious, and I'm in agreement with it, but the following finishing clause has me a little confused, and again could be due to my current understanding (or lack thereof).

Malcolm wrote:

This passage in its entirety refers to blood sacrifices. It is a condemnation of animism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 10:46 PM

Title: Re: indestructible wind-and-mind

Content:

Fig said:

The other day I came across the phrase “indestructible wind-and-mind” and it struck a chord in me so I searched online. Most references I saw seemed to be referring to completion stage practices from a Kadampa perspective.

I have not been able to find a Tibetan translation of this phrase and I am wondering if this is something specific to Kadampa or if it refers to something that is known in Dzogchen by another name.

The other day I came across the phrase “indestructible wind-and-mind” and it struck a chord in me so I searched online. Most references I saw seemed to be referring to completion stage practices from a Kadampa perspective.

I have not been able to find a Tibetan translation of this phrase and I am wondering if this is something specific to Kadampa or if it refers to something that is known in Dzogchen by another name.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, in Dzogchen is it called the "rgyu'i thig le," the causal bindu, which has the same meaning as "mi zhig thig le," the indestructible thigle, which is the fusion of the mind, winds, and the original reproductive tissues of the father and mother in the body that acts as the support for our life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 19th, 2021 at 11:20 PM

Title: Re: “Bodhisattva Gaia” and “Vairocana Sun”

Content:

Heimdall said:

Remember as well that Indra is in incessant warfare against the Asuras...

Malcolm wrote:

It is worth noting that Buddhists are Team Indra with respect to the destruction of Tripura, the Three Cities of the Asuras.



[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tripura\\_%28mythology%29](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tripura_%28mythology%29).

We just substituted Mahākāla and Śrīdevī, Shiva and Parvati's children, for Shiva.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A collection appears, it is then given a designation.

Rick said:

Does giving it a designation impute existence to the collection? (I'm not familiar with the term 'designate' as used in dharma teachings.)

Malcolm wrote:

"Designate" means "label." For example, "library" designates a collection of books.

"Book" designates a collection of pages, and so on.

Rick said:

In order for there to be becoming and transformation, there should be an entity which comes into being and is transformed.

So Buddhism doesn't buy the notion of a 'pure' becoming/transformation \*without\* an entity that becomes/transforms.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, since there is no entity, an inherent existent, that comes into being or transforms. All things are simply dependent designations, which are empty.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 5:01 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

"Designate" means "label." For example, "library" designates a collection of books.

"Book" designates a collection of pages, and so on.

Rick said:

So to designate a set of parts as a table is an act of mere naming, like assigning a ID number to a person, no reification of the designated object is involved, yes?

Malcolm wrote:

When one does not know the nature of things, indeed tables are thought to contain tables. When one knows the nature of things, one knows that tables do not contain tables.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 9:00 AM

Title: Re: If one is Transgender and Dzogchen/Vajrayana practice...

Content:

Michael126unknown said:

Here is my question. If one is transgender then does this mean they cannot practice Vajrayana or Dzogchen because I remember hearing some things about the channels in the body having relation with the gender, etc. and also I am wondering if since the h\*rmones and also g\*nitals are changed it has an impact on the practice? Or not?

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

No, it does not mean one is unable to practice Vajrayana or Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Queequeg said:

Just because you can, doesn't mean you have to.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/10/20/opinion/quitting-jobs-resignation-employment.html>

Whaddaya think?

Malcolm wrote:

Just make sure your parents are able or willing to let you move home.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Aemilius said:

In a sutra Shakyamuni says, in the last part of his life, that his body is old and worn out like an old and many times repaired chariot. Did becoming really end?

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, he did not take rebirth again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 20th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

This is a global phenom...

Queequeg said:

If people have enough to eat and a roof over their head and that becomes the baseline, people start asking, "Why am I doing this work thing again?"

"I would prefer not to."

-Bartleby

This freaks Republicans out. Their response is, "Life is too easy. Turn up the suffering", from the comfort of their seat on a private jet.

Malcolm wrote:

Ministry of the Future, by Kim Stanley Robinson. This book was discussed recently on the forum, and I finished it over the weekend...much food for thought. One of the nicer ideas was blockchaining all money, to eliminate fraud and tax evasion, as in no private transactions any more, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Queequeg said:

That would require states to intervene and make their blockchain currency the only legal tender, wouldn't it? Sounds like a good idea. I imagine the new tax havens would be jurisdictions without such traceable currency.

Malcolm wrote:

Read the book, if you haven't. It's compelling for its ideas, if not its writing (the editor is atrocious and should be fired).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 3:56 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Archie2009 said:

In a sense being disabled and found unfit for work was a godsend for me. In terms of having a social life it's proved a major obstacle (autism), but I was always a loner

anyway. I don't miss the mental exhaustion of unceasing human interaction.

Malcolm wrote:

One needn't be autistic to find unceasing human interaction exhausting...I find it pretty exhausting myself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 4:47 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

You're coming round to blockchains?

Malcolm wrote:

I never said I was against blockchain. I simply don't regard it as the panacea that some people do. If you recall, I very specifically said it was useful for such things as tracking shipments, etc. In this case, it would require that the major central banks coordinated the major world currencies, the dollar, yuan, euro, etc., in such a way that any currencies not in the system would simply be worthless. Drug traffic would dry up overnight. Taxes would be paid. Everyone's transactions would be open to public scrutiny by anyone anywhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 6:03 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

KristenM said:

And then you read the recent article in the NYT about rents going up enormously and a lack of affordable housing nationwide. Maybe we can figure out some solutions to making life more liveable for the average Joe. What I see in my community is the adults are so poor that their teens are sick of (hyperbole alert) living in a one-bedroom apartment with no money to eat out or go anywhere, so they are taking fast food jobs to make some cash because they aren't getting it from their parents and then dreaming of going to college. Anyhow, it's complicated.

Malcolm wrote:

How about convincing W. Va and AZ to replace Manchin and Sinema with a reasonable progressive Democrat? Not likely...They are totally the spoilers, they may as well join the GOP.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:00 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Least you think I'm being overly Japan-centric here let us not forget the famous and agonizing tower-building travails Marpa forced Milarepa to undergo before receiving teaching.

Malcolm wrote:

Which has been shown to be a legend not based in fact...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:03 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Queequeg said:

If people have enough to eat and a roof over their head and that becomes the baseline, people start asking, "Why am I doing this work thing again?"

"I would prefer not to."

-Bartleby

This freaks Republicans out. Their response is, "Life is too easy. Turn up the suffering", from the comfort of their seat on a private jet.

Malcolm wrote:

Ministry of the Future, by Kim Stanley Robinson. This book was discussed recently on the forum, and I finished it over the weekend...much food for thought. One of the nicer ideas was blockchaining all money, to eliminate fraud and tax evasion, as in no private transactions any more, etc.

Kim O'Hara said:

I'm glad you read the book and got something out of it, Malcolm, because I did too (having read it because someone else recommended it here, and then recommending it here in my turn).

For those who haven't read it but may just like a vision of a possible path to a liveable future world, please read it.

If SF of any kind is not your thing, you could try A Banquet of Consequences Reloaded by Satyajit Das. He's a mainstream financial writer and it's a bit dry and technical in

places but his analysis is rather similar. In brief, the neoliberal model has failed everyone except the super-rich and the consequences are upon us. Roughly speaking, voodoo finance + rising inequality + demographics (ageing population, shrinking workforce) + climate change + the loss of trust in institutions = collapse of the existing system, within years rather than decades.

To go back to an earlier writer, in 2009 Joe Romm asked "Is the global economy a Ponzi scheme?" - <https://thinkprogress.org/is-the-global-economy-a-ponzi-scheme-2c06fbd46c3/> - and answered his own question thus: This global Ponzi scheme is not just a metaphor ... but for me a central organizing narrative of how to think about the fix we have put ourselves in." He was speaking primarily about the climate crisis but the metaphor works equally well for the field which spawned it.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

And let's toss in a bit of monkey wrenching, with sometimes fatal consequences for %0.01.

I had bought it before it was recommended here, but the Children of Kali twist was unexpected.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Core Scriptures For Each School

Content:

Ayu said:

From Geluk POV at least, I think it's difficult to single out some few texts as "main", because there are so many branches of teachings. For beginners there are different main texts than for the various vajrayana practitioners.

What is main for one part of the Gelugs may not implicitly be "main" for other practitioners.

But I can name the Lamrim of Tsongkhapa and the Lojong teachings as basic for example.

Malcolm wrote:

The core scriptures for Geluk are Guhyasamāja, the Prajñāpāramitā sūtras, as well as the works of Nāgārjuna father and son, Candrakīrti, Haribhadra, and Atiśa.

And of course, Tsongkhapa, Gyaltsabje, and Khedrupje.

And more recently, Pabongkha was and remains prominent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Genealogies of Mahāyāna Buddhism: Emptiness, Power and the Question of Origin

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Jayarava

Malcolm wrote:

Speaking of cranks...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Any information about the early Tibetan Buddhist King Mune Tsenpo.

Content:

alderjerry@gmail.com said:

Thank you. I have read the Wikipedia entry. In 'The Sakya School of Tibetan Buddhism' by Dhongthog Rinpoche this information is given:

"Three princess were born to the Dharma King Trisong Detsun the eldest being Mune Tsepo..." and "During the reign of Mune in particular the four great cycles of worship were instituted and the gap between poverty and wealth among Tibetan people were equalised three times".

Malcolm wrote:

You should obtain Crystal Mirror by Lama Dampa Sonam Gyaltzen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:32 PM

Title: Re: Core Scriptures For Each School

Content:

Nalanda said:

As I understand it, each school has their own set of core scriptures. The Nyingma have the kama and the terma texts and systems, for instance, with core texts for specific yanas (i.e. the Guhyagarbha tantra as the core Mahayoga text, etc...).

Each lineage within a school has their own core scriptures (i.e. Dudjom sung bum as the collection of texts that make up the Dudjom Tersar).

Have you seen a list somewhere of what each school has as their core Scriptures and what the lineages of teach school uses as their main texts?

Malcolm wrote:

The basic list is pretty simple:

The basic tantra for Sakya and Kagyu is Hevajra. The basic tantra for Geluk is Guhyasamāja. The basic tantra for Nyingma, as you have identified, is Guhyagarbha. The basic tantra for Jonang is Kālacakra.

The monastic curriculum for study is pretty much the same for all schools: Nagārjuna, Candra, Śāntideva; the five treatises of Maitreya (in varying degrees); Abhidharma of Vasubandhu and Asanga; the Abhisamayālaṃkāra commentaries of Vimuktisena and Haribhadra; Dignaga and Dharmakīrti's epistemology, and the Vinayasūtra of Gunbhadra and commentaries.

In terms of practice cycles: for Sakya it is Hevajra and Naropa's Khecari. For Geluk, Guhyasamāja, Cakrasamvara and Vajrabhairava. For Kagyu, Cakrasamvara and Vajrayogini of various traditions from specific subschool to the next; for Nyingma, too many different practice traditions to mention. Jonang, Kālacakra and the six limb yoga.

Then of course there are many hundreds of practices which wind through all schools. So, it is pretty hard to quantify.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

Anyone who places political ideology over the spiritual well being of the laypeople deserves criticism.

Malcolm wrote:

Unless of course, that political ideology is judged to be in the best spiritual interest of the lay people.

Why do you privilege mundane religious ideology, such as Catholicism, over political ideology? They are two peas in a pod. They are both mundane. Neither can promise anything more than temporary happiness and contentment.

So, frankly, whether the Catholic mass is chanted in Latin, facing the altar, or chanted in the local language facing the congregation, should not matter one iota to a dharma practitioner. The only distinction that can possibly matter is that whatever mundane ideology one follows, political or religious, is that it renders one a more compassionate, caring person. Otherwise, it does not matter at all.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

Had we kept the pagan gods we would not be here.

Most of what you lament about Christianity is only a consequence of its implementation in the Roman Imperial Structure. The Western world "civilizing the barbarians" is a theme that goes back to Julius Caesar himself in his conquest of the French and German "Barbarian" tribes.

Malcolm wrote:

Then the opposite is also true: most of what you celebrate about Christianity goes back to a political structure embedded in Western Europe. So what was that you were saying viz spiritual vs. political ideologies? Hoisted on your petard again, I see.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Queequeg said:

typified by Fox news' Hannity and O'Reilly.

Malcolm wrote:

Who are in reality William F. Buckley wannabes, with a tenth of the wit and far less educated.

Ah the good old days, when conservatives were actually conservatives in the tradition of Burke, etc., rather than these shallow libertarians trying to pawn themselves off as conservatives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Vikings confirmed in Newfoundland Canada 1021 CE confirmed with carbon dating

Content:

Queequeg said:

I'm petitioning the village to replace the statue of Columbus with Leif Erikson.

Malcolm wrote:

The Asatru crew will be thrilled. Mohawks, not so much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

tingdzin said:

Indra was only a "good guy" from the standpoint of Indic mythology. To the Iranians, he was the arch cattle-thieving bloodthirsty warrior deva that Zarathustra condemned. It all depends on whose ox is being gored, I guess.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said elsewhere, Buddhists are Team Indra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 11:05 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

That's one of the functions of religious praxis. It's an external, objective ideal that you can orient your life towards. So, frankly, liturgical chant, incense, silent meditation and prayer, solemnity, and moral / theological instruction does matter.

Malcolm wrote:

Anything based in wrong view, at best, might get you a birth as a hedonic deva, fated to fall in the hell realms when your merit is exhausted, your flowers fade, and your body begins to smell repellant to the other devas...

Heimdall said:

While Catholicism is flawed, it's a much better alternative compared to a cult or New Age praxis.

Malcolm wrote:

What is Catholicism, or Christianity in general, but a new religious cult that disrupted the Roman Empire, and spawned plenty of so-called new age movements, including the modern New Age?

Sorry, just not seeing it. I stand by my earlier statement, if your beliefs do not make you a more kind and compassionate person, they don't matter at all, chanting, incense and the whole lot (and this applies to Buddhism as well).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Queequeg said:

You take a strange tack to criticize Francis. The Latin Mass devotees are creating a schism, aside from the fact that its become a cult of the reactionaries in the Church. The Church resolved to move in a certain direction with Vatican II. Francis was undoing a mess that Benedict, the Quitter (see the irony of that in this thread?), created.

Heimdall said:

Projection. The Catholic Church has never been more divided than under this Papacy.

Malcolm wrote:

So what? What do Buddhists care about this?

Heimdall said:

Noting has been as disunifying as Pope Francis's decision to include Mother Earth worship in his Amazonian Synod.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh come on. Be serious. Luther? Two Popes? There have been plenty of fractious periods in the history of the Church. This is nothing compared to that. Plus, Catholicism has survived for centuries through syncretism. This is why Francis' incorporation of Pachamama is just par for the course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 11:34 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

"Amen" - but some wrong views are worse than others. It is better to be a Buddhist who is mistaken on the nature of the 5 Skandhas than it is to be a Nazi Occultist who sacrifices human beings to pictures of Hitler.

Malcolm wrote:

Agreed, some wrong views are not merely wrong, but perverse. This is why mahāsiddhas like Virupa went around India putting an end to practices of human sacrifice and animal sacrifice.

Heimdall said:

If the Latin Mass has produced such compassionate "Saints" like Francis of Assisi, Bernard of Clairvoux, John of the Cross, John Bosco, or even Maximilian Kolbe, there probably is something good in the Latin Mass liturgical praxis that leads one there.

Malcolm wrote:

I doubt it. How do you explain Torquemada? You place too much emphasis on external conditions, friend.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 21st, 2021 at 11:47 PM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

What do Buddhists care about the Protestant Work Ethic?

Malcolm wrote:

Personally, nothing. I was raised an atheist. Perhaps one can view atheism as the final stage of the Reformation. I would be comfortable with that. But work ethic? I prefer festival cultures.

Heimdall said:

Not internally. Luther and the Two Popes led to a split of organization.

Malcolm wrote:

What is disunity but the splitting of a group of people?

Heimdall said:

Regardless, it doesn't change the fact that this Pope is incredibly divisive.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, in my opinion the Catholic Church is completely corrupt bunch of hoary old pedophiles. It needs to be broken up just as much as Facebook and Amazon.

Heimdall said:

Plus, Catholicism has survived for centuries through syncretism. This is why Francis' incorporation of Pachamama is just par for the course.

Which is why it created such a scandal for the devoted members?

Plus, "syncretism" is a centuries long process, not a "shock" political maneuver.

Malcolm wrote:

You actually miss the point. Syncretism starts from below, not from above. The penetration of pre-Colombian mother goddesses into Catholicism began back in the 16th century, when Catholicism was introduced to the Americas. Francis merely

acceded to something that has been happening in South America, and the Spanish dominated parts of North America for half a millennium.

I give you Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe (Coatlaxopeuh):

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Any information about the early Tibetan Buddhist King Mune Tsenpo.

Content:

alderjerry@gmail.com said:

Thank you Malcolm and by the way I have appreciated your comments on another post regarding 'The myth of progress'. I am at a friend's house who happened to have a copy so I just found information on page 251 regarding King Mune Tsenpo's three attempts to equalise the rich and poor.

I was interested as there was a very brief mention of this event on page 94 in the book 'Wisdom in Exile' by Lama Jampa Thaye. To put it in some context starting on page 93 "In conclusion, we must be aware the possibility that, out of insufficient understanding of compassion in the teachings of the Buddha, one will hurry to ally Buddhism with whatever ideologies intone the term 'compassion' more seductively. Such systems usually promise that a state of general perfection can be attained just by external changes, but, as we have already discussed, such a view is not Buddhist - apart from anything else, it is a denial of karma, the law of cause and effect. The story of the failure of King Mune Tsenpo's well intentioned but unwise policy of redistribution of wealth in eighth-century Tibet is somewhat instructive in this regard."

I wondered if some people would read this and conclude that, for instance, taxing people to set up a social security system or National Health Service was somehow not in accord with Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

His point of view is completely inconsistent with the chapter on Royal Policy by Nāgārjuna in the Precious Garland, and a host of other śāstras:

Cause the blind, the sick, the lowly,  
the protectorless, the destitute,  
and the crippled to equally obtain  
food and drink without interruption.

In the collections for enlightenment chapter in the same text there are recommendations to the king to set up shelters (housing), etc. Indeed, he touches on the necessity of rulers to provide for the nation, etc., in order to generate positive merit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

You actually miss the point. Syncretism starts from below, not from above. The penetration of pre-Colombian mother goddesses into Catholicism began back in the 16th century, when Catholicism was introduced to the Americas. Francis merely acceded to something that has been happening in South America, and the Spanish dominated parts of North America for half a millennium.

So using an Andean goddess that the Amazonians don't actually even worship organized by the Pope wouldn't be syncretism then, right?

Malcolm wrote:

Some Amazonians do. There are Quecha speaking people in the Amazon basin, as well as Aymara speaking people.

Heimdall said:

I agree. It's white people feigning moral virtue by playing into a historically illiterate "Noble Savage Brown Person" fairy tale. The inner colonial spirit of the white man who thinks he is intellectually superior to such an extent that he can speak on behalf of another nation's cultural traditions without having practiced it himself.

Malcolm wrote:

And of course, you are misrepresenting the Pope himself:

The Amazon region is a multinational and interconnected whole, a great biome shared by nine countries: Brazil, Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Guyana, Peru, Surinam, Venezuela and the territory of French Guiana.

The fact is that this all began when a Catholic Activist, Alexander Tschugguel, threw a statue of Pachamamma into the Tiber that had been installed by the bishops of the Amazonian Synod themselves. Francis didn't put it there, they did.

<https://www.americamagazine.org/faith/2019/11/11/top-five-takeaways-amazon-synod>

The Amazon region is not just Amazonian Indians, but includes parts of Peru, etc., where people of Andean descent also live.

Frankly, you sound really uptight and weird. Relax. Enjoy life. Stop looking for things of which to disapprove. It will be better for your health.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

But by virtue of repeating those two lines, even mentally, at least once a week, a person will naturally come to the conclusion “The past is the past, I did evil, now is a fresh start to move forward”, and that will guide you morally in ways superior to not having these lines at all.

Malcolm wrote:

How is this any better than New age affirmations?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

The Amazon region is a multinational and interconnected whole, a great biome shared by nine countries: Brazil, Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Guyana, Peru, Surinam, Venezuela and the territory of French Guiana.

I think one of the goals of the Synod was to “have the natives speak about consumerism and ecology”, mainly the Amazonian native Americans who aren’t “colonized”.

And the Synod wasn’t organized by Native Americans, it was organized by an old white dude in Italy.

Malcolm wrote:

So what? Old white dudes in Italy are forbidden to have an interest in the ecological health of the Amazon? Since when?

Heimdall said:

The fact is that this all began when a Catholic Activist, Alexander Tschugguel, threw a statue of Pachamamma into the Tiber that had been installed by the bishops of the Amazonian Synod themselves

Well “idolatry” is forbidden in that religion (at least of non-Catholic cosmological beings) as a consequence of Pre-Second Temple Jewish Henotheism.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, which is why for example the Lady of the Guadalupe was finally canonized in the 19th century...Nuestra Señora de la Santa Muerte is next:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

“New Age” groups tend to not be about having discipline over your impulses and looking to higher spiritual goals, but are often a bastion of libertines with moralizing cliches that point to a delusion-based view of “spiritual freedom”

Malcolm wrote:

You may not moralize with cliches, but your posts are little more than moralization. Constant disapproval and moralization. Seriously, either relax or join the Templars or something and go slay heathens.

In Dharma, we use mirrors more than binoculars. All faults we see are a reflection of our faults; all qualities we see are a reflection of our qualities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 1:48 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

“New Age” groups tend to not be about having discipline over your impulses and looking to higher spiritual goals, but are often a bastion of libertines with moralizing cliches that point to a delusion-based view of “spiritual freedom”

Malcolm wrote:

You may not moralize with cliches, but your posts are little more than moralization.

In Dharma, we use mirrors more than binoculars.

Heimdall said:

I try not to condemn others while trying bold to what I perceive to be objective, selfless, moral standards.

Malcolm wrote:

You just spend five posts condemning Pope Francis. Don't be daft. You are not an arbiter of any moral standards, other than for yourself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 3:11 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

Yes, which is why for example the Lady of the Guadalupe was finally canonized in the 19th century...Nuestra Señora de la Santa Muerte is next:



“Our Lady of Guadalupe” even if it is a dressed up Mesoamerican goddess is still purported to be the Virgin Mary, just like all the statues in Europe and America that depict the Virgin Mary on Venus’s half sea shell.

Malcolm wrote:

Then why bother getting all worked up about such issues.

Heimdall said:

That makes the syncretism consistent with their own religious tradition, unlike Pope Francis’s divisive actions.

Malcolm wrote:

I am quite sure that in the long run, everyone will forget about the naysayers and the right wing nut jobs, and be perfectly content with Pachamama being respected in Catholic churches, and will consider Francis a great pope.

Heimdall said:

The Apostle Paul calls all the “Pagan gods” “demons”, so it only causes religiously devout people in that tradition anxiety and worry when a “Pagan god” is being honored

Malcolm wrote:

.

Paul was Jewish. So, not surprising. He was also a con artist.

Heimdall said:

Even if Catholics are stuck in “wrong view”, I know many people are are hurt, upset, suicidal, and even having an existential crisis over this politically motivated affair (having been in that world), so that’s why I’m so sympathetic.

Malcolm wrote:

In general, we Buddhists try to avoid encouraging attachment views. Supporting their attachment to views does not help them one bit.

Heimdall said:

The actions, even if valid intentioned to raise concerns about the Native American needs, weren’t very mindful to the needs of many devout Catholics.

Malcolm wrote:

And it was very mindful of the needs of many other Catholics, and potential converts. You forget, that old white guy in Italy is from South America, Argentina to be precise. I am sure he knows much better than you the situation among South American Catholics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 3:20 AM

Title: Re: Any information about the early Tibetan Buddhist King Mune Tsenpo.

Content:

Sādhaka said:

But redistribution of wealth doesn't always imply what Nagarjuna said; and what Nagarjuna said doesn't always imply the redistribution of wealth.

Malcolm wrote:

We are talking about the social safety net, not the abolishing of classes, though personally, I think billionaires should be taxed out of existence.

He advocates universal health care, etc. I don't know if you have carefully read the Precious Garland, but if you haven't, when it comes to social programs, it is basic New Deal/Great Society in a nutshell.

This is why Stott's article, from which this thread branched, is so speciously reasoned. As if state-funded aid denies karma. What a laugh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 4:22 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

But even assuming it not to be true, it will be a product of this time period, along with Arab depictions of Jesus and Dravidian depictions of the Buddha, just like Godspell Jesus and 15th century "French Maiden" depictions of the Virgin Mary.

Malcolm wrote:

So why complain? It's just proliferation. Useless. Complain about something of substance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 4:26 AM

Title: Re: ngondro transmission and commitments

Content:

Hazel said:

Hello,

Are there usually commitments associated with ngondro transmissions?

Malcolm wrote:

Without empowerment, there is no guru.

Without empowerment, no commitments to keep.

Ngondro transmission does not come with commitments.

Commitments come only with empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 5:59 AM

Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

And yet, the main difference between ind logic and the euro is the presence another reality,

Malcolm wrote:

Not necessarily.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:19 AM

Title: Re: REBEL! Down with the Protestant Work Ethic!

Content:

Heimdall said:

But even assuming it not to be true, it will be a product of this time period, along with Arab depictions of Jesus and Dravidian depictions of the Buddha, just like Godspell Jesus and 15th century "French Maiden" depictions of the Virgin Mary.

Malcolm wrote:

So why complain? It's just proliferation. Useless. Complain about something of substance.

Heimdall said:

Again, pot calling the kettle black. If you're so confident that you will win in the end, why even bother posting everything you do?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't complain. I opine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:24 AM

Title: Re: the most helpful and lucid dharma text/book you've read?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Differentiation of the Three Codes by Sakya Pandita, as well as his Clarifying the Sages Intent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:49 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

That which experience the first moment of an experience prior to the conceptualization of feeling, pain etc., what is it?

That which experience the first moment, is it dependently arisen?

Malcolm wrote:

A physical sense consciousness, i.e contact. Then comes sensation.

As for your second question, of course.

The consciousness aggregate is always nonconceptual and momentary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 7:14 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

That which experience the first moment of an experience prior to the conceptualization of feeling, pain etc., what is it?

That which experience the first moment, is it dependently arisen?

Malcolm wrote:

A physical sense consciousness, i.e contact. Then comes sensation.

As for your second question, of course.

The consciousness aggregate is always nonconceptual and momentary.

Sherab said:

If a sense consciousness is faulty, the experience will be faulty. If the experience is faulty, the knowing is faulty. Can a faulty knowing be direct knowing?

Malcolm wrote:

Direct perceptions can be erroneous.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

thomaslaw said:

This finding supports that the Buddha was regarded as part of the ninth incarnation 'avatar' (avatāra) of Vishnu, and India Tantric Buddhism (c. 500-1200 CE) was also similar to Hinduism. That is, Buddhism became similar to or being part of Hinduism at that time as one of the main causes for the decline of Buddhism in India.

Malcolm wrote:

Completely false.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

conebeckham said:

I should also say that "precedes" is not quite the right word, as the naturally present awareness cannot be "temporal" and in fact imbues experiences as well. It is beyond the ability of conceptual mind to contain or define. But it is not a "thing," or any sort of permanent entity either.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just consciousness. Otherwise, you are proposing a consciousness which does not belong to the six or eight consciousnesses and this is erroneous.

Consciousness is not necessarily dualistic. When you subtract "vi" from "jñāna" you only have jñāna as a remainder. But this still is not outside the manodhātu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Genealogies of Mahāyāna Buddhism: Emptiness, Power and the Question of Origin

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Jayarava's articles/blog posts are useful...

Malcolm wrote:

Well, to the extent that he does not really know Sanskrit or Pali, blathers on and on egotistically about his "findings," bombards his critics with venomous retorts, rejects rebirth and karma out of hand, and so on, I guess so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Gaṇḍavyūha Sutra coming 10/27/21

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

[https://84000.co/the-stem-array?fbclid=IwAR2gx\\_n7rd\\_\\_Cav-PGFmwOOiqQcsNHUu6mU9baAJkTqSCll2i9tLvjNWJQE](https://84000.co/the-stem-array?fbclid=IwAR2gx_n7rd__Cav-PGFmwOOiqQcsNHUu6mU9baAJkTqSCll2i9tLvjNWJQE)

The Stem Array | A sūtra that “overwhelms the mind”

The Stem Array, which tells the beautiful story of the young layman Sudhana’s quest for awakening through encounters with a variety of spiritual teachers, forms the forty-fifth and final chapter of the Buddhāvataṃsaka (A Multitude of Buddhas) Sūtra. We recently sat down for an interview with Peter Alan Roberts, the translator of this text, to hear more about his experience of translating what he calls a sūtra that “overwhelms the mind.”

This sūtra will be published on the auspicious day of Lhabab Düchen, October 27, 2021...

Peter Allen Roberts is simply one of the best Buddhist translators alive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 9:56 PM

Title: Re: A Quick Walk Through Kensington Ave Philadelphia

Content:

Queequeg said:

Let's be clear about something here - what you see is not poverty per se.

That's opioid addiction. Those people are strung out of their gourds.

Knotty Veneer said:

This is poverty. Street sleepers are invariably addicts and the mentally ill. You seem to imply that it is all their own fault. The tragedy here is that in the wealthiest nation in the world, there seems to be little help or care for those whose addiction means they end

up living like this.

I saw similar scenes in my last visit to San Francisco. Where are the public programs to deal with this?

Malcolm wrote:

Ask the GOP. They systematically try to defund all social services in order to reduce taxes for their corporate overlords. As a result, we in the wealthy blue states pay for the red states, and as a result, cannot afford to address the needs of our own citizens, because the red states are a bunch of welfare queens, by design.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 22nd, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Javierfv1212 said:

Well, the similarities between the Buddhist tantras and the Shaiva tantras are well known.

Malcolm wrote:

Quite overstated, in fact.

Javierfv1212 said:

Of course, it is still quite different philosophically, but there are many similarities as well. They even used the same sacred sites often (the pitha lists are very similar) for example.

Malcolm wrote:

All Indians also bath in communal pools, or did at one time.

Javierfv1212 said:

So this similarity can't really be completely denied.

Malcolm wrote:

Using the presence of pan-Indian cultural themes and tropes in Buddhism to explain away the demise of Buddhism in India is lazy scholarship. The reality is that Buddhism was first weakened by the invasion of the White Huns and the collapse of the Guptas, then systematically hounded out of India by hostile Hindu kings (evident because of the frequent references to magical battles between Hindus and Buddhist Mahāsiddhas, especially from the ninth century onward), and the fatal blow was delivered by the Muslims at the end of the 12th century, though there were Buddhist holdouts in Bengal until the 16th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Gaṇḍavyūha Sutra coming 10/27/21

Content:

udawa said:

That is news indeed! How wonderful. I really like PA Roberts' translations so that's another plus.

Not sure about Stem Array as a translation of the title though. Presumably it's more accurate than Flower Garland or whatever, but it doesn't seem to mean anything as a phrase in English. Any thoughts on this?

Malcolm wrote:

Peter: The title The Stem Array is a translation of the Tibetan interpretation of the Sanskrit title Gaṇḍavyūha, though I think its original meaning is probably something more like, "an array of episodes."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 12:36 AM

Title: Re: A Quick Walk Through Kensington Ave Philadelphia

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Well according to Malcolm in his above post, it's the red state's fault.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because it is a fact that red states are an expense for the federal government, whereas the blue states are earners.

In other words, red states take more money from the Feds than they return, while blue states return more money to the Feds than they take in.

<https://apnews.com/article/north-america-business-local-taxes-ap-top-news-politics-2f83c72de1bd440d92cdbc0d3b6bc08c>

<https://www.forbes.com/sites/shaharziv/2020/05/12/blue-state-bailout-red-state-residents-received-largest-stimulus-checks-and-millions-in-federal-aid/?sh=9ac4d4835243>

[https://taxprof.typepad.com/taxprof\\_blog/2004/09/red\\_states\\_feed.html](https://taxprof.typepad.com/taxprof_blog/2004/09/red_states_feed.html)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 12:42 AM

Title: Re: A Quick Walk Through Kensington Ave Philadelphia

Content:

Sādhaka said:

By the title alone (I haven't listened to the podcast yet), I was under the impression that it is along the lines of the right pointing out that big cities are overrun with junkies,



defecating in the streets, etc., due to the left usually running said cities and their leftist policies in those cities....

Malcolm wrote:

This, of course, is bullshit. In San Fran and Cali in general this state of affairs exists because housing prices are absurdly high, and there are zoning regs all over the state that forbid the construction of two family+ dwellings. Who instituted those zoning regs? California racists in Berkely:

Those behind the recent changes to state law contend that single-family-only zoning is a relic of a past that is no longer justifiable. It originated in the city of Berkeley a century ago as a segregationist practice to prevent a Black-owned dance hall from locating near a white-only subdivision.

<https://www.latimes.com/homeless-housing/story/2021-09-17/what-just-happened-with-single-family-zoning-in-california>

This is not a problem in Boston, Providence RI, Portland ME, Hartford CT or New Haven, Albany NY, Concord NH, etc., etc.

It is a left coast problem, not a left wing problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 12:53 AM

Title: Re: A Quick Walk Through Kensington Ave Philadelphia

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Where I live it also has to do with the fact that the urban, left-leaning communities actually have services whereas the more conservative, rural ones do not, and some just run people out of town, sometimes literally bussing them out.

There are a lot of tough questions and it's always a NIMBY thing to some degree, people are great with homeless services etc. but tend to freak out once there is a service center near their house, not without good reason sometimes, it's a big problem that's only getting worse.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, what you say is true. The Mormons, bless their magic underwear, figured out it was cheaper to build housing for homeless people in Utah than have them stress emergency services...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

conebeckham said:

I should also say that "precedes" is not quite the right word, as the naturally present awareness cannot be "temporal" and in fact imbues experiences as well. It is beyond the ability of conceptual mind to contain or define. But it is not a "thing," or any sort of permanent entity either.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just consciousness. Otherwise, you are proposing a consciousness which does not belong to the six or eight consciousnesses and this is erroneous.

Consciousness is not necessarily dualistic. When you subtract "vi" from "jñāna" you only have jñāna as a remainder. But this still is not outside the manodhātu.

conebeckham said:

So, is Jnana a "Consciousness?" Would we classify "Sem Nyi" as a consciousness, in the usual sense, as a dualistic "perception?"

Malcolm wrote:

Citta dharmatā is the nature of citta (dharmin). No citta dharmin, no citta dharmatā, cittatā (sems nyid) for short. When the mind rests alertly free from inner and outer objects, this will reveal the fundamental consciousness (gnyug ma'i shes pa), also called tha mal gyi shes pa and so on.

Jñāna just means "knowledge," knowing, etc. There are both mundane and transcendent jñānas, meaning the object of this knowing is mundane or transcendent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 1:09 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Archie2009 said:

But, there is also a kind of vidyā called "Vidyā that apprehends characteristics. One's nonconceptual knowing consciousness which is defiled by many cognitions." And this kind of vidyā can be faulty and is sort of preliminary?

Malcolm wrote:

Rig pa is a characteristic of the mind, there are basically three: clarity (gsal ba), cognizance (rig pa), and emptiness (stong pa). Often you see "gsal rig" as one adjectival phrase, but when we examine more closely, we see them parsed separately.

As for your question, yes the vidyā that grasps characteristics is faulty, not intrinsically, but merely because it is consciousness which grasps outer and inner objects.

There is nothing apart from the mind that can be found which can be called "rig pa." That's a rabbit hole down which many people fall.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 1:24 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

conebeckham said:

I edited my post while you were replying, but I think we are saying the same thing?

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe, but when people start talking about rig pa, ye shes, sems nyid, etc. as if they are some other sort of mind not included in the vijñāna skandha, it is a little strange.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 3:05 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

mabw said:

There've been a lot of external factors discussed.

Malcolm wrote:

The most simple explanation is loss of patronage from the upper class. We can see this pattern repeated in Tibet, China, Japan, Korea, Shrivijaya, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 4:42 AM

Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I disagree. I never mentioned the "point" of the tetralemma, merely that it uses a two-valued logic.

Malcolm wrote:

My point, which everyone seems to either ignore or miss, is that these negations referred to real positions people held. That's all. Therefore, discussing them as if they are any more than simple negations is mistaken.

Other than the dispute between Sakya and Geluk over whether two or four negations are appropriate with respect to ascertaining the ultimate, you will not find, in Indian Buddhist texts, a treatment of the so-called tetralemma as a logical device on its own, unlike say syllogisms, and so on.

Javierfv1212 said:

who held a view rejected in the fourth corner?

Malcolm wrote:  
Eel-wrigglers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

...the loss of patronage led to the demise of Buddhism well before the Islamic raids.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

oldbob said:

Nowhere does it say that the worldwide transmission is a recording.

The worldwide transmission is a live event

Malcolm wrote:

Furthermore, October 31st falls on the Anniversary of Master Adzom Drugpa, and is one of the days on which the Master used to give the Worldwide Transmission. . We will do the Worldwide Guruyoga Practice together, simultaneously all over the world, via webcast.

No transmission given here bob.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 5:38 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

In other words, the ultimate truth cannot be directly perceived.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it can, if not, the Buddha was not a buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 5:41 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

When the mind rests alertly free from inner and outer objects, this will reveal the fundamental consciousness (gnyug ma'i shes pa), also called tha mal gyi shes pa and so on.

Sherab said:

The Buddha said, when this arises, that arises; when this ceases, that ceases.

When the mind is free from inner and outer objects, what object still remains in order for that mind not to cease as per dependent origination?

Malcolm wrote:

"Free from" does not mean "in absence of," thus there is no fault.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 8:51 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

thomaslaw said:

Both external and internal factors should be considered and discussed carefully and objectively for understanding Buddhism's decline in India. However, the internal factors within Buddhist communities themselves are particularly important.

Malcolm wrote:

You have zero proof that Buddhism became "Hinduized."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 23rd, 2021 at 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Beyond True and False Buddhist logic Vs Western Logic

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

And yet, the main difference between ind logic and the euro is the presence another reality,

Malcolm wrote:

Not necessarily.

Si-va-kon said:

OK. There are no discrepancies regarding "our" level of reality.

Malcolm wrote:

I was responding to your assertion that Buddhist logic points to another level of reality—it does not. There is only conventional truth. Ultimate truth, in Buddhadharma, is the simple absence of inherent existence (svabhāva) of conventional entities, despite TRV Murti's complete and total misunderstanding of Candrakirti.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

(1) some of our senior practitioners/instructors buckle up, do what is necessary and start teaching, with or without the blessing of the IDG, or  
(2) we radically and dramatically alter the very idea of the DC so that it becomes an umbrella institution which helps make the teachings of living Vajrayana teachers available to the world. A noble purpose, btw (but one essentially unrelated to the preservation of Rinpoche's teachings).

Malcolm wrote:

(3) Find other qualified teachers, who are somewhat numerous, and begin to follow them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 1:39 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

(1) some of our senior practitioners/instructors buckle up, do what is necessary and start teaching, with or without the blessing of the IDG, or  
(2) we radically and dramatically alter the very idea of the DC so that it becomes an umbrella institution which helps make the teachings of living Vajrayana teachers available to the world. A noble purpose, btw (but one essentially unrelated to the preservation of Rinpoche's teachings).

Malcolm wrote:

(3) Find other qualified teachers, who are somewhat numerous, and begin to follow them.

treehuggingoctopus said:

Of course, but what I wrote was "if one is hoping for the DC to survive somehow." If one just wants to practice Vajrayana, things are vastly simpler.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, there are good Dzogchen teachers out there. People get stuck on "only my master," but this is dumb, especially when one is still an ordinary person.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 2:33 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Has Longsal volume 7 always been something that was open to anyone who has received DI?

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely not. They are just trying to work with circumstances as best they know how.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Has Longsal volume 7 always been something that was open to anyone who has received DI?

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely not. They are just trying to work with circumstances as best they know how.

dharmafirststeps said:

I thought so. What's your take? From the point of view of a student, rather than someone making the decisions, now that they're doing this do you think it's ok to watch it and read the book given the circumstances, or would you advise sticking to restrictions Rinpoche established?

Malcolm wrote:

I would advise sticking to the restrictions Rinpoche established. If you didn't receive the transmission for it, or the Jñānaḍākini long or don wang, don't read it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 3:34 AM

Title: Re: Dzogchen Community of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu

Content:

Tata1 said:

He gave a rigpa tsel wang a few weeks ago.

Malcolm wrote:

Really? Where you there?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 4:45 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

The Buddha said, when this arises, that arises; when this ceases, that ceases.

When the mind is free from inner and outer objects, what object still remains in order for that mind not to cease as per dependent origination?

Malcolm wrote:

"Free from" does not mean "in absence of," thus there is no fault.

Sherab said:

So, when your body is free from disease, it does mean that the disease is absent in the body.

Malcolm wrote:

In this case it simply means the mind is free from any grasping to outer and inner sense objects. It does not mean that mind lacks apprehension of outer and inner sense objects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Ekajati, one leg?

Content:

Fishfingers said:

Does anyone know why Ekajati is sometimes depicted having a single leg?

Thanks

Malcolm wrote:

This is the Drigung version from the termas of Rinchen Phuntsok.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

Can the direct knowing by Sem Nyi which precedes the experience of mental consciousness be faulty if the physical or mental sense consciousness is faulty?

conebeckham said:

Sem Nyi, Mind Itself, is the nature of consciousness--saying it "precedes" in a temporal fashion is incorrect--I pointed this out in a subsequent post. Whether the physical or mental sense consciousnesses are faulty or not is not relevant--whether the consciousness is faulty or not, the nature of the consciousness is primordially beyond fault. As I said, it's not really correct to say that Awareness "precedes." Let's just say that it imbues all our experience--"Unborn" is just a descriptive word.

You asked: The Buddha said, when this arises, that arises; when this ceases, that ceases.

When the mind is free from inner and outer objects, what object still remains in order for that mind not to cease as per dependent origination?

If the mind is free from inner and outer objects, is there still a "mind?"

Sherab said:

Since the first instance of an experience is mediated by a sense consciousness, and since a sense consciousness can be faulty, how can the experience of the Mind Itself be free from error? It does not matter if the experience by the Mind Itself is atemporal, it's experience is still mediated by a faulty sense consciousness according to you.

Malcolm wrote:

Just because a sense consciousness can be faulty does not entail that it must be faulty. A sense consciousness can also be veridical, provided the organ is healthy and there are no other deceptive conditions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

So, when your body is free from disease, it does mean that the disease is absent in the body.

Malcolm wrote:

In this case it simply means the mind is free from any grasping outer and inner sense objects. It does not mean that mind lacks apprehension of outer and inner sense objects.

Sherab said:

So, free from objects = free from apprehension of objects. Who would have thought that they meant the same thing. It is not a conventional way of understanding the phrase, it seems to me.

Malcolm wrote:

I did not say that. I said, "In this case it simply means the mind is free from any grasping to outer and inner sense objects. It does not mean that mind lacks apprehension of outer and inner sense objects."

How things seem to you is not under my control.

Sherab said:

As long as it CAN be faulty, there is no way of having certainty regarding the truth of an experience since all experiences have to be mediated by a sense consciousness according to you.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course one can be certain of the truth of an experience, even mundane experience. If one's senses are healthy and there is no obscuring conditions, one can be confident that one's sensory experience is veridical. For example, seeing one moon rather than two.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 9:51 AM

Title: Re: If all is mind then how is Zen not monistic? II

Content:

desert\_woodworker said:

But the fact of One Mind and one mind only is not evident AT ALL until one awakens.

Malcolm wrote:

How would you know this? Are you awakened?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 7:51 PM

Title: Re: If all is mind then how is Zen not monistic? II

Content:

desert\_woodworker said:

People who practice have of a chance of awakening, especially if they have good

conditions, good teacher, good sangha, and something like a good practice and an element of good luck and timing. I'd say it's "incumbent" on each practitioner to awaken at least once...

Malcolm wrote:

I think we have a different understanding of bodhi. It happens once.

Prior to that we can have experiences known as "peaks" which resemble awakening, but they are not actually awakening, because they are still conceptual.

Anyway, this is the Chan forum, so I will leave it here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 24th, 2021 at 8:00 PM

Title: Re: Quitting smoking

Content:

Tills ljust tar oss said:

I've managed to cut down smoking to one pack a week with the help of something called snus. You put it under your upper lip and it will give you nicotine.

The good thing about this product is that it has no bad effects on your health. Especially the all white slim pouches with no tobacco in it but only plant fibre and nicotine. The minty flavors makes it feel rather fresh compared to other nicotine administration strategies. It is also way better than patches. I feel that snus is what nicotine patches and gums were meant to be. And there are so many flavors and strenghts to choose from so you can find your sweet spot and end the craving for cigarettes forever.

The one i use is called volt dark frost and it tastes like forest berries and mint.

Malcolm wrote:

Tobacco takes up an isotope of plutonium, called polonium 210. This what causes cancer. Using tobacco in any form is just freaking stupid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 1:58 AM

Title: Re: lerab lingpa's commentary on chetsun Nyingthig

Content:

mingweicello said:

just heard from another senior translator that adzom drukpa wrote an excellent commentary on chetsun Nyingthig. almost guide step by step with detailed illustrations of different experiences. is this already translated to English?

Malcolm wrote:

Probably, but not that has been published, as far as I know.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 2:11 AM

Title: Re: If all is mind then how is Zen not monistic? II

Content:

desert\_woodworker said:

People who practice have of a chance of awakening, especially if they have good conditions, good teacher, good sangha, and something like a good practice and an element of good luck and timing. I'd say it's "incumbent" on each practitioner to awaken at least once...

Malcolm wrote:

I think we have a different understanding of bodhi. It happens once.

Prior to that we can have experiences known as "peaks" which resemble awakening, but they are not actually awakening, because they are still conceptual.

Anyway, this is the Chan forum, so I will leave it here.

desert\_woodworker said:

Thanks, Malcolm. I hope you'll please post more about this, and your certainty about bodhi happening once, please. I think you mean only once.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, just once.

desert\_woodworker said:

I didn't bring in bodhi, but spoke (and do speak) of true wisdom (prajna), which I note arises spontaneously and in seamless accord with conditions and events just as they arise or occur, and our response is immediate and unmediated, simultaneously with the operation of true compassion (karuna) in our action or response. This is in everyday life, when one is awake.

Malcolm wrote:

Awake = bodhana. This means truly realized. An ārya, not a common person.

desert\_woodworker said:

Now, awakenings occur, and one has this opening of/to spontaneous true wisdom and true compassion, on a daily and continuing basis, for some time. When one is not blessed with these -- say, when the awakened state is no longer supported by the eight elements that one has developed within the eightfold-path -- and hence the awakened state has submerged again, eroded, evaporated -- one is then an ordinary deluded being, again (even if with a memory of "the way things 'really' are", as obvious in the awakened state).

Malcolm wrote:

While on the impure bodhisattva stages, which begin with the path of seeing, one can forget one's awakening upon taking rebirth. In this lifetime, however, it is impossible for awakening to erode once attained. In other words, there is no way to fall back from the path of seeing in this lifetime. However, on the path of application, one's similitude of awakening can certainly come and go.

desert\_woodworker said:

I'd appreciate knowing how you will expand on the notion and understanding of bodhi, as distinct (if distinct... ) from prajna which arises naturally and unbidden in the awakened state.

Malcolm wrote:

Prajñā is the cause of awakening (bodhi), on this we both agree. However, there are two kinds of prajñā: contaminated and uncontaminated, and all prajñā of ordinary people, no matter how subtle, is contaminated.

desert\_woodworker said:

I'm not sure this is the thread in which to do it. I'm new at the board, and perhaps you feel it would be better to begin a new and dedicated thread along the lines you envision which could address these things. Thank you!, very much.

Malcolm wrote:

This kind of discussion between practitioners of Chan and practitioners of Vajrayāna are not that fruitful. The principle reason is that Vajrayāna practitioners, following Indian Mahāyāna precedents, make very clear distinctions between the paths below and above the path of seeing, and categorize experiences accordingly. So to us, the idea that one's awakening can be eroded does not make any sense. If it can be eroded, it is not awakening, but rather a peak on the path of application, which itself has four stages: heat, peak, patience, highest mundane phenomena. The last, highest mundane phenomena, is where one rests prior to making the final breakthrough on the path of seeing. Once one has obtained the path of seeing, it is impossible that one's awakening can be eroded at all in this life, and in future lives, if and when one meets the path again, one will swiftly recapture this awakening, though it might be thousands of years hence. Nevertheless, such people who have woken up once in past lives will be characterized by uncommon compassion and selflessness in deed, their minds "perfumed" by the realization of emptiness. But they will not realize emptiness again until they meet the Mahāyāna Dharma again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Time, Space and Knowledge

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Over the years this book has gone from being an oddity to me to being one of my favorite

Dharma books, as idiosyncratic as it is.

I'm curious if anyone knows whether the exercises in this book were Tarthang Tulku's creation specifically, or whether they are part of any kind of traditional teaching. Some of them are easily identifiable as Mahamudra/Semde type teachings, others I have not seen.

Malcolm wrote:  
His own thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 5:16 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Of course one can be certain of the truth of an experience, even mundane experience. If one's senses are healthy and there is no obscuring conditions, one can be confident that one's sensory experience is veridical. For example, seeing one moon rather than two.

Sherab said:

You yourself said that sense consciousness can be faulty. If sense consciousness is CAN be faulty, you can never be certain that at the time of an experience through the sense consciousness, that it is not faulty. If so, there can be no certainty of the truth of an experience especially when the experience is something new.

Malcolm wrote:

This is why we have teachers. And in an ordinary way, if we are not sure of an experience, we confirm it with someone else, such as "Did you hear that? Did you see that? Did you feel that?" etc.

It is not the big mystery you are making it out to be. Sheesh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 6:58 AM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

tingdzin said:

Favoring Indian (Hindu) mythology over Iranian is not particularly Buddhist, strictly speaking.

Malcolm wrote:

Isn't amazing though that it is totally the case that Buddhist overwhelmingly derive their mythopeia from common Indian sources?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

You yourself said that sense consciousness can be faulty. If sense consciousness is CAN be faulty, you can never be certain that at the time of an experience through the sense consciousness, that it is not faulty. If so, there can be no certainty of the truth of an experience especially when the experience is something new.

Malcolm wrote:

This is why we have teachers. And in an ordinary way, if we are not sure of an experience, we confirm it with someone else, such as "Did you hear that? Did you see that? Did you feel that?" etc.

It is not the big mystery you are making it out to be. Sheesh.

Sherab said:

Sure, a Buddha will have to consult his teacher if he has a new experience. And his teacher will have to consult his teacher if that experience is new to him as well.

Malcolm wrote:

This is strange. Buddhas are omniscient with respect to all paths and the experiences on those paths. But yes, they too once had teachers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 9:06 AM

Title: Re: Opinions on dream yoga course?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So do you guys have the same criticism of ChNN putting out his Practice of the Night Book, or TWR publishing his dream/sleep books?

Malcolm wrote:

This book is mostly Michael Katz's trip, with very little actual practice of the night content. And it's not dream yoga per se.

Dream yoga is a completion stage practice, and as such depends on the creation stage and proper empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 8:12 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Isn't amazing though that it is totally the case that Buddhist overwhelmingly derive their mythopeia from common Indian sources?

tingdzin said:

Read Zhen Li's reply.

Malcolm wrote:

I was kidding, however, when we look at the tropes in Buddhist literature, we frequently see myths that employ the destruction of Tripura, the churning of the milky ocean, the abduction of Sita, and so on. Asuras are always the bad guys, devas always the good guys, etc. Thus, Team Indra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 9:48 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Isn't amazing though that it is totally the case that Buddhist overwhelmingly derive their mythopeia from common Indian sources?

tingdzin said:

Read Zhen Li's reply.

Malcolm wrote:

Also, Zhen Li's reply does not count for one to one correspondences with Shiva, Umadevi, Sarasvati, Tāra, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 10:33 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The point of manifestation in Buddhism, however, is different than an avatāra in purāṇic texts. A manifestation leads beings to awakening in whatever form suits their inclinations, regardless of whether they realise it or not. Avatāras are more about restoring cosmic order or punishing evil. So, it makes no sense for an avatāra to manifest in infinite forms to suit beings' needs in the way a buddha or bodhisattva does.

Malcolm wrote:

I wasn't referring to the distinction between an avatāra and a nirmāṇa. Both are docetic



in nature. I was referring the obvious adherence by Buddhists to standard forms of Indian mythopeia, the use of common tropes, which indeed can include avatāric themes, such as Rudra Cakravartin's aka Kalki, defeat of the mlecchas in the final battle to restore world peace from mleccha domination, after the latter attack Shambhala; or the taming of Mahādeva by Śrī Heruka in the Cakrasaṃvara literature or the taming of Rudra found in the lower tantras, etc., in which these beings initiated an age of chaos and inequity, requiring Vajradhara to step in and intervene, etc.

So, still Team Indra.

Its true that the Bonpos work in some Iranian themes into their quasi-Buddhist mythopeia, and that the Chinese and Japanese work in native cultural themes into their mythopeia, and there is indeed some reason to think that the Iranian "paradise", that is the walled garden, may have some influence on the conception and depiction of Sukhavati. Nevertheless, Indian mythopeia is so strong a current wherever Buddhism spread from India that it completely dominates the local myths, which only survive through being appropriated, like domestic animals.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

No questions. Pay no attention to the man behind the curtain.

Malcolm wrote:

Any one who has actually studied these questions knows that the depiction of the rise of Vajrayāna as a Hinduization of Buddhism is silly. If it is true, then since all the name of a stupa correspond to parts of the classic brahmin burnt offering precinct, Buddhism has been "Hinduized," to use a coarse appellation, from the start.

The fact of the matter is that without Buddhism, there would be no modern Hinduism (Gaudapāda, etc.). All of these tradition coevolved, and the common people, well, they just followed whatever the king told them to follow.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, October 25th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I don't think that Buddhist Tantra is inherently syncretic, but it seems very obvious it arises in a period of extreme mainstream syncretism. Many Tantras between Hinduism

and Buddhism have identical material in them. Someone copied someone. Who knows who?

Malcolm wrote:

There is some limited intertextuality, but not as much people infer based on a very small sample, which both Sanderson and Hatley admit. And what borrowing there is goes both ways, according to Hatley. This is not surprising (Nyingmapas on some occasions borrowed from Bonpo texts, this kind of syncretism is commonly found in Chinese Buddhist texts and so on). But such examples are limited, and cannot be said to indicate that Vajrayāna represents a Hindu corruption of Buddhism. As I pointed out, Indians are Indians, and made use of common themes and tropes for their own reasons and purposes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

There is also a Buddhist version of, unless I'm mistaken, the Ramayana in the Taishō Canon which I've yet to read.

Malcolm wrote:

It was also translated into Tibetan, though I am not sure it survived. Some Tibetans fluent in Sanskrit, like Sa skya Paṇḍita in the 13th century, read widely in non-Buddhist literature such as the Mahābhārata; similar with the 20th century master, Kunnu Lama, who was fond of reading the Bhagavād Gita, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness practice off the cushion

Content:

desert\_woodworker said:

Is it "necro"-mancing to reply in a thread that's 7 weeks old?

Rick said:

Not for me (the OP), I just happened to revisit this thread yesterday, so good timing! (Btw I was shocked to find out the thread is just 7 weeks old, I would have guessed a year or two, guess I've transcended time ... or it's transcended me.)

Thanks for your good simple tips for how to "keep empty." I find that with emptiness, dependent arising, the three marks, awareness ... I'm getting better and better at practicing all of these on the cushion, but carrying that practice into everyday life remains very elusive. It's as if some part of me is happy to go into a different mode of being while on the cushion, but finds it an unwanted intrusion off.

Malcolm wrote:

In post-equipose, just keep in mind everything is just an illusion, an echo, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 7:44 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

Sure, a Buddha will have to consult his teacher if he has a new experience. And his teacher will have to consult his teacher if that experience is new to him as well.

Malcolm wrote:

This is strange. Buddhas are omniscient with respect to all paths and the experiences on those paths. But yes, they too once had teachers.

Sherab said:

Of course it is strange. It is what would logically follow from all that you have said previously. From what you have said previously, Buddhas too must have their experience mediated via sense consciousness based since there is no such thing as direct knowing without mediation via sense consciousness. Therefore it has to be teachers all the way because certainty cannot be obtained without consultation with teachers since sense consciousness can be faulty.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhas know things directly without sense mediation. But they didn't start out that way, and neither do we. Hence there is no beginning to tathagatas, and this infinite regress is not a fault.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 7:52 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

The vast majority of the Western Buddhists I know consider the jab an evil concoction from outer space.

Sādhaka said:

Then Dharmawheel.net does not represent the views of most western Buddhists afterall then...?

Good to hear.

Malcolm wrote:

He lives in Eastern Europe, so not representative of Western Buddhists as a whole. But anyway, anyone who thinks the covid vaccine is harmful is dumber than shit.

The amount of damage this virus can wreck on the unvaccinated, even when they never show symptoms, is astonishing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Unknown said:

The risk of severe disease to children is simply much lower than for adults period, even with Delta.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, we don't know this. As I said, the harm this virus wrecks on people who are unvaccinated is astonishing, and is only revealed by extensive imaging. Pancreas damage, lung damage, kidney damage, etc. Look, one of my friends is the head nurse of Boston Medical Center, another friend is a surgeon at the top hospital in Mexico City. Most people have no idea the shitshow this virus creates, and long term effects are likely to be severe and ongoing in many who have been infected prior to vaccination, even if they showed no symptoms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Long Covid is poorly understood and there is no "likely" with it until there is an understood mechanism, more data etc.

Malcolm wrote:

I am talking about unvaxxed people who are not suffering from long covid, who, when imaged thoroughly, MRI, CAT scans, tomography, etc., show extensive damage to their internal organs, people who had little or no symptoms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 7:34 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

Sentient and have Buddha nature.

Killing them to eat would contradict the refuge vows.

Malcolm wrote:

Not sentient and no buddha nature.

Eating them does not contradict the commitments of refuge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 7:42 PM

Title: Re: Giving Up Masturbation

Content:

Adamantine said:

This article cites relevant scientific sources, seems the little ones do experience pain and react to predators..it's just not that simple to comprehend or quantify such a different form of experience.

<https://medium.com/@jd.feliz/the-case-for-vegans-eating-oysters-mussels-other-invertebrates-961747367305>

Malcolm wrote:

Every argument introduced here can also be made about plants.

Adamantine said:

Yes, well, there are good arguments to be made for sentience in plants as well.. most contemporary science tends to support such. I realize that may contradict Abhidharma, however we know what HHDL has said about what to do when science and dharma dogma contradict... you don't agree?

Malcolm wrote:

Most contemporary science does not support that, and even if it did, your argument against eating oysters would have to extend to plants. Then what would one eat? Soylent Green?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 7:53 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Oysters are not sentient. Even vegans eat them.

seeker242 said:

That's not true. The overwhelming majority do not. If I had to guess, maybe less than 5%

do.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means it is true and vegans eat them. I'm afraid you just blundered into the "No true Scotsman" fallacy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 8:02 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

seeker242 said:

That's not true. The overwhelming majority do not. If I had to guess, maybe less than 5% do.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means it is true and vegans eat them. I'm afraid you just blundered into the "No true Scotsman" fallacy.

seeker242 said:

Saying vegans eat oysters is like saying Buddhist monks drink alcohol, simply because Japanese monks are not forbidden. It's much more accurate to say Buddhist monks do not drink alcohol. It's much more accurate to say that vegans do not eat oysters. That has nothing at all to do with "No true Scotsman".

Malcolm wrote:

I've seen a lot of Buddhist monks drink alcohol. Some do regularly. So, poor example.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 8:46 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

So do Buddhas only have four out of five eyes, according to either you or your tradition? Or rather, they have fleshly eyes and don't use them, never letting them make contact with a visible to produce the corresponding visual consciousness?

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhas can smell with their eyes, taste with their ears, hear with their tongues, and so on.

In any case, Sarvajnana is unmediated knowledge of reality and all knowables included with aggregate, senses bases and sense elements.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 8:50 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

If a creature weren't sentient, it would never have evolved a protective cover, as with mollusks.

Malcolm wrote:

So by this argument, trees are sentient because bark.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

I will just observe that seeing this on the front page without any context was one of the more surreal experiences I've had on DharmaWheel:

Screenshot\_20211026-215313.png

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is good dharmawheel as Jikan would say...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: What to do after attaining insight into emptiness

Content:

yinyangkoi said:

After one perceives all five skandhas are empty (no self), what should one do? Sit in a cave until death? Continue being a householder but awake?

Malcolm wrote:

Perceiving all five skandhas is empty is one thing, but realizing all five skandhas as empty is quite another.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 9:05 PM

Title: Re: What to do after attaining insight into emptiness

Content:

yinyangkoi said:

After one perceives all five skandhas are empty (no self), what should one do? Sit in a cave until death? Continue being a householder but awake?

Malcolm wrote:

Perceiving all five skandhas is empty is one thing, but realizing all five skandhas as empty is quite another.

yinyangkoi said:

What is the difference

Malcolm wrote:

The former is conceptual, the latter nonconceptual.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, October 26th, 2021 at 9:10 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Tills ljuet tar oss said:

Medicine Buddha is real.

treehuggingoctopus said:

...And among his activities today is distributing the vaccine and helping people understand they need to maintain social distancing and wear masks.

Sādhaka said:

That's an assumption.

Malcolm wrote:

A reasonable one based on the fact that 99% of all people presently in hospitals with covid did not receive vaccination when they could have. But some people just continue to be dumb as shit and listen to morons like Joe Rogan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Giovanni said:

I suspect that Malcolm is being a little provocative..

Malcolm wrote:

All I was saying was that I prefer oysters to semen. Others prefer okra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)



Content:

Karma Dorje said:

I guess the bigger question is “Do vegans swallow?”

Malcolm wrote:

I don't see how they could, it's animal tissue, after all.

However, with a little shallot mignonette, you never know.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Queequeg said:

When did Buddhadharma become some hokey faith healing shit?

Malcolm wrote:

Sakya Pandit complained in the 13th century about this view in Illuminating the Muni's Intent:

Here someone claims, “If one obtains a medical diagnosis, recites texts and so on, one will have no confidence in the jewel of the Dharma. Having obtained a medical diagnosis, it is best to then go for refuge to the Three Jewels. One will damage one’s refuge in the Three Jewels if one takes medicine.”

In that case, it is said in the Bhaisayavastu of the Vinayāgama that doctors and medicines are to be relied upon by sick bhikṣus. Since food and drink are included together in the four kinds of medicine, if one eats or drinks one will be damaging one’s refuge. Therefore, just as one eats and drinks, how can it be reasonable to claim “One harms one’s going for refuge if one takes medicine?” If a scholar sees this, he will be disgusted.

So, it has been around for a long time...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 2:02 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

seeker242 said:

I wonder if traditional Korean temple food or traditional Japanese temple food is allowed to have oysters, clams etc.? Traditionally those are vegetarian foods so I don’t see how it could be allowed. I know that my Korean temple would never put oysters in anything but I don’t know if that’s traditional or not.

Malcolm wrote:

People complain mostly about eating things that have faces. There are massive environmental benefits in oyster farming, and they provide a pain-free source of animal protein. Oysters have no central nervous system and no sense organs, so they do not feel pain; and like plants, they respond to temperature and other environmental factors for feeding, breeding, etc. They may technically belong to the animal kingdom, but they are not sentient in any meaningful way. If it is argued they have sexual reproduction, so do plants.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Toenail said:

So sentience etc is depended on central nervous system and sense organs? Then do spirits or devas not have sentience? Because they do not have a central nervous system? I always thought animals like that are experience very heavy dullness karma like being absorbed in dull shamatha for many years or so. And now they are some weird dull sponge livigg for 1000s of years floating in the ocean or an oyster living in darkness etc.

Malcolm wrote:

We are talking about the physically embodied. Devas have physical bodies, actually, feel sensations, etc. Please consult chapter three of the Kośa on this point. So-called spirits, on the other hand, are disembodied, having no form, etc.

The point is that where the line is drawn between sentience/nonsentience is very ambiguous. If oysters can't think, etc., they are not sentient. I don't think they can think, YMMV. I don't think they possess minds. The Buddha is not around to ask anymore.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

LastLegend said:

When you finely see that which sees or knows, and realize it's not anything either. Yet it's functions it knows, quite clearly it knows that means you are touching pure consciousness.

Astus said:

There is no knower/seer (i.e. self) to be found, but to say that what cannot be found (i.e. does not exist) can nevertheless function is like saying that the daughter of a barren woman is a good singer.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, actually the I-making habit, the basic knowledge obscuration, has no real existence as a self, but it functions as an agent of karma and a recipient of karma, so

there is that, even though the "I" it imputes does not exist at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 5:23 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

Buddhas know things directly without sense mediation. Therefore, we too can know things directly without sense mediation because without that ability, we can never become Buddhas. It follows that direct knowing makes sense only if it is not mediated by sense consciousness, unless we have one definition of direct knowing for Buddhas and another for the rest.

Malcolm wrote:

So, are you talking about yogapratyakṣa? If so, what inhibits this is traces of ignorance, which is why the yogic direct perception of śrāvakas and pratyekabuddhas is incapable of realizing all objects of knowledge due to the presence of traces of ignorance.

Generally, however, pratyakṣa is confined to the five sense because manas is always a cognition of a direct perception of the five sense bases, aka a simple impression.

Yogic direct perception is a personal intuition (pratyatmyavit), not an ordinary direct perception, for example the direct perception of a hawk hunting mice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 5:47 AM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Well, actually the I-making habit, the basic knowledge obscuration, has no real existence as a self, but it functions as an agent of karma and a recipient of karma, so there is that, even though the "I" it imputes does not exist at all.

Astus said:

...it is rather the mistaken view is what defines intention and action and experiences are generated by them.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is an imagined, nonexistent self that causes and experiences everything, for example, when a car is in accident, it is the imagined car for which one pays the damages, not the wrong view of the imagined car. But perhaps this is a special point of Candrakīrti's Madhyamaka, unlikely to be found the Visuddhimagga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 8:50 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Toenail said:

Would you eat live oysters?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. On the half shell is the best way.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, October 27th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

Sentient and have Buddha nature.

Killing them to eat would contradict the refuge vows.

Malcolm wrote:

Not sentient and no buddha nature.

Eating them does not contradict the commitments of refuge.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Well, it may surprise you to know that at least one of your teachers disagrees.

Malcolm wrote:

Some Buddhist schools argue that causing an abortion is a parajika, other schools disagree.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Since you are a Buddhist teacher and your misinformed opinion could the death of sentient beings and cause other Buddhists to go against their vows, why don't you, instead of putting up authoritative statements like they are not sentient which contradicts various Buddhist Teachers I have heard, do the sensible and ethical thing and email a teachers whose opinion you regard someone like HHST to clarify. It's the humble thing to do.

Malcolm wrote:

I am not telling people to eat oysters. People are free to eat what they want according to their own conscience. I personally think it is fine. You disagree.

Könchok Thrinley said:

Oysters are clearly an animal and a living thing. Just see what wikipedia says on their anatomy and how it is described:

Malcolm wrote:

Plants are clearly living things too, with anatomy, physiology, gender, and so on, the ability to communicate the presence of threats from disease, insects, etc., share nutrients with ailing plants in within their reach, and so on.

Könchok Thrinley said:

There is a reasearch which found out that oysters respond to sound, apparently perceiving sound

Malcolm wrote:

Plants respond to sound as well.

Könchok Thrinley said:

The neuron count of an animal can suggest whether or not that animal has enough complexity to support consciousness.

Malcolm wrote:

So now we are depending upon physicalism to define sentience?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 1:58 AM

Title: Re: La Palma vulcano eruption

Content:

Aemilius said:

Ufo-contactee Billy Meier, or his extra terrestrial sources, made a prediction concerning the volcano on La Palma some three decades ago. What is happening now is mild compared to the predictions of Billy Meier. No lives have been lost, only some buildings. It could have been much worse.

Malcolm wrote:

That guy is a total fraud, an antisemite, and a homophobe.

Toenail said:

The last one is unacceptable.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, it's acceptable to be an antisemite? Why?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

I was talking about direct knowing.

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps because you still have not defined what you mean by “direct knowing.”

Direct perceptions are, in ordinary people only the consciousnesses of the five physical senses.

Yogis have different capacities, called abhijnana, “higher or direct knowing,” Knowledge past lives, etc. these are also five in number.

The sixth, unique to Buddhists, is insight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 8:07 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

It is permissible, and it is valid.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither permissible, valid, nor taught in any tantra.

A root guru is a person from whom one has at minimum received empowerments. No empowerment, no guru.

It's amazing how people like you get all upset about minor issues, but boldly proclaims doctrines that harm the essence of the Dharma with barely a thought.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

zerwe said:

It is pretty common to encounter Vajrayana practitioners who are very confused about this subject.

How could one receive empowerment, instructions, and teachings (thus entering into the vehicle) and be confused about who their root guru is?

Malcolm wrote:

People are often confused about this point, and think that only one guru can be a root guru or mūlaguru. In reality, any qualified person from whom one has received the four empowerments in a proper way is one's root guru.

In Nyingma and Kagyu circles is common to understand that one's principle guru is the

person from whom one has received definitive instructions through which one has understood the nature of the mind. The Sakyapas and others talk about one's karmically linked root guru as being one's principle guru, which has the same meaning as the Nyingma/Kagyu idea.

Some people think that their root guru is the person from whom they received refuge, this is another common misunderstanding. Some people in organizations like Shambhala, are encouraged to think dead teachers like Trungpa are their root guru, thus adding more confusion to the pot. Some people think they can just pick a famous figure, like HHDL, the Karmapa, etc., to be their root guru without having ever received teachings from them, but this is yet another misunderstanding.

All of this confusion comes about from not studying proper commentaries like the 50 Verses on guru devotion, and other texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

The reason I ask at all is this interesting quote from Gampopa: "For anyone who wishes to see me, studying THE JEWEL ORNAMENT OF LIBERATION and the PRECIOUS GARLAND OF THE EXCELLENT PATH is the same as meeting me."

Malcolm wrote:

This simply means that if you met Gampopa, he couldn't tell you anything more about the essentials of Dharma than what's contained in these two texts.

It is just a restatement of the Buddha's declaration. "Those who see dependent origination see the Dharma. Those who see the Dharma see me."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 11:00 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Soma999 said:

« Empowerment » is a ritual.

Malcolm wrote:

Not just a ritual. It is misunderstandings like this that cause harm to the teachings.

There is no guru in Vajrayāna without empowerment, and there is no authorization to explain the details of Vajrayāna practice at all to someone who has not received

empowerment. The Mahāmudrātilaka make this abundantly clear:

First, once empowerments are conferred  
upon the disciple,  
at that time the great secret may be explained  
because they have become suitable recipients.

If there is no empowerment, there will be no siddhi,  
just as there is no oil from pressing sand.

When someone arrogantly explicates  
the collection of tantras to one lacking empowerment,  
both master and disciple will go to hell  
as soon as they die, even if they attained siddhi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, October 28th, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: “Bodhisattva Gaia” and “Vairocana Sun”

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I may change my opinion after reading it, but it seems like he is suggesting here that  
brāhmaṇas simply passed over passages that didn't work for them, and that's their  
canon.

Malcolm wrote:

he actually makes a more interesting proposal, that brahmins were more interested in  
dhyānas, while non-brahmins were more interested in insight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Soma999 said:

What i am saying is that the essence of empowerment is not necessarily dependent  
upon a specific form.

Malcolm wrote:

The essence of an empowerment is the arrangement of a special dependent origination  
by the master upon the disciple according to the methods taught by Buddha Vajradhara  
in the authoritative tantras, realized by mahāsiddhas, practiced by bodhisattvas, and  
translated by qualified translators out of Sanskrit and other dialects of India in Tibetan,  
and thence into English and other languages. There is no other essence than this.



These days however, people take it upon them themselves to just make up whatever doctrine feels good to them, disregarding the clear words of the sūtras and tantras about how to follow a virtuous mentor or a guru. They buy books and attempt to practice their contents without transmission. Such people close the doorway to liberation for themselves by inappropriately using methods taught in the tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

zerwe said:

In short, if you are NOT practicing Vajrayana, whoever has had the greatest impact on moving your heart/mind is your root guru.

Malcolm wrote:

No, there is no such thing in Mahāyāna or for that matter in lower tantra, as a root guru.

zerwe said:

Otherwise, whoever you first received HYT initiation is your root guru by default.

Malcolm wrote:

Any guru from whom you receive the four empowerments from is a root guru. Not merely the first one from whom one received such as empowerment. If you received Kalacakra from one guru and Hevajra from another, each is your root guru for that system.

zerwe said:

I catch the drift that, from a Dzogchen perspective, this is whoever you first received direct introduction from?

Malcolm wrote:

No, the one from whom your actual understanding of rig pa arose. Not necessarily the first person one has received Dzogchen transmission from. Case in point, ChNN had already received the complete teachings of Dzogchen from 13 different teachers before he met Chanchub Dorje.

zerwe said:

I understand that there may differences between the two (direct introduction and receiving the 4 empowerments), but I (not a Dzogchen practitioner) tend to equate these as being the relatively the same--I don't think I have the terminology to adequately describe.

Malcolm wrote:

The fourth empowerment and direct introduction/pointing out are equivalent. In general, Gelukpas and Sakyas do not accept direct introduction as a ripening empowerment.

Some Gelukpas do not accept direct introductions at all, even after empowerment. Some Kagyus and generally all Nyingmapas do.

Even so, there is still some argument in Dzogchen tantras which indicate it is much better to receive the four empowerments in the Dzogchen intimate instruction system, and that direct introduction alone is not necessarily sufficient as a ripening empowerment, so even Nyingmapas and Kagyus generally err on the side of caution.

zerwe said:

And, then there are teachings on how to see all the gurus as one, all as the dharmakaya, and all the activities of many gurus as originating, being initiated, from our root guru.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but this is common to all four schools.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Soma999 said:

Heterodoxy is not necessarily heresy.

We don't give new sense to things. We expand their meaning based upon observation, practice, experimentation, and following gurus who are not sectarian and accessed a level of consciousness where they are not limited by only one perspective.

This is scientific approach. We can not understand, have a lot of questions... still, experiences force us to open to a new way of seeings.

Dharma is not replaced. Dharma is lived and makes us evolve. And as a consequence, dharma in its form evolve also.

Malcolm wrote:

In other words, you just make shit up as you go along.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 1:16 AM

Title: Re: Question about grasping

Content:

Rick said:

Noble Truth Two says craving (tanha) is the root cause of suffering (dukkha).

What is the root cause of craving?

Malcolm wrote:

The ignorance that imagines there is a self.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: Question about grasping

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The ignorance that imagines there is a self.

Rick said:

Given this, why do you think the Buddha formulated Truth 2 as grasping rather than ignorance, or belief in a self? Is 'grasping' easier to grasp?

Malcolm wrote:

Craving does not involve speculation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Sherab said:

I was talking about direct knowing.

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps because you still have not defined what you mean by "direct knowing."

Sherab said:

Just to remind you that conebeckham used the term "direct knowing" first.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, and I understood him to mean pratyakṣa, mngon sum, direct perception, which is what he meant, whereas it is clear you are referring to abhijñā, mngon shes, direct knowing. So the confusion is due to you for not asking cone to clarify what he was referring to, pratyakṣa or abhijñā. Thus, the entire exchange was stupid and remains so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 1:49 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

zerwe said:

I think "the one whom your actual understanding of rig pa arose" is what I was looking for--is this equivalent to who introduced you to the true nature of your mind?

So, it is possible for someone other than who you received the 4 empowerments from to actually bring about such an understanding?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. This person can also be a root guru, in all four schools, providing one has received empowerment.

zerwe said:

So, would it be correct to regard who caused this experience to arise, a root guru as well?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. There are three basic kind of gurus, empowerment gurus, reading transmission gurus, and explanation gurus. The one from whom one receives all three is called "a supreme guru." One has samaya with all three kinds of gurus, incidentally. It's very important to realize that receiving vajrayāna lungs and explanations from lamas also carry commitments. This is why it is important to receive these things from the proper sources.

People are very promiscuous with the Dharma these days and will just go to any lama and receive any kind of empowerment, lung, and explanation without checking out anything. They will spend days and months agonizing about what kind of school to go to, what kind of car to buy, what kind of partner to have, but when it comes to the Dharma, they seem to be content with the first thing that comes along without any investigation at all. It's really sad.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Question about grasping

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Craving does not involve speculation.

Rick said:

Craving is more direct, urgent, concrete, and there is universal agreement as to what it is, all humans know it first-hand, feel it. Both ignorance and belief in self are more abstract, indirect, and there is lots of disagreement about their origin, essence. So the decision to formulate Truth Two as craving was skillful, pedagogical, craving is a clearer and more direct descriptor than ignorance or belief in self.

?

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 2:27 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So, would it be correct to regard who caused this experience to arise, a root guru as well? Yes. There are three basic kind of gurus, empowerment gurus, reading transmission gurus, and explanation gurus. The one from whom one receives all three is called "a supreme guru." One has samaya with all three kinds of gurus, incidentally. It's very important to realize that receiving vajrayāna lungs and explanations from lamas also carry commitments. This is why it is important to receive these things from the proper sources.

Hazel said:

What are the commitments for non empowerment gurus?

Malcolm wrote:

The same as for empowerment guru, the 22 general samayas apply, including the first.

Hazel said:

I didn't realize about the explanation guru. I visualize everyone I've received a transmission from at the start of practice and make offerings to them, but I do not include everyone I have received teachings from.

Malcolm wrote:

It only applies really to those whom one has received Vajrayāna teachings from.

Hazel said:

Lama Zopa Rinpoche says to also regard your Tibetan alphabet teacher as a guru if you learned for the purpose of Dharma. I do this for my calligraphy teacher, but not for the YouTube videos I watched.

Malcolm wrote:

This kind of teacher is not a vajrayāna guru. But they need to be respected too.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 4:11 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

conebeckham said:

Just a comment---there are "LaDrup" practices that center on "historical gurus"--quite a few of them, and for all the Tibetan lineages, I think. But the key instruction is that this "Guru" has to be understood as one with one's actual root guru.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. The difference between rnam pa, aspect, and ngo bo, essence. The aspect can be whatever the sadhana is; the essence is always one's own root guru/s (yes, there can be more than one guru if you have received the same practice from more than one guru).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is an imagined, nonexistent self that causes and experiences everything, for example, when a car is in accident, it is the imagined car for which one pays the damages, not the wrong view of the imagined car. But perhaps this is a special point of Candrakīrti's Madhyamaka, unlikely to be found the Visuddhimagga.

Astus said:

In one manner of speaking it can be said so that it's the self/car that acts or is damaged, but at the same time, any type of self-view is imputed in dependence on the aggregates (according to Candrakīrti too: MA 6.150 and 6.162-164), just as a car is imputed in dependence on its parts. And just as if the windshield is broken then saying 'the car is damaged' is talking in general terms, similarly, whatever actions and results occur are the causal events of the aggregates, even if commonly it can be said to be that of a self or being.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's not the point really. The imputation itself is the agent and recipient of action, that's the point. Otherwise, one faces the contradiction of asserting that something real passes from this life to the next (consciousness), but we know that nothing at all passes from this life to the next. Certainly other Mādhyamikas make allowances for this and are prepared admit consciousness is an appropriate basis of imputation for a self, which can pass from this life to the next, and is the agent and recipient of action, conventionally speaking, but Candrakīrti will not go that far:

MAV, verse 6:162

Likewise, the self is asserted to be the appropriator in dependence on the aggregates, sense elements, and sense basis that worldly acknowledge—appropriation is the action, this is also the agent.

The commentary clarifies:

Although the self is not defined as a mundane convention in relative truth, but like a chariot, it is asserted to be the appropriator.

The next three passages bring the point to bear well. Not sure what translation you are using, but the Padmakara version is fuzzy on this point.

So, this is a special point of Candrakīrti's which one can discover more fully discussed by Gorampa in his Differentiation of Views.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 5:18 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

Setting aside the narrow question of Guru Yoga itself, one has to contend with the glaring historical fact that many revered lineage holders claimed to receive teachings directly from deceased gurus and/or non-human beings. Tilopa, Dudjom Lingpa, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also the glaring, historical fact that Tilopa, Dudjom Lingpa, and so on started out with regular old human gurus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 5:23 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

conebeckham said:

Just a comment---there are "LaDrup" practices that center on "historical gurus"--quite a few of them, and for all the Tibetan lineages, I think. But the key instruction is that this "Guru" has to be understood as one with one's actual root guru.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. The difference between rnam pa, aspect, and ngo bo, essence. The aspect can be whatever the sadhana is; the essence is always one's own root guru/s (yes, there can be more than one guru if you have received the same practice from more than one guru).

Könchok Thrinley said:

So if one has Zhitro empowerment from Lama A, then one regards withing the practice of Zhitro root guru as Lama A and if one has Vajrakilaya from Lama B, it is Lama B for Vajrakilaya?

What if one feels more affinity and karmic connection to Lama C?

And what about the principle of unifying all teachers? By which I mean for eg. one does GY of Padmasambhava from Lama D and trains to see Guru Padmasambhava as the embodiment of all ones teachers?

Malcolm wrote:

All I can tell you is how ChNN practiced. One, he did unite all gurus into one, and this is appropriate. This is also how I practice.

But when he was practicing a specific practice, such as Zhitro of Namcho, he would bring to mind that guru from whom he received that transmission, Gongkar Rinpoche; or when practicing Adzom Drukpa's Tāra, Gyalsey Gyurme Dorje; etc., or Simhamukha, Ayu Khandro, etc.

So there is no contradiction here, and indeed, it strengthens one's connection to the practice. So for example, if I practice any practice, I unite all gurus there, and I also recall specifically the guru from whom I received it. I try not to play favorites with my gurus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 5:38 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Soma999 said:

There is no « guru academy » and three years retreat does not automatically make someone a guru in its highest sense.

Malcolm wrote:

An authentic teacher has indeed gone to "guru school."

There is gurukula and guruparamparā. If one has not received empowerment, one is not a member of the Vajragurukula, the family of the vajra guru, one has no samaya, and one has no guruparamaparā, no lineage of gurus. Thus one has no business even looking at the tantras, etc.

These days, in this degenerate era, there are some people who have fallen prey to evil views, and feel that they are smarter than the Buddha, who taught the tantras; the mahāsiddhas, who realized their meaning; the paṇḍitas who commented upon them; the translators, who made them available to us to practice.

In this degenerate age it is very important to hold fast to the way the tantras should be taught, and not substitute our own fabrications for the authentic teachings of the Buddha. That is, find a qualified guru of an authentic lineage, request teachings, and then follow their instructions as best one can, and avoid people who do not respect this path, even if they claim themselves to be Vajrayāna practitioners.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 6:02 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:



Setting aside the narrow question of Guru Yoga itself, one has to contend with the glaring historical fact that many revered lineage holders claimed to receive teachings directly from deceased gurus and/or non-human beings. Tilopa, Dudjom Lingpa, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also the glaring, historical fact that Tilopa, Dudjom Lingpa, and so on started out with regular old human gurus.

Montoya said:

I think it's safe to assert that they both received the good stuff, the juice, their magnum opus material from the 'other realms'. Take Tilopa. I mean, tummo is cool and all, but I think we can all agree that Mahamudra coming down from on high was a \*slightly\* more meaningful transmission. Now, do you want to claim that it was the human gurus who prepared him to see the light, softened him up so to speak? Feels like a bit of goal post shifting, but sure, perhaps.

Malcolm wrote:

Tilopa's mahāmudrā realization came about as a result of his own meditation on the creation and completion stage systems of Cakrasamvara, which he received from his guru, Vijaya. Tilopa was originally a kṣatriya, ordained as a bhikṣu, was called Prajñābhadra, become a paṇḍita, and was ordered by Mahāsiddha Vijaya to become a sesame pounder. Since Tilopa realized mahāmudrā, there is no fault or contradiction with the idea that he also received teachings and transmissions directly from Buddha Vajradhara. But he started as an ordinary person, no different from you or me. Indeed, there is a Vajravārāhī sadhana in the Tengyur authored by him under the name "Prajñābhadra."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 8:30 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

It is permissible, and it is valid.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither permissible, valid, nor taught in any tantra.

A root guru is a person from whom one has at minimum received empowerments. No empowerment, no guru.

It's amazing how people like you get all upset about minor issues, but boldly proclaims doctrines that harm the essence of the Dharma with barely a thought.

Sonam Wangchug said:

This is incorrect, the OP asked whether it was possible to take ( and they mentioned several kagyu masters ) as their Root Guru, and I said yes it was, because the masters in

question said in their own will that it was valid, so that is the end of the question. This is the view of the Kagyu lineage BTW so I would be careful with saying the Kagyu lineage holds views which harm the essence of dharma, or that these statements have been made without thought, when they are the last will and testament of the lineage masters, because that would be, to put it in the best of words, extremely unskillful.

Malcolm wrote:

We do not just accept such statements uncritically.

The idea you can decide some teacher in the past whom you never met is now your root guru is ridiculous on its face, and I honestly don't care who claims it to be so. There is no valid precedent for this. One can never receive empowerment from such a person. For the same reason no one alive today can claim the Buddha is their root guru, and one certainly cannot hope to find a more perfect teacher than the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 8:36 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is also the glaring, historical fact that Tilopa, Dudjom Lingpa, and so on started out with regular old human gurus.

Montoya said:

I think it's safe to assert that they both received the good stuff, the juice, their magnum opus material from the 'other realms'. Take Tilopa. I mean, tummo is cool and all, but I think we can all agree that Mahamudra coming down from on high was a \*slightly\* more meaningful transmission. Now, do you want to claim that it was the human gurus who prepared him to see the light, softened him up so to speak? Feels like a bit of goal post shifting, but sure, perhaps.

Sonam Wangchug said:

True, Dudjom Lingpa had some human teachers but they were not his major teachers,

Malcolm wrote:

It's clear you never read his autobiography carefully.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:53 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

True, Dudjom Lingpa had some human teachers but they were not his major teachers,

Malcolm wrote:

It's clear you never read his autobiography carefully.

Sonam Wangchug said:

I have,

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, you didn't read it carefully enough. Dudjom Lingpa is quite clear about his devotion to his human guru.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

This is incorrect, the OP asked whether it was possible to take ( and they mentioned several kagyu masters ) as their Root Guru, and I said yes it was, because the masters in question said in their own will that it was valid, so that is the end of the question. This is the view of the Kagyu lineage BTW so I would be careful with saying the Kagyu lineage holds views which harm the essence of dharma, or that these statements have been made without thought, when they are the last will and testament of the lineage masters, because that would be, to put it in the best of words, extremely unskillful.

Malcolm wrote:

We do not just accept such statements uncritically.

The idea you can decide some teacher in the past whom you never met is now your root guru is ridiculous on its face, and I honestly don't care who claims it to be so. There is no valid precedent for this. One can never receive empowerment from such a person. For the same reason no one alive today can claim the Buddha is their root guru, and one certainly cannot hope to find a more perfect teacher than the Buddha.

Sonam Wangchug said:

I will defer to Lord Gampopa, Dusum Khyenpa, and Gotsanpa's opinion on the issue all of whom said it was possible.

Malcolm wrote:

Amazing. You are deferring to opinions on mere hearsay, opinions you have not even

read for yourself.

By the way, I have no qualms about supplicating masters from the past, I do it everyday, but the idea that one can arbitrarily decide Tilopa is one's root guru because you don't have sufficient faith in your actual guru is just pathetic. This is the sort of thing that harms the teachings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 10:02 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Nalanda said:

Sorry to ask. Seeing this thread here, is the subtext, we have to be vegetarians?

Sonam Wangchug said:

No, it is not, as it's not a point anyone in this particular thread has made, we were debating purely whether Oysters were sentient or not.

Even if Buddhists eat meat, meat that is suspected of being killed in the three ways, is forbidden. In other words you cannot specifically have an animal die for you, nor suspect that it died for you (specifically), consuming living beings obviously contradicts this which is why it is relevant to the precept of refuge and killing.

Malcolm wrote:

Plants are also living beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

Sakya Pandita from the book Ordinary wisdom

"People with some learning but no merit  
Destroy themselves with their knowledge  
Oysters forfeit their lives  
Because of the pearls to which they cling"

Team oysters are sentient,  
Patrul Rinpoche, Sapan, Check.

PeterC said:

Neither Sapan nor Patrul Rinpoche ever saw an oyster in their lives. I doubt they ever talked to a person who had seen an oyster. Now they are authorities that I would normally accept, but what does their authority rest on here?

Sonam Wangchug said:  
They weren't idiots, they possessed Wisdom.

Malcolm wrote:  
I admire Sapan more than anyone, but he wasn't right about everything. For example, he famously argued that ants had no eyes.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:13 PM  
Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?  
Content:

Montoya said:  
I think it's safe to assert that they both received the good stuff, the juice, their magnum opus material from the 'other realms'. Take Tilopa. I mean, tummo is cool and all, but I think we can all agree that Mahamudra coming down from on high was a \*slightly\* more meaningful transmission. Now, do you want to claim that it was the human gurus who prepared him to see the light, softened him up so to speak? Feels like a bit of goal post shifting, but sure, perhaps.

Malcolm wrote:  
Tilopa's mahāmudrā realization came about as a result of his own meditation on the creation and completion stage systems of Cakrasamvara, which he received from his guru, Vijaya. Tilopa was originally a kṣatriya, ordained as a bhikṣu, was called Prajñābhada, become a paṇḍita, and was ordered by Mahāsiddha Vijaya to become a sesame pounder. Since Tilopa realized mahāmudrā, there is no fault or contradiction with the idea that he also received teachings and transmissions directly from Buddha Vajradhara. But he started as an ordinary person, no different from you or me. Indeed, there is a Vajravārāhī sadhana in the Tengyur authored by him under the name "Prajñābhada."

Montoya said:  
And Tilopa received the Chakrasamvara transmission from a dakini that came to him in a vision!

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, after he attained mahamudra siddhi, having already received Cakrasamvara from Vijaya.

Montoya said:  
Look, I'm not trying to argue for arguments sake, but there is simply no getting around

the fact that many times, in many places, revered teachers within Tibetan Buddhism claimed to have accessed teachings/transmissions/realizations from non-human teachers.

Malcolm wrote:

After they attained realization, sure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:42 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

I will defer to Lord Gampopa, Dusum Khyenpa, and Gotsanpas opinion on the issue all of whom said it was possible.

Malcolm wrote:

Amazing. You are deferring to opinions on mere hearsay, opinions you have not even read for yourself.

By the way, I have no qualms about supplicating masters from the past, I do it everyday, but the idea that one can arbitrarily decide Tilopa is one's root guru because you don't have sufficient faith in your actual guru is just pathetic. This is the sort thing that harms the teachings.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Hearsay? yes

Malcolm wrote:

We don't rely on hearsay to confirm points of the doctrine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 9:52 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

There are really three questions at play here:

1) Is there precedent for humans to receive teachings from non-human/deceased teachers?

Malcolm wrote:

Not without realization, no.

Montoya said:

2) Is it possible/likely that we too could receive such teachings?

Malcolm wrote:

Not without realization, no.

Montoya said:

3) Is it advisable to attempt to pursue such a path (setting aside the obvious issue of how one would even do so)?

Malcolm wrote:

Not without realization, no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

We can debate the order he received teachings or dismiss it as hagiography, but there's no getting around the fact that the Karma Kagyu party line heavily emphasizes the fact that both dakinis and Vajradhara were the \*primary\* causes of Tilopa's realization as noted here:

<https://www.karmapa.org/karma-kagyu/lives/tilopa/>

"It is said that he was given direct transmission of Mahamudra by the Buddha Vajradhara (Tib. Dorje Chang), who became his main teacher."

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, he received the transmission of mahāmudra from both Vijaya and Antarapa, who were, for him, Vajradhara just as our own guru, for us, should be Vajradhara. The lineages lists are really very clear about who received what from whom. So you imagine that the mahāmudrā siddhas were Tilopa's teachers were incapable of giving him the introduction of mahāmudrā? Why would you believe that?

Montoya said:

There is a reason that the Karma Kagyu lineage tree starts at Vajradhara and not one of Tilopa's human teachers.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and the Sakya Yoginī starts Vajradhara --> Vajrayogini--> Naropa. But this does not mean that Tilopa was not Naropa's guru, nor that Vijaya was not Tilopa's guru, and so on.

Similarly, Ghantapāda's guru was the mahāsiddhā Darikapa, but the lineage for his system is Vajradhara --> Vajrayoginī--> Ghantapāda. And guess what, in this lineage, Tilopa is preceded by Vijaya. So, it is no disrespect to Darikapa that he is not included in the Ghantapāda lineage. Just as it is no disrespect to Vijaya that the Karma Kagyu lineages begins Vajradhara--> Tilopa, just as it is no disrespect that Naropa is preceded by Yoginī, and so on. But in reality, Darikapa was Ghantapāda's guru, Vijaya was Tilopa's guru, and Tilopa was Naropa's guru. The gurus of each of these mahāsiddhas was themselves a mahāsiddha. What do mahasiddhas realize? Mahāmudrā. So it is a strange claim to argue that Tilopa only received mahāmudrā transmission from "Vajradhara," when a) there is the fact that Tilopa received mahāmudra introduction from another of his gurus, Antarapa, b) and any practitioner worth their salt regards their guru/s as Vajradhara in person.

Montoya said:

Again, I am not proposing this as a valid path for students today, but we can't ignore that this is very much 'a thing' in the history of Tibetan Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Kagyus do not own Tilopa anymore than they own Naropa. I would say that quite frankly, you are making arguments from a paucity of information. There are many histories of the Cakrasamvara lineage which you can read, if you know Tibetan. I think you will be surprised at what you discover, and much of your present certainty will vanish.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 10:30 PM

Title: Re: "Bodhisattva Gaia" and "Vairocana Sun"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I may change my opinion after reading it, but it seems like he is suggesting here that brāhmaṇas simply passed over passages that didn't work for them, and that's their canon.

Malcolm wrote:

he actually makes a more interesting proposal, that brahmins were more interested in dhyānas, while non-brahmins were more interested in insight.

Zhen Li said:

I read through it just this morning. It was very interesting.

My take is that it is not that non-brāhmaṇas were more interested in insight, but that brāhmaṇas were simply not taught about anātman (he suggests, for instance, that Mahākāśyapa is never depicted as having been taught the doctrine) and that their "canon" consisted of sūtras that would be entirely amenable to their existing worldview. The goal, in the end, is to get people awakened, and if they're going to be repulsed upon their first meeting with the Buddha, the teaching strategy is flawed.



Malcolm wrote:

And there is a third option, which we find the PP sūtras, that is, absence of self/emptiness was (and remains) an advanced teaching, and was not simply promiscuously proclaimed as it is today.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Soma999 said:

If you don't have this opportunity yet, you can still perform guru yoga as the guru principle is everywhere.

Malcolm wrote:

No, one cannot. This is a farce. No empowerment, no guru yoga. Guru yoga is a practice only found in unsurpassed yoga tantra. It does not exist in the lower tantras nor does it exist in sūtra. The permission to practice guru yoga only comes from receiving the unsurpassed yoga tantra empowerment in full or alternately, with direct introduction of Dzogchen or Mahāmudrā.

Can one supplicate the Buddha, the great bodhisattvas, and important teachers of the past? Is there merit in that? Yes and yes. But this is not guru yoga.

The essence of guru yoga resides in the living connection one has with one's guru and the merging of the guru's body, speech, and mind with one's own body, voice, and mind forged through empowerment. That living connection is based on the transmission of the special gnosis one receives at the time of empowerment. Without this introduction, there is no basis for the practice of guru yoga at all.

Even in practices such as the guru yogas of Milarepa, Padmasambhava, and so on, the point is that while the form of the guru is in the aspect of this or that historical teacher, the essence is one's own root guru. This point is extremely important. Our root gurus are the conduit through which we are able to access the true blessings and empowerment of the lineage going back to Buddha Vajradhāra. This is why it is so important to maintain pure samaya and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Seeker12 said:

The third is exemplified by the story of Nagarjuna and Jagadbhadra. Without permission, they took from a Buddhist temple in Oddiyana two texts: the Two Segments and the

Tantra of Mahamaya. They were pursued by the vajra dakinis, who caught them and commanded them to become inheritors of these teachings and to expound them....

It would seem to me that for example King Ja, here, did not receive empowerment in the way we would often think, in the manner of the first category.

Malcolm wrote:

The example of King Jah is a very poor one, actually, and is much disputed. There isn't even a tantra called The Continuation of the Śrī Samvarodaya Tantra. Instead the citation comes from one of the Anuyoga Tantras.

Also the tale about Nāgārjuna is just so much gossip. Sonam Tsemo (1142-1182) writes in the General Presentation of Tantras:

Some claim “The Hevajra Tantra was revealed by the great master called ‘Dombi Heruka.’ Others claim “Master Nāgārjuna stole it disguised as an idiot” These are a source of laughter.

How are these a source of laughter? The masters will be slandered because there is no magical power to be attained from stealing on the first bodhisattva stage. The ḍākinīs will be slandered because how would the caretaker of the books not recognize Nāgārjuna, the theft, and so on? Our own Dharma will be slandered because the lineage would be from a stolen book.

Likewise, the Mahāmāya Tantra was revealed by master Kukuripa...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, October 29th, 2021 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

Sorry, but I find all of this rather unconvincing. Even if you accept that Tilopa was ripened before meeting Vajradhara, how was he ripened?

Malcolm wrote:

By receiving the four empowerments from Vijaya while he was still a bhikṣu called Prajñabhadra, then he went off practiced, and realized mahāmudra through practicing the two stages. I mean, why do you think he was sent to pound sesame? This type of caryavratā was very common in the Cakrasamvara lineage. Luipa sent Darikapa, a prince, to be the servant of a courtesan in a strange city, etc.

Montoya said:

The broader point I am attempting (and apparently failing) to make, is that we as Westerners must confront and accept (or not) rather outrageous claims such as receiving teachings from non-human sources. Your approach seems to be "well, yes, those teachings did occur, but they were not necessary as there were humans involved

elsewhere in the process." That seems a bit of a side step, but okay.

Malcolm wrote:

Vajradhāra is the dharmakāya expressed as the sambhogakāya. As the Tattvasamgraha Tantra states:

I, Samantabhadra, have no form,  
but I manifest in the form of a bodhisattva  
to teach bodhisattvas.

Not even bodhisattvas on the impure stages can see Vajradhara. Only eighth stage bodhisattvas and beyond are capable of seeing the sambhogakāya.

Montoya said:

As for the Karma Kagyu specifically, I make no claims to it being the definitive voice of Tibetan Buddhism, but it is one strain of lineage which claims descent from Tilopa and as such worthy of having its own views on the matter unless you choose to dismiss them on polemical grounds.

Malcolm wrote:

You are certainly entitled to your own story, just don't confuse stories with facts.

We actually have quite a bit of information about Tilopa, his career, his teachers, his practices, and so on. But if you want to obliterate them because "Mah lineage," there is nothing I can do about that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Seeker12 said:

So essentially you just completely wrote off what Jigme Lingpa wrote then. Is that fair to say?

Are you of the opinion that the only valid type of empowerment is the first type - "all empowerments given according to an empowerment ritual"?

Malcolm wrote:

I wrote off the examples Jigme Lingpa uses as faulty and disputable, since they had already been refuted 700 years before him. And he is just literally copying Pema Karpo either directly or through some intermediate source.

You have to read the whole text by Atisha, then the meaning becomes clear.

In the beginning he says:

My guru, Samayavajra, said, This vehicle is superior to the pāramitāyāna, superior in terms of the guru, empowerment, samaya, intimate instructions, and diligence.

The passage in question comes about from a description of how one receives vows:

For the first vow, an abbot and a master is required. For the second vow, one needs a guru, or even if that is lacking, it can be taken. For the last, there are four divisions: there is the empowerment that arises from the mouth of the guru, there is the empowerment of the blessing of the gnosis deity, there is the empowerment of the prediction of the ḍākinīs, and there is the empowerment of the obtained through the power of one's own mind.

This is just a description of the four empowerments, the vase, secret, third, and fourth, and not a description of four separate kinds of empowerments.

After this, after describing the benefits of the four empowerments, he says:

"Never avoid the meditation practice and dharma practice with the pledged deity, never avoid faith and respect with the guru; never avoid samayas and vows with the ḍākinīs..."

Seeker12 said:

You also didn't address the other question about if one could attain realization via non-Vajrayana methods...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, you can practice common mahāyāna for ages and ages, eventually you will attain the path of seeing, and you can visit one hundred buddhafiels, see one hundred nirmāṇakāyas, and so on. You can continue to practice for two incalculable eons, attain the eighth bhumi, and then you can see the sambhogakāya; and at the end of the third incalculable eon, you attain buddhahood and see the dharmakāya. There is no other way, no short cuts, even if you take birth in Sukhavati. It is unlikely you will meet Vajrayāna, but maybe, if you are lucky.

Seeker12 said:

and then connect with, say, the wisdom body of Longchenpa, or receive empowerment from Guru Rinpoche directly, or whatever.

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

Sorry, but I find all of this rather unconvincing. Even if you accept that Tilopa was ripened before meeting Vajradhara, how was he ripened?

Malcolm wrote:

By receiving the four empowerments from Vijaya while he was still a bhikṣu called Prajñābhada, then he went off practiced, and realized mahāmudra through practicing the two stages. I mean, why do you think he was sent to pound sesame? This type of caryavrata was very common in the Cakrasamvara lineage. Luipa sent Darikapa, a prince, to be the servant of a courtesan in a strange city, etc.

Montoya said:

The broader point I am attempting (and apparently failing) to make, is that we as Westerners must confront and accept (or not) rather outrageous claims such as receiving teachings from non-human sources. Your approach seems to be "well, yes, those teachings did occur, but they were not necessary as there were humans involved elsewhere in the process." That seems a bit of a side step, but okay.

Malcolm wrote:

Vajradhāra is the dharmakāya expressed as the sambhogakāya. As the Tattvasamgraha Tantra states:

I, Samantabhadra, have no form,  
but I manifest in the form of a bodhisattva  
to teach bodhisattvas.

Not even bodhisattvas on the impure stages can see Vajradhara. Only eighth stage bodhisattvas and beyond are capable of seeing the sambhogakāya.

Montoya said:

As for the Karma Kagyu specifically, I make no claims to it being the definitive voice of Tibetan Buddhism, but it is one strain of lineage which claims descent from Tilopa and as such worthy of having its own views on the matter unless you choose to dismiss them on polemical grounds.

Malcolm wrote:

You are certainly entitled to your own story, just don't confuse stories with facts.

We actually have quite a bit of information about Tilopa, his career, his teachers, his practices, and so on. But if you want to obliterate them because "Mah lineage," there is nothing I can do about that.

Montoya said:

Are you claiming that the lineage through Vijaya (back through Saraha) is an unbroken human lineage back to Shakyamuni?

Malcolm wrote:

Cakrasamvara does not come through Śākyamuni at all.

Why? Because the Cakrasamvara mandala still exists in this world in the 24 places, it was never closed unlike Hevajra, Guhyasamāja, Kālacakra, etc., and in these 24 places the *nirmāṇakāya* is still teaching this mandala (its one of the reasons it is so effective in this age). And of course, the *nirmāṇakāya* is inseparable from the *sambhogkāya* and the *dharmakāya*. In any case, this transmission was bestowed by Vajradhara upon Vajrapāṇi. Vajrapāṇi is a tenth stage bodhisattva, but he is also a human being, as is the *nirmāṇakāya* who teaches in the 24 places. So it is an unbroken human lineage, all the way back to *nirmāṇakāya* Śrī Heruka Vajradhara in the 24 places.

Now, Vajrapāṇi bestowed this upon Saraha at Śrīparvata in S. India along with the root tantra. etc., the latter in turn transmitted this to Nāgārjuna in S. India and the rest is history.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 3:03 AM

Title: Re: Is it permissible in Guru Yoga to choose an historical guru?

Content:

Montoya said:

Are you claiming that the lineage through Vijaya (back through Saraha) is an unbroken human lineage back to Shakyamuni?

Malcolm wrote:

Cakrasamvara does not come through Śākyamuni at all.

Why? Because the Cakrasamvara mandala still exists in this world in the 24 places, it was never closed unlike Hevajra, Guhyasamāja, Kālacakra, etc., and in these 24 places the *nirmāṇakāya* is still teaching this mandala (its one of the reasons it is so effective in this age). And of course, the *nirmāṇakāya* is inseparable from the *sambhogkāya* and the *dharmakāya*. In any case, this transmission was bestowed by Vajradhara upon Vajrapāṇi. Vajrapāṇi is a tenth stage bodhisattva, but he is also a human being, as is the *nirmāṇakāya* who teaches in the 24 places. So it is an unbroken human lineage, all the way back to *nirmāṇakāya* Śrī Heruka Vajradhara in the 24 places.

Now, Vajrapāṇi bestowed this upon Saraha at Śrīparvata in S. India along with the root tantra. etc., the latter in turn transmitted this to Nāgārjuna in S. India and the rest is history.

Montoya said:

Well, yes and the time you speak of is also the time of yakshas, rakshasas, the mighty and fearsome Bhairava, etc. I'm afraid that once we are at the point of them being tenth stage bodhisattvas also incarnated as humans then we have drifted into deep waters and there is really no further discussion to be had.

Malcolm wrote:

All of the information I have provided to you is sourced from authoritative tantras in Kenjur, and their commentaries which one can find in the Tengyur, as well as the Naropa oral tradition.

The compiler of the tantras is Vajrapāṇi. There are many emanations of Vajrapāṇi, but in particular, the Indrabhūti, all three, are regarded as Vajrapāṇi emanations and are predicted in the Tantras, and they too all had human gurus. In the case of the first, it was Śākyamuni Buddha, the later two had different gurus.

You seem to think I am making an argument that transmissions through visions and dreams are impossible. I never said that. But ordinary people have to be ripened by human gurus. There is no precedent at all for an ordinary human being to have some kind of visionary empowerment from an awakened being. Such an idea represents a fundamental misunderstanding of the paths and stages. A nirmāṇakāya is an awakened being in the form of an ordinary human being, for example, Śākyamuni Buddha; his voice is the sambhogakāya, and his mind is the dharmakāya. Not even tenth stage bodhisattvas can perceive the dharmakāya. Only buddhas can perceive this.

Even then, the account of Tilopa in the Life Stories of the 84 Mahāsiddhas by Abhayadatta is sure to disappoint. He describes Tilopa as a pandita and a court priest, who becomes disgusted when he recognizes that when he gives teachings, everyone is distracted. He then leaves for a charnel ground outside of Kañci where he begs for alms and practices. He then meets Naropa, who provides Tilopa with provisions for the next ten years, after which time, Tilopa attains mahāmudra siddhi. He departs to deva realms where he continues to practice, and attains the siddhis of body, speech, and mind, and eventually physically departed to Khecari realm. So according to this this account, when Naropa first met Tilopa, the latter had not even attained siddhi.

My question to you is this: can your mind comprehend that there are different accounts? Or is the "Mah lineage" the only one that matters to you. Because if it is the latter, what makes you any different than a fundamentalist Christian?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 3:09 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Toenail said:

even though I usually trust and follow what Malcolm is saying I would not eat oysters because I think it could be killing if they are alive and are indeed sentient.

Malcolm wrote:

It's possible, but I just don't think they are. But remember, I never said anywhere in this thread or the one it was spawned from that other people should eat oysters.

All I said that I would rather eat oysters than my own cum for its nutritional value, just to put it in the plainest possible terms. Then Adamantine opined that he hoped I did not mean on the half-shell. And I responded by saying that I did not and do not think oysters are sentient. Then some people in the peanut gallery got super indignant, and the rest is history.

So can we please close this f\*&^ing thread?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 4:20 AM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The imputation itself is the agent and recipient of action, that's the point.

Astus said:

That is more likely the view of Gorampa.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is the view of Candrakīrti, but perhaps it's too subtle for some people to grasp.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 10:45 AM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Helping in small ways is nice. But politics gets too complicated, and draws us deeper into samsara...

Malcolm wrote:

Samsara only has one level.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 6:10 PM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is the view of Candrakīrti, but perhaps it's too subtle for some people to grasp.



Astus said:

Do you know perhaps others who picked up that interpretation? On the other hand, wouldn't it be quite close to what Gorampa criticised in Tsongkhapa interpreting conventional phenomena as purely designations?

Malcolm wrote:

Rongton, etc.

And no. Gorampa is faulting Tsongkhapa for not getting this point. Gorampa argues this point more thoroughly in his yet to translated commentary on MAV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 7:47 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Helping in small ways is nice. But politics gets too complicated, and draws us deeper into samsara...

Malcolm wrote:

Samsara only has one level.

SilenceMonkey said:

You're talking about there being no difference within duality? (That as long as something is dualistic, it is samsara)

Malcolm wrote:

All three realms are samsara. They are all suffering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

narhwal90 said:

You keep saying such things. How have you tested this view?

Toenail said:

It is general buddhist view. That there is no happiness in Samsara. It is not controversial at all.

Malcolm wrote:

While it is true that one cannot fix samsara, striving to make others happy is not fruitless or worthless. It is an end in itself. I suggest you study the Bodhicarya-avatara.

Bodhisattvas engage in three main forms of generosity: material generosity, the generosity of freedom from fear, and the generosity of Dharma.

In general, seeking to make the world a safer place, in what limited ways we can, makes it possible to practice Dharma. One notes that the places where Dharma flourishes most today are places where Democracy is a high value. It is true there are a couple of toy kingdoms like Sikkim and Bhutan, but they survive only due to the grace of India's protection from the PRC, and they emulate the British constitutional monarchy now, thus, democratic. They are incapable of protecting themselves. Thailand can protect itself, but its government is rife with corruption, as is its sangha over all. Buddhism is repressed in countries like Russia, not to mention China, and other dictatorships like Vietnam, etc.

Buddhism itself is essentially anarchistic, and the idea of a supreme head of anything in the Sangha at large was quashed by the Buddha in the beginning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

Toenail said:

It is general buddhist view. That there is no happiness in Samsara. It is not controversial at all.

Malcolm wrote:

While it is true that one cannot fix samsara, striving to make others happy is not fruitless or worthless. It is an end in itself. I suggest you study the Bodhicarya-avatara.

Bodhisattvas engage in three main forms of generosity: material generosity, the generosity of freedom from fear, and the generosity of Dharma.

In general, seeking to make the world a safer place, in what limited ways we can, makes it possible to practice Dharma. One notes that the places where Dharma flourishes most today are places where Democracy is a high value. It is true there are a couple of toy kingdoms like Sikkim and Bhutan, but they survive only due to the grace of India's protection from the PRC, and they emulate the British constitutional monarchy now, thus, democratic. They are incapable of protecting themselves. Thailand can protect itself, but its government is rife with corruption, as is its sangha over all. Buddhism is repressed in countries like Russia, not to mention China, and other dictatorships like Vietnam, etc.

Buddhism itself is essentially anarchistic, and the idea of a supreme head of anything in

the Sangha at large was quashed by the Buddha in the beginning.

Toenail said:

Thank you, I studied it. What you are saying is the same as I am saying. I am not propagating some kind of nihilist view. You say that path has an end. It is buddhahood. So that is the goal that one seeks to achieve through all these actions. Gathering the two accumulations in order to benefit beings. But they are not truly benefitted through giving them an apple or medicine, or else we would all have to join Doctors beyond borders and abandon dharma practice etc. They can only truly be benefitted through dharma and thats why we gather the two accumulations that include actions like the three types of generosity amongst which giving of the dharma is (understandably) seen as supreme.

Malcolm wrote:

Baby steps. If ones political actions are motivated by selfishness, it's better not to be political. If ones politics are motivated by policies which actually will support practice of dharma, then it's better to be political.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://slate.com/culture/2021/10/dune-2021-movie-vs-book-white-savior-islam.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 10:46 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

Toenail said:

I feel like so called buddhists should move away from the wrong view that somehow you can fix or make samsara better by avoiding the use of plastic bags and being vegetarian. There is no happiness in samsara and there is no point trying to create some enlightened society, solving world hunger etc., it is just a waste of time.

seeker242 said:

There is also no point in creating more pollution for the environment and creating more suffering for animals, etc. The idea that one should live harmlessly is not a wrong view.

Malcolm wrote:

Ahimsa is not an absolute value in Dharma, unlike Jainism, however. The Buddha clearly rejected the Jain idea of extreme ahimsa as well as Devadatta's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

seeker242 said:

There is also no point in creating more pollution for the environment and creating more suffering for animals, etc. The idea that one should live harmlessly is not a wrong view.

Malcolm wrote:

Ahimsa is not an absolute value in Dharma, unlike Jainism, however. The Buddha clearly rejected the Jain idea of extreme ahimsa as well as Devadatta's.

seeker242 said:

Which has no bearing on the fact that it's not a wrong view for one to aim to live harmlessly.

Malcolm wrote:

Taking it to extremes is wrong view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Matt J said:

It seemed weird to me that no one has an issue with a ruling class rich white kid coming to be the Messiah for a bunch of indigenous people of color. Seemed a bit colonialist to me.

Malcolm wrote:

See Slate review above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

seeker242 said:

Which has no bearing on the fact that it's not a wrong view for one to aim to live harmlessly.

Malcolm wrote:

Taking it to extremes is wrong view.

seeker242 said:

Not using plastic bags and being vegetarian is not extreme.

Malcolm wrote:

They can be.

seeker242 said:

Feeding hungry people is not extreme.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that never is, but sometimes you have to feed them meat and send them off with leftovers in plastic bags.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, October 30th, 2021 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

seeker242 said:

Not using plastic bags and being vegetarian is not extreme.

Malcolm wrote:

They can be.

seeker242 said:

Because they can be does not mean they are. It was claimed they are, which is false. Feeding hungry people is not extreme.

Yes, that never is, but sometimes you have to feed them meat and send them off with leftovers in plastic bags.

And giving them beans and paper bags instead is not a function of a wrong view.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither is giving them meat and plastic bags. We work with circumstances.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 12:10 AM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Queequeg said:

And actually, the hero of the whole series is Duncan Idaho, Jason Momoa's character. Its gets quite ridiculous.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, Dune's Kenney.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Queequeg said:

At the risk of getting myself canceled, Chappelle is, as he brags, the GOAT. Its brilliant, with nods to Lenny Bruce.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, many people refuse to see his point.

But he isn't really saying anything different than this:

<https://www.blackpast.org/african-american-history/combahee-river-collective-statement-1977/>

Queequeg said:

Although we are feminists and Lesbians, we feel solidarity with progressive Black men and do not advocate the fractionalization that white women who are separatists demand. Our situation as Black people necessitates that we have solidarity around the fact of race, which white women of course do not need to have with white men, unless it is their negative solidarity as racial oppressors. We struggle together with Black men against racism, while we also struggle with Black men about sexism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

Virgo said:

Getting angry at people for using plastic bags is so far off the mark as to be astoundingly ridiculous.

Malcolm wrote:

Plus, it is very difficult to freeze soup in a paper bag.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: Making sense of types of thought

Content:

LastLegend said:

Do you want to say pure and unpure cannot established either?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course, they are also relative.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 1:57 AM

Title: Re: Why did Buddhism take a drastic focus into emptiness at the turn of the new era? (1st century CE)

Content:

Nalanda said:

If these teachings need to be secret/hidden in the Naga realms for a few hundreds of years after the Buddha's parinirvana, what was so special about our new era (first century forward) that it was then that we saw the blossoming of these teachings?

Malcolm wrote:

The advent of Nāgārjuna, someone who could understand and explicate the Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras. We still don't really know exactly when Nāgārjuna lived. It is pretty clear he lived during Satavahana Dynasty (100BCE-200CE) and had royal support. The capital of the Satavahana Dynasty was Amaravati and it is very clear they were strong supporters of Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 3:07 AM

Title: Re: Merigar webcast OK?

Content:

oldbob said:

So if we want to harmonize the social structures of the IDC, today, with the principle of Generosity as stated by ChNN above, should not all webcasts after April 30, 2014, be without the requirement to pay a fee? Is not Membership in the IDC which many cannot afford, a fee?

By simple logic then, and simple kindness, shouldn't all webcasts (access to the Teachings) be open and free?

Malcolm wrote:

Then when we did the retreats some people would come to the retreats and ask why they would have to pay for teaching. Nobody pays for the teaching. They pay for the organization, for the place, for all the expenses.

This still applies. Someone has to pay for the servers, the gars, etc. So if your membership is not current, you are not paying "for the organization, the place, for all the expenses."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 3:23 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Chappelle is brilliant. I really can't wait to see The Closer to see how he walks the line.

However, I just cannot understand why Chappelle continues going there. I mean... why transpeople?

Malcolm wrote:

It's not transpeople in general, it's white transpeople, the ones he views as abusing their privilege. Whether one agrees with him or not, that's his point.

Our situation as Black people necessitates that we have solidarity around the fact of race, which white transwomen of course do not need to have with white men, unless it is their negative solidarity as racial oppressors.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: Merigar webcast OK?

Content:

Tata1 said:

You dont have to pay for this retreat. Only requirment is having transmission

Malcolm wrote:

he is complaining that it is password protected, and to have a user account, one must be a member of the IDC. And to be a member of the IDC, one must pay dues to a gar, something he is not inclined to do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 9:19 AM

Title: Re: Fixing Samsara

Content:

Heimdall said:



The Gelug Tibetan School would disagree with that, but anyways, I think that "anarchistic" is way too harsh of a word. Otherwise the Buddha wouldn't have established an organized Sangha.

Malcolm wrote:

The Geluk school elects it's leader who serves a set term.

When I say Buddhism is essentially anarchistic, i am saying there is no central authority deciding how it should be understood and practiced, despite occasionally reactionary attempts to enforce a fleeting orthodoxy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 9:27 AM

Title: Re: Merigar webcast OK?

Content:

oldbob said:

I don't know!

My Membership History page on dzogchen.net shows that I have been a continuous member since 2012 which is as far back as they go.

Malcolm wrote:

Great, than you should have no problem logging in.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

PeterC said:

"Identity" is like the child of a barren woman or the horns of a rabbit. Whenever you try to analyze it, it becomes incoherent.

Malcolm wrote:

Unless you being oppressed for your identity, of course. Then it becomes pretty coherent for you.

For whatever reason, I know personally four transwomen, karma, I guess. And I know two more online. They are all Buddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 8:16 PM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Queequeg said:

Maybe. But maybe everything looks like a nail to a hammer, too. You didn't quite call out the colonialist trope, though... You called out the white messiah figure... The Atreides in the book are olive skinned... The guy who played the Duke was probably cast right. I don't know why they chose Chamalet. Maybe because he's so pretty. I don't know if race is really critical to the story, but of course, it's a contemporary creative work based on a decades old source; all choices are open to contemporary critique.

Malcolm wrote:

It is definitely a novel about colonial exploitation. The story does not stay there, of course, but the recall, the reason the empire is there at all is to keep the spice flowing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Matt J said:

The issues of colonialism and race are intertwined.

Malcolm wrote:

The slate article provides a lot of historical background to the Dune novels, the unrest in Algeria, etc., a lot of the first novel is a transposition of European colonialism in North Africa. The choice of Islam as the universal religion is not accidental.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Title: Re: Teachings from non-living human gurus (split from Guru Yoga/historical guru thread)

Content:

Montoya said:

Sorry, but I find all of this rather unconvincing. Even if you accept that Tilopa was ripened before meeting Vajradhara, how was he ripened? He was ripened by the four special siddhis. And where did he receive those? From human teachers. And where did they receive them? From dakinis.

The broader point I am attempting (and apparently failing) to make, is that we as Westerners must confront and accept (or not) rather outrageous claims such as receiving teachings from non-human sources. Your approach seems to be "well, yes, those teachings did occur, but they were not necessary as there were humans involved elsewhere in the process." That seems a bit of a side step, but okay.

As for the Karma Kagyu specifically, I make no claims to it being the definitive voice of Tibetan Buddhism, but it is one strain of lineage which claims descent from Tilopa and as such worthy of having its own views on the matter unless you choose to dismiss them on polemical grounds.

Malcolm wrote:

He was ripened by receiving the four empowerments from his guru, Vijaya. He then went and practiced in a charnel ground. The accounts of his life could not be more clear. If there is a claim to be litigated, it would be the claim of Gampopa that Tilopa was an emanation. It does not correspond with Abhayadatta's biography of Tilopa in the life stories of the eighty four mahasiddhas.

I've already addressed all of your other points.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

PeterC said:

"Identity" is like the child of a barren woman or the horns of a rabbit. Whenever you try to analyze it, it becomes incoherent.

Malcolm wrote:

Unless you being oppressed for your identity, of course. Then it becomes pretty coherent for you.

PeterC said:

Yes. Violence, discrimination etc. against trans people should be denounced and stopped, as should hate-based violence directed against any group. Nobody's identity, in the sense that we are using that term, poses any sort of threat to anyone else.

For whatever reason, I know personally four transwomen, karma, I guess. And I know two more online. They are all Buddhists.

I would guess that trans people are a bit like Starbucks - they tend to cluster together in areas with favorable conditions. That the trans people you know are Buddhists may reflect selection bias. But if Buddhists can't be tolerant of different gender identities, they're not very good Buddhists.

Malcolm wrote:

I wasn't really taking issue with anything you said. I was just pointing out that for Chappelle, identity is very much at issue here, and his principle resentment lies with white transpeople claiming the same status of oppression as black people in general. I was not evaluating his claim one way or the other.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Nemo said:

. His point being many LGBT people are LGBT until they need to be white and call the cops on a black person.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, that's exactly what he was pointing out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I think Chapelle is an idiot and a bigot, but that he's a funny example of both.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe a bigot, definitely not an idiot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, October 31st, 2021 at 11:18 PM

Title: Re: "You can't post that fast"

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Why do I now have to wait ~5 minutes between posts? Is it because I think Chapelle's an idiot? I'm not sorry, I swear!

Malcolm wrote:

No, someone turned on flood control. I get the same message.and have for some days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Heimdall said:

Yet it's the entire basis of contemporary leftist discourse, hence the outcry from parents about "Critical Race Theory" being taught in schools.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, it isn't, it's at best a distraction from more important issues which the left pursues, such as the reigning in the environmentally destructive forces of free-market capitalism, etc., which the far right uses in their Christian Fascist, policy-free, culture

war against democracy.

CRT is not being taught in any schools.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Heimdall said:

Are you suggesting that Capitalism has subverted leftist political movements in order to maintain the status quo and focus on unimportant issues?

Malcolm wrote:

I am suggesting that the far right is using issues like these to distract from more important issues, like climate mitigation, and so on. But Americans are, in general, poorly educated, and becoming more so. An uneducated populace is more easily manipulated with conspiracy theories and false news.

Heimdall said:

CRT is not being taught in any schools.

And now we lost it. I guess there is no God.

Malcolm wrote:

Teaching school children historical facts about European colonialism in the "New World," the history of slavery, the The Indian Removal Act of 1830, and so on is not CRT. This has been discussed to death.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Merigar webcast OK?

Content:

oldbob said:

I am throughly confused about everything and always mistake Samsara for Nirvana and vice versa.

What I am not confused about is that there will be a short Ganapuja in 15 minutes on Practicing together Closed.

<http://melong.com/the-virtues-of-generosity-chogyal-namkhai-norbus-oral-message-on-april-30-2014-at-merigar-west/>

Malcolm wrote:

<https://webcast.dzogchen.net/index.php?id=practicing-together-html5>

It's here and it is open.

oldbob said:

ChNN wanted the fixed expenses for Teachings to be paid by sponsorship / donation, not by a Membership tax on all Members.

Malcolm wrote:

He wanted everyone to pay dues. Responsible citizens pay their taxes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Heimdall said:

Look here dude, history is both descriptive and interpretative. To suggest that a critical race analysis of "history" is purely descriptive and not at all ideologically interpretative is not honest.

Malcolm wrote:

I am not using a CR analysis of history, or a Marxist analysis of history. One does not need to have an ideological agenda to understand that the United States was founded on the twin pillars of genocide and slavery. We certainly cannot do anything to change these facts. We can either acknowledge them, in which case most US History courses as they are presented in modern grade school curriculums should be jettisoned, or we can keep our eyes closed (the GOP approach in order to protect the feelings of white children) and continue to pretend that Democracy in America has been available to everyone in America since the founding of the Republic.

But this is getting off topic, and has not much to do with Chappelle, transphobia, or anything else.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Teachings from non-living human gurus (split from Guru Yoga/historical guru thread)

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Well, if it ain't just b.s. that's pretty cool. The problem is, how to differentiate?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I have also observed tertons in action. But all of the tertons I know (3) had human gurus to whom they were profoundly devoted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 2:53 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Virgo said:

This is a Christian game through and through on both sides. That this is not completely obvious to everyone, I find amazing.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it is. 100%. In Indian myths, people mate with rivers and so on, and gender/sex transformation was quite normal in India narratives. This shit made Christian missionaries quite uncomfortable. Our friend here is an conservative ex-Christian, still apparently working out the John Bircher propaganda he absorbed as a child.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 5:30 AM

Title: Progress or Decline?

Content:

Heimdall said:

Most of Western political discourse is a product of Judeo-Christian values, including "secular" left-wing paradigms which honor the moral superiority of the lower classes, decry hierarchical power as "greed", "evil", and "oppression", and seek to transform the human being into something, super natural through the civilization of nature. The whole idea of "progress" towards some terminal point of divinity (secular or religious) is also explicitly Judeo-Christian.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. But I am follower of Buddhadharma. This is the Kali Yuga, not the Krita Yuga, and things are getting worse, and will get much worse, before they get better, if they even do. So my "left wing politics" are conservationist, rather than ideological. I am not an ideological person (well, that's not completely true, if I had a political ideology it would Deep Ecology ala Arne Naess). I don't have time for it. I do have likes and dislikes around policies however, and in general, while I don't much like the policy decisions of most Democrats, I think the policy decisions of the GOP are just f\*&king tragic.

Heimdall said:

The idea that Western leftist politics is fully disconnected from an Abrahamic culture and is totally harmonious with Ancient Indian and East Asian Buddha-dharma, whereas Western conservative politics is a direct product of Abrahamic culture and irreconcilable with Ancient Indian and East Asian Buddha-dharma is laughably falsifiable.

Malcolm wrote:

It's also a strawman, hence easy to knock down.

Heimdall said:

Why is it that you people constantly advocate for a "deconstruction of patriarchal gender norms" in East Asia then?

Malcolm wrote:

What have patriarchal gender norms ever done for anyone? Is there a reason they should be treated as sacred cow?

Heimdall said:

Did the evil white man corrupt the Ancient Chinese and Japanese civilizations, who described the local tribal outsiders as "barbarians"? Who were also monogamous? Whose traditional gender roles mirrored somewhat traditional Western civilization?

Malcolm wrote:

I am pretty sure the Chinese and Japanese were excellent at corrupting themselves before we came along and put the nail in the coffin of their feudal societies.

Heimdall said:

We all know that contemporary Western Buddhism is a product of upper-middle class white people from West Coast and urban areas in the 60s and 70s, adopting a façade of East-Asian mysticism not only to live their colonial fantasy of the "noble savage", but also to find any mystical religious paradigm which could justify their pre-existing moral, political, and philosophical beliefs.

Malcolm wrote:

It would seem, according to you, Western Buddhists are just trying justify Christian belief systems they already have, such as belief in a soul, patriarchy, subordination of women, great white savior, and so on? Not sure what you are trying to say here.

I know why I am a Buddhist, how about you? I don't find the Dharma to be particularly mystical, that's something I associate with theistic religions.

Heimdall said:

I someday wish to be as philosophically transcendent and objective as you Malcolm.

Malcolm wrote:

It comes with age, plenty of good wine and good sex. Also actually studying Dharma in an original Buddhist language helps a lot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 10:27 AM

Title: Re: Merigar webcast OK?

Content:

oldbob said:



Yes, he wanted everyone to be Members, but this was changed by someone from a voluntary system to a fixed system. Fixed charges for membership fees are not in harmony with the spirit of number 4. "according to their wishes."

Malcolm wrote:

All I know is the way it is, so I with work circumstances as they are. Thus I pay my dues and I don't complain.

The dues are \$0.76 a day.

You said you pay your dues, so, I don't really see what you're bitching about.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Heimdall said:

Laws aren't real, merely a social construction, so why don't we deconstruct some of those?

Malcolm wrote:

That happens with some regularity, by necessity. Personally, I think the constitution needs a rewrite.

Heimdall said:

Let's get rid of legal prohibitions against theft, especially considering that the rich get away with so much more!

Malcolm wrote:

The rich have been deconstructing the tax code since forever.

Heimdall said:

In fact let's just get rid of penal punishments for violent crimes. As people are a product of their social circumstances more so than individuality, the reason for rape and murder is perpetuated by the lower class status they find themselves stuck in. If you murder someone, just send them to a psychiatrist where they can be rehabilitated after a couple years or so!

Malcolm wrote:

I think that's what they do in Norway. They seem to have a very low rate repeat offenders.

Heimdall said:

All of these are parodies of leftist positions (although day by day we are getting closer to

satire being a reality), but I can legitimately justify them all by arguing they are imaginary, social constructions, right? No. Obviously, if something is a "social construction", that doesn't mean it's "unimportant" or "deserves to be deconstructed".

Malcolm wrote:

Why don't you parody some right wing positions for a change?

Heimdall said:

Your next argument will be the classical "well it's not harming you" argument, but I've already demonstrated the ways it is harming children.

Malcolm wrote:

You haven't actually, you've made an assertion, that's all. Incidentally, I am personally opposed to allowing minors access to hormones and son on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:16 PM

Title: Re: Teachings from non-living human gurus (split from Guru Yoga/historical guru thread)

Content:

Montoya said:

If you want to use the "ripened" argument for Tilopa, fine, but the \*entire\* history of terma and Mahayana more broadly is full of examples of humans taking teachings from non-humans.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if you mean taking teachings from nāgas, nāgas take teachings from buddhas and bodhisattvas, not the other way around.

I am not sure where you get the idea that buddhas and bodhisattvas are not humans, since it is only human beings who can practice a path.

I think you are confusing "visionary" with "nonhuman." Ḍākas and ḍākinīs, for example, are human beings, as are buddhas and bodhisattvas.

Montoya said:

We can argue that the human/non-human interface is a metaphor, a upaya, or simply nirmanakya Buddhas in human form, but the record is clear here.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no human/non-human interface. Ḍākas and ḍākinīs, for example, are human beings, as are buddhas and bodhisattvas.

The point is simple: ordinary human beings, like you and I, cannot take teachings from anyone other than a *nirmāṇakāya*. In order to receive teachings from the *sambhogakāya*, one must be an eighth stage bodhisattva or higher.

Montoya said:

Personally, I find the teachings stand on their own merits, so its all a bit pedantic.

Malcolm wrote:

It isn't pedantry at all. Because people are ignorant of the paths and stages there is a great risk they will be deceived. If someone comes along, say some Tibetan lama, and claims "I have received teachings from the *sambhogakāya*" people need to be able to ascertain whether this person is really an eighth stage bodhisattva or not, otherwise they run the risk of being seriously deceived. The qualities of realization of an eighth stage bodhisattva can be ascertained with some ease if one has studied the *sūtrayāna* and *vajrayāna* stages of realization (*abhisamaya*).

In order to reveal treasures, the minimum requirement is that one must have attained the first bodhisattva stage. But revealing treasures, even mind treasures, is not receiving teachings directly from the *sambhogakāya*. The intermediary here is *Padmasambhava*, who is a *nirmāṇakāya*.

There is a class of teachings called "pure vision," and here one does not have to be first stage bodhisattva, but one must have some heat on path of application, that is some training in *samadhi*. And frankly, most people do not trust the pure vision teachings of anyone who is not a *mahāsiddha*, that is, someone who has not attained the path of seeing.

It is certainly true that that one can cultivate *samadhis* in order to see buddhas and receive teachings, and vague indications of these are framed in such *sūtras* as the *Pratyutpana Samadhi Sūtra*, and so on. But this will still not be a *sambhogakāya* buddhas one sees, but *nirmāṇakāyas*.

The reason for this is that ordinary people such as ourselves are incapable of seeing the *sambhogakāya* because we possess the obscuration of affliction, and until that is removed on the seventh *bhumi*, we are unable to perceive the *sambhogakāya*.

Montoya said:

Curious to hear your view on *Dudjom Lingpa*? His visions came as a child. Would you say he was ripened by human teachers in a former life? In the womb?

Malcolm wrote:

*Dudjom Lingpa* reports interesting dreams and visions as a child, there is no doubt. But he himself says these are all a result of his good karma and aspirations. He met his lama, *Lama Jamyang* in 1845, and clearly describes receiving empowerments from this lama, along with the claim that this person was his lama for many lifetimes. It is some years before he begins to reveal *termas*, after he does some retreats, especially

Mañjuśrī Simhanada.

As for his claim that he did not receive view and meditation from any human lama, no one receives the view and meditation from anyone. We receive transmissions, but the view and meditation we must discover for ourselves. So I do not find his claim to be as extraordinary as others do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Teachings from non-living human gurus (split from Guru Yoga/historical guru thread)

Content:

Montoya said:

More seriously, I think it's an interesting topic. A lot of Western Buddhists were attracted to Buddhism believing it is wholly compatible with modern, Western scientific thought and while that might be true in certain instances, I think we need to explore areas where it may raise uncomfortable questions (for some anyway). Personally, I fall into the camp of 'dharma and practice are useful in and of themselves' and don't mind poking into areas that may demand a measure of leaps of faith/credulity.

Malcolm wrote:

For me there is no discomfort. Most of what we consider to be "visionary" is a product of experiential vision of yogis. Below the path of seeing these are mostly uncomfortable because the nāḍīs, vāyus, and bindu in our body are stuck, frozen, and not pliable. For those who have attained the path of seeing and so on in previous lifetimes, they have a difference experience of yoga, and thus, their visionary experiences seem more incredible.

If you have ever wondered why advanced yogis die painless deaths, it is because they have unravelled the nāḍīs which the vāyus and bindus to move freely within their bodies. It basically amounts to plumbing. Our pipes are clogged, theirs are not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Archie2009 said:

A UK Labour politician called biological sex a social construct on national television.

Malcolm wrote:

Sex, from a Buddhist point of view, is a fact of karma and biology. It is not something one can change.

But Buddhism also recognizes that there are more than two sexes. There are at, minimum, three, and perhaps as many as five.

Archie2009 said:

Of course children that genuinely suffer from dysphoria should be helped to transition.

Malcolm wrote:

They should certainly receive support, counseling, etc. What they should not receive is hormone therapy, etc. until they are adults.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

KathyLauren said:

It happens to kids who actually ARE biologically transgender, and who are forced to wear the clothes and use the pronouns of their birth gender.

Malcolm wrote:

One only has one birth sex: male, female, or intersexed.

It often happens that intersexed children are misidentified at birth and labeled male or female. Later, when they begin to present intersex traits, it causes them and others a great deal of confusion. For example, an intersexed child who is identified as a girl, but begins to display clear male sexual development at puberty, and vice versa. Generally, by adulthood, one sex or another becomes predominant. But such people are still intersexed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 1st, 2021 at 11:45 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

What we know of COVID is already scary, we've seen what it does.

Malcolm wrote:

I know the head of nursing in a major Boston Hospital. I know a top surgeon in the best hospital in Mexico City. You have no idea what they see. The public is largely unaware of how damaging this virus can be to unvaccinated people. The damage of Covid can be severe, even for many so-called "asymptomatic people." We have no data yet on how damaging it can be for people who have contracted it after being properly vaccinated.

In three or four years, when we have more perspective and data, only then will the world at large have a true picture.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

KathyLauren said:

One also only has one gender identity: masculine, feminine, or non-binary. And it does not necessarily correspond to one's biological sex. When it doesn't correspond, the person is transgender.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it is relevant, and this is why the topic is confusing for people.

Also your assertion that people can only have one gender identity is false. A better way to put it is that people can only have one gender identity at a time.

The word gender is used a) a signifier for sex b) a signifier for identity.

When Chappelle declares "Gender is a fact," he means gender as a signifier for sex. So, he is not wrong.

The term "gender" is used promiscuously on both side of the issue, and often at cross purposes.

There is likely a biological basis for gender identity. Human physiology is complicated and it is not perfectly understood. There is an established biological basis for sex.

This is the reason, principally, where people used to refer to sex change operations, they now refer to such procedures as gender reassignment surgery and gender confirmation surgery.

For whatever reason, there are more transgender males (female --> male) than transgender females, with a ratio of about 2:1, but the transgender males generally do not provoke very much anxiety in people. What provokes anxiety in people is transgender females. They are the ones who experience the most hate violence around the public expression of their gender identity (this does not mean that transmen are not victims of violence).

This is why I suggested above that from a Buddhist point of view, there are definitely three sexes, and likely five, if we add transmen and transwomen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 4:00 AM

Title: Re: Teachings from non-living human gurus (split from Guru Yoga/historical guru thread)

Content:

Unknown said:

You are a vastly more accomplished scholar (and almost certainly practitioner) than I am, but I think we will need to accept that neither has convinced the other here. I don't ever recall understanding that when Vajradhara taught Tilopa it was in human form, but I'm open to hearing more about that. Similarly with dakinis, as you know, there are many classes of dakinis across the human/non-human spectrum, but generally 3-4 classes. I simply don't have the interest or time to drag this further, but I think without scratching the surface one could come up with dozens more examples of masters receiving (claiming to receive) teachings from non-humans. Virupa and Nairatmaya, etc. (yes, yes....pre-ripened).

Malcolm wrote:

When my book on the Path with Its Result comes out on May 22nd, 2022 from Shambhala, in the introduction I discuss in some detail the Sakya account of the origin of Vajrayāna teachings, including the origin of the Hevajra Tantra and its related tantras. My discussion of Nairatmyā, her identity, and her relationship with Virupa is to be found there as well.

Nairatmyā is clearly described as a *nirmāṇakāya*. Virupa first had a dream of her, then he met her the following day in person as a *nirmāṇakāya*. He received empowerments from this human woman and achieved the first *bhumi* that first night. This is clearly explained in the Path with Its Result (*lam 'bras*) literature. There are two other women, identified as Nairatmya, in the other two primary lineages of Hevajra who are also clearly described as human women, one of them is named *Vilāśyavajra*, the guru of *Anaṅgavajra*, who in turn is the guru of *Padmavajra*.

As far as the historical record of Tilopa is concerned, there is no room for doubt that his his gurus were Vijaya and Antarapa and that he received *Cakramsavara* and its intimate instructions from them. This does not rule out his having received visionary transmissions from Vajradhara, but this would only be possible if a) Tilopa was himself a *nirmāṇakāya* (the Kagyu position), which means he was born fully realized, a buddha, or b) he received those transmissions after he attained *mahāmudrā* *siddhi* (the more conventional account). I have already explained how this works by using the examples of Ghantapada and Naropa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 4:17 AM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

KathyLauren said:

It only becomes confusing if one refuses to recognize gender identity as different from

sex.

Malcolm wrote:

Most people do not make this distinction. That's the point. For most people gender = sex.

It's not up to them to figure it out on their own. It's up to you and others to educate them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 4:26 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Perhaps you and they will end up being right, but claiming secret knowledge based on anecdotal experiences -even anecdotal experiences of very qualified folks- is not the same as actual empirical data.

Malcolm wrote:

Here is an empirical fact for you.

My friend's cousin contracted covid. He lost his sense of smell and had a headache for an afternoon, next day fine. No symptoms after this.

Move forward a year, has major medical event, unrelated to covid, unrelated to his lungs, or anything (kidney problems), and when they look at the results of his tomography, the damage to his lungs was extensive, and the pathologist agreed that damage was indeed from covid.

There will be many more instances of such cases. The reason we are not hearing about them now, is that finding this damage requires sophisticated imaging, and that is something which HMOs are unwilling to pay for in the US, but in Mexico it is very cheap.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I'm confused as to what lung damage which shows up on imaging but has no symptoms would be, but other than that I don't find it too surprising I guess.

Malcolm wrote:

Small lesions all over the man's lungs, consistent with covid infection, like his lungs had been shot with birdshot.



Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 5:16 AM  
Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer  
Content:

KathyLauren said:  
Don't fight me on my efforts to educate people and then tell me that it is up to me to educate them.

Malcolm wrote:  
I am not. I am telling you that people do not make the distinction you want them to make.

We cannot have a discussion of gender identity in absence of a discussion of sex. If you try, people will fail to understand you.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 6:36 AM  
Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
We cannot have a discussion of gender identity in absence of a discussion of sex. If you try, people will fail to understand you.

KathyLauren said:  
If you talk about sex without talking about gender identity, you are contributing to the failure to understand.

Malcolm wrote:  
Fair point, but as you can see, I did not.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 6:40 AM  
Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations  
Content:  
Archie2009 said:  
Would this heal?

Malcolm wrote:  
Since this was a year out from his initial infection, one suspects the damage is permanent.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 6:49 PM

Title: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

From Heather Cox Richardson:

Today, Time magazine ran a story by Molly Ball about business leaders who are starting to stand up for democracy. The lower taxes and less regulation Republicans promise aren't much good without a stable democracy, some business leaders told Ball. "The market economy works because of the bedrock foundation of the rule of law, the peaceful succession of power and the reserve currency of the U.S. dollar, and all of these things were potentially at risk," former Thomson Reuters CEO Tom Glocer said. "CEOs are normally hesitant to get involved in political issues, but I would argue that this was a fundamental business issue."

Republicans disagree. Today, in a remarkable op-ed in The American Conservative, Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) called "corporate America... the instrument of anti-American ideologies." He accused Wall Street of "devoting hundreds of billions of dollars to advance corporate propaganda" that promotes Marxist tactics. Rubio wants to "require that the leadership of large companies be subject to strict scrutiny and legal liability when they abuse their corporate privilege by pushing wasteful, anti-American nonsense."

In a passage that sounds much like that of a political purge, he warned readers of "the current Marxist cultural revolution among our corporate elite," and said that "the ultimate way" to stop them "is to replace them with a new generation of business leaders who consider themselves Americans, not citizens of the world.... That is how we defeat this toxic cultural Marxism and rebuild an economy where America's largest companies were accountable for what matters to America: new factories built in America, good jobs for American families, and investments in American neighborhoods and communities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 7:00 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I'm confused as to what lung damage which shows up on imaging but has no symptoms would be, but other than that I don't find it too surprising I guess.

Malcolm wrote:

Small lesions all over the man's lungs, consistent with covid infection, like his lungs had been shot with birdshot.

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's clinically interesting, but clearly they weren't affecting his breathing or lung function in a noticeable way -I assume, so I'm confused as to what the significance of them is thought to be in the long term.

Malcolm wrote:

Damage is damage. We don't know the long term affects of this. For example, whether this kind of damage makes one more susceptible to pneumonia, etc.

Moreover, covid affects the pancreas, kidneys, etc., and some scientists speculate we are looking at a rash of early diabetes, chronic kidney disease, etc. As I said, to quote Rumsfeld, there are a lot of known unknowns with covid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 7:24 PM

Title: Re: At what point does one become a Bodhisattva in the Tibetan schools?

Content:

Pårl said:

Hello, I have a question.

At what point does one become a Bodhisattva according to Tibetan tradition? Is announcing oneself to be a Bodhisattva in and of itself a negation of that status?

Can a lay person become a Bodhisattva within their current human incarnation? Is it necessary to have been in an audience with Buddha to reach the end of the path?

I have heard myriad and wide-ranging views on this topic.

I am currently reading Shantideva's The Way of the Bodhisattva and I am seeking to put it into a practical context.

Any thoughts?

Malcolm wrote:

When one rouses bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 7:39 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Okay dropped.

So what caused the decline.

Malcolm wrote:

Loss of political support.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 8:40 PM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Queequeg said:

It would be fantastic if the Republican party actually alienated corporate leadership. Somehow, I'm not sure how far either side, Republican leadership and corporate leadership, actually believes in the rupture. Corporate leadership just wants the money to flow and I'm not convinced they're really all that worried about the health of the democracy. Actually, I don't think most Americans care all that much about democracy. Sad to write that on this election day here in the US.

We're at the stage that Bread and Circuses is all we want.

Malcolm wrote:

Here is link to full article.

<https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/november-1-2021>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Chappelle's The Closer

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

What if someone is a conservative Christian who by their religion believes in two genders, are they legally forced to use third pronouns even if it offends them? How do we value one set of beliefs over another one?

Malcolm wrote:

One's religious beliefs do not permit one to violate the civil rights of others.

Sonam Wangchug said:

The scientific research absolutely backs this, and it's all published.

Malcolm wrote:

Your claims that "scientific research backs this" is just as questionable as the science the young lgbtq activists are going on about. Anyway, you think Meru and the four continents is real based on the specious arguments of some Tibetans, so your claims of adherence to science are a little suspect.

Sonam Wangchug said:

My religion tells me my true nature is Vajrakilaya, but I'm not going to go around and demand people see me as a deity. & that it offends me if they do not.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, it would be a violation of your samaya vows to even tell people without samaya what deity you practice.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Open-mindedness must go both ways to allow space that some people simply won't agree with you. As long as people are not intentionally trying to disrespect or cause suffering to another, and yet I hear in conversations that if someone doesn't agree with one about one's view on gender and sex, this person cannot even talk or be friends with another person, I find this extreme.

Malcolm wrote:

Different people have different tolerances for different things. I find it difficult to be friends with people who support Donald Trump and the present iteration of the GOP.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Even though I am a biological male, still then as a Vajrayana practitioner, I believe we all have female and male channels. However, what I feel is that, when gender is discussed as being illusory or relative in Buddhism such as famously in the Vimalakirti sutra, it's with the emphasis of having less distinctions.

Malcolm wrote:

Are you talking about gender or sex here?

Sonam Wangchug said:

There are some whose gender expression is that they can be a Man on Monday, and a woman on Tuesday depending how they feel, how exactly can this work out with the law?

Malcolm wrote:

I know a transmanwoman fairy shaman druid Buddhist, a lovely person, who has exactly this going on for them. The best way to deal with this is to desex bathrooms and dorm rooms, and learn to behave like adults.

Sonam Wangchug said:

What about an increasing number of youth identifying as being furries...

Malcolm wrote:

There are all kinds of fetishes out there, including fetishes around so-called preserving gender "norms".

Sonam Wangchug said:

I also like to ask, (as a Buddhist) that if it can be acknowledged that someone may have been another gender in a previous life, and so karmically have that be an active force, since we believe anyone can have been born another race in their previous life, then why can they not identify as trans-racial? We don't know what unresolved karma they have playing out from another lifetime.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, Chapelle does bring this up. "Race" is a cultural and regional marker, not biological marker.

And here is the difference—unlike sex, of which there are basically three, there is only one human race. We are all the same species, the same genus. There are differences in skin tone, hair texture, and eye color, and these are rather recent developments in human evolution, within the past 40,000 years.

If you are making the point that a white person might have a marked preference for jazz, blues, etc., and this might be a result of a karmic trace from a previous life time as a black person, maybe, but unlikely, given the rarity of human birth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 11:23 PM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Queequeg said:

Yankee ideals that have been the spine of the republic are unpopular with right and left. The last gasps of democracy and the rule of law will be local in the areas with the wealth and education to practice it.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, it goes without saying, but I am a Yankee. Though I was born in Ithaca NY, I was raised in Massachusetts, and have lived 90% of my life here, with a couple of years in Vermont.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 2nd, 2021 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

This is exactly why it's important to take an evidence based approach to this stuff.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and as I pointed out, the evidence is not in yet. But from what evidence we have, it is looking worse and worse.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 4:04 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Heimdall said:

You don't get to speak out of both sides of your mouth. Either our corporate institutions are oppressive or they aren't.

Malcolm wrote:

Its not that simple.

Heimdall said:

By the way, posting this is incredibly anti-Buddhist and the Buddha would be ashamed of you posting this.

Malcolm wrote:

Piss off, pee wee.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 9:21 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Heimdall said:

[Bunch of self-involved, immature bullshit.]

Malcolm wrote:

Grow up, kid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 9:27 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

From Heather Cox Richardson:

Today, Time magazine ran a story by Molly Ball about business leaders who are starting to stand up for democracy. The lower taxes and less regulation Republicans promise aren't much good without a stable democracy, some business leaders told Ball. "The market economy works because of the bedrock foundation of the rule of law, the peaceful succession of power and the reserve currency of the U.S. dollar, and all of these things were potentially at risk," former Thomson Reuters CEO Tom Glozier said. "CEOs are normally hesitant to get involved in political issues, but I would argue that this was a fundamental business issue."

Republicans disagree. Today, in a remarkable op-ed in The American Conservative, Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) called "corporate America... the instrument of anti-

American ideologies.” He accused Wall Street of “devoting hundreds of billions of dollars to advance corporate propaganda” that promotes Marxist tactics. Rubio wants to “require that the leadership of large companies be subject to strict scrutiny and legal liability when they abuse their corporate privilege by pushing wasteful, anti-American nonsense.”

In a passage that sounds much like that of a political purge, he warned readers of “the current Marxist cultural revolution among our corporate elite,” and said that “the ultimate way” to stop them “is to replace them with a new generation of business leaders who consider themselves Americans, not citizens of the world.... That is how we defeat this toxic cultural Marxism and rebuild an economy where America’s largest companies were accountable for what matters to America: new factories built in America, good jobs for American families, and investments in American neighborhoods and communities.

zerwe said:

Have to say that's bizzaro stuff there, but does it top the last 4 years? Almost nothing is shocking at this point. Well, who p\*ssed in Rubio's Cornflakes?

Shaun

Malcolm wrote:

It is a result of the past four years and the fact that the GOP has finally abandoned any pretense of supporting democracy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 9:31 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Heimdall said:

"It's the mark of an educated mind to entertain a thought without accepting it" - Aristotle probably

What makes fascism bad?

KeithA said:

My word. Can't believe that is actually a question.

Malcolm wrote:

Kids these days don't really remember fascism, and they don't actually know anyone who fought fascists, like both my grandfathers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:



Malcolm wrote:

It is a result of the past four years and the fact that the GOP has finally abandoned any pretense of supporting democracy.

Norwegian said:

I fear that the past four years has given the GOP a foundation to build on, where it will only get worse. I saw this GOP-in-action example recently:

<https://www.texastribune.org/2021/11/01/greg-abbott-texas-schools-books/> Imagine that books about LGBTQ issues, anti-racism, etc. is deemed so outrageous that it must be banned from libraries. It's so absurd, and so surreal, to see the things the GOP does, slowly unfold.

Malcolm wrote:

Fascism has been growing slowly in America for decades, like a cancer. Henry Wallace, whom I have frequently quoted on this board, had it right, Fascism will come decked out in the flag, etc.

We may finally be at the point where the far right needs to be put down with force.

The point that seemingly eludes our friend, is that recognition of the unfortunate origins of the US, etc., is not a sufficient reason to throw everything into chaos because of some ideological commitment. One cannot practice Dharma very well in the middle of a civil war or economic uncertainty. If businesses abandon the US because our political climate becomes hostile to business, it'll be tough times. Democracy and well-oiled markets go together because trust is high. When that trust is eroded, markets suffer and poverty ensues.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 10:15 AM

Title: Re: The GOP has lost it

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Henry Wallace, whom I have frequently quoted on this board, had it right, Fascism will come decked out in the flag, etc.

Sādhaka said:

As if leftists don't love flags....

Malcolm wrote:

Don't be an idiot. But then, you have no love for democracy either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 7:55 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Small lesions all over the man's lungs, consistent with covid infection, like his lungs had been shot with birdshot.

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's clinically interesting, but clearly they weren't affecting his breathing or lung function in a noticeable way -I assume, so I'm confused as to what the significance of them is thought to be in the long term.

PeterC said:

I'll try to find the research but there's been a number of imaging studies of cases one year post recovery finding persistent damage even for asymptomatic cases. I don't think any did imaging of the brain. I can understand why they wouldn't, nobody really likes to expose their brains to extra doses of radiation unless clinically necessary.

Purely anecdotally - I'm pretty convinced that symptomatic cases can lead to persistent neurological deficits. I've now seen it in enough people.

Malcolm wrote:

I am personally convinced that covid infection is contributing to rage disorders as a result of neurological damage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 3rd, 2021 at 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Illuminating Quotes by Malcolm Namdrol-la

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

The point is simple: ordinary human beings, like you and I, cannot take teachings from anyone other than a nirmāṇakāya. In order to receive teachings from the sambhogakāya, one must be an eighth stage bodhisattva or higher.

Really? Wow. I thought it was pretty common.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is functionally impossible for an ordinary person, or even a sixth stage bodhisattva to see the sambhogakāya. This is due to their not having eliminated the afflictive obscuration. This is really an elementary principle that should surprise no one.

PadmaVonSamba said:

What higher power is there than the mind?

Is not the essence of mind dharmakaya?

How is mind's true nature separate from sambhogakaya?

Malcolm wrote:

You are confusing the three kāyas of the basis with the three kāyas of the result. In essence, because the mind's nature is inseparable clarity and emptiness, emptiness is the basis for the realization of the dharmakāya, clarity is the basis for realizing the nirmanakāya, and inseparability is the basis for realizing the sambhogakāya. But this does not mean that the nature of your mind innately possesses the 32 major marks and the eighty minor marks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Illuminating Quotes by Malcolm Namdrol-la

Content:

Arnoud said:

So if someone “sees” a Buddha during meditation, that’s always deluded? Not blessings with delusion?

Malcolm wrote:

It could be the ripening of traces of positive karma of someone is below the path of seeing, it could be a delusion of māra (especially if it talks to you and tells you what a good pratitioner you are, etc.), it could be a sign of heat on the path of application, but in all cases it is just your own mind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

There has been a request to open this thread since some aspects were not addressed. I would like to remind everyone to play nice and while sperm jokes can be fun, please try to avoid them.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh FFS.

Please kill it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 4:39 AM

Title: Re: Illuminating Quotes by Malcolm Namdrol-la

Content:

Tata1 said:

What about thogal visions?

Malcolm wrote:

Simulacrum, not real sambhogakāya, again just the ripening of traces in your own mind.  
And you should ask about such things on line.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 4:43 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

Dems have to stop looking like they want open borders. This pisses everyone off - including a lot of naturalized Americans who resent that they did things by the book only to watch others not follow the rules.

Malcolm wrote:

The economic benefits of open borders would make everyone north and south rich. But people are dumb.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Rick said:

Could you say that if you take X to be \*real\* you are in fact taking it to be inherently existent?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. It is the error of taking things to exist just as they are.

A table is a table (pre-analysis).

A table is not a table (analysis).

A table is a table (post-analysis).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 5:58 AM

Title: Re: A Texas lawmaker is targeting 850 books that he says could make students feel uneasy

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

All this is like something out of the 50s, ridiculous.

Archie2009 said:

So is segregation. "Progressive" Democrats are also working to bring that back. Americans are so full of shit. lmao.

Genjo Conan said:

what are you even on about

Malcolm wrote:  
CRT.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

Dems have to stop looking like they want open borders. This pisses everyone off - including a lot of naturalized Americans who resent that they did things by the book only to watch others not follow the rules.

Malcolm wrote:

The economic benefits of open borders would make everyone north and south rich. But people are dumb.

Queequeg said:

So, you're saying Dems should keep up with the formula they've proven time and again loses elections? Lecture the electorate, tell them to eat their vegetables?

Liberalizing immigration is a loser.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm, you miss the point. Do you have any idea how much impressive as well as cheap real estate there is south of the border? I am talking about creating a NAU, a North American Union.

Everyone wins.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 9:02 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

. But an open border?

Malcolm wrote:

I am suggesting no border. I am suggesting that we should create a NAU, from Canada to Panama.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 4:52 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

I see...I'm cool with that.

PeterC said:

Not sure any of the countries in that region other than the US like the idea of being de facto run by the US, which is how they would see this

KristenM said:

Yeah, that was my initial point. It's a nice idea and all, but really wouldn't be popular with a bunch of folks down south and up north imo.

Malcolm wrote:

It certainly isn't popular with those who profit through the present state of affairs, north and south of the border.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 4:56 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Nadereme said:

I hope you're aware that scientists are often some of the most deluded beings.

PeterC said:

Mods, if this is the sort of comment we get, please close this thread for good

Nadereme said:

I find it interesting how you're not necessarily objecting, but rather perplexed someone would say such a thing. Many beings have been indoctrinated by scientific materialism, and people take scientists for Buddhas. That will have a lot of ripening.

Malcolm wrote:

We are not perplexed about someone saying such a thing, just bored with hearing such trivial sentiments.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 7:38 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

PeterC said:

I don't think the objection to 'progressives' is their ideas per se, it's that they never deliver. So all you get is the rhetoric but not the results.

Queequeg said:

Part of the reason they never deliver is because they can't rally critical momentum. It doesn't help when they push ideas that to most people are too radical and use that as the litmus test for whether they can collaborate.

In these conversations I'm reminded of the time Verizon workers who were going on strike showed up at Zucotti Park while Occupy was going on. Those hardhats took a look at the loafing hippies and said, "f-ck this. A drum circle isn't going to get me better benefits." And that was it for organized labor's involvement in Occupy. Activists need to get serious and read the room. If they want shit done, efforts need to be recalibrated.

Malcolm wrote:

You know, in this case it's not that. It's a narcissist who takes her wardrobe from scoopydo and a coal baron posing as a democrat. The house already has all this passed. It's two assholes on our side of the aisle blocking things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 8:10 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

Part of the reason they never deliver is because they can't rally critical momentum. It doesn't help when they push ideas that to most people are too radical and use that as the litmus test for whether they can collaborate.

In these conversations I'm reminded of the time Verizon workers who were going on strike showed up at Zucotti Park while Occupy was going on. Those hardhats took a look at the loafing hippies and said, "f-ck this. A drum circle isn't going to get me better benefits." And that was it for organized labor's involvement in Occupy. Activists need to get serious and read the room. If they want shit done, efforts need to be recalibrated.

Malcolm wrote:

You know, in this case it's not that. It's a narcissist who takes her wardrobe from scoopydo and a coal baron posing as a democrat. The house already has all this passed. It's two assholes on our side of the aisle blocking things.

Queequeg said:

If W.Va. wasn't so schizo on one hand having a recent memory of the power of labor

while getting sucked up into Trumpism, Manchin would have flipped already. Sinema is just a whacko.

But it comes back to Democratic party alienating working classes. If Dems had working class loyalty, this would have been passed. That's a different world that never existed. Instead here we are after the Clintons and Third Way Dems sold out thinking demographics would save the party.

Malcolm wrote:

I think it's different. Manchin is going to primary Biden from the right.

Sinema wants to be an ambassador to France.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

I'd trade a Democratic party of an uncouth economic populism...

Malcolm wrote:

How does that make you different than Bannon and Rubio?

Economic populism is just Nationalism.

I thought we learned that doesn't work in the 1930's, and the 1880's, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I think it's different. Manchin is going to primary Biden from the right.

PeterC said:

He's just about enough of an asshole to do that.

But I really don't see what the DNC's strategy is here. Biden is not up for a second term, never was. Harris cannot win. So...what's the plan?

Malcolm wrote:

Not idea, and they seem not to have one either.

PeterC said:

Why? Or rather - since the US has torched its relationship with France, that job is no



longer anything but a pleasant sinecure, so why not let her...

Malcolm wrote:

She likes wine and she wont have to do anything but wear clothes and shop.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

lhaksam.dorje said:

I think inherent existence is a subtle trickster of a thing

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is taking things to exist just as they appear to us. That's the whole point, things do not exist as they appear.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

1880s - Its too bad the Grangers couldn't put their racism aside and form a coalition with urban immigrants who were building the labor movement. Free Silver!

1930s - I quite like the New Deal.

Malcolm wrote:

I thought so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Question about inherent existence

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is taking things to exist just as they appear to us. That's the whole point, things do not exist as they appear.

Rick said:

If a person with the right view looked at a table, how would what they see/experience/understand differ from a person with the wrong view?

Malcolm wrote:

Dependently designated and empty rather than integral and real.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 11:56 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

The Democrats are letting the perfect get in the way of the good (kinda hate that phrase, but it fits).

Malcolm wrote:

F\*\*k Joe Manchin, to the melody of "Let's Go Brandon."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 4th, 2021 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

What, to you, is the meaningful key distinction between dharmatā and nirguṇabrahman?

Malcolm wrote:

The former is emptiness, the latter is an ultimate consciousness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 12:24 AM

Title: This tribe helped the Pilgrims survive

Content:

Unknown said:

They still regret it 400 years later.

Long marginalized and misrepresented in U.S. history, the Wampanoags are bracing for the 400th anniversary of the first Pilgrim Thanksgiving in 1621

.....

By the fall, the Pilgrims — thanks in large part to the Wampanoags teaching them how to plant beans and squash in a mound with maize around it and use fish remains as fertilizer — had their first harvest of crops. To celebrate its first success as a colony, the Pilgrims had a “harvest feast” that became the basis for what’s now called Thanksgiving.

The Wampanoags weren’t invited.

Ousamequin and his men showed up only after the English in their revelry shot off some of their muskets. At the sound of gunfire, the Wampanoags came running, fearing they were headed to war.

“One hundred warriors show up armed to the teeth after they heard muskets fired,” said Paula Peters.

Told it was a harvest celebration, the Wampanoags joined, bringing five deer to share, she said. There was fowl, fish, eel, shellfish and possibly cranberries from the area’s natural bogs.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/history/2021/11/04/thanksgiving-anniversary-wampanoag-indians-pilgrims>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don’t remember who it was, but I think someone connected policy wise to FDR WRT to the New Deal said something like ‘give them social reforms or they will give you social revolution’. Can you imagine the Democratic Party of today understanding this point? They don’t live in reality.

Malcolm wrote:

It was in England, and it was Lord Hailsham in 1943.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Quintin\\_Hogg,\\_Baron\\_Hailsham\\_of\\_St\\_Marylebone](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Quintin_Hogg,_Baron_Hailsham_of_St_Marylebone)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Nadereme said:

Relative truths don’t necessarily apply to everyone or everything.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course they do.

Nadereme said:

Also there are arguments in favor of geocentricity and flat Earth...

Malcolm wrote:

No good ones.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 4:42 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

The Democrats are letting the perfect get in the way of the good (kinda hate that phrase, but it fits).

Malcolm wrote:

F\*\*k Joe Manchin, to the melody of "Let's Go Brandon."

KristenM said:

The constituents and area he represents leans Republican so likely even if he was out, there will be a Republican in his place. He's just representing his constituents. I don't agree with him, just saying.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. nevertheless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 6:59 PM

Title: Re: Why Buddhism's Decline in India?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Okay dropped.

So what caused the decline.

Malcolm wrote:

Loss of political support.

Aemilius said:

The real reasons are not available for discussion. This means that there were hidden, secret and esoteric practices going on already at the time of Shakyamuni, what we find in the sutra/suttas describes only the aspects that were/are available for public discourse. Something else takes place simultaneously in the dark, so to speak. This can be called spiritual warfare, and it had new developments in the centuries after the beginning of the common era. The influence of Buddha Shakyamuni and his teaching had spread through the continents of this planet, and the secret & invisible spiritual war or battle for supremacy had never been confined to India. Big and small cultures on all continents have always been involved. May all beings living in the ten directions and three times be happy and have the causes of happiness!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 7:03 PM

Title: Re: Sojong vows and tsog

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Hi,

since tomorrow is a newmoon I'd like to ask a question about sojong vows and tsog offerings. Is it permissible to take full one day sojong vows and still participate in tsog offering (by that I mean taste the food and drink without rejecting)?

If yes, why and also should then one just taste a bit of the food and maybe just touch lips symbolically with the alcohol?

Malcolm wrote:

Tantric vows supercede prātimokṣa vows, so, not only is it ok, it's required.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 7:42 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

I think the basic question is, what's the difference between the theistic belief in an eternal god, and the Buddhist concept of Infinite Buddhas with their infinite pure realms and all that stuff.

tobes said:

I would add to this: who among any of us is beyond conceptual beliefs to the degree that we 'see' any of this kind of stuff? The basic problem of emptiness also applies to many theistic theologies - talking about it, conceiving it, believing it etc is not "it" - whatever that "it" is supposed to be or not be.

Malcolm wrote:

Dharma is not a via negativa. Dependent origination = emptiness.

Inexpressibility simply means that we cannot point to anything and declare "this is how this appearance is." It means there is nothing behind the relative to describe, and it means that descriptions of appearances fail to capture the reality of those appearances. But there is certainly nothing behind nor beyond them, just as there is nothing behind a mirage, illusion, etc., but causes and conditions that lack inherent existence themselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 7:51 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Soma999 said:

There is a Mystery that exists, both within yourself and outside, both manifested and not manifested which is pure love. How do we know ? Many have touched this source, and miracles could manifest from it. At our level, we feel guided and empowered. Not by a « being », but by the highest manifestation of consciousness which vibrates on the frequency of love

Malcolm wrote:

There is no source, no pure love, or anything like it. The highest manifestation of consciousness is a person who has realized how things are 100%, in other words, a buddha.

Now, to the extent that Buddhas are motivated by love, the wish that sentient beings be happy, we can say they are embodiments of love. But there is nothing at all mysterious about that, just as there is nothing mysterious about a mother's love for an only child.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Covid Has Killed 5 Million People, But Only Hundreds Have Been Autopsied

To get a clearer picture of the virus's aftermath, pathologists are pushing to resurrect a dying practice.

Read in Bloomberg Businessweek: <https://apple.news/AbB7HWVhSQUaA3IRTNuxl6Q>

To get a clearer picture of the virus's aftermath, pathologists are pushing to resurrect a dying practice.

By Jason Gale

In an air-locked chamber in the world's largest research hospital, Daniel Chertow and a half-dozen doctors and scientists clad in astronaut-inspired protective gear are carrying out a microscopic search inside a 26-year-old man.

The patient went to the hospital with chest pain in spring 2020. He didn't have typical Covid-19 symptoms, but Chertow wants to study him as part of a broader mission to understand where in the body the coronavirus goes and what it does in each of those places. If you're a Covid case in Chertow's emerging pathogens lab, you're not there for treatment; you're the subject of an autopsy.

The man died at the hospital and tested negative for SARS-CoV-2, so he doesn't fit the

definition of a Covid-related fatality. He succumbed to viral myocarditis, or inflammation of the heart muscle. Chertow's sleuthing points to the coronavirus as the culprit and offers clues about a rare inflammatory condition that occurs mostly in children after a mild case of Covid.

"They show up later with sometimes life-threatening inflammation in different organs," Chertow says over Zoom from his office at the National Institutes of Health's Clinical Center in Bethesda, Md. "In a way, he fits into that category, so what's driving that?"

An autopsy provides a snapshot of what's occurred at the moment a patient has died, enabling pathologists to infer what happened up to that point. By comparing a large number of autopsies on Covid patients at different time courses, scientists can begin to assemble something akin to a record of the virus's journey through the body and the disease that arose in its wake.

Autopsies were a cornerstone of medical discoveries for more than two millennia, but sophisticated diagnostic tools and health-system budget cuts have made them a dying practice. Among the first 4 million fatal Covid cases worldwide, only several hundred autopsy findings were reported in international medical journals.

Several scientists are pushing to raise those numbers. "It's critically important that thousands of autopsies are done, so we can put this picture together," says Jeffery Taubenberger, a pathologist who heads the viral pathogenesis and evolution section of the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases in Bethesda. "What we're trying to figure out here is, what goes wrong under the worst circumstances where people die—to try to understand how the virus causes disease in less severe cases. And then: What are the therapeutic implications of that?"

The National Institutes of Health is spending \$1.15 billion over four years to learn about the aftereffects of Covid-19, including a push to conduct more autopsies. Answers are urgently needed. At least 1 in 10 survivors of the disease experience what the World Health Organization calls "post Covid-19 condition"—a constellation of symptoms that can debilitate sufferers for months.

"The post-Covid stuff is very, very real," says Chertow, a 47-year-old critical care physician. "If you're going to begin to conceive of ways to prevent or treat those manifestations, you need to understand what's driving it."

Authorities were concerned in the panic-stricken early months of the pandemic that dissecting coronavirus-infected patients could spread the infection, resulting in at least half of the autopsy units in the U.S. being shut down, according to L. Maximilian Buja, a professor of pathology and laboratory medicine at the University of Texas's McGovern Medical School in Houston.

Buja, who finished his pathology training in 1972, co-led a call to action for detailed autopsies on Covid victims in April 2020 and kept his own academic center's autopsy suites open. That enabled him to report findings from one of the earliest autopsy case series that showed the propensity for the coronavirus to cause tiny clots to form in

patients' blood.

"I take some credit, or partial credit, for getting across the idea that clinically, we need to institute early anticoagulation therapy," he says. "We have glimmers of knowledge that have contributed to improved treatment for the patients, but there's a lot more we have to learn. The key to this is to continue to do the autopsy investigations."

Hamburg forensic pathologist Klaus Puschel defied Germany's official recommendation to avoid autopsies, permitting 80 comprehensive post-mortem exams on fatal cases in March and April 2020. The findings showed SARS-CoV-2 can spread beyond the respiratory tract to affect the heart, kidney, liver, and brain.

A study Puschel co-authored that was published in October based on 17 autopsies showed the infection was associated with an increased number of defective capillaries in the brain that may explain the cognitive impairment, memory deficits, and fatigue experienced by at least a subset of long Covid patients. The authors also found that an experimental drug known as a RIPK1 inhibitor could potentially avert the damage if given to Covid patients during the acute phase of the illness.

Researchers in Norway showed in July that individuals who tested positive for the coronavirus eight months earlier were almost five times more likely than uninfected people to report memory problems. The NIH's Chertow says he's concerned about what such health effects may lead to in the future.

"Is there going to be some subclinical effects on your brain that are going to cause neurocognitive issues later in life that perhaps are not immediately noticeable or detectable?" he says. "If you're going to begin to conceive of ways to prevent or treat those manifestations—either in the next group that might be exposed or among the group that are suffering—you need to understand what the drivers are."

Chertow, who also trained as a disease detective with the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention's epidemic intelligence service, says he was inspired to pursue autopsy research from studying Ebola and treating patients with the deadly disease in Liberia in 2014. "It started with this idea that first [we've] got to go find where this virus is going—what it's doing in those places—and then we've got to try to link it back to what we're seeing clinically."

Chertow helped identify the role of the salivary glands in SARS-CoV-2 transmission. He sees more valuable clues about the virus's distribution across the body among the more than 10,000 biospecimens his team has collected from 44 fatal cases since April 2020. The post-mortem exams and dissections take three hours in a secure facility that's required for work involving microbes that can cause serious and potentially lethal disease. Bioengineers on the NIH campus custom-built an enclosure that fits over the head and shoulders of the deceased to contain aerosols when the top of the skull is removed.

The seven or so doctors, scientists, and technicians working inside the autopsy suite wear multiple layers of personal protective equipment, says David Kleiner, chief of the post-mortem section of the National Cancer Institute, who worked with Chertow on the research. Usually a plastic apron is worn over a surgical gown, over an impermeable



coverall, over surgical scrubs. Sometimes arm-sleeve protectors are worn. Investigators also don three pairs of gloves and two pairs of shoe coverings. And instead of N95 face masks, they breathe through controlled air-purifying respirators, which provide HEPA-filtered air under a hood that fits over their head and shoulders.

It's cumbersome, but that's not the only aspect of these Covid autopsies that makes the work painstaking. "We're sampling way above and beyond what is done in any sort of typical autopsy," Chertow says. Samples are taken from almost 100 different regions of the body and brain.

And for each one of those areas, adjacent pieces of tissue are also collected and preserved in different ways that are amenable to different methods of analysis, including whether the virus is capable of replicating in the sites from which it's collected. "We've done, simply put, a much more extensive sampling than others have," he says.

That partly reflects the diminishing capability to perform autopsies outside of academic and medical examiner settings.

"Autopsies are expensive procedures," says Linda Isles, head of forensic pathology services at the Victorian Institute of Forensic Medicine in Melbourne. "In reality, not many people want to spend money on dead people." Private autopsy fees vary widely, but typically cost \$2,000 to \$4,000 in Maryland.

Doctors are ordering fewer autopsies, relying instead on lower-cost X-rays, MRI scans, and other tests to ascribe the cause of a patient's death. This means pathologists have less experience performing post-mortem exams. In addition, autopsy facilities are expensive to maintain at a safe standard, Isles says.

"So it's this spiral of decreased experience—and therefore decreasing confidence—and then underutilization of the facilities leading to some of the facilities essentially being mothballed," she says. "And then when you want to reinstitute them, they're no longer really safe for modern practice."

Isles, who finished medical school at the University of Tasmania more than 20 years ago, performed 200 to 300 autopsies during her pathology training. "That might not seem like very many," she says, "but if you compare that to anatomical pathology trainees now, then that is a very large amount."

In 1918, doctors performed thousands of autopsies on victims of the Spanish flu and shared their findings widely in illustrated reports, says Taubenberger at the National Institute for Allergy and Infectious Diseases. "It's terrible that here we are with our ability to do advanced molecular studies and advanced imaging studies, and yet so few autopsy studies are being done," he says. "That's really the tragedy."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 8:20 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:  
"God" is an abstract term. It's like "art".

Malcolm wrote:  
Unlike art, however, god never appears.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 11:05 PM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:  
iskaral said:  
God is a master signifier. Kinda like "capitalism"

Malcolm wrote:  
Unlike Capitalism, God never appears in the world.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 11:10 PM  
Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates  
Content:  
Astus said:  
thus nirguna would mean sunya and would be quite preferable to us Buddhists.

Malcolm wrote:  
And thus, Śantarakṣita mocks Advaitans who assert an ajativāda without also accepting the teaching of the Tathāgata, and likewise, the reason that Śaṅkarācārya is mocked by later Vedantins for being a crypto-buddhist.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 11:28 PM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:

Harimoo said:  
For the audience, it was a game over for the buddhist.

Malcolm wrote:  
What do you expect at an interfaith conference? These things just are not serious at all, and demographically speaking, favor eternalists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 5th, 2021 at 11:35 PM

Title: Re: Children Covid Vaccinations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Good article on overall COVID policy, and some stuff to consider wrt to vaccinating different populations, namely tagging while vaccinating kids has it's own rationale, it won't compensate for unvaccinated adults.

This is especially true if the goal is fewer hospitalizations to free up the healthcare system, because a huge chunk of the hospitalizations are elderly folks.

Not an argument against vaccinating them mind you, but as the article points out hospitalization rates are directly correlated with the number of elderly vaccinated in a community.

At any rate, a short and decent article on the fact that the US needs Covid policies with an actual purpose, rather than the random shitshow we have.

[https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2021/11/what-americas-covid-goal-now/620572/?utm\\_source=pocket-newtab](https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2021/11/what-americas-covid-goal-now/620572/?utm_source=pocket-newtab)

Malcolm wrote:

This is the real point of the article I posted, with respect to this thread:

Chertow's sleuthing points to the coronavirus as the culprit and offers clues about a rare inflammatory condition that occurs mostly in children after a mild case of Covid.

"They show up later with sometimes life-threatening inflammation in different organs," Chertow says over Zoom from his office at the National Institutes of Health's Clinical Center in Bethesda, Md. "In a way, he fits into that category, so what's driving that?"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 5:14 AM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And thus, Śantarakṣita mocks Advaitans who assert an ajativāda without also accepting the teaching of the Tathāgata, and likewise, the reason that Śankarācārya is mocked by later Vedantins for being a crypto-buddhist.

Astus said:

I think Shankara was aware of some Buddhist teachings, and has differentiated his view from them intentionally.

Malcolm wrote:

So what?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 6:20 AM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

Montoya said:

Some form of this question has been nagging at me for a decade plus now. Are we reaching a point where the religious institution of Tibetan Buddhism is nearing a breaking point?

Malcolm wrote:

Not in Tibet and India.

Montoya said:

To be clear, I've spent more than half my life as a practicing Buddhist in the Nyingma/Kagyu lineages and (for me) the \*lived\* spirituality and the teachings themselves are as relevant as ever. That said, the credibility of the \*institution\* itself seems to be degrading by the year.

Malcolm wrote:

Among westerners, but we are a tiny percentage of the total.

Montoya said:

Guru scandals have intensified to the point where even the highest lineage heads are clouded with allegations of impropriety. Rinpoches considered impeccable two decades ago have seen their reputations entirely destroyed. Even gurus who have not been personally implicated in wrong doing are often only a few degrees of separation from wrong doers or (even worse) complicit in the Tibetan omerta that prevents them from calling out the bad apples. In addition, stories of mass sexual abuse in monasteries have gone from rumor to accepted consensus. Any number of gurus now have websites where one can go and purchase wealth blessings and other such nonsense. Given the centrality of the guru in Vajrayana, it feels increasingly difficult to overlook the fact that the core is rotting from the middle.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh well.

Montoya said:

Centers which used to be full of practitioners have seen membership dwindle and are often full of 60+ yo diehards. The young people who do come often see their interest peter out or run when they start to uncover the seedier side of things of a tradition that is often portrayed in the media as squeaky clean. Even a simple Google trends search of "Tibetan Buddhism" shows that interest has been waning for almost two decades.

Malcolm wrote:  
Vajrayāna is not for everyone.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 6:23 AM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:

Sherab said:  
The ultimate is timeless.

Malcolm wrote:  
There is no ultimate separate from things. Things exist in time. So, this is a meaningless statement. And it renders the rest of your statement moot.

Your "ultimate" can't produce anything, otherwise, it would be compounded, and therefore, in time.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 8:39 AM  
Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism  
Content:

Montoya said:  
Thanks Malcolm. Not saying you are wrong, but my experience in Tibet/India did not echo this. Lhasa was a tourist trap. Chinese monks infiltrated everywhere.

Malcolm wrote:  
I definitely wasn't talking about the TAR.

Montoya said:  
As for India, the abuse and general laziness of monks was openly joked about.

Malcolm wrote:  
The institutions depend on lay support. Being a monk is a job, and not a particularly good one.

Montoya said:  
Perhaps you are referring to other lineages (I'm less familiar with Gelug/Sakya) or non-monastics, though I'm not familiar with many communities of serious lay practitioners in either Tibet or India.

Malcolm wrote:

Tibetan Buddhism in Tibet and India continues to have a client population, as long as they do, the institutions will do fine.

But I don't think you are really asking about institutions. You are asking about the dharma. Well, Sakya Pandita observed in the 13th century that all that remained was a reflection of the dharma. I am sure that reflection is less distinct now than ever.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 8:42 AM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So what?

Astus said:

So he advocated a view that was not in harmony with the Dharma, and was quite open about it too.

Malcolm wrote:

It was sufficiently similar that he was chided by Buddhists for not following the Buddha, and by Vedantins for being a crypto-Buddhist, despite his prophylactic protestations, which were in vain.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 8:46 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Sherab said:

The ultimate is timeless.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no ultimate separate from things. Things exist in time. So, this is a meaningless statement. And it renders the rest of your statement moot.

Your "ultimate" can't produce anything, otherwise, it would be compounded, and therefore, in time.

Heimdall said:

What about Buddha's dharmakaya body? Isn't that distinct from Buddha's human body?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are inseparable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 9:07 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Heimdall said:

What about Buddha's dharmakaya body? Isn't that distinct from Buddha's human body?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are inseparable.

PadmaVonSamba said:

In the context of this discussion, that's not much different than saying God, Jesus, and the Holy Spirit are likewise three-in-one.

Got any better cards to play, Malcolm?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are not three different entities. The dharmakaya is just a Buddha's realization of suchness, which results in their attainment of qualities such as the eighteen unshared dharmas, that is, the ten powers, the four fearlessnesses, and so on. The sambhogakaya is just the major and minor marks of the mahapurusha, and the nirmanakaya is just a Buddha's ability to emanate in any suitable form to tame beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 9:38 AM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

Montoya said:

. No one wants to be the new guy to the forum who says "oMG wHy IS tIBetAn bUdDhIsM SO cOrRuPt?!?"

Malcolm wrote:

It's the Kali Yuga. The corruption of dharma is normal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 9:45 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

In the context of this discussion, that's not much different than saying God, Jesus, and the Holy Spirit are likewise three-in-one.

Got any better cards to play, Malcolm?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are not three different entities. The dharmakaya is just a Buddha's realization of suchness, which results in their attainment of qualities such as the eighteen unshared dharmas such as the ten powers, the four fearlessnesses, and so on. The sambhogakaya is just the major and minor marks of the mahapurusha, and the nirmanakaya is just a Buddha's ability to emanate in any suitable form to tame beings.

PadmaVonSamba said:

are you suggesting that the difference in the three kayas is purely based on how they are perceived?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are a result of the accumulation of merit and wisdom. Simply put, dharmakaya is realized for one's own benefit, the rupakaya is realized in order to benefit others.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

Montoya said:

Can you say more about where Kali Yuga comes from in a Buddhist context? I've seen a lot of references to it on DW, but I've always associated it with Hindu cosmology and can't ever remember any of my teachers talking about it.

Malcolm wrote:

It's discussed quite a bit in traditional Buddhist sources. In Tibetan it is called rtsod dus, the age of strife.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 7:04 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

are you suggesting that the difference in the three kayas is purely based on how they are



perceived?

Malcolm wrote:

The three kayas are a result of the accumulation of merit and wisdom. Simply put, dharmakaya is realized for one's own benefit, the rupakaya is realized in order to benefit others.

PadmaVonSamba said:

can you clarify...

Realized by whom?

The practitioner, or the Buddha?

Malcolm wrote:

A person who starts out a sentient being and ends up a Buddha by practicing the path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 7:08 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

I would add to this: who among any of us is beyond conceptual beliefs to the degree that we 'see' any of this kind of stuff? The basic problem of emptiness also applies to many theistic theologies - talking about it, conceiving it, believing it etc is not "it" - whatever that "it" is supposed to be or not be.

Malcolm wrote:

Dharma is not a via negativa. Dependent origination = emptiness.

Inexpressibility simply means that we cannot point to anything and declare "this is how this appearance is." It means there is nothing behind the relative to describe, and it means that descriptions of appearances fail to capture the reality of those appearances. But there is certainly nothing behind nor beyond them, just as there is nothing behind a mirage, illusion, etc., but causes and conditions that lack inherent existence themselves.

tobes said:

No, the point here is that conceptual belief about emptiness does not equal direct realisation of it.....and the amount of Buddhists who have subtly or not so subtly incorrect conceptual beliefs about emptiness far, far exceeds those who have direct realisation. Theists like Maimonides make similar arguments about correct and incorrect beliefs about god.

This is an epistemological point, not a metaphysical one. The content of what emptiness or god might be is not relevant here.

Malcolm wrote:

Trivial point. All you are saying is that realization of the first bhumi is rare. But that certainly does not allow one to draw a false equivalence between Buddhists who have a nominally correct view (many) and nonBuddhists who universally suffer from wrong view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 7:56 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Sherab said:

The ultimate is timeless.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no ultimate separate from things. Things exist in time. So, this is a meaningless statement. And it renders the rest of your statement moot.

Your "ultimate" can't produce anything, otherwise, it would be compounded, and therefore, in time.

Sherab said:

Your position has to be that there are no things ultimately. Existences only exist tenuously via dependent origination. When everything ceases, there is nothing. So ultimately, there is or will be a big fat nothing. So, you have to assume that somehow, something must keep dependent origination itself from ceasing. Or, you will have to assume that dependent origination itself exists and is eternal.

By the way, science is now questioning whether time is fundamental. Who knows, if one day science actually proved that time is indeed non-fundamental, we all will have to give up Buddhism, if Buddhism as understood by Malcolm is correct.

Anyway, I am done here. I have no wish to debate with you. You can have the last word.

Malcolm wrote:

Where this exists, that exists.

With the arising of that, this arose.

— The Buddha.

There is no dependent origination which is separate from dependently originated things; and since there is no beginning to dependent origination-since nothing arises from itself,

from another, or in absence of a cause-there is is no reason to assume that dependent origination will ever cease.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

No, the point here is that conceptual belief about emptiness does not equal direct realisation of it.....and the amount of Buddhists who have subtly or not so subtly incorrect conceptual beliefs about emptiness far, far exceeds those who have direct realisation. Theists like Maimonides make similar arguments about correct and incorrect beliefs about god.

This is an epistemological point, not a metaphysical one. The content of what emptiness or god might be is not relevant here.

Malcolm wrote:

Trivial point. All you are saying is that realization of the first bhumi is rare. But that certainly does not allow one to draw a false equivalence between Buddhists who have a nominally correct view (many) and nonBuddhists who universally suffer from wrong view.

tobes said:

The point is not trivial, and I am not drawing an equivalence about view.

What's at stake is the question of epistemic access to something which is non-conceptual, ineffable etc. One can refute metaphysics, theology etc, to the degree that they are stated in language or asserted as beliefs. But one can't really refute people's experiences of religious or spiritual kinds. Reading, for example, sociology of religion on such topics, it is perfectly obvious that theistic people experience various kinds of religious-spiritual states through their prayer, practices etc....and very often have difficulties matching that with particular creeds or ideas or dogmas.

Who are we to tell them: it's all b/s, because we know Chandrakirti? What conceit!

Malcolm wrote:

Nonbuddhists have all kind experiences which they regard as profound and spiritually transformational. But these experiences, categorically, lead them no closer to liberation.

One cannot really describe the taste of sugar, but no one expects tasting something sweet, as inexpressible as it may be, leads to salvation or liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 9:51 PM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Matt J said:

the ultimate unknown

Malcolm wrote:

Good things that's emphatically not what ultimate truth is in Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Matt J said:

Listening to Buddhists debate theism reminds me of when I was a kid listening to other middle schoolers talk about sex.

Malcolm wrote:

It appears you are saying without engaging in and practicing theistic traditions on their own terms, we cannot have any basis for accepting or rejecting their liberative value.

Since it is the case that the ultimate truth can only be understood on the basis of conventional truth, there is no direct or intuitive way that an ordinary person can detour around the conventionally-ascertained ultimate truth, in order to realize it properly. The reason for this is that there is nothing beyond the ultimate truth of conventional entities to realize at all. There is no ultimate truth to be realized beyond the true nature of compounded entities, since space and the two kinds of cessation are the only types of uncompounded phenomena.

Based on this fact we can dispense with the fantasy that theistic traditions are anything but nests of wrong view and confusion. This is because dependent origination and emptiness are found only in the Buddha's teaching, and not in the teachings of other doctrines. They have no equivalents which would allow us to extend them the charity of allowing that their teachings lead to liberation. But it's also not our job to correct them. As HHDL said, emptiness is none of their business.

The other possible consequence to your statement is that view doesn't matter at all. But this is similar to claiming seed oil can be extracted from pressing sand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Rick said:

Does the mysterious or unfathomable or unknowable play a role in Buddhist dharma?  
Because it sure does in the Vedas!

Malcolm wrote:

Nope.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: Nirguṇa Ultimates

Content:

Matt J said:

Depends on who you ask.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really.

There is no Buddhist text which asserts that ultimate truth is unknowable. There are many texts which state that ultimate truth is inexpressible. But that inexpressibility is the inexpressibility of the true nature of things, since there is no independent ultimate truth which stands apart from relative truth. The two truths are always inseparable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 6th, 2021 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

For what it is worth, more and more teachers are realising that Western Buddhists all too often use Dzogchen and Mahamudra (and Zen, etc) as an excuse to continue being heartless egoists or narcissists.

Malcolm wrote:

This is a problem identified among Tibetans as early as the 12th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 3:50 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Matt J said:

What I'm saying is that if you want to know the basis for theism, one would have to engage with theism rather than just building and knocking over conceptual models.

Malcolm wrote:

I disagree with this idea entirely. The idea that one must practice theism in order to know its basis is as silly an idea as claiming that one must practice Facism in order to knows its basis.

Matt J said:

As for liberative value, who can say? No one has a coherent model for evaluating competing claims like that.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course there are such coherent models for evaluating these things. One merely looks at the claims various soteriological models make. That said, different claims for what constitutes liberation are made in different traditions, and one merely needs to examine them alongside what one understands liberation to be and see how they match up.

Matt J said:

Rather, each tradition appears to fall back on various dogmas, inferences, and second hand knowledge.

Malcolm wrote:

No. Buddhism does not fall back on dogmas to defend its model of liberation. Its model is straight-forward: "Where this exists, that exists, where this arose, that arises; where this does not exist, that does not exist, where this has ceased, that ceases."

Matt J said:

In addition, they appear to interpret new ideas and data in light of existing models. I suppose that's fine if the goal is to memorize and repeat a complex conceptual model, but spiritual practice seems to have a different goal.

Malcolm wrote:

Practicing Dharma eliminates the afflictions of desire, hatred, and ignorance that are the cause of all suffering in the world, and the root of that is seeing that there is nothing in the world that is not dependently originated, therefore, empty. That insight into emptiness and dependent origination directly incinerates the afflictions that cause suffering.

This is the unique teaching of the Buddha.

I understand there are other alternatives out there, but as far as I am concerned, unless they make people more compassionate, their theoretical content is just so much hot air with no substance. They certainly cannot lead to the insight bequeathed to us by the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Matt J said:

Maybe. The only way to really know is to become a Buddha and then see what's what.

Malcolm wrote:

Silly. You just have to realize emptiness. Full buddhahood is not required.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 8:15 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Matt J said:

The only way to really know if a given path has liberative value for a particular person is to practice that path. If it liberates, then it has value, and if not it doesn't. The rest is just speculation, second hand reports, and yes, dogma.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, unlike other systems, dependent origination is a matter of direct perception, which requires no speculation at all. Anyone can observe it, unlike godhead, etc.

Since other systems are not predicated on dependent origination, they have no actual value in terms of liberation from suffering.

Paths are either liberative or they are not, it's not a matter of preference and choice. In Dharma, liberation is strictly defined as freedom from afflictions that result in suffering. No special mystical experience is required to verify this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 8:19 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

And extraordinary, extraordinary epistemic claim!

But if not this, then what? How are you so sure?

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness and anatma are not the view of nonBuddhist systems. So, not an extraordinary claim at all. And why, on a Buddhist website, is this even a question?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 9:28 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

know and understand the minds of each particular theist.....

Malcolm wrote:

This is a completely specious standard. It basically means that you, like Matt, entirely dismiss the fundamental Buddhist principle that liberation is a result of view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 8:25 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

It's simply a question of how you can know another person's interior experience.

Malcolm wrote:

There are two ways: inference and direct knowledge of their minds.

Since we know there is no godhead, no higher being, etc., people who report such experiences, we can infer, are merely being overwhelmed by some cognitive state they are labeling a "mystical experience," "grace," etc., based on their social conditioning.

Honestly, from the point of view of the Buddhist path, we don't care very much about the conceptual mishmash that other religions refer to as "spiritual experience." It is not at all conducive to what we in the Buddhist fold understand liberation to be. We don't even care very much about what Buddhists call "experience." Why? Experience is conceptual and transient. Even the experience of nonconceptuality is a very subtle conceptual experience.

As for whether one can drawn equivalencies between the experience of emptiness, that is, nonconceptuality, in Buddhists and nonBuddhists, no one has claimed that nonconceptual experience is confined to Buddhists. But the experience of nonconceptuality is not the realization of emptiness, nor does it necessarily lead to the



view of emptiness required for realizing emptiness. And indeed, the experience of emptiness aka nonconceptual can be a serious deviation even for Buddhists.

As Buddhists we are constantly told our experiences are not important, and that we should not get trapped in experiences, because experiences may be indicators of approaching realization, but attachment to them hinders realization. Since these experiences have been carefully mapped out along the stages of the path, it's pretty easy, once one knows these stages and their indicators, to sort out where one is on the path, as well as where others are, if they happen to be on a path. We never bother to categorize the experience of worldly people because their experience is completely samsaric, whether they are so-called religious people, spiritual people, or not.

The only indicator that concerns us about people in other religious traditions is whether they demonstrate compassion or not. And even then, the compassion and idea of compassion in other traditions is crippled and limited. Otherwise, Buddhists and nonBuddhists have nothing in common, other than our common humanity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

tobes said:

....and you know this because you checked with everyone of them? Studied all the different systems and theories and theologies etc through world history? Silently communed with all those myriad of contemplatives who kept 30 years of silence on mountaintops.....and therefore established that, yep, **\*\*you\*\*** can see for sure what they have realised.

Malcolm wrote:

We know this for three reasons:

The teaching of dependent origination and emptiness does not exist outside of the Dharma. The Buddha has taught repeatedly that outside his Dharma and Vinaya there are no aryas, and even when there are pratyekabuddhas, they do not teach the dharma they realize on their own. So, if there were a such a person on Mt. Athos, for example, it would not matter to the world because they don't teach the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

yagmort said:  
imho, buddhism, as any other religion, contains dogmas.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, all religions contain doctrines (dogma).

yagmort said:  
view is a subject to personal interpretations. for example,

Malcolm wrote:  
No, this is not correct at all.

yagmort said:  
according to Thanissaro Bhikkhu, Buddha has never said "Life is suffering" or "There is no self". is he right or wrong?

Malcolm wrote:  
Certainly, the Buddha never said pranadukkha. He taught self and no self to people depending on context.

yagmort said:  
some people will agree, some others will disagree, but who is the ultimate judge to say what view is correct/incorrect? view is described through the media of language and concepts. view is a changing thing.

Malcolm wrote:  
You should study tenet systems. The point of studying things is eliminate concepts and views one is unaware one is holding.

yagmort said:  
true nature of things has to be experienced directly as it is beyond language, concepts and explanations. how people can be so sure that only buddhism can provide the experience of true nature of things is beyond me..

Malcolm wrote:  
The true nature of things is that they are dependently originated, arising from cause and conditions. This is something you can directly experience here and now in your direct perception. The true nature of things is not hidden, it's right there in the open. The reason we miss this is that we mistake the conventions we label appearances that arise from cause and condition, cars, people, etc., for being integral or real things in and of themselves. They are empty of inherent existence, free from extremes.

The fact is that every sentient being already experiences the true nature of things, but they don't recognize it because either hasn't been pointed out to them or it can't be because of their cognitive limitations (animals, etc.).

Your problem, quite honestly, is that you have not properly reflected upon the eighteen freedoms and endowments that make up a precious human birth. That goes for everyone who doubts that Buddhadharma is the sole path to liberation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

To say there is no higher being and that non-Buddhist spiritual experiences are just social conditioning is a bit naive. But that's actually beside the point of this discussion... the rest of your post is quite good.

Malcolm wrote:

Please prove there is a higher being. What are its characteristics, how is it to be known?

All religious experience is a result of conditioning, because nothing arises without causes and conditions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Video on Mipam R and Buddha Nature.

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

Doubly weird, since Duckworth knows and appreciates the piece and its author in general. I will try to re-read MoBN when I find some time, and see how he deals with the problem.

Malcolm wrote:

It is extremely clear that the term refers to a gnosis that one realizes for oneself without depending on another. It is the same category of terms like translating rig pa as awareness.

Dharmasagara said:

Malcolm, would you please offer your own rendering of the term so sor rang gyis rig pa'i ye shes?

Thanx in advance

Malcolm wrote:

Gnosis that one personally Intuits or knows.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

To say there is no higher being and that non-Buddhist spiritual experiences are just social conditioning is a bit naive. But that's actually beside the point of this discussion... the rest of your post is quite good.

Malcolm wrote:

Please prove there is a higher being. What are its characteristics, how is it to be known?

SilenceMonkey said:

There are many higher beings and higher powers in the universe. Buddha never dismissed this, and called them devas. Some devas have enormous power. This is a traditional aspect of Buddha's teaching. Are we really debating this?

Malcolm wrote:

They are not higher beings at all, since they are inevitably going to take birth in lower realms. They are to be pitied as they do not have a precious human birth.

All religious experience is a result of conditioning, because nothing arises without causes and conditions.

I see, so that's what you mean by "social conditioning." I think it's confusing if you conflate the terms "social conditioning" and "conditioned phenomena" in a Buddhist sense.

Social conditioning is part of conditioned phenomena, no?

By saying an entire religion's spiritual experiences are merely social conditioning makes it sound like there are no spiritual experiences and people who have them are just making them up or following the herd. (Which may be true for a lot of people these days, but obviously it's not categorically true.)

Yes, there are no "spiritual" experiences, since all these nonBuddhist people are deluded, by definition. So yes, given that they are subject to conceptual delusion, and have yet to met the authentic path, they have no way out. They either fabricate their "experiences" or they follow the herd. This is also true of some Buddhists, who in order to gain importance etc., claim to have visions of this bodhisattva and that, etc., even though they cannot properly explain even the five aggregates.

Even if someone has an experience of a visitation of some entity, like the Virgin of Guadalupe, one might charitably decide this was a visitation of Tara filtered through a cultural lens, but still this is not certain, and would just be a personal fabrication, absent any proof.

This is exactly how controversies about protectors in Tibet arise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

We are a fringe phenomenon.

The number of star trek fanatics is probably greater.

FiveSkandhas said:

There is something rather depressing about this statement.

PeterC said:

On one level, yes. But we are in the age of degeneration of the teachings. If you look back over most major lineages of the Dharma - I don't just mean schools of the Vajrayana - you see multiple times over the decades when they were in pretty bad shape, very few good practitioners. But it only takes one great teacher to restore a lineage. That's why it's important that there are some, however few, really good teachers in the world - that's a lot more important than the average level of practitioners, or the outer respect that a lineage has.

Malcolm wrote:

The corollary is that it only takes one really bad teacher to spoil a lineage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 7th, 2021 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

Well, they are higher than we are now in the samsaric ladder. Therefore "higher" is an apt term, even if their station in Samsara is not permanent. But the highest of beings live in their abodes for billions and trillions of kalpas. Much more than us, haha.

Malcolm wrote:

Such beings do not have a higher birth than we do. It's simple, they lack a precious human birth and so cannot attain awakening through practicing the path.

SilenceMonkey said:

One very small portion. Conditioned phenomena is referring to all of reality itself, not just how human minds are influenced by society.

Malcolm wrote:

And social conditioning is a part of conditioned phenomena. And that is what we are talking about when we talk about the conventional experience of ordinary people.

SilenceMonkey said:

Even Buddhists are deluded until we achieve realization. And yet, we still have all kinds of spiritual experiences.

Malcolm wrote:

Valid path experiences are accounted for in texts such as Abhidharmakosha, Abhisamaya-Alamkara, etc.

SilenceMonkey said:

Sounds like you think all experiences are just made up until one realizes emptiness... is that what's going on?

Malcolm wrote:

All experience is conceptual, dualistic experience until the path of seeing. The useful experiences for the path have been precisely mapped for us by the siddha-scholars of the past. The others are completely irrelevant.

SilenceMonkey said:

Also, one doesn't need to be able to explain the aggregates in order to have visions of Buddhas, Bodhisattvas (and devas).

Malcolm wrote:

Such things are dualistic and conceptual.

SilenceMonkey said:

Visions are not dependent on our intelligence but the lack of obscurations.

Malcolm wrote:

So ask yourself, when are obscurations removed on the path? They are not even removed on the path of seeing. They only begin to be removed on the path of cultivation. So why should anyone place any trust in the random experiences and visions of anyone who is below the path of seeing, let alone the experiences reported by people who do not even have a precious human birth?

One expects someone on the path of seeing to be able to explain the five aggregates; actually, they should be able to explain this on the path of accumulation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Certainly, the Buddha never said *pranadukkha*. He taught self and no self to people depending on context.

Matt J said:

The whole "Buddha said" argument is fallacious for a few reasons.

1. It is a basic appeal to authority.

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone appeals to authority except materialists (and even they do).

Matt J said:

2. Who knows what the Buddha actually said? All of the sources are second hand. Bhikkhu Analayo says the Pali chants even a few hundred years ago are different than today. As far as I know, the Buddha didn't write anything down. Ever play telephone?

3. Even if the Buddha said it, was it meant as provisionally or not?

4. Buddha supposedly said lots of stuff. There are monks who believe the world is flat, or that atoms are composed of earth, air, fire, water, and light elements, of that lay people shouldn't meditate, or many other ridiculous things, because "Buddha said."

But you know what else Buddha said? Check it out for yourself.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, one must find out for oneself. However, your attack on the authority of inference and testimony is simplistic, and amounts to little more than the skepticism exemplified by Krishnamurti. It's also characteristic of the materialist position, which claims only direct perception is valid.

Matt J said:

You should study tenet systems. The point of studying things is eliminate concepts and views one is unaware one is holding.

Exactly. No point is escaping one conceptual prison to confine oneself in a Buddhist one. But all I see here are concepts and stories.

Malcolm wrote:

The point is how one uses concepts to escape such confines. That's the point of understanding to two truths, for example. In order to realize ultimate truth, one must

understand it. In order to understand it, it must be understood through the words and conventions of relative truth. You might think that's also just a story, and you are right. But it's an efficient story, capable of bring about the result of liberation, the other stories are not efficient.

The point is this: does one think one has an existential problem to solve? Yes or no. If yes, what is that problem? Is it engendered externally or internally? If the latter, if one's problem arises from oneself and is not imposed externally, how does one resolve that problem? Is that problem innate, and therefor irresolvable or is it adventitious? If it is the latter, then how is it resolved? If it comes from within, it cannot solved through any external condition, etc.

So we Buddhists are nang pas, we think that our problem comes from ourselves, from the unique causes and conditions which led to our present condition. Since we have this understanding, for us there can be no question of relying on some external solution, we cannot. Therefor, we must look into our own minds for the solution. Since we never can find any permanent entity within our mind, all we discover is that the mind continues based on cause and condition. When we examine those causes and conditions, we cannot find anything among them which we can say "this is it, this is my mind." This is the famous emptiness we hear so much about. When we discover this, now we have wisdom with which we can burn away what we have identified as the cause of our existential problem, which from our perspective, is identifying an existent self, a person, and so on.

Some other systems have identified the problem as not recognizing our true self that somehow exists in the middle of these causes and conditions. The problem they have, however, is proving such an unconditioned entity exists within a conditioned entity. Thus why they also are not nangpas, because they claim that our true nature is something other than our conditioned, and hence empty, existence.

We don't have this problem, because for us, there is no ultimate truth that can ever be divorced from relative truth. For this reason, it is quite reasonable reject the truth claims of other systems because in the end they must depend solely on the authority of testimony as proof of their ultimate truths, whereas ours are accessible even to analysis that can be conducted by ordinary people, not dependent upon grace, or anything else. This is the principle difference, then, between my school and the school,of others. YMMV. I also have no Advaita background because I found it's arguments in in incung from the beginning, and when I did study yoga, Samkhya, and Advaita under a qualified Hindu instructor of these systems, my understanding of those systems was both refined and confirmed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:



Matt J said:  
Except Buddhist ones, evidently.

PadmaVonSamba said:  
Buddhist teachings tell us not to even hold onto our concepts, much less our spiritual experiences. This is the profound difference between still holding on and truly letting go.

Malcolm wrote:  
Now you are simply being argumentative, with no purpose other than to say.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 3:38 AM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:

undefineable said:  
And although there are Buddhist texts that suggest that craving is the root not only of dukkha but of all reality as well, this doesn't explain how a) the external roots of the objects of craving manage to make an appearance,

Malcolm wrote:  
They arise from causes and conditions. This is not mysterious.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 3:43 AM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:  
undefineable said:  
The Buddhist claim that there is no supporting substrate to mental activity is pretty counterintuitive.

Malcolm wrote:  
That is because absence of identity is counterintuitive when one has spent a lifetime reinforcing the identity of self and other. But once it is dismantled...it's pretty intuitive.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 5:20 AM  
Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?  
Content:  
Matt J said:

"Everyone does it" is the bandwagon fallacy. I agree that few people apply critical thinking, but I don't think it warrants the rejection of critical thinking.

Malcolm wrote:

The fallacy of false equivalence. Appealing to an authority does not necessary imply a lack of critical thinking. Indeed, it may imply the opposite.

Matt J said:

The gauntlet was thrown down by the Pyrrhonists and never successfully answered for over 2000 years in the West. Rather, skeptical arguments are even today used to attack one's opponent, and then usually dismissed as applied to one's own theories.

Malcolm wrote:

Pyrrho is just an equivocator:

"There are, bhikkhus, some recluses and brahmins who are endless equivocators.[9] When questioned about this or that point, on four grounds they resort to evasive statements and to endless equivocation. And owing to what, with reference to what, do these honorable recluses and brahmins do so?

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/tipitaka/dn/dn.01.0.bodh.html#fnt-9>

Matt J said:

Similarly, to say that no one but Buddhists achieve any level of liberation is simply unfounded, i.e. an article of religious faith.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is not simply a matter of faith. Buddha defined liberation in a very specific way, and excluded other definitions. Now, it is possible to argue that there are other definitions of liberation, and I agree with you, there are other such definitions. But they all require what you might call "dogmas."

In the case of Buddhadharma, however, all that is required is insight into dependent origination. There is nothing particularly esoteric about it, apart from the mind's resistance to accepting its inevitable consequences: "Where that does not exist, this does not exist; with the ceasing of that, this ceased." That's all liberation is, according to the Buddha, or those texts which represent the Buddha to us.

Matt J said:

There are intriguing neurological studies suggesting that most of our creative and logical power is used to rationalize our pre-conceived notions.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you are hoisted on your own petard.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 8:54 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

undefineable said:

Buddhism makes the definite ontological claim that only appearances are real.

Malcolm wrote:

Absolutely not. Buddhists make any number of ontological claims, but this not among them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

krodha said:

Buddhism makes the definite ontological claim that only appearances are real.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I've never seen such a claim.

undefineable said:

That's because I made a mistake in wording, as explained. I could equally have overshoot in the other direction in trying to support my point, and said "claim[s] \*nothing\* is real", but then no-one likes being associated with nihilism...

Malcolm wrote:

You would have been correct. Buddhism does claim that nothing is real, that is, that there is no underlying state of being which pertains to things, no substrate. On the other hand Buddhism does not say everything is nonexistent, like a sky flower, a child of a barren women, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

undefineable said:

That's because I made a mistake in wording, as explained. I could equally have overshoot

in the other direction in trying to support my point, and said "claim[s] \*nothing\* is real", but then no-one likes being associated with nihilism...

Malcolm wrote:

You would have been correct. Buddhism does claim that nothing is real, that is, that there is no underlying state of being which pertains to things, no substrate. On the other hand Buddhism does not say everything is nonexistent, like a sky flower, a child of a barren woman, etc.

PadmaVonSamba said:

I prefer to say that appearances only “arise” or “happen” or “occur” (to the senses) just as a breeze occurs, which suggests that they are indeed objects awareness, but doesn’t suggest any intrinsic reality.

“Exist” is such a loaded term.

Malcolm wrote:

Appearances don’t even occur, happen, or arise, as that suggests they transition from nonbeing to being. The only way this can be discussed coherently is with reference to dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 8th, 2021 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

iskaral said:

I think it possible that Tsongkhapa’s interpretation of Madhyamaka could be disparaged this way

This is what i was referring to as the semantic interpretation: “the ultimate truth is that there is no ultimate truth”, but this says nothing about the conventional and you can have both flat (all conventional truths have equal status, something close but different to the only real thing is appearance) or thick (allowing for hierarchies of conditionality in which no one level has intrinsic reality with what appears being merely on level among many) conceptions of conventional truth.

Malcolm wrote:

Not all relative truths are conventional truths. This is a well established principle in Madhyamaka. So, there is a hierarchy of relative truths, i.e. true and false relative truth; and true relative truth is also called conventional truth, which is validated through a correspondence between naming and function. A thing is conventionally true only if it is efficient in producing a named result (arthakriya). The purpose of this distinction is to account for conventional transactions in the world, and also to account for the ability of words and meanings to contribute to realization of emptiness and so on. Even in Dzogchen tantras, the efficiency of language is accepted. It is a universally accepted Mahāyāna Buddhist dogma, derived from Nāgārjuna, that one needs to rely on conventional truth in order to understand ultimate truth, and without such

understanding, realization is impossible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

clyde said:

Is it accurate to say that there's not nothing (void), but an ineffable something and all things share its nature?

Malcolm wrote:

It would be accurate to say that if you were a Hindu, etc., but not a Buddhist. The only nature that all things share is no nature at all, and since that nature isn't anything at all, nothing can be said about it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

clyde said:

I agree, emptiness is a character of phenomena and not the ineffable. Emptiness is not a dharma, but merely the lack of self-existence.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that lack of self-existence is the nature of all phenomena, and it is ineffable, since it isn't anything at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 4:56 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Devil's advocate for a minute:

I think that I 'know' the answer to what I'm about to say; however, how does what you just said differ from what Jiddu Krishnamurti seems to often say?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't what Krishnamurti seems to say. I generally ignore him. Perhaps you can provide a quote that you have in mind?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 5:46 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

clyde said:

Is it accurate to say that there's not nothing (void), but an ineffable something and all things share its nature?

Hazel said:

By ineffable here, do you simply mean that it can not be put to words/described?

clyde said:

Yes, but not being able to be put into words doesn't mean

Malcolm wrote:

it isn't anything at all.

In this case, it does. emptiness isn't anything at all. It does not exist, since it does not arise. It does not not-exist, since it does not perish, it does not both exist and not exist, or neither, because of the fault arising from the previous two alternatives. One cannot speak coherently about that which does not arise.

On the other hand, emptiness does not negate things, since it is the nature of things. The nature or essence of things is that they are natureless and essenceless. If there are no things, there is no emptiness of things to speak of.

Emptiness and nonexistence are similar terms, for example, a bucket that is empty and a bucket that does not exist. In the first case we say a bucket is empty because there is nothing in the bucket, such as water and so on. To say a bucket is empty is to say nothing exists in the bucket. In the second case, when we say that bucket does not exist, it makes no sense to speak of an empty bucket at all. There is no bucket to be empty.

When we say that things are empty, we are saying that things have no nature. There is nothing in things. Nothing fills them up. There is nothing to describe in things. That's why it's fine to say that the nature of things is inexpressible. If there were something in things we could describe, being, existence, and so on, then we could describe that. But even nonexistence does not exist in things. Things are just empty. They are not filled with existence. they are not filled with nonexistence, and so on. They have no nature at all. They are hollow, mere appearances, nonarising by nature, like dreams, illusions, mirages, and other examples of empty things. And when we examine things carefully, we find there are no things to be empty.

Still, empty buckets make the most noise, as the saying goes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 6:22 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

clyde said:

Malcolm, I explained that the Buddha didn't teach that there is nothing (nihilism), that the Buddha taught that there is an Unconditioned and that is ineffable.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, emptiness is unconditioned since it does not arise. But it still isn't anything at all.

You see, there are only four unconditioned things in Buddhism: space and the two kinds of cessation: analytical cessation (nirvana), non-analytical cessation (simple absence of causation), and emptiness. But emptiness and nirvana are synonyms.

The perfection of wisdom states three things, which are all synonymous: all things are empty. All things are nonarisen. All things have always been in a state of nirvana. This means that nature of all things is that they are unconditioned. Everything that seems conditioned, is in reality, unconditioned. But that unconditioned state is still a negation. That's why it isn't anything at all. The unconditioned is not even unconditioned because there isn't anything to be unconditioned, since by definition, the unconditioned never arises. That which does not arise does not exist, for example, the sprout of burnt seed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 8:48 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

clyde said:

Is it accurate to say that there's not nothing (void), but an ineffable something and all things share its nature?

Malcolm wrote:

It would be accurate to say that if you were a Hindu, etc., but not a Buddhist.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Or a heretical Shentongpa. I feel fairly confident that some Gelugpas see Karma Kagyupas as crypto Hindus because of their Shentong view(s).

Malcolm wrote:

Gzhan stong pas are not heretical, they are just confused about the meaning of dependent origination. But that can be said about all three of the lower tenet systems. But at least they are Mahayanis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Mahayana Arhat?

Content:

Nalanda said:

What would that entail? Would you be following strictly the sutrayana path and not developing bodhicitta?

Is it "accidental" on the part of the practitioner? or can it be deliberate too?

If one attains arhatship, is that the same arhatship as the sravakayana? If not, how does mahayana arhatship differ?

Malcolm wrote:

The Mahayana arhat is the Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This means that nature of all things is that they are unconditioned.

clyde said:

And how is this different from all dharmas (things) share the nature of the Unconditioned?

Malcolm wrote:

It's the difference between an adjective and a noun. And in that lies a world of difference.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 9:50 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Or a heretical Shentongpa. I feel fairly confident that some Gelugpas see Karma Kagyupas as crypto Hindus because of their Shentong view(s).

Malcolm wrote:



Gzhan stong pas are not heretical, they are just confused about the meaning of dependent origination. But that can be said about all three of the lower tenet systems. But at least they are Mahayanis.

nyonchung said:

Crypto-hindu, some said this about Jonangpas (namely: Rendawa's biography, debate with Jonangpas in Sakya, alas date unknown, some of his letters and advice)

Malcolm wrote:

Rendawa really knew his Madhyamaka. Which is more than I can say for Dolbupa.

The truth is that there will always be some who find Madhyamaka too austere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 7:25 PM

Title: Re: Illuminating Quotes by Malcolm Namdrol-la

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Simulacrum, not real sambhogakāya, again just the ripening of traces in your own mind. And you should ask about such things on line.

Tata1 said:

So something like the example wisdom is to dharmakaya?

Ups sorry. Just read the last line.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, something like that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 11:33 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

iskaral said:

rangjung dorje on nagarjunas praise of dharmadhatu by brunnholz)

Malcolm wrote:

There is no possibility that the praise to the dharmadhātu is a text by Nāgārjuna I. There are no citations of it in any Indian text that can be dated prior to the mid-10th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 9th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

krodha said:

That is all well and good, but I do not have to accept gzhan stong as a view in order to accept tathāgatagarbha.

Malcolm wrote:

The gzhan stong thing is dead horse that we have reduced to mince meat.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 10th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

As presented by Khenpo Tsultrim, Shentong absolutely accepts Prasangika Madhyamaka as valid. However it does not apply to Wisdom Mind/Buddha Nature.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 11th, 2021 at 4:40 AM

Title: Re: Mahayana Arhat?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Mahayana arhat

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, a Mahāyāna arhat is a buddha, this why a buddha is called a "tathāgata, arhat, samyasambuddha."

The sixteen Arhats are bodhisattva in the guise of śrāvaka arhats.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 11th, 2021 at 8:05 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Im not saying its not buddhist. Im saying its a different frame/doctrine/concept that is independent to madhyamaka.

Although the premise of Buddha Nature is widely accepted, there are those that say Dolpopa's interpretation isn't Buddhist. I'm not one of them. But I'm agreeing with you it's a different orientation than Nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

Very few people say this. Rendawa, maybe some extremist Gelugpas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 11th, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Khenpo's point is that Madhyamaka reasoning doesn't have jurisdiction since Buddha Nature can't be taken as an object of consciousness. I don't think rephrasing that idea to be a "different orientation" is much of a leap.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if it can't be taken as an object of consciousness, not even buddhas could know it, which stands in direct contradiction to the tathāgatagarbha sūtras themselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Matt J said:

You know what they say: "not existent since even a buddha does not see it, but it is also not nonexistent since it is the basis of both samsara and nirvana."

Malcolm wrote:

Of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 1:57 AM

Title: Re: Do all refuge vows include the precepts?

Content:

Hazel said:

My understanding was when we take formal refuge, we take 1-5 of the precepts (the minimum being not killing). However, when my lama gave me these vows privately (and again when I renewed them recently) he did not mention the precepts. Are they ever not included?

Drikung Kagyu

Malcolm wrote:

They are never not included.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 5:41 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

conebeckham said:

....and of course this comes from the tradition of Mahamudra. The tradition of practice, and not the tradition of commentary and analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Mahāmudrā has plenty of commentary and analysis, whole volumes of it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 9:24 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

conebeckham said:

....and of course this comes from the tradition of Mahamudra. The tradition of practice, and not the tradition of commentary and analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Mahāmudrā has plenty of commentary and analysis, whole volumes of it.

conebeckham said:

Well, yes, of course...but I think you are missing my point.

I am making a distinction between the mode of explication and analysis, and the mode of meditative instruction and pith.

But, meh...you know what I mean, I am sure.

Malcolm wrote:

My point is that meditation without analysis is method sans wisdom, just as analysis without meditation is wisdom sans method.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 10:19 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My point is that meditation without analysis is method sans wisdom, just as analysis without meditation is wisdom sans method.

reiun said:

Meditation as experience can stand independent, and more meaningful, than any cognitive process (analysis).

Malcolm wrote:

Some people assert that, but such people cannot distinguish awakening from samadhi. This was the fault the Buddha ascertained in the teachings of his two teachers, confusing samadhi for awakening. Awakening is strictly a result of insight. Insight depends on view. View depends on analysis. Analysis depends on discernment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

reiun said:

Meditation as experience can stand independent, and more meaningful, than any cognitive process (analysis).

Malcolm wrote:

Some people assert that, but such people cannot distinguish awakening from samadhi. This was the fault the Buddha ascertained in the teachings of his two teachers, confusing samadhi for awakening. Awakening is strictly a result of insight. Insight depends on view. View depends on analysis. Analysis depends on discernment.

reiun said:

Not at all.

The wisdom of experience trumps (sorry!) the wisdom of cognition. As you stated: we are discussing a process. Also: insight depends on experience.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think we are using the same language. Merely sitting in samadhi will never lead to awakening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Awareness is absolute.

Malcolm wrote:

Part of the aggregates or different?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Awareness is absolute.

Malcolm wrote:

Part of the aggregates or different?

undefineable said:

Does it make a difference?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. People use the term "awareness" (rig pa) very promiscuously without defining it or the tradition they are drawing the term from. Even within one tradition, for example, Nyingma, the term rig pa can mean several different things depending on context, not to mention that the term is used differently in Sakya, Kagyu, Gelug, and Nyingma.

Add to this the Neo-advaitan use of the term, etc., and it is a real puttanescas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 11:03 PM

Title: Re: Is impermanence the same or different than emptiness?

Content:

iskaral said:

What i do buy is that the teachings are supposed to reduce our dukkha and aid us in reducing the dukkha of others.

Malcolm wrote:

Without seeing things as they are (yathabhūta), then this goal is unattainable, just as without a proper diagnosis, one cannot remove an illness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 11:47 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

The problem is getting from here to there. The reason people think the borders are necessary is due to the disparities. If the disparities were not so pronounced, the perceived need for borders would not be so great. Chicken and egg.

Look, if you can figure the problem of development out, you'd readily have a job in any number of organizations or government agencies and undoubtedly a Nobel prize.

Malcolm wrote:

Democracy is hard in countries where there are huge class disparities. That's what's happening to the US.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 12th, 2021 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Add to this the Neo-advaitan use of the term, etc., and it is a real puttanescia.

Rick said:

Yes! A huge problem for clear communication, a Tower of Babel'wareness. Add to that that some people differentiate awareness and consciousness, and others don't.

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhism, there is no valid reason for doing so, at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

Rick said:

Good to know. What are the Sanskrit and Tibetan terms for awareness-consciousness?

Malcolm wrote:

Rig pa, often translated as awareness, derives from Sanskrit, vid: knowing , understanding , a knower.

Rnam shes is generally a translation of vijñāna, the aggregate of consciousness, or one of the six senses consciousnesses.

Shes pa is generally a translation of jñā, to know , have knowledge , become acquainted with (acc. ; rarely gen. MBh. iii , 2154 Hariv. 7095) , perceive , apprehend , understand (also with inf. [Pa1n2. 3-4 , 65] MBh. ii , v Das3.) , experience , recognise , ascertain , investigate RV. &c. ; to know as , know or perceive that. This generally, in Tibetan texts, refers the five sense consciousnesses.

The usage of the term rig pa in Kagyu and Sakya texts is more straightforward, where it refers the knowing aspect of the all-basis.

In Dzogchen texts it is a much more complicated term. However, it has in general two interrelated meanings: the first is knowledge of the basis, that is, recognition of nature of the mind. Secondly, it refers to abiding in the nature of consciousness itself. Teacher like Milgyur Dorje and so on, and most modern translators working in Dzogchen material, tend to have taken up Herbert Guenther's early translation of rig pa as "awareness." Chogyal Namkhai Norbu coined the term "instant presence."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

Surveying history, democracy has sparkled like a gem for brief moments. Maybe this is the fading twinkle of one of those moments. I fear what comes.

Malcolm wrote:

As long as we keep allowing the huge wealth disparities that have arisen, our democracy will fold. We are living through another gilded age. Where's Teddy Roosevelt when we need him?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 1:50 AM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:



I would say the aggregates actually arise within awareness. There is awareness of the aggregates.

Malcolm wrote:

This is incorrect. The Buddha never identified anything called "awareness" in which the five aggregates are situated and arise.

What you are terming "awareness" is just the combination of the aggregates of sensation and perception.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

reiun said:

Not at all.

The wisdom of experience trumps (sorry!) the wisdom of cognition. As you stated: we are discussing a process. Also: insight depends on experience.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think we are using the same language. Merely sitting in samadhi will never lead to awakening.

reiun said:

Just the opposite

Malcolm wrote:

This is Tibetan Buddhism forum, in case you didn't notice.

Sekida's opinions are therefore irrelevant and also unsupportable, if taken literally as you have presented them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: What do they do with the hair???

Content:

SilenceMonkey said:

I thought it was so the lama can pray for us every day.

Malcolm wrote:

Why would they need our hair to do that?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 3:41 AM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

undefineable said:

Vis a vis reality, wouldn't it be more correct to say that the aggregates insinuate themselves[?!] as objects of awareness, but that awareness arises with them and centers itself within the ones mentioned?

Malcolm wrote:

Awareness is a function of being conscious. If you are not conscious, you are not aware.

The dharma has very precise language with which we discuss the mind and its functions. It's called abhidharma. If people do not ground their discussions of dharma in vinaya, sūtra, or abhidharma, they are just making shit up.

If anything, what people are here calling "awareness" is either samjñā, perception, the third skandha; or manaskāra, attention, which is a mental factor. Well, they are both mental factors, but the reason "perception" gets its own skandha is that it is one of two mental factors that pull us most strongly towards afflictive objects. The other being vedana, sensation.,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 13th, 2021 at 3:51 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

reiun said:

Sekida's opinions are therefore irrelevant and also unsupportable, if taken literally as you have presented them.

Relevant and supportable opinions about experiences, because those experiences can be certified by a proper teacher.

Malcolm wrote:

The idea that there can be awakening without analytical insight, aka, vipaśyanā, has been rejected in Tibetan Buddhism since the eighth century.

Evidence shows that samadhi is not necessary for awakening at all, actually, as we see from the large number of people who attained stream entry and even arhatship through what is called dry vipaśyanā. Certainly samadhi, aka śamatha, aka calm-abiding can help stabilize the mind, thus making insight more stable, but the crucial factor in awakening, achieving the path of seeing, is in sight, not samadhi.

Just as a bird needs two wings to fly, generally speaking a practitioner needs both

wisdom (prajñā) and method (upaya); vipaśyāna and śamatha in union.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 12:35 AM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

nyonchung said:

I can imagine, its about "Temple des Traditions", not ChNN, or any well-meaning Buddhist master

Since long, many teachers spent time to uproot animal sacrifice in Tibetan-speaking areas of the Himalayan range - where they actually still exist here and there in nominally Buddhist areas (one letter of the Karmapa XVI to Manang is available)

They still exist in Latö

We can mention also Nedo Karma Chagmé for Kham and numerous Mongolian teachers but I'm going

Malcolm wrote:

Also in Eastern Bhutan, where Kunzang Dechen Lingpa had to correct Nyingmapas who thought they had to slaughter animals for ganapujas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

The goal is to empty Samsara completely...

Malcolm wrote:

That is an aspiration, but it is impossible. It will never happen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 5:34 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

The goal is to empty Samsara completely...

Malcolm wrote:

That is an aspiration, but it is impossible. It will never happen.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

It will just take a few kalpas

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, it will never happen. sentient beings are limitless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 9:43 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-59274686>

Unknown said:

Some 450 more people were injured by scorpion stings, a health ministry official said. The hail and thunder storm in the area near the River Nile on Friday was particularly violent.

Scorpions are regularly washed into the streets by heavy rain, while snakes have also been disturbed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 1:18 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Supramundane said:

Isn't the border de facto open anyway? Why not legalize crossing, then you can regulate it. Sort of like the argument for drugs, I guess.

One of the first free trade experiments in the world was Benelux, Belgium - Luxembourg - Netherlands. After a few years of open borders and free trade, although a number of businesses had been wiped out in a flurry of creative destruction as tariffs and protective measures fell away, overall trade increased, and the economy surged, way above the European average.

This proved that open borders creates an intensification of business due to the free flow of goods and services.

Kim O'Hara said:

(1) One example is not proof of any general rule.

(2) What's 'good for business' is not necessarily good for people, e.g. industries move off-shore where workers can be freely exploited, putting workers back home out of their

jobs. Closed borders may, on the whole, be better.

Kim

PeterC said:

NAFTA has been around for almost three decades now and despite all the “great sucking sound” rhetoric, there was no group that obviously lost out from it. The border was open for decades before that, agriculture in California and elsewhere has depended on a mobile Mexican workforce for well over half a century.

The problems caused by having an open border have a lot more to do with explicitly illegal actions, eg the demand for drugs in the US and the supply of weapons back into Mexico, the social problems of having a large mobile workforce for the maquiladoras, etc. The phantasm of Mexican criminals in the US is not really an open border problem. The US does perfectly well at generating both indigenous criminal gangs and economic inequity without the help of any other country.

Malcolm wrote:

Like the death squads in Central America, the gangs there gained their criminal expertise in American Institutions, the Military in the case of the former and federal prisons in the case of the latter.

Even so, there is far more to be gained for every one with NAU then lost.

Pax Americana is not without its problems, but the alternative...? It doesn't bear thinking about.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Question about awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

I'm not sure that I'm confused about the distinction between consciousness and awareness other than perhaps in mixing up the two terms, using one term to refer to the other. Both are ambiguous English language words referring to the mental experience of subject-object interaction. Perhaps the Sanskrit terms, clearly defined, would be better to use.

Malcolm wrote:

We have a Sanskrit term we normally use to refer to "consciousness," that is "vijñāna;" not so for the term "awareness."

PadmaVonSamba said:

If, as you say, consciousness + object = awareness (A+B=C) then one would assume that A and B occur prior to their interaction. It seems as though your argument is that neither occur until they interact: there is no A until there is B (and vice-versa). I am familiar with this view, but I would like it explained better.

Malcolm wrote:

No, sense organ (A) plus object (B) gives rise to a sense consciousness (C). Of course there are problems with this basic scheme of the Sarvastivadins, but we take it as a base line, since it is the scheme the Buddha taught as the eighteen sense elements.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Another issue I have with the argument that contact relies on sense-faculties is that there are many examples of living organisms which demonstrate intentional interactions with objects in their external environments, but which, themselves, do not possess brains or sense organs. The simplest example is that of a spermatozoa which is “attracted” by the chemicals given off by the ovum, and swims towards it.

Malcolm wrote:

That is not intentional action, since a spermatozoa has no mind.

However, cetana, volition/intention is a mental factor that arises with all minds in the desire realm, it is one of the ten neutral mental factors.

PadmaVonSamba said:

But there are other examples involving simple yet more complex organisms, certain types of jellyfish, and I think, for example, those microscopic manatee-looking things that supposedly live on the surface of one’s eyelashes.

Malcolm wrote:

In order to have intentions, one must have a mind.

PadmaVonSamba said:

What about the being who is in the bardo, said to be attracted to its future parents? Does it have eye consciousness? Does it possess awareness of the various visions and lights in the bardo? If it does, then by what means is this possible since it has no organ of sight, if not for some kind of innate awareness?

Malcolm wrote:

Bardo beings have complete sense organs and aggregates, according to Abhidharma. What they are unable to see is the sun and moon, since they are apparitionally-born, lacking the solar and lunar elements on their bodies from a female and a male, thus the explanation goes.

PadmaVonSamba said:

BTW, when I said that awareness is “absolute” (and perhaps the word, “consciousness” would have been the correct term) I meant that nobody can deny that it is happening, because to even deny it requires awareness of that denial.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, when we investigated our minds, even though we cannot find anything, we cannot deny there is looking. This is generally termed *gsal rig*, clear and knowing, and is the characteristic of the mind. The essence of the mind is emptiness.

The nature of the mind has three aspects, it is clear, knowing, and empty. Clarity and knowing are somethings collapsed for convenience into clarity, to make it easier to map the resultant three *kāyas* to the causal nature of the mind.

In both Dzogchen and Mahāmudra meditation, one first identifies the clarity aspect by looking for the mind, when it is not found, this is called "sealing clarity with emptiness." When one concludes that despite not being able to find anything, one cannot deny there is an act of looking for the mind, this is called sealing "emptiness with clarity." When one is able to rest in the clear and empty nature of the mind without tending to one side or the other, this is called "sealing inseparability with inseparability."

If there is anything absolute about the nature of the mind, it is the inseparability of clarity and emptiness, which itself is uncompounded, naturally perfected, nonarising, beginningless, and unceasing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: How to avoid heretical/heterodox teachers?

Content:

Nalanda said:

My question is, what is the right attitude towards these teachers who still cling to the practice of that specific deity protector? Should they be avoided altogether?

Malcolm wrote:

Pity.

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Pax Americana is not without its problems, but the alternative...? It doesn't bear thinking about.

PeterC said:

Pax Americana doesn't really involve a lot of pax - the primary beneficiaries seem to be the defense contractors. In the Americas it generally reduces to undermining

governments that don't show sufficient deference to the US. This has never resulted in a country becoming better governed or a more pleasant place to live.

Malcolm wrote:

South Korea, Japan, Taiwan, Germany, England, France, Western Europe in general counter examples.

I will grant that the main benefit of the US for those south of the border is a place to emigrate and work. Our record in Central America is terrible.

PeterC said:

It is very hard to point to a situation where the US intervened in or coerced another country that actually benefited the US, let alone the country itself. That's my real complaint about it - not the methods, the lack of results.

Malcolm wrote:

Since WWII, it has mostly been a CF.

PeterC said:

So I'm not sure what the alternative would be, but if it was nothing, then at least for the Americas that would probably be an improvement.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is my point.

From the NYT today:

Globalism is not mushy government idealism — far from it. It does not deny the existence or importance of government — at the local, state, national and international levels — or of intergovernmental diplomacy. But it insists that the great-power games, as deadly as they have been and could still be, must give way to planetary politics, in which human beings matter more than nationalities. Competition itself is fine and natural, but it needs to be competition to achieve a goal that benefits us all.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/11/12/opinion/biden-foreign-policy.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

PeterC said:

NAFTA has been around for almost three decades now and despite all the “great sucking sound” rhetoric, there was no group that obviously lost out from it. The border



was open for decades before that, agriculture in California and elsewhere has depended on a mobile Mexican workforce for well over half a century.

The problems caused by having an open border have a lot more to do with explicitly illegal actions, eg the demand for drugs in the US and the supply of weapons back into Mexico, the social problems of having a large mobile workforce for the maquiladoras, etc. The phantasm of Mexican criminals in the US is not really an open border problem. The US does perfectly well at generating both indigenous criminal gangs and economic inequity without the help of any other country.

Malcolm wrote:

Like the death squads in Central America, the gangs there gained their criminal expertise in American Institutions, the Military in the case of the former and federal prisons in the case of the latter.

Even so, there is far more to be gained for every one with NAU then lost.

Pax Americana is not without its problems, but the alternative...? It doesn't bear thinking about.

Queequeg said:

All the sense in the world doesn't matter. In the end, you'd lose to the guy who's platform is, "Murca!" Camps on the border, whatever the actual back story, just looks to the ordinary voter like chaos.

Until the border issue is fixed, Dems will continue to get clobbered over the head with it. Doesn't matter that's its manufactured. Its not an issue that Dems can ever lead and win with. It may well be an intractable issue. It will likely get worse.

Needs to be downplayed and other stuff needs the oxygen. That likely means quietly continuing Trump's border policies.

Malcolm wrote:

The border issue will be fixed by good policies south of the border, not a Fortress Amerika mentality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/11/12/opinion/biden-foreign-policy.html>

Queequeg said:

Blah blah. The most elegant ideas don't mean shit if you can't get elected.

The American electorate is not interested in this.

Malcolm wrote:

Then the planet is f\*\*cked. I guess we should only cater to what the American electorate imagines they want, screw everyone else, right?

Well, I'll persist in my idealism, you can keep your cynicism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 14th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

The only important political issue as far as I am concerned is the environment. Everything else doesn't mean shit if that's not fixed. I will vote for the bigoted, America-first, jinogistic red neck promoting solar panels and electric ATVs if I have to.

Malcolm wrote:

That problems we have caused with environment will not be solved through nationalism, it will only be solved through total and complete international cooperation. Nationalism exacerbates climate change.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 2:47 AM

Title: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Austria will confine unvaccinated adults and minors over age 11 to their homes as part of a targeted lockdown, lawmakers announced Sunday.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/11/14/world/europe/austria-unvaccinated-lockdown.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Did guru Rinpoche ask us to be vegetarian?

Malcolm wrote:

Sometimes he did, sometimes he did not. That answer to that is that it is usually practice dependent. For example, if you are engaged in strenuous yantra yoga and tummo, Guru Rinpoche advises in several places is to rely on mild alcohol (chang) and meat. In other places, he strongly discourages people from drinking alcohol and eating meat.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 4:10 AM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Did guru Rinpoche ask us to be vegetarian?

Malcolm wrote:

Sometimes he did, sometimes he did not. That answer to that is that it is usually practice dependent. For example, if you are engaged in strenuous yantra yoga and tummo, Guru Rinpoche advises in several places is to rely on mild alcohol (chang) and meat. In other places, he strongly discourages people from drinking alcohol and eating meat.

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Thanks for this answer Malcolm. That is helpful. This does not address eating meat/drinking beer solely as sustenance. Just in one's mealtimes. Or am I wrong? Is it that someone practicing tummo should eat some meat/beer with their meals? Or that they should eat it in a ritual setting outside of their sustenance?

Malcolm wrote:

It means they should rely on meat and mild alcohol during meals to keep up their strength and stamina. In general, in Mahāyāna one should avoid meat. But in Unsurpassed Yoga Tantra, the consumption of meat is permitted. Despite this, there is a strong inclination to avoid meat other than in feasts. And as the link between industrial agriculture and climate change has become clear, many Buddhists are steering away from meat because of their conscience.

If one is a serious practitioner of Unsurpassed Yoga Tantra, you can eat meat. But one is not, then it is better to avoid it, apart from feasts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 8:00 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

KristenM said:

I'm all for people getting the vaccine, but I don't know about this. How about making proof of vaccine up to the businesses/establishments that choose?

Malcolm wrote:

The legality of Vaccine mandates are well established law in the US. It's state by state however, not federal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 8:45 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

KristenM said:

So is the 2nd Amendment. But, do you agree with it? I'm sure you have a very good argument why the two things are not equivalent, or how they are.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't believe that people have a right to endanger other peoples lives. It's be one think if it these idiots were only harming themselves, but that's not the case.

As for the second amendment, the rulings on it have been nothing short travesties of jurisprudence. I'd repeal it in a second if I could. At the very least I would insist on prohibitive insurance, and strict licensing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 11:21 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

I personally think people need to listen to other's viewpoints on both sides without knee-jerk responses and demonizing.

Malcolm wrote:

Before I listen to anyone, I'll need a firm acknowledgement that Trump is bad for democracy. Failing that, I have nothing to say to Republicans, and no interest in hearing one word they have to say.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

I personally think people need to listen to other's viewpoints on both sides without knee-jerk responses and demonizing.

Malcolm wrote:

Before I listen to anyone, I'll need a firm acknowledgement that Trump is bad for democracy. Failing that, I have nothing to say to Republicans, and no interest in hearing one word they have to say.

KristenM said:

I think a lot of Republicans don't want Trump to run again precisely because of that reason. But I didn't vote for him and don't vote Republican, so...I just wonder if the Democrats are backing themselves in a corner.

Malcolm wrote:

Fascists deserve to be punched, not heard. Because that is what we are facing, American fascism, just as Wallace described it back in 1944.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 10:11 PM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Hello all,

I'm wondering about vegetarianism, especially as it pertains to nyingma traditions. Did guru Rinpoche ask us to be vegetarian? Why is taking a vow of no killing seen as the same as taking a vow not to eat meat?

Also interested in the scriptural bases for vegetarianism in the sutras.

I have been vegetarian for a long time, and am starting to question it, based on my lack of knowledge on what the masters mentioned above actually said about it.

To be clear, I'm not interested in a conversation about the political implications of vegetarianism/veganism.

Thanks so much for your time and i'm really looking forward to what y'all have to say.

seeker242 said:

<http://www.shabkar.org/> has a bunch of references to scripture, teachers, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

The funny thing about Shabkar, is after he goes through all the reasons to not eat meat,

he turns around, in the same text, and goes through the reasons one should eat meat.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Vajrayana. How do I begin my path?

Content:

tingdzin said:

Contrary to what a lot of people are saying, choosing a Vajrayana guru is not something you do "first" when wanting to walk the path, as your initial attraction may be based on something quite trivial in the scheme of things, such as charisma or an over-elaborate list of personal qualifications, or a big organization. There are so many horror stories posted here about people whose initial attraction to a guru, whom they had been sure they would trust with their life, resulted in disaster. That way lies disillusion and inability to stay with the practice.

Malcolm wrote:

That said, one cannot go wrong with teachers like HHDL, HHST sr., Chokyi Nyima, and other senior lamas like them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 11:40 PM

Title: Re: Stained Glass Windows in a Buddhist context?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Perhaps Western sanghas have put the cart before the horse in many situations, acquiring facilities before having a community needing facilities.

Malcolm wrote:

In the case of Tibetan Buddhist communities, this was virtually always done at the encouragement of a lama, with the thinking, "If you build it, they will come."

The reality is quite different. Most of the centers built in the 80's and 90's for example, are aging out, and are not drawing new students. When I see people like Alan Wallace buying multimillion dollar facilities in the middle of nowhere in Colorado, Italy, and New Zealand, I really have to wonder just what he and people like him are thinking.

One of the things I admire about Eric Culumel, the director of Tsadra, is that he has no interest in bricks and mortar. He is only interested in books. He understands that the future of Dharma lies in translations, not expensive properties.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 15th, 2021 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

seeker242 said:

<http://www.shabkar.org/> has a bunch of references to scripture, teachers, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

The funny thing about Shabkar, is after he goes through all the reasons to not eat meat, he turns around, in the same text, and goes through the reasons one should eat meat.

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Is that text translated anywhere?? I would love to read that haha.

Malcolm wrote:

Food of Bodhisattvas: Buddhist Teachings on Abstaining from Meat.

Zhabkar's approach is pragmatic, not dogmatic. He understands that in the Tibetan context, people just are not generally going to live on vegetables, grain, and dairy alone. It is a myth, BTW, that Tibetans could not grow vegetables in Tibet. They grew plenty of things: peas, barely, wheat, etc. They merely selected for things that were could be stored long term, and that excluded fresh vegetables, which require a lot of agricultural resources for a limited return in a cold, dry alpine climate. And of course, Tibetan diets varied regionally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

Charlie123 said:

I would encourage you to use the search bar to read old threads on this subject. This very might be the single most discussed subject in the history of this forum.

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Yah I tried that but it seemed like the threads I was seeing there were not really discussing this topic. Maybe I didn't go back into the results far enough though. I will do more digging.

Hazel said:

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?f=110&t=26037&hilit=the+great+vegan+debate>

51 pages long.

This one might even end up being merged into it.

Malcolm wrote:

Please don't. We are discussing vegetarianism in a specific context, Tibetan Buddhism, thanks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:35 AM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Hello all,

I'm wondering about vegetarianism

Seeker12 said:

...Devadatta asked the Buddha to mandate vegetarianism for the monastics and while the Buddha was fine if individuals voluntarily did so, he refused to mandate it for the entire Sangha.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is well known, and it was also one of the reasons Devadatta went to hell without passing go, as he caused a schism over it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:39 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don't think they want dialogue.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, all they want is power, and f\*\*k democracy if they can't have it. This is all a predictable result of Nixon's Southern Strategy, which played on the Dixiecrat anxiety about civil rights and the absorption of the Dixiecrats into the GOP in the 1970's. The modern GOP playbook is taken right out of the Southern Democrats playbook, post Reconstruction. If you are not reading Heather Cox Richardson's ongoing, daily analysis of what's happening in the news, you should.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Stained Glass Windows in a Buddhist context?

Content:



Matt J said:

This is one of the reasons Tergar doesn't have any Western facilities. Some of the senior leaders were senior Insight Meditation Society instructors, and learned that in order to pay the bills, you need a constant influx of money, which requires constant retreats. Accordingly, YMR chose to invest in online platforms and rents facilities for retreats.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, and then it is mostly paid for by having volunteers, who work for retreats, etc. It's crazy, but even crazier is that at least during the 80's and 90's IMS in Barre, MA was always full, and I think it still is.

The Goenka people at the Vipassana Meditation Center let you go for free, but then they do exit interviews where they hit you up hard for donations. But their place, near by me in Shelburne, MA, is still very busy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Cosmology Question on Eternal Realms

Content:

Seeker12 said:

It appears to me that based on what's written, the Bṛhatphala worlds and the Pure Abodes are never destroyed by the elements, no matter what type of destruction it is (whether by wind, water, or fire).

Why would we then not say that these are eternal realms?

Malcolm wrote:

Well, one, they are conditioned in so far as only never returners can be reborn there, and the fact that all sentient beings, having exhausted there karma for the lower desire and form realm, take birth there.

Seeker12 said:

Is it that they only 'exist' or manifest when there are beings that have the karma to be born in them, and that is not always the case, so otherwise they do not manifest - as such, they themselves are not eternal realms but manifest only dependently in accord with the karma of beings?

Malcolm wrote:

If there were not more never returners, I don't think they would exist. The pure abodes are places where only aryas take birth. The Bṛhatphala is where all the other sentient beings take rebirth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 1:43 AM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

there are plenty of Mahayana sutras where the Buddha discourages meat eating. I am biased but if we have the option to eat meat or not, I feel it is best to not.

Malcolm wrote:

If one is either a Śrāvakayāna practitioner or a Vajrayāna practitioner, eating meat is permitted. If one is a common Mahāyāna practitioner, it appears it is not permitted. But even here, we have the opinion of Bhavaviveka that as long as the meat is pure in three ways, it is permitted, for the same reason that wearing leather, wool, and so on is permitted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 2:27 AM

Title: Re: Commentaries on the Canonical Sutras?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Do we have a collection of sutra commentaries from ancient times (as early as Early Buddhism) to present of every part of the sutra?

For example, if we are reading MA190, and we want to know what the ancient Buddhists think or say about this agama, we could then learn it from their perspective.

Is there something like that I could check whenever I read the agamas?

Malcolm wrote:

You are asking this on the wrong website. Go to dhammawheel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Commentaries on the Canonical Sutras?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I'm hoping not to do that. Meaning I'm hoping to learn only the works of our tradition. Mahayana and Vajrayana. For example, I would like to know what the Mahasanghika, Nagarjuna, Je Tsongkapa would say about a certain passage in the Agamas, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

They discuss the agamas very little.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 6:12 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

I'm sick with covid since a week now and I was fully vaccinated.

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry to hear that and, frankly, were you engaged in risky behavior, nightclubbing, etc?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

I'm sick with covid since a week now and I was fully vaccinated.

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry to hear that and, frankly, were you engaged in risky behavior, nightclubbing, etc?

Toenail said:

I have been to one club 3 weeks ago (it was vaccinated only) . First time in years. But I do not think I have it from there, because my symptoms just started a week ago and all my tests were negative before that. I work in a clinic so I get tested regularly. I also have not used public transportation or seen friends for 2 weeks before. At work I wear FFP2.

Malcolm wrote:

I see, well, clinics are risky places too, especially parts of structures where there is insufficient ventilation, like bathrooms, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 7:15 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

Maybe group therapy setting or 1on1.. But none of my patients has had symptoms. And almost everyone is vaccinated there as well.

I do hear a lot of people getting it though despite having been vaccinated. In my friend circle one other dude at the same time as I. And everyone you ask knows someone who got it or has it despite having been vaccinated. I am pro vaccination btw, I don't mean to make a point against it.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I understand you are vaxx positive.

The Pfizer and Moderna vaccines are not designed to provide high immunity from Delta, they are based on an older variant. I am afraid as long as there is fear of vaccines out there, and people refuse to get vaccinated, we will be getting boosters every six months, and the real issue is that fact that the first world is not rolling out vaccines to the rest of the world rapidly enough.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 7:55 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

I've heard immunity after having contracted it is more efficient than the immunity you get from vaccination.

Malcolm wrote:

Don't think there is any clinical evidence for this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

I've heard immunity after having contracted it is more efficient than the immunity you get from vaccination.

Malcolm wrote:

Don't think there is any clinical evidence for this.

Toenail said:

It is the opinion of the leading virologist dude of the Berlin Charite. I saw it in a recent interview with him.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, no clinical evidence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 9:31 AM

Title: Re: Commentaries on the Canonical Sutras?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Do you know of any Mahayana commentaries on the Agama contents?

Malcolm wrote:

Doesn't exist.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, the long and short of it is that natural immunity -can- be more effective than vaccination but probably is not overall due to things like it's varying durability, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

I have seen opinions which contradict this completely.

I would like to see clinical evidence. Not opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 10:50 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, the long and short of it is that natural immunity -can- be more effective than vaccination but probably is not overall due to things like it's varying durability, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

I have seen opinions which contradict this completely.

I would like to see clinical evidence. Not opinions.

Johnny Dangerous said:

It's been known for a while, but I'm not hunting down the study, I'm not making it up. It was accepted by the medical community AFAIK with some caveats. It's been out and known about for months, and a subject of debate.

Malcolm wrote:

Subject to debate means no clinical evidence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 10:59 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It's been known for a while, but I'm not hunting down the study, I'm not making it up. It was accepted by the medical community AFAIK with some caveats. It's been out and known about for months, and a subject of debate.

Malcolm wrote:

Subject to debate means no clinical evidence.

Johnny Dangerous said:

That is true of most things with Covid, it is too new to have anything but provisional clinical evidence in many areas. I posted the study, it is not a study that anyone has found problems with or takes issue with, it simply hasn't been peer reviewed yet, and of course other studies have found other things.

Natural immunity for Covid exists obviously, not sure why you'd want to debate that, it's kind of a no-brainer.

Malcolm wrote:

The thing I am asserting is that there is no clinical evidence that natural immunity is superior to immunity from vaccines.

I don't think this is true, I know people personally who had covid 1.0, were fully vaxxed afterwards, and still managed to contract covid 2.0 aka delta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 11:04 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That is true of most things with Covid, it is too new to have anything but provisional clinical evidence in many areas. I posted the study, it is not a study that anyone has found problems with or takes issue with, it simply hasn't been peer reviewed yet, and of course other studies have found other things.

Natural immunity for Covid exists obviously, not sure why you'd want to debate that, it's kind of a no-brainer.

Malcolm wrote:

The thing I am asserting is that there is no clinical evidence that natural immunity is superior to immunity from vaccines.

I don't think this is true, I know people personally who had covid 1.0, were fully vaxxed afterwards, and still managed to contract covid 2.0 aka delta.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Again I posted the link to the study, so I am not sure what we are trying to debate. Yes, other studies found that natural immunity is more variable, and less durable, though sometimes perhaps more efficacious. Obviously, anecdotal stuff is probably not worth addressing if we are trying to stick to data that currently exists.

Malcolm wrote:

My point is that we don't have clinical evidence for the claims you are making. Data is not evidence. Public health evidence can be distilled from data, but we are not there yet.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 11:30 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Again, there is even less clinical evidence for things like cloth masks (basically none other than poorly done mechanistic studies and observational data), yet we still use them. Virtually no evidence for masking young children, and it is pretty much just the Boneheaded US doing that in schools.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.pnas.org/content/118/4/e2014564118>

<https://med.stanford.edu/news/all-news/2021/09/surgical-masks-covid-19.html>

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7263249/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 11:43 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

One of those is the Indian study I mentioned earlier (surgical masks), the other two are not RCT's, they are observational studies, etc... nor are they are about cloth masks.

from the last link

"There are few published data on the efficacy of masks or respirators against coronavirus infections."

The study on natural immunity I posted is more reliable (being an RCT) than either of the other two studies and is more comparable to the Indian study, by my understanding.

I started wearing surgical masks based on the indian study, btw.

Malcolm wrote:

Covid is airborne, this has been proven by physicists.

Masks work.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 11:47 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

One of those is the Indian study I mentioned earlier (surgical masks), the other two are not RCT's, they are observational studies, etc... nor are they are about cloth masks.

from the last link

The study on natural immunity I posted is more reliable (being an RCT) than either of the other two studies and is more comparable to the Indian study, by my understanding.

I started wearing surgical masks based on the indian study, btw.

Malcolm wrote:

Covid is airborne, this has been proven by physicists.

Masks work.

Johnny Dangerous said:

FFS man, I'm not saying "masks don't work", but if you honestly think it is that simple you really haven't looked at the data that closely. yes, wearing an N95 -definitely- works, there is some decent evidence for surgical masks, and not much for cloth masks. That is the state of the data.

Malcolm wrote:

Why would anyone think wearing less than a n95, etc., be adequate? Even surgical masks are less effective.

<https://www.wired.com/story/the-teeny-tiny-scientific-screwup-that-helped-covid-kill/>

At this point, we are talking past each other.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 11:53 AM



Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.  
Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Anyway, most people I see are wearing shoddy things that might prevent some goobers flying your way but I am skeptical they do a whole lot personally.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, these people are dumb, but not as dumb as the unvaxxed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 12:07 PM

Title: Re: On vegetarianism

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

there are plenty of Mahayana sutras where the Buddha discourages meat eating. I am biased but if we have the option to eat meat or not, I feel it is best to not.

Malcolm wrote:

If one is either a Śrāvakayāna practitioner or a Vajrayāna practitioner, eating meat is permitted. If one is a common Mahāyāna practitioner, it appears it is not permitted. But even here, we have the opinion of Bhavaviveka that as long as the meat is pure in three ways, it is permitted, for the same reason that wearing leather, wool, and so on is permitted.

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Would you care to elaborate on those three pure ways? Or point me to where I can learn about that?

Malcolm wrote:

You didn't hear it, see it, or have it killed for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Stained Glass Windows in a Buddhist context?

Content:

Queequeg said:

but I'm afraid we're going to go deep into a phase of human history soon where material profligacy is simply not going to be an option due to scarcity and expense of resources.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we are heading back to the good old days where excess material profligacy will a required sign of power among people where virtually everyone is surviving on a subsistence level. Those good old days were just three hundred years ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Credibility of (institutional) Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

nyonchung said:

Materialism being often a bedfellow of nihilism.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends. I find that materialists are much more attached to things than Buddhists, in general. Just because someone does not accept rebirth does not render them a nihilist. Materialists also have strong theories in ethics, morals, and so on. The term "nihilist" is tossed around promiscuously by Buddhists, when they actually mean "annihilationist."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 16th, 2021 at 9:53 PM

Title: Re: How does Karma purification work?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

This is a point I have seen quite often. And I mean ... it probably kind of probably works like that but I am not sure entirely. Anyone has something to back this point?

Malcolm wrote:

This is a popular idea in the west. I have never ever seen any Indian or Tibetan text that makes this assertion. I think it can be consigned to the dustbin of pop Buddhism, personally.

Toenail said:

Maybe not in some classic text or treatise etc., but I have seen such ideas in Tibetan texts. For example in the Life story of Yeshe Tsogyal (?) where it is written that she did prostrations during Ngondro or so and blood and puss came out of her orifices or so until she was fully purified. It was described as purification. It may just be prose and fantasy., but it is in there.

Malcolm wrote:

I am just going on the basis of logic, and what ChNN said. It is unreasonable to expect that Vajrasattva, for example, and wipe out countless eons of negative karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Self-generation with transmission

Content:

Hazel said:

Hello Dharma friends,

I have been given transmission and permission to practice a Sadhana that includes visualizing yourself as the deity. My understanding is that without empowerment, you can only front-visualize even if you have transmission. Is this correct?

Thank you!

Hazel.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 1:04 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So yeah, the US is no shining example of consistency or evidence based practice. I mean, they try their best, but sometimes people's best is not very good.

Malcolm wrote:

This is because of the 5 micron dogma about airborne diseases. Anything larger, according to epidemiology manuals used around the world for the last 80 years, must be droplet transmitted.

But, we found out a) that those manuals had the physics wrong, and b) covid transmission is principally airborne. So for this reason, since the covid virus is larger than 5 microns, medical establishment dogma set in, despite obvious contradictory evidence, like the early transmission through ventilation systems on cruise ships, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 1:44 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

Should we just punch everyone in the face for voting for these people, is that going to really make things better? Yes, of course, that's the best solution, so never mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Have you ever seen that talking with Fascists ever solved anything? I mean, look, the

Germans tried it, it didn't work, the Fascists just subverted democracy in Germany, with the help of a conservative newspaper (sound familiar) that was filled with xenophobic lies and fake news.

We can only tolerate intolerance for so long. Its getting to the point where that tolerance is not working, and the arguments of the Bannons and his ilk are not being effectively rebutted in the news (well they are, but people don't trust the newspapers anymore, they trust Tucker and Sean).

Don't worry, I am not going to go out and actually look for fascists to punch, I haven't done that since I was a skinhead back in the early 80's. But my point is that we have a Fascist fifth column in the US right now, and they need to be put down with prejudice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Great news on the vajrayana book front

Content:

Norwegian said:

Anybody knows who are translating the Nyingma volumes from the gdams ngag mdzod and when they are to be published?

Malcolm wrote:

Wulstan Fletcher and Helena Blankleder. No idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 7:03 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

but the entirety of our experience is the obscuration.

Malcolm wrote:

That would make bondage inherent and liberation impossible. You sure you want to go down that route?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 7:06 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

We've been here before. It did not end well.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, and people poo pooed me here six years ago when I first raised the alarm about

Fascists in the house.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 9:57 AM

Title: Re: Commentaries on the Canonical Sutras?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Maybe a more controversial claim,

Malcolm wrote:

It's not at all controversial, it's obvious.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:10 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

KristenM said:

I'd at least like to try to bring some sense and reason to the table and dial the rhetoric down a notch, for the sake of the country.

Malcolm wrote:

The problem is that we have a genuine Fascist movement now in this country. They won't dial down the rhetoric, it's all they have.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:41 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

This question is much easier to understand/answer now. It really is something approaching a mass-collective psychosis. When it is happening in real time, there is virtually no way to undo it. The libidinal investment is so strong that there basically has to be a big crash landing for it to end.

Malcolm wrote:

This is what Wilhelm Reich thought.

KristenM said:

It's not like we ever had an actual Golden Age of Justice and Democracy, we're just going sideways down the wrong path and some of us are now more aware of the forces that are in play. And how do we respond to this neo-fascist movement? Do we take up

arms and fight them in the streets? We don't even believe in taking up arms, I thought.

Malcolm wrote:

It's been pretty good since WWII.

One of the reasons FDR passed the New Deal was to prevent a right wing fascist movement from gaining power. America First started in the 1930's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

It will just take a few kalpas

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, it will never happen. sentient beings are limitless.

PadmaVonSamba said:

"Limitless" only if you are thinking in terms of quantity.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I am, relatively speaking.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 9:25 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

but the entirety of our experience is the obscuration.

Malcolm wrote:

That would make bondage inherent and liberation impossible. You sure you want to go down that route?

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Brunnhölzl has already gone down that route for me. The sentient being cannot become a Buddha. The sentient being has to cease in order for a Buddha to arise. It's like the cessation of a Shrivakayana Arhat, but unlike the coma-like nothingness of an Arhat, a Buddha arises. That is what I've been trying to bring people's attention to. Play the video. It's short. If people are impatient then can fast forward to 1:30.

Malcolm wrote:

I doubt very much that Karl is an annihilationist. You have really misunderstood his point, quite grievously. What he and the karmapas are implying is that there never were sentient beings to begin with. This is not controversial. Haribhadra, a Madhyamaka, points out that when one realizes buddhahood, one realizes too there was never a time when one was not a buddha. This insight does not depend on the Buddhanature doctrine at all, since it is straight out of the PP Sutras. Moreover, it is commonly stated that from the point of view of the result, Buddhas only perceive other Buddhas, they do not perceive sentient beings, because to perceive obscurations would equal being obscured. Buddhas have no obscurations, hence they do not perceive them, ergo, they have no perception of sentient beings at all. Thus is another reason why Haribhadra points out that the path is entirely illusory from beginning to end, including the attainment of buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The video is short. People following this thread should watch the entire thing. It's ridiculous to discuss what Brunnhölzl means if we don't listen to what he says.

Malcolm wrote:

I did. I know Karl. I am sure Karl is quite sure he exists, conventionally speaking, and is equally confident he will realize buddhahood eventually, that his rosary of moments of empty clarity, the all-basis, will continue through the state of Vajradharahood, once his adventitious obscurations are eliminated. What he is talking about is the consequences, as he sees it, of the point of view of Karmapa III and VIII. But as I outline above, this is not the radical departure you imagine it to be.

Your idea is the radical misunderstanding of what he is saying.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 9:58 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Funny that "my interpretation" got placed in the title of the video!

Malcolm wrote:

No, the only thing related to the title of the video and your misunderstanding is the adjective "radical".

And you have failed to address my objections, since they undermine the "radicalness" of Karl's observation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:20 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

You are characterizing what he is saying as "not controversial" I am saying it is radical. The title of the video is about how radical Buddha Nature can be.

I think you're the one that is mistaken here.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course you do. What he is saying is radical and novel to those who have not studied Abhisamayālaṃkāra. Nāgārjuna states in the Verses of Dependent Origination:

Here, there is nothing to remove,  
there is nothing to add;  
See the real correctly.  
Having seen the real, liberation.

This statement is cited verbatim by Maitreyanātha in the Abhisamayālaṃkāra.

Karl is saying nothing more than this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Physical issues around sitting

Content:

NoName said:

Hi,

I don't know if this is right to put here, but I have a physical issue with a varicose vein that makes sitting still not particularly safe for me. It is annoyingly placed under the knee, so any position where the knee is bent, including chair meditation can potentially exacerbate it. I can sometimes sit with my leg stretched, or further out, or in a keeling sit with legs spread wider, but it is not ideal.

Are there any traditions where the sitting practice is not necessary, or where I can sit in a variation of a pose/change it up in a while? Are there any recommendations for particular poses that I should try out?

Thank you



Malcolm wrote:

You can sit with that knee raised up, like this:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:28 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

You are characterizing what he is saying as "not controversial" I am saying it is radical. The title of the video is about how radical Buddha Nature can be.

I think you're the one that is mistaken here.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course you do. What he is saying is radical and novel to those who have not studied Abhisamayālaṃkāra of Haribhadra. Nāgārjuna states in the Verses of Dependent Origination:

Here, there is nothing to remove,  
there is nothing to add;  
See the real correctly.  
Having seen the real, liberation.

This statement is cited verbatim by Maitreya-nātha in the Abhisamayālaṃkāra.

Karl is saying nothing more than this.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

OK, time to transcribe the video word for word. That won't happen fast, probably not today.

Malcolm wrote:

You are wasting your time. What Karl says is nothing more than the above. The problem with your position is that it makes obscurations inherently existing obstacles to buddhahood. That's not what Karl is talking about.

What Karl is talking about is taking a facet of buddhanature theory to a logical extreme, which is that idea that the Uttaratantra is wrong, that buddhanature cannot be a "possession" of sentient beings. But as I said, this is not a problem at all. Buddhanature is a provisional doctrine, according to the Uttaratantra itself, taught to eliminate five faults. It is training wheels for baby bodhisattvas who are scared of emptiness.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 10:55 PM  
Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
Christ. We're dealing with hurt little boys who haven't gotten over their myths.

Malcolm wrote:  
Bannon is a Catholic, pretty serious one too, at least ideologically. He is pretty open about his fantasies:  
"We're at the very beginning stages of a very brutal and bloody conflict, of which, if the people in this room, the people in the church, do not bind together and really form what I feel is an aspect of the church militant, to really be able to not just stand with our beliefs, but to fight for our beliefs against this new barbarity that's starting."

Not surprisingly, Flynn is also Catholic, who said the other day:  
"If we are going to have one nation under God, which we must, we have to have one religion. One nation under God and one religion under God."  
These people are dangerous. They must be put in their place.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, November 17th, 2021 at 11:11 PM  
Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching  
Content:

Matt J said:  
Making a similar point in When the Clouds Part, it is only "somewhat shocking."

"[S]entient beings are nothing but the adventitious flaws of thoughts and therefore one familiarizes with them as being nonentities."

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, flaws of the thoughts (sems)...The funny thing is, in Tibetan, sentient being is "sems can" "possessor of a mind." Well, without a mind, there can't be flaws of thoughts, can there?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 12:21 AM  
Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching  
Content:

Nicholas2727 said:  
I thought the attainment of Buddhahood was not illusory? What is the point of working so hard for so many life times if the final result is an illusion? Maybe I have gotten this

bias since many teachers or authors I have read lean in the Shentong direction, but maybe you can clarify.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to read the Heart Sutra:

There is no wisdom, nothing to obtain, and also nothing not to obtain.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

6 of 9 Supreme Court Justices are also Catholic, though I can't imagine Sotomayor lining up with the other ones.

Malcolm wrote:

This is quite deliberate on the part of the people who wish to overturn Roe.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Dune

Content:

Matt J said:

Spoilers, but on point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

6 of 9 Supreme Court Justices are also Catholic, though I can't imagine Sotomayor lining up with the other ones.

Malcolm wrote:

This is quite deliberate on the part of the people who wish to overturn Roe.

Queequeg said:

They're banking on that pernicious guilt inculcated in Catholic School. Wow.

Malcolm wrote:

The vanguard of the Pro-Life movement has always been Catholics. Remember the recent outrage at Joe Biden taking communion?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 1:14 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Therefore emptiness, yet not only emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, because the mind is relative and momentary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: The Myth of Progress

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

But limitless beings (buddhas) aren't sentient.

Malcolm wrote:

Silly. Of course buddhas are sentient.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 5:27 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

Also the vivid, wakeful awareness that some people don't like to talk about.

Malcolm wrote:

You mean rig pa. Rig pa is also empty, baseless, and not established in anyway at all. The Dzogchen tantras and Longchenpa declare this univocally.

Matt J said:

Retinue of nonexistent superficial appearances, listen!

There is no separate object in me, the view of self-originated pristine consciousness.

Passing away in the past does not exist. Arising in

the future does not exist. Appearing in the present does not exist in any way. Karma does not exist. Traces do not exist. Ignorance does not exist. Mind does not exist.

Intellect does not exist. Wisdom does not exist. Saṃsāra does not exist. Nirvāṇa does not exist. Not even vidyā (rig pa) itself exists. Not even the appearances of pristine consciousness exist. All those arose from a nonexistent apprehender.

Malcolm wrote:

-- Tantra Without Syllables.

This "nonexistent apprehender," indicates the union of the two truths. Even rig pa is something relative, that is why it is a path dharma, not a result dharma. It vanishes at the time of the result.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 7:05 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

tobes said:

This position leaves a lot of questions begging. Namely: if Buddhas do not perceive obscurations of sentient beings, then what of upaya? What of teaching Dharma itself, which is contextually attuned to the specific afflictions of specific sentient beings? i.e. the point of view of the result is not the only relevant point of view here.

Malcolm wrote:

The general example is the wish-fulfilling gem. Buddha activity is spontaneous, and manifests because of their aspirations as bodhisattvas on the path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 9:30 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Have I misunderstood even some Shentong teachers through reading and listening that they view Buddhahood as not illusory tho? I would have to find some exact quotes and possibly re-read them, but I remember it sounding like they were saying Buddhahood is real/not illusory. Don't mean to take this too far off track either  
There's not just one way to look at this. So I'm sure some people say that.

conebeckham said:

For instance, 8th Karmapa says, in his commentary on the Abhisamayalamkara, that Tathagatagarbha is the only ultimately real entity, and that this entity and sentient beings are mutually exclusive. It is not the case that sentient beings possess Buddha Nature. Instead, Sentient being seem to exist in Buddha Nature, like clouds in the sky which do not actually affect the sky. Paraphrasing from Brunnholz, When the Clouds Part.

Malcolm wrote:

I'll need to look at the Tibetan text itself before I believe this is what Karmapa VIII intended to say. Sound bites on Dharmawheel are not conclusive of anything.

And quite frankly, Tibetan scholars make errors. If such an opinion cannot be grounded in both scripture and reasoning, it should be disregarded as erroneous, no matter whose opinion it is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 9:44 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

What Tibetan word is "apprehender" here?

Also, how does anyone know if it vanishes at the time of result if there is no knowing/cognition/awareness?

Malcolm wrote:

This "nonexistent apprehender," indicates the union of the two truths. Even rig pa is something relative, that is why it is a path dharma, not a result dharma. It vanishes at the time of the result.

'dzin pa, as far as I recall.

Buddhas possess nonreferential gnosis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:14 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

And quite frankly, Tibetan scholars make errors. If such an opinion cannot be grounded in both scripture and reasoning, it should be disregarded as erroneous, no matter whose opinion it is.

The entire premise of this thread is based on the Brunnhölzl video linked in the first post. The premise of that video is that Brunnhölzl is responding to the idea that Buddha Nature is, or at least can be, a radical Teaching. He is deliberately responding with what is probably the most outrageous interpretation of Buddha Nature which he credits to both HHK8 and HHK3. So I don't think "error" enters into the equation no matter how much it conflicts with more mainstream thought. That's the point--it's radical!

Malcolm wrote:

If it's wrong, it is just wrong. But as I said, I'll need to look at the text itself. For example, what is KVIII definition here of Buddhanature and so on? As we know, tathagatagarbha has been defined in sutras from the all-basis consciousness to dharmakaya and everything in between.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:25 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

PeterC said:

The quoted language is a little polemical, but who knows in what context it was said. However he's not really wrong. If you had to choose between a library of a thousand dzogchen texts but no master ever, and one hour of instruction from a qualified teacher, you should always choose the latter. And there is something about having the right explanation at the right time that makes the difference between a load of vague-sounding words and a precise sense of what is being explained.

Malcolm wrote:

It's certainly true that if one has not received transmission of any Vajrayana material, one should not be reading it. This does not apply only to Dzogchen, it applies to everything in Vajrayana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:29 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I'm no court stenographer, so there could be an error here or there, but here's my transcript of the video in question. I'm starting the transcription around 1:15 into the video since it isn't pertinent to the thread and I wanted to save myself some work.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, it is a sound bite. It leaves a whole range of questions unanswered, how is Buddhanature being defined here and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:47 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I'm no court stenographer, so there could be an error here or there, but here's my transcript of the video in question. I'm starting the transcription around 1:15 into the video since it isn't pertinent to the thread and I wanted to save myself some work.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, it is a sound bite. It leaves a whole range of questions unanswered, how is Buddhanature being defined here and so on.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

From the same interview session he defines Buddha Nature in this video:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RmB7lZm3jBc>

Malcolm wrote:

The question is not Karl's definition, but Karmapa's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:55 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

From the same interview session he defines Buddha Nature in this video:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RmB7lZm3jBc>

Malcolm wrote:

The question is not Karl's definition, but Karmapa's.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Oh.

Malcolm wrote:

Now you get it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

tobes said:

This position leaves a lot of questions begging. Namely: if Buddhas do not perceive obscurations of sentient beings, then what of upaya? What of teaching Dharma itself, which is contextually attuned to the specific afflictions of specific sentient beings? i.e. the point of view of the result is not the only relevant point of view here.

Malcolm wrote:

The general example is the wish-fulfilling gem. Buddha activity is spontaneous, and manifests because of their aspirations as bodhisattvas on the path.

tobes said:

But how can it manifest in a way that specifically addresses the very particular obscurations of sentient beings, if it does not have the capacity to see/understand/perceive/apprehend those obscurations?



Malcolm wrote:

The same way a wish fulfilling gem grants whatever is wished to anyone who encounters it, spontaneously, according to their wishes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 9:11 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

haha said:

It says the Buddha-potential is named after its result and all beings possess the buddha essence.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, however the sound bite version being promulgated here states the opposite, Buddhanature is not a possession of sentient beings, and that they cannot enjoy the result.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 10:07 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

What Tibetan word is "apprehender" here? '

Also, how does anyone know if it vanishes at the time of result if there is no knowing/cognition/awareness?

Malcolm wrote:

'dzin pa.

At that point, all that remains is omniscience, like every other presentation of buddhahood. There are some variations in how that works. Some maintain, Gelukapas mostly, that buddhas need to have conceptual apparatus capable of seeing the faults of sentient beings. Others, Sakya, Nyingmas, etc., negate this, because relative truth is defined from the point of view of sentient beings, and buddhas are free of all obscurations and only have pure vision.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 11:39 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

Omniscience literally means "all knowing," the science being the correlate of "jna" in Sanskrit (as in sarvajna) in this translation. So knowing is present, not absent.

Malcolm wrote:  
It is also relative, not ultimate.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, November 18th, 2021 at 11:51 PM  
Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching  
Content:

Matt J said:  
Query: What, then, is the innate mind?  
Reply: It is simply this natural awareness (tha mal gyi shes pa) in one's own mind-stream in the present moment.

Malcolm wrote:  
This passage is not correctly translated because Higgins mistakes a genitive for an locative:

'o na gnyug ma'i sems ni gang zhe na de ni da ltar rang rgyud kyi tha mal gyi shes pa 'di'o

"If it is asked what is the innate mind, that is the ordinary consciousness of one's continuum at this moment."

The distinction between the locative case and the genitive case here is crucial. All this means is that the so-called "innate mind" is the clarity aspect of the all-basis. Also he mistakes for a locative, the dative "da ltar," it is an easy mistake to make in Tibetan since they have the same morphology, and the difference is context driven.

Otherwise, the problem arises of supposing there are two minds.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 12:16 AM  
Title: Re: An Important Reminder  
Content:  
SilenceMonkey said:  
(Or, as Lama Pema's teacher said, before realizing them?)

Malcolm wrote:  
As Jetsun Drakpa Gyaltsen has said:

Until it has been realized,  
do not discuss the view in words.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

I think your translation makes the point stronger, actually. Buddhanature is not a possession. Per Higgins, Mikyo Dorje's whole point is that deluded mind doesn't become pure mind--- rather, once, the impure mind is destroyed, only the pure mind remains. So it is not that the alayavijnana is a deluded tathagatgarbha, but rather the alayavijnana IS the delusion.

Malcolm wrote:

So there are two minds now? One impure, the other pure? So nine consciousnesses, rather than eight? Sapan already dispensed with this absurdity. The gnyug ma sems is just the clarity aspect of the all-basis consciousness, that's the point.

This is one of the problems with tathāgatagarbha theory. You have one sūtra proclaiming it is dharmakāya encased in afflictions; another claiming it is just a name for ālayavijñāna. The Yogacārins, as Karl correctly points out, won't have anything to do with it. And then you have Tibetans with too much time on their hands trying to reconcile all these conflicting doctrines, which do not actually have to be reconciled at all.

Just stick with Prasanga. You'll be happier.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 2:59 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

undefineable said:

Alayavijnana may seem to be another matter, since it's widely agreed that -in some manner of speaking- it doesn't survive enlightenment.

Malcolm wrote:

There are two ways to understand this: one is that ālayavijñāna vanishes when the seeds it contains are exhausted (Vasubandu in Karmasiddhiprakarana). The other is that it undergoes a transformation into gnosis, along with the other skandhas. They are not discarded, they are subject to a "a transformation in the basis" or as Karl has it, "a fundamental change" (āśrayaparivṛitti). His section on ālayavijñāna in the introduction to his translation of the Mahāyāna Samgraha is worth reading. Also the relationship between dharmakāya and ālayavijñāna is discussed in chapter 10 of the MS, pg. 238. The main problem with Yogacāra that everyone points out, is that there is a internal

contradiction when one claims something compounded (the ālayavijñāna) transforms into something uncompounded (the dharmakāya).

In short, the one cannot really appreciate the nuances of Yogacara, tathāgatagarbha theory from soundbites of videos of scholars on the internet. Its not even responsible to present these teachings in that way.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 3:16 AM

Title: Re: How to read Tathāgatagarbha Sūtra?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Is it supposed to be read allegorically or literally? Is there a way to read this without having some sort of misunderstanding of other standard doctrines?

Malcolm wrote:

allegorically

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

I don't get why we can't appreciate different presentations without needing to assert the superiority of one over the other, or reducing one into the other.

Malcolm wrote:

We can, but Candrakīrti's presentation is the best, when all is said and done.

I don't study these things for their aesthetics, though there is much that is aesthetically pleasing in Yogacāra theory. I study these things for my practice. And the traditions in which I practice, Sakya and Dzogchen, for many reasons, find Madhyamaka to be the definitive Mahāyāna view. Also the Indian Buddhist tantras show a clear bias towards Madhyamaka.

Anyway, you quote Shakya Chogden, you should always remember that Shakya Chogden's view was kicked out of Sakya by the protector Caturmukha Mahākāla in favor of Gorampa's. And in truth it is not even clear that gshan stong was really his final view. It's been speculated that since his main sponsors were Kagyus, he was writing for his audience.

Actually, the problem with Tibetans, and I have said this before, is that because Ratnakāraśānti asserted in his Madhyamaka texts that Asanga was a third stage bodhisattva and Nāgārjuna was a first stage bodhisattva, and also the main translator of them, Śāntibhadra, was hostile to Candrakīrti's school, there has been a push amongst

Tibetans to reconcile the treatises of Maitreya and Nāgarjuna.

Personally, I see no need to reconcile Madhyamaka with Yogacāra, since the former is higher than the latter; and even Karl admits that the gzhan stong approach to the three natures, for example, is not preceded in the Indian traditions from which the gzhan stong school draws its inspiration.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 4:01 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

The point of the snake-rope analogy generally is because once the illusion is removed, there is nothing left to be done. You don't remove the snake then create, build, or cultivate the rope. Nor is there nothing at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes there is, then you examine the rope. If you don't, well, you haven't finished your job. You are settling for another appearance, true relative truth, instead of false relative truth, but still not ultimate truth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So there are two minds now? One impure, the other pure? So nine consciousnesses, rather than eight? Sapan already dispensed with this absurdity. The gnyug ma sems is just the clarity aspect of the all-basis consciousness, that's the point.

Matt J said:

That's Mikyo Dorje's formulation, not mine.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I am pointing out this idea has already been negated, and that there is no doubt Mikyo Dorje is aware of this.

And I not sure, in this little sound bite exchange, if this is really representative of Mikyo Dorje's views. As I understand things, Mikyo Dorje went through a number of shifts in his life, like Shakya Chogden, Tsongkhapa, Dolbupa, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Same here. I feel like at different times different presentations have helped my practice, but picking one as some forever -definitive view above all the other views isn't a thing that attracts me in particular, because for me all the argumentation and assertion is annoying and pulls me away from simple things like maintaining presence in daily life.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you see here we are talking about a tenet system. Even though Karl can claim this is about practice, it isn't. It is about analyzing texts and what they say, and my point, is that these issues are too intricate and complicated to be well addressed by the presentations of sound bites.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 5:31 AM

Title: Re: Self-generation with transmission

Content:

Hazel said:

Hello Dharma friends,

I have been given transmission and permission to practice a Sadhana that includes visualizing yourself as the deity. My understanding is that without empowerment, you can only front-visualize even if you have transmission. Is this correct?

Thank you!

Hazel.

zerwe said:

Yes, this is usually correct. If you are uncertain I would follow up with whoever gave the transmission. However, HYT sadhanas are absolutely restricted to only those who have received a complete "Great" initiation.

Shaun

Hazel said:

How can one tell the difference between a HYT and a non-HYT sadhana?

Malcolm wrote:

For novices, it is not so easy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:15 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The Brunnhölzl video is from the Tsadra Foundation website that is focused on Buddha Nature. They have staff person that will answer questions for free. His credentials are quite good.

Malcolm wrote:

The point I am making is that you seem to think that these issues, which come from long, complicated texts, with complex intellectual histories, can be encapsulated in sound bites.

But they can't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:23 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

tobes said:

I also think they're very complementary, and if one is practicing rather than intellectualising, a lot of these apparent inconsistencies dissolve into irrelevancy.

I thought it was interesting how Jay Garfield - who as we all know has been schooled in Gelug Prasangika with special emphasis on Chandrakirti - recently took a bit of a Yogacaran turn. I haven't listened to all of the lectures, but the gist of it is: Yogacara gives more detail on the subjective-phenomenological side, which is generally quite implicit in Madhyamaka.

Malcolm wrote:

The Madhyamaka school has always focused more on view, whereas the Yogacara school focuses more on the path — this is obvious from looking at their respective texts. This is not news.

As for Jay, he is expert in Western Philosophy, including Bishop Berkeley's idealism, and has been teaching the latter at Sarnath to Tibetans there for almost three decades. His interest in Yogacara idealism is longstanding, not nascent. We are acquainted as he and my late father were colleagues at Smith College.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:30 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Same here. I feel like at different times different presentations have helped my practice, but picking one as some forever -definitive view above all the other views isn't a thing that attracts me in particular, because for me all the argumentation and assertion is

annoying and pulls me away from simple things like maintaining presence in daily life.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you see here we are talking about a tenet system. Even though Karl can claim this is about practice, it isn't. It is about analyzing texts and what they say, and my point, is that these issues are too intricate and complicated to be well addressed by the presentations of sound bites.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Naw, it's about a lot more than analyzing texts for me, though they can certainly be part of it. Exactitude in language only goes so far, though sure it can be vital at certain times.

Malcolm wrote:

When we are discussing a complicated treatise such as the one this sound bite has been extracted, it is pure dilettantism to imagine one has understood the entirety of the thought of a sophisticated scholar like Mikyo Dorje based on such a snippet, especially a scholar whose work demonstrates a marked shift in views over several decades.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:38 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The Brunnhölzl video is from the Tsadra Foundation website that is focused on Buddha Nature. They have staff person that will answer questions for free. His credentials are quite good.

Malcolm wrote:

The point I am making is that you seem to think that these issues, which come from long, complicated texts, with complex intellectual histories, can be encapsulated in sound bites.

But they can't.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My doctor doesn't have to put me through med school to tell me what's wrong with me. He summarizes it.

So I posted a link to a reputable source that has expertise in the subjects. I've not had direct contact, but he's there to answer questions. Somebody might find that useful.

Malcolm wrote:

My issue is not that you posted the sound bite, but that you presented it as a definitive



take on this masters oeuvre. It's as dumb as people who represent Sapan as rejecting tathagatagarbha based on the fact that he refers to Candrakirti's opinion, failing to pay attention to the preceding verses as well his other works. I have no problem with what Karl said, we are colleagues and we correspond, he is one of best scholars working in the field. The point is not what he said, the point is how you present it. Abd in my opinion, irresponsibly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:41 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Naw, it's about a lot more than analyzing texts for me, though they can certainly be part of it. Exactitude in language only goes so far, though sure it can be vital at certain times.

Malcolm wrote:

When we are discussing a complicated treatise such as the one this sound bite has been extracted, it is pure dilettantism to imagine one has understood the entirety of the thought of a sophisticated scholar like Mikyo Dorje based on such a snippet, especially a scholar whose work demonstrates a marked shift in views over several decades.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don't really know what you're on about specifically, but you're not my teacher and I don't need to be called a dillettante for not thinking like you, so we can simply agree to disagree, and I'll leave the thread to you and your insistence that everyone be on your page.

Malcolm wrote:

I didn't call you a dilettante. Read it again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:47 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So, you can verify there is no external world? You can prove experientially that the server you are reading this on is just a ripening of traces in your own mind stream? Or are you a half-eggist? I mean, seriously, who you kidding here? The ultimate of the lower is the relative of the higher. Ultimates represent conceptual limitations. Tenet systems exist to reveal and expose these conceptual limitations, so that we don't reify things in practice like "everything is mind" or "Buddhanature is like the sky", "Sentient beings and

Buddhanature are mutually exclusive” etc.

Matt J said:

I disagree--- these are clearly descriptions of practice that can be verified first hand, not intellectual positions to be believed. They are just put into a specific conceptual framework.

I don't get why we can't appreciate different presentations without needing to assert the superiority of one over the other, or reducing one into the other.

Malcolm wrote:

We can, but Candrakīrti's presentation is the best, when all is said and done.

I don't study these things for their aesthetics, though there is much that is aesthetically pleasing in Yogacāra theory. I study these things for my practice. And the traditions in which I practice, Sakya and Dzogchen, for many reasons, find Madhyamaka to be the definitive Mahāyāna view. Also the Indian Buddhist tantras show a clear bias towards Madhyamaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:58 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

IME Dzogchen texts are mostly impenetrable prior to introduction and likely some practice anyway.

SilenceMonkey said:

And that shouldn't be an invitation to read them, as some sort of challenge... because doing so would be dangerous to our path.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Not every teacher thinks this way about them, I've directly had a group conversation with TWR about it, he felt that the "self secret" nature of the teachings just means that most people won't get anything out them. They might be wasting their time but probably aren't harming themselves by exposure.

Malcolm wrote:

ChNN was pretty clear about what he thought of the Bonpos pov on this. He didn't approve. He felt so strongly about it he said that people can block their realization. Exhibit 1. Jax and his followers. I have many people who basically ruined their path through reading certain kinds of Dzogchen texts without guidance. And not only Dzogchen, but secret mantra texts in general. We see it here in this forum, regularly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 10:05 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Not every teacher thinks this way about them, I've directly had a group conversation with TWR about it, he felt that the "self secret" nature of the teachings just means that most people won't get anything out them. They might be wasting their time but probably aren't harming themselves by exposure.

Malcolm wrote:

ChNN was pretty clear about what he thought of the Bonpos pov on this. He didn't approve.

Johnny Dangerous said:

He also taught people to be responsible for themselves

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, he also wasn't kidding. He was absolutely pissed (I was there) when heartdrops was published and basically told all his students they should not read it, if they had not received thogal transmission. There is a solid reason why if one was not present at his thogal and yangti retreats one will never see his longsal teachings on these subjects. He wasn't kidding.

Johnny Dangerous said:

not enough concerned with actual "boots on the ground" Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

I've seen the casualties, that is, people who read stuff without transmission they ought not be reading, and their ensuing, and saddening, misconceptions. When one reads stuff protected by samaya that one does not have samaya for, one causes obstacles in one's own path,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 10:12 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

IME Dzogchen texts are mostly impenetrable prior to introduction and likely some practice anyway.

SilenceMonkey said:

And that shouldn't be an invitation to read them, as some sort of challenge... because doing so would be dangerous to our path.

Malcolm wrote:  
Absolutely correct.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 10:21 AM  
Title: Re: An Important Reminder  
Content:  
Johnny Dangerous said:  
So, why take issue with the readers?

Malcolm wrote:  
Every single one of my translations comes with a strong statement in the introduction that it should only be read by people with the proper transmission.

In my opinion, a responsible practitioner does not read that which they do not have transmission for. That's been my approach, even before I became a formal Buddhist, with respect to Vajrayana material. YMMV

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 8:19 PM  
Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Shucking oysters kills them immediately. But they are not sentient, so it's moot.

Most of the pearls one sees in Tibetan monasteries are of the freshwater variety. They certainly didn't get their on their own.

While I respect Sapan for his views on Dharma, his grasp of biology was a bit more shaky. He argued, after all, that ants have no eyes.

Adamantine said:  
PeterC you've made two comments like this however they are flagrantly incorrect. Freshwater oysters are a thing. Really a type of mussel, however they are commonly called oysters and produce their own pearls. In fact a friend just recently showed me two pearls from his hometown in Indiana. Freshwater oysters were, and likely still are, quite common in the Tibetan region, and it's something of a certainty that both Sapan and Patrul Rinpoche would be experientially confident in their proclamations. It's your, and everyone else's choice on Dharmawheel whether you listen to Patrul Rinpoche and Sapan on this matter, or Malcolm. I'll stick with the former. Especially since avoiding eating live oysters has no downside, yet continually eating living sentient beings against the advice of Sapan and Patrul Rinpoche would be an ongoing serious breach of refuge vows. Here's a link to a survey of various species of these in an Eastern Himalayan region, for an example:

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/312023535\\_Evaluation\\_of\\_pearl\\_mussels\\_diversity\\_in\\_Terai\\_region\\_of\\_Eastern\\_Himalaya\\_India](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/312023535_Evaluation_of_pearl_mussels_diversity_in_Terai_region_of_Eastern_Himalaya_India)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 8:22 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So, you can verify there is no external world? You can prove experientially that the server you are reading this on is just a ripening of traces in your own mind stream? Or are you a half-eggist? I mean, seriously, who you kidding here? The ultimate of the lower is the relative of the higher. Ultimates represent conceptual limitations. Tenet systems exist to reveal and expose these conceptual limitations, so that we don't reify things in practice like "everything is mind" or "Buddhanature is like the sky", "Sentient beings and Buddhanature are mutually exclusive" etc.

Matt J said:

I disagree--- these are clearly descriptions of practice that can be verified first hand, not intellectual positions to be believed. They are just put into a specific conceptual framework.

Johnny Dangerous said:

We cannot prove that one does not exist, that would be proving a negative in a sense, since we have no direct experience of anything outside the mind, by definition.

Malcolm wrote:

That is half-eggism,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 8:26 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

haha said:

It says the Buddha-potential is named after its result and all beings possess the buddha essence.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, however the sound bite version being promulgated here states the opposite, Buddhanature is not a possession of sentient beings, and that they cannot enjoy the result.

haha said:

Whatever that I provided above is just a possibility; it is an example which might fit to that sound bite version. Other examples are defilement covering the object (in the

context of Ratnagotravibhaga). It could be the problem of container and contain and how one defines it.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a little similar to Ganden Chopel proving the Buddha was not awakened.

Sometimes Tibetan scholars argue formal positions they themselves do not personally accept.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 8:58 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Matt J said:

The key point is that appearances are not apart from mind, and we never experience any appearances apart from mind. In addition, our mind not only flavors and colors those experiences, it generates them.

Malcolm wrote:

It does not generate those appearances independently.

Matt J said:

This is phenomenology, about what we experience, not about labelling those experiences and drawing inferences.

Malcolm wrote:

Everything you are talking about is conventional, all experiences are labeled right out the box. That's why we don't pay attention to them very much, other than path experiences, which fit a very narrow, phenomenological profile.

But the real point here is "What is going to produce realization of the path of seeing." For example, the Uttaratantra is entirely descriptive, not prescriptive at all, unlike the other Maitreya texts like Distinguishing the Middle from Extremes, and the Ornament of Mahayana Sutras. The latter is the basis of the presentation of how to practice the Mahayana path for all schools. Most yogacara literature that has come down to us is commentary on this text. Even beyond this, we can understand all this business about tathagatagarbha is purely speculative because only Buddhas can perceive it. We cannot. It is cognitively closed to us, according to tathagatagarbha sutras themselves. So while I appreciate your appeal to meditative experience, you will never experience or perceive tathagatagarbha until you are a Buddha and have realized the dharmakaya. And the consequence of this is that this topic is, from beginning to end, including Karls remarks, total intellectual proliferation with no relevance to anyone's practice, your's, mine, or anyone else.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 9:19 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

tobes said:

I also think they're very complementary, and if one is practicing rather than intellectualising, a lot of these apparent inconsistencies dissolve into irrelevancy.

I thought it was interesting how Jay Garfield - who as we all know has been schooled in Gelug Prasangika with special emphasis on Chandrakirti - recently took a bit of a Yogacaran turn. I haven't listened to all of the lectures, but the gist of it is: Yogacara gives more detail on the subjective-phenomenological side, which is generally quite implicit in Madhyamaka.

Malcolm wrote:

The Madhyamaka school has always focused more on view, whereas the Yogacara school focuses more on the path — this is obvious from looking at their respective texts. This is not news.

As for Jay, he is expert in Western Philosophy, including Bishop Berkeley's idealism, and has been teaching the latter at Sarnath to Tibetans there for almost three decades. His interest in Yogacara idealism is longstanding, not nascent. We are acquainted as he and my late father were colleagues at Smith College.

tobes said:

The point though is that he previously interpreted Yogacara as very close to idealist systems such as Berkeley's, and therefore philosophically untenable. Then he decided to investigate the matter more diligently and discovered that there was rather a big gap between Gelugpa polemics (which he had adopted) and what's actually in the texts.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, yogacara is not simple Berkeley's idealism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So you doubt that ChNN told people who had no thogal transmissions not to read Heartdrops in 1992, at the first Santi Maha Sangha base retreat, which I attended. The fact that CHNN might have asked Adriano to go and study with Loppon Tenzin Namdak as part of Adriano's research in the 80's is quite irrelevant to what ChNN might have said, repeatedly I might add, about people who lack transmission reading thogal texts. He repeatedly has told the tale of the man on the bus in Tibet reading his notes on thogal with chinese guides present. [/quote]

First, I only began to even consider publishing my translations after being repeatedly encouraged to do so by multiple Tibetan lamas. As of 2011, I was pretty sure I would

never publish them.

Yes, these editions of my translations are expensive, deliberately so. They are so expensive, I received virtually no royalties from them as they have not even paid for the cost of their printing. I didn't publish them for the money. I published them for practitioners, in the most efficient way possible, through a publisher. If I had wanted to make money I would have self-published them. I chose distribution over money. Of course, I later learned at a conference that when one self-publishes, one more or less commits publishing suicide with Wisdom and Shambhala. Nikko Odiseos was extremely clear on this point, and another editor at Wisdom, Brianna Quick, was in agreement with him. The other advantage to publishing with a top publishing house is peer-review.

So to your point of people being responsible for themselves, the reason we put such strong warnings in books is that the "restricted" approach does not work. People lie. So the choice is a) either make the books available without imposing restrictions on purchase, Wisdom; or b) impose restrictions on purchase, Shambhala, and have people lie.

Finally, Sapan is quite clear that hearing or reading tantric material—let alone trying to practice it—without transmission creates obstacles (Three Codes, pp.100-102). He dismisses as incoherent the concept of "self secrecy" (Three Codes, pg. 109).

So of course, you are free, but encouraging people to ignore the clear intent of the tantras is a little strange. Yes, of course translators and publishers are at fault for publishing Vajrayāna material in a public way, but then again, there is a risk benefit analysis, and at this point, the benefits to practitioners clearly outweighs the risk to translators and publishers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 19th, 2021 at 11:07 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

I just appealed to Sapan because he was the master you were quoting as the example and authority in another thread

Malcolm wrote:

Different people are authorities for different things.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Just wondering, do you believe any of the Masters in Tibet were fully enlightened with the quality of omniscience or that any of your present life teachers were/ are ?



Malcolm wrote:

I suspect we won't agree on what omniscience means. As Dharmakīrti said, Buddha's omniscience does not apply to the number of worms in the ground.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Responding to Sadhaka:

So you doubt that ChNN told people...

Responding to JD:

First, I only began to even consider publishing...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Astus said:

Sharing secret teachings...

Malcolm wrote:

There is no problem with sharing Vajrayāna teachings, when it is done correctly, according to the rules. Those rules are set down in the tantras. People seem to think tantras were forever kept behind lock and key. We know this is not true. But there are rules, and people should try to respect them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Classification of hypnagogic states/images in teachings

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

namtok generally?

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 6:15 AM

Title: Re: An Important Reminder

Content:

Sādhaka said:

My understanding is that Yongdzin Rinpoche and/or his Guru had consulted the

Protectors about it. Although perhaps what I'd read was misinformation; but I don't think so.

Malcolm wrote:

His guru had, some years before his death, consulted the bon protectors whether the time was right to teach Dzogchen more openly, not about whether to publish Thogal texts with Snow Lion.

We can see very clearly that none of the translations Zhang Zhung sNyan rgyud texts have been published in a way that they are available to anyone, other than Achard's book on the Six Lamps. I can tell you for sure that it is because the Bonpos do not want such texts published. Of course, if you know Tibetan, it is a different story.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 8:11 AM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

To me the value of this discussion lies in challenging settled opinions.

Malcolm wrote:

Challenging proliferation just creates more.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 8:14 AM

Title: Re: Birth Control Question

Content:

Seeker12 said:

I once heard a Dharma teacher say that a Dharma practitioner shouldn't use methods of birth control which interrupted fertility.

Malcolm wrote:

Total bullshit. We are not Catholics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 8:43 AM

Title: Re: Birth Control Question

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We are not Catholics.

Seeker12 said:

To be clear this teacher was basically very pro sex and pro birth control, so it's not a moralistic thing. He was very encouraging of healthy sexual expression.

My impression is that it had something to do with some yogas or something. He had done six yoga practice in the Kagyu tradition I believe.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a different issue, inclined to agree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Are Oysters Sentient? (Split from Giving up Masturbation)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I suspect we won't agree on what omniscience means. As Dharmakīrti said, Buddha's omniscience does not apply to the number of worms in the ground.

Sādhaka said:

I believe that I remember in one of your older posts, you saying that omniscience doesn't mean that a Buddha is aware of all things at all times; however that a Buddha could know the number of worms in the ground, if they were to direct their mind towards such....

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe. The definition of Buddha's omniscience does not come from sūtra, it comes from śāstra. And it has limits. Strictly speaking it is knowledge of all phenomena. But "all phenomena" simply refers to one aggregate, one sense base, and one sense element. It does not refer to everything in the universe, known and unknown. It refers to that which is one's personal range. Thus, to bring up another contentious point, the Buddha can be "incorrect" (that is to say, bow to conventions of his day) about Meru, but still be entirely correct about the paths and stages. We do not need to ascribe super powers to the Buddha even he didn't claim.

The second point is that killing animals does not violate one's vows of refuge. If it did, it would be a parajika for monks, but it isn't. It is merely an offense requiring confession, without a punishment, like drinking alcohol and damaging plants, and about 88 other acts. The vow not to kill, means not to kill human beings. The deliberate killing of animals does go against the commitment of training in the Dharma, non-harming, but that is not one of the five vows, it is a commitment than even butchers who go for refuge aspire to. And arguably, farming goes against that commitment as well, hence the reason monastics are forbidden from agricultural work in its entirety. For this reason, Buddhajñānapāda was astonished when he met Mañjuśrīmitra, who was a bhikṣu, the latter was plowing a field, and later came home staggeringly drunk in the evening. Mañjuśrīmitra's wife gutted a fish for their meal, and so on. In other words they lived like many Tibetan lamas do, in robes, behaving like laypeople. Go figure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Birth Control Question

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That's a different issue, inclined to agree.

Seeker12 said:

You mean that you're inclined to agree that if one might engage in such practices then it is best to not use methods which impair fertility? Can you explain why, whether generally or specifically? What would appropriate methods of birth control be then - condoms, timing, etc? Methods short of basically semen retention that is.

Malcolm wrote:

I am saying that i think one should avoid unnecessary surgery. Condoms are preferable to vasectomies, tubal ligations, etc., in my opinion, unless there is a pressing medical reason.

Of course this only relevant to secret mantra practitioners.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 9:43 PM

Title: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

rupam said:

Please pray for the victims of Kyle Rittenhouse, Joseph Rosenbaum, 36 and Anthony Huber, 26. Please pray for BIPOC(Black, Indigenous, people of color) in the US who have been fighting against the institutional racism that they don't die and they accomplish their missions.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, that court in WI just declared open season on protestor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 10:07 PM

Title: Re: video of Brunnhölzl: Buddha Nature as a radical teaching

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

To me the value of this discussion lies in challenging settled opinions.

Malcolm wrote:

Challenging proliferation just creates more.  
But because this is proliferation party:

<https://academia.edu/resource/work/34415687>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 11:29 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Ippen,

Malcolm wrote:

Def. my favorite pure land guy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 20th, 2021 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Ippen,

Malcolm wrote:

Def. my favorite pure land guy.

FiveSkandhas said:

You never fail to impress me as a man of refined intellectual taste. Ippen is definitely for gourmets.

As an aside, I'm scheduled to go to the Jishu head temple tomorrow as it so happens, and I will quite possibly be buried at my in-law's ancestral Jishu temple, where they are registered among the dwindling number of danka followers of Master Ippen's way.

Malcolm wrote:

I first read No Abode thirty-three years ago or so. I still have a copy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Inedible said:

Kyle was found not guilty, so he doesn't have victims.

Malcolm wrote:

He is still open to civil suits. He was found innocent of murder, but that does not mean he has no victims. For example, some one may be found innocent of killing the victim of a car accident, but still, there was an accident and there was a victim.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened Westerners?

Content:

Montoya said:

Vajrayana promises enlightenment in this lifetime. Where are all the enlightened Western Buddhists? We are roughly 60 years into the experiment of Westerners practicing Vajrayana. I know many people who have benefitted greatly from Vajrayana Buddhism, myself included, so this isn't really an indictment of Vajrayana, per se. But curious, to hear others thoughts?

PadmaVonSamba said:

Define "enlightened"

Toenail said:

Do we really need to define it? It is not really open for discussion or opinion what it means if you are a tibetan buddhist.

Malcolm wrote:

"Awakening" means one has realized at least either stream entry in a śrāvakayāna school, or the path of seeing in Mahāyāna. "Full awakening" is buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 5:29 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

Ill be happy to sponsor if you have paypal.

Archie2009 said:

You have a wish-fulfilling jewel?

Toenail said:

Just a paying job and liquid courage.

Malcolm wrote:

How are you feeling?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 6:21 AM

Title: Re: Austria will confine the unvaccinated to their homes in a targeted lockdown.

Content:

Toenail said:

Just a paying job and liquid courage.

Malcolm wrote:

How are you feeling?

Toenail said:

My pcr test came back negative on Thursday evening. I got tested on Wednesday, 10 days after infection. So I am quarantine free and am considered safe in regards to infecting people. I still have a chronic cough though.

Malcolm wrote:

Clove tea will help.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 9:43 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Svalaksana said:

You are correct. The American culture unfortunately is thoroughly "guncentric", it's psychologically very unhealthy, naturally. Not that Americans are as such by their own selves of course, since this has been manufactured, unwittingly or not, by several media moguls and corporations that have profited immensely from the pernicious content they have innocently classified as "entertainment" and "culture".

Malcolm wrote:

Starting with the Sears Catalogue, the Amazon of its day.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Birth Control Question

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Condoms are preferable to vasectomies, tubal ligations, etc., in my opinion, unless there is a pressing medical reason.

Seeker12 said:

Does “condoms are lame” count as a pressing medical reason?

Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm, no. Unless you are ok with having children.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: Doubts on Samaya and Empowerment

Content:

LucasGP said:

Given that context, what I want to ask is: Now I need to be engaged to vajrayana because of the vows and etc?

Malcolm wrote:

No. HHST, as I understand it, just gave a reading transmission for a famous prayer to Manjushri. Thus is not an empowerment, thus is not even an initiation. As for refuge and bodhicitta, that's for you to decide, whether you were happy to receive those vows or not. If you are not happy, then you didn't receive them.

You are not bound by anything.

M

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 10:42 PM

Title: Re: Doubts on Samaya and Empowerment

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

If I were you I'd just get the text and go for it. I've had a number of Initiations in the Sakya lineage and I've found they are often going to expect you have a basic background of understanding in the Mahayana, which means you might have some confusion initially if you don't. You practice, ask questions, and refine. I was taught that Bodhicitta motivation and genuine enthusiasm are the main factor.

The first few I went to were crazy affairs, monks running around frantically, seemingly everyone but me knew better was what going on, rice flying all over the place, etc. Over the years they came to mean a lot to me and especially now with Covid, I really recall them fondly. I can see that they did much for me, however confusing at the time.

At any rate, if you paid attention for any of it and are attracted to the practice, IMO it is a



waste of time to worry much about whether or not you "got it", and you should just do it, but YMMV.

Nicholas2727 said:

What if someone does the practice wrong? I don't have much Vajrayana experience but if the person did not realize what they were getting into, isn't it possible they do the visualizations or mudras wrong? Or is an attempt good enough to start?

Malcolm wrote:

The attempt is good enough, if the person is sincere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Simple question. Who is authorized to give refuge to people? Posting in nyingma, since that is where I practice. Is this the sort of thing that varies between schools/lineages? Or is it more static?

Thanks in advance

Malcolm wrote:

Anyone who has has Mahayana refuge vows, and understands the procedure for bestowing refuge vows, can bestow refuge vows. There is no special qualification needed other than that one's own refuge is intact.

The question is, does one really wish to be granting such vows?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My Kagyu Lama said that in order to REALLY give Refuge you have to be able to follow someone's consciousness into the Bardo.

I don't think that happens very often though.

Malcolm wrote:

One can take Mahayana refuge and bodhicitta vows without a teacher. One just has to visualize the Buddha and bodhisattvas before one in space. This system is taught in the sutras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My Kagyu Lama said that in order to REALLY give Refuge you have to be able to follow someone's consciousness into the Bardo.

I don't think that happens very often though.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just an opinion. This is not stated anywhere in sutra.

In the shravakayana, refuge vows must be received from a fully ordained bhikshu, but they only last until death.

Mahayana refuge vows are also lost at death, but since they are connected with bodhicitta, bodhisattva vows last until one attains buddhahood, unless one gives up the motivation for buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 21st, 2021 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

My Kagyu Lama said that in order to REALLY give Refuge you have to be able to follow someone's consciousness into the Bardo.

I don't think that happens very often though.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just an opinion. This is not stated anywhere in sutra.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Correct.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, the problem with this idea is that guru can't do anything for you in the bardo, other than recite some prayers and maybe recite the bardo thodrol for you, which you may or may not be aware of in the blooming buzzing confusion of the bardo. If the guru could not pick you up by the neck and liberate you in this life, what makes you think they can do so in bardo? If you've received Vajrayana teachings, and you experience the bardo, it's your fault for not practicing hard enough.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 4:22 AM

Title: Re: Doubts on Samaya and Empowerment

Content:

Toenail said:

I received this gangi lodro from hhst 10 years ago and it was not just Lung. He called it an empowerment and it worked with front visualization.

Malcolm wrote:

This technically then a rig gtad, an entrustment of a vidyā mantra, and as it is kriya tantra, it has no samayas, just refuge and bodhicitta vows.

LucasGP said:

self generate as Manjushri, only in front of us. At least I thought that the sadhana and etc wouldn't characterize as only part of the prayer, but I really don't know s\*\*\* so...

Malcolm wrote:

This is a kriya tantra practice. It only comes with refuge and bodhisattva vows.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 5:18 AM

Title: Re: Where are the enlightened Westerners?

Content:

PeterC said:

If you aren't a bodhisattva on the stages yourself, you can't tell another practitioner's level of achievement.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Svalaksana said:

The American society is fed on violence and only the banality of it prevents one from acknowledging the effects.

Malcolm wrote:

Let's be fair here: violence has been the centre of human entertainment for untold millenia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 5:39 AM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

There's Guru Yoga in this life, and there's Guru Yoga in the Bardo. Except for the venue they really aren't very different. If your practice of Guru Yoga is strong during life there's no reason it will disappear in the Bardo.

I suspect our ideas of what Guru Yoga entails may be different.

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not.

Sure, one can practice guru yoga in the bardo, but that is not the "guru following you into the bardo." This is a result of your presence of mind which allows you to practice guru yoga in the bardo, and I agree, this is a result of practicing guru yoga in this life with strong diligence and devotion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 6:36 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Svalaksana said:

The American society is fed on violence and only the banality of it prevents one from acknowledging the effects.

Malcolm wrote:

Let's be fair here: violence has been the centre of human entertainment for untold millenia.

Svalaksana said:

Surely. But can one compare watching one day or another some gladiators cutting each other up or some presumed witches and heretics burning at the stake with what we have today?

Malcolm wrote:

Oh definitely. And it was worse back in the day. Sociopaths ran rampant, no laws, etc. Angulimala would not really be possible in America in this day and age.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Doubts on Samaya and Empowerment

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is a kriya tantra practice. It only comes with refuge and bodhisattva vows.

LucasGP said:

And this practice also produces good results and it's a way to start on Vajrayana, even if don't have a guru yet?

Malcolm wrote:

You have a guru, HHST. And yes, this practice is a way to begun in Vajrayana. What you don't have are samaya vows of highest yoga tantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 9:24 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

A bunch of kids, overwhelmingly white, lined up according to their political ideologies...Nothing has changed. Its not open season on protesters.

Malcolm wrote:

Protesting police violence against black people is just a rumble? White people are not supposed to protest violence against black people? That's just ideology? Sheesh.

Yes, actually, the rules have now changed. White men with guns can shoot unarmed protestors if they feel threatened. You are going to see a lot more guns on both sides now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 9:37 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

Anglo-Saxon culture has a malicious, callous edge to it...

Malcolm wrote:

Uhuh. Unlike Japanese culture, I suppose.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 9:53 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

Anglo-Saxon culture has a malicious, callous edge to it...

Malcolm wrote:

Uhuh. Unlike Japanese culture, I suppose.

Queequeg said:

I didn't make any such distinction. Its got a different flavor in Japan. Brutality of samurai is qualitatively different. What, are you feeling picked on? Thought you were above that kind of identity.

Malcolm wrote:

I think you can pick any Colonial power and make the same statement. That was my point. Imperial Japan in the 1920's and 30's, with their fondness for Prussia, was also malicious and callous.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 9:58 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

There is no living memory of war permeating our society

Malcolm wrote:

In your generation. Our government sanitized war. They decided after the debacles in Korea and Vietnam they were not going to allow full media access to war zones anymore.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

I was just expressing opinions that I have no intention of standing by.

Malcolm wrote:

Good Dharmawheel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 10:32 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

There's far less crime and violence in Japan than there is in the US. How does this not express a difference in culture?

Malcolm wrote:

I was making a comment about essentialization.

QQ was not making a quantitative argument, he was making a qualitative argument, "malicious and cruel." Cruelty and malice are cruelty and malice, no matter whether they are spiced with salt and pepper, seaweed and soy, or a hundred different chiles. Victims of cruelty and malice don't really care much about the culture of those being malicious and cruel to them, hmmm...I prefer being gutted with a katana to being gut shot with the 12 gauge, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 11:04 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Fair enough. I just mean that there seems to be some inherent qualities to (the current) Japanese society that inhibits violent tendencies in people. As opposed to say the UK or the US.

Malcolm wrote:

After their adventure with colonialism, they got nuked. I would say that was the major influence on Japanese culture in terms of externalizing violence. Now they just internalize it in child pornography and rape fantasies in cartoon books.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 22nd, 2021 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Proto-fascists have been waiting for years to shoot protesters. My little podunk town had doughy dipshit 40-something on top of liquor stores with AR 15s.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the rise of paramilitaries is consistent with a breakdown of democracy.

<https://scholars.org/contribution/twenty-lessons-fighting-tyranny-twentieth-century>

Johnny Dangerous said:

6. Be wary of paramilitaries. When the men with guns who have always claimed to be against the system start wearing uniforms and marching around with torches and pictures of a Leader, the end is nigh. When the pro-leader paramilitary and the official

police and military intermingle, the end has come.

Malcolm wrote:

For example, no one arrested Rittenhouse.

Johnny Dangerous said:

This kid went out with an AR 15 with at least some idea that he might use it, and he did, and to some degree was vindicated in doing so. That's an escalation to our already fraught situation.

Malcolm wrote:

He was completely vindicated in the eyes of the far right.

Johnny Dangerous said:

So I am not even talking the veracity of the verdict, just the significance of this happening and the likely result, it's not hard to guess.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 1:19 AM

Title: Re: Restoring Broken Five Lay Precepts

Content:

Denam said:

Is it possible to restore the Five Lay Precepts if they have been broken?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, you just recite the refuge again. If you feel really terrible, recite the aspiration of the conduct of the Bodhisattva Samantabhadra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 1:22 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

And just for some historical parallel, 'keeping the peace' or acting as 'security' at political rallies, etc. is how the SA got started...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the same with the "Blackshirts" or <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Squadrisimo> in Italy. Ironically, the blackshirts were originally the garb of the anarchists.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 2:28 AM

Title: Re: Restoring Broken Five Lay Precepts

Content:

Denam said:

Perhaps you could suggest a specific practice that will allow me to restore the five precepts that have been broken?

Malcolm wrote:

You can recite the Sutra of Three Heaps:

<https://sakyatemple.org/how-to-recite-the-three-heap-sutra/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan words for "look, see, release"

Content:

climb-up said:

Hello lovely folks,

In his teachings on trekchod, Lama Surya Das often gives the instructions to look, see and then release. Sometimes he also says to open, recognize and release.

I don't know how direct these translations are (for example, I know that he often translates the chogshaks as 'the four droppings' ), but I'm curious if anyone knows the tibetan word for these.

Malcolm wrote:

ngo shes, rtogs pa, grol ba.

Recognize, realize, release.

climb-up said:

I don't know how direct these translations are (for example, I know that he often translates the chogshaks as 'the four droppings' ), but I'm curious if anyone knows the tibetan word for these.

Malcolm wrote:

cog bzhag, literally, "put down and leave." They refer to the method of equipoise (bzhags thabs) in Dzogchen trekchö. They may be an ancient translation of the term "samāpatti" (snyoms par 'jug).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 3:45 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Fair enough. I just mean that there seems to be some inherent qualities to (the current) Japanese society that inhibits violent tendencies in people. As opposed to say the UK or the US.

Malcolm wrote:

After their adventure with colonialism, they got nuked. I would say that was the major influence on Japanese culture in terms of externalizing violence. Now they just internalize it in child pornography and rape fantasies in cartoon books.

Brunelleschi said:

I see the common trope of Japanese people being perverted as more of a racist stereotype.

Malcolm wrote:

I did not say they were more perverse, I am just using this as example of internalized violence and repression.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 5:33 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

My point is that we have these raw impulses as human beings that are then processed through our culture

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think it has anything to with Anglo-Saxons. I would blame for the Normans for that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 5:51 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Queequeg said:

My point is that we have these raw impulses as human beings that are then processed through our culture

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think it has anything to with Anglo-Saxons. I would blame for the Normans for that.

Queequeg said:

Typical Anglo response: blame it on the French.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, the Anglo Saxons lost control of England in 1066 at the battle of Hastings.

Anglo-Saxon language and customs under the Norman Yoke:

Norman saw on English oak.

On English neck a Norman yoke;

Norman spoon to English dish,

And England ruled as Normans wish;

Blithe world in England never will be more,

Till England's rid of all the four.

-- Ivanhoe, Sir Walter Scott.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 10:22 AM

Title: Re: The victims of Kyle Rittenhouse

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

hmmmm...I prefer being gutted with a katana to being gut shot with the 12 gauge, etc.

PeterC said:

That depends on a number of factors. You could live on for a reasonable amount of time in a lot of pain with both of those. If it was a katana, and not a tanto, then by definition you're in combat and not committing seppuku, so there isn't a second waiting to decapitate you before you dishonor yourself by crying out. Since you're in combat, there's a reasonable chance that your opponent will follow up with a lethal blow pretty quickly. However with the shotgun, it depends a bit on whether its sawn off or not. If it is, then it just blows a big hole in you and you probably die as quickly as if disemboweled by a katana. But if it's not sawn off, and the pellets exit the barrel in a spread, you could live in agony for a day or so after the injury - perhaps even survive if you happened to get shot right outside a hospital and weren't hit at close range. But in any case your assailant is using a two-shot weapon, so it's most likely that they will run away rather than administering a prompt coup de grace.

This is why cross-cultural comparisons are so different, there are so many social factors that are hard to correlate directly.

Malcolm wrote:

It's all pretty bad..that's my point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 7:44 PM

Title: Re: Refuge from the view of Dhammapada

Content:

Aemilius said:

OK. I intended it [mod note: the quote from Dhammapada -

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=608961#p608961>] as an answer that it is your own self who attains Refuge by realizing the Four noble truths, i.e. by following and realizing the Dharma. According to Buddha any member of the Sangha can teach you the Dharma. In the Sravakayana sutras even a laywoman can act as a teacher, as in the case of the lay-woman Visakha, who converted her father-in-law, wealthy merchant Migara, into Buddhism. Thereafter she was called "Migara's mother", being his "mother" in the spiritual sense, because she had caused Migara's spiritual birth in Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

But in Shravakayana, not everyone can perform the rite of ordaining a male or female upasaka, only a bhikshu can do this. In Mahayana, however this restriction does not apply.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 8:23 PM

Title: Re: Taking Refuge formally

Content:

chokyi lodro said:

Would I need to formally take Refuge again? Is there some act of purification that ought to be done to mend breaking that promise?

Malcolm wrote:

You can recite the sutra of three heaps.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Does learning Lamrim Chenmo mean you've learn the other Lamrim by other TB sects as well?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Sakya: Three Visions/Three Levels of Spiritual Perception

Nyingma: Words of My Perfect Teacher

Sherab Rigdrol said:

I wouldn't consider WOMPT a Lam Rim text.

For Nyingma either Jigme Lingpa's Treasury of Precious Qualities or The Light of Wisdom.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Why, is it not graduated enough? Perhaps I have always misunderstood the formal use of the actual term.

I was thinking more in general terms of "preliminaries" and assumed the question was asked in that regard, not in the technical sense of being or not being Lamrim literature formally.

If we are doing that then for I think for Sakya it's maybe Clarifying the Sage Intent, but IMO it's tougher reading than the others.

Malcolm wrote:

Technically, Sapan and Gampopa's texts are "stages of the doctrine" (bstan rim) rather than "stages of the path" (lam rim).

The former are based on Maitreya's Ornament of Mahāyāna Sutras, which begin with the discussion of gotra, or inclination for awakening and conclude with a discussion of the three kāyas. The latter are based on Atisha's Lamp of the Path of Awakening, begins with a discussion of the qualities of the teacher and conclude with a discussion of śamatha and vipaśyāna and the desirability of practicing Vajrayāna. This is how one discerns the distinction between these two genres of texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 23rd, 2021 at 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Does learning Lamrim Chenmo mean you've learn the other Lamrim by other TB sects as well?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Thanks, makes sense.

Malcolm wrote:

For this reason, The Sakyapa Three Appearances and the Three Tantras literature belong to the "stages of the path" rather than "the stages of the doctrine." WOMPT and my forthcoming translation (late 2022?) of the Sakya Ngondro text also belong here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Anyone who has has Mahayana refuge vows, and understands the procedure for bestowing refuge vows, can bestow refuge vows. There is no special qualification

needed other than that one's own refuge is intact.

The question is, does one really wish to be granting such vows?

Toenail said:

Why is this the question? What responsibility etc comes with giving someone refuge vows?

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

I also would love to know what acharya means here. Can we also bestow the bodhisattva vow? are there any qualifications around this besides the bestower's own vows being intact?

Malcolm wrote:

One has to know how to properly conduct the rite. If one bestows refuge vows and bodhisattva vows there is no particular responsibility, but I think it can become kind of an ego trip. Even some Tibetan Lamas will incorrectly claim that having bestowed refuge, now the student has samaya with that teacher and so on. I just think it is better to encourage people to receive refuge and bodhisattva vows from qualified lamas, preferably lineage heads, and among those, bhikṣus like HH Dalai Lama are preferable to upasākas. One should recall that among vajramasters, a bhikṣu with intact vows is supreme, according to Kalacakra. On the other hand, though this is ideal, life is short, and if one does not want to use the rite of administering refuge and bodhisattva vows to oneself, then any qualified teacher who is willing to give them will do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 12:36 AM

Title: Re: Tiantai three truths and Tibetan Madhyamaka

Content:

Dharmalight889 said:

Is there any relation between the two here (for example do any of the Tibetan schools teaching something similar to the three truths)? Or are the three truths something only found in Tiantai? I know there are a lot of Madhyamaka texts in Tibet so I am curious if any of the Tibetan schools teaching something similar.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they don't. The Buddha only taught two truths, there isn't a third, as far as Indo-Tibetan Buddhism goes.

[Mod note 2024: The thread continues here :]

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=691485#p691485>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Does learning Lamrim Chenmo mean you've learn the other Lamrim by other TB sects as well?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Thanks, makes sense.

Malcolm wrote:

For this reason, The Sakyapa Three Appearances and the Three Tantras literature belong to the "stages of the path" rather than "the stages of the doctrine." WOMPT and my forthcoming translation (late 2022?) of the Sakya Ngondro text also belong here.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Which Ngondro text are you translating, the one by Deshung Rinpoche? That's the only one I'm familiar with.

Malcolm wrote:

It is a commentary by Khenchen Ngalo, HH Sakya Trichen's first tutor, on the preliminary practices in connection with Hevajra, Vajrayogini, Tsembupa's Avalokiteśvara system, and Vajrabhairava, which covers the common foundations, and contains instructions for how to adapt the uncommon recitations to each of these systems, refuge, Vajrasattva, Mandala, Guru Yoga, etc. The basic text is about 300 folios, so roughly six hundred pages long when published in English.

Dezhung Tulku's Ngondro text was composed much later, in the US. This book is not a commentary on that, though can be applied to that text too.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Sorry, WOMPT and your translation belong where? Path of doctrine?

Malcolm wrote:

Lamrim.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 2:59 AM

Title: Re: Skillful living

Content:

Rick said:

What's a skillful way to live in an era of profound political/social/cultural division and (ever increasing) violence?

Malcolm wrote:

Avoid people with whom you disagree and who you find disagreeable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 3:22 AM

Title: Re: Skillful living

Content:

Rick said:

What's a skillful way to live in an era of profound political/social/cultural division and (ever increasing) violence?

Malcolm wrote:

Avoid people with whom you disagree and who you find disagreeable.

Archie2009 said:

I've been living by that principle for a long time now, but it can leave you very isolated. No regrets, though.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's why we have Dharmawheel, so we can enjoy disagreeable people at a distance with whom we disagree, who at least more or less have the same view we do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 3:25 AM

Title: Re: The Yogis of Tibet

Content:

clyde said:

Is this yogic practice unique or are the other similar Tibetan Buddhist "secret practices"?  
Is this yogic practice performed by only a few adepts or is it generally practiced?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally practiced. Tibetan Buddhism is, more than anything else, a yogic tradition.

Scholasticism is the exoteric side, which is why one sees it more than the other.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 10:53 PM

Title: Re: Refuge from the view of Dhammapada

Content:

Aemilius said:

In the beginning period of Buddhism that wasn't always so formalized.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and then ordination rites were fixed by various sanghas later, with various procedures which differ from sect to sect.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Does learning Lamrim Chenmo mean you've learn the other Lamrim by other



TB sects as well?

Content:

zerwe said:

Not to mention we are forgetting the root text for the sarma schools later literature-->  
Atisha's Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment.

Malcolm wrote:

No, we didn't.

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=609202#p609202>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Citations regarding the Alaya

Content:

Seeker12 said:

I'm interested in primary, or as close to primary, citations regarding whether there is a singular alaya that contains the seeds for all beings

Malcolm wrote:

There are no citations for this at all.

If you want to understand the ālayavijñāna in a proper way, you should read the Mahāyānasamgraha of Asanga, where he explains how common appearances among sentient beings arise from each one's ālaya; as well as Vasubandhu's proof of distinct mindstreams in absence of outer objects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, November 24th, 2021 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: The Yogis of Tibet

Content:

heart said:

Nevertheless the oldest known yoga text is a Buddhist text. Amritasiddhi was for a long time thought to be a Hindu text but it turned out that the oldest original is Buddhist.

Mallison is a scholar of yoga and a Hindu yogi (so you can trust him ).

Anyway, it isn't "my argument" it is in the hand of scholars at this point.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, if you exclude the Yoga Sūtras. But even this text is clearly a reaction to Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

Rick said:

Given the subtle to gargantuan differences in how different Buddhist schools translate/interpret the terms awareness and consciousness, how does a student of Buddhism, rather than of one particular school of Buddhism, avoid getting heinously confused? I.e. is there universal agreement across all of Buddhism about the essence, or certain aspects of the two terms? Or is looking for agreement a fool's errand?

Malcolm wrote:

The terms "awareness" and "consciousness" are English terms. Therefore, one needs to look at the word list of equivalents to see which Sanskrit or Tibetan terms are being used for these two English terms, and their context. At that point, you can make useful comparisons and contrasts.

For example, you will be hard pressed to find the term "awareness" used at all in my translations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 1:43 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

Rick said:

Understood. Makes sense. I read somewhere that Tibetan had as many terms for consciousness as, well, you know, Eskimos have for snow.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really.

Rick said:

I'd come to think of the term awareness, as used in Buddhist contexts, to have little to nothing to do with awareness as used in Vedanta. Lo and behold, in the Mingyur Rinpoche meditation course I'm taking, the two views on awareness are very similar! Awareness in both points to clarity, radiance, cognizance, and always-present shining brightness.

Malcolm wrote:

The difference is emptiness, of course. Rig pa is baseless, without foundation, and empty.

Madhyamaka focuses on the outer objects, which are not sentient. Vajrayāna in general focuses on the subjective mind. Its cognizance (rig pa) clear, present, radiant, etc. But it's emptiness is the same emptiness as outer objects.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 5:05 AM

Title: Re: The History behind the transition from Adi-Buddha Samantabhadra to Vajradhara

Content:

SubduerOfNegativity said:

I've read in one of my teachers books, like you said, that Vajradhara is the Sambhogakaya aspect of Dharmakaya Samantabhadra, but I practice in the Nyingma lineage and this is a Nyingma view(Samantabhadra shown without the adornments to emphasize the naked-like, pure, openness of Dharmakaya); whereas in the Sarma schools, Vajradhara is the Dharmakaya(for the most part in most cases).

Malcolm wrote:

Vajradhara, as depicted in Sakya and Geluk, demonstrates the so-called seven limbs of the three kāyas, which is the result of the fourth empowerment and represents realization of mahāmudrā. The source of this presentation is the Jñānavajrasammucaya Tantra.

The simplest way to explain this is that the limb of the dharmakāya is naturelessness, or lack of inherent existence (rang bzhin med pa); the three limbs of the sambhogakāya are complete enjoyment, union, and great bliss; and the three limbs of the nirmanakāya are being filled with compassion, not being interrupted, and never ceasing. Sometimes the limbs of not being interrupted or ceasing is placed with the dharmakāya.

There is no "transition" from Samantabhadra to Vajradhara. Samantabhadra is the name given to the dharmakāya in the root tantra of yoga tantra, the Compendium of the Principles of the Tathāgatas as well as the Guhyasamāja Tantra, the root tantra of the so-called father tantras in highest yoga tantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 9:46 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Rick said:

In Chapter 1 of the MMK, Nagarjuna appears to argue against <a certain understanding of> causality. But he never argues against dependent origination, quite the contrary: emptiness and dependent origination are definitive teachings.

So, Nagarjunaphiles, if causality is kaput, how inarnation does dependent arising work?

(Feel free to correct all my misstatements and chastise me for my ignorance.)

Malcolm wrote:

Nothing arises from itself, other, or without a cause...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

If a cause if not a thing, what is it?

Malcolm wrote:

A convention.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, November 25th, 2021 at 9:17 PM

Title: Re: Extinction as a result of global warming

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

There is no point trying to defile our minds when this rare human life can be used for transcending suffering by practicing the BuddhaDharma. Trying to create a better Samsara is a pointless exercise.

Malcolm wrote:

What happened to your Mahāyāna bodhicitta? Of course we cannot improve samsara. No one is suggesting that we ought to. We work with the samsara we have. And as Mahāyāna Buddhists, we help others work with the samsara they have, right down to the amoeba, plankton, and yes, even plants and other nonsentient creatures.

Dharmasherab said:

Expecting politicians to make help with the global warming issue, whether that works or not, it doesnt matter. Because politics will eventually always let us down.

Malcolm wrote:

What you are essentially saying is this: since climate change does not matter, the extinction of billions of creatures does not matter, and therefore, their happiness does not matter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 26th, 2021 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

If you are unconscious, you are not aware of anything.

But you can be conscious and not aware of many things.

conebeckham said:

IF you are unconscious, can you dream? If so, what sort of awareness is aware of the dream while you are unconscious?

If you are sleeping, and a sudden loud noise startles you awake, what awareness was there, to wake you from your unconscious state?

PadmaVonSamba said:

If you are dreaming, you are asleep but not unconscious.

This is why I say that there is awareness which precedes consciousness (Malcolm disagrees).

Malcolm wrote:

That's because awareness, sensation, is just a mental factor that arises with consciousness. I recently read a brilliant take down of so-called self awareness where it is explained that rig pa aka awareness (rig pa) is just a name for sensation (vedana).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, November 26th, 2021 at 8:21 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

If a cause is not a thing, what is it?

Malcolm wrote:

A convention.

Sherab said:

A convention of what?

Malcolm wrote:

A cause.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

If you are dreaming, you are asleep but not unconscious.

This is why I say that there is awareness which precedes consciousness (Malcolm disagrees).

Malcolm wrote:

That's because awareness, sensation, is just a mental factor that arises with consciousness. I recently read a brilliant take down of so-called self awareness where

is it is explained that rig pa aka awareness (vidya) is just a name for sensation (vedana).

Arnoud said:

Could you share that please? Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, Smṛtijñānakīrti, in his Commentary on the Bodhicittavivaraṇa remarks that svasaṃvedana (so so rang rig), often translated as self-awareness, etc., simply refers to sensations that one has that one is unable to communicate with others. He defines it in this in contrast to the svasaṃvedana proposed by cittamantrins, as self-aware aspectless consciousness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The better question is; what kind of 'refuge' is being offered? In English, 'refuge' implies safety from danger. Obviously simply becoming a Buddhist does not guarantee that bad things will not happen to you.

Malcolm wrote:

If you maintain your refuge commitments, the likelihood of "bad things" happening to you decreases, even more so if you generate bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 2:06 AM

Title: Re: Happy Belated Thanksgiving

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

November 24, 2021

Heather Cox Richardson Nov 25

The Biden administration has announced it will convene the first of two virtual "Summits for Democracy" on December 9 and 10, 2021. The gatherings will bring together leaders from 110 countries who work in government, civil society, and the private sector, to come up with an agenda to renew democratic government and work together to keep the ideals of democracy strong.

Authoritarianism is growing around the world, including in America, and the administration is hoping to create practical ideas and strong alliances to defend against authoritarianism, fight corruption, and promote human rights, all values central to democracy.

That this announcement comes at Thanksgiving is fitting, since Thanksgiving is rooted in

a defense of democracy during the Civil War.

The Pilgrims and the Wampanoags did indeed share a harvest celebration together at Plymouth in fall 1621, but that moment got forgotten almost immediately, overwritten by the long history of the settlers' attacks on their Indigenous neighbors.

In 1841, a book that reprinted the early diaries and letters from the Plymouth colony recovered the story of that three-day celebration in which ninety Indigenous Americans and the English settlers shared fowl and deer. This story of peace and goodwill among men who by the 1840s were more often enemies than not inspired Sarah Josepha Hale, who edited the popular women's magazine Godey's Lady's Book, to think that a national celebration could ease similar tensions building between the slave-holding South and the free North. She lobbied for legislation to establish a day of national thanksgiving.

And then, on April 12, 1861, southern soldiers fired on Fort Sumter, a federal fort in Charleston Harbor, and the meaning of a holiday for giving thanks changed.

Southern leaders wanted to destroy the United States of America and create their own country, based not in the traditional American idea that "all men are created equal," but rather in its opposite: that some men were better than others and had the right to enslave their neighbors. In the 1850s, convinced that society worked best if a few wealthy men ran it, southern leaders had bent the laws of the United States to their benefit, using it to protect enslavement above all.

In 1860, northerners elected Abraham Lincoln to the presidency to stop rich southern enslavers from taking over the government and using it to cement their own wealth and power. As soon as he was elected, southern leaders pulled their states out of the Union to set up their own country. After the firing on Fort Sumter, Lincoln and the fledgling Republican Party set out to end the slaveholders' rebellion.

The early years of the war did not go well for the U.S. By the end of 1862, the armies still held, but people on the home front were losing faith. Leaders recognized the need both to acknowledge the suffering and to keep Americans loyal to the cause. In November and December, seventeen state governors declared state thanksgiving holidays.

New York Governor Edwin Morgan's widely reprinted proclamation about the holiday reflected that the previous year "is numbered among the dark periods of history, and its sorrowful records are graven on many hearthstones." But this was nonetheless a time for giving thanks, he wrote, because "the precious blood shed in the cause of our country will hallow and strengthen our love and our reverence for it and its institutions.... Our Government and institutions placed in jeopardy have brought us to a more just appreciation of their value."

The next year Lincoln got ahead of the state proclamations. On July 15, he declared a national day of Thanksgiving, and the relief in his proclamation was almost palpable. After two years of disasters, the Union army was finally winning. Bloody, yes; battered, yes; but winning. At Gettysburg in early July, Union troops had sent Confederates reeling

back southward. Then, on July 4, Vicksburg had finally fallen to U. S. Grant's army. The military tide was turning.

President Lincoln set Thursday, August 6, 1863, for the national day of Thanksgiving. On that day, ministers across the country listed the signal victories of the U.S. Army and Navy in the past year and reassured their congregations that it was only a matter of time until the United States government put down the southern rebellion. Their predictions acknowledged the dead and reinforced the idea that their sacrifice had not been in vain.

In October 1863, President Lincoln declared a second national day of Thanksgiving. In the past year, he declared, the nation had been blessed.

In the midst of a civil war of unequalled magnitude and severity, he wrote, Americans had maintained their laws and their institutions and had kept foreign countries from meddling with their nation. They had paid for the war as they went, refusing to permit the destruction to cripple the economy. Instead, as they funded the war, they had also advanced farming, industry, mining, and shipping. Immigrants had poured into the country to replace men lost on the battlefield, and the economy was booming. And Lincoln had recently promised that the government would end slavery once and for all. The country, he predicted, "with a large increase of freedom," would survive, stronger and more prosperous than ever. The president invited Americans "in every part of the United States, and also those who are at sea, and those who are sojourning in foreign lands" to observe the last Thursday of November as a day of Thanksgiving.

In 1863, November's last Thursday fell on the 26th. On November 19, Lincoln delivered an address at the dedication of a national cemetery at Gettysburg, Pennsylvania. He reached back to the Declaration of Independence for the principles on which he called for Americans to rebuild the severed nation:

"Four score and seven years ago our fathers brought forth on this continent, a new nation, conceived in Liberty, and dedicated to the proposition that all men are created equal."

Lincoln urged the crowd to take up the torch those who fought at Gettysburg had laid down. He called for them to "highly resolve that these dead shall not have died in vain—that this nation, under God, shall have a new birth of freedom—and that government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth."

The following year, Lincoln proclaimed another day of Thanksgiving, this time congratulating Americans that God had favored them not only with immigration but also with the emancipation of formerly enslaved people. "Moreover," Lincoln wrote, "He has been pleased to animate and inspire our minds and hearts with fortitude, courage, and resolution sufficient for the great trial of civil war into which we have been brought by our adherence as a nation to the cause of freedom and humanity, and to afford to us reasonable hopes of an ultimate and happy deliverance from all our dangers and afflictions."



In 1861, Americans went to war to keep a cabal from taking control of the government and turning it into an oligarchy. The fight against that rebellion seemed at first to be too much for the nation to survive. But Americans rallied and threw their hearts into the cause on the battlefields even as they continued to work on the home front for a government that defended democracy and equality before the law.

And they won.

My best to you all for Thanksgiving 2021.

<https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/november-24-2021>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 2:16 AM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The better question is; what kind of 'refuge' is being offered? In English, 'refuge' implies safety from danger. Obviously simply becoming a Buddhist does not guarantee that bad things will not happen to you.

So what are we even talking about?

Josef said:

According to Tsongkhapa the initial protection is from the three lower realms and eventually all six realms of samsara. This is the refuge we seek as dharma practitioners.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

This can either mean that:

1. having accepted proper guidance, we no longer act in such a way so as to have the result of being born in the lower realms. Or,
2. it could mean active intervention on the part of the 3 Jewels to prohibit experiencing the 3 lower realms. Or,
3. both.

Malcolm wrote:

It is option one. The merit of taking refuge is what prevents one from going to lower realms. However, if you don't sincerely observe the commitments of refuge to the best of your ability, then all bets are off.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

Arnoud said:

Could you share that please? Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, Smṛtijñānakīrti, in his Commentary on the Bodhicittavivarana remarks that svasaṃvedana (so so rang rig), often translated as self-awareness, etc., simply refers to sensations that one has that one is unable to communicate with others. He defines it in this in contrast to the svasaṃvedana proposed by cittamantrins, as self-aware aspectless consciousness.

Arnoud said:

Thanks. Is your translation of that forthcoming?

Malcolm wrote:

No, just part of my reading.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 4:33 AM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

The better question is; what kind of 'refuge' is being offered? In English, 'refuge' implies safety from danger. Obviously simply becoming a Buddhist does not guarantee that bad things will not happen to you.

So what are we even talking about?

KathyLauren said:

The way it was explained to me was that Refuge means "refuge from suffering". Taking refuge in the Buddha, Dharma and Sangha means acknowledging that only those three things, and nothing else, can free one from suffering. Looking elsewhere for refuge from suffering is futile and is breaking the spirit of one's Refuge Vow.

Om mani padme hum

Kathy

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Years ago a lady I knew that was entirely devoted to Kagyu Dharma died in a house fire. My personal understanding of Refuge has had to include that information. So you can see why I ask such questions.

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone who goes for refuge will die, somehow. The question you have to ask, is "Did

she go to lower realms after she died?"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 5:17 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

A convention of what?

Malcolm wrote:

A cause.

Sherab said:

And what is a cause which is not a thing but a convention of a cause?

Malcolm wrote:

A convention.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 10:06 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

There needs to be an established word-for-word English language standard for translating Sanskrit /Pali/Tibetan concepts.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, in a hundred years or so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 10:17 AM

Title: Re: The History behind the transition from Adi-Buddha Samantabhadra to Vajradhara

Content:

SubduerOfNegativity said:

Vajradhara, as depicted in Sakya and Geluk, demonstrates the so-called seven limbs of the three kāyas, which is the result of the fourth empowerment and represents realization of mahāmudrā. The source of this presentation is the Jñānavajrasammucaya Tantra.

The simplest way to explain this is that the limb of the dharmakāya is naturelessness, or lack of inherent existence (rang bzhin med pa); the three limbs of the sambhogakāya are complete enjoyment, union, and great bliss; and the three limbs of the nirmanakāya are being filled with compassion, not being interrupted, and never ceasing. Sometimes the limbs of not being interrupted or ceasing is placed with the dharmakāya.

There is no "transition" from Samantabhadra to Vajradhara. Samantabhadra is the name given to the dharmakāya in the root tantra of yoga tantra, the Compendium of the Principles of the Tathāgatas as well as the Guhyasamāja Tantra, the root tantra of the so-called father tantras in highest yoga tantra.

Malcolm wrote:

Thanks for you reply, Malcolm!

Actually, the Guhyasamāja -- the root tantra of the so-called father tantra's of the Yoga-niruttara Tantra class -- it is Vajradhara. [/quote]

So, you've read the Guhyasamāja? In Tibetan or Sanskrit? I'll provide the citation tomorrow.

SubduerOfNegativity said:

And I've read the Compendium of Principles of the Tathagatas, and it is (Maha)Vairocana who takes the central role...

Malcolm wrote:

How do you explain this citation then?

I, Samantabhadra, have no form,  
But exhibit the form of a bodhisattva  
To teach bodhisattvas.

SubduerOfNegativity said:

Just looking for some more accurate and detailed information about how in the evolution of Indian Buddhism, Buddha Vajradhāra gradually displaced Samantabhadra, who is the 'Primordial Buddha'

Malcolm wrote:

The Guhyasamāja was first translated during the imperial period.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 11:35 AM

Title: Re: The History behind the transition from Adi-Buddha Samantabhadra to Vajradhara

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, the Guhyasamaja -- the root tantra of the so-called father tantra's of the Yoga-niruttara Tantra class -- it is Vajradhara.

So, you've read the Guhyasamaja? In Tibetan or Sanskrit? I'll provide the citation tomorrow.

Samantabhadra as a name of the dharmakāya occurs 10 times in the Guhasamāja; Vajradhara, 14 times.

Also both names appear in the Mañjuśrīnamasamgiti.

The name Samantabhadra also appears Sandhivakyakarana explanatory tantra:

Immaculately pure by nature,  
the mind is Samantabhadra.

And in the Vajramala Explanatory tantra:

The supreme basis of all bliss,  
the nature of all things,  
this is explained to be Samantabhadra.

And:

Vajra is Vajrasattva,  
Vajrabhairava, Iśvara,  
Heruka, Kālacakra,  
Adibuddha, Mahāmuni,  
Samantabhadra, Mañjuśrī...

And in the Compendium of Principles of All Tathāgatas it is also said:

Samantabhadra is the nature of all,  
the lord of all migrating beings of the desire realm.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 8:06 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Tsonkhapa's lama was Drikung Kagyu. So...

Malcolm wrote:

Tsongkhapa's principle teacher was the Sakya Master, Rendawa Zhonnu Lodro, from he received Go transmission of Guhyasamaja. Tsongkhapa also studied at Drikung, where he received the Marpa transmission of Guhyasamaja as well as the six yogas of Naropa.

But Tsongkhapa's Sakya connections were sufficiently strong that in the early days, his school was called "New Sakya." He also self-identified as a Sakyapa in several of his earlier works. To my knowledge, he never identified as A Kagyu, though he certainly had Kagyu teachers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Great Vegan Debate

Content:

ConfusedOne said:

The Buddha did say to kill a animal cleanly and quickly

seeker242 said:

Where does the Buddha say this?

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha never said this, anywhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: I'm confused about Buddhist arguments against a creator God and what that entails for buddha activity?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Then there's the whole "Godhead" thing, where there's no idea of a creature.

Malcolm wrote:

And why should we care about such Christian foolishness?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, November 27th, 2021 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

It's where he got instructions on the nature of mind.

Malcolm wrote:

He received instructions on the nature of mind from Sakya, Kagyu, and Nyingma teachers, but mostly, according to Geluk accounts, from Mañjuśrī in person. Also, Tsongkhapa rejected direct introduction.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Changing tradition and Guru yoga

Content:

Vajradhara said:

Hello everyone,

I found myself changing tradition and i fear my practice of guru yoga could be weakened by this. I still keep the samayas and vows taken with my previous guru but i didn't speak about my change with them.

Do you know how to manage this situation? Should i retake the initiation with the tradition i'm following right now?

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

Unify all gurus in one guruyoga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 1:32 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The arguments in the Laṅkā with regard to TG and a self are not oppositional in my opinion because the MPNS is not positing the kind of self that the Laṅkā is refuting.

Malcolm wrote:

The Lanka is claiming that the TG is just a palliative for those who are not prepared to accept emptiness, and that functionally, it is the all-basis consciousness. That seems oppositional to me, which is why the Mādhyamikas seized on that definition in the Lanka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 1:48 AM

Title: Re: 48 secondary Bodhisattva downfalls

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Could someone tell me or send me a link to the 48 secondary Bodhisattva downfalls as transmitted by Atisha, compiled by Shantideva which is found in Siksasamuccaya.

(I have already come across the secondary Bodhisattva downfalls which comes from Asanga, so I am not searching for this one).

Malcolm wrote:

How about in the Siksasamuccaya?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 3:14 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

He learned Mahamudra from the DK lineage master.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, he learned one stream of mahāmudrā from Kagyu masters; the other, from Sakyā masters, connected with the traditions of Cakrasamvara, Kalacakra (six limb yoga), and Guhyasamāja. Mahāmudrā is common to Kagyu, Gelug, Sakya, and Jonang. No one schools "owns" mahāmudrā.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

tingdzin said:

One should also take into account that Tathagatagarbha teachings (according to Williams) were much more popular in China than in India, and may be a reflection of doctrinal approaches which began in the early centuries CE rather than indicating a continuity of such an approach from the times of Shakyamuni.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because it played to subitist tendencies in China that were systematically rejected by Indian pañḍitas at the major centers of learning in India from the time of Asanga onwards.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 4:24 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

...that were systematically rejected by Indian pañḍitas at the major centers of learning in India from the time of Asanga onwards.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

While you are free to hold up this time and place as the gold standard for doctrinal purity for yourself, please understand that is not universally shared.



Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there are a few people who seem to think that Indian paṇḍitas, both Madhyamaka and Yogacāra, really have no authority in their own teachings in their native language. Isn't strange that both Madhyamaka and Yogacāra systematically rejected subitism? One wonders why this would be the case. Could it possible be that it is because India is the source of Buddhadharma?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

He had to talk to Manjusri to write books.

Malcolm wrote:

More than that— his experience of awakening, according to Gelug lore, came from his sustained interactions with Mañjuśrī, first through Lama Umapa and next, through his own visionary experience.

It would be interesting to see a comparison made between the six yogas of Naropa texts he wrote with the Jigten Sumgon texts. Thubten Jinpa's bio of Tsongkhapa (well written and interesting) states that in the colophons of his Vajrayāna texts made it clear that he had realized the meaning of these teachings, before he felt comfortable setting them down in the last ten years or so of his life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 4:44 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

If my teacher is enlightened, all I care about is whatever teachings and practices he had to get that way. That's my gold standard.

Malcolm wrote:

And how would you know he or she was "enlightened?" Because that is a big IF.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

What they did 1,000 years ago in India is of some intellectual interest, but it's not all that relevant to me or my practice.

Malcolm wrote:

I disagree, it has a huge impact on how your practice today is shaped. The debates and controversies at Nalanda and Vikramashila had a huge impact on what was transmitted to Tibet, by whom, and when. Those impacts continue to resound today even here on Dharmawheel. But this little diversion is

What I am referring to is that fact that subitist\* tendencies are quite pronounced in Chinese Buddhism, because of the embrace of TG; whereas they are quite suppressed and reigned in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism, where the TG has, with difficulty, been absorbed. The reason for this clearly is the absence of Indian influence on the one hand, and its presence on the other. Even the schools that embrace wholeheartedly the TG doctrine in Tibet are still gradualist in orientation. And most Tibetan Buddhist scholars (but not all), historically, have not paid much attention to the TG doctrine, other than polemically, and as at best a provisional teaching. And this again has everything to do with what some Indian dudes thought.

\*Subitism: The application of the term "subitism" to Buddhism is derived from the French illumination subite (sudden awakening), contrasting with 'illumination graduelle' (gradual awakening). It gained currency in this use in English from the work of sinologist Paul Demiéville. His 1947 work 'Mirror of the Mind' was widely read in the U.S. It inaugurated a series by him on subitism and gradualism.[web 1][5]  
<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Subitism>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I disagree, it has a huge impact on how your practice today is shaped. The debates and controversies at Nalanda and Vikramashila had a huge impact on what was transmitted to Tibet, by whom, and when. Those impacts continue to resound today even here on Dharmawheel.

I'm a Shentongpa. That didn't exist in India.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, actually it did, in the work of Ratnakāraśanti, a paṇḍita of Vikramaśīla. Apart from tathāgatagarbha, which he ignored, his arguments about the ultimate existence of gnosis are taken directly from his works by such gzhan stong scholars as Shakya Chogden, Taranatha, etc. There is also his attempt to reconcile Nāgārjuna with the Maitreyan corpus, which also inspired these gzhan stong scholars. One of his works was translated by his student, the Nepali paṇḍita, Śāntibhadra, complete with a colophon complaining bitterly of the annihilationism of Candrakīrti. Someone recently did a paper on this text which you can find on Academia edu.

Incidentally, you contradict your own tradition, which asserts that gzhan stong entered Tibetan through the Kashmiri Paṇḍita Sajjana, so again, an Indian paṇḍita...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:12 AM  
Title: Re: Question about dependent origination  
Content:

Sherab said:  
And what is a cause which is not a thing but a convention of a cause?

Malcolm wrote:  
A convention.

Sherab said:  
So, a cause is a convention of a cause which is a convention of a convention of a cause .....

Malcolm wrote:  
All the way down, and there is no bottom,

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:26 AM  
Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?  
Content:

tobes said:  
There is an ambiguity about what Tsong Khapa thought/practiced/transmitted with respect to DI-mahamudra.

i.e. we have to make inferences based on what was written, but some things may have been transmitted as (unwritten) secret teachings. Different Gelug masters/scholars have different opinions on the question.

Malcolm wrote:  
Well we don't really, since Pabhongkha clearly states that Tsongkhapa rejected direct introduction. Are you suggesting that there is some secret teaching in Geluk Pabhongkha didn't hold?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 10:12 AM  
Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?  
Content:

tobes said:  
There is an ambiguity about what Tsong Khapa thought/practiced/transmitted with respect to DI-mahamudra.

i.e. we have to make inferences based on what was written, but some things may have

been transmitted as (unwritten) secret teachings. Different Gelug masters/scholars have different opinions on the question.

Malcolm wrote:

Well we don't really, since Pabhongkha clearly states that Tsongkhapa rejected direct introduction. Are you suggesting that there is some secret teaching in Geluk Pabhongkha didn't hold?

tobes said:

I said "different Gelug masters/scholars have different opinions on the question." Pabhongka is one - and only one - such master.

So yes, it is quite possible that there were ear whispered transmissions from TK to close disciples which were intentionally not written down/kept from wider circulation.

It is also quite possible that there weren't, and later Gelug Mahamudra masters (such as CG) moved a little from TK's explicit position.

At the end of the day, this is something no one today can really answer with much evidence.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we have two pieces of evidence—Tsongkhapa's own writing, and Pabhongkha's confirmation of that position.

There is a third piece as well, Gorampa's refutation of Tsongkhapa's position...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 8:18 PM

Title: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Unknown said:

Has the Biden administration accomplished anything? It has created a sea change in our country, rebuilding its strength by orienting the government away from the supply-side economics that led lawmakers to protect the interests of the wealthy, and toward the far more traditional focus on building the economy by supporting regular Americans.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/november-27-2021?r=62xctc&utm\\_campaign=post&utm\\_medium=web&utm\\_source=copy](https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/november-27-2021?r=62xctc&utm_campaign=post&utm_medium=web&utm_source=copy)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Does the Mo Divination System Require Empowerment?

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

I can see having the lung for the Manjushri mantra being useful for this system, but still can't find a definitive answer on it being required.

Malcolm wrote:

All mantras require a lung.

A friend of mine, an old student of HH Sakya Trichen, went to him for a mo. HHST went to get his dice, stopped, and asked my friend, "Do you need the dice?"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

tobes said:

I said "different Gelug masters/scholars have different opinions on the question."

Pabhongka is one - and only one - such master.

So yes, it is quite possible that there were ear whispered transmissions from TK to close disciples which were intentionally not written down/kept from wider circulation.

It is also quite possible that there weren't, and later Gelug Mahamudra masters (such as CG) moved a little from TK's explicit position.

At the end of the day, this is something no one today can really answer with much evidence.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we have two pieces of evidence— Tsongkhapa's own writing, and Pabhongkha's confirmation of that position.

There is a third piece as well, Gorampa's refutation of Tsongkhapa's position...

tobes said:

Since what's at stake here is the question of what might have been transmitted but not written - i.e. the possibility of an ear whispered lineage - neither Tsong Khapa's own writing, nor Gorampa's refutation of that really count as evidence. The same problem also applies to Pabhongkha, except that it is deepened, given that he existed many centuries later.

One needs to examine the Gelug Mahamudra texts, such as Highway of the Conquerors,

and ask: what connections (if any) exist between those statements and Tsong Khapa? And people arrive at different conclusions from that task.

Malcolm wrote:

Considering that Pabhongkha is considered to be the main person who transmitted the Ganden Mahāmudrā tradition in the last century to the present generation, and since he explicitly writes that Tsongkhapa rejected introductions, using this as a precedent for excluding the introduction to dharmatā that is part of the Sakyapa Naro Khachö system, I'd say we can definitely accept his opinion.

On the face of it, the Ganden Mahāmudra is little different than the other Mahāmudra systems in Tibet that trace their origin to Saraha. The Panchen Lama calls it "sutra mahāmudra" ostensibly because he is not requiring an empowerment, but the instructions themselves are virtually identical to such texts as "In Front of the Stupa" in Sakya, differing only in that some empowerment is required to practice the former. Also, recall, Ganden Mahāmudra provoked considerable controversy in the beginning, since up to that point the Gelukpas pretty consistently followed Sapan's rejection of so-called sūtra mahāmudra, and it even annoyed the Great Fifth, who was involved in an actual war with the Karma Kagyu school.

There is also the fact that you and I may mean different things by "introduction."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Changing tradition and Guru yoga

Content:

Vajradhara said:

Hello everyone,

I found myself changing tradition and i fear my practice of guru yoga could be weakened by this. I still keep the samayas and vows taken with my previous guru but i didn't speak about my change with them.

Do you know how to manage this situation? Should i retake the initiation with the tradition i'm following right now?

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

Unify all gurus in one guruyoga.

Vajradhara said:

Do you mean to look at everyone as an emanation of Vajradhara?

Malcolm wrote:

I mean that you visualize Vajradhara, and you understand that Vajradhara embodies all

of your gurus.

Unify all gurus in one guru yoga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

And although nobody is calling it a “General Strike” it seems that through stimulus money or whatever, that’s what the administration has empowered much of the low-pay-range workforce to accomplish. As a result, the minimum wage is going up, the value of labor is higher, and I think much business-model restructuring will take place, probably for the better. Not to mention much overdue infrastructure upgrades.

Malcolm wrote:

We just to blackmail Manchin and Sinema, and the BBB bill will pass.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 10:18 PM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Javierfv1212 said:

General question: is Tathāgataśāstra available in english translation somewhere?

Zhen Li said:

I completed a translation from Chinese and am still editing it, but I should finish it very soon.

84000 is translating from Tibetan, but its page says "Current version v 0.0.1 (2019)", so I am unsure where it is currently.

I heard of around 3 or 4 people who, for the past decade, have been translating or doing critical editions of it. So, there's definitely a lot of interest, but maybe a lack of concentration or motivation.

Malcolm wrote:

Text critical scholarship moves slowly. Frankly, we don't have time. Someone can always come along later and improve our translations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

zerwe said:

How is this reconciled with the Pabongkha's promotion of Vajrayogini within Gelug, which is purported to be the Naro Khacho from the 13 Golden Dharmas of the oral transmission lineage of the Sakya father and sons? Are you saying he continued with his established precedent and omitted the instructions as followed by the Sakyapa?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that is precisely what I am saying. He deliberately excluded a key part of the Sakyapa transmission on the grounds that Tsongkhapa rejected such introductions. It's not a big deal as it sounds, really, as this introduction is not necessarily given in Sakya during the standard ten day instruction.

In any case, Tsongkhapa had already rejected a key point in the Sakya system of Cakrasamvara over all, the idea that the "ultimate secret" (guhyānta) means what the Sakyapas claim it means. You can read about that in Gray's intro to his translation of the Laghusamvara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: Who can give Refuge?

Content:

Karma Dorje said:

We aren't taking refuge, like under a bus shelter in the rain. We go for refuge by practicing the path.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, we go for refuge, we don't take anything. In Tibetan: "skyabs [refuge] su [for/to] 'gro [go]."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, November 28th, 2021 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Rick said:

Alas in the post-truth world, doing a great job in a way statistics bear out only has real meaning for those who support the party in power. Opponents will either ignore the statistics, spin them in a negative way, or flat out deny them.

Malcolm wrote:

I think the point is that people will not ignore money in their pockets and increased services.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 3:26 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

zerwe said:

How is this reconciled with the Pabongkha's promotion of Vajrayogini within Gelug, which is purported to be the Naro Khacho from the 13 Golden Dharmas of the oral transmission lineage of the Sakya father and sons? Are you saying he continued with his established precedent and omitted the instructions as followed by the Sakyapa?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that is precisely what I am saying. He deliberately excluded a key part of the Sakyapa transmission on the grounds that Tsongkhapa rejected such introductions. It's not a big deal as it sounds, really, as this introduction is not necessarily given in Sakya during the standard ten day instruction.

In any case, Tsongkhapa had already rejected a key point in the Sakya system of Cakrasamvara over all, the idea that the "ultimate secret" (guhyānta) means what the Sakyapas claim it means. You can read about that in Gray's intro to his translation of the Laghusamvara.

conebeckham said:

Are you referring to Gray's translation of Tsong Khapa's commentary? I don't recall it in the volume of the actual Tantra....

Malcolm wrote:

Its in the intro of the translation of the root text.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 3:30 AM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

clyde said:

Yes.

jimmi said:

If that is so, how would you know?

clyde said:

It is accepted Buddhist doctrine across all traditions that there are Pratyeka Buddhas; so a teacher, realized or not, may be beneficial, but is not necessary.

Malcolm wrote:

Not while there is the doctrine of a samyaksambuddha in the world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 5:07 AM

Title: Re: Does the Mo Divination System Require Empowerment?

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

but ALL mantras?

Malcolm wrote:

All mantras.

There exist dharāṇis, which may not require a lung. But all mantras do, especially for texts like Mipham's Mañjuśrī dice mo.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 5:15 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Sustained interaction with Manjushri seems like a pretty serious deal, no?

Should we view Master Tsongkapa a Buddhisatva or Buddha?

zerwe said:

He has been regarded as a "second Buddha." Padmasambhava, at an earlier time, was also given this title by his devotees.

Malcolm wrote:

As was Nāgārjuna, the original second Buddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 5:40 AM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

Matt J said:

I think this is not uncommon error among neo-Advaitins and self-taught people who lack access to proper instruction.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, Smṛtijñānakīrti, in his Commentary on the Bodhicittavivaraṇa remarks that svasaṃvedana (so so rang rig), often translated as self-awareness, etc., simply refers to sensations that one has that one is unable to communicate with others. He defines it in this in contrast to the svasaṃvedana proposed by cittamantrins, as self-aware aspectless consciousness.

Yes, and in fact also Dzogchen texts, as you know, take great pains to distinguish rang rig, as the term is used in Dzogchen texts, from the false-aspectarian Yogacāra usage, etc.,

specifically so that people do not mistake Dzogchen view for the position of Yogacāra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 6:14 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

tobes said:

I'm not sure why you think a 19th century master takes precedence on this question, over the actual genesis of the tradition as it unfolded 1500's'ish.

Malcolm wrote:

Because said master was the main lineage holder of the Ganden Mahāmudra tradition, so according to your reasoning, as the main person responsible for this transmission, his opinions on related matters should hold considerable sway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 6:28 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

tobes said:

I think you need to examine more closely. In Highway of the Conquerors

Malcolm wrote:

I'll read it and get back to you. The auto-commentary to which you refer, the Utterly Clear Lamp (yang gsal sgron ma), is not terribly long.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 9:06 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

So, a cause is a convention of a cause which is a convention of a convention of a cause .....

Malcolm wrote:

All the way down, and there is no bottom,

Sherab said:

Since conventions are mind made, therefore, as far as your analysis goes, it applies only to whatever is in the mind. It cannot say anything as regards whatever is external to the

mind, and the nature of whatever is external to the mind.

Malcolm wrote:

“Mind” is also a convention, just like everything else, both external and internal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

PeterC said:

He almost certainly loses the senate (formally) in the mid-terms next year, and may actually lose congress at the same time. Then in 2024 it's going to be very hard to get a democrat elected with all the gerrymandering and election board dismembering that the republicans are doing in the states they lost in 2020. So three years from now we could have a republican president, house and senate again.

Malcolm wrote:

Agreed.

PeterC said:

The republicans have abandoned democracy at this point.

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly. The GOP “elites” have fully embraced Fascism.

PeterC said:

Biden isn't a turning point, he's a pause before the downwards journey continues.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends. If the SCOTUS overturns Roe, it might just be the push needed to keep all three houses in the hands of the Democrats, because there will a huge number of pissed of women in the USA.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Text critical scholarship moves slowly. Frankly, we don't have time. Someone can always come along later and improve our translations.

Zhen Li said:

Translation simply isn't the priority I think. In the west, it doesn't usually count for tenure review or hiring considerations, so academics, if they do it, do it in their spare time. This

seems to gradually be changing, but the situation is still not ideal.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, academics, in Western Buddhist studies, resemble forensic pathologists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Thrangu R. on prayer and deities, etc.

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

So from the Vajrayana point of view, there is in fact something topiary to, and doing so does facilitate one's attainment of the result.

DW has a lot of threads and posts about these points. I just thought I'd share how an authority on Karma Kagyu view sees it.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course there is an object of supplication, relatively speaking, and the merit of making such supplications supports the attainment of buddhahood. No one rejects this.

But not even buddhas exist from their own side.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 10:49 PM

Title: Re: Thrangu R. on prayer and deities, etc.

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The King of Samadhi Sutra extols the benefits is supplications and offerings the result being the samadhi of non origination of phenomena aka dharmakaya.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and Instructions

Content:

KoreanDharma said:

Will there be a link to the for the YouTube livestream?

Seeker12 said:

This is all I have

<https://sites.google.com/sakyatemple.org/great-compassion-mahamudra/home>

Malcolm wrote:

It will be on facebook, Sakya Dolma Phodrang, and Youtube.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, November 29th, 2021 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

That depends. If the SCOTUS overturns Roe, it might just be the push needed to keep all three houses in the hands of the Democrats, because there will a huge number of pissed of women in the USA.

PeterC said:

It may well be. The republican takeover of the judiciary is really the worst part of their project. A majority of the court throwing out settled precedent may make people wake up to the fact that the third branch of government no longer protects them.

Malcolm wrote:

It's funny, you know. One thing the right wing media never talks about is the globalization of the media. CNN, for example, for all its faults, is fully committed to liberal democracy, and is fully US based. Fox, on the other hand, is controlled by a corrupt media oligarch who has been pushing a far right wing agenda as long as anyone can remember, first destroying the British media, and now ours, for their own financial gain and power. It pretends to be "patriotic," but it is not, because it does not support democracy at all. Democracy is inconvenient for oligarchs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Thrangu R. on prayer and deities, etc.

Content:

Astus said:

Blessings are the inspiration gained by devotion to progress on the path.

'Sometimes people think that blessings are something that will make them shake, tremble, and even levitate. But that is not what blessings are. Blessings are the power of the Dharma. When we encounter the power of the Dharma, we start to feel faith, and then we become diligent. We feel love and compassion, and we develop tranquility and insight. This is what blessings are. They are the absence of greed, aversion, and delusion. If we can entirely rid ourselves of those three things right away, that is wonderful, but even if not, we can decrease and suppress them. That is blessings.'  
(Vivid Awareness by Thrangu Rinpoche, p 41)

Malcolm wrote:

Exactly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

clyde said:

I don't think that is the understanding in the Zen tradition. (This is a Zen forum.) Can you provide references?

Lobsang Chojor said:

I received these teachings in the grounds and paths material, I believe it's from Asanga in the abhidharma-samuccaya. Malcolm will know far more than me here though.

It's also in the dharmagupta vinaya

clyde said:

Can you or Malcolm provide the text (or a pointer to its location) which states that Pratyeka Buddhas cannot appear "while Sakyamuni's dharma is existent" I know of no Zen teacher or text that states such a thing.

Malcolm wrote:

It's basic buddhism.

clyde said:

II. I. The Period In Which No Buddha Exists

Pacceka Buddhas are said to exist only in periods when there are no Buddhas. "A person realises Paccekabodhi only when reborn at a time when there is no Buddha" (S-a III 189 and 208). Other expressions to denote this period are: "the time which lies between (the appearances of) a Lord" (A-a I 194); "a period in which no Teacher has appeared" (Pv-a III 144); and "the period between the Buddha (-periods)" (A-a II 192). One of the main characteristics of the Paccekabuddha's career is that he attains insight during such a period. But this does not mean that his whole aspiration to enlightenment is restricted to this time; it is invariably a matter of many existences of hard work, during which he practises the perfections and accumulates the conditions for enlightenment.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://www.bps.lk/olib/wh/wh305\\_Kloppenborg\\_PaccekaBuddha-Concept-In-Pali-Canon-Commentary.pdf](https://www.bps.lk/olib/wh/wh305_Kloppenborg_PaccekaBuddha-Concept-In-Pali-Canon-Commentary.pdf), pg. 41.

We are in the period of Buddha Śakyamuni, hence there are no prayekabuddhas in our age.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 2:33 AM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and

Instructions

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It will be on facebook, Sakya Dolma Phodrang, and Youtube.

Seeker12 said:

Do you happen to know the exact name of the empowerment and/or any other information about it?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is literally the initiation of the Union of Mahākāruṇika and Mahāmudrā. Here is the full text in Tibetan:

<http://www.tbrc.org/eBooks/W23681-2418-13-28-any.pdf>

It is an important Sakya sadhana tradition that comes from Sachen Kunga Nyingpo, and ultimately from Mahāsiddha Vajrasanapa, the guru of Bari Lotsawa. Bari Lotsawa was Sachen's tutor and the second throne holder of Sakya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

What I was asking is whether the thing being referred to in "fundamentally there is no thing", only refers to the mental image in the mind and not to the physical thing from which the perceiving mind generates its image, or the physical thing or both. We all know that the mental image of a thing is NOT a true representation of the physical thing. The mental image is only a functional representation of the physical thing. Since it is only a functional representation, that thing being represented does not truly exist. But the physical thing out there could still truly exist. Therefore how the thing in "fundamentally there is no thing" is interpreted needs clarification.

krodha said:

This phenomena-noumena dichotomy is not found in Buddhist teachings. Positing a noumena beyond your senses is positing a svabhāva.

Sherab said:

What you say is all in your mind, not mine.

Malcolm wrote:

Conventionally, there are things out there. It's not a problem unless one wants to propose that things exist from their own side. That includes everything, both subject and objects, insides and outsides.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Thrangu R. on prayer and deities, etc.

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

ibid p.144: [of the old edition]

Thrangu R. said:

Q: Could you talk about the relationship between purification and blessing?

A: These two--purification and receiving blessings--are distinct. They are not exactly the same. Purification means that the obscurations--the cognitive obscurations, which is ignorance, and the afflictive obscurations, which are the mental afflictions and the karmic obscurations or the negative karma that you have accumulated--are gradually purified, which means removed from you. And receiving blessing means that through your supplication of the Buddhas or of the Dharma, you receive their blessing. For example, when you supplicate the Medicine Buddha, through the power of your own supplication combined with the power of the twelve aspirations made by the Medicine Buddha, something happens, and that is called blessing. On the other hand, while purification and blessing are distinct, either one can cause the other. The removal of obscurations allows you to receive the blessings (more fully) and receiving blessings brings about the removal of obscurations.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

(formatting mine)

Okay, so "something happens"? Tell me more! Oh well, I guess he just doesn't want to go there.

we start to feel faith, and then we become diligent. We feel love and compassion, and we develop tranquility and insight.

Malcolm wrote:

There is your something.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 5:35 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Matt J said:

How about the snang ba - snang yul dichotomy?

Malcolm wrote:

Neither exists from its own side.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 5:39 AM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and Instructions

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Is this the same Sadhana called 'Ocean of Compassion' or a different one?

Malcolm wrote:

Completely different. That is from Thagthong Gyalpo. HHST gave the transmission for that a few weeks ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 6:53 AM

Title: Re: Thrangu R. on prayer and deities, etc.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

But not even buddhas exist from their own side.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

They don't have to in order to function in the way Rinpoche explains.

Malcolm wrote:

of course. If they did, they couldn't.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 7:09 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

What LJS says in Gongchig is that TG relates with Buddha activities.

Malcolm wrote:

That's unsurprising, since that is the basic point of the Uttaratantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and Instructions

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Is this the same Sadhana called 'Ocean of Compassion' or a different one?

Malcolm wrote:

Completely different. That is from Thagthong Gyalpo. HHST gave the transmission for that a few weeks ago.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Cool, thanks. I could swear it is not Thangtong Gyalpo though, I thought that was Filling Space to Benefit Beings. I'll check my copy.

EDIT: it's credited to Ngorchen Gonchok Lhundrub. This sadhana (it is not restricted and ok to discuss here afaik) contains a "mahamudra" section and in the preface refers to itself as combining Great Compassion and Mahamudra in the preface by Dagchen Rinpoche, that is why I am asking whether it is the same.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, that's not the actual Tibetan title of Konchok Lhundrup's text, but yes, it is that text.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 11:20 AM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and Instructions

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Is this the same Sadhana called 'Ocean of Compassion' or a different one?

Malcolm wrote:

Completely different. That is from Thagthong Gyalpo. HHST gave the transmission for that a few weeks ago.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Cool, thanks. I could swear it is not Thangtong Gyalpo though, I thought that was Filling Space to Benefit Beings. I'll check my copy.

EDIT: it's credited to Ngorchen Gonchok Lhundrub. This sadhana (it is not restricted and ok to discuss here afaik) contains a "mahamudra" section and in the preface refers to itself as combining Great Compassion and Mahamudra in the preface by Dagchen Rinpoche, that is why I am asking whether it is the same.

Malcolm wrote:

BTW:

At the vajra advice of His Holiness the Sakya Trichen, Vajrayana texts are not to be posted or transmitted by electronic means in order to preserve the samaya commitment of secrecy. Therefore, The Simultaneous Practice of the Greatly Compassionate One and Mahamudra with Instructions by Very Venerable Dezhung Rinpoche is available only in paper copy through the postal service.

Granted, in this day and age...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, November 30th, 2021 at 12:29 PM

Title: Re: Sakya Trichen and Sakya Trizin Avalokiteshvara Empowerment and Instructions

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Cool, thanks. I could swear it is not Thangtong Gyalpo though, I thought that was Filling Space to Benefit Beings. I'll check my copy.

EDIT: it's credited to Ngorchen Gonchok Lhundrub. This sadhana (it is not restricted and ok to discuss here afaik) contains a "mahamudra" section and in the preface refers to itself as combining Great Compassion and Mahamudra in the preface by Dagchen Rinpoche, that is why I am asking whether it is the same.

Malcolm wrote:

BTW:

At the vajra advice of His Holiness the Sakya Trichen, Vajrayana texts are not to be posted or transmitted by electronic means in order to preserve the samaya commitment of secrecy. Therefore, The Simultaneous Practice of the Greatly Compassionate One and Mahamudra with Instructions by Very Venerable Dezhung Rinpoche is available only in paper copy through the postal service. Granted, in this day and age...

Johnny Dangerous said:

Ok so to be clear though, the initiation is for the text I'm talking about? I don't mind ordering it if not, if it is the text I'm talking about, I own it and have had the lung, initiation, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it's for that transmission.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

clyde said:

Nevertheless, the OP's question was whether realization is possible without a realized teacher, so the existence of Pratyeka Buddhas of the past and the potential of Pratyeka Buddhas in the future seems to answer the question in the positive.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, you see, even pratyekabuddhas trained under a buddha, so yes, a realized teacher

is still needed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You are changing the terms.

An appearance indeed belongs to a mind; but an apparent object does not (as Longchenpa shows in both chapter 8 and chapter 12 of his commentary on the Treasury of the Dharmadhātu). For this reasons there are appearances for sentient beings, but not for rocks and trees. Saying that neither appearances nor apparent objects exist from their own side does not entail that that both exist from the mind's side. The mind itself does not exist from its own side.

Matt J said:

Well, if they don't exist from their own side, and are only mere appearances, and mere appearances only appear in minds...

How about the snang ba - snang yul dichotomy?

Malcolm wrote:

Neither exists from its own side.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Matt J said:

This is Mipham's phrasing in his Beacon at 6.2.1.3.2.1 states that "the common perceptual object is a mere appearance (snang tsam)." This is not to say that things exist from the mind's side, or that the mind exists. However, it is unclear how a non-existent object can appear absent a mind.

Malcolm wrote:

The common perceptual object is liquid. How it appears to beings in the six realms is a mere appearance for the mind of a sentient being in one of the six realms. However, the point here is that there is a common perceptual object.

Matt J said:

Even Longchenpa cites scriptures about how everything is an illusion. How can there be illusions absent minds?

Malcolm wrote:

Illusions are perceptual objects. How can there be an illusion without the sticks, mud,

paper, mantra of the illusionist?

Matt J said:

criticizes the notion that there is some nature to objects apart from their various appearances, positing a common substance with multiple appearances, or some sort of slightly existing object.

Malcolm wrote:

Mipham is criticizing here Tsongkhapa's assertion that the common perceptual object is composed of six parts, making it possible for it to appear as six different entities to six different kinds of sentient beings.

All we need to know is that, conventionally speaking, there are common perceptual objects. Even Mipham cannot avoid using the term "object" as the basis for a mental appearance. Why? Because it is incoherent to posit the arising of a sense consciousness in absence of a sense organ and a sense object. Hence nothing in the triad exists from its own side.

Matt J said:

However, it is unclear how a non-existent object can appear absent a mind.

Malcolm wrote:

A nonexistent object cannot appear at all, for example, the child of a barren woman or the horns of a hare. An existent object can certainly appear, such as liquid to the sentient beings of the six realms, without having to posit that existence as anything more than a convention. Certainly, one cannot establish such an object ultimately, but on the other hand, one cannot speak of the emptiness of a nonexistent, such as the child of a barren woman either. Thus appearances are neither true, nor are they false, just like the moon in the water. Without the moon reflected in the water, an appearance of the moon in the water cannot exist, and thus a mind in which the moon in the water appears cannot exist. The mind in which the moon appears to be reflected in the water cannot exist before the moon is reflected in the water, nor after. The mind in which the moon appears to be reflected in the water can exist only while it is apprehending the moon reflected in the water. When the moon is no longer reflected in the water, the mind in which the moon reflected in the water appears ceases.

Nothing exists from its own side. Objects are not primary, nor are minds. They are mutually dependent, therefore, neither are established in truth, and all is conventional. This is the meaning of arising from conditions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 6:50 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

What you say is all in your mind, not mine.

Malcolm wrote:

Conventionally, there are things out there. It's not a problem unless one wants to propose that things exist from their own side. That includes everything, both subject and objects, insides and outsides.

Sherab said:

As I have argued previously, it is all mental representations based on your argument. Because of that kind of argument, whether things that are out there actually exist from their own side is not a knowledge accessible to such a mind which itself is also a convention.

Malcolm wrote:

Things can't exist from their own side because if they did, that would require them to exist inherently. Further, no one at any time has ever beheld an inherently existing thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 10:42 PM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

Riju said:

Consciousness is bound by an ego. Awareness goes beyond ego and Emptiness.

PadmaVonSamba said:

This has sort of been my understanding.

Malcolm wrote:

This has nothing to do with the teachings of the Buddha. The Buddha never identified something as "awareness" which is separate from the consciousness and which "goes beyond the ego and emptiness." This is some kind of Advaita idea.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 1st, 2021 at 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

50,000 years ago, you could cross by land from Asia to what is now North America. Today, you need to rely on a boat or a plane. You can't do it just by yourself.

Malcolm wrote:

You couldn't do it by yourself at the time either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 2nd, 2021 at 3:30 AM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

LucasGP said:

. . . can one achieve realization in Zen even if one cannot find any realized teacher?

Matylda said:

no

clyde said:

If there are no realized (fully awakened) living Zen Masters (This is not a position I hold, but seems to be a position held by many and which also applies to other Buddhist traditions.) and realization is not possible without a realized teacher (Again, not a position I hold, but one held by many.), then it would seem that the effort, at least in this lifetime, is fruitless.

And if there are realized Zen Masters (or teachers in other Buddhist traditions), who are they?

Malcolm wrote:

Full awakening is rare. But awakening is less so. You don't need a buddha for a teacher, you just need a bodhisattva on the paths and stages, and then, maybe not even a first stage bodhisattva, but someone who has some measure of training and realization on the path of application.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 2nd, 2021 at 5:58 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The common perceptual object is liquid. How it appears to beings in the six realms is a mere appearance for the mind of a sentient being in one of the six realms. However, the point here is that there is a common perceptual object.

Matt J said:

This is exactly the position that Mipham negates. He also negates the idea that there are degrees of emptiness or existence, or that there is a separation between emptiness and appearances.

Malcolm wrote:

He is just negating what Gorampa has already negated: in other words, the appearance of liquid in the human realm is invalid in the preta realm. Calling liquid a common perceptual object is merely a convention to conform to the fact that different beings perceive liquids. It does mean that one is asserting some really existing common perceptual object.



And of course, there are no degrees of existence or emptiness, nor is there a separation between appearance and emptiness. No one suggested there was.

Matt J said:

Illusions are perceptual objects. How can there be an illusion without the sticks, mud, paper, mantra of the illusionist?

Interestingly, in his explanations in the autocommentary to the *Sems nyid ngal gso* (212:3-223:4), he says phenomenon are "hallucinatory appearances produced by the mind's habitual tendencies." (Trans Padmakara Trans Group) and then references phlegmatic seeing hairs in the sky. No mud necessary.

Malcolm wrote:

This is only one of the eight examples. One can only understand them by using all eight.

As I have pointed out to you before, specifically, Longchenpa rejects that idea that, conventionally-speaking, there are no outer objects. This is well known. He summarizes a long complex argument about illusionists, mountains, and dead people and so on, with this statement, "That appearance for that deceased is no more, but because the cessation of the outer play cannot be accepted, and there is a difference between appearances and apparent objects, there is no fault and it is valid." He then cites *Samadhirāja sūtra* to the effect that everything is just a designation.

So, positing a common perceptual object is just a designation; likewise the liquid, likewise the water. Likewise the moon in the water. These things are neither true nor false, as Jetsun Drakpa Gyaltzen points out:

The moon in the water is not the moon in the sky,  
but without the latter the former will not appear.

Similarly, the nature of all things  
is taught in the two truths.

There are no dharmas  
not included in the two truths.

Because the nature is not true and not false,  
grasping to the two truths is deluded.

It is a fools errand to try and prove that there are no outer objects. The very endeavor itself proves that there are, just as in absence of water there is no reflection of the moon, and in absence of the moon, there is no reflection either. As Chandra points out:

Empty things, reflections and the like,  
dependent on conditions, are not imperceptible.

And just as empty forms reflected in a glass  
create a consciousness in aspect similar,  
so all things, though empty,  
strongly manifest within their very emptiness,  
and since inherent nature is in neither truth,  
phenomena are neither nothing nor unchanging entities.

Intro to Middle Way, pg. 73, Padmakara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 2nd, 2021 at 8:41 AM

Title: Re: Realization and realized masters

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Full awakening is rare. But awakening is less so. You don't need a buddha for a teacher, you just need a bodhisattva on the paths and stages, and then, maybe not even a first stage bodhisattva, but someone who has some measure of training and realization on the path of application.

clyde said:

You've lowered the bar to "someone who has some measure of training and realization" which could be almost any serious Buddhist practitioner.

Malcolm wrote:

I never claimed a high bar. I just said "realized."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 2nd, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Sherab said:

As I have argued previously, it is all mental representations based on your argument. Because of that kind of argument, whether things that are out there actually exist from their own side is not a knowledge accessible to such a mind which itself is also a convention.

Malcolm wrote:

Things can't exist from their own side because if they did, that would require them to exist inherently. Further, no one at any time has ever beheld an inherently existing thing.

Sherab said:

You missed my point.

If all things are only mental representations (as you have argued previously) to your mind which itself is also a mental representation (as you have argued previously), how can your mentally represented mind know the nature of things are only known to you through your mental representations of those things?

Therefore, if you say that things do not exist inherently, that would only be your assertion. If you say that things exist inherently, that too would only be your assertion.

Malcolm wrote:

I never argued all things are merely mental representations, not once. That's not what "conventional" means. A "convention" is a term for a dependent designation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 2nd, 2021 at 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

LastLegend said:

Those who get this consciousness to disappear will then destroy the obstructing confusions of the Bodhisattvas of the ten stages. Once this consciousness is gone, then the mind is open and still, quiet, serene and calm, perfectly pure, and enormously stable.[/i]

<https://terebess.hu/zen/daman.html>

Aemilius said:

The author does not say how long it will take to traverse the Ten bodhisattva stages. It can be 10 000 years, 100 000 years, 100 000 000 years or more..  
In the Lotus Sutra...

Queequeg said:

Actually, Buddhahood can be instantaneous.

Malcolm wrote:

The Naga girl was already an eighth stage bodhisattva, so, not exactly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Queequeg said:

Actually, Buddhahood can be instantaneous.

Malcolm wrote:

The Naga girl was already an eighth stage bodhisattva, so, not exactly.

Queequeg said:

...but arguably, it was within the 8 years of her life after hearing the Lotus from Manjusri.

Malcolm wrote:

No, definitely not. In fact, the Chogyal Phakpa, fifth founder master of Sakya, has a text specifically aimed at addressing misconceptions about the Nāgā princess tale. He was the imperial preceptor to Kublai Khan, was fluent in Chinese, and interacted daily with the Chinese Buddhists.

He addresses your contention that she was able to traverse the entire path in eight years, soup to nuts. According to him, the Lotus itself shows that the retinue of nāgās were not ordinary trainees who had never entered the path and that there was no training in method. Why? Those nāgās had previously entered Mahāyāna as evidenced by the fact that they praised the qualities of Mahāyāna and the six perfections. Chogyal Phakpa contends that the nāga girl was an tenth stage bodhisattva in fact, from birth, based on the passage, "She has great wisdom, sharp faculties. The actions of her body, speech, and mind are preceded by wisdom..." He claims all these are qualities of a tenth stage bodhisattva, and cites the Sutrālamkāra in support of this. Specifically he cites power over the doors of dhāraṇi as being a quality only of tenth stage bodhisattvas. He then defines how long it takes to attain that stage. It takes one uncountable eon to reach the first stage. A second to reach the eighth stage. At that time, one attains patience to the nonarising of dharmas and receives a prediction of buddhahood by the buddhas. It takes a third incalculable eon to attain unsurpassed buddhahood.

He points out that the full awakening of a tenth bodhisattva is not an instant awakening without traversing the paths and stages, but is in fact the conclusion of the ordinary progress of a bodhisattva. Further, he also points that she, as a tenth stage bodhisattva, was an emanation, that as an ordinary women with karmic obscurations, she could not attain the tenth bhumi. As one who was irreversible and had realized the gnosis of the tenth stage, the nāgā princess was an emanation of a tenth stage bodhisattva, which was revealed by her transformation into a male, her actual form. He further asserts her buddhahood in the southern world system was an emanational act of a tenth stage bodhisattva, rather than the attainment of buddhahood. Again, based on the sūtra's actual words, he claims the texts reads that she exhibited buddhahood to all, not that she was a buddha, pointing out that exhibiting full buddhahood and emanating a buddha kāya, including all the deeds of a buddha, such as residing Tuṣita, conception up through parinirvana, are among the listed powers of a tenth stage bodhisattva such as Avalokiteśvara, etc., as explained in the Sutra of the Ten stages.

Chogyal Phakpa, when setting out the intention of this sūtra, agrees it is a definitive sūtra, but for entirely different reasons. He says the intent of this sūtra is, ""Since all phenomena are of one taste and all vehicles are accomplished in a single vehicle, the Sūtra of the White Lotus of the Sublime Dharma was produced to show that the result is of one taste in the ocean of gnosis of Tathāgata," and so on.

So, a very different perspective.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 3:33 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Queequeg said:

So, Shariputra was just wrong in his perception.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, he is regularly presented as the stooge in Mahāyāna Sūtras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 4:33 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Queequeg said:

So, Shariputra was just wrong in his perception.

When you have to use so much ink to explain what something really is...

But if such views encourage beings... who am I to argue?

Malcolm wrote:

This are the three main passages that Phakpa explains. First, in order to point out that he was teaching myriad bodhisattvas in the ocean:

As soon as Mañjuśrī Kumārabhūta said those words, many thousands of lotuses rose up into the sky from within the oceans. Many thousands of bodhisattvas were seated upon those lotuses. Then those bodhisattvas came through the sky to Vulture Peak and remained suspended in the sky above it. Mañjuśrī Kumārabhūta had guided all of them toward the highest, complete enlightenment. Those bodhisattvas who had previously entered the Mahāyāna praised the six perfections and the qualities of the Mahāyāna, while the bodhisattvas who had previously been śrāvakas praised the Śrāvakayāna. All of them knew the qualities of the Mahāyāna and the emptiness of all phenomena.

Then, the qualities of Sāgara's daughter, as we already discussed, are qualities of a tenth stage bodhisattva described at length in various sūtras, of those, these are included.

The daughter of Sāgara, king of the nāgas, said, “Venerable Śāriputra, if I have great miraculous power, I will attain the highest, complete enlightenment of perfect buddhahood even more quickly than that jewel was accepted.”

And:

That bodhisattva now went to the south and, in a southern world realm named Vimalā, manifested the attainment of perfect buddhahood while seated at the foot of a tree

made of the seven precious materials.

Note, the future tense, "I will" and then the actual statement "manifested".

As mentioned above, a tenth stage bodhisattva has the power to demonstrate any form to any being to be tamed.

This raises the question, when does buddhahood begin? We have an answer, actually. According to Maitreyañātha, buddhahood begins on the tenth bhumi, as he says, because the gnosis beyond the ninth bhumi is the gnosis of a buddha. So, the "sudden awakening" of the daughter of Sāgara is just another one of your favorite things, it's an upaya, but that does not mean it ought to be taken literally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 5:45 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Queequeg said:

Like I said... spilling more ink to explain what was actually meant... like lawyers splitting hairs until precedents are revealed to mean the exact opposite of what they appear to mean. I like the interpolation of the snakes on flying lotuses. Maybe these are the UFOs people have been looking for.

Must be boring as F in a monastery. The mind is a skilled painter indeed.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, in this case, more like Kublai's court...baiting Chinese subitists sounds like a fun pastime to me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 6:28 AM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Queequeg said:

We don't want the executive stronger than it is, and every time a president exercises more power, it just makes the presidency more powerful.

Malcolm wrote:

"The first man put at the helm will be a good one. Nobody knows what sort may come afterwards. The executive will be always increasing here, as elsewhere, till it ends in a monarchy."

-- Benjamin Franklin

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 8:13 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Zhen Li said:

In the big picture, Jōdo Shinshū suggests that all Buddhas attain Buddhahood through the same Dharmakāya.

Malcolm wrote:

Considering that the dharmakaya of all Buddhas is the same, that's not much of a stretch.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 11:12 AM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

PeterC said:

After getting Roe overturned on a "states' rights", the next stage in the campaign will be at the state level to push back on, well, states' rights. Most of the energy will go into blue or purple states. Even in places like California there's a big enough Republican minority to infiltrate zoning commissions, municipal governments etc. The brilliant thing about this is that even no progress in those states is a win for them, because they get to fuel the outrage machine by railing against the immorality and unamericanism of the coastal elites.

Malcolm wrote:

Well be ok in New England.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Aemilius said:

Suppose you attain the buddhahood in one second, what then? What do you do for the next five million kalpas?

Do you think Buddhahood is substantially existent?

Queequeg said:

The answer to the first question... time? what's that?

In answer to the second I pose another question - is any of this stuff in these sutras substantially existent? What is Buddha saying in the Lotus? If everything, from his birth

to death was a show, what does that make everything he uttered or purported to utter?  
"Come children, get your toys!"

---

My daughter said to her older brother, "The tooth fairy is mommy and daddy." He didn't want to hear it, but at some point, when belief in those words wasn't necessary for his pecuniary gain, he came around to accepting them. My daughter, on the other hand, is now losing her teeth and bought in.

Malcolm wrote:

The point of the bodhisattva career, as opposed to the arhat, is that it is supposed to be arduous, difficult, and seemingly impossible. If one isn't up for that, then one's bodhicitta is for shit. On the other hand, if one wants to tarry on the path, and not attain awakening as rapidly as possible, then one's bodhicitta is for shit. Hence the conflicting narratives about the length of the bodhisattva path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 9:59 PM

Title: Re: separating pure and impure prana

Content:

bhava said:

Dear dharma friends, I read in a text by Jigme Lingpa, (Dilgo Khyentse Rinpoche's collected works, vol.3), about him practising separation of pure and impure prana every morning. I'm wondering, what is it referring to. Apart from nine purification breathing (lungdro selwa), is it a particular pranayama or tsalung? Thanks for your answers...

Malcolm wrote:

"Apart from nine purification breathing (lungdro selwa)"

That's it. FYI, people keep translating rlung as prāṇa, but that is actually incorrect. rLung is a translation of vāyu, of which prāṇa is only one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 10:21 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

The path may be long, but who knows where you are on it?

Malcolm wrote:

That's pretty clear, based on the qualities one has. They are described in detail in various sūtras and commentaries. Of course, there is a lot of wishful thinking amongst those of subitist bent about this stuff, but the reality is that we don't have those qualities. We are lucky if we are on the path of application, let alone the path of



accumulation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

Queequeg said:

Left/Progressives will need to get our asses handed to us. Some time in the wilderness to regroup and reorient. We got too caught up in ideology ourselves. Maybe we need to drop some and blow the tubes out. Start fresh with the elements.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, enough with this pansy-ass microdosing--heroic doses for everyone!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

PeterC said:

Yeah don't be too sure of that...

<https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2021-11-29/la-me-california-covid-mandates-constitutional-republic>

KristenM said:

Oh, I'm quite aware of the State of Jefferson malarkey. I live next door. My own county had a Sheriff who was in the national news for declaring our own county a "sanctuary county" and refusing to enforce mask mandates. Then he got Covid...

PeterC said:

What exactly is going on there? It's just a batshit crazy town council, or does it go any further? It sounds like the sort of thing you'd expect from Kentucky, not California

Malcolm wrote:

California was a GOP bastion between 1948-1992.

PeterC said:

While voter registration statewide has increased by about 8.5 million people since 1990, the poll found "virtually no increase" in the number of registered Republicans. GOP registration has held steady at 5.3 million voters, but voters registering as Democrats

have surged by about a third and now outnumber Republicans by almost two to one. “No party preference” voters nearly quadrupled in that time, drawing roughly even with the GOP.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://news.berkeley.edu/2020/11/03/as-demographics-change-california-gop-fades-as-a-political-force/>

These folks are found in the Central Valley and Northern California, aka the State of Jefferson, (which would include the counties of S. Oregon in the Rogue River region to the coast).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

The path may be long, but who knows where you are on it?

Malcolm wrote:

That's pretty clear, based on the qualities one has. They are described in detail in various sūtras and commentaries. Of course, there is a lot of wishful thinking amongst those of subitist bents about this stuff, but the reality is that we don't have those qualities. We are lucky if we are on the path of application, let alone the path of accumulation.

Queequeg said:

LOL. Or elaborate world building is just another way the mind distracts itself from the immediate task.

Malcolm wrote:

People would be very fortunate to attain the path of seeing in this life, let alone buddhahood. My observation is that subitists continually lower the bar, so they can claim even the slightest meditative stability as the height of the two-fold omniscience.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 3rd, 2021 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Awareness, and consciousness, (rig pa) ... oh my!

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

This has sort of been my understanding.

Malcolm wrote:

This has nothing to do with the teachings of the Buddha. The Buddha never identified something as "awareness" which is separate from the consciousness and which "goes beyond the ego and emptiness." This is some kind of Advaita idea.

Riju said:

Lotus sutra on earth was spoken by Guatam Buddha (16th son of Great Universal Wisdom Excellence Buddha-----ref phantom city chapter 7).

Guatam Buddha was capable of experiencing only the consciousness of His father. He never experienced the awareness that was guiding His father. This is the reason that Guatam never commented on God and awareness. Awareness comes not from Emptiness but from a different source.

Malcolm wrote:

No matter which way you slice, the dharmakāya is never separate from the rūpakāya. They are in union, a whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 12:04 AM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

Queequeg said:

Left/Progressives will need to get our asses handed to us. Some time in the wilderness to regroup and reorient. We got too caught up in ideology ourselves. Maybe we need to drop some and blow the tubes out. Start fresh with the elements.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, enough with this pansy-ass microdosing--heroic doses for everyone!

Queequeg said:

500 mics is something, but

<https://www.urbandictionary.com/define.php?term=thumbprint> are heroic.

Kids: joking. Don't actually try this at home.

Malcolm wrote:

You haven't lived until you've dosed with two four-way windowpanes in the eyes (roughly 1600 mics, straight to the brain). Definitely, don't try this at all...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 12:10 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

My observation is that subitists continually lower the bar, so they can claim even the slightest meditative stability as the height of the two-fold omniscience.

Queequeg said:

Maybe there are some wide eyed dreamers who fly the banner of Sudden Awakening over their rather ordinary achievements, but that wouldn't be unique to people claiming lineage in such traditions. The cuckoos and quacks are everywhere, aggrandizing their experiences with impressive sounding labels. If every tradition is judged by their flakes, charlatans, conmen, etc., then every single one is a failure, if not yet, just give it time.

Malcolm wrote:

I was more referring to the idea of instant BUDDHAHOOD. Attaining the first bhumi "suddenly" is much more reasonable notion, though, even that is beyond most of us.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

haha said:

The dharmakaya does not take birth and die, nor does it get enlightenment in course of time. The sutra uses different narrative to say it. People with different disposition may read it differently.

Malcolm wrote:

the dharmakāya isn't an agent, so of course it does not "get enlightened." It is the result of the gnosis accumulation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, basically.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Matt J said:

Not sure if Mipham even had access to Gorampa.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, yes. He most certainly did. He read him quite thoroughly.

Matt J said:

Perhaps fitting him into such categories distorts what he writes. Mipham was not afraid to call scholars on their BS, even as he adopted similar media. He was clearly grounded not only in a rime approach, but also a practical, experiential one.

Malcolm wrote:

No. Mipham's commentaries are in the tradition of Gorampa. This is not even a question. It is just a fact.

Matt J said:

And of course, there are no degrees of existence or emptiness, nor is there a separation between appearance and emptiness. No one suggested there was. It sounds like these posts grant special privilege to physical objects. To some extent, it is an academic point given emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:

You have to understand, Mipham is responding to Gelukpas, since they indeed privilege the object-- for them the object is the truth, not the perception. Gorampa and Mipham both privilege the perception.

Matt J said:

I don't defend ontological idealism either like neo-Advaitins. This is a category error. I'm simply forwarding epistemological idealism--- we don't really know what lies beyond mind. Failing to distinguish the two is problematic.

Malcolm wrote:

When it comes to the basis, the perception of ordinary beings, Madhyamaka in general does not forward epistemological idealism. Sapan summarizes this quite well:

With the intent of functioning in common with worldlings,  
he that external objects exist,  
but having in mind the reasoning  
that investigates conventional reality,  
he taught that phenomena are mind.  
Again, having in mind ultimate reality,  
he that that all phenomena are elaborationless.

So, it really all depends on whether what perspective you are addressing things from. The Gelug POV always takes into consideration common mundane convention as the baseline for discussion. But even they, when it comes to meditating the path in Vajrayāna, consider phenomena to be mind, and ultimately, free of proliferation.

What Gorampa, and later Mipham, are criticizing the Gelug point of view for, is granting an undue existential status that is not required at all to explain the conventional truth of

ordinary persons, that is, the point of view of people who have not analyzed anything. Relative truth does not bear ultimate analysis, but on the other hand, claiming we cannot know anything of the world beyond our five senses is also not an argument that any Mādhyamika would seriously propose, since even Mādhyamikas admit that a sense consciousness will not arise in absence of a sense object, and that the two truths are objects of true and false cognitions. For example, Aryadeva clearly states:

Dependent on eye and form,  
the mind arises like an illusion,  
it is not reasonable to call  
illusory that which has existence.

Yogic Deeds of Bodhisattvas, Sonam, Snow Lion, 1994, pg. 261.

This verse itself is sufficient to show that Mādhyamikas accept outer objects conventionally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Skepticism of Pure Land among Mahayana adherents

Content:

Queequeg said:

Sagara's daughter still treads the path...It just doesn't take eons.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it does. Three asamkhyā kalpas, and only then if you are a superior practitioner.

This is why people want rebirth in Sukhavatī.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 4:22 AM

Title: Re: Roe is toast

Content:

Nemo said:

Biden may not be as good an ally as you think.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, not in 1974, when he said this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 4th, 2021 at 6:30 AM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

They're into a bottom to top strategy to upend everything.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the CSA in 1861 was the Confederate States of America. The CSA in 2021 is the Christian States of America. Basically no difference, and yes, they will legalize slavery again, but they won't call it that...It'll be more like Handmaidens.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 5th, 2021 at 10:28 PM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Nemo said:

The giveaway is how little policy changes. Less than most single party states in practice.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because representative democracy is inefficient by design, compared to authoritarian states. In fact, it is the desire to change policies quickly that leads people on both the left and the right to embrace authoritarian governments at the expense of democracy. Thus, at present, we see the persistent abandonment of democracy by the GOP at present, largely due to an huge influx of people from the Southern Democrats into the GOP in the 70's, the people who sought to undermine democracy before the civil war, and the architects of Jim Crow. This turned the GOP into an engine for undermining democracy. In a word, the civil war never ended in the United States.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 1:15 AM

Title: Re: HH Sakya Trichen's Empowerment of Avalokiteshvara: Combination of Great Compassion and Mahamudra lineage?

Content:

ratna said:

The lineage is Śākyamuni, Vajrāsanapāda, Bari Lotsawa, Sönam Tsemo, Drakpa Gyaltzen, Sakya Paṇḍita, etc.

stoneinfofocus said:

Thanks, but I mean where is the empowerment from, who wrote it, in what cycle, etc...? Like, is it from the King's Tradition, etc...? Perhaps lineage was too broad of a term.

Malcolm wrote:

It is a permission rite, and the actual permission rite was composed by Zhuchen Tsultrim Rinchen, an 18th century Sakya lama from Derge, Kham. It is not the Kings

Tradition. That is a major empowerment. The cycle it is from is the Bari Gyatsa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 3:04 AM

Title: Re: Biden is doing a great job.

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Also, the Democrats on the whole don't give a shit about democracy either, they care about 'the rule of law' inasmuch as it supports commerce these days. I mean, there are exceptions, and their shittiness pales in comparison to the GOP, but let's be honest, there isn't much there.

Malcolm wrote:

All political discussion on DW (including mine):

Bitching 'bout the things we've seen  
Bitching 'bout the things we've been  
Bitching 'bout the loves we've had  
My, oh my it wasn't so bad  
When we had that to loosen our minds  
Hey little baby in the front row be kind

Bar bitching: telling you the gospel truth  
Bar bitching: why don't you all go get screwed?  
Bar bitching: why don't you tell me something new?  
Bar bitching: Bar bitching

Bitching 'bout the Windsor C  
Bitching 'bout the Western Sea  
Why can't you all be like a Grainger man?  
Or even a Pheland man?  
I'll tell you what we'll meet in Amsterdam  
Then you'll see what should be really can

Bar bitching: telling you the gospel truth  
Bar bitching: why don't you all go get screwed?  
Bar bitching: why don't you tell me something new?  
Bar bitching: Bar bitching That's what I'm talking about

Got anything to say  
No  
Well shut up

There's a place with a lot of eyes  
Strange smoke perfume around the peacock guys  
And the girls they move their heat



To the impulsive compulsive beat  
But that's another place another time  
Maybe we'll meet there in quite a short while

Bar bitching: telling you the gospel truth  
Bar bitching: why don't you all go get screwed?  
Bar bitching: why don't you tell me something new?  
Bar bitching:

I really don't know what to say  
It's gonna happen to us all one day  
And when it does you could have me too  
But until then I really don't know what to do  
I'm just gonna keep  
Bar bitching: telling you the gospel truth  
Bar bitching: why don't you all go get screwed?  
Bar bitching: why don't you tell me something new?  
Bar bitching:  
Bar bitching, Bar bitching, Bar bitching, Bar bitching

--The Stranglers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Unknown said:

I see, again and again, teachers put in the position of having to cater, if not pander, to students, or risk losing them

Malcolm wrote:

That's only a problem for teachers who want an ever-expanding retinue.

A real teacher only needs a few good students. Not hundreds or thousands of slackers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

even in the abhidharma texts.

Malcolm wrote:

BzzzzzzzzzzzzzzT

Yes, it is certainly found in the Kośabhaṣya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 8:41 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

Nothing will happen until the left realizes liberals are also the enemy.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok, Robespierre. The reason why “liberal” are nervous about the far left is it’s impulse to tyranny which ends in circular firing squads.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 8:45 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness vs Awareness

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The foundations of mindfulness, and also the five faculties (which include mindfulness), come up a lot in Mahāyāna sūtras, but they are not given exposition, rather, it seems like it is assumed the reader/listener would already be familiar with them.

Malcolm wrote:

Thus not true, for example, a fairly detailed description of the four foundations of mindfulness is to be found in the Bodhisattvapitaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 9:46 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness vs Awareness

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Mindfulness is a practice through which awareness develops.

Carefulness is not relying too much on English language words used to translate Buddhist concepts.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, mindfulness and awareness are mutually supporting mental factors.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness vs Awareness

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The foundations of mindfulness, and also the five faculties (which include mindfulness), come up a lot in Mahāyāna sūtras, but they are not given exposition, rather, it seems like it is assumed the reader/listener would already be familiar with them.

Malcolm wrote:

Thus not true, for example, a fairly detailed description of the four foundations of mindfulness is to be found in the Bodhisattvapitaka.

Zhen Li said:

Thanks for pointing that out. Is what you are thinking of inside or outside of the Dhyāna Chapter?

Malcolm wrote:

I have to go look. I pulled it out the other day for a lama who was teaching on the FFM and needed an Mahayana source.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 6th, 2021 at 10:42 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

"Liberal" here is meaning the American sense of "progressive" rather than the actual liberal tradition? Because I think the latter could help us a lot to restore a bit of civility in the polis.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he means Nancy Pelosi as opposed to AOC.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 4:47 AM

Title: Re: HE Jhado Rinpoche teachings in CA

Content:

tony\_montana said:

Also, I don't wanna start a fuss but is Begtse Chen a Wisdom/Enlightened Protector? For a person practicing Most Secret Hayagriva that Jhado Rinpoche so kindly gave empowerment for, how would be the appropriate way to supplicate Begtse for support and help?

Lobsang Chojor said:

I'm pretty sure Rinpoche said Begtse Chen was a supramundane (enlightened) protector.

zerwe said:

Good question. All I could gather from Rinpoche, is that adoption of Begtse began

between the reign of the 2-3 Dalai Lamas, that Chamsing and Nechung are of one-nature, and that Chamsing (supramundane) is uncommon aspect and Nechung mundane?

Chamsing is one of the chief dharma protectors of Tamdrin Yangsang's mandala and is mentioned/invoked in FPMT's protector practices.

One (controversial) source lists him as a wisdom/enlightened protector along side Kalarupa, Palden Lhamo, and Six-armed Mahakala. Also, says he originally had Indian roots and came to Tibet beginning 11th century through Sakya/Kagyu via Marpa and Sachen Kunga Nyingpo?

Shaun

Lobsang Chojor said:

I was a bit unsure on the first point I think Rinpoche was just saying that the titles "black and red" protectors depends on the context. The Tibetan government mean Palden Lhamo and Nechung, whereas in Mongolia it refers to Palden Lhamo and Begtse Chen.

In the lineage list Rinpoche recited it came through Sachen Kunga Nyingpo, I don't think I heard Marpa.

Could you PM me the second mantra? I didn't write any down

zerwe said:

PM sent

"In the lineage list Rinpoche recited it came through Sachen Kunga Nyingpo"

Excellent, your ears are sharper than ours.

Shaun

Malcolm wrote:

There are two sources for the Marutse brother and sister. The Drogmi long lineage passes to him from Gayadhara. The short lineage is a term revealed by Marpa Lotsawa, originally connected with the Most Secret Hayagriva. They are combined in Sakya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: CV Jones - The Buddhist Self: On Tathāgatagarbha and Ātman

Content:

nyonchung said:

bTsan kha bo che received the "gzhan stong dbu ma chen po" lineage from Sajjana, he from Akarashanti, he from Anandakirti, he from Maitripa - Tsen Khawoché (who was not a sanskritist),

Malcolm wrote:

Which leaves open the question, how much did Tsen Khawoché actually understand?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 9:47 AM

Title: Re: Question about dependent origination

Content:

Matt J said:

I don't think that is correct. Per Mipham in the Adornment of the Middle Way (trans Padmakara):

Malcolm wrote:

For you, Mipham seems to be the summum bonum of Madhyamaka, even though for me, he just another in a long line of Tibetans. The fact mainstream Madhyamakas accept outer objects conventionally is noncontroversial. It's true that Shantaraksita, of whom Mipham is very fond, likes Yogacara for conventional truth. But as the passage from Sapan demonstrates, Madhyamakas tend to be content different presentations of conventional truth. Certainly, most Mainstream Madhyamakas accept the Sautrantika perspective. This again is noncontroversial. Also, Mipham defense of rang rig is uncertain. Candrakirti clearly understands rang rig as memory, not a self-illuminating mind, but that may simply be a fault in the translation,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 10:34 PM

Title: Re: Sakya Pandita and medicine question.

Content:

alderjerry@gmail.com said:

Recently I had seen somewhere on this forum a comment by Malcolm about Sakya Pandita's advice regarding taking medicine. The quote/text would be very helpful for a friend (currently in hospital) who wants to ask their lama a clear question. The context is their (and mine) concern that a position of being anti 'scientism' has led to a anti Covid vaccine stance within our sangha. Thank you,

Malcolm wrote:

you can find this citation in Clarifying the Sages Intent, In The Stages of the Buddhist Doctrine, Wisdom Pubs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

Liberalism has always been a scam. It pretends progressiveness while keeping property rights accumulated through generations of slavery, imperialism and theft sacrosanct. It fixes the secondary contradictions of capitalism but does nothing to prevent more from being created. Since it cannot confront capital it is a path to extinction.

Malcolm wrote:

How silly. "Confront capital." What are people supposed to do? Assembly in mobs and go relieve capitalists of their holdings. What a naive view of the world.

"Beings are owners of karmas, student, heirs of karmas, they have karmas as their progenitor, karmas as their kin, karmas as their homing-place. It is karmas that differentiate beings according to inferiority and superiority."

Hierarchy will never be eliminated among sentient beings because karma is unerring.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 7th, 2021 at 10:48 PM

Title: Re: Mindfulness vs Awareness

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

Even though rig pa or awareness is not mentioned in this literature, perhaps this one taste of suchness taught by Buddha here is something like the rig pa awareness of the higher teachings.

Malcolm wrote:

Rig pa (vidyā) is a path dharma, and it exists in practitioners below the path of seeing, so no, it is not the "one taste of suchness," at least not in the beginning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

It sounds like you worship the abstraction called capital Malcolm.

Malcolm wrote:

"Capital" is just an economic store which can be preserved, employed, or squandered. If you have fifty seeds, that is your capital. It is not abstract at all.

The Buddha recommended that lay people preserve a quarter of their capital against emergencies, use half to generate profits, and use the other quarter to enjoy their lives.

If you want to be specific, rather than make grandiose and pompous proclamations, great. But you're just bar bitching.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

Yes, this seems to be a problem in many traditional labour/working class/egalitarian parties in western/liberal democracies. i.e. the rise of a white collar political class, usually trained in law or economics, who claim to "represent" the interests of working people.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, you mean unlike the intellectuals of the revolution? There will always be educated people who claim to represent the interests of the "workers." The right does it, the left does it, it's all bollocks all the way through.

Theory sucks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 12:42 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Tsonkhapa made a lineage off of visions.

Malcolm wrote:

And, even if it were true (it isn't), this is a problem because...?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 1:00 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

zerwe said:

"The difference between Geluk and Kagyu is guru loyalty."

Also, what exactly are you saying here?

Malcolm wrote:

Some sectarian, triumphalist bullshit, I imagine. But it is pervasive throughout Tibetan

Buddhist world, so it is not surprising. Everyone feels their guru is the best, their blessings are the best, their lineage is the best, their practice is the best, their opinion is the best. That's the nature of egotism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

Theory is great. Now if we could just get these pesky humans to cooperate. I have a grand plan for all of us!

Malcolm wrote:

The reason for the turn to identity politics to begin with is that after the white labor movement secured their interest following WWII, they abandoned the rest of the working class (blacks, latinos, etc.) completely, whereas before, what they did was ensure blacks, latinos, and so on were just a marginal force.

This is why I completely laugh at white men who spend their time bitching and moaning about identity politics and fantasizing about a return to color-blind class based labor movements (which never existed).

Theory sucks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 5:55 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

The two truths doctrine is a commentarial development...

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is found in Mahāyāna Sūtras. After all, the thread is called "The Two Truths in Mahāyāna Buddhism."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 6:25 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

On one level, many of the political benefits we enjoy have arisen out of ideas/theory; kids don't work in Manchester coal mines anymore etc.



Malcolm wrote:

That was not a function of theory. That was a function of empathy.

tobes said:

But, I think we live in a time where theory has become increasingly unhinged from reality, and the dangers of this are all too clear for us to see.

Malcolm wrote:

It's always been unhinged from reality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 10:52 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

On one level, many of the political benefits we enjoy have arisen out of ideas/theory; kids don't work in Manchester coal mines anymore etc.

Malcolm wrote:

That was not a function of theory. That was a function of empathy.

tobes said:

But, I think we live in a time where theory has become increasingly unhinged from reality, and the dangers of this are all too clear for us to see.

Malcolm wrote:

It's always been unhinged from reality.

tobes said:

Theory played a big role. The labour movement that won many such freedoms is incoherent without notions of 'labour' 'class' 'capital' 'economics' etc. If you're saying that empathy played a role in informing that theory, then sure.

Malcolm wrote:

No, theory did not play any role. People saw their inequality and did something about it, leaving privileged journalists like Marx to write theories about their daily experience, while he pursued his bourgeoisie lifestyle, disconnected from their lives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Sādhaka said:

What do you guys think about Thomas Sowell's talks?

Malcolm wrote:

I strongly disagree with his advocacy of charter schools. I think they are 1) undermining public school education, 2) creating a two tier system that actually privileges white communities and sucks resources away from communities of color, and 3) is a back door for the public funding of religious education.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

In other words, the Sarvastivadins and the Sautrantikas...did not have the idea of two truths from their sutras...

Malcolm wrote:

This is not true. For example. Śamathadeva's commentary on the Kośa preserves in its entirety an agamic text called the don dam stong pa nyid kyi mdo. There is another text which provides a canonical source for the term kun rdzob.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

zerwe said:

"The difference between Geluk and Kagyu is guru loyalty."

Also, what exactly are you saying here?

Malcolm wrote:

Some sectarian, triumphalist bullshit, I imagine. But it is pervasive throughout Tibetan Buddhist world, so it is not surprising. Everyone feels their guru is the best, their blessings are the best, their lineage is the best, their practice is the best, their opinion is the best. That's the nature of egotism.

Crazywisdom said:

Let's not pretend we're ecumenical Malcolm. We all know the Geluk view as applied in Vajrayana is considered wrong view in Kagyu and Nyingma.

Malcolm wrote:

No, we do not know this. It's a ridiculous assertion. If it were true, then one would be accusing Jigme Lingpa, Shabkar, Dodrupchen Tenpé Nyima, and so on, of having wrong views, because all these men trained in the Geluk system and promulgated Geluk

Yikcha in their monasteries, which remain the curriculum current in most Nyingma monasteries in Golok and Amdo. Moreover, it amounts to a claim that Geluk Vajrayāna is invalid and is incapable of producing awakening. This is a ridiculous assertion and merely shows narrow mindedness and lack of education on the part of those who sponsor such views, no matter who they are. This is illustrated by the shame expressed by Khenpo Jigme Phuntsok, for example, for having naively criticized the views of Tsongkhapa when he was young, whom he later came to understand was a great mahasiddha, etc. Just study Tsongkhapa's praise to dependent origination. You will be unable to find in it a single fault.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

Certainly views differ (notably on the definition of kyerim and dzogrim) as certainly some Sakyapas don't consider kindly some of Khedrub Jé's view on tantra.

Malcolm wrote:

These things do not matter and should be left to moulder in the 15th century, where they belong. Every major school of Tibetan Buddhism produces awakened people in every generation, despite differences in explanation and approaches.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 11:40 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

I love how invested you are in capitalist hierarchy. Like debt and money were real things, not created by an elite to maintain control. The strong ruling over the weak is the natural order. It should be celebrated. Your net worth is your score in capitalism. So which one are you?

Malcolm wrote:

Your central thesis, that debt and money created by elites to maintain control is an unsupportable assertion. That debt and money can be used that way, however, is certainly true. You might read David Graeber's Debt, the First 5000 Years.

As for myself, I just deal with the practical reality of putting food in my mouth, without getting tangled up in ideologies about economics, certainly Marxism is an abject failure. Capitalism is not going away any time soon. So better get used to it and try and make sure it at least is contained by democratic ideals.

My way of thinking is more result-oriented. I am more interested in policy than theory.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 8th, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is not true. For example. Śamathadeva's commentary on the Kośa preserves in its entirety an agamic text called the don dam stong pa nyid kyi mdo. There is another text which provides a canonical source for the term kun rdzob.

Astus said:

That sutra was mentioned by Aemilius, and so I linked its English translation. See <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=610404#p610404>. On terminology <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=610610#p610610>.

Malcolm wrote:

You said, "did not have the idea of two truths from their sutras."

They most certainly did derive or have their idea of the two truths from their sūtras. Those passages prove it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 12:41 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

if somebody refused to visit Ganden monastery or Kumbum, Tsongkhapa's birthplace in Amdo and pay homage there ...

Malcolm wrote:

Been there, beautiful place.

Tsonghapa's birthplace.jpg (478.91 KiB) Viewed 1831 times

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 1:11 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

Kumbum is now mostly a Chinese tourist destination.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, but it is still a nice place. We also visited HHDL's birthplace on the same day.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 1:26 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

add the 37 verses of Ngülchu Thogmé Zangpo (nominally a drugpa-kagyüpa)

Malcolm wrote:

Ahem, Sakyapa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

Now

in fact doesn't change much as a beginner, in the center, you'll probably have a Bouddha statue, Tsongkhapa instead of a Karmapa or of Jigten Sumgön or Guru Rinpoché ... daily recitations will be different, basic teachings also - there will be probably a form of lojong (mind training), Kagyü an Gelug tradition come anyway from the same source, Potowa -, and from there Atisha, Serlingpa

Nicholas2727 said:

How would the basic teachings differ between Gelug and Kagyu? Im assuming Gelug would teach more from the Lam Rim and Kagyu from Jewel Ornament of Liberation? Or are you referring to this in a different way?

nyonchung said:

Right, not only Lamrim, but Atisha's "Lamp of Wisdom", but I was thinking to the pratice of tonglen (taking and giving) and its root verses in the Lojong (Basic verses of Mind Training) by Potowa, add Langrithangpa's eight verses, all this part of basic teachings in both schools - add the 37 verses of Ngülchu Thogmé Zangpo (nominally a drugpa-kagyüpa)

There is also Atisha's teachings on the "three classes" of being - Kalu Ripoché's centers were supposed to use Taranatha's commentary (Kyebu Sumgyi Lamrim)

There is an immense Gelug collection commentaries on Kadampa teachings accumulated through centuries, including contemporary ones

Malcolm wrote:

BTW, your use of me is wrong. Should be

"The sky and I don't hold views, etc." "I" is the subject here, not an object, "me."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

I couldn't visit HHDL birthplace (restrictions applied) but nearby Drotsang, a magnificent Chinese style (but Tibetan buddhist)

Malcolm wrote:

We were not allowed either, but we went anyway, much to the terror of the caretaker when we arrived unannounced. We got a fifteen minute tour because our teacher's 75 year old mother was along for the ride, as well as the senior teachers at the Tibetan Medical College.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

They most certainly did derive or have their idea of the two truths from their sūtras. Those passages prove it.

Astus said:

How so? Neither the idea of there being two truths, nor the definition of those truths are found there.

Malcolm wrote:

You really aren't that dense.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

The list of his teachers is long (includes Butön, Dölpopa, Lama Dampa, Pang Lotsawa ...)

Malcolm wrote:

Butön, Dölpopa, Lama Dampa...all Sakyapas.

- thugs rje chen po'i dmar khrid, also Sakya, through Thuje Tsondru.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 2:20 AM

Title: Re: Inner circles and cults

Content:

nyonchung said:

years! OMG, so fast, and now lecturing about it - one French guy - former Sogyal's translator (English to French) - doing same after 20 years or so profiteering of the system, now still profits by denouncing it and started his own groups ... to teach "pure Dharma", while saying that the only teachings he ever received were from Sogyal (and in English) ...

Malcolm wrote:

That is seriously distorted, whatever one thinks of Sogyal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 3:07 AM

Title: Re: Inner circles and cults

Content:

nyonchung said:

As for France, I don't think there was any formal case started against Sogyal - and French criminal law is as strict much as the US one, and police possibly more reactive ... I found some peoples' reaction pretty strange, specially this guy who showed up in magazines, TV, just to start his own Dharma business after disparaging his own teacher - well if there was anything wrong, he was so high up in the organization and close to Sogyal, must have noticed something in 20 years or so, no?

Malcolm wrote:

Sogyal may have been a bully, a sybarite, and corrupt, but to his credit, he did introduce literally thousands of people to very qualified teachers, like Khenpo Namdrol. Much the same could be said of Trungpa.

nyonchung said:

A certain German site loves this stuff

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that guy escaped from the Scientology of Buddhism, aka NKT.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 4:00 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The division of the dharmas by the Ābhidharmikas into "real" svabhāva dharmas and unreal concepts in their matrices is arguably their version of the two truths. You'll notice that in the 11th century treatise, it also didn't outrightly outline two truths. Instead, it outlined the ultimate, and the conventional is what is imputed over that ultimate, the fourfold ultimate in the case of the Theravāda sect. Now, the fourfold paramattha is not from the Theravādin Adhidhamma itself. It is a systematization of their dhamma-matrices as presented in texts like Dhammasaṅgaṇī. These matrices were the "ultimate truth" of many of the Śrāvaka Abhidharma traditions, one could argue.

Malcolm wrote:

Śamathadeva's commentary refers to sentient beings as relative (saṃvṛti), since they appropriate aggregates. Don dam, pāramārtha is a reference to emptiness.

Arguing that the Sarvastivadins did not have a concept of two truths derived from sūtras, is, frankly just dumb. Astus is applying strict text critical criteria to the question, but that is useless here, because the fact is that it is discussed by Vasubandhu, and earlier, etc. It is scholastic myopia only that would lead one to claim that there is not evidence of the two truths in the agamas. Nāgārjuna would not have bothered mentioning it had he thought there would be a serious contest about his claim:

The dharma taught the buddhas  
properly relies on two truths.

His opponents here are not Mahāyānis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

Well, Taranatha was certainly holding Sakya transmissions  
Dölpopa being zhentongpa, what do we do?

Malcolm wrote:

He was Sakya. Jonang is a subschool of Sakya. Dolbupa lived long before Gorampa's views were declared the official Sakya position in the late 15th century.

nyonchung said:

As for Butön, the Zhalu Ribug tradition (see Losel Tenkyong) describes him as a zhalupa forefots (if not as a trophu-kagyüpa), even if certainly received and transmitted innumerable Sakyapa teaching

Malcolm wrote:



Zhalu is Sakya as the day is long, from Buton down to Losal Tenkyong.

nyonchung said:

For Thugjé Tsöndrū, alas no, the dmar khrid is one of four specific teachings of Jonang (see Gö Lotsawa's deb ther)

lineage:

- Tsembupa

Malcolm wrote:

Thugje Tsondru was a Sakyapa. The only lineage that has extensive teaching on the Tsembupa Markhrid is Sakya, notably the very profound commentary by Lama Dampa and the one by Ngorpa Sangye Phunstog, and the various instructions on it Zhuchen Tsultrim Rinchen, also of Ngor. It was the first teaching I ever received.

nyonchung said:

Back to Thogmé Zangpo, if one checks his writings and the lineages he transmitted they are overwhelmingly kadampa, plus the tö-drugpa lineage of Yanggönpa Gyeltsen Pel (1213-1258) he received from Sherab Bum (who received two lineages) so theb tö-drugpa claim may be not that excessive (G-granted, Yanggönpa, heitr to Götsangpa, is also a disciple of Sakya Pendita)

I will not contest of course for Lama, a splendid figure

But Pang Lotsawa, later considered as a forefather of the bodongpas, can certainly be also described as a Sakyapa

Malcolm wrote:

There is no conflict. Sangphu, by the 14th century was effectively a branch of Sakya.

Jonang, Zhalu, and Geluk can all be generally included in the schools that branched from Sakya. Most of their Vajrayāna transmissions come from Sakya, and so on. Kunga Drolchok was Sakya, through and through, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 5:41 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

this to say that Thogmé Zangmo teachings entered also the Gelugpa tradition through Gyama Yönten Ö, a master Khedrub Jé Geleg Pelzang

butb he also transmitted (is it becoming an obsession) the tö-drugpa lhan gcig skyes sbyor gyi khrid yig rgyal sras lugs / yon tan 'od kyi zin bris who was later received by Drugpa Ngagwang Chögyel (1465-1540)

another important disciple, still relevant to the subject Radreng Shakya Sönam (1356-1442), also a disciple of Tsongkhapa Like Yönten Ö

He had many disciples among Gelugpas (like him often also disciples of Tsongkhapa) but also notable Sakyapa teachers like Ga rab 'byams pa Künga Yeshé (1397-1470)

this to say that important teachings always widely circulated, and that kadampa teachings can be obtain from teachers of all school - certainly Kagyüpas ang Gelugpas will insist on them as a foundation

Must be noted that the lojong practice was included in the shangpa 3 years-retreat before starting the chö practice

Malcolm wrote:

It must be noted that all Mahāyāna teachings are included in Parting From the Four Attachments, the very first text in the Jo nang brgya rtsa.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 6:23 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Arguing that the Sarvastivadins did not have a concept of two truths derived from sūtras, is, frankly just dumb.

Astus said:

The reason it practically cannot be derived from the sutras is that the definition of the two truths requires the ideas that come from the Abhidharma, that is, the distinction between truly existing dharmas and nominally existing worldly conventions. Such linguistic separation is not found in the sutras...

Malcolm wrote:

I don't agree with this. The Buddha is very clear in a passage that appears in Śamathadeva's commentary [mngon, ju 47a (Toh. 4094)] that one is not to have attachment to the etymologies (nirukti) of the people (jānapada), one is not to hasten to mundane names. It is because they are false.

Prior to this, [mngon, ju 40b (Toh. 4094)], the Buddha is quoted as "Bhikṣus, the supreme (mchog) falsity is the phenomena that are false and deceptive. Bhikṣus, the supreme truths are like this, this is how they are. Therefore, the bhikṣus who posses that possess, the supreme blessings of truth." Moreover, there is a whole section later, where he discusses that which is empty as being false, deceptive, etc.

So you really just have not looked well enough, because of a literal mindedness you have been infected with through reading too much text critical literature. To insist that the two truths are not in the agamas because the term "satyadvaya" does not explicitly occur is very myopic. But the two truths are there, you just have to know to see them. Maybe you should get your eyes checked again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 6:49 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

tobes said:

The fact that nearly a decade on, the real popular uprising is fascistic, and neoliberalism is still running unabated should be cause for serious reflection on how the left has deeply failed, but it seems unwilling to self-reflect on it's own shortcomings. There is often a sense of moral righteousness that precludes such reflexive awareness - and very often the arguments made are tautological in that sense. i.e. "we're right because we're right. We don't even need a clear argument."

Malcolm wrote:

You see, the right focuses on policies, not theory. They focus on getting shit done.

Bernie is a good model. He doesn't give a shit about theory either. The left needs to follow him and stop their post-Marxist, bullshit, theoretical navel-gazing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Comparison of Kagyu and Gelug schools?

Content:

nyonchung said:

If I understand well Lama Dampa received it from Mūnmé Dragkha Dragpa Senggé (1255-1343), a major disciple of Thugjé Tsöndrū, but possibly from other teachers

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

nyonchung said:

Butön transmissions includes a considerable amount of kadampa, kagyüpa, zhijé transmissions - he mentions that he received nyingma teachings from his grandfather, but doesn't see too happy with them

Malcolm wrote:

Buton' was a major fan boy of Sapan. That's all you need to know.

nyonchung said:

Sakya proper sometimes got into political hard times, but transmissions were still going in many places, not necessarily politically or administratively controlled by Sakya. But certainly Sakya (as a center of power) had for long a say in the nomination of abbots in many places and up to c. 1350 and sometimes much later. Most scholars (sutras and tantras) had a connection with Sakya, be they otherwise tö-drugpa, kagyüpas etc ... almost all shangpa-kagyüpa teachers from Tsang up to 1650 went at some point of their carrier to study in Sakya or received Sakyapa teachings.

Malcolm wrote:  
Indeed.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 7:57 AM  
Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath  
Content:  
tobes said:

The fact that nearly a decade on, the real popular uprising is fascistic, and neoliberalism is still running unabated should be cause for serious reflection on how the left has deeply failed, but it seems unwilling to self-reflect on it's own shortcomings. There is often a sense of moral righteousness that precludes such reflexive awareness - and very often the arguments made are tautological in that sense. i.e. "we're right because we're right. We don't even need a clear argument."

Malcolm wrote:  
You see, the right focuses on policies, not theory. They focus on getting shit done.

Bernie is a good model. He doesn't give a shit about theory either. The left needs to follow him and stop their post-Marxist, bullshit, theoretical navel-gazing.

tobes said:  
I think that a big part of what is making the (hard/far) right successful is the galvanizing force of direct ad hom. i.e. the objects of their hatred are strong enough to unify them.

But the more moderate right: they are drenched in theory. It's called free market economics, and they apply it to literally everything.

I also think people who resist this, like Sanders, are necessarily very engaged in theoretical critiques. And so they should, it can't be pure sentiment.

Maybe when you're saying 'theory' you mean political-social-cultural theory?

Malcolm wrote:  
Nerds geek out on Milton F., but serious GOP people just make money and make sure policies benefit themselves.

Bernie is not a theory guy. He is a policy guy, guided by a very simple set of principles: universal healthcare, universal education, cut defense spending by at least half, tax the ultra rich out of existence.

Proof he is not a theory guy, the Bookchin folks are perpetually pissed at Sanders. In deed, Sanders is very much what municipal libertarianism would look like, but he could care less about all the theoretical posturing and historical analysis behind it. Sanders is a legislator, not a theorist,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 9:30 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Yet just about anything beats the decades-old public-fool system, which aims to turn out corporate drones.

Malcolm wrote:

The sole reason public education is in decline is due to its defunding beginning with Reagan, a as racist reaction to school busing in the 70's. But you are way too young to to know this. Before Civil Rights legislation tried to secure parity for Blacks, public schools in this country in the post-war period were excellent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 8:11 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

Are there any specific sutras named/known as the sources for those quotes?

Malcolm wrote:

Most of the sutras in that commentary are unnamed, as are these.

Astus said:

To identify two truths there have to be two ways of perception and expression specified

Malcolm wrote:

Two truths are specified, seeing correctly and seeing falsely. That's enough. No need to have the Buddha declare that aggregates and so on are ultimate, otherwise it would have been game over for Madhyamaka at the beginning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 10:05 PM

Title: Re: Extinction as a result of global warming

Content:

KathyLauren said:

Trying to create a better samsara is how you manifest compassion. Of course, samsara being what it is, you won't succeed. But if you can't be bothered making the effort, where is your practice?

Dharmasherab said:

Yes it is a way to manifest compassion. However when done mindlessly it is also a good way to develop delusion even further. It is not unusual to increase their disturbing emotions based on trying to change things which are far beyond their control so they miss the time and waste their effort which could be used for practice of the mind. In an age like this including in the West, most people's deepest disturbing emotions tend to lie within their beliefs in politics and some of whom are into engaged Buddhism who try to promote and push their own political narrative on others in the disguise of engaged Buddhism. This is not compassion. Instead, it is manipulative behaviour based on delusion. For others who are of the more sincere type, its the attitude of trying to cover the entire surface of the earth with rubber instead of wearing rubber shoes.

Malcolm wrote:

Lot of judgement of others in your post, buddy. I guess you don't see the yak on your own nose because you are too busy looking for spots on the noses of others.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 9th, 2021 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Two truths are specified, seeing correctly and seeing falsely. That's enough.

Astus said:

However, that's not how the two truths are understood in Theravada. At least we'd need some identifiable agamas to say that conventional language is false.

Malcolm wrote:

Who cares what what Theravada thinks? Their tradition has no observable influence on this topic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Who cares what what Theravada thinks? Their tradition has no observable influence on this topic.

Astus said:

Assuming that Sarvastivadins worked from generally the same sutras, since their version of the two truths is somewhat different, if the origin of the two truths doctrine is the sutras, there should be some sutras not found in the Theravada canon to explain the discrepancy.

Malcolm wrote:

You are speculating. It's very clear the two truths are the Buddha's teaching, as Nagarjuna proclaims. If there was any disagreement at all, it would be evident in polemics against his assertion, but none can be found anywhere. All there there is pushback against his, and one presumes, his teachers formulation of ultimate truth, and none against his formulation of mundane convention, which also is found in sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 3:30 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Speaking to the issue of Theravādin exegesis, which I don't think is completely off-topic since they are still a Śrāvaka Abhidharma school...

Malcolm wrote:

The Theravadin tradition had zero impact on the continental Indian thought of the period we are discussing. While the record of debates at the time of Aśoka in the Kathāvatthu is certainly interesting, as is the Vibhaṅga, and so on, this predates the Theravadin tradition by hundreds of years.

What Astus is looking for is the term "satyavidhaṃdvaya" in a sūtra in the same way we find "catursatya" in order to confirm the Buddha taught two truths. What I am pointing out is that term needn't be there for the intention to be there. And the intention is clearly there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 3:54 AM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Totally opposed to charter schools.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 4:03 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

...they've had no significant impact on continental Vibhajyavādin thought, let alone a

significant impact on mainstream Indian Buddhism, but the period we are speaking of has had an effect on them. Knowing that, I'd argue that discussing them is not utterly irrelevant. They are one particularized stream of Buddhism that has been necessarily influenced by certain continental trends.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, to the extent that Sarvāstivāda comes from Vibhajjavāda, sure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I had thought that Sarvāstivāda-Vibhajjavāda was its own schism, the Sarvāstivādins "not" having ever been Vibhajjavādins, because Vibhajjavāda was formed by the schism, just like "Sarvāstivāda." What do you know to the contrary?

Malcolm wrote:

There are different accounts. Some accounts maintain that the Vibhajjavāda and Sarvāstivāda formed from a split, others maintain the latter broke off from the former. I find the former account more convincing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 4:26 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Malcolm wrote:

There are two basic Buddhist cosmologies: Hinayāna and Mahāyāna. Which one do you mean?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

and ends up with a Dzogchen (monism) paradigm.

Malcolm wrote:

Most misunderstood part of that book. Dzogchen cosmogony is not monistic at all. It is just Abhidharmakośa cosmogony.



Stay in yer lane, bub.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

not as some special truth to be analysed or considered.

Malcolm wrote:

As something to NOT follow.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 6:27 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

Why would anyone disagree when the doctrine of two truths is accepted by practically everyone? But it doesn't mean it's accepted because of what's in the sutras. Nagarjuna argues against ideas that are rather Abhidharma based, like the whole dharma-theory.

Malcolm wrote:

It must be accepted because of what's in the sūtras, hence the notion of "Sautrantikas," and so on. If the two truths had no basis in the agamic sūtras, for what reason then did the Sautrantikas accept it without question? If as you imply, Nāgārjuna was a species of Sautrantika, why would he accept and promote the two truths? After all, the term "two truths" does not occur in the PP in 8000 lines either, assuming this is one of the earliest and it was before Nāgārjuna. But it discusses dharmas as being mere conventions and names. It also mentioned pāramārtha five times only.

Kāśyapaparivarta only mentions don dam pa, pārmārtha, twice, pāramārthasatya once. If there is an ultimate truth, there must be something which is not ultimate.

Are you suggesting that the idea of two truths in Mahāyāna also comes from Abhidharma commentaries, which we have no evidence of? Its unclear which sūtras Nāgārjuna has before him, other than a PP sūtra and probably the Kāśyapaparivarta, but given that he and Lokāṣema were contemporaries, it is reasonable to assume at least he had these sūtras in front him. Sūtrasammucaya, attributed to Nāgārjuna, has only three references to ultimate truth and a relative truth, in a text called the Candragarbha Chapter (zla ba snyin po le'u), another called the Candraprabha Chapter (zla ba 'od kyi le'u) and a third text, Meeting of the Father and Son Sutra (Pitāputrasamāgamana), where the term "two truths" is explicitly introduced.

Now if your position is that the two truths are not found in either seven-text Abhidharma collections, and only appears in commentaries substantially dated after

Nāgārjuna, then you have to accept, by your own reasoning, that the "two truths" as a term occurs only in Mahāyāna, and that its presence in śrāvaka sources after Nāgārjuna are polemical response against emptiness as ultimate truth.

If on the other hand one accepts that the notion of two truths is discernible in agamic sūtras, no such admission is required, and the two truths doctrine can be seen to develop along different lines in Abhidharma and Mahāyāna, since it is certainly the case that Nāgārjuna cites it as a basic fact which no one would question at all. And there is the possibility, quite distinct and equally remote, that a text like the Pitāputrasamāgamana was "converted" into a Mahāyāna text. As something to NOT follow.

Astus said:

Not follow?

'Of that which the wise in the world agree upon as not existing, I too say that it does not exist. And of that which the wise in the world agree upon as existing, I too say that it exists.' (SN 22.94, tr Bodhi)

Malcolm wrote:

It contradicts what the Buddha says in that agama passage, thus, there is a contradiction to resolve.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Totally opposed to charter schools.

PeterC said:

When you look at who the political proponents of charter schools are, it's easy to reach that conclusion.

The countries with the best performing Education systems all have very strong, nationally standardized public school systems. US politicians would learn a lot about public service provision by looking at the other countries who get it right, but of course they never do that.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, I have come to the conclusion that the state by state system we have makes US democracy weak. There is no nationally standardized curriculum, just as there is no nationally standardized and fair system of voting. The same people promoting charter schools try to undermine the federal govt. At every turn,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 8:37 PM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Totally opposed to charter schools.

PeterC said:

When you look at who the political proponents of charter schools are, it's easy to reach that conclusion.

The countries with the best performing Education systems all have very strong, nationally standardized public school systems. US politicians would learn a lot about public service provision by looking at the other countries who get it right, but of course they never do that.

Dan74 said:

I don't know if nationally standardised is the way to go.

Malcolm wrote:

Switzerland is a tiny country. It's solutions are not applicable to us. They don't scale well. For instance:

In Texas, a Battle Over What Can Be Taught, and What Books Can Be Read

<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/12/10/us/texas-critical-race-theory-ban-books.html?>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 9:57 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

TannersHatch said:

Going out on a limb here...

Malcolm wrote:

And sawing the branch off behind you.

TannersHatch said:

The book of the dead text which is read to the being after death could be thought of as talking someone through a bad dream or 'trip'.

Malcolm wrote:

No. It has no function at all for someone who has not received the empowerment of the peaceful and wrathful deities and done some of its practice in this life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It must be accepted because of what's in the sūtras, hence the notion of "Sautrantikas," and so on. If the two truths had no basis in the agamic sūtras, for what reason then did the Sautrantikas accept it without question?

Astus said:

Sautrantikas accepted momentariness and had their karmic seed theory, but neither of them are found in the sutras.

Malcolm wrote:

You are certain of this?

Astus said:

Nagarjuna lived after the creation of the Mahavibhasa...

Malcolm wrote:

This is not certain.

Astus said:

As for his sources for the two truths teaching, he does not actually specify, does he?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, he does. He specifies the Buddha as the source this teaching. Nagarjuna also proclaims that since nirvana alone is true, everything else is false.

Astus said:

Its unclear which sūtras Nāgārjuna has before him, other than a PP sūtra and probably the Kāśyapaparivarta, but given that he and Lokāṣema were contemporaries, it is reasonable to assume at least he had these sūtras in front him.

Nagarjuna was familiar with various abhidharma works, as discussed in chapter 7 of Nagarjuna in Context.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. But that is irrelevant.

Astus said:

Now if your position is that the two truths are not found in either seven-text Abhidharma collections, and only appears in commentaries substantially dated after Nāgārjuna, then you have to accept, by your own reasoning, that the "two truths" as a term occurs only in Mahāyāna, and that its presence in śrāvaka sources after Nāgārjuna are polemical response against emptiness as ultimate truth.

The Mahāvibhāṣa precedes Nāgārjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

Again, this is uncertain. Walser claims that Ratnavali was written between 175-225. But it could easily have been written 50 years earlier. The Mahāvibhāṣa was supposedly compiled during the Reign of Kanishka (127-151 CE) in Bactria. This is 24 year period is a pretty narrow window to compose such a monumental text and then distribute it across India to Andhra Pradesh, to be received and studied by Nāgārjuna.

Astus said:

Beyond that, it would take some further research to identify early occurrences of the two truths doctrine.

Malcolm wrote:

That being the case, you should not make confident proclamations about it.

Astus said:

If on the other hand one accepts that the notion of two truths is discernible in agamic sūtras, no such admission is required, and the two truths doctrine can be seen to develop along different lines in Abhidharma and Mahāyāna, since it is certainly the case that Nāgārjuna cites it as a basic fact which no one would question at all. And there is the possibility, quite distinct and equally remote, that a text like the Pitāputrasamāgamana was "converted" into a Mahāyāna text.

The idea that there are just two truths is not that fixed, as the Pudgalavadins had a threefold division (Pudgalavada Buddhism, p 105),

Malcolm wrote:

The Pitāputrasamāgamana explicitly negates this "three truths," in no uncertain terms. If this text was in front of Nāgārjuna, as tradition maintains,

Yogacara also has a threefold version,

No. This is an error. The three natures are not three truths, but that is beyond our discussion here.

Astus said:

and the Mahāvibhāṣa notes the existence of twofold, threefold, and fivefold divisions according to different interpreters (Sarvastivada Abhidharma, p 77-78). So, if the two truths doctrine were such a clear case in the sutras, there would be no reason for differences.

Malcolm wrote:

We are here discussing pāramārthasatya and samvṛtisatya. There are also four truths, but that is not relevant here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

The two truths can be understood through yogacara (Lankavatara Sutra).

Malcolm wrote:

The term occurs once in that whole text.

But that was not my point. The three natures certainly are an attempt to describe the two truths, but there is no three truths in Yogacāra. The imputed nature is not a truth, though the imagination of the unreal (the dependent nature) is relative truth for Yogacāra, and the absence of the imputed nature in the dependent nature is what Yogacāra asserts to be ultimate truth (the perfected nature).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 10th, 2021 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Maybe a big reason education is floundering can be found if we look in the mirror.

Malcolm wrote:

There is some truth to this, but not all. As I mentioned before, the defenestration of the US educational system has been a GOP policy since bussing. White people literally moved away from school districts where their kids are educated alongside Black kids, taking their tax dollars with them. A large driving force behind the "white flight" to the suburbs in many urban areas was because of education. Black majority schools have outdated textbooks, no computers, you name it, they don't have it. School policy and curriculum should set at the national level, not the local or state level. Want to educate your kids apart from that, fine, send your kids to private school, but no funding from the state, period, no grants, etc., nothing. Schools should focus on liberal arts as well as STEM. What we turn out now is a bunch of uneducated dummies who do well enough in STEM programs but understand nothing about history, literature, how governments work, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 12:10 AM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Queequeg said:

The thing is, society is raising these kids. We're at such a pitiful stage that as Malcolm is arguing

Malcolm wrote:

We also need to kill Instagram, break up Facebook, and generally regulate social media into the grave.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

TannersHatch said:

How can you be sure of this please?

Malcolm wrote:

I have the empowerment, the lung, and the instruction for this system.

TannersHatch said:

Perhaps it could be of some use regardless?

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. There is the entire of teaching of the Dzogchen system behind this one little text.

TannersHatch said:

I'm no expert so I'm just talking here...

Malcolm wrote:

One needs the empowerment, the lung, and the instruction.

TannersHatch said:

although I don't think these ideas are exclusive to Buddhism are they?

Malcolm wrote:

Not only are they exclusive to Buddhism, they are exclusive to the Dzogchen system within Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 1:46 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

TannersHatch said:

Not only are they exclusive to Buddhism, they are exclusive to the Dzogchen system within Buddhism.

The idea of other realms after death are exclusive to Buddhism?

Malcolm wrote:

The general bardo (antarabhāva, literally the "in-between existence") is not another

realm. It describes the state a sentient being goes through for 7 weeks until it takes birth in one of the six realms—hell being, ghost, animal, human, titan, or god—which in turn are part of the three realms, the desire realm, form realm, and formless realm.

TannersHatch said:

Isn't this 'wheel' largely a Hindu concept?

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, not at all. The hindu concept of rebirth is not recognizable in Buddhism at all.

The bardo that "Liberation from Hearing in the Bardo" describes is unique the Dzogchen system. It is called the bardo of dharmatā. It is not described in any other tantric system outside of the Dzogchen system. The Dzogchen system describes four or six bardos. The other tantric traditions in Buddhism only describe one.

TannersHatch said:

I should exclusively learn from learned folks such as yourself do you advise?

Malcolm wrote:

If you wish to learn about the teachings which come from Dzogchen, then you should rely on teachers who are expert in that system. If you want to learn about ayahuasca, then you should learn from teachers expert in that system. If you want to learn about Hinduism, you learn from teachers expert in that system. But what you must not do is confuse and conflate these systems in a naive, its-all-one-man ecumenicism.

TannersHatch said:

Guess the Bardos are closed to me until I get the lung eh? Where will I go do you think?

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone goes through all the bardos. Without instruction, however, you won't even recognize the bardo of this life, never mind the bardo of death or the bardo of dharmatā. You will die, not recognizing the bardo of death or the bardo of dharmatā, passing straight into the bardo of rebirth, where you will take birth again in the six realms after seven weeks. A day in the bardo equals the amount of time one is able to remain in samadhi. So for most beings, those 49 "days" pass in 49 moments, less than a minute after the consciousness separates from the body, according to the Dzogchen teachings of which "Liberation through Hearing in the Bardo" is a part.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 3:10 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

LastLegend said:

I wasn't reading closely....



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 6:47 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

On the issue of two truths and Nagarjuna: <https://fh.pku.edu.cn/docs/2018-11/20181119234424438102.pdf>

Malcolm wrote:

This paper adds nothing new.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 6:51 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You are certain of this?

Astus said:

'There can be no doubt that the theory of momentariness cannot be traced back to the beginnings of Buddhism or even the Buddha himself. It does not fit the practically orientated teachings of early Buddhism and clearly bears the mark of later doctrinal elaboration. Thus in the Nikayas/Agamas there are many passages which attribute duration to material and even mental entities, whereas there is, at least to my knowledge, no passage which testifies to the stance that all conditioned entities are momentary.'

(The Buddhist Doctrine of Momentariness, p 15)

Malcolm wrote:

Inconclusive.

Astus said:

Can be uncertain, sure. However, the Mahavibhasa is a compendium, and the information contained therein most likely predates it,

Malcolm wrote:

Again, uncertain. Face it Astus, you just don't have very strong evidence to be making the confident statements you've been making on this subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 9:59 PM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Again, uncertain. Face it Astus, you just don't have very strong evidence to be making the confident statements you've been making on this subject.

Astus said:

Let's put it this way then: there is no evidence so far of the existence of the two truths doctrine in the sutras or the main 7 abhidharma texts, only in somewhat later works like the Mahavibhasa. To maintain that nevertheless there is would need finding such references.

Malcolm wrote:

Often in Vasubandhu and earlier Abhidharma texts references are made to doctrines belonging to sutras not found in one or another canon, like the bardo, for example, or in sutras that did not survive at all. The best you can say is that YOU personally don't see such evidence; others, such as myself, disagree. The difference, I suspect, is how much credibility one wants to lend buddhologists as being the final arbiters of Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 11th, 2021 at 10:32 PM

Title: Re: A question on Bardo

Content:

Dharmasheerab said:

Now this question may touch esoteric topics so please don't answer if one feels they are violating their precepts and tantric vows.

This is a question asked by a Zen priest who regularly visits our monastery (I am a Theravada novice living in a Theravada monastery). He asked me two questions -

1. In the Bardo stage, why do practitioners focus on the Form aspect of the being? Shouldn't they be focussing on the mind aspect?

2. At what point does the being no longer recollect that she or he was not a human in a past life?

Malcolm wrote:

1. Body and mind are not dual.

2. After the 21st day, one forgets one past life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 12:04 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I'm sure everyone has more or less their own definitions of what leftism, rightism, conservatism, and liberalism are....

I mean I'm pretty rightist, and liberal in ways; and all I can say here, is screw leninism, stalinism, trotskyism, & maoism (weren't these guys the epitome of leftism?), and screw neoconservatism.

Malcolm wrote:

Left libertarian. This means, governments pay for everything necessary to keep everyone healthy, well educated, and prosperous, while also respecting to the utmost degree civil rights, freedom of the press, and the right to assembly. Yes, taxes are high, but so are benefits.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

There is a Vinaya rule against boasting about one's spiritual accomplishments or spiritual experiences.

Malcolm wrote:

This applies only to the ordained and is probably at the root of the śrāvaka notion that anyone who attains stream entry and does not ordain within seven days, dies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Dan74 said:

US kids are different, how exactly? The maths they learn or should be learning is different, how exactly?

Malcolm wrote:

Dan, you have no idea how bad education in this country is at the primary and secondary level. How unequal it is from district to district. And don't get me started on the college loan scam.

So yeah, you don't really get it, and your solutions won't scale. Part of that is because you live in a little European country.

It is not STEM that is the problem, it is about the liberal arts side of the issue, where kids learn about government, ethics, history, and so on, the side that trains children in

citizenship and so on.

The right have become such a bunch of snowflakes in the US, they are now banning books from schools because they might cause some white child to cry. Teachers cannot honestly teach about Columbus' genocidal presence in the West Indies in many red states now because some white child might feel bad about being white, and on and on it goes. So yeah, it's not just about math.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 2:28 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

Vietnam is interesting. Highly democratic with local representation, worker co ops and multi party elections. Neoliberals even ran in the last election. Cuba has elections as well.

China for all it's faults under Deng brought 800m million people out of the worst poverty imaginable and created a Western standard of living for 300 million.

Malcolm wrote:

Thanks to Walmart.

Nemo said:

It was ironically the largest period of economic growth in the history of capitalism. China under Deng was fun and felt more free than here.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, if you were a westerner, clueless, and no idea what is happening there around you.

Nemo said:

Much better than bombing random brown people like we do.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, now they just randomly imprison Tibetans and Uigers, etc. in massive concentration camps by the hundreds of thousands at a time.

Nemo said:

The West generally had a big economic head start from genocide, slavery, colonialism and imperialism. It will be interesting when those advantages expire.

Malcolm wrote:

They've just been passed onto China, that's all. They haven't expired at all. China is the biggest colonial force in Africa, at the moment. Its a player in the neoliberalism game, now it is just trying to control neoliberalism to its own advantage. It is engaged in "internal" colonialism and genocide in Tibet and Xinjiang.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 5:54 AM

Title: Re: Two truths in Mahayana Buddhism

Content:

Astus said:

To meet this criticism, Pārśva made the extraordinary claim that the reason these matters could not be found in the sūtras must be because they had been in sūtras that the Buddha had preached, but that had been subsequently lost.'[/i]

Malcolm wrote:

An entirely reasonable assumption. Vasubandhu, speaking as a Mahāyāni, addresses the issue of the loss of many sūtras in both śrāvakayāna and Mahāyāna,

[https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/ibk1952/55/3/55\\_3\\_1106/\\_pdf](https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/ibk1952/55/3/55_3_1106/_pdf)

<https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/viewFile/9178/3036>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 11:24 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Charlie123 said:

Taken altogether, they represent a nuanced and well-thought out body of advice on how disciples should relate to gurus.

Malcolm wrote:

My personal point of view is that how gurus relate to disciples is actually more important than how disciples relate to gurus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 9:12 PM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Dan74 said:

US kids are different, how exactly? The maths they learn or should be learning is different, how exactly?

Malcolm wrote:

Dan, you have no idea how bad education in this country is at the primary and secondary level. How unequal it is from district to district. And don't get me started on the college loan scam.

Dan74 said:

I do have an idea of how bad it is. What I am not aware of is compelling evidence that the lack of a national curriculum is the root cause of that. But I am happy to learn.

Malcolm wrote:

Its obvious. For example, in the South, they still refer to the Civil War as the war of Northern Aggression, and they still use textbooks on the Civil War written by "Lost Cause" historians. In Texas, you will find virtually no reference at all to the fact that Texas as the last state after the Civil War to receive the Emancipation Proclamation (Juneteenth), and so on, or that Texas was founded to promote slavery.

There is no little to no civil studies taught in primary or secondary schools any more. There is little to no PE taught in Inner City schools because of lack of funding. Classrooms sizes range from 40 to 60 students at all levels in public schools systems. Teachers are not given living wages. Teachers Unions are demonized on the smallest pretexts. It goes way beyond curriculums.

The US educational system has been rendered dysfunctional by a whole host of issues beyond teaching reading, writing, and arithmetic, and as far as the latter three are concerned, I would say that most students in the US in the public school system graduate with insufficient skills in grammar and composition. Every college in the US has writing and grammar class requirements for freshman, because the functional literacy rate in the US has been plummeting for the past five decades. For example:

According to the U.S. Department of Education, 54% of U.S. adults 16-74 years old - about 130 million people - lack proficiency in literacy, reading below the equivalent of a sixth-grade level.

<https://www.forbes.com/sites/michaeltietzel/2020/09/09/low-literacy-levels-among-us-adults-could-be-costing-the-economy-22-trillion-a-year/?sh=56130fbe4c90>

So yeah, the US needs a complete overhaul in the primary and secondary school system, and it needs to be done at the Federal level, because the states are just not doing an adequate job.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 9:50 PM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Charlie123 said:

Taken alltogether, they represent a nuanced and well-thought out body of advice on how disciples should relate to gurus.

Malcolm wrote:

My personal point of view is that how gurus relate to disciples is actually more important than how disciples relate to gurus.

nyonchung said:

I'm a poor disciple but met teachers who were remarkably attentive to their disciples' spiritual development, material welfare, mental well-being...

Malcolm wrote:

My personal role model is ChNN. He was always unfailingly polite, kind, humble, and never lashed out or behaved in a "crazy" manner. He never gaslighted anyone. This is not to say that he was never sharp, never scolded anyone, or never used sarcasm. He would get angry if a situation warranted it. But for the most part he was pretty relaxed, and at the same time, intensely focused on benefitting his students.

He was very clear about what he was doing and one could either "be in his boat" or not. His list of 27 personal samayas he adopted before he began teaching Dzogchen is illustrative of his whole approach to being a teacher. He did not give a flying f\*\*k about Tibetan hierarchy per se, while at the same time caring deeply about Tibetan culture and history. But he never tried to turn his students into little imitation Tibetans nor did he try to invent a dharma culture by creating a mashup of Asian and Western cultures, like Trungpa, etc. He understood westerners were westerners, and that what we needed was the essentials of Dharma, not all the cultural bullshit that has hitched a ride with Vajrayāna teachings. He always put Dzogchen Community first, even when it caused problems in his personal life. He always used to call himself Dzogchen Community member #1, as we all have membership numbers. When he passed, the world lost a treasure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 10:09 PM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Dan74 said:

An overhaul you are suggesting, Malcolm, is not tantamount to a national curriculum, or at least, doesn't need to be. And if there is no grass-roots movement for it, won't it be resisted tooth-and-nail, challenged in court, etc?

Malcolm wrote:

For public schools, there needs to be a national curriculum, for example, in history, literature, social, and civil studies, as well as in the sciences, biology, physics, etc. You do realize that there are school districts (not many, but they exist) in the US that require teaching that the holocaust is only an OPINION; that evolution is only an OPINION, and one must also teach creationism alongside it; that one has to provide a fair and balanced picture of SLAVERY, showing that slaves also benefitted from the system, and so on. You are aware of these things, correct? And of course, there is, in most secondary school textbooks on US history, no account of the real story of America's westward expansion and oppression of native people, beginning in the 1830's with Jackson's Indian Removals, etc. These things are not an issue where I live but they are serious issue in South, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

nyonchung said:

What a confusion, patriarchy is mostly a meaningless gimmick drawn possibly from Foucault...

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Oxford:

pa·tri·arch·y

/ˈpātrē, ărkē/

Learn to pronounce

noun

noun: patriarchy

a system of society or government in which the father or eldest male is head of the family and descent is traced through the male line.

"the thematic relationships of the ballad are worked out according to the conventional archetypes of the patriarchy"

a system of society or government in which men hold the power and women are largely excluded from it.

"the dominant ideology of patriarchy"

a society or community organized on patriarchal lines.

plural noun: patriarchies

"we live in a patriarchy"

Merriam Webster

pa·tri·ar·chy | \ ˈpā-trē-, ăr-kē \

plural patriarchies

Essential Meaning of patriarchy

1 : a family, group, or government controlled by a man or a group of men

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 10:43 PM

Title: Re: The underrepresented genre of personal memoir in Tibetan Buddhism

Content:

nyonchung said:

to be a poet yourself.

Malcolm wrote:



Nah, attempts to translate Tibetan poetry poetically usually results in sentimental drivel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 12th, 2021 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

nyonchung said:

"patriarchy" is a gimmick of sorts...

Malcolm wrote:

Well, certainly supporters of patriarchal relations and social systems based on them would have one believe this. But I suspect you just don't like the feminist critique of patriarchy because it is primarily coming from American scholars, and you are French, and you are still mad about Quebec.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

nyonchung said:

A great part of the US scholarship in the 80's drawn heavily on Foucault, Derrida (again, badly translated at times)...

Malcolm wrote:

No serious philosophers (i.e. Anglo-American analytical philosophers) paid any attention to those guys, since the Anglo-American tradition has written off everything in Europe from Hegel onward as a waste of time.

The folks you are talking about are just literary critics, fashionable among people who don't like to think.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 1:09 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

nyonchung said:

A great part of the US scholarship in the 80's drawn heavily on Foucault, Derrida (again, badly translated at times)...

Malcolm wrote:

No serious philosophers (i.e. Anglo-American analytical philosophers) paid any attention to those guys, since the Anglo-American tradition has written off everything in Europe from Hegel onward as a waste of time.

The folks you are talking about are just literary critics, fashionable among people who don't like to think.

nyonchung said:

American exceptionnalism? hope not, but if what you say is factual, then all the best.

Malcolm wrote:

My late father was a "professional" philosopher, a colleague of Jay Garfield at Smith. He was an analytical philosopher and in his opinion, guys like Foucault. Derrida, and so on couldn't frame a coherent argument even if their lives depended on it. Guys like Heidegger, etc., are just not that coherent, what need to mention Nietzsche? Basically, for the analytical tradition, the European contribution ends in Kant. He was a bit distressed that what was passing for philosophy in some peoples mind's was this mishmash of continental incoherence, especially with 80's faddism around deconstruction and Derrida. There are some universities in which this stuff gained a foothold, but not so much in the Ivy League schools, at least not when I was of college age, forty years ago.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 2:22 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The folks you are talking about are just literary critics, fashionable among people who don't like to think.

treehuggingoctopus said:

The first bit of this is just inaccurate.

Malcolm wrote:

It's accurate.

treehuggingoctopus said:

The second part is grossly unfair, and I am truly sorry to hear it coming from you.

Malcolm wrote:

I admit it was gratuitous, but it was fun to write.

treehuggingoctopus said:

Yes, there is a split between the analytical tradition and the continental tradition -- although in recent years it has been healed to some extent, and the healing continues (most philosophers writing in the areas which I follow have been mixing both voices since the 1990s).

Malcolm wrote:

There is a place for literary criticism, certainly philosophical texts are not immune from

literary critique. But in general, I find western philosophy logorrheic, and this isn't helped when we have people mistaking Nietzsche, Marx, and Freud for philosophers, or worthy of attention from philosophers.

treehuggingoctopus said:

I stand firmly with the continental camp, but I would never parody the analytical philosophers' attitude along the lines of your crass mischaracterization.

Malcolm wrote:

It's basically a question of excluding evidence that is worthy of investigation, the analytical tradition has a much more narrow criteria for what they think is worth investigating or even deemed "philosophy." As Buddhists, our criteria is even more narrow.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

they are both theorists, the theory in question being the capital-letter Theory aka literary theory aka cultural theory -- which is not literary criticism but "theory" as in the Frankfurters' Critical Theory (which indeed is in many ways Derrida's, but not Foucault's, starting point.

Malcolm wrote:

Having theories does not make one a philosopher. Having a theory of literature is little different than literary criticism, pumped up on self-importance.

Careful argumentation, grounded in logic and rationality, makes one a philosopher: example, John Rawls.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 4:05 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Having theories does not make one a philosopher. Having a theory of literature is little different than literary criticism, pumped up on self-importance.

treehuggingoctopus said:

Theory has nothing to do with having theories. It is related to the Greek *theoria*, interpreted the way Frankfurters did (after Kant), i.e., laying bare that which is hidden, i.e., one's preconceptions, necessary blindnesses, ideological involvements, conditions

of possibility, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, I quite like Adorno's take down of Heidegger.

I just found very little of substance in Derrida, for example. Just yawn, add to this of course his and Foucault's support for sex with preteens...just not worth bothering at all. Freaking perverts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Opinions on the school system?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Outsized focus on standardized testing is what's killing a lot of kids education right now.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. people get real good at filling in circles, checking off squares, and drawing lines between two things. But they still don't learn a damn thing.

You see, you live in WA. I live in New England. We enjoy the highest rates of literacy in the US. Even New York scores at the bottom of the literacy charts, surprisingly, or maybe not, because parts of upstate NY are as poor as parts of Appalachia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

The issue is not what Derrida writes, it is in the army of Derrideans, who take him as a kind of guru, and make no effort to read or think outside of his paradigm. Same with Foucauldians et al.

Malcolm wrote:

Addressed by my comment about those who don't like to think.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

For example, 20th century analytic philosophy is unthinkable

Malcolm wrote:

The Anglo-American analytical traditions isn't an ethnic grouping, it is a grouping assembled in the Anglo-American academy in the 1950s, characterized by a certain approach to knowledge.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 10:20 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

For example, 20th century analytic philosophy is unthinkable

Malcolm wrote:

The Anglo-American analytical traditions isn't an ethnic grouping, it is a grouping assembled in the Anglo-American academy in the 1950s, characterized by a certain approach to knowledge.

tobes said:

Some of the literature on this topic suggests otherwise. i.e. a lot of the hard divisions crystallized during/after WWII. The analytic distaste for Hegel, Nietzsche etc has a lot to do with misreading them as somehow directly responsible for Nazi Germany.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is just a recognition that Hegelianism, with it focus on Hegel being the apex of history, in turn influenced Nietzsche's reactionary nihilism, as well as Marx, which ideologies led directly to anti-democratic regimes in Europe of both the left and the right in the twentieth century. This perception you speak, of course, was not positively reinforced by Nietzsche's posthumous Will to Power, compiled and edited by his virulently-antisemitic sister.

Of course Adorno aptly shows how Heidegger's pseudo-philosophy is fascism in its very essence, a sterling example of literary criticism of a philosophical text if there ever was one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 10:34 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

Some of the literature on this topic suggests otherwise. i.e. a lot of the hard divisions crystallized during/after WWII. The analytic distaste for Hegel, Nietzsche etc has a lot to do with misreading them as somehow directly responsible for Nazi Germany.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is just a recognition that Hegelianism, with its focus on Hegel being the apex of history, in turn influenced Nietzsche's reactionary nihilism, as well as Marx, were ideologies that led directly to anti-democratic regimes in Europe of both the left and the right.

PeterC said:

The common interpretation of this is more than a little unfair to Nietzsche. Hitler never read him, his main philosophical motivation was Heidegger. Nietzsche's actual ideas were consistently misrepresented from the Nazi era to today - *GötzenDämmerung* contains extensive anti-statist thoughts, and the "what does not kill you" line is almost always taken out of context to mean exactly the opposite of what he was actually saying.

Malcolm wrote:

Nietzsche was a cipher, meaning that one could selectively read whatever one wanted into him. Unfortunately, *Will to Power* is the most read title of one of his least understood books, inspiring many mini-Hitler wannabes. The other thing is that N has always ironically been more inspiring to the right than the left, because they interpret his anti statism not as a critique of state power, but as critique of consensus and cooperation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 11:05 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

There's nothing in *Will to Power* that remotely looks fascistic.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I know, that was my point. People read the title and that's about it.

However, Nietzsche's skepticism of states leads directly to skepticism of democratic institutions. A bias or an operating principle in analytical philosophy is the defense of liberalism. Attempts to rehabilitate N's thought as conducive to democratic liberalism are failures, in my estimation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 13th, 2021 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I am (to an extent, in a fashion, etc.) a good Marxist. I wish anything happening in academia was capable of significantly contributing to such political changes as the

election of POTUS. I suspect none of us uni people has really been able to believe it since the 1960s. Burroughs quipped that the Vietnam War provoked the longest and most sustained grassroots protests in the 20th century, supported by the vast majority of public intellectuals -- and, he says, all of it amounted to a fart.

Malcolm wrote:

Burroughs was wrong. It led to the US Military exiling the press. When I was a child, every night between 1968-1975 there was unedited, raw news footage of the Vietnam war on ABC, CBS, and NBC. Now, we see at best sanitized footage with grim journalists standing in other countries reporting on the latest war news. So, the effect of the anti-war movement was to cause the US military to end press access to war zones. This is one reason we stayed in Iraq and Afghanistan for so long. As for the latter, many people in the US had no idea we were still there when Biden finally pulled us out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Matt J said:

It wasn't an argument more than an observation. And if it were silly, that WaPo article never would have been written. One story that can be told is that the post-structuralist attitude, filtered via countless ways through higher learning, may have shifted the intellectual (and eventually the popular) culture in such a way that people are more open to Trumpian (and Putinian) forms of discourse.

Malcolm wrote:

And this relates directly to why Madhyamaka isn't a challenge to conventional knowledge, unlike deconstruction and other post-modernist trends, for which it is consistently mistaken.

Madhyamaka, if anything, does not seek to dismantle conventional knowledge, so much as site it appropriately in the context of liberation. It makes strong arguments against incoherent, essentialist claims which undermine conventional knowledge, in order to show that knowledge requires functionality in order to be considered knowledge at all. Its appeal to the illusory nature of phenomena and knowledge is not an argument for pure subjectivity, as it is often mistaken for. Instead, its appeal to the illusory nature of phenomena and knowledge is an argument for consensus and convention, while at the same time, negating the irrationality of imputing essences to dependently originated things.

I would argue that the present interest in Yogacāra, for example, is as much a function of the penetration of postmodernism into Buddhist studies as it is a function of increased linguistic understanding of Buddhist texts and so on. It is not an accident that in America and England, the continental fascination with yogacāra has met with quite a bit of resistance.

Now that we have scholars moving from being disinterested coroners of religion to invested proponents, this is changing, and it is not surprising that the strongest proponents of gzhan stong and yogācāra are Europeans. Frankly, a lot of argument between modern Mādhyamikas such as myself and those who adhere to various species of yogācāra can be traced to a divide between how knowledge is handled by analytical and continental philosophy in general.

On the other hand, I can't tell you how many dissertations I have read in Buddhist studies over the years complete with accounts of methodologies derived from Said, Tambiah, etc. and so on. It seems that modern professors in Buddhist studies departments are demanding 100 pages or so filled with bullshit about the student's methodology and approach rooted in some postmodern drivel.

It is also not surprising that we have modern lamas who seem to have grasped onto Nietzschean moral nihilism with respect to the behavior of "mahāsiddhas," especially of the modern variety, whose main siddhis seem to be gathering students and bilking them of their money, just to bring this whole exchange

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Yogacara + Tathagatagarba = Shentong

Content:

Matt J said:

Any progress?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, his translation is certainly challenging.

I hope at some point to bring out a new translation of this this text, as well as the second of the trilogy, An Investigation into the Meaning of the Luminous Original Mind, the Differentiation of the Basis, Path and Result of the Great Perfection entitled Illuminating Wisdom.

No, I have more important work to do than translating Mipham.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 2:05 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Terma said:

What are the requirements to read this (and any other of Malcolm's recent Dzogchen textual translations)?

Thanks.



Malcolm wrote:

The lung, if you can get it. Tulku Dakpa periodically gives the lung for Buddhahood.

He is planning to give the lung for the seventeen Tantras sometime following Tibetan New Year, 2022.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

PeterC said:

He also wasn't really a nihilist, the first few sections of Zarathustra make that very clear, he found meaning in the transformation of the individual, but he rejected finding meaning in the collective.

Malcolm wrote:

He was definitely a nihilist. His argument that the superior man was not obligated by the moral constraints imposed upon rest of us is a nihilism of narcissistic vanity.

He would be thrilled with the interpretation that some Vajrayāna wannabes promote that there are superior humans who may transgress the moral restrictions imposed on the herd because of their spiritual accomplishments.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 2:34 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

Matt J said:

I suppose it depends on what side of Yogacara/Shentong you focus on. If you focus on the "no externality" side, you get solipsism.

But what Yogacara/Shentong presents to my mind is the basic, underlying goodness, which is about as far from PoMo as you can get. In fact, this line of teaching is often justified as a corrective to nihilistic Madyamaka misinterpretations.

Malcolm wrote:

I would argue that the present interest in Yogacāra, for example, is as much a function of the penetration of postmodernism into Buddhist studies as it is a function of increased linguistic understanding of Buddhist texts and so on. It is not an accident that in America and England, the continental fascination with yogacāra has met with quite a bit of resistance.

It's a correction without an error to correct.

But my point really is that Yogacāra offers much more of a narratology than

Madhyamaka. It's loaded with many more concepts, fine distinctions, and path narratives than Mādhyamikas typically offer.

There just isn't much juice for the POMO scene to squeeze out of Madhyamaka. Madhyamaka is more akin to ordinary language philosophy than anything else in the Western scene.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 4:11 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Is it permissible to receive this lung if one has not yet received direct introduction

Malcolm wrote:

According to Rinpoche, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 7:28 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

PeterC said:

He also wasn't really a nihilist, the first few sections of Zarathustra make that very clear, he found meaning in the transformation of the individual, but he rejected finding meaning in the collective.

Malcolm wrote:

He was definitely a nihilist. His argument that the superior man was not obligated by the moral constraints imposed upon rest of us is a nihilism of narcissistic vanity.

He would be thrilled with the interpretation that some Vajrayāna wannabes promote that there are superior humans who may transgress the moral restrictions imposed on the herd because of their spiritual accomplishments.

tobes said:

I can't believe I'm here defending Nietzsche, but there's no way he's espousing nihilism...So, it is reactionary and it is aristocratic. But not nihilistic.

Malcolm wrote:

I disagree. His nihilism is evident in his moral contempt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 8:34 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Terma said:

What are the requirements to read this (and any other of Malcolm's recent Dzogchen textual translations)?

Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

The lung, if you can get it. Tulku Dakpa periodically gives the lung for Buddhahood.

He is planning to give the lung for the seventeen Tantras sometime following Tibetan New Year, 2022.

climb-up said:

Do you know if this will be online or in person, and how long the lung takes (quite a few days presumably, right?)

Malcolm wrote:

Online, TBD.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 10:05 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

climb-up said:

Do you know if this will be online or in person, and how long the lung takes (quite a few days presumably, right?)

Malcolm wrote:

Online, TBD.

climb-up said:

Yay! That means it's possible! Keeping my fingers crossed for no scheduling conflicts.

Malcolm wrote:

You have to decide what is important.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 14th, 2021 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Nemo said:

The West generally had a big economic head start from genocide, slavery, colonialism and imperialism.

tingdzin said:

China was centuries ahead of "the West" as far as genocide, colonialism, and imperialism. As for slavery, it has been almost ever-present across the world until recently.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe Nemo is cashing in:

<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2021/12/13/technology/china-propaganda-youtube-influencers.html>

Kirk Apesland, a Canadian living in China, calls his channel Gweilo 60. ("Gweilo" is Cantonese slang for foreigner.) He rejects news of repression in Xinjiang and cites his own happy experiences to contest the idea that China's people are oppressed.

After The Times contacted Mr. Apesland, he posted a video titled "New York Times vs Gweilo 60." In it, he acknowledges that he accepts free hotels and payment from city and provincial authorities. He compares it to being a pitchman for local tourism.

"Are there fees for what I do? Of course," he says. "I'm doing a job. I'm putting the videos out to hundreds of thousands of people."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 1:01 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

All I got from it was that we have too many guns in the country.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.thetrace.org/2021/12/atf-time-to-crime-gun-data-shooting-pandemic/>

Queequeg said:

ATF data shows that in 2020, police recovered almost twice as many guns with a short "time-to-crime" — in this case, guns recovered within a year of their purchase — than in 2019. Law enforcement officials generally view a short time-to-crime as an indicator that a firearm was purchased with criminal intent, since a gun with a narrow window between sale and recovery is less likely to have changed hands. Altogether, more than 87,000 such guns were recovered in 2020, almost double the previous high. And almost 68,000 guns were recovered in 2020 with a time-to-crime of less than seven months (meaning they were less likely to have been purchased the previous year).

Malcolm wrote:

This applies to the Rittenhouse case. He purchased his gun in May, 2020, and used it in a homicide in August, 2020.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

No one involved there, Rittenhouse included, had the eyes McVeigh had.

Malcolm wrote:

My point was in support of your idea that there are too many guns. McVeigh was a former soldier. Rittenhouse is a puppy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 2:19 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

No one involved there, Rittenhouse included, had the eyes McVeigh had.

Malcolm wrote:

My point was in support of your idea that there are too many guns. McVeigh was a former soldier. Rittenhouse is a puppy.

Queequeg said:

oops.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 2:25 AM

Title: Re: Sakya Pandita and medicine question.

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Well back then, Sakya Pandita could have only been talking about natural medicine (i.e. medicine that most anti-scientism people wouldn't object to); therefore it's kind of irrelevant.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he was talking about Tibetan Medicine and people who refuse medical treatment of any kind claiming that accepting medical treatment proved one had no faith the Buddha. Also, there are many strongly poisonous substances that can be used, treated and

altered for use as medicine, no better than any modern medical poisons, from the perspective of medicines used to combat severe illnesses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 5:04 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

fckw said:

Gautama Buddha could not read Tibetan at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that is certainly true, since there was no written language in Tibet at that time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 6:11 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

fckw said:

Gautama Buddha could not read Tibetan at all. Same is true for the majority of Buddhist masters of past and present.

Pero said:

Strange point to bring up when it says Tibetan Buddhist in the title of the topic which is also in the Tibetan Buddhism forum.

fckw said:

Yeah, it's really odd that the person does only bother about Tibetan explicitly, and does not seem to bother about any other language spoken, read or written by Vajrayana Buddhists throughout history, like Sanskrit, Zhang Zhung.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no living tradition of Vajrayāna in Sanskrit anymore. Zhangzhung is at best a faux language reconstructed out of fragments in the 11th century by a person who never spoke it (Shenchen Luga) nor knew it's grammar.

fckw said:

Chinese, Japanese and quite a few others.

Malcolm wrote:

There is so little in Western languages on Mikkyo in general, that there is really nothing to talk about. One can read a few books, learn a few prayers, but without going to Japan and living on Koyasan or Heizan, you are not going to get much.

fckw said:

Nor for Indian Vajrayana masters who never traveled to Tibet and did not speak the language.

Malcolm wrote:

Indian Vajrayāna, as a living tradition, ended in the 16th century, maybe the early 17th.

fckw said:

But then again, it indeed is the "Tibetan Buddhism" subforum, so it's obvious to all of us that any discussions around other forms of Vajrayana (much less so: other forms of Buddhism!) are not to be expected here, are they?

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, there is really is not much point because all those other traditions are either dead, faux, or inaccessible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 8:58 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

The two Tendai centers and the few Shingon temples seem to have access to Mikkyo no? I can't say this out of experience but the priests there were trained at Koyasan or Heizan, so it seems there is some options available for those in the west.

Malcolm wrote:

Not as much as you might think. For example, can you name one single major commentary translated from Japanese on Mikkyo into English? I can't either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 9:05 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Nadereme said:

Because many are still vexed in materialist views and think science is somehow superior.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, we think that Buddhist epistemology should be taken seriously. The latter depends on valid direct perception and inference. If you can prove through valid direct perception and inference there is a Mt. Meru out there, I am all ears.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 9:09 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Not as much as you might think. For example, can you name one single major commentary translated from Japanese on Mikkyo into English? I can't either.

Nicholas2727 said:

I believe they teach the practices tho. But I do see your point. Are you aware of any translators focusing on Japanese Mikkyo? With Tibetan Vajrayana becoming more popular in the west I think it would be great to see the East Asian side of Vajrayana in more detail

Zhen Li said:

Rolf Giebel and Thomas Eijō Dreitlein.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither of whom have yet to produce a major translation of any significance. Not saying they won't, but tap tap tap tap tap tap tap tap...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 9:15 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

Heidegger

Malcolm wrote:

I think we can all agree Heidegger was utterly full of shit, and should be cancelled.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:01 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

climb-up said:

Yay! That means it's possible! Keeping my fingers crossed for no scheduling conflicts.

Malcolm wrote:



You have to decide what is important.

climb-up said:

Of course I do.

Accordingly, if it comes down to it I will prioritize feeding my children and keeping a roof over their head.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is how it goes. We don't need every lung, every empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:10 AM

Title: Re: US Election Day Aftermath

Content:

Queequeg said:

White people take everything in the end. LOL

Malcolm wrote:

That's what they said about the Romans.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:31 AM

Title: Re: When are we Bodhisattvas?

Content:

Padmist said:

When do we become Bodhisattvas?

Can we be Bodhisattvas in this life?

Is this something that you can confirm (to yourself) or confirmed by others that you are one?

or are our actions in this life a preparation for our Bodhisattva path in the next lives?

Malcolm wrote:

The first moment we develop bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:47 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is no living tradition of Vajrayāna in Sanskrit anymore.

Varis said:

Newar Vajrayana uses Sanskrit as a liturgical language. And AFAIK there's been a few Westerners initiated in it. Difficult to access, yes, but not impossible.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not the same, that's like saying the Latin Mass still exists and a few old fogies converse in Latin at the Vatican.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 11:16 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Varis said:

Newar Vajrayana uses Sanskrit as a liturgical language. And AFAIK there's been a few Westerners initiated in it. Difficult to access, yes, but not impossible.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not the same, that's like saying the Latin Mass still exists and a few old fogies converse in Latin at the Vatican.

Zhen Li said:

The comparison is not accurate. Latin mass is now performed only by a minority, whereas all vajrācāryas use only Sanskrit for ritual and recitation. Newar is only used for popular Buddhist songs sung outside of formal rituals. Even the Newar laity uses Sanskrit at home for daily recitation.

Malcolm wrote:

I lived with a Newar family for some years, I know exactly what they do. They recite rituals in Sanskrit, like Brahmins. The Vajracaryas, a restricted cast in Nepal, are a fast dying tradition. At this point, it's practically museum Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 11:36 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Zhen Li said:

It is also quite demeaning to those who actually practice, or sponsor these rituals (including myself), to suggest that they are just performing museum displays. What an incredibly orientalist attitude.

Malcolm wrote:

There are all kinds of museum Buddhism these days, including Tibetan monks who travel around doing mandala rites in...museums.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 11:42 AM

Title: Re: When are we Bodhisattvas?

Content:

Padmist said:

Is it correct then to say that as long as a Mahayana Buddhist is generating bodhicitta, they are Bodhisattva?

Malcolm wrote:

Once you generate bodhicitta you are a bodhisattva. You don't even really need to put much effort into bodhicitta itself. Once you have made up your mind to become a buddha to benefit others, that mind will carry you the rest of the way. But it will take a long time and require courage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Zhen Li said:

It is also quite demeaning to those who actually practice, or sponsor these rituals (including myself), to suggest that they are just performing museum displays. What an incredibly orientalist attitude.

Malcolm wrote:

There are all kinds of museum Buddhism these days, including Tibetan monks who travel around doing mandala rites in...museums.

Zhen Li said:

Granted. Still there's a lot of Tibetan Vajrayāna supremacy in Buddhist studies, which is a big part of why Newar Buddhism has been overlooked, despite the fact that it's very much not merely a museum, but a changing and evolving tradition. It's interesting that effectively the study of Buddhism in the west effectively got its first major push from Nepal with Brian Hodgson and Eugène Burnouf, but most of the tradition still remains sidelined in scholarship on Vajrayana Buddhism in India (Davidson's book comes to mind).

Malcolm wrote:

That's largely because it is caste restricted. Newars who are serious about practicing Vajrayana seek out Tibetan gurus, because the Vajracaryas don't teach outside their

clique.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

I think that Heidegger's big contribution was to hermeneutics, and in fact it has become so naturalised that we may utilise it without even realising. Malcolm, as a translator - I wonder if 'text critical' methods would have even arisen without H?

Malcolm wrote:

FFS, modern hermeneutics begin with Schleiermacher, and text critical methodology predates H by centuries, originating during the Enlightenment, in the West. Also Tsongkhapa, Buton, Ngorchen, and so on were astute text critical scholars, who needed to wade through multiple translations and compare them. And H's Ancient Greek was a pretense. and let's not even begin to discuss Vasubandhu, Candrakirti, and so on, who all were astute text critical scholars and practitioners of hermeneutics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Pero said:

Strange point to bring up when it says Tibetan Buddhist in the title of the topic which is also in the Tibetan Buddhism forum.

fckw said:

Yeah, it's really odd that the person does only bother about Tibetan explicitly, and does not seem to bother about any other language spoken, read or written by Vajrayana Buddhists throughout history, like Sanskrit, Zhang Zhung. Chinese, Japanese and quite a few others. Nor for Indian Vajrayana masters who never traveled to Tibet and did not speak the language. But then again, it indeed is the "Tibetan Buddhism" subforum, so it's obvious to all of us that any discussions around other forms of Vajrayana (much less so: other forms of Buddhism!) are not to be expected here, are they?

Tata1 said:

Good way of making a simple, straight forward thread, of someone asking help with a very specific question, go off topic. Whats the necessity of posting this kind of thing?

Malcolm wrote:

Shits and giggles, I think.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 15th, 2021 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

nyonchung said:

this was arriving in the Western Continent of endless riches, Balanchö

Malcolm wrote:

They didn't go far enough west, that's America.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 16th, 2021 at 9:05 AM

Title: Re: Some Observation on the Guru-Chela Relationship by Tulku Sherdor

Content:

tobes said:

No one can avoid Gadamer...

Malcolm wrote:

We can completely ignore that, at least I have. Gadamer has zero influence on my work. I just don't cotton to Spenglerian interpretations of culture and history.

We work from commentaries and just translate what the texts actually say, as best we can. That's a function of understanding both the context and grammar of the source language, as well as being able to compose adequate sentences in the target language. Everything else is extraneous to that.

You can examine my work for yourself.

No translation is perfect, of course. But we do not need to pile theories upon theories, particularly by people who never did any serious translation work in their entire lives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 16th, 2021 at 10:14 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Granted. Still there's a lot of Tibetan Vajrayāna supremacy in Buddhist studies, which is a big part of why Newar Buddhism has been overlooked, despite the fact that it's very much not merely a museum, but a changing and evolving tradition. It's interesting that effectively the study of Buddhism in the west effectively got its first major push from

Nepel with Brian Hodgson and Eugène Burnouf, but most of the tradition still remains sidelined in scholarship on Vajrayana Buddhism in India (Davidson's book comes to mind).

Malcolm wrote:

That's largely because it is caste restricted. Newars who are serious about practicing Vajrayana seek out Tibetan gurus, because the Vajracaryas don't teach outside their clique.

Zhen Li said:

In cases where this happens, they usually maintain a Vajrācārya as the family priest and seek teachings from the lama for personal practice. Of course, there are also non-Vajrācāryas Newars who have become lamas, some of whom in turn serve in that capacity for other non-Vajrācāryas. Some non-Newars (and a few Newars too) follow a member of the Rana family who became a rinpoche. The main thing is, lamas cannot really do Newar lifecycle rites, so even those who are really into Tibetan Buddhism need to have a Vajrācārya family priest. Anyway, things are changing gradually, as I mentioned, and it is conceivable that eventually people without Vajrācārya parents could be given acāryābhiṣekha, but yes, if someone is interested in practising Newar Buddhism, at least for now, it's going to exclude esoteric practices and essentially be exoteric Mahāyāna with a few exoteric vajrayāna elements thrown in. Frankly, I think a lot of Śākyas prefer it the way it is because they don't have to learn all the procedures personally, they can just sponsor a guru to do it and due to the saṃkalpa they still get all the benefits.

Malcolm wrote:

So, you've basically ceded my point. Tibet is the place that preserved and the depth and breadth of the Indian Vajrayana tradition. People who are interested in practicing Vajrayana will naturally seek out Tibetan teachers or teachers in this tradition. No other tradition is as complete.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 16th, 2021 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Nadereme said:

Because many are still vexed in materialist views and think science is somehow superior.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, we think that Buddhist epistemology should be taken seriously. The latter depends on valid direct perception and inference. If you can prove through valid direct perception and inference there is a Mt. Meru out there, I am all ears.

Aemilius said:

The main point in Buddhists cosmology is that the three worlds and six or five worlds

where being reincarnate exist. Neither does science take them to be reality, why is that? Why do scientists not perceive these worlds?

Malcolm wrote:

Beings in lower realms are incapable of seeing the beings in the higher planes of existence, for example, desire realm devas are incapable of perceiving form realm devas and so on. You can read this in chapter four of the koshabhāṣyam.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 16th, 2021 at 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

2ndchance said:

Someone I know is desperately searching for such a Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teacher to be engaged on an extremely long-term basis and He has more than enough financial resources to pay for it.

PeterC said:

Maybe others are being too polite to say this, but a lama isn't like a coach that you hire. Of course lamas need money because everyone needs money. But an approach like "hey I'm rich go find me a personal tutor for this" is going to be a bit offensive to any teacher of the Dharma of any nationality.

Malcolm wrote:

It's only a matter of time before the "lama as life coach" becomes a thing, complete with branding and guest appearances on Oprah.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 12:49 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

There is a Vinaya rule against boasting about one's spiritual accomplishments or spiritual experiences.

Malcolm wrote:

This applies only to the ordained and is probably at the root of the śrāvaka notion that anyone who attains stream entry and does not ordain within seven days, dies.

Anders said:

[pedantry]Arhatship, not stream entry.[/pedantry]

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, my bad.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 2:28 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

gelukman said:

Your reading is not worthless...dont believe the jealous etc....

Malcolm wrote:

Reading Dzogchen texts, and other tantric texts without transmission is indeed worthless, improper, and condemned in those very texts themselves. Only fools ignore this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 2:33 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

My question now concerns their possibly restricted status – I've seen it written in a few places that the Great Completion tantras can only be read after receiving and appropriate personal transmission from a qualified teacher.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. That is the correct way. Find a teacher to study under. Do not read Dzogchen books prior to having received transmission and instruction. Otherwise, you are being a thief of the teachings. This is very negative.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

gelukman said:

You have right to be in the "natural state". You can practice mindfulness,

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but without a teacher there is no Dzogchen to speak of. One cannot introduce themselves to Dzogchen. It is impossible. The Dzogchen tantras themselves assert that this is the case. A book cannot introduce one to Dzogchen, etc. Claiming otherwise is irresponsible, basically, one is breaking samaya to make a claim that one can study and practice Dzogchen without a guru, on one's own, from a book. Worse, one is encouraging others to travel down a false path.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 3:05 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

gelukman said:

You still need to practice and study.

Malcolm wrote:

One should not read Dzogchen texts without guidance of teacher, one should not even look at them. There is plenty to study and practice in sūtra without reading restricted texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

gelukman said:

According you.

Malcolm wrote:

Not according to me. According to the tantras, like the Self-Arisen Vidyā Tantra, the commentary tantra of the utterly secret unsurpassed cycle:

“The faults of not obtaining the empowerment are as follows: In the bardo one is alarmed, panicked, exhausted, impeded, and one can also lose consciousness.

“While one has not yet left the body of traces, migrating beings will not see one as worthy of respect. One’s merit will be small, one’s life short, one’s enjoyments of living will be few, one will be powerless, and many obstacles will occur. Nothing will be accomplished. Those are the faults of not obtaining the empowerment for the conduct of secret mantra. A yogin of secret mantra conduct must first obtain empowerment.

gelukman said:

But many give dzogchen teachings freely on the internet

Malcolm wrote:

In this case, they are acting as teachers.

gelukman said:

and through books.

Malcolm wrote:  
Qualified practitioners need access to books.

gelukman said:  
And you have your self published dzogchen books too.

Malcolm wrote:  
And they all say, as in the Introduction to Tantra Without Syllables:

Only someone who has obtained the necessary empowerments and reading transmissions is qualified to study these texts.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 3:40 AM  
Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:  
sokol said:  
Well, from my own recent experience I certainly wouldn't say the uninitiated reading of these text is worthless.

Malcolm wrote:  
Worse than useless. You don't know what you are reading.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 3:50 AM  
Title: Re: Regarding Shar Khentrul Rinpoché Jamphel Lodrö (No Debates Please)

Content:  
Gaden\_Wangchuk said:  
I've attended sessions and empowerments with this teacher,

Malcolm wrote:  
You've already taken empowerments with this person. You've sealed the deal. All you are going to do is wind up breaking your samaya if continue down this path.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 4:01 AM  
Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:  
sokol said:  
thanks for replies everyone!  
Well, from my own recent experience I certainly wouldn't say the uninitiated reading of these text is worthless. Quite the contrary - even the little I did glimpse of some of these texts that I got - before realizing their possibly restricted status- has proven extremely

useful in bringing some clarity where I really needed it and thus getting me a step closer to freedom. Do consider.

Sherab Rigdrol said:

You are conceptualizing your meditative experiences and equating them with what you are reading in dzogchen texts. This is the #1 reason why people should NOT read dzogchen texts without a teacher and transmission. Throw your experiences away, find a teacher, receive transmission, ask them what you should read and go from there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 6:14 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

The question probably is: where would you look for a teacher that makes sure I respect Dzogchen tradition...

Malcolm wrote:

There is only one way to respect Dzogchen tradition, which is to follow it in the proper way.

sokol said:

guides me to study these texts with necessary respect but doesn't insist on me devoting myself to orthodox, tantric ways from the start?

Malcolm wrote:

Such a teacher is not a teacher who is teaching Dzogchen in a correct way. You cannot study these texts without transmission. Transmission comes with responsibilities. There is no authentic teacher of Dzogchen who will permit you to read these texts without proper transmission. That means receiving empowerment, the reading transmission for the text you want to practice or study, and the instruction on that text, called wang, lung, and tri.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Zhen Li said:

My approach is, take the claims of all seriously, evaluate them for their merits, and decide on the course of action in this life that gets you to Buddhahood the fastest. Buddhahood or bust, otherwise we're just messing around and will end up right where we started.

Malcolm wrote:

If that were true, you would already be a Dzogchen practitioner. Just sayin....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 10:20 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Malcolm wrote:

There are two basic Buddhist cosmologies: Hinayāna and Mahāyāna. Which one do you mean?

Shinjin said:

First time I heard this. What is the difference?

Malcolm wrote:

Avatamsaka gives the Mahayana cosmology.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Shinjin said:

First time I heard this. What is the difference?

Malcolm wrote:

Avatamsaka gives the Mahayana cosmology.

Shinjin said:

Is the Mahayana cosmology more "scientific" than the hinayana one? Your thoughts?

Malcolm wrote:

It is more cosmic and expansive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 17th, 2021 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Regarding Shar Khentrul Rinpoché Jamphel Lodrö (No Debates Please)

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

Inquiring about a teacher (post empowerment) can be considered as such?

Malcolm wrote:

Depends, you should have made your inquiries before receiving samayas.

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

So, and this is in general and not pertaining to my original question, if a teacher does commit a scandal, then those students who renounce that teacher break samaya?

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how they go about it. If they leave quietly, no. If they raise hell and cause a scandal themselves, then yes, it is bad for all involved.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Is the Mahayana cosmology more "scientific" than the hinayana one? Your thoughts?

Malcolm wrote:

It is more cosmic and expansive.

Shinjin said:

I will give it a read if it isn't too long.

Malcolm wrote:

It is very long.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 6:16 AM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I do not understand either.

Malcolm wrote:

I am sure this person is participating through google translate. "Basic lama" = root guru.

He is claiming that root gurus are basically prostitutes who are only your friend for \$\$\$

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 6:31 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

I do make it a point to keep my mind open ...and that exactly is why I don't let myself simply decide to arbitraly embark on a chosen structuralised path (with its powerful rituals as is the case) because -as you yourself said - on the base of which certain standard could I possibly evaluate it as good for me to take.

Malcolm wrote:

The most important choice is making one's choice of a guru. It is not a light choice, and qualified gurus who can actually teach Dzogchen are vanishing rapidly, there are virtually none under sixty that I know of personally, and not very many above sixty left either.

Of course, there are many qualified lamas who can give this "Dzogchen" empowerment and that empowerment, but teaching Dzogchen is something very specific, and has very little to do with practicing mantras and getting involved with complicated tantric systems, per se.

There is a lot of hanging out the tail of white deer to sell venison, and sending off the customer with a packet of horse meat. Chogyal Namkhai Norbu used to complain about this all the time. In other words, there are a number of teachers who advertise themselves as Dzogchen teachers, who are really are guilty of false advertising and worse.

Caveat emptor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 8:25 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

Inge said:

does one need lung for every text?

Malcolm wrote:

Ideally one does.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Regarding Shar Khentrol Rinpoché Jamphel Lodrö (No Debates Please)

Content:

zerwe said:

In reading this thread one question does come to mind. If you politely step away from said teacher, then should you no longer engage in the practices you have received?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, unless you have received them from other teachers as well, in whom you have faith and confidence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 11:36 PM

Title: Re: Regarding Shar Khentrul Rinpoché Jamphel Lodrö (No Debates Please)

Content:

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

To your second point and out of curiosity, does raising hell here mean bring public attention to the bad behavior of a teacher?

Malcolm wrote:

In general, yes, it means not bring public attention to what one perceives as the negative behavior of a teacher with whom one has entered into samaya. Criticizing them for their drinking habits, drug habits, spending habits, eating habits, personal habits, social habits and skills, and so on, is really not permissible. Of course, if they are not your teacher, you can criticize them for these issues as much as you like, with the caveat that you may be criticizing a bodhisattva.

This does not apply, however, in case where the teacher has themselves utterly broken their samaya with their students, where they have actually harmed the lives and health of their students, which is quite another thing. In this case, no obligation exists between teacher and and of their students. [And please, peanut gallery, refrain from the Tilopa-Naropa anecdotes].

Gaden\_Wangchuk said:

This seems like a very confusing area, so if there are more resources I'll have to learn more and look elsewhere on the forums like I mentioned. It's also not the main topic of this thread, so I will make that my last question on that aspect of samaya and teacher/student relationships.

Malcolm wrote:

The best thing to do, in the beginning, is to choose well-known teachers with proven track records over many years.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 11:40 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

The things that Mahadeva made public agree with the Lotus Sutra, i.e. that the attainments of the Sravakas had turned out to be impermanent and illusory. And the majority of the Sangha knew it, and accepted it as an undeniable fact.

Malcolm wrote:

Not permanent and illusory, merely that some arhats could fall back into the state of being never returners, but inevitably, they attain arhatship.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 18th, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

"Land rests on water" in the sense that the earth's inner core is liquid.

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely not. Land rests on water in the sense that continents are surrounded by oceans. You are forgetting the water rests on fire, fire rests on air, etc. The ancients had no idea of an inner core, nor that the world was round, not even the egg cosmologies state this.

Aemilius said:

I think the Mt Meru -cosmology is much older than Iron-Age...

Malcolm wrote:

Axial mountain cosmology is certainly quite ancient. You should examine Witzel's The Origins of the World's Mythologies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

The real ultimate guidance however, which you will obviously all agree about is beyond human, beyond our ideas about paths etc. The living awareness we all parttake in.

Malcolm wrote:



As long as you have this perennialist idea, you will never understand Dzogchen. There is no awareness in which we all partake. In fact, Dzogchen explicitly rejects this idea as eternalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: is the date of losar based on kalachakra?

Content:

Toenail said:

Is the calculation of the losar date based or described in Kalachakra?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, calendars in Tibetan Buddhism are calculated on the basis of instructions found in the Vimalaprabha commentary of Kalachakra, of which there are two systems: Phukluk, followed by most schools; and Tsurluk, followed by Karma Kagyu. The latter places new years one month prior to the former.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

Why I kept discussing this beyond the first post and your initial answers was rather to get a better picture of how it all works for people here that do follow the Dzogchen path to the letter, to form a better picture about how prominent the ritual side of this tradition really is and to search if there is a way for me to work within this tradition that doesn't go against my gut feeling discussed above.

Malcolm wrote:

You cannot expect the tradition to adapt to you. Instead you have to adapt to the tradition.

Read Crystal and the Way of Light, by my root guru, the late Chogyal Namkhai Norbu.

Ritual is not a prominent part of Dzogchen teachings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: is the date of losar based on kalachakra?

Content:

Nemo said:

The last water tiger year was something. First live trans-Atlantic television signal, First Beatles single "Love Me Do" released, Oral Polio Vaccine used to combat Polio, Marilyn Monroe is found dead, Cuban Missile Crisis takes world to brink of nuclear war,...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and I was born. It was definitely something.

Nemo said:

It's late this year. March 3rd. Hopefully omicron has burnt out by then and we can have a normal celebration.

Malcolm wrote:

No chance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 9:31 AM

Title: Re: is the date of losar based on kalachakra?

Content:

Toenail said:

Isn't that an obstacle year for you then?

Malcolm wrote:

According to one belief system, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 9:55 AM

Title: Re: In regards to meditation (feeling like on the outside)

Content:

undefineable said:

And yes, the 'essencelessness' of phenomena (sunyata?) is harder to grasp than the 'essencelessness' of apparent objects (anatta?), and I can't claim to have got there myself. Even at an academic level, the language is always confusing when taken out of context by people unfamiliar with the concepts..

Malcolm wrote:

It's mainly confusing to people who have too many concepts and no experience.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 10:07 AM

Title: Re: In regards to meditation (feeling like on the outside)

Content:

undefineable said:

No experience of sunyata?

Well yeah, that's going to leave one confused (with regard to the definition of sunyata)

past one point or another, but then it's accepted that this experience only comes after a lot of experience and progress in meditation.

Malcolm wrote:

Progress in meditation is measured by a reduction in conceptuality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 11:00 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

tingdzin said:

Ideally, traditionally, these instructions would be granted to an individual or in a very small group of disciples who were personally well known to the teacher. In this way, the teacher could be sure that the student was ready to receive and seriously practice them.

Charlie123 said:

Is this actually true? For example, reading the bio of ChNN's uncle, Togden Orgyen Tenzin, it seems pretty clear that TOT mostly received instructions from Adzom Drukpa in large groups and had very little face time with AD. I can think of a few other examples.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Ritual is not a prominent part of Dzogchen teachings.

sokol said:

So I thought

Malcolm wrote:

Ritual isn't, but the necessity for empowerment and instruction is. There are also Dzogchen preliminary practices, which are indispensable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 10:49 PM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

sokol said:

The prevailing tone here has not been entirely inviting or encouraging to get any deeper (with few notable exceptions, thank you guys).

Malcolm wrote:

There is only one way to get deeper, and you have been advised upon how to do that.

sokol said:

By the way curious fact and maybe something worth considering: the only way I got to know part of the content of the Six Lamps, Twenty-One Nails and some other parts of Zhang Zhung NyenGyud for instance, that as someone here informed me are forbidden "to even look at" without transmission ( additionally suggesting that I am a "fool" and a "thief" having done so) is through quotations in a book by Geshe Tenzin Wangyal Rinpoche, that has been prefaced and recommended to anyone by other high Dzogczen authorities and HH Dalai Lama himself – and there hasn't been a single mention about a need for formal authorisation to read it throughout the book.

Malcolm wrote:

The whole of Zhang Zhung snyan rgyud is samaya restricted, as are all texts and commentaries on Dzogchen. Sure, there are a few popular books out there that discuss Dzogchen view, and so on, but these contain virtually nothing of the actual instructions of Dzogchen practice. The books that are out there, like Achard's Six Lamps, and so on, are all published in order to provide practitioners with access to primary source material. Even then, they are not very useful without someone to explain them.

sokol said:

Not a warm welcome to say the least.

Malcolm wrote:

The welcome you received was in response to the tone of your greeting. Some of us have been practicing these teachings for three decades and moreover, read Tibetan and have clocked many hours sitting at the feet of such masters as Chogyal Namkhai Norbu, and so on. Making statements like "I am intimately familiar with rigpa (in my own spontaneous way)" is laughable from someone who has never sat and received Dzogchen teachings.

As for calling you a fool and thief, I didn't call you either thing. I said, "Reading Dzogchen texts, and other tantric texts without transmission is indeed worthless, improper, and condemned in those very texts themselves. Only fools ignore this" and "Do not read Dzogchen books prior to having received transmission and instruction. Otherwise, you are being a thief of the teachings. This is very negative."

As for the first statement, this is because no one these days can understand Dzogchen teachings immediately, even with proper transmission. Not even Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche understood the meaning of Dzogchen immediately. Before he met his root guru, he had thirteen Dzogchen teachers and had received the whole tradition of Buddhist Dzogchen teachings. It was only when he sat with Rigzin Changchub Dorje that he understand the real meaning of Dzogchen teachings. As for the second statement, Dzogchen teachings are guarded by very powerful guardians. While some claim the Bonpos assert their guardians have loosened restrictions on Dzogchen teachings, this is not the case with Buddhist Dzogchen teachings. There are no lineage

masters of Buddhist Dzogchen teachings who can loosen such restrictions, because the last lineage holder of Dzogchen teachings was Longchen Rabjam, and there won't be another one for thousands of years. Thus, since the guardians are the owners of the teachings, one who transgresses the seal of secrecy placed on Dzogchen teachings risks their wrath.

While it is often said that Dzogchen is the teaching for this age, for many reasons, this does not mean that people can just do what they like with them. The integrity of Dzogchen teachings is maintained through respecting the methods of transmission and promulgation of Dzogchen teachings described in the Dzogchen tantras themselves and the commentaries on them by ancient masters such as Vimalamitra, and so on. You haven't even begun to learn about such things because you have no teacher.

You are confused because some teachers like my guru, Tenzin Wangyal, HH Dalai Lama, and so on, have published some books that are "open," meaning that they describe a little bit about the Dzogchen teaching. But actually, they really do not say very much at all. They offer only a glimpse for the curious, nothing more.

So if you are actually interested in becoming a practitioner of Dzogchen, rather than just adding to the collection of spiritual teachings you have gathered, develop some humility, go find a qualified teacher of Dzogchen, and listen more than you talk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 19th, 2021 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: Western-Born (English) Tibetan Buddhist Teachers Like Alan Wallace

Content:

Varis said:

Why didn't the Tibetan and Chinese disciples of the Indian panditas manage to maintain Sanskrit as the language of practice and study?

Malcolm wrote:

Sanskrit studies were at a pretty high level until 15th century in Tibet, but tapered off as contact with Indian panditas waned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: Shitro mantra... Where does it first appear?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

I'm speaking of the mantras of the peaceful and wrathful mandalas. In which text do they first appear?

Malcolm wrote:

The rulu mantra appears in Guhyagarbha and some others translated during the imperial period. Based on a limited preliminary survey, looks like the bodhicitta mantra

first appears in the treasures of Nyang ral Nyima Ozer, so late 12th century. However, Nyangral was famous for finding old tantras that were translated during the imperial period and rehabilitating them. Text criticism only gets one so far.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 1:58 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

Linpupa said:

The idea that by even looking at written dzogchen texts before we have received "pointing out" (and I think the OP pointed out how flimsy that sometimes is as a "qualification") we will cut ourselves off from ever being able to practice meditation or dzogchen is, imho, an idea for the spiritually immature.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, immature (ma smin pa) people who have not been matured (smin pa) through empowerment and received the liberating instructions shouldn't read Vajrayāna texts at all, let alone Dzogchen texts. What my teachers have stressed about Dzogchen teachings, especially Chogyal Namkhai Norbu, is that one is at risk of blocking one's path by reading material for which one does not have the transmission. Longchenpa is quite explicit about the need for secrecy in Dzogchen teachings. If one doesn't want to follow his advice, then whose advice should one follow? This does not mean that Dzogchen is secret like a top secret document. It means that it should only be approached in the proper way to ensure the integrity of the lineage. Included in that proper way are not reading texts for which one does not have the appropriate level of transmission. It's a rule I have followed all of my life.

Linpupa said:

That's what I mean by being grown-up about these things. It does not include a retreat into dogmatism or into a childish fear of reading something that will ruin our progress for this life and perhaps more to come.

Malcolm wrote:

People do ruin their progress for life. There are whole public forums filled with people talking about Vajrayāna and Dzogchen who have blocked their progress for life because of the extreme depth of their misconceptions.

Linpupa said:

The warning about reading texts for which we are not qualified or prepared has merit, of course, but there is no need to get crazy about it.

Malcolm wrote:

No, we should just be serious about it, as it is a serious matter, and there are consequences for one's path when one makes light of such warnings or disregards

them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yes, it's a confusing situation with people getting all fire and brimstone even though there are so many openly published texts, it is a bit surreal and you have come up against the absurd incongruity of the situation, forcing you to make some kind of decision for your practice. It is silly in many ways, I agree. It is the reality of our circumstances though.

Malcolm wrote:

No one is getting all fire and brimstone. What I am saying is factual and is based on the benefit of the OP, whether he or she is capable of understanding that or not.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I have said in another thread that I thought either publishers need to be a lot more careful, or we are just living in a different situation now where it is not always possible to do what we are 'supposed to'. I have looked at a number of texts that were restricted to me before I even knew they were.

Malcolm wrote:

Innocently stumbling onto a text is quite different than reading things one ought not read. But once one knows what one ought not read, well, then you know.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Still, the best approach is to take Dzogchen seriously and consider the advice to at least be careful about what one exposes themselves to without guidance, without getting neurotic or worrying unnecessarily in the manner often preferred by orthodoxy;)

Malcolm wrote:

It is preferred by the guardians. There is nothing to be worried about. The requirement is simple. Don't read what you don't have transmission to read.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

vima nyingthig

Malcolm wrote:

The Vima Nyinthig is four volumes of dense and difficult material.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Alpha waves

Content:

avatamsaka3 said:

Scientific research has shown that meditation (any kind?) produces alpha waves...

Malcolm wrote:

These kinds of studies are often not well designed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 3:50 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

[

As the OP points out, it is a little strange to immediately jump on people with interest in the teachings because they do not understand a fraught and contradictory situation such as the abundance of openly available texts they aren't supposed to read.

Malcolm wrote:

The OP's post showed they are already heading down the wrong path. They're already convinced they know what "rig pa" is.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Having been in the position myself, I sympathize with new people who come here with interest in the teachings and then feel like they basically get scolded for their questions.

Malcolm wrote:

They weren't scolded for their questions, they were scolded for their presumptions. Just try telling ChNN that you already know what "rig pa" is when you have not even had any kind of Vajrayāna teachings at all and just read a couple of very general books that are decades old.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: restricted texts

Content:

heart said:

Seems to me that everyone think they know what rigpa is these days...



Malcolm wrote:  
Sadly, this is true.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 10:59 AM  
Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
The Vima Nyinthig is four volumes of dense and difficult material.

yagmort said:  
how much of it strictly practice-related?

Malcolm wrote:  
About 70 percent.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 1:17 PM  
Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.  
Content:

Zhen Li said:  
...whose role is essentially promoting ethnic integration of China's minorities into Mandarin culture and promoting ethnic propaganda.

Malcolm wrote:  
This is false. I know Thubten Phunstog personally. He is a Tibetan nationalist. He is not a propagandist at all. He is not criticizing these practices per se, he is criticizing how they are exploited by fake lamas in Tibet.

Like many modern Tibetans, he takes a critical view of institutional Buddhism in Tibet. He is quite expert in Tibetan medicine, history, and so on. He also understand the Chinese are not going anywhere, so like many of his contemporaries he advocates for modernization in Tibet, which is still quite underdeveloped.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, December 20th, 2021 at 11:25 PM  
Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.  
Content:  
Zhen Li said:  
Prayer flags are chump change when it comes to China's role in environmental destruction and the taking of animal life.

Malcolm wrote:

He is making a different point, he is claiming these practices do not yield the promised benefits (and in the case of prayer flags, do not even have a Buddhist origin), that the pursuit of them robs poor Tibetans of money better spent elsewhere, and so on, that practices like life ransom (srog bslu), in the manner in which it is pursued in Tibet, is harmful to the rivers and streams of Tibet through the introduction of invasive species from China, and that the push towards vegetarianism is a result of the undue influence of Chinese Buddhism, which comes at the expense of the health of Tibetan people, who have traditionally enjoyed a diet high in dairy and meat.

Frankly, I don't approve of the practice of life release. It is generally practiced without thought of the consequences for the local environment:

In Asian Buddhist societies, life release has led to significant ecological harm when invasive species, parasites and disease are introduced to wild populations of animals. It has led to the introduction of American bullfrogs in China and tilapia and red-eared sliders, a species of turtle, in Taiwan, according to the Society for Conservation Biology.

The practice has also caused problems outside of Asia. In 2017, two Buddhists from London were fined a total of £28,000 (about \$36,000) after pleading guilty to illegally releasing more than 700 non-native crabs and lobsters into the Atlantic Ocean off the English coast, according to the Guardian.

<https://www.sfgate.com/travel/article/Buddhist-life-release-ritual-complicates-13601643.php>

If people who did these things did so in a thoughtful manner, I be less opposed, but most people do it out of idiot compassion, not understanding the wider impacts of their desire to accumulate merit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:

In the first video, HHDL states that the mind and body are distinct streams.

Can someone please explain this duality? This duality suggests that there is a deeper paradigm in which mind and body are distinctions. What is that deeper paradigm?

Malcolm wrote:

It is based on the fact that the mind leaves this body at death.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Shitro mantra... Where does it first appear?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The "RULU" mantra in Guhyagarbha is not the same as appears in Shitro.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it is, I looked it up in Tibetan, སྐྱུ་ལྷ་མོ་ལྷ་མོ་ལྷ་མོ་, gsang ba'i snying po de kho na nyid nges pa'i bla ma chen po, f. 55a.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: nyingma lineages/cycles structures of practice.

Content:

yagmort said:

well, i thought as much, but that begs the question of how many cycles are actually available for an english-speaking western practitioner?

Malcolm wrote:

There are endless terma cycles of Dzogchen out there, but in they do nothing more than repeat what is in the 17 tantras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 2:43 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:

To the point saying they are different streams somewhat confusing. I imagine stream here is a translation of a specific term?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, rgyud, saṃtāna.

When we are alive, the body and mind are inseparable; but when we die, its really the body that dies, it loses its integrity, while the mind continues on its merry way in samsara, taking up another body. Of course, there is really never a time that the mind is without A body, it is just not always with this present body.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Sensory deprivation/float tanks

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Lsd/acid is manufactured or contrived (and not surprisingly was developed by government).

Malcolm wrote:

No, it was developed by accident, by Swiss chemist named Albert Hoffman at Sandoz, who discovered its properties by accident in 1943, resulting in the famous bicycle trip.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History\\_of\\_lysergic\\_acid\\_diethylamide#Discovery](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_lysergic_acid_diethylamide#Discovery)

My favorite LSD video from the 1950's, the housewife:

Best line: "If you can't see it, you'll just never know it. I feel sorry for you."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 3:04 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Toenail said:

What about buying crickets and shit in the pet store and freeing them? I do that in the summer. Also bad?

Malcolm wrote:

If they are native to your region, no problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: Sensory deprivation/float tanks

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Regardless of who actually first synthesized it from ergot, gathered from rye, I believe; there's this:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the MK Ultra program is well known.

<https://www.history.com/topics/us-government/history-of-mk-ultra>

LSD is synthesized from rye ergot, so it has a natural source. But rye ergot is poisonous. LSD is not, no matter how much one ingests.

<https://www.vice.com/en/article/epgebm/ergot-fungus-psychedelic-ld-witchcraft>

Personally, I find such drugs boring. I've done them all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 4:51 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Toenail said:

African crickets?

Malcolm wrote:

Are they from Germany?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Worms from a local bait shop are often a good bet.

Malcolm wrote:

Little known fact: earthworms, in North America, are an invasive species that changed the character of North American forests by consuming fallen leaves, eliminating the habitat of many plants.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 5:52 AM

Title: Re: Music time

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Fun story. Roger Miller of Mission of Burma came to one of my shows back in 1983 or so. I had my synth set in such way that it was causing subsonic vibrations in the building, shaking the whole building. He left and listened to the show from across the street during my set.

Heh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 6:44 AM

Title: Re: Shitro mantra... Where does it first appear?

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The "RULU" mantra in Guhyagarbha is not the same as appears in Shitro.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it is, I looked it up in Tibetan, སྒྲུང་བཤིག་པོ་དཀོན་པའི་བླ་མ་ཅན་པོ།, gsang ba'i snying po de kho na nyid nges pa'i bla ma chen po, f. 55a.

Crazywisdom said:

Interesting. It's not in either translation. But ok.thanks. And your referring to the Guhyagarbha Tantra and not an explanatory tanta or supplementary tantra, right? And is it presented as the main recitation mantra? Is there any other, namely the bija?

Malcolm wrote:

It's in the large tantra, it's the same text, but expanded.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 10:59 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

I hope this intra-tradition dialogue continues.

I think that Pali canon scholar-practitioners such as Analayo and Bodhi have been pretty good at finding points of continuity with the Mahayana, whilst respecting the differences. It is good for us Mahayanists to do the same.

Malcolm wrote:

Well of course, we have the same teacher, we just follow a broader set of his teachings. The question has never been what we accept, it's always been what teachings we follow that they accept.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 8:59 PM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:

To the point saying they are different streams somewhat confusing. I imagine stream here is a translation of a specific term?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, rgyud, saṃtāna.

When we are alive, the body and mind are inseparable; but when we die, its really the body that dies, it loses its integrity, while the mind continues on its merry way in samsara, taking up another body. Of course, there is really never a time that the mind is

without A body, it is just not always with this present body.

Queequeg said:

Where can I find explanations of this process? Abhidarmakosa?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and BITL.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 21st, 2021 at 11:48 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

"When a great wind amidst the ākāśa disturbs the water, a flood follows. The flood disturbs the entire earth and it shakes."

How does this line up? If the water is lava, what is the wind? Keep in mind, whatever the wind is, it must also be the support of the water.

Aemilius said:

May be it is just wrong, it plainly contradicts the modern view of the causes of earth quakes.

Malcolm wrote:

The four elements, as you correctly point out, are just four qualities of matter: solidity, liquidity, motility, and heat. Even consciousness, and beyond that, jñāna, have these four qualities. Everything in the universe is made of the four great elements. There is nothing that is not made of the four great elements.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 1:15 AM

Title: Re: Shitro mantra... Where does it first appear?

Content:

conebeckham said:

Isn't the Rulu Mantra found in Yangdak Thuk---or are those later than the Guhyagarbha?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and more or less contemporary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Music time

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 1:52 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

May be it is just wrong, it plainly contradicts the modern view of the causes of earth quakes.

Malcolm wrote:

The four elements, as you correctly point out, are just four qualities of matter: solidity, liquidity, motility, and heat. Even consciousness, and beyond that, jñāna, have these four qualities. Everything in the universe is made of the four great elements. There is nothing that is not made of the four great elements.

Queequeg said:

Does this mean mind is matter?

Malcolm wrote:

It means that matter is derived from mind. But I forgot to include, this is the great perfection understanding of the elements. Simply put, the four or five elements are experienced in their gross form only because sentient beings do not recognize the four or five elements in their true form, as the five lights\* of the five pristine consciousnesses (ye shes, jñāna).

\*Do confused this light with photons. Despite having no mass or charge, photons are compounded entities and can be created and destroyed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 3:16 AM

Title: Re: Correct but not right

Content:

Nadereme said:

Based on what I've seen so far with the vastness of Tibetan/Vajra, it's almost like everyone is 'correct' in the sense that everything that everyone says, does, experiences, believes, practices, etc...

Malcolm wrote:



No, they follow mistaken paths. They are not correct in any sense at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 5:05 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Does this mean mind is matter?

Malcolm wrote:

It means that matter is derived from mind. But I forgot to include, this is the great perfection understanding of the elements. Simply put, the four or five elements are experienced in their gross form only because sentient beings do not recognize the four or five elements in their true form, as the five lights\* of the five pristine consciousnesses (ye shes, jñāna).

\*Do confused this light with photons. Despite having no mass or charge, photons are compounded entities and can be created and destroyed.

Queequeg said:

Do the four elements spontaneously arise together or do they arise sequentially? For some reason I have in my mind:

mind/space + ignorance -> air/wind/motility -> fire/heat -> water/liquidity -> earth/solidity

I think I have in mind the descent of beings from formless realms as described in ADKB and the myth of the devas and asuras frothing up the ocean to create Jambudvīpa, crossed with the description of the appearance of beings at the beginning of a major kalpa.

Alternatively, in Samantabhadra's case:

mind/space + awareness -> five lights

?

Malcolm wrote:

Once the process of nonrecognition occurs, it is sequential, as in ADKB. etc.. with the appearance of beings at the beginning of a major kalpa.

BITL 88-87 describes this very briefly.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 6:19 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Queequeg said:  
ty

Malcolm wrote:  
We can discuss elsewhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 6:39 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:  
Where can I find explanations of this process? Abhidarmakosa?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, and BITL.

Caoimhghín said:  
I've noticed you mention "BITL" a few times. If you don't mind me asking, what is this acronym? There is a lama with an acronym of "LOTR" who was "Lord of the Rings" in my mind for a while until someone wrote out his actual name. What is BITL?

Malcolm wrote:  
My translation, "Buddhahood in this Life."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

I wish I knew more about the Tibetan present-day "modernizing" movement, it looks very hopeful.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, if Tibetans could or would set up casinos...that's exactly what it looks like. The Chinese have used our treatment of native people as a pretext for ignoring US complaints about their human rights abuses. They have done exactly what we did during our westward expansion (1883, anyone?). They have fenced off traditional grazing grounds, moved nomads into fixed settlements, and so on. A way of life that existed even twenty years ago has all but vanished everywhere but the most remote parts of the Tibetan plateau.

So, Tibetan modernization means advocating for Tibetan language and religious rights combined with assimilation into broader Han culture. They have no choice. Tibetan independence is an impractical dream and everyone but some holdouts in Dharamshala know this. Nevertheless, Tibetans are a stubborn bunch and many refuse to assimilate, refusing to learn Chinese beyond a kind of pidgin, despite the obvious economic and social advantages. While I sympathize with the anti-assimilationists, theirs is, in the long run, a losing cause. They need to shift from resistance to advocacy.

QQ said:

Whatever Tibetan society survives is going to be indelibly transformed.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a done deal already.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Tathāgataguhya Sūtra (Secrets of the Tathāgata) translation now published

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Hello everyone. My translation of the Tathāgataguhya Sūtra ( The Secrets of the Tathāgata ) is now published. It can be read online for free from my <https://sites.google.com/view/shingans-portal/s%C5%ABtra-translations>, and hard copies are available for purchase on <https://www.lulu.com/en/gb/shop/shaku-shingan-/the-secrets-of-the-tath%C4%81gata/hardcover/product-4gjjw98.html?page=1&pageSize=4>. Please feel free to share your thoughts. I look forward to discussing this sūtra in the days to come.

Malcolm wrote:

Good job. I've purchased a copy because I believe independent translators who demonstrate good scholarship should be supported.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 22nd, 2021 at 10:50 PM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Queequeg said:

I don't see how advocacy would be effective. Maybe its the only thing possible.

Malcolm wrote:

Casinos in Lhasa (they're already there, but not controlled by Tibetans).

Can you imagine, Casino Potala. Wish I had photoshop skilz.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 23rd, 2021 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Meditation on Amitābha by Sakya Paṇḍita Kunga Gyaltsen

Content:

Mirror said:

Please does someone know, if I need empowerment to practise this?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, you do. It specifies that you are to visualize yourself as a yidam, that you have a guru, and so on. Anyone familiar with Sakya Pandita's point of view, the author of this text, will understand that this is a sleeping yoga, which is a Vajrayāna practice. While the text does not specify what yidam one should visualize oneself as, this practice is most commonly combined with the practice of Avalokiteśvara.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 23rd, 2021 at 10:10 PM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

I actually think we get far too wrapped up in the rhetoric of non-dualism, and for this reason the body-mind unity remains a conceptual fiction far removed from our everyday experience.....which is usually pretty damned dualistic.

Malcolm wrote:

In sūtrayāna, the distinction between mind and body is substantial, they are considered to be different substances (dravya). Dharmakīrti, for example, goes to great lengths to prove the mind and body are substantially different in order to prove rebirth.

In higher tantras, and especially Dzogchen teachings, this substance dualism is abandoned.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 23rd, 2021 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

I actually think we get far too wrapped up in the rhetoric of non-dualism, and for this reason the body-mind unity remains a conceptual fiction far removed from our everyday

experience.....which is usually pretty damned dualistic.

Malcolm wrote:

In sūtrayāna, the distinction between mind and body is substantial, they are considered to be different substances (dravya). Dharmakīrti, for example, goes to great lengths to prove the mind and body are substantially different in order to prove rebirth.

In higher tantras, and especially Dzogchen teachings, this substance dualism is abandoned.

Queequeg said:

Ah. A different approach than the Mahayana teaching on emptiness... or rather, perhaps its best to suggest this teaching addresses the implied space left over following Madhyamaka analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Madhyamaka does not contest the conventional presentations of either sūtra or tantra. Within their own context, both presentations are functional, hence conventionally valid, since neither depend on essences for their function.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 23rd, 2021 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Meditation on Amitābha by Sakya Paṇḍita Kunga Gyaltsen

Content:

Mirror said:

Thank you so much Malcolm for the explanation! I'll try to find a teacher, who can give me the teachings and empowerment.

Malcolm wrote:

His Holiness Sakya Trichen has been giving initiations online. You should check his schedule to see if there are any upcoming events.

In the meantime, you can recite the Noble King of Prayers, which concludes with an aspiration to be born in Sukhavati. This is the best way to accumulate the merit needed to meet an authentic teacher of Buddhadharma.

Also, Jhado Rinpoche, a highly esteemed, reputable, and nonsectarian Gelukpa Lama, has been giving some initiations online recently and I think plans to continue to do so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 23rd, 2021 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: Meditation on Amitābha by Sakya Paṇḍita Kunga Gyaltsen

Content:

Mirror said:

You mean The Extraordinary Aspiration of the Practice of Samantabhadra?

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure, I mean the one that comes from the Gandhavyuha Sūtra, the Bhadracaryapranidhana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: Sensory deprivation/float tanks

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I'd rather try some of the other 'entheogens' that I mentioned, that is to avoid long-term of side-effects of synthetic drugs (I admit that most natural plants can have toxic short-term side-effects; however most synthetic drugs have possible long-term side-effects)

Malcolm wrote:

LSD is gone from your system in 6 hours, max. It has no known toxic side effects. Pure LSD is the cleanest drug out there. However, LSD found on the street may not be manufactured under ideal laboratory conditions, or be counterfeit. Therefore, it should not be ingested.

However, with renewed interest psychedelics, properly manufactured LSD administered clinically is complete safe, from a toxicity point of view. I haven't done LSD myself since 1979, I wouldn't take anything found on the street today at all. The downside to acid is that it lasts a good 12 hours. This is why people like DMT and analogues, because it lasts ten minutes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:

Ah. A different approach than the Mahayana teaching on emptiness... or rather, perhaps its best to suggest this teaching addresses the implied space left over following Madhyamaka analysis.

Malcolm wrote:

Madhyamaka does not contest the conventional presentations of either sūtra or tantra. Within their own context, both presentations are functional, hence conventionally valid, since neither depend on essences for their function.

Queequeg said:

In referring to "sutra", are you including both Sravakayana and Mahayana?

Malcolm wrote:

The collection of reasoning in Madhyamaka is mainly concerned with removing misconceptions about dependent origination.

Queequeg said:

My sense of Madhyamaka is that it brings us to a certain point - emptiness - but doesn't go beyond that. In a sense, that's the point - Madhyamaka brings us to Vimalakirti's silence. Madhyamaka refers to but doesn't actually address bodhisattva activity and its practice.

Malcolm wrote:

That is not true. Āryadeva's 400 verses is actually titled Bodhisattvayogācāracatuḥśataka, i.e. The Four Hundred Verses on the Yoga Practice of Bodhisattvas. The first half is on relative bodhicitta and conventional truth; the second half is on ultimate bodhicitta and ultimate truth. There there is Nāgārjuna's Ratnavali, Mahāyanavimsika, the four praises, and so on, which give more detail on the bodhisattva path from a Mahayāna perspective. While it is certainly true the Yogacāra school greatly elaborated on the details, its all there in Madhyamaka.

Queequeg said:

I'm not sure how Tantra fits into this conceptualization except to refer to the teaching I've encountered that says Tantra is not a difference in view from Mahayana, but rather a difference in practice.

Malcolm wrote:

The Madhyamaka perspective on the path is that it is all illusory, from beginning to end, and that doesn't depend on whether we are talking about sūtra or tantra.

Queequeg said:

Tantra seems to present a refined and immediate application of Mahayana view as well as further insights into tathagatagarbha/buddhanature.

Malcolm wrote:

The main difference is method, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 3:00 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

Queequeg said:

I guess I have an idea of Madhyamaka in my mind that is very narrow - namely MMK and the mode of analysis set forth.

Malcolm wrote:

Unfortunately, this is very common.

Personally, when it comes to Vinaya, I consider myself a Mūlasarvastivādin upāsaka; when it comes to Sūtra, I consider myself a Mādhyamika (also my bodhisattva vows come from the Madhyamaka system); and when it comes to Abhidharma, I consider myself an exponent principally of the Great Perfection, since Vajrayāna in general is considered part of the Abhidharmapiṭaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 7:31 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

Yes, but part of the issue here is not 'which ontology we believe in' but more 'how do we experience these matters in everyday life?'

Malcolm wrote:

I think, frankly, that people are incapable of imagining any experience that is not embodied. Experience by its definition implies embodiment. We only experience the five senses directly, and the mental experience is all derived, secondary.

I think substance dualism is more difficult to accept and more abstract than substance nondualism. This is why most educated people these days are materialists, don't believe in a soul, and don't believe in a next life. For them, substance dualism is very counter-intuitive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 9:15 AM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

All of this is pre-philosophical for most people.

Malcolm wrote:

Even in the time of the Buddha, most people thought the body was their self.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 9:53 PM



Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

As you probably know, in Buddhist tantra "winds" mean different currents or forces within in the body that cause body's functioning.

Malcolm wrote:

It just means the element of air inside of the body and it's ten functions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 9:56 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

\*Do confused this light with photons. Despite having no mass or charge, photons are compounded entities and can be created and destroyed.

Zhen Li said:

Photons, a massless particle that can be created and destroyed... Right. We can create and destroy all sorts of things in the realm of imagination. This kind of stuff is reason enough to reject secular "cosmology."

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, photons are empirically detectable, unlike say, Mt. Meru.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

tobes said:

I admit that I was surprised when I saw these figures, but I think they highlight that in terms of common/everyday experience, mind or consciousness 'feels' pretty immaterial.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't agree. People are conditioned in our culture to accept cartesian dualism from the cradle. The reason why people turn away from theistic religion in general is that it does not correspond to their experience. They have never experienced consciousness in any way other than through their physical senses. Those who have a notion of an immaterial self or consciousness have it because they have been conditioned to think the mind (soul) and body are different by 500 years of Cartesianism. They don't have to be philosophical to be influenced by ideas that have been dominant themes in our culture for hundreds of years.

Buddhist substance dualism is predicated on different principles than cartesian dualism. But we can see it still provokes problems for Westerners by their difficulty in

distinguishing the Buddhist principal of karmic transmigration from the Neoplatonic/Christian concept of the soul (psyche).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 10:46 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, photons are empirically detectable, unlike say, Mt. Meru.

Zhen Li said:

When you end up with something with zero dimensions, it's not that it has no mass, but that the model is wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

No, the model isn't wrong, it functions, therefore it is conventionally valid. This does not mean that there isn't something yet to be discovered that we have not understood.

Zhen Li said:

I am not defending Mt. Meru. I am instead suggesting that we should be careful about putting too much credence in things like photons.

Malcolm wrote:

I give credence to things that can be conventionally established, based on Madhyamaka criteria for what qualifies as conventional truth--these days that includes photons and not Mt. Meru. I am not making an argument from the point of view of logical positivism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Sensory deprivation/float tanks

Content:

Toenail said:

I believe it has amazing potential for treatment resistant depression, especially if you microdose it.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, though more research has been done on psilocibin in the US than LSD, thus far. It seems that psilocibin creates novel pathways in the brain, thus it is also effective for certain types of traumatic brain injuries as well. From what I understand, one controlled session of psilocibin can lift chronic depression for a year, or so I have read, but that maybe anecdotal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Particle OR wave explanations are always wrong on a material level.

Malcolm wrote:

You have the math to back that up?

Zhen Li said:

To put it this way, if I "believe" that magnets point north because a magician enchanted my compass, that is a functionally useful explanation, but it's not a correct explanation.

Malcolm wrote:

That not what "conventional" means. "Conventional" that which can be validated by healthy sense organs of ordinary people. No one's healthy sense organs can confirm a magicians enchantment, but everyone can confirm a compass points to magnetic north.

Zhen Li said:

This is going a bit beyond my point, however. My point is that photons are not a good comparison with Meru. Compare the nature of one mountain to another rather than an inscrutable and incomprehensible corpuscle.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course they are: photons conventionally exist, Meru does not. Both lack mass and charge, but the former explains the function of physical light, the latter explains nothing at all anymore. But we still use this axial cosmology symbolically. I was recently reminded (in the new bio of Dogen by Steve Heine) of John McRae's four dictums of Zen studies, the first of which is "it's not true, therefore, it is more important." I think this can be applied to Buddhist mythopoeia across the board.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 24th, 2021 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Certainly not air.

Malcolm wrote:

Certainly it is the air element.

There are only four or five elements that make the human body. One of those is air. If you wish to confirm this read the Nandagarbhavikranti sūtra, which describes how the air element shapes the fetus over its thirty-eight week gestational period. Or, you can read the Vajra Rosary Tantra, which is now in English translation, and is one of the primary

sources for the doctrine of the ten vāyus and how they function in the human body. Or you can read the *Profound Inner Meaning* by the Third Karmapa, which unifies the teachings of the vajra body in one place, translated by Elizabeth Callahan.

Translating the word vāyu/rlung as "energy" is fashionable, but it is also completely inaccurate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Math does not create material reality.

Malcolm wrote:

Math is an explanatory device. It is used to explain observable properties and to predict things in physical reality yet to be observed, it is thus a tool of both deduction and inference. No one claimed it was tool of direct perception. That's what experiment is for.

Zhen Li said:

I am not talking about conventions, I am talking about belief and merely functional versus correct explanations.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, then we are talking about two different things entirely. In any case, something conventionally is said to exist, if it functions according to expectations. For example, a car: a car that cannot drive is a non-car by definition, something we refer to as a "broken-down car." But even a broken-car is more of a car than Meru is a mountain. Sure, we can call Meru an mythical mountain, since it is myth. But it is not a real mountain, even conventionally speaking.

Zhen Li said:

I actually think that "explanation" is not something Buddhism needs to do so well. That's the role of philosophy and science (when properly done).

Malcolm wrote:

Meru belongs in the world of science, since it is a claim about the structural of physical reality.

Zhen Li said:

These pertain to the world of illusion, and are not, ultimately, of import. Suchness is beyond such calculative thought.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no Meru, nor cars in suchness; but there is suchness in cars, unlike Meru. Suchness cannot exist in something which is totally unreal, like the child of a barren

woman. There is no dharmatā without dharmin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 12:20 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Shinjin said:

Meanwhile many poor and desperate around the world who would love to come take these jobs without hesitation. Are they doing the right thing or are Americans just spoiled and ungrateful?

Malcolm wrote:

Customer-facing service industry jobs suck. Most of the "big quit" is a result of unruly, ill-mannered customers who refuse to follow masking guidelines, get vaccinations etc. Thus, people are leaving customer facing jobs in the service industries at record rates for their personal safety.

Even so, unemployment is at an all time low in the US, because there are plenty of other service industry jobs that do not require dealing with customers personally.

And, in fact the US is responsible for the employment of millions of people overseas, from call center jobs to manufacturing. You might complain that these jobs pay much less than they would in the US, and this is true. But this is a function of comparative advantage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Modern anatomy hasn't found channels of air in the body. Instead there are nerves and pathways of chemicals messages.

There is not much future for the conception of the air flowing in the body.

Malcolm wrote:

That very much depends on what one understands the element of air to be. If one understands it to be the motile property of matter, as described Abhidharma, and so on, it works just fine.

Not only this, the great Tibetan scholar Desi Sangye Gyatso, points out in his commentary on the medical tantra, that the way things are presented in the tantras is obscure, and the same things are presented in the medical literature openly. Zurkhar opines that central, right, and left channels are respectively the arterial system, the venous system, and the nervous/lymphatic system, and that further, the way nāḍīs exist in the body is not the same as the way they are visualized and not need be. Further, the

Kalacakra points out that the lower ends of these three nadis are the urethra, the seminal vesicle channel, and the rectum, further indicating that they are to be understood as physical structures in the body, but not as they are visualized. If you want to understand these things properly, you ought to study Ayurveda or Tibetan Medicine rather than making a mishmash by trying to adapt these things to some modern scientists naive attempt to explain ancient knowledge systems and make it fit with modern science.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 12:37 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

I'm not sure I understand your logic. Why should people stay in jobs that make them miserable simply because there are other people who would be willing to take those jobs?

Malcolm wrote:

And they are not staying in these jobs, because they are not safe and there are better opportunities for them elsewhere.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You might try aiming first before pulling the trigger...

Sonam Wangchug said:

The emphasis of his argument seems displaced, and his logic twisted and underdeveloped.

He is emphasizing that is it "Fake lama's" who spread these practices, and that they are merely superstitious.

however it is a dishonest emphasis because clearly many authentic lama's of the past and present have recommended these practices (which as Buddhists should be our emphasis). In one vein he talks about the masters of the past having an important opinion when it regards eating meat, but then he also disregards the blessings of authentic masters validating these practices.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he just thinks there are a lot of Tibetans being taken advantage of.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Instead of focusing on the angle that these are authentic practices, and emphasizing that they should be done with natural materials etc, he is imploring people to cease them, which is ignorance.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he is asking people to use their common sense.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Whether one sees prayer flags as an adopted practice, the fact of the matter is that prayer flags are not merely colored cloth, they have the sacred words of the Dharma on them, and as such bring benefit to the world.

Malcolm wrote:

He addresses this, by pointing out that spreading pieces of paper with mantras and so on written upon them, a kind of cheap prayer flag, which get blown about on the wind, inevitably wind up being trampled upon. How is this a correct practice from any point of view?

Sonam Wangchug said:

Thinking of an authentic master for merely a moment has the power to clarify myriad wrong views and discursive thoughts. I recall Kyabje Garchen Rinpoche, who, when passing under Lungta, touches them to his forehead with total reverence, this is how people with devotion in dharma act, and as such why I said without -much- faith.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe, Zen people might ignore prayer flags altogether-- is their devotion to Dharma lacking?

Sonam Wangchug said:

As far as life release goes, life release is one of the most powerful and beneficial karmic actions which can be performed, and it has prolonged the life of many who were destined for death ( humans not only animals ) and as such that is why it is recommended. Of course it can be performed in the wrong way, and every attention should be given to that...

Malcolm wrote:

Again, Thubten Phuntsok is criticizing the practice of throwing river fish from China into the headwaters of rivers on the Tibetan plateau. He is not criticizing the practice of srog bslu per se, he is criticizing the incorrect application of it.

Sonam Wangchug said:

It is more a characteristic of chinese Buddhism which may emphasize veg leaning scriptures like the Lankavatara, shurangama etc add to the fact that chinese culture is also influenced by Taoism and Confucianism in terms of being very conduct leaning.

Malcolm wrote:

Which Thubten Phuntsok is criticizing.

Sonam Wangchug said:  
the same author spent 21 years as a gelug monk,

Malcolm wrote:

No, Thubten Phuntsog is a Karma Kagyu person from Derge, associated with Palpung Monastery and never spent one day as a monk. You have the wrong guy. You have confused this guy:

<https://www.patreon.com/thuptenphuntsok>:

Thupten Phuntsok is a former ordained Buddhist monk for 21 years, studying under his main teacher Sermey Kensur Geshe Lobsang Tharchin.

For this guy:

Sonam Wangchug said:

Thubten Phuntsok is a prolific scholar of Tibetan Studies with dozens of books and numerous articles published in the fields of Tibetan history, Tibetan medicine, and Tibetan literature, grammar, and poetry. Originally a Tibetan medicine doctor in his hometown of Derge, he has an academic background in archeology and Tibetology. He is currently a professor and researcher in the department of Tibetan Studies at the Central Nationalities University in Beijing, China. He is also the director of the Tibetan Medical Institute and the president of Tibetan AIDS Prevention Association. He has won many national awards for his publications on language, history, religion, and medicine.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.trace.org/node/194>

Sonam Wangchug said:

"In Tibet, more than a thousand years ago, many great saints possessed the knowledge to prevent wars, famines and disease.

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly it didn't work, since the history of Tibet is filled with war, famine, and disease.

Sonam Wangchug said:

From the time the vases were 'planted' until the time the Chinese Communist forces brought about the 'cultural revolution' it was recorded in Tibetan history that there were no major wars, famines or disease.

Malcolm wrote:

This is complete and total nonsense. Read One Hundred Thousand Moons by Tsepon Wangchuk Dedon Shakabpa. It might open your eyes.

Sonam Wangchug said:



We, of the technological societies, have for many years witnessed the reckless deterioration of the world. Our Earth's resources are being rapidly raped, plundered or polluted and will eventually be exhausted, or will exhaust themselves.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhist societies have no better a track record in the destruction of environments than non-buddhist ones.

Sonam Wangchug said:

The peoples of this degenerate age are inflamed with desire, hatred and jealousy and no understanding of giving up negative actions and developing positive ones is cultivated.

Malcolm wrote:

The Kali Yuga will not be fixed with band-aids.

Sonam Wangchug said:

With the motivation that the turbulence and suffering of sickness, famine, wars and conflicts throughout the whole world may be pacified and that the auspiciousness of virtue and well-being may pervade over all the world and that all beings may continuously enjoy the splendor of exaltation, the vases are made. When the vases are placed, all the various countries where they are buried will abide in supreme virtue, the wealth and splendor of the dharma will remain long and they will bring good fortune and long life free from illness. All beings will turn away from quarrels and strife, gathering in sublime perfection and remaining till the end of the Age.

Malcolm wrote:

These are all nice aspirations, but the decline of humanity will not be prevented by burying pots filled with gems in the ground and so on, if it can be prevented at all. Not all the treasures vases in Tibet, nor stupas, statues, and so on, prevented the Chinese from rolling in and smashing Tibetan civilization into smithereens.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 3:42 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Anders said:

Also, the whole blood flow system is basically transporting transformed oxygen throughout the body. "Air" is fundamental to every process of the body.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. And actually, what happens when blood flow is restricted anywhere in the body? That part begins to die. Why? Because of lack of air

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 4:34 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

I was pondering about this subject in the last months, and since there's no consensus even among the great Masters, I was a little bit reluctant to put some questions here. But I think, with the due respect to different teachers and different ways, this kind of discussion could be of benefit for the better understanding of how things really work or should work in Vajrayana and Dzogchen.

Malcolm wrote:

We have to work with scripture and reasoning, and see what shakes out from that.

Since the fourth empowerment is given with words, it can be given online.

Since the gnosis of the wisdom consort empowerment is only symbolic now, it can be given online.

Since the secret empowerment too is a symbolic blessing of speech, which is no longer practiced according to the requirements of the ancient manuals, it too can be given online. Thus the three inner empowerments can be given online.

The eleven empowerments of the vase empowerments however, require the disciple to receive actual substances from the guru at some point during the rite. Therefore it cannot be given online. Therefore, major empowerments cannot be given or received online. Not only this, but the preparation day for a major empowerment contains many procedures needed to make the disciple a suitable recipient for each one of the four main empowerments in the rite.

Meaning empowerments (don dbang) sometimes also called symbolic empowerments (brda dbang) can be given on line. In particular, since these generally include the empowerment of the potential of vidyā (rig pa'i rtsal dbang), they are satisfactory as ripening empowerments. Also, the empowerment of the potential of vidyā alone, sometimes calls "direct introduction" is satisfactory as a ripening empowerment. This is because the empowerment of the potential of vidyā is the mother of all other empowerments.

Permissions (rje gnam) can be given online. Blessings (byin brlabs) cannot, since they also require substances.

The idea that one can receive empowerments and lungs from recordings is not reasonable, just as it is not reasonable to claim one can receive monastic ordination from a recording. Someone who claims to have received such empowerments and lungs via recordings should understand that other people will not accept this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 4:51 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

An unintuitive mystery of Buddhism is that the elements can "glow" when viewed in samādhi.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a mystery at all. The fundamental nature of the elements is actually jñāna, solidified into matter through ignorance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 5:07 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

treehuggingoctopus said:

Tibetan societies are certainly plagued with many problems. But truth be told, I do not think any "Westerner" can afford to pronounce it unhealthy or nightmarish. However environmentally destructive and uninformed they are, they have still so much to learn from the masters of the genre.

Malcolm wrote:

It's pretty bad. Monasteries have no means of waste disposal, so they just pitch their garbage over the sides of ravines, where it washes down into rivers.

The Tibetan landscape is littered with millions upon millions of plastic bags, which get caught on fences, prayer flags to modern consumerism. In many places in Amdo the forests were cut down before the Chinese arrived in force, for example, Amdo used to have millions of acres of forest land, which was all leveled for pasturing sheep in the 30's and 40's. The only reason the trees in Kham were not similarly raised is that the those forests are on steep mountain sides. Now there is very little old growth forest left in Amdo. Of course, the Tibetans in U and Tsang cut down all their trees more than a thousand years ago. Tibetans are human beings, with the same faults as everyone else. They are not masters of deep ecology or conservationism by any means. The Tibetans themselves hunted snow leopards, as well as Himalayan tigers, nearly to extinction. They hunted lions into extinction in their territory, .

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 5:43 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

What you think of some Lamas that give the Major Empowerments online, asking students to arrange some objects/substances in theirs places, or visualizing?

Malcolm wrote:

All I can say is caveat emptor. I don't think this is valid, but that's just me. People generally speaking do whatever they want and justify whatever they do, regardless of what anyone else says. Innocent people have no way of knowing what is correct and what is not correct. But as far as I am concerned, this is not correct. With respect to the five deity Cakrasamvara, I am pretty sure Jhado Rinpoche would consider this incorrect, even though he does give permissions online.

Aloke said:

As I consider CNNR as one of my Gurus, and really love His way of teaching and approach, I tend to see things as the Master would said always, in the way of working with circumstances. This for me is the more reasonable and logic way.

Malcolm wrote:

He explicitly excluded the possibility of giving major empowerments online, and absolutely dismissed the possibility that people could receive empowerments and lungs from recordings, not once but repeatedly, over more than a decade.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 10:09 AM

Title: Re: Eight precepts

Content:

Mirror said:

Hello,

I'm interested in keeping precepts, but as a lay practitioner I don't have much possibilities except for the basic 5 lay precepts and bodhisattva vows at my level of practice. Can I keep "officially" (properly taking them with a teacher and other stuff that has to be done according to a tradition) eight mahayana precepts (sojong vows if I'm not mistaken) for entire life like pratimoksa vows?

Sorry for my confusion. I'll be glad for any answer and clarification. Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

Generally you receive the fast days vows, even the Mahayana version from someone who has them. Then can administer them in your own. The reason for this is that there is no Mahayana rite for taking fast days vows. What makes them Mahayana is intent, but unlike bodhisattva vows, no rite is specified for taking them in absence of a preceptor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, December 25th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

Malcolm, could the Vajrayogini Empowerment/Blessing (Naro Kachod) be given online? It is a Jenang, based on a previous 2 day Major Empowerment right?

Malcolm wrote:

Yogini is a blessing, not a permission, so no.

There are yogini permissions, this not one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Your aim is still off. You need to adjust the sights of your rifle.

Sonam Wangchug said:

it's not only that he is criticizing the wrong application of the practices, since he prefaces it with believe in science and do away with superstitious beliefs, so he is directly calling these profound skillful means left behind by Guru Rinpoche as superstitious and not effective.

Malcolm wrote:

He is criticizing motivation:

This may be an ancient tradition but certainly it is not a genuine Buddhist practice. Hoisting flags in the mountains with the hope of increasing one's fortune is not a Buddhist aspiration. The main Buddhist principle is the law of cause and effect. Without accumulated merit from previous lives or without any genuine bodhicitta, there is no reason that by simply putting up prayer-flags in the mountaintops would bring one any good result

Again, here he is criticizing motivation for the same reason he is criticizing hoisting prayer flags for personal benefit.

In order to fool their patrons, fake monks and lamas these days make all kinds of terbums or treasure vases stuffed with various items claiming that these will enhance their wealth, life and luck and patrons are then made to buy them.

As for his embrace of science, well, Tibetans need to study the sciences so they can secure decent employment for themselves. Tibetans are among the most underemployed people in the PRC, primarily because of their illiteracy and lack of education. There is really nothing wrong in advocating that Tibetans get up to speed in the sciences. In Tibetan schools in India, physics, math, and so on are taught. No one but you has a problem with this. And yes, he is criticizing Tibetans for not following the Buddha's understanding of cause and effect and giving into superstitions. For example, he really criticized Tibetan doctors for charging for nagpo gujur pills, even though he thinks they are worthless for preventing rums nad like covid. He points out if those pills

really had the proper amount of musk in them, if any at all, they would be selling for \$50.00 a piece (300 rmb), an exorbitant price. Hence, he accused Tibetan doctors of profiting off the superstitions of Tibetans through selling them cheap, counterfeit nagpo gujur pills.

Sonam Wangchug said:

However, masters who are capable of perceiving local deities, or diagnosing problems via divinations, like Dilgo Khyentse Rinpoche, or Lama dawa rinpoche for example, can see that sometimes problems stem from unseen sources which require such spiritual solutions.

Malcolm wrote:

Such lamas are as rare as stars during the day.

Sonam Wangchug said:

Of course if one looks with a doubtful mind one can find flaws in any teacher, sutra, tantra, etc .. However for practitioners there is a different way of handling perceived inconsistencies with humility.

Although a prophecy may give a description of benefits, at the end of the day these still depend on the causes and conditions, so perhaps in ideal circumstances it would unfold as such, however depending on circumstances it depends. It still would bring nothing but benefit if done in the right way, and if we do not believe it, then we do not believe Guru Rinpoche, and that is I suppose ones right, but one thing is for sure Guru Rinpoche , and the methods he left behind, will never deceive anyone and are unfailing.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on whether one accepts treasure teachings or not. I suspect Thubten Phuntsok is suspicious of treasure teachings, and more to the point, people who claim to be tertons. Tibetan history is littered with false tertons, and even some of the supposedly authentic ones are pretty dodgy characters who plagiarize whole texts from other schools, barely altering a single word, other than substituting Guru Rinpoche's name for the original Tibetan author.

Sonam Wangchug said:

I'm not really sure who started the tradition of throwing colored papers, or if it has any authentic history at all, possible that it doesn't. I've mainly only seen it happening with Khampas.

Malcolm wrote:

All Tibetans do it.

Sonam Wangchug said:

The problem with such writings and defense of them is as the end of the day it will only

decrease peoples faith and devotion in the three jewels, and the root of all benefit comes from devotion. There are countless things we do in Vajrayana that to skeptics would be called nothing but superstition, are we going to start cow towing every time some modern mind gets a namtok? no.. we can truly trust our teachers. All this modern minded pujas don't really work and are superstitious jargon has to go. Pujas when performed correctly can bring tremendous benefit and are not 'superstitions' as the author claims.

Malcolm wrote:

He isn't claiming what you imagine he is claiming. He is a traditionally-trained doctor of Tibetan medicine. I am quite sure he knows far more about pujas and so on than do you or I.

Sonam Wangchug said:

We don't hear HHDL, HHST, etc proclaiming these practices as "superstitious" and not having authenticity,

Malcolm wrote:

It is well known that HHDL thinks elemental calculation is nonsense. It is also well-known that HHDL is keen enthusiast for science, and strongly supports modern education for Tibetans.

Sonam Wangchug said:

just think of how many compositions of various masters there are on methods of life release, prayer flags, lung ta etc (khyentse wangpo, miphram etc) .. These were not deluded beings, they compose these works because they bring great benefit to sentient beings, so let's instead argue for their continued "correct" application, as they were intended.

Malcolm wrote:

Thubten Phuntsok is arguing for their correct application, apart from prayer flags, which are just a pre-Buddhist custom in Tibet, as everyone knows:

On prayer flags:

Throwing up papers printed with mani and other mantras everywhere has two negative consequences – from the religious point of view it shows disrespect to the mantras; and from the scientific point of view it causes pollution to the land. Hence the throwing of paper prayer-flags is harmful both for this and the next life. This is a result of not knowing how to practice Buddhism.

On treasure vases:

These water bodies that have never witnessed any pollution are contaminated. Living things in these larger waters die whereas smaller water bodies dry up. Large lakes turn

dirty as can be seen from many pictures available online. This too is a result of not knowing how to practice Buddhism.

On life ransom:

But the fish suffer 1. they suffer from being caught in the first place; 2. they suffer as they are transported long distances from east to west and consequently many die because of a lack of native water. Hence water bodies are filled with dead fish and they become polluted. This too is a result of not knowing how to practice Buddhism.

On vegetarianism:

But for the poor and subsistence of ordinary people, this choice does not exist. In the Kham region of eastern Tibet, because of the ban on eating meat, a large quantity of old and out of date food items from cities are transported and sold in villages where Tibetans live. This has become a kind of habit for people to show off by eating these Chinese foods. This is one of the main consequences of banning eating of meat. This too is a result of not knowing how to practice Buddhism.

He concludes:

Tibet may be filled with monks  
But the land is filled with conflicts,  
They may be praying for world peace  
But their land is filled with fighting.

Mountains and valleys are filled with prayer-flags  
Amidst these flags are the carcasses of dead yaks,  
Businessmen may ransom many fish  
But dead bodies of these fish fill the water bodies.

Nomads avoid slaughtering  
But lamas commit murders,  
Farmers abide by the five precepts  
But monks engage in sexual acts.

There are things here in Tibet  
That do not exist elsewhere,  
This religious education,  
A la la! What a wonder!

And every words of what he says is true. Frankly, your only complaint is that he advocates that Tibetans become educated in tshan rig, science, because when they do, they will abandon some traditional practices when they understand that they do not correspond to the principle of cause and effect. It is also well known that he thinks practices like mantra healing and so are completely fraudulent. But that is his right. Just as you have the right to credulously accept any story you hear about this lama and that



lama, he has the right to doubt these things. But from his point of view, Tibetans are being ripped of and exploited by their own religious and secular authorities, and that, and nothing else, was the real cause of the Chinese Invasion of Tibet.

Tibet, prior to the fall, was a corrupt, medieval society, where aristocrats felt they could treat common people anyway they liked, where there was no democracy, and so on. It is not a surprise to discover that most of the Red Guards who engaged in the cultural revolution in Tibet were Tibetan cadres made up of illiterate Tibetan peasants, and not Chinese cadres. After the 13th Dalai passed in 1936, the Lhasa elites became too absorbed in their own power games to look up and see the train that was bearing down on them, the 14th Dalai Lama was too young to fend off the Communists, and those in Eastern Tibet were apathetic to hostile to the Lhasa Gvt.

You can claim all you like that building this statue and following that prophecy would have saved Tibet the indignity of being occupied by the Chinese Communists, but as they say, hindsight is 20/20. It is very common to blame the other guy for your own problems—— So sectarian Nyingmapas and Kagyupas blame the Gelukpas (like you are doing here), sectarian Gelukpas blame the Nyingmas and the Kagyus, etc.

The reality is that Tibet was not a unified nation, it was more like Germany or Italy in the mid 19th century. It was not unified, there was no effective national army with modern weapons and training. At the root of the issue was that the Khampas, hating Lhasa rule, did little to nothing to prevent the Chinese occupation. Similarly, the Amdowas did little to nothing to prevent the Chinese occupation. The history of the Chinese Occupation is well documented, so these facts are not disputable.

To reiterate: Tibet fell because it was not a unified country. That Lhasa nobles ignored advice from Khampa lamas is not surprising in the least. So, in reality, the real cause of the fall of Tibet was elite self-absorption combined with seething ethnic rivalry, which resulted in a situation where Tibetans, divided amongst themselves, could not stand against the Chinese occupation, a state of affairs that continues to this day.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

I'm not threatened by science, as Buddhists we should have confidence in Buddhist methods and teachers.

Otherwise you take refuge in science.

Malcolm wrote:

If one should forgo medical treatment, say for cancer, because accepting medical

treatment somehow means one lacks faith in the Dharma, then one is a fool.

There are no effective methods at all for treating internal cancers in Tibetan Medicine. I have this on the authority of one of Tibetan doctors I studied with who is the head of internal medicine in the Qinghai Tibetan Medical hospital.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 12:44 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Math is an explanatory device. It is used to explain observable properties and to predict things in physical reality yet to be observed, it is thus a tool of both deduction and inference. No one claimed it was tool of direct perception. That's what experiment is for.

Zhen Li said:

,

Math is purely the quantitative language of symbols, it cannot help us infer anything qualitative about nature.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense, for example, math, as applied to evolution, can and has been used to predict species in environmental niches.

Zhen Li said:

It has nothing to do with the physical world, it's a symbolic representation.

Malcolm wrote:

Like any language.

Zhen Li said:

Experimentation is not for direct perception—that would negate the requirement for experiments.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course it is. It is used to prove inferences. The only way an inference can be proven is with a direct perception.

Well, then we are talking about two different things entirely. In any case, something conventionally is said to exist, if it functions according to expectations. For example, a car: a car that cannot drive is a non-car by definition, something we refer to as a "broken-down car." But even a broken-car is more of a car than Meru is a mountain. Sure, we can call Meru an mythical mountain, since it is myth. But it is not a real mountain, even conventionally speaking.

I agree with regard to the mythical mountain part. A car that cannot drive is neither

necessarily a non-car nor a broken-down car. This underscores the importance of clear definitions. A lot of the issues with the photon situation are simply a lack of clear definitions for generations of particle physics.  
I don't think physicists will agree you here.

Meru is a concept. It's a mental dharma.  
So is the son of a barren women, but it is mental representation of a total nonexistent. It may have suchness in how it exists—as a concept—but not in what it represents, a total nonexistent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 12:51 AM

Title: Re: Dharma Protectors of HYT

Content:

tony\_montana said:

This might be uber-noob question, I beg for patience. But, do we ever self-generate as a Protector?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, we can, provided we have the right transmission and know what we are doing. Otherwise, better not. There are some protectors however which are almost always give as self-generation, the so-called White Mahākāla (dgon dkar) is one of these, even though white and mahākāla are contradictions in terms.

In all schools, Mahākāla is frequently given as a self-generation practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 2:08 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Sonam Wangchug said:

However, I know one tibetan doctor, the Ven paltul rinpoche who told me he has been very effective in treating breast cancer using Tibetan medicine, he gets his medicine fresh from Tibet, and not from Men-tsee-khang in dharamsala. He said though that the Tibetan medicine is effective if they had not yet gotten radiation, but if they had radiation therapy already it was less effective.

Malcolm wrote:

Tibetan Medicine can be used as an adjunct therapy, it has no methods nor herbs that can deal with internal cancers.

Sonam Wangchug said:

however i'm not sure if that is what you classify as an internal cancer.

Malcolm wrote:

Cancerous tumors that generally require surgery for removal. Tibetan medicine can deal with external cancers, like skin cancer and so on.

Sonam Wangchug said:

"One of his specialties is cancer. He has treated thousands of cancer patients from all over the world, including women with breast cancer. The rate of survival for people treated with ancient Tibetan herbal therapies with or without adjunct Western cancer treatments appears to be much higher than those receiving allopathic cancer treatments alone.

Other diseases those are successfully cure are AIDS, Brain Tumors, Multiple Sclerosis, Hepatitis, Leukemia, Stroke, Stomach Cancer."

Malcolm wrote:

There are no evidence-based studies in support of such claims.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 2:17 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

Oh ok, because of the substances. Which lineages do have Yogini Jenangs? Thank you very much again!

Malcolm wrote:

The Bari Gyatsa. But it is usually given a whole collection. You might find some lama willing to give the separate jenang.

But you don't need, since you have Mandarava.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 2:22 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

We're heading into AI Technocratic era anyway where most of the jobs will be done artificially by robots, computers and code

Malcolm wrote:

This will be mostly in agribusiness, services, logistics, and manufacturing. But there will always be a need for plumbers, electricians, farmers, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

It was really meant as a question, given what I can gather of the culture, not just "the proles" but all round. Effort is just not worth making for a lot of people.

Malcolm wrote:

??? WTF is that supposed to mean?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 8:20 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

It means that as always there are many sides to the story.

One side is surely that in many sectors in the US people are paid peanuts and enjoy shocking working conditions. Unions have been destroyed. This is exploitation and abuse pure and simple.

Another one is that many people can't be bothered doing much at all, especially if they can somehow eke out an existence with doing little. It's like a lingering depression. It just doesn't appear to them that the effort is worth making. I don't want to moralise or judge, because it's not a happy state of mind, but yeah, those values mentioned above do appear in short supply among many people, it seems.

Malcolm wrote:

People do what they. You are being judgmental, which is fine, but only if you own it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 8:28 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. And actually, what happens when blood flow is restricted anywhere in the body? That part begins to die. Why? Because of lack of air

Aemilius said:

Not lack of air but of oxygen in a dissolved liquid form, which would make it "water element" in the ancient thinking.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Buddhist “elements” is a poetic way of conceptualizing the molecular world. Oxygen itself isn’t inherently a liquid, gas, or solid.

Malcolm wrote:

Not poetic, phenomenological.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 10:07 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

None of my teachers said recordings were valid, personally. However, I’ve read Garchen’s explanation for why he allows empowerment via recording, and by my reading it tracks with your first paragraph.

If I was a Garchen student (I’m not) I would follow it without endless deliberation on DW.

PeterC said:

I agree, and HEGr is a great lama.

Whatever one believes about validity of these things, one should always seek at some point to meet the lama in person to receive empowerment anyway.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah, I think that making a genuine effort to make those connections is, in itself a part of serious practice. Whatever the technical answer, developing that attitude towards practice would make -anything- more effective, the dog’s tooth story is pretty on the nose, but it makes a point.

Malcolm wrote:

The dog’s tooth story is for gullible rubes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 10:12 AM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And when Tibetan doctors get cancer, like Chogyal Namkhai Norbu, and so on, they are first in line for allopathic treatments for it.

Sonam Wangchug said:

However, I know one Tibetan doctor, the Ven paltul rinpoche who told me he has been very effective in treating breast cancer using Tibetan medicine, he gets his medicine fresh from Tibet, and not from Men-tsee-khang in dharamsala. He said though that the

Tibetan medicine is effective if they had not yet gotten radiation, but if they had radiation therapy already it was less effective.

PeterC said:

Obviously it was less effective, because the fact they has received radiotherapy indicates the cancer had progressed. But Malcolm is right, if you have a solid cancer you will probably be having surgery at some point. The limitations of chemotherapy are well known.

Other diseases those are successfully cure are AIDS, Brain Tumors, Multiple Sclerosis, Hepatitis, Leukemia, Stroke, Stomach Cancer."

You seem to be mistakenly thinking that "Science" doesn't want to learn anything from traditional medicine. Nothing could be further from the truth. It's a field that has been and is studied quite extensively for ideas on treatment of diseases. If someone had achieved a functional cure for AIDS there would be researchers all over it, since there's so much research money in that field. There are to date only two known cases of a functional cure for AIDS, and they hadn't seen a Tibetan doctor.

You need to get over your belief that relying on modern science and medicine is somehow disrespectful to the Dharma. You're trying to be excessively pious and adopting a position that I doubt any of your lamas ever held.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 9:02 PM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The dog's tooth story is for gullible rubes.

Lingpupa said:

On a personal note, I would feel uncomfortable being quite so dismissive of either the story or of those you call "rubes", even if they might be less educated than I am.

There would not, of course, be many takers for a literalistic understanding of the story. But who does that? Tibetan "rubes"? I wouldn't be so sure. But if we ask, as I suspect most people would, what this amusing folk tale is telling us, it seems clear that it is making a perfectly valid point about the importance of confidence.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a fairytale, used to excuse blind faith.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 10:19 PM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's a fairytale, used to excuse blind faith.

Lingpupa said:

I would not be in a position of insight into the motives of the tellers.

Malcolm wrote:

That's how it is presently employed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

I've been poor, sleeping rough, couch surfing and living in a tent at a "white trash" trailer park at the outskirts of the city. Doing whatever jobs I could find. Abusive employers crushing any self-esteem I still clung on to. It's not really fun, no. As always, there are different sides to it. One could amp one's anger at it all and go down the destructive path. One could tighten the belt and do the best one can. Or one can channel the anger somewhere constructive, unionise, advocate for those even less fortunate, and try to keep one's shit together.

Malcolm wrote:

The usual conservative argument, that you tiresomely repeat here, is that these issues boil down personal character, with all moral judgements that go along them, complete with a "I buckled my belt" that usually goes along with such sentiments.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 10:48 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Do you realize what its like here with benefits and vacations?

Malcolm wrote:

Dan has no idea about America, just like I have no idea about Switzerland, which is why I don't comment on Swiss politics or social life. It's outside my experience.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit



Content:

Queequeg said:

Working for the sake of working is brain damage, dudes.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Also there are so many areas where you can be a self-taught entrepreneur I taught myself code and had a 9 year career out of it. You can do the same with Graphic Design so many areas apply to that.

Malcolm wrote:

That requires computer literacy, in which, believe it or not, the US has a deficit because of the structural ways the poorest people in this country also have the least access to technology. It is so glaring, it is hard to believe it is not by design.

You also have to take into consideration that 130 million Americans, between the ages of 14 and 65, barely read at a sixth grade level. That is 40% of the US population.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Working a slave job like in an Amazon Warehouse to make someone else rich isn't the only way. Put together a plan and execute. There are even University courses being sold on an online platform these days.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on being functionally literate, and 40% of Americans are not, through no fault of their own. They've been failed by the public school system.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, December 26th, 2021 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

I see I researched this years ago they've really dumbed down the mainstream education system for quite a few hundred years. They used to teach the Trivium which I practiced a bit also a few years ago but it made people think for themselves too much literally became autonomous. So they changed the model.

Malcolm wrote:

Theoretically, American Democracy was designed with idea that an educated populace would make good decisions in aggregate. But conservatives in the US have always sought to undermine education to keep themselves in power. First, conservative Democrats in the old South, and later, the Republican Party, when the Dixiecrats fled to the GOP over civil rights and abortion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 1:09 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

I wondered about how many of the people who left their positions did so not because of better prospects elsewhere, but because it was too much effort.

Malcolm wrote:

You sound like this:

<https://www.foxnews.com/opinion/tucker-carlson-bidens-economic-policy>

Dan74 said:

But either way, here's the core point. The incentives that we've constructed in this country over a long period of time, to be fair, but accelerating recently have a very specific effect. Those policies reward people who don't want a job and they punish people who do want a job. What they do is they degrade work. They strip it of its inherent meaning. And that's a problem in a country that is running out of things that have inherent meaning. They're telling you that your religion means nothing. Your patriotism means nothing. Your family means nothing. Now they're telling you your work means nothing? What does mean anything? And how long can a society continue that doesn't have meaning and that doesn't revere work?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Lingpupa said:

I would not be in a position of insight into the motives of the tellers.

Malcolm wrote:

That's how it is presently employed.

Lingpupa said:

Like I said - I don't have that breadth of insight.

Malcolm wrote:

Doesn't take insight, it just takes listening.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: Extinction as a result of global warming

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Just because I don't share your political views it doesn't make you more holier.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it just makes me more sensible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 1:54 AM

Title: Re: Ordained Life as a Monastic

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

1. On the use of money - Do Gelongs use money the same way as Getshuls?

Malcolm wrote:

Tibetan monks are all Mahāyānas, therefore, they observe no restrictions over the handling of money.

Dharmasherab said:

2. Is it compulsory to do an occupation while being a monastic? Or if not is this what usually happens in the West as part of the culture among those who are ordained in Tibetan Buddhism in the West?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, all Tibetan monastics in monasteries have some kind of job, cooking, cleaning, etc. Also, every single monastic I know in the West worked some kind of job if they wanted to eat. Thus, most people who ordain, and then try to live in the West, give back their ordination.

Dharmasherab said:

3. Travelling - is it required to travel to different monasteries on a frequent basis (which costs money)?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, no.

Dharmasherab said:

Apart from these questions please feel free to give information which you think may help me. I am particularly interested in the aspects which people may find typically unusual for an ordained life including the idiosyncrasies.

Malcolm wrote:

Tibetan monks are not very careful about Vinaya. If you want to understand this, you

should read Sakya Pandita's A Clear Differentiation of the Three Codes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

So from everything I can tell, people are working. I see no evidence for some Great Staycation, or a systemic malaise. I think, rather, that people prefer good jobs to lousy jobs, and will leave lousy jobs for better jobs if they have the choice.

Malcolm wrote:

It is mostly small business owners who are bitching, because people are bailing on their shitty jobs for better jobs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

I don't think there is an equivalent anywhere else in the developed world.

Malcolm wrote:

You didn't look too hard, obviously:

<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/dec/20/working-homeless-britain-economy-minimum-wage-zero-hours>

<https://www.theguardian.com/society/2019/sep/15/25pc-households-at-risk-of-homelessness-are-in-work>

<https://news.sky.com/story/covid-19-how-the-pandemic-has-led-to-a-rise-in-the-working-homeless-12362730>

<https://www.bigissue.com/news/housing/how-many-people-are-homeless-in-the-uk-and-what-can-you-do-about-it/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 2:07 AM

Title: Re: Extinction as a result of global warming

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, it just makes me more sensible.

Dharmasherab said:

No. That's just being arrogant and conceited.

Malcolm wrote:

All views are not equal, if they were, it wouldn't matter if one was a Buddhist or a Christian as far as liberation goes. This also applies to politics, where some views, the views of liberals who are committed to democracy, are better than the views of others, such as conservatives, who are not committed to democracy and never have been.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 2:13 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

oldbob said:

Merry Christmas to all,

This is not a story showing the failure / limits of blind faith, but instead, a story of how blind faith can lead to enlightenment

Malcolm wrote:

It can't. Not ever. That's why it is a bullshit story.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 2:38 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Lingpupa said:

On a personal note, I would feel uncomfortable being quite so dismissive of either the story or of those you call "rubes", even if they might be less educated than I am.

There would not, of course, be many takers for a literalistic understanding of the story. But who does that? Tibetan "rubes"? I wouldn't be so sure. But if we ask, as I suspect most people would, what this amusing folk tale is telling us, it seems clear that it is making a perfectly valid point about the importance of confidence.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a fairytale, used to excuse blind faith.

Tenma said:

In a similar vein, wouldn't the dog tooth story be used to explain other such practices as

a lama circumambulating a dog, Lama Zopa Rinpoche teaching about visualizing a stupa and circumambulating that instead, bowing down to a visualized Tathagata, regarding a pot as more precious than other disciples' offerings, Drukpa Kunley's poems regarding bowing down to a maiden's feet (amongst other things like swear words as mantras), and so forth?

Malcolm wrote:

All I know is what Āryadeva says—realization comes from view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Waxing philosophical about this is just silly and bougie, to be honest...

Malcolm wrote:

Yup:

YEO, STÉPHEN. "ON THE USES OF 'APATHY.'" *European Journal of Sociology / Archives Européennes de Sociologie / Europäisches Archiv Für Soziologie* 15, no. 2 (1974): 279–311. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23998532>.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 3:17 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

I'm not sure I understand your logic. Why should people stay in jobs that make them miserable simply because there are other people who would be willing to take those jobs? I rather think the converse is the tragedy: people forced to stay in jobs they hate because they have no choice.

Edit: in case it wasn't clear, this was a response to the op, not Malcolm

Shinjin said:

Not every single person quitting is doing it out of pure misery.

Malcolm wrote:

Hanging light fixtures for a living sounds like pure misery to me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 3:23 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Waxing philosophical about this is just silly and bougie, to be honest...

Malcolm wrote:

Yup:

YEO, STÉPHEN. "ON THE USES OF 'APATHY.'" *European Journal of Sociology / Archives Européennes de Sociologie / Europäisches Archiv Für Soziologie* 15, no. 2 (1974): 279–311. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23998532>.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Seems interesting. I just think it's kind of pointless focusing on people's inner attitudes about work when there are really obvious reasons that lots of people in the US hate their jobs. It just doesn't seem like much of a mystery to me.

I think a lot of people outside the US also don't realize that there is actually ton of poverty here, comparable in places to developing nations, and that a ton of people live hand to mouth, and have none of the social safety net that exists in many European countries.

Malcolm wrote:

The gist of the article is that there is a long-standing, self-serving, as well as self-contradictory capitalist narrative about apathy. On the one hand the wealthy are apathetic, because they are too wealthy (this targets the aristocrats); the poor are apathetic because, well, they are poor (targets the workers); on the other hand, if people are not politically apathetic, this is troublesome, so political apathy on the part of the poor is encouraged, while being simultaneously derided. And all of this is couched in moral judgement. And yes, it is a very bougie attitude...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 3:26 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

So from everything I can tell, people are working. I see no evidence for some Great Staycation, or a systemic malaise. I think, rather, that people prefer good jobs to lousy jobs, and will leave lousy jobs for better jobs if they have the choice.

Malcolm wrote:

It is mostly small business owners who are bitching, because people are bailing on their shitty jobs for better jobs.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yep. I used to work for a guy like this. It was a non-profit even, lol.

He used to lament how only I would work for him based on the good working conditions (they really weren't, there were some good things but I was -very- overworked), and that others were "lazy and just wanted a good benefits package" - he had -no- benefits package and as the business was three people he didn't have to. No shit, he really said something like that. People's insane attitudes towards there jobs here are mindblowing.

I kind of relish seeing all the upset and surprise from shit employers now that they can't fill their awful jobs as easily. Hmm, I wonder what would change that.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the bullshit, "Just work harder and you will get ahead..." carrot and stick promise of American Capitalism, as if the shitty job they are paying you for far less than a living wage is a f\*\*king favor and you are lucky to have it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 3:30 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Tenma said:

In a similar vein, wouldn't the dog tooth story be used to explain other such practices as a lama circumambulating a dog, Lama Zopa Rinpoche teaching about visualizing a stupa and circumambulating that instead, bowing down to a visualized Tathagata, regarding a pot as more precious than other disciples' offerings, Drukpa Kunley's poems regarding bowing down to a maiden's feet (amongst other things like swear words as mantras), and so forth?

Malcolm wrote:

All I know is what Āryadeva says—realization comes from view.

Tenma said:

So how come the dog tooth story is BS if there's Aryadeva's statement?

Malcolm wrote:

Blind faith has no view because it is blind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 5:16 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

pemachophel said:

Loppon-la, What is the Tibetan that you are equating with the English "blind faith"?



Malcolm wrote:

The term "blind faith" or "blind devotion" does not occur in Tibetan. But we can infer by means of analogy that it is not acceptable to the Buddha. Aryadeva quotes the Buddha in the Jñānasārasamuccaya:

Just as gold is burned, cut, and filed,  
bhikṣus or scholars  
thoroughly investigate and accept my words,  
but not because of respect.

This has direct bearing on accepting the claims of this or that person about the effectiveness or validity of various kinds of assertions about online transmissions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 6:56 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

pemachophel said:

Loppon-la, What is the Tibetan that you are equating with the English "blind faith"?

Malcolm wrote:

The term "blind faith" or "blind devotion" does not occur in Tibetan. But we can infer by means of analogy that it is not acceptable to the Buddha. Aryadeva quotes the Buddha in the Jñānasārasamuccaya:

Just as gold is burned, cut, and filed,  
bhikṣus or scholars  
thoroughly investigate and accept my words,  
but not because of respect.

This has direct bearing on accepting the claims of this or that person about the effectiveness or validity of various kinds of assertions about online transmissions.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I didn't see a lot of assertions either way in this thread, only advice for people to generally listen to their teachers and engage with the question that way.

Malcolm wrote:

Not on this thread, but generally speaking, nothing in Buddhadharma should be accepted purely on faith just because someone said "it is so."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 7:49 AM

Title: Re: What calendar to buy for 2022?

Content:

Toenail said:

I believe there is none from Dzogchen community for 2022.

Malcolm wrote:

There will be.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 7:53 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Shinjin said:

Not every single person quitting is doing it out of pure misery.

Malcolm wrote:

Hanging light fixtures for a living sounds like pure misery to me.

Shinjin said:

Worker in question quit because of laziness and entitlement, not because he wasn't being payed a living wage or treated poorly by managers and coworkers. All the best to him in his future endeavors.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe he just didn't like the job. I wouldn't. And the last thing I am is "lazy." Of course, I don't know the guy, but you were using him as some of exemplar, generalizing from a particular.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 9:01 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Toenail said:

Can you vouch for Tulku Dakpa? How should someone planning to receive this familiarize him or herself with this lama?

Malcolm wrote:

Thus lung by Tulku Dakpa is being given at my request. Incidentally, all donations are going to go to a project to build a stupa at his center in Finland.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 9:05 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

That is not an explanation, that is a quantitative prediction. Your claim was that math has an explanatory function. You cannot explain without descriptive words, it's just not possible.

Malcolm wrote:

Math is a language, just like any other construct of symbols. We use math to describe all kinds of things.

Zhen Li said:

Your claim is that experimentation is direct perception.

Malcolm wrote:

Experimentation is used to confirm inferences with direct perception.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: What holds consciousness? (pretas, devas, asuras)

Content:

Nalanda said:

In other realms without any forms or brain to hold consciousness, what holds it for pretas, devas and asuras?

What do Buddhist texts say about this?

Malcolm wrote:

Consciousness located in the center of the body, no matter what kind of body you have, according to Buddhist texts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Shinjin said:

Dan articulated the issue well but nobody wants to listen. It's ok, no problem.

Malcolm wrote:

We listened, but some of us just don't agree with his assessment, or that his concerns are particular well-founded.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:32 PM

Title: Re: Criticism of Prayer Flags, Treasure Vases, etc.

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Tibetan medicine is also not a static and unchanging entity. Promoting medical conservatism accomplishes nothing good

I believe I read a post by Malcolm once that Tibetan medicine has drawn upon influences from Galen and Ayurvedic medicine (and perhaps even Chinese?) as well as the indigenous medicines of Tibet. This makes perfect sense when we consider that medicine is primarily results-based and this has been a factor in all medical traditions (Western medicine drawing upon Islamic medicine etc.).

Point is, it would not be constructive for Tibetan medicine to reject anything it can learn from Western medicine. This should also not be taken to mean that Tibetan medicine is then obsolete. They are not mutually exclusive.

Malcolm wrote:

Tibetan Medicine is indeed derived from the medical traditions of the Byzantine Empire, China, and primarily, from Ayurveda, combined with indigenous herbal and healing traditions. It is also the case, as you point out, that Tibetan Medicine and Allopathic Medicine are not mutually exclusive. Tibetan Medicine, like Ayurveda, excels in the treatment of chronic diseases, whereas Allopathic Medicine is much better equipped to deal with acute care, such as car accidents, cancer, and other types of conditions that require immediate intervention.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:37 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

So again: where is the evidence that people are leaving their jobs en masse because they're too lazy to work?

Malcolm wrote:

[sarcasm]Obviously, we have not done enough to eradicate welfare queens from the face of the earth.[/sarcasm]

The "dignity of hard work" is a meme that should go in the dumpster right alongside the Christian "dignity of poverty."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:46 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Unknown said:

Maznevski says there are likely two broad categories of people participating in the Great

Resignation: “One is people who are professionals, who are making a choice between ‘good’ and ‘better’. The other category is people who are making a choice between something that is really terrible, unhealthy and toxic, and survival. Those are two very different dynamics.”...

In other words, we may only be seeing the Great Resignation through the eyes of those who have the privilege to quit, like top executives or financially secure workers. But the reality is that it's hard to parse from the existing data which workers are quitting more and why, which can distort what's really happening, and might encourage people to boldly quit and think everything will work out for them.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.bbc.com/worklife/article/20211028-what-were-getting-wrong-about-the-great-resignation>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 10:49 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

So again: where is the evidence that people are leaving their jobs en masse because they're too lazy to work?

Malcolm wrote:

[sarcasm]Obviously, we have not done enough to eradicate welfare queens from the face of the earth.[/sarcasm]

Genjo Conan said:

There was an excellent book a couple years back about Reagan's prototypical welfare queen. More broadly it was about how singular examples get blown up to create broad stereotypes.

<https://www.littlebrown.com/titles/josh-levin/the-queen/9780316513272/>

Malcolm wrote:

It's obvious, but it bears repeating, most of these stereotypes are driven by racism, and many of the people repeating them are engaging in racism unconsciously.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Math is a language, just like any other construct of symbols. We use math to describe all

kinds of things.

Zhen Li said:

It's purely quantitative, it is unlike almost all other constructs of symbols. It cannot describe anything without the aid of other words.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think we are talking about the same math, you seem to talking about  $2 + 2 = 4$ ; there are 26 varieties of math.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, December 27th, 2021 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Archie2009 said:

So I assume Rinpoche will be doing the lungs from Finland. This sounds too good to pass on.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, he will, from 4:00 pm -- 9:00 pm, EET March 18, 19, 20, 21st.

A registration link will be posted here as well as on his facebook page.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Queequeg said:

More seriously - Its my right as an American to not want to work like an immigrant. Totally fine with immigrants doing the shit jobs we don't want to do.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, they do work we are physically incapable of doing ourselves. If they didn't, food prices would be skyhigh:

In 1960, half of all the native-born men in the U.S. labor force were high school dropouts eager to take unskilled outdoor jobs in agriculture and construction. Today, fewer than 10 percent of the native-born men in the work force lack high school diplomas. But the economy still generates plenty of unskilled jobs, and most unskilled immigrants don't displace American workers. They fill niches — not just farmhand, but also chambermaid, busboy and others — that would otherwise go empty. And they support more skilled, more desirable jobs — foremen, accountants, waiters, chefs and more — at the businesses where they work and others in the surrounding community.

<https://www.nytimes.com/roomfordebate/2011/08/17/could-farms-survive-without->

illegal-labor/without-immigrant-labor-the-economy-would-crumble

Some Americans referred for jobs at Fortin's nursery couldn't do the grueling work.

"A few years ago when domestic workers were referred here, we saw absentee problems, and we had people asking for time off after they had just started," he said. "Some were actually planting the plants upside down."

<https://www.cbsnews.com/news/despite-economy-americans-dont-want-farm-work/>

All we've done is work and work to make a better life for our children, we haven't seen anything, we haven't been anywhere. Even if I'm sick or injured, there's no help, I can't even afford a dentist. We feed this country, I've never seen a f\*\*king gringo in the fields, but they don't value what we do."

<https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2021/may/13/meet-the-workers-who-put-food-on-americas-tables-but-cant-afford-groceries>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: What holds consciousness? (pretas, devas, asuras)

Content:

Nalanda said:

In other realms without any forms or brain to hold consciousness, what holds it for pretas, devas and asuras?

What do Buddhist texts say about this?

Malcolm wrote:

Consciousness located in the center of the body, no matter what kind of body you have, according to Buddhist texts.

Aemilius said:

Which text says it? Is it mentioned in a Sutra or an Abhidharma text?

Malcolm wrote:

Many Vajrayāna texts, the Medicine Tantra, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: Avalokiteśvara as the Jewel of Windhorse

Content:

Chenda said:

"Jewel of Windhorse".

Malcolm wrote:

This is interpolated by the translator, presumably on the basis of some comment. You

should write him and ask .

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 5:18 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

oldbob said:

not to [be] open to innovations, what would be acceptable ways of given/receiving Transmissions according to the teachings?"

Malcolm wrote:

There are certain "innovations" that will destroy Vajrayāna teachings. So, it is necessary to exercise caution and apply scripture and reasoning to these issues. Things like receiving lungs and empowerments from recordings are unacceptable innovations. It's not really that hard to understand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 7:46 AM

Title: Re: What holds consciousness? (pretas, devas, asuras)

Content:

Nalanda said:

But if the being has no "form" then what body is there? Figurative body?

Malcolm wrote:

It's "held" by the faculty of life force.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

oldbob said:

That said, ChNN allowed as valid, Lungs (many, many times) and Worldwide Transmissions many many times - on the web that were sometimes delayed by 10+ minutes.

Malcolm wrote:

That's a dumb argument Bob, since everyone was participating at the same time even if there was buffering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 10:08 AM



Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

KristenM said:

But, I don't buy the tropes of calling the American kids lazy and entitled, and alternatively glorifying the immigrant kids as more hard-working and appreciative of the so-called "American dream."

Malcolm wrote:

I don't buy it either. It's still an issue comparative advantage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 11:01 PM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

Malcolm, I asked if you please would elaborate a little bit about this because it may seem that having Mandarava would allow someone to practice Naro Kachod (as it is in Sakya and Gelug).

Malcolm wrote:

That's not what I meant. I meant that they are both dakini practices.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, December 28th, 2021 at 11:46 PM

Title: Re: HHDL on Satipatthana

Content:

avatamsaka3 said:

In contrast, Mahayana is defined by the view that all dharmas are empty from the beginning precluding grasping altogether.  
There are teachings on emptiness in the Pali.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no teaching in this canon on profound emptiness.

avatamsaka3 said:

There are teachings on ultimate realities in the Abhidhamma literature in the Pali, and these are understood to be empty of what is habitually imputed to them.

Malcolm wrote:

This level of teaching is realist.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Did I make a mistake taking empowerment?

Content:

James84 said:

A well known Tibetan Lama came to give a talk at a local temple so I decided to go give him a listen and enjoyed his talk. Many new people to Buddhism were at the talk and while there they handed out a schedule for upcoming empowerments of Vajrasattva and Medicine Buddha and told everyone they were welcome. After talking with the monks they suggested I come and see the ceremony. I have studied some Tibetan Buddhism and have an interest in it, but also enjoy zen. I decided I would go although now I am having some doubts. I'm not sure if I am doing the practice right and I'm not sure if I took any vows? He mentioned briefly that the Samaya was to recite the mantra each day and if we can do the practice that's even better. Did I take more vows than this without knowing? Am I also stuck practicing Vajrayana now? Or am I able to focus on Zen and leave Vajrayana behind if I decide its a better fit for me? Is this common too? I thought Vajrayana was more secretive although people who mentioned they were very new to Buddhism were suggested to come to the empowerment so I'm feeling lost.

Malcolm wrote:

You are not stuck with anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 3:28 AM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

Aloke said:

I think you meant that one Dakini practice would be enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

As far as Naro Khacho goes, one has to receive this according to how it is given in Sakya and Geluk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Upcoming Translations

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

This is indeed very exciting.

I've been reading the introduction and Coghlan mentions that he has used three of Tsongkhapa's works as references. I wonder if this will have had any influence on the way the text is interpreted in English.

Malcolm wrote:

I did a preliminary translation of the first 7 chapters, years ago, it looks fine, other than his decision to merge dharmata and tathata into a single term.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 11:35 AM

Title: Re: How do I know I have enough bodhichitta?

Content:

jewel123 said:

Hello! How can I determine that my Bodhichitta is sufficient? How to measure it?

What would be the way to understand if I even have it?

Thank you so much!

Malcolm wrote:

If you wish to become a buddha for the benefit of all sentient beings, you have enough bodhichitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is nothing new here Dan. This just generational bitching, “kids these days.” Some kids find their direction in life early; some a bit later; some, never. And it’s the same in Japan and China.

For example, I was utterly bored in school. I had taught myself to read when I was a toddler. I generally finished reading my schoolbooks within the first month of school, and was often punished for reading other books in class. I was pretty much done with school by age 14, though between 15-17, I was sent to an alternative private school, from which I was expelled. I met Buddhism there, however. I drifted along for another ten years, working this shit job and that, until I attended Harvard extension, but never matriculated. I got a job in a bookstore, became a Buddhist, and drifted along into a three year retreat. After I got out, I drifted into a bad marriage, drifted out of that, and drifted back to Western Massachusetts about twenty years ago, where I had “grown up.” I’ve found a nice pool in the stream of my life, and the current so far hasn’t pushed me out. I am a well—published translator, but I didn’t plan any of it. I didn’t “work” for it, or have any sense of purpose or mission. I still don’t, other than seeing a certain body of literature translated into English. So I don’t buy, for one minute, much of what you are trying to sell. It doesn’t fit my experience or observations.

One other thing: Black people get to use the Uncle Tom metaphor, you and I don’t. It’s racist to do so. And your use of it is incorrect:

The first has to do with an erroneous interpretation of the novel. The original Uncle Tom

is, well, no Uncle Tom. Like millions of his real-life counterparts at the time, Tom is enslaved. He also has courage, dignity and a strong sense of what is right. When ordered by his cruel master, Simon Legree, to whip another slave, Tom refuses; he later encourages two other slaves to escape, and when Legree confronts him, asking where they have gone, Tom refuses to reveal their whereabouts, a decision that costs him his life. Tom heartily (but not blindly) embraces Christianity, the religion of his white oppressors; but then so do most of the black Americans I know.

[https://www.washingtonpost.com/outlook/dear-white-people-stop-using-the-term-uncle-tom/2018/11/15/8a68e9c0-e84e-11e8-a939-9469f1166f9d\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/outlook/dear-white-people-stop-using-the-term-uncle-tom/2018/11/15/8a68e9c0-e84e-11e8-a939-9469f1166f9d_story.html)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 9:16 PM

Title: Re: NASA Is Hiring Religious Leaders To Prepare For Encounter With Aliens ?

Content:

Aemilius said:

The theologians are attempting to assess how major religions would react to news of alien life being found.

...

The theme of theology and ufology has gained some momentum in the ufo-platforms very recently, when do Dharma folks wake up to this?

Malcolm wrote:

We already know there is intelligent life in countless planetary systems.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 9:48 PM

Title: Re: 84000: The Sūtra on Transmigration Through Existences (Bhava-saṅkrānti-sūtra) & Some Questions

Content:

Leo Rivers said:

It is my understanding that this text represents a unique view that the last moment of consciousness at death is IMMEDIATELY followed by the first moment of the subsequent mindstream. No afterlife. No bardos. No just biding one's time.

Malcolm wrote:

It does not necessarily follow that this sūtra is rejecting the antarabhāva.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

What you describe as your experience is probably less common than most, but no less valid. You are fortunate to have found your way, many people never do. Our world, with its bewildering array of choices sometimes leads to folks such as yourself doing great things with their lives and many others losing themselves in addiction and mental illness.

Malcolm wrote:

That's karma for you.

Dan74 said:

Apart from the ~150 young people I teach every week, I have three kids at home. I worry about them, wonder how well they are navigating the challenges this world throws their way and how well (or poorly) our culture is guiding them. This ultimately is my interest. Here, in the context of the job market, but even earlier, their studies, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, that's one reason I avoided having children. I did not want the responsibility, nor the choices it would force on me as a parent. My partner is a parent, and she has the same worries you do, though her kid is a successful professional, too driven, if anything.

Dan74 said:

And for myself, having twice moved countries and continents, having something of a foot in three cultures, I guess I have a strange life experience and a stranger outlook that most people will are not likely to relate to, or find any value in.

Malcolm wrote:

Mostly it is the judgy tone I don't relate to. Why? I would have been one of those kids in your school about whom you would have thrown up your hands in exasperation, shaking your head about wasted talent, etc., and eventually you would have just addressed my recalcitrance to some moral flaw.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

KristenM said:

We should have been giving billions to encourage higher education and home ownership, rather than keeping people in situations where getting a Section 8 voucher apartment and staying on welfare makes more financial sense than actually getting a job because jobs pay less than the monthly government check and you don't have child

care or a supportive plan to move up from your crappy job.

Queequeg said:

Homeownership - the standards for qualifying for a loan were relaxed by the Clinton and Bush Jr. administrations in order to increase home ownership. It led to the 2008 crash.

Malcolm wrote:

Thats the conservative story. The real reason the crash happened is that investment firms were taking out insurance on bad debt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, December 29th, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Acceptable ways of Transmissions (Lung, Jenang, Wang)

Content:

oldbob said:

Many old practitioners go elsewhere.

Malcolm wrote:

It's the name of the game.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Queequeg said:

it wasn't just Lehman Bros. playing with junk bonds.

Malcolm wrote:

It was mostly that. Has the insurance companies not allowed investment firms to buy insurance on bad debts mixed with good debts (CDO, collateralized debt obligations), AIG, for example, would not have needed a bail out. In fact, every firm that needed a bail out, got one.

<https://www.institutionalinvestor.com/article/b150qdkrd30ggk/the-fall-of-aig-the-untold-story>

Queequeg said:

As of December 31, 2007, AIGFP had a portfolio of credit default swaps totaling \$527 billion, of which \$78 billion was written on multisector CDOs, most of which had some exposure to subprime mortgages. Indeed, it has become widely accepted that without -Cassano and AIGFP around to insure the risk that Wall Street was taking in underwriting these increasingly squirrely assets, the debt bubble might have run out of air far before it did in 2007. In its defense, which shows up, among other places, in an

August 2009 court filing by law firm Weil, Gotshal & Manges in a shareholder lawsuit, AIG argues that it wrote credit default swaps on only the supersenior portion of the multisector CDOs — that is, those payments made first. Incredibly, AIGFP believed it had little real exposure “because the supersenior tranche has priority of payment ahead of even the AAA tranches, [and so] is regarded as having a better-than-AAA rating.”

Malcolm wrote:

And this also played a part:

While that last bit of legal spin is certainly debatable, what soon became crystal clear — and a major problem for AIG — was that as the value of the toxic securities it had insured before 2006 fell, AIG’s counterparties ratcheted up their demands for collateral. At the forefront of these increasingly strident collateral demands was none other than Goldman Sachs Group. Unlike every other Wall Street firm, in 2006, Goldman became nervous about the growing risks its traders perceived in the free-for-all that the market for mortgage-related securities had become. The traders’ concerns eventually bubbled up to the 30th floor of 85 Broad Street, where Goldman’s top executives had their offices, and in December 2006 the firm decided to “get closer to home,” in the words of CFO David Viniar. The firm started to make huge bets that the mortgage market would fall by shorting individual mortgage-backed securities and the newly created ABX index, which was a basket of mortgage-related securities, and by creating synthetic CDOs and selling the risk related to them to the likes of AIG.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Nichiren Shonin's teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

Is the final and complete teaching in human or some being's consciousness or is it a pile of paper?

Malcolm wrote:

There are two kinds of dharma: scripture and realization. Pretty sure QQ is referring the the last.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: NASA Is Hiring Religious Leaders To Prepare For Encounter With Aliens ?

Content:

Giovanni said:

If aliens exist..and mathematics suggest that it is likely, then they are subject to the Three Signs OF Being.

That’s all Dharma students NEED to know. The rest is understandable curiosity.

Aemilius said:

That sounds kind of logical, but in practice it is not like that. It is more like Europeans going to South and North America or in Africa and Australia. Europeans had new conceptual constructions and their own laws and new and amazing weapons with them, and they wanted their gold and other minerals, plus workers for their plantations, and other things...

For example, we hear in some ufo-reports that slavery exists in the stars,... Its methods maybe different and quite modern, but it is still slavery.

Tenma said:

So what are you going to do if aliens exist and we encounter them?

Malcolm wrote:

See what kind of booze they like.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Nichiren Shonin's teachings

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Speaking of the first Buddhist council, it is possible there was a universal council of Buddhists that determined one particular recension of the buddhavacana that is substantially "truer" than later sectarian recensions. The texts concerning it do not date from said council. To the authors of those texts mentioning it, it was long gone mythohistory.

Malcolm wrote:

Ananda did not recite these texts at the first council, for that, Vasubandhu criticizes him. The "I" in "Thus I heard this spoken at one time" of Mahāyāna sūtras is not Ananda.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 9:02 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

I will take the judgy tone on board, Malcolm,

Malcolm wrote:

This, Dan, is illustrative as to why in America structure trumps agency:

The Bill for My Homelessness Was \$54,000



Debt is a hidden burden for Americans experiencing homelessness.  
<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/12/29/opinion/debt-homelessness.html?>

It's the difference between Marshall Mathers and his Cranbrook-educated "gangster" competitors in 8 Mile. Even so, Marshall Mathers, being white, is far less likely to be shot during a routine traffic stop than those black kids with prep school educations.

So when you talk to Americans, you should keep that in mind. Those of us who are not blind, observe that structure limits agents more than you apparently would like to admit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 9:12 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

. On a personal level, I don't judge - I've been hard-working and I've been very slack, it's more that I am responsible for them, to some extent.

Malcolm wrote:

When you are teacher, you do have responsibilities, of course, and boundaries.

As I have told you before, I don't know shit about Australia or Switzerland, or the USSR, and so I don't comment on their cultures or mores. But you seem very keen to comment on what goes on the US, which is understandable, because we are Rome. But you don't understand us, or our history, very well. Even Canadians, like Nemo, don't really understand the US very well, and they live next door. You might read Heather Cox Richardson's daily newsletter. Perhaps it will provide you some insight you lack at present.

.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 10:10 AM

Title: Re: Where did the Buddha go after death? Where is the Buddha now? Where do Buddhas go after death?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Thanks Schrödinger's Yidam. Looks like I'm going to have to go keyword search using Google to scour this room. The ones you shared are good start. Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

It's better to listen to what the Buddha said:

E ma ho! The secret of all perfect buddhas

Is that perfect buddhas do not arise.  
Everything arises from nonarising,  
And even arising never arose.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 9:25 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

Malcolm, I could say the same about your commenting on Zen here on the forum. And also that your comments on Zen have at times been instructive.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know much about Chan or Zen, other than how it has been presented, pro and con in Tibetan sources. I've always been clear about that.

Dan74 said:

I think it's more that my take doesn't always align with yours that is the issue here.

Malcolm wrote:

You don't live here, you have no stake nor voice in the outcomes of our elections, but more importantly, you don't see us clearly and you don't grasp our history and cultures. Your comment about Uncle Toms, for example, is a clear indicator of that.

Dan74 said:

I am not really allowed to say anything?

Malcolm wrote:

You can say whatever you like.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: NASA Is Hiring Religious Leaders To Prepare For Encounter With Aliens ?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

If Mahayana cosmology is traditionally flat Earth, then how exactly does billions of world-systems work here?

Malcolm wrote:

Worlds have kinds of different shapes in Mahayana cosmology.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, December 30th, 2021 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: Nichiren Shonin's teachings

Content:

Aemilius said:

Where does Vasubandhu say that? Elsewhere, in Mahayanasutra-alankara Commentary and in Vyakhyayukti "Principles of Exegesis", Vasubandhu defends the position that Mahayana sutras were taught by the Shakyamuni. By whom were they heard then?

I have read some passages of Vyakhyayukti that have been translated into english. I have heard that Vasubandhu discusses the origin of Mahayana in that work, but I haven't seen it with my own eyes.

Malcolm wrote:

Manjushri, Samantabhadra, etc.

Vasubandhu makes this argument in the Vyakhyayukti. There is a paper on it at academia.edu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 31st, 2021 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

I am also skeptical of big narratives and they generally need a lot of qualifiers. But I do think the pandemic has taken a toll on young people's mental health, which already wasn't in great shape.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, being cooped up with anxious parents won't be good for anyone's mental health.

Dan74 said:

We don't have anywhere near the levels of poverty the US (and to some extent, the UK, thanks, Malcolm) have (the gaps between rich and poor is similar to Canada, 3 times less people in % living on less than \$10 a day and sort of universal health care). We also have much safer cities and much lower rate of violent crime (homicide ~10 times less per capita, rape ~ 4 times less than the US).

Malcolm wrote:

Notice the correlation?

Dan74 said:

It's a cliché but the world really has become a global village, especially the Western

world, so socio-culturally I think there are the same issues everywhere, in a somewhat different mix and intensity.

Malcolm wrote:

Different histories cause similar pressures to play out very differently, in people, and in nations. Without understanding the trauma of Indian Resettlement act of 1830, then the Civil War, then the abandonment of Reconstruction in 1877, and the westward migration of a large portion of the population that supported the Confederacy, and so on, one cannot possibly hope to understand what is happening in the US today. It is no accident that the Don't Tread On Me Flag (Gadsen Flag)—favored by pro-Trumpists and the Tea Party and designed by gentleman from South Carolina during the Revolutionary War—was seized as the symbol of the delinquent branch of the GOP.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 31st, 2021 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Where did the Buddha go after death? Where is the Buddha now? Where do Buddhas go after death?

Content:

Nalanda said:

How is it explained in our tradition?

Would you use the trikaya to answer this question?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, you would. The mind of a buddha is the dharmakāya. The dharmakāya is free of birth and death. A nirmāṇakāya, which is what you are talking about, is an emanation of the sambhogakāya. When a nirmāṇakāya demonstrates the deed of passing into nirvana, it does not go anywhere, no more than a rainbow goes somewhere in the sky when the causes and conditions for its appearance are no longer are present. Similarly, when a nirmāṇakāya manifests the deed of birth, it does not come from anywhere, not more than a rainbow comes from somewhere in the sky when the causes and conditions for its appearance are present.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 31st, 2021 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Where did the Buddha go after death? Where is the Buddha now? Where do Buddhas go after death?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Hey friend, is dharmakaya the same as Dharmadhātu?

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=322592#p322592>

Malcolm wrote:

No. The dharmadhātu (object) is the emptiness that pervades all things, whether sentient or inert. The dharmakāya (subject) is the realization of that emptiness.

Sometimes you see the dharmadhātu equated with the nature of the mind, but this is an incomplete presentation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, December 31st, 2021 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: NASA Is Hiring Religious Leaders To Prepare For Encounter With Aliens ?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

If Mahayana cosmology is traditionally flat Earth, then how exactly does billions of world-systems work here?

Malcolm wrote:

Worlds have kinds of different shapes in Mahayana cosmology.

Johnny Dangerous said:

What texts cover these?

Malcolm wrote:

Avatamska

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Hell

Content:

mechashivaz said:

The hell realms are understood to be real, as real as the experiences we are having now.

Malcolm wrote:

Only as mental projections.

mechashivaz said:

I've heard it said from the Mahayana (or overall Buddhist?) POV the demons doing the torturing in these realms are mind made being, meaning, they only exist as an aspect of "ourselves", therefore there are no demons in a perpetual negative karma feedback loop. However, I'm unable to find sources for this; if any one knows where this is sourced I'd greatly appreciate the info!

Malcolm wrote:

Vasubandhu, 20 verses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 2:25 AM

Title: Re: Buddhist Hell

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

According to certain narratives, didn't Śākyamuni begin his bodhisattva career as a hell torturer when he decided not to torture for a while?

Malcolm wrote:

No, he started his career as a hell-being who offered to take on the suffering of others in hell, according to certain narratives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 3:32 AM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

Since the five physical elements in Buddhism are usually given as earth, air, fire, water and space (akasha) sometimes called aether, what exactly is this last one, akasha/space/ether? I

Malcolm wrote:

It is nonobstruction, according to Buddhist texts. There is also relative space, which is any kind of empty cavity.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: How do I know I have enough bodhichitta?

Content:

jewel123 said:

Hello! How can I determine that my Bodhichitta is sufficient? How to measure it?

What would be the way to understand if I even have it?

Thank you so much!

Malcolm wrote:

If you wish to become a buddha for the benefit of all sentient beings, you have enough bodhicitta.

jewel123 said:

Thank you very much. That wish is sufficient?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 9:29 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

KristenM said:

I'm late to replying...maybe it was merely relaxing the lending standards, but it was also feeding predatory lending practices, going totally unchecked and allowing people to get way over their heads in debt. The same goes for educational loans. You can provide people with better opportunities to make sensible investments without allowing people to become victims of financial abuse. You're more an expert than I am in this stuff, though.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, for example, Wells Fargo was forcing its loan associates to give loans to basically anyone who has a pulse.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

The following is all self-explanatory and as stated, it explicitly stressed that this prophecy must be shared as widely as possible to all sentient beings at this time to avert the disasters predicted.

Malcolm wrote:

This text is the Tibetan equivalent of a chain letter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: ChNN and his awakening

Content:

Nalanda said:

ChNN is an awakened person - Malcolm

Source: <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=66939#p66939>

Does this mean he was a Bodhisattva....?

Malcolm wrote:

It means he was an awakened person, a bodhisattva on the stages.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 9:42 PM

Title: Re: ChNN and his awakening

Content:

jmlee369 said:

Even in The Life and Times of Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö: The Great Biography, you can see how students of Jamyang Khyentse Chokyi Lodro made various comments of how they did not feel devotion or faith to this or that lama, which was fine as they had no student-teacher relationship with those lamas.

Malcolm wrote:

It's fine even if they did have a teacher student relationship. Faith is not something one can or should contrive. HHDL has discussed this at length. All this insistence on mandatory pure vision just turns people into neurotic messes and cult followers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 9:46 PM

Title: Re: Deepen Your Daily Practice with Khenpo Samdup Rinpoche (many transmissions from Drikung Kagyu Practice Book)

Content:

chokyi lodro said:

I wonder, would this be suitable for someone like me?

I have taken Refuge (from a lovely karma kagyu lama) some years ago, although circumstances including coronavirus have prevented me from deepening that connection. I'm a bit of a lamrim aficionado, but that's just because I find it easy to understand. I've never received any transmissions; I just practice analytical meditation. Any thoughts would be welcome.

Malcolm wrote:

One should not promiscuously take luns. One should know why one is receiving a lung for this and that practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 1st, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

alx said:

Does anybody know when the Sambhogakaya becomes visible - which Bhumi please?

Thnx Guys Alx

Malcolm wrote:

Eighth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 2:39 AM



Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Nemo said:

. A first step would be the separation of capital and the state.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummmm....that is modern day neoliberalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 7:41 AM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The basic definition of space is found in Abhidharma. That's the one we use in Buddhadharma.

Ode to Joy said:

Since the five physical elements in Buddhism are usually given as earth, air, fire, water and space (akasha) sometimes called aether, what exactly is this last one, akasha/space/ether? I

Malcolm wrote:

It is nonobstruction, according to Buddhist texts. There is also relative space, which is any kind of empty cavity.

Ode to Joy said:

Thank you for that answer. I understand about the idea of nonobstruction but I am curious if there is any other function of this element besides simple nonobstruction and how does it exactly get differentiated from the relative space you mentioned? How is "akasha-dhatu" different from "infinite space" or unconditioned space? In a way, the two concepts sound so similar I'm not clear what is the distinction. For instance, is there any sense in Buddhism that the element akasha is similar to this Hindu definition found in the Monier-Williams Sanskrit-English lexicon: "the subtle and ethereal fluid (supposed to fill and pervade the universe and to be the peculiar vehicle of life and of sound) per Vedanta"? Or is the Buddhist concept not like the Vedanta philosophy. Another interesting point is that Sanskrit akasha apparently comes from the root kAsh meaning "to shine, to appear, to be visible, to be brilliant" whence other common words like prakAsha. Which points to something beyond vacuity or mere nonobstruction - not that the BUddhist texts have to be concerned with the etymology of the word of course, Im not suggesting that. But that root syllable gives the impression that akasha could be a medium for light to propagate - and again Im not suggesting that this has anything to do with Buddhist teachings. Actually, the reason I even ask is because in Phillipe Cornu's book Tibetan Astrology, he specifically (at least, his translator from French) calls akasha as "aether", rather than "space". In English, "aether" has a special meaning, quite different from "space" and I am curious as to whether Mr. Cornu had a particular

reason for using this term.

And what do we make of this statement on the Wikipedia page of Akasha in the Buddhism section: "The Vaibhashika, an early school of Buddhist philosophy, hold the existence of akasha to be real"? What does it mean to say that "akasha is real" and what would it mean to claim it is not real?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 8:19 PM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

The following is all self-explanatory and as stated, it explicitly stressed that this prophecy must be shared as widely as possible to all sentient beings at this time to avert the disasters predicted.

Malcolm wrote:

This text is the Tibetan equivalent of a chain letter.

Ode to Joy said:

Its teachings are self-explanatory, it is a profoundly powerful and important text, crucial at this very moment. It clearly states the benefits for those who understand and have faith, as opposed to those who don't.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, like a chain letter. There is no point in distributing such texts. They make people unreasonably fearful & paranoid.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 8:28 PM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The basic definition of space is found in Abhidharma. That's the one we use in Buddhadharma.

Ode to Joy said:

Okay. So what is the meaning of this statement: "The Vaibhashika, an early school of Buddhist philosophy, hold the existence of akasha to be real"? Is it just a case of Vaibhashika considering everything to be real, including space. And is akasha as a "mahabhuta" the same thing as unconditioned void between universes or world systems described in chapter one of Kalacakra Tantra?

Malcolm wrote:

Space is not a mahabhuta, but it is a dhatu. Unconditioned space is considered "real"

in the sense that it is a dharma, that's all, along with the two cessations.

Kalacakra is an entirely different thing. It's "particles of space" are compounded. But this idea has no relevance outside of the Kalacakra system,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 9:20 PM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

PeterC said:

I don't have the transmission for that. What's the Tibetan title, and what makes it a sutra? Does it eg call itself མཛྲ་?

GrapeLover said:

I were just going by the format & content really, in that it starts:

I prostrate to all the Buddhas and the Bodhisattvas. Thus have I heard at one time, while the Buddha was staying at Bodhgaya...

and continues with a Mahayana sutra-style narrative of Shakyamuni. I'd thought that kind of general structure was what the OP meant by 'presented in the form of a Sutra'. That one doesn't call itself do, but there's another terma of Tennyi Lingpa with a similar format called "Phag-pa Chog-chui Mun-pa Tham-ched Nam-par Sel-wa Zhe-ja-wa Theg-pa Chen-poi Do" (sorry, don't have access to any more standardised transliteration)—— shares a title with a longer 'actual' sutra

I don't mean to make any kind of claim or implication with respect to the text in the OP though

PeterC said:

That's a fair question - whether it starts with evam maya srutam etc. I guess I was questioning whether anything which we accept as a sutra had been revealed in tibet as a pure vision. If there is, I'm not aware of it. That's an easily falsifiable statement though.

Malcolm wrote:

There are a number of texts in the collection of dharani that likely began life as Chinese pseudographia before they were translated into Tibetan. Then there is the much disputed Shurangama Sutra; the Vajrasamadhi Sutra, a Korean composition translated into Tibetan, and so on. So there are a number of texts in the Kenjur of dubious origin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Prophecies of Dolpopa

Content:

Terma said:

"The etymology of 'Dolpo' is still unknown, though the word is found in several religious teachings of the Buddha...the word was uttered by the Buddha in 6th century BC while predicting the birth of the great 13th century scholar, Dolpopa Sherab Gyaltzen."

Malcolm wrote:

Highly unlikely.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

Suppose we lived in the world, where being a selfish greedy asshole was never acceptable. Where people would get viscerally ill at just imagining themselves behaving in such a way. How would capitalism work in such a world?

Well, I think there are capitalists like that. There are companies in capitalist economies that are majority worker-owned. There are companies where employees are treated like family. It is possible to run an ethical and successful business, at least sometimes.

Sure, capitalism encourages the ruthless pursuit of profit. Milton Friedman taught that the sole responsibility was to the shareholders. So we can blame the system and rightly so. But at the end of the day, it is human beings taking advantage of the system in an unscrupulous unprincipled way. Or gradually coming to do so more and more, as is often the case.

But they don't all do so.

To use a crude analogy, capitalism is bad in the same way that guns are bad - both are bound to be misused. Well, in case of capitalism, this misuse isn't even considered to be misuse. So it's kinda worse. But basically capitalism needs control in the same way that guns need control, because human beings are bound to ride roughshod over their kind. That's something we should look at in a deeper, more creative way, not instead of changing the system, but as well as, IMO.

Malcolm wrote:

What you are referring to is European-styled Capitalism, aka Coordinated Market Economies, which trade growth for stability. The US—and to a lesser extent—England, Canada, Australia and New Zealand have liberal market economies, which trade stability for growth.

But the issue with international capitalism is that the watchdogs of it, the WTO, etc., almost always side with corporate interests over national interests, under the present neoliberal principles which govern it, and to which signatories of the treaty that gave birth to the WTO are bound by law to uphold. In other words, neoliberalism favors liberal market economics on an international scale, as opposed to coordinated market economics, something which underdeveloped economies, like India, and formerly, China, actually insist upon. There are no unions in China, for example.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Prophecies of Dolpopa

Content:

Terma said:

"The etymology of 'Dolpo' is still unknown, though the word is found in several religious teachings of the Buddha...the word was uttered by the Buddha in 6th century BC while predicting the birth of the great 13th century scholar, Dolpopa Sherab Gyaltzen."

Malcolm wrote:

Highly unlikely.

Terma said:

Agreed. This is in general, a topic that one can chase their own tail over.

Malcolm wrote:

It's like the use of the Mañjuśrīmūla Kalpa. Many people are predicted using the same passages...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 2nd, 2022 at 11:53 PM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

PeterC said:

Am I right in thinking that these all claimed to originate from a historical figure in this world (the Buddha, Vimalakirti, Srimaladevi, etc), and not a visionary revelation?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. The Vajrasamadhi Sūtra (Toh. 135) was is text critically analyzed by Robert Buswell in <https://press.princeton.edu/books/hardcover/9780691654164/the-formation-of-chan-ideology-in-china-and-korea>:

This book is a translation and study of the Vajrasamadhi-Sutra and an examination of its broad implications for the development of East Asian Buddhism. The Vajrasamadhi-Sutra was traditionally assumed to have been translated from Sanskrit, but some modern scholars, principally in Japan, have proposed that it is instead an indigenous

Chinese composition. In contrast to both of these views, Robert Buswell maintains it was written in Korea around A.D. 685 by a Korean adept affiliated with the East Mountain school of the nascent Chinese Ch'an tradition. He thus considers it to be the oldest work of Korean Ch'an (or Son, which in Japan became known as the Zen school), and the second-oldest work of the sinitic Ch'an tradition as a whole. Buswell makes his case for the scripture's dating, authorship, and provenance by placing the sutra in the context of Buddhist doctrinal writings and early Ch'an literature in China and Korea. This approach leads him to an extensive analysis of the origins of Ch'an ideology in both countries and of the principal trends in the sinicization of Buddhism. Buddhism has typically been studied in terms of independent national traditions, but Buswell maintains that the history of religion in China, Korea, and Japan should be treated as a whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 1:29 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Okay, I haven't read through this thread thoroughly; but is it written by Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö or not?

Malcolm wrote:

No. It is a random, anonymous prediction text, posing as Buddhavacana, that circulated, like a chain letter, in Eastern Tibet in the early twentieth century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Okay, I haven't read through this thread thoroughly; but is it written by Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö or not?

Malcolm wrote:

No. It is a random, anonymous prediction text, posing as Buddhavacana, that circulated, like a chain letter, in Eastern Tibet in the early twentieth century.

Tenma said:

Like the Middle Ages, did different Tibetan writers ever try attributing their works to famous writers (much as a random Medieval scholar might claim their text was written by Aristotle!) and was that a common practice?

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, many of Milarepa's songs are clearly forgeries. There are a number of fake Sakya Pandita texts, etc, and so on. And then, depending on your level of incredulity, many

termas...not to mention Mahāyāna sūtras in general, etc., many texts attributed to Nāgārjuna, etc.

Tenma said:

Either way, people are still going to believe in this anonymous text and its mantra, whether criticized or not!

Malcolm wrote:

People believe all kinds of things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Chenda said:

In BDK America's translation of <https://bdkamerica.org/download/1875>, the term regular mantra gets used from Chapter Seven (606b) onwards. While I don't think the sutra is in any way relevant to my current level of studies, I am interested in knowing the context behind the term.

Malcolm wrote:

The term in the Tibetan text is rang gi sngags, one's personal mantra, that's all, nothing more.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 4:03 AM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Space is not a mahabhuta, but it is a dhatu. Unconditioned space is considered "real" in the sense that it is a dharma, that's all, along with the two cessations.

Kalacakra is an entirely different thing. It's "particles of space" are compounded. But this idea has no relevance outside of the Kalacakra system,

Ode to Joy said:

The space-particles, specifically connected to the genesis of a new universe, are a different thing than what I was thinking of which is Kalacakra Tantra, chapter 1, verse 10 where it's stated:

"Outside of that, [the limit of wind to the border of wind], is the single void (shunyameka), separate from the three existences, without qualities and bereft of properties (nirgunam tattvahina)".

I am wondering if the space of this "nirgunam tattvahina" single void outside of our

universe so specifically described here is the same as the space within the border of wind and border of Meru, the space for the continents, Meru, wheel of houses and stars. In other words, is it akasha-dhatu? Since the emphasis on lack of qualities and reality (Tattva) for this space is this meant to suggest that the space within our universe holds certain qualities and properties..such as those ascribed to "aether" in Veda and medieval West and that some people talk about today. ( I understand that Abhidharma wouldnt support this idea). Especially since importance is placed on the element of wind as the basis of the universe. Does the wind element somehow condition the space element within samsara? This could have something to do with the Vedic theories and remember that in Kalacakra Buddha explains that he himself taught the 4 Vedas.

Malcolm wrote:

The dhātu of space pervades everything without obstruction, so no, that is the just the void between worlds.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 4:08 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Chenda said:

In BDK America's translation of <https://bdkamerica.org/download/1875>, the term regular mantra gets used from Chapter Seven (606b) onwards. While I don't think the sutra is in any way relevant to my current level of studies, I am interested in knowing the context behind the term.

Malcolm wrote:

The term in the Tibetan text is rang gi sngags, one's personal mantra, that's all, nothing more.

Chenda said:

And this may refer to any mantra of one's choosing?

Malcolm wrote:

No, it refers to the mantra one has received from one's ācārya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 4:14 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Chenda said:

In BDK America's translation of <https://bdkamerica.org/download/1875>, the term regular mantra gets used from Chapter Seven (606b) onwards. While I don't think the sutra is in any way relevant to my current level of studies, I am interested in knowing the context behind the term.



Malcolm wrote:

The term in the Tibetan text is rang gi sngags, one's personal mantra, that's all, nothing more.

Ode to Joy said:

BDK's translation is from the Chinese translation, not the Tibetan. Perhaps the Chinese is also "one's own", but the translator used the word "regular". Or, perhaps the Chinese does say "regular". In either case the sense is comparable: familiarity, regularity, primacy, default, go-to, automatic, personal, main.

Malcolm wrote:

The original is in Sanskrit, now lost. Nevertheless, it just means one's personal mantra, nothing more. The Tibetan is very clear.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 4:17 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

That line is glossed (Im not exactly sure by whom)

Malcolm wrote:

Adam's translation is much better than the one you've posted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 6:02 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

That line is glossed (Im not exactly sure by whom)

Malcolm wrote:

Adam's translation is much better than the one you've posted.

Ode to Joy said:

...the translation posted here is accompanied by the following interesting comments:

"...an American translator of Tibetan Buddhist texts, Malcolm Smith, who is a long-term student of Chogyal Namkhai Norbu, a well-known teacher of Dzogchen practices, attested to the accuracy of the translation below on the Tibetan Buddhist Altar

Facebook page,<sup>5</sup> saying: "There is no problem with the translation, it is fine as it is."

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, that was based on a superficial examination of the text I made many years ago. Adam's is much better since he consulted multiple editions and had the assistance of a direct disciple of JKCL, Alak Zankar Rinpoche. But if you looked a little further, I also disputed the idea that the dates were necessarily in the immediate future, etc.

I don't give much credit to prediction texts. They are too vague and can be read a hundred ways.

Ode to Joy said:

No further details are offered as to this but this indicates a sort of "mind terma" or other kind of terma which is perfectly reasonable for someone like Jamyang Khyentse Chokyi Lodro.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a mind terma of JKCL.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 6:07 AM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The dhātu of space pervades everything without obstruction, so no, that is the just the void between worlds.

Ode to Joy said:

So the kind of space indicated by the line "tad bahye shunyamekam tribhuvanarahitam nirgunam tattvahnām" ("Outside of that [the three worlds] is the single void, separate from the three existences, without qualities and bereft of properties") is simply referring to the ordinary akasha-dhatu found within the world system, as taught in Abhidharma...

Malcolm wrote:

It is referring to compounded space as dimension and area, not uncompounded space, which is unimpeded and penetrates mount meru, and cannot be conceived of as outside the three realms, and so on.

Ode to Joy said:

I see how this is sensible, space is space after all, but still curious why such a specific description of in Kalacakra. And also curious about Phillipe Cornu's use of the specific term "aether" in his Tibetan Cosmology to render the space element.

Malcolm wrote:

You'll have to ask him. For me personally, it makes no sense to confuse things by translating nam mkha' as aether.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 6:10 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

incidentally it doesn't specify "the mantra given by one's acarya".

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the tantra does in general.

Ode to Joy said:

One may come to adopt a mantra as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself due to karma from previous lives, without the direct intercession of a teacher in this life.

Malcolm wrote:

No, one may not. Such practice is disallowed. You should consult Sakya Pandita on this point in his Differentiation of the Three Codes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Prophecies of Dolpopa

Content:

Terma said:

Agreed. This is in general, a topic that one can chase their own tail over.

Malcolm wrote:

It's like the use of the Mañjuśrīmūla Kalpa. Many people are predicted using the same passages...

Tenma said:

Over in the sectarian spirit cult, I've seen their deceased teacher

Malcolm wrote:

Not deceased. Alive and living in Spain.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 11:14 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

What is still not clear is where the text or perhaps body of texts originally came from

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. That alone makes it of dubious value. It may be an utter forgery.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 11:33 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

One may come to adopt a mantra as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself due to karma from previous lives, without the direct intercession of a teacher in this life.

No, one may not. Such practice is disallowed. You should consult Sakya Pandita on this point in his Differentiation of the Three Codes.

Ode to Joy said:

There are too many teachings to name which contradict that, that's alright.

Malcolm wrote:

There are no such teachings in Buddhadharma which contradict this. You can't name even one. For example, the Vajramāla Tantra states:

A mantra is not to be given  
to a sentient being who has not received empowerment,  
nor should the wise show an image  
or a book to such a one.

Similar admonitions occur in Kālacakra, Abhidhānottaratantra, Mahāmudrātilaka, and so on. As far as practicing secret mantra goes without a proper teacher and empowerment, this is strictly prohibited for the same reason. The Mahāmudrātilaka states:

Whoever pridefully elucidates  
the tantras and upadeśas to one lacking empowerment  
as soon as they die, both master and disciple  
go to hell, even if siddhi is obtained.

And:

If one pleases the guru, the king of mantras  
will doubtlessly be attained.

If it is not attained in that way, it is faulty,

and even if one receives a mantra, it will not be effective.

Even in lower tantras, it is the same, for example, the Vairocana-abhisambodhi states:

Without empowerment, the source of secret gnosis,  
there is no mantra.

And of course in the Tenjur, there are hundreds of such admonitions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 12:58 PM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

So..."nirgunam tattvahinam" space - devoid of qualities and apart from reality - is compounded space?

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, according to the commentary by Lama Dampa (who composed the most extensive Tibetan commentary on the text), it refers to a void with lacks qualities. Hinam in this context refers to the ordinary five elements, tattva refers to the principle (tattvahinam, de nyid kyis dman pa'o) which is the single void (stong pa gcig pu) that pervades the five elements, so it is not space at all in the normal sense of the term. So this translation you are relying on is also slightly incorrect. It should be something like:

Outside that is the single void, separate from the three realms, the principle devoid of qualities that [pervades] the inferior [elements].

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 8:58 PM

Title: Re: How can you tell if a lama is a monk? Confused about robes.

Content:

Nalanda said:

I know white robes are for lay teachers.

But sometimes you see orange/red colored robe wearing lama...with hair or long hair.

Then I learned that Dzongsar Khyentse Rinpoche isn't a monk.

So how can I know if a lama is a monastic?

Are khenchen, khenpo and geshe monastics?

Malcolm wrote:

You can figure it out based on whether they wear a lower robe (monk) or a half chuba

(upasaka).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: How can you tell if a lama is a monk? Confused about robes.

Content:

Nalanda said:

I know white robes are for lay teachers.

But sometimes you see orange/red colored robe wearing lama...with hair or long hair.

Then I learned that Dzongsar Khyentse Rinpoche isn't a monk.

So how can I know if a lama is a monastic?

Are khenchen, khenpo and geshes monastics?

KathyLauren said:

One way would be to ask, either the lama himself or someone in his entourage.

Geshe is an academic degree, like doctor of divinity. In the old days, most geshes would have been monks. That is less true nowadays. I knew a couple of geshes who were lay people. Both had been monks in the past, but had given up their robes when they moved to the West. The geshe degree, of course, remains.

Om mani padme hum

Kathy

Malcolm wrote:

In general, in the Gelug school, if you give up your monastic vows you also give up the title "Geshe."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 9:19 PM

Title: Re: How can you tell if a lama is a monk? Confused about robes.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

In general, in the Gelug school, if you give up your monastic vows you also give up the title "Geshe."

KathyLauren said:

Interesting. Of the two gentlemen I knew, both Gelugpa, one went by the title 'Lama', and the other, who taught at the local university, went by 'Professor'. So that makes sense.

However, in both cases, their students referred to them as 'geshe-la', as a sign of respect, in recognition that the degree was something earned by hard work.

Om mani padme hum  
Kathy

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but in Old Tibet, their career would have been finished.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

Everything about the sutra...

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a sūtra. One, the system of animal years is unknown in any text uttered by the Buddha. Two, the so-called "mantra" in the text is clearly just a Tibetan phrase with svāhā appended to it. Not harmful in and of itself, but also not a valid mantra.

Ode to Joy said:

What other texts in the other collected works of other masters are you going to question as to their validity, and on what grounds? You will need to second guess the whole process of how such collections are compiled, the knowledge and qualifications of the individuals and communities doing the compiling and so forth.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many dubious texts found in the collected works of various people, just as there are dubious texts found in the Kenjur and Tenjur. Buton excluded hundreds of tantras from the Kenjur because, in his opinion, they were of dubious origin. Ngorchen Kunga Zangpo gives an entire list of kriya tantras, including the Tārā Tantra, which are forgeries, in his opinion.

For example, I have found texts authored by Tibetans that were repurposed as termas. In one case, a core text of Lamdre authored by Sachen Kunga Nyingpo was repurposed and included in the collected termas of a rather famous 17th century tertön, whose name I won't mention, because some feelings might be hurt.

There are a lot of politics around what gets included and excluded from a given collection. So yes, there is often a "need to second guess the whole process of how such collections are compiled, the knowledge and qualifications of the individuals and communities doing the compiling and so forth..."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 10:50 PM

Title: Re: 5 Elements

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

So..."nirgunam tattvahinam" space - devoid of qualities and apart from reality - is compounded space?

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, according to the commentary by Lama Dampa (who composed the most extensive Tibetan commentary on the text), it refers to a void with lacks qualities. Hinam in this context refers to the ordinary five elements, tattva refers to the principle (tattvahinam, de nyid kyis dman pa'o) which is the single void (stong pa gcig pu) that pervades the five elements, so it is not space at all in the normal sense of the term. So this translation you are relying on is also slightly incorrect. It should be something like:

Outside that is the single void, separate from the three realms, the principle devoid of qualities that [pervades] the inferior [elements].

Ode to Joy said:

Thanks for that citation it's interesting. The whole topic is difficult to think about I'm still not clear on the difference between ordinary space and the single void. If a single void pervades even the akasha dhatu does that mean something is being pervaded and what could that thing be? Otherwise it would be space pervading space which sounds counterintuitive. What is the exact difference between the single void and the ordinary akasha element - is there a difference? Maybe this is why you find the word aether to distinguish it from "the principle devoid of qualities that pervades the inferior elements" because people are trying to comprehend space pervaded by space.

Malcolm wrote:

The commentary makes it clear that this single void is not the same as "space with qualities." Other than that, there is not much else on this point.

Basically, the quality of "formed" space is sound, whose particles correspond to taste, and who permeate the other four elements and provide space between objects. See Ornament of Stainless Light, Khedrup Norzang Gyatso, pg. 79, and page 87m, where he discusses this passage specifically. He says this space, which is a dimension where the particles of the five elements are disconnected, is a "mere emptiness" or as I translated above, a void.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 11:33 PM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:



Ode to Joy said:

Those are all good citations, the meaning of which is clear and well known and undisputed.

For my part, I submit The Sutra that Brings Together the Contemplations of All the Buddhas, where there are statements such as:

""Great monk, I have heard that the skillful means of the teacher is a path in which one practices howsoever. Can that be understood as just the present [state]?" "

"To which came the reply, "O son of good lineage, it is indeed suitable to say that the [path] is whatever occurs in the present".

Malcolm wrote:

This is not a citation that proves your point on any level, you've also misunderstood the context of the passage, which concerns Black Liberation (thar pa nag po) and his servant Danpag.

In any case, you will not find in any Dzogchen text your central claim:

One may come to adopt a mantra as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself due to karma from previous lives, without the direct intercession of a teacher in this life.

This is just your own fabrication, with no support from any source.

I am afraid here, you are closer to Black Liberation than Danpag.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 3rd, 2022 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: When did the Buddha teach the Prajñāpāramitā and Pure Land Sūtra?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Possibly. It strikes me as odd that there isn't a Mahāyāna "life of the Buddha" text, or several, that outline the supposed chronology of the sūtras to the śrāvakas and the bodhisattvas.

Malcolm wrote:

Sapan gives somewhat of an account. But I have not taken to the time to summarize it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:38 AM

Title: Re: Being on the high bhumis without knowing?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are three stages: weak, medium, and strong. The first is practiced in secret, the

second, in your back yard, only the third can be carried out in the marketplace.

Sādhaka said:

Is this all explained in the above-mentioned text?

Of course there are a few extensive texts on Lamdre out there in English, however I'm not practicing Sakya Lamdre as of now, and currently have other studies; therefore am hoping that Jetsun Drakpa Gyaltzen's text is available in English.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

It is not yet available in English.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 2:56 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

PeterC said:

Very, very little is self-explanatory. One point that is absolutely not self-explanatory in this text is which century it refers to, for instance.

Ode to Joy said:

Since the Master revealed the text in the 1950s

Malcolm wrote:

No, he collated it from two different source texts, as the 1979 colophon clearly states:

ston mchod thub pa'i dbang po'i ma 'ongs lung bstan 'di la yi ge 'dra min gnyis snang yang...

Literally, "Though this prediction by the supreme teacher, the powerful Muni, appears in two different texts..."

In fact, the introduction to the four volume set of predictions published by Palyul (lung bstan phyogs btus/. TBRC W3CN532. 4 vols. dpal yul rdzong /: dpal ya chen o rgyan bsam gtan gling /, [n.d.]. <http://tbrc.org/link?RID=W3CN532> ) states on page 1:

Here, though the mother text of this prediction of the future that originates in sūtra was found in Ngari in the past, because its origin was unknown, it was neglected for some time. Later, the mother text was found in a collection of prediction texts at Rahor, Trakgo Dzongtsang, with slightly different wording. Jamyang Khyentse Chokyi Lodo collected these (phyogs bsdu mdzad) in India...

Then this introduction just goes on to say it was published in Delhi in 1979, etc. And also it adds that as the later mother text (the one from Rahor) was thought to be uncorrupted, this is the version presented in the Karma Kagyu publication.

Thus, it is most definitely not a modern text, it is most definitely not a terma, and it is most definitely one of two witnesses—one from Ngari in western Tibet, one from Rahor, in Kham—collected, but not revealed, by Jamyang Khyentse Chokyi Lodo.

Ode to Joy said:

it is perfectly reasonable to accept that it refers to a current 60 year cycle, and not hundreds of years in the future.

Malcolm wrote:

In fact, since there are different versions of the text which predate JKCL, these predicted events could have happened hundreds of years ago, especially since it is claimed it is a prediction sourced in the sūtras.

Ode to Joy said:

Benedictory Verses for The Clarifying Light: A Prophecy of the Future  
by Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö

Malcolm wrote:

This a separate text.

This prediction text also exists in a form attributed to Dujdom Rinpoche, Jigdral Yeshe Dorje.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 3:01 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

As for your comments on Dzogchen, I submit that the entire body of Dzogchen outlines a path that is entirely non conceptual and beyond mind, and it states endlessly that it transcends the dialectics of the lower 8 vehicles

Malcolm wrote:

It does not mean that empowerment is not required. Empowerment is required in Dzogchen, point is made very clearly in the Self-Arisen Vidyā Tantra, the Sound Tantra, which is the root tantra of all Dzogchen teachings, and others.

It also does not provide justification for your initial claim, " One may come to adopt a mantra as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself due to karma from previous lives, without the direct intercession of a teacher in this life."

You really ought not argue with me about such issues. You are just making yourself look pompous and foolish.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 3:11 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Tenma said:

What was the origin of these Benedictory Verses, out of curiosity?

Malcolm wrote:

The smon lam is not an issue at all.

Tenma said:

Is the term "prophecy" correct in translation like in English or are there some underlying things we need to know about rather than just meaning a "prediction"?

Malcolm wrote:

ma 'ongs lung bstan: literally a declaration (vyākaraṇa, lung bstan) about what has not yet come to pass (anāgata, ma 'ongs).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 3:24 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Tenma said:

What was the origin of these Benedictory Verses, out of curiosity?

Malcolm wrote:

The smon lam is not an issue at all.

Tenma said:

Is the term "prophecy" correct in translation like in English or are there some underlying things we need to know about rather than just meaning a "prediction"?

Malcolm wrote:

ma 'ongs lung bstan: literally a declaration (vyākaraṇa, lung bstan) about what has not

yet come to pass (anāgata, ma 'ongs).

Tenma said:

I'm assuming that the "declaration about what has not yet come to pass" in the smon lam may refer to something else I guess rather than the alleged prophecy text in that case?

Also, what other prophecy texts in the Himalayas have been made in the past with similar sorts of wording, styles, themes, etc., whether on the local level or not? And would you count Delog Drolma as a visionary who would expound ma 'ongs lung bstan even though she was more about saying who was where at birth or are there different categories of a "visionary"? And how different would this be from Tibetan divinatory terms?

Malcolm wrote:

Generally, most predictions come from termas, can be quite cryptic, often include events that have already happened to bolster their credibility, are sometimes employed by tertons for political leverage, and so on.

Most (but not all) delogs are uneducated Tibetan women, ordinary people who wake up from comas, and report visions of the six realms, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 3:29 AM

Title: Re: Jamyang Khyentse Chökyi Lodrö's Prophecy of Things to Come?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

But as with any prophecy, one wouldn't know until the time comes; just as for instance the Buddha's predictions about the Abrahamic lineage given in the Kalacakra Tantra

Malcolm wrote:

Was written in the mid-10th century, so no.

Ode to Joy said:

as with the line of Indian kings prophesied in the Manjushri Mula Kalpa;

Malcolm wrote:

Was written no earlier than the 7th century, so no.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 3:48 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It also does not provide justification for your initial claim, " One may come to adopt a mantra as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself due to karma from previous lives, without the direct intercession of a teacher in this life."

Ode to Joy said:

If so, then one should not be able to adopt the mantra "Om Mani Padme Hum" as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself.

Malcolm wrote:

In the sūtra where it is first found, the Karaṇḍavyūha, it is specified that the maṇi must be bestowed in a mandala rite. The text also discusses the qualities of the master (ācārya), maṇḍalas, etc. So, correct, the maṇi should not just be adopted as a mantra. In practice, people do so, and it is somewhat harmless, but it does not actually correspond how it is taught in that text.

In the tantra in question, a personal mantra is the mantra given during empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 4:13 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

If so, then one should not be able to adopt the mantra "Om Mani Padme Hum" as one's personal, regular mantra by oneself.

Malcolm wrote:

In the sūtra where it is first found, the Karaṇḍavyūha, it is specified that the maṇi must be bestowed in a mandala rite. The text also discusses the qualities of the master (ācārya), maṇḍalas, etc. So, correct, the maṇi should be just be adopted as a mantra. In practice, people do so, and it is somewhat harmless, but it does not actually correspond how it is taught in that text.

In the tantra in question, a personal mantra is the mantra given during empowerment.

Tenma said:

How does a complex, secret mantra become a commonplace mantra recited by everyone such as that of the Maṇi mantra? Any recommended sources on this phenomenon?

Malcolm wrote:

Largely because of Atisha. He revived the practice in Tibet.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 7:02 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Malcolm holds the Acharya title and has been practicing Dzogchen and Buddhism for decades. Anyone who browses these forums regularly also knows that he is an extremely meticulously translator, having published several books, and that he places a lot of importance on terminology, grammar and semantics.

Tell us, what are your Buddhist credentials?

Ode to Joy said:

Appeal to authority fallacy isn't going to help you here I'm afraid, we are talking about something specific. He has stated that people reciting the 6 syllable mantra is "somewhat harmless" - not even beneficial - which is an extraordinary statement, completely against the Buddhist spirit, I am sure you can agree. Or perhaps you don't think that laypeople should be allowed to recite the Mani mantra. Fine...you're allowed to think that.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. Reciting some mantras without transmission is somewhat harmless, and not of much benefit. Dharanis on the other hand, for the most part do not require transmission, but vidya mantras always do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 10:15 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

another poster here say that it WAS alright to recite dharanis from the Tantra class?

Malcolm wrote:

Another poster did not say this. Another poster said certain dharanis. The mani is a vidya mantra, it requires transmission. It's that simple.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 10:57 AM

Title: Re: Regular mantra as opposed to...?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

So in other words that sutra, Karandavyuha, is indeed found in the sutra section. Why did you say it was in the Tantra section?

Malcolm wrote:

I didn't. I said it was considered a kalpa tantra. There is no independent section for this class of tantra. I explained what that meant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 11:46 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, photons are empirically detectable, unlike say, Mt. Meru.

Ode to Joy said:

Whether or not photons do empirically exist (there are many Buddhist sutra teachings on the nature of light which in my opinion are much more valuable than modern scientific ones), Mt Meru isn't meant to be empirically detectable, it's a spiritual phenomenon.

Malcolm wrote:

So it isn't responsible for the sky being blue?

Ode to Joy said:

What troubles me is why these very easily understood teachings which are founded on simple principles cause people so much trauma. And why people are aggrieved at Buddhists who follow the Buddha's teaching. Shouldn't they also be aggrieved at the Buddha for teaching a spiritual cosmology and not the current nihilist one - which has, after all, only existed for the last 500 out of the countless years and kalpas of our universe.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddha didn't teach a "spiritual cosmology." Buddhists taught a version of samsara's three realms based on an axial mountain cosmology, which has since been falsified.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 11:49 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Ode to Joy said:

To describe him as having limited knowledge is not right at all.



Malcolm wrote:

It's perfectly fine. As Dharmakirti quipped, Buddha's omniscience did not extend to knowing the number of worms in the ground.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:02 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

(I'm not sure if he understood the moon wasn't really a 'disc' as it appears in visualization practice).

Although he seemed a bit perplexed, as the night went on, the lama was very eager to learn all sorts of new things he'd never been taught growing up in a monastery.

As lovely as Buddhist cosmology is, with the universe having directions like East and West for example, and as useful as Buddhist astrology might be for offering a unified theory of everything, it all pales compared to even the limited scientific knowledge we have of the known universe so far.

Sorry, I know that's going to piss some folks off.

Ode to Joy said:

In fact, there are many grounds to suppose that the Sun and Moon are indeed discs.

Malcolm wrote:

Such as?

Ode to Joy said:

Instead, a nihilistic universe

Malcolm wrote:

Universes can't be nihilistic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:06 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's perfectly fine. As Dharmakirti quipped, Buddha's omniscience did not extend to knowing the number of worms in the ground.

Ode to Joy said:  
In the Shurangama Sutra,

Malcolm wrote:  
It's a Chinese pseudographia, so I really don't care what it says.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:13 PM  
Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?  
Content:

Ode to Joy said:  
"Buddhist cosmology is doubtlessly true because it comes from the teachings of the Buddha,

Malcolm wrote:  
Fallacy of argument from authority, I, and most people, don't consider ancient Buddhist texts on cosmology authoritative descriptions of the physical universe.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:17 PM  
Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?  
Content:

Ode to Joy said:  
On the contrary, Buddhist cosmology is entirely spiritual: Tell me how many times the word "Spiritual" occurs below in these excerpts from A Cascading Waterfall of Nectar. I

Malcolm wrote:  
It really doesn't matter how many times Trinley Norbu uses the word "spiritual." It does not make his point of view about Buddhist cosmology valid.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 12:20 PM  
Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
It's a Chinese pseudographia, so I really don't care what it says.

Ode to Joy said:  
Well, since you mentioned Dharmakirti stating that Buddha couldn't count the number worms in the ground, and there is a Buddhist classic, whether it's to your liking or not, in

which a statement is found that Buddha could count the number of raindrops that fell in a day, you can't blame a person for comparing the two - they eminently invite contrast and comparison.

Malcolm wrote:

The difference is that Dharmakīrti was a real person, whereas the Buddha of the Shūrngama is a fictional character.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 4th, 2022 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

"The Śūrngama Sūtra was translated into Tibetan...

Malcolm wrote:

A Tibetan translation is no guarantee of an Indian source: example, Vajrasamādhī Sūtra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?

Content:

Aemilius said:

It is not merely a matter of faith.

Malcolm wrote:

It is purely a matter of faith.

Aemilius said:

There are hundreds, thousands or hundred thousands and millions of people who have practiced various spiritual disciplines and have attained the capabilities of seeing with the celestial eye (divya chakshu) or hearing with the celestial ear (divya shrotra) or seeing the past lives or future lives (purvanivasanusmṛiti). This is factual evidence for the phenomenon of extra sensory perception.

Malcolm wrote:

No, there is no evidence whatsoever, since there is no empirical evidence of such capacities among human beings at all. There are only anecdotal claims. Anyone can claim anything about such abilities, but since no one can verify their claims, such claims do not form proofs of any sort. Such claims merely form narratives, which some people adopt and other people ignore. Then of course there are some people that are completely bereft of common sense and reason who still insist the earth is flat, that the sun and moon rotate around Mt. Meru, and so on, using arguments that sound just like

Roman Inquisition, who convicted Galileo of heresy:

In February 1616, an Inquisitorial commission declared heliocentrism to be "foolish and absurd in philosophy, and formally heretical since it explicitly contradicts in many places the sense of Holy Scripture". The Inquisition found that the idea of the Earth's movement "receives the same judgement in philosophy and ... in regard to theological truth it is at least erroneous in faith"

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Galileo\\_Galilei](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Galileo_Galilei)

Aemilius said:

There is only a reluctance or a denial of studying an investigating it. And a reluctance of investing money and resources in the studying and researching this aspect of reality.

Malcolm wrote:

Not so. There is also a lack of ability to test such claims, since such claims could only be verified by people with similar faculties, and not by people lacking them. This requires that people who lack such faculties accept on faith the claims of people who claim to possess such faculties, since the former cannot verify the claims of the latter at all, as you admit below, and the latter can never prove their claims to the former, which is something you overlook.

Aemilius said:

We would quite certainly get results in this field, if equal amount of money was spent in this field, as is spent in the construction of particle accelerators and other gadgets of that kind.

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not, since one could not create a proper double-blind study, and so on, to test such claims. And we already know, according to the Abhidharmakośa and so on, that beings in a lower realm are incapable of perceiving those in higher realms, absent some special power, which cannot be reliably reproduced.

Aemilius said:

There is knowledge that is not accepted by the great multitudes, and it is still knowledge. Buddha speaks of the Arhats or Aryas that are above the great multitudes of people. They are like someone who has climbed on a great mountain peak and can see far from it. They can see what the ordinary people and the vast multitudes on the plains cannot see.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and so ordinary people, those not blinded by religion, generally don't accept things they cannot personally verify, either through direct perception or inference. And it is certainly the case that one's liberation does not hinge upon whether one accepts or rejects Meru cosmology and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 1:25 AM

Title: Re: When did the Buddha teach the Prajñāpāramitā and Pure Land Sūtra?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sa skya Paṇḍita's perspective is as follows:

First, he taught the śravaka sūtras for 7 years, beginning in Varanasi. Then, during the reign of Bimbisara, the Buddha taught Prajñāpāramita for 10 years. Then, he taught the third turning for 28 years, with various sūtras of both provisional and definitive import. So, he divides the Buddha's teaching into three periods.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: When did the Buddha teach the Prajñāpāramitā and Pure Land Sūtra?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

What is Sa skya Paṇḍita's understanding of what "the third turning" is? The tantras or another particular class of sūtra?

Malcolm wrote:

Sutras, such as the Lanka, and other cittamatra texts, and those sutras such as the Samadhirāja.

He considered the cittamatra sūtras of the third turning and the first turning provisional, and third turning sutras like Samadhirāja and the second turning definitive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 2:19 AM

Title: Re: Tsigdön Dzö translations?

Content:

Rune said:

Hello all

Does anybody know anything about the presumably in process translations of Tsigdön Dzö, by Richard Barron

Malcolm wrote:

I think that project was cancelled for lack of funding.

Rune said:

and David Germano?

Malcolm wrote:

To be published by Wisdom, or so I have heard.

But you will never get a better explanation than Khenpo Namdrol's commentary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 3:16 AM

Title: Re: Tsigdön Dzö translations?

Content:

Rune said:

May I ask, are you considering translating further Tantras? I've been looking around, but there's nothing definite out there. Hope it's OK that I ask you directly, then

Malcolm wrote:

I am presently working on the root text and commentary to the sgra thal 'gyur, aiming for a publication date of no later than mid 2024.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 4:10 AM

Title: Re: When did the Buddha teach the Prajñāpāramitā and Pure Land Sūtra?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

What is Sa skya Paṇḍita's understanding of what "the third turning" is? The tantras or another particular class of sūtra?

Malcolm wrote:

Sutras, such as the Lanka, and other cittamatra texts, and those sutras such as the Samadhirāja.

He considered the cittamatra sūtras of the third turning and the first turning provisional, and third turning sutras like Samadhirāja and the second turning definitive.

Könchok Thrinley said:

Since C mentioned it, did Buddha teach the tantras also physically to few students or through manifestations?

Malcolm wrote:

According to tradition, the Buddha taught the lower tantras in the deva realms as a bhikṣu, and the higher tantras such as Kalacakra and Guhyasamāja in sambhogakāya forms, meaning, this was not visible to ordinary people or even bodhisattvas below the 8th bhūmi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 5:24 AM

Title: Re: Killing a living being when it's sick

Content:  
seeker242 said:  
100% fatal case of rabies.

Malcolm wrote:  
Sometimes, killing IS the Mahāyāna thing to do. And if one refuses, then one breaks one's Mahāyāna vows. It depends, it's case by case. If a horse breaks its leg, it is best to kill it, and so on. A rabid dog or any other animal must be put down. A human intent on harming other humans out of sheer malice, well, if you have a gun...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 5:30 AM  
Title: Re: Why don't Buddhists believe in Buddhist cosmology?  
Content:

Tenma said:  
In the Indian and Tibetan understanding of the elements, were they meant to be literally taken as the 5 literal elements (like the body is literally made out of fire, water, etc.) or more their "essences" (like the Aristotelians and Medievalists with a "fiery property" of a plant making it rise, the "earthy property" of objects making them fall down, etc.)?

Malcolm wrote:  
According to the Indian Buddhist, and later Tibetan ideas of the elements, all matter is made up of the four elements in differing proportions. The four elements never exist as differentiated substances, they are properties of matter——solidity (earth), liquidity (water), heat (fire), and motility (air)——according to the Kośa. The most extensive Buddhist teachings on the elements is in Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 9:43 AM  
Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?  
Content:  
Nalanda said:  
Hello,

Does anyone know who the genuine, accessible, Dzogchen Masters are of today?  
The ones who don't appear to have any controversy surrounding them.  
The ones who will take on Western students.  
The ones who are part of a legitimate lineage.  
The ones who have reached completion. (I realise this one is speculative)

Thanks for your help.

Regards

Malcolm wrote:  
Chokyi Nyima, etc.,  
Rabjam Rinpoche,  
Tulku Dakpa,  
Erik Pema Kunsang,  
Khenchen Namdrol  
Sangye Khandro and lama Chonam  
Sogan Rinpoche

Just off the top of my head

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 12:48 PM  
Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?  
Content:  
gelukman said:  
Before covid you could fly to chengdu for 400usd. From chengdu you are very close  
the ancient tibetan gompas. I would start there.

Malcolm wrote:  
That works for those fluent in Tibetan, for others, not so much.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 10:13 PM  
Title: Re: True Mind is No Mind  
Content:  
yinyangkoi said:  
After I read this my mind stopped and there was just reality, I was so present and awake  
like never before. It stopped after a few moments.

Malcolm wrote:  
Your mind needs a brake job.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 10:26 PM  
Title: Re: True Mind is No Mind  
Content:  
yinyangkoi said:  
After I read this my mind stopped and there was just reality, I was so present and awake  
like never before. It stopped after a few moments.



Malcolm wrote:  
Your mind needs a brake job.

yinyangkoi said:  
What does that mean? You mean the brakes are old and it doesn't brake enough? I should brake more?  
It was like a melt away or disappearing.

Malcolm wrote:  
It was a joke...since you said it did not stop immediately...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 11:28 PM  
Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?  
Content:  
naljor said:  
When it comes to vast and deep knowledge of dzogchen, like three series, i remember only one - ChNN, otherwise there are many great teachers with knowledge and lineages of transmissions.

Malcolm wrote:  
Unfortunately, that ship sailed in 2018. The world has been a shit show ever since.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 5th, 2022 at 11:44 PM  
Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?  
Content:  
naljor said:  
Yes, we all know...but we have to work with circumstances

Malcolm wrote:  
In this case, how? He is not a "living" dzogchen master, other than in the hearts of his direct disciples.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, January 6th, 2022 at 1:18 AM  
Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?  
Content:  
gelukman said:  
Not forgetting Yungdrung Bon. If you are after dzogchen, probably easy to connect. Some have issues to see it as one school within others like nyingma, sakya, kagyu, geluk. And what school is very kuntuzangpo? Yungdrung Bon...Maybe more than nyingma?

Malcolm wrote:

It depends on how one is approaching Dzogchen, as a school or a vehicle. If approached as vehicle, than the name, Buddhist or Bon does not matter much, not to mention, Nyingma etc. If one approaches it from the point of view of school, then Dzogchen becomes limited by sectarian considerations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 6th, 2022 at 3:14 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I can't say for certain that they are masters, but Alan Wallace and Lama Surya Das are some names that come to mind. I am not a dzogchen practitioner, but I have listened to a few talks from them and they are quite inspiring.

Malcolm wrote:

The term "Dzogchen master" does not exist in Tibetan. It is cribbed from the earlier neologism, "Zen master," coined by D.T. Suzuki and appearing first in an article he wrote for the Journal of the Pali Text Society in 1906.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 6th, 2022 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: Upcoming Translations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

other than his decision to merge dharmata and tathata into a single term.

ManiThePainter said:

I've been thinking about this recently. What is the significance of translating them all as "reality"? Does it alter the meaning of the text based on the context?

Patacelus said:

One is naked reality and one is suchness. They seemed to me to be speaking to the nature of reality in general and the nature of a specific thing in particular. But that is just my own sense of it, it could be that they are technical terms in tantra and translating them both that way was just sloppy. I'm guessing someone with more knowledge will answer eventually. I'm looking forward to it.

Malcolm wrote:

Dharmatā is a complicated technical term, used in many contexts. It is usually contrasted with dharmin. In short, in the context it is used in Buddhapalita is illustrated in one case in this way. Take this passage, which is a very minor point, but I would do it differently:

དེ་ལྟར་ཏུ་གཞན་ནས་ཀྱང་འདུས་བྱས་དེ་ནི་སྤྱོད་པའི་ཆོས་ཀྱང་ཡིན། དེ་ནི་རབ་ཏུ་འཇིག་པའི་ཆོས་ཀྱང་ཡིན་ནོ་ཞེས་འདུ་བྱེད་ཐམས་ཅད་སྤྱོད་པའི་ཆོས་ཅན་ཡིན་པར་གསུངས་སོ། །དེའི་ཕྱིར་འདུ་བྱེད་ཐམས་ཅད་སྤྱོད་པའི་ཆོས་ཉིད་དེས། ཐམས་ཅད་བརྟན་པ་ཉིད་ཡིན་ཏེ།

Coughlin (pg. 174, line 3-6) has:

Furthermore, he also declared in another [sūtra]:

Conditioned states are also deceptive phenomena. They are also phenomena that fully disintegrate.

This states that all formations are deceptive phenomena. Since all formations are deceptive phenomena, therefore, all of them are false.

I would have rendered this passage in this way:

In the same way, elsewhere [he stated] that all formations are deceptive phenomena (dharmin), "The compounded are also deceptive phenomena (dharma), and they are also phenomena that totally perish." Therefore, since all formations have deceptive natures (dharmatā), all are false.

Otherwise, his translation is just fine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 6th, 2022 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Queequeg said:

I've read and heard a lot of names for the events in D.C. on Jan. 6, 2020, but I think Cornpone Intifada might be the best one by far. It captures the ridiculousness of those events, even as serious and dangerous as they were.

Malcolm wrote:

well, this question from the Atlantic article is easily answered:

[W]hy some of the best-educated men and women in the country, the most invested in its power, the luckiest, have overseen the destruction of their institutions like spoiled teenagers smashing up their parents' house on a weekend bender.

Christian Nationalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 7th, 2022 at 5:15 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Miorita said:

I don't think it's permissible to fragment my opinion. It's personal and not up for discussion.

Malcolm wrote:

"Nothing is true, everything is permitted."

--Last testament of Hassan I Sabbah

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 7th, 2022 at 5:29 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, you can have a great career as as grifter, just like this guy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 7th, 2022 at 6:40 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Shinjin said:

What do you disagree with?

Malcolm wrote:

This dude is just a grifter, that's all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Tata1 said:

I dont think this is good advice at all. One should not choose a teacher based on his rank and fame.

Malcolm wrote:

On the other hand, it is a bit easier to research such teachers and make sure of their qualifications. After all, selecting a guru is not a personality contest, it's about their qualifications to transmit the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 12:16 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Dan74 said:

it's really hard to imagine that people can't rally around an issue like this. Even in the US.

Malcolm wrote:

Especially in the US. The US thrives on international conflict. We have since the beginning. It is the organizing principle of this country. And when we don't have an external enemy we turn on ourselves: such as the lull after the War of 1812, there were the Indian Clearances; in the lull after the Mexican-American War, the Civil War; after reconstruction, the labor struggles; luckily, we had two world wars in a row, and that kept us occupied, and then there was the Cold War. But after the downfall of the USSR, we again turned on ourselves, principally, the conservatives started economic and social witchhunts, predicated on the false narratives of Christian Nationalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I can't say for certain that they are masters, but Alan Wallace and Lama Surya Das are some names that come to mind. I am not a dzogchen practitioner, but I have listened to a few talks from them and they are quite inspiring.

Nalanda said:

Lama Surya Das - Google the name. There's been some sad news on that front.

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, the Dzogchen lap dance goes a little too far, considering he was one of the first people to go after Sogyal back in the early nineties.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 10:22 PM

Title: Re: How does Buddhism describe the mechanics of the mind, consciousness, etc.

Content:

Aemilius said:

What are you aiming at? In ancient India there was no knowledge of the functioning of brains and nerves.

Malcolm wrote:

That's not true. You need to read the Sushruta Samhita.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: What is your opinion on the presentation of Buddhism by StudyBuddhism by Dr. Berzin?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I found his distinction between Dharma-lite and real-thing Dharma to be very helpful.

Malcolm wrote:

This distinction was coined back in the hoary old days of alt.buddhism.tibetan, Punnadhammo used the term "Buddh lite" in a post, 8/4/99. It was being used consistently by 2001.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 8th, 2022 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Tata1 said:

I dont think this is good advice at all. One should not choose a teacher based on his rank and fame.

Malcolm wrote:

On the other hand, it is a bit easier to research such teachers and make sure of their qualifications. After all, selecting a guru is not a personality contest, it's about their qualifications to transmit the Dharma.

SilenceMonkey said:

And some people seem to have the karma of getting involved with charlatans.

Maybe it's a bit rare to find a great dzogchen master who goes unknown within the Buddhist community. Hidden mahasiddhas...

Malcolm wrote:

There has not really been a true Dzogchen master since Longchenpa. Everything since then has been footnotes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 1:23 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

I have had ocd since I was about 9 or 10 years old and it really makes my life hard and not fun.

Malcolm wrote:

Generally OCD is considered a seizure disorder. An adjunct to controlling that is a balanced diet that includes cooked grain and vegetables, fruits, and some amount of

animal protein.

A raw diet will most certainly aggravate your condition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

I would be cautious about painting all Christians as conservative idealogues.

Malcolm wrote:

We are talking about Christian Nationalists aka Dominionists, like Josh Hawley, Steve Bannon, Ted Cruz, etc.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dominion\\_theology](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dominion_theology)

See:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 5:48 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There has not really been a true Dzogchen master since Longchenpa. Everything since then has been footnotes.

Lingpupa said:

You love a grand, sweeping pronouncement, don't you Malc? I'm totally overawed.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, considering that there has not been a lineage of holder of Dzogchen since Longchenpa and won't be another one until Ḍākinī Matīśrī in the distant future, I stand by my grand, sweeping pronouncement. And of course, this grand, sweeping pronouncement isn't mine at all. It belongs to Khenpo Ngachung.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 6:17 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Lingpupa said:

You love a grand, sweeping pronouncement, don't you Malc? I'm totally overawed.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, considering that there has not been a lineage of holder of Dzogchen since Longchenpa and won't be another one until Ḍākinī Matīśrī in the distant future, I stand by my grand, sweeping pronouncement. And of course, this grand, sweeping pronouncement isn't mine at all. It belongs to Khenpo Ngachung.

climb-up said:

What does it mean to be a lineage holder?

I've never been clear on this.

Malcolm wrote:

In this case it means a bstan 'dzin, a śāsanadhara. The actual name of the Buddha's teaching is śāsana. A śāsanadhara is one who "holds the teaching." There is a gap in the prediction in the Sound Tantra of the holders of the Dzogchen teaching between Longchenpa and the ḍākini mentioned above. Recently, Khenchen Namdrol mentioned this, apologizing slightly while stating that even tertons cannot be considered "holders of the Dzogchen teaching" in the sense mentioned above. Of course everyone who has received Dzogchen teachings is a brgyud 'dzin, paramparādhara, or holder of the lineage in a minor sense.

But in reality, what I mean is that no one other than Longchenpa could have written his treasures, with all his finesse and mastery of the seventeen tantras and their commentaries, not to mention the whole of Buddhist scholarship. There has been no Tibetan like him since he passed away in the middle of the 14th century. I am not talking about realization. Thousands of Tibetans have realized Dzogchen teachings to the highest level. I am talking about true mastery expressed for the benefit of sentient beings, and frankly, no one compares to him. Chogyal Namkhai Norbu himself said that among Tibetans, Longchenpa is the final word on Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 6:28 AM

Title: Re: no conditioned entity can arise from anything other than another conditioned entity?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

if you can demonstrate this rationally, I will know for sure a creator God cannot exist.

Malcolm wrote:

It's fairly straight forward, an unconditioned cause must produce all of its effects simultaneously, because if it exists in time, it is conditioned, and not unconditioned. It can only produce these effects once, because if they are produced serially, then this means the unconditioned has parts, making it conditioned. There are all kinds of arguments you can read in Pudgala chapter of Abhidharmakoshaśāstra, the



Tattvasamgraha, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 6:32 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

climb-up said:

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

And I should add, the aforementioned Sound Tantra is the original Dharma teaching of this eon, from whence all other Dharmas spring. So there is that too.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 9th, 2022 at 11:26 PM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I think that perhaps what is implied here, is Longchenpa being the most recent Major Lineage Holder of Dzogchen.

Maybe something similar to the Buddha Shakyamuni being the most recent Uttamanirmanakaya, vs other subsequent Buddhas being Nirmanakayas; with the next Uttamanirmanakaya being Maitreya.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, what I am really pointing out, along the lines mentioned, is that no one since Longchenpa has demonstrated his level of mastery of Dzogchen teachings, not to mention his grasp of general Buddhist teachings. He is the gold standard. No one matches Longchenpa's achievements in writing and systematizing Dzogchen for later generations. Everyone who comes later, including Bonpos, are not even building on Longchenpa's work, it is so definitive. At best they just summarize and simplifying what he covers extensively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Episcopalians right off the top of my head. Anyway, I honestly don't believe there is an interest to look at this with a mind that is open. This is just a personal opinion I have, based on my interaction with interfaith groups I have worked with.

Malcolm wrote:

Umm....you live in New Haven, two hours south of me. We are New Englanders, and Christians in most of New England are also Democrats.

Your interfaith experience would be very different in GA, OK, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

My response to the reasons for 1/6 was that it was primarily racially motivated, not religiously motivated. People of all religions use their faith to bolster their ignorance, hatred, and greed. That's the topic at hand.

Malcolm wrote:

Christian Racism, as well as their support for slavery, is a well known phenomena: Slaves, obey your earthly masters with respect and fear, and with sincerity of heart, just as you would obey Christ. 6 Obey them not only to win their favor when their eye is on you, but as slaves of Christ, doing the will of God from your heart. 7 Serve wholeheartedly, as if you were serving the Lord, not people, 8 because you know that the Lord will reward each one for whatever good they do, whether they are slave or free. This passage, among many others was used to justify slavery in the old South.

<https://www.nbcnews.com/think/opinion/racism-among-white-christians-higher-among-nonreligious-s-no-coincidence-ncna1235045>

KeithA said:

Even at a glance, the Racism Index reveals a clear distinction. Compared to nonreligious whites, white Christians register higher median scores on the Racism Index, and the differences among white Christian subgroups are largely differences of degree rather than kind.

Malcolm wrote:

So yes, Christians are more racist than non-Christian. One cannot so neatly separate people's motivations. A racist who is a Christian is a Christian racist.

There were plenty of bibles and invocations of Jesus at the insurrection as well.

<https://www.rollingstone.com/culture/culture-features/capitol-christian-right-trump-1121236/>

KeithA said:

Within hours, insurrectionists had surrounded the Capitol, beaten police, battered down barricades and doors, smashed windows and rampaged through the halls of the Capitol, breaching the Senate chamber. In video captured by The New Yorker, men ransacked the room, rifling through senators' binders and papers, searching for evidence of what they claimed was treason. Then, standing on the rostrum where the president of the Senate presides, the group paused to pray "in Christ's holy name." Men

raised their arms in the air as millions of evangelical and charismatic parishioners do every Sunday and thanked God for allowing them “to send a message to all the tyrants, the communists and the globalists, that this is our nation, not theirs.” They thanked God “for allowing the United States of America to be reborn.”

Malcolm wrote:  
Christians are not our friends.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:23 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:  
KeithA said:

My opinion still remains that racism, and not religion, is root cause of 1/6. Racism is what brought the last administration to power, and what keeps it's figurehead in place.

Malcolm wrote:  
They are completely intertwined in White Christianity in America as above. And I am quite certain that European Christians are more racist than nonbelievers there as well.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:29 AM  
Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?  
Content:  
Artziebetter1 said:

I have had ocd since I was about 9 or 10 years old and it really makes my life hard and not fun.

Malcolm wrote:  
Generally OCD is considered a seizure disorder.

Charlie123 said:  
Hi Acarya,

OCD as a seizure disorder sounds a little strange. Can you elaborate?

Malcolm wrote:  
<http://www.anncaserep.com/full-text/accr-v3-id1541.php>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:59 AM  
Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?  
Content:

zerwe said:

Lay or ordained, CEO or panhandler, renunciation takes place in the mind. The very same renunciation described at the level of sutra is considered vital to practice in the Vajrayana.

Without it, practice becomes another form of attachment for that of this life and future lives.

Malcolm wrote:

What is being renounced here is samsara. But in Vajrayāna, one does not renounce pleasures of the senses because it is a path of transformation, not a path of renunciation. This is why we have yogas of eating, washing, passion, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

Damchö\_Dorje said:

Is there anything we renounce in Vajrayana? Like anger? If a person is predisposed to negativities instead of what's positive, does that get transformed as well?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 2:06 AM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

zerwe said:

Yes, but it would seem that too often we have people who forget fundamentally what is being renounced and where or how this is taking place.

Malcolm wrote:

Hence the word "practice." Renunciation cannot be contrived. It is a realization, not a rule.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 2:20 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

"Christians are not our friends"

Then sadly, we are no better.

\_/|\\_

Malcolm wrote:

I don't bear animosity towards Christians. I just don't trust them en masse. The history of Christianity is far too bloody for me to imagine that if Christian Nationalists gained power in this country, as in seizing the gvt., that many of them would do much in the face of oppression, just as few Christians openly opposed the Nazis and the Fascists. Some did of course, but not enough.

We are Buddhists, we do not accept one thing they believe. They don't like that. You may not remember this but several Buddhist temples were burnt down in Western MA. and Southern Vt. in the late 70's. Personally, I am more comfortable with atheists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 2:31 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

On Christian racism and historical slavery , the abolitionists were also Christian and some saw the abolition of slavery as connected to their beliefs.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, mainly in New England, as the Puritans objected to slavery, and this was baked into New England culture, despite the presence of slaves in the Massachusetts Bay Colony beginning in the early 18th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 2:47 AM

Title: Nepal's biggest stupa turns to biodegradable prayer flags

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

[https://www.france24.com/en/live-news/20211218-nepal-s-biggest-stupa-turns-to-biodegradable-prayer-flags?mc\\_cid=e1820c16ee&mc\\_eid=d8758c9896](https://www.france24.com/en/live-news/20211218-nepal-s-biggest-stupa-turns-to-biodegradable-prayer-flags?mc_cid=e1820c16ee&mc_eid=d8758c9896)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 3:54 AM

Title: Re: no conditioned entity can arise from anything other than another conditioned entity?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

in the atemporalist picture, all of God's successive creation and acts in history are seen as aspects of one integrated atemporal act of will. since God in classical abrahamic theism (Maimonides, Aquinas, Ibn Sina etc) is self-diffusive, its outpouring will tend toward the greatest quantity of being possible. God's being is qualitatively infinite, therefore His creativity is infinitely inexhaustible.

Malcolm wrote:

Casuistry as argument is common among theists.

Something unconditioned cannot perform actions at all. At the end of the day, you will be required to admit you cannot prove the absurd thesis above, and will have to resort to argument from faith in the end.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

But rather the buddha-nature is universal self (大我) or true self (真我), and it is something which is shared by every sentient being. The true-self is interconnectedness between all sentient beings.

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is just Hinduism in Buddhist drag.

The statement before it does not even make sense:

The tathagatagarbha sutras state that buddha-nature (the tathagatagarbha) is atman (self), but not as in the conventional sense of self as in individual and unique which is tied to the 5 aggregates which are actually illusory and emptiness.

There is no person to be found apart from the five aggregates, so a putative buddhanature that is not part of the five aggregates can't connect sentient beings at all.

Buddhanature is just a name for the potential of a given sentient being to realize buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Is it Buddhist to say "5 aggregates is self".

From Sujato's recent post (Jan 7, 2021)

For the EBTs, on the other hand, it is precisely the five aggregates that are taken as self.

Indeed, it seems as if they were originally developed as a scheme for classifying self theories. If you had tried to argue, “What you take as self is nothing more than the aggregates” you would be met with, “Yes, exactly, that is my self.”

Malcolm wrote:

They are the basis for imputing a self.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:18 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is just Hinduism in Buddhist drag.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Yes, this is the standard objection.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the standard objection to the misconception that buddhanature is some transpersonal woo woo.

SY, the tathātatagarbha sūtras themselves error check against this misconception. You might try reading them sometime.

As the Uttaratantra and the Lankāvatara point out, tathātatagarbha was taught so that people would not become discouraged by the length of the path, or for those who are frightened of emptiness, like our pal here, SY.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:25 AM

Title: Re: no conditioned entity can arise from anything other than another conditioned entity?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

why can something unconditioned perform no actions?

Malcolm wrote:

Because actions have parts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:33 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Oh I fully accept self-emptiness as the nature of observable universe. No problem there. I just don't think it's the final word on Truth.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because emptiness terrifies you, so you cling to some idea that there must be something which is not empty, that you label "true."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:37 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Wow. This can easily be weaponized by Hindus against newbies like me. Which seems to be what's happening here.

Malcolm wrote:

SY is our resident buddhanature troll. He hangs out under the buddhanature bridge, waiting to suck the marrow out of bones of any unlucky traveller who happens to invoke him with the word, "buddhanature."

Sometimes, he is also our resident buddhanature zombie, who staggers around looking for brains to eat...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:40 AM

Title: Re: no conditioned entity can arise from anything other than another conditioned entity?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

if buddhas exist in a state of unconditioned Nirvana

Malcolm wrote:

They don't exist in some woo woo state of unconditioned nirvana. Buddhas arise from causes and conditions. Nirvana is simply the cessation of afflictions. Buddhahood is the realization of emptiness, the unconditioned nature of conditioned phenomena.

Artziebetter1 said:

then how can they act like incarnating, teaching the path, bodhicitta action etc ?

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhahood has causes and conditions, which is why buddhas can act.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 5:51 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Oh I fully accept self-emptiness as the nature of observable universe. No problem there. I just don't think it's the final word on Truth.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because emptiness terrifies you, so you cling to some idea that there must be something which is not empty, that you label "true."

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Well, if you put it that way, then I guess I'm guilty as charged!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course you are. You are an advocate of Yogacāra substantialism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:18 AM

Title: Re: no conditioned entity can arise from anything other than another conditioned entity?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

if buddhas exist in a state of unconditioned Nirvana

Malcolm wrote:

They don't exist in some woo woo state of unconditioned nirvana. Buddhas arise from causes and conditions. Nirvana is simply the cessation of afflictions. Buddhahood is the realization of emptiness, the unconditioned nature of conditioned phenomena.

Artziebetter1 said:

then how can they act like incarnating, teaching the path, bodhicitta action etc ?

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhahood has causes and conditions, which is why buddhas can act.

Artziebetter1 said:

So buddhas have complex awareness and intelligence/perception? because by definition a unconditioned mindstate or mind would be utterly simple intelligence or awareness.

Malcolm wrote:

An unconditioned mind is impossible. Minds exist in time, even a Buddha's continuum is conditioned, albeit, unafflicted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:27 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Sādhaka said:

however Jan. 6 was an false-flag IMO.

Malcolm wrote:

That's the stupid thing you've ever said. Some people are so f\*\*cking dumb they will even deny the evidence of their senses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:33 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Because, quite simply, it isn't all Christians. Again, a completely closed mind, no room for growth. Just an ossified point of view, no different than the most hardened Christian fundamentalist.

Malcolm wrote:

No growth necessary. We've all grown up surrounded by Christians and Christianity, it's not a mystery. They can believe whatever they want. But Christian Nationalists are dangerous, and history shows that religious groups tend to stick together even when they are engaged in atrocities, for example Buddhists in Myanmar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:37 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Well, if you put it that way, then I guess I'm guilty as charged!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course you are. You are an advocate of Yogacāra substantialism.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Lol, I love how you say that like it's a bad thing.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a bad thing, it's just where you are at. It's a stage. It's just not definitive by any measure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:44 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Because, quite simply, it isn't all Christians. Again, a completely closed mind, no room for growth. Just an ossified point of view, no different than the most hardened Christian fundamentalist.

Malcolm wrote:

No growth necessary. We've all grown up surrounded by Christians and Christianity, it's not a mystery. They can believe whatever they want. But Christian Nationalists are dangerous, and history shows that religious groups tend to stick together even when they are engaged in atrocities, for example Buddhists in Myanmar.

KeithA said:

Christian Nationalist are dangerous - yup

Religious group think can result in atrocities - yup

Malcolm wrote:

On the other hand, it's demonstrable that Buddhist tolerance towards other religions has lead to Buddhism being undermined by the intolerance of others. The old paradox of tolerance. Firm believer in separation of religions and politics, all religion, including Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:47 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Because, quite simply, it isn't all Christians. Again, a completely closed mind, no room for growth. Just an ossified point of view, no different than the most hardened Christian fundamentalist.

Malcolm wrote:

No growth necessary. We've all grown up surrounded by Christians and Christianity, it's not a mystery. They can believe whatever they want. But Christian Nationalists are dangerous, and history shows that religious groups tend to stick together even when they are engaged in atrocities, for example Buddhists in Myanmar.

KeithA said:

Christian Nationalist are dangerous - yup

Religious group think can result in atrocities - yup

Malcolm wrote:

On the other hand, it's demonstrable that Buddhist tolerance towards other religions has lead to Buddhism being undermined by the intolerance of others. The old paradox of tolerance. Firm believer in separation of religions and politics, all religion, including Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:51 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Sādhaka said:

Why I have more of a affinity with Ron Paul-style libertarian conservatives than trump's ilk.

Ron Paul, even though a christian himself, is more about the values of 'the founding fathers' (whatever limitations these may have had aside for the moment); e.g. freedom of religion and so forth.

Malcolm wrote:

Demonstrably, the founders advocated freedom FROM religion, not freedom of religion. Freedom of religion is just a necessary consequence of the establishment clause of the first amendment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 8:54 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Christian Nationalist are dangerous - yup

Religious group think can result in atrocities - yup

Malcolm wrote:

On the other hand, it's demonstrable that Buddhist tolerance towards other religions has lead to Buddhism being undermined by the intolerance of others. The old paradox of tolerance. Firm believer in separation of religions and politics, all religion, including Buddhism.

KeithA said:

Also agree...where we seem to differ is that I am of the opinion that 1/6 had little do with religion, and that the root cause was racism. I might broaden that to fascism. Religion is just the thing some fascists are hiding behind. Of course, I could be completely wrong. We are just shooting the proverbial doo-doo here. I am no political or social scientist.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and I am arguing that racism is baked into Christian Nationalism, so much so you cannot separate them. You have three ingredients, the flour is Christianity, the salt is racism, the yeast is Trump.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 9:21 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Also agree...where we seem to differ is that I am of the opinion that 1/6 had little do with religion, and that the root cause was racism. I might broaden that to fascism. Religion is just the thing some fascists are hiding behind. Of course, I could be completely wrong. We are just shooting the proverbial doo-doo here. I am no political or social scientist.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and I am arguing that racism is baked into Christian Nationalism, so much so you cannot separate them. You have three ingredients, the flour is Christianity, the salt is racism, the yeast is Trump.

KeithA said:

.

There is our disagreement. I think the recipe is faulty. Christian Nationalists prone to violence make up a small fraction of the Christian Population.

Malcolm wrote:

Christian Nationalism is itself the problem. The violence is simply an expected consequence of their belief system.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 9:55 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Now that we're done talking to Dolpopa....

How is the dharmakaya and buddhanature not actually atman? I mean I get that it lacks self-hood in a sense, but we ARE positing an unchanging, fixed, eternal, essence of sort and merely branding it as "emptiness" is it not?

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness does not exist apart from things to be empty, so, no, we are not positing some fixed essence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 10:37 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

^^ Not to be obtuse or totally beginner on you but please forgive me when I say what a normal secularist would say...

How is that "empty" not anything but what secularists are saying. That what happens after all this (existence) is a big nothing. Empty. As in totally devoid of essence, everything ceasing their essentiality to ....emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness means things do not exist inherently. Apart from things to be empty, there are is no emptiness either. Emptiness is also empty.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:22 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I mean nevermind that this Baptist pastor is a known anti-semite, anti-LGBTQ, and a fundamentalist character, but his analysis of what Buddhists are saying is exactly what you would expect from someone like him and secularists when they hear (or what we would say 'misunderstand') the Buddhist position:

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness is a “secret” teaching. It’s not for outsiders. It’s not to be discussed with nonbuddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:28 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The Nirvāṇa Sūtra and Śūraṅgama Sūtra indeed suggest that Buddha-nature is a Self.

The affirmation of Self is just part of a fourfold affirmation about Buddha-nature: it is Permanent, Bliss, Self, and Purity. This is because the Buddha is not a saṃsāric phenomenon, and thus the marks of existence, impermanence, suffering, and no-self, do not apply to it.

Malcolm wrote:

Nirvana also lacks self. All dharmas lack identity. Nirvana is a dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:48 AM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

^^ Not to be obtuse or totally beginner on you but please forgive me when I say what a normal secularist would say...

How is that "empty" not anything but what secularists are saying. That what happens after all this (existence) is a big nothing. Empty. As in totally devoid of essence, everything ceasing their essentiality to ....emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness means things do not exist inherently. Apart from things to be empty, there are no emptiness either. Emptiness is also empty.

Nalanda said:

Emptiness is also empty. How do critics respond to this historically and what is our rebuttal?

From my own mind,  $0 \times 0$  is 0 or  $0 + 0$  is 0. So saying emptiness is also empty is saying nothing as it is only affirming the first/main point. We might as well say "really empty" or absolute empty which means we are just reaffirming what our critics say. (that after death, there's just really nothing. aka annihilation, cessation, end of all experience.) The

pastor above would just say " That's what I said. You are saying after death, there's just nothing nothing absolute nothing. " Even if we say he's wrong, his answer is the natural response upon hearing what we believe.

Unless by saying emptiness is also empty we are saying it is NOT empty, which is a suggestion that there is something, in which case, we're back in the sphere of argumentations.

And finally if we insist on; it is not something/anything, AND it is also not empty/nothing, but that empty is also empty, then aren't we just subjecting ourselves to absurdity and contradiction which delegitimizes our place in any serious intellectual/philosophical conversation?

My head hurts.

Not disagreeing. I'm learning. Hope you can help.

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness is empty because it is also a dependent designation, in other words, emptiness also lacks inherent existence. There are sixteen kinds of emptiness. It's best if you study some Madhyamaka under a qualified instructor before asking more questions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:02 PM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The Nirvāṇa Sūtra and Śūraṅgama Sūtra indeed suggest that Buddha-nature is a Self.

The affirmation of Self is just part of a fourfold affirmation about Buddha-nature: it is Permanent, Bliss, Self, and Purity. This is because the Buddha is not a saṃsāric phenomenon, and thus the marks of existence, impermanence, suffering, and no-self, do not apply to it.

Malcolm wrote:

Nirvana also lacks self. All dharmas lack identity. Nirvana is a dharma.

Zhen Li said:

Yes it does, but it is also unconditioned. The reason why Nirvāṇa is described as being Permanence, Bliss, Self, and Purity is different from the kind of reasoning you are employing here. The Self, in those affirmations, is not self—not-self.

Malcolm wrote:

Since the compounded is not established, it follows the un compounded is not established. The terminology of permanence, bliss, self, and purity is intentional, not



definitive, not to be taken literally or at face value.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:06 PM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Emptiness is also empty. How do critics respond to this historically and what is our rebuttal?

From my own mind,  $0 \times 0$  is 0 or  $0 + 0$  is 0. So saying emptiness is also empty is saying nothing as it is only affirming the first/main point. We might as well say "really empty" or absolute empty which means we are just reaffirming what our critics say. (that after death, there's just really nothing. aka annihilation, cessation, end of all experience.) The pastor above would just say " That's what I said. You are saying after death, there's just nothing nothing absolute nothing. " Even if we say he's wrong, his answer is the natural response upon hearing what we believe.

Unless by saying emptiness is also empty we are saying it is NOT empty, which is a suggestion that there is something, in which case, we're back in the sphere of argumentations.

And finally if we insist on; it is not something/anything, AND it is also not empty/nothing, but that empty is also empty, then aren't we just subjecting ourselves to absurdity and contradiction which delegitimizes our place in any serious intellectual/philosophical conversation?

My head hurts.

Not disagreeing. I'm learning. Hope you can help.

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness is empty because it is also a dependent designation, in other words, emptiness also lacks inherent existence. There are sixteen kinds of emptiness. It's best if you study some Madhyamaka under a qualified instructor before asking more questions.

Nicholas2727 said:

Do you have suggestions on an introductory book or videos for Madhyamaka? Or is it best to ask a teacher to study it with them directly? Slightly difficult since the few Tibetan Teachers I have studied with follow Shentong philosophy, but there is a Gelug center about an hour and a half away that I would assume could teach the subject well.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, if you only have exposure to gzhan stong, it would very good for you to study Geluk Madhyamaka.

But in reality, if you carefully read Aryadeva, Buddhapalita, and Candrakirti, you should be all set.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:10 PM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

Nalanda said:

Just curious if you see dharmakaya and/or buddhanature as atman/brahman.

Nicholas2727 said:

No Buddhist school sees Buddhanature/Dharmakaya as atman or brahman. Even Dolpopa/Jonang do not view Buddhanature in this way. One of my teachers refers to true being as in the verb, not as a being.

Malcolm wrote:

It falls apart in the face of Nagarjuna's kind of analysis:

"Apart from whatever has been or has not been, there no [present] being."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:30 PM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, conventional logic and reasoning is always going to be insufficient for Tathāgatagarbha thinking, which is far more suited to a more poetic or evocative language.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't really have much patience for appeals to poetics, and find that a lot of sloppy thinking gets excused in the name of "poetry."

It's true that there is a great deal of metaphor employed in various classes of Buddhist literature, but it must be treated with care, its employment is generally not so obvious. For example, the nine classic examples of tathagatagarbha, understood incorrectly lead one directly to holding a nonBuddhist view of self. On the other hand there is a correct way to understand these examples, which actually lead one to a definitive understanding the absence of identity taught by the Buddha. However, most people take these examples literally and so wind up holding wrong views.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 12:41 PM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

No Buddhist school sees Buddhanature/Dharmakaya as atman or brahman.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Apparently the Karma Kagyu lama Khenpo Tsultrim thinks Shentong and Advaita Vedanta are similar in their view.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, structurally speaking, in so far as both propose that the ultimate and relative are mutually exxclusive. But he did not agree that the content or the result was the same.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 10:25 PM

Title: Re: Is there a 'true self'?

Content:

Nalanda said:

<https://madhyamaka.com> OK? It's by Alex Li Trisoglio, an instructor appointed by Dzongsar Khyentse Rinpoche to teach.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a very on point, based on my superficial perusal of the transcripts. you would better off doing courses with IBA or Rangjung Yeshe, which are more traditional,

<http://www.ibastudiesonline.com/Home/Course/7d65b48e-08c8-4b84-8dee-076ae70ec031>

I know Khenpo Jorden, he speaks excellent English and is quite learned in Madhyamaka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

Is this a joke? I am a therapist and studied this. I never heard this. Also your case study with one brain damaged individual is no evidence.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, no joke. For example, in the US, OCD is often treated with an anti-seizure drug called Depakote.

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3181953/>

I am not claiming that every case of OCD is a seizure related disorder without evidence, and there are a wide variety of behaviors associated with OCD, but it is certainly the case that seizure disorders correlate with OCD, and I suspect, in the end we will discover that most OCD is brain based.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

Nalanda said:

So we're back to it being not a path of renunciation, which is what I've always thought.

Brunelleschi said:

No, I do not agree with this view.

What you have to remember is that Sutrayana and Vajrayana both share the same outlook on Samsara (the three sufferings). E.g., when in Vajrayana you do deity practice it is important to remember that both you and the deity share the same ground - dharmakaya. You and the deity are the same, but you are temporarily obscured by adventitious stains/temporary defilements. The deity meanwhile, is not.

In Sutrayana, generally the way is to avoid sense pleasures. In Vajrayana they are transformed. However, like I mention above the view on Samsara is the same.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, the PATHS are different. There are in general three types of paths: renunciation (Hinayāna, Common Mahāyāna), transformation (lower tantras, mahāyoga and anuyoga), and self-liberation (Ati, Mahāmudra).

The confusion arises because the word renunciation in English translates different terms in Tibetan. Renunciation as a path is termed "spangs (utkṣiptā) lam," literally "the path of discarding or giving up." Whereas the idea of renunciation of samsara is niḥsaraṇa (nges par 'byung). So yes, all Buddhist paths are predicated on niḥsaraṇa, but not all Buddhist paths are predicated on the idea of utkṣiptā.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

Is this a joke? I am a therapist and studied this. I never heard this. Also your case study with one brain damaged individual is no evidence.

chokyi lodro said:

I too was sceptical regarding the labelling of OCD as a seizure disorder.

Malcolm wrote:

Just look at the mounting evidence. Then draw your conclusion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Renunciation as a path is termed "spangs (utkṣiptā) lam," literally "the path of discarding or giving up." Where as the idea of renunciation of samsara is niḥsaraṇa (nges par 'byung). So yes, all Buddhists paths are predicated on niḥsaraṇa, but not all Buddhists path are predicated on the idea of utkṣiptā.

Seeker12 said:

It seems perhaps even that the higher paths require even more authentic niḥsaraṇa, even as the aspect of utkṣiptā reduces, as the aspect of utkṣiptā is essentially only a scaffolding-type support for the development of true maturation in the dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

Eventually, even niḥsaraṇa must be liberated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 10th, 2022 at 11:49 PM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

"Regarding the sutras that teach emptiness, as many as were taught by the Victor, By al of them afflictions are reversed. But Buddha Nature is never refuted in them... Within the afflictions, primordial wisdom abides as immaculate Suchness." - In Praise of the Dharmadhatu

It's not universally accepted that this book was written by the same Nagarjuna. If it was, then I personally am shocked.

Nicholas2727 said:

I was unaware of this. I looked at other threads and it seem that there is no mention of this text by other Indian authors and other historical evidence that it was written much later. Interesting!

Malcolm wrote:

There are three hundred texts attributed to Nāgārjuna in the tengyur. Very few could actually have been composed by Nāgārjuna I.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The DSM doesn't use brain science as diagnostic criteria

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. And as such, it's diagnostic criteria are pretty subjective, not really evidence-based.

<https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/19181456/>

Johnny Dangerous said:

Evidence based medicine claims to be the paradigm for modern psychiatry. It represents proven treatments for defined diagnoses. But there are major problems with this position, starting with the fact that while they are superior to placebo, evidence based treatments too often are ineffective. It cannot be assumed that classifying psychopathology diagnostically is the best way to move forward. Established diagnostic entities, are as much wish as reality. They are the result of committee decisions so tentative that DSM III and IV refuse to use the term "diagnoses" in the diagnostic manual.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/27071528/>

Johnny Dangerous said:

In the 1990s, the rise of evidence-based medicine cast doubt on the reliability of expert consensus. Since then, medicine has increasingly relied on systematic reviews, as developed by the evidence-based medicine movement, and advocated for their early incorporation in expert consensus efforts. With the partial exception of DSM-IV, such systematic evidence-based reviews have not been consistently integrated into the development of the DSMs, leaving their development out of step with the larger medical field.

Depakote is also a pretty serious drug with considerable side effects. Not to say it isn't important in some circumstances, but plenty of people have successfully controlled their OCD without it.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, if your OCD is limited to not being able to carry magazines out of the bathroom once you have brought them in, or get in a new car with dirty underwear (true story), well, probably Depakote is probably overkill.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

but there are also a lot of issues with taking imaging or presumed balance of neurotransmitters or whatever and saying “this physiological sign is x disorder”.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and this results in a lot of people being treated for symptoms, rather than causes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Cite a source please?

Malcolm wrote:

A conversation I had with Khenpo in 1992 at the Newton Dharmadhātu, when he was teaching a program there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 5:02 AM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

Shinjin said:

It would be sweet to be a monastic. Sounds like a simple and blissful way to live.

Malcolm wrote:

People have a lot of fantasies about what it is like to be bhikṣu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 8:50 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:  
Johnny Dangerous said:  
To me the framing here is off.

IMO there is virtually no chance of some theocratic takeover of federal machinery or some such.

What there is a possibility of is a heavier version of what we have now with right leaning states getting rid of legal abortion, teaching their nonsense in schools, funneling more public money into their religion, etc.

KeithA said:  
Agree. In my opinion, Christianity is the group name. The "religion" is white supremacy. These fascists aren't any more Christian than I am a Satan worshiper.

Malcolm wrote:  
That's disingenuous, it's like claiming Ashoka wasn't a Buddhist when he executed 18k Jains—of course he was a Buddhist. Likewise Christian Nationalists are certainly Christians. We may not admire their version of Christianity, but they are indeed Christians.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 12:11 PM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

KeithA said:  
Agree. In my opinion, Christianity is the group name. The "religion" is white supremacy. These fascists aren't any more Christian than I am a Satan worshiper.

Malcolm wrote:  
That's disingenuous, it's like claiming Ashoka wasn't a Buddhist when he executed 18k Jains—of course he was a Buddhist. Likewise Christian Nationalists are certainly Christians. We may not admire their version of Christianity, but they are indeed Christians.

KeithA said:  
Disingenuous implies an intent to be untruthful. As I have admitted to all along, everything I have typed so far is my opinion. I am not a social scientist, nor do I play one on TV.

For some background, Dae Soen Sa Nim (Zen Master Seung Sahn), used to sit joint retreats with the Christian monks at Gethsemane in Kentucky. He even came up with some Christian kong ans (koans) for his collection in Whole World is a Single Flower.



They are based on poems of a German Christian mystic. We still hold regular Christian/Buddhist retreats. There is another way.

\_/\\_

Malcolm wrote:

It means here that you are denying these people their own self-identification. That's not an honest assessment of them. it's not correct to claim that Christian Nationalists are not Christians. It's similar to Protestants claiming Catholics are not really Christians, or Theravadins claiming Tibetan Buddhists are not real Buddhists. We have to deal with the fact they consider themselves Christian and theologically justify their beliefs, just as do intolerant Muslims, Jews, Buddhists, Hindus and so on.

We share nothing in common with Christians, apart from valuing compassion. There is no valid refuge In Christianity, so apart from having a positive influence on more open-minded Christians, I don't really see the point in such ecumenical exercises. But it's a free country, for the time being—just make sure you keep one eye open.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 12:16 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

And yet, hatred isn't the answer. It never is.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't hate white Christians, I just know, based on their record, when push come to shove, they are happy to persecute minorities. They are quite expert at it. Christian intolerance is the reason we we have an establishment clause in the First Amendment, since large percentage of the founders were atheists, or at least acutely aware of the long history religious persecution in Europe by state religions. It's written about quite a bit by Madison in the Federalist Papers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 1:08 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

But I also agree that fundamentalist right-wing Christianity is a bad thing in general and has been particularly toxic in the USA recently.

Malcolm wrote:

Not just recently, but for our entire history.

“Those who do not remember the past are condemned to repeat it.”

—Santayana

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 1:17 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Queequeg said:

I don't think this putative Christian Right take over will succeed - the country is just too big and too pluralistic and becoming more so everyday.

They're not interested in having a dialogue as far as I can tell. So how do you propose we should dispose ourselves toward this aggression?

Malcolm wrote:

They have already taken over a large portions of the country, our top military leaders are openly discussing fears of a military-backed coup, and so on, and the Christian Right's seditious rhetoric has become mainstream.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 11:20 PM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I hope this is okay. Don't want to step on anyone's shoes.

I ask this because there's an absolute silence I hear from General Mahayana on how they view Vajrayana.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course. Those who belong to what Vajrayāna terms "common Mahāyāna" fail to see the utility of the special methods for attaining buddhahood in a single life, using for example Zhen Li's reference to Shinran:

Real teachings of the difficult practices, the Path of Sages. These are the teachings of the Busshin (Zen), Shingon, Hokke (Tendai), Kegon and other schools.

However, Tripiṭakamāla's Nayatrayapradīpa states:

Although the goal is the same, since it is unconfused,  
with many methods, not difficult,  
and mastered by those of sharp faculties,  
Mantrayāna is superior.

Here, sharp faculties is not a reference to intelligence, it is a reference to what is referred faith, *śraddhā*, the first of the five powers (*indriyas*). Shinran was exposed to Vajrayāna, and since in Japan it was an elite practice, complicated, hard to study, etc., his attitude toward Japanese Mantrayāna is understandable. But his attitude is situated in his culture and does not apply to streams of Vajrayāna outside of his experience.

There is however a certain egalitarianism in Kamakura developments. All of them, including Soto Zen, were inclusive of anyone who wanted to participate. Dogen encouraged lay participation (and did not buy into the whole Mappo thing at all); Honen and Shinran crafted a Buddhism for the masses which relieved many people of samsaric anxiety about their future lives; Nichiren, very much influenced by Vajrayāna ideas, created a whole school around devotion to the Lotus Sūtra, asserting that people could exclusively attain awakening in this very lifetime by chanting the title of the Lotus Sutra and so on.

Nalanda said:

I would like to hear the perception of general Mahayana (historically and in the present) to Vajrayana's view of itself as X...

X could be...

- Faster than regular Mahayana?
- More profound / advanced?
- Enlightenment in one lifetime?

Malcolm wrote:

You can read Paramitayāna responses to Vajrayāna claims in such texts Sonam Tsemo's General Presentation of the Divisions of Tantra, and so on.

Also, you must understand that outside of India, the diffusion of Buddhism is extremely complex, and the notion of a "common Mahāyāna" is primarily an Indian idea taken up by Tibetans. Chan, for example, certainly never would accept this characterization.

Sino-Japanese Buddhism evolved outside the Indian Buddhist University system, and owes very little to developments in India after the 6th century, beyond the very restricted influences of Mantrayāna that was introduced to China in the late 7th century.

Nalanda said:

Do General Mahayana....

- (1)-just roll their eyes and ignore this?
- (2)-say "yeah maybe they are right, who knows?"
- (3)-accept, recognize, verify what Vajrayana says?
- (4)-"no way, that's just sectarian cheerleading"

Malcolm wrote:

(1) Usually. (2) Never. (3) Never. (4) Usually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 11th, 2022 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Putting entire groups into "bad" box is pretty awful behavior. The Christian worldview is not monolithic, as quite obviously, the Buddhist worldview isn't either.

Malcolm wrote:

I personally think all religion, including Buddhism, goes in bad box, when it is mixed with politics. But I don't see a burgeoning movement of Buddhist nationalists in the US, nor do I see Muslim nationalists, and so on. What I do see is a burgeoning Christian Identity Movement, aka Christian Nationalists, whose membership cuts across denominational lines in ways that were not possible prior the 1960's. One of the dominant themes of this movement is White European ethnocentricity, along with beliefs in the cultural superiority of European civilization, xenophobia, and yes, of course, racism. No one here is saying that all Christians in America subscribe to these beliefs, but there are sufficient number of them who do subscribe to these beliefs to represent an actual threat to American Democracy.

As for Christianity itself, while I personally find it to be a preposterous set of beliefs, I am also aware that Christians find Buddhism to be preposterous as well, so I am content to leave Christians alone as long as they leave us alone. I don't see much point in the ecumenical thing, since Christianity has nothing of value to offer Buddhism, while Christians have shown that they are mainly interested in appropriating and distorting our contemplative traditions, since Protestants and Catholics lack such a tradition of their own.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Queequeg said:

Local politics is where the voting maps are drawn that can throw a few seats in the house one way or another, as well as state and local offices that in determine those local maps. It would be heartening to see the rest of the Democratic party start working like Georgia.

Malcolm wrote:  
Difficult without national or judicial reform...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 12:48 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
Chicken/egg. Not going to get reform without political machinery. Political machinery is mostly brute force - voter turn out. Voter turnout is local organization, local issues, local effort. Ie. what Abrams has been building in GA.

Malcolm wrote:  
Only made possible by the fact that Democrats are moving to Atlanta and surrounding suburbs, attracted by a strong job market. I mean, who is going to move to North and South Dakota? Kansas? Oklahoma? Nebraska? Alabama? Arkansas?

We need national electoral reform at the federal level. Otherwise, the Voter Suppression party will keep winning the electoral college vote.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 1:50 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
Then maybe we can have some ecumenical discussions.

Malcolm wrote:  
Still don't see much point in it, unless it prevents the torches and pitchforks approach to interfaith dialogue, with us being on the receiving end. For example, if a Christian is interested in Dzogchen teachings, it's fine with me. Dzogchen teachings are for everyone. But if then they turn around and start promulgating a "Christian" Dzogchen (tm) the way some like to pretend there is a Christian Zen, then I am against it.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 2:04 AM  
Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?  
Content:

Shinjin said:  
Not sure. I just want to take the easiest path available.

Malcolm wrote:  
Oh, well, hands down, Dzogchen is the easiest path, but it might be the hardest to understand.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 2:38 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

The last sentence actually helps me to understand the lack of respect for Christianity. There is an incredibly rich and deep contemplative tradition within Christianity, especially in the Orthodox and Catholic traditions. The statement is patently false.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it isn't. I deliberately excluded Eastern orthodox traditions, and the exercises of Ignatius Loyola hardly qualify. And we may not mean the same thing by "contemplative"

In any case, there are also so-called "contemplative" traditions in Judaism, Islam, Hinduism, Taoism, and Confucism, but it doesn't matter because they all suffer from wrong view, various species of eternalism (just as materialists such as humanists suffer from annihilationism) and their religions are spiritual dead ends, just as secular humanism, etc., are dead ends.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 2:43 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Here we fundamentally disagree, but I won't argue this out much longer. The last sentence actually helps me to understand the lack of respect for Christianity. There is an incredibly rich and deep contemplative tradition within Christianity, especially in the Orthodox and Catholic traditions. The statement is patently false.

narhwal90 said:

Very true. Until covid closed it down I was attending an episcopalian meditation group that had been meeting weekly for in the churches chapel for about 20 years; 30 mins silent sitting, a reading by John Main, and a quick pass around the room for each person to say something brief about what they were grateful for that day. They didn't use a bell but instead a CD with 30 mins of quiet followed by a brief Gregorian chant to signal the conclusion. A number of the folks through that room had serious time on the cushion. If grasping at doctrine and ritual is suspended while listening to the readings, there is a lot of common ground to be observed.

Malcolm wrote:

"Beauty in things exists merely in the mind which contemplates them."

-- David Hume

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And I should add, the aforementioned Sound Tantra is the original Dharma teaching of this eon, from whence all other Dharmas spring. So there is that too.

amanitamusc said:

This really is amazing that it still exists and that it will for the first time be translated with commentaty by Vimalamitra in English.

Lingpupa said:

This perhaps doesn't need saying, but do bear in mind, white-flecked red one, that while Malc's statement here is a presumably perfectly correct formulation of the position of the system he espouses, scholars generally see the datable appearance of the seventeen tantra as later than, say, many of the Indian tantras promoted by the New Translation schools.

Me? I know nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the datable appearance of the Sound Tantra is around 1060 CE, after the passing of Atisha, and but well before the turn of the 12th century. But that is just a dating of a physical artifact. The original Sound Tantra, taught to beings of apparitional birth by the first nirmāṇakāya in the first minor eon of this major eon by Nangwa Dampa, was taught in the language of birds, not the language of Oḍḍiyāna, Sanskrit, or Tibetan.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

The last sentence actually helps me to understand the lack of respect for Christianity. There is an incredibly rich and deep contemplative tradition within Christianity, especially in the Orthodox and Catholic traditions. The statement is patently false.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it isn't. I deliberately excluded Eastern orthodox traditions, and the exercises of Ignatius Loyola hardly qualify. And we may not mean the same thing by "contemplative"

In any case, there are also so-called "contemplative" traditions in Judaism, Islam,

Hinduism, Taoism, and Confucism, but it doesn't matter because they all suffer from wrong view, various species of eternalism (just as materialists such as humanists suffer from annihilationism) and their religions are spiritual dead ends, just as secular humanism, etc., are dead ends.

Queequeg said:

Eastern Orthodox contemplation is basically God-smṛti?

Malcolm wrote:

Jesus anusmṛti, yes. But unlike Hinduism, which shares practices with Buddhism such as samādhi, dhyāna, dharāṇa, prāṇāyama, mantra and so on (and no, the Jesus prayer is NOT a mantra), these Abrahamic traditions share no such meditative traditions. Their contemplative traditions are mainly derived from Neoplatonism (which one can argue was itself influenced by Indian spiritual trends—Plotinus supposedly had a "gymnosophist" teacher); and Christian mysticism overall is generally ecstatic rather than "contemplative" in the sense that Buddhadharmā understands samādhi and dhyāna.

This is a useful article outlining the dependence of Christian mysticism upon Neoplatonism:

Inge, W. R. "The Permanent Influence of Neoplatonism upon Christianity." *The American Journal of Theology* 4, no. 2 (1900): 328–44. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3153114>.

It shows very clearly that what we know as Christian Mysticism is directly founded upon Plotinus, via Augustine. We can see the ecstatic aspect in this passage Inge quotes from the *Confessions* of St. Augustine:

"What is this light which now and again breaks in upon me, and thrills through my heart without a wound? I tremble and I burn: I tremble, because I am unlike Him; I burn because I am like Him. It is Wisdom, Wisdom's own self, which thus shines upon me."

This fellow addresses all the great Christian mystics, including Eckhardt, Böhme, and Bruno, concluding with the Cambridge Platonists and their horror at Hobbes's revival of Epicureanism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 5:03 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I would like to hear the perception of general Mahayana (historically and in the present) to Vajrayana's view of itself as X...

Astus said:

The idea of 'general Mahayana' is an abstract one, just as the idea of 'general Hinayana',



or even 'general Vajrayana'. Dogen had this to say on the matter:

'Remember, among Buddhists we do not argue about superiority and inferiority of philosophies, or choose between shallowness and profundity in the Dharma...

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly, Dogen never encountered any Tibetan Buddhists during his sojourn in China. I think the "no true Scotsman" fallacy might apply to this statement.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 5:26 AM

Title: Re: Britain's Growing Far-Right Party Is a Serious Threat

Content:

Ayu said:

It's creepy in many European countries.

In Germany the left antivaxers do not get that they are walking side by side with a nazi movement that seriously dreams of taking over the power.

Our new minister for health affairs received 250 threats of murder already. Some of them were not even sent anonymously, because those nazis literally believe it's their right and they are save with threatening politicians.

Malcolm wrote:

Its a world-wide thing, this growing ethnonationalism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 6:07 AM

Title: Re: Britain's Growing Far-Right Party Is a Serious Threat

Content:

Dan74 said:

I don't see evidence of it been a groundswell.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you haven't been paying attention....maybe the air is a little thin were you live?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:34 AM

Title: Re: Britain's Growing Far-Right Party Is a Serious Threat

Content:

Dan74 said:

I don't see evidence of it been a groundswell.

Malcolm wrote:

Then you haven't been paying attention....maybe the air is a little thin were you live?

Dan74 said:

Do you have evidence for a groundswell? Maybe in the US?

Malcolm wrote:

Again, you are not paying attention: Russia, China, and India are all countries dominated by ethnonationalists, not to mention Poland, Hungary, Israel, Turkey, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:38 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Again with the lecture. I didn't realize I was conversing with sole arbiter of what the Dharma of Sakyamuni is.

PeterC said:

Don't blame me, I didn't make up the sutras. But it really doesn't matter who the arbiter is, if you're an eternalist you're not practising the Buddhadharma. It's bizarre that things like this even need to be said here.

Kim O'Hara said:

Peter, it's possible that 'things like this' don't need to be said here and in fact are quite unhelpful in the context of the present discussion. Keith (and I, though I don't rate my opinion as highly as I rate his) have good company:

<https://www.lionsroar.com/the-dalai-lama-and-desmond-tutu-the-best-of-spiritual-friends/>

<https://www.dalailama.com/pictures/final-days-of-conversation-on-joy-dharamsala-hp-india>

etc...

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Precisely the same Dalai Lama who said, "I tell my Christian Friends, 'Emptiness is none of your business.'"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:46 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly, Dogen never encountered any Tibetan Buddhists during his sojourn in China. I think the "no true Scotsman" fallacy might apply to this statement.

Astus said:

Surely he was aware of the various classifications of the teachings that are found in any Mahayana school, so his response was quite intentionally like that.

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring to arguing about superior/inferior, shallow/deep, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:57 AM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

was taught in the language of birds

Losal Samten said:

Anything related to Kyeuchung Lotsawa's bird-teaching abilities with this?

Malcolm wrote:

No, I don't think so.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 1:06 PM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Dzogchen is spoken here as if it's a separate yana from Vajrayana. Is it.... Dzogchenyana?

Malcolm wrote:

Dzogchen is it's own vehicle, including, but not depending on the nine vehicles. You might say it is the basis of all vehicles.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

. I crossed the DW party line, which is basically whatever Malcolm says.

Malcolm wrote:

That is an insult to others. I think an apology is in order here. In this thread you've repeatedly accused others of "group think" and so on, as if people besides myself, who disagree with your notion that Christian Nationalists are not deserving of the appellation of "Christian," and that the religious views of the majority of the insurrectionists are of no account in their actions on 1/6/2021 are not capable of thinking for themselves without my help.

No one suggested you were not a Buddhist, it was suggested that one following a nonBuddhist theistic religion could not practice Buddhism at the same time. In other words, whatever the "zen" Christians might be practicing, it can't be the Zen of Bodhidharma. I think it's pointless to engage in ecumenical dialogues with Christians, Hindus, and so on, but then, I am not a pastoral counselor, a hospital chaplain, or someone whose work is likely to cause them to be in a position of having to give solace to nonBuddhists or even Buddhists who might be struggling with their chosen path, nor am I an ecclesiastical representative of the Sangha. Such people may have good reason to engage in interfaith events, but I am under no such burden.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 10:19 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Sigh, no, I won't be making an apology to anyone. I bowed out to avoid exactly this nonsense.

Take care,  
Keith

Malcolm wrote:

The nonsense initially came from you, when you began accusing others of not being able to think for themselves, because they disagreed with your point of view. Since you can't along with Buddhists, how do you expect to be able to get along with Christians?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Dan74 said:

Does anyone realise that folks here are using exactly the same rhetoric to besmirch all Christians, as Conservatives used against the Muslims, following the terror attacks? That it is inherent to their belief system, that their establishment doesn't condemn it enough, that they are taking over, that given a chance, they will [insert your favourite fear]. It's like you guys work off the same script.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to watch the movie Jesus Camp. And recall, ethnic cleansing in Gods name is a major feature of the Old Testament.

And you didn't read the thread carefully, since you missed the part where I point out religion in politics is toxic, no matter what religion it is. In the case of the US, the main danger to democracy is Christian Dominionism, look it up.

The establishment clause was not written to protect religions from state interference. It was written to ensure freedom from religion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 10:52 PM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

The question then becomes, how do I get started with Ati Yoga?

Is that Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and no, within Dzogchen itself, there are three divisions, mind, space, and intimate instruction series, and within the last, there are four cycles: outer, inner, secret, and utterly secret unsurpassed. Only the last is considered to be definitive.

Generally speaking the difference between Dzogchen and the nine vehicles is that the practice of the former is grounded in a direct experience of gnosis, whereas the practice of the latter is grounded in mind. Another way to put it is that the nine yanas are vehicles of cause and result, whereas Dzogchen is the vehicle which is beyond cause and result.

There are some similarities between Dzogchen mind series, Kagyu Mahamudra and Dogen's Zen, and Chan in general, but there are also important differences.

In the nine yana scheme all sutric Buddhism is included in the shravaka, pratyekabuddha, and bodhisattva vehicles, which are the three vehicles of the cause.

From another point of view, Dzogchen is also part of what is termed Ekayana in common Mahayana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:40 PM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Queequeg said:

Does the ecstatic experience have an analog in Buddhism? I can't imagine a yogini collapsing like St. Teresa.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, not in the Christian/Neo-platonic sense.

Certainly, some visionary experiences among Buddhists might be described as ecstatic. For example, Chetsun Senge Wangchuk's visionary encounters with Vimalamitra in the late eleventh century do not seem very ecstatic, since they consisted of instructions, nor Shangton's visionary encounter with Senge Wangchuk 60 years later for the same reason, but Khyentse Wangpo's visionary recollection of attaining rainbow body as Senge Wangchuk when he visited the site of Senge Wangchuk retreat place does seem to bear some aspect of what we would term ecstatic. He reports his experience of outer ordinary appearances dissolving into luminosity, and then recalling the experience of attaining rainbow body as Senge Wangchuk and so on. So, we might find ecstatic tendencies in the treasure tradition. Spontaneous visions of Padmasambhava, of Tsongkhapa, Sapan, Longchenpa, protectors, yidams, and so on might also be classifiable as ecstatic experience.

But these experiences do not form part of the normal path of a Buddhist nor are they considered particularly valuable in and of themselves since they are just mental phenomena. Though a person may find personal confirmation of their path in such experiences, they would rarely be communicated to others. Usually we only find out about such experiences in their inner and secret biographies and autobiographies.

Certainly trance shamanism, which is has never been completely abandoned in Buddhist countries from Tibet to Japan is ecstatic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 12th, 2022 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: Living Dzogchen Masters?

Content:

Lingpupa said:

What I am saying is that we should not confuse any particular visionary "history" with conventional facts.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, which is why I provided you with the earliest known date for the appearance of the physical witness (as text scholars like to say these days) of the sgra thal 'gyur.

The tantra itself however reveals these facts about itself. Whether someone is inclined to accept the myth and legend it presents or not is precisely the same kind of decision one faces with Mahāyāna sutras and the tantras.

Lingpupa said:

But it would, I think, be unwise to invest an awful lot of time or money in a search for

physical evidence of the Sound Tantra being taught many centuries or millennia earlier than what scholars currently accept.

Malcolm wrote:

The same qualm applies to Kālacakra, the Lotus Sūtra, etc. However, in the case of the Sound Tantra, it is the definitive text of the system of Dzogchen, so regardless of whether one accepts its claims for itself, it occupies the most important position among all tantras of the great perfection, and thus cannot be ignored because it makes claims that text critical scholarship is likely to dismiss. Text critical scholarship is limited by artifacts, physical objects, and inferences and deductions it can safely make on the basis of that evidence. So, it is limited.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 12:21 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Lama Lena good to start with Dzogchen for beginners?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to investigate your prospective gurus for yourself. She is among the people out there teaching Dzogchen in a somewhat open way. But not every teacher is suitable for every student. Only you can discern that. So you have to be like a bee, you have to visit many flowers, not only one. This is the recommended behavior for a person who is interested in Dzogchen teachings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Therefore it interpenetrates and includes Dzogchenyāna...

Malcolm wrote:

No, because Shinjin is not based on direct perception.

Shinjin is not the direct perception of dharmatā.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 2:07 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Nalanda said:

perception of dharmatā.

direct perception.

What are these?

Malcolm wrote:

That's what you will learn, eventually, if you are wise in choosing your teachers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

we are far from the topic.

Malcolm wrote:

That's Dharmawheel for you...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 2:57 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is some truth in that. But the same goes for Zennists. Nichirenistas, Pure Landistas, Theravadins etc. You would not pick a tradition if you were not convinced it was the most effective path, not just for oneself, but in general.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 3:19 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is some truth in that. But the same goes for Zennists. Nichirenistas, Pure Landistas, Theravadins etc. You would not pick a tradition if you were not convinced it was the most effective path, not just for oneself, but in general.

Shinjin said:

Just a lighthearted joke my friend.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I understood, it made me smile.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 9:00 AM

Title: Re: How does general Mahayana see Vajrayana claims of being X?



Content:  
Zhen Li said:  
Therefore it interpenetrates and includes Dzogchenyāna...

Malcolm wrote:  
No, because Shinjin is not based on direct perception.

Shinjin is not the direct perception of dharmatā.

Zhen Li said:  
Shinjin itself is dharmatā, it is Buddha-nature, it interpenetrates all things and implies all vehicles, and yet the full realisation of this occurs upon birth.

Since Dzogchen affirms the ability for a human to perceive dharmatā...

Malcolm wrote:  
It's not the same, but I don't need to press my point. Anyone who is interested can find a teacher who can explain this point in more detail. It's not suitable for public discussion, beyond a simple mention.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, January 13th, 2022 at 11:27 PM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

KeithA said:  
"We" and "they", the source of all wars.

Malcolm wrote:  
As a matter of pragmatics, there will always be "we" and "they" because that's just how sentient beings roll. Therefore, it is useful to understand who are "we" and who are "they." At this point in the history of the US, Christians are "we," Buddhists are "they." You and I are fortunate to live in the Northeast where "we" is considerably more tolerant of "they" than in other places in the US, by your own admission. And I still think Christianity is a preposterous religion. I'm with Porphyry on that one.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 12:23 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

KeithA said:  
"We" and "they", the source of all wars.

Malcolm wrote:

As a matter of pragmatics, there will always be "we" and "they" because that's just how sentient beings roll. Therefore, it is useful to understand who are "we" and who are "they." At this point in the history of the US, Christians are "we," Buddhists are "they." You and I are fortunate to live in the Northeast where "we" is considerably more tolerant of "they" than in other places in the US, by your own admission.

KeithA said:

Not really interested in worldly pragmatics in this context. Sure, if someone breaks into my house, I will engage in some worldly self-defense. And I'll also vigorously oppose the policies that this "they" support. But, in the end, as has already been pointed to me, this is a Buddhist forum. "We" and "they" are destructive ideas when it comes to practice.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the "news, politics, and other hot topics forum." The Kumbhaya forum is over there... The discussion here is discussing the danger to democracy that the Christian Right represents.

Heather Cox Richardson wrote this last night:

This evening, Senate Majority Leader Senator Chuck Schumer (D-NY) announced that he would bring voting rights legislation to the Senate floor for debate—which Republicans have rejected—by avoiding a Republican filibuster through a complicated workaround. When the House and Senate disagree on a bill (which is almost always), they send it back and forth with revisions until they reach a final version. According to Democracy Docket, after it has gone back and forth three times, a motion to proceed on it cannot be filibustered. So, Democrats in the House are going to take a bill that has already hit the three-trip mark and substitute for that bill the Freedom to Vote Act and the John Lewis Voting Rights Advancement Act. They'll pass the combined bill and send it to the Senate, where debate over it can't be filibustered.

And so, Republican senators will have to explain to the people why they oppose what appear to be common-sense voting rules.

This is what we are discussing here, not practice.

KeithA said:

What I saw on 1/6 was a bunch of suffering beings, in the grip of an insane desire for white supremacy and fealty to a mentally unwell narcissist, creating some awful Karma for themselves. They are very much "we".

Malcolm wrote:

Might be you, it isn't me.

KeithA said:

One time I remarked to a Sangha member that I would welcome Trumpers to the Center any time. To my surprise, he recoiled pretty strongly against the idea.

Malcolm wrote:

I am not surprised at all. I frankly don't even see how one can square being a Republican and a Buddhist, but I know such creatures exist, even here.

Social justice is important. Making Trumpsters feel warm and cozy so they will practice zen, etc., not so much.

Christian Nationalism is identity politics suffering from roid rage.

KeithA said:

But, it is there, sitting together, where we can do the best work. I have chafed mightily as my larger Sangha has drifted into the realm of social justice and the various strains of identity politics. It has driven away people who would otherwise be practicing. And practicing together is the most important thing, regardless of pragmatic concerns. IMHO, of course.

Malcolm wrote:

This is how Tibet lost their nation, by being passive and thinking that religious practices would fix everything. It didn't work then, it won't work now.

Chanting sutras, bowing to statues of the Buddha, and sitting in meditation never prevented an invasion or the overthrow of a government, as much as people like to fantasize to the contrary. It's like thinking one can heal illnesses with mantras alone, and forgo medical treatment with that idea in mind.

If we don't identify enemies to democracy, and respond to the threats they pose, we will lose our democracy. Our nation is in a precarious place. I hope you see this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 12:27 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

Can you conceive of, or agree that someone else could conceive of a hypothetical scenario where dependent origination, emptiness, etc. are entirely false and disproven?

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. I mean, I can conceive that someone might have this mistaken idea.

Dgj said:

Or, do you feel that Nagarjuna's teaching, and the teaching in general that everything is empty, impermanent, etc. is irrefutable, and incontrovertibly true?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yup.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 2:05 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:  
Schrödinger's Yidam said:  
I cannot image an object that is permanent, so no.

Malcolm wrote:  
How about a permanent subject?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 2:24 AM  
Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?  
Content:  
Brunelleschi said:  
I think you have misunderstood this. If you are a monk or nun, you are not allowed to work.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not so. Bodhisattva bhikṣus are not obligated to follow this rule, just as they are allowed to handle money, farm, have possessions, property, and so on.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 3:06 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:  
Brunelleschi said:  
<https://fpmt.org/lama-zopa-rinpoche-news-and-advice/lama-zopa-rinpoche-news/unveiling-and-blessing-of-saint-francis-of-assisi-statue-at-the-great-stupa-of-universal-compassion/>

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes. And?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 3:42 AM  
Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020  
Content:

KeithA said:

I don't blame Christians for 1/6.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither do I. I blame Christian Dominionists. As Sara Posner  
[https://www.salon.com/2011/08/21/posner\\_nar\\_dominionism/](https://www.salon.com/2011/08/21/posner_nar_dominionism/):

If people really understood dominionism, they'd worry about it between election cycles.

KeithA said:

That's not what motivates them, though. It's simple racism. It's the glue that binds Trumpism.

Malcolm wrote:

I disagree. I think an extremist version of Christianity does motivate them, just as an extremist version of Islam motivates followers of ISIS, just as an extremist version of Buddhism motivates the junta in Myanmar, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

As far as the last sentence goes, I stand by my words, as I feel they accurately describe what happens when the orthodox Dharmawheel position is veered away from.

Malcolm wrote:

It isn't "groupthink," what you are witnessing is a natural consensus which is not governed by any one person. "Groupthink" requires an authoritarian arbiter of opinion. That does not exist here.

Groupthink is a psychological phenomenon that occurs within a group of people in which the desire for harmony or conformity in the group results in an irrational or dysfunctional decision-making outcome. Cohesiveness, or the desire for cohesiveness, in a group may produce a tendency among its members to agree at all costs.

That does not describe Dharmawheel's members. No one really gives a flying f\*\*k about harmony and cohesiveness here, least of all me.

Also, there is no "orthodox" Dharmawheel position on anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 4:14 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

I personally know 4 people who no longer practice with the Sangha due to the hard left turn we have taken.

ManiThePainter said:

I'm very curious what it means for your sangha to have turned "hard left." Is it expressing solidarity with African-Americans protesting police brutality and with people who suffer from gender dysphoria? If so, is this different from expressing solidarity with Christians who vaguely share some tenets of faith with Buddhists?

Malcolm wrote:

Just shows how far right Americans have drifted when they think "hard left" means BLM. It used to mean Lenin, Trotsky, and Stalin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 4:37 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

I'm very curious what it means for your sangha to have turned "hard left." Is it expressing solidarity with African-Americans protesting police brutality and with people who suffer from gender dysphoria? If so, is this different from expressing solidarity with Christians who vaguely share some tenets of faith with Buddhists?

Malcolm wrote:

Just shows how far right Americans have drifted when they think "hard left" means BLM. It used to mean Lenin, Trotsky, and Stalin.

Brunelleschi said:

Well, Patrisse Cullors is a marxist (not that there's anything wrong with that).

Malcolm wrote:

Bernie, by Faux News standards is far or hard left. By leftwing standards he is center left. BLM is center left. Marxism itself has various shades of left, soft pink to crimson red.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 5:38 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Already answered the question, friend. Nothing left to say on the subject.

ManiThePainter said:

You reiterated that a “hard left turn” had led to some people leaving your sangha. You did not say what a “hard left turn” entailed.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently Keith thinks the civil rights movement (aka the social justice movement) is hard left, since that's all he has said about it:

KeithA said:

I have chafed mightily as my larger Sangha has drifted into the realm of social justice and the various strains of identity politics  
I personally know 4 people who no longer practice with the Sangha due to the hard left turn we have taken.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 6:20 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Never got Marx never did it for me

Malcolm wrote:

Marx has some pretty funny things to say at the end of Capital about British colonials in Burma. But mostly it is a snore of a book.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 6:29 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

You reiterated that a “hard left turn” had led to some people leaving your sangha. You did not say what a “hard left turn” entailed.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently Keith thinks the civil rights movement (aka the social justice movement) is hard left, since that's all he has said about it:

KeithA said:

I have chafed mightily as my larger Sangha has drifted into the realm of social justice and the various strains of identity politics

I personally know 4 people who no longer practice with the Sangha due to the hard left turn we have taken.

Ah well, it will be just a matter a time before this is locked, so I will throw in my two sense. This is bullying.

Malcolm wrote:

I am sorry you feel bullied by your own words.

KeithA said:

Then the minions jump in, to support the bullying. It happens over and over. If you cross Malcolm, you will pay. Everybody knows this, I am just saying it out loud. And no, I won't apologize for voicing this opinion.

Malcolm wrote:

What were you saying about "we" and "they"?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 6:37 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

Ah well, it will be just a matter a time before this is locked, so I will throw in my two sense. This is bullying. This is chastising someone for not toeing the DW company line. This is exactly what I am talking about. But, bring it. I won't be bowed. Tired of the nonsense.

I made a simple point. That in my opinion, 1/6 was motivated by racism, and I also chose not to join in the Christian blame train, which is doctrinal here, by virtue of Malcolm's opinion. Then the minions jump in, to support the bullying. It happens over and over. If you cross Malcolm, you will pay. Everybody knows this, I am just saying it out loud. And no, I won't apologize for voicing this opinion.

Ah well, round and round. I do think a lot of this medium based. If we were sitting in the tea room talking, it would be much more civil.

\_/\_/\_

Keith

Norwegian said:

I really don't see what it is that you think you see is taking place here. Honestly, a lot of posts here wouldn't be necessary if you could communicate clearly with people instead



of speaking vaguely and not actually answering people's questions.

KeithA said:

It's a two way street friend...listening and reading with an open mind is necessary.

Malcolm wrote:

It seems you just want people to agree with you. I could care less if people agree with me. I am just expressing my opinion. Our opinions differ. The difference between you and me, apparently, is that I have never felt bullied on an internet forum in my life, no matter how many people disagree with me, en massé or individually.

Apparently, when several people disagree with you and express similar points of view, you feel a need to identify a ring leader and then castigate the rest of the people with whom you are having a discussion as that person's minions. SMH.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 8:10 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

KeithA said:

listening and reading with an open mind is necessary.

ManiThePainter said:

Then heed your own advice.

For the sake of keeping the dialogue going, I will confess that I was being overly aggressive in my rhetoric about Christian political ambition in the beginning of the thread or at least that I made a monolithic entity out of them. I still think that there's a danger to democracy coming from the political aspirations of many Christians though.

Malcolm wrote:

Christianity is antidemocratic by nature. It goes all the way back to Paul.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 14th, 2022 at 8:37 AM

Title: Re: The Cornpone Intifada - Jan. 6, 2020

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Then heed your own advice.

For the sake of keeping the dialogue going, I will confess that I was being overly aggressive in my rhetoric about Christian political ambition in the beginning of the

thread or at least that I made a monolithic entity out of them. I still think that there's a danger to democracy coming from the political aspirations of many Christians though.

Malcolm wrote:

Christianity is antidemocratic by nature. It goes all the way back to Paul.

ManiThePainter said:

I cannot speak for Catholicism and Protestantism since my fort  was related to the Eastern Orthodox Byzantines (both before and after the Ottoman conquest), and even then my knowledge of the intersection of theology and politics is weak (I know vastly more about Muslim theology and political theory) but suffice to say that for the Byzantines they considered faith and politics to be wed in the form of the Christian Roman emperors.

That being said, I find many Christian movements in North America very disturbing from a Western European point of view.

Malcolm wrote:

Of interest:

Sessions says the Bible justifies separating immigrant families. The verses he cited are infamous.

The passage has been seen as an unequivocal order for Christians to obey authority, has been used to justify Southern slavery, authoritarian rule in Nazi Germany and South African apartheid.

By Kyle Swenson

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2018/06/15/sessions-says-the-bible-justifies-separating-immigrant-families-the-verses-he-cited-are-infamous/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: Deism - An Error

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Deism actually is the view attributed to the materialist philosopher Epicurus, through the latin poem of Lucretius. <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/lucretius/>

In section six, the attitude of Epicureans to religion is discussed:

Lucretius presents Epicurus' chief achievement as the defeat of religio. Although this Latin word is correctly translated into English as 'religion', its literal meaning is 'binding down', and it therefore serves Lucretius as a term, not for all attitudes of reverence towards the divine, but for those which cow people's spirits, rather than, as he thinks such attitudes should, elevate them to a joyful state of tranquility

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Deism - An Error

Content:

Queequeg said:

For Owsley, The Kybalion “was perfect because it put into total context all the things I had experienced on acid. The universe is a creation entirely within a being that is outside time and space, and dreaming what we are. Everything is connected, because it’s all being created by this one consciousness. And we are tiny reflections of the mind that is creating the universe. That’s what alchemy says.”

<https://www.rollingstone.com/feature/owsley-stanley-the-king-of-ld-82181/>

(interesting read)

What is a Buddhist critique of that view? I have some ideas, but curious how others would unpack that.

Malcolm wrote:

It is a nonbuddhist view. There is no universal consciousness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 3:09 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

KristenM said:

A little robot running down the sidewalk making food deliveries.

Malcolm wrote:

Somehow, this just brings out my inner Luddite.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 3:52 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Chandrakirti says somewhere that Niravana is a conventional truth. Humanity is a population, and a society. Language and knowledge exist in a society, in a population.

Malcolm wrote:

"Convention" (vyavahāra) refer to the appearances of ordinary life, not the designations of those appearances. This is a poorly understood point of Madhyamaka. If it were true that "convention" referred to designations, then polka-dotted elephants would appear simply by named.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 4:14 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit  
Content:  
Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
In England too in the East Midlands

Malcolm wrote:  
Obviously it is time for the Butlerian Jihad.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 7:40 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:

Miorita said:  
On a relative level, the Sun is a permanent object/being who shines.

Malcolm wrote:  
There are no permanent objects on the relative level, the sun included.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 7:44 AM  
Title: Re: Deism - An Error  
Content:  
Queequeg said:  
I guess I'm wondering about the experience through which one comes to this view.  
Owsley said this Alchemist book explained what he had experienced on LSD.

What are the errors in interpreting an experience that might lead to a conception of a Creator? We're not talking about someone with a [https://youtu.be/i1Nh\\_3JCFj8](https://youtu.be/i1Nh_3JCFj8) of God. I suppose its too much speculate about Owsley in particular, or anyone in particular.

The way I'm thinking about it now -

1. There is the error of assuming the subject-object dichotomy.
2. There is the error of assuming that some particular object is the fundamental source of one's own consciousness and that of all others.

Thinking out loud on the keyboard here.

Kim O'Hara said:  
For as long as I've had an opinion on the matter (i.e. decades), I have believed that the "standard mystical experience" (unity of creation, floating in a sea of light, universal beneficence, etc) is pretty much universal, and independent of the experiencer's

religious background; but that it is beyond words and afterwards, the experiencer needs to put it into words to try to communicate it - even, perhaps, to try to remember it.

Malcolm wrote:

Such descriptions are notably absent in Buddhist literature. One of things we learn right off of the bat in Buddhadharma, in all schools, is that experiences are transient and not very important. Realization, on the other hand is not transient and is very important.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 7:47 AM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Cite a source please?

Malcolm wrote:

A conversation I had with Khenpo in 1992 at the Newton Dharmadhātu, when he was teaching a program there.

Anders said:

They are quite similar. And why not? Shankara was greatly inspired by Nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

Gzhan stong is not the view of Nagarjuna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 9:48 AM

Title: Re: Deism - An Error

Content:

Shinjin said:

Richard Nixon was a Deist too.

Malcolm wrote:

Not exactly. He was a Quaker. But I am pretty sure the Quakers were not fans of Epicurus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 15th, 2022 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Does shedra style debate have any place in the Dzogchen tradition?

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

As the title says, is this kind of debate useful to sharpen your conceptual understanding

given that Dzogchen is predicated on direct perception?

Malcolm wrote:

In Buddhism, no. In Bon, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 1:17 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Miorita said:

On a relative level, the Sun is a permanent object/being who shines.

Malcolm wrote:

There are no permanent objects on the relative level, the sun included.

Miorita said:

Lavoisier does not agree with you.

Malcolm wrote:

Lots of people did not agree with Nāgārjuna, but they were all wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 4:35 AM

Title: Re: Please Enlighten Me Regarding Ngondro Variations 🙏

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 5:09 AM

Title: Re: Please Enlighten Me Regarding Ngondro Variations 🙏

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Sweet or salty?

Malcolm wrote:

Parmesan and truffle oil.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Extinction as a result of global warming

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

All views are not equal, if they were, it wouldn't matter if one was a Buddhist or a Christian as far as liberation goes. This also applies to politics, where some views, the views of liberals who are committed to democracy, are better than the views of others, such as conservatives, who are not committed to democracy and never have been.

Dharmasherab said:

When it comes to religion this is correct. But when it comes to politics it doesn't matter given that politics will always let us down. Liberalism hasn't made the world a better place.

Malcolm wrote:

Liberalism most certainly has made the world a better place. The examples are legion. The fact that you can communicate your ideas without fear that some governmental authority will arrest you is an example of the benefits of liberalism you overlook.

Dharmasherab said:

Actually in one year abortion became the number one cause of death around the world and this is partly due to the popularity of liberal ideals.

Malcolm wrote:

Since you don't care about the sufferings of countless myriads of nonhuman sentient beings, and see no reason at all to be concerned about mass extinctions, why care about abortions? Your nihilism is quite obvious.

Dharmasherab said:

By considering that Buddhists who are liberals are more sensible than conservative Buddhists you are creating a the grounds for further division among Buddhists.

Malcolm wrote:

There has always been division amongst Buddhists. It's baked in. The Buddha anticipated this.

Dharmasherab said:

What is liberalism today will not be the liberalism in another 2 decades or more. The same labels will be used over and over again but their meanings would change. Today's liberals are for censorship and authoritarianism which is more aligned with fascism than with democracy.

Malcolm wrote:

This is a very silly statement. I am by all considerations a liberal, and I am neither for censorship nor authoritarianism. Quite the opposite.

Dharmasherab said:

This is part of the reason why I am no longer of the left and I left the left.

Malcolm wrote:

What is considered "left" today was considered centrist 50 years ago. I have recently been informed by another participant on this forum, much to my surprise, that the Civil Rights movement the United States was a "hard left" political movement.

Dharmasherab said:

When it comes to being Buddhist what political party you support is not much different from which football team you support.

Malcolm wrote:

This is quite naive, in my opinion. There are no consequences to being a supporter of Man United, for example. There are many consequences if one supports the Tories in England, for example, or the GOP in the United States.

Dharmasherab said:

Its the Buddhist teachings that really matter, other forms of knowledge whether that is communism, socialism or capitalism are samsaric forms of knowledge and practice and will only lead to suffering and disappointment.

Malcolm wrote:

Communism, capitalism, and socialism are not forms of knowledge, they are economic systems. At present, it is quite clear that a mixed economy, one constituted of a mixture of capitalism and socialism, is best for people.

The problem with your point of view, is that by utterly withdrawing from your civic responsibilities, you are abdicating your responsibility to help the myriad sentient beings who cannot help themselves and protect themselves from our economic activity. It is as if you don't care at all about sentient beings because you do not care about the environment. So we are right where we started. You clearly don't care about the happiness and wellbeing of the myriads of sentient beings on this planet and see no reason at all to act to mitigate and reverse the present climate crisis we have caused as a species. Sadly, you have confused nihilism for Buddhadharma. You really need to work on that bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 11:19 PM

Title: Re: How do you feel about Buddhists getting involved in politics?

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

His advice to rulers was within the realms of the Dharma especially in relations to matters on Sila. So in a way one could see that he was encouraging rulers to be more ethical with what they are doing. The same goes for his advice and recommendation when it comes to doing occupations which doesn't involve breaking precepts.



Malcolm wrote:

In a democracy, the people are the rulers, so we can take this advice ourselves.

Dharmasherab said:

But it doesn't mean that he was a Social Justice Warrior either which is the way today's modern progressive liberals engage in.

Malcolm wrote:

Please define your terms, what exactly is negative about social justice, and why should one not fight for it?

Dharmasherab said:

This is the way today's liberals try to hijack Buddhism to use Buddhist groups as instruments to propagate their ideology. The greater interest among them is with their politics and less interest in the Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

I notice that you fail to criticize conservatives who do the same thing, that is, hijack Buddhism to propagate their ideology, for example, in Śrī Lanka, Burma, and so on.

Dharmasherab said:

Spiritual bypassing - Its just another shame tactic for those who want to fully focus on the Dharma and not engage with worldly matters such as politics. Today's global politics involves waging wars and putting populations in debt. Buddhists are best to keep distance from that. Definitions don't mean much. The map is not the territory.

Malcolm wrote:

You are like a man who prefers to keep himself warm at his own stove, but chooses to ignore the fact that his whole neighborhood is on fire.

Dharmasherab said:

Not getting involved in politics is not the same as avoiding politics.

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty much the same.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

The great mass of people will therefore be surplus to requirements.

Malcolm wrote:

World population is already headed in the other direction.

And face it, we have no idea what the world will look like in 2122.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 16th, 2022 at 11:33 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics

Content:

Dharmasherab said:

Plants do need carbon dioxide. Without carbon dioxide plants cant make glucose. If there was no carbon dioxide in the atmosphere then food production would diminish considerably.

Malcolm wrote:

Too much atmospheric carbon dioxide makes some plant foods less nutrient-rich: Likewise, a landmark study in 2018 found that growing rice in high-CO2 conditions makes it less nutritious. As a basic grain, rice plays a critical role in feeding the world's population. The extra CO2 caused an imbalance within the crop's chemical makeup, which resulted in rice that had lower amounts of protein, iron, zinc, and B-vitamins. "The entire elemental balance is out of whack," explained plant physiologist Lewis Ziska, an author of the study. This result is yet another example of how the recipe of nature is being disrupted by excess CO2.

<https://yaleclimateconnections.org/2020/12/more-co2-in-the-atmosphere-hurts-key-plants-and-crops-more-than-it-helps/>

Dharmasherab said:

In addition to ignoring the long-term outlook, he says, many skeptics also fail to mention the potentially most harmful outcome of rising atmospheric CO2 on vegetation: climate change itself. Its negative consequences—such as drought and heat stress—would likely overwhelm any direct benefits that rising CO2 might offer plant life. "It's not appropriate to look at the CO2 fertilization effect in isolation," he says. "You can have positive and negative things going at once, and it's the net balance that matters." So although there is a basic truth to skeptics' claim, he says, "what's missing from that argument is that it's not the whole picture."

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/ask-the-experts-does-rising-co2-benefit-plants1/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 12:14 AM

Title: Re: What do you call a gift of respect to someone more accomplished than you?

Content:

2ndchance said:

just because the health tonic has an alcoholic content of 14%?

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on the monk.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: What do you call a gift of respect to someone more accomplished than you?

Content:

Miorita said:

The alcohol burns the herbs, it takes away some of the virya. It also packs blood vessels with fat.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on how it is made. Medicinal alcohol has long history in Ayurveda.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Conversion of mahayana texts into indian languages

Content:

khemindas said:

I think it would be a nice idea, if somebody would convert mahayana texts into original indian languages into pali and sanskrit...

Malcolm wrote:

This won't work, because even the Tibetan texts are not as uniformly translated as many people imagine. It is best to just translate them straight out of the languages in which they are presently preserved.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 9:42 AM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

The great mass of people will therefore be surplus to requirements.

Malcolm wrote:

World population is already headed in the other direction.

And face it, we have no idea what the world will look like in 2122.

Kim O'Hara said:

2122?

With the way things are changing now, we will have either crashed and burned long

before that or decided we're smart enough to make some hard choices.

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, we have no idea how things are going to go. Right now, it doesn't look very good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 9:22 PM

Title: Re: The Great Quit

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

(which I take to be primarily economics and social justice)

Malcolm wrote:

I was thinking of the the whole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 17th, 2022 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: What is the motivation for Tibetan Buddhists to join the monastics?

Content:

Miorita said:

Of course, the expenses might weigh easier on someone, but a monastery offers education, different horizons and perspectives, and a way of life in which there is a chance to excel. Living high up in the mountains does not allow much interference from the social...

Malcolm wrote:

This a pretty Shangri La account. It's not very grounded in reality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 12:00 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, yes, Ānanda memorised the Mahāyāna but also some people received it in revelation from Vajrapāṇi.

Malcolm wrote:

This is disputed. Vasubandhu in the Vyākhyāyukti criticizes Ānanda because he did not know all the sūtras, meaning the Mahāyāna sūtras.

See Skilling, <https://journals.ub.uni->

[heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/viewFile/9178/3036](https://heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/viewFile/9178/3036)

Also the Tibetan tradition clearly maintains that the compilers of the general Mahāyāna was not Ānanda, but rather Mañjuśrī, Avalokiteśvara, and Samantabhadra on Mt. Potala in South India.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 12:48 AM

Title: Re: Does shedra style debate have any place in the Dzogchen tradition?

Content:

tigerneptune said:

Good to know, i didnt have idea

Malcolm wrote:

Chapter 69 in the Self-Arisen Vidyā Tantra gives keys to refuting opponents of Dzogchen teachings, but we Buddhists have never really turned them into a courtyard debate formate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Chod Teachers England UK

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

I do have the Lord Jigten Sumgon Mahamudra Chod but stopped practicing as I felt I needed a personal teacher to guide.

Malcolm wrote:

Understanding the principle of Chod far more important than playing a chod liturgy, which in any case should only be taken up after one has really understood the meaning of Machik's presentation of the four māras.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 6:28 AM

Title: Re: Chod Teachers England UK

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

I do have the Lord Jigten Sumgon Mahamudra Chod but stopped practicing as I felt I needed a personal teacher to guide.

Malcolm wrote:

Understanding the principle of Chod far more important than playing a chod liturgy, which in any case should only be taken up after one has really understood the meaning of Machik's presentation of the four m̄aras.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Thanks Acharya I'm not in a rush with it but would love to find a teacher to seriously hone down the points and finer points

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, I would try to find instruction on the Great Collection. Practicing Chod liturgies without this is a waste of time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 6:59 AM

Title: Re: Chod Teachers England UK

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Is that in this book?:

[https://www.amazon.co.uk/Machiks-Complete-Explanation-Clarifying-Foundation/dp/1559394145/ref=sr\\_1\\_2?crid=7ERXOASU30MC&keywords=machig+labdron+complete+explanation&qid=1642459714&srefix=machig+labdron+complete+explanation%2Caps%2C134&sr=8-2](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Machiks-Complete-Explanation-Clarifying-Foundation/dp/1559394145/ref=sr_1_2?crid=7ERXOASU30MC&keywords=machig+labdron+complete+explanation&qid=1642459714&srefix=machig+labdron+complete+explanation%2Caps%2C134&sr=8-2)

I have this but not sure if it requires transmission?

Malcolm wrote:

The great collection can be approached from both a sutra and Vajrayana pov, so the lung transmission is good, but not absolutely needed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 18th, 2022 at 4:08 PM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, yes, Ānanda memorised the Mahāyāna but also some people received it in revelation from Vajrapāṇi.

Malcolm wrote:

This is disputed. Vasubandhu in the Vyākhyāyukti criticizes Ānanda because he did not know all the sūtras, meaning the Mahāyāna sūtras.

Zhen Li said:  
Haribhadra suggests...

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, there are various accounts, but the main point I was making is that in general the idea is that Mahayana sutras were not compiled by Ananda, but rather by high bodhisattvas. As far as I know, the first person to point this out was Vasubandhu.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 12:48 AM  
Title: Re: Chod Teachers England UK  
Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
Is it OK to read the whole book or do the other parts require transmission?

Thanks Malcolm

Malcolm wrote:  
It's a little better to have the empowerment before reading the ritual sections, but the instructions in the first part are fine to read.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 1:19 AM  
Title: Re: Chod Teachers England UK  
Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
Is it OK to read the whole book or do the other parts require transmission?

Thanks Malcolm

Malcolm wrote:  
It's a little better to have the empowerment before reading the ritual sections, but the instructions in the first part are fine to read.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:  
So up to section 13 'Door Opening Empowerments'?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes. Unless you have received such an empowerment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 2:46 AM

Title: Re: Nyingthiks

Content:

Passing By said:

Besides the Khandro and Vima Nyingthiks what are the main Nyingthik cycles in Nyingma?

The big three are Nyingthik Yabzhi, Gongpa Zangthal and Chetsun Nyingthik right?

Also how do you tell if a cycle is Nyingthik (as opposed to other divisions of Menngagde) or not since just having the word in the name is not a sure indicator and they may not be as detailed as the main three above? Are cycles like Dudjom Saraha Nyingthik and Khandro Thuktik considered as Dzogchen Nyingthik?

Malcolm wrote:

The term "snying thig" in actuality refers to the teaching of the Seventeen Tantras, that is where the term comes from. Of the many teachings called "snying thig," only the Vima Snying thig, Bla ma yang thig, and the Zab mo yang thig are solely devoted to the teachings of the Seventeen Tantras. The mkha' 'gro Snying thig is based in the klong gsal tantra, which is sort of a compilation of the key topics of the Seventeen Tantras. Then there is the Ati zab don of Terdag Lingpa, this is about is stripped down a Dzogchen Snying thig cycle as one is likely to find. Most of the others, including the dgongs pa zang thal, focus mainly on the teachings of the Seventeen Tantras, but have other more elaborate cycles for intermediate practitioners.

All the other snying thigs have supporting practices derived principally from Anuyoga, but their dzogchen teachings are based on the utterly secret unsurpassed cycle, so they can be included in "snying thig". Otherwise, the term "snying thig" has become kind of a popular name.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 2:57 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Yeah it looks like it hasn't been translated yet by 84000.co

Malcolm wrote:

Everything you really need to know about Mahāyāna is in the Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras and their commentaries. This is the class of sutras, according to Sakya Paṇḍita, the Buddha spent the most time teaching (ten years), out of his 45 year long career. These are the most important sūtras of Mahāyāna, the most extensive class of sūtras (20 volumes in their Tibetan translation), and the sūtras most commented upon in surviving Indian



sources.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 3:46 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Yeah it looks like it hasn't been translated yet by 84000.co

Malcolm wrote:

Everything you really need to know about Mahāyāna is in the Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras and their commentaries. This is the class of sutras, according to Sakya Paṇḍita, the Buddha spent the most time teaching (ten years), out of his 45 year long career. These are the most important sūtras of Mahāyāna, the most extensive class of sūtras (20 volumes in their Tibetan translation), and the sūtras most commented upon in surviving Indian sources.

Nalanda said:

I like that. Thanks. And I might actually do just that, put all my eggs in Prajanaparamita.

Could you please tell me though why people like Alex Duncan would study all Mahayana sutras like this?

<https://palisuttas.wordpress.com/2013/02/18/how-to-study-buddhism/>

If this is not necessary, then why do it? Personal accomplishments? Job?

Malcolm wrote:

You will have to ask him.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 3:59 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Yeah it looks like it hasn't been translated yet by 84000.co

Malcolm wrote:

Everything you really need to know about Mahāyāna is in the Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras and their commentaries. This is the class of sutras, according to Sakya Paṇḍita, the Buddha spent the most time teaching (ten years), out of his 45 year long career. These are the most important sūtras of Mahāyāna, the most extensive class of sūtras (20 volumes in

their Tibetan translation), and the sūtras most commented upon in surviving Indian sources.

Nalanda said:

Also I love that you called out before that some Chinese Sutras are not Sutras. lol Platform Sutra for example. Can we rely on some notable sutras of East Asian Tradition / Pureland Tradition as sutras?

Malcolm wrote:

It has been the case from the time sutras were being set down in writing that different schools did not accept some or all of sutras of some other school. For example, outside of a very few tantras that were basically too important to exclude, virtually all of the tantras of the Nyingma school were excluded from the official Tibetan canon in the 14th century, including all the most important Dzogchen tantras. But we don't care. Likewise there are many sutras likely composed in China that are important to Chinese Buddhists, and they don't care that we do not accept them. We Mahāyānis in general don't care that the Theravadins do not accept our sūtras, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 5:06 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

What do you think?

Malcolm wrote:

I think this guy is a perennialist. I have no patience with that sort of inclination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 5:31 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

What do you think?

Malcolm wrote:

I think this guy is a perennialist. I have no patience with that sort of inclination.

Nalanda said:

Oh...I thought he's strong defense of Mahayana and Tantra against fundamentalist sravakayana make him the opposite of Perennialist. I don't know tho.

Malcolm wrote:

He equates rainbow body with Christian stuff. He also writes stuff on Aleister Crowley, Taoism, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 6:18 AM

Title: Re: So Many Mahayana Sutras - Do They All Agree - Why So Many?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Oh ok then. I just like his take on Early Buddhist Schools. That's all

Malcolm wrote:

There is no reason to criticize early Buddhist schools.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 6:21 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Artziebetter1 said:

whenever I used entheogens and the ocd went away...

Malcolm wrote:

Sounds to me like a brain chemistry issue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: What is the Orthodox position of your school on alcohol, narcotics, psychedelics?

Content:

Padmist said:

Or does it break the precepts as well?

Malcolm wrote:

It breaks the fifth precept. But one does not have to follow the fifth precept at all, in the Tibetan tradition. One can choose to follow only the vows against killing, stealing, and lying.

Of course, if you are a Dzogchen practitioner, there really are no hard and fast rules. You can try anything, but if you get habituated to anything, this is negative.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 19th, 2022 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: What is the Orthodox position of your school on alcohol, narcotics, psychedelics?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I believe I remember you saying there are not many rituals in Dzogchen either in a different post.

Malcolm wrote:

A Dzogchen practitioner can use a lot of rituals, if they find this useful, or none at all. The main point is knowledge (rig pa) of one's own state.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 20th, 2022 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

PeterC said:

Omicron is, hopefully, the end of all of this...

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. Wishful thinking. Think 2024. My guess is that since we are far away from global vaccination, there will continue to be dangerous variants like Omicron (from which one can still die, and still get "long" covid) that will bypass older vaccines, and continue to stress our healthcare systems every year.

Plus, Western Europe is preparing for a war in Eastern Europe in response to Russian aggression over Ukraine, etc. etc.,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 20th, 2022 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

Anders said:

They are quite similar. And why not? Shankara was greatly inspired by Nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

Gzhan stong is not the view of Nagarjuna.

Anders said:

There was neither a "gzhan stong" nor "rang stong" for Shankara to take inspiration from in 8th century India.

But even if there were, how does that relate to what I posited? I am simply saying that it

is understandable that Advaita Vedanta and Gzhan stong should be quite similar, given how much inspiration Shankara took from nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you don't seem to understand here is that gzhan stong isn't derived from Nāgārjuna, but is instead a distortion of Nāgārjuna.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 20th, 2022 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Is there an atman in your school? (Shentong)

Content:

Anders said:

There was neither a "gzhan stong" nor "rang stong" for Shankara to take inspiration from in 8th century India.

But even if there were, how does that relate to what I posited? I am simply saying that it is understandable that Advaita Vedanta and Gzhan stong should be quite similar, given how much inspiration Shankara took from nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you don't seem to understand here is that gzhan stong isn't derived from Nāgārjuna, but is instead a distortion of Nāgārjuna.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Correct. It comes from Asanga and the Kalachakra Tantra.

Malcolm wrote:

Many people overlook the fact that the Agamaśāstra, the source Anders alludes to, combines Madhyamaka and Yogacāra views indiscriminately to present a nondual view of Vedanta. This is what influenced Shankara, since Gaudapāda, the author of the Agamaśāstra, was Shankara's guru's guru.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 20th, 2022 at 11:36 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

PeterC said:

My moneys on annexation of Ukraine by early March.

Malcolm wrote:

My bet is no later than February 23, Men's Day aka the Defender of the Fatherland anniversary.

PeterC said:

He won't do it during the Winter Olympics as that would annoy China.

Malcolm wrote:

This year, I don't think China will care much.

PeterC said:

By April the ground will have melted and will be harder going for tank regiments, and by May the troops will have rotated and he'll have less experienced recruits on the border.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, tanks don't do so well in thick, Ukrainian mud. That lesson was learned in WWII.

PeterC said:

And the demands he's making now are ones that nobody can or will agree to - he's not trying to negotiate, he's preparing an excuse for more aggressive measures.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, Putin wants this war. He needs it because of growing unrest in Russia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

PeterC said:

My moneys on annexation of Ukraine by early March.

Malcolm wrote:

My bet is no later than February 23, Men's Day aka the Defender of the Fatherland anniversary.

PeterC said:

He won't do it during the Winter Olympics as that would annoy China.

Malcolm wrote:

This year, I don't think China will care much.

PeterC said:

The 23rd is days before the closing ceremony. One person in Beijing will be seriously pissed if Putin upstages that, and it's a person Putin needs to stay on good terms with.

Malcolm wrote:

Then I think it will be next week, so they can declare victory on the 23rd. March is already pretty muddy in the Ukraine:

<https://www.climatestotravel.com/climate/ukraine>

I think they will take Kiev, and stop at the Dnieper River...for now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

One thing the pandemic has really shown is the folly of deregulation and austerity measures, but I doubt we will learn the appropriate lessons.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, we've known this from the 80's, but you know, union busting, etc. It's like when the pension fund in Detroit collapsed, driving the city into bankruptcy. Why? Because pension funds were for the first time allowed to invest in stocks, and when those collapsed, that pension fund collapsed, and went bankrupt. Had they stayed in bonds, Detroit would have never gone into receivership.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness as negation

Content:

cyril said:

Ok, so I am currently reading Avi Sion's "Logical criticism of Buddhist doctrines" and I came across the following argumentation:

Emptiness cannot be claimed as a one-off experience because it is defined by negation as the absence of essence or self-nature. Negation is a basic act of reason. It is not something ever directly experienced, not a positive phenomenon. Thus, to claim that what Buddha experienced is precisely emptiness, it would be necessary to claim a positive character to emptiness; otherwise it must be admitted his rational faculty was involved.

Can anyone spot what is wrong in this line of thought? I've been ruminating on this for a couple of days now and I still cannot find any fault in the author's reasoning. And yet, since it denies the Aryas' non-conceptual cognition of emptiness, there must be something wrong there.

Malcolm wrote:

It is very faulty. Buddha's awakening was predicted on seeing dependent origination. Whatever is empty is dependently originated, whatever is dependent originated is empty. Negations are merely an analytical manner of approximating emptiness. Negations are not themselves the insight into the absence of inherent existence of dependently originated phenomena. When an ārya cognizes emptiness, they are cognizing the emptiness of something, and that something is always something which arises dependent on causes and conditions.

So, basically Avi Sion is an idiot who did not bother to even understand the thought of the person he was refuting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 4:24 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness as negation

Content:

cyril said:

Ok, so I am currently reading Avi Sion's "Logical criticism of Buddhist doctrines" and I came across the following argumentation:

Can anyone spot what is wrong in this line of thought? I've been ruminating on this for a couple of days now and I still cannot find any fault in the author's reasoning. And yet, since it denies the Aryas' non-conceptual cognition of emptiness, there must be something wrong there.

Malcolm wrote:

It is very faulty. Buddha's awakening was predicted on seeing dependent origination. Whatever is empty is dependently originated, whatever is dependent originated is empty. Negations are merely an analytical manner of approximating emptiness. Negations are not themselves the insight into the absence of inherent existence of dependently originated phenomena. When an ārya cognizes emptiness, they are cognizing the emptiness of something, and that something is always something which arises dependent on causes and conditions.

So, basically Avi Sion is an idiot who did not bother to even understand the thought of the person he was refuting.

cyril said:

Ok, understood. But when we say all dependently originated phenomena are empty of inherent existence, we do not negate that which arises as dependently originated; that's only the basis for our negation. What we negate is the inherent existence; but, since that is a concept, it follows that the non-conceptual mind could not cognize it as such. It looks like there is something I fail to grasp here.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, inherent existence, an existence that is nondependent, is a false concept that we negate in relation to mere existence, an existence that arises dependent on causes and



conditions. When we search for inherent existence, we cannot find it. That nonfinding is called "emptiness." For example, we can say a pot is empty of water, without implying there is water somewhere else. No one refutes this kind of negation, if they do, it is what is termed an exaggeration, no one argues that saying something is empty of water necessarily implies water elsewhere. Also, no one can argue that the perception of the absence of water is invalid. Sion's thesis, that one cannot perceive an absence is foolish and naive. As I said, he is an idiot.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 5:29 AM

Title: Re: Who is Goddess Prajnaparamita and is she a valid part of the Buddhist pantheon?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I believe that god and goddess are terms that shouldn't be used in Buddhism...

Malcolm wrote:

It results in strained sadhana translations. For devas, asuras, and pretas, these terms are preferred over gods, titans, and ghosts, but in a sadhana, when we are describing an offering goddess, for example, washing water, I think goddess is preferable to devi. But it is a fairly arbitrary choice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 5:53 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness as negation

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, he is an idiot.

Shinjin said:

He has a phd in philosophy according to his bio.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, well, you know what Ph.D stands for? Pinheaded Dope.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 6:40 AM

Title: Re: Who is Goddess Prajnaparamita and is she a valid part of the Buddhist pantheon?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I believe that god and goddess are terms that shouldn't be used in Buddhism...

Malcolm wrote:

It results in strained sadhana translations. For devas, asuras, and pretas, these terms are preferred over gods, titans, and ghosts, but in a sadhana, when we are describing an offering goddess, for example, washing water, I think goddess is preferable to devi. But it is a fairly arbitrary choice.

Miorita said:

It doesn't. It's called a deity.

Malcolm wrote:

Can you imagine, "the female deities of washing water..." Thanks, I'll keep "goddesses."

Anyway, goddess is a fine English word, as is god:

goddess (n.)

mid-14c., female deity in a polytheistic religion, from god + fem. suffix -esse (see -ess).

The Old English word was gyden, corresponding to Dutch godin, German Göttin, Danish gudine, Swedish gudinna. Of mortal women by 1570s. Related: Goddesshood.

god (n.)

Origin and meaning of god

also God; Old English god "supreme being, deity; the Christian God; image of a god; godlike person," from Proto-Germanic \*guthan (source also of Old Saxon, Old Frisian, Dutch god, Old High German got, German Gott, Old Norse guð, Gothic guþ), which is of uncertain origin; perhaps from PIE \*ghut- "that which is invoked" (source also of Old Church Slavonic zovo "to call," Sanskrit huta- "invoked," an epithet of Indra), from root \*gheu(e)- "to call, invoke." The notion could be "divine entity summoned to a sacrifice. "

But some trace it to PIE \*ghu-to- "poured," from root \*gheu- "to pour, pour a libation" (source of Greek khein "to pour," also in the phrase khute gaia "poured earth," referring to a burial mound; see found (v.2)). "Given the Greek facts, the Germanic form may have referred in the first instance to the spirit immanent in a burial mound" [Watkins]. See also Zeus. In either case, not related to good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 8:45 AM

Title: Re: Emptiness as negation

Content:

Shinjin said:

He has a phd in philosophy according to his bio.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, well, you know what Ph.D stands for? Pinheaded Dope.

PeterC said:

Relative to BS, I thought it stood for Piled Higher and Deeper

Malcolm wrote:

That too....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 10:10 AM

Title: Re: Who is Goddess Prajnaparamita and is she a valid part of the Buddhist pantheon?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

, but Buddhists are usually fairly adamant in their assistance that the Buddha is not "god." If we are going to call PP devī a goddess, we have to start saying "our god is Buddha"—no thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring to offering goddesses, not major figures, even so, in Tibetan Buddhism we refer to the creation stage as Deity Yoga. And in that context PP is a deity, like Tara, etc. but thus all an argument over nothing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 10:44 AM

Title: Re: Who is Goddess Prajnaparamita and is she a valid part of the Buddhist pantheon?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

, but Buddhists are usually fairly adamant in their assistance that the Buddha is not "god." If we are going to call PP devī a goddess, we have to start saying "our god is Buddha"—no thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

I was referring to offering goddesses, not major figures, even so, in Tibetan Buddhism we refer to the creation stage as Deity Yoga. And in that context PP is a deity, like Tara, etc. but thus all an argument over nothing.

Zhen Li said:

Even deity, I have noticed, has been something that many newcomers to Mahāyāna/Vajrayāna have found to be a confusing term.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, given that newcomers to Mahayana and Vajrayana are usually completely confused about everything, there are only so many training wheels which be provided. A lot they have to sort out themselves.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

So criticizing them for only treating symptoms is ridiculous and unfounded since they are only for diagnostics...

Malcolm wrote:

Proper diagnostics must account for causes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 10:09 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

So criticizing them for only treating symptoms is ridiculous and unfounded since they are only for diagnostics...

Malcolm wrote:

Proper diagnostics must account for causes.

Toenail said:

I would say that it should be included in treatment. You are taking one aspect of treatment/curing an illness (diagnosing it) and criticize it for not including other aspects of the big thing. That is unfair and really just semantics. At the end all medicine should be evidence based. You look at how patients with this problem feel before the treatment and ask them how they feel afterwards. As simple as you would check whether or not a medicine works.

Malcolm wrote:

If you don't know the cause of an illness, you cannot treat it effectively since you have no evidence to address its causation and hence its cessation. The most you can do is give palliative treatment for symptoms, which sadly, is where most psychiatric medicine is at these days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 10:49 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

I would say that it should be included in treatment. You are taking one aspect of treatment/curing an illness (diagnosing it) and criticize it for not including other aspects of the big thing. That is unfair and really just semantics. At the end all medicine should be evidence based. You look at how patients with this problem feel before the treatment and ask them how they feel afterwards. As simple as you would check whether or not a medicine works.

Malcolm wrote:

If you don't know the cause of an illness, you cannot treat it effectively since you have no evidence to address its causation and hence its cessation. The most you can do is give palliative treatment for symptoms, which sadly, is where most psychiatric medicine is at these days.

Toenail said:

Psychiatric medicine as well as all other schools of thoughts about this do believe they know the causes of these illnesses. Obviously this "OCD is a seizure disorder" thing you defended so strongly before brings no benefit for patients and your medication you referred to as evidence is a shit treatment. CBT is the best option we have to treat mental illnesses. And cbt has a very clear idea of what the causes of most mental illnesses are. It addresses them and when these causes are annihilated the illness is gone.

Malcolm wrote:

CBT is a management strategy only. It does not "cure" anything. But we should define what we mean by "illness" as opposed to "behavior." We will probably avoid unnecessary disagreement by doing so. For me, an illness is a disorder in the physical organism. There are many behaviors which may result from such illnesses, but not all pathological behaviors are "illnesses."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I currently have the coronavirus. For me, it was a rather intense but not deadly 3-day flu. Some difficulty breathing, a lot of coughing. The worse part by far was actually the fever. What am I doing about it? Just hanging out around the house. I predict that today will be the day when just hanging out around the house gets very boring, since I no longer have a fever and am no longer preoccupied with aches and pains in my joints etc.

Malcolm wrote:

My friend, who contracted covid a month ago, is still suffering from exhaustion. And his symptoms would remerge from time to time over the past month, after the first ten days when the vid first ran its course.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 11:09 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

Psychiatric medicine as well as all other schools of thoughts about this do believe they know the causes of these illnesses. Obviously this "OCD is a seizure disorder" thing you defended so strongly before brings no benefit for patients and your medication you referred to as evidence is a shit treatment. CBT is the best option we have to treat mental illnesses. And cbt has a very clear idea of what the causes of most mental illnesses are. It addresses them and when these causes are annihilated the illness is gone.

Malcolm wrote:

CBT is a management strategy only. It does not "cure" anything. But we should define what we mean by "illness" as opposed to "behavior." We will probably avoid unnecessary disagreement by doing so. For me, an illness is a disorder in the physical organism. There are many behaviors which may result from such illnesses, but not all pathological behaviors are "illnesses."

Toenail said:

That is not true at all. CBT can cure most mental illnesses completely. Evidence? Follow-up studies. Also behavior in the phrase CBT means physical behavior as well as thought patterns and emotions etc. It does not just refer to observable behavior.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I understand this. My point is quite different. Mental illnesses are subjective and culturally determined, even physical illnesses, to some extent, are as well. Example— oracles, who clearly from a western diagnostic point of view are sufferers of petite and grand mal seizures, are elevated to important positions in the Tibetan Buddhist hierarchy. Things like cancer, infections, etc., on the other hand are recognized everywhere as physical pathologies. So, again, we are talking at cross purposes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I'm double vaxxed. For me, perhaps because I'm young, it seems like it was a very uncomfortable 3-day affair that is coming to a conclusion. We'll see if I still have symptoms next week.

I did cough up blood once, which was worrying, but only once, and now my coughing is quite mild.

Malcolm wrote:

Covid continues to damage internal organs, even if you don't notice it. The fact you coughed up blood is something you should take seriously.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

All the evidence shows that these are probably real conditions that can be treated.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and seizure disorders are a real possibility in OCD. Many people with epilepsy have associated symptoms of OCD. There are a vast range of seizures in severity. People have mini seizures they do not even recognize. We really do not know very much about the brain. But one thing I do know, having known many people with OCD disorders, is that their conditions is aggravated by what we call vata diets and behaviors. In traditional Tibetan medicine and Ayurveda, OCD is considered a vata disorder, and that it is better for such people have vata reducing diets, etc. Vata diseases are real diseases and they can be treated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 21st, 2022 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Toenail said:

All the evidence shows that these are probably real conditions that can be treated.

Malcolm wrote:

by what we call vata diets and behaviors. In traditional Tibetan medicine and Ayurveda, OCD is considered a vata disorder, and that it is better for such people have vata reducing diets, etc. Vata diseases are real diseases and they can be treated.

Toenail said:

So now you are basically saying these diseases can be cured by adjustments of behavior?

Malcolm wrote:

Not alone, no. They require changes in behavior, diet, combined with herbs and physical therapies. But the Western Medical establishment does not recognize Ayurveda, etc.,

so...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 12:01 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

PeterC said:

He's not really winning any right now.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, he has two people in his party in the Senate who decided to throw in their lot with the party of the insurrection for personal gain.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, and seizure disorders are a real possibility in OCD. Many people with epilepsy have associated symptoms of OCD. There are a vast range of seizures in severity. People have mini seizures they do not even recognize. We really do not know very much about the brain. But one thing I do know, having known many people with OCD disorders, is that their conditions is aggravated by what we call vata diets and behaviors. In traditional Tibetan medicine and Ayurveda, OCD is considered a vata disorder, and that it is better for such people have vata reducing diets, etc. Vata diseases are real diseases and they can be treated.

n8pee said:

Now I'm curious about what a vata reducing diet would entail...

Malcolm wrote:

It is not hard to find out:

<https://www.banyanbotanicals.com/info/ayurvedic-living/living-ayurveda/diet/vata-pacifying-diet/>

There is none of the standard meats added here, but to this list one could add oily fish such as salmon, tuna, etc.; meats such as lamb, duck, and dry aged beef, buffalo, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: Every school/tradition's most effective method/practice to reach



enlightenment...

Content:

Aemilius said:

There are many stories in modern and ancient times when some person practices under the impression and conviction that it is a technique that will take him to enlightenment/nirvana/vimoksha. Then after many years and even decades of searching for and practicing a "perfect technique", he finally meets a person who shows him/her the truth in some simple way or manner.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is true, there is no special technique for awakening, there is just recognition, realization, and liberation. But paths based on mind are limited and produced a limited, and temporal result.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 1:11 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Will Trump win again or will someone worse come in?

Malcolm wrote:

If Trump manages to steal the next election, he will be a smarter, more dangerous Trump.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Proper diagnostics must account for causes.

Johnny Dangerous said:

There are all kinds of idiopathic diseases which are defined primarily by symptoms.

chokyi lodro said:

Correct. And for many mental health conditions, the cause becomes somewhat irrelevant to both the patient and practitioner.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is the Western paradigm, the Hippocratic approach to treating illnesses.

I don't actively practice Tibetan medicine any more, but in Tibetan Medicine and Ayurveda, this view of illness is not favored. If there is an effect, there must be a cause.

If the cause is not addressed—and some causes cannot be addressed in the case of karmic illnesses, for example—the effect cannot be removed, just palliated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I would not at all be surprised with a De Santis or Doctor Oz presidency.

Malcolm wrote:

I would. Trump might win. These two? Never.

More likely would be an MOR Republican like Romney who can catch independent voters and centrists on both sides, leaving the extremes to fume and sputter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 1:41 AM

Title: Re: mostly Raw organic vegan diet for mental health?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

I don't actively practice Tibetan medicine any more, but in Tibetan Medicine and Ayurveda, this view of illness is not favored. If there is an effect, there must be a cause. If the cause is not addressed—and some causes cannot be addressed in the case of karmic illnesses, for example—the effect cannot be removed, just palliated.

chokyi lodro said:

Understood, but my point is that in many instances the cause is simply unknown.

Malcolm wrote:

I understand that Western Medicine leaves these causes as unknown. That is not the case with Tibetan Medicine and Ayurveda. The cause of all diseases is known. They are the three humors: vata, pitta, and kapha. Those in turn arise from desire, hatred, and confusion. Its a complete different way of looking at illness, including mental illness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 2:05 AM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Nalanda said:

What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Malcolm wrote:

A guru.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 2:12 AM

Title: Re: Every school/tradition's most effective method/practice to reach enlightenment...

Content:

Aemilius said:

There are many stories in modern and ancient times when some person practices under the impression and conviction that it is a technique that will take him to enlightenment/nirvana/vimoksha. Then after many years and even decades of searching for and practicing a "perfect technique", he finally meets a person who shows him/her the truth in some simple way or manner.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is true, there is no special technique for awakening, there is just recognition, realization, and liberation. But paths based on mind are limited and produced a limited, and temporal result.

Queequeg said:

By mind, are you referring to mano, manas and alaya vijnananas? I.e. conditioned levels of mind?

Malcolm wrote:

The eight consciousnesses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

More likely would be an MOR Republican like Romney who can catch independent voters and centrists on both sides, leaving the extremes to fume and sputter.

ManiThePainter said:

I thought that Romney, as one of the few Republicans who dared speak out against Trump, was on the Republican shitlist?

Queequeg said:

Yeah, there's no frickin way.

The benches of both parties are pretty thin.

A third party candidate might actually have a shot here. I don't know what that party

would look like.

Right of Center? A little populist/working class?

Malcolm wrote:

How about a Romney/Cheney ticket?

Or HRC again?

We are so f\*\*cked.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Nalanda said:

I'm sold, teacher. I'm sold. But some teacher don't accept any more students.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many good teachers out there. But you have a lot of learn just about General Buddhadharma to begin with. It's better to make a connection with a principle lineage, and then when you know what you are doing, continue from there.

I do not recommend connection with rando teachers on the internet.

Making a connection with a guru is serious business and many so-called teachers presenting themselves as as so-called gurus have concocted or exaggerated credentials. Nor do they have any idea how to care for their students. Being a teacher is a serious responsibility, as is being a student.

So one has to be discerning in the beginning. You have to be like a bee, and see which teachers and lineages resonate, and then investigate them, and see what faults and qualities they have. What you do not need is an old fraud like me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 7:57 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I'm double vaxxed. For me, perhaps because I'm young, it seems like it was a very uncomfortable 3-day affair that is coming to a conclusion. We'll see if I still have symptoms next week.

I did cough up blood once, which was worrying, but only once, and now my coughing is quite mild.

Malcolm wrote:

Covid continues to damage internal organs, even if you don't notice it. The fact you coughed up blood is something you should take seriously.

Caoimhghín said:

Well, I certainly didn't cough up blood and then think "Well, it's just my time of the month."

Malcolm wrote:

Sorry I expressed concern.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 9:02 AM

Title: Re: Question about White Tara Initiation bestowed by H.H. The Sakya Trichen Rinpoche

Content:

Aloke said:

Dear all,

H.H. The Sakya Trichen Rinpoche just bestowed the White Tara Wish Fulfilling Wheel Initiation online today.

Can anyone confirm if it was the Six-Domed White Tara Empowerment?

As it was given at the same time of the scheduled White Tara Retreat at Sakya Canberra:

<https://www.sakya.com.au/civicrm/event/info/?reset=1&id=435>

Thank you very much!

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and you can purchase the sadhana on Amazon as arranged by Khenpo Migmar

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 11:23 AM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Nalanda said:

So what is it that actually brings about enlightenment in someone?

Malcolm wrote:

Insight.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 9:00 PM

Title: Re: Question about White Tara Initiation bestowed by H.H. The Sakya Trichen Rinpoche

Content:

Aloke said:

Thank you so much!

Couldn't find the Sadhana, but I found this very interesting and appropriate book by Lama Choedak Rinpoche:

Meditation on White Tara: The Goddess of Vitality and Longevity

[https://www.amazon.com.br/dp/0994581319/ref=cm\\_sw\\_r\\_apan\\_glt\\_i\\_AZEB351KCYGQGWSF8AHB](https://www.amazon.com.br/dp/0994581319/ref=cm_sw_r_apan_glt_i_AZEB351KCYGQGWSF8AHB)

Malcolm wrote:

The sadhana in in this book.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 22nd, 2022 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: NASA Is Hiring Religious Leaders To Prepare For Encounter With Aliens ?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Has there been any discussion or guide lines about aliens taking refuge in the Three Jewels?

Malcolm wrote:

Nonhuman beings cannot receive upasaka precepts. Nor, for that matter, can all humans. Chapter 4, Kishabhasya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 23rd, 2022 at 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Refuge as a pre-requisite for lung

Content:

Inedible said:

Do you really have to ask? Without going for Refuge, you aren't a Buddhist. You don't have to have a formal ceremony, but you have to say the words. And mean them.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. It's sufficient to be sincerely interested in the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 23rd, 2022 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Refuge as a pre-requisite for lung

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Quite a few different views on this it seems.

From my own basic knowledge I'd assume that practice necessitated refuge.

But is receiving a lung a practice?

Malcolm wrote:

For a practitioner it is a practice, part of the three wisdoms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 23rd, 2022 at 11:29 PM

Title: Re: Are we living in a virtual reality?

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

...Chalmers argues that we could already be inhabitants of a virtual reality: "We can never prove we're not in a computer simulation because any evidence of ordinary reality could be simulated."

This is known as the simulation hypothesis, the scenario that is explored in the recently released Matrix Resurrections. Chalmers points out that humans have already invented games that simulate real life, such as The Sims. These will become more sophisticated over time, with versions of them running on millions of devices. Furthermore, out there in the rest of the universe, "if any aliens have human-level intelligence, they should eventually develop computers and program them. If these alien civilisations survive long enough, they'll likely create simulated universes." Statistically speaking, that means simulated beings probably already vastly outnumber "real" ones. In other words, it's more likely we're living in a simulation than in the original version of our world. ...

Ultimately, Reality+ is about extending our sense of the real. Chalmers's central idea, that "there is more to reality than we thought", is seductive, and I was surprised to find his arguments delightfully – or perhaps worryingly – convincing.

He has taken a subject most people would dismiss as pure science fiction and produced a brilliant and very readable philosophical investigation.

This is the David Chalmers who defined the 'hard problem' of consciousness so we should take him (at least a little ) seriously. His new book Reality+ is reviewed here - <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2022/jan/19/reality-by-david-j-chalmers-review-are-we-living-in-a-simulation>.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

This is just a variation of Descarte's demon:

And yet firmly rooted in my mind is the long-standing opinion that there is an omnipotent God who made me the kind of creature that I am. How do I know that he has not brought it about that there is no earth, no sky, no extended thing, no shape, no size, no place, while at the same time ensuring that all these things appear to me to exist just as they do now?...I will suppose therefore that not God, who is supremely good and the source of truth, but rather some malicious demon [mauvais génie] of the utmost power and cunning has employed all his energies in order to deceive me.

<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/descartes-epistemology/#EvilGeniDoub>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 23rd, 2022 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: Thich Nhat Hanh has passed away

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

TNH's commentary on the Heart Sutra was one of the first Buddhist teachings I ever heard. His social engagement, which grew out of his experience dealing with colonial repression in Vietnam caused him to coin the term "engaged Buddhism." He is the OG Engaged Buddhist teacher, one of the most important Buddhist teachers of the 20th and early 21st century.

"Our ecology should be a deep ecology—not only deep, but universal."

--Thich Nhat Hahn.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 12:08 AM

Title: Re: How to know if a Dharma Center is a "Sangha" or "official"?

Content:

zerwe said:

There are layers of meaning to the word "Sangha." I can't remember, but technically a group would have at least 3 ordained to qualify.

Malcolm wrote:

This refers only to a monastic Sangha.

zerwe said:

The term "Sangha" gets thrown around a lot and, in the west people consider a group of dharma brothers and sisters to be a "Sangha," but this is not the true meaning of the word.



Malcolm wrote:  
Of course it is.

saMgha m. (fr.  $\%{\text{sam}} + \%{\text{han}}$ ) ` " close contact or combination " , any collection or assemblage , heap , multitude , quantity , crowd , host , number (generally with gen. pl. or ifc. , e.g.  $\%{\text{muni-s}}$  , ` " a multitude of sages " BhP. ;  $\%{\text{zatra-s}}$  , a host of enemies Ra1jat.) MBh. Ka1v. &c. ; any number of people living together for a certain purpose , a society , association , company , community ; a clerical community , congregation , church Mn. Sa1h. &c. ; (esp.) the whole community or collective body or brotherhood of monks (with Buddhists ; also applied to a monkish fraternity or sect among Jainas) Buddh. Sarvad. MWB. 176.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 12:43 AM  
Title: Re: Sotapannas and killing  
Content:

Shinjin said:  
Do Sotapannas/stream enterers have the ability to kill according to the Mahayana understanding?

Malcolm wrote:  
Assuming you are referring to Mahāyāna stream entrants, i.e. first stage bodhisattvas, sure—they definitely can end the life of evil beings in order to protect sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 1:13 AM  
Title: Re: Did Buddha really teach the Middle Way?  
Content:

Realmwalker said:  
To me it comes across that you are agitated with my words, and instead of responding indepthly you simply tell me I am incompetent and refer me to go seek out a teacher.

Malcolm wrote:  
The Dunning–Kruger effect is the cognitive bias whereby people with low ability at a task overestimate their ability.  
-- [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dunning%E2%80%93Kruger\\_effect](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dunning%E2%80%93Kruger_effect)

Realmwalker said:  
I am comparing Buddha's wisdom to my own mystical experience in order to deepen my understanding of that experience

Malcolm wrote:  
The Dunning–Kruger effect is usually explained in terms of meta-cognitive abilities. This

approach is based on the idea that poor performers have not yet acquired the ability to distinguish between good and bad performances. They tend to overrate themselves because they do not see the qualitative difference between their performances and the performances of others

-- [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dunning%E2%80%93Kruger\\_effect](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dunning%E2%80%93Kruger_effect)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Does buddhism require taking scripture literally?

Content:

wonderingaround said:

Hi,

I recently encountered an online conversation whether buddhists must accept deities, the other realms etc. as fact and believe in them.

Malcolm wrote:

This rather fundamentalist idea mainly circulates in some Nyingmapa circles.

wonderingaround said:

I have considered myself as a Buddhist for some time and frankly, got slightly upset that my view that I have assumed is very mainstream especially in the West is considered an insult to "real buddhists".

Malcolm wrote:

There are fanatics everywhere.

wonderingaround said:

I would really appreciate any views on this and also how to respond if I encounter this sort of claims again.

Many thanks in advance!

Malcolm wrote:

Treat it the same way you would treat any fundamentalist claim.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Sotapannas and killing

Content:

Shinjin said:

Do Sotapannas/stream enterers have the ability to kill according to the Mahayana understanding?

Malcolm wrote:

Assuming you are referring to Mahāyāna stream entrants, i.e. first stage bodhisattvas, sure—they definitely can end the life of evil beings in order to protect sentient beings.

Shinjin said:  
I'm talking about the Hinayana stream enterer.

Malcolm wrote:  
It's not possible.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 1:58 AM  
Title: Re: Sotapannas and killing  
Content:

Shinjin said:  
I'm talking about the Hinayana stream enterer.

Malcolm wrote:  
It's not possible.

Shinjin said:  
Even out of self defense or if they have a mice infestation inside their homes? How is that practical for them?

Malcolm wrote:  
They live with the mice, they have no self to defend.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 2:01 AM  
Title: Re: Sotapannas and killing  
Content:

Arnoud said:  
Since stream enterers get rid of view of self, clinging to rituals and doubt, how does it follow that they can't kill?

Malcolm wrote:  
They are incapable of breaking precepts, the most basic of which is refraining from killing.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 3:39 AM  
Title: Re: Sotapannas and killing  
Content:

Unknown said:  
"And what does it mean to be consummate in virtue? There is the case where a noble

disciple abstains from taking life, abstains from stealing, abstains from illicit sexual conduct, abstains from lying, abstains from taking intoxicants that cause heedlessness. This is called being consummate in virtue.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/study/into\\_the\\_stream.html#association](https://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/study/into_the_stream.html#association)

Unknown said:

"Monks, there are these six rewards in realizing the fruit of stream-entry. Which six? One is certain of the true Dhamma. One is not subject to falling back. There is no suffering over what has had a limit placed on it. [1] One is endowed with uncommon knowledge. [2] One rightly sees cause, along with causally-originated phenomena.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 5:15 AM

Title: Re: Does buddhism require taking scripture literally?

Content:

wonderingaround said:

Like with all internet arguments, I felt like an idiot for engaging in one, but couldn't help myself reading these outrageous claims.

I was so taken aback by someone claiming that a literal interpretation of the scriptures is mainstream and that I must follow some "american Zen way" to think otherwise.

Malcolm wrote:

There are two doctrines, without which Buddhadharma makes no sense: karma and rebirth. These are the two main existential issues Buddhadharma seeks to address. Without these two doctrines, Buddha's solutions to the problem of suffering do not make sense.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 7:20 PM

Title: Re: Refuge as a pre-requisite for lung

Content:

Inedible said:

I'm not Catholic so I don't take Communion. My parents tried, but it didn't take. I don't know about other religions. Why would someone want to be involved with someone else's religion without actually joining it?

Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha never said to anyone, "Before you sit and listen to me, you must go for refuge to me." However, very often at the end of a discourse, people, impressed by his words, then went to refuge in the Three Jewels.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 7:27 PM

Title: Re: Asoka and the Jains

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Aśokāvadāna, but this is mixing Ājīvakas and Jains and is more legendary than historical.

tingdzin said:

Thanks, I thought it might be something like that.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a strange thing to include if there is no truth to it at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 10:51 PM

Title: Re: Does buddhism require taking scripture literally?

Content:

wonderingaround said:

That to call oneself a Buddhist, one must have faith in these things and that it is wrong to view the stories as metaphorical.

Malcolm wrote:

Wrong view in Buddhadharma is confined to rejecting rebirth, karma, and dependent origination. Questioning the existence of nāgās and so on does not rate as wrong view.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 24th, 2022 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Asoka and the Jains

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is a mistake in the text, but it is clear that Jains were the intended targets of the purge.

Screen Shot 2022-01-24 at 10.00.41 AM.png (119.32 KiB) Viewed 4216 times

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 12:57 AM

Title: Re: Asoka and the Jains

Content:

Zhen Li said:

In fact, as far as what can be established by the edicts alone, Aśoka himself was supportive of Buddhism, Jainism, Brahmanism and Ajīvikism.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, after a certain point in his reign. But the Avadana records that he was a tyrant, very cruel, and explains the reason for his softening to be the execution of his brother.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Refuge as a pre-requisite for lung

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Nobody here is saying anything about never taking refuge.

Since I'm planning on taking an online lung within a couple of months but might be unable to take formal refuge (I would like to do so in person at a temple or with a sangha and to take vows) due to the current coronavirus strain, I was merely wondering if it was pointless to receive the lung if I hadn't already gone for refuge.

PeterC said:

You can take refuge anywhere, at any time. If you feel a little formality would be desirable, look into Garchen R's 'refuge at a distance' arrangement.

ManiThePainter said:

Thanks PeterC. I thought I had read somewhere that one had to go for refuge and take vows in person (one could say it by oneself but it would not be the same). Clearly I was misinformed.

Malcolm wrote:

Mahayāna refuge can be taken by visualizing the Buddhas and bodhisattvas in front of you and reciting refuge formula. You do not need a preceptor. This system is clearly taught in the Mahāyāna sūtra. However, you should not let other people's religious trips make you anxious.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 1:20 AM

Title: Re: Refuge as a pre-requisite for lung

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Thanks PeterC. I thought I had read somewhere that one had to go for refuge and take vows in person (one could say it by oneself but it would not be the same). Clearly I was misinformed.

Malcolm wrote:

Mahayāna refuge can be taken by visualizing the Buddhas and bodhisattvas in front of you and reciting refuge formula. You do not need a preceptor. This system is clearly taught in the Mahāyāna sūtra. However, you should not let other people's religious trips make you anxious.

ManiThePainter said:

Thanks. I appreciate the help.

So the cutting of hair as part of the refuge ceremony is just a formality?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it is a formality. You never read in the sutras where someone cuts hair just for going for refuge. All ordination rites are later developments. None of them come from the Buddha himself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 1:57 AM

Title: Seventeen Tantras Lung with Tulku Dakpa

Content:

Unknown said:

Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche, the director of Danakosha Ling in Finland, at the request of Zangthal Editions in association with Wisdom Publications, has kindly agreed to bestow the reading transmission (lung) of the Seventeen Tantras online beginning March 18, 2022, the anniversary of Nirmāṇakāya Garab Dorje's birth on Danakosha Island.

Malcolm wrote:

Register here:

<https://wisdomexperience.org/seventeen-tantras-lung/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 9:16 AM

Title: Re: Asoka and the Jains

Content:

Zhen Li said:

but Ajātaśatru killed his father so he committed one of the five heinous crimes.

Malcolm wrote:

This is debatable, actually. He didn't actually slay Bimbisara, rather, Bimbisara starved to death. As Ajatashatru attained stream entry, etc., according to some accounts, it's questionable if he committed an uninterruptible deed, and is a topic of debate among Tibetan scholars.

As far as Ashoka goes, I think it certainly plausible that early in his conversion he may

have engaged in sectarian violence, despite his later turn toward tolerance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 9:38 AM

Title: Re: Is Jamyang Losel a monk?

Content:

Nalanda said:

<https://sakyachodcholing.org/blueflower/>

Asking because the website says he is an ordained monastic but he seems to have a lot of hair on his head.

Malcolm wrote:

He is a getsul, not a gelong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 11:03 AM

Title: Re: Seventeen Tantras Lung with Tulku Dakpa

Content:

Charlie123 said:

Thank you, I am excited for this. Do you know who Tulku Dakpa received this transmission from?

Malcolm wrote:

Sangye Nyenpa, who received it from Dilgo Khyentse.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Shaiksha said:

Hi All

Here is the registration link (just in case anyone needs it):

[https://wisdomexperience.org/seventeen-tantras-lung/?fbclid=IwAR1aZyyMvIQyBl3bEhJ0o5iKH7qWrbDY8MKzqrRV0ZoQfn0nxYIDJ5ut\\_ok](https://wisdomexperience.org/seventeen-tantras-lung/?fbclid=IwAR1aZyyMvIQyBl3bEhJ0o5iKH7qWrbDY8MKzqrRV0ZoQfn0nxYIDJ5ut_ok)

I have a question and hopefully someone can help me. Once I receive this transmission, can I also read and practice with the Buddhahood in this life since it is a related text? Or, do I need to have a separate transmission?

Thank you all in advance.



Malcolm wrote:

In general, you to have received Dzogchen transmission and instructions on how to practice. There is no DIY Dzogchen for beginners.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 11:27 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Shaiksha said:

Another question, if I may though: how does Buddhahood relate to the Seventeen Tantras in terms of practice? If I receive the transmission and instructions for the Seventeen Tantras, should I still get a transmission and instruction on Buddhahood when an opportunity arises? E.g. are they complementary or one is more complete than the other?

Malcolm wrote:

If you have received the lung for the Tshig Don mDzod (Treasury of Genuine Meaning) than you can read Buddhahood, providing of course you have received Dzogchen transmission. Both it and Buddhahood present how one is to systematically approaches the material in the 17 tantras, the former being an expansion of the latter by Longchenpa.

If you receive the lung for the 17 tantras you can study those tantras that have been translated, as well as their commentaries.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

truthb said:

I am wondering about Mahayana/Vajrayana Teachers, Schools or Sutras which talk about the inevitable "salvation" of all from Samsara?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to distinguish between two types of gotra, or inclination for awakening: natural and activated.

Only those sentient beings who have activated their inclination for awakening will attain buddhahood. There is no guarantee that all sentient beings will awaken to full buddhahood, since there is no guarantee that all sentient beings will eventually take birth as human beings with eight freedoms and ten endowments and meet the Dharma. And meeting the Dharma is the condition for attaining Buddhahood. And, the Buddha did say:

Misdeeds cannot be washed away with water.

Suffering cannot be removed by hand.  
I cannot give liberation to you,  
but I can demonstrate the path.

Meeting the path of the Dharma always requires some cause, some gathering of merit. No one can meet the Dharma and practice the path without first attaining the precious human birth. Various examples are taught by the Buddha to illustrate the rarity of the fully qualified human birth, one of the most famous of which is that a precious human birth is as rare as a blind sea turtle who rises to the surface of the ocean every one hundred years, and just happens to put his head through a golden yoke that has been floating on the surface of the ocean.

So, no, there is no valid Mahāyāna tradition that teaches it is inevitable that all sentient beings will attain buddhahood. It is a realistic probability that some sentient beings, despite having the potential to attain buddhahood, will never gather the causes and conditions for meeting the Dharma, much less even be reborn as a human being who can attain buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, January 25th, 2022 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Shinjin said:

It's impossible since the number of sentient beings is infinite.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but it is an infinity that has a limit. Meaning, no new sentient beings come into being. So it could be possible, but there are other factors that make it improbable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Shinjin said:

It's impossible since the number of sentient beings is infinite.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but it is an infinity that has a limit. Meaning, no new sentient beings come into being. So it could be possible, but there are other factors that make it improbable.

Shinjin said:

In other words the number is actually finite but there's a high improbability of it ever happening because of icchantikas.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we Madhyamakas don't actually admit there is such a thing as real icchantikas, but allow that there are de facto "icchantikas"

in so far as there are some sentient beings who may never have the causes and conditions to meet the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Shaiksha said:

Another question, if I may though: how does Buddhahood relate to the Seventeen Tantras in terms of practice? If I receive the transmission and instructions for the Seventeen Tantras, should I still get a transmission and instruction on Buddhahood when an opportunity arises? E.g. are they complementary or one is more complete than the other?

Malcolm wrote:

If you have received the lung for the Tshig Don mDzod (Treasury of Genuine Meaning) then you can read Buddhahood, providing of course you have received Dzogchen transmission. Both it and Buddhahood present how one is to systematically approach the material in the 17 tantras, the former being an expansion of the latter by Longchenpa.

If you receive the lung for the 17 tantras you can study those tantras that have been translated, as well as their commentaries.

Shaiksha said:

Oh okay - good to know the relation between Longchenpa's Precious Treasury of Genuine Meaning and Buddhahood. How does theg mchog mdzod (Treasury of Supreme Vehicle) come into the picture? Do we even have a translation on this work?

I note that a new book is coming out - the Precious Treasury of the Fundamental Nature. I wonder if this is a translation and commentary of theg mchog mdzo?

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

The Theg mchog mdzod is a treatment of the 17 tantras in 25 chapters. It is in two volumes and has not been translated. And it really shouldn't be translated until all 17 and their extant commentaries have been translated.

The text you mention, the gnas lugs mdzod, is not the theg mchog mdzod.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 3:15 AM

Title: Re: Creating representations of the Buddha = Wealth, Fame, Happiness?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Question about the sutra “Describing the Benefits of Producing Representations of the Thus-Gone One”

Āryatathāgata-pratibimba-pratiṣṭhānuśaṃsa-saṃvarṇananāmadharmaparyāya

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh320.html>

It says that you will get this as benefits:

excellent life circumstances such as happiness and fame

physical beauty

wealth they will accrue

the donor will become a universal emperor enjoying all the advantages of that position

that the donor will be reborn among the gods and enjoy all divine distinctions.

and this is over "benefits accrued by creating representations of the Buddha."

What is this "representation" being talked about here? Statues of the Buddha?

And, really? Those benefits are to be expected for creating statues of the Buddha?

Malcolm wrote:

Statues and paintings. But this does not mean just coming up with some drawing.

Images of the Buddha have to be made according to very strict rules composition and need to be studied under a qualified teacher.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 3:19 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Shinjin said:

In other words the number is actually finite but there's a high improbability of it ever happening because of icchantikas.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, we Madhyamakas don't actually admit there is such a thing as real icchantikas, but allow that there are de facto "icchantikas"

in so far as there are some sentient beings who may never have the causes and conditions to meet the Dharma.

Shinjin said:

Does everything cease to exist if every sentient being attains parinirvana? No more earth, deva realms, pure lands, rainbow bodies etc?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, because the cause of outer universe is the result of collective karma of all sentient beings. No sentient beings, no karma, no outer universe left. All that will be left is the field of the wisdom of Buddhahood, which is actually all there is anyway, we just don't see it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 4:04 AM

Title: Dodrupchen is in Thukdam

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sad news.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Dodrupchen is in Thukdam

Content:

Arnoud said:

Indeed. Did you ever meet him?

Malcolm wrote:

Once.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 5:19 AM

Title: Re: Monastic Advice for Modern Society

Content:

BodhiPrajna said:

My friend then asked me, "How can someone who has spent their whole life in a monastery, cloistered away from the real world, offer any advice on how to live in the real world, when they don't have bills to pay, and they don't get stuck in traffic or have a boss that talks down to them, and they don't deal with any of the things that people in the real world have to deal with on a daily basis?"

Malcolm wrote:

Samsara is samsara no matter where you. Monasteries also have bills to pay, monks get stuck in traffic, and have pushy bosses too, etc. Your friend has a misunderstanding of monastic life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 6:36 AM

Title: Re: Dodrupchen is in Thukdam

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Sad news.

Seeker12 said:

I saw a facebook post saying that reports of his death were misinformation and he was in fact doing just fine. Do you have reliable info that he has passed?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

It has been confirmed to me by a Tibetan tulku. Also Khenpo Tsewang Dongyal announced it earlier today.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:07 AM

Title: Re: Monastic Advice for Modern Society

Content:

BodhiPrajna said:

My friend then asked me, "How can someone who has spent their whole life in a monastery, cloistered away from the real world, offer any advice on how to live in the real world, when they don't have bills to pay, and they don't get stuck in traffic or have a boss that talks down to them, and they don't deal with any of the things that people in the real world have to deal with on a daily basis?"

Malcolm wrote:

Samsara is samsara no matter where you. Monasteries also have bills to pay, monks get stuck in traffic, and have pushy bosses too, etc. Your friend has a misunderstanding of monastic life.

KeithA said:

This. Monks have many of the same concerns lay people have. They are just framed a little different. No one escapes the fire of samsara.

Malcolm wrote:

Plus they have added anxiety of modeling awakening, whether they are or not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:22 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, Dzogchen also teaches that it is inevitable that all beings will attain Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

It's interpretable and can't be taken at face value, since Dzogchen texts also state some Buddhas err and return to the state of being sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:26 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So, no, there is no valid Mahāyāna tradition that teaches it is inevitable that all sentient beings will attain buddhahood.

Zhen Li said:

Jōdo Shinshū.

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a claim you can validate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Toenail said:

can I read Buddhahood in this life?

Malcolm wrote:

It's better if you the lung for BITL.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:04 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

some Buddhas err and return to the state of being sentient beings.

ConfusedOne said:

If I may, would you explain what err is? Sounds really interesting. Can't seem to find more about this on google.

Queequeg said:

It would mean that some beings, after attaining buddhahood, fall back into the error of not recognizing their fundamental state, buddhahood. Its a logical impossibility.

Malcolm wrote:

For lower yanas, yes, it seems impossible. But the Buddhahood they assert is reversible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:14 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Queequeg said:

I agree with Zhen Li here - there is ample scriptural support for the assertion that all sentient beings will become buddhas;

Malcolm wrote:

No, there is scriptural support for the idea all can become Buddhas. Even the Lotus only asserts a prediction. Such assertions are interpretable, like the teachings on buddhanature itself. Thus is not a guarantee that all will become Buddhas. This is why Indian Madhyamakas, no slouches when it comes to reading and interpreting sutras, deny the existence of icchantikas while allowing that there are some beings so benighted that they will never attain buddhahood.

They amount to a "Sure, buddy, you can do it!" In contrast to the sourpuss shravakayana assertions that one has to receive a prediction in person from a buddha, while being male and so on.

And, if all sentient beings are actually going to become Buddhas, thus undermines the reason for having bodhicitta in the first place. There are a number of negative consequences for taking such a position literally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Dude, you're just a sim.

Content:

Queequeg said:

Some people who think very highly of their intelligence think we're living in a computer simulation.



Malcolm wrote:  
Such people failed Phil101.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 10:45 PM  
Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
I agree with Zhen Li here - there is ample scriptural support for the assertion that all sentient beings will become buddhas;

Malcolm wrote:  
No, there is scriptural support for the idea all can become Buddhas. Even the Lotus only asserts a prediction. Such assertions are interpretable, like the teachings on buddhanature itself. Thus is not a guarantee that all will become Buddhas. This is why Indian Madhyamakas, no slouches when it comes to reading and interpreting sutras, deny the existence of icchantikas while allowing that there are some beings so benighted that they will never attain buddhahood.

They amount to a "Sure, buddy, you can do it!" In contrast to the sourpuss shravakayana assertions that one has to receive a prediction in person from a buddha, while being male and so on.

And, if all sentient beings are actually going to become Buddhas, thus undermines the reason for having bodhicitta in the first place. There are a number of negative consequences for taking such a position literally.

Queequeg said:  
I think I come around more or less without carrying the one, so to speak. As edifying stories, they imply what needs to be done now, by someone who chooses to undertake the path. Whether such calculations are even possible where the absolutes are inestimable is beside the point. One must conduct themselves as though this is a literal possibility. At bodhi, from what I can infer, the actual answer to this question doesn't matter.

Malcolm wrote:  
Also, Dzogchen teachings assert that while all sentient beings manifested in this mahakalpa will attain buddhahood, in the next kalpa, an infinite number of latent sentient beings will manifest.

Above, I said "traditions", I should have said "positions." The position that all sentient beings will attain buddhahood is not a valid Mahayana position, IMO.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Queequeg said:

It would mean that some beings, after attaining buddhahood, fall back into the error of not recognizing their fundamental state, buddhahood. Its a logical impossibility.

Malcolm wrote:

For lower yanas, yes, it seems impossible. But the Buddhahood they assert is reversible.

Queequeg said:

I've encountered this teaching in Tiantai, also. They assert the buddhahood of lower teachings (doesn't follow the same yana model in Dzogchen) is provisional in nature and not authentic Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a symptom of an incomplete gnosis.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Prajnaparamita Translations & Commentaries

Content:

Zhen Li said:

"Groundless Paths" is also the same kind of work, but from the Nyingma tradition.

Malcolm wrote:

The AA commentary by Paltrul is basically just a crib of Tsongkhapa's AA commentary. So, one should just get Sparhams translation of Tsongkhapa's commentary.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:22 PM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

Toenail said:

can I read Buddhahood in this life?

Malcolm wrote:

It's better if you the lung for BITL.

Toenail said:

Any idea when he will give it next?

Malcolm wrote:

I have no idea. Recently Shechen Rabjam gave the lung for the 7 treasures of Longchenpa. If you attended that, that is sufficient. But in reality, it is a text you should hear, not just read.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Queequeg said:

I've encountered this teaching in Tiantai, also. They assert the buddhahood of lower teachings (doesn't follow the same yana model in Dzogchen) is provisional in nature and not authentic Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

It's a symptom of an incomplete gnosis.

Queequeg said:

Yes. The degree of incompleteness is commensurate with the relative insight of the particular yana. The thing that distinguishes the highest teaching from the penultimate teaching is whether fundamental nescience, the ignorance beyond the myriad dust like afflictions, is overcome.

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhology is fun!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:34 PM

Title: Re: Does buddhism require taking scripture literally?

Content:

wonderingaround said:

That to call oneself a Buddhist, one must have faith in these things and that it is wrong to view the stories as metaphorical.

Malcolm wrote:

Wrong view in Buddhadharma is confined to rejecting rebirth, karma, and dependent origination. Questioning the existence of nāgās and so on does not rate as wrong view.

wonderingaround said:

Thank you Malcolm. Are there any (possibly) beginner friendly resources on this I could do further readings on?

Malcolm wrote:

There is an interesting book by Bhikku Analayo on rebirth:

<https://www.amazon.com/Rebirth-Early-Buddhism-Current-Research/dp/1614294461>

wonderingaround said:

German Buddhist monk and university professor Bhikkhu Analayo had not given much attention to the topic of rebirth before some friends asked him to explore the treatment of the issue in early Buddhist texts. This succinct volume presents his findings, approaching the topic from four directions. The first chapter examines the doctrine of rebirth as it is presented in the earliest Buddhist sources and the way it relates to core doctrinal principles. The second chapter reviews debates about rebirth throughout Buddhist history and up to modern times, noting the role of confirmation bias in evaluation of evidence. Chapter 3 reviews the merits of current research on rebirth, including near-death experience, past-life regression, and children who recall previous lives. The chapter concludes with an examination of xenoglossy, the ability to speak languages one has not learned previously, and chapter 4 examines the particular case of Dhammaruwan, a Sri Lankan boy who chants Pali texts that he does not appear to have learned in his present life. *Rebirth in Early Buddhism and Current Research* brings together the many strands of the debate on rebirth in one place, making it both comprehensive and compact. It is not a polemic but an interrogation of the evidence, and it leaves readers to come to their own conclusions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, January 26th, 2022 at 11:54 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Malcolm wrote:

There are some well-known pure lands: Khechari realm, where the vidyādhara hang out (but you only get there by realizing mahāmudra); the Copper Colored Mountain where Padmasambhava hangs out; Sukhavati where the Amitabha devotees hang out. There is Tara's pure land, called the Turquoise realm, Avalokiteśvara's pure land, Mt. Potala in S. India, Mañjuśrī's pure land, Wutai Shan, in China, Medicine Buddha's pure land (which you can take birth in if you recite the dhāraṇī of Medicine Buddha seven times every day), etc. All of these pure lands are "generated nirmāṇakāya" pure lands,

which arose out of the aspiration of this or that bodhisattva to purify a buddhafiield, one of the important deeds of a bodhisattva on the stages.

There are also natural *nirmāṇakāya* buddhafiields, which are buddhafiields emanated by the five *sambhogkāya* buddha families. Birth in these is guaranteed for the average practitioner of Dzogchen teachings, people who have received Dzogchen teachings but are unable to practice them well in this life.

The special feature of these *nirmāṇakāya* buddhafiields is that the door to the three realms is permanently closed, and perfect, full buddhahood is attained within five hundred human years, without taking another birth in *samsara*, rather than the interminably long, albeit blissful and edifying, time one spends in other pure lands. It should also be mentioned that middling practitioners of Dzogchen attain perfect, full buddhahood in the *bardo*. The best practitioners attain perfect, full buddhahood either in this life or at the moment of death.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 12:13 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (*Sukhavati*?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

According to Machig Labdron:

For those who wish to become buddhas swiftly, it is necessary to pray for rebirth in a pure buddha-field...

Malcolm wrote:

Everything she says is true with respect to common *Mahāyāna* practitioners.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (*Sukhavati*?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

There are many Dzogchen/Vajrayanists who encourage practioners to pray for rebirth in *Sukhavati*. Karma Chagme for example, a well known Dzogchen master.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but most practitioners are not Dzogchen practitioners. And a lot of *Vajrayāna* practitioners like to hedge their bets. But Dzogchen practitioners don't need to be concerned about this, but if they like to recite aspirations for birth in *Sukhavati*, there is no problem with this either. Everytime I recite the *Bhadracaryapranidhana*, etc., I don't deliberately exclude the aspiration for birth in *Sukhavati*. But I also know that for me it is not necessary. YMMV.

Just to add a point: Dzogchen is its own vehicle, it does not depend on the lower vehicles in any way. One can of course approach it from lower vehicles, but it is independent and stands on its own.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 1:09 AM

Title: Re: Seventeen Tantras Lung with Tulku Dakpa

Content:

Marenz said:

Do you know if Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche has plans to give the rigpa'i tsal wang at some point? Does he offer this from time to time, and would you have a suggestion on how to best connect with him?

I think this an excellent opportunity and would like to receive these verbal transmissions, but as I have not received Dzogchen transmission up until now, I'm wondering what would be the benefit in my receiving the lungs only.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not hard to become a student of Tulku Dakpa. He is very kind.

The benefit of the receiving the lungs now is that you won't have to receive them again later. In any case, I am not sure what empowerments you may have received, but most Nyingma empowerments contain the rig pa rtsal dbang in a brief form, at minimum. At worst, you will create a positive connection to receive Dzogchen teachings in the future, so there is really no downside to attending.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Wait, there's a distinction?

Pure Buddhafield (Sukhavati) - aspiration of common Mahayana?

natural nirmāṇakāya buddhafiels, which are buddhafiels emanated by the five sambhogkāya buddha families - aspiration of Dzogchen/Vajrayanist? (although they can opt for Sukhavati as well?)

Malcolm wrote:

No. b) is not an aspiration. It is a guaranteed result of practicing the path for people of minimal diligence. One doesn't need to have faith in the aspirations of this or that buddha or rely on "other power" in order to take birth in these buddhafiels. However,

one does need to a) have the fortune to meet Dzogchen teachings, b) have faith in them, and c) try to put them into practice as best one can.

It is not a competition however. Sukhavati teachings are a perfectly suitable and valid path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

So for Dzogchenyanist, they don't bother with Purelands at all except those who like hedging bets in common Mahayana aspirations?

Malcolm wrote:

I can't speak for most Dzogchen practitioners.

I can tell you that my main teacher never emphasized pure lands at all. And I can tell you for sure that in the Dzogchen tantras and commentaries, there is little emphasis on pure lands at all, outside of what I just mentioned, that is, how it is explained for average practitioners. Most Dzogchen practitioners attain buddhahood in the bardo, eliminating the need for pure lands at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Delaying Buddhahood is not part of the bodhisattva path.

Caoimhghín said:

This is something that Mahāyānikas often end up explaining exhaustively to their critics. It is Parinirvāṇa that is delayed, not Bodhi.

Malcolm wrote:

Even then, Mahāyāna nonabiding nirvana can encompass the display of parinirvana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 2:31 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

This is something that Mahāyānikas often end up explaining exhaustively to their critics.

It is Parinirvāṇa that is delayed, not Bodhi.

Malcolm wrote:

Even then, Mahāyāna nonabiding nirvana can encompass the display of parinirvana.

Caoimhghín said:

Yes, but the skandha-parinirvāṇa does not actually occur at the apparent end of life of an Āryabodhisattva. They aren't Śrāvakabuddhas. The display is just a display. Kleśa-parinirvāṇa occurs arguably far before the stage at which one is called an "Ārya" bodhisattva. The bodhisattvas do not indefinitely put-off kleśa-parinirvāṇa, surely, even though one might appear as such to guide defiled beings as one of them.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as a śrāvakabuddha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

1 point is well within the margin of error, and polling has consistently understated Trump's actual turnout.

I don't think that Trump is a lock (and he might get indicted soon, which would throw a crimp in things), but I don't think a 1-point lead two years out is a slam dunk for Biden either.

Malcolm wrote:

Especially with GOP's record of attempted and successful election rigging.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: Nyingthiks

Content:

Pema Rigdzin said:

It's in these upadeshas from our guru that we find our realization.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, as the Tantra Without Syllables states:

"The dharmakāya is encountered in the intimate instructions."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 3:34 AM



Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Shinjin said:

Polls were showing Hillary would beat trump by landslide in 2016 .

Malcolm wrote:

Well, she did. Trump pulled off an electoral college win by the thinnest of margins, 77k votes across four states. The GOP knows they can only win by cheating now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

This is incorrect. I do not expect you to be familiar with terminologies for "Arhats" from foreign sects that you've not studied though. Likely there is no such term in your tradition, so you've mistakenly stated that such a term does not exist.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh I am familiar enough with the term as used in Hinayāna schools. But there isn't any such thing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 4:37 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Toenail said:

I feel like practice with little diligence may still be really hard in reality? What are the criteria of it?

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty sure you already know. Anyway, people who are interested can just go to teacher and find out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 4:58 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Who needs Pure Land when you have Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

It's not like that. Despite whatever petty quarrels people have, all Dharma is good in the beginning, the middle, and the end. For example, Zhen li is a Jodo Shinshu person, he always slips in a plug for Jodo Shinshu, where ever he can. He's really on about other power, etc. We couldn't say that he is making a mistake by forgoing Dzogchen teachings. He has likely even received some. But he is into Jodo Shinshu. All we can say is that from a Dzogchen point of view, the practices and teachings that belong to the nine yānas are based on mind (citta) and not gnosis (jñāna). But we don't expect that others will agree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 5:01 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

This is incorrect. I do not expect you to be familiar with terminologies for "Arhats" from foreign sects that you've not studied though. Likely there is no such term in your tradition, so you've mistakenly stated that such a term does not exist.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh I am familiar enough with the term as used in Hinayāna schools. But there isn't any such thing.

Caoimhghín said:

Out of curiosity, do you interpret the fourth of the eight downfalls for ordinary persons (referencing the 18 root downfalls for those who do not know) as something like "denying the rousing of the Arhats?"

Malcolm wrote:

The elimination of afflictions is a necessary, but not a sufficient, condition for buddhahood. Also seventh stage bodhisattvas eradicate the afflictive obscuration entirely, but they do not then attain buddhahood.

As for arhats being roused from a samadhi of cessation, this is standard Mahāyāna doxology.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 5:33 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Not necessarily. Plenty of Buddhists don't believe in it and agree with Ven Hùifēng and believe that "Arhat = game over." For these, it is necessary that Arhats be a variety of Buddha, much like Aryabodhisattvas are a variety of Buddha and Pratyekabuddhas are

a variety of Buddha.

Malcolm wrote:

This idea of three gotras is provisional.

Caoimhghín said:

If Arhats are not a variety of Buddha, then the Śrāvakas do not have an authentic path to liberation.

Malcolm wrote:

Liberation comes from having eliminated the afflictive obscuration. Vasubandhu points out, however, that arhats and pratyekabuddhas possess a nonafflictive ignorance. And it is clearly stated in Mahāyāna sutras, such as the Lanka, that arhats are roused from their samadhi of cessation and required to join the path again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 5:41 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Does citta-based practice mean of a different (higher-grade) than jhana-based practices?

Malcolm wrote:

No, Dhyāna is citta based practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 5:56 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Not necessarily. Plenty of Buddhists don't believe in it and agree with Ven Hùifēng and believe that "Arhat = game over." For these, it is necessary that Arhats be a variety of Buddha, much like Aryabodhisattvas are a variety of Buddha and Pratyekabuddhas are a variety of Buddha.

Malcolm wrote:

This idea of three gotras is provisional.

Caoimhghín said:

To be fair, they say that the doctrine of the rousing is provisional.

I believe in the rousing myself, it's in the Lotus Sūtra and the Prajñā Treatise, but there are plenty that don't. Furthermore, we are talking about Buddhahood in two different ways with regards to two different things. I am familiar with imperfect degrees of

Buddha, including "(Ārya)Bodhisattva" and "Pratyekabuddha."

Malcolm wrote:

Who are "they?" Some modern academicians?

There are all kinds of grades of bodhi, that is not at issue here. We can certainly consider tenth stage bodhisattvas a type of buddha, since the Abhisamayālaṃkāra deems it so, since their omniscience is very nearly that of a samyasaṃbuddha. But to claim that arhats and pratyekabuddhas cannot be roused from their samadhi a) defies scripture b) defies logic. In the first place, we have already agreed that there is scriptural evidence that arhats, etc. are roused. In the second place, asserting they cannot be roused means they are essentially icchantikas, that their continuums have ceased to exist, and so on. Moreover, such an assertion harms the bodhisattva path, because the consequence of this assertion is that no one can attain samyaksambuddhahood, not even the buddha, since as soon as their afflictions are completely eradicated, a bodhisattva can no longer proceed on the bodhisattva path. So I stand by my initial claim. There is no such thing as a śrāvakabuddha. They may not like the idea since an arhat, once roused from cessation, has to begin at the Mahāyāna path of accumulation, rendering them effectively ordinary sentient beings.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:01 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I see. I'm confused by this. So Dzogchen is jhana or Citta?

All we can say is that from a Dzogchen point of view, the practices and teachings that belong to the nine yānas are based on mind (citta) and not gnosis (jñāna). But we don't expect that others will agree.

Malcolm wrote:

You are confusing the Sanskrit term jñāna (gnosis) with the Pali term jhana (concentration).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:04 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Shinjin said:

Polls were showing Hillary would beat trump by landslide in 2016 .

Malcolm wrote:

Well, she did. Trump pulled off an electoral college win by the thinnest of margins, 77k votes across four states. The GOP knows they can only win by cheating now.

Shinjin said:

Both sides are always accusing the other of cheating.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but only one actually does cheat, the GOP, at least in modern elections since Reagan. For example, the Gore recount was shut down because of a riot fomented purposefully at the counting precinct by Roger Stone. Had the ballots continued to be counted, it is a sure thing, a matter of fact and not speculation, that Florida would have to have gone to Gore.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:16 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Other than that, the only other I've heard of is Ven Hùifēng based on his reading of the Śakra section of the Prajñāpāramitā.

Malcolm wrote:

can you point me to a link.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:32 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

It's the link from earlier. It's poorly formatted, not being clearly integrated into my text well. I'm on my phone, so hyperlinks are a bit dodgy. Look on page 1, the fourth post from me. There's a hyperlink there.

I had thought I had read you two disagreeing over it, but likely it was something else I'm misremembering. I think I'm conflating you explaining the rousing in one of the old "three vehicles/ekayāna" threads with that linked thread from ages ago.

Malcolm wrote:

Here is the passage:

If a person has already entered into the status of certitude [to perfection], they are unable to generate mental aspiration toward anuttarāsamyaḥ sambodhi. For what reason? Because they have already constructed an embankment against [the torrent of cyclic] birth and death.

-- An Annotated English Translation of Kumārajīva's Xiaōpīn Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra

This is not a problem. This requires that arhats be roused in order to be introduced to Mahāyāna aspiration. It is not a passage claiming arhats cannot be roused by a buddha. The reason it is possible for an arhat to realize perfect buddha eventually is given a little later:

Then, Ānanda said: "Teaching the meaning of Prajñāpāramitā in this way, avinivartin bodhisattvas, those who possess right views, and arhats who have fulfilled their aim; [people] such as these will be able to take it up."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:39 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I can agree with that. I can also see the other side's logic, even if I don't agree with it and think that the conclusion is flawed.

There's more issues than that though, as I see it. By his logic voiced elsewhere that I can find in a bit, a Bodhisattva becoming a Bhūmika would be like a Śrāvaka stream-entrant: seven lifetimes and then it's "over." According to the more radical consequences of his thought, attaining the first bhūmi would have to be indefinitely postponed.

Malcolm wrote:

There are many issues with such a position, such as the one you just mention.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 7:19 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

That is such a great promise of Dzogchen.

A good slogan might be:

Who needs Pure Land when you have Dzogchen?

or

Dzogchen, why settle?

Skip the lines, take Dzogchen.

Shinjin said:

The same can be said about pure land. It has a success rate.

Malcolm wrote:

There are in fact various points of view on that in Tibetan Buddhism. The general point of view is that it is not so easy as Japanese schools maintain.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 8:27 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Pure Land - It ain't easy but its guaranteed.

Malcolm wrote:

Well,that's the point. It's not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 10:21 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Pure Land - It ain't easy but its guaranteed.

Malcolm wrote:

Well,that's the point. It's not.

Nalanda said:

It's not?

The idea is you end up there and your enlightenment is guaranteed. Isn't this a universal understanding?

Malcolm wrote:

If you end up there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 10:56 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

As for TB, people practice all their lives to accumulate merit and realisations, and yet, at the end of the day, they rely on Amitābha to gain birth and attain actual buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

Even then, it's not guaranteed, even from the point of view of the tradition of Karma Chakme. A commentary by Tujey Zhanphen Pel on Karma Chakme's famous aspiration specifies four requirements for birth in Sukhavati: the support, the recollection of the merit field at the time of death; the cause, gathering of accumulations and the purification of obscurations; the assistant, the generation of bodhicitta; and the condition, the pure aspiration.

The point is that if, at the time of death, one cannot maintain this recollection of Amitabha and his host, even if one spent a lifetime aspiring to birth in Sukhavati, one will not succeed in the end. From this perspective, mere faith is not a sufficient cause, in our tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 11:04 AM

Title: Re: How do you replace negative thoughts with positive thoughts?

Content:

2ndchance said:

How do you replace negative thoughts with positive thoughts?

Let me give you two examples.

1) A middle-aged man has an attractive younger female platonic friend. He likes to develop bodhicitta / loving-kindness / compassion for his attractive younger female platonic friend without triggering any lustful emotions and/or romantic emotions at all.

How does he replace negative lustful emotions and/or romantic emotions towards his attractive younger female platonic friend with bodhicitta / loving-kindness / compassion?

Malcolm wrote:

He should cultivate the thought this woman is his daughter or his younger sister.

2ndchance said:

2) A middle-aged man has a very aggressive hot-tempered younger brother who has been attacking the middle-aged man with verbal abuse and vulgarities and even threatening the middle-aged man with physical violence and challenges to physical fights.

How does he replace negative angry emotions towards his younger aggressive hot-tempered bully brother with bodhicitta / loving-kindness / compassion?



Malcolm wrote:

He should understand this younger man is not in his right mind. And if necessary, place distance between himself and the aggressor.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 11:15 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Beings are infinite, I vow to liberate them all.

This is what it means to be a bodhisattva. Infinite means infinite. Liberate means liberate. It's so simple and yet it's beyond calculative thought.

Malcolm wrote:

In the Tibetan tradition this is understood to be an impossible aspiration, though meritorious. For example, the Buddha, as Shantideva points out, perfected generosity not because he could actually relieve the poverty of all sentient beings, but because he wished to—the merit of such aspirations exceeds the fact that they cannot possibly be achieved. And it goes without saying, Buddhas cannot liberate anyone. The proof of this is that there are still sentient beings. No Buddha with the capacity to liberate sentient beings would ever leave so many in samsara. One can only liberate oneself from this samsara. No Buddha or bodhisattva can do it for you. There is no choice but to practice a path taught by the Buddha, and without a precious human birth, that choice isn't even available.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 11:30 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Birth in the lowest grade and lowest rank is rendered possible by one's own power, thinking of Amida even only ten times, including by those who committed the five grave offences.

Malcolm wrote:

This is definitely not considered adequate for birth in Sukhavati in the Tibetan tradition.

Buddhas cannot hand you liberation. All they can do is show you the path.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 11:45 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Beings are infinite, I vow to liberate them all.

This is what it means to be a bodhisattva. Infinite means infinite. Liberate means liberate. It's so simple and yet it's beyond calculative thought.

Malcolm wrote:

In the Tibetan tradition this is understood to be an impossible aspiration, though meritorious. For example, the Buddha, as Shantideva points out, perfected generosity not because he could actually relieve the poverty of all sentient beings, but because he wished to—the merit of such aspirations exceeds the fact that they cannot possibly be achieved. And it goes without saying, Buddhas cannot liberate anyone. The proof of this is that there are still sentient beings. No Buddha with the capacity to liberate sentient beings would ever leave so many in samsara. One can only liberate oneself from this samsara. No Buddha or bodhisattva can do it for you. There is no choice but to practice a path taught by the Buddha, and without a precious human birth, that choice isn't even available.

Zhen Li said:

This is conflating the time of aspiration with the time it takes to liberate beings. The time it takes is also infinite. Buddha activity is continuous and infinite. From the perspective of an ordinary being it will appear like nothing is being done, but actually, awakening activity is continually being wrought upon one unawares.

Again, the idea that one is liberating oneself is from the ordinary perspective. From the ultimate perspective, all hearing, understanding, and practice are performed by the Buddha, who dwells within the bodies of all beings. This is taught in Chapter 1 of the Tathāgataguhya.

Malcolm wrote:

From the ultimate perspective there is no Buddha, sentient being, liberation, or bondage. There isn't even a dharmakaya.

Did you have in mind a specific passage from your translation?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 12:02 PM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

To be fair, they say that the doctrine of the rousing is provisional.

I believe in the rousing myself, it's in the Lotus Sūtra and the Prajñā Treatise, but there are plenty that don't. Furthermore, we are talking about Buddhahood in two different ways with regards to two different things. I am familiar with imperfect degrees of Buddha, including "(Ārya)Bodhisattva" and "Pratyekabuddha."

Malcolm wrote:

Who are "they?" Some modern academicians?

There are all kinds of grades of bodhi, that is not at issue here. We can certainly consider tenth stage bodhisattvas a type of buddha, since the Abhisamayālaṅkāra deems it so, since their omniscience is very nearly that of a samyasaṃbuddha. But to claim that arhats and pratyekabuddhas cannot be roused from their samadhi a) defies scripture b) defies logic. In the first place, we have already agreed that there is scriptural evidence that arhats, etc. are roused. In the second place, asserting they cannot be roused means they are essentially icchantikas, that their continuums have ceased to exist, and so on. Moreover, such an assertion harms the bodhisattva path, because the consequence of this assertion is that no one can attain samyaksambuddhahood, not even the buddha, since as soon as their afflictions are completely eradicated, a bodhisattva can no longer proceed on the bodhisattva path. So I stand by my initial claim. There is no such thing as a śrāvakabuddha. They may not like the idea since an arhat, once roused from cessation, has to begin at the Mahāyāna path of accumulation, rendering them effectively ordinary sentient beings.

ItsRaining said:

This view is very popular amongst those that study or specialise in Yogacara, particularly Xuanzang's transmission of it in China. One text reports that before Xuanzang returned to China he asked Śīlabhadra on whether he should teach the five gotras as it was extremely unpopular among Chinese Buddhist. Śīlabhadra replied that if he were to teach anything he must teach the five gotras as that was the definitive view of the Mahayana. People kept carrying on this legacy I guess.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, Yogacara accepts icchantikas. But their view on this is incorrect.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 6:34 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Astus said:

Imagining that there are sentient beings and buddhas out there somewhere, how is that not delusion?

Malcolm wrote:

No more deluded than imagining that there are Buddhas and sentient beings “in here somewhere”

Poor Huineng, the delusions perpetrated in his name...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 7:26 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

. but not having enough monoclonals for transplant recipients in my hometown.

Malcolm wrote:

They don't work against omicron, that's why the FDA pulled authorization on their use.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 8:03 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No more deluded than imagining that there are Buddhas and sentient beings “in here somewhere”

Astus said:

Such an assumption was meant to be avoided by the subsequent quotes. Another one on that specifically:

Malcolm wrote:

Quotes are boring, unless couched in reasonings which they support. Proof texts are not arguments. they are to be used to support arguments. You can't just imitate the words of old masters. You have to use your own words, which show your own understanding.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: For myself

Content:

KathyLauren said:

I am home now. It won't be a speedy recovery, but I am on the mend.

Om mani padme hum

Kathy

Malcolm wrote:

Glad to hear it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Is it mainstream/majority Mahayana view that arhats are to walk the Bodhissatva path eventually?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is the mainstream view.

Nalanda said:

Does that mean then that they are reborn (inspite of what they expected: arhats = end of rebirth) reborn as regular sentient beings to become Bodhissatva?

Malcolm wrote:

This is a difficult point. Some scholars assert that, once roused from the absorption of cessation (nirodhasamāpatti), arhats are basically equivalent to 7th stage bodhisattvas and some even assert they can enter the bodhisattva path on the eighth bodhisattva stage because it is asserted that arhats are equivalent to bodhisattvas in realizing the selflessness of phenomena that is the absence of inherent existence.

Other scholars assert that once roused from the absorption of cessation (nirodhasamāpatti) arhats must begin at the beginning of the Mahāyāna path of accumulation since they have not generated Mahāyāna bodhicitta nor have they realized the profound emptiness free from extremes. I personally favor the latter position because the Abhisamayālaṃkāra clearly describes the superiority of the hearing and reflection on signlessness in the Mahāyāna path of accumulation, and so on. Gorampa summarizes it as follows in his Moonrays:

Therefore, in our own system of Madhyamaka, although the selflessness of the three yānas is equivalent, the difference between whether freedom from proliferation, the two accumulations, the ultimate nature and reality are realized or not realized is clear in all Madhyamaka textual systems.

Basically, arhats have a subtle grasping to true existence because they do not realize four-fold signlessness. Since they have this subtle grasping to true existence, they continue to grasp a self. Because they continue to grasp a self, they accumulate action. And since they continue to accumulate action, they can continue to take birth, having been roused from nirodhasamāpatti. And because of this arhats, in order to realize buddhahood, must begin at the beginning of the Mahāyāna path of application where one reviews through hearing and reflection signlessness, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, January 27th, 2022 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Wow, that's just wow. I have some adjustments in thinking to do. I just thought arhats are enlightened (but that their enlightenment is not similar to that of the Buddha) and that once enlightened there is nothing further to do. I didn't know they are still in samsara and will take rebirth in spite of the belief that there is nothing further after their reaching their arhatship.

Malcolm wrote:

Arhats, after they die, are basically formless realm beings, who because they have subtle traces, wind up taking birth again. They are among the "some buddhas" who err and re-enter samsara. It's not very shocking, since we already know that arhats can fall away from arhatship, according even to śrāvaka sources.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 12:54 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

From the ultimate perspective there is no Buddha, sentient being, liberation, or bondage. There isn't even a dharmakaya.

Zhen Li said:

That's why this discussion is going in circles. The ultimate perspective is continually being responded to with the conventional perspective.

Malcolm wrote:

The ultimate perspective is that no buddha, sentient being, liberation, bondage, or buddhakāyas can be established at all. Buddha, sentient being, liberation, bondage, kāyas, gñoses, etc. are all just conventional designations and do not refer to anything real. Why? Your sūtra itself states it as follows:

The tathāgata kāya is the kāya of space, the kāya equal with the unequalled, the kāya that is superior to all the three realms, the kāya of endowed with the suchness of all sentient beings, the kāya that is incomparable, unmatched, pure, immaculate, and without all afflictions, the kāya of natural luminosity, the kāya that does not arise by nature, the kāya that is unproduced by nature, the kāya that is not connected with mind, intellect, or consciousness, the kāya that has the nature of an illusion, mirage, and a moon in the water..."

Then of course, there is the Sūtra That Explicates the Relative and Ultimate Truth ( ārya-saṃvṛti-paramārtha-satya-nirdeśa-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra Toh. 179):

Child of a good family, all buddhafiels are not buddhafiels. Why? because there is truly is no birth in the ultimate. All buddhas are not buddhas. Why? because there is truly no production in the ultimate. All phenomena are not phenomena. Why? Because there is there is truly nothing real in the ultimate. All sentient beings are not sentient beings. Why? Because there is truly no source of suffering in the ultimate.

Zhen Li said:

Chapter 1 section 8k

Malcolm wrote:

Not seeing how this section endorses your assertion.

Zhen Li said:

But more specifically Chapter 15 section 1: the superior wisdom possessed by all Tathāgatas dwells in the bodies of all sentient beings...

Malcolm wrote:

I don't agree with your rendering of this part of the passage:

ཆོས་སྤྱི་བ་དེ་དག་ཐམས་ཅད་ཀྱི་ལུས་ལ་དེ་བཞིན་གསལ་བའི་ཡེ་ཤེས་གནས་སོ

This states very clearly in Tibetan, "The gnosis of the tathāgata abides in the bodies of all those dharmabhāṇakas."

It does not say the the gnosis of the tathāgata abides in the bodies of all sentient beings. This being so, I reject your argument.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Where does the rigpa'i tsalwang fit in?

Content:

Sonam Gyalmo said:

No, I'm not asking anyone to describe it. I have a fair idea what it "is", and it not a thing I'd ask net-writers to break "secrecy" about.

But I do need help understanding where it fits it. Such as:

Is it a Longchen Nyingtig speciality?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Sonam Gyalmo said:

If it's found outside Longchen Nyingtig, do other dzogchen traditions put the same emphasis on it?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes.

Sonam Gyalmo said:  
Does it appear both as a stand-alone empowerment as well as embedded in other more deity-oriented or lama-oriented empowerments?

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes.

Sonam Gyalmo said:  
Does it appear in equivalent form but under another name in other parts of the Nyingma and dzogchen traditions?

Malcolm wrote:  
Sometimes it is referred to as the "precious word empowerment." Sometimes it is called "direct introduction." Sometimes it is called "the extremely unelaborate empowerment."

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 1:28 AM  
Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?  
Content:  
Shinjin said:  
Are the four requirements that Karma Chakme talks about based out of the Pure Land sutras or is it only his opinion?

Malcolm wrote:  
It is based on a passage from Ārya Amitābhavyūha Sūtra:

Ānanda, any sentient beings who repeatedly thinks of the aspects of that tathāgata, generates immeasurable quantities of roots of merit, totally dedicates themselves to generating the thought to awaken (bodhicitta), and offers supplications to be born in that world, when the time of death draws near will see before them the Tathāgatam Arhat, Samyaksambuddha Amitābha surrounded by many groups of bhikṣus. Upon seeing Bhagāvan Amitābha, they will die with a mind of utter faith, and be born in that world, Sukhavati."

Karma Chakme's prayer is structured around these four points from the sūtra. His aspiration is a supplement to the Sadhana practice of Amitabha found in the Sky Treasure (Nam chos) tradition, which is widely practiced in both Nyingma and Kagyu, but not really in Sakya or Geluk.

There is a shorter aspiration, set down by Namcho Migyur Dorje:



༄༅། སྒྲོན་ལམ་བཟུས་པ་བཞུགས།

## Brief Sukhāvātī Aspiration

from the terma of Mingyur Dorje

ཨམ་ཧོ་ ངོ་མཚར་སངས་རྒྱས་སྒྲུང་བ་མཐའ་ཡས་དང་།

emaho, ngotsar sangye nangwa tayé dang

Emaho! Amitābha, magnificent Buddha of Boundless Light,

གཡས་སུ་རྩོལ་བྱུགས་རྗེ་ཆེན་པོ་དང་།

yé su jowo tukjé chenpo dang

With the great compassionate lord Avalokiteśvara to his right,

གཡོན་དུ་སེམས་དཔའ་མཐུ་ཆེན་པོ་ནམས་ལུ་

yöndu sempa tuchen tob nam la

And Vajrapāṇi-Mahāsthāmaprāpta on his left,

སངས་རྒྱས་བྱང་སེམས་དཔའ་མེད་འཁོར་གྱིས་བསྐོར་།

sangye changsem pakmé khor gyi kor

Surrounded by an assembly of countless buddhas and bodhisattvas

བདེ་སྐྱིད་ངོ་མཚར་དཔག་ཏུ་མེད་པ་ཡི།

dekyi ngotsar paktu mepa yi

In the place of wonder and boundless joy and happiness

བདེ་བ་ཅན་ཞེས་བྱ་བའི་ཞིང་ཁམས་དེར་།

dewachen shyekawé shyinkham der

That is the heavenly realm of Sukhāvātī, the Blissful Paradise.

བདག་ནི་འདི་ནས་ཆོ་འཕོས་གྱུར་མ་ཐག་།

dak ni di né tsé pö gyur ma tak

When the time comes for me to leave this present life,

སྐྱེ་བ་གཞན་གྱིས་བར་མ་ཆོད་པ་རུ་

kyewa shyen gyi bar ma chöpa ru

May I go there directly, without any other birth upon the way,

དེ་རུ་སྐྱེས་ནས་སྒྲུང་མཐའི་ཞལ་མཐོང་གྲག་།

dé ru kyé né nang té shyal tong shok

And being reborn there, may I see Amitābha face to face!

དེ་སྐད་བདག་གིས་སྒྲོན་ལམ་བཟུས་པ་འདི།

deké dak gi mönlam tabpa di

May this, my fervent prayer of aspiration,

ཕྱགས་བཅུའི་སངས་རྒྱས་བྱང་སེམས་ཐམས་ཅད་གྱིས་།

chok chü sangye changsem tamché kyi

Be blessed by all the buddhas and bodhisattvas of the ten directions

གེམ་མེད་འགྲུབ་པར་བྱིན་གྱིས་བརྒྱབ་ཏུ་གསོལ།

gekmé drubpar jingyi lab tu sol

So that it is accomplished, without the slightest hindrance!

ཏཏ་སྐྱེ་པལྱ་རྩི་ཡ་ལྷ་མ་བོ་ན་ལྷ་ཡེ་སྐྱ་རྒྱེ།

teyatha | pentsadriya awabodhanayé soha

tadyathā pañcendriyāvabodhaniye svāhā

ཞེས་པ་འདི་ནི་སྐུལ་སྐྱེ་མི་འགྲུར་དོན་རྗེ་དགྲུང་ལོ་བརྒྱ་གསུམ་གསེར་འཕྱུང་གི་ལོ་ས་ག་ལྷ་བའི་ཆོས་བདུན་ལ་གཙོ་འཁོར་རྣམས་ཀྱིས་ཞལ་གཟིགས་པའི་ཆོ་སངས་རྒྱུས་ལྷ་བ་མཐའ་ཡ་ས་ཀྱིས་དངོས་སུ་གསུངས་པའོ།།

When Tulku Mingyur Dorje was thirteen years old, on the 7th day of the month of Saga Dawa, Fire Bird year (1657), he had a vision of the deities of the maṇḍala, and Buddha Amitābha spoke these words directly.

<https://www.lotsawahouse.org/tibetan-masters/terton-mingyur-dorje/brief-sukhavati-aspiration>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Dodrupchen is in Thukdam

Content:

reipun said:

Tidwell said the Thukdam Project is working on a study of how bodies decompose in different climatic conditions in India, and Dunne said he wants to look outside the brain for signs of post-mortem consciousness."

Malcolm wrote:

They are barking up the wrong tree. I know Dunne and Tidwell, they at least know Tibetan and can check sources. But there are problems they will encounter such as the distinction made in Dzogchen texts between rig pa, which exits the body through the eyes, and mind, which exits the body through the fontanelle. Moreover, there is the fact that unlike other tantric traditions, the highest level Dzogchen practitioners do not remain in thukdam for many days. The less developed your practice is, the longer your thukdam will be.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 3:48 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Are the four requirments that Karma Chakme talks about based out of the Pure Land sutras or is it only his opinion?

Malcolm wrote:

It is based on a passage from Ārya Amitābhavyūha Sūtra:

Ānanda, any sentient beings who repeatedly thinks of the aspects of that tathāgata, generates immeasurable quantities of roots of merit, totally dedicates themselves to generating the thought to awaken (bodhicitta), and offers supplications to be born in that world, when the time of death draws near will see before them the Tathāgatam Arhat, Samyaksambuddha Amitābha surrounded by many groups of bhikṣus. Upon seeing Bhagāvan Amitābha, they will die with a mind of utter faith, and be born in that world, Sukhavati."

Shinjin said:

Thank you, but the Larger Sutra states:

(3. The lower grade)

[25] The Buddha said to Ananda, "The lower grade of aspirants are the devas and humans in the worlds of the ten quarters who sincerely desire to be born in that land. Although unable to do many meritorious deeds, they awaken aspiration for the highest Enlightenment and single-mindedly concentrate on Amitayus even ten times, desiring birth in his land. When they hear the profound Dharma, they joyfully accept it and do not entertain any doubt; and so, remembering the Buddha even once, they sincerely aspire to be born in that land. When they are about to die, they will see the Buddha in a dream. Those aspirants, too, will be born in the Pure Land. Their merit and wisdom will be next to those of the middle grade of aspirants."

<http://web.mit.edu/stclair/www/larger.html#Three%20grades%20of%20aspirants>

Nowhere does it mention the four requirements here.

Malcolm wrote:

What I quoted from is the so-called Large Sūtra, it is the passage immediately before this one above. The Sanskrit and Tibetan text certainly mentions these four requirements for those who see Amitabha before them in person. For whatever reason, in the Tibetan tradition, seeing Amitabha in a dream is not sufficient for immediate birth, only those of the first and second grade will do so.

Because the second grade also generate (1) bodhicitta, (2) the altruistic thought to attain birth there, (3) much merit, and (4) direct their minds to Sukhavati, when they approach death, an emanation of Amitabha and his retinue appear to that person and as soon as they die, they will take birth in Sukhavati.

No such stated guarantee is made for people who merely see Amitabha in dream. In its Sanskrit and Tibetan version there is no statement in the Long Sūtra that as soon as those person's die they will be born in Sukhavati. It merely says they will be born there without specifying a time frame.

Thus, there is a difference in the textual tradition which underlies a difference in

understanding the requirements for birth in Sukhavati. Thus, as I said, it is not so easy to take birth in Sukhavati from the Tibetan tradition's point of view. For this reason there is a sadhana practice of Amitabha with the mantra.

Generally, in the Tibetan tradition, we focus on the longevity-providing aspect of Amitabha, Amitayuh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 3:56 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Higher Bodhisattvas and the Buddhas are also "formless," and merely create "formed" bodies via the powers of their minds. It's a matter of two different kinds of formlessness. The Arhats' minds are constantly preoccupied by their all-emcompassing samādhi. The minds of Āryabodhisattvas are otherwise. Buddhas do not have "minds." My opinion, obv, but one I feel confident defending.

Nalanda said:

Well the Buddha Dharmakaya obviously have no "minds" right?

But the Sambhogaya do?

And Nirmanayaka clearly do have minds.

Malcolm wrote:

The three kāyas are inseparable. The mind of the nirmāṇakāya, nominally speaking, is the dharmakāya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I stumbled upon this website that purports to have been a livestream of Thaye Dorje from Rumtek last month.

<https://www.karmapa.org/kagyu-monlam-2021-live-streaming-post/>

Has there been a change in the status of Rumtek?

Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

Rumtek has been in the hands of Thaye Dorje for some years now, after the Indian

courts awarded his side control. Where have you been, Rip Van Schrödinger?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I think tho that that needs to be clarified to beginners. The "mind" of such dharmakaya is not material or has essence? (or is that wrong) Rather, the dharmakaya is emptiness itself, so there cannot be a "mind" that is "something". (Please correct, if this statement is in error)

So going back to Caoimhghín's post, the Buddha does not have a "mind", in the dharmakaya sense. (emptiness) And in the material/nirmanakaya sense.

So when Malcolm says the mind of the nirmanayaka is the dharmakaya, I feel like, yes that's true. But that mind is not "something" or a substance/material.

Plz correct if this is wrong. My reading of Madhyamaka and other materials is introductory level.

Malcolm wrote:

The dharmakāya is the realization of emptiness. But there are various opinions on whether buddhas have thoughts or not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 6:42 AM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Malcolm, I had posted in the previous page what a sravaka might say about all of this. I wonder if there are historical arguments from Mahayana/TB on this:

(about arhat not being actually final enlightenment/nirvana, only leading to formless realm, and reborn to do the Bodhisattva path...)

I think the sravakas would ask "If that's all true, why would the historical Buddha Shakyamuni not teach the actual path? Yeah yeah okay, 500 years before Nagarjuna, people are not as sharp in mental faculties, but why bother teaching the sravaka path at all considering it sounds a lot like the Jain vehicle? So either that's the case, or maybe your team's calculations is off a bit and that the Buddha Shakyamuni was actually right and sravaka is the path he taught in the buddhavacana."

Malcolm wrote:

I didn't say arhats took birth in the formless realm, that is a samsaric place. Their samadhi of cessation resembles such a state. I honestly don't care what people who

belong the śrāvakayāna would say to this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:17 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

There are multiple layers of development in the sūtra, as I demonstrate in the introduction. If you reject an argument simply because your tradition's text says differently, then you are relying purely on argumentum ad verecundiam and are simply falling into the criticism that you levelled against Astus for using quotes:

Malcolm wrote:

When someone's argument depends on a citation which does not correspond to their premise, the entire argument can be regarded as a failure.

You might think your argument hangs together on the basis of what you've judged an accurate rendering of the Chinese, but since the Tibetan translation, likely rendered in reference to the Chinese translation, is at such a stark variance, I can't accept your argument on the face of such a stark contrast. You will note I did not assert your rendering entirely wrong, merely that I consider this passage invalid based on a version I consider more authoritative.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:23 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Then it shouldn't be such a surprise to suggest that all beings can attain buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

All beings can attain buddhahood, that does not entail that all beings will.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:35 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

All beings will—this is also supported by the sūtras. Given infinite time, there are no beings that will not come to attain buddhahood, that would be an inconceivability.

Malcolm wrote:

There will always be some being who has not attained buddhahood.

You'd be better off asserting Lonngchenpa's resolution: primordial liberation. It's a copout, but it's easier, and in fact, more sensible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:44 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

This is also an interesting topic and maybe it's worth a separate thread. But I have been taught a few times that we can take Master Shinran or Rennyō as our teacher. There's actually not the specification that the teacher needs to be alive or present before us. Hōnen, for instance, relied on Shandao's writings to gain Shinjin but did not himself meet Shandao.

Rennyō said, for instance, that if someone lacks faith, let them listen to the scriptures of our tradition (i.e. KGSS) repeatedly, up to a hundred times. If they don't have Shinjin after that, then they lack the karmic roots.

Malcolm wrote:

This is definitely a difference between common Mahayana on the one hand, and Vajrayana as well as Zen on the other. Dogen, for example, makes it absolutely clear that real Zen lies in the interaction between teacher and student.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 11:39 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I am not saying that there is no interaction between teacher and student. Just that we ultimately rely directly on the Buddha as a teacher.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course there are virtuous friends in common Mahayāna, but it's just not same relationship as one has with one's teacher in Vajrayana and Zen.

Zhen Li said:

But even TB takes refuge in the Buddha before the Guru.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually the Guru jewel comes first. This is ubiquitous in TB.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 8:36 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I am not saying that there is no interaction between teacher and student. Just that we ultimately rely directly on the Buddha as a teacher.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course there are virtuous friends in common Mahayāna, but it's just not same relationship as one has with one's teacher in Vajrayana and Zen.

Zhen Li said:

But even TB takes refuge in the Buddha before the Guru.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually the Guru jewel comes first. This is ubiquitous in TB.

Zhen Li said:

There you go. This is why TB doesn't work for everyone, it depends a lot on karmic connections. Actually, the same is true with Pure Land. It's not the practitioner who chooses the practice but the practice that chooses the practitioner.

Malcolm wrote:

All Buddhas attained buddhahood under the guidance of a guru, and in the common path, through attaining empowerment at the conclusion of the tenth bhumi after three asamkhyā kalpas. Your path is different only in so far as you want Amitabha to be your guru, so you put off finding a guru in this life, under whom you can receive ripening empowerment and liberating instructions to attain buddhahood in this life, at the time of death, or the bardo, for the common paths and stages which are pursued in Sukhavati under the guidance of Amitabha. It's a valid choice, but it's no short cut.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Good interview with Kim Stanley Robinson:

<https://apple.news/AURZkmoilS1mRnMn1oM6c-w>



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

. Since there are infinite beings, yes, there will always be some beings who haven't attained Buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

Then it is axiomatic, some beings will never attain buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Because of the nature of eternity and infinite arrangements, every being will come to have the arrangement of conditions that you speak about, Astus.

Astus said:

Samsara has no beginning (SN 15), therefore the infinite arrangements is already covered by that. In other words, just because something could happen does not mean it eventually happens.

Zhen Li said:

The idea that all beings will eventually become Buddhas is a Mahāyāna teaching not covered by the Śrāvakayāna texts.

Malcolm wrote:

It's one of those things one needs not take literally, since certainly there are a number of Mahayana opinions on the subject.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:23 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Choice and practice are two things that are essentially done away with in JSS. But like I said, there's no contradiction with the rest of the Dharma. You are led to what suits you.

Malcolm wrote:

That only gets you as far as Sukhavati. There are still many eons to go.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Real life is messy and indeterminate. Dogma only goes so far. Sometimes, people don't need a grand sermon on the highest teaching; sometimes they just need a hand.

Malcolm wrote:

We can't save anyone. We can benefit others through pacifying their fear, satisfying their material needs, or teaching Dharma. But the last requires active participation on the part of the person to be benefited.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:44 PM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Vasabandhu is a Mahayana author.

Astus said:

It is in Mahayana where one can find the doctrine of eight consciousnesses. But the eighth is not something posited on top of the five aggregates.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I don't know what you mean by "on top of".

No Shrivakayani would accept the idea of an 8th consciousness that goes from one life to another. They would say it a corruption imported from Hinduism. Vasabandhu is light years away from Shrivakayana.

Malcolm wrote:

The Theravadins have a concept of the bhavangacitta, it's a linking consciousness between this life and the next. Asanga invokes this doctrine in defense of the all-basis consciousness.

I am afraid you been hoisted on the petard of "No True Scotsman."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The idea that all beings will eventually become Buddhas is a Mahāyāna teaching not covered by the Śrāvakayāna texts.

Astus said:

But why would all eventually become a buddha? The reasoning that "if it can happen, it will happen" does not stand. That all beings have buddha-nature is not a sufficient condition either.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people conceive of tathagatagarbha as a kind of uncompounded agent that propels one inevitably to buddhahood.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 11:40 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Nembutsu recitation is more than enough. Shinran, Honen, Genshin, Shandao and many other qualified teachers agree.

Malcolm wrote:

You should observe that this is the Tibetan Buddhism forum. If you care to understand the Tibetan Buddhist point of view more fully, there is Halkias' book, Luminous Bliss. It is a pretty good history book, covers the literature well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Theravadins have a concept of the bhavangacitta, it's a linking consciousness between this life and the next. Asanga invokes this doctrine in defense of the all-basis consciousness.

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Thus proving Asanga felt the need to defend his position from Shravakayana criticisms.  
QED

Malcolm wrote:

It means you erred when you claimed no śrāvaka...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, January 28th, 2022 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

Thus proving Asanga felt the need to defend his position from Shravakayana criticisms.

QED

Malcolm wrote:

It means you erred when you claimed no śrāvaka...

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

It means I was correct in that the 8th consciousness was criticized by Shravakayanis.

Malcolm wrote:

It's also criticized by Mahāyānīs. Asanga was actually directing his rebuttal at Madhyamakas by pointing out there is this concept of bhavanga citta in śrāvaka Abhidharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

saṃjñāvedayitanirodha.

Malcolm wrote:

As a reminder, as we are not in the Academic forum, terms like this need to have a translation next to them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 2:01 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Some people conceive of tathagatagarbha as a kind of uncompounded agent that propels one inevitably to buddhahood.

Astus said:

Even so, it is not in and of itself the cause of liberation, hence cannot guarantee it either.

'The causes of freedom from these two veils are the two jnanas, considered as being the non-conceptual jnana and the ensuing jnana.'

(Uttaratantrasastra 5.174, tr Holmes)

Malcolm wrote:  
I didn't say they were right.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 2:06 AM  
Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal  
Content:  
Caoimhghín said:  
"Cessation of perception and feeling," or "cessation of cognition and hedonic tone." I'm sure there are other popular renderings too.

Malcolm wrote:  
632lqn.jpg (86.84 KiB) Viewed 122 times

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 2:11 AM  
Title: Re: I read Ongi kuden chapter 16, and it left me a little perplexed..  
Content:

Queequeg said:  
A hippie friend of mine tried to convince me that Trump is part of some grand functioning of the universe that will ultimately bring harmony.

Malcolm wrote:  
That must have been some pretty strong weed.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 5:47 AM  
Title: Re: I read Ongi kuden chapter 16, and it left me a little perplexed..  
Content:  
Queequeg said:  
Zennies in Kamakura on the other hand definitely had it out for him.

Malcolm wrote:  
Unlikely. Zen Buddhism, during Nichiren's life was fledgling. When Nichiren was 3, Dogen was 25, and Eisai, the master who brought Rinzai to Kakakura had been dead for 15 years.

Anyway, it is pretty clear that the Zen that got Nichiren's back up was the Daruma school, but that had already been banned by 1194 because Eisai, recently returned from studying Chan in China, requested the Tendai school to shut Nonin down.

Both Eisai and Dogen met with a lot of resistance from the Tendai school over their

versions of Zen, with Dogen eventually fleeing Kyoto politics to the mountains outside present day Fukui City in western Japan in 1243, where he built Eihei-ji.

The Pure Land school was much more immediately popular than Zen during the 13th century. The hegemony of Zen in Japanese Buddhism took considerable time to develop.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 5:52 AM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The pratisaṃdhipijñāna, specifically in the case of the modern Theravāda sect (which rejects the "in-between" state between births), is compared to lighting an unlit candle with a lit candle. If there is no unlit candle to inherit the flame, then the flame goes out and dies (i.e. it becomes "extinguished"/nirvṛti). I believe that this is what Schrödinger's Yidam was referring to.

Astus said:

It might be so, although it could as well be what's taught in the

<https://suttacentral.net/mn72/en/sujato> as an illustration of the Buddha not being identifiable as anything already in his life, hence the baseless conjecture about birth after death:

"Suppose that fire burning in front of you was extinguished. Would you know: 'This fire in front of me is extinguished'?"

"Yes, I would, Master Gotama."

"But Vaccha, suppose they were to ask you: 'This fire in front of you that is extinguished: in what direction did it go—east, south, west, or north?' How would you answer?"

"It doesn't apply, Master Gotama. The fire depended on grass and logs as fuel. When that runs out, and no more fuel is added, the fire is reckoned to have become extinguished due to lack of fuel."

"In the same way, Vaccha, any form by which a Realized One might be described has been cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future. A Realized One is freed from reckoning in terms of form. They're deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom, like the ocean. 'They're reborn', 'they're not reborn', 'they're both reborn and not reborn', 'they're neither reborn nor not reborn'—none of these apply."

Malcolm wrote:

Yup, when the beer is gone, so is the cognition and hedonic tone...or was that the cognac and hedonic tone...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 6:06 AM

Title: Re: Thereavada vs Mahayana Buddhist Goal

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

"Cognac and tonic moans" sometimes happen in front of the toilet after a long night, or so I've been told.

Malcolm wrote:

To be followed up with Ashton Kuchner in "Dude! Where's My Māla?"

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 11:17 AM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

So, this is probably one, among many reasons, why all beings having Buddha-nature is equivalent to all beings will attain buddhahood. It is both a necessary and sufficient condition (so I am changing my opinion from earlier that it was necessary but not sufficient).

Malcolm wrote:

The reason why your argument here is flawed is that there is a clear distinction to be made between natural gotra and "expanded gotra." For example, all viable seeds have the potential to germinate (natural gotra), but without water, warmth, and soil, they won't germinate (expanded gotra). It is just not inevitable that all sentient beings will develop the aspiration to attain buddhahood for the welfare of all sentient beings. As the old saying goes, one can lead a horse to water, but one can't force it to drink. All sentient beings may be "buddhanatured", but not all sentient will necessarily generate Mahayana bodhicitta. Without bodhicitta, buddhahood is just not possible. This also why Madhyamikas like Candrakirti entertain the probability that there are some benighted sentient beings who will never attain buddhahood, despite having the potential to attain buddhahood, just as some seeds never germinate, even though they are viable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 12:10 PM

Title: Re: I read Ongi kuden chapter 16, and it left me a little perplexed..

Content:

Queequeg said:

More generally, Zen has never been a popular sect -

Malcolm wrote:

The Soto School is the largest single Buddhist institution in Japan, with 14,000 temples. There are larger denominations—pure land is the largest, with 8 million followers, but it is split into ten different bodies, with Nishi Honganji being the largest, with 10,000

temples.

Despite the popularity of Zen in Kamakura and Hōjō Tokiyori's support for it, Zen in Kamakura itself was still small potatoes, and confined to the literate elite. It was the "it" Buddhism of the day, since it was the latest Import from China. When Tokiyori ordained in 1256, Nichiren would have been 34. And had himself barely arrived in Kamakura. It would be six years more before Nichiren forwarded his Risshō Ankoku Ron to Tokiyori, who had by then ordained and left the government in the hands of Hōjō Nagatoki. The person most instrumental in spreading Zen in the Kamakura era was Hōjō Tokimune. It was he who banished Nichiren to Sado Island. Tokimune's teacher was the Chinese monk, Mugaku Sogen. However, Mugaku did not arrive until 1279.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

All Buddhas attained buddhahood under the guidance of a guru,

Nalanda said:

Does that mean Sakyamuni had a guru?

Malcolm wrote:

Ultimately, yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: After enlightenment, can a Buddha return/manifest/emanate to samsara?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I do have questions about the other things said in that quote.

"The Buddha's body never grows decrepit with age. He is only endowed with all virtues, yet he makes a show of having a body which grows decrepit with age."

Is this "Buddha" here the other 2 of the trikaya bodies? If so, that would make sense. Or is this referring to the nirmanakaya body itself? Is it saying that the disciples were looking at a body that was immortal and does not age but it appears to them as a "normal aging" body?

Malcolm wrote:

It refers to the sambhogakāya.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 11:10 PM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Dolma said:

Is there any concept or notion of "nothingness" in TB?

I do not mean emptiness, and I do not mean e.g. "the absence of a flower in a sky", but I mean the complete absence of anything, something like in classical physics a vacuum.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this concept exists as an object of criticism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, January 29th, 2022 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: Will all eventually become Buddhas?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

There are simply two schools of thought in this matter. While on the one hand the Nirvana Sutra affirms that there are icchantikas, it also suggests that not only will they lose their icchantika status, but as with all beings, they'll attain buddhahood inevitably.

Malcolm wrote:

This is one kind of agotra. There is a second, the permanent agotra, mentioned in the Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra. Interestingly, gotra and tathāgatagarbha are not the same thing. All beings have tathāgatagarbha, but not all beings possess the gotra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Why is the book "Tibetan Book of the Dead" so popular amongst non-Buddhists / beginners

Content:

Nalanda said:

It's so popular that even my aunt (who is a Christian) has one.

Why is this book such a hit to Westerners?

Malcolm wrote:

Hippies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 8:54 PM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I stumbled upon this website that purports to have been a livestream of Thaye Dorje from Rumtek last month.

<https://www.karmapa.org/kagyu-monlam-2021-live-streaming-post/>

Has there been a change in the status of Rumtek?

Thanks.

Malcolm wrote:

Rumtek has been in the hands of Thaye Dorje for some years now, after the Indian courts awarded his side control. Where have you been, Rip Van Schrödinger?

jmlee369 said:

I am somewhat surprised to hear that, and not sure what to make of this

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hqYq3N6xXWw> of Goshir Gyaltsab Rinpoche purportedly visiting in early 2021.

Malcolm wrote:

The court awarded control of Rumtek to the organization that was controlled by Shamar, originally setup by the 16th. This does not bar OTD followers from Rumtek, they just don't control it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

[http://tibetanbuddhistencyclopedia.com/en/index.php/DECISION\\_OF\\_THE\\_INDIAN\\_SUPREME\\_COURT\\_-\\_20](http://tibetanbuddhistencyclopedia.com/en/index.php/DECISION_OF_THE_INDIAN_SUPREME_COURT_-_20)

Unknown said:

This decision was the culmination of the case that the Karmapa Charitable Trust filed in 1998 to regain control of Rumtek monastery. In this decision, given in the case of Tsurphu Labrang vs. Karmapa Charitable Trust and Ors., announced in New Delhi on July 5, 2004, the court refused to hear the appeal of the Tsurphu Labrang, a group created by Gyaltsab Rinpoche and Tenzin Namgyal to represent the claims of followers of Ogyen Trinley to manage Rumtek in legal proceedings. The court rejected their Special Leave Petition to this effect. By thus refusing to interfere in the earlier decision of the Sikkim District Court and a subsequent confirmation by the High Court in New Delhi, the Supreme Court allowed the original decision to stand -- meaning that the Tsurphu group had no legal claim to Rumtek, and that the Karmapa Charitable Trust was the only group recognized to manage the monastery.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 10:20 PM

Title: Re: Why is the book "Tibetan Book of the Dead" so popular amongst non-Buddhists / beginners

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

They aren't entirely wrong, but are missing out on the fact that the book is not for "everyone," nor is it useful to "everyone." I have a copy of one of the translations. It was given to me one Christmas. It's not a useful book for me, but I was obviously very polite when I received it.

Malcolm wrote:

It's specifically a bardo guidebook for Dzogchen practitioners. First Evans Wentz published his version, very influenced by his Theosophical leanings, totally not understanding it's context. Then, well, hippies like Leary started to read this while they were tripping. He then wrote his LSD version. Then, Trungpa collaborated with Francesca Freemantle to reestablish the book's context, Thurman did a version, that, quite frankly, is just weird. Gyurme Dorje translated the liturgical content.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 10:34 PM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Dolma said:

Yep, and that's very interesting because the question is: must the object to be refuted be an object of mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure. Example: rabbit horn is a conceptual object.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 10:59 PM

Title: Re: Dodrupchen is in Thukdam

Content:

reun said:

Tidwell said the Thukdam Project is working on a study of how bodies decompose in different climatic conditions in India, and Dunne said he wants to look outside the brain for signs of post-mortem consciousness."

Malcolm wrote:

They are barking up the wrong tree. I know Dunne and Tidwell, they at least know

Tibetan and can check sources. But there are problems they will encounter such as the distinction made in Dzogchen texts between rig pa, which exits the body through the eyes, and mind, which exits the body through the fontanelle. Moreover, there is the fact that unlike other tantric traditions, the highest level Dzogchen practitioners do not remain in thukdam for many days. The less developed your practice is, the longer your thukdam will be.

reiun said:

I'm guessing that mind is said to exit through the anterior fontanelle, rather than any of the other five? From what I have researched, this fontanelle evidently stays open longest (average closure is between 13 - 24 months), and is thus a pediatric feature. Not required to be open for exit of mind, as I understand your comment.

Malcolm wrote:

The purpose of phowa practice is to open a tiny opening, into which a straw is inserted as a sign of success. But it's not entirely necessary for it to be open.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 11:22 PM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Dolma said:

Yep, and that's very interesting because the question is: must the object to be refuted be an object of mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure. Example: rabbit horn is a conceptual object.

Dolma said:

"Rabbit" is a valid object as well as "horn", so I can have an image of a rabbit with a horn in my mind. No problem.

But not of nothingness. Because then my mind would be nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

You can also have conceptual image of nothingness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, January 30th, 2022 at 11:26 PM

Title: Re: Argentinian guy who remembers his past lives

Content:

Aemilius said:

He recalls that in Atlantis...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Argentinian guy who remembers his past lives

Content:

Aemilius said:

Graham Hancock explains in this TED talk why Atlantis is a serious scientifically plausible concept:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Lingpupa said:

But I fear your link is not it. It does really look as if the situation is as muddy as it has been for more than 20 years now!

Malcolm wrote:

The Sikkim Supreme Court ruled in favor of the KCT. It was reported in the Indian media when it happened.

<https://www.telegraphindia.com/west-bengal/hc-rejects-tsurphu-labrang-plea/cid/809033>

[https://www.ngofoundation.in/ngo-database/karmapa-charitable-trust-contact-number-contact-details\\_i62163](https://www.ngofoundation.in/ngo-database/karmapa-charitable-trust-contact-number-contact-details_i62163)

<https://www.thestatesman.com/opinion/the-karmapa-controversy-1502680000.html>

<https://sikkimnews.blogspot.com/2011/05/karmapa-charitable-trust-kct-terms-any.html>

Enough yet?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

You can conceive nothing,

But you can't conceive nothing ness.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure you can, you just did.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 2:05 AM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Lingpupa said:

But I fear your link is not it. It does really look as if the situation is as muddy as it has been for more than 20 years now!

Malcolm wrote:

The Sikkim Supreme Court ruled in favor of the KCT. It was reported in the Indian media when it happened.

<https://www.telegraphindia.com/west-bengal/hc-rejects-tsurphu-labrang-plea/cid/809033>

[https://www.ngofoundation.in/ngo-database/karmapa-charitable-trust-contact-number-contact-details\\_i62163](https://www.ngofoundation.in/ngo-database/karmapa-charitable-trust-contact-number-contact-details_i62163)

<https://www.thestatesman.com/opinion/the-karmapa-controversy-1502680000.html>

<https://sikkimnews.blogspot.com/2011/05/karmapa-charitable-trust-kct-terms-any.html>

Enough yet?

Lingpupa said:

Well, in fact, no.

Your first link, from 19 years ago, does not reflect the current situation.

Your second only shows me some registration information for the Karmapa Charitable Trust, saying nothing about the current legal situation.

Your third has the merit of being less than four years old, but makes no reference to the legal situation then, now, or before.

Your fourth link, more than 10 years old, repeats the position of the KTC, but reveals nothing about the actual legal situation even then, let alone now.

It appears there has been no final legal determination. The situation is opaque - if there has been a resolution, it is being kept damned quiet.

Malcolm wrote:

2002 Sikkim Supreme Court ruled KCT owns Rumtek. Ruling supported by Indian Supreme Court who declined to hear an appeal.

Case closed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: Current status of Rumtek.

Content:

Lingpupa said:

Why are legal moves still ongoing?

Malcolm wrote:

Because the Tshurphu Labrang keeps filing motions in court about this thing and and that thing. But the main point is that KCT won their case, showing that KCT was the legal entity that rightfully controlled Rumtek. It's all over money. Rumtek is very wealthy. Personally, I don't have a horse in this race. This is an internal affair within Karma Kagyu. I have no Karma Kagyu teachers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 3:42 AM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

You can conceive nothing,

But you can't conceive nothing ness.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure you can, you just did.

Dolma said:

What you are referring to is the label but not the content.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, just like the son of a barren women, it's a mere label, that's all a total nonexistent can be, a mere label.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 5:45 AM

Title: Re: Samādhirāja Sūtra Translation Plans?

Content:

Seeker12 said:

Are there any known plans for a full translation of the Samādhirāja Sūtra?

Malcolm wrote:

It has been translated by the 84000 folks. Its right there in the reading room.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 5:54 AM

Title: Re: Samādhirāja Sūtra Translation Plans?

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Hopkins' Mediation on Emptiness

Malcolm wrote:

All hope abandon, ye who enter here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:06 AM

Title: Re: Samādhirāja Sūtra Translation Plans?

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Hopkins' Mediation on Emptiness

Malcolm wrote:

All hope abandon, ye who enter here.

Svalaksana said:

Thanks for the heads-up regarding the 84000 translation, Malcolm.

Why must our hope perish in flames upon glancing on Hopkins' Meditation? Is it because of its unabashedly Gelug leaning? I must say I found Chandrakirti's Slivers exposition and the Buddhapalita/Bhavaviveka debate section quite illuminating, among other things.

Malcolm wrote:

It is the Scilla and Charybdis of Madhyamaka translations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:10 AM

Title: Re: Why is the book "Tibetan Book of the Dead" so popular amongst non-Buddhists / beginners

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

They aren't entirely wrong, but are missing out on the fact that the book is not for "everyone," nor is it useful to "everyone." I have a copy of one of the translations. It was given to me one Christmas. It's not a useful book for me, but I was obviously very polite when I received it.

Malcolm wrote:

It's specifically a bardo guidebook for Dzogchen practitioners. First Evans Wentz published his version, very influenced by his Theosophical leanings, totally not understanding it's context. Then, well, hippies like Leary started to read this while they were tripping. He then wrote his LSD version. Then, Trungpa collaborated with



Francesca Freemantle to reestablish the book's context, Thurman did a version, that, quite frankly, is just weird. Gyurme Dorje translated the liturgical content.

Caoimhghín said:

I was given the Thupten Jinpa translation by a very well-meaning relative. Where does this translation stand amongst those?

Malcolm wrote:

Was unaware he made one. I am sure it is technically accurate enough.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 8:56 PM

Title: Re: Samādhirāja Sūtra Translation Plans?

Content:

Svalaksana said:

Thanks for the heads-up regarding the 84000 translation, Malcolm.

Why must our hope perish in flames upon glancing on Hopkins' Meditation? Is it because of its unabashedly Gelug leaning? I must say I found Chandrakirti's Slivers exposition and the Buddhapalita/Bhavaviveka debate section quite illuminating, among other things.

Malcolm wrote:

It is the Scilla and Charybdis of Madhyamaka translations.

Svalaksana said:

I chuckled, but I'm honestly interested in your opinion, wouldn't mind a bit more specificity though. Does that mean it is a bad translation, a hard translation, both, or none?

Malcolm wrote:

It's book that has crushed the spirit of many Madhyamaka adventurers. It's not so easy a book for beginners, that's all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Argentinian guy who remembers his past lives

Content:

yagmort said:

it is very funny to see guys who dead sure that great masters can leave footprints on a rock, can fly or disappear as a rainbow, that dzogchen tantras have been taught in language of birds and was taught in 13 other galaxies, that there are higher beings who

transmit practices to certain individuals later to be known as tertons etc., are all of a sudden take cringe when Atlantis is mentioned ..

Malcolm wrote:

Who said we were sure of any of these things? I have mentioned many times it is important to distinguish myth (language of birds), legends, (footprints in rocks, etc.) and history (such and such a text shows up in x century and not before).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:08 PM

Title: Re: Happy New Year/ རོ་གསར་ / 新年快樂

Content:

tingdzin said:

Thanks. Tibetan tiger year doesn't start for another month.

Malcolm wrote:

In the Tshurlug system, it starts tomorrow. In the Phuklug system, next month.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

You can conceive nothing,

But you can't conceive nothing ness.

PeterC said:

How are we discussing something if we can't conceive of it?

PadmaVonSamba said:

Nothingness? What is there to discuss?

What is there to conceive?

The problem is that one is starting out with an abstract concept. It's like talking about art, or god, beginning with an abstract concept and then only afterwards trying to determine what defines it. But nothing defines nothing. So, it can't be discussed.

Malcolm wrote:

Then how are you discussing it? It's similar claiming that one can only discuss concrete concepts, but "concrete concepts" is also abstract concept.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 9:43 PM

Title: Re: Ancient Shamanic Bön

Content:  
Kosm said:  
Hello All!

Does anyone have any info about the original shamanic type of Bön from which Yungdrung Bön grew?

The ancient type was not connected to temples and organised religion, but was a system of animistic/shamanistic techniques and ritual magic. It was not even called Bön (apparently it was called “gter”).

Any info/source much appreciated, thank you!

Malcolm wrote:  
If you want to know about pre-Buddhist Bon, you should read Drung, Deu, and Bon, by Namkhai Norbu, Arrow and Spindle by Samten Karmay, etc. Modern Bon has no resemblance to ancient Bon.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, January 31st, 2022 at 11:14 PM  
Title: Re: I freakin' love vaccinations now  
Content:

Toenail said:  
In women it can cause cancer in one part of the vagina where babies come from. I don't know the English name.

Malcolm wrote:  
Uterus.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 12:06 AM  
Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:  
Caoimhghín said:  
If this isn't off-topic, where does the samādhi that takes as its object the "āyatana of nothingness" (無所有入處) stand in Tibetan Buddhism and in relation to this topic?

Malcolm wrote:  
Oh, this is when one makes a samadhi on the mental image of nothingness. It's a serious deviation...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 12:13 AM  
Title: Re: I freakin' love vaccinations now  
Content:

pemachophel said:

Actually no, not the uterus. The cervix. Cervical cancer.

Malcolm wrote:

True, my bad.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 1:04 AM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

If this isn't off-topic, where does the samādhi that takes as its object the "āyatana of nothingness" (無所有入處) stand in Tibetan Buddhism and in relation to this topic?

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, this is when one makes a samadhi on the mental image of nothingness. It's a serious deviation...

Caoimhghín said:

If the yogin becomes ensnared in the samādhi, does it lead to birth as an asaṃjñasattva (unconscious being), or is that only if the yogin fails at the fourth arūpyasamāpatti?

Malcolm wrote:

If one falls into a samadhi of nonconceptuality, this results in being born among the unconsciousness devas. If one makes a samadhi on the āyatana of nothingness, then one will be born in that formless āyatana.

Caoimhghín said:

The Bodhisattvas have to master all samādhis, the dhyānas and the samāpattis, but some are evidently more dangerous than others to Bodhisattva practice. There is a time and place for arūpya cultivation, and likely this life isn't it for most. Nonetheless, is the reason for the danger the likelihood of getting entranced in it and taking birth in the arūpyadhātu as an asaṃjñasattva? Is that the specific reason?

Malcolm wrote:

There are transcendent samadhis and mundane samadhis. The four dhyānas are all mundane. They are mastered after the path of seeing in order to remove traces connected with them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are transcendent samadhis and mundane samadhis. The four dhyānas are all mundane. They are mastered after the path of seeing in order to remove traces connected with them.

Caoimhghín said:

If you'll humour me further, of the five powers on the path of joining, there is a samādhī component included.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is a reference to the indriya of samadhi, which is also one of the ten neutral mental factors belonging to all minds. It is a faculty. I assume you are talking about prayogamarga, the path of application/preparation. Actually, you need these faculties even to enter sambharamarga.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 4:13 AM

Title: Re: "Nothingness"

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

If you'll humour me further, of the five powers on the path of joining, there is a samādhī component included.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is a reference to the indriya of samadhi, which is also one of the ten neutral mental factors belonging to all minds. It is a faculty. I assume you are talking about prayogamarga, the path of application/preparation. Actually, you need these faculties even to enter sambharamarga.

Caoimhghín said:

So am I wrong to conclude, based on your responses here, that in your understanding, neither a single dhyāna nor the anāgāmya (much less the samādhī on nothingness) is necessary for the first bhūmi, because these are to be practiced later?

Malcolm wrote:

It is useful to have perfect śamatha/first dhyāna, but by no means required. The point of Buddhism is not meditation. The point of Buddhism is waking up. Meditating incorrectly leads to no place good.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 4:37 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The title says it all. Related: Is first dhyāna necessary for any particular significant degree of Bodhi?

Malcolm wrote:  
Nope.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 4:48 AM  
Title: Re: "Nothingness"  
Content:  
Caoimhghín said:

I'll make this a separate topic, since I've ventured off the topic, but I thought I had recalled you saying that perfect *śamatha* was the first *dhyāna*, and that this was necessary for the first *bhūmi*. As always, I could be quite wrong. I've very good at misremembering what I've read on these forums.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, I never said it was a requirement. However, generally speaking *śamatha* is considered an important container for stable insight. And yes, perfect *śamatha* is the first *dhyāna*.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 4:59 AM  
Title: Re: I freakin' love vaccinations now  
Content:  
Archie2009 said:  
Identity politics is deranged.

Malcolm wrote:  
I agree, white supremacists are quite deranged.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 5:28 AM  
Title: Re: Is first *dhyāna* necessary for the first *bhūmi*?  
Content:

Caoimhghín said:  
Where does the eightfold path and threefold training stand in relation to the *bodhisattva bhūmis* if not even the first *dhyāna* is a prerequisite? What does the *samādhi* component entail if not the *anāgāmya* or first *dhyāna*?

I am personally familiar with first *dhyāna* being an absolutely mandatory necessity, but I'm open to other perspectives.

Malcolm wrote:  
*Samadhi* is a natural mental factor of one pointedness. People with no experience, who like to follow books like recipe guides, say such things as "first *dhyāna* is absolutely

mandatory for the path of seeing." But then you have to ask them if they have discovered the path of seeing. If they say no, then obviously they are just going to the basis of what they have heard or read in a book. If they say yes, there are other tests you can apply.

In Mahāyāna, the samadhi part is not perfected until the fifth bhumi. There is no requirement for the first dhyāna to realize the first bhumi. The first bhumi merely requires realization of śūnyatā. That can come about as a result of the union of śamatha and vipaśyāna, or it can be arrived at merely through vipaśyāna. It depends on the person. All that is really necessary is that aspiring bodhisattva can focus on their analysis on the emptiness of objects without being distracted, but is certainly does not mean that they have to first perfect all four or five factors of the first dhyāna. It won't harm them if they do, but it is not required.

You should examine Discerning the Middle from the Extremes, it presents a concise summary of the five paths and how they are realized in Mahāyāna. Madhyamaka texts do not discuss this so much, at least, not early ones.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 6:05 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

...inherited traditional bodies of knowledge

Malcolm wrote:

That's what I meant by people who just read books. The only concentration one needs is to be able to focus on one's analysis without being distracted. That's it.

If one goes chasing after samadhi, one will waste a lot of time and never realize emptiness, and that is a fact.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 6:18 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

clyde said:

A must read by Dosho Port,

We Are All This Luminous Mind: The Possibility and Importance of Awakening

A Zen view of what awakening is and isn't, with personal stories from contemporary practitioners

<https://tricycle.org/trikedaily/zen-awakening/>

Simply put, awakening begins with an abrupt nondual embodiment.

Malcolm wrote:  
It does? Why?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 6:37 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:

Dgj said:  
In other words, there is nothing stopping an understanding from being valid in which one could realize that the teaching that dependent origination and emptiness invalidate or disprove an ultimately existing Buddha Nature are wrong

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, there is quite a bit stopping such an understanding. There is not such a thing as a self which is anything more than a designation for the series of aggregates. Such an understanding that you suggest is just Hinduism in drag.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 6:45 AM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:

KeithA said:  
I hope every student of the way reads that.

Malcolm wrote:  
I read it, but it sounded to me like a lot of confirmation bias and scripted realizations, and a bit Eckhart Tolle.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 6:48 AM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:

KeithA said:  
I hope every student of the way reads that.

Malcolm wrote:



I read it, but it sounded to me like a lot of confirmation bias and scripted realizations.

KeithA said:

This is the Zen forum, so no playing in the sandbox with you today, Malcolm.

Malcolm wrote:

I am not criticizing Zen. I am talking about the content of the article. Unless for some reason only agreement is allowed here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 10:04 AM

Title: Re: Haiku today.

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Pizza and cold beer,  
Damn it's frosty outside now,  
The show's almost done.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 10:17 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Even then, it's not guaranteed, even from the point of view of the tradition of Karma Chakme. A commentary by Tujey Zhanphen Pel on Karma Chakme's famous aspiration specifies four requirements for birth in Sukhavati: the support, the recollection of the merit field at the time of death; the cause, gathering of accumulations and the purification of obscurations; the assistant, the generation of bodhicitta; and the condition, the pure aspiration.

The point is that if, at the time of death, one cannot maintain this recollection of Amitabha and his host, even if one spent a lifetime aspiring to birth in Sukhavati, one will not succeed in the end. From this perspective, mere faith is not a sufficient cause, in our tradition.

Zhen Li said:

Mere faith isn't sufficient for birth in the highest grade and highest rank in Jōdo Shinshū either. That's why Shinjin isn't one's own citta, it's the citta of Amida. Assurance is something that comes from the Buddha. However, the Pure Land sūtras permit birth by very slight causes. Birth in the lowest grade and lowest rank is rendered possible by one's own power, thinking of Amida even only ten times, including by those who

committed the five grave offences.

Jangchup Donden said:

It may be just me but I feel like when sutras guarantee rebirth (or other things) by slight causes, it's that it will happen eventually, but it may be a very very long time until it happens.

Malcolm wrote:

This is generally how things are understood in the Tibetan tradition, in every commentary in every school

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:35 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is generally how things are understood in the Tibetan tradition, in every commentary in every school

Zhen Li said:

Do you mind sharing some examples?

Malcolm wrote:

Read the Halkias book. He summarizes it all quite.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 9:02 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I haven't gotten to Halkias' translations but so far I haven't been so fond of his translation choices and there are a few errors.

Malcolm wrote:

He does make some minor errors here and there—who doesn't?—but the point is not the accuracy of his translations, but his review of a selection of various commentaries composed by Tibetans on the subject. You will see there, invariable, they are univocal about the need for four causes to take birth in Sukhavati. I've consulted these to make sure he's got it right, and some commentaries he hasn't presented, such as the Sakya commentary mentioned, for review. The Tibetan Buddhist approach is pretty well summarized by Weihsan above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

In other words, there is nothing stopping an understanding from being valid in which one could realize that the teaching that dependent origination and emptiness invalidate or disprove an ultimately existing Buddha Nature are wrong

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there is quite a bit stopping such an understanding. There is not such a thing as a self which is anything more than a designation for the series of aggregates. Such an understanding that you suggest is just Hinduism in drag.

Aemilius said:

Conventional everyday reality/language exists even for Buddhas. Buddha Shakyamuni had a father, a mother, relatives, clan, tribe, country and upbringing. These make up one's identity and position in a society. He is called Shakya-muni, i.e. a sage/silent one of the Shakya people. That is an identity. And it is Buddhism that accepts reality as it truly is.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, a conventional designation of the series of skandhas called "Buddha." But there is no real or permanent identity there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:07 PM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

It seems that in a lot of Mahāyāna, the eight vimokṣas have become disassociated from the dhyānas and arūpyasamāpattis.

Malcolm wrote:

The eight dhyānas are paths of rebirth. The only reason the Buddha meditated on them was to remove traces connected with rebirth in these lokas.

Otherwise, as I mentioned, and as Astus affirms, the first bhūmi requires only one-pointedness, non-distraction, on the object of contemplation, four-fold emptiness. Upon its attainment, one can manifest one hundred bodies, visit one hundred buddhafiels and so on:

“If he wishes to, he can apply himself in such a way that in just one instant, in one moment, he can give up his entire family, wife, and possessions and be ordained in the Tathāgata’s teaching. Having been ordained, in just one instant he will attain and rest in a hundred samādhis, see a hundred buddhas and know their blessings, cause a hundred worlds to shake, go to a hundred buddha realms, [F.185.b] illuminate a hundred worlds, ripen a hundred beings, remain for a hundred eons, enter a hundred previous eons and a hundred future eons, open a hundred Dharma doors, manifest a hundred bodies, and manifest each body having a retinue of a hundred bodhisattvas.  
<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh44-31.html#UT22084-036-002-390>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

n8pee said:

Why is this?

Malcolm wrote:

Apart from Lamdre, Naropa’s Khecari is the most important set of instructions in Sakya. It’s easy to practice, profound, and complete. According to the Sakya Tradition, it’s the ultimate practice lineage from the Cakrasamvara tantra tradition as preserved by this school.

Passing By said:

Easier than Ganga Mahamudra and Dzogchen? Speaking of which, is this found only in Sakya or does Kagyu Mahamudra / Samvara contain the gist of it also?

Malcolm wrote:

They are three completely different paths.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

If the yogin fails at the stage of any of the dhyānas, they will lead to rebirth for him.

Malcolm wrote:

Below the path of seeing, the dhyānas are just causes for rebirth.

Caoimhghín said:

If the yogin succeeds, then he can use the dhyānas to destroy lust and hatred, as well as attachment to the kamadhātu. That's what I'm familiar with. Whether you consider it wrong is another matter.

Malcolm wrote:

Without vipaśyanā, samādhi is useless——this is why there are three prajñās, not only one. Meditation just isn't the main point of Buddhadharma. Prajñā is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

narhwal90 said:

I suppose the dramatic awakening experiences make for dramatic reading.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently, only Zen/Chan/Son people are allowed to confirm or question the claims of awakening of Zen/Chan/Son people. Others need not apply.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 1st, 2022 at 11:34 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

At least I'm not someone else's luminous mind.

That would totally suck.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 12:12 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Wisdom is acquired through samādhi, so while samādhi may not be "the main point" of Buddhism, it is the methodology through which "the main point" is made manifest, no?

Malcolm wrote:

Prajñā is not acquired through samādhi at all. However, śīla provides a basis for a focused mind (samādhi), and a focused mind provides a basis for prajñā.

Prajñā is acquired through hearing (śrutimayāprajñā), reflection (cintamayāprajñā), and cultivation (bhāvanamayāprajñā).

The dhyānas are not required for this at all. Samādhi is just mental one-pointedness on a object. For most people, that would be TV, these days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

narhwal90 said:

I suppose the dramatic awakening experiences make for dramatic reading.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently, only Zen/Chan/Son people are allowed to confirm or question the claims of awakening of Zen/Chan/Son people. Others need not apply.

reipun said:

There shouldn't be a problem to "question" claims of awakening. But you should understand that it is only a Zen Teacher, i.e., someone like Meido Moore or Guo Gu, who is qualified to "confirm" (verify) it.

Malcolm wrote:

That supposes they are qualified to confirm it. Guo Gu claims to be a first stage bodhisattva. I find that difficult to believe. On the other hand, I don't find it difficult to believe that Dogen was an awakened person.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 12:36 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

According to Lama Zopa Rinpoche <https://www.lamayeshe.com/advice/recite-amitabha%E2%80%99s-name-every-day>

If you recite Amitabha's name every day, when you die you will go to the blissful realm of Amitabha like a rocket, without any obstacle.

PRAYER:

I prostrate to the Tathagata Infinite Light Buddha.

I prostrate to the Suchness Savior Limitless Light.

MANTRA:

OM AMI DEWA HRIH

If possible, recite this 108 times daily, then dedicate:

May I be born in the Western blissful realm.

I guess he agrees with the chinese/japanese mahayana perspective.

Malcolm wrote:

No, if you examine carefully, all four characteristics discussed in the commentaries are present in this short practice. The Amitabha mantra (Amideva is a Tibetan corruption of Amitabha) is there for focus. There is a supplication. There is dedication. Prostration as an expression of faith.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Unknown said:

Haven't seen that claim...

Malcolm wrote:

He made it in a video presentation, when he was describing an encounter with his teacher, who informed he had achieved the first bodhisattva bhumi. One could argue that Guo Gu was not making the claim himself, merely reporting what Shenyen had told him, but even bringing it up...makes it a claim he is making for himself.

Unknown said:

Since you know Guo Gu well enough to judge his claim false, thus damaging his reputation, in the context of the above definition only, where do you think he falls short?

Malcolm wrote:

I am generally skeptical when people claim to be first stage bodhisattvas. Example, Michael Roach.

I doubt my skepticism damages his reputation. There are all kinds of claims of realization for this and that teacher and by this and that teacher. I am generally skeptical of them all.

In my book, one can claim one has some realization without being a first stage bodhisattva. But claiming one has directly realized emptiness is a big claim. To claim one is a first stage bodhisattva is to put on some big pants. A well know but somewhat controversial student of Maezumi Roshi once told me he thought he was a first stage bodhisattva, when I asked him for an explanation of Tozan's five ranks. I didn't believe him either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I get the impression that Kensho is kind of having a moment in Western Zen these days.

Genjo Conan said:

I think it's been a response (and in some ways a useful corrective) to certain strains in American Soto Zen.

Malcolm wrote:

Personally, I rather admire the anti-kensho stance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I get the impression that Kensho is kind of having a moment in Western Zen these days.

Genjo Conan said:

I think it's been a response (and in some ways a useful corrective) to certain strains in American Soto Zen.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah il got that impression, and it probably is a good thing. The thing that I don't get though is what sort of differentiation there is in the article between just a basically samsaric 'peak experience' and kensho.

Malcolm wrote:

If someone has actually realized emptiness and woken up, they don't need anyone to confirm it for them. If on the other hand, they have a bit of doubt, and are not sure they have understood the meaning of emptiness, they might need a little push from a teacher to direct them in the proper way.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 1:53 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

There's no one to one comparison there, just saying, I don't think kensho necessarily implies a person has reached the first Bhumi or something, but maybe I'm wrong and there is some 'traditional' justification for that....

Malcolm wrote:

The word used in the article is "bodhi." Last time I checked, it meant realizing emptiness.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 1:57 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

reiu said:

And it is only stage one . . . As long as it is verified by a qualified teacher, for me, it's no contest.

Malcolm wrote:

That means the teacher must be such a person and so on. But as I said, if one has realized emptiness, one needn't depend on anyone to confirm it. Confirmations serve only institutional purposes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Minobu said:

nightmare but I have a weird feeling he will win. the republicans are going to go ape in getting the vote out .

Malcolm wrote:

"the republicans are going to go ape throwing votes out"

There, fixed it for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

KeithA said:

where we speak of waking up just now, in this life.

Malcolm wrote:

I have no problem with the idea of waking up in this life (Dzogchen, check; Zen, check), a teaching outside of the sutras (Dzogchen, check; Zen, check), based on following a qualified teacher (Dzogchen, check; Zen, check).

I merely question the promiscuous use of the term "bodhi" to describe what appear to me to be training experiences.

Presumably, we are all trying to realize the same reality, no? the same absence of self, the same emptiness of dharmas and persons?

Bodhi, waking up, means realizing emptiness, not intellectually, but in actuality. It's inexpressible, so how can it be expressed in words?

This is why, when I see such articles like these in Trike, etc., it makes me skeptical. I don't doubt that Dosho Port is writing this in good faith. I am just skeptical.

Have these people even achieved patience towards their own afflictions? Are they still gripped by the three poisons? If they are, then they have not realized emptiness at all, but merely had a training experience that approximates emptiness. It's a good experience, a positive working basis for bodhi, but it isn't awakening, bodhi. It's like someone who opens their eyes for moment before waking up in the morning and then falls back into the early morning dream they were having. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:35 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

KeithA said:

Our friend Malcolm's pov is that Dzogchen is superior...

Malcolm wrote:

Bzzzzt. Wrong answer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:40 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Shinjin said:

Yes, not very much different at all.

Malcolm wrote:

Biden is quite polite to the press compared to 45. At least Biden perceives the need for a free press, unlike the previous guy, who cannot stand the slightest disagreement or criticism from the press at all, because he is such a whiny, little bitch.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:44 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I was surprised to learn "In GA, voter roll purges are mandated by a law created by Democrats(!) in 1997-98."

Malcolm wrote:

Which is why we need federal voting standards and objective districting based on math, not gerrymandering.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 2:50 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Because it is a threefold training, we can be confident that the one-pointedness that is supposed to be cultivated is not one like watching a TV, because watching a TV does not require śīla as a support.

Malcolm wrote:

The only difference between the samādhi of watching TV and the training of samādhi in the Dharma is that the former is contaminated, and the latter is not. But the samādhi, the mental factor, is identical in both cases, only the object is different. What makes the samādhi part hard is that it is difficult to shift one's focus from mundane contaminated objects to mundane uncontaminated objects, such as the path dharma. Hence, the need for śīla as a basis for samādhi. But this has nothing actually to do with samādhi itself. Samādhi can be focused wherever one likes. And in the case of a practitioner, that concentration is focused on Dharma. It also has nothing developing rarified samadhis, etc. Samādhi here just means being able to focus the mind at will. That's it. People keep turning these things into strange beasts. We avoid things that disturb our minds (śīla), so that we can focus (samādhi) on developing the three wisdoms. That's it. It's not complicated.

It's better to understand the essence of a thing, rather than pile elaboration on top of elaboration.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 9:06 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

According to Lama Zopa Rinpoche <https://www.lamayeshe.com/advice/recite-amitabha%E2%80%99s-name-every-day>

If you recite Amitabha's name every day, when you die you will go to the blissful realm of Amitabha like a rocket, without any obstacle.

PRAYER:

I prostrate to the Tathagata Infinite Light Buddha.

I prostrate to the Suchness Savior Limitless Light.

MANTRA:

OM AMI DEWA HRIH

If possible, recite this 108 times daily, then dedicate:

May I be born in the Western blissful realm.

I guess he agrees with the chinese/japanese mahayana perspective.

Malcolm wrote:

No, if you examine carefully, all four characteristics discussed in the commentaries are present in this short practice. The Amitabha mantra (Amideva is a Tibetan corruption of Amitabha) is there for focus. There is a supplication. There is dedication. Prostration as an expression of faith.

Charlie123 said:

If someone is trained in Phowa, are the 4 causes still necessary?

Malcolm wrote:

They're baked in.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 9:39 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I will continue with Halkias' book. It was interesting so far and it is worthwhile considering all other perspectives.

GrapeLover said:

Perhaps you might also find interesting the commentary by Mipham Rinpoche available at the end of this Document:

[https://www.academia.edu/35095965/JU\\_MI\\_PHAM\\_ON\\_PURE\\_LAND\\_DOCTRINE\\_AND\\_PRACTICE](https://www.academia.edu/35095965/JU_MI_PHAM_ON_PURE_LAND_DOCTRINE_AND_PRACTICE)

Malcolm wrote:

One reservation I have about this paper is that Cook misleadingly follows Halkias in translating a common Tibetan term, *dnogs po gi nus pa*, *vastushakti*, as "other power." I was going to mention this reservation earlier, but I see it is more necessary now, seeing

that Cook here follows Halkias' error.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 9:51 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

That being said, if someone successfully completes Phowa and opens one's sahasrāra, I understood that no lack of merit and no karmic obstruction can prevent one from being born in Sukhāvātī.

Malcolm wrote:

If you can manage to get your act together. Sukhavati phowa is enormously unreliable in this regard. Case in point: there was a famous phowa master in Dedham Dun, who successfully performed phowa often for other people. However, when it came time for this master to perform phowa for himself, he was unable to do so. He died before His Holiness Sakya Trichen was able to perform it for him.

There are many forms of phowa. Some involve Sukhavati, but not all. Sukhavati phowas are considered nirmanakaya phowas, because they involve a subject, an object, and an action. There are also sambhogakaya phowas and dharmakaya phowas. These later two have nothing to do with birth in Sukhavati, and instead refer to attaining buddhahood in bardo or at the time of death. Phowa is a rich tradition, which encompasses many approaches.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 9:54 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, it is recognition of the nature of mind. Got it.

Malcolm wrote:

So, not bodhi, check.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 10:00 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So, it is recognition of the nature of mind. Got it.

Malcolm wrote:  
So, not bodhi, check.

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Yeah, from my perspective at least, "awakening" is a weird term to use for this, again I think just by use of that term there is a bit of unintentional (counter?) cultural crossover with the way Neadvaita people talk about "awakening". Until this conversation I was quite unsure whether or not it was essentially recognizing the nature of mind, it just sounded like it. Apparently there is some precedent for it being exactly that...if I am following.

Malcolm wrote:  
Re: Meido's definition, it's the entrance to authentic mahamudra and Dzogchen practice as well. But we don't call this "awakening" or even "realization." It's just a recognition.

And, as I understand things, Dogen didn't like the term "kensho" because it implied an imperishable mind as opposed to a perishable body.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 10:03 AM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:  
clyde said:  
For those who are interested, I posted links to interviews of Guo Gu (

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, this is where he made his comment.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 10:07 AM  
Title: Re: I freakin' love vaccinations now  
Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Sorry to say, while antivaxx sentiment has always existed, from my point of view the Biden era CDC and related policy makers have done a bad enough job that combined with above factors, the paranoid have only dug in their heels.

ManiThePainter said:  
The paranoid dug in their heels a year ago.

The blame for this lies with Trump and his cronies and no one else. Whatever antivaxxer

hysteria we're dealing with today, it is something that Trump knowingly stoked and attempted to use to his political advantage. He also completely gutted the CDC as one of the first things he did when he came into office.

Blaming Biden for this is unfair.

Johnny Dangerous said:  
I disagree, the CDC under Biden has been a joke,

Malcolm wrote:  
Imagine, if you will, someone suffering from brain damage after a serious car accident. The car accident was Trump.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 8:29 PM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:  
clyde said:  
For those who are interested, I posted links to interviews of Guo Gu (

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes, this is where he made his comment.

clyde said:  
Malcolm, Guo Gu is a respected Chan teacher and he said his highly regarded teacher, Sheng Yen confirmed Guo Gu's stream entry.

Earlier you wrote,

Malcolm wrote:  
I find that difficult to believe.

clyde said:  
So, is it that you believe Guo Gu is lying? Or that Sheng Yen was mistaken? Or what?

Malcolm wrote:  
Mahayana stream entry is the first bhumi, so I don't believe it.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 8:37 PM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:

Meido said:

In any case, i do not think there is confusion in Rinzai Zen regarding what kensho is and isn't vis a vis the path. I agree that the article in question expresses a needed corrective to trends especially within Soto Zen since Meiji (what the author has called the "Post-Meiji Soto Orthodoxy") arising at least partly from Christian influence. He has written in more detail regarding those things here, if anyone is interested:

<https://www.patheos.com/blogs/wildfoxzen/2021/08/the-showa-dispute-about-true-faith.html>

Malcolm wrote:

Interesting. Removing Christian influence from any Buddhist tradition is a net gain for Buddhism as a whole.

But is this anti-kensho stance in Soto actually modern?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

My current practice is reciting the name at least 108 each day before going to bed followed by saying "May I be born in Sukhavati and attain supreme enlightenment". What would you add to that?

Malcolm wrote:

The sleeping yoga composed by Sakya Pandita.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 11:37 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Personally, I rather admire the anti-kensho stance.

Anders said:

In what way?

Malcolm wrote:

I see a lot of people chasing experiences, chasing recognition of the nature of the mind, objectifying the nature of the mind as if it is something to be grasped and held. The way it is summarized by Astus from a variety of sources here makes a lot of sense to me:



<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?t=20655>

Dosho Port's article, for me, is describing are what are classified as experiences: Tib. nyams su myong ba, Skt. anubhava.

Experiences are transient. They come and go.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 2nd, 2022 at 11:57 PM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Queequeg said:

Observation - seems Trump's tariffs on China are an issue for our friends from the Sinosphere... they're never mentioned here. I guess we can conclude they're making someone uncomfortable. Maybe its an effective tactic after all.

Malcolm wrote:

Tariffs just punish the intended market for goods, not the producers of those goods.

Tariffs are bad foreign policy. However, once they are in place they are difficult to unwind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

For example, I believe cancel culture is a legitimate criticism that can be leveled be against the left.

Malcolm wrote:

Whose doing the cancelling now? Trump cancels anyone who disagrees with him.

FiveSkandhas said:

America should always be a place where difference of opinion vis protected.

Oversensitivity about what really are often minor verbal gaffes really do destroy lives and careers, and it's a frightening trend.

Malcolm wrote:

Who gets to decide what's minor?

FiveSkandhas said:

book-banning

Malcolm wrote:

Strictly a right-wing thing. Or haven't you been paying attention to the news?

[https://www.vice.com/en/article/wxdpen/mississippi-furry-book-banning?utm\\_source=email&utm\\_medium=editorial&utm\\_content=news&utm\\_campaign=220202](https://www.vice.com/en/article/wxdpen/mississippi-furry-book-banning?utm_source=email&utm_medium=editorial&utm_content=news&utm_campaign=220202)

As far as taking down statues of Confederate traitors, we have not been thorough enough. We also need to blow the faces off of Stone Mountain in GA.

FiveSkandhas said:

And COVID disinformation needs to be patiently rebutted with facts

Malcolm wrote:

It is, repeatedly, or haven't you been paying attention to the news?

FiveSkandhas said:

The desire to secure the southern border...

Malcolm wrote:

Is basically rooted in racism and 19th century history of US imperialism. Just when was Texas, NM, AZ, and CA part of the thirteen original colonies?

Where is the wall on the Canadian border? Oh, right, mostly white people up there with a common Anglo heritage, apart from Quebec and the First nations.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 1:22 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Experiences are transient. They come and go.

reiun said:

But they may leave their mark and open doors.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, experiences are necessary, but they are not the point, at least not in Buddhism as I understand it, no matter what school we are referring to. Experiences are mind. Minds come and go.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 1:45 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

clyde said:

You don't believe Guo Gu is a stream enterer, so either he's lying or Sheng Yen, a renowned Chan Master who knew Guo Gu as a child and was his teacher for many years, was mistaken - and you know better. Which is it?

Malcolm wrote:

I told you, I don't believe it. That's all the answer you are going to get. What I believe is irrelevant to you, just as it is irrelevant to Sheng Yen, and Guo Gu. Why would they care what I think? And why do you care what I think?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 1:49 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Meido said:

Of course, in at least one major corner of Western Soto Zen, ayahuasca is now the hot thing. Too bad.

Malcolm wrote:

Sheesh, and here I thought it was just the inability to distinguish Advaita Vedanta from Buddhadharma that was contaminating Zen-- too much emphasis on "nonduality."

Ayakensho, who knew? It's 1964 all over again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

But is this anti-kensho stance in Soto actually modern?

Matylda said:

Yes.. it was first attacked by Nishiari Bokusan,

Malcolm wrote:

So do you agree or disagree with Shohaku Okumura:

Some people think mind to be permanent and body to be impermanent. In this case, mind was considered to be atman; that is, pure and permanent. And the body was considered to be the source of delusive desire and impermanent. In this case, mind was

called shinsho (mind nature) and body was called shinso (bodily form). And this mind-nature was often used as a synonym of buddha-nature. This is the reason Dogen negates the idea of kensho (seeing the nature).

[http://www.thezensite.com/ZenTeachings/Dogen\\_Teachings/Genjokoan\\_Okumara.htm](http://www.thezensite.com/ZenTeachings/Dogen_Teachings/Genjokoan_Okumara.htm)

Or is the case you are making that Nishiari Bokusan's influence was so strong that it has overwhelmed a more balanced view of the subject?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Matylda said:

Well, Rev. Okamura is very important person in American and Western soto. I am not a scholar as you know.

Malcolm wrote:

You are an important cultural informant, at the very least.

Matylda said:

Scholars with their intelectual understanding simply kill zen.

Malcolm wrote:

I'd say they are pretty well murdering Buddhism in general.

Thanks for your answer.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 2:55 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Tibetan Pure Land has a rich tradition of their own and perfect for those who are into more self power oriented practices.

Malcolm wrote:

We don't articulate it as a separate tradition. Everyone has faith in Amitabha Buddha, and everyone recites the Aspiration of Bodhisattva Samantabhadra as a matter of course, which is sufficient for birth in the pure land, sooner or later.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Minobu said:

Indigenous is an oxymoron for they too migrated to North America and are not of the land.

Malcolm wrote:

All humans are indigenous to planet earth.

But when your people have been living in the same place, more or less for the past 15,000+ years as opposed to the last 400, I think its ok to call yourself "indigenous."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

sun-and-moon said:

3. Since dhyana stabilizes the mind and mental factors, does stability of dhyana bring stability in rigpa too?

Malcolm wrote:

The dhyāna being discussed is not the dhyāna discussed in Dzogchen teachings. The latter does not depend on mental factors, unlike the former. So the answer is a solid no. In fact, it is the opposite. Rig pa (knowledge of one's own state) brings about natural concentration (rang bzhin bsam gtan), which is unlike the dhyānas spoken of in the lower yānas. Longchenpa writes about this extensively.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 3:38 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

a significant chunk of the population still looks up to the men who fought to preserve slavery as heroes worthy of public monuments.

Malcolm wrote:

Talk about lost causes...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

Minobu said:

(edits weird joke about what white Americans might refer to themselves in about 150 years)

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, they already think they are indigenous and have indigenous rights, you don't have to wait 150 years.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 5:00 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

ItsRaining said:

He himself used satori a lot which also refers to some kind of realisation.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I am aware of this. Thanks for your overall reply.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 5:31 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Matylda said:

Those people were real zen people. Some of them wrote quite a lot, like Sawaki (circa 20 vol.) some wrote virtually nothing but were still famous in the inner circles. I found myself that those who were not inclined to write, talk and show up, were best.

Malcolm wrote:

Thanks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 5:42 AM

Title: Re: What will you do...

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's not a "Blue State" problem, it's a west coast problem, primarily. And it is somewhat overblown by the right wing media.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 6:36 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I agree that Bhadracarī would be sufficient for birth, but would identify it as birth through the 19th and 20th vows.

Malcolm wrote:

In our tradition, Dharmakāra only makes one aspiration. It may have forty-eight parts, but they are integral to a single aspiration. One can argue over which passage is more important, but actually, it's just one aspiration.

Sure, one might argue that the 18th part is the most important because of the gatha that says:

If any sentient being hears my name,  
they will be born in my buddhafiield.

But this is nothing I have ever seen any Tibetan scholar advance as a special position, Mipham included.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 6:52 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

clyde said:

slander.

Malcolm wrote:

Expressing an opinion is not slander. What is slander? "The action or crime of making a false spoken statement damaging to a person's reputation."

Now, my statement is not false. How could it be? I merely expressed an opinion, one you don't like. But that's your problem of attachment, not mine. You are certainly entitled to think my opinion is wrong, misguided, deluded, shameful, and any number of terrible things. But it isn't a false statement, since it's my opinion and I stated it directly and honestly.

But I certainly have not ruined anyone's reputation, either, and I don't answer to you, clyde. So get over yourself.

Now, this little exchange has become a meta-conversation and is therefore, out of TOS.

One other thing-- if Guo Gu was a first stage bodhisattva, do you think he would care? Of

course not, so get over it. This is solely your problem. It isn't my problem, Sheng Yen's problem, or Guo Gu's problem. Maybe you ought to get in touch with that luminous mind. It would definitely solve your problem.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 11:55 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I agree that Bhadracarī would be sufficient for birth, but would identify it as birth through the 19th and 20th vows.

Malcolm wrote:

In our tradition, Dharmakāra only makes one aspiration. It may have forty-eight parts, but they are integral to a single aspiration. One can argue over which passage is more important, but actually, it's just one aspiration.

Zhen Li said:

This is the same in Jōdo Shinshū, the term 本願 (pūrva-praṇidhāna) has multiple referents:

1. The 48 vows.
2. The Gates for Birth (Essential Gate (19th), Provisional (20th), and Ocean Like (18th))
3. The Ocean Like Vow or True Gate (18th)

These distinctions were originally made by Shandao.

Hōnen added the dimension of "selection." This means that each of the 48 vows was specifically selected for a reason and to provide the Pure Land with a particular quality. It's not just a shotgun blast with a scattering of qualities here and there—they are actually selected for particular purposes. Hōnen also points out that we can select among the gate for birth, and indicates that the essential intent of the Larger, Shorter, and Contemplation sūtras is that the 18th vow is the universal vow that permits the full working of Amitābha's other power.

Shinran only added the clarification that the 19th vow is specifically meditative and non-meditative good acts, and that birth occurs by transferring the merits of those practices to birth, and that the 20th vow is Amitābha-oriented practice, but reliant upon self-power, hence it contains both "true and provisional aspects," i.e. both self and other power components. So, with Phowa, we can say that it is enabled by the 20th vow because it depends upon the practitioner's meditative act to activate, but it is enabled by Amitābha making the vow that enables birth through such methods in the first place.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, one might argue that the 18th part is the most important because of the gatha that says:



If any sentient being hears my name,  
they will be born in my buddhafiield.

But this is nothing I have ever seen any Tibetan scholar advance as a special position,  
Mipham included.

Zhen Li said:

It also depends on the audience. 98% of the pūrva-praṇidhāna is skilful means.

Malcolm wrote:

Self-power, other-power, who cares? it's doesn't matter either way. Only the hook of  
faith is able to catch the ring of compassion.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 8:12 PM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

sun-and-moon said:

Thanks for your answer. Could you give a reference on Longchenpas texts?

Malcolm wrote:

Commentary on the treasury of dharmadhatu.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 8:20 PM

Title: Re: Seventeen Tantras Lung with Tulku Dakpa

Content:

yagmort said:

can i attend if i don't have any nyingthig wang yet?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 8:25 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for  
whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Self-power, other-power, who cares? it's doesn't matter either way. Only the hook of  
faith is able to catch the ring of compassion.

Zhen Li said:

It's the difference between practising without calculation and attaining Buddhahood

upon death, and wavering and spending 500 years or many kalpas to even begin hearing the Dharma again. This is an interpretation not treated in TB, so we don't have to continue this discussion here, but I personally find it interesting to explore potential overlaps and parallels. The different kinds of Phowa, for instance, are something worth exploring in this regard.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. In Tibetan Buddhism, the practice is designed on the basis of the first grade of practitioners. So if some one is serious about being in the best or second best kind of birth, they know what to do.

Apart from irmanakaya phowa, the other two do do not involve birth in Sukhavati. In particular lamas train in nirmanakaya phowa mainly to help others. Also when train, you need to have the sign of phowa to assist others, and as proof you yourself will succeed if you can do it at the time death.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 8:32 PM

Title: Re: Buddha Nature of insentient thing.

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

However he does throw in Mipam and Longchenpa into the subject.

Malcolm wrote:

Neither would ever assert rocks and trees have Buddhanature.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

My current practice is reciting the name at least 108 each day before going to bed followed by saying "May I be born in Sukhavati and attain supreme enlightenment". What would you add to that?

Malcolm wrote:

The sleeping yoga composed by Sakya Pandita.

Könchok Thrinley said:

Looking at the text, is a transmission of lung or anything necessary? It seems like a rather straightforward instruction that can be used by anyone who practices vajrayana.

Malcolm wrote:  
It does not need a lung. It's sutra level.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 11:15 PM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:  
Anders said:  
Malcolm is just a guy on an internet forum.

dharmafootsteps said:  
And HHDL is just a simple monk.

Malcolm wrote:  
HHDL asserts, and I see no reason to doubt him, that he is not an ārya.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 3rd, 2022 at 11:58 PM  
Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind  
Content:  
Anders said:  
Malcolm is just a guy on an internet forum.

dharmafootsteps said:  
And HHDL is just a simple monk.

Matylda said:  
It is what he says, isn't it? And he has never said that he is a bodhisattva, the first bhumi neither any other bhumi up to the 10th. Of course Tibetans believe, that he is a kind of Avalokiteshvara in person, and that believe is shared by many non-Tibetans.

Malcolm wrote:  
If Buddhism depended on enlightened teachers these days, it would have already been extinguished.

The very first Buddhist teacher I ever encountered was on a weekend field trip to go sit with Eido Shimano in 1978 at Dai Bosatsu Zendo. I was sixteen, and I thought for sure that this guy must be enlightened. When I heard about the drunken sprawl that constituted a weekend field trip sit with Trungpa at Tail of Tiger, I was pretty smug, since I was very impressed with Dai Bosatsu (I wasn't permitted to go because I was delinquent in my homework).

At Dai Bosatsu, I remember chanting the Heart Sutra in Japanese, but of course I could not keep up. And I remember being hit with a stick, which at that place you had to

request. I wanted to see what it felt like. Of course I never received a Koan, etc., because I never went back there. But I always felt a kinship with the Japanese Zen tradition in general. When I went to Japan, a monk from Koyasan who spoke English asked me what kind of Buddhist I was, since I self-identified as a Buddhist, and I told him I was a Rinzai Buddhist. Of course, I did not know what I was talking about, but because I had that weekend experience at a nominally Rinzai place, that's what I said. (A funny aside, some of the kids brought valium to make it through the sitting periods, but I toughed it out).

Imagine my disappointment when, thirty-two years later, I heard he had been a serial womanizer, and that Robert Aitken had been keeping a record of his indiscretions for decades. The scandal went so deep that Myōshin-ji rejected the qualifications of all people that Shimano had designated as successors.

Now, many of the major Zen Buddhist founding teachers and their students in the US of note have been implicated in some kind of impropriety with women, financial impropriety, etc. some even claiming their bodhisattva activity justified their behavior. We all know who they are, no need to rehash the details. Many major Tibetan Buddhists like Trungpa, etc., were all deeply involved sex scandals, drug addiction, alcoholism, etc. Not just in the Kagyu school, but in Nyingma, Gelug, and so on. Even here we run into people who assert Trungpa was enlightened because x or y said so. I don't believe it.

I generally do not believe students of teachers when they assure me their guru or roshi or sensei or geshe or tulku is a highly realized being. I certainly don't believe it when a guru or roshi or sensei or geshe or tulku declares they are a highly realized being.

If someone passes, and they shows signs and relics at the time of their death, maybe I will believe it. But also signs and relics can just be the play of the four elements, and illustrate nothing special at all, so maybe I won't. Also nonbuddhist yogis sometimes sit for days without their bodies showing signs of decay, which demonstrates nothing more than function of mundane samādhis and nothing about awakening, bodhi.

All I know is that studying and practicing Dharma has brought meaning and purpose to my life. But claims of realization by Buddhist teachers and for Buddhist teachers? Meh. You can keep 'em. I am not buying.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 12:09 AM

Title: Re: "Formally" asking a lama to be one's root guru?

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Hello,

I have heard it said that one has to formally ask a lama to be ones root lama?

Malcolm wrote:

Total misunderstanding of the meaning of "root guru" in Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. In Tibetan Buddhism, the practice is designed on the basis of the first grade of practitioners. So if some one is serious about being in the best or second best kind of birth, they know what to do.

Shinjin said:

[22] The Buddha said to Ananda and Vaidehi,

Malcolm wrote:

We don't read this sūtra. So it forms no part of our commentarial tradition at all. Therefore, it cannot be used to discuss the issue, since there is no common textual base for a discussion. Therefore, we are not making it complicated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 12:20 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

WeiHan said:

How well the pandemic is managed not just reflected in death numbers but also, as you brought out, how fast and how far people life can get back to normal.

Malcolm wrote:

That depends on getting the world vaxxed. Then there is the issue of the virus spreading rapidly among the wild life population.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Matylda said:

However the competence and experience of a teacher from whom one could receive valid instructions is crucial.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but that does not depend on some putative awakening proclaimed by devoted

disciples. They just need to know what they are doing and know how to properly care for students.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 1:21 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We don't read this sūtra. So it forms no part of our commentarial tradition at all.

Shinjin said:

Why is this?

Malcolm wrote:

It was never translated into Tibetan. There are three reasons why this may be so: 1) it may not have a Sanskrit original 2) It may not have been sufficiently well-known among Indians to be translated based on reputation. 3) It might have been a Central Asian text, the original of which did not survive. Whatever the reason, we don't read it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 2:00 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Matylda said:

However the competence and experience of a teacher from whom one could receive valid instructions is crucial.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but that does not depend on some putative awakening proclaimed by devoted disciples. They just need to know what they are doing and know how to properly care for students.

Matylda said:

it is what I meant

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 3:17 AM

Title: Re: "Formally" asking a lama to be one's root guru?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

63ucn4.jpg (67.11 KiB) Viewed 9855 times

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 3:31 AM

Title: Re: Biden would beat Trump in 24

Content:

WeiHan said:

The number is from Edelman, a neutral to mildly anti-China America based consultancy firm.

Malcolm wrote:

I've been in China, more than once. I have many Chinese friends. One cannot trust what Chinese citizens say about China inside China. What they say inside is not what they say outside.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

And I believed the Zen promise that Buddhahood was attainable "in this lifetime".

Malcolm wrote:

Bodhisattvas have great courage because they do not expect to attain buddhahood in this life. They understand the daunting task of practicing the perfections, and don't try to explain it with with clever rhetoric.

Of course everyone wants to attain buddhahood as soon as possible, however, 99.999 percent of people do not attain buddhahood in this life, no matter what path one chooses to follow.

clyde said:

I am saddened that it is not only considered improper for students or teachers to talk in public of one's progress on the path, but that it seems generally accepted that there are NO awakened living Buddhist teachers in any tradition!

Malcolm wrote:

You shouldn't be sad. It is against monastic vows to speak of one's spiritual attainments, period. This precedent has force in the lay community as well. Hence there is clear standard of conduct where teachers, generally speaking, refuse to speak of their realization. And if they do, it's only carefully selected disciples with whom they would

share such information.

clyde said:

I had assumed and continue to believe that there are awakened contemporary Buddhist teachers in all the traditions (e.g. - HHDL and the recently departed TNH).

Malcolm wrote:

Why believe things of people when they themselves reject it? For example, HHDL has stated in certain terms that he is not an ārya bodhisattva. Of course, many people will ignore him and assume he is merely being humble.

clyde said:

But if it is the case that there are no awakened Buddhists, not even among the most dedicated practitioners and teachers, then the Zen promise is empty.

Malcolm wrote:

The measure of progress in Dharma: are your three poisons under control? Are you a more loving and compassionate person? Are you more patient, relaxed, and easy going? Are you wiser when viewing cause and effect? Do you have some understanding of emptiness and dependent origination? If the answer is yes to all of these questions, then you are doing pretty good job as a practitioner. In this case it does matter whether you practice Zen, Vipassana, Dzogchen, Pure Land, Nichiren Buddhism, Vajrayāna, and so on.

The awakening or enlightenment of other people is not transferrable. All teachers can do us is show us a path. As long as they understand the path they are practicing, have some core competencies in the literature of their tradition, as well as some kind of lineage transmission, then they can teach to interested people. If they happen to be awakened, great. But there is no special sign that someone is an ārya bodhisattva, they don't carry signs. One can only know a bodhisattva through their extraordinary compassion.

In the lower stages, bodhisattvas don't remember their training in past lives and will not possess the realization they had in previous lives. They practice the path and realize it again. This is why the lower bodhisattva stages are stages of retrogression. When one passes away, even if one reached the sixth bodhisattva stage, one will forget it in the next life until one meets the dharma again, whenever that is, in a future life. To be a Mahāyāna bodhisattva requires great courage and the commitment to practice the path to the end. There are many time where we will take rebirth where there will be no dharma for us to meet, no teachers to meet, no sangha to have.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 5:44 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

reiun said:



A Zen Teacher would have made this clear.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, people chase experiences, just like dogs chase their own tails.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 6:24 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

reiun said:

A Zen Teacher would have made this clear.

Malcolm wrote:

Nevertheless, people chase experiences, just like dogs chase their own tails.

reiun said:

Of course, since you are implying Zen people are like dogs, I am skeptical.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, I am implying everyone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 6:29 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

realizations

Malcolm wrote:

Realizations are not the same thing as awakening.

There are all kinds of realizations common people can have.

But when you realize bodhi, nonconceptual insight into emptiness, you are no longer an ordinary person. But even if you do realize bodhi, so what? You can't give it to anyone else. All you can do is teach.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 6:36 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

reiun said:

Of course, since you are implying Zen people are like dogs, I am skeptical.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope, I am implying everyone.

reiun said:

And you?

Malcolm wrote:

Been there, done that. I am nobody special.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 6:44 AM

Title: Re: Qbism... For your consideration

Content:

Queequeg said:

<https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/does-quantum-mechanics-reveal-that-life-is-but-a-dream/>

Hm.

Malcolm wrote:

Annoying webpage.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 7:09 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

You know those three animals at the center of a Bhavachakra? Those are the same notion here as the dog, everyone in samsara is chasing their tail, and many of us can't even differentiate between when we are doing that, and when we have ceased. That's why there is so much literature (including in Zen) that addresses deviations from the path.

Malcolm wrote:

And just as clearly, the lesson we learn from history both recent and distant, is that even renowned teachers are really no different. Hence, my general distrust of authorization of any kind, institutional or otherwise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 9:38 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think that's a legitimate approach within a tradition. There are plenty of Pure Land sutras that Honen and others could have used to support their approach, but either they didn't know about them or they weren't available. What we today consider the "canon" isn't necessarily what historic monastic would call the Tripitaka or Twelve Section canon. Halkias makes this point too with reference to different monastic libraries in Tibet, which don't perfectly have collections that all correspond to Derge equivalents.

As for the matter of particular vows, Halkias makes the interesting point that the four requisites are in fact directly lifted from the nineteenth vow, so Tibetan Pure Land methodology is explicitly a nineteenth vow approach in contrast to East Asian methodologies. Just something interesting that came out of my reading so far.

This is pretty interesting in as far as deconstructions of the vows were used to develop these methodologies. If you deconstruct the nineteenth vow you get the four requisites, and if you deconstruct the eighteenth vow you get the threefold mind. The twentieth vow on the other hand supports more the kind of continual Nembutsu practices you see in mainland schools and Tendai.

Malcolm wrote:

Among Tibetan commentaries, there is no such deconstruction of the parts of the aspiration. It is one aspiration with 48 parts. If any of the 48 parts are not satisfied, the other 47 are voided.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 9:53 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

Not really. Imagine someone promoting a process to heal your pain and promises success, but can't (or won't) identify anyone who has been successful.

Malcolm wrote:

What exactly do you think awakening is? What does realization mean to you? Meido brings up a good point, how are you going to tell if someone is awakened if you are yourself not an awakened person with clairvoyance?

The Mahayana sutras provide a good answer to your quandry: regard anyone you consider a teacher as if they are a buddha. It really doesn't matter who they are. And it doesn't matter if they are a buddha in fact. They are a connection to the Dharma for you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 9:57 PM

Title: Re: "Formally" asking a lama to be one's root guru?

Content:

KonchogUrgyenNyima said:

Hello,

I have heard it said that one has to formally ask a lama to be ones root lama?

Malcolm wrote:

Total misunderstanding of the meaning of "root guru" in Dzogchen.

Sonam Gyalmo said:

Are you going to point the OP in a useful direction, or just issue a ruling?

Malcolm wrote:

The issue has been discussed to death here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 10:15 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think that's a legitimate approach within a tradition. There are plenty of Pure Land sutras that Honen and others could have used to support their approach, but either they didn't know about them or they weren't available. What we today consider the "canon" isn't necessarily what historic monastic would call the Tripitaka or Twelve Section canon. Halkias makes this point too with reference to different monastic libraries in Tibet, which don't perfectly have collections that all correspond to Derge equivalents.

As for the matter of particular vows, Halkias makes the interesting point that the four requisites are in fact directly lifted from the nineteenth vow, so Tibetan Pure Land methodology is explicitly a nineteenth vow approach in contrast to East Asian methodologies. Just something interesting that came out of my reading so far.

This is pretty interesting in as far as deconstructions of the vows were used to develop these methodologies. If you deconstruct the nineteenth vow you get the four requisites, and if you deconstruct the eighteenth vow you get the threefold mind. The twentieth vow on the other hand supports more the kind of continual Nembutsu practices you see in mainland schools and Tendai.

Malcolm wrote:

Among Tibetan commentaries, there is no such deconstruction of the parts of the aspiration. It is one aspiration with 48 parts. If any of the 48 parts are not satisfied, the

other 47 are voided.

Shinjin said:

Then the commentaries contradict the sutras since the Larger sutra itself states that the lowest grade consists of those who have only recited the name and nothing else. Why should commentaries be taken more seriously than what the actual sutra states?

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such contradiction. The Sanskrit and Tibetan recensions do not guarantee immediate birth for those of the third grade. Only the Chinese version does. It makes no sense to try and box the Tibetan tradition into a Chinese commentarial perspective. They are different traditions, with different textual histories, and different assumptions and motivational drives.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 10:26 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such contradiction. The Sanskrit and Tibetan recensions do not guarantee immediate birth for those of the third grade. Only the Chinese version does. It makes no sense to try and box the Tibetan tradition into a Chinese commentarial perspective. They are different traditions, with different textual histories, and different assumptions and motivational drives.

Shinjin said:

Could you recommend a sanskrit version of the Larger sutra that is available online?

Malcolm wrote:

You should just obtain a copy of Gomez's book which has both the Sanskrit and Chinese sūtras translated separately, because they are sufficiently different to warrant such separate treatment. The short title of his book is "The Land of Bliss."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Pablo said:

Just to be clear (I ask because I truly do not know, I'm not really interested in polemics), what Malcolm and Johnny are saying is that the language used in the Zen tradition re Buddhahood (see for instance Astus's messages in this thread) is rhetorical, and that the awakening spoken of in Zen does not correspond with awakening as understood in

the general Mahayana tradition. Is this correct?

Astus said:

There is such an interpretation, especially when one takes the side of Doctrine (jiao 教 - a Zen term for the rest of Buddhism that's based on scriptures and treatises). On the other hand, it can also be said that it's the 'general Mahayana' that is rhetorical, while Zen is seeing how things are. And there's also a third option, that it's all a matter of skilful means and one works with whatever one can work for the single goal of liberation.

Malcolm wrote:

It's all rhetoric, all the way down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 4th, 2022 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Ok, thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Also, there is no doubt a Tibetan/Sanskrit based version that is perhaps more text critically oriented than Gomez's will appear on 84000.co.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 12:28 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Astus said:

If there is disagreement then there is discrimination, if there is discrimination there is suffering.

Malcolm wrote:

So when the Buddha disagreed with someone, he was suffering?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 1:15 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Pablo said:

Thanks, Malcolm.

So then the point would be not to try to "match" two different rhetoric schemes (aka bhumis on one hand and Zen on the other), or am I misunderstanding you?

Malcolm wrote:

What I am saying is that at one level, it doesn't matter what this old master said or that one. What matters is gaining personal experience in the path. That can only happen if one actually make a commitment and actually practices the path. It is useless to sit around and compare realizations. We can only have our own realization and no one else's. No one can actually confirm our realization for us, in fact, not even the Buddha. That's why every teacher tells their students, "Great, you understood something, keep up the good work" if the student is sincere. Acknowledgement of a student by a teacher is far more about the student's sincerity than confirming that someone has achieved this or that rank.

For example, in Dzogchen teachings, there is only one level, rhetorically speaking. Where other teachings such as Vajrayāna, Lotus Buddhism, Shingon, etc., are ekayāna teachings, Dzogchen is an ekabhumi teaching. Zen is a little similar, according to my understanding. In Dzogchen, you learn to recognize your own state after it has been introduced; you work on removing doubt about that state; and then, when you have resolved your doubts, you continue in that state. But these are just words. The rubber has got to meet the road, otherwise it is all just rhetorical posturing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 1:31 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Ok, thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

Also, there is no doubt a Tibetan/Sanskrit based version that is perhaps more text critically oriented than Gomez's will appear on 84000.co.

Shinjin said:

What problem do you have with Zhen Li's interpretation from a few pages back?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't have a problem with it per se, it just isn't how things are framed in a Tibetan Buddhist context. There is no commentarial analysis of these 48 points of Dharmakāra Bodhisattva's aspiration, for example. No distinctions are made between the 18th, 19th, and 20th point, no mokṣology connected with the kind of faith Zhen Li discusses—which isn't even one's own faith, properly speaking, but more of a pure trust in the efficacy of Dharmakāra's aspiration to do all the heavy lifting. This kind of idea is simply

not present in the Tibetan Buddhist culture sphere.

The faith of simple people in Tibet is to recite the mani as much as possible, spinning prayer wheels all the while, and hope to be born in the Sukhavati after death, guided through the bardo there by a qualified lama. That's about it. When one does transference of consciousness, the form may be Amitabha, but the essence is one's guru. All phowas with three thoughts, a consciousness to transfer, a place to transfer, and the action are predicated on one transferring one's consciousness into the heart of one's guru visualized as Amitabha, Vajrasattva, etc. It is just an entirely different religious culture than Chinese or Japanese Pure Land Buddhism.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Queequeg said:

Its also interesting that Red Pine himself might be responsible for the popularity of the area because of his book.

Matylda said:

Do you think so?

Malcolm wrote:

Amongst western spiritual seekers.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 2:29 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

He said to me there is Other Power in Tibetan Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. I have read literally tens of thousands of pages of Tibetan Buddhist commentaries and sadhanas, etc. The word "gzhan stobs" (tariki) does not exist in our discourse. Halkias is mistaken to suggest translating "dngos po'i nus pa" (vastuśakti) as "other power," and Cook is mistaken to follow Halkias' lead in this. It is not a big deal, but it is misleading.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 2:42 AM



Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

He said to me there is Other Power in Tibetan Buddhism.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. I have read literally tens of thousands of pages of Tibetan Buddhist commentaries and sadhanas, etc. The word "gzhan stobs" (tariki) does not exist in our discourse. Halkias is mistaken to suggest translating "dngos po'i nus pa" (vastuśakti) as "other power," and Cook is mistaken to follow Halkias' lead in this. It is not a big deal, but it is misleading.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Thanks Acharya

Yes it was nothing official more of a personal teaching not literal or definitive like it is in Shin

Malcolm wrote:

I personally think the main defect of the Halkias book is confirmation bias. He wanted to find tariki in the Tibetan Buddhist pure land tradition, and sure enough, he "found" it in one text by Mipham, by misconstruing a common Tibetan term to confirm his bias. Cook followed him down this rabbit hole.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Matylda said:

Was his book published in Chinese?

Meido said:

Yes, it was. Apparently selling 250,000 copies in China:

<https://sinosphere.blogs.nytimes.com/2014/07/17/q-and-a-bill-porter-on-travel-writing-in-china/>

Malcolm wrote:

Heh, the first time I hit that link it gave me this:

Error 503 first byte timeout

first byte timeout

Guru Mediation:

Details: cache-lga21936-LGA 1644000185 1426676425

Varnish cache server

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 3:16 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

It exists in its own place within the 18th Vow

What I took to mean from my old teacher was very generalistic like say praying to Guru Rinpoche as one example

Malcolm wrote:

And as I explained above, In the Tibetan tradition there is no analysis of the forty-eight parts of Dipamkara Bodhisattva's aspiration, which can be privileged over any other, which could form the basis for a self-power/other-power distinction. It's simply foreign to the Tibetan tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 4:50 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I guess the disagreement would be that Rigpa is not the same as Kensho? And from there the differences continue?

Malcolm wrote:

Why would rig pa be different than kensho? Both can be experienced by people who are not "enlightened." The whole point of the Dzogchen path is that one can recognize one's state. I presume this is the point of Zen. Enlightenment is overrated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 5:01 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

The differences are just method, and that in Dzogchen one is introduced to nature of mind, in Zen one discovers it.

Malcolm wrote:

There are important differences. I would never, for example, assert expertise in Zen, claim to be able to explain koans, etc., or argue that shikantaza and trekcho are the same thing, though it is tempting to draw similarities. I would be suspicious of any Zen teacher who claimed they could explain Dzogchen unless they knew Tibetan, etc.

But as JD astutely observed, my initial response was one of discomfort with the responses reported by Dosho Port. It all seemed just a little pat to me. Slogans like "OMG, I am he as you are he as you are me and we are all together." Plus I really think that "nonduality" is an overused meme in Western "Eastern" spirituality, and when taken out of context is completely meaningless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 5:21 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So when the Buddha disagreed with someone, he was suffering?

Astus said:

If he had disagreed by taking one view and opposing with another...

Malcolm wrote:

FFS, Astus, get a sense of humor. We know very well you are an excellent book dancer, ready with your handy kindle library.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 5th, 2022 at 8:15 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Anders said:

Longchenpa never hid his attainment

Malcolm wrote:

On what basis do you make this claim?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Anders said:

Longchenpa never hid his attainment

Malcolm wrote:

On what basis do you make this claim?

Anders said:

That he'd in many places write about his own realisation.

Malcolm wrote:

In works read by virtually no one for three hundred years. That doesn't really count. And such references aren't in many places, but mainly in the commentary of the treasury of the dharmadhatu, written towards the end of his life.

And he doesn't really come right out and say "I attained this or that", he couches it in terms of "I understood this personally" which later scholars take as confirmations of his realization.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 2:25 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

He concludes this section by saying that these qualities are not based solely on the "ripening force of individual beings" (sems-can rang-rang gi stobs smin-pa) but on the power of Amitābha's aspirations (smon-lam) and wisdom (ye-shes).

Malcolm wrote:

Right, without the ring of faith, there is nothing for the hook of compassion to catch. But this is beside the point. The point I keep making is that Pure Landers are inclined to focus on thus or that part of Amitabha's aspiration. We aren't.

As for accepting or rejecting sutras, if a sutra isn't in the Tibetan Canon, we don't read it, or reference it commentarily. You might regard this as short-sighted, but it isn't. It's just how our tradition evolved. Yours evolved differently. That's totally ok.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 2:43 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

Intellectual comprehension of Truths is possible without dhyanas.  
In this case, it is the fruit of the stream-enterer.

There are 7 remaining shackles to be eradicated from the total 10 saṃyojanāni.

Five higher bonds and five lower ones. Three of them (sakkāya-diṭṭhi, vicikicchā, sīlabbata-parāmāsa) are eliminated by the Way of Seeing the Truths, i.e. Abhisamaya - full of intellectual comprehension.

Dhyana without understanding the Truths can eliminate all degrees (strong-medium-weak) of these seven impurities, except inherent in bhavagra (8th dhyana).

Only one who has mastered the entrance to the 8th dhyana and fully comprehended the Truth is able to balance shamatha and vipashyana in such a way as to achieve nirodha-samapatti.

Vasubandhu gives the example of the Buddha himself, who "reached the 8th dhyana even before he sat under the bodhi tree."  
Bhavagra - the limit of the mundane Path, i.e. Dhyana without Truth.

Defilements were recognized that could only be removed by Truths and only dhyana.

The underdevelopment of one of these two paramitas means the presence of certain impurities.

Their perfection and balance make it possible to achieve nirodha-samapatti, "calcinate" the most intractable saṃskaras, defilements still remaining on the bhavagra.

Malcolm wrote:  
This is the general shravakayana account.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 4:24 AM  
Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
In works read by virtually no one for three hundred years. That doesn't really count.

Anders said:  
It counts for me in that I appreciate he did it.

Malcolm wrote:  
My point is that he wasn't running around bragging to all and sundry.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

All the theses I have presented are taken from Sanskrit texts.

Abhidharma samuccaya, Astasahasrika, Abhisamaya-alamkara, Abhisamaya-alamkara-aloka, etc.

I just tried to back them up with Pali primary sources.

Malcolm wrote:

Your creating a strange brew.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 4:58 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

The referent of any word/concept is "empty".

A series of one-time objects conceived by us as one and the same object.

This mental image of an object "lasting" in time, created by the consciousness, is able to enter into connection with the word,  
i.e. suitable for naming as well as for storing in memory.

And this "nomenclature unit" exists as a mental projection, as an artificial overlay on reality.

Cows, pudgals, pots - just such "imaginary" objects. In reality, there are only a fast change of frames,  
a series of different (consisting of different groups atoms) of unique instantaneous objects,  
divorced not only substantially, but also according to the time intervals of their existence.

Malcolm wrote:

Atoms are also imaginary objects, no less than cows, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 8:51 AM

Title: Re: Is first dhyāna necessary for the first bhūmi?

Content:

Si-va-kon said:

) This porridge was brewed long before me.

The gradations given by Vasubandhu in AK are refined by Maitreya/Asanga dividing the Path into five stages.

In Abhisamayālaṃkāra and in Abhisamayālaṃkāra-āloka says that the lowest entry level into the path,

the first stage of practice, is called proximate liberation (mokṣa-bhāgiya).

The equivalent term in AS is sambhara-marga.

The second stage - proximate penetration (nirvedha-bhāgiya) is called prayoga-marga.

Its four divisions - usmagata, myrdhagata, ksanti and laukikagradharma are identical to those found in earlier Buddhism.

But Maitreya and Haribhadra frequently emphasize that stages of Mahayana penetration are superior (visistata) to the Hinayana equivalents.

Darshanamarga is Abhisamaya, she is the first bhumi.

This is the answer to the question whether dhyana is necessary here.

Everyone answered correctly - "No".

Dhyana is necessary from the second bhumi, this is already the stage of bhavanamarga.

In conclusion, a list of the degrees of pollutions eliminated on the bhavanamarga, respectively bhumi:

- 2 great great
- 3 middling great
- 4 soft great
- 5 great middling
- 6 middling middling
- 7 soft middling
- 8 great soft
- 9 middling soft
- 10 soft soft

Malcolm wrote:

Maitreya precedes Vasubandhu

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 9:40 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

You're making this more than it is. I was only asking if Zen practitioners could name even a few modern dead Zen teachers whom they sincerely believe were awakened as

they understand the term (not needing to accept any definition but their own).

Malcolm wrote:

So you are looking for opinions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 8:56 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

You're making this more than it is. I was only asking if Zen practitioners could name even a few modern dead Zen teachers whom they sincerely believe were awakened as they understand the term (not needing to accept any definition but their own).

Malcolm wrote:

So you are looking for opinions.

clyde said:

Malcolm, I understand your point, but what proof could there be?

Malcolm wrote:

That's my point, none.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 9:23 PM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Generally try to stick with original texts, don't waste your time on academic papers. Obtain wang, lung, and tri.

The Crystal and the Way of Light: Sūtra, Tantra and Dzogchen by Chögyal Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche

The Precious Treasury of Philosophical Systems by Longchen(pa) Rabjam

Gateway to Knowledge by Jamgön Mipham

Dzogchen Teachings - Namhai Norbu Rinpoché

Wellsprings of the Great Perfection

Buddhahood in this Life



Treasury of Genuine Meaning

Ye she Lama

Treasury of the Fundamental State

Self Arisen vidya tantra

Self liberated vidya tantra

Tantra without syllables

Blazing Lamp

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 10:19 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

dharmafirststeps said:

Sorry if I misrepresented you, thanks for clarifying.

Great interview by the way. Really enjoyed it.

Malcolm wrote:

Tulku Orgyen has said that all Yanas have some aspect of trekchod in their teachings.

The term original purity is not unique to Dzogchen, it's found in the PP sutras, etc.

So it is not surprising Meido would see some similarities between Dzogchen and Rinzai Zen in his later training.

But I don't think one can just say Dzogchen and Zen are commensurate, there are important differences, not least of which is that Dzogchen is situated in a dialectic with the Path of Transformation in Vajrayana, whereas Chan/Zen/Son are situated in a dialectic with Sutric Buddhism, while largely accepting the path of renunciation advocated in Sutra as a basis for conduct, particularly in Chan and Son.

Similarities include, as noted above, teacher/student interaction that privileges oral instruction over scripture and rejection of path-based ranking schemes of realization.

A striking difference I perceive between Chan/Son/Zen is the extent to which Chan, etc., is deeply entwined with institutional practice, whereas Dzogchen practice is fundamentally a solo endeavor, carried out alone and in solitude. Of course I don't mean to suggest there is no solo Chan/zen meditation practice, because of course

there is. But group meditation practice, while not completely foreign to Dzogchen, especially in an instructional context, is not the general mode of practice. There are no Dzogchendos.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 6th, 2022 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Why is the book "Tibetan Book of the Dead" so popular amongst non-Buddhists / beginners

Content:

Nalanda said:

It's so popular that even my aunt (who is a Christian) has one.

Why is this book such a hit to Westerners?

Malcolm wrote:

Hippies.

Aemilius said:

It is much earlier than that. What are the names of the youth- and subculture movements in 1920's, 1930's, 1940's, 1950's, and 1960's?

"Walter Yeeling Evans-Wentz (February 2, 1878 – July 17, 1965) was an American anthropologist and writer who was a pioneer in the study of Tibetan Buddhism, and in transmission of Tibetan Buddhism to the Western world, most known for publishing an early English translation of The Tibetan Book of the Dead in 1927. He had three other texts translated from the Tibetan: Tibet's Great Yogi Milarepa (1928), Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines (1935), and The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation (1954), and wrote the preface to Paramahansa Yogananda's famous spiritual book, Autobiography of a Yogi (1946)."

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and he understood none of them and interpreted all of them through the cloudy lens of Theosophy. His publications are useful for understanding the progress of the reception of Buddhism in the west, but importantly, none of his books are accurate and immediately attracted the attention of early Tibetan arrivals for their lack of accuracy. Of course the Sikkimese gentleman who translated these for him understood them perfectly well, but Evans-Wentz's editing distorted these translations not to mention his introductions, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 12:33 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Gateway to Knowledge by Jamgön Mipham

ManiThePainter said:

I always thought the Gateway to Knowledge was more of a text on Abhidharma than on Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

You need a little abhidharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 12:40 AM

Title: Re: Geshe Tenzin Gelek Rinpoche

Content:

PeterC said:

I don't know why people keep flogging the dead horse of Christianity here,

Malcolm wrote:

Makes a nice dull thud.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 1:21 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

I always thought the Gateway to Knowledge was more of a text on Abhidharma than on Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:

You need a little abhidharma.

ManiThePainter said:

Is there anything in the Gateway which is restricted?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Why is the book "Tibetan Book of the Dead" so popular amongst non-Buddhists / beginners

Content:

Aemilius said:

It is much earlier than that. What are the names of the youth- and subculture movements in 1920's, 1930's, 1940's, 1950's, and 1960's?

"Walter Yeeling Evans-Wentz (February 2, 1878 – July 17, 1965) was an American anthropologist and writer who was a pioneer in the study of Tibetan Buddhism, and in transmission of Tibetan Buddhism to the Western world, most known for publishing an early English translation of The Tibetan Book of the Dead in 1927. He had three other texts translated from the Tibetan: Tibet's Great Yogi Milarepa (1928), Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines (1935), and The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation (1954), and wrote the preface to Paramahansa Yogananda's famous spiritual book, Autobiography of a Yogi (1946)."

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and he understood none of them and interpreted all of them through the cloudy lens of Theosophy. His publications are useful for understanding the progress of the reception of Buddhism in the west, but importantly, none of his books are accurate and immediately attracted the attention of early Tibetan arrivals for their lack of accuracy. Of course the Sikkimese gentleman who translated these for him understood them perfectly well, but Evans-Wentz's editing distorted these translations not to mention his introductions, etc.

Aemilius said:

Your eye of transcendental wisdom is lacking in compassionate understanding of the times and people of those times, I would kindly suggest.

Malcolm wrote:

I would suggest that EW's publications were quite typical of colonialism, and nothing like Csoma De Koros pioneering work.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 5:16 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

Yes, it will simply be Zen practitioners opinions about Zen teachers. To be honest, I've sat with a number of Zen teachers and not all Zen teachers are equal based on their personalities and tendencies, capabilities and skills, and depth of realization. Some, in my opinion (What else is there, except your opinions?) are awakened, and some not. Admittedly, even those I don't believe are awakened are often excellent teachers.

My point, as I've stated repeatedly, is that it's false modesty to not be honest about what

Zen students believe about Zen teachers. Yes, it will be opinions, but our opinions about contemporary Zen teachers are no different than our opinions about the ancient Zen Masters and even the Buddha, except that we have their presence to aid our judgement.

Malcolm wrote:

But then, since there are no objective standards, it merely becomes an aesthetic judgement, much like Tibetan Buddhists who claim lama so and so is a realized master, and so on.

And now you can reconsider your outrage when I expressed my doubts about Guo Gu's declaration about his stream entry or calling into question the sort of rhetoric employed in Dosho Port's article. It amounts to no more than preferring The Rolling Stones to the Grateful Dead.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 6:57 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

dude, come on, the Stones are objectively better.

Malcolm wrote:

We think so but...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 8:09 PM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Generally try to stick with original texts, don't waste your time on academic papers. Obtain wang, lung, and tri.

The Crystal and the Way of Light: Sūtra, Tantra and Dzogchen by Chögyal Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche

The Precious Treasury of Philosophical Systems by Longchen(pa) Rabjam

Gateway to Knowledge by Jamgön Mipham

Dzogchen Teachings - Namhai Norbu Rinpoché

Wellsprings of the Great Perfection

Buddhahood in this Life

Treasury of Genuine Meaning

Ye she Lama

Treasury of the Fundamental State

Self Arisen vidya tantra

Self liberated vidya tantra

Tantra without syllables

Blazing Lamp

Nalanda said:

Thanks. Are any of these texts restricted requiring wang lung tri?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 8:12 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

dude, come on, the Stones are objectively better.

Malcolm wrote:

We think so but...

Anders said:

Would a Buddha's all knowledge extend to knowing which of the two are better?

Malcolm wrote:

Assuming Buddhas have ears, they would pick the Stones every damn day.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 7th, 2022 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

clyde said:

but that it seems generally accepted that there are NO awakened living Buddhist teachers in any tradition!

seeker242 said:

There are plenty of awakened teachers. There is really no reason to believe there isn't.

Malcolm wrote:

There is also no reason to believe there is. Awakening is not a falsifiable phenomena. So in the end, it just amounts to a faith-based narrative. Even the Buddha was absolutely clear about this:

Excellent, Sariputta. Excellent. Those who have not known, seen, penetrated, realized, or attained it by means of discernment would have to take it on conviction in others that the faculty of conviction... persistence... mindfulness... concentration... discernment, when developed & pursued, gains a footing in the Deathless, has the Deathless as its goal & consummation; whereas those who have known, seen, penetrated, realized, & attained it by means of discernment would have no doubt or uncertainty that the faculty of conviction... persistence... mindfulness... concentration... discernment, when developed & pursued, gains a footing in the Deathless, has the Deathless as its goal & consummation."

— <https://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn48/sn48.044.than.html>

I am not saying we should not have faith that there are somewhere awakened human beings out there. I am just saying we need to be honest that it isn't an objective fact that can be ascertained beyond doubt. Relics, light shining from bodies, etc., are also not proof of realization.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 12:44 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's still subjective, since who knows whether the "mendicant" is deluded. There is no way to book dance your way around it. And hanging out with someone for a long while is also no guarantee, as the case of Sunakshatra shows.

There is also no reason to believe there is. Awakening is not a falsifiable phenomena.

Astus said:

'There is a method—apart from faith, preference, oral tradition, reasoned contemplation, or acceptance of a view after consideration—that a mendicant can rely on to declare their enlightenment.'

( <https://suttacentral.net/sn35.153/en/sujato> )

'Great king, as a layman enjoying sensual pleasures, living at home with your children, using sandalwood imported from Kāsi, wearing garlands, perfumes, and makeup, and accepting gold and money, it's hard for you to know who is perfected or on the path to perfection.

You can get to know a person's ethics by living with them. ... You can get to know a

person's purity by dealing with them. ... You can get to know a person's resilience in times of trouble. ... You can get to know a person's wisdom by discussion. But only after a long time, not casually; only when paying attention, not when inattentive; and only by the wise, not the witless.'

( <https://suttacentral.net/sn3.11/en/sujato>; also AN 4.192 & Ud 6.2)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 5:44 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's still subjective, since who knows whether the "mendicant" is deluded. There is no way to book dance your way around it.

Astus said:

Yes, subjective, but not necessarily based on faith.

Malcolm wrote:

Necessarily. You have to have faith in these texts as authorities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 5:47 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And now you can reconsider your outrage when I expressed my doubts about Guo Gu's declaration about his stream entry

clyde said:

Malcolm, I have reconsidered, but, as I explained before, I still have this problem.

If Guo Gu had simply said, "I am a stream enterer" and you said you doubted it, I would understand and have nothing to say.

But you heard Guo Gu say his teacher, Sheng Yen, told him he was a stream enterer and this creates the following dilemma: either your doubt is that Guo Gu was lying (and I hope that isn't the reason for your doubt) or that Sheng Yen, a renown Chan Master who knew Guo Gu since he was a child and was his teacher for many years, was mistaken and your doubt is about Sheng Yen's discernment. Frankly, I was asking (and hoping) you would point to a third possibility for your doubt such as a difference in understanding of the causes and results of stream entry.

Malcolm wrote:

I told you. When people start talking about their realization, I just doubt it. It does not mean I think they are bad people, or even lying. Guo Gu probably believes it. But such



declarations cause me personally to have less confidence in people rather than more.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 6:07 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

Then it looks like Dzogchen is closed door for me right now.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to find a teacher. That is the base line. You cannot understand Dzogchen from books. Many people try. All fail.

In the beginning, you have to be like a bee, and visit and sample several teachers. Once you find the right teacher for you, then you settle down. The teacher, in every respect, is more important than the teaching.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 6:40 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Necessarily. You have to have faith in these texts as authorities.

Astus said:

What do you mean by that? One first needs to have faith in the texts initially, or there is nothing beyond faith? If the former, then why necessarily?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to believe the narrative. But there is nothing about the narrative that can be proven to anyone. So, yes, there is in the end nothing but faith, unless someone is claiming direct personal knowledge, and you know how sketchy that is.

Anyone want to stand up here and proclaim they are awakened? No? I thought as much.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 6:44 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Right, without the ring of faith, there is nothing for the hook of compassion to catch. But this is beside the point. The point I keep making is that Pure Landers are inclined to focus on thus or that part of Amitabha's aspiration. We aren't.

Zhen Li said:

It is clear that there is no inclination to focus on particular vows, but the point the reference to Mipham was making is that it is at least in the background that if not a focus on the 19th vow, then the practices of other vows are at least presumed to be subsumed under the practices specified there. You could say that the 19th vow appears to have the most detailed rundown of things you can do to be born, so from a certain point of view, it would be logical to say that is the clear area of focus in terms of finding out what it is that one should practice.

Malcolm wrote:

These are the things the aspirant can do. But they are not parsed as "vows." There is no language in the text to indicate that they are, or that they can be treated as individual aspects.

Zhen Li said:

Personally, I am interested in a holistic view of the Buddha-Dharma, so I want to know how people in all traditions understand these things

Malcolm wrote:

Then stop calling the 48 parts of the aspiration of Dharmakāra "vows." They do not satisfy the requirement of a vow (samvara) from the pov of the Tibetan tradition.

If you continue to call these things vows, you won't understand pure land practice from the Tibetan Buddhist pov. You need to set aside your frame.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 7:57 AM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

It's the closest thing we have to peer review.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course this declaration can't be checked, so it is hardly peer review.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:05 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

That's just the most common translation for pranidhana.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe in Chinese, not in Tibetan. In Tibetan pranidhana is translated as smon lam.

Smon pa refers to a desire to attain something, lam refers to an utterance (tshig gi lam, literally path of words), hence we typically translate this term as "aspiration." So there is a disconnect here based on semantics.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:11 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Astus said:

What do you mean by that? One first needs to have faith in the texts initially, or there is nothing beyond faith? If the former, then why necessarily?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to believe the narrative. But there is nothing about the narrative that can be proven to anyone. So, yes, there is in the end nothing but faith, unless someone is claiming direct personal knowledge, and you know how sketchy that is.

Anyone want to stand up here and proclaim they are awakened? No? I thought as much.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Sure. I will.

Well...give me a few minutes. I haven't had my coffee yet. But then...

Ultimately, asking for someone to reveal they are fully awakened is a trick question. As soon as you say, "I" you negate "am enlightened".

Malcolm wrote:

No, this doesn't follow, since the Buddha, so we have read, did exactly that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:54 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Ultimately, asking for someone to reveal they are fully awakened is a trick question. As soon as you say, "I" you negate "am enlightened".

Malcolm wrote:

No, this doesn't follow, since the Buddha, so we have read, did exactly that.

PadmaVonSamba said:

Yeah, well, he was the exception, which is probably why we are Buddhists. He also backed it up with a few miracles

Malcolm wrote:

Which he also explained didn't prove anything...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 9:10 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

As for Tibetan, for smon lam, Jeffrey Hopkins includes "vow; resolve," as does Valby, and Ives Waldo. For smon pa, JH has "resolve, vow."

I think the problem isn't really with the term "vow," it's that you may be assuming vow means saṃvāra or precept or something along those lines, when most people are using the term in a different way.

Malcolm wrote:

I was using a native Tibetan dictionary. The Valby dictionary is not reliable, it's kind of like a pastiche of different translators. It's not reflective of how Tibetans understand their own terminology at all. The native Tibetan etymology is as I explained it to you. No Tibetan considers a smon lam to be a sdom pa. As I said, there is a semantic disconnect here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 9:33 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, there is a semantic disconnect here.

Zhen Li said:

I do not have a disconnect, I am happy to recognise that praṇidhāna is smon lam and 願. That I represent this word with a different English term than you is of the lowest importance for the conversation. We shall just use praṇidhāna going forward.

Malcolm wrote:

My point related to how the term is understood in Tibetan, and we can't simply gloss over it. The point I am making, which is being astutely ignored here, is that Dharmakara didn't make 48 aspirations. He made one. His aspiration was to purify a buddhafiield, and he specified 48 conditions integral to his success in doing so. I am maintaining that distinction is critical in understanding why the Tibetan pure land traditions are quite uniform in their presentation from the eighth century onward.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 10:02 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

Then it looks like Dzogchen is closed door for me right now.

Malcolm wrote:

You need to find a teacher. That is the base line. You cannot understand Dzogchen from books. Many people try. All fail.

In the beginning, you have to be like a bee, and visit and sample several teachers. Once you find the right teacher for you, then you settle down. The teacher, in every respect, is more important than the teaching.

Nalanda said:

Yes yes. You said several times and

<https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?p=615173#p615173>, this isn't an overnight project. It will take a few years.

By my estimation:

For the next 10 years - General Buddhism, Sutrayana Mahayana, Tibetan Buddhism. FTMP, Tergar, my <https://www.bodhicittasangha.org/> - Khenpo Sherab)

I just thought there are Dzogchen books I could read in the meantime.

Malcolm wrote:

It's better you don't, frankly. You won't understand them without explanation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 10:07 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

Got it.

Well, I saved some money and time.

Thank you.

Malcolm wrote:

You can always buy them. It's not that difficult to get teachings. For example you should attend the lung of 17 tantras that's coming up. You should not try understand these things on your own.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 10:16 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

Where is the 17 tantras?

That Bon master video above?

Malcolm wrote:

No, I posted a link a while back, you can find it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 11:19 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think if you reflect upon the matter, you will find that this is clearly the case, and that any mention of the four conditions for birth is a clear selection of specific aspects of the 48 conditions relevant to us.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but that condition is not possible without all the rest, they are all integral to one another, just as it is integral to all of them. Since Dharmakara has done his job, presumably, without our participation the other 47 conditions fail. The crucial point of course is that it's our faith, through hearing Amitabha's name, upon which Dharmakara depends for the success of his aspiration. Without us, he has no buddhafiield.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:14 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

Dan74 said:

Maybe Malcolm's understanding of what attaining stream entry entails differs from that of Ven. Sheng-Yen and Guo Gu? I mean he has shown siddhis and all...

Malcolm wrote:

Mahayana streamentry means one has directly realized two-fold emptiness.

There are no observable external signs of such an attainment. So in this case, one would have to just take GG's word at face value.

I mean, that would be like me publicly claiming that I've been told by some lama I won't experience the bardo. Anyone would be quite justified in expressing their skepticism of such a claim.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:17 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

It's the closest thing we have to peer review.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course this declaration can't be checked, so it is hardly peer review.

PadmaVonSamba said:

No, but I said it's the closest thing we have to it.

Malcolm wrote:

It isn't close at all. Peer review is usually done by committee, and it is not a process free of flaws.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Formless shamatha + shamatha w/o object

Content:

Damchö\_Dorje said:

First, are formless shamatha and shamatha without an object the same practice?

What is the relationship of this kind of shamatha to nonmeditation?

Malcolm wrote:

You need to indicate where you are taking this terminology from.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 8:58 PM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You have to believe the narrative. But there is nothing about the narrative that can be proven to anyone. So, yes, there is in the end nothing but faith, unless someone is claiming direct personal knowledge, and you know how sketchy that is.

Astus said:

If by faith you mean cannot be proven to others, then it's all just faith.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. And, quite honestly, having a more calm mind, etc., is just as likely to be an expression of maturity as a human being, as it is to be a result of some faith commitment to Buddhism or any other religion.

As for the rest tl;dr.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 9:11 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Apart from Lamdre, Naropa's Khecari is the most important set of instructions in Sakya. It's easy to practice, profound, and complete. According to the Sakya Tradition, it's the ultimate practice lineage from the Cakrasamvara tantra tradition as preserved by this school.

Konchog1 said:

In the Ganden Tradition, it is recommended to practice Heruka first. It's my understanding the Sakyapa only practice Hevajra first. Do you know the reason for this?

Malcolm wrote:

Yogini includes Heruka.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: We Are All This Luminous Mind

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

My point is that while there is no absolutely sure way to determine if a teacher has attained realization (a point on which I think you'd agree), probably the safest bet is to



find out if their teacher thinks so or not.

Malcolm wrote:

It's exactly the same. Who says their teacher is realized?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 11:34 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

I think if you reflect upon the matter, you will find that this is clearly the case, and that any mention of the four conditions for birth is a clear selection of specific aspects of the 48 conditions relevant to us.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, but that condition is not possible without all the rest, they are all integral to one another, just as it is integral to all of them. Since Dharmakara has done his job, presumably, without our participation the other 47 conditions fail. The crucial point of course is that it's our faith, through hearing Amitabha's name, upon which Dharmakara depends for the success of his aspiration. Without us, he has no buddhafiield.

Zhen Li said:

Yes. This is why there are confirmation passages in the second half of the sūtra, confirming that indeed he is now a Buddha—therefore the praṇidhāna works and is true in all its aspects and not just in one.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means his aspiration depends on the power of our desire to take birth in Sukhavati.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 11:38 PM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Schrödinger's Yidam said:

I got that information from an Alan Wallace video. Unfortunately I did not bookmark it. You'll have to take my word on it—or not.

treehuggingoctopus said:

Oh, I can easily believe you got it from Alan Wallace -- the guy reputed to have made

some rather extraordinary claims in a similar vein  
( <https://www.dharmawheel.net/viewtopic.php?f=40&t=20699&hilit=dhyana+wallace> ).  
It must have been a performative rather than descriptive statement -- one about what Alan Wallace would like things to be rather than about what they were (or are).

Tata1 said:

Allan wallace says that both approaches existed in tibet.

Malcolm wrote:

In fact, the way it actually is, is like this, according what I heard from HH Taklung Tsetrul, You go and get wang, lung, and tri. Since many of these Dzogchen cycles are too large to explain, point by point, you get the essential instructions you need for practice. You read the rest on your own for which you have received the lung. If you have questions, you go back and ask. Wallace is not completely wrong, but he has left out an essential part of the process. It all begins with empowerment, lung, and tri, and all Dzogchen empowerments contain direct introduction.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 8th, 2022 at 11:45 PM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Yes. This is why there are confirmation passages in the second half of the sūtra, confirming that indeed he is now a Buddha—therefore the praṇidhāna works and is true in all its aspects and not just in one.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means his aspiration depends on the power of our desire to take birth in Sukhavati.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Maybe the aspiration is given by Amitabha in the first place

Malcolm wrote:

No. That is not possible. If it were possible, then there would be no sentient being who had heard Amitabha's name and ignored it. Why? Because presumably Amitabha's compassion would not permit it. But buddhas are not omnipotent. They do not have the power to change the karma of sentient beings by fiat, nor to plant thoughts in their minds. If they did, the consequence would be that since there is still suffering, buddhas would be incomparably cruel for not motivating all sentient beings to attain buddhahood by taking birth in Sukhavati. The inspiration for taking birth in Sukhavati necessarily depends on a sentient being's own karma and aspirations (smon lam).

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 12:43 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

The Aspiration to go to the Pure Land is part of the 18th Vow which is Other Power

Malcolm wrote:

I understand how these distinctions are made in JSS, and I am not arguing with them about their understanding.

However, it is not germane to the Tibetan Buddhist tradition. If we want to understand this from the Tibetan Buddhist point of view, we have to exclude imputing Jodo Shinshu, etc. interpretations, otherwise, we will not understand what Tibetan commentaries actually intend—and this is the main fault of the Halkias book and Cook paper.

The Tibetan version of the Sutra requires that sentient beings first must have generated Mahāyāna bodhicitta. Those who have not generated bodhicitta are necessarily excluded. Actually, conditions 18 and 19 are barely distinguishable, to the point where 19 is basically an elaboration of 18. For this reason, we see Tibetans selecting condition 19, with its four conditions as the critical point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 1:10 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

Ok fine from a Vajrayana point of view it's different

Malcolm wrote:

It isn't even a Vajrayāna perspective, it's based strictly on sūtra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Yes, condition 19 is only for those who are unable to let go of self power effort.

Malcolm wrote:

That is just not how it is seen in the Tibetan tradition. At no point in any Tibetan commentary is such an indication made. My point is that this distinction that strictly differentiates one's personal effort and Amitabha's aspiration is not made in Tibetan Buddhism, in fact, it is the opposite; they are mutual, without personal effort through generating bodhicitta and so on, Amitabha's aspiration is not effective for that person. It's quite clear in the text of the sūtra as we read it. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 3:09 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

Yes, condition 19 is only for those who are unable to let go of self power effort.

Malcolm wrote:

That is just not how it is seen in the Tibetan tradition. At no point in any Tibetan commentary is such an indication made. My point is that this distinction that strictly differentiates one's personal effort and Amitabha's aspiration is not made in Tibetan Buddhism, in fact, it is the opposite; they are mutual, without personal effort through generating bodhicitta and so on, Amitabha's aspiration is not effective for that person. It's quite clear in the text of the sūtra as we read it. YMMV.

Shinjin said:

I don't think anyone recites Amitabha without the desire for buddhahood. Generating bodhicitta isn't some sort of separate activity.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people just want salvation, without understanding no buddha can offer this, not even Amitabha.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 4:20 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

I don't think anyone recites Amitabha without the desire for buddhahood. Generating bodhicitta isn't some sort of separate activity.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people just want salvation, without understanding no buddha can offer this, not even Amitabha.

Shinjin said:

The special feature of Sukhavati is that even ordinary worldly beings can be born there in contrast to other buddhafi elds. Nobody is excluded.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there are some beings who are excluded, those who have committed the five heinous deeds, etc.; if you have not generated bodhicitta, etc. This is how it is understood in Tibetan Buddhism. YMMV.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 4:25 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Shinjin said:

I don't think anyone recites Amitabha without the desire for buddhahood. Generating bodhicitta isn't some sort of separate activity.

Malcolm wrote:

Some people just want salvation, without understanding no buddha can offer this, not even Amitabha.

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

In Jodo Shinshu it is profound trust in the working of the original vow the name becomes other power in this case no further understanding is required it's a very unique teaching

With great respect to you Malcolm

Malcolm wrote:

You are completely missing my point. From the point of view of Tibetan Buddhism, no Buddha can offer you liberation. All they can do is show you a path, that includes Amitabha.

And, as I said, there is a defacto mutuality between one's desire to be born in Sukhavati and Amitabha's aspiration. But it really seems people are not interested in

understanding Tibetan pure land practices on their own terms here. So this is will be my final contribution to the thread.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 4:51 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Konchog Thogme Jampa said:

You shouldn't get angry if people have a different point of view in this case

Malcolm wrote:

I am not angry. But at this point I am beginning repeat myself. My final word:

There is no "other power" or "self power" in Tibetan Pure land practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: In TB, is there a specific Pure Land we aim for (Sukhavati?) or you can aim for whatever you want?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

So this is will be my final contribution to the thread.

Virgo said:

Malcolm, before you go does this one need transmission or can it be done without lung?

<https://www.lotsawahouse.org/tibetan-masters/jamyang-khyentse-chokyi-lodro/brief-amitabha-sleeping-meditation>

Malcolm wrote:

It can be done without a lung.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 5:17 AM

Title: Re: How to use dharani?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Like this one: <https://read.84000.co/translation/toh750.html>

Let me guess...need empowerment, lung, transmission, etc?

Malcolm wrote:

Some, most do not.

Nalanda said:

Are there dharanis for generating wealth for a practitioner to help with personal financial stability?

Malcolm wrote:

Tara practice.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Who were the previous Buddhas before Shakyamuni (who lived in this world) according to our tradition?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Who were the previous Buddhas before Shakyamuni (who lived in this world) according to our tradition?

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on the tradition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 6:52 AM

Title: Re: Persons whose hands have been cut off

Content:

Subcontrary said:

I have felt pretty uneasy about this section, as the decree does not seem compassionate at all. I don't see what purpose there is in excluding people with disabilities from the sangha...

Malcolm wrote:

It is meant to prevent people from joining the monastic Sangha out of a need for social services, which is the proper responsibility of their families or the state, that is all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 7:32 PM

Title: Re: Persons whose hands have been cut off

Content:

Unknown said:

but blind people aren't, although they would be heavily dependent on others.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, actually they are forbidden to,ordain if they are already blind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Queequeg said:

Yeah. Well.

Kim O'Hara said:

So far, <https://www.vox.com/2020/11/30/21726563/kim-stanley-robinson-the-ezra-klein-show-climate-change-looks-best>.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Ummmm....KSR's portrait depends heavily on actual terrorism. Just saying....

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Ummmm....KSR's portrait depends heavily on actual terrorism. Just saying....

Queequeg said:

Some people need their teeth kicked in. Without malice, of course. Just saying...

Malcolm wrote:

Pretty hard to explain that to the relatives of people whose planes have been downed by drone attacks...just saying...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 11:20 PM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Queequeg said:

Seriously, though, as I said, that book is like watching a trick shot. Motherf\*ckers aint doin shit. Humans didn't survive as a species by being bold and brave. We survived by being cowardly and opportunistic.

Malcolm wrote:



Nope. I just question Kim's assertion that it is a remotely workable blueprint.

Now, just let me get back to my greenwashed life.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Formless shamatha + shamatha w/o object

Content:

Damchö\_Dorje said:

First, are formless shamatha and shamatha without an object the same practice?

What is the relationship of this kind of shamatha to nonmeditation?

Malcolm wrote:

You need to indicate where you are taking this terminology from.

Damchö\_Dorje said:

On this forum, I have usually seen the term nonmeditation in connection with Mahamudra just combing through old posts. Formless shamatha I have hardly come across at all, but it's a term I've seen used on this forum as well.

Malcolm wrote:

There is object-oriented śamatha, when one uses an outer object. Objectless śamatha is when you focus on a mental image, sometimes called a "nimitta." "Formless" śamatha is a western term that as far as I know has no Tibetan correlate.

Nonmeditation means that one has reached a stage of practice where there is no distinction between equipoise and post-equipoise, buddhahood, basically.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 1:03 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Nemo said:

I suggest talking to them directly.

Queequeg said:

I have, and do.

Malcolm wrote:

No point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 5:11 AM

Title: Single Stage:Ekabhumi

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I read in Dzogchen there are four Vidyādhara levels that correspond to the 1st, 5th, 8th, and 10th bhūmi respectively. (Source Alan Wallace.)

Malcolm wrote:

Alan Wallace might make that assertion, but I prefer to follow Garb Dorje comments on this passage from The Great Space of Vajrasattva:

The path of higher and higher purification  
is not consistent with the Dharma that is free of activity.

Merit and wisdom are accumulated with thoughts that arise from the worldly. Objectives of traversing somewhere—gradual progress, the stages of bodhi, the abodes of Brahma and Indra, the universal emperor, and so on—are the path of affliction, and are bondage. Free from all activity, totally peaceful like space, bliss that is totally uniform and beyond limits, the natural great perfection cannot be thought, practiced, nor mediated. It does not depend on another by nature. For example, like the great king of wishfulfilling gems, it has the power to grant all treasures, whether Dharma or not Dharma.

If there were traversing a path,  
nothing would attained, like the boundary of space.

Also, the meaning commentary on the Cuckoo of Vidyā in the Bairo 'Gyud 'bum addresses the part of the title "single stage"

Since the suffering of effort is pacified because there is no progression in stages, there is the refreshment of great final solace without depending on arriving [somewhere].

As such, Dzogchen should be understood as an ekabhumi teaching.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 5:42 AM

Title: Re: Single Stage:Ekabhumi

Content:

Archie2009 said:

The descriptions seem to correspond to the four visions of thögal?

Malcolm wrote:

Not even slightly. If you are going to go by that description of paths and stages, then the maturational vidyādhara level is only realized at the third, and the other three between it and the fourth.

Thinking in terms of paths and stages with respect to Dzogchen teachings is a great

deviation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 6:09 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

After I attend the "Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras"

What books would I be able to read? (if any)

Malcolm wrote:

Better you work with a teacher even after you have the lung, You still need at minimum Dzogchen empowerments and instructions. You cannot understand Dzogchen from books. You need instruction, step by step.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 7:08 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:

Queequeg said:

Seriously, though, as I said, that book is like watching a trick shot. Motherf\*ckers aint doin shit. Humans didn't survive as a species by being bold and brave. We survived by being cowardly and opportunistic.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. I just question Kim's assertion that it is a remotely workable blueprint.

Kim O'Hara said:

First you complained about the terrorists. Like others here, I dislike the idea of eco-terrorism but concede that it may happen and may improve our chances of survival.

Malcolm wrote:

It will happen, but it much more likely to be eco-fascist terrorism against indigenous people, which is the current state of affairs, ala Edward Abbey's "shut down the border 'cause brown people are ruining my view." That won't assist anything.

Kim O'Hara said:

Then you "question" the whole thing,

Malcolm wrote:

The banking system plot is high fantasy of the first order.

Kim O'Hara said:

Can you be more constructive, e.g. suggesting improvements to it, or an alternative to it?

Malcolm wrote:

For the next ten generations, nine out of ten women pledge to have no children and voluntarily sterilize themselves. 1 out of ten are restricted to one child. That ought to do it, or something like that.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 7:15 AM

Title: Re: Building my Dzogchen literature library, please make a suggestion

Content:

Nalanda said:

Okay, thanks. After this 17 dzogchen tantras program, what happens next? I just go and listen / watch? Is there some kind of directions on what happens next?

Malcolm wrote:

You have the satisfaction of knowing you have received the reading transmission of the 17 tantras. This itself is very certain to cement your connection with Dzogchen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 9:16 AM

Title: Re: Single Stage:Ekabhumi

Content:

Sādhaka said:

How does this line up with Yongdzin Rinpoche (and someone also mentioned on this forum that Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche agrees with the Yongdzin on this point) talking about making sure that Dzogchen is not conflated with the Dzogchenpa?

Malcolm wrote:

It lines up perfectly. If someone thinks they are progressing from somewhere to somewhere, they deviate.

In any case, the point is that there is only one stage in Dzogchen. The practitioner of Dzogchen's job is to realize this. Dzogchen is neither a gradual path nor a sudden path, since even "sudden" implies going from here to there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Reversing Global Warming - Science and Politics (split from: Reversing Global Warming -Prayers and Aspirations")

Content:  
Kim O'Hara said:  
the economy (

Malcolm wrote:  
Is the problem. And as far as I can tell, no one is really interested in actual change.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 10:12 AM  
Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)  
Content:  
Shinjin said:  
Nenbutsu is the easiest and most direct path especially in the current age.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not so. For example, the Buddha in the Cakrasamvara tantra asserts that the practice of Heruka is the only means by which one can attain buddhahood in this degenerate age, and so on.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 5:33 PM  
Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)  
Content:  
Shinjin said:  
Nenbutsu is the easiest and most direct path especially in the current age.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not so. For example, the Buddha in the Cakrasamvara tantra asserts that the practice of Heruka is the only means by which one can attain buddhahood in this degenerate age, and so on.

Shinjin said:  
Don't know. Even if it is not everyone has the luxury of finding a qualified guru and practicing with them. Nenbutsu on the other hand is accessible to all.

Malcolm wrote:  
It very much depends on how quickly one is motivated to attain Buddhahood, from the point of view of the cause and result vehicles. It still requires three incalculable eons to attain buddhahood, even if one should take birth in Sukhavati, according to the causal vehicles.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 10:40 PM  
Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Shinjin said:

Don't know. Even if it is not everyone has the luxury of finding a qualified guru and practicing with them. Nenbutsu on the other hand is accessible to all.

Malcolm wrote:

It very much depends on how quickly one is motivated to attain Buddhahood, from the point of view of the cause and result vehicles. It still requires three incalculable eons to attain buddhahood, even if one should take birth in Sukhavati, according to the causal vehicles.

Shinjin said:

It depends in what grade one is born into. High grade birth is instant buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it isn't. And this is the problem: everyone claims their own path is the best, fastest, etc. but it's not a race, and everyone has to work out their own path to their own satisfaction. But the one thing necessary in all is a teacher, a spiritual friend.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 10:52 PM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Dan74 said:

QQ, listening, like Nemo does, is good. Empathetic listening even better.

Malcolm wrote:

As an American living in America, I have in this era found it is better not to discuss politics with strangers. It makes moving through our country easier. When meeting trumpsters I smile, look for nearest exit, and leave them to their imaginations, but I don't engage them in conversation, because there is no point. They are a political cult.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Is kensho stream entry?

Content:

clay said:

I don't recall reading any Zen text that compared or equated kensho and stream entry

Astus said:

Stream entry is on the shravaka path, hence it is something to be avoided by Mahayana followers.

Malcolm wrote:

Mahāyāna also has stream entry. It's called the path of seeing. Mahāyāna has once-returners, 7th stage bodhisattvas, never-returners, eighth on up, and arhats, aka samyaksambuddhas.

Astus said:

Definitions for stream-entry are fairly standard. Here's a modern summary of the active and the abandoned qualities.

Malcolm wrote:

Which are the same fetters abandoned on the Mahayana path of seeing. The main difference is time to arhatship (full buddhahood in this case) and the kind of emptiness realized.

And yes, I recognize paths and stages are somewhat irrelevant in Zen.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Shinjin said:

It depends in what grade one is born into. High grade birth is instant buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it isn't.

PadmaVonSamba said:

What is "High grade birth"?

Malcolm wrote:

He is referring to the nine grades of birth in in Sukhavati described in the Chinese canon's contemplation sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 10th, 2022 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Shinjin said:

It depends in what grade one is born into. High grade birth is instant buddhahood.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it isn't. And this is the problem: everyone claims their own path is the best, fastest, etc. but it's not a race, and everyone has to work out their own path to their own

satisfaction. But the one thing necessary in all is a teacher, a spiritual friend.

Shinjin said:

Yes, let's not repeat the same discussion we had over at the other thread. Everyone determines a path according to their own karmic dispositions. Mine happens to be JSS but I always like to keep an open mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, and even if the Buddha were sitting in front of us telling us in a group what the most effective teaching was, we would all hear something completely different.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 12:08 AM

Title: Re: Single Stage:Ekabhumi

Content:

Sādhaka said:

How does this line up with Yongdzin Rinpoche (and someone also mentioned on this forum that Namkhai Norbu Rinpoche agrees with the Yongdzin on this point) talking about making sure that Dzogchen is not conflated with the Dzogchenpa?

Malcolm wrote:

It lines up perfectly. If someone thinks they are progressing from somewhere to somewhere, they deviate.

In any case, the point is that there is only one stage in Dzogchen. The practitioner of Dzogchen's job is to realize this. Dzogchen is neither a gradual path nor a sudden path, since even "sudden" implies going from here to there.

Giovanni said:

This is the pure stream. But sometimes we draw back.

Malcolm wrote:

This is why we spend so much time learning about the meaning of the basis, aka primordial state and then how delusion occurs. The Dzogchen point of view is that without understanding the process of delusion, one cannot be free of it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Is kensho stream entry?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Mahāyāna also has stream entry. It's called the path of seeing. Mahāyāna has once-returners, 7th stage bodhisattvas, never-returners, eighth on up, and arhats, aka samyaksambuddhas.



Astus said:

Do you know if anyone actually called them so? I have not found such a definition for stream entry (入流, 預流, 須陀洹) in the <https://www2.buddhistdoor.net/dictionary/>.

Which are the same fetters abandoned on the Mahayana path of seeing.

But, as you noted in another thread, a first stage bodhisattva can still break even basic precepts, unlike a stream enterer.

Malcolm wrote:

A first stage bodhisattva cannot actually break even basic precepts. They can appear to break basic precepts, but they will only do so if indeed there is reason to benefit another sentient being. One late, famous master of recent vintage used this doctrine to explain his sexual relationships with his women students while maintaining he was nevertheless still fully ordained.

Also, Introduction to the Middle Way (Shambhala), ch. 1, verse 6, line 2 (pg. 60):

Three fetters they have utterly forsworn.

Compare with Abhidharmakośabhaṣya 5:41cd-45

The four kinds of āryas are defined on the basis of the fetters they have dropped. To say one is stream entrant in a Mahāyāna context is to claim to be a first stage bodhisattva.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Formless shamatha + shamatha w/o object

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Nonmeditation means that one has reached a stage of practice where there is no distinction between equipoise and post-equipoise, buddhahood, basically.

Damchö\_Dorje said:

Hi again. So with the four yogas in Mahamudra, is the last understood to be what you're discussing here (the result, buddhahood)? If so, that's very intriguing: I hadn't realized that those yogas were understood as progressive stages and considered attainments.

Malcolm wrote:

In Mahāmudra, yes, they are progressive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 3:01 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Nalanda said:

Is this the one?

[http://tibetanbuddhistencyclopedia.com/en/index.php?title=Seventeen\\_tantras](http://tibetanbuddhistencyclopedia.com/en/index.php?title=Seventeen_tantras)

And it will take 3 days long, full days to listen/hear this read from start to finish?

Malcolm wrote:

Four days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 3:12 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Nalanda said:

I know these are in the tantric texts but have you come across from the academic perspective how these ideas come about and developed over time?

Malcolm wrote:

You should subscribe to Academia.edu. There are thousands of Buddhist papers that will answer all your questions, and create thousands more.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Single Stage:Ekabhumi

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A commentary on the Soaring Garuda, one of the five lungs brought to Tibet by Vairocana:

In order to demonstrate the deviations of the stages:

Even relying on the tenth bhumi is an obstruction to awakening.

Seeking that relies on the path method of the tenth bhumi of the causal bodhisattvas and the wish to attain by relying on the tenth stage of outer, inner and secret secret mantra are unable to see the place that is free from being traversed.

The extremely rapid wisdom is free from all thoughts.

That being the case, because the self-originated wisdom, the basis of everything, is free from gradual progression, it is more rapid because of emphasizing nonprogression through mere seeing. Since that is free from all goal-oriented apprehension of objects and apprehending subjects, it is very special because there is no obscuration to purify.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 3:55 AM  
Title: Re: Single Stage:Ekabhumi  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
duplicate

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 4:00 AM  
Title: Re: Do I need transmission, empowerment, lung, requirements, etc to read Tantric texts?  
Content:  
Nalanda said:  
Are all tantric texts not to be read without the necessary requirements/pre-requisites?

How about specifically these:

Abhisambodhi Tantra  
Sarvatathāgatatattvasamgraha Tantra  
Mahāvairocana-abhisambodhi-tantra  
Kunjed Gyalpo Tantra

Malcolm wrote:  
You need to have empowerment for all. There are no exceptions.

You need to understand this point: all tantric teachings are connected with transmission. Without transmission it is like trying to use an appliance without electricity. If you have received an anuttarayoga tantra empowerment, you are then permitted to read tantras. But even then, you should only do so under the guidance of a teacher. This is the tradition. Of course, no one can see what you do in your house. But this is the proper way.

To read Dzogchen texts you need Dzogchen empowerments. General anuttara empowerments like Hevajra, etc., are not sufficient because the path is different.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 5:07 AM  
Title: Re: Is kensho stream entry?  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:

The four kinds of āryas are defined on the basis of the fetters they have dropped. To say one is stream entrant in a Mahāyāna context is to claim to be a first stage bodhisattva.

Astus said:  
In light of the fetters here's a classic story:

"there was a fourteen year old novice called Daoxin (Faith in the Way) who came to pay his respects to the Third Patriarch, saying, 'Would that the Venerable Monk's compassion allow me to beg for the Dharma gate of Liberation.'

The master replied, 'Who binds you?'

'No one,' responded Daoxin.

'Why seek liberation then?' asked Sengcan.

On hearing this [Dao] Xin had a great awakening."

(Records of the Transmission of the Lamp, vol 1, 3.40)

Malcolm wrote:

Good story.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 6:43 AM

Title: Re: What exactly is it that leads to Enlightenment? (arhat and buddhahood)

Content:

Nalanda said:

Now, let's suppose we have all these teachings/tools on a table. Tantra, Vipassana, Dzogchen, Meditation, Bodhicitta, Compassion, Devotion. Now let's say they are all effective and can lead someone to enlightenment.

Malcolm wrote:

There is no such thing as "enlightenment."

There is bodhi.

What is bodhi? Realizing there is no self in persons and no identity in phenomena. This results in freedom from clinging and burns afflictions.

What is buddhahood? Omniscience about everything that has to do with realizing bodhi.

That's it. There are many different approaches to this elephant. Most of our discussions are well represented by the six blind men who each insist only they have the right part of the animal.

Drenched with the trunk,  
pissed and shit upon near the tail,  
crushed by the side,  
stepped on with the foot,  
brushed off with the ear,  
impaled on the tusk—  
the six blind men  
can't ride the elephant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 6:50 AM

Title: Re: Persons whose hands have been cut off

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Again, Vinaya is not where you learn the Dharma—it's a historical and anthropological fossil. This may sound harsh but, if you are not a monk or academic you are wasting your time reading it, and even monks these days don't read or know it.

Malcolm wrote:

There is much agamic material in the Vinaya Vastu. It needs to be read and studied, and screw what some old monk thought about making it hands off for lay people.

For example, the Bhaisajya vastu is pretty interesting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Queequeg said:

Hopefully nothing.

Malcolm wrote:

Don't bet on it. New variant, more lockdowns by July. Maybe not as widespread.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 11th, 2022 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Was the monastic tradition/lineage established in Japanese Buddhism??

Content:

Zhen Li said:

the Age of Dharma Decline

Malcolm wrote:

One of the things I've recently come to appreciate is Dogen's resistance to mappo ideology.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 12th, 2022 at 2:45 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It kind of blows me away that this is a radical notion in some quarters ...humans have lived with more severe diseases than this throughout most of our history, and usually some sense of “normality”, however fleeting; is one of the things that got them through it.

Malcolm wrote:

In the past, there was less health care overall, so there was less of a healthcare system to disrupt, and hence less cost, since we just let people die in those days.

Our economies are more delicate, intricate, and more easily disrupted.

That said, millions more would have died from this, but for vaccines, masking, and so on.

Johnny Dangerous said:

but we need to develop a better sense of social resilience.

Malcolm wrote:

That will only happen with a global public health system that works. We can expect more of these kinds of issues. Remember, this is SARS 2. If you think there won't be a SARS 3, well...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 12th, 2022 at 3:19 AM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It kind of blows me away that this is a radical notion in some quarters ...humans have lived with more severe diseases than this throughout most of our history, and usually some sense of “normality”, however fleeting; is one of the things that got them through it.

Malcolm wrote:

In the past, there was less health care overall, so there was less of a healthcare system to disrupt, and hence less cost, since we just let people die in those days.

Our economies are more delicate, intricate, and more easily disrupted.

That said, millions more would have died from this, but for vaccines, masking, and so on.

Johnny Dangerous said:

but we need to develop a better sense of social resilience.

Malcolm wrote:

That will only happen with a global public health system that works. We can expect more of these kinds of issues. Remember, this is SARS 2. If you think there won't be a SARS 3, well...

Johnny Dangerous said:

Again, coronaviruses (most viruses I think) don't typically evolve into deadly superbugs. Anything is possible of course, and yes there will always be new variants, other viruses, etc. That actually speaks to my point of not living in permanent emergency mode, rather than against it.

As to the delicate economic structures, same thing. While we could argue masks, distancing and -especially- vaccination (vaccine have been way more effective than the other two, IMO) have been protective of the economy, lockdowns, restriction on movement, etc. have not.

Malcolm wrote:

When this bug hit, people were literally dropping dead in the streets in China. Then there was years of political sabotage from the right (which is still going on).

Johnny Dangerous said:

About 50% of Covid policy has been theatre

Malcolm wrote:

Most of the theater has been right wing theater, IMO.

Johnny Dangerous said:

In the future, given the collateral damage, civil unrest, and economic damage they caused or contributed to, I do not see most democratic governments being as quick with lockdowns and restrictions, that's a good thing as far as I'm concerned.

Malcolm wrote:

That's what happens when a man like Trump is let near an executive office.

Our health care system is still being stressed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 12th, 2022 at 6:24 AM

Title: Re: Averting Astrological Obstacles (Sok, Wang, Lungta, etc)

Content:

reiun said:

Just to clarify: Tibetan Buddhists believe that Tibetan Astrology is predictive of actual karma?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

It is basically a older version of five element calculation that comes from China. Rather than being based on the Indian elements of earth, water, fire, air, and space, it is based on the five phases of the Chinese system: wood, fire, earth, metal, and water, and the mother/son/enemy/friend relationship between these five. These five are mapped over the cycle of twelve years, beginning with the rat year and entering with the ox year, making for a sixty year cycle. Also the months, days, and hours are similarly divided. It also includes the magic square of saturn (mewa), and the eight trigrams, called parkha in Tibetan in its calculations.

It is used as a kind of almanac, a general way of knowing what are good days and bad, and so on, whether a year has a positive outlook for one or negative, and if negative, what kind of rites one needs to use to repel them. It has a broad use in Tibetan culture.

Myth has it that it was taught by Manjushri to Confucius, and it was then brought to Tibet. Like the I ching trigams and hexagrams, a tortoise figures largely in its origins. The various legends it has about the origins of the trigrams, etc., and the cosmic tortoise itself are very entertaining.

But no one believes it trumps karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 12th, 2022 at 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Averting Astrological Obstacles (Sok, Wang, Lungta, etc)

Content:

rejun said:

Then Tibetan Astrology is predictive of potential karma only?

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's predicative of the how the elements change in the seasons, since everything is subject to impermanence and change in the elements. One can do these calculations for buildings,etc as well.

But karma always trumps calculation,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 12th, 2022 at 10:54 PM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Queequeg said:

No, D. This is a question for YOU. Where do YOU draw the line?



Malcolm wrote:

Dan has no stake in the game. He is in Switzerland. He is just a passive observer of this mess.

Soon, of course, there will another mess to contend with: Putin invading Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 1:21 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Svalaksana said:

That won't happen for sure. Putin may be a power-hungry authoritarian with an expansionist mindset, but he's not stupid nor reckless.

Malcolm wrote:

We shall see. He wants clear passage over the overland route to the Russian Navel base in Crimea, either through taking over the contested Donbas region, where he has been sponsoring a proxy war since 2014, or through forcing Ukraine to accept the terms of MINSK II, or something like it. Failing this power move, he either backs down, which I think is very unlikely, or he goes in, which is more likely.

Naturally, everyone will think its Biden's fault.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 1:35 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shinjin said:

It will defininitely be his fault since he has the power to stop it.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no he does not, unless you think it is a good idea for Europe to capitulate to Putin. Do you? Biden has pulled NATO back together. I personally think this is a good thing. I don't like fascists and Putin is a fascist. Democracies have to stand up to fascist bullies.

Shinjin said:

Military wise a very weak president. Look how he handled the withdrawal from Afghanistan.

Malcolm wrote:

Afghanistan wasn't Biden's fault, and everyone who understands the history of the conflict and the extent to which Trump critically weakened US forces there in 2020 knows it. You recall that the Afghanistan Gvt. was left out of the negotiations with the

Trump administration?

For those with short memories:

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/9/30/us-generals-say-afghanistan-collapse-rooted-in-trump-taliban-deal>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 2:39 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Ayu said:

Okay, I'm sorry. The US stubbornness and ignorance about healthcare makes me quite angry. I think, I don't want to discuss it further, because I can't solve that problem anyway.

Malcolm wrote:

As we used to say in the Nixon days:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 3:45 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Dan74 said:

Matt, you drew me into this exchange.

Malcolm wrote:

Take some responsibility for your own actions, man. No one drew you into anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Dan74 said:

Matt, you drew me into this exchange.

Malcolm wrote:

Take some responsibility for your own actions, man. No one drew you into anything.

Dan74 said:

Yep, you're right and that will mean not participating in any more political threads.

Malcolm wrote:  
Politics, by its very nature, is an exercise in misery.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 7:02 PM  
Title: Re: 84000: The Sūtra on Transmigration Through Existences (Bhava-saṅkrānti-sūtra) & Some Questions  
Content:  
Aemilius said:  
"All words are true, because all words are false", says Mañjushri in Edward Conze's Buddhist Texts Through the Ages. I think you know the meaning.

identity  
noun

The condition of being a certain person or thing. The set of characteristics by which a person or thing is definitively recognizable or known. The awareness that an individual or group has of being a distinct, persisting entity.

The American Heritage® Dictionary of the English Language, 5th Edition

Malcolm wrote:  
All identity is imputed. Things don't possess identity.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 13th, 2022 at 11:07 PM  
Title: Re: 84000: The Sūtra on Transmigration Through Existences (Bhava-saṅkrānti-sūtra) & Some Questions  
Content:  
Leo Rivers said:  
I have been both impressed and humbled by the level of this conversation.

But then I wonder if we don't need to step back.

Recall the distinction of "true aspectarian" and "false aspectarian".

If we review the statements of Buddhist thinkers over the centuries between the Pali texts and first Tibetan translations isn't it risking anachronism to treat all those diverse and changing landscapes of language as if the same words meant the same thing?

The way the word "identity" has been discussed here demonstrates this.

Anyway, Beer and hot wings to everybody! Have a happy Valentine's day.

Malcolm wrote:

Even true aspectsarian yogacarins don't believe that phenomena have integral identities...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's just a segment of the petite bourgeoisie trying to usher in another Fascist moment in history, just as they did in Italy, Germany, and Vichy France, etc. They did not succeed with Trump, but they are still mad.

Queequeg said:

As a final follow up - Dan, I hear what you are saying. I'm afraid the people who are planting their feet and refusing to vaccinate or take any steps to mitigate spread of COVID are too far gone to have a discussion with. Its an ideological stance at this point associated with the reactionary right. This crowd, at least here in the US and apparently in Canada also, is not interested in working these issues out together. They have demonstrated in words and deeds for long enough that there is no good will desire to work out some consensus. They are, as you can see, opting for intimidation and coercion - whether its storming the Capitol Building to disrupt the proceedings of our Congress or choking strategic border crossings, or shouting down local school board members and threatening the safety for doing the jobs they were democratically elected to do.

As you have demonstrated yourself, you yourself are not capable of carrying your empathetic listening to its end.

Sure, it would be great if these people had not taken a turn down a world view that brought them to this place adorned with lies, falsehoods and denial of science. That ship sailed for most of these people years ago. Instead, they've been filling their heads with toxic conservative media for years. I'm not sure you really understand this.

Listening empathetically is a nice platitude that I agree with in principle. In reality, there is no point. These are grown men who if they are sincere in wanting to help us all should find their place at the table and accept that for our democracies to work, there needs to be a commitment to the underlying principle of democratic norms. They're not there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 12:59 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Queequeg said:

I think that about sums up the situation across the West with the reactionary right finding a kindred spirit in Putin and the rest of us still thinking we're all playing by the same civil rules.

I think in the US, we still have a ways to go, but, things are not augering well.

Malcolm wrote:

The thing is, the kindred spirit of the right in western countries in the 1930s was Mussolini, then Hitler.

Everyone thought we were playing by the same rules then too.

Biden understands that this is not the case, and this is why he has tied NATO tightly together to oppose Putin, and rightfully so.

In the 1930's it was the Axis powers. Now it is Russia, China, and Iran. The more things change, the more they stay the same.

If this were Trump and Putin, this is now the conversation would:

Putin: We get Ukraine, you get Florida.

Trump: Sounds like a great deal, my people will love it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Queequeg said:

. Is it coincidence that the sabres are rattling again as the living memories of WWII have largely blinked out?

Malcolm wrote:

The sabres are rattling because people forgot the 1930's, the lead up to WWII.

Remember, this is just the followup to Crimea (, equivalent to the militarization of the Rhineland, 1936), now we are at the equivalent of 1938, the Sudetenland Crisis. The German gvt. is behaving like Chamberlain.

If NATO backs down, there will be more Russian incursions into the former Soviet sphere of influence. As it stands, there is also Transnistria in Moldavia, on Ukraine's southwestern border, where Russian troops are stationed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 5:58 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

CNN is falling on hard times at the moment as well, they have lost a majority of their viewership.

Malcolm wrote:

Let's see:

On the positive side for CNN, there was some month-to-month viewership growth. CNN grew +4% in total primetime viewers—and +9% in the primetime demo from what was a particularly rough Dec. 2021. In total day, however, CNN did fall -1% in total viewers and held steady among adults 25-54.

<https://www.adweek.com/tvnewser/jan-22-ratings-cnn-is-among-cables-top-10-networks-but-struggles-at-9-pm-and-sees-year-over-year-declines/499572/>

You might want to fact check your statements.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 6:35 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

CNN is falling on hard times at the moment as well, they have lost a majority of their viewership.

Malcolm wrote:

Let's see:

On the positive side for CNN, there was some month-to-month viewership growth. CNN grew +4% in total primetime viewers—and +9% in the primetime demo from what was a particularly rough Dec. 2021. In total day, however, CNN did fall -1% in total viewers and held steady among adults 25-54.

<https://www.adweek.com/tvnewser/jan-22-ratings-cnn-is-among-cables-top-10-networks-but-struggles-at-9-pm-and-sees-year-over-year-declines/499572/>

You might want to fact check your statements.

Jesse said:

The information you are posting are percentages.

Malcolm wrote:

And you are just talking about 9 PM.

Jesse said:

However, CNN is struggling in the key weekday 9 p.m. hour (posting its lowest delivery since July 2015) and has been delivering Nielsen ratings not seen since before Trump took office. CNN posted especially poor ratings relative to Jan. 2021. The network shed -

77% in total primetime viewers, -82% in adults 25-54 during primetime, -74% in total day viewers and -81% in adults 25-54 across total day vs. what the network averaged in those measurements in Jan. 2021.

Malcolm wrote:

But this is all to be expected. Less people are watching news because there is less news to watch, thank goodness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 11:23 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

They are not, and the moment this alliance is no longer in the interest of democrats, everyone further left than democrat will be facing the exact same de-platforming, and censorship that conservatives currently are.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. Truly complete and utter nonsense.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 14th, 2022 at 8:11 PM

Title: Re: 84000: The Sūtra on Transmigration Through Existences (Bhava-saṅkrānti-sūtra) & Some Questions

Content:

Aemilius said:

"All words are true, because all words are false", says Mañjushri in Edward Conze's Buddhist Texts Through the Ages. I think you know the meaning.

identity

noun

The condition of being a certain person or thing. The set of characteristics by which a person or thing is definitively recognizable or known. The awareness that an individual or group has of being a distinct, persisting entity.

The American Heritage® Dictionary of the English Language, 5th Edition

Malcolm wrote:

All identity is imputed. Things don't possess identity.

Aemilius said:

Experientially speaking, alcohol has the identity of being alcohol and water has the identity of being water.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not from their own side.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 3:54 AM  
Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada  
Content:

Nemo said:  
Every thing he says is a lie.

Malcolm wrote:  
Well, of course. It's Tucker Carlson.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 5:54 AM  
Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
<https://www.reuters.com/world/americas/canada-police-response-protests-spotlight-after-key-bridge-us-cleared-2022-02-14/>

Unknown said:  
OTTAWA, Feb 14 (Reuters) - Canadian Prime Minister Justin Trudeau plans to activate emergency powers in an effort to end protests that have shut some border crossings and paralyzed downtown Ottawa, sources said on Monday.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 10:59 AM  
Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?  
Content:  
Nalanda said:

I know these are in the tantric texts but have you come across from the academic perspective how these ideas come about and developed over time?

Javierfv1212 said:  
I would look into scholarship which talks about texts like the Tattvasaṃgraha and Mahāvairocana Tantras, these are considered by modern scholars some of the earliest full fledged Buddhist tantras.

Zhen Li said:  
I think Ādibuddha might be a Kālacakra development, but I am not sure. I don't recall it



being mentioned in those texts...

Malcolm wrote:

The term is probably first found in the Namasamgiti.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 12:15 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Unknown said:

In May 1889, people living in Bukhara, a city that was then part of the Russian Empire, began sickening and dying. The respiratory virus that killed them became known as the Russian flu. It swept the world, overwhelming hospitals and killing the old with special ferocity.

Schools and factories were forced to close because so many students and workers were sick. Some of the infected described an odd symptom: a loss of smell and taste. And some of those who recovered reported a lingering exhaustion.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/14/health/russian-flu-coronavirus.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 9:18 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

They are not, and the moment this alliance is no longer in the interest of democrats, everyone further left than democrat will be facing the exact same de-platforming, and censorship that conservatives currently are.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. Truly complete and utter nonsense.

Jesse said:

it's not as if they'd go so far as to declare martial law to silence the free speech of people or something.. Oh Wait...

It really speaks to just how far they are willing to go to silence people who they disagree with. Martial law for a couple hundred people, after the police already cleared the bridges, and now they are announcing the canadian government has the broad authority to seize cryptocurrency accounts. That should go down well in crypto land.

I'm going to go watch democracies around the world curl up in terror for the day.

Malcolm wrote:  
Canada does not have free speech written into their constitution.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 9:27 PM  
Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101  
Content:

Astus said:  
That looks very much like a duality of a permanent awareness and impermanent objects.  
Then how is such an awareness not independent?  
see that while things (objects of mind) appear to come and go the essence of mind is  
intrinsically free from change.  
An unchanging subject, isn't that what is called a self?

Malcolm wrote:  
It's a purusha, and Ted is basically advocating a kind crypto-Samkhya.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 9:45 PM  
Title: "Russian" Flu, 1889  
Content:

Unknown said:  
In May 1889, people living in Bukhara, a city that was then part of the Russian Empire,  
began sickening and dying. The respiratory virus that killed them became known as the  
Russian flu. It swept the world, overwhelming hospitals and killing the old with special  
ferocity.

Schools and factories were forced to close because so many students and workers  
were sick. Some of the infected described an odd symptom: a loss of smell and taste.  
And some of those who recovered reported a lingering exhaustion.

Malcolm wrote:  
<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/14/health/russian-flu-coronavirus.html>

So, not from a lab...

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 10:36 PM  
Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:

It's just a segment of the petite bourgeoisie trying to usher in another Fascist moment in history, just as they did in Italy, Germany, and Vichy France, etc. They did not succeed with Trump, but they are still mad.

Minobu said:

These morons don't rate bourgeoisie .

Malcolm wrote:

petite bourgeoisie: : the lower middle class including especially small shopkeepers and artisans.

Truckers fit right in here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 15th, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.reuters.com/world/americas/canada-police-response-protests-spotlight-after-key-bridge-us-cleared-2022-02-14/>

OTTAWA, Feb 14 (Reuters) - Canadian Prime Minister Justin Trudeau plans to activate emergency powers in an effort to end protests that have shut some border crossings and paralyzed downtown Ottawa, sources said on Monday.

Nemo said:

55% of donors are from the US and their stated goal is overthrowing the democratically elected government.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 12:26 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

It's in the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

Malcolm wrote:

I may have overstated the case.

But in Canada, freedom of speech is not as robust as in the US. One of the chief differences is whether hate speech can be outlawed. Canada, yes; US, no.

A rather long read:

<https://scholarship.law.duke.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=4120&context=lcp>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 1:16 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

"Canadian" is all about being "not American."

For instance, IMO, Canadians are not traditionally loudly "proud to be" Canadian. There are a few like that, but everyone kind of looks at them like idiots because everyone in the room is Canadian and who are they trying to impress? Instead, we're quietly "smug about being" Canadian.

Malcolm wrote:

I thought you were from America originally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 1:40 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Minobu said:

These morons don't rate bourgeoisie .

Malcolm wrote:

petite bourgeoisie: : the lower middle class including especially small shopkeepers and artisans.

Truckers fit right in here.

Minobu said:

I was just pointing out that being Bourgeoisie is all about their attitude. They crave to be part of the upper class and try to emulate themselves as such.

Malcolm wrote:

There are the bourgeoisie, the upper middle class, and the petite bourgeoisie, the lower middle class.

If you own a 100,000K truck, you are not working class.

The working class generally works for wages in businesses they do not own, and have

very little discretionary income.

The line between the petite bourgeoisie and the working class is fuzzy, especially in the mind of the petite bourgeoisie, who often self-identify as working class, even though they are actually small business owners, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

Ted Biringer said:

. To recognize that objects of mind (phenomena, forms, dharmas) arise and cease endlessly, while mind itself neither arises nor ceases is not to deny the reality (Buddha-nature) of such objects – just the opposite in fact. It is, in truth, the very coming and going of all transient forms that allows us to awaken to that which is ever and always free from coming and going. I

xabir said:

What you are describing is the Shrenika false view of eternalism which Dogen refuted.

Ted Biringer said:

Dear xabir,

I am very familiar with Dogen's work and with the Shrenika view. If you read my actual posts (and not just the misrepresentations attributed to me) you will see that I am definitely not advocating the Shrenika view - or any other form of dualism.

Please be more circumspect with your claims about what I may or may not be advocating in the future.

Thank you,

Ted

Malcolm wrote:

People only have your words to go on. Astus is quite right to fault your words, which posit a permanent knower. You made two mutually contradictory statements:

Moreover, "the mind" that "is Buddha"...is the normal mind as it is.

And:

Objects of mind come and go in an endless stream, contents of awareness arise and cease – mind or awareness is the unchanging realm in which objects come and go, the immutable dimension wherein the contents of awareness arise and cease.

The "normal mind" is the aggregate of consciousness. It is impermanent and it changes constantly. There is no "awareness" or "mind" that is separate from the aggregate of consciousness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 2:49 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Queequeg said:

Dear Canadians,

Sorry for the infection.

Sincerely,

Your neighbors

Malcolm wrote:

It's their fault, they should have worn a condom.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 3:47 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

Ted Biringer said:

If you read the actual post rather than misrepresentations attributed to me it should be clear that I did not posit a “permanent knower.”

Malcolm wrote:

Sure you did.

Ted Biringer said:

I, in harmony with the classic Buddhist records, did and do recognize that “mind” (in context of “mind is Buddha”) is beginningless and endless.

Malcolm wrote:

Not as an integral entity (The Srenika Heresy xabir was referring to).

The continuum of mind has no beginning or end, but that continuum is constituted of moments that perish as soon as they arise. Thus the mind is constituted of parts, and apart from this mind, there is no other mind to be found. Not even the Buddha found some other mind outside the impermanent aggregate of consciousness.

Ted Biringer said:

Malcolm wrote: The "normal mind" is the aggregate of consciousness. It is impermanent and it changes constantly. There is no "awareness" or "mind" that is separate from the aggregate of consciousness.

Again, as I have made perfectly clear in my posts, I am using “mind” as it is used by the Zen masters in the sense of “mind is Buddha” – not as the aggregate consciousness, This “mind” is intrinsically free from change, and the aggregates you refer to, along with

all other thoughts and things (dharmas) are actually manifestations of this essential mind.

Malcolm wrote:

Then your "normal mind" falls into the extreme of permanence, since according to you it is a) not momentary and b) it is unchanging. An unchanging entity cannot produce anything, since an unchanging entity is uncompounded.

You are here claiming that there is an uncompounded agent (awareness, normal mind) that produces compounded things. Moreover, you claim this uncompounded agent is the "buddha." This is exactly why Astus is faulting your words.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 3:53 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

clyde said:

The basic nature of mind and all phenomena is empty luminosity as taught by Zen (and Tibetan) Buddhist teachers.

Malcolm wrote:

"Luminosity" simple means the mind and phenomena are intrinsically pure.

"Luminosity" is just a synonym for emptiness.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

clyde said:

And "intrinsically pure" is just a synonym for emptiness.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. People mistake "luminosity" as if it were something like light. In this context, it isn't. The Sanskrit term is prabhāsvara/ābhāsvara. It is also adjective describing the audibility of bodhisattva's voice, for example.

The most famous line from the PP Sūtras is, "There is no mind in the mind; the original nature (prakṛti) of the mind is luminous."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 5:12 AM

Title: Emptiness vs Clarity using Tibetan terminology (was Sudden Awakening 101)

Content:

clyde said:

It's also said that emptiness is the nature of mind and luminosity is its function.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe in Chinese texts. I wouldn't know, as I have no skill in Chinese.

There is a bit of slippage in Tibetan texts between luminosity ('od gsal) and clarity (gsal ba), sometimes translated as cognizance. Generally the nature of the mind has three characteristics: it is empty, it is clear, and it is knowing. These characteristics are irreducible. They are also inseparable. "Clarity" in this context means that mind can receive impressions from objects without actually being affected by those impressions, like the surface of a mirror.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 5:36 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

clyde said:

It's also said that emptiness is the nature of mind and luminosity is its function.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe in Chinese texts. I wouldn't know, as I have no skill in Chinese.

There is a bit of slippage in Tibetan texts between luminosity ('od gsal) and clarity (gsal ba), sometimes translated as cognizance. Generally the nature of the mind has three characteristics: it is empty, it is clear, and it is knowing. These characteristics are irreducible. They are also inseparable. "Clarity" in this context means that mind can receive impressions from objects without actually being affected by those impressions, like the surface of a mirror.

Nicholas2727 said:

I remember hearing somewhere that the luminosity in "empty luminosity" had to do with what you are describing as clarity. The ability to reflect or "light up" impressions (probably not the best word here) but not be affected by them due to its emptiness. Is this incorrect? Since you previously stated that luminosity is another way of saying empty, just wanting to check

Malcolm wrote:

There is some problematical slippage in these terms in Tibetan across lineages. So it is best to be very specific.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 6:55 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:



Hilarious twitter thread about the collapse of the protests in Canada:

My favorite line so far:

“None of us know how to use that goddamn bitcoin,” says one guy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 7:00 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

Don't just post a video. Share your thoughts on it

Shinjin said:

Just trying to keep the conversation balanced. I like to hear from both sides.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Minobu said:

Your usage is modern take on it.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it's the original usage from the 19th century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 9:01 PM

Title: Re: What are you doing about the coronavirus?

Content:

Toenail said:

There have always been Corona viruses. This does not prove that the Chinese had not experimented on this kind of virus.

Malcolm wrote:

It considerably reduces the probability that it came from a lab in China.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 10:06 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Apart from Lamdre, Naropa's Khecari is the most important set of instructions in Sakya. .

yagmort said:

what are the completion stages of both Lamdre and Khecari, respectively?

from what i understand Lamdre is based on Hevajra - do sakyapas practice tummo?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

According to Wisdom Library:

"In the Guna Karanda Vyuha it is written:

'When nothing else was, Sambhu was: that is the Self-Existent (svayambhu): and as he was before all, he is also called Adi-Buddha.'

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, it isn't written there at all. The term does not exist in this sūtra or any other.

The term adhibuddha (dang po'i sangs rgyas) either originates from the Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa or the Namasāṃgiti, depending on which text one thinks was set down first.

Samantabhadra, to answer the OP's question, first shows up as a name for the dharmakāya in the Sarvatathāgatatattvasaṃgraha Tantra. Vajrasattva also first appears in this tantra.

Vajradhara first appears in the Susiddhikara-mahātantra-sādhanaopāyika-paṭala, the root kriya tantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 16th, 2022 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

yagmort said:

so Lamdre completion stage is tummo?

do they only practice tummo or there are other yogas involved akin to 6 dharmasa of Naropa set?

what about Khecari's completion stage?

Malcolm wrote:

Lamdre has a completion stage with signs for each of the three inner empowerments: tummo and other prāṇāyama practices for the secret; karma mudra for the third; vajra waves for the fourth. It also has a dream yoga, luminosity yoga, etc., like the Naro chos drug system.

Yogini's completion stage with signs is also tummo, and some ancillary practices, such as mental recitation, etc. Karma mudra is unnecessary in this system.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 12:14 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

According to Wisdom Library:

"In the Guna Karanda Vyuha it is written:

'When nothing else was, Sambhu was: that is the Self-Existent (svayambhu): and as he was before all, he is also called Adi-Buddha.'

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually, it isn't written there at all. The term does not exist in this sūtra or any other.

The term adhibuddha (dang po'i sangs rgyas) either originates from the Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa or the Namasāṃgīti, depending on which text one thinks was set down first.

Samantabhadra, to answer the OP's question, first shows up as a name for the dharmakāya in the Sarvatathāgatatattvasaṃgraha Tantra. Vajrasattva also first appears in this tantra.

Vajradhara first appears in the Susiddhikara-mahātantra-sādhanaopāyika-paṭala, the root kriya tantra.

Crazywisdom said:

Do we have dates on these tantras?

Malcolm wrote:

We have the evidence of when they were translated into Tibetan and Chinese, and evidence of their development over time.

Susiddhikara-mahātantra-sāadhanopāyika-ṣaṭṭala was translated into Chinese in 726. The Sarvatathāgatatattvasaṃgraha in 756. The Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa appeared in Chinese (983), and a bit later in Tibetan (1040+-). AFIK, the Nāmasaṃgīti was never translated into Chinese until quite late, The version now in the Tibetan Kengyur was translated into Tibetan by Rinchen Zangpo, but there exists a commentary attributed Vimalamitra with all the root verses, in a translation attributed to Nyak Jñānakumara. Davidson thinks it may have been composed around 700 CE. It is a work listed in the Ldan dkar catalogue. There is a Snying ma rgyud 'bum translation that differs from the one in the Kengyur. It is also found in Dunhuang. Anthony Tribe summarizes the scholarship on Namasamgiti here:

[https://www.academia.edu/34621199/\\_Ma%C3%B1ju%C5%9Br%C4%ABn%C4%81m\\_asa%E1%B9%83g%C4%ABti.\\_In\\_Brills\\_Encyclopedia\\_of\\_Buddhism\\_Volume\\_One\\_Literature\\_and\\_Languages\\_edited\\_by\\_Jonathan\\_Silk\\_Oskar\\_von\\_Hin%C3%BCber\\_and\\_Vincent\\_Eltschinger\\_353\\_59.\\_Leiden\\_Brill\\_2015](https://www.academia.edu/34621199/_Ma%C3%B1ju%C5%9Br%C4%ABn%C4%81m_asa%E1%B9%83g%C4%ABti._In_Brills_Encyclopedia_of_Buddhism_Volume_One_Literature_and_Languages_edited_by_Jonathan_Silk_Oskar_von_Hin%C3%BCber_and_Vincent_Eltschinger_353_59._Leiden_Brill_2015).

In any case, I would elect this as the likely source of the term "adibuddha."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

yagmort said:

thank you.

never heard of "vajra waves" before. possible to explain what is it?

is there an explanation in Khecari root text as to why karmamudra is unnecessary in this system? is it substituted with a visualized consort? or there is simply no consort practice of any kind at all?

Malcolm wrote:

As for your first question, no.

There is explanation, but you need to receive the teaching.

Karmamudra practice in this system is associated with the Yab, Cakrasamvara, but not the yum, Vajrayogini. It is explained that karmamudra is not necessary for the realization of mahamudra in Yogini practice. This is probably based on the Kalacakra's rejection of karmamudra as well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

clyde said:

The basic nature of mind and all phenomena is empty luminosity as taught by Zen (and Tibetan) Buddhist teachers.

Malcolm wrote:

"Luminosity" simple means the mind and phenomena are intrinsically pure.

"Luminosity" is just a synonym for emptiness.

Crazywisdom said:

Then why does Buddha say the mind is emptiness AND luminous, bright, soft, shining, etc...?

Malcolm wrote:

He doesn't, but sometimes translators who do not understand the meaning of terms do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 12:50 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

The widely known name Adam comes from the sumerian word Adapa, meaning "first man". The concepts that have been used in Buddhism in many cases existed before the teaching of Shakyamuni. Thus the word First-buddha or Adibuddha can be, for example, 10 000 or 100 000 years old.

Malcolm wrote:

Fantasy.

"First" here is metaphorical. It does not refer to a period in time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Then why does Buddha say the mind is emptiness AND luminous, bright, soft, shining, etc...?

Malcolm wrote:

He doesn't, but sometimes translators who do not understand the meaning of terms do.

Crazywisdom said:

You'd have to prove that claim, because it seems like he says it a lot.

Malcolm wrote:

Anyone who knows Tibetan can quickly run through the synonyms of 'od gsal in the canon. They will see this is the case. For example, not only are minds "luminous", but all phenomena are luminous, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 10:24 PM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

clyde said:

It's also said that emptiness is the nature of mind and luminosity is its function.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe in Chinese texts. I wouldn't know, as I have no skill in Chinese.

There is a bit of slippage in Tibetan texts between luminosity ('od gsal) and clarity (gsal ba), sometimes translated as cognizance. Generally the nature of the mind has three characteristics: it is empty, it is clear, and it is knowing. These characteristics are irreducible. They are also inseparable. "Clarity" in this context means that mind can receive impressions from objects without actually being affected by those impressions, like the surface of a mirror.

Archie2009 said:

Is your statement that the nature of the mind (sems nyid) has three characteristics the same as saying that the basis (gzhi) is endowed with three aspects?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not exactly. I am here just talking about the more standard new school (Sakya, Kagyu, Gelug) presentation of clarity and emptiness, what the Sakyas and Kagyus term the kun gzhi, the all-basis. The Geluks do not like that terminology. But this is off-topic for the thread...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 17th, 2022 at 10:28 PM

Title: Re: Sudden Awakening 101

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Is your statement that the nature of the mind (sems nyid) has three characteristics the same as saying that the basis (gzhi) is endowed with three aspects?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not exactly. I am here just talking about the more standard new school (Sakya, Kagyu, Gelug) presentation of clarity and emptiness, what they term the kun gzhi, the all-basis.

Archie2009 said:

So sems not sems nyid.

Malcolm wrote:

sems nyid for Sakya, Kagyu, and Geluk. Not Nyingma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 12:05 AM

Title: Re: nol sang

Content:

pemachophel said:

If we have a public teaching or puja at our center, we dribsang everyone at the front door since we don't know everyone who's entering. The sang pot is placed by the front door and people simply walk through the smoke. We don't say anything about this. For most people, it's just "incense."

Malcolm wrote:

According to one of my Tibetan Medicine teachers, Menpa Tingzin, sang, in general, comes from the ancient Tibetan nomadic custom of burning juniper by the tent door when visitors come in order to disinfect them, because juniper is antimicrobial. Splints for broken limbs are made from juniper for this reason also.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 12:32 AM

Title: Re: nol sang

Content:

pemachophel said:

If we have a public teaching or puja at our center, we dribsang everyone at the front door since we don't know everyone who's entering. The sang pot is placed by the front door and people simply walk through the smoke. We don't say anything about this. For most people, it's just "incense."

Toenail said:

Based on which text if I may ask?

Malcolm wrote:

sgrib bsang does not necessarily need a text, just bsang substance made according to a specific formula, and consecrated as such.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 12:55 AM

Title: Re: nol sang

Content:

Toenail said:

Based on which text if I may ask?

Malcolm wrote:

sgrib bsang does not necessarily need a text, just bsang substance made according to a specific formula, and consecrated as such.

Toenail said:

Thats what I was curious about. How it is empowered. By which method. The Tendrel Mantra?

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 1:47 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Protestors live feed:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 2:42 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Your own material aggregate. :HONK!:

[/quote]

I know, scary right?



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 5:02 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shinjin said:

True patriots of God

Malcolm wrote:

I didn't know God was a country.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 5:18 AM

Title: Re: nol sang

Content:

pemachophel said:

There are drib-sang texts.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. That is not what I was referring to.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 5:42 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

wei wu wei said:

How do you, presumably a Buddhist, give an account of such an event in light of karma?

2. "Master Gotama, what is the reason, what is the condition, why inferiority and superiority are met with among human beings, among mankind? For one meets with short-lived and long-lived people, sick and healthy people, ugly and beautiful people, insignificant and influential people, poor and rich people, low-born and high-born people, stupid and wise people. What is the reason, what is the condition, why superiority and inferiority are met with among human beings, among mankind?"

3. "Student, beings are owners of karmas, heirs of karmas, they have karmas as their progenitor, karmas as their kin, karmas as their homing-place. It is karmas that differentiate beings according to inferiority and superiority."

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nanamoli/wheel248.html#shorter>

wei wu wei said:

Then the brahmin youth Śuka, the son of Taudeya, asked the Bhagavān the following question: “Sir<sup>39</sup> Gautama, there are many types of sentient beings, such as beings who have a short lifespan or a long lifespan, have many illnesses or few illnesses, are ugly or beautiful, have little power or are powerful, are highborn or lowborn, are poor or rich, are ignorant of the Dharma,<sup>40</sup> or possess knowledge of the Dharma to a lesser or greater degree, have good or bad fortune, and so forth. How does karmic ripening lead to this diversity of beings?”<sup>41</sup>

1.-5

The Bhagavān replied, “Young brahmin, listen<sup>42</sup> and pay careful attention to what I shall explain.<sup>43</sup> Young brahmin, sentient beings are the owners of their actions committed in former lives;<sup>44</sup> sentient beings have actions as their heritage, actions as their origin, actions as their individual causes; sentient beings develop through actions, young brahmin.<sup>45</sup> [F.299.b]

Malcolm wrote:

<https://read.84000.co/translation/toh339.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 8:50 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

wei wu wei said:

It's notable that Malcom's and Genjo's passages lead to entirely different and opposite conclusions--if I'm not mistaken.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they don't actually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 11:24 AM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

Look at how you are treated when attempting to defend one of their beliefs or ideals.

Malcolm wrote:

Really? Defend antisemitism? Anti-immigrant racism? Xenophobia? Christian dominionism?

We are not talking about seeing things from a conservative contra liberal point of view aka William F. Buckley v. Gore Vidal here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 7:29 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Adibuddha is mentioned in Karandavyuha sutra, chapter 4.

"The Kāraṇḍavyūha Sūtra is a Mantrayāna sutra that was compiled at the end of the 4th century or beginning of the 5th century CE."

It seems to be a lot earlier scriptural reference to Adibuddha than Namasangiti.

Malcolm wrote:

I looked, the term isn't there.

It's been well translated by Roberts over at 84,000 as Basket Display. Go read it. Rather than depending upon inaccurate wiki pages.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 8:15 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

Look at how you are treated when attempting to defend one of their beliefs or ideals.

Malcolm wrote:

Really? Defend antisemitism? Anti-immigrant racism? Xenophobia? Christian dominionism?

We are not talking about seeing things from a conservative contra liberal point of view aka William F. Buckley v. Gore Vidal here.

Jesse said:

You are painting the entire right wing (Republican and further) as Xenophones, anti-semites, racists?

Malcolm wrote:

No, but I am saying that what passes for Republican these days is pretty much a mix of all those things in various proportions. The Republican Party of today is not the home of Buckley style conservatives like Max Boot, David Frum, Billy Crystal and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 8:18 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

Oh trust me, in general both sides are wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure kid.

Both sides stormed the Capital. Uh huh.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 9:14 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Jesse said:

Our Future.

Malcolm wrote:

What you seem to fail to understand is that this is all just a continuation of the US civil war.

Archie2009 said:

And BLM's mantra: "White Supremacy!"

Malcolm wrote:

Not a mantra, a legitimate complaint. Trying being black in the US.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 9:33 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Archie2009 said:

And BLM's mantra: "White Supremacy!"

Malcolm wrote:

Not a mantra, a legitimate complaint. Trying being black in the US.

Archie2009 said:

But in advance, it's posited as a root cause of everything, no investigation necessary or tolerated. Don't agree then your anti-black™.

Malcolm wrote:

BLM's excesses of rhetoric in no way delegitimizes the fact that White Supremacy is a major social and cultural problem in the US, harmful to civil liberties.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 9:42 PM

Title: Re: Google's quest to control the destiny of humanity, without humanity's consent.

Content:

Archie2009 said:

But in advance, it's posited as a root cause of everything, no investigation necessary or tolerated. Don't agree then your anti-black™.

Malcolm wrote:

BLM's excesses of rhetoric in no way delegitimizes the fact that White Supremacy is a major social and cultural problem in the US, harmful to civil liberties.

Archie2009 said:

I agree, though not in the sense of how I understand Critical Race Theory, Whiteness Studies, etc. define White Supremacy.

Malcolm wrote:

White supremacy means black people etc., face systematic disadvantages white people don't

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 10:14 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

It's kind of obvious (to me at least) why there would be such an odd fudging of the content of this sūtra, namely "People want to believe in God and want the Buddha's realization tied to some sort of communion, communication, or gnosis of God." I see no other reason why we'd see so many falsified or mistaken references in otherwise relatively-well-established compendia. There is a bias at work.

Malcolm wrote:

This is the passage, the misunderstanding of which, has caused such confusion:

Bodhisattva Sarva-nīvaraṇa-viṣkambhin asked the Bhagavat, "What were the qualities of Bodhisattva Mahāsattva Avalokiteśvara that you heard the tathāgata describe?"

The Bhagavat said, “Āditya and Candra came from his eyes, Maheśvara came from his forehead, Brahmā came from his shoulders, Nārāyaṇa came from his heart, Devī Sarasvatī came from his canines, Vāyu came from his mouth, Dharaṇī came from his feet, and Varuṇa came from his stomach.

“When those deities had come from Avalokiteśvara’s body, that bhagavat told the deity Maheśvara, ‘Maheśvara, in the kaliyuga, when beings have bad natures, you will be declared to be the primal deity who is the creator, the maker. All those beings will be excluded from the path to enlightenment. They will say to ordinary beings:

“ ‘It is said: the sky is his liṅga,  
The earth is his seat.  
He is the foundation of all beings.  
The liṅga is so called because they dissolve into it.

<https://read.84000.co/translation/UT22084-051-004.html#UT22084-051-004-67>

The Sanskrit manuscript provided as an appendix lists the term ādibuddha 8 times, sometimes in the phrase ādibuddhaiḥ pracoditā, Was taught by the buddhas from the earliest times. And sometimes in the plural, ādibuddhair, primordial buddhas. But it is never used in this text in sense of adibuddha in the Namasaṃgīti, and later texts. So, the Namasaṃgīti wins.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 10:36 PM

Title: Re: Most Important Empowerments in the Sakya Tradition

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

...each of the three inner empowerments: tummo and other prāṇāyama practices for the secret; karma mudra for the third; vajra waves for the fourth...

yagmort said:

is that a typo? i thought it is a typo initially, but maybe it is not. you talk about three empowerments and indeed have mentioned three only, but enumerate last 2 as "third" and "fourth". so is it three or four? if four what is the missing link between tummo and karmamudra?

Malcolm wrote:

There are four empowerments: one outer; three inner.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 10:40 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Adibuddha is mentioned in Karandavyuha sutra, chapter 4.

"The Kāraṇḍavyūha Sūtra is a Mantrayāna sutra that was compiled at the end of the 4th century or beginning of the 5th century CE."

It seems to be a lot earlier scriptural reference to Adibuddha than Namasangiti.

Malcolm wrote:

I looked, the term isn't there.

It's been well translated by Roberts over at 84,000 as Basket Display. Go read it. Rather than depending upon inaccurate wiki pages.

Aemilius said:

It is in the Karanda Vyuha Sutra or Supernal Virtues of Avalokiteshvara by Lokesh Chandra, publ P.K. Goel for Aditya Prakashan, Delhi 1999.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, we are talking about the same text. The text where the mantra om manipadme hum comes from.

There is just no doubt that information you have is wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 18th, 2022 at 10:53 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

The Sanskrit manuscript provided as an appendix lists the term ādibuddha 8 times, sometimes in the phrase ādibuddhaiḥ pracoditā, Was taught by the buddhas from the earliest times. And sometimes in the plural, ādibuddhair, primordial buddhas.

Caoimhghín said:

Seemingly, none of these English correspondences you've provided show "ādibuddha" being used in the sūtra to refer to any particular Buddha at all. Mind you, it's just two examples. I'll give the document a read to see if I see anything that changes my mind in it.

Malcolm wrote:

Correct, unlike the Namasamgīti, in which Mañjuśrī is clearly identified as THE ādibuddha, in this text no specific buddha is identified as the ādibuddha.

There are only eight examples of the term ādibuddha in the Sanskrit text, and its only translated two ways, buddhas from earliest time, and primordial buddhas.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 12:45 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Adibuddha is mentioned in Karandavyuha sutra, chapter 4.

"The Kāraṇḍavyūha Sūtra is a Mantrayāna sutra that was compiled at the end of the 4th century or beginning of the 5th century CE."

It seems to be a lot earlier scriptural reference to Adibuddha than Namasangiti.

haha said:

Indeed, you are correct, it is in forth chapter (Adhibuddhātma sambhuto).

Malcolm wrote:

No. Here is the complete Sanskrit:

There is no "adibuddhātma sambhuto anywhere in the fourth chapter.

candrādyutpattirnāma caturthaṃ prakaraṇam |

atha sarvanīvaraṇaviṣkambhī bhagavantametadavocat–bhagavana, adyāpi  
nāgacchatyavalokiteśvaro bodhisattvo mahāsattvaḥ ? bhagavānāha – anekāni  
kulaputra sattvakoṭīniyutaśatasahasrāṇi paripācayati | dine dine sa āgatya paripācayati  
| nāsti kulaputra īdṛśaṃ pratibhānaṃ tathāgatānāmapi yādṛśamāryāvalokiteśvarasya  
bodhisattvasya mahāsattvasya ||

atha sarvanīvaraṇaviṣkambhī āha–kena prakāreṇa bhagavan ? bhagavānāha–  
bhūtapūrvam kulaputra vipaśyī nāma tathāgato'rhan samyaksambuddho loka udapādi  
vidyācaraṇasaṃpannaḥ sugato lokavidanuttaraḥ puruṣadamyasārathiḥ śāstā devānām  
ca manuṣyāṇām ca buddho bhagavān | tena kālēna tena samayenāhaṃ  
sarvanīvaraṇaviṣkambhin sugandhamukho nāma vaṇikputro'bhūvam | tadā me śrutā  
vipaśyinastathāgatasya sakāśādāryāvalokiteśvarasya guṇodbhāvanā ||

atha sarvanīvaraṇaviṣkambhī bhagavantametadavocat– kīdṛśī tvayā bhagavan  
guṇodbhāvanā śrutā ? etāḥ sarvā pravadatām | vijñarāja bhagavan me prabodhaya,  
yādṛśī tvayā bhagavan guṇodbhāvanā āryāvalokiteśvarasya bodhisattvasya  
mahāsattvasya śrutā ||



bhagavānāha– cakṣuṣoścandrādityāvutpannau, lalāṭānmaheśvaraḥ, skandhebhyo  
brahmādayaḥ, hṛdayānnārāyaṇaḥ, daṁṣṭrābhyāṃ sarasvatī, mukhato vāyavo jātāḥ,  
dharaṇī pādābhyāṃ, varuṇaścodarāt | yadaite devā jātā āryāvalokiteśvarasya kāyāt,  
athāryāvalokiteśvaro bodhisattvo mahāsattvo maheśvaraṃ devaputrametadavocat–  
bhaviṣyasi tvaṃ maheśvaraḥ kaliyuge pratipanne | kaṣṭasattvadhātusamutpanna  
ādideva ākhyāyase sraṣṭāraṃ kartāraṃ, te sarvasattvā bodhimārgena viprahīṇā  
bhaviṣyanti, ya īdṛśaprthagjaneṣu sattveṣu sām̐kathyaṃ kurvanti ||

ākāśaṃ liṅgamiyāhuḥ pṛthivī tasya pīṭhikā |

ālayaḥ sarvabhūtānāṃ līlayā liṅgamucyate || 1 ||

īdṛśaṃ mayā kulaputra vipaśyinastathāgatasya sakāśādāryāvalokiteśvarasya  
guṇodbhāvanā śrutā ||

tadapyatikramya śikhī nāma tathāgato'rhan samyaksaṃbuddho babhūva  
vidyācaraṇasaṃpannaḥ sugato lokavidanuttaraḥ puruṣadamyasārathiḥ śāstā devānāṃ  
ca manuṣyāṇāṃ ca buddho bhagavān | tena kālena tena samayenāhaṃ  
sarvanīvaraṇaviṣkambhin dānaśūro nāma bodhisattvo mahāsattvo'bhūvam | tasya  
śikhinastathāgatasya sakāśādavalokiteśvarasya bodhisattvasya mahāsatvasya  
guṇodbhāvanā śrutā ||

iti candrādyutpattirnāma caturthaṃ prakaraṇam ||

<http://www.dsbcproject.org/canon-text/content/42/387>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 12:58 AM

Title: Re: the Zen promise is empty

Content:

Nadereme said:

Well, not falsifiable from the perspective of one who isn't awakened.

Malcolm wrote:

Its the only perspective that counts, actually.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 1:13 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No. Here is the complete Sanskrit:

There is no "adibuddhātma sambhuto anywhere in the fourth chapter.

haha said:

It is because you are searching it on wrong title.

Malcolm wrote:

I am responding to Amelius. She is the one claiming the term adibuddha comes from section four of the Karandavyūha. It is not found in that text at all. Glad you agree.

This text, the Guṇakāraṇḍavyūha, was written during the Malla era. It is quite late, so it frankly is completely irrelevant to the OP.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 1:28 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's not exactly the "Tibetan view", and there are all kinds of writings on karma across traditions, including Tibetan traditions, not all of which agree....what a surprise.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, not really. The Tibetan idea of karma is pretty uniform across all Tibetan traditions. Tibetans generally follow the idea stated in the Kośa that everything that happens to a person is the ripening of karma.

As stated more precisely, all pleasant, unpleasant, and neutral sensations are a result of karma. Not all events, per se.

On the other hand, more broadly the universe is created by the karma of all sentient beings, and all its diversity is a result of those actions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Is T1050 the "Avalokiteśvaraguṇakāraṇḍavyūha" the Kāraṇḍavyūha or the "Guṇakāraṇḍavyūha?" I've generally seen T1050 and the Kāraṇḍavyūha to be considered "the same text." Is this wrong?

Malcolm wrote:

[http://www.acmuller.net/descriptive\\_catalogue/files/k1088.html](http://www.acmuller.net/descriptive_catalogue/files/k1088.html)

This is the same as the Basket Array posted from above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 4:17 AM

Title: Re: Can you incarnate before dying?

Content:

Nalanda said:

How is it possible to reincarnate before even dying?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

But if you attain high realization, you can emanate 100 bodies, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's not exactly the "Tibetan view", and there are all kinds of writings on karma across traditions, including Tibetan traditions, not all of which agree....what a surprise.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, not really. The Tibetan idea of karma is pretty uniform across all Tibetan traditions. Tibetans generally follow the idea stated in the Kośa that everything that happens to a person is the ripening of karma.

As stated more precisely, all pleasant, unpleasant, and neutral sensations are a result of karma. Not all events, per se.

On the other hand, more broadly the universe is created by the karma of all sentient beings, and all its diversity is a result of those actions.

wei wu wei said:

Malcolm, you've brought up earlier Sutra presentations of karma and are obviously familiar with Tibetan. Where do you land?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't worry about other people's karma. I worry about my own.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 4:44 AM

Title: Re: Can you incarnate before dying?

Content:

Nalanda said:

How is it possible to reincarnate before even dying?

Malcolm wrote:

No.

But if you attain high realization, you can emanate 100 bodies, etc.

Nalanda said:

How do we explain Dudjom Lingpa taking a rebirth before dying?

[https://www.rigpawiki.org/index.php?title=Dudjom\\_Lingpa](https://www.rigpawiki.org/index.php?title=Dudjom_Lingpa)

"His immediate incarnation, born even before he himself passed away, was Dudjom Rinpoche."

Malcolm wrote:

He emanated. This language is not precise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 5:35 AM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a way of life

Content:

shanyin said:

What is Buddhism if considered from the point of view of a way of life?

Malcolm wrote:

Buddhism is 100% a way of life. It is a path, and there are instructions not just for view and meditation, but also for conduct.

As in life, there are many different Buddhist lifestyles, not just one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 7:30 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

wei wu wei said:

Malcolm, you've brought up earlier Sutra presentations of karma and are obviously familiar with Tibetan. Where do you land?

Malcolm wrote:

I don't worry about other people's karma. I worry about my own.

wei wu wei said:

As do I. Perhaps you'd generate some positive karma for yourself then by helping me clarify my own understanding of a pretty large and central issue in Buddhist thought.

Malcolm wrote:

Just read the karmasiddhiprakarana and chapter 4 of Abhidharmakoshabhāṣyam, that ought to sort you out.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 8:33 PM

Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:

haha said:

It is because you are searching it on wrong title.

Malcolm wrote:

I am responding to Amelius. She is the one claiming the term adibuddha comes from section four of the Karandavyūha. It is not found in that text at all. Glad you agree.

This text, the Guṇakāraṇḍavyūha, was written during the Malla era. It is quite late, so it frankly is completely irrelevant to the OP.

Aemilius said:

By the way I am a male person. The division into chapters is somewhat different in the text used by Lokesh Chandra compared with the text of Mithun Howdalar. The fourth Chapter in Lokesh Chandra is longer. Lokesh Chandra is an established authority in the field, I am sure that the word is in the text used by him. Because he says it is there. Karanda Vyūha Sutra or The Supernal Virtues of Avalokiteshvara has the complete text

in sanskrit.

I don't understand why this issue has become so important. It is contrary to the general Buddhist view of infinite past, where no beginning is found.

Adi means quite unequivocally "first", so it does give a wrong impression of a beginning in time.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, it isn't. The term is not present in the extant Sanskrit, nor in Tibetan, nor in Chinese translations. It's only in the Malla dynasty Nepalese summary.

Roberts addresses the Lokesh Chandra Manuscript in his intro to his translation of the original version.

Aemilius said:

The sūtra also exists in a later, longer, and more polished form, entirely in verse and incorporating passages from such texts as Śāntideva's Bodhi-sattva-caryāvatāra, which has great importance within Nepalese Buddhism. Dating to the fifteenth century, it is one of the last Sanskrit Buddhist sūtras. It has not been translated into Tibetan.

Malcolm wrote:

You should go read what he says.

The origin of the term is the Namasamgiti.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Buddhism as a way of life

Content:

Ayu said:

I believe, ethical conduct is a core item for the way of life of a Buddhist.

Compassion is the base of that base.

There are "10 unwholesome deeds" defined.

[https://www.dhammadownload.com/index.php/10\\_unwholesome\\_actions](https://www.dhammadownload.com/index.php/10_unwholesome_actions)

To avoid them is the exercise that is considered as "10 wholesome deeds".

So, if you manage to spare killing an ant, it's a wholesome deed already. The focus is not on guilt and sin. Rather "10 wholesome deeds" are viewed as a practice. Nobody is perfect in this from the beginning. It is a steady exercise.

"Mindfulness, skillfulness, transcendence, awareness" are helpers for this task, I think. They are deepened while practicing 10 wholesome deeds.

Tennyson said:  
What exactly does "wrong views" mean in this case?

Malcolm wrote:  
Not observing proper relationship cause and effect, for example, believing in a creator god, or rejecting karma.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 19th, 2022 at 9:36 PM  
Title: Re: Dudjom Sangye Pema Shepa Rinpoche's parinirvana  
Content:

Lingpupa said:  
Where did this happen? Might there not be a demand for an autopsy when someone young and seemingly healthy suddenly dies? This might not go well.

Malcolm wrote:  
In Tibet/China.

Autopsy unlikely.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 20th, 2022 at 12:56 AM  
Title: Re: Dudjom Sangye Pema Shepa Rinpoche's parinirvana  
Content:

Archie2009 said:  
Rinpoche had no history of illness?

Malcolm wrote:  
Not that I am aware. But I wouldn't know anyway.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 20th, 2022 at 5:55 AM  
Title: Re: Origin & Development of Adi-Buddha, Vajradhara, Vajrasattva, and Samantabhadra?

Content:  
Aemilius said:  
According to Wisdom Library:

"In the Guna Karanda Vyuha it is written:

'When nothing else was, Sambhu was: that is the Self-Existent (svayambhu): and as he was before all, he is also called Adi-Buddha.'

The first system of Adi-Buddha was set up in Nepal by a theistic school called Aisvarika,

but was never generally adopted in Nepal or Tibet, and had practically no followers in China and Japan.

The Nepalese school supposed an Adi-Buddha infinite, omniscient, self-existing, without beginning and without end, the source and originator of all things, who by virtue of five sorts of wisdom (jnana) and by the exercise of five meditations (dhyana) evolved five Dhyani-Buddhas or Celestial Jinas called Anupapadaka, or 'without parents'.

When all was perfect void (maha-Sunyata) the mystic syllable aum became manifest, from which at his own will the Adi-Buddha was produced. At the creation of the world he revealed himself in the form of a flame which issued from a lotusflower, and in Nepal the Adi-Buddha is always represented by this symbol.

Svayambhu, or Adi-Buddha, was called Isvara by the Aisvarika, and Svabhava by the Svabhavika; but he was also given such special names as Vairocana, Vajrapani, Vajradhara, and Vajrasattva. In the Namasangiti (compiled before the tenth century a.d.) Manjusri, god of Transcendent Wisdom, is referred to as Adi-Buddha. "

<https://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/the-gods-of-northern-buddhism/d/doc4664.html>

steveb1 said:

Coming late here, with an ignorant layperson's question.

To the extent any Buddhists "believe in" Adi-Buddha, do they typically align him in any way with the Mahayana Buddha Body of the Dharmakaya...? In my understanding, the Dharmakaya is not personal, is not a Creator-deity, but is an endless expression of Buddha's super-consciousness and ever-operative compassion. If that is correct, can the Dharmakaya and Adi-Buddha be considered to be functionally equivalent at some level...?

Malcolm wrote:

The commentaries on the term, of which there are many, equate adibuddha with the nature of reality.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 20th, 2022 at 8:08 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Putin has been a bad hombre for over a decade. There's nothing new about it. He has flexed his muscles in Georgia, Syria and Crimea in the past. The only difference now is that we're talking about a bigger slice of land.

I think that the West, despite its bluster and threats of sanctions, has already more or less accepted that Ukraine will fall to Russia. I know that many Europeans see the



cultural relationship between Russia and Ukraine as being close enough to actually make it “acceptable,” even though they might not admit it. This is pretty evident in all of the shoulder-shrugging and finger-wagging going on. One only needs to remember how quickly everyone got over the annexation of Crimea.

To call this the start of a new Cold War is to draw a much sharper line between Russia and the West than what exists: Most of Russia’s upper class and oligarchs are deeply integrated into the scene in London and New York. The gas pipeline to Germany is so integral that it perfectly explains why the new German PM has been so hesitant to strongly condemn Russia. There’s no real talk of kicking Russia out of Swift, which might actually hurt. Many politicians in both North America and Europe adore Putin and will try to impede attempts to punish him. He was even invited to the former Austrian foreign minister’s wedding in 2018.

Frankly, Putin is gonna take Ukraine, harsh words will be shared, but ultimately nothing will come of it. Ukraine is neither NATO nor EU. It is absolutely outside the Western sphere.

The question isn’t whether it’ll happen or not. The question is: will Ukraine be fully annexed or will a pro-Russian puppet government be established?

KristenM said:  
Excellent points.

Putin is betting on the fact that the US doesn't have the will to fight and I've heard that Putin chose this time because he believes the US is weakened now in the same way that Russia was in the 1990's. Especially after the retreat of US forces from Afghanistan, Putin has felt emboldened. I'm not blaming any particular administration, but Russia sees the US as vulnerable.

Ukraine has a strategic importance that Crimea may not have and the domino effect of Ukraine falling into Russian hands does not bode well for the EU or the US. This takeover may be more costly than what the Russians or Europe are expecting. A long, drawn-out war and refugee crisis that Europe isn't ready for, just for starters. So, the US and its allies need to put their foot down or else they are doomed to lick the proverbial boot. How they do that, I've no idea.

Malcolm wrote:  
IMO, this more to do with Merkle stepping down, following Trump’s weakening of NATO.

And yes, NATO has to stand up to Putin. Crippling oligarchs is the first step to dismantling the Russian dystopia.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 20th, 2022 at 9:13 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

And yes, NATO has to stand up to Putin. Crippling oligarchs is the first step to dismantling the Russian dystopia.

Könchok Thrinley said:

Yup. NATO has to stand up as Russia demands things that would influence not only Ukraine but entire eastern and central Europe. It is not just about one country.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 20th, 2022 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

I'm sure what Malcolm is saying about Trump weakening NATO etc is correct, but it seems one big issue is gas. A lot of people are depending on that Russian pipeline.

Malcolm wrote:

A long term strategic error of the EU, especially Germany.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 1:05 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I wish we could give them free visas and dump them where they clearly want to live. Literally everyone would be happier.

Malcolm wrote:

We don't want 'em. You keep 'em. We have enough problems of our own.

Caoimhghín said:

I'm personally in favour of giving Calgary to the States.

Malcolm wrote:

They'll just be another red state sucking off the blue states for welfare karens. No thanks.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 1:10 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I'm personally in favour of giving Calgary to the States. Just the city. They can have a thin line of highway connecting it to the rest of America. We really don't need Calgary and they'd rather be gone themselves.

DNS said:

If that happened, then at least Ted Cruz could legally run for POTUS.

He ran for president, but wasn't even born in America, which is required by the Constitution. He was born in Calgary to an American mother and Cuban (not citizen at the time) father. It's unclear if that would count as "birth-US Citizen."

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ted\\_Cruz](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ted_Cruz)

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ted\\_Cruz#Citizenship](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ted_Cruz#Citizenship)

McCain was born in Panama, but that's allowed since it was on a military base to a father serving in the US Navy (an admiral at that).

Malcolm wrote:

Unfortunately:

Birthright citizenship in the United States is United States citizenship acquired by a person automatically, by operation of law. This takes place in two situations: by virtue of the person's birth within United States territory or because one or both of their parents is (or was) a US citizen.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Birthright\\_citizenship\\_in\\_the\\_United\\_States](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Birthright_citizenship_in_the_United_States)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 1:24 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

I wish we could give them free visas and dump them where they clearly want to live. Literally everyone would be happier.

Malcolm wrote:

We don't want 'em. You keep 'em. We have enough problems of our own.

Shinjin said:

What if they weren't white?

Malcolm wrote:

Skin tone has nothing to do with it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 3:09 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shinjin said:

What if they weren't white?

Malcolm wrote:

Skin tone has nothing to do with it.

Shinjin said:

What about immigration from Mexico?

Malcolm wrote:

We aren't talking about immigration.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

Well to be fair it's not like the USA has ever invaded another country and all that.....mmmm. \*+)

Malcolm wrote:

Well, to be fair, that is quite irrelevant. We never invaded anyone claiming we were rescuing anglophones from "genocide."

This is just the Sudetenland 1939 all over again.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 4:46 AM

Title: Re: Lojong - Offering to the Döns

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is a post I wrote some time ago, slightly corrected.

The very simplest method is the practice of the Pretamukha-agnijvālayaśarakāra-nāma-dhāraṇī:

Early in the day, but also at any other time: into a pure vessel which is completely clean without any remnants of any food at all, place water, and holding this in one's right hand recite the following dharani seven times:

Namaḥ sarvatathāgata avalokite oṃ saṃbhara saṃbhara hūṃ

Then recite the names of these Buddhas:

Homage to the Tathāgata Many Jewels [imagine all the pretas actions of avarice of many lifetimes are destroyed and they accumulate all merits].

Homage to the Tathāgata Sublime Form [Imagine all the pretas physical sufferings are conquered and they achieve perfect forms and characteristics].

Homage to the Tathāgata Endlessly Abundant Body [Imagine all the pretas thirst is given up and satisfied, and they are satisfied with sufficient food].

Homage to the Tathāgata Free from Fear [Imagine all the pretas are free from all fears].

At the end of reciting these names, snap one's fingers three times, and pour the vessel's contents out onto clean ground.

Having done this, one will have pacified the realms of the pretas, and satisfied them, and so on.

This instruction on how to do the practice is extracted from the root text found in volume Wam of the bstan 'gyur.

This practice is very powerful in removing provocations by non-human beings, is an extremely rapid way of reaching the end of the perfection of generosity, and so on. It requires no initiation of any kind. You can also skip reciting the Buddhas names.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Most of Russia's upper class and oligarchs are deeply integrated into the scene in... New York.

Queequeg said:

No they're not.

ManiThePainter said:

Sure they are.

Malcolm wrote:

It's much worse in London.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 5:36 AM

Title: Re: On the Unchanging Nature of the One Mind

Content:

clyde said:

Astus, Do you think that Huang Po meant “the mind that thinks and names everything” when he taught about Mind?

Malcolm wrote:

So you think there is mind and Mind? Is there are also self and Self?

Does the capital letter make mind and self have more than four letters? Or does it somehow metaphysically transform the terms into something ultimate?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 6:34 AM

Title: Re: On the Unchanging Nature of the One Mind

Content:

clyde said:

Malcolm, Regarding capitalization of Mind, I was following the usage of Blofeld

Malcolm wrote:

His translations are pretty outdated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 8:01 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Just saw on CNN, according to US intelligence, Russian commanders have been given orders to attack Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 8:09 AM

Title: Re: On the Unchanging Nature of the One Mind

Content:

clyde said:

Now that we've discussed capitalization, terminology, and my motives for raising a question, let me rephrase my question.

Astus linked this,

Astus said:

How unexpected! The self-nature is originally without movement.

How unexpected! The self-nature can produce the ten thousand dharmas.'

( <http://www.cttbusa.org/6patriarch/6patriarch3.asp.html> )

clyde said:

How does the self-nature produce the ten thousand dharmas without movement?

Malcolm wrote:

What is a "self-nature"?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 8:47 AM

Title: Re: On the Unchanging Nature of the One Mind

Content:

clyde said:

Malcolm, You're seem more interested in exploring terminology

Malcolm wrote:

If one isn't clear what a term means, one cannot have a meaningful dialogue about it. Your examples don't explain what you think the term means.

So, it's nit really clear whether you think there are flags, wind, and movement outside the mind, or if you think that these things only exist in the mind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 10:29 PM

Title: Re: On the Unchanging Nature of the One Mind

Content:

Astus said:

In other words, what makes 'one' in 'one mind' is the essence, that is emptiness.

Another term for it is self-nature (zixing 自性).

Malcolm wrote:

That makes everything more clear. Zixing is svabhāva; and if one defines svabhāva as emptiness, there is no problem. Of course there is only one dharmatā pervading all phenomena, whether conditioned or unconditioned.

As a statement originating Dzogchen teachings has it: gcig shes kun grol. Knowing one

thing liberates all things.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 21st, 2022 at 10:33 PM

Title: Re: Is there a particular barrier between the Dharma and US society/culture?

Content:

Nadereme said:

So I'm asking this cause there seems (at least from my view) a particular barrier between the USA and Dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. Dharma is beyond culture. Buddhism, not necessarily.

Nadereme said:

I would say that this can be due to the extreme sort of Protestantism pervading the country. From fanatical Christians and Jews to fanatical secularists/atheists/agnostics/science/rationality folks. As well as all of the political discourse. Not to mention marketing catering and consumerism.

Malcolm wrote:

Fanaticism, politics, marketing, and consumerism have existed in Buddhism from the beginning as well.

Nadereme said:

I see it as extensions of perceived 'righteousness' where those who don't follow along are simply bad, wrong, stupid, or evil. Does this present a unique challenge? And even when the Dharma is in the US, there tends to be a 'Protestantizing' of it seen through the secular and pragmatic movements a la Ingram, or through sectarianism and purism/triumphalism of literature and texts and practice and yantras.

Malcolm wrote:

So you just proved the point, these things have existed in Buddhism from the beginning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:05 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shinjin said:

What if they weren't white?

Minobu said:

They are white. Totally it's like a white supremest heaven in Alberta. This is where the



reform party was born, our first ramble into the populace movement. which as far as I can see are 99% white

Shinjin said:

Isn't Quebec the most racist part of the country with the hijab/turban ban and mosque shootings? Alberta hasn't had anything like that as far as I know.

Malcolm wrote:

Islam isn't a race.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:13 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

The Ukrainians voted to be independent and have been muddling along with a democracy since. If they want to join Russia, they can vote on it. If democracies don't stick up for each other, its over. The world will be overrun by strongmen.

President Vladimir V. Putin said he would decide by day's end whether to recognize the independence of Luhansk and Donetsk. U.S. officials worry that Russia could use such a recognition to move more forces in.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/live/2022/02/21/world/ukraine-russia-putin-biden>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:19 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Shinjin said:

Isn't Quebec the most racist part of the country with the hijab/turban ban and mosque shootings? Alberta hasn't had anything like that as far as I know.

Malcolm wrote:

Islam isn't a race.

Shinjin said:

Majority of those who follow Islam are racial minorities.

Malcolm wrote:

The "hijab/turban ban" isn't about race, it applies equally to all religious symbolism.

Since Quebec often follows France in their sentiments, being a Francophone province, the "hijab/turban ban" is just an example of Quebec following the precedent of this law

in France:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/French\\_law\\_on\\_secularity\\_and\\_conspicuous\\_religious\\_symbols\\_in\\_schools](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/French_law_on_secularity_and_conspicuous_religious_symbols_in_schools)

Quebec's legal system is based on the Napoleonic Code, like Louisiana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: The moral outrage of strong karma...

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's not exactly the "Tibetan view", and there are all kinds of writings on karma across traditions, including Tibetan traditions, not all of which agree....what a surprise.

Shinjin said:

What is the "Tibetan view" and how does it differ across traditions?

Malcolm wrote:

The "Tibetan" view is rooted in writings of Vasubandhu: the fourth chapter of Abhidharmakośabhaṣya and the Karmasiddhiprakaraṇa.

It does not differ across Tibetan traditions. In other words, all the Tibetan schools pretty much follow the same playbook when it comes to explaining karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:28 AM

Title: Re: Trump encourages populace movement in Canada

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

These Canadians are so dumb:

Dwayne Lich questions legality of Emergencies Act

He also questioned whether the Emergencies Act — which was debated Saturday in the House of Commons — was implemented legally, at times confusing the numbered amendments found in the U.S. Constitution with Canada's Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

"Honestly? I thought it was a peaceful protest and based on my first amendment, I thought that was part of our rights," he told the court.

"What do you mean, first amendment? What's that?" Judge Julie Bourgeois asked him.

"I don't know. I don't know politics. I don't know," he said. "I wasn't supportive of the blockade or the whatever, but I didn't realize that it was criminal to do what they were doing. I thought it was part of our freedoms to be able to do stuff like that."

<https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/ottawa/tamara-lich-bail-hearing-february-19-1.6358307>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yeah and they have nukes. Maybe Ukraine will be ok.

Malcolm wrote:

No, actually they do not.

<https://www.politico.eu/article/ukraines-nuclear-lesson-with-russia-written-guarantees-can-be-worth-little/>

Crazywisdom said:

KYIV — Around 30 years ago, Ukraine handed all its nuclear weapons to Russia in exchange for promises of peace from Moscow. Western powers brokered the deal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 1:22 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Ever heard of the European Union?

Malcolm wrote:

Now a word from your sponsor:

[https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/official\\_texts\\_191931.htm](https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/official_texts_191931.htm)

[https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/opinions\\_191847.htm?selectedLocale=en](https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/opinions_191847.htm?selectedLocale=en)

So, do you want Russia to crush Ukraine or not?

If not, then the EU is going to have to stand up against Russia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 1:42 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

In fact since the conflict in Crimea started, European neo-nazis have been travelling to Ukraine, to fight against Russian separatists.

Malcolm wrote:

The Azov Battalion has been officially absorbed into the Ukrainian military. And yes, they are completely anti-semitic. So, should this permit Russia, which is also antisemitic, etc. to crush Ukraine?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 1:51 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

This approach to independence cannot be recognized.

Malcolm wrote:

Agreed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 2:22 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

In fact since the conflict in Crimea started, European neo-nazis have been travelling to Ukraine, to fight against Russian separatists.

Malcolm wrote:

The Azov Battalion has been officially absorbed into the Ukrainian military. And yes, they are completely anti-semitic. So, should this permit Russia, which is also antisemitic, etc. to crush Ukraine?

Brunelleschi said:

That's not the point. The point is that it is not a right wing opinion per se. In Europe right wingers save a few populists are pro-NATO, anti-Russia. The political scene is not the same as in the US.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://polishnews.co.uk/marine-le-pen-ukraine-is-under-the-influence-of-russia-interview-in-rzeczpospolita-about-russia-ukraine-the-alliance-with-pis-and-the-vision-of-the-eu/>

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/AfD\\_pro-Russia\\_movement](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/AfD_pro-Russia_movement)

I wouldn't say these are just a few people. These are two sizable far right movements in the EU.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

My opinion is that war is, and should be viewed as a last resort and diplomacy should continue.

Malcolm wrote:

Putin is clearly not interested in diplomacy.

Brunelleschi said:

Perhaps there needs to be concessions. This is not ideal but it would most likely be vastly preferable to a military conflict.

Malcolm wrote:

No. The EU has no right to make "concessions" about another nation's boundaries to a foreign aggressor.

This is no different than Hitler's Sudetenland expansion in 1939.

The EU is looking a lot like Neville Chamberlain these days.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 2:41 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

digging up their definitely not fake stories about Russian energy weapons\*\*

Malcolm wrote:

Not energy weapons, sonic weapons.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sonic\\_weapon](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sonic_weapon)

Both sides have them and they can be made with stuff from Radio Shack.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 2:52 AM

Title: Re: Surangama question

Content:

Constructelf said:

As far as I know, the current academic position is that the Surangama Sutra is of Indian origin

Malcolm wrote:

No, the current consensus is that it is a pastiche of native Chinese ideas and Indian source material.

it was never translated into Tibetan until the 18th century, and is absent from the Imperial period catalogues, ldan dkar ma and 'phang thang ma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 3:02 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

My opinion is that war is, and should be viewed as a last resort and diplomacy should continue.

Malcolm wrote:

Putin is clearly not interested in diplomacy.

Brunelleschi said:

Putin's a crook but we don't yet know what could be achieved through diplomacy.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, pretty clearly giving away Ukrainian territory is not an acceptable option.

Brunelleschi said:

Amping up the rhetoric is not helping. There has been anti-Russian sentiment for years in the US and Europe. Most major news channel in the US has ex CIA and intelligence operatives, FBI officials, Pentagon functionaries and so on acting as political analysts. Undoubtedly, this is the case in Russia as well.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, all these people inspired Putin to mass 130k+ troops on the border of Ukraine.

Brunelleschi said:

Sorry, I did not mean concessions as in land concession. I meant concession as in

compromise. Russia has a set of goals, the EU and Europe has a set of goals, the US has a set of goals. Deals can be made.

Malcolm wrote:

Most Ukrainians want to join NATO and the EU. Russia's goal is to prevent that at any cost.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 3:45 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

And, sorry, but no, if Nagarjuna's logic destroys all being

Malcolm wrote:

His logic doesn't destroy anything other than faulty reasonings of others.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 4:09 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

I mean you claim an invasion is imminent.

Mr. Putin made the case that Ukraine is by history and makeup an integral part of Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.nytimes.com/live/2022/02/21/world/ukraine-russia-putin-biden#russia-will-recognize-two-regions-in-ukraine-a-possible-prelude-to-invasion>

Long and short, Putin waited until Germany had a novice chancellor to make his move. He is now intent on embroiling your continent in a war of aggression based on his imperial ambitions, invoking nationalist nostalgia as a pretext for war. Open your eyes, man.

In other words, Russia's claim on Ukraine is about as valid as China's claim on Tibet, i.e., not at all.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 4:22 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Yup. Unfortunately, there is now potential for an extremely rapid escalation.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.bbc.com/news/live/world-europe-60454795>

Brunelleschi said:

He spoke for nearly an hour, and covered a lot of ground, going as far back as the creation of the Soviet Union in 1922. Here are the main lines:

In the speech he said "Ukraine never had a tradition of genuine statehood" and that modern Ukraine had been "created" by Russia.

He attacked the idea of Ukraine joining the Nato defensive alliance, saying it would serve as "a direct threat to the security of Russia"

Putin repeated his argument that Nato had ignored Russian security concerns

Without providing evidence, he said Ukraine was a "puppet" of the US and accused the Ukrainian authorities of corruption

Confirming the recognition of the breakaway states, he said it was a decision he should have made a long time ago

Malcolm wrote:

Russia is the reason we have never dismantled the Atlantic Consensus. Europe needs it to maintain their democracies.

Brunelleschi said:

I still stand by comments regarding war being a last-ditch effort, opposing unnecessary interventionism, favoring de-escalation as well as being skeptical towards the US intelligence apparatus.

Malcolm wrote:

Your "deescalation" has been tried. But since Ukraine is not part of NATO, there will be no intervention. So, it's going to be a long bloody war, with Russia now on your back porch, not just in your backyard.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 4:55 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Foundations\\_of\\_Geopolitics](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Foundations_of_Geopolitics)

From the book: Ukraine should be annexed by Russia because "Ukraine as a state has no geopolitical meaning, no particular cultural import or universal significance, no geographic uniqueness, no ethnic exclusiveness, its certain territorial ambitions represents an enormous danger for all of Eurasia and, without resolving the Ukrainian problem, it is in general senseless to speak about continental politics". Ukraine should not be allowed to remain independent, unless it is cordon sanitaire, which would be inadmissible



Malcolm wrote:

Yup. This was all in the air in 2015 because of the illegal annexation of Crimea.

All these idiots on the far left and the far right were repeating Russian talking points taken from this book and this author (including the fantasy that HRC was going start a nuclear war in Syria). It is why I finally abandoned the Green Party in the US. Jill Stein was a total moron who accepted a dinner invitation from Putin.

Trump tried to destroy the Atlantic Consensus.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 5:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

weak and soft

Malcolm wrote:

Measured and deliberate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 6:47 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

weak and soft indeed <https://www.msn.com/en-us/news/world/biden-responds-with-limited-sanctions-after-putin-recognizes-ukraine-regions/ar-AAU8gRF?ocid=msedgntp>

Queequeg said:

what would meet your approval?

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 6:52 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

Just discovered the shentong position and these refutations and critiques of Nagarjuna recently.

Malcolm wrote:

The gzhan stong position is for the most part, merely false aspectarian yogacāra, ala Ratnākaraśanti.

gZhan stong suffers from the same internal contradiction as false aspectarian yogacāra, namely, the assertion of the transformation of a compounded consciousness into an uncompounded gnosis. It also suffers from the defect of splitting the two truths, etc.

I been studying gzhan stong etc. for 30 years, and if you want to understand its defects, they are ably pointed out by Tsongkhapa in his legs bshad snying po and in Gorampa's lta ba shan 'byed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 7:01 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

weak and soft indeed <https://www.msn.com/en-us/news/world/biden-responds-with-limited-sanctions-after-putin-recognizes-ukraine-regions/ar-AAU8gRF?ocid=msedgntp>

Queequeg said:

what would meet your approval?

Shinjin said:

Tougher sanctions.

Malcolm wrote:

If Putin continues on this mad course—which is certain it seems—they will happen. But it won't be good for the world economy. Hence the mature thing is to proceed deliberately and respond in a proportional manner. Slapping him with tougher sanctions too soon will have the net effect of giving Putin nothing to lose, the nuclear option I alluded to.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 9:29 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

Tougher sanctions.

Malcolm wrote:

If Putin continues on this mad course—which is certain it seems—they will happen. But it won't be good for the world economy. Hence the mature thing is to proceed

deliberately and respond in a proportional manner. Slapping him with tougher sanctions too soon will have the net effect of giving Putin nothing to lose, the nuclear option I alluded to.

PeterC said:

He's going to take some or all of Ukraine, either now or at a later date, largely because the consequences aren't enough to deter him.

Malcolm wrote:

He's deluded. I agree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 8:44 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Seems when Biden slipped a few weeks ago and suggested that the degree of incursion into Ukraine would determine the magnitude of response, he knew more than he was letting on.

Also, PeterC's prediction that the invasion would start after the conclusion of the Olympics was spot on, to the day. Aside, the Russian participation in the Olympics marred by cheating did not do any good for Russia's reputation in the world. Seems the culture is saturated with cheating as the norm. smh

Malcolm wrote:

And tomorrow is defense of the fatherland day in Russia, which is when I predicted they would go in.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 8:59 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

And, sorry, but no, if Nagarjuna's logic destroys all being

Malcolm wrote:

His logic doesn't destroy anything other than faulty reasonings of others.

Dgj said:

Depends on who you ask. Some say he negated literally everything, including himself (See Stafford L Betty, "Nagarjuna's Masterpiece, Logical, Mystical, Both, or Neither?"). Others say he only ostensibly negated his immediate peers in Buddhism and closely related religions, but only by his own terms, not theirs, and that he didn't rely on valid

axioms, and didn't give the imaginary representatives of opposing views held by real people a fair shake. See Richard Robinson "Did Nagarjuna Really Refute All Philosophical Views?"

Malcolm wrote:

It doesn't depend at all on which western philosopher one asks.

Every position refuted by Nagarjuna is a historical position held by one of his contemporaries, and no, you are incorrect, he rejected the assertions of others by pointing out the unintended consequences in their theses. There is no law requiring that erroneous assertions and arguments be given a "fair shake."

Since all assertions depend on assertions of the existence and nonexistence of something, Nagarjuna shows two things: 1) the Buddha spoke intentionally of existence and nonexistence depending on the audience. 2) he reaffirmed the Buddha's own observations that dependent origination was free of the extremes of existence and nonexistence in the face of mounting misunderstanding of the Buddha's intent. That's it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 9:07 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Dgj said:

Just discovered the shentong position and these refutations and critiques of Nagarjuna recently.

Malcolm wrote:

The gzhan stong position is for the most part, merely false aspectarian yogacāra, ala Ratnākaraśanti.

gZhan stong suffers from the same internal contradiction as false aspectarian yogacāra, namely, the assertion of the transformation of a compounded consciousness into an uncompounded gnosis. It also suffers from the defect of splitting the two truths, etc.

I been studying gzhan stong etc. for 30 years, and if you want to understand its defects, they are ably pointed out by Tsongkhapa in his legs bshad snying po and in Gorampa's lta ba shan 'byed.

Dgj said:

And Nagarjuna's defects are pointed out by many as well.

Malcolm wrote:

Not so. One cannot refute a person who has no thesis of their own. Nagarjuna's sole concern is to point out deviations from dependent origination. Thus is why in the beginning of his text, he outlines three main theses of his opponents to take down:

arising from self, from other, and without cause, having declared that dependent origination pacifies proliferation about cessation, arising, and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 10:14 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Norwegian said:

Will we see anything beyond condemnations and sanctions? And if Russia decides to go into Ukraine as a whole, and not just Donetsk and Luhansk, with the inevitable war that will happen, will we still just see condemnations and sanctions from the world leaders - the same old same old that Russia couldn't give two shits about? Will the West respond with physical action? And if not, when will the West do so?

Malcolm wrote:

You will see the West send weapons and advisors. But not troops. Although there is this:

<https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/02/16/nato-considering-new-battlegroups-in-eastern-europe-to-deter-russia/>

Norwegian said:

If Russia decides Sweden or Finland is next? If they spread out further somewhere else?

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not.

Norwegian said:

At what point does the world act instead of sit idly by doing nothing? And how should Russia best be stopped or be convinced to stop?

Malcolm wrote:

Basically, Ukraine is screwed unless they put up such a fierce resistance, with western support, that Russia decides it is not worth it. But short of destroying Ukraine to save it...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 10:18 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Könchok Thrinley said:

Like the one about the Himalayan yogi that is immortal and he supposedly met.

Malcolm wrote:

Baba Ji Lives!

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahavatar\\_Babaji](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahavatar_Babaji)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 10:33 PM

Title: Re: Is there a particular barrier between the Dharma and US society/culture?

Content:

Tills ljuset tar oss said:

Generally the west is unfriendly if you are serious about the dharma.

Malcolm wrote:

I have never had this experience where I live in the US. Most people are disinterested and couldn't care less.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Norwegian said:

If Russia decides Sweden or Finland is next?

PeterC said:

Not sure about Sweden, but after the Winter War, Russia is never going to invade Finland again. Those Finns are crazy. They fought a quasi-guerilla war in -40 Celsius temperatures where about five Russians died for every Finn.

Malcolm wrote:

Plus, they keep skiing even when their dicks get frostbit.

<https://www.reuters.com/lifestyle/sports/cross-country-skiing-finn-remi-suffers-frozen-penis-mass-start-race-2022-02-20/>

PeterC said:

Lindholm explained that he used a heat pack to try to thaw out his appendage once the race was over.

"When the body parts started to warm up after the finish, the pain was unbearable," he added.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, February 22nd, 2022 at 11:55 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Ukraine is neither EU nor NATO and therefore nobody is “required” to help.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. And any move to admit it to either will certainly result in WWII.

Nevertheless, Ukraine's sovereignty should be protected by all possible means, beginning with seizing all Russian-owned assets in the US and the UK, and the expulsion of all Russian diplomats from all NATO nations, as well as removing Russia from the UN Security Council.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Is your spouse/partner a dharma person too, and if not...

Content:

PadmaVonSamba said:

Is your spouse/partner a dharma person too

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course. I wouldn't be in a relationship with someone who was not a Dharma practitioner. Done that, it doesn't work for me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 4:34 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

And no, he is not going to take over Europe. No one here thinks that. Not even the Ukraine is likely. They've already had presence in the breakaway region, so so far, not much has happened, contrary to the US predictions.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense, Dan US Intelligence has been spot on every step of the way.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 4:39 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Dan74 said:  
Ukraine is a failed state.

Malcolm wrote:  
Ok, so let's just give it the Russians. Then what?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 5:31 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:  
Nicholas2727 said:  
I am curious how this is understood by Nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:  
It understood by Nāgārjuna to mean that nirvana is something relative. You should consult chapter 9 of Āryadeva, where he refutes permanent functional phenomena. Namely he says:

In nirvana there are no aggregates  
and there cannot be a person.  
What nirvana is there for one  
who cannot be seen in nirvana?

Yogic Deeds of Bodhisattvas, pp. 211-212

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 8:39 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:  
Nicholas2727 said:  
I am curious how this is understood by Nagarjuna.

Malcolm wrote:  
It understood by Nāgārjuna to mean that nirvana is something relative. You should consult chapter 9 of Āryadeva, where he refutes permanent functional phenomena. Namely he says:

In nirvana there are no aggregates  
and there cannot be a person.  
What nirvana is there for one  
who cannot be seen in nirvana?



Yogic Deeds of Bodhisattvas, pp. 211-212

Nicholas2727 said:

I am a bit confused, how could the unborn/unconditioned/etc be relative? Is he saying that Nirvana is dependent on someone realizing it therefore it is relative? Or does Madhyamaka negate nirvana completely?

Planning on listening to this here shortly which will probably answer a lot of these questions, but I guess a more basic question I am unsure of is what enlightenment/nirvana is for madhyamaka.

<https://madhyamaka.com/2017-06-07-madhyamakavatara-week-1/>

Malcolm wrote:

The uncompounded is relative since it depends on the compounded. In other words, nirvana is a cessation. The cessation of what? The aggregates. There is nothing left over after a cessation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

And no, he is not going to take over Europe. No one here thinks that. Not even the Ukraine is likely. They've already had presence in the breakaway region, so so far, not much has happened, contrary to the US predictions.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense, Dan US Intelligence has been spot on every step of the way.

Dan74 said:

Yep and black is white.

<https://www.vox.com/2022/2/14/22933850/ukraine-war-february-16-zelensky-prediction-joke>

<https://www.rollingstone.com/politics/politics-news/ukraine-kyiv-life-potential-russian-invasion-1300869/>

Malcolm wrote:

As I said, US intelligence on this matter has been spot on. The media is not the intelligence services.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 8:07 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

You missed the point. It explains why many Ukrainians would not be so averse to being part of Russia. Especially those with ethnic or culturally Russian roots.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, about 20 percent. But this still does not justify in any way Putins continued invasion of a sovereign nation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 8:19 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

I am a bit confused, how could the unborn/unconditioned/etc be relative? Is he saying that Nirvana is dependent on someone realizing it therefore it is relative? Or does Madhyamaka negate nirvana completely?

Planning on listening to this here shortly which will probably answer a lot of these questions, but I guess a more basic question I am unsure of is what enlightenment/nirvana is for madhyamaka.

<https://madhyamaka.com/2017-06-07-madhyamakavatara-week-1/>

Malcolm wrote:

The uncompounded is relative since it depends on the compounded. In other words, nirvana is a cessation. The cessation of what? The aggregates. There is nothing left over after a cessation.

Aemilius said:

That is just plain nihilism. How would a Buddha know anything without the aggregates? I.e. without sense organs, sensation, concepts/perceptions, volitions (to teach the dharma) and consciousness?

How about the eighteen āveṇīkadharmanas of the Buddhas or the Eighteen Special Attributes of the Buddha, how would they exist?

<https://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/maha-prajnaparamita-sastra/d/doc225801.html>

Malcolm wrote:

It is no more nihilism than observing that when a fire has consumed all its fuel it ceases.

In any case, here Aryadeva is refuting assertions of permanently functional phenomena, including nirvana.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 9:28 PM

Title: Re: Averting Astrological Obstacles (Sok, Wang, Lungta, etc)

Content:

fckw said:

You can practice any yidam that subdues planetary influences.

LolCat said:

Could you please give examples of such Yidams, at least the most popular ones?

Chenda said:

Can we get a bump on this? I'm assuming "subduing" planetary influences entails wrathful deities?

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrapāṇi, generally speaking, is the best for controlling planetary spirits.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 10:12 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

but I guess a more basic question I am unsure of is what enlightenment/nirvana is for madhyamaka.

Malcolm wrote:

In this presentation which refutes permanently functioning phenomena, Gyaltsab's commentary on Aryadeva's 400 indicates that the attainment of the perception of emptiness is nirvana, during which the aggregates do not cease, and this is termed "mere nirvana."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Soma999 said:

He is not buddhist but has insights that can help human beings, whatever their religion.

Wisdom does not belong to any religion. It belongs to life, and clearly he has interesting things to say or teach.

PeterC said:

Given how close he is with the BJP and what his views on Muslims are, I'm guessing that his personal views aren't quite so ecumenical

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed, they are not:

<https://scroll.in/article/948963/how-jaggi-vasudev-has-helped-strengthen-fears-about-muslims>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, February 23rd, 2022 at 11:48 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

If the aggregates cease how are Buddha's able to help sentient beings? I've gotten the impression from teachers that nirvana is the cessation of wrong views and afflicted emotions, not the aggregates themselves but maybe I have misunderstood.

Still a bit confused as well how the unborn, unbecome, etc is relative. I understand Aryadeva's comments, but reading the Nibbana Sutta with that understanding doesn't make sense. If the unborn is what frees us from the born how could they both be relative. A relative insight freeing us from conventional reality?

Malcolm wrote:

The uncompounded is relative because without the compounded there is no such a thing. In other words, nirvana is also empty.

In any case, there are only three uncompounded dharmas: space, analytical cessation and nonanalytical cessation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 1:02 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:  
Dan74 said:  
Ukraine is a failed state.

Könchok Thrinley said:  
I am sorry to moralize here, but how the f\*\*\* dare you? Ukraine sure has corruption and other problems oh so prevalent in poorer countries, however they underwent two major revolutions where people chose freedom and accountability. It is not ideal, however clearly it works there and there is a will for improvements.

For a poor post-soviet republic with almost constant threat of Russian invasion, take over or influence they are doing a pretty good job.

Dan74 said:  
I come from there, have relatives there, visited, read and heard enough to reach this conclusion. This isn't a slight on Ukrainians, just how things turned out. I also don't know what you mean by 'a poor post-Soviet republic', it was highly industrialised, had well-educated population, natural resources, etc.

Malcolm wrote:  
It still has a well-educated population, natural resources, and so on. If it is a failing state, that is Russia's doing. But it hasn't failed yet. Strictly speaking, a failed state is one whose political or economic system has become so weak that the government is no longer in control. For example, Haiti.

Of course, Putin has openly declared, more than once, that the Ukraine isn't a state at all. In line with his Eurasian hegemonic fever dreams, he has clearly decided that Ukraine is there for the taking.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/23/world/europe/putin-speech-russia-ukraine.html>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 3:12 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Dan74 said:  
I come from there, have relatives there, visited, read and heard enough to reach this conclusion. This isn't a slight on Ukrainians, just how things turned out. I also don't know what you mean by 'a poor post-Soviet republic', it was highly industrialised, had well-educated population, natural resources, etc.

Malcolm wrote:  
It still has a well-educated population, natural resources, and so on. If it is a failing state,

that is Russia's doing. But it hasn't failed yet. Strictly speaking, a failed state is one whose political or economic system has become so weak that the government is no longer in control. For example, Haiti.

Of course, Putin has openly declared, more than once, that the Ukraine isn't a state at all. In line with his Eurasian hegemonic fever dreams, he has clearly decided that Ukraine is there for the taking.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/23/world/europe/putin-speech-russia-ukraine.html>

Dan74 said:

Yep, everything is Russia's fault, especially Ukraine's endemic corruption. Then the broken infrastructure, the dysfunctional politics, etc etc. An anecdote. When I was in Kyiv in 1999, while the relations with Russia were still good, the street lights no longer worked in many places in the city. At the main railway station I saw a pensioner holding a placard advertising her apartment for an overnight stay. Making our way through the broken asphalt in the dark streets, I heard her voice trembling with fear for letting this stranger (me) into her apartment for the night, explaining that otherwise she would not be able to pay her utility bills. Many were begging in the streets, people who've worked their whole lives.

Malcolm wrote:

Dan. I am not going to argue with you about the material conditions in a country I have never visited.

But I also know other Ukrainians. One, a Russian-speaking Jew from Donetsk, left Ukraine and moved to Israel. In the middle of his rants about Soros, etc., he explained that he was afraid of the neo-nazis in the separatist regions—an entirely valid fear.

There is no doubt Ukraine has endemic corruption, after all, the previous pro-Russian regime hired Paul Manafort as their PR guy until the government fell after the protests. However, yes, it is Russia's fault, after all, Russia was its largest trading partner til 2014 and the annexation of Crimea.

But it isn't a failed state, not yet. For example, their bond rating was moved up from b- to b; it moved up seven positions in the 2020 World Bank report. But of course there are problems, like the Ukrainian supreme court ruling anti-corruption measures unconstitutional, which then lead the IMF not to release loan money, etc.

Russia wants Ukraine for its natural resources. It's just a land grab.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 3:21 AM

Title: Re: Averting Astrological Obstacles (Sok, Wang, Lungta, etc)

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Vajrapāṇi, generally speaking, is the best for controlling planetary spirits.

tony\_montana said:

Thanks!! for those of us with difficult charts this is really helpful information. Just asking, please name a few other such deities (is Vajrabhairava, Yamari, Vajrayogini or Chakrasamvara known for such help to practitioners?)

LolCat said:

Please add Vajrakilaya to that list (does VK practice help with this?)

Malcolm wrote:

Mainly, Vajrapāṇi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 4:06 AM

Title: Re: Lojong - Offering to the Döns

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This is a post I wrote some time ago, slightly corrected.

The very simplest method is the practice of the Pretamukha-agnijvālayaśarakāra-nāma-dhāraṇī:

Early in the day, but also at any other time: into a pure vessel which is completely clean without any remnants of any food at all, place water, and holding this in one's right hand recite the following dharani seven times:

Namaḥ sarvatathāgata avalokite oṃ saṃbhara saṃbhara hūṃ

Then recite the names of these Buddhas:

Homage to the Tathāgata Many Jewels [imagine all the pretas actions of avarice of many lifetimes are destroyed and they accumulate all merits].

Homage to the Tathāgata Sublime Form [Imagine all the pretas physical sufferings are conquered and they achieve perfect forms and characteristics].

Homage to the Tathāgata Endlessly Abundant Body [Imagine all the pretas thirst is given up and satisfied, and they are satisfied with sufficient food].

Homage to the Tathāgata Free from Fear [Imagine all the pretas are free from all fears].

At the end of reciting these names, snap one's fingers three times, and pour the vessel's

contents out onto clean ground.

Having done this, one will have pacified the realms of the pretas, and satisfied them, and so on.

This instruction on how to do the practice is extracted from the root text found in volume Wam of the bstan 'gyur.

This practice is very powerful in removing provocations by non-human beings, is an extremely rapid way of reaching the end of the perfection of generosity, and so on. It requires no initiation of any kind. You can also skip reciting the Buddhas names.

Konchog1 said:

Excellent. Do you have the names of the Buddhas in Sanskrit by any chance?

Malcolm wrote:

As far as I know, they exist only as backtranslations. so not reliable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 4:33 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Nicholas2727 said:

Pretty different from the Shentong explanations I have received, but trying to research both to stay balanced. I've always been taught the uncompounded is ultimate because it is what remains after the removal of all that is false (relative). Is the uncompounded at a relative level another name for emptiness?

Malcolm wrote:

Emptiness is the fourth thing that is uncompounded, but as it is also empty...

This way of dividing the two truths is inappropriate. If there is nothing to be empty, there also isn't emptiness. There is no ultimate apart from the ultimate nature of things. Gzhan stong suffers from the same realism that yogacāra does. They assert buddhas exist but sentient beings do not. In reality, neither sentient beings nor buddhas can ever be established to exist inherently. That means both buddhas and sentient beings, samsara and nirvana, are relative and not ultimate.

Nicholas2727 said:

Also if Nirvana is empty and everything that is empty is illusory, is Nirvana illusory? I'm assuming not, but not sure how to defend that position.



Malcolm wrote:

How can what is permanent be harmed,  
or the unharmed be liberated?

Liberation is irrelevant

for one whose self is permanent.

--Yogic deeds of Bodhisattvas, pg. 223.

The general view of Madhyamaka is that everything, including buddhahood, is illusory.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 10:34 AM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

clyde said:

Interesting. Then everyone is in their own personal samsara.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course. It can't be otherwise.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:25 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:29 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 8:25 PM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

Jesse said:

Interconnection very much describes the actual state of reality, suchness.

Malcolm wrote:

In order for there to be a connection, there must be a boundary or delineation between one thing and another thing, otherwise the word “connection” has no meaning. But if, as you say, there are no boundaries or delineations, this means there are also no connections., much less “interconnection.”

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Aemilius said:

That is just plain nihilism. How would a Buddha know anything without the aggregates? I.e. without sense organs, sensation, concepts/perceptions, volitions (to teach the dharma) and consciousness?

How about the eighteen āveṇikadharmaś of the Buddhas or the Eighteen Special Attributes of the Buddha, how would they exist?

<https://www.wisdomlib.org/buddhism/book/maha-prajnaparamita-sastra/d/doc225801.html>

Malcolm wrote:

It is no more nihilism than observing that when a fire has consumed all its fuel it ceases.

Aemilius said:

The nihilistic nirvana is refuted in the Mahayana sutras like the White Lotus sutra,

Malcolm wrote:

Where do you suppose afflictions go when they cease?

Mahayana texts do not negate nirvana at all, in fact they observe that all phenomena are in a state of nirvana from the beginning as nothing ever arose anywhere at any time. This is also taught in the Saddharmapundarika.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

I don't care how poor or corrupt the country is, Ukraine and the Ukrainian people don't deserve this.

Dan74 said:

Of course not. It is not only criminal, it seems like a lose-lose proposition. I really don't understand how Putin could hold the Ukraine. Perhaps he plans to annexe the country, install a puppet regime under an autonomy, and maintain Russian military bases throughout. Doesn't seem realistic though. Western Ukrainians especially hate Russians. I just can't see them accepting it. But maybe I'm I'm wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

Dan, he made his intent quite clear: Ukraine is not a country, it has no right exist, kind of like the PLO etc., declaring Israel has no right to exist. He plans on taking over the country, it's as plain as the nose on your face.

Save a full-scale war with the EU, there is nothing to prevent him from annexing the whole of Ukraine. He's betting the blood cost is too high for Europe and the US.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 9:41 PM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

Jesse said:

Interconnection very much describes the actual state of reality, suchness.

Malcolm wrote:

In order for there to be a connection, there must be a boundary or delineation between one thing and another thing, otherwise the word "connection" has no meaning. But if, as you say, there are no boundaries or delineations, this means there are also no connections., much less "interconnection."

Jesse said:

So you are denying interdependence teachings then?

Malcolm wrote:

You are one who made the assertion there are no delineations between one thing and another thing, not me. I am just pointing out the consequences of your assertion.

Interdependence is just a convention for causes and conditions, and they are themselves just conventions. Upon analysis, one cannot find a cause or a condition anywhere, so how could one find an interconnection?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 10:01 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:  
Here, people are in shock.

Malcolm wrote:  
They shouldn't be. Our intelligence agencies have been making Putin's intention clear for weeks.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 10:37 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

PeterC said:  
Well, that depends on what his definition of winning is. He doesn't need to control the whole territory. Perhaps he's ok with controlling the Russian-dominated regions in the east...

Malcolm wrote:  
His rhetoric does not indicate this at all.

As of right now, the military air base outside of Kyiv has been seized by Russian paratroopers. You don't do that unless you are preparing for a full regime change.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 10:41 PM  
Title: Re: This One Mind is You  
Content:

Jesse said:  
I made the assertion that these delineations are imagined. Not non-existent, or existent.

Malcolm wrote:  
So imagined things are existent or nonexistent? You followed up your statement by claiming interconnectedness. I merely pointed out that connections require delineations, and moreover, separation, otherwise it makes no sense to talk of "connections" between things that are not separated.

Jesse said:  
Well then, what's there left to discuss then?

Malcolm wrote:  
Conventions, of course, which is all anyone ever discusses.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

Jesse said:

According to this theory, any phenomenon exists only as part of the total nexus of reality, its existence depends on the total network of all other things, which are all equally connected to each other and contained in each other.[24]

Malcolm wrote:

This theory does not go beyond the *kāraṇa* *hetu* theory of the Sarvastivādins, that is, all things are the cause of all other things but themselves.

This theory is negated by Nāgārjuna in chapter one of the MMK.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:16 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

I'm sure he wants to decapitate the existing regime, but whether he wants to stand up something coherent in its place? If his objective is to have a territorial buffer, he may not need to

Malcolm wrote:

I think we all can see the writing on the wall.

Protracted insurgencies, which he has an appetite for, etc. Destroy Ukraine to "save it."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

Jesse said:

According to this theory, any phenomenon exists only as part of the total nexus of reality,

its existence depends on the total network of all other things, which are all equally connected to each other and contained in each other.[24]

Malcolm wrote:

This theory does not go beyond the kārāṇa hetu theory of the Sarvastivādins, that is, all things are the cause of all other things but themselves.

This theory is negated by Nāgārjuna in chapter one of the MMK.

Jesse said:

I have serious doubt that that is the case.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, until you subject it to analysis, you won't know, will you? Since all cause and condition is determined by Nāgārjuna to be mere convention, statements like this, "any phenomenon exists only as part of the total nexus of reality" are subject to the analysis of one vs. many. As Śāntirakṣita points out:

Because these entities asserted by ourselves (buddhists) and others (nonbuddhists) are in reality free from a nature of being one or many, they lack inherent existence, like a reflection.

This equally to proposed entities such as a "total nexus of reality." You can say a car is a nexus of parts, but in reality you will not find a car in its parts, separate from its parts, nor in all of its part together. This claim above is the same: you can call all phenomena together reality, but you will not find reality in any one phenomena, separated from phenomena, or in all phenomena together. You will also be unable to find any phenomena which can support the existence of any other phenomena either alone or in concert. For example, a car cannot be supported on any of the phenomena which we assemble into a car, a car is merely conventional designation for a collection of parts which does not indicate anything real. As Nāgārjuna famously stated, "whatever arises in dependence, that is empty, that is dependently designated, and that is the middle way."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:47 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

In other news, Russian troops are fighting to take over Chernobyl at significant risk to the EU.

<https://www.mirror.co.uk/news/world-news/breaking-russian-forces-enter-chernobyl-26320432>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, February 24th, 2022 at 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

Are you suggesting there is no changed in Madhyamaka philosophy since Nagarjuna's time? Then, you might not be accurate. That is what I intended to say "gradually evolved".

Malcolm wrote:

There are some differences in pedagogy, but there is no real evolution in Madhyamaka thought. How could there be? Mādhyamikas do not make propositions concerning the ultimate. They did respond to the assertions of others, and where there is disagreement among Mādhyamikas, it is disagreement over pedagogy alone, how to respond to the assertions of other buddhists and nonbuddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 12:00 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

ManiThePainter said:

Either that or it was all orchestrated to show Putin's "iron-will" and "right to rule."

Dan74 said:

No way Naryshkin's performance was orchestrated. No no, this makes no sense within the Kremlin modus operandi. Have you watched the vid?

ManiThePainter said:

I did. I found it odd that it would be released if not to send a message. Putin has a tight grip on the media in Russia. It could also be that it is meant to show discord within higher Russian political circles so as to make it look like Russia is "hesitant" to invade.

Malcolm wrote:

That's all moot now. Just hope that the fighting around Chernobyl doesn't take a turn for

the worse, and unleash fall out from its waste facilities.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 1:55 AM

Title: Re: How can one access Dudjom Tersar centers/ngondro in the West?

Content:

Nalanda said:

Can one practice Dodjum Tersar ngondro and another ngondro or would that be redundant?

Malcolm wrote:

Redundant.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 3:35 AM

Title: Re: Please recommend Longchen Nyingtik ngondro teachers with zoom/livestream

Content:

Nalanda said:

Try it for 10-20 years and then ignore whatever else are out there? Is that what you'd recommend?

Malcolm wrote:

Five, anyway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There are some differences in pedagogy, but there is no real evolution in Madhyamaka thought. How could there be? Mādhyamikas do not make propositions concerning the ultimate. They did respond to the assertions of others, and where there is disagreement among Mādhyamikas, it is disagreement over pedagogy alone, how to respond to the assertions of other buddhists and nonbuddhists.

haha said:

There is no disagreement with your statement. But I cannot agree/resolve it is just the same.

Malcolm wrote:



Then you would have to show where there is a significant difference between Indian Mādhyamikas, other than pedagogical approach.

If you cannot, well, then your assertion isn't warranted.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

He made his first statement in his karika and it took thirteen verses proved his own statement. He also has position.

Malcolm wrote:

And that is?

haha said:

He has started his karika which his position/thesis: eightfold negation.

Malcolm wrote:

Maṅgalaṃ of the MMK is not a thesis, it is praise to the Buddha based on a passage from the PP Sūtras, but it is not a thesis.

haha said:

He has made position by saying “there are only four conditions, not fifth”;

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is his opponent's position. Please examine Buddhapaṇita's commentary, pg. 26.

haha said:

other traditions have more conditions; it is trying to imposing his conditions to other. There are more.

Malcolm wrote:

The opponent here is a Sarvāstivādin. The Sarvāstivādins propose a system of six causes and four conditions. See chapter two of the Abidharmakośaśābhaṣya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 4:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

I doubt it. If it persists they will most likely get "tiannemen squared".

KristenM said:

Judy trying to keep some hope. "The only thing we have to fear is fear itself," and all that jazz.

Shinjin said:

There's no hope under authoritarian dictators. Only death and despair.

Malcolm wrote:

Not so, there is considerable room for advancement in the hierarchy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nalanda said:

Wow. This is the thread. Thanks.

Team USA USA USA.

Hot dogs and burgers.

Malcolm wrote:

Those are not really American.

Now if you had said tacos, tamales, and tequila, those actually do come from America.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

Him and the oligarchs that rule Russia are capitalists through and through.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really. Capitalism requires free markets and competition. Putin doesn't want free markets and he doesn't like liberal democracy. He wants corporations subordinate to the state. He is a classical corporatist.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 5:45 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

On the other tack, here's a thoughtful lecture from John Mearsheimer on the causes of this crisis, which he lays at the feet of the US.

Malcolm wrote:

Principally this is his point:

Q: Now Russia and China are cultivating a friendly relationship premised on the U.S. as their common enemy. Do you think Russia and China will be compatible in their stances toward Asia?

A: The U.S. has foolishly driven the Russians into the arms of the Chinese. I think Russia is the natural ally of the U.S. against China.

In 1969, the Soviet Union and China almost fought a war in Siberia. The Soviet Union and China -- and now we're talking about Russia and China -- have a history of bad relations, in large part because they share a border and each occupies big chunks of real estate in Asia. Russia should be an ally of the U.S. against China, and the U.S. needs all the allies it can get to contain China.

But what we have done by expanding NATO eastward is we have precipitated a huge crisis with Russia that prevents us from fully pivoting to Asia. We can't fully pivot to Asia because we're so concerned about events in Eastern Europe. That's the first consequence. The second is that we have driven the Russians into the arms of the Chinese. This makes no sense at all.

Q: The current tensions along the Ukraine border raise the question of whether the U.S. is capable of dealing with European and Asian issues simultaneously.

A: Let me chose my words carefully. The U.S. has the capability to deal with a conflict in Europe and a conflict in Asia at the same time.

However, it does not have the capability to perform well in both campaigns at the same time. By getting involved in a conflict in Eastern Europe, we, the U.S., are detracting from our ability to contain China and to fight a war against China, should one break out.

<https://asia.nikkei.com/Editor-s-Picks/Interview/U.S.-engagement-with-China-a-strategic-blunder-Mearsheimer>

And there you have it. We will not rescue Ukraine because of Taiwan. And Taiwan is more important to US interests.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 7:27 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

And this is something the US would never allow in reverse as per the Munroe doctrine.

Malcolm wrote:

You are mistating the Monroe Doctrine:

“We should consider any attempt on their part to extend their system to any portion of this hemisphere as dangerous to our peace and safety. With the existing colonies or dependencies of any European power we have not interfered and shall not interfere. But with the Governments who have declared their independence and maintained it... we could not view any interposition for the purpose of oppressing them, or controlling in any other manner their destiny, by any European power in any other light than as the manifestation of an unfriendly disposition toward the United States.”

So, Russia's attitude is in fact completely different than the Monroe Doctrine. They do not respect the Ukrainian Government's independence, and they have in fact actively sought to undermine it for decades now. What did Putin say Tuesday?

"Ukraine has never had its own authentic statehood. There has never been a sustainable statehood in Ukraine."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 8:20 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

Plus you were around at the time of the Cuban Missiles crisis, no?

Malcolm wrote:

I was an extremely precocious five month old.

In any case, the US response was dictated by the Platt amendment of 1903:

American foreign policy was further aided by the 1903 Platt Amendment, which stated that the “government of Cuba shall never enter into any treaty or other compact with any foreign power or powers which will impair or tend to impair the independence of Cuba, nor... authorize or permit any foreign power... to obtain by... military or naval purposes... lodgment in or control over any portion of said island” and that the “government of Cuba consented that the United States may exercise the right to intervene for the... maintenance of a government adequate for the protection of life,

property, and individual liberty”

<https://colinatoxford.wordpress.com/about/to-what-extent-was-the-monroe-doctrine-invoked-during-the-cuban-missile-crisis/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nalanda said:

Yes, from his perspective, we are definitely aggressor.

Malcolm wrote:

Paranoid megalomaniacs like Putin always think they are the victim.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 10:25 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nalanda said:

Yes, from his perspective, we are definitely aggressor.

Malcolm wrote:

Paranoid megalomaniacs like Putin always think they are the victim.

Nalanda said:

Things were never the same for Vlad when he saw NATO aircraft shoots Gaddafi's convoy, then his own people beating, sodomizing, and publicly executing him while Hillary laughs and says "We came, we saw, he died."

Vlad fears he's next.

Malcolm wrote:

That was the British settling a grudge: Lockerbie. Clinton's words were honest. She would have made an excellent president. Putin was genuinely afraid of her.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 10:53 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nalanda said:

This stopped being true when people ceased being serfs. Today, people and countries are aligned by ideologies, not geography. If you meant Slavic culture, well, I think the Ukrainians have spoken. ("No" because they have other ideologies that are more in line with the West) If you meant the Russians within Ukraine, yeah and they're the minority.

Bundokji said:

I guess the cold war was an attempt to prove that ideology can trump geography, but it failed. The spheres of influence that are emerging in the world seem to be more driven by geography. China's sphere of influence is the south China sea (and that includes the Philippines). Russia is trying to protect its sphere of influence. Iran's sphere of influence is the Persian gulf. Turkey, a major NATO country turned its back to Europe and is trying to join its natural sphere of influence in the south and the East.

On the other hand, western democracies (an ideology) deviate from this more-natural rule and are causing divisions. Europe is becoming more divided especially after Brexit, while anglo-saxons are trying to form alliances based on ethnicity and history such as US, Britain and AUS (they gave the middle finger recently to France over the submarines deal hence France is showing some sympathy to Russia according to Macron).

Malcolm wrote:

Since what Putin wants is irrelevant to Ukrainian aspirations, (they want the obvious benefits of western democracy), Putin has exercised his paranoid megalomania and invaded a bordering Sovereign nation, an invasion that began in 2014 when the Ukrainian people chased out his corrupt puppet regime. In 2019 they held fair elections and voted in the present government.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 11:40 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

The west has its track record in spreading democracy against the will of the people.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. That's a contradiction in terms. It is not possible.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

He made his first statement in his karika and it took thirteen verses proved his own statement. He also has position.

Malcolm wrote:

And that is?

haha said:

Karika's first verse.

It is his premise: No existents whatsoever are evident (utpannā jātu vidyante). From themselves, from another, from both, or from a non-cause.

Malcolm wrote:

No, these are not his positions. These are four positions taken by those he intends to negate. For example, the first, origination from self is the position of the Sāṃkhya, and so on. This is quite clear in Buddhapaṇṇāsa, etc.

haha said:

To validate above premise, he provided four conditions and then refuted them (pratyaya, kriya, utpada, bhanga, alambana, anantara, adhipati, phala) in thirteen verses.

Malcolm wrote:

Nope. The four conditions referred to are not his position.

haha said:

Maṅgalaṃ of the MMK is not a thesis, it is praise to the Buddha based on a passage from the PP Sūtras, but it is not a thesis.

That Maṅgalastūti is the thesis. Intended meaning of these verses is the summary of Madhyamaka theory. If one understands their meaning, then she/he completely gets Nāgārjuna's intention.

Malcolm wrote:

They are not a thesis per se, they are descriptive, not prescriptive. A negation cannot be defined as a premise. Those are eight negations, not eight premises.

haha said:

That is the Madhyama reading assuming these verses are said to the such and such opponents. But one can read it very differently.

Malcolm wrote:

One would be incorrect to do so, since there is universal agreement among all commentaries as to which passages belong to the opponent, and which are Nāgārjuna's replies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/02/ukraine-russia-war-nato-biden-deterrence/622873/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 10:47 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, February 25th, 2022 at 11:44 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nalanda said:

Christian missionary of course can be very good. No? So yes, its like that. Thank God.

Bundokji said:

Not really, unless you hold human well-being hostage to it through propaganda. Spreading democracy seems to be a form of secular Jihad, a pretext to serve narrow interests and a complete disregard of the suffering caused under shiny slogans.

Malcolm wrote:

This is just rhetoric.

Bundokji said:

Nations better focus on fixing their own house first, and there is plenty to be improved if energy and focus are directed towards more wholesome objectives.

Malcolm wrote:

People in the US, even the most poor, even the homeless, are demonstrably better off than people in countries with no democracy.

Bundokji said:

Just contemplate the difference between American pragmatism and the pragmatism taught by the lord Buddha as per the poisoned arrow simile. The former turned into a justification for serving the interests of elites, and the later is the setting aside of ideology and focusing on what is essential for human well-being.



Malcolm wrote:

The Buddha did not institute a social system, or a system of government. He taught a path of liberation. He also recommended social solutions for well being. Not invading your neighbor was included in that.

Bundokji said:

Is it essential for the Ukrainian people at this point of time to join the NATO in order to implement necessary reforms when having a paranoid neighbor?

Malcolm wrote:

Ukrainians think so.

Bundokji said:

When democracy is presented as an ideology, alternatives are presented as false dilemmas.

Malcolm wrote:

This is a non sequitur.

Bundokji said:

In this ideological mindset, the highest value to be preserved is their right of self-determination even if this goes against their own self interest.

Malcolm wrote:

The right to self determination never goes against anyone's interest, other than those who would seek to take that right away.

Bundokji said:

Under this state of affairs, it is Putin to blame, and we should engage into endless ethical and legal debates to determine responsibility while the people of Ukraine are being bombarded. At the end of the day, we are convinced that this is what civilized people do!

Malcolm wrote:

This is how one lady feels about Putin trying to deprive her of her right to self-determination:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 12:07 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, these are not his positions. These are four positions taken by those he intends to negate. For example, the first, origination from self is the position of the Saṃkhya, and so on. This is quite clear in Buddhapaṇḍita, etc.

haha said:

The Pursha of the Saṃkhya is beggingless. It does not have any cause.

Malcolm wrote:

You clearly have not read a qualified commentary of the MMK. You have not done your homework. Get back to me when you have read Buddhapaṇḍita.

haha said:

Nope. The four conditions referred to are not his position.

As long as one makes statement, one has position.

Malcolm wrote:

Nāgārjuna identifies an opinion he does have, namely one: the indestructible (avipranāśa) of the Ārya-saṃmitiyas is his preferred conventional account of karma and its results. Other than that, he does not present opinions of his own at all in the MMK.

The point that you seem to miss is that when it is said by Nāgārjuna that he has no position, it means he makes no ontological claims with respect to existence and nonexistence, or specifically, svabhāva.

It does not mean he has no opinion with respect to the value of the Mahāyāna, medical care for the indigent, and so on, in other words, he may have positions regarding conventional things, but he neither defends nor advances positions regarding existence and nonexistence.

haha said:

I am not saying they are eight premises, either. I am only saying it is a summery or it is his position (dedicatory verse).

Malcolm wrote:

[/quote]

Nāgārjuna here is merely stating that the Buddha taught dependent origination to pacify proliferation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 12:24 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:  
Shinjin said:  
Another power hungry sociopath.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nah, you give her too much power, and listen to too much right wing agitprop.

But Putin was terrified of her. He apparently obsessively watched the Qadafi video over and over again.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 12:27 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 12:46 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
This is just rhetoric.

Bundokji said:  
This is where we differ. I am arguing that holding human well-being to ideology is just rhetoric. It is no coincident that ideologies are often associated with utopian promises, be it democracy or otherwise.

Malcolm wrote:  
Liberal democracy is not a utopian ideal. It is pragmatic.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 2:06 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Johnny Dangerous said:  
Sometimes there is skepticism around claims of “supporting democratic values” etc. because it seems just a cover for an economic program that isn’t necessarily democratic at all.

Malcolm wrote:  
Democracy takes work. The Ukrainians put in the work. We should support that.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 3:15 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Yup:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 4:03 AM  
Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?  
Content:

Aemilius said:  
The nihilistic nirvana is refuted in the Mahayana sutras like the White Lotus sutra,

Malcolm wrote:  
Where do you suppose afflictions go when they cease?

Mahayana texts do not negate nirvana at all, in fact they observe that all phenomena are in a state of nirvana from the beginning as nothing ever arose anywhere at any time. This is also taught in the Saddharmapundarika.

Aemilius said:  
Who or what sees the absence of afflictions?

Nirvana as literal cessation is refuted, see for example MMK ch. 25:

Malcolm wrote:  
If something does not arise, it cannot cease. And as N clarifies in this chapter, nirvana is not an entity, compounded or otherwise. Instead just a name for emptiness, as he makes very clear.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 4:10 AM  
Title: Re: Please recommend Longchen Nyingtik ngondro teachers with zoom/livestream  
Content:  
Arnoud said:  
I hate to say it but I think the world holder is missing. Like principle lineage holder.

Malcolm wrote:  
No, I meant exactly what I said, a principle lineage in which there are many holders of

the lineage, not only one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 4:25 AM

Title: Re: Please recommend Longchen Nyingtik ngondro teachers with zoom/livestream

Content:

Arnoud said:

I hate to say it but I think the world holder is missing. Like principle lineage holder.

Malcolm wrote:

No, I meant exactly what I said, a principle lineage in which there are many holders of the lineage, not only one.

Arnoud said:

Ah, my bad. Since you often recommended connecting to one of the lineage heads I figured that was the case here as well.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, I have said that many times.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 7:26 AM

Title: Re: Best English Translation of Mulamadhyamikakarika

Content:

Nalanda said:

The Siderits and Katsura one won the Khyentse Foundation prize 2014.

Archie2009 said:

And the authors draw on all four Indian commentaries for their own commentary.

Malcolm wrote:

The Coughlin translation is my preference these days, 'cause Buddhapalita.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 9:19 AM

Title: Re: Relating with war

Content:

Nalanda said:

[Mod note: moved as off topic from the subforum Tibetan Buddhism.

For me, causes and effects are quite clear.

If I keep provoking a bear, poking it with a stick for 20 years, I won't be surprised if it

suddenly growls and tries to bite.

I wish we can all just be friends.

reipun said:

Yeah, that free election of Zelensky was quite a 'poke'. . .

Sorry, I don't think I want to be friends with Putin

Malcolm wrote:

Yeah, how dare Ukraine have free elections...the nerve of those people...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 9:25 AM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

clyde said:

but these practices are Tibetan Buddhist practices, not Zen.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, sending and receiving comes from Nagarjuna in the second century,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 11:17 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 12:57 PM

Title: Re: Best English Translation of Mulamadhyamikakarika

Content:

Shaiksha said:

Ornament of Reason by Mabja Jangchub Tsondu

I have heard good things about the book and is apparently widely respected and studied by Tibetans. Though, I have not read it myself but this is high on my reading list for the Madhyamaka philosophy.

Malcolm wrote:

It's ok, Coughlin's book is better. Buddhapalita is the definitive commentary on MMK.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 8:15 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You clearly have not read a qualified commentary of the MMK. You have not done your homework. Get back to me when you have read Buddhapalita.

haha said:

You are quite dismissive towards me for not reading Buddhapalita.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not possible to understand MMK without reading Buddhapalita, or, Bocking's translation of the Pingala commentary preserved in Chinese.

haha said:

Studying Nagarjuna's other writings should be considered reading the qualified materials for the MMK.

Malcolm wrote:

Not if you are unable to identify who is saying what to whom in the text, for example, Kalupahana's stillbirth of a translation utterly misconstrues nearly all of MMK because he tried to understand the text without relying on Buddhapalita. You have also misconstrued exactly the same points he did. Therefore, read Buddhapalita and get back to me. You will thank me.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 8:43 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

Membership in NATO is symbolically important, sure, but if you wanted Ukraine to remain independent, you should have given it weapons...

Malcolm wrote:

Vindman blames Trump:

<https://apple.news/AM8pYTAblRzy5o560t0oogQ>

PeterC said:

Vindman told VICE News on Friday that Trump's decision to withhold the badly needed military aid hurt the country's ability to defend itself—and emboldened Russian President Vladimir Putin. And while Vindman doesn't let President Biden off the hook,

he puts much of the blame for Putin's invasion squarely on Trump.  
"It's because of Trump's corruption that we have a less capable, less prepared Ukraine,"  
Vindman said.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 9:13 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Maybe accurate?

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 11:35 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Norwegian said:

For example, Putin can still withdraw, and claim that he "taught the Ukrainian rebels a lesson" or some bullshit nonsense like that, if that's the spin he wants to put on it, to save face. But if he just keeps going and going, it won't end well (for him).

Svalaksana said:  
Thanks for the input on the Norwegian assessment, seems rather on-point.

I too think Putin has painted himself into a corner, although I think he can't even pull off the "lesson to Ukrainian rebels" convincingly even in Russia, no matter how much he might try to push that narrative through the media.

Right now if he retreats or concedes in any way on potential negotiations (ones in which Zelensky will not budge now that the rest of the world backs him), it's an embarrassing defeat since everyone knows he wanted to obliterate the concept of Ukraine altogether. If Putin however goes all the way, it will isolate himself and Russia, leading the nation down the drain. Either way he loses, his reputation is now in the mud and I'm pretty sure this will be the beginning of the end of his reign.

Malcolm wrote:  
NATO gets involved now, since the Ukrainians have shown their resolve. When Russians hit the NATO ally resupply transports, it all blows up.

I just watched Poroshenko on CNN for 20 minutes. Yes, I know he is a crook, but at least he is a pro-democracy crook who handed power over over to Zelensky peacefully.

Either Putin withdraws, or he faces the prospect of a years long war over territory he cannot afford.



Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, February 26th, 2022 at 11:48 PM  
Title: Re: This One Mind is You  
Content:  
Way-Fun said:  
You cannot understand your way to realization.

Malcolm wrote:  
Sure you can.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 12:37 AM  
Title: Re: This One Mind is You  
Content:  
Way-Fun said:  
Can you say more?

Malcolm wrote:  
Without understanding, realization isn't possible. MMK 24:8-10

The dharma explained by the Buddha properly relies on two truths:  
mundane relative truth and ultimate truth.  
One who does not understand the distinction between the two truths  
will not understand the profound principle of the Buddha's doctrine.  
Without relying on convention, the ultimate cannot be explained;  
without realizing the ultimate, nirvana cannot be attained.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 12:58 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 1:07 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Ukrainians last night:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Unarmed Ukrainians facing down Russian tanks:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 1:55 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Dorje Shedrub said:  
Maybe some or many will refuse to fight.

Malcolm wrote:  
Quite a few are abandoning their uniforms and APC's, so I have heard.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 1:59 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 2:12 AM  
Title: Re: Relating with war  
Content:  
tobes said:  
i.e. assuming one sees this as an unjust war, one might feel certain sentiments when Ukrainian forces have defensive victories, therefore subtly rejoicing in killing, harming etc.

Malcolm wrote:  
This is all on Putin.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 2:46 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:  
On the other hand, I just saw video of a Russian tank or APC turning out of its way to crush an occupied car...

Malcolm wrote:

That may have been a Ukrainian vehicle, and it is clear the driver actually lost control of it. I don't think it was deliberate.

Dorje Shedrub said:

and also Russian ship firing on an island after the Ukrainian border guards told the ship to go F themselves.

Malcolm wrote:

That happened.

Dorje Shedrub said:

Makes me wonder how the majority of the everyday Russian soldier feels.

Malcolm wrote:

Shitting their pants and wishing they were home.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Ayu said:

No need for expensive deadly weapons then.

Malcolm wrote:

So we wish, but unfortunately, Russia has started a war in Europe they can never win (their economy is too small compared to NATO), and the cost will be terrible for everyone in Europe. But NATO really has no choice. They have to stand together against Putin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Passing By said:

What is the topic of each of the Seventeen Tantras?

sgra thal 'gyur --> Root Tantra

rig pa rang shar --> Explanatory Tantra

yi ge med pa --> Trekcho

sgron ma 'bar ba --> Thogal

What about the rest? Especially Dorsem snying gi melong and mu tig rin po che'i phreng ba since they seem to be mentioned a lot in Longchenpa's Choying Dzo and its autocommentary

Malcolm wrote:

They all have complete presentations of Dzogchen. But you can find summaries of their contents in the Treasury of Philosophical Systems.

There are seven that are the most important: The Sound Tantra, Without Syllables, Blazing Lamp, Introduction Tantra, Blazing Relics, Union of Sun and Moon, and the Beautiful Good Fortune.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 4:00 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

On the other hand, I just saw video of a Russian tank or APC turning out of its way to crush an occupied car...

Malcolm wrote:

That may have been a Ukrainian vehicle, and it is clear the driver actually lost control of it. I don't think it was deliberate.

Confirmed, it was indeed a Russian vehicle.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 5:02 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 6:37 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

It's kinda hard at this point to tell what is true and what is propaganda.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really.

Dan74 said:

Many people familiar with the history explain how Russia has been treated disgracefully by the US over the past 14 years.

Malcolm wrote:  
Nonsense.

Dan74 said:  
There needs to be a give-and-take on both sides

Malcolm wrote:  
There is no reason for Ukraine to give up anything. Zelensky was duly elected in a democratic fashion, soundly defeating Poroshenko in 2019. Russia has violated Ukraine's borders twice now in the past 8 years. The person who needs to stop or be stopped is Putin.

Dan74 said:  
Giving some respect to Russia,

Malcolm wrote:  
Putin is the problem, not Russia per se. Putin is a thug and deserves no respect whatsoever. As long as he is in power, Europe is not safe. Putin actually threatened to use nuclear weapons against Europe. You are quite insane if you think that Putin can be reasoned with.

Dan74 said:  
like that hapless German admiral recently said, is the way forward and it may well encourage more positive development at home. I think it was no coincidence that NATO aggressive expansion

Malcolm wrote:  
NATO did not "aggressively expand." Former republics in the USSR, etc., sought to join NATO of their own accord. They were invited to join NATO in 2002 and 2004, etc. Ukraine sought to join NATO as well. They have a right to join NATO if that is what they choose to do. They are a sovereign nation, not kindergarten children whose parents choose who they can play with.

Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, etc., all joined NATO and the EU because of the net benefit of belonging to Europe and NATO as a whole. The notion that Putin is invading Ukraine to create a buffer between him and NATO is facially absurd, since if he succeeds, he will have two problems he did not have before: 1) he will be occupying a country, supplied with arms from NATO, which will fight him tooth and nail 2) he will have no buffer zone since his border will be a border with NATO.

I know you come from the Ukraine, but are you Ukrainian or Russian? Do tell. I understand that there are Ukrainian Russians who sympathize with Russia and that there are Ukrainian Russians who don't. But Ukraine is not Russia, never has been, and never will be. Russia needs to go home before more of their kids are pushing up

sunflowers in a foreign country.

Russia ceasing hostilities, removing their troops, and withdrawing their "recognition" of the separatist regions is the only way this goes well for everyone.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 6:47 AM

Title: Re: This One Mind is You

Content:

clyde said:

Yes, all dharmas are empty and Buddha taught emptiness.

But, except for those fully awakened, we are experiencing appearances (delusions). I have my delusions and you have your delusions which are unique. It is the goal of Buddhism to see through our delusions and experience reality, but until then we are each in our private samsara.

Malcolm wrote:

There are two kinds of delusion, clyde. Delusion concerning the nature of things (for example, believing in svabhāva, self, and so on) and delusion concerning the aspect of things (two moons in the sky). Most of us do not suffer from the latter. All of us suffer from the former.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 9:34 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

I simply do not see any glimmer of good will on Putin's part. At this point, things are too far gone. Russia will need a change of leadership.

Malcolm wrote:

They've tried, but Putin keeps poisoning his opposition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 10:04 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

However bad Putin is, there's going to be a large segment of Russian government/business/citizenry who still think that they need him because the alternative is chaos. And they are to some degree correct. Post-Putin Russia will not be

a smooth ride.

What should have happened is that post-Medvedev they should have resisted Putin taking back the presidency. That's when things started to go seriously wrong - when he stopped pretending.

Malcolm wrote:

Not different than the tyrants before him.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

SkyFox said:

Although I don't know much, from my limited understanding, Putin is sick with Parkinson and Cancer. With his illness, age, and stress, I wouldn't be surprised if he has mental health issues. Nothing's worse than a madman who can literally end the world on a whim.

Malcolm wrote:

Whatever else may be wrong with him, he is certainly suffering from paranoia and delusion, and clearly is emotionally unstable.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Ayu said:

Another strangely surrealistic question. Have you read Dan's post to his last question?

amanitamusc said:

Of course. Dan is an apologist for Putty's bad behavior.

Dan74 said:

No. If you actually cared to read what I said, I said multiple times that my posts were about the lead up to the crisis, not this criminal invasion. It's hard to separate the two for many, and the usual pundits are falling over each other to declare it as proof and validation of their rotten behaviour to Russia over all these years.

Many people cheered for the Joker, after all the shit he'd been through, when he went ballistic at those privileged c&#^ts on the train. This is how many Russians are seeing this latest event. What the Joker did was not right, nor is the analogy quite right, the last thing Ukrainians need or deserve is Russian missiles raining on them, but just to make it

a little easier to understand:

[http://kiis.com.ua/?lang=eng&cat=reports&id=1015&page=1&fbclid=IwAR107dbpt4RZyfbnHNuBOavPi\\_Weh97xi2PjNmPRu0sxRuAOcFSnRUTpA48](http://kiis.com.ua/?lang=eng&cat=reports&id=1015&page=1&fbclid=IwAR107dbpt4RZyfbnHNuBOavPi_Weh97xi2PjNmPRu0sxRuAOcFSnRUTpA48)

The Russians see the US as the culprit in all this, not the Ukrainians.

Malcolm wrote:

Really? I thought it was neo Nazis, drug addicts, and that elderly billionaire, Soros, that had them rattled.

If any Ukrainian questioned the wisdom of joining NATO before Wed, they don't now.

BTW, Dan, the opinions of one political scientist do not render your statements factual. The fact is that Ukraine is in the process of turning itself into a modern liberal democracy. Putin hates democracy. Those two things are facts.

This is just Putin's Sudetenland move. The sad thing is all those Russian kids he us sending out to the slaughter. They don't deserve it any more than the Ukrainians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 9:26 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

amanitamusc said:

Of course. Dan is an apologist for Putty's bad behavior.

Dan74 said:

. Sorry if this sounds like gobbledygook to you, or to some others, but in this world, things are rarely black-and-white.

amanitamusc said:

No need to be sorry i am used to it in your posts.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, we are all used to Dan's nuanced opinions. Putin invades Ukraine, Dan wants to pin the blame on the US. Somehow, in Dan's mind, it's all our leadership's fault that Putin feels so bad about himself, that he rigged his election that he murdered, poisoned, and jailed his opposition, and then he had to round up 190k soldiers with thermobaric rockets, cluster bombs, tanks, APCs, etc., and send them to decapitate a sovereign nation next door. And it's all the USA's fault. What a f\*\*king joke.

Here is another political scientists point of view, instead faulting the US for being too



soft:

Why Is Putin at War Again? Because He Keeps Winning.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/25/opinion/putin-war-russia-military.html?>

Finally, when Trump praises something, one just knows it's wrong.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nemo said:

For 30 years many of us in the military have been saying extending NATO East against our explicit promise would cause a military crisis. We pushed for years. This was inevitable. If China wanted to put troops and missiles in Canada no one would spare us a moment of pity. This combined with the endless hypocrisy and racism after the wholesale murder in countless countries by America makes them look utterly ridiculous. Malcolm complaining about thermobaric weapons is especially pathetic. Weapons widely used by US forces in it's illegal occupation of Iraq and used extensively in Fallujah on civilians. Anyone who speaks like an adult is a traitor now. The double standard is so odious. If only resistance fighters in the countries you invaded were treated so well. Your opinion is might makes right. You have zero moral authority.

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/2/27/western-media-coverage-ukraine-russia-invasion-criticism>

Malcolm wrote:

For the record, I opposed both Iraq wars and Afghanistan.

As for NATO expansion, you are incorrect. There was no such promise at all: The main issue highlighted by the crisis on the Ukraine borders over the past few months has predominantly focused on the role of Nato and the friction over the eastward expansion of the alliance. This has been a constant message emerging from the Kremlin: that the Nato membership of many parts of the old Soviet Bloc, and the prospective membership of Ukraine to the alliance, poses a threat to Russian sovereignty.

But the decision to accept former members of the Warsaw Pact, the defensive alliance which included the USSR and several eastern European countries, is being subject to a revisionist history. This is perpetuating a myth that Nato promised not to expand eastwards after the Soviet Union dissolved.

In 2014, the former Soviet leader Mikhail Gorbachev marked the 25th anniversary of the fall of the Berlin wall by noting in an interview that that Nato's enlargement "was not discussed at all" at the time:

Not a single Eastern European country raised the issue, not even after the Warsaw Pact ceased to exist in 1991. Western leaders didn't bring it up, either.

There was, he said, no promise not to enlarge the alliance, though in the same interview Gorbachev also stated that he thinks that enlargement was a "big mistake" and "a violation of the spirit of the statements and assurances made" in 1990.

Indeed, the only formal agreement signed between Nato countries and the USSR, before its breakup in December 1991, was the Treaty of Final Settlement with Respect to Germany. The promises made specifically relate to Germany, and the territory of the former GDR, which were on the deployment of non-German Nato forces into eastern Germany and the deployment of nuclear weapons – and these promises have been kept. <https://theconversation.com/ukraine-the-history-behind-russias-claim-that-nato-promised-not-to-expand-to-the-east-177085>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

When the soviet union fell, the UN basically told Russia they wouldn't expand east any further.

Malcolm wrote:

False.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 10:55 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

When the soviet union fell, the UN basically told Russia they wouldn't expand east any further.

Malcolm wrote:

False.

Jesse said:

Considering it was never codified into law, charter, or treaty it becomes a matter of hearsay, so it's kind of irrelevant. But there are many on both sides arguing that it

happened, and that it didn't. Just like every single other argument that results from a non-binding verbal agreement..

Malcolm wrote:

Gorbachev says no promises were made. He was there.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:00 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

This is some scary rhetoric indeed. I thought Malcolm was referring to the Russian Foreign Ministry spokeswoman's words after the talk of Finland and Sweden entering Nato. But if you mean these above, I guess it could mean a threat of nuclear. I am not sure. He says, Russia's response will be swift and lead to consequences for you [the meddling powers]. the like of which you have never yet experienced in your history.

Rhetoric? Has he really lost the plot? I sincerely hope not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:08 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

Considering it was never codified into law, charter, or treaty it becomes a matter of hearsay, so it's kind of irrelevant. But there are many on both sides arguing that it happened, and that it didn't. Just like every single other argument that results from a non-binding verbal agreement..

Malcolm wrote:

Gorbachev says no promises were made. He was there.

Jesse said:

This may be worth looking at, it contains actual documents from freedom of information requests.

[https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/russia-programs/2017-12-12/nato-expansion-what-gorbachev-heard-western-leaders-early#.WjAX9r\\_XxYI.twitter](https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/russia-programs/2017-12-12/nato-expansion-what-gorbachev-heard-western-leaders-early#.WjAX9r_XxYI.twitter)

Malcolm wrote:

As the article I linked to above points out, promises were made only concerning Germany, promises that have been kept.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:11 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:23 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

This may be worth looking at, it contains actual documents from freedom of information requests.

[https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/russia-programs/2017-12-12/nato-expansion-what-gorbachev-heard-western-leaders-early#.WjAX9r\\_XxYI.twitter](https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/russia-programs/2017-12-12/nato-expansion-what-gorbachev-heard-western-leaders-early#.WjAX9r_XxYI.twitter)

Malcolm wrote:

As the article I linked to above points out, promises were made only concerning Germany, promises that have been kept.

Jesse said:

The article is dense, but it's highly cited, and provides evidence in the form of photos of documents from the events.

The documents reinforce former CIA Director Robert Gates's criticism of "pressing ahead with expansion of NATO eastward [in the 1990s], when Gorbachev and others were led to believe that wouldn't happen." [1] The key phrase, buttressed by the documents, is "led to believe."

President George H.W. Bush had assured Gorbachev during the Malta summit in December 1989 that the U.S. would not take advantage ("I have not jumped up and down on the Berlin Wall") of the revolutions in Eastern Europe to harm Soviet interests; but neither Bush nor Gorbachev at that point (or for that matter, West German Chancellor Helmut Kohl) expected so soon the collapse of East Germany or the speed of German unification. [2]

The first concrete assurances by Western leaders on NATO began on January 31, 1990, when West German Foreign Minister Hans-Dietrich Genscher opened the bidding with a major public speech at Tutzing, in Bavaria, on German unification. The U.S. Embassy in

Bonn (see Document 1) informed Washington that Genscher made clear “that the changes in Eastern Europe and the German unification process must not lead to an ‘impairment of Soviet security interests.’ Therefore, NATO should rule out an ‘expansion of its territory towards the east, i.e. moving it closer to the Soviet borders.’” The Bonn cable also noted Genscher’s proposal to leave the East German territory out of NATO military structures even in a unified Germany in NATO.[3]

This latter idea of special status for the GDR territory was codified in the final German unification treaty signed on September 12, 1990, by the Two-Plus-Four foreign ministers (see Document 25). The former idea about “closer to the Soviet borders” is written down not in treaties but in multiple memoranda of conversation between the Soviets and the highest-level Western interlocutors (Genscher, Kohl, Baker, Gates, Bush, Mitterrand, Thatcher, Major, Woerner, and others) offering assurances throughout 1990 and into 1991 about protecting Soviet security interests and including the USSR in new European security structures. The two issues were related but not the same. Subsequent analysis sometimes conflated the two and argued that the discussion did not involve all of Europe. The documents published below show clearly that it did.

Malcolm wrote:

And NATO didn’t take advantage of anything. Nations have to apply to enter NATO. They have to meet certain standards:

[https://www.nato.int/nato\\_static\\_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf\\_2016\\_07/20160627\\_1607-factsheet-enlargement-eng.pdf](https://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2016_07/20160627_1607-factsheet-enlargement-eng.pdf)

To join the Alliance, nations are expected to respect the values of the North Atlantic Treaty, and to meet certain political, economic and military criteria, set out in the Alliance’s 1995 Study on Enlargement.

In any case, what initially ticked Putin off was Ukraine’s move to join the EU in 2014, which is what lead to the invasion of crimea and the removal of Yakunovich by the Ukrainian parliament.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:28 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Is anyone interested in the question why former Soviet republics and Soviet block nations would want to join NATO? Christ. If your neighbors who know you best, hear all the yelling and plotting coming from your house and feel they need to join a rival gang for their safety... who's the bad guy?

Malcolm wrote:

It’s typical “whataboutism.” Putin invades x, but what about Iraq, etc. Condemning

Putin's invasion of Ukraine does not automatically mean one supports the neocon policies and wars of the Bush era.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

This entire thing is more complicated than is being portrayed in the news, of course it means very little now that they decided to wage war, and kill civilians, and threaten nuclear war.. Any valid geo-political concerns Russia had ended when they began killing people.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, February 27th, 2022 at 11:42 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

By the way, Youtube is blocking/deleting livestreams and videos from the Warfront. Except for from major media organizations (CNN,etc)

Other websites are allowing the videos on. BitChute (An alternative youtube) has alot of videos being live streamed from the front lines, It's alot worse than we are seeing in our news cycles.

Be aware Bitchute is full of paranoid Q-Anon people. However, the platform itself doesnt censor or remove media, so there's alot of good stuff there as well. You can find live streams of current events that break the TOS of bigger platforms like youtube/twitter.

Just mentioning in case anyone wants to see in-depth reporting/video of what's going on moment by moment.

Malcolm wrote:

Too much crazy shit to wade through...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 12:41 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 12:44 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 1:20 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Dan74 said:  
It's only worth looking at if people care about the facts and being informed.

Malcolm wrote:  
There were no promises made by NATO not to admit new nations during the two plus four negotiations that led to The Treaty on the Final Settlement with Respect to Germany.

Even Gorbachev, who in 2008 claimed there were such promises, reversed himself in 2014.

This issue has been lobbied back and forth for years and is not something at all new:

<https://www.csis.org/analysis/twq-myth-no-nato-enlargement-pledge-russia-spring-2009>

In response to a criticism of this article, Kramer writes this:  
Most of the primary sources about Soviet perceptions and goals are in Russian. But even if Shiffrinson cannot use Russian sources, a few important items are available in English, including an illuminating interview with former Soviet leader Mikhail Gorbachev in October 2014 that appeared in English translation. Shiffrinson has definitely seen the interview (I sent a copy of it to him in November 2014), but he never cites it directly and instead paraphrases it inaccurately. In the interview, Gorbachev was asked whether the topic of NATO enlargement beyond eastern Germany ever came up during the negotiations in 1990 on German reunification. Gorbachev's response was unequivocal: "The topic of 'NATO expansion' was not discussed at all [in 1990], and it wasn't brought up in those years. I say this with full responsibility. Western leaders didn't bring it up, either."<sup>5</sup> Instead of citing these comments, Shiffrinson briefly and misleadingly paraphrases Gorbachev as having remarked: "NATO expansion may not have been explicitly discussed in 1990" (p. 13). This cursory paraphrase misrepresents what

Gorbachev actually said. The former Soviet leader did not use the equivocal formulation “NATO expansion may not have been explicitly discussed.” He said very plainly that NATO expansion “was not discussed at all” and “was not brought up.”  
<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/667395/pdf>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

And that some people have taken their grievances against this to the extreme and committed terrible crimes, whether the 9/11 terrorists

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, the terrible grievance that led to 9/11 was US troops being stationed on Saudi soil, in case you forgot. Do you even know why Bush actually invaded Iraq the first time? Why Iraq invaded Kuwait which resulted in the first Gulf War?

Personally, I have never supported even one war the US has ever been involved in during my lifetime. I was 29 when the Soviet Union fell.

But blaming all the world's ills on the US foreign policy just f\*\*king idiotic.

I never gave much thought to NATO until Trump tried to break it up. You should be really glad he didn't succeed, and that Biden pulled it back together.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

To argue that the West was right to fear Putin and expand NATO is the old self-fulfilling prophesy.

Malcolm wrote:

Actually, the West was right about Putin, and allowing former Warsaw pact nations to join NATO if they chose to was the right thing to do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 1:46 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Is anyone interested in the question why former Soviet republics and Soviet block



nations would want to join NATO? Christ. If your neighbors who know you best, hear all the yelling and plotting coming from your house and feel they need to join a rival gang for their safety... who's the bad guy?

No one forced these countries to join NATO. They begged to join NATO. Maybe it was a bad idea to let them in. That's up for debate. But there seems to be a consistent theme underlying all of this... Russia's conduct. Russia should have gotten its shit together decades ago. But instead, a small group of corrupt men stole control of all the resources. That is the genesis of Russia's problem right there.

KristenM said:

And I agree with what Blinken said, i.e. that Ukraine has the right to decide for itself who it wants to ally with. It's not Putin's decision. And judging from Putin's actions, it's clear why Ukraine doesn't want to ally with Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course, but Putin does not believe in democracy at all. He has said so. Why some people defend his feelings here is beyond me, but whatever.

KristenM said:

After all, what caused this crisis in the first place? It's very simple: the overwhelming desire of Ukrainians to live in an open, democratic society. Let us not forget what it was that enraged Putin and led him to invade Ukraine for the first time in 2014. It was not a Ukrainian declaration to seek NATO membership; it was the efforts of the Kyiv government (a pro-Russian government at the time) to finalize an "association agreement" with the European Union. When the president of Ukraine ultimately balked at this deal — under pressure from Russia — he was greeted by massive street protests, and the parliament voted him out of office. That is what triggered Putin's first invasion of Ukraine.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/2022/02/24/putin-invasion-ukraine-shows-why-liberal-democracy-worth-defending/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 2:04 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

And that some people have taken their grievances against this to the extreme and committed terrible crimes, whether the 9/11 terrorists

Malcolm wrote:

Umm, the terrible grievance that led to 9/11 was US troops being stationed on Saudi soil, in case you forgot. Do you even know why Bush actually invaded Iraq the first time? Why Iraq invaded Kuwait which resulted in the first Gulf War?

Personally, I have never supported even one war the US has ever been involved in during my lifetime. I was 29 when the Soviet Union fell.

But blaming all the world's ills on the US foreign policy just f\*\*king idiotic.

I never gave much thought to NATO until Trump tried to break it up. You should be really glad he didn't succeed, and that Biden pulled it back together.

Crazywisdom said:

Iraq invaded Kuwait for the same reasons Putin is doing. Claiming historical ownership, but just wanting to claim natural resources. That would make gas expensive of course the US had to incinerate them.

Malcolm wrote:

The truth is a little more complicated. Iraq and Kuwait has an agreement about raising oil prices in concert. Kuwait broke that agreement, moreover, they were drilling under Iraq's border, according to Iraq. So what did Iraq do? They raided Kuwait, broke into people's houses and shops, and carried away art, gems, furniture, etc.

Naturally of course the Kuwaitis were pissed, and then Bush got into it, because he saw a good opportunity to get rid of a former client from his CIA days.

Crazywisdom said:

And just because Al Qaeda said their reason was infidels on holy land does not mean that was the reason. I spent a lot of time talking with some dudes from Jordan.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, my information about Iraq comes from a reserve officer in the US military from Jordan with whom I worked, who was in the Jordanian army when the first Iraq war happened, who was sent to Iraq when the second Iraq war happened.

It was pretty much the reason. Recall, we had been sending Bin Ladin arms for years during the 80's. He turned on us after the first Gulf war when our troops did not leave Saudi Arabia.

Crazywisdom said:

Wait till the missiles get back to Cuba and Venezuela and see if that righteous position means anything. Geopolitics is a Russian concept of realpolitik.

Malcolm wrote:

That will never happen. Everyone has satellites that can see up a fly's ass from 20 miles above the earth.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

antimissiles in Poland

Malcolm wrote:

Seems like a good idea to me. Putin broke every treaty Russia had with us.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

Some people on this thread sure have rose colored glasses on when it comes to NATO.

It's not like NATO hasn't bombed other countries and all that.....

Oh wait a minute ....

Malcolm wrote:

No, no rose colored glasses here. But undermining NATO is a pretty stupid idea.

For example, the DSA tried on Twitter to float the idea that the US should pull of NATO, much mockery ensued.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.reuters.com/world/europe/launchpad-russias-assault-ukraine-belarus-holds-referendum-renounce-non-nuclear-2022-02-27/>

Unknown said:

Feb 27 (Reuters) - Protesters took to the streets as Belarus held a referendum on Sunday to adopt a new constitution that would ditch its non-nuclear status at a time when the country has become a launchpad for Russian troops invading Ukraine.

Writing by Matthias Williams; Editing by Alison Williams and Richard Chang

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

For those who do not know, this is Josep Borrell, High Representative of the European Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy

3:04 PM EST

Borrell just committed the EU to providing modern jets to Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's clear that Russian soldiers don't want this war either:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 4:42 AM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Hard to understand the attraction, frankly.

Malcolm wrote:

Access to other teachers and programs where serious Dzogchen teachings were being taught in a very comprehensive and detailed way by those other teachers. That was the attraction.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 4:54 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's clear that Russian soldiers don't want this war either:

SkyFox said:

Nobody, except Putin and his buddies, wants this war. Many Russians have friends and family in Ukraine. There are videos of Russian soldiers crying; some got tricked into thinking it was only a military exercise, which is very sad.

Malcolm wrote:

Lets all hope the enlisted kids decided to revolt.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 5:04 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Twitter translation:

"In total, our submarines are capable of launching more than half a thousand nuclear warheads, which is guaranteed to destroy the countries of the United States and NATO in addition. This is according to the principle: why do we need peace if there is no Russia in it"

F\*\*cking unhinged.

Russian responses to state tv:

Unknown said:

Does this motherf\*\*ker know that the US will kind of retaliate and destroy us all to hell?

Does he think he will sit out in a bunker with his adored leader?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 5:47 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

The guy is a journalist and commentator, btw. An idiot.

Malcolm wrote:

I understood that, and thanks for the nuance in the translation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 6:09 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

[https://news.google.com/articles/CAliElacUyElHDe911LjeEBUkZUqGQgEKhAIACoHCAowjailCzDQsr0DMK\\_uigc?uo=CAUIANIBAA&hl=en-US&gl=US&ceid=US%3Aen](https://news.google.com/articles/CAliElacUyElHDe911LjeEBUkZUqGQgEKhAIACoHCAowjailCzDQsr0DMK_uigc?uo=CAUIANIBAA&hl=en-US&gl=US&ceid=US%3Aen)

Times of Israel reports that Ukrainian forces have destroyed convoy of over 50 Chechnyan tanks and killed a general. The Chechnyan national guard convoy was tasked with search and destroy of Ukrainian leaders portrayed on decks of cards.

Shotenzenjin said:

Portrayed on decks of cards. Where have we seen that before? A NATO country perhaps.....

If it works and all that ...

Malcolm wrote:

Quit complaining about what the US did then, we all know it sucked. Focus on what f\*\*cking Putin is doing now.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 6:31 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

You can thank Biden for what is going on right now.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm no, you can thank Trump. You do remember why he was impeached the first time, right?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 6:58 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

You can thank Biden for what is going on right now.

Malcolm wrote:

Ummm no, you can thank Trump. You do remember why he was impeached the first time, right?

Shinjin said:

Jesus Christ we are still talking about Trump. He isn't president anymore. Biden is. The man who has the power to do something right now is Biden.

The right-wing talking point that Biden is weak and inept and therefore emboldened Putin to invade Ukraine is belied by the united front the western world is presenting.

After the former president tried to weaken NATO and even discussed withdrawing from

the treaty, Biden and Secretary of State Antony Blinken have managed to strengthen the alliance again. They have brought the G7 (the seven wealthiest liberal democracies), the European Union, and other partners and allies behind extraordinary economic sanctions, acting in concert to make those sanctions much stronger than any one country could impose.

They have managed to get Germany behind stopping the certification of Nord Stream 2, the gas pipeline from Russia to Germany that would have tied Europe more closely to Russia, and in what Marcel Dirsus, a German political scientist and fellow at the Institute for Security Policy at Kiel University, told the Washington Post was possibly “one of the biggest shifts in German foreign policy since World War II,” Germany is now sending weapons to Ukraine and has agreed to impose economic sanctions.

Biden has facilitated this extraordinary international cooperation quietly, letting European leaders take credit for the measures his own administration has advocated. It is a major shift from the U.S.’s previous periods of unilateralism and militarism, and appears to be far more effective.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/february-26-2022?r=62xtc&utm\\_campaign=post&utm\\_medium=email](https://heathercoxrichardson.substack.com/p/february-26-2022?r=62xtc&utm_campaign=post&utm_medium=email)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 7:16 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 7:19 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 7:23 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 9:26 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 11:09 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

It's sad, but I find it hard to disagree with him.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

The US isn't an empire and never has been. Pirates maybe, but not an empire.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 8:21 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

More like robber barons than pirates, applying the Randian might-is-right, winner-takes-all (un)principles to foreign relations?

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

Have you forgotten the Marshall Plan? You know, the one that helped rebuild Germany, Japan, and Italy?

We are certainly not angels, and in our history, like yours, there are terrible crimes of colonialism, and huge blunders like the post 9/11 wars, but at least our nation, like yours, aspires to assist others in setting up democracies. And after all, the democracy you enjoy today really is courtesy of the American revolution.

Ironically, Putin has succeeded in the one thing he feared, a stronger NATO bloc. Even the Germans decided to get strapped. And who can blame them?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 9:03 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine



Content:

Malcolm wrote:

If someone has a gun and is trying to kill you, it would be reasonable to shoot back with your own gun.

—— HH Dalai Lama, Seattle Times, May 15, 2001.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 9:42 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Buddha has also pointed out that it is difficult to know another person, whether he is enlightened or not.

Malcolm wrote:

He also excluded the possibility of awakening outside of his dharma and vinaya.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

If someone has a gun and is trying to kill you, it would be reasonable to shoot back with your own gun.

—— HH Dalai Lama, Seattle Times, May 15, 2001.

seeker242 said:

The rest of that quote.

Not at the head, where a fatal wound might result. But at some other body part, such as a leg.

I want to make it clear, however, that although I am deeply opposed to war, I am not advocating appeasement. It is often necessary to take a strong stand to counter unjust aggression. For instance, it is plain to all of us that the Second World War was entirely justified. It "saved civilization" from the tyranny of Nazi Germany, as Winston Churchill so aptly put it. In my view, the Korean War was also just, since it gave South Korea the chance of gradually developing democracy. But we can only judge whether or not a conflict was vindicated on moral grounds with hindsight. For example, we can now see that during the Cold War, the principle of nuclear deterrence had a certain value. Nevertheless, it is very difficult to assess all such matters with any degree of accuracy. War is violence and violence is unpredictable. Therefore, it is better to avoid it if possible, and never to presume that we know beforehand whether the outcome of a particular war will be beneficial or not.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.dalailama.com/messages/world-peace/the-reality-of-war>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 9:58 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

This strident stance by the West may be good to get the war to end,

Malcolm wrote:

Strident? How about "freaked out."

Dan74 said:

but in order to find a lasting peaceful settlement, it needs to show a flexibility to accommodate Russia's concerns, otherwise, I fear, we are heading to a far worse conflict. This isn't 1939.

Malcolm wrote:

Putin has never had a right to dictate to anyone anything outside Russian borders. If he wants security, he should cease his hostile posturing towards Europe.

It's very telling that you are acting as an apologist for another fascist.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 10:10 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

The rest of that quote.

I want to make it clear, however, that although I am deeply opposed to war, I am not advocating appeasement. It is often necessary to take a strong stand to counter unjust aggression. For instance, it is plain to all of us that the Second World War was entirely justified. It "saved civilization" from the tyranny of Nazi Germany, as Winston Churchill so aptly put it. In my view, the Korean War was also just, since it gave South Korea the chance of gradually developing democracy. But we can only judge whether or not a conflict was vindicated on moral grounds with hindsight. For example, we can now see that during the Cold War, the principle of nuclear deterrence had a certain value.

Nevertheless, it is very difficult to assess all such matters with any degree of accuracy. War is violence and violence is unpredictable. Therefore, it is better to avoid it if possible, and never to presume that we know beforehand whether the outcome of a particular war will be beneficial or not.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.dalailama.com/messages/world-peace/the-reality-of-war>

seeker242 said:

And at the same time, if he had the opportunity himself, I doubt very much he himself would go pick up a gun and go off to kill nazis.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he would have performed an abhicarya rite while sending his soldiers off to defend his country.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 10:30 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

And at the same time, if he had the opportunity himself, I doubt very much he himself would go pick up a gun and go off to kill nazis.

Malcolm wrote:

No, he would have performed an abhicarya rite while sending his soldiers off to defend his country.

seeker242 said:

If they met the criteria for such a rite, and one could easily argue nazis did not. Russians invading Ukraine certainly don't.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think you really understand what the criteria of such rites are.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 10:45 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

If they met the criteria for such a rite, and one could easily argue nazis did not. Russians invading Ukraine certainly don't.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't think you really understand what the criteria of such rites are.

seeker242 said:

And I think you know full well that Russians invading Ukraine don't meet the criteria

Malcolm wrote:

Of course they don't, they are innocent kids. Their leader on the other hand, that's a different question.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, February 28th, 2022 at 10:52 PM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

And I think you know full well that Russians invading Ukraine don't meet the criteria

Malcolm wrote:

Of course they don't, they are innocent kids. Their leader on the other hand, that's a different question.

seeker242 said:

Quite a stretch to say that people killing other people are innocent

Malcolm wrote:

They have no choice. They've been sent into a hostile country as conscripts.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 12:02 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

Yes that's true they were taken by surprise some Russian soldiers even said things like "we didn't know we were going to be killing anyone". But if you pull the trigger and

someone dies, well that means you're not innocent. The fact that you might be tortured if you don't, doesn't automatically make you innocent.

Malcolm wrote:

A perfect karma requires four things: object, intention, act, and satisfaction.

We cannot know what is going on in anyone's mind. But I doubt highly that any of those kids are happy they have to pull triggers, or that they are satisfied and happy to be pawns in Putin's war.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 12:06 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nemo said:

Americans have finalized their divorce from reality.

Malcolm wrote:

You lost all credibility when you defended China's treatment of the Uyghurs.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 12:15 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

Yes that's true they were taken by surprise some Russian soldiers even said things like "we didn't know we were going to be killing anyone". But if you pull the trigger and someone dies, well that means you're not innocent. The fact that you might be tortured if you don't, doesn't automatically make you innocent.

Malcolm wrote:

A perfect karma requires four things: object, intention, act, and satisfaction.

We cannot know what is going on in anyone's mind. But I doubt highly that any of those kids are happy they have to pull triggers, or that they are satisfied and happy to be pawns in Putin's war.

seeker242 said:

Perfect karma is not required in order to be not innocent.

Malcolm wrote:

Depends on what you mean by "innocent." If you mean that karma is unerring, then no sentient being is innocent, not even staunch vegans, who knows what horrible crimes we have all committed in the past.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 12:22 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

To think that the soldiers pulling the trigger are just as innocent as the civilians being killed, that makes no reasonable sense at all

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly we are using the word in a different sense.

You are using the term in this sense:

: free from legal guilt or fault

Here is the sense I am using:

: a naïve, inexperienced, or unsophisticated person

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 1:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

As the saying goes, if I had a penny every time your implied or outright said that I was a fascist..

Malcolm wrote:

Dan, you've been apologizing for Putin for weeks now. The only tune we've heard from you is that "Russia's security concerns ought to be respected...", "Putin has been humiliated by the West...", etc.

I don't happen to generally agree with "realists" like Mearsheimer, or their left-wing counterparts like Chomsky, etc. They do not offer realistic solutions.

I generally agree more with [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John\\_Ikenberry](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Ikenberry), those who defend liberal internationalism, and so on. Ikenberry's World Safe For Democracy is a must read, if one cares about things like geopolitics.

And if you like both-sidism:

[http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/111899/1/ogab020\\_1\\_.pdf](http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/111899/1/ogab020_1_.pdf)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

This strident stance by the West may be good to get the war to end, but in order to find a lasting peaceful settlement, it needs to show a flexibility to accommodate Russia's concerns, otherwise, I fear, we are heading to a far worse conflict. This isn't 1939.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

These morons couldn't sort it all out and send an invitation to Ukraine to join NATO before all this happened? They had to wait until they were finally attacked?

Malcolm wrote:

Ukraine was stymied in its application for EU membership in 2014 by the Russian "annexation" of Crimea, or didn't you remember that part?

One just doesn't join the EU overnight. It is a process, and there are conditions for entry.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 3:02 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

To think that the soldiers pulling the trigger are just as innocent as the civilians being killed, that makes no reasonable sense at all

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly we are using the word in a different sense.

You are using the term in this sense:

: free from legal guilt or fault

Here is the sense I am using:

: a naïve, inexperienced, or unsophisticated person

seeker242 said:

I don't think any of them are naïve when it comes to what's going to kill a person. All of them know full well what's gonna happen when you start dropping bombs on people. Nobody is so unsophisticated to not know the consequences of that, except for perhaps a mentally disabled person. Naïve of politics etc. sure, naïve of what's going to kill people certainly not

Malcolm wrote:

Sigh, all of those kids are conscripts, not volunteers. They are just canon fodder. But I guess you'd rather be all Yama, judge of the dead. Fine. Go for it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 3:37 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

It is worth emphasising that Mearsheimer said that before the invasion. Pretty much everything I've been saying too refers to the crisis before the invasion. You seem to be intent on confounding the two.

For years talking about the allied war crimes in WW2 would subject one to accusations of being a cryptonazi, Hitler apologist etc. We are past that now. People like Kurt Vonnegut help make it acceptable. And you know, he was not a Nazi.

What I say is not about excusing the invasion, but helping understand how the crisis arose in the first place. The facile approach is to just chant the mantra Putin=Bad=Mad and be content with it. It's easy and clear. But it's not the truth. Well, I don't know, maybe now he has gone mad, but up until the invasion, most his foreign policy did make sense.

Malcolm wrote:

Dan, you have stated quite plainly that you feel that Putin's 2014 and 2022 invasions of the Ukraine are clearly just a response to how unfairly Putin has been treated by the West. You have marshaled the opinions of American political scientists in defense of your point of view. There are other American political scientists who disagree with this point of view. You've thrown shade on Ukrainian corruption, and conflated Ukraine's desire to be admitted to the EU with NATO membership. You've argued that NATO



"broke" its promises to Russia, when its quite debatable that this is the case.

In short, you've pretty much sided with Russia entirely. That's fine, but Putin is a fascist, like his asset in Florida, and the entire MAGA wing of the GOP.

You may not think the "Liberal Hegemony" led by the US is a good thing. I happen to think it is a very good thing, and find it a preferable world order to the kind of world order envisioned by Putin, Xi, and the rest.

It's the start of the water tiger year tomorrow, and tiger years are always marked by a lot of upheaval.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 3:46 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A debate in 2/16/2021 between Professor John J. Mearsheimer, Professor Beate Jahn and Professor G. John Ikenberry

<https://www.lse.ac.uk/lse-player?id=168d8077-b7df-4eea-92c3-2767407d02b0>

This event will debate the crisis of the liberal order: is the cause of the crisis liberalism itself, or does it have as much to do with Trump and the rise of populism as anything else?

Explore the clash between liberalism and realism

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

conscript or not doesn't change anything...

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it does.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 4:19 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

conscript or not doesn't change anything...

Malcolm wrote:

Sure it does.

seeker242 said:

Nope. It's still killing regardless and killing is not innocent the only way it could be is if you accidentally press the button...

Malcolm wrote:

Or if you take no satisfaction in it, are not driven by hatred as a motivation, etc.

You have a very simplistic view of karma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 4:33 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Toenail said:

There is no room for defending Putin at all. Nothing justifies murdering political opponents using poison and starting a war. People want freedom and have had enough of Russia sucking them dry like a big fat leech. Every country around Russia is afraid of Putin. That is because he is a psychopath who is also a dictator and has a huge military and who is not hesitating to kill civilians. I think it was Gampopa saying that sometimes you have to beat women and children so that they listen. I am not saying that but when I read stupid shit like this I want to slap sense into ignorance I am not going to lie. Putin is not only a psychopath who starts a war and then threatens nuclear war when faced with economical sanctions he is also an idiot who has not even managed to achieve what he tried to do. He basically started cold war all over again but Russia is nowhere near as strong or relevant in the whole scale as it was back in soviet times, so he frak up big time. He will get frak badly and Europe will wake up again. Germany just pledged a 100 billion this year alone and Putin will have strapped up NATO on all borders except China. Now tell me that is what he would have wanted to achieve. The situation is very bad and sad. I cried yesterday.

Malcolm wrote:

And this is the guy that is going to beat him:

It must enrage Putin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

Nope. It's still killing regardless and killing is not innocent the only way it could be is if you accidentally press the button...

Malcolm wrote:

Or if you take no satisfaction in it, are not driven by hatred as a motivation, etc.

You have a very simplistic view of karma.

seeker242 said:

You have a very convoluted idea of what innocent means.

Malcolm wrote:

I explained what I meant by "innocent." But I am not hung up on a guilt/innocence trip.

You really ought to study the Kośabhaṣyaṃ, karma chapter. In order for a karma to ripen, it necessarily needs four things. If any of them are missing, it is not a perfect karma.

But we know that everyone killed fighting in a battle goes to hell. So I feel sorry for all them. Especially the naive kids that though no fault of their own were sent without their knowledge into a war not of their making or desire.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 5:03 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

Countries have a right to choose their alliances.

Malcolm wrote:

You either agree with this, or you don't. If you don't, whether you intend to or not, you side authoritarians who view the world through the lens of spheres of influence and power, rather than self-determination and democracy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 5:13 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

Of course one feels sorry for them but the idea that people who are dropping bombs on other people are innocent, is quite frankly downright ridiculous.

Malcolm wrote:

FFS, I never said they were innocent in the sense of being innocent of an act of killing. I said they were innocent in the sense that this war is not of their making.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 5:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

I guess JFK was "an authoritarian who view[ed] the world through the lens of spheres of influence and power", since he didn't agree with Cuba aligning itself with the USSR and allowing Soviet missiles on its land.

Malcolm wrote:

You brought this up before, yawn.

Your comparison is inept. These days, missiles are intercontinental. The ability for the US and Russia to obliterate each other in a nuclear war does not depend on proximity.

The Ukraine wishing to join the EU is not the same as the Russia parking nukes in Cuba.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 5:54 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

You know, Malcolm, I'd rather Ukraine carve out a good future and a prosperous life for its citizens, rather than being a pawn in the US-Russian games. Finland and Sweden did just fine out of Nato, as have we here in Switzerland, thank you very much. I don't think Ukrainian people dearly want the US bases on their soil, provided they have other security guarantees. It's the curse of their geography, their divided history that led them being the plaything in this tug-o-war between these two cursed empires.

Malcolm wrote:

The US is not a cursed empire. It's not an empire. It is however the leader of a hegemony of liberal, democratic states, a hegemony that Estonia, Poland, Hungary, Bulgaria, Romania, Czech Republic, Latvia, Lithuania, Turkey, Ukraine, etc., have seen the economic and social advantages of being a part, and have, collectively, the largest world economy.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 6:09 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I don't really see a huge moral distinction between this, and say when GWB claimed Iraq had weapons of mass destruction.

A huge, much more impactful act of aggression in terms of Geopolitical consequences for sure, but morally? Seems to be pretty equivalent.

Malcolm wrote:

Iraq did have weapons of mass destruction, ie. large stocks of sarin gas, etc, and Hussein most certainly wanted people to believe he had them.

The problem with the second Iraq war was Cheney's total paranoia and persistent delusion (even to this day) that Hussein really had such weapons. When GWB found out that Cheney was deluded about that, GWB iced Cheney completely. GWB is not the sharpest tool in the shed, but he also didn't like being played for a fool by Wolfowitz, Cheney, and Rumsfeld, who had all started their careers under Nixon together.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 6:14 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

Of course one feels sorry for them but the idea that people who are dropping bombs on other people are innocent, is quite frankly downright ridiculous.

Malcolm wrote:

FFS, I never said they were innocent in the sense of being innocent of an act of killing. I said they were innocent in the sense that this war is not of their making.

seeker242 said:

It's obvious that it's not a war of their making. Nobody ever claimed it was. Nobody is blaming them for starting a war. They are blamed for carrying it out.

Malcolm wrote:

Go ahead and blame away. Karma just isn't a simple transaction: do a, b happens.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 6:36 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan typing programs

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I would also like to be able to type in uchen script on my iMac. At the moment I type online in wylie into the <https://www.thlib.org/reference/dictionaries/tibetan-dictionary/translate.php> and copy/paste into RTF text files and subsequently between text files.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a wylie keyboard in the Mac software.

Open Keyboard preferences, select wylie.

You will switch back and forth with command + space bar.

Image 2-28-22 at 5.35 PM.jpg (80.25 KiB) Viewed 2213 times

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 6:42 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 6:54 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

It's obvious that it's not a war of their making. Nobody ever claimed it was. Nobody is blaming them for starting a war. They are blamed for carrying it out.

Malcolm wrote:

Go ahead and blame away. Karma just isn't a simple transaction: do a, b happens.

seeker242 said:

And who claimed it was? Yea, nobody....again...

Malcolm wrote:

Your notion of "guilt/innocence" is telling. Are lions "guilty" of killing their prey? Anyway, this is off topic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 8:01 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

I guess what Malcolm and Co refuse to understand is that trying to trace the genesis of the crisis (from different sides) is vitally important

Malcolm wrote:

We have different understandings of the etiology of this crisis. Neither of us has special or privileged knowledge, so in the end, it boils down to fact that we have different values and different perspectives based on those values. Unlike you, I am a fan of the American-led liberal hegemony, and think it is superior to the type of world Putin and Xi would usher in, if they could.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 8:38 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

... One also needs to understand how the other side sees the situation, in order to negotiate. ...

Kim O'Hara said:

I think this is one of the things we're missing on the NATO side, and particularly from the US.

Someone has already mentioned the Cuban crisis as a parallel, and I think it's a good one.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a good one, it's a facile comparison. 1) no one is parking nuclear weapons in Ukraine. 2) Ukraine initially asked to join the EU, not NATO. 3) It was only after Putin illegally annexed Crimea in 2014 and moved mercenaries into Eastern Ukraine, creating a civil war there, that Ukraine began the democratic process of passing legislation to join NATO in 2017.

Two take aways: Ukraine will wind up in the EU and NATO. It is now a certainty.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 8:42 AM

Title: Re: Tibetan typing programs

Content:

Archie2009 said:

I would also like to be able to type in uchen script on my iMac. At the moment I type online in wylie into the <https://www.thlib.org/reference/dictionaries/tibetan-dictionary/translate.php> and copy/paste into RTF text files and subsequently between text files.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a wylie keyboard in the Mac software.

Open Keyboard preferences, select wylie.

You will switch back and forth with command + space bar.

Image 2-28-22 at 5.35 PM.jpg

Archie2009 said:

Thank you, that worked. Only command + space bar opens Spotlight Search on macOS Monterey. Control + space switches between input sources.

Malcolm wrote:

You have to change the command.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 8:45 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

And who claimed it was? Yea, nobody....again...

Malcolm wrote:

Your notion of "guilt/innocence" is telling. Are lions "guilty" of killing their prey? Anyway, this is off topic.

seeker242 said:

No,

Malcolm wrote:

You have no understanding of karma. A lion killing it's prey is no different than one human being shooting another. Karma is karma.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 8:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

... One also needs to understand how the other side sees the situation, in order to negotiate. ...

Kim O'Hara said:

I think this is one of the things we're missing on the NATO side, and particularly from the US.

Someone has already mentioned the Cuban crisis as a parallel, and I think it's a good one. An updated hypothetical parallel would be a Chinese offer of economic aid to Mexico, accompanied by, say, 10 000 troops, a naval base or two, and an airfield. How would the US react to that?

Kim

PeterC said:

What everyone forgets about Cuba was that stationing the missiles there was a response to the US putting short-range missiles in Turkey. The US instigated that conflict.

We can, with Ukraine, debate endlessly who is “responsible” in a causative sense, and that does matter, but we are where we are, and we need to find the least bad destination for this. Right now that clearly does not involve a broadening of the conflict or a return to the prior status quo, unfortunately

Malcolm wrote:

Correct:

To reinforce Western interests, President Eisenhower secured the unanimous approval of NATO states to position intermediate-range ballistic missiles (IRBMs) in Europe, but only Britain, Italy, and Turkey actually agreed to host the weapons. In October 1959, it was arranged to place fifteen Jupiter IRBMs in Turkey, with the Turkish government agreeing to keep the armaments sovereign to the US and to keep the negotiations and acceptance of the missiles secret from the Turkish nation.<sup>5</sup>

Earlier that year, Eisenhower predicted that positioning warheads near the USSR could cause a backlash and that “If Mexico or Cuba . . . began getting arms and missiles from [the Soviets], we would be bound to look on such developments with the gravest concern and . . . it would be imperative for us to take . . . even offensive military action.”<sup>6</sup> John F. Kennedy, who took over the operation upon his 1961 inauguration, shared these concerns. He believed the Soviets would use the Turkish IRBMs to justify arming Cuba—if Turkey could attack across the Black Sea for the US, Cuba could attack across the Gulf of Mexico for the USSR—so, three months before the crisis, he urged US

officials to see what needed to be done to remove the missiles, telling Undersecretary of State George Ball to progress the issue. However, Ball, after discussing the issue with the Turkish ambassador, allied with other State Department officials and decided to not try to remove the missiles so as to preserve US-Turkish relations.<sup>7</sup>

<https://digitalcommons.northgeorgia.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1218&context=isr>

When whole situation is reviewed, it is shown that Kennedy exercised incredible restraint.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 9:18 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

seeker242 said:

No,

Malcolm wrote:

You have no understanding of karma. A lion killing it's prey is no different than one human being shooting another. Karma is karma.

seeker242 said:

You have no understanding of what common usage of words mean apparently...But go ahead and keep trying to say that people bombing other people aren't guilty...As that is such a reasonable thing to argue...No really, it is.

Malcolm wrote:

Now you are twisting my words. That's dishonest. We're done here.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 9:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Similarly, if NATO expansion really is part of what is at issue, we have to face that and ask what the right way to proceed is.

Malcolm wrote:

NATO is not a golf club. Ukraine has a right to join it. They've voted on it in their

parliament. It would absolutely hypocritical not to admit them. The Ukrainian people have unequivocally made their will clear through their own democratic process. For their trouble, they have had a proxy war waged against them for the past eight years, which has now turned into an actual war. So, it's just not up to Putin. It's only up to the Ukrainian people.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 9:15 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

US did not invade Cuba. Just saying.

In other news... Seeing the response of the Social Democrats, I'm done considering them a viable caucus in the US. They're in the same wastebasket as the Greens as far as I'm concerned.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, they're idiots, like the Green Party, USA.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 9:31 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Kim O'Hara said:

I think this is one of the things we're missing on the NATO side, and particularly from the US.

Someone has already mentioned the Cuban crisis as a parallel, and I think it's a good one.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not a good one, it's a facile comparison. 1) no one is parking nuclear weapons in Ukraine. 2) Ukraine initially asked to join the EU, not NATO. 3) It was only after Putin illegally annexed Crimea in 2014 and moved mercenaries into Eastern Ukraine, creating a civil war there, that Ukraine began the democratic process of passing legislation to join NATO in 2017.

Two take aways: Ukraine will wind up in the EU and NATO. It is now a certainty.

Dan74 said:

Dubya announced that the Ukraine would join Nato in 2008.

<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-nato-ukraine-bush-idUSL0141706220080401>

Who exactly is arguing for Putin and against Western liberal order here? Criticising the US foreign policy does not mean one is a Putin fanboy. Do I even have to say this??

The difference between us is not our values, I think, Malcolm. It's our reading (or ignoring) of the facts.

Malcolm wrote:

Again, Dan, no one just "joins" NATO. GWB declaring that he thinks Ukraine should join NATO if they so choose is not even a formal invitation. So yes, Ukraine began the process of MAP in 2008, but shelved it in 2010 under Yanukovich. After 2014, of course it became clear it was necessary for Ukraine to be a part of NATO, and in 2019, the goal of membership in NATO and EU was written into the preamble of the Ukrainian constitution, in order to remove the capriciousness of individual presidents.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 9:45 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

In any case, when it comes to domestic opinion, Russians are sold on the notion that Nato has been more and more belligerent to Russia and moving into Ukraine would be an existential threat.

Malcolm wrote:

An existential threat to Putin's ambitions, definitely, but not Russia itself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

But keep thinking that the US has some grand plan to take over Russia, meanwhile going on and on about how the US is a crumbling empire. Make up your mind.

Malcolm wrote:

But her emails!!!

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:12 PM

Title: Re: Tibetan typing programs

Content:

Archie2009 said:

Thank you, that worked. Only command + space bar opens Spotlight Search on macOS Monterey. Control + space switches between input sources.

Malcolm wrote:

You have to change the command.

Archie2009 said:

What is your preferred Tibetan font? Or is that choice dictated by your occupation as translator? I use Kailasa.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't translate sadhanas, so I have little need for a specific font, that said, yes, I tend to use Kailash when I do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:15 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:24 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Sigh. Well, I guess it was an American's fault, to an extent. But Russians lacked the competent leadership, also, who could have actively steered the country as these distortions emerged.

The human and natural resources the Soviet Union had could have served it well. But then, I suppose we're seeing yet another example of why economies need to evolve gradually.

PeterC said:

That's an interesting observation. I suppose there is moral responsibility implicit in the causality, but ultimately though the causality is very important. it doesn't really matter much who is morally responsible. We have this situation and we have to deal with it, turning that into a moral question tends to make that process harder. The historians will be still picking over who was right and wrong centuries from now.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2022/02/28/world-war-iii-already-there-00012340>

“Sadly, we are treading back through old historical patterns that we said that we would never permit to happen again,” Hill told me.

Those old historical patterns include Western businesses who fail to see how they help build a tyrant’s war chest, admirers enamored of an autocrat’s “strength” and politicians’ tendency to point fingers inward for political gain instead of working together for their nation’s security.

But at the same time, Hill says it’s not too late to turn Putin back, and it’s a job not just for the Ukrainians or for NATO — it’s a job that ordinary Westerners and companies can assist in important ways once they grasp what’s at stake.

“Ukraine has become the front line in a struggle, not just between democracies and autocracies but in a struggle for maintaining a rules-based system in which the things that countries want are not taken by force,” Hill said. “Every country in the world should be paying close attention to this.”

...

Hill: You totally see it. Unfortunately, we have politicians and public figures in the United States and around Europe who have embraced the idea that Russia was wronged by NATO and that Putin is a strong, powerful man and has the right to do what he’s doing: Because Ukraine is somehow not worthy of independence, because it’s either Russia’s historical lands or Ukrainians are Russians, or the Ukrainian leaders are — this is what Putin says — “drug addled, fascist Nazis” or whatever labels he wants to apply here.

So sadly, we are treading back through old historical patterns that we said that we would never permit to happen again. The other thing to think about in this larger historic context is how much the German business community helped facilitate the rise of Hitler. Right now, everyone who has been doing business in Russia or buying Russian gas and oil has contributed to Putin’s war chest. Our investments are not just boosting business profits, or Russia’s sovereign wealth funds and its longer-term development. They now are literally the fuel for Russia’s invasion of Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:30 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

Biden is a disgrace. Why doesn't he impose sanctions on russian oil and gas? That will hurt putin big time.

Malcolm wrote:

You don't play all your cards at once in international poker.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:46 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

Biden is a disgrace. Why doesn't he impose sanctions on russian oil and gas? That will hurt putin big time.

Malcolm wrote:

You don't play all your cards at once in international poker.

Shinjin said:

By the time he does (if he does) it will be too late for Ukraine.

Malcolm wrote:

He also has US markets to think about. The DOW as of now is down 424 points again to 33,468 as of 10:41 am. Oil finished over \$100 a barrel yesterday.

This is not the Gunfight at the OK Corral, but you seem to treat it as if it were just as simple as "Let's crash the world economy to punish Putin."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:51 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 1st, 2022 at 11:55 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

It is true and not true. Buddha has also put it in a circular fashion: Only the Noble eight-fold path leads to liberation. If a method leads to liberation it must have the limbs of the Noble eightfold path. We know that a path is the right path, if it produces the genuine result. But who can say that "this is the right result, all other results are wrong"?

Malcolm wrote:

There is only one right result: freedom from the afflictions that cause rebirth. This comes from the only right view: dependent origination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 12:18 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

Economy already was starting to go to hell under Biden long before this war started.

Malcolm wrote:

That is simply inaccurate. For example:

<https://www.bloomberg.com/opinion/articles/2021-12-20/president-biden-s-economic-performance-has-proved-unbeatable>

<https://www.usnews.com/news/politics/articles/2022-02-04/bidens-economy-strengthens-upon-further-review>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 12:29 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

DW reports that there is a Russian military convoy 60 kilometers long in route to Kyiv. Russia announces that they will bomb Kyiv. They have already used cluster bombs on civilian targets. Let's hope they don't hit a nuclear reactor.

If they start destroying Kyiv and civilians, I don't see how the U.S. and Europe can stay out of the war considering the world wide unity against Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

I don't either.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 1:33 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

It is just a misconstrued attribution towards me. I am using his translation does not mean I am using his interpretation. Reading the Candrakirti's Prasannapada is enough for understanding one model of reasoning, which naturally includes Buddhapalita. It is still the 5th-6th centuries CE perspective on Nagarjuna.



Malcolm wrote:

Then read Akutobhyā. It has the same stucture, and is much earlier than Buddhapalita, attributed to Nāgārjuna. It sets out the purpose for writing MMK, but it does not set out any ontological thesis to defend.

It's the only model of reasoning there is. If you want to interpret the MMK outside these parameters, I have nothing more to say to you other than that you are making a mistake.

haha said:

Lucid Exposition of the Middle Way The Essential chapters from the Prasannapada of Candrakirti Translated from the Sanskrit by Mervyn Sprung

Malcolm wrote:

Unfortunately influenced by T.R.V. Murti's crypto-advaita leanings. A contribution, but a long ago superseded one.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Context:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Boris said:

What local beings do the bombings disturb/make angry (beside obviously humans, animals)?

And is there a class of beings which are satisfied that humans have started fighting with each other?

Malcolm wrote:

Gyalpos.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 4:04 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 4:37 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Huh? Can you please stop advocating for a war between the world's two foremost nuclear powers? The US has around 5,400 nuclear warheads and Russia around 6,000 = enough to kill every human being on earth.

Malcolm wrote:

As long as Russia does not use nuclear weapons, there wont be. If they do,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 6:05 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

IQ < 70.

SkyFox said:

I don't get this. You first confronted my post. And then when you realized what you said had nothing to do with what I posted, you attack my IQ?

Brunelleschi said:

I'm joking, I apologize.

The point is that squeezing a mayor nuclear power with sanctions like this is pretty much uncharted territory. There is a reason the US is very clearly saying "No" to a no-fly zone for example. We have to be rational in times like these.

Malcolm wrote:

The reason NATO is saying no to a no-fly zone has somewhat to do with the UAF doing a fair job of protecting their own airspace, and Russia has yet to establish air dominance for some inexplicable reason.

We will see how long that lasts. One twist in the jets for Ukraine scheme is the NATO is not allowing them to be flown through NATO airspace.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 12:59 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Unknown said:

Europeans have also dropped, abruptly, some of their doubts about Ukraine's membership in their institutions. On Monday, the European Parliament not only asked Zelensky to speak, by video, but gave him a standing ovation. Earlier today the parliamentarians, from all across the continent, voted to accept his application for EU membership for Ukraine. Accession to the EU is a long process, and it won't happen immediately, even if Ukraine emerges intact from this conflict. But the idea has been broached. It is now part of the continent's collective imagination. From being a distant place, badly understood, it is now part of what people mean when they say Europe...In the long run-up to this war, the conversation in Washington and Berlin was always focused on Putin and Joe Biden, Sergei Lavrov and Antony Blinken, NATO and Russia. This was the kind of talk that academics and pundits liked: big topics, big countries. In this conversation Ukraine was, as the political scientist John Mearsheimer put it in 2014, nothing more than "a buffer state of enormous strategic importance to Russia." But the Ukrainians have now put themselves at the heart of the story, and they know it.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/03/putins-war-dispelled-the-worlds-illusions/623335/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 8:01 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

Even though Bhāviveka and Candrakīrti both are interpreting the Nagarjuna, but they are not using the same structure of logic. So, "there is the only model of reasoning" does not apply. One can add Santaraksita; may be other teachers, too.

Malcolm wrote:

We aren't talking about the same thing. I am talking about which passages belong to the opponent, which belong to the response.

The use of syllogisms by Bhāvaviveka merely unpacks an algorithm implied by Buddhapalita's consequences, and the whole controversy between Buddhapalita, etc., amounts to little more than a squabble over pedagogy, not substance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 9:36 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

There is only one right result: freedom from the afflictions that cause rebirth. This comes from the only right view: dependent origination.

PadmaVonSamba said:

There is only one right buddhist result: its aim (freedom from the afflictions that cause rebirth), as Malcolm suggests.

If the result one wants is moksha, or higher rebirth, or a perfect lemon cheesecake, other methods exist for achieving those.

In other words, Mr. Sad Guru may offer a path that leads to a blissful something-or-other, but not to full liberation in the buddhist sense.

And from that it may be assumed that he is not “enlightened” in any sense of the word as it would be applied to Buddhism.

Aemilius said:

Making that sort of declarations is not what Shakyamuni recommends that one should do. It may cause one unnecessary (bad) karma saying things like that. You would perhaps do much better without it.

The buddhist goal is not so self-evident, if you would consider what the Mahayana says. Like for example: "there is no ignorance and no end of ignorance...", Heart of Perfection of Wisdom sutra, " ...no old age and death and no end of old age and death". Mahayana sutras unambiguously say that the sravakayana nirvana is not ultimately true and not the final goal.

Malcolm wrote:

The cessation of afflictions that cause rebirth in samsara is part and parcel of Mahayana. It's not the whole of the path of Buddhahood, but it's essential nevertheless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 9:40 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Great to see European nations stepping up. I'm particularly impressed by Germany's decisiveness at obvious cost to themselves.

Biden mentioned last night in his State of the Union address that US and European countries are going to seize the real and personal property of Russian oligarchs. Putting the vise to these people is critical.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

But I can't help wondering what effect this will have long-term? Not only will the Russian economy suffer a huge blow, with millions losing work, it will have expelled Russia from practically all Western institutions, economy, etc. This isolation makes an all-out conflict with the West much more possible, I fear.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, maybe Putin will be deposed, and Russians will be able to hold free and fair elections.

The Russian largest lender, Sberbank is beginning to fail, and pulling out of European Markets:

<https://www.theguardian.com/business/2022/mar/02/russia-sberbank-pulls-out-of-europe-after-facing-failure-amid-sanctions>

This war is going to be known Putin's folly. He is destroying Russia, Belarus, and Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 2nd, 2022 at 11:50 PM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

Ok

If you do not mind, I would like to ask one question.

How do you read or view the dedicatory verse and the last verse from MMK?

yaḥ pratīyasamutpādaṃ prapañcopaśamaṃ śivam |  
deśayāṃ āsa saṃbuddhas taṃ vande vadatāṃ varam ||2||

Who taught dependent origination

That is peaceful and fully pacifies all fabrication.

I pay homage to the perfect Buddha

Who is supreme among teachers

27.

sarvadṛṣṭiprahāṇāya yaḥ saddharmam adeśayat |  
anukampāṃ upādāya taṃ namasyāmi gautamam ||30||

I pay homage to Gautama,

Who, motivated by compassion,

Taught the holy Dharma

For the abandonment of all [false] views. [Coghlan]

Malcolm wrote:

One, while in general the Coughlin translation is pretty good, it is not without its faults, bracketing [false] before views is misleading.

Two, pacifying proliferation (prapañcopaśamaṃ) and abandonment of all views (sarvadrṣṭiprahāṇāya) are equivalent.

But there is no thesis here to defend, no affirming negation, if you will. There is here no negation of view to replace it with some other view.

If you want to get into the head of Nāgārjuna regarding the limits of holding a thesis (pratijñā), you should look at Westerhoff's study and translation of the Vaidalyaprakāṣa. It is a detailed refutation of the Nyāya's sixteen categories (padārtha). You should also look at the Vigrahavyavartani, also translated by Westerhoff.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 12:00 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.thesun.co.uk/news/17806693/russia-mutiny-army-ukraine-vladimir-putin/>

Not sure if it true, but I have seen it reported in several places that yesterday Russian Marines rioted onboard ship and refused to storm Odessa.

Shotenzenjin said:

It's easy to get caught up in the propoganda onslaught. Russia failing. Ukrainians kicking ass. On day.....6

One wonders if ukraine is doing so well why do they need so much help then?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 1:07 AM

Title: Re: Can you conceive of a scenario where it turns out Nagarjuna was wrong (ex: not all things are empty, or otherwise)?

Content:

haha said:

It is old translation. What do you say about Fernando Tola and Carmen Dragonetti's translation?

Malcolm wrote:

Westerhoff's is later than theirs, and offers pointed analysis of their treatment.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 2:26 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

But I can't help wondering what effect this will have long-term? Not only will the Russian economy suffer a huge blow, with millions losing work, it will have expelled Russia from practically all Western institutions, economy, etc. This isolation makes an all-out conflict with the West much more possible, I fear.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, maybe Putin will be deposed, and Russians will be able to hold free and fair elections.

The Russian largest lender, Sberbank is beginning to fail, and pulling out of European Markets:

<https://www.theguardian.com/business/2022/mar/02/russia-sberbank-pulls-out-of-europe-after-facing-failure-amid-sanctions>

This war is going to be known Putin's folly. He is destroying Russia, Belarus, and Ukraine.

Dan74 said:

When was the last time sanctions brought down an autocratic ruler?

Malcolm wrote:

1958-1959: the U.S.S.R. vs. Finland

During the "Night Frost Crisis" of 1958 and 1959, Finnish-Soviet relations were fraught after the Communists were excluded from government and Karl-August Fagerholm, viewed as unfavorable to the Soviets, was appointed as prime minister. The U.S.S.R. used economic sanctions to force Fagerholm's resignation. The sanctions cost 1.1.% of the Finnish GNP.

1961-1965: the United States vs. Ceylon (Sri Lanka)

Between 1961 and 1965, the United States applied sanctions against the Dominion of Ceylon (what is now Sri Lanka) after the socialist government of Sirimavo Bandaranaike was accused of expropriating the assets of U.S. and British oil companies. The government fell in 1965, largely because of the economic effects of these sanctions, which cost 0.6% of the the country's GNP.

1982-1986: South Africa vs. Lesotho

South Africa applied economic pressure on Lesotho to make it return South African

refugees with links to the African National Congress. After a military coup in Lesotho, South Africa lifted a blockade on the landlocked nation, and 60 ANC members were deported back home. The cost was estimated to be 5.1% of Lesotho's GNP.

1992-1993: the United States vs. Malawi

The United States (and other nations) significantly cut aid in 1992 in a bid to improve the democratic standards and human rights situation in Malawi. Malawi was largely reliant on aid (the sanctions were estimated to cost 6.6% of its GNP) and swiftly adopted more open policies. After a referendum, multi-party democracy was introduced in 1993, and aid was soon resumed.

1993: the United States vs. Guatemala

In 1993, after President Jorge Serrano dissolved Congress and said he would rule by decree, the United States and European nations threatened sanctions. Business owners, scared of the economic effects, helped force Serrano out of power and installed a new president, Ramiro de Leon Carpio. The economic cost was said to be 1.3% of Guatemala's GDP.

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/04/28/13-times-that-economic-sanctions-really-worked/>

Dan74 said:

As for the war, Russia appears to have hoped for a quick surgical operation to achieve their objectives. That failed and now we are in for some truly horrible war. It will be a slaughter and the West arming Ukraine will make it drag on longer. Maybe by upping the cost for Russia it could lead it to settle sooner, or maybe it will just increase the body count, I don't know. Putin may just dig in and he has the resources to win at whatever cost. Intransigence is a pretty natural reaction for a Russian whose back is against the wall.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe not.

Russia is in for a whole world of hurt because of its leaders actions.

Dan74 said:

I hear people freaking out, storing food, checking bomb shelters.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. Sensible precautions.

Dan74 said:

Yes, Putin started it. But we do we go from here?

Malcolm wrote:

The US and NATO said we are not going into Ukraine. So i guess we are just going to



watch Ukraine get ground into dust and resist as best they can, until it becomes too expensive for Putin to continue.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 2:48 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 3:11 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

FWIW, Putin has repeated that Russia will not occupy Ukraine and that the Ukrainian people will be free to choose their future.

Malcolm wrote:

Obviously not, since the Ukrainians want to be in the EU and NATO.

Dan74 said:

Put that in the context of the wars the US have waged in the past 50 years and maybe stop collectively foaming at the mouth. Not to single you out, QQ.

Malcolm wrote:

I'd like to remind you that during the first Gulf War we did not occupy Baghdad, mainly due to Colin Powell's fear of what the second Gulf war turned into.

NATO intervened in the Balkans, justifiably so.

Dan74 said:

I don't know if you can imagine how this feels.

Malcolm wrote:

No, I can't imagine it, but I am sure it's an awful feeling.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 4:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This just says it all:

“The Ukrainian authorities . . . are in fact waging war with their own population in cities where there are no Russian troops, first and foremost in Kyiv,” said Artyom Sheinin, host of a political talk show on state TV.

<https://www.ft.com/content/73f87533-749a-4539-aeae-89ce0a9265bd?segmentID=d649553c-7c7e-7cd5-957a-9d059f0e7d27&twclid=11499124780666081280>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 5:12 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 6:42 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 6:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 7:03 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 8:56 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

BTW, Dan, with all this discussion of whether NATO made a promise not to expand or not, there is a little thing called the Budapest Memorandum, which Russia signed, in return for Ukraine giving up its nukes:

Respect Belarusian, Kazakh and Ukrainian independence and sovereignty in the existing borders.

Refrain from the threat or the use of force against Belarus, Kazakhstan and Ukraine.

Refrain from using economic pressure on Belarus, Kazakhstan and Ukraine to influence their politics.

Seek immediate Security Council action to provide assistance to Belarus, Kazakhstan and Ukraine if they "should become a victim of an act of aggression or an object of a threat of aggression in which nuclear weapons are used".

Refrain from the use of nuclear arms against Belarus, Kazakhstan and Ukraine.

Consult with one another if questions arise regarding those commitments.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 10:40 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Good article on non-dumb anti-imperialism from The Intercept:

<https://theintercept.com/2022/03/01/ukraine-russia-leftists-tankie/>

KristenM said:

I read it and it is a good article. The forgot to mention Cuba, though. Everyone's favorite dictatorship.

Malcolm wrote:

Cuba could have been Miami, but they f\*\*cked up.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Buddha never said that he has found his unique path to a specific liberation.

Malcolm wrote:

Of course he did.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 11:22 PM

Title: Re: Nyingma vs Sarma Yamantaka

Content:

Pema Rigdzin said:

Yamantaka is one the the 8 yidams in the famed central Mahayoga collection of sadhanas, the Kagye. So definitely front and center among the most important yidams in Nyingma. Sounds like in actuality the only difference in the deity is the line of transmission and the approach and any methods and instructions unique to each.

Manjukumaar said:

Would the Nyingma termas contain the equivalents of Mother and Father Tantras?

Malcolm wrote:

Mahayoga is the equivalent.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 3rd, 2022 at 11:36 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Read whole thread:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

It looks like the memorial to Jews killed by the Nazis wasn't bombed it was a tv tower...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this was very clearly reported on CNN, etc. And the fact remains that buildings at the Baba Yar memorial were damaged.

<https://www.australianjewishnews.com/israeli-jewish-officials-denounce-russian-strike-that-hit-babi-yar-memorial-complex/>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 12:20 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Only people who get their news from nobodies tweeting out farts actually thought the memorial was the target. Reliable commentators noted the irony that the memorial was hit.

Malcolm wrote:

The constant refrain about propaganda is a wearing a bit thin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Ethical impact on defense against the Russian Invasion in Ukraine

Content:

muni said:

Prayers for Ukraine. And may these boys be send home.

Malcolm wrote:

They don't want to go home. They will be punished for failing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 1:14 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

Why aren't the Ukrainian's putting these captured tanks into military service? Their own army uses Russian tank models.

Malcolm wrote:

The Ukrainians, apparently, have a very wry sense of humor.

Nemo said:

I can't even fully separate fact from fiction in the wars I was a part of and I had real time access to comms and was in the room where decisions were made. There is no truth in war. Throw in language, a lack of historical knowledge and geographic barriers and it's safe to assume most of what you know is wrong.

Malcolm wrote:

Not sure you can tell fact from fiction in the present, what with your denial that the Chinese imprisoned one million Uyghurs in work camps.

Anyway, in Russia today:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 3:41 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:01 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Chernobyl II

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:35 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:44 AM  
Title: Re: Nyingma vs Sarma Yamantaka  
Content:

Manjukumaar said:  
Would the Nyingma terms contain the equivalents of Mother and Father Tantras?

Malcolm wrote:  
Mahayoga is the equivalent.

Manjukumaar said:  
And Anuyoga?

Malcolm wrote:  
No equivalent. The principles of anuyoga are not found in sarma tantra.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:56 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:59 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 10:08 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 10:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 7:21 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

Watch to the end

Malcolm wrote:

Fog of war indeed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:21 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Hinduism uses much of the same vocabulary with Buddhism. The common aim of a hindu is to attain liberation from Samsara or the wheel of rebirth.

Malcolm wrote:

The aim of "Hinduism" is the liberation of an atman/purusha from samsara. This is defined in various ways depending on the darshan.

Buddhist negates such a liberation, since there is no atman to be liberated.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 10:17 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Ayu said:

A kind request

Could everybody please stop posting Twitter links, because my devices are loading endlessly. Could you rather copy and paste or please at least do delete the Twitter links from your quotes?

The Twitter post linked only once into the thread would be sufficient.

Otherwise moderating this topic becomes really a time consuming drag.

Norwegian said:

Honestly, this is unfair.

Malcolm wrote:

She has a point about replies. People should leave the original tweet out of their reply.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 4th, 2022 at 11:01 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Shinjin said:

On the other hand a Hindu will negate the Buddhist idea of liberation since we don't believe in atman. Who's telling the truth?

Malcolm wrote:

You can discover that yourself.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 5th, 2022 at 10:29 AM



Title: Re: Was the monastic tradition/lineage established in Japanese Buddhism??

Content:

Zhen Li said:

Also, this is presupposing that the Yogacarabhumi precepts are being upheld. In fact, Saichō only upheld the Brahmajāla precepts, and the Brahmajāla Sūtra states that only the Brahmajāla bodhisattvas precepts are to be regarded as the pratimokṣa in the age of Dharma Decline.

Malcolm wrote:

Unknown outside China. Tibetan Buddhists don't read this sutra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 5th, 2022 at 7:27 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Hinduism uses much of the same vocabulary with Buddhism. The common aim of a hindu is to attain liberation from Samsara or the wheel of rebirth.

Malcolm wrote:

The aim of "Hinduism" is the liberation of an atman/purusha from samsara. This is defined in various ways depending on the darshan.

Buddhist negates such a liberation, since there is no atman to be liberated.

Aemilius said:

That is only play with words. No one needs to seek liberation, because there is no atman, namarupa, aggregates or jiva. But why do we then observe precepts, study, meditate, ect...?

Malcolm wrote:

Because we impute such an entity on our series of aggregate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 5th, 2022 at 8:30 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

That is only play with words. No one needs to seek liberation, because there is no atman, namarupa, aggregates or jiva. But why do we then observe precepts, study, meditate, ect...?

Malcolm wrote:

Because we impute such an entity on our series of aggregate.

Aemilius said:

You still have "we", who impute and attain (freedom from imputation). So there is no difference to "atman" (doing something).

Malcolm wrote:

Of course there is a difference: the atman/soul/person, etc., asserted by nonBuddhists does not exist in the various manners in which they claim it does. It does exist in the manner which we claim it does, that is, as a mere imputation upon the series of aggregates. I think you need to reread Vasubandhu' refutation of the self again.

The conventional use of pronouns does not negate the general Buddhist argument of the self being a convention,an imputation, and a mere designation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 5th, 2022 at 8:36 PM

Title: Re: Was the monastic tradition/lineage established in Japanese Buddhism??

Content:

Zhen Li said:

There is a Tibetan translation (and apparently Mongolian), which I had a look at a few years ago alongside the Chinese, but it is strange. It is probably translated from Chinese but also shows differences. Probably the sūtra was popular in Kucha. If I recall correctly, there's a shorter variant from Dunghuang which shows similarities but is also not identical.

Malcolm wrote:

Link?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 12:21 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 1:08 AM

Title: Re: Why do some scholars deny the existence of Amitabha Buddha?

Content:

Shinjin said:

...

Malcolm wrote:

Why do you care? There are far more people in the world who do not believe in Amitabha Buddha than do.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 6:27 AM

Title: Re: Why do some scholars deny the existence of Amitabha Buddha?

Content:

Shinjin said:

I think the questionnaire is referring to some shin scholars who are trying to reinterpret the tradition to fit their materialistic worldviews. Same as those such as Stephen Bachelor who reject karma/rebirth and present Buddhism as some sort of therapy program only.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, who cares what they think? Only thing that matters is what you think.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 9:37 AM

Title: Re: Why do some scholars deny the existence of Amitabha Buddha?

Content:

Shinjin said:

I think the questionnaire is referring to some shin scholars who are trying to reinterpret the tradition to fit their materialistic worldviews. Same as those such as Stephen Bachelor who reject karma/rebirth and present Buddhism as some sort of therapy program only.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, who cares what they think? Only thing that matters is what you think.

Shinjin said:

I agree but don't you feel some of these secular attitudes are damaging Buddhism? How can someone expect to be liberated by receiving watered down teachings?

Malcolm wrote:

Don't much care about Buddhism. Buddhism is a religion. Buddhadharma, on the other

hand, can't be harmed by anything.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 11:07 AM

Title: Re: Was the monastic tradition/lineage established in Japanese Buddhism??

Content:

Zhen Li said:

There is a Tibetan translation (and apparently Mongolian), which I had a look at a few years ago alongside the Chinese, but it is strange. It is probably translated from Chinese but also shows differences. Probably the sūtra was popular in Kucha. If I recall correctly, there's a shorter variant from Dunhuang which shows similarities but is also not identical.

Malcolm wrote:

Link?

Zhen Li said:

It was a few years ago and it was on paper. So, I don't have any info handy. Maybe there's something in Muller's intro to his translation on it.

Edit:

Actually, I found a PDF I have of it. It's translated as Chos-kyi-rgyal-mo and is in Volume 62 of the Tog Palace manuscript of the Kanjur, Leh 1980.

Malcolm wrote:

I stand corrected. I was unaware that the so-called Brahamajala Precept sūtra was this Chos kyi rgya mo. We have the Hinayāna Brahmajala sūtra in translation as well.

The title is Chos kyi rgya mo, which means roughly "Seal of the Dharma" (Chos kyi rgyal mo means Queen of Dharma). The Dege edition lists it as a translation from Chinese, with the legend, "translated from Chinese, edited according to the new dharma terminology." It is found in the Phangthangma catalogue.

It begins a little after the second fascicle of the Chinese text begins.

So, even though a portion of this text was translated into Tibetan, we really don't read this text. For example. the Fourth Shamar notes it is a dubious text specifically because of this passage:

"[H]e himself was named Siddhārtha. He left home at the age of seven; he attained enlightenment at thirty and came to be called Śākyamuni Buddha."

Pg. 40, BDK edition.

So, in general, we don't give it any credit.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 8:41 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

?

No matter how we view the situation, the fact of the matter is Ukraine is at war. Morality, integrity, and ideals are the first things to go in war. I'm not really buying that Russia just suddenly fired on a nuclear power plant without provocation either. (Who fires unprovoked on a nuclear power plant that would just as likely effect their home country, as it would Europe if it exploded?.)

Malcolm wrote:

They absolutely did.

Jesse said:

The way I see it.. It's in Ukraine's interest to get NATO involved in this war. Without NATO Ukraine will eventually fail.

Malcolm wrote:

We, the US, guaranteed Ukraine's security in 1994. We've done a piss poor job of living up to that promise.

Jesse said:

Many in Ukraine have come out and stated that if NATO doesn't help them we are just as responsible as Russia for their demise -- and I'm sure that sentiment isn't uncommon. That being the case, Ukraine becomes a nightmare scenario for NATO, I imagine them trying to manage this, and failing miserably. It's sort of terrifying actually.

Malcolm wrote:

They are right: Ukraine has been a NATO partner for nearly three decades.

Jesse said:

I know people have taken up Ukraine's cause as Just and morally righteous, that doesn't however mean that Ukraine is now a morally pure agent. They are just as capable of evil as anyone else. Especially when it comes to matters of survival. I should mention the same is true of the United States, NATO, and Russia. We will never genuinely know many of the actual facts about what's happening. If you look at the situation objectively

though, regardless of why NATO is involved, Ukraine is definitely looking like a proxy war being fought on behalf of NATO against Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

The only nation that has violated national sovereignty is Putin's Russia, on a pretext that makes Cheney's WMDs look solid by comparison.

Jesse said:

Even if it wasn't intended, it will play out that way. NATO are sending massive amounts of weapons to Ukraine, while sapping Russia of funds via sanctions. The end effect will be NATO waging war on Russia without a single NATO Soldier being deployed.

Malcolm wrote:

Which is totally awesome. Putin is a petty thug. He needs to sit in a Supermax for his crimes. The Russian people need to depose him, and try a do over with democracy. I am sure the world, and NATO will appreciate it, that is, after they voluntarily give up their nuclear weapons and repay Ukraine, Syria, Georgia, etc., for damages. They've lost the privilege of keeping them, since they openly threatened the world with them. The present Russian gvmt. has proven they are too irresponsible to keep a nuclear arsenal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 9:06 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

Then act like the Russian people are not capable of critical thinking.

Malcolm wrote:

They are quite clearly capable of critical thinking, once armed with facts, such as the cops in the vudeo.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 9:09 PM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Jesse said:

And yes, there is a chance it will not happen, but there are many signs that this situation will degrade over time. It's best to be prepared just in case this scenario arises. TBH from what I can observe happening Russia is not simply be sanctioned, they are being cut off from the rest of the world in every imaginable way.

Malcolm wrote:

Russia leaves Ukraine, Putin faces trial in The Hague, and all will be well.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

Cool?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, but it does not mean this “I” is anything more than a convention for the series of aggregates, just as “we” is a convention for an aggregate of people, and so on, without having any more reality than being a designation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 11:02 PM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Shinjin said:

I would also put an emphasis on learning survivalist skills such as hunting, fishing, and making shelter. Most people will be handicapped in those areas if all hell broke loose.

Malcolm wrote:

If there is a nuclear war, there will be no game to hunt, fish to catch, nor anywhere to find shelter.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 6th, 2022 at 11:21 PM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Robert Gates’ oped in Wapo today:

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/2022/03/03/why-ukraine-should-force-a-total-overhaul-of-our-national-security-strategy/>

Unknown said:

Vladimir Putin’s invasion of Ukraine has ended Americans’ 30-year holiday from history. For the first time since World War II, the United States faces powerful, aggressive adversaries in Europe and Asia seeking to recover past glory along with claimed territories and spheres of influence. All in defiance of an international order largely shaped by the United States that has kept the peace among great powers for seven

decades. The Russian and Chinese challenge to this peaceful order has been developing for a number of years. Putin's war has provided the cold shower needed to awaken democratic governments to the reality of a new world, a world in which our recent strategy — including the “pivot” to Asia — is woefully insufficient to meet the long-term challenges we face.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 12:17 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

If there is a nuclear war, there will be no game to hunt, fish to catch, nor anywhere to find shelter.

Crazywisdom said:

Depends on the size of the war. Tactical nukes don't wipe out continents. The full War Games scenario is unlikely. A regional nuclear war could be possible, but full scale global nuclear warfare is extremely unlikely precisely because it means extinction.

Shinjin said:

Exactly.

Malcolm wrote:

Wishful thinking.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 12:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Norwegian said:

snip

Queequeg said:

Of course I'm skeptical about these videos of captured Russian soldiers, but they looked and sounded sincere. If not, they are superb actors.

I want to believe that they are speaking truthfully and giving us an accurate picture of the POV of ordinary Russians. That gives hope that there are ways to avoid the end game that seems to be coming.

Malcolm wrote:

There is this today:



And here is a translation of said document:

Take aways:

Our conditional deadline is June. Conditional because in June there will be no economy left in Russia – there will be nothing left. By and large, next week there will be a collapse (in Russia) to either of the two sides, simply because the situation cannot remain under current conditions.

...

By and large, Russia does not have an out. There are no options for a possible victory, only of losses – this is it.

100% we've repeated our mistake from last century, when we decided to kick the "weak" Japan in order to achieve a quick victory, and it turned our army was in a state of total calamity.

...

Now we are stuck waiting until some mentally screwed up advisor convinces the top to start a conflict with Europe, with demands to reduce the sanctions – they either loosen the sanctions or war. What if the West refuses? In that instance I won't exclude that we will be pulled into a real international conflict, just like Hitler in 1939. Our "Z" will be equated to the Swastika.

Is there a possibility of a localized nuclear strike? Yes. Not for any military objectives. Such a weapon won't help with the breach of the defenses. But with a goal of scaring everyone else (The West).

...

Our current position is like Germany in 1943-1944 – but that's our STARTING position in Ukraine.

...

Third, and this is the most disgusting and sad, I personally do not believe in Putin's will to sacrifice himself when he does not even allow his closest ministers and advisors to be in his vicinity. Whether it's due to his fear of COVID or a possible assassination is irrelevant. If you are scared for the most trusted people to be near you, then how could you possibly choose to destroy yourself and those dearest to you.

Original source:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 1:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

This is all USA's fault.

Malcolm wrote:

Ok Glenn Greenwald.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:14 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

The West is wearing rose tinted glasses with Ukrainian ability to defend itself. Putin will flatten the entire country if he has to.

Malcolm wrote:

The Soviet–Afghan War (1979–1989). Ukrainians have allies all around it who will supply weapons to them for as long as it takes. Much better weapons than the Mujahideen were armed with by the USA.

Crazywisdom said:

Just see Syria as the scrimmage game. Now Russia has bet it's entire future. He's not going to be deposed. If I were Europe I would at least try to block his access to the oceans and seas. But honestly, there is no path to defeat Putin here.

Malcolm wrote:

Putin is bankrupting his nation. The economy of Russia (1.6T) 2/3rds that of Italy (2.2T). It will be the same story as Afghanistan. 100% guaranteed.

Crazywisdom said:

Russia and China and survive any siege now. Sometimes it's difficult to admit defeat, especially when it happens in the first minute of the first round.

Malcolm wrote:

Russia lost by invading. They should not have even played the game.

There is no upside for Russia. (1) They don't gain security from NATO, (2) there are no Nazi's to denazify, (3) they were removed from the world banking system, (4) they will suffer a major embargo on oil (it's coming), (5) US makes a deal with Maduro and Iran to replace Russian oil, (6) Ukrainians will never accept Russian rule, and (7) Russia will

become China's bitch.

Putin really f\*\*cked up this time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Meanwhile in America #beltway:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:47 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Shinjin said:

Exactly.

Malcolm wrote:

Wishful thinking.

Crazywisdom said:

It's realistic, especial when Russia and China may have already achieved tech superiority in their ICBMs. They have the initiative now. Let's say they nuke Kyev.... The West will have no answers.

Malcolm wrote:

Wishful thinking.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:51 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Sure, put together bug out bags, never a bad idea. My Jewish in laws recommend

jewelry as a portable form of wealth and sometimes currency.

Beyond that the best we can do is practice and use this as a stark reminder of impermanence. Ruminating over the various possibilities is unlikely to be productive. This would be different if a person had inside information, concrete ability to affect outcomes, etc. but most of these discussions are things out of our hands. Problem solving involves concrete decision making, when it is based on wavering anxieties it's not actually problem solving.

Co-rumination is a thing people do sometimes to deal with anxiety. In that respect it can be a helpful outlet at times, but it can also become a source of anxiety itself.

Crazywisdom said:

You're just admitting citizens have no power in democracies. And that is what autocratic elites in democrats have been cultivating for decades.

Johnny Dangerous said:

So what? That's always been the case. There has never been a time in history where foreign policy decisions were actually included in the democratic process.

Malcolm wrote:

We live in a representative democracy, so you are not correct here. Congress is regularly consulted by the Executive Branch on foreign policy issues. It requires an act of Congress to declare war.

If you don't like US foreign policy, vote in new leaders.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 2:57 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

Reporting that Russian media reports threats to use tactical nukes.

Caoimhghín said:

What does this say in English?

Malcolm wrote:

Twitter translate tool renders:

Рашисти на своїх телепомийках заговорили про застосування тактичної ядерної зброї проти України. Черговий спосіб шантажувати Захід. Останній має нарешті висунути Росії ультиматум про припинення обстрілів. Треба зрозуміти нарешті всю відповідальність за наступні події

The racists talked about the use of tactical nuclear weapons against Ukraine at their TV stations. Another way to blackmail the West. The latter must finally issue an ultimatum to Russia to stop shelling. We must finally understand all the responsibility for the following events

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

So what? That's always been the case. There has never been a time in history where foreign policy decisions were actually included in the democratic process.

Malcolm wrote:

We live in a representative democracy, so you are not correct here. Congress is regularly consulted by the Executive Branch on foreign policy issues. It requires an act of Congress to declare war.

If you don't like US foreign policy, vote in new leaders.

Johnny Dangerous said:

The last formal declaration of war was what, WWII?

Malcolm wrote:

The Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq Resolution of 2002. We don't use the word "war" any more. We have a defense department, now, not a war department. We have not used the terminology of "department of war" since 1947.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Perpetually.

Malcolm wrote:

Perhaps. But to claim these wars and military engagements are not a product of democratic process in our country is an error, passing the buck. We have treaties we have signed, which have drawn us into a number of conflicts. Since we signed them, they are US law, like Article 5 of NATO.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 3:27 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Queequeg said:  
Putin really screwed.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes. He just sold his whole country to China.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 3:44 AM  
Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations  
Content:  
Queequeg said:  
Putin really screwed.

Malcolm wrote:  
Yes. He just sold his whole country to China.

Queequeg said:  
It would be comical how stupendously he screwed up, but for the people who are going to get ground into mince meat because of his error.

Malcolm wrote:  
But it is a good lesson for us. We need to forgo the idea that building up the economies of authoritarian regimes (whether left or right) is going to turn them into our friends and pave the way for their entry into the liberal democratic order.

Fukuyama is probably regretting that End of History book title now. Anyway, he published this op-ed in FT Friday:

<https://www.ft.com/content/d0331b51-5d0e-4132-9f97-c3f41c7d75b3>

He sums up:  
The travails of liberalism will not end even if Putin loses. China will be waiting in the wings, as well as Iran, Venezuela, Cuba and the populists in western countries. But the world will have learnt what the value of a liberal world order is, and that it will not survive unless people struggle for it and show each other mutual support. The Ukrainians, more than any other people, have shown what true bravery is, and that the spirit of 1989 remains alive in their corner of the world. For the rest of us, it has been slumbering and is being reawakened.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 3:51 AM  
Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations  
Content:  
Johnny Dangerous said:

That's really beside the point, or rather it proves my point The machinations of "democracy" as far as war goes really have nothing to do with the will of the populace, but rather the will of PR people, weapons industry, large corporate interests, politicians with empire-forward agendas etc. Of course everything can be a democratic decision somehow on paper.

The Iraq invasion was historically unpopular across the globe, obviously including here in the US.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it is the will of the people, since we elected these people. You want to change policies? Change the leadership.

The power of elections was proven by the Trump Administration. He managed to convince a sizable portion of our population to resume the disastrous isolationism of Hoover, and combined it with the graft and corruption of Mckinley. He undermined NATO, gutted State, etc.

That same power was proven by Biden's election, who has proven to be one of the most competent presidents we have had in years, by every metric you can imagine.

So, I just don't share your cynicism about our government, warts and all.

The lesson of Ukraine is, that when a people say and go to great lengths over decades to demonstrate that they want a liberal democracy, and do everything in their power to institute one, we should support it and defend it. Because frankly, liberal democracies are just better governments, and people are happier under them.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 3:57 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 4:11 AM

Title: Re: Prayers for the People of the Ukraine

Content:

Shinjin said:

Pray that they are born in Sukhavati.

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely, unless they are Buddhists.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 4:23 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I feel like this barely even needs to be said, but the range of politicians that one can vote for in the US largely share the same foreign policy.

Malcolm wrote:

Then support a different range of politicians if you want a different foreign policy. I think most Americans, frankly, like US Foreign policy for the most part. They complain about this and that, but they keep voting in people who preserve the liberal order as it stands. It is not because we are idiots, it is because it has been to our collective advantage.

Fukuyama's point is very sound:

Liberalism is a doctrine, first enunciated in the 17th century, that seeks to control violence by lowering the sights of politics. It recognises that people will not agree on the most important things — such as which religion to follow — but that they need to tolerate fellow citizens with views different from their own.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 4:59 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I feel like this barely even needs to be said, but the range of politicians that one can vote for in the US largely share the same foreign policy.

Malcolm wrote:

Then support a different range of politicians if you want a different foreign policy. I think most Americans, frankly, like US Foreign policy for the most part. They complain about this and that, but they keep voting in people who preserve the liberal order as it stands. It is not because we are idiots, it is because it has been to our collective advantage.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I do. Those politicians are largely denied access to power, much like what happened with Bernie and the DNC, it's been this way forever.

Malcolm wrote:

No, they have not been "denied access" to power. Progressive candidates do not have enough people to vote them into office beyond the east and west coast.

Bernie lost his lawsuit against the Democrats. Sure, I was pissed about that turn of affairs too. However, its pretty clear that Bernie did not actually have enough support in the American public to win the national Democratic primary at the convention (both



times). Clinton took that primary 2,842 to Sanders 1,865. Perhaps had he then run as independent, he might have won. Or he would have ensured a Trump victory anyway.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 5:06 AM

Title: Re: Prayers for the People of the Ukraine

Content:

Shinjin said:

Pray that they are born in Sukhavati.

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely, unless they are Buddhists.

Shinjin said:

How about phowa? I have read about some Tibetan masters such as Shabkar doing phowa on insects and animals. Why wouldn't it be possible with humans?

Malcolm wrote:

You have to train quite a bit to do this, basically, one has to be a mahāsiddha. Really, the only thing people can do is dedicate merit so that the dead people from this war on both sides might someday meet the Dharma and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 5:36 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Political consensus is partially (I'd largely, but trying to be fair) manufactured, not some organic will of the populace.

Malcolm wrote:

In a democracy, anytime any majority comes to agreement about an issue, the dissenting party will always claim their opponent's consensus is manufactured, a result of manipulation, "if only people knew the facts," and so on. It happens on both the right and the left. As a result, very broadly no one in a liberal democracy is 100% happy with much of what happens in their governments. But they are still responsible for what happens in their governments, 100% of the time. Democracy, as you know, is slow, messy, provides uneven results, and is generally inefficient in many ways. However, the general outcome of liberal democracy is that people are, over all, happier than in autocracies. We are more prosperous, and there are more opportunities for everyone. But not everyone's needs are met, nor can they be. That is a socialist fantasy.

The people do not have a unified will. There are too many of us, and too many of us have very different opinions about the world, so liberal democracies tend to represent an averaging out of the will of the people. For example, it was never the "unified will of the

people" that the US should preserve slavery after the Revolution. Some people wanted slavery, some people opposed it. Eventually, slavery was ended. The point is that everyone gets a voice. Everyone gets a say. If they choose not to use that voice, that's their fault. If that voice is silenced, as in the voter suppression that plagues every election in our country, that needs to be dealt with. When we vote, we don't always get our way. But at least we get a say, unlike for example, in Putin's Russia, Xi's China, Maduro's Venezuela, or Ortega's Nicaragua, etc. Because we get a say, slavery was ended, the work week was reduced from up to 80 hours a week to 40, civil rights laws were passed, and so on. But it is a slow, and not very attractive process. But it is very beneficial for us in the end, and well, I don't want to think of the alternative...

Johnny Dangerous said:  
Chomsky...

Malcolm wrote:  
One of the most over-rated public intellectuals of all time.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 5:42 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Caoimhghín said:  
Who are "the racists" I wonder? Does he mean Putin or is he calling the West "racists" as a kind of polemic?

ratna said:  
It should be "Rashists", meaning "Russian Fascists."  
[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Russian\\_fascism\\_%28ideology%29](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Russian_fascism_%28ideology%29)

Malcolm wrote:  
So basically the Russian equivalent of MAGA.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 7:12 AM  
Title: Re: Prayers for the People of the Ukraine  
Content:

Leo Rivers said:  
Somewhere I seem to have read something to the effect "Don't some Buddha fields accept virtuous non-Buddhists?" Or is this just some Heavens?

Malcolm wrote:  
Not a question of accept. This is a buddhafield. I have never heard however that pure buddhafields are accessible to nonbuddhists.

In any case, where one takes birth is a result of karma, nothing else.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 8:07 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Politicians and pundits did not achieve the 40 hour work week nor civil rights. You talk about Zinn's People History from time to time, did you actually read it?

Malcolm wrote:

Sure they did. That's why these things are now law. One can agitate all one wants, but until it becomes law, welll...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 10:06 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Interesting that article from The Intercept on "this sounds like this" logic:

<https://theintercept.com/2022/03/06/russia-john-mearsheimer-propaganda/>

Malcolm wrote:

The intercept is so dumb. Characterizing Anne Applebaum as a neocon is about as lazy as you get. Certainly, she was raised a conservative. She is now widely regarded in what passes for "conservative" circles these days as a heretic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 10:46 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

PeterC said:

They aren't the force they were half a century ago.

Malcolm wrote:

That's because most of their ground equipment is poorly maintained hardware made 50 years ago.

BTW, it may be the case that Russia's position on the UN Security Council is in fact illegal.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 10:57 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Interesting that article from The Intercept on “this sounds like this” logic:

<https://theintercept.com/2022/03/06/russia-john-mearsheimer-propaganda/>

Malcolm wrote:

The intercept is so dumb. Characterizing Anne Applebaum as a neocon is about as lazy as you get. Certainly, she was raised a conservative. She is now widely regarded in what passes for “conservative” circles these days as a heretic.

Johnny Dangerous said:

The Intercept is far from the first publication to categorize her as Neoconservative.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the Progressive press does. And all the conservative publications criticize her too. So, it’s just lazy characterizing her as a neocon.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 7th, 2022 at 12:16 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The Intercept is far from the first publication to categorize her as Neoconservative.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, the Progressive press does. And all the conservative publications criticize her too. So, it’s just lazy characterizing her as a neocon.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I see Neocon as a description of foreign policy posture, it doesn’t make someone necessarily socially or otherwise politically conservative.

Malcolm wrote:

It is nevertheless a lazy designation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 12:31 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

PeterC said:

... In the event of a first strike on an ally (eg Ukraine) there would be a second strike on Russian military assets....

Ayu said:

In which setting is Ukraine an ally of the US?

I suppose, Putin dared to attack Ukraine because it's not member of the NATO.

Malcolm wrote:

Ukraine belongs to Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe. It is a partner in European security. But, unfortunately, not a NATO member.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 1:48 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

US is giving it one heave ho and that will be the end of that.

Malcolm wrote:

Probably not. We supported to Mujahideen for a decade.

Trump is responsible for the chaos of the Afghanistan exit, not Biden, just as he is responsible for what is happening to Ukraine now.

Putin miscalculated, it's pretty clear.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 1:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

As for the column I find it equally strange that it hasn't been attacked yet from the air if the Ukrainian air force is up and going as the west states why hasn't it attacked the column? It's been there apparently bogged down or broken down or perhaps there are other reasons

Malcolm wrote:

UAF is saving it planes for other purposes. Ground troops has been systematically attacking parts of that column.

As for bombing Russia if they didn't have nukes well the fact is they do so it's out of the question.

Shotenzenjin said:  
Maybe it won't be as easy as you think.

Malcolm wrote:  
No one in their right mind would try to invade Russia. It's a country of 140 million people.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 2:44 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 3:11 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Dan74 said:  
This is not a bad source, just recently blocked in Russia:

<https://meduza.io/en>

Malcolm wrote:  
Ukrainian Chess:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 3:26 AM  
Title: Re: Proper transliteration of དམ་མཁའ་ [dhanma(?)]  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Need more context.

Also, in some older texts dha is used to represent ད, hence "dha" is Sanskrit "dā."

Chenda said:  
Good day.

I would like to ask for the proper transliteration of དམ་མཁའ་. I've tried the tools from THL to transliterate the word and hopefully get the Sanskrit, but it cannot read it for some reason. It says d+han+ma or dhanma(?). I've tried to check Tibetan dictionaries, but I cannot find it at all. I have a guess that it's དམ་མཁའ་ which corresponds to the Sanskrit ध्यान (dhāna), but the Sanskrit doesn't decline to dhāNMA (which is how I would transliterate

the word I'm asking about). The closest I could find is धनम् (dhánam), which is both the nominative and accusative form of धन (dhána).

This is connected to my recent inquiry about a specific mantra of Vasudhara, and my research has led me to this last piece. Any leads or information would help, especially if it's from an actual text.

A question would be a great start, I suppose. Is there any textual evidence of ཐན being used as the Tibetan transcription of धन (dhána) or धनम् (dhánam)?

Thank you in advance.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 5:01 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 7:09 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

What do we know of Ukrainian military losses to compare.?

Russia can afford to lose more considering its size

But good for the Ukrainians. May they keep it up

Malcolm wrote:

The Russians are so going to lose:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 7:43 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

It will take time. As they go down they will take ukraine with them sadly. I think Putin is in it for all the marbles.

Malcolm wrote:

The West will help rebuild Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 8:18 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Unknown said:

Another person granted anonymity said Kremlin officials were "carefully enunciating the word clusterf\*\*k" when describing the invasion.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.businessinsider.com/putin-close-circle-russian-officials-complaining-about-ukraine-invasion-rustamova-2022-3>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 9:39 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Ayu said:

\*crying\*

Not as a mod, just as fellow deciple, I'd like to remind us: It's Saka Dawa month.

Malcolm wrote:

No, Sagadawa is in late spring.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 8th, 2022 at 10:35 PM

Title: Re: Guru-Disciple relationship

Content:

stucked said:

Hello

I've been confused these days about guru-disciple relationship. Few months ago I attended a teaching by guru. Sometimes I feel like I want to be his disciple on and after the teaching, but by this thought, is this relationship established without I realize it? I'm afraid that when the relationship is established without me knowing it, there's something I'm breaking and I'm falling into the lower realms.

Thank you.

heart said:

If you go to an empowerment you are creating a relationship with that Guru. Don't go to empowerments with Gurus you don't want a relationship. It is easy.

/magnus



Malcolm wrote:

When people are innocent, and they don't know what they are doing, I don't think this really applies if they do not understand that they are taking vows and so on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 2:23 AM

Title: Re: Implied Samaya (Action Tantra)

Content:

Hazel said:

When you receive an action tantra class empowerment, is there any samaya implied that's not stated by the lama? Some lamas say that the samaya they're assigning is to just "become more compassionate" (His Holiness the Dalai Lama has done this as has Garchen Rinpoche as well as others), but I'm wondering if there's typically more to it than that in terms of compulsory behavior.

Malcolm wrote:

Consult Buddhist ethics by Kongtrul on this point.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

I think this is more a coping mechanism for folks. I'm guilty too, so I'm including myself here, but let's not pretend there is any relevance whatsoever to people "thinking through" areas like long term Geopolitical strategies which are nowhere near their fields of expertise on a Buddhist forum.

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. It's not like Biden, Blinken, and so on are consulting Dharmawheel for our stunning insights into Ukraine crisis. I do think the notion of immediate apocalypse is a little overwrought, personally.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 3:20 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This changes the game:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 3:40 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This changes the game:

Dorje Shedrub said:

How will they get the planes to Ukraine?

Malcolm wrote:

Via Germany, apparently.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 3:55 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Gas in the US is up to \$5 a gallon in some places. This is higher than it has ever been and its not clear how high they will go.

Genjo Conan said:

I live in California, \$5 a gallon is baby prices, for soft babies

Seriously, it's one of the big reasons EV takeup is so high here.

Malcolm wrote:

It won't last long. We are not very dependent on oil imports. Expect a lot of GOP "drill baby drill" chants.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:18 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

People easily forget the basic point of citizenship is to be informed which means discussions.

Malcolm wrote:

Strongly agree.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

This changes the game:

Crazywisdom said:

I read in this. Apparently, the US is doing a deal to supply Ukraine with fighter jets, but had promised some jets to Taiwan. So it asked Poland to cancel a similar deal so the jets can go to Ukraine. Not sure if I got that all correct, but there's a Taiwan connection.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2022/03/09/2003774463>

Crazywisdom said:

The US Department of Defense on Monday said that it has no plans to send F-16 jets scheduled for delivery to Taiwan to Poland instead, calling speculation raised by a US media report "not accurate."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:25 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Indeed. It's not like Biden, Blinken, and so on are consulting Dharmawheel for our stunning insights into Ukraine crisis. I do think the notion of immediate apocalypse is a little overwrought, personally.

Crazywisdom said:

People easily forget the basic point of citizenship is to be informed which means discussions. Everyone matters.

KristenM said:

And look at Zelenskyy. The best military leader turns out to be a comedian and former actor.

Malcolm wrote:

And can even dance in f\*\*k me pumps. Amazing.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:46 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

Tucker Carlson had an interesting reflections about the long-term impact of the current conflict on the US financial system and ordinary citizens. What is happening will indeed accelerate the demise of the US dollar as the world's reserve currency and the linkage between USD and energy markets.

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely:

<https://fortune.com/2021/10/07/dollar-hegemony-reserve-currency-threats-to-dominance/>

Bundokji said:

First, the idea of a crisis-induced loss of reserve currency status does not square well with history, as the dollar's de facto displacement of sterling happened gradually over the first half of the 20th century. Second, Britain's loss of reserve currency status contradicts assumptions of terminal decline. Of course, sterling's displacement went hand in hand with the decline of the British Empire, but Britain's wealth has ground inexorably higher in the 100 years since this process started -- and the pound remains a leading international currency.

Malcolm wrote:

As for the rest of TC's comments, well, talk is cheap.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

So, I have a question about this - I get that we, in the US, don't get much oil from Russia. Europe does. I'm not sure who else gets Russian oil. India?

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.statista.com/statistics/1100591/russia-main-crude-oil-export-destinations/>

Queequeg said:

I'm wondering how much the current price of a barrel actually reflects supplies and how

much is a combination of hysteria and profit taking. I don't see how prices come down in the next few months. I'm sure we will spike, but that won't last. The time frame I'm thinking is through November.

Malcolm wrote:

My guess? Prices will be down well before elections. Americans are not going to priced out of July 4th travel.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 4:56 AM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

KristenM said:

And look at Zelenskyy. The best military leader turns out to be a comedian and former actor.

Malcolm wrote:

And can even dance in f\*\*k me pumps. Amazing.

Crazywisdom said:

I bet he did a ton of coke and psychedelics.

Malcolm wrote:

Maybe that's what Putin needs, to drop some acid or do some shrooms. He is one uptight MF.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 5:19 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Unlikely:

<https://fortune.com/2021/10/07/dollar-hegemony-reserve-currency-threats-to-dominance/>

First, the idea of a crisis-induced loss of reserve currency status does not square well with history, as the dollar's de facto displacement of sterling happened gradually over the first half of the 20th century. Second, Britain's loss of reserve currency status contradicts assumptions of terminal decline. Of course, sterling's displacement went hand in hand with the decline of the British Empire, but Britain's wealth has ground inexorably higher in the 100 years since this process started -- and the pound remains a leading international currency.

As for the rest of TC's comments, well, talk is cheap.

Bundokji said:

It is unlikely to happen suddenly, but the transition was in the happening before this particular crisis.

Malcolm wrote:

No, it wasn't.

Bundokji said:

The excessive use of economic sanctions that are enabled by having the USD as a reserve currency and its relation to existing financial systems made cryptos a favorite alternative for some terrorist organizations and even states.

Malcolm wrote:

China does not permit crypto, they are deeply invested in US treasuries.

Bundokji said:

I have heard that more countries are seeking alternatives and working on it, including Russia, China, India, Iran and Turkey. Those represent a major share of the world's economy.

Malcolm wrote:

They will have a hard time finding a better guarantee than the largest world economy.

Bundokji said:

What is also interesting is the neutral stance of Saudi in this conflict. Saudi refused Biden's demand to increase oil production.

Malcolm wrote:

The last time an OPEC member went awol, it resulted in the first Gulf war.

Bundokji said:

In a recent interview between MBS and The Atlantic, MBS threatened to withdraw some of Saudi investment in the US and to buy weapons from "eastern countries". Few years ago, Kuwait decided to have a basket of currencies as its reserve ending pegging the value of its currency to the USD. Even Israel is hesitant to take a clear stance.

Malcolm wrote:

All of this is besides the point.

Bundokji said:

The weaker stance of the western bloc in this conflict...

Malcolm wrote:

???

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 5:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

No, it wasn't.

Bundokji said:

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Petroyuan>

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.forbes.com/sites/douglasbulloch/2018/04/26/the-petro-dollar-is-a-myth-the-petro-yuan-mere-fantasy/?sh=364669076a14>

Bundokji said:

Inevitably, stories about the toppling of the "Petro-dollar" and the long yearned for rise of an alternative reserve currency, one not dependent on the whims of a capricious political elite in Washington, have proliferated across the alter-net and on the state-backed media platforms of Russia and China.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 5:40 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

He is selling "opinions"...

Malcolm wrote:

Anyone who relies on Tucker Carlson is a fool.

Bundokji said:

His utterances would resonate with many of which their intelligence level is beside the point.

Malcolm wrote:

As the saying goes, "There is a sucker born every minute."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 6:03 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Petroyuan>

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.forbes.com/sites/douglasbulloch/2018/04/26/the-petro-dollar-is-a-myth-the-petro-yuan-mere-fantasy/?sh=364669076a14>

Bundokji said:

Inevitably, stories about the toppling of the "Petro-dollar" and the long yearned for rise of an alternative reserve currency, one not dependent on the whims of a capricious political elite in Washington, have proliferated across the alter-net and on the state-backed media platforms of Russia and China.

I fail to see the connection between what you quoted and that countries are seeking alternatives before the current crisis, something you denied previously.

Malcolm wrote:

You brought up Petroyuans. I did not deny that some countries might seek to get out of the US reserve currency system, I pointed out instead that the idea there is actually a viable alternative at this time is a fantasy, and everyone knows it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 6:08 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Just one point... He's complaining that Lindsey Graham was in Ukraine agitating for war in 2017. Carlson failed to mention anything about Crimea which was the real reason for those statements. He took them out of context to argue that people in DC want war with Russia. That is some qanon level paranoia.

Bundokji said:

My main take from what he said is that many American people will be negatively affected by the current policies. Usually, when policies are sold, the negatives are downplayed.

While the effects of the sanctions will be most felt in Russia, the short and long term effects on those who are imposing them are less spoke about. To that extent, i see value in what he says.

Malcolm wrote:

Everyone who pays attention is quite aware of these things. If they need Tucker Carlson to point it out to them...



Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 6:48 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

You brought up Petroyuans. I did not deny that some countries might seek to get out of the US reserve currency system, I pointed out instead that the idea there is actually a viable alternative at this time is a fantasy, and everyone knows it.

Bundokji said:

Had they known it, they would not have tried.

Malcolm wrote:

Sometimes people fly to close to the sun.

Bundokji said:

Many other nations have expansionist ambitions, or simply they do not want to be held hostage to a financial system that works in favor of their rival. The excessive use of financial sanctions would further fuel the efforts to find alternatives.

Malcolm wrote:

I would say that excess use of force against civilians which result in sanctions is likely to permanently damage ambitions of such expansionist countries, resulting in the opposite of what they want.

Bundokji said:

Many US allies are taking somehow a neutral stance, possibly as a perpetration for a future where the US wont be as dominant.

Malcolm wrote:

??? Neutral stance to what? An oil embargo against Russia? Its not a neutral stance, its a stance of economic dependency. However, the Russians and Germany, etc, are going to discover, sooner rather than later, that under the present conditions, Russia will not be able to meet their obligations to deliver oil that has already been purchased.

Bundokji said:

I thought that the stance of oil rich countries would be particularly relevant in this context. It is not only Saudi who threatened to turn east, but UAE also abstained from voting against Russia at the security council and the UN assembly.

Malcolm wrote:

In the first case, MSB wants something. Not sure what. In the second case, oligarchs.

Bundokji said:

Those countries have been suckers for the US since their independence. Another example is Israel that had a history of strong partnership with the US. Change in interests changes attitude and the formation of alliances.

Malcolm wrote:

Israel has to maintain a pretense of independence for their own sense of self-worth.

Bundokji said:

Media helps shape public opinion (Tucker Carlson or otherwise). For what its worth, circa 2M people, mostly US citizens i assume, watched his video since yesterday.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, there are a lot of people who are not used to critical thinking. That is TC's fan base.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 7:31 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 8:01 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

??? Neutral stance to what? An oil embargo against Russia? Its not a neutral stance, its a stance of economic dependency. However, the Russians and Germany, etc, are going to discover, sooner rather than later, that under the present conditions, Russia will not be able to meet their obligations to deliver oil that has already been purchased.

Bundokji said:

I have heard that Saudi refused to increase their oil production (as they usually do per US demands) to ease the markets. A decrease in Russian oil and gas production is offset by the increase in prices, minimizing the effects of sanctions on their economy.

Malcolm wrote:

As for the Saudis, I learned they want more support in the Yemen civil war and immunity for MSB.

As for your other argument, I don't think so. Right now Russian oil is being sold at a discount.

Bundokji said:

Germany decided to increase its military spending, and while in the short term this is promoted as increasing their contribution to NATO, longer term is a move towards less dependence on US protection. I expect similar moves by Japan. As to energy independence, in this crisis nuclear plants have been targeted. I assume that renewable energy present easier military targets than fossil fuel in the case of military confrontation short of nuclear war. A whole solar farm can be easily destroyed and would take much longer time to repair, than to say, a damage to an oil or gas pipeline.

Malcolm wrote:

No one bothers to hit pipelines. They hit refineries.

Bundokji said:

In the first case, MSB wants something. Not sure what. In the second case, oligarchs. I think those regimes are better aligned with the republicans than the democrats. Also i guess the DNC is more funded by renewable energy companies than the RNC which is funded by oil and gas companies.

Malcolm wrote:

They are the same companies.

Bundokji said:

Israel has to maintain a pretense of independence for their own sense of self-worth. The pretense is two sided in my opinion. Israel's alliance with the US was never for free. They have things to gain by forming new alliances and hopefully being more open to the rest of the region where they exist.

Malcolm wrote:

Only if they actually succeed in allying with the Saudi's against Iran. Muslims of all stripes still think Israel has no right to exist.

Bundokji said:

They still have equal rights to vote.

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, they sure do. And the GOP is incapable of winning anymore without cheating.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 9:44 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

On the other hand, Biden used harsh rhetoric during the elections, but did not act on it.

Malcolm wrote:  
You really underestimate Biden.

But frankly, this is all beside the point.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:52 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:58 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
Conclusion:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 11:20 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Nemo said:  
Digital Yuan is a stable coin that can be used for trade without banking intermediaries.

Malcolm wrote:  
Um, no. It is a so called Central Bank Digital Currency. It's meant for retail and is backed by the Peoples Bank of China.

It is unlike "crypto" currencies which have no backing by a central bank. Like other digital currencies, it's anonymity is limited.

<https://www.db.com/news/detail/20210714-digital-yuan-what-is-it-and-how-does-it-work>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 11:39 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:  
Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.reuters.com/markets/europe/oil-markets-fret-over-supply-shock-some-buyers-shun-russia-2022-03-08/>

Unknown said:

LONDON, March 8 (Reuters) - The U.S. ban on Russian oil and gas imports is likely to leave more cargoes at sea with no buyers, and the European Union's decision to continue imports was unlikely to make much difference to disarray in Russian oil trade, analysts said on Tuesday.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 9:13 PM

Title: Re: Start preparing for War Escalations

Content:

Boris said:

Now, it is difficult for me to imagine which sick brain at the head of China would worsen all the above-mentioned trade partnerships in order to work only with Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.facebook.com/zz6677/posts/10224903516792419>

[/quote]

Yes. Still, China will benefit from the firesale that Russia has become.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:27 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

That's a first.

Bundokji said:

Seconded by Tulsi Gabbard in an interview earlier today

Queequeg said:

Not impressive company. She has turned out to be a jackass.

Malcolm wrote:

We should welcome Bundokji's trolling, if only to confirm how out of touch with reality the Trump wing of the GOP actually is from their own side.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:34 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

Indeed the reason there is demand for an alternative is because for the past few decades the US has increasingly used the way the payments system is structured to pursue national political goals.

Malcolm wrote:

But you have already explained why it is impractical for such an alternative payment system to function. Basically, either the size of the US economy would have to shrink substantially, or the size of the Chinese economy would have to increase substantially. But the latter is unlikely and the former is too. Recall, the Chinese were issuing warnings to DC in 2008 when they were concerned about the value of treasuries during the melt down.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

Tucker Carlson had an interesting reflections

PeterC said:

That's a first.

Bundokji said:

Seconded by Tulsi Gabbard in an interview earlier today

Malcolm wrote:

Meanwhile, back in the real world:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:42 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

Seconded by Tulsi Gabbard in an interview earlier today

Queequeg said:

Not impressive company. She has turned out to be a jackass.

Bundokji said:

I think she strikes a balance between being too institutional like a standard politicians, and too individualistic like Trump

Malcolm wrote:

Seconded, she is a jackass. The only reason she has a career is because she is on Faux news.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:48 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nemo said:

They are solving the biggest problem with crypto first.

Malcolm wrote:

It is not "crypto". It is a state-backed, central-bank guaranteed currency in digital form. It is not tied to churning out irrelevant solutions to math problems no one cares about.

Nemo said:

Using it at retailers and for everyday purchases. It would be cheaper and more practical for international transactions. Imagine traveling to a new country and simply paying for everything with your phone with no fees.

Malcolm wrote:

One of the first things that went down in Russia was paying for things with your Iphone. And, Denmark is already largely cashless. I personally rarely carry cash, which is why I owe the town dump 2 bucks.

Nemo said:

The US will have to compete or be left behind. E-CNY could be better than SWIFT.

Malcolm wrote:

Two completely unrelated systems. Better lay off the "Yukon gold" there Nemo.

Hey mods, can we split the financial thing, it is off topic, related but off topic.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.wsj.com/articles/swift-banking-system-sanctions-biden-11645745909?>

Unknown said:

The Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication, or Swift, is the financial-messaging infrastructure that links the world's banks. Swift doesn't handle actual money transfers itself. It is a messaging system, a secure way banks transmit transfer requests to each other. Money moving from one account to another often passes by multiple banks before landing in the final destination, particularly if it involves a foreign currency. Swift routes messages with instructions from one bank to another, allowing them to know where the money should ultimately land. The Belgium-based system is run by its member banks and handles millions of daily payment instructions across more than 200 countries and territories and 11,000 financial institutions. Iran and North Korea are cut off from it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 11:06 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nemo said:

I don't think you know what crypto is.

Cryptocurrency, sometimes called crypto-currency or crypto, is any form of currency that exists digitally or virtually and uses cryptography to secure transactions.

Apply pay is intermediated by your bank. E-CNY is digital cash that can be sent between parties while offline.

Malcolm wrote:

OED:

A digital currency in which transactions are verified and records maintained by a decentralized system using cryptography, rather than by a centralized authority.

<https://www.cnbc.com/2022/01/11/china-digital-yuan-pboc-to-expand-e-cny-use-but-challenges-remain.html>

Also known as the e-CNY, it's designed to replace the cash and coins already in circulation. It is not a cryptocurrency like bitcoin, in part because it's controlled and issued by the central bank. Bitcoin is a decentralized digital currency that isn't backed by any central banks or a single administrator.

The whole point of crypto is that it is NOT administered and controlled by a central bank, that is, a government.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 9th, 2022 at 11:31 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Nemo said:

Stable coins are still crypto. Your idea is some libertarian nonsense.

Malcolm wrote:

Um, no Nemo.

Nemo said:

Since you can trade e-CNY offline clearly it is cryptographic in nature. So Binance USD is not crypto?

Malcolm wrote:

No, this is not the case. Why don't you read up a bit on the Chinese white paper published last July:

One, it clearly distinguishes digital currency from cryptocurrencies:

Adopting blockchain and encryption technology, cryptocurrencies such as Bitcoin are claimed to be decentralized and entirely anonymous. However, given their lack of intrinsic value, acute price fluctuations, low trading efficiencies and huge energy consumption, they can hardly serve as currencies used in daily economic activities. In addition, cryptocurrencies are mostly speculative instruments, and therefore pose potential risks to financial security and social stability. Moreover, they have been employed as payment instruments for money-laundering and other illegal economic activities. To tackle the relatively big price fluctuation concern of cryptocurrencies, some commercial institutions launched so-called “stablecoins”, and tried to stabilize their values by pegging them to sovereign currencies or related assets. Some commercial institutions even plan to launch global stablecoins, which will bring risks and challenges to the international monetary system, payment and clearing system, monetary policies, cross-border capital flow management and etc.

More importantly, it is fiat currency, like the dollar:

E-CNY is the digital version of fiat currency issued by the PBOC and operated by authorized operators. It is a value-based, quasi-account-based and account-based hybrid payment instrument, with legal tender status and loosely-coupled account linkage. It has the following connotations:

The encryption features are present for storage, not for generating the currency:

E-CNY adopts a variety of technologies, including digital certificate system, digital signature, and encrypted storage to make double-spending, illegal duplication and counterfeit, transaction falsification, and repudiation unfeasible. A multi-layer security system has been initially established to guarantee that e-CNY has a safe life cycle and risks are manageable.

Here is the white paper:

<http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4157443/4293696/2021071614584691871.pdf>

E-CNY is not what you are representing it to be.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 10th, 2022 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Timothy Snyder, Arne Westad, etc:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 10th, 2022 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

Of course, the fact that he's been weaponised by Russian propaganda makes him automatically untouchable for many here, and I partially understand.

Malcolm wrote:

Mearshiemer is just one opinion out of many in US academia. He belongs to a certain school of geopolitics. Like everyone else, he is an observer with opinions, some of which I disagree with, and find poorly argued, especially in light of Ukraine's long standing wish to join the Western European community, against more than a decade of Putin's open hostility to their nation, and in light of Russian promises to respect Ukrainian territorial integrity, signed by Lavrov in 1994.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 10th, 2022 at 9:35 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

<https://tompepinsky.com/2022/03/03/heres-why-mearsheimers-realist-take-is-so-exasperating/>

I have a different interpretation of what a realist should conclude about the Russian invasion of Ukraine and its antecedents. I start from a different premise: Russia is not a great power. It is obviously a declining power, objectively so. Its only claims to global power status are its petroleum reserves, its nuclear arsenal, and our collective memories of the Cold War. Take those away, and Russia is no more a great power than Turkey was in 1935.

The Soviet Union lost the Cold War decisively. Its empire fell into pieces, its regional alliance disappeared, and most of its former allies joined NATO. Russia lost, and the Western alliance won. Given this, it is not NATO's responsibility to protect Russian state security interests. It is Russia's responsibility to give wide berth to NATO, recognizing—as every realist should—that the strong do what they will, the weak do what they must. Russian proclamations that it gets to prioritize Putin's individual political survival over the logic of international relations are nothing more than idealist fantasies.

Objectively, no one wants to invade or destroy Russia, there are not and have never been plans for a NATO conquest of Russia. Russia had a good deal: they got to sell their petroleum and defend their territorial integrity with their aging nuclear arsenal. Invading Ukraine was a stupid strategic error made by a declining power that does not understand The Tragedy of Great Power Politics. In the immediate short run, Ukrainians will pay the prices for Russia's strategic errors, but in the long run, Russia will bear the consequences. It has demonstrated clearly the limits of its force projection capabilities, and united NATO and the EU and a bunch of other hard-hearted neutral states at the same time. As I like to say, if you've lost Singapore and Switzerland....

See how this works? One goes quickly from a different premise about what the objective facts of the realist world are, and reasons through the questions of “how should the world work?” and “what should a policymaker do.”

Lots of people object to realist analyses because they lack a clear moral position on violence and individual liberty. I share these views. But I also despise this realist way of thinking because it is so indeterminate, and because it leads to statements about what states' security interests which are, I think, either vacuous or hopelessly subjective.\*\* And that is why Mearsheimer's take is so exasperating.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 10th, 2022 at 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 10th, 2022 at 11:59 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

To be clear - I don't think any of us thinks the US should have a hand in any "regime change" in Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Let's just be honest here. Sanctions are aimed at regime change. And I disagree completely. We should have a hand in regime change in Russia.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 12:08 AM

Title: Re: Is Sadhguru enlightened?

Content:

Aemilius said:

'The Damar Tantra claims that, "Shivambu (Urine therapy) is capable of abolishing old age and various types of diseases and ailments."

This book is divided into two parts. Part one is organized according to ailment for your particular health concern. Part two is the original shivambu kalpa vidhi taken from the Damar Tantra. Most of the therapies in the Damar Tantra are for reversing aging and treating various ailments.'

"The Shivambu Kalpa Vidhi is part of a 5,000-year-old document called the Damar Tantra. This is linked to the Vedas, the sacred Hindu texts. Urine is the water of Shiva and is antibacterial, antifungal and antiviral. You can put it on wounds for healing. It's already structured to your DNA. You have to have a healthy diet. If you have alcohol, tobacco or meat – what I consider toxic substances – then all your systems will be toxic. Don't start urine therapy until you've looked at everything going into your body. You are making your best preventative medicine. It's like a gift to yourself. Face creams contain urea, and that's cow piss. I'd rather [use] my own piss."

TEIG O'MALLEY , yoga instructor

Malcolm wrote:

This thread gets more bizarre everyday.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 12:53 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

As for the hospital being hit and all the civilian deaths, this is what happens in a war. Not sure if you're old enough to remember the US war in Iraq. They hit hospitals, weddings and many other civilian targets. A 2 second google search yielded this:

<https://www.france24.com/en/20080503-us-air-strike-hits-sadr-city-hospital-iraq>

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, but we don't AIM at hospitals and civilians, unlike the Russian military:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/10/13/world/middleeast/russia-bombing-syrian-hospitals.html>

So your attempted whataboutism is just pathetic.

Dan74 said:

And I don't know if the Russian army has been especially brutal in this war or more brutal than the US in Iraq.

Malcolm wrote:

Not since the Vietnam war has the US ever engaged in anything like the desolation of Grozny or Aleppo. etc.

Dan74 said:

And yeah, the Russian Empire appears to be playing catchup in these evil stakes..

Malcolm wrote:

Catch up? The Russians have been ahead of us on that score since the invasion of Chechnya, not to mention Ukrainian Genocide, a.k.a the

<https://www.britannica.com/event/Holodomor>.

What is happening now is just a continuation of one hundred years of Russian genocidal policy towards Ukrainians.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 1:32 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

You can't really defend America when it comes to war.. We've been committing genocide since our country was established.. Native americans being the first group.

Malcolm wrote:

Yup. A national stain on our conscience. Our country was founded on the twin pillars of slavery and genocide. I've mentioned it often enough myself on these boards. I didn't forget.

Jesse said:

<https://www.commondreams.org/news/2022/01/21/saudi-bombings-kill-scores-civilians-including-children-yemen>

Malcolm wrote:

That's the Saudis.

Jesse said:

America is heavily involved in Yemen, they provide more than just weapons. America is guilty in an ongoing genocide right now, literally.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, no, we are not.

<https://arabcenterdc.org/resource/a-timeline-of-the-yemen-crisis-from-the-1990s-to-the-present/>

We not only sold the Saudis' arms under the Trump administration, we also supplied 5.5 billion dollars in aid directly to Yemen in 2017.

One of the reasons the Saudi's won't release more oil is due to the fact that we are not supporting them to their satisfaction in their proxy war with Iran.

The Biden administration only agreed to a new weapons sale, 280 air to air missiles, in Oct. 21.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

One is of course welcome to believe that the Russian war machine is more evil than the US one, if it helps one sleep better at night. The USSR surely inflicted more suffering on its people, at least in its first 30 years. But when it comes to the rest of the world, whether due to its reach or a general harmful disposition or both, there is no way the USSR/Russia comes even close to the body count the USA is responsible for.

Malcolm wrote:

Really, so you really think the United States killed more than 6-9 million people, which is the number Stalin by himself dispatched? Then there is the million or so under Nicolas 1, etc.

The total number of casualties in all US wars combined, including civilians, is no more than 3 million, over a 250 year history.

It's difficult to come up with a number for Native Americans who were killed during the 19th century, because the US did not count native people in the census. It's anyone's guess. However, the estimate population of Native people can be gleaned here: <https://nativestudy.wordpress.com>

So, no Dan, your guess is utter bullshit based on no facts. We know quite well how many people Stalin killed under his regime.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:03 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

Except we are, our own state department has been calling us out on it.

Malcolm wrote:

Sure, people have reservations about things. A responsible state department examines many sides of an issue. The job of an inspector general is to voice concerns.

And those arms sales called into question happened during the Pompeo State department.

<https://www.politico.com/news/2020/08/11/state-department-civilians-middle-east-393584>

We are out of Yemen. But the Houthis keep firing rockets at the Saudis. So we sold the Saudi's 280 air to air missiles for defensive purposes.

You are not presenting a very complete picture of the situation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:10 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

The problem with sanctions is that they do not seem to work. Iran has had terrible sanctions for many years which have resulted in deficits in diabetes medicine and so on - however no regime change in sight.

Malcolm wrote:

They do work. But in order to work, the US has to maintain a consistent foreign policy from one administration to another. Trump savaged NATO, the State Department, alliances, and so on, and interrupted 70 years of diplomacy. The reason why Biden has continued many Trump era policies is that once the ground changes, one is kind of stuck with it. Imagine it as trench warfare. In this case, because Trump was a terrible general, the US nearly lost ground. Biden, being a pretty good general, strengthened our position. Nonetheless, we have to deal with emboldened enemies like Putin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:15 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Are you admitting you're one of those complexly nuanced supporters of Putin?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course he is.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:32 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

I provided the history of the situation, and the fact we still haven't stopped selling them arms. Considering our present situation with oil, do you fathom that we won't sell them more bombing munitions once the public freaks out and makes gas prices a primary issue in the next election?

Malcolm wrote:

The arms sale happened before the Russian invasion of Ukraine.

Jesse said:

I see very little difference between directly bombing civilians, and knowingly selling bombs to a country that is bombing civilians, the difference is marginal. Saudi is well protected, 99% of the rockets are taken down by their anti missile systems.

Malcolm wrote:

Right, and they needed to replenish them.

Jesse said:

Yes Iran is waging proxy wars on both Saudi, and Israel, both of whom are our allies,



which is why we are providing arms to them. We haven't however forced either of them to comply with higher standards in warfare, and which we ourselves still violate frequently enough.

Malcolm wrote:

Basically, you are a left-wing isolationist. This is ok. But I don't think this is very sound foreign policy.

Jesse said:

Nothing really justifies supporting genocide of civilians, even if an armed group is firing rockets at you/allies. You being a larger, more well funded country, spend the extra money, comply with international treaties and standards; go in and remove the armed groups. You don't bomb hospitals, and infrastructure, and blockade food and supplies for civilians harming/killing millions.

The primary reasons they can't stop these groups is because they committed genocide, displacing millions of people, which supplies constant streams of new soldiers/terrorists; however you want to designate them. When you murder civilians, they join militias and armies, go figure.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, its just not as straight-forward as you would like it to be:

Since March 2015, the coalition has conducted numerous indiscriminate and disproportionate airstrikes killing thousands of civilians and hitting civilian structures in violation of the laws of war, using munitions sold by the United States, United Kingdom, and others. Houthi forces have used banned antipersonnel landmines, recruited children, and fired artillery indiscriminately into cities such as Taizz, killing and wounding civilians, and launched indiscriminate ballistic missiles into Saudi Arabia. <https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2020/country-chapters/yemen>

Jesse said:

Followers of Zayd established themselves in north Yemen's rugged mountains in the ninth century. For the next thousand years, the Zaydis fought for control of Yemen with various degrees of success. A succession of Zaydi Imams ruled the community and Zaydis were the majority of the population in the mountains of the north. They fought against both the Ottomans and the Wahhabis in the 18th and 19th centuries.

With the collapse of the Ottoman Empire in 1918, a Zaydi monarchy took power in North Yemen called the Mutawakkilite Kingdom. The ruler, or imam, was both a secular ruler and a spiritual leader. Their kingdom fought and lost a border war with Saudi Arabia in the 1930s, losing territory to the Saudi state. They also enjoyed international recognition as the legitimate government of North Yemen. Their capital was in Taiz.

Malcolm wrote:

They are anti-American:

The American invasion of Iraq in 2003 deeply radicalized the Houthi movement, like it did many other Arabs. It was a pivotal moment. The Houthis adopted the slogan: “God is great, death to the U.S., death to Israel, curse the Jews, and victory for Islam,” in the wake of the U.S.-led invasion of Iraq. The group also officially called itself Ansar Allah, or supporters of God. It was a turning point largely unrecognized outside Yemen, another unanticipated consequence of George Bush’s Iraq adventures.

<https://www.brookings.edu/blog/markaz/2017/12/18/who-are-the-houthis-and-why-are-we-at-war-with-them/>

Should we refrain from supporting the Saudi war against the Houthis? Of course, but quite frankly, while the situation in Yemen is terrible, we didn't create it.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:35 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

It doesn't necessarily tell us what to support or do, that's a much more complicated decision.

Malcolm wrote:

The whataboutism should be considered off topic or another thread created for the Whataboutist party to waffle on and on.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 2:58 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

In my view, whataboutism

Malcolm wrote:

Generally speaking, whataboutism serves to draw false equivalencies.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 3:18 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

I think we should absolutely hold ourselves and others to higher standards.

Malcolm wrote:

That's just not how the concept of state sovereignty functions.

The fact is that the Houthis attacked the legitimate government of Yemen.

Yemen was on track to institute western style liberal democracy, was a US ally against Al Qaida, etc. Ex-president Saleh and the Houthis illegally deposed the elected president of Yemen, Hadi, in 2015.

This is a summary of what State has to say on the issue:

<https://www.state.gov/u-s-relations-with-yemen/>

Characterizing Yemen as a genocide by the Saudis or anyone else is just bollocks, quite frankly. The Houthis are, if anything, more responsible for this mess than the Saudis. They started this war, and it is their people who are suffering the most. If they want to stop the suffering of the northern Yemeni people, they should put down their arms.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 3:22 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Naw, sorry. Just because a bunch of y'all have decided to convert to Neocons doesn't mean people can't mention things.

Queequeg said:

Supporting Ukraine makes one a Neocon?

Malcolm wrote:

The general point of view of people to the left of the center left is always the same.

I was kidding a few years ago when I mentioned a few years ago that Trump's election put me in touch with my inner neocon/neoliberal. Not kidding now. Labels are not really that helpful in these sorts of things, but hey, if it makes happy to call me a neocon, that's fine by me. I've never made any secret of the fact that I prefer US hegemony to that of China. Russia of course does not have enough power to muster a hegemony of anything but mud pits in Siberia. But they can still wreck a lot of damage on their neighbors.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 3:28 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

1) All the sudden legitimizing anything America does as not as bad because Pax Americana is better than Pax Putin.

Malcolm wrote:

There can never be a Pax Putin. Putin is too weak.

Mischaracterizing what evil the US has done in the world however, such as Dan as done, can't be allowed to stand, since it is grounded in zero facts.

Johnny Dangerous said:

2) Continually accusing anyone and everyone who even dares question the narrative of "Supporting Russia".

Malcolm wrote:

Apologizing for Russia isn't supporting Russia, it's one step removed. It's still atrocious.

Johnny Dangerous said:

3) Equating Democracy itself with maintenance of American imperial goals, assuming that military postures somehow automatically line up with just ideologies.

Malcolm wrote:

America doesn't have imperial goals. Much like Rome, its expansion was largely driven by what it perceived to be external threats: First Britain, then the Mexican empire, later Spain. By 1914, the US was largely concerned with consolidation. WWII and the collapse of the British empire paved the way for our hegemony, with Europe's blessing, by and large.

Spreading democracy used to be considered good for business, since in general the idea was that democracy and capitalism are interrelated. This is actually true, in fact. The capitalist development of Russia was stifled by Putin's authoritarianism, just as it is being reigned in by Xi.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 3:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

You would vote for George Bush?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course not. But according to JD's logic, the US involvement in the Balkan war was also a neoconservative action. I also think trashing the TPP was a big mistake. I did not support Bernie in this. I still voted for him. I also permanently ended my affection for the Green Party when I saw Jill Stein repeating RT talking points about Clinton.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 3:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

The leftist gang-up on Clinton was mostly misogyny funded by alt-right groups pretending to be on the left anyways.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, it was definitely misogyny, and it was widely supported by people on the left in the USA. I can't tell you how many people I know, who should have known better, who left the top of their ticket blank, because "Hillary."

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 4:18 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Talk about out of touch with reality.

On the other hand, finding myself on the same side as Karl Rove is a bit disconcerting.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 4:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shinjin said:

You would vote for George Bush?

Malcolm wrote:

Of course not. But according to JD's logic, the US involvement in the Balkan war was also a neoconservative action. I also think trashing the TPP was a big mistake. I did not support Bernie in this. I still voted for him. I also permanently ended my affection for the Green Party when I saw Jill Stein repeating RT talking points about Clinton.

Johnny Dangerous said:

I didn't say anything about the Balkans, I said your theoretical foreign policy posture has basically pivoted to neoconservative, and you pretty much agreed.

One of the premises of Neoconservative thought is that there are only two choices, an American-dominated world where the US must always aggressively pursue its interests (because those are everyone's interests, really), the other alternative is chaos. As far as I can tell, you agree with this.

Malcolm wrote:

I think that an American-dominated world is in everyone's best interest. The alternative is chaos, as the Trump administration proved this admirably, as did the Hoover administration (another isolationist administration that not only destroyed the American economy, but tolerated the rise of Fascism in Europe, along with an England that dropped the ball on this point as well).

Johnny Dangerous said:

I tend not to, and believe there may be more options than these. Further, I think that uncritically supporting US interventions as ideologically sound can lead to bad stuff, like Iraq.

Malcolm wrote:

I do not believe that the second invasion of Iraq was ever in anyone's interest. On the other hand, it was fomented by Dick Cheney almost exclusively, who through sheer force of delusion (he still believes in the WMD theory to this day) forced us into this conflict.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Far as the present situation, I am not sure what the US should do. However, it's important to remember that in any conflict no country has simple motivations.

Malcolm wrote:

I think we should arm the Ukrainians to the teeth. Putin's attempted assault on the liberal democratic order is far from over. Just read Alexander Dugin. These people are enemies of democracy in toto.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Often the strategic and tactical end is pretty well divorced from the moral one. In that sense, I have some sympathy for the realists position.

Malcolm wrote:

The Road to Unfreedom by Snyder really is required reading to understand what is going on. He says:

The fascism of the 1920s and 1930s, Ilyin's era, had three core features: it celebrated will and violence over reason and law; it proposed a leader with a mystical connection to his people; and it characterized globalization as a conspiracy rather than as a set of problems. Revived today in conditions of inequality as a politics of eternity, fascism serves oligarchs as a catalyst for transitions away from public discussion and towards political fiction; away from meaningful voting and towards fake democracy; away from the rule of law and towards personalist regimes.

Snyder, Timothy. The Road to Unfreedom (p. 16). Crown. Kindle Edition.

Basically, it boils down to this for me: if we do not support democratically elected governments abroad, our democracy, imperfect though it may be, will fail here in the

United States. We also need to recognize that Putin's attempts to degrade democracy wherever he can are real, are an explicit part of Russian foreign policy, and are driven by ideology as well, an ideology no less authoritarian than Soviet-style communism. In short, Putin is a fascist, and Russia is a fascist country.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 4:53 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah, well, I remember when it was “the end of history” and when America was “the last great superpower”. Turns out that was nonsense and we still live in a multipolar world, despite the Neocon/Neolib fantasy to the contrary.

Under those circumstances, desiring An exclusively American-dominated world seems out of touch, and perhaps dangerous and destabilizing in its own way.

Comparing Russia with pre WWII Germany simply seems crazy to me, sorry.

Malcolm wrote:

The comparisons are completely apt. But if you won't see it, well, that's not my problem. But you should understand that Putin revived a Russian fascist author named Ivan Ilyin, whose works are wildly popular in Russia these days.

Johnny Dangerous said:

After a new Russian Federation emerged from the defunct Soviet Union in 1991, Ilyin's short book *Our Tasks* began to circulate in new Russian editions, his collected works were published, and his ideas gained powerful supporters. He had died forgotten in Switzerland; Putin organized a reburial in Moscow in 2005. Ilyin's personal papers had found their way to Michigan State University; Putin sent an emissary to reclaim them in 2006. By then Putin was citing Ilyin in his annual presidential addresses to the general assembly of the Russian parliament. These were important speeches, composed by Putin himself. In the 2010s, Putin relied upon Ilyin's authority to explain why Russia had to undermine the European Union and invade Ukraine. When asked to name a historian, Putin cited Ilyin as his authority on the past.

Malcolm wrote:

Snyder, Timothy. *The Road to Unfreedom* (pp. 17-18). Crown. Kindle Edition.

Snyder does not have any patience for what he called the politics of inevitability in the US either:

The capitalist version of the politics of inevitability, the market as a substitute for policy, generates economic inequality that undermines belief in progress. As social mobility halts, inevitability gives way to eternity, and democracy gives way to oligarchy. An oligarch spinning a tale of an innocent past, perhaps with the help of fascist ideas, offers fake protection to people with real pain. Faith that technology serves freedom

opens the way to his spectacle. As distraction replaces concentration, the future dissolves in the frustrations of the present, and eternity becomes daily life. The oligarch crosses into real politics from a world of fiction, and governs by invoking myth and manufacturing crisis. In the 2010s, one such person, Vladimir Putin, escorted another, Donald Trump, from fiction to power.

Snyder, Timothy. The Road to Unfreedom (pp. 15-16). Crown. Kindle Edition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 5:32 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 5:46 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

I for one welcome our Chinese friends.

Malcolm wrote:

A very poor understanding of Adam Smith.

And she might do well to read Hayek's "The Road to Serfdom." You might too:

It is not difficult to see what must be the consequences when democracy embarks upon a course of planning which in its execution requires more agreement than in fact exists. The people may have agreed on adopting a system of directed economy because they have been convinced that it will produce great prosperity. In the discussions leading to the decision, the goal of planning will have been described by some such term as "common welfare," which only conceals the absence of real agreement on the ends of planning. Agreement will in fact exist only on the mechanism to be used. But it is a mechanism which can be used only for a common end; and the question of the precise goal toward which all activity is to be directed will arise as soon as the executive power has to translate the demand for a single plan into a particular plan. Then it will appear that the agreement on the desirability of planning is not supported by agreement on the ends the plan is to serve. The effect of the people's agreeing that there must be central planning, without agreeing on the ends, will be rather as if a group of people were to commit themselves to take a journey together without agreeing where they want to go: with the result that they may all have to make a journey which most of them do not want at all.

Hayek, F. A.. The Road to Serfdom: Text and Documents--The Definitive Edition: Text and Documents--The Definitive Edition (The Collected Works of F. A. Hayek, Volume 2) (pp. 103-104). University of Chicago Press. Kindle Edition.



Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 5:59 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Brunelleschi said:

I for one welcome our Chinese friends.

Malcolm wrote:

A very poor understanding of Adam Smith.

Brunelleschi said:

Yeah, I'm just joking man.

Malcolm wrote:

Sometimes it is hard to tell.

I am not a big fan of the Austrian school either; however, this book of Hayek's is very difficult to argue against.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 7:10 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Toenail said:

Cant listen to the explanation thing tomorrow. Is there a way to listen to a recording of it?

Malcolm wrote:

There will be. I will let you know.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 9:54 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

I don't understand why we're discussing whether the US or Russia is morally worse.

They both suck.

Malcolm wrote:

The United States birthed democracy. Democracy has benefitted everyone, including Russians. When they see those benefits withdrawn due to the behavior of their leadership, they will either replace it, or frankly, they will suffer in poverty, and will be shunned by the international community, by those at least who have some moral timbre, at any rate.

Once Putin starts using chemical weapons, within the next week or so, then things will go from where they are now—bad—to much, much worse.

There is no way the EU and NATo tolerates this.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 10:13 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

. I get it, people want to blame the US for this and then also say the US has no right to feign moral outrage.

Malcolm wrote:

Which of course is a bunch of total bullshit.

Not only that, Dan is in no position to be so patronizing toward you.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 8:49 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

I guess because many politicians, especially in the west, promoting their interference on moral ground, while the other side focuses more on self-interest.

Malcolm wrote:

Clearly, you have not paid attention to anything Putin has said. He regards democracy itself as immoral and he has said so. In the process, he has done everything he can to undermine democracy every way possible, because he thinks it is immoral. It's part and parcel of his Russian fascism.

He is not acting in his self-interest, nor in the interest of Russia. It's preposterous to make the claim he is. He is just a victim of the kind of nationalist romanticism that always leads people like him to the open embraces of fascist ideologues like Ilyin and Dugin.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 8:57 PM

Title: Re: Are we our bodies?

Content:

shanyin said:

Does Buddhist no-self teaching mean that human beings are not their bodies and minds?

If we are not those what are we?

Malcolm wrote:

Correct. A “person” is an imputation upon a series of aggregates.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 11th, 2022 at 9:49 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Bundokji said:

Democracy ceases to be moral

Malcolm wrote:

Democracy is a system of transferring power, as Snyder points out:

Functional states produce a sense of continuity for their citizens. If states sustain themselves, citizens can imagine change without fearing catastrophe. The mechanism that ensures that a state outlasts a leader is called the principle of succession. A common one is democracy. The meaning of each election is the promise of the next one. Since each citizen is fallible, democracy transforms cumulative mistakes into a collective belief in the future. History goes on.

Bundokji said:

He did not deny the ambition of restoring Russia as a respectable player in international arena. Existence of both individuals or nations is historical in nature, so having a historical reference to his ambitions is not as disorderly or pathological as his opponents try to make it sound.

Malcolm wrote:

One reason we know that Russia is a dysfunctional state is that they have no viable principle of succession. In Putin’s case, he explicitly depends on a fascist for his vision. You might be fine with fascism. The liberal democratic order is not.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Democracy is a system of transferring power, as Snyder points out:

Bundokji said:

Some would define democracy as the tyranny of the majority.

Malcolm wrote:  
Some people, then, would be wrong.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 2:48 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Bundokji said:  
I do not see the bravery of Ukrainian resistance except through the lens of propaganda that convinced people that Russia would emerge victorious in a couple of days. Even the US military might took over a month to invade Iraq which was much weaker than the Ukrainian military.

Malcolm wrote:  
They had a longer drive.

Bundokji said:  
The same propaganda is not even considering that the Russian army is trying to minimize the impact on civilians which would make the military operation lasts longer. In fact, they are pushing the Russians to use more fatal means, the same game they used before the invasion, keeping on speculating when Russia is going to invade, a tactic that Putin described as both childish and dangerous.

Malcolm wrote:  
Pushing Russia? You are nuts.

Bundokji said:  
The Russians have history of turning conflicts to their advantage when everyone think they are losing.

Malcolm wrote:  
Only when they themselves have been invaded. The record of their wars is not inspiring, they got beat in Crimea, Japan, and Europe in WWI. It was only due to the lendlease program they won in WWII.

Bundokji said:  
Biden took a hostile narrative against Russia since the elections.

Malcolm wrote:  
For sounds reasons: Chechnya, Georgia/S. Ossetia, Syria, Crimea, and now the rest of

Ukraine. Nato is not a threat to Russian security, unless one imagines liberal democracy in itself is such a threat (and it is a threat to Putin's power). If that is the case, Westphalian sovereignty still governs the situation. Russia has violated Ukrainian state sovereignty since 2014.

Bundokji said:

His son was involved with gas companies in Ukraine and Kazakhstan,

Malcolm wrote:

A complete nothing burger.

Bundokji said:

Self interest is more conducive to approaching worldly affairs with a mindset of "damage control".

Malcolm wrote:

It is in the self-interest of liberal democracies to support other liberal democracies. The struggle between authoritarianism (both right and left) and liberal democracy is an existential conflict.

The post-Soviet era was just a pause in the Cold War. It's back now, and naturally, liberal democracy will prevail, just as it did before. The combined economic power of the liberal democracies is the largest in the world. All Putin managed to do was strengthen the resolve of the West to oppose him and other totalitarian regimes like his, if they interfere in our interests.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 3:04 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

That's globalism...

Malcolm wrote:

Thank goodness. Anti-globalism is just anti-modernity in drag.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 3:45 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dan74 said:

It's fascinating what narratives are being build on the basis of scant reliable information. The fire at Enerhodar was never deemed a threat and no one actually confirmed

responsibility and how it got started. The electricity cut in Chernobyl is not deemed dangerous by the IAEA: [https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/mar/09/chernobyl-power-supply-cut-completely-after-russian-seizure-warns-ukaine](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/mar/09/chernobyl-power-supply-cut-completely-after-russian-seizure-warns-ukraine)

Malcolm wrote:

Correction, oh right, you scampered off before you could read the reply...

### The Situation at Chernobyl Is Deteriorating

The defunct site of the infamous 1986 meltdown has lost power two weeks after it was seized by Russian forces. Experts fear another nuclear disaster looms.

...

“To have a long-term loss of power is certainly a concern,” says Ed Lyman, a senior global security scientist at the Union of Concerned Scientists and coauthor of the book *Fukushima: The Story of a Nuclear Disaster*. Some of Chernobyl’s waste has been transferred into dry casks, but considerable quantities of fuel rods remain in a pool that requires cooling. That’s where the biggest risks currently are. “Without electrical power to the cooling pumps, the spent fuel pool will start heating up,” Lyman says. Water will gradually evaporate or boil away, exposing the fuel rods and releasing radioactive gasses.

Chernobyl’s New Safe Confinement structure also needs electricity. This is the facility built around the concrete “sarcophagus” that surrounds what’s left of the damaged reactor Number Four, which melted down in the 1986 disaster. The confinement structure’s ventilation system must run to prevent the exposed nuclear fuel within it from becoming more hazardous. Without power, the site’s 1.5-billion-euro decommissioning program could be imperiled, Claire Corkhill, an expert on nuclear material degradation at the University of Sheffield in the United Kingdom, wrote on Twitter and in an email to WIRED.

...

“The Russians have been incredibly careless. They not only attacked a nuclear power plant; they also attacked a nuclear laboratory, an accelerator complex that’s designed to produce neutrons,” says Bob Rosner, a physicist at the University of Chicago and former chair of the Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists’ Science and Security Board.

And the threat won’t be over as long as Russia continues to bombard Ukraine with missiles and fly warplanes overhead. US Department of Energy researchers have studied whether nuclear reactors could withstand an airplane crash, Dalnoki-Veress says. They cannot. And missiles fly faster and are more penetrating. An impact on a fuel pool could be highly damaging, likely spreading dangerous radioactive material all over. That’s why prohibiting combat near nuclear facilities should be a top priority in Ukraine-Russia negotiations, Dalnoki-Veress argues: “No reactor in the world can withstand a

missile strike. It's important to not have any fighting near these facilities. It's a no-brainer."

<https://apple.news/Ay0-fn8cCTKuuqWa8b9CX5A>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It is in the self-interest of liberal democracies to support other liberal democracies. The struggle between authoritarianism (both right and left) and liberal democracy is an existential conflict.

The post-Soviet era was just a pause in the Cold War. It's back now, and naturally, liberal democracy will prevail, just as it did before. The combined economic power of the liberal democracies is the largest in the world. All Putin managed to do was strengthen the resolve of the West to oppose him and other totalitarian regimes like his, if they interfere in our interests.

Bundokji said:

If liberal democracy is a middle path between the extremes of right and left, then it would be a cause for co-existence rather than in existential conflict with them. In my understanding, existential conflict is a result of the extremes, not the middle.

Malcolm wrote:

Liberal internationalism has moralist tendencies and activist impulses, but it is ultimately a reform-oriented and pragmatic endeavor. Modern liberals do not embrace democratic governments, market-based economic systems, and international institutions out of idealism or as tools of empire but as arrangements better suited to realizing human interests than the alternatives. Liberal internationalists hold that world politics requires institutional cooperation and political integration in response to relentlessly rising economic and security interdependence. Liberal internationalists across the past two centuries have considered a global architecture of rules and institutions necessary to protect liberal democracy and realize basic human interests. They have not always kept the best company, and their history is tainted by colonialism, imperialism, slavery, racism, and sexism. Yet liberals have also led the efforts to end these practices.

Ikenberry, G. John. *A World Safe for Democracy* . Yale University Press. Kindle Edition.

Putin is flouting these rules and concerns. Hence, he has come into the crosshairs of the liberal international order.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 7:34 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

Haven't heard the words False Flag so much in my life, except maybe when I used to watch Alex Jones as a teenager. Now we are to be 'on the lookout' for false flag biological and chemical attacks too.

Sweet.....

Norwegian said:

Yes, because there's a long tradition of Russia saying "X are doing Y!", and then Russia does Y instead, and accuses X of doing it, in order to instigate something or give themselves the right to do something (i.e., react with violent and deadly force). This isn't particularly new, and so it's important to call them out on it.

Jesse said:

Karl Marx: "Accuse Your Enemy Of What You Are Doing, As You Are Doing It To Create Confusion"

Malcolm wrote:

The basic strategy of Putin, and his understudy, Trump.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 9:53 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Jesse said:

In fact Russia is on par with us technologically

Malcolm wrote:

No. Russia is technologically dependent on the US.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 10:52 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Queequeg said:

Nukes, Oil, Wheat, and Troll Farms.



Malcolm wrote:  
Oil, gas, vodka, and caviar.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 8:38 PM  
Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:  
heart said:  
Is Guru yoga with a white A not Dzogchen?

Malcolm wrote:  
ChNN characterized it as an Anuyoga level practice, like Mandarava, Gomadevi, and Jnanadakini.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 9:10 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 9:17 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 12th, 2022 at 10:52 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:  
We've been hearing voices both past and present saying that the reason for what has happened is, as George Kennan put it, the strategic blunder of the eastward expansion of nato. The great-power realist-school historian John Mearsheimer insists that a great deal of the blame for what we're witnessing must go to the United States. I thought we'd begin with your analysis of that argument.

I have only the greatest respect for George Kennan. John Mearsheimer is a giant of a scholar. But I respectfully disagree. The problem with their argument is that it assumes that, had nato not expanded, Russia wouldn't be the same or very likely close to what it is today. What we have today in Russia is not some kind of surprise. It's not some kind of deviation from a historical pattern. Way before nato existed—in the nineteenth century—Russia looked like this: it had an autocrat. It had repression. It had militarism.

It had suspicion of foreigners and the West. This is a Russia that we know, and it's not a Russia that arrived yesterday or in the nineteen-nineties. It's not a response to the actions of the West. There are internal processes in Russia that account for where we are today.

I would even go further. I would say that nato expansion has put us in a better place to deal with this historical pattern in Russia that we're seeing again today. Where would we be now if Poland or the Baltic states were not in nato? They would be in the same limbo, in the same world that Ukraine is in. In fact, Poland's membership in nato stiffened nato's spine. Unlike some of the other nato countries, Poland has contested Russia many times over. In fact, you can argue that Russia broke its teeth twice on Poland: first in the nineteenth century, leading up to the twentieth century, and again at the end of the Soviet Union, with Solidarity. So George Kennan was an unbelievably important scholar and practitioner—the greatest Russia expert who ever lived—but I just don't think blaming the West is the right analysis for where we are.

<https://www.newyorker.com/news/q-and-a/stephen-kotkin-putin-russia-ukraine-stalin>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 1:27 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Shotenzenjin said:

I've been late coming back to this thread. But the idea the USA hasn't or does not target civilians populations is utter bs

Malcolm wrote:

In the battle Foggia, the targets were German and Italian troops as well as a major rail hub, but not civilians.

A more apt example of US terror bombing would be Dresden, and as you mentioned, Hiroshima and Nagasaki. Frankly, in the case of nuclear weapons, we did not know what we were doing. We had an inkling, but the results were far more terrible than US war planners anticipated.

I did not deny the US has targeted civilians. I stated that it is not now our policy to target civilians. Our policy is the opposite and has been since WWII.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 1:32 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

heart said:

Would that make Ati Guru Yoga, as Rinpoche often called it, Anu Guru Yoga?

Malcolm wrote:

Guru Yoga of White A is a practice in the collective practice booklet which includes the invocation, and the shorter version in the Short Thun. That, according to ChNN is a guruyoga at the anuyoga level. The medium and long thun with Guru Padmasambhava is a guruyoga at the mahāyoga level.

Ati guru yoga is ati level because it does not involve visualizing a human form.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 1:38 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Passing By said:

Is the Longsal Barma Gyud that was mentioned during the info session the one that is the root source of the Khandro Nyingthik? And is the Terton who discovered the Longsal Barma, Nyangral Nyima Ozer?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes. The Longsal tantra is like a summary of the topics of the 17 tantras, and reproduces a lot of material, especially from the Rangshar.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 2:43 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 3:36 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Yes, I understand why the ex-Soviet states want to join NATO. I think it also nevertheless true that expansion increased tensions with Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. This is just a recent excuse Putin has made up to satisfy his fascist dream of restoring Imperial Russia.

Between 2000 and 2008, during Putin's first two terms as president, the Russian economy grew at an average rate of almost 7% per annum. Putin won his war in Chechnya. The government exploited high world market prices of natural gas and oil to distribute some export profits throughout the Russian population. The instability of the Yeltsin order had passed, and many Russians were understandably pleased and

grateful. Russia also enjoyed a stable position in foreign affairs. Putin offered NATO Russia's support after the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001. In 2002, he spoke favorably of "European culture" and avoided portraying NATO as an adversary. In 2004, Putin spoke in favor of European Union membership for Ukraine, saying that such an outcome would be in Russia's economic interest. He spoke of the enlargement of the European Union as extending a zone of peace and prosperity to Russia's borders. In 2008, he attended a NATO summit.

Snyder, Timothy. *The Road to Unfreedom* (pp. 47-48). Crown. Kindle Edition.

No Russian leader feared a NATO invasion in 2011 or 2012, or even pretended to. In 2012, American leaders believed that they were pursuing a "reset" of relations with Russia. When Mitt Romney referred to Russia as America's "number one geopolitical foe" in March 2012, he was ridiculed. Almost no one in the American public or media was paying attention to Moscow. Russia did not even figure in American public opinion polls about global threats and challenges. The European Union and the United States were presented as threats because Russian elections were faked. In winter 2011 and spring 2012, Russian television channels and newspapers generated the narrative that all who protested electoral fraud were paid by Western institutions. The effort began on December 8, 2011, with the reporting of Putin's claim that Clinton had initiated the protests.

Snyder, Timothy. *The Road to Unfreedom* (p. 55). Crown. Kindle Edition.

Until 2012, Russian leaders spoke favorably of European integration. Yeltsin accepted Europe as a model, at least rhetorically. Putin described the approach of the EU to Russia's border as an opportunity for cooperation. The eastward enlargement of NATO in 1999 was not presented by Putin as a threat. Instead, he tried to recruit the United States or NATO to cooperate with Russia to address what he saw as common security problems. After the United States was attacked by Islamist terrorists in 2001, Putin offered to cooperate with NATO in territories that bordered Russia. Putin did not present the EU enlargement of 2004 as a threat. On the contrary, he spoke favorably that year of future EU membership for Ukraine. In 2008, Putin attended the NATO summit in Bucharest. In 2009, Medvedev allowed American aircraft to fly over Russia to supply troops in Afghanistan. In 2010, Russia's ambassador to NATO, the radical nationalist Dmitry Rogozin, expressed his concern that NATO would leave Afghanistan. Rogozin complained of NATO's lack of fighting spirit, its "mood of capitulation." He wanted NATO troops at Russia's border.

Snyder, Timothy. *The Road to Unfreedom* (p. 79). Crown. Kindle Edition.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 4:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Yes, I understand why the ex-Soviet states want to join NATO. I think it also nevertheless true that expansion increased tensions with Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Nonsense. This is just a recent excuse Putin has made up to satisfy his fascist dream of restoring Imperial Russia.

Genjo Conan said:

Malcolm, this is demonstrably false. Russian anger at NATO expansion predated Putin. This is well documented. <https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/russia-programs/2021-11-24/nato-expansion-budapest-blow-1994>

One can argue, pace Norwegian, that this anger was overblown, or that it demonstrates some deeper pathology. I think both are likely true. That doesn't mean the sentiment isn't real.

Malcolm wrote:

It is demonstrably true that Putin himself never actually felt threatened by NATO, no matter what Gorbachev may have felt in 1994. Hence, my statement is factual.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 6:57 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

heart said:

So most Dzogchen sadhanas would be either Mahayoga or Anuyoga or Atiyoga.

Malcolm wrote:

This nine-fold division is less than useful for understanding sadhanas. In any case ChNN frequently asserted that anything to do with deity yoga was never Dzogchen proper, but was part of path of transformation, hence Anuyoga at best.

Now, some other Lamas might disagree, but I follow ChNN.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 7:11 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

Yeltsin, not Gorbachev. And, ok, you do you.

Malcolm wrote:

It is a fantasy that Putin felt threatened by NATO.

But I am sure he does now, now that he has given himself reason to feel threatened by NATO for attacking Ukraine.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 10:42 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

They fly sorties with fighters along the border of a lot of countries - Denmark and Finland get that treatment periodically too. It's extremely petty as it doesn't really serve any purpose except to be annoying, because you have to scramble jets in response.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 6:56 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Genjo Conan said:

These policy steps contributed to a renewed "clash of civilizations" narrative within Russia that Putin and his inner circle have both exploited and themselves contributed to, and seem in some respects to believe.

None of this caused Russia to invade or absolves Russia's leadership of their actions.

Malcolm wrote:

The "clash of civilizations" narrative is a key part of the Russian fascist pov since the 20's. It was also part of narrative of Hitler and Mussolini.

It's clear that Putin bought into this, as I have already pointed out. His whole narrative is a pack of lies, an Ajatasatru for the 21st century.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 7:02 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

heart said:

So most Dzogchen sadhanas would be either Mahayoga or Anuyoga or Atiyoga.

Malcolm wrote:

This nine-fold division is less than useful for understanding sadhanas. In any case

ChNN frequently asserted that anything to do with deity yoga was never Dzogchen proper, but was part of path of transformation, hence Anuyoga at best.

Now, some other Lamas might disagree, but I follow ChNN.

heart said:

I find it very helpful and it actually make more sense if you look at how Dzogchen was practiced by the masters of the lineage. For example ChNN did a Mandarava retreat every year and I am pretty sure his never lowered his view to Anuyoga. It is the view that matters and if the view is Ati then everything is Ati.

/magnus

Malcolm wrote:

Magnus, sorry bud, he was very clear that Mandarava, etc., was anuyoga. Why did he emphasize anuyoga? Because anuyoga's view of the basis is the same as Dzogchen. Why is anuyoga lower than Dzogchen? Because anuyoga regards ati as a result. So your assertion, "if the view is ati, then everything is ati" is not correct. There is also no creation or completion stage in Dzogchen.

I don't know why you want to argue with me about ChNNs pov, I am a second level SMS student.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 7:08 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

heart said:

So most Dzogchen sadhanas would be either Mahayoga or Anuyoga of Atiyoga.

Malcolm wrote:

This is nine-fold division is less than useful for understanding sadhanas. In any case ChNN frequently asserted that anything to do with deity yoga was never Dzogchen proper, but was part of path of transformation, hence Anuyoga at best.

Now, some other Lamas might disagree, but I follow ChNN.

Jangchup Donden said:

Do guru yoga sadhanas count as deity yoga?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, of course. If there transformation of any kind, it is the resultant path, Dzogchen is a path beyond cause and result,

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 10:38 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

2) At the same time, I deny he is a "madman" or a "crazed conquest-bent tyrant" or any of the other cartoon images being brandied about by people who should really know better. Everything he is doing is based in a flawed and overly aggressive but essentially logical Geopolitical worldview. He is protecting his vulnerable Western border from an ever-encroaching NATO that has broken it's 1991 treaty commitments to Russia not to Expand NATO eastward, in ridiculously flamboyant fashion.

Malcolm wrote:

This assertion has already been debunked. No such treaty commitments exist or have ever existed.

And you are undoubtedly aware Putin is a Russian fascist who quotes Ilyin every chance he can.

Putin is most certainly rational actor. Just because he has made a fundamental miscalculation about Ukraine, does not mean he is bereft of reason. He has however gone the way of most dictators, living in an echo chamber of sycophantic (fearful) underlings who merely tell him what he wants to hear.

Also his lies are preposterous. Only fools could take them at face value.

Slander is unbecoming:

western oil giant friendly cokehead in the Ukrainian presidential office

Do you have any proof of this, or are you merely repeating Russian propaganda?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 10:53 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

heart said:

Thank you very much Malcolm for requesting these "lungs", it feels like a very auspicious sign in these rather dark times.

Malcolm wrote:

You and everyone else are very welcome. I am glad to be a catalyst for this transmission.



But TDR is the one doing all the work. He really deserves the thanks. He is quite happy to be doing so. He is very happy to be able to share these transmissions with everyone who is interested.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 10:57 PM

Title: Re: Tradition for Solitary Practitioner?

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

"The Majjhima Nikaya (M III 69–71) enumerates 119 names of a group of five hundred Paccekabuddhas who are said to reside on Mount Isigili. Of these names only a few are mentioned in Pali texts elsewhere: the most important ones are Tagarasikhin, Uparittha, Matanga and Mahapaduma.

Malcolm wrote:

They all attained nirvana with the advent of Śākyamuni.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 13th, 2022 at 11:32 PM

Title: Re: I have received Tokudo after over 30 years as a lay practitioner

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

Formally received Tokudo, three sets of vows, and practice commitments from a Shingon-shu temple in Japan run by my Teacher and Master.

The funny thing is I have spent far more time as a Pure Land practitioner at Zojoji Temple in Tokyo and then some years at a Kanagawa Rinzai temple. I would be lying if I said I didn't think often about having a long sit-down with my Shingon teacher about shifting over to Ji-shu Pure Land (my family Danka, for what it's worth) or perhaps taking one of the wonderful 真宗学 academic courses on offer and delving into the arcana of Pure Land theory. I have a feeling given my age and limited memory powers I will never be able to advance to Ajari status in Shingon, not that it matters all that much. There are a few specialized practices I would like to be initiated into. It sure gets pricy collecting Shingon permissions, vestments, implements....ive already spent... well, why grumble? It was worth every yen.

So after all these years in Japan knocking around different temples I've finally taken the plunge. Ami not allowed a little public victory lap in this egotistical thread?

Samsara is a strange place. I've been a farmer, a washing machine factory worker, I spent time semi homeless living on 7 bucks a week. I earned full university degrees in Western Philosophy and Chinese History, been a certified Geopolitical strategist with a aide order of Cyber Warfare accreditation, and finally it seems a Shingon practitioner. Hopefully my story ends there, but not quite yet.

Malcolm wrote:  
Congrats

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 14th, 2022 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Tradition for Solitary Practitioner?

Content:

FiveSkandhas said:

So the Pratyekayana as a gate or path is closed during this current Buddha Sasana? I feel strangely let down. I always wanted to encounter one.

Malcolm wrote:

That is the official story. The bodhicitta of a pratyekabuddha is to attain buddhahood when there is no samyaksambuddha in the world.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 14th, 2022 at 2:59 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A must read analysis.

Tl:dr, US and the West emerge much more powerful from this. China pivots to the West for self-preservation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 14th, 2022 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

A must read analysis.

Tl:dr, US and the West emerge much more powerful from this. China pivots to the West for self-preservation.

A tentative rebuttal to this article:

[https://mp-weixin-qq-com.translate.googleusercontent.com/s/WCcXCEGZdsqL30VvZ1MCaA?\\_x\\_tr\\_sl=auto&\\_x\\_tr\\_tl=en&\\_x\\_tr\\_hl=en&\\_x\\_tr\\_pto=wapp](https://mp-weixin-qq-com.translate.googleusercontent.com/s/WCcXCEGZdsqL30VvZ1MCaA?_x_tr_sl=auto&_x_tr_tl=en&_x_tr_hl=en&_x_tr_pto=wapp)

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 14th, 2022 at 10:11 PM

Title: Re: Maintaining one's Peace in a time of conflict

Content:

master of puppets said:

I live in turkey. Ukrania is our neighbour.

I think in the private ukranian war is organized and planned to give loss/damage on turkey, that the NATO or west shouldn't take on themselves. And that's it.

Malcolm wrote:

Turkey is part of NATO. You need to get out more.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 15th, 2022 at 12:30 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Karma\_Yeshe said:

Could someone please clarify the schedule?

On the Wisdom page it says that the lung starts on the afternoon on Friday, while the Zoom-Invitation says that all sessions start in morning.

Malcolm wrote:

Morning in the US; afternoon in Europe.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 15th, 2022 at 3:06 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It's getting frizzy in Russia:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 15th, 2022 at 6:25 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Padmist said:

Thank you Archie.

Is there a way to contact the Tulku? I tried to email his center in Finland but no answer yet.

I wish to ask for formal Refuge Vow ceremony before this event. I have only taken

personal commitment of the refuge.

Or perhaps Malcolm? I've been trying for 2 weeks to get this sorted out but no luck yet. Not even local. Not even the lamas I listen to online virtually are available for this.

My only options are: Lama Zopa in August (too far out), Anam Thubten in April (too far out).

Malcolm wrote:

You don't need this. Your interest in the teachings is refuge. There was no ritual of taking refuge during the time of the Buddha. That ritual came later.

The principle of refuge is that you recognize that the three jewels are your sole refuge. If you have this idea, then you don't need a ritual. Also in Mahayana, you can take refuge by visualizing all Buddhas and bodhisattvas in front of you and reciting the formula of refuge. That is sufficient.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 15th, 2022 at 9:24 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 15th, 2022 at 9:34 PM

Title: Re: Is Shingon lesser because it has less tantras than Tibetan vajrayana?

Content:

tingdzin said:

The whole "kriya, carya, yoga, anuttarayoga (or yogini)" classification is India-based and a development much later than the tantras themselves (the classification system actually originated in Tibet, if I recall correctly),

Malcolm wrote:

The four fold classification system comes from the Vajramāla tantra, so 9th century.

The classification of tantras into kriya, carya, and yoga is earlier than Shingon, and is contemporary with Amoghavajra. The mid-eighth century Indian master, Buddhagupta, author of detailed commentaries on the Mahāvairocana Abhisambodhi, was the originator of the three-fold division.

The classification system that seems to have originated in Tibet is the classification of the three inner tantras into mahā, anu, and ati. However, even here, there is evidence that it is an eighth century arrangement, since it is a feature of Padmasambhava's rosary of views.

tingdzin said:

Bringing in the caste system is just creeping Brahmanism, and not at all appropriate.

Malcolm wrote:

It makes sense, actually. Highest tantra is for people outside the caste system, like us.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 16th, 2022 at 12:41 AM

Title: Re: Is Shingon lesser because it has less tantras than Tibetan vajrayana?

Content:

Injrabodi said:

Looking at the extreme sexual practices of various tantras, such as the Kalachakra Tantra...

Malcolm wrote:

The Kalacakra explicitly negates karmamudra practices.

Crazywisdom said:

Ummm there's karmamudra in Kalachakra.

In order to increase the coemergent bliss [ni] of the victorious ones, first the karma mudrā should be bestowed.

-Wisdom Chapter

Malcolm wrote:

The Kālacakra states:

One should abandon karmamudra

and the imputed jñānamudra

as they are not supreme.

The practitioner should meditate mahāmudrā.

And alternate translation gives:

The mind should give up the tainted karmamudra and the jñānamudra of these imputations.

and meditate the excellent mudra, the progenitor of the supreme victor, the cause of full awakening

untainted, unchanging, the one who destroys the darkness, equal with space, all pervasive, traversed by the yogi.

The brilliant gnosis that resides in the body should be known to be the wheel of time that robs the misdeeds of existence.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 16th, 2022 at 3:05 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:  
Malcolm wrote:  
It's getting frizzy in Russia:

Brave woman. I read she was arrested and faces up to 15 years in prison for this, smh.

KristenM said:  
She was fined 30,000 rubles, about \$280.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Wednesday, March 16th, 2022 at 3:08 AM  
Title: Re: Is Shingon lesser because it has less tantras than Tibetan vajrayana?  
Content:

Crazywisdom said:  
Yes. At the stage of Mahamudra, because Kalachakra is a graduated path. The completion stage has many stages. Thus giving up karmamudra means one was practicing it. And the empowerment is happening with a guru and his consort. Kalachakra is very consort oriented and has instructions on finding a consorts, types of human consorts, even paying them. The guru bestowing a consort on a disciple and so on. Then later that us given up in favor of the six vajra yogas, in which the variegated consort is Mahamudra in the form of inner visual signs.

Malcolm wrote:  
Not how it is understood by many important Tibetan masters. For example, Dakpo Tashi Namgyal discusses this issue in his Moonbeams of Mahāmudra, etc.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 18th, 2022 at 5:26 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

Miorita said:  
By doing so, Biden has excluded Putin out of the civilized world.

Malcolm wrote:  
Rightly so.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 18th, 2022 at 8:07 PM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

PeterC said:

No - China gets the opposite treatment - presumption of guilt, while India gets indifference or presumption of innocence

Malcolm wrote:

Well, China just signed an agreement of limitless mutual support with Russia. But I don't think the Chinese understood what the Russians meant by limitless.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 18th, 2022 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

No - China gets the opposite treatment - presumption of guilt, while India gets indifference or presumption of innocence

Malcolm wrote:

Well, China just signed an agreement of limitless mutual support with Russia. But I don't think the Chinese understood what the Russians meant by limitless.

Queequeg said:

I've been thinking about that. Chinese leadership must be thinking hard about how to walk that statement back and/or hoping it just gets resolved ASAP. They did not realize how gangster Russia is and how much a promise like that would actually mean, and so soon. Its quite possible that they were in complete disbelief that Russia would actually go all out on Ukraine like this. Chinese leadership probably studies a lot of stuff to prepare themselves... maybe they need to study The Godfather and the genre of gangster movies generally. Vito Corleone would never have gone for this.

For the time being, they're basically affirming humanitarian concerns but otherwise pretending nothing is happening in Ukraine and relations with Russia are business as usual.

Malcolm wrote:

Apparently, "boundary-less" is an operational concept in Russian political rhetoric: The mature Ilyin rejected the rule of law in favor of the arbitrariness—proizvol—of fascism. Having given up hope that Russia could be governed by law, he presented lawlessness (proizvol) as a patriotic virtue. Putin followed the same trajectory, citing Ilyin as his authority. When he first ran for president in 2000, he spoke of the need for a "dictatorship of the law." Those two concepts contradicted each other, and one of them fell away. Running for president in 2012, Putin rejected the idea of a European Russia, which meant ignoring external incentives that favored the rule of law. Instead, proizvol

would be presented as redemptive patriotism. The operative concept in the Russian language today is *bespredel*, boundary-less-ness, the absence of limits, the ability of a leader to do anything. The word itself arose from criminal jargon.

On this logic, Putin was not a failed statesman but a national redeemer. What the EU might describe as failures of governance were to be experienced as the flowering of Russian innocence.

The Road to Unfreedom, Snyder.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 5:29 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Padmist said:

I am so sorry. I mean no disrespect to the Master Tulku. I think I'm a bad student. I log in, listened, and throughout the whole reading, I keep falling asleep. (Because I have been sleeping 4 hours only in the past week) Not deep sleep, just dozing off repeatedly then waking up but his reading was on my earpiece the whole time and I heard it all, or I would hear his reading whenever I wake back up, then doze off again, then heard his last notes as well like coming in 10 minutes early tomorrow.

My question is, did I mess up? Does this reading transmission fail/become invalid, for me?

Malcolm wrote:

Just do your best.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 8:13 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

pemachophel said:

Please don't forget to offer Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche dana for these lungs. You can do so through Paypal at the Wisdom Publications page for this event. Tulku Dakpa will be using any monies received as offerings for these lungs to build a stupa for world peace.

It is taught that Jetsun Milarepa experienced terrible poverty during His years of practice at least in part because, when He first became a student of Marpa Lotsawa, He offered His Teacher an empty pot. Marpa Lotsawa filled the pot with chang (Tibetan "beer"). Thus in Je Mila's later years He had abundant provisions. Both of these outcomes are based on the principle of dependent origination. This teaching underscores the karmic importance of always giving offerings for any Dharma one receives.

Padmist said:

How much? And I ask in terms of what's generally accepted/common/reasonable,



culturally and normally.

I am sending \$25 now and do it per day. Would that be alright?

Malcolm wrote:

\$108

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 10:32 AM

Title: Re: Quotes from Śūraṅgama Sutra in "Poison is Medicine - Clarifying the Vajrayana"

Content:

Zhen Li said:

The Buddha's qualities by definition must be limitless.

Malcolm wrote:

Which means they just an abstraction, and cannot actually represent buddhahood, since they are illusory, just as buddhahood is illusory.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 9:27 PM

Title: Re: Quotes from Śūraṅgama Sutra in "Poison is Medicine - Clarifying the Vajrayana"

Content:

Crazywisdom said:

Yeah, not Sanskrit. Maybe derived from. You're gonna have to show me something in Sanskrit in there.

na mo sa dan tuo

2. su qie duo ye

3. e la he di

4. san miao san pu tuo xie

5. na mo sa dan tuo

6. fo tuo ju zhi shai ni shan

This is Chinese. Pull out your Sanskrit dictionary and find me one word besides namo.

Malcolm wrote:

It is a phonetic representation of Sanskrit sounds derived from Chinese characters, which looks even stranger when rendered in English phonetics. But it is well attested in other sources, and is in fact the White Umbrella dhāraṇī.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 9:54 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

climb-up said:

I made a very small dana

Does anyone know if the PayPal option will be available still in a couple weeks?

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 19th, 2022 at 10:00 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Miorita said:

What do you advise?

Malcolm wrote:

There will be a record of everything you received. You will have received most. So you do your best.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Miorita said:

Maybe last hour he'll do Q&A.

Malcolm wrote:

No Q&A.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 4:38 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Wally said:

Malcom (or anyone really) -

Is there a copy of this particular version (adzom par ma) on BDRC

( <https://library.bdrc.io/> )? Vimala ( <http://www.Vimalatreasures.org> )? Any other suggestions?

Thank you in advance,  
Wally

Malcolm wrote:  
<http://purl.bdrc.io/resource/MW1KG892>

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 7:30 AM  
Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:  
Padmist said:  
What kind of karma do I have that I am connected to this, totally drawn to this, I even make it to the event on time, every day, donating, but during the event, falling asleep.

Malcolm wrote:  
It is the effect of purifying ignorance. Don't worry.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 7:58 AM  
Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:  
Padmist said:  
) if that is what we need to do (hands together) I'll do that tomorrow.

Malcolm wrote:  
No. It's not necessary.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 9:26 PM  
Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal  
Content:  
Aemilius said:  
"The end of days" is cheap propaganda. In the geologic time scale Earth has had several periods of warmer and colder weather/climate. Warming up isn't anything unheard of in Earth's history.

Malcolm wrote:  
"End of days" refers to human civilization. We are in the days of the five degenerations (pañcakaṣāyā): degeneration of lifespan, view, afflictions, sentient beings, and the age.

It will be increasingly more difficult, especially in the global south, for humans to thrive.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 9:30 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Padmist said:

What kind of karma do I have that I am connected to this, totally drawn to this, I even make it to the event on time, every day, donating, but during the event, falling asleep.

Malcolm wrote:

It is the effect of purifying ignorance. Don't worry.

Crazywisdom said:

So I like these lists of side effects of listening to readings. Are there any more specific to these tantras?

Malcolm wrote:

My observation is that new people listening to any Dharma teaching universally report a sense of dullness while the teaching is happening, which lifts the minute the teaching concludes. I also experienced this in the beginning.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Sādhaka said:

I thought that it was kind of the opposite, i.e. that many third-world countries are generally happier...

Malcolm wrote:

Yes, this is why people are killing themselves to get into the EU, USA, and Canada. Obviously they are incredibly happy in corruption and poverty.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 11:25 PM

Title: Re: Is Shingon lesser because it has less tantras than Tibetan vajrayana?

Content:

jmlee369 said:

Tsongkhapa disagreed with the view that different tantra classes were taught for different castes.

Malcolm wrote:

So what? This is clearly explained by Sonam Tsemo and others, including Buton.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Sunday, March 20th, 2022 at 11:41 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Eamon said:

Will Rinpoche include ngak sung tröma or longsal barma?

Malcolm wrote:

Definitely not the longsal barma.

Not sure about ekajati tantra. Depends on time I suspect. Anyway, that tantra has no real Dzogchen content.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 12:25 AM

Title: Re: Regarding Shar Khentrul Rinpoché Jamphel Lodrö (No Debates Please)

Content:

Ikkyu's\_Son said:

Something such as this is precisely what I was worried about, because if such claims prove true, I could not in good faith maintain pure perception.

Malcolm wrote:

If you discover you have made a connection with someone you later discover is not a qualified teacher, you just leave. You don't make a fuss. Just move on. It's not your fault if their conduct is a problem. Teachers also have samayas with students, if they cannot maintain them, it is negative for the student. It is a two-way street.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 1:12 AM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Sādhaka said:

My point being that neither poverty or bread & circus-seeking are conducive to liberation. If one doesn't have the Eighteen conditions for Dharma practice (Precious Human Rebirth), it likely doesn't matter much if you live in a first or third world country; or, on the flip-side, if you do have it/them it doesn't matter much either way either....

Malcolm wrote:

There are eight freedoms and ten endowments.

A part of those eight freedoms is not being stuck in a country dominated by barbarians. At this point in time, secular democracies with free markets are the best place to practice the Dharma.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 2:35 AM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Sādhaka said:

We could pick this apart for sure.

For now however, I don't see any country nowadays that's not dominated by mlecchas (i.e. various variations of eternalists, atheists, theists, nihilists, carvakas, lokayatis, materialists, etc.).

Malcolm wrote:

"Mleccha" comes from "As-Salaa( m-Alaikum )." It generally refers to Arabic speakers, both pre and post Islam.

The secularists who founded American democracy at base guaranteed freedom of religious conscience. Why? They observed the religious wars that tore Europe apart, wanted to avoid that, and when democracy was first established in the US, the establishment clause was included in the first amendment. This was not done to protect religion, but rather to protect the state against religious sentiments.

I'll stick with liberal democracy. You can do as you please.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 3:20 AM

Title: Re: "special transmission"?

Content:

Way-Fun said:

What if the Buddha had farted instead?

Malcolm wrote:

A dog would have been his lineage heir.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Queequeg said:

FWIW, I posted that map tongue in cheek. Being happy while the planet becomes uninhabitable for human beings is like have a luxury suite on the Titanic.

Malcolm wrote:

I think it will sink a little slower...not only this, but the temperate zones will offer more climate resilience. But people in the global south are in trouble.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 5:10 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

It is likely to be extended for an extra day. Rinpoche is concerned he will not be able to finish tomorrow in the allotted time.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 5:17 AM

Title: Re: China Is Already at War With America

Content:

Aemilius said:

While the US calls China things like a "serious competitor" and "strategic competition," China sees the US as its #1 enemy and one of the only countries stopping it from global domination.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, of course someone who works for the far-right wing Falung Gong cult is going to see things that way. In fact, the US and EU together are China's major business partner, with the EU being the largest.

After what happened to Russia, China is going to think twice about confronting the West.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 5:40 AM

Title: Re: China Is Already at War With America

Content:

Aemilius said:

While the US calls China things like a "serious competitor" and "strategic competition," China sees the US as its #1 enemy and one of the only countries stopping it from global domination.

Malcolm wrote:

Well, of course someone who works for the far-right wing Falung Gong cult is going to see things that way.

Könchok Thrinley said:

I have seen these claims about this channel and Falun Gong being far right cult in general. Do you have any source for that? I always considered it as mostly fabricated by Chinese propaganda.

Malcolm wrote:

Have you ever read the Epoch Times? I rest my case.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 5:44 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Toenail said:

If there is an extra day Tuesday it will be at the same time? Would be good to know so one can make arrangements

Malcolm wrote:

Yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 10:38 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Queequeg said:

The ridiculous difficulty of Chinese written language is the biggest obstacle to world domination.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 11:00 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Most fentanyl these days is made in Mexico.

Jesse said:

In many ways yes.. one of the most disturbing ones is their chemical weapons attack on American civilians:

<https://www.heritage.org/crime-and-justice/commentary/china-poisoning-america-fentanyl>

The oddest part is that the amount of deaths from this fentanyl have gotten so absurdly high that it's in the news pretty much daily, yet no one ever mentions that it's an intentional chemical attack by china.

<https://www.snopes.com/fact-check/fentanyl-overdose-death/>

Fentanyl overdoses have surged to the leading cause of death for adults between the ages of 18 and 45, according to an analysis of U.S. government data.



Between 2020 and 2021, nearly 79,000 people between 18 and 45 years old — 37,208 in 2020 and 41,587 in 2021 — died of fentanyl overdoses, the data analysis from opioid awareness organization Families Against Fentanyl shows.

They are killing more than 3 times the amount of people in America with fentanyl, than Covid has killed.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 8:24 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

Russia deploying a hypersonic missile is an attempt to pre-empt this - certain types of weapons, including hypersonic missiles, are problematic because they mean you can't have force protection and you can't rely on missile defense systems.

A US defence official was quoted as saying on Friday that Russian forces had fired more than 1,080 missiles since 24 February.

"[That] is an astonishing number and a very significant fraction of Russia's pre-war inventory," Mr Acton told the BBC, pointing to the increasing use of unguided bombs in Russian aerial attacks. "They may very well be running short of accurate munitions."

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-60806151>

I don't think Russia has very many hypersonic cruise missiles. And given the rest of Russia's technology...

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 8:35 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

Most fentanyl these days is made in Mexico.

Jesse said:

It's not, It's made in China,

Malcolm wrote:

No. That stopped in 2019. Now, China ships precursors to Mexican labs.

Jesse said:

Effective May 1, 2019, China officially controlled all forms of fentanyl as a class of drugs. This fulfilled the commitment that President Xi made during the G-20 Summit. The implementation of the new measure includes investigations of known fentanyl manufacturing areas, stricter control of internet sites advertising fentanyl, stricter

enforcement of shipping regulations, and the creation of special teams to investigate leads on fentanyl trafficking. These new restrictions have the potential to severely limit fentanyl production and trafficking from China. This could alter China's position as a supplier to both the United States and Mexico.

Malcolm wrote:

[https://www.dea.gov/sites/default/files/2020-03/DEA\\_GOV\\_DIR-008-20%20Fentanyl%20Flow%20in%20the%20United%20States\\_0.pdf](https://www.dea.gov/sites/default/files/2020-03/DEA_GOV_DIR-008-20%20Fentanyl%20Flow%20in%20the%20United%20States_0.pdf)

Here is recent report (Feb, 2022) assembled by the Rand Corporation. It covers the whole issue up to where we are today. As I indicated, Mexico is the main producer of synthetic opioids today. There is just no argument about that.

Jesse said:

Mexico is the principal source of this illicit fentanyl and its analogues today.\* In Mexico, cartels manufacture these poisons in clandestine laboratories with ingredients—precursor chemicals—sourced largely from the People's Republic of China (PRC).

...

Since then, the dominant source of illegally sourced fentanyl has been Mexico. The drug is manufactured in illegal laboratories there using precursors from Asia—mainly the PRC—and is trafficked principally by land into the United States. Fentanyl coming from Mexico is often of very low purity—generally, in powder form around or slightly above 10 percent—but now accounts for almost all the fentanyl that law enforcement has seized since late 2019. Trafficking in synthetic opioids has increased in part because of its low cost: It is cheaper to illegally manufacture fentanyl or a fentanyl analogue than it is to grow poppies, extract the raw materials from them, and produce heroin.

...

Today, Mexico-based TCOs are the main producer of illegally manufactured heroin and synthetic opioids, mostly fentanyl, that are trafficked into the United States. Further, according to several experts, fentanyl production capacity appears to be increasing, illegal producers could be seeking to diversify sources from which to obtain the primary materials.

Malcolm wrote:

<https://www.rand.org/hsrd/hsoac/commission-combating-synthetic-opioid-trafficking.html>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 8:53 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:

Passing By said:

The Lion Tantra is pretty long.....Is it the second longest one after the Rangshar?

Malcolm wrote:

We are in volume two of the Adzom Parma published in 1977.

The next longest tantra of the 17 after the Rangshar is the ancillary tantra, called the Self-Originated Perfection, rdzogs pa rang byung, which contains many ritual methods. It is the last in this collection. It has very little direct Dzogchen content. It mostly concerns methods practitioners need, such as rites for dealing with obstacles from nāgas and so on, rites for guiding the dead through the bardo, details of empowerment rites, etc. It is very interesting for these reasons.

The Sound Tantra, which is the root tantra of all Dzogchen teachings, is the next longest after that. Then the Invincible Lion, String of Pearls, etc.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 9:55 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We will finish today, but the session will likely last 8 hours.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 10:09 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras  
Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We will finish today, but the session will likely last 8 hours.

Archie2009 said:

Then I'd like to request more than one 15 minute break so I can let my elderly dog pee.

Malcolm wrote:

I will pass the request along

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 10:39 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Dorje Shedrub said:

Putin seems to keep escalating. I wish NATO could do more or give Ukraine Patriot Defense System. They can't even get the migs.

Queequeg said:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cash\\_and\\_carry\\_%28World\\_War\\_II%29](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cash_and_carry_%28World_War_II%29) for the Migs and whatever other weapons they need. Full line of credit. We did this before against Germany.

Malcolm wrote:

Only matter of time before Putin tries to sever the Suwalki Gap that divides Kalingrad from the rest of the Russian Federation. It is the lifeline to the Baltic states, Estonia, Latvia, and Lithuania from Poland. It's only 60 miles wide.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Monday, March 21st, 2022 at 10:56 PM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 12:23 AM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Aemilius said:

"The geologic temperature record are changes in Earth's environment as determined from geologic evidence on multi-million to billion (10<sup>9</sup>) year time scales. The study of past temperatures provides an important paleoenvironmental insight because it is a component of the climate and oceanography of the time."

Malcolm wrote:

The present rate of warming precisely lines up with the widescale employment of hydrocarbons (coal, oil, gas) since the 1850's.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 1:37 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

We will be reciting the Aspiration of Samantabhadra at the conclusion of the lung after all. People who need to download the prayer may find it here:

<https://www.lotsawahouse.org/tibetan-masters/rigdzin-godem/prayer-of-kuntuzangpo>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 1:59 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Bhumi108w said:

So is that technically receiving the lung for the prayer as well?

Malcolm wrote:

yes.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 6:21 AM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

For those without paypal:

Receiver: Danakosha Ling

Bank account number: FI5940550016672046

Bank name: Aktia Oyj

Bank address: Arkadiankatu 4-6, 00100 Helsinki, Finland

BIC/SWIFT: HELSFIHH

Reference number: 1627

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 8:28 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Bhumi108w said:

Malcom is the discount on the text only for March? I don't get paid again until April. Any information would be greatly appreciated.

Thank you

Malcolm wrote:

I don't know.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 8:39 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:

Not much difference, they kept the same connections, and they continue the same operations.. they are simply shipping the materials instead of the finished product. It fundamentally remains unchanged except where they do the chemistry that changes the precursors into an illegal drug. Literally they just abused a loophole, a technicality.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you didn't read the part about the cartels increasingly procuring their raw materials from places other than China.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 8:42 PM

Title: Re: Antártica and Arctic 70 and 50 degrees above normal

Content:

Aemilius said:

I am happy to provide a link for it, as it contains important scientific knowledge that can help to straighten out common misunderstandings:

Geologic temperature record

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Geologic\\_temperature\\_record](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Geologic_temperature_record)

"The geologic temperature record are changes in Earth's environment as determined from geologic evidence on multi-million to billion (10<sup>9</sup>) year time scales. The study of past temperatures provides an important paleoenvironmental insight because it is a component of the climate and oceanography of the time."

Kim O'Hara said:

It's not rubbish because it's wrong but misleading because it not at all relevant to our situation now. Talking about the climate of five million or five hundred million years ago as though it means anything for our current situation is either ignorance (which should be remedied) or deliberate deceit through misdirection (which should be called out). Let's assume ignorance and do something about it.

The time frame which concerns us is the time since modern humans first appeared, roughly half a million years ago, and especially since our settled culture of farms and cities first appeared, roughly 10 000 years ago.

If you compare that to Malcolm's first graph you will see that it aligns perfectly with a period of very stable climate which lasted all the way up to about 1900. That is the climate we need. It is the climate we are adapted to, the climate our crops and animals are adapted to, the sea levels our ports are built for, the weather our houses are built for, etc, etc. And when it changes too far, too fast, we can't adapt fast enough and neither

can other living creatures.

The results, which we're already seeing, are crop failures, starvation, climate refugees, mass extinctions ... but surely you know all that.

What things were like five million or five hundred million years ago is of scientific interest only, just like the exact size of Saturn's moons or the wavelength of red light.

Kim

Malcolm wrote:

The explosion of world population also tracks on the graph above.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 11:39 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:

Not much difference, they kept the same connections, and they continue the same operations.. they are simply shipping the materials instead of the finished product. It fundamentally remains unchanged except where they do the chemistry that changes the precursors into an illegal drug. Literally they just abused a loophole, a technicality.

Malcolm wrote:

I guess you didn't read the part about the cartels increasingly procuring their raw materials from places other than China.

Jesse said:

In fact I read it:

CHINA

Currently, China remains the primary source of fentanyl and fentanyl-related substances trafficked through international mail and express consignment operations environment, as well as the main source for all fentanyl-related substances trafficked into the United States. Seizures of fentanyl sourced from China average less than one kilogram in weight, and often test above 90 percent concentration of pure fentanyl.

(U) FIGURE 1. FENTANYL FLOW TO THE UNITED STATES 2019

Source: DEA

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED3DEA Intelligence Report

As Beijing and the Hong Kong Special Autonomous Region (SAR) place restrictions on more precursor

chemicals, Mexican transnational criminal organizations (TCOs) are diversifying their sources of supply.

This is evidenced by fentanyl shipments from India allegedly destined for Mexico.

From your link:

[https://www.dea.gov/sites/default/files/2020-03/DEA\\_GOV\\_DIR-008-20%20Fentanyl%20Flow%20in%20the%20United%20States\\_0.pdf](https://www.dea.gov/sites/default/files/2020-03/DEA_GOV_DIR-008-20%20Fentanyl%20Flow%20in%20the%20United%20States_0.pdf)

Malcolm wrote:

You apparently failed to read the Rand report.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Tuesday, March 22nd, 2022 at 11:43 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Passing By said:

Malcolm, can I ask which of the Seventeen Tantras explains Guru Yoga (Both Ati and Anu style) the most?

Malcolm wrote:

None, actually. However, the method of selecting a guru is discussed extensively in the Self-Arisen Vidyā Tantra.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 23rd, 2022 at 8:34 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:

From the rand report.

Malcolm wrote:

And if you read a little more closely, you will discover these sources are being curtailed, and the cartels are sourcing these chemicals from other sources. Xi understands perfectly well the export of fentanyl and chemicals is a bad image for China.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 23rd, 2022 at 9:04 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:



When China outlawed Fentanyl, there is simply no way that the scientists and the think tanks involved in writing the laws didn't consider outlawing precursors as well, they would have known exactly what would happen by leaving precursors legal. Unless there was a reason for doing so, either corruption/money, or as an intentional politically motivated ploy, it happened; leaving the illegal fentanyl industry alive.

Malcolm wrote:

You are still behind the news:

<https://apple.news/AzbLqYOFXSWq0Ka8bq4lIRA>

Jesse said:

The U.N. Commission on Narcotic Drugs on Wednesday voted to control three chemicals used to create fentanyl, after a U.S. request to do so – marking a win for the Biden administration in its efforts to control the flow of the deadly drug into the United States.

The commission voted unanimously to control three fentanyl precursors by adding them to the list of chemicals to the 1988 Convention Against Illicit Traffic of Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances – obligating nations signed onto the convention to implement regulations on the manufacture and distribution of the chemicals, which in turn makes it harder for smugglers to gain access.

Malcolm wrote:

China is on this commission. The vote to make these precursors illegal was unanimous.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 23rd, 2022 at 10:58 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:

That is the nature of speculation.

Malcolm wrote:

That is why it is better not to speculate.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 23rd, 2022 at 11:36 PM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Jesse said:

"China is doing this intentionally"

Malcolm wrote:

Extraordinary proof is required for extraordinary claims.

The opioid crisis was caused largely by Purdue Pharma and the Sackler family.

When the US caught them in addicting millions of people to opioids, the cartels responded by supplying cheap Mexican dope to the US markets. They soon figured out it was cheaper to buy fentanyl from China and repackage it. China started to crack down on fentanyl shipments in 2019. China is clearly aware this is a big optics problem for them and that it makes them look bad. So they have taken measures. China is also a country where corruption is very high, because their markets have not been well regulated up to this point. Markets don't function well where there is excessive corruption, because trust is not there. Functioning markets require a high level of trust, for example, trade between US and Canada. One of Xi's main programs is the elimination of corruption in all sectors of Chinese business. He has been surprisingly effective in this. Nevertheless:

[https://www.uscc.gov/sites/default/files/2021-08/Illicit\\_Fentanyl\\_from\\_China-An\\_Evolving\\_Global\\_Operation.pdf](https://www.uscc.gov/sites/default/files/2021-08/Illicit_Fentanyl_from_China-An_Evolving_Global_Operation.pdf)

Jesse said:

In his testimony before the Commission in 2019, Ben Westhoff highlighted how “China’s clumsy, understaffed bureaucracy has a difficult time controlling the country’s chemical industry. Different layers of government are sometimes at odds with one another, local officials are corruptible, and industry regulations are confusing and poorly enforced.”

Malcolm wrote:

The issue of drug policy is one fraught with internal contradictions and international difficulties. Claiming that China, as a policy, has been and is intentionally shipping fentanyl to the US is a basically irresponsible and fact free claim.

Here is another piece of information on this issue:

China’s May 2019 fentanyl scheduling announcement has changed the way illicit vendors operate as Chinese authorities have ramped up investigations of known manufacturing sites, cracked down on websites selling illicit fentanyl, begun to enforce shipping rules, and created special investigation teams.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Wednesday, March 23rd, 2022 at 11:56 PM

Title: Re: Tulku Dakpa Rinpoche online reading transmission of the 17 Dzogchen Tantras

Content:

Passing By said:

Malcolm, can I ask which of the Seventeen Tantras explains Guru Yoga (Both Ati and Anu style) the most?

Malcolm wrote:

None, actually. However, the method of selecting a guru is discussed extensively in the Self-Arisen Vidyā Tantra.

Passing By said:

So when tertons emphasize Guru Yoga for Dzogchen, is it an original pith instruction? Or is it sourced from somewhere.....perhaps Khandro Nyingthik? Quite curious since it is THE method for Dzogchen

Malcolm wrote:

The origin of guru yoga in general is the Guhyasamaja tantra. However, the recommendation to rely on a guru is found in all Dzogchen teachings. The various different forms of guru are primarily oral instructions.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 2:05 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

To Malcolms point, the opioid demand issue in the US is homegrown. It might be an arbitrary distinction, but the most China can be accused of here is taking advantage of that, the demand was already here. Having worked with a bunch of opioid users myself I've seen this firsthand and heard the stories.

Ayu said:

I watched a documentary on the problem and it was said there that the beginner drugs are given by doctors in the US. The addiction starts with legal tranquilizers and such medicaments.

As soon as those patients get that heroine is much cheaper than the stuff they have to buy in the drugstore the tragedy goes ahead.

Malcolm wrote:

The real story was that as people become more and more addicted to Oxycontin, Purdue began upping the dosages. Purdue originally sold Oxycontin as a nonaddictive opioid under the theory it was time released. But it was bullshit, of course. People became very addicted to it, and finally, in roughly 2006, the feds put an end to it. There was a time in the US, where drugstores started to refuse to carry it because of constant robberies.

When Oxy was not longer easily available, cartels stepped in with cheap Mexican heroin, as I mentioned above (which is incidentally much safer than fentanyl). However, dealers in the US began mixing fentanyl with heroin, my state, Massachusetts was ground zero for this, as the Parts Unknown episode by Bourdain illustrates:

<https://www.imdb.com/title/tt4181346/> One of the towns in this is Greenfield, my country seat.

It is very easy to ship fentanyl in the mail. This is the main way it is smuggled into the US and Europe.

The solution is not a drug war (what are we going to do, invade Sinaloa? Good luck). The solution is breaking the back of the cartels by legalizing or decriminalizing some drugs and levying vice taxes to pay for the treatment programs. We have been doing this for alcohol forever.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 2:09 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

That's exactly how it goes. It's surprising the number of people who develop their habit as a result of being given a prescription for Vicodin or Percocet due to a broken arm or something, and eventually it spirals into a full blown addiction. That's especially true when the person is already having a tough time in life in other respects, lack of family support, etc.

Malcolm wrote:

And there is a steady percent of the population who are prone to addictions of all kinds.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 2:44 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yes, our culture with its tacit endorsement of chronic poverty, punitive justice around drug use, lack of resources, endorsement of compulsive behavior etc. guarantees a certain amount of chronic addiction.

Combine that with heavily addictive chemicals and the results aren't that surprising.

Malcolm wrote:

Oh, there is that, and below that, genetics.

Sentient beings enjoy getting high. We see it in humans and animals, even insects.

A certain percentage goes all in.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 3:13 AM

Title: Re: Is China Already at War With America?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

Yeah, this true, generally the way it's viewed in the field is bio-psycho-social, so while there are definitely certain people with a genetic predisposition (epi genetic?) to addictive behavior,

Malcolm wrote:

The Irish.

Johnny Dangerous said:

the actual condition often comes about through environmental, social triggers and those biological predispositions.

Malcolm wrote:

Catholicism, sexual abuse, and bars.

Johnny Dangerous said:

In other words, addiction is less of a social ill in societies that care to do something meaningful about it.

Malcolm wrote:

In some societies, it's a way of life.

Johnny Dangerous said:

Along a similar line there are also tests with animals that seem to provisionally show - they- are less or more likely to "go all in" depending on environmental variables.

Anyway you find both camps, but generally I think that notable people in the addiction field who are not rank ideologues recognize that biology and environment both play substantial roles. There are people on the extremes of both ends, but generally IME they don't have compelling arguments.

Malcolm wrote:

Agreed. No single causation.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 3:44 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

Russian forces have been stalled and its hopes for an easy conquest thwarted. And

apparently there is no Russian leadership that can be identified in this war.

<https://www.nytimes.com/live/2022/03/22/world/ukraine-russia-war#russia-ukraine-pentagon>

Malcolm wrote:

Seems like the main general who planned this has gone missing for two weeks...

<https://www.newsweek.com/russian-defense-minister-sergei-shoigu-missing-putin-1690948>

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 3:49 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 3:58 AM

Title: Re: Stream of Lapis And ChNN namchö medicine Buddha ...same?

Content:

climb-up said:

Oh wow, fascinating. Well, I keep an eye out if the lung or empowerment is offered in the future.

Do you know how it works that it says it's compiled from the namchö terma, but is completely different?

Are there more namchö cycles than Mingyur Dorje's? Maybe that was an assumption that I made that it always referred to him.

heart said:

There might be more than medicine buddha practice in the namcho.

/magnus

climb-up said:

That would makes sense too.

I think I looked one time for a list of the practices in the namchö and couldn't find it. I wonder if anyone here knows if there are multiple medicine Buddha practices.

Malcolm wrote:

There are something like 600 deities in Namcho.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 4:34 AM

Title: Re: Stream of Lapis And ChNN namchö medicine Buddha ...same?

Content:

climb-up said:

That would makes sense too.

I think I looked one time for a list of the practices in the namchö and couldn't find it. I wonder if anyone here knows if there are multiple medicine Buddha practices.

Malcolm wrote:

There are something like 600 deities in Namcho.

climb-up said:

wow!

So, I assume this is not really a cycle that people work through and accomplish every single practice ...right?

Malcolm wrote:

No, not really. There are a few standard deities: three roots. A Chenrezi practice which is used as a kind of six lokas purification, another Chenrzi which is the basis for trulkor, and so on. The main point of Namcho is the Dzogchen text, Buddhahood in the Palm of the Hand, from which the ngondro is derived.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 5:46 AM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

devr said:

Does anything ever exist outside mind? is a useful contemplation.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really, since things do exist outside the mind.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 8:28 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

KristenM said:

Russian forces have been stalled and its hopes for an easy conquest thwarted. And apparently there is no Russian leadership that can be identified in this war.

<https://www.nytimes.com/live/2022/03/22/world/ukraine-russia-war#russia-ukraine-pentagon>

Malcolm wrote:

Seems like the main general who planned this has gone missing for two weeks...

<https://www.newsweek.com/russian-defense-minister-sergei-shoigu-missing-putin-1690948>

PeterC said:

About a quarter of Russia's top 20 generals are reported killed in Ukraine so far. This greatly increases the chances that there might be some consequences for Putin, as the senior military staff are the only people capable of delivering them.

Despite their apparent stalling, they've still taken a lot of territory, including the two eastern provinces that they declared independent and a large part of the south. Any peace deal will probably involve Ukraine losing a lot of land to Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Zelensky has declared this to be a nonstarter. Have you been following Kamal Galeev's thread on Twitter?

Eye opening.

The best fighters in Ukraine are Chechens...fighting for Ukraine. The Sheik Mansur brigade.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 9:32 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

PeterC said:

About a quarter of Russia's top 20 generals are reported killed in Ukraine so far. This greatly increases the chances that there might be some consequences for Putin, as the senior military staff are the only people capable of delivering them.

Despite their apparent stalling, they've still taken a lot of territory, including the two eastern provinces that they declared independent and a large part of the south. Any peace deal will probably involve Ukraine losing a lot of land to Russia.

Malcolm wrote:

Zelensky has declared this to be a nonstarter. Have you been following Kamal Galeev's thread on Twitter?



Eye opening.

The best fighters in Ukraine are Chechens...fighting for Ukraine. The Sheik Mansur brigade.

PeterC said:

No - do you have a link? Who is he?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 11:48 AM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

devr said:

Does anything ever exist outside mind? is a useful contemplation.

Malcolm wrote:

Not really, since things do exist outside the mind.

devr said:

Where is 'outside'?

Malcolm wrote:

Everywhere but inside. If there is no outside, there isn't an inside.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Thursday, March 24th, 2022 at 10:41 PM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

devr said:

Where is 'outside'?

Malcolm wrote:

Everywhere but inside. If there is no outside, there isn't an inside.

devr said:

haha, if I ask you where is inside, you will most likely respond "everywhere but outside." I think both 'inside' and 'outside' are arbitrarily defined conceptual designations. Phenomenon, in my view or lack thereof, can't ultimately be posited as here or there, inside or outside and so forth.

Malcolm wrote:

Where did you say you were positing an ultimate?

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 1:23 AM

Title: Re: Buddhahood In This Life

Content:

PRESTONCHRISTIAN23 said:

but does the 17 tantras allow me to be connected to where I can read that?

Malcolm wrote:

If you have received Dzogchen transmission and some teachings already, then I think it is ok. If you have not, then maybe it is better to find a teacher first.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 2:24 AM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

devr said:

haha, if I ask you where is inside, you will most likely respond "everywhere but outside." I think both 'inside' and 'outside' are arbitrarily defined conceptual designations. Phenomenon, in my view or lack thereof, can't ultimately be posited as here or there, inside or outside and so forth.

Malcolm wrote:

Where did you say you were positing an ultimate?

devr said:

You didn't say you were positing a relative either when you said things do exist outside the mind. Even if your statement was made for valid relative truth, outside/inside are still quite arbitrary to be considered valid on the same level as phenomena appearing.

Malcolm wrote:

All dualistic referents, such as outside, inside, up, down, large, small, etc., are axiomatically relative.

What makes something conventional is whether or not something is functional. Asserting there is nothing outside the mind renders cognition dysfunctional, unless one then substitutes an elaborate metaphysics to account for the cognition of sense objects, for example, yogacāra.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 5:04 AM  
Title: Re: Mantra Recitation  
Content:

stucked said:  
And, is it ok to recite mantra when doing something / distracted/ in public?

Malcolm wrote:  
Waste of breath.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 8:55 AM  
Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment  
Content:

Caoimhghín said:  
Among the laity, a member of the Saṃgha is at fault if he proclaims himself to be a person of the path, a saint, an Āryan, to them. Where in the bodhisattvaśīla is the faux-bodhisattva prohibited from falsely claiming to be a Bodhisattva to others?

Malcolm wrote:  
It is permitted, actually, if it is beneficial.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 9:18 AM  
Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment  
Content:

Caoimhghín said:  
Among the laity, a member of the Saṃgha is at fault if he proclaims himself to be a person of the path, a saint, an Āryan, to them. Where in the bodhisattvaśīla is the faux-bodhisattva prohibited from falsely claiming to be a Bodhisattva to others?

Malcolm wrote:  
It is permitted, actually, if it is beneficial.

Caoimhghín said:  
That is not good advice IMO. Such an interpretation is not meant for common folk, IMO. "Is beneficial" is far too significant a caveat, IMO.

Malcolm wrote:  
It is meant for bodhisattvas who are not aryas, who nevertheless need to inspire people. Anything for the cause.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Friday, March 25th, 2022 at 11:54 AM  
Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment  
Content:

tobes said:

You could also have a look at the Akashagarbha Sutra, which becomes canonical on the issue, as it is quoted by Shantideva.

Malcolm wrote:

These claims are downfalls only if such exaggerations are intended to benefit yourself. If not, anything for the cause.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 12:07 AM  
Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis  
Content:

ratna said:

No, the Sheik Mansur Batallion is a different crew, they are enemies of Kadyrov.

Brunelleschi said:

My mistake.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a lot of moving parts here. Mistakes are normal.

Author: Malcolm  
Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 12:20 AM  
Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment  
Content:

Caoimhghín said:

Back in the day, when the monastic Bodhisattva community was also observing the vinaya, it would be a non-issue.

Malcolm wrote:

A Sutra in the Ratnakūṣa collection, Taisho 310, called the Definitive Vinaya in Chang's translation, will explain this point.

Bodhisattva monks are not prohibited from breaking any of the samvara of śrāvakas providing it is done with bodhicitta.

In the Nāgārjuna tradition of bodhisattva vows, the downfall of claiming realization of emptiness, when you do not have it, applies only to so-called "acute" practitioners, not average practitioners.

In the Yogacāra system, it is a downfall not break engage in a nonvirtue if performed out of compassion. You can read these in Buddhist Ethics by Kongtrul.

In short, the only real downfall in Mahāyāna is abandoning aspirational bodhicitta.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 12:56 AM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

Aemilius said:

The outer world is not the same in different cultures and in different epochs.

Malcolm wrote:

There is a liquid substance perceived by those in the six lokas. It may not be perceived the same way by beings in the six lokas, but there is still a liquid substance which is being perceived, which stands apart from the percepts of the beings in those six lokas through its own causes and conditions. Can sentient beings ever hope to know with precise accuracy the exact nature of that liquid substance in all its aspects and its nature? Sure, when one of them attains buddhahood.

In the meantime, functionality is the best measure of conventionality, which is why Meru cosmology could never be functional, not even when it was current. On the other hand, we did not have the tech to fly to the moon even 100 years ago, so it is moot. Nevertheless, Meru cosmology would never have permitted us to fly to the moon, and therefore, it was always a dysfunctional cosmology on a conventional level, but no one needed to question this for millenia.

There are always people who will forever go down the idealist rabbit hold of Bishop Berkley and what not, but at least Dzogchen teachings firmly maintain, conventionally speaking, the objective existence of outer objects, contra the metaphysics of yogacāra, even in its Madhyamaka version.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 1:56 AM

Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment

Content:

DNS said:

Contrary to some popular views, there is no prohibition on lay people discussing attainments

Malcolm wrote:

Correct.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 2:30 AM

Title: Re: Ukraine Crisis

Content:

Malcolm wrote:

American Volunteer in Ukraine, on the ground:

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 2:37 AM

Title: Re: Does reincarnation really exists or is it just in the mind?

Content:

Johnny Dangerous said:

The thing is that even with modern physics (if we go that route) it's hard to argue for the "real existence" (i.e. "outside") of anything beyond just obstruction via...I don't know, probability fields or something.

So, all \*experience\* is of the mind, and we can only ever know of "outside" existence via inference.

Malcolm wrote:

No object, no experience. This can be known through direct perception and not inference. If you argue that all experience is inferential, than awakening is impossible, since it is also reduced to an inference.

Author: Malcolm

Date: Saturday, March 26th, 2022 at 4:21 AM

Title: Re: Proclamations of Attainment

Content:

Caoimhghín said:

There's also the issue of impersonating a member of the Āryasaṃgha. This is a big no-no as far as I've been taught the Dharma.

It's interesting how this is so easy to find in the prātimokṣa, but difficult to find outrightly stated in the bodhisattvaśīla. My tentative conclusion is that it was considered "obvious,"

Malcolm wrote:

Anything for the cause, as long as it is really for the benefit of others.

The usual example is the bodhisattva bhikṣu who had sex with a young women who threatened to kill herself if he did not make love to her. His prātimokṣa defeat is not considered a defeat in the bodhisattvasamvara.

It is the same for the other defeats.

The Buddha of the śrāvaka canon is far less practical than the Buddha of the mahāyāna canon.